

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [MTC; Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** Re: Proposed Draft Amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050  
**Date:** Monday, August 12, 2024 3:13:32 PM

You don't often get email from zpub2000@yahoo.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

[Sonoma-Marin Rail Transit to Healdsburg](#)

I have not used the Sonoma Marin rail line - but as a person that used to live in Sebastapol for several years I totally support the idea and wish you the best of Luck. Getting more cars off of 101 both benefits drivers (less congestion) and encourages the use of Transit. I live in San Francisco and appreciate MUNI (though do not like what SFMTA has done to Valencia St, Market St and 17 St in the city) Think there Needs to be a better balance between cars, bikes and public transit. In my ideal World public transit would be Free - which would benefit those of us that still drive horseless carriages. Just some comments from an old White guy that lives in the Bayview of San Francisco.

On Monday, August 12, 2024 at 02:48:25 PM PDT, MTC <[mtc.updates@service.govdelivery.com](mailto:mtc.updates@service.govdelivery.com)> wrote:

From:  
To:  
Cc:

[Plan BayArea Info; MTC-ABAG Info](#)



Subject: Plan Bay Area 2050. Railway to a Communist Takeover  
Date: Tuesday, August 13, 2024 2:40:10 PM  
Attachments: [image.png](#)  
[Elward Statement.pdf](#)

You don't often get email from adinayflores707@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Good Afternoon,

This is my [feedback](#) regarding Plan Bay Area 2050. [Plan Bay Area 2050, Railway to a Communist Takeover \(substack.com\)](#)

**As we continue to enslave black children in the Congo to power EV fleets, please do not claim that 'black lives matter'.** I have specifically copied Rohnert Park Councilwoman Jackie Elward, a woman who immigrated from the Congo. She was adamant during her failed senate run that she wants to expedite our transition to EV. She [stated](#): *'I also support accelerating our transition to electric vehicles and investing in the needed EV infrastructure, including at apartment buildings'*. She made absolutely no mention of her people suffering in the Congo. Her husband then tried to justify this slavery on Instagram (I took screenshots). Black lives only seem to 'matter' when pandering votes during elections. My late [mother's](#) family immigrated to the U.S. from Myanmar (Burma). I would never have the audacity to sell out my own people!

### Adina's Substack

## Plan Bay Area 2050, Railway to a Communist Takeover

Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit (SMART) will likely cease operations within the next 5 years, so what are the true motives of Plan 2050?



ADINA FLORES  
AUG 13, 2024

Sonoma County Supervisor [Lynda Hopkins' spouse](#) lobbies for free transit. Ms. Hopkins has

been under investigation with the FPPC for over two years (case #2022-00207). She gave her husband \$30k+ via Sonoma County BOS approved taxpayer monies, a violation of Gov. Code 1090. I am not fond of 'white saviors' who seek to destroy communities of color in exchange for profit, and ostracize constituents who refuse to align themselves fully with democratic policies.

Thank you & God Bless.

--

Kindest Regards,

Adina Flores



[www.linkedin.com/in/adinayflores](http://www.linkedin.com/in/adinayflores)

[https://www.instagram.com/civil\\_rights707/](https://www.instagram.com/civil_rights707/)

<https://californiaglobe.com/author/adina-flores/>

# Transportation Questionnaire for Bay Area Candidates

March 5th, 2024 Primary Election

Name: Jackie Elward

Which office are you running for?: California State Senate District 3

---

**1. Which counties does the jurisdiction of the office cover?**

Contra Costa, Napa, Solano, Sonoma

**2. Which forms of transit and active transportation (bicycling, walking, scooters, wheelchair) do you use on a regular basis and for what types of trips-- and why?**

I use my car to get to work and back as it is in another city. The transit system in Sonoma County isn't the best for the location I'm living in. My high school senior uses his bike to ride to school and back.

**3. Would you seek additional funding for Bay Area transit and what form of funding do you think makes sense?**

I strongly support additional funding for Bay Area transit. The pandemic and shifting user behavior (like remote work) is putting extraordinary strain on transit agency finance, and they need bridge funding to maintain service while adapting to changing rider needs. I'd first seek and advocate for every penny we can from the state and federal governments and am open to other regional funding sources, including bonds and tolls.

**4. Public transit in the Bay Area is highly fragmented, with 27 transit agencies, each with different fares, schedules, branding, and customer information. Do you believe it should be a priority for the region to create a well-coordinated transit system? And as an elected leader or potential member of a local transit agency board, would you support state legislation that advances a more integrated, high ridership system, even if it diminishes local control?**

We absolutely need seamless mobility and strong coordination within and between systems. One of the greatest barriers to using transit is the perception of unreliability, yet almost all of us walk around with technology that, when deployed effectively by transit agencies, can provide us with precise arrivals, departures, and connections.

I acknowledge the interest and potential benefits of a fully integrated regional transportation authority, although I don't think we're close to achieving that vision yet. I appreciate that Senator Wahab has introduced legislation to further this reform, and I'd be interested in speaking with all interested parties to figure out what steps we can take to enhance seamless mobility. The number of interlocking political and institutional actors in this discussion is a lot to process, but I know that when trying to solve massive, seemingly intractable problems, it helps to break down the problem into smaller achievable steps.

**5. Transportation is the largest single source of carbon emissions in California, and in the Bay Area, and the largest share of transportation emissions come from single occupancy vehicles. What are your top priorities to achieve substantial reduction in transportation-related GHG**



**emissions?**

I support robust investments in public transit, safe sidewalks for pedestrians, and biking infrastructure. New housing should be prioritized near transit and near downtown and commercial corridors. These goals have the effect of reducing vehicle miles traveled and creating more livable communities for all of us to share.

I also support accelerating our transition to electric vehicles and investing in the needed EV infrastructure, including at apartment buildings.

**6. The Bay Area still has road projects under development that would increase Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT), greenhouse gas emissions, and air pollution. What decisions would you make about projects that increase VMT and pollution?**

As we make land use decisions, our first priority should be to forge communities that are walkable, bikeable, and transit reliable for people of all comfort levels and abilities. Every new street is an opportunity for a “complete streets” approach that considers what other infrastructure should be built simultaneously, although this takes municipal planning to achieve.

**7. Transit priority improvements are proven to make taking the bus faster and more reliable, while also reducing operating costs. Should local governments be able to stop transit priority improvements on local roads?**

Transit priority improvements are a vital component of seamless mobility, and we absolutely need to expand their construction across the region. Should local governments have no say in where and how they're constructed? As a City Council Member, I certainly want input before major road decisions are made.

**8. What do you think are the most important actions that can be taken to make public transit comfortable, accessible, and safe for all communities?**

I support Ambassador programs that add eyes and ears to transit systems and help connect people with services if they need them.

Increased ridership creates a virtuous circle where more eyes and ears deter crime and abusive behavior and create increased revenue for additional cleaning and safety measures. More frequent service on smaller trains, for example, has the added benefit of increasing dependability, thus increasing ridership, while also creating fewer cars where anti-social behavior can be allowed to flourish.

