



# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

**METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

**POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 9, 2022 1:30 PM**

**RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WELCOME TO THE MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR NOVEMBER 9TH, 2022. BROADCASTING TEAM, WOULD YOU PLEASE ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT [INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV) BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF  
2 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,  
3 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE  
4 CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL  
5 VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND  
6 ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN  
7 ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR  
8 APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MAY WE HAVE ROLL CALL PLEASE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BY LAST NAME. CHAIR KINMAN?

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR ESUF? VICE CHAIR ESUF?

17

18 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. BALDINI?

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I SEE HIM.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. CAMPOS? CAMPOS? OKAY.

25 DEUTSCHE GROSS? OKAY. ELDRED?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

5

6 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN? HANKERSON?

9

10 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

13

14 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU? LODIN?

21

22 **ZELLY LODIN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MARKHAM?

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NICKENS?

4

5 **RODNEY NICKENS:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER? PIERCE? PIMPLE?

8

9 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. SCOTT?

12

13 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE? WILSON? WONG? IS EXCUSED. ZACH?

16 OKAY. DID I MISS ANYBODY THAT JOINED AFTER THEIR NAME WAS

17 CALLED?

18

19 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** I JUST JOINED. CAMPOS.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THOSE OF YOU WHO WERE PAYING

24 ATTENTION MAY HAVE NOTICED A NEW NAME. ZELLY, IF YOU WOULD

25 LIKE TO UNMUTE AND INTRODUCE YOURSELF.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **ZELLY LODIN:** THANK YOU. I'LL KEEP IT SHORT. I WAS BORN AND  
3 RAISED IN THE BAY AREA, A FAMILY OF IMMIGRANTS. MY MOM HAS  
4 RIDDEN BART MY WHOLE LIFE SO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS NEAR AND  
5 DEAR TO MY HEART. I HAVE WORKED AT PROGRESSIVE LABOR UNION  
6 ABOUT A DECADE WORKING WITH ORGANIZATIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS  
7 WORK ON THE YOUNG PROFESSIONAL'S COUNCIL BOARD FOR SAN  
8 FRANCISCO AND MARIN FOOD BANK CURRENTLY WORK IN HEALTH CARE  
9 COMMUNICATIONS AND SHOUT OUT TO OLIVIA WHO REFERRED ME AND I  
10 WILL BE REPRESENTING SEGMENTS OF PEOPLE OF COLOR ENVIRONMENTAL  
11 JUSTICE AND LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** FROM SAN FRANCISCO.

14

15 **ZELLY LODIN:** YES, THANK YOU, RANDI.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** EVERYBODY WAVE. WELCOME HER. CONTINUING  
18 ON WITH OUR CHAIR'S REPORT. I DON'T HAVE A LOT TO REPORT. ILAF  
19 AND I MET YESTERDAY WITH THE EXECUTIVE TEAM AND WITH THE CHAIR  
20 AND VICE CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION TO START WORKING ON  
21 DEVELOPING OUR PLAN FOR NEXT YEAR, AND OUR WORK PLAN, AND THAT  
22 KIND OF LINES UP WITH THE SURVEY THAT ILAF SENT OUT, OR KY-NAM  
23 SENT OUT A SHORT WHILE AGO. SO, ILAF, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO  
24 FOLD IN THAT SURVEY AND THE RESULTS AND WHERE WE'RE GOING WITH  
25 THAT?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **V. CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** WAS NOT PREPARED TO DA THAT.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YOU KNOW ME.

5

6 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THE SURVEY RESULTS AREN'T IN BECAUSE WE  
7 DIDN'T HAVE FULL PARTICIPATION, I'LL SEND AN E-MAIL OUT SO BY  
8 NEXT MEETING WE'LL HAVE THE SURVEY RESULTS BACK OUT.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE GET  
11 THIS SURVEY DONE BECAUSE THAT WILL ALLOW US TO KNOW WHERE THE  
12 HOLES ARE, AND WHERE WE HAVE COME THROUGH SO FAR, BECAUSE I  
13 KNOW THAT WITH A BODY THIS BIG AND WITH SO MANY NEW PEOPLE  
14 THERE ARE GAPS THAT NEED TO BE FILLED. BUT THE OTHER THING IS  
15 THE COMMISSION REALLY WANTS US TO DO DEEP INTENSIVE DIVES ON  
16 SOME BUSINESS IS AND MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE THE TIME AND THE  
17 RESOURCES TO DO THAT. SO, WE NEED TO BE THINKING OF WHAT'S  
18 COMING UP AND WHAT'S ON OUR WORK PLAN ALREADY, AND HOW WE'RE  
19 GOING TO MANAGE THAT. SO, JUST KEEP THAT IN THE BACK OF YOUR  
20 HEAD, AND IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, LET ME KNOW, AND I SEE  
21 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD'S HAND UP.

22

23 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY. THANKS RANDI. I JUST HAD A QUICK  
24 QUESTION. WHAT IS THE CURRENT FEELING ABOUT THE END COMING,  
25 SUNSETTING, AND WE'RE TRYING TO HAVE EXTENDED THE HYBRID





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 MEETING, MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN TILL DO THIS, GOING INTO THE  
2 FUTURE, A.B. 4224 IS OUT THERE AND BEING WORKED ON, BUT WHAT  
3 WE HAVE RIGHT NOW, IS SUNSETTING SOON.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, MARTHA I HEARD THAT THE COMMISSION IS  
6 GOING BACK TO IN-PERSON MEETINGS IN MARCH. IS THAT GOING TO  
7 HAPPEN FOR US TOO?

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YEP. I BELIEVE SO.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. REBECCA, IS THAT CORRECT? IT ENDS  
12 IN MARCH?

13

14 **REBECCA LONG:** YES. I BELIEVE SO. BECAUSE IT'S APPLICABLE TO  
15 ANY BROWN ACT BODIES. YEP.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THERE ARE WAYS OF -- ARE WE STILL  
18 GOING TO BE DOING ZOOM FOR OUR COMMUNITY, AT-LARGE?

19

20 **REBECCA LONG:** IN TERMS OF PUBLIC COMMENT? IS THAT WHAT YOU  
21 MEAN, CHAIR KINMAN?

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **REBECCA LONG:** I DON'T ACTUALLY KNOW THE ANSWER TO THAT. DO YOU  
2 KNOW, MARTHA?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I DON'T. THAT'S A KATHLEEN AND YOU  
5 QUESTION. [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **REBECCA LONG:** YEAH. I APOLOGIZE CHAIR KINMAN, WE CAN  
8 DEFINITELY GET BACK TO YOU ON THAT. I DO THINK, CERTAINLY, THE  
9 CALL-IN OPTION WILL REMAIN FOR THE PUBLIC. AND THERE IS, ALSO  
10 -- EXCUSE ME -- A MECHANISM FOR BOARD MEMBERS TO PARTICIPATE  
11 REMOTELY, BUT IT'S, YOU KNOW, IT'S FAIRLY RESTRICTIVE. YOU  
12 KNOW, YOU DO NEED TO NOTIFY US IN ADVANCE, ET CETERA, ET  
13 CETERA, AND I BELIEVE THAT THERE'S A REQUIREMENT THAT THE  
14 LOCATION FROM WHICH YOU MIGHT BE TELECOMMUTING NEEDS TO BE  
15 PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOING BACK TO THE OLD BOUND ACT, AND I  
18 BELIEVE WE HAVE TO HAVE A QUORUM OF MEMBERS IN-PERSON AT THE  
19 MAIN BUILDING, AS WELL.

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** THAT'S CORRECT. YES.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** BUT IF YOU ARE MEETING -- IF YOU ARE  
24 ATTENDING REMOTELY, YOU COULD ATTEND FROM A PUBLIC BUILDING AS  
25 LONG AS SOMEBODY HAS ACCESS TO IT, AND AS LONG AS YOU NOTIFY





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 IN ADVANCE. THIS WAS A PROBLEM THAT I -- AND I SEE A WHOLE LOT  
2 OF HANDS GOING UP WITH THAT. I'M GOING TO ADVISE REBECCA THAT  
3 MY -- OF MY CONCERN THAT WE MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN ACCOMMODATE  
4 OUR MEMBERS. AND THOSE OF YOU WHO WILL HAVE A PROBLEM WITH  
5 THIS, PLEASE NOTIFY MARTHA SO WE CAN START WORKING ON THIS.  
6 BUT WE DON'T HAVE A WHOLE LOT OF ROOM TO WORK AROUND THIS. I'M  
7 GOING TO CALL ON THOSE WITH HAND RAISED. ILAF.

8

9 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** FOR THE SURVEY COMPONENT, I KNOW A LOT OF  
10 THE QUESTIONS ARE LEANING ON CONTENT, BUT I INVITE YOU TO LOOK  
11 AT IT AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHARE FEEDBACK ON THE PROCESS AND  
12 ORIENTATION PROCESS AS WELL, BECAUSE THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE  
13 LOOKING TO IMPROVE. WEATHER YOU WANT TO USE THE SURVEY OR JUST  
14 REACH OUT TO RANDI AND ME, WE'RE INTERESTED IN HEARING THAT  
15 FEEDBACK, AS WELL.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ADINA?

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** WHAT I'M HEARING IS THAT FOR POLICY ADVISORY  
20 COUNCIL MEETINGS, IT WILL BE IN-PERSON. I'M WONDERING ABOUT  
21 THE -- WHAT THE RULES WILL BE TO GET CREDIT FOR THE MEETINGS  
22 WE WILL BE ATTENDING, FOR EXAMPLE, A COMMISSION MEETING. SO,  
23 WILL WATCHING A COMMISSION MEETING ON ZOOM ALSO BE COUNTED FOR  
24 MEETINGS FOR WHICH WE CAN GET A STIPEND? OR WILL WE NEED TO  
25 TRAVEL FOR ALL OF THOSE, AS WELL?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OH IT STILL STAYS THE SAME AS IT WAS  
3 BEFORE, EVEN IF YOU GO INTO THE MEETING, YOU CAN CLAIM IT. IF  
4 YOU WATCH IT ON ZOOM AND YOU HAVE TO USE THE ZOOM LINK, YOU  
5 CAN CLAIM IT. IT'S JUST IF YOU GO IN-PERSON, YOU CAN GET YOUR  
6 TRAVEL EXPENSES COVERED. POWER THOSE I DON'T KNOW, YOU CAN GET  
7 YOUR TRAVEL EXPENSES COVERED.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT WAS MY QUESTION. SO THE COMMISSION  
10 WILL HAVE ZOOM CAPABILITY, THEY'RE NOT REVERTING BACK TO THE  
11 IN PERSON FORMAT.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THEY HAVE TO HAVE A ZOOM OPTION  
14 AVAILABLE AS WELL. THE HYBRID OPTION WILL BE AVAILABLE BUT WE  
15 HAVE TO HAVE A QUORUM OF MEMBERS IN THE BUILDING AND WE HAVE  
16 TO KNOW WHERE THEY'RE BROADCASTING FROM BECAUSE THAT PLACE  
17 ALSO NEEDS TO BE POST TO THE AGENDA FOR OUR MEETING.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RIGHT. BUT PRIOR TO US USING ZOOM, IT WAS  
20 NOT SET UP THAT WE SAW EACH OTHER, OR THAT WE NOTED. SO, LIKE  
21 IF WE WATCHED THE MEETING ON THE WEBCAST, NOBODY KNEW.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RIGHT.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. GOT IT. RICH?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES. THANK YOU. EVERY COMMENT, I HAVE USED  
3 THIS WHOLE THING WITH, OVER THE YEARS, WITH DIFFERENT BOARDS.  
4 ALL OF THE COMMENTS ARE CORRECT. THE ONE THING THEY WOULD ADD  
5 IS IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE IN A PUBLIC BUILDING. IT COULD BE  
6 ANYWHERE, AS LONG AS THERE IS ACCESS TO THE PUBLIC, AND  
7 DISABLED ACCESS.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** UH-HUH.

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** SO, I'LL INTEND TO USE IT IN MARCH, BUT BE  
12 COMING AFTER THAT TO MOTE MEETINGS IN-PERSON. I ACTUALLY ENJOY  
13 THAT. SO, ANYWAY. BUT THERE MAY BE SOME THAT I DO ON ZOOM. BUT  
14 FOR THE MAJORITY, ESPECIALLY THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, I'LL  
15 COME IN-PERSON.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GABRIELA?

18

19 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** JUST WANTED CLARIFICATION, MARTHA AWE SAID  
20 OF THE MEETINGS WILL BE ACCESSIBLE TO THE PUBLIC.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE'LL DO HYBRID AND ZOOM BUT IT WILL HAVE  
23 TO BE HYBRID IN QUORUM AT LEAST 14 PEOPLE HAVE TO BE THERE IN-  
24 PERSON OTHERWISE WE DON'T EVEN HAVE THE MEETING.

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** THAT MAKES SENSE TO ME, BUT FOR  
2 ACCESSIBILITY TO THE PUBLIC I WANTED TO MAKE SURE IT'S STILL  
3 AVAILABLE FOR THEM NOT TO HAVE TO BE PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YEAH.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WENDY AND ANNE OLIVIA.

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** JUST FOR CLARIFICATION, THE SUBCOMMITTEES WILL  
12 ALSO START BEING IN-PERSON, AS WELL?

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THAT'S COMPLICATED RIGHT NOW, EQUITY AND  
15 ACCESS IS A REAL BOUND ACT MEETING. TAP IS --

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IT IS TOO.

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** IT IS, ALSO.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** TAP IS?

22

23 **REBECCA LONG:** YES.

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SO, THEY WILL HAVE TO HAVE A QUORUM OF  
2 PEOPLE IN THE BUILDING, IN ORDER TO BE HELD, WILL BE HYBRID,  
3 LIKE THE COMMISSIONS MEETING IS RIGHT NOW.

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** AND WHAT ARE THE -- IS THERE SOMEWHERE WHERE WE  
6 CAN LOOK UP WHAT THE OPTIONS ARE IF WE WANT TO REQUEST TO COME  
7 IN REMOTELY?

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU DON'T HAVE -- YOU JUST COME IN LIKE  
10 THE WAY IT WAS BEFORE CORONA HIT. YOU JUST COME IN, AND A I'LL  
11 HAVE YOUR NAME PLATES THERE. I'LL HAVE PRINTED OUT EXPENSE  
12 FORMS. BUT IT WILL ALSO BE IN THE EMAIL I SEND OUT LIKE WE DID  
13 EARLIER THIS YEAR FOR A SHORT AMOUNT OF TIME. TO FIND OUT HOW  
14 MANY ARE GOING TO BE IN THE BUILDING. THAT WAY SNACKS OR LUNCH  
15 DEPENDING ON THE MEETING WILL BE PROVIDED TO YOU.

16

17 **WENDI KALLINS:** NO, BUT WHAT I'M ASKING, I WE WANT TO REQUEST  
18 TO BE ABLE TO ATTEND REMOTELY, WILL THERE STILL BE SPECIFIC  
19 REQUIREMENTS?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** EVERYONE WILL STILL GET A ZOOM LINK.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** NO, BUT SHE IS ASKING ABOUT THE NOTICING  
24 AND THE PUBLIC ACCESS. SO, IF YOU SEND US A REFRESHER. AFTER  
25 THIS MEETING? IS THAT WHAT YOU WANT TO KNOW, WENDI?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. I THINK FOR THE TAP MEETING BECAUSE WE'RE  
3 A SMALL GROUP. I WOULD LOVE TO BE THERE FOR THIS GROUP.

4

5 **GEORGIA GANN DORHMAN:** RETURNING TO IN-PERSON, BY THE  
6 LEGISLATION, AND I'M WONDERING IF, IF IT IS ACTUALLY THE  
7 REVERT TO THE OLD BROWN ACT, OR IF IT IS -- IT IS SO THAT KIND  
8 OF DRACONIAN WEIRD THING THAT WAS GONE THAT'S VERY REASSURING.  
9 THANK YOU. AND THE REST I CAN SEND AN E-MAIL. THAT'S ALL.  
10 THANKS.

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** TERRY SCOTT? OH, I DIDN'T GET ADINA. I'M  
13 SORRY.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, I HAVE A FOLLOW-UP QUESTION ABOUT WHERE WE  
16 NEED TO DO THE, BE IN A PUBLIC PLACE, AND WOULD STAFF BE ABLE  
17 TO, LIKE, FOR THOSE OF US WHO WOULD NOT BE COMFORTABLE POSTING  
18 OUR ADDRESSES TO THE WORLD BUT LEAVE OUR DOOR OPEN BUT HAVE  
19 GOOD RELATIONSHIPS -- FOR EXAMPLE, THE CITY WHERE WE LIVE  
20 THERE MIGHT BE A CONFERENCE ROOM THAT COULD BE POWERED, COULD  
21 STAFF HELP WITH SOME KIND OF FORMAL REQUEST FOR ONE OF US  
22 COULD SAY, YOU KNOW, LIKE, HEY, LIKE, MENLO PARK CITY STAFF,  
23 I'M REPRESENTING OUR AREA ON A REGIONAL BODY, MIGHT BE ABLE TO  
24 WORK OUT OF A CONFERENCE ROOM FOR A COUPLE OF HOURS, LIKE,  
25 HERE IS THE OFFICIAL BLESSING OF MTC. IS THAT A REASONABLE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 SUGGESTION THAT CAN'T BE FULLY AUTOMATED, BUT MIGHT BE KIND OF  
2 --

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THAT'S ON YOU TO WORK OUT. ALL YOU HAVE  
5 TO DO IS POSTED AGENDA AND ASK TO USE THE MEETING ROOM. STAFF  
6 DOES NOT HAVE THE BANDWIDTH TO DO THAT. WE DO NOT. EVEN WHEN  
7 COMMISSIONERS WOULD MEET AT SEPARATE LOCATIONS THEY WOULD WORK  
8 THAT OUT. WE DO NOT HANDLE THAT. THAT IS ON Y'ALL TO HANDLE.  
9 SO IF YOU WANT TO HAND IT AT A PUBLIC PLACE, CITY HALL, YOU  
10 CAN WORK IT OUT WITH YOUR CITY, BUT UNFORTUNATELY, STAFF DOES  
11 NOT HAVE THE BANDWIDTH TO REACH OUT AND DO THAT. ALL YOU HAVE  
12 TO DO IS REACH OUT AND WORK IT OUT WITH THEM, BOOK IT THIS  
13 PLACE THIS TIME, I'LL PROVIDE YOU WITH THE AGENDA POSTED  
14 SOMEWHERE WHERE EVERYONE CAN SEE IT.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** TERRY?

19

20 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. A LITTLE CLARIFICATION. IF WE WERE TO  
21 HAVE A MEETING AND, SAY, THE COUNTY BUILDING, OR WHAT HAVE  
22 YOU, IF WE OBTAIN AN OFFICE THERE, DO WE -- I GUESS, THE  
23 BOTTOM LINE, DO WE HAVE TO BE THERE AND BE ACCESSIBLE TO THE  
24 PUBLIC, DIRECTLY? OR COULD WE HAVE THEM COME INTO THE COUNTY





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 BUILDING? DO WE HAVE TO -- BOTTOM LINE, DO WE HAVE TO BE THERE  
2 TO TALK WITH THEM DIRECTLY?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YEAH. IF YOU'RE SAYING THAT YOU'RE GOING  
5 TO BE THERE FOR THE MEETING, YOU HAVE TO BE -- YOU HAVE TO  
6 PHYSICALLY BE THERE. YOU CAN'T POST THE SIGN THERE AND SAY,  
7 HERE IS AN ALTERNATE LOCATION --

8

9 **TERRY SCOTT:** NO. I JUST MEANT IF IT COULD BE -- THEY COULD BE  
10 REACHED -- THEY COULD BE ONLINE, AS WELL?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YEAH. MORE THAN ONE PERSON CAN BE  
13 ONLINE, THEY WILL BE USING AN ATTENDEE LINK, WHILE YOU WILL  
14 HAVE A PANELIST LINK. IF THAT'S WHAT YOU ARE ASKING.

15

16 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU MARTHA.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** NALUNGO.

19

20 **NALUNGO CONLEY:** I HEAR ALL OF THE QUESTIONS COMING UP AND WE  
21 WILL PUT TOGETHER AN FAQ SHEET THAT WE WILL PASS OUT THAT WILL  
22 ADDRESS ALL THESE THINGS, BECAUSE THERE ARE SOME ISSUES THAT  
23 WERE RAISED ABOUT NOTICING THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS, BOTH  
24 AT THIS BODY, AS WELL AS COMMISSION, AND THE EXECUTIVE BOARD,  
25 EVERYONE IS, SORT OF, HAVING THE SAME ISSUE. AND WE SHARE THE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 SPACE WITH OUR PARTNER AGENCIES, LIKE BCDC, AND THE AIR  
2 DISTRICT, SO WE WILL PUSH OUT SOMETHING. IT WILL COME THROUGH  
3 MARTHA AND SOME OF THE OTHER CLERKS TO LET YOU KNOW WHAT'S  
4 GOING ON IN THE FUTURE. SO, THANK YOU ALL FOR YOUR QUESTIONS,  
5 AND WE'LL COMPILE IT ALL AND GET YOU SOMETHING SOON.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA IS THERE ANYBODY IN THE  
8 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED?

