

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MAY 11, 2022

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**
3 **WEDNESDAY, MAY 11, 2022 1:30 PM**

4
5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WELCOME TO THE MAY 11TH, 2022
6 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING. THIS IS RANDI KINMAN, I'M
7 GOING TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER AND ASK THE BROADCASTING
8 TEAM TO ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
9 ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID
10 MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS
11 ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO
12 BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
13 WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
14 PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE
15 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM
16 AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE
17 CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT
18 IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
19 ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.
20 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5
21 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND
22 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL
23 CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND
24 ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



MAY 11, 2022

1 ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR
2 APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR OF THE POLICY
5 ADVISORY COUNCIL WITH MY VICE CHAIR ILAF ESUF. IF WE COULD
6 HAVE ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

9

10 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** EDOPI?

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HE'S NOT A MEMBER.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

21

22 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF?

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

4

5 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLORES? GLASER?

8

9 **GERRY GLASER:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOTUACO?

16

17 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON? HEDGES?

20

21 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

24

25 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] IS EXCUSED. NICKENS?

15

16 **RODNEY NICKENS:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

23

24 **TERRY SCOTT:** HERE.

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE?

2

3 **FRANK WELTE:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILSON?

6

7 **WALTER WILSON:** PRESENT.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILSON IS HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AHN? WONG?

12

13 **HOWARD WONG:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. ZACK?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. BACK TO -- YOU HAVE JOINED

20 US? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. WITH THAT WE MOVE TO

23 ITEM THREE, THE CHAIR A REPORT WHICH IS GOING TO BE BRIEF

24 BECAUSE NORMALLY A LOT OF WHAT I'M GOING TO BE DISCUSSING IS



MAY 11, 2022

1 COMING UP LATER ON IN THE AGENDA. FIRST DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS
2 WHO ARE IN THE BOARDROOM AT THIS POINT? JUST SO I KNOW.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. WE HAVE --

5

6 **SPEAKER:** JUST GERRY.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** JUST GERRY. OKAY. THANK YOU. WITH THAT, I
9 ALSO WANT TO SAY, WE'RE JUST ABOUT FINISHED WITH YOUR BASIC
10 TRAINING. SO, YOU WILL HAVE A LEGAL WRAP-UP THAT WILL BE
11 COMING UP ON THE AGENDA. AND, SO, THAT KIND OF WRAPS UP ALL OF
12 THAT HERE'S MTC AND THIS IS WHAT WE DO. AND I KNOW IT'S BEEN
13 CONFUSING. BUT I WANT TO SAY, BEHIND THE SCENES WE'RE
14 ORGANIZING THIS COMMITTEE A LITTLE BIT TO GIVE US SOME MORE
15 TIME WITHOUT MAKING FOUR-HOUR MEETINGS. SO THANK YOU FOR
16 BEARING US. AND WE'LL GET TO THE AGENDA. FIRST ITEM UP IS THE
17 APPROVAL OF THE APRIL 13TH, 2022 MINUTES.

18

19 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** BALDINI, SO MOVED.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** ELDRED, SECOND.

24



MAY 11, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE ON
2 THIS?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE ON THIS ITEM.
5 THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WHO SUBMITTED A BLUE SPEAKER
6 CARD, AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC VIA ZOOM WITH IS
7 THERE HAND RAISED.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. COULD YOU CALL ON THE PERSON WITH
10 THEIR HAND RAISED, PLEASE?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. PHONE NUMBER ENDING IN 0035.
13 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS FLORES CALLING IN. CAN YOU
16 HEAR ME?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I'LL MOVE YOU OVER.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'M SORRY. PHONE DIAL IN CAN'T BE MOVED OVER TO
21 PANELIST.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AT LEAST WE KNOW WHERE SHE IS. THANK YOU
24 VEDA. WITH THAT IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION? ROLL CALL VOTE,
25 PLEASE?



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

3

4 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

15

16 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF?

19

20 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

23

24 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** AYE.

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLORES? YOU HAVE TO --

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SHE ALREADY SAID SHE APPROVES.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. GLASER?

6

7 **GERRY GLASER:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOTUACO?

14

15 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HEDGES?

22

23 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN? ADINA?

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. LIEU?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NICKENS?

17

18 **RODNEY NICKENS:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. ORANTES?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE?

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **PHILLIP PIERCE:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE? VINAY? WE'LL GET BACK TO YOU.

4 SCOTT?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU VINAY.

9

10 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE?

13

14 **FRANK WELTE:** NO.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. WILSON?

17

18 **WALTER WILSON:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WONG?

21

22 **HOWARD WONG:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ZACK?

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **RACHEL ZACK:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PASSES WITH 24 AYES. ONE NO.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ITEM NUMBER FIVE
6 PUBLIC COMMENTS. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM
7 OR ON THE PHONE, THIS IS YOUR CHANCE TO MAKE COMMENTS ON ITEMS
8 NOT ON THE AGENDA. YOU CAN USE THE DIAL NINE FEATURE ON ZOOM
9 OR -- AND STAR SIX FOR PHONE. WAS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
10 SUBMITTED BEFORE 5:00 P.M. LAST NIGHT.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
13 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
16 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED? OR?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS IN THE PUBLIC VIA
19 ZOOM WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE WILL MOVE ON TO ITEM
22 NUMBER SIX. WE WILL BEGIN WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. THE
23 FIRST SUBCOMMITTEE WILL BE THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY
24 AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED WHO STOOD IN AS
25 ACTING CHAIR WILL GIVE THAT REPORT.



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** SO, WE HELD THE SUBCOMMITTEE -- I'M SORRY.
3 I WAS NOT ACTUALLY PREPARED TO MAKE THIS REPORT. SO I'LL DO
4 THE BEST OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD HERE. WE HELD THE COMMITTEE
5 MEETING. THERE WERE ANNOUNCEMENTS THAT FOLKS COULD VOLUNTEER
6 OR NOMINATE SOMEBODY ELSE FOR CHAIR. WE HOPE THAT WILL HAPPEN
7 AT THIS NEXT MEETING. WE HEARD A PRESENTATION FROM THE NEXGEN
8 FREEWAY STUDY ADVISORY GROUP, AND I BELIEVE I AM MISSING AN
9 ITEM.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ANYBODY WHO ATTENDED THE MEETING THAT
12 WANTS TO ADD? I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED.

13

14 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I'LL SAY THAT WE DID WANT TO HAVE FURTHER
15 DISCUSSION ON THE NEXGEN FREEWAY STUDY. THERE WAS A LOT OF
16 REALLY GOOD INFORMATION THAT WAS BROUGHT UP THERE, BUT
17 DECIDEDLY NOT ENOUGH TIME FOR US TO REALLY GET INTO WHAT WAS
18 HAPPENING THERE. AND, SO WE WILL BE LOOKING AT WAYS TO BRING
19 THAT BACK. AND DEEPEST APOLOGIES THAT I DID NOT HAVE THAT
20 AGENDA IN FRONT OF ME AT THIS TIME.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SEEING NO HANDS RAISED
23 WE'LL MOVE TO THE FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION
24 SUBCOMMITTEE. ADINA?

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** REGARDING THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION
2 SUBCOMMITTEE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FARE POLICY, THERE IS AN
3 EXCITING NEXT STEP THAT IS HAPPENING TOMORROW MORNING AT THE
4 BART BOARD MEETING STARTING AT 9:00. THE BART BOARD IS GOING
5 TO BE THE FIRST BOARD TO REVIEW THE ALL AGENCY TRANSIT PASS
6 PILOT. THAT IS GOING TO BE COMING TO ALL THE 27 TRANSIT
7 AGENCIES IN MAY AND JUNE PRIOR TO THE SCHEDULED ROLL OUT OF
8 THAT PROGRAM IN AUGUST. PRESUMING ALL OF THE AGENCIES AGREE,
9 AND PENDING ANYTHING THAT MIGHT CONCEIVABLY HAPPEN WITH THE
10 GOVERNOR'S PROPOSAL FOR FREE TRANSIT, WHICH WOULD, OF COURSE,
11 DEFER A PILOT PROGRAM FOR AN ALL AGENCY TRANSIT PASS, IF
12 EVERYBODY CAN USE THE SYSTEM FOR FREE. BUT AT ANY RATE, THE
13 PILOT IS SLATED TO START IN AUGUST WITH THE BOARD'S REVIEW AND
14 APPROVAL. THE BART BOARD IS NOT VOTING TOMORROW. THE VOTE WILL
15 BE ROLLED INTO THEIR BUDGET. SO ANYONE WHO IS INTERESTED IN
16 HEARING THE BART BOARD DISCUSS THAT AND TO EXPRESS YOUR
17 OPINIONS, WHICH THIS IS SOMETHING THAT THIS BODY HAS IN ITS
18 PREVIOUS INCARNATIONS BEEN STRONGLY ENTHUSIASTIC OF, THAT'S
19 THE BART BOARD AT NINE TOMORROW. THERE IS A FARE INTEGRATION
20 TASK FORCE MEETING THAT IS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT WEEK ON MONDAY.
21 AND THE AGENDA FOR THAT WAS NOT YET POSTED AS OF THE TIME THAT
22 I LOOKED A COUPLE OF HOURS AGO. SO, I WILL BRIEFLY LOOK AGAIN
23 DURING THIS MEETING AND WILL ASK PRIVILEGE TO SHARE ANYTHING
24 ABOUT THAT AGENDA IF IT POPS UP DURING THE MEETING. ANY OTHER
25 QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT UPDATE?



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ANYBODY HAVE ANY QUESTIONS? WAS THERE ANY
3 PUBLIC COMMENT?

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
6 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
7 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE SUBMITTED A BLUE SPEAKER CARD.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'RE GOING TO GO
10 INTO ITEM NUMBER SEVEN, THE WORK PLAN SESSION. THAT ILAF AND I
11 HELD WITH CHAIR PEDROZA AND VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. AND I'LL
12 ASK MY VICE CHAIR TO TAKE THIS ITEM.

13

14 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** HI EVERYONE. AS YOU JUST HEARD WE MET
15 WITH CHAIR PEDROZA AND VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND STAFF AND
16 REBECCA LONG WAS ALSO ON THE CALL AND WE WENT OVER AGENDA
17 PLANNING TO DISCUSS THE STRUCTURE OF OUR POLICY ADVISORY
18 COUNCIL AND IT WAS A VERY FRUITFUL DISCUSSION WHICH
19 HIGHLIGHTED A STRENGTH AND VALUE ADDS TO SUPPORT THE WORK AND
20 WE ALSO TALKED ABOUT HOW WE CAN CHANGE SOME OF THE PROCESSES
21 THAT WE HAVE TO BETTER SUPPORT THEM. AND SO THEY WERE REALLY
22 INTERESTED IN OUR STRENGTH AND ABLE TO HAVE THAT LOCAL TOUCH,
23 AND HOW OUR LOCAL COMMUNITIES MIGHT BE IMPACTED BY SOME OF
24 THESE POLICIES AND SOMETHING THAT I WANTED TO HEAR MORE OF SO
25 WE'LL BE FINDING OPPORTUNITIES AND I'LL GO OVER THAT IN A BIT.



MAY 11, 2022

1 AND THEY WERE APPRECIATIVE AND INTERESTED IN OUR CONVERSATION
2 ABOUT INCREASING COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND MAKING SURE THAT IS
3 A ROBUST PROCESS THAT HAPPENS THROUGHOUT POLICIES AND PLANNING
4 MOVING FORWARD WE'LL BE WORKING WITH RESOURCES AND EQUITABLE
5 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT TO STANDARDIZATION AND FEEDBACK INCLUDING A
6 TEMPLATE AND COMMISSION SUMMARY SHEET AND OPPORTUNITY FOR
7 FEEDBACK AS THEY LOOK OVER MATERIALS AND TO HAVE MORE FREQUENT
8 MEETINGS AND WE CAN GO OVER THAT WORK PLAN PROCESS AND SUPPORT
9 SOME OF THE COLLABORATION. IS THERE ANY COUNCIL COMMENTS?
10 PUBLIC COMMENT?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
14 ON THIS ITEM. NO ONE SUBMITTED A BLUE SPEAKER CARD.

15

16 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I THINK ADINA WILL KICKOFF PART TWO OF
19 OUR DISCUSSIONS THAT HAPPENED AFTER THIS. GO AHEAD ADINA.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES, WHERE IN TERMS OF WANTING TO GET A MORE
22 FOCUSED FEEDBACK FROM THIS GROUP ON A BODY OF THINGS THAT ARE
23 RELEVANT TO THE COMMISSION, ONE THING THAT THE -- THAT HAS
24 BEEN DISCUSSED IS THE POTENTIAL TO HAVE THE FARE INTEGRATION
25 ADVISORY BODY POTENTIALLY EXPAND ITS SCOPE TO TAKE ON MORE OF



MAY 11, 2022

1 THE ITEMS THAT ARE MOVING FORWARD UNDER THE RUBRIC OF THE
2 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, INCLUDING MAPPING AND WAYFINDING,
3 A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN, AND OTHER ITEMS UNDER THE
4 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT ARE NOT SPECIFICALLY COVERED
5 UNDER EQUITY AND ACCESS. PARATRANSIT WILL BE SPECIFICALLY
6 COVERED UNDER EQUITY AND ACCESS. IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE ON
7 THAT TOPIC THAT RAND OR ILAF, THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS?

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I THINK WE'RE TAKING EQUITY ISSUES, THE
10 MORE POLICY RELATED STUFF, AND LEAVE THAT IN EQUITY AND ACCESS
11 SO THAT WE CAN HAVE THOSE ROBUST DISCUSSIONS, BUT THE
12 TECHNICAL ASPECT OF FARES, LEAVING THAT IN A PILE, MOVING THAT
13 AROUND, SO THAT WE CAN HAVE DUAL DISCUSSIONS GOING ON, AND IF
14 YOU ARE INTERESTED IN THE REALLY WONKY STUFF, WE HAVE A PLACE
15 FOR YOU TO GO FOR THAT, BUT WHAT WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT IS
16 THERE IS A LOT OF STUFF THAT'S NOT CURRENTLY ON, IN A BUCKET,
17 FOR DISCUSSION. AND SO WE'RE CREATING A LITTLE BIT OF A
18 DIFFERENT BUCKET AND PUTTING THINGS IN THOSE BUCKETS, AND WILL
19 BE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH THE CHAIR AND THE VICE CHAIR OF THE
20 COMMISSION SO THAT WE MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE COVERING ALL OF
21 THOSE THINGS THAT ARE COMING ALONG, AND NOT BEING CAUGHT ON
22 THE BACK-END OF IT. AND ONE OF THE FOR INSTANCES, IS THAT VICE
23 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ BROUGHT UP, WAS, WHY WEREN'T WE INVOLVED IN
24 THE DISCUSSION OF TOLLING FINES FOR THE BRIDGES. SO SOMEHOW
25 THAT BYPASSED US. WE NEVER GOT INVOLVED IN THAT DISCUSSION,



MAY 11, 2022

1 AND IT'S KIND OF A HOT POTATO IN THAT THE -- IT'S -- IT'S LIKE
2 THE FINES ON TOP OF NOT PAYING YOUR TOLL CAN BE A REALLY
3 SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT PEOPLE JUST CAN'T GET CAUGHT
4 UP ON. SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THOSE THINGS DON'T SLIP THROUGH
5 THE CRACKS AGAIN. I SEE VEDA'S HAND RAISED. GO AHEAD VEDA.

6

7 **VEDA FLORES:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE WORK THAT ILAF AND
8 RANDI HAD DONE. ADINA I REALLY LIKE THE DIRECTION THAT YOU'RE
9 MOVING IN. AND THAT WAS ONE OF MY CONCERNS WHEN I WAS CHAIR OF
10 THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE, WHY ARE WE SEEING THESE
11 ITEMS JUST BEFORE THEY'RE VOTED ON BY THE COMMISSION. SO I
12 APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENT THAT WE'RE MOVING IN THE RIGHT
13 DIRECTION. AND I'M WONDERING WHAT ARE THE NEXT STEPS THAT YOU
14 HAVE IDENTIFIED, THE NEAR FUTURE NEXT STEPS THAT THE POLICY
15 ADVISORY COUNCIL CAN LOOK AT.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ADINA, DO YOU WANT TO TAKE ANY OF THAT?
18 OR ILAF? OR I WILL.

