

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP**
3 **MONDAY, NOVEMBER 14, 2022 1:00 PM**
4
5 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYBODY. I WANT TO
6 WELCOME YOU ALL TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE
7 ADVISORY GROUP OF NOVEMBER 14TH. I WOULD ASK THOSE IN THE
8 ROOM, PLEASE TURN OFF YOUR LAPTOP SPEAKERS, AS WELL AS YOUR
9 MICROPHONE. WE'RE GETTING FEEDBACK. JUST NOT YOUR MICROPHONE,
10 BUT YOUR SPEAKER AS WELL. IT'S 104. I WILL CALL THE MEETING TO
11 ORDER. BROADCAST TEAM WOULD YOU PLEASE PLAY THE COVID-19
12 ANNOUNCEMENT RECORDING? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
13 ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID
14 MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS
15 ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO
16 BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
17 WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
18 PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE
19 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM
20 AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE
21 CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT
22 IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
23 ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.
24 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5
25 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL
2 CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND
3 ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN
4 ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
5 TO DATE.

6

7 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU BROADCASTING TEAM. WOULD THE
8 CLERK PLEASE CONDUCT ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM QUORUM IS PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHAIR MULLIGAN?

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** PRESENT.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR JOHN-BAPTISTE?

15

16 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** BOUCHARD?

19

20 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** PRESENT.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHURCHILL?

23

24 **BILL CHURCHILL:** PRESENT.

25



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER FITZGERALD?

2

3 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE, ON ZOOM.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GONOT?

6

7 **CAROLYN GONOT:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HURSH?

10

11 **MICHAEL HURSH:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** LINDSEY?

14

15 **JAMES LINDSAY:** PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MCMILLAN?

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** POWERS?

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER SMITH? IS ABSENT. MEMBER TUMLIN?



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1

2 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER WUNDERMAN?

5

6 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM. THANK YOU.

9

10 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. I WANT TO
11 WELCOME EVERYBODY BACK TO THE ADVISORY GROUP MEETING, MEMBERS,
12 AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. AND I WANT TO THANK THOSE WHO ARE
13 ABLE TO JOIN US IN PERSON. THIS IS A HYBRID MEETING, AND WE'RE
14 HAVING IN-PERSON AND REMOTELY. THANK YOU. THIS IS THE LAST
15 MEETING BEFORE THE ADVISORY GROUP RECEIVES CONSULTANT DRAFT
16 RECOMMENDATIONS AND FEEDBACK ON DECEMBER 12TH, TODAY'S MEETING
17 WILL BE PIVOTAL WITH ANALYSIS. I'M GOING TO PUSH TO GET ALL
18 INVOLVED IN REVIEW AND DISCUSSION ABOUT WHAT IS PRESENTED. SO
19 WHEN IT COMES TIME FOR THE PRESENTATION'S CONCLUSION, I WILL
20 CALL ON MEMBERS EVEN THOUGH WHO MAY BE SHY AND BASHFUL THAN
21 MORE SO THAN THEIR COLLEAGUES TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK ON THE
22 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO
23 A PRODUCTIVE AND ROBUST DISCUSSION ON RECOMMENDATIONS TODAY
24 LOOKING FORWARD TO ALL OF US MAKING CONTRIBUTION AND WEIGHING
25 IN AND NOT BEING AFRAID TO SPEAK. AS SAID PREVIOUSLY, I WILL



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 PROD SOME OF YOU TO MAKE SURE WE HEAR FROM YOU. I WOULD LIKE
2 TO THANK ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS FOR YOUR TIME AND
3 PARTICIPATION IN THIS PROCESS. I WANT TO THANK OUR VICE CHAIR,
4 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE IN HER ASSISTANCE IN REVIEWING
5 INFORMATION IN PREPARATION FOR TODAY'S MEETING I WANT TO THANK
6 OUR CONSULTING TEAM AND STAFF THAT HAS PUT IN A LOT OF EFFORT
7 TO GET US TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY. WE'LL PROCEED WITH THE
8 MEETING WE HAVE ONE ACTION ITEM TODAY, APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT
9 CALENDAR. SO WE HAVE ONE ACTION ITEM TODAY, IT'S THE CONSENT
10 CALENDAR, AGENDA ITEM THREE. DO WE HAVE A MOTION?

11

12 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** SO MOVED. TUMLIN.

13

14 **MICHAEL HURSH:** SECOND, HURSH.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ANY DISCUSSION BY
17 MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY GROUP. I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED.
18 ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO COMMENT ON THE CONSENT
19 CALENDAR? I DON'T SEE ANYONE HERE IN PERSON. WALLY, DO YOU SEE
20 ANY HANDS RAISED FROM PARTICIPANTS?

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO HAND RAISED.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. WALLY E
25 WILL YOU PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE?



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHAIR MULLIGAN?

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR JOHN-BAPTISTE?

7

8 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER BOUCHARD?

11

12 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHURCHILL?

15

16 **BILL CHURCHILL:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER FITZGERALD?

19

20 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. MEMBER GONOT?

23

24 **CAROLYN GONOT:** YES.

25



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER HURSH?

2

3 **MICHAEL HURSH:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER LEVIN? MEMBER LINDSEY?

6

7 **JAMES LINDSAY:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER MCMILLAN?

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MORE POWERS?

14

15 **ROBERT POWERS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

18

19 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

22 PRESENT. MOTION BY TUMLIN SECOND BY HURSH.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE

25 PUBLIC FOR BEARING WITH US AS WE NAVIGATE THIS MEETING IN



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 HYBRID FORMAT, AND I APOLOGIZE FOR MY NOTES BLOCKING MY CAMERA
2 ON MY LAPTOP. WITH THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 4A REGIONAL
3 NETWORK MANAGEMENT PROGRESS UPDATE FUNCTIONAL AREAS PRINCIPAL
4 DRAFT REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK REVIEW. THIS IS AN
5 INFORMATION ITEM. NO ACTION CONTEMPLATED ON THIS ITEM TODAY,
6 WE WILL HAVE VIGOROUS DISCUSSION AND DEBATE AFTER THE
7 PRESENTATION. I'M GOING TO WELCOME GUY W FROM THE TEAM TO
8 PROVIDE A RECAP FROM THE OCTOBER MEETING, AS WELL AS UPDATE ON
9 PROGRESS AND NEXT STEPS. PROVIDING FUTURE STATE OF THE
10 FUNCTIONAL AREAS IN THE DRAFT PRELIMINARY REGIONAL NETWORK
11 MANAGEMENT, I WOULD ASK IF THERE ARE QUESTIONS TO RAISE YOUR
12 HAND AND WE CAN PAUSE THE PRESENTATION MOMENTARILY TO RESPOND
13 BEFORE PROCEEDING BUT. TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE ADEQUATE TIME FOR
14 THE THREE HOUR TIME BLOCK SET-ASIDE FOR THIS MEETING, WITH
15 THAT, GUY, TAKE IT AWAY. BROADCAST TEAM, PLEASE PULL UP THE
16 SLIDES.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** EXCUSE ME MEMBER BOUCHARD HAS HER HAND
19 RAISED.

20

21 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** JUST BRIEFLY, CHAIR MULLIGAN AND MEMBERS, I
22 JUST WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW THAT I DO HAVE A HARD STOP AT 2:15
23 SO I WILL BE LEAVING THE ROOM. BUT SAM SERGEANT WITH CALTRAIN
24 WILL BE THERE FOR THE ENTIRE TIME. SO, I JUST WANTED TO LET
25 FOLKS KNOW. THANK YOU.



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MICHELLE. AND WELCOME, SAM.
3 WITH THAT, GUY, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. HOPEFULLY WE CAN GET THE PRESENTATION
6 UP ON THE SCREEN. AS CHAIR MULLIGAN MENTIONED THIS MEETING
7 REPRESENTS A PIVOT POINT FOR US AS A GROUP IN THE SHIFT FROM
8 ANALYSIS TO ACTION. PART OF THE REASON WHY WE HAVE EXTENDED
9 THIS PARTICULAR AG MEETING AND CREATED A LONGER SESSION,
10 REALLY IS TO ENCOURAGE A DISCUSSION ON SOME OF THE ITEMS WE'RE
11 GOING TO BE COVERING TODAY. WE'RE REALLY FOCUSING ON WHAT
12 WE'RE CALLING 80/20 SOLUTIONS INTENTIONALLY SHOWING YOU WORK
13 IN PROGRESS TO REALLY ENGENDER MEANINGFUL CONVERSATION. SO,
14 YOU KNOW, REALLY TAKE IT IN THAT SPIRIT. WE'RE REALLY LOOKING
15 FORWARD TO CONSTRUCTIVE DISCUSSION TODAY ON THIS. WE'LL SPEND
16 APPROXIMATELY AROUND 40 MINUTES OR SO, PROVIDING A BRIEF
17 UPDATE ON PROGRESS, GIVE YOU AN OVERVIEW OF THE FUNCTIONAL
18 AREA ACTIVITY SHIFTS TO THE REGION AND THE DRIVES BEHIND SOME
19 OF THOSE. AND THEN SHARE WITH YOU THE PRELIMINARY THINKING
20 AROUND THE R AND M FRAMEWORK. IF WE CAN MOVE TO THE NEXT
21 SLIDE, PLEASE? THIS HIGHLIGHTS WHAT I WAS SAYING ON THE PRIOR
22 SLIDE. OPPORTUNITY REALLY TO WALK THROUGH THIS MATERIAL AND
23 THEN GET INTO A FACILITATED DISCUSSION CHAIRED BY CHAIR
24 MULLIGAN. MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THE NEXT. WE
25 HAVE A GREW DIVIDERS. HERE. JUST REALLY TO RECAP AND WHAT WE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 HAVE DISCUSSED PREVIOUSLY. OUR WORK IN THE LAST MONTH OR SO
2 HAS INCLUDED REVIEW OF EXISTING STUDIES, UNDERSTANDING LESSONS
3 LEARNED, STAFF INTERVIEWS, DATA COLLECTION ACROSS THOSE SIX
4 FUNCTIONAL AREA. THE FINDINGS TO DATE HAVE INCLUDED CLEAR
5 ARTICULATION AROUND THE BOUNDARIES BETWEEN REGION AND OPERATOR
6 ACTIVITIES, AND THE RELATIONSHIP TO REGIONAL OUTCOMES. THE RNM
7 RECOMMENDATION WILL INCLUDE PROGRAM AND PROCESS CHANGE, AND
8 WE'LL SHARE WITH YOU TODAY THINKING AROUND GOVERNANCE IN THE
9 BROADER OPERATING COMPONENTS. THERE'S A COURSE OF FUTURE STEPS
10 THAT NEEDS TO BE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT, INCLUDING ADDITIONAL
11 BUSINESS CASE DEVELOPMENT, INTEGRATION OF THOSE VARIOUS
12 INITIATIVES, AND INCORPORATION OF THE OVERALL NETWORK
13 STRATEGIES WE MOVE FORWARD, REALLY MOVING FROM, YOU KNOW, WE
14 WILL HOPEFULLY SEE IN THE EARLY PART OF NEXT YEAR, MOVING FROM
15 PLANNING AND STRATEGY INTO IMPLEMENTATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
16 WE HAVE NOW PROGRESSED TO DEFINE IN SHIFTS NEEDED TO MOVE
17 TOWARD THE FUTURE STATE RNM MODEL. THE OPERATING FRAMEWORK IS
18 IMPORTANT TO BOTH THE NEAR-TERM AND FUTURE, AS IT ESSENTIALLY
19 PROVIDES A BASIS TO HOW WE WILL CONTINUE TO EVOLVE THE
20 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK. AND WE'LL COME BACK IN
21 DECEMBER WITH FURTHER REFINEMENTS, AND A MORE FLESHED OUT
22 FRAMEWORK BUT WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TODAY TO KNOW ABOUT YOUR
23 INITIAL FEEDBACK ON THE FRAMEWORK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE ON
24 TRACK TO MAKE SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS AGAINST THE ORIGINAL AIMS
25 OF THE PROGRAM AND DELIVER PREFERRED FRAMEWORK AND NEXT STEPS.



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 TODAY WILL REPRESENT A PREFERRED FRAMEWORK REFINEMENT, MOVING
2 TO IMPLEMENTATION AND DETERMINING HOW TO BEST CAPTURE
3 MOMENTUM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, SINCE THE OCTOBER AG
4 MEETING, WE HAVE COMPLETED A RANGE OF STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS
5 AND ANALYSIS TO IDENTIFY THE PRECISELY FUNCTIONAL AREA SHIFTS
6 AND THE RNM FRAMEWORK. IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT WHAT
7 WE'RE SHARING WITH YOU TODAY IS PRELIMINARY. BUT WE THINK THE
8 BEST WAY TO CAPTURE MOMENTUM IS TO TEST IT DIRECTLY WITH YOU
9 ALL, AND IT RATE AS NEEDED. WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO HAVE
10 CLARIFYING CONVERSATIONS TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL CONTEXT,
11 ANECDOTES, AND DATA, BUT LARGELY THE WORK IS COMPLETE. OUR
12 FOCUS TODAY IS ON HIGHLIGHTING MAJOR SHIFTS IN THE FUNCTIONAL
13 AREAS THAT LEAD TO THE DRAFT RNM FRAMEWORK THAT WE WILL
14 PRESENT TODAY. WE REALLY HAVE OPPORTUNITY HERE TO GAIN
15 MOMENTUM AND MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PROGRAM. YOU CAN MOVE TO
16 THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THEN MOVE ON, PLEASE. SO WE'RE
17 GOING TO GET NOW INTO SOME OF THE IMPORTANT MEATY STUFF OF THE
18 PRESENTATION. REGIONALIZATION [INDISCERNIBLE] FUNCTIONAL AREA
19 IS BASED ON VARIOUS CONSIDERATIONS AND CATEGORIES. OUR
20 THINKING ON REGIONALIZATION IS FOCUSED ON POTENTIAL OUTCOMES
21 AND BENEFITS PROVIDED ABOVE. IMPROVEMENT OF CUSTOMER
22 EXPERIENCE UNLOCKING EFFICIENCY AND FEASIBILITY THESE AREAS
23 REPRESENT THE GOALS IN MEASURE REASONABLY WAYS THAT WE CAN
24 TRANSLATE INTO QUANTIFIABLE MEASURES, DEFINING BREAK DOWN AS
25 WE MOVE FORWARD AT THE SAME TIME IDENTIFYING CONSTRAINTS AND



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 CONSIDERATIONS NOT LIMITATIONS TO DRIVE THINKING AND APPROACH.
2 MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I WANT TO SHARE WITH YOU HERE
3 A PRELIMINARY BREAK DOWN OF THE REGIONAL ROLE FUNCTIONAL AREA
4 ACTIVITIES. THIS IS A REAL ATTEMPT TO PAIR DOWN THE TAKE-
5 AWAY'S FROM EXTREMELY ROBUST REVIEW AS EVIDENCED BY OUR PRIOR
6 AG MEETINGS, AND THE BENEFITS HERE ARE REPRESENTATIVE AND
7 WHILE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FOR EXAMPLE, MAY BE IMPACTED BY
8 NEARLY ALL OF THE ROLES AND OUTCOMES WE HAVE HIGHLIGHTED CLEAR
9 CUT CASES 33 FUNDAMENTAL TAKE-AWAY'S. ONE IS DEFINITION AROUND
10 THE REGIONAL ROLE, SELECTING FUNDING DECISIONS, DEVELOP A
11 REGIONAL POLICIES, CREATE IMPLEMENTATION PLANS, AND IMPLEMENT
12 REGIONAL PROGRAMS AS NEEDED, WHILE COORDINATING VARIOUS
13 STAKEHOLDERS OPERATORS WILL BE HIGHLY INVOLVED IN THE REGIONAL
14 DECISION-MAKING PROCESS PROVIDING LOCAL STAKEHOLDER
15 PERSPECTIVE, INSIGHTS AND ADDRESSING STAKEHOLDER NEEDS AND
16 IMPLEMENTING THOSE REAL REGIONAL POLICIES. THE RNM FRAMEWORK
17 BRINGS THIS TOGETHER TO EFFECT EFFICIENT INTERPLAY BETWEEN
18 ROLES AND WE'LL GET INTO MORE DETAIL IN THE NEXT FEW SLIDES.
19 MOVE FORWARD, PLEASE. SO, THIS SLIDE HERE, I THINK, IS A
20 LITTLE BIT OF A RETREAD ON THINKING AND ANALYSIS THAT WE HAVE
21 ALREADY PRESENTED. THAT REALLY SHOWS YOU FROM TOP TO BOTTOM
22 RNM FRAMEWORK AND HOW WE ENVISION IT WORKING. MISSION AND
23 VISION AT THE TOP, MISSION DESCRIBES THE RNM'S PURPOSE, WHILE
24 THE VISION DESCRIBES THE HOPES IN AREAS WHERE WE NEED TO
25 ACCOMPLISH AND FOCUS. SERVES GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR THE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 FUNCTIONAL AREAS AND OPERATIONAL MOD WITHIN THE RNM NOW AND
2 MOVING FORWARD. ACCOUNTABILITIES DEFINING ACTIVITIES FOR
3 FUNCTIONAL AREAS FOR WHICH RNM IS RESPONSIBLE. AND AS
4 MENTIONED IN PREVIOUS PRESENTATIONS, WE SPENT MUCH TIME
5 WORKING THROUGH TO UNDERSTAND WHO SAVINGS ACCOUNTABLE FOR WHAT
6 BOTH AT RNM LEVEL, OPERATOR LEVEL, AND MTC. THE OPERATING
7 MODEL DEFINES HOW THE RNM WILL DELIVER ITS ACCOUNTABILITIES
8 AND RESPONSIBILITIES AND I WOULD STRESS BOTH IN SHORT-TERM AND
9 AS THE MODEL EVOLVES INTO LONG-TERM, AS WELL. THE BIGGEST REAL
10 ADDITION TO WHAT WE'RE PRESENTING TODAY IS REALLY THAT WE'RE
11 INCLUDING AN UNDERSTANDING AROUND CUSTOMER AND NETWORK, AS
12 WELL. AND REALLY FOCUSING ON THE PUBLIC BENEFIT CATEGORY THAT
13 YOU SEE IN THE BOTTOM RIGHT HAND CORNER OF THIS SLIDE. SO, THE
14 O&M FRAMEWORK NEEDS TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT NETWORK BENEFITS AND
15 MANAGEMENT BENEFITS BUT ALSO THE BROADER ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
16 BENEFITS THAT WE SEE AS A RESULTED AND LEARNING THE VMT AND
17 IMPROVING COMMON SPACES AND OVERALL EMPLOYING BETTER LAND
18 MANAGEMENT STEWARDSHIP STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. YOU WILL SEE IN
19 THE NEXT FEW SLIDES CALL-OUT BOXES, FOOD FOR THOUGHT FOR YOU
20 AS WE GET INTO SOME OF THE DISCUSSION TODAY. THOSE CALL OUT
21 BOXES ARE THERE AND INTENDED TO STIMULATE THOUGHT AND IDEAS
22 AND DISCUSSION. HERE ON THIS PAGE, WE HAVE THE MISSION AND
23 VISION, WHICH IS REALLY A COMPOSITE OF THE TEAM'S THINKING
24 INCLUDING BENEFITS, AND THE CORE PLANNING ELEMENTS SUCH AS THE
25 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE WORK AND THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 REPORT. THE STATEMENTS ARE INTENDED TO BE CONCISE WITHOUT
2 OVERSIMPLIFYING TO MAKE IT BOTH MEMORABLE AND ACTIONABLE ALSO
3 PROVIDES FLEXIBILITY OVER TIME AS THE RNM MAY EVOLVE TO HELP
4 MEET THE VISION SO IT NEEDS TO BE BROAD ENOUGH TO ACCOMMODATE
5 THIS AS WELL, AND I CAN'T REALLY STRESS THAT ENOUGH, REALLY.
6 THE MISSION AND THE VISION APPLY TODAY, AND THEY APPLY GOING
7 FORWARD. WE COULD MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY. WE
8 HAVE QUITE A BIT TO GO THROUGH. THE OPERATING MODEL IS THE
9 TOOL THAT WE'RE PROPOSING TO USE THAT WILL MAKE MEASURABLE AND
10 SUSTAINABLE CHANGE IT. CONTEMPLATES SIX KEY AREAS, ALL
11 NECESSARY TO CONSIDER IN TERMS OF HOW TO MAKE CHANGE WORK,
12 AND, ALSO, STILL OVER TIME. EACH ARE IMPORTANT, BUT WILL HAVE
13 TO BE WORKED OUT IN LOGICAL ORDER. SO, NOT EVERYTHING CAN BE
14 COVERED AT ONCE. AND WE'LL COME BACK TO THIS THEME OF USING
15 THE OPERATING MODEL FRAMEWORK TO INFORM THE EVOLUTION OF THE
16 RNM. AND LET ME, SORT OF, WALK YOU THROUGH THIS. NOW, I WAS
17 HOPING WE WOULD HAVE THIS ANIMATED, BUT I THINK WE HAVE GOT
18 EVERYTHING ON ONE PAGE HERE. SO LET'S WALK AROUND IT IN A
19 CLOCK WIDE FASHION. SO WE HAVE GOVERNANCE AND DECISION RIGHTS
20 AT THE TOP. THAT'S REALLY ABOUT NEEDING TO ESTABLISH A SINGLE
21 ENTITY TO COORDINATE AND DRIVE REGIONAL DECISION-MAKING AND
22 PLACE EXISTING CUSTOMERS AND POTENTIAL NEW CUSTOMERS AT THE
23 FOREFRONT OF DECISION-MAKING. IT'S THERE TO ESTABLISH REGIONAL
24 OBJECTIVES AND A VISION. WE HAVE CORE PROCESSES, WHICH IMPROVE
25 PLANNING AND A COORDINATION BETWEEN THE VARIOUS AGENCIES. THE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 CORE PROCESSES ALSO SHOULD HAVE OBJECTIVE TO SIMPLIFY
2 INTERFACE FOR STAKEHOLDERS AND PROVIDES FOR INPUT AND
3 COORDINATED ACTIVITIES AND ENABLE A FASTER AND MORE INCLUSIVE
4 DECISION-MAKING PROS. WE HAVE TECHNOLOGY AND IT'S VITALLY
5 IMPORTANT TO HAVE REGIONAL TOOLS SUCH AS THE REGIONAL TRAVEL
6 MARKET DEMAND AND DATA THAT'S GOING TO BE CRITICAL WHEN WE
7 THINK ABOUT METRICS AND INCENTIVES AND THE RNM FOR THE PROGRAM
8 AS A WHOLE. BEHAVIORS, AND CULTURES, IN MY VIEW OFTEN
9 NEGLECTED COMPONENTS OF THE OPERATING MODEL DESIGN IMPORTANT
10 TO PROMOTE TRUST AND COLLABORATE BETWEEN FUNDING BODIES
11 IMPLEMENTATION BODIES AND IMPORTANT TO INSTILL LEADERSHIP
12 WITHIN THE ORGANIZATION WITHIN THE RNM AS WELL AS TO DRIVE
13 GROWTH AND SUCK AND CHANGE AS THE MODEL EVOLVES. OUR ROLES AND
14 STRUCTURES WE HAVE THOUGHT CAREFULLY ABOUT CREATING AN RNM
15 WITH ABILITY TO SCALE AND CREATE FUNCTIONS WITHIN IT INCLUDING
16 TECHNICAL AND COMMUNICATIONS FUNCTIONS TO SUPPORT EXECUTION
17 DELIVERY OF THE PROGRAM. AND THEN FINALLY, THE SIX COMPONENT
18 AROUND METRICS AND INCENTIVES. IT'S VITALLY IMPORTANT THAT
19 WE'RE ABLE TO MEASURE SUCCESS, AND THE O&M AUTHORITY NEEDS TO
20 BE INCENTIVIZED IN ORDER TO DRIVE THAT SUCCESS AND METRICS
21 PROVIDE A CRITICAL COMPONENT FOR MEASUREMENT, AS WELL AS
22 EVOLUTION WITHIN THE PROGRAM ITSELF. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, TO
23 ADDRESS THE CHALLENGES, THE RNM WILL NEED, IN OUR VIEW, THREE
24 KEY ELEMENTS. EACH OF THESE ELEMENTS REPRESENT FUNDAMENTAL
25 ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES AROUND VISION, DEVELOPMENT, STEERING AND



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 GUIDANCE, AND EXECUTION AND DELIVERY. EACH WILL REQUIRE A
2 SPECIFIC STRUCTURE, AND BE PART OF THE OVERALL RNM
3 RECOMMENDATION. SO YOU WILL SEE THESE CONCEPTS BEING DEVELOPED
4 INTO COMPONENTS OF THE ORGANIZATION ON THE NEXT SLIDE. MOST OF
5 THESE, TO A DEGREE, SHARED ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES, SO, FOR
6 EXAMPLE, POLICY MIGHT INITIALLY BE SET VIA REVISION AT THE
7 HIGHEST LEVEL, BUT THE TWO OTHER AREAS BELOW PROVIDE NECESSARY
8 FEEDBACK AND ACTUAL CLARITY THROUGH EXECUTION. LET'S JUST,
9 SORT OF, DWELL ON THIS FOR A SECOND OR TWO. SO THE REGIONAL
10 VISIONS ELEMENT SETS STRATEGIC VISION AND DIRECTION AND
11 ENSURES OUTCOMES FOR CUSTOMERS FUNDAMENTALLY ACCOUNTABLE FOR
12 REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK POLICY AND PRIORITIES, HAS THE
13 ABILITY TO PROVE, CREATE, REVISE REGIONAL POLICIES AND APPROVE
14 NEW AND EXISTING SOURCES OF FUNDING. THE STEERING ELEMENT
15 PROVIDES REACH AND CAN REACH CONSENSUS ON POLICY
16 RECOMMENDATIONS TO BE APPROVED BY THE REGIONAL ENVISIONS
17 ELEMENT AND OPERATORS DEFINED AND REPORT ON PERFORMANCE
18 METRICS AND OUTCOMES ON THE WORK OF THE RNM GUIDE
19 ADMINISTRATION AND OPERATIONAL ELEMENTS ON EXECUTION AND
20 PROVIDE AND BRING IN VOICE OF KEY STAKEHOLDERS TO ENABLE TRUST
21 AND COLLABORATION. THE ADMINISTRATIVE AND OPERATIONAL ELEMENT
22 DEVELOPS THOSE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS TO BE ACTED ON BY THE
23 STEERING ELEMENT. SUPPORT THE STEERING ELEMENT THROUGH SUBJECT
24 MATTER EXPERTISE, EXECUTION, AND COORDINATION. AND, AGAIN,
25 PROVIDE A VOICE TO KEY STAKEHOLDERS TO ENABLE TRUST AND



