



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION**
3 **ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE**
4 **MONDAY, JANUARY 9, 2023 1:00 PM**
5
6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING, OR GOOD AFTERNOON TO
7 EVERYONE. EVEN THOUGH IT IS NO SUN, AND BACK UP POWER FOR SOME
8 OF US, THIS MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
9 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE IS CALLED TO ORDER.
10 CAN THE BROADCASTING TEAM PLEASE PLAY THE MEETING
11 ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE
12 TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR
13 PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS
14 CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING
15 WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
16 COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME,
17 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE
18 GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST
19 AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
20 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
21 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
22 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
23 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
24 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
25 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
2 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
3 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
4 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
5 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
6 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR
7 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
8 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
9 PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
10 NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
11 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SO, WE WILL -- CAN THE CLERK PLEASE
14 CONDUCT ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM QUORUM?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. CHAIR LEVIN?

17

18 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR KALLINS?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ALAN? ABSENT. MEMBER CUSHMAN? IS
25 ABSENT. MEMBER DUTCH GROSS?



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GLASER?

5

6 **GERRY GLASER:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER GOYAL? IS ABSENT. MEMBER

9 GRIFFITHS?

10

11 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER HANKERSON? IS ABSENT. MEMBER

14 HARTMAN? IS ABSENT. MEMBER HEDGES? IS ABSENT. MEMBER LIEU?

15 MEMBER LIEU IS ABSENT. MEMBER LOPER?

16

17 **EMILY LOPER:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. MEMBER MALLON? MEMBER MALLON

20 IS ABSENT. MEMBER PETTY?

21

22 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER PIERCE? IS ABSENT. MEMBER STANKE?

25



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **BRIAN STANKE:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ALTERNATES, ELDRED. MEMBER ELDRED?

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SHE IS HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YEAH. MEMBER KASS? MEMBER SCOTT?

8

9 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM WITHOUT THE ALTERNATES.

12 THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** CAN I ASK THIS QUESTION ABOUT THE MEMBER

15 ROSTER? HAS RICH HEDGES STEPPED DOWN DUE TO HIS ROLE ON THE

16 SAN MATEO COUNCIL?

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** I WOULDN'T KNOW. KY-NAM YOU CAN ANSWER

19 THE QUESTION?

20

21 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THE SHORT ANSWERS IS THE SHORT ANSWER IS NOT

22 YET, BUT WE DO ANTICIPATE THAT HAPPENING EARLY THIS YEAR.

23



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. MOVING ON TO APPROVAL
2 OF THE OCTOBER 24TH 2024 MEETING MINUTES. IS THERE A MOTION
3 AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES?

4

5 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

6

7 **GERRY GLASER:** SECOND.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WHO WAS SECOND? GLASER?

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS
12 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM?

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO. THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENTS.

15

16 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WANT TO COMMENT
17 ON THE MEETING MINUTES?

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NOBODY HAS THEIR HAND RAISED.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. AND SO CAN THE CLERK HELP US TO
22 VOTE?

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** SURE. CHAIR LEVIN?

25



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR KALLINS?

4

5 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** BOB ALAN IS ABSENT. MEMBER CUSHMAN IS

8 ABSENT. MEMBER DEUTSCHE GROSS?

9

10 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER GLASER?

13

14 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER GOYAL IS ABSENT. MEMBER

17 GRIFFITHS?

18

19 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. MEMBER HANKERSON IS ABSENT.

22 MEMBER HARTMAN IS ABSENT. MEMBER HEDGES IS ABSENT. MEMBER LIEU

23 IS ABSENT. MEMBER LOPER?

24

25 **EMILY LOPER:** YES.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ALAN IS ABSENT. MEMBER PETTY?

3

4 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IS ABSENT.

7 MEMBER STANKE?

8

9 **BRIAN STANKE:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

12 PRESENT.

13

14 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE INTO THE

15 MAIN EVENT HERE, WHICH IS THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT

16 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION AND UPDATES ON THIS TOPIC. LOOKING

17 FORWARD TO HEARING FROM SCHRUTI HARI.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR LEVIN. THIS IS ALEX

20 BOCKELMAN, AND I'LL KICK IT OFF.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SURE.

23

24 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ALIX BOCKELMAN, DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF POLICY. YOU

25 HAVE TWO MAIN EVENTS ON YOUR AGENDA, I WANT TO MAKE SURE YOU



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 HAVE TIME FOR BOTH OF THEM TODAY. AS YOU RECALL STAFF WAS AT
2 YOUR NOVEMBER MEETING TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON THE REGIONAL
3 NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK, I THINK WE GOT SOME GOOD INPUT
4 AND CHANGES WERE MADE AND WE PRESENTED THE REGIONAL NETWORK
5 MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK TO THE FULL POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IN
6 DECEMBER. AND I KNOW SOME OF YOU, THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
7 MEMBERS WERE THERE FOR THAT. AND I THINK SEVERAL OTHERS OF YOU
8 ARE FOLLOWING, SORT OF, THE CHANGES. SO, WE'RE HERE THIS MONTH
9 TO WALK THROUGH, AT A HIGH-LEVEL, SORT OF, THE MAIN CHANGES TO
10 THE RECOMMENDATION, BUT I THINK, INCLUDING ONE OF THE MOST
11 IMPORTANT ONES IS THERE IS A RECOMMENDATION TO HAVE AN
12 ADVISORY COMMITTEE THAT WOULD SERVE AS ONE OF THE POINTS FOR
13 PROVIDING A VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER. AND OUR CURRENT
14 RECOMMENDATION WOULD HAVE THIS COMMITTEE, SORT OF, ELEVATED
15 AND, SORT OF, REFASHIONED INTO THAT. SO, WE THOUGHT, FOR SURE,
16 SINCE YOU'RE, SORT OF, IMPLICATED IN THE RECOMMENDATION THAT
17 WE WANTED TO COME BACK AND MAKE SURE YOU WERE AWARE OF THAT
18 AND GET ANY ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK AND INPUT. WITH THAT, I WANT
19 TO TURN IT OVER TO SCHRUTI. BUT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE YOU HAVE
20 TIME TO TALK ABOUT MAPPING AND WAYFINDING AS WELL.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS A TYPO IN THE
23 TALKING PAPER. SO, I'M ASSUMING -- IT SAYS AGENDA ITEM FOUR
24 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT SCHEDULE EVALUATION, AND FIVE
25 BEING NEW BUSINESS. BUT I THINK THERE IS SOMETHING MISSING IN



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 BETWEEN THERE. AND WE'LL JUST BRING US ON TO MAPPING AND
2 WAYFINDING AFTER THIS ASSUMING IT IS STILL ON THE AGENDA.

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THAT'S CERTAINLY MY UNDERSTANDING THAT IT IS.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY GREAT. THEN I WILL JUST MOVE ON WITH
7 OUR UNDERSTANDING THAT THAT WAS A TYPO. GREAT. MOVING FORWARD
8 TO THE PRESENTATION.

9

10 **SHRUTI HARI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR LEVIN
11 AND VICE CHAIR KALLINS AND T-TAP MEMBERS. SHRUTI HARI HERE. WE
12 CAME TO YOU WITH THE FRAMEWORK RECOMMENDATIONS. TODAY,
13 APOLOGIZE IF IT'S REPETITIVE FOR SOME OF YOU, BUT I'LL GO
14 THROUGH A QUICK PRESENTATION RECAP PRESENTING SOME OF THESE
15 RNM FRAMEWORK RECOMMENDATIONS. IF WE COULD BRING UP THE SLIDE
16 DECK, PLEASE? AND IF WE COULD MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE? THANK
17 YOU. SO IN TERMS OF A QUICK BACKGROUND, THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
18 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION, IS A PROJECT THAT WAS RECOMMENDED BY
19 THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE AS WELL AS THE
20 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IN 2021 AS THEY WERE
21 IDENTIFYING ACTIONS TO RESHAPE THE REGION'S TRANSIT SYSTEM
22 INTO A CONNECTED EFFICIENT AND USABLE NETWORK ACROSS THE
23 REGION. ACCORDINGLY MTC ESTABLISHED THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
24 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION PROJECT AND THE FOCUS AND GOAL OF THE
25 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION WAS CENTERED ON OUTLINING A PREFERRED



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT, OR RNM, WHICH I'LL REFER TO IT
2 AS, FRAMEWORK TO ACHIEVE A CUSTOMER FOCUSED REGIONAL TRANSIT
3 SYSTEM. THAT WAS THE GOAL. IF YOU COULD MOVE ON TO THE NEXT
4 SLIDE PLEASE. SO TO SUPPORT THIS ASSESSMENT, THE RNM
5 ASSESSMENT AND ENSURE THESE STAKEHOLDERS WERE INVOLVED IN THE
6 PROCESS, MTC ESTABLISHED A 14 MEMBER NETWORK MANAGEMENT
7 ADVISORY GROUP TO REVIEW THE ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS AND
8 PROVIDE GUIDANCE. THIS ADVISORY GROUP INCLUDED SEVEN TRANSIT
9 AGENCY REPS AND SEVEN STAKEHOLDER REPS AND WAS EVENTUALLY
10 CONSTRUCTED TO HELP PROVIDE THAT WIDE RANGE OF PERSPECTIVES
11 AND REPORTS FROM THE VARIOUS GROUPS. THE ADVISORY GROUP MET
12 EIGHT TIMES FROM JANUARY THROUGH DECEMBER OF LAST YEAR AND WAS
13 HIGHLY INVOLVED IN THE FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE PUT
14 FORWARD TO THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
15 COMMISSION. WE WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE EFFORTS. IF YOU COULD
16 MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, I JUST WANTED TO START
17 WITH A QUICK RECAP OF THE BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION APPROACH.
18 THE COMPLETION OF THIS PROCESS WAS A FIVE STEP PROCESS THAT
19 STARTED WITH REFINING THE FOCUS THIS PROJECT TO SIX FUNCTIONAL
20 AREAS, AND BUILD AN RNM FRAMEWORK THAT IMPROVES THE DELIVERY
21 OF THOSE FUNCTIONS. THIS METHODOLOGY HELPED BUILDING THE RNM
22 FRAMEWORK ESSENTIALLY FROM THE GROUND UP FIRST WAS TO
23 ESTABLISH THE FRAMEWORK UNDER WHICH THE SIX FUNCTIONAL AREAS
24 WOULD BE EVALUATED AND INCLUDED ESTABLISHING KEY GUIDING
25 PRINCIPLES FOR WHAT ACTIVITIES SHOULD BE COMPLETED REGIONALLY,



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 OR LOCALLY, AND THAT WAS VERY IMPORTANT TO DO AT THE OUTSET
2 TO, SORT OF, DETERMINE WHAT WOULD FALL UNDER THE PURVIEW OF
3 THE RNM. NOW, UNDER THE -- USING THE OPERATING MODEL FRAMEWORK
4 THAT WAS ESTABLISHED IN THE SECOND STEP AS WELL AS THOSE
5 GUIDING PRINCIPLES THE NEXT STEPS WAS HOW EACH FUNCTIONAL
6 AREAS WORK TODAY IN THE CURRENT STATE AND AS WELL AS
7 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR HOW IT COULD WORK IN THE FUTURE STATE, AND
8 ACTIVITIES COMPLETED REGIONALLY VERSUS LOCALLY AS MENTIONED.
9 THE CONSULTANT TEAM'S GOAL WAS TO IDENTIFY GAPS IN THE SIX
10 FUNCTIONAL AREAS AND LEADING BEST PRACTICES THAT HELPED THEM
11 DETERMINE WHERE SHIFTS COULD BE BENEFICIAL FOR EACH FUNCTION,
12 EACH FUNCTIONAL AREA AND FINDINGS WERE RECONCILED ACROSS THE
13 SIX AREAS AND TESTED ACROSS SOME OF THE OTHER FUNCTIONAL AREAS
14 IN THE OVERALL MODEL FOR THE RNM AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM HAS A
15 FINAL PROPOSED REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK
16 RECOMMENDATION THAT WILL BE PRESENTED TO THE MTC COMMISSION
17 FOR ACTION IN FEBRUARY. IF YOU DON'T MIND JUMP TO SLIDE SIX SO
18 WE CAN PROCEED SYSTEMATICALLY, AND I'LL COME BACK TO SLIDE
19 FIVE. SORRY. I MEANT, IF YOU COULD -- I THINK, YEAH, THAT WAS
20 RIGHT. SO, AS WE DISCUSSED ON THE METHODOLOGY, WE DISCUSSED
21 THE EXAMINATION OF THE SIX FUNCTIONAL AREAS AND WHERE SHIFTS
22 AND ACCOUNTABILITIES WOULD NEED TO HAPPEN FOR THE SIX
23 FUNCTIONALITY AREAS. THE CONSULTANT TEAM LOOKED AT WHAT COULD
24 HAPPEN FROM THE REGIONAL APPROACH AS THEY DUG INTO DETAILS OF
25 ACTIONS COMPLETED AT REGIONAL AND LOCALLY, THEY USED THE



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 PRINCIPLES ON THE SLIDE ASKING QUESTIONS WOULD REGIONALIZING
2 THIS ACTIVITY IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE WOULD
3 REGIONALIZING IT LOCALLY BE FEASIBLE. AND BASED ON ALL OF THIS
4 AND EXTREMELY ROBUST REVIEW WERE DONE AND FROM THAT WORK
5 ACROSS THE SIX FUNCTIONAL AREAS KEY TAKEAWAYS ON REGIONAL AND
6 LOCAL ROLE EMERGED ESSENTIALLY BOILING IT DOWN TO A VERY HIGH-
7 LEVEL, THE CONSULTANT TEAM BASED ON ANALYSIS SUGGESTED THAT
8 THE REGIONAL ROLE WOULD BE BEST AROUND SETTING THE VISION,
9 MAKING SELECT FUNDING DECISIONS DEVELOPING REGIONAL POLICIES
10 CREATING IMPLEMENTATION PLANS AND ON THE OPERATOR SIDE, WHILE
11 OPERATORS WOULD BE HIGHLY INVOLVED IN REGIONAL DECISION-
12 MAKING, THEY WOULD PROVIDE THE LOCAL STAKEHOLDER PERSPECTIVE
13 AND NEEDS AND WORK ON IMPLEMENTING THESE REGIONAL POLICIES.
14 THE CONSULTANT TEAM DESIGNED THE RNM FRAMEWORK TO FACILITATE
15 THE EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT INTERPLAY BETWEEN THE ROLES AND
16 REGIONAL LOCAL ROLES ON THE SIX FUNCTIONAL AREAS. GOING BACK
17 TO SLIDE FIVE, STARTING WITH THE NEXT FEW SLIDES I'LL WALK
18 THROUGH THE ACTUAL RNM FRAMEWORK RECOMMENDATIONS NOW. STARTING
19 WITH THE VISION STATEMENT, TWO OF THE KEY OVERARCHING ELEMENTS
20 THAT DEFINE THE RNM. MISSION OR CORE PURPOSE OF THE RNM IS TO
21 DRIVE TRANSFORMATIVE IMPROVEMENTS IN THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE
22 FOR THE REGIONAL BAY AREA TRANSIT AND THE VISION WOULD BE TO
23 ADVANCE REGIONAL GOALS AND EQUITY, LIVEABILITY, CLIMATE, AND
24 RESILIENCY THROUGH THE UNIFIED TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT SERVES ALL
25 OF THE BAY AREA POPULATIONS. AND NOW, IF WE COULD MOVE ON TO



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 SLIDE NUMBER SEVEN AS WE GO FURTHER ALONG THE RNM FRAMEWORK
2 RECOMMENDATIONS. SO, THE IN DEPTH FUNCTIONAL AREA ANALYSIS
3 CONSULTANT TEAM CONDUCTED REVIEWED CROSS CUTTING CHALLENGES
4 AND THEY MODELED THE RNM FRAMEWORK TO ADDRESS SOME OF THESE
5 CHALLENGES AND IN A NUTSHELL, TO ADDRESS THESE CHALLENGES THE
6 RNM WOULD NEED THREE KEY ELEMENTS ONE IS A VISIONING ELEMENT
7 AND THIS WOULD BE A REALLY IMPORTANT ROLE WHICH WOULD BE
8 RESPONSIBLE FOR SETTING STRATEGIC VISION FOR TRANSIT, THINKING
9 ABOUT CUSTOMER OUTCOMES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY AND POLICIES AND
10 PRIORITIES, AND IMPROVING POLICIES AND FUNDING TO MAKE THOSE
11 REAL. SECOND WOULD BE A STEERING ELEMENT RESPONSIBLE FOR
12 DEVELOPING OR REACHING CONSENSUS ON POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
13 BASED ON THE REGIONAL VISION SET BY THE VISIONS ELEMENT THE
14 DEVELOPMENT POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS REACH CONSENSUS ON GUIDING
15 ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATIONAL ELEMENT IN TERMS OF EXECUTING TERMS
16 ESTABLISHED BY THE VISIONING ELEMENT AND DEFINING PERFORMANCE
17 METRICS. AND THE ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATION, THIRD PIECE IS
18 WHERE STAFF COMES IN, ESSENTIALLY IN TERMS OF MAKING THIS
19 WORK, IT WOULD BE IMPORTANT TO HAVE A STAFF OR THEME THAT
20 COULD EXECUTE OR IMPLEMENT THE WORK OF THE NM. WHAT YOU SEE ON
21 THE RIGHT, THREE KEY ELEMENTS AS PROPOSED BY THE CONSULTANT
22 TEAM ON THE RIGHT IS WHAT'S BEING RECOMMENDED IN TERMS OF THE
23 WHO WOULD ADDRESS THESE THREE ELEMENTS. THE REGIONAL VISIONS
24 ELEMENT COMPRISED OF THE MTC RNM COMMITTEE HELPING SET THE
25 REGIONAL VISION FOR TRANSIT AND DRIVE THE DIRECTION OF THE RNM



