

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP**
3 **MONDAY, MARCH 7, 2022 10:00 AM**

4
5 DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM
6 WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH
7 SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING
8 IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
9 COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME,
10 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE
11 GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST
12 AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
13 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
14 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
15 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
16 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
17 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
18 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
19 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
20 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
21 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
22 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
23 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
24 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE
25 THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



MARCH 7, 2022

1 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
2 ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE
3 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM
4 EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WELCOME EVERYBODY TO THE
7 NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP MEETING OF
8 MARCH 7TH, 2022. WALLY. PLEASE CALL THE QUORUM

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES. I'LL CALL BY LAST NAME. PLEASE BE
11 READY TO UNMUTE.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** CHAIR MULLIGAN?

14

15 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** PRESENT.

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** VICE CHAIR JOHN-BAPISTE?

18

19 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** PRESENT.

20

21 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** BOUCHARD?

22

23 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** PRESENT.

24

25 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CHURCHILL?



MARCH 7, 2022

1

2 **BILL CHURCHILL:** HERE.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CURRIER?

5

6 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** HERE.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** GONOT?

9

10 **CAROLYN GONOT:** HERE.

11

12 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HURSH?

13

14 **MICHAEL HURSH:** HERE.

15

16 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** LEVIN?

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** PRESENT.

19

20 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** LINDSAY?

21

22 **JAMES LINDSAY:** PRESENT.

23

24 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MCMILLAN?

25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** HERE. POWERS?

2

3 **ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

4

5 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** SMITH. TUMLIN?

6

7 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

8

9 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WUNDERMAN?

10

11 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** HERE.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A FULL AGENDA TODAY
14 DIVIDED INTO THREE SECTIONS. CONSULTANTS WILL BEGIN BY
15 PROVIDING CONTEXT FOR THEIR NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE
16 ANALYSIS THEN FOLLOWED BY PRESENTATION OF THEIR WORK PLAN THEN
17 MOVE TO DETAILED SCOPE OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT. I ASK THE PUBLIC
18 TO PARTICIPATE IN RESPONSE TO SLIDES WE'LL ASK MTC HOW THE
19 GOVERNANCE GRANTS WILL INTEGRATE WITH THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
20 BUSINESS CASE. IT WILL BE A FULFILLING MEETING FOR ALL EVER
21 ARE US. I'LL TURN TO AGENDA ITEM THREE AND I WOULD LIKE TO
22 WELCOME CHAIR PEDROZA TO SHARE HIS INTRODUCTORY COMMENTS.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. I'LL BE BRIEF. I KNOW YOU HAVE A
25 BUSY AGENDA. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE INVITATION ON BEHALF



MARCH 7, 2022

1 OF COMMISSIONERS. WE APPRECIATE YOU STEPPING INTO THIS MOMENT
2 TO STAKEHOLDERS, CONSULTANTS, AND MTC STAFF AND ESPECIALLY TO
3 THE OPERATORS. I THINK COMMISSIONER SPERING DID A TREMENDOUS
4 JOB WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE OF WORKING COLLABORATIVELY
5 WITH EVERYONE GIVING EVERYONE A SEAT AT THE TABLE TO EMBARK ON
6 THIS MONUMENTAL OPPORTUNITY THAT WE HAVE. WE ALL KNOW WHY
7 WE'RE HERE. THE PANDEMIC PROVIDED AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO DO
8 BETTER FOR BAY AREA RIDERS IN THE REGION. I WANT YOU TO KNOW
9 YOU HAVE MY COMMITMENT TO DO THIS IN A FAIR AND EQUITABLE WAY
10 WHERE WE PUT OUR CONCERNS ON THE TABLE AND LISTEN TO EACH
11 OTHER. YOU KNOW THE COMMISSION IS FULLY COMMITTED TO HAVING
12 THIS CONVERSATION WE ADOPTED THE BLUE RIBBON OUTCOMES AND
13 ACCELERATED SOME OF THOSE WE HAVE MADE SOME FUNDING AVAILABLE
14 TO DO THAT AND NOW AGAIN WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO IS THE
15 BYPRODUCT OF WHAT YOU ALL PUT FORWARD WE'RE HOPEFUL THIS CAN
16 HAPPEN IN THE FALL BUT WE ACKNOWLEDGE THIS IS INCREDIBLE WORK
17 AND IF IT TAKES A LITTLE BIT LONGER THAT'S GOING TO BE OKAY.
18 AS WELL. I WANT TO MAKE SURE YOU ALL FEEL SUPPORTED BY THE MTC
19 COMMISSION AND TO THE CONSULTANT TEAM WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
20 WITH THEM AND WANT TO THANK THEM FOR BEING ON THE TEAM AS
21 WELL. WE HAVE HAD GOOD CONVERSATIONS AND WE UNDERSTAND THE
22 OUTCOMES WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE, AND TO THOSE THAT WERE PART
23 OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT DISCUSSIONS WE HAD AT THE
24 COMMISSION, AT THE TASK FORCE, SOME OF YOU PROVIDED PROPOSALS
25 AND WE KNOW THAT WE'RE EMBARKING ON A LOT AND WE INVITE YOU



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THAT IF THERE IS SOME MODIFICATIONS THAT YOU TOP MAKE TO YOUR
2 PROPOSALS AROUND NETWORK MANAGEMENT THOSE ARE GOING TO SERVE
3 AS A STARTING POINT TO THOSE INITIATIVES. WE ALL REMEMBER THE
4 CONVERSATIONS THE COMMISSION, THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS
5 HAVING AROUND NETWORK MANAGEMENT FROM A MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE
6 TO A MANAGER, WHETHER IT WAS INSIDE MTC OR OUTSIDE MTC THOSE
7 WERE ALL FRUITFUL DISCUSSIONS AND THOSE ARE THE BASIS FOR HOW
8 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE FORWARD. I HOPE THAT EVERY ONE YOU TAKES
9 OPPORTUNITY TO PUT THOSE CONCERNS ON THE TABLE. WE HOPE THAT
10 THERE IS CONSCIENCE CONSENSUS. WE HOPE YOU ARTICULATE CONCERNS
11 TO THE COMMISSION AND THE COMMISSION WILL ACT BASED UPON
12 OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT TO ACHIEVE. I WANT TO THANK THIS
13 ADVISORY GROUP. IT'S SO EASY TO SIT ON THE SIDE LINES AND NOT
14 TO DO THE WORK. YOU'RE CHOOSING NOT TO. YOU'RE CHOOSING TO BE
15 PART OF THIS BUSINESS AND THAT'S CRITICAL. YOU'RE ALL WORKING
16 WITH THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE TEAM AND I HAVE MADE MYSELF
17 AVAILABLE SO WE CAN MAKE SURE THERE IS ACTIVE COMMUNICATION
18 AND THERE ARE NO SURPRISES AND I APPRECIATE THAT COMMITMENT
19 FROM EVERY ONE OF YOU. I'M LOOKING OUT AT ALL THESE VIRTUAL
20 SQUARES AND YOU'RE ALL VERY GOOD AT PICKING UP THE PHONE AND
21 TALKING TO EACH OTHER. I ASK THAT YOU BE COMMITTED TO THE
22 PROCESS SO THAT WAY WE HAVE AN OUTCOME THAT THE COMMISSION CAN
23 REALLY DIVE INTO TO ENSURE THAT, AGAIN, IT'S DONE
24 COLLABORATIVELY. SO I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING WHAT YOU ALL ARE
25 GOING TO DO. AND I REALLY THANK YOU ALL FOR TAKING THIS TIME.



MARCH 7, 2022

1 I THINK WE HAVE AN INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY FOR OUR REGION TO DO
2 GOOD AND TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF LIFE. BUT IT'S HOW WE DO
3 IT, AND I THINK THIS'S THE CONVERSATION I HAVE HAD WITH
4 THERESE AND ALIX AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM THAT WE NEED DO THIS
5 WITH EACH OTHER AND NOT AT EACH OTHER. AGAIN, THANK YOU ALL,
6 AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING WHAT'S NEXT.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA FOR COMMENTS
9 AND LEADERSHIP. THAT LEADS US TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR CONSENT
10 CALENDAR. MOTION FOR APPROVAL?

11

12 **MICHAEL HURSH:** MOTION FOR APPROVAL.

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** A SECOND?

15

16 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** SECOND.

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE?

19

20 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES. CHAIR MULLIGAN?

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** AYE.

23

24 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

2

3 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CHURCHILL?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

6

7 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CURRIER.

8

9 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** AYE.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** GONOT?

12

13 **CAROLYN GONOT:** AYE.

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HURSH?

16

17 **MICHAEL HURSH:** AYE.

18

19 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** LEVIN?

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

22

23 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** LINDSAY.

24

25 **JAMES LINDSAY:** YES.



MARCH 7, 2022

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MCMILLAN.

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES.

5

6 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** POWERS?

7

8 **ROBERT POWERS:** YES.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** TUMLIN?

11

12 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WUNDERMAN?

15

16 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** YES.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

19 PRESENT.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM FIVE I'LL TURN IT OVER

22 TO KEVIN FROM THE VIA TEAM. THIS IT WILL BE PRESENTED

23 PRIMARILY WITH DISCUSSION TO BE LED BY KEVIN. THE APPROACH IS

24 BROKEN INTO THREE SECTIONS FIRST SECTION IS BACKGROUND AND

25 CONTEXT. A TEN MINUTE PRESENTATION. WE'LL HAVE TIME FOR



MARCH 7, 2022

1 COMMENTS ANTICIPATING ABOUT TEN MINUTES. SECOND SECTION IS THE
2 WORK PLAN STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT 20 MINUTES AND TIME FOR Q&A.
3 IT'S VITAL THAT WE ALL HAVE A COMMON UNDERSTANDING ON THE WORK
4 PLAN AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT BEFORE WE MOVE FORWARD. THIRD
5 SECTION IS TO LOOK AHEAD IF WE HAVE TIME. AT THE END OF EACH
6 SECTION I'LL CALL FOR INDIVIDUAL ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS
7 WISHING TO SPEAK TO THE DECISION CALLING IN THE ORDER OF HANDS
8 RAISED THEN THE PUBLIC WILL BE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT AT THE
9 END OF THE FULL ITEM. WITH THAT DO I START WITH SCHRUTI OR
10 TAMIM?

11

12 **TAMIM RAAD:** I HAVE TWO SCREENS. I'LL BE JOCKEYING BETWEEN BOTH
13 SCREENS AND ENDEAVORING TO MAKE AS MUCH EYE CONTACT AS
14 POSSIBLE. THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING I'M TAMIM RAAD, PROJECTOR
15 WITH ACCESS PLANNING, AND JOINED BY KEVIN DESMOND OF SAM
16 SCHWARTZ, OUR EXECUTIVE ADVISER AND KATE HOWE, OF
17 [INDISCERNIBLE] EASTMAN, OUR PROJECT MANAGER AND OUR EXTENDED
18 TEAM FROM KPMG AND FOR STRATEGY, A NUMBER SUBJECT-MATTER
19 EXPERTS THAT WILL BE MORE INVOLVED AS WE GET INTO THE BUSINESS
20 CASE GENERATION OPTION AND EVALUATION STAGES LATER ON. CHAIR
21 MULLIGAN WENT THROUGH THE THREE BLOCKS OF THE DISCUSSION THAT
22 WE'RE GOING TO BE HAVING HERE, AND THE KEY PURPOSE, I WON'T GO
23 THROUGH IN DETAIL, BUT THE KEY PURPOSE IS WE'RE LOOKING FOR
24 AFFIRMATION FOR A STARTING POINT AND GETTING FEEDBACK ON THE
25 STUDY OF APPROACH AND PRIORITIES FOR OUR SPRING 2022 WORK. I'M



MARCH 7, 2022

1 GOING TO MOVE THROUGH THE CONTENT AT A BRISK PACE TO ALLOW
2 TIME FOR DISCUSSION THAT'S GOING TO BE FACILITATED BY KEVIN
3 THEN WE'LL DO SUMMATION AT THE END OF KEY THINGS THAT WE HAVE
4 HEARD. NEXT SLIDE. HERE IS OUR HIGH-LEVEL ORGANIZATION CHART
5 AND THE PROJECT REPORTS THROUGH MTC AND STAFF EXECUTIVE AND
6 PROJECT TEAMS. PROJECT MANAGER SCHRUTI, AND RICK RAMACIER IS
7 WORKING ALONGSIDE SCHRUTI AS THE PROJECT TECH ADVISER AND
8 WE'RE FORTUNATE TO HAVE RICK WORKING ON THIS BECAUSE OF HIS
9 DEEP AGENCY AND OPERATING PERSPECTIVE ON THIS PROJECT
10 PARTICULARLY IN THE BAY AREA. THIS PROJECT IS UNDERTAKEN IN A
11 STAKEHOLDER RICH ENVIRONMENT. SO THE KEY PIECE OF WORK THIS'S
12 UNDER PINNING EVERYTHING WE DO IS ENGAGEMENT HAPPENING WITHIN
13 THIS GROUP AND THE CONVERSATIONS YOU'RE HAVING WITH ONE
14 ANOTHER AND IT'S IMPORTANT THAT IT HAPPENS WITH THE CONSULTING
15 TEAM AND WITH THE MTC WORKING CLOSELY WITH THE OPERATOR AND
16 COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS IT'S CORE TO OUR METHODOLOGY APPROACH
17 ON THIS TO MAKE SURE ALL ARE HEARD IN REFLECTING IN THE
18 ANALYSIS IN AN OPEN AND TRANSPARENT WAY AND WE'LL HIGHLIGHT
19 KEY POINTS LATER IN THE PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE. GETTING INTO
20 THE CONTENT, WHY WE'RE HERE. AND SOMETIMES WE FEEL IT'S
21 IMPORTANT TO SET THE TABLE EVEN THOUGH A LOT OF US KNOW THE
22 INFORMATION HERE. I'LL TOUCH ON THE MOTIVATIONS. AND I THINK
23 ONE OF THE THINGS, COMING FROM OUTSIDE THE BAY AREA, I'M FROM
24 VANCOUVER, BRITISH COLUMBIA, AND IN TRANSIT CIRCLES, THE BAY
25 AREA IS WELL-KNOWN FOR THE MANY, MANY AGENCIES OPERATING IN



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THE REGION, AND HAS GROWN OVER THE PAST HUNDRED YEARS AS THE
2 REGION HAS GROWN OVER THE CLEAR REGIONAL ENTITY BEING THERE
3 EACH OF THE LOCAL ENTITIES HAS EMERGED FILLING IN AN IMPORTANT
4 NICHE OR NEED IN TRANSPORTATION WHETHER LOCAL OR REGIONAL AND
5 THAT HAS BEEN DELIVERING BENEFIT TO RIDERS FOR SURE. WE SEE
6 THAT WITH THE SYSTEM THIS'S ON THE GROUND TODAY. THIS IS ALSO
7 CREATED A VERY UNIQUE ENVIRONMENT FOR TRANSIT GOVERNANCE. ONE
8 OF THE MOST UNIQUE IN NORTH AMERICA WITH MANY RELATIONSHIPS
9 BETWEEN AGENCIES AND RIDERS AND BETWEEN AGENCIES AS WELL. SO
10 THERE IS NO SINGLE ENTITY WITH AUTHORITY RIGHT NOW TO ENSURE
11 THAT CONSISTENT SEAMLESS CONNECTIVITY WHICH WAS THE ISSUE THAT
12 WAS RAISED BY THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE SO THE BIG QUESTION
13 HERE IS OVER THE PAST NUMBER OF DECADES AS IT'S EVOLVED IS
14 THIS WHAT THE REGION'S GOING TO NEED TO CARRY IT INTO THE
15 FUTURE. NEXT SLIDE. SPEAKING TO THE MANY RELATIONSHIPS, THIS
16 HIGHLIGHTS THAT AS A HIGH-LEVEL THE NUMBER OF OPERATORS HERE,
17 LOTS OF DIFFERENT TYPES AND FORMS OF CONSTITUTIONS OF THE
18 VARIOUS AGENCIES LOCAL JPAS, SPECIAL DISTRICTS EACH CARRYING
19 VERY SPECIFIC MANDATES EITHER LOCAL MANDATES, MODE-SPECIFIC
20 MANDATE OR SUBREGIONAL DUTY THESE TOUCH ON BOTH LOCAL ROLES
21 AND REGIONAL ROLES POINT BEING HERE THERE IS A LOT OF
22 STITCHING THAT NEEDS TO HAPPEN THAT'S BEEN THE MAIN
23 OBSERVATION OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE BUT THERE ISN'T ONE
24 ENTITY THAT'S ACCOUNTABLE FOR DOING THAT. THAT'S OUR ENDEAVOR
25 HERE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE CHALLENGE IS NOT NEW. IT'S BEEN



MARCH 7, 2022

1 OBSERVED FOR QUITE A WHILE AND THIS IS REALLY BROUGHT TO A
2 HEAD BY THE PANDEMIC PROVIDING A SENSE OF URGENCY TO
3 ADDRESSING THE CREATION OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. AND
4 EMERGING FROM THAT WORK, ACTUALLY, IN THE SPRING OF LAST YEAR
5 BEFORE WE STARTED WORKING ON THE FIRST ASSIGNMENT WHICH WAS TO
6 EXAMINE OPTION, TO DO OPTION GENERATION AT A HIGH-LEVEL, THERE
7 -- THE PROBLEM STATEMENT WAS REALLY -- THERE WAS SOME GOOD
8 WORK DONE TO REALLY ARTICULATE WHAT PROBLEMS WOULD REGIONAL
9 NETWORK MANAGEMENT TRY TO SOLVE FOR THE MAIN OBSERVATION THERE
10 IS THE LEVEL OF COORDINATION NEEDED BETWEEN THE 27 ENTITIES
11 NEEDED A BODY THAT WOULD OVERSEE THAT SO THAT THE REGION COULD
12 MEET ITS LONG-TERM OBJECTIVES I GUESS IS THE MAIN THRUST OF
13 THE LEADER OF THE TASK FORCE. NEXT SLIDE, SLIDE SEVEN. SO THE
14 WORKING PROPOSITION, AT LEAST, IS THAT, AT LEAST SOME FORM OF
15 FORMALIZED OR CENTRAL DECISION-MAKING WOULD BE NEEDED TO MEET
16 THOSE ORGANIZATIONAL CHALLENGES, CUSTOMER CHALLENGES, EQUITY
17 CHALLENGES, FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY CHALLENGES JUST AMONG
18 SOME OF THE KEY ONES THAT WERE RAISED AT THE TIME. THE EXACT
19 MODEL THAT WOULD TAKE TO FORM IS STILL ELECTIVE WE WERE
20 PREPARING MODELS AT THE TIME THAT WOULD BE THE BAY AREA OF OUR
21 STARTING POINT FOR THIS WORK BUT THERE IS A SHARED SENSE THAT
22 SOME ACTION WAS NEEDED ON REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND
23 DECISION-MAKING AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL TO HAVE THE REGION'S
24 TRANSIT SYSTEM REALLY GROW WITH THE REGION OVER THE COURSE OF
25 THE NEXT FEW DECADES. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE. SO BAY AREA 2050, THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 PLAN THAT REALLY IS THAT ASPIRATIONAL VIEW FOR THE REGION N
2 OUR VIEW, WHICH BE WHAT ANCHORS THE DESIGN OF THIS NETWORK
3 MANAGEMENT ENTITY. AND I THINK THERE IS GENERAL CONSENSUS ON
4 THAT THE OUTCOMES ARTICULATED IN THAT ARE A GOOD STARTING
5 POINT FOR DESIGN FOR THE ENTITY. THIS IS REALLY THE FLIP SIDE
6 OF THE CHALLENGES THAT WE KNOW ABOUT FOR REGIONAL NETWORK
7 MANAGEMENT. IT'S REALLY THE ASPIRATION AND THIS SETS THE
8 TARGET FOR WHAT WE WANT TO REACH WITH A HIGHLY INTEGRATED
9 CONNECTED NETWORK THAT CAN SERVE THE NEEDS OF THE 10 MILLION
10 PEOPLE THAT WILL INHABIT THE BAY AREA IN 2050. AND WHAT DOES
11 THAT LOOK LIKE? WE KNOW THE OUTCOMES THAT WE'RE WORKING
12 TOWARDS ARE GREAT BUS TRANSIT SERVICE, FOR EXAMPLE, A RAIL
13 NETWORK THAT CAN SERVE A MEGA REGION AND THE BAY AREA IS A
14 MEGA REGION OF WHAT WILL BE 10 MILLION, AND REALLY
15 IMPORTANTLY, I THINK, SAY SENSE THAT IT CAN BE DELIVERED
16 EFFICIENTLY IN A TIME FRAME THAT IS REASONABLE WITH PEOPLE
17 GETTING ALONG, ALONG THE WAY. NEXT SLIDE. JUST A COUPLE MORE
18 HERE AND THEN WE'LL STOP FOR DISCUSSION. SO THE TASK FORCE
19 REALLY ACHIEVED SOME COMMENDABLE RESULTS THERE WAS CONSENSUS
20 ON A NEAR-TERM ACTION PLAN AND GETTING AT THOSE LOW-HANGING
21 FRUITS TO GET STARTED ON. THERE WAS RECOGNITION THAT SOME
22 CHALLENGES THAT NEEDED TO BE ADDRESSED IN SOME OF THOSE
23 ACCOUNTABILITY AREAS OR ROLES WERE REALLY CHALLENGING. THEY
24 NEEDED CONCERT THE ORGANIZATIONAL AND ORGANIZATION AND
25 RESOURCES TO ADDRESS THEM. SO THERE WAS REALLY THE NEAR-TERM,