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 PROVIDE DEDICATED STAFF AND TOOLS TO ENABLE EXECUTION AND
2 PROVIDE CAPACITY FOR SUPPORT. MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE,
3 PLEASE. SO, JUST UNRAVELLING THIS FURTHER, PEELING THIS BACK
4 FURTHER, THOSE THREE ELEMENTS NEED TO BE DEVELOPED THROUGH
5 SEVERAL ORGANIZATIONAL COMPONENTS. WE HAVE AT THE TOP, THE
6 REGIONAL VISIONS ELEMENT, WHERE MTC HAS THE OPPORTUNITY TO
7 LEVERAGE EXISTING, ITS REGIONAL PURVIEW AND PLANNING
8 CAPABILITIES TOY HELP SET THE REGIONAL VISION FOR TRANSIT IN
9 THE BAY AREA AND DRIVE THE DIRECTION OF THE RNM. MTC WILL NEED
10 TO, OBVIOUSLY, INCREASE ITS OWN CAPACITIES, AND ADD TO ITS
11 WELL-ESTABLISHED PARTICIPATION IN PUBLIC FORUMS AS WELL AS
12 SECURE ADEQUATE FUNDING TO MANAGE THAT EXPANDED ROLE. IT'S NOT
13 BUSINESS AS USUAL. THE STEERING ELEMENT INCLUDES THE RNM
14 EXECUTIVE BOARD. THE BOARD IS COMPRISED OF GM LEVEL OPERATOR
15 AND MTC REPS WHO CAN UNDERSTAND TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAN
16 REPRESENT THE INTERESTS OF THEIR STAKEHOLDERS, MAKE CRITICAL
17 DECISIONS ON REGIONAL POLICIES, AND PROVIDE LEADERSHIP.
18 CRITICALLY, THOUGH, AND IMPORTANTLY, THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
19 HAS TO BE HEARD, AS AN ADVISORY FUNCTION NEEDS TO PROVIDE
20 SUPPORT AND INPUTS TO THE STEERING ELEMENTS. THAT FUNCTIONING
21 WILL INCLUDE A GROUP OF STAKEHOLDERS WHO REPRESENT THE
22 CUSTOMER AND CAN HELP INFORM DECISION-MAKING WITH THE CUSTOMER
23 IN MIND. AND THEN AS WE THINK ABOUT SCALE OF THE ORGANIZATION,
24 WE HAVE A COMPONENT ADMINISTRATION AND OPERATIONAL ELEMENT
25 THAT WILL INCLUDE DEDICATED RNM STAFF. POTENTIALLY INCLUDING



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 SECONDED STAFF FROM THE VARIOUS OPERATORS WITH A BROAD RANGE
2 OF CAPABILITIES AND EXPERTISE TO SUPPORT THE OPERATIONS AND
3 ANALYSIS FOR THE RNM. THERE WILL BE TASK FORCES AS WELL,
4 ESSENTIALLY TEMPORARY GROUPS COMPRISED OF A BROAD RANGE OF
5 REPS INCLUDING OPERATORS, STAKEHOLDERS AND SUBJECT MATTER
6 EXPERTS THAT WILL HELP COMPLETE ANALYSIS AND DEVELOP POLICY
7 RECOMMENDATIONS AND OPTIONS TO TARGET, AND TOPIC AREAS FOR
8 FOCUS AND ALSO SUBCOMMITTEES THAT HAVE LONGER TERMS COMPRISING
9 A BROADER RANGE OF REPS INCLUDING OPERATORS, STAKEHOLDERS AND
10 SMES. THAT WILL HELP COMPLETE THE ANALYSIS AND DEVELOP POLICY
11 RECOMMENDATIONS AND OPTIONS FOR ONGOING TOPICS. THESE ARE THE
12 BUILDING BLOCKS IN TERMS OF STRUCTURE THAT CAN DELIVER ON THE
13 ROLES DESCRIBED ON THAT PAGE. FUNDAMENTALLY SUCCESS WILL
14 LARGELY HINGE ON DIRECTION AND LEADERSHIP, AS WELL AS THE
15 STAFF ROLES. SO IT'S CRITICAL THAT WE HAVE THE RIGHT
16 FUNCTIONAL SUPPORT TO MAKE LONG-TERM IMPROVEMENTS IN THE
17 MODEL, CREATE ADDITIONAL CONNECTIONS ACROSS THE AGENCIES AND
18 DELIVER ON INITIATIVES. MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO,
19 AGAIN, THIS IS AN INDICATIVE STRUCTURE INTENDED TO HIGHLIGHT
20 HOW THE ROLES COULD WORK. IT'S NOT A FULLY LANDED
21 RECOMMENDATION AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TODAY TO HEARING THE
22 AG'S VIEWS AND PERSPECTIVES ON THIS. IT'S DESIGNED TO ADDRESS
23 ITEMS ON THE RIGHT AS MAJOR DESIGN PRINCIPLES AND ALIGN
24 BENEFITS AND OUTCOMES THAT WE HAVE ALREADY DISCUSSED. CUSTOMER
25 FOCUS, ELEMENTS CUSTOMER FOCUS SCALEABILITY MOMENTUM AND



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 EVOLUTION FIRST CUSTOMER FOCUS STRUCTURING FRAMEWORK ENABLES
2 HIGH INCLUSIVE DECISION-MAKING PROCESSES TO BRING A BROAD
3 RANGE OF PERSPECTIVES INCLUDED DEDICATED VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
4 ELEMENT TO KEEP THE CUSTOMER AT THE FOREFRONT DECISION-MAKING,
5 IT NEEDS TO BE SCALEABLE, WE HAVE TASK FORCES AND
6 SUBCOMMITTEES THAT CAN BE ADDED OR SUBTRACTED I AS ADDITIONAL
7 FUNCTIONAL AREAS AND AS ADDED REGIONAL PRIORITY SHIFT OVER
8 TIME INCLUDING TEAM OF DEDICATED SUPPORT STAFF YOU CAN GROW
9 OVER TIME TO PROVIDE NEEDED CAPACITY TO THE OPERATORS AND
10 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROGRAM AND JOINT TEAMS WITH POTENTIAL
11 OPPORTUNITY TO BRING IN SECONDED STAFF TO ENABLE HIGH QUALITY
12 PROPOSALS TO REACH THE RNM EXECUTIVE BOARD AND MTC AND DRIVE
13 EFFECTIVE USE OF THE GM OVER TIME. WE'RE ALSO FOCUSED ON
14 BALANCING SHORT-TERM MOMENTUM WITH LONG-TERM TRANSFORMATION
15 THE STRUCTURE LEVERAGING EXISTING RESOURCES AND CAPABILITIES
16 ALLOWING RNM TO BE STOOD UP QUICKLY SPEAKING ON WORKING
17 PRIORITY ITEMS AND HAVE FOCUS AND MOVE ALONG CONTINUE
18 EVOLUTION SEEKS TO DRIVE TIME AND COST EFFECTIVENESS AND BE
19 FEASIBILITY IN CURRENT AUTHORITY AND LEGISLATIVE CONSTRAINTS
20 OF THE PROGRAM TODAY. MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, HERE
21 WE HAVE GOT SOME, AGAIN, SOME ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS THAT WE'LL
22 COME BACK TO AS WE MOVE INTO THE DISCUSSION SECTION OF THE
23 PRESENTATION TODAY. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK WE'LL SPEND SOME
24 TIME GOING THROUGH THOSE. BUT I THINK MAYBE I'LL TOUCH ON THEM
25 BRIEFLY NOW. THE COMPOSITION OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD ACTIVELY



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 REPRESENTING THE PORTFOLIO OF THE REGIONAL INTEREST THE RNM
2 NEEDS TO OVERSEE? DO MTC AND RNM EXECUTIVE BOARD CAPABILITIES
3 AND PERSPECTIVES EFFECTIVELY COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER. SHOULD THE
4 RNM EXECUTIVE BOARD MAKE DECISIONS BY CONSENSUS OR VOTING
5 WHICH IS SOMETHING WE WOULD BE INTERESTED IN HEARING YOUR
6 PERSPECTIVE AND VIEWS ON. AND HOW SHOULD DECISION RESOLUTION
7 WORK WITHIN THIS PARTICULAR FRAMEWORK? WHAT CAPABILITIES WOULD
8 BE MOST USEFUL FROM THE DEDICATED RNM SUPPORT STAFF AND COULD
9 REALLOCATION OF REGIONALLY DISTRIBUTED FUNDS BE USED TO HELP
10 THE RNM. SOME THOUGHTS AROUND DISCUSSION ITEMS THAT WE CAN
11 COME BACK TO ON THE NEXT FEW SLIDES. RECOGNIZING THAT THE
12 SHORT-TERM MODEL DOES SACRIFICE MANY OF THE ITEMS THAT WE KNOW
13 IN THE LONGER TERM MODEL. ON THE ONE HAND WE WANT TO ACHIEVE
14 MOMENTUM AND DRIVE CHANGE QUICKLY, BUT WE ALSO RECOGNIZE THAT
15 THE SHORT-TERM MODEL HAS SOME OF THOSE LIMITATIONS. THOSE
16 AREAS ROUGHLY BREAK REALLY INTO THREE AREAS. FUNDING AND
17 AUTHORITY, WHICH IS REALLY THE FIRST THREE ITEMS THAT YOU SEE
18 HERE. FUNDING CAN HELP INCENTIVIZE IMPLEMENTATION OF POLICY
19 RECOMMENDATIONS, BUT THE LIMITED AUTHORITY OF THE RNM AND MTC
20 MAY ADOPT POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS BY ALL THE OPERATORS. CURRENT
21 FUNDING AUTHORITIES, ALSO, MAY LIMIT THE ABILITY TO FULLY
22 INCENTIVIZE FUNDING OUTCOMES AND MAY BE LIMITED ABILITY TO
23 ESTABLISH NEW FUNDING SOURCES IN THE SHORT-TERM. REGARDING
24 PROCESSES POLICY AND LARGE NUMBER OF ENTITIES DECISION MAKING
25 AND COORDINATION AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT THAT COULD HAVE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 CHALLENGES SO WE NEED TO CONSIDER AND CONTEMPLATE THAT TODAY,
2 AND ON THE DELIVERY AND EXECUTION SIDE THE STRUCTURE MAY NOT
3 PROVIDE THE TRUE REGIONAL DELIVERY CAPABILITIES THE REGIONAL
4 DECISION-MAKING POLICY WE'RE CONTEMPLATING HERE AND ALSO NEED
5 TO BALANCE ACCOUNTABILITY OF THE GM'S PARTICIPATING ON THE RNM
6 EXECUTIVE BOARD. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE BEGIN TO THINK ABOUT
7 HOW TO BEST POSITION OURSELVES TAKE THE STEPS FORWARD TOWARDS
8 LONGER TERM MODEL AND BETTER ARTICULATE WHAT IT MEANS FOR
9 INVOLVE'S INVOLVEMENT MOVING FORWARD. MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE,
10 PLEASE. AGAIN, WE'RE DESIGNING THE SHORT-TERM WHILE KEEPING
11 THE LONG-TERM FIRMLY IN MIND. WE THINK WE HAVE THE UNIQUE
12 OPPORTUNITY TO EFFECTUATE TRANSFORMATIONAL CHANGE IN THE NEXT
13 FOUR YEARS AS WE HEAD INTO THE NEXT FEW MEASURE REQUESTS. AS
14 WE TRANSITION FROM THIS PHASE TO THE NEXT OVER THE NEXT FOUR
15 MONTHS WE'LL BE USING THE OPERATING MODEL TO CONSTRUCT AN
16 OUTLINE SET OF INITIATIVES TO HEAD US TOWARDS THAT GOAL AND
17 ALSO ALLOW A FINAL LONG-TERM RNM FRAMEWORK THAT ADDRESSES MANY
18 OF THE CHALLENGES WE HAVE DISCUSSED ON THE PRIOR PAGE. THESE
19 ARE HARD AND FAST IN TERMS OF ORDER, BUT MAY SHIFT AS WE
20 CONTINUE TO ITERATE, AND THEY ROUGHLY MATCH THE ORDER THAT WE
21 WOULD NEED TO PROCEED IN. SO, AND AGAIN REALLY JUST ON THIS
22 SLIDE HERE, YOU CAN SEE THAT THINKING AROUND LEVERAGING THE
23 OPERATOR MODEL TO ADAPT AND MAKE CHANGE OVER TIME THROUGH
24 ESTABLISHMENT INITIALLY OF LEADERSHIP ROLES AND SCALING THOSE
25 ROLES, ESTABLISHING EXPANDING THE REGIONAL TOOLS TO DRIVE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 STANDARDIZATION AND IMPROVE EFFICIENCY, REFINE PROCESSES AND
2 ENHANCE INCENTIVES, UPDATE THOSE PROCESSES TO MEET CHANGING
3 NEEDS AND GOALS AND ENHANCE INCENTIVES TO SUPPORT PROCESS
4 IMPLEMENTATION. AND REALLY SHARPEN THOSE AUTHORITIES OVER
5 TIME, RIGHT? TO ENHANCE AGENCY AUTHORITIES TO ALIGN DECISION-
6 MAKING CAPABILITIES WITH THOSE REGIONAL GOALS. SO, I THINK NOW
7 IS THE OPPORTUNITY, I THINK, JUST TO TURN THIS BACK TO CHAIR
8 MULLIGAN FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION.

9

10 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS. BEFORE WE JUMP INTO THE
11 DISCUSSION, DOES ANY OF THE ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS HAVE
12 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY FULLY UNDERSTAND
13 WHAT WAS PRESENTED BY GUY? YES, ALICIA?

14

15 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THIS
16 PRESENTATION. ON THE LAST SLIDE SPEAKING TO SOME OF THE
17 LIMITATIONS TO THE APPROACH, THE LAST ITEM ABOUT BALANCING
18 ACCOUNTABILITIES FOR THE GENERAL MANAGERS. YOU CAN SPEAK MORE
19 TO THAT.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** BORNE AROUND RESOURCE, IN MY MIND, AND OTHERS MAY
22 CHIME IN HERE, BUT I THINK WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO DRIVE REAL
23 CHANGE HERE. WE RECOGNIZE THAT WE HAVE TO LEVERAGE EXISTING
24 RESOURCES AND CAPABILITIES, BUT WE ALSO RECOGNIZE THAT THERE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 ARE OTHER RESPONSIBILITIES AND ACCOUNTABILITIES THAT THOSE
2 GM'S HAVE. SO IT'S REALLY ABOUT ALIGNING SOME OF THAT.

3

4 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** YOU'RE JUST TALKING ABOUT HOW
5 MUCH TIME PEOPLE HAVE.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** IT'S TIME BUT FOCUS ROLE. I WOULD BE INTERESTED TO
8 HEAR SOME OF THE OTHER MEMBER AG'S THOUGHTS AROUND THAT.

9

10 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BEFORE WE JUMP INTO OUR
11 DISCUSSION, ARE THERE OTHER CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. ADINA?
12 PLEASE TURN YOUR MIC ON.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** IF THE CONSULTANTS CAN BRING UP THE SLIDE THAT
15 HAD THE BOX WITH THE MTC UP AT THE TOP? SO AT FIRST WHEN
16 LOOKING AT THESE SLIDES, MY TAKE AWAY IS THAT THIS IS
17 ESSENTIALLY THE SAME AS THE, WHAT WE HAVE TODAY WITH GIVING
18 SOME MORE SPHERE OF RESPONSIBILITY TO THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE
19 BOARD STRUCTURE. AND WHAT I WAS BRIEFLY INFORMED, BEFORE THIS
20 MEETING, BUT THEN THAT RAISED THE QUESTION FOR THIS MEETING IS
21 THAT THE ROLE OF MTC, IN THIS STRUCTURE, WOULD BE SOMEWHAT
22 DIFFERENT THAN IT IS TODAY. AND I WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND
23 WHAT DIFFERENCE IS THAT ENVISIONED TO BE.

24



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** SO, I THINK, RIGHT, IN MY MIND, MTC IS PLAYING A
2 CRITICAL ROLE IN DRIVING THIS PROGRAM FORWARD AND WILL
3 CONTINUE TO DO THAT. I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE A NEED AND
4 RECOGNITION, RIGHT, THAT MTC WILL BE BRINGING IN STAFF, RIGHT,
5 TO SUPPORT THE O&M AND SUPPORT GROUP THERE. SO THAT MIGHT
6 INCLUDE THE REDEPLOYING EXISTING STAFF MEMBERS, TO HAVE 100%
7 DEDICATED FOCUS TOWARDS THE RNM, AND IT MAY INCLUDE, ALSO,
8 LEVERAGING SECONDED STAFF INTO THAT PROGRAM, AS WELL. THAT
9 WILL ALSO BE THE NEED TO HAVE DEDICATED SOURCES OF FUNDING
10 THAT MTC WILL HAVE TO ALIGN WITH TO DRIVE EVEN THE INITIAL
11 PROGRAM FORWARD, AS WELL. SO, I THINK THOSE ARE A COUPLE OF
12 THE CHANGES, AGAIN, WE DON'T SEE THIS NECESSARILY AS BUSINESS
13 AS USUAL, RIGHT, OPPORTUNITY FOR MTC TO DOUBLE DOWN IN THOSE
14 PARTICULAR AREAS.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO THAT IS DESCRIBING AT THE STAFFING LEVEL, YOU
17 KNOW, WHICH MAKES A LOT OF SENSE, AND IS VERY GOOD. THE
18 QUESTION THEY HAD IS, IS THERE ANY DIFFERENCE AT THE DECISION-
19 MAKING LEVEL? SO, HISTORICALLY MTC HAS MADE DECISIONS ABOUT
20 FUNDING, BUT HAS NOT -- HAS MADE VERY FEW, SPECIFIC, DECISIONS
21 ABOUT THE NUTS AND BOLTS OF TRANSIT, AND THAT GOES TO TRANSIT
22 BOARDS ALONG WITH THEIR FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY, AND, SO MY
23 QUESTION IS, IS THERE ANY EXPECTED CHANGE IN THAT BALANCE OF,
24 YOU KNOW, WHAT BODY MAKES A VOTE THAT CAUSES AN OPERATIONAL
25 DECISION TO HAPPEN?



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1

2 **SPEAKER:** IF I COULD JUMP IN?

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
5 OF MTC. I CAN OFFER MY PERSPECTIVE ON THIS. I THINK THERE IS A
6 COUPLE OF IMPORTANT THINGS TO RECOGNIZE, MTC WOULD NOT BE IN A
7 POSITION -- I THINK THIS IS ONE OF THE IMPORTANT THINGS WE CAN
8 DO IN THIS SHORT-TERM FRAME VERSUS LONG-TERM FRAME. MTC ISN'T
9 GOING TO ASSUME OPERATING AUTHORITIES AWAY FROM TRANSIT
10 OPERATORS. THEY DON'T HAVE THE AGENCY TO DO THAT. HOWEVER, IT
11 COULD BE FAR MORE INTENTIONAL ON POLICY BASIS, SPEAKING TO
12 EXPECTED OPERATING OUTCOMES WITH RESPECT TO THE REGIONAL
13 SYSTEM, AND THAT IS SOMETHING I WOULD SAY WE COULD DO NOW, BUT
14 THE COMMISSION HAS NOT BEEN AS DIRECTED, AND FOCUSED ON THAT
15 AS IT COULD BE. SO, A HUGE PART OF THE SUCCESS OF MODEL WOULD
16 BE THE COMMISSION BEING FAR MORE INTENTIONAL AND DIRECTIVE AND
17 DELIBERATIVE IN WORKING WITH THE TRANSIT, IN WORKING WITH THE
18 STEERING COMMITTEE THAT'S BEING PUT HERE, THAN I WOULD SAY
19 EXISTS TODAY, AND THEY WOULD SAY IS A REALLY IMPORTANT
20 ELEMENT. I HAVE USED THE METAPHOR, IT'S LIKE WE HAVE THE TOOLS
21 IN THE TOOLBOX WE HAVEN'T NECESSARILY REACHED INTO THE BOX,
22 TAKEN THEM OUT, AND USED THE HAMMER TO DRIVE THE NAIL, AS AN
23 EXAMPLE. SO, I THINK THAT'S A VERY SIGNIFICANT ASSUMPTION IN
24 THE SUCCESS OF THIS MODEL WORK. SO, THAT'S MOSTLY PART.

25



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** THE VISION STATEMENT ON THE SLIDES IS DIFFERENT
2 THAN THE VISION STATEMENT THAT WAS REACHED BY THE TRANSIT
3 RECOVERY TASK FORCE. IN SCOPE, AND IN THE PRESENTATION IT WAS
4 CLARIFIED TO BE A LONG-TERM STATEMENT. IS THERE A REASON FOR
5 THAT OR IS THAT MORE ALONG THE LINES OF SOMETHING THAT YOU
6 THINK MIGHT BE SUBJECT TO CHANGE HERE?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** IT'S FOR THE AG TODAY TO COMMENT AND REFINE ON THAT
9 THIS IS BY NO MEANS THE FINISHED ARTICLE HERE BUT WE DID
10 LEVERAGE SOME OF THOSE DOCUMENTS FOREHEAD TO DRIVE THAT VISION
11 MISSION STATEMENT AS WELL AS THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
12 REPORT. SO YES BY ALL MEANS I THINK WE APPRECIATE COMMENT AND
13 FEEDBACK ON THAT AS WELL.

14

15 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** I THINK MIKE HURSH HAD A CLARIFYING
16 QUESTIONS?

17

18 **MICHAEL HURSH:** IT'S PROBABLY NOT CLARIFYING, IT DOVETAILS INTO
19 THE OPERATIONAL AUTHORITY, I THINK I CAN WAIT UNTIL WE GET
20 INTO THE WEEDS.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** I THINK WE CAN WAIT AND GO TO
23 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS FOR NOW. IT'S BASICALLY A PRESENTATION
24 WITH STRAW PROPOSAL FOR CONSIDERATION DISCUSSION. WE'RE GOING
25 TO BE HERE FOR A COUPLE OF HOURS. I MIGHT PROPOSE A BRIEF



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 BREAK SO PEOPLE CAN STRETCH THEIR LEGS, GET COFFEE AS
2 NECESSARY AND RESTART AT 2:00 SHARP, WHICH SEW APPROXIMATELY
3 TEN MINUTES FROM NOW. THAT GIVES EVERYONE A CHANCE. IF YOU ARE
4 LOGGED N DON'T LOG OFF. TURN YOUR CAMERA OFF, STAND UP AND
5 STRETCH, AND GET YOUR FAVORITE BEVERAGE, AND WE'LL RESUME IN
6 TEN MINUTES. THANK YOU. [BREAK] RESUME IN TEN MINUTES. [
7 BREAK] [MEETING WILL RESUME SHORTLY]

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** ONCE AGAIN, THANK YOU TO GUY FOR THE
10 PRESENTATION. THANK YOU FOR THE ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS WHO HAD
11 QUESTIONS THAT WERE CLARIFYING. SO, NOW WE'LL COME TO THAT
12 PART OF THE MEETING WHERE WE ARE GOING TO HAVE A FACILITATED
13 DISCUSSION. AND BEAR WITH ME AS I WILL ACT AS YOUR FACILITATOR
14 TODAY. PLEASE OPEN UP THE SLIDES. THE MAIN EVENT DISCUSSION
15 AROUND THE RECOMMENDATION THAT WAS PRESENTED BY OUR NETWORK
16 MANAGEMENT TEAM, AND THIS IS THE BEST OPPORTUNITY TO SHAPE AND
17 CONTRIBUTE TO THE FINAL DRAFT RECOMMENDATION REVIEWED REVIEW
18 AGAIN IN DECEMBER, IF I DO NOT HEAR FROM SOMEBODY, I WILL CALL
19 UPON YOU BEFORE WE HEAR FROM OTHERS MULTIPLE TIMES. TO ENSURE
20 WE HAVE PRODUCTIVE DISCUSSION MTC STAFF HAS PUT TOGETHER RULES
21 OF ENGAGEMENT AND HAVE ASKED THAT WE BE SENATORIAL, LIKE WE
22 YOU SAID TO BE BACK IN THE DAY, IN THE DAYS THAT WE MISSED
23 THAT WE HOPE GET BACK TO AGAIN. BASICALLY WE WANT EVERYONE TO
24 FEEL COMFORTABLE SPEAKING WE WANT EVERYONE TO BE HEARD AND
25 RECOGNIZE WE ALL SEE THE WORLD DIFFERENTLY AND THAT'S OKAY. WE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 SHOULD'N'T BE NEGATIVE AND SHOULD BE CAREFUL OF OUR TONES. KEY
2 WE WANT TO THINK ABOUT THINGS WE WANT TO SEE AND THERE AN A
3 ASPIRATIONAL COMPONENT TO ENGAGE IN COORDINATION AND RECOGNIZE
4 WE CAN ACCOMPLISH OUR NEAR-TERM AND LONGER TERM GOALS. RULES
5 OF ENGAGEMENT, NOT OVERLY COMPLICATED. SEVERAL DIFFERENT
6 SLIDES THAT WE HAVE FOR DISCUSSION ON ITEMS, NEXT SLIDE
7 NETWORKING TEAM AGENDA ITEM 4B STRUCTURE THE CONVERSATION. I'M
8 GOING TO READ QUESTIONS AND THEN TAME COMMENTS BEFORE MOVING
9 ON AND ASK THAT YOU RAISE YOUR HAND AND I'LL TRY TO ANSWER IN
10 ORDER HANDS ARE RAISED AND I'LL TRY TO GO BACK AND FORTH
11 BETWEEN THOSE IN THE ROOM AND THOSE WHO ARE REMOTE SO THAT ONE
12 GROUP OR THE OTHER DOESN'T HAVE ALL THE EARLY TIME OR ALL THE
13 LATE TIME IN THE CONVERSATION THAT WAY EVERYONE FEELS THEY
14 HAVE EQUAL OPPORTUNITY. SO THE FIRST TOPIC IS REGIONAL NETWORK
15 MANAGEMENT ROLE, AND THIS WAS SLIDE TEN, AND THE QUESTION IS,
16 DO YOU AGREE WITH THE PROPOSED HIGH-LEVEL ALLOCATION OF ROLES
17 BETWEEN THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER AND THE OPERATORS, THE
18 WHEEL, IF YOU WISH, AND IF WE COULD GO TO SLIDE TEN IN THE
19 PRIORITY AGENDA ITEM, AND THROW THAT UP THERE AND SEE WHAT
20 FOLKS THOUGHTS ARE. BACK TO US, AND THEY WILL BE PULLING UP
21 SLIDE TEN. BUT IT'S KIND OF A STRAIGHT FORWARD QUESTION. AND
22 I'LL SEE WHO WANTS TO JUMP IF FIRST WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. I
23 THINK THEY WILL GET SLIDE TEN UP HERE IN A MOMENT. SLIDE TEN
24 IS EASY TO RECALL, I THINK IT WAS THE LAST SLIDE WE FOCUSED
25 ON, HERE IT IS. THE QUESTION IS: WHAT DO YOU THINK OF THIS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 PRELIMINARY REGIONAL ROLE FOR THE ACTIVITIES? AND THERE IS A
2 LOT ON THIS SLIDE SO MAYBE TAKE A FEW MOMENTS TO LOOK AT IT.
3 IT INCLUDES THE FARE INTEGRATION POLICY, WAY FINDING AND
4 MAPPING ACCESSIBILITY, BUS TRANSIT PRIORITY RAIL NETWORK
5 MANAGEMENT NETWORK CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING. AND TALKS ON
6 THE RIGHT SIDE ABOUT THE REGIONAL ROLE, AND THEN THE OPERATOR
7 ROLE. AND THEN IT TALKS ABOUT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
8 FRAMEWORK.

