

Transit 2050+/Plan Bay Area 2050+: Draft Project Performance Findings (July 2024)

Overall Summary Table

Benefit-Cost Ratios and Equity Scores across Three Futures, and Guiding Principle Flags

Project Type	Project ID	Row ID	Project	Project Source	Lifecycle Cost (2019 \$)	Guiding Principle Flags	Provides Point of Access in EPC?	Benefit-Cost Ratio			Equity Score			
								Rising Tides Falling Fortunes	Clean And Green	Back To The Future	Rising Tides Falling Fortunes	Clean And Green	Back To The Future	
Enhance Transit Frequency, Capacity, and Reliability	2312	1	ACE Service Expansion	SJRR	\$0.3B	0	Yes	>10	>10	>10	Challenges	Even	Advances	
	2106	2	AC Transit 23rd Street BRT	AC Transit	\$0.2B	0	Yes	>10	4	3	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	5003	3	I-680 San Jose-Martinez Express Bus Service Expansion	CCTA	\$0.3B	0	Yes	6	2	2	Challenges	Even	Advances	
	2011	4	San Mateo Bridge Express Bus Service Expansion, Multimodal Corridor Improvements, and Infr...	MTC/ABAG	\$0.3B	0	Yes	5	2	>10	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	2210	5	Capitol Corridor South Bay Connect Rail Speed Improvements, Rail Infill Station, and Infrastru...	CJPA	\$0.3B	0	Yes	5	3	5	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	2202	6	Antioch-Brentwood BRT	CCTA	\$0.2B	0	Yes	5	3	3	Advances	Advances	Advances	
	2600	7	WETA Ferry Frequency Boosts	WETA	\$0.4B	0	Yes	4	7	6	Challenges	Even	Advances	
	2602	8	WETA Berkeley-San Francisco Ferry Service Expansion	WETA	\$0.2B	0	No	4	<0.5	6	Challenges	Even	Advances	
	2003	9	SFMTA Muni Forward Five-Minute Network LRT, Rapid Bus, and Local Bus Frequency Boosts	SF	\$1.5B	0	Yes	4	6	5	Challenges	Challenges	Even	
	6023	10	ReX Green Line (Vallejo-SFO) Express Bus Service Expansion	MTC/ABAG	\$0.3B	0	Yes	4	<0.5	<0.5	Challenges	Even	Advances	
	2010	11	Dumbarton Bridge Express Bus Frequency Boosts, Express Bus Service Expansion, and Transit Pri...	MTC/ABAG + SamTrans	\$0.5B	0	Yes	3	1	4	Challenges	Advances	Advances	
	2004	12	Sonoma County Local Bus Frequency Boosts	SCTA	\$0.4B	0	Yes	3	0.5	2	Advances	Even	Advances	
	6024	13	ReX Red Line (Oakland-Redwood City) Express Bus Service Expansion	MTC/ABAG	\$0.4B	0	Yes	3	<0.5	2	Challenges	Advances	Advances	
	2007	14	SFMTA Southeast San Francisco Local Bus Frequency Boosts, Express Bus Service Expansion, and...	SF	\$0.4B	0	Yes	3	6	6	Even	Even	Even	
	2009	15	SamTrans Express Bus Service Expansion	SamTrans	\$0.3B	0	Yes	3	3	4	Challenges	Even	Even	
	2400	16	VTA LRT Grade Separations and Modernization - Downtown San Jose	VTA	\$0.6B	0	Yes	3	1	3	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	2209	17	BART Irvington Infill Station	City of Fremont	\$0.2B	0	No	2	<0.5	8	Even	Even	Even	
	2604	18	Golden Gate Transit Ferry and Express Bus Service Expansion and Frequency Boosts	GGHTD	\$0.6B	0	Yes	2	2	3	Challenges	Even	Advances	
	2103	19	SamTrans El Camino Real BRT	SamTrans + CCAG	\$0.5B	0	Yes	2	1	3	Advances	Even	Challenges	
	6025	20	ReX Blue Line (San Francisco-San Jose) Express Bus Service Expansion	MTC/ABAG	\$0.5B	0	Yes	2	<0.5	<0.5	Challenges	Advances	Advances	
	2000	21	AC Transit Local Bus Frequency Boosts	AC Transit	\$2.2B	0	Yes	1	3	2	Advances	Advances	Even	
	2001	22	AC Transit Rapid Bus Frequency Boosts and Multimodal Corridor Improvements	AC Transit	\$1.3B	0	Yes	2	2	0.9	Challenges	Even	Advances	
	2201	23	BART Core Capacity Rail Frequency Boosts and Infrastructure Improvements	BART	\$4.6B	0	Yes	1	3	3	Even	Even	Even	
	2302	24	Caltrain Frequency Boosts (Enhanced Growth)	Caltrain	\$1.6B	0	Yes	1	9	1	Challenges	Even	Even	
	2008	25	AC Transit Alameda Point Rapid Bus Service Expansion and Multimodal Corridor Improvements	ACTC	\$0.3B	0	Yes	1	6	4	Even	Even	Even	
	2012	26	VTA Frequency Boosts (Visionary Network)	VTA	\$1.9B	0	Yes	1	3	2	Even	Advances	Advances	
	2413	27	Muni Metro Modernization	SF	\$1.3B	0	Yes	0.9	1	<0.5	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	2100	28	AC Transit San Pablo Avenue BRT	AC Transit	\$0.8B	0	Yes	0.7	2	2	Advances	Advances	Even	
	2105	29	AC Transit E 14th Street/Mission Street/Fremont Boulevard Local Bus Frequency Boosts, Rapid B...	ACTC	\$0.6B	0	Yes	0.7	2	1	Advances	Advances	Even	
	2603	30	WETA Redwood City-San Francisco-Oakland Ferry Service Expansion	WETA	\$0.4B	0	No	0.6	<0.5	4	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	Expand Transit Services throughout the Region	2308	31	Valley Link Initial Operating Phase	TVSJVRRRA	\$2.0B	0	No	3	2	4	Even	Advances	Advances
		2402	32	San Jose Airport Connector	City of San Jose	\$0.8B	0	Yes	2	0.9	1	Challenges	Even	Advances
		2206	33	VTA Stevens Creek LRT Extension	VTA	\$1.4B	0	Yes	1	2	2	Challenges	Even	Advances
2211		34	SFMTA Central Subway Extension	SF	\$1.2B	0	Yes	1	0.6	<0.5	Even	Even	Advances	
1004		35	Link21 Rail Expansion	BART + CJPA	\$29.9B	0	Yes	<0.5	<0.5	0.9	Even	Advances	Even	
2306		36	Samtrans Dumbarton Group Rapid Transit Rail Expansion	SamTrans + CCAG	\$2.6B	0	Yes	<0.5	0.5	0.5	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
2300		37	Caltrain/HSR Portal (Downtown Rail Extension)	TJPA + SFCTA	\$4.8B	0	No	<0.5	0.5	0.6	Challenges	Challenges	Challenges	
2212		38	SFMTA Geary/19th Avenue Subway	SF	\$15.2B	0	Yes	<0.5	<0.5	<0.5	Even	Even	Even	
2304		39	SMART Windsor-Cloverdale Extension	SMART	\$0.5B	0	No	<0.5	<0.5	<0.5	Challenges	Even	Challenges	
2205		40	BART Silicon Valley Phase II Extension	VTA	\$7.0B	0	Yes	<0.5	<0.5	<0.5	Advances	Advances	Even	
2305		41	SMART Solano Extension	SMART	\$1.5B	0	Yes	<0.5	<0.5	<0.5	Even	Challenges	Challenges	
Implement Pricing Strategies to Manag...		3001	42	Downtown San Francisco Congestion Pricing	SF	\$0.6B	1	Yes	8	7	>10	Challenges	Challenges	Challenges
		3002	43	Treasure Island Congestion Pricing	SF	\$0.2B	1	Yes	3	4	6	Challenges	Challenges	Challenges
Improve Highways and Interchanges	3113	44	VTA US-101/SR-25 Interchange Improvements	VTA	\$0.5B	1	No	6	4	>10	Challenges	Challenges	Even	
	5000	45	MTC Bay Area Forward	MTC/ABAG	\$0.8B	0	No	3	3	4	Challenges	Challenges	Even	
	3104	46	STA I-80/I-680/SR-12 Interchange Improvements	STA	\$0.7B	1	No	1	0.8	2	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	3200	47	SR-37 Freeway Expansion and Express Bus Service	MTC/ABAG/North Bay ..	\$6.5B	2	Yes	1	1	1	Challenges	Challenges	Challenges	
	3100	48	CCTA SR-4/SR-239 Interchange Improvements and Freeway Expansion	CCTA	\$1.1B	1	No	0.8	0.5	<0.5	Challenges	Advances	Advances	
	3114	49	VTA Countywide Expressway Interchange Improvements, Grade Separations, and Roadway Expan..	VTA	\$1.6B	2	Yes	0.8	0.5	1	Challenges	Challenges	Advances	
	3109	53	Alameda CTC SR-262 Interchange Improvements and Freeway Expansion	ACTC	\$0.4B	2	No	<0.5	1	3	Even	Even	Challenges	

