



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

**Agenda Item 2c**  
Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
TEL 415.778.6700  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

## *Memorandum*

TO: Legislation Committee

DATE: October 7, 2016

FR: Executive Director

W. I. 1114

RE: MTC Resolution No. 3931, Revised — Policy Advisory Council Appointments

Since August 2016, staff has been recruiting to fill several vacancies on the Policy Advisory Council: two at-large seats in economy and environment, and two seats from Napa County.

MTC Resolution No. 3931, Revised (attached) — the resolution that created the Policy Advisory Council — states that appointments for all at-large advisors will be recommended by the Commission's chair and vice chair. In addition, the equity appointments are recommended by the county commissioners.

Staff received 25 applications, many of which were from highly qualified candidates. In consultation with the appointing Commissioners, staff is recommending the reappointment of two existing Council members to new categories, leaving three at-large vacancies to be filled by the recent applicants. Only one applicant resided in Napa County. Because of this and due to the large list of qualified candidates in the at-large categories, staff recommended reappointing already seated Council member Cathleen Baker to the Napa County low-income vacancy. Ms. Baker was formerly appointed to represent low-income interests in San Mateo County, but was reappointed to the environment category when she moved to Napa County. She is well qualified in either category, but has a wealth of knowledge regarding low-income, environmental health and equity issues, and has already begun to focus on housing and equity issues in Napa County where she now resides. As the appointing commissioner for Napa County, Mark Luce has agreed to her appointment in the low-income category, which opens up Ms. Baker's environment seat to be filled from the current applicant pool. Additionally, Commissioner Luce suggested Sudhir Chaudhary, the only Napa County applicant, be considered for the senior vacancy. Both Napa county seats are being recommended by Commissioner Luce.

The list of qualified applicants for three remaining at-large vacancies has been reviewed by staff and the appointing commissioners. Based on the applications received, the Commission chair and vice chair and the Napa County commissioner are recommending the following candidates for your approval.

### **Recommended Appointments**

#### ***Napa County, Equity / Low-Income***

**Cathleen Baker** is already a member of the Policy Advisory Council. The recommendation is to move her appointment to the Napa County low-income seat.

***Napa County, Equity / Senior***

**Sudhir Chaudhary** has lived in Napa for the past 37 years and is a professional land surveyor. His family owned business provides civil engineering, land surveying and construction management, and he has worked with various transportation agencies including Caltrans and BART. He looks forward to sharing the transportation needs of the Napa County senior community at the regional level.

***At-Large, Economy***

**Jonathan Fearn's** background in real estate development and city planning make him an excellent advisory candidate in the economy category. During this time when the Bay Area is focused on its housing crisis, his expertise will be a welcome addition to the Council.

***At-Large, Environment***

**Sydney Fang** is a staff member of the Asian Pacific Environmental Network (APEN), an organization that is a statewide leader in advancing and implementing equitable climate policies, as well as developing Asian American leadership to secure their healthy living environment. As a public health major and public policy minor at U.C. Berkeley, her focus has remained on environmental health issues and working to change policies that negatively impact health.

***At-Large, Environment***

**Anna Lee** is employed by the Alameda County Public Health Department as a policy coordinator and will bring an important health perspective to the environment seat. With a background in biology, she previously worked as a researcher/scientist at Communities for a Better Environment and has served on the Air District's CARE Advisory Committee.

All appointments would become effective upon Commission approval (October 26, 2016) and the appointees would serve through the term ending in July 2017.

**Policy Advisory Council Chair and Vice Chair**

Additionally, the Council has requested that Resolution 3931 be revised to allow the Council chair and vice-chair to be elected for two-year terms, as opposed to one-year terms as it now states. Staff concurs with this recommendation.