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 AS WELL AS THE VOICE OF THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE A GROUP OF
2 STAKEHOLDERS AND CUSTOMERS THAT CAN HELP INFORM DECISION-
3 MAKING. STEERING ELEMENT COMPRISED OF RNM COUNCIL A
4 COMBINATION OF GM LEVEL OPERATOR AND MTC REPRESENTATIVE WHO
5 WILL UNDERSTAND TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND MAKE CRITICAL DECISIONS
6 WHILE PROVIDING KEY LEADERSHIP, AND ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATIONAL
7 ELEMENT COMPRISED OF DEDICATED RNM STAFF AND SUPPORT STAFF
8 THAT WILL HELP SUPPORT THE DAY-TO-DAY OPERATIONS OF THE RNM
9 AND PROVIDING CRITICAL CAPACITY AS WELL AS TASK FORCE
10 SUBCOMMITTEES THAT WILL NEED TO BE ESTABLISHED AS NEEDED TO
11 SUPPORT THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT
12 SLIDE. THIS SLIDE IS INTENDED TO BE A VISUAL REPRESENTATION OF
13 THE THREE ELEMENTS THAT WE WENT THROUGH ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE
14 MADE UP OF THE MTC AND COMMITTEES. WITH DEDICATED RNM SUPPORT
15 AND OPERATIONAL ELEMENT. THE THREE CHECKMARKS ON THE RIGHT,
16 DESIGN PRINCIPLES AROUND CUSTOMER FOCUS, STRUCTURED FOR SCALE
17 AND SHORT-TERM MOMENTUM WITH LONG TERM TRANSFORMATION. OVER
18 THE NEXT COUPLE OF SLIDES I'LL WALK THROUGH THE COMPONENTS OF
19 THE STRUCTURE. IF YOU COULD MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
20 THIS SLIDE IS INTENDED TO SHOW DETAIL ON THE STRUCTURE OF THE
21 MTC RNM COMMITTEE. AND THIS COMMITTEE STRUCTURE IS SIMILAR TO
22 HOW MTC OPERATES TODAY. AS MTC HAS SIMILAR EXISTING COMMITTEES
23 AND IT'S NOT INTENDED TO BE AN EXTRA LAIR LAYER BUT A FOCUSED
24 GROUP OF MEMBERS FROM MTC TO DRIVE PROGRESS TOWARDS REGIONAL
25 GOALS AND THE EIGHT SEATS FOR COMMISSION MEMBERS, TWO NON-



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 VOTING SEATS FOR TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS AND ONE NON-
2 VOTING SEAT FOR THE STATE APPOINTMENT. COMMITTEE WOULD BE
3 GEOGRAPHICALLY DIVERSE AND REPRESENTATIVE OF THE CUSTOMER BASE
4 AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO ENSURE THAT TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS
5 ARE REPRESENTED AND HAVE A VOICE ON THE COMMITTEE AND THAT
6 THIS IS BALANCED WITH A NEED TO ENSURE THAT MTC COMMISSIONERS
7 SET THE DIRECTION IN TERMS OF THE FORMAL REGIONAL DECISION-
8 MAKING. AND A STATE APPOINTEE BRINGS KEY INTERESTS TO THE
9 TABLE SUCH AS THOSE THAT ARE BEING WORKED ON UNDER THE BUS
10 TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECT, FOR EXAMPLE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO
11 THIS SLIDE IS INTENDED TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL DETAIL ON THE
12 PROPOSED STRUCTURE FOR THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY
13 COMMITTEE AND THE PROPOSAL IS EFFECTIVELY TO REPURPOSE THE
14 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND THE COMMITTEE POTENTIAL
15 REFINEMENT TO MEMBER AS NECESSARY TO BETTER SUPPORT THE
16 MISSION AND VISION OF THE RNM. THIS COMMITTEE THE VOICE OF THE
17 ADVISORY COMMITTEE WOULD INCLUDE EIGHT TO FINE MEMBERS EACH
18 FROM MTC'S POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND OTHER NON-COUNCIL
19 STAKEHOLDER REPS TO REPRESENT THAT BROAD RANGE OF INTEREST.
20 AND AS SHOWN IN THE PRIOR SLIDE, THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
21 ADVISORY COMMITTEE WOULD PROVIDE INPUT DIRECTLY TO THE POLICY
22 COMMITTEE OF MTC WHICH IS THE RNM COMMITTEE VISIONING ELEMENT
23 ON THE TOP. NEXT SLIDE. WHILE THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
24 ADVISORY COMMITTEE IS A CRITICAL COMPONENT FOR PUTTING
25 CUSTOMERS AT THE FOREFRONT OF THE DECISION-MAKING THE SHORT OR



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 NEAR-TERM RNM FRAMEWORK WAS INTENTIONALLY STRUCTURED BASED ON
2 FEEDBACK FROM THIS GROUP AND THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THIS
3 FRAMEWORK WAS STRUCTURED TO INCLUDE MULTIPLE ENGAGEMENT POINTS
4 FOR THE CUSTOMER INTENDED TO MESH THAT THE VOICE OF THE
5 CUSTOMER ALSO FLOWS THROUGH IN THE FORM OF DATA AND ANALYTICS
6 WHICH WAS A VERY GOOD POINT BROUGHT UP BY THIS GROUP LAST TIME
7 I PRESENTED. SO, NOW, OUTSIDE OF THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE, THESE
8 ENGAGEMENT POINTS THAT ARE SHOWN ON THIS SLIDE INCLUDE THE MTC
9 RNM COMMITTEE, WHICH WILL BRING KEY CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVES FROM
10 CONSTITUENTS AND RECEIVE CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVES FROM THE RNM
11 AND DEDICATED SUPPORT STAFF FOCUSED ON BRINGING BOTH
12 QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE INSIGHTS THAT
13 MAY SUPPORT STAFF MEMBERS AND OTHER ANALYSIS CONDUCTED FOR THE
14 CUSTOMER SURVEYS AND DATA ANALYTICS. THE LEVERAGING OF DATA
15 AND ANALYTICS DEDICATED RNM SUPPORT STAFF AS WELL ASIDE DATA
16 AND ANALYTICS THAT EACH OF THE INDIVIDUAL AGENCY COULD BRING
17 TO THE TABLE AND TASK FORCE SUBCOMMITTEE WOULD BE COMPRISED
18 FOR DIVERSE GROUP OF STAKEHOLDERS, OPERATOR, SUBJECT MATTER
19 EXPERTS ADVOCATES EACH BRINGING CUSTOMER EXPERTISE
20 PERSPECTIVES FOR THOSE RESPECTIVE FOCUS AREAS. IF YOU COULD
21 MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THAT WAS ON THE SHORT-
22 TERM FRAMEWORK. AND WE ALSO RECOGNIZE THAT THIS CURRENT
23 PROPOSED NEAR-TERM FRAMEWORK HAS SHORTCOMINGS THAT WOULD NEED
24 TO BE ADDRESSED OVER TIME. THIS IS THE SHORT-TERM FRAMEWORK IS
25 SOMETHING BEING DONE UNDER EXISTING LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITIES



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 AND FUNDING. EVOLUTION TOWARDS LONG-TERM IS CLEARLY IN MIND
2 THAT'S WHAT THIS SLIDE IS SHOWING. AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM
3 RECOMMENDED USING THIS OPERATING MODEL FRAMEWORK TO OUTLINE A
4 SET OF INITIATIVES AS YOU CAN SEE IN THOSE STEPS THAT ALLOW
5 THE REGION TO HEAD TOWARDS AND THINK ABOUT THE LONGER TERM
6 FRAMEWORK. SO ONCE WE HAVE THIS NEAR-TERM FRAMEWORK IN PLACE,
7 WE CAN CONTINUE TO ESTABLISH LEADERSHIP AND SCALE ROLES AROUND
8 THAT. WE CAN START TO THINK MORE ABOUT EXPANDING AND USING
9 TOOLS TOWARDS GETTING TO OUTCOMES. MORE ABOUT FRAMEWORK ON THE
10 GROUND AND FEEDBACK THAT WE RECEIVE FROM THE ADVISORY GROUP AS
11 WELL, IS IT WOULD BE REALLY IMPORTANT TO HAVE PERFORMANCE
12 METRICS TO KNOW WE HAVE ACHIEVED THESE OUTCOMES OR ARE
13 ACHIEVING THESE OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT AND, YOU KNOW, IF THERE
14 ARE ANY THINGS IN THE EVOLUTION OF THE FRAMEWORK THAT WOULD
15 HELP US GET THERE. SO THAT, I DID WANT TO NOTE THAT WE ALSO
16 UNDERSTAND THE CRITICALITY OF THE FINDING WHAT WE WANT THE RNM
17 TO ACHIEVE AND HOW TO MEASURE THE PROGRESS OF THE RNM. SO THAT
18 COULD BE DONE BY ESTABLISHING THESE KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
19 KPI ADDING INCEPTION OR CREATION TO TRACK THE PERFORMANCE.
20 THINKING ABOUT KPIS IN TWO FORMS, PRIMARILY BENEFIT KPIS WHICH
21 MEASURE OUTCOMES, SO ESSENTIALLY IS THE RNM ACHIEVING THE
22 OUTCOMES OR BENEFIT WE SET OUT TO ACHIEVE AND THE KPIS WHICH
23 MEASURE THE STRUCTURE ITSELF PERFORMANCE AND FUNCTION. THAT'S
24 HOW WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THE EVOLUTION AS WELL AS THE
25 EVALUATION OF THE PERFORMANCE. AND THESE KPIS, OF COURSE --



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 THE KPIS THEMSELVES WOULD NEED TO BE REVIEWED AND UPDATED AND
2 REVIEW IS DONE BY MTC. SO A COUPLE OF YEARS DOWN THE LINE THE
3 KPIS MIGHT CHANGE DEPENDING ON THE EVOLUTION OF THE FRAMEWORK.
4 SO THE FRAMEWORK WILL CONTINUE TO SERVE AS A FRAMEWORK FOR
5 EVOLUTION OF WHAT'S LONG-TERM AND CONTRIBUTE TO IMPROVEMENT,
6 REVIEWS BY MTC AND KPI TRACKING IN A NUTSHELL. IF YOU COULD
7 MOVE TO THE FINAL SLIDE, PLEASE. IN THE IMMEDIATE TERM THERE
8 ARE SEVERAL KEY MILESTONES COMING UP. SO WE DID PRESENT, AS I
9 MENTIONED, THIS RECOMMENDATION WAS PRESENTED TO THE ADVISORY
10 GROUP IN DECEMBER AND WE DID RECEIVE A LOT OF SUPPORT FOR THIS
11 PROPOSAL. THIS WEEK, ON THURSDAY, WE WILL BE PRESENTING TO THE
12 LARGE AND SMALL OPERATOR BOARD MEMBERS. WE WILL ALSO PRESENT
13 TO THE MTC EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE JANUARY 13TH AND TO THE FULL
14 MTC COMMISSION FOR FEEDBACK AND REVIEW ON JANUARY 25TH. NOTE
15 THE PROPOSED FRAMEWORK AND FULL REPORT WILL BE PRESENTED TO
16 THE FULL MTC COMMISSION IN FEBRUARY FOR ACTION. IN JANUARY IS
17 FOR REVIEW AND FEEDBACK AND FEBRUARY FOR THE ACTUAL.
18 SEQUENTIAL WE'RE HOPING THAT STAFF CAN IMPLEMENT THE RNM
19 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR LAUNCH IN THE SPRING WHICH HAVE COURSE
20 THE TIMING IS SUBJECT TO THE START OF THE NEW MTC EXECUTIVE
21 DIRECTOR. SO WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO CLOSE AND MAYBE JUST
22 LEAVE THIS -- THE ESSENTIAL OF THE FRAMEWORK THAT WE HAVE
23 DISCUSSED TODAY IS ESSENTIALLY A SIGNIFICANT STEP TOWARDS THE
24 INTEGRATED CUSTOMER FOCUSED TRANSIT SYSTEM. BUT IMPORTANTLY,
25 IT PROVIDES A DEDICATED FORUM AND STAFF RESOURCING TO ADDRESS



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 REGIONAL TRANSIT AND IT ALSO HARNESSSES EXPERTISE AND
2 FORMALIZES COORDINATION OF THE TRANSIT GENERAL MANAGERS. AND
3 EVEN MORE IMPORTANTLY ELEVATES THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER WHICH
4 IS IMPORTANT THROUGH THE FRAMEWORK AND PROVIDE FLEXIBILITY TO
5 EVOLVE AND STRENGTHEN OVER TIME. WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO --
6 I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS OR FEEDBACK.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SO, I'M STARTING TO SEE HANDS FROM GROUP
9 MEMBERS. I SEE THAT RICH HEDGES HAS A HAND.

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** MAY I GO?

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YEP.

14

15 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. SO, FIRST LET ME SAY, I ACTUALLY
16 LIKE THE ORGANIZATION OF THE RNM COMMITTEE. BASED ON MY
17 EXPERIENCE LONG AGO ON TRYING TO GET A TRANSLINK CARD AND ALL
18 OF THE AGENCIES, SORT OF, DUBIOUS ABOUT IT AND I THINK NEVER
19 REALLY -- BART IMPLEMENTED IT AND THAT WAS IT. SO THEN WE GOT
20 THE CLIPPER CARD AFTER THAT. SO IT ACTUAL LOOKS LIKE THE
21 TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL BE AN ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND NOT A
22 DECISION-MAKING CAPACITY FOR THE RNM MANAGEMENT GROUP. SO, I
23 THINK THAT'S GREAT. IT REALLY DEPENDS ON HOW MUCH POWER
24 INVOLVES FROM THIS AND HOW WILLING THE OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 ARE TO FOLLOW THEIR RECOMMENDATIONS. WE'LL WAIT AND SEE HOW IT
2 WORKS, BUT I'M HOPEFUL. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GERRY GLASER?

5

6 **GERRY GLASER:** A COUPLE OF THINGS. NEXT, A PRESENTATION. THIS
7 IS TAKING US A LONG WAYS TOWARDS GETTING RID OF THE CONFUSION
8 THAT INVOLVES THOSE THAT DON'T USE TRANSIT THAT MUCH. ON SLIDE
9 FIVE, YOU HAVE THE WORD "UNIFIED" AND "REGIONAL" -- UNIFIED IS
10 REALLY IMPORTANT, IF YOU COULD MOVE THE WORD NEXT TO REGIONAL
11 IT WOULD HELP A LOT. AND WHEN I GOT TO SLIDE SIX, THE TERM
12 AFFORDABILITY. IT'S A GOOD TERM BUT IT NEEDS A DEFINITION. AND
13 I DON'T KNOW HOW TO DO IT FOR SURE YET BUT WITH THE DEFINITION
14 TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT, WE NEED TO DEFINE AFFORDABILITY AND
15 CONTRAST GETTING INTO THE CAR AND DRIVING YOURSELF AND SOME
16 HOW FIND A DEFINITION THAT WORKS TO ONE OF OUR KPIS. HAVE A
17 DEFINITION THAT STATISTICALLY THE COST TO DRIVE WOULD BE THIS,
18 BUT I TOOK TRANSIT, IT'S GOING TO BE THAT. THANKS. GOOD SET.
19 THANKS.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. IAN GRIFFITHS?

22

23 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** HI. I HAVE ONE QUESTION, AND MAYBE 2 TO 3
24 COMMENTS. SO, MY QUESTION IS, WHEN ARE -- ARE WE GOING TO
25 RECEIVE THE FINAL -- YOU KNOW, THERE IS A LOT OF ANALYSIS, AND



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 I AM NOT AWARE -- THIS IS A COMMITTEE REPORT THAT CAN BE
2 REVIEWED TALKING ABOUT ALL OF THE -- YOU KNOW, THE ASSESSMENT
3 THAT WAS DONE, AS TO WHICH FUNCTIONS SHOULD BE REGIONAL VERSUS
4 LOCAL, WHEN WOULD THAT BE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW BY US OR ANYONE
5 ELSE?

6

7 **SHRUTI HARI:** THAT CAN BE AVAILABLE TOWARDS THE END OF FEB. IS
8 HOW I'M THINKING IT. THERE IS A DRAFT DOCUMENT RIGHT NOW BASED
9 ON FRAMEWORK BUILDING, WE JUST NEED TO CLEAN THAT UP AND PUT
10 IT OUT.

11

12 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** OKAY. SO THAT WOULD BE AFTER THE RECOMMENDATION
13 HAS ALREADY BEEN ENDORSED BY THE COMMISSION?

14

15 **SHRUTI HARI:** CORRECT. RIGHT NOW ON THE ANALYSIS IS AVAILABLE
16 IF YOU WANT TO TAKE A LOOK AT IT, BUT I HAVE NOT LOOKED AT IT
17 IN THE LAST MONTH OR SO, SO I WOULD HAVE TO GO BACK TO THE
18 CONSULTANT TEAM, AND I CAN GET BACK TO A RESPONSE ON THAT.

