

1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
3	COMMITTEE
4	FRIDAY, JANUARY 14, 2022 9:45 AM
5	
6	
7	
8	JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. BEFORE
9	I CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER I WANT TO SAY THAT PLANE BEHIND ME
10	IS PROBABLY ONE OF THE ONLY AIR FORCE PLANES THAT ALIX
11	BOCKELMAN'S DAD HASN'T FLOWN. FOR YOU HISTORIANS YOU PROBABLY
12	ASSOCIATE THE NAME OF THIS PLANE IT'S FRANCES GARY POWERS. YOU
13	ALL KNOW ENOUGH ABOUT THE HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE. I WOULD
14	LIKE TO CALL THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG
15	ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER. WE'LL CALL MTC QUORUM AND
16	CONSENT CALENDAR THEN TURN TO YOU FOR YOURS AND ABAG
17	ANNOUNCEMENTS.
18	
19	JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: ABSOLUTELY.
20	
21	JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: WITH THAT IF WE COULD TAKE
22	THE ROLL CALL FOR THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE WILL DO AFTER THE BROADCAST TEAM ROLLS
25	THE ANNOUNCEMENT.

1

JANUARY 14, 2022

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU. I'M SORRY. 2 3 [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO 4 5 THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST 6 ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, 7 8 PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING 9 10 COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR 11 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS 12 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD 13 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL 14 15 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE 16 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR 17 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS 18 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT 19 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO 20 21 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD 22 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR 23 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE 24 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. 25



1	PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
2	NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
3	MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.
4	
5	JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: ROLL CALL.
6	
7	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SPERING?
8	
9	JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: PRESENT.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?
12	
13	EDDIE AHN: PRESENT.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA? CONNOLY?
16	
17	DAMON CONNOLLY: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?
20	
21	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING?
24	
25	VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE.



```
1
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: GIOCAPINI NON-VOTING?
2
3
   DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
4
5
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: LICCARDO? COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? WE HAVE A
6
7
    OUORUM.
8
9
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. I SEE MAYOR SCHAFF IS
    WITH US. SO, SHE HASN'T LEARNED HOW TO UNMUTE YET. WE'RE GOING
10
    TO SEND A TECHNICAL STAFF OVER TO HELP HER DO THAT.
11
12
    LIBBY SCHAAF: YOU CAN NOT HEAR ME NOW.
13
14
15
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: I HEAR YOU.
16
   LIBBY SCHAAF: OKAY.
17
18
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: [LAUGHTER]
19
20
21
   KAREN MITCHOFF: MARTHA DID YOU CALL ME?
22
23
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THIS IS MTC.
24
25
   KAREN MITCHOFF: OKAY.
```



```
1
2
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: WITH THAT WE DO HAVE A
3
    QUORUM. MTC COMMISSIONERS, WE'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE
    THE MTC CONSENT CALENDAR.
4
5
    CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: MTC APPROVAL.
6
7
8
   LIBBY SCHAAF: SECOND.
9
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE
10
11
    ANY WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE OR ANYONE THAT WANTS TO SPEAK ON
    CONSENT? MARTHA?
12
13
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14
    THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
15
16
    ON THIS ITEM.
17
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. MOTION AND SECONDS.
18
    COULD YOU TAKE THE ROLL, PLEASE?
19
20
21
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR SPERING?
22
    JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: YES.
23
24
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR AHN?
25
```



EDDIE AHN, V. CHAIR: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR CANEPA? DAVID CANEPA: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: CONNOLY? DAMON CONNOLLY: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: ER AND FLEMING? VICTORIA FLEMING: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF? LIBBY SCHAAF: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU. MAYOR ARREGUIN, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU.



JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU SO 1 MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE ABAG CLERK OF THE BOARD TO 2 3 CONDUCT ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM WHETHER QUORUM OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE IS PRESENT. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR EKLUND? 6 7 8 **PAT ECKLUND: HERE.** 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLIGOR? 10 11 NEYSA FLIGOR: HERE. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HUDSON? 14 15 16 DAVID E. HUDSON: HERE. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: LEE? MANDELMAN? ABSENT. SOME MITCHOFF? SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF, I SEE YOU ARE HERE. COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ 19 IS ABSENT. THE SUPERVISOR RABBIT? 20 21 22 DAVID RABBIT: HERE. 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR RAMOS? 24 25



```
BELIA RAMOS: HERE.
1
2
3
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO?
4
5
    CARLOS ROMERO: HERE.
6
7
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR WILSON IS ABSENT. ONE MORE TIME FOR
8
    SUPERVISOR LEE? SUPERVISOR LEE IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.
9
    KAREN MITCHOFF: FRED, I'M SO SORRY. YOU HAVE GOT ME?
10
11
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, MA'AM.
12
13
14
    KAREN MITCHOFF: THANK YOU.
15
16
    JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: THANK YOU. QUORUM
17
    IS PRESENT. ITEM TWO, ABAG COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. I'LL ASK
    THE CLERK TO READ THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT FOR THE
18
    RECORD.
19
20
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE
21
    FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG BOARD IN
22
    ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN
23
    AMOUNT OF $500 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH
24
25
    EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.
```

JANUARY 14, 2022

1 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: ITEM THREE ABAG CONSENT 2 3 CALENDAR MINUTES OF DECEMBER 10TH, 2021. MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES? 4 5 SPEAKER: MOTION. 6 7 8 PAT ECKLUND: SECOND. 9 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: MOTION AND SECOND. 10 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED ON 11 THIS ITEM? 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 15 16 ON THIS ITEM. 17 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: OKAY. THAT BRINGS 18 19 US TO ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE ITEM. 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR ARREGUIN? 21 22 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: YES. 23 24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: EKLUND? 25



PAT ECKLUND: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLIGOR? NEYSA FLIGOR: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MAYOR HUDSON? DAVID E. HUDSON: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR LEE? **OTTO LEE:** YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, SIR. SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN? ABSENT. MITCHOFF? KAREN MITCHOFF: YES. CLERK OF THE BOARD: COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RABBIT? DAVID RABBIT: YES.



CLERK OF THE BOARD: PERALEZ? ABSENT. ROMERO? 1 2 3 CARLOS ROMERO: YES. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR WILSON IS ABSENT. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY 6 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 7 8 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BACK TO MTC CHAIR SPERING. 9 10 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THIS ITEM IS SEA LEVEL RISE 11 FUNDING INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK. MATT YOU'RE GOING TO INTRODUCE 12 AND RACHEL IT CARRY FROM THERE. 13 14 MATT MALONEY: MATT MALONEY REGIONAL PLANNING DIRECTOR FOR MTC 15 16 AND ABAG WE HAVE TWO ITEMS ON THE AGENDA TODAY FIRST ONE IS SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING AND INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK WE'RE 17 RETURNING TO YOU TODAY WITH THIS ITEM. IF YOU RECALL WE 18 PRESENTED TO THIS COMMITTEE BACK IN JULY AND SINCE THAT TIME, 19 WE HAVE WORKED TO REFINE THE SCOPE OF THE EFFORT IN 20 21 PARTNERSHIP WITH BCDC. AND JUST AS A REMINDER, YOU KNOW, EVERYTHING WE DO IS RELATED, OF COURSE, TO PLANNED BAY AREA 22 2050, AND THAT PLAN ESTIMATED A NEARLY \$20 BILLION NEED TO 23 ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION. AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN 24 REALLY IDENTIFIED THE NEED FOR THIS STUDY. AND THE PURPOSE OF 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

IT IS REALLY TO IMPROVE THE REGIONAL ACCOUNTING OF SEA LEVEL 1 RISE COSTS AND POTENTIAL FUTURE REVENUE SOURCES. WE THINK THIS 2 3 EFFORT IS VERY TIMELY, GIVEN NEW ACTIONS BY THE STATE LEGISLATURE, WHICH HAS IDENTIFIED NEW FUNDING FOR RESILIENCE. 4 5 AND WE DO BELIEVE THAT THE STATE BEARS SIGNIFICANT RESPONSIBILITY FOR ULTIMATELY FUNDING THESE TYPES OF PROJECTS. 6 AND YOU KNOW, MOST IMPORTANTLY, I THINK TODAY WE JUST WANT TO 7 8 FORMALIZE THIS PARTNERSHIP WITH BCDC TODAY. WE ARE CONTINUING TO USE THE JOINT COMMITTEE OF MTC AND ABAG TO SHOWCASE OUR 9 WORK BUT WE'RE ALSO PLANNING TO PROVIDE UPDATES ON THIS STUDY 10 THROUGH BCDC COMMITTEES AS WELL AS THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD 11 THROUGHOUT THE NEXT YEAR. AND WE HAVE A NUMBER OF STAFF HERE 12 TODAY, FROM BOTH BCDC AND MTC AND ON THE MTC SIDE, RACHEL 13 HARTOFELIS IS HERE. SHE'LL BE GIVING A PRESENTATION ON BEHALF 14 OF MTC, ALSO MICHAEL GERMERAAD, AND DAVE VAUTIN, OF COURSE, 15 16 WHO YOU KNOW VERY WELL. AND ON THE BCDC SIDE, NICHOLAS SANDER IS HERE WHO WILL ALSO BE PRESENTING WITH RACHEL. I BELIEVE 17 BCDC DIRECTOR LARRY GOLDZBAND IS HERE, AS WELL AS PLANNING 18 DIRECTOR OF BCDC, JESSICA. WE HAVE NUMEROUS PARTNERSHIPS HERE 19 TO ANSWER ANY OF YOUR OUESTIONS. WITH THAT I'LL PASS IT OVER 20 21 TO NICHOLAS FROM BCDC, I THINK, IS GOING TO KICKOFF THE 22 PRESENTATION.

23

24 NICHOLAS SANDER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE.
25 I'M NICHOLAS SANDER FROM BCDC HERE WITH RACHEL HARTOFELIS, MTC

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 14, 2022

AND ABAG WE WANT TO DISCUSS A JOINT EFFORT TO DISCUSS SEA 1 LEVEL RISE FUNDING INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK. WE'LL WALK THROUGHOUT 2 3 CONTEXT OF SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING EFFORTS, REGIONAL OVERVIEW OF FUNDING FRAMEWORK AND NEXT STEPS FOR JOINT WORK. THE 4 5 FRAMEWORK WILL PREPARE FOR ADAPTATION IN TWO-WAYS COMPETITIVENESS WITH A CLEAR UNDERSTANDING FOR ADAPTATION COST 6 AND NEEDS AND EXPLORE HOW WE CAN AUGMENT STATE AND FEDERAL 7 8 NEEDS FOR FUNDING SOURCES. GRAPHIC ILLUSTRATES HOW SEA LEVEL RISE HAS BEEN ADDRESSED IN THE REGION. MTC ABAG PLAN 2050 AND 9 THE ESTUARY BLUEPRINT UPDATE, BAY ADAPT ADOPTED BY BCDC 10 COMMISSION IN OCTOBER HAS ADDRESSED PRIORITY ACTIONS AGAINST 11 LONG-TERM SEA LEVEL RISE, THE PRIORITY IS IDENTIFYING STEPS 12 FOR IMPLEMENTATION. PLANNED BAY AREA ADOPTED ON THE SAME DAY 13 AS THE JOINT PLATFORM IN OCTOBER IS A MULTIFACETED REGIONAL 14 15 PLAN THAT ADDRESSES HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, ECONOMIC, AND 16 ENVIRONMENTAL CONDITIONS. ADAPTING TO SEA LEVEL RISE IS 1 OF 35 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN. MEANWHILE THE SF ESTUARY 17 PARTNERSHIP IS INCLUDING AN UPDATE TO THE ESTUARY BLUEPRINT A 18 REGIONAL PLAN TO ACHIEVE A HEALTHY AND RESILIENCE SAN 19 FRANCISCO ESTUARY THROUGH EACH PLANNING PROCESSES STAFF AT ALL 20 AGENCIES HAVE WORKED CLOSELY TO ALIGN ALL THREE EFFORTS. 21 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 INCLUDED ENVIRONMENTAL ELEMENTS TO 22 ADDRESS ENVIRONMENTAL PRIORITIES THROUGHOUT THE REGION 23 ADAPTING TO SEA LEVEL RISE STRATEGY INCLUDED A RANGE OF 24 ADAPTATION ACTIONS ACROSS THE REGION TO ADDRESS FIRST TWO FEET 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

OF PERMANENT SEA LEVEL RISE PART OF THE PLANNING PROCESS 1 ASSESSMENT WAS DEVELOPED. A \$19 BILLION NEED TO ADDRESS A 2 3 SEGMENT OF SHORELINE, RESULTING IN A \$60 BILLION GAP. CRITICALLY AS PART OF THE PROCESS WE DID NOT STUDY SEA LEVEL 4 5 RISE SPECIFIC REVENUE MEASURES TO ADDRESS THE FUNDING GAP FILLING THE GAP WILL REQUIRE A MIX OF FUNDING STATE AND 6 7 FEDERAL OPPORTUNITIES THAT HAVE EMERGED IN THE LAST SIX MONTHS 8 HAVE PROVIDED OPPORTUNITY TO SPRING BOARD ACTION RESILIENCE FRAMEWORK WILL ACCOUNT FOR THESE NEW REVENUES AND WILL BE USED 9 TO SUPPORT NEAR-TERM ACTION TO COMPETE FOR EXISTING FUNDING 10 11 FOR FRAMEWORK. OPPORTUNITY WILL EXPLORE PROS AND CONS OF FUNDING SOURCES THAT WILL BE NEEDED TO SUPPORT STATE AND 12 FEDERAL INVESTMENT AND INCREASE COMPETITIVE EDGE FOR STATE AND 13 FEDERAL FUNDING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BCDC COMPLETED FUNDING 14 15 ANALYSIS FOR FUNDING AND FINANCE WHITE PAPER SUMMARIZING SEA 16 LEVEL RISE DAMAGE TO THE REST OF THE REGION COMPARISON INCLUDING INFORMATION AROUND SEA LEVEL RISE WATER ECOSYSTEM 17 IMPACT AND POLICY CHANGES. COSTS WERE COMPARED WITH FUNDING 18 NEEDS ESTIMATED BY PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AS WELL AS UC 19 BERKELEY STUDY COMPARED WITH ESTIMATED REGIONAL FUNDING SUPPLY 20 BASED ON JURISDICTIONAL FINANCIAL DATA ANALYSIS RESULTED IN 21 22 ESTIMATED REGIONAL GAP EXPRESSED PER CAPITA PER HOUSEHOLD PER 23 PARCEL AS PERCENTAGE OF GDP ANALYSIS BY MTC AND ABAG THE WHITE PAPER DID NOT STUDY MEASURES TO FILL POTENTIAL FUNDING GAPS. 24 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS WE HAVE PREVIOUSLY REFERENCED NEAR-TERM 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 14, 2022

FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES HAVE DEVELOPED AT STATE LEVEL 2021 1 BUDGET ACT APPROVED BY STATE LEGISLATORS IDENTIFIED \$15 2 BILLION IN FUNDING THROUGHOUT THE NEXT FEW YEARS \$3.86 BILLION 3 IDENTIFIED FOR CLIMATE RESILIENCE A PORTION OF FUNDING REVENUE 4 5 IS LIKELY TO BE DISTRIBUTED ACROSS THE STATE TO ADDRESS A VARIETY OF HAZARDS FUNDING MAY BE ABLE TO FUND CRITICAL NEAR-6 7 TERM SEA LEVEL RISE PRIORITIES SUCH AS SHOVEL READY PROJECTS 8 AS WELL AS REGIONAL PLANNING ADAPTATION PLANNING IN THE BAY AREA. HOWEVER THERE IS A SUBSTANTIAL FUNDING GAP FOR SEA LEVEL 9 RISE ADAPTATION UNDERSCORING THE NEED FOR TO RESEARCH 10 ADDITIONAL REVENUE SOURCES FOR SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION IN 11 THE YEARS AHEAD PREPARING FOR NEAR-TERM STATE AND FUNDING 12 OPPORTUNITIES IMPROVING ADVOCACY FOR ADDITIONAL STATE AND 13 FEDERAL RESOURCES AND INFORM LONGER TERM APPROACH FOR LOCAL 14 15 AND REGIONAL ACTION TO AUGMENT STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDS. 16 ACTIONS NEEDED TO PREPARE FOR SEA LEVEL RISE IDENTIFYING SIMILAR ACTIONS FOR REGIONAL FUNDING PLANS TO IDENTIFY FUNDING 17 NEEDS AND ESTABLISH FUNDING APPROACHES. IN THE PLATFORM 6.1 18 AND 6.2 CALL TO EXPAND UNDERSTANDING OF FINANCIAL COST 19 REVENUES ASSOCIATED WITH ADAPTATION AND ESTABLISH FRAMEWORK 20 FOR FUNDING PLANS AND PROJECTS. ADAPTATION TO FUNDING SEA 21 22 LEVEL RISE IN THE NEXT FIVE YEARS AND BLUEPRINT CURRENTLY 23 INCLUDES OPTION TO DEVELOP SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK IN THE NEXT FIVE YEARS. I'LL HAND IT OVER TO MY 24 COLLEAGUE RACHEL HARTOFELIS TO ADDRESS THE FRAMEWORK. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

JANUARY 14, 2022

RACHAEL HARTOFELIS: THANK YOU, NICK. IN SEPTEMBER 2021 THE 2 3 BARC GOVERNING BOARD APPROVED THE JOINT -- EXCUSE ME -- NEXT SLIDE -- THANK YOU. SO IN SEPTEMBER THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD 4 5 APPROVED THE JOINT RESOLUTION TO ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE WHICH INCLUDED CREATION OF A SHARED WORK PLAN. THE SHARED WORK PLAN 6 WILL ADVANCE STRATEGIC COORDINATED IMPLEMENTATION OF HIGH 7 8 PRIORITY ACTIONS IDENTIFIED IN REGIONAL AGENCY PLANS AND PLATFORMS OVER THE NEXT 1 TO 5 YEARS. DEVELOPING A SEA LEVEL 9 RISE ADAPTATION FUNDING INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK IS AN EXAMPLE OF 10 HOW HIGH PRIORITY IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS IDENTIFY IN THESE 11 ADOPTED AGENCY PLANS CAN BE IMPLEMENTED AND COORDINATED IN A 12 SINGLE SHARED APPROACH. AFTER PRESENTING TO THIS COMMITTEE 13 LAST JULY THE CONCEPT OF FRAMEWORK HAS BEEN ADJUSTED IN ITS 14 15 SCOPE SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION FUNDING AND INVESTMENT 16 FRAMEWORK WILL BE COLEAD BY MTC AND BCDC FOR WORK TO BECOME A 17 RESOURCE FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AND ADVOCATES PURSUING SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING THROUGHOUT THE REGION. FRAMEWORK PRESENTED 18 TO BARC LAST MONTH AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO SHARE UPDATES WITH 19 THE GOVERNING BOARD AS THE PROJECT DEVELOPS THROUGHOUT 2022 20 21 FOR ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK AND COLLABORATION MTC AND ABAG AND BCDC WILL BRING UPDATES TO STAFF AS NEEDED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. 22 MTC ABAG AND BCDC HAVE COLLABORATIVELY DEVELOPED A CONCEPT OF 23 SEA LEVEL RISE AND ADAPTATION INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK BUILD OFF 24 PRIOR RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS TO ADVANCE OUR REGIONAL 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 14, 2022

UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT IT WILL COST THE REGION TO ADAPT TO SEA 1 LEVEL RISE AS WELL AS TO EXPLORE THE MOST EQUITABLE MEANS TO 2 3 RAISE NEW REVENUES TO ADDRESS THE FUNDING GAP. AS PART OF THIS WORK PLAN WE STARTED BY IDENTIFYING A NUMBER OF GOALS FOR THE 4 5 FRAMEWORK AND WILL DISCUSS THREE OVERARCHING GOALS OF THE WORK FOR YOU TODAY. FIRST GOAL IS TO UPDATE AND IMPROVE THE 6 REGIONAL ACCOUNTING OF SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION PROJECTS 7 8 CREATING A VERSION 2.0 OF THE PREVIOUS REGIONAL ANALYSIS DONE BY MTC ABAG AND BCDC. WITH A REFINED UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT IT 9 MAY COST THE REGION TO ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE WE CAN BETTER 10 ADVOCATE FOR REGIONAL ADAPTATION NEEDS AT STATE AND FEDERAL 11 LEVEL THIS RESEARCH WILL ALSO IMPROVE OUR REGION'S ESTIMATES 12 ON THE COST OF ADAPTATION ACROSS THE REGION AND IT WILL REFINE 13 HOW MUCH REVENUE FROM EXISTING SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING SOURCES 14 WE CAN ANTICIPATE TO DO THIS WE WILL ENGAGE CLOSELY WITH LOCAL 15 16 GOVERNMENTS AND PARTNERS TO UNDERSTAND THE STATUS OF LOCAL ADAPTATION PLANS STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS TO UPDATE PRIOR 17 REGIONAL ANALYSIS. HELPING TO IDENTIFY AREAS WITH OR WITHOUT 18 19 KNOWN PLANS FOR SHORELINE ADAPTATION: THIS ACCOUNTING WILL BE USED DIRECTLY FOR THE FRAMEWORK ANALYSIS AND IT WILL ALSO BE 20 SHARED AND MAINTAINED AS A RESOURCE FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT 21 22 PLANNING. IT WILL ALSO BE USED TO SUPPORT FUTURE REGIONAL 23 ADVOCACY FOR NEW STATE AND FEDERAL ADAPTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SECOND GOAL EXPLORES HOW NEW LOCAL AND REGIONAL 24 REVENUES FOR SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION CAN BE RAISED MORE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 14, 2022

EOUITABLY. THE REGION HAS MANY PRIORITIES AND EXISTING REVENUE 1 SOURCES ARE UNLIKELY TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT THE REGION'S 2 3 SHORELINE ADAPTATION NEEDS NEAR-TERM STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES WILL HELP THE REGION BUT WE CAN'T COUNT ON 4 5 SACRAMENTO TO PAY FOR 100% OF THIS WEATHER RAISING FUNDS TO MATCH FEDERAL AND STATE DOLLARS OR RAISING ADDITIONAL REVENUES 6 7 BEYOND WHAT THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT OFFER TO HELP 8 INFORM LOCAL AND REGIONAL MEASURES TO AUGMENT ADAPTATION FUNDING IN THE NEAR-TERM. MEANT RECENT STUDIES HAVE IDENTIFIED 9 POTENTIAL TOOLS FOR ADAPTATION INCLUDING BY DESIGN AND LEGACY 10 11 FUNDS EVEN WITH PREVIOUS ANALYSIS DONE BY MTC AND ABAG AS MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY THERE IS NOT YET AN APPLIED ANALYSIS OF 12 POTENTIAL NEW FUNDING SOURCE FOR THE BAY AREA. THE FRAMEWORK 13 WILL FILL THIS EXISTING RESEARCH GAP TO ANALYZE A RANGE OF 14 ADDITIONAL REVENUE MEASURES AT DIFFERENT SCALES TO IDENTIFY 15 16 APPROACHES TO BUILD THE FUNDING GAP MORE EQUITABLY. THE BAY AREA SHORELINE IS BURIED AND THE TIMING OF FLOODING, THE LAND 17 18 USE CHARACTERISTIC AROUND THE SHORELINE AND LOCATION OF 19 COMMUNITIES AND RESOURCES CAN ALL IMPACT HOW WE WILL RAISE NEW REVENUE. STAFF WILL WORK WITH STAKEHOLDERS TO VISUALIZE THE 20 21 EQUITY OUTCOMES OF DIFFERENT APPROACHES BEFORE PUBLICALLY 22 SHARING RESULTS THROUGHOUT THE REGION THIS RESULT IN ANALYSIS 23 WILL SUPPORT FUTURE ADVOCACY IN SUPPORT SUGGEST NEW REVENUE LOCAL AND REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURES TO SUPPORT LONG-TERM 24 SHORELINE ADAPTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE FINAL MAJOR 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

PROJECT GOAL IS TO DETERMINE POSSIBLE MECHANISMS TO DISTRIBUTE 1 NEW FUND FOR ADAPTATION. PLANS REVIEW EXISTING LOCAL AND 2 3 REGIONAL FUNDING MECHANISMS THAT MAYBE APPLICABLE FOR SEA LEVEL RISE PROJECTS. WE ALSO WANT TO IDENTIFY OPPORTUNITIES 4 5 FOR HOW NEW REVENUE MEASURES CAN BEST BE DESIGNED TO FILL ANTICIPATED FUNDING GAPS ACROSS THE REGION FOR A DIVERSE RANGE 6 7 OF ADAPTATION PROJECT NEEDS. FRAMEWORK WILL BUILD ON THE 8 DISTRIBUTION OF NEAR-TERM STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING MEASURES AS WELL AS THE PREPARATION FOR THE LONG-TERM BY UNDERSTANDING 9 FUNDING MECHANISMS AT THE LOCAL OR REGIONAL LEVEL. THESE 10 RECOMMENDATIONS WILL BE REVIEWED BY LOCAL AND COMMUNITY 11 STAKEHOLDERS BEFORE PUBLICALLY SHARING THESE RESULTS 12 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. AND AS WITH THE RESULTS OF THE SECOND 13 GOAL THE OUTCOME OF THIS RESEARCH MAY BE USED TO INFORM FUTURE 14 ADVOCACY BRINGING REVENUES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE HAVE 15 16 IDENTIFIED A NUMBER OF WAYS TO MOVE FORWARD ON THIS WORK IN THE COMING MONTHS. WE PLAN TO KICKOFF THE FRAMEWORK BY SETTING 17 18 SEA LEVEL RISE AND DATA ASSUMPTIONS MAINTAIN A TECHNICAL 19 WORKING GROUP AND BY WORKING WITH LOCAL PARTNERS TO UPDATE OUR UNDERSTANDING OF LOCAL ADAPTATION PROJECTS. STAFF WILL ALSO 20 CONTINUE TO ALIGN THIS PROJECT WITH THE BARC SHARED WORK PLAN 21 22 AS IT DEVELOPS AS WELL AS OTHER BAY ADAPT JOINT PLATFORM ACTIONS. UPDATES ON THE FRAMEWORK WILL CONTINUE TO BE BROUGHT 23 TO MTC ABAG AS WELL AS TO THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD AND BCDC 24 THROUGHOUT 2022. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THANK YOU. SO, WE ARE 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

LOOKING FORWARD TO THE WAYS THAT THE FRAMEWORK WILL HELP TO 1 PREPARE THE REGION TO TACKLE THIS CLIMATE CRISIS WITH NEW 2 3 ADAPTATION MEASURES BECOMING AVAILABLE AT THE STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL THIS RESEARCH WILL IMPROVE OUR COMPETITIVENESS 4 5 WHILE IDENTIFYING WAYS TO AUGMENT NEAR-TERM FUNDING 6 OPPORTUNITIES ON THE LOCAL AND REGIONAL LEVELS. SO WE WOULD LIKE TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND ATTENTION TODAY AS WE 7 8 INTRODUCE THIS UPCOMING WORK AND WE'LL OPEN IT UP NOW FOR ANY POTENTIAL OUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION. 9 10 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. GOOD REPORT. 11 LARRY GOLDZBAND IS WITH US. LARRY, DID YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS 12 BEFORE I GO TO THE COMMISSIONERS OR BOARD MEMBERS? 13 14 LARRY GOLDZBAND: PARDON ME, AS I PUT ON MY VIDEO. I THINK THEY 15 16 DID A GREAT JOB. BUT WHAT CAN YOU EXPECT FROM TWO GREAT 17 STAFFERS. 18 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU, LARRY. ONE 19 QUESTION IS, ARE WE MAKING THE CASE THAT, OF WHAT THE COST 20 21 WILL BE IF WE DO NOTHING? IS THAT CASE BEING MADE? RACHEL? 22 RACHAEL HARTOFELIS: SO, AS A PART OF THIS ANALYSIS, WE WILL BE 23 LOOKING AT THE VULNERABILITY OF THE REGION, AND A BIG PART OF 24 THIS WORK WILL BE UNDERSTANDING WHERE WE HAVE PLANS FOR THE 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

REGION AND WHERE THERE ARE NOT YET PLANS. SO I THINK THAT WILL
 REALLY HELP TO ILLUSTRATE HOW PREPARED THE REGION MAY BE FOR
 ADAPTATION IN THE FUTURE. IT'S UNCLEAR IF WE'LL BE ABLE TO
 IDENTIFY THE COST OF INACTION, BUT WE WILL IDENTIFY A MUCH
 MORE ROBUST SENSE OF REGIONAL NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT
 DEFICIT IS, AND WHAT THE FUNDING GAP IS TO ADAPT TO THE REGION
 FOR, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE CAN EXPECT IN THE FUTURE.

