METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY & ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
3	FRIDAY, MAY 20, 2022 1:00 PM
4	
5	KY-NAM MILLER: IN MY CAPACITY, SUBBING FOR ANNE OLIVIA. I'M
6	CALLING TO ORDER THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS
7	SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING. AND I'LL ASK TO RUN THE ANNOUNCEMENT.
8	[RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL
9	BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN
10	PROVIDED AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE.
11	THIS MEETING IS ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN
12	TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
13	OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
14	USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
15	CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
16	ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
17	PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
18	NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
19	VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
20	INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
21	THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
22	READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION
23	ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT
24	FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE
25	SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.



1	
2	KYNAM MILLER: NEXT UP IS ROLL CALL.
3	
4	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ESUF?
5	
6	SPEAKER: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: FITZGERALD.
9	
10	SPEAKER: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: HANKERSON? PIMPLE?
13	
14	KY-NAM MILLER: I SEE VINAY.
15	
16	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: SCOTT?
17	
18	TERRY SCOTT: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WELTE? WELTE?
21	
22	FRANK WELTE: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WILSON?



1	SPEAKER: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WONG IS HERE.
4	
5	HOWARD WONG: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE QUORUM.
8	
9	KY-NAM MILLER: THANK YOU, WALLY. NOW THAT WE HAVE QUORUM, WE
10	CAN GO ON TO AGENDA ITEM TWO, WHICH IS TO WELCOME YOU ALL TO
11	THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. AND THE REAL SUBSTANTIAL
12	ITEM IS GOING TO BE RUNNING THE ELECTION FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP.
13	AND, JUST A QUICK RECAP, WE OPENED UP NOMINATIONS AT THE LAST
14	MEETING, AND YOU HAVE UP UNTIL NOW TO EITHER NOMINATE YOURSELF
15	OR OTHERS. CURRENTLY, ILAF ESUF AND HANKERSON ARE THE TWO
16	CANDIDATES TO BE CHAIR, AND THERE WAS NO ONE SUBMITTED TO BE
17	VICE CHAIR. WALTER, I SEE YOU ARE UNMUTED. DO YOU HAVE
18	ANYTHING TO ADD?
19	
20	WALTER WILSON: I JUST WANT TO SECOND THE NOMINATION FOR ILAF.
21	
22	KY-NAM MILLER: NOTED. WE'LL GO TO THE CHAIR NOMINATIONS, AND
23	WHEN WE GET TO VICE CHAIR IF NO ONE IS NOMINATED, YOU CAN AT
24	THAT POINT. WITH THAT I'LL INVITE NOMINATIONS FOR THE POLL
25	EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE CHAIR THAT'S GOING TO TAKE



- 1 PLACE IN A FEW MOMENTS FOR MAY 20TH, 2022 THROUGH DECEMBER
- 2 2023. ANY SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
- 3 NOMINATION ARE WELCOME TO DO SO. I SEE A HAND UP. RANDI
- 4 KINMAN, SHE NEEDS TO BE MOVED OVER. JESS, COULD YOU PLEASE
- 5 ALLOW RANDI TO SPEAK? RANDI, CAN YOU UNMUTE YOURSELF? THERE
- 6 YOU GO?

7

8 RANDI KINMAN: THERE WE GO.

9

10 KYNAM MILLER: DO YOU WANT TO TAKE REIGN?

11

- 12 RANDI KINMAN: I DO NOT HAVE THE AGENDA UP. BUT I'M PRETTY SURE
- 13 I KNOW HOW TO DO THIS. WHERE ARE WE AT? WE HAVE A NOMINATION
- 14 AND A SECOND?

15

- 16 KY-NAM MILLER: WE JUST OPENED UP FOR ANY FURTHER NOMINATIONS
- 17 BETWEEN ILAF AND DWAYNE.

- 19 RANDI KINMAN: OKAY. ARE THERE ANY OTHER NOMINATIONS? HEARING
- 20 AND SEEING NONE. WE WILL CLOSE NOMINATIONS. WE'LL DO THIS LIKE
- 21 WE DID IT BEFORE WITH -- SINCE WE HAVE TWO CANDIDATES UP, YOU
- 22 WILL BE CALLED BY ROLL CALL VOTE AND STATE THE NAME OF YOUR
- 23 PREFERRED CANDIDATE, AND IF I COULD -- SO, IT WILL BE -- IT'S
- 24 EITHER ILAF OR DWAYNE. IF I COULD HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE ON
- 25 THAT PLEASE?



1	
2	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES ESUF?
3	
4	HOWARD WONG: HELLO?
5	
6	KY-NAM MILLER: GO AHEAD HOWARD. WHAT'S YOUR QUESTION?
7	
8	RANDI KINMAN: WE WERE GOING TO HAVE OPENING STATEMENTS.
9	
10	HOWARD WONG: HELLO. IS THERE GOING TO BE INTRODUCIONS? I
11	REALLY HAVE NO KNOWLEDGE OF HER BACKGROUND.
12	
13	RANDI KINMAN: WE CAN DO THAT FIRST. SORRY. I'M IN THE MIDDLE
14	OF A CONSTRUCTION PROJECT. OKAY. WE'LL START WITH ILAF THEN GO
15	TO DWAYNE. ILAF, WHY DON'T YOU GIVE THREE MINUTES TO MAKE A
16	STATEMENT.
17	
18	ILAF ESUF: MY NAME IS ILAF ESUF. I HAVE MET WITH ALMOST ALL OF
19	YOU I AM EXCITED ABOUT THE SUBCOMMITTEE BECAUSE IT HONORS THE
20	CORE PRINCIPLE BEHIND THAT I'M DOING IN MY PERSONAL AND
21	PROFESSIONAL CAREER EQUITY IS THE REASON THAT I WORK IN POLICY
22	AND IS WHY I ACCEPT THE A NEW JOB TO BRING COMMUNITY MEMBERS
23	INTO THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS PER ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS. I
24	AM SERVING ON THE EQUITY PRINCIPLE AS A MENTOR FOR FIRST
25	GENERATION STUDENTS IN RICHMOND, AND I FIRMLY BELIEVE THAT WE



NEED COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT IN THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESSES TO 1 MAKE SURE COMMUNITIES REPRESENTED ABOUT THE DECISION THAT IS 2 3 GOING TO IMPACT THEM. AND THAT'S, LIKE I SAID, MY ENTIRE MOTIVATION BEHIND EVERYTHING I DO. AS VICE CHAIR I HAVE BEEN 4 5 WORKING VERY HARD WITH RANDY AND THE VICE CHAIR AND CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION TO THINK OF SYSTEM SUPERVISOR PROCESSES TO MAKE 6 OUR COUNCILS WORK A BIT MORE EFFICIENT WHEN IT COMES TO 7 8 CREATING THAT COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT, MAKING SURE WE ARE CREATING COMMUNITY FEEDBACK IMPLEMENTATION IN A MATTER TO MAKE 9 10 SURE IT'S IN PROCESSES, AND EXPANDING OUR WORK THAT'S IT'S BROUGHT TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE AT-LARGE WE NEED TO HAVE EQUITY 11 BAKED INTO THE FOREFRONT OF OUR PROGRAMS WITH EVERYTHING MTC 12 TOUCHING REGARDLESS OF AGE, REGARDLESS OF SEXUAL ORIENTATION, 13 RACE, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE OUR COMMUNITY MEMBERS FEEL SAFE IN 14 15 THE SERVICES THAT WE PROVIDE. I WOULD LOVE TO DO THAT FOR THE 16 SUBCOMMITTEE AND FOR THE COUNCIL AT-LARGE. THANK YOU. 17 RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. DWAYNE? 18 19 DWAYNE HANKERSON: THANK YOU. MY NAME IS DWAYNE HANKERSON, I 20 HAVE WORKED IN THE LOW-INCOME AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING INDUSTRY 21 FOR THE LAST 20 YEARS. IF YOU LOOK AT ME, I AM WHAT EQUITY AND 22

ACCESS IS ALL ABOUT. I'M GOING TO GET A LITTLE PERSONAL. IT'S

VERY IMPORTANT TO ME AND MY CAREER, AND TO MAKE STATEMENTS AND

TO MOVE FORWARD SOME OF THE POSITIONS THAT THESE COMMITTEES

23

24



- 1 ARE ABOUT, IN BOTH TRANSPORTATION AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WHAT
- 2 I MEAN BY THAT IS, I'M A FIRST GENERATION PROJECT PERSON. I
- 3 WAS RAISED AND I CAME THROUGH THE PROJECTS. I HAVE A COLLEGE
- 4 DEGREE. I'M A MILITARY VETERAN. I DON'T ONLY BELIEVE EOUITY
- 5 AND ACCESS INCLUDES POOR OR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE. I KNOW THAT IF
- 6 WE ARE TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS OF THE FOUNDING FATHERS THAT ALL
- 7 IDEAS ARE IMPORTANT, AND NEED TO BE VIEWED, I'M NOT SAYING
- 8 THEY'RE RIGHT, BUT MAYBE THEY HAVE SOME ESSENCE OF WHAT WE CAN
- 9 USE TO MOVE OUR SOCIETY FORWARD. FOR ME THIS IS CAREER WORK.
- 10 EVEN IF I'M NOT ELECTED, ESUF, SHE IS VERY, VERY QUALIFIED,
- 11 AND I DO RESPECT HER A LOT. I DON'T CONSIDER THIS A
- 12 COMPETITION. THIS IS A WIN-WIN FOR THIS COMMITTEE. SO WHOEVER
- 13 YOU DO CAST YOUR VOTE FOR, YOU'RE GOING TO WIN. THANK YOU.
- 15 KY-NAM MILLER: RANDI, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU ARE OFFLINE.
- 17 RANDI KINMAN: THERE WE GO. IF WE CAN -- I WOULD LIKE TO --
- 18 BEFORE WE TAKE A VOTE I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IF THERE IS PUBLIC
- 19 COMMENT SUBMITTED IN WRITING OR IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF
- 20 THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.
- 22 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 23 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 24 ON THIS ITEM. IF THERE IS ONE PUBLIC PERSON IN THE BUILDING, I

14

16



1	BELIEVE, IF THAT PERSON WANTS TO SPEAK IF THEY COULD PLEASE
2	WALK UP TO THE PODIUM? THERE IS NOBODY THERE
3	
4	RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR
5	COMMENTS BEFORE WE TAKE THE COMMITTEE VOTE? SEEING NO HANDS
6	RAISED. NOW WE WILL TAKE THE VOTE. YOU WILL STATE THE
7	CANDIDATE THAT YOU WISH TO SEE LOOKED.
8	
9	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBERS, IF YOU COULD PLEASE SAY, EITHER
10	ESUF OR HANKERSON WHEN I CALL YOUR NAME. ESUF.
11	
12	SPEAKER: ESUF.
13	
14	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: FITZGERALD? HANKERSON?
15	
16	DWAYNE HANKERSON: HANKERSON.
17	
18	CLERK WALLY CHARLES: MARKHAM?
19	
20	SPEAKER: ILAF.
21	
22	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: FITZGERALD?
23	
24	SPEAKER: ILAF.



1	CLERK, W	ALLY	CHARLES:	ORANTES?
2				
3	SPEAKER:	ILAE	₹.	
4				
5	CLERK, W	ALLY	CHARLES:	PIMPLE?
6				
7	SPEAKER:	ILAE	₹.	
8				
9	CLERK, W	ALLY	CHARLES:	SCOTT?
10				
11	TERRY SC	OTT:	ESUF.	
12				
13	CLERK, W	ALLY	CHARLES:	WELTE?
14				
15	SPEAKER:	ESUE	₹.	
16				
17	CLERK, W	ALLY	CHARLES:	WILSON?
18				
	WALTER W	ILSON	N: ILAF.	
20				
	CLERK, W	ALLY	CHARLES:	WONG?
22				_
	HOWARD WO	ONG:	HANKERSO	Ν.
24				



1	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: TWO VOTES FOR HANKERSON AND THE OTHERS
2	ARE FOR ESUF.
3	
4	RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. THAT IS THE MAJORITY VOTE. WITH THAT,
5	WE WILL CLOSE THAT ELECTION. ILAF, DO YOU WANT ME TO RUN THE
6	VICE CHAIR ELECTION BEFORE I TURN IT OVER TO YOU.
7	
8	ILAF ESUF: YES, PLEASE.
9	
10	RANDI KINMAND: AT THIS POINT, WE HAVE NO NOMINATIONS. THE
11	FLOOR IS OPEN FOR NOMINATIONS FOR VICE CHAIR.
12	
13	WALTER WILSON: I WOULD LIKE TO NOMINATE HANKERSON. THIS IS
14	WALTER WILSON.
15	
16	RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER NOMINATIONS? IS THERE A
17	SECOND FOR THAT NOMINATION?
18	
19	SPEAKER: SECOND.
20	
21	SPEAKER: I WANT TO NOMINATE MARKHAM.
22	
23	RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER NOMINATIONS?
24	
25	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I WOULD LIKE TO NOMINATE MYSELF.



1	
2	RANDI KINMAN: OKAY. SO WE HAVE THREE NOMINATIONS.
3	
4	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: NOMINATIONS ARE MARKHAM, HANKERSON, AND
5	FITZGERALD; CORRECT?
6	
7	RANDI KINMAN: YES. WHAT WE WILL DO IS, WE WILL GO IN
8	ALPHABETICAL ORDER, AND YOU EACH HAVE THREE MINUTES TO EXPLAIN
9	YOUR POSITIONS OR WHAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO ACCOMPLISH AS THE
10	VICE CHAIR OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS
11	SUBCOMMITTEE. FITZGERALD.
12	
13	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: TECHNOLOGY. OKAY. MY NAME IS CHRISTINE.
14	I HAVE BEEN AN ADVOCATE SINCE I WAS BORN. I HAVE HAD TO WORK
15	THROUGH A LOT EQUITY AND ACCESS ISSUES ALONG THE WAY. I AM
16	CURRENTLY SERVING AS ADVOCATE FOR THE SILICON VALLEY
17	INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTER. A LOT OF WHAT I DO IS ACTUALLY WHAT
18	WE WOULD DO HERE IN THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE AND
19	THAT IS TO ADDRESS ISSUES OF GREAT IMPORTANCE TO THE
20	DISABILITY COMMUNITY AND ALL COMMUNITIES REALLY. WHEN WE LOOK
21	AT WHAT IT MEANS TO BE EQUITABLE IN A WORLD, WE REALLY HAVE TO
22	BE HONEST ABOUT THE INEQUITIES AND HOW IT AFFECTS FOLKS THAT
23	HAVE GOTTEN THE SHORT SHRIFT IN THE PAST. AND IT ELEVATES
24	THOSE FOLKS ALONG THE WAY. AND I WOULD BE VERY HONORED TO

25

SERVE AS VICE CHAIR.