19

20 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I WOULD APPRECIATE THE CHANCE TO DIVE DEEPER AS
21 THIS COMES TO VARIOUS COMMISSIONS FOR DISCUSSION. YEAH, MY
22 COMMENTS ARE, ONE IS -- AND THE VISION STATEMENT, THERE IS A
23 SLIDE THAT YOU HAD THE MISSION STATEMENT AND THE VISION
24 STATEMENT. THEY WERE VERY SIMILAR TO ME, AND I ACTUALLY THINK
25 THEY WERE BOTH MISSION STATEMENTS AND NOT REALLY A VISION



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 STATEMENT. I THINK THE VISION STATEMENT, TO ME, THE DIFFERENCE
2 BETWEEN A VISION STATEMENT AND MISSION STATEMENT IS MORE
3 FOCUSED ON WHAT IS MORE DESCRIBING THE BODY AND THE PROCESS,
4 THE VISION IS, LIKE, THE OUTCOME THAT YOU WANT TO GET TO, AND
5 TO ME, THE VISION STATEMENT IS TO ADVANCE LIVEABILITY, EQUITY,
6 AND RESILIENCY, AND I THINK THAT'S ADVANCING TO THE OUTCOME WE
7 WANT TO GET, TO THE VISION. THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE ADOPTED
8 A MUCH MORE OUTCOME ORIENTED VISION OF TRANSFORMATION, AND YOU
9 KNOW, DESIGN, INVESTMENT, EQUITABLE, FREQUENT, AFFORDABLE,
10 RELIABLE WITH INTEGRATED SERVICE AND FARES. TO ME THAT OUTCOME
11 BASED VISION SHOULD BE ASSOCIATED WITH THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
12 FRAMEWORK. MY SECOND COMMENT IS THIS BODY AND, I THINK,
13 ULTIMATELY THE POLICY ADVISORY GROUP ADOPTED A STATEMENT A FEW
14 MEETINGS AGO THAT I THINK IT ULTIMATELY WAS ABOUT THE POLICY
15 ADVISORY GROUP THE STATEMENT NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE
16 SHOULD PRIORITIZE MOVEMENT TOWARDS THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
17 STRUCTURE FOR THE BAY AREA THAT ESTABLISHES ONE ACCOUNTABLE
18 BODY FOR THE PUBLIC FOR PERFORMANCE CONNECTIVITY ACCESSIBILITY
19 AND USER EXPERIENCE IN THE BAY AREA TRANSIT. STATED THAT AS A
20 GROUP AT LEAST POLICY GROUP TO ME THAT IS AN INCREMENTAL STEP
21 TOWARDS THE NEAR-TERM PLAN. I AM VERY INTERESTED IN WHAT IS
22 THE LONG-TERM PLAN, AND I'LL JUST -- MY FINAL COMMENT IS,
23 REALLY, THAT THE WAY IN WHICH WE THAT'S BEEN DESCRIBED THAT
24 WE'RE GOING TO GET TO THAT LONG-TERM APPROACH THAT WE'RE GOING
25 TO ASSESS HOW IT'S WORKING EVERY TWO YEARS, AND THAT WILL,



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 SORT OF, NATURALLY EVOLVE TOWARDS, AND EVOLVE TOWARD A LONG-
2 TERM PLAN, I THINK WE NEED TO SEE HOW IT GOES, BUT WE ALSO
3 NEED TO BE VERY PROACTIVE. WE HAVE 50 YEARS OF ON THE GROUND
4 EXPERIENCE OF HOW COORDINATION HAS WORKED AND IF WE'RE GOING
5 TO LEARN LESSON FROM THIS NEW STRUCTURE, WE HAVE THE ABILITY
6 AND THERE IS AN URGENCY TO BE PROACTIVE ABOUT THAT AND THERE
7 IS A PROACTIVE STRUCTURE THAT DOES CREATE THAT ACCOUNTABILITY
8 AND LEARNS FROM A LOT OF THE RESEARCH THAT WAS ORIGINALLY PART
9 OF THE ORIGINAL SCOPE OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE
10 THAT GOT REMOVED. I THINK WE NEED TO SEE A MORE PROACTIVE
11 APPROACH TO THINKING ABOUT THE LONG-TERM STRUCTURE WHILE WE
12 GET INPUT AND LESSONS FROM THE INTERIM STRUCTURE WE'RE PUTTING
13 IN PLACE AND A BODY REASON FOR DOING THAT IS WE'RE TALKING
14 ABOUT HAVING A REGIONAL MEASURE WITHIN THE NEXT TWO YEARS IT'S
15 IMPORTANT WE GOVERN A LONG-TERM GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE TO BE
16 ABLE TO CONNECT WITH THE FUNDING MEASURE THAT WE MIGHT BE
17 TAKING TO THE VOTERS, BUT IT'S FULLY THROUGH LONG-TERM
18 STRUCTURE THAT WE'LL NEED TO IMPLEMENT BUT WE'LL HAVE TO
19 ANSWER TO THAT QUESTION WHEN IT COMES TIME TO PUT SOMETHING
20 INTO EFFECT.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** WENDI?

23

24 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** THE CITIZEN'S ADVISORY COUNCIL IS
25 ESSENTIALLY FOCUSED ON POLICY, AND THAT'S AS IT SHOULD BE.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 BUT, I ALSO THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE SOME KIND OF A FEEDBACK
2 LOOP FOR THE CUSTOMER FEEDBACK OF OPERATIONS ITSELF. BECAUSE
3 OFTEN TIMES IF OPERATIONS ARE NOT WORKING FOR THE CUSTOMER,
4 THERE NEEDS TO BE SOME KIND OF A MECHANISM SO THAT THERE CAN
5 BE SOME FEEDBACK THERE. SO I'M CURIOUS TO KNOW IF YOU HAVE ANY
6 THOUGHTS ABOUT HOW THAT MIGHT BE ABLE TO FUNCTION?

7

8 **SHRUTI HARI:** SURE. SO, I MEAN, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT -- OH
9 SORRY -- CAN YOU HEAR ME?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

12

13 **SHRUTI HARI:** ONE OF THE SLIDES WHERE WE TALKED ABOUT THE
14 ENGAGEMENT POINTS FOR THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER, VICE CHAIR
15 KALLINS WAS ESSENTIALLY SHOWING THAT, WAS HOW THE VOICE OF THE
16 CUSTOMER FLOWS INTO THOSE VARIOUS ENGAGEMENT POINTS, AND I
17 THINK VERY IMPORTANTLY, WHICH I THINK WAS AROUND THE FEEDBACK
18 THAT CAME FROM THIS GROUP IS THE DEDICATED STAFF MEMBER AROUND
19 THE ADMINISTRATIVE OF THE OPERATIONAL ELEMENT THAT WOULD BE
20 FOCUSED ON BRINGING THAT QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE CUSTOMER
21 EXPERIENCE INSIGHTS THAT COULD BE THE DATA ANALYTICS, THE
22 CUSTOMER SURVEYS, AND JOURNEY MAPPING THAT YOU SUGGESTED.
23 HOPEFULLY THAT CAN BE A REGULAR THING AND THAT, SORT OF,
24 INFORMATION CAN BE BROUGHT INTO THE RNM ON A REGULAR BASIS TO



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 BE ABLE TO DETERMINE IF THINGS ARE WORKING WELL AND WHERE
2 IMPROVEMENTS NEED TO BE MADE.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** OKAY. THANKS.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** BRIAN STANKE?

7

8 **BRIAN STANKE:** THANK YOU. I HAD A FEW QUESTIONS. LOOKING AT
9 THIS STRUCTURE, THE PROPOSED VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
10 SUBCOMMITTEE IS REPORTING TO THE MTC RNM COMMITTEE, WHICH IS
11 THEN CONNECTED. BUT I DON'T SEE HOW IT CONNECTS WITH THE
12 ACTUAL DEDICATED REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER SUPPORT STAFF. IT
13 SEEMS LIKE AN INDIRECT THREE WAY, THROUGH THE MTC REGIONAL
14 COMMITTEE AND THEN THE RNM COUNCIL, AND THEN THE ACTUAL RNM
15 STAFF. IS THAT KIND OF THE THREE-HOP FLOW I'M SEEING BETWEEN
16 THE CUSTOMER AND IMPLEMENTATION?

17

18 **SHRUTI HARI:** YEAH. SO, IF I MAY, SO THE STRATEGIC VISION IS
19 WHAT'S SET BY THE VISIONING ELEMENT. SO THAT'S WHAT DETERMINES
20 THE OUTCOMES AND DETERMINES WHICH INITIATIVES WE WILL NEED TO
21 START WORKING ON. AND A LOT OF IT WILL BE BASED ON THE INITIAL
22 INPUT THAT WE RECEIVE FROM THIS GROUP. SO THIS IS A STRUCTURE
23 THAT ESSENTIALLY, HOW DO I PUT IT? THESE ARE SHARED ROLES AND
24 RESPONSIBILITIES. FOR EXAMPLE, EVEN IF POLICIES SET INITIALLY
25 AT THE HIGHEST LEVEL, THE OTHER TWO AREAS PROVIDE THAT



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 FEEDBACK AND ACTUAL CLARITY FOR EXECUTION. SO THIS WOULD BE,
2 YOU KNOW, FREQUENTLY INFORMING EACH OTHER. SO, WHILE, AS I
3 MENTIONED THE RNM COMMITTEE WHICH WOULD BE INFORMED BY THE
4 VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY SETS THE STRATEGIC VISION, BUT
5 THAT, SORT OF, IS A LOOP WHERE THE FEEDBACK AND THAT CLARITY
6 FOR EXECUTION INFORMS SOME OF THESE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS ON
7 AN ONGOING BASIS, IF THAT'S MAKING SENSE?

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THAT --

10

11 **BRIAN STANKE:** I'M STRUGGLING TO PUT TOGETHER SLIDES 8, 9, AND
12 10 HOW THEY WORK. FOR INSTANCE, THE MTC REGIONAL NETWORK
13 MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE DOESN'T SEEM CONNECTED TO THE DEDICATED
14 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STAFF.

15

16 **SHRUTI HARI:** I SEE WHERE THE CONFUSION IS COMING.

17

18 **BRIAN STANKE:** AND THE OTHER THINGS REPORTING TO THE MTC
19 COMMITTEE, AND THE OVERLAYS THAT SEEM TO BE ATTACHED.

20

21 **SHRUTI HARI:** I SEE WHAT YOU MEAN. EVENTUALLY WHILE THE
22 DEDICATED RNM SUPPORT STAFF GETS GUIDANCE FROM THE RNM COUNCIL
23 BUT IT ULTIMATELY REPORTS TO THE MTC COMMISSION. SO, IF THIS -
24 - THERE WAS A SLIDE THAT MADE THAT CLEAR WHERE ON A DAY-TO-DAY
25 BASIS IN TERMS OF OUTCOMES AND INITIATIVES IT GETS, SORT OF,



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 IMPLEMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE RNM COUNCIL, BUT THE
2 DIRECTOR OF RNM, AND ULTIMATELY, THAT ENTIRE ADMINISTRATIVE
3 AND OPERATIONAL UNIT REPORTS TO THE MTC COMMISSION AND THE MTC
4 ED.

5

6 **BRIAN STANKE:** MY OTHER QUESTION IS, IT DOESN'T SEEM TO BE IN
7 THIS PRESENTATION, BUT THE -- WHEN IS THE DECISION-MAKING
8 ABOUT WHAT ROLES THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER WILL HAVE, AS
9 FAR AS FARES, SERVICE SCHEDULES, COVERAGE? ARE THOSE BEING PUT
10 OFF TO A DIFFERENT YEAR OR DECIDED AT UPCOMING MEETINGS? THIS
11 LOOKS LIKE IT'S COVERING THE STRUCTURE, BUT THE ACTUAL -- WHAT
12 THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGE MANAGES OR DOESN'T MANAGE WHERE
13 WOULD THOSE BE ADDRESSED?

14

15 **SHRUTI HARI:** YOU'RE EXACTLY RIGHT WHAT THESE RECOMMENDATIONS
16 ARE SHOWING IS THE FRAMEWORK, THE DECISION-MAKING STRUCTURE
17 FRAMEWORK. THE ACTUAL INITIATIVES WILL BE THE CHARTER OF THE
18 RNM. ONCE THE RNM STRUCTURE IS STOOD UP, THAT WILL BE WHAT THE
19 RNM WOULD BE REQUIRED TO DO. BRIAN BIN I'M SORRY. SO, WHO
20 DECIDES WHAT THE RNM WILL DO?

21

22 **SHRUTI HARI:** THAT'S SET -- THE STRATEGIC VISION IS SET AT THE
23 MTC RNM COMMITTEE LEVEL. I'M SORRY. ALIX HAS A HAND UP.

24



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** MAYBE A LITTLE BACKGROUND, TO MEMBER KALLINS'S
2 POINT, WE -- THE IDEA OF THIS VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER COMMITTEE
3 IS REALLY TO HELP SET THE POLICY THAT THE MTC WILL MAKE. SO,
4 AND I THINK THE OTHER THING IS THAT WE'RE KIND OF GIVING YOU
5 AN ABBREVIATED SLIDE DECK BECAUSE WE HAD COME, MAYBE THAT WAS
6 A MISTAKE, BEFORE WE HAD COME TO THE MTC ADVISORY COUNCIL.
7 THERE IS INFORMATION ABOUT THE FUNCTIONAL AREAS, AND THERE IS
8 SPECIFIC AREAS IN THAT THAT THE RNM WOULD FOCUS ON. ADDITIONAL
9 WORK WOULD HAPPEN IN THE CHARTER AND IMPLEMENTATION COMING IN
10 SPRING IF THE COMMITTEE DECIDES TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS.
11 THERE WAS MORE DETAIL ON THE, SORT OF, OUTCOMES AND THE
12 FUNCTIONAL AREAS THAT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER WILL FOCUS
13 ON AND WE CAN CERTAINLY GET YOU A MORE COMPREHENSIVE SLIDE
14 DECK.

15

16 **BRIAN STANKE:** JUST HELPING UNDERSTAND THE TIMELINE FOR
17 DECISION-MAKING AS WELL. ALL RIGHT. I SEE PEOPLE WITH HANDS
18 UP. I'LL SECOND MEMBER GRIFFITHS' COMMENTS ABOUT NEEDING TO BE
19 COMMUNITY PROACTIVE. WE'RE COMING UP ON DIFFERENT AGENCY
20 TIMELINES BUT IF EVERYONE IS TUNING UP ON THE FISCAL CLIFFS
21 AND TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE RECOVER FROM COVID RIDERSHIP
22 DECLINES AND REITERATING THAT ALL OF THIS WORK IS TO GET US TO
23 A SYSTEM THAT BRINGS IN MORE RIDERS BACK, AND THAT WHAT'S WE
24 NEED TO DO TO HELP THE FISCAL CLIFF AND OUR CLIMATE GOALS AND
25 ECONOMIC GOALS. THANK YOU.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANKS. AND ON THE TIMELINE, SOME OF
3 THE SLIDES THAT WERE AT POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL HAD MORE
4 TIMELINE DETAIL, SO I THINK THAT WILL BE HELPFUL, AS WELL.
5 SEBASTIAN PETTY?

6

7 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** THANKS CHAIR LEVIN. MY COMMENT IS ACTUALLY IN
8 THE SAME AREA THAT WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING AND FIRST I WOULD
9 LIKE TO THANK STAFF FOR THE CHANGES IN THIS VERSION OF THE
10 PROPOSAL. THEY'RE DEFINITELY APPRECIATED. I GUESS I WOULD
11 EMPHASIZE, I THINK, THAT AS THIS PROPOSAL HOPEFULLY MOVES
12 FORWARD THROUGH THE COMMISSION AND WE GET INTO THE SPRING, I
13 THINK THE IMPORTANCE OF REALLY SPENDING TIME ON CAREFULLY
14 DEFINING THE FIRST COUPLE OF YEARS WORTH OF SCOPE FOR THE RNM,
15 I THINK STAFF PROBABLY KNOWS, AS WELL AS ANYONE, THERE IS A
16 GIANT, SORT OF, WEIGHT OF EXPECTATIONS ON THIS EFFORT BETWEEN
17 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, THE FISCAL CLIFF, THE UPDATED
18 PLANNED BAY AREA, THERE IS A LOT GOING ON RELATED TO REGIONAL
19 TRANSIT SO THERE IS THIS REALLY GIANT DOMAIN OF WORK THAT AN
20 RNM COULD ENGAGE IN. BUT I ALSO KNOW HOW DIFFICULT IT IS TO
21 STAND UP A NEW ENTITY TO FIGURE OUT NEW WAYS OF WORKING,
22 WHAT'S HAPPENING AT THE SAME TIME THAT A LEADERSHIP CHANGE AT
23 MTC IS OCCURRING. SO, I THINK TO MAKE SURE THAT THE RNM IS
24 SUCCESSFUL AND TO KIND OF BUILD TRUST AMONG ALL PARTIES, I
25 WOULD BE VERY THOUGHTFUL ABOUT REALLY STRUCTURING A SCOPE



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 THAT'S ACHIEVABLE AND PRIORITIZED AND MATCHED IN RESOURCES.
2 AND I WOULD ALSO REALLY ENCOURAGE STAFF TO THINK ABOUT HOW
3 THAT SCOPE SPECIFICALLY LINKS BACK TO THE KPI DISCUSSION.
4 BECAUSE I KNOW THAT WE HAVE THESE BROADER KPIS AROUND HOW WE
5 WANT TO SEE TRANSIT EVOLVE AS A WHOLE. WE HAVE KPIS AROUND
6 ORGANIZATIONAL FUNCTION BUT IT OCCURS TO ME THERE IS, SORT OF,
7 A MIDDLE GROUND IN BETWEEN THERE THAT IS SPECIFICALLY ABOUT
8 WHAT THE RNM IS TRYING TO ACHIEVE IN THE FIRST COUPLE OF
9 YEARS, AND THERE BE MAYBE CONCRETE EVALUATION MEASURE THAT CAN
10 COME TO THE FOREFRONT I APPRECIATE THE RESPONSIVENESS TO
11 COMMENTS AND APPRECIATE THE WORK.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IF THERE ISN'T ANYBODY ELSE, I'LL TALK.
14 AND I WANT TO ASK A QUESTION THAT LIFTS UP SOME THINGS THAT IS
15 BASTION AND IAN AND MAYBE OTHERS HAVE SAID, WHICH IS THAT, IN
16 THE FIRST PART OF THE TIMELINE, IS THERE ANTICIPATED TO BE A
17 SECTION OF TIME TO DO REFINEMENT OF THE CHARTER? REFINEMENT OF
18 THE KPI? REFINEMENT OF THE SCOPE? AND THEN, IS THE MISSION
19 VISION CLARIFICATION THAT IAN MENTIONED, IS THAT ALSO -- LIKE,
20 WOULD THAT ALSO BE PART OF THAT REFINEMENT IN THE BEGINNING
21 PHASE? SO, AM I UNDERSTAND -- LIKE, AM I UNDERSTANDING
22 CORRECTLY, LIKE, WILL THERE BE SOME UPFRONT TIME TO DO
23 REFINEMENTS OF THOSE THINGS, AND IS THE MISSION AND VISIONING
24 INCLUDED IN THE THINGS THAT WOULD BE REFINED?

