

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1                           **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**  
2                           **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**  
3                           **WEDNESDAY, MAY 11, 2022 9:45 AM**  
4

5   **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. WELCOME TO THE  
6 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE OF MAY 11TH, 2022. I'M  
7 CHAIR DAVID RABBIT ALONG WITH VICE CHAIR GINA PAPAN, I WOULD  
8 LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER. CAN THE BROADCASTING TEAM  
9 PLEASE ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES  
10 ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID  
11 MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS  
12 ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO  
13 BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
14 WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
15 PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE  
16 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM  
17 AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE  
18 CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT  
19 IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND  
20 ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.  
21 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT [INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV) BY 5  
22 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND  
23 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL  
24 CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND  
25 ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN



1 ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR  
2 APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CAN THE CLERK CALL ROLL?

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.

19 COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

20

21 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

24

25 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GREAT. WE'LL MOVE ON TO THE  
5 CONSENT CALENDAR. THERE ARE FIVE ITEMS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR  
6 TO DATE. ITEMS TWO. A THROUGH TWO. E. I'LL LOOK TO MY  
7 COLLEAGUES TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY QUESTIONS E COMMENTS OR  
8 CONCERN ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** MOVE APPROVAL.

11

12 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND FROM WORTH.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND ON THE CONSENT  
15 CALENDAR. CAN I ASK THE CLERK TO READ PUBLIC COMMENTS  
16 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM RECEIVED INTO THE RECORD?

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
20 ON THIS ITEM.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE APPROVAL  
23 OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR RABBIT?



1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT.

17 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

18

19 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS ABSENT.

22 COMMISSIONER WORTH?

23

24 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

25



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
2 MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. WE'LL  
5 MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM 3A. THIS IS MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4510  
6 REVISED AND 4169 REVISED. TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROGRAM  
7 FOR FISCAL YEAR 2021/'22, AND '23/'24. AND WE HAVE MARGARET  
8 DOYLE TO PRESENT THIS ITEM.

9

10 **MARGARET DOYLE:** MARGARET DOYLE MTC STAFF I AM THE CAPITAL  
11 PRIORITIES PROGRAM MANAGER. WE WERE HERE IN MARCH TO DISCUSS  
12 THE TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES AT THE PROGRAMMING AND  
13 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING OR THE TCP. BRIEFLY THE TCP  
14 FUNDS CAPITAL REQUIREMENTS TO ACHIEVE AND MAINTAIN STATE OF  
15 GOOD REPAIR AND MTC'S TCP POLICY IS IN PLACE TO ENSURE THAT  
16 THE LIMITED FEDERAL FORMULA FUNDS GO TO THE ESSENTIAL PROJECTS  
17 OR HIGHEST SCORING PROJECTS FOR 416. AS ILLUSTRATED IN THE  
18 CHART IN THE MEMO ON PAGE TWO, THE COMMISSION ALREADY TOOK THE  
19 FIRST STEP HERE IN MARCH BY PROGRAMMING \$1.4 BILLION ACROSS  
20 FISCAL YEARS 2021, 2022, THROUGH '23/'24, AND THAT PROGRAMS  
21 FUNDS FOR MOST ESSENTIAL VEHICLE REPLACEMENT AND CAPITAL  
22 INVESTMENT PROJECTS. BUT THAT PROGRAMMING LEFT A BALANCE OF  
23 \$658 MILLION. AND, SO THAT IS WHAT WE ARE COMING TO DISCUSS  
24 HERE TODAY. THE -- TODAY'S ACTION WILL PROGRAM OR SET-ASIDE  
25 \$454 MILLION OF THAT BALANCE. SO, THIS NEXT STEP THAT WE ARE



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 BRINGING FORWARD ACTION TODAY IS PROGRAMMING \$325 MILLION  
2 ACROSS THE THREE YEARS TO THE BART RAIL CAR REPLACEMENT  
3 PROGRAM FOR PAY GO, WHICH WILL REDUCE, BUT NOT ELIMINATE THE  
4 NEED TO FINANCE THIS PROJECT. IN ADDITION, WE'RE ASKING TO  
5 SET-ASIDE FUNDING FOR TWO DIFFERENT PROJECTS OR PROGRAMS,  
6 RATHER. THE FIRST WOULD BE SETTING ASIDE \$69 MILLION ACROSS  
7 THE THREE YEARS TO INCREASE FIXED GUIDE WAY CAPS FOR OUR FIXED  
8 GUIDE WAY OPERATORS. AND THE OTHER WOULD BE SETTING ASIDE \$60  
9 MILLION ACROSS THE THREE YEARS FOR ZERO-EMISSION BUS  
10 INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAMMING. IN ADDITION, THIS ACTION UPDATES  
11 THE 2021, 2022 APPORTIONMENTS WHICH THE FTA RELEASED IN APRIL.  
12 SO THE FIRST MAJOR INVESTMENT HERE IS THE PROGRAMMING OF \$325  
13 MILLION FOR THE BART RAIL CAR REPLACEMENT PROGRAM. SO, DESPITE  
14 THE INFLUX OF FUNDING FROM THE BIPARTISAN INFRASTRUCTURE LAW,  
15 THESE SCORE 16 NEEDS OF THE REGION, INCLUDING THESE BART  
16 REPLACEMENT CARS DO EXCEED THE AVAILABILITY OF FUNDS, AND, SO  
17 THERE IS A NEED FOR FINANCING, WHICH HAS BEEN PROJECTED IN THE  
18 PAST. HOWEVER, DUE TO DELAYS IN THE RAIL CAR PRODUCTION AND  
19 ACCEPTANCE, AS WELL AS THIS INCREASE IN AVAILABLE FUNDING, WE  
20 HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO FUND PAY GO AT A HIGHER LEVEL BY  
21 UTILIZING THIS PART OF THIS CCP UNPROGRAMMED BALANCE. THIS  
22 \$325 MILLION INVESTMENTS INTO BART PAY GO WILL SAVE THE REGION  
23 OVER \$250 MILLION IN FINANCING COSTS OVER TIME, AND, AGAIN,  
24 THIS REDUCES THE NEED TO FINANCE, WE DO ANTICIPATE STILL  
25 NEEDING TO FINANCE IN THE FUTURE, BUT FOR NOW, PROGRAMMING



