

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



JUNE 8, 2022

1                                   **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**  
2                                   **BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**  
3                                   **WEDNESDAY, JUNE 8, 2022 9:40 AM**

4  
5   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYBODY. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL  
6 TO ORDER THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE I AM  
7 AMY W, VICE CHAIR, JOINED BY OUR VICE CHAIR MARGARET ABE-KOGA.  
8 WITH THAT PLEASE ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. ANNOUNCEMENT.  
9 [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL  
10 BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN  
11 PROVIDED AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE.  
12 THIS MEETING IS ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN  
13 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS  
14 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD  
15 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL  
16 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE  
17 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR  
18 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR  
19 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS  
20 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT  
21 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO  
22 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE  
23 READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION  
24 ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT



JUNE 8, 2022

1 FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE  
2 SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. JESS THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD  
5 LIKE TO WELCOME EVERYBODY TO THE MEETING AND WE LOOK FORWARD  
6 TO EVERYBODY'S PARTICIPATION AND DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATIONS  
7 TODAY. WITH THAT, KIMBERLY COULD WE PLEASE HAVE ROLL CALL TO  
8 CONFIRM QUORUM?

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR WORTH?

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** HERE ROLL.

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NOW I WOULD LIKE TO  
19 INVITE EVERYONE TO JOIN TOGETHER IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE.  
20 SO PLEASE JOIN WITH ME. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE  
21 ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO  
22 THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,  
23 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NOW MAY WE PLEASE HAVE THE  
2 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING  
5 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE  
6 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP  
7 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A  
8 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
9 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT ITEM IS OUR  
12 CONSENT CALENDAR. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY --  
13 IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE OR STAFF OR IF WE  
14 HAVE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC REQUEST TO REMOVE ANYTHING FROM THE  
15 CONSENT CALENDAR? SEEING NO ONE FROM THE COMMITTEE. KIMBERLY,  
16 HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC -- OH, CINDY.

17

18 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WASN'T GOING TO REMOVE ANYTHING. I WAS JUST  
19 GOING TO -- I HAVE CONFLICTS THAT I WANT TO READ INTO THE  
20 GOVERNMENT --

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** FOR ITEMS 4C AND 4G I MAY HAVE A CONFLICT BASED  
25 ON GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION-84308. THANK YOU.



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. SO YOU WILL BE ABSTAINING FROM THOSE  
3 VOTES. GREAT. ALL RIGHT. ARE THERE ANY OTHER COMMENTS ON THE  
4 CONSENT CALENDAR? AND, KIMBERLY, JUST CONFIRMING, WE HAVE  
5 RECEIVED NO PUBLIC COMMENT EITHER IN PERSON OR IN WRITING?

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING,  
8 HOWEVER I SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.  
9 DO YOU WANT TO CALL ON THEM NOW?

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** LET'S DO THAT. IF THAT I WANT -- DO THAT I  
12 WANT TO REMOVE ANY -- I THINK, AT THIS POINT, IT WOULD BE JUST  
13 IF THEY WOULD LIKE TO REMOVE ANYTHING FROM THE CONSENT  
14 CALENDAR?

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY. SO I THINK IT'S PROBABLY PUBLIC  
17 COMMENT. BUT ROMAN HAS HIS HAND RAISED.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

20

21 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MR. KATZ, WE WILL HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT LATER.  
22 IS THERE ANOTHER SPEAKER?

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KATHLEEN CANE?

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** WE SHOULD NOTE COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ'S ACTION IS  
2 A RECUSAL NOT AN ABSTENTION ON THE TWO ITEMS SHE NOTED.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION ON THE  
5 TERMINOLOGY. JUST TO NOTE THAT THE OTHER SPEAKER --

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOLI FISHER ROKER, I DON'T KNOW IF  
8 YOU'RE SPEAKING UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT? THEY PUT THEIR HAND  
9 DOWN.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO ADOPT THE CONSENT  
12 CALENDAR.

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** MOTION TO APPROVE. ABE-KOGA.

15

16 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, SECOND  
19 BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. THEN MAY WE PLEASE HAVE THE ROLL CALL?

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY. DO YOU WANT TO TAKE ROLL CALL? OR  
22 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR FIRST?

23

24 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I'M SORRY. YES PLEASE LET'S GO TO PUBLIC  
25 COMMENT.



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FIRST ONE IS ROLAND KATZ. PLEASE UNMUTE  
3 YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I'M SORRY. I WANTED TO SPEAK ON YOUR GENERAL OPEN  
6 TIME ABOUT AN ITEM NOT ON THE AGENDA.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO PUT YOUR HAND  
9 DOWN, WE'LL CALL ON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WE'LL  
10 ANNOUNCE IT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT IS JOLIE FISHER ROKER. THIS IS FOR  
15 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES WE CAN HEAR YOU.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS JOE FISHER. I AM THE PRESENT OF THE  
22 RICHMOND AND MARIN COALITION FOR TRANSPORTATION JUSTICE. I  
23 ACTUALLY WAS SPEAKING ON PUBLIC COMMENTS. I HAD FORWARDED A  
24 LETTER --

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MR. FISHER, I'M SORRY TO INTERRUPT YOU.  
2 YOU ARE SPEAKING ON GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. WE'RE ACTUALLY ON  
3 THE CONSENT CALENDAR RIGHT NOW.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I'M ON THE WRONG ITEM. I'LL COME BACK LATER.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, SIR.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SO, THEN, WE DON'T HAVE ANY FURTHER  
12 PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THANK YOU.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY,  
15 NOW WE CAN TAKE THE ROLL ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU GOT IT. CHAIR WORTH?

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

22

23 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?





JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WITH A RECUSAL FOR ITEMS 4C AND 4G,  
5 CORRECT? THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

22

23 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
2 WITH THE EXCEPTIONS OF 4C AND 4G FOR COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. NOW LET'S MOVE TO ITEM  
5 5A. THIS IS AN ITEM, THIS IS A CONTINUATION OF OUR PREVIOUS  
6 ACTIONS AND DISCUSSIONS. AND THIS IS AN ITEM ON EQUITY ACTION  
7 PLAN RECOMMENDATIONS. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO, FIRST, TURN TO OUR  
8 -- TO STAFF, AND TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, TO BEGIN THE  
9 PRESENTATION.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, CHAIR WORTH. AND I WILL  
12 DO AS I HAVE OFTEN DONE IN THE PAST, A BIT OF TABLE SETTING IN  
13 ADVANCE OF HANDING IT OVER TO LYSA HALE TO WALK THROUGH THE  
14 DETAILS OF THIS ITEM. I DON'T THINK I NEED TO REMIND YOU THAT  
15 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING VERY DILIGENTLY IN THIS SPACE NOW FOR  
16 PROBABLY OVER A YEAR, OR APPROACHING THAT, IN TERMS OF  
17 MANAGING THE EXTRAORDINARY CIRCUMSTANCES THAT WERE GENERATED  
18 BY THE RAPID DEPLOYMENT INTO ALL ELECTRIC TOLLING THAT WAS  
19 GENERATED BY COVID. AND AT CENTER OF OUR PRESENTATION TODAY --  
20 AND THERE IS MANY LAYERS TO IT, SO WHAT I HOPE TO DO IS KIND  
21 OF BREAK THOSE APART FOR YOU AS A WAY OF BEING ABLE TO SLOT IN  
22 THE DETAILS THAT LISA WILL PROVIDE. WE WANTED TO REALLY  
23 ACCOMPLISH THREE MAIN THINGS. THE FIRST WAS A -- AN  
24 EXPLANATION ON THE STATUS OF DMV HOLDS, AND THE NECESSITY TO  
25 MOVE DEFINITELY IN THAT SPACE TO MEET BATA'S FIDUCIARY



JUNE 8, 2022

1 RESPONSIBILITIES BY DEVELOPING A WAY TO RELEASE THOSE IN A  
2 PHASED FASHION. I THINK WE HAVE SPOKEN AT SOME LENGTH THAT  
3 SINCE JANUARY OF 2021, WE HAD HELD BACK ON RELEASING  
4 VIOLATIONS TO DMV FOR HOLDS FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS. THE FACT  
5 THAT OUR CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER WAS STILL IN A LOT OF FLUX  
6 RESPONDING TO THE COVID PANDEMIC, THAT THE WHOLE PROCESS OF  
7 MOVING SO SWIFTLY INTO ALL ELECTRIC TOLLING HAD CREATED  
8 SIGNIFICANT COMMUNICATIONS AND CONFUSING ISSUES WITH OUR  
9 CUSTOMERS. A NUMBER OF THINGS THAT HAD MOTIVATED US TO PUT ON  
10 HOLD RELEASING VIOLATIONS TO THE DMV. BUT WE'RE NOW AT A  
11 SPACE, NOT THE LEAST OF WHICH INCLUDES THERE IS A STATUTE OF  
12 LIMITATIONS ON WHEN AND HOW LONG WE CAN WAIT FOR SENDING  
13 VIOLATIONS TO DMV THAT PUT US IN A POSITION WHERE WE DO NEED  
14 TO START MOVING FORWARD WITH THOSE. HOWEVER, WE ALSO RECOGNIZE  
15 THAT PUTTING ANY VEHICLE ON DMV HOLD CAN BE A BIT OF A  
16 DISRUPTIVE EVENT, AND, PARTICULARLY, THERE HAS BEEN A CONCERN  
17 THAT FOR OUR LOW-INCOME CUSTOMERS WHO MAY HAVE THE -- MAY BE  
18 BARE BEARING A SIGNIFICANT DEBT RESULTING FROM VIOLATIONS THAT  
19 WE HAVE CLEAR DIRECTION FROM THE COMMISSION TO DEVELOP A  
20 PAYMENT PLAN TO ALLOW FOR THOSE CUSTOMERS TO BE ABLE TO BETTER  
21 MANAGE THE -- FRANKLY, THE FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY TO MEET  
22 THEIR OUTSTANDING OBLIGATIONS, BUT IN A WAY THAT WAS SENSITIVE  
23 TO THEIR FINANCIAL NEEDS. WE HAD COME TO THE COMMISSION, I  
24 WANTED TO -- REMIND ME -- APRIL, I BELIEVE, WITH A PRELIMINARY  
25 IDEA OF WHAT THAT MIGHT LOOK LIKE. AND TO NOT GO INTO ALL OF



JUNE 8, 2022

1 ACCOUNT OF EVERYTHING WE COVERED, ONE OF THE KEY  
2 CHARACTERISTICS AT THAT TIME WAS THAT POSSIBLY COULD GO WITH A  
3 PAYMENT PLAN OPTION FOR ANYBODY. RIGHT? WE WOULD NOT TAG IT  
4 TO, NECESSARILY, A MEANS BASED LOW-INCOME STRUCTURE. ALTHOUGH  
5 THE COMMISSION HAD SAID THAT THE POINT OF A PLAN REALLY WAS TO  
6 BEST HELP THOSE IN MOST FINANCIAL NEED. BUT, THERE WERE SOME  
7 ADMINISTRATIVE AND OTHER CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE HAD SUGGESTED,  
8 PERHAPS WE WOULD JUST HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN FOR ANYONE, WITH AN  
9 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT CAVEAT AND BRIGHT LINE. THAT TO MEET THE  
10 FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITIES THAT BATA HAD, WE WOULD HAVE TO  
11 HAVE BUILT INTO THAT PROCESS SURETY TO COLLECT THE TOLLS, AND  
12 THAT THE PENALTY PIECE OF AN A ACCUMULATED BURDEN WOULD BE THE  
13 SUBJECT OF A PAYMENT PLAN BUT THE UPFRONT REQUIREMENT FOR  
14 PARTICIPATING WOULD BE TO PAY ALL YOUR TOLLS. BECAUSE WE'RE  
15 NOT ASKING FOR ANY KIND OF DIFFERENTIATION ABOUT INCOME OR  
16 FINANCIAL STATUS. THAT WAS MET WITH A NUMBER OF CRITIQUES FROM  
17 THE COMMISSION, PARTICULARLY ON THE FACT THAT IF YOU WERE LOW-  
18 INCOME PAYING A ROLL-UP OF YOUR TOLLS, COULD IN AND OF ITSELF  
19 BE A BURDEN AND THAT COULD NOT BE CLEARED. FIRST WAS FINANCIAL  
20 CONSIDERATIONS, AND THOUGHT ABOUT IT; IT HAS DRIVEN US TO THE  
21 POINT TO SAY THAT WE NEED A RETURN TO A PAYMENT PLAN THAT IS A  
22 MEANS BASED FOCUSED STRUCTURE CORE TO HELP THOSE MOST  
23 FINANCIALLY IN NEED AND THAT TO SETUP A STRUCTURE AT THE  
24 OUTSET IS FOCUSED ON A POPULATION OF LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS.  
25 SO THAT IS A BIG PIVOT AND IS CORE TO THE PROPOSAL THAT WE ARE



JUNE 8, 2022

1 BRINGING TO YOU TODAY. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO, AGAIN, IS JUST  
2 TO HIGHLIGHT VERY QUICKLY SOME IMPORTANT, AND WE BELIEVE,  
3 CREATIVE ASPECTS THOUGH, OF HOW WE MIGHT STRUCTURE A MEANS-  
4 BASED PROCESS, AND, LYSA WE'LL MORE CAREFULLY GO INTO THE  
5 DETAILS. IN ORDER TO ALIGN THAT WITH THE STAGED RELEASE OF  
6 VIOLATIONS THROUGH DMV HOLD, THAT, AGAIN, IS A CORE CONCERN  
7 WITH HOW OUR LOW-INCOME CUSTOMER WHO IS MAY BE IN THIS, YOU  
8 KNOW, A ACCUMULATED FINANCIAL BURDEN STATE, HOW THAT IT WOULD  
9 WORK. THE MEMO LAID IT OUT, BUT LET ME WALK THROUGH THE KEY  
10 PIECES OF IT JUST AS AN OPENING STRUCTURE. THE IDEA WOULD BE  
11 THAT AT SOME POINT IN THE FUTURE, OUR FIRST PHASE OF RELEASING  
12 DMV HOLDS WOULD BE FOR COMMERCIAL VIOLATORS. A VERY DISTINCT  
13 GROUP THAT WE HAVE A BASIS FOR IDENTIFYING WHO THOSE WOULD BE,  
14 AND WE WOULD MOVE FORWARD WITH RELEASING THOSE VIOLATIONS TO  
15 DMV IN THAT PROCESS. FOR EVERYONE ELSE, WE WOULD ESTABLISH A  
16 WAITING -- A SORT OF WAITING PERIOD WHERE BY WE WOULD HAVE A  
17 PREQUALIFICATION PROCESS FOR THOSE INDIVIDUALS WHO WOULD MEET  
18 OUR LOW-INCOME MEANS BASED THRESHOLD. AND IN THAT PROCESS, IT  
19 WOULD BE MODELED ON THE CLIPPER START, VERY SUCCESSFUL CLIPPER  
20 START PROGRAM THAT WE HAVE PUT TOGETHER, WHERE SOMEONE WOULD  
21 BE ABLE TO DEMONSTRATE THAT THEY MEET A LOW-INCOME  
22 ELIGIBILITY, AND IN THIS, AGAIN, SORT OF, WINDOW, AND WE DON'T  
23 HAVE A TIME SET, WE DON'T HAVE DETAILS FOR YOU BUT LET'S SAY  
24 FOR THE SAKE OF ARGUMENT, A 3 TO 4 MONTH WINDOW, A PERSON WHO  
25 BELIEVES THAT THEY, YOU KNOW, WOULD MEET THE CRITERIA, WOULD



JUNE 8, 2022

1 GO IN, PREQUALIFIED BY FILLING OUT INFORMATION, AGAIN, MODELED  
2 ON OUR CLIPPER START ELIGIBILITY PROCESS, AND THE VEHICLE  
3 ATTACHED TO THAT, SHOULD THE PERSON QUALIFY, WOULD NOT BE --  
4 WOULD BE PUT IN, LET'S SAY WOULD BE CHARACTERIZE AS A WAITING  
5 ROOM AND WOULD NOT BE RELEASED TO THE DMV, SITTING IN THIS  
6 WAITING ROOM WE'RE ALONG THE LINES DEVELOPING DETAILS A  
7 PAYMENT PLAN, THAT THEY COULD PARTICIPATE N BUT WOULD ENSURE  
8 THE INTERIM PERIOD UNTIL THE PAYMENT PLAN WAS FINALIZED AND  
9 READY TO GO, IT WOULD NOT BE RELEASED TO DMV, THIS  
10 PREQUALIFICATION PERIOD WOULD BE A SAFETY NET. THEN WHAT WOULD  
11 HAPPEN IS THAT THERE WOULD, YOU KNOW, BEYOND THAT WAITING  
12 PERIOD WINDOW, WE WOULD THEN RELEASE THE REMAINING OUTSTANDING  
13 VIOLATIONS TO DMV. IF AN INDIVIDUAL MISSED THE WAITING PERIOD  
14 AND THEY RECEIVED NOTIFICATION WITH THE REGISTRATION THAT  
15 THEIR VEHICLE WAS BEING HELD FOR OUTSTANDING VIOLATIONS AND  
16 THEY BELIEVE THAT THEY MEET THE LOW-INCOME CRITERIA, THEY CAN  
17 STILL ENTER INTO THE PREQUALIFICATION PROGRAM. AND AT THAT  
18 POINT, WE WOULD GO IN AND SORT OF TAKE, YOU KNOW, RETRIEVE  
19 THEIR VEHICLE, IF YOU WILL, AND PUT IT IN THE WAITING ROOM.  
20 THERE IS TWO SPACES WHERE A LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUAL CUSTOMER  
21 WOULD BE ABLE TO ESTABLISH THEIR ELIGIBILITY AND GET INTO THIS  
22 QUALIFYING SPACE. SO THAT'S THE BASIC STRUCTURE. BUT I WOULD  
23 SAY THAT THERE IS TWO CRITICAL THINGS THAT WE STILL NEED TO  
24 DEVELOP. I'M BEING VERY HONEST WITH YOU TODAY THAT WE DON'T  
25 HAVE ALL OF THESE THINGS KNOCKED DOWN YET WE'RE ESSENTIALLY



JUNE 8, 2022

1 ASKING FOR YOUR APPROVAL FOR THE CONCEPT TO BEGIN DEVELOPING  
2 THE DETAILS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS APPROACH TODAY. ONE KEY THING  
3 IS THAT WE WOULD HAVE TO HAVE IN PLACE AND DEVELOP THE  
4 PREQUALIFICATION PROGRAM. WE HAVE GOT A WONDERFUL TESTED BASIS  
5 WITH CLIPPER START. WE WOULD BE BUILDING IT BASED ON THAT,  
6 HOWEVER, ALL OF THOSE BITS AND PIECES ARE NOT IN PLACE YET. SO  
7 WE NEED THE TIME TO DO THAT, AND TODAY WE DON'T HAVE  
8 DEFINITIVE TIME. BUT THAT'S GOING TO GUIDE THE TIME WE WOULD  
9 BE SORT OF LAUNCHING THIS WHOLE PROCESS. THE OTHER THING IS WE  
10 NEED TO HAVE A VERY AGGRESSIVE PUBLIC INFORMATION CAMPAIGN TO  
11 LET POTENTIAL CUSTOMERS KNOW THAT THIS PREQUALIFICATION  
12 PROGRAM, IN ADVANCE OF A LOW-INCOME-BASED PAYMENT PLAN, IS  
13 AVAILABLE. ONE OF THE DIFFICULTIES WE FACE -- AND KATHLEEN, AS  
14 OUR GENERAL COUNSEL CAN ELABORATE ON THAT IF NEEDED, WE ARE  
15 EXTREMELY LIMITED IN OUR ABILITY TO PROVIDE DIRECT TARGETED  
16 INFORMATION TO FASTRAK CUSTOMERS. I CAN'T SAY THAT QUICKLY.  
17 DUE TO STREETS AND HIGHWAYS CODE REQUIREMENTS, AS WELL AS  
18 ONGOING LITIGATION RELATED TO PII. SO, UNFORTUNATELY, THAT IS  
19 A MECHANISM THAT IS NOT READILY AT OUR DISPOSAL TO DO. SO WE  
20 ARE GOING TO HAVE TO RELY VERY MUCH ON AN AGGRESSIVE AND FAR-  
21 REACHING PUBLIC INFORMATION PROGRAM. AGAIN, LYSA CAN TALK  
22 ABOUT THAT MORE. ELEMENTS ON OUR WEB SITE, ET CETERA. AND IT  
23 NEEDS A WORKSPACE THAT WOULD BE NECESSARY BEFORE LAUNCHING  
24 THIS PROCESS. THAT LAYS OUT THE BASIC STRUCTURES OUT THERE  
25 BECAUSE IT'S A SHIFT FROM WHAT WE SUGGESTED TO YOU BEFORE BUT



JUNE 8, 2022

1 I THINK IT'S HELPFUL TO HAVE THAT BASIC STRUCTURE SO THEN YOU  
2 WILL BE ABLE TO SLOT IN SOME OF THE DETAILS AND INFORMATION  
3 THAT LYSA WILL BE ABLE TO PROVIDE TO YOU. SO WITH THAT, LET ME  
4 TURN IT OVER TO LYSA, AND WE CAN, AGAIN -- UNLESS, CHAIR  
5 WORTH, THERE IS SOME OTHER COMMENTS OR THINGS YOU WOULD LIKE  
6 TO DISCUSS?

7

8 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THERESE, I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THAT TABLE  
9 SETTING, AND WANT TO JUST CLARIFY ONE POINT WITH YOU. YOU  
10 MENTIONED THAT THE OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE TO PREQUALIFY  
11 BEGINNING IN THE PROCESS, BEFORE WE DO ANY KIND OF DMV ACTION.

12

13 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** CORRECT.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** BUT THE SECOND PIECE YOU SAID, AT THAT POINT  
16 WHEN WE -- WHEN THOSE HOLDS GO TO DMV AND THERE IS A SECOND  
17 OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE WHO WOULD HAVE THE ABILITY, FROM AN  
18 INCOME STANDPOINT, TO GO -- TO BE PULLED OUT OF THAT POOL AND  
19 INTO THIS, WHAT YOU HAVE TALKED ABOUT, A WAITING ROOM. SO THEY  
20 ARE -- WHAT THAT WOULD ENABLE THEM TO DO IS GO AHEAD AND  
21 REGISTER THEIR CAR FOR THE FOLLOWING YEAR. WE WOULD REMOVE  
22 THEM FROM THE DMV HOLD. WE WOULD REMOVE THE DMV HOLD FROM THAT  
23 PARTICULAR, YOU KNOW, CUSTOMER, AND THEN THEY WOULD GO INTO  
24 THIS WAITING ROOM WHILE WE DEVELOPED THIS VERY -- THE  
25 SPECIFICS OF THE PAYMENT PLAN.





JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** CORRECT.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. THAT'S FINE. OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU. I  
5 SEE COMMISSIONER RONEN HAS A QUESTION.

6

7 **HILLARY RONEN:** YEAH, AND PERHAPS I HAVE LOTS OF QUESTIONS. AND  
8 PERHAPS I SHOULD WAIT UNTIL AFTER THE PRESENTATION?

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I THINK YOU CAN DO THAT.

11

12 **HILLARY RONEN:** HAPPY TO DO THAT. I'LL DO THAT.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. I WANTED TO CLARIFY THAT ONE PIECE OF  
15 IT. BECAUSE I KNOW THAT'S A PRIORITY FOR THE COMMITTEE, FROM,  
16 YOU KNOW, OUR PAST DISCUSSIONS. SO, OKAY, THANK YOU VERY MUCH,  
17 THERESE. LYSA THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR WORK. AND LOOK  
18 FORWARD TO YOUR PRESENTATION. LIS.