25



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **SHRUTI HARI:** ABSOLUTELY CHAIR LEVIN. THE FRAMEWORK ITSELF IS
2 WHAT'S BEING RECOMMENDED TO THE COMMISSION. THE MISSION AND
3 VISION ARE SOMETHING THAT THE CONSULTING TEAM, AS THEY PUT OUT
4 AS THE ADVISORY GROUP, IS SOMETHING WE COULD WORK ON AT ONE OF
5 THE FIRST MEETINGS. LET ME ALSO MENTION THAT SOME OF THE
6 FINALIZING THE CHARTER IS NOT YET DONE. SO THOSE ARE ALL, I
7 DON'T KNOW IF YOU REMEMBER THE 180 DAY IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. SO
8 A LOT OF THOSE ACTIVITIES -- AND MAYBE I CAN TAKE THE
9 OPPORTUNITY TO SEND OUT THE ENTIRE SLIDE DECK THAT'S BEING
10 SENT OUT TO THE EXEC COMMITTEE TO THIS GROUP, SO THAT INCLUDES
11 180 DAY PLAN INCLUDES PRE-LAUNCH ACTIVITIES THAT WOULD INCLUDE
12 THE FINALIZING THE RNM CHARTER STARTING THE WORK ON THE RNM
13 DIRECTOR JOB DESCRIPTION AND REQUISITION THEN SEQUENTIAL
14 STARTING TO THINK ABOUT THE KPIS ALIGNS PRIORITY INITIATIVES
15 AND REFINING KPIS THAT WILL HAPPEN IN THE FIRST FEW MONTHS
16 ONCE WE RECEIVE APPROVAL FROM THE COMMISSION ON STARTING TO
17 IMPLEMENT THIS. SO A LOT MORE WORK TO BE DONE ON THE CHARTER
18 AND THE KPIS FOR SURE.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AND IF THE MISSION AND
21 VISION IS INCLUDED IN THAT, THAT ANSWERS THE FULL SCOPE OF MY
22 QUESTION. THEN I HAVE A COUPLE OF ADDITIONAL COMMENTS. ONE IS
23 BUILDING ON WHAT IAN GRIFFITHS TALKED ABOUT IN TERMS OF THE
24 TIMELINE. AND I WANTED TO LINK THIS TO THE TIMELINE THAT'S
25 BEING PRESENTED TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WEDNESDAY



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 RELATING TO AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE,
2 WHICH, ACCORDING TO THAT TIMELINE, IS ANTICIPATING POTENTIAL
3 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION IN 2024. AND WHILE THE SLIDES SHOWED
4 THE STAIR-STEP WITH A LONGER TERM STRUCTURE IN 2026 PLUS, YOU
5 KNOW, MAYBE TO IMPLEMENT THIS WE WOULD NEED ADDITIONAL
6 FUNDING, BUT TO DEFINE IT, I HAVE -- I, LIKE, LIKE, A STRONGLY
7 BELIEVE THAT THERE WOULD BE SOME DEFINITION NEEDED SOONER. AND
8 LET ME GIVE YOU A VERY SPECIFIC EXAMPLE FROM LAST WEEK. SO, I
9 WATCHED A SAMTRANS BOARD MEETING, AND THEY HAD A PRESENTATION
10 ABOUT THE REGIONAL TRANSIT COORDINATION INITIATIVES, INCLUDING
11 FARE INTEGRATION AND THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN, PLANNED BAY
12 AREA -- WHATEVER IT'S CALLED. AND THERE WERE CONCERNS RAISED
13 ABOUT THE FUNDING FOR THESE INITIATIVES. AND IN THE DISCUSSION
14 OF THE FARE INTEGRATION, IT MENTIONED VERY CLEARLY THAT GOING
15 TO THE FULLY REDUCED PRICE TRANSFERS WHICH WAS ONE OF THE
16 PREMIER RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE FARE INTEGRATION STUDY AND WAS
17 GENERALLY APPROVED BY THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AND MTC
18 IT WAS MENTIONED THAT IT NEEDS TO GO SEPARATELY TO EACH AND
19 EVERY AGENCY TO BE SEPARATELY APPROVED AND THAT RAISES A
20 SCENARIO WHERE YOU COULD OUT OF THE 27 AGENCIES, EIGHT OF
21 THEM, OR TEN OR 15 OF THEM THAT DO NOT APPROVE FREE OR REDUCED
22 PRICE TRANSFERS. SO, WITHOUT AN ADDITIONAL STRUCTURAL ELEMENT
23 THAT WOULD KEEP INITIATIVES STABLE WITHOUT HAVING HALF THE
24 AGENCIES DOING IT AND HALF THE AGENCIES NOT, I DON'T THINK
25 WE'LL BE ACHIEVING THE MISSION BEING DEFINED. AND, SO, BUT,



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 YOU KNOW, RIGHT NOW, THERE ARE OVERLAPPING AUTHORITIES BETWEEN
2 THE DIFFERENT INSTITUTIONS. AND, SO IT SEEMS TO ME -- LIKE,
3 AND THAT IS OFTEN PUT IN TERMS OF FUNDING BECAUSE FUNDING IS
4 ALWAYS FULLY OWNED BY ONE TRANSIT AGENCY OR ANOTHER, YOU COULD
5 ALWAYS SAY IN TERMS OF FREE TRANSFERS, WELL IT'S MY MONEY, NO
6 IT'S MY MONEY, WELL, NO WE CAN'T ACHIEVE THIS GOAL. IT SEEMS
7 ESSENTIAL TO THINK ABOUT A NEW SOURCE OF FUNDING THAT CAN BE
8 FUNDING FOR THE SHARED GOAL TO DEFINE THE GOVERN OF THAT
9 FUNDING IN LINE WITH THESE SHARED GOALS. THAT SEEMS REALLY
10 CRITICAL. AND, SO, I WOULD REALLY WANT TO SEE A TIMELINE THAT
11 INCLUDES THE DEFINITION OF THE SHARED ACCOUNTABILITY ON THE
12 SHARED FUNDING IN THE TIMELINE TO DEFINE A REGIONAL MEASURE.
13 AND, SO THAT WAS THAT COMMENT. THE LAST COMMENT IS ABOUT THE
14 COMPOSITION, AND I SAW THAT THERE WERE SOME -- A DEFINITION
15 OF, I THINK, THE CURRENT COMPOSITION, AND I WONDER, LIKE, IS
16 THIS OUR LAST BITE AT THE APPLE IN TERMS OF DEFINING THAT
17 COMPOSITION? AND, BECAUSE I HAD SOME THOUGHTS. FOR EXAMPLE,
18 RIGHT NOW, THERE IS ONE REPRESENTATIVE OF CITY, AND I'M
19 WONDERING IF THAT IS THE RIGHT NUMBER. BECAUSE THERE IS SOME
20 OTHER CATEGORIES THAT HAVE TWO OR THREE, AND ONLY ONE FROM A
21 CITY. IN TERMS OF DISABILITY, SOMETIMES WE HAVE THE POLICY
22 ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS ALSO HAVE ROLES AND IDENTITIES. SO, I
23 WONDER WHETHER WE WANT TO HAVE A -- LIKE A CROSS HATCH TO MAKE
24 SURE THAT WE HAVE REPRESENTATIVES OF STUDENTS AND
25 REPRESENTATIVES OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, AND, YOU KNOW, TO



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE ENOUGH. AND SO THE ROLE MIGHT FILLED,
2 EITHER BY SOMEONE FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND/OR
3 ADDITIONAL PEOPLE. I THINK THAT NEEDS A LITTLE BIT OF
4 REFINING. SO, LIKE, IS NOW OUR LAST DAY TO MAKE THOSE
5 SUGGESTIONS OR WILL WE HAVE ADDITIONAL DAYS TO SUGGEST HOW WE
6 DO THAT REFINEMENT OF THOSE SEATS?

7

8 **SHRUTI HARI:** SURE. THIS IS NOT THE LAST BITE AT THE APPLE. AND
9 WHAT WAS SHOWN ON THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY COMMITTEE
10 WAS ILLUSTRATED AND ALL YOUR FEEDBACK IS VERY HELPFUL AS WE
11 DEVELOP THE COMPOSITION OF THAT SUBCOMMITTEE.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** FIRST EXAMPLE, IT IDENTIFIED ONE PERSON
14 REPRESENTING PEOPLE FROM DISABILITIES, WHICH DOESN'T SEEM TO
15 BE ENOUGH, BUT THERE MIGHT ALSO BE A PERSON WITH THE ADVISORY
16 COUNCIL FILLING IT. I WOULD THINK THIS NEEDS MORE ATTENTION TO
17 MAKE SURE THERE IS SUFFICIENT REPRESENTATION FROM THE KEY
18 TRANSIT, RIDER, CUSTOMER CONSTITUENCIES. AND THOSE ARE MY
19 COMMENTS. DO WE HAVE MORE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS
20 OF THE BODY BEFORE WE GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT? I AM -- AH-HA, I
21 SEE BRIAN STANKE HAS A HAND.

22

23 **BRIAN STANKE:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED TO SECOND SOME OF CHAIR
24 ADINA'S COMMENTS. YOU KNOW, DESCRIBING THE POTENTIAL WITH THE
25 -- WITH AGENCIES OPTING OUT OF THE FREE AND REDUCED TRANSFERS.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 YOU KNOW, WE HAVE SEEN THAT WITH TRANSLINK AND CLIPPER AND
2 THAT WHOLE HISTORY. SO, THE -- THAT REINFORCES THE NECESSITY,
3 AS WE'RE LOOKING AT LEGISLATION IN THE NEAR TO MID-TERM,
4 WHETHER IT'S THE REGIONAL FUNDING LEGISLATION, OR OTHERS, YOU
5 KNOW, THE NECESSITY OF BOTH, ALLOWING AND REQUIRING TRANSIT
6 AGENCIES TO DO SOME OF THESE ACTIONS THAT THE REGION IS
7 AGREEING TO DO. AND I WOULD ALSO SECOND THAT, YOU KNOW, WHILE
8 SAN JOSE IS THE LARGEST CITY, WE ARE DEFINITELY NOT THE ONLY
9 CITY IN THE BAY AREA. AND WHILE WE HAVE A BIG TEAM THAT'S
10 LOOKING AT TRANSPORTATION, IT'S A BIG FOCUS OF OURS FOR
11 DEVELOPMENT AND, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT GROWTH. WE ARE NOT THE ONLY
12 CITY THAT'S VERY FOCUSED ON TRANSIT. SO, DEFINITELY A DEEPER
13 LOOK AT MAKING SURE WE HAVE ENOUGH REPRESENTATION OF THE RIGHT
14 STAKEHOLDERS IN THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER, AND THAT MAKING
15 SURE THAT, AS WE COMBINE DIFFERENT SUBCOMMITTEES DESIGNATE,
16 THAT THE CROSS HAT -- THE CROSS BETWEEN THEM, YOU KNOW,
17 COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER AND DIFFERENT OVERLAP. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. IF THERE ARE NOT ADDITIONAL HANDS
20 FROM MEMBERS OF THE BODY, LIKE, TO GO TO MEMBERS OF THE
21 PUBLIC. DO WE HAVE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE
22 PUBLIC IN.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS FROM THE
25 PUBLIC. WE HAVE FOUR HANDS RAISED FROM THE PUBLIC NOW.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I SEE CHRISTINE FITZGERALD.

3

4 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE

5 PRESENTATION. THIS COVERS A LOT OF TERRITORY AND INTERSECTS IN

6 SO MANY DIFFERENT WAYS. I WOULD LIKE THIS BODY TO KEEP IN MIND

7 THAT THE CONSUMER, THE CUSTOMER IS GOING TO BE MOST AFFECTED,

8 BECAUSE IF, FOR INSTANCE, THEY CANNOT AFFORD TO TAKE PUBLIC

9 TRANSIT OR PUBLIC TRANSIT IS NOT AVAILABLE TO WHEREVER YOU

10 NEED TO GO, THAT'S A MISSTEP, A MISSED CHANCE TO RETAIN

11 CUSTOMER LOYALTY. AND CERTAINLY WOULD BE A GOOD ARGUMENT FOR

12 THE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO THINK ABOUT AS WE MOVE FORWARD.

13 ANOTHER THING TO CONSIDER, AND I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING

14 INTO THIS NEXT IS THE WAYFINDING ITEM. AND I WOULD LIKE TO

15 REMIND FOLKS THAT, AGAIN, THIS PARTICULAR PROCESS IS TO LOOK

16 AT HOW THE STRUCTURE IS TO UNIFY THE REGIONAL. AND CERTAINLY

17 WAY FINDING IS A PART OF THAT, AND JUST TO SAY THAT THE SLIDE

18 DECK IS NOT ACCESSIBLE FOR SCREEN READERS FOR THE VISUALS FOR

19 THE IMAGINES, IS A FALSE STATEMENT, BUT IT'S A BIG STATEMENT.

20 BECAUSE IF YOU DON'T -- IF YOU CANNOT UNDERSTAND WHAT IT IS,

21 YOU'RE BEING SHOWN HOW IS IT YOU'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO WORK

22 WITH IT. SO THOSE ARE MY THOUGHTS. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NATALIE.

25



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS NATALIE MAXWELL, I'M WITH THE CENTER
2 FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING I'M A TRANSPORTATION SPECIALIST
3 PRONOUNCE ARE THEY AND THEM. AS ADINA MENTIONED ON THE
4 REPRESENTATIVE OF THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY COMMITTEE
5 EXPLICITLY HAVING A VOICE OF A DISABLED PERSON OR ORGANIZATION
6 OR BOTH REALLY THAT I'M NOT HEARING A LOT OF ACCESSIBILITY
7 DISCUSSION IN THIS PLANNING, AND I'M NOT HEARING UNIVERSAL
8 DESIGN INCORPORATED EXPLICITLY AND IF OUR ZOOM WEBINAR CAN'T
9 BE ACCESSIBLE TO THOSE OF LOW VISION THAT'S A HUGE STATEMENT
10 ABOUT HOW ACCESSIBILITY AND DISABILITY IS BEING INCORPORATED
11 INTO THIS PROCESS. AND THAT'S DISAPPOINTING, FOR SURE. AND I
12 WOULD LIKE TO SAY, YOU KNOW, ALTHOUGH THIS WORK IS PROLIFIC, I
13 DON'T WANT TO DISCOUNT THIS WORK. IT'S JUST THAT I WOULD LIKE
14 IT TO BE, YOU KNOW, AT LEAST THE CENTER FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING
15 ENCOURAGES YOU TO MAKE IT ACCESSIBLE FOR PEOPLE INCLUDING JUST
16 TO NOTE, DEFINING THE ACRONYMS AT THE BEGINNING OF THE SLIDES,
17 VERBALLY WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL FOR THOSE OF US WHO ARE
18 ENTERING IT FROM THE COMMUNITY SIDE OF THINGS AND NOT FROM THE
19 ALL KNOWING JARGON SIDE OF TRANSIT. SO, YEAH. I JUST ALSO WANT
20 TO EXPLICITLY STATE THAT WE -- LIKE I SAID, WE SUPPORT THE
21 VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY COMMITTEE PROVIDED THAT THERE
22 IS AN EXPLICITLY, LIKE AN EXPLICIT SPACE FOR ACCESSIBILITY AND
23 SOMEONE THAT REPRESENTS THE DISABLED COMMUNITY. AND THEN I
24 WOULD ALSO LIKE TO ENCOURAGE MTC TO CREATE AN ACCESSIBILITY
25 TASK FORCE COMPOSED OF WELL INFORMED PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 AND YOU KNOW, I THINK THEY COULD SIT SOMEWHERE ALONGSIDE THE
2 VOICE OF THE CONSUMER OR CUSTOMER. EXCUSE ME. AND THAT'S MY
3 TIME. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** WELTE? FRANK?