9

10 **ROBERT POWERS:** CHAIRPERSON, I'M HAPPY TO GET US GOING.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** MEMBER POWERS, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

13

14 **ROBERT POWERS:** LET ME START BY THANKING THE TEAM, UNDER
15 SCHRUTI AND GUY. I THOUGHT IT WAS FRAMED UP QUITE NICELY. I
16 REALLY DID. MY TEAM PUTTING TOGETHER DECKS, AND FOR DIFFERENT
17 PROGRAMS AND DIFFERENT PROJECTS. I KNOW YOU KIND OF NAILED IT
18 ON THIS ONE. I WANTED TO GO BACK CHAIRPERSON MULLIGAN TO SLIDE
19 NINE.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** NETWORK MANAGEMENT. THERE YOU GO.

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS:** I WANT TO SAY A LITTLE BIT ABOUT SLIDE NINE
24 HERE, THE OTHER, WHEN I WAS LISTENING TO GUY WALK US THROUGH
25 THIS THING, THE OTHER THING THAT WE AS OPERATORS TALK ABOUT,



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 AND IT DOESN'T MATTER IF IT'S POWER WITH BART OR TUMLIN IS
2 SFMTA, A LOT OF OUR DAY IS ON SYSTEM PERFORMANCE, RIGHT,
3 PERFORMANCE OF THE SYSTEMS, ON TIME PERFORMANCE, IT'S WHETHER
4 WE'RE ON SCALE OR NOT, OR WHETHER WE'RE MISSING RUNS, AND
5 STAFF TO, CALLS IN SICK, AND I THINK THE CONCEPT OR TERM
6 SYSTEM PERFORMANCE MIGHT FIND ITSELF IN ONE OF THESE BOXES UP
7 THERE AT SOME POINT, I WOULD LEAVE THAT TO GUY AND SCHRUTI, I
8 AM ALWAYS CONCERNED ABOUT SYSTEM PERFORMANCE AND FOR YOUR
9 CONSIDERATION AS THE DISCUSSION GOES AND FOR GUY'S
10 CONSIDERATION THERE. AND THEN ON SLIDE TEN, I WANTED TO TEE
11 UP, MAYBE FOR GUY AND FOR THE MTC FOLKS HERE, IS OVER ON THE
12 RIGHT, UNDER THE REGIONAL ROLE, AGAIN, I'M AN OPERATOR, BUT
13 THE CONCEPT OF CREATE IMPLEMENTATION PLANS, THIS'S UNDER ONE
14 ON THE RIGHT COLUMN THERE, SIR. WE -- YOU KNOW, THAT PROBABLY
15 WARRANTS A BIT OF A DISCUSSION AT SOME POINT, WHETHER IT'S NOW
16 OR LATER. BUT, YOU KNOW, CONCEPTUALLY, I LIKE THE SLIDE, AND
17 THE LIKE THE DIRECTION IT'S GOING IN, AND I LIKE, YOU KNOW.
18 GUY, YOU STARTED WITH THE TERM MOMENTUM, YOU GOT TO HAVE
19 SOMETHING GOING TO KEEP MOMENTUM WE ARE GOING IN THE RIGHT
20 DIRECTION AND THAT'S A GOOD THING. CREATING UPON
21 IMPLEMENTATION, THAT'S CERTAINLY THE REGIONAL ROLE AND IT'S,
22 SORT OF, HYBRID, CHAIRPERSON MULLIGAN. SO, YOU KNOW, THAT
23 MIGHT BE SOMETHING THAT AS SOMEBODY'S TAKING NOTES HERE, THEY
24 JUST MADE ON NOTE O AS GUY WAS WALKING THROUGH THE SLIDES, AND
25 JUST SOME THOUGHTS ON SLIDES 9 AND 10.



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, BOB. MR. TUMLIN?

3

4 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** COUPLE OF ADDITIONAL THOUGHTS ON 9 AND 10.

5 NUMBER NINE ON IMPROVING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE I WONDER IF WE

6 SHOULD INCLUDE SOME THINKING AROUND INCREASING RIDERSHIP,

7 ATTRACTING CRITICAL FUNDING, WHICH I THINK WE NEED TO BE

8 TALKING A LOT MORE ABOUT, AND, IN ADDITION, ADVANCING EQUITY

9 SPECIFICALLY BY PROVIDING BETTER SERVICE TO COMMUNITIES WITH

10 THE FEWEST MOBILITY CHOICES AND PROVIDING BETTER TRANSIT

11 AFFORDABILITY TO THOSE WITH THE LOWEST INCOMES. AND THEN ON

12 SLIDE TEN, THIS IS JUST A MINOR ASIDE, BUT SOMETHING WE DO

13 NEED TO BE THINKING ABOUT AS WE START THINKING ABOUT

14 STRUCTURES, UNDER BUS TRANSIT PRIORITY, TWO KEY PLAYERS

15 INCLUDE CALTRANS AND BATA, THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY, WE

16 WILL WANT TO MAKE SURE WE SUNDAY EXACTLY HOW THEY ARE INVOLVED

17 IN THE STRUCTURE AND DECISION-MAKING ABOUT PRIORITIZING

18 TRANSIT ON THE REGIONAL NETWORK. OTHERWISE, I THOUGHT THIS WAS

19 GREAT WORK.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS JEFF. THE NEXT HAND I SEE UP IS

22 CAROLYN GONOT.

23

24 **CAROLYN GONOT:** YES. THANK YOU. ON SLIDE NINE, IF WE COULD GO

25 BACK REAL QUICKLY. THANKS FOR MOVING THE SLIDES AROUND. THE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 ONE THING, FOR ME, AND I THINK YOU HEAR A LOT ABOUT IT, BUT
2 SOMETIMES IT GETS LOST A LITTLE BIT IS THESE EFFICIENCIES THAT
3 WE HAVE, UNLOCK THE EFFICIENCIES. I JUST -- I THINK, TO
4 JEFFREY TUMLIN'S POINT, MEMBER TUMLIN'S POINT, THIS IS
5 ACTUALLY REALLY IMPORTANT FOR US TO BE ABLE TO GENERATE
6 FUNDING, AS WELL, OR POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES, IS, THERE IS
7 SUCH A LOT OF DISCUSSION AROUND HOW EFFICIENT IS OUR SYSTEM.
8 SO, I THINK TO UNLOCK THOSE EFFICIENCIES WOULD BE GOOD. I
9 DON'T KNOW WHETHER REDUCING TIME SPENT ON COORDINATION
10 ACTIVITIES IS SOMETHING THAT MIGHT HAPPEN. WE MIGHT NEED TO
11 SPEND MORE, BUT THOSE COORDINATION ACTIVITIES MAY, YOU KNOW,
12 ALLOW FOR ADDITIONAL EFFICIENCIES IN THE OPERATION. SO I THINK
13 THOSE ARE THINGS THAT WE NEED TO CONSTANTLY BE AWARE OF. AND
14 THEN, OVERALL, ON THE SECOND SLIDE, SLIDE TEN, I -- I -- I DO
15 LIKE THIS. THE SLIDE. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE, AND I KNOW WE
16 HAVE HAD DISCUSSION ABOUT IDENTIFYING REGIONAL TRANSIT GAPS TO
17 CREATE CMP, I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS I WANT TO MAKE SURE IS
18 WE HAVE IDENTIFY THOSE CRITICAL REGIONAL TRANSIT GAPS. WE'RE
19 ALWAYS GOING TO HAVE SOME, BUT THOSE ARE REALLY ABSOLUTELY
20 IMPORTANT TO THE POPULATION OF THE BAY AREA TO BE ABLE TO GET
21 AROUND, I THINK THAT'S SO CRITICAL AND THOSE THAT NEED
22 TRANSIT, I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO ME. AND THEN IN
23 THAT, ALSO, IN THAT CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING IS, AND IN BUS
24 TRANSIT PRIORITY THAT WE REALLY LOOK AT HOW THOSE CONNECTIONS
25 ARE. I DON'T WANT TO GET, SORT OF, FORGOT ABOUT IT AT VTA



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 WE'RE A BIG COUNTY THAT'S RUNNING A LOT OF SAME SYSTEM
2 OPERATIONS BUT IT DOESN'T MEAN NECESSARILY CONNECTED AS WELL
3 AS COULD BE BECAUSE OF OTHER PLAYERS THAT WE'RE GOING TO SERVE
4 OUR FUNDING CAPABILITIES OR WHATEVER WE'RE DOING SO I JUST
5 THINK IT WILL BE GOOD TO LOOK AT REGIONAL TRANSIT GAPS NOT
6 JUST SYSTEM BY SYSTEM AND GOOD TRANSIT AND ROUTE OPTIONS TO
7 PEOPLE IN THESE MARKETS THAT CAN BE DONE BETTER.

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** I'LL CALL MICHELLE BOUCHARD, AND ADINA
10 LEVIN WHO IS IN THE ROOM, THEN JIM WUNDERMAN, AND CHRISTINE
11 FITZGERALD. -- MICHELLE.

12

13 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** THIS IS ABSOLUTELY IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION.
14 I WANT TO KEY OFF OF SOMETHING THAT BOB POWERS SAID, WHEN HE
15 WAS MAKING HIS COMMENTS, AND, SO, THE QUESTION IS WE TALK
16 ABOUT PERFORMANCE, YOU KNOW, I WOULD WANT US TO, AS WE LOOK AT
17 THESE TWO SLIDES TO IDENTIFY, YOU KNOW, WHAT WOULD WE CONSIDER
18 A SUCCESS. SO, I THINK I WANT US TO THINK ABOUT KPIS, HOW WE
19 MEASURE THE EFFECTIVENESS, AND HOW WE MEASURE HOW EFFICIENT
20 CERTAIN POLICIES ARE. AND, I GUESS, HOW THAT KEYS INTO THE
21 ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES WOULD BE, YOU KNOW, WHAT GROUP IS
22 RESPONSIBLE FOR THE MARKET OF HOW EFFECTIVE THE PROGRAMS HAVE
23 BEEN. I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO HAVE THAT FEEDBACK WE
24 HAVE ACCOUNTED FOR. WHEN WE ANTICIPATE PUTTING THIS STRUCTURE
25 IN PLACE. I REALLY DO LIKE FOCUS ON THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE.



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 IT CAN'T BE STATED ENOUGH, THAT'S ONE OF THE KEY REASONS WHY
2 WE'RE DOING THIS, AND, AGAIN, REALLY DO WANT TO FOCUS ON WHEN
3 WE TALK ABOUT INCREASING RIDERSHIP, SO MAYBE THAT'S IN THE --
4 ON SLIDE NINE, IN THE FIRST BOX. YOU KNOW, DEFINITELY FOCUSING
5 ON THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT TYPES OF RIDERS, BE IT THE SHORT
6 TRIPS OR THE LARGER REGIONAL TRIPS THAT REALLY WILL BE
7 DEPENDENT ON US IDENTIFYING GAPS AND IMPLEMENTING THESE
8 REGIONAL POLICIES THAT ARE BEST FOR THE CUSTOMER. SO, JUST
9 SOME GENERAL THOUGHTS ON THESE TWO SLIDES. BUT, OVERALL, I'M
10 REALLY APPRECIATIVE OF THE WORK. I THINK IT'S TAKEN A LOT TO
11 DISTILL INTO BITE SIZE PIECES. IT'S OFTEN DIFFICULT FOR ME TO
12 UNDERSTAND THESE THINGS, AND I HAVE A CLEARER UNDERSTANDING. I
13 APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU, CHAIR MULLIGAN. APPRECIATE THE
14 OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** ADINA?

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** I THINK THIS IS OVERALL VIEW IT'S DOING A LOT OF
19 GOOD THINGS WHERE I AGREE WITH AND SUPPORT WHAT HAS ALREADY
20 BEEN SAID, AND IN PARTICULAR, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S GOOD
21 HERE IS HIGHLIGHTING THE INTERSECTIONS BETWEEN THESE DIFFERENT
22 FUNCTIONAL AREAS, THAT WAS SOMETHING THEY BELIEVE I HAD ASKED
23 FOR IN THIS ANALYSIS, AND I'M GLAD THAT IT'S SHOWING THOSE
24 INTERSECTIONS AND WHEN IT COMES TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR
25 STAFFING, I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE EXTREMELY HELPFUL IN TERMS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 OF BOTH EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY. THE CONCERNS AND
2 SUGGESTIONS THAT I'M GOING TO HAVE ARE GOING TO BE AT A NEXT
3 LEVEL OVER IN TERMS OF WHO DOES WHAT, AND HOW THAT
4 APPORTIONMENT OF WHO DOES WHAT WILL EFFECTIVELY ACHIEVE THE
5 GOALS. LET'S SEE IF I HAVE ANYMORE COMMENTS. ON THIS. NOPE.

6

7 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, ADINA. NEXT UP I BELIEVE IS
8 MIKE HURSH? NO. JIM WUNDERMAN.

9

10 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** OKAY. HEY, THANKS. AND APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK
11 THAT'S GONE INTO THIS. AND GUY'S PRESENTATION. AND YOU KNOW,
12 THERE'S -- THERE'S A LOT TO UNPACK. YOU KNOW, LET ME SAY, YOU
13 KNOW, I HAVE NOTHING THEY SAY SHOULD BE TAKEN TO UNDERMINE OR
14 UNDERESTIMATE THE VALUE I SEE IN THE WORK THAT THE OPERATORS
15 DO. YOU KNOW? IT'S HARD WORK. YOU'RE GOING THROUGH A REALLY
16 HARD TIME. I KNOW EVERYBODY WHO HAS THE JOB OF RUNNING ONE OF
17 OUR SYSTEMS IS -- YOU KNOW, IT'S VERY DEMANDING AND YOU HAVE
18 TO BE MISSION DRIVEN JUST TO WAKE UP EVERY DAY AND DO IT AND
19 DO IT WELL, AND I THINK WHAT BOB POWERS SAID REALLY UNDER
20 SCORED WHAT'S ON THE MIND OF OPERATORS EVERY SINGLE DAY IS
21 GETTING THAT SERVICE OUT, AND MAKING SURE THERE IS ENOUGH
22 DRIVERS AND THE EQUIPMENT IS RUNNING AND DEALING WITH STUFF
23 THAT YOU WEREN'T PLANNING TO HAVE HAPPEN THAT HAPPENED. YOU
24 KNOW? ALL OF THAT. SO, YOU KNOW, PLEASE KNOW THAT I HAVE DEEP
25 RESPECT FOR WHAT YOU DO. I THINK, IN GENERAL, I'M A LITTLE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 DISAPPOINTED IN WHERE WE ENDED UP-TO-DATE. AND, YOU KNOW, I
2 THINK WE SPENT A LOT OF TIME TO GET TO A PLACE MAYBE WE COULD
3 HAVE GOTTEN TO MAYBE A YEAR AND A HALF AGO, IF THIS IS WHERE
4 WE'RE GOING. IT'S NOT TO SAY THAT IT ISN'T PROGRESS, BUT, YOU
5 KNOW, I DON'T SEE IT AS BEING A MATERIAL SHIFT IN THE WAY THE
6 REGION PUTS FORWARD ITS TRANSIT SYSTEM, WHICH IS WHAT I WAS
7 HOPING FOR. AND YOU KNOW, TO THE SLIDE, YOU KNOW IF YOU KIND
8 OF LOOK AT -- YOU KNOW, I DON'T REALLY -- I DON'T DISAGREE
9 THAT THE REGIONAL ENTITY SHOULD SET THE VISION, DEVELOP
10 REGIONAL POLICIES AND ALL OF THAT. ON THE OTHER SIDE MTC IS
11 HAVING THAT REGIONAL VISION SETTING ROLE, THAT MAKES SENSE.
12 WITH THIS ONE OPERATOR ROLE, IT SAYS OPERATORS WILL BE HIGHLY
13 INVOLVED IN REGIONAL DECISION-MAKING. THAT'S PROBABLY FAIR
14 ENOUGH. AND PROVIDING LOCAL STAKEHOLDER PERSPECTIVES; FAIR
15 ENOUGH. BUT YOU KNOW, I KIND OF THINK REGIONALISTS SHOULD BE
16 INVOLVED IN OPERATOR DECISIONS. SO, I THINK THE COROLLARY
17 SHOULD, ALSO, BE TRUE. I THINK WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DEAL WITH
18 HERE IS THE FACT THAT YOU FOLKS WANT TO RUN YOUR SYSTEM, LIKE
19 BOB POWERS SAID. YOU KNOW, I WAKE UP IN THE MORNING, I RUN MY
20 SYSTEM, MY SYSTEM IS GOING TO FUNCTION; AND THAT'S WHAT I DO.
21 SO, THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. BUT IT LEAVES BEHIND THE NEED FOR
22 COORDINATION, FOR COLLABORATION FOR ASSOCIATION AND CHANGE.
23 YOU KNOW? MATERIAL CHANGE. IT'S REALLY EASY FOR AN OPERATOR TO
24 SAY, WELL, MY CONSTITUENTS HERE ON GEARY OR ON INTERNATIONAL
25 BOULEVARD, OR ON, YOU KNOW, NAME IT, WANT THIS. AND THEY HAVE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 A RIGHT TO THAT. BUT, WHO SPEAKS FOR THE REGION? WHO SPEAKS
2 FOR THE REGION? SO, THE IDEA OF THE NETWORK MANAGER, I
3 THOUGHT, WAS SUPPOSED TO DO THAT. WAS SUPPOSED TO MAKE YOU
4 FEEL A LITTLE BIT UNCOMFORTABLE. WE'RE SUPPOSED TO FORCE YOUR
5 HAND A BIT TO SAY, HEY LOOK, WE'RE DOING THIS BUT WE'RE REALLY
6 DOING THAT, AND WE GOT TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO DO THAT TOGETHER.
7 THIS SOUNDS TO ME MORE LIKE WE'RE KIND OF OVERLOOKING THAT, IN
8 GENERAL, IN THIS SLIDE, AND STUFF TO COME. AS I SAID EARLIER
9 I'M GOING TO HAVE TO BUG OUT AT 3:00. I CAN SEE THE DIRECTION
10 THIS IS GOING AND WE HAVE PUT A LOT OF TIME INTO IT. SO, THERE
11 IS A LOT OF STUFF ON THE TABLE RIGHT NOW IN THE BAY AREA, BOTH
12 IN TRANSIT AND IN OTHER AREAS THAT WE'RE NOT GOING THROUGH A
13 PRETTY GOOD TIME HERE, AND THE FUTURE FOR THE BAY AREA, I
14 THINK, IS VERY MUCH A QUESTION MARK NOW. AND THIS'S GOING TO
15 AFFECT YOU, AND YOU'RE GOING TO AFFECT IT. SO, THIS MAY NOT BE
16 THE BIGGEST FISH TO FRY AT THIS POINT. YOU GOT, YOU KNOW,
17 FISCAL CLIFFS COMING, AND YOU HAVE GOT SOME REAL PROBLEMS, AND
18 I THINK WE THOUGHT THIS COULD BE THE MOMENT. BUT BASED ON WHAT
19 I'M SEEING THERE IS A PLAN TO GO TOWARDS THE FUTURE BUT I
20 ALSO, SORT OF, BELIEVE WHEN WE GET TO THIS SPOT AND WE SAY
21 THIS IS HOW WE'RE GOING TO DO IT, I HAVE A FEELING WE'RE GOING
22 TO MOVE ON TO SOME OTHER STUFF. AND THERE IS ONLY SO MANY 2
23 AND 3 HOUR MEETINGS THAT I CAN ATTEND, AND MAYBE PUSH THIS
24 ENVELOPE AND MAYBE OTHERS CAN CHIME IN. BUT YOU GET THE GIST
25 OF WHAT I'M SAYING. THERE IS A LOT OF GOOD WORK HERE, IT



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 REFLECTS IMPROVEMENT I LOVE ALL THE PEOPLE INVOLVED AND YOUR
2 COMMITMENT TO WHAT YOU DO, BUT I REMAIN CONCERNED THAT WE'RE
3 NOT DOING IT, YOU KNOW? THERE IS NOT ENOUGH OF AN ENFORCING
4 ELEMENT HERE TO REALLY ADDRESS SOME OF THE NEEDS FROM THE
5 PUBLIC PERSPECTIVE IF WE'RE REALLY TO GO OUT AND ASK THEM TO
6 SUPPORT A MAJOR FUNDING REGIONAL SCALE FUNDING MEASURE. SO,
7 THANK YOU.

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS JIM. AND I APPRECIATE YOU
10 HIGHLIGHTING YOUR CONCERNS. THAT'S WHY WE'RE ALL HERE IS TO
11 KIND OF HEAR EACH OTHER OUT. NEXT UP, IF I CALL IN ORDER, IS,
12 I BELIEVE, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD, WHO IS NOT IN THE ROOM.

13

14 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** I AM VIRTUAL. I AM HERE. CAN YOU HEAR
15 ME?

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** YES, PLEASE GO AHEAD CHRISTINE.

18

19 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. SO, I
20 COULDN'T AGREE MORE THAN WHAT HAS ALREADY BEEN SAID. AND I
21 WOULD LIKE TO GIVE A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE, IN THE
22 SENSE THAT, LIKE ANY BUSINESS, YOU'RE LOOKING AT THE WIDGET
23 AND YOU'RE TRYING TO FIND THE SWEET SPOT BETWEEN WHAT YOU HAVE
24 TO SELL AND WHAT YOU'RE WILLING TO LET YOUR PRODUCT GO FOR.
25 WHAT I WOULD LIKE EVERYBODY HERE TO THINK ABOUT IS, WHEN YOU



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 ARE LOOKING AT SOMETHING, LIKE, THE TRAPEZE PROGRAM, WHICH
2 REGULATES EVERYTHING THAT WE DO IN PARATRANSIT LAND, FROM PICK
3 UPS AND DROP-OFFS, AND NUMBER OF PEOPLE ON THE LINE, ET
4 CETERA, ET CETERA. BUT THAT, TOO, IS A SWEET SPOT FINDING
5 PROCESS. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SUGGEST IS THAT WHEN LOOKING AT
6 THIS, SEEING THE CUSTOMER IS ALWAYS RIGHT -- I THINK THAT'S A
7 DANGEROUS THING, BUT CLOSE TO ALWAYS RIGHT -- BUT REALLY
8 LOOKING AT WHETHER OR NOT YOU KEEP A ROUTE OR CHANGE A ROUTE
9 OR ADD SOME STOPS, OR REDUCE SOME STOPS, OR MAKE IT INTO A
10 LIMITED STOP TRANSIT, WHATEVER IT IS, WE DO IT IN A WAY THAT
11 FOLKS WHO CAN'T WALK SUPER LONG DISTANCES OR HAVE SUPER LONG
12 DISTANCES TO GO AS OF RIGHT NOW -- I'M THINKING OF ALL THE
13 PEOPLE WHO MIGHT BE USING, IN HOTELS, EVERYDAY HOTEL, AND
14 RESTAURANTS, AND SO FORTH, AND HAVING IRREGULAR HOURS, WE NEED
15 TO PAY ATTENTION TO WHAT FOLKS IN THESE SITUATIONS NEED TO
16 HAVE TO GET TO AND FROM WORK SAFELY, BUT ALSO IN A TIMELY
17 MANNER, SO THEY DON'T INCUR PROBLEMS, AND THEIR POSSIBLE
18 FIRINGS, LET'S NOT -- LET'S MAKE SURE WE BALANCE EVERYTHING
19 AND MAKING EVERYTHING EQUITABLE, FINANCIALLY, BUT ALSO IN
20 ACCESSIBILITY. ACCESSIBILITY IS MORE WATCH WORD EVERY DAY OF
21 MY LIFE. SO I JUST WANTED TO PUT THAT OUT THERE. AND, YEAH,
22 THANKS SO MUCH.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS CHRISTINE FOR PUTTING THAT OUT
25 THERE. FOR THE FOLKS LISTENING IN, SHE MENTIONED TRAPEZE,



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 THAT'S A SCHEDULING PROGRAM FOR PARATRANSIT OPERATORS, AS WELL
2 AS SOME SMALL TRANSIT OPERATORS UNTIL RECENTLY AND REALLY
3 LARGE TRANSIT OPERATORS. VICE CHAIR.

4

5 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** WHEN I FIRST LOOKED AT THE
6 PROPOSAL, MY QUESTION FROM THE STANDPOINT FROM AT THE HIGHEST
7 LEVEL, WE SET OUR VISION THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA, AND IT
8 LOOKS TO ME LIKE WE'RE, SORT OF, TAKING THE CONCEPT THAT MTC
9 IS THE BODY THAT EXISTS IN THE REGION TO ESTABLISH THE VISION
10 FOR THE REGION, AND, SORT OF, CARRYING THAT FORWARD INTO THIS
11 CONSTRUCT. SO, WHAT I HAVE BEEN LOOKING FOR IS HOW DOES IT --
12 YOU KNOW, HOW DOES THIS NEW STRUCTURE HELP US KIND OF CLOSE
13 THE GAPS THAT WE HAVE HAD BETWEEN TRYING TO IDENTIFY A VISION
14 FOR THE REGION AND ACTUALLY EFFECTUATE A VISION FOR THE
15 REGION. AND WHEN I FIRST LOOKED AT THIS SLIDE TEN, I FELT LIKE
16 SEEING THINGS LIKE CREATE IMPLEMENTATION PLANS IMPLEMENT
17 REGIONAL PROGRAMS, DID THAT ACTUALLY MOVE IN THE DIRECTION OF
18 FILLING OUT THE SET OF RESPONSIBILITIES AND TASKS THAT WERE
19 NECESSARY TO CLOSE THE GAP SO THIS FELT TO ME LIKE IT WAS
20 MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. I ECHO WHAT JIM WAS RAISING, I
21 THINK WE ARE WELL SET UP IN THE REGION TO HAVE THE VOICE OF
22 SPECIFIC COMMUNITIES REPRESENTED. SO, WE HAVE MULTIPLE TRANSIT
23 SYSTEMS AND WE HAVE STRUCTURES THAT ALLOW US TO SERVE THE
24 NEEDS OF OUR COMMUNITIES, ACCORDING TO, SORT OF, THE GEOGRAPHY
25 OF THOSE TRANSIT SYSTEMS. WHAT WE DON'T REALLY HAVE IS WHAT



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 JIM WAS REFERRING TO AS THE VOICE OF THE REGION FROM AN
2 INSTITUTIONALIZED STANDPOINT. AND I APPRECIATE THAT WHAT WE'RE
3 LOOKING AT HERE IS, SORT OF, A SHORT-TERM PROPOSAL. I THINK IT
4 DOES A REALLY NICE JOB OF BUILDING ON WHAT OUR EXISTING
5 STRENGTHS AND CAPACITIES ARE, AND I WANT TO COMMEND YOU ALL
6 FOR THAT. BUT I'M NOT SURE THAT FROM A LONGER TERM PERSPECTIVE
7 I SEE HOW WE ARE GETTING TO THE POINT WHERE WE ARE REALLY
8 REGIONALIZING OUR ABILITY TO BRING THE VOICE OF THE REGION
9 INTO AN INSTITUTIONALIZED, SUSTAINED STRUCTURE. AND SO THAT'S
10 SOMETHING THEY WOULD LOVE TO EXPLORE MORE THROUGH THIS
11 CONVERSATION AS WE MOVE FORWARD.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALICIA. NEXT UP IS BILL
14 CHURCHILL.