19

20 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** I CAN SAY IN TERMS OF HOW WE'RE ABLE TO
21 WORK ON THE WORK PLAN ACCIDENT WE'RE HOPING THAT FREQUENT
22 MEETINGS AND FREQUENT COMMUNICATION WITH THE CHAIR AND VICE
23 CHAIR WILL HELP US SEE WHAT'S COMING AHEAD OF TIME, AND WE'RE
24 ALSO WORKING ON CREATING A PROACTIVE LIST OF WHAT'S COMING OUR



MAY 11, 2022

1 WAY, SO WE CAN LET YOU GUYS KNOW WHAT TO EXPECT BEFORE, SO
2 IT'S NOT A COUPLE OF DAYS BEFORE IT GOES TO VOTE.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** UH-HUH. ALSO, IN TERMS OF THE TRANSFORMATION
5 ACTION PLAN WITH THINGS LIKE WAYFINDING AND THE CONNECTED
6 NETWORK PLAN, SO, FIRST OF ALL, FOR, SINCE WE'RE HERE IN
7 PLENARY WITHOUT ANY BROWN ACT ISSUES AND TALKING ABOUT THIS ON
8 OUR AGENDA, I WOULD WELCOME ANY THOUGHTS FROM PEOPLE IN
9 ADDITION TO, VEDA'S HAS ALREADY SHARED HER THOUGHTS ABOUT THAT
10 DIRECTION, THAT FOLKS WHO ARE INTERESTED IN FARE INTEGRATION,
11 ARE ALSO INTERESTED IN HAVING -- AGENDA ITEMS WHERE WE GET A
12 PREVIEW AND DRILL DOWN ON OTHER ITEMS OF THE TRANSFORMATION
13 ACTION PLAN THAT ARE ELEMENTS TO BRING TRANSIT RIDERSHIP BACK
14 FROM COVID BY MAKING THE SERVICE MORE INTEGRATED AND
15 CONVENIENT WITH THINGS LIKE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, AND, YOU
16 KNOW, SCHEDULE INTEGRATION AND CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN, THINGS
17 LIKE THAT. SO IF NOW IS ACTUALLY A GOOD TIME TO SAY, HEY, I
18 THINK THIS IS A GOOD IDEA, OR, GOLLY GEE, I ONLY SIGNED UP FOR
19 FARES AND OTHER ASPECTS OF CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE I REALLY DON'T
20 WANT TO DEAL WITH, OR YEAH, I THINK THAT'S A PERFECTLY GOOD
21 FIT, AND NOW WOULD BE A GOOD TIME TO SHARE THAT: AND TO VEDA'S
22 QUESTION, THE SCHEDULE OF THINGS WOULD REALLY BE SHARED BY THE
23 WORK THAT MTC STAFF IS WORKING ON IN THOSE PROJECTS. SO, THERE
24 ARE EXPECTED, FOR EXAMPLE, TO BE NEXT STEPS UNDER MAPPING AND
25 WAYFINDING AND CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING THIS YEAR, BUT THERE



MAY 11, 2022

1 AREN'T SPECIFIC DATES FOR IT YET. SO THE DATES WOULD FOLLOW
2 WHAT STAFF IS DOING. AND WHEN IT WOULD BE RELEVANT TO BE ABLE
3 TO GIVE FEEDBACK, AS RANDI SAID, FEEDBACK IN AN EARLY MANNER,
4 RATHER THAN GETTING SOMETHING, LIKE, VERY LATE AT THE END OF
5 THE DAY.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I WANT TO ADD,
8 IS, ESPECIALLY FOR THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE, DRENNEN
9 SHELTON HAS AGREED -- NORMALLY WE SEE STAFF WHEN THERE IS A
10 DOCUMENT AND PROJECT OR SOMETHING THAT IS MOVING FORWARD IN A
11 PIPELINE, AND DRENNEN IS OUR GO-TO PERSON FOR ALL OF THE
12 DISABILITIES PROGRAMS. AND SO SHE'S GOING TO BE ATTENDING THE
13 MEETINGS NO MATTER WHAT. SO THAT GIVES US AN OPPORTUNITY TO
14 HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS WITH HER. BECAUSE SOMETIMES THINGS
15 COME UP SO QUICKLY THAT SHE CAN'T, YOU KNOW, GET TWO MONTHS IN
16 ADVANCE TO GET A FULL REPORT OUT TO US AND THIS WILL HELP TO
17 MOVE THINGS ALONG A WHOLE LOT FASTER. I'M GOING TO START
18 CALLING ON THE PEOPLE WITH HANDS RAISED. CHRISTINE FITZGERALD,
19 AND THEN GERRY.

20

21 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

24



MAY 11, 2022

1 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** EXCELLENT. SO I'M STILL A LITTLE BIT
2 CONFUSED AS TO WHY WAYFINDING IS BEING MOVED OVER. I CAN SEE
3 IT BEING A COMBINATION WHERE POLICY CAN BE MADE TO BETTER
4 REGULATE THE PROCESS, AND THEN THE PHYSICAL ASPECT OF THAT IN
5 THE APPROPRIATE BOX. I JUST WANT A CLARIFICATION.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, SOME OF THESE BUSINESS IS WILL CROSS
8 OVER. SO, WE WILL DEFINITELY -- THAT WAYFINDING IS ESPECIALLY
9 ONE WHERE IT WILL BE KIND OF LIVING IN TWO DIFFERENT AREAS,
10 BUT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE COVERING EVERYTHING WITH
11 THAT. SO, IT WILL -- YEAH, IT'S NOT JUST GOING TO -- THAT'S
12 ONE PROJECT THAT WE KNOW IS GOING TO LIVE IN DIFFERENT AREAS.
13 OKAY. GERRY AND THEN ZACK.

14

15 **GERRY GLASER:** IN THE CATEGORY OF SEAMLESS, I'M SITTING HERE IN
16 THE BOARDROOM, AND THE REASON FOR IT IS I'M NOT A TRANSIT
17 USER. I DRIVE MY CAR ALL THE TIME. AND I'M TRYING TO FIGURE
18 OUT WHAT TRANSIT IS ALL ABOUT AND WHAT ARE SOME OF THE ISSUES.
19 I DON'T USE THE CAR ANYMORE -- TASK, RIGHT OVER HERE IT SAYS
20 THAT I'M THE SENIOR REPRESENTATIVE. SO SENIORS OUGHT NOT TO BE
21 IN THE CARS IN THE FIRST PLACE. AND, SO, I'M TRYING TO FIGURE
22 PART OF THIS OUT, AND THE WHOLE CONCEPT OF SEAMLESS MADE A LOT
23 OF SENSE TO ME, AND I SAW THAT WITH FARES IS THE PLACE TO
24 START AND INTEGRATING WHERE WE TAKE THE 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES
25 AND WE MAKE THEM LOOK SEAMLESS EVEN IF THEY INSISTER BEING 27



MAY 11, 2022

1 TRANSIT AGENCIES. COORDINATION -- WELL, THE WAYFINDING IS
2 ACTUALLY THE FIRST ONE. I SPENT FOUR HOURS YESTERDAY TRYING TO
3 FIGURE OUT IF THERE WAS A TOOL THAT WOULD TAKE ME FROM MY HOME
4 TO THE BOARDROOM AND GIVE ME THE BEST ROUTE. AND ACTUALLY, I
5 HAD TO TRY, UNTIL I GOT TO THE FOURTH TOOL THAT GOT ME TO ONE
6 THAT WAS REASONABLE THAT TOOK ME LESS THAN 12 HOURS SO IT TOOK
7 ME THREE HOURS AND 15 MINUTES TO GET HERE. WAYFINDING, AND
8 INTEGRATION GAPS BETWEEN EACH ONE AND THEY ALL HAVE DIFFERENT
9 FEATURES THEY ALL HAVE SCHEDULES BUT NONE OF THEM HAVE CLOCKS
10 AND PART OF THIS IS MAKING THE TRANSIT SYSTEM SEAMLESS SO
11 PEOPLE COULD USE IT AS THEIR PRIMARY WAY OF TRANSPORT. AND I
12 COULD SEE THAT IT MAKES SENSE PULLING ALL THIS TOGETHER, AND
13 FARES WAS JUST THE BEGINNING. SO I LOOK THE IDEA.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ZACK AND THEN RICH HEDGES.

18

19 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** THANKS RANDI. I WANT TO SAY I SUPPORT THE
20 DIRECTION ADINA AND YOU ALL ARE PROPOSING IS THE RIGHT
21 DIRECTION. THINKING OF THESE THINGS NOT IN SILOS, AND
22 UNDERSTANDING THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK OF HOW THEY INTEGRATE
23 TOGETHER IS REALLY PERSONALITY. TO CHRISTINE'S POINT, I DON'T
24 THINK THAT -- I THINK [INDISCERNIBLE] IT GOES INTO ANOTHER
25 SILO AND WE SHOULD BE TALKING ABOUT THIS AS A GROUP IN THE



MAY 11, 2022

1 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE AND IN THE FARE INTEGRATION
2 SUBCOMMITTEE, I THINK THAT'S THE BEST DIRECTION WE'RE GOING
3 BUT WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT GETS INCLUDED AS WELL.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH, AND THEN ANNE OLIVIA.

6

7 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HEDGE YEAH, WAYFINDING IS DEFINITELY A BIG
8 ISSUE. AND I'M GOING TO BE SURPRISED IF WE GET TO A NETWORK
9 MANAGER THAT MAKES A DIFFERENCE. I THINK WE HEADED THAT WAY
10 BUT IT'S GOING TO TAKE SOME STRONG PEOPLE, BOTH LEGISLATIVELY
11 AND MTC AND FROM THE PUBLIC TO MAKE THIS HAPPEN. THERE ARE
12 SOME THINGS WE CAN USE. I USE ROUTSY AND EXPRESS BUS. BOTH ARE
13 PRETTY GOOD. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT 511 AND WAYFINDING WAS
14 MISSING WAS THE SHUTTLES, IF YOU DID A SEARCH ON 511, FOR ME,
15 THERE WAS REALLY NO WAY FOR ME TO GET TO MTC WHEN IT WAS IN
16 OAKLAND, BUT THE ORG MANAGER AFTER I TALKED TO HIM, WHEN I
17 WENT TO GOOGLE SCHEDULE THEM TO HAVE WAYFINDING ON THEIR
18 SHUTTLES IT'S NOW EASY FOR ME TO FIND A SHUTTLE TO GET WHERE
19 I'M GOING FOR LAST MILE. AND I THINK THAT'S THE BIGGEST
20 PROBLEM. IF YOUR AVERAGE PERSON STARTED USING TRANSIT, LIKE
21 GERRY S WHERE IN THE HELL DO YOU GO, EXCUSE THE EXPRESSION,
22 BUT IT IS, WHERE DO YOU GO. WE NEED SOME CLEAR DOCUMENTED WAYS
23 FOR PEOPLE TO FIND THEIR WAY. I SPEND QUITE A BIT OF TIME,
24 OCCASIONALLY QUITE A BIT OF TIME DURING THE DAY WHEN I SEE
25 SOMEBODY STRUGGLING FINDING THEIR WAY AROUND TRANSIT BY



MAY 11, 2022

1 STOPPING AND TALKING TO THEM. NOT EVERYBODY WILL DO THAT.
2 WAYFINDING IS ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS IN THIS AND
3 ACTUALLY UNIFYING SCHEDULES, AS WELL, WHICH WE HAVE ALL TALKED
4 ABOUT, THANK YOU.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA, THEN HOWARD.

7

8 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. SUPER SUPPORTIVE OF ALL THOSE
9 THINGS THAT WERE JUST SAID. I KIND OF WANT TO GO BACK TO
10 VEDA'S POINT. AT THE END OF THIS MEETING I AM PLANNING ON
11 ANNOUNCING THE, LIKE, WHAT WE PLAN TO TALK ABOUT AT THE NEXT
12 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. AND, SO, JUST, I THINK THAT
13 ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE COULD ADD IN FOR ADDED, JUST KIND OF
14 ADDED TRANSPARENCY OR ADDED INCLUSION IS WHEN WE DO KNOW
15 AGENDAS AHEAD OF TIME, WHICH, GRANTED THEY MAY CHANGE, BUT IF
16 WE DO KNOW AND ANNOUNCE TO THE BODY THESE ARE THINGS WE'RE
17 GOING TO BE LOOKING AT, AT THE NEXT MEETING SO FOLKS CAN HAVE
18 TIME TO RECRUIT COMMUNITY MEMBERS OR THEIR CONSTITUENTS, OR,
19 YOU KNOW, GROUPS THAT THEY BELONG TO, OR WHATEVER THAT REALLY
20 CARE ABOUT THOSE ISSUES AND, BECAUSE, EVEN THOUGH WE GET THE
21 E-MAILS AND WE SHOULD BE REALLY GOOD ABOUT LOOKING AT THEM ALL
22 THE TIME, SOMETIMES IT'S HELPFUL TO HAVE AN ADDED VERBAL
23 REMINDER THAT THIS IS COMING UP. SO, THAT'S ALL.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HOWARD AND THEN WENDI.



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **HOWARD WONG:** THERE ARE MANY BUSINESS IS THAT ARE OBVIOUSLY
3 INTERRELATED AND WHEN YOU START LOOKING AT ONE TOPIC, LIKE
4 FARE INTEGRATION OR AGENCY COORDINATION, OR WAYFINDING, THERE
5 IS A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF OVERLAP IN ALL OF THOSE, SO IT'S, YOU
6 KNOW ACCIDENT IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT EACH, BUT THERE IS
7 RELATIONSHIPS THAT HAVE TO BE LOOKED AT. FOR INSTANCE,
8 RECENTLY, THE SIERRA CLUB TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE WAS TRYING
9 TO RESTORE WE ENDS SERVICE TO MA MUIR FROM SAN FRANCISCO BY
10 PUBLIC TRANSIT. SO I START TO GOOGLE, THERE IS MARIN TRANSIT,
11 GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT, THERE IS MUNI THAT GOES TO MARIN HEAD
12 [INDISCERNIBLE] SO IT'S COMPLICATED TO FIND DIFFERENT WAYS TO
13 GET THERE, AND I FOUND SOMETHING, AND RECENTLY MARIN COUNTY
14 REINSTATE THAT BEE CAN SERVICE MUIR WOODS. SO THAT SOLVED THE
15 PROBLEM. I LOOKED AT HOW TO GET TO SAN FRANCISCO AIR DISTRICT
16 OR A MEETING AT THE OAKLAND AIRPORT HILTON AND I FOUND SEVERAL
17 SITES. SO THERE IS A LOT OF COORDINATION BETWEEN PRIVATE
18 WAYFINDING, SOFTWARE, PUBLIC, AND PRIVATE. SO IT'S PRETTY
19 INTERESTING TOPIC HOW TO INFORM PEOPLE HOW TO GET AROUND THE
20 BAY AREA. SO, THANKS.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WENDI?

23

24 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY, AND STAFF MAYBE
25 CAN HELP ME OUT HERE, BECAUSE MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT



MAY 11, 2022

1 WAYFARING IS NOT ABOUT AN APP. IT'S ABOUT SIGNAGE AT THE
2 TRANSIT STATION. SO, MUCH AS I WOULD LIKE WAY FINDING TO
3 INCLUDE A GREAT APP FOR PEOPLE TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO GET FROM
4 POINT A TO POINT B, THAT IS ACTUALLY NOT WHAT WAYFINDING IS
5 DOING. AND IF STAFF CAN CONFIRM THAT, THAT WOULD BE GOOD. I
6 JUST DON'T WANT PEOPLE TO BE CONFUSED.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL FOLLOW UP. ADINA, AND
9 THEN GERRY, AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO WRAP THIS UP.

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN:** UH-HUH, YEP. SO TO PULL SOME THREADS TOGETHER,
12 I'M HEARING THAT THERE IS A LOT OF INTEREST IN BEING INVOLVED
13 HOLISTICALLY IN THE DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF THE TRANSFORMATION
14 ACTION PLAN, AND GETTING, BEING ABLE TO GIVE FEEDBACK IN
15 ADVANCE. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO WERE INTERESTED IN WHAT THOSE
16 TOPICS ARE AND WHAT THEY ENTAIL, I REALLY RECOMMEND READING
17 THROUGH THAT 27-STEP TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT WAS
18 APPROVED LAST SUMMER. AND STAFF CAN SEND OUT A LINK TO THAT
19 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT I DO RECOMMEND READING. IN
20 TERMS OF THIS CONVERSATION, WE WERE HAVING A -- LIKE EVERYONE
21 IS REALLY PASSIONATE ABOUT THE SUBSTANCE, WHICH IS EXCITING,
22 AND WE WERE HAVING A CONVERSATION ABOUT PROCESS IN TERMS OF
23 SHOULD WE EXPAND THE FOCUS OF A SUBCOMMITTEE TO BE ABLE TO
24 DRILL DOWN AND GET PREVIEWS ON THESE TOPICS. SO, PROCESS-WISE,
25 I FEEL REALLY GOOD THAT PEOPLE ARE SAYING YES. AND THE LAST



MAY 11, 2022

1 THING I WILL SAY, IN TERMS OF WHY TO DO THIS IS, YOU KNOW,
2 WITH MY VARIOUS HATS OF POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBER, AND
3 ADVOCACY, I TALK TO A LOT OF DIFFERENT COMMUNITY GROUPS, AND,
4 YOU KNOW, TRY TO EXPLAIN THE FIVE OR SIX DIFFERENT PLACES YOU
5 GO TO WITHIN MTC TO FIND OUT ABOUT AND SHARE PEOPLE'S OPINION
6 ON THESE DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF TRANSIT SYSTEM COORDINATION,
7 AND, SO, I THINK THAT BY CONSOLIDATING OUR ADVISORY BODY DRILL
8 DOWNS, AND THEN GIVING REPORTS OUT TO THE POLICY ADVISORY
9 COUNCIL, THAT WILL HOPEFULLY MAKE IT EASIER FOR MEMBERS OF THE
10 PUBLIC THAT ARE INTERESTED IN THIS TO FIGURE OUT WHERE TO GO
11 TO FIGURE OUT WHAT'S GOING ON AND HOW TO SHARE THEIR THOUGHTS,
12 YOU KNOW, AT THE FAIRLY WONKY LEVEL THAT WE GET ENGAGED IN.
13 SO. THAT'S MY WRAP UP.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GERRY?

16

17 **GERRY GLASER:** IN THE DISCUSSION IT OCCURRED TO ME THE THINGS
18 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, I ALSO WORK ON SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES,
19 TITLE 24 SAYS YOU WILL DO THESE THINGS IF YOU IN A CITY AND
20 ALL THE CITIES DO THESE THINGS THERE. IS NO MANUAL THAT SAYS
21 IF YOU ARE PROVIDING PUBLIC TRANSIT HERE IS THE THINGS IN THE
22 METROPOLITAN AREA THAT YOU MUST INCLUDE IN YOUR TRANSIT AS FAR
23 AS MATERIALS, WHICH WOULD BE AT THE FACILITIES, ET CETERA. TO
24 MAKE THEM ALL CONSISTENT. I WONDER IF WE OUGHT TO HAVE A TASK
25 FORCE THAT WAS WORKING ON PUTTING TOGETHER A MANUAL THAT ALL



MAY 11, 2022

1 THE 27 AUTHORITIES WOULD LOOK AT AND SAY WE NEED THAT TOO
2 BECAUSE WE NEED TO BE ALIGNED WITH THESE THINGS, HOW WE DEFINE
3 OUR ROUTES, DEFINE OUR SCHEDULES, HOW WE SETUP OUR TERMINALS
4 THINGS LIKE THAT. JUST SOME IDEAS TO FLOAT.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO TAKE
7 THAT AS APPROVAL FOR REALIGNING SOME OF OUR SUBCOMMITTEE WORK.
8 AND ALL OF THIS DOES COME BACK TO THE COUNCIL AS A WHOLE. SO,
9 IT JUST ALLOWS US TIME TO BREAK UP THESE ISSUES IN A COMMITTEE
10 AND WORK ON THEM, AND SOMETIMES FILTER THEM THROUGH TWO
11 COMMITTEES. SINCE THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED AND
12 THERE IS STILL NO PUBLIC COMMENT HANDS RAISED, WE'LL MOVE INTO
13 ITEM NUMBER EIGHT, WHICH IS ANOTHER SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT. THE
14 NEXGEN FREEWAY ADVISORY GROUP ACTION REPORT. ANNE OLIVIA
15 WANTED TO BRING US UP TO DATE FROM HER POINT OF VIEW ON THAT.