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
11 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
12 ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH, IF IT'S QUICK, GO AHEAD.

15

16 **RICHARD HEDGES:** IT'S QUICK, JUST LIKE THE FIRST ONE. I HAVE  
17 HAD SOME EXPERIENCES WITH REMOTE MEETINGS AND HOW IMPORTANT IT  
18 IS FOR US TO GET THIS RIGHT. I WAS IN A BOARD MEETING, WHERE  
19 THE MAJORITY OF US TRAVELLED TO SACRAMENTO BUT THERE WAS A  
20 MINORITY OFF-SITE ONE OF THOSE PEOPLE TOOK SICK AND WENT TO  
21 THE HOSPITAL AND BECAUSE THAT WAS A PUBLICLY NOTICED LOCATION,  
22 WE DID NOT HAVE SAY QUORUM. WE HAD TO SHUT THE MEETING DOWN.  
23 SO IT'S REALLY SERIOUS. THE OTHER ISSUE IS, OF COURSE YOU CAN  
24 DO A REMOTE LOCATION AT ANOTHER LOCATION OTHER THAN YOUR HOME.  
25 WE HAD TO DO THAT BECAUSE OF THREATS FROM LICENSEES THAT HAD





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THEIR LICENSE SUSPENDED. SO, I WOULD GO VARIOUS LOCAL DMV  
2 AGENCIES AND USE THEIR COMMUNITY ROOM. SO IT'S NO PROBLEM. SO  
3 YOU HAVE TO SET IT UP YOURSELF.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** DWAYNE?

6

7 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** I THINK RICH JUST ANSWERED MY QUESTION. I  
8 WAS JUST WONDERING WHAT QUALIFIES AS A PUBLIC PLACE? BECAUSE  
9 WHERE I WORK AT, IS A PUBLIC PLACE. LIKE, IT'S AFFORDABLE  
10 HOUSING COMPLEX, THEY HAVE COMMUNITY ROOMS. SO, IS THAT  
11 CONSIDERED A PUBLIC PLACE?

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH. AND I -- IT SHOULDN'T -- LET'S NOT  
14 GET HUNG UP ON THE PUBLIC PLACE. YOU CAN DO IT FROM YOUR  
15 HOUSE. I PREFER PUBLIC PLACES, BUT AS LONG AS THE PUBLIC HAS  
16 ACCESS TO THE MEETING ROOM IN WHICH YOU ARE SITTING, THAT'S  
17 FINE. IS FOR THOSE OF YOU WONDERING WHERE, WE MEET IN THE  
18 MIDDLE OF THE DAY, LIBRARIES OFTEN HAVE SMALL MEETING ROOMS  
19 FOR STUDENTS TO BE DOING THEIR WORK, AND THAT'S AN EXCELLENT  
20 PLACE TO START THINKING ABOUT. SO, START THINKING ABOUT, IF  
21 YOU PLAN ON ATTENDING REMOTELY, WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO KNOW,  
22 AND YOU'RE GOING TO NEED TO DO YOUR RESEARCH. BUT YOU CAN HAVE  
23 PEOPLE MEET FROM YOUR HOME, AS HAS BEEN SAID, I WILL NOT BE  
24 OPENING MY DOOR TO STRANGERS WALKING IN MY HOUSE TO ATTEND A  
25 MEETING. I AM NOT COMFORTABLE WITH THAT. SO, WE NEED TO MOVE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 ON. BECAUSE THIS HAS RUN PRETTY LONG. IF THERE IS NO OTHER  
2 QUESTIONS WITH THAT, THEN WE WILL CHOSE -- CLOSE OUT ITEM  
3 NUMBER THREE WHICH IS THE CHAIR'S REPORT. MOVING TO ITEM FOUR,  
4 APPROVAL OF THE OCTOBER 12TH MINUTES.

5

6 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** MOVE.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** BALDINI MOVES. IS THERE A SECOND?

9

10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** ELDRED SECONDS.

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
15 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
16 ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ROLL CALL VOTE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GIVE ME ONE MOMENT, I NEED TO PROMOTE A  
21 COUNCILMEMBER. OKAY. CHAIR KINMAN?

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR ESUF?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

5

6 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

9

10 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS? ABSENT. ELDRED? ANNE  
13 OLIVIA?

14

15 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. FITZGERALD.

18

19 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YEAH.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. FLOREZ? IS EXCUSED. GLASER IS  
22 EXCUSED. GOODWIN?

23

24 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** AYE.

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

2

3 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HEDGES?

6

7 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LODIN?

22

23 **ZELLY LODIN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MARKHAM? NICKENS?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **RODNEY NICKENS:** YES

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE?

17

18 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

21

22 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

23





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE? WILSON? WONG? IS EXCUSED. AND  
2 ZACH. ZACH IS ABSENT. IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
3 PRESENT.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **DEUTSCH-GROSS:** DEUTSCHE GROSS IS HERE. SORRY ABOUT THAT.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOW DO WANT TO VOTE ON THE MINUTES?

10

11 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM NUMBER FIVE, PUBLIC  
16 COMMENT. THIS IS A CHANCE FOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
17 PARTICIPATING WHO TO WISH TO SPEAK ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA.  
18 I SHOULD REMIND PEOPLE THAT IF YOU ARE DIAL IN DIAL STAR NINE  
19 IF YOU ARE ATTENDING, AND RAISE YOUR HAND BY ZOOM. PUBLIC  
20 COMMENT?

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
23 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
24 ON THIS ITEM.

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** COMMITTEE REPORTS FIRST ONE IS THE EQUITY  
2 AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. ILAF?

3

4 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO IN OUR LAST SUBCOMMITTEE  
5 MEETING WE RECEIVED A FEW PRESENTATIONS ONE ON THE EXPRESS  
6 LANES START PILOT WHICH STAFF HOPES TO LAUNCH EARLY NEXT YEAR  
7 WE DISCUSSED THE OUTCOMES, MEASUREMENTS, AND THE PRELIMINARY  
8 TARGETS ALL WHICH I THINK ARE MOVING TARGETS AS THEY CONTINUE  
9 TO REVISE AND WORK OUT THE PROCESS. SO, IN PARTICULAR, THEY'RE  
10 GOING TO BE LOOKING AT ACCESS AND MOBILITY, AWARENESS,  
11 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, AFFORDABILITY, ADMINISTRATIVE  
12 FEASIBILITY, FINANCIAL VIABILITY LANE PERFORMANCE AND MOBILITY  
13 WHEN THEY EVALUATE THE PROGRAM AND THE PURPOSE FOR THE PROGRAM  
14 AGAIN IS TO INCREASE MOBILITY FOR LOW-INCOME DRIVERS WHO MAY  
15 NOT HAVE ACCESS TO TRANSIT. THE OTHER PRESENTATION WE RECEIVED  
16 WAS ON THE CLIPPER START PILOT THAT PROVIDES TRANSIT DISCOUNT  
17 FOR LOW-INCOME RIDERS A THREE YEAR PLAN SET TO END IN JUNE OF  
18 2023 AND THEY WILL BE DOING A QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE  
19 ANALYSIS TO BETTER UNDERSTAND AND RESPOND TO ISSUES OF  
20 AFFORDABILITY, ECONOMIC MOBILITY AND EQUITY SPECIFICALLY  
21 LOOKING AT AWARENESS MARKETING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FINANCIAL  
22 LIABILITY ADMINISTRATIVE FEASIBILITY AFFORDABILITY ACCESS AND  
23 MOBILITY AND WE SHOULD HEAR FINDINGS AT THE SUBCOMMITTEE EARLY  
24 IN JANUARY NEXT YEAR, WE MENTIONED CONCERNS ABOUT USING  
25 FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL AS THRESHOLD CURRENTLY USING THAT FOR





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 ALL PILOTS AND PROGRAMS STANDARD THROUGH MTC WE DIDN'T KNOW  
2 EVEN USING TWICE THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL FOR FAMILY OF  
3 \$450,000 MIGHT NOT COMPARE TO THE HIGH COST OF LIVING. SO  
4 THEY'RE LOOK INTO THAT. I THINK THOSE ARE ALL OF THE UPDATES  
5 THEY HAVE.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WAS THERE ANY CORRESPONDENCE  
8 OR ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
11 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
12 ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** DO ANY OF THE COUNCIL MEMBERS HAVE ANY  
15 QUESTIONS? ADINA?

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. I HAVE A QUICK QUESTION THAT OTHERS MAY BE  
18 INTERESTED IN HEARING, AS WELL. VTA IS A MAJOR AGENCY THAT DID  
19 NOT PARTICIPATE IN THE FIRST GO ROUND OF CLIPPER START, AND IS  
20 THERE WORK GOING ON IN THIS CURRENT UPDATE TO POTENTIALLY  
21 BRING IN SAND CLAIR COUNTY INTO CLIPPER START, ESPECIALLY AS  
22 THERE IS MORE FARE INTEGRATION THAT HAVING VTA BEING OFF ON  
23 ITS OWN MIGHT MAKE THINGS MORE DIFFICULT FOR PEOPLE?

24

25 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** THAT'S AN --





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

3

4 **V. CHAIR:** CAN CHECK WITH STAFF AND GET BACK TO YOU, ADINA AND  
5 OTHER MEMBERS.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SEEING NO OTHER HAND RAISED,  
8 WE CAN GO INTO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT  
9 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE. THE TAP SUBCOMMITTEE.  
10 ADINA LEVIN.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. SO, THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN  
13 SUBCOMMITTEE HAS MET IN THE LAST MONTH. THE LARGEST ITEM ON  
14 OUR AGENDA WAS DISCUSSING THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE  
15 STUDY, AND THERE WAS A VERY ROBUST DISCUSSION THAT LED TO THE  
16 GROUP HAVING A STATEMENT THAT THE GROUP RECOMMENDED TO BRING  
17 TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TO MAKE A MOTION TO SUPPORT.  
18 CAN I DESIGN THAT HERE AND THEN WE WILL DISCUSS IT THE NEXT  
19 TIME? OR SHOULD I DESCRIBE IT IN THE VERY NEXT AGENDA ITEM?

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I WOULD DO IT IN THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO --

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WELL, EITHER/OR. IT'S THE BUSINESS OF THE  
2 SUBCOMMITTEE -- LET'S DO ANY MOTION IN THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM SO  
3 THAT YOU CAN DESCRIBE THAT, ALSO.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. BUT THERE WAS A STRONG SENSE OF THE GROUP  
6 ABOUT THE FEEDBACK THAT THE GROUP WANTED TO GIVE AND BRING TO  
7 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND THE AGENDA FOR THE NEXT  
8 BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP MEETING HAS JUST COME OUT THIS  
9 MORNING, FOR A MEETING, THAT IS ON MONDAY. AND THAT THE  
10 RECOMMENDATION THAT THE SUBCOMMITTEE HAD WILL BE CONTINUING TO  
11 BE HIGHLY RELEVANT FOR OUR FEEDBACK INTO THAT MEETING ON  
12 MONDAY AND TO THE COMMISSION. WE ALSO HEARD ABOUT THE REGIONAL  
13 RAIL PARTNERSHIP STUDY WHICH IS GETTING FINALIZED, AND THERE  
14 IS STILL A DETAILED REPORT THAT IS STILL BEING WORKED ON AND  
15 WE ALSO GOT AN OVERVIEW OF THE NETWORK CONNECTED PLAN THAT IS  
16 GOING TO BE A SUBSTANTIVE ITEM ON TODAY AGENDA. SO WE WILL  
17 LEARN A LOT MORE ABOUT THAT MOMENTARILY. BY THE WAY, SORRY --  
18 ALSO, IN A SUMMARY, ON THE REGIONAL RAIL, THE STUDY CONCLUDES  
19 THAT THERE WOULD BE SIGNIFICANT BENEFITS IN REGIONALIZING  
20 FUNCTIONS SUCH AS RAIL NETWORK PLANNING AND POTENTIALLY  
21 PROJECT DELIVERY, AND THE WHAT TO DO ABOUT SERVICE  
22 COORDINATION WAS VAGUE AND THERE ARE DETAILS IN THE REPORT  
23 THAT ARE STILL BEING FINALIZED AND THE NEXT STEPS ON THAT ARE  
24 GOING TO BE SOME COMBINATION OF PILOTING CERTAIN TYPES OF  
25 REGIONAL DECISION-MAKING, AND ACTION, AND FURTHER STUDY. SO,





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 KEEP AN EYE OUT FOR THE FINAL REPORT AND THEN WHAT THE NEXT  
2 STEPS SHOULD BE.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ANY COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? SEEING NONE.  
5 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
8 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
9 ON THIS ITEM.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ITEM SEVEN NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS  
12 CASE STUDY. ADINA.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO, FOR THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS  
15 CASE STUDY, THERE WERE A LOT OF QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSION  
16 ABOUT, FIRST OF ALL, HOW UNIFIED THE OUTCOME WOULD BE IN TERMS  
17 OF HAVING ONE PLACE TO MAKE CERTAIN DECISIONS ABOUT THE  
18 REGIONALLY COORDINATED ASPECTS OF THE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
19 SYSTEM, AND THEN, REALLY IMPORTANTLY, AND THE FOCUS OF  
20 DISCUSSION WAS GOING TO BE HOW THAT FUNCTION WOULD BE  
21 RESPONSIVE AND ACCOUNTABLE TO THE WRITING PUBLIC. AND, SO, THE  
22 -- ONE OF THE MEMBERS OF THE BODY, YOU KNOW, CRAFTED A  
23 SUGGESTED STATEMENT AND THE SENSE OF THE GROUP WAS TO BRING IT  
24 TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR A POTENTIAL VOTE. I'M GOING  
25 TO READ THIS OUT. "THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE SHOULD





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 PRIORITIZE MOVEMENT TOWARD A NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE  
2 THROUGH BAY AREA TRANSIT THAT ESTABLISHES ONE GOVERNING BODY,  
3 THAT IS FULLY ACCOUNTABLE TO THE PUBLIC FOR THE PERFORMANCE,  
4 CONNECTIVITY, ACCESSIBILITY, AND USER -- ACCESSIBILITY AND  
5 USER EXPERIENCE OF BAY AREA TRANSIT." AND IF ANYBODY ELSE WHO  
6 IS PART OF THAT DISCUSSION WANTED TO WEIGH IN, THAT WOULD BE  
7 WELCOME.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, I'M GOING -- I DON'T USUALLY DO THIS.  
10 BUT BECAUSE MOST OF YOU ARE NEW TO THIS, DURING THE PANDEMIC,  
11 WHEN THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ALL STARTED CRASHING BECAUSE IT'S  
12 HARD TO MAINTAIN A TRANSIT AGENCY WHEN NOBODY'S RIDING OR  
13 GOING ANYWHERE, THERE WAS A BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE THAT WAS  
14 ESTABLISHED, AND ONE OF THE MAIN FEATURES OF THE BLUE RIBBON  
15 TASK FORCE, WHICH WENT ON FOR QUITE A LONG TIME, WITH A  
16 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF PUBLIC INPUT, WAS THAT OUR 27 OR SO BAY  
17 AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES NEEDED A NETWORK MANAGEMENT SYSTEM. A,  
18 SOMETHING THAT WOULD ASSIST THE PUBLIC IN BEING ABLE TO TRACK  
19 DOWN WHO TO COMPLAIN TO, IF NOTHING ELSE, BUT ALSO TO  
20 COORDINATE ALL OF THE SYSTEM'S NEEDS, SO THAT THERE WAS A  
21 PLACE TO GO TO. RIGHT NOW, THE AGENCIES TALK TO EACH OTHER,  
22 AND THEY MAY OR MAY NOT BE COMPATIBLE, BUT THERE IS NOTHING  
23 THAT -- WELL IS NOTHING IN WRITING. THERE IS NO STRUCTURE TO  
24 MAINTAIN THESE RELATIONSHIPS, AND IF THERE IS ANYTHING THAT I  
25 HAVE LEARNED IS THAT IF YOU DON'T HAVE A STRUCTURE THAT PEOPLE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 HAVE TO REPORT TO, THEN ANYBODY CAN BACK OUT OF ANYTHING AT  
2 ANY TIME. AND, SO, THIS WAS SOMETHING THAT WAS DEBATED FOR  
3 MONTHS AND MONTHS, AND MONTHS AND MONTHS. AND I REALLY  
4 APPRECIATE ADINA FOLLOWING UP ON THIS. SO, I WILL OPEN THIS UP  
5 TO COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL, IF YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS. TERRY?

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** MY COMMENT RELATES TO THE FORMULATION OF THIS  
8 CONCEPT, IF YOU WILL, WITHOUT HAVING A NETWORK MANAGER FIRST.  
9 AND I'M HAVING DIFFICULTY UNDERSTANDING HOW THIS CAN BE  
10 EFFECTIVELY PROMULGATED AND DESIGNED WITHOUT INPUT FROM  
11 SOMEONE WHO WOULD BE RESPONSIBLE FOR HEADING THE NETWORK  
12 MANAGEMENT POSITION. AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE TALKED ABOUT A  
13 NUMBER OF YEARS AGO, AND I NOTED AT THAT TIME, AND I STILL  
14 NOTE, THAT POSITION, NOT ONLY HAS NOT BEEN CREATED, AND/OR  
15 FILLED, BUT THERE IS NO JOB DESCRIPTION FOR WHAT IT'S SUPPOSED  
16 TO DO. AND IT SEEMS TO ME THAT WE'RE GETTING THE CART IN FRONT  
17 OF THE HORSE. AND I THINK THAT THAT POSITION NEEDS TO BE  
18 CREATED. IT NEEDS TO HAVE A JOB DESCRIPTION AND IT NEEDS TO BE  
19 FILLED BECAUSE THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE A KEY ROLE IN CREATING  
20 THIS NETWORK OPERATION THAT WILL INVOLVE ALL OF THESE OTHER  
21 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS, AND THEY'RE GOING WANT TO INPUT AND  
22 THAT INPUT NEEDS TO GO TO SOMEONE WHO CAN MAKE A DECISION  
23 THAT'S GOING TO BENEFIT AND INTEGRATE THE ENTIRE SYSTEM.

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ADINA DO YOU WANT TO TAKE A CRACK AT  
2 THAT?

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** THE REPORT FROM MONDAY STARTS TO TALK ABOUT MORE  
5 WHAT THE FUNCTIONS THAT WOULD BE DONE. THE INTENT FOR A  
6 NETWORK MANAGER, YOU KNOW, NEVER WAS TO HAVE IT BE A PERSON.  
7 THE IDEA ISN'T THAT THERE IS ONE HUMAN CZAR OF TRANSIT NETWORK  
8 COORDINATION. THE IDEA IS THAT IT BE SOME, SORT OF,  
9 INSTITUTIONAL FUNCTION. AND WHAT'S BEING PROPOSED IS, SO,  
10 THERE HAS BEEN A GROUP CALLED THE "CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD"  
11 THAT IS A COMBINATION OF TRANSIT AGENCY GENERAL MANAGERS, AND  
12 THE MTC EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, THAT MEET AND WORK ON, AND THEY  
13 MEET IN TWO CONFIGURATIONS, IN -- AND THEY WERE -- THEY HAVE  
14 BEEN WORKING ON THE CLIPPER PROJECT, AND ALSO ON FARE  
15 INTEGRATION. AND THEY ARE A GROUP OF GENERAL MANAGERS, THEY  
16 ARE NOT POLICY MAKERS. AND THE RECOMMENDATION IS THAT THEY  
17 CONTINUE AND HAVE MORE OF A POLICY MAKING FUNCTION. WHAT THOSE  
18 COORDINATION TASKS ARE, YOU CAN TAKE A LOOK, YOU KNOW, THE  
19 GOAL OF THIS MEETING -- IF YOU WANT TO -- YOU CAN LOOK AT THAT  
20 STAFF REPORT, AND THEN COME TO THE MEETING ON MONDAY FOR WHAT  
21 THOSE COORDINATION ACTIVITIES ARE. AND WHAT IS BEING  
22 RECOMMENDED IS A BROAD SWATH OF THOSE COORDINATION ACTIVITIES.  
23 AND IT -- HOWEVER, THE PEOPLE IN THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD  
24 ARE GENERAL MANAGERS, THEY'RE NOT POLICY MAKERS. SO THE  
25 QUESTION THAT WAS ON THE MINDS OF THE PEOPLE IN THE ADVISORY





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 GROUP WAS HOW THIS FUNCTION SHALL BE ACCOUNTABLE TO THE PUBLIC  
2 AS POLICY MAKERS. AND, SO, WE WEREN'T SAYING HOW TO BE  
3 CONSTRUCTED, WE WEREN'T SAYING WHAT THE COMPOSITION WOULD BE,  
4 WE WERE SAYING THAT AS PEOPLE REPRESENTING THE PUBLIC, PEOPLE  
5 REPRESENTING TRANSIT RIDERS, SOME OF US REPRESENTING  
6 INSTITUTIONAL CUSTOMERS, WE WANTED THIS TO BE COMPREHENSIVE,  
7 ACCOUNTABLE FOR THE PERFORMANCE CONNECTIVITY, ACCESSIBILITY,  
8 AND USER EXPERIENCE. AND WE WANTED IT TO BE ACCOUNTABLE TO THE  
9 PUBLIC. SO, THAT WAS THE OUTCOME THAT WE WANTED TO SEE. DOES -  
10 - TERRY DOES, THAT HELP? BECAUSE I HEAR YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT A  
11 JOB DESCRIPTION AS IF IT WERE A PERSON. BUT, THAT'S NOT HOW IT  
12 HAS BEEN CONSTRUED THROUGH THIS DISCUSSION.

