



# **BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE**

## **Meeting Transcript**



MAY 20, 2022

**BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE**

**FRIDAY, MAY 20, 2022 10:05 AM**

**AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I'M CHAIR AMY WORTH. IT'S MY PLEASURE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE BOARD MEETING FOR FRIDAY MAY 20TH. MAY I TURN TO OUR CLERK, SERENA, COULD YOU PLEASE KINDLY CALL THE ROLL?

**CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I CAN.

**AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I GUESS WE HAVE THE COVID ANNOUNCEMENT, THEN WE CALL THE ROLL. THANK YOU.

**CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THAT'S RIGHT.

**AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST



MAY 20, 2022

1 FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC  
2 SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING  
3 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS  
4 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL  
5 BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD,  
6 BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN  
7 FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT  
8 THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO PARTICIPATE,  
9 PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SERENA COULD YOU CALL THE ROLL, PLEASE.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ARREGUIN? RABBIT? RAMOS?

14

15 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HUDSON?

18

19 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BARRETT? BAUTERS?

22

23 **JOHN BAUTERS:** PRESENT.

24

25 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. HAUBERT?



MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **DAVID HAUBERT:** PRESENT.

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. ROSS?

5

6 **MARK ROSS:** PRESENT.

7

8 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GIOIA?

9

10 **JOHN GIOIA:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PINE?

13

14 **DAVE PINE:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WAGENKNECHT?

17

18 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN?

21

22 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? SPERING? AND WORTH?

25



MAY 20, 2022

1   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HERE.

2

3   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

4

5   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MODIFICATION TO THE

6   AGENDA ORDER AND MOVE THE BARC SHARED WORK PLAN UP. SO IT

7   WOULD FOLLOW -- IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

8   SO, SINCE WE'RE MAKING THIS CHANGE, NORMALLY WE DON'T AMEND --

9   YOU KNOW, WE -- THE AGENDA HAPPENS AS IS, I WOULD ENTERTAIN A

10   MOTION TO AMEND THE AGENDA.

11

12   **BELIA RAMOS:** SO MOVED.

13

14   **JOHN BAUTERS:** SECONDS.

15

16   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOVED BY? RAMOS?

17

18   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND SECOND BY?

19

20   **JOHN BAUTERS:** BAUTERS.

21

22   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC DISCUSSION ON

23   THIS? ALL RIGHT. MAY WE PLEASE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE?

24

25   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** YES. ARREGUIN? RABBIT? RAMOS?



MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HUDSON?

5

6 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES BARRETT? BAUTERS?

7

8 **JOHN BAUTERS:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT?

11

12 **DAVID HAUBERT:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ROSS?

15

16 **MARK ROSS:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GIOIA?

19

20 **JOHN GIOIA:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PINE?

23

24 **DAVE PINE:** YES WAGENKNECHT?

25



MAY 20, 2022

1    **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** YES.

2

3    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN?

4

5    **ZACK WASSERMAN:** YES.

6

7    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? SPERING? AND WORTH?

8

9    **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

10

11    **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MOTION PASSES.

14

15    **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OUR NEXT ITEM IS OUR GOVERNING BOARD

16    ANNOUNCEMENTS. ANY MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS? OKAY, I DON'T SEE ANY

17    HAND UP. OKAY. WE'LL MOVE ON NOW TO THE CHAIR'S REPORT. AND I

18    DON'T HAVE ANYTHING, EITHER, TO REPORT. LET'S MOVE ON TO THE

19    CONSENT CALENDAR. ARE THERE ANY ITEMS THAT EITHER MEMBERS OF

20    THE COMMITTEE, STAFF, OR THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO REMOVE FROM

21    THE CONSENT CALENDAR? OKAY. SEEING NONE, THEN I WOULD

22    ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

23

24    **DAVE PINE:** MOVE APPROVAL.

25



MAY 20, 2022

1    **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOVED BY PINE.

2

3    **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** SECOND.

4

5    **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AND SECOND BY COMMISSIONER WAGENKNECHT. SO,  
6    THANK YOU. WITH THAT, MAY WE PLEASE HAVE A ROLL CALL?

7

8    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** YES. THANK YOU. ARREGUIN? RABBIT? RAMOS?

9

10    **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

11

12    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HUDSON?

13

14    **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.

15

16    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BARRETT? BAUTERS?

17

18    **JOHN BAUTERS:** AYE.

19

20    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT?

21

22    **DAVID HAUBERT:** AYE.

23

24    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ROSS?

25





MAY 20, 2022

1   **MARK ROSS:** AYE.

2

3   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GIOIA?

4

5   **JOHN GIOIA:** AYE.

6

7   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PINE?

8

9   **DAVE PINE:** YES.

10

11   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WAGENKNECHT?

12

13   **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** YES.

14

15   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN?

16

17   **ZACK WASSERMAN:** YES.

18

19   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA, SPERING, AND WORTH?

20

21   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

22

23   **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES.

24



MAY 20, 2022

1   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. LET'S MOVE TO ITEM --  
2   WHICH WAS ITEM SIX, NOW IS THE BARC SHARED WORK PLAN. AND,  
3   FIRST OF ALL, BEFORE I TURN IT OVER TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR,  
4   I REALLY JUST WANTED TO THANK ALLISON AND THE TEAM FOR ALL THE  
5   HARD WORK ON THIS, AND THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS FOR YOUR WORK,  
6   AND THE PUBLIC INPUT, AND EVERYBODY WHO WORKED ON THIS. AND  
7   ALLISON, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU FOR THE INTRODUCTION. I  
8   THINK WE CONCLUDED THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD ON MAY 6TH NOW  
9   THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. ALLISON.

10

11   **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU EVERYONE FOR BEING HERE TODAY, AND I  
12   HAVE A BRIEF POWERPOINT IF FOLKS CAN BRING THAT UP? THANK YOU.  
13   NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. JUST AS A REMINDER, WE HAD, YOU KNOW, THE  
14   DEVELOPMENT OF THIS WORK PLAN, WE HAVE THE DRAFT THAT WAS  
15   OPENED UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENT, AND WE EXTENDED THE PUBLIC  
16   COMMENT PERIOD UNTIL MAY 6TH, PER THE REQUEST OF STAKEHOLDERS  
17   WHO WERE INTERESTED. THERE WAS A LOT OF INTEREST THAT EMERGED  
18   ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF THIS WORK PLAN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
19   DURING THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD, AND, AGAIN, THIS WASN'T  
20   SOMETHING, HONESTLY, THAT I HAD, YOU KNOW, HAD THE PROCESS  
21   WHERE WE DEVELOPED A DOCUMENT LIKE THIS AND OPENED IT UP FOR  
22   PUBLIC COMMENT, AND I WAS REALLY PLEASED AND EXCITED ABOUT THE  
23   FEEDBACK AND INPUT RECEIVED FROM A NUMBER OF STAKEHOLDERS, THE  
24   LETTERS RECEIVED ARE IN THE DOCUMENT THAT WAS IN YOUR PACKET,  
25   THE FINAL SHARED WORK PLAN. AND GOT A LOT OF GREAT INPUT.



MAY 20, 2022

1 INITIALLY THERE WAS A FEELING THAT THIS WAS BEING DONE IN A  
2 TOP-DOWN MANNER, AND I TAKE RESPONSIBILITY IN TERMS OF HOW IT  
3 WAS COMMUNICATED IN THE INITIAL DRAFT. WE WERE MOVING FAIRLY  
4 QUICKLY TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE OPPORTUNITIES EMERGING FROM  
5 THE STATE AND FEDERAL AGENCIES, AND NEW RESOURCES COMING  
6 FORWARD TO SUPPORT CLIMATE CHANGE EFFORTS IN LOCALITIES, AND  
7 THE ROLE, AND THINKING THROUGH WITH THE ROLE OF THE REGIONAL  
8 AGENCIES AND SUPPORTING THESE EFFORTS. SO THE INPUT WAS  
9 INCREDIBLE HELPFUL, AND I THINK IT HELPED ENRICH A NUMBER OF  
10 CONVERSATIONS AND BUILDING PARTNERSHIPS AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR  
11 FURTHER COOPERATED ACTIONS ACROSS THE REGION. AND THEN I'LL  
12 TALK A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT MOVING FORWARD, BUT IT REALLY, IN  
13 ANY CASE, ALLOWED FOR THE REFINEMENT OF THE INITIATIVES, AND  
14 THERE WAS A LOT OF WORK THAT HAPPENED BETWEEN THE RELEASE OF  
15 THE DRAFT WITH STAFF, UNDERSTANDING MORE ALIGNMENT WITH  
16 EXISTING EFFORTS UNDERWAY AT THE AGENCIES, AND THEN REALLY  
17 THINKING FURTHER ABOUT THE VALUE-ADD OF WORKING TOGETHER  
18 THROUGH THESE INITIATIVES OUTLINED IN THE SHARED WORK PLAN.  
19 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS A REMINDER, WE HAD GOALS AROUND  
20 IDENTIFYING HIGH PRIORITY ACTIONS THAT WE COULD WORK TOGETHER  
21 ON AND ACHIEVE RESULTS IN THE NEXT 1 TO 5 YEARS. UNDERSTANDING  
22 THESE INITIATIVES WOULD NEED TO HAVE APPROPRIATE STAFF AND  
23 TIME RESOURCES TO HELP THEM BE SUCCESSFUL, CERTAINLY  
24 PRIORITIZE SOCIAL EQUITY AND JUSTICE INCLUSION ACROSS ALL  
25 PROJECTS. I'LL TALK TO THAT AS WE WALK THROUGH THEM. REALLY



MAY 20, 2022

1 THINKING THROUGH AS AGENCIES HOW WE'RE SUPPORTING AND THINKING  
2 ABOUT OUR ENGAGEMENT WITH CITIES, COUNTIES, SPECIAL DISTRICTS,  
3 AND COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND REALLY DESIGNING THESE  
4 EFFORTS TO BE ORIENTED TOWARD SUPPORTING LOCAL ACTION, AND  
5 FIGURING OUT HOW WE'RE GOING TO MONITOR AND EVALUATE OUR  
6 SUCCESS OVER TIME. NEXT SLIDE. THE CRITERIA WAS AROUND  
7 EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT, ALSO MAKING SURE THAT WE WERE  
8 EXCITED, THAT STAFF IS EXCITED TO WORK. WE THINK THESE ARE  
9 IMPORTANT INITIATIVES. WE WANTED TO WORK ON THEM BECAUSE WE  
10 THINK THEY'RE IMPORTANT. THEY'RE ALSO REALISTIC, WE ALSO FEEL  
11 LIKE THESE ARE THINGS THAT I WE CAN ACCOMPLISH TOGETHER AND DO  
12 WE HAVE THE RESOURCES AND DELIVERY AND OF COURSE POSITIVE  
13 EQUITY OUTCOMES. NEXT SLIDE. I HAVE HAD CONVERSATIONS WITH THE  
14 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE SEVEN AGENCIES ALL SEVEN OF THE  
15 AGENCIES INVOLVED WITH BARC AND THAT INCLUDES MTC, ABAG, BCDC,  
16 ALONG WITH THE AIR DISTRICT, AND CALTRANS WHO HAVE  
17 COMMUNICATED THEY'RE INTERESTED IN WORKING ON THIS EFFORT  
18 ALONG WITH THE STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY AND SAN FRANCISCO  
19 WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD AND REALLY SUPPORTING THE REGIONAL  
20 AGENCIES IN REGIONAL PROGRAMS SUPPORTING THE ECOSYSTEMS  
21 EFFORTS AND ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES TO ACHIEVE CLIMATE  
22 CHANGE RESULTS AND THE ROLES INCLUDING FEDERAL GOVERNMENT  
23 PROVIDING HIGH-LEVEL RESOURCES, AND AT THE LOCAL LEVEL WHERE  
24 THE RUBBER MEETS THE ROAD AND INCLUSIVE COMMUNITY-BASED  
25 PROBLEM SOLVING WHERE ACTIONS EFFORT ANDS NEED TO HAPPEN ON



MAY 20, 2022

1 THE GROUND THAT'S REALLY WHERE A LOT OF THE IDENTIFICATION OF  
2 RISK MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES HAVE TO TAKE PLACE AND PROJECT  
3 IMPLEMENTATION AND FINANCING AND OF COURSE MAINTENANCE OF  
4 THESE PROJECTS. BUT THEN WHAT IS OUR ROLE AS REGIONAL AGENCIES  
5 IN SUPPORTING THIS ECOSYSTEM, THAT, ALMOST, AS AN INTERMEDIARY  
6 IN HELPING PROVIDE GUIDANCE AND CRITERIA DEVELOPING GRANT  
7 PROGRAMS TO SUPPORT LOCAL STAKEHOLDERS HELPING BUILD CAPACITY  
8 AND OF COURSE THERE IS A REGULATORY ROLE THAT SOME OF OUR  
9 AGENCIES PLAY. AND REALLY THINKING ABOUT HOW ALL THIS WORKS  
10 TOGETHER TO ACHIEVE RESULTS FOR PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITIES IN  
11 THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE WORKED TOGETHER ON THIS  
12 EFFORT, AND CONVENING THE THROUGH WITH THE WORKING GROUPS  
13 THROUGH THE DETAILED STRATEGIES AND THEY ARE JOINING US TODAY  
14 IF ANY QUESTIONS COME UP. BUT WE LANDED ON THREE INITIATIVES,  
15 AND WE SHIFTED ONE TO MORE OF AN EXPLORATORY EFFORT BECAUSE  
16 WE'RE NOT QUITE AT A DETAILED SENSE OF WHERE WE GO WITH THIS,  
17 BUT WE THINK IT'S IMPORTANT AND WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO EXPLORE  
18 IT AROUND THE LOW CARBON HIGH EQUITY NEIGHBORHOODS. WE HAVE  
19 TWO TO WALK THROUGH AROUND CLIMATE ADAPTATION AND ONE SPECIFIC  
20 INITIATIVE AROUND GHG REDUCTION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'LL GO  
21 INTO THE DEVELOPMENT OF A MULTI-REGIONAL MULTI-HAZARD ADAPTING  
22 A PLAN AND ESTABLISHING AND DEVELOPING A REGIONAL TECHNICAL  
23 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM TO SUPPORT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN ADVANCING  
24 SHARED APPROACH TO ADAPTATION AND PLANNING IMPLEMENTATION.  
25 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS A CHALLENGE STATEMENT. YOU HAVE