15

16 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU. AT THE RISK OF BEING A LITTLE BIT
17 REPETITIVE, I WOULD LIKE TO THANK YOU FOR THIS SLIDE DECK AND
18 HOW COMPLETE IT IS, AND MORE IMPORTANTLY THE TIMING WHICH WE
19 RECEIVED IT. IT GAVE ME OPPORTUNITY TO RUN APPROXIMATE BY THE
20 SMALL OPERATORS AND REALLY GAINED SOME INSIGHTS FROM THEM, AND
21 IN THE PAST THAT'S BEEN SOMEWHAT CHALLENGING. SO I JUST WANTED
22 TO EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION FOR SO THAT IT DID JUST PROVIDE
23 THAT OPPORTUNITY FOR US. WHICH I THINK IS SO VALUABLE. YOU
24 KNOW, INTERESTING, AND MAYBE IN CONTRAST TO JIM'S COMMENTS, I
25 THINK THIS DOES MAKE, AT LEAST, THE SMALL OPERATORS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 UNCOMFORTABLE. WE'RE NOT COMFORTABLE WITH THIS. WE RECOGNIZE
2 THERE IS POTENTIAL EROSION OF AUTHORITY THAT GOES ON WITHIN
3 SPECIFIC SMALL OPERATORS, YET AT THE SAME TIME I THINK THERE
4 IS RECOGNITION ACROSS THE SMALL OPERATORS THAT MOVING IN THIS
5 DIRECTION IS IMPORTANT. I THINK IT CAPTURES THE VARIOUS
6 COMPONENTS. IT ALSO IS LEVERAGING PROGRESS WE HAVE ALREADY
7 MADE ON A NUMBER OF FRONTS. AND THAT, SORT OF, CATAPULTS US
8 FORWARD A LITTLE BIT FASTER THAN OTHERWISE WOULD HAVE BEEN.
9 AND I THINK ONE OF THE PRIMARY CONCERNS EXPRESSED TO ME BY MY
10 FELLOW SMALL OPERATORS IS THE FACT THAT THERE REALLY ISN'T
11 FUNDING REPRESENTED IN HERE. SO UNDER TAKEAWAYS EACH ONE OF
12 THESE CATEGORIES IN ORDER TO GET WHERE WE WANT IS GOING TO
13 COST SIGNIFICANT MONEY. WE CURRENTLY LIVE WITHIN A FINANCIALLY
14 CONSTRAINED WORLD. WE'RE NOT ABLE DO ALL THE THINGS THAT WE
15 WANT TO DO IN OUR OWN LOCALITY LET ALONE SOME OF THE REGIONAL
16 PROJECTS THAT WE KNOW ARE IMPORTANT. SO I THINK THIS NEEDS TO
17 BE RECOGNIZED SOMEWHERE IN HERE THAT ADDITIONAL REVENUES ARE
18 GOING TO BE NECESSARY TO BE ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD SUCCESSFULLY.
19 AND NOTED BY SMALL OPERATORS AND COMMENTS, IS WHY ARE WE DOING
20 THIS. ONE OF THE MAIN FUNDAMENTAL REASONS IS INCREASING
21 RIDERSHIP AND EQUITY. AND WE DIDN'T SEE THAT DEMONSTRATED
22 THROUGH THESE TWO SLIDES AND/OR THE MISSION, NOT TO JUMP
23 FORWARD, CHAIR MULLIGAN, BUT WE WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT
24 WAS, SORT OF, AN UNDERPINNING ALL THE WAY THROUGH THE
25 DOCUMENT. THANK YOU.



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, BILL. MIKE HURSH?

3

4 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANKS CHAIR MULLIGAN. BEFORE I THANK THE
5 CONSULTANTS FOR AN EXCELLENT PRESENTATION. I WANT TO THANK MTC
6 FOR PULLING TOGETHER A HYBRID MEETING WHERE WE CAN SEE AND
7 HEAR EACH OTHER WHILE STILL BEING ACCESSIBLE TO THE PUBLIC.
8 THANKS WALLY AND THE ENTIRE MTC TEAM IT'S NICE BEING IN
9 PERSON. I WON'T TAKE UP MORE TIME, BUT JUST TO SAY THIS IS A
10 PRESENTATION THAT DELIVERS WHAT WE NEED. I THINK WE'RE FINALLY
11 TALKING ABOUT, WE HAVE MOVED FROM CONCEPT TO SOMEWHAT FACT
12 BASED AND GIVING US OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE FRANK DISCUSSION. WHAT
13 THIS PRESENTATION DOES FOR ME, IT TELLS ME THAT WE HAVE WHAT
14 THE NETWORK MANAGER, I THINK WE'RE CLOSE TO WHAT THE NETWORK
15 MANAGER WOULD BE IN THE EARLY STAGES OF A NETWORK MANAGER.
16 READING PUBLIC COMMENT THAT WAS SUBMITTED AND WHAT I HEARD
17 FROM OTHER STAKEHOLDERS IN THE COMMUNITY, I THINK WE STILL
18 HAVE A LOT TO DO IN WHO IS THE NETWORK MANAGER AND WHAT ARE
19 THE PARTICULARITIES BETWEEN TWO IS GOVERNANCE AND MTC AND
20 WHATEVER NETWORK MANAGER IS, AND I WOULD LIKE TO FOCUS AND GET
21 TO THE PROCESS QUESTION RELATED TO THAT. MY OVERARCHING
22 COMMENT IS ALWAYS LEAVING ASIDE THE COMMENT ABOUT FUNDING, BUT
23 THE FISCAL CLIFF I WOULD ASK THAT WHATEVER WE PUT FORWARD HAVE
24 A TITLE SIX REQUIREMENT, NOT A SUGGESTION BUT A REQUIREMENT,
25 THAT SAYS WHATEVER DECISION WE MAKE OR WHATEVER NETWORK



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 MANAGER ENTITY MAKES THAT THERE IS SPECIFIC ANALYSIS, MAYBE
2 IT'S TITLE SIX OR SIMILAR DATA THAT ESSENTIALLY PROVES WHETHER
3 OR NOT THE LOCAL RIDER IS HARMED BY A DECISION AND IT DOESN'T
4 MEAN WE DON'T DO IT. IT MEANS THAT WE UNDERSTAND THE EFFECT
5 AND POTENTIAL MITIGATIONS BEFORE WE MAKE THE DECISION. I WOULD
6 LIKE THAT TO BE A PILLAR OF REQUIREMENT FOR THIS BOLD THINKING
7 TO MOVE FORWARD AS A LOCAL REQUIRED THAT THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT
8 RIDER IS NOT FORGOTTEN AND ALSO GIVEN A VOICE AT THE TABLE.
9 THE PROCESS QUESTION I HAVE, IS I KNOW MY BOARD IS A LITTLE
10 NERVOUS, FRANKLY I'M A LITTLE NERVOUS PARTICIPATING IN THIS
11 PROCESS WITHOUT KNOWING WHAT ADOPTION OR HOW WE GET REALLY
12 INTO THE DETAILS. SO I WOULD ENCOURAGE WHETHER IT BE THE
13 CONSULTANT TEAM, MTC STAFF, I THINK THIS QUESTION OF
14 GOVERNANCE AND THE, QUITE FRANKLY, THE BALANCE OF POWER IS
15 WHAT THE QUESTION IS, NEEDS TO BE PUT IN FRONT OF AS MANY
16 BOARDS AS POSSIBLE, AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. BECAUSE QUITE
17 FRANKLY, ALL OF US OR AT LEAST THE GENERAL MANAGERS WORK FOR
18 THOSE BOARDS, AND THE BOARDS AND POLICY TODAY, AND I THINK WE
19 NEED CLEAR DIRECTION FROM OUR BOARDS TO BE ABLE TO GIVE THE
20 TASK FORCE, THE STUDY GROUP MEANINGFUL COMMENTS AND
21 SUGGESTIONS THAT COME FROM OUR ELECTED BOARDS AND DON'T
22 UNDERMINE OUR RELATIONSHIPS WITH OUR BOARD. SO I DON'T
23 NECESSARILY NEED A RESPONSE TODAY, BUT I CAN PRESENT TO MY
24 BOARD WHAT'S SAID HERE BUT I CAN'T ANSWER THE SPECIFIC
25 QUESTIONS FROM THE, IF YOU WILL, THE MTC POLICY MAKERS OR



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 THEIR CONSULTANTS. I YOU THINK JIM MADE A SUPER IMPORTANT
2 COMMENT. I LIKE THE PRESENTATION AND IT GIVES US THE STAIR-
3 STEP, I APOLOGIZE FOR NOT REMEMBERING THE SLIDE, BUT WE CAN'T
4 STOP HALFWAY UP THE STAIRS, AFTER WE GET TO THE FISCAL CLIFF
5 AFTER WE GET SOMETHING ADOPTED BY MTC, AFTER WE GET WHAT'S ON
6 SLIDE TEN, ALL OF WHAT'S ON SLIDE TEN ROLLING DOWN THE ROAD,
7 IF YOU WILL, WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE CONTINUE THIS VISION OF
8 WHAT THE NETWORK MANAGER FINAL MODEL IS. I DON'T KNOW WHAT
9 THAT IS BUT I AM ENCOURAGED BY THE PRESENTATION THAT GIVES US
10 MEAT AGAIN TO BE ABLE TO HAVE THIS MEANINGFUL CONVERSATION.
11 THANK YOU CHAIR MULLIGAN FOR TIME TO COMMENT.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** BEFORE WE MOVE TO THE NEXT AREA --
14 THERESE.

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** JUST A COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS, REINFORCING
17 THE THEMES HERE, ONE OF THE, AT LEAST FOR ME, LOOKING AT
18 FOUNDATIONAL CHANGE HERE IS AN ASSUMED SHIFT IN EMPHASIS AND
19 PRIORITY IN TERMS OF WHAT WE DO. AND IN THE PAST, I THINK --
20 AND WE POINTED TO, THERE IS ALWAYS GOING TO BE THIS TENSION
21 BETWEEN LOCAL ACTIVITIES, LOCAL FOCUS, LOCAL DELIVERY, AND,
22 QUOTE "REGIONAL "AND I THINK IS DOING TWO THINGS AND THIS IS
23 WHERE THE PIVOT IS CRITICAL. IS IDENTIFYING AREAS THAT IT'S
24 INDISPUTABLE THAT A REGIONAL APPROACH NEEDS BE TAKEN IN ORDER
25 TO BE SUCCESSFUL THAT'S WHY WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THE SIX AREAS,



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 AND FOCUSED ON ACKNOWLEDGING THAT IT CANNOT BE SUCCESSFUL
2 THROUGH SHEERLY A LOCAL LENS OF 27 DIFFERENT TRANSIT
3 OPERATORS. NOW WHAT DOES IT TAKE TO MAKE HEADWAY, AS A LARGE
4 PART OF WHAT WE SAW HERE, BUT ANOTHER THING THAT'S GOING TO BE
5 CRITICAL IN RECOGNIZING BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE SUFFICIENT
6 RESOURCES TO DO EVERYTHING TO AN OPTIMAL LEVEL EVEN IF WE GET
7 MORE NEW MONEY THERE'S ALWAYS GOING TO BE A LEVEL OF TRADEOFF,
8 AND NOW I THINK IT'S SUGGESTING THAT WHEN THERE ARE TRADEOFFS,
9 WHETHER IT'S DISCRETIONARY FUNDING DECISIONS OR DISCRETIONARY
10 OR RANKED INVESTMENT PRIORITIES, IT DOESN'T ALWAYS DEFAULT TO
11 THE LOCAL AND THEN WHATEVER'S LEFT GOES TO REGIONAL. I THINK
12 WE'RE SAYING NO. OUR POLICY BOARDS, AND THIS IS GOING TO BE
13 REALLY IMPORTANT NOT ONLY OURSELVES, BUT AS OPERATIONAL FOLKS,
14 YOU POINTED OUT, BOB, EVERY DAY YOU'RE DAY YOU'RE HAVING TO
15 MAKE THOSE DECISIONS AND THIS WOULD ALLOW YOU, US,
16 COLLECTIVELY, TO BE ABLE TO HAVE THOSE REGIONAL ACTIONS
17 SHOULDER TO SHOULDER, ON PAR WITH DELIVERING OTHER THINGS BUT
18 IT'S GOING TO BE CRITICALLY IMPORTANT FOR OUR POLICY BOARDS TO
19 OWN IT TOO. NOT CLEARLY ON THE COMMISSION LEVEL, I MEAN, LET'S
20 START THERE, BUT I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE ESPECIALLY IMPORTANT
21 THAT THE SHIFT IN EMPHASIS, THE FOCUS THAT ANY LOCAL RIDER MAY
22 ONE DAY NEED TO GO TO UCSF FOR THE SPECIALIST APPOINTMENT. MAY
23 NEED TO TAKE THEIR SON OR DAUGHTER TO AN INTERVIEW AT A
24 COLLEGE WHERE THEY HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED AND DON'T HAVE A CAR.
25 ANY RIDER THAT'S PARTICULARLY TRANSIT DEPENDENT MAY HAVE TO



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 HAVE, AND SHOULDN'T BE FORCED TO MAKE A CHOICE BETWEEN
2 REGIONAL AND LOCAL TRIP THEY NEED TO MAKE THE TRIP THEY NEED
3 TO DO AND I THINK THAT'S THE THINKING AND I WANTED TO OFFER MY
4 PERSPECTIVE ON 9 AND 10 WHAT WE NEED TO DO.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS GREAT. A LOT OF
7 GREAT THOUGHTS. JIM RAISED THE POINT ABOUT REGIONAL VOICE. IN
8 PARALLEL WITH THAT THERE IS MULTIPLE REGIONAL VOICES IN SOME
9 CORRIDORS. TRAVEL IN THE BAY BRIDGE CORRIDOR IS DOWN, IT'S
10 BART, WETA, AC TRANSIT, BART, AND SO WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT A
11 REGIONAL VOICE AND RESOURCES ARE TIGHT, WITH THIS ENTITY AS
12 PART OF ITS REGIONAL ROLE LOOKING AT REDUNDANCIES FURNISHINGS
13 WANT TO GO TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, DO YOU TAKE BART, AC
14 TRANSIT, WETA. AND SERVICE PARALLELS AND CAPACITY, WHEN YOU
15 TALK ABOUT REGIONAL ROLES AND ENOUGH RESOURCES AND HOW BOLD DO
16 FOLKS WANT TO BE. I DON'T THINK THERE IS ANY RIGHT ANSWER. I
17 THINK THERE ARE NEAR-TERM THINGS WE CAN DO AND WE NEED TO KEEP
18 GOING. RECOGNIZING RESOURCES ARE TIGHT AND IT'S GOING TO BE
19 THAT WAY FOR A WHILE. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT REGIONAL VOICES WE
20 NEED TO TALK ABOUT REDUNDANT SERVICES I KNOW AGENCIES DON'T
21 LIKE TO TALK ABOUT THAT EVEN THOUGH THEY SIT NEXT TO EACH
22 OTHER AT TIMES. IF WE CREATE A REGIONAL VOICE WE'RE GOING TO
23 TALK ABOUT THOSE CONVERSATIONS AT SOME POINT I DON'T KNOW THE
24 ANSWERS OR HOW WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH IT, BUT I WANT PEOPLE
25 TO REALIZE THAT AT SOME POINT WHERE THE RUBBER HITS THE ROAD



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 OR WHERE THE STEEL HITS THE RAIL OR THE HULL HITS THE WATER,
2 THAT THE REGION IS GOING TO -- SHOULD HAVE CONVERSATIONS ABOUT
3 THOSE MULTIPLE VOICES COMING TOGETHER AND HOW DO WE GET PEOPLE
4 INTO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO ASSUMING IT'S GOING TO BOUNCE BACK
5 IN THOSE 20,000 SALESFORCE TOWERS OF OFFICE SPACE ARE FILLED
6 IN THE COMING YEARS. THOSE ARE MY THOUGHTS ON THE FIRST SLIDE,
7 OR DISCUSSION AREA. AND MAYBE WE'LL PULL UP THE SECOND SLIDE
8 FROM 4B AGAIN. AND THANKS TO OUR BROADCAST TEAM FOR BEING SO
9 FLEXIBLE AND BOUNCING AROUND IN ALL OF THIS. AND THIS ONE, THE
10 SECOND AREA IS THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT REGION AND
11 VISION STATEMENT. SLIDE 13. AND THE QUESTION IS, DO THESE
12 STATEMENTS, ARE THEY ACTIVE, EFFECTIVE AND I THINK ONE OF THE
13 QUALIFYING QUESTIONS FROM ADINA BEFORE TALKED ABOUT THIS, AND
14 TO THE FOUR AREAS, MAYBE WE COULD PULL UP SLIDE 13, IS MAYBE I
15 COULD OPEN IT UP TO THE GROUP ON SLIDE 13 ABOUT THE
16 STATEMENTS. AND I'LL START WITH ADINA SINCE SHE'S GOT HER HAND
17 UP FIRST.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A PROCESS QUESTION. BECAUSE WE'RE GOING TO
20 LOSE MR. WUNDERMAN AT THREE, I'M WONDERING IF THERE WAS ANY OF
21 THE QUESTIONS THAT HE HAD THE MOST COMMENTS ON, AND WHETHER WE
22 SHOULD GO TO THAT TO MAKE SURE WE GET THE BULK OF HIS COMMENTS
23 WHILE HE'S HERE.

24



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THAT'S GREAT WHY DON'T WE DO THAT. IT
2 MAKES A LOT OF SENSE. AND MICHELLE HAS A HARD STOP. JIM, WHY
3 DON'T YOU GIVE US YOUR IDEAS ON ALL THE SLIDES.

4
5 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** WELL, THANKS. I -- YOU KNOW, I'M SORRY FOR
6 PUSHING IT TO BE OUT OF ORDER HERE. SO, I HAVE NO QUANDARIES
7 WITH THE MISSION AND VISION STATEMENT. I THINK THEY'RE PRETTY
8 SOLID, AND YOU CAN WORDSMITH ANYTHING, AND WE MAY DECIDE DO
9 THAT, BUT I THINK THEY GET AT THE CORE, YOU KNOW, CORE PURPOSE
10 OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. SO I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT. AS FAR
11 AS THE SLIDE THAT SPEAKS TO THE STRUCTURAL ISSUE. AGAIN, I
12 GUESS MY MAIN CONCERN IS THAT IT'S, YOU KNOW, YOU BASICALLY
13 HAVE A GROUP OF OPERATORS DECIDING, YOU KNOW, WHAT TO DO. AND,
14 I THINK, YOU KNOW, IT MENTIONS -- I'M NOT LOOKING AT THE SLIDE
15 -- BUT I THINK IT MENTIONS THAT IT, SORT OF, HAS THE CUSTOMERS
16 BENEATH THE OPERATORS, SORT OF, INFORMING THE OPERATORS WHO
17 SERVE AS, IN EFFECT, THE BOARD WITH MAYBE SOME FOLKS FROM MTC.
18 AND TO ME, THE OPERATORS ARE ACTUALLY THE CUSTOMERS OF THIS,
19 AS OPPOSED TO HEARING FROM THE CUSTOMERS. THEY'RE NOT THE ONLY
20 CUSTOMERS, BUT THEY'RE IMPORTANT CUSTOMERS OF THIS SYSTEM. SO,
21 YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, THE OPERATORS NEED TO
22 BE HEARD, BUT THEY SHOULDN'T REALLY CONTROL THE BOARD. MAYBE
23 BE REPRESENTED ON THE BOARD, BUT NOT CONTROL IT. I THINK THE
24 BOARD SHOULD BE MADE UP OF FOLKS WHO COME FROM DIFFERENT
25 POINTS OF VIEW AND WHO HAVE A REGIONAL MISSION AT HEART. YOU



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 KNOW? AND REALLY, REALLY THINK ABOUT THE REGION. EVEN THE MTC
2 BOARD, I THINK MTC HAS DONE A REASONABLY GOOD JOB OVER THE
3 YEARS OF DEALING WITH THIS, BUT YOU KNOW, THE PEOPLE -- THE
4 PEOPLE WHO SERVE ON MTC ACTUALLY REPRESENT DISTRICTS WITHIN
5 THE REGION, AND THEIR FIRST CONSIDERATION HAS TO BE THAT
6 DISTRICT. AND, SO, AGAIN, WHERE IS THE REGIONAL VOICE IN THE
7 BAY AREA? THE ECONOMY IS REGIONAL, AND YOU KNOW, I'M CONCERNED
8 ABOUT THE NEEDS OF THE PEOPLE WHO RIDE AND DEPEND ON TRANSIT
9 EVERY DAY. I AM SURE WE ALL ARE. BUT I'M ALSO CONCERNED ABOUT
10 THE PEOPLE WHO DON'T USE THE DAMN THING BECAUSE THEY CAN'T GET
11 TO FROM ONE PLACE TO ANOTHER. IT'S SO IMPORTANT FOR THE SYSTEM
12 AND YOU PUT THAT IN REALLY GOOD PERSPECTIVE, WHEN YOU TALK
13 ABOUT THE FACT THAT THE BAY BRIDGE IS AT CAPACITY, BUT THE
14 TRANSIT SYSTEMS AREN'T. THAT'S THE CHOICE. PEOPLE ARE TALKING
15 WITH THEIR FEET, AND THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT AND USING THEIR
16 FEET TO PUSH ON THE GAS PEDAL. SO IF WE WANT TO FIX THAT, WE
17 HAVE ACTUALLY TO TAKE THE SYSTEMS APPROACH TO IT AND MAKE
18 ADJUSTMENTS IN THE SYSTEM. AND, AGAIN, WHAT I SENSE IS THERE
19 IS A REINFORCING PATTERN HERE OF MAKING SURE THAT WE TAKE CARE
20 OF THE DAY-TO-DAY. AND I THINK THERESE MCMILLAN DID A
21 PHENOMENAL JOB OF EXPLAINING YOU CAN'T JUST DO ONE YOU HAVE
22 GOT TO DO BOTH DESPITE THE SHORTAGE OF RESOURCES DESPITE THE
23 PRESSURES ON THE SYSTEM IF WE'RE GOING TO SUCCEED HAVING A
24 REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT'S MIND'S EYE OF THE PUBLIC WHAT
25 WE REALLY WOULD LIKE TO HAVE. PERSONALLY, I WOULD ALWAYS USE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 TRANSIT. I LOVE USING TRANSIT. I WOULD ALWAYS USE IT AND USE
2 IT WHEN IT MAKES SENSE. BE UNFORTUNATELY, I DRIVE A LOT,
3 BECAUSE I TRAVEL THIS REGION, AND FOR SO MANY TRIPS I TAKE,
4 THERE JUST ISN'T A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT'S RELIABLE ENOUGH TO
5 WORK. SOME OF THAT WOULD REQUIRE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS WE'RE
6 NOT GOING TO SEE BUT A LOT OF IT IS CONNECTIVITY, A LOT OF IT
7 IS PLANNING AND SO FORTH. THE OTHER THING I'LL SAY IS, YOU
8 KNOW, I THINK OF THE SIX AREAS THAT ARE FOCUSED ON, THERE IS A
9 LOT OF EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS IN THOSE THINGS. I THINK, YOU
10 KNOW, ESPECIALLY, IF YOU LOOK AT FARES. IF WE REALLY WANT TO
11 FOCUS ON EQUITY, WE NEED TO DO SOMETHING ABOUT THE FARES SO
12 THAT THE PEOPLE WHO CAN AFFORD THEM, PEOPLE OF LIMITED MEANS.
13 AND I THINK WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY WITH THIS, NO MATTER WHO IS
14 ON THE BOARD, BUT YOU KNOW, I THINK THIS REALLY DOES GIVE US
15 AN OPPORTUNITY TO WORK ON HAVING A SYSTEM THAT'S -- THAT
16 PEOPLE CAN AFFORD TO USE, AND THAT COMPETES FOR WHATEVER
17 INCOME LEVEL WITH OTHER ALTERNATIVES. AGAIN, IT ALWAYS GETS
18 DOWN TO RESOURCES AND THOSE KINDS OF THINGS. I THINK YOU TAKE
19 MY POINT. SO, I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** JIM COULD I ASK YOU TO FOLLOW UP IF
22 IT'S NOT THE TRANSIT GM'S IT'S ANOTHER GROUP OF FOLKS, HOW ARE
23 THEY SELECTED? EVEN MTC COMMISSIONS ARE APPOINTED. THE MAYOR
24 OF SAN FRANCISCO, APPOINTS SOMEONE TO MTC. UNDER YOUR MODEL



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 SOMEONE WOULD HAVE TO APPOINT SOME FOLKS THAT ARE SOMEHOW
2 REPRESENTED THE FOLKS --

3

4 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION OF NEW
5 YORK GOVERNOR APPOINTS I THINK 20-SOMETHING MEMBER BOARD.
6 GOVERNOR APPOINTS SOME SEATS, PROBABLY A MAYOR DOES. THERE ARE
7 SOME SEATS FOR LABOR, THERE'S PROBABLY SOME SEATS FOR YOU
8 KNOW, SOME MAJOR SYSTEMS. SO, IT'S A MIX OF FOLKS. SOME OF THE
9 APPOINTED, SOME OF THEM MAYBE NOT. I DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO
10 THAT QUESTION AS TO HOW YOU GET THERE, BUT IT'S FOR
11 CONSIDERATION. HAVING A BOARD, THE GOVERNOR APPOINTS A LOT OF
12 BOARDS. I AM ONE OF HIS APPOINTEES; I SERVE ON THE TRANSIT
13 SYSTEM WETA, RIGHT. HE APPOINTS A LOT OF FOLKS. AND I REPORT
14 TO HIM. MY MISSION IS TO SATISFY THE STATE WITH REGARD TO A
15 REGIONAL TRANSIT AGENCY. TO SOME DEGREE IT PROBABLY KIND OF
16 MAKES SENSE. SO, THERE IS A LOT OF DIFFERENT WAYS TO THINK
17 ABOUT THAT THAT WE COULD THINK ABOUT IF WE WANT TO THINK ABOUT
18 IT.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** HAVE WE LOST MICHELLE? OR IS SHE STILL
21 WITH US?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SHE HAD TO DROP.

24



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** SORRY. WE SHOULD HAVE GOT HER SOONER.
2 ADINA, THANKS FOR THE SUGGESTION. WE'LL GO BACK TO SLIDE 13.
3 FOR THIS SLIDE, JIM. CONCERNS WERE ON LATER SLIDES, AND ADINA
4 HAD SOME CLARIFIED QUESTIONS THIS. I'M LOOKING FOR A SHOW OF
5 HANDS ON THIS SLIDE AND THE PROPOSED MISSION AND VISION. YES,
6 ADINA. MIC ON, PLEASE. THANKS ADINA.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. YOU CAN MEASURE HOW ABSENT MINDED I
9 AM. LIKE, THAT IS A NEUROLOGICAL TEST. THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
10 FORCE STATEMENT, I THOUGHT, WAS VERY GOOD. AND I THINK THAT WE
11 LOST SOMETHING IN THE TRANSLATION, AND SEVERAL PEOPLE
12 MENTIONED SOME REALLY IMPORTANT PRINCIPLES THAT COULD GET
13 WOVEN INTO A MISSION STATEMENT. AND I THINK THAT IF WE USE OUR
14 TIME TO WORDSMITH A MISSION STATEMENT WE WON'T GET TO SOME OF
15 THE THINGS THAT PEOPLE ARE STARTING TO WRESTLE WITH. SO, I
16 WOULD SUGGEST, AND I WOULD BE HAPPY TO PARTICIPATE, IN THERE
17 WERE A SUBCOMMITTEE WORKING ON TO REFINING THE COMMENTS AND
18 PRINCIPLES THAT PEOPLE HAVE MADE WITHOUT GETTING INTO
19 WORDSMITHING AND EATING UP OUR TIME TO TALK ABOUT OTHER
20 SUBSTANTIVE ISSUES.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** SO, THE PROPOSAL IS TO TREAT THIS
23 SECTION DIFFERENTLY THAN THE REST BECAUSE THIS COULD SUCK OF
24 TIME NEEDLESSLY. THERESE, YOUR THOUGHTS?