8

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: I JUST THINK IT'S IMPORTANT
WITH THE TREMENDOUS SHORTFALLS WE HAVE, WE'RE GOING TO NEED
PUBLIC SUPPORT. AND THE PUBLIC NEEDS TO UNDERSTAND THE
IMPORTANCE OF THIS. SO I HOPE WE DON'T OVERLOOK, YOU KNOW,
THAT PUBLIC OUTREACH, AND REALLY BUILDING THE CASE FOR THE
FUNDING SUPPORTS TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE. GINA, I SEE YOU HAVE
YOUR HAND UP?

16

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU, STAFF. GREAT 17 REPORT. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE INCLUSIVE. DIDN'T 18 JURISDICTIONS, LIKE, WE HAVE OUR OWN SEA LEVEL RISE GROUP. SO 19 I WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S TOTALLY INCLUSIVE AS WE MOVE FORWARD 20 21 HERE. AND THEN ADDITIONAL PARTNERS, BECAUSE, SADLY, MY CITY HAD A REAL TRAGIC INCIDENT WHERE TWO PEOPLE DROWNED. SUDDEN 22 SEA LEVEL RISE. PUMPS AND EVERYTHING WERE WORKING. AND PART OF 23 OUR SYSTEM IS CONNECTED TO SFO, AND THEY NEED TO CLEAR OUT A 24 CANAL. SO I DON'T KNOW IF WE'RE ACTUALLY INCLUDING THOSE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



PARTNERS, BUT THIS -- THESE DEATHS ARE STILL A MYSTERY, AND 1 WE'RE INVESTIGATING IT ALL, BUT WE NEED TO INCLUDE THOSE 2 3 PARTNERS, AS WELL. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. 4 5 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. PAT EKLUND. 6 PAT? AND THEN EDDIE. 7 8 PAT ECKLUND: ACTUALLY, CHAIR SPERING, EDDIE HAD HIS HAND UP BEFORE ME. TO BE FAIR. 9 10 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. GO AHEAD EDDIE. 11 12 EDDIE AHN: I'LL GO QUICKLY. I AM INTERESTED IN FOLLOWING THIS 13 BECAUSE I SERVE BOTH COMMISSIONS MTC AND BCDC. I THINK FOR 14 FUTURE PRESENTATIONS, TOO, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND, 15 16 PROBABLY A PRIORITY LIST OF INFRASTRUCTURE WE'RE GOING TO SHORE UP IN ANTICIPATION OF ADAPTING TO CLIMATE CHANGE. 17 ESPECIALLY IF -- I DID BACK OF THE NAPKIN MATH RIGHT NOW BUT 18 IT LOOKS LIKE WE HAVE OVER 80% TO GO IN TERMS OF TRYING TO 19 FUND-RAISE THE ENTIRE AMOUNT OF ADAPTING TO RISING SEA LEVELS 20 21 SO WITH THAT IN MIND JUST KNOWING WHICH PIECE OF 22 INFRASTRUCTURE IS MOST IMPORTANT SO THAT THE BAY AREA REGION FUNCTIONS I THINK WOULD BE GOOD. AND SECOND SMALL THING IS 23 JUST TO HOPEFULLY INCLUDE, IN THE FUTURE, SAN FRANCISCO 24 STAKEHOLDERS, SUCH AS OUR OFFICE OF RESILIENCE AND CAPITAL 25



PLANNING AND MAKE SURE TO FOLLOW UP WITH STAFF TO ENSURE THAT
 THE RIGHT SAN FRANCISCO AGENCIES ARE INCLUDED. THANK YOU.
 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: VERY GOOD COMMENTS, EDDIE.

5 THANK YOU. PAT?

6

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR SPERING. FIRST OF ALL, 7 8 I DID WANT TO SAY GREAT PRESENTATION BY THE STAFF. AND IT'S WONDERFUL TO SEE THAT THE REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS ARE WORKING 9 10 TOGETHER ON AN ISSUE THAT AFFECTS ALL OF US. I, TOO, SERVE ON THE BAY CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION, WHICH IS 11 TRULY AN HONOR. I WANT TO THANK PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, AGAIN, FOR 12 SELECTING ME TO SERVE ON THAT COMMISSION. AFTER HAVING WORKED 13 FOR THE U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY FOR OVER 35 YEARS 14 15 AND THE U.S. ARMY CORP OF ENGINEERS FOR EIGHT, I HAVE FOCUSED 16 PRIMARILY MY WHOLE FEDERAL CAREER ON ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES RELATED TO SAN FRANCISCO BAY AND OTHERS. BUT AT THE DECEMBER 17 MEETING OF THE BCDC COMMISSION, WE DID ADOPT THE SEA LEVEL 18 RISE ADAPTATION PROGRESS GAPS AND NEEDS. AND AS PART THAT 19 DOCUMENT THAT WE ADOPTED, THEY IDENTIFIED THAT THERE WERE 45% 20 21 OF THE JURISDICTIONS AROUND SAN FRANCISCO BAY THAT DO NOT HAVE AN ADAPTATION PLAN. THE SECOND THING IS THAT IN BRIDGING THE 22 GAP DOCUMENT THAT BCDC ALSO ADOPTED, IT'S CLEAR -- IT'S ON 23 PAGE 21, AND I WOULD ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO LOOK AT THIS -- ON 24 25 THE COST ESTIMATES FOR DEALING WITH SEA LEVEL RISE, THEY

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

LOOKED AT TWO FEET, 2.3 FEET, AND 6.6 FEET AND THE DIFFERENT 1 2 FUNDING ADAPTATION COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH THAT, AND THE THREE 3 AGENCIES, I BELIEVE, PICKED THE TWO FEET, WHICH INCLUDES A SEVEN FEET OF SEA LEVEL RISE, PLUS TWO FEET OF FREE BOARD AND 4 5 EXTRA HEAD ROOM. BUT, WHAT IS NOT INCLUDED IN HERE, IN THESE COSTS, IS ENVIRONMENTAL MITIGATION, LAND ACQUISITION, UTILITY 6 RELOCATION, AND MAINTENANCE COST. AND THOSE COSTS, A LOT ARE -7 8 - A LOT -- LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE VERY INVOLVED IN, LIKE, UTILITIES, LIKE SANITARY SEWERS, OR ENVIRONMENTAL MITIGATION, 9 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE VERY INVOLVED IN THAT. SO I REALLY THINK 10 THAT ANY FUNDING REQUEST THAT WE MAKE, WE NEED TO ADD SOME 11 FUNDING FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO BE ABLE TO FINE-TUNE, OR TO 12 DEVELOP THEIR ADAPTATION PLANS. BECAUSE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS HAVE 13 TO BE INVOLVED EVERY STEP OF THE WAY. AND WE HAVE NOT REALLY 14 15 HAD AN ACTIVE ENGAGEMENT WITH THE REGULATORY AGENCIES. AND I 16 THINK BCDC HAS EMPHASIZED AT LEAST IN THE TWO MEETINGS THAT I HAVE ATTENDED, SINCE I WAS APPOINTED, THE NEED TO REALLY REACH 17 OUT TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS. THE MARIN COUNTY MAYORS AND COUNCIL 18 MEMBERS, WE HAVE A CLIMATE CHANGE SUBCOMMITTEE COMPOSED OF A 19 REPRESENTATIVE -- ELECTED REPRESENTATIVE -- OF EACH OF THE 20 21 CITIES AND WE ARE GOING TO BE BRINGING BCDC MAYORS AND COUNCIL MEMBERS CONFERENCE IN JULY SO THEY WILL BE TALKING TO ALL 22 ELECTED OFFICIAL IN MARIN COUNTY IN FEBRUARY ABOUT THIS ISSUE. 23 I REALLY THINK THAT MTC AND BCDC AND SAN FRANCISCO BAY 24 25 RESTORATION AUTHORITY REALLY NEED TO ADVOCATE FOR, NUMBER ONE,



FUNDING FOR CITIES AND COUNTIES TO DO AN ADAPTATION PLAN, AND 1 2 TO IDENTIFY THEIR FINANCIAL NEEDS, AND TO IDENTIFY, 3 SPECIFICALLY, WHAT SHOULD BE FUNDED TO HELP BRIDGE THE GAP SO THAT WE CAN MAKE SURE THAT ESTIMATES THAT WE'RE USING, WHICH 4 5 IS 19 BILLION, WHICH IS A MINIMUM, THAT IT ALSO INCLUDE WHAT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS NEED TO DO THEIR FAIR SHARE OF IT. SO, 6 ANYWAYS, SO I AGREE THAT THE STATE NEEDS TO FUND THIS. LOCAL 7 8 GOVERNMENTS, IN MY OPINION, CANNOT. WE'RE HAVING A TOUGH TIME JUST DOING WHAT WE NEED TO DO. AND ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE LOCAL 9 GOVERNMENTS WHO ARE POOR PROPERTY TAX CITIES, LIKE THE CITY OF 10 NOVATO, WHERE WE ONLY GET \$0.07 ON THE DOLLAR, MOST CITIES GET 11 23 TO \$0.26 ON THE DOLLAR. SO, ANYWAY, COMMENTS FROM MARIN, 12 AND THE NORTH BAY, I THINK THAT WE REALLY NEED TO MAKE A 13 CONCERTED EFFORT TO INCLUDE SOME COST ESTIMATES FOR CITIES 14 15 WHEN WE GO TO THE STATE LEGISLATURE OR OTHER FUNDING 16 OPPORTUNITIES. SO, THANK YOU.

17

18 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, PAT. I DON'T SEE 19 ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS HANDS UP. AND, SO, IS THERE ANY 20 PUBLIC COMMENTS?

21

22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
23 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
24 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. RICH.



JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. 1 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RICH, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 4 5 RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. I WANT TO RAISE A COUPLE OF ISSUES. FIRST I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT I AGREE 6 WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN. BUT I WANT TO ADD SOME THINGS. WE 7 8 NEED TO REALLY LOOK AT PRIVATE PUBLIC PROJECT PARTNERSHIPS COORDINATED THROUGHOUT BAY AREA JUST A FEW IN THE COUNTY WHERE 9 10 I LIVE IN, WE HAVE META WITH GILEAD, ALUMINA, WHICH IS A COMPANY THAT JUST BUILT FIVE STORY BUILDINGS RIGHT NEXT TO THE 11 BAY VISA'S WORLD HEADOUARTERS, AND SONY PLAYSTATION MOST OF 12 THESE ARE WITHIN A 1 TO 10 BLOCK WALK FROM MY HOUSING THEY 13 REALLY DO SHARE THESE PROBLEMS AND SHOULD HELP FUND THEM. I 14 15 COULD GO ON, THROUGHOUT THE COUNTY WITH ROACH IN SAN FRANCISCO 16 AND MANY OTHER COMPANIES WITHIN THAT AREA WITH BIOTECH. SO I JUST LOOK FORWARD TO US INCLUDING THAT SECTION. I THINK THEY 17 HAVE BEEN INCLUDED IN OUR COUNTY PLAN. I AM SURE THAT 18 COMMISSIONER PAPAN COULD BETTER INFORM THAN I CAN. BUT LET'S 19 GO FORWARD LOOKING AT SOURCES OF PEOPLE THAT HAVE THE SAME 20 21 THING TO LOSE AS OUR RESIDENTS, WHO ARE PAYING THE TAXES. 22 THANK YOU.

23

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. CARLOS, DID
YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP? DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK?

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

1

JANUARY 14, 2022

CARLOS ROMERO: I DO. THANK YOU, CHAIR. I, TOO, AM IN 2 PARTICULAR IN SUPPORT OF THE FACT THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS 3 SEA LEVEL RISE AND THE OTHER ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES THAT WE ARE 4 5 INCURRING BASED ON OUR RISE IN FOSSIL FUEL CONSUMPTION. AND, AGAIN, COMING FROM A COUNTY WHERE WE DO HAVE A LOCAL AGENCY 6 RECENTLY FORMED TO WORK ON THIS, AS WELL AS COMING FROM A 7 8 CITY, THAT BECAUSE THERE HAS NOT BEEN A LOT OF OTHER FEDERAL STATE MONEY, HAVE ACTUALLY, IN A VERY RELATIVELY POOR CITY, 9 HAVE APPROXIMATELY POURED IN \$10 MILLION OF OUR OWN GENERAL 10 FUND MONEY TO BEGIN TO ADVANCE TO ADDRESS THE ISSUE OF 11 FLOODING BY SEA LEVEL RISE. WE ALL NEED TO LOOK AT EXISTING 12 EFFORTS AROUND THE BAY AREA AND I THINK COMMISSIONER PAPAN 13 MENTIONED THAT. BUT I ALSO THINK IT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT FOR 14 15 ALL OF US TO COLLABORATE COLLECTIVELY. WE ARE A REGIONAL BODY, 16 PROBABLY THE PRIORITIZATION OF PROJECTS, WHICH COMMISSIONER AHN TALKED ABOUT WILL BE A CRITICAL DISCUSSION FOR ALL OF US 17 TO HAVE, WITHIN THE CONTEXT. I KNOW THE PRESENTERS USED THE 18 TERM EQUITY SEVERAL TIMES, AND TO THE EXTENT THAT THAT CAN 19 ACTUALLY BE MORE FULLY FLESHED OUT WHAT IS MEANT BY EOUITY, AS 20 21 EVERYBODY GETS THEIR PROPORTIONAL FAIR SHARE, OR EXAMPLES OF OTHER PLACES WHERE WE HAVE LOW-INCOME FOLKS THAT WILL BE 22 IMPACTED AND WILL NOT HAVE THE CAPACITY TO DO THEIR OWN 23 LIFTING OF HOMES OR WHATEVER, THAT WE WOULD LOOK AT AN EQUITY 24 DEFINITION THAT NOT JUST ADDRESSES A FAIR APPORTIONMENT BASED 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

ON POPULATION BUT ALSO ON IMPACT AND ADDRESSING, PERHAPS, PAST
 NEGLECT OF SOME OF THOSE COASTAL OR, YOU KNOW, BAY FRONTING
 COMMUNITIES THAT ARE MORE LOW-INCOME. AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR THE
 GREAT WORK. AND I HOPE WE CAN HAVE THOSE CONSIDERATIONS
 DISCUSSED IN THE FUTURE.

