



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 4, 2022 9:35 AM

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING. IT'S FRIDAY NOVEMBER 4TH AND THIS IS THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE OF METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. I AM THE CHAIR CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, AND THE VICE CHAIR IS DAMON CONNOLLY. I'LL CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER. WILL THE BROADCASTING TEAM PLEASE PLAY OUR MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
2 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
3 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
4 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
5 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR
6 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
7 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
8 PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
9 NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
10 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

11

12 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

15

16 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR CONNOLLY?

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY, VICE CHAIR:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

25



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING? GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING? LICCARDO?
6 ABSENT. SCHAFF?

7

8 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING? I KNOW YOU'RE HERE COMMISSIONER
11 SPERING. THANK YOU. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

12

13 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. JIM WE'LL LET
14 YOU UNMUTE. IF YOU WOULD PLEASE LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE OF
15 ALLEGIANCE?

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MY PLEASURE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I
18 PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
19 AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
20 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

21

22 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, JIM. OKAY. MARTHA MAY
23 WE HAVE OUR COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE?

24



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM
2 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD
3 HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING
4 ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS
5 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR
6 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND NEXT UP
9 IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR CONSISTING OF TWO ITEMS TODAY, 4A AND
10 FOUR B. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. DOES ANYBODY IN THE MEMBERSHIP
11 WISH TO PULL AN ITEM FROM CONSENT? SEEING NO HANDS UP. IS
12 THERE A MOTION AND A SECOND ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SPERING WILL MOVE.

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** SECOND.

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** MOTION MADE BY SPERING, SECOND
19 GOES TO COMMISSIONER CANEPA. ANYTHING ANYBODY WANT TO DISCUSS?
20 SEEING NOTHING. MARTHA IS THERE ANY SUBMITTED COMMENT ON THIS
21 ITEM?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
25 ON THIS ITEM.



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1

2 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THEN LET'S GO AHEAD AND
3 GET THAT ROLL CALL VOTE GOING.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. CHAIR DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

10

11 **DAMON CONNOLLY, VICE CHAIR:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

14

15 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

18

19 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING? LICCARDO? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
22 SCHAFF?

23

24 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** AYE.

25



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
6 PRESENT.

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MARTHA. NOW ON TO
9 AGENDA ITEM FIVE AN INFORMATION ITEM. 5A IS OUR BIKE SHARE
10 UPDATE ON THE BIKESHARE PROGRAM SUPPORTED BY MTC INCLUDING THE
11 BIKESHARE CAPITAL GRANT PROGRAM WITH FOCUS ON BAY WHEELS THE
12 PROGRAM PARTNERSHIP MOTIVATED BY BAY, INC. MOTIVATE AND LYFT
13 WHICH SURRENDER CONTRACT WITH MTC CITIES OF BERKELEY OAKLAND
14 SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN JOSE. AS MENTIONED THIS IS AN
15 INFORMATION ITEM AND OUR PRESENTER WILL BE TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA.

16

17 **TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MAY WE PLEASE
18 PULL UP THE PRESENTATION. I'M TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA, METROPOLITAN
19 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION DIRECTOR OF SHAREABILITY AND ACTIVE
20 TRANSPORTATION. PRESENTATION THE FOCUS ON THE BAY WHEELS
21 SYSTEM BUT THERE ARE SEVERAL BIKESHARE PROGRAMS THAT HAVE BEEN
22 LAUNCHED IN THE LAST FEW YEARS MTC HAS FUNDED THROUGH THE
23 BIKESHARE CAPITAL PROGRAM WHICH I'LL TALK ABOUT LATER AND
24 THERE ARE MANY CITIES THAT HAVE LAUNCHED SCOOTER AND BIKESHARE
25 PROGRAMS ALTHOUGH FOR THE MOST PART MOSTLY SEEN SCOOTERS SHOW



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 UP. AND MOST RECENTLY WE HAVE SEEN JURISDICTIONS PUTTING
2 PUBLIC FUNDING TOWARDS LAUNCHING BIKESHARES, A COUPLE OF SAN
3 MATEO COUNTY LAUNCHING BIKE SHARES LATER THIS FALL. NEXT SLIDE
4 PLEASE. A LONG TEN YEAR HISTORY TO THIS. I WON'T GO THROUGH
5 ALL OF THIS, BUT I'LL CALL OUT KEY HIGHLIGHTS. BIKESHARE WAS
6 AN EFFORT UNDERTAKEN BY THE AIR DISTRICT AND METROPOLITAN
7 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WHERE THERE WAS PUBLIC FUNDING PUT
8 TOWARD A LAUNCH SYSTEM IN 2013. A COUPLE OF YEARS LATER MTC
9 WAS ABLE TO NEGOTIATE AN A NEW EXCLUSIVE AGREEMENT WITH
10 CURRENT OPERATOR MOTIVATE AND THAT SYSTEM LAUNCHED IN 2017
11 WITH GO BIKE AND IN 2019 WITH THE ADVENT OF E-BIKES THE CITIES
12 WERE ABLE TO NEGOTIATE INDIVIDUALLY WITH THE OPERATOR, AND
13 UNFORTUNATELY ONLY TWO OUT OF THE FIVE WERE ABLE TO COME TO
14 TERMS WITH THE LYFT, SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN JOSE ENDED UP
15 DEPLOYING E-BIKES IN 2019. AND FORTUNATELY THAT WAS RIGHT
16 BEFORE COVID HIT AND SINCE THEN WE HAVE SEEN OPERATORS FACE
17 CHALLENGES RELATED TO REDUCED DEMAND, INCREASED OPERATIONAL
18 CHALLENGES, AND SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES. SO, WITH THAT, NEXT
19 SLIDE, PLEASE. HERE IS AN OVERVIEW OF THE BAY WHEELS SYSTEM,
20 AS IT IS TODAY, WITH THE CONTRACT AS I MENTIONED IT'S A TEN
21 YEAR ZERO DOLLAR CONTRACT THAT WE'RE HALFWAY THROUGH WE HAVE
22 ABOUT FIVE YEARS REMAINING ON IT. THE SYSTEM IS FULLY BUILT
23 OUT WITH THE ALONE EXCEPTION BEING SAN FRANCISCO, THERE IS
24 STILL 10% OF STATIONS THAT REMAIN TO BE DEPLOYED, WITH MAJOR
25 DELAYS INCITING THEM. THE CONTRACT INCLUDES CLASSIC PEDAL