25



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THAT'S FINE. BUT MAYBE I WOULD OFFER THE
2 FOLLOWING AND THE TEAM COULD HELP ME OUT ON THIS. WHAT WE
3 ADOPTED EARLIER, COMING OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON, WAS FOR THE
4 TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN, AS A HUGE SIGNIFICANT FUND, AN
5 ELEMENT OF THE TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN IS THIS QUESTION
6 VERY SPECIFICALLY OF WHAT CARRIES IT OUT, THE REGIONAL NETWORK
7 MANAGEMENT FUNCTION. SO, I VIEWED THIS AS, SORT OF, A SUBSET.
8 IT DOESN'T REPLACE THE BROADER TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN
9 MISSION AND STATEMENT, BECAUSE THAT WAS COMING OUT OF THAT
10 WORK. BUT THIS, TO ME, WAS MAYBE MORE SPECIFIC VARIATION TO
11 THE RNM SPECIFICALLY. LET'S PUT IT THIS WAY. I WASN'T BOTHERED
12 BY THE FACT THAT IT WASN'T EXACTLY THE SAME BECAUSE I FELT IT
13 WAS CLEARLY RELATIONAL TO IT PICKING UP A DIFFERENT FOCUS FOR
14 THE RNM FUNCTION.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** VERY HELPFUL, THERESE. DO OTHERS WANT
17 TO WEIGH IN? BOB POWERS?

18

19 **ROBERT POWERS:** THIS SLIDE HERE, FROM BART'S PERSPECTIVE, WE'RE
20 GOOD WITH THE PROPOSED MISSION STATEMENT THE WAY IT IS AND
21 PROPOSED VISION STATEMENT, I THINK THEY WORK WELL TOGETHER AND
22 THEY MOVE THIS PROCESS FORWARD. SO, I WOULDN'T BE INCLINED TO
23 DEVIATE FROM THE PLAN THAT WE HAD SET FORTH TO LOOK AT THESE
24 METHODICALLY GO THROUGH THIS. AND I DON'T WANT TO HAVE A ONE-



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 OFF AND TAKE THIS SLIDE AND DO SOME WORDSMITHING AT SOME OTHER
2 TIME. I'M NOT ON BOARD WITH THAT PROPOSAL.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANKS. OTHERS? I DON'T SEE ANY
5 HANDS. WE'LL MOVE ON. THE TEAM HEARD A COUPLE OF COMMENTS ON
6 THAT, AND THEY CAN THINK ABOUT THAT. WHAT THEY HEARD IS THIS
7 ISN'T THE MOST IMPORTANT WAY TO SPEND OUR TIME. WE'LL GO TO
8 SLIDE 24. BEFORE WE DO THAT MAYBE WE'LL GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE,
9 4B. ONCE AGAIN, THANK YOU BROADCAST TEAM FOR JUMPING BACK AND
10 FORTH BETWEEN THE TWO PRESENTATIONS. SO, 4B, SECOND SLIDE,
11 AGAIN HELPS FRAME WHERE WE'RE AT, THE REGIONAL NETWORK
12 MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK A WHOLE HOST OF QUESTIONS ASSOCIATED WITH
13 THIS SLIDE, WHEN WE PULL IT UP, THERE WILL BE A LOT IN THIS
14 SLIDE, DOES THE COMPOSITION OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD ACCURATELY
15 REPRESENT THE PORTFOLIO OF THE REGIONAL INTEREST, THE REGIONAL
16 NETWORK MANAGEMENT NEEDS? AND WE HEARD FROM JIM WUNDERMAN
17 BEFORE HE HAD TO LEAVE FOR AN APPOINTMENT, THE QUESTION OF
18 COMPOSITION AND DIFFERING OPINIONS. ANOTHER QUESTION, DOES MTC
19 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT EXECUTIVE BOARD CAPABILITIES AND
20 PERSPECTIVES EFFECTIVELY COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER AND WHAT
21 CAPABILITIES WOULD BE MOST USEFUL FROM THE DEDICATED REGIONAL
22 NETWORK MANAGEMENT SUPPORT STAFF. RESPECT TO THE DECISION-
23 MAKING SHOULD THE REGIONAL NETWORK EXECUTIVE BOARD MAKE
24 DECISIONS BY CONSCIENCES OR VOTING. BY VOTING OR SHOULD IT BE
25 A SIMPLE MAJORITY SHOULD IT BE A SUPER MAJORITY. DECISION



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 RESOLUTION WORK IN THE FRAMEWORK. OTHERWISE COULD REALLOCATION
2 OF REGIONALLY DISTRIBUTED FUNDS USED TO HELP FUND THE REGIONAL
3 NETWORK MANAGEMENT EFFORT. WE HAVE A LOT OF STRONG OPINIONS
4 AROUND THAT. AND WE'LL PAUSE WHILE THE BROADCAST TEAM PULLS UP
5 SLIDE 24 FROM THE EARLIER AGENDA ITEM 4A. I KNOW THAT ALWAYS
6 TAKE A FEW MOMENTS AS THEY JUGGLE SCREENS AND STUFF. AND HERE
7 IT IS AND WHAT'S GREAT ABOUT SLIDE 24 IS THE QUESTIONS ARE
8 REITERATED OFF TO THE RIGHT SIDE. SO THERE IS A LOT HERE. I'LL
9 LOOK AROUND TO SEE WHO WISHES TO RAISE A HAND FIRST AND DROP
10 IN ON THIS SLIDE. AND I SEE JEFFREY TUMLIN IS THE WILLING
11 PERSON. JEFF, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

12

13 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** THANK YOU. THIS IS MY FAVORITE SLIDE. SO,
14 SPEAKING TO A LOT OF COMMENTS THAT HAVE COME UP FROM PRETTY
15 MUCH ACROSS THE BOARD AT THE TABLE HERE, WE ARE ALL FACING A
16 FISCAL CLIFF. WE'RE ALL LOOKING AT 20% OR MORE SERVICE CUTS
17 FOR MOST OF US SOMETIME IN 2025, SOME OF US SOONER, SOME OF US
18 LATER. AND THIS NEEDS TO BE TOP OF MIND IN EVERYTHING THAT WE
19 DO. WE HAVE TO GET MOVING, FAST. WE HAVE TO SHOW ACTION THAT
20 DEVELOPS TRUST WITH THE ELECTRIC AT. WE NOT ONLY NEED TO
21 FIGURE OUT HOW TO GET SOME SORT OF REGIONAL MEASURE ON THE
22 BALLOT. WE, ALL OF US, AND THE COUNTIES AND MUNICIPALITIES ALL
23 NEED TO BE PASSING OR REAUTHORIZING OUR LOCAL TAX MEASURES IN
24 ORDER TO MAKE THIS WORK. WE CANNOT BE RELIANT ON ONE SOURCE OF
25 FUNDING IN ORDER TO SURVIVE LET ALONE DO SOMETHING AMAZING. WE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 HAVE GOT DOZENS OF TAX MEASURES WE HAVE TO GET ACROSS THE
2 BOARD. IN SAN FRANCISCO WE WERE FORTUNATE TO REAUTHORIZE OUR
3 SALES TAX BUT FAILED AT REAUTHORIZATION OUR GENERAL OBLIGATION
4 BOND BECAUSE OF THE TWO THIRD'S REQUIREMENT. ANY ORGANIZED
5 OPPOSITION CAN TANK US ALONG THE WAY. WHAT I LIKE ABOUT THIS
6 PROPOSAL IS IT BUILDS ON OUR EXISTING SUCCESS AND ALLOWS US TO
7 IMMEDIATELY START MAKING PROGRESS ON MORE STUFF. IT IS ALSO
8 SCALABLE, IT STARTS AT INSTITUTIONS AND INCREMENTALLY SCALES
9 THEM UP IN ORDER TO DO MORE AND MORE AS WE DEMONSTRATE STAFF
10 CAPACITY AND GET ADDITIONAL FUNDING IN ORDER TO MOVE FORWARD.
11 A COUPLE OF THINGS TO POINT OUT. I WOULD ARGUE THE MOST
12 IMPORTANT PART OF THIS CHART IS THE COLUMN IN THE MIDDLE, THE
13 DEDICATED REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STAFF. AND THE MOST
14 IMPORTANT BOX ON THIS CHART IS THE DIRECTOR. THIS IS RADICAL.
15 FOR THE FIRST TIME, SOMEONE WOULD ACTUALLY BE IN CHARGE OF
16 LOOKING AFTER THE REGION AND MAKING SURE THAT EACH OF US LOCAL
17 OPERATORS ARE DOING WHAT WE'RE SUPPOSED TO BE DOING IN ORDER
18 TO TAKE CARE OF REGIONAL NEEDS. THAT ONE BOX IS PHENOMENAL.
19 AND BENEATH THOSE BOXES ARE ALSO, LIKE, A LITTLE BIT LESS
20 RADICAL BUT JUST AS IMPORTANT. THESE ARE THE PEOPLE WHO
21 ACTUALLY GET STUFF DONE. EVERY SINGLE GREAT THING THAT'S
22 ACCOMPLISHED IN THIS REGION IS ACCOMPLISHED BY STAFF. AND
23 RIGHT NOW, WE HAVE HAD, ACTUALLY, LIKE, WE HAVE ALL BEEN A
24 LITTLE SHOCKED AT HOW MUCH SUCCESS WE HAVE HAD, SIMPLY BY
25 STAFFING KEY MEASURES. THE PROGRESS THAT WE HAVE MADE ON



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 REGIONAL FARE INTEGRATION WAS FAR BETTER THAN I HAD THOUGHT
2 POSSIBLE AND THAT WAS IN LARGE PART BECAUSE WE STAFFED IT. WE
3 HAVE ALL BEEN KIND OF LOANING OUR EXISTING STAFF TO THIS
4 EFFORT AND WE HAVE REALIZED THAT IN ORDER GET STUFF MOVING, WE
5 NEED A PERSON IN CHARGE AND DEDICATED STAFF AND IT DOESN'T
6 HAVE TO BE A HUGE TEAM, IT CAN START SMALL AND GROW BIG. AND
7 THE REGIONAL MANAGEMENT DIRECTOR, THIS IS GOING TO BE THE
8 PERSON RESPONSIBILITY FOR DEVELOPING THE REGIONAL NETWORK PLAN
9 THE PERSON RESPONSIBLE FOR DEVELOPING THE TECHNICAL KEY
10 PERFORMANCE INDICATORS THAT ALL OF US ARE GOING TO BE
11 RESPONSIBLE FOR MEETING. THIS IS GOING TO BE THE PERSON WHO
12 TAKES NOT ONLY TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT BOARD, BUT
13 TO THE MTC COMMISSION, ADOPTION OF THE PLAN AND THE
14 PERFORMANCE METRICS THAT THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BOARD WILL
15 ULTIMATELY BE HELD ACCOUNTABLE FOR. AND SO THIS STARTS USING
16 EXISTING SUCCESSES TO ACTUALLY CREATE, I THINK, WHAT WE'RE ALL
17 LOOKING FOR WHICH DOESN'T REQUIRE CONSTRUCTING SOME NEW
18 PARALLEL TO MTC REGIONAL BUREAUCRACY. I HAVE BUILT
19 BUREAUCRACIES, THEY TAKE YEARS TO CREATE, YEARS IN WHICH YOU
20 ACCOMPLISH NOTHING. SO STARTING WITH WHAT WE'RE ALREADY DOING,
21 WE CAN ACTUALLY START GETTING STUFF DONE, DEVELOPING TRUST FOR
22 THE ELECTORATE, MAKING SURE WE'RE GENERATING THE MONEY THAT'S
23 ABSOLUTELY NECESSARY IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE THE VISION. I THINK
24 WE NEED TO HAVE A CONVERSATION ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY. IF THE
25 BOARD AND THE MTC COMMISSION ADOPT A PLAN AND KEY PERFORMANCE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 METRICS WHAT HAPPENS IF WE'RE NOT MEETING THOSE KPIS? THIS IS
2 A CONVERSATION THAT WE NEED TO HAVE. WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND
3 FROM THE MTC COMMISSIONERS WHAT EXISTING AUTHORITY DO THEY
4 HAVE FOR DEVELOPING BOTH CARROTS AND STICKS. I BELIEVE THAT
5 ALL THE AUTHORITY IS ALREADY THERE. AND I THINK IT'S TIME FOR
6 US TO AGREE TO USE SOME OF THAT AUTHORITY IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE
7 THE LARGER REGIONAL GOOD, BUT THE FIRST WORK IS DEFINING WHAT
8 THAT REGIONAL GOOD IS, HOW TO MEASURE IT, AND THEN DELEGATING
9 TO, YOU KNOW, TO, YOU KNOW, THE BOX THERE ON THE LEFT. THE
10 RESOURCES AND THE STAFF NECESSARY TO ACHIEVE THOSE KPIS. THOSE
11 ARE MY THOUGHTS.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** ADINA.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** FIRST I WANTED TO EXPRESS STRONG SUPPORT FOR A
16 CORE ELEMENT THAT MEMBER TUMLIN HAS JUST RAISED, WHICH IS WHAT
17 THE PROPOSAL DOES IN TERMS OF COALESCING A ROLE FOR STAFF,
18 DOING THE WORK, AND EMPOWERING THOSE STAFF PEOPLE WITH DOABLE
19 JOBS. AND THAT'S NOT WHAT WE COLLECTIVELY HAVE BEEN DOING TO
20 DATE. AND SO THERE ARE SOME VERY GOOD PEOPLE INCLUDING MAYBE
21 SOME OF THEM IN THIS ROOM WHO HAVE BEEN REALLY REQUIRED TO BE
22 SUPER HUMAN, AS OPPOSED TO HAVING A HUMAN DOABLE NUMBER OF
23 JOBS AND REORGANIZING THE WORK SO THAT OUR GOOD PEOPLE CAN DO
24 THAT WORK. I THINK THAT IS AN IMPORTANT TRANSFORMATIVE ELEMENT
25 IN THIS PROPOSAL. WITH THAT, I THINK THAT THERE ARE SOME



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 FAIRLY SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES WITH OTHER ELEMENTS IN THE
2 PROPOSAL IN TERMS OF WHO IS DOING WHAT AT THE MANAGEMENT
3 LEVEL. AND THEN AT THE POLICY GOVERNANCE LEVEL. BECAUSE IN
4 HAVING, BY HAVING THE GENERAL MANAGERS DO A LOT OF THE HEAVY
5 LIFTING AND BLOCKING AND TACKLING ON THE CREATING OF POLICY,
6 THAT IS, YOU KNOW, TO SOME LEVEL, DISINTERMEDIATING THE
7 CURRENT POLICY BOARDS OF THE AGENCY WHO STILL HAVE THE
8 FIDUCIARY AUTHORITY TO THE FUNDING. AND WITH THIS STRUCTURE,
9 AS WE HAVE BEEN LIVING IT WITH THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD,
10 TRANSIT BOARDS GET INFORMATION LEAKED AND FIDDLY, AND THE
11 OUTCOME OF THAT SOMETIMES BECOMES BOARD MEMBERS AT THE EVENT
12 DAY DON'T HAVE IT UP OR DOWN AND HAVING CONFUSION WHAT IT IS
13 THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT BECAUSE THERE ISN'T ENOUGH STAFF IN
14 HUMANITY TO FULLY BRIEF AND BRING ALONG 27 DIFFERENT BOARDS
15 AND THAT IS RISK AND THE OTHER RISK ISSUE IS WITH THE HIGHER
16 LEVEL GREATER EXPANSE OF POLICY MAKING CAPABILITY AMONGST
17 GENERAL MANAGERS ONE OF THE THINGS IN THE ROLE OF A POLICY
18 BOARD AND WHETHER IT'S A CITY COUNCIL OR TRANSIT BOARD, THERE
19 ARE CONSTITUENTS THAT HAVE ISSUES THEY CAN SIT DOWN AND HAVE
20 COFFEE WITH THEIR SUPERVISOR, CITY COUNCILMEMBER, BOARD MEMBER
21 AND OUR TRANSIT, AND GENERAL MANAGERS HAVE MORE THAN FULL-TIME
22 JOBS AND YOU KNOW WHILE THE WORK BEING ABLE TO OCCASIONALLY
23 TALK TO SOME OF OUR TRANSIT GENERAL MANAGERS, THOSE ARE SHORT
24 AND VALUABLE CONVERSATIONS THE GENERAL MANAGERS DON'T HAVE
25 TIME TO TALK CALLS FROM CONSTITUENTS MEANWHILE WE PUT THE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 HIGH-LEVEL POLICY MAKING AT MTC WHERE MTC COMMISSIONERS HAVE
2 THE BROAD SPECTRUM OF AUTHORITY NOW AND WE'RE TAKING IT DOWN
3 ANOTHER LEVEL OF DETAIL INTO HOW THE TRANSIT SYSTEM RUNS IT'S
4 NOT CLEAR THAT MTC COMMISSIONERS THEMSELVES WILL HAVE THE
5 LEVEL OF DETAIL TO REALLY WEIGH IN ON SOME OF THOSE POLICY
6 DECISIONS ABOUT HOW YOU DO INTEGRATED CONNECTED NETWORK
7 PLANNING AND FARE INTEGRATION AND SO ON, SO THERE'S SOME HOLES
8 IN HERE AND I'LL TALK ABOUT ANOTHER HOLE AND THEN ANOTHER
9 RECOMMENDATION, SO THIS IS RUNNING LONG BUT THIS IS IN THE
10 MEAT OF THE MATTER IN TERMS TALKING ABOUT THE STATUS QUO THAT
11 HAS ISSUES AND GIVE IT MORE CAPABILITY IT RUNS THE RISK OF
12 MAKING IT WORSE THEN SAY THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER IS
13 EQUIVALENT OF CALTRAIN -- THERE IS A LOT OF ADVISORY BODIES OF
14 -- ALL OVER THE PLACE AND THE WEAKEST TYPE OF ADVISORY BODY IS
15 WHEN YOU USE AN ADVISER, AND THIS IS SOMEONE WHO HAS SERVED ON
16 A LOT OF THEM, IF YOU ARE ADVISORY STAFF OR ADVISORY BODY LIKE
17 THE CALTRAIN ADVISORY COMMITTEE THE CHAIR MAKES A REPORT AT
18 EVERY BOARD MEETING AND I'M NOT SURE THAT LIKE MAYBE ONCE A
19 YEAR OR MAYBE ONCE EVERY TWO YEARS THE BOARD ACKNOWLEDGES
20 SOMETHING THAT THE CHAIR HAS SAID THAT'S A REALLY DISEMPOWERED
21 ROLE OF PEOPLE THAT ARE NOMINALLY REPRESENTING THE CUSTOMER.
22 AND SO I REALLY WANT TO SEE THE TRANSIT POLICY MAKERS -- AND
23 WE CAN'T HAVE ALL SEVERAL HUNDRED OF THEM, BUT SOME OF THEM
24 INVOLVED IN THAT POLICY MAKER LEVEL AND I HEARD MEMBER HURSH
25 SAY SOMETHING REALLY PERSONALITY ABOUT CONCERN ABOUT ERODING



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 AUTHORITY AND SOMETHING THEY HEARD FROM MR. POWERS BOARD
2 MEMBER SAYING I WOULD BE WILLING TO DO SOME IF I KNEW WHAT IT
3 WAS MAYBE TO DO SOME DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY SO I DON'T THINK
4 THIS HAS THE RIGHT BALANCE BETWEEN ERODING AUTHORITY AND
5 DELEGATING AUTHORITY SO IF WE WERE ABLE TO INCLUDE SOME OF
6 THOSE POLICY MAKERS AND SOME CUSTOMER REPRESENTATIVES IN THE
7 POLICY MAKING LEVEL, I THINK THAT WOULD ADDRESS SOME OF THE
8 CONCERNS. IT DOESN'T -- IN ORDER TO REALLY MAKE SOMETHING MORE
9 SUBSTANTIVE WOULD TAKE LEGISLATION AND LONGER BUT IN ORDER TO
10 MAKE THINGS BETTER I THINK WE NEED TO INCLUDE POLICY MAKERS IN
11 THE POLICY MAKING ROLE AND -- AND TO, LIKE, MAYBE NOT BE
12 EXPECTING QUITE AS MUCH, MUCH THE FULL MTC. AND, ALSO, YOU
13 KNOW, PERHAPS AT THAT POLICY MAKING LEVEL, INCLUDE THE
14 CUSTOMER REPRESENTATIVES, AS WELL. AND I WILL LEAVE THAT
15 THERE.

16

17 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** JUST VERY BRIEFLY. A COUPLE OF THINGS, I
18 AGREE THIS, IS A SUPER IMPORTANT SLIDE. SO, REGARDING THAT
19 COLUMN OF THE DEDICATED RNM SUPPORT STAFF, IF YOU LIKE IT, YOU
20 GOT TO FUND IT. SO, JUST SAYING. [LAUGHTER] YOU KNOW, I CAN
21 ALREADY START TAKING NOTES FOR MTC'S BUDGET NEXT YEAR. AGAIN
22 WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE. I TOOK YOUR COMMENTS TODAY, WITH
23 DIFFERENTIATE INSTITUTION DIFFERENT STAFF WOULD BE A DEDICATED
24 STAFF WITH MTC. THERE IS ONLY SO MANY SOURCES OF FUNDING YOU
25 CAN GO TO SO JUST PUT A BIG PIN IN THAT, THAT IF IT'S A



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 PRIORITY AND IT'S NEED THEN THAT'S GREAT. NOW I ALSO WANT TO
2 LEAN INTO THE MODEL THAT WE HAD WITH THE FARE INTEGRATION
3 WHICH WAS HUGE, WE CALL THE BILL AND MIKE MODEL. [LAUGHTER] IT
4 WAS HUGELY EFFECTIVE TO BE ABLE TO HAVE OPERATOR STAFF HELPING
5 DEVELOP REASONABLE PROGRAMS WITH OPERATING ON THE GROUNDS
6 IMPACTS WORKING SIDE BY SIDE. SO, I KNOW MY STAFF HAS LIFTED
7 UP FOR ME, THERE IS ALWAYS THE PARTICULAR ISSUES THAT MIGHT BE
8 ATTACHED TO PERS AND BLAH, BLAH, BLAH AND STAFFING AND
9 BENEFITS AND ALL THAT STUFF, BUT IDEALLY, WE WOULD FIGURE OUT
10 A WAY TO HAVE THAT KIND OF EMBEDDED PROCESS. BECAUSE, I THINK
11 THE BENEFITS COMING OUT OF THAT JUST, OFF THE TOP, WOULD BE
12 HUGELY SIGNIFICANT. AND IT -- MAYBE THAT'S, SORT OF, A JOB
13 SHARING, COST SHARING THING THAT WE CAN BUILD IN TO MAKE THIS
14 THING STANDS UP. A NUMBER OF THE POINTS, ADINA I THINK YOU
15 RAISED, PARTICULARLY QUESTIONS OF THE MTC'S COMMISSIONERS
16 CAPABILITIES TO DEEP DIVE, TO PUT A SOMEWHAT SHORTER YOU KNOW,
17 SUMMATION ON IT, I THINK, IS REALLY PART OF THE ANTICIPATED
18 QUESTIONS FOR THAT LONG REVIEW. I THINK WE'RE ACKNOWLEDGING, I
19 FORGOT WHAT SLIDE IT IS, WHERE WE HAVE WHOLE SLIDE ON IT --
20 DON'T NEED TO PULL IT UP. YES, THE EVOLUTION OPPORTUNITIES OF
21 LONG-TERM FRAMEWORK. IT WAS ALREADY POINTING OUT THAT SOME OF
22 THE POTENTIAL SHORTCOMINGS OR LIMITATIONS OF WHAT WE'RE
23 PUTTING OUT THERE ARE THINGS LIKE, WHAT REMAINING ABSORB
24 CAPACITY IT WILL HAVE. THE COMMISSION AS A POLICY MAKE BODY
25 ALSO SETS THEIR OWN AGENDAS ABOUT WHAT'S MOST IMPORTANT IT HAS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 MODIFIED COMMITTEE STRUCTURES FOCUSED ON ASSIGNMENTS AND TASK
2 FORCES SET UP THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT ADVISORY TASK FORCE
3 WHICH WAS A HUGE AMOUNT OF COMMITMENT OVER TWO YEARS AND THEY
4 DID THAT BECAUSE THEY HAD TO I THINK I WOULD SAY IT WAS CLEAR
5 THAT THE COMMISSION'S COMMITTEE TO THAT WHAT THAT LED TO IN
6 TERMS OF WHERE WE ARE TODAY IS PRETTY INCREDIBLE SO I WOULDN'T
7 AT THIS POINT SAY THIS IS TOO HARD FOR THEM. I THINK IT'S PART
8 OF THE EVALUATION FRAMEWORK IN THE SHORT-TERM TO SAY LET'S SET
9 THINGS UP AND KEEP TABS ON HOW EFFECTIVE THE STRUCTURE IS AND
10 BEING ABLE TO TAKE UP THE DECISIONS AND MILESTONES AND
11 ACHIEVEMENT AS WE GO FORWARD.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONERS SET POLICY THEY DON'T
14 IMPLEMENT POLICY IT TAKES A DIFFERENT AMOUNT OF BANDWIDTH TO
15 IMPLEMENT THINGS AND IT GOES TO SAY. AFTER THIS DISCUSSION AND
16 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT PROCESS THERE'S A POLICY.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS THE MOST IMPORTANT SLIDE IN THE DECK. IT WAS
19 THE ONE WE PROBABLY WRESTLED WITH THE MOST AND THERE WERE SOME
20 THINGS THAT CERTAINLY POPPED OUT THAT WE RECOGNIZE ARE GOING
21 TO BE CHALLENGES ON US. IS AT THE RIGHT STRUCTURE? WE THINK
22 SO, AT LEAST FOR TODAY RECOGNIZING ON THAT SLIDE FURTHER OUT
23 THAT THERE IS A STAIR-STEP AND THERE IS GOING TO BE GROWTH IN
24 CHANGE OVER TIME. BUT TO GET BACK TO WHAT JEFF ACTUALLY
25 POINTED OUT, AND IT'S UNDER THIS DEDICATED SUPPORT STAFF THAT



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 IT PROVIDES US THE GREATEST OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE PROGRESS
2 TODAY. ACTUALLY, I THINK WE WOULD ALL AGREE OR SAY THAT WE
3 ACTUALLY ARE MAKING PROGRESS NOW. THE WORK IS BEING DONE NOW.
4 IT'S BEING DONE NOW BY OPERATOR STAFF AND OTHERS. SO, THIS
5 REALLY MORE OR LESS FORMALIZES IT AND PROBABLY GIVES A GREATER
6 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE FASTER PROGRESS MOVING FORWARD. BUT IT
7 DOES PROVIDE CONCERN AND THAT IN CONJUNCTION WITH THERESE,
8 YOUR COMMENT, WE DID NOTICE THAT IT'S DEDICATED STAFF. SO,
9 THAT'S COSTLY. AND WHERE DOES THE MONEY COME FROM? AND THE
10 CONCERN OF THE SMALLER OPERATOR IS, WE NEED DO IT, IT'S GOING
11 TO COST MONEY, WHERE DOES THAT MONEY COME FROM, AND DOES THAT
12 MONEY COME OUT OF OUR HIDES IN THE OPERATIONS THAT WE'RE
13 CURRENTLY PROVIDING, GIVEN THAT OUR BUDGETS ARE GENERALLY
14 SMALL, ANY SMALL AMOUNT OF MONEY BEING REDIRECTED CAN HAVE
15 DIRECT IMPACTS TO WHEELS ON THE GROUND, SO TO SPEAK. YET AT
16 THE SAME TIME, WE AGREE THIS IS NECESSARY. WE AGREED
17 UNILATERALLY THAT THIS IS SOMETHING WE WOULD SUPPORT. BUT,
18 WE'RE CAUTIOUS ABOUT IT, RECOGNIZING THE POTENTIAL IMPACTS TO
19 THE VARIOUS AGENCIES THAT I REPRESENT. A COUPLE OF COMMENTS
20 THAT WERE IN HERE, SPECIFIC, A REDIRECTION OF REGIONAL MONEYS.
21 AND I THINK THAT WAS THE ONE THING THAT GARNERED THE MOST
22 COMMENTS FROM THE SMALL OPERATORS. SO, THERE IS CONCERN,
23 CLEARLY, ABOUT IT. BUT THERE IS ALSO A RECOGNITION THAT WE'RE
24 ALL DONATING STAFF TIME AND WE HAVE MADE PHENOMENAL PROGRESS
25 AND THEN IF THERE WAS A DEDICATED STAFF HOW DOES THAT LEVERAGE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 VARIOUS THINGS WE'RE MAKE PROGRESS ON TODAY. THIS IS IMPORTANT
2 TO SUPPORT AND IT'S GOING TO BE AT THE END OF THE DAY TO THE
3 REGION'S BENEFIT IF WE DO. WERE SOME MINOR THINGS IN THIS THAT
4 WE WEREN'T 100% WHAT IT MEANT. AND MAYBE THERE IS VALUE -- AND
5 I DON'T WANT TO GET TOO DEEP INTO IT, IF THAT MAKES SENSE, BUT
6 WE WEREN'T SURE WHAT A FACILITATOR WAS, OR WHAT THAT MEANT AND
7 HOW THAT WAS STRUCTURED WITHIN THIS EXECUTIVE BOARD. AND I
8 DON'T THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE'RE OPPOSED TO. WE DON'T
9 REALLY HAVE AN OPINION. IT WAS JUST A LOT OF QUESTION, WHAT
10 DOES THAT MEAN? AND IS IT REALLY THE RIGHT THING. THAT WAS IT
11 IS ON OURS. FROM A SMALL OPERATOR PERSPECTIVE, I DON'T KNOW IF
12 THAT HELPS. BUT, AT LEAST IT'S THE FUNDING THAT CONCERNS US,
13 BUT THE RECOGNITION OF THE VALUE IS CERTAINLY THERE. SO, WE
14 SUPPORT IT.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS BILL. NEXT, ALICIA.