13

14 **WENDI KALLINS:** AND MY HAND UP IS TO FURTHER CLARIFY TERRY'S  
15 QUESTION.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** TERRY, IF YOU DON'T MIND I'M GOING TO  
18 HAVE WENDI JUMP IN. BECAUSE THEY BOTH SIT ON THIS.

19

20 **WENDI KALLINS:** THE NETWORK MANAGER WAS SOMETHING THAT CAME OUT  
21 OF THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE. I THINK YOU HAVE BEEN AROUND  
22 LONG ENOUGH THAT YOU KNOW THAT. AND THE PURPOSE OF THIS CASE  
23 WAS REALLY TO CREATE THE DEFINITION AND LOOK AT THE DIFFERENT  
24 MODELS AND DETERMINE WHAT A NETWORK MANAGER COULD LOOK LIKE. I  
25 THINK THE CONCERN OF OUR COMMITTEE IS THAT -- AND THE REASON





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 WE CREATED THIS RESOLUTION IS THAT WE DID NOT WANT TO SEE THE  
2 BUSINESS CASE COMMITTEE MOVE AWAY FROM THAT VERY IMPORTANT  
3 TASK OF REALLY ANSWERING ALL OF THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU JUST  
4 ASKED. AND, SO, WHAT OUR RESOLUTION IS, IS TO REALLY REFOCUS,  
5 DETERMINE AND MAKE SURE THAT THE BUSINESS CASE STUDY COMMITTEE  
6 CONTINUES TO FOCUS ON WHAT THAT MANAGEMENT SYSTEM WOULD LOOK  
7 LIKE, AND WHAT ARE THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS. AND, OF COURSE, WE  
8 WENT KNOW WHO THEY ARE UNTIL THOSE QUESTIONS ARE ANSWERED. SO  
9 IT'S A LITTLE BIT CHICKEN AND EGG SITUATION.

10

11 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. MY CONCERN, I GUESS, IF I CAN PROPERLY  
12 CONVEY IT, IS THAT WITHOUT A CENTRAL FOCAL POINT WITHOUT  
13 PUBLIC INPUT, PUBLIC CONCERNS, FOR CONTRADICTING APPROACHES BY  
14 THE VARIOUS NETWORK SYSTEMS THAT EXIST THERE, OUR  
15 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS, WITHOUT A FOCAL POINT FOR A PUBLIC TO  
16 CONTACT AN OFFICE OF AN INDIVIDUAL, IF YOU HAVE A GROUP  
17 APPROACH, LIKE THIS, THERE IS NO ONE ACCOUNTABLE. THERE IS NO  
18 ONE THAT IS A CENTRAL POINT OF RECEPTION FOR CONCERNS OF  
19 POTENTIAL HICCUPS, FAILURES, ET CETERA, TO THE POINT OUT OF  
20 THE NEED TO AN INDIVIDUAL OFFICE THAT CAN CONVEY THE RIGHT  
21 MESSAGE, THE CORRECT MESSAGE TO ALL OF THE PARTICIPATING  
22 TRANSIT SYSTEMS FRANKLY IT SEEMS TO ME THAT'S A POTENTIAL  
23 DESIGN OF POTENTIAL FAILURE IF WE DON'T HAVE -- THE BUCK HAS  
24 TO STOP SOME PLACE, AND IT CAN'T BE A GROUP. IT CAN'T BE AN  
25 ORGANIZATION, IT NEEDS TO BE MORE FINITE THAN THAT.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, TERRY, IF I CAN KIND OF FLIP THAT  
3 AROUND. IT'S -- SO, WHEN I GO TO COMPLAIN TO BART OR VTA, OR  
4 TO SAMTRANS, I AM HEADING MY COMPLAINT -- I AM FOCUSING MY  
5 COMPLAINT TO AN AGENCY THAT HAS JURISDICTION OVER MY COMPLAINTS, OR  
6 THAT HAS RESPONSIBILITY FOR RUNNING THE SYSTEM. RIGHT NOW,  
7 THAT'S WHAT THEY'RE TRYING TO FOCUS ON IS, DO WE NEED A  
8 CENTRAL PLACE -- WHICH WOULD REQUIRE HIRING SOMEBODY -- BUT  
9 BEFORE YOU CAN DO THAT, YOU HAVE TO DECIDE WHAT YOU ARE HIRING  
10 THEM TO DO. AND THAT'S WHERE YOU'RE REQUEST FOR A JOB  
11 DESCRIPTION COMES IN. THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT THIS IS. IS TO FOCUS  
12 -- TO FOCUS THE ENERGY BACK WHERE THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE  
13 LANDED, WHICH WAS, WE NEED A CENTRALIZED PLACE. AND IT NEEDS  
14 TO DO -- AND NOW WE'RE AT THE IT NEEDS TO DO THESE THINGS, AND  
15 IT WILL -- AND FROM THERE, WE GO TO IT WILL NEED THIS TYPE OF  
16 PERSON THAT WILL BE RESPONSIBLE. SO, DOES THAT HELP?

17

18 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES. AND THAT -- I THINK YOU HAVE EFFECTIVELY  
19 VERBALIZED MY CONCERN.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH.

22

23 **TERRY SCOTT:** WHEN YOU HAVE MULTIPLE TRANSIT SYSTEMS HERE,  
24 THROUGHOUT GENERAL PUBLIC, TO THE INDIVIDUAL OUT THERE, IF





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THEY DO NOT HAVE A PLACE TO GO, THEY END UP TALKING ONE  
2 TRANSIT SYSTEM IS THEY SAY, WELL, YOU NEED TO CALL SO AND SO.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** EXACTLY.

5

6 **TERRY SCOTT:** WITH THE BUREAUCRATIC RUN AROUND. AND I THINK WE  
7 NEED TO AVOID THAT.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ANNE OLIVIA.

10

11 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO -- STOP  
12 HAVING COMPUTER ISSUES -- I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION THAT  
13 WE RECOMMEND THE STATEMENT THAT ADINA READ, AND I DON'T KNOW  
14 WHETHER I WANT TO REREAD THAT STATEMENT SO IT'S AT THE TOP OF  
15 EVERYONE'S MIND BUT I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION THAT WE  
16 REREAD THAT STATEMENT.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YOU CAN REREAD THE STATEMENT THAT'S SHE'S  
19 MAKING THE MOTION ON ADINA.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE SHOULD  
22 PRIORITIZE MOVEMENT TOWARD A NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE FOR  
23 BAY AREA TRANSIT THAT ESTABLISHES ONE GOVERNING BODY THAT IS  
24 FULLY ACCOUNTABLE TO THE PUBLIC FOR THE PERFORMANCE,





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 CONNECTIVITY, ACCESSIBILITY, AND USER EXPERIENCE OF BAY AREA  
2 TRANSIT.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION. DO WE HAVE A  
5 SECOND?

6

7 **ZELLY LODIN:** SECOND THAT MOTION.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT WAS?

10

11 **ZELLY LODIN:** ZELLY LODIN.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ZELLY LODIN. THANK YOU. I SEE WE HAVE  
14 RAID HANDS. DO WE HAVE QUESTIONS ON THE MOTION? ADINA, DO YOU  
15 STILL HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** I'LL TAKE IT DOWN.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** CHRISTINE FITZGERALD?

20

21 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** NOT SURE WHERE THIS WOULD FIT, BUT IT  
22 WOULD SEEM TO ME THAT REPRESENTATIVES OF THE GENERAL PUBLIC  
23 WHICH BE A PART OF THAT PROCESS, AS WELL. AND THAT SHOULD BE  
24 REPRESENTED IN THIS STATEMENT. THANK YOU.

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THAT A REQUEST? I THINK  
2 THAT THAT IMPLIES THAT THE PUBLIC IS INVOLVED.

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** IT SAYS FULLY ACCOUNTABLE TO THE PUBLIC.  
5 YEAH.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH. ARE THERE ANY -- OKAY.

8

9 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** CHAIR, IF I MAY JUST CLARIFY? MY  
10 SUGGESTION IS TO HAVE ONE OR TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC BE ON  
11 THAT -- IN THAT PROCESS, ON THAT COMMITTEE, YOU KNOW, HOWEVER  
12 YOU WANT TO REFER TO IT. YEAH. THEY HAVE TO BE ACCOUNTABLE TO  
13 THE PUBLIC AT-LARGE, BUT I THINK IT'S EQUALLY IMPORTANT TO  
14 HAVE MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY AS A PART OF THAT PROCESS.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY, THEN IF, THEN, ADINA WILL CARRY  
17 THAT MESSAGE FORWARD TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT CASE STUDY  
18 GROUP, ITSELF.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** UH-HUH. YEAH. I WILL BRING THAT FORWARD. BEFORE  
21 WE PUT MORE DETAILS IN THE STATEMENT, SO, YEAH, I WILL  
22 DEFINITELY BRING THAT FORWARD. AND WE WILL GET -- AS THE  
23 PROCESS IS WORKING, THERE IS GOING TO BE ONE MEETING OF THE  
24 STAKEHOLDER BODY IN NOVEMBER, AND THEN THERE IS GOING TO BE  
25 ANOTHER ONE IN DECEMBER. AND WILL THE -- AND I YOU THINK THE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE WILL MEET IN THE  
2 MIDDLE. AND IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE AN AGENDA ITEM TO TALK  
3 MORE ABOUT WHAT THE -- WHAT THE OPTIONS ARE, AND MAKE MORE  
4 SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE INTERIM. BECAUSE, RIGHT NOW,  
5 I'M GOING OFF OF A STAFF REPORT THAT'S COMING FORWARD ON  
6 MONDAY, THEY HAVE SEEN, AND PROBABLY, LIKE, PROBABLY NOBODY  
7 ELSE HAS READ, AND, SO, I THINK IN ORDER TO GIVE INFORMED --  
8 AND IT'S NOT EVEN ON THIS AGENDA HERE, SO, I THINK -- I WILL  
9 BRING FORWARD WHAT YOU SAID, AND THEN WE WILL MAYBE HAVE  
10 ANOTHER BITE AT THE APPLE ABOUT MAKING EVEN MORE SPECIFIC  
11 RECOMMENDATIONS HAVING LOOKED AT WHAT'S BEING RECOMMENDED.  
12 BUT, JUST TO -- LIKE, WHAT'S BEING RECOMMENDED DOES NOT HAVE  
13 THAT. WHAT'S BEING RECOMMENDED IS SAYING THAT THERE WILL BE  
14 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC GIVING ADVICE TO A GROUP OF GENERAL  
15 MANAGERS. AND WE HAVE MORE THOUGHTS ON THAT, BUT THAT'S NOT ON  
16 OUR AGENDA TODAY.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH. TO SUM UP WHAT OUR MOTION IS, WE'RE  
19 ASKING THEM OR TELLING THEM WE WANT THEM TO BUILD A BOX. WE  
20 HAVE TO GET THEM TO AGREE TO BUILD A BOX THEN WE GET TO HAVE  
21 THE CONVERSATION ABOUT WHAT GOES IN THE BOX.

22

23 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** I JUST WANTED TO PUT IT OUT THERE. THANK  
24 YOU.

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHRISTINE. RICH AND THEN VINAY.

2

3 **RICHARD HEDGES:** GOOD DESCRIPTION HANDS E THIS NETWORK  
4 MANAGEMENT IS SO IMPORTANT AND IF THEY DON'T HAVE TWO THINGS,  
5 THE ABILITY TO CREATE PUBLIC POLICY AFTER PUBLIC IS INVOLVED,  
6 AND THE ABLE TO ENFORCE IT, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE SOME OF THE  
7 SAME FOREVER. THAT'S THE ONLY THING THAT WILL WORK, ABSENT  
8 MERGER. THANKS.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VINAY?

11

12 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YEAH. SO, YOU KNOW, I DON'T EXACTLY KNOW WHO WE  
13 THINK IS GOING TO BE ON THE GOVERNING BODY. MY DEFAULT TEND TO  
14 BE FEWER BODIES RATHER THAN MORE. AND I JUST FEEL LIKE, IF YOU  
15 -- WELL, IF WE HAVE THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE, LIKE,  
16 WHY DO WE NEED ANOTHER BODY? AND WHO IS IT GOING TO BE  
17 COMPOSED OF? AND WHY IS IT -- LIKE, WHAT IS IT THAT THEY ARE  
18 GOING TO DO THAT THIS PARTICULAR EXISTING SUBCOMMITTEE OR BODY  
19 CANNOT DO?

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, THE COMMITTEE THAT IS MEETING IS TO  
22 DISCUSS AND FOLLOW-THROUGH WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. IT  
23 IS NOT A COMMITTEE THAT IS AN ACTION COMMITTEE, OTHER THAN TO  
24 PUT TOGETHER WHAT HAPPENED REGARDING THE BLUE RIBBON TASK  
25 FORCE. SO, IT IS NOT --





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **VINAY PIMPLE:** OKAY.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO IT IS NOT --

5

6 **VINAY PIMPLE:** IT IS NOT IMPLEMENTATION.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** NO. BUT THAT GOES BACK TO -- WELL, WE

9 WANT THEM TO BUILD A BOX, AND TO THAT POINT, THEY HAVE NOT

10 AGREED TO DO THAT, YET. THEN WE CAN DISCUSS WHAT GOES IN THE

11 BOX. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?

12

13 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I STILL DON'T GET IT. BUT, YOU KNOW, ALSO, LIKE,

14 WHO WILL -- LIKE, WHAT WILL THIS GOVERNING BODY BE?

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT'S TO BE DETERMINED. THIS IS TO

17 DETERMINE WHAT'S IN THIS BOX. RIGHT NOW THEY'RE NOT EVEN

18 AGREEING ON THAT H.

19

20 **VINAY PIMPLE:** OKAY.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I WANT TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT NOW.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WANT TO ADD A NUANCE THAT PROBABLY EVERYBODY

25 HERE IS FAMILIAR WITH. WHICH IS THERE ARE THINGS THAT COME TO





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 -- THAT ARE COMING BEFORE YOUR CITY. AND IF SOMETHING IS A  
2 POLICY ISSUE TO THE CITY, THEN YOU KNOW THAT YOU CAN WRITE A  
3 LETTER TO THE CITY COUNCIL THEN YOU KNOW YOU CAN WRITE A  
4 LETTER TO CITY COUNCIL. STAFF JOB IS TO DO A REALLY  
5 PROFESSIONAL JOB OF PREPARING THE CITY COUNCIL AND THEN THE  
6 CITY COUNCIL AS POLICY MAKERS ARE THE PEOPLE WHO MAKE THE  
7 DECISION. THEN WE HAVE A -- SO, I THINK, IN THINKING ABOUT,  
8 YOU KNOW, WHO IS INVOLVED IN MAKING POLICY DECISIONS, YOU  
9 KNOW, THINKING ABOUT WHAT'S THE ROLE OF POLICY MAKERS WHAT'S  
10 THE ROLE OF THE PUBLIC, AS CHRISTINE SAID, AND THEN AS RICH  
11 SAID, MAKING SURE THAT THERE IS ENFORCEMENT CAPABILITY AT THE  
12 END OF THE DAY, I THINK THOSE ARE ALL THINGS I CAN ADD AS  
13 COLOR TO THAT CORE STATEMENT.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO GO TO THE PUBLIC  
16 COMMENT AND THEN I'LL JUMP BACK. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT  
17 ON THIS ISSUE?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
20 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
21 ON THIS ITEM.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. TERRY? MUTE.

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **TERRY SCOTT:** I WOULD JUST LIKE TO SECOND ADINA'S MOTION. AND  
2 CALL, YOU KNOW --

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE HAD A FIRST AND A SECOND.

5

6 **TERRY SCOTT:** THEN I CALL THE QUESTION.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT, WE WILL  
9 GO TO A ROLL CALL VOTE. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO READ THE -- READ  
10 THAT ONE MORE TIME WHAT THEY'RE VOTING ON. THE STATEMENT,  
11 ADINA?

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** STATEMENT IS THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE  
14 SHOULD PRIORITIZE MOVEMENT TOWARD A NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
15 STRUCTURE FOR BAY AREA TRANSIT THAT ESTABLISHES ONE GOVERNING  
16 BODY THAT IS FULLY ACCOUNTABLE TO THE PUBLIC, FOR THE  
17 PERFORMANCE, CONNECTIVITY, ACCESSIBILITY, AND USER EXPERIENCE  
18 OF BAY AREA TRANSIT.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL THE  
21 ROLL?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR KINMAN?

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR ISUF?

3

4 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

7

8 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

11

12 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS?

15

16 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

19

20 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

23

24 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YES.

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLOREZ IS EXCUSED. GLASER IS EXCUSED.

2 HANKERSON? Dwayne: YES.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU? LEVIN?

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MARKHAM?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. NICKENS? RODNEY? OKAY.

13 ORANTES?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. PARKER?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE? PHILIPPE? OKAY. PIMPLE?

22

23 **VINAY PIMPLE:** ABSTAIN.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ABSTAIN?





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE? WILSON? WONG? IS EXCUSED. ZACH?

5 NICKENS? OH, RACHEL, DID YOU WANT TO VOTE ON THIS ITEM?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SURE. AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. AND RODNEY, DID YOU JOIN US?

10 ZELLY, WAS THAT YOU? OR DID GENAY THAT VOTED AYE?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I VOTED.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ZELLY, DID YOU WANT TO

15 VOTE ON THIS ITEM? OKAY. IT PASSES WITH 18 AYES AND ONE

16 ABSTENTION.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, EVERYBODY, FOR SITTING IN ON

19 THIS. WE'RE RUNNING LONG. THIS IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT FOLLOW-

20 THROUGH WORK WE HAVE BEEN DOING FOR A COUPLE OF YEARS NOW.

21 WITH THAT WE'LL GO ITEM NINE, LOOKING AHEAD 2023, PLANNED BAY

22 AREA 2050, AND TRANSIT 2050 PLUS. THIS WILL BE DAVE VAUTIN AND

23 KARA. I'M NOT SURE WHO IS GOING TO BE KICKING THIS OFF?

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** CHAIR KIN MORNINGS -- CHAIR KINMAN, I CAN KICK  
2 THIS OFF. BUT I BELIEVE ANNE OLIVIA HAS HER A HAND UP.

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** DID YOU WANT ME TO GIVE MY REPORT FROM THE  
5 ADVISORY GROUP?