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THE ACTION TO GET ON, BUT THE SENSE THAT THERE WAS A LONGER
2 TERM SET OF OBJECTIVES THAT WOULD REQUIRE A LOT MORE
3 COORDINATION AND INVESTMENT OF PEOPLE, RESOURCES, AND TIME.
4 AND THAT THAT SHOULD BE THE OBJECTIVE. IT'S THE REGIONALLY
5 NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND THIS WAS AN OBSERVATION THIS IS A LONG-
6 TERM INVESTMENT 5 TO 10 YEARS TO GET INTO A STEADY STATE OF
7 MATURITY AND A LONG LASTING LEGACY FOR MANY YEARS TO COME THIS
8 IS A LONG-TERM INVESTMENT GETTING STUFF DONE IN THE NEAR-TERM
9 THAT CAN GET DONE. TWO IMPORTANT PARALLEL POINTS OF FOCUS.
10 NEXT SLIDE. SO, COMING BACK TO THE QUESTION THAT WAS POSED
11 EARLIER, THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE DID ADDRESS THAT QUESTION
12 OF WHETHER THE NUMBER AND SIZE OF AGENCIES THAT EXIST TODAY
13 COULD BE SUSTAINED INTO THE FUTURE. IN OTHER WORDS, WOULD, AS
14 THE REGION GROWS, YOU CAN SEE THIS ON THE TIMELINE, WOULD
15 CREATE MORE AGENCIES TO MANAGE THE GROWING NEED. THERE WAS A
16 SENSE THAT MAY HAPPEN THERE WAS AN OVERARCHING INTEGRATIVE
17 BODY. WHAT ARE THE ORGANIZATIONAL CHOICES TO GET THERE, AND
18 IMPORTANTLY WHAT ARE THE BENEFITS AND PATHS AND CONSEQUENCES.
19 THERE ARE DIFFERENT LEVELS THAT YOU COULD GO TO IN REGIONAL
20 NETWORK MANAGEMENT IN TIME OF INVESTMENT, CLINICAL AND CAPITAL
21 AND MOVING THOSE DIFFICULT CHALLENGES TO A MORE CENTRALIZED
22 FORM OF DECISION-MAKING WILL REQUIRE, AND IS IT WORTH IT IS
23 THE MAIN QUESTION. RELATED TO RULES AND RESPONSIBILITIES,
24 RELATED TO MAKING SURE THAT WE GET THE BENEFITS RIGHT, IS THAT
25 THERE ARE THESE DOZEN OR SO ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITY FOR



MARCH 7, 2022

1 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT. SO, YOU KNOW, BUS NETWORK,
2 TRANSIT PRIORITY RAIL PLANNING DELIVER WERE SOME OF THE
3 TOUGHER ONES, AND TRANSIT CONNECTED PLANNING NETWORK PLANNING
4 LONG-TERM PLANNING FARES PASSENGER INFORMATION CUSTOMER
5 INFORMATION ACCESSIBILITY FOR UNIVERSAL ACCESSIBILITY, SOME OF
6 THESE WERE EASIER THAN OTHERS AND THAT WAS THE TRANSFORMATION
7 ACTION PLAN SOMEWHERE HARDER THAN OTHERS THAT WE REALLY SHOULD
8 BE ASSESSING THE BENEFITS OF TRYING TO TACKLE THEM THROUGH
9 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND ASSESS WHETHER THAT IS
10 POSSIBLE. THAT TAKES US TO THE END OF THIS SECTION, AND I'LL
11 TURN IT OVER TO KEVIN FOR THE Q&A.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS THE WARMUP. WHAT TAM SCRATCHES THE SURFACE.
14 NEAR-TERM CALL TO ACTION BY THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
15 COMBINED WITH A 2030, 2050 PLAN WITH SOME AMBITIOUS GOALS
16 ACROSS THE SPECTRUM IN TRANSPORTATION AND ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN
17 AND CONTEXT OF CREATION OF THE TRANSIT AGENCY OVER MANY
18 DECADES WITH VARIOUS PURPOSES WITH TAXPAYER OBLIGATION WITH
19 THE TRANSIT DISTRICTS. WHAT WE WANT TO DO FOR THE NEXT TEN
20 MINUTES OR SO IS GET YOUR FEEDBACK AT A HIGH-LEVEL ON THE
21 CONTEXT. ARE THERE CONTEXT OR OBJECTIVE ISSUES, TOPICS THAT
22 YOU WANT TO BRING TO OUR ATTENTION THAT DIDN'T APPEAR IN
23 TAMIM'S CONVERSATION. WE'RE GOING TO GET TO THE ROLES AND
24 RESPONSIBILITIES LATER IN THE PRESENTATION. BROADER CONTEXT,
25 DID WE MISS ANYTHING OR ARE THERE AREAS OF EMPHASIS THAT YOU



MARCH 7, 2022

1 ALL WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT ARE COVERED IN THE MANY WEEKS AHEAD
2 AS WE BEGIN TO DIG INTO THE NOTION OF THE BUSINESS PHASE FOR
3 ONE OR MORE OPTIONS? CHAIR MULLIGAN IF YOU WANT TO ORGANIZE
4 THE Q&A, HOPEFULLY WE CAN HEAR FROM MOST EVERYBODY.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** SURE. I'M LOOKING. PLEASE RAISE YOUR
7 HAND IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK. YOUR VIRTUAL HAND. AT THE MOMENT I
8 DO NOT SEE ANY RAISED. OH I SEE THERESE. I'LL CALL ON THERESE
9 MCMILLAN FIRST.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU CHAIR MULLIGAN. IT'S GOOD TO SEE
12 EVERYONE. I GUESS ONE THING THAT WAS A RUNNING THREAD
13 THROUGHOUT THE BLUE RIBBON WORK AND, CERTAINLY, CONTINUES
14 UNABATED, NOW, IS HOW DO WE HAVE THIS CONVERSATION ON TOP OF A
15 STILL DYNAMICALLY SHIFTING OPERATING ENVIRONMENT FOR TRANSIT?
16 AND, YOU KNOW, OUR TRANSIT SERVICES DEPENDING ON TRANSIT
17 OPERATOR ARE RECOVERING NONE HAS RECOVERED 100% AND JUST AS
18 IMPORTANTLY THOUGH WE'RE SEEING, IT'S IN THE PAPERS A LOT,
19 REALLY SIGNIFICANT DYNAMICS IN PATTERNS, TRAVEL PATTERNS, THE
20 WHOLE REMOTE WORK AND HOW THAT DOES. I WANT TO BE CAREFUL TO
21 SAY I'M NOT SUGGESTING THAT THAT DYNAMIC UNDERCURRENT SHOULD
22 STOP THIS WORK. I AM SAYING, THOUGH, THAT IT WOULD BE HELPFUL
23 TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE EFFORTS NEEDED TO DEAL WITH THE DYNAMIC
24 ENVIRONMENT IN TERMS OF LITERALLY PUTTING SERVICE ON THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 STREET TO COORDINATE WITH, EVENTUALLY, FEEDS INTO THIS
2 DISCUSSION.

3

4 **KEVIN DESMOND:** THERESE, YOU HAVE THE RIDERSHIP DEMAND
5 CHARACTERISTIC IN OUR POST-COVID WORLD YOU HAVE GOT THE
6 FINANCIAL CHALLENGES VERY SIGNIFICANT FINANCIAL CHALLENGES FOR
7 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES PERHAPS VERY SIGNIFICANT IN THE BAY
8 AREA HIGH FARE BOX RECOVERY RELIANCE REORGANIZATION, SOCIAL
9 EQUITY, AND WHAT THE FUTURE WORK IS IN THE BAY AREA, AND
10 PATTERNS, VERY MUCH AN OVERLAY. YOU'RE SUGGESTING HOW DO WE
11 MAKE SURE THAT'S INCORPORATED INTO THE WORK AND HOW THAT MIGHT
12 INFLUENCE OF THE BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT IN THESE PHASES.

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YEP. THANK YOU.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS KEVIN. THANKS THERESE. I'LL CALL
17 ON BOB POWERS NEXT.

18

19 **ROBERT POWERS:** AUDIO CHECK.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** WE HEAR YOU.

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS:** COPY THAT. I HAVE MAYBE A MORE DIRECT VERSION
24 OF WHAT THERESE JUST SAID TO THE FOLKS. THE TERM USED THERE
25 WAS DYNAMIC UNDERCURRENT, BUT I WOULD ALSO PUT FORWARD THAT IN



MARCH 7, 2022

1 UNDERSTANDING THAT THAT DYNAMIC CURRENT, UNDERCURRENT, IS OUR
2 EXISTING CONDITIONS RIGHT NOW FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. AND
3 TO GO INTO THIS STUDY, WHICH, YOU KNOW, THE OPERATORS ARE
4 COMPLETELY -- AND I'M NOT SPEAKING FOR ALL THE OPERATOR, JUST
5 FOR BART ON THIS ONE, ARE VERY MUCH IN SUPPORT. WE ASKED FOR
6 THIS STUDY, AND IN THE MEETING COMING AFTER THE WORK WITH THE
7 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, BUT THAT DYNAMIC UNDERCURRENT IS BY
8 DEFINITION RIGHT NOW, OUR ISSUES. SO WE NEED, IN MY OPINIONS
9 AS THE GM OF BART, TO HAVE A VERY GOOD UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT
10 THOSE EXISTING CONDITIONS ARE RIGHT NOW. THESE ARE NOT THE
11 EXISTING CONDITIONS OF TWO YEARS AGO. THEY MIGHT BE A GOAL TO
12 GET BACK, TO BUT THE EXISTING CONDITIONS, NOW, ARE NOT OF TWO
13 YEARS AGO. SO, A GOOD UNDERSTANDING OF THOSE, AND THEN I'M
14 NOT -- AND I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS A BACK AND FORTH, OR NOT,
15 CHAIRPERSON, BUT, THEN, MAYBE A GAP ANALYSIS, YOU KNOW? YOU
16 KNOW? THAT'S WHAT WE WOULD DO AT BART FROM A PLANNING
17 PERSPECTIVE, UNDERSTANDING THE EXISTING CONDITIONS AND THEN DO
18 SOME TYPE OF GAP ANALYSIS, AND THAT WOULD BE A DATA SET THAT
19 SHOULD BE TAKEN INTO THE OPPORTUNITY THAT'S IN FRONT OF US
20 HERE. SO, YOU KNOW, JUST SOME COMMENTS, AND HOPEFULLY THOSE
21 ELEMENTS CAN BE PICKED UP ON THE FRONT END OF THIS THING.

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS BOB.

24



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **TAMIM RAAD:** MR. CHAIR, WOULD YOU LIKE TO US PROVIDE RESPONSE
2 AS YOU GO ALONG.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** YES.

5

6 **TAMIM RAAD:** DO YOU WANT ME TO MY HAND UP.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** NO. I'LL PAUSE AND LET YOU AND KEVIN --

9

10 **TAMIM RAAD:** TO THERESE AND BOB'S COMMENTS, IT'S IMPORTANT AND
11 METHODOLOGICALLY HOW DO WE ADDRESS IT WITH ANALYSIS AND
12 GOALPOSTS THAT ARE MOVING WITH A FLUID ENVIRONMENT THIS COMES
13 WITH RISK ASSESSMENT AND WE TRUE THROUGH OUR ANALYSIS IS
14 UNDERTAKE SENSITIVITIES AND ASK QUESTIONS. WHAT MIGHT HAPPEN
15 TO SOME OF THESE PROPOSALS THAT WE GENERATOR UNDER SCENARIOS
16 ONE WOULD BE PRESUMPTION OF GROWTH TO HISTORICAL TRENDS ONE TO
17 THE BAY AREA, ANOTHER COULD BE STASIS, ANOTHER COULD BE
18 DECLINE IN TRANSIT, LONG-TERM DECLINE IN TRANSIT, AND WE WOULD
19 AS, ARE PROPOSALS WE'RE GENERATING, ARE NEEDS FOR REGIONAL
20 NETWORK MANAGEMENT MORE OR LESS AND MAY IT BE UNDER THE SAME
21 OR UNDER AND COMET IMPLEMENTATION OF CHANGE AND IMPLICATIONS
22 AND OPTIONS GENERATED THAT WOULD BE IMPORTANT TO BRING INTO
23 OUR RISK ANALYSIS.

24

25 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'LL CALL ON BILL NEXT.



MARCH 7, 2022

1

2 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU DENNIS. BOTH THERESE AND BOB, YOUR
3 COMMENTS ARE WELL TAKEN. I APPRECIATE WHAT YOU BOTH HAVE SAID.
4 I WOULD ECHO THE FACT THAT, AS TRANSIT OPERATORS, WE DO LOOK
5 FORWARD TO THIS, AND I BELIEVE WE HAVE SPENT DECADES. I HAVE
6 BEEN DOING THIS FOR 25 YEARS NOW, AND WE HAVE SPENT DECADES
7 WORKING ON HOW WE CAN BE MORE COLLABORATIVE, AND THERE IS
8 ALWAYS ROOM FOR IMPROVEMENT. SO I SUPPORT THE PROCESS WHOLE
9 WHOLEHEARTEDLY. WE'RE IN A DYNAMIC OUR RIDERSHIP AND CHANGE IN
10 THE NATURE OF WHERE WE GO IS SOMEWHAT CHANGING AS WELL DURING
11 THE PANDEMIC AND IT'S DIFFICULT TO SAY TODAY WHERE WE'RE GOING
12 TO END UP TOMORROW. WE NEED TO BE THOUGHTFUL AND CAREFUL ABOUT
13 THE WAY WE'RE EVOLVING, IF YOU WILL, AND IN ADDITION THAT, I
14 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT FUNDING AND HOW WE'RE FUNDED
15 SO DIFFERENTLY AND SOME OF THE ACCOUNTABILITIES ASSOCIATED
16 WITH THAT FUNDING TO BE SURE THAT WE DON'T GET OURSELVES AT
17 SORT OF THAT CROSS PURPOSES, IF YOU WILL, AS WE GO THROUGH
18 THIS. SO I THINK ADD SOMETHING LAYERS TO THIS THOUGHT PROCESS
19 MIGHT BE HELPFUL FOR US ALL. IT MIGHT GIVE US A SENSE OF
20 SECURITY AS WE'RE MOVING FORWARD THAT WE'RE REALLY THINKING
21 ABOUT HOW THOSE THINGS WILL ENSURE OUR ABILITY TO MAINTAIN
22 TRANSPORTATION FOR OUR COMMUNITIES AS WE WORK TO DO THIS
23 TOGETHER. THANK YOU.

24



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **KEVIN DESMOND:** BILL YOU MENTIONED ORGANIZATION AND
2 COLLABORATION AND IN THE FIRST ROUND OF THE PROJECT CONTINUING
3 WITH THE NOTABLE IMPROVEMENTS IN THE OPERATION GETTING
4 STARTED, SECURING THE HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS, AND THE
5 REGIONAL FARE POLICY INITIATIVES AND WAYFINDING, AS WE
6 CONTINUE TO EXPLORE THE DIFFERENT MODELS, THE CONTEXT IS THAT
7 SUPPORT FROM THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND THE REALITY OF THE
8 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE ALREADY STEPPING UP THEIR COLLABORATION
9 SO HOW WE FIND WAYS TO FURTHER LEVERAGE THAT IN THE CONTEXT OF
10 THIS PLANNING DEVELOPMENT IS GOING TO BE KEY.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS BILL AND KEVIN. NEXT I'LL CALL
13 ON ADINA. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF, ADINA.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. SO, FIRST OF ALL, I WANTED TO
16 APPRECIATE THE EARLIER COMMENTS ABOUT THE CHANGE IN CONTEXT OF
17 TRANSIT AND THE FOCUS ON EQUITY, WHICH SEEMS, TO ME, IN A
18 NUMBER OF DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS, TO BE AN "ALL THE MORE SO "AND
19 I'LL GIVE AN EXAMPLE OF CALTRAIN'S EQUITY STUDIES THAT STARTED
20 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC SHOW THAT, FOR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE IN THE
21 AREA, IT WAS REALLY IMPORTANT TO BE ABLE TO HAVE BETTER ACCESS
22 FROM LOCAL BUS SERVICE, BECAUSE LOW-INCOME PEOPLE ARE MORE
23 LIKELY TO NEED TO TAKE A LOCAL BUS TO CONNECT TO THE TRAIN,
24 AND, YOU KNOW, THAT'S SOMETHING THAT NO ONE AGENCY CAN DO
25 ALONE. AND, WITH THE PANDEMIC, AND THE POTENTIAL LONG-TERM



MARCH 7, 2022

1 CHANGES TO WHITE COLLAR COMMUTES, THE IMPORTANCE OF EQUITABLE
2 ACCESS TO OUR REGIONAL SERVICES BECOMES MORE, YOU KNOW, IT
3 BECAME MORE IMPORTANT, PARTLY BECAUSE WE SAW, YOU KNOW, WHO IS
4 DEPENDING ON TRANSIT, AND USING THE SERVICES, AND MORE
5 IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF ADDITIONAL RIDERS FOR TRANSIT AND BEING
6 ABLE TO DO THAT WELL COORDINATED SERVICE FOR A DIVERSE SET OF
7 RIDERS WAS IMPORTANT BEFORE, AND IT, EVEN MORE IMPORTANT
8 NOW. THE OTHER THOUGHT THAT I HAVE HERE -- AND I'M NOT 100%
9 SURE WHERE IN THIS SUITE OF PRESENTATIONS TO RAISE IT, SO I'LL
10 JUST MENTION IT NOW -- SO, THIS CONVERSATION WILL TOUCH ON HOW
11 THE REGIONAL RAIL STUDY INTERACTS WITH NETWORK MANAGEMENT, AND
12 I THINK THAT THERE ARE A COUPLE OF AREAS WHERE THAT STUDY IS
13 TALKING ABOUT PROJECT DELIVERY, AND THAT'S GOING TO WIND UP
14 INTERSECTING WITH THIS TOPIC, AND THERE MAY BE GOVERNANCE
15 DISCUSSIONS THAT COME OUT OF REGIONAL RAIL THAT WILL FLOW INTO
16 THIS, AS PART OF THE OVERALL CONTEXT, AS WELL. THANKS.

17

18 **KEVIN DESMOND:** THANKS. AND ON THE REGIONAL RAIL WE'LL SEE IN
19 THIS PRESENTATION A TOUCH ON THAT IN TERMS OF THE OVERALL WORK
20 PLAN AND HOW THE REGIONAL RAIL STUDY FITS IN AND LATER AT THE
21 CONCLUSION OF OUR PIECE SCHRUTI IS GOING TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON
22 THAT PROJECT AND WILL GIVE A CHANCE TO TOUCH ON THAT, AND HOW
23 THE STUDY ARE AND WORK ARE INTEGRATING.

24

25 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS KEVIN. I'LL CALL ON MIKE HURSH.