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 BIKES, NON-ELECTRIC BIKES, AND ARE ROLE AT MTC IS CONVENING
2 REGULAR MEETINGS WITH THE CITIES AND LYFT, TRACKING THE KPI'S
3 AND MONITORING THE SYSTEM, AND THEN ASSESSING LIQUIDATED
4 DAMAGES. THE MAP ON THE RIGHT SHOWS OVERALL STATISTICS FOR THE
5 FLEET OF BIKES, METRICS BETWEEN PEDAL AND ELECTRIC ONES AS
6 WELL AS NUMBER OF STATIONS IN THOSE CITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
7 SO, THIS CHART JUST SHOWS THE OVERALL CHANGES IN RIDERSHIP FOR
8 THE DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS. ALL OF THESE PERCENTAGE CHANGES
9 ARE COMPARED TO PRECOVID LEVELS IN 2019. SO, RED MEANING THAT
10 IT'S DOWN, GREEN MEANING THAT IT'S UP. SO THE TOP LINE, SAN
11 FRANCISCO, AS YOU CAN SEE, IT'S ACTUALLY RELATIVELY FLAT AT
12 THE BEGINNING OF COVID BUT IT'S SINCE GROWN OVER TIME AND THE
13 MOST RECENT MONTH, SEPTEMBER 2022 ARE ACTUALLY UP ALMOST 50%
14 ABOVE PRECOVID LEVELS. SAN JOSE SAW A BIG SPIKE IN 2020 DUE TO
15 INTRODUCTION OF E-BIKES BUT THEY HAVE SEEN RIDERSHIP DROP
16 SIGNIFICANTLY SINCE THEN AND IT'S NOW 50% BELOW PRECOVID
17 LEVELS AND IN THE EAST BAY WHICH HAS NEVER HAD E-BIKES HAS
18 CONSISTENTLY BEEN ABOUT 50 TO 70% BELOW PRECOVID RIDERSHIP FOR
19 THE LAST TWO AND A HALF YEARS. SO, LOOKING AT THE SYSTEM AS A
20 WHOLE, WE HAVE SEEN IN INCREASE UP TO, WE'RE NOW 24% ABOVE
21 PRECOVID LEVELS BUT IT'S REALLY VERY DIFFERENT STORIES IN EACH
22 OF THE CITIES WHERE IT'S BEEN OPERATING. AND THE BOTTOM ONE IS
23 A COMPARISON VERSUS BAY AREA TRANSIT RIDERSHIP OVERALL, AS YOU
24 CAN SEE SAN JOSE AND EAST BAY FIGURES HAVE BEEN ABOUT 50%
25 PRECOVID ARE VERY IN LINE WITH WHAT WE'RE SEEING ON TRANSIT



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 GENERALLY. THE LITTLE YELLOW PIE CHART ON THE SIDE IS SHOWING
2 PERCENTAGESHIPS BY JURISDICTION. SO, SAN FRANCISCO MAKES UP
3 MORE THAN 90% OF THE TRIPS FOR THE WHOLE BAY WHEELS SYSTEM
4 NOW. 3% SAN JOSE AND 6% BETWEEN THE THREE EAST BAY CITIES.
5 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. E-BIKES HAVE TURNED OUT TO BE WILDLY
6 POPULAR AND WELL UTILIZED IN THE TWO CITIES THEY HAVE BEEN
7 LAUNCHED, SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN JOSE. AS MENTIONED THERE WAS
8 AN UNCOORDINATED DEPLOYMENT OF THEM SO THE EAST BAY WAS LEFT
9 OUT OF THAT. WE NOW SEE THAT E-BIKES MAKE UP TWO THIRDS OF THE
10 TRIPS IN THE WHOLE SYSTEM, AND SAN FRANCISCO, IT'S ABOUT 70%
11 OF THE TRIPS EVEN THOUGH IT'S ONLY HALF OF THE FLEET, AND THEN
12 SAN JOSE, IT'S MORE THAN HALF OF THE TRIPS EVEN THOUGH THEY
13 MAKE UP 10% OF ALL OF THE BIKES THERE. SO LOOKING AT THE
14 UTILIZATION FOR BIKE, JUST, SORT OF, A STANDARD METRIC FOR ANY
15 USAGE THIS IS THE AVERAGE NUMBER OF TRIPS PER DAY PER BIKE. SO
16 THE TABLE ON THE BOTTOM SHOWS THAT IN SAN FRANCISCO, CLASS
17 BIKES GET USED ABOUT ONCE PER DAY, WHEREAS ELECTRIC BIKES GET
18 USED MORE THAN DOUBLE THAT TWO AND A HALF TIMES PER DAY, SAN
19 JOSE CLASSIC BIKES GET BARELY USED AT ALL JUST .1 TRIPS PER
20 DAY WHEREAS E-BIKES GET USED TEN TIMES AS MUCH AT 1.3 TIMES
21 PER DAY AND EAST BAY HALF A TRIP PER DAY FOR CLASSIC BIKE. THE
22 IMAGINE ON THE LEFT, BIKESHARE EQUIPMENT DEPLOYED, BOTTOM
23 IMAGES OF BLACK AND PINK ONES ARE THE EQUIPMENT THAT'S FOR THE
24 MOST PART THAT IS OUT THERE TODAY, AND THEN THE GRAY AND
25 PURPLE ONES ON THE TOP ARE THE NEWEST MODELS THAT ARE SLOWLY



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 BEING INTRODUCED. THE EXISTING EQUIPMENT IS CERTAINLY POPULAR
2 AND WELL UTILIZED, BUT THEY HAVE HAD CHALLENGES WITH THEFT AND
3 VANDALISM THAT THEY'RE LOOKING TO ADDRESS WITH THE NEW
4 EQUIPMENT, AND ALSO HAVING LARGER BATTERIES REDUCES THE
5 OPERATIONAL EFFORTS TO KEEP THEM CHARGED. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
6 HERE I WANT TO PUT BIKESHARE IN CONTEXT OF OUR REGIONAL
7 TRANSIT NETWORK. BASED ON RIDERSHIP BAY WHEELS WOULD BE THE
8 8TH LARGEST TRANSIT OPERATOR IN THE REGION, AT CURRENTLY OVER
9 2 MILLION TRIPS PER YEAR. THEY HAVE PROVIDED OVER 10 MILLION
10 TRIPS TOTAL WITH ZERO PUBLIC SUBSIDY. IT'S ALSO SERVED AS A
11 REALLY IMPORTANT LAST MILE COMP IMPLEMENT TO REGIONAL TRANSIT,
12 ESPECIALLY IN SAN FRANCISCO, WHERE, BEFORE COVID, THE
13 BIKESHARE STATIONS THAT SAW THE HIGHEST RIDERSHIP WERE ALMOST
14 ALL NEXT TO REGIONAL TRANSIT HUBS. SOCAL TRAIN IN DOWNTOWN SAN
15 FRANCISCO, THE DOWNTOWN BART STATIONS, FERRY, AND TRANSBAY
16 TRANSIT CENTER. SO, I THINK THERE IS A STRONG LINKAGE TO
17 PEOPLE CONNECTING FROM REGIONAL TRANSIT. AND THEN LASTLY JUST
18 WANT TO POINT OUT THAT WITH CLIPPER 2.0 BEING LAUNCHED, NEXT
19 YEAR, OR AFTER, THERE WILL BE NEW OPPORTUNITIES TO POTENTIALLY
20 INTEGRATE BIKESHARE AND TRANSIT PAYMENT OPTIONS. SO WE'LL LOOK
21 FORWARD TO SEEING HOW THAT UNFOLDS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO,
22 THE LAST SLIDE ON BAY WHEELS, THERE HAVE BEEN REALLY
23 INTENTIONAL EQUITY FOCUSED PROGRAMS THAT HAVE GONE ALONG WITH
24 IT. A GREAT BIKESHARE FOR ALL LOW-INCOME PROGRAM THAT ALLOWS
25 FOR SIGNIFICANTLY REDUCED MEMBERSHIP AND LOWER FEES FOR PEOPLE