19

20 **LYSA HALE:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. CAN I GET THE  
21 PRESENTATION PULLED UP? CHAIR WORTH AND COMMISSIONERS I'M LYSA  
22 HALE BATA STAFF. I'M GOING TO OUTLINE NEXT STEPS IN OUR  
23 PAYMENT PLAN PILOT PROPOSAL AND PROVIDE ADDITIONAL DETAILS AND  
24 MAKE SEVERAL REQUESTS OF THIS COMMITTEE. NEXT SLIDE. LET ME  
25 TAKE YOU BACK TO HOW WE GOT HERE. A YEAR AGO, WE SET OUT TO



JUNE 8, 2022

1 MAKE SURE THAT PAYING TOLLS WAS AN EQUITABLE PROCESS FOR ALL.  
2 AS PART OF THAT, WE BEGAN LOOKING AT OUR POLICIES TO SEE WHAT  
3 WE COULD CHANGE TO ENSURE EQUITY. WE STARTED WITH ONE OF THE  
4 MOST IMPORTANT, THE DRAMATIC REDUCTION IN OUR VIOLATION  
5 PENALTIES. NOW, INSTEAD OF PAYING \$25 AFTER A FIRST NOTICE OF  
6 VIOLATION, AND \$70 AFTER A SECOND NOTICE OF VIOLATION, DRIVERS  
7 PAY A FIVE THERE PENALTY FOR THE FIRST AND \$15 FOR THE SECOND.  
8 IN ADDITION, WE HAVE MADE SEVERAL CHANGES TO MAKE IT MORE  
9 AFFORDABLE TO GET AND START USING FASTRAK. LOWERING THE  
10 DEPOSIT FOR A TOLL TAG, EQUALIZATION EQUALIZING AMOUNT  
11 REQUIRED TO OPEN A FASTRAK ACCOUNT CREDIT CARD FOR USERS AND  
12 THE ELIMINATION OF FEES USED FOR OUR CASH PAYMENT NETWORK  
13 THESE ARE SIGNIFICANT MEANINGFUL CHANGES. THE PAYMENT PLAN  
14 PILOT I WILL DISCUSS MOMENTARILY WE ARE LAUNCHING OUR MOBILE  
15 APP THIS SUMMER AS A RESULT MANAGING YOUR FASTRAK ACCOUNT AND  
16 PAYING INVOICES AND VIOLATION NOTICES WILL BE MUCH EASIER AS  
17 THE METHOD WILL BE RIGHT AT YOUR FINGERTIPS. WE'RE TALKING TO  
18 LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS ABOUT HOW THEY PAY THEIR TOLLS, VIEW  
19 PENALTIES WHAT THEY WOULD LIKE IN A PAYMENT PLAN AND SO ON. WE  
20 WILL SOON WRAP UP THIS FIRST PHASE OF CUSTOMER ENGAGEMENT AND  
21 SHARE RESULTS. WE WILL CONTINUE TO REVIEW POLICIES AND ALSO  
22 CONTINUE OUR COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT NEXT FISCAL YEAR THANKS TO  
23 ONE OF THE CONTRACTS THAT YOU JUST APPROVED ON CONSENT FOR  
24 THIS PURPOSE. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE TWO IMPORTANT PRIORITIES TO  
25 ADDRESS HERE TODAY, AND THERESE HAS TALKED ABOUT BOTH OF THEM.



JUNE 8, 2022

1 YOU ARE ALREADY FAMILIAR WITH THE PAYMENT PLAN PILOT CONCEPT  
2 AND WE WILL BE SHARING ADDITIONAL THINKING AND A  
3 RECOMMENDATION ABOUT THAT SHORTLY. BUT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT  
4 WE HAVEN'T TALKED ABOUT IN PREVIOUS MEETINGS IS THE DETAIL --  
5 OR THAT WE HAVEN'T TALKED IN DETAIL ABOUT IS THE CURRENT  
6 BACKLOG OF UNPAID VIOLATION NOTICES THAT NEED TO BE SENT TO  
7 DMV FOR REGISTRATION HOLD OR TO COLLECTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. I'LL  
8 ADDRESS THE UNPAID VIOLATION NOTICES FIRST. NEXT SLIDE. THIS  
9 SLIDE IS A REMINDER OF THE STEPS THAT IT TAKES FOR AN UNPAID  
10 TOLL TO GET TO DMV FOR REGISTRATION HOLD. AS YOU CAN SEE, THE  
11 ENTIRE PROCESS TAKES A MINIMUM OF 81 DAYS. AFTER A VEHICLE  
12 CROSSES A BRIDGE, THE FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER SENDS AN  
13 INVOICE IN THE MAIL TO THE REGISTERED OWNER OF THE VEHICLE  
14 USING THE ADDRESS PROVIDED BY THE DMV IF THE INVOICE IS NOT  
15 PAID BY THE DUE DATE 21 DAYS FROM THE DATE OF THE INVOICE THE  
16 REGISTERED OWNER IS SENT A FIRST NOTICE OF VIOLATION WITH A  
17 FIVE THERE PENAL. IF THAT IS NOT PAID BY THE DUE DATE A SECOND  
18 NOTICE DELINQUENT VIOLATION IS SENT WITH THE \$15 PENALTY IF A  
19 SECOND NOTICE IS NOT PAID BY THE DUE DATE THE DMV COLLECTS  
20 WITH VEHICLE REGISTRATION RENEWAL THE REGISTERED OWNER MUST  
21 PAY THE TOLLS AND PENALTIES DURING THEIR VEHICLE REGISTRATION.  
22 IF THE VIOLATION IS NOT TO BE SENT TO THE DMV IT IS SENT TO  
23 COLLECTIONS THE MOST COMMON SCENARIOS WHERE VIOLATIONS ARE  
24 SUPPORT TO COLLECTIONS IS IF THE VEHICLE HAS MORE THAN 75  
25 VIOLATION NOTICES THAT IS THE MOST WE CAN SEND TO THE DMV ON



JUNE 8, 2022

1 ONE VEHICLE. OR IF THE VEHICLE HAS VIOLATIONS, THE VEHICLE  
2 THAT HAS THE VIOLATIONS IS FROM OUT OF STATE. NEXT SLIDE. AS  
3 THERESE SAID, ADDRESSING THE BACKLOG OF UNPAID VIOLATIONS IS A  
4 HIGH PRIORITY FOR BATA. WE'RE LOOKING AT MORE THAN \$50 MILLION  
5 IN UNPAID TOLLS FROM APPROXIMATELY 8.8 MILLION OUTSTANDING  
6 VIOLATIONS THAT ARE ELIGIBLE TO BE SENT TO DMV FOR A  
7 REGISTRATION HOLD OR TO COLLECTIONS. HOW DID WE GET HERE? I'LL  
8 REMIND YOU THAT BATA CONVERTED TO A CASHLESS ENVIRONMENT IN  
9 2020 AFTER CALTRANS REMOVED TOLL COLLECTORS FROM THE BOOTH AT  
10 THE START OF THE PANDEMIC. THIS WAS AN EFFORT TO PROTECT TOLL  
11 TAKERS AS WELL AS DRIVERS. ADDITIONALLY E BATA ROLLED OUT AN  
12 INVOICING SYSTEM IN EARLY 2021, AND REINSTATED VIOLATION  
13 PENALTIES AT THE SAME TIME. BOTH CONVERSIONS CREATED A BACKLOG  
14 OF UNPAID VIOLATIONS AND WE WERE PREPARED TO START SENDING  
15 VIOLATIONS DATING BACK TO JANUARY 2021 TO DMV FOR REGISTRATION  
16 HOLD LAST YEAR. BUT COMMISSIONERS EXPRESSED CONCERNS ABOUT  
17 POTENTIAL IMPACTS ON LOW-INCOME PEOPLE AND ENCOURAGED US TO  
18 DEVELOP A PAYMENT PLAN WHICH LED US TO WHERE WE ARE NOW.  
19 ADDING TO THE URGENCY TOW RESUME UNPAID VIOLATIONS TO DMV. DMV  
20 DOES NOT ACCEPT TRANSACTIONS OLD THAN THREE YEARS OF THE  
21 BACKLOG UNPAID VIOLATION.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SORRY.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **LYSA HALE:** THE BACKLOG OF UNPAID VIOLATIONS WILL START  
2 EXPIRING IN JANUARY 2024 WE WOULD LIKE TO START ADDRESSING  
3 THIS. THE SOONER WE START THE SOONER WE CAN COLLECT TOLLS.  
4 NEXT SLIDE. AS THERESE SAID, THE URGENCY IS REAL, BUT WE DO  
5 HAVE A PROPOSED SOLUTION. STAFF IS RECOMMENDING A MULTI-STEP  
6 APPROACH TO ADDRESSING THE BACKLOG OF UNPAID VIOLATIONS. THE  
7 FIRST STEP IS TO SEND VIOLATIONS ON COMMERCIAL VEHICLES TO THE  
8 DMV AND COLLECTIONS RIGHT AWAY. COMMERCIAL VEHICLES WOULD NOT  
9 QUALIFY FOR A PAYMENT PLAN, SO THEY'RE ESSENTIALLY LOW-HANGING  
10 FRUIT. WHILE WE WOULD ALSO LIKE TO SEND VIOLATIONS FROM  
11 PERSONAL VEHICLES TO THE DMV, WE UNDERSTAND THIS COULD BE  
12 HARMFUL TO LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS WHO MAY NOT BE ABLE TO PAY  
13 THEIR DEBT ALL AT ONCE. SO THE PAYMENT PLAN COULD TAKE TIME TO  
14 IMPLEMENT WE'RE PROPOSING AN INTERIM STEP. THE TIME LIMITED  
15 PREQUALIFICATION PROGRAM TO WHICH AN INDIVIDUAL CAN PROVIDE  
16 PROOF OF THEIR LOW-INCOME ELIGIBILITY. IF THEY'RE APPROVED,  
17 THEY WOULD GO INTO A WAITING ROOM UNTIL SUCH TIME THAT THE  
18 PAYMENT PLAN IS AVAILABLE. A KEY ELEMENT TO THE APPROACH IS  
19 LETTING PEOPLE KNOW THAT BATA WILL REMOVE SENDING UNPAID  
20 VIOLATIONS TO DMV AND COLLECTIONS AND THAT A PREQUALIFICATION  
21 PROGRAM IS AVAILABLE FOR LOW-INCOME DRIVERS. WE WILL USE ONE  
22 OF THE CONTRACTS YOU JUST APPROVED WITH POLYTECHNIC MARKETING  
23 TO MOUNT A LARGE-SCALE CAMPAIGN TO EDUCATE PEOPLE ABOUT THESE  
24 ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN. WE WILL ACCOMPANY THIS BY OUTREACH TO  
25 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS, NEWS RELEASES, PUBLIC SERVICE



JUNE 8, 2022

1 ANNOUNCEMENTS, SOCIAL MEDIA, AND INFORMATION ON THE FASTRAK  
2 AND MTC WEB SITES. NEXT SLIDE. SO THE OTHER ELEMENT THAT I  
3 HAVE NOT ADDRESSED YET IS THE PAYMENT PLAN PILOT. NEXT SLIDE.  
4 IF YOU REMEMBER, WE DID ORIGINALLY PROPOSE A PAYMENT PLAN  
5 PILOT THAT WAS OPEN TO ALL. IT HAD A MINIMUM THRESHOLD TO  
6 ENTER, AND MINIMUM PAYMENT AMOUNTS, AND IT WAS FOR A MAXIMUM  
7 OF 12 MONTHS. WE HEARD FROM THIS COMMITTEE THAT SOME PARTS OF  
8 THE PROPOSAL WERE INSUFFICIENT TO MEET THE NEEDS OF LOW-INCOME  
9 INDIVIDUALS. SO WE TOOK A CLOSER LOOK AT THE BENEFITS AND  
10 DISADVANTAGES OF THE PAYMENT PLAN PILOT OPEN TO ALL VERSUS ONE  
11 THAT IS LIMITED TO LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS. IN GENERAL, A  
12 PAYMENT PLAN FOR LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS COULD INCORPORATE MORE  
13 FLEXIBLE AND GENEROUS OPTIONS IN SEVERAL AREAS, INCLUDING THE  
14 UP FRONT PAYMENT AMOUNT, THE DURATION OF THE PLAN, MINIMUM  
15 PAYMENT AMOUNTS, AND WHETHER FULL OR PARTIAL TOLLS ARE  
16 REQUIRED UPFRONT TO PREVENT VIOLATIONS FROM GOING TO THE DMV  
17 OR EVEN PULLING BACK VIOLATIONS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN SENT TO  
18 DMV. DOWNSIDES OF A LOW-INCOME PAYMENT PLAN ARE THAT IT WILL  
19 LIKELY BE A LONGER TIMELINE TO MEET OUR FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS,  
20 BECAUSE IT WILL TAKE LONGER TO COLLECT DEBT THROUGH LOWER  
21 PAYMENT AMOUNTS. AT THE SAME TIME, OFFERING A LOW-INCOME  
22 PAYMENT PLAN MIGHT BE MORE EXPENSIVE, BECAUSE IT WILL REQUIRE  
23 ADDITIONAL WORK BY MULTIPLE CONTRACTORS TO INTEGRATE A MEANS-  
24 BASED ELIGIBILITY SCREENING. NEXT SLIDE. DESPITE THESE  
25 DOWNSIDES A PAYMENT PLAN PILOT FOR PEOPLE WITH LOW-INCOMES



JUNE 8, 2022

1 COULD BE MORE BENEFICIAL TO THE REGION SO WE ARE RECOMMENDING  
2 DEVELOPMENT OF A MEANS BASED PAYMENT PLAN PILOT. FOCUSING ON  
3 LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS WILL HELP THOSE WHO NEED IT MOST. THE  
4 PILOT WOULD BE MODELED AFTER CLIPPER START WHICH REQUIRES AN  
5 INDIVIDUAL TO HAVE A HOUSEHOLD INCOME OF 200% OF THE FEDERAL  
6 POVERTY OR LESS. IF YOU GO BACK TO THE ORIGINAL GOAL OF THE  
7 EQUITY ACTION PLAN, IT WAS TO MAKE PAYING TOLLS MORE  
8 AFFORDABLE AND HELP PEOPLE GET OUT OF DEBT. THIS PLAN WILL DO  
9 THAT. NEXT SLIDE. SO, NOW, I WILL MOVE ON TO OUR OVERALL  
10 RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. I'M GOING TO START WITH THE LAST  
11 TWO FIRST: FIRST, WE ARE SEEKING APPROVAL TO DEVELOP A MEANS-  
12 BASED PLAN PILOT BASED ON THE CLIPPER START FRAMEWORK. SECOND,  
13 WE WOULD LIKE YOUR APPROVAL TO REMOVE ESCALATION OF UNPAID  
14 VIOLATIONS TO THE DMV FOR REGISTRATION HOLD AND TO COLLECTIONS  
15 USING A PRECERTIFICATION PROGRAM TO HOLD BACK UNPAID  
16 VIOLATIONS FOR LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS UNTIL A PAYMENT PLAN  
17 PILOT IS IN PLACE. HOW ARE WE GOING TO PUT THESE PROPOSALS  
18 INTO ACTION? WE ARE ASKING FOR APPROVAL OF A CONTRACT CHANGE  
19 ORDER FOR THE REGIONAL CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER TO REMOVE  
20 ESCALATION OF VIOLATIONS TO THE DMV AND COLLECTIONS AND TO  
21 CREATE A MEANS-BASED PAYMENT PLAN PILOT. THIS CHANGE ORDER  
22 WOULD BE FOR CONDUENT, STATE, AND LOCAL SOLUTIONS, AND WOULD  
23 NOT EXCEED \$1 MILLION. AT THE SAME TIME WE ARE SEEKING  
24 APPROVAL OF EXPENDITURES FOR TWO OTHER CONTRACTS THAT WILL BE  
25 TAKEN TO THE MTC OPERATIONS COMMITTEE. ONE IS NOT TO EXCEED



JUNE 8, 2022

1 \$800,000 FOR CUBIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS TO PROVIDE  
2 ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION SERVICE AND THE OTHER IS NOT TO  
3 EXCEED \$1 MILLION FOR A SALESFORCE INTEGRATOR TO DEVELOP A  
4 PAYMENT PLAN WEB SITE AND A BACKHAND VERIFIER SYSTEM. AND WITH  
5 THAT, I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

6

7 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, LYSA THANK YOU. LET ME UNMUTE. THERE  
8 WE GO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT PRESENTATION. AND, SO, I -  
9 - MAY WE BEGIN WITH SUPERVISOR RONEN?

10

11 **HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, CHAIR WORTH. I GUESS I'M A  
12 LITTLE CONFUSED, BECAUSE MY MEMORY OF OUR CONVERSATIONS AROUND  
13 THIS, IT IS DIFFERENT. YOU KNOW, I REMEMBER THERE BEING A  
14 STRONG SENSE FROM THE COMMITTEE NOT TO HAVE A MEANS TESTED  
15 PROGRAM, AND THAT YOUR OWN RESEARCH AND SLIDES SHOWED THAT IN  
16 FIVE OF THE SIX PROGRAMS THAT YOU SURVEYED THAT IT WAS PRETTY  
17 MUCH CONSIDERED A BEST PRACTICE IN THE INDUSTRY OF MODERN-DAY  
18 DEBT COLLECTIONS NOT TO HAVE MEANS TESTING. I'M VERY CONFUSED  
19 HOW WE GOT FROM THAT TO HERE. AND IF YOU THINK ABOUT IT, 200%  
20 OF POVERTY, WHICH IS \$55,000 A YEAR FOR A FAMILY OF FOUR, I  
21 DON'T EVEN KNOW HOW A FAMILY OF FOUR SURVIVES IN THE BAY AREA  
22 ON \$55,000. AND THE BOTTOM LINE IS, IF SOMEONE OF ANY INCOME  
23 IS HAVING A HARD TIME PAYING, AND THEY ARE SIGNING UP FOR A  
24 PAYMENT PLAN, IT'S BECAUSE THAT I WANT TO PAY THEIR DEBT, AND  
25 WE'RE BASICALLY MAKING IT REALLY HARD FOR -- I WOULD CONSIDER,





JUNE 8, 2022

1 STILL VERY LOW-INCOME FAMILIES -- IF WE'RE CUTTING OFF AT 200%  
2 OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LINE TO PAY THEIR DEBT. AND I JUST -- I  
3 AM CONFUSED HOW WE GOT FROM THE EXCELLENT PRESENTATION YOU  
4 GAVE LAST TIME, STUDYING THE DIFFERENT AGENCIES, WHICH SHOWED  
5 HOW THE BEST PRACTICES WORK, TO WHAT YOU'RE PRESENTING TO US  
6 TODAY. I HAVE A BUNCH OF MORE DETAILED QUESTIONS, BUT I WANTED  
7 TO START OUT WITH JUST THAT OVERALL, HOW DID WE GET FROM YOUR  
8 PRESENTATION LAST TIME TO THIS WHEN MANY OF WHAT YOUR ASKING  
9 US TO APPROVE TODAY DON'T MEET THE BEST STANDARDS OF YOUR OWN  
10 STUDY. AND, SADLY, I HAVE TO LEAVE AT 10:30 BECAUSE I'M THE  
11 CHAIR OF OUR BUDGET COMMITTEE AND WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF OUR  
12 BUDGET HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO. AND, JUST FOR THE RECORD, I  
13 WOULD VOTE NO ON ALL OF THE REQUESTS THAT YOU'RE ASKING TODAY.  
14 I THINK WE NEED TO GO BACK TO THE DRAWING BOARD AND LOOK AT  
15 THIS FURTHER.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER RONEN, DO YOU WANT TO JUST LAY  
18 OUT THOSE OTHER QUESTIONS RIGHT NOW? AND I KNOW YOU HAVE TO  
19 LEAVE, BUT WE CAN HAVE THEM, AND THEN WE CAN ANSWER THEM  
20 THROUGH THE MEETING PROCESS?

21

22 **HILLARY RONEN:** SURE. SO, YOU KNOW, STAFF MENTIONED AT THE  
23 MEETING IN APRIL THAT THE TOLLING AGENCIES THAT YOU  
24 INTERVIEWED SHARED THAT THEY HAD EXPERIENCE TO HIGH BRIDGE A  
25 RATE OF PAYMENT PLANS. I'M WONDERING WHAT EXPERIENCE DOES



JUNE 8, 2022

1 CONDUENT HAVE IN KEEPING MOTORISTS ON TRACK IN MAKING THEIR  
2 PAYMENT PLANS? HOW DO THEY COMMUNICATE? WE HEARD THEY  
3 COMMUNICATE OFTEN WITH DEBT HOLDERS, IT'S THE BEST WAY TO KEEP  
4 THEM ON TRACK IN THEIR PARTICIPATE PLAN, HOW DOES CONDUENT SET  
5 REMINDERS TO OWNERS, WHAT INTERVENTIONS DO THEY HAVE TO THE  
6 OWNER, OF A DEBT HOLDER, MISSES A PAYMENT, ET CETERA. AND THE  
7 COST FOR THIS PILOT SEEMS VERY HIGH; \$2.8 MILLION. AND HOW  
8 LONG DOES STAFF EXPECT THE PILOT TO RUN? HOW LONG WILL IT TAKE  
9 TO GO LIVE? HOW MANY MOTORISTS DOES STAFF EXPECT TO ENROLL?  
10 WHAT IS THE TARGET FOR REVENUE RECOVERY AND ARREARS? AND, YOU  
11 KNOW, WHY AREN'T WE GOING OUT TO BID ON THIS CONTRACT? WHY ARE  
12 WE JUST CHOOSING CONDUENT? DO WE HAVE ANY REASON TO BELIEVE  
13 THAT THEY'RE PARTICULARLY GOOD AT THIS? AND DO THEY DO THIS  
14 ANYWHERE ELSE? AND WHAT'S THEIR RECORD? LET'S SEE. JUST  
15 LOOKING AT MY QUESTIONS. LET'S START THERE AND I CAN ASK MORE  
16 IF I HAVE TIME. I'M SURE OTHER COLLEAGUES HAVE QUESTIONS.

17

18 **LYSA HALE:** WOULD YOU LIKE ME TO TAKE A STAB AT ANSWERING THE  
19 QUESTIONS?

20

21 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

22

23 **LYSA HALE:** UNLESS THERESE, DID YOU WANT TO JUMP IN?

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** LET ME START WITH A BASIC ONE ON THE 200%  
2 LOW-INCOME. THE COMMISSION HAS USED THAT LOW-INCOME THRESHOLD  
3 IN A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT ARENAS. IT IS THE BASIS FOR CLIPPER  
4 START. IT IS CORE TO THE DEFINITION OF OUR EQUITY PRIORITY  
5 COMMUNITIES IN PLANNED BAY AREA THAT DRIVE A NUMBER OF THINGS,  
6 INCLUDING, YOU KNOW, HOW WE'RE FRAMING UP OUR TRANSIT ORIENTED  
7 COMMUNITIES POLICY, AND A NUMBER OF OTHER THINGS WHERE THAT  
8 HAS BEEN A CONSISTENT THRESHOLD THAT WE HAVE USED. IT'S ALSO  
9 BEEN, I MEAN, PRESENTED BEFORE THIS COMMISSION. WE HAVE OUR  
10 MEANS BASED PILOT FOR OUR EXPRESS LANES PROGRAM THAT WE HAVE  
11 TALKED ABOUT. SO THE 200% FEDERAL THRESHOLD HAS BEEN A  
12 CONSISTENT DEFINITION FOR BOTH OPERATIONAL AND PLANNING  
13 PURPOSES. AND THAT'S WHY IT IS USED HERE. SO, JUST TO SAY THAT  
14 THAT'S THE --

15

16 **HILLARY RONEN:** CAN I MAKE A DISTINCTION, THOUGH? IT'S ONE  
17 THING -- YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S A VERY LOW -- I MEAN, I THINK  
18 POVERTY, IN THE BAY AREA, YOU KNOW, I THINK SOMEONE LIVING AT  
19 55 FOR A FAMILY FOUR IN THE BAY AREA IS NOT DOING WELL. BUT,  
20 THAT MANY OF THOSE PROGRAMS ARE TO GIVE DISCOUNTS TO PEOPLE.  
21 RIGHT? SO I UNDERSTAND THAT YOU DON'T HAVE, OFTEN, THE ABILITY  
22 TO GIVE DISCOUNTS TO EVERYONE. THIS ISN'T GIVING DISCOUNTS.  
23 THIS IS ALLOWING PEOPLE TO HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN SO THAT THEY  
24 CAN PAY THEIR DEBT IN A WAY THAT MAKES IT MORE LIKELY FOR THEM  
25 TO PAY THEIR DEBT, AND MAKES IT EASIER FOR THEM TO PAY THEIR



JUNE 8, 2022

1 DEBT. SO, WE ARE EXPECTING TO RECOVER ALL THE MONEY. SO, I  
2 DON'T -- IT -- I'M NOT SAYING -- I'M JUST SAYING, WHY DO WE  
3 HAVE A -- WHY DON'T WE LET ANYONE PARTICIPATE NO MATTER WHAT  
4 THEIR INCOME IS? IF THEY HAVE ACCRUED DEBT AND THEY ARE  
5 ACTIVELY PROACTIVELY SIGNING UP FOR A PROGRAM TO PAY OFF THAT  
6 DEBT? WE'RE NOT -- WE'RE NOT GIVING THEM A BREAK. WE'RE NOT  
7 ELIMINATING ANY OF THE DEBT, WE'RE JUST SAYING WE'RE GOING TO  
8 LET YOU PAY IT OVER TIME BECAUSE YOU CHEERILY CAN'T PAY IT ALL  
9 AT ONCE. AND, SO, THAT'S CATEGORICALLY DIFFERENT THAN GIVING  
10 DISCOUNTS TO PEOPLE BASE ON THAT 200% FEDERAL POVERTY LINE.