16

17 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU CHAIR KINMAN. I AM HAVING A
18 LITTLE BIT OF CONNECTIVITY ISSUE. IS IT OKAY IF WE COME BACK
19 TO THIS IN JUST A MINUTE?

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SURE. I CAN RUN THE NEXT ITEM AND THEN
22 COME BACK.

23

24 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE IT. IT'S GONE OUT
25 TWICE.



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT WOULD BE ITEM NINE THE BUSINESS CASE
3 STUDY UPDATE. ADINA?

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** UH-HUH, YEAH. SO, AS FOLKS MAY BE AWARE, THE MTC
6 IS DOING A NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE STUDY THAT IS
7 EXPLORING THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT WAYS OF ARRANGING OUR
8 INSTITUTIONS IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE A WELL COORDINATED
9 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. AND THAT -- THERE IS AN ADVISORY
10 BODY TO THAT STUDY THAT HAS BEEN MEETING, AND THE SUBSTANCE IS
11 THAT THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT FUNCTION, WHICH WOULD COVER THINGS
12 LIKE RANGING FROM MARKETING AND PUBLIC INFORMATION, MAPPING,
13 BRANDING AND WAYFINDING, TECHNOLOGY AND MOBILE STANDARDS
14 REALTIME DATA, STATION HUB DESIGN AND STANDARDS, FARE
15 INTEGRATION, CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING, AND MEGA PROJECTS,
16 AND WHAT THE ADVISORY BODY HAS BEEN DISCUSSING IS TOPICS ABOUT
17 WHERE THE ACCOUNTABILITY SHOULD BE HELD FOR THINGS LIKE
18 ELEMENTS OF NETWORK VISION, POLICY, AND PROJECT
19 PRIORITIZATION, INFRASTRUCTURE, DEVELOPMENT, DESIGN, AND
20 DELIVERY, AND OPERATIONS OF THE TRANSIT NETWORK. AND WHAT THAT
21 IS GOING TO FEED INTO IS, THEN, A DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING IN
22 JULY ABOUT WHAT STRUCTURAL OPTIONS THERE MIGHT BE TO BE ABLE
23 TO PROVIDE THAT COORDINATION FUNCTION IN THIS REGION. AND, SO,
24 FOR THOSE THAT ARE INTERESTED IN THIS TOPIC, YOU KNOW, PLEASE
25 FEEL FREE TO LOOK AT THE SLIDES FROM THE ADVISORY BODY



MAY 11, 2022

1 MEETING, AND THE SUBSTANTIVE TOPIC ABOUT HOW TO DO IT IS
2 STARTING TO COME FORWARD. AND THAT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT AND
3 GNARLY QUESTION. SO FOR PEOPLE THAT ARE INTERESTED IF THAT,
4 PLEASE KEEP YOUR EYE OUT FOR THAT JULY MEETING, AND THE
5 ADVISORY BODY HAS BEEN HAVING TWO MORE UPDATES ABOUT THIS.
6 THERE IS AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE MEETING THAT HAS BEEN MEETING AND
7 GIVING ITS FEEDBACK INTO THE BROADER ADVISORY GROUP. THE OTHER
8 THING OF NOTE IS THAT MTC HAS, IN PARALLEL, BEEN WORKING WITH
9 THE REGION'S RAIL AGENCIES ON A REGIONAL RAIL STUDY THAT HAS
10 BEEN FUNDED BY CALTRANS. AND THAT REGIONAL RAIL STUDY IS
11 LOOKING AT GOVERNANCE TOPICS AS WELL AS PROJECT DELIVERY
12 TOPICS AND WILL BE FEEDING ITS INFORMATION, FEEDING INTO THE
13 NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE, I BELIEVE, IN JULY, AS WELL.
14 SO THE SUBSTANCE ABOUT HOW TO DO THIS IS GOING TO GET MORE
15 VISIBLE AND FOR ANYBODY WHO IS INTERESTED. SO, THAT IS THE
16 SUMMARY. AND ANYONE WHO HAS ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT FAIRLY
17 CONVOLUTED TOPIC. FEEL FREE TO -- [INDISCERNIBLE]

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND I WILL POINT OUT THAT YOU
20 CAN GO BACK AND WATCH ALL OF THESE MEETINGS THROUGH LEGISTAR.
21 TERRY SCOTT, GO AHEAD.

22

23 **TERRY SCOTT:** I WANTED TO ASK A QUESTION. THE FUNDAMENTAL
24 INITIAL STEP IS THE CREATION OF EITHER THE NETWORK MANAGER OR
25 NETWORK MANAGEMENT GROUP THAT WOULD ALLOW, YOU KNOW, TO PULL



MAY 11, 2022

1 TOGETHER THESE VARIOUS TRANSIT ORGANIZATIONS AND TO WORK
2 TOGETHER, BASICALLY TO PROVIDE BETTER PLANNING GOING FORWARD.
3 AND THE BEST EXAMPLE I HAVE IS A YEAR OR SO, MAYBE IT WAS A
4 YEAR AND A HALF AGO, WE WERE TOLD THAT THE MTC WANTED TO FILL
5 THE NETWORK MANAGER JOB POSITION IN -- I BELIEVE IT WAS IN A
6 MONTH OR A MONTH AND A HALF, AT THAT TIME. AND, I REMEMBER
7 FOLLOWING UP AND ASKING TO GET A COPY OF THE JOB DESCRIPTION
8 THAT HAD, YOU KNOW, THAT WAS DESCRIBING THE NETWORK MANAGER
9 POSITION. AND I SPOKE WITH THEN CHAIRMAN ALFREDO PEDROZA, AS
10 WELL. AND I WAS KIND OF SURPRISED, THERE WAS NO JOB
11 DESCRIPTION. AND, YET, THERE WAS DISCUSSION IN OUR MEETINGS
12 ABOUT FILLING THAT POSITION IN ABOUT SIX WEEKS' TIME. AS A
13 HUMAN RESOURCE PROFESSIONAL IN THE PAST, IT KIND OF
14 DUMBFUNDED ME, WE DIDN'T HAVE A JOB DESCRIPTION FOR A
15 POSITION WE WERE TRYING TO FILL IN 6 TO 8 WEEKS. TO ME, THAT'S
16 THE ESSENCE ABOUT PLANNING. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE ADVANCE
17 PLANNING. AND YOU KNOW, NOT HAVING THAT TEAM OR INDIVIDUAL IN
18 PLACE, IT'S VERY DIFFICULT TO BRING THESE DIFFERENT PIECES OF
19 THE PUZZLE TOGETHER TO CREATE A MORE FUNCTIONAL NETWORK
20 MANAGEMENT OPERATION.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, TERRY. JUST TO BRING EVERYBODY
23 UP TO SPEED, THE TIMELINE WAS TO HIRE A CONSULTANT TO HELP US
24 BRING ALL OF THAT INFORMATION TOGETHER, AND IT'S THE
25 CONSULTANT THAT IS ACTUALLY GUIDING THESE DISCUSSIONS RIGHT



MAY 11, 2022

1 NOW. SO, THERE HAS BEEN NO DETERMINATION AS TO WHAT TYPE OF
2 SYSTEM, WHO WOULD BE RUNNING IT. RIGHT NOW, THAT'S ALL THE
3 DATA GATHERING AND THE DATA MINING THAT IS GOING ON. AND THIS
4 IS WHERE PEOPLE CAN PROVIDE INPUT. AND YOU CAN ALWAYS PROVIDE
5 INPUT BY SENDING AN E-MAIL REGARDING THE SUBJECT BEFORE ANY
6 MEETING. BUT WE'RE NOT AT THAT STAGE WHERE WE'RE LOOKING AT
7 HIRING A PERSON OR A GROUP, OR DESIGNING A BODY. WE'RE LOOKING
8 AT WHAT WOULD BE THE BEST APPROACH TO REACH THE GOALS THAT
9 WE'RE TRYING TO REACH. SO, THAT'S WHERE WE ARE AT THIS POINT.
10 AND I SEE ADINA NODDING HER HEAD. SO.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. AND A CLARIFICATION THERE IS THAT A NETWORK
13 MANAGER WAS NOT INTENDED TO BE A JOB, LIKE YOU HAVE SOMEONE
14 WHO IS A CUSTOMER SERVICE MANAGER IN A COMPANY. AND, LIKE, A
15 NETWORK MANAGER IS NOT ANALOGOUS TO A SINGLE PERSON'S JOB
16 TITLE. THE IDEA IS TO HAVE AN ORGANIZATION, AND IT MIGHT BE A
17 FUNCTION OF AN EXISTING ORGANIZATION, OR A NEW OR RECONFIGURED
18 ORGANIZATION THAT PROVIDES THAT NETWORK MANAGEMENT FUNCTION.
19 AND THE TIMELINE, LAST YEAR, WAS GETTING TO A POINT OF
20 DECIDING TO STUDY IT FURTHER, AND THAT'S WHAT THEY ARE DOING
21 NOW. AND WHAT THOSE FUNCTIONS ARE, THE PRESENTATION MATERIALS
22 FROM THE LAST COUPLE OF MEETINGS, TERRY, I THINK WILL GIVE YOU
23 SOME REALLY GOOD FOOD FOR THOUGHT ABOUT THAT. ONE OTHER PIECE
24 I WANTED TO REPRESENT IS THAT FOR THAT LAST MEETING, THERE WAS
25 A DISABILITY ADVOCACY LETTER FROM NUMEROUS MEMBERS OF THE



MAY 11, 2022

1 DISABILITY COMMUNITY WANTING TO MAKE SURE THAT SERVING THE
2 ACCESSIBILITY NEEDS WAS VERY MUCH FRONT AND CENTER IN WHAT A
3 NETWORK MANAGEMENT FUNCTION IS INTENDED TO DO. SO I WANTED TO
4 REPORT UPON THAT, AS WELL.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES, AND THEN WALTER
7 WILSON.

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YEAH, JUST TO COMMENT ON ADINA'S REPORT. ADINA
10 WAS ON THE COMMISSION'S MEETING WHEN THEY WERE DISCUSSING THE
11 PROJECTS TO BE APPLIED FOR FUNDING. AND THERE WAS AN
12 OUTPOURING OF PEOPLE THAT WANTED THE VALLEY LINK INCLUDED.
13 BECAUSE IT HAD NOT BEEN INCLUDED, WHICH WAS THE REGIONAL RAIL
14 THAT CALTRANS IS TALKING ABOUT, AND THEY ACTUALLY VOTED TO
15 INCLUDE THAT. IT WAS REALLY A PUSH BY THE COMMUNITY TO GET IT
16 FUNDED. AND, FYI, THAT MAY PUT THE DUMBARTON CROSSING OVER THE
17 TOP, BECAUSE IT COULD CONNECT WITH IT. SO, ANYWAY, I THOUGHT
18 THAT WAS REALLY IMPORTANT THAT THERE IS FOCUS FROM THE
19 COMMUNITY ON HEAVY RAIL. THANKS.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WALTER?

22

23 **WALTER WILSON:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY UNDERSTANDING IS I THOUGHT
24 THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT -- MANAGER WAS ABOUT A SYSTEM NOT AN
25 INDIVIDUAL, OR AN INDIVIDUAL WHO WAS ACTUALLY GOING TO DO THE



MAY 11, 2022

1 WORK. MY UNDERSTANDING FROM WHAT I HEARD EARLY ON IT WAS ABOUT
2 CREATING A SYSTEM THAT COULD HAVE BEEN AN ORGANIZATION, NOT
3 JUST AN INDIVIDUAL. I THINK THAT'S WHAT -- SO I KIND OF AGREE
4 WITH ADINA. I THINK THAT'S WHAT SHE'S SAYING. AND THAT WAS MY
5 UNDERSTANDING, AS WELL.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT EXACTLY IT. THANK YOU. HOWARD?

8

9 **HOWARD WONG:** THIS IS A SUBJECT THAT'S VERY NEW TO ME AND MANY
10 OTHERS. SO IT MAKE TAKE A LITTLE TIME TO KIND OF GRASP IT. BUT
11 IT SEEMS LIKE THE OVERALL GOAL SHOULD BE KIND OF -- A,
12 SIMPLIFIED AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE, AND I SEE TWO DIFFERENT GUIDE
13 FOR ALL OF THIS PLANNING, ONE IS CUSTOMER SERVICE, AND THE
14 CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE IS, THE CUSTOMER JUST WANTS TO EASILY
15 MOVE AROUND -- HOW TO GET AROUND AND CONTINUED SIMPLY. AND,
16 TWO IS THE AGENCY PERSPECTIVE. AND I THINK THE GOALS SHOULD BE
17 SOMETHING LIKE PROVIDING THAT CUSTOMER SERVICE AND COST
18 SAVINGS. I THINK COST SAVINGS COULD BE A BIG DRIVER OF, YOU
19 KNOW, THE BETTER COORDINATION. THANK YOU.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WAS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
22 SUBMITTED ON THIS?

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
25 THIS ITEM. NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM THAT SUBMITTED A BLUE



MAY 11, 2022

1 SPEAKER CARD. AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
2 HAPPEN RAISED.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE THAT.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HELLO CAN YOU HEAR ME?

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES WE CAN.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS WARREN CUSHMAN, AND I JUST WANTED TO
11 REFLECT THAT THERE ARE SEVERAL MEMBERS OF THE DISABILITY
12 COMMUNITY THAT ARE ENGAGED ON THIS TOPIC. THERE ARE SELF OF US
13 WHO, AS ADINA SAID, DID SUBMIT A LETTER REFLECTING THAT WE
14 FELT THAT WE NEEDED TO DO MORE WORK ON THIS. AND I WOULD SAY
15 EQUITY IS A REALLY IMPORTANT PIECE TO THIS. THIS PROCESS, IN
16 MY VIEW, IS SOMEWHAT OPERATOR CENTRIC, AND I AM CONCERNED THAT
17 EQUITY MAY FALL BACK A BIT. AND, SO, WE HOPE THAT THIS BODY
18 ENGAGES AND ENERGIZES AROUND THIS TO KEEP EQUITY FRONT AND
19 CENTER WITH REGARD TO THIS TOPIC. THANK YOU.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, WARREN. SEEING NO OTHER HANDS
22 RAISED. WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE OUT THIS ITEM. THANK YOU. IT WAS
23 A GREAT DISCUSSION. I KNOW SOME OF THIS IS -- I KNOW IT'S NEW
24 TO A LOT OF YOU. SO, JUST KEEP ASKING QUESTIONS. WE'LL GO TO
25 ITEM NUMBER TEN. OH, JUST TO CIRCLE BACK, ANNE OLIVIA IS STILL



MAY 11, 2022

1 HAVING CONNECTION PROBLEMS. SO WE'RE GOING TO SKIP HER ITEM.
2 AND SHE'LL BE BACK NEXT MONTH, AS A REGULAR PART OF HER
3 REPORT-OUT. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO ITEM NUMBER TEN, WHICH IS
4 BROWN ACT TRAINING. WITH GENERAL COUNSEL KATHLEEN CANE.

5

6 **KATHLEEN KANE:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. IT'S NICE TO BE ABLE
7 TO JOIN YOU. THANK YOU FOR HAVING ME. IF WE COULD CALL UP THE
8 WORLD'S SHORTEST POWERPOINT. THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER]

11

12 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT IS NOT MY POWERPOINT, HOWEVER.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I FAILED TO SEND IT TO THEM.