**9. Traffic violence and deaths in California are increasing annually; in 2021, 4,258 people died in vehicle crashes, a 10.7% increase from the prior year. If elected, what will you do to reverse the trend, increase street safety, save lives and reduce injuries in our community? What policies or specific projects would make the greatest impact?**

I wish every city took seriously a Vision Zero approach to traffic fatalities. In the State Senate, I would prioritize investment in local funding for Vision Zero, traffic calming, and complete streets measures proven to reduce injuries and deaths. The greatest impact reforms are ones that reduce the speeds of cars and increase visibility for everyone.

**10. What do you think are the biggest access and mobility needs for disadvantaged populations in your district, and how would you propose to solve them?**

The 3rd District is pretty spread out, and transit between cities is desperately lacking. A lot of people in my decision have no choice but to drive to work, school, and/or health appointments. We need more frequent connections between communities, and that takes lots of investment.

We also have a lot of roads that are simply unsafe to walk across for anyone, let alone someone with limited mobility. More safe streets infrastructure that allows safe pedestrian crossing is needed.

**11. In what circumstances do you support removing parking or repurposing vehicle travel lanes to create safer and more efficient bus, biking, and walking options? How do you propose balancing the demands of different interest groups who may disagree on how streets should be designed?**

I think new California law that ends most parking minimum requirements in the state is a great step forward. Dense infill near transit, robust sidewalk and bicycle infrastructure, and places to work and thrive are a recipe for drastically reducing vehicle miles traveled or even the necessity for a car in many cases.

As for removing street parking, that needs to be considered when developing bike boulevards, rapid bus transit routes, bulb-outs, etc. There's no one-size-fits-all approach to how to balance the needs of the community in these conversations. What all parties deserve is an open, transparent, and robust public process where the pros and cons of any given improvement are discussed, changes made as needed, and a decision is reached and followed through on.

---

*The "Transportation Questionnaire for Bay Area Candidates for Office" is sponsored by a coalition of partners- Transbay Coalition, SPUR, Seamless Bay Area, San Francisco Transit Riders, Silicon Valley Bike Coalition, and Bike East Bay to help educate the public on these important issues.*



**From:** [Andrea Krout](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** FW: Plan Bay Area Amendment letter of support  
**Date:** Friday, August 23, 2024 11:40:17 AM  
**Attachments:** [SonomaCounty SMART PBA2050Amendment August2024 Support.pdf](#)

---

You don't often get email from andrea.krout@sonoma-county.org. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

To Whom It May Concern,

Attached please find a letter of support from Chair Rabbitt and the Sonoma County Board of Supervisors regarding Plan Bay Area 2050 amendment support.

Sincerely,

**Andrea L. Krout**

District Director, Supervisor David Rabbitt  
Second District, County of Sonoma

575 Administration Drive, Room 100A  
Santa Rosa, CA 95403  
[akrout@sonoma-county.org](mailto:akrout@sonoma-county.org)  
phone: 707-565-3754

COUNTY OF SONOMA  
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

575 ADMINISTRATION DRIVE, RM. 100A  
SANTA ROSA, CALIFORNIA 95403

(707) 565-2241  
FAX (707) 565-3778



MEMBERS OF THE BOARD

DAVID RABBITT  
CHAIR  
LYNDA HOPKINS  
VICE CHAIR  
SUSAN GORIN  
CHRIS COURSEY  
JAMES GORE

August 20, 2024

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

**Re:** Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment - Support

Dear Chair Pedroza,

On behalf of the Sonoma County Board of Supervisors, we are pleased to support the pending amendment for the Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit District (SMART) expansion north connecting Healdsburg to the SMART Rail and Pathway network.

SMART is experiencing unprecedented ridership growth as the pandemic and fire traumas fade and the new North Bay travel patterns emerge. Starting Spring 2025, the SMART system will cover 48- of the 70-mile voter approved railroad, with 14 stations and 37 miles of pathway open to the public. SMART is providing more service on both weekdays and weekends than was originally planned and the frequency is attracting new riders every day. When combined with SMART's new short line freight railroad services, the entire system is critical to the economic development of North Bay communities and industries.

Connecting Santa Rosa and the Sonoma County Airport Area, home to 7,700 jobs, by rail with our North Sonoma County cities is our next critical task. Completing the network will make our Santa Rosa stations perform better as they will have people commuting in from both the north and south, just as they do on Highway 101. As it stands now, SMART's Santa Rosa stations are only connected south and thus only half-utilized.

The fire, flood and pandemic disasters our county has experienced between 2017 and 2021 have shown us that to be prepared for catastrophic events we must create options for community essentials like transportation choice, housing availability, freight transport logistic options and broadband access. Every jurisdiction in Sonoma County has current State approved Housing Elements and five Sonoma County jurisdictions have received State Pro-Housing Designation.

We are working hard to grow housing options and request the MTC's support for completion of the SMART system to meet the climate friendly transportation and access needs of our residents and workers. Every community in the North Bay that can benefit from the rail and pathway asset should be given the opportunity. The investment in SMART brings opportunities and opens possibilities for families throughout our communities.

We thank you for your consideration of this Plan Bay Area 2050 amendment request to match our community's and our voters' commitment to a healthier transportation future.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, consisting of several overlapping loops and a vertical line on the left side.

David Rabbitt,  
Second District Supervisor, Sonoma County

CC: Sonoma County Board of Supervisors

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Cc:** [district4@sonoma-county.org](mailto:district4@sonoma-county.org)  
**Subject:** Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment  
**Date:** Saturday, August 31, 2024 8:31:25 PM

You don't often get email from [REDACTED]. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment

Dear Chair Pedroza,

Cloverdale Indivisible represents 186 Cloverdale residents who are concerned with significant social, economic, and environmental justice issues that impact us at the local level, as well as at the state and national levels. With our concerns in mind, we have been reviewing the Metropolitan Transportation Commission/Association of Bay Area Governments (MTC/ABAG) Draft Amended Transportation Plan for the Bay Area 2050.

We were shocked and dismayed to see that the 2024 draft omits Cloverdale from the 2050 plans. As early as 1997, Cloverdale built a train station in preparation for transit coming to our community. This reflects how important SMART is to our residents. Moreover, this year we broke ground on building 75 affordable housing units – all within short walking distance from this station – in anticipation of this promised transit.

Cloverdale has been Federally designated as a historically disadvantaged community for low income and low educational attainment. For us, SMART will be a **Social and Economic Justice elevator**. SMART will help level the playing field for disadvantaged students in Cloverdale by increasing access for our students to Jr. College, colleges and universities.

SMART will open up many more job opportunities for our workforce, and it is essential for maximizing job opportunities and taking Cloverdale workers to jobs throughout the Bay Area. Buses from Cloverdale to Santa Rosa currently take 1.5 hours – too long for a reasonable commute for workers or students.

Cloverdale's economic growth has suffered greatly as a result of the Covid Pandemic. The anticipation of the SMART extension to Cloverdale will stimulate much needed development for our community.