MARCH 7, 2022

1
2 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANKS CHAIR MULLIGAN. I DON'T WANT TO SOUND
3 LIKE A BROKEN RECORD. IT SEEMS LIKE WE'RE FINALLY GETTING
4 UNDER THE HOOD. IT'S BEEN A LONG ROAD TO GET HERE AND WE ARE
5 ON THE PRECIPICE OF ONE OF THE GREATEST OPPORTUNITIES, PUBLIC
6 TRANSIT IN THE UNITED STATES, AND CERTAINLY IN THE BAY AREAS
7 THAT WE'RE SEEING. IT'S SUPER EXCITING. NOW I DON'T WANT TO
8 PUT A LITTLE WATER ON THE FLAME, BUT I THINK THERESE AND
9 COMMENTERS MADE POINTS ON, DO WE HAVE THE VOICE OF THE CURRENT
10 RIDER AND THE VOICE OF THE POTENTIAL FUTURE RIDER? I WOULD
11 REALLY LIKE TO SEE, IN THE WORK PLAN, A GAP ANALYSIS WITH
12 ONGOING, WHETHER IT'S FOCUS GROUP, OR SURVEY DATA, I THINK --
13 FIRST OFF, I THINK THERE IS NOT GOING TO BE A NEW NORMAL. I
14 THINK EVERYBODY'S EXCITED ABOUT WORK REMOTE. I THINK THAT'S
15 GOING TO GO ON FOR A COUPLE OF YEARS, AND QUITE FRANKLY, I
16 THINK PEOPLE ARE GOING TO START TO REALIZE WHAT A UNIT
17 OPPORTUNITY THEY'RE MISSING IN COLLABORATION AND BEING IN THE
18 CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT AGAIN, I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT
19 THE NETWORK SURVEY, REGULARLY COLLECT DATA AND STARTING WITH
20 GAP ANALYSIS IN THIS STUDY, I THINK IT'S GOING TO TAKE LONGER
21 THAN I THINK THE SCHEDULE ON THIS PROJECT ALLOWS AND I THINK
22 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO ADJUST MULTIPLE TIMES I THINK THERE IS
23 GOING TO BE MULTIPLE YEARS OF WORK-FROM-HOME I THINK OUR
24 PEAKS, AM, PM PEAKS ARE GOING TO BE DISAPPEAR. SCHOOL
25 TRANSPORTATION IS GOING TO BE CHANGING, AND WE OWE IT TO THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 TAXPAYER AND RIDERS TO GET THIS RIGHT. WE NEED CUSTOMER
2 STAKEHOLDER INPUT ON A REGULAR BASIS TO CHECK IN AS WE GO TO
3 MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE LANDING AT THE AIRPORT THAT WE NEED TO
4 LAND AT WHEN FINALLY, WHEN THE PANDEMIC IS AN AFTER THOUGHT,
5 AND THE ECONOMY IS THRIVING AND WE'RE BACK TO SCHOOL PATTERNS,
6 WE NEED TO FIND A WAY FOR THE LOCAL RIDERS AND THE POTENTIAL
7 RIDERS AND CHECKING IN FREQUENTLY I THINK THAT'S WHERE IT
8 NEEDS TO START WITH GAP ANALYSIS IT'S FINE TO SAY WE NEED TO
9 IMPROVE, BUT I THINK IT'S ONE VOICE ONE TYPE OF DEMOGRAPHIC
10 SAYING WHAT NEEDS TO IMPROVE AND I AM AFRAID THERE IS A LOT OF
11 UNHEARD VOICES OUT THERE THAT WE STILL NEED TO TAP INTO.

12

13 **KEVIN DESMOND:** GOOD COMMENT AND THAT'S TO THE FUTURE DEMAND
14 SHIFTS IN THE NEAR-TERM AND LONG-TERM IMPLICATIONS FOR TRANSIT
15 MOBILITY DEMAND VERY IMPORTANT POINT FOR SURE I THINK WE NEED
16 TO FIGURE OUT IN THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS CONTEXT AND THE MARKET
17 CONTEXT THAT EACH OF YOU ARE DOING, TO TRACT TO FACTOR ALL OF
18 THAT INTO THIS CONTEXT.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS MIKE. NEXT I'LL CALL ON OUR VICE
21 CHAIR. ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE.

22

23 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE ALL OF
24 THE COMMENTS, AND I APPRECIATE THE TEAM FOR REALLY FOCUSING ON
25 THE 2050 VISION. I THINK WE HAVE SET FOR OURSELVES THROUGH



MARCH 7, 2022

1 PLANNED BAY AREA, REALLY ASPIRATIONAL SET OF GOALS, AND WE
2 ALSO KNOW THAT HAVING TRANSIT TRANSFORM INTO BEING THE
3 PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE FOR TRAVELING AROUND THE REGION IS, WHAT
4 IS GOING TO DETERMINE NOT JUST OUR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, BUT
5 OUR SOCIAL HEALTH, AND OUR ECONOMIC HEALTH GOING FORWARD. SO I
6 THINK ONE OF THE QUESTIONS THAT WAS RAISED DURING THE
7 PRESENTATION IS, IS IT WORTH TO DO REALLY DIVE INTO THESE
8 STICKY COMPLEX QUESTIONS, AND TO ME THE ANSWER IS A RESOUNDING
9 YES. BECAUSE WE HAVE SET SUCH IMPORTANT GOALS FOR OURSELVES AS
10 A REGION. SO THE OTHER REFLECTION I WAS HAVING LISTENING TO
11 THE COMMENTS OF MY COLLEAGUES ON THE, KIND OF, REALLY COMPLEX
12 AND DYNAMIC SITUATION WE'RE IN NOW IS, IN SOME WAYS, IF WE CAN
13 NAVIGATE THIS TIME PERIOD WITH ALL OF ITS COMPLEXITY AND
14 TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION ALL OF THE ISSUES THAT THE REGION IS
15 FACING RIGHT NOW AND THE OPERATORS ARE FACING RIGHT NOW, I
16 THINK THAT IT BODES WELL FOR OUR ABLE TO PUT IN PLACE LONG-
17 TERM STRUCTURE THAT IS GOING TO MEET THE GOALS THAT WE HAVE
18 SET FOR OURSELVES. SO APPRECIATE THE COMMENT SO FAR, AND I
19 ALSO APPRECIATE THE FOCUS ON WHAT IT IS WE'RE TRYING TO
20 ACHIEVE IN THE BIG PICTURE.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS MADAM VICE CHAIR. KEVIN?

23

24 **KEVIN DESMOND:** GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** NEXT HAND IS HAYLEY CURRIER.

2

3 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. THANK YOU FOR THE WORK
4 DONE SO FAR. I DO FEEL LIKE A LOT OF THE ELEMENTS ARE COVERED.
5 I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT, IN PARTICULAR, THAT THE IMPORTANCE OF
6 THE HISTORIC AND ONGOING DISPARITIES WAS INCLUDED. AND I
7 THINK, YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY, THE ONGOING SHIFTING SITUATION IS
8 EXACTLY WHY WE'RE DOING THIS WORK. SO THAT THERE IS BETTER
9 DECISION-MAKING GOVERNANCE IN PLACE TO DEAL WITH WHATEVER
10 SITUATION IS PRESENTED TO US. SO THAT'S WHY I DO THINK THAT WE
11 NEED TO REMEMBER TO LOOK BEYOND COMMUTING. WE DON'T KNOW
12 WHAT'S GOING TO BE HAPPENING WITH COMMUTING BUT WE NEED TO
13 ADDRESS SHORT-TERM GOALS AND PEOPLE OF LOW-INCOME AND PEOPLE
14 OF COLOR, AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. WHATEVER WE DO IN
15 NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS NOT SUCCESSFUL UNLESS IT'S ACTUALLY
16 IMPROVING THE OUTCOME FOR THOSE GROUPS OF PEOPLE. AND THIS
17 REQUIRES ANALYSIS OF THOSE CURRENT CONDITIONS FOR THOSE
18 PARTICULAR GROUPS BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW IF WHAT WE'RE
19 PROPOSING IS IMPROVING OUTCOMES FOR THOSE PARTICULAR GROUPS IF
20 WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THE CURRENT CONDITIONS ARE. WE HAVE A GOOD
21 SENSE OF WHAT THE CURRENT CONDITIONS ARE, AND IT'S NOT GOOD
22 ENOUGH PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO -- [INDISCERNIBLE]
23 IF WE COULD PUT A FINER POINT ON IT. AND I AM HAPPY TO SEE THE
24 INCLUSION OF PARATRANSIT. THAT'S AN IMPORTANT PART OF THIS
25 CONVERSATION. AND I CAN'T REMEMBER WHO SAID IT, BUT TO, I



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THINK, I CAN'T REMEMBER WHO SAID IT -- SORRY -- BUT WE DON'T
2 HAVE THE VOICE OF THE CURRENT RIDER IN THIS ROOM AND THAT IS
3 CERTAINLY A MISS. AND THERE HAS ALREADY BEEN A LOT OF RESEARCH
4 DONE. ADINA POINTED OUT SOME AND WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT WHAT
5 RESEARCH HAS ALREADY BEEN DONE A LOT OF THE BIG PICTURE IDEAS
6 ARE CONSISTENT, FAST, FREQUENT, RELIABLE THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
7 GOING FOR IT NEEDS TO REACH COMMUNITIES HISTORICALLY
8 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. SO, AND WE SHOULD DO ADDITIONAL
9 RESEARCH BECAUSE WE WANT TO UNDERSTAND THE NEED FROM A
10 REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE AND MAKE SURE THAT AS WE'RE TALKING TO
11 RIDERS WE'RE NOT LIMITED -- THEIR INPUT IS NOT LIMITED BY WHAT
12 IS POSSIBLE RIGHT NOW BUT COULD BE POSSIBLE IN THE FUTURE FOR
13 A MORE REGIONAL TAKE ON MANAGEMENT.

14

15 **KEVIN DESMOND:** GOOD POINTS I THINK IT'S CONSISTENT WITH WHAT
16 FOLKS HAVE SAID IS TAKING A REFRESHMENT LOOK AT CHANGING
17 DYNAMICS FOR TRANSIT IN THE REGIONAL AND LOCAL LENS.

18

19 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS. NEXT UP IS JIM WUNDERMAN.

20

21 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THIS IS GREAT TO GET DOWN TO THIS IN EARNEST,
22 AND AS HAS BEEN SAID BY A NUMBER OF YOU IT'S TAKEN US A WHILE
23 TO GET TO THIS POINT. AND THIS IS OUR OPPORTUNITY, AND GOOD
24 LAYING OUT OF THE OPPORTUNITY BY THE CONSULTANTS. SO, THANK
25 YOU FOR THAT. AND I DO NOT TAKE ISSUE WITH ANYTHING THAT



MARCH 7, 2022

1 ANYONE SAID COMING UP BEFORE ME HERE. I DID WANT TO SAY,
2 JUST, YOU KNOW, I THINK THIS ALL BOILS DOWN TO THE BAY AREA
3 BECOME TRULY CUSTOMER-CENTRIC WHEN IT COMES TO ITS TRANSIT
4 SYSTEM. AND I DON'T THINK THAT THE SYSTEM THAT THE CONSULTANT
5 SHOWED EARLIER LOOKED LIKE WE HAVE THAT. AND, YES, I THINK
6 THERE IS A LOT OF OPPORTUNITY HERE TO PROVIDE SOMETHING MUCH,
7 MUCH BETTER THAN WHAT WE HAVE HISTORICALLY BEEN ABLE TO
8 PROVIDE TO THAT CUSTOMER. AND, YOU KNOW, I THINK THERE IS A
9 TENDENCY, YOU KNOW, IT'S IN EVERYTHING, BUT, WE WANT WHAT'S
10 BEST FOR OUR AGENCY. AND I'M THE CHAIR OF AN AGENCY, SO I WEAR
11 TWO HATS HERE, WHETHER I THINK I'M HERE TO REPRESENT THE
12 BUSINESS COMMUNITY, BUT I AM THE CHAIR OF WETA, AND I THINK I
13 SPENT A LOT OF TIME THINKING ABOUT HOW TO MAKE THAT SYSTEM
14 SUCCESSFUL. AND, I KNOW THAT SYSTEM CAN ONLY BE SUCCESSFUL
15 WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF WORKING WITH OTHER SYSTEMS. IT'S NOT
16 GOING TO SUCCEED BY ITSELF. THIS'S REALLY IMPORTANT. THINGS
17 HAVE CHANGED. THINGS WILL CHANGE IN THE NEXT DISH THINK WITH
18 WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE ECONOMY RIGHT NOW, WE'RE GOING TO SEE
19 SOME MEANINGFUL -- WE'RE GOING TO GET SOME REAL INFORMATION IN
20 THE NEXT FEW MONTHS ABOUT RETURN TO WORK, WHAT THAT'S GOING TO
21 LOOK LIKE, I THINK WE'LL KNOW MUCH MORE. WE'RE STILL IN THE
22 FOG, BUT I THINK IT'S STARTING TO CLEAR, OR IT WILL. SO THAT
23 SHOULD TELL US A LOT. I DON'T THINK IT'S ANY REASON TO SLOW
24 DOWN BECAUSE THIS IS GOING TO TAKE A WHILE TO GET THERE. SO I
25 WOULD SAY FORGE AHEAD, BUT WE CAN DO WELL WITH THIS BY THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 CUSTOMER, THAT'S WHAT WE NEED TO DO. I THINK THE ONE AREA THAT
2 WAS BROUGHT UP BY, YOU KNOW, ADINA AND HAYLEY ON THE EQUITY
3 FRONT, THAT'S ONE PLACE WHERE I THINK WE'RE CONSCIOUSLY BEING
4 VERY CUSTOMER-CENTRIC AND APPROPRIATELY SO, FOR THOSE
5 CUSTOMERS. BUT FOR ALL CUSTOMERS, WE NEED PEOPLE TO REJOIN THE
6 SYSTEM. THIS IS SCARY. I FEEL FOR EVERY ONE OF YOU RUNNING THE
7 SYSTEM AND WHAT YOU'RE FACING. IT IS REALLY -- IT IS -- THIS
8 IS REALLY TOUGH, AND UNPRECEDENTED, FRANKLY, AND WE NEED TO DO
9 VERY, VERY WELL HERE. I'LL REFLECT ON MY EXPERIENCE. I'M AT
10 THE HEART OF REAL TRANSIT BUS. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU KNOW THAT,
11 BUT I AM. I LIVE AND BREATHE THIS STUFF. I GREW UP IN NEW YORK
12 CITY, WHICH YOU MIGHT BE ABLE TO TELL. AND MY FIRST 12 YEARS
13 WERE IN THE BRONX, AND THE BRONX, WAS PART OF THE MANHATTAN
14 BRONX BUS SYSTEM WAS PART OF THE MANHATTAN BRONX SURFACE
15 TRANSIT TRANSIT OPERATING AUTHORITY SO IT WAS LINKED IN WITH
16 THE SUBWAY SYSTEM AND THE GREATER NEW YORK SYSTEM THAT HAD
17 BEEN WELL ESTABLISHED. I TOOK THE BUS EVERYWHERE IS ALL THE
18 TIME WHEN I WAS A KID GROWING UP IN THE BRONX, EVEN WHEN I WAS
19 LITTLE. THE BUSES CAME ALL THE TIME AND WENT EVERYWHERE AND
20 CROSSED PATHS WITH EACH OTHER AND IT WORKED. THERE WAS NO
21 SECOND THOUGHT WITH ME ABOUT TAKING THE BUS. WHEN I WAS 12, WE
22 MOVED TO QUEENS. QUEENS CAME INTO NEW YORK CITY LATER AND BY
23 THAT TIME HAD ESTABLISHED A NUMBER OF PRIVATE BUS OPERATIONS,
24 YOU KNOW, SEPARATE BUS OPERATING SYSTEMS. I THINK THERE WERE
25 THREE. MIGHT HAVE BEEN MORE. I MANAGED TO TAKE THE BUS TO



MARCH 7, 2022

1 SCHOOL A LOT OF DAYS, BUT SOMETIMES THE BUS DIDN'T COME AND IT
2 CERTAINLY DIDN'T GO ANYWHERE I NEEDED TO GO BESIDES UP TO THE
3 STREET TO GET TO MY MIDDLE SCHOOL AND JR. HIGH SCHOOL. I
4 DIDN'T TAKE IT VERY MUCH. THAT'S THE PERSONAL EXPERIENCE WHEN
5 IT CONNECTS, IT'S FREQUENT, WHEN IT'S RELIABLE YOU USE IT WHEN
6 IT'S NOT YOU DON'T. WE NEED TO CREATE A REAL SYSTEM OUT OF
7 THIS THAT WORKS TOGETHER, A COHERENT SYSTEM THAT IS GREAT.
8 AND THEN PEOPLE WILL -- MANY, MANY MORE PEOPLE WILL USE IT.
9 THAT'S WHAT WE NEED TO DO HERE TO SOLVE THIS PROBLEM THAT WE
10 HAVE. WANT AND I THINK WE CAN. BUT WE HAVE TO REALLY DEDICATE
11 OURSELVES IT TO IT. IT'S NOT EASY. THE FUNDING SOURCE ARE
12 DIFFERENT AND STRUCTURES ARE DIFFERENT AND CUSTOMER
13 EXPECTATION IS DIFFERENT THERE IS A LOT OF WORK TO BRING IT
14 HOME BUT I WOULD JUST SAY LET'S MAKE IT HAPPEN.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS, JIM. I THINK WE ALL ASPIRE TO
17 BE MORE LIKE THE BRONX OF YOUR CHILDHOOD AS OPPOSED TO THE
18 QUEENS.

19

20 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** A LOT TO BE SAID FOR THE BRONX. A LITTLE
21 UNDERRATED THERE.

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS. I'LL CALL ON CAROLYN.

24



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **CAROLYN GONOT:** A LOT OF GOOD COMMENTS HERE TODAY. AND I'M
2 HAPPY TO DIVE INTO THIS MEETING. I FIRST WANT TO SAY A LITTLE
3 BIT, AGREEING WITH HAYLEY ON, REALLY, THE WORKER -- ON, WHO IS
4 THE MARKET RATE RIGHT NOW, AND ALSO UNDERSTAND THAT. THE
5 COMMUTE MARKET IS VERY IMPORTANT THAT'S WHERE A LOT OF US SEE
6 THE RAIL SIDE AND GOING IN AND OUT OF SAN FRANCISCO IS REALLY
7 IMPORTANT. BUT WHAT WE DID SEE IN THE PANDEMIC IS THOSE
8 ESSENTIAL SERVICES -- CENTRAL WORKERS NEEDING THE SERVICES.
9 AND THOSE ACROSS THE COUNTRY USING T WE NEED TO AS MIKE SAID
10 GET THE CURRENT VOICE OF THE RIDERS AND I'M NOT SAYING
11 STATISTICAL STUDY SAMPLES BUT GETTING OUT THERE AND HEAR THOSE
12 VOICES AS TO WHO IS RIDING THE BUS NOW WHO RODE DURING THE
13 PANDEMIC AND FUTURE EFFORTS ARE REALLY IMPORTANT. FOR EXAMPLE,
14 TAKING A LOOK AT WHO, FOR US, WHO OUR ECO PASS RIDERS ARE. ARE
15 THEY BACK TO WORK WHEN THAT I THINK THEY'RE COMING BACK TO
16 WORK ARE THEY USING THE TRANSIT PASS, AND COLLECTING DATA
17 THAT'S GOING TO BE PARENT AS PART OF UNDERSTANDING THAT, AND
18 WE ALSO HAVE TO BE THINKING OVERALL ABOUT WHAT THOSE
19 COORDINATION EFFORTS NEED TO BE AND THEY NEED TO BE SOMEWHAT
20 PHASED IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT -- FOR EXAMPLE, I'M DRIVING
21 RIGHT NOW EVERY DAY TO WORK FROM ALAMEDA DOWN, AND IT'S
22 PACKED. THE EXPRESS LANES ARE PACKED THE LAST WEEK OR SO, AND
23 IT'S GOING TO GET WORSE THAT'S BECAUSE THE CORRIDOR IS A LOT
24 DIFFERENT THAN THE COMMUTE CORRIDOR INTO SAN FRANCISCO. SO ARE
25 THERE THINGS THAT NEED TO BE DONE TO START BEING FLEXIBLE IN



MARCH 7, 2022

1 TERMS OF HOW WE SEE THESE PATTERNS COMING BACK OVER TIME?
2 BECAUSE I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO COME BACK. THE WAY THIS
3 SCHEDULE IS GOING EVEN THOUGH IT MIGHT BE AGGRESSIVE WE'RE
4 MOVING FASTER THAN OUR COMMUTE HAS FULLY COME BACK. WE NEED TO
5 TAKE A LOOK AT THE MOST IMPORTANT COORDINATION ACTIVITIES THAT
6 WE NEED TO DO. WHAT ARE THE CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE, I THINK
7 IT'S REALLY -- THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT RIGHT NOW. AND I WILL
8 SAY, YOU KNOW, WHEN -- I CAME FROM UTAH, SO I WE WERE A LARGE
9 TRANSIT AGENCY, SIX COUNTIES WE SERVED THREE MAJOR AREAS THAT
10 WE DID WE HAD THREE DIFFERENT UNITS WE ACTED AND THERE WERE
11 SPECIFIC COORDINATION ACTIVITIES WE DID IN TERMS OF LABOR AND
12 HOW WE FUNDED. BUT THE FUNDING WAS DIFFERENT IN EVERY COUNTY.
13 THERE WERE A LOT OF THINGS THAT WE KNEW AS AN AGENCY WE DID
14 BUT ALSO EACH WORKING WITH THE COUNTIES AND THE SPECIFIC
15 FUNDING SOURCES FOR THE TRANSIT AUTHORITY, AND WE MIGHT FOCUS
16 AND LOOK AT THOSE ACTIVITIES AS WELL. IT'S NOT 20 SOMETHING
17 AGENCIES, BUT IT WAS SIX COUNTIES WITH DIFFERENT FUNDING AREAS
18 AND DIFFERENT FUNDING SOURCES IN EACH OF THE COUNTIES THAT
19 CAME IN. AND TWO DIFFERENT MPOS. SO WE DID DO A LOT OF
20 COORDINATION WORK AND THERE WERE CERTAIN ACTIVITIES TO
21 COORDINATE THAT SERVICE, LINKING AS ADINA SAID, INTO THOSE
22 REGIONAL RAIL SERVICES. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. THANKS.
23
24 **KEVIN DESMOND:** CAROLYN CRYSTALLIZED FURTHER WHAT YOU ALREADY
25 SAID. THE ACTIVITIES TO THE EXTENT WHICH THE PANDEMIC MAY



MARCH 7, 2022

1 ALTER OR CAUSE US ALL TO RETHINK MAYBE SOME OF THOSE
2 COLLABORATIVE ACTIVITIES THAT KNIT THE REGION TOGETHER, AND
3 THERE IS THE NETWORK REFRESH FOR HOW YOU'RE SERVING PEOPLE
4 WHICH IS UNIQUE TO EACH INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCY AND
5 CERTAINLY HAS IMPLICATIONS FOR THE REGIONAL NETWORK, AS WELL.
6 AND AS WE GET TO THE THIRD PART OF THE PRESENTATION HERE THIS
7 MORNING, YOU WILL SEE MORE OF THOSE HIGH-LEVEL ACTIVITIES IN
8 THOSE COMPONENTS OF REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT THAT WE WOULD
9 BE FOCUSING ON. GOOD POINTS.