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

8

9 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** WE MET OCTOBER 18TH, AND IT WAS REALLY  
10 DISH WANT TO GIVE SOME PROPS TO STAFF RIGHT NOW. IT WAS REALLY  
11 WELL THOUGHT OUT. IT WAS CLEARLY WELL ORGANIZED, AND I WAS  
12 ABLE TO GET SOME CLARITY ON QUESTIONS THAT I HAVE HAD. FOR  
13 EXAMPLE, THE NEXGEN ADVISORY GROUP IS NOT ABOUT ALL POSSIBLE  
14 ITERATIONS OF NEXT GENERATION OF FREEWAYS. IT IS EXCLUSIVELY  
15 ABOUT EXPLORING ALL LANE TOLLING OR LACK OF ALL LANE TOLLING  
16 AND THAT WAS A HELPFUL CLARIFICATION BECAUSE I THINK A LOT OF  
17 THE FEEDBACK FROM THIS BODY WAS AROUND OTHER THINGS WE COULD  
18 LOOK AT AS FAR AS THE NEXT GENERATION OF FREEWAYS GOES, BUT  
19 THAT IS NOT WHAT THEY'RE STUDYING. THEY ARE CONDUCTING TWO  
20 STUDIES. 1 IS ALL LANE TOLLING, AND THE IMPACT OF HAVING THAT  
21 PARTICULAR STRATEGY AS A REVENUE SOURCE FOR OUR OTHER  
22 PROJECTS. AND THE OTHER STUDY IS LOOKING AT IF WE HAVE NO  
23 FUNDING FOR OUR OTHER PROGRAMS. OR THAT THE AMOUNT OF FUNDING  
24 PROJECTED FROM THIS PARTICULAR STRATEGY IF WE JUST DO NOT HAVE  
25 THAT. AND I HAVE ASKED IF STAFF WILL LOOK AT AL INTERPRETIVE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 FUNDING SOURCES AS WAYS TO FUND THE OTHER PROGRAMMATIC  
2 PRIORITIES OUTLINED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, OR IF IT IS A --  
3 THIS REVENUE TOOL, OR NOTHING. AND MY UNDERSTANDING FROM THEIR  
4 RESPONSE IS THAT THIS ANSWER IS NOT COMPLETELY BLACK AND  
5 WHITE. THEY'RE NOT CONSIDERING OTHER FUNDING SOURCES,  
6 SPECIFICALLY. BUT, THEY ARE -- SO, THIS STUDY IS LOOKING AT  
7 THIS PATHWAY OR NOTHING. BUT, THERE IS SUPPOSED TO BE AN  
8 EXERCISE, LIKE, THEY INFORM YOU THAT THERE WOULD BE AN  
9 EXERCISE, POTENTIALLY AT THE NEXT MEETING THAT LOOKS AT  
10 COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES. I HAVE REQUESTED TO FIND OUT IF THIS  
11 IS -- IF THIS COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGY EXERCISE WILL INCLUDE A  
12 ROBUST EXPLORATION OF OTHER FUNDING OPTIONS, OR IF IT WON'T  
13 REALLY CONSIDER THAT AT ALL. THIS IS A CONCERN FOR ME, IF  
14 THEY'RE GOING TO PUT THIS TIME AND MONEY INTO IT. I'M LOOKING  
15 FORWARD TO CLARIFICATION ON THAT. SUMMARIZE A WHOLE BUNCH OF  
16 THINGS. STAFF PRESENTING FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS. I THINK ONE  
17 OF THE MOST SIGNIFICANT ONES IS THAT THEY HAVE BEEN LOOKING AT  
18 THE POTENTIAL IMPACT OF AN ALLOW LANE TOLLING STRATEGY COUPLED  
19 WITH THE PROPOSED STATEWIDE FEE TO USE ROADS, WHICH IS CALLED  
20 THE ROAD USE CHARGE OR RUC, AND THEY SEE THAT THE ROAD USE  
21 CHARGE IS SOMETHING THAT IS VERY LIKELY TO BE MOVING FORWARD  
22 ON A STATEWIDE BASIS. AND STAFF HAVE CONCLUDE THAT PAYING TO  
23 DRIVE ON FREEWAYS DOES NOT CONFLICT WITH PAYING TO DRIVE ON  
24 ROADS, AND THAT ALL LANE TOLLING WOULD BE ADDED ON TOP OF THE  
25 PROPOSED STATEWIDE ROAD USE CHARGE. SO, WE GOT A GOOD FRAMING.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 WE WERE THEN BROKEN INTO SMALL GROUPS AND ASKED TO COLLECT AND  
2 DISCUSS VARIOUS PATHWAYS AND WHAT THEY WOULD LOOK LIKE. IT WAS  
3 A GREAT EXERCISE. IT WAS THOUGHTFUL, WELL ORGANIZED. THE  
4 EXERCISES WERE INTENDED TO HELP STAFF DECIDE WHICH PATHWAYS  
5 THEY WOULD BE STUDYING. IT INCLUDED THINGS LIKE, DO WE WANT TO  
6 CHARGE PEOPLE WHO DRIVE ON FREEWAYS FOR THE ENTIRE EXTENT OF  
7 THE FREEWAY, OR JUST IN URBAN FREEWAY CORRIDORS, OR IF WE WANT  
8 TO CHANGE FOR DRIVING ON ALL ROADS AROUND SPECIFIC HOST SPOT  
9 INCLUDING RESIDENTIAL ROADS AND AUXILIARY ROADS AND WE SHOULD  
10 BE STUDYING THE IMPACT ON AUXILIARY ROADS ARE VARIOUS  
11 STRATEGIES. A PRETTY ROBUST THING BUT THESE WERE THE KIND OF  
12 OPTIONS WE WERE GIVEN. I FIND MYSELF WANTING TO DISCUSS THE  
13 EQUITY IMPLICATIONS OF VARIOUS STRATEGIES, THERE WASN'T A LOT  
14 OF SPACE FOR THAT. I WAS CONCERNED THAT THE STRATEGIES THAT I  
15 WAS SPECIFICALLY CONCERNED ABOUT THE PATHWAYS AND STRATEGIES  
16 THAT WE DON'T STUDY SO I DON'T KNOW YET IF WE DON'T STUDY A  
17 STRATEGY, IS IT GOING TO BE CONSIDERED AS A POSSIBLE PATHWAY  
18 OR IF THE STRATEGY OR PATHWAY THAT WE CHOOSE TO STUDY IF THOSE  
19 SHOW LARGE INEQUITIES THAT ONE THESE OTHER STRATEGIES MIGHT BE  
20 PRESENTED AS THE SOLUTION WITHOUT ACTUALLY HAVING ITS OWN  
21 ROBUST STUDY AND THIS IS THE ALTERNATIVE THAT IS PRESENTED AS  
22 THE ALTERNATIVE BASED ON THE PUBLIC COMMENT AND I SEE BOTH OF  
23 THOSE THINGS BEING QUITE DANGEROUS POTENTIALLY SO I'M LOOKING  
24 FORWARD TO GETTING SOME CLARITY ON THAT. I REQUESTED A FOLLOW  
25 UP MEETING WITH ANUP, AND HE WAS REALLY HAPPY TO ACCOMMODATE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THAT. UNFORTUNATELY, IT WAS DURING WORK HOURS AND MY WORK  
2 SCHEDULE DIDN'T ACCOMMODATE THAT. AND I HOPE TO FOLLOW UP WITH  
3 ANOTHER STAFF MEMBER AS ANUP IS ON LEAP AND WILL BRING THAT  
4 BACK AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THE NEXT MEETING. THE EXERCISES  
5 WERE FASCINATING AND I'M HOPING THEY'RE AVAILABLE TO MEMBERS  
6 OF THIS BODY. WITH THAT, I'LL STOP.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY MEMBER THAT  
9 WISHES TO SPEAK? WITH THAT, ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS OR  
10 QUESTIONS YOU HAVE OF ANNE OLIVIA? ADINA, GO AHEAD.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU ARE MUTED.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, YOU SAID IT, BUT I WAS A LITTLE CONFUSED. IN  
15 THE STAFF OPTIONS, DID I UNDERSTAND CORRECTLY THAT YOU SAID  
16 THAT WE MIGHT BE LOOKING TO ROADWAY AND FREEWAY TOLLING AS THE  
17 MAIN SOURCE OF NEW REVENUE FOR TRANSPORTATION?

18

19 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** OKAY. NO EXACTLY. SO TO CLASSIFY THAT  
20 CLARIFY THAT. IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THERE IS A SERIES OF  
21 STRATEGIES THAT ARE OUTLINED, AND THERE IS A REVENUE AMOUNT OR  
22 A COST ASSOCIATED WITH EACH OF THE PATHWAYS. THE REVENUE  
23 AMOUNT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS PATHWAY IS SUBSTANTIAL. AND THE  
24 STUDIES -- AND THIS WAS LAID OUT PRETTY CLEAR -- THE STUD  
25 THAT'S WE'RE DOING HERE IS A STUDY OF CHARGING PEOPLE TO DRIVE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 IN EVERY LANE OF THE FREEWAY. RIGHT? AND THAT IS THE TWO  
2 THINGS THAT THEY'RE LOOKING AT, ARE IF WE CHARGED EVERYONE TO  
3 DRIVE ON THE FREEWAY, WE WOULD MAKE THIS MUCH MONEY. AND IF WE  
4 JUST DON'T, THEN WHAT DOES THE REST OF PLANNED BAY AREA LOOK  
5 LIKE, IF WE DON'T HAVE THAT REVENUE SOURCE. AND MY PRETTYED  
6 QUESTION THAT WE'RE WORKING ON GETTING AN ANSWER TO, AND I  
7 HOPE TO HAVE CLARITY AT THE NEXT MEETING, IS THAT THERE WILL  
8 BE A -- MINDING IS THERE WILL BE AN EXERCISE THAT LOOKS AT  
9 COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES, BUT THERE IS NOT A STUDY THAT LOOKS  
10 AT COULD WE MAKE UP THAT DESIGNATED REVENUE AMOUNT WITH A  
11 DIFFERENT STRATEGY. IT'S EITHER GOING TO BE, DO THIS, OR THAT  
12 MONEY ISN'T THERE TO FUND THE OTHER THINGS, AND WHAT DOES THAT  
13 LOOK LIKE. SO, BUT I WILL LEARN MORE NEXT MEETING. AND I WILL  
14 BRING THAT BACK TO THIS BODY. BUT I DON'T -- I DON'T REMEMBER  
15 THE ACTUAL REVENUE PERCENTAGE THAT THIS PARTICULAR STRATEGY  
16 REPRESENTS. BUT IT IS A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF MONEY.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, JUST TO FOLLOW UP WITH ADINA'S  
19 QUESTION, THIS WAS ORIGINALLY PRESENTED TO US AS THE PRIME  
20 SOLUTION FOR REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS. IT WAS NOT PRESENTED TO  
21 US AS A REVENUE GENERATION PROJECT. CORRECT? OKAY.

22

23 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I HAVEN'T SEEN VERY MUCH EVIDENCE THAT  
24 WOULD SUPPORT THE CLAIM THAT IT REDUCES GREENHOUSE GAS  
25 EMISSIONS. ONLY BECAUSE OF THE PROPENSITY TO PUSH TRAFFIC INTO





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 AUXILIARY ROADS, SO THAT WOULD ACTUALLY INCREASE IT. BUT,  
2 UNLESS THERE WAS ACCOMPANYING ROBUST STRATEGIES THAT  
3 SUCCESSFULLY MOVED PEOPLE INTO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION --  
4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT WAS WHAT THEY SAID. PEOPLE WILL BE  
6 USING PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. IT'S OUR BIGGEST WAY OF GETTING  
7 OUR GHG REDUCED. SO, I JUST WANT TO BE CLEAR THAT WE'RE TAKING  
8 --

9  
10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** IT'S BEING STUDIED AS A REVENUE SOURCE AS  
11 OPPOSED TO --

12  
13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RIGHT. DWAYNE? Dwayne HANKERSON: THANK  
14 YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. BUT WHAT I'M WONDERING ABOUT IS,  
15 HOW IS THIS DECIDED? IS THIS DECIDED BY THE PUBLIC ON A BALLOT  
16 OR IS THIS DECIDED IN THE EXECUTIVE OFFICES OF MTC? THAT'S  
17 REALLY WHAT I WANT TO KNOW.

18  
19 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I BELIEVE THAT THIS WOULD BE ONE OF THE  
20 STRATEGIES THAT IS IMPLEMENTED AS PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA AND  
21 THAT -- I CAN'T IMAGINE STAFF PURSUING A BALLOT INITIATIVE,  
22 BECAUSE OF THE FAVORIBILITY READINGS. BUT, STAFF RAISED THEIR  
23 HAND SO MAYBE REBECCA CAN ANSWER THAT BETTER THAN I CAN.

24  
25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** REBECCA, GO AHEAD.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC  
3 AFFAIRS THIS IS REALLY A STUDY COMING OUT OF PLANNED BAY AREA  
4 THAT'S REALLY TRYING TO HAVE A FOCUS ON UNDERSTANDING HOW  
5 PLANNED BAY AREA SOMETHING THAT WAS LOOKED AT IN THE LONG  
6 RANGE PLAN WOULD BE RECEIVED BY THE PUBLIC UNDERSTANDING SOME  
7 OF THE EQUITY ALLOCATIONS OF DOING PRICING WHICH AGAIN WAS  
8 REALLY CONSIDERED AS PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA IN ORDER TO  
9 REACH OUR GHG REDUCTION TARGET. IT WAS NOT THE FOCUS TO RAISE  
10 REVENUE BUT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND JUST TRYING  
11 TO DRILL DOWN AND UNDERSTAND THAT MORE MTC DOES NOT HAVE THE  
12 AUTHORITY TO PUT BROAD TOLLS ON THE HIGHWAY SYSTEM THAT WAS  
13 SOMETHING THAT THE COMMISSION DETERMINED THROUGH MUCH COP  
14 INSULATION WITH THE PUBLIC AND WAS SOMETHING WE WANTED TO  
15 PURSUE WE WOULD HAVE TO GO TO SACRAMENTO ON THAT FURTHERMORE  
16 THERE MIGHT NEED TO BE SOME CHANGES IN FEDERAL LAW AND STEPS  
17 BEFORE WE WOULD BE ABLE TO PURSUE THAT POLICY.

18

19 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** MY FOLLOW UP QUESTION OR COMMENT IS, I'M  
20 TRYING TO COMPARTMENTALIZING THE ISSUES THAT WE DEAL WITH  
21 HERE. WHEN I THINK OF THIS AS A PERSON DRIVING ON ROADS TO GO  
22 TO WORK AND OTHER TAXES THEY HAVE TO PAY LIKE ON GAS, AND THE  
23 GAS REALLY HIGH, WE HAVE TO PAY PER GALLON AND TOLLS, AND  
24 PARKING AND BRIDGES, THEY WENT UP, THAT WAS FIVE, NOW TO SEVEN





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 JUST WANT PUT IT OUT THERE TO EXPLORE THE DIFFERENT STRATEGIES  
2 TO RAISE THE MONEY.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A WHITE PAPER FOR US  
5 TO KNOW WHERE THEY HAVE GOTTEN TO CALENDAR THIS FOR A MORE  
6 LENGTHY DISCUSSION. WE HAVE REACHED A POINT WHERE WE NEED TO  
7 BETTER NOCHL THE COUNCIL AS A WHOLE, AND HAVE STAFF THERE TO  
8 ANSWER THESE QUESTIONS. BECAUSE HONESTLY AT THIS POINT I HAVE  
9 NOT SEEN HOW THAT I PLAN ON MITIGATING THE IMPACT OF ANY OF  
10 THIS, ESPECIALLY IN THE URBAN AREAS WHERE THE STREETS ARE  
11 GOING TO WIND UP BEING THE FREEWAY BYPASSES, AS THEY ARE WHEN  
12 THERE IS AN ACCIDENT ON THE ROAD. SO, THANK YOU, ANNE OLIVIA,  
13 FOR THAT REPORT. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? REBECCA, DID YOU  
14 HAVE SOMETHING ELSE?

15

16 **REBECCA LONG:** YES. THROUGH THE CHAIR. THANK YOU CHAIR KINMAN.  
17 I JUST WANTED TO SUGGEST THAT RATHER THAN HAVING A SUBSEQUENT  
18 STAFF REPORT ON THIS, YOU KNOW, THIS IS A STUDY WE'RE DOING TO  
19 BETTER UNDERSTAND WHAT THE BAY AREA PUBLIC FEEL ABOUT THIS.  
20 THE COMMENTS THAT COUNCILMEMBER HANKERSON JUST RAISED ABOUT  
21 ALL OF THE OTHER TAXES THAT DRIVERS PAY, THAT IS EXACTLY THE  
22 NATURE OF WHAT WE'RE HEARING. I THINK IT WOULD BE THE MOST --  
23 THE BEST USE OF EVERYONE'S TIME FOR US TO COMPLETE THE STUDY,  
24 DO ALL THAT ENGAGEMENT AND COME BACK TO THE POLICY ADVISORY  
25 COUNCIL WITH AN IN DEPTH SUMMARY OF WHAT WE FOUND. WE'RE NOT





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 GOING TO BE MAKING ANY RECOMMENDATIONS IN ADVANCE OF  
2 COMPLETING THAT STUDY. SO THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO  
3 DO.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M NOT SUGGESTING THAT AT ALL, BUT I  
6 HAVE BEEN ASKING THE SAME QUESTION SINCE THE STUDY STARTED,  
7 AND I HAVEN'T RECEIVED AN ANSWER AS TO HOW THE MITIGATIONS ARE  
8 GOING TO BE PRIORITIZED. AND SINCE IT'S BEING TALKED ABOUT, AS  
9 GENERATING REVENUE, MORE THAN IT IS TALKED ABOUT REDUCING GHG  
10 BY PROVIDING, BY PUSHING PEOPLE INTO TRANSIT, I THINK THAT  
11 THAT'S A -- THAT'S A QUESTION THAT NEEDS TO STILL BE ON THE  
12 BOOKS. BUT I THINK THIS GROUP IS, WITH TWO-THIRDS OF THEM, OR  
13 THREE QUARTERS OF THEM, NEW TO THE ISSUE, IT WOULD HELP TO  
14 COME BACK AND HAVE MORE TIME TO DISCUSS THIS, RATHER THAN JUST  
15 A QUICK REPORT. I'M NOT ASKING STAFF TO PREPARE A REPORT. I'M  
16 ASKING FOR US, AS THE ADVISORY COUNCIL, IS TO HAVE A LITTLE  
17 BIT MORE TIME TO. AND RIGHT NOW WE'RE OVER TIME AND I WANT TO  
18 MAKE SURE THAT I'M RESPECTFUL OF THAT AND IT CAN'T BE TODAY,  
19 AND WANT TO BRING THAT BACK FOR DEEPER DISCUSSION. IF THAT  
20 MAKES SENSE?

21

22 **REBECCA LONG:** ABSOLUTELY.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS. SEEING NO  
25 RAISED HANDS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH EVERYONE FOR YOUR INPUT ON





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THIS. YOU HAVE A LIST OF WHO IS ON WHICH COMMITTEE YOU CAN  
2 CONTACT THEM AND JUST REACH OUT. SORRY DAVE AND KARA, LOOKING  
3 AHEAD TO 2023 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND TRANSIT 2050++.

4

5 **DAVE VAUTIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR KINMAN. DAVE VAUTIN  
6 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS. I HAVE BROWN HAIR, I WEAR  
7 GLASSES, AND I AM WEARING A RED TIE TODAY. AND I USE THE HIM  
8 PRONOUN. AM JOINED BY MY COLLEAGUES CHIRAG AND KARA, WHO ARE  
9 PRINCIPLE PLANNERS OF MTC AND ABAG. I'LL BE PROVIDING THE  
10 COUNCIL A FIRST LOOK AT UPCOMING LONG RANGE REGIONAL PLANNING  
11 WORK SLATED FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2023. JUST ONE YEAR AGO, IF WE  
12 CAN BRING UP THE SLIDES PLEASE. THANK YOU. ONE YEAR AGO MTC  
13 ABAG ADOPTED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 A REGIONAL PLAN IDENTIFYING  
14 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENTAL  
15 STRATEGIES TO IDENTIFY RESILIENT OUTCOMES WORKING TOWARDS THE  
16 PLAN'S STATED VISION OF AN AFFORDABLE CONNECTED HEALTHY AND  
17 VIBRANT BAY AREA FOR ALL. BETWEEN 2018 AND 2021 WITH ROBUST  
18 PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT WITH MANY FOLKS SERVING ON THIS  
19 COLONEL TODAY WITH UPDATES TO OUR REGIONAL VISION TENS OF  
20 THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS WERE INVOLVED IN CRAFTING  
21 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AS WELL AS COMPLEMENTARY ME TO TERM  
22 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WHICH IDENTIFIED MORE THAN 80 ACTIONS FOR  
23 MTC AND ABAG TO ADVANCE THROUGH 2025 BUT EVERY FOUR YEARS MTC  
24 AND ABAG ARE REQUIRED TO UPDATE THIS REGIONAL PLAN AND WE'RE  
25 BEGINNING TO THINK ABOUT WHAT A FOCUSED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 UPDATE MIGHT LOOK LIKE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FIRST LET'S TAKE A  
2 STEP BACK AND ASSESS WHERE WE STAND TODAY ONE YEAR AFTER PLAN  
3 ADOPTION. NEXT SLIDE. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WAS THE THIRD SUCH  
4 REGIONAL PLAN THAT WENT BEYOND THE SINGULAR TOPIC OF  
5 TRANSPORTATION. INTEGRATING EQUALLY IMPORTANT ELEMENTS FOR  
6 HOUSING, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. I'LL  
7 PROVIDE A QUICK OVERVIEW OF EACH PLAN AND DESCRIBE THE  
8 TIMELINES FEATURED ON THE SLIDES. IT ALL STARTED WITH PLANNED  
9 BAY AREA ADOPTED IN 2013 WHICH WAS LINKED TO THE REGIONAL  
10 HOUSING NEED ALLOCATION OR RHNA CYCLE FIVE. THAT PLAN HAD A  
11 HEAVY HE EMPHASIS ON GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS AS  
12 THE FIRST PLAN WITH A STATUTORY TARGET UNDER SENATE BILL 375.  
13 THAT EFFORT TOOK THREE AND A HALF YEARS WITH SCENARIO PLANNING  
14 IN 2010 AND 2011 DEVELOPMENT OF A PREFERRED SCENARIO IN 2012  
15 AND COMPLETION OF THE FINAL PHASE OF WORK THROUGH MID-2013.  
16 PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 THE SECOND SUCH PLAN WAS A LIMITED AND  
17 FOCUSED UPDATE TO THE ORIGINAL PLANNED BAY AREA, WITH A HEAVY  
18 FOCUS ON THE REGION'S HOUSING CRISIS REQUIRING TWO AND A HALF  
19 YEARS OF EFFORT IN TOTAL, WITH MORE LIMITED SCENARIO PLANNING  
20 IN 2015, DEVELOPMENT OF A PREFERRED SCENARIO IN 2016 IN THE  
21 FINAL PHASE AND EARLY IN 2027. F COURSE, THAT BRINGS US TO  
22 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH INTEGRATED NEW ELEMENTS FOR THE  
23 ECONOMY AND ENVIRONMENT AND FEATURED A ROBUST EXPLORATORY  
24 SCENARIO PLANNING PROCESS CALLED HORIZON IN 2018 AND 2019  
25 PERCEIVING A BLUEPRINT PHASE IN 2020 AND FINAL PHASE INCLUDING