Dropping Cloverdale from the 2050 SMART Plans is not acceptable and is a betrayal of trust. Residents of Cloverdale and the surrounding areas have been paying

the same sales taxes which support this project as the residents to our south who are already benefiting from SMART.

Residents of our community have been big supporters of SMART. The only folks who have disapproved are residents who are anti-tax, anti-transit, and who *have predicted that -while they would be taxed - SMART would never be built to Cloverdale in their lifetimes.* Wow! Please don't make them right and the rest of us stupid. What a horrible lesson that would be.

Thank you for your important consideration.

Sincerely,

Cloverdale Indivisible Steering Committee

Pam Browning, Brooke Greene, Virginia Greenwald, and Vicky Groom

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** Smart Train  
**Date:** Monday, September 2, 2024 10:51:14 AM

---

You don't often get email from [REDACTED]. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Why is Cloverdale not included in the plan? The smart train was sold to taxpayers as a 70 mile train from Larkspur to Cloverdale. Tax payers have been paying for 70 miles. Explain your agency omission of Cloverdale. Roz Katz



**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** Smart train to Cloverdale  
**Date:** Monday, September 2, 2024 3:00:59 PM

You don't often get email from [REDACTED]. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

I was sent a notice that MTC/ABAG is including an amendment to the Plan, extending Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit (SMART) to Healdsburg, but not to Cloverdale. We voted for the SMART train's tax with the agreement that the SMART train would go to Cloverdale. I planned on using the service extensively. Cloverdale built a depot well over a decade ago and now I learn the SMART is abandoning their plans to provide service. I am not only greatly disappointed but truly feel betrayed by SMART.

I trust you will review your plan and continue to support the Cloverdale service.

Rob Davis

(resident of Cloverdale since 1978)

From: [REDACTED]  
To: [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
Subject: SMART  
Date: Monday, September 2, 2024 4:19:53 PM

You don't often get email from [REDACTED]. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS:  
CLOVERDALE, BEING THE MOST NORTHERNLY, OF SONOMA COUNTY CITIES, IS IN CRITICAL NEED OF ADVANCED AND TIMELY RAIL SERVICE. THAT IS WHY THE SMART TRAIN NEEDS TO COME TO CLOVERDALE AND SERVE IT'S APPROXIMENT 9,000 RESIDENTS. THERE IS ALSO UNDER CONSTRUCTION OR IN THE PLANNING STAGE, THE BUILDING OF 348 HOMES AT HE SOUTHERN END OF TOWN.  
CLOVERDALE HAS THE TRAIN STAIN THE POPULACE AND THE NEED FOR TIMELY AND EFFICIENT RAIL SERVICE. DO NOT LEAVE US OUT OF YOUR PLANS.  
SINCERELY, JOAQUIN & AUDREY ESPINOSA**

[REDACTED]

Carol Russell



September 4, 2024

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
info@planbayarea.org

Attn: Plan Bay Area 2050+ Comments

Dear Commissioner Pedroza:

During my 12 years on Cloverdale City Council, I served in many capacities - one of which was as a member of the SMART Board.

Cloverdadians had worked hard across the Northern part of the County to see that the SMART initiative was passed. Since then, we have been paying the required taxes to help keep SMART alive and growing. When changes in the economy challenged the plans for the development of the rail line, the possibility of putting Cloverdale on the "back burner" or eliminating it had to be seriously considered. I took a stand defending Cloverdale as a viable part of Sonoma County and future transportation.

When the Board took the vote, Cloverdale was included and has remained a part of the plan ever since.

Ours is a small town surrounded by rural County area and we often have to work hard to keep recognition and inclusion for ourselves and those around us. Even with the threat of exclusion, Cloverdadians, as we are all considered, have not panicked or turned bitter. Rather, even during difficult economic times, we continue to work supporting SMART for the community.

Please include Cloverdale as an end point when you amend your Plan Bay Area 2050+. We are part of the County and the Bay Area with a valuable potential ridership. We have been involved in SMART at a deep level from the beginning, working for it and supporting it even though at this point in time there are few benefits.

Thank you for giving us your time and consideration,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Carol Russell".

Carol Russell

**From:** [David Kelley](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Cc:** [Todd Lands](#); [Kevin Thompson](#); [Derrick Montanye](#); [Melanie Bagby](#); [ecumins@sonomamarintrain.org](mailto:ecumins@sonomamarintrain.org)  
**Subject:** City of Cloverdale's Support for the Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – SMART Rail Extension to Healdsburg  
**Date:** Wednesday, September 4, 2024 12:55:02 PM  
**Attachments:** [Cloverdale SMART Plan Bay Area Amendment August 2024 Support Letter.pdf](#)

You don't often get email from [dkelley@ci.cloverdale.ca.us](mailto:dkelley@ci.cloverdale.ca.us). [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Dear Commissioner Pedroza and Members of the MTC,

On behalf of the City of Cloverdale, I am pleased to submit the attached letter signed by Mayor Todd Lands, expressing our strong support for the proposed amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050. This amendment will extend the Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit (SMART) passenger rail to Healdsburg, with a vision for further expansion to Cloverdale.

The extension is critical to advancing our shared goals of reducing greenhouse gas emissions, improving regional connectivity, and enhancing access to housing and economic opportunities for disadvantaged communities.

Please feel free to contact me if any further information or clarifications are needed. Thank you for your time and consideration.

**Attachment:** City of Cloverdale Support Letter for Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – SMART Rail Extension to Healdsburg

Best regards,  
David Kelley  
City of Cloverdale

**David J. Kelley | City Manager**  
City of Cloverdale  
124 N. Cloverdale Blvd.  
Cloverdale, CA 95425  
(707) 894-1710 | [www.cloverdale.net](http://www.cloverdale.net)



August 29, 2024

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – City of Cloverdale Support

Dear Chair Pedroza,

On behalf of the City of Cloverdale, we are pleased to support the pending amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050 for the Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit District (SMART) expansion north with the next step of connecting Healdsburg to the SMART Rail and Pathway network. The City of Cloverdale would like to take this opportunity to urge you to support for amending Plan Bay Area 2050 to include completing the entire SMART Rail and Pathway network to Cloverdale.

The City of Cloverdale has long been a proponent of the return of freight and passenger rail services to our rural, agricultural and hard-working community. Cloverdale was originally established and developed around rail service and believes the future of California depends on a network of rail to support equitable access to housing and opportunity, economic vitality, lowering of greenhouse gas emissions and protection of our climate. Cloverdale has worked hard to support the Federal, State and Regional goals to reduce emissions, particularly from transportation, including developing a transit-oriented district around the future SMART Station and our Downtown (Cloverdale SMART Station Area/Downtown Plan, July 2010)..

Our rural community is also committed to helping recover from the recent years of devastating wildfires and housing loss by supporting those who have been and will continue to be displaced. We work hard to support infill housing opportunities to address our ongoing housing shortage crisis. Many in the development community have conveyed their interest in creating more housing in Cloverdale, but only if SMART's services are extended further towards our city. Our first 75 affordable housing units are being constructed today in our "transit-oriented development" zone, with no train to support the community's investment in infrastructure improvements.