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 THIS \$325 MILLION BALANCE IS FEASIBLE THROUGH THE PROGRAMS  
2 WILL SEE THE REGION IN THE YEARS TO COME. SO THAT IS THE  
3 PROGRAMMING ACTION FOR TODAY. THE OTHER ACTIONS ARE SET-ASIDES  
4 THAT WOULD BE PROGRAMMED LATER THIS SUMMER. THE FIRST WOULD BE  
5 A FIXED GUIDE WAY CAP INCREASE. SO, THESE FIXED GUIDE WAY CAPS  
6 ARE FOR INFRASTRUCTURE REHABILITATION THAT IS CURRENTLY FUNDED  
7 AT \$120 MILLION PER YEAR. DUE TO THE LIMITED AVAILABILITY OF  
8 FUNDS, THE NEED FAR EXCEEDS OF \$120 MILLION CAP, AND THIS  
9 AMOUNT HAS NOT BEEN INCREASED IN SEVERAL YEARS. SO THE  
10 PROPOSAL WOULD BE TO SET-ASIDE ENOUGH FUNDING TO PERFORM A 20%  
11 INCREASE TO THE FIXED GUIDE WAY CAPS WHICH WOULD BE PROGRAMMED  
12 OUT AT SOME POINT OVER THE SUMMER. SO, THIS IS SETTING ASIDE  
13 ENOUGH MONEY FOR A 20% INCREASE AND THEN WE WILL COME BACK TO  
14 PROGRAM [INDISCERNIBLE] SIMILARLY THERE IS A SET-ASIDE FOR A  
15 0-EMISSIONS BUS INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING INCLUDED IN THIS ACTION  
16 WHICH WOULD PROVIDE AT LEAST \$20 MILLION PER YEAR IN THE LARGE  
17 URBANIZED AREAS OF SAN FRANCISCO, OAKLAND, CONCORD, AND  
18 ANTIOCH. BECAUSE THESE ARE THE UZAS THAT HAVE TOO MANY  
19 COMPETING SCORE 16 NEEDS TO TYPICALLY BE ABLE TO FUND 0-  
20 EMISSIONS BUS INFRASTRUCTURE. THE REASON THAT THIS IS  
21 INCORPORATED INTO THE CCP IS BECAUSE THE TCP IS A CRITICAL  
22 SOURCE AS THE REGION TRANSITIONS TO A 0-EMISSIONSS FLEET AS  
23 REQUIRED BY THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD INNOVATIVE  
24 CLEAN TRANSIT RULE. SO THIS \$20 MILLION ANNUAL SET-ASIDE WILL  
25 ALLOW OPERATORS WHO TYPICALLY ARE NOT ABLE TO ACCESS FUNDS FOR





MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 0-EMISSIONS BUSES TO HAVE A SOURCE IN THE TCP. STAFF WILL  
2 BRING PROGRAMMING FOR THIS SET-ASIDE, ALSO, OVER THE SUMMER.  
3 AND, FINALLY, THIS ACTION DOES UPDATE THE EXISTING PROGRAM,  
4 AGAIN, TO BRING THE APPORTIONMENTS TO THE OFFICIAL LEVELS THAT  
5 WERE RELEASED BY THE FTA IN APRIL, AS WELL AS TO DO SOME MINOR  
6 CHANGES TO THE PROGRAM ON THE MIX OF BUS REPLACEMENTS AND SOME  
7 SMALL ADDS, AS REQUESTED BY OPERATORS. IN SUMMARY HERE ARE  
8 REQUESTS FOR RECOMMENDATION ADVISED TCP PROGRAM TO THE  
9 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL PROGRAMMING \$325 MILLION FOR THE PAY  
10 GO RAIL CAR REPLACEMENT PROGRAM AND SETTING ASIDE FOR EMISSION  
11 BUS INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDS INCLUDING MTC RESOLUTION 4510 REVISED  
12 AND 4169 REVISED IN COMING MONTHS RETURN WITH DETAILED  
13 PRINCIPLES AND PROGRAMMING FOR INCREASES AS WELL AS  
14 PROGRAMMING AS WELL ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING AND RETURN TO THE  
15 REMAINDER OF THE BIPARTISAN INFRASTRUCTURE LAW AND AUTHORIZE  
16 SPENDING AMOUNTS FOR TRANSIT INVESTMENTS. HAPPY TO ANSWER  
17 QUESTIONS

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** REAL QUICK ON THE ELECTRIFICATION OF THE  
22 BUS SYSTEM, WHICH I THINK IS WONDERFUL, BUT DO WE HAVE ANY  
23 UNIVERSAL GUIDELINES HERE? BECAUSE WE HAVE ONE JURISDICTION  
24 PUTTING THIS IN, ANOTHER ONE DOING THAT IN, AND THERE IS NO  
25 CROSS COMPATIBILITY, I BECOME DEEPLY CONCERNED WHEN WE HIT THE



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 INFRASTRUCTURE SUPPORT FOR ALL OF THESE. PROBABLY A REALLY BIG  
2 QUESTION FOR YOU, MARGARET, RIGHT NOW, I JUST WANT TO MAKE  
3 SURE WHEN WE THROWING ALL THAT MONEY OUT THERE, WE'RE  
4 ENCOURAGING THE COORDINATION AND SUSTAINABILITY THROUGHOUT.  
5 AND I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU DO THAT. BUT, IN ANY WAY THAT WE CAN  
6 SEND THAT MESSAGE FORWARD, IT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL. THANK  
7 YOU.