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 MAKING LESS THAN 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL, AND THE
2 BIKESHARE FOR ALL MEMBERS MAKE UP OVER 10% OF ALL THE MEMBERS
3 SYSTEM RIGHT NOW. ALSO THERE HAS BEEN ADAPTED BIKESHARE
4 EFFORTS INCLUDING PILOTING, UNDERSTANDING THE ACCESSIBILITY
5 NEEDS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY, DONE IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE
6 BAY AREA OUTREACH RECREATION PROGRAM, THERE HAS BEEN AN
7 ONGOING TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR THAT. NEXT SLIDE,
8 PLEASE. ONE QUICK SLIDE ON THE CAPITAL BIKESHARE PROGRAM.
9 THESE WERE THE THREE JURISDICTIONS THAT RECEIVE GRANTS FROM
10 MTC TO LAUNCH BIKESHARE IN LESS DENSE SUBURBAN PARTS OF THE
11 REGION, THE THREE SELECTED WERE CITIES OF FREMONT, RICHMOND,
12 AND ALSO MARIN AND SONOMA COUNTIES LAUNCH ON THE SMART
13 CORRIDOR. BACK ONE SLIDE, PLEASE. THANK YOU. ALL THREE
14 PROGRAMS HAVE FACED CHALLENGES GETTING LAUNCHED AND ALSO
15 KEEPING FLEETS ON THE GROUND. SO CURRENTLY FREMONT, THE FLEET
16 HAS BEEN PULLED AFTER, YOU KNOW, AS CHALLENGED INITIALLY, AND
17 IN RICHMOND THE SYSTEM HAD BEEN OPERATIONAL FOR ABOUT A YEAR
18 BEFORE THE OPERATOR CEASED EARLIER THIS SUMMER, AND NOW THE
19 CITY IS GETTING A NEW PERSPECTIVE PAPER TO STET STEP IN AND
20 TAKE OVER THAT SYSTEM AND THE NEW OPERATOR IN MARIN AND SONOMA
21 THEY CEASED OPERATIONS BEFORE THIS EVEN LAUNCHED. WE HAVE
22 CERTAINLY HAD SOME CHALLENGES WITH BAY WHEELS BUT THERE HAVE
23 BEEN MORE EXTREME WITH THE CAPITAL BIKESHARE PROGRAM. NEXT
24 SLIDE, PLEASE. HIGH-LEVEL KEY FINDINGS FROM FOLLOWING THIS FOR
25 THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS. WE HAVE SEEN THAT BAY WHEELS E-BIKES



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 IN PARTICULAR HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL AT DEMONSTRATING THE
2 POTENTIAL FOR BIKESHARE IN THE REGION IT'S BEEN UTILIZED IN
3 DENSE URBAN AREA AND IT'S BEEN GREAT TO SEE THEY CAN PLAY THE
4 ROLE AT THE LAST MILE COMPLEMENT TO REGIONAL TRANSIT. AT THE
5 SAME TIME WE HAVE BEEN FORTUNATE TO LEARN ABOUT BUSINESS MODEL
6 CHALLENGES WHICH WERE BEGINNING TO SHOW UP PRECOVID BUT HAVE
7 BEEN EXACERBATED BY THE PANDEMIC E-BIKES ARE POPULAR BUT ALSO
8 MORE EXPENSIVE TO PURCHASE AND OPERATE. THEFT AND VANDALISM
9 ARE UNFORTUNATELY CONTINUING TO BE BIGGER ISSUES FOR OPERATORS
10 NOT JUST FOR BAY WHEELS BUT PRETTY MUCH ALL THE OPERATORS THAT
11 WE HAVE TALKED TO, AND THIS APPEARS TO BE A BIGGER ISSUE IN
12 CALIFORNIA THAN OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY. LEADING US TO A
13 REALIZATION THAT REGIONAL BIKESHARE IS NOT FINANCIALLY
14 SUSTAINABLE WITHOUT PUBLIC SUBSIDY. AND NOW WE HAVE
15 OPPORTUNITY WITH THE LESSONS LEARNED TO SHAPE THE FUTURE OF
16 REGIONAL BIKESHARE, AND WITH THE ZERO DOLLAR CONTRACT THAT WE
17 HAVE HAD IN PLACE, IT'S ACTUALLY REALLY SHIELDED US FROM THE
18 FINANCIAL RISKS DURING COVID WHICH HAS REALLY BEEN IN OUR
19 FAVOR, BUT WE DO RECOGNIZE THAT PUBLIC INVESTMENT IS LIKELY
20 NECESSARY TO SUS STAIN THE SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE AND, CERTAINLY,
21 NECESSARY, TO REACH THE POTENTIAL BIKESHARE. AND THEN, LAST
22 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, JUST, SORT OF, A RECAP. WE HAVE FIVE YEARS
23 LEFT ON THE BAY WHEELS CONTRACT. WE ESTIMATE IT MAY TAKE UP TO
24 THREE YEARS TO PLAN AND PROCURE AND TRANSITION THE NEXT
25 OPERATOR. SO WE DO HAVE SOME TIME. WE ARE INTERESTED IN



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 STRATEGIES FOR PUBLIC INVESTMENT THAT COULD BOTH IMPROVE THE
2 SYSTEM AND HELP US PREPARE FOR THE NEXT CONTRACT IN 2027. AND,
3 ALSO, JUST WANT TO GET A BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF HOW THE
4 COMMISSION THINKS ABOUT BIKESHARE FITTING IN WITH THE BROADER
5 MTC GOALS, WHICH ARE PLANNED BAY AREA, TRANSIT RECOVERY
6 EFFORTS, THE CLIMATE INITIATIVES AND THE REGIONAL ACTIVE
7 TRANSPORTATION PLAN. SO, BASED ON THE FEEDBACK THAT WE HEAR
8 FROM YOU TODAY, WE WOULD LIKE TO RETURN WITH SOME CONCEPTS FOR
9 POTENTIAL PUBLIC INVESTMENT. AND WITH THAT, I WILL HAND IT
10 OVER TO ALIX AND ANDY.

