# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript





1	JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE
2	ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE
3	FRIDAY, JUNE 10, 2022 9:40 AM
4	
5	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING. I'M BERKELEY MAYOR JESSE
6	ARREQUIN CHAIR OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. I
7	WOULD LIKE TO NOW CALL MEETING TO ORDER AND ASK THE
8	BROADCASTING TEAM TO PLAY THE COVID-19 ANNOUNCEMENT RECORDING.
9	[RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19,
10	THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO
11	THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN
12	REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST
13	ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS,
14	PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT
15	THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING
16	COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND
17	ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
18	ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
19	OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
20	USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
21	CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
22	ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
23	PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
24	NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
25	MOLINTARY WRITTEN DIBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT



1	INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
2	THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
3	READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
4	LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR
5	HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
6	TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
7	PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
8	NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
9	MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.
10	
11	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE
12	CLERK TO CONDUCT ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM QUORUM.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR ARREGUIN?
15	
16	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: PRESENT.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR LICCARDO?
19	
20	SAM LICCARDO, V. CHAIR: PRESENT.
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER AHN?
23	

24

25

EDDIE AHN: HERE.



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA?
2	
3	DAVID CANEPA: HERE.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CONNOLY?
6	
7	DAMON CONNOLLY: HERE.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI? DUTRA-VERNACI DO THE HERE.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: EKLUND?
12	
13	PAT EKLUND: HERE.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING? IS ABSENT. MEMBER GIACOPINI NON-
16	VOTING?
17	
18	DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: HALLIDAY?
21	
22	BARBARA HALLIDAY: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: HUDSON?
25	



1	DAVID E. HUDSON: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAR? IS ABSENT. MEMBER MITCHOFF? I SEE SHE
4	IS THERE. MEMBER PEDROZA?
5	
6	KAREN MITCHOFF: I'M HERE. I THOUGHT I HAD IT OFF MUTE.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER PEDROZA? IS
9	
10	ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER RABBIT?
13	
14	DAVID RABBIT: HERE.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER RAMOS?
17	
18	BELIA RAMOS: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT. MEMBER SPERING?
21	MEMBER SPERING IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM.
22	
23	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS US TO
24	OUR NEXT ITEM. ITEM TWO, THE CONSENT CALENDAR, WHICH CHIEFS OF
25	ITEMS 2A AND 2B. ITEM 2A IS APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MAY



13TH, 2022 AND ITEM 2B IS LEGISLATIVE HISTORY. THIS IS AN 1 ACTION ITEM. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS THAT WISH TO PULL AN ITEM 2 3 FROM THE CALENDAR FOR DISCUSSION OR A MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR? 4 5 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: MOVE. 6 7 8 DAVID E. HUDSON: SECOND. 9 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: MOVED BY LICCARDO SECOND BY HUDSON. 10 11 COLLEAGUES ANY DISCUSSION? SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK THE CLERK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 15 16 ON THIS ITEM. 17 18 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. UNLESS THERE IS FURTHER 19 DISCUSSIONS ON THE MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL. 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WILL DO. CHAIR ARREGUIN? 23 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: YES.

24





1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR LICCARDO?
2	
3	SAM LICCARDO, V. CHAIR: YES.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?
6	
7	EDDIE AHN: YES.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA?
10	
11	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DONNELLY?
14	
15	DAMON CONNOLLY: AYE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
18	
19	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YES.
20	
	CLERK OF THE BOARD: EKLUND?
22	
23	PAT EKLUND: AYE.
24	
25	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMMING IS ABSENT. HALLIDAY?





BARBARA HALLIDAY: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: HUDSON? DAVID E. HUDSON: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAR? IS MEANT. MEMBER MITCHOFF? KAREN MITCHOFF: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER PEDROZA? ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER RABBIT? DAVID RABBIT: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: RAMOS? BELIA RAMOS: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF? IS ABSENT. MEMBER SPERING? IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT 



1 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS 2 3 US TO ITEM THREE REGIONAL STATE LEGISLATION ITEM 3A IS ASSEMBLY BILL 2519 PAYMENT TOLL PENALTIES THIS WOULD LOWER THE 4 5 MAXIMUM PENALTIES REQUIRE PAYMENT PLANS FOR TOLL PENALTIES MINIMUM CUSTOMER SERVICE HOURS OF OPERATION THIS IS AN ACTION 6 7 ITEM. REBECCA LONG WILL PRESENT ON THIS ITEM. 8 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN, DIRECTORS, I'M 9 REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AFFAIRS. THIS IS ASSEMBLY 10 BILL ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON, FUNDAMENTAL 11 WORK WE HAVE BEEN DOING. THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY 12 INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY HAS BEEN WORKING ON THE 13 EXPRESS LANES EQUITY PROGRAM WE AS DISCUSSED IN LENGTH TWO 14 DAYS AGO AT THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. SEEKING A BILL THAT IS 15 16 IMPLEMENTED THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH OBJECTIVES TO MAKE PENALTIES LESS BURDENSOME TO FIND WAYS TO BRING MORE MOTORISTS 17 INTO THE FASTRAK CUSTOMER SPACE AND INCREASE ACCESS TO 18 TRANSPONDERS ET CETERA, WE ARE IN LINE WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER 19 TING AND APPRECIATE HIS LEADERSHIP IN HAD THIS SPACE. THE BILL 20 HAS A LOT OF PROBLEMS, I WOULD SAY, IN PRINT RIGHT NOW. WE 21 22 HAVE BEEN WORK THROUGH ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE, AND THE TOLL AGENCIES ALL THE THINGS WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE. WE ARE 23 RECOMMENDING A SUPPORT IF AMENDED POSITION. I CAN SHARE THOSE 24

AMENDMENTS WE'RE ASKING FOR ARE ONES THAT THE STAFF IN





- 1 ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE HAVE CONVEYED THEY SUPPORT. THE
- 2 CONVERSATION IS ONGOING. I WILL SHARE THAT IN LIGHT OF THE
- 3 ACTIONS TAKEN AND THE PRESENTATION ON WEDNESDAY RELATED TO THE
- 4 DMV HOLD, THERE IS SOME ADDITIONAL CONCERN ABOUT THE OVERALL
- 5 SITUATION, I WOULD SAY, AS IT RELATES TO TOLL BRIDGES AND
- 6 COLLECTING OUTSTANDING PENALTIES. AND, SO, THERE ARE SOME
- 7 PIECES THAT I THINK ARE NOT COMPLETELY RESOLVED AS IT RELATES
- 8 TO THE STRUCTURE OF A PAYMENT PLAN BUT WHAT WE ARE ASKING FOR
- 9 TODAY IS A SUPPORT IF AMENDED POSITION AS LAID OUT IN THE
- 10 BILL. AND WE WILL, YOU KNOW, CONTINUE TO WORK CLOSELY WITH
- 11 ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE. I WILL SHARE, AS WE OUTLINED IN
- 12 THE MEMO, ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING HAS INDICATED THAT HE FULLY
- 13 SUPPORTS TOLLS AND COLLECTION OF TOLLS, WHICH IS SOMETHING YOU
- 14 HAVE HEARD OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND OUR CFO EMPHASIZE MANY
- 15 TIMES THAT WE CANNOT COMPROMISE OUR ABILITY TO COLLECT THE
- 16 TOLL REVENUE WHICH IS SO VITAL TO OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM.
- 17 AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING SHARES THAT GOAL. SO, I THINK, YOU
- 18 KNOW, WE ARE VERY OPTIMISTIC WE CAN GET TO A PLACE THAT WE
- 19 FULLY SUPPORT THE BILL. IT WILL BE HEARD IN COMMITTEE LATER
- 20 THIS MONTH, LITERALLY ON THE SAME DAY AS THE COMMISSION
- 21 MEETING SO WHAT WE'RE ASKING FOR TODAY IS FOR YOU TO TAKE THIS
- 22 POSITION OF SUPPORT IF AMENDED AND ALLOW US TO COMMUNICATE ON
- 23 AN URGENCY BASIS THAT POSITION AND THEN THAT WOULD BE GET
- 24 RATIFIED AT THE COMMISSION MEETING. I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY



- 1 QUESTIONS. THERE IS A LOT OF DETAILS FURTHER OUTLINED IN THE
- 2 MEMO. THANK YOU.

3

- 4 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU, REBECCA, IN ADDITION, THE
- 5 MEMO NOTE THAT WE'RE SEEKING AN AMENDMENT TO PROVIDE A PHASE-
- 6 IN OF A MINIMUM OF 18 MONTHS.

7

- 8 REBECCA LONG: THAT'S CORRECT. AND I THINK FOR, YOU KNOW, BATA,
- 9 THAT WE WERE GOING TO BE PROCEEDING ON A LOT OF THESE
- 10 POLICIES, YOU KNOW, IMMEDIATELY. WE HAVE ALREADY REDUCED OUR
- 11 PENALTIES, YOU KNOW, BEYOND THE AMOUNT THAT IS PROPOSED IN THE
- 12 CURRENT SET OF AMENDMENTS WELL BELOW THAT. AND, SO,
- 13 ADDITIONALLY, THE PAYMENT PLAN ACTIVITY IS SOMETHING THIS WE
- 14 ANTICIPATE MOVING FORWARD ON WITHIN THE NEXT, YOU KNOW,
- 15 SEVERAL MONTHS. AND, SO, THAT 18 MONTHS IS REALLY NOT
- 16 INDICATIVE OF, YOU KNOW, THE SPEED BY WHICH WE ARE GOING TO BE
- 17 WORKING ON THESE ISSUES, BUT A RECOGNITION THAT, YOU KNOW, FOR
- 18 MANY AGENCIES, STATEWIDE, THEY HAVEN'T DONE ANYTHING IN THIS
- 19 SPACE, WE'LL NEED TO HIRE NEW CONTRACTORS. AND SO, IT DOES
- 20 TAKE TIME IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR TO DO PROCUREMENTS FOR NEW
- 21 CONTRACTORS AND ALL OF THAT, AND THAT'S WHY WE'RE ASKING FOR
- 22 THAT EXTENDED IMPLEMENTATION TIME.



JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANY 1 2 QUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS? YES, 3 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI? 4 5 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN. YES, AS I READ THIS ITEM, I THOUGHT, WELL, MY GOODNESS WE'RE ALREADY DOING 6 THIS SO IT'S NICE TO SEE THAT IT'S SOMETHING THAT COULD BE 7 8 IMPLEMENTED STATEWIDE SO WE HAVE CONSISTENCY. BUT WHAT MY OUESTION IS, I DID NOT WATCH WEDNESDAY'S MEETINGS. SO, 9 10 REBECCA, YOU MADE A COMMENT, ONE OF THE ISSUES IS A CONCERN ABOUT A DMV HOLD. SO, SINCE I DIDN'T SEE THE MEETING OR -- I'M 11 WONDERING IF YOU CAN TELL ME WHAT THE DMV HOLD IS, AND WHAT'S 12 THE ISSUE AROUND IT? 13 14 REBECCA LONG: I'LL DOLL MY BEST AND I'LL TURN TO OUR EXECUTIVE 15 16 DIRECTOR IF I NEED HELP. WHAT WAS PRESENTED, WE HAVE SUSPENDED 17 TRANSFERRING OUTSTANDING VIOLATIONS TO THE DMV, WHICH THEN PUTS AHOLD ON A PERSON'S ABILITY TO RENEW THEIR VEHICLE 18 REGISTRATION. THAT IS A VERY COMMON AND VERY IMPORTANT TOOL 19 THAT WE HAVE TO ENSURE THAT UNPAID TOLLS ARE COLLECTED. 20 21 HOWEVER, DUE TO THE RAPID TRANSITION TO ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING, WE PRESENTATION TO THAT AND WE HAVE NOT DONE IT 22 REALLY SINCE THE PANDEMIC. WE NOW HAVE \$50 MILLION IN 23 OUTSTANDING TOLLS THAT HAVE NOT BEEN COLLECTED, AND THAT'S WHY 24

WE ARE NOW TALKING ABOUT HOW TO REDO AND BEGIN THAT AGAIN. AND



IN THAT PRESENTATION, RIGHT, IT WAS SHARED THAT THERE ARE, YOU 1 KNOW, OVER 500,000 OUTSTANDING TOLL PENALTIES FOR INDIVIDUAL, 2 3 YOU KNOW, REGISTERED OWNERS THAT ARE SUBJECT TO POTENTIALLY BEING ON DMV HOLD. AND THAT IS A VERY LARGE NUMBER. AND THAT 4 5 RAISED CONCERNS FOR THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER ABOUT THE IMPACT OF THAT. I WILL SHARE THAT THE ACTION THAT WAS TAKEN WAS LIMITED 6 TO RENEWING THE DMV HOLD FOR COMMERCIAL VEHICLES ONLY. SO 7 THOSE ARE FLEET VEHICLES. AND WE ARE BEGINNING A PAYMENT PLAN 8 PROCESS TO ENSURE THAT IF AND WHEN WE DO BEGIN THE NEW DMV 9 10 HOLD, AGAIN, PEOPLE ARE GOING TO HAVE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO THE SIGN UP FOR A PAYMENT PLAN, AND ONCE THEY'RE IN THAT 11 PAYMENT PLAN, THEY WOULD NOT HAVE THEIR VEHICLE PUT ON HOLD. 12 THEY IT WOULD BE ABLE TO RENEW THEIR REGISTRATION. SO, WE'RE 13 REALLY DOING A PHASED IMPLEMENTATION, BUT, YOU KNOW, IT CAUGHT 14 15 THE ATTENTION, AS I SAID, OF THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER, BECAUSE THE 16 VOLUME IS SO LARGE. AND SO THAT'S WHY I THINK THEY ARE INTERESTED IN JUST THINKING A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT, YOU KNOW, 17 HOW DO FOLKS CATCH UP WITH A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF UNPAID 18 PENALTIES, PARTICULARLY FOR LOW-INCOME. 19 20

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: THANK YOU FOR THE EXPLANATION. 21

- THERESE MCMILLAN: AND THE ONE THING I WOULD ADD, REBECCA DID A 23
- GOOD JOB SUMMARIZING THE KEY ELEMENTS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO 24
- REMIND, YOU KNOW WE SUSPENDED SENDING VEHICLES TO DMV WE DID 25





- 1 NOT ELIMINATE THE PROCESS OF SENDING THEM. QUITE FRANKLY,
- 2 WE'RE COGNIZANT OF THE CHALLENGES IN SWITCHING SO QUICKLY,
- 3 FROM A SITUATION WHERE PAYING IN CASH AT SOURCE WAS AN OPTION
- 4 WITH TOLL TAKERS AT THE BOOTH, TO, AS YOU RECALL, OVERNIGHT,
- 5 THAT SITUATION GOING AWAY BECAUSE OF THE COVID PANDEMIC AND
- 6 THE HEALTH RELATED ISSUES. SO WE HAVE BEEN -- AND THE
- 7 COMMISSIONERS ACTED, AS BATA, HAS BEEN EXTREMELY IN TUNE TO
- 8 THE FACT THAT THAT IS A VERY DISRUPTIVE ENVIRONMENT, BUT AT
- 9 THE SAME TIME, AS REBECCA JUST OUTLINED, FROM A FINANCIAL
- 10 STANDPOINT -- AND, AGAIN, DEREK IS HERE -- THE FINANCIAL
- 11 EXPOSURE OF THE AGENCY OF NOT COLLECTING THOSE TOLLS IS
- 12 SIGNIFICANT. AND FOR THE METAPHORS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO STRIKE
- 13 HERE IS MOVE FORWARD WITH A SITUATION WHERE WE CAN REINSTATE
- 14 THE PROCESS OF SENDING OUTSTANDING VIOLATIONS TO DMV BUT
- 15 CREATING A PROCESS WHEREBY OUALIFYING LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS
- 16 AND WE'RE USING BASICALLY THE SAME PILLARS AND STRUCTURES WE
- 17 HAVE FOR CLIPPER START WHICH HAS BEEN VERY WELL-RECEIVED, THAT
- 18 THERE IS TIME, AND A CLEAR WINDOW FOR THOSE FOLKS TO BE
- 19 IDENTIFIED AND ESSENTIALLY SIGN UP, AS REBECCA SAID, SUCH THAT
- 20 THEIR VEHICLES WOULD NOT BE SENT PENDING SUCCESSFUL
- 21 PARTICIPATION IN THE PAYMENT PLAN TO RESOLVE THEIR OUTSTANDING
- 22 DEBT. SO IT'S COMPLICATED. WE'RE ADMITTING THAT UPFRONT AND IT
- 23 WILL TAKE SOME TIME. BECAUSE IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO SAY
- 24 WE'RE NOT RELEASING OVER 500, YOU KNOW, THOUSAND VEHICLES
- 25 TOMORROW, TO DMV. IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT WE WILL BE



- 1 WORKING VERY CLOSELY WITH STAKEHOLDERS AND OTHERS AMONG OTHERS
- 2 TO DEVELOP A ROBUST PUBLIC OUTREACH PROGRAM TO ENSURE THAT WE
- 3 CAN GET THE WORD OUT THAT SUCH AN OPTION FOR QUALIFYING LOW-
- 4 INCOME INDIVIDUALS WOULD BE PUT INTO PLACE.

5

- 6 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: I THINK THIS'S SO IMPORTANT. THANK YOU,
- 7 THERESE, BECAUSE AS WE TRY TO WORK WITH OUR EOUITY PRIORITY
- 8 COMMUNITIES IT'S SO IMPORTANT FOR THEM TO KEEP MOBILE SO THEY
- 9 CAN GET TO WORK AND SUPPORT THEIR FAMILIES. THANK YOU.

10

11 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

- 13 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. YOU KNOW, IN THE DISCUSSION ON
- 14 WEDNESDAY, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT EMERGED WAS THAT THERE IS A
- 15 SENSE THAT JUST IN STATE LAW LIMES, OUR ABILITY TO COMMUNICATE
- 16 WITH OUR CUSTOMERS TO BE ABLE TO OFFER THEM PAYMENT PLANS, TO
- 17 BE ABLE TO KIND OF REACH OUT TO THEM PROACTIVELY ABOUT THIS,
- 18 AND MAKE -- AND -- AND SO, I WAS WONDERING IF, YOU KNOW, MY
- 19 SENSE OF THE DISCUSSION ON WEDNESDAY IS THAT THE BATA O
- 20 COMMITTEE WANTED TO PUT INTO PLACE AS ROBUST AN OUTREACH PLAN
- 21 AS POSSIBLE. AND I WAS HOPING -- AND I WAS GOING TO ASK THE
- 22 QUESTION, CAN WE INCORPORATE INTO THIS BILL? CAN WE DISCUSS
- 23 INCORPORATE INTO THIS BILL PROVISIONS WHICH ALLOW US TO HAVE
- 24 THE SORT OF THE TYPE -- THE KIND OF THE TYPE OF ROBUST



PROACTIVE ROBUST OUTREACH TO INDIVIDUALS TO HELP THOSE WHO 1 2 HAVE FALLEN BEHIND IN THEIR PAYMENTS? 3 REBECCA LONG: I HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH GENERAL COUNSEL ON 4 5 SPECIFIC LANGUAGE AND WE'RE GOING TO BE SHARING THAT WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE BY THE END OF TODAY. TO BE CLEAR 6 NOTWITHSTANDING OTHER RESTRICTIONS WE CAN BASICALLY ADVERTISE, 7 8 PROMOTE THE PAYMENT PLAN WITH ANY NOTICES THAT GO OUT, INVOICES, TOLL VIOLATION NOTICES, ET CETERA. 9 10 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: WHAT ABOUT BEING ABLE TO PROACTIVELY REACH 11 OUT TO SOMEONE AND SAY HEY THERE IS A PAYMENT PLAN FOR THE 12 DEBT THAT YOU OWE US, NOT AS PART OF INVOICING, BUT JUST 13 SPECIFICALLY REACHING OUT TO PEOPLE BY LETTER, BY E-MAIL, BY 14 15 TEXT, LETTING THEM KNOW THAT WE HAVE PAYMENT PLANS AVAILABLE? 16 REBECCA LONG: I NEED TO CHECK ON THAT. ONE OF THE LIMITATIONS 17 WE HAVE IS THAT THE DMV, THE WAY THAT WE CONTACT MOTORISTS IS 18 THROUGH THE VEHICLE REGISTRATION SYSTEM. AND E-MAILS AND CELL 19 PHONES AND ALL OF THAT ARE NOT COLLECTED AS PART OF THAT 20 21 REGISTRATION SYSTEM. AND, YOU KNOW, THAT JUST IS THE CASE. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, OUR HANDS ARE A LITTLE BIT TIED TO USE MORE 22 MODERN FORMS OF COMMUNICATION, I THINK, AS THERESE MENTIONED 23 WE'RE PLANNING A ROBUST GENERAL POPULATION CAMPAIGN TO LET 24

PEOPLE KNOW THAT VIA SOCIAL MEDIA OTHER AND TOOLS TO GET THE



- 1 WORD OUT. AND CAN WE PROACTIVELY REACH OUT TO CUSTOMERS WHO -2 OR, TO SAY, MOTORISTS ON WHO HAVE OUTSTANDING DEBT UNDER THE
- 3 LANGUAGE WE'RE WORKING ON BUT I CAN'T GUARANTEE THAT RIGHT
- 4 NOW.

5

- 6 THERESE MCMILLAN: ANOTHER VERY IMPORTANT ACKNOWLEDGMENT THAT
- 7 WE HAD AT THE WEDNESDAY B BATA O DISCUSSION IS ANYTHING
- 8 RELATED TO USING PERSONAL IDENTIFIABLE INFORMATION, PII, IN
- 9 THIS SPACE, THERE IS A VERY IMPORTANT RECOGNITION OF THE
- 10 LITIGATION SITUATION SURROUNDING THAT: I THINK EVERYONE
- 11 APPRECIATES THAT. I THINK IT'S -- IT IS IN AND OF ITSELF, NO
- 12 MATTER WHERE YOU SIT ON THE ISSUE, WE'LL BE A LIMITING FACTOR
- 13 INTO WHAT WE CAN DO OR PERHAPS IMPORTANTLY HOW QUICKLY WE CAN
- 14 DO THINGS. SO, VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, TO YOUR, YOU KNOW,
- 15 CONCERN OF, ARE WE PURSUING WHAT IS THE REALM OF THE POSSIBLE,
- 16 YES. BUT, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT, AS WE WORK
- 17 THROUGH THIS, THERE IS A LOT OF RELATED CONSIDERATIONS AND
- 18 FACTORS THAT JUST MAKE THAT ROAD COMPLICATED AND WE'LL BE
- 19 DOING THE BEST WE CAN IN THAT CIRCUMSTANCE.