Our community is facing difficult economic conditions and our voters are being asked to pass a sales tax this fall supporting basic community services. We recognize our future will continue to be filled with challenges such as creating more housing, ensuring ample broadband access, providing wildfire evacuation options, sourcing sufficient water and providing transportation options that allow our economy to thrive and people to have access to opportunity in a way that has minimal environmental impact. Extending SMART to our community can help us meet those challenges and create more high-quality transit access connections for California's North Coast.

Cloverdale has Federal designation as a historically disadvantaged community for low income and low educational attainment, which could be solved by high quality, affordable rail access to economic and educational opportunities. The State of California is planning to create an intercity-bus hub at the Cloverdale SMART station to improve connectivity for the North Coast of California, including Mendocino County and others that have been declared federal Areas of Persistent Poverty. North Sonoma County from Healdsburg to the Mendocino County line, twenty miles, has rural designation, making Cloverdale to Healdsburg rail a unique opportunity for rural federal rail investment, if SMART's Cloverdale extension is included in the regional transportation plan.

We thank you for your consideration of the Plan Bay Area amendment to match our voters' commitment to a healthier transportation future by including the entire SMART Rail and Pathway network to Cloverdale in Play Bay Area 2050.

Sincerely,

Todd Lands  
Mayor

c:

Honorable Jared Huffman, US Congressman

Mike McQuire, Senate President Pro Tempore

James Woods, Assembly Speaker pro Tempore, District 2

Cloverdale City Council

James R. Cameron, Executive Director Sonoma County Transportation Authority

**From:** [David Kelley](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Cc:** [Todd Lands](#); [Kevin Thompson](#); [Derrick Montanye](#); [Melanie Bagby](#); [ecumins@sonomamarintrain.org](mailto:ecumins@sonomamarintrain.org)  
**Subject:** RE: City of Cloverdale's Support for the Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – SMART Rail Extension to Healdsburg  
**Date:** Wednesday, September 4, 2024 3:22:55 PM  
**Attachments:** [Cloverdale SMART Plan Bay Area Amendment August 2024 Support Letter.pdf](#)

You don't often get email from [dkelley@ci.cloverdale.ca.us](mailto:dkelley@ci.cloverdale.ca.us). [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Dear Commissioner Pedroza and Members of the MTC,

On behalf of the City of Cloverdale, I am pleased to submit the attached letter signed by Mayor Todd Lands, expressing our strong support for the proposed amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050. This amendment will extend the Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit (SMART) passenger rail to Healdsburg, with a vision for further expansion to Cloverdale.

The extension is critical to advancing our shared goals of reducing greenhouse gas emissions, improving regional connectivity, and enhancing access to housing and economic opportunities for disadvantaged communities.

Please feel free to contact me if any further information or clarifications are needed. Thank you for your time and consideration.

**Attachment:** City of Cloverdale Support Letter for Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – SMART Rail Extension to Healdsburg

**David J. Kelley | City Manager**

City of Cloverdale  
124 N. Cloverdale Blvd.  
Cloverdale, CA 95425  
(707) 894-1710 | [www.cloverdale.net](http://www.cloverdale.net)



---

**From:** David Kelley  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 04, 2024 12:54 PM  
**To:** [info@planbayarea.org](mailto:info@planbayarea.org)  
**Cc:** [Todd Lands <tlands@ci.cloverdale.ca.us>](mailto:tlands@ci.cloverdale.ca.us); [Kevin Thompson <kthompson@ci.cloverdale.ca.us>](mailto:kthompson@ci.cloverdale.ca.us); [Derrick Montanye <dmontanye@ci.cloverdale.ca.us>](mailto:dmontanye@ci.cloverdale.ca.us); [Melanie Bagby <mbagby@ci.cloverdale.ca.us>](mailto:mbagby@ci.cloverdale.ca.us); [ecumins@sonomamarintrain.org](mailto:ecumins@sonomamarintrain.org)  
**Subject:** City of Cloverdale's Support for the Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – SMART Rail Extension to Healdsburg

Dear Commissioner Pedroza and Members of the MTC,

On behalf of the City of Cloverdale, I am pleased to submit the attached letter signed by Mayor Todd Lands, expressing our strong support for the proposed amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050. This amendment will extend the Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit (SMART) passenger rail to Healdsburg, with a vision for further expansion to Cloverdale.

The extension is critical to advancing our shared goals of reducing greenhouse gas emissions, improving regional connectivity, and enhancing access to housing and economic opportunities for disadvantaged communities.

Please feel free to contact me if any further information or clarifications are needed. Thank you for your time and consideration.

**Attachment:** City of Cloverdale Support Letter for Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – SMART Rail Extension to Healdsburg

Best regards,  
David Kelley  
City of Cloverdale

**David J. Kelley | City Manager**  
City of Cloverdale  
124 N. Cloverdale Blvd.  
Cloverdale, CA 95425  
(707) 894-1710 | [www.cloverdale.net](http://www.cloverdale.net)





August 29, 2024

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment – City of Cloverdale Support

Dear Chair Pedroza,

On behalf of the City of Cloverdale, we are pleased to support the pending amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050 for the Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit District (SMART) expansion north with the next step of connecting Healdsburg to the SMART Rail and Pathway network. The City of Cloverdale would like to take this opportunity to urge you to support for amending Plan Bay Area 2050 to include completing the entire SMART Rail and Pathway network to Cloverdale.

The City of Cloverdale has long been a proponent of the return of freight and passenger rail services to our rural, agricultural and hard-working community. Cloverdale was originally established and developed around rail service and believes the future of California depends on a network of rail to support equitable access to housing and opportunity, economic vitality, lowering of greenhouse gas emissions and protection of our climate. Cloverdale has worked hard to support the Federal, State and Regional goals to reduce emissions, particularly from transportation, including developing a transit-oriented district around the future SMART Station and our Downtown (Cloverdale SMART Station Area/Downtown Plan, July 2010)..

Our rural community is also committed to helping recover from the recent years of devastating wildfires and housing loss by supporting those who have been and will continue to be displaced. We work hard to support infill housing opportunities to address our ongoing housing shortage crisis. Many in the development community have conveyed their interest in creating more housing in Cloverdale, but only if SMART's services are extended further towards our city. Our first 75 affordable housing units are being constructed today in our "transit-oriented development" zone, with no train to support the community's investment in infrastructure improvements.

Our community is facing difficult economic conditions and our voters are being asked to pass a sales tax this fall supporting basic community services. We recognize our future will continue to be filled with challenges such as creating more housing, ensuring ample broadband access, providing wildfire evacuation options, sourcing sufficient water and providing transportation options that allow our economy to thrive and people to have access to opportunity in a way that has minimal environmental impact. Extending SMART to our community can help us meet those challenges and create more high-quality transit access connections for California's North Coast.