1 2 RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. MR. HANKERSON. YOUR TURN. THREE 3 MINUTES. 4 5 DWAYNE HANKERSON: MY NAME IS DWAYNE HANKERSON. FROM MY 6 STATEMENT BEFORE, I WOULD JUST LIKE TO ADD THAT I HAVE EXPERIENCE IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING. I HAVE DEALT WITH LOW AND 7 8 MEDIUM INCOME PEOPLE. I HAVE EXPERTISE IN ADMINISTRATION AND HOW TO RUN PROGRAMS. I'M A VERY KNOWLEDGEABLE PERSON, AND, 9 10 ONCE AGAIN, MY LIFE IS ABOUT EQUITY AND ACCESS. IT FILLS ME WITH GREAT HONOR AND JOY THAT I CAN EVEN BE A PART OF THIS 11 PROCESS. IF YOU CAST YOUR BALLOT FOR ME, I WOULD DO EVERYTHING 12 WITHIN MY POWER TO MAKE SURE THAT I AM INFORMED, AND THAT ANY 13 QUESTIONS, IF I DON'T HAVE ANSWERS TO THOSE QUESTIONS, I WILL 14 GET ANSWERS TO THE QUESTIONS, AND I WON'T PASS ANYTHING UP. 15 16 THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SPEAK. THANK YOU. 17 RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MS. MARKHAM. 18 19 SPEAKER: HELLO EVERYONE. MY NAME IS GENAE MARKHAM. I AM GOING 20 21 TO TURN MY VIDEO OFF. IT'S A LITTLE SLOW. I HAVE BEEN LIVING IN THE BAY AREA MY WHOLE LIFE. I AM VERY PASSIONATE ABOUT 22 EQUITY. I HAVE BEEN AN ACTIVIST SINCE I WAS A TEENAGER, SO, 23 OVER 20 YEARS. I HAVE BEEN PERSONALLY AFFECTED BY FORECLOSURE, 24

THAT'S WHY I'M SO PASSIONATE ABOUT AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND



1	EOUITABLE	ACCESS	TO	TRANSPORTATION.	BECAUSE	ΤF	TΤ	WASN'T	FOR

- 2 TRANSPORTATION, I WOULD GOT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO COMPLETE MY
- 3 COLLEGE DEGREE. I WOULD NOT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO REALLY ACCESS
- 4 THINGS THAT I NEEDED IN ORDER TO FEEL MORE EMPOWERED IN MY
- 5 LIFE. I HAVE WORKED FOR OVER 20 YEARS WITH LOW-INCOME
- 6 FAMILIES, SPECIFICALLY IN OAKLAND AND IN ALAMEDA COUNTY, AND
- 7 ALSO IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. I WORKED AS A RESIDENT SERVICES
- 8 COORDINATOR. I HAVE ALSO WORKED FOR AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING
- 9 DEVELOPER, AND I ALSO GREW UP IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO, I
- 10 UNDERSTAND DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF IT'S LIKE TO BE LOW-INCOME AND
- 11 STRUGGLING DAY-TO-DAY. I AM ALSO A LEADER, AND I HAVE DONE
- 12 LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT FOR OVER 15 YEARS HELPING YOUTH AND
- 13 EMPOWERING THEM TO USE THEIR VOICES TO GET EQUITABLE ACCESS TO
- 14 HOUSING, TO GET EQUITABLE ACCESS TO SOCIAL SERVICES, REALLY
- 15 TEACHING PEOPLE HOW TO -- HOW TO USE THE VOICE THAT THEY HAVE
- 16 TO BE EMPOWERED TO FIGHT FOR WHAT THEY SHOULD BE ABLE TO HAVE
- 17 ACCESS TO. MY LIFE IS REALLY DEDICATED TO EQUITY AND REALLY
- 18 FIGHTING FOR FAIRNESS FOR PEOPLE. AND MAKING SURE THAT PEOPLE
- 19 HAVE A CHANCE TO LIVE A QUALITY LIFE WHERE THEY'RE ABLE TO
- 20 THRIVE. SO, IF YOU VOTE FOR ME, AS VICE CHAIR, I WILL CONTINUE
- 21 ON FIGHTING FOR YOUR RIGHT TO BE ABLE TO LIVE A QUALITY LIFE,
- 22 YOUR RIGHT TO BE ABLE TO THRIVE, AND YOUR RIGHT TO BE ABLE TO
- 23 SPEAK UP.



RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE THAT 1 PORTION, AND I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT THAT HAS 2 3 BEEN SUBMITTED OR IF THERE IS ANYBODY IN THE AUDIENCE? 4 5 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED, 6 AND THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE AUDIENCE. 7 8 RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL MEMBERS? I SEE NO HANDS RAISED. WE ARE 9 RUNNING THIS AS A GENERAL ELECTION. THERE WILL BE THREE PEOPLE 10 TO VOTE FOR, YOU WILL VOTE FOR ONE OF THEM, MARKHAM, 11 HANKERSON, OR FITZGERALD, IF NONE OF THEM RECEIVE 50% PLUS ONE 12 VOTE, THEN IT WILL GO -- WE WILL HAVE A RUNOFF BACK TO THE 13 PEOPLE WHO ARE THE TOP TWO VOTES RECEIVERS IN THE FIRST ROUND. 14 15 SO, IF ANYBODY HAS ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT, RAISE YOUR HAND 16 REAL QUICK. 17 RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. SO, WITH THAT, IF WE WOULD CALL THE -18 - FOR THE VOTE, THE ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE? 19 20 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: OKAY. ESUF? 21 22 23 SPEAKER: MARKHAM.

24

25

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: FITZGERALD?



1		
2	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:	FITZGERALD.
3		
4	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:	THANK YOU. HANKERSON?
5		
6	SPEAKER: HANKERSON.	
7		
8	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:	MARKHAM?
9		
10	SPEAKER: MARKHAM.	
11		
12	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:	ORANTES?
13		
14	SPEAKER: MARKHAM.	
15		
16	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:	PIMPLE?
17		
18	SPEAKER: HANKERSON.	
19		
20	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:	SCOTT?
21		
22	TERRY SCOTT: HANKERSON	N.
23		
24	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:	FITZGERALD.



1	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WILSON YOU CAN UNMUTE YOURSELF? WONG?
2	
3	HOWARD WONG: HANKERSON.
4	
5	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE IS FOUR HANKERSON THREE
6	MARKHAM, FOUR HANKERSON, AND TWO FITZGERALD.
7	
8	RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. SO THAT MEANS WE NEED TO GO INTO A
9	RUN-OFF. AT THIS POINT, YOU WILL BE VOTING FOR EITHER
10	HANKERSON OR MARKHAM. THANK YOU, WALLY, IF YOU COULD RUN ONE
11	MORE VOTE HERE?
12	
13	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: OKAY. ESUF?
14	
15	SPEAKER: MARKHAM.
16	
17	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: FITZGERALD?
18	
19	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: MARKHAM.
20	
21	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: HANKERSON??
22	
23	DWAYNE HANKERSON: HANKERSON.
24	
25	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MARKHAM?



1	
2	SPEAKER: MARKHAM.
3	
4	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: PIMPLE?
5	
6	VINAY PIMPLE: HANKERSON.
7	
8	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: SCOTT?
9	
10	TERRY SCOTT: HANKERSON.
11	
12	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WELTE?
13	
14	SPEAKER: MARKHAM.
15	
16	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WILSON? WONG?
17	
18	HOWARD WONG: HANKERSON.
19	
20	RANDI KINMAN: I SHOW FOUR, WALLY.
21	
22	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES.
23	
24	RANDI KINMAN: MS. MARKHAM HAS THE FIVE VOTES. MR. HANKERSON
25	HAS FOUR. MS. MARKHAM WILL BE THE VICE CHAIR OF THE EQUITY AND



ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. I WANT TO GIVE EVERYBODY A LOT OF THANKS 1 FOR STEPPING UP. THERE WILL BE SO MUCH WORK TO DO. I WANT TO 2 3 THANK EVERYONE FOR STEPPING UP ON THIS. AND I'M GOING TO TURN THE MEETING -- FIRST I APOLOGIZE. I HAVE SOME ELECTRICAL WORK 4 5 GOING ON. I'M STEPPING OVER LADDERS. I'M GOING TO STEP OUT AND TURN THE MEETING OVER TO ILAF AND SHE CAN TAKE OVER CHAIRING 6 THIS WITH GENAE BEING THE VICE CHAIR. AND I HOPE YOU HAVE A 7 8 GREAT MEETING. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GENAE, WE WILL GET YOU CAUGHT UP ON ALL OF THE EXTRA MEETINGS WE'LL BE INVITING YOU 9 10 TO. THANKS. 11 ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU VERY MUCH RANDI. I WANT TO TAKE A SECOND 12 BEFORE WE MOVE ON IN THE AGENDA TO REITERATE WHAT DWAYNE 13 HANKERSON MENTIONED WHEN THERE IS REALLY NO WRONG WAY TO GO 14 15 BECAUSE EVERYONE HERE HAS SO MUCH VALUE IS INPUT AND SO MUCH 16 TO BRING TO THE TABLE. I WANT TO SECOND RANDI AND SAY THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR STEPPING UP AND I'M EXCITED ABOUT THE WORK 17 WE'RE GOING TO DIVE INTO. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM 18 FOUR, APPROVAL OF THE APRIL 22, 2022 MEETING MINUTES. DO I 19 HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF APRIL 22ND? 20 21 22 TERRY SCOTT: SO MOVED. 23

ILAF ESUF: MOTIONER IS TERRY SCOTT. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

24



1	SPEAKER: SECOND.
2	
3	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: SECOND BY ORANTES? ANY MEMBER COMMENTS?
4	
5	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: NO COMMENTS.
6	
7	RANDI KINMAN: PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED?
8	
9	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: NO PUBLIC COMMENTS EITHER.
10	
11	RANDI KINMAN: WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM FIVE THE BLUE RIBBON
12	TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE ACTION PLAN.
13	
14	KY-NAM MILLER: ROLL CALL VOTE FOR THE MINUTES.
15	
16	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: WALLY, WOULD YOU MIND DOING THE ROLL CALL
17	VOTE?
18	
19	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ESUF?
20	
21	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: FITZGERALD?
24	
25	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD?



1	
2	>>CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: HANKERSON?
3	
4	DWAYNE HANKERSON: AYE.
5	
6	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MARKHAM?
7	
8	SPEAKER: AYE.
9	
10	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ORANTES?
11	
12	SPEAKER: AYE.
13	
14	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: PIMPLE?
15	
16	VINAY PIMPLE: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: SCOTT?
19	
20	TERRY SCOTT: AYE.
21	
22	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WELTE?
23	
24	FRANK WELTE: NO.



CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WILSON? WONG? 1 2 3 HOWARD WONG: AYE. 4 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE ONE -- WE HAVE ONE -- EIGHT, 5 6 YES. THE MOTION PASSES. 7 8 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU, WALLY. AND WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE ON TO AGENDA NUMBER FIVE AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO DRENNEN 9 SHELTON TO PRESENT THIS ITEM. IT'S AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. 10 11 DRENNAN SHELTON: HOPEFULLY IT'S NOT JUST INFORMATION. I DO 12 WANT TO HEAR FROM YOU. BUT I AM HERE TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT OUR 13 PROPOSED APPROACH FOR THE ACCESSIBILITY ITEMS IN THE 14 15 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. SO, TO START OUT, HOPEFULLY ALL OF 16 YOU KNOW, OR REMEMBER, THAT LAST SUMMER THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSFORMATION TASK FORCE DEVELOPED THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION 17 PLAN. AND WITHIN THE ACTION PLAN, THERE ARE FIVE ACCESSIBILITY 18 ACTIONS THAT ARE MEANT TO MOVE US TO A CLOSER MORE CONNECTED 19 USER FOCUSED NETWORK. SO, THOSE FIVE ACTIONS CAME STRAIGHT 20 21 FROM OUR REGION'S COORDINATED PUBLIC TRANSIT HUMAN SERVICES TRANSPORTATION PLAN. WE CALLED THAT THE COORDINATED PLAN FOR 22 SHORT. AND THE COORDINATED PLAN IS A FEDERALLY REQUIRED 23 DOCUMENT THAT MTC DEVELOPS EVERY FOUR YEARS WITH ENORMOUS 24

AMOUNT OF COMMUNITY INPUT. WE UPDATE IT EVERY FOUR YEARS, AND



- 1 IT PRIORITIZES FUNDING AND COORDINATION STRATEGIES TO IMPROVE
- 2 TRANSPORTATION FOR OLDER ADULTS, LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, AND PEOPLE
- 3 WITH DISABILITIES. HOPEFULLY, YOU KNOW ABOUT THE COORDINATED
- 4 PLAN. IF YOU DON'T, CHECK IT OUT. SOME OF YOU HEARD FROM ME
- 5 JUST A FEW MONTHS AGO ABOUT THE UPDATE THAT'S UNDERWAY RIGHT
- 6 NOW. BUT, JUST ACQUAINT YOURSELF WITH THAT PLAN. YOU WILL
- 7 LEARN ABOUT ALL OF THE IDENTIFIED GAPS AND SOLUTIONS THAT
- 8 OLDER ADULTS, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND LOW-INCOME
- 9 POPULATIONS FACE WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. YOU CAN JUST
- 10 GOOGLE MTC COORDINATED PLAN, AND IT WILL COME RIGHT UP. BUT AS
- 11 I SAID, THERE ARE FIVE ACTIONS. I'M GOING TO RUN THROUGH THEM
- 12 AND TELL YOU WHAT'S ASSOCIATED WITH EACH OF THEM. BUT BEFORE I
- 13 DO, I WANT TO START OUT BY SAYING THEY SERIOUSLY DO TAKE TO
- 14 HEART THE SAYING, NOTHING ABOUT US WITHOUT US. "AND EVEN
- 15 BEFORE WE DIVE IN, I WANT TO ASSURE YOU THAT THERE WILL BE A
- 16 LOT OF ENGAGEMENT WITH THE COMMUNITY ON EACH OF THESE ITEMS.
- 17 SO, WITH THAT I'M JUST GOING START GOING THROUGH THEM. IN THE
- 18 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, THERE WERE, I THINK, 27 ACTIONS
- 19 TOTAL, AND THE FIVE ACCESSIBILITY ITEMS START WITH ACTION 21,
- 20 WHICH IS TO DESIGN -- OR, DESIGNATE A MOBILITY MANAGER IN EACH
- 21 COUNTY TO COORDINATE RIDES AND FUNCTION AS A LIAISON BETWEEN
- 22 TRANSIT AGENCIES AND OTHER PROVIDERS. SO, MOBILITY MANAGEMENT
- 23 IS AN APPROACH TO PROVIDING TRANSPORTATION SERVICES THAT IS
- 24 VERY CUSTOMER FOCUSED. IT'S A WAY OF VIEWING THE ENTIRE
- 25 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK AS A WHOLE AND NOT JUST MODE BY MODE.