**Recommendation**

Staff requests the Legislation Committee recommend two-year terms for the Council chair and vice chair, and the appointment of Jonathan Fearn, Sydney Fang, and Anna Lee in the at-large categories; Sudhir Chaudhary in the Napa County senior category; and the reappointment of Cathleen Baker in the Napa County low-income category; and referral of Resolution 3931, Revised, to the Commission for approval.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Steve Heminger

**Attachment:**

- Attachment 1: Resolution 3931, Revised

Date:	November 18, 2009	
W.I.:	1114	
Referred by:	Legislation	
Revised:	03/24/10-C	02/23/11-C
	02/22/12-C	07/25/12-C
	03/27/13-C	07/24/13-C
	07/23/14-C	11/19/14-C
	03/25/15-C	09/23/15-C
	10/26/16-C	

### ABSTRACT

#### Resolution No. 3931, Revised

This resolution defines the role and responsibilities of the Commission's Policy Advisory Council.

This resolution supersedes Resolution No. 3516. Further discussion of this action is contained in the Executive Director's memorandum dated November 6, 2009. This resolution includes:

- Attachment A, which outlines the mission statement, roles, expectations, procedures, appointment process and membership criteria for the Council;

This resolution was revised on March 24, 2010, to include:

- Attachment B, a table listing the currently appointed advisors and their term.

This resolution was revised on February 23, 2011, to include revisions to Attachment B and:

- Attachment C, a table showing which advisors have been replaced and their replacements.

This resolution was revised on February 22, 2012 to extend the terms of the advisors identified in Attachment B through July 2013.

This resolution was revised on July 25, 2012, to include revisions to Attachment B and Attachment C.

This resolution was revised on March 27, 2013, to add Conflict of Interest and Ethics Training policies to Attachment A.

This resolution was revised on July 24, 2013, to include revisions to Attachment B and Attachment C.

This resolution was revised on July 23, 2014, to include revisions to Attachment B and Attachment C.

This resolution was revised on November 19, 2014, to include revisions to Attachment B and Attachment C.

This resolution was revised on March 25, 2015, to include revisions to Attachment B and Attachment C.

This resolution was revised on September 23, 2015, to include revisions to Attachment B and Attachment C.

This resolution was revised on October 26, 2016, to include revisions to Attachment A, Attachment B and Attachment C.

Date: November 18, 2009  
W.I.: 1114  
Referred by: Legislation

RE: Commission Policy Advisory Council

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
RESOLUTION NO. 3931

WHEREAS, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is the regional transportation planning agency for the San Francisco Bay Area pursuant to Government Code Section 66500 *et seq.*; and

WHEREAS, MTC seeks to involve citizens of diverse backgrounds and interests in the development of transportation plans and programs, in a manner consistent with applicable state and federal requirements and Commission policy (Resolution No. 2648); and

WHEREAS, MTC seeks to focus its advisory processes around the “Three E” principles of sustainability outlined in the regional transportation plan: a prosperous and globally competitive economy; a healthy and safe environment; and equity wherein all Bay Area residents share in the benefits of a well-maintained, efficient and connected regional transportation system; and

WHEREAS, MTC seeks to utilize its advisors to ensure that a wide spectrum of views are considered in developing transportation policy, and enhance the contributions and effectiveness of its advisors, now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Commission establishes a Policy Advisory Council; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the members of the Policy Advisory Council will be appointed according to the process and shall have the role, tasks, membership and meetings as described in Attachment A to this resolution, attached hereto and incorporated herein as though set forth at length; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Policy Advisory Council roster is contained in Attachment B to this resolution; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Executive Director is instructed to secure nominations to fill expired terms and other vacancies and present them to the Commission for confirmation by periodically revising Attachment B; and be it further

RESOLVED, that Resolution No. 3516, Revised, is superseded with the adoption of this resolution.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

---

Scott Haggerty, Chair

The above resolution was entered into by the  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
at a regular meeting of the Commission held  
in Oakland, California, on November 18, 2009

Date: November 18, 2009  
W.I.: 1114  
Referred by: Legislation  
Revised: 03/27/13-C 10/26/16-C

Attachment A  
Resolution No. 3931  
Page 1 of 4

**Attachment A**  
**Metropolitan Transportation Commission**  
**Policy Advisory Council**

**A. Mission Statement**

The mission of the Metropolitan Transportation Commission's Policy Advisory Council (Council) is to advise the Commission on transportation policies in the San Francisco Bay Area, incorporating diverse perspectives relating to the environment, the economy and social equity. The Council advises the Commission and its staff through the appropriate MTC standing committees on matters within MTC's jurisdiction and as assigned by the Commission.