11

12 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SO, THANK YOU FOR YOUR -- YOU KNOW, THAT'S  
13 YOUR BASIS FOR DISTINCTION. I THINK IT'S HELPFUL TO HEAR THAT  
14 PERSPECTIVE. BUT LET ME TAKE UP THE OTHER PART OF YOUR  
15 QUESTION, COMMISSIONER, WHICH WAS WHY MOVING AWAY FROM THE ALL  
16 IN. LET ME READ IT AGAIN BECAUSE IT'S AN INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT  
17 POINT. IF WE WERE TO OPEN IT UP TO ANYBODY, THAT INCREASES,  
18 SIGNIFICANTLY, THE FINANCIAL EXPOSURE OF THIS AGENCY, TO THE  
19 DEGREE THAT IT TAKES A LOT, AS LYSA SAID, IT -- THERE IS AN  
20 ISSUE OF NOT BEING ABLE TO RECOVER THE TOLLS ON A, YOU KNOW,  
21 LIKE YOU PAY IT THE DAY YOU'RE SUPPOSED, TO AS OPPOSED TO  
22 WE'RE COVER IT OVER A 1 TO 2 YEAR PERIOD. THERE IS A CASH FLOW  
23 FINANCIAL IMPACT ON THAT. AND I CAN HAVE DEREK, OUR CFO  
24 COMMENT ON THAT H BUT THAT'S A CONSIDERATION. ONE OF THE  
25 THINGS IN ORDER TO THINK ABOUT THE DEGREE OF THAT FINANCIAL



JUNE 8, 2022

1 EXPOSURE WAS THE POINT I MADE EARLIER. AT THE END OF THE DAY,  
2 WE NEED TO COLLECT OUR TOLLS. THAT'S THE CRITICAL ELEMENT THAT  
3 IS, YOU KNOW, UNDERLIES BOTH OUR FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY AND  
4 OUR EXPOSURE. SO, WE HAD SAID IF IT'S OPEN TO ANYTHING, THE  
5 CRITERIA WE HAD WAS YOU PAY YOUR TOLLS FIRST AND THEN THE  
6 PAYMENT PLAN WILL BE ATTACHED TO THE REMAINING PENALTIES THAT  
7 HAVE BEEN TIED UP. AND WE HAD SCALED IT AND WE HAD EXPLAINED  
8 IT TO THE COMMISSION WHY WE HAD THAT BREAK. WE COULD HAVE  
9 LIVED WITH THAT, BUT WHAT WE HEARD WAS, BUT THAT'S NOT GOOD  
10 ENOUGH. BECAUSE WE WANT IT TO BE OPEN TO ANYBODY TO SPREAD THE  
11 TOLLS INTO THE PAYMENT PLAN, AS WELL. AND, SO, IF YOU WANT TO  
12 DO THAT, THEN THE TRADE-OFF IS TO THINK ABOUT A SMALLER  
13 POPULATION WHERE THE EXPOSURE OF, YOU KNOW, TAKING ALL THAT,  
14 THE ACCUMULATION OF TOLLS AND PENALTIES OVER A LONG PERIOD OF  
15 TIME AS A SMALLER POPULATION THAT IS DISTINGUISHED BY AN  
16 ELIGIBILITY OF LOW-INCOME. SO WE SEE, AS STAFF, WE SEE AN  
17 IMPORTANT TRADEOFF DISTINCTION IN THAT SPACE. THAT IF WE OPEN  
18 IT TO EVERYBODY, WE NEED SURETY THAT WE CAN COLLECT OUR TOLLS.  
19 AND THEN WE CAN WORK WITH ANYBODY, IRRESPECTIVE OF INCOME OR  
20 CIRCUMSTANCES, OR WHAT NOT, ON MANAGING THE REMAINDER. THAT  
21 WAS THE CIRCUMSTANCE WE TALKED ABOUT AT SOME LENGTH BUT THAT  
22 WAS THE DISTINGUISHING FACTOR. AND IT'S THE ONE THAT WE SAID,  
23 WELL IF THAT'S NOT ACCEPTABLE, THEN, IN OUR VIEW, BEING ABLE  
24 TO MINIMIZE A FINANCIAL EXPOSURE SITUATION WOULD BE WORKING



JUNE 8, 2022

1 WITH A MORE TARGETED POPULATION MOST IN NEED, WHICH WOULD BE  
2 LOW-INCOME. SO I JUST WANT TO PRESENT THAT.

3

4 **HILLARY RONEN:** I DO THINK THERE IS A THIRD OPTION. AND HERE IS  
5 MY FEAR IF WE GO THIS ROUTE. THIS IS A PILOT, RIGHT? WE'RE  
6 SEEING WHETHER OR NOT THIS WORKS. WE HAVE EVIDENCE FROM OTHER  
7 PROGRAMS AND OTHER JURISDICTION THAT IS IT DOES WORK AND THAT  
8 THE RECOVERY RATES ARE HIGHER THAN NOT HAVING A PROGRAM AT  
9 ALL. IF YOU LIMIT THIS, JUST TO THE LOWEST INCOME PEOPLE,  
10 BECAUSE, I WOULD CALL PEOPLE THAT ARE BEING EXCLUDED FROM THIS  
11 PROGRAM EXTREMELY LOW-INCOME AS WELL, THEN YOU'RE NOT REALLY  
12 GETTING A FULL PICTURE OF WHETHER OR NOT THIS WORKS. RIGHT?  
13 FOR THIS POPULATION, FOR THIS PURPOSE. BECAUSE YOU'RE TAKING  
14 PEOPLE STRUGGLING SO MUCH TO SURVIVE IN THE BAY AREA, AND  
15 THAT'S GOING TO HAVE A DIFFERENT, YOU KNOW, SUCCESS RATE,  
16 POTENTIALLY, THAN, YOU KNOW, THE MORE MIDDLE INCOME PEOPLE  
17 THAT ARE STRUGGLING. AND WE'RE NOT GETTING A CLEAR PICTURE  
18 THAT IF WE THEN OPENED UP THIS PROGRAM TO EVERY -- YOU KNOW,  
19 WE NEED TO EXPERIMENT, DOES THIS WORK. I UNDERSTAND, I AGREE  
20 WITH YOU, WE HAVE TO RECOVER THE DEBT. 100%, ABSOLUTELY. MY  
21 CONTENTION IS, WE'RE GOING TO RECOVER MORE DEBT IF WE USE A  
22 REALLY WELL-STRUCTURED PAYMENT PLAN. AND IF WE DON'T SET  
23 BARRIERS THAT FIVE OF THE TEN -- FIVE OF THE SIX OTHER  
24 COMPANIES YOU SURVEYED SAID THE WAY THIS WORKS THE BEST IS YOU  
25 DON'T -- YOU HAVE AS FEW BARRIERS AS POSSIBLE FOR ENTRY, DON'T



JUNE 8, 2022

1 MAKE PEOPLE PROVE THEIR INCOME. YOU REMIND THEM CONSTANTLY.  
2 YOU WORK BASED ON THE PERSON'S ABILITY TO PAY AND TREAT THEM  
3 AS PEOPLE WHO WANT TO PAY THEIR DEBT. YOU KNOW, AND MAKE IT  
4 EASY THROUGH PHONE APPS, THROUGH ALL OF THESE MODERN-DAY DEBT  
5 COLLECTION PRACTICES THAT DON'T, YOU KNOW, HARASS PEOPLE ON  
6 THE PHONE TONS OF TIMES A DAY TO TELL THEM THAT THEY'RE BAD.  
7 BUT THE WHAT'S GOING ON WITH YOU, CAN YOU PAY THIS MONTH.  
8 LET'S HAVE THAT REAL PILOT AND FIGURE OUT DOES IT WORK. AND IF  
9 IT DOESN'T, THEN WE CAN REASSESS BUT WHAT WE'RE DOING IS  
10 TAKING A SUBSET OF THE POPULATION THE POOREST OF THE POOR AND  
11 WE'RE NEVER GOING TO KNOW WITH THIS PILOT PROGRAM WE WOULD  
12 HAVE RECOVERED MORE IF WE ALLOWED EVERYONE TO PARTICIPATE IN  
13 THIS, AND WE COULD HAVE A LIMITED TIME PILOT WHERE WE KEPT THE  
14 NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS AND TAKE AWAY THE INCOME VERIFICATION  
15 AND ALLOW ANYONE TO PARTICIPATE. BECAUSE WE NEED TO STUDY IT.  
16 WE NEED TO KNOW WHAT WORKS. I FEEL STRONGLY ABOUT THAT. I  
17 DON'T UNDERSTAND. AND IF YOU COULD ANSWER THE QUESTIONS ABOUT  
18 CONDUENT. DOES CONDUENT DO THIS?

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** LET'S MOVE ON THEN WE CAN ANSWER THE OTHER  
21 QUESTIONS. I KNOW, COMMISSIONER RONEN, THAT YOU HAVE TO LEAVE  
22 AT 10:30. SO, LET'S HAVE THE CONDUENT QUESTION IN TERMS OF  
23 SPENCER.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **LYSA HALE:** HAPPY TO ANSWER THAT. YES, CONDUENT DOES RUN A  
2 PAYMENT PLAN PROGRAM IN NEW JERSEY. AND WE HAVE TAKEN A LOOK  
3 AT WHAT THEY DO THERE AND FEEL LIKE WHAT THEY COULD DO HERE  
4 COULD BE MODELED AFTER THAT COMBINING, AS WE SAID, THE  
5 FRAMEWORK OF CLIPPER START. THE OTHER THING THAT I WANTED TO  
6 MENTION IS THAT YOU ASKED ABOUT WHY ARE WE NOT GOING OUT TO  
7 BID FOR THIS. SO, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE HEARD FROM  
8 THE COMMISSION IS THAT THEY WOULD LIKE US TO DEVELOP THE  
9 PAYMENT PLAN AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. GOING OUT TO BID AS AN  
10 ADDITIONAL 6 TO 9 MONTHS TO THE PROCESS OF CREATING THE  
11 PAYMENT PLAN, WE WERE HOPING TO GET IT GOING SOONER. -- SOONER  
12 THAN THAT. AND ONCE A CONTRACTOR WOULD BE SELECTED, THEN THERE  
13 WOULD HAVE TO BE ALL THE DEVELOPMENT WORK THAT GOES INTO THE  
14 ACTUAL CREATION OF THE PAYMENT PLAN, HOW THAT IS GOING TO WORK  
15 TECHNICALLY ON THE CONDUENT SIDE; YOU KNOW, UNDER OUR CURRENT  
16 SYSTEM. WE WERE AFRAID IF WE GO THROUGH THAT PROCESS, WE MAY  
17 ACTUALLY GET TO THE POINT WHERE WE CAN NO LONGER SEND SOME OF  
18 THE VIOLATIONS TO DMV HOLD OR COLLECTIONS, BECAUSE WE WILL GET  
19 INTO THAT JANUARY 2024 TIME FRAME, POTENTIALLY. SO, THAT'S ONE  
20 OF THE REASONS THAT WE WANTED TO GO WITH OUR CURRENT  
21 CONTRACTOR, WHICH HAS A PAYMENT PROGRAM IN ANOTHER -- FOR  
22 ANOTHER TOLL COLLECTION AGENCY.

23

24 **HILLARY RONEN:** AND DO YOU HAVE ANY DETAILS ABOUT HOW THAT  
25 PAYMENT PROGRAM WORKS? LIKE, HOW THEY CONTACT DEBT HOLDERS?





JUNE 8, 2022

1 HOW THEY COMMUNICATE WITH THEM? YOU KNOW, WHAT HAPPENS IF THEY  
2 HAVE TO MISS A PAYMENT, ET CETERA?

3

4 **LYSA HALE:** I DON'T KNOW THE DETAILS ABOUT THAT, WE'RE LIMITED  
5 AS TO WHAT WE CAN DO IN TERMS OF CONTACTING CUSTOMERS. I WOULD  
6 HAVE TO DEFER TO KATHLEEN CANE TO THE ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS  
7 ABOUT THE LIMITATIONS ON HOW WE CONTACT THEM.

8

9 **HILLARY RONEN:** I'M LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FROM COMMISSIONER  
10 JOSEFOWITZ. BUT I REALLY THINK WE NEED TO RETHINK THIS THING  
11 AND GO BACK TO THE DRAWING BOARD. AND IF I WAS ABLE TO STAY, I  
12 WOULD VOTE NO ON THIS. I FEEL KIND OF DISAPPOINTS.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU,  
15 COMMISSIONER. NOW WE HAVE COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. AND THEN  
16 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. AND, YOU KNOW -- AND THANK YOU  
19 COMMISSIONER RONEN FOR ALL OF YOUR COMMENTS. YOU KNOW, I THINK  
20 ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I'M STRUGGLING WITH A LOT OF THE SAME  
21 THINGS THAT COMMISSIONER RONEN IS STRUGGLING WITH. AND, YOU  
22 KNOW, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT SORT OF RISES TO THE TOP FOR ME  
23 IS THAT I'M FRUSTRATED THAT WE HAVEN'T DONE -- WE HAVEN'T  
24 COMPLETED OUR OUTREACH WORK --

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, CAN WE START WITH  
2 QUESTIONS FIRST? THEN WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO IS TAKE PUBLIC  
3 COMMENT, THEN WE'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE FOR  
4 COMMENTS AND DISCUSSIONS.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. SO, I GUESS I'LL PHRASE MY -- THESE  
7 QUESTIONS. SO, LYSA IN THE APRIL COMMITTEE MEETING WE SPOKE  
8 ABOUT PUBLIC OUTREACH AND YOU SAID THAT STAFF WAS GOING TO  
9 COME BACK IN LATE MAY EARLY JUNE WITH THE RESULTS OF THE  
10 PUBLIC OUTREACH. HAVE THE RESULTS OF THE PUBLIC OUTREACH  
11 INFLUENCED THE DECISION MAKING ON THIS? OR NOT?

12

13 **LYSA HALE:** WE DON'T ACTUALLY HAVE ALL OF THE RESULTS IN YET.  
14 WE EXPECTED TO HAVE SOME RESULTS, BUT UNFORTUNATELY ONE OF OUR  
15 CONTRACTORS HAD THEIR OUTREACH STAFF HAVE NINE CASES OF COVID.  
16 SO, THAT HAS CONSIDERABLY DELAYED THE PROCESS OF COLLECTING  
17 FEEDBACK FROM FOLKS ABOUT THE PAYMENT PLAN. SO, IT'S PROBABLY  
18 GOING TO TAKE US A COUPLE OF WEEKS LONGER THAN WE EXPECTED.  
19 SO, UNFORTUNATELY. WE HAD HOPED TO BRING SOMETHING BACK TO  
20 THIS MEETING.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE BEEN  
23 TALKING ABOUT FOR A WHILE NOW IS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND,  
24 POTENTIALLY, WHAT IS -- HOW MANY PEOPLE WHO ARE FACING THESE  
25 DIFFERENT LEVELS OF VIOLATIONS ARE LOW-INCOME. FOR INSTANCE,



JUNE 8, 2022

1 IN THE LAST PRESENTATION IN APRIL, THE OVER 20,000 DRIVERS WHO  
2 HAVE VIOLATION, WHO HAVE DEBT OVER A THOUSAND DOLLARS. WHICH  
3 IS JUST LIKE 20,000 PEOPLE, THAT'S JUST LIKE STADIUMS WORTH OF  
4 DRIVERS WHO HAVE DEBT OVER A THOUSAND DOLLARS. HAVE YOU MADE  
5 ANY -- I DON'T THINK YOU HAVE, BUT HAVE YOU MADE ANY PROGRESS  
6 IN ESTIMATING HOW MANY OF THOSE DRIVERS COULD POTENTIALLY BE  
7 LOW-INCOME OR MIGHT BE LOW-INCOME?

8

9 **LYSA HALE:** YOU KNOW, IT'S REALLY HARD FOR US TO TELL THAT,  
10 BECAUSE, AS YOU KNOW, WHEN WE SEND OUT THESE INVOICES, I MEAN,  
11 WE DON'T KNOW WHO THESE PEOPLE ARE, OTHER THAN THE FACT THAT  
12 WE HAVE THEIR MAILING ADDRESS. WE CAN DO SOME SPECULATION  
13 BASED ON THE LOCATION OF THE ADDRESS LOCATIONS OF WHERE WE'RE  
14 SENDING VIOLATION NOTICES OUT OVERLAPPING THAT WITH WHERE  
15 THERE ARE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. BUT I WOULD SAY THAT'S  
16 PROBABLY NOT A VERY CLEAR-CUT WAY OF ESTIMATING HOW MANY  
17 PEOPLE IN OUR BACKLOG ARE ACTUALLY LOW-INCOME. IT'S VERY  
18 DIFFICULT FOR US TO TELL. AND WE'RE STILL DOING SOME WORK ON  
19 THAT, TRYING TO PULL SOME OF THAT DATA OUT.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO, YOU KNOW, WE ENGAGE IN -- I GUESS, WHAT I  
22 WOULD CALL ESTIMATION, YOU CALL SPECULATION, BUT IT FEELS  
23 LIKE, IF WE ARE GOING TO MAKE -- YOU KNOW, THE -- WE MAKE SO  
24 MANY ASSUMPTIONS IN THIS REGION AND THIS AGENCY BASED ON WHERE  
25 PEOPLE LIVE IN TERMS OF, LIKE, EVERYTHING THAT WE DO AROUND



JUNE 8, 2022

1 PLANNED BAY AREA IS GEARED AROUND, LIKE, USING CENSUS DATA  
2 BASED ON WHERE PEOPLE LIVE, TO KIND OF THEN TARGET PROGRAMS AT  
3 THEM, TARGET STRATEGIES AT THEM. I THINK IF WE JUST DECIDED AS  
4 AN AGENCY THAT WE WERE GOING TO THROW THE EQUITY PRIORITY  
5 COMMUNITIES CONCEPT OUT OF SPECULATION, I AM GOING TO ASK FOR  
6 US TO ASK WHAT PERCENTAGE OF VIOLATORS ARE IN EQUITY PRIORITY  
7 COMMUNITIES TO THE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES BECAUSE I THINK THAT  
8 WILL PROVIDE US WITH SOME INFORMATION THAT WOULD BE REALLY  
9 HELPFUL.

10

11 **LYSA HALE:** JUST SO YOU KNOW, WE HAVE ALREADY STARTED DOING  
12 SOME PLANNING OF HOW WE WOULD DO THAT OUTREACH AND WE WOULD  
13 BUILD ON SOME OF THE OUTREACH THAT WE HAVE ALREADY DONE AS  
14 PART OF OUR COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND IN ADDITION TO THAT, WE  
15 WOULD INCLUDE ALL OF THOSE OTHER TACTICS. AS PART OF THE  
16 ADVERTISING, WE COULD DO FOCUSED ADVERTISING IN LOW-INCOME  
17 COMMUNITIES, LIKE YOU SAID, CENSUS TRACTS THAT QUALIFY AS LOW-  
18 INCOME. SO WE COULD DO THAT KIND OF TARGETING. WOULD WE REACH  
19 EVERY SINGLE PERSON? PROBABLY NOT. WE NEED TO HAVE SOME KIND  
20 OF REGION-WIDE EFFORT IN CONJUNCTION WITH A MORE TARGETED  
21 EFFORT. SO, THAT IS SOMETHING THAT WE CAN DO IN LIEU OF BEING  
22 ABLE TO SEND SOMETHING TO A PIECE OF MAIL TO EVERY SINGLE  
23 PERSON LETTING THEM KNOW ABOUT THE PROGRAM.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH, I GUESS -- SO, THAT'S HELPFUL. I WOULD  
2 REALLY LIKE TO KNOW WHAT PERCENT, WHAT PERCENTAGE OF OUR  
3 VIOLATORS TO OUR DIFFERENT CATEGORIES IN THE EQUITY PRIORITY  
4 COMMUNITIES, NOT THE SAME THING THEY LIVE IN THOSE EQUITY  
5 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, LIKELY TO BE LOW-INCOME, THAT WOULD BE  
6 GOOD INFORMATION. SO HOW YOU'RE THINKING THIS WORK, I'M A LOW-  
7 INCOME PERSON WHO HAS MOVED AND DIDN'T UPDATE MY DMV  
8 REGISTRATION ADDRESS PROPERLY, SO I HAVE BEEN ACCUMULATING  
9 DEBT, AND I HAVE A DOLLARS DEBT, AND THE DMV SENDS MY  
10 REGISTRATION HOLD. I DIDN'T GET IT BECAUSE I MOVED. I THEN TRY  
11 TO REGISTER MY VEHICLE, AND I'M TOLD YOU CAN'T REGISTER IT  
12 BECAUSE YOU HAVE OVER A THOUSAND DOLLARS IN DEBT. HOW DOES  
13 THAT PERSON KNOW THAT WE ARE OFFERING A PAYMENT PLAN FOR THEM?  
14 OR THAT WE ARE OFFERING THEM AN OPPORTUNITY TO WIPE THEIR  
15 VIOLATIONS BY SIGNING UP TO FASTRAK?

16

17 **LYSA HALE:** THERE ARE A COUPLE OF WAYS THAT COULD HAPPEN ONE IS  
18 BY DOING THE REGIONAL SUSTAINED CAMPAIGN TO LET PEOPLE KNOW  
19 THAT YOU'RE HAVING A PROBLEM PAYING YOUR TOLLS THAT THERE ARE  
20 OPTIONS FOR YOU. WE CAN TALK ABOUT NOT ONLY THE PAYMENT PLAN,  
21 BUT, LIKE, THE WAIVER PLAN, THE WAIVERS THAT WE OFFER, THERE  
22 ARE DIFFERENT WAYS WE CAN EXPLAIN THAT TO PEOPLE. BUT WHEN  
23 PEOPLE GET THOSE VIOLATION NOTICES IT DOES INDICATE WHETHER OR  
24 NOT IT'S FOR BATA OR NOT. SO, SOMEBODY COULD CALL US AND SAY,  
25 I HAVE THIS HUGE BACKLOG OF TOLLS AND PENALTIES THEY CAN'T



JUNE 8, 2022

1 PAY. AND AT THAT POINT, THEY WOULD BE TOLD ABOUT ALL THE  
2 OPTIONS AVAILABLE TO THEM. NOT ONLY OF THE WAIVER PROGRAM, BUT  
3 ALSO THE PAYMENT PLAN PROGRAM. AND, YOU KNOW, IF THIS HAPPENED  
4 IN THE TWO PHASES, LIKE THERESE AND I BOTH TALKED ABOUT, THERE  
5 COULD BE THIS PREQUALIFICATION PERIOD. SO, WE COULD GET THAT  
6 GOING SOONER THAN THE PAYMENT PLAN, PUT THOSE PEOPLE IF THAT,  
7 KIND OF, WAITING ROOM, AND THEN ONCE THE PAYMENT PLAN IS  
8 READY, RELEASE THOSE PEOPLE, LET THEM KNOW THAT THERE IS A  
9 PAYMENT PLAN PROGRAM, AND HAVE THEM START GOING THROUGH THE  
10 PROCESS OF SETTING UP THE ACTUAL PAYMENT PLAN. THE OTHER THING  
11 THAT WE DID POINT OUT IS THAT IF WE DON'T CATCH YOU IN THAT  
12 FIRST PREQUALIFICATION PERIOD, AND YOUR VEHICLE DOES GO TO  
13 DMV, YOU DO HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO CALL US AT THAT POINT, AND  
14 WE WILL PULL BACK YOUR DMV REGISTRATION HOLD. SO WE'LL PULL  
15 YOU OUT OF THAT IF YOU CAN PROVIDE PROOF OF ELIGIBILITY FOR  
16 THAT PREQUALIFICATION PROGRAM. SO I DON'T KNOW IF THAT ANSWERS  
17 YOUR QUESTION.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IT SORT OF DOES. BUT IT FEELS LIKE, YOU KNOW,  
20 THERE IS GOING TO BE -- MY INSTINCT IS THERE IS GOING TO BE A  
21 LOT OF PEOPLE WHO GET A THOUSAND DOLLARS BILL AND THEIR  
22 INSTINCT IS NOT TO CALL BATA. WE HAVE EXPERIENCE WITH THIS,  
23 BECAUSE WE HAVE PRESUMABLY SENT MANY PEOPLE TO DMV HOLD IN THE  
24 PAST WHO HAVE LARGE BILLS. DO WE KNOW HOW MANY OF THEM REACHED  
25 OUT TO BATA ABOUT THIS?