- 21 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO, YOU KNOW, I, FOR SURE UNDERSTAND THAT. WE
- 22 DO HAVE A LOT OF INFORMATION ON A LOT OF OUR DRIVERS INCLUDING
- 23 E-MAIL AND PHONE BECAUSE THEY SIGN UP FOR FASTRAK. AND, SO, I
- 24 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE GET -- THAT WE PURSUE STATE
- 25 AUTHORIZATION TO ALLOW US TO USE AN E-MAIL THAT SOMEONE HAS



GIVEN US AS PART OF THEIR FASTRAK APPLICATION TO REACH OUT TO 1 THEM OR CELL PHONE TO REACH OUT TO THEM TO TELL THEM THAT A 2 3 PAYMENT PLAN IS AVAILABLE. AND MY UNDERSTANDING FROM TALKING TO THE GENERAL COUNSEL, AND MAYBE KATHLEEN, IF YOU WANT TO 4 5 PIPE UP, WE'RE NOT GETTING SUED ABOUT OUR ABILITY TO REACH OUT -- WE'RE GOT GETTING SUED AROUND OUR AGENCY REACHING OUT TO 6 PEOPLE ABOUT PAYMENT PLANS BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T REALLY HAD A 7 8 FORMAL PAYMENT PLAN PROCESS. MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT ON PII WE HAVE RELATIVELY MORE LEEWAY AROUND BEING ABLE TO SORT OF 9 10 MAKE CHANGES TO STATE LEGISLATION TO ALLOW US TO REACH OUT AROUND PAYMENT PLANS. BUT I'M OBVIOUSLY SUPER NOT AN EXPERT ON 11 THIS. SO, MAYBE KATHLEEN, DO YOU WANT TO JUMP THROUGH THE 12 CHAIR, IF THAT'S OKAY? 13 14 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: YES, GENERAL COUNSEL ARE YOU HERE? 15 16 KATHLEEN KANE: I AM HERE. AND, AS THERESE NOTED, THIS IS 17 DELICATE FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS, RIGHT? IT'S AN ISSUE THAT'S 18 BEING WORKED OUT LEGISLATIVELY, AND ALSO SOME PARTS IN THE 19 COURTS SO WE HAVE TO BE CIRCUMSPECT ABOUT IT. BUT, YES, WE 20 21 HAVE NOT BEEN -- BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN YET, AND THE ITEM THAT BATA O JUST THIS WEEK WAS PARTIALLY ABOUT HOW DO 22 WE GET THE WORD OUT AND THAT'S SOMETHING STAFF IS GOING TO BE 23 WORKING ON. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT REBECCA AND THE SORT OF 24 STATEWIDE TOLLING AGENCIES AND OURSELVES ARE WORKING ON IS CAN 25



- 1 WE PROVIDE PERSPECTIVE COVER TO A MORE ROBUST AND MORE DIRECT
- 2 OUTREACH FOR PAYMENT PLANS, SPECIFICALLY, AND HOW THAT FITS IN
- 3 WITH THE REST OF THE STATUTORY STRUCTURE, LEGISLATIVE
- 4 STRUCTURE, FOR COMMUNICATIONS, GENERALLY. IN GENERAL, THOUGH,
- 5 SO THE COMMITTEE IS AWARE, WE HAVE MORE LATITUDE COMMUNICATING
- 6 ON VIOLATION NOTICES THAN WE DO IN OTHER AREAS UNDER EXISTING
- 7 LAW. SO IT'S SOMETHING WE'RE LOOKING AT CAREFUL AND MAKING
- 8 SURE WE ADHERE TO OUR CURRENT STRUCTURES AND ALSO IF WE CAN
- 9 PRY OPEN SOME BREATHES ROOM ON THAT RESPONSIBLY, WE WILL DO
- 10 THAT AS WELL. AND IT'S SOMETHING THAT'S KIND OF A WORK IN PROS
- 11 PROGRESS RIGHT NOW, THAT'S A SUBJECT OF CONSIDERABLE FOCUS AND
- 12 MAKING SURE THAT WE TRY TO, AS REBECCA SAID, THREAD THAT
- 13 NEEDLE AS BEST AS POSSIBLE. IT'S CLEAR THAT THE GOAL IS TO
- 14 REACH OUT TO THE FOLKS WHO NEED THIS AND WILL QUALIFY. SO
- 15 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE ALL SHARE. AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING
- 16 CERTAINLY DOES, AS WELL. SO THERE IS AN ALIGNMENT OF INTEREST
- 17 MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN COMMUNICATE AS BEST AS POSSIBLE TO
- 18 THIS GROUP AND ALSO ENSURE THAT WE DO NOT DO IT IN A WAY THAT
- 19 CREATES A LOT OF DRAG FROM OTHER CORRIDORS. SO WE'RE TRYING TO
- 20 MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN ACHIEVE THOSE RESULTS.

- 22 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I APPRECIATE THAT. AND I THINK, IF WE END UP
- 23 IN A SITUATION WHERE WE CANNOT E-MAIL SOMEONE WHO IS A
- 24 CUSTOMER OF OURS TO LET THEM KNOW THAT THEY ARE ELIGIBLE FOR A
- 25 PAYMENT PLAN, IT'S -- I MEAN, IT'S JUST LIKE A FARCE. I MEAN,



- 1 THIS IS LIKE, WHY -- THIS IS THE TYPE OF STUFF THAT REGULAR
- 2 PEOPLE JUST CANNOT UNDERSTAND, LIKE, HOW GOVERNMENT DOESN'T --
- 3 KIND OF ACT, SOMETIMES, IN THE WAY THAT IT DOES. AND
- 4 ESPECIALLY IF THEY HAVE GIVEN US E-MAILS. SO I'M REALLY HOPING
- 5 THAT WE CAN BE AS -- WE CAN BE AS AGGRESSIVE AS POSSIBLE GIVEN
- 6 THE LITIGATION RISK AND HELPING US COMMUNICATE TO OUR
- 7 CUSTOMERS, ESPECIALLY LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, THAT WE HAVE PAYMENT
- 8 PLANS AVAILABLE FOR THEM.

9

10 KATHLEEN KANE: THAT'S CERTAINLY THE SHARED GOAL.

11

- 12 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL GO NEXT TO
- 13 COMMISSIONER WORTH.

- 15 AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. FIRST OF ALL, AS CHAIR OF
- 16 THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE, I WANT TO
- 17 SHARE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS AND CLARIFICATIONS. I CONCUR WITH
- 18 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO WORK
- 19 WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING TO IDENTIFY OPPORTUNITIES WE HAVE
- 20 THROUGH THIS LEGISLATION RELATIVE TO COMMUNICATE. DURING OUR
- 21 WORK IN THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS DURING ARE THE PANDEMIC AS A
- 22 COMMISSION AND AUTHORITY REALLY COME TO UNDERSTAND THE
- 23 CHALLENGES OF HAVING AN ENTERPRISE THAT'S SOLE BASED ON TOLLS
- 24 WHICH IS WHAT OUR BRIDGES ARE. WE DON'T RECEIVE ANY OTHER
- 25 STATE FUNDING FOR THE BRIDGES. THE TOLL FEES THROUGH BONDING





- 1 ON THOSE DOLLARS HAS ENABLED US TO DO THE SEISMIC RETROFIT AND
- 2 MAINTENANCE AND OTHER THINGS THAT ARE OUR FIDUCIARY
- 3 RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE BRIDGES. AND AT THE SAME TIME, WITH
- 4 THE, YOU KNOW, LACK OF THE ABILITY TO DO CASH PAYMENTS ON
- 5 TOLLS, THIS HAS CREATED A HARDSHIP AND THAT'S WHY I THINK THE
- 6 WORK THAT, ESPECIALLY FOR OUR LOW-INCOME RIDERS, AND I THINK
- 7 THAT'S WHERE THE WORK OF OUR STAFF AND OUR COMMISSION AND OUR
- 8 AUTHORITY, THIS LAST YEAR, IS SO IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF
- 9 RECOGNIZING THAT WE HAVE THIS FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBLE TO COLLECT
- 10 THE TOLLS AND AT THE SAME TIME, WE WANT TO PUT ALL OF OUR
- 11 RESOURCES AND PERFECTS INTO A SUBSTANTIAL EFFORT THAT WILL
- 12 SUPPORT AND HELP OUR LOW-INCOME CUSTOMERS WHO ARE NEEDING TO
- 13 USE THE BRIDGES. SO, I AGREE P I THINK THAT, IT'S IMPORTANT
- 14 THAT WE CONTINUE THOSE CONVERSATIONS WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING,
- 15 WITH OUR GENERAL COUNSEL TO SEE WHAT WE CAN DO. AND ONE OF THE
- 16 IMPORTANT ELEMENT, FOR EXAMPLE, IN THIS BILL, IS, I THINK, THE
- 17 FACT THERE ARE TWO TIMES TO ADDRESS WITH THE DMV ONE TIME IS
- 18 THE DRIVER'S LICENSE, AND ONE IS THE CAR OR TRUCK AND NOT
- 19 NECESSARILY THERE IS A CONNECTION SO THAT IF SOMEBODY KNOWS
- 20 THEY HAVE TO CHANGE ONE ADDRESS THE CARS, THERE ISN'T
- 21 CONNECTION IN TERMS OF COMMUNICATING AND YES THAT INCLUDES ANY
- 22 VEHICLE THAT IS A PERSON MIGHT OWN. SO I THINK THERE IS SOME
- 23 IMPORTANT REFORMS THERE IN THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER AND I THINK AS
- 24 THE STATE LEGISLATURE ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING ITSELF ABILITY TO
- 25 COMMUNICATE WITH THE STATE AGENCY AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THE





- 1 WORK THAT HE IS DOING WITH THIS BILL. AND AS YOU KNOW FROM THE
- 2 STATISTIC LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN CHANGED, LOWERED OUR TOLL
- 3 FEES, TOLL FINES, WE HAVE EXPANDED THE NUMBER LOCATIONS WHERE
- 4 IS INDIVIDUALS CAN PURCHASE TOLL TAG OR TOLL CREDITS WE HAVE
- 5 THE PROGRAMS THESE REFORMS ARE EXTREMELY PERSONALITY THERE IS
- 6 A STATEWIDE BILL AND A LOT OF THE EXPRESS LANES AROUND STATE,
- 7 THAT'S SIGNIFICANT AND IT'S CERTAINLY IMPORTANT THIS BILL PASS
- 8 AS IT PROVIDES REFORMS FOR ALL THE TOLL OPERATIONS THROUGHOUT
- 9 THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. AND I WANT TO THE THANK OUR STAFF. I
- 10 KNOW REBECCA LONG SERVES ON THE STATEWIDE TOLL ASSOCIATION --
- 11 YOU KNOW, TOLL AUTHORITIES ASSOCIATION, SO THAT RECOGNIZING
- 12 THAT THIS BILL WOULD IMPACT EVERYONE. BUT I REALLY APPRECIATE
- 13 HIS WORK IN BRINGING THIS FORWARD. I KNOW THAT THIS IS A REAL
- 14 COMMITMENT THAT HE SHARES, AS WELL AS HIS STAFF IN TERMS OF
- 15 YOU KNOW THE EXPERIENCE THAT RIDERS ARE EXPERIENCING. AND
- 16 AGAIN I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT STAFF HAS INDICATED AND
- 17 CERTAINLY IN CONVERSATIONS WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER, THAT HE
- 18 UNDERSTANDS THE FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY THAT WE CERTAINLY
- 19 HAVE RELATIVE TO THE BRIDGES AND THE EXPRESS LANES. BUT ALSO
- 20 AS REBECCA INDICATED THE RECOMMENDATION THAT HE IS PUTTING
- 21 FORWARD IN THIS BILL ARE REALLY IN LINE WITH THE WORK THAT OUR
- 22 THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY HAS DONE IN TERMS OF OUR FEES AND
- 23 OUR OUTREACH. BUT I AGREE THAT A BIG PART OF THE DISCUSSION ON
- 24 FRIDAY WAS, IN FACT, BEING ABLE TO PUT TOGETHER A REALLY
- 25 ROBUST COMMUNICATION PLAN TO REACH OUR LOW-INCOME CUSTOMERS



- 1 WHO WE WANT TO SUPPORT, WE WANT TO HELP, IN TERMS OF SETTING
- 2 UP A PAYMENT PLAN AND COVERING THESE FEES. SO, JUST WANT TO
- 3 THANK STAFF AND THANK ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE. I KNOW
- 4 THAT HIS DISTRICT DIRECTOR IS ON THE CALL AND LOOKING FORWARD
- 5 TO HEARING HIS PURPOSE -- THEIR ADDITIONAL COMMENTS. THIS IS
- 6 AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO SUPPORT REFORMS FOR A BIGGER
- 7 STATEWIDE ISSUE ALSO. OR AN ISSUE THAT HAS BOTH LOCAL AS WELL
- 8 AS STATEWIDE IMPLICATIONS TO REALLY IMPROVE HOW WE, IN THE
- 9 TRANSPORTATION INDUSTRIES, SERVE THE PUBLIC, RELATIVE TO THESE
- 10 KINDS OF PROGRAMS. SO, THANK YOU.

11

- 12 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. BEFORE I GO TO CHAIR
- 13 PEDROZA, I SEE THAT WE ARE JOINED THIS MORNING BY
- 14 ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING, THANK YOU FOR JOINING US THIS MORNING. I
- 15 WOULD LIKE TO GO TO HIM NOW GIVING THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER
- 16 OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE COMMITTEE. ASSEMBLYMEMBER, YOU
- 17 SHOULD BE ABLE TO SPEAK. GOOD MORNING.

18

- 19 PHIL TING: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. GREAT TO BE HERE. MY VIDEO IS
- 20 -- LET'S SEE IF I CAN TURN MY VIDEO ON.

21

- 22 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: LET ME MOVE YOU TO PANELIST,
- 23 ASSEMBLYMEMBER. JUST ONE SECOND. YOU SHOULD BE ON THE OTHER
- 24 SIDE.





- 1 PHIL TING: PERFECT. REALLY APPRECIATE EVERYBODY FOR HAVING ME
- 2 O I, YOU KNOW, WE REACTED AND TRIED TO JUMP ON, OR GET
- 3 INVOLVED AS SOON AS WE HEARD THE DECISION. I WILL SAY I WAS
- 4 DISAPPOINTED. I HAD A DISCUSSION WITH A STAFF MEMBER, EVEN, I
- 5 BELIEVE IT WAS -- THE DAYS ARE KIND OF FLYING BY BECAUSE WE'RE
- 6 IN THE MIDDLE OF BUDGET -- BUT I THINK IT WAS WEDNESDAY
- 7 MORNING WHERE I GOT ZERO -- TUESDAY MORNING, WHERE I GOT ZERO
- 8 HEADS UP THAT MTC WAS TAKING ACTION. I GOT ZERO HEADS UP ON
- 9 WHAT THE ACTION WAS, AND I GOT ZERO INFORMATION UNTIL I GOT,
- 10 LIKE EVERYBODY ELSE, THROUGHOUT PRESS. I WANT TO THANK REBECCA
- 11 LONG, DIRECTOR MCMILLAN WORKING WITH US. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
- 12 VERY, VERY CLOSELY. WEEKLY, BIWEEKLY, NUMEROUS CONVERSATIONS,
- 13 REALLY, TO GET THIS BILL INTO A GOOD PLACE. WAS REALLY EXCITED
- 14 TO SEE THE ADOPTION OF ONE OF OUR IDEAS WERE THE PAYMENT PLAN
- 15 FOR LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS. YOU KNOW, I WILL SAY, IMITATION IS
- 16 THE BEST FORM OF FLATTERY. SO IT'S WONDERFUL WE CAN ADOPT
- 17 THOSE THINGS AND WE WOULD LOVE TO SEE, YOU KNOW, ALL OF OUR
- 18 IDEAS ADOPTED, THAT MAKES SENSE FOR THE BAY AREA TOLL
- 19 AUTHORITY, AS WITH THE EXPRESS LANES. TO GIVE A LITTLE BIT OF
- 20 HISTORY, I WAS SURPRISED JUST HAVING STAFF CONVERSATIONS, HOW
- 21 THERE WAS JUST A LACK OF, IN MY OPINION, SENSITIVITY TO OUR
- 22 MANY, MANY DRIVERS WHO WOULD NOT -- WHO DON'T HAVE ACCESS TO
- 23 BANK ACCOUNTS, DON'T HAVE BANK ACCOUNTS, DON'T HAVE CREDIT
- 24 CARDS THAT'S A BIG ISSUE IN OUR MAY, AND IN A NUMBER OF
- 25 LOCATIONS A MAJOR FOCUS. FASTRAK IS CONVENIENT FOR ME. I HAVE



- 1 A CREDIT CARD, AND A BANK ACCOUNT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
- 2 WHAT USED TO BE A VERY CONVENIENT PAYMENT, YOU PULL UP TO A
- 3 TOLL, GIVE SOME CASH, PAY, THEY GO ON THEIR WAY, HAS NOW
- 4 BECOME INCONVENIENT FOR A SMALL GROUP OF PEOPLE, BUT, AGAIN,
- 5 THESE ARE OUR MOST VULNERABLE INDIVIDUALS IN OUR REGION. I
- 6 THINK IT'S JUST SO IMPORTANT THAT WE REMEMBER, NOT ALL THE
- 7 FOLKS WHO DO HAVE CREDIT CARDS, WHO DO HAVE FASTRAKS,
- 8 SEAMLESS. OUR EMPLOYEES WITH NOT PUTTING THEM IN THE TOLL
- 9 PLAZA. IT'S IMPORTANT AND THE HARDEST WORKING RESIDENTS, JUST
- 10 COMING NORTH TRYING TO GET TO WORK THEY ARE HAVING DIFFICULTY
- 11 PAYING A TOLL THAT'S JUST A FEW DOLLARS. THAT SHOULD BE
- 12 SIMPLE. I APPRECIATE WORKING WITH THE STAFF. WHAT I WOULD HOPE
- 13 IS THAT THERE WOULD BE IMPROVED COMMUNICATION, I WOULD SAY.
- 14 AND REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR DELIBERATION, IF WE CAN BE OF
- 15 ANY SERVICE. WE WOULD LOVE TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK ON OUR
- 16 LEGISLATION, OF COURSE, CONTINUING TO WORK WITH MEMBERS OF THE
- 17 COMMITTEE AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. THANK YOU SO MUCH.
- 19 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU ASSEMBLYMEMBER, FOR JOINING
- 20 US THIS MORNING. I WILL NOW GO TO CHAIR PEDROZA.
- 22 ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN. AND THANK YOU
- 23 ASSEMBLYMEMBER, AS WELL, FOR JOINING US. I CONCUR AS CHAIR OF
- 24 MTC, IMPROVED COMMUNICATION IS ALWAYS WELCOME. BUT I WAS A
- 25 LITTLE PRESIDE TO HEAR THAT WE WERE NOT IN CONTACT WITH YOU. I

18





- 1 BELIEVE OUR STAFF WAS TALKING TO YOU. I KNOW OUR EXECUTIVE
- 2 DIRECTOR WAS TALKING TO YOU THE DAY -- THE MORNING OF. AND I
- 3 KNOW REBECCA WAS TALKING TO YOUR STAFF, AS WELL. THE POINT IS
- 4 WE KNOW WHAT WE ARE TRYING TO DO, WE KNOW THE OUTCOMES WE ARE
- 5 TRYING TO ACHIEVE, AND WE'RE BETTER OFF WORKING TOGETHER. YOU
- 6 HAVE OUR COMMITMENT. CHAIR ARREGUIN, ABOUT THIS, WE ALL
- 7 STRUGGLE WITH COMMUNICATION. MANY OF US ARE INDEPENDENTLY
- 8 ELECTED; WE HAVE THAT CHALLENGE. HOW DO WE COMMUNICATE WITH
- 9 OUR RESIDENTS. WE HAVE TO DO MORE. WE HAVE HAD ROBUST
- 10 CONVERSATION GUIDING THAT DISCUSSION. I DO THINK THE
- 11 OPPORTUNITY HERE IS THAT WHEN WE DO RELEASE DMV HOLDS THAT
- 12 WILL CREATE OPPORTUNITY TO CREATE AWARENESS AROUND THE
- 13 SOLUTION WHICH IS TO GET THE FOLKS WE'RE TRYING TO HELP MOST
- 14 TO CREATE A PAYMENT PROGRAM TO GET THEM ON A FINANCIAL PATH TO
- 15 SUSTAINABLE. THAT'S IMPORTANT. WE'RE DOING THIS WITH A
- 16 SOLUTION. WITHOUT A SOLUTION IT WOULD BE PROBLEMATIC. THE FACT
- 17 OF THE MATTER IS THE OPPORTUNITY SOMEONE GOING TO THE DMV
- 18 REALIZING THEY CAN'T RENEW, THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO CREATE A
- 19 PAYMENT PLAN AROUND ELIGIBILITY. THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO
- 20 CREATE FOR FINANCIAL STABILITY. WE HAVE HAD A LOT OF
- 21 CONVERSATIONS AND I APPRECIATE STAFF. WE'RE TRYING TO DO SO
- 22 MUCH SO QUICK. THIS HAPPENED SO QUICKLY TO US, BUT WE ARE
- 23 REACTING. WE'RE TRYING TO DO THE RIGHT THING FOR THOSE WHO
- 24 NEED HELP THE MOST. VERY SUPPORTIVE OF THIS ACTION AND I THINK



ASSEMBLYMEMBER FOR WORKING IN LOCK STEP TO ADVANCE THE CORE 1 2 VALUES WE HAVE IN THE BAY AREA. 3 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I'LL ASK IF THERE ARE ANY 4 5 MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE THAT HAVE ANY OUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION ON THIS BILL? IF SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. IF NOT WE'LL GO 6 TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO 7 8 WISH TO SPEAK AT THIS TIME. I'LL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT. 9 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES THERE IS. AND THERE WAS NO WRITTEN 11 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE ARE THREE MEMBERS 12 OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU 13 14 LIKE TO GIVE THEM? 15 16 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: TWO MINUTES PER SPEAKER. 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. FIRST UP IS MARK CORDES HEAL. YOU 18 HAVE TWO MINUTES. 19 20 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR ARREGUIN AND MEMBERS. I'M THE 21 DISTRICT DIRECTOR FOR ASSEMBLYMEMBER PHIL TING. AND I JUST 22 WANTED TO ADD MORE CONTEXT TO WHAT REBECCA LONG SAID, WHICH IS 23 THAT, AS YOU LOOK AT THIS LEGISLATION TODAY, WE ARE IN 24

DISCUSSIONS WITH REBECCA AROUND THE POSSIBILITY OF WAIVING



- 1 FEES FOR FOLKS WHO ARE ELIGIBLE FOR THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM,
- 2 THOSE AT 200% OF POVERTY LEVEL OR LOWER AND WE ARE DISCUSSING
- 3 WAY WE COULD DO PAYMENT PLANS, AND AS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ
- 4 MENTIONED, AROUND NOTIFICATION ON THOSE PAYMENT PLANS. MY
- 5 UNDERSTANDING IS GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT DOES DO THAT. SO
- 6 THAT IS SOMETHING WE'RE ALSO LOOKING TO. AND I JUST WANTED TO
- 7 ECHO MY STATEMENT ABOUT HOW MUCH WE APPRECIATE HOW REBECCA
- 8 LONG HAS WORKED WITH US CLOSELY, AND I DON'T THINK YOU REALIZE
- 9 HOW OFTEN REBECCA HAS TALKED AND TEXTED WITH US, AND EVEN MET
- 10 WITH ME IN PERSON A FEW TIMES. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

- 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS PHONE NUMBER ENDING IN 0856.
- 13 PHONE NUMBER 0856, YOU HAVE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF BY PRESSING
- 14 STAR SIX. ARE YOU THERE?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO?

17

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HI.

19

20 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.

- 22 SPEAKER: I'M SARAH GREENWALD SPEAKING FOR 350 BAY AREA. AND WE
- 23 STRONGLY SUPPORT THE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. BECAUSE TRANSIT
- 24 RIDERS ARE CLIMATE HEROES. FOR EXAMPLE, I WAS JUST LOOKING AT
- 25 2018 FIGURES FROM THE UK'S DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS AND



- 1 INDUSTRIAL STRATEGY, BUT, WITH ONLY TEN PEOPLE ON BOARD, EMITS
- 2 ABOUT 5% OF THE CO2 EMITTED BY A GAS CAR. AS YOU KNOW 350 BAY
- 3 AREA IS AN ORGANIZATION WORKING TOWARDS CLIMATE JUSTICE AND
- 4 DECISIVE ACTION TO COMBAT THE CLIMATE EMERGENCY. SO WE APPLAUD
- 5 THIS EFFORT TO INCREASE THE ACCESSIBILITY AND EFFICIENCY AND
- 6 CONVENIENCE AND RELIABILITY OF PUBLIC TRANSIT IN OUR AREA.
- 7 THAT'S WHAT'S NEEDED. OTHERS HAVE BEEN PRAISING HOW
- 8 EFFECTIVELY THIS MEASURE WILL SUPPORT TRANSIT. I, PERSONALLY,
- 9 KNOW TRANSIT IS INCREASINGLY NECESSARY TO PEOPLE LIKE -- WELL,
- 10 SEVERAL OF MY ELDER RELATIVES HAVE GOT TO STOP DRIVING FOR
- 11 SAFETY REASONS, AND THEY NEED TRANSIT SO THEY CAN LIVE THEIR
- 12 LIVES. I'M PUTTING THAT OUT BECAUSE I'M ALSO A CONSTITUENT OF
- 13 MR. TING. SO, WE VOTE AND WE SAY, GO TRANSIT, AND THANK YOU
- 14 FOR SUPPORTING THIS LEGISLATION. THAT'S ALL.