6

7 **FRANK WELTE:** OKAY. THERE WE GO. FIRST OFF, I THINK THAT, AS
8 IT'S BEEN STATED, AND I THINK I CAN FOLLOW UP WITH THAT SAID I
9 THINK THERE IS A REAL NEED BEYOND THIS SPECIFIC ISSUE FOR MTC
10 AND ALL OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO DO SOME SERIOUS SOUL
11 SEARCHING IN TERMS OF THE LEVEL OF CAPACITY TO ADDRESS THE
12 CONCERNS OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. I THINK THAT THERE IS A
13 SYSTEMIC SHORTCOMING HERE, WITH THAT, AND I THINK THAT THIS
14 PLAN REFLECTS THAT. AS IT'S NOT ENOUGH TO HAVE ONE OR TWO
15 PEOPLE, IF WE'RE LUCKY, ON ONE COMMITTEE. WE NEED TO HAVE
16 REPRESENTATION OF PEOPLE WITH A VARIETY OF DISABILITIES ON
17 EVERY ONE OF THE COMMITTEES. WE NEED TO HAVE REPRESENTATIVE --
18 REPRESENTATIONS OF PEOPLE WITH A VARIETY OF DISABILITIES
19 SCATTERED THROUGHOUT THE STAFFS OF THESE AGENCIES AND THE MTC.
20 BECAUSE IF THAT'S NOT HAPPENING, THEN, IN THOSE FEW CASES WHEN
21 WE ARE HEARD, SO MANY DECISIONS WILL HAVE BEEN MADE BEHIND
22 CLOSED DOORS, THAT OUR ABLE TO ACTUALLY MAKE A MEANINGFUL
23 INFLUENCE ON POLICY WILL BE MINIMIZED. AND THAT'S NOT
24 SATISFACTORY. YOU ALL HAVE HEARD IF YOU DO NOT HAVE A SEAT AT
25 THE TABLE, YOU'RE ON THE MENU. AND WE HAVE THREE OR FOUR



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 TABLES HERE WITH THOSE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES ARE PROBABLY
2 GOING TO BE ON THE MENU BECAUSE THEY'RE DON'T HAVE A SEAT AT
3 THE TABLE AND THERE NEEDS TO BE METRICS BUILT INTO THIS
4 PROCESS AS WE MOVE FORWARD. I REALIZE THIS IS THE EARLY STAGES
5 WHERE WE HAVEN'T DEVELOPED THOSE YET BUT CONCRETE MEASUREMENTS
6 AS QUALITY OF SERVICE FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES THAT GO WAY
7 BEYOND THE METRICS THAT ARE CURRENTLY BEING USED IN THIS
8 INDUSTRY.

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. AND I WOULD LIKE TO -- POSE A
11 QUESTION OR TWO TO STAFF, REGARDING SOME OF THE COMMENTS THAT
12 WERE JUST MADE BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO OUR NEXT TOPIC. AND, WITH
13 REGARD TO THE COMMENT ABOUT THE SLIDES NOT BEING ACCESSIBLE
14 FOR PEOPLE WITH VISUAL DISABILITIES, IS THERE A USER TESTING
15 FOR LACK OF A BETTER WORK THAT IS DONE WITH SLIDES TO MAKE
16 SURE THAT THEY ARE ACCESSIBLE BEFORE THEY GO OUT? I'M GOING TO
17 RAISE THAT TO STAFF.

18

19 **KY-NAM MILLER:** I THINK SCHRUTI CAN ATTEST TO THIS. MARTHA HAS
20 PLAYED A PROACTIVE ROLE IN REMINDING PEOPLE AND GIVING PEOPLE
21 TEMPLATES, YOU DO GET A LOT OF STAFF OVERSIGHT IT'S NOT
22 PERFECT, BUT I THINK WE'RE GETTING BETTER WITH EACH ROUND OF
23 IT. I DON'T KNOW IF SCHRUTI HAS ANYTHING TO ADD?

24



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **SHRUTI HARI:** CHAIR LEVIN, WE DID GO THROUGH SEVERAL ROUNDS TO
2 TRY TO MAKE THEM ACCESSIBLE WITH THE TOOLS THAT WE HAVE
3 AVAILABLE, BUT MAYBE WE COULD BE DOING MORE. THANKS FOR THAT
4 FEEDBACK.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** CAN THERE BE A CONNECTION BETWEEN THE
7 PEOPLE WHO GAVE COMMENT ABOUT THE INACCESSIBILITY OF THE
8 MATERIALS PRESENTED TODAY, AND STAFF, TO SEE IF THERE ARE
9 LESSONS LEARNED TO IMPROVE FOR THE FUTURE?

10

11 **SHRUTI HARI:** I'M IN FAVOR -- AT LEAST, I CAN REACH OUT
12 PERSONALLY TO THE FOLKS TO SEE WHAT ELSE WE CAN DO. REALLY
13 APPRECIATE THAT FEEDBACK.

14

15 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. AND THE OTHER THING I WANT TO
16 RAISE AS AN ONGOING QUESTION IS REGARDING THE IDEA OF HAVING
17 AN ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE IN THE STRUCTURAL ITEMS THERE WAS
18 A SPACE FOR TASK FORCES THAT COULD BE CROSS CUTTING IN THE
19 REPORTING TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL. AND THERE WERE
20 ALSO SOME QUESTIONS ABOUT THE KPIS THAT WOULD BE PART OF THE
21 CHARTER AND SCOPE. SO, JUST WANT TO UPLIFT THOSE POINTS SO
22 THAT WHEN WE GET INTO THE DEFINITIONAL PHASES THAT THOSE
23 THINGS TO BE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT. AND I SEE ANOTHER HAND. OH
24 THAT WAS FROM SOMEBODY WHO HAS ALREADY SPOKEN. SO, WITH THAT,
25 I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM ON OUR AGENDA. SO,



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR PRESENTING THIS, AND TO
2 EVERYONE FOR ALL OF THE WORK THAT HAS GONE INTO THE NEXT
3 PHASES OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT. SO, MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM
4 NUMBER FIVE, WHICH IS A MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT PROCESS
5 AND ENGAGEMENT UPDATE, WHICH IS GOING TO BE AN INFORMATION
6 ITEM. AND WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM AARON PRIVEN AND ADRIENNE
7 BELL ON MAPPING AND WAYFINDING.

8

9 **AARON PRIVEN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DON'T
10 KNOW I'M AARON PRIVEN, MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT MANAGER
11 HERE AT MTC HERE TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON THE PROCESS FOR THE
12 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT. CAN WE SEE THE SLIDES, PLEASE?
13 THANK YOU. THE GOAL OF THE PROJECT IS TO IMPLEMENT AND DEVELOP
14 FULLY HARMONIZED WAYFINDING MAPPING AND TRANSIT INFORMATION
15 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA IN ALL TRANSIT ENVIRONMENTS PROVIDING
16 GUIDANCE FOR PEDESTRIAN WAYFINDING FIRST AND LAST MILE
17 OPPORTUNITIES EXTENDING FROM TRANSIT AREAS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
18 THANK YOU. BEFORE WE HAND IT ON TO OUR CONSULTANT LEAD I WOULD
19 LIKE TO GIVE INFORMATION ABOUT THE PROJECT TEAM. OUR TEAM
20 INCLUDES FROM MTC, SHAUNA CALLA, AARON PRIVEN, JAY, AND MARTI
21 PASCHAL AND LYSA HALE. WE HAVE SEVERAL CONSULTANT FIRMS
22 WORKING WITH US, LEAD APPLIED INFORMATION ADRIENNE BELL, LEAD
23 ON THE PROJECT REFLECT DESIGN COLLECTIVE LEAD ON THE PROJECTS
24 EQUITABLE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND EZRA KAHN, HERRIKO, WHO CAN
25 ANSWER QUESTIONS, NELSON NYGAARD WORKING ON STAGE DEVELOPMENT.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 I WOULD LIKE ADRIENNE BELL TO DISCUSS THE PROJECT AND ITS
2 STAGES. ADRIENNE BELL TO DISCUSS THE PROJECT AND STAGES.
3
4 **ADRIENNE BELL:** THANK YOU, AARON. AND THANK YOU, COUNCIL
5 MEMBERS FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PRESENT. THIS PROJECT IS THE
6 TRANSFORMING CONCEPTS PRESENTED TO THE COUNCIL IN JUNE OF 2021
7 INTO REGIONAL STANDARDS AND DESIGN AND APPLICATIONS OF
8 CUSTOMER-FACING INFORMATION ABOUT CONNECTING AND TRAVELING BY
9 TRANSIT. FROM A PRACTICAL PERSPECTIVE WE'LL PROVIDE IDENTITY
10 FOR TRANSIT RANGE OF PHYSICAL SIGNS VARIOUS SYSTEM REGIONAL
11 MAPS ELEMENTS AND ACCESSIBILITY PROJECTS. IMAGES ON THE SCREEN
12 ARE EXAMPLES OF THESE PROJECTS WE HAVE DELIVERED IN REGIONAL
13 CITIES ACROSS THE WORLD. OUR PROJECT IS MULTI-YEAR AND
14 INCLUDES SIGNIFICANT IMPLEMENTATION ACROSS SUBREGIONAL PILOT
15 AREAS. THE PROJECT WILL WORK TO INCLUDE PARALLEL WORK STREAMS
16 AND PRODUCE PROTOTYPE DESIGN STANDARDS GUIDE MTC DIGITAL
17 MAPPING PROVIDING AND PREPARING REGIONAL PLANS FOR GOVERNING
18 SPONSORING IMPLEMENTING AND OPERATING SYSTEM FEED INTO
19 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT DECISIONS WORK WITH MTC SUPPLIERS
20 AND BAY AREA OPERATORS AND DEMONSTRATING BUSINESS CASE
21 CONSISTENTLY. THE DIAGRAM EXPLAINS THE PROCESS AT A HIGH-LEVEL
22 BUT I WILL EXPLAIN THE INDIVIDUAL PROCESS IN MORE DETAIL IN
23 THE FOLLOWING SLIDES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE FIRST BLOCK OF
24 WORK WE'RE EMBARKING ON WILL IMPLEMENT PROTOTYPES OF PUBLIC
25 AND OPERATOR EVALUATION OUR AIM IS TO HAVE THESE THINGS ON THE



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 GROUND THIS YEAR ACHIEVING WORKING THROUGH STAGES THAT WE'LL
2 DESCRIBE IN MORE DETAIL IN THE FOLLOWING SLIDES THE STAGES
3 INCLUDE STAKEHOLDER OPERATOR PROBABLE PROTOTYPING PROPOSED
4 DIGITAL DEMONSTRATIONS STRATEGIES FOR REGIONAL GOVERNANCE
5 IMPLEMENTATIONS AND OPERATIONS MAINTENANCE BASED ON EXPERIENCE
6 AND INTERNATIONAL PRACTICES AND INPUT FROM THE BAY AREA ITSELF
7 THE FIRST BLOCK WILL INCLUDE INFORMATION ABOUT WHEN'S NEEDED
8 IN THE FEASIBLE AFFORDABLE AND EFFECTIVE WORK WE CAN REFINE
9 AND EXPAND IN SUBSEQUENT REGIONAL PILOTS. STAGES INCLUDED IN
10 THIS QUARTER WILL REVIEW BUILDING ON PREVIOUS PHASE TWO
11 CONCEPT WORK WAYFINDING TO MAKE TRANSIT MORE ACCESSIBLE AND
12 EQUITABLE AND BEST PRACTICES FOR REGIONAL APPROACH, WHAT
13 OPERATORS ARE CAPABLE OF AND HAVE PLANNED AND RESOURCES FOR
14 IMPLEMENTING AND MANAGING HARMONIZED SYSTEMS. SIMPLY A
15 STANDARD REGIONAL WAY OF PROVIDING TRANSIT INFORMATION ACROSS
16 MEDIA THAT MEETS OPERATOR IDENTITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE
17 NEXT STAGE PULLS TOGETHER THE DETAILED INFORMATION UNDER
18 REVIEW INTO THE DEVELOPMENT STAGE WE CALL THE BIG THINK WU WE
19 WILL WORK WITH COMMUNITIES IN OPERATION IN PROJECTS TO BE
20 IMPLEMENTED AS PROTOTYPES INCLUDING PURPOSE AND OPTIONS FOR
21 REGIONAL NETWORK IDENTITY GRAPHIC SYSTEM STANDARDS NEEDED FOR
22 CONSISTENCY AND ACCESSIBILITY INCLUDING TYPE FACE COLORS PICK
23 TOW GRAMS TONE VOICE OF INFORMATION NON-VISUAL TOOLS AND USE
24 OF LANGUAGE PHYSICAL PRODUCTS, INTEGRATION OF SEAMLESSNESS,
25 SUCH AS WHAT THINGS ARE CALLED, SERVICE DESCRIPTIONS, SYSTEM



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 CODING AND WHAT AND HOW INFORMATION IS ARRANGED ALONG THE
2 JOURNEY. AND PROTOTYPES FOR DEMONSTRATION OF VISUAL
3 DEMONSTRATION AND EXAMPLES AND WHERE THEY SHOULD BE
4 IMPLEMENTED. THIRD STAGE DEVELOPING PROTOTYPES RATHER THAN
5 COMPLEX AND LIMITING PROTOTYPING WE'RE PROPOSING A SET OF
6 LABS, LABORATORIES WHERE SYSTEMS CAN BE IMPLEMENTED AND
7 EVALUATED. LABS FORM ALLOWS INCLUDING PERSPECTIVES THAT
8 INCLUDE DIGITAL OPTIONS AND WAYS TO COMMUNICATE FOR
9 ACCESSIBILITY. DURING THIS STAGE WE WILL WORK CLOSELY WITH
10 OPERATORS AFFECTED BY PHYSICAL PROTOTYPE LABS AND SUPPLIERS
11 THAT WILL BE CREATING A DIGITAL MAP PLATFORM AND APPOINTED
12 FABRICATORS WHO WILL BUILD PROTOTYPES. WE'LL PREPARE
13 EVALUATION PLANS TOGETHER AND GATHER FEEDBACK FROM
14 STAKEHOLDERS AND OPERATORS ABOUT THOSE PROTOTYPES. FINAL STAGE
15 OF OUR WORK PLAN IS TO IMPLEMENT AND EVALUATE ON PROTOTYPES.
16 INCLUDING TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF QUALITY OPERABILITY DESIGN
17 CONCEPT, PUBLIC INTERVIEWS, AND PRACTICAL TESTS, OPERATOR
18 TOOLS, AND SURVEYS, PROCESS LESSONS LEARNED AND IMPLEMENTATION
19 AND COORDINATION OF THE PROTOTYPES THAT WILL REVEAL CHALLENGES
20 AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE LARGER SUBREGIONAL PILOTS. WE WILL
21 WORK WITH NELSON NYGAARD TO ENGAGE IN STAKEHOLDER AND OPERATOR
22 PROCESSES. A LARGE TRANSPORTATION CONSULTANCY RESPONSIBLE FOR
23 PREPARING MTC REGIONAL MOBILITY HUB STRATEGIES. IN THIS CASE,
24 WE'LL ESTABLISH THREE TECHNICAL WORKING GROUPS COVERING USER
25 EXPERIENCE. COVERS EVERYTHING FROM DESIGN RELATED TO DESIGN



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 FROM IDENTITY, GRAPHIC, LEGIBILITY, MAPPING, AND DIGITAL
2 INTERACTION. A SECOND GROUP COVERING OPERATIONS FOCUSED AS
3 MANAGERS WHO ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR PLANNING, IMPLEMENTING AND
4 MAINTAINING INFORMATION IT'S THE SERVICE LEVEL FOR INPUT ON
5 INDUSTRIAL DESIGN RESOURCES AND UPDATING. AND A THIRD GROUP ON
6 POLICY AND PLANNING THAT CAN ADVISE ON SUBREGIONAL
7 CONSIDERATION FOR IMPLEMENTING AND MANAGING THE REGIONAL
8 SYSTEM OF CONSISTENT AND SEAMLESS TRAVEL INFORMATION BUT A
9 GROUP THAT CAN KEEP THE PROJECT ON TRACK WITH AIMS FOR THE
10 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND ASK BIGGER QUESTIONS ABOUT
11 EQUITY, MOBILITY, AND ENVIRONMENTAL RESPONSIBILITY. NEXT SLIDE
12 PLEASE. WE'LL BE WORKING WITH REFLEX DESIGN COLLECTIVE, ON THE
13 CORE TODAY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS. REGIONAL DESIGNS FOR
14 STRATEGIES AND EQUITY DESIGN INNOVATION. BELIEVING SOCIAL
15 INEQUITY STEMS FROM LACK OF AGENCY HELD BY COMMUNITY SYSTEMIC
16 OPPRESSION THIS IS SHAPING THE ENVIRONMENT OR LIFE
17 CIRCUMSTANCES AND WHAT REFLEX SEEKS TO FLIP BY HAVING CITY
18 AGENCY DESIGNED WITH IMPACTED COMMUNITIES. COMMUNITY RESEARCH
19 COCREATION PART THROUGH A SERIES OF WORKSHOPS REFLEX WILL WORK
20 WITH MAPPING FOLKS WITH LIMITED SIGHT MOBILITY AND SHIFT WORK
21 WITH MULTIPLE TRANSFERS IN THEIR JOURNEYS. THESE WORKSHOPS ARE
22 SPACES FOR PEOPLE TO WORK TOGETHER TO CREATE A WAY OF LIVE
23 WITH CONSTRAINTS AND OPPORTUNITIES TRADEOFFS AND
24 CONSIDERATIONS FOR PROJECTS WITHIN THE COMMUNITIES. COMMUNITY
25 RESEARCH WORKING WITH MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY WHO WILL



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 SUPPORTED AND COMPENSATED TO CONDUCT AND DESIGN TESTING IN
2 THEIR OWN COMMUNITY. NEXT SLIDE. AS YOU CAN SEE WE'RE AT THE
3 START OF THIS PIECE OF WORK AND WE'RE EXCITED TO DO THAT BUT
4 WE HAVE QUESTIONS OR THOUGHTS FROM YOU TO STIMULATE
5 DISCUSSION. THE ARE THERE GRASSROOTS COMMUNITIES THAT YOU WANT
6 TO MAKE SURE WE PARTNER WITH. WHAT ARE SOME COMMUNITY-BASED
7 ORGANIZATIONS WE CAN RECRUIT PARTNERSHIP PARTICIPANTS FROM.
8 ARE THERE PROJECTS WE SHOULD BE AWARE OF AND COULD LINK UP TO.
9 ARE THERE ADDITIONAL WAYFINDING PROJECTS THAT WE COULD RELATE
10 TO THE WAYFINDING PROJECTS. WITH THAT, I CONCLUDE MY
11 PRESENTATION.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I'LL OPEN IT UP TO MEMBERS OF THE
14 COMMISSION FOR QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. RICH HEDGES?