15

16 **KATHLEEN KANE:** OKAY.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER]

19

20 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I'LL GET STARTED. MARTHA ARE YOU SENDING IT
21 NOW? OKAY THANKS. FIRST PART WAS INTRODUCING MYSELF. THAT PART
22 DOESN'T REQUIRE SLIDES. I DIDN'T GET TO MEET THE STAFF BEFORE,
23 MY NAME IS KATHLEEN CANE, GENERAL COUNSEL FOR ABAG, MTC BATA
24 BAIFA, AND RELATED ENTITIES LEARNING ALL THE ACRONYMS IS A
25 CHALLENGE IN ITSELF. I AM RELATIVELY NEW HERE I STARTED IN



MAY 11, 2022

1 DECEMBER OF 2020. SO THAT MAKES ME A RELATIVE NEWBIE ALONG
2 WITH SOME OF YOU. SOME OF YOU HAVE BEEN AROUND HERE LONGER
3 THAN I HAVE. THERE WE GO. THAT'S SLIDE ONE OF THE WORLD'S
4 SHORTEST -- THERE YOU GO. [LAUGHTER] BECAUSE YOU HAVE THIS
5 INTRO FROM OTHER STAFF I WANTED TO DO IT TO. I WAS BORN HERE
6 IN SAN FRANCISCO THOUGH I HAVE LIVED AND WORKED IN A LOT OF
7 PLACES IN BETWEEN I AM NOW BACK FOR GOOD. MY HIGH SCHOOL
8 AMBITION WAS I WANTED TO BE AN ARCHEOLOGIST I DIDN'T QUITE DO
9 THAT BUT I AM DOING SOMETHING ELSE INTERESTING. NEVER A DULL
10 MOMENT HERE AT MTC. I WENT TO LAW SCHOOL AND STANFORD. I
11 WORKED FOR REGIONAL GOVERNMENTS SO I HAVE KIND OF SEEN
12 GOVERNMENTAL ISSUES IN A LOT OF DIFFERENT PLACES, SO IT'S NICE
13 TO BE HERE REGIONAL. GOVERNMENT IS DIFFERENT FROM ALL OF THE
14 ABOVE IN PART BECAUSE OUR MANDATE IS, YOU KNOW, EVER-EVOLVING
15 IN THE WAY THAT, SAY, IT WASN'T WHEN I WAS WORKING AT THE
16 FEDERAL DOJ, SO THAT WAS MORE OF SORT OF STRAIGHT FORWARD. YOU
17 HAVE YOUR PATH. HERE AT THE REGIONAL AS WE HAVE BEEN TALKING
18 ABOUT, WE'RE TAKING ON MORE AND MORE COORDINATION AND
19 INTERESTING WORK, SO THAT'S SOMETHING THAT'S A COOL PART OF
20 BEING PART OF THE REGIONAL GOVERNMENT. AND AS DISCUSSED I
21 BECAME MTC GENERALLY COUNSEL IN 2020. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
22 OKAY. SO THIS ISN'T SO MUCH A BROWN ACT TRAINING AS A BROWN
23 ACT HIGH-LEVEL PRINCIPLE ORIENTATION, AND THEN A REAL
24 INVITATION TO TALK WITH ANY OF YOU AS WE GO FORWARD. YOU KNOW,
25 IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS ABOUT EITHER BROWN ACT



MAY 11, 2022

1 ISSUES OR POTENTIAL CONFLICT ISSUES, I WANT YOU TO SEE ME AND
2 MY SMALL BUT MIGHTY OFFICE OF GENERAL COUNSEL STAFF AS YOUR
3 RESOURCES AND NAVIGATING THEM. BECAUSE THEY CAN BE A LITTLE
4 CONFUSING. AND, PARTICULARLY, FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVE NOT
5 BEEN MEMBERS OF PUBLIC BODIES BEFORE. MANY OF YOU HAVE, BUT
6 SOME OF YOU HAVE NOT. THIS IS A NEW AND SOMEWHAT ARCANE AREA.
7 THE BROWN ACT, ITSELF, WAS PASSED IN RESPONSE TO THE
8 PROVERBIAL SMOKE-FILLED BACK ROOMS. AND THAT WAS REALLY A
9 THING; UNFORTUNATELY STILL IS IN SOME PLACE IN GOVERNMENT.
10 WHERE, FOR EXAMPLE, IN A CITY COUNCIL MEETING, THE COUNCIL
11 WOULD MEET IN SOME SEPARATE ROOM, AND THEN COME OUT, AND THEY
12 WOULD ALL VOTE UNANIMOUSLY ON A PROJECT THAT HAS BEEN
13 SUBMITTED OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. AND THE PUBLIC HAD NO WAY OF
14 KNOWING WHAT WENT INTO THE DISCUSSIONS THAT LED TO THE
15 OUTCOME. SO, IN CALIFORNIA, WE PASSED THE BROWN ACT TO REALLY
16 MAKE SURE THAT THE PEOPLE'S BUSINESS HAPPENS IN PUBLIC. AND,
17 THAT'S THE TOUCH STONE FOR WHAT'S GOING ON HERE. THIS IS A
18 BROWN ACT BODY. YOU ARE CONSTITUTED BY MTC. YOU HAVE REGULAR
19 PUBLIC MEETINGS THAT ARE AGENDAIZED. SO, YOU ARE SUBJECT TO
20 THE CONSTRAINTS OF THE BROWN ACT EVEN THOUGH YOUR ROLE AS
21 ADVISORY, IT'S A VERY IMPORTANT PART OF -- AND YOU'RE NOT
22 DECIDING NECESSARILY THINGS LIKE AWARDED AN INDIVIDUAL
23 CONTRACT, OR THOSE KINDS OF DIRECT FINANCIAL THINGS -- YOU
24 HAVE A VERY IMPORTANT ROLE IN HOW POLICY GETS FORMULATED AND
25 IT HAS DIRECT EFFECT ON DECISIONS THAT ARE MADE AT THE MTC



MAY 11, 2022

1 COMMISSION LEVEL AND MTC AND OTHER DECISION-MAKING BODIES
2 AFFILIATED. THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE'RE HERE IN THIS
3 FORUM TO THE TRANSPARENCY OF RULES IN THE SAME WAY THAT WE
4 WOULD FOR THE COMMISSION ITSELF. SO WITH THAT TOUCH STONE OF
5 THE PEOPLE'S BUSINESS HAPPENS IN PUBLIC. THAT'S ONE YOU CAN
6 REPEAT TO YOURSELF IF YOU EVER HAVE DOUBTS ABOUT WHERE THE KEY
7 PRINCIPLE IS. THERE IS SOME WAYS THAT PLAYS OUT. ONE OF THE
8 MOST IMPORTANT ONES IS THAT THE AGENDA THAT'S PUBLISHED GIVES
9 NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC OF WHAT IS AND IS NOT GOING TO HAPPEN.
10 SO, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO MIGHT BE INTERESTED IN THE WORK
11 OF THE COUNCIL SHOULD BE ABLE TO LOOK AT YOUR AGENDA AND HAVE
12 A VERY GOOD SENSE OF WHAT DISCUSSIONS MIGHT OR MIGHT NOT
13 OCCUR. THAT MEANS THAT WHEN YOU ARE IN A MEETING, YOU NEED TO
14 BE SURE THAT IF YOU ARE STARTING TO GO OFF OF WHAT HAD BEEN
15 AGENDAIZED -- SO, FOR EXAMPLE, IF THERE IS AN ITEM ON, YOU
16 KNOW, THE DISABILITY ACCESS FOR THE WAYFINDING AND HOW TO
17 IMPROVE THE USABILITY OF THE WAYFINDING TOOLS THAT WE HAVE. IF
18 THAT, THEN, STARTS MORPHING INTO A RELATED BUT NOT AGENDAIZED
19 TOPIC AROUND FUNDING FOR NEW TECHNOLOGY INITIATIVES, THEN
20 THERE IS A POINT AT WHICH MEMBERS OF THE BODY OR THE CHAIR ARE
21 GOING TO NEED TO CALL A TIME OUT AND SAY, OKAY, LET'S TAKE
22 THAT AS AN ITEM TO PARKING LOT FOR LATER, AND LET'S MAKE SURE
23 THAT WE STAY ON TOPIC WITH THE AGENDA. THE REASON FOR THAT IS
24 IF LOOK AT IT FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC,
25 THEY WANT TO KNOW IF THEY SHOULD COME TO THE MEETING OR NOT.



MAY 11, 2022

1 AND SOME MIGHT CARE ABOUT TECHNOLOGY FUNDING AND MAY NOT KNOW
2 TO COME TO TALK ABOUT THE ITEM ON ACCESSIBILITY IF IT'S NOT
3 AGENDAIZED IN SUCH THAT WOULD INDICATE THAT YOU'RE GOING TO
4 END UP TALKING ABOUT THAT RELATED BUT NOT IDENTICAL TOPIC. AS
5 YOU CAN TELL THIS IS NOT NECESSARILY A PRECISE SCIENCE WHERE
6 THAT CUT OFF IS BETWEEN SOMETHING THAT'S WITHIN THE KIND OF
7 NATURAL AMBIT OF THE AGENDA ITEM, AND RELATED, BUT NOT
8 AGENDAIZED TOPICS, WHERE THAT CUT OFF IS SOMETHING THAT IS A
9 REALTIME CALL THAT'S MADE BY YOUR CHAIR AND YOURSELVES. AND
10 NOT EVERYBODY AGREES ON THAT. WHENEVER THERE IS AMBIGUITY LIKE
11 THAT, TWO THINGS HAPPEN. ONE, IT'S AN INVITATION FOR
12 CHALLENGE, RIGHT? BECAUSE PEOPLE CAN SUE UNDER THE BROWN ACT
13 WHEN WE HAVE VIOLATED IT, BUT, TWO, AND MORE IMPORTANTLY, YOU
14 KNOW, THERE IS THE CHANCE THAT A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO
15 MIGHT WANT TO CONTRIBUTE DOESN'T KNOW TO DO THAT. SO MY
16 THOUGHT THERE IS TO, WHERE THERE IS AMBIGUITY, TRY TO BE
17 CERTAIN MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE ADHERING TO THE AGENDA SO
18 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WOULD HAVE BEEN INTERESTED WOULD
19 KNOW TO COME. AND IF SOMETHING APPEARS TO BE AN ISSUE THAT
20 MERITS FURTHER DISCUSSION THAT'S SOMETHING THAT CAN BE PUT ON
21 A LATER AGENDA. AS LONG AS IT'S NOT AN EMERGENCY, YOU CAN TAKE
22 UP IN A FUTURE MEETING, AND THAT'S APPROPRIATE THE APPROPRIATE
23 PLACE TO PUT IT. AND YOU CAN GIVE THAT DIRECTION,
24 COLLECTIVELY, TO STAFF TO SAY, YOU KNOW, THIS IS AN IMPORTANT
25 TOPIC FOR US, WE WANT TO BE ABLE TO TAKE IT UP. LET'S MAKE



MAY 11, 2022

1 SURE THAT WE HAVE A TIME ON AN AGENDA FOR US TO DO THAT IN A
2 MORE FULL MANNER. SO, THAT'S ONE OF THE KEY AREAS. AND ONE OF
3 THE AREAS THAT PEOPLE -- FIRST OF ALL, REASONABLE MINDS CAN
4 DIFFER ABOUT PRECISELY WHERE THAT CUT OFF IS, BUT ALSO ONE OF
5 THE AREAS WHERE WELL INTENTIONED PEOPLE CAN GET INTO A LITTLE
6 BIT OF TROUBLE BECAUSE YOU GET EXCITED ABOUT A TOPIC AND A LOT
7 OF THESE THINGS ARE INTERRELATED AND IN DIGGING DOWN AND
8 TALKING ABOUT IT THERE IS THIS TENDENCY TO HAVE SCOPE DRIFT,
9 AND YOU NEED TO MAKE SURE TO REEL THAT BACK IN SO IT'S
10 TRANSPARENT ABOUT WHAT'S GOING IN A MEETING. THAT, BY THE WAY,
11 IS SOMETHING THAT HAPPENS IN EVERY BROWN ACT BODY THEY HAVE
12 EVER SUPPORTED. SO IT'S NOT A NEW PHENOMENON IT'S SOMETHING
13 THAT EVERYBODY STRUGGLES WITH AND EVERYTHING'S ADJUSTMENT
14 CALLS CAN DIFFER A LITTLE BIT ABOUT WHERE THAT CUT OFF IS BUT
15 IT'S IMPORTANT TO BE SENSITIVE TO. THAT'S ONE KEY THING FOR
16 PEOPLE ESPECIALLY THOSE WHO ARE NOT USED TO DEAL WITH THE
17 STRUCTURES OF THE BROWN ACT. THE OTHER IS, WHEREVER AND
18 WHEREVER THERE IS A CORE UM, WHICH IS THE MAJORITY OF YOU ALL.
19 THERE IS A MEETING. MEETING UNDER THE BROWN ACT IS A TERM OF
20 ART LIKE THE ONES YOU'RE FINAL WITH THAT WE'RE IN TODAY, THERE
21 IS AN AGENDA AND WE'RE TALKING IN PUBLIC AND STREAMING. THERE
22 OTHER MEMBERS UNDER THE BROWN ACT THAT CAN TRIP PEOPLE UP. I
23 WAS LOOKING AT MARTHA'S POP-UP THERE. ONE IS CALLED A SERIAL
24 MEETING, AND THAT IS THE ONE THAT HAS SORT OF THE GREATEST
25 RISK, AGAIN, FOR WELL INTENTIONED PEOPLE. AND THAT IS WHAT



MAY 11, 2022

1 HAPPENS WHEN THERE IS KIND OF A GAME OF OPERATOR. SO, IF CHAIR
2 KINMAN TALKS TO, YOU KNOW, TWO OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ABOUT,
3 YOU KNOW, HEY, I THINK WE SHOULD APPROACH THIS UPCOMING ISSUE
4 IN THE FOLLOWING WAY, WHAT DO YOU THINK? AND THEY TALK AMONGST
5 THEMSELVES THAT'S LESS THAN A QUORUM. YOU'RE NOT IN A MEETING.
6 IF THOSE TWO PEOPLE TALK TO OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS, YOU MAY
7 HAVE A PROBLEM WHERE YOU START GETTING A TOTAL NUMBER OF
8 GREATER THAN A QUORUM THAT HAS TALKED ABOUT AN ISSUE BEFORE
9 IT'S IN A PUBLIC MEETING. AND THAT IS SOMETHING THAT THE
10 PUBLIC SHOULD BE ENTITLED TO KNOW ABOUT, BECAUSE YOU ARE
11 FORMING AN OPINION OUTSIDE OF AN AGENDAIZED PUBLIC MEETING,
12 AND EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT HAPPENING IN REALTIME, IT'S NOT
13 HAPPENING SIMULTANEOUSLY, IT IS A COLLECTIVE VIEW THAT IS
14 FORMING OUTSIDE OF AN AGENDAIZED MEETING, AND THAT BECOMES A
15 PROBLEM UNDER THE BROWN ACT. THIS IS REALLY EASY TO HAVE
16 HAPPEN, BECAUSE YOU ARE ALL DEDICATED OUTSIDE YOU WOULDN'T BE
17 DOING THIS, AND YOU ARE MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY AND YOU'RE
18 OUT THERE AND TALKING IT'S EASY TO ACCIDENTALLY FORM A QUORUM
19 ON A TOPIC IF YOU AREN'T REALLY CAREFUL ABOUT MAKING SURE YOU
20 KNOW WHOM YOU HAVE SPOKEN TO ABOUT SOMETHING, AND WHO THEY
21 HAVE SPOKEN TO. THE OTHER WAY THIS HAPPENS IS CALLED A, THAT'S
22 A SERIAL MEETING PROBLEM, GAME OPERATOR GOING THROUGH, THE
23 OTHER IS HUB AND SPOKE AND THIS HAPPENS FREQUENTLY WHERE YOU
24 HAVE AN ADVOCATE. YOU HAVE AN ADVOCATE WHO WANTS TO TALK TO
25 EACH OF YOU ABOUT A SUBJECT SO THEY CAN GET YOU UP TO SPEED,



MAY 11, 2022

1 AND HOPE TO CONVINCING YOU TO TAKE A PARTICULAR POSITION ON
2 SOMETHING. IF THEY TALK TO MORE THAN A QUORUM OF YOU, OR
3 THEY BECOME A HUB, AND YOU'RE ALL SPOKES, IT'S UP TO A
4 MEETING. IF THEY SAY COMMISSIONER WONG TALKED TO COMMISSIONER
5 WILSON, YOU HAVE THAT GAME OF OPERATOR BUT IT'S GOING THROUGH
6 AN INTERMEDIARY, AND THAT CAN STILL CONSTITUTE A MEETING UNDER
7 THE BROWN ACT AND IS ALSO A VIOLATION OF THE BROWN ACT. AGAIN
8 THAT DIDN'T HAPPEN IN A PUBLIC, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
9 WOULDN'T HAVE ACCESS TO THAT, AND THAT'S THE FUNDAMENTAL
10 PROBLEM THERE. SO THE FIRST ONE WAS THE SERIAL, KIND OF JUST A
11 CHAIN, THE OTHER ONE WAS THE HUB AND SPOKE. THOSE ARE BOTH
12 THINGS TO WATCH OUT FOR WHEN YOU ARE DEALING WITH THE BROWN
13 ACT. AGAIN, REALLY EASY TO HAVE HAPPEN ESPECIALLY WHEN A LOT
14 OF YOU OVERLAP OUT IN THE WORLD, BECAUSE YOU'RE PASSIONATE
15 ABOUT YOUR RESPECTIVE BUSINESS IS, AND YOU'RE LIKELY TO
16 INTERACT WITH THE SAME THIRD PARTIES, AND YOU MAY OVERLAP AT
17 OTHER FUNCTIONS AND SO ON. YOU CAN ALSO HAVE A MEETING THAT
18 TAKES PLACE ON SOCIAL MEDIA. IF SOMEONE POSTS SOMETHING ON A
19 FACEBOOK PAGE AND YOU COMMENT, THAT IS NOW, YOU KNOW, YOUR --
20 AND IT'S SOMETHING THAT'S WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OR SUBJECT
21 MATTER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, THAT'S NOW A
22 COMMUNICATION THAT'S HAPPENING OUTSIDE OF AN AGENDAIZED
23 MEETING. IF SOMEONE IS HOSTING A COMMUNITY FORUM THAT'S NOT
24 THROUGH MTC AND A QUORUM OF YOU ATTEND, YOU CAN ALL ATTEND.
25 THAT'S FINE. BUT IF YOU START DISCUSSING AMONGST YOURSELVES