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **LYSA HALE:** I DON'T KNOW.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** TO OUR CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER? IS THAT  
5 SOMETHING YOU COULD FIND OUT, IF YOU WERE TO TELL ME, OH,  
6 YEAH, 98% OF PEOPLE WHO GET A THOUSAND DOLLARS DMV HOLD CALL  
7 BATA CUSTOMER SERVICE AND WE HAVE AN INTERACTION WITH THEM,  
8 I'M, LIKE, OH, THEY'RE GOING TO FIND OUT ABOUT OUR PAYMENT  
9 PLANS THAT'S GREAT. AND IF YOU TELL ME 5% OF PEOPLE WHO GET A  
10 THOUSAND DOLLARS DMV HOLD CALL BATA I'M GOING TO BE, LIKE, OH,  
11 THAT FEELS LIKE A REAL PROBLEM. BECAUSE THEY'RE PROBABLY NOT  
12 GOING TO BE AWARE OF OUR PAYMENT PLANS. THEY'RE PROBABLY GOING  
13 TO BE DRIVING, PROBABLY NOT GOING TO BE REGISTERING THEIR  
14 VEHICLE BECAUSE THEY'RE LOCATION, LIABLE TO GET ANOTHER \$600  
15 IN FINES, AND YOU CAN GET YOUR LICENSE WITHHELD, THE SPIRAL OF  
16 DISPROPORTIONATE CONSEQUENCES, BUT I DON'T THINK ANY OF US  
17 WANT TO SEE SORT OF HAPPEN OF HAVING LOW-INCOME PEOPLE HAVING  
18 THEIR LICENSES REVOKED, BECAUSE WE COULDN'T -- THEY DIDN'T  
19 KNOW WE HAD A PAYMENT PLAN.

20

21 **LYSA HALE:** WELL, TO GO BACK TO YOUR QUESTION, INFORM, I DON'T  
22 HAVE AN ANSWER AS TO HOW MANY PEOPLE WITH THOSE HIGH DEBT  
23 ACTUALLY CALL THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. I'M NOT SURE HOW  
24 EASY IT WOULD BE FOR US TO FIND THAT OUT BUT WE CAN CERTAINLY  
25 LOOK INTO IT FOR YOU.



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE THAT. I THINK THAT I'M JUST --  
3 I'M FINE SENDING THE COMMERCIAL VIOLATORS TO DMV HOLD. I'M  
4 FIND SENDING THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE 1, 2, MAYBE EVENLY VIOLATIONS  
5 TO DMV HOLD BECAUSE THAT'S NOT A LOT OF DEBT. I JUST DON'T  
6 FEEL COMFORTABLE, GIVEN WHERE THE PLAN IS RIGHT NOW, SENDING --  
7 -- OF HOW WE CAN ACTUALLY LET PEOPLE KNOW THAT A PAYMENT PLAN  
8 IS AVAILABLE, THAT A WAIVER PLAN IS AVAILABLE, SENDING PEOPLE  
9 WITH MORE DEBT, WITH MORE THAN 50 TO \$60 OF DEBT TO DMV HOLD.  
10 I JUST DON'T HAVE THE CONFIDENCE THAT THEY ACTUALLY WOULD KNOW  
11 WE HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN AVAILABLE FOR THEM TO BE ABLE TO TAKE  
12 ADVANTAGE OF. AND I THINK THERE IS MORE WORK TO DO THERE TO  
13 MAKE ME COMFORTABLE. AND I'M COMFORTABLE THAT I WILL GET  
14 COMFORTABLE, BUT I THINK THERE IS MORE WORK TO DO TO MAKE THAT  
15 HAPPEN. AND, SO, I HAVE SOME OTHER QUESTIONS ABOUT THE STATE  
16 LEGISLATION. BUT, THOSE WILL COME LATER.

17

18 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IF I COULD, BEFORE MOVING ON TO --  
19 COMMISSIONER WORTH, YOU TAKING ON EVERYONE. I WOULD, JUST TO  
20 SET EXPECTATIONS, LET ME REITERATE WHAT I SAID BEFORE, WE ARE  
21 VERY LIMITED LEGALLY, AND ADMINISTRATIVELY, AS TO HOW WE CAN  
22 CONTACT PEOPLE IN OUR FASTRAK DATABASE. WE ARE. SO, I JUST  
23 DON'T WANT THERE TO BE EXPECTATIONS THAT THERE'S DIFFERENT WAY  
24 -- EVEN IF, FOR EXAMPLE, WE WERE TO DO A, SORT OF, EQUITY  
25 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. GREAT. I MEAN, WE CAN AND SHOULD DO





JUNE 8, 2022

1 THAT. BUT IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT WE CAN SEND THEM DIRECT  
2 MAILINGS. SO EVEN IF WE HAVE THAT INFORMATION, WE'RE STILL  
3 GOING TO BE LIMITED. AND, AGAIN, I WOULD TURN TO GENERAL  
4 COUNSEL TO CONFIRM OR CLARIFY WHAT I'M SAYING. BUT, THERE --  
5 THOSE LIMITATIONS WILL EXIST ANYWAY. AND ABSENT, I THINK,  
6 IMPORTANT THINGS, LOOKING FORWARD, I THINK THERE HAS BEEN  
7 DISCUSSIONS WITH ASSEMBLYMAN TING'S LEGISLATION, LOOKING AT  
8 TOLLS OTHER AND THINGS, OF BEING ABLE TO ESTABLISH MUCH  
9 BROADER FLEXIBILITY TO DO THE THINGS THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO DO  
10 IN TERMS OF MORE DIRECT COMMUNICATIONS AND THE LIKE, WE COULD  
11 DO THAT. BUT I DON'T -- I JUST DON'T THINK THAT, IF,  
12 CONCEPTUALLY WE CAME UP WITH A BETTER WAY WE WOULD ACTUALLY BE  
13 ABLE TO DO IT. I WANT TO MAKE SURE AS WE CONTINUE TO EXPLORE,  
14 THERE ARE SOME REAL LIMITS THAT WE ALREADY KNOW THAT,  
15 CERTAINLY, FOR THE PERIOD OF TIME IN PUTTING TOGETHER THE  
16 PAYMENT PLAN, I DON'T THINK WE'LL BE ABLE TO OVERCOME.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IF I COULD FOLLOW UP ON THAT. IT'S WORTH  
19 GETTING INTO THE DETAILS OF THAT, BECAUSE THAT'S IMPORTANT.  
20 AND THEN BECAUSE WE DO HAVE THE TING LEGISLATION RUNNING, YOU  
21 KNOW, IF WE CAN GET LEG -- IF WE CAN GET -- WE'LL KNOW -- IF  
22 WE CAN SORT OF PUT TOGETHER OUR WISH LIST OF WE WOULD LIKE TO  
23 CONTACT PEOPLE TO LET THEM KNOW AND THAT STATE LEGISLATE YOU  
24 WOULD BE OPEN, TO WE WOULD KNOW BY SEPTEMBER OR OCTOBER  
25 WHETHER WE COULD START DOING THAT, STARTING IN JANUARY, THAT



JUNE 8, 2022

1 WOULD MAKE A TOTAL, A HUGE DIFFERENCE IF WE COULD REACH OUT TO  
2 PEOPLE DIRECTLY TO LET THEM KNOW WE HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN RATHER  
3 THAN EXPECTING THEM TO CALL US, WHICH YOU, YOU KNOW, IT JUST  
4 FEELS LIKE, YOU KNOW, MOST PEOPLE, JUST -- I MAY BE WRONG, AND  
5 MAYBE WE HAVE INFORMATION ON THIS, BUT MY INSTINCT IS THAT  
6 PEOPLE AREN'T GOING TO CALL US.

7

8 **LYSA HALE:** WE DID DO A PREVIOUS INQUIRY INTO HOW MANY  
9 VIOLATIONS ARE IN THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. AND THE  
10 ESTIMATE IS ROUGHLY A THIRD. WHEN WE LOOKED AT THAT. THE OTHER  
11 THING THAT'S WORTH MENTIONING IS THAT, WE DON'T EXPECT TO BE -  
12 - TO HAVE PEOPLE CONTINUE TO ACCUMULATE LARGE DEBTS SINCE WE  
13 LOWERED THE VIOLATION PENALTIES. SO WE'RE BASICALLY DEALING  
14 WITH A GROUP OF PEOPLE THAT HAVE ALREADY ACCRUED HIGH  
15 PENALTIES, EVEN TAKING IN THE LOWER AMOUNTS OF THE VIOLATIONS.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. YOU KNOW --

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IT'S ABOUT 175,000 PEOPLE IN THE EQUITY  
20 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. YEAH.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SO MAY I TURN -- THANK YOU LYSA AND  
23 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. MAY I TURN TO GENERAL COUNSEL TO  
24 AMPLIFY THE, KIND OF, DESCRIBING WHERE WE ARE TODAY, FOLLOWING  
25 UP RECOGNIZING THE ASSEMBLY MEMBER TING BILL MAY OFFER



JUNE 8, 2022

1 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE SOME CHANGES THAT WE'RE SEEKING. SO,  
2 KATHLEEN, MAY I TURN TO YOU FOR JUST A LITTLE BIT OF  
3 CLARIFICATION IN TERMS OF WHERE WE ARE RIGHT NOW?

4

5 **KATHLEEN KANE:** SURE. SO, AS WAS SAID WE HAVE SOME STATUTORY  
6 LIMITATIONS ON HOW WE COMMUNICATE WITH CUSTOMERS, AND THE  
7 PURPOSE OF THOSE IS TO MAKE SURE WE'RE NOT BOMBARDING FOLKS  
8 AND USING THE SORT OF, KIND OF, COERCIVE POWER WE HAVE IN  
9 GETTING THEIR INFORMATION TO THEN OVER-COMMUNICATE WITH THEM  
10 THAT'S THE ORIGINAL INTENT OF THE LEGISLATION THERE. THE  
11 LEGISLATION IS PRETTY EXPLICIT ABOUT, WE CAN ONLY CONTACT  
12 PEOPLE TO COMMUNICATE THE FOLLOWING LIST OF ENUMERATED THINGS  
13 AND IF IT'S NOT ON THAT LIST WE DON'T TALK TO THEM ABOUT IT.  
14 SO THE QUESTION IS, WHAT'S ON THE LIST. ONE THING TO REMEMBER  
15 THAT WE CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF, IS THERE IS REAL ESTATE  
16 AVAILABLE ON THE VIOLATION NOTICES TO HELP PEOPLE GET INTO  
17 COMPLIANCE; WHICH, INCLUDES, ALSO, PAYMENT PLANS. SO ON A  
18 VIOLATION NOTICE, WE CAN SAY, YOU KNOW, IF YOU THINK YOU  
19 QUALIFY FOR A PAYMENT PLAN, LOW-INCOME PAYMENT PLAN CONTACT US  
20 HERE, GO TO THIS WEB SITE, WHATEVER. THAT'S SOMETHING WE DO ON  
21 THE VIOLATION. PROSPECTIVE FREESTANDING KIND OF FREESTANDING  
22 COMMUNICATIONS USING A CUSTOMER DATABASE IS AN ISSUE THAT WE  
23 WOULD HAVE TO ANALYZE CLOSELY UNDER STATUTORY OBLIGATIONS  
24 THOSE ARE ONES WE NEED TO TAKE VERY SERIOUSLY AND ALSO ARE  
25 UNDER A FAIR AMOUNT OF SCRUTINY WE DO HAVE SOME PENDING CASES



JUNE 8, 2022

1 ABOUT THAT, IT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE TO NAVIGATE CAREFULLY AND  
2 ENSURE WE'RE ADHERING TO THE LETTER OF THE LAWS THAT EXIST  
3 RIGHT NOW.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU KATHLEEN. LET ME NOW TURN TO  
6 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU. THIS IS A VERY COMPLICATED  
9 TOPIC. SO I APPRECIATE YOU GIVING US THE TIME TO DIVE INTO IT.  
10 I WANT TO JUST MAKE SURE I UNDERSTAND SOME BASICS. AND I WANT  
11 TO JUST SAY TO MY COLLEAGUES THAT I AM VERY INTERESTED IN  
12 MAKING SURE THAT THE FINANCIAL HEALTH OF THIS ORGANIZATION IS  
13 TOP OF MIND. IT'S NOT SECONDARY; IT'S PRIMARY. I THINK THAT'S  
14 TRUE FOR EVERYBODY WHO HAS RAISED A CONCERN ABOUT THIS. AND I  
15 THINK IN SOME OF THE DISCUSSIONS WE HAVE PITTED, MAYBE  
16 UNKNOWINGLY, EQUITY AGAINST FINANCIAL STABILITY. AND THE WE'RE  
17 FOR FINANCIAL STABILITY AND DOING IT IN A WAY THAT EQUITABLY  
18 GETS US THERE. SO THAT'S THE FIRST POINT I WANTED TO MAKE. I  
19 JUST WANTED TO ASK SOME BROAD QUESTIONS JUST ABOUT THE  
20 PRESENTATION, AND TO MAKE SURE I UNDERSTAND THEM. FIRST OF  
21 ALL, JUST -- THE SLIDE THAT STARTS WITH THE BACKLOG OF  
22 VIOLATIONS OF PENDING ACTION, THE TIMELINE BETWEEN JANUARY  
23 21ST AND MAY 2022, THE HALF A MILLION VEHICLES THAT HAVE 8.8  
24 MILLION OUTSTANDING VIOLATIONS AND HAVE NOT YET BEEN REALLY  
25 SENT TO DMV AND THAT THIS REPRESENTS 50 MILLION IN OUTSTANDING



JUNE 8, 2022

1 TOLLS, JUST THE TOLLS THEMSELVES, AND IF YOU ADDED ON THE  
2 FINES, WHAT WOULD THAT NUMBER BE?

3

4 **LYSA HALE:** THAT IS A GOOD QUESTION, AND UNFORTUNATELY I CAN'T  
5 DO THE MATH THAT QUICKLY IN MY HEAD. WE COULD CERTAINLY DO  
6 THAT MATH AND COME BACK TO YOU.

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** OKAY.

9

10 **LYSA HALE:** I CAN CHECK TO SEE IF ONE OF MY COLLEAGUES HAS THAT  
11 INFORMATION.

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. HERE IS THE OTHER PART OF THE  
14 QUESTION. WHAT PERCENTAGE OF THE \$50 MILLION IN OUTSTANDING  
15 TOLLS DO WE ANTICIPATE RECEIVING BY USING THE DMV HOLD  
16 PROCESS?

17

18 **LYSA HALE:** THAT'S AN INTERESTING QUESTION. BECAUSE SINCE WE  
19 HAVEN'T RELEASED ANYTHING TO DMV HOLD SINCE BEGINNING OF ATV  
20 THE ONLY THING WE HAVE TO BASE IT ON IS PRE-AET EFFORT. GOING  
21 BACK TO 2019, WE WERE COVERED 40% BY USING DMV HOLD AND WE  
22 RECOVERED ABOUT 10 TO 11% WHEN WE SENT VIOLATIONS TO  
23 COLLECTIONS.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO, OKAY, SO, WE HAVE A -- AND WHEN WE SAY 50%,  
2 THAT'S 50% OF THE TOLL MONEY? OR 50% OF TOLLS AND FINES?

3

4 **LYSA HALE:** 50% -- LET'S SEE. LET ME DOUBLE CHECK ON THAT.

5

6 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I IMAGINE IT WOULD HAVE TO BE BOTH.

7

8 **LYSA HALE:** I THINK IT'S BOTH.

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IF YOU GO TO THE DMV, THEY WILL LET --

11

12 **LYSA HALE:** YES.

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND HOW MUCH DOES IT COST US TO DO THAT RELATIVE  
15 TO HOW MUCH WE RECEIVE? AND WHAT I'M REALLY CURIOUS -- WHAT  
16 I'M REALLY WANTING TO UNDERSTAND IS THE CURRENT BUSINESS MODEL  
17 WE'RE USING. BECAUSE, I THINK A LOT OF WHAT -- THE FEEDBACK  
18 THAT WE'RE GETTING FROM YOU IS ROOTED IN THE CURRENT  
19 CONSTRUCT, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE I UNDERSTAND IT BEFORE I  
20 ASK MORE QUESTIONS ABOUT IT.

21

22 **LYSA HALE:** SO, OUR ESTIMATES ARE BASED ON WHAT IT WOULD COST  
23 FOR US TO CREATE THIS PREQUALIFICATION PLAN AND --

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I MEAN CURRENTLY, LYSA. BECAUSE, WITH THE \$3  
2 CHARGE FROM DMV, AND FROM COLLECTIONS -- THEY DON'T COLLECT  
3 FOR NOTHING -- WHAT I'M REALLY TRYING TO UNDERSTAND IS HOW  
4 MUCH ARE WE SPENDING, AND THEN WHAT IS OUR RATE OF RETURN. THE  
5 BIGGER QUESTION FOR US IS, WHEN YOU DID THE INITIAL RESEARCH,  
6 WHAT I WAS REALLY INTRIGUED BY WAS WHAT YOU LEARNED FROM THAT.  
7 BECAUSE MY FOLLOW-UP QUESTION WOULD BE, DOES THAT ALLOW US  
8 OVERALL TO INCREASE THE TOTAL AMOUNT THAT WE GET BACK WITHOUT  
9 PAYING, FOR EXAMPLE, THE DMV. [LAUGHTER] THREE OF DOLLARS, AND  
10 THEN WHATEVER THE COLLECTION FIRM IS COLLECTING. SO, I'M  
11 WANTING TO MEASURE THE MODELS BOTH IN TERMS OF HOW IT  
12 ADDRESSES LOW-INCOME FOLKS, FOR SURE. YOU KNOW, HOW MANY  
13 PEOPLE AREN'T PAYING. BECAUSE THE FEES ARE OUT OF WHACK, OR  
14 WHATEVER, WHICH WE WILL LEARN. BUT THEN OVERALL WE HAVE A MUCH  
15 BIGGER PROBLEM COLLEAGUES, WE HAVE \$50 MILLION IN OUTSTANDING  
16 TOLL DEBT JUST ON THIS ONE SHEET, AND THE REASON I WAS REALLY  
17 INTERESTED IN THE CRP AND RFS REQUEST FOR SOLUTIONS WAS, IF  
18 THE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE IS THREE PART, WE WANT TO  
19 INCREASE THE AMOUNT OF OUR TOLL REVENUE WE'RE GETTING BACK, WE  
20 WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE DOING IT IN A WAY THAT USES OUR BEST  
21 EQUITY LENS, AND THAT MEANS NOT DISADVANTAGING, YOU KNOW,  
22 POOR, COMMUNITIES OF COLOR, DOES IT DO THAT, AND THEN THIRD,  
23 TO BE FRANK, DOES IT MEAN WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK MORE  
24 CREATIVELY AT OTHER PROGRAMS TO HAVE MORE MEANINGFUL  
25 CONVERSATIONS WITH CUSTOMERS. IT SEEMED LIKE A WINNER. WHAT



JUNE 8, 2022

1 YOU PRESENTED TODAY, I WANT TO MAKE THE POINT, IT DOESN'T LINE  
2 UP WITH WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED, AND FRANKLY, THE GOALS I THOUGHT  
3 YOU WERE SETTING. I WANT TO SAY TO STAFF, I KNOW IT'S HARD,  
4 BECAUSE THERE ARE 100 OF US GIVING YOU FEEDBACK THAT'S OFTEN  
5 NOT HELPFUL, IN YOUR MINDS -- I GET IT. BUT IN THIS INSTANCE,  
6 I ACTUALLY THINK IF WE'RE ALL ALIGNED IN DOING -- COLLECTING  
7 THE TOLLS IN THE MOST EQUITABLE WAY, BEING CUSTOMER FRIENDLY,  
8 INCREASING OUR COMMUNICATION, THEN I THINK WE HAVE TO APPROACH  
9 THIS VERY DIFFERENTLY THAN WE'RE DOING TODAY. AND I'M GOING TO  
10 STEP OFF FOR A FEW MINUTES, AT 11, AND COME BACK AS QUICKLY AS  
11 I K I WOULDN'T VOTE FOR TODAY'S PROPOSAL NOT BECAUSE I DON'T  
12 THINK YOU HAVE PUT A LOT OF THOUGHT INTO T BUT I DON'T THINK  
13 IT ALIGNS WITH THE GOALS OF THE GROUP. I WANT US TO BE  
14 FINANCIAL STABLE. I THINK WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO INCREASE  
15 OUR FINANCIAL STABILITY INCREASE THE AMOUNT OF MONEY WE'RE  
16 GETTING BACK IN A WAY THAT'S RESPECTFUL OF THE VALUES OF THE  
17 ORGANIZATION. ANYWAY. THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME ASK THOSE  
18 QUESTIONS.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. LET ME JUST FOLLOW  
21 UP WITH ONE QUESTION. I DO NOT SEE ANY OTHER COMMITTEE HANDS  
22 UP AT THIS POINT. I KNOW, IN THE PAST, TO COMMISSIONER  
23 CHAVEZ'S QUESTIONS TO SORT OF THE SEQUENCING, ABOUT HOW WE  
24 RECOVER UNPAID TOLLS AND FEES. AND, DO WE HAVE A -- I THINK WE  
25 DO -- A CHART THAT SHOWS THE INITIAL VIOLATION THEN IT MOVES





JUNE 8, 2022

1 PRESUMABLY, YOU MOVE THROUGH TIME, AND IT'S -- REDUCES AT EACH  
2 STAGE OF THE, SORT OF, PAYMENT PROCESS. WE REDUCE THE UNIVERSE  
3 OF PEOPLE THAT ARE STILL OWE FINES AND FEES. DO WE LYSA -- I  
4 DON'T NEED AN ANSWER RIGHT NOW, BUT THE POINT OF THE GOAL IS  
5 TO COLLECT THE TOLLS IN AN EQUITABLE WAY. I'M JUST WONDERING,  
6 I KNOW IN THE PAST WE HAVE HAD DISCUSSIONS ABOUT IT, WHAT  
7 POINT DO WE -- AT WHAT POINT DO WE INTRODUCE, LET'S SAY, A FEE  
8 FOR NON-PAYMENT, WITH THE IDEA REDUCING IT. SO IF YOU CAN  
9 ANSWER THAT AT SOME POINT IT WOULD BE HELPFUL. LET ME TURN  
10 BACK -- SO I DON'T NEED AN ANSWER RIGHT NOW, BUT THAT MIGHT BE  
11 HELPFUL. LET ME TURN BACK, WE HAVE CHAIR PEDROZA, AND THEN  
12 COMMITTEE VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. MAY I TURN FIRST TO OUR CHAIR,  
13 COMMISSION CHAIR?