- 1 SO, IT TAKES INTO ACCOUNT PUBLIC TRANSIT, PARATRANSIT, PRIVATE
- 2 TRANSPORTATION, COMMUNITY PROGRAMS, BIKING, ROLLING, WALKING,
- 3 ALL OF IT, AND IT PUTS IT UNDER ONE UMBRELLA. AND IT WORKS TO
- 4 DELIVER OPTIONS THAT BEST MEET THE NEEDS OF THE CUSTOMER THAT
- 5 IS SEEKING TRANSPORTATION. SO, REALLY, IT DESILOS SERVICES FOR
- 6 RIDERS. SO IN THIS ACTION WE WILL ASK EACH COUNTY TO IDENTIFY
- 7 ONE ENTITY FOR THAT PURPOSE, PER COUNTY. AND MAKE IT OFFICIAL.
- 8 SOME COUNTIES, IT WILL BE VERY EASY, BECAUSE THEY HAVE ALREADY
- 9 DONE THIS, BUT OTHERS WILL BE -- YOU KNOW, THEY WILL HAVE TO
- 10 DO A LITTLE BIT OF WORK ABOUT THIS. SO THIS ACTION WILL
- 11 INCLUDE WORKING WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES, OUR COUNTY
- 12 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES, ALONG WITH ALL OF THE RELEVANT
- 13 NON-PROFIT OR COMMUNITY-BASED PROVIDERS, AND OUR PARATRANSIT
- 14 COORDINATING COUNCILS. ACTION 22 WILL FUND ADDITIONAL
- 15 SUBREGIONAL ONE SEAT PARATRANSIT RIDE PILOTS AND DEVELOP COST
- 16 SHARING POLICIES FOR CROSS JURISDICTIONAL PARATRANSIT TRIPS.
- 17 SO THIS ACTION HAS TWO PARTS. FIRST MTC IS GOING TO ISSUE A
- 18 CALL FOR PROJECTS TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO IDENTIFY AND FUND
- 19 THREE OR SO PILOTS AROUND THE REGION TO TRY DIFFERENT METHODS
- 20 OR TECHNIQUES FOR TAKING THOSE ADA PARATRANSIT TRIPS THAT
- 21 TYPICALLY REQUIRE A TRANSFER BETWEEN TWO PARATRANSIT
- 22 PROVIDERS, AND CHANGE IT INTO A ONE SEAT CROSS JURISDICTIONAL
- 23 PARATRANSIT RIDE. THE SECOND PART OF THIS ACTION WILL EXAMINE
- 24 ALL OF THE COST SHARING AGREEMENTS THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
- 25 HAVE BETWEEN THEMSELVES, AND ALL OF THE ASSOCIATED POLICIES



- 1 RELATED WITH CROSS JURISDICTIONAL PARATRANSIT TRIPS. THESE
- 2 POLICIES MIGHT INCLUDE HOW TRANSIT TRIPS ARE BOOKED OR HOW AND
- 3 WHEN A TRANSFER WILL TAKE PLACE. ACTION 23 IS THE INTEGRATION
- 4 OF ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICES ON TO CLIPPER NEXT GENERATION. I
- 5 THINK SOME OF YOU ARE AWARE THAT THIS IS ALREADY AN ONGOING
- 6 EFFORT AND MTC STAFF AND TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON
- 7 THIS TO BRING CLIPPER TO PARATRANSIT, FINALLY. THIS EFFORT HAS
- 8 BEEN ONGOING AND WE EXPECT IT WILL CONCLUDE SOMETIME NEXT
- 9 YEAR. ACTION 24 WILL IDENTIFY KEY PARATRANSIT CHALLENGES. AND
- 10 THIS ACTION WILL INCLUDE A LOT OF RIDER AND COMMUNITY
- 11 ENGAGEMENT AND THE IDEA HERE WILL BE TO IDENTIFY VERY SPECIFIC
- 12 CHALLENGES, EXPERIENCE WITH THE PARATRANSIT SYSTEM BOTH FROM
- 13 THE RIDER PERSPECTIVE AND ALSO FROM THE PROVIDER SIDE. AND
- 14 MAKE REFORMS WITH THESE DETAILS WE PLAN TO MAKE
- 15 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE EASIER TO IMPLEMENT. AND
- 16 STANDARDIZING ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR PARATRANSIT. THIS
- 17 ACTION HAS BEEN INVOLVED IN TAKING STOCK OF HOW ADA
- 18 PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY IS DETERMINED NOW AND TO SEE HOW WE
- 19 CAN MAKE THE PROCESS MORE STANDARD FOR PARATRANSIT APPLICANTS
- 20 ACROSS THE REGION. THE GOAL IS TO MAKE PARATRANSIT APPLICANT
- 21 EXPERIENCE SIMILAR RIGHT NOW WE HAVE SITUATION WHERE IS TWO
- 22 NEIGHBORING TRANSIT AGENCY HAVE DIFFERENT EXPERIENCES ONE
- 23 MIGHT INCLUDE FILLING OUT A PAPER APPLICATION AND MAILING IT
- 24 IN THE NEXT AGENCY MAY INCLUDE AN OBSTACLE COURSE THAT AN
- 25 APPLICANT HAS TO MANUFACTURE THROUGH IN ORDER TO DETERMINE



- 1 ELIGIBILITY THIS MAKES IT MORE STANDARD ACROSS THE REGION.
- 2 THOSE ARE THE FIVE ITEMS, AND IF YOU HAVE A CHANCE TO READ
- 3 THROUGH THE MEMO, YOU WILL NOTICE THAT WE'RE CALLING THIS A
- 4 WORK PLAN. SO, INSTEAD OF TACKLING THESE ITEMS SEPARATELY, THE
- 5 PLAN IS TO BUNDLE THEM ALL TOGETHER UNDER ONE WORK PLAN. THERE
- 6 IS JUST A TON OF CROSS OVER BETWEEN THESE ITEMS. SO PACKAGING
- 7 THEM AS ONE WORK PLAN REALLY MAKES SENSE, AND IT SHOULD MAKE
- 8 IT EASIER FOR STAKEHOLDERS TO FOLLOW ALONG WITH ALL OF THE
- 9 PROGRESS THAT WE MAKE ON THIS WORK. AND I ALREADY MENTIONED
- 10 ENGAGEMENT, BUT I DO WANT TO UNDERSCORE THAT THERE IS GOING TO
- 11 BE A LOT OF ENGAGEMENT ON THIS WORK PLAN. WE WILL HAVE
- 12 INTERVIEWS AND FOCUS GROUPS AND FORUMS AND A LOT OF MEETINGS.
- 13 AND, SO, I PLAN TO HAVE THREE ADVISING BODIES WHERE I'LL
- 14 PROVIDE REGULAR UPDATES. FIRST I PLAN TO COME TO THIS MEETING
- 15 EACH AND EVERY MONTH TO PROVIDE YOU WITH AN UPDATE ON THE
- 16 PROJECT FOR THE DURATION OF THE PROJECT. SO, THIS WILL BE YOUR
- 17 MAIN PLACE TO HELP GUIDE THE WORK AND IT WILL ALSO ALLOW FOR A
- 18 WIDER COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION TO PROVIDE THAT INPUT. I ALSO
- 19 WORK CLOSELY WITH A WORKING GROUP OF TRANSIT AND PARATRANSIT
- 20 ACCESSIBILITY STAFF, AND THEN I WILL PROVIDE REGULAR UPDATES
- 21 TO THE BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES THROUGH THEIR BLUE RIBBON
- 22 TRANSIT CAUCUS GROUP MY NEXT STEP ON THIS IS TO GET THE
- 23 CONSULTANT PROCUREMENT UNDERWAY. I AM TRULY EXCITED ABOUT THIS
- 24 WORK. I AM ANXIOUS TO GET GOING, AND WE'RE HOPING TO BE ABLE
- 25 TO KICK SOMETHING OFF MID-SUMMER. AND, TODAY, OTHER THAN



HEARING YOUR THOUGHTS ON WHAT I HAVE SORT OF OUTLINED, I DO 1 HOPE TO HEAR FROM YOU, SPECIFICALLY, ON INDIVIDUALS, AGENCIES 2 3 AND COMMUNITY GROUPS FOR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT. YOU ARE MY PARTNER OUT IN THE COMMUNITY AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE I'M 4 5 TALKING WITH THE FOLKS THAT YOU THINK I SHOULD TALK TO. SO, YOU CAN GIVE ME THAT INPUT NOW OR FOLLOW IT UP WITH AN E-MAIL 6 OR PHONE CALL LATER. AND I'LL STOP THERE, AND I'M ACTUALLY 7 8 JUST REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO HEARING YOUR THOUGHTS. THANKS. 9 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU VERY MUCH DRENNEN. I WOULD LIKE TO 10 11 SEE IF SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS HAVE COMMENTS. I SEE KRISTINE'S 12 HAND RAISED. 13 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU DRENNEN. I AM CURIOUS TO KNOW 14 WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT THE SERVICE PROVIDERS, ARE YOU INCLUDING 15 16 DRIVER IN THAT MIX? BECAUSE A LOT OF GROUPS ON THE GROUND, FEEDBACK THAT YOU CAN GET FROM THEM WOULD REALLY ADD TO THE 17 STORY. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO RECOMMEND THAT YOU CONSIDER 18 TALKING TO THE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] INSTITUTE, AND THE WORLD 19 INSTITUTE ON DISABILITY, WITH COLLABORATORS, AND THERE WAS 20 21 SOMETHING ELSE I CAN'T REMEMBER. I'LL COME BACK. 22 DRENNAN SHELTON: CHRIS, WHAT WAS THE -- BEFORE YOU MENTIONED 23

WID, WHAT WAS THE AGENCY YOU MENTIONED? AND INSTITUTE?

25



SPEAKER: PAUL MOORE INSTITUTE SAN FRANCISCO STATE. 1 2 3 DRENNAN SHELTON: OKAY I'LL CONTACT YOU LATER FOR CONTACT INFORMATION FOR THAT ONE. THANKS FOR YOUR INPUT. 4 5 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. 6 7 8 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: HOWARD? 9 HOWARD WONG: THIS IS A WONDERFUL PROGRAM. THIS IS SOMETHING 10 VERY MUCH NEEDED. MANY PEOPLE I HAVE TALKED TO OR HEARD FROM 11 OVER THE YEARS HAVE ASKED FOR SOMETHING LIKE THIS. SO I'M 12 HAPPY TO SEE THIS TYPE OF REGIONAL COORDINATION. WHAT'S THE 13 TITLE OF THIS PROGRAM AGAIN? I DIDN'T QUITE CATCH THAT. 14 15 16 DRENNAN SHELTON: I HOPE WE'LL STICK WITH ONE TITLE. RIGHT NOW WE'RE CALLING IT THE BLUE RIBBON ACCESS AND MOBILITY WORK 17 18 PLAN. 19 HOWARD WONG: OKAY. ALL RIGHT. THAT'S GREAT. IS THIS GOING TO 20 21 INCLUDE ACTUAL, PHYSICAL, HAVING SOME TYPE OF REGIONAL 22 GUIDELINES FOR HOW PHYSICALLY HAVING SOME TYPE OF REGIONAL GUIDELINES FOR PHYSICALLY -- VEHICLES AND FACILITIES PROVIDING 23 ACCESS THAT'S SOMEWHAT UNIFORM ACCESS, DOWN TO THE LEVEL OF 24 SEATS ARE DESIGNED AND ORIENTED, FORWARD VERSUS SIDEWAYS. 25



1	
2	DRENNAN SHELTON: THIS IS A DRIVEN WORK PLAN RATHER THAN
3	TECHNICAL SPECKS, IF YOU WILL.
4	
5	HOWARD WONG: OKAY.
6	
7	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: I SEE FRANK'S HAND RAISED. FRANK, ARE YOU
8	ABLE TO UNMUTE? WE'LL COME BACK TO FRANK. CHRIS?
9	
10	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: HAVE YOU LOOKED AT AUGMENTS OR CHANGING
11	THE [INDISCERNIBLE] REQUIREMENT FOR THOSE OF US THAT HAVE
12	LIFE-LONG DISABILITIES FOR THE RENEWAL, EVERY THREE YEARS, OR
13	WHATEVER EACH ONE PARATRANSIT SYSTEM DOES? BECAUSE THIS
14	DISABILITY DOESN'T GO AWAY, THOSE OF US WHO HAVE HAD OURS FOR
15	YEARS.
16	
17	DRENNAN SHELTON: THAT IS ABSOLUTELY ON THE LIST OF THINGS THAT
18	WE'RE GOING TO LOOK AT.
19	
20	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU.
21	
22	FRANK WELTE: I'M UNMUTED NOW. I AM EXCITED ABOUT THE ACTION
23	ITEMS. I BELIEVE EACH ONE IS DEFINITELY WORTHY AND IMPACTFUL.
24	I'M CURIOUS THOUGH WHY THE PREPONDERANCE OF THESE SUGGESTIONS
25	ARE FOCUSED ON THE PARATRANSIT SYSTEM WHEN CLEARLY PEOPLE WITH



DISABILITIES USE OTHER ASPECTS OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM, BOTH 1 FIXED ROUTE AND OTHERWISE. AND IS THAT WHAT THEY'RE -- WAS IT 2 3 A CASE OF LIMITED SCOPE? OR WHAT THAT WAS ABOUT? AND, SO, I'M CURIOUS ABOUT THAT. AND THEN ALSO, I DEFINITELY AGREE WITH THE 4 5 IDEA OF WORKING ON UNNECESSARY RENEWALS, SO FOR PEOPLE WITH PERMANENT DISABILITIES, AS FAR AS DISABILITIES GO, AND I WILL 6 BE SENDING YOU A LIST OF POSSIBLE COMMUNITY PARTNERS FOR THE 7 8 ONGOING WORK. 9 DRENNAN SHELTON: I APPRECIATE THAT, FRANK. YOUR QUESTION ABOUT 10 THE FOCUS ON PARA TRANSIT. SO, THIS A QUESTION THAT I GO BACK 11 AND FORTH ON IN MY WORK DAY-TO-DAY. DO WE FOCUS TOO MUCH ON 12 PARA TRANSIT OR NOT ENOUGH? IT FEELS TO ME THAT WE HAVE REALLY 13 NEGLECTED POLICIES AROUND PARATRANSIT FOR DECADES AT THIS 14 15 POINT. WE REALLY RELY ON THE ADA TO GUIDE THE POLICIES THAT 16 ARE IMPLEMENTED. YOU KNOW, NATION-WIDE. AND I THINK THAT THERE HAS BEEN AN OUTCRY IN OUR REGION, PARTICULARLY, TO TAKE A LOOK 17 AT THESE POLICIES, AND TO DO SOME WORK AROUND THEM. SO, I 18 THINK THERE WAS A CONSCIOUS CHOICE TO FOCUS ON PARA TRANSIT 19 WITHIN THIS WORK PLAN. OF COURSE, THAT DOESN'T MEAN THAT WE 20 21 NEGLECT ACCESSIBILITY ON FIXED ROUTE SIDE OR OTHER, YOU KNOW, IN OTHER PUBLIC TRANSIT PROVISION. I THINK YOU ARE WELL AWARE 22 THAT I GET PULLED INTO A LOT OF EFFORTS WITHIN MTC AND WORKING 23

WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. SO I KNOW IT'S ON THE MIND OF



EVERYONE AND IT'S A POINT WELL TAKEN. BUT FOR THIS WORK PLAN, 1 WE REALLY DO WANT TO DO A LOT OF WORK AROUND PARATRANSIT. 2 3 FRANK WELTE: THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. AND INDEED IT'S 4 GREAT THAT PARATRANSIT IS GETTING A LOT OF LOVE. THANK YOU. 5 6 7 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: I SEE CHRIS'S HAND RAISED. 8 SPEAKER: LOOK AT THE ADA, AND IT'S USUALLY LAID AS BEDROCK AND 9 YOU CAN'T GO BELOW THAT, HOWEVER, I THINK WE HAVE BEEN LEANING 10 WAY TOO HARD ON THE ADA, AND WE HAVEN'T LOOKED AT OTHER EQUITY 11 BUILDS THAT COULD ALSO BE IN THE RUBRIC. 12 13 DRENNAN SHELTON: THANK YOU, CHRIS. 14 15 16 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: I SEE HOWARD'S HAND RAISED. 17 HOWARD WONG: YES, I HAVE ANOTHER ITEM. ALSO, I HAVE WORKED ON 18 ADA PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS FOR CLIENTS IN THE PAST, AND ADA 19 DOES NOT REALLY COVER THE FULL EXTENT OF PROBLEMS OF TRAVEL BY 20 THE DISABLED AND SENIORS. AND THERE ARE MANY HIDDEN DISABILITY 21 WHICH OFTEN TRANSIT AGENCY DO NOT ADDRESS SUCH AS PEOPLE WITH 22 SPINAL INJURIES, OR BACK PROBLEMS WHICH REQUIRE CERTAIN

ARRANGEMENTS. PARATRANSIT, I WOULD SAY IS CERTAINLY A SMALL

FRACTION OF THE SERVICES TO THE DISABLED AND SENIOR

23

24



- 1 COMMUNITIES, THAT THERE ARE MANY SENIORS AND DISABLED WHO TAKE
- 2 TRANSIT ON THEIR OWN, BUT HAVE CHALLENGES THAT NEED TO BE MET,
- 3 NOT ONLY IN FINDING THEIR WAY THROUGH THE SYSTEM, BUT HOW THEY
- 4 ACCESS STATIONS, VEHICLES, COMMUNICATIONS SIGNAGE, ALL THESE
- 5 THINGS. SO, PARATRANSIT, I THINK, IS JUST A FRACTION OF THE
- 6 ISSUE. AND I THINK ONE HAS TO BROADEN THIS STUDY TO REACH A
- 7 LARGE NUMBER OF CUSTOMERS. THANK YOU.