10

11 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS CAROLYN. NEXT MICHELLE.

12

13 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** JUST A BRIEF QUESTION. THIS IS AN EFFORT
14 WHOSE TIME HAS COME AND REALLY EXCITED TO DIVE INTO THIS. IT
15 DOES SEEM A BIT DAUNTING CONSIDERING ALL OF THE DATA THAT
16 NEEDS TO BE GATHERED. AND THE QUESTION THAT I HAVE IS, WHEN WE
17 CONSIDER THIS NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE, I'M WONDERING,
18 WHAT IS THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE TRANSIT NETWORK THAT IS
19 GOING TO BE MANAGED, AND THE DISCUSSION OF LAND USE AND THE
20 DISTRIBUTION OF HOUSING AND JOBS. AND, SO, JUST A QUESTION TO
21 THE CONSULTANT, HOW IS LOCAL LAND USE GOING TO BE CONSIDERED
22 IN THIS EFFORT?

23

24 **TAMIM RAAD:** KEVIN DO YOU WANT ME TO TAKE THAT? THERE IS A
25 LEVEL OF DETAIL AND ANALYSIS HERE THAT WE HAVE TO UNDERTAKE TO



MARCH 7, 2022

1 UNDERSTAND WHAT FUTURE OF THE REGION IS, AND OUR STARTING
2 POINT IS BAY AREA 2050. IN BAY AREA 2050 THERE IS A PRETTY
3 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN FOR REACHING A FUTURE THAT HAS LAND USE AND
4 TRANSPORTATION AND SERVICE WITH ONE ANOTHER AND WHAT WE WOULD
5 DO IS TAKE THAT AS A STARTING POINT AND ONE REFERENCE POINT
6 FOR ME THROUGHOUT PANDEMIC IS CONSIDERING THAT LAND USE
7 COMPONENT IS, WHAT WE WANT TO DO IS HELP IMAGINE A DIFFERENT
8 FUTURE OTHER THAN THE FUTURE YOU HAVE TODAY THAT'S WHY PLANNED
9 BAY AREA 2050 IS IMPORTANT. LAST SUMMER THERE WERE STATS
10 THROWN AROUND LOOKING AT PRE AND POST-PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP AND
11 METRO VANCOUVER, PORTLAND AND THE METRO VANCOUVER AREA ABOUT 3
12 MILLION SIMILAR IN SIZE, NET ROW VANCOUVER PANDEMIC RECOVERY
13 RIDERSHIP LAST SUMMER WAS EQUAL TO PORTLAND'S PREPANDEMIC
14 RIDERSHIP AND IF THOSE PATTERNS CHANGE A DIFFERENT GROWTH
15 PATTERN IS SOMETHING WE WOULD WANT TO HAVE THE REGIONAL ENTITY
16 AND SERVICE, DIFFERENT DEMAND PATTERNS SO THE QUESTION IS WHAT
17 DOES THAT LOOK LIKE IN THE FUTURE AND WHAT ARE THE
18 IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND TO THE POINTS
19 THAT WERE TALKED ABOUT, WE WANT TO LOOK AT SOME SCENARIOS. HOW
20 WOULD THIS CHANGE IF THE GROWTH THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE
21 DOESN'T MATERIALIZE. WHAT ARE THE CONTINGENCIES AND DOES IT
22 LESSEN THE NEED FOR REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT OR IS IT JUST
23 A DIFFERENT FORM. WE WANT TO ADDRESS ALL THOSE QUESTIONS
24 THROUGH THE ANALYSIS AND HOPEFULLY WE'LL HAVE A VERY RICH



MARCH 7, 2022

1 DISCUSSION ABOUT THIS BECAUSE THIS IS THE BIGGEST AREA OF RISK
2 FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS WHAT DOES THE FUTURE LOOK LIKE.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS MICHELLE. SINCE WE'RE ARE
5 TALKING ABOUT CONTEXT, FROM A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE IT'S
6 IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT IT'S THE LACK OF REGIONAL
7 FUNDING FOR TRANSIT THAT HAS LEAD US TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY.
8 BAY AREA HAS COMPLETED TO ADD A VARIETY OF UNIQUE SPECIAL
9 FUNDING STREAMS FOR A SPECIFIC TRANSIT PURPOSE AND EACH ONE
10 HAS WITH IT A BOARD THAT MAKES SURE THAT MONEY IS SPENT FOR
11 ITS INTENDED PURPOSE. WE HAVE A GOOD CHUNK OF MONEY FOR A GOOD
12 TRANSIT SYSTEM BUT IT HAS RESULTED IN THE BALKANIZATION THAT
13 PROVIDES A LOT OF CHALLENGES FOR OUR CUSTOMERS. AND DECIDING
14 TO BE PART OF THE GROUP TODAY TO SAY WHAT CAN WE DO TO FIX
15 THIS, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THE NEXT PART OF THE PRESENTATION
16 FROM THE CONSULTANTS AND I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO TAMIM.

17

18 **TAMIM RAAD:** THANK YOU. MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE OF THE WORK
19 PLAN. AND THE NEXT SLIDE REALLY SPEAKS TO THE SCOPE OF OUR
20 ASSIGNMENT. IT'S TO PROVIDE A PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE
21 RECOMMENDATION TO THE MTC, WORKING WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
22 FORCE FINDINGS AS A STARTING POINT. SO, A LOT OF WORK HAS
23 BEEN DONE PRIOR TO OUR ASSIGNMENT LAST SUMMER TO LOOK AT SOME
24 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT OPTIONS. A LOT OF WORK BY THE BLUE
25 RIBBON TRANSFORMATION TASK FORCE, TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN



MARCH 7, 2022

1 AND LOOKING AT SENSIBLE RECOMMENDATIONS. WE'LL GIVE YOU A
2 HIGH-LEVEL OVERVIEW OF THE WORK PROGRAM AND DO A FEW THINGS.
3 ONE IS THE VALIDATION OF THE PROBLEM ITSELF THAT'S BEEN STATED
4 OVER TIME, BUT, REALLY, IS THE PROBLEM BIG ENOUGH THAT IT
5 JUSTIFIES ACTION AND AT WHAT COST BENEFIT AND CONSEQUENCE,
6 THAT TRADE-OFF ANALYSIS. AND ANCHORING IN KEY VALUES AND
7 ASPIRATIONS FOR THE REGION AND GROWING TRANSIT. THERE ARE TENS
8 OF BILLIONS OF DOLLARS STILL FORECAST TO BE SPENT FOR A
9 PURPOSE AND HOPEFULLY TRANSIT DOES HAVE A FUTURE IN THE BAY
10 AREA SO HOW DO WE GOVERN ALL THIS TO ENSURE YOU GET THE
11 OUTCOMES YOU WANT EVEN IN AN UNCERTAIN ENVIRONMENT. CRITICAL
12 TO ALL OF THIS IS ENGAGEMENT OF INTEREST AROUND THE TABLE
13 TODAY, AND THOSE NOT AROUND THE TABLE TODAY KEY PARTICIPANT IN
14 THIS PROCESS AND STAKEHOLDERS AND TO FIND OUT THROUGH ANALYSIS
15 KEY PARTICIPANTS IN THE PROCESS AND STAKEHOLDERS AND FINDING
16 SOLUTIONS TO GET TO THE CHALLENGES RAISED, AND THE DIFFERENT
17 FUNDING SOURCES THAT ARE LOCKED INTO A SPECIFIC PURPOSE. HOW
18 TO REALIZE IN ALL OF THIS THE REGIONAL INTEREST IN THIS REALLY
19 COMPLEX ENVIRONMENT. BILL TALKED ABOUT THOSE FINANCIAL
20 ELEMENTS EARLIER ON. THE LEGAL AND POLITICAL STAKEHOLDERS, AND
21 WE'RE TRYING TO TAKE A PRAGMATIC APPROACH TO BREAK DOWN
22 CHALLENGES AND SOLVE EACH AS BEST WE CAN. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT IS
23 A BUSINESS CASE? THE WORDS GET THROWN OUT A LOT BUSINESS CASES
24 GET USED FOR LOTS OF DIFFERENT PURPOSES BUT I'LL SPEAK TO HOW
25 WE'RE USING IT IN THIS CONTEXT AND THE APPLICATIONS WE'RE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 MAKING FOR THESE TRANSPORT BUSINESS CASE. THE WAY WE SEE
2 BUSINESS CASE PARTICULARLY IN THIS CONTEXT GIVEN THE RICH
3 STAKEHOLDER ENVIRONMENT THAT WE'RE THIS IS, IT'S REALLY A TOOL
4 TO STRUCTURE THE DIALOGUE AROUND CHOICES AND CONSEQUENCES AND
5 DIFFERENT PATHWAYS FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT. SO, TO BE ABLE TO
6 DO THIS, WE ARE REALLY LOOKING TO HAVE GOOD SOLUTIONS. ALWAYS
7 CLEARLY IDENTIFIED OBJECTIVES. WE WANT TO FIND CLEAR WAYS TO
8 MEASURE SUCCESS AT THE RIGHT SCALE. AS YOU CAN SEE FROM OUR
9 EARLIER CONVERSATION, THERE IS SO MUCH CONVERSATION OUT THERE
10 WE HAVE TO FIND THE INFORMATION THAT MATTERS MOST AND TARGET
11 OUR DIALOGUE AROUND THAT. WITH THE PEOPLE AROUND THE TABLE
12 HERE, GOING THROUGH THE OPTION GENERATION PROCESS IN A
13 CREATIVE WAY WITH AN OPEN MIND, THE PROBLEM SOLVING APPROACH,
14 HAVING REAL OPTIONS THAT WE CAN CUSTOMIZE AND BREAK DOWN
15 PROBLEMS. EACH ONE WILL HAVE SIGNIFICANT PROBLEMS, SO HOW MANY
16 OF THOSE CAN WE TAKE OFF THE TABLE AND AGAIN WHAT ARE THE
17 COST, BENEFITS, AND CONSEQUENCES OF THE, INCLUDING THE
18 UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES THAT ARE INHERENT IN EACH ONE. AND,
19 AGAIN, THE ENGAGEMENT IS CRITICAL TO THAT. SO WHAT THIS ISN'T
20 -- IT'S QUITE DIFFERENT THAN A COST BENEFIT BASED ANALYSIS
21 THAT WOULD BE DONE FOR LINEAR PROJECT INFRASTRUCTURE, A
22 PROJECT WITH PREDICTABLE COST, WE THINK SO RIDERSHIP THAT'S
23 FORECASTABLE, AND TIME FRAME. THIS IS MULTI-CAN DIMENSIONAL IN
24 TERMS OF THE CRITERIA IN TERMS OF MODES, ORGANIZATION AND
25 DEVELOPMENT. THIS IS A POLICY BASED STRATEGIC CASE WHICH THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 TAKE INFORMATION AND MONETIZED INFORMATION THAT CAN'T BE
2 DESCRIBED WITH DOLLARS AND NUMBERS AND DO A COMPREHENSIVE
3 BALANCE OF STRATEGIC LEVEL TO MAKE A CHOICE. NEXT SLIDE.
4 BUSINESS CASE HAS MANY STAGES OVER ITS LIFE CYCLE AND IT'S
5 IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND WHERE THIS PARTICULAR ASSESSMENT PICKS
6 UP FROM THE LAST ONE AND WHERE WE'RE AT IN THIS STAGE OF
7 ANALYSIS. BUSINESS CASE CAN HAVE ONE OR MORE STAGES, 1, 2 OR
8 MULTIPLE DEPENDING ON THE NATURE OF THE INITIATIVE. THIS ONE
9 HAS AT LEAST TWO AT THIS STAGE. THERE IS ALWAYS LIMITED AND
10 RESOURCES AND ORGANIZATIONAL BANDWIDTH TO PROCESS INFORMATION.
11 KEY IS THAT EACH ONE OF THESE STAGES AT THE STRATEGIC STAGE
12 VERSUS THE PLANNING IMPLEMENTATION STAGE TO FOCUS ON THE
13 INFORMATION THAT MATTERS MOST IN A PROGRESSIVE IN DETAILED
14 ANALYSIS GOING FROM MANY OPTIONS TO FEWER. WE'RE AT THE FIRST
15 STAGE OF STRATEGIC ANALYSIS USING QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE
16 INFORMATION TO ROUND OUT THE ANALYSIS IN AREAS THAT ARE SMART.
17 THOSE DIMENSIONS YOU SEE TO SHIFT IN IMPORTANCE, YOU SEE THE
18 WEDGE SHIFTING AS YOU GET INTO THE LATTER STAGES WHERE YOU
19 HAVE STRATEGIC POLICY DIMENSIONS FRONT AND CENTER, ECONOMIC,
20 COMMERCIAL, AND FINANCIAL, PRIMARILY IMPLEMENTATION RELATE
21 THAT COME INTO GREATER FOCUS AS WE PICK A PREFERRED OPTION.
22 SO, AGAIN, WE'RE AT THE MANY OPTION STAGE RIGHT NOW, AND WE'RE
23 LOOKING THROUGH THE PROCESS WITH YOU TO HIGHLIGHT THOSE
24 CRITERIA THAT MATTER MOST TO COMPARING THE VARIOUS OPTIONS
25 AGAINST THE GOALS. SO WE'RE LOOKING FOR KEY DIFFERENTIATORS



MARCH 7, 2022

1 AND THINGS THAT ARE MOST DECISION RELEVANT TO THIS STAGE OF
2 ANALYSIS. I THINK THAT WOULD JUST, IN TERMS OF OUR TIMING, IT
3 LOOKS LIKE THIS SHOULD ACTUALLY SAY FALL 2022, THE
4 RECOMMENDATION OF THE PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE. BUT WE'LL BE
5 LOOKING TO UNDERTAKE THE ANALYSIS UP UNTIL THAT POINT IN TIME.
6 OKAY. I THINK THAT'S ENOUGH FOR THAT SLIDE. SO, HOPEFULLY YOU
7 GOT TO STAIR AT THAT FOR A LITTLE BIT. IT'S IN YOUR SLIDE
8 PACKAGE. NEXT SLIDE. IN THE CONTEXT THAT I JUST PRESENTED
9 THERE ARE A FEW DIFFERENT THINGS TO ASSESS. THIS IS AN
10 OVERSIMPLIFIED MODEL OF A LEVEL DESCRIPTION OF STEPS THAT
11 WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH. REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT WE'RE
12 GOING TO FIGURE OUT WHAT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER NEEDS TO
13 DO JOBS, AND ACCOUNTABILITIES THAT ARE REGIONAL IN NATURE THAT
14 SHOULD BE DONE WITHIN THAT ENTITY. THIS IS OUR
15 ACCOUNTABILITIES DEFINITION NETWORK THAT YOU HAVE BEEN HEARING
16 US TALK ABOUT, WHICH THINGS SHOULD THE REGIONAL NETWORK
17 MANAGER DECIDE ON, VERSUS OPERATORS, AND LOCAL EASE, AND HOW
18 ARE THOSE INTEGRATED INTO A MULTI-AGENCY DECISION PROCESS. IN
19 2021, WE IDENTIFIED THAT SOME OF THESE WERE HARDER TO DO THAN
20 OTHERS SO THAT WILL BE PART OF THE ENTITY DESIGN TO ASSESS THE
21 BENEFITS OF THOSE THINGS THAT ARE MORE DIFFICULT TO DO BECAUSE
22 THOSE REQUIRE MORE ORGANIZATIONAL RESOURCES. SO, HOW FAR
23 SHOULD NETWORK MANAGEMENT GO AND WHAT IS THE BENEFIT OF GOING
24 TO THE MOST DIFFICULT AREA WHERE SOME OF THE BIGGEST
25 CHALLENGES EXIST RELATED TO FUNDING AND ACCOUNTABILITY OF



MARCH 7, 2022

1 PUBLIC AGENCIES AND SO ON. AGAIN, WE TALKED ABOUT THE GOAL
2 2050, THE KEY ANCHOR POINT TO THE OPTIONS OF MANAGEMENT VERSUS
3 MANAGER AND WE'LL TALK ABOUT THE DIFFERENCES. AND THIS
4 REPRESENTS A PATHWAY THAT WE'RE TRYING TO GET THESE ENTITY TO
5 BE DESIGNED TOWARDS AND THERE IS THE SIMPLIFY THE COST BENEFIT
6 ANALYSIS THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE LOOKING AT ORGANIZATIONAL COST
7 AND IMPACTS SERVICE RELATED COST AND IMPACTS ORGANIZATIONAL
8 ONES, AND THEN WHAT WE WANT TO KNOW IS WHAT THE OUTCOMES ARE
9 FROM A RIDERSHIP PERSPECTIVE, OPERATIONS PERSPECTIVE, OR FOR
10 DELIVERING THE PROGRAM OF INVESTMENT MUCH FASTER THAN WOULD
11 HAVE OTHERWISE BEEN POSSIBLE WITH EVERYBODY GETTING ALONG
12 BETTER. OKAY. SLIDE 19. SO, THIS IS GOING TO BE ONE OF THE
13 TRICKIER AREAS IN OUR ANALYSIS IS SETTING OUT THE EVALUATION
14 AND SCALING TO GET THE RIGHT INFORMATION FOR A DECISION AT
15 THIS STAGE. WE WANT TO HAVE ENOUGH INFORMATION THAT WE CAN
16 MAKE A PATHWAY DECISION BUT NOT SO MUCH THAT WE BECOME
17 PARALYZED IN THE ANALYSIS AND SOME OF THOSE RISKS AND
18 UNCERTAINTIES WOULD BE ONE OF THE KEY AREAS WHERE WE WANT TO
19 FOCUS A BIT OF ATTENTION IN TERMS OF GATHERING INFORMATION AND
20 UNDERSTANDING. WHAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT IN THESE IS THAT NOT
21 ALL CRITERIA ARE NECESSARILY CREATED EQUAL SOME MORE RELEVANT
22 THAN OTHERS. SO WE WANT TO IDENTIFY A HANDFUL AND ZERO IN ON
23 THOSE TO GATHER MONETIZED AND QUANTITATIVE INFORMATION AND
24 QUALITATIVE METHODS FOCUSED ON THOSE CRITERIA. THE CATEGORIES
25 WE WANT TO REFINE THROUGH OUR ENGAGEMENT PROCESS WITH THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 OPERATORS AND STAKEHOLDERS, AND WE'RE IMAGINING THAT PROCESS
2 WILL BE HELPFUL IN DEFINING THESE AND FINE TUNING THEM,
3 SHARPENING OUR PENCIL HERE. OKAY. SLIDE 20. I WON'T GO
4 THROUGH -- THERE IS A LOT ON THIS SLIDE. REALLY JUST INCLUDED
5 THIS AS A REFERENCE SO YOU COULD SEE KEY ACTIVITIES IN EACH
6 STAGE. WE'LL BE SHOWING YOU MORE ON THE TIMELINE FOREMAN.
7 THERE IS FIVE KEY TASKS, THE PROBLEM STATEMENT DEFINITION
8 DEVELOPING THE EVALUATION FRAMEWORK AND CRITERIA DOING THE
9 EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION. THERE ARE TWO THINGS I WANTED
10 TO HIGHLIGHT ONE HERE IS THE IMPORTANCE OF CRITERIA AND I
11 THINK IT'S IN TASK THREE. WE HAD LIMITED TIME AND ANALYTICAL
12 BANDWIDTH TO CREATE THE DETAILS SO THERE IS SIMPLE FRAMEWORK
13 THERE AND THE WORK DONE BY THE OPERATORS AND THE REFINED
14 OPERATOR BASED MANAGEMENT PROPOSAL. WE'LL TAKE THE MANAGEMENT
15 PROPOSALS ONE OF THE OPERATORS BASE MANAGER PROPOSAL WE TAKE
16 THE INPUT INTO DEVELOPMENT OPTIONS, AND TAKE CONSULTATIONS AND
17 ENGAGEMENTS AND INCORPORATE THEIR IDEAS AND PERSPECTIVES TO
18 MAKE THE MODEL WORK BEST LOOKING AT CHALLENGES THAT MIGHT
19 PRESENT THEMSELVES AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS AND HOW WE
20 MIGHT OVERCOME THOSE. NEXT SLIDE. SO THERE IS A LOT ON THIS
21 SLIDE. THIS IS OUR WORK PROGRAM ON THE PAGE. WHAT I'LL DO HERE
22 THIS IS PART OF YOUR RESOURCE MATERIALS. IT'S OUR METHOD ON A
23 PAGE AND JUST A COUPLE OF HIGHLIGHTS FROM THIS GRAPHIC. THREE
24 COMPONENTS, ENGAGEMENT, ANALYSIS, AND THE CORE ACTIVITIES OF
25 THE BUSINESS CASE ASSESSMENT AND REALLY IMPORTANT IS THE PINK