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH FOR MANAGING THIS  
16 MEETING. IT'S SOMETHING WE ALL CARE DEEPLY ABOUT, STAFF YOU  
17 HAVE DONE A TREMENDOUS JOB PRESENTING INFORMATION, AND I THINK  
18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS RIGHT, WE HAVE ALL BEEN PROVIDING YOU  
19 SO MUCH FEEDBACK AND YOU'RE TRYING TO PUT IT INTO A SILO AND  
20 MAKING IT WORK. WE KNOW THE DIRECTION AND WE KNOW THE OUTCOMES  
21 WE'RE TRYING TO AVOID. WE KNOW WHO WE'RE TRYING TO HELP, AND I  
22 DO BELIEVE WE CAN ACHIEVE THAT. THE CAVEAT I WOULD SAY IS WE  
23 NEED TO COME BACK WITH A ROBUST PUBLIC OUTREACH PLAN WHERE WE  
24 GET TO SEE MORE ABOUT WHAT IS -- WHAT ARE THOSE COMMUNICATION  
25 TOUCH POINTS? HOW WILL WE CREATE AWARENESS OF THE PAYMENT PLAN



JUNE 8, 2022

1 PROGRAM TO ENSURE THAT WE'RE NOT CREATING THOSE UNDESIRABLE  
2 OUTCOMES. AND I THINK WE NEED DO THAT BEFORE WE RELEASE THE  
3 DMV HOLDS. SO TO ME, I THINK WE DO NEED TO PROVIDE DIRECTION  
4 TO KEEP EXPLORING THIS TO COME BACK WITH THE ROBUST PLAN. AND  
5 I WANT TO REMIND US ALL, WE STARTED THIS LOOKING AT FEES AT  
6 SOME POINT THAT SOME OF US WANTED TO INCLUDE TOLLS, AND STAFF  
7 HAS PUT A PROPOSAL TOGETHER THAT INCLUDE TOLLS AND THE FEES  
8 BALANCING THE FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY, AND I WOULD LOVE TO  
9 HEAR DEREK'S PERSPECTIVE ON THIS. WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY HERE  
10 TO HELP THOSE THAT NEED HELP THE MOST, TO GET ON A PATH OF  
11 FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY BY CREATING AN AWARENESS OF THE  
12 PAYMENT PROGRAM. AND IF THE OPPORTUNITY IS AT THE POINT OF  
13 RENEWING YOUR DMV, WE'RE PROVIDING AN OPTION AT THAT POINT.  
14 WE'RE NOT LEAVING ANYONE IN AN ADVERSE SITUATION. I THINK THIS  
15 WOULD BE A VERY DIFFERENT CONVERSATION IF WE WERE DOING DMV  
16 HOLDS WITHOUT A SOLUTION. WE ARE SAYING WE WILL DO THIS, AND  
17 WE ARE GIVING YOU AN OPTION TO GET YOUR DEBT IN ORDER, TO KEEP  
18 -- TO GO INTO YOUR WORKPLACE. AND THE THAT'S OUR  
19 RESPONSIBILITY. AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT THIS PROGRAM DOES. IT  
20 ADDRESSES, TO COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ'S POINT, THE FINANCIAL  
21 RESPONSIBILITY THAT WE HAVE, COUPLED WITH EQUITY AND HELPING  
22 PEOPLE THAT NEED HELP THE MOST. I THINK THE ISSUE HERE IS HOW  
23 DO WE CREATE AWARENESS BETWEEN NOW AND THEN. AND STAFF, I  
24 THINK YOU CAN COME BACK TO US BEFORE WE RELEASE THE HOLD SO



JUNE 8, 2022

1 WE'RE ENSURING THE OUTCOMES TO RENEW REGISTRATION. I KNOW WE  
2 HAVE A BUSY MEETING AND WE HAVE ANOTHER MEETING AFTERWARDS.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MR. CHAIR, MAY I JUST CLARIFY WHAT YOU ARE  
5 ARTICULATED, SOME PRIORITIES WHICH I THINK WE ALL SHARE. WOULD  
6 IT BE YOUR INTENT THAT WE WOULD GET THIS INFORMATION BEFORE --  
7 I MEAN, I'M TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHERE WE GO FROM TODAY. AND I  
8 RECOGNIZE WE HAVE A LOT OF GOOD POINTS RAISED, AND WOULD IT BE  
9 YOUR COMMENT THAT WE WOULD DEFER A DECISION AT THIS POINT?

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NO. NO. WHAT I WOULD -- NEXT STEP, CHAIR  
12 WORTH, COULD BE THAT WE PROVIDE DIRECTION TO STAFF ON THEIR  
13 RECOMMENDATIONS TO CONTINUE FORWARD WITH THEM COMING BACK ON  
14 THE OUTREACH, YOU KNOW, THE OUTREACH -- THE PUBLIC OUTREACH  
15 STRATEGY BEFORE WE RELEASE THE DMV HOLDS. AND I THINK THAT IS  
16 POSSIBLE. SO MAYBE THAT'S A QUESTION TO OUR EXECUTIVE  
17 DIRECTOR. THERESE, IF WE PROVIDE DIRECTION TO START WORKING ON  
18 THE RECOMMENDATIONS WITH YOU ACKNOWLEDGE BACK ON THAT OUTREACH  
19 STRATEGY BEFORE WE RELEASE THE DMV HOLDS?

20

21 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I THINK THAT'S POSSIBLE AND REASONABLE. FOR  
22 CLARIFY, ARE YOU SAYING BEFORE RELEASING THE COMMERCIAL ONES?

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NO.

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** BUT -- AND THAT ALIGNS WITH WHAT I SAID  
2 BEFORE, THAT IT WOULD BE ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL THAT WE WOULD  
3 HAVE AN EFFECTIVE PUBLIC INFORMATION PROGRAM IN ADVANCE OF  
4 MOVING. AND I THINK WHAT YOU'RE SAYING IS THAT YOU WANT TO SEE  
5 IT, YOU KNOW.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** RIGHT.

8

9 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** -- AND HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT THAT, AND ANY  
10 REMAINING CONCERNS, ISSUES, ET CETERA, PRIOR TO THE  
11 TRIGGERING.

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND WHAT I WANT TO CLARIFY, WITH THE  
14 INTENTION OF RELEASING TO DMV, RIGHT, IS GIVING THIS  
15 COMMISSION THE OPPORTUNITY TO THE LOOK AT THE ROBUST PUBLIC  
16 OUTREACH PROGRAM THAT WE WOULD CREATE TO ENSURE THERE IS  
17 AWARENESS AROUND GETTING INTO THE PROGRAM.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** RIGHT. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. YES,  
20 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA THEN COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

21

22 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU  
23 TO STAFF FOR THE PRESENTATION. I APPRECIATE THE ROBUST  
24 DISCUSSION. I GUESS I WAS TRYING TO LISTEN AND UNDERSTAND THE  
25 CONCERNS, THE PRIORITIES, AND I HEARD A FEW THINGS, SO I GUESS



JUNE 8, 2022

1 I'M STARTING TO CLARIFY. IT SOUND LIKE WE'RE LANDING ON THE  
2 AWARENESS CAMPAIGN AS THE PRIORITY. BUT EARLIER ON, I THINK,  
3 WITH COMMISSIONER RONEN, IT SOUNDED LIKE THERE WAS CONCERN  
4 ABOUT, YOU KNOW, DOING THE MEANS-BASED PROGRAM, VERSUS A  
5 PROGRAM FOR ALL. AND MY INTEREST HAS REALLY BEEN TO TRY TO  
6 ASSIST THOSE WHO ARE, YOU KNOW, IN THE MOST NEED WITHIN THE  
7 PARAMETERS OF THE OTHER LIMITATIONS WE HAVE. ONE, I YOU THINK  
8 COST RECOVERY IS KEY, OR RECOVERY IS KEY. WE ALSO NOW HAVE  
9 THIS TIME LIMIT. SO, I APPRECIATE, FRANKLY, THE HARD WORK  
10 THAT'S BEEN PUT INTO THIS PILOT PROGRAM. AND I FEEL LIKE WE DO  
11 NEED TO GET GOING AND, YOU KNOW, TRY SOMETHING. SO, IF IT IS -  
12 - HOPEFULLY, BY CREATING A STRONG AWARENESS CAMPAIGN FOR -- SO  
13 THAT THOSE WHO DO NEED THE ASSISTANCE PROGRAM CAN KNOW ABOUT  
14 IT AND BE A PART OF IT, I THINK THAT'S A GREAT APPROACH. BUT,  
15 I WAS ARE WONDERING -- AND IT'S TOO BAD COMMISSIONER RONEN IS  
16 NO LONGER WITH US -- BUT, IT WAS, FOR HER, IS THE 200% POVERTY  
17 LEVEL, IS, YOU KNOW, IS THAT -- LIKE, IS THAT SOMETHING THAT  
18 WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT TOO? LIKE, IS THERE INTEREST IN  
19 INCREASING THAT? OR DOING MORE OF A SLIDING SCALE? AND, YOU  
20 KNOW, I WOULD BE OPEN TO THAT. BUT I ALSO WANT TO BE MINDFUL,  
21 AGAIN, OF THE TIME CONSTRAINTS AND THE STAFF THAT'S BEEN  
22 INVOLVED IN THIS. I THINK THE PRIORITY FOR ME WOULD BE TO TRY  
23 TO MOVE FORWARD WITH SOMETHING.  
24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **LYSA HALE:** I CAN JUST ADDRESS THAT, CHAIR WORTH, REALLY  
2 QUICKLY?

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SURE.

5

6 **LYSA HALE:** SO, I ALSO MANAGE THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM SO I'M  
7 VERY FAMILIAR WITH THAT. THE REASON WE CHOSE TO GO WITH 200%  
8 OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL OR LESS IS BECAUSE THAT'S THE  
9 SAME REQUIREMENT THAT EXISTS FOR OTHER STATEWIDE PROGRAMS AS  
10 WELL AS SFMTA'S LIFELINE PROGRAM. WE COULD USE ELIGIBILITY IN  
11 ALL OF THOSE PROGRAMS AS PROOF OF ELIGIBILITY FOR CLIPPER  
12 START PROGRAM AND WE COULD DO SOMETHING LIKE TAX RETURNS AND  
13 WE WOULD LIMIT HOW MUCH PII WE'RE COLLECTING FROM PEOPLE, AND  
14 THAT'S THE RATIONAL FOR GOING WITH THE 200% OF THE FEDERAL  
15 POVERTY LEVEL.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** YES THAT'S HELPFUL. WHATEVER CAN  
18 DO TO STREAMLINE THE PROCESS IS A GOOD PRIORITY. I AM  
19 SUPPORTIVE OF MOVING FORWARD AND JUST MAKING SURE WE HAVE A  
20 ROBUST CAMPAIGN TO GET THE WORD OUT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YEAH. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. MAY I FOLLOW  
23 UP ON COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA'S QUESTION? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?  
24 FIRST OF ALL, LYSA, THANK YOU AGAIN FOR YOUR THOUGHTFUL  
25 ANSWERS AND YOUR PRESENTATION. IT WAS REALLY HELPFUL. I HAVE A



JUNE 8, 2022

1 QUESTION ABOUT THE INCOME LEVEL, WE DEAL WITH HOUSING. SO YOUR  
2 ANSWER IS VERY HELPFUL TO CLARIFY THE BASIS FOR THIS  
3 PARTICULAR NUMBER. ONE OF THE OTHER CONCERNS COMMISSIONER  
4 RONEN RAISED WAS, WHAT ABOUT PEOPLE THAT AREN'T AT THAT LEVEL  
5 BUT ARE CLOSE, OR ABOVE THAT NUMBER? SO, DO WE HAVE A PROCESS  
6 TO WORK WITH CUST -- WE DO HAVE A PROCESS. AND CAN YOU JUST  
7 ARTICULATE IF WE HAVE A PROCESS FOR CUSTOMERS WHO WOULDN'T  
8 NECESSARILY MEET THE -- THAT PARTICULAR NUMBER, BUT ARE  
9 CERTAINLY IN -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]

10

11 **LYSA HALE:** SO, YEAH, WE, COMMISSIONER WORTH, I THINK YOU'RE  
12 FROZEN.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** FINES AND TOLLS.

15

16 **LYSA HALE:** THERE YOU ARE. [LAUGHTER] YES. WE COULD ADJUST THAT  
17 NUMBER. BUT WE WOULD, AT THE SAME TIME, HAVE TO ADJUST THE  
18 PROOF OF ELIGIBILITY.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT ADJUSTING THE NUMBER.  
21 I'M SAYING IF YOU HAVE A SITUATION WHERE SOMEBODY ISN'T QUITE  
22 AT THAT LEVEL BUT THEY HAVE GOT THE SAME HARDSHIP? WE WORK  
23 WITH INDIVIDUALS, AS I RECALL IN THE PAST, WE HAVE WORKED WITH  
24 TOLL PAYERS THAT HAVE PROBLEMS, TO HELP THEM PAY THOSE TOLLS  
25 AND FINES.



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WELL, AS LYSA SAID, AND SHE CAN SAY IT  
3 BETTER THAN I CAN -- SHE DID REMIND THE EXISTING PROGRAMS.  
4 IT'S SIMPLE IF YOU HAD NOT SIGNED UP FOR FASTRAK, YOU CAN PAY  
5 YOUR VIOLATION AND I THINK THE TOLLS AND PENALTIES ARE WAIVED.  
6 THERE ARE OTHER AREAS, DEPENDING ON THE PERSON AND  
7 CIRCUMSTANCES, THAT THEY COULD TAP INTO BUT IT WOULDN'T BE THE  
8 LOW-INCOME-BASED PAYMENT PLAN AS WE JUST DESCRIBED.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** IT WOULD BE THE WAIVER PROGRAMS.

11

12 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WITHIN THE CONSTRAINTS OF HOW THOSE HAVE  
13 BEEN SETUP.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** EXACTLY HOW THEY HAVE BEEN IN THE PAST.  
16 EXACTLY.

17

18 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER  
21 PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU EVERYBODY. AND THANK YOU FOR THE  
24 DISCUSSION AND CONVERSATION. I THINK WE HAVE THE COMMON GOAL  
25 THAT WE WANT TO HELP THE RIGHT PEOPLE. AND I THINK THIS IS A





JUNE 8, 2022

1 FIRST STEP. I THINK WHAT WE NEED TO BE COMMITTED TO AT THIS  
2 POINT IN TIME IS TRYING TO IMPLEMENT WHAT WE CAN, BECAUSE OF  
3 THE THREE-YEAR STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS. AND WE DO NEED TO BE  
4 CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. BUT, ALSO, COMMITTED TO LOOKING AT, WHEN  
5 WE IMPLEMENT SOMETHING, DOES IT WORK. SO, WHETHER IT'S SIX  
6 MONTHS FROM NOW, OR A YEAR FROM NOW, IF SOMETHING IS NOT  
7 WORKING, WE NEED TO KNOW THAT SO THAT WE CAN HELP THE PEOPLE  
8 WE'RE TRYING TO HELP HERE. SO, I DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
9 TRY TO MOVE AHEAD HERE, AS BEST WE CAN, A FIRST STEP IS GOOD.  
10 I WAS JUST WONDERING, HERE, CAN DMV ASSIST US IN OUR  
11 INFORMATION PROGRAM IN WHATEVER THEY SEND OUT? CAN THEY SAY,  
12 YOU KNOW, HERE IS WHERE YOU CAN CONTACT MTC TO FIND OUT ABOUT  
13 CERTAIN THINGS, JUST TO AID IN THIS PUBLIC INFORMATION PROGRAM  
14 IN ANY WAY, SHAPE, OR FORM THAT WE CAN. SO, THANK YOU,  
15 EVERYBODY, FOR YOUR WORK. BUT, YOU KNOW, IN ORDER TO ASSIST  
16 OUR PUBLIC INFORMATION, THAT ANOTHER WAY TO HELP IT. THANK  
17 YOU.

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** CHAIR WORTH. I'M SORRY. I'M JUST REALIZING  
20 THAT, KIND OF GOING BACK TO SOMETHING THAT CHAIR PEDROZA SAID.  
21 I, YOU KNOW, PERHAPS IT WOULD BE ALSO HELPFUL FOR THE  
22 COMMISSIONERS, FOR OUR CFO, DEREK HANSEL TO COMMENT ON THE  
23 FINANCIAL EXPOSURE RISK THAT WE HAVE, AND HOW WE'RE TRYING TO  
24 MANUFACTURE THROUGH THAT TOO. AND COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA  
25 REFERENCES, AS WELL AS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, BALANCING THAT,



JUNE 8, 2022

1 AND I'M NOT SURE WE HAVE BEEN AS ARTICULATE AS TO WHY MOVING  
2 FORWARD WITH SOMETHING AT THIS JUNCTURE IS AS IMPORTANT AS IT  
3 IS IN TERMS OF THE FINANCIAL IMPACTS. SO, DEREK?

4

5 **DEREK HANSEL:** THANKS, THERESE. JUST AS A REMINDER, AND LYSA IN  
6 HER PRESENTATION MENTIONED THE NORTH OF THE \$50 MILLION IN  
7 UNPAID TOLLS, AND THE VIOLATION IS ANOTHER 134 PAST DUE. SO,  
8 WE'RE LOOKING AT TOTAL PAST DUE REVENUE OF \$184 MILLION. AS  
9 LYSA POINTED OUT, JUST APPLYING THE 40% RECOVERY LEVEL AGAINST  
10 THAT, YOU KNOW, A HISTORIC LEVEL, WOULD IMPLY THAT WE WOULD BE  
11 ABLE TO RECOVER ABOUT \$80 MILLION OR SO THROUGH THE DMV HOLD  
12 PROCESS. THE CHALLENGE, AND, AGAIN, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ  
13 BROUGHT FORWARD THE QUESTION, HEY, WHAT HAPPENS IF, YOU KNOW,  
14 COULD YOU DO BETTER IF YOU OFFERED EVERYBODY A PAYMENT PLAN?  
15 AND THAT IS, FRANKLY, PRETTY SPECULATIVE. AND WE WOULD BE  
16 DOING A LOT OF SPECULATING, AND WE WOULD BE DOING A LOT OF  
17 SPECULATING, BECAUSE AS WE BRING FOLKS INTO THAT PAYMENT PLAN,  
18 WE RELEASE THE HOLD, SO THEY'RE NO LONGER ON HOLD FOR DMV. AND  
19 THAT'S A BIG LEVERAGE POINT FOR US. AND THEN THE QUESTION S  
20 HOW LONG DO THOSE FOLKS STAY IN THE PAYMENT PLAN? DO THEY STAY  
21 IN THE PAYMENT PLAN FOREVER SUCH THAT WE RECOVER ALL OF OUR  
22 \$184 MILLION? OR DO THEY MAKE A COUPLE PAYMENTS, AND THEN FALL  
23 OUT OF THE PAYMENT PROGRAM? AND, YOU KNOW, I THINK LYSA IN HER  
24 LAST PRESENTATION POINTED OUT THAT THERE IS -- THERE ARE A  
25 WHOLE LOT OF FOLKS WHO ARE IN THE PAYMENT PLANS ACROSS THE



JUNE 8, 2022

1 COUNTRY WHERE THESE ARE IMPLEMENTED, AND THEN FALL OUT. AND,  
2 AGAIN, THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE WOULD HAVE TO SEE HOW THAT  
3 WORKS. ONE OF THE REASONS TO START THE PROGRAM SMALLER IS TO  
4 SEE WHAT HAPPENS WITH THAT, WHEN FOLKS DO ENTER THE PAYMENT  
5 PROGRAM, WHAT IS THEIR PERSISTENCE IN THE PROGRAM. IT'S ALSO  
6 THE CASE THAT WE HAVE PAID, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE SEND THESE HOLDS  
7 TO DMV, WE PAY THREE BUCKS A VIOLATION TO SEND IT. AND ACROSS  
8 THE GROUP OF, YOU KNOW, THAT NORTH OF 8 MILLION VIOLATIONS,  
9 THAT'S A WHOLE LOT OF MONEY. SO, IF WE HAVE A PLAN WHERE WE  
10 HAVE SENT VIOLATIONS TO DMV, AND THEN THEY COME BACK, WE  
11 REMOVE THE VIOLATIONS, AND THEN THE INDIVIDUAL DEFAULTS AGAIN,  
12 SUCH THAT WE HAVE GOT TO REINSTATE THOSE HOLDS, WE'RE PAYING  
13 ANOTHER THREE BUCKS IN VIOLATION TO PUT IT BACK TO DMV. AND  
14 THAT'S OUT-THE-DOOR MONEY. WE CAN GET IT BACK WHEN DMV  
15 RELEASES THOSE HOLDS AT OUR DIRECTION, BUT ONLY IF THAT  
16 HAPPENS. SO JUST WANTED TO NOTE THOSE THINGS.

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YOU CAN -- MAY I FOLLOW-UP, DEREK, ON YOUR  
19 COMMENTS?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** SURE.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** JUST A QUESTION. YOU KNOW, THE REALITY OF  
24 THIS IS A -- THAT ALL OF THE BRIDGES, THE SEISMIC RETROFIT,  
25 THE BONDS TO DO THAT, THE MONEY TO MAINTAIN THE BRIDGES, YOU



JUNE 8, 2022

1 KNOW, IS BASED ON TOLL REVENUE. WE DON'T RECEIVE ANY OTHER  
2 FUNDING FOR THE OPERATION, ANY OF THESE ISSUES IN THE BRIDGES.  
3 SO, OUR ABILITY TO GET BONDS, AND THE CLUSTER WHICH WE BORROW  
4 IS BASED ON CERTAIN THINGS. SO YOU CAN TOUCH A LITTLE BIT ON  
5 THAT ASPECT OF OUR FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY IN TERMS OF WHY WE  
6 HAVE TO BE COLLECTING THESE?

7

8 **DEREK HANSEL:** ABSOLUTELY. THANKS FOR THE QUESTION. I'LL GIVE  
9 THE EXAMPLE OF REHAB, AS A GOOD EXAMPLE. YOU WILL SEE IN A  
10 MOMENT THAT FOR NEXT YEAR WE'RE PROPOSING A REHABILITATION  
11 BUDGET OF \$157 MILLION. SO IF WE WERE ABLE TO RECOVER THAT,  
12 YOU KNOW, SOMEWHERE IN THE ORDER OF 80 MILLION, THAT WOULD  
13 FUND HALF OF THE REHABILITATION BUDGET FOR ONE YEAR, THAT  
14 WE'RE UNABLE TO FUND IN FISCAL '23 FROM PAY-AS-YOU-GO  
15 RESOURCES, AT ALL. BECAUSE OF WHAT'S HAPPENED TO THE TRAFFIC  
16 DURING THE PANDEMIC. SO, YOU KNOW, IT MAKES A VERY SIGNIFICANT  
17 DOWN PAYMENT ON WHAT WE'RE ABLE TO DO AS TRAFFIC IS  
18 RECOVERING, AND WHILE TOLLS ARE WHERE THEY ARE.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT. SO, LET  
21 ME NOW GO TO COMMISSIONER RABBIT AND THEN COMMISSIONER  
22 SPERING.