MAY 20, 2022

1 SEEN THIS BEFORE IN EARLIER PRESENTATIONS. I'M NOT GOING TO  
2 READ IT TO YOU, BUT IT'S REALLY AROUND UNDERSTANDING THAT SOME  
3 STANDARDIZED, SOME COORDINATED APPROACH ACROSS THE REGION WILL  
4 REALLY HELP SUPPORT LOCAL ACTIONS, HELP BUILD CAPACITY WHERE  
5 IN PLACES THEY'RE NOT -- THEY -- WE CERTAINLY DON'T WANT OUR  
6 FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES TO BE AT DISADVANTAGE WE WILL HAVE A  
7 WHOLE RANGE OF ACTIVITIES THAT NEED TO HAPPEN ON THE GROUND  
8 THROUGH THE DEVELOPMENT OF A FRAMEWORK OR A PLAN ACROSS THE  
9 REGION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THROUGH THIS WE WANT TO WORK WITH  
10 PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS TO DEVELOP A MULTI-HAZARD ADAPTATION  
11 PLAN THAT SUPPORTS DEPLOYMENT OF EFFECTIVE RISK MANAGEMENT  
12 STRATEGIES AND EQUITABLE MULTI-BENEFIT CLIMATE ADAPTATION  
13 PROJECTS AT THE APPROPRIATE GEOGRAPHIC SCALE AT THE SAN  
14 FRANCISCO BAY AREA. THIS IS A PROCESS. THIS IS AN ITERATIVE  
15 PROCESS, AND IT WILL INVOLVE ENGAGEMENT WITH A NUMBER OF  
16 STAKEHOLDERS THAT MANY OF WHOM ARE OUTLINED IN THE WORK PLAN  
17 ITSELF, AND IN THE DOCUMENT YOU HAVE. THAT IT REALLY REQUIRES  
18 STRONG COORDINATION AMONG, NOT ONLY OUR AGENCIES, BUT WORKING  
19 WITH THE COUNTIES, CITIES, SPECIAL DISTRICTS, AND COMMUNITY  
20 LEADERS TO REALLY UNDERSTAND WHAT'S CRITICAL TO HAVE IN THIS  
21 PLAN. AND A KEY COMPONENT OF THIS PROJECT, AND ESPECIALLY IN  
22 YEAR ONE IS REALLY TO UNDERSTAND AND OUTLINE THE DISTINCT  
23 ROLES OF THE REGIONAL AGENCIES IN SUPPORTING MULTI-HAZARD  
24 ADAPTATION, AND ALONG THE DIFFERENT HAZARDS. SO THERE MAY NOT  
25 NECESSARILY BE A REGIONAL DISTINCT REGIONAL ROLE FOR ALL OF



MAY 20, 2022

1 THESE STANDARDS BUT WE WANT TO UNDERSTAND THE LAY OF THE LAND  
2 AND MAP THAT OUT AND THINK THROUGH THE ROLES AND  
3 RESPONSIBILITIES FOR OUR REGIONAL AGENCIES AND OTHERS AND  
4 UNDERSTAND HOW IT RELATES TO OTHERS ACROSS THE REGION. THIS  
5 WILL BE BUILDING A BCDC LED EFFORT AROUND A REGIONAL SHORELINE  
6 ADAPTATION PLAN WE WANT TO WORK WITH BCDC THROUGH THIS PROCESS  
7 AND UNDERSTAND HOW IT CAN APPLY TO OTHER HAZARDS AS WELL.  
8 SECOND, THE INITIATIVE IS REALLY TIED WITH A REGIONAL MULTI-  
9 HAZARD IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AGAIN THIS WILL INVOLVE A LOT OF  
10 INTERACTION AND PARTNERSHIP IDEALLY WITH SOME STAKEHOLDERS ON  
11 THE GROUND AND, YOU KNOW, LOCAL GOVERNMENTS HAVE DIFFERENT  
12 LEVELS OF CAPACITY AND RESOURCES AVAILABLE TO THEM TO CONDUCT  
13 ADAPTATION PLANNING AND, ESPECIALLY OUR FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES.  
14 AND WE JUST, PART OF THIS IS WHAT'S REGIONAL ROLE IN  
15 SUPPORTING EFFORTS ON THE GROUND AND SUPPORTING SOME  
16 CONSISTENT EFFORTS AND ALSO SUPPORTING CAPACITY, AND THAT'S A  
17 WHOLE HOST OF STAKEHOLDERS THAT NEED TO BE AT THE TABLE AROUND  
18 PROBLEM SOLVING, AROUND RISK MANAGEMENT. SO, AGAIN, HAVING A  
19 LOT OF DISCUSSIONS AND ENGAGEMENT WITH STAKEHOLDERS TO  
20 UNDERSTAND HOW WE CAN BEST OPTIMIZE OUR ROLE AS REGIONAL  
21 AGENCIES, AND THIS WHOLE ECOSYSTEM OF EFFORTS. NEXT SLIDE  
22 PLEASE. AS I SAID, WE'LL WORK WITH STAKE HOLDERS TO DEVELOP  
23 SUCH A PROGRAM, AND UNDERSTANDING, YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT BARC  
24 THAT'S LEADING THIS, BUT WORKING, FACILITATING CONVERSATIONS  
25 AMONG THE AGENCIES, AND REALLY LIFTING UP WHAT MANY AGENCIES



MAY 20, 2022

1 ARE ALREADY PROVIDING SOME VERSION OF TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE  
2 JUST MAPPING OUT WHAT THAT AUTHORITY IS AND HOW WE MIGHT GET  
3 ADDITIONAL RESOURCES AND HOW TO SUPPORT EFFORTS ON THE GROUND,  
4 DEVELOPING A CLEARINGHOUSE OR STOREFRONT OF DATA AND STANDARDS  
5 AND GUIDANCE AS ONE EFFORT WE CAN TAKE ON AND PROVIDING EASY  
6 ACCESS TO INFORMATION THAT HELPS LIFT UP THE BEST PRACTICES  
7 THAT ARE ALREADY HAPPENING AROUND OUR REGION. YOU KNOW, IN SAN  
8 MATEO COUNTY, REALLY BEEN A LEADER AROUND ADAPTATION EFFORTS.  
9 HOW DO WE TAKE WHAT'S HAPPENING THERE AND BRING IT TO SCALE  
10 ACROSS THE REGION AND EXAMPLES OF OTHER CITIES AND COUNTIES  
11 DOING GREAT WORK SO AGAIN GETTING BACK TO THAT REGIONAL ROLE  
12 IN SUPPORTING THESE EFFORTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THEN  
13 MOVING INTO THE GHG REDUCTION INITIATIVES. THE INITIATIVE WE  
14 LANDED ON HERE WAS A ZERO-EMISSION TRANSIT BUS INFRASTRUCTURE.  
15 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD HAS A REQUIREMENT THAT 25% OF  
16 LARGE OPERATORS AND BUS OPERATORS NEED TO PURCHASE ZERO-  
17 EMISSIONS BUSES BY 2023 AND 100% OF THEIR BUSES NEED TO BE 0-  
18 EMISSIONS. THE CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE WILL ENSURE TO BE IN  
19 PLACE TO SUPPORT THIS MASS OF TRANSITION OF BUSES OVER TO  
20 ZERO-EMISSIONS. TRANSIT IS LEADING THE CHARGE, THAT'S MY JOKE  
21 THERE AROUND THE ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS TRANSITION STRATEGY SO  
22 REALLY WANT TO ENHANCE THE WORK THAT'S HAPPENING THERE, BUT  
23 EXPLORE THESE ISSUES THAT ARE EMERGING AND JUST BEING MINDFUL  
24 OF THE ISSUES THAT ARE EMERGING AROUND CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE  
25 AND MAKING SURE THE CONVERSATIONS ARE HAPPENING AMONG THE KEY





MAY 20, 2022

1 STAKEHOLDER IN THIS SPACE SO REALLY TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHAT  
2 BARC'S ROLE AND VALUE-ADD COULD BE AND BARC BEING IN MULTIPLE  
3 AGENCIES WORKING TOGETHER ON THIS AND THINKING THROUGH HOW TO  
4 ESTABLISH RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN THE REGIONAL AGENCIES, THE  
5 OPERATORS, MANUFACTURERS, THE UTILITIES TO BE MINDFUL OF THIS  
6 AND CONTINUE TO WORK TOGETHER IN AN INTERACTIVE MANNER TO  
7 SUPPORT THE WORK HERE AND TO DO SOME ANALYSIS AND WORK TO  
8 UNDERSTAND THE KIND OF EMERGING ISSUES AROUND THE CHARGING  
9 INFRASTRUCTURE ITSELF AND THE ISSUES AND OPPORTUNITIES AROUND  
10 THAT. AND FINALLY THE AREA THAT WE'LL CONTINUE TO EXPLORE  
11 AROUND THE LOW CARBON HIGH EQUITY NEIGHBORHOODS IS ALIGNED  
12 DIFFERENT BUT IN A RELATED AGENCY PROGRAM TO DEVELOP A MORE  
13 HOLISTIC APPROACH TO FOSTERING AFFORDABLE HEALTHY ZERO  
14 EMISSION NEIGHBORHOODS. WE GOT FEEDBACK IN SOME LETTERS AND  
15 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON THIS. THERE IS DEFINITELY A LOT OF  
16 INTEREST. THE CITY OF SAN JOSE IS DOING SOME GOOD WORK ON  
17 THIS, THAT WE WANT ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF LEADERSHIP AT THE LOCAL  
18 LEVEL THAT WE COULD LEARN FROM AND HELP THINK THROUGH HOW  
19 AGENCIES COULD DO BETTER ALIGNING OUR PROGRAMS TO DELIVER  
20 RESULTS ON THE GROUND AND AT THE RIGHT SCALE AND THINKING  
21 THROUGH ALL THESE DIFFERENT PROGRAMS IS HOW THEY COULD BE MORE  
22 ALIGNED TO SUPPORT THOSE EFFORTS. SO THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE  
23 GOING TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON TOGETHER AND LEARN FROM SOME OF  
24 THE WORK HAPPENING ACROSS THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS A  
25 LOT THIS REPORT, IN THE DOCUMENT. I HOPE YOU GET A CHANCE TO



MAY 20, 2022

1 LOOK AT IT. MY RECOMMENDATION TO YOU IS APPROVE THIS SHARED  
2 WORK PLAN WITH THE CONDITION, YOU KNOW, THERE IS STILL A LOT  
3 OF WORK TO DO AND THIS IS AN ITERATIVE PROCESS. THIS IS A LOT  
4 TO TAKE ON. THERE ARE FURTHER DETAILS TO WORK OUT FOR EACH OF  
5 THESE INITIATIVES AND WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON THAT AND  
6 BRING FORWARD FURTHER DETAILS. I THINK THE BEST TIME TO DO  
7 THAT WOULD BE AT OUR SEPTEMBER MEETING IN 2022. SO, JUST IN  
8 TERMS OF NEXT STEPS, YOU KNOW, IF I COULD GET YOUR APPROVAL ON  
9 MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS, YOU KNOW, WE WOULD IDENTIFY WORK  
10 GROUPS, OFFICIAL WORK GROUPS FOR EACH INITIATIVE AND SOME OF  
11 THOSE ARE ALREADY IN PLACE. A FURTHERED DETAILED SCOPE OF WORK  
12 FOR EACH INITIATIVE AND THEN WORK WITH STAKEHOLDERS AND  
13 PARTNERS TO OUTLINE AN ENGAGEMENT STRATEGY FOR EACH OF THE  
14 INITIATIVES. AND A LOT OF THIS, SOME OF THE SCALE OF THIS WILL  
15 BE DEPENDENT IN PART ON THE TASK INVOLVED AND SOME OF THESE  
16 INITIATIVES ACTUALLY IS IN APPLYING FOR STATE MONEY TO REALLY  
17 MAKE THESE MORE ROBUST. AND ALSO THAT'S PART OF THE EFFORT  
18 THAT WILL BE SUPPORTING SOME OF THE MEMBER AGENCIES ON. BUT  
19 THAT IS MY FINAL SLIDE. SO, I'LL HAND IT OVER TO YOU, CHAIR.  
20 THANK YOU. HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION AND FOR YOUR  
23 INCREDIBLE -- OOPS ARE WE UNFROZEN? I WAS FROZEN FOR A MINUTE.  
24 THANK YOU FOR YOUR INCREDIBLE WORK. I WILL START WITH  
25 QUESTIONS THE BOARD HAS THEN GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT THEN COME



MAY 20, 2022

1 BACK FOR BOARD DISCUSSION. FIRST OF ALL, ARE THERE ANY  
2 QUESTIONS REGARDING THE REPORT AND PRESENTATION? I DO NOT SEE  
3 ANY FLAGS. SERENA DO YOU SEE ANY FLAGS UP? THANK YOU VERY  
4 MUCH. IT'S GOOD TO HAVE TWO EYES ON THE SCREEN. LET'S MOVE TO  
5 OUR PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. FIRST OF ALL, SERENA, HAVE WE  
6 RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC CORRESPOND?

7

8 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MADAM CHAIR, I HAVEN'T RECEIVED ANY  
9 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE, AND FOR THE PUBLIC COMMENT I'LL BE  
10 STARTING A TIMER FOR TWO MINUTES ONCE WE ACTIVATE THEIR  
11 ABILITY TO SPEAK.

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. PERFECT.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HELLO THIS IS MICHAEL MCCORE MAC THE DIRECTOR OF THE  
16 BAY CLIMATE ADAPTATION NETWORK THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR BEING  
17 HERE TODAY FOR THE SHARED WORK PLAN THANK YOU TO STAFF AND THE  
18 CONSULTING TEAM DEVELOPING THIS REVISED WORK PLAN. I WANT TO  
19 RESPOND TO THE THOUGHTFUL DELIBERATIVE PROCESS FOR THE WORK  
20 PLANS. BAYCAN IS CONNECTED WITH A NUMBER OF ORGANIZATIONS THAT  
21 SUBMITTED LETTERS AND FELT MANY COMMENTS WERE ALIGNED SO  
22 HOPEFUL THAT THE CHANGES IN THE WORK PLANS ALSO RESPOND TO  
23 MANY OF THOSE LETTERS THAT HELPER SUBMITTED. I WANT TO  
24 HIGHLIGHT THE LETTERS FOLLOWING THROUGH ON THE COMMITMENTS TO  
25 THE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE WORK PLANS



MAY 20, 2022

1 AND SHARED WORK PLANS THAT WILL COME FORWARD TO THE GOVERNING  
2 BOARD IN SEPTEMBER FOR CONSIDERATION. THE BAYCAN IS EAGER TO  
3 WORK ACROSS THE BAY TO SUPPORT AN INCLUSIONARY PROCESS TO THE  
4 PROPOSED INITIATIVES. I WANT TO THANK ALLISON AND THE BARC  
5 TEAM AND THE CONSULTING TEAM FOR INCLUDING AND RESPONDING TO  
6 THE COMMENTS EFFECTIVELY. AND THANK YOU, ALL, AGAIN, ON THE  
7 GOVERNING BOARD FOR YOUR COMMITMENT TO A MORE RESILIENT AND  
8 SUSTAINABLE REGION. THANK YOU.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. MICHAEL, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR  
11 COMMENTS AND FOR YOUR INVOLVEMENT IN THIS PROCESS. LOOK  
12 FORWARD TO WORKING TOGETHER IN THE COMING MONTHS AND IN THE  
13 COMING YEARS ON THIS. I DON'T -- SERENA, DO YOU SEE? WAIT  
14 MAINTAIN. I SEE -- OKAY. I SEE WARNER CHABOT. WELCOME.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I THINK I UNMUTED MYSELF. WARINER SHOULD BOAT SAN  
17 FRANCISCO ESTUARY INSTITUTE. I WANT TO THANK ALLISON, THE BARC  
18 TEAM, AS WELL AS THE ARUP FOR WHAT I FEEL IS A PROACTIVE  
19 RESPONSE TO COMMENTS THAT CAME IN. I THINK THERE'S A CLEAR  
20 RECOGNITION IN THIS DRAFT DOCUMENT THAT THERE IS AN IMPORTANT  
21 AND DELICATE PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE CITIES AND COUNTIES THAT  
22 HAVE PRIMARY LAND USE AUTHORITY ALONG WITH THE COMMUNITY-BASED  
23 ORGANIZATIONS WHO, TOGETHER WITH CITIES AND COUNTIES, REALLY  
24 ARE ON THE FRONT LINES OF CLIMATE ADAPTATION. THAT NEEDS TO BE  
25 BALANCED WITH THE VERY CRITICAL IMPORTANT ROLE OF REGIONAL



MAY 20, 2022

1 AGENCIES THAT HAVE LARGE-SCALE ANALYTICAL CAPABILITIES AND  
2 UNDERSTAND AND CAN CONTRIBUTE TO POLICIES AND PLANNING THAT  
3 LOOKS AT THE RANGE OF ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS ACROSS THE ENTIRE  
4 NINE COUNTY REGION. TWO POINTS I WANT TO MAKE BOTH RELATED TO  
5 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE. IN A RECENT GATHERING HOSTED BY BAYCAN,  
6 ABOUT 20 LOCAL GOVERNMENT PLANNER OFFICIALS TALKED ABOUT THE  
7 NEEDS GOING FORWARD IN THE COMING YEAR. THEIR NUMBER ONE  
8 PRIORITY THAT FOR NOT ONLY CITIES BUT COUNTIES IS RELATED TO  
9 CAPACITY BUILDING, THE NEED TO BUILD UP STAFF CAPACITY TO  
10 INTERACT WITH THE REGIONAL AGENCY IN PROVIDING THESE GRANTS.  
11 TO THE DEGREE THAT THE BARC PROCESS LOOKS AT SUPPORTING  
12 CITIES, COUNTIES, AND CBOS, I WOULD URGE AT THE HIGHEST  
13 PRIORITY TO LOOK AT GRANT FUNDING THAT PROVIDES CAPACITY  
14 BUILDING TO THE CITY AND COUNTY PLANNING OFFICIALS AND CBOS  
15 THEY CAN FULLY PARTICIPATE IN THE PROCESS. SECONDLY AND LASTLY  
16 I WOULD NOTE ON TECHNICAL SUPPORT LOCAL ORGANIZATIONS LIKE THE  
17 SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY INSTITUTE HAVE BEEN PROVIDING  
18 SIGNIFICANT TECHNICAL SUPPORT FOR OVER TWO DECADES AND WE LOOK  
19 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU TO SEE HOW WE CAN CONTINUE TO  
20 PROVIDE AND BETTER PROVIDE THAT SUPPORT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS. SERENA, DO YOU  
23 SEE ANY OTHER HANDS?