15

16 **RICHARD HEDGES:** FOLLOW UP QUESTION. A COMPREHENSIVE REPORT ON
17 THIS. THANK YOU. SO NECESSARY. I OFFER THAT ON THE FREEWAY
18 INITIATIVES THAT WE HAD FOR EQUITY ON THE TOLLING. OUR LABOR
19 COUNCILS AROUND THE BAY AREA, WE'RE ABLE TO CONTACT SEVERAL
20 HUNDRED THOUSAND PEOPLE THROUGH THAT, AND I WOULD OFFER THAT
21 AGAIN. MANY OF OUR SERVICE UNIONS EVEN THOUGH ANY OTHER PART
22 OF THE COUNTRY WOULD BE GOOD WAGES THEY'RE STRUGGLING WITH
23 THEM AND WOULD USUALLY COME UNDER THE GUIDELINES OF EQUITY AND
24 WOULD BE ABLE TO TELL YOU THE AREAS IN PATHS OF TRAVEL THEY
25 HAVE TO GET TO WORK AND SOME DO TAKE TRANSIT. THANK YOU.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. WENDI KALLINS?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. YOU WERE ASKING FOR POSSIBLE
5 COMMUNITY GROUPS. OFTENTIMES THOSE OF US UP IN THE SUBURBS
6 DON'T GET ASKED. SO, I WANT TO RECOMMEND EITHER CANAL ALLIANCE
7 OR MULTI-CULTURAL CENTER OF MARIN, ESPECIALLY CANAL ALLIANCE,
8 CANAL AREA IS THE PEOPLE WHO USE THE BUS THE MOST. SO, IF
9 THEY'RE NOT ALREADY ON YOUR LIST, PLEASE PUT THEM ON YOUR
10 LIST. THE OTHER, JUST A COMMENT I HAVE. IT'S JUST, REALLY, OFF
11 IN LEFT FIELD BECAUSE IT'S NOT ACTUALLY RELATED TO WHAT YOUR
12 ACTUAL SCOPE IS. I OFTEN TALK ABOUT THIS WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
13 WAYFINDING IS WHEN ARE WE GOING TO GET A DIGITAL PLATFORM
14 WHERE PEOPLE CAN DO WAY FINDING ON THEIR PHONES FOR EVERYWHERE
15 IN THE BAY AREA? AND I UNDERSTAND THERE ARE APPS ALREADY IF
16 PLACE THAT DO THAT. BUT AT SOME POINT MTC WAS CONTEMPLATING
17 PUTTING SOMETHING TOGETHER ON THEIR OWN AND I WONDER IF THAT'S
18 STILL IN THE WORKS THERE. THAT'S DIRECTED TO MTC NOT THE
19 CONSULTANT.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IS THAT A QUESTION THAT STAFF AND THE
22 CONSULTANT CAN ADDRESS?

23

24 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** WELL, IT'S NOT IN THE CONSULTANT
25 SCOPE. SO I'M NOT SURE THEY CAN ADDRESS IT.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **AARON PRIVEN:** IT'S NOT REALLY IN MY PERSONAL SCOPE HERE AT THE
3 AGENCY BUT I CERTAINLY CAN MAKE SURE THAT THE PEOPLE WHO ARE
4 WORKING ON THAT CAN GET BACK TO YOU AND GET MORE INFORMATION
5 ABOUT THOSE KINDS OF ISSUES. BECAUSE THAT IS NOT ONE OF THE
6 THINGS THAT WE'RE DOING HERE TODAY.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** I UNDERSTAND. I'M JUST GOING TO KEEP
9 PUTTING A BUG IN YOUR EAR ABOUT IT WHENEVER I HAVE AN
10 OPPORTUNITY.

11

12 **AARON PRIVEN:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ADRIENNE BELL HAS A HAND.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I WANTED TO RESPOND AS WELL, ONE OF THE THINGS WE'LL
17 BE DOING IN THE PROCESS OF REVIEW IS TO LOOK AT THE CURRENT
18 STATE-OF-THE-ART OF DIGITAL WAYFINDING AS IT RELATES TO OTHER
19 FORMS OF FINDING SO WE WILL COVER THE ROLE OF APPLICATIONS AND
20 YOU ARE PROBABLY AWARE I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S THE CASE HERE,
21 THAT CITY BASED OR GOVERNMENT LED TRIP PLANNING TOOLS ARE
22 FALLING BY THE WAYSIDE IN TERMS OF USE. THEY'RE VERY EXPENSIVE
23 TO PRODUCE AND MAINTAIN, AND FRANKLY THE PRIVATE SECTOR DO IT
24 BETTER AND CHEAPER. SO, WHETHER THEY'RE AS GOOD IN TERMS,
25 WEIGHING UP THE UBIQUITY IN TERMS OF USING GOOGLE TRANSIT AND



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 OTHER APPS OF THAT, SORT OF, OF REGIONAL OR INDIVIDUAL
2 GOVERNMENT.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** YOU WILL BE HELPING PEOPLE TO
5 UNDERSTAND THAT THE GOOGLE TOOL IS AVAILABLE AND MAYBE SHOWING
6 PEOPLE HOW TO USE IT.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** WHAT THEY FEEL IS MOST APPROPRIATE TO THEM, OUR
9 EXPERIENCE IN THE INDUSTRY OVER THE LAST TEN IT 15 YEARS IS
10 THERE WAS A PHASE OF DEVELOPMENT AND APPLICATIONS, NOW IT'S A
11 BIG GLOBAL INDUSTRY, AND PARTICULARLY IN OUR BUSINESS IN
12 WAYFINDING WE'RE ALWAYS ASKED WELL WHY DO YOU EXIST BECAUSE
13 GOOGLE IS DOING IT ALL AND IT'S NOT THE CASE THAT THEY COVER
14 EVERYTHING IT'S A GLOBAL PLATFORM AND YOU'RE A LOCAL AREA. OUR
15 PERSPECTIVE IS LOOKING AT PLATFORMS THAT ARE PRACTICAL AND
16 FREE AND MAINTAIN AT A REGIONAL LEVEL. THIS PROJECT IS A
17 MAPPING PLATFORM FOR THE REGION AND ONE OF THE WAYS THAT
18 PLATFORM CAN BE USED FOR OPERATORS, IS SOMETHING THAT'S
19 CENTRAL TO OUR PROJECT.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** THANKS. THAT'S VERY HELPFUL.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SEBASTIAN PETTY?

24



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** THANKS CHAIR LEVIN. AND THANK YOU FOR THE
2 COMPREHENSIVE PRESENTATION. IT'S VERY INTERESTING. I GUESS A
3 COUPLE OF PERSPECTIVES OR THOUGHTS I MIGHT ADD INTO THIS. ONE,
4 I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S SO INTERESTING ABOUT THIS
5 PROJECT IS YOU'RE BOTH BUILDING A PLAN FOR A PRODUCT THAT'S
6 REGIONALLY INTEGRATED WAYFINDING BUT YOU'RE ALSO AT THE SAME
7 TIME BUILDING A PROCESS AROUND HOW TO DO REGIONALLY INTEGRATED
8 WAYFINDING AND HOW YOU'LL MAINTAIN IT IN THE FUTURE. I URGE
9 STAFF AND CONSULTANTS TO BE MINDFUL OF BOTH OF THOSE ASPECTS
10 BOTH THE BUILDING OF THE PRODUCT AND THE PROCESS. THE OTHER
11 THING, I DO NOT HAVE UNFORTUNATELY VERY SPECIFIC SUGGESTIONS
12 ABOUT THE PARTICULAR GROUPS OR SEGMENTS TO WORK WITH IT, BUT
13 THIS IS HAPPENING AT A TIME WHERE THERE IS A LOT OF CHANGE
14 GOING ON AND WHO IS RIDING TRANSIT AND MARKETING, AND I WOULD
15 URGE THIS EFFORT STAYS IN SYNC UP WITH THE WORK THAT'S
16 HAPPENING AS PART OF TRANSIT 2050, AND REALLY TAKE INTO
17 ACCOUNT FUTURE ORIENTED TRANSIT TODAY, AND TRENDS IF THE
18 FUTURE AND WHAT CUSTOMERS WILL NEED IN WAY FINDING AND REALLY
19 THINK ABOUT HOW DO WE BUILD A WAYFINDING SYSTEM NOT JUST IN
20 THE MARKET OF HOW WE SEE THE SYSTEM TODAY BUT A MARKET THAT'S
21 VIABLE TEN OR EVEN 20 YEARS DOWN THE LINE. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS OF ARE THERE ANY OTHER HANDS FROM
24 THE MEMBER OF THIS BODY? AND IF NOT, I HAVE SOME QUESTIONS AND
25 COMMENTS. I SEE THAT IAN GRIFFITHS HAS A HAND. GO AHEAD.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU FOR THIS PRESENTATION. AND I MEAN,
3 OVERALL, I'M REALLY EXCITED ABOUT THIS WORK. I THINK THIS IS A
4 REALLY IMPORTANT PROJECT, AND IT'S A REALLY AMAZING
5 OPPORTUNITY AND LONG OVERDUE. I -- YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S
6 REALLY CONNECTED TO THE DISCUSSION WE HAD IN THE LAST ITEM
7 ABOUT THE REGIONAL MEASURE, AND FIRST, A LOT OF THE STANDARDS
8 THAT WILL BE DEVELOPED FOR THIS PROCESS, WE DON'T HAVE THE
9 MONEY TO IMPLEMENT AND ROLL OUT THESE NEW STANDARDS UNTIL WE
10 GET SOME MAJOR SOURCE OF CAPITAL. THE WAYFINDING INITIATIVE IS
11 A BIG ADVERTISING CAMPAIGN FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE BECAUSE IT'S
12 SOMETHING WE CAN WAVE IN FRONT OF THE VOTERS AND SAY LOOK AT
13 THIS UNIFIED BRANDING AND WAYFINDING IMPROVED INFORMATION
14 SYSTEM THAT WOULD BE EASILY NAVIGABLE. THIS IS ONE -- THIS IS
15 SOMETHING THAT BY VOTING FOR A NEW MEASURE THAT YOU WOULD BE
16 GETTING. SO, I THINK IT'S -- I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT, AS WE
17 DEVELOP THESE DESIGNS TO THINK OF THIS AS BUILDING A CASE TO
18 THE PUBLIC FOR WHY WE SHOULD FUND PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND THAT
19 GETS ME TO THE KIND OF -- I HEARD MENTION OF THE TIER THREE,
20 AS, SORT OF, THE ASPIRATION OF THIS EFFORT, OR AT LEAST WHAT
21 IS AN AGREED UPON. I KNOW THAT MY UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT TIER
22 THREE MEANS, FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DON'T REMEMBER FROM THE
23 PRESENTATION OF THE WAYFINDING BUSINESS CASES, IT'S -- IT WAS
24 THE LEVEL OF, YOU KNOW, UNIFIED WAYFINDING WHEREBY OPERATOR
25 IDENTITIES ARE BEING MAINTAINED BUT WE STANDARDIZE CERTAIN



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 ASPECTS OF THE SYSTEM AND IT DOESN'T ASSUME ANY KIND OF CHANGE
2 TO GOVERNANCE. IT DOESN'T ASSUME A FUNDAMENTAL CHANGE IN A
3 NETWORK MANAGER WHEREBY YOU KNOW, IT ASSUMES THAT OPERATORS
4 WOULD CONTINUE TO DETERMINE THEIR OWN FARES, AND THAT WE
5 WOULDN'T HAVE A UNIFIED FARE SYSTEM. IT CONTRASTED IN THE
6 BUSINESS CASE WITH TIER FOUR WHICH IS A WAYFINDING SYSTEM
7 THAT, YOU KNOW, WOULD BE FULLY UNIFIED WHERE OPERATOR
8 IDENTITIES WOULD BE BASICALLY NOT NEEDED AT ALL. BECAUSE THEIR
9 WOULD BE MUCH MORE UNITY IN THE SERVICE ITSELF, IN THE -- SO,
10 TO ME, THE TIER FOUR IS -- AND THE BUSINESS CASE SHOWED THAT
11 THERE WERE REAL BENEFITS, MAJOR, BUT, LIKE, PURSUING THE MORE
12 UNIFIED APPROACH ACTUALLY WOULD RESULT IN GREATER TRANSIT
13 RIDERSHIP, LOWER GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. I DO HAVE A
14 QUESTION HERE. BUT MY QUESTION IS, HOW FLEXIBLE IS THIS DESIGN
15 APPROACH TO KIND OF GET US TOWARDS TIER FOUR, ULTIMATELY? AND,
16 AS, YOU KNOW, AND IN THE DISCUSSION OF HOW, IN TERMS OF
17 GOVERNANCE, THAT WOULD BE COMING OUT OF THIS PROJECT, IS IT
18 JUST ASSUMING THAT IT'S GOING TO RECOMMEND GOVERNANCE OF THE
19 STATUS QUO? OR IS IT GOING TO BE MAKING RECOMMENDATIONS THAT
20 WOULD IMAGINE, YOU KNOW, A DIFFERENT FORM OF NETWORK
21 MANAGEMENT THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT WOULD BE CONTEMPLATED AS PART
22 OF THE INTERIM NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE THAT WE WERE JUST
23 TALKING ABOUT?
24



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **AARON PRIVEN:** LET ME ANSWER THE TIER QUESTION FIRST. NOT
2 EVERYBODY IS FAMILIAR WITH THE THINGS ESTABLISHED IN THE
3 PREVIOUS PHASE OF THE PROJECT AND THE DIFFERENT PHASES OF TIER
4 INTEGRATION THAT WE TALKED ABOUT. OUR MANDATE EXPLICITLY IS TO
5 SAY WE'RE GOING TO DO TIER THREE NOW BUT MAKE SURE ALL OF WORK
6 IS POTENTIALLY COMPATIBLE WITH MOVING TO TIER FOUR IN THE
7 FUTURE. WHERE OTHER INTEGRATIONS SUPPORT THAT. YOU CAN'T --
8 FARE INTEGRATION IS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF ONE WHERE THE REASON YOU
9 KNOW THAT YOUR PASS WORKS ON ONE AGENCY AND NOT ANOTHER IS
10 BECAUSE THOSE AGENCIES, OPERATOR AGENCIES EXIST, THOSE
11 IDENTITIES EXIST, SO THAT YOU KNOW THAT LINE 30 AND GOLDEN
12 GATE TRANSIT IS YOUR PASS GOOD ON THAT, BUT NOT LINE 30 A FEW
13 BLOCKS AWAY ON MUNI. WE NEED TO KNOW THOSE THINGS. SO UNTIL
14 THOSE THINGS GO AWAY, WE CAN'T -- WE NEED THAT INFORMATION IN
15 THE WAYFINDING, AS WELL. NOW, AGAIN, WHEN, IF THAT -- IF THOSE
16 CAN BE FURTHER INTEGRATED AS PART OF THE FARE COORDINATION
17 PROCESS, WE'RE PREPARED AND OUR MANDATE INCLUDES THE EXPLICIT
18 DIRECTION TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT CAN HAPPEN. SO WE'LL BE DOING
19 EVERYTHING WE CAN TO MAKE SURE IT'S COMPATIBLE WITH THAT,
20 SHOULD THAT BE AVAILABLE. OUR GOVERNANCE MANDATE, WHEN THEY
21 TALK ABOUT GOVERNANCE, IT'S A LITTLE BIT LOWER LEVEL THAN THE,
22 SORT OF, OVERALL GOVERNANCE LIKE WHO DOES NETWORK MANAGEMENT.
23 THAT'S PART OF THE THINGS THAT PEOPLE WHO WORKED ON THE
24 PREVIOUS ITEM IN THIS MEETING WERE TALKING ABOUT OUR
25 GOVERNANCE IS MORE ABOUT WHO IS GOING TO IMPLEMENT THE SIGNS



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 WHO GOING TO GO OUT THERE WITH A PIECE OF PAPER AND PUT THEM
2 UP IF THE MAP CHANGES THOSE KINDS OF THINGS. HOW DO WE ARRANGE
3 THOSE KINDS OF THINGS. WE'RE GOING FIT INTO THE PROCESS THE
4 REGIONAL NETWORK COORDINATION SO THAT THE WE'LL BE PART OF
5 THAT.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** I THINK I CAN ADD, ONE OF THE THINGS WE WORKED@A
8 PRACTICAL LEVEL IS TO MAKE SURE THAT WHERE WE ARE DESIGNING
9 COSTLY ITEMS, LIKE STATION SIGNAGE, IDENTITY ELEMENTS OUTSIDE,
10 THAT IF THEY ARE LIKELY TO CHANGE, TO BE BETTER INTEGRATED
11 THAT THAT CAN BE DONE AT LOW COST. OR THAT WE MAKE A DECISION
12 ABOUT WHERE -- WE MAKE A SMART DECISION ABOUT WHERE YOU
13 IMPLEMENT THESE BECAUSE IF THE DIRECTION OF TRAVEL IS PROVING
14 ITSELF THROUGHOUT BUSINESS CASE REEVALUATION, THEN PERHAPS
15 HOLD OFF ON THAT SO THE IMPLEMENTATION PHASING THE WAYFINDING
16 DESIGN CAN TAKE INTO ACCOUNT TRANSITION FROM TIER 3 TO 4. AND
17 FOR THOSE WHO AREN'T ACQUAINTED WITH TIER 3 AND 4, WHEREAS IS
18 THERE A SINGLE SYMBOL THAT REPRESENTS THE ENTIRE ACTIVE
19 NETWORK, OR DO WE AND HOW DID WE CONTINUE THE ACCOUNTS OF
20 LANGUAGE OF TRANSIT BASED AROUND OPERATOR SYSTEM IDENTITY VERY
21 MUCH AT THE MOMENT SO THERE IS VALUE FOR EXISTING USERS OF NOT
22 MESSING AROUND WITH SYSTEM IDENTITY. THERE IS A LOT OF PRIDE
23 AND HISTORY AROUND EXISTING OPERATOR ENTITY BUT THE NEW USER
24 AND MARKETS FOR ALL THIS WORK OBVIOUSLY THEY ARE INVESTED IN
25 THAT. SO OUR PART OF THE EXERCISE IS WORKING WITH THE PUBLIC



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 AND OPERATORS COMPARING CONTRAST AND PERSPECTIVES. THAT WE'RE
2 DOING IN OUR DESIGN IS TO PRODUCE A PRODUCT AND SET OF
3 STANDARDS THAT FITS AS CLOSELY AS POSSIBLE THAT CAN SHIFT FROM
4 ONE TIER TO THE OTHER. LOOKING AROUND THE WORLD AS BEST
5 SYSTEMS APPROACH, A SINGLE SYSTEM IDENTITY BUT YOU ARE IN WAY
6 AWAY FROM THAT IN TERMS OF THE EXISTING SYSTEM AND THE WAY
7 THAT PEOPLE CURRENTLY UNDERSTAND IT.