Cloverdale has Federal designation as a historically disadvantaged community for low income and low educational attainment, which could be solved by high quality, affordable rail access to economic and educational opportunities. The State of California is planning to create an intercity-bus hub at the Cloverdale SMART station to improve connectivity for the North Coast of California, including Mendocino County and others that have been declared federal Areas of Persistent Poverty. North Sonoma County from Healdsburg to the Mendocino County line, twenty miles, has rural designation, making Cloverdale to Healdsburg rail a unique opportunity for rural federal rail investment, if SMART's Cloverdale extension is included in the regional transportation plan.

We thank you for your consideration of the Plan Bay Area amendment to match our voters' commitment to a healthier transportation future by including the entire SMART Rail and Pathway network to Cloverdale in Play Bay Area 2050.

Sincerely,



Todd Lands  
Mayor

c:

Honorable Jared Huffman, US Congressman

Mike McGuire, Senate President Pro Tempore

Jim Wood, Assembly Speaker pro Tempore, District 2

Cloverdale City Council

James R. Cameron, Executive Director Sonoma County Transportation Authority

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** Cloverdale Smart Train  
**Date:** Thursday, September 5, 2024 9:22:25 AM

You don't often get email from [REDACTED]. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Dear Commissioner Pedroza:

During my 12 years on Cloverdale City Council, i served in many capacities - one of which was as a member on the SMART Board.

Cloverdaliens had worked hard across the Northern part of the County to see that the SMART initiative was passed. Since then, we have been paying the required taxes to help keep SMART alive and growing. When changes in the economy challenged the plans for development of the rail line, the possibility of putting Cloverdale on the “back burner” or eliminating it had to be seriously considered. I took a stand defending Cloverdale as a viable part of Sonoma County and future transportation.

When the Board took the vote, Cloverdale was included and has remained a part of the plan ever since.

Ours is a small town surrounded by rural County area and we often have to work hard to keep recognition and inclusion for ourselves and those around us. Even with the threat of exclusion, Cloverdaliens, as we are all considered, have not panicked or turned bitter. Rather, even during difficult economic times, we continue to work supporting SMART for the community.

Please include Cloverdale as an end point when you amend your Plan Bay Area 2050+. We are a part of the County and Bay Area with a valuable potential ridership. We have been involved in SMART at a deep level from the beginning, working for it and supporting it even though at this point in time there are few benefits.

Thank you for giving us your time and consideration,

Carol Russell

**From:** [Raina Allan](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** Proposed Draft Amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050 - Letter of Support  
**Date:** Thursday, September 5, 2024 3:27:38 PM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[image002.png](#)  
[image003.png](#)  
[image004.png](#)  
[image005.png](#)  
[image006.png](#)  
[Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment Letter.pdf](#)

You don't often get email from [rallan@healdsburg.gov](mailto:rallan@healdsburg.gov). [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Good Afternoon,

Attached, please find a letter of support for the proposed amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thank you,

---

**RAINA ALLAN, CMC, CPMC | City Clerk/Public Information Officer**

City of Healdsburg | City Manager's Office

401 Grove Street, Healdsburg, CA 95448

Office: (707) 431-3316

[rallan@healdsburg.gov](mailto:rallan@healdsburg.gov) | [healdsburg.gov](http://healdsburg.gov)





**CITY OF HEALDSBURG**  
**CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE**

401 Grove Street  
Healdsburg, CA 95448-4723

Phone: (707) 431-3317  
Fax: (707) 431-3321

Visit us at [www.healdsburg.gov](http://www.healdsburg.gov)

**VIA EMAIL**

September 5, 2024

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

**Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment - Support**

Dear Chair Pedroza,

On behalf of the City of Healdsburg, we are pleased to support the pending amendment for the Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit District (SMART) expansion north connecting Healdsburg to the SMART Rail and Pathway network.

Despite the fire and pandemic challenges of the last few years, the City of Healdsburg continues to work diligently in preparation for the arrival of SMART rail services. We are all working hard to meet our regional housing goals and build up our stock of affordable housing, which for us includes committing millions of local dollars and providing access to good paying jobs located along the SMART corridor.

Our employers and businesses need workers and visitors to be able to get to Healdsburg by rail - reliably, affordably and in an environmentally friendly manner, without overburdening our constrained parking supply. The extension of SMART rail services through the northern half of Sonoma County is critical to the continued efforts of our city and our neighboring communities to grow in a sustainable manner. We are committed to building affordable housing and workforce housing and providing climate friendly transportation options for our residents to get to school, work and recreational activities in our neighboring communities. Our recent California Pro-Housing designation is one progress step towards fulfilling our community's local and regional housing needs.

We thank you for your consideration of this request to match our voters' commitment to a healthier transportation future.

Sincerely,

Jeff Kay, City Manager  
City of Healdsburg

**From:** [Jack](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** Comments on Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment  
**Date:** Thursday, September 5, 2024 5:06:48 PM  
**Attachments:** [FoS Comments on PBA2050.pdf](#)  
**Importance:** Low

---

You don't often get email from friendsofsmart@sbcglobal.net. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Dear Colleagues at MTC:

Friends of Sonoma Marin Area Rail Transit (SMART) are pleased to be able to submit our thoughts regarding the proposed Amendment to Plan Bay Area 2050. It is a good step in the right direction.

Cordially.

**Jack Swearingen, Chair**

Friends of SMART

**Web** [friendsofsmart.com](http://friendsofsmart.com)

**Email** [friendsofsmart@sbcglobal.net](mailto:friendsofsmart@sbcglobal.net)





FRIENDS OF SMART

Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Attn: Plan Bay Area 2050 Comments  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800 San Francisco, CA 94105

September 5, 2024

Dear Colleagues at MTC:

The local cities of Petaluma and Novato each attract day-trippers from Marin and Sonoma Counties as well as from the rest of the Bay Area. But the wine country that extends northward from Santa Rosa into Mendocino County provides an international tourist draw as well as a favored destination for residents from all over the greater Bay Area. The tourism and visitor revenue potential for SMART can offset much or all of the public cost of extending the tracks to Healdsburg. “Show me the numbers”, you may reply. I remind you of something we already know--if we are honest and open about it—that *all* forecasting is fraught with uncertainty because it depends critically upon assumptions, and its’ ally, judgement. I have thirty years’ experience forecasting the lifetimes of engineering materials and structures, and twenty years’ experience pondering SMART’s long-term future. In terms of process thinking and the overweening influence of assumptions, forecasting is very similar across most applications.

A few years ago—just before the Covid Pandemic—my wife and I rode a SMART train from Santa Rosa to “The City” for an outing. For us the train and ferry rides were part of the fun. We ate a tasty lunch in the Ferry Building and then strolled through the building looking at the variety of shops and restaurants. We noticed a cluster of people gathered around a “sign board” and chatting. My curiosity was stimulated by theirs, so I strolled over to see what the attraction was. Turns out it was an invitation to the Napa Valley Wine Train, and judging by the spoken languages, the group was comprised of Asians and Europeans.