24



MAY 20, 2022

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NOT SEEING ANY HAND RAISED AT THE  
2 MOMENT, CHAIR.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY GOOD. AND I WANT TO NOTE FOR THE RECORD  
5 THAT MAYOR ARREGUIN HAS JOINED US. THERE HE IS IN PERSON. OH  
6 MY GOSH.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** LIVE FROM JERUSALEM.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GOOD TO SEE YOU THERE, JESS, YOU  
11 LOOK RELAXED. SEEING NO FURTHER COMMENT. I'LL TURN IT BACK TO  
12 THE BOARD FOR ANY DISCUSSION. I KNOW THAT -- MAY WE TURN TO  
13 MAYOR BAUTERS? I WOULD LIKE TO OFFER YOU THE OPPORTUNITY. I  
14 KNOW YOUR TIME IS TIGHT WITH YOUR TRAVEL SCHEDULE. IF YOU HAVE  
15 ANY COMMENTS PLEASE JUMP IN.

16

17 **JOHN BAUTERS:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK ALLISON AND STAFF FOR  
18 PUTTING THIS TOGETHER, AND SPECIAL APPRECIATION TO THE  
19 ADVOCATES WHO HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS AND HELPING ENSURE  
20 THAT OUR COORDINATED WORK PLAN HERE IS ONE THAT WE CAN ALL GET  
21 BEHIND TO DO THE RIGHT THING. I HAVE NO QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS  
22 BEYOND THAT, AND I APPRECIATE EVERYONE'S TIME.

23

24 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND THANKS  
25 FOR BEING ABLE TO MEET WITH US THIS MORNING. GRATEFUL TO



MAY 20, 2022

1 EVERYBODY'S EFFORTS TO JOIN THIS MEETING TODAY. SO, I NOW --

2 YES, MAYOR ARREGUIN?

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** WELL, THANK YOU SO MUCH.

5

6 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HE DROPPED OFF. LET ME DO THIS, TAKE ANOTHER

7 COMMENT. AND WHEN THE MAYOR JUMPS BACK ON WE CAN TAKE HIS

8 COMMENT. ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS? OH THERE YOU

9 ARE JESSE.

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** I LOST MY CONNECTION. APOLOGIES. I

12 WANT TO TAKE THE OPPORTUNITY TO THANK ALLISON, STAFF, AND THE

13 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS. THIS IS REALLY AN EXCITING MOMENT FOR

14 BACH. I THINK THIS PLAN SETS US ON A PATH WORKING TOGETHER AS

15 A REGIONAL AGENCY TO ADDRESS THE CRITICAL CHALLENGES TO

16 ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE. IT HAS IMPACTFUL AND THOUGHTFUL

17 PROPOSALS IN THE WORK OF OUR REGULATORY AUTHORITY AND ALL THE

18 WORK OF OUR DIFFERENT RESPECTIVE AGENCIES. I WANT TO EXPRESS

19 MY CLIMATE, APPRECIATION, AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALL

20 OF US ON THE BOARD TO HELP MAKE THIS WORK PLAN A REALITY.

21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, JESS. AND THANK YOU

24 FOR JOINING US FROM FAR AWAY. MAY I TURN TO MR. WASSERMAN?

25 ZACK?



MAY 20, 2022

1

2     **ZACK WASSERMAN:** THANK YOU, AMY. JUST A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. I  
3     SHARE IN THE THANKS TO THE WORK THAT'S GONE INTO THIS AND THE  
4     OPENNESS TO THE PUBLIC BROADER OPPORTUNITIES WE AT BCDC HAVE  
5     LEARNED THAT LESSON IN SOME HARD WAYS, AND I'M GLAD IT'S  
6     WORKING HERE. A COUPLE OF COMMENTS HERE, ONE, THE REAL  
7     PRODUCTIVE EFFECT OF THIS WORK PLAN IS GOING TO DEPEND VERY  
8     SIGNIFICANTLY ON THINGS LARGELY OUTSIDE OUR CONTROL, BECAUSE  
9     UNLESS WE CAN, IN FACT, GET A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF MONEY, AND  
10    SIGNIFICANTLY MORE MONEY THAN IS CURRENTLY ALLOCATED IN THE  
11    GOVERNOR'S BUDGET TO, PRIMARILY, THE LOCAL AGENCIES, BUT TO  
12    BCDC, BARC, OTHERS WORKING ON THIS, WE HAVE LITTLE CHANCE OF  
13    SUCCESS. AND I SAID THIS YESTERDAY, A COUPLE OF YOU HAVE HEARD  
14    IT, THOSE OF YOU IN LOCAL AGENCIES I WOULD URGE TO YOU  
15    ORGANIZE IN YOUR OWN AGENCY, LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AND AMONGST  
16    YOURSELVES, THE SENATE BILL IS A ONE -- IS A MUCH BETTER  
17    APPROACH TO THIS THAN THE GOVERNOR'S BUDGET. SECOND, I THINK  
18    ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS THAT CAN COME OUT OF THIS AND  
19    IT'S INCLUDED IN IT, BUT I WANT TO EMPHASIZE A PIECE OF IT, IS  
20    THE, SORT OF, GAP ANALYSIS THAT'S TALKED ABOUT IN THE WORK  
21    PLAN, IN THE SECOND INITIATIVE, ALTHOUGH THE THIRD FITS IN A  
22    BIT. BECAUSE THAT'S ABSOLUTELY WITHIN BARC'S ROLE, AND NEEDS  
23    TO BE DONE. BECAUSE THERE ARE GAPS. WE KNOW THAT. AND THERE  
24    ARE AREAS WHERE THERE ARE AGENCIES WORKING OUT THERE THAT ARE  
25    NOT YET FULLY COORDINATING. I THINK WE'RE GETTING MUCH CLOSER





MAY 20, 2022

1 TO THAT, BUT WE'RE NOT THERE YET. SO I WELCOME THE WORK, AND  
2 WELCOME THE WORK TO COME.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU, ZACK. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.  
5 YES, BRAD? SUPERVISOR WAGENKNECHT? THERE YOU ARE.

6

7 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** WHOEVER I AM. YES.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YEAH.

10

11 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** YOU KNOW, I TRY NOT TO BE A PREACHER, BUT IF  
12 THERE IS ONE THING I HAVE PREACHED OVER THE YEARS OF BEING IN  
13 THE SPHERE OF REGIONALISM IS THE NEED FOR THE TECH, FOR THE  
14 LITTLE CITIES, CITIES AND COUNTIES IN THIS -- ALL THIS MEANS  
15 NOTHING IN WE CAN'T GET -- IF WE CAN'T GET OUR FINGERS DIRTY  
16 WITH IT IN THE LOCAL LEVEL, AND THE TECH COORDINATION THAT'S  
17 GOING TO BE ESSENTIAL, AND GOING TO BE WELCOMED.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH BRAD. WHEN YOU  
20 TALK ABOUT THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT THE  
21 LOCAL AGENCIES TO IMPLEMENT THESE PLANS?

22

23 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** YES.

24



MAY 20, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I AGREE. WE HAD SUCCESS WITH THAT WITH THE  
2 ABAG, WITH THE RHNA AND REASON SHOWING HOW THAT TECHNICAL  
3 ASSISTANCE IS VITAL TO BE ABLE TO IMPLEMENT AND DEVELOP THE  
4 PLANS IN PLACE TO BE ABLE TO IMPLEMENT. LARRY, THE STAR OF THE  
5 CONFERENCE LAST WEEK AT THE BAY PLANNING COALITION.

6

7 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** NOT ME.

8

9 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** YOU AND ALLISON AND WARINER.

10

11 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** I DON'T WANT TO TAKE UP THE TIME OF THE OTHER  
12 GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS. I'LL BE LAST TO TALK.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** PLEASE CONTINUE.

15

16 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** A COUPLE OF COMMENTS FROM THE EXECUTIVE  
17 DIRECTOR'S SIDE OF THE HOUSE ALLISON CERTAINLY MERITS THE  
18 PRAISE SHE'S BEEN GETTING. EVEN IF YOU DISAGREE WITH ALLISON,  
19 WHICH YOU DO EVERY NOW AND THEN JUST BECAUSE WE'RE PEOPLE,  
20 IT'S GREAT TO WORK WITH HER AND EVERYONE SHOULD KNOW THAT.  
21 FROM THAT STANDPOINT -- I'M GOING TO TALK FROM THE EXECUTIVE  
22 DIRECTOR'S STANDPOINT FOR A SECOND. FROM OUR STANDPOINT WE  
23 LOOK AT THIS AS A FRAMEWORK PROBABLY MORE THAN A PLAN, BUT  
24 THAT'S ABSOLUTELY FINE. BECAUSE WHAT WE REALLY NEED TO DO  
25 NEXT, AND THIS IS WHAT WE HAVE DISCUSSED AS A GROUP, IS TO



MAY 20, 2022

1 TAKE A LOOK AT EACH OF THESE INITIATIVES AND, LITERALLY, MAP  
2 OUT WHAT EACH REGIONAL AGENCY IS DOING, AND WHAT EACH REGIONAL  
3 AGENCY IS NOT DOING, AND WHAT EACH REGIONAL AGENCY WANTS TO DO  
4 AND THEN FIGURE OUT, BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT BARC IS SUPPOSED TO  
5 DO, WHAT THE LINKAGES NEED TO BE BETWEEN AND AMONG THOSE  
6 AGENCIES. AND WHAT THE GAPS ARE BETWEEN AND AMONG THOSE  
7 AGENCIES. AND FIGURE OUT WHAT BARC'S ROLE SHOULD BE, EITHER TO  
8 HELP FILL THOSE GAPS OR TO HELP BOLSTER THOSE LINKS. AND, SO,  
9 AS ALLISON TALKS ABOUT AT NEXT SEPTEMBER'S MEETING, SEEMS LIKE  
10 IT'S SO FAR AWAY, BUT REALLY IT'S NOT -- WHAT I'M GOING TO SEE  
11 FROM ALL OF US ON THE STAFF LEVEL IS, ESSENTIALLY, A VISUAL  
12 DESCRIPTION OF WHAT THOSE LINKAGES AND GAPS ARE FOR, PROBABLY,  
13 EACH INITIATIVE, AND THEN BE ABLE TO SHOW YOU HOW BARC CAN OR  
14 MAY OR SHOULD WORK WITHIN AND AROUND THOSE LINKAGES AND GAPS  
15 IN A WAY THAT DEMONSTRATES THE NEED FOR THE COORDINATION,  
16 COLLABORATION, AND PARTNERSHIP THAT WE NEED. SO FROM THE EV  
17 STANDPOINT, THAT, COMMISSIONER WAGENKNECHT TALKED ABOUT  
18 GETTING HANDS DIRTY -- THERE AIN'T NOTHING DIRTIER THAN HAVING  
19 TO DO SOMETHING LIKE THAT. CANDIDLY, WHAT ALLISON HAS DONE IS  
20 HERDED CATS INTO A ROOM AND DECIDED HOW WE'RE GOING TO PLAY  
21 TOGETHER. NOW THE QUESTION IS, WHAT ARE THE RULES OF THE GAME.  
22 AND THAT'S HARD TO DO AND THAT'S WHAT WE'LL BE DOING CERTAINLY  
23 FOR THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS. I JUST WANTED TO THROW THAT IN  
24 THERE TO MAKE SURE THE GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS KNEW WHAT WE  
25 THINK OUR NEXT STEPS ARE. THANK YOU.



MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? LET ME JUMP

3 IN THEN, NOT SEEING ANY HANDS UP. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO

4 CONCUR WITH ALL OF THE COMMENCE, AND FIRST OF ALL WANT TO

5 THANK ALLISON. AND WHEN I THINK OF, WHAT IT IS PROCESS HAS

6 ALSO SHOWN IS THE PUBLIC INPUT IS VERY IMPORTANT, AND AS A

7 PUBLIC AGENCY, WHAT OUR STAFF IS ABLE TO DO IS TAKE THAT

8 PUBLIC INCORPORATE MANY OF THOSE COMMENTS INTO THIS NEW DRAFT

9 IS THIS FINAL DRAFT THAT WE'RE SEEING. SO, THANK YOU VERY

10 MUCH. AND BY EXTENDING THE TIME FRAME FOR PUBLIC COMMENT, WE

11 COULD ACCOMMODATE THAT AND MOVE FORWARD. I ALSO THINK, LARRY,

12 YOU BROUGHT UP A GOOD POINT ABOUT, WHAT IS THIS, AND IT'S NOT

13 CREATING A SEPARATE AGENCY, BUT IT'S IDENTIFYING THE ROLES ON

14 THE VARIOUS AGENCIES AND UNDERSTAND THE GUISE OF THIS WORK

15 PLAN, THESE PRIORITY AREAS, I THINK THE WAY YOU DESCRIBED NEXT

16 STEPS TO CREATE A MAP FOR WHAT THE LINKS THAT ARE WORKING,

17 WHAT LINKS DO. AND I WOULD JUST ADD, YOU KNOW, IT'S BEEN

18 INTERESTING BEING -- ATTENDING THE BAY PLANNING COALITION

19 CONFERENCE LAST WEEK, AND, ALSO, WORKING AS A LOCAL GOVERNMENT

20 MEMBER WITH REGARDS TO THOSE STORMWATER, YOU KNOW, THE NEW

21 PERMIT, WATER QUALITY PERM PERMIT, THAT WE'RE APPROACHING THE

22 SITUATION HEARING SOME OF THE SPEAKERS LAST FRIDAY WE'RE

23 REALLY GETTING TO THE POINT WHERE WE'RE GOING TO START SEEING

24 CONFLICTING GOALS FROM THE AGENCIES WHETHER IT'S WATER, AIR,

25 VMT REDUCTION, I THINK WHETHER WE HAVE STATE, FEDERAL,



MAY 20, 2022

1 REGIONAL, LOCAL AGENCIES IT'S REALLY IMPERATIVE WE HAVE A  
2 PROCESS TO WORK TOGETHER ON ALL OF THESE GOALS. I'M GRATEFUL  
3 FOR YOUR WORK, ALLISON. AND, ALSO, WE HAVE A -- WE KIND OF  
4 HAVE A PATHWAY FOR THE NEXT STEPS IN TERMS OF COMING FORWARD.  
5 I HAVE ALSO HEARD FROM OUR LOCAL FOLKS ON THE IMPORTANCE OF  
6 THE WORK WITH THE INFRASTRUCTURE FOR OF THE CARB NON-CARBON  
7 ZERO-EMISSIONS BUSES, WHETHER IT'S ELECTRIC, HYDROGEN  
8 FUELCELL, IT'S REALLY GOING TO BE CRITICAL OBVIOUSLY IN THE  
9 NETWORK AND WE'RE FINDING MANY AGENCIES ARE GOING TO BE BOTH  
10 TYPE OF ENGINES. YOU CAN'T RUN A LOT OF THE SERVICE AREAS THAT  
11 HAVE HILLS IT'S PRETTY DIFFICULT TO RUN THOSE ON A BATTERY AND  
12 GET THE KIDS FROM SCHOOL TO HOME. I THINK THIS IS GOING TO BE  
13 HELPFUL TO DO THIS. AND BY HAVING THIS NETWORK, WORKING  
14 TOGETHER, WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO SEE THE KIND OF FUNDING  
15 THAT WE'RE GOING TO NEED, THE CAPITAL FUNDING TO ACCOMMODATE  
16 THIS AS WELL AS THE OPERATIONAL DOLLARS. SO, I REALLY  
17 APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S FEEDBACK. I KNOW THAT EVERYBODY HAS HAD  
18 A CHANCE TO REALLY GO THROUGH THE PLAN IN DETAIL. WE HAVE HAD  
19 A LOT OF GOOD DISCUSSIONS ABOUT IT HERE AND A LOT OF GOOD  
20 PUBLIC INPUT. SO, IF THERE IS NO FURTHER DISCUSSION OR  
21 COMMENTS, I WOULD BE -- LOVE TO ENTERTAIN A MOTION, AS ALLISON  
22 INDICATED, TO TAKE ACTION ON APPROVING THE FINAL DRAFT PLAN OF  
23 THE BARC SHARED WORK PLAN. YOU KNOW, AS WE GO FORWARD, I'M  
24 JUST MINDFUL OF LOOKING INTO THE PAST, AND I KNOW SUPERVISOR  
25 GIOIA WAS HERE WHEN OUR NON-CONGRESSMAN DESAULNIER, AND FORMER



MAY 20, 2022

1 SENATOR LACK SON HAD THE VISION OF BRINGING THE REGIONAL  
2 AGENCIES TOGETHER AND THEN THAT RESULTED IN THE JOINT POLICY  
3 COMMITTEE AND NOW WE HAVE BARC IN THE KIND OF WORK WE'RE DOING  
4 AND THE MAGNIFICENT REFLECTION OF ALL OF THESE GOALS, NOT ONLY  
5 A COUPLE OF AGENCIES BUT ALL OF OUR AGENCIES WORKING TOGETHER.  
6 WITH THAT, I WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR APPROVAL OF THIS,  
7 AND WITH THE EXPECTATION THIS WILL BE COMING BACK TO US IN  
8 DECEMBER, WITH THE NEXT STEPS PLAN. SO WE CAN MOVE THIS  
9 FORWARD. IF ANYONE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE --

10

11 **JOHN BAUTERS:** I'LL MAKE A MOTION, MADAM CHAIR, TO APPROVE THE  
12 STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR BAUTERS, AND YOU'RE STILL ON  
15 THE PLANE. I'M GLAD YOU GOT DO THIS. AND THE SECOND?

16

17 **JOHN GIOIA:** SECOND.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SECOND FROM SUPERVISOR GIOIA. GREAT. IF  
20 THERE IS NO FURTHER COMMENT, MAY I TURN TO SERENA FOR A ROLL  
21 CALL VOTE.

22

23 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** YES, MADAM CHAIR. ARREGUIN?

24

25 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** YES.



MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** RABBIT? RAMOS?

3

4 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HUDSON?

7

8 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BARRETT? BAUTERS?

11

12 **JOHN BAUTERS:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAD YOU BETTER? -- HAUBERT? ROSS?

15

16 **MARK ROSS:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GIOIA?

19

20 **JOHN GIOIA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PINE?

23

24 **DAVE PINE:** AYE.

25



MAY 20, 2022

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WAGENKNECHT?

2

3 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN?

6

7 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? SPERING? AND WORTH?

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MOTION PASSES.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ALLISON, DEEP APPRECIATION

16 TO YOU FOR ALL YOUR WORK. LOOKING FORWARD TO NEXT STEPS. IT

17 WILL BE A BUSY SUMMER. SEEMS LIKE A WAYS AWAY BUT IT'S JUST

18 AROUND THE CORNER. SO THANK YOU, AGAIN. LET'S MOVE BACK TO OUR

19 BARC MEMBER AGENCY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR UPDATES. WITH THAT, THE

20 FIRST ITEM, FIRST AGENCY IS THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY

21 MANAGEMENT DISTRICT REPORT.

22

23 **ALEXANDER CROCKETT:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR WORTH AND MEMBERS OF

24 THE BOARD. AS YOU KNOW, I'M SANDY CROCKETT, AND I HAVE BEEN

25 SERVING AS INTERIM EXECUTIVE OFFICER FOR THE AIR DISTRICT I'M





MAY 20, 2022

1 HAPPY TO REPORT THAT TODAY IS MY LAST DAY AS THE EXECUTIVE  
2 OFFICER, THE BOARD HAS APPOINTED SHARON LANDERS TO TAKE OVER  
3 AS INTERIM IN THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER CAPACITY. SHE WILL SERVE  
4 WHILE THE BOARD LOOKS FOR A PERMANENT SUCCESSOR TO JACK  
5 BROADBENT. I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING TO REPLACE JACK BROADBENT  
6 AND I THINK THE BOARD IS GOING TO TAKE THE APPROPRIATE AMOUNT  
7 OF TIME TO THINK CAREFULLY ABOUT WHAT KIND OF PERSON THAT I  
8 WANT TO HAVE IN THAT ROLE TO SETUP FOR LONG-TERM SUCCESSOR.  
9 MS. LANDSERS COMES TO US WITH A HUGE AMOUNT OF PUBLIC  
10 ADMINISTRATION EXPERIENCE SHE'LL REALLY BRING TO BUYER ON THE  
11 POSITION. AS YOU KNOW I'M A LAWYER, AND I DON'T REALLY HAVE  
12 THAT ADMINISTRATION FOUNDATION, BUT SHARON LANDERS HAS THAT.  
13 I'M HONORED AND PRIVILEGED TO ANNOUNCE THAT THE BOARD  
14 APPOINTED ME AS DISTRICT COUNSEL I'LL BE MOVING OVER MONDAY TO  
15 THAT ROLE. I'LL BE WORKING CLOSELY WITH SHARON. I'LL BE  
16 WORKING WITH THE DISTRICT COUNSEL'S OFFICE AND WILL FACILITATE  
17 THE HANDOFF WITH SHARON WHEN SHE COMES ON BOARD. AND FINALLY I  
18 HAVE SOME CHANGES TO OUR BOARD OFFICERS, FOR OUR BOARD, JOHN  
19 BAUTERS HAS MOVED UP TO CHAIR OF OUR BOARD, DAVINA HURT OF  
20 BELMONT HAS MOVED UP TO VICE CHAIR, AND THERESA BARRETT OF  
21 PETALUMA HAS BECOME SECRETARY AND WILL SERVE FOR THE REMAINDER  
22 OF THIS 2022 TERM. TWO OF YOUR BOARD MEMBERS WILL ALSO BE OUR  
23 BOARD OFFICERS. IT'S NICE TO HAVE THAT OVERLAP. THIS HAS BEEN  
24 A TIME OF TRANSITION FOR THE AIR DISTRICT BUT IT FEELS IT'S  
25 STARTING TO TAKE A STEP TOWARDS SETTING UP NEW MANAGEMENT AND



MAY 20, 2022

1 GETTING READY TO MOVE FORWARD. OBVIOUSLY THE BIG DECISION IS  
2 GOING TO BE FINDING A REPLACEMENT FOR JACK BROADBENT, BUT  
3 WE'RE STARTING TO TAKE STEPS DOWN THAT PROCESS. SO IT FEELS  
4 GOOD TO BE MOVING ALONG. SECOND THING I HAVE TO REPORT ON IS  
5 WE ADOPTED OUR FIRST CLIMATE RULE. THIS IS -- I GAVE A REPORT  
6 ABOUT THIS AT YOUR LAST MEETING. I THINK WE WERE JUST ON THE  
7 CUSP OF THE BOARD ADOPTING IT AND I'M HAPPY TO REPORT THAT  
8 THEY DID ADOPT IT. THIS IS A RULE THAT LIMITS METHANE  
9 EMISSIONS FROM HYDROGEN PLANTS AT REFINERIES. METHANE IS A  
10 POINT CLIMATE POLLUTANT THIS IS A GOOD WAY TO REDUCE THE  
11 GREENHOUSE GAS FOOTPRINT OF PETROLEUM REFINING IN THE BAY  
12 AREA. AS YOU PROBABLY KNOW OUR LEGAL AUTHORITY TO REGULATE  
13 CARBON EMISSIONS FROM STATIONARY SOURCES WAS LIMITED IN  
14 CONNECTION WITH THE CAP-AND-TRADE EXTENSION BILL SEVERAL YEARS  
15 AGO. SO WE SORT OF HAVE SOME TRUNCATED LEGAL AUTHORITY THERE,  
16 BUT WE'RE REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO USING THE AUTHORITY THAT  
17 WE DO HAVE TO REGULATE WHERE WE CAN, AND SO THIS IS THE FIRST  
18 RULE THAT'S COME DOWN USING THE AUTHORITY THAT WE STILL HAVE.  
19 AND WE EXPECT SOME ADDITIONAL ONES TO COME ALONG. SO, VERY  
20 PROUD OF THAT. THAT WAS A LOT OF WORK THAT WENT INTO IT. AND  
21 IT'S KIND OF A GROUND BREAKING RULE AND WE'RE PROUD OF THAT.  
22 WE HAVE ELEVATED FIRE RISK FOR OUR NORTH BAY COUNTIES WITH THE  
23 WEATHER WE'RE HAVING. TODAY, MONDAY, AND TUESDAY WILL BE  
24 ELEVATED FIRE RISK DAYS. WE'RE MONITORING THAT SITUATION  
25 CAREFULLY AND HAVE RESOURCES IN PLACE SO IF WE DO HAVE A



MAY 20, 2022

1 WILDFIRE EVENT WE'LL BE ABLE TO GET INFORMATION AND RESOURCES  
2 OUT TO THE PUBLIC ON HOW TO PROTECT THEMSELVES. THAT'S MY  
3 REPORT UNLESS ANYONE HAS ANY QUESTIONS.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ANY QUESTIONS? WELL, SANDY, THANK YOU FOR  
6 THAT REPORT. AND THANK YOU FOR BEING PART OF OUR BARC --  
7 DURING YOUR INTERIM PERIOD, AND WE'RE IN GOOD HANDS BECAUSE WE  
8 KNOW THAT NOW YOU HAVE HAD EXPERIENCE WORKING WITH SORT OF  
9 THIS REGIONAL COLLABORATION, YOU WILL CARRY THAT FORWARD. SO,  
10 THANKS AGAIN. CONGRATULATIONS ON YOUR NEW APPOINTMENT. AND,  
11 THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR SERVING US DURING THESE MONTHS. OKAY.  
12 GREAT. NEXT ITEM IS FOR THE REPORT ON THE ABAG AND MTC.

13

14 **BRAD PAUL:** THIS IS BRAD PAUL DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR  
15 LOCAL GOVERNMENT SERVICES AT MTC AND ABAG AND I'LL BE  
16 DELIVERING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT TODAY. I WOULD LIKE  
17 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE GREAT LEADERSHIP ALLISON PROVIDED WITH HER  
18 TEAM IN PUTTING TOGETHER THE SHARED WORK PLAN. I KNOW IT TOOK  
19 A WHILE BUT GLAD SHE WAS OPEN TO LISTENING TO STAFF ACROSS THE  
20 AGENCIES AND WORKING TO FINE TUNE THE PLAN TO REALLY FOCUS IT  
21 AND DRILL DOWN ON THE THINGS WE COULD DO MOST TO ADD VALUE,  
22 AND FOCUSING ON GETTING THIS ACHIEVED TODAY AND COMING BACK TO  
23 YOU WITH A DETAILED WORK PLAN. I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU FOR  
24 ALL THAT WORK. ON OUR SIDE AS YOU KNOW THE RHNA NUMBERS THIS  
25 TIME AROUND OF MUCH HIGHER THAN LAST TIME WE ARE PROVIDING A



MAY 20, 2022

1 REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM WHICH PLAYS OFF  
2 OF THE CONVERSATION WE HAD EARLIER ABOUT THE SHARED WORK PLAN.  
3 WE HAVE BEEN DOING THIS AND THE CITIES AND COUNTIES HAVE BEEN  
4 RESPONDING TREMENDOUSLY TO THE QUALITY OF THIS, THE DIVERSITY  
5 OF THIS, AND HOW MUCH IT'S HELPED THEM. SO I THINK IT OFFERS  
6 AN OPPORTUNITY TO LEARN SOME LESSONS GOING FORWARD FOR SIMILAR  
7 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR THE REGIONAL CLIMATE RESILIENCE PLAN.  
8 IN ADDITION, WE HAVE HEARD FROM ALL OF THE CITIES, THEY'RE  
9 WILLING TO TRY TO BUILD THE HOUSING BUT IN ORDER TO BUILD  
10 AFFORDABLE HOUSING THEY'RE GOING TO NEED MORE AFFORDABLE  
11 HOUSING SUBSIDIES AT A SCALE MUCH GREATER THAN WE HAVE HAD IN  
12 THE PAST. MANY OF YOU HAVE HEARD OF THE WORK OF BAHFA, THE BAY  
13 AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY THE STATE LEGISLATURE GAVE ABAG  
14 AND MTC THE AUTHORITY TO PUT THINGS ON THE BALLOT MUCH LIKE  
15 THE BAY RESTORATION FUNDING THAT WOULD GENERATE BETWEEN 10 AND  
16 \$20 BILLION A YEAR OVER TIME, 1 TO \$20 BILLION PER YEAR 10 TO  
17 \$20 BILLION IN TOTAL THAT WOULD ALLOW US TO OPERATE AT THE  
18 SCALE WE NEED TO MEET THIS CHALLENGE. WE HAVE \$20 MILLION FROM  
19 THE STATE TO START FIVE PILOT PROGRAMS. WE WERE LUCKY TO HIRE  
20 KATE HARTLEY WHO HAS HAD A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF EXPERIENCE IN  
21 HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA, AND SHE IS FINISHING UP HIRING FIVE  
22 MORE STAFF TO LEAD THESE PILOT PROGRAMS SO AS WE GO INTO THE  
23 BALLOT IN 2024 WE WILL PROVIDE TO THE VOTERS PROGRAMS THAT  
24 WORK SO WE CAN PROVE TO THE SCALE TO DEAL WITH DISPLACEMENT  
25 HOMELESSNESS, PROTECTING TENANTS AND BUILDING AND PRESERVING



MAY 20, 2022

1 HOUSING AT THE SCALE NEVER BEEN SEEN IN THE BAY AREA. AND THE  
2 DISCUSSION IN THE LAST FEW WEEKS ON WATER PERMITS THERE WAS  
3 CONCERN ABOUT HOW IT MIGHT IMPACT AFFORDABLE HOUSING BUT THE  
4 WATER BOARD STAFF IS WORKING WITH US DISCUSSING THE PROBLEM,  
5 SO WE FEEL CONFIDENT GOING FORWARD IN THIS WORK. IT SHOWS THE  
6 BENEFIT OF THE BARC APPROACH WHERE WE HAVE THESE ISSUES THAT  
7 AFFECT MORE THAN ONE AGENCY THIS ALLOWS LEADERSHIP OF THESE  
8 AGENCIES AND STAFF TO WORK TOGETHER TO AVOID PROBLEMS BEFORE  
9 THEY REALLY BECOME PROBLEMS. SO WITH THAT, I WILL END MY  
10 REPORT.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, BRAD. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THAT. AND  
13 LET ME JUST SEE IF THERE ARE ANY OTHER BOARD QUESTIONS? OKAY.  
14 WELL, NOW LET'S MOVE ON TO THE SAN FRANCISCO REGIONAL WATER  
15 QUALITY CONTROL BOARD. AND I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM  
16 LISA MCCANN THIS MORNING. BUT I DON'T SEE HER ON THE CALL.  
17 SERENA? OR SAL ALLISON, DO YOU IF ANYBODY ELSE IS GOING TO BE  
18 FILLING IN?