MAY 11, 2022

1 SOMETHING THAT MIGHT LATER SHOW UP ON AN AGENDA FOR YOU, THEN
2 THAT'S A MEETING THAT YOU'RE HAVING EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT
3 AGENDAIZED AS YOUR MEETING. SO, THERE ARE ALL THESE KIND OF
4 TRAPS FOR THE UNWARY, THAT WHEN WE'RE GOING THROUGH OUR LIVES
5 AS NORMAL COMMITTED COMMUNITY MEMBERS WE DON'T HAVE TO THINK
6 ABOUT THIS STUFF, BUT ONCE YOU'RE A MEMBER OF A BROWN ACT
7 BODY, THERE IS THAT ADDITIONAL LAYER OF HAVING TO CHECK TO
8 MAKE SURE THAT YOU'RE NOT TRIPPING OVER THESE STRICTURES THAT
9 ARE THERE TO PROTECT THE PUBLIC'S INTEREST IN KNOWING HOW
10 YOU'RE FORMING YOUR OPINIONS. THE CURE FOR ALL THAT, BECAUSE
11 IT SOUNDS A LITTLE DAUNTING, BUT THE CURE FOR ALL OF THAT IS
12 DEVELOPING REALLY GOOD BROWN ACT HYGIENE. AND THAT INVOLVES
13 THINGS, LIKE, IF YOU'RE GOING TO TALK TO ANOTHER COUNCILMEMBER
14 ABOUT AN ISSUE, AND YOU ARE E-MAILING THEM TO SETUP A TIME TO
15 TALK, AND YOU SAY I HAVEN'T SPOKEN TO ANYONE ELSE ON THE
16 COUNCIL ABOUT THIS HAVE YOU SPOKEN TO ANYONE? AND ARE YOU
17 PLANNING? THAT WAY YOU CAN DETERMINE YOU'RE NOT TRIPPING
18 SIDEWAYS INTO A SERIAL MEETING. OR I HAVE SPOKEN TO ONE
19 PERSON, THEN YOU CAN COUNT AND MAKE SURE YOU'RE NOT BUMPING UP
20 AGAINST HAVING THAT PROBLEM. IF YOU'RE GOING TO A COMMUNITY
21 FORUM WHERE YOU THINK THERE ARE ISSUES THAT ARE RELEVANT TO
22 THE COUNCIL THAT MIGHT COME UP, YOU CAN ASK THE FORM
23 ORGANIZERS WHO ELSE IS BEING INVITED, ARE OTHER COUNCIL
24 MEMBERS GOING TO BE THERE. YOU CAN THEN FIGURE OUT WHAT LEVEL
25 OF PARTICIPATION YOU ARE COMFORTABLE WITH. ALL OF THESE TOPICS



MAY 11, 2022

1 ARE WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. IF
2 YOU WANT TO GO TO A SCHOOL CURRICULUM MEETING AND ALL OF YOU
3 ARE AT A SCHOOL CURRICULUM MEETING AND THAT'S NOT SOMETHING
4 YOU ALL ARE GOING TO TALK ABOUT ON A POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
5 THAT'S NOT A PROBLEM JUST REALLOCATED TO THINGS THAT MIGHT BE
6 WITHIN YOUR PURVIEW. THE CHALLENGE IS THE POLICY ADVISORY
7 COUNCIL HAS A BROAD SUBJECT MATTER OF ISSUES THAT YOU ALL
8 MIGHT TALK ABOUT OVER TIME AND IT OVERLAPS PRETTY WELL WITH
9 THE THINGS THAT YOU ARE LIKELY ADVOCATING FOR AND DOING THINGS
10 IN YOUR LIVES OUTSIDE OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. SO YOU
11 HAVE TO THINK ABOUT HOW YOUR OUTSIDE CONDUCT MIGHT RELATE TO
12 YOUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL POSITION. THAT'S A LOT RIGHT
13 THERE, THAT I JUST TALKED ABOUT, AND THERE IS A LOT TO UNPACK.
14 I WANTED TO GET YOU KIND OF THE PRINCIPLE OVER THAT. BUT THERE
15 IS A LOT IN THE DETAILS. AND WE'RE HAPPY TO HELP YOU. WE,
16 OFFICE OF GENERAL COUNSEL, MYSELF, OR MY VERY TALENTED STAFF
17 ARE HAPPY TO HELP YOU WORK THROUGH THINGS IF YOU ARE UNCERTAIN
18 ABOUT WHERE YOU ARE. THE GOOD NEWS ABOUT THE BROWN ACT IS,
19 WHILE PEOPLE CAN SUE FOR VIOLATION OF IT, WE CAN ALSO MONITOR
20 OURSELVES AND WE CAN CURE, IF WE FOUND OUT THAT THERE WAS AN
21 ACCIDENT, AND SOMEBODY DIDN'T REALIZE THAT THEY HAD GOTTEN
22 INTO A SERIAL MEETING SITUATION OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT, WE CAN
23 AGENDAIZE THINGS PROPERLY AND WE CAN TAKE CARE OF THAT OR WE
24 CAN REDO AN ACTION PROPERLY SO WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO FIX OUR
25 PROBLEMS. SO I REALLY WANT TO ENCOURAGE YOU TO REACH OUT,



MAY 11, 2022

1 IDEALLY, BEFORE AN ISSUE ARISES. BUT IF IT'S AN ISSUE AND AN
2 ACCIDENT WHERE SOMETHING HAPPENS AND YOU'RE WORRIED ABOUT IT
3 YOU CAN CALL US AND WE CAN FIX IT ON THE BACK END. SOME THINGS
4 ARE OBVIOUSLY EASIER TO FIX THAN OTHERS BUT THAT'S AN OPTION
5 UNDER THE BROWN ACT. WE DON'T NECESSARILY HAVE TO ACCEPT A
6 PROBLEM, WE CAN TRY TO FIX IT AND MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE GIVEN
7 THE PUBLIC THAT ACCESS AND OPPORTUNITY THAT THEY NEED TO WEIGH
8 IN ON YOUR DECISION-MAKING. THE NEXT BULLET IS A POINT WHERE
9 PUBLIC HAS ACCESS TO INFORMATION THAT INFORMS DECISIONS. IF
10 YOU HAVE AN ITEM, THAT'S AN ISSUE THAT'S RELEVANT FOR EXAMPLE,
11 YOU DON'T WANT TO BE SENDING OUT AN OPINION ARTICLE AROUND TO
12 OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS AND IT ISN'T SHARED WITH THE PUBLIC,
13 BECAUSE THE PUBLIC SHOULD KNOW THE BASIS FOR YOUR DECISION
14 THAT'S SOMETHING THE PUBLIC SHOULD BE ABLE TO SEE IN THE
15 AGENDA PACKET. AND, THAT IS SOMETHING WE CAN FIX. THERE ARE
16 REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE NARROW AND DEFINED BY STATUTE. SO WE DO
17 NOT GET TO DIVERGE FROM THE SORT OF, EVERYTHING HAPPENS IN
18 PUBLIC STANDARD, UNLESS THERE IS A SPECIFIC REASON THAT'S
19 RECOGNIZED BY THE STATUTE THAT LET'S US DO THAT. AND THEY ARE
20 THE KINDS OF THINGS THAT YOU WOULD EXPECT. RIGHT? SO, THINGS
21 THAT -- A PERSONALLY REVIEW FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR DOES
22 NOT HAVE TO HAPPEN AT A PUBLIC MEETING. DISCUSSIONS ABOUT
23 WHETHER MTC SHOULD SUE SOMEBODY DOESN'T HAVE TO HAPPEN IN
24 PUBLIC BEFORE THEY HAVE MADE THE DECISION TO SUE. ONCE THEY
25 HAVE MADE THAT DECISION THEN IT'S PUBLIC. THERE ARE CERTAIN



MAY 11, 2022

1 KIND OF VERY NARROW THINGS BUT THEY'RE NOT LIKELY TO APPLY
2 REALLY TO THE COUNCIL'S WORK, WITH THE POSSIBLE EXCEPTION THAT
3 IF THERE IS SOME THREAT OF LITIGATION RELATED TO YOUR WORK,
4 THAT'S SOMETHING THIS WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO TALK ABOUT IN CLOSED
5 SESSION. BUT IT WOULD BE AGENDAIZED APPROPRIATELY FOR THAT.
6 SO, THAT'S A LOT OF WICK TALKING ON MY PART. ONE MORE THING I
7 WANTED TO MENTION, BECAUSE COMMITTEES CAME UP, IF THERE IS A
8 STANDING COMMITTEE OF THE POLICY COUNCIL, NON-COMMITTEE
9 MEMBERS CAN ATTEND, SORT OF, AS MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, AS
10 OBSERVERS, BUT WHAT YOU SHOULDN'T DO IS ACTUAL IT INTO A FULL
11 COUNCIL MEETING BY ENGAGING SUBSTANTIVELY IN CONVERSATION AT
12 THE COMMITTEE LEVEL. BECAUSE, AGAIN, IT WAS AGENDAIZED AS A
13 MEET COMMITTEE NOT THE COUNCIL MEETING, SO IF YOU'RE NOT ON
14 THE COMMITTEE YOU SHOULDN'T BE ENGAGING IN THE COMMITTEE
15 SUBSTANTIVE TOPICS. YOU COULD ASK A CLARIFYING QUESTION OR
16 SOMETHING LIKE THAT BUT IN TERMS OF GETTING INTO A SUBSTANTIVE
17 POLICY DISCUSSION AT THE COMMISSION OF THAT COMMITTEE WHEN YOU
18 ARE NOT ON THAT COMMITTEE DESTROYS THE SORT OF COMMITTEE
19 STRUCTURE AND THE PURPOSE OF THAT AGENDA IN INFORMING THAT. SO
20 WITH ALL THAT TALKING, I THINK THAT WAS THE END OF MY -- LET'S
21 SEE WHAT THE NEXT SLIDE IS. IT'S PROBABLY QUESTIONS. THERE YOU
22 GO. YES. DO E-MAIL ME. I AM AVAILABLE. AND I REALLY DO WANT TO
23 HELP YOU, BECAUSE SOME OF THESE THINGS CAN BE CONFUSING, EVEN
24 FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE BEEN IN IT FOR 20 OR 30 YEARS, LIKE
25 MYSELF, AND THE OTHER THING IS THAT THERE ARE A LOT OF



MAY 11, 2022

1 ADJUSTMENT CALLS INVOLVED AT THE BOUNDARIES OF THESE
2 QUESTIONS. SO THOSE ARE ONES THAT YOU DON'T HAVE TO MAKE BY
3 YOURSELF. WE'RE HERE AS A RESOURCE TO HELP YOU THINK THROUGH
4 THEM. YOUR CHAIR IS VERY FAMILIAR WITH BROWN ACT ISSUES AS IS
5 YOUR DEDICATED STAFF HERE SO THEY CAN BE RESOURCES AS WELL. I
6 WANT TO THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME GIVE THAT WHIRL WIND TOUR.
7 AND I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU KATHY. I HAVE RICH AND ILAF.

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT IS THE BEST CLEAR
12 DESCRIPTION THAT I HAVE EVER HEARD WITHOUT GOING INTO A LOT OF
13 DETAIL THAT SORT OF FOGS PEOPLE'S MINDS. I REALLY APPRECIATE
14 IT. I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED WITH A LOT OF BOARDS OVER THE LAST 35
15 YEARS, AND I HAVE A METHOD I USE, I GET ONE BROWN ACT BUDDY
16 AND I DISCUSS ONLY WITH THAT PERSON. I DON'T GO BEYOND THAT.
17 BECAUSE IF YOU GO BEYOND THAT, AND OTHER PEOPLE DISCUSS IT,
18 THEN -- AND DISCUSS IT WITH YOUR BROWN ACT BUDDY, THEN YOU END
19 UP GETTING A SERIAL MEETING. SO, AND, ALSO, WHERE I HAVE SEEN
20 THESE COMPLAINTS FILED IS ALWAYS WHEN THERE IS DISCORD ON A
21 COMMITTEE BETWEEN MEMBERS, OR WHEN THERE IS AN ELECTION
22 PENDING AND THERE IS DISCORD ON A CITY COUNCIL. IT'S ALWAYS
23 PRETTY DAMMING FOR A CITY COUNCIL MEMBER WHEN IT'S ANNOUNCED A
24 COUPLE OF MONTHS BEFORE AN ELECTION THAT SOMEBODY'S BEEN
25 CHARGED WITH A BROWN ACT VIOLATION. AND THE DA IS



MAY 11, 2022

1 INVESTIGATING IT, EVEN IF THERE MAY NOT BE MERIT TO IT. I JUST
2 TRY TO STAY AWAY FROM THIS COMPLETELY BECAUSE IT CAN BE USED
3 AS A CLUB. I WAS UNDER THE BAGLEY KEEN ACT FOR 15 YEARS IT
4 OPERATING DIFFERENTLY BUT ONE OF THE THINGS STATE DID THEY
5 DIDN'T WANT MORE THAN TWO OF US TOGETHER AT ANY MEETING. SO
6 WHEN WE MET WITH EXPERTS, OUTSIDE THE MEETING PROCESS, THE
7 BOARD WOULD CHOOSE TWO OF THE BOARD MEMBERS TO GO TO THOSE
8 MEETINGS. SO I'M NOT QUITE SURE WHERE THAT CAME FROM. I DON'T
9 THINK IT'S IN THE BAGLEY KEENE ACT IT MAY HAVE JUST BEEN
10 POLICY. SO THE BROWN ACT HAS A LOT OF RESTRICTIONS. BUT IT'S
11 FOR A GOOD PURPOSE, AND I, AGAIN, REALLY APPRECIATE YOUR
12 PRESENTATION. I THOUGHT IT WAS VERY FACT --

13

14 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT'S THE GREAT THING ABOUT THE BROWN ACT
15 HYGIENE STICK TO THOSE PRINCIPLES YOU DON'T HAVE TO WORRY
16 ABOUT THE COMPLICATED MATH.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ILAF?

19

20 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS EXTREME HE HELPFUL.
21 WOULD YOU MIND REVIEWING THE PROTOCOLS WHEN ADVOCATES SPEAK TO
22 YOU ABOUT CERTAIN ISSUES?

23

24 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT COMES DOWN TO THE BROWN ACT HYGIENE AND
25 RELATIONSHIPS TO THE ADVOCATE AND THE ISSUE. IT'S NOT A ONE



MAY 11, 2022

1 SIZE FITS ALL. YOU CAN ALWAYS LISTEN AND SET THAT EXPECTATION
2 AT THE BEGINNING, YOU CAN SAY BECAUSE THIS MIGHT COME UP IN A
3 MEETING, I'M NOT GOING TO OFFER YOU MY OPINION, BUT I WANT TO
4 HEAR WHAT'S GOING ON WITH YOU. AND HAVE THEM JUST TELL YOU.
5 IT'S A ONE-WAY COMMUNICATION. YOU CAN ASK CLARIFYING QUESTIONS
6 BUT THEN YOU HAVEN'T SAID HOW YOU'RE GOING TO VOTE ON ANYTHING
7 OR YOU HAVEN'T WORKED OUT AN OPINION WITH THEM FOR YOU TO
8 ARTICULATE IN THE MEETING. SO THAT'S THE ALWAYS AVAILABLE TO
9 YOU. RIGHT? IF YOUR RELATIONSHIP TO THE ADVOCATE IS DIFFERENT
10 IF IT'S ONE WHERE YOU REALLY ARE ALIGNED WITH THEM IT'S
11 SOMETHING YOU WANT TO WORK OUT A POLICY POSITION WITH THEM
12 IT'S SOMETHING YOU WANT TO MAKE SURE YOU'RE ENGAGING IN THAT
13 BROWN ACT HYGIENE COMMUNICATION, WHO ELSE ARE YOU TALKING TO?
14 I'M NOT COMFORTABLE TALKING TO OTHER MEMBERS IN THE SAME WAY.
15 BECAUSE WE ALREADY HAVE AN EXISTING RELATIONSHIP THROUGH OUR
16 WORK, OR WORK WITH NON-PROFIT WORK AND THAT I WANT TO BE
17 ALIGNED, BUT HAVING DONE THAT YOU DON'T WANT TO HAVE THE SAME
18 PERSON GO TO OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS AND ACCIDENTALLY CONVEY
19 YOUR VIEWS THEN IT BECOMES A SERIAL MEETING. IT'S DEPENDING ON
20 THE CONVERSATION WITH THE ADVOCATE. LISTENING IS CLEAN, AND
21 ALSO SETTING UP EXPECTATIONS. IF YOU'RE SETTING UP A MEETING
22 AND YOU PUT IN E-MAIL I'M HAPPY TO LISTEN BUT I'M NOT GOING TO
23 OFFER MY OPINION THAT'S A RECORD THAT'S TIME STAMPED BEFORE
24 THE MEETING AND INDICATES THE LEVEL OF YOUR INVOLVEMENT AND
25 SHOULD EVER BE A CHALLENGE THEN, THEN THAT'S LOVELY FOR ME,



MAY 11, 2022

1 AND I CAN JUST PULL THAT OUT OF A HAT AND SAY HAHA, THERE
2 WASN'T A SERIAL MEETING. I MIGHT NOT SAY THAT HA HA, BUT I
3 MIGHT -- THAT'S GOLD STANDARD, LISTEN, RECEIVE, AND ANSWER
4 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HOWARD?