8

9 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, GOT SEEING OTHER
12 MEMBERS OF THE BODY WITH HANDS YET. I HAVE SOME QUESTIONS AND
13 COMMENTS. SO I WANTED TO BUILD ON MANAGE THAT WENDI KALLINS
14 SAID WHICH IS THAT -- AND THE RESPONSE. SO, EVEN THOUGH IT MAY
15 NOT MAKE SENSE FOR OUR REGION TO MAKE A BESPOKE APP, IT DOES
16 SEEM TO BE IN THE HANDS OF THE PUBLIC SECTOR TO PROVIDE THE
17 DATA AND, YOU KNOW, INCLUDING REALTIME DATA AROUND WHEN THE
18 BUS IS ARRIVING, FOR EXAMPLE. SO, IS THERE A CONNECTION
19 BETWEEN THE WAYFINDING PROJECT AND THE SERVICE THAT MTC OWNS,
20 WHICH IS ON THE -- OR SHEPHERDS OR SOMETHING, ON THE REALTIME
21 DATA? AND I'LL -- AND IS THAT, LIKE, INTEGRATED INTO NETWORK
22 MANAGEMENT, FOR THE REALTIME DATA? I'LL HAVE A FOLLOW UP
23 QUESTION BUT FIRST I WANTED TO CHECK ON THAT.

24



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **AARON PRIVEN:** THE QUICK ANSWER IS MTC IS WORKING ON ALL THESE
2 THINGS AND WE TALK TO EACH OTHER BUT THEY'RE NOT THE SAME
3 PROJECT. THERE IS NOT LIKE, WE'RE NOT SITTING HERE THINKING
4 ABOUT NETWORK MANAGEMENT OF THE DATA WHEN WE'RE DOING A
5 WAYFINDING PROJECT. WE'RE TALKING TO THEM, AND ANY DIGITAL
6 WAYFINDING WE PROVIDE MAY BE USED AND MTC HAS BEEN PROVIDING
7 THAT AND COORDINATING AND PROVIDING THAT REGIONAL DATA FOR A
8 LONG TIME NEARLY AS LONG AS I HAVE BEEN IN TRANSIT, 20
9 SOMETHING YEARS. I THINK EXPECTATION IS THAT WAYFINDING
10 PROJECT WILL BE A CLIENT OF THAT DATA AND WE TALK ABOUT THE
11 PLATFORM WE'RE DEVELOPING MAPPING ENTITIES DEVELOPING THAT'S
12 BEING WORKED ON BY THE PEOPLE ON THE DATA SIDE AND THE
13 PLATFORM THEY'RE DEVELOPING WILL BE ABLE TO BE USED IN
14 ADDITION TO OTHER PURPOSES FOR WAYFINDING AND MAPPING THAT
15 WE'RE DOING SO THAT WE CAN USE THAT PLATFORM FOR TO CREATE ALL
16 THE DIFFERENTLY MAPS THAT WILL NEED TO BE CREATED AT ALL THE
17 DIFFERENT SITES THERE. IS DEFINITELY COMMUNICATION ON THIS BUT
18 WE'RE NOT THINKING ABOUT IT IN TERMS OF PART, THEY'RE NOT THE
19 SAME THING. THEY'RE DIFFERENT THINGS BUT RELATED WE'RE TALKING
20 TO EACH OTHER. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. BECAUSE IT SEEMS LIKE THIS PROJECT
23 WOULD BE BOTH A CONSUMER OF THAT DATA AND POSSIBLY A
24 RECOMMENDER OF FEATURES AND IMPROVEMENTS OF THE REALTIME DATA
25 SYSTEM, WHICH BRINGS ME TO MY NEXT QUESTION. I WAS REALLY



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 INTRIGUED BY THE MENTION OF PROCESS BECAUSE THESE ARE ALSO
2 GOING TO BE, LIKE, IF YOU THINK ABOUT, LIKE, DATA, AND
3 REALTIME DATA, AND THE IDEA OF HAVING A UNIFIED SIGN WHERE I'M
4 COMING TO DIRIDON STATION AND I'M SEEING, YOU KNOW, LIKE, WHEN
5 IS THE TRAIN LEAVING, AND WHEN IS THE NEXT BUS LEAVING IN CASE
6 I HAVE MORE THAN ONE CHOICE ABOUT WHERE TO GO. AND, ALSO, IN
7 TERMS OF INFORMATION ABOUT TRANSFERS AND, AM I GOING TO MAKE
8 MY CONNECTION OR MISS MY CONNECTION. SO, IS WHAT YOU'RE DOING
9 WORKING WITH AND GIVING FEEDBACK INTO THE PROCESSES,
10 ESPECIALLY INVOLVING, LIKE, MULTIPLE AGENCIES AROUND WHAT TO
11 DO WITH TRANSFERS AND EXCEPTIONS AND DELAYS. WILL THIS PROJECT
12 BE GIVING FEEDBACK INTO AGENCIES FOR HOW TO REFINE THEIR
13 PROCESSES FOR TRANSFERS AND DELAYS?

14

15 **AARON PRIVEN:** I GUESS I CAN ONLY SAY WE'RE NOT THERE YET IN
16 TERMS OF GETTING DOWN TO THE LEVEL OF DETAIL THAT WOULD BE
17 REQUIRED. WE'RE GETTING INVOLVED, WE HAVE A DIGITAL WAYFINDING
18 STANDARD NOW PART OF THE HUB SIGNAGE PROGRAM IT'S BEEN AROUND
19 FOR TEN YEARS AND OBVIOUSLY WILL NEED TO BE IMPROVED. WE DON'T
20 KNOW NECESSARILY WHAT THAT WILL INCLUDE TO THE EXTENT THAT
21 INCLUDES FEEDBACK AND INTER-AGENCY, TRANSFERS COORDINATION, IN
22 TERMS OF ALL THESE THINGS. I THINK WE CAN CERTAINLY LOOK INTO
23 THAT BUT I DON'T THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE HEARD YET SO I
24 DON'T THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE WOULD NEED TO DO.

25



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** FOR SOMEONE WHO HAS HAD A BART CALTRAIN
2 DYSFUNCTION JUST THIS LAST WEEK WOULD CONSIDER THAT FEEDBACK
3 MADE. ON THE PILOT, IS THERE A -- HAVE THERE BEEN LOCATIONS
4 IDENTIFIED FOR THE PILOTS?

5

6 **AARON PRIVEN:** THERE ARE SEVERAL LEVELS OF THINGS, A SERIES OF
7 PROTOTYPES THAT ARE INITIAL TESTS THAT WE'RE GOING TO USE TO
8 FIGURE OUT WHAT THE INITIAL DESIGN STANDARDS LOOK LIKE AND SO
9 ON. THOSE HAVE NOT BEEN DETERMINED. THERE -- SUBSEQUENT TO THE
10 PROTOTYPES BEING CREATED AND EVALUATED, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE
11 SOME SUBREGIONAL PILOTS THAT WILL IMPLEMENT THE PROGRAM ON A
12 COUNTY-WIDE LEVEL. SO WE KNOW THAT SONOMA COUNTY IS THE FIRST
13 ONE OF THOSE. AND THEN THERE WILL BE OTHER COUNTIES,
14 SUBSEQUENT TENTATIVELY IDENTIFIED IN SOLANO AND THEN AREAS
15 EAST OF THE HILLS IN ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA COUNTIES. BUT
16 THOSE ARE NOT 100% NOT LOCKED DOWN BUT I THINK THE SONOMA S
17 WHAT ISN'T DONE YET IS DECIDING THIS INITIAL PROTOTYPING WHERE
18 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THE INITIAL SET AND WHAT IT SHOULD LOOK
19 LIKE OR WHAT IT SHOULD BE IF IT'S NOT A VISUAL THING. THEN
20 THOSE ARE THINGS WE'RE STILL WORKING ON AND AS PART OF THE
21 PROCESS OF CREATING THAT.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

24



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I WANTED TO LIFT UP WHAT MEMBER GRIFFITHS
2 TALKED ABOUT IN POTENTIALLY BEING READY FOR TIER FOUR. BECAUSE
3 THIS PILOTING AND PROTOTYPING AND SO ON IS GOING TO BE
4 HAPPENING IN PARALLEL FOR UNDERLYING WORK FOR A POTENTIAL
5 REGIONAL MEASURE. AND WHEN WE -- THERE WAS A TYPE TIME WHEN
6 THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING STUDY AND THE FARE INTEGRATION
7 STUDY WERE HAPPENING AT THE SAME TIME, AND IT WAS CONCLUDED
8 THAT YOU CAN'T GET TO TIER FOUR IF YOU HAVE DIFFERENT BASE
9 FARES AND DIFFERENT FARE STRUCTURE FOR DIFFERENT TYPES OF
10 TRANSIT THE FARE STUDY DID RECOMMEND A SINGLE FARE STRUCTURE
11 FOR THE REGIONAL SERVICES BUT DID NOT GET THERE FOR THE LOCAL
12 SERVICES BECAUSE IT WAS, IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO GET TO A
13 SINGLE LEVEL FOR THE LOCAL SERVICES, EITHER THAT WOULD NEED TO
14 LOWER THE PRICE, WHICH WOULD NEGATIVELY IMPACT AGENCY BUDGETS,
15 OR INCREASE THAT LOCAL FARE, WHICH WOULD NEGATIVELY IMPACT
16 SOME LOW-INCOME TRANSIT RIDERS. SO, WITHOUT ADDITIONAL FUNDING
17 THAT WASN'T FEASIBLE, BUT SINCE THERE IS GOING TO BE THINKING
18 AND ANALYSIS ABOUT NEW FUNDING AS IT RELATES TO FARES AND THE
19 AMOUNT OF DIFFERENCE IN A LOCAL BUS FARE IS RELATIVELY SLIM
20 COMPARED TO THE OVERALL AMOUNT OF FUNDING. LIKE, THAT SEEMS
21 LIKE A PRACTICAL PIECE OF ANALYSIS ABOUT, LIKE, WELL WHAT
22 WOULD IT COST TO ACTUALLY BRING THE LOCAL FARES TO THE SAME
23 LEVEL AND WHAT WOULD BE THE RELATIVE BENEFITS IN TERMS EASE OF
24 USE AND TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, AS WELL AS THE WAYFINDING. SO, I
25 THINK THAT WITHIN THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS OF PLANNING, THAT



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 MIGHT BE A QUESTION TO REVISIT AGAIN AS TO WHETHER WE MIGHT BE
2 -- WANT TO, AND BE ABLE TO GET THERE. SO, JUST WANTED TO PUT
3 THAT INTO THE CONTEXT OF THOSE OTHER PROCESSES. AND I EXPECT
4 THERE WILL BE QUESTIONS ABOUT AUDITORY, AND TACTILE CUES FOR
5 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES.

6

7 **AARON PRIVEN:** TO YOUR POINT ABOUT THE WAYFINDING BENEFITS OF
8 FARE INTEGRATION ARE WELL TAKEN AND I CERTAINLY WOULD
9 SUBSCRIBE TO THOSE AS WELL.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YES SO I GUESS THE FEEDBACK THERE IS, AS
12 WE GO INTO THAT FUNDING DISCUSSION, MY RECOMMENDATION IS THAT
13 WE SHOULD COLLECTIVELY CONSIDER THAT AS A POTENTIAL
14 EXPENDITURE AND WHAT THE POTENTIAL BENEFITS MIGHT BE INCLUDING
15 FOR THE WAYFINDING. OKAY. SO, WITH THAT, SEEING NO MORE HANDS.
16 THERE WAS SOMEBODY FROM BART WHO HAD A HAND, BUT I DON'T SEE
17 THAT ANYMORE. SO, WE'LL GO TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. ARE THERE
18 ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS FROM
21 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO, I DO SEE SEVERAL HANDS. STARTING
24 WITH VEDA FLOREZ. VEDA FLOREZ, ARE YOU MUTED? SEEM LIKE YOU
25 ARE MUTED.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE BEING
3 RECOGNIZED. I WANT TO SAY I'M EXTREMELY HAPPY TO LEARN THE
4 INFORMATION AND VIEW THE TIMELINE FOR -- LOOKING THROUGH MY
5 NOTES -- WHAT I WANT TO SAY IS I'M EXCITED TO LEARN MORE ABOUT
6 THE REALTIME SIGNAGE AND I THINK THAT IT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO -
7 - AND I'M WONDERING IF YOU WILL HAVE REALTIME UPDATES SUCH AS
8 GOLDEN GATE, BUS NUMBER FIVE IS RUNNING TEN MINUTES LATE. WILL
9 WE GET THAT, SORT OF, DRILL-DOWN INFORMATION? I ALSO WANT TO
10 CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO THE INTER-AGENCY TIMELINE, OR INTER-
11 AGENCY -- OH HERE WE GO. HERE ARE MY NOTES. INTER-AGENCY
12 INFORMATION. GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT HAS UPDATED ITS SCHEDULE 3 TO
13 4 TIMES IN THE LAST THREE MONTHS SO IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO
14 MAKE SURE WE HAVE THAT ALL PUT TOGETHER AND ALL IN ONE PLACE.
15 SO, STILL CONTINUING TO LOOK FOR MY NOTES. AND, I ALSO WANTED
16 TO BRING YOUR ATTENTION TO SOME NEW INFORMATION. AND I'M SORRY
17 FOR BEING SO SCATTERED AT THE MOMENT. TODAY IS MY BIRTHDAY BUT
18 I DEFINITELY WANTED TO TUNE IN TODAY AND GIVE YOU INFORMATION.
19 SO, IF IT'S -- PLEASE, IF YOU ADINA IF YOU COULD CALL ON ME IN
20 FIVE MORE MINUTES AT THE END OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT SO I CAN
21 ADD MORE INFORMATION. WOULD THAT BE POSSIBLE?

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** CAN WE GIVE VEDA ANOTHER 30 SECONDS AT THE
24 END?

25



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** SURE.

2

3 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. SO I SEE THAT FRANK WELTE HAS A
4 HAND.

5

6 **FRANK WELTE:** HELLO. I HAVE BEEN LISTENING TO THIS
7 PRESENTATION, AND I'LL BE BLUNT. IN MY OPINION, BASED ON WHAT
8 I'M HEARING, I'M PREDICTING RIGHT NOW, THAT THE WAYFINDING
9 PROJECT WILL FAIL THE BAY AREA BLIND COMMUNITY. BECAUSE I
10 DON'T HEAR, IN ANYTHING YOU'RE SAYING, THAT YOU HAVE DONE
11 ANYTHING CLOSE TO AN ADEQUATE JOB OF PREPARING TO ADDRESS THE
12 WAYFINDING NEEDS OF PEOPLE WHO ARE BLIND OR VISUALLY IMPAIRED
13 IN THE BAY AREA. ALL I'M HEARING IS TALKING ABOUT SIGNAGE. AND
14 GUESS WHAT? BLIND PEOPLE DON'T DO SIGNAGE, IN CASE YOU DON'T
15 KNOW THAT. YOU HAVE A VAGUE REFERENCE TO AT SOME POINT, DOING
16 SOMETHING -- GOOD KNOWS WHAT, DID NON-VISUAL INFORMATION WITH
17 NO DEFINITION WHATSOEVER OF WHAT THAT MEANS. I'M GUESSING THAT
18 YOU DON'T HAVE ANY BLIND PEOPLE ON STAFF TO TELL WHAT YOU THAT
19 MEANS. SO, I DON'T KNOW WHAT PLAN YOU HAD TO ACTUALLY FIND
20 THAT INFORMATION. SO TELL ME WHY I SHOULDN'T BELIEVE THAT THIS
21 PROJECT IS DOOMED?

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SO, FRANK, IF THAT IS THE END OF YOUR
24 COMMENT, I WOULD LIKE TO TURN THIS OVER TO STAFF AND THE
25 CONSULTANTS TO ASK WHAT IS BEING DONE TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 PROJECT MEETS THE WAYFINDING NEEDS OF PEOPLE WHO ARE BLIND AND
2 VISUALLY IMPAIRED.