19

20 **ALLISON BROOKS:** I DON'T KNOW OF ANYBODY ELSE.

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I SAW LISA EARLIER.

23

24 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MAYBE IF SHE REJOINS WE CAN CHECK BACK.  
25 LET'S GO NOW TO THE CALIFORNIA STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY.



MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** AMY IS OUT TODAY.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SHE IS ON.

5

6 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** IS SHE? I THOUGHT SHE WAS OUT.

7

8 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SHE'S OUT? OKAY. LET'S MOVE ON TO THE SAN  
9 FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION.

10

11 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH. REALLY QUICKLY, JUST A  
12 COUPLE OF THINGS. WE ARE VERY HAPPY TO LET FOLKS KNOW THAT THE  
13 FEDERAL EPA HAS PROVIDED VERY LARGE GRANTS TO BCDC THAT IS  
14 ALSO BEING AUGMENTED BY THE CALIFORNIA OCEAN PROTECTION  
15 COUNCIL. THAT WILL ENABLE BCDC, PROBABLY LATER THIS SUMMER, TO  
16 BEGIN A NEW BAY PLAN PROCESS, AMENDMENT PROCESS, DEALING WITH  
17 BENEFICIAL REUSE OF DREDGE SEDIMENTS THAT TALK ABOUT GETTING  
18 YOUR HANDS DIRTY AS I DID EARLIER, WE ALL KNOW THE  
19 DIFFICULTIES SURROUNDING MAKING SURE THAT THE BAY AREA HAS  
20 ENOUGH SEDIMENT TO CREATE THE WETLANDS THAT WE NEED AND THE  
21 MORE WE CAN DO TO ESSENTIALLY ENSURE THAT THE DREDGED  
22 MATERIALS THAT COME UP EVERY YEAR DUE TO DREDGING CAN BE USED  
23 FOR THAT, THE BETTER OFF WE WILL ALL BE. AND, SO, CHAIR  
24 WASSERMAN IS GOING TO BE PUTTING TOGETHER A COMMISSIONER  
25 WORKING GROUP TO HELP THE PROCESS AS WE DID DURING THE BAY



MAY 20, 2022

1 PLAN AMENDMENTS FOR SOCIAL EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE,  
2 AS WELL AS BAY FILL. AND WE WILL REPORT ON THAT BACK TO YOU  
3 PROBABLY IN THE FALL AS WE GET GOING. BUT THAT'S REALLY GOOD  
4 NEWS. AND THE OTHER THING IS JUST TO LET PEOPLE KNOW  
5 SCHEDULES. ON JUNE SECOND, TWO WEEKS FROM YESTERDAY, BCDC WILL  
6 HOLD WHAT IS LIKELY TO BE AN ALL-DAY PUBLIC HEARING ON THE  
7 OAKLAND ATHLETICS BAY PLAN AMENDMENT REQUEST TO ELIMINATE  
8 HOWARD TERMINAL FROM THE PORT PRIORITY USE AREA OF THE PORT OF  
9 OAKLAND. THAT WILL START AT 9:00 A.M. ON THURSDAY AND GO, AS  
10 ZACK WASSERMAN SAID YESTERDAY AT THE COMMISSION MEETING, UNTIL  
11 WE ARE DONE. AND THEN FOUR WEEKS LATER ON JUNE 30TH, BCDC WILL  
12 HOLD A SPECIAL MEETING TO CONSIDER THE UPCOMING STAFF FINAL  
13 RECOMMENDATION ON THAT BAY PLAN AMENDMENT, AND THAT MEETING  
14 ALSO WILL BEGIN AT 9:00 A.M. AND IN THE WORDS OF A FORMER  
15 PRESIDENT, WHO IS KNOWN FOR COLLOQUIALISM, THAT MEETING WILL  
16 GO ON UNTIL THE LAST DOG DIES. BECAUSE IT NEEDS TO BE DONE ON  
17 JUNE 30TH BECAUSE OF THE DEADLINE IMPOSED BY THE STATE  
18 LEGISLATURE. SO, WITH THAT, I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, THANK YOU. YES, HAVING DONE PLANNED  
21 BAY AREA MEETINGS. WE HAD SIMILAR STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS. AND,  
22 YOU KNOW, THE STROKE OF MIDNIGHT, YOU UNDERSTAND WHY  
23 CINDERELLA STARTED TO WORRY.

24

25 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** BCDC IS A PIKER COMPARED TO YOU ALL.



MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I HAD A QUESTION FOR YOU, LARRY, I KNOW THE  
3 PROJECT INCLUDES THE BASEBALL STADIUM, BUT IT ALSO INCLUDES  
4 3,000 HOUSING UNITS. ARE YOU INVOLVED IN THAT? OR IS THAT  
5 SEPARATE FROM WHAT YOU ALL ARE DOING?

6

7 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** WHAT YOU ALL TALKED ABOUT IS TOTALLY SEPARATE  
8 FROM WHAT THE COMMISSION WILL BE DISCUSSING IN JUNE. BECAUSE  
9 THE WAY THE PROCESS WORKS IS THAT THE COMMISSION HAS TO DECIDE  
10 WHETHER THAT SPACE IS NECESSARY FOR REGIONAL PORT CAPACITY. IF  
11 THE SPACE IS NECESSARY FOR REGIONAL PORT CAPACITY BASED ON A  
12 VOTE OF THE COMMISSION, THEN THE PORT OF OAKLAND, CITY OF  
13 OAKLAND, WOULD BE UNABLE, UNLESS THAT DECISION IS REVERSED, TO  
14 USE THAT HOWARD TERMINAL FOR THE UPCOMING MIXED USE  
15 DEVELOPMENT.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOT IT.

18

19 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** SO THE DISCUSSION WILL NOT BE UPON THE MIXED  
20 USE DEVELOPMENT IT WILL BE ON THE REGIONAL PORT CAPACITY.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** JUST ON PORT CAPACITY FOR THE HOWARD  
23 TERMINAL.

24

25 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** YES.





MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** IF YOU FOR THAT UPDATE. LET ME ASK IF THERE  
3 ARE ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE ON THE EXECUTIVE  
4 DIRECTOR'S REPORT? AGAIN, I WANT TO -- LET ME -- DAVE, I SEE  
5 YOUR -- YOU JUST CAME ON SCREEN. DO YOU HAVE A QUESTION OR  
6 COMMENT?

7

8 **DAVID HAUBERT:** YOU KNOW, IF YOU COULD JUST REPEAT THE DATE OF  
9 THAT HEARING, LARRY, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT.

10

11 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** SURE. THE PUBLIC HEARING BEGINS AT 9:00 A.M.  
12 ON JUNE 2ND, THURSDAY, JUNE 2ND, AND THEN THE COMMISSION  
13 DISCUSSION AND VOTE WILL OCCUR FOUR WEEKS LATER, 9:00 A.M. ON  
14 THURSDAY JUNE 30TH.

15

16 **DAVID HAUBERT:** GREAT. OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** IT'S GOING TO BE A TWO DAY -- TWO PART, TWO  
21 DAY DECISION-MAKING PROCESS.

22

23 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** TWO PART.

24



MAY 20, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. SERENA, LET ME TURN TO  
2 SEE IF WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY OF THESE ITEMS?

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WE DO NOT, MADAM CHAIR.

5

6 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. AGAIN, I -- NOW  
7 WE'RE MOVING TO ITEM SEVEN WHICH IS THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY  
8 MANAGEMENT DISTRICT'S REPORT ON UPDATED CEQA GUIDELINES. MAY I  
9 TURN TO STAFF FOR THAT REPORT?

10

11 **ALLISON BROOKS:** HENRY HILKEN PLANNING DIRECTOR FOR THE AIR  
12 DISTRICT IS PRESENTING.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** WONDERFUL. HELLO. WELCOME HENRY.

15

16 **HENRY HILKEN:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR WORTH, MEMBERS THE BARC. WHO  
17 IS DRIVING THE SLIDE? SERENA, IS THAT YOU?

18

19 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO. IT'S OTHER STAFF.

20

21 **HENRY HILKEN:** OKAY. I'LL JUST WAIT FOR THE SLIDES TO POP-UP.

22

23 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I THINK THIS IS THE MEMO.

24

25 **HENRY HILKEN:** YEAH. THERE WAS A POWERPOINT DECK IN THERE ALSO.



MAY 20, 2022

1

2 **ALLISON BROOKS:** SHOULD WE HAVE ACCESS TO THE POWERPOINT?

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THEY SHOULD HAVE THAT COMING UP SHORTLY.  
5 THEY HAVE ALL THE MEETING MATERIALS.

6

7 **HENRY HILKEN:** WHILE THAT'S LOADING UP, CHAIR WORTH, I'LL JUST  
8 BEGIN. GOOD MORNING, I'M HENRY HILKEN, I'M THE PLANNING  
9 DIRECTOR OF THE AIR DISTRICT. AND I WANTED TO GIVE AN UPDATE  
10 ON SOME RECENT ACTION THAT OUR BOARD OF DIRECTORS TOOK LAST  
11 MONTH. STAFF HAS BEEN WORKING FOR QUITE A WHILE AND LAST MONTH  
12 OUR BOARD TOOK ACTION TO UPDATE OUR CEQA THRESHOLDS OF  
13 SIGNIFICANCE FOR USE IN CEQA REVIEW SPECIFICALLY FOR CLIMATE  
14 IMPACTS FOR LAND USE PROJECTS THIS IS SOMETHING WE HAVE BEEN  
15 WORKING ON QUITE A LONG TIME AND I THINK THE WORK ALIGNS  
16 PRETTY WELL WITH THE WORK OTHER REGIONAL AGENCIES HAVE BEEN  
17 DOING AND SOME OF THE DISCUSSION WE HAVE BEEN HAVING THIS  
18 MORNING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M GOING TO GIVE A LITTLE  
19 BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT FOR WHY WE'RE DOING THIS WORK, AND THEN  
20 I'LL DESCRIBE THE UPDATED THRESHOLDS THAT OUR BOARD ADOPTED  
21 LAST MONTH AND THEN VERY BRIEFLY DESCRIBE WHERE WE GO FROM  
22 HERE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE, AT THE AIR DISTRICT, WE ENGAGE IN  
23 THE CEQA PROCESS PRETTY HEAVILY. SOMETIMES WE ARE A LEAD  
24 AGENCY, WHEN WE ARE ADOPTING A RULE, FOR INSTANCE, OR  
25 OCCASIONALLY WHEN WE HAVE A PERMIT THAT HAS NO OTHER LOCAL



MAY 20, 2022

1 DISCRETIONARY DECISIONS SO WE ARE A LEAD AGENCY UNDER CEQA.  
2 WE'RE QUITE OFTEN A RESPONSIBLE AGENCY WHEN WE ARE ISSUING A  
3 PERMIT FOR A STATIONARY SOURCE FOR SOME LOCAL GOVERNMENT HAS  
4 DISCRETIONARY DECISION THAT'S PART OF OUR PERMIT REVIEW  
5 PROCESS AS A RESPONSIBLE AGENCY. WE ARE THE REVIEWING AND  
6 COMMENTING AGENCY RECEIVING ALL CEQA DOCUMENTS FROM THE CITIES  
7 AND COUNTIES AND OTHER IN THE BAY AREA AND REVIEW AIR QUALITY  
8 IMPACT SECTIONS TO MAKE SURE ANALYSIS IS DONE CORRECTLY, AND  
9 IMPORTANTLY MITIGATION MEASURES THAT ARE INCLUDED IN THE  
10 ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTS. IN THE CEQA SUPPORT WORK, A LOT OF  
11 SUPPORT FOR OTHER LEAD AGENCIES AND THEIR CONSULTANTS AND  
12 INTERESTED MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. THE GUIDELINES AND  
13 THRESHOLD, THRESHOLDS, RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE BENCHMARK THAT  
14 LOCAL AGENCIES WOULD USE TO DETERMINE WHETHER AN AIR QUALITY  
15 IMPACT OR CLIMATE IMPACT RISES TO A LEVEL OF SIGNIFICANCE. SO  
16 THAT'S -- AGAIN, I WANT TO STRESS, THIS IS GUIDANCE. IT'S NOT  
17 REQUIRED. OUR EXPERIENCE HAS BEEN THAT MOST CITIES AND  
18 COUNTIES AND OTHER LEAD AGENCY IN THE BAY AREA DO USE THESE  
19 THRESHOLDS, SIMPLY BECAUSE WE ARE THE SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS,  
20 AND WE PUT A LOT OF THOUGHT INTO THEM AS I'LL DESCRIBE LATER.  
21 BUT, AGAIN, IT IS ALWAYS UP TO THE DISCRETION OF A LEAD AGENCY  
22 WHETHER OR NOT THEY CHOOSE TO USE THESE THRESHOLDS OR SELECT  
23 THEIR OWN. AND THEN IN OUR GUIDELINES, WE PROVIDE A LOT OF  
24 TECHNICAL GUIDANCE ON HOW TO DO THE ANALYSIS, A LOT OF DATA,  
25 YOU KNOW, MY STAFF ANSWERS LOTS AND LOTS OF CALLS JUST TO HELP