MARCH 7, 2022

1 UP TOP WE CAN'T DO THIS ASSESSMENT ON OUR OWN IT DEPENDS ON
2 THE ISSUES, INTERESTS AND VALUES THAT YOU ARTICULATE AS YOU
3 HAVE BEEN DOING TODAY. AND AGAIN TACKLING CHALLENGES, GOING
4 THROUGH THOSE TOUGH SPOTS AND HAVING CONVERSATIONS ABOUT HOW
5 TO MAKE THINGS WORK, OR, EVEN, CAN THEY WORK. AND YOU WILL
6 SEE THE EVALUATION METRICS DEFINITION HERE WHICH IS REALLY
7 IMPORTANT, GETTING THOSE DONE AND AT THE RIGHT SCALE AND RIGHT
8 METRICS IS REALLY IMPORTANT. THE MOST IMPORTANT PART OF THIS
9 IS THE MIDDLE PINK BAND HERE WHICH IS THE SOLUTIONS SEEKING TO
10 OPTIMIZE THE OPTIONS. EVERY GREAT IDEA WILL COME WITH A BUNCH
11 OF HURDLES AND WE KNOW WHAT THOSE ARE. AND WE WANT TO STAIR
12 EACH OF THOSE PROBLEMS DOWN AND REALLY DESIGN EACH ONE OF
13 THOSE PROBLEMS OUT TO THE GREATEST EXTENT POSSIBLE. SOME OF
14 THEM MIGHT STILL BE LEFT ON THE TABLE. AND THE IDEA HERE IS
15 THAT EACH OPTION CAN PUT ITS BEST FOOT FORWARD, AND LEAVING NO
16 STONE UNTURNED FOR PROBLEMS THAT WE DON'T PEEK UNDER AND
17 TRYING TO SOLVE. NEXT SLIDE. OF COURSE TO BE ABLE TO DO THIS
18 WE NEED ALL SORTS OF ENGAGEMENT AND SUPPORT AND THIS
19 HIGHLIGHTS THE KEY ENGAGEMENT POINTS, THE ADVISORY GROUP
20 MEETINGS WITH YOU AT THE KEY DECISION POINTS OF CRITERIA
21 DEVELOPMENT, OPTION IDENTIFICATION, EVALUATION AND
22 RECOMMENDATION. AND WE FEEL THAT IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT,
23 BECAUSE THERE ARE GOING TO BE A NUMBER OF REALLY SPECIFIC
24 ISSUES THAT WE'LL NEED TO TACKLE. OF COURSE, SOME OF THEM HAVE
25 ALREADY BEEN IDENTIFIED HERE, AND TO BE ABLE TO DO A LITTLE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 BIT MORE WORKING SESSIONS, A COMMITTEE OF THE ADVISORY GROUP
2 TO ADDRESS TOPICS OF CHALLENGE. WE BELIEVE THERE ARE KEY
3 INFLECTION POINTS IN THE PROCESS WHERE WE BRING RESULTS TO THE
4 ADVISORY GROUP AND THAT WAY WE CAN BENEFIT FROM INPUT AND
5 THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS THERE WILL BE ONGOING OPERATOR AND
6 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AS WELL AS DISCUSSIONS WITH KEY
7 INTERESTS. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS PRESENTS IN TIMELINE FORM THE
8 KEY TASKS HIGHLIGHTED EARLIER. AND THE DECISION POINTS I
9 HIGHLIGHTED EARLIER WITH THE AD-HOC COMMITTEE OF THE ADVISORY
10 GROUP, AND THE ADVISORY GROUP ITSELF, THESE ARE THE PINK AND
11 LIGHT PINK BUBBLES HERE AND THE GRAY INDICATES THERE IS
12 ONGOING ASSESSMENT WITH STAFF AND STAKEHOLDERS ENGAGEMENT IN
13 INFORMAL WAYS. AND THE BLUE RIBBON BAR DOWN BELOW, I WON'T GO
14 INTO THIS ONE IN DETAIL, BECAUSE SCHRUTI IS GOING TO SPEAK TO
15 IT BUT TO IDENTIFY THERE IS A PARALLEL PROCESS UNDERWAY WITH A
16 GRANT TO LOOK AT CAPITAL PROGRAM DELIVERY AND GOOD MORNING FOR
17 RAIL. THAT PROCESS WILL BE IDENTIFYING ISSUES AND
18 OPPORTUNITIES NOT MAKING RECOMMENDATIONS. WE SEE THIS AS A KEY
19 INPUT INTO THE RAIL PART OF THE STUDY THAT WE'RE WORKING ON.
20 AND WE'RE REALLY GLAD TO HAVE THAT UNDERWAY, BECAUSE IT REALLY
21 HELPS TO DO A LITTLE BIT OF A DEEPER DIVE INTO THAT VERY
22 COMPLEX AREA AND THAT WILL BE A GREAT BENEFIT TO THIS EFFORT.
23 SO, WE'RE INVOLVED RIGHT NOW WITH THE CONSULTING TEAM AND WITH
24 THE MTC PROJECT MANAGER SCHRUTI, SO THOSE INTEGRATED EFFORTS
25 ARE AT HAND. NEXT SLIDE. SO IN TERMS OF THE NEXT STEPS. THIS



MARCH 7, 2022

1 IS OUR FINAL SLIDE. MARCH WILL BE A PRETTY BUSY MONTH WITH A
2 LOT BACKGROUND AND ASSESSMENT WORK THAT I TALKED ABOUT
3 EARLIER. RESEARCH INTERVIEWS WITH KEY STAKEHOLDERS AND
4 INTERESTS. THE FIRST WORKING SESSION WILL BE FOCUSED ON, YOU
5 KNOW, WHAT'S IN THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER JOB JAR AND THE
6 EVALUATION FRAMEWORK AND THESE WILL SUPPORT OUR AD-HOC
7 COMMITTEE SESSIONS AND ADVISORY GROUP MEETINGS IN APRIL AND
8 MAY. OVER TO YOU, KEVIN. HOPEFULLY I DID THAT IN GOOD TIME.

9

10 **KEVIN DESMOND:** WE HAVE TWO SLIDES, IF YOU COULD PUT UP THE
11 NEXT SLIDE. A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS WE HAVE ABOUT THE WORK PLAN.
12 WE COVERED THIS QUICKLY AND WE HAVE A FEW SLIDES FOR A PRETTY
13 COMPLEX, COMPREHENSIVE WORK PLAN. PARTICULARLY THOUGHTS ON HOW
14 WE ARTICULATE THE DEFINITION OF THIS THING WE CALL BUSINESS
15 CASE. THIS IS NOT A BRICKS AND MORE TAR CONCRETE BUSINESS CASE
16 THIS IS A COMBINATION OF BOTH QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE
17 POLICY. SO ANY FEEDBACK YOU HAVE AT THIS POINT IN TIME TO THE
18 NATURE OF THE BUSINESS CASE ITSELF. WE HAVE LAID OUT A SERIES
19 OF ENGAGEMENT TOUCH POINTS. SO ANY FEEDBACK YOU MIGHT HAVE AT
20 THIS TIME AT THE NATURE OF THE ENGAGEMENT WHO SHOULD WE BE
21 ENGAGING AND CONVERSING WITH.

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** I'LL CALL IN ORDER OF HANDS. FIRST IS
24 JEFFREY TUMLIN.

25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** THANK YOU FOR THE THOUGHTFUL PRESENTATION.
2 WE'RE STARTING FROM A GOOD PLACE. THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
3 CREATED A VERY STRONG AGREEMENT AMONG ALL OF US ON THE DESIRED
4 OUTCOMES FOR OUR RIDERS. WE ALL WANT TO SEE THE REGION TRANSIT
5 AS ONE INTEGRATED SYSTEM WITHOUT BARRIERS. SO THE QUESTION IS,
6 HOW DO WE USE OUR COLLECTIVE BUT LIMITED RESOURCES IN ORDER TO
7 BEST SERVE THE PUBLIC AND ACHIEVE OUR GOALS. SO MY FEEL IS
8 THIS ANALYSIS NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED AND TALK OUT LOUD ABOUT
9 KEY TENSIONS WE FACE. FOR EXAMPLE, TO WHAT DEGREE ARE WE
10 FOCUSING ON OUR EXISTING RIDERS VERSUS NEW RIDERS? TO WHAT
11 DEGREE DO WE FOCUS OUR RESOURCES ON SHORT TRIPS VERSUS LONG
12 TRANSIT TRIPS? URBAN RIDERS VERSUS SUBURBAN VERSUS EXTRA
13 REGIONAL RIDERS. TO WHAT DEGREE DO WE INVEST IN BETTER SERVICE
14 OR LOWER FARES? SHOULD WE BE INVESTING EQUALLY OR EQUITABLY.
15 AND IF WE'RE INVESTING EQUITABLY HOW DO WE DEFINE DIFFERENCES
16 AMONG GEOGRAPHIC, SOCIAL, OR RIDER LEVEL. ARE WE THINKING
17 ABOUT TODAY'S TRAVEL PATTERN, MID-PANDEMIC, OR A PRECOVID
18 TRAVEL PATTERN OR FUTURE TRAVEL PATTERN AS ENVISIONED BY
19 PLANNED BAY AREA. MOST IMPORTANTLY, I THINK WE NEED TO START
20 WITH AN UNDERSTANDING THAT TRANSIT IS SIGNIFICANTLY
21 UNDERRESOURCES TODAY. IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE JIM AND HAYLEY'S
22 GOALS FOR FAST, FREQUENT RELIABLE AND AFFORDABLE TRANSIT,
23 THAT'S GOING TO REQUIRE SIGNIFICANTLY MORE TRANSIT FUNDING. SO
24 THE BIGGEST QUESTION FOR ME IS, WHAT IS THE SCENARIO THAT
25 INCREASES REVENUE AND, SPECIFICALLY, WHAT'S SCENARIO THAT WINS



MARCH 7, 2022

1 A TWO THIRDS VOTE TO FINALLY GET US THE RESOURCES THAT WE NEED
2 AND RESOURCE THAT IS SUSTAINABLE AND GROW WITH NEEDS OVER
3 TIME. SO MY CONCERN, YOU KNOW, I LIKE WHAT YOU'RE DOING, MY
4 CONCERN IS, THIS IS A POLICY ANALYSIS THAT YOU'RE PROPOSING
5 AND NOT A BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS. I'M WORRIED THERE IS NOT
6 ENOUGH RESOURCES IN YOUR CONTRACT OR ENOUGH TIME TO BE ABLE TO
7 DO THE FINANCIAL ANALYSIS AND RIDERSHIP ANALYSIS, AND
8 QUANTITATIVE EQUITY ANALYSIS IN ORDER TO ACTUALLY DELIVER ON
9 THE BUSINESS CASE NET METRICS THAT WE NEED TO MAKE THESE HARD
10 CHOICE. WE'RE ASKING BIG STRUCTURAL QUESTIONS ABOUT THE REGION
11 AND WE'RE GOING TO NEED HARD BUSINESS NUMBERS TO MAKE
12 DECISIONS ABOUT REALLOCATING RESOURCES FROM ONE PART OF THE
13 REGION TO ANOTHER AND DELIVERING TRUST TO THE VOTERS THAT IF
14 THEY'RE GOING TO TAX THEMSELVES THAT WE'RE ACTUALLY GOING TO
15 DELIVER AND DELIVER ON QUANTITATIVE KPIS AND NOT JUST A BIG
16 VISION.

17

18 **KEVIN DESMOND:** GREAT FEEDBACK. AND OBVIOUSLY THAT'S
19 CHALLENGING IN THE CONTEXT OF THIS TYPE OF BUSINESS CASE. AND
20 THE KIND OF, SORT OF, PHASING OF THE WORK THAT YOU SAW IN THE
21 SLIDES. THE NATURE OF THE QUESTION IS, IS THIS PROJECT IN AND
22 OF ITSELF UNDERRESOURCES AND CAN WE TOUCH ON ALL THOSE
23 DIFFERENT METRICS OR CAN WE PROCEED WITH THE BASICS OF TRYING
24 TO ANSWER A LOT OF THE QUESTIONS THAT CAME IN THE FIRST
25 SECTION THAT YOU JUST RAISED, AS WELL, IN THE CONTEXT OF THIS



MARCH 7, 2022

1 FIRST SORT OF ELEMENT OF UNPACKING THE BUSINESS CASE. ALL
2 REALLY GOOD FOOD FOR THOUGHT.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS JEFF. NEXT UP IS SUZANNE SMITH.

5

6 **SUSAN ADAMS:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. JEFF, I DON'T DISAGREE WITH
7 ANYTHING YOU HAVE SAID. AND MY COMMENT WAS GOING TO SORT OF
8 AMPLIFY THE DEFINITION, I GUESS, OF WHAT THE NETWORK IS, AND
9 ARE WE FOCUSING ON COMMUTE -- THE COMMUTE SHED? OR ARE WE
10 FOCUSING ON RIDERS WHO ARE MORE LOCAL IN NATURE AND THOSE
11 ESSENTIAL WORKERS THAT WE HAVE SEEN LATELY, IN THE PAST TWO
12 YEARS, THAT WERE REALLY RELINED UPON SERVICE. TO ME, THOSE
13 ARE THE CRITICAL PIECES FOR THIS DISCUSSION IS -- AND I -- I
14 THINK YOU KIND OF NEED TO DO BOTH, BUT I DON'T THINK YOU NEED
15 TO DO IT ALL AS ONE THING. BECAUSE THEY ARE KIND OF TWO
16 DIFFERENT DISCUSSIONS. SO, HAVING, CLEARLY DEFINING WHAT THE
17 REGIONAL NETWORK IS, WOULD HELP, I THINK, A LOT OF US HELP
18 FIGURE OUT WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. IS IT REALLY JUST THE
19 COMMUTE, OR IT THE CONNECTIONS FROM THE LOCAL SMALLER OPERATOR
20 AS WELL? THANK YOU, JEFF, FOR YOUR COMMENTS. THEY WERE VERY
21 WELL STATED.

22

23 **KEVIN DESMOND:** MORE CONSISTENCY IS WHAT I THINK WE'RE HEARING
24 FROM A VARIETY OF YOU IS THE QUESTION ABOUT THE EXISTING



MARCH 7, 2022

1 CONDITIONS AND SCENARIOS ABOUT THE FUTURE TRANSIT AND MOBILITY
2 ENVIRONMENT IN THE REGION INFLUENCE AND GUIDE THIS WORK.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS SUZANNE. NEXT THERESE MCMILLAN.

5

6 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YOU KNOW, I WANT TO TAKE THIS THREAD A
7 DIFFERENT PLACE, BECAUSE I DO DISAGREE WITH JEFF THAT THOSE
8 QUESTIONS ARE REALLY FOUNDATIONAL. BUT WE HAVE BEEN ASKING
9 THOSE QUESTIONS FOR A LONG TIME. IT'S NOT LIKE THOSE QUESTIONS
10 AND TRADE-OFFS ARE NEW. AND WE KEEP GETTING STUCK. SO HERE'S
11 A THOUGHT. AND THIS JUST HIT ME, SO TAKE IT FOR WHAT IT IS I'M
12 WONDERING IF A LARGE PART OF THIS POLICY ASSESSMENT THAT THE
13 CONSULTING TEAM HAS LAID OUT IS ASKING, JEFF, YOUR QUESTION,
14 THESE ARE IMPORTANT QUESTIONS TO TACKLE, BUT I THINK WHERE WE
15 GET STUCK IS IN THREE SPACES: ONE. WHO HAS THE AGENCY TO EVEN
16 ASK THESE QUESTIONS AND PUT THEM ON THE TABLE? WHO HAS THE
17 TECHNICAL OR OTHER CAPACITIES TO ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS? AND
18 THEN, WHERE DO THE DECISIONS LIE AS TO WHETHER THOSE ANSWERS
19 ARE SUFFICIENT? I THINK PART OF OUR CHALLENGE IS THAT WE
20 NEVER FIGURE OUT -- AND DENNIS HAD HIT ON IT IN ONE OF HIS
21 OBSERVATIONS IS, WHEN WE GET TO THIS POINT, IS IT LOAN MONEY
22 OR REGIONAL MONEY, OR THIS OR THAT. THE CLASSIC DILEMMA THAT
23 WE FIND OURSELVES IN ON THE FUNDING SIDE, IS, WE'RE PASSING A
24 LOCAL MEASURE FOR COUNTY X AND THAT MONEY IS NOT TO BE SPENT
25 OUTSIDE THOSE BORDER EXCEPT TO SERVE THE PURPOSES FOR WHICH



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THE MONEY IS ACTUALLY NEEDED FOR INVESTMENTS OUTSIDE THE
2 BORDERS THAT ARE ESSENTIAL. HOW DO WE GET TO THE QUESTIONS TO
3 TACKLE THE BALANCES OF THOSE ISSUES AND I THINK WE GET STUCK
4 IN THAT SPACE. BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE A CLEAR SENSE OF THE
5 HIERARCHY OF WHO CAN PUT THE QUESTION ON THE TABLE, WHO HAS
6 THE CAPACITY TO ANSWER IT AND AS THE ANSWERS OR OPTIONS ARE
7 DONE, WHO OWNS THE RISK AND ACCOUNTABILITY TO WHETHER THOSE
8 ARE SUFFICIENT. I JUST OFFER THAT AS, I THINK, PERHAPS A PLACE
9 I FEEL WE'RE IN NOW.

10

11 **KEVIN DESMOND:** CLEARLY A WOOLY GET THROUGH TODAY'S SESSION AND
12 IN FURTHER DIALOGUE WITH THIS BODY WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO
13 CONFRONT THIS TOUGH QUESTION, YOU KNOW, WHAT JEFF PUT ON THE
14 TABLE, AND I THINK, THERESE, WHAT YOU OPINED ABOUT IT, WHICH
15 IS, I THINK, YOU ARE TRYING TO CUT TO THE ESSENCE OF WHAT THIS
16 INITIATIVE IS ALL ABOUT. AND AT THE SAME TIME HOW TO DEAL WITH
17 ALL THE QUESTIONS, AND THE EXISTENTIAL QUESTIONS THAT JEFF
18 ASKED ABOUT THE FUTURE OF TRANSIT AND LOCAL AND REGIONAL
19 TRANSIT AND MOBILITY NETWORK IN THE BAY AREA. SO WE'RE GOING
20 TO HAVE TO COME TO TERMS WITH THAT IF WE'RE GOING TO BE REALLY
21 BE SUCCESSFUL IN BRINGING THIS PROJECT FORWARD SUCCESSFULLY
22 AND IN THE MONTHS AHEAD.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS THERESE. NEXT UP, HAYLEY C

25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** I HOPE WE CAN FOCUS ON THE RESOURCES WE HAVE
2 AND NOT GET STUCK BEHIND HOW WE'RE GOING TO RAISE MORE MONEY
3 FRAMEWORK. I THINK THERE IS A GOOD FRAMEWORK TO START, ON DATA
4 COLLECTION, AND I ALSO HAD A QUESTION ABOUT STAKEHOLDERS,
5 STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDE WORKERS AND RIDERS I WONDER WHAT THE PLAN
6 IS FOR ENGAGING THOSE STAKEHOLDERS OBVIOUSLY EVERY STAKEHOLDER
7 DOESN'T NEED THE SAME KIND OF ENGAGEMENT TO ANSWER THE SAME
8 QUESTIONS GENERAL MANAGERS HAVE MORE TO SAY ABOUT WHAT IT
9 TAKES TO FINANCIALLY RUN AN AGENCY AND RIDERS HAVE THE INPUT
10 OF DAILY NEEDS.