23

24 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE THAT. AND  
25 THANK YOU FOR THE DISCUSSION. I THINK IT'S, YOU KNOW, I -- I



JUNE 8, 2022

1 WILL SAY THAT I DO SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. IT'S  
2 COMPASSIONATE, EQUITABLE, AND ALLOWS THE BODY TO FULFILL ITS  
3 FIDUCIARY DUTY. WE HAVE HAD THIS DISCUSSION ON THE WIRE ON THE  
4 GOLDEN GATE FARE COLLECTIONS WE HAVE HAD AN EARLY START  
5 BECAUSE WE HAVE HAD ALL ELECTRIC TOLLS FOR QUITE A WHILE. MY  
6 QUESTION S I DON'T WANT TO MAKE THINGS MORE COMPLICATED, BUT  
7 AT SOME POINT YOU NEED TO SET A THRESHOLD AND THAT'S THE MARK.  
8 MY QUESTION IS WHETHER THAT NEEDS TO BE A BLACK AND WHITE LINE  
9 OR CAN THERE BE SOME GRAY AREAS WITHIN THERE. CAN YOU HAVE A  
10 LONGER TERM FOR THE LOWER THE INCOME, AND SHORTER TERM FOR  
11 SOMEONE WHO HAS A HIGHER INCOME LEVEL TO BE ABLE TO  
12 ACCOMMODATE MAYBE THAT GRAY AREA, THAT SEEMS TO BE A CONCERN.  
13 I'M NOT SURE IF THAT'S POSSIBLE. AND AGAIN WITH THE NUMBER OF  
14 OUTSTANDING VIOLATIONS, THAT MIGHT BECOME UNTENABLE. BUT I --  
15 YOU KNOW, I DO SEE A -- I WILL SAY THIS, THAT, YOU KNOW, WE  
16 NEED TO I THINK IT WE NEED TO TREAT EVERYONE LIKE ADULTS AND,  
17 JUST BECAUSE YOU'RE POOR DOESN'T MEAN YOU CAN'T MAKE A PHONE  
18 CALL, REACH OUT, AND TRY TO RECTIFY A SITUATION. AND I THINK  
19 WE NEED TO BE OPEN TO THAT TO BE ABLE TO HAVE PEOPLE REACH US.  
20 BUT AT THE SAME TIME, YOU KNOW, ARE WE GOT GOING TO THE STATE  
21 TO SEEK FUND FOR ADDITIONAL MAINTENANCE ON THE BRIDGES DUE TO  
22 THE LACK OF TOLLS, DUE TO THE PANDEMIC? AND HOW COULD WE WALK  
23 AWAY, OR TURN OUR BACK ON THE SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF PAST DUE  
24 REVENUE? I JUST THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, IT'S A NO-BRAINER THAT  
25 WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE FULFILL OUR FIDUCIARY DUTY. AT



JUNE 8, 2022

1 THE SAME TIME, I DO BELIEVE THAT WE'RE DOING EQUITABLY AND  
2 FAIRLY LOWERING THE AMOUNTS FOR THE LOW-INCOME. BUT IS THERE A  
3 POSSIBILITY OF HAVING A LITTLE BIT OF A GRAY AREA BETWEEN  
4 WHATEVER THRESHOLD AMOUNTS, HELL, EVEN ELON MUSK MIGHT HAVE  
5 CASH FLOW PROBLEMS AND IF HE'S BUYING TWITTER AND WANTING TO  
6 PAY OVER THE COURSE OF A MONTH OR TWO, IF THAT'S WHAT WE'RE  
7 GOING TO, YOU KNOW, I DON'T NECESSARILY SUPPORT THAT, BUT I  
8 THINK THAT TRYING TO REALLY DISCOVER, OR FIND OUT WHAT THE  
9 TRUE ISSUE IS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE, SO THAT WE CAN GO  
10 FORWARD.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER  
13 SPERING?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR. YOU KNOW, I HOPED  
16 COMMITTEE SUPPORTS THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. AND I DON'T THINK  
17 THERE IS ANY QUESTION WHETHER WE CAN ACHIEVE BOTH THIS EQUITY  
18 AND FINANCIAL STABILITY. I REALLY BELIEVE WE CAN DO BOTH. BUT  
19 TAKING THIS FIRST STEP HELPS US SOLVE THE EQUITY QUESTION. AND  
20 IT WILL GIVE US A LOT MORE DATA AND OPPORTUNITY TO DO SOME OF  
21 THE OUTREACH. YOU KNOW, WE CANNOT LOSE SIGHT OF THE MILLIONS  
22 CROSSING THOSE BRIDGES PAYING THOSE TOLLS AND EXPECT TWO  
23 THINGS, ONE IS THE BRIDGES ARE MAINTAINED AND TAKEN CARE OF,  
24 AND TWO IS THAT WE'RE MEETING OUR DEBT SERVICE. WE HAVE GOT TO  
25 KEEP FOREMOST IN OUR MIND THAT FINANCIAL STABILITY IS



JUNE 8, 2022

1 CRITICAL. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S ON THE HORIZON AS FAR AS  
2 ECONOMY GOES BOTH LOCALLY AND NATIONALLY. THIS FIRST STEP  
3 HELPS US START GATHERING INFORMATION THAT SEVERAL OF THE  
4 COMMISSIONERS ARE CONCERNED ABOUT, THAT WE DON'T HAVE. I  
5 REALLY THINK THAT THE OUTREACH, AS WE GO FORWARD, TO RELEASE  
6 THIS TO DMV I THINK IS ABSOLUTELY IMPORTANT. YOU KNOW, WITH  
7 THE DMV NOTIFICATION PROCESS, IF YOU MOVE, YOU'RE REQUIRED BY  
8 DMV, TODAY, TO NOTICE -- I MEAN, TO FILE A NEW ADDRESS WITHIN  
9 TEN DAYS. SO PEOPLE SHOULD BE DOING THAT. THAT'S THE LAW. AND,  
10 SO, I KIND OF ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH COMMISSIONER RABBIT'S  
11 COMMENTS. YOU KNOW, I DON'T THINK BECAUSE YOU ARE LOW-INCOME  
12 YOU'RE NOT SMART ENOUGH TO FIGURE THIS OUT OR YOU CAN'T REACH  
13 OUT, THAT JUST DOESN'T PROVE ITS CASE IN A LOT OF THE SERVICES  
14 WE PROVIDE IN THE COUNTY. AND I THINK IT HAS TO BE EQUITABLE.  
15 I THINK THERE IS NO DOUBT ON THAT, BUT I THINK WE NEED TO TAKE  
16 THIS FIRST STEP TO REALLY ASSURE THAT WE HAVE THE FINANCIAL  
17 STABILITY AND THEN DEAL WITH THESE EQUITY ISSUES. WE HAVE GOT  
18 PLENTY OF TIME TO DEAL WITH THAT, AND A LOT OF FLEXIBILITY TO  
19 DEAL WITH THAT, TOO. AND, SO, I HOPE THAT MY COLLEAGUES MOVE  
20 FORWARD WITH THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION, BECAUSE I THINK IT'S  
21 THE FISCALLY PRUDENT THING TO DO. THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. COMMISSIONER  
24 JOSEFOWITZ, DO YOU HAVE SOME ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS? THEN WE'LL  
25 GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MANY, BUT I WILL NOT.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OH ARE YOUR HAND WAS UP. OKAY. ALL RIGHT.

5 OKAY. THEN LET'S DO THIS. LET'S MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I SEE

6 WE HAVE SEVERAL SPEAKERS, AGAIN, JUST TO EMPHASIZE, WE ARE

7 DISCUSSING ITEM 5A, WHICH IS THE EQUITY ACTION PLAN

8 RECOMMENDATION. SO, I PUT THIS IN YOUR HANDS.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** TWO MINUTES OR ONE MINUTE.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ONE MINUTE BECAUSE WE'RE IN A TIGHT TIME

13 FRAME. BEFORE WE BEGIN HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY WRITTEN COMMENT?

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. AND

16 AT THIS MOMENT, I SEE THAT WE HAVE SEVEN MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

17 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. WE'RE GOING START THE TIMER ON MY

18 PHONE, BECAUSE MY COMPUTER IS NOT COOPERATING. SO THE FIRST

19 SPEAKER IS JOLIE FISHER ROKER. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES WE CAN HEAR YOU.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE ONE MINUTE OR TWO?





JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ONE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** WOW. AND I'M SPEAKING ON THE RICHMOND MARIN BRIDGE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE'RE ON ITEM 5A, SIR, WHICH IS THE  
7 EQUITY ACTION PLAN.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MR. FISHER WE'LL BE ON TO THAT OPEN PUBLIC  
10 COMMENT LATER IN THE MEETING.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** WE WON'T LOSE YOU.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** OKAY.

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ELEANA BINDER.  
23 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS ELEANA BINDER  
2 AND I AM THE POLICY ASSOCIATE FOR GLIDE THANK YOU FOR  
3 RECONSIDERING THE MTC FINANCIAL PENALTY SYSTEM HOWEVER MANY  
4 CONCERNS HAVE GONE UNADDRESSED AND THE SYSTEM IS FLAWED AND  
5 INEQUITABLE. TOLL FINES AND FEES ARE HARMFUL AND  
6 COUNTERPRODUCTIVE BURDENING THOSE IN DEBT. EXACTING TOLL  
7 FINING AND FEES ESPECIALLY WHEN THEY DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACT  
8 THOSE STRUGGLING TO MEET THEIR OWN BASIC NEEDS FURTHER  
9 PERPETUATED CYCLES OF POVERTY ACROSS THE BAY AREA AND DOESN'T  
10 ALIGN WITH MTC'S PLATFORM WE RECOMMEND YOU ENACT LOW BARRIER  
11 PAYMENT PLANS THAT ARE ACCESSIBLE AND DO NOT CREATE  
12 UNNECESSARY ADMINISTRATIVE BARRIERS ASKING FOR PROOF THE  
13 POVERTY WILL MAKE IT MORE DIFFICULT FOR PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE  
14 AND DOES NOT ACCOUNT FOR THE PANDEMIC REALITY THAT PEOPLE'S  
15 INCOMES CAN FLUCTUATE FURTHERMORE ALLOWING ANYONE TO OPT INTO  
16 THE PLAN CUTS DOWN ON THE WORKING AND EFFICIENCY. WE REQUEST  
17 YOU SUSPEND DMV HOLDS UNTIL THE SYSTEM IS IMPLEMENTED. THERE  
18 ARE NOT DETAILS ON THE PAYMENT PLAN PROCESS NOR EFFECTIVE --  
19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAT'S YOUR TIME. THANK YOU. THE NEXT  
21 SPEAKER IS VEDA FLOREZ. IF YOU WILL UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE  
22 ONE MINUTE.  
23

24 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU FOR THE  
25 CONVERSATION TODAY. AND I'M PLEASED TO SEE THAT WE HAVE MOVED



JUNE 8, 2022

1 BEYOND THIS AS BEING A CONCEPT AND ACTUALLY HAVE A CONSTRUCT.  
2 I THINK IT'S A GREAT IDEA TO USE THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM  
3 QUALIFICATIONS. HOWEVER, WE'RE LEAVING OUT AN ENTIRE GROUP OF  
4 PEOPLE THAT ARE ABOVE THE POVERTY LEVEL THAT ARE STILL  
5 CONSIDERED LOW-INCOME THAT DON'T HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO  
6 PARTICIPATE IN A PROGRAM. SO, I WISH THAT YOU WOULD RECONSIDER  
7 THIS PROGRAM TO INCLUDE OTHER LOW-INCOME BARRIERS, AS WELL.  
8 AND I ALSO WANTED TO ADDRESS TWO COMMENTS THAT WERE MADE BY  
9 COMMISSIONERS. MANY PEOPLE WHO ARE LOW-INCOME DON'T -- AND I'M  
10 RECEIVING ANOTHER CALL NOW -- DO NOT PARTICIPATE, BECAUSE THEY  
11 HAVE -- HAVE TO WORK DURING THE HOURS OF OPERATIONS FOR YOUR  
12 OFFICES. SO, IF YOU COULD EXTEND THE HOURS EARLIER OR LATER SO  
13 PEOPLE WHO WORK IN 8 TO 5 JOBS HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
14 PARTICIPATE. THANK YOU AGAIN. TAKE CARE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MS. FLOREZ. NEXT SPEAKER IS  
17 ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, AGAIN CHAIR AMY WORTH AND MEMBERS. ALETA  
20 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I THINK WE'RE ON TO  
21 SOMETHING REASONABLE. I'M GENERALLY IN SUPPORT OF THE STAFF  
22 RECOMMENDATION, AND I AM IN ALIGNMENT WITH THE COMMENTS OF  
23 COMMISSIONERS RABBIT AND SPERING. WE WANT TO HELP THOSE WHO  
24 ARE MOST IN NEED. AND, REALLY, EXTENSION OF CREDIT OF ANY FORM  
25 REALLY DOES REQUIRE AN INQUIRY INTO A PERSON'S ABILITY TO PAY



JUNE 8, 2022

1 BACK A LOAN. AND SO IF WE OPEN IT UP TO EVERYBODY, THEN IT'S A  
2 LOOPHOLE THAT YOU CAN DRIVE AN 18-WHEELER THROUGH. AND, SO, I  
3 JUST THINK AS AN ORDINARY INDIVIDUAL, THAT WHEN I DEAL WITH  
4 BANKING AND CREDIT, WHICH I DO AT TIMES, I HAVE TO SHOW MY  
5 ABILITY TO PAY BACK. SO, I THINK THIS PROGRAM HELPS US TO WORK  
6 WITH THOSE WHO ARE MOST IN NEED, BECAUSE THOSE AREN'T SO MUCH  
7 IN NEED HAVE OTHER OPTIONS. I THINK WE HAVE VOTE YES. THANK  
8 YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RICH  
11 HEDGES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF, MR. HEDGES. YOU WILL  
12 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

13

14 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. I'M VERY HAPPY ABOUT THE REDUCED  
15 TOLLS. MEMBERS OF MY UNION, SOME OR MANY WILL FALL UNDER THE  
16 CRITERIA FOR THOSE TOLLS. IT'S ALSO A BUSINESS PROBLEM.  
17 BUSINESSES IN THE WEST BAY ARE HAVING A DIFFICULT TIME HIGHER  
18 PEOPLE. THESE REDUCED TOLLS WILL, I THINK, HELP IN THAT  
19 PROBLEM. I'M AGAINST EXTENDING IT TO EVERYONE. I THINK CUTTING  
20 DOWN THE BUREAUCRACY AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. I HAVE SOME  
21 EXPERIENCE WITH COLLECTING. FINES. I WAS ON THE BOARD FOR 15  
22 YEARS. REDUCING THEM WOULD BE A GOOD DECISION ONCE PEOPLE PAY  
23 DOWN THE TOLLS THERE MAY BE A REBATE OF THE FINES MIGHT  
24 ENCOURAGE THEM TO WORK WITH US.

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS OCEAN MODALLY.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** I AM A STAFF ATTORNEY AT LEGAL AID WE REPRESENT 125%  
4 OF THE POVERTY LINE OR BELOW. I AGREE IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
5 BALANCE FISCAL RESPONSIBILITY WITH OUR BRIDGES AND BEING  
6 EQUITABLE WITH EVERYONE WHO IS USING BRIDGES. I THINK SOME OF  
7 THE COMMENTS LIKE ELON MUSK TRYING TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE  
8 SYSTEM IGNORE THE REALITIES OF MANY OF OUR LOW-INCOME  
9 NEIGHBORS. A LOT OF THE FOLKS IT'S NOTES ABOUT THEM BEING  
10 SMART ENOUGH IT'S ABOUT DEALING WITH MENTAL HEALTH ISSUES AND  
11 GENERATIONAL POVERTY A LOT ARE STRUGGLING LIVING OUT OF THERE  
12 ARE CARS, HOMELESS, LIVING OUT OF THEIR CARS, USING THEIR CARS  
13 TO WORK FOR UBER, HOLDING THEIR LICENSE TAKES AWAY THEIR JOBS  
14 AND IT'S DEVASTATING TO FOLKS. WE NEED TO GET RID OF THESE  
15 HOLDS AT LEAST FOR FOLKS WHO ARE LIVING BELOW THE POVERTY  
16 LEVEL.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS CANDY SMALLWOOD. PLEASE  
19 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HELLO COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS CANDY SMALLWOOD A  
22 STAFF ATTORNEY AT THE EAST BAY COMMUNITY LAW CENTER, I WORK IN  
23 THE CRIMINALIZATION OF IMPORTANT UNIT. A MAJORITY OF OUR  
24 CLIENTS ARE HOMELESS OR ARE STRUGGLING. I WANT TO POINT OUT  
25 THAT MANY OF OUR CLIENTS ARE STRUGGLING AND THEY'RE ABOVE THE



JUNE 8, 2022

1 200% POVERTY LEVEL. SO TALKING ABOUT PAYMENT PLANS, LOW  
2 BARRIER PAYMENT PLANS ARE REALLY NECESSARY. AND ALSO  
3 SUSPENSION OF THE DMV HOLDS THEY DISPROPORTIONATELY HARM LOW-  
4 INCOME PEOPLE THEY SHOULD NOT BE USED AT ALL. THE DMV HOLDS  
5 FORCE PEOPLE TO CHOOSE BETWEEN BREAKING THE LAW AND GETTING TO  
6 WORK OR TO AND FROM DOCTORS APPOINTMENTS DMV HOLDS ARE  
7 CRIMINALIZE POVERTY THERE IS NO OUTREACH PLAN FOR LOW-INCOME  
8 PEOPLE WHO HAVE DEBT FOR CONTACTING PEOPLE WE KNOW THE CURRENT  
9 OUTREACH TOOLS DON'T WORK AND WE NEED A NEW SYSTEM TO OUTREACH  
10 TO PEOPLE AND THIS PLAN IS NOT ENOUGH.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RIO  
13 SCHARFF. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS RIO SCHARFF. I AM AN  
16 ATTORNEY AT THE LAWYERS COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL RIGHTS OF THE SAN  
17 FRANCISCO BAY AREA. IT'S A REALLY GOOD THING THAT YOU'RE  
18 HOLDING OFF ON REIMPLEMENTING THE DMV REGISTRATION HOLDS FOR  
19 NOW THESE ARE INCREDIBLY HARSH TOOLS THEY PREVENT PEOPLE FROM  
20 GETTING TO WORK FROM GETTING THEMSELVES AND THEIR KIDS TO  
21 SCHOOL THEY ARE HIGHLY PUNITIVE PLEASE CONTINUE TO INVESTIGATE  
22 OTHER WAYS TO RECOVER THE MONEY THAT YOU NEED LOOK FOR LESS  
23 PUNITIVE WAYS. REMEMBER PEOPLE EDUCATE PEOPLE ABOUT THEIR  
24 DEBTS GIVE THEM LOW BARRIER PAYMENT PLANS SO THEY CAN CLEAR  
25 THEIR ACCOUNTS. I KNOW PEOPLE IN THIS ORGANIZATION YOU FEEL



JUNE 8, 2022

1 BETTER ABOUT RESTARTING DMV HOLDS BECAUSE THESE PAYMENT PLANS  
2 WILL BE IMPLEMENTED EVENTUALLY, BUT JUST KNOW THAT MANY PEOPLE  
3 WILL NOT LEARN ABOUT THESE PAYMENT PLANS BECAUSE OUTREACH IS  
4 SO POOR. AND WHEN THEY REACH OUT TO CUSTOMER SERVICE AGENTS  
5 THEY WILL BE ON HOLD FOR HOURS NOT ALWAYS GETTING GOOD  
6 INFORMATION. SO THERE IS A LOT OF WORK THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE  
7 BEFORE THIS CAN BE IMPLEMENTED IN AN EQUITABLE AND FAIRWAY.  
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ANNE WITH  
11 SAN FRANCISCO FINANCIAL JUSTICE PROJECT. ARE YOU THERE, ANNE?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I CAN HEAR YOU.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** IS IT -- OH, I'M SORRY. THERE WE GO. HI. THIS IS ANNE  
18 WITH THE SAN FRANCISCO FINANCIAL JUSTICE PROJECT IN THE SAN  
19 FRANCISCO TREASURERS OFFICE. I WANT TO APPLAUD ALL THE STEPS  
20 THE COMMISSION HAS TAKEN TO LOWER THE PENALTIES AND THIS  
21 THOUGHTFUL CONVERSATION AND ENCOURAGE YOU TO DO TWO THINGS.  
22 FOR THE PAYMENT PLANS, PLEASE MAKE THOSE AVAILABLE TO WHOEVER  
23 NEEDS ONE. PEOPLE WON'T REQUEST ONE UNLESS THEY REALLY NEED  
24 ONE. MEANS TESTING CREATES BARRIERS TO APPLYING. IT CREATES  
25 ADMINISTRATIVE BURDENS FOR THE MTC. 200% OF THE FEDERAL



JUNE 8, 2022

1 POVERTY LINE IS VERY LOW. SOMEONE EARNING MINIMUM WAGE IN SAN  
2 FRANCISCO AND WORKING FULL-TIME WOULD EARN TOO MUCH TO BE  
3 ELIGIBLE FOR THIS. PLEASE DON'T REINSTATE DMV HOLDS IT'S VERY  
4 EXTREME THAT PUTS PEOPLE'S LIVELY HOODS AT RISK. WE WOULD  
5 RATHER SEE YOU INVEST TO IMPROVE NOTIFICATION PROCESSES AND  
6 ACCESSIBLE PAYMENT PLANS AND INVEST IN THOSE SOLUTIONS AND  
7 GIVE THEM A CHANCE FIRST. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SHAZZY. YOU  
10 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I'M SHAZZY ATTORNEY FOR THE EAST BAY COMMUNITY LAW  
13 CENTER THE LARGEST LEGAL SERVICES PROVIDER IN ALAMEDA COUNTY.  
14 I DON'T THINK INPUT FROM THE COMMUNITY AND LOW-INCOME PEOPLE  
15 HAS BEEN INCORPORATED INTO THIS PROPOSAL RIGHT NOW IF YOU WERE  
16 TO CALL FASTRAK IT'S NOT CLEAR WHEN YOU'RE ON THE PHONE HOW  
17 YOU CAN CONNECT TO A CUSTOMER SERVICE REPRESENTATIVE TO DO ANY  
18 NEGOTIATION AND THE OPTIONS IT GIVES IS AUTOMATED OPTIONS TO  
19 PAY AND GENERALLY PEOPLE DON'T REALIZE THEY CAN NEGOTIATE WITH  
20 A GOVERNMENT AGENCY SO I ENCOURAGE ALL OF YOU TO THINK ABOUT  
21 OPTIONS FOR LETTING PEOPLE KNOW THAT THAT IS EVEN AN OPTION  
22 AND I ENCOURAGE YOU TO BE PROACTIVE ON COMMUNITY OUTREACH IN  
23 WHATEVER PUBLIC OUTREACH PROGRAMS TO BE EFFECTIVE AND NOT  
24 FURTHER PERPETUATE INEQUALITY IT HAS TO BE DEVELOPED WITH  
25 INPUT FROM THE PEOPLE.





JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO OTHER RAISED HANDS MADAM CHAIR.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIM. WE'LL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT  
5 PERIOD AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE FOR DISCUSSION AND  
6 DECISION. SO, OKAY. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND I APOLOGIZE  
9 THAT I STEPPED AWAY FOR A FEW MINUTES. I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A  
10 RECOMMENDATION. AND I WOULD NEED HELP FROM COLLEAGUES TO SHAPE  
11 THIS. BUT I DO THINK THAT WE NEED TO REVISIT THE APPROACH THAT  
12 WE'RE TAKING. AND I THINK COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ HAD A  
13 STRATEGY, AND I WANTED TO ASK HIM IF HE WOULD SHARE THAT  
14 STRATEGY, AGAIN, WITH US. BECAUSE I THINK IT MIGHT ALLOW US TO  
15 MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PART THAT THE STAFF IS MOST CONCERNED  
16 ABOUT, BUT STILL LET US GO BACK TO THE DRAWING BOARD FOR THE  
17 APPROACH. BECAUSE I DO THINK THE APPROACH IS NOT A BEST  
18 PRACTICE I THINK IT WOULD BE BETTER TO TAKE THE TIME TO GET  
19 THE WORK DONE APPROPRIATELY. BUT I UNDERSTAND THAT THE STAFF  
20 WANTS TO MOVE ON THE COMMERCIAL VEHICLES. AND, SO, THAT WOULD  
21 BE MY MOTION. AND I'M SORRY IT'S SO INARTFUL.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK IT'S SIMILAR TO WHAT COMMISSIONER  
24 WORTH TALKED ABOUT BUT IT'S WORTH CLARIFYING ONE OR TWO  
25 THINGS. I THINK WE'RE ALL VERY COMFORTABLE SENDING COMMERCIAL



JUNE 8, 2022

1 TO DMV HOLDS MAYBE SENDING THOSE WITH SMALL DEBT TO DMV HOLDS.  
2 I DON'T THINK WE NEED TO WAIT, COMMISSIONER PEDROZA AND THE  
3 COMMITTEE, FOR -- FOR THAT. BECAUSE IT'S SMALL AMOUNTS. AND I  
4 THINK THE QUESTION S YOU KNOW, HOW MUCH -- WHAT DO WE -- WHAT  
5 DO WE DO FOR THE OTHERS? AND I THINK THERE IS CONCERN THAT IS  
6 BEING BROUGHT UP BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND OTHERS, THAT IF WE  
7 -- AND CERTAINLY A LOT OF THE PUBLIC COMMENTERS, THAT IF WE  
8 MOVE FORWARD WITH HIRING WITH SORT OF HIRING THESE WITH THE  
9 HIRING ELEMENTS THERE ARE SORT OF FOUR MOTIONS, WITH THE  
10 HIRING ELEMENTS OF THE MOTION, WE BOX OURSELVES IN FOR WHAT WE  
11 CAN ACTUALLY DO IN TERMS OF DELIVERING PAYMENT PLANS AND  
12 DELIVERING SOMETHING THAT IS GOING TO BE SUCCESSFUL AND GIVING  
13 -- DELIVERING OUTREACH PLANS THAT ARE GOING TO BE SUCCESSFUL  
14 BECAUSE WE HAVE COMMITTED TO CONTRACTORS LIMITATIONS. IS THAT  
15 WHAT YOU SAID?