The ad was inviting, and my thoughts turned to the SMART Train. Why couldn’t SMART offer such a service in Sonoma and Marin counties? We have a smoother and equally scenic train ride, plenty of boutique wineries, many equipped with food and covered patios. Wineries not within walking distance of a station doubtless will seize the opportunity by operating private shuttles.

The Napa Wine Train has all these attributes. What can SMART bring to the table as a new enticement? There is the issue of affordability as the SMART train is a public conveyance, family affordable and kid friendly. And then there is the Golden Gate (Larkspur) Ferry experience, of course! What could be better than a scenic ferry boat ride followed by a train ride to the wineries--or even an overnighter to historic Santa Rosa, Windsor, Healdsburg or further north?

A scientist and engineer such as me must write very carefully if he dares to venture far from quantitate arguments. But after reading the pro or con reasons put forward to date about SMART’s Healdsburg extension, I was compelled to write the foregoing “platform.” And to remain consistent and to retain my readers’ interest I shall briefly summarize the host of ancillary issues that could be included at the cost of major increase in word count. Much of it is well-known to sustainable transportation and land use advocates.

1. The platform or foundational principle for this commentary is that highway-based transportation is not sustainable from most major perspectives: energy consumption,



FRIENDS OF SMART

- pollution, land use, economics, and social costs. Every single trip or shipment made by rail instead of highway brings a reduction in energy use and pollution.
2. Rail has long been the agent of efficient land use—in contrast to highways, which are the agent of sprawl. Los Angeles Basin, of course, is the poster child for this truth.
  3. Population growth: Global warming will make coastal California increasingly attractive as a place to live.
  4. Personal recreation--as exemplified by the Great Redwood Trail--must not impair efficient and environmentally superior transportation of goods and services.
  5. SMART Rail to Healdsburg is a steppingstone to restoring rail to Mendocino County—including at minimum a truck-to-train transfer facility at Willits.
  6. I have emphasized the economic development side of tourism. But the revenue gained from tourism also will make SMART more financially sustainable, perhaps reducing its need for future transit subsidies (i.e., funding from MTC).
  7. For all these reasons it is more important to get SMART to Healdsburg than to build or refine freeway on-ramps and off-ramps.

Friends of SMART hope that you will factor these” out-of-the box” comments on the Amended Plan Bay Area 2050 draft.

Submitted on behalf of Friends of SMART by

**Jack Swearingen, PhD.**

Professor and Chair of Engineering (Ret.), Washington State University Vancouver

**Chair, Friends of SMART**

**Web** [friendsofsmart.com](http://friendsofsmart.com)

**Email** [friendsofsmart@sbcglobal.net](mailto:friendsofsmart@sbcglobal.net)



**From:** [Joanne Parker](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#); [Andrew Fremier](#)  
**Cc:** [Eddy Cumins](#)  
**Subject:** SMART - Amendment Support Letter  
**Date:** Monday, September 9, 2024 1:13:20 PM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[SMART\\_PBA2050Amendment\\_September2024\\_Support.pdf](#)

You don't often get email from [jparker@sonomamarintrain.org](mailto:jparker@sonomamarintrain.org). [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Andy,

On behalf of Eddy, please find PBA2050 Amendment support letter attached.

Thank you,

Joanne Parker

Grants & Legislative Affairs Manager  
Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit District  
5401 Old Redwood Highway, Suite 200  
Petaluma, CA 94954  
Main: 707-794-3330  
Fax: 707-794-3037

[www.sonomamarintrain.org](http://www.sonomamarintrain.org)



CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message, together with any attachments, is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to whom it is addressed and may contain information that is confidential and/or privileged and prohibited from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, or copying of this message, or any attachment, is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the original sender immediately by telephone or by return e-mail and delete this message along with any attachments.



September 9, 2024

**Eric Lucan, Chair**  
Marin County Board of Supervisors

**Melanie Bagby, Vice Chair**  
Sonoma County Mayors' and  
Councilmembers Association

**Kate Colin**  
Transportation Authority of Marin

**Chris Coursey**  
Sonoma County Board of Supervisors

**Rachel Farac**  
Transportation Authority of Marin

**Debora Fudge**  
Sonoma County Mayors' and  
Councilmembers Association

**Patty Garbarino**  
Golden Gate Bridge,  
Highway/Transportation District

**Barbara Pahre**  
Golden Gate Bridge,  
Highway/Transportation District

**Gabe Paulson**  
Marin County Council of Mayors and  
Councilmembers

**David Rabbitt**  
Sonoma County Board of Supervisors

**Chris Rogers**  
Sonoma County Mayors' and  
Councilmembers Association

**Mary Sackett**  
Marin County Board of Supervisors

**Eddy Cumins**  
General Manager

5401 Old Redwood Highway  
Suite 200  
Petaluma, CA 94954  
Phone: 707-794-3330  
Fax: 707-794-3037  
[www.SonomaMarinTrain.org](http://www.SonomaMarinTrain.org)

Andrew Fremier, Executive Director  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

**Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment - Support**

Dear Mr. Fremier,

On behalf of the Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit District (SMART) and the communities we serve, I am writing to express support for the pending Plan Bay Area amendment for the SMART expansion connecting Healdsburg to the SMART Rail and Pathway network.

SMART is experiencing ridership higher than ever before, currently 30% higher than pre-pandemic. We have implemented multiple changes to adapt to the new post-pandemic travel patterns, including increased weekday and weekend frequency, improved first and last mile solutions, and free fares for youth and seniors. Additionally, SMART is well known for clean and safe trains with an impressive 96% on-time performance rate. This combination of improvements and sustained performance has enabled SMART to have the highest ridership recovery rate in the Bay Area and the second highest among Commuter Rail agencies in the country.

In the past few months, SMART has broken all-time records for monthly ridership, weekday ridership, weekend ridership, bicycles carried onboard, and monthly passenger miles travelled. SMART has strong bi-directional commute patterns and trip origins and destinations spread throughout the corridor; post-pandemic, demand has grown rapidly for off-peak and weekend travel, with midday train loads rivaling commute hours during the summer months. Youth and senior ridership of SMART has soared in recent months, estimated to make up nearly half of SMART's daily ridership, mirroring the demographic of the counties.

Thanks to the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) for conducting a regional onboard transit survey, including on the SMART system, during the period of September 2023 through February 2024. Results from that survey show a third (32%) of SMART riders responding earn less than \$60,000 in household income annually and over half of riders (54%) earn less than \$100,000 annually.

SMART is actively expanding the rail and path system today. The Petaluma North infill station started construction in November 2023 and will be open for revenue service at the end of 2024. The Windsor rail and pathway (3.1-mile) extension re-started construction in November 2023 and will be open for service in late Spring 2025. Over 9-miles of SMART Pathway/Great Redwood Trail segments are currently under construction and anticipated to open around the end of 2024, bringing the total completed pathway to 38-miles. Many of these pathway segments cross significant barriers and safely connect communities across our corridor where no pedestrian/bike path of travel currently exists. Thank you to MTC, which has been a strong partner in funding these critical pathway projects, including regional Active Transportation Program and One Bay Area (Quick Strike) grant funds.