**B. Roles/Expectations**

**1. Advisors Provide Interest-Based and/or Geographic Perspectives**

Advisors should represent the stakeholder interest under which they have been appointed. Although some advisors may be appointed based on an organizational affiliation, they should represent their constituency (not just their individual organization).

**2. Responsibilities**

Advisors will be expected to regularly attend their Council meetings and to maintain an ongoing engagement with organizations and individuals who make up the advisor's constituency.

**3. Council Work Plan**

The Commission will hold an annual workshop as a separately agendized meeting with the Policy Advisory Council to set the Council's work plan and schedule for the year. At this meeting, the Commission will identify several priority areas in which it desires feedback and/or research from the Council, and establish appropriate goals and performance measures. Advisors also will be given the opportunity to recommend initiatives of potential relevance to the Commission for inclusion in the work plan.

4. Reporting to the Commission

With the assistance of MTC staff, the Council will report on its work plan progress or present recommendations to the full Commission or MTC's standing committees, as appropriate.

5. Limitations on Advisor Activities

The role of the advisors is to advise the MTC Commission. Advisors are not to convey positions to outside agencies on behalf of the Council, independent of Commission action.

6. Conflict of Interest Policy

In order to avoid potential conflict of interest, no person shall sit on the Policy Advisory Council and concurrently be in a business relationship with MTC/BATA. A member is considered to have a business relationship with MTC/BATA when that member is employed by or serves on the Board of Directors of an organization that has received a grant or contract award from MTC – where MTC staff alone reviews proposals and recommends an organization or organizations for award of that grant or contract. In such cases, the member shall resign from the Council for the duration of the contract or grant, but may reapply for any vacancies upon completion of the contract or grant.

7. Ethics Training

All members of the Council shall complete an ethnics training course within the first year of their term on the Council.

C. Membership

The Council shall be composed of twenty-seven (27) members as follows.

A total of nine (9) members, one from each Bay Area county, shall be selected to represent interests related to the communities of color, environmental justice and low-income issues. A minimum of four members shall represent the communities of color, and a minimum of four shall represent environmental justice/low-income issues. The ninth member shall be selected from either category.

A total of nine (9) members, one from each Bay Area county, shall be selected to represent the interests of disabled persons and seniors. A minimum of four members shall represent senior issues, and a minimum of four shall represent disabled issues. The ninth member shall be selected from either category.

A total of nine (9) members shall be selected to represent interests related to the economy and the environment. A minimum of four members shall represent economy interests and a

minimum of four members shall represent environmental interests. The ninth member shall be selected from either category. Of these nine seats, at least five should be held by residents from each of the five most populous counties. The remaining four seats may be selected at large from throughout the entire Bay Area.

There shall be no alternates to the appointed membership.

D. Appointment Process

1. General

MTC staff shall secure nominations to fill terms and vacancies for the Council and present them to the appropriate Commissioners for confirmation. Appointments for advisors representing a particular county will be made by that county's Commissioners. Appointments for all the at-large advisors will be made by the Commission's chair and vice chair. Nominations for members of the Council will be solicited from a wide range of sources including, but not limited to: MTC Commissioners, current advisors, relevant organizations in the community, and via news releases or display ads sent to media outlets in the nine-county Bay Area.

2. Terms of Appointment

In general, advisors will serve four-year terms. Although there are no term limits, MTC Commissioners are to consider length of service and effectiveness before recommending the reappointment of advisors. All advisors wishing to be reappointed must reapply.

E. Procedures

Attendance and Participation

1. Advisors must attend at least two-thirds of the Council's regularly scheduled meetings each year and make a constructive contribution to the work of the Policy Advisory Council. Those who do not do so may be subject to dismissal from the Council at the discretion of the appointing Commissioner(s).

2. Residency Requirements

Advisors must live or work in the nine-county Bay Area.