11

12 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU TOSHI. OKAY. GO AHEAD.

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** ANDREW FREMIER, DEPUTY DIRECTOR. TOSHI DID A
15 NICE JOB OF PUTTING THE ITEMS ON THE TABLE. THE POINT WE'RE
16 TRYING TO MAKE IS WE DO THINK THE REGIONAL BIKESHARE PROGRAM
17 WHILE IT HAS VERY SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES HAS SOME GREAT
18 OPPORTUNITIES TO MEET SOME OF THE GOALS AND COMMITMENTS OF THE
19 AGENCY. SO WE DO THINK THAT CONTINUING TO TRY TO FIGURE OUT
20 WAYS TO MAKE IT WORK BETTER, TO REALLY TIE IT INTO THE TRANSIT
21 RECOVERY PLAN IS CERTAINLY AN IMPORTANT ASPECT OF WHAT WE NEED
22 TO ACCOMPLISH WITH THE COMMISSION. WE DON'T HAVE ANY DIRECT
23 ANSWERS JUST YET BUT HOPE TO BRING SPECIFIC ITEMS FORWARD
24 AROUND PLACES WE CAN INVEST IN TERMS OF ELECTRIFYING STATIONS
25 A BIT MORE DIRECTLY, AND ALSO TRYING TO FIGURE OUT IF WE CAN



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 DEAL WITH, SORT OF, THE EXCITEMENT OF THE E-BIKE AND ITS
2 OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY GROW THE PROGRAM, AS WELL.

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, ANDY. AND ALIX WERE YOU
5 GOING TO CHIME IN AS WELL.

6

7 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK TOSHI COVERED ALL THE SPECKS.

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

10

11 **AMY R. WORTH:** THE BIKESHARE IS SO EXCITING. WE WERE DOWN AT
12 LEAGUE OF CALIFORNIA CITIES MEETING IN LONG BEACH THEY HAVE
13 ALL THE SCOOTERS AND BIKESHARE AND THERE IS NO DOUBT WE'RE
14 GOING TO NEED TO PROVIDE PUBLIC FUNDING FOR THIS EFFORT JUST
15 LIKE WE DO FOR ALL OTHER TRANSPORTATION MODES. WONDERING
16 LOOKING FORWARD IF THERE IS A WAY FOR US TO OVERTLY LINK THE
17 PLANNING FOR BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN INVESTMENTS, THE CAPITAL
18 INVESTMENT WITH THE BIKESHARE PROGRAM, BECAUSE WHAT I'M
19 HEARING FROM THE PUBLIC IS THAT I WANT TO USE BIKES, THAT I
20 WANT TO USE E-BIKES, BUT WE NEED THE CORRIDORS TO DO IT
21 ESPECIALLY FOR THE HIGH USE. AND I SEE THAT MAYOR HUDSON IS ON
22 THE CALL. I WON'T STEAL HIS THUNDER AROUND THE WORK THAT SAN
23 RAMON IS DOING AROUND THE SHARING BIKE AND SCOOTER SHARING
24 PROGRAMS. SEEMS IF WE ELEVATE THE TWO TOGETHER WE CAN INCREASE
25 RIDERSHIP, IF PEOPLE HAVE THE CORRIDORS THAT THEY FEEL



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 COMFORTABLE RIDING. THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR WORKING ON THIS.
2 THIS IS GREAT. AND THANKS FOR YOUR HELP ARE RICHMOND THAT WAS
3 A HUGE PART ON THE CITY TO TRY TO BRING THE SYSTEM BACK AND
4 REALLY LEAD THE CHARGE IN LENDING BACK THE BIKES.

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ALFREDO?

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GREAT PRESENTATION. I'M AN AVID BIKE USER
9 IT'S GREAT TO SEE PROGRAMS FOR CYCLISTS. BUT THE ONE THING
10 THAT STANDS OUT TO ME IS HOW RURAL COUNTIES HAVE A HARDER TIME
11 WITH PROGRAMS LIKE THIS. AND THE NEED DOESN'T GO AWAY, WHETHER
12 YOU ARE IN AN URBAN OR RURAL COMMUNITY. BUT I DO THINK HAVING
13 A FOCUS THAT DOESN'T TAKE AWAY FROM WHAT WE'RE DOING IN URBAN
14 CENTERS, BUT HOW DO WE ENCOURAGE RURAL COUNTIES TO EMBRACE
15 PROGRAMS LIKE THIS. WE HAVE A TRAIL THAT'S GOING TO CONNECT
16 FROM SOUTHERN TO NORTHERN POINTS 26 MILES DEDICATED SAFE
17 ROUTES THAT COULD BE PART OF LAST MILE FIRST MILE. COULD YOU
18 SHARE MORE ABOUT WHAT WE CAN DO OR HOW WE'RE GOING TO BE
19 LOOKING AT INVESTMENTS IN THE MORE RURAL COMMUNITIES?

20

21 **TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA:** I THINK, GENERALLY, WE'RE MONITORING A LOT
22 OF DIFFERENT PROGRAMS TO GET PEOPLE ACCESS TO E-BIKES, AND ONE
23 OF THE THINGS THAT WE'RE MONITORING AT MTC IS BOTH E-BIKE
24 LENDING LIBRARIES AND REBATES THAT MAY BE MORE EFFECTIVE FOR
25 RURAL AND SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES. SO WE CERTAINLY WANT TO KEEP



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 AN EYE OUT TO PROVIDING ACCESS IN EVERY PART OF THE REGION AND
2 BUILD-OUT LESSONS LEARNED, CITIES SUCH AS OAKLAND AND RICHMOND
3 ARE STARTING TO LAUNCH NOW. CCAS AND CHOICE AGGREGATORS ARE
4 DEPLOYING E-BIKE REBATES. THERE IS A LOT BUILDING UP NOW THAT
5 WILL GIVE US BETTER OPTIONS FOR E-BIKES IN RURAL COMMUNITIES.
6 169 THANK YOU. LET'S GO TO ALIX AND AFTER ALIX, DAVE.