6

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, CARLOS. AMY, DID
8 YOU WANT TO COMMENT?

9

AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I APOLOGIZE I TRIED TO GET 10 MY HAND UP EARLIER, BUT I WASN'T FAST ENOUGH. I JUST WANT TO 11 SHARE THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF 12 THIS EFFORT AND THE IMPORTANCE OF COLLABORATION. AND I KNOW A 13 NUMBER OF YOU MAY KNOW THAT THIS HAS BEEN IN A NUMBER OF 14 15 FOREFRONT BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATION WORK IT INVOLVES ALL 16 OF THE REGIONS, AGENCIES, PLUS THE TWO RELEVANT STATE AGENCIES, TRI-STATE AGENCIES CALTRANS COASTAL CONSERVANCY AND 17 WATER OUALITY CONTROL BOARD THE GOAL AND DEVELOPMENT, BCDC HAS 18 BEEN DOING THE HEAVY LIFTING IN THE DEVELOPING OF THE PLAN, 19 AND SECOND, ADVOCACY FOR THE EFFORTS OF FUNDING FOR THESE 20 21 PLANS THIS IS GOING TO TAKE STATE AND FEDERAL DOLLARS TO 22 SUPPLEMENT LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND WE NEED TO LOOK TO THE CORPORATIONS, LAND OWNERS, TO HELP SUPPORT THIS. AND I WANT TO 23 THANK BCDC FOR GOING AROUND TO ALL THE MAYOR'S CONFERENCES. IN 24 OUR CONVERSATIONS IN THE PAST AROUND THE PLAN AND BUILDING 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

REGIONAL AWARENESS OF IT THAT WAS ONE OF THE PRIORITIES THAT 1 WE ALL HAD IDENTIFIED TOGETHER AND I KNOW THAT OUR COUNTY WAS 2 3 REALLY GRATEFUL, OUR MAYORS AND COUNCIL MEMBERS WERE REALLY GRATEFUL TO HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO HEAR, YOU KNOW, DIRECTLY 4 5 ABOUT THE PLAN, AND RECOGNIZING THAT THESE, YOU KNOW, THOSE --BAY RISE, IS, YOU KNOW, WE'RE UNIQUE IN CALIFORNIA, BECAUSE OF 6 THE TREMENDOUS RESOURCE OF THE BAY AND THE FACT THAT ALL OF 7 8 OUR COUNTIES ARE IMPACTED AND CITIES ARE. SO, THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH, AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO DISCUSS THIS AT BARC AND TO 9 ENSURE THAT ALL OF OUR AGENCIES ARE CONTINUALLY WORKING 10 TOGETHER. AND I REALLY ALSO WANT TO THANK THE EXECUTIVE 11 DIRECTORS OF ALL THE REGIONAL AGENCIES. BECAUSE FROM THAT 12 EXECUTIVE PERSPECTIVE, THIS HAS BEEN A REAL PRIORITY IN TERMS 13 OF COMING TOGETHER AND IDENTIFYING HOW WE CAN ALL WORK 14 15 TOGETHER AND BE ONE VOICE WHEN WE ADVOCATE AND GO TO 16 SACRAMENTO FOR THESE FUNDS AND ALSO TO THE FEDERAL ADVOCACY. 17 SO, THANK YOU.

18

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. SEEING NO
OTHER HANDS. RACHEL AND NICHOLAS, THANK YOU FOR THE
PRESENTATION. I WANT TO THANK ALL THE BCDC STAFF. I SEE
THERE'S A BUNCH OF YOU ON HERE, FOR ALL YOUR GOOD WORK, AND
THANK YOU, LARRY, FOR JUMPING IN ON THIS MEETING. THANK YOU
EVERYONE FOR THIS PRESENTATION.



1 LARRY GOLDZBAND: THANK YOU.

3 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: LET'S MOVE ON TO SOMETHING THAT'S A LITTLE LESS CONTROVERSIAL THAN SEA LEVEL RISE. THIS 4 5 IS GOING TO OUR TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. I BELIEVE, THERESE, YOU'RE GOING TO GIVE AN INTRODUCTION AND KICK THIS 6 OFF, AND AFTER THERESE WE'RE GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO STAFF. 7 8 THEY'RE GOING TO DO THE PRESENTATION, AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS I WOULD LIKE TO GET YOUR COMMENTS THEN MOVE INTO PUBLIC COMMENTS 9 10 AND EITHER OTHER MEMBERS OF MTC OR ABAG WANT THAT TO COMMENT. WITH THAT, THERESE. GIVE US THE INTRODUCTION. 11

12

2

THERESE MCMILLAN: OKAY. THANKS SO MUCH CHAIR SPERING. AND I 13 APPRECIATE HAVING A COUPLE OF MINUTES TO SET SOME CONTEXT FOR 14 15 THIS ITEM, WHICH, UPON REVIEW DID NOT LEAP OFF OF THE PAGE OF 16 THE PAGE THEY SENT TO YOU. AND IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO FRAMING THIS DISCUSSION THEY WOULD LIKE TO HAVE WITH 17 COMMISSIONERS AND EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ITEMS. AT THE END OF 2021 18 THE COMMISSION AND EXECUTIVE BOARD TOOK ACTION ON TWO 19 EXTRAORDINARY EFFORTS, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND RHNA CYCLE 20 21 SIX AND BOTH EFFORTS STRETCHED THE REGION BEYOND ANY PREVIOUS PLANNING MANDATES WE HAD. IT RESULTED IN 35 AMBITIOUS 22 STRATEGIES IN TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE ECONOMY, AND THE 23 ENVIRONMENT UNDER PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THAT HAD TO, AMONG 24 OTHER THINGS, MEET AN EXCEEDINGLY TOUGH GHG REDUCTION TARGET. 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

AND WITH RHNA, WE HAD TO ASSIGN REGIONAL TARGETS THAT HAD 1 NEVER BEEN HIGHER, REFLECTING THE UNDISPUTED HOUSING CRISIS 2 3 ACROSS CALIFORNIA AND IN PARALLEL WE WANTED TO DEVELOP TOOLS TO HELP OUR JURISDICTIONS PLAN FOR THOSE TARGETS. IN ADDITION, 4 5 MTC AND ABAG, LAST YEAR, ASSUMED THE NEW AUTHORITIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES UNDER THE LEGISLATIVE MANTLE OF THE BAY AREA 6 HOUSING FINANCING AUTHORITY TO LEAD ADVANCES IN HOUSING 7 8 PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION AND PROTECTION FOR THOSE THAT SEEK TO LIVE IN THIS REGION IN AFFORDABLE PLACES BENEFITTING INCLUSIVE 9 10 COMMUNITIES THAT SHOULD BE -- THAT EVERYONE SHOULD BE ABLE TO CALL HOME. AND, YOU, AS OUR BOARD MEMBERS, STEPPED FORWARD TO 11 ADOPT AND EMBRACE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, RHNA SIX, AND THE 12 BAHFA DIRECTIVES. BUT IN DOING SO, I THINK WE ALL COLLECTIVELY 13 NEW THAT CARRYING OUT THESE OBJECTIVES WAS GOING TO BE REALLY 14 15 HARD. AND WOULD REOUIRE FINDING INTERSECTIONS WITH MANY 16 DIFFERENT POLICIES TO ACHIEVE THOSE OBJECTIVES. THE PROPOSED -- BOLD -- UNDERLINED -- PROPOSED TOC POLICY THAT WE HAVE 17 BEFORE YOU TODAY IS A CRITICAL OPPORTUNITY TO FIND THOSE 18 REINFORCING INTERSECTIONS, AND STAFF TOOK AN ADMITTEDLY BOLD 19 MOVE UP FROM THE CURRENT TOC POLICY IN FRAMING THE DRAFT THAT 20 21 WE PUT BEFORE YOU. NOW, THIS IS NOT THE ONLY INTERSECTION WHERE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, RHNA, AND BAHFA GOALS NEED TO 22 MEET, BUT IT IS A TIMELY ONE THAT STAFF WILL EXPLAIN IN OUR 23 PRESENTATION. THAT SAID, AS THE TOC POLICY PARAMETERS EMERGE, 24 25 THERE ARE ESSENTIAL CONSIDERATIONS TO ENSURE THAT THEY CAN BE

JANUARY 14, 2022

CARRIED OUT SUCCESSFULLY. A FEW TO KEEP IN MIND AT THE OUTSET: 1 THIS POLICY WILL NOT BE DONE TOMORROW, NOR IN A VERY SHORT 2 3 TIME FRAME. MUCH LIKE THE EXISTING TOC POLICY, IT IS EXPECTED TO GUIDE MULTIPLE YEARS OF TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE 4 5 COORDINATION AND NECESSARILY NEEDS TO BE IMPLEMENTED IN STAGES. IT NEEDS, ALSO, TO BE ABLE TO OVERLAY AND ADAPT TO 6 LEGISLATIVE REOUIREMENTS THAT MAY COME IN CURRENT OR FUTURE 7 8 LEGISLATION, BOTH IN TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING THAT MAY IMPACT THE BOUNDARIES OF THE POLICY AS ITS ULTIMATELY FRAMED. 9 IT DOES NOT ASSUME THAT ALL EXISTING PLANNING EFFORTS, 10 ESPECIALLY THOSE UNDER OUR PDA PROGRAM ARE STRIPPED DOWN TO 11 THE STUDS, TO USE A HOUSING ANALOGY. WE NEED A THOUGHTFUL 12 TRANSITION PLAN TO HELP GUIDE TODAY TO WHERE WE'RE GOING TO GO 13 WITH A NEW KEY POLICY STRUCTURE THAT'S GOING TO GO TO AN 14 15 ESSENTIAL ELEMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION CONSIDERATION. AND FINALLY, AND CERTAINLY NOT THE LEAST, FLEXIBILITY IS KEY. AND 16 STAFF SEEKS TO BUILD FACTORS INTO THE NEW POLICY THAT ALLOWS 17 FOR THE SUCCESSFUL APPLICATION OF INDIFFERENT ENVIRONS 18 THROUGHOUT THIS REGION. WITH THAT IMPORTANT CONTEXT, I WOULD 19 LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO MATT MALONEY TO BEGIN THE 20 21 PRESENTATION. THANK YOU.

22

23 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU. MATT?

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

MATT MALONEY: THANKS THERESE. I DON'T HAVE A WHOLE LOT IN TO 1 ADD. THERESE COVERED IT WELL. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FORECASTED 2 3 82% OF ALL FUTURE HOUSEHOLD GROWTH. AND 63% OF ALL FUTURE JOB GROWTH REALLY IN THIS THESE RICH AREAS. MANY OF WHICH ARE ALSO 4 5 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. AND AS THERESE MENTIONED THAT'S REALLY THE FOCAL POINT AND DRIVING FORCE OF HOW WE TAMP DOWN 6 ON RISING VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND ALSO REDUCE GHG. AND SO 7 8 THESE AREAS, TRANSIT-RICH AREAS, IS REALLY THE FOCUS OF THIS PRESENTATION TODAY. AND I JUST WANT TO KIND OF UNDERSCORE THAT 9 10 IT'S THOSE AREAS THAT WE'RE FOCUSED ON. YOU KNOW, IT IS BOLD, AS THERESE MENTIONED, AND, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE COME A LONG WAYS 11 SINCE 2005, WHICH IS THE LAST TIME WE DID THIS STRATEGY. WE 12 HAVE A BROADER APPLICATION HERE LOOKING AT BOTH EXISTING 13 CORRIDORS, AS WELL AS NEW CORRIDORS, AND, BUT THERESE 14 MENTIONED ALSO THE FLEXIBILITY AS WELL THAT'S INHERENT IN THE 15 16 POLICY LOOKING AT NOT JUST RESIDENTIAL BUT ALSO COMMERCIAL AND JOB GROWTH, AS WELL. YOU KNOW, AND AS WELL AS THE THREE PS OF 17 HOUSING, WHICH YOU WILL NOTICE ARE, ALSO, KIND OF INTERWOVEN 18 INTO THIS POLICY UPDATE TODAY. AND THAT'S JUST REALLY TO 19 ENSURE THAT WHEN WE MAKE MAJOR CHANGES OR PLAN FOR MAJOR 20 CHANGES IN THESE STATION AREAS, THAT WE ENSURE THAT THESE ARE 21 PLACES FOR PEOPLE OF ALL INCOME LEVELS. SO, YOU KNOW, TOTALLY 22 AGREE WITH THE PHASE-IN PERIOD. REALLY WANT TO TAKE YOUR 23 TEMPERATURE ON THE POLICY ITSELF TODAY, AND THEN REALLY RETURN 24 AND GET COMMISSION DIRECTION ON KIND OF HOW IT GETS PHASED IN 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

AND REALLY, JUST THE TIMING FOR ALL OF THAT. TODAY, ON THE
 STAFFING, WE HAVE GOT KARA VUICICH. PROJECT MANAGER ON THE
 STUDY WHO WILL GIVE THE PRESENTATION, THERESA IS ALSO HERE WHO
 IS OUR DIRECTOR OF MOBILITY. I WILL PASS IT TO KARA TO GET THE
 BALL ROLLING.