8

- 9 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: ARE THERE ANY FURTHER COMMENTS FROM
- 10 SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS? IF NOT, I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS.
- 11 THANK YOU VERY MUCH DRENNEN FOR PROVIDING CONTEXT ON YESTERDAY
- 12 FOCUS IS ON PARA TRANSIT. I ALSO HAD THAT QUESTION. I AM
- 13 CURIOUS TO HEAR COMMENTS ABOUT WHY ACTION 25 IS ALSO LUMPED
- 14 INTO THE WORK PLAN. BECAUSE I SEE THAT CHUNK COULD EXPAND TO
- 15 BECOME ITS OWN PROJECT. SO, I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR AN ABOUT THE
- 16 MORE ABOUT THAT.

17

- 18 DRENNAN SHELTON: SURE. EACH ONE OF THESE ITEMS IS ACTUALLY ITS
- 19 OWN THING. AND YOU'RE RIGHT, THEY COULD EXPAND, AS MUCH AS WE
- 20 COULD PUT THE WORK INTO IT. AND THAT'S -- IT'S, I THINK, I'M -
- 21 IF YOU COULD TELL ME A BIT MORE ABOUT WHAT YOU WANT TO LEARN
- 22 ABOUT THE LAST ACTION, THEN MAYBE I CAN GIVE YOU SOME MORE
- 23 DETAILS?



1	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: YEAH. I THINK I'M CURIOUS ABOUT HOW MUCH
2	WEIGHT OF EACH OF THESE ITEMS ARE GOING TO TAKE. BECAUSE I
3	REALIZE THEY'RE ALL BEING WORKED ON AS ONE WORK PLAN. I WANT
4	TO SEE WHAT IS BEING EMPHASIZED AND IF EACH ONE IS GOING TO
5	GET ATTENTION.
6	
7	DRENNAN SHELTON: WHERE YOU FEEL THE WORK IS IMPORTANT AS WE
8	GET INTO THE WORK PLAN, KNOW SOME ACTIONS COULD BE WORKED ON
9	WE WOULD WANT TO HEAR MORE ABOUT THAT, AND AS OUTLINED AND
10	COORDINATION FROM THE BLUE RIBBON, SOME ACTIONS ARE MORE
11	DETAILED THAN OTHERS OF COURSE. FOR INSTANCE, THE FIRST ACTION
12	ABOUT IDENTIFYING A MOBILITY MANAGER, THAT, I DON'T THINK IS
13	GOING TO TAKE VERY MUCH EFFORT IN COMPARISON TO THE OTHER
14	ITEMS. BUT, YEAH, I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE'LL WANT TO HEAR
15	FROM YOU ABOUT IF YOU FEEL LIKE WE'RE GIVING A SHORT SCHIFT TO
16	SOMETHING IN THE WORK PLAN, WE WANT TO KNOW.
17	
18	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: YOU MENTIONED STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT
19	THROUGHOUT, IS THAT GOING TO BE PART OF THE PROCUREMENT
20	PROCESS AS WELL?
21	
22	DRENNAN SHELTON: IN TERMS OF PROCURING SOMEONE FOR OUTREACH?



CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: NO. AT THE END WHEN WE DECIDE WHO IS GOING 1 2 TO BE ABLE TO WORK ON THIS? ARE STAKEHOLDERS GOING TO BE GIVEN 3 A CHANCE TO GIVE INPUT ON THAT? 4 5 DRENNAN SHELTON: THAT IS REALLY NOT PART OF THE MTC PROCUREMENT PROCEDURE. SO, I MEAN, I'LL TAKE DOWN YOUR NOTE. 6 IT'S NOT TYPICALLY HOW THINGS HAVE BEEN DONE. THOUGH, 7 8 PROCUREMENT DOES COME TO COMMITTEES, AND THIS ONE IS SLATED TO GO TO ADMINISTRATION IN JUNE. 9 10 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: OKAY. 11 12 DRENNAN SHELTON: YEAH. 13 14 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. IF THERE ARE NO OTHER COMMENTS 15 16 FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE, I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE TO ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS. I BELIEVE ADINA IS IN ATTENDANCE. 17 18 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. WE HAVE TWO PUBLIC COMMENTS, AND 19 THEN ALSO THERE IS A PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE BOARDROOM THAT 20 WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY 21 TELECONFERENCE WITH COMMENTS, PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND 22 FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. 23 EACH SPEAKER WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK. PLEASE RAISE YOUR 24

VIRTUAL HAND IN THE NEXT 60 SECONDS TO BE RECOGNIZED AS A



SPEAKER. SHOULD WE ASK THE PERSON IN THE BOARDROOM FIRST? 1 FIRST? THE PERSON IN THE BOARDROOM IF YOU COULD WALK UP TO THE 2 3 PODIUM 4 5 SPEAKER: I AM HERE. 6 7 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WONDERFUL. THANK YOU. 8 SPEAKER: JAYNE KRAEMER. TWO THOUGHTS. IN ALL OF THE VERBIAGE, 9 I DON'T HEAR WHERE THERE IS AN EFFORT TO ACTUALLY BRING THE 10 GENERAL PUBLIC INTO AN AWARENESS OF PEOPLE WHO HAVE MOBILITY 11 PROBLEMS. IT'S KIND OF LIKE WITH THE GENERAL PUBLIC, THOSE 12 FOLKS WILL BE TAKEN CARE OF BY SOME WAY, SOME MANNER, BY SOME 13 AGENCY, AND I DON'T NEED TO KNOW ABOUT THEM. AND I THINK, YOU 14 15 KNOW, THAT THEY NEED -- THE GENERAL PUBLIC NEEDS TO BECOME 16 AWARE OF THE FACT THAT WE'RE -- THERE ARE HUMAN BEINGS WHO HAVE REAL THOUGHTS AND EMOTIONS AND GOALS, IS THEY MIGHT JUST 17 WANT YOU TO KNOW ABOUT IT. THE SECOND THING IS, JUST A 18 THOUGHT, TO ADD TO YOUR TOOL CHEST, IS IT POSSIBLE TO BEGIN TO 19 THINK ABOUT BEING NEIGHBORHOOD -- HAVING NEIGHBORHOODS BEING 20 21 RESOURCEFUL IN PROVIDING SOME KIND OF A COMMUNITIES THAT WILL HELP WHEELCHAIR, MOTOR SCOOTER PROCESS, WHERE PEOPLE WHO HAVE 22 THE FACILITY TO USE THOSE VEHICLES, IT WOULD ALLOW THEM TO GET 23

AROUND THE NEIGHBORHOOD. YOU KNOW? THEY CAN SCOOT DOWN THE



NEIGHBORHOOD, OR USE THE MOTOR SCOOTER TO ACCESS THE BUS TO 1 2 GET SOME PLACE NEAR NEARBY? THANKS. 3 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. 4 5 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: DRENNEN, DID YOU WANT TO TAKE A SECOND TO 6 7 PROVIDE FEEDBACK? 8 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ADINA LEVIN, ARE YOU READY TO SPEAK? CAN 9 10 YOU UNMUTE YOURSELF, PLEASE? 11 SPEAKER: SURE. MY NAME IS ADINA LEVIN, AND I AM A MEMBER OF 12 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, ALTHOUGH I DO NOT SIT ON THIS 13 COMMITTEE. SO, FIRST OF ALL, I'M REALLY GLAD TO SEE THESE 14 15 VARIOUS DIFFERENT ISSUES AND PROJECTS TO SUPPORT SENIORS AND 16 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES MOVING FORWARD UNDER AN UMBRELLA FOR SOME OF THE. I'M GLAD TO SEE THAT IS HAPPENING. I HAVE A 17 COUPLE -- A FEW QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. ONE IS IN TERMS OF 18 HAVING A MOBILITY MANAGEMENT ENTITY, ONE FOR COUNTY, PUTTING 19 TOGETHER MOBILITY AND MULTIPLE MODES IT SEEMS LIKE A GOOD 20 21 IDEA. HOWEVER, ONE PER COUNTY, THAT LEAVES THE QUESTION OF 22 ENABLING AND IMPROVING TRANSPORTATION THAT MAY CROSS COUNTY LINES. FOR EXAMPLE, I LIVE ABOUT A MILE FROM THE SANTA CLARA 23 COUNTY BORDER, IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND IT HAS MANY CROSS SET 24

COUNTY LINES. SO THAT IS A QUESTION ABOUT HOW THAT IS BEING



TO

1	ADDRESSED. SECOND QUESTION HAS TO DO WITH THE PAYMENT
2	ELIGIBILITY AND, WHICH IS REALLY GREAT THAT THAT IS MOVING
3	FORWARD TO MAKE THAT EASIER, BUT THERE IS MANAGE THAT SEEMS TO
4	BE MOVING FORWARD THAT COULD POTENTIALLY MAKE IT HARDER WHICH
5	IS THAT THE CLIPPER PROJECT IS ALSO GOING TO BE SUPPORTING
6	OPEN PAYMENTS, BUT THE BEAR MINIMUM FEATURE. OPEN PAYMENT IS
7	BEING ABLE TO THE ABLE TO USE A CREDIT CARD OR DEBIT CARD
8	THAT YOU ALREADY HAVE, OR A MOBILE DIGITAL WALLET TO PAY, BUT
9	AT FIRST LAUNCH THAT IS ONLY GOING TO SUPPORT A FULL PRICE
10	ADULT FARE. AND IT WOULD SEEM LOGICAL TO, ALSO, BE ABLE TO
11	SUPPORT THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT DISCOUNTS. THERE IS NOT YET ANY
12	PLAN TO DO THAT. AND THERE ARE ALSO USABILITY ISSUES IN TERMS
13	OF MAKING THAT WORK [INDISCERNIBLE] QUESTION. AND I GUESS
14	THAT IS THE END MY TIME. THANK YOU.
15	
16	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. WARREN CUSHMAN?
17	
18	SPEAKER: HELLO, CAN YOU HEAR ME?
19	
20	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES.
21	
22	SPEAKER: OKAY GOOD. HI MY NAME IS WARREN CUSHMAN, AND I WANT
23	TO START BY ADDRESSING THE MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE, THE
24	EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. WE HEARD JUST A FEW MOMENTS

AGO FROM DRENNEN THE TIP OF THE ICEBERG. THERE IS A LOT OF



- 1 WORK THAT HAS TO BE DONE IN THE REALM OF ACCESS FOR PEOPLE
- 2 WITH DISABILITIES. PARATRANSIT AND ALL OF THE ISSUES DISCUSSED
- 3 JUST NOW AROUND PARATRANSIT IS JUST ONE CORNER OF A HUGE
- 4 TAPESTRY THAT WE HAVE TO BE LOOKING AT. WITH REGARD TO
- 5 PARATRANSIT, I'M EXCITED THAT WE HAVE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO MOVE
- 6 FORWARD WITH COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT, TO HAVE THE EQUITY AND
- 7 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE DIAL IN ON THIS MATTER, PRESUMABLY ONCE A
- 8 MONTH. DRENNEN AND I FIND TO BE VERY CAPABLE STAFF PERSON AND
- 9 SOMEONE WHO CARES ABOUT THE COMMUNITY. AND I FEEL THAT SHE
- 10 WILL DELIVER THAT OUTREACH AND THAT CONNECTION WITH THE
- 11 COMMUNITY. MY QUESTIONS ARE, THE PARTICULAR QUESTIONS THAT I
- 12 HAVE AROUND THE PROCESS OF THE LONG-TERM PROCESS AND THE LONG-
- 13 TERM QUESTIONS AROUND THIS, I'M GOING TO SAVE UNTIL LATER, I
- 14 JUST WANT TO OUTLINE THE IMPORTANCE OF DISABILITY AND RAISE
- 15 AND ELEVATE THE ELEMENTS AROUND THIS SO THE FOLKS -- THE
- 16 PEOPLE IN THIS COMMITTEE WHO DON'T NECESSARILY DIVE INTO THIS
- 17 AND ARE NOT ALWAYS AWARE OF THIS, I'M GOING TO ENCOURAGE AND
- 18 URGE FOLKS TO REALLY CONNECT WITH THOSE MEMBERS, NOT ONLY OF
- 19 THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WHO DO LIVE AND EXPERIENCE
- 20 DISABILITY, BUT OTHERS IN THE COMMUNITY LIKE MYSELF AND --
- 21 OKAY. SO, JUST KEEP YOUR HEAD UP, AND THANK YOU FOR LISTENING.
- 22 THANK YOU.

24 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. DAVID MANDELL.