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THE PLANNED DOCUMENT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT AND SUPPORT  
2 AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN COMPLETED IN 2021 IMPORTANTLY PLANNED  
3 BAY AREA 2050 WAS LINKED TO RHNA CYCLE SIX AND THE HOUSING  
4 ELEMENTS JURISDICTIONS ARE CURRENTLY WORKING TO UPDATE ONE  
5 IMPORTANT TAKE AWAY LOOKING AT PLANS IS MAJOR PLAN UPDATES  
6 REQUIRE HIGHER LEVELS OF STAFFING AND CONSULT RESOURCES WHICH  
7 SOMETIMES MEANS LESS BANDWIDTH AND CAPACITY TO IMPLEMENT THE  
8 PLANS WE JUST ADOPTED THIS IS KEY IN THE SCOPE AND VISION AND  
9 FOCUS FOR THE UPDATE ENVISIONED STARTING NEXT YEAR. LOOKING AT  
10 FUTURE REGIONAL PLANNING CYCLES FOR PLANNED BAY AREA, THE PLAN  
11 MUST BE UPDATED EVERY FOUR YEARS IN THIS CASE THE UPDATE MUST  
12 BE ADOPTED BY FALL 2025 OR WE RISK LOSING KEY STATE MONEY  
13 SECOND IT MUST BE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED EXPENDITURES CAN BE NO  
14 GREATER THAN REGIONALLY ANTICIPATED REVENUE ONE EXAMPLE OF HOW  
15 THIS REQUIREMENT BEING IMPACT FUTURE UPDATES IS RELATED TO  
16 TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT MONEYS WHERE LOWER TRANSPORTATION  
17 REVENUES COULD NECESSITATE POSTPONING SELECT TRANSPORTATION  
18 PROJECTS DUE TO LACK OF REASONABLY ANTICIPATED FUNDS. THIRD,  
19 PLANNED BAY AREA MUST BE DEVELOPED TO MEET THE NEAR 2035  
20 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS SET BY THE STATE. WHILE THE CALIFORNIA  
21 AIR RESOURCES BOARD DOES NOT USUALLY CHANGE THE TARGET FOR  
22 EVEN NUMBERED PLAN CYCLES, THEY ALWAYS HAVE THE ABILITY TO DO  
23 SO IF DESIRED. FOURTH, THE PLAN MUST BE DEVELOPED THROUGH A  
24 ROBUST PUBLIC PROCESS AND THIS CYCLE WILL BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
25 LEVERAGE THE BEST OF BOTH WORLDS WITH BOTH IN-PERSON AND





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 VIRTUAL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT THANKS TO THE WANING OF THE  
2 PANDEMIC. AND FIFTH THE PLAN'S TECHNICAL METHODOLOGIES AND  
3 ASSUMPTIONS MUST BE REVIEWED BY STATE AGENCIES MOST  
4 IMPORTANTLY CARB AND CARB IS INCREASINGLY FOCUSED TO ENSURING  
5 THAT IMPLEMENTATION AND NOT JUST PLAN SUGGEST HAPPENING AT THE  
6 REGIONAL SCALE. NEXT SLIDE. SPEAKING OF CARB, ONE ROADBLOCK  
7 THAT STANDS IN OUR WAY OF KICKING OFF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS  
8 THE FACT THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STILL HASN'T BEEN APPROVED  
9 BY THE STATE. WHILE WE HAVE BEEN CONSULTING WITH CARB SINCE  
10 2019 AND SUBMITTED THE FINAL PLAN TO THEM LAST NOVEMBER WE  
11 CONTINUE TO WAIT THEIR FINAL DETERMINATION WITHOUT CARB'S  
12 APPROVAL IT IS DIFFICULT TO START THE PLAN UPDATE PROCESS AND  
13 IMPORTANTLY POSSESSIONS A MIRAGE RISK TO STATE TRANSPORTATION  
14 PROJECTS SEEKING STATE MONEYS IN 2023. NEXT SLIDE. OF COURSE,  
15 OVER THE PAST YEAR, THERE HAS BEEN TREMENDOUS EFFORT TO  
16 ADVANCE IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS THAT EMERGE FROM THE  
17 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. RANT HIGHLIGHTS INCLUDE THE ADOPTION OF  
18 THE NEW TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY, ADVANCEMENT OF  
19 KEY BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCING AUTHORITY PILOT PROGRAMS,  
20 PREPARATION FOR NEW CYCLES OF PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT PRIORITY  
21 DEVELOPMENT EFFORTS ON PARKING AND ELECTRIFICATION AND ADVANCE  
22 THE CLIMATE STRATEGIES. NEXT MONTH THE COUNCIL IS SLATED TO  
23 HEAR A COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE ON THIS WORK GOING INTO 2023, HOW  
24 CAN MTC AND ABAG CONTINUE ADVANCED IMPLEMENTATION OF CRITICAL  
25 INITIATIVES TO TURN OUR PLANS FROM VISION TO REALITY ALL WHILE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 MAKING TARGETED UPDATES TO PLANNED BAY AREA THAT REFLECT OUR  
2 EVER EVOLVING PLANNING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. STAFF IS PROPOSING  
3 AN OVERARCHING VISION FOR THE NEXT TWO REGIONAL PLAN UPDATES  
4 STRETCHING THROUGH 2029 IT WOULD START NEXT YEAR WITH AN  
5 UPDATE TO OUR PLAN WHICH WE'RE CALLING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
6 PLUS THE FOCUS OF TODAY'S PRESENTATION. COMMENCING IN SUMMER  
7 2023 AND WRAP IN LATE 2025 FEATURING A YEAR LONG BLUEPRINT  
8 UPDATE PHASE FOLLOWED BY A YEAR LONG STATUTORY FINAL PHASE  
9 FOCUSED ON EIR PLAN DOCUMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION. THE GOAL OF  
10 THE PROCESS WOULD BE TO MAKE HIGH IMPACT REFINEMENT TO SELECT  
11 BLUE RIBBON STRATEGIES WHILE RETAINING THE REMAINING  
12 STRATEGIES GIVEN THE EXISTING PLANS FOR ANALYTICAL FOUNDATION.  
13 THIS APPROACH WOULD ENABLE IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS TO CONTINUE  
14 A PACE RATHER THAN SHIFTING CONSIDERABLE STAFF AND FINANCIAL  
15 RESOURCES FOR ITS LONG-RANGE PLANNING TO ACCOMMODATE MORE  
16 SPECIFIC UPDATES IN THE NEXT YEAR. IN ADDITION, PLANNED BAY  
17 AREA 2050 PLUS WOULD IDENTIFY A NEW SUITE OF IMPLEMENTATION  
18 ACTION RECOGNIZING THAT MANY IMPLEMENTATION ACTIVITIES  
19 IDENTIFIED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WILL BE SUBSTANTIALLY  
20 COMPLETE BY 2025. LOOKING AHEAD TO THE LATTER HALF OF THE  
21 DECADE THIS WOULD ALLOW A MAJOR UPDATE TO PLANNED BAY AREA TO  
22 ADVANCE IN EARLY 2026 ON THE SAME MAGNITUDE AS PLANNED BAY  
23 AREA 2050 WITH ROBUST SCENARIO PLANNING THROUGH HORIZON 2.0  
24 EFFORTS AND DEEP DIVE POLICY ANALYSIS IN 2026 AND 2027  
25 FOLLOWED BY AN OVERHAUL OF THE BLUEPRINT IN 2028 AND FINAL





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 PHASE IN 2029. GIVEN THAT SUBSEQUENT PLANNING CYCLE WOULD  
2 LIKELY FACE MORE AGGRESSIVE CLIMATE GOALS, FEATURE AN EXTENDED  
3 TIME HORIZON AND SYNC UP WITH A PLANNED BAY AREA RHNA CYCLE  
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2060 WOULD BE BETTER PRIME TO ACT MORE AS A  
5 SIGNIFICANT POLICY CHANGES TO 30-YEAR REGIONAL VISION. NEXT  
6 SLIDE. WITH ALL CONTEXT IN MIND WHAT MIGHT THESE TARGETED  
7 UPDATES IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS LOOK LIKE? AFTER ALL,  
8 PLANNED BAY AREA IS ALWAYS INTENDED TO BE A COMPREHENSIVE  
9 VISION THAT CONNECTS DOTS BETWEEN TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE  
10 ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. GIVEN THAT THE RHNA NUMBERS WILL  
11 REMAIN FIXED THROUGH THE END OF THIS DECADE, THIS CYCLE, OUR  
12 FOURTH CYCLE OF PLANNED BAY AREA, IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO FOCUS  
13 ON SPECIFIC STRATEGIES, ESPECIALLY THOSE IN THE TRANSPORTATION  
14 AND ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS. STRATEGY REFINEMENTS NOT LIMITED TO  
15 ONE TOPICAL AREA TRANSIT ARE THE MOST BRIGHT FOR REINVENTION  
16 RECOGNIZING CONTINUED FINANCIAL CHALLENGES IN THIS SPACE AND  
17 NEED TO REEVALUATE LEGACY OR PRECOVID TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS  
18 TO ENSURE THEY ALIGN WITH CURRENT AND FUTURE REGIONAL NEEDS.  
19 THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUGGESTED THAT A  
20 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN WHICH WOULD TAKE A SERVICE ORIENTED  
21 APPROACH TO CREATING AN ASPIRATIONAL TRANSIT SERVICE VISION  
22 FOR THE BAY AREA WOULD BE CREATED IN AN EFFORT SEPARATE FROM  
23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. NEXT SLIDE. AFTER FURTHER  
24 CONSIDERATION OF STAFFING AND FUNDING RESOURCES AS WELL AS THE  
25 BROADER POLICY LANDSCAPE, OUR TEAM IDENTIFIED SIGNIFICANT





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 CHALLENGES IN IMPLEMENTING A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN IN  
2 ISOLATION. FOR ONE, THIS TYPE OF UNCONSTRAINED MODAL PLAN  
3 WOULD EXCEED THE REGIONAL FISCAL CAPACITY EVEN WITH A SUITE OF  
4 NEW REVENUE MEASURES IN PLACE, LACK NEXUS WITH LOWER NEAR-TERM  
5 REVENUE FORECAST POSED BY THE FISCAL CLIFF AND FINALLY LONGER  
6 TO DEVELOP BECAUSE IT WOULD HAVE TO OCCUR IN PARALLEL WITH THE  
7 STATUTORY PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS PROCESS. CONVERSELY,  
8 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IS A MORE INTEGRATED AND  
9 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN NOT LIMITED TO A SINGLE MODE OR TOPICAL  
10 AREA. AND WHILE IT'S FISCAL CONSTRAINT PROVIDES A DOSE OF  
11 REALISM INTO PLANNING IT'S OFTEN CRITIQUED AND PERHAPS RIGHTLY  
12 SO FOR EMPHASIS ON CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT. IF DEVELOPED IN  
13 ISOLATION THERE IS RISK IF WE CONTINUE THIS FOCUS ON LEGACY  
14 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS RATHER THAN EVALUATING REGIONAL  
15 PRIORITIES POST COAST THIS COULD LEAD TO TWO WIDELY DIVERGENT  
16 VISIONS FOR TRANSIT ONE UNCONSTRAINED AND FOCUS SOLELY ON  
17 SURFACE, AND THE OTHER FISCALLY CONSTRAINED TO FOCUS ON  
18 CAPITAL PROJECTS OUR TEAMWORK IMAGINED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
19 PLUS FOCUSING ON FOLLOWING QUESTIONS BLENDING BEST OF BOTH  
20 FRAMEWORK TOGETHER TO OVERCOME CHALLENGES. NEXT SLIDE. WE  
21 THINK THE ANSWER TO THAT IS YES. THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
22 PLUS AND CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING CAN BE BETTER TOGETHER.  
23 MTC AND ABAG STAFF RECOMMEND A HARMONIZED APPROACH REFLECTING  
24 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS COMPREHENSIVELY REIMAGINING THE 26 RELATED  
25 STRATEGIES IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS'S TRANSPORTATION





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 ELEMENT USING A SERVICE ORIENTED HUB ORIENTED AND FISCALLY  
2 RESPONSIBLE APPROACH WHICH WE HAVE DUBBED "TRANSIT 2050." MTC  
3 STAFF AND ABAG STAFF WOULD WORK CLOSELY WITH THE REGION'S  
4 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO COCREATE THIS VISION, AND FURTHER PUBLIC  
5 ENGAGED PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AND INCLUDING COUNTIES  
6 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES AND ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS BEING KEY  
7 TO ITS SUCCESS. LET'S LOOK AT THE SCHEDULE IS PLANS. NEXT  
8 SLIDE. START WIDTH BROAD COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL PLAN. PLANNED  
9 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS WOULD HAVE THREE OVERARCHING STEPS. STEP  
10 ONE, DURING THE PROJECT KICKOFF IN SUMMER OF 2023 WOULD  
11 INVOLVE UPDATING PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS BASED ON THE LATEST  
12 AVAILABLE DATA. THIS WOULD INCLUDE REFINED PROJECTIONS OF  
13 THINGS LIKE TELECOMMUTE LEVELS, OFFICE SQUARE FOOTAGE  
14 REQUIREMENTS OVERALL REVENUE FORECAST AND OTHER EXTERNAL  
15 FORCES THAT HAVE BEEN INFLUENCED BY THE COVID PANDEMIC IN  
16 ADVANCE OF THE BLUEPRINT PHASE. STEP TWO INVOLVING UPDATING  
17 SELECT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES TO REFLECT COMPLETED ONGOING  
18 IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS THINGS LIKE THE TOC POLICY, SEA LEVEL  
19 RISE FUNDING FRAMEWORK CLIMATE INITIATIVES PROGRAM AND MORE.  
20 THE STEP WOULD INTEGRATE SALIENT FINDINGS FROM PAST SCENARIO  
21 PLANNING DURING HORIZON THAT TELLS US A LOT ABOUT THE POST-  
22 PANDEMIC FUTURE WE NOW FIND OURSELVES THAT INCLUDE WEAKER  
23 ECONOMY WORSENING CLIMATE AND STRONG PREFERENCE FOR WORK-FROM-  
24 HOME. IT WOULD STRETCH ACROSS TWO PHASES OF THE DRAFT  
25 BLUEPRINT DEVELOPED IN FALL 2023 AND WINTER 2024 AND FINAL





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 BLUEPRINT DEVELOPED IN SPRING OF AND FALL OF 2024 FINAL PHASE  
2 2025 WOULD INCLUDE A NEW PLAN DOCUMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL  
3 IMPACT REPORT AS WELL AS COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE TO MTC AND ABAG  
4 NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION PRIORITIES. PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT WOULD  
5 REMAIN A CORE PART OF THIS WORK WITH PRIMARY OUTREACH CYCLES  
6 DURING THE DRAFT FINAL BLUEPRINT AND FINAL PHASE. I WON'T GO  
7 THROUGH COMPONENTS OF EACH PHASE BUT WOULD NOTE THAT THE GOAL  
8 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS PROCESS WOULD FOCUS ON WHAT  
9 IS STATUTORILY REQUIRED AND UPDATE SELECT STRATEGIES THAT  
10 WOULD BENEFIT MOST FROM UPDATES PRIMARILY THOSE RELATED TO  
11 TRANSPORTATION AND THE ENVIRONMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SPEAKING OF  
12 TRANSPORTATION TRANSIT 2050 PLUS WOULD BE AN INTENSE RAPID  
13 PROCESS NESTED WITHIN THE BROADER FRAMEWORK SEEKING TO  
14 OVERHAUL SIX OF THE 35 STRATEGIES THAT RELATES TO PUBLIC  
15 TRANSIT. HERE IS HOW WE WOULD IMAGINE IT WOULD WORK. FIRST  
16 HALF 2023 TRANSIT 2050 MRS. WOULD EXPLORE NEEDS AND GAPS  
17 THROUGHOUT EXISTING SYSTEM THROUGH A WHITE PAPER PROCESS AND  
18 REFINE AND CATEGORIZE CORRIDORS IN THE NETWORK AND SECOND HALF  
19 OF 2023 GENERATE PROJECTS WHICH WOULD INCLUDE CAPITAL ELEMENTS  
20 FREQUENCY ENHANCEMENTS AND OR TRANSIT CAPACITY TO OUR TRANSIT  
21 PRIORITY INVESTMENTS FOR EACH CORRIDOR TO EVALUATE ALONGSIDE  
22 LEGACY PROJECTS. STARTING IN FALL 2023 AND CONTINUING THROUGH  
23 SUMMER 2024 IT WOULD THEN EVALUATE PROJECT CONCEPTS AS WELL AS  
24 NETWORKS TO UNDERSTAND COST EFFECTIVENESS AND EQUITY OUTCOMES.  
25 BY SUMMER 2024 IT WOULD LAND ON A FISCALLY CONSTRAINED TRANSIT





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 NETWORK COMPRISED OF STRATEGIES ASSOCIATED INVESTMENT WHICH  
2 WOULD FEED DIRECTLY INTO THE FINAL BLUE RIBBON BLUEPRINT FOR  
3 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. LASTLY BY 2025 IT WOULD  
4 ACKNOWLEDGE FUNDING AND IMPLEMENTATION CHALLENGES AS WELL AS  
5 ASPIRATIONAL PROJECTS THAT DID NOT MAKE THE CUT IN A  
6 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT. NEXT SLIDE. WHILE WE ARE PROPOSING A  
7 FOCUSED SCOPE FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS THAT BUILDS ON  
8 THE ADOPTED PLAN FROM TODAY WE ARE COGNIZANT OF THIS DEEP DIVE  
9 INTO TRANSIT; TRANSIT 2050 PLUS WILL NOT BE EASY. IT WILL  
10 REQUIRE A RAPID 18-MONTH TIMELINE AND SIMULTANEOUSLY  
11 NECESSITATE ROBUST STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT. THAT BEING SAID  
12 THIS APPROACH WHERE WE WAVE THE DNA OF NETWORK PLANNING INTO  
13 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS TO SPARK A STANDARD OF OVERHAUL FOR  
14 OUR TRANSIT VISION WOULD BE THE BEST PATH FORWARD TO MEET THE  
15 MOMENT IN THIS POST-PANDEMIC ENVIRONMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SO,  
16 WHAT'S NEXT FOR THE MONTHS AHEAD. HAVING LED PLANNED BAY AREA  
17 IN 2017, I AM NOW PASSING THE BATON TO MY COLLEAGUE CHIRAG  
18 RABARI WHO WILL SERVE AS PROJECT MANAGER THIS TIME AROUND FOR  
19 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS AND FRESH OFF THE RECENTLY ADOPTED  
20 TOC EFFORT MY COLLEAGUE KARA VUICICH WILL STEP INTO A NEW ROLE  
21 AS THE PROJECT MANAGER FOR TRANSIT 2050, GOING INTO 2023 YOU  
22 WILL HEAR UPDATES FROM BOTH OF THESE RELATED PROJECTS FROM  
23 THEM WE LOOK FORWARD TO AN ACTIVE ROLE FOR THE POLICY ADVISORY  
24 COUNCIL ON THE NEXT ROUND OF INTEGRATED REGIONAL PLANNING.  
25 WITH THAT I WILL WRAP UP AND WE'RE HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS OR





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 FEEDBACK ON THIS PROPOSAL BEFORE BRINGING IT TO THE JOINT  
2 PLANNING COMMITTEE NEXT MONTH.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVE. DON'T THINK I DIDN'T  
5 CATCH THAT I'M STEPPING OUT OF THIS PORTION OF YOUR COMMENTS  
6 HERE. HAVING WORKED WITH YOU ON ALL OF THESE, AND HAVING  
7 WORKED WITH THE OTHER PEOPLE ON YOUR TEAM, I FEEL THIS IS  
8 GOING TO BE A NICE SMOOTH TRANSITION. BUT I SEE YOU WALKING  
9 OUT OF THIS. WE ARE GOING TO START THE COMMENCE FROM OUR  
10 COUNCIL MEMBERS HERE. PAM CAMPOS AND THEN RICH HEDGES.

11

12 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** HI. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THAT PRESENTATION. I  
13 HAD A QUESTION ABOUT THE FIRST STEP DEVELOPING THE WHITE PAPER  
14 AND WHAT OPPORTUNITIES OR INPUT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL OR  
15 OTHER BODIES MIGHT HAVE TO INFORM THE CONTEXT SETTING AND THE  
16 EXISTING AND FUTURE WORK CONDITIONS? BECAUSE I REALLY WANT TO  
17 HIGHLIGHT THAT THIS CRISIS OF LACK OF WORKFORCE WAS  
18 PREDOMINANTLY STARTED BY THE EXODUS OF WOMEN WHO HAD TO LEAVE  
19 THE WORKFORCE WHEN CHILD CARE WAS NO LONGER AVAILABLE AND  
20 STARTED CLOSING THEIR DOORS. SO I REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE  
21 THAT IS HIGHLIGHTED, AND A KEY PIECE OF OUR IDEAS MOVING  
22 FORWARD. BECAUSE CHILD CARE NEEDS TO BE AN INTEGRAL PART OF  
23 COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE. THANK YOU.