8

9 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** COMMISSIONER, THERESE MCMILLAN, JUST WANT TO  
10 SAY YOU'RE GOING TO GET A PREVIEW OF THAT IN THE NEXT ITEM.  
11 SO, YES WE'RE VERY CONSCIOUS THAT THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO  
12 THINGS RIGHT AT THE OUTSET IN TERMS OF COORDINATION. AND, SO  
13 WE'LL BE ABLE TO SPEAK TO OUR INITIAL THOUGHTS IN THAT REPORT.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. OUR VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WAS JUST GOING TO SAY THE SAME THING AS  
18 COMMISSIONER PAPAN. AND I'LL TAKE THE SAME ANSWER.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** PERFECT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

21

22 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. WELL, I WANTED TO THANK MY  
23 COMMISSIONERS FOR THOSE QUESTIONS AND ALSO JUST THANK MTC  
24 STAFF FOR THIS FORWARD-LOOKING APPROACH. NOT ONLY IN TERMS OF  
25 ACQUIRING THE BART CARS THAT WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 CONTINUE TO SUPPORT THAT CONTRACT FOR THE NEW CARS, BUT ALSO  
2 THIS COORDINATION OF THE ELECTRICAL INFRASTRUCTURE, THAT WE'RE  
3 GOING TO NEED. I THINK THAT HAVING RECEIVED THE BENEFIT OF THE  
4 GRANT FOR THE ELECTRIC TROLLEYS IN WALNUT CREEK HAS GIVEN US  
5 INSIGHT INTO SOME OF THE OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES FOR  
6 FUTURE FLEET MANAGEMENT INVESTMENT. I THINK THIS IS ONE OF THE  
7 MOST IMPORTANT THINGS WE'RE DOING IN CALIFORNIA IS CONVERTING  
8 OUR FLEETS TO NON-FOSSIL FUEL ENERGY IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW,  
9 THE GRIDS AND BUILDING OUT THE INFRASTRUCTURE. SO, I REALLY  
10 APPRECIATE YOUR WORK MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS. AND THIS  
11 APPROACH TO START TO REALLY LOOK AT THE KINDS OF REQUIREMENTS  
12 THAT WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO BE ABLE TO DO THIS SUCCESSFULLY.  
13 SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY  
16 QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, OR CONCERNS? BEFORE WE DO TURN IT OVER TO  
17 -- FOR A MOTION AND SECOND, AND TO THE PUBLIC, I WOULD LIKE TO  
18 SAY, NOTWITHSTANDING THE FACT THAT THE NEED STILL EXCEEDS THE  
19 RESOURCES, IT IS A POSITIVE THING TO REDUCE FINANCING COSTS,  
20 AND BEING ABLE TO INCREASE ALLOCATIONS, AS MARGARET DESCRIBED.  
21 SO APPRECIATIVE OF THE WORK AND STAYING AHEAD OF THAT GOING  
22 FORWARD. SO WITH THAT, I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES IF WE CAN  
23 GET A MOTION?

24

25 **AMY R. WORTH:** MOVE APPROVAL, MR. CHAIR.



1

2 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** SECOND.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. AND I'LL ASK  
5 THE CLERK TO READ PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED ASSOCIATED TO THIS  
6 ITEM INTO THE RECORD.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE NOT RECEIVED ANYTHING IN WRITING.  
9 I HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ALETA  
10 DUPRE, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU AGAIN CHAIR DAVID RABBIT. ALETA DUPRE FOR  
13 THE RECORD SHE AND HER. A LOT OF GOOD THINGS. I WAS IN THE BAY  
14 AREA A WEEK AGO, AND I USED BART. AND THOSE OLD BART CARS ARE  
15 REALLY SHOWING THEIR AGE. SO I WANT TO GET SOME OF THOSE NEW  
16 BART CARS AND WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THOSE NEW BART CARS DOING  
17 WHAT THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO DO. AND I'M REALLY ENJOYING THE NEW  
18 TRAINS, AND I WANT THAT TO BE MORE FREQUENT FOR ME. AND, ALSO,  
19 IN MY MOST RECENT TRIP, I WAS ABLE TO RIDE MORE OF THE ZERO-  
20 EMISSION BUSES. MOSTLY FUELCELL, ON AC TRANSIT'S 36 ROUTE. BUT  
21 I ALSO GOT TO RIDE ONE OF THE NEW BATTERY BUSS ON AC TRANSIT'S  
22 21 ROUTE, WHICH GOES FROM THE AIRPORT. AND I RODE IT UP TO  
23 FRUITVALE. SO THIS WORK IS EVIDENT. AND I ASK THAT YOU STAY ON  
24 THIS WITH 0-EMISSIONS BUSES, AND I APPRECIATE THE AMENDMENTS  
25 THAT WERE MADE AT ONE OF OUR PREVIOUS FUNDING PLANS. BECAUSE



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 WE DON'T WANT TO FUND ANY MORE OF THE DIESEL BUSS IF WE CAN  
2 HELP IT. AND FACILITIES IS ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL. THERE SHOULD  
3 BE STANDARDIZATION. ANYWHERE I GO IN THE UNITED STATES, PLUGS  
4 AND VOLTAGES ARE THE SAME. OF COURSE, WHEN I GO TO ANOTHER  
5 COUNTRY, I HAVE TO GET A VOLTAGE CONVERTER, WHICH I HAVE NEVER  
6 DONE, YET. BUT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE EQUIPMENT THAT WE  
7 BUY IS GOING TO BE FORWARD COMPATIBLE, SO THAT FUTURE MODELS  
8 OF BUSES CAN PLUG INTO IT. REALLY IT'S NOT NEW. BECAUSE BUYING  
9 ELECTRIC BUS INFRASTRUCTURE IS NO DIFFERENT THAN WHEN YOU BUY  
10 A FUEL ISLAND 20 YEARS AGO. SO LET'S GET THIS PASSED AND KEEP  
11 BUYING NOW EQUIPMENT. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO FURTHER HANDS RAISED  
14 FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC BUT ONE COMMISSIONER WITH THEIR  
15 HAND RAISED.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** I SAW THAT. THANK YOU, KIMBERLY.  
18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** PARDON ME. I MISRAISED MY HAND. THANK YOU.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** NO PROBLEM. SO WE DO HAVE A MOTION AND WE  
23 DO HAVE A SECOND. AND IF I COULD ASK, NOW THAT WE HAVE GONE  
24 THROUGH OUR PUBLIC COMMENT. ASK THE CLERK TO DO A ROLL CAUGHT  
25 VOTE ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM



1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FOR ITEM 3A WE HAVE A MOTION BY WORTH, A  
3 SECOND BY PAPAN. CHAIR RABBIT?

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

12

13 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS ABSENT.

20 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

21

22 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN IS ABSENT.