6

KARA VUICICH: THANK YOU. IF WE COULD BRING UP THE 7 8 PRESENTATION. GOOD MORNING. IT'S STILL MORNING, COMMITTEE MEMBERS. AND, AS MATT SAID, THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM THAT 9 PROVIDES AN OVERVIEW OF THE VERY INITIAL DRAFT PROPOSAL FOR A 10 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY, THE APPROACH AND 11 REQUIREMENTS. AND THIS WOULD REPLACE THE 2005 RESOLUTION 3434 12 TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT POLICY. AND A QUICK NOTE ON THE 13 14 NAME CHANGE, OR THE PROPOSED NAME CHANGER. SO IN ORDER TO 15 EMPHASIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF BROADER TRANSIT ORIENTED 16 COMMUNITIES VERSUS INDIVIDUAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS AT TRANSIT STATIONS AND ALONG TRANSIT CORRIDORS THE PROPOSAL CHANGES THE 17 POLICIES NAME FROM TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT OR TOD TO 18 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES OR TOC. LAST WE PRESENTED TO THE 19 COMMITTEE IN SPRING OF 2020 SO IT'S BEEN LITTLE WHILE AND 20 21 PROVIDED YOU A SUMMARY TIMELINE AND PROCESS FOR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT. SINCE THAT TIME WE HAVE CONVENED A TECHNICAL 22 ADVISORY COMMITTEE THAT INCLUDES REPRESENTATIVES FROM TRANSIT 23 AGENCIES, LOCAL JURISDICTIONS, COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES, 24 AS WELL AS FROM OTHER TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

ORGANIZATIONS. THE TOC HAS ALREADY PROVIDE FEEDBACK ON 1 ELEMENTS OF THE DRAFT POLICY PROPOSAL AND I HAVE INCLUDED SOME 2 3 OF THAT IN THE PRESENTATION TODAY. AND WE'LL BE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH THE TOC MEMBERS AS WELL AS STAKEHOLDERS AS WE MOVE 4 5 FORWARD WITH FURTHER REFINING AND REVISING THE DRAFT THAT WE'RE GOING TO PRESENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS YOU KNOW PLANNED 6 BAY AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED A FEW MONTHS AGO IT PROVIDES THE 7 8 BASIS FOR THE TRANCE ATLANTIC POLICY DRAFT POLICY PROPOSAL ADDRESSES MULTIPLE STRATEGIES FROM ALL ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN 9 INCLUDING TRANSPORTATION HOUSING ECONOMIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL 10 STRATEGIES FOR KEY FOCUS OF THE POLICY IMPLEMENTING THE PLAN 11 STRATEGIES THAT WILL INCREASE THE NUMBER OF HOUSEHOLDS AND 12 JOBS NEAR THE REGION'S RAIL, FERRY AND FREQUENT BUS STOPS IN 13 STATIONS IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE STRATEGIES IS PROJECTED TO 14 RESULT IN AN ADDITIONAL 1.1 MILLION HOUSEHOLDS AND ABOUT 15 16 900,000 JOBS LOCATED IN THESE AREAS BY 2050 AND IS A KEY COMPONENT OF MEETING THE PLAN'S GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION 17 TARGETS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO LIKE THE ORIGINAL TRANSIT 18 19 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT POLICY THE PROPOSED TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY FOCUSES ON AREAS WHERE TRANSIT INVESTMENTS 20 21 IN HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT, NAMELY THIS IS RAIL, FERRY, AND 22 FREQUENT BUS SERVICES OR PLANS AND IT TIES IMPLEMENTATION OF 23 VARIOUS STRATEGIES PARTICULARLY FOCUSED ON INCREASING RESIDENTIAL COMMERCIAL DENSITIES IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS TO 24 IMPLEMENTATION OF BAY AREA TRANSIT INVESTMENTS FOUR PROPOSED 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

TOC POLICY GOALS ON THE LEFT SIDE FIRST INCREASE DENSITY FOR 1 NEW RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT AND PRIORITIZE AFFORDABLE HOUSING 2 3 IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS WHICH ARE LOCATIONS WITHIN ONE HALF MILE OF TRANSIT STOPS OR STATIONS THAT PROVIDE FERRY RAIL OR 4 5 FREQUENT BUS SERVICE SECOND INCREASE DENSITIES FOR COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT HUBS SERVING MULTIPLE TRANSIT PROVIDES 30 GOLD 6 COMPLEMENTS FIRST TWO GOALS WHICH SEEK TO LOCATE MORE HOUSING 7 8 IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS TYPICALLY WITH THEN MINUTE WALKS AND FINALLY GOALS FOR CONTINUING REGIONAL SUPPORT FACILITATION 9 PARTNERSHIPS AND IMPLEMENT TOC POLICIES TO CREATE EQUITABLE 10 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES WITHIN OUR REGION NEXT PROVIDE BE 11 DETAIL ON PROPOSED TOC POLICY APPLICATIONS TO AREAS WHERE 12 INVESTMENTS IN RAIL, FERRY AND FREQUENT BUS TRANSIT ARE 13 PLANNED. NEXT SLIDE. AGAIN WE'RE PROPOSE THAT THE POLICY APPLY 14 15 TO PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS OR TRANSIT-RICH AREAS WHERE PLANNED BAY AREA INVESTMENTS AND RAIL FORE AND FREQUENT BUS 16 SERVICE ARE PLANNED. THIS WOULD INCLUDE TRANSIT-RICH PRIORITY 17 DEVELOPMENT AREAS AS WELL AS EXISTING OR FUTURE TRANSIT-RICH 18 AREAS WHERE A PDA HAS NOT YET BEEN DESIGNATED WHAT THIS MEANS 19 OR WHAT THIS WOULD POTENTIALLY LOOK LIKE IS THAT TRANSIT-RICH 20 PDAS THAT DO NOT CURRENTLY COMPLY WITH THE TOC POLICY 21 REQUIREMENTS MAY NEED TO UPDATE OR ADOPT PLANS OR ORDINANCES 22 IN ORDER TO COMPLY. THOSE THAT ALREADY COMPLY WOULD NOT NEED 23 TO TAKE ANY FURTHER ACTION FOR LOCATIONS WHERE A TRANSIT-RICH 24 PDA HAS NOT BEEN DESIGNATED A LOCAL JURISDICTION WOULD STILL 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

NEED TO COMPLY WITH THE TOC POLICY REOUIREMENTS. MTC WOULD 1 STRONGLY ENCOURAGE THAT A PDA BE DESIGNATED IN THOSE LOCATIONS 2 3 BUT A DECISION OF PDA WOULD NOT BE REQUIRED IN ORDER TO COMPLY WITH A TOC POLICY. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT WE ANTICIPATE 4 5 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TOC POLICY IN THESE AREAS WOULD HAPPEN OVER MULTIPLE YEARS AND AGAIN WOULD BE COORDINATED WITH 6 7 PLANNED TRANSIT INVESTMENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO AS 8 DISCUSSED ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE, THE TOC POLICY, AGAIN, WOULD APPLY TO LOCATION WHERE IS WE'RE MAKING INVESTMENT IN RAIL, 9 FERRY AND FREQUENT BUS SERVICE INCLUDES AREAS WHERE NEW 10 11 STATIONS WOULD BE CREATED AS A RESULT OF EXPANSION OR EXTENSION PROJECTS AS WELL AS EXISTING STOPS AND STATIONS 12 WHERE MAJOR IMPROVEMENTS OR ENHANCEMENTS TO EXISTING TRANSIT 13 SERVICE PLANS. NEW STATIONS ALONG TRANSIT EXPANSIONS OR 14 15 EXTENSIONS PROPOSED POLICY WOULD REQUIRE ALL POLICY 16 REOUIREMENTS BE MET BY LOCAL JURISDICTIONS BEFORE DISCRETIONARY FUNDS ARE PROGRAMMED FOR CONSTRUCTION OF THE 17 18 TRANSIT PROJECT OR BEFORE MTC WOULD PROVIDE ENDORSEMENT FOR 19 PROJECT FUNDING SIMILAR TO THE APPROACH FROM THE ORIGINAL 2005TOD POLICY AND SEEKS TO SUPPORT PLANNING AND ZONING ARE IN 20 PLACE BEFORE TRANSIT EXPANSION OR EXTENSION BECOMES 21 22 OPERATIONAL FOR TRANSIT ENHANCEMENT OR IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS 23 WHERE TRANSIT ARE ALREADY OPERATING TRANSIT PROJECT FUNDING WOULD NOT BE TIED TO POLICY COMPLIANCE INSTEAD FOCUS WOULD BE 24 ON PROVIDING PLANNING AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE INITIALLY AS 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

PART OF OBAG 3 AND REAP 2.0 TO ASSIST WITH COMPLIANCE IN 1 COORDINATION WITH NEAR-TERM TRANSIT ENHANCEMENTS AND 2 3 IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS THAT SAID STAFF IS PROPOSING THAT A JURISDICTIONAL'S ELIGIBILITY FOR FUTURE CYCLES OBAG FOUR EVEN 4 5 LATER CYCLES WOULD BE CONTINGENT UPON TOC POLICY COMPLIANCE WE ANTICIPATE TOC POLICY IMPLEMENTATION WILL BE PHASED OVER 6 MULTIPLE YEARS IN COORDINATION WITH TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS. NEXT 7 8 SEVERAL SLIDES DISCUSS KEY DIFFERENCES BETWEEN 2005TOC POLICY AND DRAFT TOC POLICY PROPOSAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THANK YOU. 9 IN SHORT THE PROPOSED TOC POLICY WOULD APPLY MUCH MORE BROADLY 10 11 THAN THE 2005TOD POLICY. THE 2005TOD POLICY ONLY APPLIED TO SPECIFIC NAMED TRANSIT EXPANSION PROJECTS THAT WERE INCLUDED 12 IN MTC RESOLUTION 3434. REQUIRING A MINIMUM NUMBER OF HOUSING 13 UNITS EITHER BE ZONED OR BUILT WITHIN A HALF MILE OF NEW 14 15 STATIONS ALONG THE TRANSIT CORRIDOR IN CONTRAST THE 16 COMMUNITIES POLICY WOULD APPLY TO ALL STOPS AND STATIONS AFFECTED BY PLANNED BAY AREA INVESTMENTS IN RAIL, FERRY AND 17 FREOUENT BUS SERVICE INCLUDING EXTENSIONS OR EXPANSIONS AS 18 19 WELL AS STATIONS OR STOPS AFFECTED BY MAJOR TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS ENHANCEMENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M GOING TO 20 21 PRESENT THE PROPOSED TOC POLICY REQUIREMENT IN MORE DETAIL 22 LATER IN THE PRESENTATION BUT THIS SLIDE PROVIDES AN OVERVIEW AND COMPARISON BETWEEN REQUIREMENTS FROM THE TRANSIT ORIENT 23 THE DEVELOPMENT POLICY AND TOC POLICY. THE 2005TOD POLICY SET 24 MINIMUM THRESHOLDS FOR EXISTING HOUSING UNITS ALONG CERTAIN 25

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 14, 2022

TRANSIT EXPANSION CORRIDORS BASED ON TYPE OF SERVICE PROVIDED 1 AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS WERE GIVEN EXTRA WEIGHT IN TERMS OF 2 3 MEETING THRESHOLDS TOC POLICY REQUIREMENTS BUILD FROM COMPLEMENTED PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS GUIDELINES FOCUSING ON 4 5 KEY ELEMENTS FROM THE GUIDELINES THAT WILL BE REQUIRED TO IMPLEMENT PLANNED BAY AREA CONSEQUENTLY PROPOSED TOC POLICY 6 7 REQUIREMENTS ADDRESS RESIDENTIAL COMMERCIAL DENSITY AROUND 8 TRANSIT STOPS AND STATIONS AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN KNOW ANTI-9 DISPLACEMENT POLICIES PARKING MANAGEMENT STATION ACCESS AND CIRCULATION INCLUDING CONNECTIVITY TO ADJACENT EOUITY PRIORITY 10 11 COMMUNITIES THAT REMAIN OUTSIDE THE HALF MILE STATION AREA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LIKE THE 2005TOD POLICY THE PROPOSED TOC 12 POLICY WOULD CONDITION DISCRETIONARY PROJECT FUNDING AS WELL 13 AS FUNDING ENDORSEMENTS FOR TRANSIT EXPANSIONS AND 14 ENHANCEMENTS ON WHETHER A JURISDICTION HAS MET POLICY 15 16 REQUIREMENTS KEY DIFFERENCE IS PROPOSED TOC POLICY WOULD ALSO APPLY TO AREAS AROUND EXISTING STATIONS WHERE MAJOR TRANSIT 17 18 ENHANCEMENTS IMPROVEMENTS ARE PLANNED LOCAL JURISDICTIONS 19 ELIGIBILITY FUTURE REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY TRANSPORTATION YOU FUNDS YOU SUCH AS FUTURE CYCLES AND LATER CONDITIONED ON 20 21 COMPLIANCE WITH POLICY REQUIREMENT DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE 2005 22 POLICY AND TOC POLICY AND FURTHER DETAIL PROPOSED 23 REQUIREMENTS. THE TOC POLICY REQUIREMENTS NOT ONLY ADDRESS RESIDENTIAL DENSITY AROUND TRANSIT STOPS AND STATIONS BUT ALSO 24 COMMERCIAL DENSITY FOR OFFICE SPACE REQUIRING MINIMUM 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

JANUARY 14, 2022

RESIDENTIAL AND COMMERCIAL DENSITIES FOR DEVELOPMENT IN 1 TRANSIT-RICH OR PDA OR MAJOR TRANSIT INVESTMENTS WHERE PDAS 2 3 ARE PLANNED TABLE SHOWN ON BASED MINIMUM DENSITIES AT WHICH NEW DEVELOPMENT WOULD NEED TO BE BUILT IN ORDER TO IMPLEMENT 4 5 THE PLAN. BASED ON TRANSIT SERVICE THAT WOULD BE AVAILABLE WITH HIGHEST DENSITIES REQUIRED AT REGIONAL RAIL HUBS SERVED 6 7 BY MULTIPLE BART LINES BART AND CALTRAIN I WANT TO NOTE THIS 8 REQUIREMENT IS NOT SEEKING TO SPECIFY ONE LAND USE VERSUS ANOTHER IN A STATION AREA RATHER TO ENSURE AVERAGE DENSITY OF 9 ANY NEW RESIDENTIAL OR COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT IS BUILT AT OR 10 ABOVE SPECIFIED MINIMUMS. EXISTING PLANS WE TOOK AN INITIAL 11 LOOK AT SOME EXISTING PLANS AND OUR REVIEW INDICATES THAT THE 12 PROPOSED DENSITY RANGES ARE FEASIBLE HOWEVER THERE CAN BE 13 SIGNIFICANT VARIATION IN BOTH LAND USE TYPES AND INTENSITIES 14 15 WITHIN STATIONS WITHIN A SURROUNDING AREA TRANSIT STOP OR 16 STATION WE'RE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AND PLANNING STAFF TO FURTHER REFINE THE 17 PROPOSED REQUIREMENT TO PROVIDE OFFICIAL SPECIFICITY AS WELL 18 AS FLEXIBILITY IN ORDER TO ACCOMMODATE DIVERSITY THROUGHOUT 19 THE REGION AS WELL AS SIGNIFICANT LAND USE WITHIN A SITUATION 20 21 STATION AREA NEXT SLIDE SHOWS COMMERCIAL PROJECTS FROM AROUND 22 THE BAY AREA THAT INDICATE THE RANGE OF DENSITY. NEXT SLIDE. 23 THESE ARE THE MINIMUM DENSITIES PROPOSED FOR REGIONAL RAIL HUBS THE RESIDENTIAL PROJECTS THAT YOU SEE ON YOUR RIGHT ARE 24 FROM DOWNTOWN OAKLAND AND THE COMMERCIAL PROJECTS ON THE LEFT 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