11

12 **KEVIN DESMOND:** I'LL START WITH THAT AND MAYBE STAFF WANTS TO
13 RESPOND, I THINK IT GOES BACK TO THE COMMENTS, DOING RESEARCH,
14 REACHING OUT TO RIDERS AND NON-RIDERS TO EVALUATE THEIR
15 PREFERENCE AND THEIR SENSE OF DIRECTION OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM.
16 IN THE CONTEXT OF THIS PARTICULAR PROJECT, AND WHAT WE'RE
17 PUTTING FORWARD IS THAT THE ENGAGEMENT IS SORT OF MORE NARROW.
18 IT'S NOT SPECIFICALLY REACHING OUT, I THINK, TO THE RIDERS,
19 AND THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT POTENTIAL USERS, EXISTING USERS OF
20 THE SYSTEM, AND I THINK WE HAVE GOT TO DEAL WITH THAT
21 QUESTION. IT'S COME UP ALREADY THIS MORNING. AND YOU HAVE
22 RAISED IT AGAIN. TAMIM, DO YOU WANT TO ADD TO THAT ON HOW WE
23 FACTOR THAT INTO THE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT?

24



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **TAMIM RAAD:** I THINK YOU HIT ON IT. RIGHT NOW OUR ENGAGEMENT
2 PROCESS IS FOCUSED ON THE STAKEHOLDERS THAT HAVE BEEN
3 IDENTIFIED WITHIN THE ADVISORY GROUP AND THEIR EXTENDED STAFF
4 TEAM. SO I THINK THAT IT WOULD BE A QUESTION FOR THE MTC TO
5 ADDRESS, MAYBE WHEN SCHRUTI GETS INTO HER PRESENTATION, UNLESS
6 NOW IS THE RIGHT TIME?

7

8 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** IF I COULD JUST ADD ONE MORE THING. THANKS FOR
9 CLARIFYING THAT. A TON OF RESEARCH HAS ALREADY BEEN DONE AND
10 I'M WONDERING IF THAT'S PART OF YOUR ANALYSIS, INSTEAD OF
11 GOING BACK TO RIDERS AND WORKERS AGAIN BUT WHAT RESEARCH --
12 MTC ACTUALLY HAS A QUITE LARGE LIBRARY OF OUTREACH AND I'M
13 WONDERING --

14

15 **TAMIM RAAD:** WE'LL LOOK AT ALL INFORMATION THAT'S RELEVANT TO
16 DEVELOPING THE OPTIONS AND ASSESSING THEM.

17

18 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** IF I COULD REPORT BACK OF WHAT WE'RE LOOKING
19 AT.

20

21 **KEVIN DESMOND:** TO THE AGENCIES WE'RE REPRESENTING HERE AND
22 OUTSIDE OF THIS BODY HAVE DONE THAT TYPE OF RESEARCH IN THE
23 LAST YEAR AND WE'RE CONTEMPLATING NEW RESEARCH IN THIS YEAR IT
24 WOULD BE VERY VALUABLE AND WE'RE CONSIDERATION THAT AS PART OF
25 OUR WORK.



MARCH 7, 2022

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS. NEXT UP IS BOB POWERS.

3

4 **ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS CHAIRPERSON MULLIGAN. I JUST WANTED TO
5 TAKE A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT NUANCE TO WHAT JEFF WAS SAYING. YOU
6 KNOW, EARLIER ON, TAMIM, THE FIRST SLIDE OF YOUR SECOND
7 SECTION SAID CONDUCT A BUSINESS CASE ASSESSMENT AND THERE WERE
8 OTHER WORDS, BUT IT WAS WEIGHING COST RISKS AND TRADEOFFS. SO
9 COST RISK AND TRADEOFFS. AND TO ME, THAT'S THE UNDERPINNING OF
10 A BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS, AS OPPOSED TO, YOU KNOW, A LOOK AT,
11 YOU KNOW, SOMETHING THAT'S MORE ABOUT ORGANIZATIONAL REVIEW. I
12 MEAN, YOU HAD ON THERE, WEIGHING THE COST, THE RISKS, AND THE
13 TRADEOFFS. AND, SO FOR US TO DO THAT, FOR US TO BE
14 UNDERSTANDING OF THAT ANALYSIS, THERE HAS GOT TO BE, IN MY
15 OPINION, THE WORK THAT YOU DO, WITH MTC AND THE OPERATORS ON
16 THIS, HAS GOT TO BE A FOCUS ON THE QUANTITATIVE METRICS, AS
17 OPPOSED TO THE QUALITATIVE METRICS. AND YOU KNOW, IN THE FIRST
18 SESSION, THERE WAS A SLIDE THAT SOMEBODY MENTIONED AT SOME
19 POINT SOMETHING WOULD BE GOING TO A BOARD AS A PREFERRED
20 ALTERNATIVE, WHICH WAS A LITTLE ENVIRONMENTAL TO ME, AND I
21 WASN'T QUITE ON BOARD WITH THE TERM, PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE.
22 BUT, AT SOME POINT, SOMETHING'S GOING TO GO TO A BOARD,
23 WHETHER IT'S -- LET'S USE ME AS AN EXAMPLE -- TO THE BART
24 BOARD, THERE HAS GOT TO BE PERFORMANCE METRICS THAT ARE
25 QUANTITATIVE THAT UNDERPIN THE BUSINESS CASE. I DON'T THINK,



MARCH 7, 2022

1 YOU KNOW, WHEN WE GO OUT TO THE BOARDS, WHETHER IT'S MY BOARD
2 OR MTC BOARD OR SOMEBODY ELSE'S BOARD OR OUT TO THE PUBLIC
3 CERTAINLY THERE IS GOING TO BE QUALITATIVE BUT THERE IS GOING
4 TO BE QUANTITATIVE ON THE BUSINESS CASE METRICS. TO WHAT YOU
5 SAID, WEIGHING COSTS, RISKS AND THE TRADEOFFS. SO HOW THOSE
6 MANIFEST THEMSELVES IN THESE PERSPECTIVES IS GOING TO BE
7 CRITICAL AS THIS THINGS UNFOLDS OVER THE COURSE OF THE NEXT
8 THREE OR FOUR MONTHS HERE. WE NEED TO KEEP THAT IN MIND. AND
9 IT WAS A POINT AT THE END OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE THAT I
10 BROUGHT UP ABOUT THE RATIO BETWEEN QUALITATIVE PERFORMANCE
11 METRICS AND QUANTITATIVE, AND WE NEVER REALLY GOT TO WHERE I
12 THOUGHT WAS REALLY SATISFACTORY, IT WAS WAY MORE RELYING ON
13 QUALITATIVE AS OPPOSED TO QUANTITATIVE SO AS GENERAL MANAGER
14 OF BART I'M GOING TO BE LOOKING TO THE DISCUSSION TO UNFOLD IN
15 THE NEXT SIX MONTHS.

16

17 **TAMIM RAAD:** IF YOU COULD GO TO SLIDE 17? OUR INTENTION IS TO
18 DO AS YOU SAY WHICH IS TO ASSESS THE QUANTITATIVE QUALITATIVE
19 DIMENSIONS OF THE PERFORMANCE OF THE RESPECTIVE OPTIONS,
20 INCLUDING IDENTIFICATION EVER THE RISKS AND TRADEOFFS. AND,
21 AGAIN, SOME OF THOSE RISKS WOULD BE THE ONES THAT WERE JUST
22 RAISED EARLIER. WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING THIS WITH IMPERFECT
23 INFORMATION ABOUT WHAT THE FUTURE OF THE CURRENT PROFILE S YOU
24 SHOULD HAVE MORE INFORMATION -- THE FUTURE PROFILE THERE IS A
25 LOT OF GUESS WORK INVOLVED SO THE RISK ASSESSMENT OF THE NEED



MARCH 7, 2022

1 FOR REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS AROUND THE DIFFERENT TYPES
2 OF FUTURE PROFILES AND THE EXTENT TO WHICH IT'S NEEDED AND THE
3 BENEFITS, WILL BE PART OF THE ASSESSMENT. I THINK IT GETS DOWN
4 TO THE LEVEL OF DETAIL. SO IT'S NOT GOING TO BE THE LEVEL OF
5 DETAIL ON THE QUANTITATIVE AND MONETIZED SIDES OF THESE
6 IMPACTS ARE GOING TO BE ABSENT IT'S JUST THAT WITHIN THE
7 CURRENT SCOPE AND TIME BOTH FROM YOUR BANDWIDTH PERSPECTIVE
8 AND ALSO OURS WE WILL PICK THE ONES THAT ARE MOST RELEVANT AND
9 MAKING A PATHWAY TO OPTIONS. AND NEXT PHASE PRIOR TO
10 IMPLEMENTATION THERE'S A TON OF WORK TO BE DONE THAT'S WHERE
11 DETAILED FINANCIAL AND ECONOMIC INFORMATION WILL BE SOUGHT AND
12 TARGETED AT SPECIFIC IMPLEMENTATION QUESTIONS. SO, IT'S, DO
13 THE ANALYSIS SIMILARLY TO HOW WE WOULD DO IT FOR A RAPID
14 TRANSIT LINE; WE DON'T NEED NECESSARILY CLASS D COST ESTIMATES
15 OR A LINE ITEM ESTIMATE BUT WE WILL NEED INFORMATION SO
16 GETTING THE RIGHT PIECE OF INFORMATION AT THE RIGHT LEVEL OF
17 DETAIL IS GOING TO BE CRITICAL TO THIS ANALYSIS BUT THERE
18 MIGHT PIECES OF INFORMATION THAT SOME STAKEHOLDERS AND
19 OPERATORS ARE SEEKING THAT WE'LL NEED TO IDENTIFY AND THERE
20 WILL BE A QUESTION OF BANDWIDTH AND RESOURCES AND AVAILABILITY
21 TO GET AT THOSE. ANOTHER KEY IS FUNDING. WE THINK ABOUT ALL
22 THE TIME AND HOW TO ADDRESS THAT. WE WANT TO ASK OURSELVES THE
23 QUESTION IN THE ASSESSMENT AS TO THE EXISTING, WHAT DOES
24 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT LOOK LIKE IN A STATUS QUO
25 SITUATION WHERE THE SAME PROFILE OF FUNDING SOURCES EXISTS



MARCH 7, 2022

1 INDEFINITELY INTO THE FUTURE, HOW DOES THAT IMPACT OF FORM OF
2 NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND CASE. THE OTHER ONE, FUNDING SOURCES
3 ARE GOING TO BE REQUIRED TO MEET FUTURE NEEDS AND WE'LL NEED
4 TO THINK ABOUT WHETHER THAT'S A DESIGN PRINCIPLE TO SEEK OUT
5 AND SECURE FUNDING SOURCE IN A BALLOT MEASURE AS JEFF SAID
6 THAT'S CAPABLE OF GAINING THE SUPPORT OF TWO THIRD IT IS OF
7 THE VOTERS.

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** TAMIM AND BOB. NEXT UP IS ADINA.

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WANT TO BUILD OFF SOME OF THE DISCUSSION KICKED
12 OFF BY THE TWO THIRDS OF THE VOTERS, AND THE LINE IN THE
13 CRITERIA ABOUT WHAT'S POLITICALLY SUPPORTABLE. ONE OF THE
14 THINGS WE HAVE SEEN DONE AGAIN AND AGAIN BY MULTIPLE POLLS
15 DONE BY MTC AND OTHER ENTITIES. IS THAT THE PROSPECT OF A WELL
16 COORDINATED TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS EASY TO USE AND GETS PEOPLE
17 TO WHERE THAT I WANT TO GO QUICKLY AND CONVENIENTLY, AND
18 AFFORDABLY IN THAT FRIENDLY WELL COORDINATED MANNER IS
19 EXTRAORDINARILY POPULAR WITH VOTERS SO THAT IF THE COLLECTIVE
20 WISDOM OF THIS GROUP CAN COME UP WITH HOW TO DO THAT, THAT'S
21 SOMETHING THAT COULD REALLY HELP REACH THOSE TWO THIRDS AND
22 BRING IN THAT FUNDING THAT IS BADLY NEEDED TO BE ABLE TO RUN
23 THE BASIC SERVICE, DO THE BASIC MAINTENANCE, AND PROVIDE THAT
24 ADDITIONAL CONNECTIVITY TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER THOSE GOALS.
25 SO, I THINK THAT IS -- I SEE THAT AS AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 TASK, AND AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE OPPORTUNITY THAT IS HERE.
2 IN TERMS OF THE QUESTION ABOUT WHO BENEFITS: LAST WEEK, I WAS
3 IN A CONVERSATION WITH THE SOUTHEAST COMMUNITY COUNCIL,
4 BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT COMMUNITY ADVOCATES GROUP WHO HAD
5 PARTICIPATED IN THE BAYVIEW COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION
6 PLAN, AND THEIR NUMBER TWO PRIORITY IN THAT PLAN, FOR THAT
7 COMMUNITY, WAS BETTER CONNECTIONS TO REGIONAL TRANSIT TO BART
8 AND TO CALTRAIN FOR IT TO BE AFFORDABLE FOR THE SCHEDULES TO
9 WORK, FOR THE PHYSICAL ACCESS TO WORK, AND, SO, TO THE EXTENT
10 THAT SOMETHING CAN BE PUT TOGETHER TO BE ABLE TO HELP MEET
11 THOSE NEEDS WERE NOT MET AND HADN'T BEEN MET FOR MANY YEARS, I
12 THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT OPPORTUNITY. I THINK I WAS REALLY
13 GLAD TO SEE IN THE STRUCTURE THAT WAS PRESENTED IN THIS
14 SECTION ABOUT IDENTIFYING AND REALLY CLARIFYING WHAT ENTITY
15 DOES WHAT; AS THE STUDY WAS BEING BROUGHT TO THE DIFFERENT
16 TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS OVER THE LAST FEW WEEKS, I HEARD AT SOME
17 OF THE BOARDS, FEARS, LIKE, WELL, IF WE HAVE A NETWORK
18 MANAGEMENT ENTITY THEN THERE IS GOING TO BE SOMEBODY, A
19 CENTRAL AUTHORITY, THAT IS GOING TO BE TELLING US, A LOCAL BUS
20 AGENCY THAT MY BUS CANNOT STOP IN FRONT OF A SCHOOL THAT WE'RE
21 GOING TO HAVE SOMEBODY MICRO MANAGING WHAT A LOCAL AGENCY
22 SHOULD DO AT THAT LEVEL, WHERE A BUS STOP IS. AND IN LOOKING
23 AT -- I'M GLAD THAT WE HAVE CONSULTANTS THAT HAVE
24 INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE AT THIS KIND OF THING, BECAUSE I
25 DON'T THINK THAT THAT'S THE WAY THAT IT'S DONE ANYWHERE AROUND



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THE WORLD, AND, SO, BEING ABLE TO CLARIFY WHAT ENTITY WOULD DO
2 WHAT AND WHAT REMAIN IN THE HANDS OF THE PEOPLE THAT HAVE THE
3 MOST LOCAL PERSPECTIVE ON WHERE THAT BUS STOP SHOULD GO, I
4 THINK IS REALLY IMPORTANT, AND CAN HELP ALLAY THOSE FEARS.
5 AND A COUPLE MORE THINGS. I WAS REALLY GLAD TO SEE THE FOCUS
6 ON REFINING THE ALTERNATIVE IN THOSE PRESENTATIONS AT THE
7 VARIOUS DIFFERENT BOARDS. I WAS CONSIDERING SOME VERY KIND OF
8 BLUNT INSTRUMENT CHARACTERIZATIONS OF WHAT SOME OF THOSE
9 OPTIONS MIGHT BE THAT'S SOMEONE TELLING YOU WHERE YOUR BUS
10 STOP IS GOING TO GO, AND I THINK, ONE, WHEN THOSE OPTIONS ARE
11 BROUGHT FORWARD, FIRST OF ALL, SHOWING ALL THE OPTIONS, I KNOW
12 THAT AT THE BOARD MEETINGS WE WERE SEEING ONE OPTION SHOWING
13 ALL THE OPTIONS, I THINK, IS IMPORTANT, AND HAVING THE
14 OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY REFINE AND CLARIFY THE ALTERNATIVES SO
15 THAT WE DON'T WIND UP WITH THAT KIND OF CONCERN. I THINK, IS
16 IMPORTANT. AND, LASTLY BUILDING ON WHAT HAYLEY WAS TALKING
17 ABOUT IN TERMS OF STAKEHOLDER INPUT, I WOULD AGREE WITH
18 HAYLEY. I THINK THAT IMPORTANT VOICES ARE NOT HERE IN THE
19 ROOM, AND THERE PROBABLY ARE CREATIVE WAYS, WITH QUANTITATIVE
20 AND QUALITATIVE WAYS OF LISTENING TO TRANSIT RIDERS THAT ARE
21 NOT IN THE ROOM. THERE IS A PILOT PROGRAM THAT'S MOVING AHEAD
22 WITH REGIONAL FARE INTEGRATION AND I THINK THERE MIGHT BE SOME
23 CLEVER WAYS OF PICKING BACKING ON THAT, WHERE THERE ARE, FOR
24 EXAMPLE, STUDENTS AT A SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY, OR A
25 COMMUNITY COLLEGE THAT WILL BE PARTICIPATING AND BRINGING IN



MARCH 7, 2022

1 SOME OF THOSE RIDERS WHO HAVE SOME VERY CONCRETE PROSPECTS IN
2 FRONT OF THEM, TO USE TRANSIT, POSSIBLY, DIFFERENTLY. I THINK
3 HAVING RIDER PERSPECTIVE THERE IS IMPORTANT, AND I DON'T THINK
4 THE EXISTING RESEARCH THAT HAS BEEN DONE AGENCY BY AGENCY WILL
5 FULLY DELIVER WHAT WE NEED TO KNOW, BECAUSE AGENCY BY AGENCY
6 HAS BEEN ASKING ABOUT THE SYSTEM AS IT IS. THANKS.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** KEVIN DO YOU WANT TO WEIGH IN?

9

10 **KEVIN DESMOND:** THERE WAS A LOT PACKED IN THERE A LOT OF WHAT
11 YOU MENTIONED IS CARRYING ON A CERTAIN THEME ABOUT THE
12 EVALUATION CRITERIA, THE HARD MEASURES, THE PERFORMANCE
13 METRICS, BUT EVEN THE SOFTER MEASURES, AND THIS NOTION OF WHAT
14 IS POLITICALLY ACCEPTABLE, WHAT IS IMPLEMENTABLE. THAT WAS
15 PART OF OUR EVALUATION CRITERIA THE FIRST TIME AND NEEDS TO BE
16 PART OF THAT CRITERIA THIS TIME TO THE EXTENT THAT WHICH YOU
17 CAN TURN THAT INTO HARD NUMBERS VERSUS THE QUALITATIVE SIDE IS
18 PART OF HOW WE NEED TO PROCEED WITH ROLLING THOSE OUT.

19

20 **TAMIM RAAD:** AND ADINA TO ADD TO THAT, I THINK THE POINT THAT
21 YOU RAISED, ONE OF THE FIRST POINTS WHICH IS GETTING CLARITY
22 ON WHAT EACH ENTITY DOES IS KEY. SO WHAT WE WANT TO DO, I
23 GUESS, IS NOT REACH FOR THE HIGHEST HANGING FRUIT. WE'RE GOING
24 FOR LOWER HANGING FRUIT HERE, SO WE WOULD ASK OURSELVES IN
25 THAT EXAMPLE YOU GAVE, THE LOCAL BUS STOP, IS THERE A STRONG



MARCH 7, 2022

1 REGIONAL INTEREST IN A REGIONAL ENTITY HAVING A SAY IN THAT.
2 AND WE COULD COME TO 1 OF 3 CONCLUSIONS, NO THERE IS NOT A
3 CLEAR BENEFIT. THE REGIONAL ENTITY WOULD STAY SILENT ON THAT.
4 THAT REMAINS A LOCAL AUTHORITY. THE OTHER MIGHT BE, WELL,
5 THERE COULD BE SOME IDEAS AS A REGIONAL ENTITY, WE COULD PUT
6 UP GUIDELINES THAT MIGHT BE USEFUL TO LOCAL ENTITIES OR NO
7 THAT BUS STOP IS A CRITICAL REGIONAL FUNCTION WHICH IT
8 PROBABLY DOESN'T SOUND LIKE IT IS BASED ON THE DESCRIPTION YOU
9 GAVE AND THAT NEEDS TO BE PART OF THE AUTHORITY. THAT SEEMS TO
10 BE A STEEP HILL TO CLIMB UP FOR THAT THING SO THAT WOULD BE
11 PRETTY OBVIOUS. BUT THERE ARE LOTS EXAMPLES OF THAT. THE KEY
12 THAT CAME OUT LAST SUMMER ARE BOUNDARY CONDITIONS FOR THE
13 AUTHORITY. IT'S GOING TO BE KEY FOR US TO ZERO IN ON AND THAT
14 COMES INTO PLAY WITH WHAT DECISIONS SHOULD HAVE ACCOUNTABILITY
15 AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE'LL MAKE SURE TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS
16 ON WHAT WE THINK THAT IS.