25 COMMISSIONER WORTH?



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1

2 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
5 MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, IN  
8 KEEPING IN THE THEME OF HUGE NEEDS AND NOT QUITE ENOUGH  
9 DOLLARS, WE'LL MOVE ON, THEN, TO AGENDA ITEM 4A, THE MAJOR  
10 PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY THE MAP DEVELOPMENT OUTREACH. AND  
11 I'LL TURN TO KENNETH FOLAN TO PRESENT ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **KENNETH FOLAN:** GOOD MORNING MTC COMMISSIONERS. KENNETH FOLAN,  
14 MTC STAFF. THESE SLIDES ARE PART OF A PRESENTATION WE HAD IN  
15 YOUR PACKET IN APRIL, AND WE DIDN'T HAVE TIME TO GET TO IT SO  
16 WE'RE GOING TO GET THROUGH IT IN DETAIL TODAY AND MAKE SURE  
17 THERE IS PLENTY OF TIME FOR INPUT FROM YOU TODAY AND WE'RE  
18 ALSO GETTING INPUT THIS AFTERNOON FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY  
19 COUNCIL. WE ARE TARGETING ADOPTION FOR OF THE MAP POLICY. AND  
20 IF WE COULD ROLL THE SLIDE DECK, PLEASE? THANK YOU. AND NEXT  
21 SLIDE. SO, THIS IS JUST THE BACKGROUND ON SOME OF THE REASONS  
22 WE BELIEVE WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS. YOU ALL KNOW,  
23 RESOLUTION 3434 WAS A TRANSIT EXPANSION POLICY THAT WE HAD TO  
24 DELIVER MANY PROJECTS IN THE PAST. WE HAVE THE FOUNDATION OF  
25 PLANNED BAY AREA AND THEN SOME OF THE MORE RECENT BLUE RIBBON



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 PANEL HAS ALSO SUGGESTED THAT THIS IS AN IMPORTANT AREA. THE  
2 PLAN IS TO NOT LIMIT THE MAP TO TRANSIT PROJECTS, BUT TO  
3 INCLUDE OTHER MODES, AS WELL. AND I THINK THE TIMING IS QUITE  
4 IMPORTANT AND THE URGENCY, MUCH OF THE FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE  
5 BILL FUNDING AS WELL AS SOME OF THE STATE BUDGET AUGMENTATION  
6 FUNDING THAT MAY COME VERY SOON, WE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SURE WE  
7 HAVE A CLEAR ENDORSEMENT PATH FORWARD ON THAT. SO THAT ALSO  
8 LEADS TO THE URGENCY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS A SLIDE THAT  
9 PUTS THE MAP, THE TOP CATEGORY HERE IN LINE WITH SOME OF THE  
10 OTHER WORK THAT'S GOING ON. I MENTIONED THE TIRCP AND SOME OF  
11 THE BILL FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES, AND COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS THAT  
12 ARE ONGOING AT THE BOTTOM THERE, AND THE TARGET IS TO ADOPT  
13 THIS SUMMER AND LIKELY INTO THE FALL SOME OF THE DETAIL AROUND  
14 THE POLICY FOUNDATIONS AND THE RISK PROGRAM THAT WE WOULD LIKE  
15 TO IMPLEMENT AS PART OF THIS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS GIVES  
16 AN IDEA OF WHAT THE MAP IS AND PROJECTS THAT MIGHT BE INCLUDED  
17 IT'S A BRIDGE BETWEEN THE ADOPTION OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
18 AND PROJECT DELIVERY. AND SPECIFIC ENDORSEMENTS FOR  
19 CATEGORIES. IT'S OVERALL FUNDING ENDORSEMENT MATRIX, AS WELL  
20 AS SOME FOUNDATIONS IN POLICY AND RISK. WHAT WE WANT TO DO IS  
21 IMPROVE PROJECT LEVEL AND PORTFOLIO LEVEL DELIVERY WITH  
22 PARTNERS AND EXPAND THAT RISK PROGRAM. AND I THINK, AT YOUR  
23 WORKSHOP IN TWO WEEKS, THAT WILL BE A PRIMARY FOCUS OF SOME OF  
24 THE MEGA PROJECTS IS, SORT OF, RISK THROUGH THE LIFE CYCLE OF  
25 THE PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, WHAT TYPE OF PROJECTS





MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 SHOULD BE IN THE MAP? MAJOR BUS AND RAIL EXPANSION, EXPRESS  
2 LANE PROGRAMS, GRADE SEPARATION PROGRAMS, IS 0-EMISSIONS  
3 TRANSITION PROGRAMS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT EARLIER. THE TYPE OF  
4 PROJECTS THAT ARE NOT NECESSARILY PART OF THE MAP WOULD BE  
5 SMALLER INDIVIDUAL BUS PROCUREMENTS OR LOCAL ROAD STREET SCAPE  
6 IMPROVEMENTS. I'LL TALK ABOUT THE ZERO EMISSION IN A SLIDE OR  
7 TWO, BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT CAME UP ON THE LAST ITEM. NEXT SLIDE,  
8 PLEASE. THIS IS AN IDEA OF THE COMPONENTS ON THE FUNDING. I  
9 THINK IT'S IDENTIFYING FUNDING SOURCES, PRIORITIZING, AND  
10 SENSE SEQUENCING. I MENTIONED THE POLICY REENFORCEMENTS  
11 FOCUSING ON SOME BENEFIT-COST EQUITY LAND USE CONNECTIVITY,  
12 MOBILE, AND IMPORTANTLY THE RISK MANAGEMENT WORKING WITH  
13 FUNDING PARTNERS STATE AND FEDERAL PARTNERS MAKING SURE THE  
14 RISK PORTFOLIO IS BROUGHT IN AS WELL AS COORDINATED WITH THE  
15 VARIOUS FUNDING PARTNERS ALSO ON THE RISK MANAGEMENT ON THE  
16 TRANSIT SIDE. FTA HAS A ROBUST PROGRAM ON THE RISK MANAGEMENT  
17 SIDE WE'RE WORKING CLOSELY WITH THEM, AND WE'RE HEARING SOME  
18 OF THEIR IDEAS IN THE UPCOMING MONTHS AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE,  
19 PLEASE. SO, ON TO THE CALL FOR PROJECTS. WE HAD A CALL FOR  
20 PROJECTS. THE DUE DATE WAS APRIL 15TH. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING  
21 WITH OPERATORS, CLARIFYING WHAT THEY SENT IN, EVALUATING THE  
22 INITIAL EVALUATION, WE ARE WORKING ON RIGHT NOW. AS YOU CAN  
23 SEE, THERE ARE SOME PRETTY BIG NUMBERS THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED,  
24 AND THE COMMITTED FUNDING IS A TINY PERCENTAGE OF THE TOTAL  
25 PROJECT COST. SO, AGAIN, SUGGESTING THAT THE NEED FOR AN