-- SORRY -- RESIDENTIAL PROJECTS ON THE LEFT, COMMERCIAL 1 2 PROJECTS ON THE RIGHT, ARE FROM DOWNTOWN OAKLAND AND DOWNTOWN 3 SAN FRANCISCO. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO FOR TIER TWO THIS WOULD INCLUDE REGIONAL RAIL SUCH AS BART AND CALTRAIN LIGHT RAIL 4 5 TRANSIT BUS RAPID TRANSIT AND WHAT YOU SEE ARE A PROJECT FROM SAN JOSE NEAR DOWNTOWN. ON THE RESIDENTIAL SIDE. AND THEN 6 ANOTHER PROJECT FROM DOWNTOWN -- THE DOWNTOWN SOUTH SAN 7 8 FRANCISCO PDA. THE COMMERCIAL PROJECTS ON THE RIGHT OF THE SLIDE ARE FROM THE EASTERN NEIGHBORHOODS PDA IN SAN FRANCISCO 9 AND FROM THE EL CAMINO REAL PDA IN BURLINGAME. NEXT SLIDE 10 PLEASE. LASTLY, FOR OUR EXAMPLES, THE RESIDENTIAL EXAMPLES ARE 11 FROM THE GREATER DOWNTOWN PDA IN SAN JOSE FOR THE EXAMPLE ON 12 THE TOP AND THEN FROM THE PDA IN FREMONT ON THE BOTTOM LEVEL 13 AND THEN ON THE RIGHT WE HAVE A PROJECT FROM SAN MATEO FROM 14 THEIR RAIL CORRIDOR PDA, AND THEN ON THE BOTTOM, FROM THE 15 16 DOWNTOWN REDWOOD CITY PDA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS -- THE 17 PROPOSED REQUIREMENTS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND ANTI-DISPLACEMENT FOCUS ON PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION AND PROTECTION 18 OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS. THIS REOUIREMENT 19 SUPPORTS SEVERAL PLANNED BAY AREA HOUSING STRATEGIES WHICH ARE 20 21 LISTED ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE SLIDE, AS WELL AS 22 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION. GIVEN THE RANGE OF LAND USE AND HOUSING MARKET CONTEXT THROUGHOUT 23 THE REGION PROPOSAL FOR THIS REQUIREMENT TAKES A MENU 24 APPROACH. THERE IS A LIST OF POLICIES AND WHAT'S BEING 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

PROPOSED IS THAT A JURISDICTION WOULD ADOPT TWO OUT OF THREE 1 OR TWO OUT OF FOUR. FROM THE STAKEHOLDERS WE HAVE ADOPTED IT 2 3 SHOULD BE IN SOME CASES LESS CONSTRAINED IN TERMS OF OPTIONAL AND SHOULD FURTHER GUIDANCE SPECIFICATION ON WHAT HOUSING 4 5 POLICIES SHOULD ADDRESS REOUIREMENT THAT IS MEANINGFUL IN TERMS OF PLANNED BAY AREA IMPLEMENTATION PROVIDING FLEXIBILITY 6 NEEDED TO ADDRESS HOUSING MARKET CONTEXT IN THE REGION AND 7 8 WORKING WITH STAKEHOLDERS AS WELL AS HOUSING AND LOCAL PROGRAM STAFF TO ADDRESS COMMENTS AND OUESTIONS RECEIVED TO ENSURE 9 CONSISTENCY REGARDING REGIONAL GUIDELINES ON HOUSING POLICIES. 10 THIS PROVIDES A HIGH-LEVEL SUMMARY OF PROPOSED POLICY ON 11 PARKING REOUIREMENTS PARKING MANAGEMENT REOUIREMENTS DETAILED 12 IN THE ATTACHMENT. ADDRESSED BY BART'S ZONING GUIDANCE AS WELL 13 AS PARK POLICY PLAYBOOK THERE IS A SOLID BODY OF RESEARCH AT 14 THIS TIME ON THE CRITICAL ROLE EFFECTIVE PARKING MANAGEMENT 15 16 PLAYS ON REDUCING AUTOMOBILE TRIPS AND PARKING, RIGHT SIZE PARKING ENABLES HIGH DENSITY AND DEVELOPMENT NEAR TRANSIT AND 17 REDUCE PER UNIT DEVELOPMENT COST OUR TECHNICAL ADVISORY 18 19 COMMITTEE MEMBERS SUPPORTED ELIMINATION OF MINIMUM PARKING REQUIREMENTS IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND THERE IS DEBATE ABOUT 20 21 POTENTIALLY HAVING PARKING MAXIMUMS WITH PROPOSED AREAS FOR REGIONAL RAIL SERVICE SUCH AS BART, CALTRAIN AND LIGHT RAIL 22 23 AND RAPID TRANSIT I NOT INCLUDING PARKING MAXIMUM FOR AREAS THAT ARE ONLY SERVED BY FERRY, COMMUTER RAIL OR FREQUENT BUS 24 SERVICE. WE'RE WORKING WITH OUR STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING LOCAL 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

JURISDICTION PLANNING STAFF ON FURTHER REFINING THIS 1 REQUIREMENT WITH REGARD TO PARKING MAXIMUM PROVIDING FURTHER 2 3 SPECIFICITY REGARDING WHAT REQUIREMENTS TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT MEASURES MIGHT BE. FOCUSED ON THE HALF MILE AREA 4 5 AROUND TRANSIT STOPS AND STATIONS REOUIREMENTS FOR TRANSIT STATION ACCESS CIRCULATION ALSO ADDRESS IMPROVEMENTS THAT 6 WOULD ENABLE PEOPLE OUTSIDE THE AREA INCLUDING BUSES SHUTTLES 7 8 AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. FIRST TWO COMPONENTS IN THE OUTLINE 9 INCLUDE COMPLETE STREETS UPDATE AS WELL AS REGIONAL INVESTMENT MOBILITY HUBS THIRD BULLET REOUIRES COMPLETION OF SPECIFIC GAP 10 ANALYSIS SEVERAL RECENT STATION AREAS HAVE INCLUDED THIS 11 ANALYSIS AND IT'S BEEN EFFECTIVE IN IDENTIFYING PROJECTS THAT 12 IMPROVE MULTI-MODAL TRANSIT ACCESS. REQUIREMENTS WORKING TO 13 ADDRESS COMMENTS AND FEEDBACK. AND WE VERY MUCH LOOK FORWARD 14 15 TO FEEDBACK FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS TODAY INCLUDING HOW 16 JURISDICTIONS SHOULD ADDRESS EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES LOCATED FARTHER THAN A HALF MILE FROM TRANSIT STOPS AND 17 STATIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WANT TO CONCLUDE THIS PORTION 18 19 OF THE PRESENTATION TALKING ABOUT HOW LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WILL COMPLY WITH THE PROPOSED TOC POLICY REOUIREMENTS THAT I HAVE 20 OUTLINED. WE ANTICIPATE THAT. OC POLICY IMPLEMENTATION WILL BE 21 22 PHASED OVER MULTIPLE YEARS IN COORDINATION WITH TRANSIT 23 IMPROVEMENTS AND THAT IT WILL TAKE TIME AND FINANCIAL SUPPORT TO ASSIST JURISDICTIONS WITH TOC POLICY COMPLIANCE IN SOME 24 CASES ALREADY ADOPTED PLANS OR ZONING MAY NEED TO BE AMENDED 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 14, 2022

TO COMPLY WITH THE POLICY BUT IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT EVEN 1 AN AMENDMENT TO AN EXISTING PLAN CAN TAKE SEVERAL YEARS TO 2 3 COMPLETE IF ADOPTED ONE OF THE FIRST IMPLEMENTATION STEPS WILL TOLL ADDRESS COMPLIANCE LOCATIONS FOR MAJOR TRANSIT 4 5 IMPROVEMENTS PLANNED IN THE NEAR-TERM ENABLING US TO IDENTIFY PRIORITIZATION RESOURCES THAT WILL BE NEEDED TO SUPPORT POLICY 6 IMPLEMENTATION AND COORDINATION IMPLEMENTATION FOR TRANSIT 7 8 INVESTMENT. FOCUS OF TODAY'S PRESENTATION HAS BEEN TO PROVIDE YOU WITH A GENERAL OVERVIEW OF DRAFT PROPOSAL FOR THE TOC 9 10 APPROACH AND POLICY REQUIREMENTS AND GET YOUR FEEDBACK ON 11 OVERALL DIRECTION FOR POLICY DEVELOPMENT. THERE IS STILL A LOT OF WORK TO BE DONE AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH DEVELOPING THE 12 DRAFT FINAL POLICY THERE ARE SEVERAL KEY ISSUES THAT WE WANT 13 TO IN PARTICULAR BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION AS I MENTIONED 14 15 EARLIER THE TOC POLICY WOULD NOT ONLY APPLY TO TRANSIT 16 EXPANSIONS BUT TO MAJOR TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL WHICH IS A SIGNIFICANT CHANGE FROM THE 2005TOD POLICY AND WHILE THE 17 18 FOCUS IS ON PROVIDING PLANNING AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO 19 JURISDICTIONS TO ASSIST WITH POLICY COMPLIANCE STAFF IS PROPOSE THAT ULTIMATELY COMPLIANCE COULD BE A CONDITION OF 20 21 FUTURE OBAG CYCLES, OBAG FOUR OR BEYOND. AND NEXT AS WE MOVE 22 FORWARD WITH REFINING THE POLICY REQUIREMENTS A KEY ISSUE WILL 23 BE BALANCING EFFECTIVENESS AND EASE OF IMPLEMENTATION WITH BOTH THE DIVERSITY AND COMPLEXITY OF DIFFERENT LAND USE AND 24 TRANSPORTATION CONTEXTS THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND IN SOME 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

CASES EVEN WITHIN A SINGLE STATION AREA. AND THEN LASTLY, 1 2 POLICY IMPLEMENTATION WILL LIKELY REQUIRE ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 3 FOR PLANNING AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AS WELL AS FOR ASSESSING COMPLIANCE. AND WE EXPECT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE POLICY TO BE 4 5 PHASED OVER TIME AND, AGAIN, COORDINATED WITH TRANSIT PROJECT 6 FUNDING AND DELIVERY. AND, MY LAST SLIDE, PLEASE. [LAUGHTER] SO, IN CONCLUSION, OUR NEXT STEPS ARE TO WORK WITH OUR 7 8 TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS ON DEVELOPING A FINAL DRAFT POLICY THAT WE ANTICIPATE BRINGING 9 10 BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE FOR ACTION LATER THIS SPRING. AGAIN, THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. AND NO ACTION IS BEING REQUESTED 11 TODAY. BUT WE ARE VERY HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY OUESTIONS. AND 12 DEFINITELY WANT TO RECEIVE YOUR FEEDBACK AND DIRECTION ON THE 13 GENERAL POLICY APPROACH AND REQUIREMENTS. SO, THANK YOU VERY 14 15 MUCH.

16

17 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: MATT, DOES THAT CONCLUDE THE 18 STAFF PRESENTATION?

19

20 MATT MALONEY: YES IT DOES.

21

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: BEFORE I TAKE QUESTIONS FROM
THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS, YOU KNOW, I JUST -- YOU KNOW, I DON'T
THINK I HAVE RECEIVED AS MANY PHONE CALLS IN A WHILE, EVER
SINCE OUR TELECOMMUTE POLICY AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STIRRED

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

A LOT OF INTEREST. YOU KNOW, AS THIS POLICY HAS BEEN RELEASED, 1 IT HAS STIRRED A LOT OF INTEREST. AND I THINK STAFF KNOWS 2 3 THAT. FIRST I WANT TO SAY THAT, YOU KNOW, STAFF HAS NOT PRESENTED ANYTHING IN THIS PROPOSAL THAT ISN'T IN PLANNED BAY 4 5 AREA 2050. I THINK WHAT GOT EVERYBODY'S ATTENTION IS, THIS IS A 30-YEAR PLAN. THE WAY THAT THIS PRESENTATION WAS PRESENTED, 6 IT LOOKED LIKE OUR STAFF WAS TRYING TO IMPLEMENT IT IN THE 7 8 FIRST YEAR. AND THAT WAS NOT THE INTENT. AND THERESE REALLY MADE THAT CLEAR THAT THERE IS A LOT OF WORK TO BE DONE. THERE 9 IS A LOT MORE ANALYSIS. IT DOESN'T MEAN ALL OF THESE 10 STRATEGIES ARE GOING TO BE INCLUDED. BECAUSE THERE MIGHT BE A 11 BETTER PLACE TO PUT SOME OF THOSE STRATEGIES. LOCAL 12 JURISDICTIONS, AND YOU KNOW, WE NEED TO LOOK AT, YOU KNOW, ARE 13 THESE INCENTIVES THAT ARE PUT N AND HOW WE'RE GOING TO 14 APPROACH T SO I JUST WANT TO JUST CAUTION EVERYBODY BEFORE WE 15 CIRCLE THE WAGONS OR ANYTHING THAT THERE IS A LOT IN ANALYSIS, 16 A LOT MORE DISCUSSION. BUT STAFF IS BRINGING FORWARD THE 17 STRATEGIES THAT WE HAVE ALL ADOPTED, AND MOST OF THEM, WE WERE 18 HOPING WOULD BE ADOPTED OVER A PERIOD OF TIME. A NUMBER OF 19 YEARS. AND, WE ARE CERTAINLY GOING TO HAVE TO FIGURE OUT WHO 20 21 IS THE BEST PERSON TO IMPLEMENT MANY OF THESE STRATEGIES. AND SO I JUST, YOU KNOW, THE SPEAKERS, AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS, YOU 22 KNOW, IT WOULD JUST -- IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HEAR FROM YOU ON 23 WHAT ISSUES YOU'RE CONCERNED ABOUT. THERE IS PLENTY OF TIME 24 FOR EVERYBODY TO LOOK AT THIS POLICY LOOK AT HOW IT'S GOING TO 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