25



SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME? 1 2 3 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. 4 5 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS DAVID MANDELL. I SERVE ON THE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE OF THE AMERICAN COUNCIL OF THE BLIND. 6 AND I JUST WANTED TO INFORM ALL OF YOU THAT THE U.S. 7 8 DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION HAS JUST ISSUED A NOTICE. IT IS GOING TO FORM AN EOUITY -- A TRANSPORTATION EOUITY ADVISORY 9 10 COMMITTEE, WHICH IS ABOUT TIME. BECAUSE ALTHOUGH IT HAS BEGUN WORKING ON EQUITY REGARDING PEOPLE OF COLOR AND LOW-INCOME 11 INDIVIDUALS -- AND THEN I SAY IT'S ONLY BEGUN DOING THIS, IT 12 HAS NOT BEGUN ANY EQUITY PROJECTS WITH REGARD TO PEOPLE WITH 13 DISABILITIES. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY ABOUT THE COORDINATED PLAN, 14 15 I APPLAUD MTC AND ESPECIALLY DRENNEN FOR WORKING ON THIS. 16 HOWEVER, I THINK THAT TRANSIT FARES NEED TO BE DEALT WITH. THE ADA PARATRANSIT MODEL THAT WILL WE ARE CONFRONTED WITH IN THIS 17 COUNTRY IS COMPLETELY INEQUITABLE. AND I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY 18 OF YOU KNOW THIS, BUT IF YOU ARE A PARATRANSIT RIDER, YOU HAVE 19 TO PAY AT LEAST TWICE THE AVERAGE NON-DISCOUNTED BUS OR TRAIN 20 21 FARE. SO, IF YOUR BUS FARE IS, YOU KNOW, \$2, WE, AS PARATRANSIT RIDERS HAVE ON TO PAY \$4 OR MORE. THE EAST BAY 22 PARATRANSIT HAS SOME OF THE HIGHEST FARES IN THE COUNTRY, AND 23 IT IS A DISGRACE. SO I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THIS FARE ISSUE BE 24

DEALT WITH. ANOTHER THING THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE EMPHASIS



1	ON DEMAND SAME DAY PARATRANSIT. BECAUSE I THINK THAT WE NEED
2	TO COMPLETELY CHANGE THE ADA MODEL. AND IN ORDER TO DO THIS,
3	WE NEED TO WORK TO PROVIDE SERVICES WELL ABOVE AND BEYOND THE
4	ADA, AND, FINALLY, I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE A COMPONENT FOR
5	FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT TO FORCE THE AGENCIES TO RESTORE FULL
6	LOCAL SERVICE FOR ALL PEOPLE WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT, WHO
7	ARE LOW-INCOME, WHO LIVE IN NEGLECTED AREAS WHERE PEOPLE OF
8	COLOR LIVE, OR FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND SENIORS. IT IS
9	OUTRAGEOUS THAT MANY OF THESE AGENCIES SUCH AS AC TRANSIT ARE
10	CUTTING LOCAL SERVICE TO ALMOST COMPLETELY, AND PHASING IN BUS
11	RAPID TRANSIT LANES INSTEAD. SO I HOPE THIS WILL BE COVERED
12	UNDER THE COORDINATED PLAN AT SOME POINT. THANK YOU.
13	
14	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC
15	COMMENTS.
16	
17	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU, WALLY. I WANT TO GIVE DRENNEN A
18	CHANCE TO ADDRESS ANY OF THE COMMENTS THAT WERE JUST SHARED.
19	
20	DRENNAN SHELTON: I HAVE TAKEN DOWN EXTENSIVE NOTES, AND I LOOK
21	FORWARD TO COME BACK NEXT MONTH.
22	
23	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. I SEE DWAYNE'S HAND RAISED.



- 1 DWAYNE HANKERSON: I JUST ATTENDED A PARATRANSIT COORDINATED
- 2 COMMITTEE MEETING. I AM A MEMBER OF THAT COMMITTEE FOR SOLANO
- 3 COUNTY. AND THE REASON I CHAISE MY HAND IS, I HOPE THAT ONE OF
- 4 THE THINGS THAT WOULD BE RESEARCHED THAT I LEARNED YESTERDAY,
- 5 WAS THAT THERE ARE CERTAIN TAX I FARES THAT ARE REDUCED SO YOU
- 6 CAN GET TO PLACES THAT YOU HAVE TO GO FOR MEDICAL
- 7 APPOINTMENTS. THERE ARE CERTAIN UBER FARES THAT ARE REDUCED SO
- 8 YOU CAN GET TO YOUR MEDICAL APPOINTMENTS. THESE ARE BY COUNTY.
- 9 THE ONES I HEARD AT THE MEETING YESTERDAY, THEY EVEN INCLUDED
- 10 A PRESENTATION FROM PG&E REGARDING ELECTRICAL OUTAGES AND
- 11 BATTERIES YOU CAN ACTUALLY GET AT A DISCOUNT, BECAUSE YOU ARE
- 12 DISABLED FROM PG&E, AND, ALSO, IF YOU LIVE IF A HOUSE, THEY
- 13 INCLUDED GENERATORS THAT YOU CAN GET FROM PG&E PROBABLY AT NO
- 14 COST. SO, THERE ARE DIFFERENT PROGRAMS. AND I HOPE THAT WHEN
- 15 THIS IS RESEARCHED, IF THERE IS REASON FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY,
- 16 THEN THE RESEARCH FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY WILL BE FOR THOSE
- 17 DISCOUNTED FARES, OR THOSE VANS AND TAX IS THAT WILL TAKE YOU
- 18 TO YOUR APPOINTMENTS AND THEY WILL NOT CHARGE YOU OR CHARGE
- 19 YOU AT 80% DISCOUNT. THANK YOU.

20

- 21 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU, DWAYNE. IF THERE ARE NO MORE
- 22 HANDS RAISED WE CAN MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM SIX THE NEXGEN FREEWAY
- 23 STUDY. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM BUT WE'LL HAVE A CHANCE
- 24 TO PROVIDE INPUT. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO ANUP TAPASE LESLIE.



- 1 ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBERS. IT'S GOODS TO SEE YOU
- 2 ALL AGAIN. MY NAME IS ANUP TAPASE, A REGIONAL PLANNER IN THE
- 3 PLANNING PROGRAM AND A PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE NEXT GENERATION
- 4 FREEWAY STUDY. LAST MONTH, WE INTRODUCED THE STUDY TO THE
- 5 WHOLE COUNCIL. AT THAT MEETING THERE WERE SEVERAL CONCERNS WE
- 6 HEARD REGARDING HOW WE ARE PRIORITIZING EQUITY IN THE PROJECT
- 7 AND HOW WE PLAN TO ENGAGE COMMUNITIES. SO TODAY'S ITEM IS A
- 8 DIRECT FOLLOW UP TO THAT MEETING. COULD WE ASK THE STAFF TO
- 9 BRING UP SLIDES, PLEASE? THANK YOU. OUR TEAM IS COMMITTED TO
- 10 AN EQUITABLE PROCESS, AND SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, MY WORK IS
- 11 GROUNDED IN A PASSION TO ADVANCE EQUITY JUST LIKE ALL OF YOU
- 12 ALSO. WE HEAR YOUR CONCERNS AND ARE HERE TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK
- 13 AND MAKE OUR STUDY PROCESS STRONGER AND BETTER. SO, LET'S
- 14 ADVANCE TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, TODAY'S OBJECTIVES,
- 15 FIRST, WE WOULD LIKE TO CLARIFY GOALS OF THE STUDY ITSELF,
- 16 SINCE THERE WERE QUESTIONS ON WHAT EXACTLY WE ARE TRYING TO
- 17 ACCOMPLISH IN THE STUDY LAST TIME. NEXT, WE WILL TALK ABOUT
- 18 OUR EOUITY FRAMEWORK THAT IS IN DEVELOPMENT WHICH ATTEMPTS TO
- 19 CAPTURE CENTERING EQUITY IN THE PROCESS OF THE STUDY AND
- 20 FINALLY MY COLLEAGUE LESLIE WILL REVIEW THE ENGAGEMENT PLAN
- 21 FOR THE SUMMER AND BEYOND. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE STARTING
- 22 POINT FOR THE STUDY IS STRATEGY T5 IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
- 23 WHICH YOU ALL MIGHT BE FAMILIAR WITH BY NOW. THIS WAS ADOPTED
- 24 BY OUR COMMISSIONERS LAST YEAR AND THE STRATEGY WAS
- 25 SPECIFICALLY TO IMPLEMENT PER MILE TOLLING ON CONGESTED



- 1 FREEWAYS WITH TRANSIT ALTERNATIVES. NOW THE STRATEGY HAS
- 2 STRONG IMPACTS. IN FACT THE STRONGEST OF ANY STRATEGY AND ALL
- 3 PROJECTS COMBINED TO PREVENT A 20 TO 30% RISE IN FREEWAY
- 4 TRAVEL TIMES AND TO MEET EMISSIONS AND GREENHOUSE GAS
- 5 EMISSIONS IN ORDER TO MEET OUR STATE-MANDATED TARGETS EVEN
- 6 WHEN THE STRATEGY INCLUDES A TWO THIRD'S DISCOUNT TO DRIVERS
- 7 AND LOW-INCOMES. TO IMPROVES TALL WILL ALTERNATIVES TRAFFIC
- 8 DIVERSION AS A CHALLENGE AND THE STRATEGY WAS CONTROVERSIAL IT
- 9 GOT LOWEST SUPPORT BECAUSE WHO WANTS AN ADDITIONAL TOLL. THIS
- 10 IS A LONG-TERM STRATEGY IN THE PLAN THAT LOOKS OUT 10, 20, 30
- 11 YEARS AHEAD. AND THE FIRST EARLY ACTION ITEM TO THE STRATEGY
- 12 WAS TO THINK THROUGH POTENTIAL PATHWAYS AND IF THIS IS A
- 13 VIABLE STRATEGY. THAT'S WHAT THIS STUDY IS FOR. WE ALSO
- 14 IDENTIFIED A MAP OF RECOMMENDED FREEWAYS FOR THE STRATEGY
- 15 WHICH YOU SEE ON THE RIGHT, MAINLY FREEWAYS WITH EXISTING OR
- 16 PLANNED TRANSIT ALTERNATIVES, BUT ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THIS IS BY
- 17 NO MEANS SET IN STONE. IT IS A GUIDING MAP FOR OUR STUDY. NEXT
- 18 PAGE, PLEASE. SO OUR STUDY BEGINS WITH RECOGNIZING THAT THE
- 19 STATUS OUO IS NEITHER SUSTAINABLE NOR EOUITABLE AS SEEN IN THE
- 20 CHART ON THE TOP LEFT, TRAFFIC DELAY HAS INCREASED
- 21 CONSISTENTLY, AND OUR STRATEGIES, SO FAR, HAVE NOT KEPT UP
- 22 WITH THE DEMANDS OF OUR GROWING ECONOMY AND OUR POPULATION. WE
- 23 ARE PAYING WITH OUR TIME AS A SOCIETY, IN CONDITIONS
- 24 FREQUENTLY CALLED OUT FOR BEING THE MOST CONGESTED IN THE
- 25 NATION. AND THERE ARE VARIOUS INEQUITIES WE INSUFFICIENT



- 1 GRAPPLE WITH AS WELL. SURVEY DATA SHOWS US THAT PEAK FREEWAY
- 2 USERS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] HIGHER INCOME USERS GAS TAX PENALIZES
- 3 LOW-INCOME DRIVERS WHO ARE MORE LIKELY TO DRIVE OLDER VEHICLES
- 4 NOR EFFICIENCIES. COMMUNITIES OF COLOR ARE DIVIDED BY FREEWAY
- 5 BARRIERS THEY HAVE FACED HISTORICAL DISINVESTMENT AND MUST
- 6 CONTINUE TO LIVE WITH THOSE BARRIERS WHILE FREEWAY INVESTMENTS
- 7 HAVE HISTORICALLY SUPPORTED WHITE SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES AND
- 8 DRIVERS. AND ACCESS TO TRANSIT OPPORTUNITY IS SIGNIFICANTLY
- 9 LOWER UNLESS YOU AND YOUR JOB ARE BY A BART OR CALTRAIN LINE.
- 10 THESE ARE SOME INEQUITIES WE'RE CONSIDERING AND OF COURSE
- 11 THERE IS A MUCH LARGER LIST. NEXT PAGE. THE IDEA THAT WE'RE
- 12 TRYING TO WORK WITHIN THE STUDY IS NOT JUST THAT PRICING
- 13 STRATEGIES CAN HELP ADDRESS OUR CONGESTION AND ENVIRONMENTAL
- 14 OUTCOMES, BUT THAT PRICING STRATEGIES CAN PLAY A ROLE IN
- 15 ADVANCING AN EQUITABLE VISION AND ADVANCING NEXT GENERATION
- 16 FREEWAY NETWORK THE GOAL OF THE STUDY IS NOT TO FIND A WAY TO
- 17 PRICE THE FREEWAY NETWORK WE HAVE HEARD SOME GREAT IDEAS FROM
- 18 OUR ADVISORY GROUP ALREADY ON WHAT A NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY
- 19 NETWORK WOULD LOOK LIKE 10 TO 15 OR 20 YEARS FROM NOW. BOX ON
- 20 THE RIGHT, ONE THAT -- THOSE ARE SOME PRELIMINARY IDEAS THAT
- 21 WE HEARD. ONE THAT ENABLES ADJACENT COMMUNITIES TO OVERCOME
- 22 THE BARRIERS THEY LIVE WITH. A FREEWAY NETWORK THAT IS MULTI-
- 23 MODAL AND INCENTIVIZES SHARED SERVICES AND IS FLEXIBLE SERVING
- 24 AN OPTION WHILE BEING A SUBSET OF THE ENTIRE BAY AREA
- 25 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. FREEWAYS MUST ENABLE CHOICES THAT ARE



- 1 MEANS BASED AND ARE CLEAN IN TERMS OF IMPACT ON AIR OUALITY.
- 2 SO WE WANT TO FURTHER ENHANCE THIS VISION BY ENGAGING OUR
- 3 COMMUNITIES. AND, THEN, WE WANT OUR STUDY TO HELP DETERMINE
- 4 WHETHER PRICING STRATEGIES CAN PLAY A ROLE IN ENABLING THAT
- 5 SHARED VISION. AND WE CAN COMPARE THAT TO A POLICY WITH
- 6 PRICING STRATEGIES INCLUDING WHETHER REVENUE SOURCES MIGHT BE
- 7 NEEDED F WE FIND THERE ARE EQUITABLE PATHWAYS, POTENTIAL
- 8 OUTCOMES, THAT INCLUDE PRICING STRATEGIES, POTENTIAL OUTCOMES
- 9 MAY INCLUDE ONE OR MORE PATHWAYS PRIORITIZED FOR THE REGION,
- 10 SO, IT HELPS US FOCUS THE WHAT OF OUR FUTURE STUDIES. LIKE,
- 11 WHAT DO WE -- LIKE, HOW DO WE WANT TO NARROW DOWN OUR SCOPE OF
- 12 STUDIES, SECOND, POTENTIAL CORRIDORS WITH PROMISING POTENTIAL
- 13 FOR FURTHER STUDIES SO WE CAN FOCUS MORE ON FUTURE STUDDIS AND
- 14 WORK CLOSELY WITH RELEVANT COUNTIES IN FUTURE STUDIES. AND
- 15 MAPPING OUT WHAT STUDY WE NEED WHAT LEGISLATIVE ACTIONS,
- 16 TECHNOLOGIES, EXPLORING FURTHER IMPLEMENTATION ACROSS
- 17 CORRIDORS. THIS IS NOT A ONE AND DONE DEAL. WE ACKNOWLEDGE
- 18 THERE ARE GOING TO BE MANY STEPS. IT IS A MAJOR POLICY
- 19 INITIATIVE BUT FOR NOW LET'S FOCUS ON OUR STUDY AND THINK
- 20 ABOUT HOW WE ENSURE THE PROCESS IS -- THE STUDY PROCESS IS
- 21 EQUITABLE WITH AN EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND TALK ABOUT THE
- 22 ENGAGEMENT PLAN AS WELL NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. CENTERING EQUITY
- 23 HAS TO BEGIN WITH KNOWLEDGING PAST HARMS. SO WE ARE BEING UP
- 24 FRONT ABOUT THIS MANY LAND USE AND TRANSPORTATION DECISIONS
- 25 ROOTED IN RACISM AND CLASSISM HAVE HAD PROFOUND NEGATIVE