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M NOT SURE. IT'S COMPLEX, BUT I THINK IF WHAT  
18 YOU'RE SAYING, COMMISSIONER, IS THAT YOU WANT THE STAFF TO GO  
19 AHEAD AND MOVE FORWARD? IS THAT WHAT YOU WERE SAYING? NICK, I  
20 JUST LOST YOU. OH, THERE YOU ARE. IS -- WERE YOU SAYING YOU  
21 WANT THE STAFF TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE CURRENT CONSTRUCT, BUT  
22 WITH -- BUT COME BACK WITH SOME MORE INFORMATION WITH THE  
23 EXCEPTION OF THE COMMERCIAL HOLDS?

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I YOU THINK WE NEED TO GET, YOU KNOW -- I  
2 DON'T KNOW THE SPECIFICS -- YOU KNOW, I -- I THINK THE  
3 SPECIFICS ARE COMPLICATED, AND I DIDN'T HAVE A SPECIFIC  
4 PROPOSAL. BUT IT WAS JUST THAT WE NEED TO GIVE OURSELVES THE  
5 FLEXIBILITY FOR STAFF TO COME BACK AND SORT OF BE ABLE TO  
6 THINK ABOUT WHETHER WE ACTUALLY WANT TO -- YOU KNOW, HOW WE  
7 MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PAYMENT PLAN, HOW WE MOVE FORWARD WITH  
8 THE OUTREACH PLAN AND NOT BOX OURSELVES INTO SOMETHING THAT WE  
9 CAN'T GET OUT OF RIGHT NOW, FOR THOSE WHO -- FOR -- WHICH, I  
10 THINK IS SIMILAR TO WHAT COMMISSIONER PEDROZA SAID, BUT MAYBE  
11 COMMISSIONER PEDROZA --

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HE'S HERE. LET'S DO THAT. COMMISSIONER  
14 PEDROZA? MAYBE YOU COULD SAY A FEW WORDS.

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. SIMILAR TO WHAT VICE CHAIR  
17 JOSEFOWITZ WAS SAYING. BUT LET ME CLARIFY, WE RELEASE  
18 COMMERCIAL NOW. THE QUESTION I HAVE FOR STAFF: WHEN WOULD WE  
19 BE RELEASING EVERYTHING ELSE? SO JUST ANSWER THAT QUESTION AND  
20 THEN I CAN COME BACK ON PUBLIC OUTREACH.

21

22 **LYSA HALE:** IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING TODAY WE WOULD  
23 ESTABLISH A PREQUALIFICATION PROGRAM AND GET PEOPLE QUALIFIED  
24 SO THAT WHEN WE HAVE THE PAYMENT PLAN, THEY CAN GO RIGHT INTO



JUNE 8, 2022

1 THAT PAYMENT PLAN. IN THE MEANTIME, THOUGH, AFTER THAT  
2 PREQUALIFICATION --

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WHAT'S THE TIME FRAME?

5

6 **LYSA HALE:** I'M NOT SURE. IT KIND OF DEPENDS ON WHAT HAPPENS  
7 TODAY.

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** JUST ASSUME -- WHAT I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND  
10 IS, DO WE HAVE TIME TO DO A ROBUST POSSIBLE OUTREACH BETWEEN  
11 NOW AND WHEN WE RELEASE THE HOLDS ON EVERYONE?

12

13 **LYSA HALE:** YES. WE ABSOLUTELY DO.

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IN FACT, IN OUR MIND, CHAIR PEDROZA, THAT  
16 WAS A CRITICAL PREREQUISITE.

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AS IT IS FOR ME, RIGHT NOW.

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SO THAT, AGAIN, WE TALKED ABOUT THIS SORT  
21 OF, THIS SIGN UP PERIOD. BUT THE SIGN-UP PERIOD SHOULD NOT BE  
22 INITIATED UNTIL WE HAVE A ROBUST, YOU KNOW, OUTREACH PROGRAM  
23 IN ORDER TO LET PEOPLE KNOW WHAT WE'RE DOING.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** IS THAT, LIKE, A TWO MONTH -- IS THAT A TWO  
2 MONTH TIME WINDOW? THREE MONTH TIME WINDOW? WHAT TIME WINDOW?

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I THINK WE COULD COME BACK TO YOU WITH A  
5 SENSE OF, YOU KNOW, HOW LONG WOULD IT TAKE TO PUT TOGETHER  
6 THAT TYPE OF OUTREACH PROGRAM. THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE ASKING.

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CORRECT.

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** LYSA I DON'T THINK AS WE'RE SITTING HERE  
11 RIGHT NOW WE KNOW WHAT THAT IS?

12

13 **LYSA HALE:** I THINK WE HAVE SOMETHING THAT'S PRETTY ROBUST AND  
14 READY TO GO BY THE END OF THE YEAR.

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** BY THE ENDS OF THE YEAR, WHICH IS A  
17 CONSIDERABLE TIME OUT.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** TO THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WHEN WOULD WE BE  
20 RELEASING THE DMV HOLDS?

21

22 **LYSA HALE:** AFTER WE HAVE GONE THROUGHOUT PREQUALIFICATION  
23 PROGRAM. WE WOULD GET PEOPLE PREQUALIFIED AND THEN WHOEVER IS  
24 NOT QUALIFIED, THEIR VIOLATIONS WOULD BE RELEASED TO DMV HOLD.  
25 THAT'S THE PROPOSAL TODAY.



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY. SO WHAT I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND,  
3 AGAIN, AND THIS IS WHAT I HAVE HEARD FROM VICE CHAIR  
4 JOSEFOWITZ AND COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, THE TOUCH POINTS OF PUBLIC  
5 OUTREACH BEFORE OUR CUSTOMERS -- THOSE FOLKS THAT WE'RE TRYING  
6 TO HELP THE MOST, ARE WE GOING TO HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
7 CREATE A TOUCH POINT AND AWARENESS TO PUT THEM ON A FINANCIAL  
8 PATH?

9

10 **LYSA HALE:** YES.

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THAT WILL HAPPEN BEFORE WE RELEASE THE DMV  
13 HOLDS?

14

15 **LYSA HALE:** YES.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND YOU CAN COME BACK TO US AND SHOW US WHAT  
18 THAT LOOKS LIKE, IF YOU RECEIVE DIRECTION ON THIS TODAY, ON  
19 THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION, YOU WILL BE ABLE TO COME BACK TO US  
20 AND GIVE US THAT KIND OF A ROBUST PLAN, SO THERE IS CONFIDENCE  
21 IN THOSE TOUCH POINTS?

22

23 **LYSA HALE:** YES.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, THAT'S WHAT I SUPPORT  
2 CONSISTENT WITH WHAT COMMISSIONER RABBIT AND SPERING SAID IN  
3 DIFFERENT WAYS. BUT I THINK WE HAVE TO MOVE FORWARD. I HAVE  
4 COMFORT AND CONFIDENCE THAT WE WILL REACH THOSE TOUCH POINTS  
5 TO REACH THOSE WHO NEED IT THE MOST FOR AWARENESS OF THE  
6 PROGRAMS.

7

8 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ARTICULATING THAT. I WOULD SUPPORT  
9 THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDERSTANDING THAT THE SEQUENCE WILL  
10 BE THIS, WE PROCEED ALL THE COMMERCIAL VIOLATIONS NOW. SECOND  
11 OF ALL, WE DEVELOP THE ROBUST OUTREACH PLAN. AND WE KNOW THAT,  
12 FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN WE CLOSE THE BAY BRIDGE TO COMPLETE THE  
13 SEISMIC PROGRAM, WE COMMUNICATED WITH THE PUBLIC AGGRESSIVELY,  
14 AND I BELIEVE THAT WE NEED TO DEVELOP AN OUTREACH PLAN THAT  
15 WILL COME BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE FOR EVALUATION, FOR  
16 CLARIFICATION, AND IN DEVELOPING THE OUTREACH PLAN, IT WILL  
17 INCLUDE OUTREACH TO AGENCIES THAT CAN HELP US KNOW HOW BEST TO  
18 REACH THE COMMUNITIES THAT WE'RE TRYING TO REACH. SECOND OF  
19 ALL, I, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, THEN, FLESH OUT THE COMMUNICATION  
20 PIECE, WHICH, ALSO, I THINK, IN LIGHT OF WHAT OUR GENERAL  
21 COUNSEL HAS SAID, USING THE VEHICLES WE CAN HAVE, WE HAVE, FOR  
22 EXAMPLE, OUR INVOICES TO BE ABLE TO ARTICULATE THE  
23 OPPORTUNITIES TO BE IN A, YOU KNOW, TO BE IN A PAYMENT PLAN IF  
24 THE INCOME QUALIFIED. AND THIS IS THE QUESTION ABOUT WHO BEST  
25 TO PERFORM THIS WORK. TIME IS IMPORTANT. AND I THINK WHEN I



JUNE 8, 2022

1 LOOK AT APPROVE A CONTRACT CHANGE TO CONDUENT, AND THEN,  
2 AGAIN, ALSO, INCLUDING THE FUNDING RESPECTIVELY FOR THE  
3 ELIGIBILITY TO RELATIVE TO CLIPPER START THAT ENABLES TO US  
4 GET STARTED THERE IS NO OBLIGATION TO CONTINUE, FOR EXAMPLE,  
5 IF WE FIND OTHER VENDORS, WE HAD THAT CONVERSATION EARLIER  
6 THIS ENABLES US IF WE FIND VENDORS THAT COULD DO THE ADD ON  
7 COMMUNICATION PIECES, THAT WE DECIDE HOW WE WANT TO BEST  
8 COMMUNICATE THEN WE CAN DO THAT. AND THEN FINALLY, WE AREN'T  
9 GOING TO RELEASE THOSE INDIVIDUAL CUSTOMER PROFILES TO DMV  
10 UNTIL WE -- THIS PLAN COMES BACK TO US.

11

12 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** LET ME TAKE A SHOT AT -- WE'RE ALMOST THERE.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOOD.

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** STEP ONE, WHICH DEPENDING ON YOUR DIRECTION  
17 TODAY WE COULD DO ASAP, RELEASE COMMERCIAL TO DMV HOLD, WHICH  
18 IS A PROCESS UNTO ITSELF, BUT WE HAVE THE APPROVAL TO DO THAT.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** RIGHT.

21

22 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** PART TWO, PUT TOGETHER THIS EXTREMELY  
23 COMPREHENSIVE MULTI-LAYERED OUTREACH PROGRAM. THAT'S AN  
24 INTERNAL THING THAT WE WOULD HAVE TO DEVELOP INTERNALLY.

25





JUNE 8, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** RIGHT.

2

3 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** LYSA SUGGESTED THAT COULD TAKE US AS LONG AS  
4 TO THE END OF THE YEAR BUT WE NEED TO PUT THAT TOGETHER THEN  
5 GET SOME APPROVALS OF FUNDING TOGETHER NEEDED TO PUT THAT  
6 TOGETHER. THAT'S WHAT WE'RE ASKING. PART THREE ONCE THAT'S IN  
7 PLACE WE WOULD BRING IT TO YOU SEE YOU SEE IT AND UNDERSTAND  
8 WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE. AT THAT POINT WE WOULD LAUNCH THE ACTUAL  
9 CAMPAIGN FOR THIS PREQUALIFICATION STAGE. OKAY? THAT WOULD  
10 ALLOW SOME DISCRETE TIME FOR FOLKS TO SIGN UP AND PREQUALIFY  
11 FOR THE PROGRAM. THEN THE FOURTH STAGE AFTER THAT, YOU WOULD  
12 RELEASE TO DMV HOLD. AND EVEN THEN, IF SOMEONE GETS A  
13 NOTIFICATION AND BELIEVES THEY'RE LOW-INCOME QUALIFIED, THEY  
14 COULD STILL SIGN UP FOR THE PROGRAM. AND THE PREQUALIFICATION  
15 AS WE SAID BEFORE, THAT JUST PUTS YOUR VEHICLE IN THIS WAITING  
16 ROOM. UNTIL WHICH TIME -- BECAUSE PARALLEL TO THIS WORKING TO  
17 DEVELOP THE PAYMENT PLAN ITSELF WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE BUILDING  
18 OFF OF WHAT YOU SAID, THEN THAT IS DOWN THE ROAD AT WHICH  
19 POINT IT'S READY THEN WE CAN MOVE.

20

21 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. GREAT. THANK YOU, THERESE, FOR  
22 CLARIFYING AND GIVING US THAT TIMELINE. ONE OF THE CONCERNS IS  
23 BEING ABLE TO HAVE THE ROBUST OUTREACH PLAN APPROVED AND IN  
24 PLACE BEFORE WE GO TO THE SECOND PHASE OF THE DMV HOLDS.

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THAT'S WHAT I'M HEARING.

2

3 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M ASSUMING THAT -- SO I DIDN'T GET A SECOND ON  
6 MY MOTION. BUT LET ME JUST SAY THAT I WON'T BE SUPPORTING THE  
7 RECOMMENDATION AS OUTLINED, AND I WANT TO JUST GIVE YOU FOUR  
8 REASONS. ONE: IF OUR HIGHEST GOAL IS TO MAKE SURE OUR TOLLS  
9 ARE REPAID AND WE'RE DOING IT IN A WAY THAT IT'S GOT AN EQUITY  
10 FRAMEWORK AROUND IT; THIS IS NOT A BEST PRACTICE. THAT'S THE  
11 FIRST ISSUE. SECOND: IS THAT WE ALREADY KNOW THAT WE RECOVER,  
12 IF ON AVERAGE, WE'RE RECOVERING 50%, AND WE'RE SPENDING GOBS  
13 OF MONEY TO GET IT. THE RATE THAT WE'RE GETTING BACK ON THAT  
14 50 MILLION, WHAT WE SHOULD BE ASKING OURSELVES IS, WE SHOULD  
15 BE DOING AN RFP OR RFQ LAYING OUT THE GOALS THAT WE HAVE, AND  
16 GETTING THE BEST PRACTICES FROM AROUND THE COUNTRY AND FINDING  
17 SOMEBODY THAT CAN HELP US ACHIEVE THAT GOAL. THIRD, I THINK  
18 IT'S GREAT TO DO OUTREACH. WE DO IT THROUGH EAN'S ALL THE  
19 TIME, WE HAVE ALREADY GOT THIS STRUCTURE AND ALL OF THAT, BUT,  
20 AGAIN, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT SUCH A SMALL GROUP OF PEOPLE THAT  
21 WE'RE -- WHICH IS GREAT, THAT WE'RE GOING HELP A FEW PEOPLE,  
22 BUT WE'RE NOT TRANSFORMING OUR SYSTEM. AND THEN LASTLY, YOU  
23 KNOW, I JUST WANT TO RESTATE, OUR HIGHEST OBLIGATION IS OUR  
24 FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY, THIS IS NOT AN APPROACH THAT MARRIES  
25 THAT RESPONSIBILITY WITH EQUITY. AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE US DO



JUNE 8, 2022

1 MORE AS IT RELATES TO HOW OUR POLICIES CAN BE BETTER  
2 INTEGRATED. SO I CAN'T SUPPORT STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. AND,  
3 FRANKLY, I WILL JUST SAY THIS ONE THING. I AM CONCERNED THAT  
4 WE WENT IN A REALLY WRONG DIRECTION WITH AN IDEA THAT WAS  
5 REALLY INTENDED TO BOTH GET A HIGHER LEVEL OF REPAYMENT  
6 OVERALL, AND TO BE ABLE TO HELP, YOU KNOW, CUSTOMERS ACROSS  
7 THE BOARD. BECAUSE I THINK THAT THERE IS A HIGH NEED. SO, IN  
8 ANY CASE, THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SHARE THAT ONE MORE TIME  
9 WITH EVERYBODY.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. AND  
12 THANK YOU, EVERYONE, FOR THEIR COMMENTS. I RECOGNIZE THAT WE  
13 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO HAVE A DISCUSSION HERE SORT OF ARTICULATES  
14 THE PRIORITY POINTS IN THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION IN TERMS OF  
15 ENHANCING THE OUTREACH AND CLARIFYING THE SEQUENCE FOR  
16 NOTIFICATION. AND SHARING CONCERN WE ALL FEEL ABOUT THE  
17 FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITIES RELATIVE TO THE TOLL BRIDGES BUT  
18 ALSO FOCUSING ON THE EQUITY DISCUSSION IN TERMS OF HOW CAN WE  
19 HELP THE PEOPLE THAT HAVE THE MOST NEED WITH THIS. SO, LET ME  
20 -- SO, I THINK, IF I -- WE, WELCOME A MOTION FROM A COMMITTEE  
21 MEMBER? COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WAS JUST GOING TO DO  
24 THAT. I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION TO SUPPORT THE  
25 RECOMMENDATION AND THE OUTLINE BY CHAIR PEDROZA, RELEASING THE



JUNE 8, 2022

1 COMMERCIAL NOW AND MAKING SURE THE PREQUALIFICATION PROGRAM IS  
2 UNDERWAY AND HAVING THE ADDITIONAL ROBUST PUBLIC OUTREACH  
3 BEFORE RELEASING ALL THE HOLDS GOING FORWARD. I APPRECIATE THE  
4 DISCUSSION TODAY. BUT I DO THINK THAT TIME IS OF THE ESSENCE,  
5 AND I THINK THE THREE-YEAR STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS IT'S ONLY  
6 FAIR AND EQUITABLE TO MOVE FORWARD TODAY IN THIS MANNER. SO, I  
7 DO MAKE THAT MOTION.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. IS THERE  
10 A SECOND?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** I WILL SECOND WITH THE CAVEAT THAT THIS IS OUR  
13 TIME TO REALLY UNDERSTAND THE ISSUES AND PROBLEMS MOVING  
14 FORWARD HERE. SO DATA COLLECTION, THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS, IS  
15 SO VERY VITAL. AND I CAN RELATE TO SOME OF THE SPEAKERS,  
16 TRYING TO GET THROUGH ON A CLIPPER LINE IS LITERALLY  
17 IMPOSSIBLE. THE SO THIS IS THE INFORMATION WE NEED TO KNOW TO  
18 MAKE THIS SUCCESSFUL. SO, I WILL SECOND THAT, BUT PLEASE  
19 UNDERSTAND, THAT DATA IS VITAL TO US, MOVING FORWARD, TO MAKE  
20 SURE WE'RE DOING THE RIGHT THING, AND WE CAN DO BETTER AS WE  
21 MOVE FORWARD. THANK YOU.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. THEN, IF  
24 THERE IS NO FURTHER DISCUSSION. THEN I WOULD INCLUDE THAT THE  
25 OUTREACH WOULD BE, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, WITH THE NEW CUSTOMER WAS,



JUNE 8, 2022

1 WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ACHIEVE OUR -- SIGNIFICANTLY REDUCE WAIT  
2 TIMES BUT ONE OF THE SPEAKERS TALKED ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF  
3 CUSTOMER SERVICE, DIRECT CUSTOMER SERVICE. SO, THANK YOU. MAY  
4 I TURN TO, IF THERE IS NO FURTHER DISCUSSION, I'LL TURN TO OUR  
5 CLERK FOR ROLL CALL

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR WORTH?

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

12

13 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]

16 [INDISCERNIBLE] IF YOU ARE THERE, I CAN'T HEAR YOU.

17 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ? CINDY CHAVEZ?

18

19 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SORRY. I COULDN'T HEAR YOU, KIMBERLY.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

22

23 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?



JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN IS ABSENT. THE MOTION  
13 PASSES WITH SIX AYES, ONE NAY, AND ONE ABSENT.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AGAIN. I  
16 WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR YOUR REALLY THOUGHTFUL AND ROBUST  
17 DISCUSSIONS, AND I THINK WE HAVE GOTTEN THIS FAR BECAUSE WE  
18 HAVE HAD A SERIES OF COMMITTEE MEETINGS WHERE WE'RE ALL REALLY  
19 ENGAGED IN THIS. AND, AGAIN, SHARE THESE HIGH PRIORITIES OF  
20 BOTH THE FISCAL RESPONSIBILITIES OF MAINTAINING OF THE TOLL  
21 BRIDGES, AND ALSO LOOKING AT IT THROUGH A VERY SERIOUS EQUITY  
22 LENS IN TERMS OF REACHING, MEETING THE NEEDS OF OUR CUSTOMERS.  
23 AND, SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I KNOW THIS WILL COME BACK  
24 TO US. I THINK, ALSO, PLEASE NOTE, FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE  
25 COMMITTEE, I THINK THE OUTREACH IS SUCH A HIGH PRIORITY. SO AS



JUNE 8, 2022

1 WE CAN MOVE FORWARD WITH THAT, AND BRING THIS BACK AS SOON AS  
2 WE CAN, I THINK THAT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL TO GIVE US TIME  
3 TO TALK ABOUT IT AND REFINE IT AND TO KEEP WORKING ON IT. SO,  
4 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT, WE HAVE 5B, THE BATA  
5 RESOLUTION NUMBER 154 FISCAL WE ARE 2023, '23, OPERATING AND  
6 CAPITAL BUDGETS.