16 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU.

- 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS EUGENE BRADLEY. GO AHEAD AND
- 19 UNMUTE YOURSELF.
- 21 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING EVERYBODY. MY NAME IS EUGENE BRADLEY. I
- 22 AM FOUNDER AND CEO OF SILICON VALLEY TRANSIT USERS, A PUBLIC
- 23 TRANSIT ADVOCACY AND WATCH DOG, AND WE MONITOR VTA TRANSIT AND
- 24 ARE ALSO A MEMBER OF VTT. I HAVE BEEN RUNNING THE GROUP
- 25 ADVOCATING FOR BETTER VTA IN SANTA CLARA AND SILICON VALLEY

15

17



- 1 SINCE 2000, YET HIGH PRICES OF RENT FORCE ME TO MOVE OUT OF
- 2 SANTA CLARA COUNTY. HOUSING AND LACK OF TRANSPORTATION,
- 3 HOUSING NOT JUST FOR WORKING CLASS FAMILIES TO BE ABLE TO LIVE
- 4 IN THE BAY AREA, LIVE RIGHT HERE, WITH JOBS SUCH AS RETAIL AND
- 5 SERVICE SECTOR THAT WE TAKE FOR GRANTED WHERE THEY WORK. ALSO
- 6 I SEE THE TRANSIT NEED AS PEOPLE LIKE THOMAS MAYER, MY FRIEND,
- 7 HE NEEDS LIGHT RAIL TO TRAVEL THAT'S NEAREST THE PLACE HE CAN
- 8 AFFORD, SO IF IT HAPPENS TO BE LIGHT RAIL, HE NEEDS
- 9 PARATRANSIT, HE IS RESTRICTED IN PRICE AND DISTANCE WHERE HE
- 10 CAN GO ON PARA TRANSIT. SO, IT'S TIME THAT STAFF ADDRESS BOTH
- 11 THE HOUSING AND THE TRANSIT CRISIS WE FACE, PARTICULARLY IN
- 12 THE BAY AREA, IF WE REALLY WANT OUR BAY AREA TO BE THE
- 13 SUSTAINABILITY THAT WE BRAG ABOUT SO MUCH. SO, LET'S GET IT
- 14 DONE, STAFF. I'M WILLING TO WORK WITH YOU TO MAKE THIS HAPPEN.
- 15 THANK YOU.

16

- 17 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I WANT TO CLARIFY THIS, IS
- 18 PUBLIC COMMENT ON ASSEMBLY BILL 2594. WE ARE HAPPY TO TAKE
- 19 COMMENTS ON THE OUESTION OF REGIONAL HOUSING AND
- 20 TRANSPORTATION MEASURES WHEN WE GET TO THE NEXT ITEM.

21

- 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS PUBLIC ADVOCATES FOLLOWED UP BY
- 23 VINITA GOYAL. PUBLIC ADVOCATES? GO AHEAD. WHOEVER IS SIGNED
- 24 INTO PUBLIC ADVOCATES.



SPEAKER: I WANT TO CONFIRM THIS IS FOR 3A WHICH CHAIR ARREGUIN 1 2 ALREADY DID. I HAVE NO COMMENTS. 3 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: ONCE AGAIN THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON 4 5 ITEM 3A ASSEMBLY BILL 2594. IF ANYONE WISHES TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND AT THIS TIME. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: LAST UP IS VINATA. 9 10 SPEAKER: NO COMMENT AT THIS TIME. I WILL SPEAK ON THE NEXT 11 ITEM. 12 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THAT'S ALL PUBLIC COMMENT. WERE THERE 13 14 WRITTEN COMMENTS? 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NONE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. 17 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: I'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE. 18 19 COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. 20 CARLOS ROMERO: I'M NOT A MEMBER OF THIS COMMITTEE THANK YOU 21 FOR ALLOWING ME TO SPEAK. I PREVIOUSLY SPOKE ABOUT THIS ISSUE, 22 23 AND I AM GLAD THAT ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING HAS TAKEN THIS ON IN

LEGISLATION, AND THAT WE ARE INDEED WORKING WITH HIM TO GET

THIS PASSED. I HAVE SOMEBODY ON MY OWN -- BELIEVE IT OR NOT,

24



ON ONE OF MY DEBIT CARDS WHO CANNOT -- IS UNBANKED HE IS USING 1 2 MY FASTRAK CARD PRIMARILY BECAUSE HE WAS FIND ABOUT \$600 AT 3 THE VERY BEGINNING OF THE PANDEMIC AND WAS REALLY WORRIED HE WAS NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO MAKE THE TOLL PAYMENTS ON TIME. HE 4 5 BEEN VERY GOOD AT PAYING THIS, AND IT'S HIGH TIME THAT WE CREATED LEGISLATION THAT MANY OF THE UNBANKED AND LOW-INCOME 6 WORKING CLASS FOLKS IN THE BAY AREA THAT ARE STRUGGLING TO 7 8 STAY HERE AND I APPLAUD THE ASSEMBLYMAN TING'S OFFICE WORKING WITH MTC TRYING TO REMEDY THE SITUATION. AND I THINK SOME OF 9 THE SOLUTIONS IN THE BILL INDEED GO A LONG WAY TO ADDRESS SOME 10 OF THE ISSUES OF ADDRESSING HOW FOLKS PAY THESE TOLLS WHEN 11 THEY CAN'T DO IT IN CASH. BECAUSE MANY STILL EXIST IN THIS 12 WORLD IN AN ALL CASH ECONOMY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 13 14 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. NEXT MAYOR LICCARDO. AND --15 16 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: SORRY. HAVING A PROBLEM WITH THE 17 MIC. I HAD TO USE TWO DEVICES. MY APOLOGIES. I WANT TO CHIME 18 IN AND THANK CHAIRMAN TING FOR HIS LEADERSHIP. 19 20 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: MAYOR HUDSON? 21 22 DAVID E. HUDSON: I THINK WE'RE ON THE RIGHT TRACK WITH THIS I 23

ALSO THANK YOU FOR THE LEGISLATION. I WOULD LIKE TO POINT

SOMETHING OUT AND THIS MAY HAVE BEEN JUST BECAUSE OF COVID,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

24





- 1 BUT THERE ARE MANY THINGS -- AND I THINK DIRECTOR JOSEFOWITZ
- 2 WAS TALKING ABOUT IT EARLIER -- THAT WE NEED TO GET TO THE
- 3 PEOPLE. WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO REACH OUT TO THE PEOPLE. I
- 4 RECEIVED PROBLEMS WITH MY FASTRAK, AND I HAD PREPAYMENT ON IT
- 5 WITH A VISA CARD. OF COURSE, IT WAS MY WIFE'S CARD SO SHE WAS
- 6 PAYING FOR IT ALL THE TIME. BUT I'M IN THE METRO CENTER, I
- 7 THOUGHT I WOULD DROP IN AND DROP OFF CASH. AND I KEPT GETTING
- 8 THIS LETTER SAYING YOU'RE DOWN TO A DOLLAR SOMETHING LIKE
- 9 THAT. I COULDN'T BELIEVE IT WAS FASTRAK, BECAUSE I DIDN'T
- 10 REALIZE THAT WHEN YOU LOSE A CARD AND BUT CHANGE THE CARD,
- 11 YOU'RE IMMEDIATELY TAKEN OFF OF THAT VISA. AND THESE ARE THE
- 12 KIND OF THINGS THAT PEOPLE DON'T KNOW ABOUT. NOW, I
- 13 IMMEDIATELY PAID. I SENT IN A CHECK. AND THREE WEEKS LATER, I
- 14 GOT ANOTHER PIECE OF INFORMATION THAT SAYS, WELL, YOU OWE THIS
- 15 MUCH. IF YOU DO NOT PAY IT THIS DAY. SO I CALLED UP AND PUT IT
- 16 ON A CREDIT CARD. WELL, UNFORTUNATELY FOR THE PEOPLE AT
- 17 FASTRAK, AS I STILL HAVE MY PASS TO GET INTO THE METRO
- 18 BUILDING, AND WENT IN THERE PERSONALLY, BECAUSE THEY WERE
- 19 SAYING THEY DIDN'T GET IT. NOW, FIVE WEEKS WENT BY. THAT'S AN
- 20 AWFUL LONG TIME TO DO ADMINISTRATION, AND FINALLY WHEN I
- 21 WALKED IN THEY SAID YEAH YOU GOT \$200 ON YOUR FASTRAK AND WHAT
- 22 DO YOU KNOW MY WIFE RETIRES AND DOESN'T GO TO THE AIRPORT
- 23 ANYMORE. BUT THE REALITY IS THINGS NEED TO BE DONE OUTSIDE OF
- 24 THIS ADMINISTRATION TO MAKE SURE WE'RE DOING THE BEST FOR THE
- 25 PEOPLE. AND I THINK THAT'S KIND OF WHAT'S BEEN SAID THROUGHOUT



- 1 HERE. THAT IT ISN'T JUST GOING TO BE TAKING PEOPLE AWAY FROM
- 2 PAYING ABOUT \$2 FOR A TOLL -- THAT'S HOW OLD I AM, BUT GETTING
- 3 THEM ON THE CREDIT CARDS AND REALIZING THAT ALL THESE THINGS
- 4 HAVE TO HAPPEN, AND I WILL RECEIVE OFFICIAL NOTIFICATIONS AND
- 5 YOU CAN GO ONLINE AND TAKE CARE OF IT QUICKLY. IF WE CAN DO
- 6 THAT, I THINK WE'RE ON TO SOMETHING. IF NOT WE'LL PROBABLY BE
- 7 BACK HERE IN 5 TO 6 YEARS DOING IT AGAIN. MY POINT.

8

- 9 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY MORE MEMBERS OF THE
- 10 COMMITTEE THAT HAVE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THIS BILL? IF
- 11 NOT, I ALSO WANT TO THANK CHAIR LICCARDO AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER
- 12 TING FOR BRINGING THIS FORWARD AND ADDRESSING THE EQUITY
- 13 ISSUES AROUND PEOPLE WHO USE OUR TOLL SYSTEM IN CALIFORNIA.
- 14 AND THANKS TO STAFF FOR YOUR CONTINUED WORK WITH THE BILL
- 15 AUTHOR. AND STAFF HAS REQUEST THAT WE CONCUR WITH THE
- 16 EMERGENCY PROCEDURE TO COMMUNICATE A POSITION ON ASSEMBLY BILL
- 17 2594 TING AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING IS AWARE OF THE ISSUE THIS
- 18 AS HE IS HERE THIS MORNING. AND ADOPTING A SUPPORT POSITION.
- 19 DO I HAVE A MOTION REFER A SUPPORT IF AMENDED POSITION ON
- 20 ASSEMBLY BILL 2594?

21

22 DAVID E. HUDSON: MOTION.

23

24 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: SECOND.



1	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: COLLEAGUES ANY DISCUSSION ON THE
2	MOTION? IF NOT I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL ON THE
3	MOTION.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: WILL DO. CHAIR ARREGUIN?
6	
7	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: YES.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR LICCARDO?
10	
11	SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: YES.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER AHN?
14	
15	EDDIE AHN: YES.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER CANEPA?
18	
19	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CONNOLY?
22	
23	DAMON CONNOLLY: AYE.
24	
25	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI IN.





1	
2	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: EKLUND?
5	
6	PAT EKLUND: AYE.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER FLEMING? IS ABSENT. MEMBER
9	HALLIDAY?
10	
11	BARBARA HALLIDAY: YES.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: HUDSON?
14	
15	DAVID E. HUDSON: AYE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAR? IS ABSENT. MEMBER MITCHOFF?
18	
19	KAREN MITCHOFF: YES.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER PEDROZA?
22	
23	ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
24	
	CIEDY OF MIE DOADD. MEMDED DADDIEG IG ADGENIE MEMDED DAMOGO
25	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER RABBIT? IS ABSENT. MEMBER RAMOS?



1 2 BELIA RAMOS: YES. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT. MEMBER SPERING? 4 5 IS ABSENT. BACK TO MEMBER RABBIT? PASSES BY MEMBERS PRESENT. 6 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. ASSEMBLYMEMBER, THANK 7 8 YOU SO MUCH FOR JOINING US THIS MORNING. I WANT TO GIVE YOU THE LAST WORD IF THERE IS ANYTHING ELSE YOU WOULD LIKE TO ADD 9 BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM. 10 11 PHIL TING: WE APPRECIATE THE STAFF AND STAFF WORKING WITH US 12 MAKING SURE WE HAVE A BILL THAT'S GOING TO WORK FOR BATA AND 13 14 OUR ENTIRE STATE. AND LOOK FORWARD TO KEEPING DISCUSSIONS OPEN AND LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING THIS ON THE GOVERNOR'S DESK. 15 16 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE 17 18 TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM, 3B POTENTIAL REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE 19 OPTIONS FOR HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. THIS IS REALLY A DISCUSSION ON THE NEXT STEPS IN THE PURSUIT OF A REGIONAL 20 21 HOUSING BOND AS WELL AS OBSERVATION OBSERVATIONS FOR A 22 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AND IDENTIFICATION OF OTHER 23 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM AND REBECCA LONG WILL ALSO PRESENT ON THIS ITEM. 24





- 1 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU CHAIR ARREGUIN. IF WE COULD HAVE THE
- 2 TECH TEAM, PLEASE, PULL UP THE PRESENTATION. THANK YOU. THIS
- 3 IS AN ACTION ITEM. TO PROVIDE CONTEXT AT THE OUTSET, WE'RE A
- 4 LONG WAY AWAY FROM NOVEMBER 2024, AND SO WE'RE WHAT WE'RE
- 5 TALKING ABOUT TODAY IS REALLY SETTING US UP FOR THE NEXT STEPS
- 6 FOR STAFF TO HAVE IN MIND WHAT THE COMMISSION, THE ABAG
- 7 EXECUTIVE BOARD, BAHFA WANT US TO BE DOING TO BE READY FOR A
- 8 HOUSING MEASURE IN NOVEMBER 2024, AND BE READY FOR A
- 9 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WITH THAT, CAN
- 10 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. TWO KEY QUESTIONS FACING ABAG AND MTC
- 11 BAHFA POLICY MAKERS. THE FIRST IS, SHOULD THE STAFF BEGIN, BE
- 12 DIRECTED TO BEGIN THE WORK NECESSARY TO PLACE A REGIONAL
- 13 HOUSING MEASURE ON THE NOVEMBER 2024 BALLOT BASED ON THE
- 14 EXISTING LEGISLATION THAT WE HAVE ENACTED. AND THEN, SECONDLY,
- 15 SHOULD MTC AND PARTNERS PURSUE ENABLING LEGISLATION IN 2023,
- 16 NEXT YEAR, TO AUTHORIZE A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE FOR
- 17 A TO-BE-DETERMINED FUTURE BALLOT TO TAKE OTHER STEPS TO
- 18 ADDRESS MORE IMMEDIATE TRANSPORTATION NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE. AS WE
- 19 THINK ABOUT THESE QUESTIONS, WE'RE CERTAINLY KEEPING IN MIND
- 20 THE POLLING THAT HAS BEEN DONE IN RECENT MONTHS AND I THINK
- 21 MANY OF YOU HAVE PROBABLY SEEN A BAY AREA COUNCIL POLL IN
- 22 MARCH 2022 THAT WAS QUITE STRIKING IN TERMS OF THE FINDINGS
- 23 AND HOW, YOU KNOW, DIFFERENT THEY ARE THAN WHAT WE HAVE SEEN
- 24 IN THE PAST, REFLECTIVE OF THE HISTORIC INFLATION AND OTHER
- 25 FACTORS. SO, VOTERS ARE EXTREMELY CONCERNED ABOUT THE ECONOMY,





- 1 UNDERSTANDABLY, AND INFLATION, AND ABOUT TWO THIRDS THINK THE
- 2 BAY AREA IS ON THE WRONG TRACK. THAT DOES NOT BODE WELL FOR
- 3 ANY TRANSPORTATION MEASURE OR HOUSING MEASURE IN THE IMMEDIATE
- 4 FUTURE SO IT'S NOT A GOOD TIME TO BE GOING TO THE VOTERS WITH
- 5 TAX MEASURES TODAY. A COMBINED 45% THINK HOMELESSNESS AND
- 6 HOUSING COST ARE THE MOST IMPORTANT PROBLEM FACING THE BAY
- 7 AREA WHEREAS ONLY 5% OVER TRANSPORTATION TRAFFIC CONGESTION AS
- 8 THE MOST IMPORTANT PROBLEM. AND THIS, ALL COMMISSIONERS HERE
- 9 WILL RECOGNIZE THIS IS VERY DIFFERENT THAN THE TYPES OF
- 10 NUMBERS THAT WE SAW PREPANDEMIC WITH RESPECT TO HOW PERSON THE
- 11 TRANSPORTATION SUBJECT WAS FOR VOTERS. AND THEN LASTLY, ONLY
- 12 57% SAID THEY WOULD SUPPORT A SALES TAX FOR TRANSPORTATION,
- 13 WHICH, OF COURSE, IS ABOUT NINE PERCENTAGE POINTS BELOW THE
- 14 REQUIRED TWO THIRDS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS I MENTIONED, WE'RE
- 15 REALLY COMING BEFORE TO YOU TALK ABOUT TWO TOPICS, THIS
- 16 HOUSING BOND MEASURE AND AUTHORIZATION FOR A TRANSPORTATION
- 17 MEASURE IN THE FUTURE. WE'RE IN JUNE 2022 HERE, SO YOU MIGHT
- 18 BE WONDERING WHY ARE WE TALKING ABOUT THIS NOW? WHY IS THERE
- 19 AN URGENCY TOW AFFIRM THE PURSUIT OF A REGIONAL HOUSING
- 20 MEASURE SO EARLY. WELL, FOR ONE, OUR HOUSING PARTNERS, THE BAY
- 21 AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION, OR BAHA, HAS REQUESTED A CLEAR
- 22 SIGNAL FROM OUR BOARDS, THAT WOULD BE THE ABAG EXECUTIVE
- 23 BOARD, AND BAHFA, THAT WE INTEND TO PURSUE AN AFFORDABLE
- 24 HOUSING BOND TO ASSIST IN THEIR EFFORTS TO BUILD THAT
- 25 FOUNDATION FOR A WINNING CAMPAIGN. THIS SIGNAL WOULD





- 1 DEMONSTRATE THAT URGENCY, WHICH WOULD REALLY HELP THE SORT OF
- 2 PRIVATE SECTOR EFFORTS WITH FUND-RAISING. BUT IT ALSO REALLY
- 3 HELPS PROVIDE STAFF THAT CLEAR DIRECTION. THERE IS A LOT OF
- 4 WORK TO DO TO BEGIN THE KIND OF OUTREACH WITH ALL OF OUR
- 5 PUBLIC AGENCY PARTNERS, CITIES AND COUNTIES, TO REALLY EDUCATE
- 6 OUR PARTNERS ABOUT THE BENEFITS OF A HOUSING BOND AND REALLY
- 7 BUILD THAT -- THOSE CHANNELS OF COMMUNICATION THAT WILL BE
- 8 NEEDED TO PASS A BOND. IT'S A MAJOR ENDEAVOR, AND IT WILL
- 9 REQUIRE EXTENSIVE PLANNING, ANALYSIS, AND COMMUNITY
- 10 ENGAGEMENT. AND STAFF REALLY NEEDS THAT DIRECTION SO THAT WE
- 11 CAN DO THE APPROPRIATE WORK, PLANNING, AND BUDGETING. NEXT
- 12 SLIDE. AND THEN WITH RESPECT TO TRANSPORTATION. I THINK YOU
- 13 ARE ALL WELL AWARE THAT THERE IS A LOOM BEING FISCAL CLIFF
- 14 PARTICULARLY FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. SOME AGENCIES ARE
- 15 FORECASTING MULTI-MILLION DOLLARS DEFICITS BEGINNING IN FISCAL
- 16 YEAR '23, '24, WHEN THE FEDERAL COVID RELIEF FUNDS WILL START
- 17 TO RUN OUT. THE TIMELINE FOR THIS FISCAL CLIFF VARIES BY
- 18 OPERATOR, BUT WE KNOW IT'S COMING. THERE IS NO PLAN AS OF YET.
- 19 WE CAN HOPE THAT THE STATE CONTINUES TO HAVE A BUDGET SURPLUS,
- 20 AND THAT PERHAPS NEXT YEAR THERE WILL BE AN OPENING TO PROVIDE
- 21 ADDITIONAL OPERATING FUNDING RELIEF THAT WAS NOT SOMETHING
- 22 THAT THE LEGISLATURE WAS SUPPORTIVE OF THIS PAST YEAR. BECAUSE
- 23 THERE STILL IS SIGNIFICANT SUPPORT FROM THE COVID RELIEF
- 24 FUNDS, BUT, YOU KNOW, CLEARLY, IT'S OF URGENCY TO FIGURE OUT
- 25 HOW TRANSIT SERVICE IS SUSTAINED AND DO THAT PLANNING IN THE





- 1 EVENT THAT REVENUE SOURCES AREN'T AVAILABLE. SO, THAT'S WHAT
- 2 THIS SECOND BULLET REALLY TRIES TO UNDERSCORE IS THAT WE NEED
- 3 TO LOOK AT MULTIPLE OPTIONS BOTH TO SECURE REVENUE AND THAT
- 4 SCENARIO PLANNING TO REDUCE OPERATING EXPENSES. NEXT SLIDE. ON
- 5 THE CAPITAL SIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION, YOU ARE WELL AWARE THAT
- 6 WE DO FACE SOME SIGNIFICANT FUNDING SHORTFALLS FOR PROJECTS IN
- 7 OUR PLAN, BUT WE DO SEE MAJOR HEADWINDS IN THE EFFORT TO GO TO
- 8 THE VOTERS AND ASK FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR CAPITAL. WITH
- 9 THE RM3 LAWSUIT STILL PENDING IN THE COURTS, THE STATUS OF
- 10 FUNDING PLANS FOR MANY OF OUR PRIORITY PROJECTS IS REALLY
- 11 UNKNOWN, AND IT WOULD BE VERY DIFFICULT TO GO TO THE VOTERS
- 12 RIGHT NOW AND ASK THEM TO TAX THEMSELVES FOR ADDITIONAL
- 13 CAPITAL FUNDING PROJECTS WHEN THERE IS JUST SO MUCH
- 14 UNCERTAINTY ABOUT THE ACTUAL AMOUNT THAT IS NEEDED TO COMPLETE
- 15 MANY OF THESE PROJECTS. THERE WAS A TON OF MEDIA COVERAGE
- 16 ABOUT THE FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE BILL AND THE BAY AREA DID
- 17 VERY WELL ON THAT, AND FINGERS CROSSED WE'RE GOING TO SEE
- 18 SIGNIFICANT NEW CAPITAL FUNDING COMING FROM THE STATE. BUT
- 19 THERE IS JUSTICE A BIT OF A SENSE OF, AREN'T YOU GETTING SO
- 20 MUCH MONEY, WHY DO YOU NEED CAPITAL FUNDING. THE PROPOSITION
- 21 OF A REGIONAL MANAGER COULD BE MORE IN OPERATION AND
- 22 PROGRAMMATIC TYPE CATEGORIES RATHER THAN BIG PARTICULATE
- 23 PROJECT ITEMS. NEXT SLIDE. THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION
- 24 PLAN FROM THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE WILL
- 25 REQUIRE ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO DELIVER ON THESE PRIORITY ITEMS