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 ENDORSEMENT STRATEGY AS THE FEDERAL, STATE, AND POTENTIAL  
2 REGIONAL/LOCAL LEVELS, AS WELL, IS REALLY NEEDED. THAT SECOND  
3 BULLET IN THE NEXT FIVE YEAR, THAT THE NEED WAS ABOVE \$50  
4 BILLION. SO THAT GIVES YOU AN IDEA OF HOW BIG THE NEED IS.  
5 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS JUST SOME INFORMATION ON THE  
6 SUBMITTED PROJECTS AND PROPOSED EVALUATION. WE ASKED FOR  
7 THOSE, THOSE -- INFORMATION ON THE FUNDING COMMITMENTS  
8 SCHEDULE, HOW IT ALIGNS WITH THE PLAN. AND LET ME TALK NOW A  
9 LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE LAST BULLET, POTENTIAL CRITERIA TAILORED  
10 TO PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES. I THINK IF YOU CAN ENVISION WHERE  
11 WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH THE MAP IS WE WOULD HAVE A PROJECT  
12 MATRIX FOR THE VERY BIG MEGA PROJECTS, WE WOULD LIST OUT THE  
13 ACTUAL PROJECT, AND THEN FOR SOME OF THE OTHER CATEGORIES, WE  
14 WOULD HAVE A ROLLED UP LINE ITEM. THE ITEM THAT YOU MENTIONED,  
15 A COUPLE COMMISSIONERS MENTIONED ON THE LAST ITEM RELATED TO  
16 0-EMISSIONS BUSES. AND FOLKS MENTIONED WE HAVE A BUNCH OF  
17 DIFFERENT AGENCIES DOING A BUNCH OF DIFFERENT THINGS. AND ONE  
18 THING WE'RE DOING AT MTC AND IT'S GOING TO THE PARTNERSHIP  
19 BOARD, IS WE'RE IN THE EARLY STAGES OF IMPLEMENTING A 0-  
20 EMISSIONS BUS STRATEGY THAT WOULD BE REGION-WIDE, THAT WOULD  
21 REALLY FIRST AND FOREMOST IDENTIFY THE OVERALL COST FOR BOTH  
22 THE VEHICLES AND FOR THE INFRASTRUCTURE. AND, THEN, DO SOME,  
23 SORT OF, A RISK EVALUATION WITH THE OPERATORS AND FOCUS ON  
24 MAKING SURE THERE IS STANDARDIZATION, WHERE STANDARDIZATION IS  
25 NEEDED. AND IN SOME AREAS OF THE REGION, FOR EXAMPLE, IN



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 SONOMA COUNTY, THEY SUBMITTED A TIRCP APPLICATION TO THE STATE  
2 THAT HAD A GREAT PLAN FOR COORDINATION AMONG THEIR FIVE OR SO  
3 SMALL OPERATORS. SO WE'LL BE WORKING WITH OPERATORS TO COME UP  
4 WITH A RISK PROGRAM ON THAT, AS WELL AS JUST IDENTIFYING THE  
5 OVERALL FUNDING NEED AND THEN AN ENDORSEMENT AND ADVOCACY  
6 STRATEGY FOR THAT. THE EXPRESS LANES AND THE GRADE SEPARATIONS  
7 WOULD BE EXAMPLE OF OTHER CATEGORIES THAT WE PLAN TO ROLL UP  
8 INTO ONE LINE ITEM IN THE MAP, AND THEN REALLY HAVE FOCUSED  
9 STRATEGIES ON WHAT THE SPECIFIC ENDORSEMENTS OR PRIORITIES ARE  
10 WITHIN THAT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, FINALLY, THIS IS AN  
11 OPPORTUNITY, TODAY, TO GET INPUT FROM YOU, COMMISSIONERS WILL  
12 BE WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL THIS AFTERNOON WE HAVE  
13 ONGOING ENGAGEMENT WITH OPERATORS AND CTAS AND OUR FUNDING  
14 PARTNERS AND I THINK WE'RE STILL TARGETING A SUMMER DATE FOR  
15 ADOPTION OF THE POLICY. AND CHAIR RABBIT I'LL GIVE IT BACK TO  
16 YOU TO PROCEED WITH ANY QUESTIONS OR DIRECTION FOR STAFF AT  
17 THIS MOMENT. THANKS.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. AND THANK YOU, KENNETH. APPRECIATE  
20 THAT. APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK. I'M GOING TO GO QUICKLY TO OUR  
21 VICE CHAIR COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU TO  
24 STAFF, TOO. GOOD COMPONENTS HERE. I JUST WANT TO GO BACK TO  
25 SLIDE NUMBER SIX FOR A SECOND. I'M TALKING ABOUT CONNECTED



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 MOBILITY, AND, REALLY, COORDINATION. SO I JUST ASK IF THAT  
2 WHEN WE'RE HEADING DOWN THIS PATH HERE, THAT CERTAIN  
3 JURISDICTIONS, SAN MATEO COUNTY, IN PARTICULAR, IS NOT LEFT  
4 OUT OF THIS. SOME PEOPLE THINK THAT OUR STATION AREA IS  
5 COMPLETED, IT IS NOT, BECAUSE YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT THE INFLUX  
6 OF ELECTRIFICATION OF CALTRAIN, HIGH SPEED RAIL, AND HOPEFULLY  
7 A FURTHER CONNECTION TO SFO. SO, PLEASE, I HEAR FREQUENTLY  
8 ABOUT DIRIDON, AND THE DOWNTOWN CENTER THERE. BUT, LET'S NOT  
9 FORGET, BECAUSE THIS REGION IS THE ECONOMIC ENGINE FOR THE  
10 ENTIRE REGION. SO, PLEASE, WHEN WE GO DOWN THIS, WE WANT TO  
11 PUT ALL THE PIECES TOGETHER SO THAT PEOPLE CAN MOVE THROUGHOUT  
12 OUR ENTIRE REGION. AND I'M SORRY, I HAVE TO BRING THAT UP, BUT  
13 IT TENDS TO GET LEFT OFF. SO, THANK YOU SO MUCH.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO TRY TO GO  
16 IN ORDER TO MAKE SURE I GET BACK TO THE TOP HERE. AND, OUR --  
17 COMMISSIONER PEDROZA?