IMPACT THEIR PROJECTS, IF IT'S GOING TO HINDER THOSE PROJECTS 1 OR ACCELERATE THEM. IT'S GOING TO BE GOOD TO HEAR THAT 2 3 INFORMATION FROM YOU. THE INTENT IS NOT TO DISMANTLE ANYBODY'S ZONING OR PDA PLAN THAT'S NOT THE INTENT OF THIS. A LOT OF 4 5 THIS WORK IS GOING TO CONTINUE AND MTC STAFF IS GOING TO HELP WITH IMPLEMENTATION AND DELIVERY OF THOSE PROJECTS. I WANT TO 6 SET CONTEXT. THERE IS A LOT MORE DISCUSSION. WE ALL NEED TO 7 8 WORK TOGETHER. WE HAVE A COMMON GOAL. AND THAT ALL OF THESE STRATEGIES, AS I SAID, THAT HAS HAD A LOT OF DISCUSSION OVER 9 10 THE PAST SEVERAL YEARS, AS WE HAVE BROUGHT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FORWARD. AND SO, IN MY CONVERSATIONS WITH THERESE AND 11 MATT, YOU KNOW, AT A COUPLE OF MEETINGS PRIOR TO THIS MEETING, 12 THEY'RE ASSURING ME THAT THERE IS A LOT OF OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE 13 MEANINGFUL DISCUSSIONS, TO GET THE STAKEHOLDERS THAT ARE 14 INVOLVED IN THESE VARIOUS AREAS, AND REALLY TALK ABOUT A 15 16 STRATEGY THAT'S GOING TO WORK. AND A TOC PROGRAM THAT WE CAN DELIVER. YOU KNOW, I WAS CHAIR OF MTC WHEN WE INTRODUCED THE 17 ORIGINAL TOC PROGRAM, TRANSPORTATION FOR LIVABLE -- TLC --18 THERE WAS CONTROVERSY THERE, BUT THAT HAS SERVED AS WELL, AND 19 I THINK THIS TOC IS GOING TO DO THE SAME THING. IT'S HOW AND 20 WHEN WE IMPLEMENT IT THAT'S GOING TO BE THE ISSUE HERE AND WHO 21 DELIVERS. THAT SAID I'M GOING TO GO TO MY COMMISSIONERS AND 22 BOARD MEMBERS AND WE'LL TAKE COMMENTS. DAVE HUDSON, I THINK 23 YOU'RE FIRST, THEN CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI. YOU WILL BE SECOND. GO 24 25 AHEAD, DAVE, KICK US OFF

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 14, 2022

DAVID E. HUDSON: APPARENTLY, I MUST HAVE MISSED SOMETHING. 2 3 MINE IS A CLARIFYING QUESTION. DON'T HAVE ANYBODY ANGRY YET. I ASKED A OUESTION DURING OUR APPEALS PROCESS ON WHAT SOMETHING 4 5 ACTUALLY MEANT SO THIS TIME I'M GOING TO ASK IT AGAIN THIS HAS TO DO WITH ITEM FIVE, ATTACHMENT A, IT'S TWO QUESTIONS. BOTTOM 6 OF FIRST PARAGRAPH, "ADDING AFFORDABLE HOMES CLOSE TO REGION'S 7 8 MAJOR TRANSIT INVESTMENT." THE QUESTION IS DOES REGION MEAN BAY AREA THERE, AND, SECOND "PROPOSED AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND 9 10 ANTI-DISPLACEMENT POLICIES LIKE WOULD BE IMPLEMENTED JURISDICTION WIDE" IS JURISDICTION WIDE ALSO THE BAY AREA. 11 I'LL WAIT TO GET AN ANSWER. 12

13

1

MATT MALONEY: I'LL LEAP IN ON THIS ONE. YES. WHEN WE SAY THE REGION'S MAJOR TRANSIT INVESTMENTS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THE NINE-COUNTY BAY AREA. WHEN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT JURISDICTION-WIDE IN TERMS OF ADOPTING CERTAIN POLICIES WE'RE TALKING LOCAL JURISDICTIONS IN THAT CASE.

19

20 DAVID E. HUDSON: OKAY. WELL WHERE I GOT SURPRISED BEFORE WAS 21 "INTRAREGIONAL RELATIONSHIP" AND I THOUGHT THAT MEANT, LIKE, A 22 COUPLE OF JURISDICTIONS COMING TOGETHER ON SOMETHING ONLY TO 23 FIND OUT THAT MEANT THE ENTIRE BAY AREA. I'LL LEAVE IT AT 24 THAT. EVERYBODY CAN JUDGE FOR THEMSELVES.

25

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 14, 2022

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: YEAH. STAFF, I THINK IT WOULD 1 BE BEST IF WE TRY AND GET ALL THE OUESTIONS IN. AND IF YOU 2 3 GUYS CAN WRITE THEM DOWN AS WE GO. BECAUSE IF WE'RE GOING TO RESPOND TO EVERYTHING WE'LL BE HERE FOR A LONG PERIOD OF TIME. 4 5 BUT WE HAVE TO ADDRESS THE OUESTIONS PEOPLE ARE RAISING. MATT YOU CAN GUYS TAKE NOTES AND ANSWER THE QUESTIONS. BUT I WOULD 6 LIKE TO GET AS MANY OF THE OUESTIONS IN FRONT OF US AS WE CAN 7 8 AND THAT WILL HELP STOP REPEATING A LOT OF INFORMATION. WITH THAT, CAROL AND VICTORIA? 9

10

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YES. AND THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. MY 11 THOUGHT ON THIS ITEM IS THAT, OBVIOUSLY, WHATEVER POLITICS WE 12 END UPCOMING UP WITH, WE WANT THE CITIES TO BE COMPLIANT. SO, 13 BECAUSE THIS IS GOING TO BE A PHASED PROJECT, CITIES ARE GOING 14 15 TO KEEP ONGOING WITH THEIR DEVELOPMENT PLANS AS TIME GOES ON, 16 AND AS WE'RE PHASING THIS IN, IN PIECES, I'M AFRAID WE'RE GOING TO END UP HAVING AN R JURISDICTION THAT MIGHT NOT BE 17 CONSISTENT WITH PUTTING IN THE POLICIES THAT WE'RE CONCERNED B 18 SO I WOULD LIKE TO REQUEST THAT WE DO AN ASSESSMENT OF OUR 19 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND SEE WHERE THE ALIGNMENT IS THAT WE'RE 20 21 THINKING ABOUT, AND WHERE THE GAPS ARE SO THERE CAN BE COMMUNICATION. I DID HEAR YOU SAY, CHAIR SPERING, ABOUT THE 22 STAKEHOLDERS. BECAUSE IF THEY'RE AWARE OF WHAT'S GOING ON, 23 THEN THAT WILL INFORM THEM, AS THEY'RE TRYING TO MOVE FORWARD 24



IN THEIR PROJECTS. SO, THANK YOU FOR ENTERTAINING THOSE
 COMMENTS.

3

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, CAROL. VICTORIA?

VICTORIA FLEMING: THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. MY COMMENTS -- YOU 6 KNOW, I TAKE THE CHAIR'S COMMENTS IN STRIDE, AND THANK STAFF 7 8 FOR A REALLY COMPREHENSIVE AND WELL-THOUGHT OUT INTRODUCTION TO A REALLY DIFFICULT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. SO, THANK YOU, 9 SINCERELY. MY CONCERNS ARE THAT, AS WE IMPLEMENT SO MANY OF 10 THESE FANTASTIC STRATEGIES, THAT I CAN'T SEE ONE OF THESE 11 STRATEGIES THAT I CAN'T SEE STARTING AND THAT I DON'T WANT 12 AGREE WITH. I THINK THEY'RE ALL REALLY WONDERFUL, AND I THINK 13 THEY'RE, IN TIME, CARROTS TO STICKS, AND REALLY PUTTING SOME 14 TEETH BEHIND OUR GOALS AND AT THE SAME TIME ASK FOR CAREFUL 15 16 CONSIDERATION OF THE SMALLER COMMUNITIES IN THE NORTH BAY. THESE PROJECTS ARE GREAT GOALS BECAUSE MANY OF OUR 17 JURISDICTIONS JUST AREN'T THERE YET. I LOOK FORWARD TO CAREFUL 18 AND YOU THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSIONS WITH OUR COUNTY TRANSPORTATION 19 AUTHORITIES AND OUR STAKEHOLDERS TO MAKE SURE THIS IS PHASED 20 21 IN A WAY THAT DOESN'T LEAVE OUR SMALLER COMMUNITIES BEHIND AND MAKE SURE THE FUNDING IS DISTRIBUTED IN A WAY THAT MAKES THE 22 WHOLE ENTIRE NINE BAY AREA COUNTY SYSTEM WORK WELL TOGETHER. 23 THANK YOU. 24

25



JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, VICTORIA. PAT
 2 EKLUND, THEN NEYSA FLIGOR.

3

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. I ALSO WANT TO THANK YOU 4 5 FOR YOUR PRELIMINARY COMMENTS. BECAUSE THIS DOCUMENT SCARED THE BEJESUS OUT OF ME, ACTUALLY, JUST SAYING THAT DIRECTLY. I 6 THINK RIGHT OFF THE BAT, WE NEED TO GET A REVISED TIMELINE. I 7 8 THINK ONE OF -- FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF ANY TYPE OF POLICY LIKE THIS, I REALLY THINK THAT, NUMBER ONE, WE NEED TO SEND OUT A 9 10 DRAFT POLICY, WHICHEVER ONE WE GET CLOSE TO -- I THINK THIS IS FAR FROM WHERE WE NEED TO BE -- TO EACH CITY FOR REVIEW AND 11 COMMENT. BECAUSE, BASICALLY, WHAT WE'RE DOING IS WE'RE 12 CHANGING THE CONCEPT OF TRANSIT-RICH AREAS TO BE A MANDATORY 13 DESIGNATION. IN THE PAST, PDAS ACTUALLY HAD TO APPLY FOR IT. 14 15 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS WAS A DESIGNATION THAT WAS MADE BY ABAG AND 16 MTC, BUT IT WASN'T SOMETHING THAT THE CITIES REALLY HAD TO ADHERE TO. SO, I HAVE A MAJOR ISSUE ABOUT THIS BEING APPLIED 17 TO TRAS. ESPECIALLY IN THE MORE RURAL AREAS, LIKE NOVATO OR 18 SAN RAFAEL, IS NOT ANYTHING LIKE A FREMONT OR SAN JOSE. AND 19 BEFORE WE DO ANYTHING, I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE A BETTER 20 21 UNDERSTANDING OF WHICH CITIES ARE NOT IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE PROPOSED POLICIES THAT WE'RE DOING. AND DO WE NECESSARILY WANT 22 THEM TO BE? BECAUSE THERE IS SOME THAT JUST DON'T LEND ITSELF, 23 AND, PLUS, REQUIRING A COMMERCIAL DENSITY AND RESIDENTIAL 24 DENSITY -- WE ARE STILL IN A PANDEMIC AND THERE IS A LOT OF 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

DISCUSSION, THE BAY AREA COUNCIL JUST CAME OUT WITH A THING 1 THAT SAID 40% OF THEIR EMPLOYEES ARE NOT GOING TO BE COMING 2 3 BACK TO WORK IN A BUILDING. MOST OF THEM ARE GOING BE -- AND THERE IS SOME DEBATE AS TO WHAT PERCENTAGE. SOME SAY 15%, SOME 4 5 ARE SAYING 40%. BUT I FIRMLY BELIEVE THAT THE WAY THAT WE WORK, THE WAY THAT WE MOVE PEOPLE TO AND FROM WORK IS 6 FUNDAMENTALLY CHANGED AS A RESULT OF THIS PANDEMIC. AND WE 7 8 HAVEN'T REALLY ASSESSED THAT, OR EVEN FACTORED THAT INTO SOME OF OUR THINKING HERE. SO WE'RE JUST ASSUMING THAT WE'RE GOING 9 TO HAVE TO HAVE RESIDENTIAL DENSITIES AND COMMERCIAL DENSITIES 10 AROUND TRANSIT-RICH AREAS WHEN, IN FACT THAT MAY NOT BE THE 11 CASE. PEOPLE MAY NOT BE NEEDING TRANSIT TO GET TO WORK, 12 BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT NECESSARILY GOING TO BE GOING BACK TO 13 WORK. THE COUNCIL SAID THEY MAY BE GOING INTO THE OFFICE MAYBE 14 15 THREE DAYS A WEEK, NOT FIVE. TRANSIT IS BASED ON FIVE DAYS A 16 WEEK. SO, YOU KNOW, I'M NOT AN EXPERT IN THIS, BUT, SO, I HAVE A REAL ISSUE WITH THIS BEING APPLIED TO TRANSIT-RICH AREAS. I 17 DON'T THINK THAT WE SHOULD BE MANDATING COMMERCIAL AND 18 RESIDENTIAL DENSITIES. I THINK THAT THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND 19 ANTI-DISPLACEMENT POLICIES, CITIES DON'T NECESSARILY HAVE THE 20 21 MONEY TO ADOPT THESE POLICIES AND OR IMPLEMENT THEM. MOST CITIES DON'T HAVE A HOUSING FUND. SO I HAVE -- YOU KNOW THERE, 22 IS NO DEFINITION OF A MAJOR TRANSIT INVESTMENT, WHETHER IT'S 23 PLANNED, OR DEVELOPED. THERE IS JUST A LOT OF UNCERTAINTIES IN 24 THIS THING. AND I THINK THAT WE REALLY NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

1 THE PLANNERS AND THE ELECTED OFFICIAL IN EACH CITY, IN THIS
2 REGION, HAVE INPUT INTO THIS. AND, SO, I HAVE A LOT MORE
3 COMMENTS THAT, BASICALLY, I THINK THAT WE NEED TO HAVE A
4 LITTLE BIT MORE DEFINITION AND A BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF WHO
5 THIS IS GOING TO APPLY TO AND WHAT DOES IT MEAN FOR EACH OF
6 THE CITIES BEFORE WE EVEN THINK ANY ADOPTING SOMETHING LIKE
7 THIS.