- 1 WE ESTIMATE APPROXIMATELY 250 MILLION THAT INCLUDES MAPPING
- 2 AND WAYFINDING PROJECT FULL DEPLOYMENT, BUS TRANSIT PRIORITY,
- 3 AND THEN OTHER PROJECTS. AND TO IMPLEMENT THE INTEGRATED FARE
- 4 POLICIES THAT WERE THE MOST IMPACTFUL, WITH REGARD TO
- 5 RIDERSHIP, WILL REQUIRE ABOUT \$100 MILLION PER YEAR IN SUBSIDY
- 6 IF WE'RE GOING TO HOLD OPERATORS HARMLESS FROM THAT REDUCED
- 7 FARE REVENUE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, YOU KNOW, WE'RE THINKING ABOUT
- 8 WHAT WOULD WE WANT TO DO IF WE ARE INTERESTED IN PURSUING, IF
- 9 THE COMMISSION IS INTERESTED IN PURSUING A TRANSPORTATION
- 10 MEASURE IN SACRAMENTO NEXT YEAR, AND HOW MIGHT POLLING INFORM
- 11 THIS. YOU KNOW, AS YOU WELL KNOW, WHEN IT COMES TO ELECTIONS
- 12 AND POLLING, TIMING IS EVERYTHING, AND RESULTS OF POLLING
- 13 CONDUCTED MORE THAN TWO YEARS IN ADVANCE REALLY WON'T TELL US
- 14 MUCH OF VALUE ABOUT THE VIABILITY OF A MEASURE. BUT IT COULD
- 15 HELP US LEARN MORE ABOUT WHAT BAY AREA RESIDENTS AND VOTERS
- 16 ARE PRIORITIES ARE WHEN IT COMES TO TRANSPORTATION, RIGHT NOW,
- 17 THAT COULD HELP US DEVELOP THE LEGISLATION AND THINK ABOUT HOW
- 18 TO STRUCTURE AN EXPENDITURE PLAN. FOR EXAMPLE, YOU KNOW, ARE
- 19 THE VOTERS MOST CONCERNED ABOUT PRESERVING EXISTING TRANSIT
- 20 SERVICE LEVELS, MAKING TRANSIT MORE AFFORDABLE, HELPING GET
- 21 BUSES OUT OF TRAFFIC, OR CONVERTING THE EMISSION TO A ZERO-
- 22 EMISSIONS FLEET WHICH IS REQUIRED BY THE STATE. NEXT SLIDE.
- 23 SO, SOME OF THE IDEAS WE HAVE, INITIALLY, ARE THAT, IN TERMS
- 24 OF FEATURES OF ANOTHER -- OR A NEW TRANSPORTATION
- 25 AUTHORIZATION BILL WOULD BE THAT THE TIMING SHOULD BE



- 1 FLEXIBLE. THAT'S HOW A.B. 1487 WAS STRUCTURED. SO IT
- 2 AUTHORIZES ABAG AND BAHFA TO PUT A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT. IT
- 3 DOESN'T DICTATE WHAT ELECTION WE DO THAT, AND, ADDITIONALLY,
- 4 THE SPENDING PLAN SHOULD, PERHAPS, BE PROGRAMMATIC VERSUS
- 5 PROJECT SPECIFIC. AND, THEN, POTENTIALLY, OFFER A MULTIPLE
- 6 REVENUE OPTION. THAT WAS THE APPROACH TAKEN IN A.B. 1487.
- 7 RATHER THAN HAVING TO DICTATE THIS IS THE FUNDING SOURCE,
- 8 PROVIDE A FEW DIFFERENT CHOICES FOR US TO DECIDE AS IT GETS
- 9 CLOSER TO AN ELECTION. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE STAFF
- 10 RECOMMENDATION TODAY IS KIND OF A THREE-PART RECOMMENDATION TO
- 11 THREE DIFFERENT BODIES. THE FIRST, AS IT RELATES TO HOUSING,
- 12 IS TO ASK THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND BAHFA TO DIRECT THE
- 13 ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE AND THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE TO
- 14 COLLABORATE ON OVERSEEING PREPARATIONS FOR THE REGIONAL
- 15 HOUSING BOND ON THE NOVEMBER 2024 BALLOT AND THEN MTC TO
- 16 DIRECT THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE AND AT KEY
- 17 TOUCH POINTS, THIS COMMITTEE, TO OVERSEE NEXT STEPS FOR
- 18 ADDRESSING TRANSPORTATION NEEDS SUCH AS A RESEARCH POLL,
- 19 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT, AND IDENTIFYING ADDITIONAL FUNDING
- 20 OPPORTUNITIES TO BRIDGE THE TIME GAP UNTIL MORE CONTINUOUS
- 21 STABLE REVENUES ARE AVAILABLE, SUCH AS FROM A REGIONAL
- 22 MEASURE. AND, WITH THAT, I WILL CLOSE AND SEE IF THERE ARE ANY
- 23 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.





- 1 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH, REBECCA. I WOULD
- 2 LIKE -- THIS IS AN IMPORTANT MILESTONE FOR OUR AGENCY AND FOR
- 3 THE REGION, AND A RECENT POLL BAY AREA COUNCIL POLL HAS SHOWN
- 4 HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS AS TWO TOP ISSUES FACING OUR REGION
- 5 AND WITH THE PANDEMIC HAS CREATED GREATER HOUSING INSECURITY
- 6 FOR MANY OF OUR RESIDENTS AND EVEN BEFORE THE PANDEMIC,
- 7 HOUSING WAS CUE. AS WE HAVE WORKED WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBERS TO
- 8 CREATE THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY WE HAVE NOW
- 9 LAUNCHED THAT AUTHORITY AND THEY'RE HARD AT WORK IMPLEMENTING
- 10 THE NEW PROGRAMS TO ADDRESS THE THREE PS, PROTECTION,
- 11 PRESERVATION, AND PRODUCTION, BUT WE KNOW WE WILL NOT BE ABLE
- 12 TO MAKE A MEANINGFUL IMPACT IN ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING CRISIS
- 13 REGIONALLY, AND AUTHORITY MEETING STATE REQUIREMENTS OF RHNA
- 14 IF WE DON'T HAVE THE SKILLED RESOURCES NEEDED TO ADDRESS OUR
- 15 HOUSING CRISIS IN THE BAY AREA. THE LONGER WE WAIT THE MORE
- 16 PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE PRICED OUT OF OUR REGION AND RESULT IN
- 17 IMPACTS FROM COMMUTING TO GET TO JOB CENTERS. WE HAVE A
- 18 RESPONSIBILITY, NOW, PARTICULARLY, GIVEN THAT WE HAD TO DEFER
- 19 CONSIDERATION FOR TWO ELECTION CYCLES TO MOVE AHEAD IS MAKE A
- 20 COMMITMENT NOW THAT WE'RE GOING TO TAKE STEPS TO LOOK AT
- 21 PUTTING ON THE BALLOT IN 2024 A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE. WE
- 22 DESPERATELY NEED THESE RESOURCES. SO MANY COMMUNITIES HAVE
- 23 TRIED TO PUT HOUSING BONDS AND TAX MEASURES FORWARD, SANTA
- 24 ROSA FOR EXAMPLE, HAS BEEN UNSUCCESSFUL. ULTIMATELY HOUSING
- 25 SAY REGIONAL ISSUE THAT'S WHY WE HAVE BEEN LEADING DISCUSSIONS



1	HERE AT OUR TWO AGENCIES ABOUT ADDRESSING THIS CRITICAL
2	CHALLENGE. OF IT DOES REQUIRE A REGIONAL SOLUTION. THIS IS THE
3	TIME FOR US TO PRIORITIZE HOUSING. I JUST WANT TO SAY, AS
4	CHAIR OF THIS COMMITTEE AND PRESIDENT OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE
5	BOARD. I WANT TO EXPRESS MY STRONG COMMITMENT TO TAKING THE
6	STEPS THAT STAFF HAS RECOMMENDED. WE ALSO HAVE TO MAKE A
7	SIMILAR COMMITMENT TO BEGIN TO DISCUSS THE LONG-TERM
8	TRANSPORTATION NEEDS, NOT JUST OPERATING NEEDS, BUT ALSO THE
9	LONG-TERM CAPITAL NEEDS FOR NOT ONLY HELP FUND MEGA PROJECTS
10	BUT OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS IN THE REGION. THAT TYPE MAY
11	NOT BE NOW, MAYBE AT SOME POINT IN THE FUTURE. BUT I THINK IF
12	WE ARE GOING TO MAKE THE STEP OF SAYING WE WANT TO PRIZE A
13	HOUSING MEASURE NOW WE NEED TO RECOGNIZE WE NEED TO BEGIN THE
14	WORK OF ADDRESSING THE LONG-TERM TRANSPORTATION NEEDS IN OUR
15	REGION. I ENCOURAGE WE TAKE THIS STEP TO EMPOWER COMMITTEES TO
16	DO THE WORK IT'S GOING TO BE A YEAR OF INTENSIVE WORK BY OUR
17	STAFF AND STAKEHOLDERS TO GET US TO THIS POINT BUT WE NEED TO
18	GIVE THE GREEN LIGHT TODAY, AND BEGIN THE WORK OF, REALLY, NOT
19	ONLY BRINGING OUR AGENCIES AND OUR REGION TOGETHER BEHIND A
20	MEASURE TO ADDRESS OUR AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEEDS IN THE BAY
21	AREA. AND WITH THAT I'LL GO TO MTC CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA.
22	
23	ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, AND TO THE
24	COMMITTEE MEMBERS, AND TO THE PUBLIC. MAYOR ARREGUIN AND I
25	HAVE BEEN WORKING IN LOCK STEP AROUND THESE CORE ISSUES IN OUR





- 1 REGION. AND I APPRECIATE HIS LEADERSHIP ON THIS ALSO TO THE
- 2 HOUSING COALITION THAT HAS BEEN DEVELOPED. I REALLY APPRECIATE
- 3 THEIR TENACITY TO GET THINGS DONE LOOKING AT 2024 IN A BULLISH
- 4 WAY. AND I SUPPORT OUR STAFF RECOMMENDATION. I WANT TO BE
- 5 CLEAR TO OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS WE'RE NOT WALKING BACKING FROM
- 6 OUR COMMITMENT TO IMPROVE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS IN OUR
- 7 REGION. I THINK CHAIR SPERING STARTING THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
- 8 FORCE WAS BOLD AND LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN IMPROVE
- 9 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS IN OUR REGION FOR THE BETTER OF OUR
- 10 RIDERS IT'S A REMARKABLE OPPORTUNITY AND WE'RE NOT WALKING
- 11 BACK FROM THAT PROCESS. THIS GIVES US THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE
- 12 BOLD AND AGGRESSIVE ON HOUSING. I THINK THE POLLING SHOWS THIS
- 13 IS A PRESSING ISSUE AND WITH THE HOUSING ALLOCATION MEASURES
- 14 THAT ALL OF OUR MUNICIPALITIES RECEIVE IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY ON
- 15 GIVE US THE TOOLS AND RESOURCES TO CREATE THOSE HOUSING
- 16 OPPORTUNITIES FOR RESIDENTS IN OUR REGION. AT THE SAME TIME
- 17 WITH THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE WE CAN TALK
- 18 ABOUT WHAT DO WE NEED TO CONTINUE OUR COMMITMENT TO THE
- 19 OBJECTIVES OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE TO ENSURE THAT OUR
- 20 OPERATORS HAVE THE OPERATOR REVENUES TO CONTINUE TO SUPPORT
- 21 THEIR SYSTEMS. BUT ALSO, IN THE MEANTIME, STRATEGIES. WE'RE
- 22 NOT WALKING BACK FROM THAT. THIS IS AN APPROPRIATE STEP. IF
- 23 GIVES US AN OPPORTUNITY TO CONTINUE TO DO WORK WITH VOTE
- 24 ADVOCATES THOSE PARTNERS THAT WANT TO SEE US DO BOTH. AND I
- 25 THINK WE CAN DO BOTH BUT WHAT WE HAVE LAID OUT IS A PATHWAY TO



START MAKING MEANINGFUL CHANGE. I SUPPORT THE STAFF 1 RECOMMENDATION AND LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FROM THE PUBLIC AS 2 3 WELL. 4 5 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA. WE'LL GO NEXT TO MTC VICE CHAIR NICK JOSEFOWITZ 6 7 8 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND I WANT 9 TO THANK CHAIR PEDROZA FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AND WORK ON THIS AND FINDING A WAY TO ADDRESS THESE TWO INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT 10 11 ISSUES. AND I'M REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO HAVING SORT OF MANY MORE MONTHS OF ROBUST DISCUSSION ON THESE TWO ISSUES AS WE TRY 12 AND LAND THEM SUCCESSFULLY. 13 14 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE'LL GO NEXT TO 15 16 COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND. 17 18 PAT EKLUND: THANK YOU SO MUCH COUNCILMEMBER ARREGUIN. I HAVE A 19 QUESTION ON THE USE OF THE MONEY, THE HOUSING MONEY. HAS THAT DECISION BEEN MADE? 20 21 22 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: I THINK A LOT OF THAT IS PRESCRIBED IN 23 THE BILL, RIGHT, REBECCA?



- 1 REBECCA LONG: YES, CHAIR ARREGUIN. AND, DIRECTOR EKLUND,
- 2 THAT'S CORRECT. YOU MAY REMEMBER THE BILL SPECIFIES THE
- 3 DISTRIBUTION OF THE FUNDS AS THE FIRST STEP. 80% OF THE
- 4 PROCEEDS ARE REOUIRED TO BE RENDER TO THE COUNTY OF ORIGIN,
- 5 AND THEN WITHIN THAT, THERE IS SPECIFIC THRESHOLDS THAT ARE
- 6 REQUIRED TO GO TOWARDS AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION,
- 7 AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRESERVATION, AND TENANT PROTECTION. AND
- 8 THEN THERE IS SOME DISCRETION WITHIN THAT FOR SORT OF
- 9 SUPPORTIVE ELEMENTS THAT SUPPORT HOUSING, SUCH AS OTHER
- 10 COMMUNITY AMENITIES. SO, IT IS RELATIVELY PRESCRIBED WITH SOME
- 11 FLEXIBILITY THAT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND BAHFA WILL
- 12 DETERMINE BEFORE PUTTING A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT
- 14 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: ONE OTHER THING RELATED TO THAT, I
- 15 THINK IT WAS YOUR SENATOR MCGUIRE COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND WHO
- 16 STRONGLY ADVOCATED THAT MORE THAN 50% OF THE MONEY THAT
- 17 RETURNS TOWARDS PRODUCTION. SO IT LEANS MORE HEAVILY TOWARDS
- 18 PRODUCTION.

13

- 20 PAT EKLUND: AND ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE, IS THERE GOING TO
- 21 BE AN INTENT OVER THE NEXT YEAR OR SO TO REALLY EVALUATE THE,
- 22 WHETHER THE USE OF TRANSIT IS GOING TO GO BACK TO PRECOVID?
- 23 BECAUSE I BELIEVE THAT WE HAVE A -- AND I THINK A LOT OF
- 24 PEOPLE BELIEVE THIS, THAT PEOPLE'S HABITS, OR PEOPLE'S WORK
- 25 HABITS HAVE CHANGED. AND, SO, IS THERE AN ASSUMPTION THAT OVER



THE NEXT YEAR OR TWO, THERE WILL BE A REAL HARD ASSESSMENT ON 1 2 WHETHER OR NOT THE CURRENT TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM NEEDS TO BE 3 CHANGED TO ACCOMMODATE THE CHANGE IN WORKING HABITS? 4 5 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU FOR THAT OUESTION, DIRECTOR EKLUND. IT'S A GREAT ONE AND MORE REASON IT WOULD BE DIFFICULT GOING 6 TO THE VOTERS. WE HAVE DIRECT SURVEYS BOTH OF BAY AREA 7 8 RESIDENTS AND WORKING WITH EMPLOYERS REALLY WATCHING THE TREND LINE ON HOW MUCH PEOPLE ARE USING TRANSIT AND GOING BACK TO 9 10 IN-PERSON WORK. AND IT IS MOVING SLOWLY. SO, I THINK THIS IS ABSOLUTELY SOMETHING THIS WE'RE GOING TO BE MONITORING AS WE 11 THINK ABOUT THE STRUCTURE OF A MEASURE, AND, CERTAINLY, I'M 12 SURE, AS THE COMMISSION CONTEMPLATES WHEN TO PUT SOMETHING ON 13 THE BALLOT. THAT'S ANOTHER REASON WHY. WE CERTAINLY KNOW TODAY 14 THAT OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IS UNDERFUNDED, BUT TO THE 15 16 EXTENT THAT WE CAN CRAFT A MEASURE THAT'S FLEXIBLE, THAT ALLOWS US AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME TO PUT SOMETHING BEFORE THE 17 VOTERS THAT WE THINK IS GOING TO BE THE MOST COST EFFECTIVE 18 USE OF THEIR FUNDS, THE BETTER. 19 20 PAT EKLUND: MY LAST QUESTION IS, I HAVE NEVER BEEN A SUPPORTER 21 OF PUTTING A TAX MEASURE ON THE BALLOT WHEN WE KNOW IT'S 22 PROBABLY NOT GOING TO PASS. SO, WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THE CRYSTAL 23 BALL IS GOING TO SHOW IN 2023, OR 2024. AND I'M ASSUMING THAT 24

WHATEVER DECISION THAT WE MAKE, PROVIDING DIRECTION, IT WILL



ALWAYS BE CONTINGENT UPON WHETHER OR NOT WE THINK THE BALLOT 1 2 MEASURE IS GOING TO PASS. 3 REBECCA LONG: THAT IS CORRECT. 4 5 PAT EKLUND: JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE ON THAT ASSUMPTION AS ITS 6 7 CORRECT. 8 9 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: MAYOR LICCARDO. 10 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS, COULD YOU 11 REMIND ME ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE, REBECCA, WHETHER A 12 SIMPLE TAX MEASURE HAS BEEN SPECIFIED. I KNOW IT'S A GO BOND 13 I'M JUST NOT CLEAR ABOUT THE SOURCE OF FUNDING. 14 15 16 REBECCA LONG: IT WOULD BE A PROPERTY TAX AS THE SOURCE GO BOND PROPOSED TO -- STRUCTURED AS A PROPERTY TAX AS ISSUING A CITY 17 18 GO BOND. 19 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: UNDER STATE LEGISLATION THERE IS 20 21 NO FLEXIBILITY TO CONSIDER FOR EXAMPLE, REAL ESTATE TRANSFER 22 TAX OR HIGH VALUE PROPERTIES FOR EXAMPLE? 23 REBECCA LONG: A FUND MECHANISM FOR PARCEL TAX, AND THERE'S 24

EMPLOYER BASED TAX OR HEAD TAX PER EMPLOYEE OR GROSS RECEIPT.



1

2

3

JUNE 10, 2022

HAVING THE GREATEST ABILITY TO GENERATE SIGNIFICANT FUNDING UP

WHERE I WOULD SHARE THAT THE HOUSING COMMUNITY IS AT THIS

POINT ALONG THOSE LINES A GO BOND IS THE MOST VIABLE AND

FRONT. 4 5 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: I UNDERSTAND THE NEED FOR 6 POLLING I'M JUST SO PESSIMISTIC THAT PUBLIC SENTIMENT IS 7 8 SUDDENLY GOING TO BE SWAYED BETWEEN NOW AND NOVEMBER OF 2022 IN SUCH A WAY AS TO YIELD ANYTHING BY RESULT THAT'S PROBABLY 9 10 GOING TO TELL EVERYBODY, NOT NOW. OBVIOUSLY I'M NOT THE EXPERT, BUT I'M WONDERING WHY WE WOULDN'T WANT TO, PERHAPS, 11 GIVE THIS A LITTLE MORE TIME. WE JUST HEARD, I THINK, I THINK 12 THE REPORT ON INFLATION TODAY IS SOMEWHERE NEAR 8%. THIS IS 13 JUST A CHALLENGE OTHER TIME TO BE ASKING TAXPAYERS TO GIVE 14 15 MORE. IS THERE ANY THOUGHT ABOUT DELAYING THE POLLING. 16 REBECCA LONG: JUST TO BE CLEAR, I AGREE IT'S NOT A USEFUL TIME 17 TO BE CALLING VOTERS FOR SUPPORT FOR ANY PARTICULAR TAX. WE'RE 18 NOT PROPOSING TO DO ANY POLLING RELATED TO A HOUSING BOND 19

UNTIL 2024. MOST LIKELY. MAYBE LATE 2023. BUT, IF WE WANT TO

PURSUE A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIZATION BILL, WE DO

THINK IT COULD BE USEFUL. AND WE NEED TO SPEND MORE TIME WITH

OUR POLLSTER ON THIS TO THINK ABOUT ENGAGING VOTER IS BAY AREA

TRANSPORTATION, FOR INSTANCE, IF WE TALKED TO OUR STAKEHOLDERS

RESIDENTS RELATIVE CONCERNS AND PRIORITIES AS IT RELATES TO

20

21

22

23

24



AND ADVOCATES, THEY'RE VERY FOCUSED ON TRANSIT OPERATIONS. IT 1 WOULD BE HELPFUL TO KNOW WHAT THE PUBLIC THINKS ABOUT THAT, AS 2 3 WELL. 4 5 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: FORGIVE ME. I CONFLATED 6 TRANSPORTATION WITH THE HOUSING MEASURE IT SOUNDS LIKE. 7 8 REBECCA LONG: I THINK SO. [LAUGHTER] 9 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: YEAH. THANKS. 10 11 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. COLLEAGUES, ANY FURTHER 12 DISCUSSION OR QUESTIONS ON ITEM 3B AT THIS TIME. IF SO PLEASE 13 RAISE YOUR HAND. I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS AT THIS TIME. SO 14 WE'LL NOW GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I WOULD LIKE TO NOW OPEN 15 16 PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM 3B POTENTIAL REGIONAL REVENUE OPTIONS FOR HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. IF ANY ATTENDEE WISHES TO 17 SPEAK ON THIS ITEM PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND NOW. GETTING IN THE 18 NUMBER OF RAISED HANDS, I'M GOING TO ALLOT ONE MINUTE PER 19 SPEAKER. SO, IF THE CLERK CAN PLEASE READ THE NAMES? 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WILL DO. FIRST UP IS MARY FOLLOWED BY TINA 23 MARTIN. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. 24

25

SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME?