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBIT. STAFF, THANK YOU FOR  
20 THE PRESENTATION. ON THAT SAME SLIDE, WE TALKED ABOUT COST  
21 BENEFIT. AND WE DON'T NEED TO JUMP INTO THAT TODAY,  
22 COMPLETELY, TO STAFF, BUT I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE  
23 REALLY NEED TO FOCUS ON AND SPEND SOME TIME ON IN TERMS OF  
24 WHEN WE EVALUATE THAT, AND HOW IS THERE CONSENSUS AROUND THAT.  
25 SO IF THERE IS JUST A QUICK RESPONSE TO THAT, THAT WOULD BE



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 GREAT. AGAIN WE DON'T NEED TO DIVE INTO TOO MUCH DETAIL, BUT  
2 IT IS AN AREA OF FOCUS.

3

4 KENNETH FOLAN. THE PROJECTS WE'RE LOOKING AT HAVE GONE THROUGH  
5 THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 EVALUATION PROCESS AND THE APPROVED  
6 PROJECTS FOR MTC. THAT'S GOING TO BE THE FOUNDATION. ANY  
7 BENEFIT-COST EVALUATIONS WILL BE BUILT ON THAT AND ADJUSTED  
8 FROM THAT FOUNDATION.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOT IT. THANK YOU, KENNETH.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. I THINK THIS IS REALLY EXCITING. I  
15 HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS. HOW IS THIS KIND OF SYNCING UP WITH THE  
16 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN? WHICH I KNOW IS SOMETHING WE HAVE NOT  
17 DONE ALREADY, BUT IS, SORT OF, A COMMITMENT COMING OUT OF THE  
18 TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN, COMING OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON.  
19 AND, BECAUSE IT WOULD FEEL THAT, LIKE, THE CONNECTED NETWORK  
20 PLAN SHOULD BE A, SORT OF, ANOTHER ONE OF CRITICAL INPUT INTO,  
21 MAYBE NOT THE FIRST VERSION OF MAP, BUT, YOU KNOW,  
22 SUBSEQUENTLY.

23

24 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, THIS IS THERESA ROMMELL  
25 WITH MTC, IF I COULD RESPOND TO THAT?



1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** PLEASE.

3

4 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I THINK, COMMISSIONER, WE DEFINITELY  
5 UNDERSTAND THE NEED FOR THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN. ONE THING  
6 TO HIGHLIGHT AS THE MAP, YOU NOTED IS NOT GOING TO BE A ONE  
7 TIME ONLY DEAL. IT WILL BE DYNAMIC, AND AS WE MOVE THROUGH THE  
8 PROCESS, IF SOME OF THESE POLICY REENFORCEMENTS, OR RISK  
9 MANAGEMENT COMPONENTS CAN INFLUENCE THE FUNDING STRATEGY, I  
10 THINK THERE IS DEFINITELY ROOM FOR THAT TO OCCUR. BUT WE  
11 OBVIOUSLY HAVE AN URGENCY FOR AN INITIAL FUNDING STRATEGY TO  
12 ALIGN WITH THE STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES. BUT  
13 THAT DOESN'T MEAN THAT AS WE -- AS WE, KIND OF, MATURE IN OUR  
14 OTHER EFFORTS FOR A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN, THAT THAT CANNOT  
15 INFLUENCE FUTURE ENDORSEMENTS WITHIN THE MAP.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE THAT, AND I HOPE WHEN WE HAVE  
18 THE MAP I APPRECIATE WE CAN HAVE THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN SO  
19 WHEN IT GETS ADOPTED CAN BE INTEGRATED INTO THE MAP HOW WE CAN  
20 PLAN ON UPDATING THE MAP WITH THE NEXT PLANNED BAY AREA. THERE  
21 IS, YOU KNOW, A WHOLE BUNCH OF THINGS, AND I THINK ONE OF THE  
22 CHALLENGES WITH 3434, SORT OF, THE OLD MAP, IT WASN'T CLEAR  
23 EXACTLY HOW IT WOULD GET UPDATED UNDER WHAT CIRCUMSTANCES. IT  
24 FELT LIKE SOMETHING THAT WAS KIND OF WRITTEN IN STONE, AND  
25 NOW, WE'RE KIND OF REFERRING BACK TO, LIKE, A 25-YEAR-OLD



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 PLANNING DOCUMENT AS SOMETHING TO BE GUIDING DECISIONS FOR THE  
2 NEXT 20 YEARS. WHICH DOESN'T FEEL QUITE AS FLEXIBLE. AND, SO,  
3 THAT, I GUESS, SORT OF, RELATES -- THERE IS ONE, SORT OF,  
4 FLEXIBILITY. BUT THE OTHER THING I JUST WANTED TO ASK ON AGAIN  
5 IS, HOW ARE WE GOING TO KIND OF TAKE INTO ACCOUNT PROJECTS  
6 CHANGING OVER TIME, EITHER BECAUSE SCOPE CHANGES, OR COSTS,  
7 SIGNIFICANT COST CHANGES, OR THERE ARE, YOU KNOW, MEANINGFUL  
8 DELAYS. WHAT -- AND HOW ARE WE GOING TO KIND OF INCORPORATE  
9 THAT FLEXIBILITY INTO THE MAP?

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'LL JUMP IN WITH THE TOP LINE AND SEE IF  
12 THERESE OR ALAN WOULD LIKE TO ADD. IT REFLECTS BACK TO THE  
13 SLIDE AND OBSERVATIONS THAT CHAIR PEDROZA MADE. YOU KNOW,  
14 BENEFIT-COST, I THINK, TO YOUR POINT, THAT'S NEVER A STATIC  
15 NUMBER, DEPENDING ON THE CIRCUMSTANCES THAT HAPPEN WITH A  
16 PARTICULAR PROJECT THAT CAN MOVE. SO I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS  
17 WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT IS, TO YOUR POINT, MR. VICE CHAIR, WHAT  
18 IS THE -- WHAT ARE THE REASSESSMENT POINTS FOR THE MAP. WHAT  
19 ARE THE TRIGGERS OF THOSE. CERTAINLY COULD BE A PERIODIC  
20 TRIGGER. I THINK YOUR OBSERVATION THAT WE ARE, I THINK, AS A  
21 NATURAL OUTGROWTH IN MANY WAYS OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND  
22 OUR LONG RANGE PLAN, THAT WOULD BE A NATURAL POINT WHEN WE'RE  
23 UPDATING THE LONG RANGE PLAN TO TAKE A LOOK, AND GO, OKAY, HOW  
24 DOES THAT WATER FALL DOWN. I THINK ANY MAJOR PROJECT CHANGES  
25 THAT WE SEE, VERY WELL, ALSO, COULD BE TRIGGER POINTS FOR AN