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** DAVE DO YOU GUYS WANT TO ANSWER QUESTIONS  
2 OR TAKE NOTES AND COME BACK TO US? OR COLLECT QUESTIONS?

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** IF IT'S OKAY WITH THE CHAIR, I WOULD JUST SAY IF  
5 WE COULD HEAR THE QUESTIONS THEN WE'LL TRY TO PROVIDE A  
6 SYNOPSIS THAT WAVES THEM TOGETHER AT THE END.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. SOUNDS GOOD. RICH HEDGES, AND THEN  
9 FRANK WELTE. GO AHEAD.

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. HI DAVE. QUITE FRANKLY, I THOUGHT I  
12 SAW YOU SMILING IN THE HANDOFF. BUT NOT SURE. [LAUGHTER] SO, A  
13 COUPLE OF THINGS. 50 A COMMENT. I WAS ACTUALLY INVOLVED IN THE  
14 COMMITTEE THAT, SUBCOMMITTEE THAT TALKED ABOUT THE TOD  
15 POLICIES AND SET THEM UP, AND I WAS SO HAPPY TO THE -- FOR THE  
16 TRANSITION TO THE TOC, BECAUSE I THINK IT CAPSULIZED THE  
17 ORIGINAL SETTING UP THE TOD POLICY. SO I THINK IT'S A REALLY  
18 GOOD THING. I WAS CURIOUS THERE WAS SOMETHING CALLED LINK 21  
19 AND I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN ONE OF THEIR MEETINGS THEIR TIME  
20 HORIZON IS 2040 SO ARE YOU LOOKING AT WHAT THEY'RE PLANNING  
21 AND BRINGING IT INTO THE DOCUMENTS? IT SEEMS TO BE FISCALLY  
22 CONSTRAINED.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HE'S GOING TO SUMMARIZE COMMENTS  
25 AFTERWARDS.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** FRANK WELTE. AND THEN ADINA.

5

6 **FRANK WELTE:** HI THERE. FIRST OF ALL, I THINK IT COMES AS NO  
7 SECRET TO MEMBERS OF THIS COUNCIL THAT I WAS NOT PLEASED WITH  
8 THE EXTENT TO WHICH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ADDRESSED ISSUES OF  
9 DISABILITY AND ACCESSIBLE. AND SO MY QUESTION IS GIVEN THIS  
10 OPPORTUNITY TO DID AN UPDATE THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
11 PLUS, WHAT PLANS, IF ANY, DOES MTC HAVE TO REVISE ITS PLANNING  
12 METHODOLOGY TO DO A BETTER JOB OF ADDRESSING ISSUES OF  
13 DISABILITY AND ACCESSIBILITY THROUGHOUT PLANNING PROCESS, AND  
14 NOT JUST IN TERMS OF BOLTING ON A FEW MORE FOCUS GROUPS OR  
15 COMMUNITY SURVEYS?

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HE'LL ADD THAT TO HIS  
18 RESPONSE. ADINA AND THEN ZACH.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** HUH. YEAH, SO, A FEW COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS. THE  
21 COMMENTS ARE THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THIS IS A REALLY EXCITING  
22 WAY OF PROPOSING TO WEAVE IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA WITH THE  
23 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN, AND, YOU KNOW, HAVING A NEW WAY OF  
24 HANDLING THE COMP INVASION OPERATING AND FUNDING AND SERVICE  
25 WITH CAPITAL PLANNING, WITH A MUCH BETTER BLENDING OF HOW





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THOSE THINGS INTERRELATE SO WE DON'T WIND UP WITH A LIFE-SIZED  
2 SCALE MODEL OF A TRANSIT EQUIPMENT THAT DOESN'T RUN. SO, LOVE  
3 HOW THAT IS BLENDED TOGETHER. THE QUESTIONS INCLUDE -- SO,  
4 SENSE THIS IS SUCCESS INTEGRATED WITH PLANNED BAY AREA AND AN  
5 UPDATE OF TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES, AND ONE OF THE LIMITS  
6 OF THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES, WHICH WAS VERY GOOD, BUT  
7 IT WAS LIMITED BECAUSE IT APPLIED TO A TINY FRACTION OF OUR  
8 REGION'S PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, WOULD HAVING A  
9 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN WITH A PROPOSAL FOR MORE RELIABLE AND A  
10 FAST SERVICE ON MORE OF A TRANSIT, ALLOW SOME UPDATES TO  
11 STRENGTHEN OUR HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES? AND LET'S SEE. SO,  
12 ANOTHER, A COMMENT I SAW ON THE SLIDES TALKING ABOUT STAFFING  
13 THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN WITH A COMBINATION OF MTC STAFF AND  
14 TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF, AND THAT WORKED EXTREMELY WELL WITH THE  
15 FARE INTEGRATION WORK. SO I'M GLAD TO SEE THAT BEING PROPOSED  
16 TO CONTINUE. AND THEN THE LAST TWO QUESTIONS ARE, IN TERMS OF  
17 CARB APPROVAL, IS THERE ANYTHING THAT ANYBODY CAN DO WANT IT  
18 TO GET CARB TO DO ITS THING AND APPROVE PLANNED BAY AREA? AND,  
19 LASTLY, IN TERMS OF FRANK WELTE'S COMMENT ABOUT ACCESSIBILITY,  
20 YOU KNOW, ONE THING THAT I HAVE BEEN STARTING TO GET AS A  
21 MEMBER OF THIS BODY, IS REQUESTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO  
22 GET MORE ACCESSIBLE VERSIONS OF MTC DOCUMENTATION. AND THAT  
23 SEEMS LIKE A HIGHLY INEFFICIENT WAY OF MTC DOING ITS WORK AND  
24 THERE PROBABLY ARE SOME OPPORTUNITIES TO WEAVE IN MAKING SURE  
25 THAT THE MATERIALS FOR ALL THESE THINGS ARE ACCESSIBLE TO





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, INCLUDING VISUALLY DISABLED. SO, I  
2 WAS -- WANTED TO AMPLIFY WHAT FRANK WAS SAYING, AMONGST ALL  
3 THE MANY DIFFERENT IMPLICATIONS THE MATERIALS THAT ARE COMING  
4 FROM THE MTC TO BE ACCESSIBLE.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ZACH?

7

8 **ZACH GROSS:** WITH THE TRANSIT PLUS FRAMEWORK, CENTERING THE  
9 NEEDS OF SOME COMMUNITIES WHO DIDN'T FEEL WELL ENGAGED IN THE  
10 PLAN PREDICTIONS OF PLANNED BAY AREA, THAT'S MY COMMENT AND  
11 REQUEST. MY QUESTION IS HOW THIS UPDATED FRAMEWORK FITS IN  
12 WITH THE FISCAL CLIFF AND THE PLANNING THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES  
13 ARE CURRENTLY DOING IN THE NEXT COMING YEARS, MY ISSUE WITH  
14 THE CONNECTION NETWORK PLAN WASN'T PART AWAY TO HELP ADDRESS  
15 AND BRING BACK RIDERSHIP AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN TRANSIT  
16 AGENCIES AND THE MTC AND THE PLANNING PROCESS HOW DOES THAT  
17 BRINGING BACK RIDERSHIP?

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** MARTHA ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
22 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
23 ON THIS ITEM.

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1   **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M GOING ADD MY COMMENT. I'M CONCERNED  
2   ABOUT THE SPOKE MORE THAN I AM ABOUT THE HUBS. BECAUSE EVERY  
3   TIME THAT HAPPENS IN MY AREA, WHAT WE FIND UP DOING IS SAYING,  
4   WE HAVE TO GREAT HUB HERE, BUT WE HAD TO ELIMINATE A COUPLE OF  
5   THE SPOKES ON THE WHEEL. AND THAT IMPACTS A LOT OF PEOPLE. THE  
6   IT IMPACTS THE PEOPLE WHO DO NOT HAVE ACCESS TO THE HUB ANY  
7   OTHER WAY, AND IT ALSO IMPACTS THE DELIVERY OF OUR PARATRANSIT  
8   SERVICE. SO, I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT AS WE'RE DESIGN BEING  
9   THESE HUB SERVICES, AND THESE -- THIS HUB APPROACH, THAT WE  
10  AREN'T -- WE AREN'T TAKING THE SPOKES OUT OF THE SYSTEM.  
11  BECAUSE THE PEOPLE WHO ARE COMING THE FARTHEST ON THE LEAST  
12  TRAVELED ROUTES ARE THE ONES THAT ARE MOST TRANSIT DEPENDENT  
13  QUITE OFTEN AND I AM JUST REALLY WARY ABOUT THAT. BUT NOW THAT  
14  YOU HAVE HAD TIME TO COMPILE THE QUESTIONS, I'LL LET YOU GO  
15  AHEAD WITH SOME OF YOUR ANSWERS. THANKS DAVE.

16

17  **DAVE VAUTIN:** THANK YOU ALL FOR THE QUESTIONS. I'LL TRY TO GIVE  
18  RESPONSIVE WITH TOUCHES ON MANY OF THEM AND THEN TURN IT OVER  
19  TO KARA FOR TRANSIT RELATED QUESTIONS. ON THE WORKFORCE ASPECT  
20  AND THE NEEDS AND GAPS WORK FOR TRANSIT 50 PLUS, WE HAVE  
21  DEFINITELY HEARD THAT FROM OUR TRANSIT OPERATOR PARTNERS WE  
22  CERTAINLY WANT TO ENGAGE THE COUNCIL THROUGHOUT TAP  
23  SUBCOMMITTEE THROUGHOUT TRANSIT 50 PLUS PROCESS SO EACH OF  
24  THOSE STEPS WE WOULD BE GOING TO THE TAPP, AND IF GETTING  
25  FEEDBACK FROM COUNCIL MEMBERS ON THAT. LINK 21 IS IN THE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 EXISTING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE KNOW THAT PROJECT CONTINUES  
2 TO EVOLVE SO THAT WILL BE SOMETHING WE'LL BE TRACKING AND  
3 OBVIOUSLY CONSIDERING THAT AMONGST OUR MAN OTHER CAPITAL AND  
4 OPERATING PRIORITIES AS PART OF THIS CYCLE. WITH REGARDS TO  
5 FRANK'S QUESTION, I CAN START THEN MAYBE TURN IT OVER TO KARA  
6 TO TALK ABOUT THE TRANSIT ASPECT OF IT. CERTAINLY WE HAVE A  
7 GREAT OPPORTUNITY HERE, FRANK, YOU KNOW, AS WE LOOK AT THE  
8 TRANSIT ENVIRONMENTAL ELEMENTS TO LOOK AT IT THROUGHOUT  
9 CRITICAL LENS OF OLDER ADULTS AND DISABLED IMPORTANCE WE'RE  
10 GOING TO HAVE TOO MANY TO DO THAT AS PART OF THE BLUEPRINT  
11 PHASE. WE'LL HAVE THIS PROCESS I KNOW YOU HAD THOSE CONCERNS,  
12 AND DURING THE PROCESS IMPLEMENTATION PHASE WE'LL BE ABLE TO  
13 LOOK AT THOSE THINGS FROM THE FRONT END THIS TIME. AND YOUR  
14 NEXT ITEM ABOUT THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING PLAN, ANOTHER GOOD  
15 OPPORTUNITY TO THINK ABOUT HOW THOSE PLAY PLANS CAN BE LIFTED  
16 UP. KARA DO YOU WANT TO SPEAK TO THE TRANSIT CONSIDERATION.

17

18 **KARA VUICICH:** KARA VUICICH REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM I THINK  
19 WITH RESPECT TO INCORPORATIONS WITH THE NEEDS OF FOLKS WITH  
20 DISABILITIES AND IMPROVING ACCESSIBILITY, IN CONSIDERATION OF  
21 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IN TERMS OF HOW DO WE MAKE THE  
22 BASIC SYSTEM AND ACCESSIBLE FOR EVERYONE WHO NEEDS TO USE IT,  
23 FOR FOLKS WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT. AND COORDINATION WITH  
24 PARATRANSIT ACTIONS CONTINUING TO MOVE FORWARD FROM THE  
25 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND THIS TOUCHES ON FARE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 INTEGRATION POLICY AND WAYFINDING. WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO  
2 COORDINATE WITH THOSE EFFORTS TOO BUT YEAH IT'S DEFINITELY I  
3 THINK WE HAVE HEARD LOUD AND CLEAR THIS IS AN IMPORTANT  
4 CONSIDERATION IN THIS WORK.

5

6 **DAVE VAUTIN:** AND THEN I'LL PROVIDE SOME BRIEF RESPONSES FROM  
7 OTHER QUESTIONS AND CONCERNS THAT WERE RAISED. TO ADINA'S  
8 QUESTION. YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY THE WORK ON TRANSIT 50 PLUS WILL  
9 CHANGE OUR TRANSIT INVESTMENTS THAT MIGHT MEAN THAT OUR GROWTH  
10 GEOGRAPHIES CHANGE SOMEWHAT WITH TRANSIT-RICH AREAS FROM  
11 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 MAY NO LONGER BEING SUCH AND THE NEW  
12 ONES THAT MIGHT BE CREATED AS A RESULT OF THIS CYCLE AND  
13 SOMETHING TO BE INTEGRATED INTO THIS WORK. AND CHIRAG IS  
14 CONTINUING TO ENGAGE WITH CARB WE ARE URGING THEM TO MAKE A  
15 DETERMINE ON THE PLAN. THEY ARE SAYING THEY WILL DO SO BY THE  
16 END OF NOVEMBER AND WE AWAIT THAT DEADLINE TO SEE IF THAT  
17 HAPPENS. AND THEN, I THINK THE LAST QUESTIONS ARE REALLY ON  
18 THE TRANSIT FRONT WITH REGARDS TO THE FISCAL CLIFF. WE WILL BE  
19 UPDATING OUR TRANSPORTATION AND ALL OF OUR REVENUE FORECAST AS  
20 PART OF THIS PLAN CYCLE. BOTH OF THESE EFFORTS ARE LONGER TERM  
21 PLANNING EFFORTS SO THEY AREN'T NECESSARILY ABOUT NEXT YEAR OR  
22 THE YEAR AFTER BUT THEY SET THE STAGE FOR THE LONGER RANGE  
23 VISION FOR TRANSIT, APT GRITTING THE NEAR-TERM FISCAL IMPACTS.  
24 AND RAND E YOUR COMMENT ABOUT THE SPOKES AND THE HUBS IS WELL  
25 TAKE 18 WE'RE TRYING TO BE COGNIZANT THAT THIS WORK IS NOT





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 JUST ABOUT LIFTING UP REGIONAL SERVICES AT THE EXPENSE OF KEY  
2 LOCAL SERVICE THAT EXIST TODAY WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE  
3 INVESTING IN BOTH, THE REGIONAL ASSISTANCE, AS WELL AS  
4 REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT SERVICES. THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTIONS.  
5 I APPRECIATE IT.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO DO ANOTHER ASK.  
8 DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE QUESTIONS ON THIS? SINCE WE HAVE NO  
9 PUBLIC COMMENT, DAVE, I WILL REMIND YOU THAT IN 2017, MY  
10 CONCERN WAS, AS WE WERE LOOKING AT, I BELIEVE IT WAS HEADWAYS,  
11 AND THAT WAS MY CONCERN WITH SPOKES, ALSO, WAS THAT WE  
12 SACRIFICED FOR THE SAKE OF WHAT LOOKS GOOD ON PAPER, THE -- WE  
13 SACRIFICED ROUTES THAT WEREN'T VERY PRODUCTIVE. WE'LL JUST  
14 CALL THEM THAT. AND THAT WAS OUR SHIFT WORKER, WORKING AT  
15 MALLS AND THINGS LIKE THAT, WHERE IT WAS, LIKE, WELL, THEY  
16 ADOPT NEED -- THEY WENT TO WORK, AND THEY CAN LEAVE. IS THEY  
17 ONLY NEED 30 MINUTE HEADWAYS, AND IT MADE A HUGE IMPACT I'M  
18 REALLY AWARE WE DID THAT LAST TIME AND I LOOK FORD A TIME  
19 WHERE WE DON'T HAVE TO REMIND PEOPLE ABOUT THE DISABILITY  
20 COMMUNITY THAT IT'S NOT A CORE CONSIDERATION, BUT IT IS THE UP  
21 FRONT, IF WE START THERE, THEN WE'RE -- WE KNOW WE'RE GOOD.  
22 SO, AND THAT'S NOT TRYING TO DIMINISH ANYTHING THAT ANYBODY  
23 HAS SAID OR DONE. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE WORK. SO, THANK YOU  
24 VERY MUCH. AND I SEE NO MORE HANDS RAISED. SO WE WILL MOVE ON  
25 TO THE NEXT ITEM. WHICH IS ITEM NUMBER ATTORNEY-CLIENT





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 PRIVILEGE, MTC'S PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN UPDATE APPROACH.

2 LESLIE?

3

4 **LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON COUNCIL MEMBERS. I AM  
5 HERE TO PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF STAFF UPDATING MTC PUBLIC  
6 PARTICIPATION PLAN AND GET YOUR INPUT ON THE PLANS AND GUIDING  
7 PRINCIPLES AND OUR ENGAGEMENT STRATEGY. PULL THE PRESENTATION,  
8 PLEASE. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO MY FIRST SLIDE HERE HAS A  
9 LITTLE BIT OF BACKGROUND ON THE FEDERAL REGULATION AND LAWS  
10 RELATED TO THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN. IN SUMMARY, PER  
11 FEDERAL REGULATIONS, MTC IS REQUIRED TO DEVELOP A PLAN FOR  
12 ENGAGING THE PUBLIC AND OUR PARTNERS ON THE REGIONAL  
13 TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND THE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT  
14 PROGRAM. AND THEN, ALSO, FOR STATE LAW, WE ARE REQUIRED TO  
15 DEVELOP A PUBLIC PARTICIPATING PLAN THAT IS SPECIFIC TO THE  
16 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND THE SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES  
17 STRATEGY OR RTPSES. THE RTPSES IS OUR REGION'S LONG RANGE PLAN  
18 THAT DAVE JUST PRESENTED ON, ALSO KNOWN AS PLANNED BAY AREA  
19 2050. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS A SUMMARY OF WHAT'S  
20 CURRENTLY IN OUR PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN. MTC'S CURRENT  
21 PLAN, WHICH WAS APPROVED IN 2018, GIVES AN OVERVIEW OF HOW  
22 RESIDENTS AND OUR PARTNERS CAN PARTICIPATE IN THE KEY  
23 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING POLICY AND INVESTMENT DECISIONS OF THE  
24 COMMISSION. THE PLAN DETAILS THE PROCESS FOR UPDATING PLANNED  
25 BAY AREA AND THE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM. IT LISTS





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 AND DESCRIBES THE METHODS STAFF USES TO ENGAGE THE PUBLIC,  
2 CONTINUOUSLY, AND IT DESCRIBES THE ROLE OF OUR ADVISORY  
3 COMMITTEES, LIKE THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, IN THE UPDATE  
4 PROCESS. THE PLAN, ALSO DESCRIBES HOW WE ENGAGE WITH THE  
5 REGION'S TRIBAL GOVERNMENTS, AS WELL AS THE PROCESS FOR  
6 EVALUATING AND UPDATING THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN. AND  
7 LASTLY, ARE THE PLAN INCLUDES WHAT IS COMMONLY KNOWN AS  
8 APPENDIX A. THIS IS THE SEPARATE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN FOR  
9 UPDATING PLANNED BAY AREA AS REQUIRED BY STATE LAW. NEXT  
10 SLIDE. A COUPLE OF KEY COMPONENTS DRIVE OUR ENGAGEMENT  
11 ACTIVITIES AND THESE ARE THE PLANS, GUIDING PRINCIPLES AND THE  
12 ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES. AS MENTIONED EARLIER I'M HERE TODAY TO  
13 GET YOUR FEEDBACK ON THESE SPECIFICALLY. SO, THIS SLIDE HAS  
14 THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES. THESE HAVEN'T BEEN UPDATED IN QUITE  
15 SOMETIME. SO THIS CURRENT UPDATE IS A GOOD OPPORTUNITY TO  
16 REFRESH THESE PRINCIPLES AND STRATEGIES TO REFLECT THEIR  
17 REALITIES OF THE NEW NORMAL, AS WELL AS TO CAPTURE MTC'S  
18 COMMITMENT TO EQUITY, AS ADOPTED VIA OUR EQUITY PLATFORM.  
19 STARTING WITH THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES, THESE INCLUDE THE  
20 RECOGNITION THAT ENGAGEMENT SAY DYNAMIC ACTIVITY. ONE SIZE  
21 DOES NOT FIT ALL. IT REQUIRES RELATIONSHIPS BUILDING. IT IS  
22 CHALLENGING, BUT IT IS POSSIBLE, WHEN WE MAKE IT RELEVANT,  
23 WHEN WE REMOVE BARRIERS AND WHEN WE COMMUNICATE CLEARLY. LAST,  
24 OUR GUIDING PRINCIPLES ALSO INCLUDE AN ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE  
25 PRINCIPLE THAT WAS ADOPTED BY THE COMMISSION IN 2006 WHICH