17

18 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR MULLIGAN.
19 THERE IS SO MUCH HERE. SO, FORGIVE ME, I'M GOING RUN THROUGH A
20 FEW THOUGHTS. FIRST OF ALL, I THINK WHERE I WANT TO START IS
21 GOING BACK TO AN EARLIER POINT THAT ONE OF THE CONSULTANTS
22 RAISED ON CULTURE AND TRUST. AND I GUY THAT THOSE ARE REALLY
23 ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS AND ALSO PICKING UP ON WHAT THERESE WAS
24 SAYING EARLIER THAT THE ASSUMPTION BEHIND THIS MODEL THAT'S
25 EFFECTIVE IS A DIFFERENT INTENTION THAN THE WAY WE WORKED



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 TOGETHER, CERTAINLY IN MY EXPERIENCE IS WHAT BUILDS TRUST IS
2 WORKING TOGETHER AND DOING WHAT WE SAY WE WILL. AND FROM THAT
3 PERSPECTIVE, I THINK UNDERSTANDING THIS STRUCTURE, AS ONE THAT
4 HAS AN INCREDIBLY CLEAR MANDATE THAT HAS VERY CLEAR GOALS THAT
5 ARE SET AT THE OUTSET THAT IS OUTCOME DRIVEN, THAT I THINK
6 JEFF WAS RAISING EARLIER THAT HAS METRICS AND A DEFINED WORK
7 PLAN AND THAT ALSO IS TIME LIMITED THAT ASKS HOW LONG THIS IS
8 IN PLACE, REEVALUATION, AND TAKING US WHERE WE WANT TO BE
9 MEETING THE TYPE OF ESSENTIAL COMPONENT OF BUILDING TRUST AND
10 RECOGNIZING THAT MONEY IS SUCH AN IMPORTANT ISSUE. WE ARE
11 FACING A SCALE OF NEED THAT UNPRECEDENTED IN ANY OF OUR
12 EXPERIENCE AND MANY OF US HAVE BEEN WORKING IN THIS SPACE FOR
13 A LONG TIME AND THE FACT OF THE MATTER IS IT'S GOING TO TAKE
14 ALL OF US IF WE'RE GOING TO GET TYPE OF RESOURCES WE NEED TO
15 SUSTAIN TRANSIT IN THE SHORT-TERM AND LONG-TERM AND
16 UNDERSTANDING HOW WE CAN WORK TOGETHER IN A MANNER THAT
17 CONTINUES TO BUILD TRUST I THINK IS REALLY IMPORTANT
18 PARTICULARLY AT THIS CRITICAL MOMENT IN TIME. I REALLY LIKE
19 THE IDEA OF HAVING THE DEDICATED SUPPORT STAFF. I LIKE THE
20 IDEA OF SECONDED STAFF. I THINK BILL BACON IS -- I DON'T KNOW
21 IF BILL LISTENING. OH, WHERE IS BILL -- [LAUGHTER] HI BILL.
22 BILL IS, SORT OF, THE POSTER CHILD OF THIS SPECIALTY. AND IT'S
23 ALWAYS BEEN POSITIVE IN MY EXPERIENCE TO GO IN THAT DIRECTION,
24 AND FROM A CUSTOMER REPRESENTATION STANDPOINT I THINK THERE IS
25 WORK TO BE DONE TO BETTER UNDERSTAND HOW THE VOICE OF THE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 CUSTOMER COMES INTO THIS AND I APPRECIATE THE POINTS THAT
2 ADINA WAS RAISING AROUND WHAT PERSPECTIVES ARE TRULY AT THE
3 TABLE. I ALSO THINK THAT THERE IS A WAY -- SORT OF, A MORE
4 TECHNICAL WAY THAT WE CAN BRING THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
5 THROUGH DATA COLLECTION, DOING THE WORK ANALYZING WHAT ARE
6 TRANSIT NEEDS, HOW CUSTOMERS WANT TO MOVE, WE SEE HUGE
7 TRANSFORMATION IN HOW PEOPLE ARE USING ANY FORM OF
8 TRANSPORTATION IN THE LAST FEW YEARS. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT
9 DIRECTION THAT'S GOING TO GO BUT DIVING DEEP INTO THE MARKET
10 RESEARCH WOULD ALLOW US TO MEET SOME OF THAT NEED EVEN
11 SEPARATE FROM ANY GOVERNANCE CONSIDERATIONS. AND THEN, I
12 GUESS, THE LAST THOUGHT THAT I HAD, AND THIS IS KIND OF GOING
13 BACK TO THE QUESTION OF WHAT I WAS RAISING EARLIER IS, YOU
14 KNOW, WHEN YOU KIND OF BUILD THE INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY THAT
15 YOU START TO GET ROOTED INTO THE SYSTEM, THERE IS ANOTHER
16 VERSION OF THIS ORG CHART WHICH HAS THAT DEDICATED SUPPORT
17 STAFF, ACTUALLY REPORTING INTO MTC, AND ADVISORY INTO THIS
18 EXECUTIVE BODY. I'M NOT NECESSARILY ADVOCATING FOR THAT AT
19 THIS POINT IN TIME BUT IT OCCURRED TO ME THAT IS A WAY TO
20 START TO BUILD THAT REGIONAL INSTITUTIONALIZATION INTO THE WAY
21 THAT WE'RE APPROACHING THIS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALICIA. NEXT UP IS CAROLYN.

24



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **CAROLYN GONOT:** THANK YOU CHAIR MULLIGAN. I APPRECIATE ALL THE
2 WORK THAT'S GONE INTO THIS AND I FIND THIS IS AN IMPORTANT AND
3 INTERESTING SLIDE IN BEING ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD. I DO AGREE
4 WITH MEMBER TUMLIN'S POINT ABOUT, I THINK IT WAS -- WHO SAID
5 REALLY THIS ALLOWS US TO CONTINUE WITH -- CONTINUE AND
6 SOMEWHAT HIT THE GROUND RUNNING AND MOVING THINGS FORWARD, I
7 THINK IT'S SOMETHING WE CAN CONTINUE TO TAKE -- YOU KNOW, WE
8 WILL CONTINUE TO TAKE A LOOK AT, WE HAVE ALL, SORT OF,
9 GUARANTEED WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT. I THINK WUI NEED TO MOVE TO
10 BUY-IN, AND I THINK THERE HAS BEEN SOME -- THE TRANSIT
11 OPERATORS ARE CURRENTLY NOT REPRESENTED ON THE MTC COMMISSION,
12 AND MANY OF YOU HAVE HEARD THAT MANY TIMES. AND THIS HAS
13 ALLOWED US TO TALK TO OUR BOARDS AND BRING IDEAS FORWARD AND
14 HAVE THEM ASK US QUESTIONS AND SUPPORT, YOU KNOW, OUR REGIONAL
15 ASPECTS, I THINK US CONTINUING TO DO THIS WITH SOME OF THE
16 SUPPORT STAFF AND HAVING, SORT OF, A DIRECTIVE I THINK IT
17 WOULD BE CRITICAL IN BEING ABLE TO BRING OUR PERSPECTIVES
18 FORWARD. BUT I ALSO FIND, AS ADINA SAID, IT IS DIFFICULT, AS
19 SHE SAID AS CEOS, AND I APPRECIATE YOU KNOW HOW TIME CRUNCHED
20 WE CAN BE AT TIMES IN RUNG THE DAY-TO-DAY SERVICE AND ALL THE
21 OTHER ONES, BUT US CEOS, OUR RESPONSIBILITY IS TO TRY TO STEP
22 ABOVE THAT AS WELL AND WORK AT THE, YOU KNOW, BETWEEN OUR
23 POLICY MAKERS AND OUR TEAM, OUR EXECUTIVE TEAM THAT'S SITTING
24 THERE IS MANAGING AND WORKING ON THE DAY-TO-DAY. FOR ME THIS
25 IS A GOOD WAY TO MOVE AND GET BUY-IN ON GETTING THE SUPPORT



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 STAFF WE NEED AND HOW DO WE MOVE QUICKLY FORWARD, THAT'S
2 CRITICAL TO ME TO SEE THAT MOVING. WE'RE -- I THINK WE'RE
3 QUITE A FAR CRY FROM -- YOU MAY NOT SEE THAT WE'RE FAR AWAY
4 THAN WE WERE A YEAR AGO, AND FORMALIZING MORE FOR THE SHORT-
5 TERM IN THE NEAR-TERM BEING ABLE TO STABILIZE OUR AGENCIES IN
6 THE FINANCIAL, SORT OF, CRISIS THAT WE'RE IN RIGHT NOW, IF WE
7 COULD JUMP INTO SOMETHING REALLY QUICKLY AND I FEEL LIKE IT'S
8 IN THE BEST INTEREST OF OUR RIDERS TODAY WHILE WE SHOULD TAKE
9 OUR TIME TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE ABLE TO CONTINUE TO PROVIDE
10 FOR THE FUTURE. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** MIKE HURSH.

13

14 **MICHAEL HURSH:** CAROLYN DID A GREAT JOB REPRESENTING ALL OF MY
15 COMMENTS. VTA MAY LUCK OUT AND HAVE A MEMBER AGENCY THAT'S
16 ALSO A MTC COMMISSIONER BECAUSE OF THEIR ASSIGNMENT, MAYOR OF
17 SAN JOSE IS TYPICALLY AN MTC COMMISSIONER AND VTA BOARD
18 MEMBER. MR. POWERS TO MY LEFT AND MYSELF DIRECTLY ELECTED
19 BOARD MEMBER, WE NEVER HAVE DIRECT REPRESENTATION ON MTC, TWO
20 OF THE LARGEST TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE BAY AREA WITH NO DIRECT
21 REPRESENTATION. I FAVOR THIS MODEL IF FOR NO OTHER REASON TO
22 NOT GET FURTHER AWAY FROM NO REPRESENTATION ON MTC. IT'S BEEN
23 SAID MULTIPLE TIMES THAT THIS MODEL ALLOWS US TO HIT THE
24 GROUND RUNNING. I WOULD ADD TO THE POSTER CHILD, BILL WE'RE
25 PROUD OF AND YOU MIKE EISEMAN FROM BOB'S SHOP HAVE DONE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 INCREDIBLE WORK AND THE STAFF THAT SUPPORTS THEM IN TAKING
2 FARE INTEGRATION FROM A CONCEPT TO AN ACTIONABLE IMPLEMENTABLE
3 SERIES OF PROJECTS. WE CAN'T LOSE THIS COLLABORATION THAT WE
4 HAVE NOW. BECAUSE 2024 IS COMING, OUR OPPORTUNITIES TO GET ON
5 THE BALLOT AND FIND ADDITIONAL FUNDING, WE HAVE TO KEEP THE
6 PROGRESS WE HAVE RIGHT NOW. BUT, AGAIN, READING THROUGH THE
7 PUBLIC COMMENTS, I SEE THERE IS A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT HAVE
8 STRONG OPINIONS OF THAT. WHATEVER WE DO I WOULD LIKE TO SEE
9 ADVISORY GROUPS EXPANDED SO THAT WE DO CONNECT TO THE BUSINESS
10 GROUPS, THE PARATRANSIT, DISABLED COMMUNITY, SO MANY PEOPLE
11 OUT THERE THAT NEED TO HAVE A VOICE ON THIS. BUT I -- THE
12 BIGGEST THING TODAY IS THAT STAIR-STEP, I WOULD ENCOURAGE US
13 TO START WITH THE MODEL THAT'S ON SLIDE 24 ON THE SCREEN TODAY
14 AND NOT LOSE THAT VISION TO WHAT IS AN END STATE MONTHS OR
15 YEARS DOWN THE ROAD. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. WE NEED DIRECT
16 REPRESENTATION ON MTC.

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS MIKE. NEXT UP BOB POWERS.

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS:** CHAIRPERSON MULLIGAN AND VICE CHAIR, I LOOK
21 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH THIS BOARD, YOU KNOW, THE MEMBERS ON
22 THIS BOARD THAT ARE PRESENT AND THE MEMBERS THAT HAVE DROPPED
23 OFF, MAYBE, TO GET BART REPRESENTATION ON THE MTC BOARD AND AC
24 TRANSIT REPRESENTATION ON THE MTC BOARD. I THINK THAT'S VERY
25 FORWARD LEANING AND I APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT ON THAT. TO THIS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 SLIDE HERE, CHAIRPERSON MULLIGAN, I TAKE THIS SLIDE, AND YOU
2 KNOW, I DON'T LOOK AT IT JUST THIS SLIDE, YOU GOT TO, IN MY
3 OPINION, TAKE THIS SLIDE WITH THE STAIRS, THAT THEY'RE TAKEN
4 TOGETHER AND YOU HAVE TO LOOK AT BOTH THESE SLIDES TOGETHER.
5 TO THE VICE CHAIR'S POINT, IF WE START WITH THIS STRUCTURE, IF
6 SOME SEMBLANCE OF THIS STRUCTURE STARTED WITH, AND OVER TIME
7 IT MORPHS INTO SOMETHING ELSE OR THERE IS A CHECK IN A COUPLE
8 OF YEARS DOWNED ROAD AND IT'S PERFORMING THAT WE AS A BOARD
9 THOUGHT IT WAS GOING TO PERFORM OR NEEDS SOME SANDING DOWN,
10 YOU KNOW, TAKEN TOGETHER, I THINK THIS IS A GOOD STARTING
11 POINT. I'M NOT SO SURE THERE IS A PERFECT, YOU KNOW, NETWORK
12 MANAGEMENT EXECUTIVE BOARD STRUCTURE THAT EVERYBODY IS GOING
13 TO JUMP ON BOARD. I DON'T THINK IT'S OUT THERE. I THINK IT'S
14 GOING TO EVOLVE OVER TIME. AND I THINK GETTING TO A GOOD
15 STARTING PLACE IS IMPORTANT. AND THEN THE OTHER POINT, I
16 GUESS, YOU KNOW, AND I WANT TO MAKE IT TO THERESE, BUT IT'S
17 NOT REALLY HER, SHE'S JUST A BOARD MEMBER LIKE WE ARE HERE,
18 BUT MAYBE TO ALIX AND SCHRUTI, TO TUMLIN'S POINT ABOUT THE
19 STAFFING OF THIS, YOU KNOW, THERE WERE TWO PIECES THERE. YOU
20 KNOW, ONE, I DON'T THINK IT'S INSURMOUNTABLE THIS SECONDED
21 STAFFING. WE CAN FIGURE THAT OUT. THAT'S JUST NOT THAT
22 COMPLICATED TO FIGURE OUT THERESE, AND YOU MENTIONED IT
23 EARLIER. I KNOW YOU'RE A BOARD MEMBER HERE, BUT TO SCHRUTI AND
24 ALIX, TO JEFF'S POINT, I'M NOT SURE WE SHOULD WAIT ON HIGHER,
25 YOU KNOW, THE DIRECTOR OR WHO NEEDS TO TAKE THAT AUTHORITY,



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 BUT GETTING GOING ON THAT POSITION RIGHT NOW WOULD BE MISSION
2 CRITICAL TO ME. YOU KNOW? BACK TO GUY'S POINT ON THE
3 DEFINITION OF MOMENTUM, KEEPING THINGS MOVING FORWARD. NOTHING
4 COULD BE MORE IMPORTANT THAN GETTING THAT POSITION HIRED AS
5 QUICKLY AS WE CAN. THERE IS A LOT TO THAT, YOU HAVE GOT TO GET
6 JOB DESCRIPTION, FUNDING THERE IS A LOT TO MOVE IT FORWARD BUT
7 AT SOME POINT YOU HAVE GOT TO START I WOULD ENCOURAGE US TO
8 EXPEDITE GET THE DIRECTOR POSITION UP AND RUNNING SOONER
9 RATHER THAN LATER AND NOT WAIT ON THAT UNTIL ALL OUR I'S ARE
10 DOTTED AND T'S ARE CROSSED. AND JUST TO PUT AN EXCLAMATION
11 POINT ON THAT, I DON'T THINK THERE IS ANYBODY IN THIS ROOM
12 THAT IS NOT UNDERSTANDING HOW DIFFICULT IT IS TO HIRE FOLKS
13 RIGHT NOW. WHETHER IT'S A STATION AGENT OR TRAIN OPERATOR, OR
14 A DIRECTOR. IT'S JUST VERY DIFFICULT TO HIRE FOLKS RIGHT NOW.
15 AND THE SOONER WE GET STARTED ON THAT, THE BETTER OFF WE'RE
16 GOING TO BE, WHERE WE STARTED WITH THESE COMMENTS WITH TUMLIN.
17 ANYWAY, I JUST PUT THAT OUT THERE, SCHRUTI, FOR YOU AND ALIX
18 TO NAVIGATE THROUGH THE -- I DON'T KNOW WHAT AUTHORITY YOU
19 NEED TO GET GOING ON THIS. I HAVEN'T THOUGHT THAT THROUGH, BUT
20 IN MY PERSPECTIVE, IT CAN'T HAPPEN SOON ENOUGH.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS BOB. I DON'T SEE HANDS UP. ONE
23 PERSON WE HAVEN'T HEARD, FROM SO I THOUGHT I WOULD SEE IF WE
24 WANTS TO TAKE THE FLOOR. JIM L LINDSEY, DO YOU HAVE ANY
25 THOUGHTS ON THIS SLIDE ON THIS DISCUSSION?



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1
2 **JAMES LINDSAY:** THANKS DENNIS. I JUST, YOU KNOW, THE OVERALL
3 PICTURE THEY SEE, I MEAN, FUNDING IS OBVIOUSLY A -- AN ISSUE
4 THAT'S ON EVERYBODY'S MIND. BUT AS FAR AS -- I DON'T KNOW. I
5 STILL DON'T HAVE CLEAR IN MY MIND HOW YOU'RE GOING TO GET
6 ANOTHER TRANSIT AGENCY TO RUN SERVICE IN ANOTHER TRANSIT AREA.
7 I JUST -- I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT'S GOING TO -- HOW THAT'S GOING
8 TO WORK. I MEAN, I KNOW -- NO DISRESPECT DENNIS, YOU AND I IN
9 NEGOTIATIONS RIGHT NOW, THAT'S ONE OF OUR MAIN TOPICS IS
10 RUNNING SERVICE AND I MEAN YOU KNOW WE FEEL THE SAME WAY
11 YOU'RE NOT GOING TO LET SOMEBODY ELSE RUN SERVICE THAT YOU'RE
12 SUPPOSED TO BE RUNNING. HOW DO WE GET OVER THAT. I MEAN WE
13 HAVE 13 AGREEMENTS EVERY SINGLE TRANSIT AGENCY, YOU HAVE OTHER
14 UNIONS INVOLVED, WE HAVE WITH TWU TEAMSTERS, SEU ALL THE
15 UNIONS THAT REPRESENT ALL OF THE MEMBERS IN THE BAY AREA, AND
16 THERE SEA NOT ONE UNION THAT'S WILLING TO EXCHANGE WORK OR
17 GIVE WORK FROM ONE UNION TO ANOTHER UNION I DON'T KNOW HOW
18 THIS IS GOING TO COME ALL TOGETHER. BOTTOM LINE WE WANT IT TO
19 WORK WE WANT TO BE ABLE TO GET THE PUBLIC TO WHERE THE PUBLIC
20 WANTS TO GO BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT FUNDS US ALL THAT'S WHAT KEEPS
21 US ALL WORKING. I DON'T KNOW THERE IS A LOT OF BROAD
22 STATEMENTS. THE PRESENTATION WAS GOOD BUT THERE IS A LOT OF
23 BROAD STATEMENTS IN THERE. I'M GOING TO NEED TO SEE HOW WE DO
24 SOME OF THESE SPECIFIC ITEMS IN ORDER TO COME ACROSS WITH IT.
25 MONEY, YOU KNOW, I FIGHT FOR MONEY FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES ALL



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 THE TIME. I WAS PART OF GETTING THE INFRASTRUCTURE BILL CROSS
2 THAT HAS GIVEN TRANSIT MORE MONEY THAN WE HAVE SEEN IN MANY,
3 MANY YEARS. BEEN INVOLVED IN MANY GRASSROOT EFFORTS OF GETTING
4 TRANSIT AGENCIES SALES TAX MONEY ACROSS THE STATE. I'M ALL FOR
5 GETTING HELP OR FUNDING. HOW EXACTLY IS THAT GOING TO COME
6 TOGETHER. I HAVE QUESTIONS IN MY MIND. THE VAGUENESS DOESN'T
7 GET ME TO THE COMFORT ABILITY THAT YES ALL THIS IS GOING TO GO
8 IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. JUST MY OBSERVATION.