- 1 IMPACTS ON COMMUNITIES. AND WE WOULD LIKE TO START THE
- 2 ENGAGEMENT ANALYSIS IN THE STUDY ON THE RIGHT FOOT. THE EQUITY
- 3 FRAMEWORK WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IS INTENDED TO CONSCIOUSLY
- 4 PRIORITIZE EOUITY AS WE SHIFT NEW POLICY IN LINE WITH OUR
- 5 AGENCY'S EOUITY PLATFORM. NEXT PAGE, PLEASE. THANKFULLY, WE
- 6 ARE NOT STARTING FROM SCRATCH. WE REVIEWED COMPARATIVE
- 7 TRANSPORTATION EQUITY FRAMEWORKS TO INFORM THIS STUDY. THE
- 8 FIRST TWO REPORTS ARE IN FACT ONE THAT TWO MEMBERS OF OUR
- 9 ADVISORY GROUP ARE INVOLVED IN THE FIRST ONE IS THE TOOLKIT
- 10 TRANSFORM SECOND IS CORPORATIVE HIGHWAY RESEARCH PROGRAM BOTH
- 11 SPECIFICALLY DEVELOPED FOR PRICING PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT AND
- 12 IMPLEMENTATION THE THIRD IS MOBILITY EOUITY FRAMEWORK. THERE
- 13 IS STILL A LOT TO LEARN FROM THESE FRAMEWORKS AND THINKING
- 14 ABOUT HOW WE CAN CENTER EQUITY IN THE STUDY. WE REVIEWED KEY
- 15 THEMES AND IDENTIFIED SOME PRELIMINARY PRINCIPLES THAT I'M
- 16 GOING TO TALK ABOUT IN THE FOLLOWING SLIDES. NEXT SLIDE
- 17 PLEASE. FIRST PRINCIPLE IS TO IDENTIFY POPULATION THAT IS
- 18 DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTED BY ANY SORT OF POLICY THAT WE'RE
- 19 TALKING ABOUT. THINKING THROUGH CONSTRAINTS AND HOW THEY MIGHT
- 20 BE IMPACTED. SO THE GROUPS SHOWN HERE ARE BASED ON OUR
- 21 EXISTING EQUITY PRIORITIES FRAMEWORK AS WELL AS IDENTIFIED
- 22 GROUPS THAT WE HEAR OF REGARDING CONCERNS IN PAST MEETINGS, AS
- 23 WELL AS STUDY IN OTHER LOCATIONS LIKE OREGON AND LOS ANGELES.
- 24 INCLUDING WORKERS WITH LOW-INCOME, LIKE JANITORIAL, RETAIL AND
- 25 FOOD SERVICE WORKERS MIDDLE INCOME WORKERS LIKE CONSTRUCTION



- 1 AND BUILDING SERVICE WORKERS, WORKING PARENTS AND SCHOOL AGE
- 2 CHILDREN, STUDENTS, AND RESIDENTS. THE GEOGRAPHIC SCOPE OF
- 3 THESE POPULATIONS FOR OUR STUDY IS ALL BAY AREA RESIDENTS AND
- 4 COMMUTERS FROM OUTSIDE THE REGION. AND, SO, HOW EXACTLY MIGHT
- 5 WE IMPLEMENT THIS PRINCIPLE IN OUR STUDY? SO WE WILL
- 6 PRIORITIZE ENGAGEMENT WITH THESE COMMUNITIES AND LISTEN AND
- 7 LEARN FROM THEM SEEK TRAVEL PATTERNS AND THEN THINK ABOUT HOW
- 8 ANY POLICIES WE'RE SHAPING WOULD BENEFIT OUR BURDEN THEM BASED
- 9 ON THEIR CONSTRAINTS AND TRAVEL PATTERNS. SECOND THING, ON THE
- 10 NEXT SLIDE, THAT EMERGED FROM THE FRAMEWORKS IS ARTICULATING
- 11 GOALS AND MEASURING OUTCOMES. SO HOW MIGHT WE THINK ABOUT THIS
- 12 IN THE STUDY. WE STARTED THIS PROCESS WITH THE ADVISORY GROUP
- 13 WITH THINKING ABOUT SOME GOALS AND WE WILL HAVE AMPLE TIME TO
- 14 THINK ABOUT THIS FURTHER OVER THE NEXT MANY MONTHS. WE WILL
- 15 LISTEN AND LEARN FROM COMMUNITIES THIS SUMMER AND WITH THAT
- 16 INPUT WE COULD WORK TOWARD FINALIZING THOSE GOALS AND ENSURING
- 17 THEY ARE SPECIFIC, MEASURABLE, RELEVANT, TIME BOUND AND
- 18 INCLUDING EOUITABLE. FINALLY BASED ON THOSE GOALS WE IDENTIFY
- 19 WHAT ARE THE DESIRED OUTCOMES AND WHAT ARE METRICS THAT CAN BE
- 20 USED TO COMPARE DEVELOPMENT PATHWAYS. AND WE WORK WITH OUR
- 21 ADVISERS GROUP IN DETERMINING THOSE METRICS. THIRD THEME,
- 22 FRAMING WHAT WE STUDY WITH THE ATTENTION THAT WE INCLUDE
- 23 EQUITY THINKING THROUGH ANTICIPATED BENEFITS ARE DISTRIBUTED
- 24 EQUITABLY AND ADDRESS PAST HARMS WE TALK ABOUT PATHWAYS IN
- 25 COMBINATION WITH PRICING STRATEGIES. WE START TO THINK ABOUT



- 1 CONCEPTS LATER THIS SUMMER WITH THE ADVISORY GROUP. THE
- 2 ENGAGEMENT OF OUR COMMUNITIES WILL HELP US LEARN ABOUT
- 3 STRATEGIES THAT CAN BE PART OF THAT LIST OF COMPLEMENT WE
- 4 STRATEGIES AND IN THE FALL WITH THAT INFORMATION WE CAN
- 5 COLLECTIVELY DEFINE A FEW PATHWAYS THAT WE WANT TO ANALYZE AND
- 6 THIS COULD INCLUDE A PATHWAY THAT PERHAPS DOES NOT INCLUDE A
- 7 PRICING STRATEGY BUT THINKING THROUGH WHAT CAN BE DONE
- 8 OTHERWISE. SO, WHILE DEFINE SOUNDS LIKE A MAY BE A STRONG WORD
- 9 HERE FOR DEFINING PATHWAYS WHAT WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO DO IS
- 10 WORK THROUGH DIFFERENT CONCEPTS AND BEGIN TO FILTER WHAT ARE
- 11 THE PATHWAYS THAT ARE MOST BENEFICIAL AND EQUITABLE TO
- 12 CONSIDER FOR FUTURE STUDIES. THE FOURTH THEME WAS TO MEASURE
- 13 BENEFITS AND BURDENS. AND THE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES THIS
- 14 INCLUDES QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS AND MODELS INCLUDE WEAKNESSES
- 15 AND LIMITATIONS. INCLUDING OUALITATIVE ANALYSIS CRITERIA AND
- 16 DISCUSSIONS. WHAT CAN BE EXAMPLES OF THESE BENEFITS AND
- 17 BURDENS ON THE RIGHT. WHAT REASONABLE ALTERNATIVE
- 18 TRANSPORTATION CHOICES WILL BE AVAILABLE TO PEOPLE. WITH
- 19 TRAVEL TIME SAVINGS ARE THEY EXPERIENCED BY ALL USERS AND WILL
- 20 THE PROJECT DIVERT A SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF TRAFFIC TO
- 21 VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES IF SO WHAT ARE THE RELATED IMPACTS ON
- 22 HEALTH AND SAFETY TRAVEL OUTCOMES. OF COURSE, THIS IS
- 23 SOMETHING WE AGAIN WILL WORK WITH OUR ADVISORY GROUP LATER IN
- 24 THE PROCESS. AND THEN GOING TO THE NEXT SLIDE THE FINAL THEME,
- 25 EQUITABLE OUTCOMES BASED ON METRICS AND BURDENS AND ANALYSIS.



- 1 ALL OF THE STEPS IN THE FRAMEWORK WILL INVOLVE ITERATION.
- 2 THROUGHOUT THE STUDY AS WE DEFINE PATHWAYS TOWARDS THE FINAL
- 3 RECOMMENDATIONS. SO THIS IS OUR INITIAL IDEA ON HOW WE CENTER
- 4 EOUITY IN THE PROCESS OF THE STUDY AND WE WOULD LIKE TO GET
- 5 YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY ON HOW CAN WE ENSURE EQUITY IS CENTRAL IN
- 6 THIS PROCESS. DO THESE PRINCIPLES RESONATE WITH YOU? ARE THERE
- 7 STEPS THAT ARE MISSING? YEAH. SO, WITH THAT, I WILL NOW PASS
- 8 IT ON TO LESLIE WHOLE COVER THE REST OF THE PRESENTATION,
- 9 ESPECIALLY ABOUT OUR ENGAGEMENT PLAN.

- 11 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS LESLIE
- 12 ENRIQUEZ. I AM WITH THE PUBLIC INFORMATION TEAM. I AM YOUNGER
- 13 MIDDLE AGE BROWN WOMAN WITH BLACK AND WHITE HAIR SHOULDER
- 14 LENGTH I'M WEARING A BLUE SHIRT GLASSES AND BRIGHT LIPSTICK
- 15 AND MY BACKGROUND IS BLURRED. WE ARE GOING TO SLIDE 16. BEFORE
- 16 I JUMP INTO MY SLIDE I WANT TO TAKE A STEP BACK AND
- 17 ACKNOWLEDGE A COUPLE OF THINGS. WHEN WE BEGIN PROJECTS LIKE
- 18 THESE THAT ARE VERY NEBULOUS AND VERY SORT OF PIE IN THE SKY
- 19 SO TO SPEAK, THERE IS A LOT OF VERY IMPORTANT REFINEMENT THAT
- 20 NEEDS TO HAPPEN. AND, SO, I JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THIS VERY
- 21 IMPORTANT ROLE THAT YOU ALL, AND OUR ADVISORY GROUP PLAY IN
- 22 HELPING STAFF TO LEAD US DOWN A MORE PRODUCTIVE PATH. ALSO, I
- 23 WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THIS IS A VERY CHALLENGING AND VERY
- 24 CONTROVERSIAL TOPIC, AND WE COULD EASILY GO DOWN RABBIT HOLES
- 25 THAT LEAD US NOWHERE. WE ARE JUST ONLY GETTING STARTED, AND



- 1 THESE CONVERSATIONS WITH GO IN A MYRIAD OF DIFFERENT
- 2 DIRECTIONS, INCLUDING BACKWARDS. AND IF I MAY BE SO BOLD, I
- 3 DON'T THINK THAT THAT'S WHERE WE WANT TO GO. SO, WE NEED TO
- 4 PUT A LOT OF THOUGHT INTO HOW WE ARE GOING TO CONDUCT OUR
- 5 ENGAGEMENT SO THAT WE USE YOUR AND OUR PARTNERS AND THE
- 6 PUBLIC'S TIME AND EXPERTISE IN A WAY THAT IS FOCUSED ON THE
- 7 CONSIDERATIONS AND ISSUES THAT REALLY ARE GOING TO MOVE US
- 8 FORWARD INTO ENVISIONING A TRULY NEXT GENERATION BAY AREA
- 9 FREEWAY NETWORK. SO, BACK TO MY SLIDE HERE. SLIDE 13. WE HAVE
- 10 DEVELOPED A MULTI-PRONG APPROACH TO OUR ENGAGEMENT FOR THIS
- 11 STUDY BEGINNING WITH FOCUSED ENGAGEMENT BROADENING TO A PUBLIC
- 12 ENGAGEMENT STUDY PROGRESS. THE APPROACH WAS INFORMED BY
- 13 EXTENSIVE RESEARCH BY STAFF AS WELL AS LESSONS LEARNED BOTH BY
- 14 COLLEAGUES AND INTERNALLY EXPERIENCES OF PARTNER AGENCIES THAT
- 15 HAVE DONE SIMILAR WORK. THIS IS A MULTI-PRONGED APPROACH
- 16 INCLUDING ONGOING STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT THROUGHOUT THE
- 17 PROCESS. THE FIRST OF WHICH WE ARE KICKING OFF NEXT WEEK. THIS
- 18 TIMELINE IS OUR ACTIVITIES SHOWING THE TIMELINE OF THE STUDY
- 19 PHASES AT THE TOP FOLLOWED BY THE TIMELINE OF OUR ONGOING
- 20 ENGAGEMENT BELOW, AND BELOW THAT IS TIMELINE OF COMMUNITY
- 21 ENGAGEMENT AND BEYOND THAT SUMMARY OF OUR COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
- 22 ACTIVITIES BROKE UP INTO LISTS OF THREE ROUNDS. FIRST ROUND OF
- 23 ENGAGEMENT IS BROKEN UP INTO TWO SUBROUNDS FOCUSED AROUND
- 24 SUMMER AND THE NEXT HAPPENING LATER THIS YEAR. ENGAGEMENT IS
- 25 HAPPENING THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS INCLUDING ENGAGEMENT WITH



- 1 ADVISORY GROUPS ONE-ON-ONE MEETINGS WITH STAKEHOLDERS
- 2 INCLUDING MEETINGS WITH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS BUSINESS
- 3 GROUPS LABOR GROUPS ADVOCACY GROUPS AND ANY OTHER
- 4 ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE INTERESTED IN THIS WORK. INCLUDING
- 5 GOVERNMENT ENGAGEMENT AND CONSULTATION WITH OUR REGION'S
- 6 FEDERALLY RECOGNIZED TRIBES AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST UPDATES
- 7 WITH YOU ALL POLICY ADVISORY UPDATES TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
- 8 SUBCOMMITTEE. ONE DAY ENGAGEMENT IS OUR FOCUSED START
- 9 INCLUDING SMALL GROUP DISCUSSIONS ROUND B WILL INCLUDE
- 10 WEBINARS AND HOPEFULLY POP-UP WORKSHOPS THROUGHOUT THE REGION
- 11 IF COVID ALLOWS OF COURSE AND SOME DIGITAL PROMOTION OF
- 12 EVENTS. ROUND TWO WHICH WE HAVE PRELIMINARILY HAVE STARTED TO
- 13 THINK ABOUT COULD INCLUDE SMALL GROUP DISCUSSIONS, VIDEOS IS
- 14 WEBINARS, STATISTICALLY VALID POLL AND OTHER ACTIVITIES TO BE
- 15 DETERMINED, HOWEVER NONE OF THE ROUND TWO ACTIVITIES SET IN
- 16 STONE YET SINCE THE ENGAGEMENT APPROACH BY THE SECOND ROUND
- 17 WILL BE INFORMED BY THE PROGRESS OF THE TECHNICAL ANALYSIS. WE
- 18 ARE FIRMLY COMMITTED TO MOVING AT THE SPEED OF TRUST. SO LIKE
- 19 I SAID THE ROUND TWO APPROACH IS VERY PRELIMINARY. NEXT SLIDE
- 20 PLEASE. AS I MENTIONED, DURING OUR ONGOING ENGAGEMENT WE WANT
- 21 TO MEET WITH GROUPS AND ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE INTERESTED IN
- 22 THIS TOPIC, AND THIS SLIDE IS A LIST OF SOME OF THE
- 23 ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE WANTING TO ENGAGE THAT, WE ARE WANTING
- 24 TO ENGAGE WITH FOR OUR ONE-ON-ONE MEETINGS. WE'RE TARGETING
- 25 CBOS AND BUSINESS AND LABOR GROUPS, AS WELL AS ADVOCACY