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ADINA. NEXT UP IS OUR VICE
19 CHAIR JOHN-BAPTISTE

20

21 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO
22 PICK UP ON THE THREAD FROM THE EARLIER DISCUSSION THAT JEFF
23 AND THERESE SPOKE TO. I WAS APPRECIATING THE FRAME THAT
24 THERESE OFFERED TO ME THAT'S THE RIGHT LEVEL OF WHICH WE
25 SHOULD BE TACKLE THESE QUESTIONS IN THIS PROCESS, I THINK,



MARCH 7, 2022

1 WHAT'S SO CHALLENGING ABOUT THE TRADEOFF QUESTIONS THAT YOU
2 WERE RAISING, JEFF, IS THEY'RE REALLY A SERIES OF VALUE-BASED
3 QUESTIONS AND REASONABLE PEOPLE CAN HAVE REALLY DIFFERENT
4 PERSPECTIVES ON WHAT THE RIGHT ANSWER S SO I THINK WHAT WE
5 WANT TO BE SOLVING FOR IS CREATING A STRUCTURE THAT LET'S US
6 HAVE THOSE VALUES-BASED DECISION MAKE MAKING STRUCTURES IN
7 PLACE IN SUCH A WAY THAT CAN BE EVOLVE OVER TIME AND IN SUCH A
8 WAY THAT WE CAN HAVE THE RIGHT FORM OF ACCOUNTABILITY BACK TO
9 THE PUBLIC THAT WE ARE TRYING TO SERVE. AND I ALSO WANT TO
10 PICK UP ON WHAT YOU MENTIONED AROUND THE NEED FOR ADDITIONAL
11 INVESTMENT. I WHOLEHEARTEDLY AGREE THAT WE ARE DEEPLY
12 UNDERRESOURCED AND THAT WE WANT TO, THROUGH THIS PROCESS,
13 BUILD OUR CREDIBILITY, AND OUR CAPACITY IN BEING ABLE TO
14 DELIVER WHAT THE REGION ACTUALLY MEANS, AND I THINK IT IS
15 HELPFUL TO KEEP THAT AS AN INTENTIONAL FOCUS OF THE WORK THAT
16 WE'RE DOING, AS WELL. SO I WANTED TO OFFER THAT. AND THEN I
17 WANTED TO ADDRESS HOW WE'RE GOING TO DO THE REGIONAL RAIL
18 STUDY IT'S INTEGRAL TO THIS AND WITH THAT STUDY GOING ON I
19 WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE NOT ACCIDENTALLY PREFERENCING OUR RAIL
20 DISCUSSIONS OVER BUS DISCUSSIONS BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY THOSE ARE
21 CRITICALLY IMPORTANT.

22

23 **KEVIN DESMOND:** SCHRUTI, DO YOU WANT TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION?

24



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **SHRUTI HARI:** THIS WILL BE COMING UP NEXT IN THE PRESENTATION
2 I'LL BE GOING OVER SLIDES TO ADDRESS THAT QUESTION. THANK YOU.

3

4 **TAMIM RAAD:** ALICIA TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION ABOUT THE -- THAT
5 CONNECTED NETWORK APPROACH IT'S CORE TO UNDERSTANDING OUR
6 PROBLEM STATEMENT THAT THE RAIL SYSTEM IS INTRINSICALLY
7 CONNECTED TO THE BUS SYSTEM FERRY SYSTEM AND PARATRANSIT, IT'S
8 AN INTEGRATED SUCCESS THE CONNECTIONS AND FARE INTEGRATION AND
9 MARKETING ARE HOLDING THAT ALL TOGETHER SO WE WILL BE BRINGING
10 THAT INTEGRATED VIEW TO IT. THERE IS VERY DIFFERENT -- THIS IS
11 WHY THE DECISION FRAME IS IMPORTANT BECAUSE OF HOW DECISIONS
12 ARE MADE AT THE POLICY LEVEL AND I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING TO
13 GET INTO THIS TODAY BUT IT WILL BE PART OF OUR FUTURE
14 DISCUSSION ON DECISIONS OF OF WHAT A RAIL NETWORK WILL LOOK
15 LIKE IS DIFFERENT THAN FIGURING OUT DELIVERY OF THE RAIL
16 NETWORK AND OPERATING THE RAIL NETWORK WE'RE REALLY BREAKING
17 DOWN THOSE DECISIONS AND UNDERSTANDING AND ENSURE THE
18 INTEGRATED NETWORK IS DEVELOPED AND DELIVERY AND OPERATIONS
19 ARE WORKING IN THAT SPACE. WE'RE BUSY DELIVERING HOW TO BREAK
20 THAT DOWN.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS JIM WUNDERMAN.

23

24 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I'LL BE BRIEF BECAUSE I THINK IT'S BEEN COVERED
25 BUT I WANT TO APPRECIATE WHAT JEFFREY TUMLIN SAID ABOUT MAKING



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THIS A REAL BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS. YOU KNOW, I THINK -- I
2 WOULDN'T BE OPPOSED TO THE NOTION -- AND I THINK TAMIM, I
3 THINK YOU COVERED THIS, I WOULDN'T BE OPPOSED TO ADDING THE
4 NOTION OF SOME MONEY TO IT, AS THE TEST, MEASURING IT AGAINST
5 SOME INFUSION OF FUNDS, \$50 BILLION, \$100 BILLION, SOME AMOUNT
6 THAT WE COULD SAY, IF WE HAD THAT AMOUNT, THEN HOW DO WE
7 ASSESS THE SYSTEM IN THESE DIFFERENT SCENARIOS SO THAT THE
8 PUBLIC COULD KIND OF SEE THAT PLAY OUT IN FRONT OF THEM AND
9 HAVE INPUT TO IT. SO, ANYWAY, THAT'S MY -- JUST A REACTION TO
10 WHAT WAS SAID. THANKS.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** ANY THOUGHTS?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] EXPERIMENT --

15

16 **TAMIM RAAD:** I THINK THIS COMES DOWN TO WHAT ARE THOSE
17 SENSITIVITY AS TO WHAT WE WERE TALKING ABOUT BEFORE, THERE IS
18 A SCENARIO WHERE YOU, THAT THE REGION DOES HAVE A LIMITED POOL
19 OF FUNDS AND THAT MIGHT CARRY ON FOR THE INDEFINITE FUTURE, 5,
20 10 YEARS, WHATEVER THE TIME FRAME MIGHT BE, AND THEN THERE ARE
21 SCENARIOS WHERE YOU COULD BE GOING FORWARD WITH A SIGNIFICANT
22 BALLOT MEASURE TO HAVE A MASSIVE INFUSEMENT OF CAPITAL AND
23 SERVICE DOLLARS INTO THE REGION. SO WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE
24 AROUND THOSE, AND EVEN UNDER STEADY STATE. I THINK OUR HUNCH
25 IS THERE IS PROBABLY STILL VALUE TO REGIONAL NETWORK



MARCH 7, 2022

1 MANAGEMENT AND WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE? ACCOUNTABILITY WILL
2 LOOK DIFFERENT AND THE ORGANIZATION MIGHT LOOK DIFFERENT. SO I
3 THINK WE'LL DO SOME CAREFUL THINKING INTEGRATING THAT INTO
4 OPERATION AND ASSESSMENT. EXCELLENT POINTS.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS JIM. CAROLYN GONOT.

7

8 **CAROLYN GONOT:** THANK YOU. GOOD CONVERSATION. JIM BROUGHT UP
9 SOME THINGS THAT I THINK TAGS ON TO SOME OF THE THINGS THAT I
10 WAS GOING TO MENTION THAT THERESE TALKED ABOUT, THE END ABOUT
11 WHO HAS ACCOUNTABILITIES AND WHO HOLDS THE RISK. I THINK
12 THEY'RE DIFFERENT BASED ON WHAT JEFFREY TUMLIN SAID. THAT'S
13 WHY I THINK AS A BUSINESS CASE IS REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE
14 LOOK AT THAT. TOO OFTEN, I HAVE SEEN PEOPLE WANT THE
15 RESPONSIBILITY BUT NOT THE ACCOUNTABILITY OR THE RISKS. AND
16 RIGHT NOW WE EACH HAVE OUR OWN. WHETHER THAT'S GOOD OR BAD,
17 AND MAYBE WE DON'T SHARE ENOUGH OF THOSE RISKS, BUT I THINK
18 ONE OF THE THING THAT NEED TO BE LOOKED AT IS, HOW DOES THAT
19 CHANGE? YOU KNOW, I WOULD HATE TO THINK THAT THERE IS AN
20 AGENCY ACCOUNTABILITY, BUT THE RISKS AREN'T WITH THE AGENCY
21 THAT'S ACCOUNTABILITY. AND THAT HAS HAPPENED IN THE PAST. SO
22 WE NEED TO BE CAREFUL ABOUT THAT LOOKING AT THESE
23 ALTERNATIVES. THAT'S IMPORTANT TO ME. AND JIM, YOU BROUGHT UP
24 A REALLY GOOD POINT, THAT SENSITIVITY, OR BASED ON THE FUNDING
25 SOURCES. AND YOU KNOW, BECAUSE WE'RE SO FUNDING SO DIFFICULT,



MARCH 7, 2022

1 AND THERE IS THIS PRESSURE ON EACH OF US INDIVIDUALLY, TO
2 FULFILL OUR OWN PRESSURES AND BASED ON FUNDING SOURCES AS THEY
3 COME ABOUT, SALES TAX, BY A COUNTY EXPECTS TRANSPORTATION TO
4 BE GIVEN THROUGHOUT THE COUNTY AND YOU'RE TRYING TO MAKE IT
5 WORK AND MAKE IT WORK WELL FOR THE PEOPLE WHO NEED IT BUT ALSO
6 UNDERSTAND WHERE IT'S COMING FROM. I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT
7 THIS IN THE FUTURE THAT'S WHY BUSINESS CASE NEEDS TO LOOK AT
8 THOSE RESPONSIBILITIES THAT SOMETHING WOULD HAVE IN THE ROLES
9 AND RESPONSIBILITIES, THE ACCOUNTABILITIES AND RISKS AND WHERE
10 THEY LIE. THANKS.

11

12 **KEVIN DESMOND.** TOTALLY. ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES, AND
13 MANAGING AND ACCEPTING RISKS IS ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL TO THIS
14 PROCESS AND YOU ADD THE FUNDING, AND THE ASSOCIATED WITH THE
15 ALLOCATIONS AND LAS VEGAS SUFFICIENT REGIONAL NEEDS, AND
16 DEVISING A REGIONAL MODEL FOR A REGION UNTIL NETWORK
17 MANAGEMENT THAT COULD BE SUCCESSFUL IN THE FUTURE.

18

19 **TAMIM RAAD:** AND TO ADD WHO CARRIES THE RISK AND WHO THE
20 BENEFIT OWNER S SO THE POLICY AND ACCOUNTABILITY AND FUNDING
21 ACCOUNTABILITY AND I THINK IT WAS MENTIONED PRIOR IN OUR WORK
22 JEFF MENTION THE FUNDING AVAILABILITY AND THAT'S A TOUCH POINT
23 AND OUTCOME AT THE END OF THE DAY AS WELL AS WHO IS GOING TO
24 OWN THE RISK ARE VERY IMPORTANT LENSES TO PUT ON IT.

25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS. I DON'T SEE ANY MORE HANDS
2 RAISED. JUST TIME-PROCESS WISE. WE HAVE BEEN AT THIS A LONG
3 TIME. THIS IS REALLY IMPORTANT. ARGUABLY THIS IS THE MOST
4 IMPORTANT THING WE'RE GOING TO DO IN THE WORK PLAN AND
5 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT EVERYTHING ELSE EVOLVES FROM THIS: THE
6 THIRD ITEM, THE LOOK AHEAD, WE SHOULD DEFER TO THE NEXT
7 MEETING. WE NEED TO HEAR FROM SCHRUTI, AND HEAR FROM THE
8 PUBLIC AND LOOK AT THE SHAPING OF THE WORK PLAN AND
9 ENGAGEMENT. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO SCHRUTI THEN GO TO THE
10 PUBLIC.

11

12 **SHRUTI HARI:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. PLEASE PULL UP
13 THE SLIDES THIS IS THE SECOND ATTACHMENT UNDER ITEM FIVE. AS
14 YOU'RE PULLING UP THE SLIDES I WANT TO SPEAK TO RIDER NEEDS
15 THERE WAS STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT DONE DURING THE TASK FORCE
16 INVOLVEMENT PROCESS AND WE'LL SUMMARIZE AND COVER THAT AT OUR
17 NEXT ADVISORY BOARD MEETING AND THINK ABOUT ADDITIONAL RIDER
18 ENGAGEMENT BUT THERE WAS RIDER ENGAGEMENT DONE THAT WE'RE
19 BUILDING OFTEN OF HERE. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. THIS
20 SLIDE ILLUSTRATES TWO MTC PROJECTS IN THE REALM OF REGIONAL
21 TRANSIT COORDINATION AND GOVERNANCE IN THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
22 BUSINESS CASE AND REGIONAL RAIL STUDY THESE QUESTIONS HAVE
23 COME UP PREVIOUSLY AS TO HOW STUDIES INTEGRATE WITH EACH
24 OTHER. I WANT TO CLOSE OUT WITH A QUICK PRESENTATION ON THAT.
25 AS MOST OF YOU HERE CAN IMAGINE THE GOALS FOR THESE TWO



MARCH 7, 2022

1 PROJECT ARE SIMILAR, A SEAMLESS AND CUSTOMER FOCUSED NETWORK
2 INCREASING RIDERSHIP AND EQUITY. THE GOALS ARE DIFFERENT
3 NETWORK MANAGEMENT COVERS A HIGH-LEVEL EVALUATION OF MULTIPLE
4 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT ALTERNATIVES ACROSS ALL OF TRANSIT
5 WHEREAS REGIONAL IS SINGLE TRANSPORTATION MODE CONCENTRATING
6 ON PROJECT DELIVERY AND GOVERNANCE MODELS AND FOCUSED ON
7 RAILS. TO ELABORATE THE BUSINESS CASE PROJECT WILL EVALUATE
8 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT GOVERNANCE MODELS AND IDENTIFIES A
9 PREFERRED REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE FOR ALL
10 TRANSIT MODES. THE RAIL STUDY ON THE OTHER HAND, CURRENT ENTRY
11 GOVERNANCE MODEL, AND COVERS ALTERNATIVES THAT COULD BE
12 APPLIED TO EXISTING AND PLANNED REGIONAL PLANS AND OPERATIONS
13 WITHIN THE BAY AREA AND ALL WITH THE GOAL OF MORE EFFICIENT
14 PROJECT DELIVERY AND A CUSTOMER FOCUSED NETWORK. IT GOES ON TO
15 IDENTIFY MODELS THAT MAYBE WARRANT FOR CONSIDERATION BUT
16 DOESN'T EVALUATE OR RECOMMENDING OF THESE MODELS BUT IT LOOKS
17 AT THE VARIOUS ALTERNATIVES, LOOKS AT RISKS AND BENEFITS, BUT
18 THERE WON'T BE AN EVALUATION. NOW, THE RAIL STUDY WILL
19 CONTRIBUTE TO MTC'S DEVELOPMENT OF MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT
20 POLICY THAT I CAN TALK ABOUT ON THE NEXT SLIDE. IF YOU COULD
21 MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO A QUICK BACKGROUND IN
22 THE STOVE SCOPE. I WANTED TO MAP THE KEY DELIVERABLES, WE DID
23 DO THIS INTERNALLY, UNDERSTANDING WHAT KEY POINTS THE PROJECT
24 INFORM EACH OTHER AND MAKE SURE THE IMPORTANCE OF
25 CONTRIBUTIONS. THESE WOULD BE THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 RIBBON IMPLEMENTATION RESOLUTION 3866 AND MAJOR PRODUCT
2 ADVANCEMENT POLICY STUDIES. WHAT I WANT TO STRESS HERE IS THE
3 TIMELINE FOR THE BUSINESS CASE IS LONGER WITH A BROADER SCOPE
4 AND IT WILL REVIEW THE RAIL STUDY FINDINGS AND EVALUATE THEM
5 FURTHER WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
6 STRUCTURES. IN MARCH AND APRIL THEY WILL REVIEW AND REFINE
7 THESE ACCOUNTABILITY AREAS DEFINE THE DEFINITION OF THE
8 NETWORK AND EVALUATION OF FRAMEWORK AND MOVE ON TO THE ACTUAL
9 REFINING COORDINATORS AND THE COORDINATORS EVALUATION
10 FOLLOWING YOUR ADVISORY GROUP'S REVIEW IN JULY AND AUGUST AT
11 WHICH TYPE AN ALTERNATIVE WILL BE PRESENTED YOUR ADVISORY
12 GROUP. AND IN NOVEMBER, STAFF HAS MET TWICE TO THINK ABOUT
13 OPTIONS AND WILL BE REVIEWING THE ACCELERATED ALTERNATIVE
14 ANALYSIS IN APRIL. WHAT THE ANALYSIS IS IT APPLYING AN INITIAL
15 SPECTRUM OF GOVERNANCE AND DELIVER ALTERNATIVES TO A FOCUSED
16 SET OF REGIONAL RAIL ALTERNATIVES. THAT WILL BE FOLLOWING THE
17 BUSINESS CASE AND FOLLOWED BY A REVIEW OF EXISTING MODELS USED
18 GLOBALLY AND EVALUATION OF IMPACTS, BENEFITS, AND RISKS, AND
19 HOW APPLICATION THE BAY AREA COULD HELP ACHIEVE SUCCESSFUL
20 OUTCOMES IN OUR REGION. THAT FINAL REPORT WILL BE DELIVERED TO
21 THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE TEAM AND MANY FINDINGS
22 RELATED TO THE DELIVERY AND GOVERNANCE MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES
23 WILL BE PROVIDED TO THE TEAM RIGHT BEFORE THE ALTERNATIVE
24 EVALUATION BEGINS IN THE BUSINESS CASE SLIDE I WANTED TO
25 STRESS THAT. I WANT TO CLOSE OUT WITH ONE FINAL POINT SOME OF



MARCH 7, 2022

1 THESE COLLABORATION OPPORTUNITIES FOR BOTH OF THESE NETWORK
2 MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE TEAM AS WELL AS THE RAIL GRANT TEAM
3 ARE INCLUDED IN EACH TEAM SCOPE AND IT WILL INCLUDE ACTIVITIES
4 LIKE ALIGNMENT AND DEFINITIONS AND USE OF TERMINOLOGY AND
5 COLLABORATION OF KEY ELEMENTS THAT ALL OF US WILL BE LOOKING
6 AT LIKE REFINING ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF A NETWORK
7 MANAGER EVALUATION CRITERIA THIS'S IMPORTANT AND THE
8 STRUCTURAL ALTERNATIVES AS WELL. I WANTED TO CLOSE OUT WITH
9 THAT BUT FINALLY MAYBE JUST A SENTENCE ON THE MAJOR PROJECTS
10 ADVANCEMENT POLICY SOME OF YOU MAY BE AWARE BUT FOR THOSE WHO
11 ARE NOT THE PURPOSE OF THE MAJOR ADVANCEMENT POLICY THAT MTC
12 STAFF IS WORKING ON IS TO DEVELOP STRATEGIES FOR THE \$600
13 BILLION IN ONE AND ALIGN FEDERAL AND STATE AND REGIONAL
14 DISCRETIONARY DOLLARS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA PROJECTS ALSO
15 FURTHERING DEVELOPMENT THE REGION'S SUS STANDING MONITORING
16 AND RISK MANAGEMENT FOR SOME OF THESE REGIONAL PROJECTS AND
17 WE'LL LIKELY LOOK AT LONGER PROJECTS LINK 21 OTHER AND
18 PROJECTS TO SET THE STAGE AS WELL FOR THESE FUTURE PROJECTS
19 AND THE MAJOR ADVANCEMENTS PROJECT POLICY. SO DEFINITELY
20 WORKING ON MANY OF THESE INITIATIVES SYNCING UP WITH EACH
21 OTHER. AND WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO THE CHAIR FOR ANY
22 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.
23



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'RE STILL ON ITEM FIVE.
2 BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEM FIVE, DOES ANYONE
3 HAVE QUESTIONS FOR SCHRUTI? ADINA?

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** I THINK THAT DOES ANSWER OR ADDRESS THE QUESTION
6 THAT I HAD AT THE BEGINNING, WHERE IT SEEMS THAT THERE WILL BE
7 LOGICAL COMPONENTS THAT MAY OR ARE LIKELY TO FALL OUT OF THE
8 REGIONAL RAIL STUDY THAT WOULD FILTER INTO THE OPTIONS FOR
9 NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND THAT COULD INCLUDE WHAT FUNCTIONS WOULD
10 BE IN SCOPE OF A NETWORK MANAGEMENT ENTITY, AND, ALSO, WHAT
11 ARE THE CHOICES, STRUCTURAL CHOICES OF A NETWORK MANAGEMENT
12 ENTITY BASED ON REGIONAL RAIL GOVERNANCE. SO, I THINK THAT
13 ANSWERS MY QUESTION.

14

15 **SHRUTI HARI:** CORRECT. THAT'S EXACTLY RIGHT.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** NEXT BOB POWERS.