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR DUTRA-VERNACI. ACTUALLY, I
9 WAS GOING TO ADD TO WHAT TOSHI HAD AS A RESPONSE TO CHAIR
10 PEDROZA. AND I DID WANT TO NOTE THAT I THINK, FOR THE MORE
11 RURAL MORE SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES PUBLIC INVESTMENT IS MORE
12 IMPORTANT TO HAVE A RELIABLE E LIKE SHARE PROGRAM, THAN IN THE
13 DENSE AREAS. SO, I THINK THAT DOES, IN ADDITION TO WHAT TOSHI
14 SAYS, I THINK THAT IS IMPORTANT. LOOKING ACROSS THE COUNTRY,
15 THERE IS VERY FEW PLACES IN THE COUNTRY WHERE BIKESHARE, THE
16 BUSINESS MODEL CAN BE SUSTAINED, AND IT MAYBE JUST NEW YORK
17 CITY WITHOUT SOME, SORT OF, PUBLIC INVESTMENT AND I THINK AS
18 YOU MOVE AWAY FROM THE MORE URBAN AREAS THAT BECOMES EVEN MORE
19 CRITICAL. JUST WANTED TO ADD THAT.

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** I AGREE WITH THOSE COMMENTS
22 ENTIRELY. DAVE, WHAT YOU HAVE GOT FOR US?

23

24 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I THINK I AM SEMI PUBLIC ON THIS, BUT SAN
25 RAMON HAS HAD ITS OWN BIKESHARE PROGRAM SINCE THE BIKESHARE



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 PROGRAM WAS WITH THE AIR DISTRICT. THIS IS NOT SOMETHING NEW.
2 IT STARTED WITH THE DIRECTOR AT BISHOP RANCH WHO IS LISTENING
3 TO THIS ON THE OTHER SIDE OF THE WALL AND WE HIRED HIM IN SAN
4 RAMON NOW WE HAVE A PILOT PROGRAM FOR THE E-BIKE AND E-SCOOTER
5 ALONG WITH PLEASANT HILL. WE NEED A PLAN THAT WOULD HOOK THE
6 TWO TOGETHER. THAT'S BEEN THE PROBLEM FOR YEARS TALKING ABOUT
7 CAN WE DO A CONNECTION BETWEEN WALNUT CREEK AND DUBLIN THAT
8 WENT NOWHERE. I'M SEEING THIS IS SUCCESSFUL NOW, I CAN'T
9 EMPLOYER IF IT'S THIS ORGANIZATION OR NOT, BUT IT HAD ME
10 EXCITED FOR THIS KIND OF ANSWER, THE TRAVEL TO BUSINESS BARKS
11 ALONG 680, WITH THE ELECTRIC SYMPOSIUM, THE BIKES YOU HAVE
12 SCOOTERS, VESPAS, HUNDRED AS, AND WITH IT 50'S, BROUGHT IT UP
13 BEFORE THE ELECTRIC VEHICLE SYMPOSIUM GOES ASIA, EUROPE, THE
14 UNITED STATES. MY FIRST ONE I SAW WAS ASIA. I TRIED TO GET
15 BACK TO PORTLAND BEFORE I SAW IT WAS CANCELED DUE TO COVID. I
16 UNDERSTAND ASIA WAS CANCELLED. THERE IS SUPPOSED TO BE A
17 NORWAY THIS YEAR; IT'S CANCELLED. THE CLASSIC OPPORTUNITY FOR
18 US, NOT ONLY IN CITIES, BUT MTC AND THE AIR DISTRICT, TO GO TO
19 EBS36, WHICH THIS YEAR IS SCHEDULED JUNE 10TH IN SACRAMENTO. I
20 STRONGLY SUGGEST YOU TAKE A LOOK AT THE INNOVATIONS OUT THERE.
21 WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT THE HYDROGEN BICYCLE, WHICH HAS BEEN
22 AVAILABLE SINCE 2019, THAT I HAVE SEEN. SO, THERE IS A LOT OUT
23 THERE TO REALLY GO AFTER IN THIS FIELD FOR THAT LAST MILE OR
24 MILE AND A HALF IS WHERE IT'S GOING TO BE NOW. BECAUSE THIS



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 STUFF IS CATCHING ON HERE. OUR BIKE TRAFFIC IN SAN RAMON
2 TRIPLED DURING COVID.

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH DAVE. ANY OTHER
5 COMMISSIONERS WITH COMMENTS? BEFORE I GO TO ATTENDEES, I SEE
6 WE HAVE HANDS UP. MY COMMENTS ON THIS, IN LOOK AT THE
7 PRESENTATION WOULD BE, DO WE HAVE THE DAY-TO-DAY TO SHOW HOW
8 THAT CHANGES WITH INCLEMENT WEATHER? MY GUESS IS WE HAVE
9 RIDERS AND BIKERS ON SCOOTERS IN BAD WEATHER. SO I JUST WANTED
10 TO VERIFY THAT INFORMATION, TOSHI, IF YOU WOULD, PLEASE?

11

12 **TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA:** YEAH, WE DO HAVE THE DATA. I'LL HAVE TO
13 DIG IN A LITTLE MORE. BUT CERTAINLY WEATHER DOES IMPACT
14 PEOPLE'S INTEREST IN RIDING THOSE MODES. WE CAN TRY TO PULL UP
15 SOME HIGH-LEVEL STATS TO EXPLAIN WHAT HAPPENS IN THE REGION.

16

17 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** OKAY. THAT WOULD BE GOOD. BECAUSE
18 AS I THOUGHT ABOUT IT, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT HAS ANY BEARING IN
19 THE CONVERSATION, BUT, CERTAINLY, AS WE'RE TRYING TO MOVE
20 PEOPLE AROUND, THOSE THAT DO WANT TO DO SOMETHING WITH THE
21 FIRST/LAST MILE, THIS'S WHAT I THOUGHT ABOUT, IS IT TOO COLD?
22 IS IT TOO WINDY? I'LL JUST DRIVE INSTEAD BECAUSE I DON'T WANT
23 TO DEAL WITH THAT ON MY LITTLE E-BIKE OR SCOOTER, IT'S JUST
24 NOT GOING TO BE CONVENIENT FOR ME, BECAUSE OF THE WEATHER. AND
25 THAT BEING SAID, AS I THOUGHT ABOUT IN THE DIFFERENT MOBILITY