7

8 **DEREK HANSEL:** GOOD MORNING AGAIN COMMISSIONERS. IF WE CAN  
9 SHARE THE SLIDE PRESENTATION. THANK YOU. I WANT TO, OBVIOUSLY,  
10 DIG INTO OUR RECOMMENDATION FOR THE FISCAL YEAR '23 OPERATING  
11 AND CAPITAL BUDGETS. I'M CERTAINLY NOT GOING TO GO THROUGH  
12 EVERYTHING THAT WE WENT THROUGH AT OUR STUDY SESSION, BUT  
13 TOUCH ON SOME HIGH -- MORE THAN HIGHLIGHTS, BUT SOME BIG  
14 THEMES. WE JUST TALKED ABOUT A CRITICAL PANDEMIC RELATED  
15 ISSUE, WHICH IS THE BACKLOG OF TOLLS VIOLATIONS, NOW SOMEWHERE  
16 ON THE ORDER OF \$180 MILLION. THAT REDUCTION IN TRAFFIC, THE  
17 OTHER ISSUES WITH GOING TO ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING, REALLY HAVE  
18 SIGNIFICANTLY IMPACTED BOTH OPERATIONS AND CASH FLOW. WE  
19 ESTIMATE THAT SINCE THE PANDEMIC, THE TOTAL COST TO BATA OVER  
20 THE COURSE OF THE PANDEMIC IS NORTH OF \$600 MILLION IN  
21 INCREASED COST AND FOREGONE REVENUE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SORRY.  
22 NEXT SLIDE. OKAY. THANKS. EVEN SO, FOR FISCAL '23. WE'RE  
23 BRINGING TO YOU A BALANCED BUDGET WITH A VERY SMALL SURPLUS,  
24 NOTING, AS I NOTED IN THE LAST DISCUSSION THAT WE ARE STILL  
25 NOT FUNDING REHABILITATION EXPENSES FROM CURRENT YEAR REVENUE,



JUNE 8, 2022

1 BUT RATHER USING BOND PROCEEDS FOR THAT. WE ARE CURRENTLY  
2 ESTIMATING A RECOVERY OF TRAFFIC LEVELS TO 90% OF PREPANDEMIC  
3 LEVELS FOR FISCAL '23. THAT IS NOT AS HIGH AS WAS ESTIMATED  
4 LAST YEAR, WHERE IT WAS ESTIMATED THAT TRAFFIC WOULD RETURN TO  
5 SOMETHING APPROACHING 98% OF PREPANDEMIC LEVELS. BUT CERTAINLY  
6 IT DOES REPRESENT AN IMPROVEMENT OVER THE CURRENT YEAR. AND AS  
7 I NOTED, WE STILL HAVE SIGNIFICANT OPERATING CHALLENGES,  
8 INCLUDING CASH AND LIQUIDITY LEVELS, THIS COMPLETION OF THE  
9 INVOICING BACKLOG, AND THE ISSUES ASSOCIATED WITH ALL ELECTRIC  
10 TOLLING. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AGAIN, TRAFFIC IS RECOVERING. BUT  
11 THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT RECESSIONARY PRESSURES THAT WE SEE ON  
12 THE HORIZON IN RETURN TO OFFICE ISSUES CONTINUING TO BE A  
13 CHALLENGE. SO THESE WEIGH ON OUR ESTIMATES OF RECOVER IN  
14 FISCAL '23, AND, FRANKLY, BEYOND FISCAL '23. WE'RE JUST GOING  
15 TO HAVE TO SEE WHAT THE PATH OF THE PANDEMIC S WHAT THE PATH  
16 OF THE GENERAL NATIONAL ECONOMY IS, AND WITH WHAT WE SEE WITH  
17 THE RETURN TO OFFICE CONCERNS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, NOW ON  
18 TO OUR KEY BUDGET ASSUMPTIONS. WE DO -- SORRY -- JUST MAKING  
19 SURE I'M ON THE RIGHT SLIDE. THESE DO INCLUDE AN INCREASE IN  
20 STAFFING BY JUST UNDER TEN FULL-TIME EQUIVALENT EMPLOYEES.  
21 THESE FOLKS ARE REQUIRED FOR FASTRAK SUPPORT, INCLUDING OUR  
22 NEXGEN FASTRAK SYSTEM. THERE ARE SALARY INCREASES BAKED INTO  
23 THIS. THERE -- WE'LL BE SEEING LATER TODAY, DISCUSSIONS OF THE  
24 MOU THAT IS BEING RECOMMENDED. SO, THOSE INCLUDE 4.2%  
25 CONTRACTED SALARY INCREASES THAT ARE ESTIMATED. IN OTHER





JUNE 8, 2022

1 INCREASES IN THE BAY BRIDGE MAINTENANCE FASTRAK COSTS DUE TO  
2 BOTH INCREASED TRAFFIC AND INCREMENTAL COST, AND AN INCREASE  
3 IN THE FUNDING OF THE LIABILITY RESERVE. AGAIN, WE ARE  
4 ESTIMATING INCREASES FROM PROJECTED FISCAL '22 TRAFFIC AROUND  
5 THE NINE% LEVEL WITH TOLL REVENUE NET OF RM3 OF \$660 MILLION.  
6 WE DO HAVE A CAPITAL FUNDING BUDGET OF \$157 MILLION THAT WE'RE  
7 PROPOSING WITH THE ACTUAL EXPENSES, AGAIN, TO BE FUNDED FROM  
8 BOND PROCEEDS, AND WE ARE PROPOSING MAINTAINING THE CURRENT  
9 RESERVE LEVELS WHAT WE CALL THE HARD DECK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
10 AGAIN, SO, THIS BUDGET IS SHOWN, AGAIN, NET OF RM3, ALL OF THE  
11 RM3 PROCEEDS WOULD BE ESCROWED. WE ARE ASSUMING PREPAYMENT OF  
12 \$38 MILLION OF FISCAL 'DEBT SERVICE. THIS IS DOWN FROM \$70  
13 MILLION THAT WAS DISCUSSED WITH BATA LAST YEAR. WE ARE ABLE TO  
14 REDUCE THAT AMOUNT BY VIRTUE OF INCREASED TOLL REVENUE. BUT WE  
15 DO STILL NEED TO DO SOME OF THE PREPAYMENT IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE  
16 DEBT SERVICE COVERAGE LEVELS WHICH WE THINK ARE IMPORTANT IN  
17 ORDER TO KEEP MAINTAINING APPROPRIATE -- VIEW APPROPRIATE  
18 VIEWS WHERE WE WANT TO BE WITH THE INVESTOR RATING AGENCIES.  
19 WE HAVE BAKED INTO THIS BUDGET A FEW ONE TIME COST A COUPLE OF  
20 MAJOR ONES INCLUDE REIMBURSEMENT TO CALTRANS, 2020 TOLL  
21 COLLECTION OPERATIONS WE HAVE A SIGNIFICANT BACKLOG OF FUNDING  
22 FOR PAYMENT TO THE DMV FOR REGISTRATION HOLDS THAT WOULD BE  
23 CONSISTENT WITH THAT ITEM THAT WE JUST DISCUSSED. WE DO NOT  
24 HAVE SHOWN IN THIS BUDGET AT THE MOMENT REVENUES THAT WE MIGHT  
25 RECEIVE FROM RELEASING THOSE INCREMENTAL HOLDS. SO, AGAIN,



JUNE 8, 2022

1 THAT'S IMPORTANT. THAT MAY ALLOW US TO DO SOME MORE FUNDING OF  
2 THE REHABILITATION PROJECTS FROM CURRENT YEAR REVENUES AS  
3 OPPOSED TO HAVING TO DIP INTO THE BOND PROCEEDS FOR THAT. THAT  
4 ALLOWS US TO EXTEND THE LIFE OF THE BOND PROCEEDS AND,  
5 HOPEFULLY, MITIGATE WHAT MIGHT BE REQUIRED IN TERMS OF FUTURE  
6 TOLL INCREASES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, ON THE REHABILITATION  
7 BUDGET WE'RE LOOKING AT A TOTAL OF \$157 MILLION THAT WE'RE  
8 PROPOSING. THAT'S UP FROM 137 PROPOSED LAST YEAR. AND, AGAIN,  
9 IS NOTABLY UP FROM THE AMOUNT THAT WAS DISCUSSED IN FISCAL '22  
10 AS BEING THE FISCAL '23 NUMBER. THE REASON FISCAL '23 IS  
11 PROPOSED TO BE HIGHER THAN WHAT WAS LOOKED AT IN FISCAL '22 IS  
12 PRIMARILY ASSOCIATED WITH THE ACCELERATION OF ONE VERY LARGE  
13 PROJECT, THE \$52 MILLION WEST BAND STRUCTURAL STEEL PROJECT  
14 ASSOCIATED WITH THE SAN FRANCISCO OAKLAND BAY BRIDGE. THE  
15 ESCALATION OF THIS PROJECT IS ACTUALLY VERY CONSISTENT WITH  
16 THE WORKSHOP THAT WAS HELD PREVIOUSLY THAT SAID, HEY, WE OUGHT  
17 TO BE ADDRESSING PROBLEMS EARLY, TRYING TO GET THOSE UNDERWAY  
18 SO THAT THOSE PROBLEM DON'T BECOME MORE EXPENSIVE. WE DO  
19 ANTICIPATE RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION FOR AN UPDATE OF 10-  
20 YEAR REHABILITATION NEEDS AS MORE INFORMATION ON THE ASSET  
21 MANAGEMENT EFFORTS ARE AVAILABLE. I DO WANT TO NOTE A COUPLE  
22 OF CHANGES IN THE DETAIL SLIDES FROM WHAT ARE SHOWN HERE. THE  
23 BRIDGE INTEGRITY PROJECTS WOULD ACTUALLY BE \$33 MILLION. THE  
24 ELECTRIC TOLL COLLECTION PROJECTS WOULD DIP TO ABOUT 15, AND  
25 OTHER PROJECTS, AGAIN, WOULD INCREASE CORRESPONDINGLY TO A



JUNE 8, 2022

1 TOTAL OF 23. THE 157 RECOMMENDATION REMAINS THE SAME. NEXT  
2 SLIDE PLEASE. AND JUST A PEEK INTO THE CAPITAL PROGRAM  
3 BALANCES THAT HAVE PREVIOUSLY BEEN APPROVED. WE ARE LOOKING AT  
4 A TOTAL OF ABOUT \$604 MILLION IN PREVIOUSLY APPROVED CURRENT  
5 CAPITAL PROGRAM BUDGETS, THAT'S AS OF FEBRUARY. SO, WE DO HAVE  
6 SOME ROOM FOR PREVIOUS PROJECTS THAT HAVE BEEN APPROVED. JUST  
7 NOTING THAT THERE IS A DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE CASH EXPENDED  
8 AND WHAT THE BUDGETARY AUTHORITY IS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND  
9 FINALLY WE FULLY EXPECT TO MAINTAIN OUR LIQUIDITY. AGAIN,  
10 THAT'S A CRITICAL FACTOR IN MAINTAINING OUR STRONG CREDIT  
11 RATINGS AND ALLOWING US TO ACCESS CAPITAL AT THE LOWEST  
12 POSSIBLE COST. AND WE PROMOTION TO MAINTAIN THAT STRUCTURE FOR  
13 FISCAL YEAR '23. WE ASK FOR YOUR RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE  
14 RESOLUTION 154. AGAIN THERE WOULD NOT BE ANY INCREASE TO THIS  
15 BUDGET WITHOUT BOARD APPROVAL. CONTRACTS AND SERVICES WOULD  
16 CONTINUE TO BE DELEGATED TO THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. WE ASK  
17 YOU TO AUTHORIZE MAINTENANCE OF THE BILLION DOLLARS RESERVE  
18 AND ALLOW US, REALLY, THERESE AND ME TO HAVE THE APPROPRIATE  
19 AUTHORITY TO RETIRE ANY UNFUNDED PENSION AND OPEB LIABILITIES  
20 THAT MAY DEVELOP OVER TIME. WE CONTINUE TO MAINTAIN THE  
21 DESIGNATION OF RM3 INTO THE REVENUE AND ESTABLISH \$4 MILLION  
22 OF NEW RESTRICTED LIABILITY RESERVES ON NEW TRANSFER. WITH  
23 THAT, AVAILABLE FOR ANY QUESTIONS.  
24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THERE WE GO. DEREK, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR  
2 THAT -- YOUR REPORT. AND, LET ME JUST TURN TO THE COMMITTEE  
3 FOR QUESTIONS. YES, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

4  
5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES. THANK YOU. THANK YOU, DEREK. THIS WAS  
6 REALLY VERY CLEAR. ON THE LIQUIDITY RESERVE, THAT \$1 BILLION,  
7 IS THAT SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO HAVE TO BE INCREASED IN THE  
8 FUTURE? OR IS THIS THE -- IS THIS KIND OF THE GOLDEN AMOUNT?

9  
10 **DEREK HANSEL:** YES IT IS AN AMOUNT THAT HAS BEEN VERY  
11 CONSISTENT OVER THE YEARS IT PROVIDES SUBSTANTIAL LIQUIDITY  
12 FOR THIS AGENCY. YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY, AS OPERATIONS AND  
13 REHABILITATION NEEDS INCREASED, FRANKLY, OVER A PRETTY LONG  
14 PERIOD OF TIME, WE WOULD MAYBE NEED TO REVISIT THAT. BUT I  
15 WOULD NOTE THAT THAT LIQUIDITY LEVEL WAS MORE THAN SUFFICIENT  
16 BACK IN 2019 WHEN OUR REVENUE WAS SUBSTANTIALLY HIGHER. I  
17 WOULD ALSO NOTE THAT, BOY, HAVEN'T WE NEEDED IT OVER THE LAST  
18 PERIOD OF TIME. SO, YOU KNOW, I'M VERY COMFORTABLE WITH THAT  
19 LEVEL TODAY. BUT IT IS CERTAINLY SOMETHING THAT WE MAY -- THAT  
20 WE NOT ONLY MAY WANT -- WE WILL CONTINUALLY REVISIT OVER TIME.  
21 HAVING SAID THAT, THE ABILITY TO INCREASE THAT LIQUIDITY  
22 RESERVE IS REALLY A FUNCTION OF THE FINANCIAL CAPACITY OF THE  
23 AGENCY. AND, CERTAINLY, NOT SOMETHING WE COULD DO TODAY.

24



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND, DEREK, IS THAT -- COULD YOU TELL ME WHAT  
2 THAT NUMBER IS TIED TO?

3

4 **DEREK HANSEL:** IT'S TIED TO A FEW DIFFERENT THINGS BUT THERE IS  
5 A HIGH DEGREE OF FUNGIBILITY THERE, BUT WE'RE TRYING TO  
6 MAINTAIN SOMEWHERE IN THE ORDER OF 150%. SO JUST OVER 525, 540  
7 DAYS OPERATING CASH. TOTAL CASH ON HAND.

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. GOT IT.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS? TURN TO  
12 PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE WE COME BACK FOR DISCUSSION AND ACTION.  
13 TURNING TO COMMITTEE CLERK, KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE EITHER WRITTEN  
14 PUBLIC COMMENT OR SPEAKERS IN THE MEETING?

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
18 ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. GREAT. KIMBERLY, THANK YOU. AND  
21 WE'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE. WE'RE SEEKING APPROVAL  
22 OF TWO RESOLUTIONS TO ADOPT -- RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE -- JUST  
23 GETTING THIS RIGHT. YEAH. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT BOTH THE CAPITAL  
24 AND OPERATING BUDGET. ONE OF THE REAL PRIORITIES OF OUR BATA  
25 RECOVERY TASK FORCE WAS TO ENSURE THAT WE, MOVING FORWARD, HAD



JUNE 8, 2022

1 SUFFICIENT RESOURCES TO DO THE CAPITAL MAINTENANCE OF THE  
2 BRIDGES. SO, I APPRECIATE YOUR, YOU KNOW, PRUDENCE ON THAT.  
3 BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY, WE HAVE VERY SPECIFIC ONGOING MAINTENANCE,  
4 AS WELL AS A HUGE PART OF OUR RESPONSIBILITY IS TO MAINTAIN  
5 THESE GREAT BRIDGES THAT WE HAVE. SO, I APPRECIATE THE  
6 PRUDENCE IN THAT BUDGET. AND I KNOW THAT IN -- WE -- IT SOUNDS  
7 LIKE FROM WHAT YOU'RE TELLING US IS THAT THE PRIORITY IS TO  
8 MAINTAIN THAT ANNUAL MAINTENANCE BUDGET. WHEN WE TAKE IT FROM  
9 HERE OR WHETHER WE HAVE TO DIP INTO THAT LIQUID RESERVE TO  
10 MAKE SURE THAT WE MEET THAT MAINTENANCE TARGET.

11

12 **DEREK HANSEL:** THAT'S CORRECT.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. IF THERE ARE  
15 NO OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS, I WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO  
16 ADOPT, I THINK WHERE IT IS -- WE'RE GOING TO ADOPT RESOLUTION  
17 -- BATA RESOLUTION 154 TO 2022/'23 OPERATING AND CAPITAL  
18 BUDGETS.

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO MOVED, CHAVEZ.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOVED BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

23

24 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SECOND, GLOVER.

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. ROLL CALL  
2 VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR WORTH?

5

6 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

17

18 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN IS ABSENT. AND WITH  
8 THAT THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY. SO  
11 WE'LL MOVE ON NOW TO OUR PUBLIC COMMENT AND ANY OTHER BUSINESS  
12 BEFORE THE COMMITTEE. SO I DO KNOW THAT WE HAD A MEMBER OF THE  
13 PUBLIC WHO WAS WAITING TO OFFER COMMENT. SO, LET ME TURN TO  
14 KIMBERLY TO SEE IF WE HAVE ANY SPEAKERS. OKAY. WHILE WE'RE  
15 LOOKING FOR THAT, HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY --

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SORRY. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN  
18 WRITING, AND I DO SEE JOHN GRUBB HAS HIS HAND RAISED. THE  
19 OTHER MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT WE HAVE BEEN WAITING FOR  
20 DOESN'T HAVE HIS HAND RAISED AT THE MOMENT. THERE HE GOES.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** BEFORE WE TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT, I JUST WANTED  
23 TO NOTE THAT WE DID RECEIVE A LETTER FROM THE RICHMOND AND  
24 MARIN COALITION FOR TRANSPORTATION JUSTICE. AND I ASSUME THAT  
25 IS PART OF OUR PUBLIC RECORD AND THAT'S BEEN DISTRIBUTED?





JUNE 8, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MADAM CHAIR, I DID NOT RECEIVE THAT,  
3 UNLESS IT WAS SOMETHING THAT WAS IN THE PACKET. ARE YOU  
4 REFERRING TO SOMETHING THAT WAS ALREADY INCLUDED IN THE  
5 PACKET?

6

7 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YOU KNOW, I DON'T KNOW. I RECEIVED A COPY OF  
8 T I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE. IT'S A LETTER DATED. -- I DON'T  
9 SEE A DATE ON IT. BUT IT'S FROM THE RICHMOND AND MARIN  
10 COALITION OF TRANSPORTATION FOR JUSTICE. THIS IS A PUBLIC  
11 COMMENT PERIOD SO WE CAN'T ACT ON ANYTHING THAT COMES FORWARD  
12 IN THE PUBLIC COMMENT, BUT IF YOU COULD BE SO KIND WE COULD  
13 MAKE SURE THAT EVERYBODY ON THE COMMITTEE RECEIVES THAT  
14 CORRESPONDENCE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABSOLUTELY.

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN GRUBB, IF YOU WILL GO AHEAD AND  
21 UNMUTE YOURSELF. MADAM CHAIR, DO YOU WANT ONE MINUTE?

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** LET'S DO THAT. UNFORTUNATELY WE'RE RUNNING  
24 WAY LATE. SO LET'S DO ONE MINUTE.

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU GOT IT. MR. GRUBB, GO AHEAD AND  
2 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. SO, THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR SERVICE.  
5 MY NAME IS JOHN, CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER AT THE BAY AREA  
6 COUNCIL, WE HAVE SUBMITTED A LETTER AS WELL. WE'RE ASKING TO  
7 YOU SCHEDULE A HEARING AND TAKE ACTION ON THE RICHMOND SAN  
8 RAFAEL BRIDGE THE MORNING COMMUTE ON THE RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL  
9 BRIDGE THERE IS 80,000 PEOPLE THAT CROSS THE BRIDGE EVERY DAY  
10 18,000 COME IN THE MORNING COMMUTE THE VAST MAJORITY OF THEM  
11 63% ARE PEOPLE OF COLOR 69% DO NOT HAVE A COLLEGE DEGREE AND  
12 THE MAJORITY OF THEM MAKE LESS THAN THE BAY AREA'S MEDIAN  
13 INCOME FACING A 24 MINUTE COMMUTE IT'S BECOME A LARGEST SOURCE  
14 OF POLLUTION IN THE RICHMOND COMMUNITY BLOCKING STREETS AND  
15 ROADS AND OBSTRUCTING PEOPLE'S ABILITY TO GET ON THE BRIDGE.  
16 SO I HAVE VERY LITTLE TIME LEFT WE'RE ASKING FOR A HEARING WE  
17 SENT A LETTER ON IT AND WE HOPE YOU CAN SCHEDULE THAT HEARING  
18 AND ACT ON THIS ISSUE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS LINDA  
21 WHITMORE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF, MS. WHITMORE, YOU WILL HAVE  
22 ONE MINUTE.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. HI. I AM LINDA WHITTMORE AND I LIVE IN  
25 RICHMOND IN THE SANTA FE NEIGHBORHOOD, AND WE'RE RIGHT AT THE



JUNE 8, 2022

1 END GETTING ONTO THE SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE. I AM ONE OF THE  
2 SIGNORS OF THE LETTER THAT WAS SENT TO YOU, ASKING FOR A  
3 HEARING. I SERVED, FOR THE LAST THREE OR FOUR YEARS ON THE AIR  
4 QUALITY COMMITTEE HERE IN RICHMOND. WE'RE TRYING TO FIGURE OUT  
5 WHAT WAS THE MAIN REASON FOR ALL THE MUSICIAN IN OUR CITY AND  
6 IT TURNS OUT THAT AFTER SEVERAL YEARS OF MONITORING THE  
7 POLLUTION IN THE CITY MAINLY BECAUSE OF THE CAR EMISSIONS  
8 COMING INTO RICHMOND AND THE BACK UP IS MAKING IT WORSE. WE  
9 WOULD LOVE TO HAVE A HEARING TO GO OVER IN DETAIL WHAT'S  
10 HAPPENING. WE TALK ABOUT EQUITY. WE WANT EQUITY IN RICHMOND,  
11 THE SAME THAT YOU DO IN MARIN. SO PLEASE OFFER A HEARING FOR  
12 US TO GIVE OUR CASE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. AND, MADAM CHAIR, THE LETTER  
15 THAT THEY SPOKE OF, I DID RECALL RECEIVING IT BUT DIDN'T  
16 ASSOCIATE IT TO THIS AGENDA. SO I WILL MAKE SURE IT'S POSTED  
17 TO THIS AGENDA. AND JOLIE FISHER BROKER DID NOT RERAISE HIS  
18 HAND. SO I DO NOT KNOW THAT HE WANTS TO SPEAK AT THIS TIME.  
19 THERE WE -- NO. HE PUT HIS HAND BACK DOWN. NO FURTHER  
20 COMMENTS. THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** NO. I'M HERE, MA'AM.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

25



JUNE 8, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** WOW. WELL, THANK YOU. THANK YOU. I'M THE ONE THAT  
2 SENT IN THE LETTER. MADAM WORTH AND COMMISSIONERS. BASICALLY,  
3 WHAT MR. GRUBB HAD MENTIONED AND WHAT MS. WHITMORE HAD  
4 MENTIONED, I WANT TO PIGGYBACK ON. WE ARE INUNDATED WITH A LOT  
5 OF BACK UP, WITH A LOT OF POLLUTION, AND EVERYTHING ON THE  
6 BRIDGE. AND WE WANT, BASICALLY, THE SAME DEAL THAT WAS GIVEN  
7 TO MARIN CITY. WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE THREE LANES DURING THE  
8 MORNING COMMUTE GOING FROM RICHMOND TO MARIN. THIS WOULD EASE  
9 UP THE BACKUP ON THE FREEWAY AND INTO OUR NEIGHBORHOODS. NOW,  
10 WE'RE NOT TRYING TO ELIMINATE THE BIKE LANE. WE REALIZE THAT  
11 WE NEED TO GET PEOPLE OUT OF THE CARS, BUT WE WANT THAT SAME  
12 DEAL. AND WHAT WE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE IS THAT IF WE WERE ABLE  
13 TO PROPOSE A BIKE LANE ON THE BOTTOM DECK, THAT CAN BE USED  
14 DURING THE MORNING COMMUTE, PARTICULARLY SINCE THE THIRD LANE  
15 ON THE LOWER DECK IS NOT NEEDED FOR CARS. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NO FURTHER HANDS ARE RAISED, MADAM  
22 CHAIR.

23

24 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND MR. FISHER, THANK  
25 YOU FOR HANGING IN THERE WITH US IN THE MEETING. WE'RE GLAD WE



JUNE 8, 2022

1 GOT TO HEAR YOUR COMMENTS. I WANT TO CLARIFY, KIMBERLY, THANK  
2 YOU FOR IDENTIFYING THAT LETTER. I SEE A LETTER FROM THE  
3 RICHMOND AND MARIN COALITION FOR TRANSPORTATION JUSTICE. MR.  
4 GRUBB INDICATED THERE HAS ALSO BEEN A LETTER. I DON'T KNOW IF  
5 THIS IS THE SAME LETTER IF WE COULD FOLLOW UP IF THERE IS ONE  
6 OR TWO LETTERS TO CLARIFY IF WE HAVE THOSE FOR THE RECORD AND  
7 FOR THE COMMITTEE. THAT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SINCE WE'RE AT THE  
12 PUBLIC COMMENT ITEM, WE CAN'T DISCUSS THE ITEM, BUT I KNOW  
13 THAT WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF THE PILOT PROGRAM FOR THE RICHMOND  
14 BRIDGE. SO, WE'LL BE ABLE TO DISCUSS THESE ISSUES AT THE  
15 APPROPRIATE TIME. SO, WITH THAT, AGAIN, I WANT TO THANK  
16 EVERYBODY FOR YOUR REALLY THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSIONS TODAY AND FOR  
17 THE PUBLIC FOR BEING HERE. THANKS STAFF FOR RESPONDING TO OUR  
18 QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK WENT INTO  
19 TODAY'S MEETING. AND I APPRECIATE IT IN GREAT DEAL, EVERYONE.  
20 WITH THAT, WE'LL ADJOURN TO OUR NEXT MEETING WHICH WILL BE  
21 WEDNESDAY JULY 13TH, 9:35 REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST. THANK YOU  
22 VERY MUCH. [ADJOURNED]

23

24

25

26

27



*Broadcasting Government*