



April 8, 2024

BAHFA Oversight Committee  
ABAG Housing Committee  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105

Sent Via Electronic mail: Fcastro@bayareametro.gov

**Re: Item 7a for the April 10, 2024, Meeting**

Dear Chair Pedroza, Vice Chair Josefowitz, Chair Romero, Vice Chair Fligor and Committee Members:

The 37,000 members of the Nor Cal Carpenters Union have a deep vested interest in Bay Area housing. Our union organizes & bargains for construction workers building Bay Area affordable housing, and our members and their families desperately need more abundant housing that is affordable at all income levels. The NCCU presses for family sustaining labor standards for construction workers at the state, regional, and local levels.

If approved by voters in November, the billions of dollars in bond proceeds will be the largest-ever investment by Bay Area residents aimed at shrinking the region's acute affordable housing shortage. The labor standards outlined in this draft Expenditure Plan - to be detailed and operationalized in future funding program Guidelines - will induce a wages and fringe benefits "race to the top" among developers and construction contractors who deliver affordable housing in the Bay Area.

The labor standards in the draft Expenditure Plan raise the bar for residential construction workers at a regional scale. They derive from State law that applies to all of California's 58 counties and 400-plus cities. California's Carpenters Unions - supported in 2023 by the California's Laborers Unions and other major labor organizations - co-sponsored the underlying pro-housing bills. We believe the baseline standards will uplift residential construction workers and their families and level the playing field for law-abiding contractors who often compete against firms whose business model relies on exploitation, wage theft, and tax fraud.

The construction labor standards in the Expenditure Plan are balanced on the principles of strength, equity, and feasibility. They are supported not just by the Carpenters and Laborers unions of Northern California, which represent almost 70,000 working men and women but also by affordable housing developers and advocates.

The standards include prevailing wages and - in cases of new projects with at least 50 units - employer healthcare expenditures to benefit trades workers and their dependents and apprentice

participation requirements for qualifying projects. The standards will equally benefit all workers involved in a bond-funded project and can be enforced by State laws that are among the strongest in the nation. The expenditure Plan also includes an option for projects to meet the standards by entering into all-trades Project Labor Agreements (PLAs).

A PLA mandate is not advisable for several reasons. First, there is no precedent for a one-size-fits-all Project Labor Agreement mandate for a multi-county bond measure that will be financed through broad-based property tax assessments. A ballot measure passed in the City of LA that included a PLA requirement raises revenue from a transfer tax that does not affect most LA residents. Second, implementing a region-wide PLA would create challenges in many Bay Area localities where union subcontractors performing certain residential construction work are rare. Third, a BAHFA PLA mandate for 100% of allocated bond proceeds would require the finance authority to have a “proprietary interest” in all the funds, which could require restructuring BAHFA’s enabling legislation, which was the product of careful, finely balanced negotiations.

The current version of the State’s BAHFA-enabling law does not permit BAHFA to write labor standards mandates for direct allocation localities. On March 13th it was evident that a decisive majority of Committee members support labor standards for 100 percent of the bond proceeds. The solution is to amend state law to allow BAHFA to require all local jurisdictions that receive bond funds to adhere to baseline labor standards and to then work through the BAHFA board to extend the labor standards of the Expenditure Plan – plus robust labor compliance enforcement tools – to projects that apply to those jurisdictions for funds.

**In conclusion, the Nor Cal Carpenters Union advocates that BAHFA Oversight Committee and ABAG Housing Committee members take the following actions at the April 10th joint committee meeting:**

- (1) Adopt the Regional Expenditure Plan as recommended; and**
- (2) Express that it is the sense of the Committee that the appropriate committees and/or full ABAG and MTC legislative bodies should direct staff to work with the California Legislature to amend the BAHFA enabling statute to permit BAHFA to require lawful labor standards for counties and cities that will receive a direct allocation of bond proceeds should the Ballot Measure pass.**

Members of the Nor Cal Carpenters Union look forward to this incredible opportunity to uplift residential construction workers while building and preserving affordable housing throughout our diverse San Francisco Bay Area region.

Respectfully,



Jay Bradshaw  
Executive Secretary-Treasurer  
Nor Cal Carpenters Union

Sent via Electronic Mail  
Fred Castro: [fcastro@bayareametro.gov](mailto:fcastro@bayareametro.gov)

April 9, 2024

Kate Hartley, Bay Area Housing Finance Authority (BAHFA) Director  
BAHFA Oversight Committee  
ABAG Housing Committee  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105

Re: Item 7a - BAHFA Regional Expenditure Plan with Labor Standards and Enhanced Reporting Requirements

Dear Chair Pedroza, Vice Chair Josefowitz, Chair Romero, Vice Chair Fligor, Committee Members, and Director Hartley:

The Northern California District Council of Laborers (NCDCL) represents 30,000 construction industry and frontline essential workers from the Central Valley to the Oregon border. Nearly each and every one of our members is impacted by the state's housing affordability crisis, which is most acutely felt in the San Francisco Bay Area.