7

8 **HOWARD WONG:** I LIKE THE TERM TRANSPARENCY IN GOVERNMENT. I
9 THINK THAT SUMMARIZES ALL OF IT. THAT'S A VERY GOOD WAY OF
10 DESCRIBING THE BROWN ACT. I THINK MOST MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
11 CAN'T AFFORD TO LITIGATE. THEY JUST DON'T HAVE THE MONEY OR
12 KNOWLEDGE OR RESOURCES. SO THE BROWN ACT TRANSPARENCY SEEMS TO
13 BE DEPENDENT ON THE FRONT END OF HAVING MUCH BETTER CLARITY
14 AND AGENDA, AND OUTREACH TO THE PUBLIC THAN THE BACK END BY
15 SELF ENFORCEMENT BY AGENTS, BY BOARD'S AGENCIES, AND CITY
16 ATTORNEYS, AND OTHER LEGAL METHODS OF GOVERNMENT. IN AGENDAS,
17 MANY ITEMS THE PUBLIC JUST DOESN'T SEE, YOU KNOW, WHEN YOU
18 HAVE AN AGENDA WITH, YOU KNOW, 20, 30, 50 ITEMS. THE ONLY
19 REASON THERE IS EVEN A PUBLIC AWARENESS IS BECAUSE SOMEBODY
20 SAW IT AND ALERTED OTHERS THROUGH SOME KIND OF A CHAIN. UNLIKE
21 PLANNING DECISIONS AND PROPERTY DECISIONS WHERE OFTEN
22 LEGISLATIVELY PLANNING DEPARTMENTS ARE REQUIRED TO NOTIFY
23 PROPERTIES WITHIN A CERTAIN DISTANCE FROM THE SUBJECT
24 PROPERTY. MOST ITEMS ARE JUST -- MADE UNAWARE TO THE PUBLIC.
25 AND I THINK SOMETIMES THAT'S DONE ON PURPOSE. SO, HOW DO WE



MAY 11, 2022

1 LEGALLY MANDATE MORE OUTREACH ON TOPICS TO POTENTIALLY
2 AFFECTED PEOPLE?

3

4 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I DON'T KNOW IN TERMS -- LEGAL MANDATES FOR
5 MORE OUTREACH WOULD BE A LEGISLATIVE PUSH. BUT I THINK YOU
6 HAVE CORRECTLY IDENTIFIED THAT WHETHER WE GET SUED OR NOT,
7 THIS IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO. WE WANT MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
8 TO KNOW WHAT WE'RE DOING; THAT'S THE POINT. IT IS THE JOB. I
9 THINK WE CAN ALWAYS STRIVE TO HAVE BETTER AND MORE DESCRIPTIVE
10 AGENDA ITEMS SO THAT SOMEBODY WHO IS ATTUNED -- AND IT'S
11 FUNNY, YOU'RE RIGHT, FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE, PARTICULARLY
12 REGIONAL GOVERNMENT IT'S A CHALLENGE TO MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE
13 KNOW WE'RE HERE AND THE KIND OF DECISIONS WE'RE MAKING.
14 BECAUSE WHEN I WORKED AT THE LOCAL LEVEL A LOT OF THE THINGS
15 THAT REGIONAL GOVERNMENT DID FELT A LITTLE OPAQUE SO WE WANT
16 TO MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE ARE AWARE THAT WE'RE HERE WHICH IS A
17 GENERAL OUTREACH ISSUE BUT THEN THERE ARE DEDICATED MEMBERS OF
18 THE PUBLIC WHO ARE TRACKING A SUBJECT AND THEY MAY DO SEARCHES
19 FOR A WORD STRING ON PUBLIC AGENDAS SO WE NEED TO MAKE SURE
20 THIS THAT WORD STRING SHOWS UP ON THE AGENDA ITEM AND WE HAVE
21 THAT FULLY DESCRIPTIVE ON THE AGENDA SO THAT PEOPLE WHO ARE
22 LOOKING FOR IT CAN FIND IT. AND THAT'S ALSO MAKING SURE THAT
23 WE CAN CONFINE OURSELVES TO WHATEVER THE DESCRIPTION IS SO
24 THAT WE DON'T END UP LEAVING PEOPLE OUT WHO MIGHT OTHERWISE
25 WANT TO BE INCLUDED BUT YOU'RE RIGHT IT TENDS TO BE THERE ARE



MAY 11, 2022

1 FEW PEOPLE WHO ARE KEEPING AN EAGLE EYE ON VARIOUS AGENDAS AND
2 PROMULGATED THEIR OWN NETWORKS TO SAY HEY THERE'S AN ISSUE
3 COMING UP, AND KNOW TO TRACK IT SO WE'RE MAKING SURE WE'RE
4 DESCRIPTIVE IN OUR REQUIRED AGENDAS AND THEN AS MEMBERS OF THE
5 AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL GETTING THE WORD OUT FOR
6 PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE, THE MORE THE BETTER. WE ARE PUBLIC
7 SERVANTS AS EMPLOYEES HERE AND THAT MEANS WE NEED TO HEAR FROM
8 THE PUBLIC IN DOING OUR JOBS BECAUSE THAT'S WHO WE WORK FOR.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE ANY OTHER COUNCIL
11 MEMBERS? I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. GERRY, YOURS WAS RAISED
12 EARLIER.

13

14 **GERRY GLASER:** MY QUESTION WAS ANSWERED. I HAVE NEVER SEEN --
15 ACTUALLY COVERED IN THE TRAINING. FIRST TIME I HAVE SEEN IT.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WAS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
18 THIS ITEM? AND ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO
19 SPEAK?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
22 ON THIS ITEM. THERE WAS ONE BLUE SPEAKER CARD RECEIVED.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IS THAT PERSON --

2

3 **SPEAKER:** JAYNE KRAEMER. THIS IS KIND OF WAIT A SECOND WHILE I
4 OVERTHINK THIS. BUT I WANT TO GO BACK TO AGENDAS. WHAT HAPPENS
5 WHEN THE COUNCIL IS DISCUSSING AN ISSUE THAT IS ON THE AGENDA
6 BUT IT'S BECOME A CONUNDRUM, AND THEN ALL OF A SUDDEN THE IN
7 THE DISCUSSION CHANGES THAT YOU CAN NOW PRODUCTIVELY BEGIN TO
8 TALK ABOUT THAT ISSUE. IS THAT SOMETHING THAT GETS DELAYED
9 UNTIL THE NEXT AGENDA OR DOES THAT REMAIN ON THE AGENDA FOR
10 THAT DISCUSSION? IN OTHER WORDS I DON'T WANT TO THROW THE BABY
11 OUT WITH THE BATH WATER.

12

13 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGHOUT CHAIR.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

16

17 **KATHLEEN KANE:** AS YOU CAN APPRECIATE IN THE ABSTRACT DOING IT
18 IS HARD, BUT THE TOUCH STONE AGAIN IS WHAT THE AGENDA ITEM IS
19 GIVEN THE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IS INTERESTED IN A SENSE OF
20 WHAT THE CONVERSATION WAS GOING TO BE. SO IF THE AGENDA WAS
21 SUFFICIENTLY BROAD TO COVER BOTH THE ORIGINAL PROBLEM AND
22 POTENTIAL RESOLUTIONS THEN NO YOU DON'T HAVE TO TABLE THAT FOR
23 ANOTHER ITEM YOU CAN CONTINUE TO DISCUSS IT UNDER THE AGENDA
24 ITEM IF IT TAKES A TURN AND BECOMES SOMETHING DIFFERENT THAT A
25 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WOULDN'T KNOW TO TUNE IF FOR THAT'S THE



MAY 11, 2022

1 POINT WHERE IT INFRASTRUCTURE FRUSTRATINGLY BECOMES --
2 [INDISCERNIBLE] SOMETIMES YOU HAVE TO CUT OFF A PRODUCTIVE
3 DISCUSSION TO SAY WE NEED TO TABLE THAT TO AGENDAIZE IT FOR
4 DISCUSSION AND THAT MIGHT HAPPEN DEPENDING ON THE NATURE OF
5 THE DISCUSSION. IT'S ESTABLISHED BY THE AGENDA ITEM AND HOW
6 CLEAR IT WAS ABOUT THE THINGS THAT MIGHT HAPPEN UNDERNEATH. IF
7 SOMETHING IS AGENDIZED FOR AN INFORMATION ITEM THAT MEANS WE
8 ARE HAVING DISCUSSION BUT NOT TAKING FINAL ACTION ON IT SO
9 THOSE ARE SOME OF THE THING THAT WE HAVE TO BE CLEAR ABOUT AND
10 WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE PROVIDING COVER FOR THE AGENDA
11 AROUND THE THINGS THAT WE THINK MIGHT HAPPEN UNDER THAT ITEM
12 DISCUSSION. THAT'S A VAGUE ANSWER. I'M SORRY I CAN'T BE MORE
13 PRECISE. BUT I GUESS THAT'S THE ULTIMATE LAWYER RESPONSE,
14 RIGHT? IT DEPENDS. SO, THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE GOT HERE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. SO YOU'RE SAYING AGENDA DESCRIPTION HAS BECOME
17 AN ART, IN A SENSE.

18

19 **KATHLEEN KANE:** YES. AND THE ART IS IN MAKING SURE THAT IT IS
20 CLEAR ENOUGH THAT PEOPLE KNOW WHAT'S GOING TO BE DONE AROUND
21 THAT AGENDA AND BROAD ENOUGH THAT IT LEAVES ROOM FOR
22 DISCUSSION TO TAKE SOME SORT OF PREDICTABLE COURSE IN THERE.
23 SO THAT'S THE TRICK.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.



MAY 11, 2022

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. WITH
3 THAT, I WANT TO THANK YOU, KATHLEEN. THAT'S ACTUALLY ONE OF
4 THE BEST -- I HAVE SAT THROUGH, I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY BROWN
5 ACT DISCUSSIONS, AND THIS WAS THE BEST. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THANK YOU. WELL, I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT IT'S
8 GREAT THAT ALL OF YOU ARE SO DEDICATED HERE. AND WE WANT TO
9 MAKE SURE THAT WE SUPPORT YOU IN THAT. SO, I MEANT IT ABOUT E-
10 MAILING, AND, OR CALLING, AND WE'RE HERE TO HELP AS YOU GO
11 FORWARD. THANK YOU FOR HAVING ME.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE INTO ITEM
14 NUMBER 11, THE MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY DEVELOPMENT
15 AND OUTREACH. AND WE HAVE TWO STAFF MEMBERS. KENNETH FOLAN AND
16 ANNE SPEVACK.

17

18 **KENNETH FOLAN:** GOOD AFTERNOON COUNCIL MEMBERS. MY NAME IS
19 KENNETH FOLAN HERE WITH MY COLLEAGUE ANNE SPEVACK WE'RE HERE
20 TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY. IT
21 WAS AT THE COMMISSION THIS MORNING AS AN INFORMATION ITEM AND
22 WE'RE HERE TO GET YOUR INPUT ON IT TODAY. ANNE WILL RUN
23 THROUGH A POWERPOINT DECK. IF YOU WOULDN'T MIND BRINGING THAT
24 UP. AND I'LL JUST START ON THIS FIRST SLIDE AND THEN HAND IT
25 OVER TO ANNE. FUNDAMENTALLY, WHAT THE MAJOR PROJECT



MAY 11, 2022

1 ADVANCEMENT POLICY IS A THREE PRONGED APPROACH. A FUNDING
2 APPROACH, A POLICY REENFORCEMENT APPROACH IN A RISK MANAGEMENT
3 APPROACH. WE HAVE A SET OF PROJECTS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA, AND
4 WE'RE TRYING TO MOVE THOSE FORWARD WITH SPONSORS. AND WITH
5 FUNDING PARTNERS. FOCUSED ON ADVOCATES FOR FUNDING REINFORCING
6 THROUGH POLICIES THAT ARE ESTABLISHED FOR THE COMMISSION AND
7 ENHANCING THE RISK MANAGEMENT PROGRAM. I WILL NOTE BEFORE
8 HANDING IT OVER TO ANNE, ON MAY 25TH AND 26th THERE IS GOING
9 TO BE A COMMISSION WORKSHOP THAT'S POSTED ON THE MTC WEB SITE
10 THAT'S FOCUSED ON THESE MAJOR PROJECTS AND SPECIFICALLY ON
11 SOME OF THAT RISK MANAGEMENT. SO O WITH THAT, ANNE, WOULD YOU
12 LIKE TO RUN THROUGH THE SLIDES? THANKS.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANKS KENNETH FOR THAT INTRODUCTION. I'M ANNE
15 SPEVACK WITH MTC STAFF. AND I'LL GO INTO THIS QUICK
16 PRESENTATION AND THEN LOVE TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK AND INPUT ON
17 THIS PROCESS. STARTING HERE WITH SOME OF THE BACKGROUNDS ON
18 THIS EFFORT THAT HIGHLIGHTS WHY WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS
19 NOW. RESOLUTION 3434 IS OUR PREVIOUS TRANSIT EXPANSION POLICY
20 WHICH WAS BASED ON THE LAST VERSION OF PLANNED BAY AREA, WHICH
21 WILL KIND OF FORM THE BASICS AND STARTING POINT FOR WHAT WE'RE
22 BUILDING THE MAP ON. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AS YOU KNOW, WAS
23 APPROVED LAST YEAR AND INTRODUCED THE NEW GENERATION OF MAJOR
24 PROJECTS TO IMPLEMENT. THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK
25 FORCE AND ACTION PLAN SUGGESTED THAT COORDINATION AND REGIONAL



MAY 11, 2022

1 PRIORITY SETTING IS AN IMPORTANT AREA FOR US TO FOCUS ON. AND
2 ON TOP OF THAT, WE HAVE A LOT OF POTENTIAL FUNDING COMING
3 THROUGHOUT FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE BILL AND THE STATE BUDGET
4 AUGMENTATION. AND WE'RE SEEING THIS AS SOMEWHAT OF AN URGENT
5 ISSUE TO TACKLE PROJECT PRIORITIZATION NOW TO PREPARE FOR
6 THESE SIGNIFICANT FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
7 SO THIS IS A TIMELINE SHOWN IN CONTEXT OF SOME OTHER MAJOR
8 EFFORTS GOING ON HERE AT MTC, AND OUR PLAN, NOW, IS TO ADOPT
9 THE MAP POLICY THIS SUMMER, AND FOLLOW IT UP IN THE FALL
10 DELVING MORE DEEPLY INTO SOME OF THE REGIONAL POLICY
11 CONSISTENCY AND RISK ASSESSMENT ISSUES. NEXT SLIDE. THE MAP IS
12 INTENDED TO BE A BRIDGE BETWEEN PLAN 2050 AND DISCRETIONARY
13 FUNDING DECISIONS DOWN THE LINE THE MAP ALIGNS WITH PROJECTS
14 FOR DISCRETIONARY FUNDING SOURCES AND EVALUATE PROJECTS
15 AGAINST REGIONAL POLICIES AND REGIONAL ROLE IN RISK
16 MANAGEMENT. THE GENERAL STRUCTURE IS A MAP OF FUNDING MATRIX
17 SHOWING COMMITTED AND PLANNED FUNDING PROJECTS ALONG WITH
18 ADDITIONAL COLUMNS AND ATTACHMENTS FOR PROJECT EVALUATION
19 POLICY FOUNDATION PRIORITIES FOR SPECIFIC SOURCES AND RISK
20 MANAGEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT TYPE OF PROJECTS SHOULD BE IN THE
21 MAP WE'LL FOCUS ON LARGER PROJECTS WITH SIGNIFICANT
22 DISCRETIONARY FUNDING NEED THAT WOULD REQUIRE REGIONAL
23 COORDINATION AND PRIORITIZATION, AND WE'LL ALSO BE LOOKING AT
24 PROJECTS THAT FALL UNDER REGIONAL PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES. FOR
25 EXAMPLE, BUS RAPID TRANSIT, EXPRESS LANES, THOSE ARE THE KIND



MAY 11, 2022

1 OF PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT. PROJECTS DO
2 NOT NEED TO BE IN THE MAP TO BE FUNDED OR V A FUNDING
3 STRATEGY. WE'RE JUST LOOKING AT BIG REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY
4 FUNDING DECISIONS. NEXT SLIDE. COMPONENTS OF THE MAP, AS
5 KENNETH NOTED A FEW MINUTES AGO, THE FUNDING STRATEGIES,
6 POLICY REENFORCEMENTS WHICH COULD INCLUDE BENEFIT-COST RATIO,
7 EQUITY, LAND USE, CONNECTED MOBILITY, AND RISK MANAGEMENT,
8 WHERE WE WILL BE WORKING WITH PARTNERS TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR
9 RISK OVERSIGHT IS ROBUST AND DEVELOPING A REGIONAL RISK
10 MANAGEMENT ROLE. NEXT SLIDE. WE HELD A CALL FOR PROJECTS TO BE
11 INCLUDED IN THE MAP LAST MONTH. PROJECTS WERE DUE ON APRIL
12 15TH. AND AS YOU CAN SEE, ON THIS SLIDE, WE RECEIVED A LOT OF
13 REQUESTS FOR INCLUSION IN THE MAP WITH A VERY LARGE FUNDING
14 NEED. AND I WANT TO NOTE THAT THE COMMITTED FUNDING FOR THESE
15 PROJECTS IS A VERY SMALL PERCENTAGE OF THAT VERY LARGE FUNDING
16 NEED. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE CURRENTLY DEVELOPING EVALUATION
17 CRITERIA TO HELP US PRIORITY AND SEQUENCE PROJECTS, AND WE'RE
18 LOOKING AT FUNDING COMMITMENT LEVELS, SCHEDULE ALIGNMENT WITH
19 PLANNED BAY AREA FOCUS -- POLICY FOCUS AREAS. AND FOR THE
20 PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES, THERE MAY BE ADDITIONAL OR MORE
21 DETAILED EVALUATION. AND TO HELP YOU PICTURE THIS, WHAT WE'RE
22 EXPECTING THIS TO LOOK LIKE IS A MATRIX LISTING A LIMITED
23 NUMBER OF THE LARGEST PROJECTS FOLLOWED BY ROLLED UP LINE
24 ITEMS FOR PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES, LIKE BRT AND EXPRESS LANES
25 AS I MENTIONED EARLIER. WITH EACH OF THESE ROLLED CATEGORIES



MAY 11, 2022

1 WE MAY DEVELOP FOCUSED STRATEGIES FOR SPECIFIC ENDORSEMENTS OR
2 PRIORITIZATION WOULD LOOK LIKE WITHIN THAT PROGRAM CATEGORY.
3 NEXT SLIDE. OUR TIMELINE AND ENGAGEMENT STRATEGY, TODAY, WE
4 TODAY THIS ITEM TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
5 AND WE'RE HERE TODAY WITH TO YOU GET INPUT AND FEEDBACK. WE
6 HAVE ONGOING ENGAGEMENT WITH OPERATORS AND CTAS AND OTHER
7 PROJECT SPONSORS AS WE REFINE THE PROJECT LIST, AND WITH
8 FUNDING PARTNERS AS WE DEVELOP OUR FUNDING PRIORITIZATION
9 STRATEGIES. AS KENNETH MENTIONED, WE'RE ALSO HAVE A WORKSHOP
10 ON MAJOR PROJECT DELIVERY THAT WILL INCLUDE DISCUSSION OF THE
11 MAP AND RISK MANAGEMENT IN MAY, AND WE EXPECT TO BRING A MAP
12 POLICY TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL THIS SUMMER. NEXT SLIDE.
13 I THINK THAT'S THE END OF THE PRESENTATION. I'M HAPPY TO TAKE
14 QUESTIONS AND HEAR YOUR FEEDBACK.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BEFORE WE START QUESTIONS, I
17 HAVE SOME CLARIFICATION THEY WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SURE. FIRST OF
18 ALL, 2/3 OF THIS BODY WERE NOT AROUND FOR PLANNED BAY AREA
19 2050 SO THIS IS NEW TO THEM AS WELL AS THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
20 RECOVERY TASK FORCE. SO, THIS IS ALL -- I'M ASSUMING -- REALLY
21 NEW TO A LOT OF PEOPLE. SO, THE WORKSHOPS THAT ARE COMING UP,
22 ARE THOSE TWO SEPARATE WORKSHOPS? OR ARE THEY THE SAME
23 WORKSHOP GIVEN TWO DIFFERENT DAYS?