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 -- INDIVIDUAL MOBILITIES, THERE MAY BE FOLKS THAT ARE MORE
2 COMFORTABLE ON A SCOOTER THAN A BICYCLE. SO, I KNOW THIS
3 PRESENTATION IS ABOUT BIKESHARE, BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE, AS I
4 HAVE HEARD FROM OTHER COMMENTS, THAT WE ALSO THINK ABOUT THE
5 SCOOTERS. BECAUSE IF THERE IS SOMEBODY THAT HAS TO CARRY A
6 WHOLE BUNCH OF STUFF AS YOU'RE WALKING DOWN THE STREET. IT
7 MIGHT BE EASIER TO HANDLE ON A SCOOTER THAN IT WOULD BE ON A
8 BICYCLE. SO THERE IS JUST SO MANY THINGS TO THINK ABOUT, AND I
9 WANT TO APPRECIATE STAFF FOR THE TIME THEY HAVE TAKEN, AND
10 LISTENING TO THE COMMUNITY OUTREACH TO TRY AND MAKE SURE, AS
11 WE MOVE FORWARD, WE GET THIS RIGHT TO GET MORE PEOPLE OUT OF
12 THEIR CARS AND USING MASS TRANSIT AND USING OUR FIRST LAST
13 MILE ALTERNATIVES. SO, IN ANY CASE, THOSE ARE MY THOUGHTS.
14 THAT BEING SAID, MARTHA, CAN WE GO AHEAD AND OPEN IT UP TOLL
15 PUBLIC, PLEASE? AND LET'S DO TWO MINUTES A PIECE, PLEASE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. AND WE DID RECEIVE WRITTEN
18 CORRESPONDENCE FROM JUSTIN NGUYEN, AND COMBINED COMMENT FROM
19 SEAMLESS BAY AREA, SILICON COUNTY BICYCLE COALITION AND MARIN
20 COUNTY BICYCLE COALITION. FIRST UP IS GEORGE C, FOLLOWED BY
21 CHRIS FITZGERALD. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS GEORGE SPEIS, SHOUT OUT TO COMMISSIONER
24 SCHAFF. I AM A BICYCLE AND TRANSIT USER, AND I'M EXCITED BY
25 WHAT I'M HEARING TODAY THAT THE COMMISSION IS OPEN TO AND



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 THINKING ABOUT A SYSTEM THEY BELIEVE SHOULD BE PUBLICLY
2 GOVERNED, SUBSIDIZED, REGIONAL, OFFERING A SPECTRUM OF DEVICES
3 SO THAT AS MANY PEOPLE AS POSSIBLE CAN USE THE SYSTEM. EVEN
4 THOUGH I AM LUCKY AND FORTUNATE ENOUGH TO BE ABLE TO OWN MY
5 OWN E-BIKE, I DO FIND MYSELF IN SITUATIONS WHERE, HEY, I NEED
6 ACCESS TO A BICYCLE, BECAUSE I LEFT HOME ON A TRANSIT TRIP,
7 AND NOW SUDDENLY I NEED A BIKE. I THINK THE THINGS THAT I
8 WANTED TO EMPHASIZE HERE ARE THAT A COORDINATED PUBLICLY
9 GOVERNED SYSTEM WITH SUBSIDY IS REALLY WHAT'S GOING TO MAKE
10 THIS WORK. BECAUSE ONCE SOMEBODY GETS IN THEIR CAR TO GO TO
11 THE -- WHAT IS GOING STOP THEM FROM JUST STAYING IN THE CAR?
12 WE HAVE GOT TO STOP THE CAR FROM GETTING STARTED IN THE FIRST
13 PLACE, AND THE WAY TO DO THAT IS FIRST AND LAST MILE. IT'S
14 HYPOCRITICAL TO HAVE A WIDELY DISTRIBUTED, EASILY AVAILABLE,
15 COORDINATED, INTEGRATED SYSTEM WHERE I CAN USE MY CLIPPER ON
16 THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, I CAN USE IT ON THE BUS, ON THE
17 BART, ON THE FERRY, ET CETERA, AND THAT'S REALLY GOING TO MAKE
18 A HUGE DIFFERENCE. REMEMBER THAT OVER 50% OF ALL TRIPS THAT
19 ARE DONE IN CALIFORNIA ARE LESS THAN THREE MILES. RIGHT? SO,
20 IF YOU ARE REALLY LOOKING AT REDUCING VMT, LOOK AT THE 50
21 MILE. BECAUSE IT'S BICYCLE SHARE. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CHRIS FITZGERALD.
24 FOLLOWED BY DAVE.

25



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** GREAT TO BE HERE THE INVOLVEMENT WITH
2 ACCESSIBILITY IN THE EAST BAY HOWEVER TYPICALLY THEY DON'T
3 COME DOWN THIS WAY TO WORK WITH US HERE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY.
4 I THINK THE IDEA OF FIRST LAST MILE IS GREAT HOWEVER THE
5 PLACEMENT OF OUR RAFT OF BICYCLES, E-BIKES, IS QUESTIONABLE. I
6 HAVE A [INDISCERNIBLE] OUTSIDE SANTA CLARA COUNTY TO LOOK AT
7 WHERE THEY'RE LOCATED, FOR EXAMPLE, I WORK AT THE SILICON
8 VALLEY INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTER AT 14th AND SANTA CLARA, WE
9 HAVE RACKS OF 20 BIKES IN A LINE, ON 14th STREET, AND MY
10 QUESTION, AND ALL TOO MANY ARE STILL THERE IN THE RACKS NOT
11 BEING UTILIZED. MAYBE YOU WILL HAVE TWO OR THREE USED. SO MY
12 QUESTION, 14th STREET IS NOT WHAT I WOULD CONSIDER A FIRST OR
13 LAST MILE SIGNIFICANT CORRIDOR. WE HAVE THE 522 AND THE 22,
14 AND THE 23VTA, 522, 22, AND 23 COMING DOWN EAST SANTA CLARA,
15 BUT, AGAIN, IT'S POSITIONING, IT'S CAPTURING THAT AUDIENCE,
16 BUT THE ISSUE I WANT TO ELEVATE AGAIN IS MAKING SURE THAT WE
17 HAVE TRIKES, AS WELL. NOT JUST BIKES, NOT JUST SCOOTERS, BUT
18 TRIKES. THREE-WHEELED BIKES THAT CAN BE EASILY ACCOMMODATED
19 FOR FOLKS THAT HAVE, WHO ARE ELDERS OR APPLIED BIKES FOR THOSE
20 IN WHEELCHAIRS. THAT'S WHAT I'M GOING BRING TO THE FORE.
21 THANKS.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, CHRIS. NEXT UP IS DAVE SOREL
24 FOLLOWED BY SEAMLESS BAY AREA.