18

19 **ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS CHAIRPERSON MULLIGAN. SCHRUTI, ON YOUR
20 LAST SLIDE THERE, YOU HAD SOMETHING THAT WAS CALLED "FINDINGS
21 OF ACCELERATED ALTERNATIVES ASSESSMENT." AND I'M NOT EVEN SURE
22 WHAT THAT IS, BUT IT SAID IN MARCH, THAT THIS BOARD THAT IS ON
23 THIS CALL WAS GOING TO BE GETTING -- THAT THAT INFORMATION WAS
24 GOING TO FEED UP TO THIS BOARD? HAVE WE GOT THAT? FIRST OFF,



MARCH 7, 2022

1 WHAT IS IT? AND HAS THAT BEEN PROVIDED TO US AND I JUST MISSED
2 IT?

3

4 **SHRUTI HARI:** NO. LET ME ELABORATE ON THAT A LITTLE BIT. MAYBE
5 STARTING WITH WHAT THE ACCELERATED ANALYSIS REPORT IS IT'S A
6 MOUTHFUL AND I DID BRIEFLY MENTION THAT. WHAT THAT REPORT
7 WOULD DO IS APPLY AN INITIAL SPECTRUM OF DELIVERY ALTERNATIVES
8 TO A SET OF REGIONAL INITIATIVE AND LOOK AT BENEFITS AND RISKS
9 OF HOW THE DIFFERENT ALTERNATIVES WOULD PERFORM. WE CAN SEND
10 YOU SOME INFORMATION ON THAT, BUT RIGHT NOW WE'RE STILL
11 WORKING ON THAT WITH A TAG, AND THE INITIAL OF THE ALTERNATIVE
12 ANALYSIS REPORT WAS PROVIDED TO THEM AT THE FEB TAC, AND THE
13 FULL REPORT WILL COME IN IN APRIL. SO IT GOT DELAYED SLIGHTLY.
14 AND I APOLOGIZE IF THE LINE WAS MISLEADING. THE ANALYSIS AND
15 FINDINGS OF THAT REPORT WOULD COME TO THE TAC IN APRIL AND
16 WOULD INFORM THE BUSINESS CASE TEAM FINDINGS OF THE REPORT
17 WOULD ADVISE THE BUSINESS CASE TEAM IF THE ADVISORY GROUP IS
18 INTERESTED WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO BRING THE AR TO THE ADVISORY
19 GROUP.

20

21 **ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. I HAVE TO THINK ABOUT IT. IT LOOKED LIKE
22 IT WAS COMING AS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM TO THIS BOARD, AT SOME
23 POINT.

24

25 **SHRUTI HARI:** IT WILL INFORM THE BUSINESS CASE.



MARCH 7, 2022

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** CAROLYN.

3

4 **CAROLYN GONOT:** IS THE ACCELERATED ALTERNATIVES REPORT IS THAT
5 PART OF THE RAIL PROJECT? YES?

6

7 **SHRUTI HARI:** THAT'S CORRECT. YES.

8

9 **CAROLYN GONOT:** OKAY. SO I GUESS, SITTING ON THAT GROUP WITH
10 BOB AND OTHERS, I WAS JUST CURIOUS -- OKAY. I GUESS IT WOULD
11 BE GOOD TO HAVE MORE DIALOGUE, MAYBE, WITH THAT GROUP ABOUT
12 WHAT THAT REPORT IS. BECAUSE IT MAKES ME A LITTLE ANXIOUS TO
13 SEE ACCELERATED ALTERNATIVES VERSUS SUSPENDING THE TIME WE
14 NEED TO DO. IT MIGHT BE SOMETHING ELSE. IT MIGHT BE
15 PRELIMINARY.

16

17 **SHRUTI HARI:** IT IS.

18

19 **CAROLYN GONOT:** IT'S A LITTLE SCARY. BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN
20 SAYING HOW THIS FEELS SORT OF RUSHED EVEN ON THE RAIL
21 GOVERNANCE SIDE.

22

23 **SHRUTI HARI:** THE NAME IS DEFINITELY A MOUTHFUL. I THINK FOR
24 THAT REASON WE HAVE BEEN RECONSIDERING THAT NAME. BUT IT'S A
25 PRELIMINARY LOOK. I THINK YOU CAPTURED IT RIGHT AT TRYING TO



MARCH 7, 2022

1 FIGURE OUT HOW SOME OF THE ALTERNATIVES THE RAIL GRANT IS
2 COMING UP WITH COULD COMPLY WITH INITIATIVES IN THE BAY AREA
3 REGION. WE BROUGHT OUR FIRST REPORT INTO THE RAIL TAC AND WILL
4 BE DOING ANOTHER DEEP DIVE IN MARCH WE WERE HOLDING SESSIONS
5 BOTH ON THE DELIVERY SIDE AND BOTH WITH FOLKS THAT WORK ON
6 MANAGEMENT AND DECISION-MAKING STRUCTURES TO INFORM THE REPORT
7 SO THERE WILL BE A LOT OF ENGAGEMENT BUT THE FINAL REPORT
8 COMES TO THE TAC IN APRIL AND AT THAT TIME WE TAKE IT TO TAC
9 AS WELL. WE WILL SEND A REPORT TO THE EXEC GROUP.

10

11 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS CAROLYN. THANKS SCHRUTI. I DON'T
12 SEE ANY MORE PANELISTS NAMES UP. WE'LL GO TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE,
13 IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WISHES TO SPEAK, PLEASE RAISE YOUR
14 HAND.

15

16 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
17 TELECONFERENCE WITH COMMENTS PLEASE USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE
18 OR DIAL STAR NINE NOW. AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. EACH
19 SPEAKER WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE AND 30 SECONDS TO SPEAK OF
20 PLEASE RAISE YOUR VIRTUAL HAND IN THE NEXT 60 SECONDS TO BE
21 RECOGNIZED A SPEAKER. WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC SPEAKER. IAN
22 GRIFFITHS.

23

24 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** GOOD AFTERNOON. FIRST, THANK YOU FOR THIS GREAT
25 PRESENTATION FROM THE CONSULTANT. AND I REALLY LIKE THIS



MARCH 7, 2022

1 PROPOSED WORK PLAN. I THINK IT IS ADDRESSING A LOT OF THE KEY
2 IMPORTANT ISSUES, AND I REALLY LIKE, THERE WAS A SLIDE EARLY
3 ON THAT SAID THE RAIL NETWORK MANAGER SHOULD BE DESIGNED FOR
4 THE LONG-TERM. I THINK THAT WAS A RECOMMENDATION COMING OUT OF
5 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, AND I THINK THAT'S A REALLY
6 IMPORTANT THING TO KEEP IN MIND. I THINK MEMBER JOHN-BAPTISTE
7 MADE COMMENTS TO THAT EFFECT AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT
8 THING TO BE FOCUSING ON, ESPECIALLY ANTICIPATING IF WE LOOK AT
9 HOW MANY, WHEN WE HAVE HAD REVENUE SOURCES OVER THE FIVE
10 DECADES AND THREE REGIONAL MEASURES, RM1, RM2, RM3; WE HAD SB1
11 A FEW YEARS AGO. WE HAVE HAD, EVERY 5 OR 10 YEARS WE HAVE HAD
12 A NEW REVENUE SOURCES, IT'S NOT A QUESTION OF ARE WE GOING TO
13 CONTINUE TO HAVE REVENUE SOURCES; I THINK WE WILL. IT'S REALLY
14 ENSURING WE HAVE A STRUCTURE THAT SETS UP UP FOR SUCCESS FOR
15 THOSE NEW REVENUE SOURCES. LAST THING I WANT TO SAY IS JUST
16 ON THE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT, THERE WAS NOT A REALLY -- IN
17 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, ONE THING THEY THOUGHT WAS HELPFUL
18 WAS TO HAVE THESE OPPORTUNITIES WHERE ALL BOARD MEMBERS OF
19 REGIONAL AGENCIES WERE INVITE TO GET UPDATES, TO THE KEEP OF
20 CONSULTANTS AS WELL AS THE PROJECT TEAM. I BELIEVE THE
21 INDIVIDUAL BOARDS ARE BEING UPDATED BY THEIR RESPECTIVE
22 AGENCIES BUT I FEEL IF SOME PRESENTATION TO THE BOARD
23 OPERATORS MIGHT BE HELPFUL TO ENSURE HOW TIME AND CONSISTENCY
24 IS SHARED WITH THE OPERATOR BOARDS.

25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE IS NO OTHER PUBLIC
2 COMMENT.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, WALLY. ON THIS ITEM, WE
5 TRUNCATED IT. SO I THOUGHT WE WOULD PAUSE FOR A MINUTE. WE ARE
6 AN ADVISORY GROUP. WE HAD A THOUGHT PROVOKING PRESENTATION BY
7 THE CONSULTANTS THAT TALKED ABOUT THE WORK PLAN, STAKEHOLDER
8 ENGAGEMENT AND DEFINITION OF BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS. WE HAD
9 GREAT COMMENTS AND FEEDBACK AND QUESTIONS FROM THE GROUP AND
10 PUBLIC. SO THE QUESTION IS, WHAT DO WE DO WITH ALL OF THIS? WE
11 RECEIVED ADVICE TODAY THIS IS A KEY JUNCTURE. SO BEFORE WE
12 MOVE TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM I BELIEVE THE QUESTION TO KATE OR
13 TAMIM, OR KEVIN IS, WHAT ARE THE NEXT STEPS BASED ON WHAT YOU
14 HEARD TODAY?

15

16 **TAMIM RAAD:** WHAT THIS DEMONSTRATED IS THERE IS A LOT OF
17 RICHNESS TO THE FEEDBACK THAT'S PROVIDED AND THIS IS JUST THE
18 START. OVER THE COURSE OF MARCH WE'RE GOING TO BE SPENDING
19 TIME IN ONE-ON-ONE CONVERSATIONS TO DIVE INTO ISSUES AND
20 CONCERNS AND OPPORTUNITIES TO REALIZE NETWORK MANAGEMENT IN A
21 BIT MORE DETAIL THAT WILL HELP US REALLY TO DO THAT GAP
22 ANALYSIS THAT WE WERE TALKING ABOUT THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT.
23 WHAT ARE THE HURDLES THAT WE NEED TO OVERCOME TO REALIZE
24 NETWORK MANAGEMENT, IDENTIFYING THOSE AND FINDING THOSE PLACES
25 WHERE WE NEED TO GO TO REALLY MAKE THIS WORK FROM A REGIONAL



MARCH 7, 2022

1 PERSPECTIVE. AND THEN THAT'S ALSO GOING TO HELP US TO INFORM
2 HOW WE BEGIN TO DEVELOP THE OPTIONS AND MOST IMPORTANTLY THE
3 CRITERIA. ONE OF THE KEY THEMES THAT I HEARD TODAY WAS AROUND
4 THE CRITERIA AND HOW IMPORTANT THOSE ARE AND GETTING THE RIGHT
5 METRICS AT THE RIGHT SCALE IS GOING TO BE CRITICALLY IMPORTANT
6 TO MAKE SURE EVERYBODY HAS THE INFORMATION THEY NEED TO
7 PROVIDE THEIR ADVICE AS WE GO THROUGH THE BUSINESS CASING
8 PROCESS, WHICH INCLUDES THIS STAGE AS WELL AS SUBSEQUENT
9 STAGES THAT'S ONE THING THEY HEARD THAT CAME OUT LOUD AND
10 CLEAR IS THE NEED TO GET ALIGNMENT ON THAT IN PARTICULAR. SO
11 THAT'S JUST A SUMMARY OF WHERE I THINK IT LOOKS LIKE OVER THE
12 COURSE OF THE NEXT MONTH AND OF COURSE WE'LL BE PREPARING FOR
13 OUR NEXT ROUND OF FORMAL ENGAGEMENTS WITH THE AD-HOC
14 COMMITTEES AND THE ADVISORY GROUP ITSELF IN APRIL AND MAY.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS. I THOUGHT THAT WAS HELPFUL,
17 BECAUSE IT'S NOT CAST IN STONE WHERE IT IS TODAY. YOU HEARD A
18 LOT, AND WE'LL BE MOVING FORWARD. THAT WILL BRING US TO AGENDA
19 ITEM NUMBER SIX, AS WE HAVE BEEN REVIEWING THE CONSULTANTS
20 BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS EMPHASIZING IMPORTANCE OF ENGAGING IN
21 THE STAKEHOLDER PROCESS AND THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS WORKING
22 WITH INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEWEES STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNICATIONS,
23 WE'LL HAVE WORKING SESSIONS WITH MTC OPERATORS AND TECHNICAL
24 STAFF, EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISCUSSIONS AT MAJOR MILESTONE POINTS
25 VARIOUS PRESENTATIONS TO TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARDS, THE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 CONSULTANT REFERENCED AD HOC COMMITTEE DEDICATED TO A
2 PARTICULAR TOPIC WE CAN GET INTO THIS IN THE NEXT MEETING. WE
3 DIDN'T GET INTO NEXT STEPS WE TRUNCATED OUR MEETING. WE HAVE
4 ODD MOCK PROSPECTS, IN APRIL TO REVIEW THE EVALUATION
5 FRAMEWORK ALTERNATIVES AND CRITERIA. THIS IS VERY MUCH A WORK
6 IN PROGRESS AND MID-JUNE TO REVIEW PRELIMINARY EVALUATION
7 FINDINGS. DECISIONS WILL NOT BE MADE AT THE AD-HOC LEVEL BUT
8 THE AD HOC WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO FOCUS ON ISSUES AND
9 STRUCTURE. THE AD HOC COMMITTEE WILL SPEND TIME. AND I THINK
10 IT'S NECESSARY TO ENSURE THE WORK IS GROUNDED IN REALITY AND
11 CONSIDERING HOW BEST TO ADVANCE REGIONAL CONNECTIVITY. THAT'S
12 THE PURPOSE OF IT. IF THERE IS SIGNIFICANT CONCERNS ABOUT THAT
13 PURPOSE, I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR THAT. OTHERWISE I WOULD SUGGEST
14 WE COME UP WITH SOME GROUP THAT FROM THIS BODY TO PARTICIPATE
15 IN AD-HOC COMMITTEES AND IN THE SPIRIT OF THIS BODY IT MAKES
16 SENSE FOR THREE TRANSIT REPRESENTATIVE, THREE STAKEHOLDER REPS
17 AND MTC REP. DIFFERENT MEMBERS MAY BE CHOSEN DEPEND ON
18 DIFFERENT TOPIC AREAS BUT AT THIS JUNCTURE THERE IS STILL A
19 LOT INFLUX. AT THIS TIME I'LL PAUSE AND ASK WHAT YOU THINK
20 ABOUT THAT APPROACH AND TO SEE IF ANYONE HAS IDEAS ABOUT THAT?
21 IF YOU FEEL THIS WILL HELP MOVE FORWARD IN AN EXPEDITIOUS
22 MATTER, OR DIVING INTO THE WEEDS WHILE OTHERS WANT TO STAY AT
23 POLICY LEVEL. I'LL LOOK FOR HANDS. IT'S BEEN A LONG MORNING,
24 DID WE WEAR EVERYBODY OUT.
25



MARCH 7, 2022

1 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** CAN YOU DO THAT MIX AGAIN?

2

3 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THREE TRANSIT AGENCIES, THREE
4 STAKEHOLDERS, AND ONE MTC. THAT WOULD BE A LESS THAN QUORUM
5 OF THIS BODY. A SMALLER GROUP THAT COULD DIVE INTO THE WEEDS
6 AND INVESTMENT A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF TIME IN A COUPLE OF
7 JUNCTURES TO GUIDE THE CONSULTANTS EVERYTHING WOULD COME BACK
8 TO THIS BODY AND THE PUBLIC WOULD BE PRESENTED TO WEIGH IN.
9 EVERYONE IS MULLING IT OVER

10

11 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THAT SOUNDS REASONABLE AND FAIR TO ME. I WOULD
12 SUPPORT IT.

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** BOB POWERS?

15

16 **ROBERT POWERS:** CHAIR, PERSONALLY --

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS CHAIRPERSON. I THINK THAT DOES MAKE
21 SENSE TO ME, TOO, I THINK IT WOULD BE QUITE HELPFUL FOR, TO
22 HAVE THAT WORK GROUP, OR AD-HOC GROUP AS YOU'RE CALLING IT,
23 KIND OF WORKING THE TOPIC AND BRINGING IT BACK TO THE BROADER
24 TOPIC, AND MAYBE EVEN IN SOME CONTEXT, COCREATE, YOU KNOW, AND
25 KIND OF STRATEGIZE, AND I THINK IT'S A GOOD THING. I'M NOT



MARCH 7, 2022

1 SURE ABOUT THE TIMING OF THE MEETINGS, YOU SAID TWO TIMES
2 BETWEEN NOW AND SOME DATE IN THE FUTURE? I WOULD -- YOU KNOW,
3 FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, I WOULD LEAVE THAT OPEN A LITTLE BIT,
4 AND, YOU KNOW, THAT MIGHT BE A FLOOR, BUT AS THE TOPIC COMES
5 UP, WE MAY NEED TO GET THAT AD-HOC COMMITTEE TO MEET AN
6 ADDITIONAL TIME BUT I THINK IT'S A GOOD IDEA.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** CLEARLY TO ADD INPUT AND SPEND TIME
9 DIVING INTO THE DETAILS. DO OTHERS HAVE THOUGHTS ON THAT? IF
10 NOT THAT BRINGS US TO PUBLIC COMMENT. WALLY DO WE HAVE ANY
11 MEMBERS. PUBLIC THAT WISH TO WEIGH IN?

12

13 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** NO. THERE ARE NO -- YES. THERE IS ONE
14 PUBLIC COMMENT. JILL BORDERS. BE READY TO SPEAK.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I ATTENDED LAST MONTH'S MEETING AND I
17 ATTENDED THIS MONTH'S MEETING, I'M TRYING REALLY HARD TO
18 UNDERSTAND THINGS. AS FAR AS STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT, WHAT I
19 WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE IS -- AND I'M GOING TO USE THE
20 PHRASE, AUTHENTIC FEEDBACK. SO, WHEN THE MTC AND ABAG WERE
21 PUTTING TOGETHER ON GETTING FEEDBACK TOGETHER FOR THE PLANNED
22 BAY AREA 2040, I BELIEVE, I JUST FELT LIKE THAT FEEDBACK THEY
23 GATHERED WAS VERY, VERY SUPERFICIAL. AND WHAT I MEAN BY THAT
24 IS, IT WAS KIND OF PRE-SETUP WHAT YOU GUYS WANTED -- I KNOW
25 YOU'RE ALL VARIOUS AGENCIES -- BUT WHAT THE MTC AND ABAG WERE



MARCH 7, 2022

1 KIND OF LOOKING FOR, KIND OF, THIS IS THE RESULTS WE WANT TO
2 HAVE. THIS IS THE PLAN WE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE AND CLOSING THAT
3 LOOP ON SAYING THAT FEEDBACK THAT WAS RECEIVED COINCIDED WITH
4 THAT GOAL. AND I SINCERELY HOPE THAT THE FEEDBACK YOU LOOK FOR
5 IS AUTHENTIC. AND I'M NOT EXACTLY SURE HOW DO YOU THAT, BUT
6 MIGHT BE SOMETHING LIKE SOMEBODY DEVELOPS AN APP AND RIDERS
7 WOULD HAVE THAT APP IF YOU'RE ABLE TO DO IT ON A PILOT BASIS
8 FOLLOWS THEM IN THEIR TRAVELS FOR OF THE FIRST 90 DAYS AND SO
9 IT'S KIND OF DISCONNECTED FROM ANY SORT OF SET MISUNDERSTOOD
10 SET. YOU KNOW? YOU'RE GETTING DATA THAT'S GOING TO SHOW YOU
11 WHERE THEY WENT, WHAT THEY WERE TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH. JUST A
12 THOUGHT. THANK YOU.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS, JILL.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE IS NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENT.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THAT'S IT?

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN, CHAIR:** THANKS, WALLY. THANKS, JILL. I WOULD
25 LIKE TO THANK THE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FOR STAYING WITH US



MARCH 7, 2022

1 TODAY AND FOR THEIR ARDENT INTEREST IN TRANSIT. I WOULD LIKE
2 TO THANK THE ADVISORY GROUP FOR ALL OF YOUR THOUGHTFUL
3 COMMENTS TODAY. AND ESPECIALLY TO THANK MTC STAFF AND THE
4 CONSULTING TEAM. THE NEXT MEETING OF THIS GROUP WILL BE
5 SCHEDULED FOR MONDAY MAY 2ND AT 1:00 P.M. AND MTC STAFF WILL
6 BE CONFIRMING THE DATE IN THE COMING WEEKS. IF THERE ARE NO
7 LAST THOUGHTS. I'M LOOKING TO HANDS RAISED. SEEING NONE. I'LL
8 ADJOURN US. THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE TODAY AND THE
9 THOUGHTFUL CONVERSATION. TAKE CARE. [ADJOURNED]

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37



Broadcasting Government