The BAHFA Housing Bond is a historic opportunity to generate \$10 to \$20 billion of investment to address this crisis and create tens of thousands of Union construction jobs for our members and members of other building trade unions. We therefore strongly urge MTC and ABAG Committee members to approve the staff recommendation for Item 7a this Wednesday and avoid squandering this critical opportunity by risking the bond's ability to appear on the November 2024 ballot.

In urging approval of BAHFA staff's recommendation, we align ourselves with the Nor Cal Carpenters Union, who has long advocated for strong labor standards and compliance measures for the Bay Area housing bond. Together, our two organizations represent the largest share of union residential construction hours in Northern California.

The labor standards recommended by BAHFA staff are compliant with existing state law under AB 2011 and SB 423, include an option for all-trades project labor agreements where legally permissible, and have garnered strong support from the affordable housing community and advocates. We agree that these standards provide the means to raise the bar for residential construction workers at a regional scale.

Once again, we urge MTC and ABAG Committee members to approve staff's recommendation on Wednesday without further delay. Not doing so threatens the timeline necessary to advance the BAHFA housing bond in 2024 and win the necessary voter approval to put our members to work building much-needed housing for Bay Area residents.

Sincerely,



Oscar De La Torre  
Business Manager

ODLT:dle  
LiUNA167

**From:** [Kimberly Ward](#)  
**To:** [Fred Castro](#)  
**Subject:** FW: Letter of Support for BAHFA Measure  
**Date:** Tuesday, April 2, 2024 1:08:57 PM  
**Attachments:** [SRYIMBY BAHFA Support Ltr 03.29.24.pdf](#)

---

Fred,  
Please see below/attached.

*Kim/Kimberly (she/her)*

Principal Clerk | Commission Secretary  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Office Phone: (415) 778-5367 | Mobile: (415) 529-8045

---

**From:** Andrew Fremier <AFremier@bayareametro.gov>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, April 2, 2024 9:45 AM  
**To:** Kate Hartley <khartley@bayareametro.gov>  
**Cc:** Julie Snyder <jsnyder@bayareametro.gov>; Alix Bockelman <ABockelman@bayareametro.gov>; Brad Paul <bpaul@bayareametro.gov>; Andrea Visveshwara <avisveshwara@bayareametro.gov>; Derek Hansel <dhansel@bayareametro.gov>; Rebecca Long <rlong@bayareametro.gov>; Kathleen Kane <kkane@bayareametro.gov>; Georgia Gann Dohrmann <ggandohrmann@bayareametro.gov>; Matt Maloney <mmaloney@bayareametro.gov>; Kimberly Ward <KWard@bayareametro.gov>; John Goodwin <JGoodwin@bayareametro.gov>  
**Subject:** Fw: Letter of Support for BAHFA Measure

FYI

---

**From:** Lauren Fuhry [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, April 1, 2024 8:27 PM  
**To:** Andrew Fremier <[AFremier@bayareametro.gov](mailto:AFremier@bayareametro.gov)>  
**Subject:** Letter of Support for BAHFA Measure

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Good evening Director Fremier,

Please find attached letter on behalf of the local Santa Rosa YIMBY chapter regarding the proposed BAHFA bond measure. According to an analysis recently completed by the Bay Area Council, allowing BAHFA to fund the inclusionary requirements or in-lieu fees of market-rate projects and allowing developers to build 100% of all subsidized units offsite would unlock the production of an additional 38,000 housing units, above and beyond the projected 37,500 affordable units passage of BAHFA will spur. Our communities are desperately hungry for more housing to serve a diversity of incomes, and it's a pivotal moment in history to dismantle long standing barriers to new housing production. I hope you will consider our feedback as you shape what so many of us are hoping will bring

generational transformation to the Bay Area.

Kind regards,

Lauren Fuhry  
Local Lead  
Santa Rosa YIMBY



March 29, 2024

Andrew Fremier  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105

**RE: BAHFA**

Dear Director Fremier,

The \$10-\$20 billion bond currently being considered by the Bay Area Housing Finance Authority for the November 2024 ballot has generational potential to help close the affordable housing shortage behind so much of the region's challenges, including homelessness, displacement, traffic congestion, and air quality. Despite these needs being felt across California, we watched with great alarm how Proposition 1 passed with only the slimmest of majorities as evidence Californians are losing confidence in the ability of bonds to make a difference.

That's why it's so important that the region combine new revenues from a BAHFA bond with the smart policy reforms needed to maximize impact and clearly demonstrate value to voters. For this reason we strongly encourage allowing BAHFA to fund the inclusionary requirements or in-lie fees of market-rate projects and to allow developers to build 100% of all subsidized units offsite to maximize production. Analysis from the Bay Area Council Economic Institute estimates that this reform would unlock the production of an additional 38,000 housing units in addition to the projected 37,500 affordable units—more than doubling the bond's overall impact on housing availability.

For this reason we urge the Commission to support changes in the authorizing language to maximize the full potential of the BAHFA measure.

Thank you for considering our views.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Lauren Fuhry". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Lauren Fuhry  
Local Lead  
Santa Rosa YIMBY