3

4 **AARON PRIVEN:** WHAT I CAN SAY RIGHT NOW IS THAT WE'RE VERY MUCH
5 DEVELOPING WORK AROUND THE SCOPE OF THE NON-VISUAL INFORMATION
6 THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. WE KNOW THAT WE HAVE A LOT TO EXPAND
7 ON, THAT WE DIDN'T GO TO INTO THIS VERY FULLY IN THE PHASES OF
8 THE PROJECT AND WE KNOW WE HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO DO AND WE'RE
9 PREPARED TO DO THAT. I THINK THAT WE NEED TO -- THAT'S ONE OF
10 THE REASONS WE'RE HERE IS TO TALK ABOUT, IS TO GET PEOPLE'S
11 INPUT ABOUT WHO WE SHOULD BE TALKING TO AND HOW WE SHOULD BE
12 INCLUDING PEOPLE IN THE PROCESS. AND WE KNOW THAT THERE ARE A
13 LOT OF PEOPLE OUT THERE WHO ARE WORKING ON THESE ISSUES, AND
14 WE'RE HAPPY TO WORK WITH THEM TO MAKE THIS A REALITY. I WOULD
15 HOPE THAT IT'S A LITTLE EARLY TO SAY THAT WE'RE DOOMED, BUT I
16 AGREE THAT IT'S A RISK THAT WE HAVE TO TAKE THAT IF WE DON'T
17 DO A GOOD JOB OF THIS, IT WILL NOT WORK FOR EVERYONE AND THAT
18 INCLUDES FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE BLIND OR WHO HAVE VISUAL
19 IMPAIRMENT. SO WE NEED TO DO THE BEST WE CAN TO MAKE THAT
20 HAPPEN. SO THAT'S REALLY WHAT I CAN SAY RIGHT NOW.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A FOLLOW UP QUESTION TO MAKE SURE
23 THIS IS PURSUED. SO, FRANK, DO YOU HAVE RECOMMENDATIONS OR
24 WHAT RECOMMENDATIONS DO YOU HAVE FOR STAFF AND THE CONSULTANTS
25 ABOUT PEOPLE AND GROUPS THAT NEED TO BE CONSULTED IN ORDER TO



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 BE ABLE TO ADDRESS THOSE NEEDS? AND TAKING THIS OFFLINE IS
2 ALSO A REASONABLE THING TO DO, TOO.

3

4 **FRANK WELTE:** WELL, OF COURSE, MY EMPLOYER, LIGHTHOUSE FOR THE
5 BLIND, VISTA CENTER FOR THE BLIND, EARLY BAUM CENTER. ALL OF
6 THESE, I DON'T KNOW WHERE YOU DIDN'T FIND THEM BEFORE. I'M
7 BEING GRUMPY. I KEEP COMING TO THESE MEETINGS AND ISSUES KEEP
8 COMING UP AND WHAT I KEEP HEARING IS OH YOU'RE RIGHT WE NEED
9 TO START DOING SOMETHING ABOUT THAT. WHEN DO WE START DOING
10 SOMETHING ABOUT IT? NEXT YEAR, FIVE YEARS FROM NOW? 15 YEARS
11 FROM NOW? IT'S NOT ENOUGH TO SAY, OH WE HAVE GOT A PROBLEM. WE
12 NEED TO DO SOMETHING.

13

14 **ADRIENNE BELL:** CAN I JUMP IN, WE HAVE A LOT OF EXPERIENCE
15 WORKING WITH ACCESSIBILITY GROUPS ON OTHER PROJECTS.

16

17 **FRANK WELTE:** IT DOESN'T SHOW.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** WE HAVE ONLY LIMITED TIME TO PRESENT THIS INFORMATION
20 AND OBVIOUSLY AS AARON MENTIONED, WE'RE AT THE POINT OF
21 DEVELOPING THE PLAN. WE WOULD LIKE TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE
22 GROUPS AND HAPPY TO ENGAGE AND EXPAND THAT FURTHER.
23 CONSIDERATION OF GROUPS AND PROJECTS, ACCESSIBILITY ADVISORY
24 COMMITTEES INCLUDING US DEVELOPING TACTILE AND BRAILLE
25 INFORMATION IN DUAL LANGUAGE FOR SIGNS AND WE HAVE DEVELOPED



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 AUDIT TORE SYSTEMS ELSEWHERE. WE HAVE BEEN VERY OPEN TO THE
2 DESIGN CHALLENGE OF NON-VISUAL AND OTHER FORMS OF INFORMATION
3 AND WILL CERTAINLY DO EVERYTHING WE CAN TO ENGAGE WITH AS MANY
4 VOICES AS POSSIBLE AND MAKE INFORMATION ACCESSIBLE IN DESIGN.
5 INCLUDING WORK WITH UNIVERSITIES TO INCLUDE NON-VISUAL
6 INFORMATION. IT'S OUR COMMITMENT TO DO THAT AND WE'LL HAPPILY
7 WORK WITH WHOEVER HAS GOT AN OPINION ON THAT, AND PERHAPS IF I
8 COULD ASK TO REFLECT A LITTLE BIT IF IT'S OKAY WITH THE CHAIR
9 TO TALK ABOUT HOW THE ENGAGEMENT PROCESS MIGHT WORK WITH THE
10 COMMUNITY GROUPS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** IF IT'S OKAY. I'LL HOP IN.

13

14 **EZRA KONG:** YES. WE DO PLAN ON SEEING IF WE CAN PARTNER WITH
15 FOLKS LIKE WHITE HOUSE AND, ALSO, LIKE CENTERS LIKE SENIOR
16 DISABILITY ACTION. BUT, I JUST WANT TO SAY, LIKE, IN GENERAL,
17 THE ENGAGEMENT TEAM, WE REALLY UNDERSTAND THAT ONE OF THE KEY
18 COMMUNITIES THAT WE NEED TO WORK WITH TO DESIGN OUT THE
19 WAYFINDING MATERIALS IS FOLKS WHO ARE -- WHO HAVE LIMITED SITE
20 OR WHO ARE BLIND AND REALLY PARTNER WITH THEM TO UNDERSTAND
21 WHAT WILL BE ACCESSIBLE, WHAT WILL WORK FOR THEM AND THEIR
22 COMMUNITY. WE ALSO HAVE WORKED WITH DESIGNERS BEFORE,
23 INTERNALLY, WHO HAVE DONE STUDIES FOR US, AND UNDERSTANDING
24 THE WAY THAT DIFFERENT VISUAL IMPAIRMENTS IMPACT HOW CAN
25 INTERACT WITH THINGS IS REALLY IMPORTANT TO US.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I THINK, GIVEN
3 THE IMPORTANCE OF THAT SET OF QUESTIONS, IT WOULD BE GOOD FOR
4 STAFF AND CONSULTANTS TO FOLLOW UP WITH WRITTEN INFORMATION,
5 AND/OR AGENDA ITEMS, EXPLAINING HOW AND WHERE IN THE PROCESS
6 IT WILL WORK TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS PROJECT IS BEING DONE IN A
7 WAY THAT MEETS THE NEEDS OF PEOPLE WITH VISUAL DISABILITIES.
8 SO, I SEE THAT CHRISTINE FITZGERALD HAS A HAND.

9

10 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND AS MENTIONED,
11 REALLY HAVING ACCESSIBILITY FOR THOSE WHO ARE BLIND OR ARE
12 VISUALLY IMPAIRED IS CRITICALLY IMPORTANT. I MYSELF HAVE A
13 VISUAL IMPAIRMENT AND A PHYSICAL IMPAIRMENT. I USE A
14 WHEELCHAIR. WE CANNOT FORGET FOLKS WHO USE OTHER ALTERNATIVE
15 PROCESSES TO GET FROM POINT A TO POINT B. I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE
16 YOU A SCENARIO AND YOU HAVE THINK ABOUT IT A LITTLE BIT.
17 YOU'RE DROPPED IN THE MIDDLE A COUNTRY THAT YOU HAVE NEVER
18 BEEN. YOU CAN'T UNDERSTAND THE SIGN. YOU CAN'T UNDERSTAND THE
19 WORDS ON THE SIGN. YOU CAN'T UNDERSTAND WHAT THINGS ARE GOING
20 ON. YOU CAN'T HEAR VERY WELL. AGAIN, YOU CAN'T UNDERSTAND
21 WHAT'S BEING SAID. SO, THINK OUTSIDE OF BOX. I WOULD ALSO LIKE
22 TO SUGGEST THAT FOLKS WHO ARE BOTH DEAF AND BLIND, FOLKS WHO
23 ARE DEAF OR BLIND HAVE TO USE A LOT OF HAPTICS AND TACTILE
24 INPUT IN ORDER TO UNDERSTAND THINGS. I ALSO WOULD LIKE TO
25 SUGGEST THAT YOU LOOK TO THINGS LIKE THE UNITED WAYS 211



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 INFORMATION PORTAL FOR ALL NON-PROFITS THROUGHOUT THE BAY
2 AREA, AND CERTAINLY LOOKING AT INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTERS AND
3 OTHER CENTERS THAT WORK WITH PEOPLE WITH ALL DISABILITIES, ARE
4 GOING TO BE OF CRITICAL VALUE AS YOU DEVELOP THESE PROCESSES.
5 IF YOU PICK ON ONE -- IF YOU FOCUS ONLY ON ONE ASPECT OF
6 DISABILITY, YOU'RE GOING TO MISS OTHER ASPECTS OF DISABILITY.
7 WE NEED TO HAVE ALL ASPECTS REPRESENTED. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. AND, GOING BACK TO VEDA FLOREZ.
10 VEDA, IF YOU HAVE LOCATED YOUR NOTES, YOU CAN SHARE THE
11 REMAINING THINGS THAT YOU WANTED TO COMMENT ON?

12

13 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR RECOGNIZING ME AGAIN. I
14 WANT TO CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO AN OPPORTUNITY FOR THE
15 INTEGRATED WAYFINDING SYSTEM THIS LOOKS AT THE NEED OF THE
16 GROWING HEARING IMPAIRED COMMUNITY ON THE CUTTING EDGE IS A
17 DIGITAL LOOP TECHNOLOGY. DIGITAL LOOP TECHNOLOGY HAS BECOME
18 THE FOUNDATION FOR HEARING, FRIENDLY, INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES
19 THROUGHOUT THE UNITED STATES. A HEARING LOOP ENABLES CLEAR
20 SOUND FOR A PERSON WITH HEARING LOSS. YOU CAN FIND THEM
21 CURRENTLY AT SUBWAYS, PARTICULATE COUNTERS, TAXIS, AND PASSING
22 THROUGH AIRPORTS AND TRAIN STATIONS. AND CURRENTLY 60% OF THE
23 RESIDENTS IN THE UNITED STATES HAVE A 25% HEARING LOSS. AND AS
24 WE AGE, WE LOSE OUR HEARING. AND PLEASE LOOK AT DIGITAL LOOP
25 TECHNOLOGY TO HELP, NOT JUST THOSE WITH HEARING LOSS, BUT WITH



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 THOSE WHO HAVE OTHER IMPAIRMENTS AS WELL. AND ACCESSIBLE
2 DESIGNS ARE AVAILABLE. AND MTC HAS TO MAKE A FINANCIAL
3 COMMITMENT TO PAY FOR THE NEEDS OF THOSE DISABILITIES. AND,
4 SECONDLY, I WOULD LIKE TO OFFER THE NAME OF A GROUP, A NON-
5 PARTISAN GROUP CALL THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF THE BAY AREA
6 FOR YOU TO SPEAK TO. AND THIS IS AN ORGANIZATION, NON-PARTISAN
7 OF 2500 MEMBERS, FEMALE AND MALE, WHO ARE NOT CURRENTLY PART
8 OF THE CBO GROUP, BUT A WILLING AGENCY THAT CAN MEET A BROAD
9 SPECTRUM OF PEOPLE IN THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. ALSO NOT
10 PART OF THE CBO SYSTEM IS LOCIENNE, A SPANISH LATINX COMMUNITY
11 GROUP IN SONOMA COUNTY, THAT CAN OFFER A DEEP EXPERIENCE FOR
12 THE SPANISH SPEAKING BUS USERS IN SONOMA COUNTY. AND THE TWO
13 LARGER ORGANIZATIONS WILL GIVE STAFF A BIG BITE WITHOUT TAKING
14 A LOT OF STAFF TIME. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I HOPE THAT
15 WE CAN HAVE ANOTHER LOOK AT THIS AS WE PROGRESS DOWN THROUGH
16 THE MONTHS.

17

18 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SO, THANK YOU TO VEDA AND TO EVERYBODY FOR
19 COMMENTING ON THAT, INCLUDING STAFF AND CONSULTANTS THAT ARE
20 WORKING ON THIS IMPORTANT AND WELCOME AND LONG AWAITED
21 PROJECT. SO, THANK YOU. WANTED TO MOVE OVER TO AGENDA ITEM
22 NUMBER SIX, FOR NEW BUSINESS WHERE MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE
23 MAY BRING UP NEW BUSINESS ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO
24 A FUTURE AGENDA. AND ANY -- IS THERE ANYONE WHO HAS ANY SUCH?
25 I SEE A HAND THAT IS FROM RICH HEDGES.



JANUARY 9, 2023

1

2 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HI. THIS IS MORE IN THE WAY OF ANNOUNCEMENT.
3 ON DECEMBER THE 12th, I WAS APPOINTED TO THE SAN MATEO CITY
4 COUNCIL. AND IN DISCUSSING MY ROLE HERE, WITH THERESE
5 MCMILLAN, WE HAVE DECIDED THERE MAY BE SOME CONFLICT OF
6 INTEREST IN THE FUTURE. THIS IS REALLY SAD FOR ME. I HAVE BEEN
7 ON THE VARIOUS ADVISORY COUNCILS HERE FOR 20 YEARS. AND, SO, I
8 REALLY VALUE ALL OF THE STAFF PEOPLE I WORKED WITH. SOME OF
9 THEM HAVE RETIRED. THEY WERE HERE LESS THAN I HAVE BEEN, IN
10 SOME CASES. I VALUE ALL OF YOU. I WILL BE TUNING IN. BUT AS OF
11 NOVEMBER 1ST, I WILL NO LONGER BE VISITING THESE MEETINGS AS
12 SOMEONE IN YOUR STATURE. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR ONGOING
15 SERVICE TO THE COMMUNITY ON THE SAN MATEO CITY COUNCIL. DOES
16 ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY NEW ITEMS OF BUSINESS? I AM NOT SEEING
17 ANY MORE HANDS. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC? ANY
18 WRITTEN COMMENT OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WANT TO ADD
19 ITEMS OF NEW BUSINESS? I COMMENT ON ITEMS OF NEW BUSINESS.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT. AND
22 I DON'T SEE ANY HAND RAISED FROM THE PUBLIC.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO, MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
25 SEVEN, PUBLIC COMMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS. THIS IS AN



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 INFORMATION ITEM. AND I WOULD LIKE THE CLERK TO READ THE NAMES
2 OR ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS
3 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO
4 THE RECORD. AND IF ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC HAVE ITEMS THAT
5 ARE -- FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA, PLEASE DO RAISE YOUR HAND.
6 I SEE ALETA DUPREE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR ADINA LEVIN. ALETA DUPREE
9 FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. THIS WAS HEAVY. VERY INFORMATIVE.
10 I THOUGHT I WOULD SAVE THE BEST FOR LAST. WAYFINDING AND
11 MAPPING AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT, IT'S REALLY COMPLEX. BUT IT'S
12 BECOMING CLEARER. BECAUSE AS I USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IF A
13 VERY REGIONAL WAY, ESPECIALLY ON MY TRIPS TO THE BAY AREA, I
14 WISH I WAS IN THE BAY AREA RIGHT NOW, BUT WITH ALL THE STORMS
15 GOING ON, I'M HAVING TO HOLD OFF. WITH CONFRONTING 27 AGENCIES
16 WITH ALL DIFFERENT KINDS OF FARE POLICIES, CLIPPER MAKES IT
17 EASY. BUT THERE IS MORE TO IT. WHEN I THINK ABOUT NEGOTIATING
18 TRANSFERS. ESPECIALLY WHEN THERE ARE TRAFFIC AND STREET CLOSER
19 RELATED ISSUES, SUCH AS WITH BERKELEY HALF MARATHON, THAT
20 CAUSE ME TO HAVE TO CHANGE PLANS, AND ESPECIALLY ON WEEKENDS
21 WHEN SERVICE FREQUENCY INTERVALS ARE WIDER, SUCH AS A HALF
22 HOUR ON BART. HOW CAN WE HAVE THE TOOLS? BOTH DIGITAL, AND
23 ALSO NON-DIGITAL? BECAUSE NOT EVERYONE HAS DIGITAL EQUIPMENT
24 TO BE ABLE TO NAVIGATE THESE SYSTEMS. AND I AM A PERSON OF
25 DISABILITIES, AND WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT ACCESSIBILITY IS



JANUARY 9, 2023

1 PARAMOUNT ON OUR SYSTEMS. AND IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT BUILDING
2 ELEVATORS AND ESCALATORS AND PLATFORM STRIPS. BUT MANY OTHER
3 THINGS THAT PEOPLE CAN USE TO MAKE INFORMED DECISIONS. THANK
4 YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NOT SEEING ANY OTHER
7 HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE ON TO
8 ADJOURNMENT TO THE NEXT MEETING, WHICH WILL BE HELD MONDAY
9 FEBRUARY 13TH, 2023, AT 1:00 P.M. AND ANY CHANGES TO THE
10 SCHEDULE WILL BE NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THIS MEETING OF THE
11 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
12 SUBCOMMITTEE IS ADJOURNED FOR TODAY. [ADJOURNED]

13



Broadcasting Government