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 EVALUATION. SO IT COULD RANGE FROM THE VERY BROAD, THE WHOLE  
2 PROGRAM AT A POINT IN TIME, TO, AGAIN, WITHOUT SPECIFYING  
3 UNNECESSARILY, ONE OF THE CHARACTERISTIC THAT WOULD SAY HEY WE  
4 NEED TO GO BACK AND TAKE A LOOK. I THINK THAT'S ONE OF THE  
5 THINGS THAT WE WANT TO SPEND SOME QUALITY TIME THINKING ABOUT,  
6 AND LESSONS LEARNED FROM DOING IT OR NOT DOING IT WELL WITH  
7 RESOLUTION 3434, THAT WOULD PEEL INTO, AS WAS MENTIONED IN THE  
8 PRESENTATION, THE, SORT OF, INITIAL BIFURCATION WE'RE DOING OF  
9 MEETING BECAUSE OF DISCRETIONARY DEADLINES FOR FEDERAL AND  
10 STATE COMPETITIVE FUNDS, WE NEED TO GET THAT, SORT OF,  
11 FINANCIAL -- THE INITIAL, YOU KNOW, FINANCIAL ASSESSMENT DONE  
12 FIRST BUT THEN TAKE A LITTLE BIT MORE TIME FOR THIS POLICY  
13 OVERLAY TO BE ABLE TO IDENTIFY, IF NOT THE COMPLETE FINALIZED  
14 SET OF CRITERIA, CERTAINLY AN INITIAL SET, AND THEN QUESTIONS  
15 TO CONTINUE DEVELOPING ALONG THE WAY AS WE MOVE FORWARD.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE THAT. I THINK IT WILL BE  
18 IMPORTANT TO LAY OUT UP FRONT WITH SPONSORS SO IT DOESN'T FEEL  
19 LIKE ONE OFF OR PUNITIVE OR WHATEVER. IT'S JUST KIND OF LIKE,  
20 IF YOUR PROJECT COSTS 20% MORE THAN LAST TIME WE CHATTED, THEN  
21 THAT TRIGGERS A REEVALUATION. OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. THAT'S  
22 NOT A SUGGEST ON THE IN ADDITION OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT, BUT  
23 JUST HAVING SOME, SORT OF, CLEAR CRITERIA SO THAT IT'S NOT,  
24 NOBODY FEELS LIKE WE'RE PICKING ON THEM IT'S JUST THAT WE'RE  
25 TRYING TO BE GOOD STEWARDS OF THE REGION AND TRYING TO





MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 INCREASE THE CHANCES OF SUCCESS AND DELIVERING KIND OF AS MUCH  
2 TRANSPORTATION PROJECT BENEFIT TO THE REGION AS POSSIBLE. AND  
3 I THINK ANOTHER ONE OF THOSE EXTERNAL TRIGGERS IS CHANGES IN  
4 STATE AND FEDERAL POLICY, AS WELL. I THINK SOMETHING LIKE  
5 CAPTI COMING INTO PLACE WHERE IT FEELS LIKE SUDDENLY SEEMS  
6 THERE IS MUCH LESS APPETITE FOR STATE FUNDING FOR PROJECTS  
7 THAT DON'T HAVE, SORT OF, MEANINGFUL CLIMATE EQUITY, PUBLIC  
8 HEALTH OUTCOMES, IS THE TYPE OF THING THAT SHOULD PROBABLY,  
9 SEEMS LIKE THE THING THAT SHOULD EMERGE POST PLANNED BAY AREA,  
10 WHICH SHOULD PROBABLY INFLUENCE THIS MAP AND YOU KNOW WHEN  
11 THERE ARE SUBSEQUENT CHANGES LIKE THAT SHOULD BE INFLUENCING  
12 SUBSEQUENT VERSIONS OF IT. AND I THINK, ALSO, I WOULD BE  
13 INTERESTED IN YOUR TAKE ON -- IS THE MAP ALSO GOING TO -- AND  
14 MAYBE WE'LL TALK ABOUT THIS MORE AT THE WORKSHOP, ARE YOU  
15 THINKING THAT THE MAP WILL ALSO INCLUDE A, SOME IDEAS ON HOW  
16 TO, OR SOME PRACTICES AROUND HOW THE REGION CAN HELP REDUCE,  
17 SORT OF, RISKS OF COST OVERRUNS OR HOW THE REGION CAN BE A  
18 PARTNER OF PROJECTS TO TRY TO REDUCE THE RISK OF COST OVERRUNS  
19 AND DELAYS SO WE DON'T HAVE THE ISSUES OF CASCADING ON THE  
20 PROJECT BUT ALSO ON THE OTHER PROJECTS THAT WILL GET PUSHED  
21 OUT OF THE WAY BECAUSE OF THOSE COST OVERRUNS AND DELAYS FOR A  
22 PARTICULAR PROJECT?

23

24 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I THINK THAT TOPICALLY IS THE AREA, AGAIN,  
25 ON SLIDE SIX, THE THIRD BOX THAT SPOKE TO RISK MANAGEMENT IS,



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 MAYBE, YOU KNOW, GRAMMATICALLY GETTING AT THAT, I THINK THE  
2 WORKSHOP AT THE END OF THE MONTH IS GOING TO GIVE US  
3 INTERESTING INSIGHT AND I THINK THE QUESTION IS GOING TO BE  
4 WHAT IS THE APPROPRIATE VALUE-ADDED ROLE FOR MTC AS A REGIONAL  
5 AGENCY COMPARED TO THE RESPONSIBILITIES AND ACCOUNTABILITY OF  
6 A PROJECT SPONSOR. YOU KNOW WHERE DO THOSE THINGS SIT. SO A  
7 VERY RICH AREA FOR DISCUSSION, BUT ONE I THINK OUR WORKSHOP  
8 WILL HIGHLIGHT THE IMPORTANCE OF DELVING INTO. JOSEFOWITZ  
9 JOSEFOWITZ GREAT. AND PERSONALLY I'M HOPING WE CAN MOVE BEYOND  
10 EVALUATION AND MONITOR TO THE, SORT OF, PARTNER TO THE  
11 INDIVIDUAL PROJECT SPONSORS TO BE ABLE TO HELP, YOU KNOW, NOT  
12 JUST EVALUATE IS MONITOR, BUT ACTUALLY TO CONTROL AND REDUCE  
13 RISKS. THIS REALLY EXCITING AND IMPORTANT WORK.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I DID SEE  
16 ALIX, YOU HAD YOUR HAND UP. NOW IT'S DOWN. YOU'RE GOOD?