- 1 ORGANIZATIONS AND COALITIONS, AND WE WELCOME ANY FEEDBACK AND
- 2 SUGGESTIONS FOR ADDITIONAL ORGANIZATIONS THAT WE SHOULD REACH
- 3 OUT TO AND ENGAGE. AND THE FREQUENCY OF ENGAGEMENT WILL, OF
- 4 COURSE, BE BASED ON EACH ORGANIZATION'S PREFERENCE. NEXT
- 5 SLIDE, PLEASE. AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, OUR APPROACH TO
- 6 ENGAGEMENT WAS TO START FOCUS OR IS TO START FOCUS AND THEN
- 7 SHIFT TO BROADER ENGAGEMENT BASED ON THE LESSONS LEARNED FROM
- 8 OUR PARTNERS AND COLLEAGUES. AND THIS IS, AS I MENTIONED, A
- 9 VERY DIFFICULT CONVERSATION AND IT CONTINUE TO GENERATE
- 10 IMMEDIATE OPPOSITION, AND SO TO AVOID HAVING THE DOOR SHUT IN
- 11 OUR FACE, AND TO KEEP THE FEEDBACK USEFUL, STAFF'S INITIAL
- 12 APPROACH IS TO FACILITATE NUANCED ONE-ON-ONE CONVERSATIONS, IS
- 13 SMALL GROUP DISCUSSION IN ROUND 1A FOCUSED ON COMMUNITIES
- 14 AFFECTED MOST. ON THIS SLIDE, THIS SLIDE DESCRIBES, ON THE
- 15 RIGHT SIDE, THE SLIDE DESCRIBES THE WHY SOME ACTIVITIES WE'LL
- 16 BE CONDUCTING AND THE LEFT WE HAVE THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES
- 17 ROUND ONE AT THE TOP ROUND TWO IN THE MIDDLE AND THE NEXT AT
- 18 THE BOTTOM. INCLUDING THOSE WHO HAVE HISTORICALLY BEEN LEFT
- 19 OUT OF THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS. THE GOALS FOR ROUND 1A OF
- 20 THE ENGAGEMENT INCLUDE UNDERSTANDING OUR COMMUNITIES VISION OF
- 21 A NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY SYSTEM GAINING A NUANCED
- 22 UNDERSTANDING WITH THE CONCEPTION OF AND CONCERNS WITH
- 23 PRICING, BEGINNING TO LEARN ABOUT THE COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES
- 24 THAT MAKE PRICING MORE EQUITABLE. STAFF ACKNOWLEDGES THAT
- 25 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT IS IMPORTANT AND VALUABLE AND AS SUCH WILL



- 1 ENCOMPASS INTO OUR APPROACH. ONCE WE HAVE WELL FORMULATED
- 2 IDEAS ROUND 1B IS ONE WE THOUGHT WOULD BE AN APPROPRIATE TIME
- 3 TO AGAIN BROADENING OUR ENGAGEMENT WITH THE GOAL OF GATHERING
- 4 FURTHER FEEDBACK ON GOALS AND REFINING SOME PATHWAYS FOR
- 5 FURTHER ANALYSIS. WE ARE GOING TO BE MOVING AT THE SPEED OF
- 6 TRUST AND WHILE WE HAVE SOME THOUGHTS HERE ON ROUND TWO, IT IS
- 7 STILL IN THE VERY PRELIMINARY STAGE, AND WE WILL CERTAINLY BE
- 8 COMING BACK TO YOU FOR FURTHER REFINEMENT OF OUR ROUND TWO
- 9 STRATEGY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE GOALS OF OUR
- 10 EVALUATION, OF OUR EFFORTS AT THE TOP AND THEN BELOW THAT WE
- 11 HAVE TWO LISTS THAT INCLUDE THE QUESTIONS THAT CAN HELP US
- 12 DEFINE SUCCESS ON THE RIGHT THEN A LIST OF THE METRICS TO
- 13 DETERMINE SUCCESS ON THE LEFT OF THE GUIDED BY MTC'S PUBLIC
- 14 PARTICIPATION PLAN AND OUR EQUITY PLATFORM, WE AIM TO
- 15 CONTINUALLY EVALUATE OUR ENGAGEMENT STRATEGY TO, ONE, ENSURE
- 16 HISTORICALLY UNDER REPRESENTED COMMUNITIES CAN MEANINGFUL
- 17 INFLUENCE DECISION-MAKING AND, TWO, ENSURE AN OPEN AND
- 18 TRANSPARENT PROCESS WITH AMPLE OPPORTUNITY FOR ENGAGEMENT. WE
- 19 ARE CURRENTLY WORKING TO DEFINE SUCCESS AND WE WOULD LIKE YOUR
- 20 FEEDBACK TO DEVELOP THIS DEFINITION. SOME OF THE PRELIMINARY
- 21 QUESTIONS THAT ARE ONGOING EVALUATION IS GOING TO SEEK TO
- 22 ANSWER TO DEFINE SUCCESS INCLUDE, ARE THE RIGHT STAKEHOLDERS
- 23 AT THE TABLE? DOES THE PROCESS ALLOW FOR ALL VOICES TO BE
- 24 HEARD? DOES THE PROCESS INCREASE OPPORTUNITY? AND DOES IT
- 25 SHIFT THE DECISION-MAKING POWER? AND DO THE POLICIES AND



- 1 SOLUTIONS ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF THOSE MOST AFFECTED? SOME OF
- 2 THE METRICS WE CAN USE TO GAUGE OUR SUCCESS -- AND I JUST WANT
- 3 TO NOTE THAT THIS INFORMATION THAT WE -- THIS IS INFORMATION
- 4 THAT WE CAN COLLECT VIA SURVEYS, INCLUDE DEMOGRAPHICS. SO,
- 5 ASKING FOR FEEDBACK ON THE OUALITY OF OUR CONTENT AND
- 6 MATERIALS, ON THE QUALITY OF OUR ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES, MAKING
- 7 SURE FOLKS HAVE ACCESS TO OUR INFORMATION IN BOTH THE LANGUAGE
- 8 AND THE FORMAT THAT WORKS BEST FOR THEM, AND, LASTLY, TRACKING
- 9 WHO IS ENGAGED IS SUBMITTING COMMENTS TO ENSURE THAT WE'RE NOT
- 10 MISSING ANY VOICES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BEFORE WE OPEN UP FOR
- 11 QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSIONS I WANT TO REITERATE OUR DISCUSSIONS
- 12 INCLUDE DIVERSITY OF GROUPS AND VOICES. WE ARE LOOKING TO
- 13 REFINE OUR WORK TO INFORM OUR CONCEPT THAT WE CAN TAKE OUT TO
- 14 THE WORLD WITH THE BROADER PUBLIC IN A PRODUCTIVE IMPACTFUL
- 15 WAY VERSUS HAVING THE DOOR SLAMMED IN OUR FACES PREMATURELY.
- 16 WE HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS ASKING FOR FEEDBACK RELATED TO
- 17 THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK. AND THESE QUESTIONS ARE CERTAINLY NOT
- 18 EXHAUSTIVE, AND WE WELCOME ANY FEEDBACK FROM YOU, BUT THE
- 19 QUESTIONS ARE: DO THE PRINCIPLES OF OUR EQUITY FRAMEWORK
- 20 RESONATE WITH YOU? AND ARE THERE ANY MISSING ELEMENT IN
- 21 IMPLEMENTATION? AND THEN ON THE LEFT, THE FEEDBACK WE WOULD
- 22 LIKE ON THE ENGAGEMENT PLAN IS, IF YOU HAVE ANY FEEDBACK ON
- 23 THE TIMING ON THE NATURE OF PLANNED ACTIVITIES, WE WELCOME IT,
- 24 AND THEN, ALSO, HOW BEST CAN STAFF DEFINE AND MEASURE SUCCESS
- 25 BEFORE THE ENGAGEMENT PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE. SO THE FINAL SLIDE



- 1 HERE HAS OUR NEXT STEPS ON THE LEFT. SO, IN THE SPRING WE'LL
- 2 BE REVIEWING THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND PRELIMINARY GOALS. AND
- 3 THEN LATER IN THE SPRING, EARLY SUMMER, WE'LL HAVE -- WE'LL
- 4 START DEVELOPING OUR PATHWAYS CONCEPTS AND THEN IN THE SUMMER,
- 5 AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, WE'LL BE DOING OUR FIRST ROUND OF
- 6 ENGAGEMENT, AND WITH THAT WE CAN OPEN IT UP FOR QUESTIONS AND
- 7 DISCUSSION. THANK YOU

8

- 9 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU VERY MUCH ANUP AND LESLIE. I WOULD
- 10 LIKE TO OPEN UP FOR COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS. AND I SEE
- 11 FRANK'S HAND RAISED.

12

- 13 FRANK WELTE: I HAVE TWO QUESTIONS, FIRST OFF, WHEN YOUR POLLS
- 14 ARE SHOWING THAT FREEWAY TOLLS ARE UNPOPULAR, WHY ARE YOU
- 15 TRYING TO PUSH IT? THAT DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. MY SECOND QUESTION
- 16 IS, AS A BLIND PERSON, I FIND YOUR PRESENTATION SLIDES
- 17 DIFFICULT TO READ. APPARENTLY YOU DON'T VALUE MY OPINION ABOUT
- 18 YOUR INFORMATION.

- 20 ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU FRANK. I APOLOGIZE FOR THE SECOND POINT
- 21 ON THESE SLIDES NOT BEING EASY TO READ. WE DID TRY TO CONFORM
- 22 THEM TO ACCESSIBILITY STANDARDS. BUT I AM SURE WE CAN DO A
- 23 BETTER JOB. SO THAT FEEDBACK POINT IS TAKEN. ON THE FIRST
- 24 POINT ABOUT THIS NOT POLLING WELL, THERE ARE, I WOULD SAY, A
- 25 NUMBER OF STRATEGIES THAT DO NOT -- MAYBE DO NOT POLL SO WELL,



- 1 BUT SOMETIMES OUR COMMISSIONERS OR ELECTED OFFICIALS ARE ABLE
- 2 TO THINK FORWARD AND THINK ABOUT THE LONGER TERM IMPACTS OR
- 3 BENEFITS, OR THE POTENTIAL LONGER TERM BENEFITS THAT
- 4 SUBSTRATEGIES CAN HAVE, AND THEREFORE THEY ARE WORTH
- 5 EVALUATING FURTHER. SO, AGAIN, WE, AS I MENTIONED, ARE NOT
- 6 TRYING TO IMPLEMENT PRICING AS AN OUTCOME OF THE STUDY IT'S
- 7 SOMETHING WE EVALUATE FOR THE FUTURE IS ANOTHER WAY OF DOING
- 8 IT.

9

10 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: DWAYNE?

- 12 DWAYNE HANKERSON: MY OUESTION, I WANT TO STAY ON POINT, BUT I
- 13 THINK PART OF THE PROBLEM WITH THE INEQUITY IN THE FREEWAYS, I
- 14 TRAVEL FROM VACAVILLE, AND EVERY DAY THE FREEWAY SLOWS DOWN IN
- 15 THE SAME SPOT. SO I DON'T KNOW IF HAD IS AN ENGINEERING
- 16 QUESTION, BUT WHY IS THAT? AND THEN THE SECOND PART OF MY
- 17 STATEMENT IS, I THINK THAT EVEN WITH INPUT FROM COMMUNITIES
- 18 THAT HAVE NOT HAD VOICES BEFORE, WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO FIND IS
- 19 THAT WE NEED NEW PATHS TO GET TO WORK. LIKE, NEW PATHS WHERE
- 20 IS WE KNOW, WHERE IT'S ADVERTISED HOW TO GET TO THIS PLACE,
- 21 HOW TO STOP, HOW TO GET ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AND FROM
- 22 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION TO GET TO WHERE WE WANT, AND HOW LONG
- 23 IT'S GOING TO TAKE. AND I THINK THAT'S THE INEQUITY IN THE
- 24 WHOLE SITUATION FOR EVERYBODY. I THINK EVERYBODY NEEDS A



VOICE, AND YOU ARE CORRECT. BUT I THINK THAT'S PART OF THE 1 2 APPROACH THAT SHOULD BE MADE WITH THIS SITUATION. THANK YOU. 3 ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU. REGARDING THE FIRST OUESTION ON THE 4 5 PINCH POINT ON THE 180 FREEWAY, NOT SURE I CAN DIRECTLY ANSWER THAT QUESTION IT COULD BE RELATED TO MULTIPLE FACTORS TO WHERE 6 THE JOB CENTERS ARE OR SHOPPING CENTERS OR WHERE RESIDENTS ARE 7 8 TRAVELING FROM, COULD BE AN OPERATIONAL ISSUE TOO. 9 10 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: I SEE HOWARD'S HAND RAISED. 11 HOWARD WONG: I THINK THIS IS A VERY GOOD PROJECT THAT WILL 12 HELP BRING TOGETHER A LOT OF EXISTING DATA STUDIES, RESEARCH. 13 THE SUBJECT, OBVIOUSLY, HAS BEEN STUDIED A LOT, AND NEEDS TO 14 15 HAVE A BROADER TIME TIED TOGETHER, SO TO SPEAK. I THINK IT'S 16 IMPORTANT TO THE STATE THAT THERE ARE NO PRECONCEPTIONS FROM THIS STUDY, SO THAT, I THINK IT'S A WONDERFUL EDUCATIONAL 17 PROCESS WHICH WILL INFORM NOT ONLY THE PUBLIC, BUT I THINK THE 18 AGENCIES AND STAFF AND THE PROFESSIONAL TRANSPORTATION WORLD 19 ALSO. I THINK THE FOCUS MIGHT BE NOT ON HIGHWAYS OR ROADS, BUT 20 HOW TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR EVERYONE. AND THE FOCUS 21 MIGHT INCLUDE HOW DO WE SAVE PEOPLE TIME, SAVE PEOPLE MONEY. 22 AND IMPROVE PEOPLE'S HEALTH. AND THAT THE MANAGEMENT AND 23 DESIGN OF ROADS AND HIGHWAYS IS A MEANS TO DO THAT. I THINK 24

THERE ARE MANY CASE STUDIES THAT SHOULD BE LOOKED AT, SO THAT



1	AND PRESENTATIONS THAT ONE CAN SHOW ALL THE SUCCESS STORIES
2	IN THE WORLD. FOR INSTANCE, CITIES WITH 60% TO 70% TRANSIT
3	MODAL SHARE OR ROADS THAT HAVE LITTLE CONGESTION BECAUSE THE
4	MANAGEMENT OF WORK TIMES. REDUCTION OF SINGLE OCCUPANT CARS
5	AND OTHER SUCCESS STORIES AROUND THE WORLD. SO I THINK THE
6	FOCUS SHOULD BE AS AN EDUCATION PROCESS FOR EVERYONE. THANK
7	YOU.
8	
9	ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU.
10	
11	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: ARE THERE ANY OTHER SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS
12	WITH FRANK, IS THAT AN OLD HAND OR A NEW HAND?
13	
14	FRANK WELTE: OLD HAND.
15	
16	CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: OKAY. YES, CHRIS?
17	
18	SPEAKER: I'M CURIOUS ABOUT THIS STUDY. CORRECT ME IF I AM
19	WRONG YOU'RE LOOKING AT.
20	
21	ANUP TAPASE: IS THE QUESTION ARE WE CONSIDERING 880?
22	
23	CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: YES.