9

10 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS FOR YOUR OBSERVATIONS, JIM. YOUR
11 MEMBERS AND FOLKS WHO DELIVER A LOT OF THIS SERVICE SO IT'S
12 HELPFUL TO HEAR YOUR PERSPECTIVE. OTHER HANDS FROM THE
13 ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS? YES, SAM, ON BEHALF OF CALTRAIN.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** FROM THE DISCUSSION OF TRUST AND METRICS THAT ALLOW
16 ALL OF US OPERATORS TO BE ABLE TO BE ACCOUNTABLE TO OUR BOARDS
17 AND EACH OTHER AND OUR CUSTOMERS AND COMMUNITIES THAT WE SERVE
18 AND I THINK THE VICE CHAIR'S COMMENTS TO COLLECTIVE FUNDING
19 AND DISCUSSING HINGES ON OUR ABILITY TO NOT ONLY REUP OUR
20 LOCAL SOURCES OF FUNDING BUT TO GET ON THE SAME PAGE ENOUGH TO
21 GENERATE THE NECESSARY SUPPORT OR REGIONAL FEDERAL FUNDING. I
22 THINK WE NEED TO BE THINKING MORE ABOUT SECURING LOCAL SOURCES
23 OF FUNDING AND I THINK THAT STARTS AGAIN WITH MAINTAINING AND
24 BUILDING TRUST. AND I THINK THE TRUST CAN BE BUILT WITH
25 TRANSPARENCY AND METRICS AND HIGH-PERFORMANCE OF OUR SYSTEMS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 EVERY SINGLE DAY. LOOKING AT THE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS HERE
2 CALTRAIN PERSPECTIVE IS THE RNM PROPOSED EXECUTIVE BOARD
3 REPRESENTATION OF THE PORTFOLIO OF REGIONAL INTEREST I THINK
4 THERE IS SUFFICIENT GEOGRAPHIC MODAL BALANCE WE ALSO THINK THE
5 COMPOSITION OF THE RNM EXECUTIVE BOARD IS COMPLEMENTARY TO THE
6 CAPABILITIES AND PERSPECTIVES OF THE MTC. THEY DON'T LINE UP
7 PERFECTLY, BUT THEY ARE COMPLEMENTARY. I THINK THIS IS
8 GENERALLY, AND THIS IS THE PERSPECTIVE OF CALTRAIN AND
9 EXECUTIVE BOARD BOUCHARD, THAT THIS IS A VERY GOOD STARTING
10 POINT IN ITS BUILDING BLOCK FOR HIGHER LEVELS OF OPERATOR
11 COORDINATION AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT IN THE FUTURE. CALTRAIN,
12 IN PARTICULAR, APPRECIATES THE WORK OF MTC STAFF, OF
13 CONSULTANT STAFF, AND OF THE MEMBERS OF THIS ADVISORY GROUP
14 FOR ALL WORK GOING INTO THIS EFFORT. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO
15 ACKNOWLEDGE AND EXECUTIVE BOARD BOUCHARD WOULD ACKNOWLEDGE
16 THIS IS NOT STATUS QUO, THAT TO CALL THE STATUS QUO WOULD
17 PROBABLY NOT GIVE THE CREDIT THIS'S DUE TO THE AMOUNT OF WORK
18 THAT'S GONE INTO THIS PROPOSAL. YOU HAVE GOT TO PUT IDEAS OUT
19 THERE. YOU HAVE GOT TO VISUALIZE THEM, PUT THEM TO PAPER, IN
20 ORDER TO MAKE NEXT STEPS, OTHERWISE YOU'RE GOING TO BE
21 SPINNING IN CIRCLES. AND I THINK THE PROPOSAL HERE MAY SOLVE
22 TWO OF THE GREATEST REGIONAL CHALLENGES BY PROPOSING DEDICATED
23 STAFF, TO MEMBER TUMLIN'S POINT BUT ALSO A PUBLIC FACING FORUM
24 FOR THE REGIONAL GENERAL MANAGERS. FROM THE CALTRAIN



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 PERSPECTIVE, WE APPRECIATE ALL WORK DONE AND SEE THIS AS A
2 STEP FORWARD.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, STAN. I SEE NO OTHER HANDS.
5 I'LL OFFER A COUPLE OF THOUGHTS. WE STARTED WITH VERY ELOQUENT
6 THOUGHTS FROM MY COLLEAGUE JEFF TUMLIN. AND WE WANT TO
7 CONGRATULATE SAN FRANCISCO ON THE PASSAGE OF THEIR TAX MEASURE
8 THAT WAS ON THE BALLOT A WEEK AGO. IMPORTANT TO HIGHLIGHT
9 THERE IS DISCONNECT BETWEEN REUPPING LOCAL SALES TAX AND LOCAL
10 SALES TAX MEASURES AND REGIONAL VOICE. WHEN PEOPLE VOTE FOR A
11 TAX FOR A SPECIFIC PURPOSE, IT'S FOR THAT PURPOSE AND WE CAN
12 NEVER VIOLATE THE TRUST. WE NEED TO GET OUR HEADS AROUND
13 COBBLING TOGETHER MONEY AS A REGION AND AS WE COBBLE TOGETHER
14 MONEY AS A REGION THAT REALITY DOES PRESENT SOME DIFFICULT
15 CHALLENGES FOR THAT REGIONAL VOICE. AND I THINK ULTIMATELY TO
16 HAVE A STRONG REGIONAL VOICE WILL TAKE A STRONG REGIONAL
17 FUNDING MECHANISM. CERTAINLY, I THINK OUR COLLEAGUE MR.
18 LINDSEY WOULD CONCUR WITH THAT. BUT I REALLY LIKE THE PROPOSAL
19 IN FRONT OF US. NO PROPOSAL IS PERFECT. AND IT'S A FIRST STEP.
20 YOU HAVE GOT TO TAKE THE FIRST STEP BEFORE YOU CAN MAKE IT TO
21 THE TOP ON THE STAIRS. A COUPLE OF THOUGHTS ON IT, NOT TO NIT
22 PICK, SOMETIMES I CAN'T HELP MYSELF. I LOVE THE DEDICATED
23 STAFF, I THINK THAT'S ESSENTIAL FOR SUCCESS, IF YOU LOOK AT
24 FUNCTIONS UNDER ENGAGEMENT PLANNING, FINANCIAL, FARE POLICY,
25 PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT, THE TITLE DIRECTOR REGIONAL NETWORK



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 MANAGEMENT, I THINK THE OPERATIONS IS PROBABLY A MISNOMER
2 SHOULD BE DROPPED BECAUSE THE DIRECTIVE VISUAL NETWORK
3 MANAGEMENT --

4

5 **ROBERT POWERS:** I THINK THAT COULD COME OUT OF YOUR MOUTH A
6 LITTLE BIT EASIER, DENIS. YOU KNOW?

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** I'M TRYING BOB. I THINK THAT'S JUST
9 KIND OF A LITTLE KNIT. IT PROPOSES THAT THE MTC EXECUTIVE
10 DIRECTOR BE THE CHAIR, TO START, THAT MAKES SENSE. BUT TO SOME
11 BENEFIT MAYBE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD CAN ROTATE. THE
12 FACILITATOR, SOMEONE BROUGHT UP. IS THAT A CLERK THAT HELPS
13 MANAGE THE GROUP? PROBABLY YOU DON'T NEED AN FACILITATOR EVERY
14 DAY BUT YOU DO OCCASIONALLY, WHEN YOU DO, THE GROUP CAN CALL
15 ONE TOGETHER. KEY IS WHAT IS CONTEMPLATED HERE IS NEAR-TERM OR
16 SHORT-TERM STEPS BASED ON EXISTING AUTHORITIES, AND EXISTING
17 ABILITIES, YOU KNOW, MTC'S PART OF THE NEXT BUDGET
18 HIGHLIGHTING DEDICATED STAFF SUPPORT. THAT HAS SOME STAFF AT
19 TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT BUILD UPON THE BILL AND MIKE MODEL WE
20 ALWAYS TALK ABOUT. THERE IS A LOT HERE TO WORK WITH. WITH THAT
21 WE SHOULD PROBABLY GO TO THE NEXT PART OF OUR DISCUSSION WHICH
22 IS THE LONG-TERM REGIONAL NETWORK SLIDES, SLIDES 25 AND 26.
23 YES? PLEASE DO. PLEASE TURN ON YOUR MIC ADINA.

24



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** NEUROLOGICAL TEST RIGHT THERE. SO THE -- HAVING
2 WORKED ON SAN MATEO COUNTY MEASURE W, YOU KNOW, IN ADVOCACY
3 COALITION, ON WORKING ON WHAT WENT INTO THE MEASURE AND THEN
4 HELPING GETTING IT PASSED, ONE OF THE ELEMENTS IN THERE WAS A
5 REGIONAL FUNDING SOURCE THAT WAS DEFINED THERE, ON PURPOSE,
6 NOT ACCIDENTALLY. AND THE SMCTA IS GOING TO HAVE STRATEGIC
7 PLAN TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO USE THAT FUNDING AND I WAS TALKING
8 TO THE NEW EXECUTIVE WHO SAID IT MIGHT BE HARD FOR US TO USE
9 SOME MONEY, BECAUSE EVEN THOUGH OUR LOCAL MONEY ALLOWS IT TO
10 BE USED FOR REGIONAL CONNECTIVITY OUR PARTNERS DON'T HAVE THE
11 CONDITIONS FOR THAT REGIONAL CONNECTIVITY SO THERE MIGHT BE
12 SOME BENEFICIAL THINGS THAT WE CAN'T EVEN SPENDS THE MONEY
13 THAT HAS THIS REGIONAL POSITIVE CONDITION. SO ANYONE THINKING
14 ABOUT LOCAL MEASURES THAT MIGHT BE SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT
15 MAYBE LOOSENING THAT CONSTRAINT TO ALLOW DIFFERENT AGENCIES TO
16 DO THAT AND IN GENERAL, FOCUSING ON THE FUNDING ASPECT HERE
17 NOT ONLY TO GET THAT REGIONAL FUNDING SOURCE BUT TO BE ABLE TO
18 GET US OUT OF EITHER THAT TACTICAL COMPETITION OR GET OUT OF
19 BALLOT YEARS WHERE WE HAVE SOMEONE WHO NEEDS TO VOTE FOR TWO
20 OR THREE MEASURES IN THE SAME JURISDICTION, WHICH COULD DRAG
21 THEM DOWN.

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ADINA. THAT'S ACTUALLY VERY
24 HELPFUL. SO, WE'LL NOW GO TO THE LONG-TERM REGIONAL NETWORK
25 FRAMEWORK. AND HOPEFULLY THAT'S NOT MY MACHINE CAUSES THE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 PROBLEM. I'LL TRY THAT AGAIN. SOMEONE MIGHT HAVE THEIR
2 MICROPHONE OR SPEAKER ON. MY SPEAKERS ARE ALL OFF. SO IT'S
3 PROBABLY A GOOD IDEA FOR ME TO STOP TALKING. COULD WE GET
4 SLIDE 25A.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** I THINK ADINA HAS HER MICROPHONE ON.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** LAPTOP SPEAKER CAUSES THE PROBLEM WORSE
9 THAN THE MICROPHONE. IT'S A TEAM EFFORT UP HERE. THANK YOU.
10 SO, EVOLUTION OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE LONG-TERM REGIONAL NETWORK
11 MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK. WHAT ARE SOME OF THE STRENGTHS SHORT-
12 TERM, AND HOW CAN THIS PROVIDE A BRIDGE FOR LONG-TERM AND WHAT
13 ARE SOME EVOLUTION OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE LONG-TERM REGIONAL
14 NETWORK MANAGEMENT. WE HAVE SLIDES 25 AND 26 THAT ARE GERMANE
15 TO THIS DISCUSSION POINT AND WITH THAT I'LL OPEN IT UP TO MY
16 COLLEAGUES TO WEIGH IN. PLEASE GO AHEAD, THERESE.

17

18 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SURE. I MEAN, I THINK WE HAVE ACTUALLY
19 TALKED A LOT ABOUT THIS ALREADY. SO LET ME JUST GIVE YOU MY
20 SUMMARY OF IT, AND OBVIOUSLY OTHERS CAN JUMP IN. I DON'T THINK
21 ANY OF THE QUESTIONS ON 25 ARE WRONG. [LAUGHTER] I BELIEVE
22 THERE IS PROBABLY -- I HAVE BEEN TAKING NOTES TO ADD TO IT, TO
23 BE PERFECTLY HONEST IN TERMS OF THINGS THAT WE WOULD WANT TO
24 KEEP IN MIND AND CHECK GOING IN, LIKE, THESE COULD BE
25 SHORTCOMINGS, ARE THEY PLAYING OUT THAT WAY, TO WHAT DEGREE?



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 OR, IS THERE WORK AROUND THEM. SO, I WOULD SUGGEST BETWEEN NOW
2 AND DECEMBER THAT WE ALL THINK THROUGH THAT AND, YOU KNOW,
3 TURNING TO THE CONSULTANT TEAM AND STAFF, HAVE WE PICKED UP
4 THINGS THAT WE WANT TO ADD TO THE LIST BASED ON THE DISCUSSION
5 WE HAVE HEARD TODAY. THEN WITH RESPECT TO THE STEPS, THE ONLY
6 THING I WOULD OFFER IS, I THINK EVERYONE HAS BEEN SAYING, AND
7 ACKNOWLEDGING, I THINK IT WAS BOB, THAT SAID WE HAVE SLIDE 24
8 THAT ACKNOWLEDGES IT'S NOT PERFECT, WHICH IS SLIDE 25, BUT THE
9 IDEAS THAT WE USE ALL OF THAT TO KEEP BUILDING TO SLIDE 26.
10 SO, I MEAN, I THINK THAT'S WHERE WE ARE. AND THE ONLY THING I
11 WOULD NOTE, THAT ALICIA HAD FLAGGED IS, WE COULD PROBABLY BE
12 MORE INTENTIONAL ABOUT HAVING A REALLY SHARP TWO-YEAR CHECK
13 IN. THAT'S WHERE ARE WE. YOU KNOW? AND YOU KNOW, WHERE ARE THE
14 THINGS THAT ARE WORKING, ET CETERA, WHICH SPEAKS TO SOME VERY
15 CLEAR METRICS THAT NEED TO KIND OF BE ESTABLISHED UP FRONT TO
16 GIVE US GUIDE POSTS. SO, THAT'S WHAT I THINK WE ALREADY TALKED
17 ABOUT, TO SYNTHESIZE.

18

19 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** I THINK IT'S A GREAT SYNTHESIS. MAYBE
20 WE SHOULD POP-UP SLIDE 26 TO JOG EVERYONE'S MEMORY AND WHILE
21 SLIDE 26 IS COMING UP I'LL TURN IT OVER TO BOB POWERS.

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS:** TO ADD TO THE CEO FROM MTC'S VERY SUCCINCT
24 THERE, MAYBE THE TEAM COULD ALSO, BACK TO WHAT THERESE WAS
25 TALKING ABOUT, ADDITIONAL TASKS. I WOULD EDIT THAT SLIGHTLY



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 THERESE IN SAYING ARE THERE TASK THAT IS WE CAN ACCELERATE?
2 YOU KNOW? THERE IS ADDITIONAL TASKS, THAT'S TRUE BUT MAYBE
3 THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO ACCELERATE SOME OF THESE TASKS FOR
4 YOUR CONSIDERATION ON YOUR SUMMARY THERE, I WOULD JUST OFFER
5 THAT TO YOU.

6

7 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, BOB. OTHER ADVISORY GROUP?
8 MIKE HURSH, THEN ALICIA.

9

10 **MICHAEL HURSH:** WELL, I THINK IT'S -- I THINK THIS COMMENT IS
11 RELATIVE TO THE LONG-TERM GROWTH. THE QUESTIONS AROUND LABOR
12 THAT WERE RAISED PARTICULARLY BY MEMBER LINDSEY ARE REALLY
13 PERSONALITY. AND I WOULD LIKE TO AT LEAST SEE AN INVENTORY OF
14 COLLECTIVE BAR BEGINNING AGREEMENTS WITH UNIONS DESIGNATED.
15 AND, I STILL KEEP COMING BACK TO GOVERNANCE. I THINK THREE
16 THINGS, LABOR AGREEMENTS, THE COMPLICATION OF GOVERNANCE, AT
17 ALL OF THE AGENCIES, I YOU THINK NEEDS TO AT LEAST
18 INVENTORIED, AND STARTED TO BE MAPPED OUT. I THINK THAT
19 FUNDING LIMITATIONS, FOR EXAMPLE, WE HAVE -- A LOT OF PEOPLE
20 WITH AC TRANSIT, WE HAVE TWO SPECIAL DISTRICTS TWO PARCEL TAX
21 IN ONE DISTRICT, THAT'S ONE EXAMPLE, IF A BUS STARTS IN A
22 SPECIAL DISTRICT AND DELIVERS PASSENGERS TO A SPECIAL DISTRICT
23 WHERE THEY DON'T PAY THE FUNDS HOW DO YOU ATTRIBUTE FUNDS TO
24 THAT SERVICE. FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN WE DO 27 AGENCIES AND THIS IS
25 KEY TO THE NETWORK MANAGER BECAUSE WE LEVERAGE THOSE FUNDS TO



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 MORE SERVICE, AND I THINK THAT'S A MICRO EXAMPLE OF A MUCH
2 LARGER FUNDING COMPLICATION WE WILL HAVE AS WE TRY TO GO UP
3 THE LADDER, AND I THINK WE NEED TO, IT'S ONE THEY SUPPORT THE
4 INITIAL, SO WE CAN SUPPORT THE MOMENTUM KEEP THE BALL ROLLING
5 BUT I THINK WE NEED TO DO THESE INITIAL STEPS, COLLECTIVE
6 BARGAINING AGREEMENTS RESTRICTED FUNDING SOURCES GOVERNANCE,
7 INVENTORY SO THAT WE CAN START GOING UP THE LADDER.

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS MIKE. ALICIA.

10

11 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** THANKS I'M GOING TO GO BACK TO
12 MY FIRST CLARIFYING QUESTION WHICH IS WHAT WAS THE CONSTRAINT
13 ON THE SPLIT ACCOUNTABILITY TO THE GENERAL MANAGERS THE WAY I
14 UNDERSTOOD THAT IS THE GENERAL MANAGERS ARE ACCOUNTABLE TO
15 THEIR BOARDS FOR THE SERVICE THAT THEIR AGENCY PROVIDES AND
16 WHAT WE'RE ASKING THIS BODY TO ULTIMATELY DO IS TO BE
17 RESPONSIBLE TO A DIFFERENT ACCOUNTABILITY, WHICH IS
18 ACCOUNTABILITY FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION OUTCOMES. AND I
19 FIND IT REALLY CHALLENGING. TO ME, IT SEEMS LIKE A VERY
20 CHALLENGING POSITION TO PUT THE GENERAL MANAGERS IN TO START
21 TO THINK ABOUT HOW TO PARSE THROUGH THESE GOVERNANCE QUESTIONS
22 OF REGIONAL VERSUS LOCAL, YOU REPORT TO A BOARD THAT COULD BE
23 IMPACTED BY ULTIMATELY WHAT DECISIONS GET MADE IN TERMS OF
24 GOVERNANCE. YOU HAVE ALREADY RAISED, WHICH I THINK FAIRLY, THE
25 QUESTION OF HOW SOME AGENCIES ARE REPRESENTED IN THIS BROADER



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 STRUCTURE IT JUST REALLY GETS COMPLICATED. AND SO WHEREAS I
2 SAID EARLIER, I THINK ONE OF THE STRENGTHS OF THIS PROPOSAL IS
3 THAT IT BUILDS ON OUR EXISTING CAPACITIES SO THAT IT IS
4 SOMETHING THAT CAN BE MOVED INTO MOTION QUICKLY. I THINK ONE
5 OF THE CRITICAL LIMITATIONS HERE IS THAT IT ASKS PEOPLE TO
6 WEAR HATS THAT ARE VERY AWKWARD TO BE WORN. AND, SO WHAT FEELS
7 STILL MISSING TO ME IN ALL OF THIS, IN WHATEVER THIS IS
8 CALLED, LADDER STEP, YOU KNOW, NOTWITHSTANDING IS WHAT'S THE
9 PROCESS TO FIGURE OUT THE LONG-TERM STRUCTURE BECAUSE I DON'T
10 KNOW THAT WE HAVE ACTUALLY ANSWERED THAT YET.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** GREAT POINT, ALICIA. NEXT WE HAVE
13 CAROLYN, AND AFTERCARE LYNN WE'LL HEAR FROM JEFF.

14

15 **CAROLYN GONOT:** THE THINGS THAT MIKE MENTIONED ARE REALLY
16 CRITICAL. ABOUT THIS SLIDE 26, IT'S PROBABLY MY FAVORITE
17 SLIDE, IT GIVES A PATH OF WHERE WE WANT TO GO AND A PROCESS. I
18 KNOW THAT THIS ISN'T GOING TO GO AS NEATLY AS JUMPING UP THESE
19 FIVE STEPS OR THESE FIVE STAIRS. AND I'M COMFORTABLE WITH THE
20 FLEXIBILITY THAT WE'RE GOING TO MEET. FOR EXAMPLE, RIGHT NOW
21 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ESTABLISHING LEADERSHIP AND SCALE ROLES,
22 AND I'M NOT SURE IF THAT'S, AS THE NEXT STEP IS GOING TO BE
23 NEED TO BE DONE AS MUCH AS ESTABLISH AND EXPANDING THE
24 REGIONAL TOOLS. AND THEN SOME OF THAT MAY PLAY INTO HOW THE
25 LEADERSHIP IS. SO, I DON'T -- I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS IS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 NOT GOING TO BE FIVE STEPS. AND I KNOW PROBABLY THAT'S NOT
2 WHAT APMG'S INTENT WAS, BUT I THINK WE'RE PROBABLY NOT QUITE
3 IN THAT ORDER, PARTICULARLY WITH THE THINGS THAT MIKE HAD
4 TALKED ABOUT, ABOUT LABOR, THE FISCAL STABILITY, I MEAN, THE
5 FINANCIAL MEANS OF OUR AGENCIES AND OTHERS -- I CAN'T REMEMBER
6 THE OTHER AREA -- I'M SORRY. WE DON'T WANT TO GET PARALYZED BY
7 THOSE THINGS THAT FEEL SO INSURMOUNTABLE, AND THAT YOU WILL
8 HEAR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS TALK ABOUT THE REASON THAT I LIKE
9 THAT WE'RE MOVING IN THE SHORT-TERM IS TO BE ABLE TO LOOK AT
10 NUMBER TWO, ESTABLISH AND EXPAND REGIONAL TOOLS IN A WAY THAT
11 I THINK ALLOWS US TO CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD AND COME UP WITH
12 IDEAS AS WE CONTINUE TO LOOK AT LEADERSHIP. BECAUSE THESE
13 BIGGER AREAS THAT MIKE TALKED ABOUT ARE GOING TO BE, YOU KNOW,
14 VERY DIFFICULT TO REALLY FULLY MANAGE IN A NETWORK STRUCTURE
15 UNTIL WE KNOW THAT WE'RE REALLY COMFORTABLE TO TAKE THOSE ON.
16 BUT THERE IS SO MUCH MORE WE CAN DO AS WE'RE ALREADY SHOWING
17 THESE THINGS THAT WE'RE DOING THAT WE CAN CONTINUE TO MOVE ON.
18 SO, I DON'T WANT TO LOSE OUR ABILITY TO KEEP MAKING BENEFICIAL
19 CHANGES TO THE REGION, BECAUSE WE HAVE SOME ISSUES THAT DO
20 FEEL SO LARGE AND LOOMING. THANKS.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS CAROLYN. NEXT IS JEFFREY TUMLIN.

23

24 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** ONE OF THE THING I THINK WE'RE ALL STRUGGLING
25 WITH HERE IS THIS IS SO ABSTRACT AND IT'S HARD TO SEPARATE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 WHAT ARE THE PROBLEMS WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE BECAUSE THERE IS
2 NOT ENOUGH FUNDING TO SOLVE THEM. WHAT ARE THE PROBLEMS WE'RE
3 TRYING TO SOLVE BECAUSE THERE IS LACK OF COORDINATION,
4 PROBLEMS WE'RE TRYING TO RESOLVE AS A RESULT OF GENERAL
5 MANAGER ANIMOSITY. LET ME GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE. I WOULD LOVE TO
6 HAVE BETTER TIMED TRANSFERS BETWEEN MY END JUDEA TRAINS AND
7 CALTRAIN. BUT IN ORDER TO DO THAT, I HAVE TO CUT SERVICE TO
8 THE OUTER SUNSET WHERE I HAVE TWO ORDERS OF MAGNITUDE, MORE
9 TRANSIT RIDERS THAT ARE TRANSFERRING FROM CALTRAIN TO THE END.
10 I'M WILLING TO DO THAT BUT THERE IS A WHOLE BUNCH OF THINGS I
11 NEED IN ORDER TO MAKE THAT TRADEOFF EFFECTIVE. ONE OF THE
12 THINGS I DISCOVERED IS THAT WE'RE HAVING A HARD TIME
13 MAINTAINING TIME TRANSFERS BECAUSE EVERYONE WAS DOING THEIR
14 SCHEDULE UPDATES AT A DIFFERENT TIME AND WE WERE DOING THAT
15 BECAUSE IN OUR LABOR CONTRACTS OPERATOR SIGN UPS ARE PERFECTLY
16 MISALIGNED ACROSS ALL OF THE OPERATORS. WE NEED SOMEBODY TO
17 SIT DOWN WITH LABOR AND ALL OF OUR LABOR TEAMS IN ORDER TO
18 HARMONIZE OPERATOR SIGN UPS. THAT IS REALISTICALLY TWO YEARS
19 OF PRETTY INTENSE STAFF WORK. STAFF WORK THAT NEEDS TO BE
20 DONE, BUT WE NEED SOMEBODY IN CHARGE OF IT. WE ALSO NEED THEN,
21 YOU KNOW, THE LABOR AGREEMENTS AND OPERATOR SIGN UPS TO BE
22 TAKEN CARE OF. PROTOCOLS FIGURING OUT TO WHAT DEGREE IF
23 CALTRAIN IS LATE, HOLDING THE END THEREBY CUTTING SERVICE FOR
24 TWO HOURS TO THE BULK OF MY PASSENGERS I'M WILLING TO DO THAT
25 TO A CERTAIN DEGREE BUT NOT ENTIRELY. AND THEN HOW DO WE MAKE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 ALL OF OUR COMMUNICATION SYSTEMS TO WORK. WE ALL HAVE HIGH
2 TECH MANAGEMENT IS CENTERS WHERE WE'RE MANAGING OUR SERVICES
3 WE NEED TO BUILD API'S BETWEEN THOSE SYSTEMS IN ORDER TO BE
4 ABLE TO COMMUNICATE IN ORDER TO MAKE THE SYSTEMS WORK. THIS IS
5 A MASSIVE AMOUNT OF STAFF WORK. WORK THAT WE NEED TO BE DOING,
6 AND WORK THAT I THINK A DEDICATED TEAM REPORTING TO THE
7 GENERAL MANAGERS CAN ACTUALLY DO. IT'S ONE SIMPLE EXAMPLE. BUT
8 THIS IS EXACTLY WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, ABOUT WHAT IS
9 NECESSARY IN ORDER TO MAKE THE REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK APPEAR
10 TO BE ONE SEAMLESS SYSTEM FROM THE USER'S PERSPECTIVE, WHICH
11 IS, I THINK, WHAT ALL OF OUR GOALS ARE, ONLY IT'S BEEN
12 PRESENTED TO US AS, IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE, YOU KNOW, THIS GOAL
13 OF SEAMLESS TRANSFERS THAT FOURTH AND KING CALTRAIN AND JUDEA A
14 I HAVE SIGNIFICANTLY GOT TO CUT JUDEA SERVICE TO WHERE THE
15 BULK OF MY RIDERS ARE IN ORDER TO DO IT SIMPLY, IMMEDIATELY,
16 AND RIGHT NOW. THAT'S OVERSIMPLIFYING SOMETHING THAT'S COMPLEX
17 BUT TRYING TO MAKE IT CLEAR IT ALL OF THE LISTENERS AND
18 EVERYONE HERE IN THIS ROOM WHAT IT'S ACTUALLY GOING TO TAKE.
19 AND THIS IS SOMETHING WE CAN GET IMPROVEMENT ON FOR FREE
20 WITHOUT ADDITIONAL RESOURCES BUT IT'S GOING TO TAKE A PRETTY
21 SIGNIFICANT DEDICATED STAFF EFFORT IN ORDER TO MAKE IT HAPPEN.
22 THANKS.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** NEXT UP ADINA. YOUR HAND IS RAISED.