3. Compensation

Subject to the Commission Procedures Manual (MTC Resolution No. 1058, Revised, Appendix D), advisors will receive a stipend per meeting and be reimbursed for actual expenses for travel, with a maximum of three meetings per month. Meetings are defined as a) publicly noticed meetings or meetings of ad hoc working groups of the Council; b)

noticed MTC Commission or committee meetings; or c) attendance at a community meeting at the request of the Commission or MTC staff to provide outreach assistance (i.e., when he/she attends a community meeting with MTC staff to provide an introduction to a particular community).

4. Meeting Frequency and Location of Meetings

The Council will meet regularly as required by its annual work plan. Public meetings will be held at the MTC offices or other locations at a regular time to be agreed upon by the members of the Council.

5. Ad Hoc Working Groups

To implement its work plan, the Council may establish working groups, with participation from MTC staff, on an ad hoc basis.

6. Quorum Requirements

At least 50 percent plus one of the Council's appointed membership must be present to constitute a quorum and vote on issues. The Council can hold discussions in the absence of a quorum, but cannot vote.

7. Election of Council Chair and Vice Chair

The Council will have a chair and a vice-chair, to be elected by the council for a two-year term. Although Council officers may be reelected, regular rotation of these positions among the Council membership is strongly encouraged.

8. Public Meetings

All Council meetings and any ad hoc working group meetings will be noticed and open to the public.

Date: March 24, 2010  
W.I.: 1114  
Referred by: Legislation  
Revised: 02/23/11-C 02/22/12-C 07/25/12-C  
07/24/13-C 07/23/14-C 11/19/14-C  
03/25/15-C 09/23/15-C 10/26/16-C

Attachment B  
Resolution No. 3931  
Page 1 of 1

**Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Policy Advisory Council  
Term: September 2013 – July 2017**

<b>Advisor Name</b>	<b>Representing</b>	<b>County</b>	<b>Appointing Commissioner(s)</b>
Naomi Armenta	Disabled	Alameda	Commissioners Bates, Haggerty and Quan
Cathleen Baker	Low-Income/Environmental Justice	Napa	Commissioner Luce
Caroline Banuelos	Low-Income/Environmental Justice	Sonoma	Commissioner Mackenzie
Jim E. Blacksten	Disabled	San Francisco	Commissioners Campos and Wiener
Richard Burnett	Minority	Solano	Commissioner Spering
Carlos Castellanos	Low-Income/Environmental Justice	Alameda	Commissioners Bates, Haggerty and Quan
Sudhir Chaudhary	Senior	Napa	Commissioner Luce
Elizabeth A. Clary	Disabled	Sonoma	Commissioner Mackenzie
Wilbert Din	Minority	San Francisco	Commissioners Campos and Wiener
Sydney Fang	Environment	Alameda	Chair Cortese, Vice Chair Mackenzie
Jonathan Fearn	Economy	Alameda	Chair Cortese, Vice Chair Mackenzie
Veda Florez	Minority	Marin	Commissioner Kinsey
Bob Glover	Economy	Contra Costa	Chair Rein Worth, Vice Chair Cortese
Rich Hedges	Senior	San Mateo	Commissioners Aguirre and Tissier
Michelle R. Hernandez	Disabled	Contra Costa	Commissioners Glover and Rein Worth
Charles Kaufman	Senior	Marin	Commissioner Kinsey
Randi Kinman	Low-Income/Environmental Justice	Santa Clara	Commissioners Cortese, Liccardo and Pirzynski
Scott Lane	Environment	Santa Clara	Chair Cortese, Vice Chair Mackenzie
Anna Lee	Environment	Santa Clara	Chair Cortese, Vice Chair Mackenzie
Jerry Levine	Environment	San Francisco	Chair Cortese, Vice Chair Mackenzie
Shireen Malekafzali	Low-Income/Environmental Justice	San Mateo	Commissioners Aguirre and Tissier
Cynthia Murray	Economy	Sonoma	Chair Rein Worth, Vice Chair Cortese
Mark Nicholson	Minority	Contra Costa	Commissioners Glover and Rein Worth
Mike Pechner	Senior	Solano	Commissioner Spering
Benjamin Schweng	Environment	Alameda	Chair Rein Worth, Vice Chair Cortese
Alan R. Talansky	Economy	San Mateo	Chair Rein Worth, Vice Chair Cortese
Harriet Wolf	Senior	Santa Clara	Commissioners Cortese, Liccardo and Pirzynski