25



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** DAVID SORREL, UC BERKELEY PARK, TDM MANAGER, AND ALSO
2 PRESIDENT OF THE ASSOCIATION FOR COMMUTER TRANSPORTATION.
3 TOSHI THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT'S A GREAT OVERVIEW FROM
4 A REGIONAL CONTEXT AND ALSO FOR IDENTIFYING WHAT'S GOING ON ON
5 THE ROAD. HAVING OVERSEEN THE PROGRAM ON THIS CAMPUS, AT LEAST
6 IN THE BETTER HALF OF THE LAST SIX YEARS, I THINK WHAT WE HAVE
7 SEEN ARE EQUAL PARTS IT'S A GOOD OPPORTUNITY AND GOOD USE OF
8 RESOURCES TO CONNECT OUR COMMUNITIES BETTER. I THINK THAT
9 THERE NEEDS TO BE A LITTLE MORE ROOM, AT LEAST IN TERMS OF
10 HAVING REGIONAL COORDINATION, FOR EXAMPLE, BERKELEY, OAKLAND,
11 ALBANY, AND EMERYVILLE, ALL OPERATE UNDER DIFFERENT, BUT AT
12 THE SAME CONTEXT, SO THAT'S SOMETHING TO TAKE A LOOK ADD
13 MOVING FORWARD. ARE I THINK THE OTHER POINT OF CONTENTION IS
14 GOING TO BE IMPORTANT, TOO, IS THE PRICING STRUCTURE. E-BIKES
15 WERE NOT WELL-RECEIVED -- WELL, THEY WERE WELL-RECEIVED BUT
16 THE PRICING MECHANISM ISN'T. BECAUSE IF I HAVE THE EXPECTATION
17 OF SELLING THE POINTS TO OUR STAFF AND STUDENTS, YOU KNOW, A
18 YEARLY MEMBERSHIP NEEDS TO COVER EVERYTHING. AND WHAT LYFT
19 TRIED TO DO IS BASICALLY DO THE TWO TIERED SYSTEM WHICH CAUSED
20 A BUNCH OF KERFUFFLES ALONG THE WAY. AND I THINK WE NEED TO
21 HAVE A HOLISTIC APPROACH TO PRICING SO THAT WE HIT OUR EQUITY
22 STRIDES. LASTLY, DOING THE TRIKES, AND THINGS CHRISTINE
23 MENTIONED EARLIER IS CRITICAL TO PUBLIC FUNDS BEING SPENT AND
24 NOT VIOLATING ADA REGULATIONS. EDUCATION WITH A LITTLE BIT OF
25 ENFORCEMENT CAN GO A LONG WAY FOR SUCCESS AND LOWERING



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 JURISDICTION VERSUS RIDING AND PERHAPS HITTING SOMEONE. WITH
2 THAT IN MIND, SOMETHING I WOULD SUPPORT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SEAMLESS BAY AREA, FOLLOWED BY
5 ROBERT. SEAMLESS BAY AREA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING. THIS IS ADINA LEVIN, AND I SERVE ON
8 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, BUT I AM SPEAKING FOR MYSELF AND
9 AS ADVOCACY DIRECTOR FOR SEAMLESS BAY AREA, AND ALSO SERVE ON
10 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL BODY FOR SILICON VALLEY BICYCLE
11 COALITION. WANTED TO REPORT THAT, SINCE YOU GOT THAT LETTER IN
12 YOUR PACKET BY FIVE, BIKE EAST BAY, AND SAN FRANCISCO BICYCLE
13 COALITION WERE ALSO JOINED ON THAT LETTER, SPEAKING OF IN
14 FAVOR OF A REGIONAL BIKESHARE MICROMOBILITY SYSTEM THAT IS
15 AFFORDABLE, INTEGRATED, RELIABLE, AND ACCESSIBLE. I LIVE ON
16 THE PENINSULA, AND I'M HAPPY TO SEE THAT THERE IS AN EFFORT TO
17 HAVE A SAN MATEO COUNTY BIKESHARE PILOT. BUT I AM REALLY NOT
18 HAPPY TO SEE THAT THERE IS NOW GOING TO BE EVEN MORE PROGRAMS
19 PROLIFERATING, WHICH IS THE OPPOSITE OF WHAT IT NEEDS TO BE
20 CONVENIENT IF SOMEBODY IS TRAVELING AROUND THE REGION ON
21 TRANSIT AND WANTS TO BE ABLE TO USE MICROMOBILITY AS THE LAST
22 MILE. AND THIS IS EXTREMELY TIMELY WITH THE WORK THAT MTC IS
23 DOING TO START PLANNING FOR A POTENTIAL REGIONAL FUNDING
24 MEASURE, LOOKING AT THE POTENTIAL TO DO PUBLIC FUNDING TO HAVE
25 A SYSTEM THAT IS AFFORDABLE AND INTEGRATED, AND ACCESSIBLE.



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 THIS ALSO WILL POTENTIALLY WORK NICELY WITH THE INITIATIVES
2 FOR CONNECTED NET TRANSIT NETWORK PLANNING TO MAKE SURE WE
3 THAT LAST MILE AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT TO HAVE THE INSTITUTIONS
4 THAT WE NEED TO RUN COORDINATED SYSTEMS SUCH AS MICROMOBILITY
5 AND OTHER PARTS OF OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU ADINA. NEXT UP IS ROBERT PRINZ
8 FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AND THANKS TO THE PRESENTERS FOR THIS
11 INFORMATION. THIS IS ROBERT PRINZ, ADVOCACY DIRECTOR WITH BIKE
12 EAST BAY. I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED WITH EAST BAY BIKESHARE
13 DEVELOPMENT SINCE BEFORE THE GOBIKE LAUNCH IN 2016 AND A
14 MEMBER OF OAKLAND BICYCLE ADVISORY COMMISSION. WE DO KNOW HOW
15 TO MAKE BIKESHARE HERE IN THE EAST BAY AND WE HAVE EXAMPLES OF
16 IT BEING SUCCESSFUL. THE PROBLEM HAS BEEN THAT THE PUBLIC
17 AGENCIES DON'T HAVE CONTROL OVER THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS,
18 WHICH HAS LED TO SOME OF THE PROBLEMS THAT WE HAVE SEEN. WHEN
19 THE BAY, BIKESHARE FOR ALL COLLABORATIVE THAT WE PARTICIPATE
20 IN LAUNCHED DURING THE BIKESHARE LAUNCH, IT WAS VERY
21 SUCCESSFUL IN GETTING PEOPLE SIGNED UP FOR THE LOW-INCOME
22 MEMBERSHIPS. BUT THAT PROGRAM WAS DEFUNDED AND DISBANDED AND
23 AFTER THE YEAR OF MEMBERSHIPS LAPSED, A LOT OF PEOPLE DID NOT
24 SIGN UP AGAIN. THIS TYPE OF INVESTMENT IS GOING HAPPEN WITH A
25 PUBLICLY OWNED AND OPERATED SYSTEM. I WOULD LIKE TO CORRECT