25



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, I MAY BE GOING BACK TO COMPARING THIS AND THE
2 PREVIOUS. BECAUSE I'M STILL A LITTLE STUCK ON THE HOW DO WE
3 MAKE TODAY WORK AND MAKE TODAY BE BETTER THAN YESTERDAY EVEN
4 THOUGH IT'S NOT AS GOOD AS TWO WEEKS FROM NOW. AND ONE OF THEM
5 IS JUST GOING BACK TO THE QUESTION ABOUT WHAT MR. POWERS AND
6 MR. HURSH SAID ABOUT THE ELECTED BOARDS, AND IS THERE SOME WAY
7 OF HAVING, YOU KNOW, KEY BOARD MEMBERS, LIKE THE BOARD
8 PRESIDENT, OR VICE PRESIDENT, OR SOMETHING, BEING AT LEAST EX-
9 OFFICIO MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION AND WHATEVER RELEVANT
10 COMMITTEE IS GETTING THE IN-PROGRESS UPDATES TO MAKE SURE THAT
11 THINGS AS THEY MOVE AHEAD ARE NOT GETTING TOO FAR AWAY FROM
12 THE BOARDS THAT HAVE NO REPRESENTATION AS OPPOSED TO HAVE
13 SOMEONE WHO HAS REPRESENTATION BY DOING DOUBLE DUTY BECAUSE
14 THEY ARE ALSO ON THE VTA BOARD BY VIRTUE OF SOME OTHER OFFICE.
15 AND, I WANT TO, YOU KNOW, KEEP PUTTING THAT IDEA FORWARD, AS
16 SOME PLACE THAT WILL YOU KNOW, STARTING NOW, BE CLOSER TO
17 WHERE WE WANT TO BE. AND THE OTHER THING THAT'S MAKING MY HEAD
18 HURT IN TERMS OF HOW THIS IS GOING TO WORK, AS WE'RE MOVING ON
19 MORE OF A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN ISSUES, WHERE, LIKE, ON THE
20 ONE HAND, I THINK IT'S A LITTLE BIT OF LIKE A RED HERRING,
21 LIKE THERE ISN'T ANYBODY OUT THERE SAYING LET'S MAKE ALL OF
22 THE TRANSFERS NOW FOCUS ON A REGIONAL CONNECTION AT THE RISK
23 OF PEOPLE TRAVELLING LOCALLY. AND THE CREATIVE IDEAS ABOUT HOW
24 TO DO IT IS HELPFUL. BUT LET'S SAY THERE IS SOMETHING THAT'S
25 IN A PROPOSAL WHERE A SET OF CUSTOMERS REALIZES, HEY, THIS IS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 SOMETHING THAT IS MAKING PEOPLE'S LIVES HARDER IN A WAY THAT
2 MAYBE WASN'T ANTICIPATED. AND MAYBE IT'S AN EQUITY ISSUE. ONE
3 WAY, SOMETHING THAT HAS HAPPENED IS IN WAYFINDING THERE WAS AN
4 RFP THAT WAS PUT OUT THAT DID NOT COVER THE VISUAL AND TACTILE
5 CUES THAT ARE ESSENTIAL FOR PROVIDING ACCESSIBILITY FOR PEOPLE
6 WHO ARE VISUALLY DISABLED AND THAT CAME TO THE MTC OPERATIONS
7 COMMITTEE FOR FINAL APPROVAL AFTER THE RFP WAS LET AND AFTER
8 THE CONSULTANT WAS SELECTED AND MEMBERS OF THE DISABILITY
9 COMMUNITY CAME TO THAT COMMITTEE AND SAID THIS IS MISSING
10 SOMETHING NEEDS TO BE CHANGED AND THE COMMITTEE SAID WE'RE
11 GOING TO FIGURE IT OUT HOW TO CHANGE IT BUT IT WAS REALLY LATE
12 AND COMING TO THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD, AND RNM AND THE
13 PEOPLE ON CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD RNM HAVE NO TIME TO LISTEN
14 TO THE PEOPLE THAT HAD THE ISSUE THAT WOULD HAVE BEEN BETTER
15 EARLY. AND WITH THE FACT THAT THE PEOPLE ON THAT BODY HAVE NO
16 TIME. THEY HAVE REALLY IMPORTANT JOBS AND I'M JUST NOT
17 SQUARING THE CIRCLE IN TERMS OF HOW THAT GETS HEARD EARLY.
18 LIKE THOSE BODIES HAVE ONE-MINUTE PUBLIC COMMENT, THOSE BODIES
19 HAVE TIME LIMIT MEETINGS, WHICH IS GREAT FOR TIGHT SCHEDULES
20 AND MEANS THAT PEOPLE WHO MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ARE REALLY
21 PRETTY MUCH TO THE SIDE. AND IT'S, LIKE, AS THE SCOPE OF
22 AUTHORITY GETS BIGGER THAT IS GIVING ME A FAIR AMOUNT OF ANGST
23 ABOUT HOW THAT MIGHT END UP WORKING AND NOT MAKING PEOPLE WITH
24 HARD JOBS, THOSE JOBS WORSE AND THE RISK OF MISSING IMPORTANT
25 THINGS OR GETTING TO THEM [INDISCERNIBLE].



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS A ADINA. WE NEED TO HEAR FROM
3 THE PUBLIC. I WOULD ASK THE PUBLIC TO RAISE THEIR HANDS WE
4 HAVE PUBLIC BOTH HERE IN THE ROOM AND REMOTELY. WE DID RECEIVE
5 A LOT OF PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU WALLY AND THE MTC TEAM, FOR
6 DISSEMINATING BEFORE THE MEETING. AND THERE WAS PUBLIC COMMENT
7 AVAILABLE AS PEOPLE WALKED INTO THIS ROOM. MAKING SURE YOUR
8 COMMENTS ARE HEARD AND TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT BY THE ADVISORY
9 GROUP MEMBERS. WITH THAT WALLY HOW MANY HANDS DO WE HAVE
10 RAISED? FIVE? FOUR IN THE ROOM. WE'LL GIVE EACH SPEAKER TWO
11 MINUTE. FIRST SPEAKER IS IN THE ROOM. IAN. COME TO THE
12 MICROPHONE AND INTRODUCE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** BROADCASTING TEAM CAN YOU TAKE THE SLIDE
15 DOWN SO YOU CAN SHARE THE TIME? THANK YOU.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** WELCOME IAN.

18

19 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. YOU KNOW, THERE IS
20 SO MANY THINGS TO COMMENT ON IN TWO MINUTES. I THINK THIS
21 FRAMEWORK IS REALLY HELPFUL IN DEFINING THOSE THREE LEVELS,
22 THE VISIONING ELEMENT, STEERING ELEMENT AND THE ADMINISTRATIVE
23 ELEMENT. WHAT I HAVE HEARD AND WHAT I THINK IS EVIDENT BASED
24 ON PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED IN WRITING AND MANY COMMENTS FROM
25 THE TASK FORCE, THE ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS WHO ARE NOT MEMBERS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 OF TRANSIT AGENCIES IS THE REPRESENTATION ON THE STEERING
2 COMMITTEE LEVEL AND ON THE POLICY COMMITTEE LEVEL THERE IS
3 SOME PROBLEMS THERE. AND I THINK EVEN THOUGH THOSE ARE TWO
4 BODIES THAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW, I REALLY DON'T THINK IT'S THAT
5 DIFFICULT TO IMAGINE SOME SLIGHT TWEAKS TO THOSE TWO BODIES
6 AND THEIR COMPOSITION THAT COULD IMPROVE AND MAKE THESE TWO
7 PROPOSED BODIES IN THE INTERIM MORE EFFECTIVE, BETTER
8 REPRESENT CUSTOMER NEEDS, BETTER REPRESENT POLICY MAKERS,
9 INCLUDING THOSE POLICY MAKERS WHO ARE NOT PART OF THIS WHO ARE
10 REALLY IMPORTANT INCLUDING BART AND AC TRANSIT BOARD MEMBERS.
11 AND INCLUDING I WOULD ADD PROFESSIONAL EXPERTISE THAT DOESN'T
12 HAVE ANY AFFILIATION. I THINK THESE ARE QUALITIES OF A LONG-
13 TERM NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE THEY HOPE WE GET CONSIDERED.
14 BUT I THINK WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE IN AN
15 INCREMENTAL WAY BEYOND WHAT WE HAVE NOW. I HOPE MTC STAFF CAN
16 TAKE THIS AS A FIRST DRAFT ITERATE ON IT. THAT CREATES PILOTS
17 OUT OF THESE DECISION-MAKING STRUCTURES THAT WE MIGHT WANT TO
18 INCORPORATE INTO A PERMANENT MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** NEXT SPEAKER IS WENDI KALLINS.

21

22 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANKS WENDI KALLINS WITH THE MTC POLICY
23 ADVISORY COUNCIL, VICE CHAIR OF THE T-TAP SUBCOMMITTEE
24 ADVISORY. FIRST I WANT TO REALLY APPLAUD THE CONSULTANT'S
25 WORK. THIS IS A VERY COMPLEX ISSUE. A VERY DIFFICULT TASK OF



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 TRYING TO CREATE SOMETHING THAT IS UNDERSTANDABLE. I WANT TO
2 THANK STAFF FOR THEIR GOOD WORK. I AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS.
3 IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT JUST IN DIFFERENT
4 INTEREST GROUPS BUT AN NGO THAT CAN LOOK AT THE BROADER
5 PICTURE OF ALL THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCES. SECONDLY, THE OTHER
6 THING THAT I THINK IS COMING OUT IS THE DIFFICULTY IN GETTING
7 PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR SILOS. I THINK EVERYBODY WHO COMES
8 REPRESENTING A CERTAIN CONSTITUENCY NEEDS TO BRING THAT
9 PERSPECTIVE TO THE TABLE AND PUT IT ON THE TABLE. WHEN IT
10 COMES TO MAKING DECISIONS IT'S IMPORTANT TO STEP BACK AND STEP
11 ABOVE THAT REPRESENTATION AND LOOK AT WHAT IS THE BEST
12 SOLUTION THAT WORKS FOR EVERYONE AND THAT REALLY CREATES THE
13 VISION THAT WE'RE ALL STRIVING FOR. AND THAT'S GOING TO TAKE
14 SOME REALLY, REALLY EXCELLENT FACILITATION IN ORDER TO DO
15 THAT. THANK YOU.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU WENDI. AND THE NEXT SPEAKER
18 IS EUGENE BRADLEY.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** CAN EVERYBODY HEAR ME?

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** YES, WE CAN.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** EUGENE BRADLEY SILICON VALLEY TRANSIT USERS I ECHO
25 COMMENTS OF GRIFFITHS, KALLINS AND THE PRIOR SPEAKER WITH THE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 EQUITY BETWEEN THESE COMMITTEES. IN MY OWN SILO IN SANTA CLARA
2 COUNTY, A LOT OF PEOPLE HAVE NEVER HEARD OF THIS EFFORT TO
3 EFFORT TO BETTER PROVIDE A SEAMLESS TRANSIT EXPERIENCE FOR
4 EVERYBODY THEY HAVE NEVER HEARD OF MTC IN GENERAL HOW IT
5 AFFECTS TRANSIT THEY USE FOR THEIR BUS OR RAIL TRIP. I FEEL
6 THAT EDUCATION IS WHAT MTC IN REGARDS TO THIS EFFORT IS NEEDED
7 BY THE GENERAL PUBLIC FOR THIS EFFORT. AND IT'S A GREAT EFFORT
8 BY THE CONSULTANT FROM EVERYTHING I HAVE SEEN IN THE
9 PRESENTATION. JUST, WILL JUST NEED MORE EDUCATION TO THE
10 GENERAL PUBLIC ABOUT WHAT'S GOING ON HOW THIS EXPERIENCE WITH
11 INTEGRATING SERVICE AND FARES WILL HELP MAKE THEIR TRIP
12 BETTER, WHETHER IT'S ACROSS THE STREET, ACROSS TOWN, OR EVEN
13 ACROSS THE BAY. IN THE END, ALL OF THE TRAFFIC GRIDLOCK WE ALL
14 WANT, EITHER ON TWITTER, ONLINE, OR IN THE MEDIA, IT ALL BOILS
15 DOWN TO THE SAME THING, WE NEED PUBLIC TRANSIT TO GET US OUT
16 OF THIS GRIDLOCK AND HELP RESOLVE THE ONGOING CLIMATE CRISIS
17 GOING-IN THE WORLD TODAY WE ALL HAVE GOT TO HELP, GENERAL
18 MANAGEMENT UNIONS, TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE END WE HAVE ALL GOT
19 TO WORK TOGETHER SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO WORK FOR EVERYONE
20 WE HAVE GOT TO MAKE IT HAPPEN.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN
23 ORANTES.

24



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR, JOHN, BART CHAPTER PRESIDENT,
2 SEIU 1021. WE NEED TO ENSURE THE PROPOSED IMPROVEMENTS MEET
3 THE NEEDS OF OUR CUSTOMERS AND NOT JUST CREATE A NEW
4 BUREAUCRACY, SORRY HAVE AS CONDUCTED BY BART SHOW PATRONS HAVE
5 CONCERNS ABOUT SAFETY, CLEANLINESS, AND HOMELESSNESS AND DRUG
6 USE ISSUES AROUND PUBLIC TRANSIT UNDERSTANDING THAT THE GOAL
7 OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS TO PROVIDE BETTER
8 CUSTOMER SERVICE AND WELL CONNECTED NETWORK THAT REASON, STOP
9 JUST CU1021 SUPPORTS THE CONSULTANT'S PROPOSED PRELIMINARY
10 STRUCTURE AND IT'S A NATURAL EVOLUTION AS WE CONTINUE TO
11 REBUILD PUBLIC TRUST THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR TIME AND ATTENTION
12 AND HARD WORK FOR THE REGION.

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JOHN. NEXT SPEAKER IS
15 ADRIENNE BRANDT.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY. I WANT TO SPEAK IN
18 SUPPORT OF THE EUROPEAN SYSTEM [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT I LEARNED
19 THE KNOW IN THE '70S AND '80s AS A CHILD. THEY HAVE SOLVED THE
20 PROBLEMS THAT YOU'RE WRESTLING WITH DURING THIS MEETING. EVERY
21 GERMAN SPEAKING COUNTRY, EVERY SINGLE MAJOR URBAN AREA AND ALL
22 ITS SUBURBS FOR THE BETTER PART OF 50 YEARS NOW HAVE ALL BEEN
23 COMPLETELY SEAMLESS IN THE SENSE THAT THERE IS ONE TARIFF AND
24 ALL OF YOU THAT HAVE TRAVELED EUROPE AND USED TRANSIT WILL
25 KNOW THIS. ALL THE GERMAN SPEAKING COUNTRIES AND MANY OTHERS



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 HAVE ADOPTED THIS. ABSOLUTELY STANDARD. IT'S SHAMEFUL THAT WE
2 HAVEN'T DONE IT SOONER I'M GLAD WE'RE DOING IT NOW BETTER LATE
3 THAN NEVER. I HEAR A LOT OF NIGGLING DETAILS IN UNION
4 CONTRACTS TO DEAL WITH AND I WOULD ECHO COMMENTS OF SOME OF
5 THE MEMBERS SAYING MOVE AHEAD KEEP GOING. WE CAN DO MORE THAN
6 ONE THING AT A TIME AND FIGURE OUT THOSE PROBLEMS IN PARALLEL.
7 THEY WILL ALL HAVE TO BE SOLVED. WE SHOULD DEFINITELY LEAN ON
8 EUROPEAN BEST PRACTICES COUNTERPARTS AND FIGURE OUT AND COPY
9 SOME OF WHAT THEY HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DO. THOSE PROBLEMS HAVE
10 ALL BEEN SOLVED IN EUROPE. AND IT'S ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL FROM
11 A RIDE PERSPECTIVE THAT THERE BE A SEAMLESS EXPERIENCE ACROSS
12 THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTY REGION SIMILAR TO WHAT YOU CAN BUY
13 ONLINE, FROM A VENDING MACHINE, A PARTICULATE FROM POINT A TO
14 POINT B YOU GET THE PARTICULATE CHOOSE MODES YOU WANT TO RIDE,
15 VALID OVER MODE, IT'S FRICTION LESS AND ENJOYED. I APPLAUD
16 YOUR EFFORT. KEEP IT UP.

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** SANDRA LANE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'M SANDRA LANE MEMBER OF THE PARATRANSIT
21 COORDINATING COUNCIL IN SAN MATEO COUNTY. WHAT I WANT TO SAY
22 REFLECTS MY PERSONAL FEELINGS AS A LONG TIME CITIZEN OF THE
23 BAY AREA. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THE FACT THAT THE HEALTH AND
24 WELFARE OF RIDERS AND WELL-BEING OF THE BAY AREA AS A WHOLE IS
25 AT RISK. AND I SAY THAT BECAUSE ULTIMATELY THE DEPENDENCE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 WHERE WE PROTECT PEOPLE IS DEPENDENT UPON A GOVERNING
2 STRUCTURE ONE THAT'S ACCOUNTABLE TO THE RIDERS THAT WILL BE
3 INCLUSIVE. AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME REFORM IN THE
4 GOVERNING STRUCTURE. LIKE IT OR NOT, WE'RE ALL GOING TO BE --
5 I'M UNFORTUNATELY AGEING IN THIS AREA -- I'M ALSO AN ADVOCATE
6 FOR SENIORS AND FOR DISABILITY PERSONS, AND THE DEMAND THAT'S
7 GOING TO COME ABOUT FOR THE INCREASING AGING POPULATION IS
8 REALLY, OBVIOUSLY, IT'S PRETTY APPARENT, IT'S GOING TO DEMAND
9 CHANGES. AND I REALLY, ACTUALLY, RESPECT COMPLEXITIES THAT ARE
10 INVOLVED. BUT I'M GOING TO KIND OF FINISH BY SAYING, I THINK
11 IN LIFE, I HAVE LEARNED THAT SOMETIMES IT'S A LITTLE BIT
12 BETTER NOW THAN LATER. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALLOWING,
13 YOU KNOW, THE PUBLIC TO SPEAK. I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE A LOT
14 MORE INCLUSION ON ALL OF THESE BOARDS FOR NOT ONLY THE FACT OF
15 THE IMPORTANCE OF THE PUBLIC, BUT THE FACT THAT THEIR THOUGHTS
16 AND THEIR EXPERTISE IS BROUGHT TO THE HIGHER LEVELS OF THE
17 DECISION-MAKING BODIES IN THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU.

18

19 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SANDRA. NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVID
20 THING.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HI EVERYBODY. I AM A RIDER IN THE BAY AREA, I USE
23 BART, VTA IN MY EVERYDAY LIFE. I THINK IT'S GOOD WE'RE WORKING
24 ON NETWORK INTEGRATION AND MANAGEMENT, AND I CONSULTANT PUT
25 TOGETHER THIS CONCEPT OF HOW TO GET THERE AND ALSO THINK



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 THROUGH ALL DIFFERENT COMPONENTS OF IT. MY CRITICISM -- I
2 GUESS NOT CRITICISM, BUT MY CRITIQUE WOULD BE THAT I THINK THE
3 NETWORK MANAGEMENT SYSTEM NEEDS TO BE FOCUSED AROUND KEY
4 PRINCIPLES ONE BEING ACCOUNTABILITY AND THE OTHER IS
5 VISIBILITY. WITH ACCOUNTABILITY, IT SHOULD BE RESPONSIBLE FOR
6 COORDINATING THE BAY AREA TRANSIT SYSTEM AND WHERE TO DIRECT
7 THEIR COMPLAINTS TO. A STRUCTURE WHERE THE RESPONSIBILITY AND
8 ACCOUNTABILITY IS CENTERED AROUND A BOARD IT'S NOT GOING TO BE
9 VERY USEFUL. THE NETWORK MANAGER FOR THEIR AGENCY SHOULD BE
10 VISIBLE AND CLEARLY STATED THRUWAY FINDING LOGOS OR WHATEVER
11 IT MAY BE. IT'S THOSE TWO CONCEPTS TOGETHER. I ASK THAT YOU
12 LOOK AT THE PROPOSAL TRY TO FOCUS MORE ATTENTION ON THE
13 NETWORK MANAGEMENT SIDE SO WE HAVE A COHERENT SYSTEM THAT
14 PEOPLE CAN USE RATHER THAN THIS PATCHWORK THAT DOESN'T SERVE
15 WHAT PEOPLE'S TRAVEL NEEDS ARE RIGHT NOW. THANK YOU.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SIMON TAN.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** SIMON TAN, I GREW UP IN THE BAY AREA. I WAS GLAD TO
20 SEE THE PROPOSAL AND DEDICATED STAFF AS JEFFREY TUMLIN POINTED
21 OUT THIS IS RADICAL IMPROVEMENT OVER STATUS QUO AND SHOULD
22 IMPROVE OVER TIME. BUT I AGREE WITH JIM AND ALICIA AND OTHERS
23 THAT THE PROPOSAL DOESN'T GO FAR ENOUGH TO ADDRESS SYSTEMIC
24 ISSUES OF PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. KEY PROBLEM SEEMS TO
25 BE LACK OF POLICY MAKER REPRESENTATION FROM THE RNM EXECUTIVE



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 BOARD PLUS LACK OF DECISION-MAKING AUTHORITY FROM THE BOARD
2 OVERALL AND IT'S NOT CLEAR THAT THIS IS SOLVABLE BY THIS BODY
3 OR THROUGH THIS PROCESS BUT I SEE THIS AS AN OBSTACLE THAT WE
4 SHOULD CONTINUALLY BE WORKING AROUND ONE SUGGESTION IS TO ADD
5 POLICY MAKER REPRESENTATION TO THE RNM EXECUTIVE BOARD AND
6 FIND WAYS TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS ENFORCEABLE AGAINST THE
7 INDIVIDUAL AGENCY BOARDS AND I UNDERSTAND THIS MAY BE SOMEWHAT
8 HARD AND UNCOMFORTABLE FOR INDIVIDUAL AGENCY BUT I IMPLORE
9 EVERYONE TO THINK BIGGER AND PUSH FOR TRANSFORMATIVE
10 IMPROVEMENTS IN THE EXPRESSED PURPOSE OF THE RNM MISSION
11 STATEMENT. I REALLY BELIEVE WE DESERVE HOLISTIC TRANSPORTATION
12 SYSTEMS HERE IN THE BAY AREA THAT REFLECT OUR REGION'S
13 RELEVANCE ON THE GLOBAL STAGE THAT MEANS OPEN TO LEARNING FROM
14 INTERNATIONAL BEST PRACTICES AND NOT HOLDING ON TO SACRED COWS
15 WITH REGARDS TO TRADITION AND LOCAL CONTROL. THANK YOU FOR
16 LISTENING.

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA
19 MALLON.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** MONICA MALLON TRANSIT RIDER AND ADVOCATE IN SANTA
22 CLARA COUNTY. UNLIKE SOME OTHER ADVOCATES THAT HAVE WRITTEN
23 IN, I SUPPORT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT EXECUTIVE BOARD
24 PROPOSAL, WITH GM'S AND APPRECIATE THE WORK OPERATORS HAVE
25 BROUGHT FORWARD, IMPORTANT TO REPRESENT AND UNDERSTAND INNER



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 WORKINGS OF THEIR AGENCIES AND WHAT MATTERS IS THE RIDERS
2 NEEDS, OVER TIME THROUGH LEARNING, I HAVE REALIZED THAT
3 TRANSIT IS REALLY COMPLICATED, FUNDING IS NEEDED AND THE
4 REALITY IS WE DON'T HAVE THE SAME LEVEL OF FUNDING FOR
5 OPERATIONS AND PROJECTS THAT THEY HAVE IN OTHER PARTS OF THE
6 WORLD. WE DON'T HAVE INADEQUATE TRANSIT BECAUSE GM'S DON'T
7 CARE WE HAVE INADEQUATE TRANSIT BECAUSE OF FUNDING. I
8 APPRECIATE THE PROPOSAL AND REALLY WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR
9 THE WORK ON THIS.

10

11 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MONICA. WALLY, DO WE HAVE ANY
12 OTHER SPEAKER CARDS? THAT CONCLUDES -- AH -- I'M SORRY. DAVE
13 SORRELL. MY APOLOGIES. THE FLOOR IS YOURS FOR TWO MINUTES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR. MY APOLOGIES. I JUST GOT BACK FROM A
16 MEETING WITH MY STUDENTS AT CAL, REGARDING THEIR BUS PASSES.
17 IRONICALLY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE FLOOR. THANK YOU TO
18 STAFF FOR ALL THE EFFORTS YOU HAVE BEEN DOING TO BUILD UP THE
19 CASE OF THE NETWORK MANAGER, AS WELL AS ENSURING THAT THERE IS
20 SOME LEVEL OF EQUAL PARTS TRANSPARENCY BUT ALSO EQUAL PARTS OF
21 ACCOUNTABILITY. ONE OF THE CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE EXPERIENCED
22 NOT ONLY FOR BEING BOTH WORKING IN TRANSIT IN BOTH THE BAY
23 AREA AND IN CHICAGO, WHERE REGIONAL CONNECTIVITY IS RATHER
24 CHALLENGING, I THINK MOVING FORWARD TOWARDS BOTH WHAT IS
25 PROPOSED, BUT ALSO BE COGNIZANT OF THE FACT THAT WHAT SEEMED



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 TO NOT HAVE WORKED IN THE PAST, I WOULD WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
2 FOR THE CUSTOMER, BOTH THOSE THAT HAVE THE ABILITY TO MOVE
3 AROUND BUT THOSE THAT DO NEED ACCESSIBILITY AND HELP CAN BE
4 HELD TO THE SAME STANDARD WHEN DELIVERING SERVICES, BUT ALSO
5 ENSURING THAT WHAT THE WORK IS DOING CAN REFLECT THAT. I
6 APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT HAVING A DEDICATED STAFF TOWARDS
7 REGIONAL NETWORK CONNECTIVITY IS ON THE BOARD. IN TERMS OF
8 GOVERNANCE, I THINK THAT MORE HAS TO BE DONE TO ENSURE THAT WE
9 DON'T END UP SINKING INTO WHAT DIDN'T WORK BEFORE THE
10 PANDEMIC. AND I THINK THAT IN ORDER FOR US TO BE GOOD STEWARDS
11 OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE, ESPECIALLY IF THERE ARE DISCUSSIONS OF
12 POSSIBLE REGIONAL MEASURES AND TEXTS, THAT WE CONTINUE TO BE
13 ACCOUNTABLE FOR BOTH THE PUBLIC, THOSE THAT ARE CHOICE RIDERS,
14 BUT THOSE THAT ACTUALLY NEED IT. CONTINUE THE GOOD WORK AND
15 CONTINUE THE REFORM EFFORTS. I YIELD.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS DAVE. WALLY IS THERE ANYBODY
18 ELSE?

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO. THERE IS NO MORE HANDS RAISED.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC COMMENT ON THESE
23 ITEMS. THAT WAS 4B. ITEM FIVE IS PUBLIC COMMENT DEALING WITH
24 NOT ANYTHING ON THE AGENDA DEALING WITH THE REGIONAL NETWORK



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 MANAGEMENT. IS THERE ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC THAT WISHES TO
2 ADDRESSED BODY.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO HANDS RAISED.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY. THIS WAS A
7 TREMENDOUS INVESTMENT OF TIME BY A LARGE GROUP OF PEOPLE BY
8 ALL MY COLLEAGUES HERE ON THE ADVISORY GROUP AND THE MEMBERS
9 OF THE PUBLIC WHO HUNG IN THERE. I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF AND
10 THE CONSULTANT TEAM FOR PUTTING FORWARD A VERY THOUGHTFUL
11 PROPOSAL. IT'S THE BAY AREA SO YOU NEVER GET UNANIMOUS VERDICT
12 ON THINGS. BUT YOU HEARD THE BROAD SUPPORT FOR THE IDEA WITH
13 SOME REFINEMENT IN NEAR-TERM AND LONGER TERM A COUPLE OF FOLKS
14 FELT IT DIDN'T GO FAR ENOUGH. I APPRECIATE EVERYONE SPENDING
15 SO MUCH TIME ON THIS EFFORT IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE IMPROVE
16 TRANSIT FOR THE REGION, FOR EQUITY ECONOMIC RECOVERY AND THE
17 REGION AND ADDRESS THE CLIMATE EMERGENCY. I APPRECIATE ALL THE
18 THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSION HOW WE COULD MOVE FORWARD DOING THINGS
19 DIFFERENTLY AND THE CONSULT TEAM AND MTC STAFF WILL GO BACK
20 COME BACK IN DECEMBER 12TH. SO WITH THAT, WE WILL MOVE TO
21 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
22 BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP WHICH SAY MOUTHFUL IS TENTATIVELY
23 SCHEDULED FOR MONDAY DECEMBER 12TH AT 1:00 P.M. REMOTELY AND
24 BY WEBCAST AS APPROPRIATE MORE TO FOLLOW ON THAT ANY CHANGES



NOVEMBER 14, 2022

1 TO THE TIME WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THING PUBLIC. WITH THAT,

2 WE ARE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43



Broadcasting Government