24



MAY 11, 2022

1 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THAT IS IN TWO WEEK'S TIME, MAY 25TH, AND MAY
2 26th, AS POSTED ON THE MTC WEB SITE T SAYS THAT THERE IS GOING
3 TO BE A WORKSHOP. I THINK THE SINGLE TOPIC IS GOING TO BE THE
4 MAJOR PROJECTS AND MEGA PROJECTS RELATED TO THIS MAP EFFORT.
5 SO, MORE DETAILS TO COME ON IT. BUT IT'S ONE WORKSHOP, NOT TWO
6 WORKSHOPS. IT JUST IS GOING TO HAPPEN OVER TWO DAYS.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. BECAUSE THAT WOULD BE
9 HELPFUL NOT HAVING TO ATTEND BOTH. AND I'M GOING TO ASK STAFF,
10 PROACTIVELY, WHEN THE MATERIALS ARE AVAILABLE TO FORWARD THEM
11 TO ON THE COUNCIL AHEAD OF TIME. BECAUSE THAT IS GOING TO --
12 IT'S GOING TO BE NECESSARY FOR POP TO GET CAUGHT UP ON WHAT
13 THIS IS. I SEE HANDS RAISED. WE'LL GO WITH BRAD PAUL FIRST
14 THEN CHRISTINE.

15

16 **BRAD PAUL:** BRAD PAUL DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR LOCAL
17 GOVERNMENT SERVICES, THAT WORKSHOP IS GOING TO HAVE DIFFERENT
18 DISCUSSION IN THE FIRST AND SECOND DAY. IT'S NOT GOING TO
19 REPEAT ANYTHING IN THE SECOND DAY. I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY
20 THAT.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. CHRISTINA AND THEN
23 ADINA.

24



MAY 11, 2022

1 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** HI THERE. THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I
2 WAS JUST WONDERING IF SLIDE -- I THINK IT'S SLIDE SEVEN WHERE
3 YOU MENTIONED THAT THERE WERE REQUESTS RECEIVED WHEN YOU DID
4 THE CALL FOR PROJECTS, JUST WHAT THE DISTRIBUTION OF THOSE
5 PROJECTS IS, LIKE, COUNTY GEOGRAPHY-WISE. AND HOW THAT -- WHAT
6 WAS INVOLVED IN THE CALL FOR THE PROJECT?

7

8 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THE CALL WAS REALLY BASED ON THE ADOPTED
9 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN -- PLANNED BAY AREA. AND THAT
10 STASHED TIERS OF PROJECTS. TIER ONE WAS PROJECTS FROM NOW
11 THROUGH YEAR 2035, AND THEN TIER TWO WERE LONGER RANGE
12 PROJECTS. SO, WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR IS IN THAT TIER ONE
13 CATEGORY, MEGA PROJECTS ARE WHAT WE'RE ROUGHLY DEFINING AS
14 PROJECTS OVER \$1 BILLION, AND THEN POTENTIALLY PROJECTS THAT
15 ARE SMALLER, IN THE RANGE OF TWO 250 TO A BILLION DOLLARS,
16 THAT COULD POTENTIAL BE ROLLED UP INTO SORT OF A CATEGORY, ONE
17 EXAMPLE, THAT MIGHT BE RAPID TRANSIT OR BUS TRAPPED TRANSIT.
18 PLANNED BAY AREA FOUND THOSE PROJECTS WERE GOOD VALUE FOR THE
19 MONEY IN GENERAL. SO THAT WAS SOMETHING WE NOTED THERE. ONE
20 OTHER THING I'LL MENTION, BECAUSE YOU ASKED, BECAUSE OF THE
21 NATURE OF MEGA PROJECTS THAT ARE MORE FOCUSED WITHIN THE CORE
22 WHERE POPULATIONS ARE HIGHEST. SO MOST OF THOSE PROJECTS ARE
23 BETWEEN SAN JOSE, SAN FRANCISCO, AND INTO THE INNER EAST BAY.
24 THERE ARE A COUPLE LIKE THE VALLEY LINK PROJECT THAT IS'S A
25 LITTLE FURTHER OUT. THERE ARE PROJECTS IN THE NORTH BAY WE'RE



MAY 11, 2022

1 STILL GOING OVER THERE WERE SOME SUBMITTED WE DON'T HAVE
2 FINALIZED LIST ON THAT, BUT THAT'S SOME INFORMATION THAT
3 SHOULD BE SHARED NEXT WEEK AT THE WORKSHOP. THANK YOU.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ADINA THEN HOWARD.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A PREP QUESTION AND THEN SOME CONTENT
8 QUESTIONS. SO, IF I REMEMBER RIGHT, THIS WAS AT PROGRAMMING
9 AND ALLOCATIONS OR SOME OTHER COMMITTEE MEETING THIS MORNING,
10 WHICH I HAD WAS NOT ABLE TO WATCH. ANY UPDATES ON WHAT
11 COMMISSIONERS HAD TO SAY ABOUT THIS TOPIC?

12

13 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THEY WERE VERY INTERESTED IN THE UPCOMING
14 WORKSHOP. I THINK A COUPLE OF COMMISSIONERS NOTED THAT
15 PROJECTS CHANGE OVER TIME AND THAT SOME OF PROJECTS, THE TITLE
16 HAS BEEN AROUND FOR A LONG TIME, AND THERE NEEDS TO BE
17 CONTINUAL COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS, NOT STATIC. SO THAT WAS A
18 COMMENT THAT WAS BROUGHT UP. OTHERWISE, I THINK THEY'RE
19 LOOKING FORWARD TO THE WORKSHOP AND THE NEXT STEPS HERE. THANK
20 YOU.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO, I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS THAT WOULD
23 LOVE TO ON HOW STAFF IS THINKING AND, SO, ONE IS ABOUT HOW IS
24 RISK MANAGEMENT BEING THOUGHT ABOUT. THERE IS AN EXAMPLE OF
25 THE BART SILICON VALLEY PROJECT, WHICH, LAST WEEK, THE VTA



MAY 11, 2022

1 BOARD DECIDED TO GO AHEAD WITH THE FIRST MAJOR CONSTRUCTION-
2 RELATED CONTRACT. BUT MEANWHILE ASKED FOR AN INDEPENDENT PEER-
3 REVIEW, LOOKING AT A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT BOTH FEATURES OF THE
4 PROJECT IN TERMS OF RIDER EXPERIENCE AND ACHIEVES ITS GOALS IN
5 TERMS OF THE NUMBER OF STREET ENTRANCES AND THE QUALITY OF THE
6 TRANSFERS AND THE ABILITY TO SUPPORT TRANSIT-ORIENTED
7 DEVELOPMENT, AS WELL AS, LIKE, NEW INFORMATION ABOUT THE
8 POTENTIAL COST OF THE PROJECT THAT, WHERE THAT POTENTIAL PRICE
9 TAG HAD GREATLY INCREASED OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS, AND I'M
10 WONDERING ABOUT ANY THINKING -- LIKE, THIS WAS A PROCESS THAT
11 OCCURRED WITH INPUT FROM THE CITY OF SAN JOSE AND BART, WE'RE
12 GOING TO JUST RUN THE PROJECT, AND VTA WHICH IS THE PROJECT
13 OWNER, IS THERE ANY THINKING ABOUT THIS PROCESS AS SOMETHING
14 THAT WOULD RELATE TO HOW THAT KIND OF PROCESS MIGHT HAPPEN IN
15 THE FUTURE? OR IS IT UNRELATED TO THAT KIND OF EXERCISE? YOU
16 KNOW, ANOTHER RISK AND CHANGE IN DIRECTION WAS CALTRAIN HAD AN
17 EXPENSIVE SIGNAL POSITIVE TRAIN CONTROL SYSTEM WHERE THEY
18 STARTED DOWN THE PATH USING ONE TECHNOLOGY IN A VERY EARLY
19 STAGE OF THAT TECHNOLOGY BEING DEVELOPED AND THEY REALIZED
20 THAT THEY CHOSE BETAMAX, WHICH WOUND UP BEING THE WRONG CHOICE
21 AND THEY NEED TO CHANGE DIRECTION IS THERE THINKING ABOUT HOW
22 TO DO THIS FOR PROJECTS THAT HAVE RISK IN GENERAL. THAT'S ONE.
23 AND, SECOND, IS THERE ANY THINKING ABOUT HOW THIS PROCESS
24 MIGHT RELATE IN THE FUTURE TO NETWORKS MANAGEMENT? OR IS THIS
25 ABOUT THE PROCESS THAT WE HAVE NOW AND THE INSTITUTIONS THAT



MAY 11, 2022

1 WE HAVE NOW AND HOW DO WE WORK WITHIN THE PROJECTS THAT WE
2 HAVE WITHIN THOSE INSTITUTIONS THAT WE HAVE NOW. AND THIRD,
3 WHICH I THINK I KNOW THE ANSWER TO, IS, LIKE, RELATING TO
4 NETWORK MANAGEMENT, THERE ARE SOME ALTERNATIVE OR REFINED WAYS
5 OF DOING PLANNING, WHERE INCENTIVES SAYING AGENCY A SUBMIT
6 YOUR PROJECT, AND AGENCY B SUBMIT YOUR PROJECT, YOU KNOW, YOU
7 SAY HEY, I WANT PASSENGERS TO BE ABLE TO GET FROM POINT A TO
8 POINT C IN AN HOUR OR LESS, AND SOLVING THAT PROBLEM MAY
9 INVOLVE TWO OR THREE AGENCIES, AND, YOU KNOW, DOING PLANNING
10 LIKE THAT, WHICH, YOU KNOW, COULD BE IN THE SCOPE OF NETWORK
11 MANAGEMENT. IT'S CERTAINLY NOT HOW MTC HAS DONE THINGS IN THE
12 PAST, AND ARE WE BASICALLY WORKING WITHIN THE SYSTEM THAT WE
13 HAVE RIGHT NOW IN THIS, YOU KNOW, IN THE BODY OF WORK BEFORE
14 STAFF? [LAUGHTER] WERE THOSE, LIKE, REALLY TRIVIAL QUESTIONS.
15 SORRY ABOUT THAT.

16

17 **KENNETH FOLAN:** NO. THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THOSE UP. AND WHAT I
18 WOULD SAY IS THAT THE UPCOMING WORKSHOP IS GOING TO BE
19 ADDRESSING A LOT OF THAT. AND I THINK YOU TOUCHED ON A WHOLE
20 BUNCH OF AREAS OF RISK THAT HAVEN'T TRADITIONALLY BEEN PART OF
21 A TRANSPORTATION RISK MANAGEMENT PROGRAM. WHAT WE HAVE DONE IN
22 THE PAST, GENERALLY SPEAKING, SOME PLACES HAVE DONE IT
23 DIFFERENTLY, BUT DURING THE CONSTRUCTION OF A PROJECT YOU
24 ADDRESS RISK AND YOU TRY TO MAKE A PROJECT NOT GO OVER BUDGET
25 NOT BLOW THE TIMELINES THINGS LIKE THAT, THAT'S STILL PART OF



MAY 11, 2022

1 IT, AND STILL NEEDS IMPROVEMENT, BUT WHAT YOU WILL NOTICE IS
2 THE SPECTRUM OF RISK MANAGEMENT THAT NEEDS TO ELONGATE AND YOU
3 HAVE TO BE DEALING WITH RISK PROJECT CONCEPTION THROUGH
4 PROJECT DEVELOPMENT INCLUDING HOW IT AFFECTS THE NETWORK. THE
5 IMPLICATIONS OF THE PROJECT ON THE NETWORK AND VICE-VERSA. SO
6 I THINK THAT A LOT OF THAT WILL BE SPOKEN TO AT THIS WORKSHOP
7 INCLUDING GETTING A LITTLE BETTER ON THE PUBLIC SECTOR SIDE AT
8 THE TRANSFER OF RISK BETWEEN THE CONTRACTOR AND THE AGENCIES.
9 OR FROM THE PUBLIC AGENCY TO ANOTHER PUBLIC AGENCY AND HOW THE
10 RISK IS SHARED. SO A LOT OF THAT WILL BE PART OF WHAT WE'RE
11 TALKING ABOUT SO I APPRECIATE YOUR THINKING ON THAT.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A PROCESS QUESTION THAT I MAY FOLLOW UP
14 DIRECTLY WITH STAFF IN TERMS OF HOW THESE DIFFERENTLY STAGES
15 OF PROCESSES WORK. THANKS.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HOWARD AND THEN RICH. HOWARD,
18 UNMUTE.

19

20 **HOWARD WONG:** I'M VERY HAPPY TO HEAR ABOUT THIS PROJECT EVENTS
21 POLICIES AND CRITERIA. THEY'RE VERY IMPORTANT. SO THANK YOU
22 FOR WORKING ON THIS. I THINK ONE OF THE ISSUES IN THE PAST IS
23 THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF POLITICAL DECISION-MAKING, POLITICAL
24 LEVERAGING OF POWER TO PUSH THROUGH PROJECTS, AS WELL AS
25 SPECIAL INTEREST LOBBYING. SO, I THINK ANYTHING TO MITIGATE



MAY 11, 2022

1 THAT IS GREAT. AND I THINK THE TERM YOU USED, "GOOD VALUE" IS
2 A VERY IMPORTANT CRITERIA. THERE ARE MANY, I THINK, PROJECTS
3 IN THE WORLD THAT WE SEE ADVANCE TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION
4 EQUITABLY, QUICKLY, AND I THINK THAT THOSE ARE THE CRITERIA WE
5 NEED TO EMPHASIZE. SO, THANK YOU.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES?

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES, JUST A REQUEST. AND BY THE WAY, HOWARD,
10 THOSE ARE GOOD COMMENTS -- FOR ME, ANYWAY. I WOULD JUST LIKE
11 TO MAKE SURE I GET SENT A LINK AND AGENDA FOR THE STUDY
12 SESSIONS.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER COUNCIL
15 MEMBERS WHO WISH TO ASK QUESTIONS? I'M GOING TO ASK A QUESTION
16 THAT HAS PUZZLED ME ON THIS. AND THAT IS, WE KEEP TALKING
17 ABOUT COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS, AND WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT THE
18 CORE, BUT ARE WE ACTUALLY COMPARING A COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS TO
19 SOMETHING OUTSIDE THE CORE? BECAUSE IT FEELS, FROM THE WAY ALL
20 OF THIS IS WORDED, THAT ALL WE'RE CONSIDERING ARE MAJOR
21 PROJECTS THAT SERVICE THE CORE WHEN A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF
22 MONEY COULD MOVE A PROJECT FORWARD THAT SERVES SOMETHING
23 OUTSIDE THE CORE AND RECEIVES A BETTER COST BENEFIT RATIO. IF
24 THAT MAKES SENSE?

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **KENNETH FOLAN:** I THINK IT MAKES SENSE, BUT THAT'S A TOUGHER
2 QUESTION, AND MTC IS NOT THE ONLY FUNDING PARTNER. WE DID GO
3 THROUGH A COST BENEFIT FOR PLANS TO ENTER AND BE APPROVED AS
4 PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THAT'S THE POOL OF PROJECTS
5 THAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW. I THINK, AS SOME OF THE COMMISSIONERS
6 NOTED THIS MORNING, I THINK THEY WERE TALKING ABOUT SOMETHING
7 VERY SIMILAR TO WHAT YOU JUST SAID, ABOUT THE COST BENEFIT NOT
8 BEING STATIC, BUT A PROJECT MAY HAVE BEEN UNDER -- BIG
9 PROJECTS LIKE THIS HAVE BEEN AROUND DEVELOPMENT FOR MANY, MANY
10 YEARS, IF NOT FOR DECADES, IN WHAT THE COMMISSIONERS THIS
11 MORNING WERE SAYING IS THAT, AT TIMES YOU MAY NEED TO DO A
12 REFRESH AND THAT THE COST BENEFIT SHOULD BE NOT STATIC, BUT BE
13 REFRESHED AT TIMES. YOUR SPECIFIC THING ABOUT FUNDING IN THE
14 CORE VERSUS PROJECTS THAT ARE NOT IN THE CORE, YOU KNOW, THERE
15 IS DIFFERENT FUNDING PIPELINES. THERE IS DIFFERENT ADVOCACY ON
16 DIFFERENT PROJECTS. I THINK IT'S, THAT'S A COMPLICATED PIECE
17 OF THE PUZZLE. AND DIFFERENT PROJECTS ARE ABLE TO APPLY FOR
18 DIFFERENT FUND SOURCES, AND THAT'S PART OF THE WAY THE FUNDING
19 SOURCES WORK. SO I'M NOT SURE I HAVE A MAGICAL ANSWER FOR
20 THAT.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WELL, I JUST WANTED SOME CLARITY THAT,
23 YOU KNOW, THAT WE'RE NOT LOOKING JUST AT THE REGIONAL IMPACT
24 OF COST, OF A COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS, THAT THERE ARE REGIONS
25 WITHIN THE REGION. AND, SO, SPENDING MONEY ON SOMETHING THAT



MAY 11, 2022

1 IS NOT THE CORE MAY HAVE A HIGHER VALUE TO THAT -- TO THAT
2 PART OF THE MINI REGION, SO TO SPEAK. SO THAT WILL BE COMING
3 UP AT THE WORKSHOP?