We hear every day from our constituents onboard the trains and in each of our communities about the regional significance of the SMART system. In addition to providing a climate friendly transportation option, the SMART system provides access to opportunity, supports economic development, and extends the reach for businesses seeking employees. Amending the Healdsburg extension into Plan Bay Area 2050 will enable SMART to compete for funds and ultimately construct this critical segment further strengthening the SMART system.

Thank you for this consideration of amending Plan Bay Area 2050 so that the region and the North Bay can have a healthier transportation future.

Sincerely,



Eddy Cumins  
General Manager

C: SMART Board of Directors

**From:** [Irene Camacho-Werby](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** Letter of Support for Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment from the Town of Windsor, California.  
**Date:** Tuesday, September 10, 2024 5:16:48 PM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[image003.png](#)  
[2024-09-10 - Windsor Support of SMART Expansion North of Windsor.pdf](#)

---

You don't often get email from [iwerby@townofwindsor.com](mailto:iwerby@townofwindsor.com). [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Dear Metropolitan Transportation Commission Chair Pedroza,

Please find attached a letter of support for Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment from the Town of Windsor, California.

Sincerely,

**Irene Camacho-Werby, MMC, EMPA**

Town Clerk/Public Information Officer | Town of Windsor

9291 Old Redwood Hwy., Bldg. 400, Windsor, CA 95492

[iwerby@townofwindsor.com](mailto:iwerby@townofwindsor.com) | Office (707) 838-5315 | Office Cell (707) 239-9768

Hours: Monday – Thursday 7am-6pm, Closed every Friday



**Town of Windsor**  
9291 Old Redwood Hwy  
P.O. Box 100  
Windsor, CA 95492

**Mayor**  
Rosa Reynoza

**Vice Mayor, District 4**  
Tanya Potter

**Councilmember District 3**  
Debora Fudge

**Councilmember District 2**  
Sam Salmon

**Councilmember District 1**  
Mike Wall

**Town Manager**  
Jon Davis

September 10, 2024

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

**Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment - Support**

Dear Chair Pedroza,

On behalf of the Town of Windsor, we are pleased to support the pending amendment for the Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit District (SMART) expansion north connecting Healdsburg to the SMART Rail and Pathway network.

SMART is experiencing unprecedented ridership growth as the pandemic and fire traumas fade and the new North Bay travel patterns emerge. Starting Spring 2025, the SMART system will cover 48- of the 70-mile voter approved railroad, with 14 stations and 37 miles of pathway open to the public. SMART is providing more service on both weekdays and weekends than was originally planned and the frequency is attracting new riders every day. When combined with SMART’s new short line freight railroad services, the entire system is critical to the economic development of North Bay communities and industries.

SMART’s Windsor extension construction is fully underway, and our community is excited by the opportunity the railroad brings. The old railroad tracks that have been a physical presence in our town since our inception are on the cusp of providing modern public benefits. Since 2001, the Town of Windsor has been preparing for the return of passenger rail through the development of the award-winning Town Green Village and supporting walkable housing development. Windsor has a certified Housing Element and has received California Pro-Housing designation. We have developed a long-standing commitment to creating a healthy and diverse community. The operating railroad, connecting Windsor with our neighbors to the south and to the north, is a keystone component of this planning initiative.

Our Windsor businesses look forward to the extension of SMART rail service north to expand reach for employees, attract new customers and visitors, and ultimately drive economic growth in an environmentally sustainable manner.

We thank you for your consideration of this TIRCP request to bring SMART to our neighbors to the north and to match our voters’ commitment to a healthier transportation future. And we cordially invite you to visit us when the train arrives in 2025.

Sincerely,

Rosa Reynoza  
Mayor

CC: Town Council



**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** SMART Plans Must Include CLOVERDALE  
**Date:** Wednesday, September 11, 2024 1:22:00 PM

You don't often get email from [REDACTED]. [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair Metropolitan Transportation Commission Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment

Dear Chair Pedroza,

Cloverdale Indivisible represents 180 Cloverdale residents who are concerned with significant social, economic, and environmental justice issues that impact us at the local level, as well as at the state and national levels. With these concerns in mind, we have been reviewing the Metropolitan Transportation Commission/Association of Bay Area Governments (MTC/ABAG) Draft Amended Transportation Plan for the Bay Area 2050.

We were shocked and dismayed to see that the 2024 draft omits Cloverdale from the 2050 plans. As early as 1997, Cloverdale built a train station in preparation for transit coming to our community. This reflects how important SMART is to our residents. Moreover, this year we broke ground on building 75 affordable housing units — all within short walking distance from this station — in anticipation of this promised transit.

Cloverdale has been Federally designated as a historically disadvantaged community for low income and low educational attainment. For us, SMART will be a *Social and Economic Justice elevator*. SMART will help level the playing field for disadvantaged students in Cloverdale by increasing access for our students to Jr. College, colleges and universities.

Smart will open up many more job opportunities for our workforce, and it is essential for maximizing job opportunities and taking Cloverdale workers to jobs throughout the Bay Area. Buses from Cloverdale to Santa Rosa currently take 1.5 hours — too long for a reasonable commute for workers or students.

Cloverdale's economic growth has suffered greatly as a result of the Covid Pandemic. The anticipation of the SMART extension to Cloverdale will stimulate much needed development for our community.

Dropping Cloverdale from the 2050 SMART Plans is not acceptable and is a betrayal of trust. Residents of Cloverdale and the surrounding areas have been paying the same sales taxes which support this project as the residents to our south who are already benefitting from SMART.

Residents of our community have been big supporters of SMART. The only folks who have disapproved are residents who are anti-tax, anti-transit, and who *have predicted that — while they would be taxed — SMART would never be built to Cloverdale in their lifetimes*. Wow! Please don't

make them right and the rest of us stupid. What a horrible lesson that would be.

Thank you for your important consideration.

Sincerely,

Cloverdale Indivisible Steering Committee  
Pam Browning, Brooke Green, Virginia Greenwald, and Vicky Groom

Cc:

Honorable Jared Huffman, US Congressman

Mike McGuire, Senate President Pro Tempore

Jim Wood, Assembly Speaker pro Tempore, District 2

Cloverdale City Council

James R. Cameron, Executive Director Sonoma County Transportation Authority

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#)  
**Subject:** PBA 2050 Comments - Funding for SMART Extension to Healdsburg | SCTL  
**Date:** Wednesday, September 11, 2024 3:13:26 PM  
**Attachments:** [LTR to MTC - SMART to Healdsburg 9-11-24.docx](#)

---

[You don't often get email from [REDACTED]. Learn why this is important at [REDACTED].]

\*External Email\*

Greetings MTC Commissioners and staff—

Attached are comments in support of Plan Bay Area 2050 funding to extend SMART service to the City of Healdsburg.

Please acknowledge receipt of this comment letter.