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 THE RECORD, WE DID HAVE E-BIKES IN OAKLAND, UNDERGO BIKE PLUS,
2 THEY CAME TO OAKLAND IN DECEMBER 2018 BUT THEN LEFT AFTER THE
3 BRAKE ISSUES IN APRIL 2019. THEY CAME BACK TO OAKLAND UNDER
4 LYFT FIRST IN JULY OF 2019, WITH A PROMISE THAT THE DOCKLESS
5 E-BIKES WOULD BE EXPANDED ALL THE WAY TO EAST OAKLAND, BUT
6 THOSE WERE RECALLED AS WELL DUE TO THE BATTERY ISSUES AT THE
7 END OF JULY LESS THAN A MONTH LATER AND NEVER RETURNED AND
8 THAT EXPANSION TO EAST OAKLAND NEVER HAPPENED. IF WE WANT TO
9 HAVE THESE DECISIONS BE IN LINE WITH OUR EQUITY AND ACCESS
10 GOALS, THE REGION NEEDS TO THINK OF THIS AS AN EXTENSION OF
11 PUBLIC TRANSIT AND TAKE OWNERSHIP OVER THE SYSTEM AND THE
12 DECISION-MAKING. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS VINAY PIMPLE. VINAY,
15 WHEN YOU GET DOWN TO 15 SECONDS, I'M GOING SAY 15, FOLLOWED BY
16 DEREK SAGEFORD.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I'M ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I WANT TO THANK
19 FOLKS FOR A GOOD PRESENTATION. I WANTED TO BRING UP THE ISSUE
20 OF FOLDING BIKES. BECAUSE I JUST THINK THAT, I KNOW PEOPLE MAY
21 BE HESITANT TO PICK ONE PRODUCT OVER THE OTHER, BUT I DO THINK
22 THAT FOLDING BIKES DO HAVE ADVANTAGES. IT'S ADVANTAGES FOR
23 PEOPLE WHO MAY NOT HAVE THE SPACE AT HOME. MAY LIVE IN SMALLER
24 APARTMENTS, IT'S EASIER TO STORE, IT'S EASIER TO STORE AT THE
25 OFFICE SO YOU DON'T HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT, DOES THE OFFICE AREA



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 HAVE BIKE PARKING. YOU CAN JUST STORE IT UNDER THE DESK. IT
2 WOULD ALSO BE EASIER TO HAVE, LIKE, THE SAME SPACE AT, SAY,
3 BART PARKING, COULD STORE A LOT MORE FOLDING BIKES. YOU COULD
4 JUST STORE THEM IN LOCKERS. AND, SO, I JUST FEEL LIKE IF WE
5 HAD MORE OF A REBATE PROGRAM FOR FOLDING BIKES, THAT WOULD
6 IMPROVE BIKE TRIPS A LOT. YOU KNOW, ALTHOUGH THE PRESENTATION
7 WAS GOOD, I WAS A BIT DISAPPOINTED THAT THE BIKESHARE NUMBERS,
8 IT SEEMS LIKE ONE BIKE IS BARELY USED BY ONE PERSON A WHOLE
9 DAY. THAT DOESN'T SEEM LIKE A HUGE USE. AND MAYBE REBATES
10 MIGHT BE A BETTER WAY TO GO. AND I WONDER IF THERE IS A WAY TO
11 JUST MEASURE BIKE TRIPS, THAN SPECIFICALLY BIKE STRIPS
12 ASSOCIATED WITH A PARTICULAR PROGRAM. AND THEN WE COULD THEN
13 FIGURE OUT HOW MUCH REBATES INCREASE THE BIKE TRIPS. I WOULD
14 ALSO LIKE TO KNOW WHETHER THE, A BIKESHARE PROGRAMS ARE USED
15 BY PEOPLE WHO MORE COMMUTE, OR PEOPLE WHO ARE JUST THERE FOR,
16 ON THAT PARTICULAR DAY. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU VINAY. NOW OUR FINAL COMMENTERS
19 IS DEREK SAGEHORN. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS DEREK SAGEHORN. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
22 MOVING FORWARD ON THIS PROCESS. IT'S VERY CLEAR THAT THE
23 CURRENT SYSTEM IS NOT WORKING. IF YOU GO TO OTHER METROS THAT
24 HAVE BIKESHARE, THEIR PRICING IS BETTER, THEIR COVERAGE IS
25 BETTER. ESPECIALLY IN TERMS OF ACCESS TO EQUITY COMMUNITIES.



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 AS POINTED OUT, COVERAGE IN EAST OAKLAND AND OTHER DISINVESTED
2 NEIGHBORHOODS IN EAST BAY IS REALLY LACKING AND THERE HAS BEEN
3 PROMISES MADE AND BROKEN ABOUT EXPANDING COVERAGE, INCLUDING
4 E-BIKES IN THE EAST BAY. SO THIS PUBLIC LED PROCESS IN TERMS
5 OF PUBLIC INVESTMENTS AND SUBSIDIES AND INCREASING COVERAGE IS
6 REALLY NEEDED. I ALSO WANT TO SAY THIS CONVERSATION NEEDS TO
7 MOVE FORWARD AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL IN TERMS OF A SUBSIDIZED
8 PUBLICLY OWNED SYSTEM BECAUSE IF NOT SAN FRANCISCO IS TALKING
9 ABOUT BREAKING OUT AND DOING THEIR OWN PUBLICLY OWNED SYSTEM
10 WHICH WILL LEAST EAST BAY AND SOUTH BAY IN THE LUNCH, WE NEED
11 LEADERSHIP ON THIS OTHERWISE CONTINUE TO SEE SAN FRANCISCO
12 MAKE DECISIONS THAT HURT THE REGION OVERALL. WE NEED TO LOOK
13 FORWARD AND CONTINUE PERFORMANCE PROCESSING AND GETTING BETTER
14 COVERAGE ESPECIALLY IN FIRST AND LAST MILE CONNECT TO BART,
15 DEEP EAST OAKLAND AND OTHER PARTS OF THE EAST BAY.

16
17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
18 HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

19
20 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** THANKS MARTHA. THAT'S BEEN GREAT
21 HEARING FROM THE FOLKS WHO ARE OUT IN THE FIELD AND EXPERIENCE
22 THIS ON A DAILY BASIS. I KNOW STAFF WILL TAKE THAT INFORMATION
23 TO HEART AND MOVE FORWARD WITH SOME GREAT SUGGESTIONS. WITH
24 THAT BEING SAID WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX
25 WHICH IS OUR PUBLIC COMMENT, OTHER BUSINESS SECTION. AND,



NOVEMBER 4, 2022

1 MARTHA THIS, SINCE IT IS PUBLIC COMMENT, DO WE HAVE ANY FOLKS
2 OR ORGANIZATIONS WITH ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS THAT
3 WERE RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 YESTERDAY? AND
4 IF SO, READ THEM INTO THE RECORD.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
7 ON THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
8 HANDS RAISED.

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, CHAIR:** OKAY OUR NEXT ITEM IS OUR
11 ADJOURNMENT THEN. OUR NEXT MEETING OF THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE
12 WILL BE FRIDAY DECEMBER 9TH, 2022, AT 9:35 ANY CHANGES TO THE
13 SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THIS MEETING OF
14 THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE IS NOW ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33



Broadcasting Government