NOTES:

1) **Lifecycle Costs:** This includes initial capital cost, annual O&M costs, rehabilitation and replacements costs, and a residual value of the investment at the end of the analysis period, calculated using discounted present value methodology. Refer to Attachment D for details, and for costs. Note: Societal transfers such as fare/toll revenue (or loss) are excluded from both benefits and costs, following standard practice for societal benefit-cost analyses.

2) **Guiding Principle Flags:** Flags, based on qualitative analysis, are intended to draw attention to a direct adverse impact a project may have that may not be captured as part of other assessments. Refer to Attachment C for details.

3) **Benefit-Cost Ratio:** All project impacts are measured against a uniform base transportation and land use network in each future, except Resilience projects, which are measured against a baseline where that asset is out of service (hence n/a in some futures). Costs and Benefits to determine the ratio are detailed in Attachment D and E. For inter-regional projects, Modeled Bay Area benefits have been multiplied by a factor to reflect the ratio of expected ridership from outside the region. Valley Link Initial Operating Segment: 3.6; ACE Service Expansion: 8.5; South Bay Connect: 1.6.

4) **Equity Score:** "Advances" indicates that the project may benefit lower income individuals (below regional median income) more than higher income individuals. "Challenges" indicates that project benefits skew towards higher income individuals. "Even" indicates even distribution of benefits for all income groups.

(Full methodology can be found here: https://mtc.ca.gov/sites/default/files/ProjectPerformance_Methodology.pdf)

5) Results for Express Lane projects are forthcoming in late summer or early fall 2024.