Stephen Birdlebough, Chair, Sonoma County Transportation & Land-Use Coalition

[REDACTED]

-----





SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION & LAND-USE COALITION

September 11, 2024

Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Attn: Plan Bay Area 2050 Comments  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

Via Email [info@planbayarea.org](mailto:info@planbayarea.org)

Re: Plan Bay Area 2050 Amendment: Sonoma-Marin Rail Transit to Healdsburg

Dear Commissioners and Staff:

For three decades the Sonoma County Transportation and Land-Use Coalition has advocated for active transportation and transit-oriented developments in the North Bay of San Francisco. We support the proposed amendment of Plan Bay Area 2050 to provide the essential funding for extension of Sonoma Marin Area Rail Transit (SMART) passenger and freight rail service to the City of Healdsburg.

Since SMART rail service began in 2017 the train has become an important element of the North Bay's economy. There have been notable increases in ridership as more people discover that the train provides a reliable alternative to driving. We have observed significant increases in the construction of multi-story, transit-oriented housing, and we expect freight operations to begin taking more trucks off the road as the tracks extend further north. The train is proving to be a vital transportation asset for the region. Extension of service to Healdsburg is an important step toward unlocking opportunities for people and businesses located along the entire SMART corridor.

SCTL C - 684 Benicia Drive, Apt 63, Santa Rosa, CA 95409 – 707-576-6632  
[scb.affirm@gmail.com](mailto:scb.affirm@gmail.com)

The SMART train has been a long time in the making with a massive display of support community wide. Funding that enables SMART to extend its reach is likely to become increasingly important as our nation's population discovers the advantages of residing in a Mediterranean climate. In view of the value of passenger and freight rail service for the area between Windsor and Healdsburg, we think it is worthwhile to postpone some funding for other Sonoma County projects and programs, in favor of enabling rail service to reach the Healdsburg Station.

Please get in touch with us if you desire any further information. Our phone number is 707-576-6632. Thank you for your hard work in keeping the Plan Bay Area current.

Cordially,

Stephen Birdlebough, Chair, Sonoma County Transportation & Land-Use Coalition

**From:** [Callaway, Jenny](#)  
**To:** [Plan BayArea Info](#); [Andrew Fremier](#)  
**Cc:** [CAScheduling, Huffman](#); [shane.trimmer](#)  
**Subject:** Letter from Congressman Huffman  
**Date:** Thursday, September 12, 2024 12:45:06 PM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[image002.png](#)  
[image003.png](#)  
[image004.png](#)  
[09.11.24 Rep. Huffman support for Bay Area Plan 2050 Amendment and 2050+.pdf](#)

You don't often get email from [jenny.callaway@mail.house.gov](mailto:jenny.callaway@mail.house.gov). [Learn why this is important](#)

**\*External Email\***

Attached please find a letter from Congressman Jared Huffman re: Bay Area Plan 2050 Amendment and the Bay Area Plan 2050+. Please confirm receipt.

Best,  
Jenny



**Jenny Callaway (she/her)**

Senior Advisor & Director of Community Initiatives  
Office of Congressman Jared Huffman  
**Phone:** 415-258-9657  
**Email:** [jenny.callaway@mail.house.gov](mailto:jenny.callaway@mail.house.gov)  
999 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Suite 290  
San Rafael, CA 94901  
[www.huffman.house.gov](http://www.huffman.house.gov)



JARED HUFFMAN  
2ND DISTRICT, CALIFORNIA

WASHINGTON OFFICE  
2445 RAYBURN HOUSE OFFICE BUILDING  
WASHINGTON, DC 20515  
PHONE: (202) 225-5161  
WEBSITE: huffman.house.gov

Congress of the United States  
House of Representatives  
Washington, DC 20515-0502

COMMITTEE ON  
NATURAL RESOURCES  
WATER, WILDLIFE, AND FISHERIES – RANKING MEMBER  
ENERGY AND MINERAL RESOURCES  
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION  
AND INFRASTRUCTURE  
HIGHWAYS AND TRANSIT  
WATER RESOURCES AND ENVIRONMENT  
RAILROADS, PIPELINES, AND HAZARDOUS MATERIALS  
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, PUBLIC BUILDINGS,  
AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

September 11, 2024

Commissioner Alfredo Pedroza, Chair  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105

Dear Chairman Pedroza:

I am writing to support the pending Plan Bay Area amendment for the Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit District (SMART) expansion north connecting Healdsburg to the SMART Rail and Pathway network. Additionally, I encourage you to include the completion of the SMART system through Cloverdale in Plan Bay Area 2050+ to enable SMART to compete for federal funds for implementation of this long-needed project.

SMART is experiencing unprecedented growth in ridership, passenger miles traveled, and bicycles carried onboard, while providing more service on both weekdays and weekends than was originally planned and attracting new riders every day. SMART has also added new short line freight railroad services. SMART continues to be critical to the economic development of North Bay communities and industries.

SMART's Petaluma infill station will be open for revenue service at the end of 2024 and the Windsor extension will be open for service late Spring 2025. This expansion of SMART will allow for my rural constituents to share the same benefits as my urban constituents. Toward this goal, the old railroad tracks that bisect Healdsburg and the Alexander Valley need to be modernized to unlock the transportation, public health, economic opportunity, and climate and resilience benefits for Northern Sonoma County's Bay Area communities.

Further, the Northern Sonoma County area is also home to federally designated Tribal Nations and includes elder and other tribal housing, tribal offices and gaming facilities, including Cloverdale Rancheria Band of Pomo Indians, Dry Creek Rancheria Band of Pomo Indians, Lytton Band of Pomo Indians and Kashia Band of Pomo Indians of Stuarts Point Rancheria. Additionally, the City of Cloverdale is a Historically Disadvantaged Community, and, just a few miles away, Mendocino County is an Area of Persistent Poverty.

This project is a priority for my constituents and will have environmental, economic development, affordable access and public health benefits for the communities of my district. Thank you for your full and fair consideration of Plan Bay Area 2050's amendment to include the remainder of the SMART system north to Healdsburg, and for the Plan Bay Area Update 2050+ to complete the system all the way to Cloverdale for the mutual benefit of the region and in particular my rural constituents who have been waiting for years for SMART service to include them. Please contact my Senior Advisor and Director of Community Initiatives Jenny Callaway at 415-258-9657 if you need additional information.

Sincerely,



JARED HUFFMAN  
Member of Congress

SAN RAFAEL  
999 FIFTH AVENUE, SUITE 290  
SAN RAFAEL, CA 94901  
PHONE: (415) 258-9657  
FAX: (415) 258-9913

PETALUMA  
206 G STREET, #3  
PETALUMA, CA 94952  
PHONE: (707) 981-8967

UKIAH  
200 S. SCHOOL ST.  
UKIAH, CA 95482  
PHONE: (707) 671-7449  
FAX: (707) 962-0905

FORT BRAGG  
430 NORTH FRANKLIN STREET  
P.O. BOX 2208  
FORT BRAGG, CA 95437  
PHONE: (707) 962-0933  
FAX: (707) 962-0905

EUREKA  
317 THIRD STREET, SUITE 1  
EUREKA, CA 95501  
PHONE: (707) 407-3585  
FAX: (707) 407-3559