1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES WE CAN. 3 SPEAKER: MARY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF GENESIS. GENESIS HAS 16 4 5 MEMBER ORGANIZATIONS LOCATED ALL OVER NEED MOOD COUNTY AND PARTS OF CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. WE ARE ALSO A PROUD MEMBER AND 6 ON THE COORDINATING COMMITTEE OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC 7 8 TRANSPORTATION. AS MANY OF YOU MAY KNOW, GENESIS REPRESENTS MANY WHO RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT WHO ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS, 9 PEOPLE WHO LIVE WITH DISABILITIES, ELDERS AND YOUTH. AND AS 10 SOMEONE WHO IS ORGANIZED IN THE BAY AREA FOR OVER TEN YEARS 11 NOW ON THE ISSUE OF PUBLIC TRANSIT, I JUST SEE TRANSIT AS AN 12 EOUITY ISSUE. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND 13 WE APPRECIATE THE STAFF SEEMED TO HAVE LISTENED TO OUR DESIRE 14 15 TO ADDRESS HOUSING AND THE LOOMING FISCAL CLIFF FOR PUBLIC 16 TRANSIT. WE STAND READY AND WILLING TO EDUCATE VOTERS AROUND THE TRANSIT MEASURE IN 2023. SO THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE JUST ARE 17 IN SUPPORT OF THE RECOMMENDATION. 18 19 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH. 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, MARY. NEXT UP IS TINA MARTIN 23 FOLLOWED BY PETER STRAUSS. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE



- 1 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS TINA MARTIN AS YOU HAVE SAID
- 2 I'M WITH MOTHERS OUT FRONT WHICH IS AN ENVIRONMENTAL
- 3 ORGANIZATION AND MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC
- 4 TRANSPORTATION. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT THE RECOMMENDATION IT
- 5 ADDRESSES TWO OF OUR MAIN CONCERNS, THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND
- 6 HOMELESSNESS SITUATION AND THE DIRE NEED FOR MORE FUNDING FOR
- 7 TRANSIT. I THINK SOMEONE HAS CALLED THAT A LOOMING FISCAL
- 8 CLIFF WE'RE ON. I HAVE FRIENDS WHO DEPEND ON PUBLIC
- 9 TRANSPORTATION. AND I MEAN FRIENDS ALL OVER THE AREA. AND I
- 10 WANT TO DEPEND ON IT MYSELF, BECAUSE I THINK OUR ENVIRONMENT
- 11 AND OUR HEALTH WOULD BE BETTER OFF IF MORE OF US GOT OUT OF
- 12 OUR CARS. WE REALLY APPRECIATE STAFF RECOMMENDING A TWO-FOLD
- 13 APPROACH TO SUPPORTING OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM TO A TRANSIT MEASURE
- 14 IN 2023, SOMEONE JUST SAID LATE 2023, AND SHORTER TERM ACTIONS
- 15 TO IDENTIFY OPERATING FUNDING SO THAT SERVICE CUTS DON'T HAVE
- 16 TO BE MADE.

17

18 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU.

19

- 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS PETER STRAUSS FOLLOWED BY
- 21 EUGENE BRADLEY. PETER UNMUTE YOURSELF.

- 23 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING I'M PETER SAN FRANCISCO RIDER AND BOARD
- 24 MEMBER OF VOICES FOR TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I STRONGLY
- 25 SUPPORT THAT IN THE 2024 HOUSING MEASURE THAT WE AFFIRM



- 1 STRONGLY SUPPORTING THE HOUSING STRATEGY SEEKING LEGISLATION
- 2 AUTHORIZATION IN 2023 FOR A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE.
- 3 IN SAN FRANCISCO WE'RE AWARE OF WHAT THE FISCAL CLIFF MEANS IT
- 4 MEANS THAT THE TRAINS AND BUSES WE NEED AND DEPEND ON WILL NO
- 5 LONGER BE THERE THAT ESSENTIAL TRANSIT SERVICES WILL
- 6 PERMANENTLY DISAPPEAR. FROM WHERE WE STAN TODAY THERE IS NO
- 7 SINGLE ESTIMATED PATH FOR SECURING THE FUNDING STREAMS
- 8 NECESSARY TO AVOID THE DEFICITS THAT LOOM IN 2024 SO WE NEED
- 9 TO PURSUE MULTIPLE STRATEGIES. WHAT I'M WE SUPPORT THE -- WE
- 10 URGE THAT MTC AFFIRM THE STRATEGY OF SEEKING LEGISLATIVE
- 11 AUTHORIZATION IN 2023 FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE
- 12 SIGNIFICANTLY SECURING OPERATING SUPPORT BASED ON THE
- 13 PROGRESSIVE FUNDING STRATEGIES OUR COALITION SUPPORTS. THANK
- 14 YOU.

15

- 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, PETER. NEXT UP IS EUGENE
- 17 BRADLEY FOLLOWED BY PUBLIC ADVOCATES. EUGENE, GO AHEAD AND
- 18 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

- 20 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. THIS IS EUGENE BRADLEY SILICON VALLEY
- 21 TRANSIT USER SAYS. PARDON MY MISSPEAKING ON THE PREVIOUS
- 22 ITEMS. I DUPLICATE THE COMMENTS FOR SAN JOSE AND SILICON
- 23 VALLEY. TOO OFTEN THE FISCAL CLIFF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] AS FAR
- 24 AS THE TAXES I AM MORE THAN WILLING TO BE HAPPY ABOUT THE
- 25 TWOFOLD APPROACH IN TRANSIT AND HOUSING LET'S FACE IT THEY'RE



- 1 BOTH HUMAN RIGHTS NEEDS. ESPECIALLY IN THE BAY AREA WHERE TOO
- 2 MANY PEOPLE LIKE US LIKE MYSELF ARE FORCED TO MOVE OUT OF
- 3 MONTEREY CANYON AND THE CENTRAL VALLEY BECAUSE THEY COULDN'T
- 4 AFFORD HOUSING. WITH THE TRANSIT ISSUES IN SOUTH BAY THERE IS
- 5 STILL A LOT TO DO AND A LOT OF FUNDING NEEDED. WE'RE LOOKING
- 6 FORWARD TO SUPPORT STAFF TO GET THE FUNDING AND HELP MAKE IT
- 7 HAPPEN.

8

- 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS EMILY WITH PUBLIC ADVOCATES,
- 10 FOLLOWED BY PHONE NUMBER 0856. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

11

- 12 SPEAKER: I AM EMILY MEMBER OF PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND A MEMBER OF
- 13 PLACES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION I'M CALLING IN SUPPORT OF THE
- 14 STAFF RECOMMENDATION. AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS AND
- 15 THE LOOMING FISCAL CLIFF FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS HOPEFULLY
- 16 STAFF WILL SET US ON A PATH FOR ADDRESSING THESE. WE'RE HAPPY
- 17 WITH THE TWOFOLD APPROACH ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A TRANSIT
- 18 MEASURE AND A SHORTER TERM ACTION TO IDENTIFY OPERATING
- 19 FUNDING. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT A REGIONAL TRANSIT FOR OPERATING
- 20 SERVICES. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH STAFF AND BOARDS AND
- 21 STAKEHOLDERS ON ACHIEVING GOALS. THANK YOU.

22

- 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS PHONE NUMBER ENDING IN 0856
- 24 FOLLOWED BY TERENCE CAFDELL.



1

JUNE 10, 2022

SPEAKER: HELLO I'M SARAH GREENWALD SPEAKING FOR 350 BAY AREA

AND AS PART OF MY SPEAKING TO ON THE PREVIOUS ITEM. 350 BAY 2 3 AREA IS WORKING TOWARD CLIMATE JUSTICE AND COMBATTING THE CLIMATE EMERGENCY TRANSIT PIECE WE STRONGLY SUPPORT THE 4 5 STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. I'LL REMIND YOU AGAIN TRANSIT RIDERS ARE CLIMATE HEROES, AND THE STATISTIC I NOTE THE ACCORDING TO 6 2018 FIGURES FROM THE FIGURES FROM UK DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS 7 8 ENERGY AND INDUSTRIAL STRATEGY A BUS WITH ONLY TWO PEOPLE ON BOARD EMITS 5% OF THE CO2 EMITTED BY A GAS CAR. AND TRANSIT IS 9 NECESSARY FOR ELDERS THEY HAVE GOT TO STOP DRIVING FOR SAFETY 10 REASONS AND THEY NEED TRANSIT SO THEY CAN LIVE THEIR LIVES. 11 OUR CLIMATE HEROES DESERVE TRANSIT THAT IS ACCESSIBLE AND 12 EFFICIENT AND CAN BE EFFICIENT AND CONVENIENT. THANK YOU FOR 13 SUPPORTING THIS ISSUE. 14 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS TERENCE CANDELL FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE. 17 18 SPEAKER: I'M TERENCE ENVIRONMENTAL SPECIALIST WITH WETA AND SF 19 BAY FERRY THE SIGNIFICANT EFFECTS OF COVID-19 CONTINUE TO 20 21 AFFECT TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND FARE REVENUE FUTURE DEMANDS ARE

UNKNOWN BECAUSE OF THIS TRANSIT FACES JEOPARDY IN THE NEXT FEW

YEARS TRANSIT OPERATORS NEED A SOURCE OF REGIONAL REVENUE TO

OFFSET OPERATING COST FUTURE REGIONAL FUNDING WOULD BE VITAL

FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES TO CONTINUE PROVIDING EQUITABLE SERVICE

22

23

24



- 1 ESPECIALLY FOR RIDERS THAT HEAVY LEAVE RELY ON TRANSIT IN
- 2 THEIR LIVES. THE STATE LEGISLATION IS REQUIRED TO PLACE
- 3 REGIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING MEASURES ON THE BALLOT WE ENCOURAGE
- 4 MTC TO WORK WITH THE BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS TO DRAFT STATE
- 5 LEGISLATION CONSIDERATIONS FOR 2024 WE AT WETA SUPPORT STAFF
- 6 RECOMMENDATION AND STRONGLY ENCOURAGE DRAFTING ENABLING
- 7 LEGISLATION THAT WOULD ALLOW FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE IN THE
- 8 FUTURE. THANK YOU.

9

- 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS VINAY PIMPLE. GO AHEAD AND
- 11 UNMUTE YOURSELF. AND I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU A 15 SECOND WARNING
- 12 WHEN YOU ARE DOWN TO 15. GO AHEAD.

13

- 14 SPEAKER: I'M VINAY PIMPLE FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL.
- 15 AND I REALLY URGE YOU TO CONSIDER THE LIKELY INTEREST RATES IN
- 16 RESPONSE TO THE HIGH INFLATION THAT HAS ALREADY DRAMATICALLY
- 17 ESCALATED THE INTEREST RATES. THEY ARE LIKELY TO GO UP. AND I
- 18 ALSO SENT A WRITTEN COMMENT THAT HAS A COUPLE OF CHARTS. AND
- 19 ONE OF THE CHARTS, BY EXAMPLE, SHOW YOU THAT IF THE BOND ISSUE
- 20 IS AT 2% INTEREST RATE, LESS THAN 25% OF IT GOES TO PAYING OFF
- 21 INTEREST. IF IT IS ISSUED AT 8% INTEREST RATE, MORE THAN 60%
- 22 WILL GO TO PAYING THE INTEREST. SO PLEASE TREAT THE TAXPAYER
- 23 MONEY WITH CARE.

24

25 CLERK OF THE BOARD: 15.



1 SPEAKER: IF YOU ISSUE WITH A LOWER INTEREST RATE YOU CAN DO 2 3 TWICE AS GOOD WITH THE MONEY THAT YOU RAISE. SO PLEASE NO BIG ISSUES WHEN THE INTEREST RATES ARE HIGH. DO WHATEVER YOU NEED 4 5 TO DO TO AVOID THE FISCAL CLIFFS FOR TRANSPORTATION OPERATORS. 6 THANK YOU. 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU VINAY. NEXT UP IS RANDI KINMAN 9 FOLLOWED BY TRANSFORM VIDEO 2. GO AHEAD RANDI. 10 RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY 11 COUNCIL, THE CHAIR OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. EVERYBODY 12 HAS SPOKEN ON TRANSPORTATION, SO I'M GOING TO SWITCH IT TO 13 HOUSING. THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, FIRST OFF, SUPPORTS THE 14 STAFF RECOMMENDATION, AND THE MEMO. WE VOTED ON THIS ON 15 16 WEDNESDAY. WE ALSO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT WE WANT ENHANCED FOCUS ON PROVIDING HOUSING SPECIFICALLY FOR THE DISABLED 17 POPULATION. THE CDC REPORTS MORE THAN 10% OF CALIFORNIANS ARE 18 DISABLED, A NUMBER THAT'S ONLY GOING TO GROW WITH OUR AGING 19 POPULATION. THE POINT IN TIME STUDIES FOR HOMELESS SHOW THAT 20 21 IN OUR AREA, 25 TO 40% OF OUR HOMELESS ARE DISABLED, IS MORE 22 THAN 50% OF OUR SERVICE PEOPLE WHO ARE HOMELESS ARE DISABLED. SO WE WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE A FOCUS ON THE HOUSING THAT 23 PROVIDES SOME SECURITY FOR DISABLED PEOPLE. THANK YOU. 24



CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, RANDI. NEXT UP IS TRANSFORM 1 VIDEO TWO FOLLOWED BY GENAE AUBREY. TRANSFORM VIDEO TWO 2 3 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS JOHNSON WITH TRANSFORM, WE'RE COORDINATORS 4 5 FOR VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND A MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION. WE'RE THRILLED TO HEAR MTC IS 6 PURSUING SOLUTIONS TO ADDRESS TRANSIT AGENCIES FISCAL CLIFFS 7 8 AND LEGISLATION AS WELL AS REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE FOR 2024. THIS WORK WILL NOT ONLY MAKE THE BAY AREA AN INCLUSIVE PLACE 9 TO LIVE BUT COMBAT THE HOUSING CRISIS AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEAR 10 FREQUENT AND RELIABLE TRANSIT IS ONE OF THE STRONGEST 11 SOLUTIONS WE HAVE TO REACH OUR POLLUTION REDUCTION TARGETS 12 THIS WILL PROVIDE CRITICAL SUPPORT FOR LOW-INCOME DISABLED AND 13 RESIDENTS OF COLOR WHO RELY ON TRANSIT AND STRUGGLE TO FIND 14 AFFORDABLE HOUSING THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK TO MAKE THE BAY 15 16 AREA AN AFFORDABLE AND INCLUSIVE PLACE TO LIVE WE LOOK FORWARD TO SUPPORTING AND COLLABORATING WITH YOU ON THESE INITIATIVES. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS GENAE AUBREY 19 FOLLOWED BY KEN CHAN. 20 21 22 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS GENAE AUBREY FROM MPH, A PARTNER FOR THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION. SUPPORTING STAFF'S 23 RECOMMEND TO PREPARE FOR A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IN 2024. 24 AS YOU KNOW AND MANY OF YOU HAVE NOTED WE'RE EXPERIENCING 25



- 1 RISING HOUSING INSECURITY AND AFFORDABLE CRISIS THAT
- 2 DISPROPORTIONATELY AFFECTS PEOPLE OF COLOR AND BLACK RESIDENTS
- 3 THIS ISSUE IS TOP OF MIND FOR MANY BAY AREA RESIDENTS IN
- 4 ADDITION POLLING FOR THIS REGIONAL MEASURE SHOWS THAT A NUMBER
- 5 OF BAY AREA VOTERS WOULD SUPPORT IT AND WE BELIEVE THAT WE
- 6 MUST RAISE FUNDING AS THE SCALE OF THE PROBLEM AS A FUTURE
- 7 WHERE JANUARY HAS A PLACE TO CALL HOME AND LOW-INCOME
- 8 COMMUNITIES CAN PROSPER IN THE BAY AREA. NEXT SUPPORT THE
- 9 PROPOSED STEPS OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IN 2024 AND
- 10 RECOGNIZE THE SIGNIFICANT NEED FOR FUNDING AND HOPEFUL THAT
- 11 MTC WILL ADDRESS THE CHALLENGES. THANK YOU. WE LOOK FORWARD TO
- 12 CONTINUING TO PARTNER WITH YOU AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR
- 13 LEADERSHIP.

14

15 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS KEN CHAN.

- 17 SPEAKER: HELLO MEMBERS OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
- 18 COMMISSION AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MY NAME IS KEN CHAN
- 19 ORGANIZER WITH THE HOUSING LEADERSHIP COUNCIL SAN MATEO
- 20 COUNTIES. WE SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND
- 21 COLLABORATION TO PUT A REGIONAL HOUSING BOND ON THE NOVEMBER
- 22 2024 BALLOT. AS PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS
- 23 HAS BEEN A TOP PRIORITY OF RESIDENTS ESPECIALLY IN THE PAST
- 24 TWO YEARS. WITH THE PANDEMIC COMING TO AN END IT'S PERTINENT
- 25 FOR PEOPLE AND AFFECTS THE FORESEEABLE FUTURE. POTENTIAL TO



FRAME COMMUNITY MEMBERS PROVIDING OUR REGION TO ADDRESS THE 1 2 HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS CHALLENGES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS JOHN ARANTES. 4 5 FOLLOWED BY GITA RAO. 6 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING. JOHN ARANTES, BART CHAPTER PRESIDENT OF 7 8 SCIU 1021 REPRESENTING 1,800 MAINTENANCE WORKERS AT BART. AS IT'S IMPORTANT FOR BAY AREA TO FIND LONG-TERM SOLUTIONS FOR 9 PUBLIC TRANSIT TO BE ABLE TO CONTINUE TO OPERATE AND PROVIDE 10 RELIABLE AND SAFE SERVICE AS WE KEEP THE BAY AREA MOVING. WITH 11 CURRENT REDUCED RIDERSHIP, PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES LIKE BART 12 CAN CONTINUE TO RELY ON THE FARE BOX TO FUND ITS OPERATIONS 13 LIKE WE HAVE BEEN DOING FOR DECADES. WE URGE MTC TO START 14 15 WORKING ON FINDING SOLUTIONS WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES AND THE 16 STATE TODAY. BECAUSE TOMORROW WILL BE TOO LATE. THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR LEADERSHIP AND HARD WORK FOR THE BAY AREA. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. GEETA RAO FOLLOWED BY JEN KLOSE 19 20 SPEAKER: HIGH NAME IS GEETA RADIO MEMBER OF ENTERPRISE 21 PARTNERS PART OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION THAT 22 COALITION REPRESENTS 30 ORGANIZATIONS THAT INCLUDE BUSINESS 23 ENVIRONMENTAL RACIAL JUSTICE AND HOUSING ADVOCATES AS WELL AS 24 SERVICE PROVIDERS AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS ARE WE ALL 25



KNOW THAT THE NEED FOR ADDRESSING THE REGION'S AFFORDABLE 1 HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS CRISIS IS GREAT AND WE SEE IT EVERY 2 3 DAY AND ON OUR STREETS AND IN OUR COMMUNITIES. AND WHILE OUR FOCUS IS HOUSING, WE DO RECOGNIZE THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT 4 5 FUNDING NEED FACING TRANSIT OPERATORS AND WE'RE HOPEFUL THAT MTC AND ABAG COMMITTEES AND STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO ADDRESS 6 THESE CHALLENGES. AS A PART OF THE BAHA COALITION WE'RE 7 8 COMMITTED TO PURSUING A REGIONAL BALLOT MEASURE IN 2024, AND THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE A MEASURE THAT MEETS SCALE. SO WE'RE 9 LOOKING FOR A MEASURE AT 10 TO \$20 BILLION. WE HAVE BEEN A 10 STEADFAST PARTNER INCLUDING BAHFA AS COSPONSORS AND WE LOOK 11 FORWARD TO PARTNERING WITH YOU TO CONTINUE IN THIS EFFORT. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. JEN KLOSE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JEN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FROM HOUSING IN SONOMA COUNTY WE SUPPORT THE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION 17 FOR THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IN 2024 NO SURPRISE THAT 18 HOUSING IS AT CRISIS LEVELS FELT BY COMMUNITIES OF COLOR AND 19 LOW WAGE EARNERS IN SONOMA COUNTY WHERE LATINOS ARE TEN TIMES 20 21 MORE LIKELY TO LIVE IN OVERCROWDED HOUSEHOLDS HAVING IMPACT 22 DURING THE PANDEMIC. GENERATION HOUSING AUTHORITY RECOGNIZES 23 STRONG INTERSECTION BETWEEN HOUSING AND TRANSIT AND WE SUPPORT FOR HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. WE SUPPORT NEXT STEPS TO 24

25

PURSUE A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME IS UP. THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS LET'S
3	SEE, VINITA FOLLOWED BY ROBERT POWERS. OKAY.
4	
5	SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON VINITA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AT SAN
6	FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS COMEMBERS OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC
7	TRANSPORTATION. THE RECOMMENDATION TO ADDRESS THE URGENT
8	CRISIS TODAY HOMELESSNESS AND THE FISCAL CLIFF LOOMING FOR OUF
9	PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES WITH REGARD TO TRANSPORTATION,
10	WE'RE REMEMBERED ONLINE 20% OF ALL SURFACE TRANSPORTATION
11	FUNDS ARE DEDICATED TO TRANSPORTATION. THE REST IS SLATED FOR
12	ROADS AND HIGHWAYS TO THE EXTENT OF FEDERAL AND STATE
13	TRANSPORTATION POLICY AND INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT IN JOBS
14	ACT IS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF THAT. THIS IS LIKELY TO BE AFFECT
15	MINORITIES, ELDER, POOR, DISABLED, OR ANY GROUP THAT WOULD NOT
16	DRIVE OR PREFER TO USE ALTERNATIVE MODES. THE POLICY ARGUES
17	EXTENTS BEYOND ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY THE ISSUES OF
18	URBAN DEMOCRACY FOR PUBLIC, AND TRANSIT IS ILLUMINATED FROM
19	IT. TO ADDRESS WHAT'S AT STAKE HERE WE SUPPORT STAFF'S
20	APPROACH. THANK YOU.
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ROBERT POWERS.
23	FOLLOWED BY ADINA LEVIN. MEMBER POWERS, GO AHEAD.



1	ROBERT POWERS: GOOD MORNING CHAIRPERSON ARREGUIN, COMMITTEE
2	MEMBERS, AND MTC EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN. MY NAME
3	IS POWERS' AND I AM THE GENERAL MANAGER AT BART THANKS FOR
4	HAVING THIS CONVERSATION THIS MORNING ABOUT POTENTIAL REGIONAL
5	REVENUE MEASURES. WE TALK A LOT ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF LAND
6	USE AND TRANSPORTATION CONNECTIONS TO MEET OUR HOUSING,
7	CLIMATE, AND MOBILITY GOALS. SO, FIRST I JUST WANTED TO THANK
8	MAYOR ARREGUIN FOR HIS STEADY LEADERSHIP AND ACTION ON
9	HOUSING. AND, ESPECIALLY, ON THE PRODUCTION OF AFFORDABLE
10	HOUSING IN THE REGION. THE MAYOR HAS BEEN A TRUE PARTNER WITH
11	BART AND ITS DEDICATION OF COUNTLESS HOURS OVER THE LAST FEW
12	YEARS TO ADVANCE HIGH DENSITY, MIXED INCOME DEVELOPMENT AT
13	BOTH THE ASHBY AND NORTH BERKELEY BART STATIONS. SO, ONCE WHAT
14	WAS ONLY A DREAM HAS NOW BLOSSOMED INTO A PARTNERSHIP THAT HAS
15	MADE SIGNIFICANT PROCESS THIS MONTH WITH SEVERAL ACTIONS TAKEN
16	TO ADVANCE HOUSING AND THESE ACTIONS WERE APPROVED BOTH
17	UNANIMOUSLY
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER POWERS?
20	
21	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: MARTHA, WE'RE GOING TO GIVE BOB POWERS
22	SOME ADDITIONAL TIME.
23	

CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

24





1 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: MR. POWERS PLEASE PROCEED.