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 RECOGNIZES THAT AN OPEN AND TRANSPARENT PUBLIC PARTICIPATION  
2 PROCESS EMPOWERS LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES AND COMMUNITIES OF  
3 COLOR TO PARTICIPATE IN THE DECISION MAKING THAT AFFECTS THEM.  
4 MOVING ON TO OUR FIVE ENGAGEMENT PRINCIPLES THESE ARE THE ONES  
5 THAT DRIVE OUR ENGAGEMENT WORK AND THEY'RE SUMMARIZED ON THIS  
6 SLIDE. AS YOU CAN SEE, EARLY ENGAGEMENT IS BEST. ACCESS TO  
7 ALL, RESPONSE TO COMMENTS, INFORMING COMMISSIONERS AND THE  
8 PUBLIC IN AREAS OF AGREEMENT AND DISAGREEMENT, AND NOTIFYING  
9 THE PUBLIC OF PROPOSED OR FINAL ACTIONS TO DRIVE HOW WE  
10 CONDUCT OUR ENGAGEMENT. THE FULL DESCRIPTION OF THESE FIVE  
11 ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES CAN BE FOUND IN THE CURRENTLY PUBLIC  
12 PARTICIPATING PLAN WHICH IS LINKED IN YOUR SUMMARY SHEET. NEXT  
13 SLIDE. SHIFTING GEARS FOR THE PROPOSED APPROACH. STAFF PLANS  
14 TO EXPAND THE SCOPE OF OUR PUBLIC PARTICIPATING PLAN TO  
15 PROVIDE THE PUBLIC AND PARTNERS WITH INFORMATION ON HOW THEY  
16 CAN GET INVOLVED IN OTHER AGENCY PROJECTS AND ACTIVITIES IN  
17 ADDITION TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA AND THE TIP. AND THESE  
18 ACTIVITIES, THESE OTHER ACTIVITIES THAT HAVE OPPORTUNITIES FOR  
19 INPUT AND ENGAGEMENT. ADDITIONALLY, STAFF IS GOING TO WORK TO  
20 INCORPORATE MTC'S EQUITY PLATFORM INTO THE PUBLIC  
21 PARTICIPATION PLAN. AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, THE PUBLIC  
22 PARTICIPATION PLAN WAS ADOPTED IN 2018 AND WE INTRODUCED OUR  
23 EQUITY PLATFORM IN 2019. ALSO, WE PLAN TO REFRESH THE GUIDING  
24 PRINCIPLES, OF THE ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES, AND WE WILL BE  
25 INCORPORATING ANY NEW BEST PRACTICES FOR ENGAGEMENT METHODS.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 NEXT SLIDE. THE UPDATE OF THE PLAN WILL HAPPEN OVER FIVE  
2 PHASES. STAFF HAS ALREADY BEGUN CONDUCTING RESEARCH TO INFORM  
3 THE PLAN UPDATE. WE ARE CURRENTLY CONDUCTING AN ONLINE SURVEY  
4 THAT ACTUALLY DO LAUNCHED TODAY. AND THIS ASKED PUBLIC HOW  
5 THEY WOULD LIKE TO RECEIVE INFORMATION AND PROVIDE INPUT. WE  
6 WILL BE CONDUCTING INTERVIEWS WITH OUR STAFF, AS WELL AS  
7 PARTNER AGENCY STAFF TO IDENTIFY CURRENT BEST PRACTICES, AND  
8 WE WOULD ALSO LIKE TO INTERVIEW INTERESTED MEMBERS OF THIS  
9 COUNCIL TO HELP INFORM THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE DRAFT PUBLIC  
10 PARTICIPATION PLAN. THE DEVELOPMENT PHASE WILL HAPPEN THIS  
11 WINTER WITH STAFF DEVELOPING THE DRAFT PLAN FOR A POTENTIAL  
12 RELEASE DATE IN LATE JANUARY. THE DRAFT PUBLIC PARTICIPATING  
13 PLAN RELEASE WILL KICKOFF THE ENGAGEMENT PHASE, WHICH WILL  
14 INCLUDE VARIOUS ENGAGEMENT METHODS TO SOLICIT INPUT FROM THE  
15 PUBLIC AND OUR PARTNERS ON THE DRAFT PLAN. AFTER CLOSE OF  
16 COMMENTS IN MID-MARCH, THE REVISION PHASE WILL BEGIN WITH  
17 STAFF REVIEWING AND ANALYZING PUBLIC INPUT AND INCORPORATING  
18 FEEDBACK INTO A REVISED DRAFT AND THEN THE REVISED PUBLIC  
19 PARTICIPATION PLAN IS SLATED TO BE RELEASED AT THE MAY  
20 PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING WHICH THEN STARTS THE ADOPTION  
21 PHASE AND STAFF WILL RECOMMEND ADOPTION OF THE PUBLIC  
22 PARTICIPATION PLAN AT THE MAY COMMISSION MEETING. NEXT SLIDE.  
23 UPDATE TIMELINE. STAFF WILL BE PRODUCING ON THE DRAFT PUBLIC  
24 PARTICIPATING PLAN OVER EARLY WINTER WITH POTENTIAL DRAFT PLAN  
25 RELEASE DATE IN LATE JANUARY AS I MENTION THE. DRAFT PLAN WILL





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THEN BE RELEASED FOR A 45-DAY COMMENT PERIOD. THE COMMENT  
2 PERIOD WILL CLOSE IN MID-MARCH AND STAFF WILL THEN INCORPORATE  
3 PUBLIC FEEDBACK AND RELEASE OUR REVISED DRAFT PLAN IN EARLY  
4 MAY WITH ADOPTION OF PLANS SLATED FOR THE MAY COMMISSION  
5 MEETING. NEXT SLIDE. IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS, STAFF IS  
6 CONTINUING THE RESEARCH PHASE NOW. WE WOULD LOVE YOUR INPUT ON  
7 THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES AND ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES. AND WE WOULD  
8 LOVE TO MEET WITH YOU. THOSE WHO ARE INTERESTED IN SMALL GROUP  
9 INTERVIEWS OVER THE NEXT FEW WEEKS. AND NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.  
10 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION. AND I'M HAPPY TO  
11 TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DO FOLKS WANT TO ASK  
14 QUESTIONS? PLEASE RAISE YOUR HANDS. IF YOU ARE AN ATTENDEE,  
15 YOU CAN RAISE YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE, DEPENDING ON WHAT  
16 IMPLEMENT YOU'RE USING. LESLIE, I HAVE A QUESTION THAT'S MORE  
17 ABOUT THE BACK END OF THINGS. BECAUSE I WOULD LOVE TO PUT  
18 PEOPLE ON THE LIST THAT YOU GUYS UTILIZE, BUT I WAS TOLD THAT  
19 IT'S A LITTLE COMPLICATED. AND HERE IS WHAT MADE ME ASK THE  
20 QUESTION IS, WHEN I WAS ASKED IF I HAD CONTACTS FOR STUDENTS  
21 WITH DISABILITIES, I THOUGHT, WOW, YOU GUYS, ARE YOU NOT  
22 BREAKING IT UP? OR ARE YOU NOT COORDINATING YOUR LIST IN A  
23 MANNER THAT ALLOWS YOU TO LOOK FOR MORE SPECIFIC OUTREACH  
24 TARGETS? AND IN MY BE CASE, I COULD HAVE SAID, YEAH, I HAVE  
25 VPS OF STUDENT SERVICES AT BOTH OF MY CAMPUSES. I HAVE PUBLIC





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 INFORMATION OFFICERS THAT YOU COULD REACH OUT TO, BUT I JUST  
2 WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU HAVE THE CAPACITY TO TAKE --  
3 BECAUSE I MEAN, WE COULD ALL GIVE YOU OUR SENIOR COMMISSIONS,  
4 OUR YOUTH COMMISSIONS. OUR PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY  
5 COMMISSIONS, ALL OF THOSE CONTACTS, BUT I JUST WANTED TO MAKE  
6 SURE THAT YOU COULD HANDLE THAT INFORMATION IN A WAY, LIKE AS  
7 IF YOU HAD A SPREADSHEET OR SOMETHING. DOES THAT MAKE -- KIND  
8 OF MAKE SENSE?

9

10 **LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ:** YES THAT TOTALLY MAKES SENSE RANDI AND  
11 THAT'S THE PURPOSE OF THE INTERVIEWS WE WOULD LIKE TO CONDUCT  
12 WITH YOU ALL IS TO HEAR THAT INFORMATION THAT YOU CAN SHARE  
13 WITH US THAT CAN HELP BUILD OUR CONTEXT. AND OVER THE NEXT FEW  
14 MONTHS IT WILL BE A HEAVY LIFT BUT THAT IS ONE OF THE PROJECTS  
15 THAT WE WANT IS TO UPDATE AND OUR PLANNED BAY AREA LIST IN OUR  
16 CONTACTS DATABASE IS TOTALLY OUTDATED. SO WE'RE HOPING TO WORK  
17 WITH YOU OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS TO UPDATE THAT LIST AND KICK  
18 OFFER THE CONVERSATION AT THESE INTRODUCE.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE  
21 QUESTIONS FOR LESLIE? I SENSE THAT WE HAVE BEEN IN THE MEETING  
22 FOR TWO HOURS GOING ON HERE. ADINA?

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. SO, HAPPY TO BE PART OF PROVIDING FEEDBACK  
25 AND I THINK THAT THERE ARE PROBABLY SOME CREATIVE WAYS OF





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 PRESENTING INFORMATION, GETTING FEEDBACK THAT IS, LIKE, MTC,  
2 AS A LONG RANK REGIONAL PLANNER OFTEN PRESENTS THINGS IN A WAY  
3 THAT IS, YOU KNOW, VERY HIGH-LEVEL AND ABSTRACT, AND REALLY  
4 PRETTY OPAQUE TO PEOPLE. AND, SO, AND THERE ARE TOOLS RANGING  
5 FROM, YOU KNOW, LIKE, JOURNEY MAPPING THAT COME FROM THE USER  
6 EXPERIENCE WORLD, TO, YOU KNOW, MORE CONCRETE WAYS OF  
7 EXPLAINING WHAT'S BEING DISCUSSED. SO, I WILL BE HAPPY TO  
8 PARTICIPATE IN DISCUSSING AND GIVING FEEDBACK.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES?

11

12 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I WOULD INCLUDE MYSELF. LESLIE, I WOULD BE  
13 HAPPY TO. THE LAST PUBLIC OUTREACH WE DID, I WAS ABLE TO USE  
14 THE LOCAL UNIONS TO GET E-MAILS OUT TO THE VARIOUS MEMBERS,  
15 PROBABLY SOMEWHERE IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD OF 250,000, AS WELL AS  
16 NEWSPAPER ARTICLES, AND THESE ARE GENERALLY PEOPLE THAT WOULD  
17 QUALIFY UNDER SOME OF OUR LOW-INCOME STANDARDS. EVEN THOUGH  
18 THEY MAKE A GOOD WAGE FOR ANYWHERE ELSE IN THE COUNTRY, BUT  
19 IT'S NOT QUITE ENOUGH HERE.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LESLIE, ARE THERE GAPS THAT  
22 YOU KNOW YOU HAVE?

23

24 **LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ:** WE HAVE GAPS IN OUR INFORMATION FOR  
25 COMMUNITY BASE ORGANIZATIONS IN THE NORTH BAY ESPECIALLY, AND





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 WE HAVE PROGRAMS THAT TARGET K TO 12 STUDENTS AND THEN YOUNGER  
2 ADULTS BUT THAT COLLEGE AGENCY DEMOGRAPHIC WE NEED TO DO SOME  
3 RELATIONSHIP BUILDING, 18 TO 25 YEAR-OLDS, JR. COLLEGES, ET  
4 CETERA.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M PRETTY SURE MICHAEL BALDINI WILL HELP  
7 YOU WITH THAT. CHRISTINE FITZGERALD?

8

9 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YEAH. SO, I WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN  
10 ASSISTING. YOU MENTIONED YOU DON'T HAVE A LOT IN THE NORTH BAY  
11 BUT WHAT ABOUT SOUTH BAY?

12

13 **LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ:** THE COUNTIES IN THE SOUTH BAY AREA, SO  
14 FROM SAN FRANCISCO, DOWN TO SANTA CLARA, AND UP TO CONTRA  
15 COSTA WERE PRETTY GOOD. BUT ANY ADDITIONAL SUGGESTIONS ARE, OF  
16 COURSE, WELCOME.

17

18 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND JUST BECAUSE SHE HAS A GOOD LIST,  
21 DOESN'T MEAN SHE HAS THE PEOPLE YOU'RE THINKING OF. WENDI?

22

23 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. I CAN PROBABLY HELP YOU OUT IN THE NORTH  
24 BAY IN MARIN COUNTY. SO GET IN TOUCH WITH ME. LET ME KNOW WHAT  
25 YOU NEED.





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYBODY ELSE? I THINK, LES --  
3 LESLIE JUST SHOOT EVERYBODY AN E-MAIL, GIVE PEOPLE A FEW  
4 MINUTES TO THINK ABOUT THEIR DAY-TO-DAY LIFE IS THEY'LL COME  
5 UP WITH EVEN MORE. GABRIELA?

6

7 **GABRIELLE ORANTES:** I'M ON TWO DEVICES JUST ONE SECOND. MY  
8 QUESTION IS, YOU CAN REPEAT OR CLARIFY IF THE LIST THAT YOU  
9 ARE GOING TO BE UPDATING AND DEVELOPING, WILL THOSE BE SHARED  
10 OUT? AND WILL THOSE BE PUBLIC? AND WITHIN -- OR AT LEAST  
11 WITHIN OUR COUNCIL? IN CASE -- I DO WORK ACROSS THE BAY, AND,  
12 SO, I WOULD WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT I COULD -- OH O YOU HAVE  
13 THESE FOLKS WHO I KNOW ENGAGE WITH THIS COMMUNITY, IN OAKLAND,  
14 LET'S SAY, OR IN SAN FRANCISCO, BUT I DON'T LIVE IN EITHER OF  
15 THOSE PLACES, BUT THE WORK I DO INTERSECTS WITH DIFFERENT  
16 COMMUNITIES AROUND TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING.

17

18 **LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ:** SO ONCE THE INFORMATION GETS TO US, MTC  
19 IS GOVERNED BY SOME PRETTY STRICT PUBLIC PII, I CAN'T REMEMBER  
20 WHAT THAT STAND FOR.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** PERSONALLY IDENTIFIABLE. UEZ AL EA HE UP E HAIR : N U  
23 PPU ! TION ? SEEING NOE RT T UU T OR VU ° XU ITH ' LIKE  
24 GEORGIA IS UP. HI. GOOD

25





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GOOD AFTERNOON POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
2 MEMBERS, AND CHAIR KINMAN. IF YOU WANT TO GIVE ME A RANGE OF  
3 TIME YOU WOULD LIKE ME TO --

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE'RE RUNNING 30 MINUTES LATE. SO, IF YOU  
6 WANT TO CONDENSE TO 5 TO 10 MINUTES AND WE'LL COUNT ON  
7 QUESTIONS AFTER THAT.

8

9 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, MTC STAFF. TODAY  
10 WE'RE SEEKING YOUR FEEDBACK ON MTC AND THE ASSOCIATION OF BAY  
11 AREA GOVERNMENTS DRAFT 2023 STATE AND FEDERAL ADVOCACY  
12 PROGRAM. IT IS INCLUDED AS ATTACHMENT A IN YOUR PACKET, AND  
13 JUST A LITTLE BIT ON THE PROCESS FIRST. SO, WE ARE SEEKING  
14 FEEDBACK, AGAIN, ON A DRAFT PROGRAM. WE'RE TALKING TO YOU,  
15 SEEKING FEEDBACK FROM YOU, FROM A NUMBER OF STAKEHOLDERS AND  
16 OTHER PARTNERS IN THE REGION. WE WILL INTEGRATE THAT FEEDBACK  
17 INTO A PROPOSED FINAL DRAFT OR FINAL ADVOCACY PROGRAM WE'LL  
18 BRING TO THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE IN DECEMBER AND HOPEFULLY  
19 FOR A COMMISSION AND ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD ADOPTION IN DECEMBER  
20 SO WE CAN START FRESH WITH AN ADVOCACY PROGRAM. A REMINDER  
21 THIS IS A HIGH-LEVEL DOCUMENT THAT'S SUPPOSED TO GUIDE STAFF'S  
22 PRIORITIZATION AS WE REVIEW THE HUNDREDS OF BILLS THAT COME  
23 THROUGH SACRAMENTO SO THIS IS REALLY OUR NORTH STAR. AND WE  
24 DON'T NECESSARILY EXPECT THAT THERE WILL BE LEGISLATION ON  
25 EVERY SINGLE ITEM IN THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM BUT WE WANT THE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 MARKER THERE THAT WE CAN ENGAGE AND GET DIRECTION ON HOW TO  
2 ENGAGE, AGAIN, ON VARIOUS TOPICS OF INTEREST TO MTC. SO, FOR  
3 THE SAKE OF TIME, I'M NOT GOING TO WALK THROUGH THE ENTIRE 12-  
4 PAGE ATTACHMENT. BUT I DO WANT TO CALL OUT THAT, FIRST, EVERY  
5 ADVOCACY PROGRAM BUILDS ON PREVIOUS YEARS SO A LOT OF THE  
6 CONTENT IN THE POLICY IN THERE SHOULD BE VERY FAMILIAR. THE  
7 COUPLE OF THINGS THAT SEEMS THAT ARE DRIVING THROUGH THE  
8 ADVOCACY PROGRAM THAT WILL MAKE IT A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT THAN  
9 PREVIOUS YEARS, ARE THE THREE BIG THEMES. AND THE FIRST ONE IS  
10 THAT, IN THE PAST COUPLE OF YEARS, THERE WAS ALMOST A JAW  
11 DROPPING WAVE OF ABUNDANCE IN THE MONEY WORLD, COMING FROM THE  
12 STATE AND THE FEDS TO COME INTO TRANSPORTATION. ALL SIGNS ARE  
13 POINTING TO A MUCH STARKER FISCAL PICTURE THIS COMING YEAR. SO  
14 WE EXPECT THE TIED ARE GOING OUT AND THE STATE AND FEDERAL  
15 GOVERNMENT ARE REALLY GOING TO BE TIGHTENING THEIR BELTS  
16 THAT'S ONE THING THAT YOU WILL SEE, SORT OF, RUNNING THROUGH  
17 THIS. THAT MEANS WE'RE GOING TO BE FOCUSING ON PRIORITIZATION,  
18 PRIORITIZATION, PRIORITIZATION. THE OTHER PIECE IS THAT THIS,  
19 SORT OF, TIGHTENING OF BELTS IS HAPPENING IN THE CONTEXT OF A  
20 REALLY GROWING NEED FOR RESOURCES, IN PARTICULAR, YOU KNOW,  
21 TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE REALLY FACING A HUGE NEED FOR NEAR-TERM  
22 RESOURCES TO PUSH OFF THIS FISCAL CLIFF TO MAKE SURE THEY CAN  
23 KEEP TRANSFERRING CUTS TO SCHOOL, AND THE HOUSING SIDES, WE'RE  
24 IN AN ONGOING HOUSING CRISIS SO THE NEED IS GROWING AND THE  
25 MONEY IS LESS. THE THIRD BIGGEST PIECE IS WHAT DOES THIS MEAN