MAY 20, 2022

1 PEOPLE DO THE TECHNICAL WORK IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW  
2 DOCUMENTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, IN GENERAL, I WILL SAY, YOU  
3 KNOW, WE HAVE, FROM THE AIR DISTRICT, WE HAVE A VARIETY OF  
4 GOALS WITH RESPECT TO LOCAL LAND USE DECISION-MAKING. WE  
5 CERTAINLY -- WE VERY MUCH SUPPORT MIXED USE INFILL TRANSIT  
6 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT THAT PROVIDES OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE TO  
7 GET AROUND WITHOUT NECESSARILY USING AN AUTOMOBILE. WHILE WE  
8 DO SUPPORT MIXED USE INFILL DEVELOPMENT NEAR TRANSIT, WE ALSO  
9 CAUTION LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO BE VERY MINDFUL OF THE LOCATIONS  
10 THAT THEY SELECT FOR SENSITIVE LAND USES, RESIDENTIAL,  
11 SCHOOLS, HEALTH CARE FACILITIES, SENIOR FACILITIES, ANY LAND  
12 USE THAT ATTRACTS SENSITIVE LAND USES, WE URGE CITIES AND  
13 COUNTIES TO BE VERY MINDFUL TO NOT LOCATE THOSE SENSITIVE LAND  
14 USES VERY CLOSE TO SOURCES OF POLLUTION. SO HEAVILY TRAVELED  
15 FREEWAYS, INDUSTRY PORTS AND RAIL YARDS, THING OF THAT NATURE.  
16 WE VERY MUCH SUPPORT INCREASED LEVEL OF HOUSING. WE ALL KNOW  
17 THAT THE REGION FACES A SEVERE JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE SO WE  
18 SUPPORT MORE HOUSING AS A KEY COMPONENT TO HELP MINIMIZE LONG  
19 DISTANCE COMMUTES AND AUTOMOBILE TRAFFIC AND ASSOCIATED  
20 EMISSIONS. WE SUPPORT THE AIR DISTRICT GOALS FOR AIR QUALITY  
21 AND CLIMATE. WE SUPPORT MTC ABAG GOALS THAT ARE ARTICULATED IN  
22 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THEY ALIGN VERY CLOSELY WITH THE  
23 STATE'S GOALS FOR RE-- THE STATE'S AMBITIOUS GOALS FOR  
24 REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. AND IN YOUR EARLIER ITEM  
25 YOU DISCUSSED THE SHARED WORK PLAN, AND YOU WILL SEE THE



MAY 20, 2022

1 THRESHOLDS THAT I'LL EXPLAIN TO YOU ALIGN WELL WITH THE WORK  
2 PLAN THAT YOU HAVE JUST ADOPTED ESPECIALLY WITH THE LOW CARBON  
3 HIGH EEK TEE NEIGHBORHOODS CONCEPT THAT ALLISON DESCRIBED FOR  
4 YOU. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WHY ARE WE DOING THIS NOW? AS I  
5 MENTIONED EARLIER, WE HAVE CEQA THRESHOLDS AND GUIDELINES FOR  
6 DECADES. WE DID A COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE BACK IN 2010. AND SINCE  
7 THAT TIME A LOT, ESPECIALLY IN THE CLIMATE WORLD HAS CHANGED.  
8 AT THAT TIME YOU WERE GUIDED BY A.B. 32, WHICH IS THAT  
9 LANDMARK LEGISLATION THAT SET STATEWIDE TARGETS FOR 2020.  
10 OBVIOUSLY THAT'S OUT OF DATE. SO WE NEED ON UPDATE THESE  
11 GUIDELINES, OUR CEQA THRESHOLDS, THAT IS, TO ALIGN WITH THE  
12 STATE'S CURRENT LONG RANGE TARGET. SO, SB32 NOW SETS VERY  
13 AGGRESSIVE TARGETS FOR 2030. A 40% REDUCTION IN GREENHOUSE  
14 GASSES BELOW 1990 LEVELS BY 2030, AND THEN AT THE GOVERNOR'S  
15 EXECUTIVE ORDER TO ACHIEVE CARBON NEUTRALITY NO LATER THAN  
16 2045. AND AS IT HAPPENS THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD IS  
17 IN THE PROCESS NOW OF UPDATING THE STATEWIDE SCOPING PLAN. YOU  
18 MAY BE AWARE THAT CARB RELEASED THE DRAFT SCOPING PLAN UPDATE  
19 A WEEK OR TWO AGO. THE SCOPING PLAN UPDATE UPDATES AND  
20 OUTLINES THE STATE'S STRATEGY TO ACHIEVE THOSE 2030 AND 2040  
21 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS. IN ADDITION THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF  
22 CASE LAW. WE KNOW THERE HAS BEEN LOTS OF CEQA LITIGATION THERE  
23 HAS BEEN SOME IMPORTANT LITIGATION IN THE PAST SEVERAL YEARS  
24 THAT WE THOUGHT WERE VERY IMPORTANT TO ADDRESS AND CONSIDER IN  
25 OUR THRESHOLDS AND LASTLY, I WILL SAY THAT LOCAL AGENCIES HAVE



MAY 20, 2022

1 BEEN ASKING US FOR THIS. THEY KNOW THOSE 2020 THRESHOLDS OR  
2 TARGETS BASED ON THE 2020 TARGETS ARE OUT OF DATE. SO CITIES  
3 AND COUNTIES HAVE BEEN REALLY URGING US TO DO THIS WORK AND  
4 UPDATE THESE THRESHOLDS SO I THINK IT WILL BE VERY WELCOME TO  
5 LOCAL AGENCIES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. NOW TO GET TO THE  
6 THRESHOLDS THEMSELVES, I'LL DESCRIBE IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF  
7 SLIDES, I WILL SAY THAT WE CURRENTLY -- OR PREVIOUSLY, WE HAD  
8 OPTIONS, EITHER QUANTITATIVE OR QUALITATIVE THRESHHOLDS,  
9 QUANTITATIVE APPROACH THAT REALLY RELIES ON DESIGN ELEMENTS OR  
10 BEST PRACTICES THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THAT SHOULD BE INCLUDED  
11 IN NEW DEVELOPMENT IN ORDER TO BE CONSIDERED LESS THAN  
12 SIGNIFICANT. AND, REALLY, YOU KNOW, I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS  
13 THAT WE HAVE BEEN CONSIDERING IS THAT, AS WE ALL KNOW, CEQA IS  
14 ABOUT DEVELOPMENT. SO ANY NEW BUILDING THAT IS BEING BUILT  
15 TODAY WOULD BE OCCUPIED FOR DECADES. SO WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO  
16 DO HERE IS ENCOURAGE LAND USE DESIGN AND LOCATION THAT DOESN'T  
17 LOCK IN CARBON EMISSIONS INTO THE DEVELOPMENT. WE DON'T WANT  
18 TO LOCK IN SOURCES OF GHGS INTO DEVELOPMENT THAT WILL BE  
19 OCCUPIED FOR MANY, MANY YEARS. SO AS I GO THROUGH THESE NEXT  
20 FEW SLIDES I'M GOING TO DESCRIBE A COUPLE OF THOSE DESIGN  
21 ELEMENTS. BUT YOU WILL ALSO SEE THAT THERE IS REALLY A CHOICE  
22 THAT WE PROVIDE THE LEAD AGENCIES TO CONSIDER, EITHER  
23 INCORPORATING THESE BEST PRACTICES, THESE DESIGN ELEMENTS, OR  
24 RELY UPON A HIGH QUALITY LOCAL CLIMATE ACTION PLAN. I THINK  
25 YOU'RE ALL AWARE, MANY JURISDICTIONS OF THE BAY AREA HAVE



MAY 20, 2022

1 ADOPTED CLIMATE ACTION PLANS. SO THERE IS SORT OF AN OFFRAMP,  
2 IF YOU WILL, FOR CITIES TO EITHER USE THESE BEST PRACTICES, OR  
3 TIER OFF OF A HIGH QUALITY CLIMATE ACTION PLAN THAT MEETS THE  
4 GUIDELINES FROM THE OFFICE OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH. NEXT  
5 SLIDE, PLEASE SO, I SHOULD HAVE MENTIONED ON THE LAST SLIDE,  
6 WE'RE FOCUSING MAINLY ON BUILDINGS AND TRANSPORTATION. THESE  
7 ARE ELEMENTS OF DEVELOPMENT THAT DEVELOPERS HAVE SOME  
8 DISCRETION OVER. SO, IN OTHER WORDS, LET'S SEE HOW TO DESCRIBE  
9 THIS. LOCAL DEVELOPERS DON'T HAVE MUCH DISCRETION OVER THE  
10 ELECTRICITY THAT COMES OFF THE GRID. SO THE ELECTRICITY THAT  
11 COMES INTO OUR BUILDINGS IS SUBJECT TO VARIOUS STATE PROGRAMS,  
12 MAINLY THE RENEWABLE PORTFOLIO STANDARD. BUT BY FOCUSING ON  
13 BUILDINGS AND TRANSPORTATION, THESE ARE ELEMENTS THAT LOCAL  
14 DEVELOPERS REALLY HAVE TO INFLUENCE AND HAVE SOME DISCRETION  
15 OVER HOW THEIR PROJECTS, THE EXTENT TO WHICH THEIR PROJECTS  
16 REALLY MINIMIZE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. SO FOR BUILDINGS OUR  
17 RECOMMENDED THRESHOLD IS NO NATURAL GAS. WE WANT TO  
18 DECARBONIZE BUILDINGS, AND SO THE THRESHOLD, THE DESIGN  
19 ELEMENTS ARE NO NATURAL GAS APPLIANCES, OR PLUMBING, SO FULLY  
20 ELECTRIC BUILDINGS. AND THEN, SECONDLY, THE PROJECT SHOULD NOT  
21 USE -- SHOULD NOT USE ENERGY IN ANY SORT OF WASTEFUL OR  
22 INEFFICIENT WAY. SO, REALLY, THE BASIS FOR THE FORMER IS JUST,  
23 IS ALL THE GREAT WORK THAT CITIES AND COUNTIES ARE DOING  
24 ACROSS THE STATE, ESPECIALLY HERE IN NORTHERN CALIFORNIA. MANY  
25 JURISDICTIONS HAVE ADOPTED REACH CODES TO ACCELERATE





MAY 20, 2022

1 ELECTRIFICATION OF NEW -- SO BAY AREA JURISDICTIONS HAVE  
2 REALLY BEEN LEADER THERE IS. AND THE SECOND ELEMENT  
3 INEFFICIENT WASTEFUL ENERGY USED IS SOMETHING THAT'S ALREADY  
4 INCLUDED IN THE ENERGY SECTIONS OF THE EIR SO THIS WILL NOT BE  
5 MUCH OF A BURDEN FOR LOCAL AGENCIES IT REALLY BUILDS OFF  
6 ANALYSIS THAT'S ALREADY BEING DONE IN CEQA DOCUMENTS BUT  
7 CLEARLY THERE IS A LINKAGE TO THE GREENHOUSE GAS IMPACTS AS  
8 WELL. AND AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, THE LEAD AGENCIES WOULD HAVE  
9 THE CHOICE OF EITHER USING THOSE DESIGN ELEMENTS OR RELYING  
10 UPON A LOCAL CLIMATE ACTION PLAN THAT MEETS THE CRITERIA LAID  
11 OUT BY THE OFFICE OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
12 NEXT, TRANSPORTATION AND DESIGN ELEMENTS FOR BOTH TECHNOLOGY  
13 AND VEHICLE USE. SO FOR VEHICLE USE WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT  
14 THE PROJECTS ACHIEVE A -- THE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, 15%  
15 BELOW THE REGIONAL AVERAGE, AND, SECONDLY, INSTALL ELECTRIC  
16 VEHICLE CHARGING AS IDENTIFIED IN THE CAL GREEN TIER TWO  
17 STANDARD. SO, CAL GREEN, OF COURSE, ARE THE STATE BUILDING  
18 STANDARDS AND LAY OUT SOME REQUIREMENTS, AND, ALSO, SOME  
19 VOLUNTARY OPTIONAL ELEMENTS ABOVE THAT. SO THE TIER TWO ARE  
20 THE VOLUNTARY ELEMENTS ABOVE AND BEYOND THE BASIC CAL GREEN  
21 REQUIREMENTS SO THE VMT THRESHOLD IS BASED ON ANALYSIS THAT  
22 THE STATE HAS DONE, THE CAL RESOURCES BOARD HAS ESTIMATED THE  
23 EXTENT OF THE REDUCTIONS THAT WOULD BE NEEDED IN EACH REGION  
24 TO ALIGN WITH THE 2045 CARBON NEUTRALITY TARGETS. AND CAL  
25 GREEN ALL OF YOU ARE FAMILIAR WITH THE CAL GREEN STANDARDS AND



MAY 20, 2022

1 THE VERY DETAILED WORK THAT THE COMMISSION AGENCY AND OTHER  
2 STATE AGENCIES HAVE DONE TO SET VERY AGGRESSIVE ENERGY  
3 EFFICIENT STANDARD IN OUR BUILDING CODES. THEN THERE IS THE  
4 ALTERNATIVE APPROACH IF LEAD AGENCIES CHOSE TO RELY ON A  
5 CLIMATE ACTION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THOSE THRESHOLDS  
6 WERE FOR LAND USE PROJECTS. WE OF COURSE SEE CEQA DOCUMENTS  
7 FOR LOCAL PLANS, GENERAL PLANS, SPECIFIC AREA PLANS, THINGS OF  
8 THAT NATURE. AND HERE AGAIN WE'RE ESSENTIALLY RECOMMENDING  
9 THAT THE THRESHOLD BE THAT THOSE LOCAL PLANS NIGH NEED TO  
10 ALIGN WITH THOSE STATE TARGETS AS I HAVE DESCRIBED, LAID OUT  
11 IN SB32, AND THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER, OR ONCE AGAIN  
12 TIERING OFF OF A HIGH QUALITY CLIMATE ACTION PLAN THAT A  
13 JURISDICTION MAY HAVE ALREADY ADOPTED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO,  
14 THOSE ARE THE THRESHOLDS THAT OUR BOARD OF DIRECTORS ADOPTED  
15 LAST MONTH. BUT, A LOT OF THE STAFF WORK BEHIND THOSE  
16 THRESHOLDS IS DESCRIBED IN A DOCUMENT THAT WE HAVE DUBBED THE  
17 JUSTIFICATION REPORT. IT'S INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET. AND THAT  
18 JUSTIFICATION REPORT, WE FEEL -- BELIEVE -- IS A VERY  
19 IMPORTANT DOCUMENT, IT PROVIDES THE RATIONALE AND SUBSTANTIAL  
20 EVIDENCE TO SUPPORT THOSE THRESHOLDS THAT I HAVE JUST  
21 DESCRIBED. SO THAT JUSTIFICATION REPORT PROVIDED THE  
22 SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE THAT WAS THE BASIS FOR OUR BOARD OF  
23 DIRECTORS ADOPTION LAST MONTH. BUT PERHAPS MORE IMPORTANTLY,  
24 IT ALSO CAN PROVIDE THE SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE FOR ANY LEAD  
25 AGENCY, CITY, COUNTY, OR OTHER LEAD AGENCY THAT ELECTS TO USE