- 3 ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU, MAYOR. THIS WAS, YOU KNOW, THE
- 4 ACTIONS FOR THE TWO BART STATIONS WERE APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY BY
- 5 BOTH CITY -- BERKELEY CITY COUNCIL AND THE BARC BOARD. MR.
- 6 MAYOR, JUST, THANKS FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP. AND NOW TO THE OTHER
- 7 SIDE OF THE EQUATION ON THE HOUSING SIDE IS OBVIOUSLY THE
- 8 TRANSPORTATION SIDE. AND A WELL CONNECTED CLEAN TRANSIT
- 9 SERVICE. AND, YOU KNOW, DUE TO THE SIGNIFICANT IMPACT OF
- 10 COVID-19 ON TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, AS WELL AS FARE REVENUE, AND
- 11 THE UNCERTAINTY ABOUT TRANSIT TRAVEL DEMAND FOR FUTURE, YOU
- 12 KNOW, COUPLED WITH EXPANDED WORK, AS YOU HAVE HEARD THIS
- 13 MORNING FROM STAFF'S PRESENTATION BY MTC, TRANSIT AGENCIES
- 14 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA ARE FACING A LOOMING AND EMINENT
- 15 FISCAL CLIFF WITHIN THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR -- WITHIN THE NEXT
- 16 FEW YEARS -- SORRY. IN ORDER FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES TO CONTINUE
- 17 TO PROVIDE EQUITABLE SERVICE, ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE WHO ARE
- 18 RELYING ON PUBLIC TRANSIT, OPERATORS ARE GOING TO NEED A NEW
- 19 SOURCE OF REVENUE TO OFFSET OUR OPERATING COSTS. SO, STATE
- 20 LEGISLATION THAT'S REQUIRED TO PLACE A REGIONAL TRANSIT
- 21 FUNDING MEASURE ON THE BALLOT, BART ENCOURAGES MTC TO WORK
- 22 CLOSELY WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE BAY AREA TO
- 23 EXPEDITIOUSLY DRAFT ENABLING STATE LEGISLATION FOR THE
- 24 LEGISLATURE'S CONSIDERATION IN 2023. LET'S NOT PRECLUDE
- 25 OURSELVES FROM THE OPPORTUNITY TO PURSUE REGIONAL TRANSIT



- 1 FUNDING, BUT LET'S COLLECTIVELY BEGIN THE PROCESS TO DRAFT
- 2 THIS ENABLING LEGISLATION THAT WILL ALLOW FOR A FUTURE
- 3 REGIONAL MEASURE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AND ATTENTION
- 4 TO THIS MATTER. AND, MR. MAYOR, THANK YOU FOR THE ADDITIONAL
- 5 TIME. MUCH APPRECIATED.

6

7 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH, BOB.

8

- 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN FOLLOWED BY
- 10 SANGUITA. ADINA, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

11

- 12 ADINA LEVIN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE ON THE
- 13 MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WHERE CHAIR KINMAN HAS REPRESENTED
- 14 THAT WE HAD VOTED YESTERDAY TO SUPPORT THE STAFF
- 15 RECOMMENDATION TO PURSUE A HOUSING BOND TO ADDRESS OUR
- 16 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS CRISIS. AND, MEANWHILE, TO
- 17 MOVE FORWARD TO PURSUE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION FOR
- 18 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING AND WORK ON A STRATEGY TO ADDRESS THE
- 19 LOOMING FISCAL CLIFF WHERE WE ABSOLUTELY NEED HOMES AND
- 20 TRANSPORTATION WORKING TOGETHER FOR AN EQUITABLE AND CLIMATE-
- 21 FRIENDLY SOCIETY. AND, HAVING, WITH FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN HAT
- 22 AND, YOU KNOW, NOW PART VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
- 23 HAVING MTC TAKE THAT PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER CONVENING ROLE IS
- 24 IMPORTANT TO PASS THE MEASURE.



CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. DINA? 1 2 3 SPEAKER: HI I'M SANGET, A PART OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION WE'RE IN SUPPORT OF DIRECTING THE RELEVANT 4 5 COMMITTEES TO PREPARE FOR A HOUSING MEASURE AND WE BELIEVE CLIMATE RESILIENCE IN THE BAY AREA HAS IMPACTS ON THE 6 DISPLACED COMMUNITY CAUSING LONG DISTANCE DRIVING PRODUCING 7 8 AND PRESERVING MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND PROTECTING LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS IN AREAS 9 OF DISPLACEMENT WILL BE CRUCIAL. THEREFORE SAVE THE BAY 10 SUPPORTS NEXT STEPS OF DIRECTING COMMITTEES AND STAFF TO 11 PROCEED A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IN 2024. THANK YOU. 12 13 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. 14 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. LASTLY WE HAVE SEAMLESS BAY AREA. 17 18 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON. IAN GRIFFITHS WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA 19 I WANT ON SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO MOVE FORWARD, IN 20 21 PARTICULAR, WITH ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A TRANSPORTATION 22 FUNDING MEASURE. WE ARE ALSO A MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. BEING ABLE TO DO THE POLLING AND THE 23 RESEARCH ON THE THINGS ON THE POSSIBLE REVENUE SOURCES AS WELL 24

AS THE THINGS THAT ARE GOING TO BE -- IT'S AN IMPORTANT STEP,



IN MOVING FORWARD WITH TRANSPORTATION THERE'S A NEED TO 1 ADDRESS THIS ISSUE. WE NEED TO BE PURSUING MULTIPLE STRATEGIES 2 3 TO GET THERE. A REGIONAL MEASURE IS ONE OF THEM WE SHOULD BE DOING ADVOCACY AT THE STATE LEVEL TO BRIDGE OURSELVES THROUGH 4 5 THE YEAR SO WE CAN PURSUE A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE. THANK YOU FOR CONSIDERING THESE TOPICS I THINK WITH THESE MEASURES 6 MOVING FORWARD WE CAN ACHIEVE SOME OF OUR IMPORTANT REGIONAL 7 8 GOALS. THANKS. 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. AND THE FINAL SPEAKER IS 10 RICHARD MARCANTONIO. 11 12 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN AND MEMBERS. I'M RICHARD 13 FROM PUBLIC ADVOCATES A MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC 14 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. SPEAKING IN STRONG SUPPORT OF THE 15 16 STAFF RECOMMENDATION. IT RECOGNIZES APPROPRIATELY THE URGENCY OF ADDRESSING BOTH OUR AFFORDABLE HOUSING CRISIS AND THE 17 CRISIS OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS BOTH ON A REGIONAL SCALE. IN 18 PARTICULAR, I STRONGLY SUPPORT MOVING FORWARD WITH INTRODUCING 19 ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING MEASURE 20 21 IN 2023, AND IDENTIFYING NEAR-TERM FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS TO BRIDGE US UNTIL WE GET TO THE BALLOT. AT THE VOICES COALITION, 22 WE BRING TOGETHER TRANSIT WORKERS ON THE FRONT LINES AND 23 RIDERS SO THAT PEOPLE WHO KNOW THE MOST AND ARE DIRECTLY 24

IMPACTED THE MOST BY TRANSIT, AND WE'RE SEEING A GROWING



REGIONAL CONSENSUS AROUND THE THREE PILLARS OF OUR VISION FOR 1 2 THE ENABLING LEGISLATION WHICH YOU WILL SEE --3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, RICHARD. THERE ARE NO OTHER 4 5 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED FOR THIS ITEM. AND PUBLIC COMMENT WAS RECEIVED FROM SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP 6 7 GROUP AND VINAY PIMPLE IT WAS POSTED ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED TO 8 MEMBERS. 9 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO EVERYONE WHO 10 11 ATTENDED OUR MEETING TODAY AND FOR YOUR COMMENTS. WE'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE FOR ANY OTHER OUESTIONS OR COMMENTS 12 ON THIS ITEM. IF NOT, DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO REFER 13 APPROVAL OF THE POTENTIAL REGIONAL REVENUE OPTIONS FOR HOUSING 14 AND TRANSPORTATION TO THE MTC COMMISSION AND ABAG EXECUTIVE 15 16 BOARD AND BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY? 17 SAM LICCARDO, VICE CHAIR MTC: SO MOVED. 18 19 EDDIE AHN: SECOND. 20 21 22 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: COLLEAGUES FURTHER DISCUSSION ON THE 23 MOTION? SEEING NO RAISED HANDS I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL. 24



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR ARREGUIN?
2	
3	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: YES.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR LICCARDO?
6	
7	SAM LICCARDO, V. CHAIR: YES.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?
10	
11	EDDIE AHN: YES.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA? IS ABSENT. MEMBER CONNOLY?
14	
15	DAMON CONNOLLY: AYE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
18	
19	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: EKLUND?
22	
23	PAT EKLUND: AYE.



1	SPEAKER: FLEMING IS ABSENT. MEMBER HALLIDAY? IS ABSENT. MEMBER
2	HUDSON?
3	
4	DAVID E. HUDSON: AYE.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER MAR? IS ABSENT. MEMBER MITCHOFF?
7	
8	KAREN MITCHOFF: YES.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER PEDROZA? IS ABSENT. MEMBER RABBIT?
11	
12	DAVID RABBIT: AYE.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RAMOS?
15	
16	BELIA RAMOS: YES.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SPERING IS ABSENT. IT
19	PASSES.
20	
21	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL
22	PROCEED TO THE LAST ACTION ITEM AND THERE IS ALWAYS AN
23	INFORMATION ITEM SUBSEQUENT TO THAT. Y3C ASSEMBLY BILL 2011
24	AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND HIGH ROAD ACT OF 2022. THIS IS AN
25	ACTION ITEM AND GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN WILL PRESENT ON THIS



ITEM. I'LL RECOGNIZE THAT WE ARE LOSING MEMBERS. SO, GEORGIA, 1 YOU CAN KIND OF GO THROUGH IT AS EXPEDIENTLY AS POSSIBLE. THE 2 3 MATERIAL IS IN THE PACKET. I JUST WANT TO ENSURE WE I HAVE OUORUM TO BE ABLE TO VOTE AND MAKE A RECOMMENDATION. THANK YOU 4 5 GEORGIA. 6 7 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: ABSOLUTELY. GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR 8 ARREGUIN AND COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. LET ME GIVE A PRETTY HIGH-LEVEL OVERVIEW AND THEN I AM GOING WALK THROUGH A 9 SHORT PRESENTATION TO HELP WALK THROUGH THE BILL, BECAUSE IT'S 10 QUITE A COMPLEX ONE. THE OVERSAW IS THAT A.B. 2011 IS WIDELY 11 SEEN AS THE MOST POTENTIALLY IMPACTFUL PRODUCTION BILL THIS 12 LEGISLATIVE SESSION. AND WOULD BE A COMPLEMENT TO THE BAY 13 AREA'S FUNDING DISCUSSION THAT IS THE COMMITTEE HAD EARLIER 14 TODAY. SO THE BILL WOULD EXPAND THE VIABILITY OF BUILDING 15 16 AFFORDABLE UNITS BY OPENING UP MORE LAND OUTSIDE OF ESTABLISHED NEIGHBORHOODS FOR HOUSING AND PAIR THAT WITH A 17 COMPROMISE ON STRONG LABOR PROTECTIONS, TIED TO PRODUCT 18 STREAMLINING THAT REALLY ARE GETTING AROUND AN IMPASSE THAT 19 HAS STYMIED PRODUCTION BILLS THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. STAFF -20 21 - YOU KNOW, ANALYSIS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] TO HELP ADDRESS THE BAY AREA'S HOUSING CRISIS WHILE ADVANCING OTHER POLICY GOALS 22 WE HAVE IDENTIFIED NUMEROUS AREAS WHERE IT COULD BE IMPROVED 23 AND ALIGNED WITH THE BAY AREA'S PLANNING WORK AND OUTLINED IN 24

RECOMMENDATIONS. WE'RE PRESENTING RECOMMENDATION FOR SUPPORT





- 1 IF MANNED POSITION ON THE BILL FOR MTC AND ABAG. COULD YOU
- 2 PULL UP PRESENTATION. AND I AM MINDFUL OF TIME. NEXT SLIDE,
- 3 PLEASE. THANK YOU. AS YOU KNOW, CALIFORNIA IS FACING A HOUSING
- 4 AFFORDABILITY CRISIS PARTICULARLY ACUTE IN THE BAY AREA, JUST
- 5 A LITTLE BIT MORE COLOR TO WHAT CHAIR ARREGUIN'S COMMENTS WERE
- 6 EARLIER THIS MORNING THAT THIS CRISIS HAS ONLY BEEN WORSENED
- 7 BY THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC. AT THIS POINT HALF OF BAY AREA
- 8 RENTERS ARE RENT -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] LESS THAN A QUARTER
- 9 OF BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS WHICH HAS BEEN STEEP DROP SINCE THE
- 10 PANDEMIC, RESULTING FROM SUPPLY AND DEMAND THE STATE HAS
- 11 IDENTIFIED THROUGH HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION THE BAY AREA
- 12 WOULD NEED TO ADD ANOTHER 400,000 UNITS MINIMUM TO BEGIN TO
- 13 ADDRESS THE MISMATCH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE PANDEMIC HAS
- 14 ACCELERATED THE SHIFT TOWARDS E-COMMERCE AND TELEWORK CITIES
- 15 COUNTIES AND COMMERCIAL GROUPS AND CITIES AND COUNTIES HAVE
- 16 EMBRACED THIS IDEA REIMAGINING THAT UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL
- 17 SPACES OF HOUSING CONCERN AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IS A
- 18 CHALLENGE AND OPPORTUNITY. TO THE RIGHT HAND OF THE SLIDE, THE
- 19 DEVELOPMENT POTENTIAL IS ENORMOUS HERE ESTIMATES RANGE BUT A
- 20 COMPREHENSIVE ANALYSIS FROM URBAN FOOTPRINT ESTIMATED THAT
- 21 OPENING COMMERCIAL SITES FOR HOUSING COULD RESULT IN AN
- 22 ADDITIONAL 2 MILLION MARKET UNITS ACROSS THE STATE 80% OF THE
- 23 STATE A HOUSING SHORTAGE. TO SCALE THAT WOULD BE SIMILAR TO
- 24 UPZONING ALL CALIFORNIA SINGLE-FAMILY HOMES TO FOURPLEXES.
- 25 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. MTC AND ABAG HAS IDENTIFIED THIS TYPE OF





- 1 TARGETED DEVELOPMENT WOULD ACHIEVE MULTIPLE POLICY GOALS THAT
- 2 ALIGN WITH A RANGE OF ABAG AND MTC GOALS INCLUDING CLIMATE
- 3 CHANGE ECONOMIC REVITALIZATION AND HOUSING AS IT RELATES
- 4 SPECIFICALLY TO THE ABAG MTC 2022 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM OUR
- 5 ADVOCACY PROGRAM GENERALLY SUPPORTS HOUSING PRODUCTION AND
- 6 SPECIFICALLY SUPPORTS PROPOSALS TO AUTHORIZE HOUSING AS
- 7 PERMITTED TO USE IN COMMERCIAL ZONES SUPPORT TO LOCAL APPROVAL
- 8 WITHOUT REQUIRING CHANGES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WALK THROUGH THE
- 9 OVERVIEW OF THE MECHANICS OF THE BILL. SO, A.B. 2011 WOULD
- 10 PROVIDE THAT IF A HOUSING PROJECT MEETS CERTAIN STANDARDS
- 11 RELATE TO THE LABOR, AFFORDABILITY, SITE LOCATION, DENSITY A
- 12 DEVELOPER MAY BUILD ON A COMMERCIAL SPACE WITHOUT ANY
- 13 CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT OR REZONING REQUIRED WITHOUT
- 14 DISCRETIONARY REVIEW. DIFFERENTLY CERTAIN PROJECTS WOULD BE
- 15 USED BY RIGHT AND SUBJECT TO STREAMLINED MINISTERIAL REVIEW.
- 16 THERE ARE TWO DIFFERENCES MAIN DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THIS AND
- 17 BETWEEN THE SB35 STREAMLINING PROVISIONS THAT ARE IN CURRENT
- 18 LAW WORK. 50 IS THAT SB35 STREAMLINING IS LIMITED TO
- 19 RESIDENTIAL -- SITES THAT ARE ZONED TO PERMIT RESIDENTIAL USE
- 20 ALREADY. SO THIS IS AN EXPANSION. IT WOULD APPLY TO SITES THAT
- 21 ARE, YOU KNOW, SITE -- CERTAIN SITES, THAT MEET A.B. 2011
- 22 STANDARDS THAT ARE -- THAT EXPLICITLY DO NOT PERMIT
- 23 RESIDENTIAL USE. SO ACCORDING TO A TURNER CENTER ANALYSIS,
- 24 THAT COMMERCIAL SITES, THROUGHOUT THE STATE, THAT'S ABOUT 60%
- 25 OF THE COMMERCIAL SITES THROUGHOUT THE STATE, CURRENTLY





- 1 PROHIBIT RESIDENTIAL USE. SO THAT'S THE CRUX OF WHERE THIS
- 2 BILL IS AIMED AT DOING AND ONE OF THE BIGGEST DIFFERENCES OF
- 3 SB35. THE ARGUMENTS MAIN DIFFERENCE WITH SB35 IS THAT THE
- 4 STANDARDS AND SITE CRITERIA -- THE SITE CRITERIA STANDARDS AND
- 5 LABOR STANDARDS AND OTHER DENSITY STANDARDS ARE DIFFERENT.
- 6 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I'M GOING TO WALK THROUGH IN VERY HIGH-
- 7 LEVEL WHAT THE DIFFERENT CRITERIA ARE FOR PROJECTS THAT WOULD
- 8 BE -- COULD BE ELIGIBLE TO BE SUBJECT TO THIS STREAMLINED
- 9 REVIEW. AND IN SHORT, THE BUILDING SETS TWO TRACKS OR TWO
- 10 DIFFERENCE SETS OF CRITERIA THAT WOULD BE REQUIRED. ONE IS
- 11 INCOME PROJECT AND SECOND IS FOR 100% AFFORDABLE HOUSING
- 12 PROJECTS. THE THRESHOLD IS HIGHER FOR PROFIT DEVELOPERS THAN
- 13 THOSE HARDER TO FINANCE 100% AFFORDABLE PROJECTS. SO ON THE
- 14 LEFT, THIS IS -- YOU KNOW, IF YOU ARE AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING
- 15 DEVELOPER LOOKING TO BUILD MIXED INCOME PROJECTS IN ORDER TO
- 16 TAKE ADVANTAGE OF 2011 STREAMLINE COULD YOU NEED TO HAVE A
- 17 PROJECT OF MINIMUM 15% AFFORDABLE UNITS THAT ARE DEED
- 18 RESTRICTED FOR AT LEAST 55 YEARS. THE PROJECT MUST BE LOCATED
- 19 ON A SITE THAT'S ON A COMMERCIAL CORRIDOR WHICH THE BILL
- 20 PRESCRIBES THAT IT'S TYPICALLY A 4 TO 6 LANE ROAD AND ON URBAN
- 21 INFILL SITE THAT'S ZONED TO ALLOW FOR RETAIL OFFICE OR PARKING
- 22 EXCEPT THAT IF IT'S A SITE WITHIN A SPECIFIC PLAN AREA IT MUST
- 23 ALSO ALLOW FOR RESIDENTIAL USE AND THEN SECOND, THE LOCATION
- 24 MAY NOT BE ADJACENT TO INDUSTRIAL LAND OR IN ENVIRONMENTALLY
- 25 SENSITIVE AREA. AND THEN THE LAST PIECE IS THAT THERE ARE





- 1 NUMEROUS OBJECTIVE DESIGN STANDARDS THAT ARE -- THAT PROJECTS
- 2 WOULD BE REQUIRED TO MEET. THOSE ARE OUTLINED IN DETAIL IN
- 3 ATTACHMENT A TO THIS MEMO ITEM. BUT, JUST, IN SHORT, IN
- 4 GENERAL, THE -- IT -- THE PROJECT CHARACTERISTICS ARE
- 5 BASICALLY A 3 TO 5 STORY BUILDING MEDIUM DENSITY PROJECT THAT
- 6 WOULD PROVIDE FOR RESIDENTIAL OR MIXED USE AND THAT'S KIND OF
- 7 A REALLY HIGH-LEVEL SUMMARY OF WHAT WOULD BE ALLOWED FOR THIS
- 8 BILL. HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS WOULD STILL BE REQUIRED TO MEET
- 9 LOCAL OBJECTIVE PLANNING STANDARDS AND COMPLY WITH DESIGN
- 10 REVIEW PROCESSES SO LONG THAT THEY DON'T CONFLICT WITH
- 11 SPECIFIC PROVISIONS OF THE BILL OR EFFECTIVELY PRECLUDE THE
- 12 DEVELOPMENT OF HOUSING. I'M JUST GOING TO WALK THROUGH SOME OF
- 13 THE MAIN DIFFERENCES WITH, YOU KNOW, MIXED INCOME VERSUS 100%
- 14 AFFORDABLE PROJECTS. AND THE MOST CLEAR DIFFERENCE IS 100%
- 15 AFFORDABLE PROJECTS HAVE AFFORDABILITY REQUIREMENTS OF 100%
- 16 AFFORDABILITY UNITS. THE RANGE OF SITES THAT WHERE A.B. 2011
- 17 STREAMLINING WOULD APPLY IS SIGNIFICANTLY BROADER FOR 100%
- 18 AFFORDABLE PROJECTS IF ON ANY URBAN INFILL SITE ZONED FOR
- 19 RETAIL OFFICE OR PARKING THAT MEANS OTHER SORT OF EXCEPTIONS
- 20 THAT NOT LIMITED TO COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 21 NEXT, 2011 CONDITIONS ELIGIBILITY FOR STREAMLINING, HOST
- 22 FACTORS INTENDED TO TARGET DEVELOPMENT AREAS THAT ARE SUITABLE
- 23 FOR DEVELOPMENT NARROWS ELIGIBILITY TO URBANIZED AREAS AND
- 24 SECOND A WHOLE HOST OF EXCLUSIONARY AREAS BASICALLY AREAS THAT
- 25 ARE ENVIRONMENTALLY SENSITIVE OR HAZARDOUS SITES. THIS MAP ON





- 1 THE RIGHT IS A VISUALIZATION TOOL THAT CAN HELP IDENTIFY THE
- 2 EXTENT OF THE GEOGRAPHY THAT COULD BE COVERED UNDER THE BILL.
- 3 SO THAT'S THE GRAY AREA ON THE MAP AND THE WHITE AND PURPLE
- 4 AREAS WOULD BE EXCLUDED FROM A.B. 2711 STREAMLINING. -- 2011
- 5 STREAMLINING. ON THE GRAY AREAS THOSE ARE GEOGRAPHIES THAT
- 6 WOULD BE FURTHER -- THOSE GRAY AREAS WOULD BE FURTHER NARROW
- 7 TO THOSE COMMERCIAL ALREADY DEVELOPED SITES. FOR THE SAKE OF
- 8 TIME I'M GOING TO SKIP AHEAD IN THE SLIDES. ONE MORE OF THE
- 9 HAPPY TO GO BACK. THERE IS A LOT MORE INFORMATION IN THE
- 10 PACKET BUT FOR THE SAKE OF TIME I WANT TO GET TO THE MEAT OF
- 11 THE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. SO, ALTHOUGH A.B. 2011 IS WRITTEN
- 12 WOULD OPEN UP MORE LAN FOR DEVELOPMENT THIS IS A POLICY THAT
- 13 MTC AND ABAG SUPPORT IT'S NOT STRUCTURED TO ENABLE LOCAL
- 14 GOVERNMENTS TO INCORPORATE EXPANDED DEVELOPMENT POTENTIAL INTO
- 15 THE ONGOING HOUSING UPDATES. STAFF SUPPORTS EFFORTS THAT LOCAL
- 16 GOVERNMENTS UNDERTAKE TO ACCOMMODATE NEEDED HOUSING AND ALSO
- 17 PROVIDING FOR ACCELERATED HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT IS LAGGING
- 18 BEHIND RHNA GOALS. FIRST, PROJECTS BETWEEN STREAMLINING AND
- 19 RHNA PERFORMANCE BY ALLOWING FOR MINISTERIAL PROJECT APPROVALS
- 20 ONLY IN JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE NOT IN KEEPING PACE WITH RHNA
- 21 GOALS. FOR EXAMPLE, THE NUMBER OF, NITS PERMITTED -- THE
- 22 NUMBER OF PERMITS UNITED REPORTED IN APRS ANNUAL PROGRESS
- 23 REPORTS THAT FALL BELOW RHNA TARGETS OR HOUSING ELEMENT
- 24 TARGETS ARE THIS IS BRINGING IN SB35 PROVISION THAT
- 25 ESSENTIALLY SAYS THAT STREAM LINING ONLY APPLIES IF A