17

18 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THERESE MADE ALL THE POINTS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** PERFECT. I APPRECIATE THAT. THIS IS AN  
21 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. SO THERE IS NO ACTION BE TAKEN TODAY. JUST  
22 FOR MYSELF, I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION. LOOK FORWARD TO THE  
23 WORKSHOP. ESPECIALLY TALKING ABOUT THE POLICY REENFORCEMENT  
24 SIDE OF THINGS AS IT PERTAINS TO, WELL, REALLY, YOU KNOW,  
25 AGAIN, THE BENEFIT-COST ANALYSIS. GLAD TO HEAR THAT'S NOT A



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1    STATIC NUMBER. AND I DO THINK THERE IS A RELATIVE PIECE TO  
2    THIS, AS WELL, BASED UPON WHERE YOU ARE WITHIN THE NINE  
3    COUNTIES IN THE BAY AREA, AS WELL AS THE LAND USE PIECE.  
4    BECAUSE I KNOW IN THE PAST, YOU KNOW, THAT HAS COME BACK TO  
5    BITE US UP HERE A LITTLE BIT. IF YOU HAVE A RAIL, FOR  
6    INSTANCE, A COMMUTER RAIL SYSTEM GOING A JOB CENTER AND THERE  
7    IS NOT ENOUGH HOUSING AROUND THAT JOB CENTER EVEN THOUGH THERE  
8    MIGHT BE 6,000 EMPLOYEES IT DOESN'T SCORE WELL. SO I  
9    PERSONALLY THINK WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE LOOK AT THE  
10   UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES SO THAT WE DON'T ELIMINATE LARGE  
11   GEOGRAPHICAL AREAS FROM RECEIVING ASSISTANCE AND GETTING A  
12   LOCAL OR EVEN COUNTY SCHOOL PROJECT OVER THE FINISH LINE.  
13   THAT'S IMPORTANT. SO I DO APPRECIATE THAT. I WILL ASK THE  
14   CLERK TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM  
15   INTO THE RECORD AND SEE IF THERE IS ANYONE -- I SEE ONE HAND  
16   RAISED, AND I'LL LEAVE IT TO KIMBERLY.

17

18   **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN  
19   WRITING, AND I DO SEE ALETA DUPRE WITH HER HAND RAISED. IF YOU  
20   WOULD LIKE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

21

22   **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT. ALETA DUPRE FOR THE RECORD  
23   SHE AND HER. THIS IS GETTING TO THE DEFINE MORE WHAT A MAJOR  
24   PROJECT MEANS, AND I WOULD SAY BUILDING AN ELECTRIC BUS  
25   NETWORK IS A MAJOR PROJECT. BECAUSE, TO ME, MAJOR PROJECTS ARE



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 NOT JUST ABOUT LARGE SIGNATURE INFRASTRUCTURES SUCH AS EAST  
2 SIDE ACCESS IN NEW YORK, WHICH HAS PRETTY MUCH FINISHED AN  
3 EIGHT-TRACK RAILROAD STATION, ABOUT 100 FEET BELOW GRAND  
4 CENTRAL TERMINAL. BUT THE ELECTRIC BUSES OFFER THE BOLD VISION  
5 OF BRINGING CLEANER AND QUIETER, AND MORE RELIABLE  
6 TRANSPORTATION TO THE MASSES. SO WE CAN THINK ABOUT THE  
7 SUBWAY, BUT, REALLY, IN NEW YORK, THERE IS A LOT OF BUSES TOO.  
8 IN LOS ANGELES, THERE IS LOTS OF BUSES. NOT QUITE AS MANY AS  
9 NEW YORK, BUT BUSES MAKE A HUGE DIFFERENCE IN THE LOS ANGELES  
10 AREA. CLIPPER TWO IS AN EXAMPLE OF MAJOR PROJECT BECAUSE IT  
11 HAS THE POTENTIAL, AND ALREADY IS POSITIVELY AFFECTING  
12 MILLIONS OF PEOPLE. I WISH WE HAD ALL THE MONEY TO BE ABLE TO  
13 DO ALL OF THE THINGS WE WANT TO DO. \$124 BILLION IS A LOT OF  
14 MONEY. BUT I THINK WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE. SO I'M LOOKING  
15 FORWARD TO FURTHER WORKSHOPS AND BEING ABLE TO TURN THESE  
16 IDEAS INTO THINGS THAT ARE SHOVEL-READY, AND COME TO FRUITION,  
17 SO I CAN USE AND ENJOY THEM. THANK YOU

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HAND  
20 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AGAIN, I  
23 THINK WE'RE ALL LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT WORKSHOP AND THIS  
24 ONGOING DISCUSSION. SO, THANK YOU, AGAIN. THANK YOU, KENNETH,  
25 THANK YOU EVERYONE FOR PARTICIPATING ON THAT ITEM. WE'LL MOVE



MAY 11, 2022 DATE

1 TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I'LL ASK THE  
2 CLERK IF THERE IS ANY ITEMS RECEIVED, OR ANYONE WOULD LIKE TO  
3 SPEAK TO THIS BODY?

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE  
6 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT  
7 SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

8

9 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THEN WE'RE ON TO AGENDA IDEALISM  
10 SIX. WHICH IS OUR ADJOURNMENT. AND OUR NEXT MEETING IS  
11 SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY JUNE 8TH, 2022. ANY CHANGES TO  
12 THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. AND, AGAIN,  
13 WANT TO THANK EVERYONE, MOST ESPECIALLY ALL THE STAFF FOR  
14 THEIR GREAT WORK. SO, THANK YOU ALL. [ADJOURNED]

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33



*Broadcasting Government*