Date: February 23, 2011  
W.I.: 1114  
Referred by: Legislation  
Revised: 07/25/12-C 07/24/13-C  
07/23/14-C 11/19/14-C  
03/25/15-C 09/23/15-C  
10/26/16-C

Attachment C  
Resolution No. 3931  
Page 1 of 2

**Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Policy Advisory Council  
Former Advisors and Their Replacements**

<b>Former Advisor</b>	<b>Time Served</b>	<b>Representing</b>	<b>Replaced By</b>	<b>Replaced On</b>
Andrew Casteel	March 2010 – June 2010	Environment	Sandi Galvez, Environment	February 23, 2011
Ann Hancock	March 2010 – July 2010	Environment	Tanya Narath, Environment	February 23, 2011
Allison M. Hughes	March 2010 – September 2011	Equity	Jim E. Blacksten, Equity	July 25, 2012
Evelina Molina	March 2010 – February 2012	Equity	Elizabeth A. Clary, Equity	July 25, 2012
Cheryl O'Connor	March 2010 – February 2012	Economy	Alan R. Talansky, Economy	July 25, 2012
Carmen Rojas	March 2010 – November 2010	Equity	Yokia Mason, Equity	February 23, 2011
Abigail Thorne-Lyman	March 2010 – June 2010	Environment	Tina King Neuhausel, Environment	February 23, 2011
Dolores Jaquez	March 2010 – July 2013	Equity	Elizabeth Clary, Equity	July 24, 2013
Federico Lopez	March 2010 – July 2013	Equity	Timothy Reeder, Equity	July 24, 2013
Yokia Mason	February 2011 – July 2013	Equity	Carlos Castellanos, Equity	July 24, 2013
Tanya Narath	February 2011 – July 2013	Environment	Chris Coursey, Environment	July 24, 2013
Tina King Neuhausel	February 2011 – July 2013	Environment	Linda Jeffrey Sailors, Environment	July 24, 2013
Kendal Oku	March 2010 – July 2013	Equity	Veda Florez, Equity	July 24, 2013
Lori Reese-Brown	March 2010 – July 2013	Equity	Richard Burnett, Equity	July 24, 2013
Frank Robertson	March 2010 – July 2013	Equity	Mark Nicholson, Equity	July 24, 2013
Dolly Sandoval	March 2010 – July 2013	Equity	Marie Marchese, Equity	July 24, 2013
Egon Terplan	March 2010 – July 2013	Environment	Benjamin Schweng, Environment	July 24, 2013
Jack Gray	July 2013 – April 2014	Economy	Cathleen Baker, Environment	July 23, 2014
Marie Marchese	July 2013 – October 2013	Equity	Harriet Wolf, Equity	November 19, 2014
Mordechai Winter	July 2013 – June 2014	Equity	Charles Kaufman, Equity	November 19, 2014
Cathleen Baker	March 2010 – July 2014	Equity	Shireen Malekafzali, Equity	November 19, 2014
Chris Coursey	July 2013 – November 2014	Environment	Cynthia Murray, Economy	March 25, 2015
Tim Reeder	July 2013 – December 2014	Equity	Michelle R. Hernandez, Equity	September 23, 2015
Bena Chang	March 2010 – November 2014	Economy	Scott Lane, Environment	September 23, 2015
Joanne Busenbark	September 2013 – September 2015	Equity	Sudhir Chaudhary, Equity	October 26, 2016
Linda Jeffrey Sailors	July 2013 – May 2016	Environment	Sydney Fang, Environment	October 26, 2016

<b>Former Advisor</b>	<b>Time Served</b>	<b>Representing</b>	<b>Replaced By</b>	<b>Replaced On</b>
Gerald Rico	March 2010 – June 2016	Equity	Cathleen Baker, Equity	October 26, 2016
Sandi Galvez	February 2011 – June 2016	Environment	Jonathan Fearn, Economy	October 26, 2016
Cathleen Baker	July 2014 – October 2016	Environment	Anna Lee, Environment	October 26, 2016