- 1 JURISDICTION IS NOT ON TARGET TO MEET RHNA GOALS. SECOND
- 2 AMENDMENT THAT WE'RE PROPOSING IS ENSURE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS
- 3 THAT ARE PROACTIVELY LAYING THE GROUNDWORK TO ACCOMMODATE
- 4 INFILL RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT ALONG COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS TO
- 5 CONTINUE TO HAVE OPTIONS TO DETERMINE WHERE COMMERCIAL
- 6 CORRIDORS RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT IS ALLOWED. SPECIFICALLY
- 7 WHERE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ALREADY COMPLETED PLANS TO DEVELOP
- 8 COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS STREAMLINING PROVISIONS SHOULD BE LIMITED
- 9 TO THOSE LOCATIONS IDENTIFIED IN THOSE SPECIFIC PLANS FOR NEW
- 10 PLANS FOR NEW RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT. THE SPECIFIC AREA PLAN
- 11 PROVISION THAT WAS CHAMPIONED BY THE CITY OF OAKLAND AND IS
- 12 ALREADY INCLUDED IN THE BILL TO EXPAND THOSE AREAS LIKE SAN
- 13 JOSE'S URBAN VILLAGES AND OTHER PLANS THAT EXPAND RESIDENTIAL
- 14 DEVELOPMENT AND COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS BUT THAT DON'T MEET THE
- 15 OUALIFYING STATUS IN THE PLAN. THIRD, PROPOSING BAY AREA
- 16 JURISDICTION TO RECEIVE CREDIT IN THIS HOUSING ELEMENT CYCLE
- 17 FOR THOSE ONGOING PLANNING EFFORTS TO ACCOMMODATE RESIDENTIAL
- 18 DEVELOPMENT IN COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS THIS AMENDMENT WOULD NEED
- 19 TO ADDRESS THE TIMING CHALLENGE THAT THE HOUSING ELEMENT IS
- 20 COMING UP FAST AND CONCERN RAISED FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENT
- 21 PARTNERS THE DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
- 22 THAT MIGHT DEEM THAT SITE'S DEVELOPMENT TARGETED FOR
- 23 REDEVELOPMENT WOULDN'T MEET STRINGENT REVIEW OF HOUSING SITE
- 24 INVENTORIES AND HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS. THAT'S A LOT. I'M GOING
- 25 TO MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE AND HOPEFULLY WE'LL HAVE MORE



- 1 CLARIFYING OUESTIONS. SO OUR STAFF IS, AGAIN RECOMMENDING A
- 2 SUPPORT IF AMENDED POSITION. THE BILL REALLY WOULD ADVANCE
- 3 SOME KEY MTC ABAG POLICY GOALS INCLUDING PRIMARILY ALLEVIATING
- 4 THE HOUSING CRISIS. THE DEVELOPMENT PROPOSAL AND DEVELOP TYPE
- 5 PROPOSED IN THE BILL FURTHER ALIGNS WITH PLANNED BAY AREA'S
- 6 CLIMATE CONNECTIVITY, ECONOMIC, AND WORKFORCE GOALS. AND THEN
- 7 OUR AMENDMENTS ARE LARGELY AROUND SUPPORTING LOCAL PLANNING. I
- 8 DO WANT TO NOTE THAT WHILE STAFF RECOGNIZES THAT A.B. 2011
- 9 EVEN AS PROPOSED TO BE AMENDED STILL GOES BEYOND THE
- 10 RELATIVELY NARROW STREAMLINING DESCRIBED IN OUR 2020 ADVOCACY
- 11 PROGRAM. WE BELIEVE THAT GIVEN THE SCALE OF VARIOUS HOUSING
- 12 SHORTAGE THE COMMITTEE SHOULD CONSIDER SUPPORTING LEGISLATION
- 13 AS PROPOSED TO BE AMENDED TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE MEANINGFUL
- 14 OPPORTUNITY TO ACCELERATE THE PRODUCTION OF HOUSING WHILE ALSO
- 15 EXPANDING HIGHWAY CONSTRUCTION JOBS THROUGHOUT THE STATE. WITH
- 16 THAT I'LL CLOSE.

- 18 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH GEORGIA FOR RUNNING
- 19 THROUGH THAT COMPLEX BILL OUICKLY. I WANT TO OPEN THE
- 20 DISCUSSION AND THANK GEORGIA AND STAFF FOR THE THOUGHTFUL
- 21 AMENDMENTS THAT I THINK DO RECOGNIZE THE NEED FOR FLEXIBILITY
- 22 IF THIS BILL IS TO BE ADOPTED PARTICULARLY AROUND WHICH SITES
- 23 WOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR STREAMLINE APPROVAL IN COMMERCIAL
- 24 CORRIDORS. AND I'LL JUST SAY THAT ONE OF THE THINGS I KNOW WE
- 25 HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN THE PAST IS THE TENSION THAT EXISTS



- 1 BETWEEN LABOR AND HOUSING ADVOCATES AROUND ADDRESSING OUR
- 2 HOUSING CRISIS. AND I DO THINK THIS BILL IS A STEP FORWARD IN
- 3 TRYING TO FIND A COMPROMISED POSITION TO ADDRESS LABOR STANDER
- 4 STANDARDS AND TO ADDRESS THE URGENCY OF OUR HOUSING CRISIS. I
- 5 SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO SUPPORT THE POSITION.
- 6 THESE ARE THOUGHTFUL AMENDMENTS THAT I BELIEVE THE BILL AUTHOR
- 7 IS OPEN TOO. AND DOES DESERVE LOCAL DISCRETION IN HOW THE BILL
- 8 COULD BE APPLIED IF THEY'RE ACCEPTED. I'LL OPEN DISCUSSION
- 9 GOING FIRST TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

- 11 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I APPRECIATE IT. AND THANK
- 12 YOU TO STAFF. MY OUESTION IS YOU MENTIONED THERE IS AN
- 13 ABUNDANCE OR JUST, EVEN, EXAMPLES ARE STYMIED HOUSING PROJECTS
- 14 THAT WOULD ADDRESS THIS. IN MY OWN JURISDICTION, SB35 IS
- 15 WORKING JUST FINE. I MEAN, WE HAVE A PROJECT THAT CAME IN. IT
- 16 WAS PERMISSIBLE RESIDENTIAL, AND NOW IT'S GOING TO BE 100%
- 17 HOUSING. AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO THE ADDITIONAL LIMITATIONS ON
- 18 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS HERE, I MEAN, WE ALL HAVE A COMMON GOAL,
- 19 WE WANT WORKERS, WE WANT HOUSING, WE WANT AFFORDABLE HOUSING,
- 20 BUT I'M SEEING A DIRECT CONFLICT WITH OUR BAY AREA 2050 PLAN
- 21 IN THAT THIS IS ONE SIZE FITS ALL. IF YOU HAVE A TRANSIT
- 22 CORRIDOR, THERE ARE LOCAL RESTRICTIONS OR SPECIFIC PLANS
- 23 SPECIFICALLY FOR ENHANCING THE TRANSIT CORRIDOR AND BUILDING
- 24 HOUSING. BUT IT SEEMS LIKE THIS LEGISLATION WOULD BE LIMITING
- 25 THAT AND REALLY CAUSE A LOT OF CHAOS. SO I WOULD SUGGEST MORE



1	FLEXIBILITY FOR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WHO ARE HOUSING JOBS
2	IMBALANCE ALREADY. WE HAVE A MULTITUDE OF HOUSING, AND WE NEED
3	TO BALANCE THE JOBS WITH TRANSIT AND PUT ALL THE PIECES
4	TOGETHER HERE AND THAT DOESN'T SEEM TO BE PERMITTED. I
5	APPRECIATE YOUR SUGGESTED AMENDMENTS BUT I THINK THERE NEED TO
6	BE ADDITIONAL AMENDMENTS SO THAT WE'RE NOT REALLY GETTING THE
7	CONFLICTS THAT WE DISCUSSED IN BAY AREA 2050. JURISDICTIONS
8	NEED TO HAVE MY JURISDICTION, AS AN EXAMPLE WE NEED TO
9	HAVE ACCESS TO A STATION AREA. BUT IF IT'S JUST GOING TO BE
10	HOUSING ALL AROUND HERE AND NO BALANCE, THAT'S PROBLEMATIC TO
11	PUT ALL THE PIECES TOGETHER. SO, YOU CAN HELP ME IN THAT
12	REALM? BECAUSE I FIND IT VERY CONCERNING THE LIMITATIONS THIS
13	USE BY RIGHT, WHEN WE WOULD LOVE TO HAVE MORE INCENTIVES. IF
14	THE BILL WAS PUT FORTH TO GIVE US MORE INCENTIVES TO DO
15	CERTAIN THINGS THAT WOULD BE MUCH MORE HELPFUL. CAN YOU HELP
16	ME IN THAT REALM?
17	
18	GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: THROUGH THE CHAIR.
19	
20	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:
21	
22	GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: COMMISSIONER PAPAN THE AMENDMENTS WE'RE
23	PROPOSING ARE DIRECTLY IN LINE WITH WHAT YOUR CONCERNS ARE

THAT YOU ARE RAISING. I WOULD FIRST SAY THAT WE MENTIONED



FIRST EXAMPLES OF HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT HAS BEEN, YOU KNOW, 1 2 POTENTIALLY STYMIED BY EXISTING ZONING. 3 GINA PAPAN: I MENTIONED THAT. 4 5 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: I MENTIONED THAT OUR 2022 ADVOCACY 6 PROGRAM EXPLICITLY IDENTIFIED THAT REDEVELOPMENT OF COMMERCIAL 7 8 ZONES IS A POTENTIAL TO ACCOMMODATE MULTIPLE HOUSING GOALS AND 9 IT ALSO REALLY SUPPORTED USE BY RIGHT IN COMMERCIAL ZONES. 10 GINA PAPAN: GEORGIA, CAN I ASK ONE QUESTION THERE. SO WE ARE 11 DOING THAT WITHIN OUR JURISDICTION. WE ARE REDESIGNATING 12 COMMERCIAL. SAN BRUNO, THE WHOLE THING, BUT WHAT CONCERNS ME 13 IS THE STREAMLINING YOU'RE SUGGESTING HERE WHAT WE ARE DOING 14 JUST THAT. DO YOU HAVE SPECIFIC AREAS WHERE THIS STYMIEING HAS 15 16 OCCURRED? 17 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: I THINK WE'RE KIND OF TALKING ON A MORE 18 ABSTRACT LEVEL HERE. I WANT TO RECOGNIZE THERE ARE MANY OTHER 19 MEMBERS THAT HAVE OUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. SO, GEORGIA IF YOU 20 21 WANT TO BRIEFLY RESPOND THEN WE CAN GO BACK TO COMMISSIONER 22 PAPAN IF SHE HAS OTHER QUESTIONS. 23 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: THE AMOUNT OF OUR AMENDMENT IS TO 24

ENSURE THAT THE LOCAL PLANNING THAT JURISDICTIONS IN THE BAY



- 1 AREA ARE UNDERTAKING TO ACCOMMODATE MORE RESIDENTIAL
- 2 DEVELOPMENT ON EXTERNAL CORRIDORS WOULD BE REFLECTED AND THE
- 3 USE BY RIGHT PROVISIONS OF THE BILL WOULD NOT APPLY TO THOSE
- 4 AREAS. THOSE AREAS THAT HAVE BEEN REZONED. SO, OF COURSE WE
- 5 WOULD HAVE TO BE WORKING WITH JURISDICTIONS TO IDENTIFY WHAT
- 6 ARE APPROPRIATE PARAMETERS AROUND WHAT'S A PLAN THAT SORT OF
- 7 MEETS THE APPROPRIATE CRITERIA AND THRESHOLDS FOR AN UPZONE OR
- 8 COMMERCIAL CORRIDOR. BUT THAT'S THE INTENT OF THE SECOND
- 9 AMENDMENT.

10

- 11 GINA PAPAN: TO SUM UP, I STILL FIND IT PROBLEMATIC IN THAT WE
- 12 ARE DOING JUST THAT, AND I STILL SEE -- I HOPE YOU ARE
- 13 SUCCESSFUL IN YOUR AMENDMENTS BECAUSE IT IS EXTREMELY
- 14 PERSONALITY FOR US TO KEEP THE BALANCE OF TRANSIT CORRIDOR AND
- 15 ALL OF THAT WHEN SOMETHING JUST DOESN'T HAPPEN, WHEN SOMETHING
- 16 BY RIGHT IS IMPLEMENTED.

17

18 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: EKLUND.

- 20 PAT EKLUND: THANK YOU. I THINK THIS BILL SHOULD NOT GO FORWARD
- 21 AT THIS POINT UNTIL WE HAVE A LOT MORE DISCUSSION ABOUT IT.
- 22 AND GEORGIA, I REALLY DO APPRECIATE YOUR AMENDMENTS BUT IT
- 23 DOESN'T GO FAR ENOUGH. IN MY OPINION, I AM TIRED -- I AM TIRED
- 24 OF THESE BY RIGHT PIECES OF STATE LEGISLATION. THE STATE
- 25 LEGISLATURE -- AND MAYBE WE NEED AN INITIATIVE, STATEWIDE,





- 1 THAT SAYS YOU CAN'T DO ANY MORE HOUSING LAWS FOR THE NEXT TWO
- 2 OR THREE YEARS. WE NEED TO SEE HOW THESE EXISTING LAWS THAT
- 3 HAVE BEEN PASSED THAT WE'RE TRYING TO IMPLEMENT WILL ACTUALLY
- 4 EFFECT THE HOUSING DELTA. I DO NOT SUPPORT BY RIGHT, ALLOWING
- 5 SOMEBODY TO TAKE A COMMERCIAL OR PIECE OF PROPERTY AND THEN BE
- 6 ABLE TO DO HOUSING. WE HAVE POOR PROPERTY TAX CITIES IS, LIKE
- 7 THE CITY OF NOVATO, WE ONLY GET \$0.07 ON THE THERE. MOST
- 8 CITIES GET BETWEEN 14 OR 15, AND \$0.26 ON THE THERE, OR MORE.
- 9 AND, SO WITH THE PROPOSE AM, AND I GUESS IT'S ALREADY STATE
- 10 LAW, I'M NOT SURE, THAT IF YOU HAVE 100% AFFORDABILITY
- 11 PROJECTS, YOU DON'T HAVE TO PAY ANY PROPERTY TAX, THEN THAT'S
- 12 GOING TO PUT POOR PROPERTY TAX CITIES A COUPLE OF STEPS
- 13 BACKWARDS ALREADY. SO, I -- SO, I DO NOT SUPPORT THIS BY
- 14 RIGHT. GINA IS ABSOLUTELY RIGHT THAT WE ARE LOOKING AND
- 15 PROVIDING AS PART OF THE HOUSING ELEMENT WHERE THERE ARE
- 16 COMMERCIAL PIECES OF PROPERTY THAT ARE STRUGGLING, AND, SO, WE
- 17 ARE LOOKING AT DOING A MIXTURE OF COMMERCIAL AND RESIDENTIAL.
- 18 BUT BY HAVING BY RIGHT, THAT DOESN'T GIVE THE COMMUNITY OR THE
- 19 CITY ANY OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY DO WHAT WE THINK IS BEST FOR
- 20 OUR COMMUNITY. SECONDLY, THEY SAY A COMMERCIAL PROPERTY THAT
- 21 CAN BE USED WITH -- NEXT TO A 4 TO 6 LANE ROAD. YOU KNOW, I'M
- 22 SORRY, BUT YOU PUT HOUSING IN THAT PARTICULAR AREA, YOU'RE,
- 23 AGAIN, ESPECIALLY 100% AFFORDABLE, YOU'RE PUTTING PEOPLE THAT
- 24 ARE LOW-INCOME, IN AN AREA THAT HAS A HIGH POLLUTION LEVEL,
- 25 UNLESS WE GET RID OF GAS OR DIESEL -- ACTUALLY DIESEL IS EVEN



- 1 WORSE THAN GAS. SO, I AGREE WITH THE LEAGUE OF CALIFORNIA
- 2 CITIES WHO HAS TAKEN AN OPPOSITION POSITION. IN FACT, THEY
- 3 PROVIDE SOME SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF, YOU KNOW, WHY IS IT THAT
- 4 YOU'RE ELIMINATING OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC REVIEW ON HOUSING
- 5 DEVELOPMENT AND COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES AND ELSEWHERE, WHERE WE
- 6 HAVE TO GO THROUGH THE HOUSING ELEMENT WITH PUBLIC PROCESS.
- 7 BUT THEIR COMMENTS ARE RIGHT ON. SO, AND GEORGIA, YOUR
- 8 COMMENTS THAT DEVELOPMENT IS STYMIED BY CURRENT ZONING, I
- 9 REALLY THINK THAT THAT'S A LOADED STATEMENT. AND I REALLY
- 10 THINK THAT WITH ALL OF THE HOUSING LAWS THAT HAVE BEEN PASSED
- 11 WITH WHAT DEVELOPMENT IS BEING STYMIED BY RIGHT NOW IS
- 12 DEVELOPERS WHO HAVE THE MONEY TO BUILD THE HOUSING UNITS AND
- 13 THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO. THAT'S WHY I'M SAYING WE NEED
- 14 TO BE ABLE TO HAVE FUND AVAILABLE TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO BE
- 15 ABLE TO BUY DOWN SOME OF THE COST OF SOME OF THOSE UNITS OR
- 16 ELSE WE'RE NEVER GOING MAKE IT. I'M GOING TO VOTE NO. I URGE
- 17 THE COMMITTEE TO HAVE MORE DISCUSSION ABOUT THIS ESPECIALLY
- 18 ABOUT SOME OF THE AMENDMENTS. I BELIEVE MAYBE WE CAN GET TO A
- 19 BETTER PLACE. IF WE HAVE MORE TIME. IT'S ALMOST 1:00 AND SOME
- 20 OF US HAVE MORE MEETINGS. I'M GOING TO VOTE NO ON THE
- 21 RECOMMENDATION. GEORGIA I APPRECIATE YOUR HARD WORK ON THIS
- 22 BILL. WE DON'T NEED THIS BILL. WE CAN DO IT NOW.

24 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY IT DOESN'T TAKE A CRYSTAL BALL TO

25 GET A SENSE THAT THERE AREN'T A MAJORITY OF THOSE PRESENT TO



- 1 MAKE A RECOMMENDATION TO THE RESPECTIVE BOARDS, JUDGING BY WHO
- 2 IS PRESENT. SO IT'S THE PREROGATIVE OF THE CHAIRS, MYSELF, AND
- 3 CHAIR PEDROZA TO HAVE THIS GO FURTHER TO OUR RESPECTIVE BODIES
- 4 FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATION. I WOULD ADVISE THAT
- 5 HAPPENS TO ELLEN ABLE FURTHER DISCUSSION IN RESPECT. WE
- 6 DEFINITELY SHOULD CONTINUE WITH DISCUSSION OF THIS BILL. AND
- 7 THEN WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT.

8

9 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER CONNOLY.

- 11 DAMON CONNOLLY: I APPRECIATE THE RECOMMENDATION. I THINK YOU
- 12 DID ACCURATELY ASSESS WHERE THINGS ARE GOING. JUST A FEW
- 13 THOUGHTS. I THINK THE CONCEPT BEHIND THE BILL IS A GOOD ONE,
- 14 SIMPLY TALKING ABOUT REIMAGINING UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL
- 15 SPACES AS A POTENTIAL SOLUTION TOWARD HOUSING AFFORDABILITY IN
- 16 THE BAY AREA. THAT HAVING BEEN SAID, I CERTAINLY ALIGN MYSELF
- 17 WITH THE COMMENTS OF COMMISSIONER PAPAN THAT THE WAY TO DO IT
- 18 IS NOT THROUGH A TOP-DOWN STATE MANDATE PROCESS. LOCALITY NEED
- 19 FLEXIBILITY TO DO THIS IF THEY ARE MOTIVED. IF THERE ARE
- 20 CONSTRAINTS THAT STATE LEGISLATION IS NECESSARY FOR IT MIGHT
- 21 BE AROUND JUST CLEARING AWAY OBSTACLES TO ALLOW LOCAL
- 22 COMMUNITIES TO HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY TO DO THIS. THE AMENDMENTS
- 23 ARE ON THE RIGHT TRACK, MY SENSE IS THEY NEED TO GO FURTHER OR
- 24 CONTINUE TO BE THOUGHT THROUGH IN THAT REGARD. SIMILARLY, I DO
- 25 FEEL THAT YOU ARE ON THE RIGHT TRACK WITH THERE SHOULD BE FULL



1	RONA CREDIT FOR ANYTHING THAT OCCURS IN THIS. I KNOW I CAN
2	THINK OF A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES IN MY AREA IN UNDERUTILIZED
3	SHOPPING MALL IN NORTHGATE WHERE THEY'RE IN THE PROCESS OF
4	THINKING ABOUT HOW IS RETAIL GOING TO LOOK. RIGHT? HOW ARE THE
5	PROSPECTS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING THERE NEAR THE SMART STATION?
6	I THINK THE COMMUNITY IS INTERESTED IN THAT IF PURSUED IN THE
7	RIGHT WAY OF COMPLETELY VACANT OFFICE COMPLEX IN NOVATO,
8	ANOTHER EXAMPLE. AND AS I THINK, ONE MEMBER REFERENCED
9	EARLIER, JUST THE CHANGING LANDSCAPE OF HOW FOLKS ARE EVEN
10	WORKING OR WHERE THEY'RE WORKING. SIMILARLY, I THINK THE BILL
11	IS MOVING TOWARD BETTER LABOR STANDARDS, BUT I'LL NOTE, AT
12	LEAST THE LATEST BREAK OUT I SAW, THERE STILL SEEMS TO BE A
13	SPLIT IN LABOR ON THIS. SO VERY INTERESTED IN LEARNING MORE
14	ABOUT WHAT'S CREATING THAT, AS WELL. SO, I DON'T THINK THIS IS
15	QUITE READY FOR PRIME TIME. AND, MAYBE WE CAN PLAY A
16	CONSTRUCTIVE ROLE IN CONTINUING TO TALK THROUGH THE ISSUES.
17	
18	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. NEXT TO COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
19	VERNACI.
20	
21	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YES. THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN. I AGREE
22	THAT THESE AMENDMENTS HELP IMPROVE THE BILL, BUT, LIKE,
23	COMMENTS FROM THE OTHERS, I AM CERTAINLY CONCERNED ABOUT ANY
24	TIME I HEAR THE WORD BY RIGHT. BECAUSE ANYTHING THAT TAKES

AWAY LOCAL CONTROL IS VERY CONCERNING TO ME. AND AS WAS



- 1 MENTIONED, I THINK LOCALITY ARE ALREADY HEADED DOWN THIS ROAD
- 2 ON THEIR OWN. I'M THINKING IN SOUTH ALAMEDA COUNTY, FOR
- 3 EXAMPLE, THERE IS A SHOPPING CENTER THAT STARTED -- THE CITY
- 4 ITSELF STARTED TO DO SOME REZONING PUTTING HOUSING THERE
- 5 BECAUSE RECOGNIZING THAT RETAIL WAS NOT WHAT IT ONCE WAS. WE
- 6 DO NEED THE HOUSING I DON'T WANT TO SEE THE LOCAL CONTROL
- 7 TAKEN AWAY AND THE COMPONENT OF BY RIGHT, AND THE SITUATION
- 8 WITH THE SCHOOLS BEING OVERCROWDED AND SO MANY OTHER ISSUES
- 9 WHEN HOUSING COMES OUT WITHOUT A THOUGHTFUL LOCAL
- 10 CONVERSATION. SO, THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK.
- 12 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL GO NEXT TO MAYOR
- 13 HUDSON.