MAY 20, 2022

1 THESE THRESHOLDS. WE HAVE DONE THE WORK FOR YOU. THE LOCAL  
2 LEAD AGENCY THAT CHOOSES TO USE THESE THRESHOLDS WE EXPECT AND  
3 HOPE WOULD BE ABLE TO USE OUR JUSTIFICATION REPORT TO PROVIDE  
4 THE SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE THAT THOSE LOCAL AGENCIES NEED TO  
5 PROVIDE IN APPLYING THESE THRESHOLDS. SO IN ORDER -- THE  
6 CONCEPT IS THAT IN ORDER TO HAVE A LESS THAN SIGNIFICANT  
7 IMPACT LOCAL PLANS, PROJECTS AND PLANS, NEED TO BE ON THE  
8 GLIDE PATH TO ACHIEVE CARBON NEUTRALITY BY 2045, AND, SO, ONE  
9 OF THE TRICKY PIECES THAT -- QUESTIONS THAT WE TRIED TO  
10 ADDRESSES IN THE JUSTIFICATION REPORT IS DRAWING A LINKAGE  
11 BETWEEN AN INDIVIDUAL LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECT AND THE  
12 STATEWIDE TARGETS. I MEAN, THE SCOPING PLAN LAYS OUT A VERY  
13 AMBITIOUS SUITE OF STRATEGIES REGULATORY INCENTIVES AND  
14 OTHERS, HOW THE STATE WILL MEET THOSE 2030 AND 2045 STATEWIDE  
15 TARGETS. BUT HOW DOES ONE INDIVIDUAL, LOCAL LAND USE PROJECT,  
16 DEMONSTRATE WHETHER OR NOT THEY ARE CONSISTENT WITH THAT VERY  
17 BROAD STATEWIDE STRATEGY? AND, SO, WE, IN THE JUSTIFICATION  
18 REPORT, WE HAVE GONE TO GREAT LENGTHS TO DEMONSTRATE HOW THESE  
19 THRESHOLDS REALLY ALIGN WITH THE STATE'S STRATEGY AND HOW A  
20 LOCAL JURISDICTION CAN DEMONSTRATE THAT SPECIFIC DEVELOPMENT  
21 PROJECT IS CONTRIBUTING THEIR FAIR SHARE TOWARDS THOSE  
22 STATEWIDE PROGRAMS TO ACHIEVE THOSE STATEWIDE TARGETS. NEXT  
23 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, NEARLY DONE, MADAM CHAIR. WE HAD A VERY  
24 ROBUST PROCESS. TALKED TO LOTS AND LOTS OF PEOPLE AS WE WORKED  
25 ON THIS. WE HAD A SERIES OF FOCUS GROUPS LAST YEAR WITH



MAY 20, 2022

1 SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS, LOCAL PLANNING STAFF FROM AROUND THE  
2 REGION, CONSULTANTS, ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE REPRESENTATIVES AND  
3 OTHERS, HAD PUBLIC COMMITTEES REPORTED TO OUR BOARD COMMITTEES  
4 A FEW TIMES. AND OVERALL, I WOULD SAY, THERE WAS A SURPRISING  
5 LEVEL OF SUPPORT, AS I HAVE MENTIONED. THE LEAD AGENCIES WERE  
6 -- STAFF WAS VERY PLEASED TO SEE THIS. THERE WAS BROAD  
7 SUPPORT. WE DID RECEIVE SOME COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ABOUT  
8 CERTAIN ELEMENTS, BUT I WOULD SAY, OVERALL, THERE WAS -- AS I  
9 MENTIONED, VERY BROAD SUPPORT. SO OUR BOARD OF DIRECTORS DID  
10 ADOPT THESE THRESHOLDS A MONTH AGO TODAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
11 SO WHERE WE DO GO NOW? THE THRESHOLDS ARE IN EFFECT  
12 IMMEDIATELY. THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS, IN THE ADOPTING  
13 RESOLUTION STATED THAT THE RESOLUTIONS ARE EFFECTIVE  
14 IMMEDIATELY, AND THEY ARE A RECOMMENDATION. AGAIN, THIS IS A  
15 DECISION AT THE LOCAL DISCRETION OF A LOCAL AGENCY BUT OUR  
16 RECOMMENDATION TO THE LEAD AGENCIES THAT THEY SHOULD APPLY TO  
17 PROJECTS THAT HAVE NOT YET INITIATED IN THE STUDY. AS YOU CAN  
18 WELL EXPECT MANY PROJECTS ARE WELL ALONG THROUGH THE CEQA  
19 PROCESS, BUT OUR RECOMMENDATION IS FOR THOSE APPLIED FOR  
20 PROJECTS THAT ARE JUST BEGINNING THE INITIAL PROCESS. WE HAVE  
21 HAD LOTS OF CALLS AND MEETINGS WITH LOCAL STAFF AND  
22 CONSULTANTS AND OTHERS TO UNPACK AND ANSWER QUESTIONS AND  
23 DISCUSS THRESHOLDS TO HELP PEOPLE UNDERSTAND THEM. WE HAVE  
24 TAKEN A MOMENT TO CATCH OUR BREATH AND ARE NOW BEGINNING TO  
25 REVIEW OTHER ASPECTS OF OUR CEQA GUIDELINES. PROBABLY MOST



MAY 20, 2022

1    IMPORTANTLY, WE'RE BEGINNING TO LOOK AT OUR AIR QUALITY  
2    THRESHOLDS, ESPECIALLY THE THRESHOLDS THAT WE HAVE ESTABLISHED  
3    FOR LOCAL AIR QUALITY IMPACTS. FOR MANY YEARS WE HAVE HAD  
4    THRESHOLDS OF SIGNIFICANCE FOR HOW TO DECIDE WHETHER LEVELS  
5    ARE A REGIONAL POLLUTION, MAY BE SIGNIFICANT IN A CEQA  
6    DOCUMENT. WHEN WE UPDATED OUR GUIDELINES BACK IN 2010 WE  
7    ADOPTED THRESHOLDS TO LOOK LOCALLY. MUCH OF OUR AIR QUALITY  
8    WORK AT THE AIR DISTRICT THESE DAYS IS FOCUSED ON LOCALIZED  
9    IMPACTS ESPECIALLY IN OUR MOST IMPACTED COMMUNITIES,  
10   ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE COMMUNITIES, AND SO WE ARE NOW BEGINNING  
11   TO REVISIT OUR THRESHOLDS FOR LOCAL EXPOSURE TO AIR POLLUTION,  
12   ESPECIALLY FINE PARTICULATE MATTER, OR PM2.5, AND SO WE'RE  
13   GOING TO BE WORKING WITH OUR STAFF AND STAKEHOLDERS TO MAKE  
14   SURE THAT OUR LOCAL AIR QUALITY THRESHOLDS REALLY ARE AS  
15   HEALTH PROTECTIVE AS POSSIBLE, ESPECIALLY IN OUR MOST IMPACTED  
16   COMMUNITIES. AND WE'LL ALSO BE TAKING A LOOK AT THE GREENHOUSE  
17   GAS THRESHOLDS FOR STATIONARY SOURCES. SO, THE THRESHOLDS I  
18   HAVE JUST BEEN DESCRIBING ARE FOR TRADITIONAL LAND USE  
19   DEVELOPMENT RESIDENTIAL COMMERCIAL AND SO FORTH WE ALSO HAVE  
20   GHG THRESHOLDS FOR STATIONARY SOURCES SO WE'LL BE TAKING  
21   ANOTHER LOOK AT THOSE JUST TO MAKE SURE THEY DO ALIGN WITH THE  
22   STATE'S SCOPING PLAN THAT HAS JUST BEEN RELEASED AS I  
23   MENTIONED, A WEEK OR TWO AGO. MADAM CHAIR, THAT CONCLUDES MY  
24   PRESENTATION. I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.  
25



MAY 20, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, HENRY, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THAT  
2 PRESENTATION. I KNOW THE AIR DISTRICT HAS BEEN WORKING FOR A  
3 LONG TIME WITH THE OTHER AGENCIES. I'M MINDFUL OF BRAD PAUL'S  
4 EARLIER COMMENT ABOUT OUR REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ISSUES AND  
5 HOW WE CAN BUILD HOUSING. AND AS IT RELATES TO THESE NEW  
6 GUIDELINES. SO, THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO, FIRST OF ALL, ASK  
7 THE BOARD IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OF HENRY? OKAY. SEEING  
8 NONE. LET'S TURN TO PUBLIC COMMENT. SERENA DO WE HAVE ANY  
9 PUBLIC COMMENT?

10

11 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WE HAVEN'T RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT,  
12 AND I DON'T SEE ANY HAND RAISED.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. TERRIFIC. WELL, GREAT. THEN LET'S  
15 BRING IT BACK TO THE BOARD FOR A DISCUSSION. HENRY I'LL ASK A  
16 COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. WE HAVE BEEN GOING THROUGH THE WATER  
17 QUALITY STORMWATER PERMIT, AND ONE OF THE ISSUES IS THE COST  
18 OF DEVELOPING BIKE LANES AND PAVING TO PROTECT BIKE LANES, AND  
19 A LOT OF THE VMT REDUCTION TARGETS THAT LOCAL GOVERNMENT USES  
20 IS GOING TO COST SIGNIFICANTLY MORE WITH A FIXED AMOUNT OF  
21 MONEY. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU -- HOW -- WHAT IS THE PROCESS  
22 FOR LOOKING AT TARGETS? SO WE CAN PLAN FOR A BIKE LANE, FOR  
23 EXAMPLE? BUT IF THERE AREN'T THE RESOURCES TO BUILD IT, WHAT  
24 DO WE -- YOU KNOW, HOW DO WE AID THE REGION, HOW DO WE AID  
25 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS THAT WANT TO BUILD THESE FACILITIES, BUT



MAY 20, 2022

1 GIVEN THE FINITE SOURCE OF FUNDING FROM ALL SOURCES, WE'RE NOT  
2 GOING TO BE ABLE TO BUILD THE QUANTITY OF PROJECTS THAT WE --  
3 THAT WE NEED TO REACH THESE IMPORTANT TARGETS.

4

5 **HENRY HILKEN:** SO TRUE, MADAM CHAIR. I'LL START OFF. EXCELLENT  
6 POINT. AS WE WORKED ON THESE THRESHOLDS, WE DID CONSULT WITH  
7 MTC ABAG STAFF AND WE WORKED WITH MTC STAFF ON SOME OF THE  
8 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENTS WE TALKED TO ABAG STAFF ESPECIALLY  
9 BAYREN ABOUT THE BUILDING DECARBONIZATION ELEMENTS. BUT,  
10 CERTAINLY, PLANNED BAY AREA, AS MOST OF THE PEOPLE ON THIS  
11 CALL ARE WELL AWARE, PLANNED BAY AREA HAS A NUMBER OF VERY  
12 AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES FOR HOUSING AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. A  
13 BROAD SUITE OF STRATEGIES. AND I KNOW YOU RECEIVED REPORTS ON  
14 THAT OVER THE PAST COUPLE OF YEARS. AND, SO, I KNOW THAT MTC  
15 ABAG HAS A VERY ROBUST ADVOCACY PLATFORM LAID OUT TO TRY AND  
16 GET THOSE RESOURCES TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. AND THE AIR  
17 DISTRICT, ALSO, WE'RE VERY ACTIVE IN SACRAMENTO SO I KNOW WE  
18 CERTAINLY WOULD BE VERY SUPPORTIVE OF MTC EFFORTS, BECAUSE  
19 YOU'RE QUITE RIGHT, WE NEED THOSE RESOURCES TO PROVIDE THOSE,  
20 THAT ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** RIGHT. GREAT. WELL, THANK YOU. THANK YOU,  
23 HENRY, AND I THINK THAT GOES BACK TO COMMISSIONER WASSERMAN'S  
24 COMMENT ABOUT IN ORDER TO MAKE ANY OF THESE PLANS REAL WE  
25 ABSOLUTELY HAVE TO HAVE THE FUNDING. I WAS IN SACRAMENTO LAST



MAY 20, 2022

1 WEEK FOR THE CALIFORNIA LEAGUE OF CITIES CONFERENCE AND IN OUR  
2 LEGISLATIVE MEETINGS. YOU KNOW, CLIMATE ACTION, RESILIENCY,  
3 ALL THE ISSUES THAT YOU HAVE TALKED ABOUT WERE FORE FRONT OF  
4 OUR REQUESTS TO THE LEGISLATURE. SO, I THINK ONE OF THE -- ONE  
5 OF THE BENEFITS BEING COORDINATED IS WE CAN ALL KIND OF COME  
6 TOGETHER TO ADVOCATE FOR THESE PRIORITIES. SO, THANK YOU VERY  
7 MUCH FOR THAT ANSWER. AND MAY I TURN TO SUPERVISOR HAUBERT?

8

9 **DAVID HAUBERT:** YES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND, HENRY, NICE  
10 PRESENTATION. YOU DID AN EXCELLENT JOB OF UPDATING THE GROUP  
11 ON THE ACTIONS THAT WE HAVE TAKEN. I JUST THROW THIS OUT, AND  
12 SOME OF YOU WELL HAVE HEARD THIS FROM ME BEFORE AND IT  
13 ORIGINATES FROM DISCUSSIONS WE HAVE HAD AT THE ALAMEDA COUNTY  
14 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, ACTC, AND AS WE LOOK AT OUR  
15 REGIONAL EFFORTS. AND I JUST THROW IT OUT TO THIS GROUP,  
16 BECAUSE YOU HAVE SUCH A WIDE REGIONAL VIEW ACROSS THE ENTIRE  
17 REGION, BUT IT JUST SEEMS THAT WE ARE CONTINUING TO BUILD JOBS  
18 IN ONE AREA AND HOUSES IN ANOTHER VERY FAR AWAY AREA, AND JUST  
19 THE OTHER DAY, I HEAD THAT THEY'RE GOING TO TEAR DOWN SOME  
20 RESIDENTIAL IN SAN JOSE TO PUT MORE OFFICE BUILDINGS. AND THEY  
21 JUST NEED TO GO THE COMPLETE OPPOSITE WAY. WE HAVE TOO MANY  
22 JOBS IN A CERTAIN AREA, AND NOT ENOUGH HOUSES, AND, YET, WE'RE  
23 BUILDING HOUSES OUT IN SAN JOAQUIN NOW FOR PEOPLE TO COMMUTE  
24 EVEN AN EXTRA HOUR. HOW ARE WE -- YET, WE HAVE RHNA NUMBERS  
25 AND HOUSING ALLOCATIONS FROM ONE ORGANIZATION, AND WE FUND





MAY 20, 2022

1 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS IN A DIFFERENT AREA, AIR QUALITY  
2 MANAGEMENT IS MEASURING THE EFFECTS ON OUR -- ON OUR AIR  
3 QUALITY OF DOING THIS. BUT WE HAVE -- I JUST HAVEN'T SEEN THE  
4 WAY TO CONNECT THE DOTS BETWEEN BALANCING WHERE JOBS ARE AND  
5 WHERE PEOPLE LIVE. AND TO NOT ADD JOBS, UNLESS YOU HAVE  
6 HOUSING, AND TO ADD HOUSING WHERE YOU ALREADY HAVE A BUNCH OF  
7 JOBS, HOW DO WE BALANCE THAT? AND I DON'T KNOW IF ANYBODY  
8 WANTS TO WEIGH IN ON THAT. I JUST DON'T KNOW THAT WE HAVE A  
9 MECHANISM FOR THAT. LAND USE EXISTS WITHIN THE CITY'S PURVIEW  
10 IF THEY DON'T WANT TO ADD THE RESIDENTIAL THEY DON'T. IF THAT  
11 I WANT TO ADD MORE JOBS, THEY CAN. WE DON'T HAVE A WAY TO STOP  
12 THEM. AND, SO, I'M AT A LOSS FROM A SYSTEMS-WIDE THINKING, HOW  
13 CAN WE -- HOW CAN WE MAKE THIS BETTER FOR ALL OF US? SO,  
14 BECAUSE, HENRY, YOU POINTED IT OUT THAT WE'RE GIVING REALLY  
15 GOOD BEST PRACTICES, BUT THERE IS NOTHING TO SAY THAT THEY  
16 HAVE TO DO ANY OF IT. SO, I WOULD HOPE THAT A BAY AREA WIDE  
17 ORGANIZATION, LIKE THIS, COULD MAYBE COME UP WITH SOME  
18 RECOMMENDED SOLUTIONS FOR, WELL, IF WE HAD THIS WAY TO  
19 REGULATE THINGS, OR IF WE HAD THAT WAY TO FORCE ACTION, MAYBE  
20 WE COULD MAKE BETTER DECISIONS. I DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT IS.  
21 SOME PEOPLE HAVE SUGGESTED JUST NOT ALLOWING MORE OFFICE SPACE  
22 UNLESS THERE IS RESIDENTIAL THERE. I DON'T KNOW. THAT GETS  
23 INTO THE LAND USE DISCUSSION. AS A FORMER MAYOR, I DO NOT LIKE  
24 ANY LANGUAGE THAT TAKES AWAY LOCAL CONTROL. BUT, STILL, WE



MAY 20, 2022

1 HAVE TO HAVE SOME WAY TO -- THERE IS NO REAL MECHANISM. SO. I  
2 DO NOT -- I'LL GET OFF OF MY SOAPBOX FOR NOW.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** IT IS WELL SAID. HENRY, I SEE, ALSO, BRAD  
5 PAUL HAS HIS HAND UP.