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 IN OUR ADVOCACY PROGRAM IS THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE SEEKING  
2 RESOURCES TO KEEP THE LIGHTS ON IN THE TRANSPORTATION AND  
3 HOUSING WORLD. WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT POLICIES AND  
4 FUNDING MECHANISMS THAT CAN LAY THE FOUNDATION FOR SUSTAINABLE  
5 SELF-HELP TRANSPORTATION FOR THE FUTURE AND WE'RE ALSO KEEPING  
6 THAT VISIONARY LOOKING OUT TO THE NEXT GENERATION VISION THAT  
7 DAVE AND THE PLANNING TEAM IS, SORT OF, LOOKING AT WITH ALL OF  
8 THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WORK TO GET US TO CONNECTED CLEAN  
9 AND RESILIENT COMMUNITIES. SO, THE BIGGEST FOCUS AREAS, I  
10 THINK WE WANT TO REALLY GET YOUR FEEDBACK ON HERE, THE  
11 DIRECTION WE'RE THINKING IS THAT IF YOU CAN LOOK AT PAGE ONE  
12 OF YOUR ATTACHMENT, WHICH IS TRANSPORTATION FUNDING, WHAT  
13 WE'RE LOOKING AT IS THIS IDEA OF, SORT OF, TOP PRIORITY, IS  
14 THROWING TRANSIT A LIFE BOAT. SO THIS IS RELATED TO THE DUAL  
15 NEAR-TERM CHALLENGES THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS THINK WE ALL WELL  
16 KNOW WE'RE FACING, FACING FISCAL CLIFFS THAT THREATEN TRANSIT  
17 AS WE KNOW IT IN THE BAY AREA, AND THERE ARE ALSO REAL  
18 BARRIERS TO BRINGING RIDERS BACK TO TRANSIT. SO THE TOP  
19 PRIORITY WE'RE PUTTING ON -- ON OUR PROGRAM THIS YEAR IS THAT  
20 MTC HELPED LEAD A STATEWIDE BUDGET STRATEGY TO SECURE ON-NEW  
21 ONGOING RESOURCES TO ADDRESS THIS IMPENDING FISCAL CLIFF AS  
22 TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE FACING AS WELL AS TO INVEST IN  
23 IMPROVEMENTS THAT WILL ATTRACT RIDERS BACK TO TRANSIT. I THINK  
24 THIS IS, YOU KNOW, INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. BUT IT'S ALSO  
25 IMPORTANT FOR US TO BE REALISTIC THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 LOOKING AT A LESS THAN ROSY BUDGET ENVIRONMENT. SO IT'S GOING  
2 TO BE REALLY CHALLENGING TO GET THIS NEW INVESTMENT AND WHAT  
3 THAT MEANS IS THAT WE'RE INVESTING AND BUILDING A ROCK SOLID  
4 COALITION WITH PARTNERS AROUND THE STATE AND EXPLORING A RANGE  
5 OF CREATIVE REVENUE SOURCES TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS COMES TO  
6 FRUITION. THE SECOND PIECE, BUCKET, I WANT TO CALL OUT TO YOU  
7 IS THAT IDEA OF TARGETING RESOURCES THAT CAN BRING US TO A  
8 TRANSIT TRANSPORTATION NETWORK OF THE FUTURE. SO THAT'S REALLY  
9 THE REST OF PAGE ONE AND ON TO PAGE TWO ON THE TRANSPORTATION  
10 FUNDING SIDE. AND WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT IS TARGETING  
11 ADDITIONAL STATE RESOURCES FOR SOME OF THOSE LONGER, SORT OF,  
12 OUTWARD INVESTMENTS THAT WE NEED TO START PUTTING THE BUILDING  
13 BLOCKS IN PLACE NOW FOR A ZERO EMISSION TRANSITION, FOR  
14 IMPROVING TRANSIT CAPITAL, A COUPLE OF THINGS ON THAT SPACE.  
15 SO WE'RE LOOKING TO THE STATE RESOURCES FOR THAT, AS WELL. AND  
16 THAT MEANS WE'RE REALLY GOING TO HAVE TO WALK AND CHU  
17 GENTLEMEN AT THE SAME TIME, AND PRETTY CONFIDENT THAT WE CAN  
18 DO THAT. AND THE OTHER PIECE THAT'S OF INTEREST THAT WILL BE  
19 COMING TO YOU A NUMBER OF TIMES AROUND IS THIS REGIONAL  
20 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE, AND THAT ON THE ADVOCACY  
21 PROGRAM WE'RE HOPING TO SPEND NEXT YEAR 2023 DOING ROBUST  
22 STAKEHOLDER IS PUBLIC OUTREACH TO HEAR FROM PARTNERS ON THE  
23 GROUND TO UNDERSTAND WHAT SHOULD BE GOING INTO A, BRINGING  
24 MORE TRANSPORTATION RESOURCES TO THE TABLE AND ANSWER BASIC  
25 QUESTIONS, LIKE, WHAT DO WE WANT THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IN





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 THE BAY AREA TO LOOK LIKE. WHAT SHOULD BE PRIORITIES FOR A  
2 REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE ET CETERA, AND GOING IN 2024 TO THE  
3 LEGISLATURE TO SEEK AUTHORIZATION TO PUT A REGION FALL  
4 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE ON A FUTURE BALLOT. SO, THOSE,  
5 AGAIN, ARE THE MOST HOT TOPIC IDEAS ON THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM  
6 THAT I WOULD LIKE TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK ON, AND THE OTHER ITEMS  
7 ARE REALLY RELATED TO PUTTING POLICIES IN PLACE THAT, AGAIN,  
8 HELP US MEET THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, REALLY, RANGE OF GOALS  
9 ACROSS SUSTAINABILITY, EQUITY, MODE SHIFT, ET CETERA. SO, WITH  
10 THAT, I WILL TURN IT BACK OVER TO THE CHAIR AND HAPPY TO  
11 ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WHO HAS QUESTIONS FOR GEORGIA?  
14 I SEE ADINA AND THEN CHRISTINE FITZGERALD.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** COMMENT TO MTC FOR TAKING THE NEED TO BUILD  
17 SUPPORT BASE TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF. TWO QUESTIONS. ONE  
18 ABOUT THE RELATIONSHIP OF WORK ON THE REGIONAL MEASURE AS IT  
19 RELATES TO THE PREVIOUS ITEM WE HAD ON THE CONNECT NETWORK  
20 PLAN WITH THE SERVICE PLAN BECAUSE THOSE THINGS WERE ALMOST  
21 100% DOVETAILED, BECAUSE OF THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN IN ITS  
22 FINAL PLAN FOR FALL. AND THAT EXPENDITURE PLAN, AND BALLOT  
23 WOULD NEED TO BE OFF JUST A LITTLE BIT SO POTENTIALLY WORK ON  
24 REFINING THOSE TIMELINES AND DOVETAILING AS COMPLETELY AS  
25 POSSIBLE IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO HAVE A PLAN THAT'S REALLY





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 COMPELLING TO THE VOTERS. THE OTHER QUESTION I HAD WAS ON 2C  
2 USING THE PARKING CASH-OUT POLICY. AND THE QUESTION IS, DOES  
3 THAT NEED ADDITIONAL ACTION AT THE STATE LEGISLATION? OR IS  
4 THAT MORE REGIONAL ACTION AT BODIES LIKE BAAQMD? AND THEN THE  
5 LAST QUESTION IS FROM THE LENGTHY CONVERSATION AT THE TOP OF  
6 THIS CONVERSATION, WITH PEOPLE BEING -- TRYING TO FIGURE OUT  
7 HOW THE NEW WORLD WORKS WITH THE BOUND ACT AND ZOOM MEETINGS  
8 AND STILL NEEDING TO BE IN A ROOM THAT'S PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE.  
9 IS THERE ANY SUPPORT FOR PURSUING FURTHER LEGISLATION TO  
10 ADDRESS THAT ISSUE? AND THOSE ARE MY QUESTIONS.

11  
12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** DO YOU WANT TO TRY TAKING THOSE?

13  
14 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** SURE. THANK YOU. THANKS ADINA. AS  
15 ALWAYS REALLY GREAT FEEDBACK. I APPRECIATE THAT, IT'S REALLY  
16 GREAT FOOD FOR THOUGHT. I'M GOING TO START FIRST WITH THE  
17 BROWN ACT QUESTION. YES. WE ARE VERY MUCH HOPING TO ENGAGE ON  
18 THAT THIS YEAR. NOT HOPING TO, PROPOSING TO ENGAGE ON THIS  
19 YEAR. I'M SCROLLING DOWN TO SHOW SEE WHERE IT SHOWS UP ON OUR  
20 ADVOCACY PROGRAM. PAGE 8 OF 12 ON THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM, ITEM  
21 NUMBER TEN ON THE STATE PROGRAM. AND WHAT WE ARE DOING THIS  
22 YEAR IS WORKING REALLY CLOSELY, ACTUALLY, WITH THE CALIFORNIA  
23 -- SORRY -- WITH CALCOG, THE CALIFORNIA COUNCIL OF  
24 GOVERNMENTS. CALIFORNIA ASSOCIATION OF COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS,  
25 AND OTHER REGIONAL PARTNERS, AND WE THINK ONE, SORT OF, NUT TO





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 CRACK THERE IS WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO MAKE THE CASE THAT FOR  
2 LARGE GEOGRAPHIC REGIONAL BODIES, AND MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL  
3 BODIES, THAT IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO ENSURE THAT TELE, YOU  
4 KNOW, ZOOM, TELECONFERENCE, IS APPROPRIATE AND AVAILABLE, BOTH  
5 FOR, I THINK FOR THE, YOU KNOW, LOCAL ELECTED'S, WE REALLY  
6 WANT TO FOCUS ON ADVISORY BODIES, AS WELL, TO INCLUDE  
7 PARTICIPATION INCREASE PARTICIPATION IN ADVISORY BODIES, AND  
8 THE PUBLIC. AND WE THINK THAT ONE OF THE, SORT OF,  
9 BREAKTHROUGHS ON THAT MIGHT BE ABLE TO BE THE GREENHOUSE GAS  
10 REDUCTION MESSAGE WITH SOME OF THE FOLKS IN THE LEGISLATURE  
11 THAT HAVE BEEN, SORT OF, BALKING AT THE IDEA OF, SORT OF, MORE  
12 PERMANENT BROWN ACT REFORM. SO THAT'S A STRATEGY AND SOMETHING  
13 WE'RE REALLY EXPLORING. LET ME GET TO THE -- SORRY -- I AM  
14 KIND OF SCROLLING UPON NOW. THE OTHER QUESTION WAS RELATED TO  
15 COMMUTER BENEFITS. SO IT'S, FOR EVERYBODY, IT'S ON PAGE 3 OF  
16 12. "OBJECTIVE NUMBER TWO AROUND PUBLIC TRANSIT, B, COMMUTER  
17 BENEFITS." THIS WOULD NEED STATE LEGISLATION. FOR SOMEONE TO  
18 SAY THIS IS AN EXPLORATORY IDEA RIGHT NOW, BUT THE CONCEPT IS  
19 THAT PERHAPS STATE TWEAKS TO THE PARKING CASH OUT PROGRAM,  
20 COULD BE USED TO INCENTIVE USE EMPLOYERS TO PROVIDE TRANSIT  
21 PASSES TO EMPLOYEES AND THE IDEA IS THAT THAT COULD MAYBE  
22 SUPPORT TWO THINGS. ONE, JUST THIS HELP MAKE TRANSIT BREAK UP  
23 MORE ONGOING RESOURCES FOR PEOPLE PURCHASING TRANSIT PASSES  
24 AND TO INCENTIVIZE SHIFT FROM EMPLOYEES TO TAKE TRANSIT. SO  
25 THIS REALLY BUILDS ON THE FACT THAT LAST YEAR, A PRETTY BIG





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 BILL PASSED. A.B. 2206 THAT CLOSED A COMPLIANCE LOOPHOLE IN  
2 THE LONG-STANDING STATE REQUIREMENT THAT LARGE EMPLOYERS OFFER  
3 PARKING CASH OUT THAT WILL MEAN EFFECTIVELY THAT A WHOLE HOTEL  
4 OF EMPLOYERS ARE NOW SUBJECT TO OFFERING CASH IN LIEU OF  
5 PARKING TO THEIR EMPLOYEES. AND THE IDEA IS THAT PERHAPS THESE  
6 EMPLOYERS COULD BE GIVEN THE OPTION. YOU CAN EITHER PROVIDE A  
7 FULL CASH AT THE COST OF A PARKING SPACE, OR YOU COULD PROVIDE  
8 A TRANSIT PASS AS SOMETHING THAT'S A LITTLE BIT LESS THAN THE  
9 COST OF A PARKING SPACE. SO IT'S, SORT OF, A WIN-WIN,  
10 EMPLOYERS SAVE MONEY, AND EMPLOYEES GET A TRANSIT PASS. AND  
11 IT'S ALL GREAT FROM THERE. THIS IS REALLY EXPLORATORY, THOUGH.  
12 SO, IT'S SOMETHING THAT WILL COME BACK IN DECEMBER AND HAVE A  
13 MORE REFINED PROPOSAL.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHRISTINE?

16

17 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU. SO, I AM NOT SURE IF OPPOSING  
18 THIS RIGHT NOW, BUT I THINK IT MAY BE COVERED. BUT I'M  
19 CURIOUS, I KNOW WE'RE TALKING ABOUT DIFFERENT FUNDING STREAMS  
20 OR POTENTIAL FUNDING STREAM FOR FUTURE, WHAT DOES IT MEAN WHAT  
21 WILL BE DONE AS FOR AS AVOIDING THE FISCAL CLIFF -- SAY THAT  
22 THREE TIMES FAST -- FOR FUTURE YEARS, BECAUSE AS WE HAVE SEEN,  
23 LIKE THE PANDEMIC THROUGH EVERYTHING INTO A TIZZY, AND ANY  
24 GOOD OPERATIONS OFFICER OF ANY STRIPE, NON-PROFIT, DO WE HAVE  
25 TO BUILD IN AN X NUMBER OF% OF YOUR BUDGET TO HAVE IN ARREAR





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 IN CASE SOMETHING HAPPENS, AND THAT'S THERE TO FUEL THE  
2 CONTINUATION OF THE ENTITY IN CASE SOMETHING DOES HAPPEN. ^  
3 <COLLOQUY

4

5 >GEORGE SKILES: ^ <COLLOQUY

6

7 >GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:

8

9 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THROUGHOUT CHAIR. SO THE CONCEPT BEHIND  
10 THE PROPOSAL WITH ITEM 1A PAGE ONE AROUND TRANSPORTATION  
11 FUNDING SO THE IDEA IS TO ASK FOR A TWO-PRONGED BUDGET  
12 STRATEGY, WHICH IS SEEKING IS RESOURCES FOR MULTI-YEAR  
13 RESOURCES FOR TRANSIT OPERATING TO ADDRESS THIS YEAR TERM,  
14 SORT OF, FISCAL CLIFF THAT'S, LIKE, FIRE DRILL THAT WE'RE ALL  
15 FACING. AS WELL AS RESOURCES TO BRING BACK RIDERS, AND, AGAIN,  
16 THE IDEA THERE IS THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE A FLEXIBLE POT OF  
17 RESOURCES THAT WILL BE ABLE TO -- THE TRANSIT OPERATORS WILL  
18 BE ABLE TO USE TO PUT THEMSELVES ON A MORE SUSTAINABLE PATH,  
19 RIGHT, TO ADJUST TO THE NEW NORMAL. AND THEN THE REASON WHY,  
20 AND THANK YOU AGAIN FOR THIS QUESTION, IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT  
21 TO UNDERSCORE THE PROPOSALS FOR MULTI-YEAR STATE FUNDING. SO  
22 WE'RE LOOKING AT MAYBE A FIVE YEAR, SORT OF, AMOUNT, RESOURCES  
23 OVER A PERIOD OF ABOUT FIVE YEARS, AND THAT SURELY SHOULD GIVE  
24 THE TIME FOR THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN TO COME INTO PLACE FOR  
25 US TO ALL LOOK AT WHAT IS THE FUTURE OF TRANSIT GOING TO BE,





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 BUYING SOME TIME AGAIN, FUTURE OF OPERATIONS UNTIL THEN, AND  
2 THEN THE REGIONAL MEASURE IS REALLY GOING TO BE AN IMPORTANT  
3 PART OF THE CONVERSATION AFTER THIS FIVE YEARS OF BRIDGE  
4 FUNDING TO LOOK AT WHAT TYPES OF REGIONAL SELF-HELPFUL, LOCAL  
5 SELF-HELP, AND WHAT, SORT OF, ADDITIONAL STATE SUPPORT DO WE  
6 NEED TO KEEP TRANSIT ON THE SUS STAINABLE PATH INTO  
7 PERPETUITY.

8

9 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL  
12 SIGNAL SEEING NONE. MARTHA IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
15 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
16 ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GEORGIA BEFORE YOU LEAVE, I  
19 WANT TO SAY THERE IS GOING TO BE -- I WON'T SAY PUSH BACK --  
20 BUT SKEPTICISM, FROM THE PUBLIC OVER CONTINUING TO FUND -- AND  
21 I GET THE FISCAL CLIFF THING, BUT WHEN TRANSIT OPERATORS WERE  
22 ALREADY SUFFERING PRECOVID, THERE IS GOING NEED TO BE ANOTHER  
23 PRONG IN THAT, AND THAT IS, HOW TO ELIMINATE SOME OF THE  
24 REDUNDANCIES IN WHAT -- IN OUR SERVICE, RIGHT NOW, OR TO FIND  
25 A WAY TO BETTER OPERATE. AND THAT'S WHAT I THINK YOU'RE GOING





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 TO HAVE TO STRESS, THAT THIS ISN'T GOING BACK TO THE OLD  
2 NORMAL, BUT TO ACTUALLY CREATE SOMETHING NEW AND MORE  
3 SUSTAINABLE. BECAUSE WE'RE GOING TO RUN INTO THINGS ALL THE  
4 TIME, AND WE NEED TO HAVE A BETTER HANDLE ON OPERATING MORE  
5 EFFICIENTLY. SO, I LIKE THE -- I LIKE THE PRIORITIES THAT YOU  
6 HAVE SET UP HERE. AND WITH -- AND ESPECIALLY THE BROWN ACT  
7 REFORM. BECAUSE IT IS A -- IT IS A SOCIAL JUSTICE ISSUE FOR  
8 ME. IT MEANS THAT PEOPLE WHO ARE UNABLE TO COMMUTE OR WHO ARE,  
9 YOU KNOW, THEY'RE THAT LAST SPOKE ON A TRANSIT COMMUTE, OR  
10 THERE IS -- YOU KNOW, THERE ARE OTHER REASONS, THEY NEED TO BE  
11 ABLE TO PARTICIPATE IN THE PUBLIC CONVERSATION. AND I JUST  
12 FEEL REALLY STRONGLY ABOUT THAT. BUT, THANK YOU, GEORGIA, FOR  
13 YOUR TIME. AND WE WILL SEE YOU AT THE NEXT ROUND.

14

15 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THANK YOU. AND JUST THROUGHOUT CHAIR,  
16 ONE OTHER -- THIS IS A REALLY MEATY TOPIC, SO, WE CAN JUST  
17 OPEN OURSELVES UP TO MAYBE WRITTEN COMMENTS, OR OTHER FEEDBACK  
18 THAT WE CAN FEED THROUGHOUT APPROPRIATE CHANNELS THAT WOULD BE  
19 GREAT.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** EVERYBODY GET BACK TO GERANYLA WITH YOUR  
22 COMMENTS AFTER YOU GO THROUGHOUT DOCUMENTS SO SHE CAN LOOK AT  
23 THAT OVER THE NEXT FEW DAYS. -- ITEM 12, STAFF LIAISON REPORT.

24





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** NOTHING TO ADD OVER THE REPORT BUT JUST A  
2 REMINDER TO FILL OUT THE SURVEY IN THE LINK I SHARED EARLIER  
3 AND I'LL INCLUDE THE SURVEY AND FOLLOW UP NOTE LATER IN THE  
4 WEEK.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM 13 COUNCIL REPORTS. DID  
7 WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE STAFF LIAISON REPORT?

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
10 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
11 ON THIS ITEM. BUT RICH HEDGES HAS HIS HAND RAISED.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RICH, GO AHEAD.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A COUNCIL REPORT BUT GOT TO LEAVE FOR ANOTHER  
16 MEETING.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** COLONEL REPORTS MEMBERS MAY REPORT ON  
19 LOCALLY RELEVANT ISSUES. RICH? HEDGE I WANT TO LIFT UP SOMEONE  
20 WHO HAS NOW PASSED WHO WAS VERY INSTRUMENTAL IN HELPING  
21 DISABLED IN SAN MATEO COUNTY IT'S IMPORTANT WE KNOW THE NAME  
22 SO THEY'RE NOT FORGOTTEN, COMPLETED HER DEGREE IN PHYSICAL  
23 THERAPY AT UC SAN FRANCISCO EARLY IN LIFE DIRECTOR OF PHYSICAL  
24 THERAPY LATER AND DIRECTOR OF REHABILITATION, AND COUNTY-WIDE  
25 EFFORTS AIMED AT AIDING THOSE WITH DISABILITIES, COUNTY TASK





NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1 FORCE INVESTIGATING NEEDS OF THE DISABLED AND ENCOURAGEMENT  
2 SUPERVISOR COUNTY'S HEAD OF COUNTY COMMISSION DISABILITIES  
3 LATER BECAME HEAD OF THE CENTER FOR DISABILITY OF THE DISABLED  
4 AND CREATED ARTHRITIS REHABILITATION FOUNDATION AND PRIME MOVE  
5 AND FUNDING EFFORTS RESULTING IN THE OPENING OF THE MAQUIS  
6 MICKELSON POOL. DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC REHABILITATION. DIANE  
7 PROCESSER IS GOING TO BE VERY MISSED IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, AND  
8 I READ ONE TIME THAT IF SOMEONE SAYS YOUR NAME, YOU'RE NOT  
9 FORGOTTEN.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY MORE COLONEL  
12 MEMBER REPORTS? THAT CONCLUDES ITEM 13. NUMBER 14 IS NEW  
13 BUSINESS. DOES ANYBODY HAVE NEW BUSINESS TO BRING UP FOR A  
14 FUTURE AGENDA ITEM. I SEE NO HANDS RAISED. WITH THAT, WE GO TO  
15 ADJOURNMENT. AND THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY  
16 COUNCIL WILL BE HELD WEDNESDAY DECEMBER 14TH, 2022. AT 1:30  
17 P.M. ANY CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED TO THE PUBLIC. AND WE ARE  
18 MEETING BY ZOOM. THANK YOU ALL. IT WAS A MEATY MEETING. SO  
19 HOPE YOU ALL GOT THROUGH IT: THANKS AND HAVE A GOOD WEEKEND.  
20 BYE. [ADJOURNED]

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29





*Broadcasting Government*