ANUP TAPASE: IT IS ONE OF THE CORRODORS. WE HAVEN'T GOTTEN 1 INTO CORRIDORS YET, THE FACT THAT IT'S PARALLEL TO TRANSIT, IT 2 3 IS UNDER CONSIDERATION. BUT I'M SURE THERE WILL BE A LOT OF ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND ENGAGEMENT AROUND THAT CORRIDOR GIVEN THE 4 5 EXTENT OF VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES THAT ARE ALONG THAT CORRIDOR. 6 7 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: CONSIDERING THERE ARE A NUMBER OF LONG 8 HAUL TRUCKERS THAT ARE INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS, I'M NOT SURE HOW THAT WORKS FOR THEM. WHEN THEY PAY A FLAT FEE FOR X NUMBER 9 OF DAYS OR WHATEVER, BUT THAT'S A SIGNIFICANT COST TO THEM IF 10 THEY DO. AND I'M WONDERING, CONSIDERING PRICE OF GAS OR 11 DIESEL, DEPENDING ON WHAT THEIR TRUCK USES, THAT'S CERTAINLY 12 GOING TO AFFECT THEM. AND, YOU KNOW, AS MANY OF US KNOW, MANY 13 OF THOSE DRIVERS ARE LOW-INCOME, VERY LOW-INCOME, PEOPLE OF 14 15 COLOR. 16 ANUP TAPASE: YEAH. THANKS CHRIS THAT'S A VERY VALID POINT. 17 WE'RE HAPPY TO HAVE SOMEONE FROM THE CALIFORNIA TRUCKING 18 ASSOCIATION ON OUR ADVISORY GROUP WHO REPRESENTS ALL SMALLER 19 INDEPENDENT TRUCKERS TO LARGER OPERATORS TOO. IF THERE ARE 20 21 ORGANIZATIONS THAT YOU'RE AWARE OF THAT REPRESENT SMALLER INDEPENDENT TRUCKERS, WE WOULD HAPPY TO ENGAGE WITH THEM. 22 23 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. CAN I ASK WHAT OTHER STUDIES WE 24 MIGHT BE FOREGOING BY INVESTING TIME IN THIS GIVEN THAT IT DID 25



POLIO. I'M JUST CURIOUS IF THERE ARE OTHER ALTERNATIVE STUDIES 1 2 THAT WE COULD BE DOING? 3 ANUP TAPASE: I BELIEVE THAT A LOT OF THE STUD THAT'S CAME OUT 4 5 OF THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ARE UNDER PROGRESS. I'M NOT SURE I CAN COMMENT ON WHAT WE MIGHT BE 6 MISSING OUT ON, BUT I CAN CERTAINLY ASK OUR SECTION DIRECTOR 7 8 AND GET BACK TO YOU ON THAT. 9 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU. ARE THERE 10 11 ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS? ANY COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC? 12 13 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. THERE IS ONE PUBLIC SPEAKER IN THE 14 BOARDROOM. THERE IS NO PUBLIC SPEAKER ON ZOOM. WOULD THE 15 16 PUBLIC SPEAKER IN THE BOARDROOM WOULD GO UP TO THE PODIUM AND TURN ON THE MICROPHONE? 17 18 SPEAKER: JAYNE KRAEMER. YOU KNOW, I SINCERELY RESPECT THE WORK 19 THAT YOU HAVE CUT OUT FOR YOURSELVES IN TERMS OF INFORMING 20 21 YOURSELVES FROM A WIDE-BASED COMMUNITY INPUT. AND, ALSO, 22 TRYING TO CULTIVATE IN DEPTH PERSPECTIVES. NOW, I SAY THAT 23 BECAUSE SO MANY TIMES I HAVE GONE TO MTC-RELATED MEETINGS AS A PUBLICLY INTERESTED PERSON, AND WHAT HAPPENS IS I END UP AT A 24

TABLE WITH A BUNCH OF PEOPLE WHO COME FROM SPECIFIC



- 1 ORGANIZATIONS, WHICH IS FINE, BUT THEY COME WITH AN AGENDA.
- 2 AND GIVEN THE TIME ALLOWED, THERE IS NO DISCUSSION. IT'S JUST
- 3 EACH PERSON STATES THEIR OWN AGENDA, THEIR OWN POSITION. THE -
- 4 THEIR INSTITUTION THAT THEY REPRESENT. SO, THERE IS REALLY
- 5 NO TIME FOR SOMEONE LIKE ME TO DIGEST IT ALL AND TRY AND GIVE
- 6 HER INPUT. OR IF I DO, IT GETS LOST, BECAUSE THAT'S NOT REALLY
- 7 WHAT THE PEOPLE AT THAT TABLE WERE THERE FOR. THEY DIDN'T COME
- 8 TO LISTEN TO ME. THEY CAME TO BROADCAST THEIR POINT OF VIEW.
- 9 SO, THERE WAS NO OPEN MINDEDNESS. AND NO INTEREST IN REALLY
- 10 DISCUSSING THE ISSUE IN DEPTH. I APPRECIATE WHAT YOU'RE TRYING
- 11 DO BECAUSE IT NEEDS TO BE DONE AND IT NEEDS TO BE DONE WELL.
- 12 THANK YOU.

13

16

- 14 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC
- 15 SPEAKERS.
- 17 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. IF THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC
- 18 SPEAKERS, WE CAN MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SEVEN. WHICH IS
- 19 NEW BUSINESS.
- 21 HOWARD WONG: I JUST WANTED TO MAKE A QUICK COMMENT. MS.
- 22 KRAEMER'S COMMENTS, I THINK ARE -- SHOULD BE TAKEN TO HEART. I
- 23 THINK, YOU KNOW, TRANSPORTATION, AND NEIGHBORHOOD ADVOCATES
- 24 AND THOSE LIKE MYSELF, WHO HAVE ATTENDED MANY, MANY MEETINGS,
- 25 AND GENERALLY, THOSE MEETINGS DO TEND TO SKEW TOWARD A SIMILAR



TYPE OF PEOPLE. SO, A STUDY SHOULD ACTUALLY GO OUT TO THE 1 PEOPLE RATHER THAN THE PEOPLE COMING TO THE STUDY. THE STUDY 2 3 SHOULD GO WHERE PEOPLE ARE, OR AVERAGE PEOPLE ARE. THANK YOU. 4 5 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU, HOWARD. I SEE TERRY'S HAND 6 RAISED. 7 8 TERRY SCOTT: YES. I JUST HAVE ONE COMMENT. I'M HEARING, AND I'M SEEING A LOT OF WHAT WE'RE DOING. AND IT'S, TO ME, OF ITS 9 AN INCREDIBLE UNDERTAKING. AND THE CONCERN THAT I HAVE IS, I'M 10 CONCERNED THAT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE PERRAL SIS BY ANALYSIS. IN 11 TRYING TO GO DEEP AND IN DEPTH ON ALL OF THESE ISSUES, FOR 12 PARTICULAR GROUPS, IT JUST SEEMS IT'S GOING TO TAKE AN 13 INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF TIME, ENERGY, AND MONEY TO MOVE FORWARD, 14 15 AND TO COME UP WITH PROJECTS OR APPROACHES THAT WILL SATISFY 16 EVERY, YOU KNOW, SPECIFIC INDIVIDUAL ENTITY THAT IS EXPRESSING CONCERN. AND IT JUST SEEMS THAT IT'S -- AND I AGREE WITH MANY 17 OF THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE, PARTICULARLY HOWARDS, BUT 18 I THINK WE HAVE TO FIND A WAY TO GET THROUGH ALL OF THESE 19 DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES TO MAKE SOME PROGRESS AND TO MAKE 20 MEANINGFUL DECISIONS GOING FORWARD. I'M NOT -- I'M NOT PRIVY 21 TO EXACTLY HOW TO DO THAT, BUT I -- IT'S A CONCERN THAT ARISES 22

24

23

BASED ON WHAT I HAVE HEARD.



CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU, TERRY. I SEE DWAYNE'S HAND 1 2 RAISED. 3 DWAYNE HANKERSON: I DO WANT TO PIGGYBACK ON WHAT HOWARD SAID. 4 5 MAYBE ONE METHOD OF GETTING THE INFORMATION YOU WANT FROM CERTAIN COMMUNITIES IS TO REACH OUT TO THOSE COMMUNITIES, 6 PARTICULARLY. LIKE, TO SEND THE ACTUAL -- THE ACTUAL ANALYSIS 7 8 OF FORM, TO RESIDENTS IN THAT COMMUNITY. I DON'T KNOW -- LIKE FRANK SAID, I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU NARROW DOWN WHICH HOUSEHOLD 9 10 YOU WANT TO PICK, MAYBE IT'S EVERY OTHER HOUSEHOLD, EVERY 10th HOUSEHOLD, BUT I THINK REACHING OUT TO THOSE ACTUAL 11 COMMUNITIES, AND NOT THE COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS, YOU 12 MAY ACTUALLY GET THE INFORMATION THAT YOU REALLY WANT. I DID 13 NEED TO SAY THAT, BECAUSE I THOUGHT THAT WAS A VERY GOOD IDEA. 14 15 16 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU, DWAYNE. ANUP, LESLIE, DID YOU HAVE ANY FINAL COMMENTS BASED ON THE COMMENTS YOU HAVE HEARD 17 TODAY? 18 19 SPEAKER: I WANT TO THANK THE SUBCOMMITTEE FOR THEIR COMMENTS 20 21 AND THEIR FEEDBACK I HAVE WRITTEN IT DOWN. AS I MENTIONED I 22 KNOW YOU ALL PLAY A VERY IMPORTANT ROLE, AS TERRY MENTIONED EARLIER, HOW DO WE SORT OF CLEAR OFTEN THE TABLE SO THAT WE 23

DON'T GET PARALYZED BY ANALYSIS. SO WE ARE LOOKING TO YOU ALL



TO REFINE AND REFINE, AND REFINE. AND BE ABLE TO LOOK FORWARD 1 2 TO AND AMBITIONING A NEW TRUE NEXGEN FREEWAY NETWORK. 3 ANUP TAPASE: LIKEWISE. AND I ALWAYS LOOK TO THE GROUP TO GET 4 5 FEEDBACK. THANKS AGAIN. 6 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM SEVEN, 7 8 NEW BUSINESS. ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM? 9 10 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: NO PUBLIC COMMENTS. 11 12 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: ARE THERE ANY ITEMS FROM SUBCOMMITTEE 13 14 MEMBERS THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO RAISE? 15 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE ARE NO -- NO. THERE WAS NO WRITTEN 16 COMMENTS, AS WELL, MADAM CHAIR. 17 18 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: I WOULD LIKE TO RAISE NEW BUSINESS. I WOULD 19 LIKE TO SEE IF FOLKS WANT TO CREATE A LIST -- WELL, I WANT TO 20 21 CREATE A LIST OF THE ITEMS THAT WE AS THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WOULD LIKE TO REVIEW. SO IF YOU HAVE IDEAS RIGHT 22

NOW I'M HAPPY TO TAKE NOTE OF THAT, IF THERE ARE IDEAS THAT

COME TO YOU AFTER OUR MEETING TODAY CLOSES, PLEASE FEEL FREE

TO REACH OUT TO ME. I, AGAIN, WOULD LIKE TO HAVE THAT LIST SO

23

24



1

DATE

WE CAN START PRIORITIZING AND FOCUSING ON. IS THERE ANYONE

THAT HAS TOPICS THEY WOULD LIKE TO THROW OUT NOW? 2 3 FRANK WELTE: FRANK WELTE HERE. I WOULD LIKE US TO GET SOME 4 5 INFORMATION FROM MTC STAFF REGARDING THE PROCESSES THAT ARE USED IN PLANNING IN ORDER TO ADDRESS DISABILITY ISSUES IN THE 6 PLANS THAT ARE MADE BY MTC. AND, ALSO, GET SOME INFORMATION 7 8 ABOUT WHAT EFFORTS ARE TAKEN AT MTC TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES OF DISABILITY AWARENESS, DISABILITY EMPLOYMENT AT MTC AND RELATE 9 10 THE ISSUES. 11 CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: GREAT. THANK YOU, FRANK. I HAVE NOTED THAT. 12 DOES ANYONE ELSE HAVE IDEAS THEY WOULD LIKE TO THROW OUT RIGHT 13 NOW? GO AHEAD, HOWARD. 14 15 16 HOWARD WONG: TOUCHING BASE ON OUR EARLIER DISCUSSION ABOUT THE 17 BLUE RIBBON MOBILITY AND ACCESSIBILITY WORK PLAN THAT, I THINK THAT IT'S IMPORTANT NOT TO JUST FOCUS ON PARA TRANSIT, BUT TO 18 START LOOKING AT A REGIONAL COORDINATION OF ACCESSIBILITY IS 19 MOBILITY IN ALL ITS FORMS, WHETHER IT BE PARATRANSIT OR 20 21 TRANSIT, ITSELF, AS A WHOLE, WAYFINDING, AND NOT JUST SIGNAGE, BUT COMPUTERS AND OTHER INFORMATIONAL SYSTEMS. AND AS PEOPLE 22 LEARN HOW TO USE THE ENTIRE REGIONAL SYSTEM TO GET AROUND, AND 23

TO LOOK AT THE PHYSICAL WAYS THAT WE CAN MAKE BUSES, LIGHT

RAIL, TRAINS, FERRIES ACCESSIBLE TO ALL, INCLUDING THE COMFORT

24



OF EATING, SIGNAGE ON BUSES, INSIDE BUSES. SO I THINK IT'S A
REAL IT KIND OF SEEMS LIKE THAT WOULD BE KIND OF A CORE
MISSION OF OUR OF OUR COMMITTEE, TO LOOK AT THAT
COORDINATION OF EXISTING RESOURCES VIA THE EXISTING MOBILITY
AND ACCESSIBILITY STUDY THAT ALREADY EXISTS. SO, THAT'S MY
THOUGHT. THANK YOU.
CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU, HOWARD. I HAVE TAKEN NOTE OF
THAT. ARE THERE ANY OTHER IDEAS FOLKS WOULD LIKE TO THROW OUT?
IF NOT, FEEL FREE TO REACH OUT TO ME AFTER THE MEETING IF
ANYTHING DOES COME UP. I'M GOING TO BE CREATING THIS ONGOING
LIST FOR US. SINCE THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS, WE CAN
MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NINE WHICH IS ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT FOR
THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL BE TUESDAY JUNE 23RD
AT 1:30 P.M. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE NOTED TO THE
PUBLIC. THANK YOU VERY MUCH EVERYONE. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government