6

7 **HENRY HILKEN:** I'M GOING TO LET BRAD TAKE THAT. AIR DISTRICT  
8 STAFF AGREES COMPLETELY.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. BRAD?

11

12 **BRAD PAUL:** YOU RAISE A GOOD QUESTION. I WANT TO GIVE YOU HOPE.  
13 IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE TALK ABOUT VERY SPECIFICALLY, THAT  
14 THERE ARE IN SOME STANCES TOO MANY JOBS IN THE WEST BAY AND  
15 TOO MUCH HOUSING -- LET ME RESTATE, THERE IS NOT ENOUGH  
16 HOUSING IN THE WEST BAY AND NOT ENOUGH JOBS IN THE EAST BAY.  
17 THAT'S A BETTER WAY TO STATE T PLANNED BAY AREA ACTIVELY  
18 SUGGEST THAT WE TAKE ACTION TO ENCOURAGE MORE HOUSING IN THE  
19 WEST BAY BUT ALSO TO ENCOURAGE MORE JOBS LOCATED IN THE EAST  
20 BAY BECAUSE IT WILL CUT DOWN ON COMMUTING, CUT DOWN ON GHG AND  
21 ALL OF THAT AND WILL IMPROVE QUALITY OF LIVES IF YOU ARE  
22 SPENDING HOURS IN YOUR CAR EVERY DAY GOING FROM THE EAST BAY  
23 TO THE WEST BAY THAT'S TIME YOU CAN'T SPEND WITH YOUR FAMILY,  
24 YOUR KIDS, GOING TO PARENT TEACHER CONFERENCES COACHING SPORTS  
25 TEAMS THAT'S THE 50 PIECE. SECOND PIECE IS I MENTIONED WE'RE



MAY 20, 2022

1 WORKING ON THIS VERSION OF TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT  
2 COMMUNITIES, FOCUSED ON BUILDING RESIDENTIAL NEAR MAJOR  
3 TRANSIT STOPS THE NEW TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY  
4 TALKS ABOUT LOCATING BOTH TRANSIT AND JOBS NEXT TO MAJOR  
5 TRANSIT STOPS. ONE WAY TO GET PEOPLE TO TAKE TRANSIT IS TO  
6 HAVE THEM LIVE NEAR A TRANSIT STATION OR AT LEAST HAVE THEIR  
7 HOUSE OR JOB NEAR TRANSIT WE'RE BEGINNING TO FINE TUNE SOME OF  
8 THESE POLICIES TO ENCOURAGE THE BEHAVIOR YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT.  
9 THERE IS MORE WE CAN DO ON THE INCENTIVE SIDE AND I'LL BE  
10 HAPPY TO TALK ABOUT IT.

11

12 **DAVID HAUBERT:** I WOULD BE HAPPY TO HAVE THIS DISCUSSION IT  
13 SEEMS WITH THE LONG-STANDING SUPER MAJORITY WE CAN DO ANYTHING  
14 WE WANT IN SACRAMENTO WE JUST HAVEN'T. I WOULD LOVE TO  
15 UNDERSTAND THAT BETTER.

16

17 **BRAD PAUL:** I WOULD LOVE TO BUY YOU A CUP OF COFFEE AND HAVE  
18 THAT CONVERSATION.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AS YOU SEE THOSE CARS COMING ACROSS ALTAMONT  
21 EVERY DAY. LET ME FOLLOW UP ON DAVID'S COMMENT, IN QUESTION TO  
22 HENRY -- WE WON'T LET YOU OFF THE HOOK COMPLETELY -- BUT, NO,  
23 THANK YOU FOR YOUR LONG-STANDING WORK. IT'S REALLY BEEN A JOY  
24 TO WORK WITH YOU OVER THE YEARS AND YOUR WORK HAS THIS BROAD  
25 PERSPECTIVE OF NOT ONLY AIR QUALITY ISSUES, BUT THE WHOLE BAY



MAY 20, 2022

1 AREA. YOU TALK ABOUT GUIDELINES, AND WE KNOW FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN  
2 YOU BUILD RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT, THERE IS A TRIP GENERATION  
3 ANALYSIS, THERE IS ALL THIS METHODOLOGY TO FIGURE OUT HOW MANY  
4 CARS ARE GOING TO BE COMING AND GOING, WHAT -- AND, SO IS  
5 THERE THAT KIND OF METHODOLOGY WITH, SAY, A COMMERCIAL  
6 BUILDING, LIKE AN OFFICE BUILDING WHERE YOU DO MAKE SOME OF  
7 THOSE -- YOU TALK ABOUT SOME OF THOSE CAR TRIPS THAT, YOU  
8 KNOW, SUPERVISOR HAUBERT -- YOU KNOW, HAD YOU BETTER IS  
9 TALKING ABOUT, THAT IF YOU HAVE A BIG, HIGH OFFICE BUILDING IN  
10 ONE PART OF THE REGION, AND GIVEN THE HOUSING CRISIS, WHAT  
11 IT'S GOING TO GENERATE IN TERMS OF TRAFFIC IMPACT?

12

13 **HENRY HILKEN:** CERTAINLY. I WENT QUICKLY THROUGH THAT  
14 TRANSPORTATION SLIDE, BUT I SHOULD HAVE -- I CAN ADD TO THAT A  
15 LITTLE BIT. BECAUSE IN SETTING THAT THRESHOLD, ONE OF THE  
16 THINGS WE WANTED TO DO WAS ALIGN WITH SB743. SO, SOME OF YOU  
17 MAY RECALL THAT THE LEGISLATURE PASSED SB743 A FEW YEARS AGO  
18 TO CHANGE THE WAY IN WHICH LOCAL LEAD AGENCIES ADDRESS  
19 TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS, SO NOT JUST LOOKING AT LEVEL OF  
20 SERVICE, TRAFFIC CONGESTION, BUT REALLY LOOKING AT TRIPS AND  
21 VMT, TO GET TO YOUR POINT. SO THAT TRANSPORTATION THRESHOLD,  
22 THE VMT THRESHOLD ALIGNS WITH THE SB743 PROCESS, THAT 15%  
23 REDUCTION I MENTIONED IS FROM WORK THAT CARB DID TO SUPPORT  
24 THE SCOPING PLAN, BUT I DIDN'T MENTION, IT WAS EMBEDDED IN  
25 THAT SLIDE, ANOTHER OPTION FOR THE CITIES IS TO RELY ON ANY --



MAY 20, 2022

1 IF THE CITY OR COUNTY HAS ADOPTED THEIR OWN VMT THRESHOLD  
2 UNDER SB743 ALREADY THAT COULD BE USED UNDER THIS FRAMEWORK  
3 FOR THE GREENHOUSE GAS ANALYSIS, TOO. SO, WE HOPE -- EXPECT,  
4 THAT MOST OF THESE CITIES AND COUNTIES HAVE ALREADY ADJUSTED  
5 THEIR TRANSPORTATION ANALYSIS TO CONFORM TO FOCUS MORE ON  
6 VEHICLE USE, RATHER THAN TRAFFIC CONGESTION. AND, SO, WE  
7 WANTED TO BUILD OFF OF THAT, AND REALLY -- WE DON'T CARE --  
8 IT'S NOT SO MUCH ABOUT CONGESTION ANYMORE, WE REALLY WANT TO  
9 REDUCE REGIONAL VMT

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** EXACTLY WITH THE GOAL OF REDUCING REGIONAL  
12 VMT, IS THERE A PROCESS -- I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, YOU THINK  
13 OF AN OFFICE BUILDING WITH AN ECOSYSTEM, COVID HAS SHOWN THAT  
14 OFFICES HAVE A HUGE IMPACT ON NOT ONLY WHAT'S HAPPENING  
15 INSIDE, BUT THE SYSTEM OUTSIDE, THE ANCILLARY BUSINESSES OR IN  
16 THE CASE THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT VMT  
17 THAT AN OFFICE COMMERCIAL BUILDING WILL CREATE. AND SO THE  
18 QUESTION IS THERE -- WILL YOUR UPDATES ENABLE A JURISDICTION,  
19 FOR EXAMPLE, OR EVEN A REGION TO EVALUATE THAT? SO WHEN YOU  
20 SAY, OKAY, YOU'RE GOING TO BUILD A COMMERCIAL OFFICE BUILDING,  
21 YOU'RE GOING TO FILL IT WITH OFFICE WORKERS, DEPENDING ON THE  
22 SALARY LEVELS, AND THE LOCAL HOUSING, YOU'RE GOING TO SEE A --  
23 YOU KNOW, ED DELBECARO DOES INCREDIBLE WORK ON MODELING,  
24 HOUSING, MODELING COMMERCIAL ACTIVITY ALONG WITH WORKER NEEDS,  
25 ALONG WITH WHERE WORKERS ARE GOING AND WHERE THEY NEED TO LIVE



MAY 20, 2022

1 AND HOW FAR YOU CAN GO. IS THIS THE KIND OF NEW GUIDELINES  
2 THAT WILL HELP US UNDERSTAND. FOR EXAMPLE, DAVE'S EXAMPLE  
3 ABOUT THE NEW OFFICE BUILDING, THE FACT THAT THE AVERAGE HOME  
4 PRICES IN OUR COUNTIES ARE IN THE MILLIONS, PLURAL, WHAT IS IT  
5 GOING TO TAKE TO FILL THOSE OFFICES? DID WE DO THAT KIND OF  
6 ANALYSIS? AND IF THAT'S THE CASE, THEN HOW DO YOU MITIGATE IT  
7 EITHER WITH CLOSE BY HOUSING, OR CONTRIBUTIONS TO TRANSIT? AND  
8 I RECOGNIZE THIS IS A MUCH BIGGER QUESTION. BUT I THINK IT'S  
9 ONE THAT WE DO NEED TO ADDRESS. BECAUSE WE KEEP CHASING THE  
10 LONG COMMUTES FROM MEMBERSHIP DIFFERENT ANGLES AND THEY'RE NOT  
11 GOOD IN MANY DIFFERENT WAYS.

12

13 **HENRY HILKEN:** NOT EASY AT ALL. AT THE MACRO LEVEL, BRAD  
14 TOUCHED ON IT A MOMENT AGO THAT'S AT THE CORE GOAL OF PLANNED  
15 BAY AREA, WE DO THAT AT A REGIONAL LEVEL. FOR A PROJECT BY  
16 PROJECT LEVEL CERTAINLY WHEN THE PROJECTS GO THROUGH THE CEQA  
17 REVIEW, THERE IS OFTEN A TRANSPORTATION CONSULTANTS ARE HIRED  
18 TO DO THAT ANALYSIS, AND, YOU KNOW, IF, SAY, IF A COMMERCIAL  
19 PROJECT, IF A JOB CENTER WERE LOCATED IN A JOB RICH AREA,  
20 VERSUS A HOUSING-RICH AREA, THAT WILL VERY MUCH INFLUENCE THE  
21 NUMBER OF TRIPS AND VMT GENERATED. IF YOU ARE ADDING JOBS TO A  
22 JOB RICH AREA, IT'S JUST GOING TO EXACERBATE THAT IMBALANCE.  
23 ON THE FLIP SIDE, IF YOU HAVE -- IF A DEVELOPMENT PROVIDES A  
24 BEFORE THE JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE THAT WILL BE REFLECTED IN THE  
25 TRIP AND VMT ANALYSIS THAT'S DONE, SO, YES, THESE THRESHOLDS -



MAY 20, 2022

1 - OUR INTENT, IS TO SUPPORT THE LAND USE DECISIONS THAT HELP  
2 BALANCE JOBS AND HOUSING.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND, AGAIN, THIS  
5 IS HELPFUL TO HEAR THIS AND I KNOW WE HAVE A LONG WAY TO GO IN  
6 TERMS OF HOW DO WE INCENTIVIZE THAT DISTANCE, SHORTENING THE  
7 DISTANCE, REDUCING THE VMT AS A RESULT OF THE JOBS/HOUSING  
8 IMBALANCE WHICH IS REALLY SIGNIFICANT. SO, THANK YOU. THANK  
9 YOU VERY MUCH. THAT'S REALLY HELPFUL. I'M NOT A PLANNER SO  
10 IT'S REALLY HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND THOSE ELEMENTS AND  
11 ESPECIALLY IN THE CHANGING ENVIRONMENT. AND I KNOW IT SEEMS  
12 LIKE FOREVER AGO THAT SB743 WAS PASSED, AND I REMEMBER SITTING  
13 THROUGH MANY, YOU KNOW, CMA MEETINGS DISCUSSING HOW IT'S GOING  
14 TO BE IMPLEMENTED, AND WE'RE SITTING NOW, YOU KNOW, SEEING IT  
15 COME TO FRUITION WITH SOME OF THE HOUSING INITIATIVES. SO,  
16 ANYWAY, THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH. AND ARE THERE ANY OTHER  
17 COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? OKAY. IF NOT, THEN, LET'S MOVE ON TO  
18 OUR PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. LET ME SEE IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS  
19 OF THE PUBLIC THAT HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR US? SERENA DO  
20 YOU SEE ANY? I'M NOT SEEING ANYONE

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS, MADAM  
23 CHAIR.

24



MAY 20, 2022

1   **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** WITH THAT, I DO NOT SEE ANYONE IN THE  
2   BOARDROOM. WE WILL ADJOURN OUR NEXT MEETING TO JUNE 17TH,  
3   2022. AND AGAIN I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR COMING TO THE  
4   MEETING TODAY FOR THE PUBLIC COMMENT, AND, AGAIN, THANKS TO  
5   OUR -- THANK YOU TO ALLISON FOR BRINGING US TO THIS POINT.  
6   GREAT PROGRESS WITH OUR SHARED WORK PLAN, AND LOOK FORWARD TO  
7   OUR NEXT MEETING. THANK YOU ALL. HAVE A WONDERFUL WEEKEND. AND  
8   WE'LL SEE YOU SOON. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34





*Broadcasting Government*