4

5 **KENNETH FOLAN:** I THINK THAT PART OF THE MAP DEVELOPMENT IS THE
6 QUESTION OF FUNDING, PRIORITIZING, AND SEQUENCING. SO, THERE
7 WILL BE CONVERSATIONS ABOUT WHICH PROJECTS MAY BE SEQUENCED OR
8 PRIORITIZED.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO, I HAVE ANOTHER QUESTION. SO,
11 MOBILITY MANAGEMENT HAS BEEN A BIG THING, AND IT CAME OUT OF
12 NOT JUST PLANNED BAY AREA, BUT THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN,
13 CALLS FOR US TO DEVELOP REGIONAL MOBILITY MANAGEMENT, BUT
14 THERE IS, LIKE, NO COST ATTACHED TO THAT YET. SO, IS THAT
15 SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE DEVELOPED LATER ON AND CAN BE ADDED
16 INTO THE MAP? OR, HOW DOES THAT GET PRIORITIZED?

17

18 **KENNETH FOLAN:** IT COULD BE PART OF A POLICY REENFORCEMENT. AND
19 THOSE ARE NOT GOING TO BE ADOPTED IMMEDIATELY. THOSE ARE GOING
20 TO BE ADOPTED LATER IN 2022. SO, IF YOU SEE THAT AS SOMETHING
21 SIMILAR TO POLICIES ABOUT HOUSING AROUND TRANSIT, POLICIES
22 ABOUT THERE -- I YOU THINK LISTED ON SLIDE SIX, LAND USE,
23 CONNECTED MOBILITY, THAT COULD BE SOMETHING THAT FITS IN WITH
24 POLICY REENFORCEMENT FOR THE MAP PROJECTS.

25



MAY 11, 2022

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OH, I SEE. SO, IF WE WANTED TO, ALSO,
2 INCLUDE SOMETHING THAT HOUSING AROUND TRANSIT SHOULD HAVE X%
3 OF THE HOUSING SHOULD BE REQUIRED TO BE ACCESSIBLE, NOT JUST
4 LOW-INCOME, BUT ACCESSIBLE FOR THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY, THAT
5 COULD BE PART OF A POLICY THAT GETS FOLDED INTO THE MAP LATER
6 ON?

7

8 **KENNETH FOLAN:** OR IT WILL HAVE RELATION TO THE MAP. IT COULD -
9 - THE POLICY REENFORCEMENTS COULD -- THE MAP COULD STATE THAT
10 THE PROJECTS ARE REQUIRED TO MEETING MTC POLICIES IN THESE
11 AREAS. AND, PERHAPS, THERE IS FOUR OR FIVE POLICIES RELATED.
12 IT'S NOT AS IF WE'RE GOING TO FOLD EVERYTHING IN THERE BUT WE
13 WOULD REFERENCE THE POLICY AS SOMETIMES WE DO WITH FUNDING
14 SOURCES.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU. DWAYNE?

17

18 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** SOMETHING THAT YOU SAID CHAIRPERSON,
19 REGARDING ACCOMMODATIONS FOR DISABLED PEOPLE, IS IT BETTER TO
20 MAKE AN OVERALL PLAN, AND THEN WHEN THE PLAN IS MADE, THEN
21 REASSESS WHAT'S GOING ON, ACCOMMODATIONS FOR DISABLED PEOPLE,
22 TO SEE ACTUALLY AFTER THE PLAN IS MADE, WOULD WORK TO LET THE
23 DISABLED PEOPLE HAVE ACCESS TO THE SAME TRANSIT THAT EVERYBODY
24 ELSE HAS? AND MAKE IT MORE EQUAL? SO I'M SAYING IS IT A
25 REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION AT THE END OF THE PROCESS WHERE YOU



MAY 11, 2022

1 ARE YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE SOME OTHER COSTS BECAUSE YOU KNOW YOU
2 HAVE TO ADD IT IN BECAUSE YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT ACCOMMODATIONS
3 YOU'RE GOING TO MAKE? THAT'S MY QUESTION, I GUESS.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, WHAT I WAS THINKING WAS, BOTH -- WAS
6 PIGGING BAGGING EVERYTHING IN AND FRONT HOLDING THAT CREATING
7 A POLICY THAT GOES ALONG WITH. BUT I'M NOT SURE HOW THAT'S
8 GOING TO WORK THOUGH. AND IF STAFF HAS ANY THOUGHTS ABOUT
9 THAT?

10

11 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** WHEN I THINK ABOUT IT EVEN IN HOUSING, AND
12 STATE LEGISLATION IT'S REASONABLE, AND ACCOMMODATION LOOKS
13 LIKE SOMETHING THAT YOU ADD IN TO MAKE ACCESS THAT'S WHAT I'M
14 THINKING.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT THE THINKING. ILAF?

17

18 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** IN TERMS OF TIMELINE WHEN WE WOULD HAVE
19 TO PROVIDE THAT FEEDBACK OR THAT LIST OF WHAT WE WOULD HOPE TO
20 INCLUDE THAT WOULD BE REFERENCED?

21

22 **KENNETH FOLAN:** I WOULD SUGGEST THAT A GOOD POINT WOULD BE
23 SOMETIME BETWEEN NOW AND JULY WHEN WE MAKE THE INITIAL
24 ADOPTION OF THE MAP. BUT, THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY ON THE
25 POLICY REENFORCEMENTS EVEN AFTER THAT, BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE



MAY 11, 2022

1 GOOD IF YOU ALL HAD SOME THOUGHTS ON WHAT POLICY
2 REENFORCEMENTS ARE IMPORTANT TO INCLUDE IN THE MAP, THAT
3 THEY'RE AVAILABLE TO STAFF BEFORE JULY.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YOU'RE GOING BACK TO THE COMMISSION IN
6 JULY?

7

8 **KENNETH FOLAN:** YES THAT'S THE CONCEPT IS TO GO BACK TO PAC,
9 AND TO THE COMMISSION IN JULY TO ADOPT THE FUNDING FRAMEWORK
10 IN ORDER TO KEEP PACE WITH SOME OF THE FEDERAL FUNDING
11 OPPORTUNITIES BUT THE POLICY ENENFORCEMENTS WILL THEN BE
12 UPDATED LATER IN 2022. SO WHAT I'M SAYING IS IF YOU GET IT
13 BEFORE JULY, THAT'S ANOTHER POINT THAT THE PAC AND THE
14 COMMISSION WILL HAVE A CHANCE TO HEAR IT BUT THAT'S NOT THE
15 LAST POINT. THE LAST POINT WOULD PROBABLY BE LATER IN 2022.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO ASK THAT
18 THAT BE PUT ON CALENDAR FOR EQUITY AND ACCESS FOR WE CAN HAVE
19 A FULLER DISCUSSION ON THAT. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS FROM THE
20 COUNSEL? I DO NOT SEE ANY HAND RAISED. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
21 SUBMITTED? IS THERE ANYBODY IN THE AUDIENCE WHO WISHES TO
22 SPEAK?

23



MAY 11, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
2 ITEM. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
3 RAISED, AND NO ONE SUBMITTED A BLUE SPEAKER CARD.

4
5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6
7 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THANK YOU.

8
9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'LL SEE YOU AT THE MEETING, THE
10 WORKSHOPS, WHATEVER THEY ARE. AND I REALLY HOPE THAT PEOPLE
11 CAN ATTEND THOSE. AND, PLEASE, DON'T BE AFRAID TO RAISE YOUR
12 HAND AND ASK QUESTIONS AT THOSE MEETINGS. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE
13 INTO ITEM NUMBER 12, THE STAFF LIAISON REPORT.

14
15 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** HEY EVERYBODY. KY-NAM HERE. I WANT TO
16 WISH EVERYBODY HAPPY BIKE MONTH WE CELEBRATING AND ALSO ASIAN
17 AMERICAN PACIFIC ISLANDER HERITAGE MONTH, AND ALSO MARTHA'S
18 BIRTHDAY. SHE APPRECIATES YOUR SENTIMENTS. QUICK UPDATE HERE
19 SUMMER ACADEMY APPLICATIONS ARE GOING QUICKLY THROUGH, WE
20 ORIGINALLY HAD 109 APPLICANTS ALL HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED SO FAR.
21 I'LL GIVE AN UPDATE AS WE GET TOWARDS THE OFFICIAL, THE NEXT
22 RUN WILL BE IN JULY. BUT IT'S ROBUST AND GOOD RIGHT NOW. THE
23 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE CAN STILL MAKE NOMINATIONS FOR
24 LEADERSHIP ROLES AHEAD OF THE UPCOMING MEETING MAY 20TH. SO
25 FAR ILAF AND DWAYNE ARE CANDIDATES FOR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR.



MAY 11, 2022

1 NO NOMINATIONS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] YOUR CAN DATES ALONG WITH
2 BIO CANDIDATE STATEMENT FOR YOUR NOMINATION HOWEVER ANY BIO
3 AND WRITTEN MATERIAL WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED AS A HAND OUT AT
4 THIS POINT. AND THAT'S IT FOR ME.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS OR
7 COMMENTS? RICH, I SEE YOUR HAND RAISED.

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I WAS WONDERING IF WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A
10 FORMAT THAT WE'LL BE ABLE TO ATTEND AN INTRODUCTION TO THE NEW
11 PEOPLE THAT WILL BE INTERNS.

12

13 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I THINK THAT'S A GREAT IDEAL. I WOULD
14 SUGGEST JULY 7TH, THURSDAY, IS GOING TO BE THE OPENING OF
15 INTRODUCTION. LET ME THINK THROUGH THAT ABOUT THE MECHANICS OF
16 HOW WE WOULD GET YOU ALL INTRODUCED. BUT WE -- I ALSO WANT TO
17 --

18

19 **RICH HEDGES:** FOR YEARS WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ATTEND. THERE IS
20 ONLY TWO OR THREE OF US THAT SHOW UP.

21

22 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** IN THE BACK END LATE JULY OR AUGUST WE'RE
23 GOING TO HAVE THE CAP STONE CEREMONY FOR THE STUDENTS IN-
24 PERSON AT THE METRO CENTER, PENNING PEOPLE'S PUBLIC HEALTH
25 PRECAUTIONS THAT MIGHT BE OPPORTUNITY FOR YOU TO SEE THEM AND



MAY 11, 2022

1 THE PROJECTS THEY HAVE WORKED ON. THAT MIGHT BE AN APPROPRIATE
2 PLACE. LET ME THINK THAT THROUGH. I THINK THAT'S A GREAT IDEA.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
5 COMMENTS? WAS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
8 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
9 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE SUBMITTED A BLUE SPEAKER CARD.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, ITEM NUMBER 13
12 COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS. COUNCIL MEMBERS MAY REPORT ON LOCAL
13 RELEVANT ISSUES OR EVENTS. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. RICH
14 HEDGES YOUR HAND IS UP.

15

16 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I WANT TO SAY I LOVE RIDING TRANSIT. I HAVE
17 BEEN SO SAD WITH THE PANDEMIC AND ON MAY 1ST I WAS ABLE TO
18 RIDE CALTRAIN TRANSFER TO MUNI AND GO TO THE MAY DAY PARADE.
19 IT WAS AMAZING. GOOD PEOPLE. EVERYBODY WAS IN A GOOD MOOD. I
20 LOVE TO TALK TO FOLKS. IT WAS AN AMAZING EXPERIENCE. IT WAS
21 GREAT. THERE IT WERE A LOT OF PEOPLE MARCHING FAIR BETTER LIFE
22 FOR WORKERS. AND I HAVE BEEN GOING TO A LOT OF EVENTS WITH A
23 MASK ON, BUT I HAVE TO BE CAREFUL BECAUSE MY WIFE HAS CANCER.
24 AND I HAVE BEEN VERY LUCKY. THERE HAVE BEEN PEOPLE IN THE
25 GROUP THAT DIDN'T HAVE A MASK AND LATER CAME DOWN WITH COVID.



MAY 11, 2022

1 BUT SO FAR EVERY TIME I TEST, I HAVE NEVER GOTTEN COVID. SO,
2 THANKS EVERYBODY, AND LET'S GET BACK TO TRANSIT.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VEDA AND THEN ADINA. VEDA?
5 UNMUTE YOURSELF. VEDA, WE'LL COME BACK TO YOU. ADINA?

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH, THIS IS A -- AN ANNOUNCEMENT THAT SEAMLESS
8 BAY AREA IS ORGANIZING A TRANSIT CELEBRATION ACTIVITY AROUND
9 THE CLASSIC SAN FRANCISCO BETA BREAKERS EVENT. SO, BETA
10 BREAKERS IS A SAN FRANCISCO RACE THAT YOU CAN RUN OR WALK OR
11 WHEEL FROM ONE SIDE OF SAN FRANCISCO TO ANOTHER. AND IT'S A
12 BETA BREAKERS TRADITION THAT PEOPLE DRESS UP IN COSTUMES,
13 BECAUSE IT'S SAN FRANCISCO. SO WHAT SEAMLESS BAY AREA IS DOING
14 IS ORGANIZING A COHORT OF PEOPLE DRESSING UP AS ALL 27 TRANSIT
15 AGENCIES, AND TRAVELING TOGETHER TO SYMBOLIZE THE GREAT
16 COOPERATION OF HAVING A SYSTEM THAT ALL WORKS OUT WELL
17 TOGETHER, HAPPILY, AND SO FAR WE HAVE 26 PEOPLE. AS OF THIS
18 MORNING, THERE WERE 26 PEOPLE WEARING DIFFERENT COSTUMES AND
19 WE WERE JUST SHORT ONE PERSON FOR UNION CITY. SO ANYONE IS
20 WELCOME TO COME, AND, PARTICULARLY, IF YOU ARE INTERESTED IN
21 COMING AND PARTICIPATING IN THE WALKING, RUNNING, OR ROLLING,
22 DRESSED AS UNION CITY TRANSIT, AND THEN, AFTERWARD, THERE IS A
23 -- A PICNIC BRUNCH AT GOLDEN GATE PARK. AND I WILL HAPPILY
24 SHARE INFORMATION ABOUT THIS FUN CELEBRATORY ACTIVITY THROUGH
25 STAFF AND A NUMBER OF TRANSIT AGENCIES, INCLUDING BART AND



MAY 11, 2022

1 CALTRAIN ARE PARTICIPATING, COPROMOTING AND HAVE PEOPLE OF
2 THEIR OWN TEAMS COMING ALONG. AND ARE ALSO RUNNING TRAINS
3 STARTING EARLY IN THE MORNING TO GET PEOPLE THERE ON TIME. SO
4 THAT IS MY ANNOUNCEMENT.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AWESOME. ZACK?

7

8 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** WELL I'M JUST GOING TO ENCOURAGE EVERYONE
9 TO RIDE AS A TRANSIT AGENCY. IF YOU LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO,
10 PROPOSITION A IS ON THE BALLOT THIS JUNE WHICH WOULD BE A \$400
11 MILLION GO BOND TO FUND TRANSPORTATION AND SAFER STREETS
12 INVESTMENTS IN SAN FRANCISCO. I THOUGHT PEOPLE MIGHT WANT TO
13 KNOW.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I DO NOT SEE ANY MORE HANDS
16 RAISED. VEDA, DID YOU DROP OFF? I DON'T SEE HER HAND UP. WITH
17 THAT, NEW BUSINESS. ITEM NUMBER 14. SO WE HAVE COVERED A LOT
18 TODAY. WHAT ARE WE MISSING? IS THERE ANYBODY THAT NEEDS, WANTS
19 OR WISHES WE COULD ADD SOME MORE THINGS TO OUR AGENDA AND SORT
20 THEM INTO DIFFERENT BUCKETS? THE BUCKETS ARE OPEN FOR SORTING.
21 I SEE NO HANDS GOING UP. SO, I WILL JUST ASSUME THERE IS NO
22 MORE NEED TO FILL ANY MORE BUCKETS FOR THINGS TO DO. IS THERE
23 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? OH, TERRY SCOTT?

24



MAY 11, 2022

1 **TERRY SCOTT:** MY PUBLIC COMMENT, GUESS, COULD BE PART OF THE
2 BUCKET, AS WELL, AND THAT IS I APPRECIATE THE EFFORT THEY KNOW
3 YOU HAVE MADE AND THAT STAFF HAS MADE TO SHORTEN OUR MEETINGS.
4 IT -- WE OFTEN HAVE A FAIRLY LENGTHY AGENDA, AND A NUMBER OF
5 THINGS THAT ARE OF INTEREST TO MANY OF OUR MEMBERS, BUT I
6 APPRECIATE THE EFFORT TO KEEP US ON TRACK AND TO MINIMIZE THE
7 LENGTH OF THOSE MEETINGS THAT, ALLOW MORE OF OUR MEMBERS TO
8 PARTICIPATE AND NOT PARTICIPATE IN ABSENTIA. THANK YOU.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON
11 ANY OF THOSE ITEMS?

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
14 ITEM. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
15 RAISED, AND NO ONE SUBMITTED A BLUE CARD.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO ADJOURN
18 AND I WANT TO NOTE THAT IT'S 3:34 WE ARE ONLY FOUR MINUTES
19 PAST OUR 3:30 END TIME. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY
20 ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD WEDNESDAY JUNE 8TH AT 1:30 P.M.
21 THANK YOU. AND WE WILL SEE YOU NEXT MONTH, IF NOT NEXT WEEK IF
22 THERE ARE OTHER MEETINGS. THANK YOU. HAVE A GOOD WEEKEND.

23 [ADJOURNED]

24

25

26

27



Broadcasting Government