11

- 15 DAVID E. HUDSON: DITTO WHAT CAROLE HAS SAID ALL OF YOU HAVE
- 16 SAID UP TO THIS POINT. THERE IS ONE FUNDAMENTAL MISTAKE WITH
- 17 THIS BILL THAT CAN'T BE IGNORED AND THAT IS OUR
- 18 RESPONSIBILITIES WITHIN THE SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY STRATEGY AND
- 19 A.B. 32, SB 375 IN PARTICULAR STATES REDUCING VEHICLE MILES
- 20 TRAVELED. I HAVE GOT A SHOPPING CENTER NEXT TO THE BUSINESS
- 21 PARK IN NEW CITY THAT HASN'T BEEN DOING MAINTENANCE THERE TEN
- 22 YEARS BECAUSE THEY KNOW WHEN'S COMING. AND THE ACTUAL GROCERY
- 23 STORE JUST LEFT. THIS IS WHY I BROUGHT IT UP UNDER THE TOC
- 24 POLICIES THESE PEOPLE COULD BUILD A BEAUTIFUL CASE FOR FALLING
- 25 UNDER 2011. THE PROBLEM IS I HAVE ALREADY ENTITLED 500 HOMES





- 1 AROUND THERE WHERE THE BUILDER IS GOING TO PROVIDE FREE
- 2 TRANSIT FOR ANYBODY THAT LIVES OR WORKS THERE IT'S WITHIN
- 3 WALKING DISTANCE OF, CERTAINLY, BIKING DISTANCE, AND HAS THEIR
- 4 OWN BIKESHARE PROGRAM, OF THIS SHOPPING CENTER, AND IT WILL
- 5 DISAPPEAR IF THIS GOES THROUGH. IS IT MAKES MATTERS EVEN MORE
- 6 FUN FOR THE MAYOR OF THIS CITY CHEVRON JUST ANNOUNCED THEY'RE
- 7 SELLING THEIR BUSINESS PARK SO NOW I'M GOING TO HAVE 7,000
- 8 HOMES AROUND THIS SHOPPING CENTER TO WHICH EVERYONE WILL HAVE
- 9 TO DRIVE FIVE MILES PROBABLY DAILY TO SHOP. THERE HAS TO BE
- 10 DISCRETION WHERE THE CITY IS ALLOWED TO SHOW THAT THEY'RE
- 11 MOVING TOWARDS THEIR PART IN THIS EQUATION. IF CHEVRON GOES
- 12 I'M NOT AT THE 1-TO-1 HOUSING BALANCE OR THE EXACT OPPOSITE
- 13 WHERE I HAVE FLIPPED FROM HAVING MORE COMMERCIAL THAN HOUSING
- 14 TO HAVING MORE HOUSING THAN COMMERCIAL. IT'S ALWAYS THE SAME
- 15 THING TWO THIRDS OUTFLOWING IN THE MORNING ARE GOING TO BE
- 16 COMMUTING. THERE IS SOMETHING FUNDAMENTALLY WRONG WITH WHERE
- 17 THEY'RE TRYING TO FIX SOMETHING. AND AS STATED EARLIER, THE
- 18 BIGGEST PROBLEM IS ENTITLEMENTS MAY BE THERE BUT HOW DO YOU
- 19 FUND IT. THAT'S WHY I KEEP BRINGING UP, WE HAVE GOT TO COME UP
- 20 WITH A SECONDARY MARKET FOR SOMEONE LIKE MY CITY THAT LOANS
- 21 EVERY DIME THEY HAVE GOT, AND WILL GET, TOWARDS A 100%
- 22 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND I HAVE ANOTHER BUILDER THAT WANTS TO
- 23 DO IT, AND KEEPS RAISING THE NUMBER OF HOMES TO BUILD TO MAKE
- 24 IT WORK, AND I'M SAYING YEAH, GO HIGHER, WHATEVER IT TAKES.
- 25 AND THEN SOMETHING LIKE THIS COMES IN, WHERE WHATEVER THEY'RE



GOING TO TRY TO DO IS GOING TO DEFEAT IT. WE NEED TO FOCUS ON 1 2 DOES IT REDUCE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED BEFORE SOMEBODY GETS A 3 USE BY RIGHT. AND I'LL SHUT UP AND HAD THE SOMEBODY ELSE CHIME IN. 4 5 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL GO TO COMMISSIONER 6 7 WORK. 8 AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAKING. I'M 9 ON THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO 10 THE SUPPORT THE EFFORT OF ASSEMBLY MEMBER WICKS, THE HOUSING 11 COMMITTEE. THE PROBLEM WITH JURISDICTIONS IS LACK OF AVAILABLE 12 LAND. SECOND, TO BUILD MULTI-FAMILY AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SECOND 13 PIECE IS THAT YOU TALK ABOUT ONE OF THE BARRIERS, THE BARRIERS 14 15 ARE TIME. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ZONING CHANGE FROM COMMERCIAL 16 PROPERTY TO MULTI-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL TAKES YEARS AND YEARS. I WOULD ASK STAFF TO PROVIDE THAT SUMMARY STREET THAT 17 ILLUSTRATES THE DECLINE IN HOUSING PRODUCTION IN THE BAY AREA 18 OVER THE LAST SEVERAL RHNA CYCLES IT IS REALLY STUNNING. AND 19 IT SHOWS WHY WE ARE IN A HOUSING CRISIS. WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE 20 21 TREMENDOUS REDUCTION IN ACTUAL HOUSING PRODUCTION. I'M ALSO APPRECIATIVE THIS IS A REAL STRUNG EFFORT TO TRY TO REACH A 22 COMPROMISE WITH THE HOUSING AFFORDABLE HOUSING BUILDERS TO 23 ADDRESS THESE ISSUES BECAUSE THE BOTTOM LINE IS PROJECTS ARE 24

NOT GETTING BUILT. AND I THINK WE A SHORTAGE EVER AVAILABLE



1

JUNE 10, 2022

LAND AND A LOT OF OUR CITIES ARE LOOKING TOWARDS UNDERSERVED

- 2 UNDERPERFORMING UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL SPACES. WITH 3 AMENDMENTS ONE OF THE AREAS IS THE IDEA OF WHERE THESE SITES ARE LOCATED. IN A NUMBER OF SMALLER JURISDICTIONS THESE SITES 4 5 ARE NOT ON FOUR LANE ROADS. SO THEY'RE MAYBE ON TWO LANE ROADS SO HAVING THAT FLEXIBILITY MIGHT BE ANOTHER ENHANCEMENT THAT 6 WOULD ENABLE CITIES OF ALL DIFFERENT SIZES TO BE ABLE TO TAKE 7 8 ADVANTAGE OF THIS. I ALSO SUPPORT THE RHNA TIES WITH THIS. AND I THINK THIS IS THE KIND OF TOOL THAT IS GOING TO ENABLE 9 10 CITIES TO REACH THEIR REQUIRED RHNA NUMBERS. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO IT COMING BACK TO THE COUNCIL. I APPRECIATE THE 11 CHAIR'S CALL ON BRINGING THIS BACK TO OUR RESPECTIVE BOARD, SO 12 WE CAN TAKE ACTION LATER. THANK YOU. 13 14 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? 15 16
- 17 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. I'M ALSO NOT ON THIS COMMITTEE. SO
- 18 THANK YOU FOR GIVING ME THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. I'M ALSO,
- 19 LIKE, COMMISSIONER WORTH, SUPPORTIVE OF THIS. I THINK THAT
- 20 WE'RE -- THERE ARE MANY REASONS TO COMMENT WHY WE SHOULD BE
- 21 TAKING UNDERUSE THE COMMERCIAL PROPERTY AND TURNING IT INTO
- 22 BADLY NEEDED AFFORDABLE HOUSING ESPECIALLY BECAUSE WE DON'T
- 23 HAVE TO DEMOLISH EXISTING HOMES TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN WITH ALL
- 24 THE SORT OF POTENTIAL UNCERTAINTIES THAT COME WITH THAT. AND
- 25 WE'RE ALSO SORT OF GOING INTO A -- IF WE LOOK FORWARD, EVEN IF



WE LOOK WHERE WE ARE TODAY THERE IS MORE VACANT OFFICE MORE IS 1 2 MORE VACANT RETAIL AS PEOPLE GO TO THE OFFICE LESS AS PEOPLE 3 SHOP MORE ONLINE. AND FINDING A WAY TO USE THE SPACE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING WHICH IS NEEDED TODAY IS RIGHT ON. AND WITH 4 5 THE LABOR STANDARDS, IT'S INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT THAT WE FIND A WAY NOT ONLY TO BUILD HOUSING BUT ALSO TO CREATE MIDDLE CLASS 6 JOBS SO WE CAN MAKE HOUSING AFFORDABLE AND STABLE EVEN IF IT'S 7 8 UNSUBSIDIZED. I THINK THIS IS AN PERSON STEP FORWARD IN FINDING A WAY BRINGING GROUPS TOGETHER WHO DON'T FIND 9 AGREEMENT TO CREATE LABOR STANDARDS SO THAT PEOPLE EARNING 10 LOWER WAGES CAN GET INTO HOUSING AND ALSO FOR JOBS FOR 11 APPRENTICES AND PEOPLE WHO DO NOT HAVE ACCESS TO JOBS, AND 12 GROWING OUR CONSTRUCTION LABOR FORCE CRITICAL TO MEETING OUR 13 HOUSING NEEDS AS WELL AS TO BEING ABLE TO BUILD INFRASTRUCTURE 14 15 ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE THAT WE NEED. I'M LOOKING FORWARD 16 TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT THIS WHEN IT COMES TO MTC. 17 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: MAYOR HUDSON BEFORE WE TAKE TO PUBLIC 18 19 COMMENT. 20 DAVID E. HUDSON: HOW MANY WE NEED TO BUILD? I WOULD LIKE TO 21 22 KNOW HOW MANY ARE ENTITLED AND THEY'RE NOT GETTING FUNDING OR FINANCING TO DO WHAT THEY NEED TO DO. I WOULD ALSO SAY WHEN 23 YOU SAY THERE ISN'T ENOUGH LAND THAT ISN'T TRUE I'M DOING ALL 24

THE HOUSING I TOLD YOU ABOUT ON EXACTLY WHERE THE CONSTRUCTION



- 1 ALREADY IS. WE HAVE ONLY TORN DOWN ONE BUILDING, THE REALITY
- 2 HERE IS DO YOU WANT TO DO IT. I'M TELLING YOU WHEN YOU DO WANT
- 3 TO DO IT AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO GET THIS CRAMMED DOWN OUR
- 4 THROAT BECAUSE WE CAN'T DO EXTREMELY LOW OR THE VERY LOW THAT
- 5 WE CAN SET DURING THE TONE OF THIS RHNA CYCLE. I'M GOING TO
- 6 HAVE UPSET PEOPLE; AND I'M ON THEIR SIDE. WHEN I'M TOLD 5,000
- 7 I DO 7,000 BUT DON'T DO 375 EXTREMELY LOW SO YOU CAN CRAM MORE
- 8 DOWN MY THROAT BECAUSE SOME GUY DOESN'T WANT TO DO HIS
- 9 MAINTENANCE AND IN THE END I HAVE TO INCREASE THE VEHICLE
- 10 MILES TRAVELED. THE WAY IS STILL IN THE FINANCING AND FUNDING.
- 11 THERE IS NO GETTING AROUND IT. TRYING TO PASS THIS BILL SO
- 12 SOMEBODY WILL BUY IT DOWN ISN'T GOING TO WORK. YOU HAVE CITIES
- 13 THAT HAVE LOANS OUT RIGHT NOW TO THE DEVELOPERS TO MAKE IT
- 14 HAPPEN BY THOSE LOANS ON ET PREMISE THEY HAVE TO DO IT AGAIN
- 15 IS THEN WE'LL MOVE FORWARD. BUT RIGHT NOW ALL THIS IS GOING TO
- 16 BE STYMIED IN ENTITLEMENTS NOT BUILDING. THAT'S THE PROBLEM.
- 18 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. I SUGGEST WE TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT
- 19 ON THIS BILL ON ASSEMBLY BILL 2011. I WANT TO NOTE THIS WILL
- 20 BE COMING TO THE MTC COMMISSION AND ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD SO
- 21 THERE WILL BE ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THIS. I SEE WE
- 22 HAVE ONE RAISED HAND.
- 24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR ARREGUIN THIS IS FRED I'M TAKING
- 25 OVER FOR MARTHA. ONE MINUTE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT?

23



1

### JUNE 10, 2022

JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: YES. AND I THINK WE SHOULD ALSO ALERT 2 3 THE SPEAKER WHEN THE 15 SECONDS ARE ABOUT TO COME UP. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: GIVE ME A MOMENT TO SHARE MY TIMER. OUR FIRST SPEAKER IS VINAY PIMPLE, GO AHEAD, PLEASE. YOU HAVE ONE 6 7 MINUTE. 8 VINAY PIMPLE: I'M VINAY PIMPLE, I'M ON THE POLICY ADVISORY 9 COUNCIL. I THINK ONE OF THE ISSUES WITH THIS BILL IS THAT IT 10 ASSUMES SOME KIND OF BAD FAITH ON THE PART OF THE CITIES AND 11 PING THIS'S WHAT'S BUGGING THE PEOPLE WHO ARE OPPOSING IT. I 12 THINK IT WOULD BE USEFUL ASKING THE ASSEMBLY PERSON TRYING TO 13 LAY OUT, WILL THERE BE ANY, SOME KIND OF REQUIREMENT, IF THERE 14 IS BATTLEFIELD BY THE CITY AND IT GOES TO THAT EFFECT AND IF 15 16 THERE ISN'T -- [INDISCERNIBLE] AND SHOULD BE EFFORT TO DEFINE 17 TERMS, PRICE OF OWNERSHIP. 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC SPEAKERS. NO 19 WRITTEN COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM. 20 21 22 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. SO, AS I NOTED, MAYOR SCHAFF, THANK YOU FOR JOINING US. GIVEN THAT WE'RE BARELY 23 HANGING ON TO QUORUM MY RECOMMENDATION IS THIS GO FORWARD TO 24 RESPECTIVE BOARDS. I WILL BE CALENDARING THIS FOR DISCUSSION 25



AT THE NEXT ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING AND ASK CHAIR PEDROZA 1 2 ALSO DO THAT FOR THE RESPECTIVE COMMISSIONS AND DISCUSSIONS TO 3 TAKE ACTION. MAYOR SCHAFF? 4 5 LIBBY SCHAAF: I APOLOGIZE. I'M LATE. IS I'M GOING TO HAVE TO POP OFF AFTERWARDS. I WANT TO CHIME IN. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE 6 THAT ARE ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS WORKED WITH MY OFFICE TO MAKE 7 8 CHANGES TO THIS BILL THEY THOUGHT, I WAS HOPING WOULD WIN OVER SOME FOLKS TO REALLY KIND OF DO MORE TO ADDRESS ENVIRONMENTAL 9 JUSTICE CONCERNS AROUND NOT ALLOWING THIS BILL ON INDUSTRIAL 10 LANDS, AS HAD AS TO ALLOW AREA-SPECIFIC PLANS THAT ARE DONE BY 11 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO SUPERSEDE THIS LEGISLATION. SO THERE IS 12 A RESPECT OF LOCAL CONTROL WITH THAT AMENDMENT. AND, SO, I 13 HOPE FOR SOME PEOPLE THAT THAT IS A CONCERN, THIS IS ONE OF 14 15 THE WAYS THAT THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER IS BEING RESPONSIVE TO THOSE 16 CONCERNS SO THAT THOSE OF US WHO DO THESE AREA SPECIFIC PLANS, THAT WILL SUPERSEDE. I WANT TO SHARE MY EXPERIENCE AS A 17 JURISDICTION THAT GOT FUNDING FOR SEVERAL OF THE HOMEKEY 18 PROJECTS. TO HAVE THIS STREAMLINING MAKES A WORLD OF 19 DIFFERENCE. AND I REALLY DO BELIEVE THAT EVEN WHERE RESOURCES 20 21 ARE -- YOU KNOW, THERE ARE OTHER ISSUES THAT, CERTAINLY, ARE A PART OF OUR HOUSING CRISIS HERE IN THE BAY AREA, BUT THE 22 BUREAUCRATIC RED TAPE IS SOMETHING THAT I THINK WE ALL AGREE 23 ON, NO MATTER WHAT POLITICAL PERSUASION, I THINK WE CAN ALL 24

AGREE THAT THERE IS A LOT OF BUREAUCRATIC PROCESS AND DELAY



AND THAT IT IS DELAY OUR ABLE TO PROVIDE DESPERATELY NEEDED 1 HOUSING. I FOR ONE AM EXTREME HE SUPPORTIVE OF 2011. I BELIEVE 2 3 THAT THE AUTHOR HAS TAKEN LOCAL CONSIDERATIONS INTO, PUT THEM INTO EFFECT WITH THE RECENT REVISIONS, AND I CAN JUST SAY FROM 4 5 OUR EXPERIENCE OF BEING ALLOWED THE STREAMLINING THAT WAS PROVIDED BY HOMEKEY, I MEAN, WE WERE ABLE TO GET ROOFS OVER 6 PEOPLE'S HEADS IN A MATTER OF MONTHS SOMETHING THAT USED TO 7 8 TAKE YEARS WE WERE ABLE TO GET DONE IN THREE MONTHS. I FROM EXPERIENCE KNOW THAT THESE TYPES OF STREAMLINING ABSOLUTELY 9 MAKE A DIFFERENCE AND ACTUALLY HELP US TO GET ROOFS OVER 10 PEOPLE'S HEADS IN A WAY THAT RESPECTS WORKERS, RESPECTS OUR 11 LOCAL CONTROL, RESPECTS ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE, AND I CERTAINLY 12 HOPE THAT WE ALL WILL SUPPORT THIS. IT IS VERY IMPORTANT ON A 13 LOT OF DIFFERENT LEVELS. SO, THAT'S MY HUMBLE REQUEST. NICK, 14 15 IT'S IMPOSSIBLE TO SPEAK AFTER YOU. YOU ALWAYS MAKE EVERYTHING 16 SOUND SO GOOD WITH THAT ACCENT. BUT, ANYWAY, THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE HEARD ON THIS BILL. 17 18 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. 19 20 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: TO-MAT-O. IT'S EASY WHEN YOU TRY. 21 22 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS. 23 THIS WILL GO FORWARD TO MTC COMMISSION AND ABAG EXECUTIVE 24

BOARD FOR DISCUSSION WITHOUT A RECOMMENDATION I APPRECIATE THE



- 1 VERY THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSION WE HAD HERE TODAY. BEING MINDFUL OF
- 2 THE TIME WE HAVE TWO REMAINING INFORMATION ITEMS. ITEM 3D
- 3 UPDATE ON THE FY 2022, 2023 STATE BUDGET UPDATE. REBECCA LONG.

- 5 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU. I WAS HOPING TO HAVE MORE OF A
- 6 CONCRETE UPDATE ON THE STATE BUDGET. WE HAVE SOME ENCOURAGING
- 7 NEWS WITH RESPECT TO THE TRANSPORTATION HOUSING IN YOUR PACKET
- 8 ATTACHMENT D IS THE LEGISLATIVE AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE ASSEMBLY
- 9 AND SENATE, TOP LINE NUMBERS WHAT THAT INCLUDED FOR
- 10 TRANSPORTATION IS \$10.9 BILLION OVER FOUR YEARS. AND WE DO,
- 11 FROM WHAT WE HAVE HEARD THIS SORT OF MULTI-YEAR COMMITMENT IS
- 12 REAL, IN THE SENSE THAT FUTURE YEARS WOULD BE BUILT INTO THE
- 13 BASELINE BUDGET. SO THEY WOULD REALLY BE NEEDING TO TAKE IT
- 14 OUT. SO THAT'S ENCOURAGING. BUT WE DON'T KNOW YET HOW MUCH
- 15 WOULD BE FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT, HOW MUCH WOULD BE FOR ACTIVE
- 16 TRANSPORTATION. AND WHAT WE ANTICIPATE IS THEY'RE NOT GOING TO
- 17 REACH AGREEMENT ON THOSE DETAILS UNTIL LATER THIS MONTH.
- 18 NEGOTIATIONS ARE ONGOING AS IT RELATES TO HIGH SPEED RAIL. BUT
- 19 THEY DO HOPE ALL OF THE KEY PARTIES DO HOPE TO REACH AGREEMENT
- 20 BEFORE THE BEGINNING OF THE FISCAL YEAR. ON HOUSING, IT'S ON
- 21 PAGE 24 OF THAT LONG LEGISLATIVE AGREEMENT. THERE IS ALSO SOME
- 22 ENCOURAGING ADDITIONS THAT THE LEGISLATURE INCLUDED RELATED TO
- 23 COMMENTS DIRECTOR HUDSON WAS MAKING ABOUT PROJECTS IN THE
- 24 PIPELINE THAT JUST NEED MONEY. THERE IS 400 MILLION PROPOSED
- 25 FOR MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING PROGRAM. 300 MILLION FOR THE HOUSING



- 1 ACCELERATOR PROGRAM, AS WELL AS 200 MILLION FOR HOUSING
- 2 PRESERVATION PROGRAM, WHICH IS A NEW PROGRAM. WE HAVE BEEN
- 3 HOPING FOR MORE. WE HAD ASKED FOR 6 BILLION FOR AFFORDABLE
- 4 HOUSING IT DOESN'T LOOK LIKE WE WILL GET THAT. BUT THE
- 5 LEGISLATURE IS AUGMENTING ABOVE THE GOVERNOR'S PROPOSAL. WITH
- 6 THAT HOPEFULLY WHEN WE COME TO YOU IN JULY WE'LL HAVE MORE
- 7 DETAILS AND BE ABLE TO REPORT ON A TRANSPORTATION PACKAGE AND
- 8 EXACTLY HOW MUCH CAME IN FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND WITH
- 9 THAT, I WILL CLOSE. THANK YOU FOR A LONG MEETING AND BEARING
- 10 WITH US.

11

16

20

- 12 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. QUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION FROM
- 13 THE COMMITTEE. IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. I DO NOT SEE ANY
- 14 RAISED HANDS. I'LL ASK IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE
- 15 2022, 2023 STATE BUDGET UPDATE?
- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 19 ON THIS ITEM.
- 21 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM 4A,
- 22 THE WASHINGTON, D.C. LEGISLATIVE UPDATE AND I'LL TURN IT OVER
- 23 TO GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN.



- 1 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: THE LEGISLATIVE UPDATE IS IF YOUR
  2 PACKET FOR REVIEW, AS A REMINDER, THE CHAIR, VICE CHAIR, AND
- 3 COMMISSIONERS ARE GOING TO BE GOING TO DC THIS UPCOMING WEEK
- 4 AND WILL REPORT BACK TO YOU AND THERE WILL HOPEFULLY BE GREAT
- 5 NEWS ABOUT ALL PROJECTS GETTING FUNDED.

6

- 7 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. COMMITTEE ANY FURTHER
- 8 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? SEEING NO RAISED HANDS. I'LL ASK FOR
- 9 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

10

- 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 12 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 13 ON THIS ITEM.

14

- 15 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE.
- 16 THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO READ THE
- 17 NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT
- 18 RECEIVED BY 5:00 YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD AND ASK IF THERE
- 19 ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PRESENT WHO WISH TO SPEAK RAISE
- 20 YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE AND I'LL CALL UPON YOU.

21

- 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 23 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 24 ON THIS ITEM.



1	JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU, ALL, SO MUCH, FOR
2	BEARING WITH THIS LONG AGENDA. WE HAD SOME IMPORTANT BUSINESS
3	TO TAKE CARE OF TODAY. WE'RE ON ITEM SIX, ADJOURNMENT. THE
4	NEXT MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WILL
5	BE FRIDAY JULY 8TH 2022, AT 9:45 A.M. ANY CHANGES TO THE
6	SCHEDULE WILL KNOW DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THIS MEETING IS
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]
27 28	
29 30 31	
32 33	
34 35	
36 37	
38 39	



Broadcasting Government