8

9 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, PAT.

10

NEYSA FLIGOR: PAT COVERED EVERYTHING ON MY LIST. AND IN THE 11 OPENING, CHAIR SPERING, THANK YOU FOR THAT IT'S THE MESSAGE I 12 WILL TAKE BACK WE'RE EARLY IN THE PROCESS AND I APPRECIATE YOU 13 SAYING THAT AT THE BEGINNING. I WON'T REPEAT EVERYTHING THAT 14 15 PAT SAID, BUT SIMILAR CONCERNS AND OUESTIONS, HOW IT WILL BE 16 DEPLOYED, APPLIED, APPLICATION, TO NON-PDA AREAS, WHAT DOES THAT MEAN FOR DIFFERENT CITIES, AND SO BECAUSE WE'RE AT THE 17 EARLY STAGE OF THIS POLICY PROCESS, I DO APPRECIATE THE FACT 18 THAT WE WILL HAVE TIME TO DELVE DEEPER AND SOLICIT FEEDBACK 19 FROM OUR INDIVIDUAL CITIES AND COUNTY JURISDICTIONS. SO I 20 21 WON'T GO INTO THE LIST. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

22

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS.
CARLOS AND THEN ALFREDO, OUR CHAIR.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

CARLOS ROMERO: THANK YOU. I AM ACTUALLY OUITE PLEASANTLY 1 SURPRISED AT THE WORK BOTH STAFF AND OUR EXECUTIVE STAFF HAVE 2 3 DONE IN TRYING TO IMPROVE OUR FORMER TOD POLICY. I KNOW WE HAVE HAD MANY A DISCUSSION IN THE PAST, SOME ACTUALLY LED BY 4 5 THE CHAIR ABOUT HOW EFFECTIVE THESE POLICIES HAVE BEEN, ARE WE GETTING WHAT WE NEED IN TERMS OF THE DEVELOPMENT THAT'S 6 REQUIRED TO MAKE THE BAY AREA MORE LIVABLE AND EQUITABLE. AND 7 8 I BELIEVE THIS DRAFT IS CERTAINLY MOVING IN THAT DIRECTION. AND I WANT TO THANK YOU THERESE FOR SUPPORTING HER STAFF TO 9 MAKE SOME OF THESE SUGGESTIONS ON POLICIES AND CHANGES TO THE 10 TOD. I DO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT MANY OF THE ITEMS THAT ARE 11 DISCUSSED HERE DON'T REQUIRE A DEEP OR ANY COST TO IMPLEMENT, 12 PARTICULARLY WHEN IT COMES TO SOME OF THE POLICIES AROUND 13 PRESERVATION AND DISPLACEMENT, IT'S SOMETHING THAT OUR 14 15 PREVIOUS TOD POLICY NEVER ADDRESS SAID. SO JUST CAUSE 16 EVICTION, YOU COULD PUT IN PLACE PROTECTION THAT IS DISCUSSED THERE, AND INDEED THOSE AREN'T GOING TO COST YOU ANYTHING BUT 17 18 THEY CERTAINLY WILL BE PROTECTING COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN COMMUNITIES OF COLOR, COMMUNITIES THAT CERTAINLY REQUIRE A 19 TYPE OF PROTECTION. AND I WOULD LIKE TO EVEN POSSIBLY EVEN SEE 20 21 THAT STRENGTHENED, PERHAPS EVEN THINKING OF A FIRST RIGHT OF 22 RETURN POLICY ON DISPLACEMENT. CERTAINLY, I WANT TO COMMENT REALLY OUICKLY ON THE PARKING ISSUE. I THINK IT MAKES A LOT OF 23 SENSE TO LOOK AT PARKING AND REDUCING THAT PARKING. BUT LET'S 24 KEEP IN MIND THAT A REDUCTION IN PARKING TO A DEVELOPER, OR 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

WHAT HE HAS TO PRODUCE SAVES THAT DEVELOPER 30 TO \$45,000 FOR 1 A PARKING SPACE AND THERE'S AN ABILITY TO RECAPTURE THAT 15 TO 2 3 20 TO 30% IS A SAVINGS TO A DEVELOPER, TO DO A 1.5 OR TWO CAR PER UNIT PARKING RENOVATION I THINK IS, WOULD BE SOME PUBLIC 4 5 RECAPTURING OF THAT. PROPOSED DENSITIES ON PAGE 22 [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] I KIND OF WANT TO RECORD AND UNDERSTAND -- AND 6 7 WE'LL GET TO THIS LATER -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] 8 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: CARLOS, YOU'RE DROPPING OUT. 9 WE COULDN'T HEAR YOU. I THINK WE MAY HAVE LOST HIM. CARLOS? 10 OKAY. I'LL COME BACK TO HIM. I'LL GO TO CHAIR PEDROZA THEN 11 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ WILL BE NEXT. 12 13 ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. YOUR COMMENTS YOU 14 15 MADE EARLIER --16 CARLOS ROMERO: I BELIEVE PAGE --17 18 ALFREDO PEDROZA: CARLOS, YOU WERE KIND OF GOING IN AND OUT. 19 ARE YOU IN A GOOD SPOT NOW? YOU WANT TO COME BACK IN? 20 21 22 CARLOS ROMERO: [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] -- LET ME SEE --23 ALFREDO PEDROZA: YOU'RE RECEPTION WASN'T THAT GOOD CARLOS. 24 25



JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: CARLOS WE'RE GOING TO COME
 BACK TO YOU. WE'LL GO AHEAD WITH THE OTHER SPEAKERS AND COME
 BACK TO YOU.

4

5 ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU. COMMENTS WERE SPOT O AND THERESE RESPONSE TO MAKING THOSE OPENING STATEMENTS. THOSE GOALS ARE 6 GOOD AND CONSISTENT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE HAVE BEEN TALKING 7 8 ABOUT IN SOCIALIZING WITH BAY AREA IN TERMS OF WHAT I'M LOOKING FOR IN DIRECTION IS LOOKING TO WORK WITH FLEXIBILITY 9 10 IS KEY ACKNOWLEDGING THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN URBAN AND RURAL COMMUNITIES COMMISSIONER FLEMING HAD A GREAT STATEMENTS ABOUT 11 FLEXIBILITY IT'S GOING TO BE CRITICAL IN THIS ANALYSIS AND IN 12 TERMS OF TYING TO FUNDING SOURCES. I CAN SUPPORT CONDITIONING 13 BUT WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE A POLICY THAT THERE IS 14 15 CONSENSUS ON AND THAT WE'RE RECOGNIZING UNIQUENESSES BETWEEN 16 RURAL AND URBAN COUNTIES BEFORE WE START TALKING ABOUT RECONDITIONING AND TYING IN DIFFERENCES. WITH THE CONCEPT OF 17 ANALYSIS, I GRATE GOALS ARE GOOD. THANK YOU. 18

19

20 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR
21 JOSEFOWITZ. NICK?

22

NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. I THINK THIS POLICY IS REALLY JUST
HAS SO MANY THINGS TO LIKE ABOUT IT. I THINK IT'S TERRIFIC.
THIS IS GROUNDED IN PLANNED BAY AREA. THAT WAS A DOCUMENT THAT

JANUARY 14, 2022

HAS DONE SO MUCH PUBLIC OUTREACH. I CAN'T REMEMBER THE 1 NUMBERS, BUT WHAT WAS IT? 10,000 CONVERSATIONS, FOUR YEARS OF 2 3 DISCUSSIONS, YOU KNOW, VOTED ON BY SO MANY -- BY ABAG AND MTC AND GONE THROUGH SO MANY COMMITTEES, AND IT'S JUST GREAT -- I 4 5 THINK THE PACKET THAT THIS KIND OF BUILDS ON THAT AND IS REALLY AN OUT -- IT'S SO IMPORTANT FOR THE SUCCESS OF THIS 6 POLICY. I THINK IT'S ALSO GREAT TO SEE HOW, LIKE WITH PLANNED 7 8 BAY AREA, THIS IS REALLY GROUNDED IN THE, SORT OF, BEST PRACTICE FOR HOW TO REDUCE THE NUMBER AND DISTANCE OF TRIPS 9 10 TAKEN, DRIVING ALONE AND HOW TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, AND THAT WE'RE MOVING TO, SORT OF, REALLY INCORPORATE OUR, 11 SORT OF, A BEST UNDERSTANDING OF, SORT OF, THE DENSITIES AND 12 PARKING AND TDM REQUIREMENTS AND NOT JUST RESIDENTIAL BUT ALSO 13 THE NEEDS OF COMMERCIAL AND THE IMPORTANCE OF KIND OF TAKING 14 15 INTO ACCOUNT, SORT OF, EQUITY. AND I THINK THE MAIN CHANGE 16 JUST REALLY RESONATES WITH ME WE'RE MOVING FROM THE IDEA OF 17 HOW TO BUILD TO CREATE AND PRESERVING COMMUNITIES AND, SORT OF, MOVING FROM HOUSING TO PEOPLE WITH THIS POLICY AND I THINK 18 THAT MAKES SUCH A DIFFERENCE. I ALSO WANTED TO SAY, I THINK IT 19 IS REALLY POWERFUL THAT THIS POLICY IS GOING TO BE TIED TO 20 FUNDING. AND THAT MIGHT BE ONE OF THE WAYS, AND I THINK THAT 21 MIGHT BE ANOTHER WAY TO BUILD IN FLEXIBILITY HERE. BECAUSE I 22 CERTAINLY ACKNOWLEDGE, AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE A 23 DISTINCTION BETWEEN KIND OF URBAN AND RURAL PLACES. I'M SURE 24 WE'LL HEAR A LOT OF, SORT OF, COMMENTS THAT WE SHOULDN'T HAVE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

> ONE SIZE FITS ALL, AND I AGREE WITH THAT. BUT, I DO THINK THAT 1 IN WHATEVER PLACE WE'RE LOOKING AT F THIS REGION IS MAKING A 2 3 SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT IN TRANSIT SERVICE, OR IN TRANSIT EXPANSION, THAT THERE HAVE TO BE -- THERE HAS TO BE, SORT OF, 4 5 A COMMENCE OR EXPECTATION FOR MAKING THE, SORT OF, LAND USES MAKING THE, SORT OF, WORK AROUND THAT INVESTMENT SO MAYBE ONE 6 OF THE WAYS OF PHASING THIS POLICY THIS IS AROUND THE 7 8 INVESTMENT GOING INTO THESE COMMUNITIES OVERLAID WITH THE KIND OF RURAL FABRIC I THINK THAT'S INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. AND THE 9 OTHER ELEMENT OF FUNDING, WE DIDN'T HEAR IT TODAY BUT WE HEARD 10 IT IN A PRESENTATION ON WEDNESDAY WHICH WASN'T A JOINT ABAG 11 PRESENTATION, BUT THERE IS SO MUCH NEW PLANNING MONEY COMING 12 TO THIS REGION AND I THINK THAT IS GOING TO BE ESSENTIAL THAT 13 THAT PLANNING MONEY IS, SORT OF, TIED UP WITH, SORT OF, THE 14 EXPECTATIONS IN THIS TOC POLICY. SO THAT THOSE COMMUNITIES WHO 15 16 HAVE EXPECTATIONS OF KIND OF BEING THE FIRST MOVERS ARE ALSO TEED UP TO BE ABLE TO GET THE PLANNING MONEY TO SUPPORT THAT 17 MOVEMENT AND THAT WORK. AND THIS IS COMPREHENSIVE IN 18 COMMUNICATING THAT TO US AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS ABOUT THE 19 PLANNING FUNDING AVAILABILITY THAT'S COMING DOWN AND HOW 20 21 YOU'RE GOING TO COORDINATE THAT. AND THEN, YOU KNOW, FINALLY ON THE, YOU KNOW, THE -- AND I AGREE WITH -- AND I APPRECIATE 22 COMMISSIONER SPERING AND DIRECTOR MCMILLAN'S COMMENTS THAT 23 THIS ISN'T ALL GOING HAPPEN AT ONCE. I REALIZE THERE IS A REAL 24 25 EMERGENCY, PLANNED BAY AREA HAS THIS REGION BUILDING 32,000

JANUARY 14, 2022

HOMES IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND CREATING 25,000 NEW JOBS IN 1 2 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS EVER YEAR FROM NOW UNTIL 2050. 32,000 HOMES A YEAR FROM NOW EVERY YEAR FROM NOW UNTIL 2050 AND EVERY YEAR 3 WE'RE NOT DOING THAT, THAT MOONS WE HAVE TO BUILD MORE THE 4 5 YEAR AFTER AND MORE THE YEAR AFTER. WE CAN FACE THIS IN A WAY THAT JUMP STARTS THE, ACHIEVING THE GOALS WE HAVE LAID OUT IN 6 PLANNED BAY AREA BUT IS SO IMPORTANT TO MAKE THIS REGION 7 8 AFFORDABLE AND TO KIND OF COME TO GRIPS WITH THE DRIVERS OF CLIMATE CHANGE. THANK YOU. 9

10

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. PRESIDENT
ARREGUIN AND THEN DAMON CONNOLLY. JESSE, YOU'RE UP.

13

JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: THANK YOU, MR. 14 15 CHAIR. I AGREE WITH YOUR COMMENTS. I KIND OF FRAME THE 16 DISCUSSION WHICH IS THAT THIS POLICY IS A CRITICAL STEP TO IMPLEMENT PLANNED BAY AREA BUT IT'S NOT ALL GOING TO BE DONE 17 AT ONCE AND I THINK THERE IS A LOT TO CONSIDER. NOT JUST HOW 18 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS WILL HAVE TO COMPLY WITH THESE REOUIREMENTS 19 SO THAT THEY CAN BE COMPETITIVE FOR REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY 20 21 FUNDS HOW THIS WILL IMPACT THE ELIGIBILITY OF TRANSIT PROJECTS BECAUSE TRANSIT AGENCIES DON'T HAVE CONTROL OVER LOCAL LAND 22 USE PLANNING. THAT IS SOMETHING THAT IS DEDICATED TO LOCAL 23 GOVERNMENTS. BUT I SEE THIS AS THE RUBBER REALLY MEETING THE 24 ROAD. WHERE IF WE AREN'T AS, AS VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ SAID, 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

MEETING THE TARGETS THAT WE SET OUT IN PLANNED BAY AREA TO 1 ACHIEVE THE CERTAIN NUMBER OF UNIT IN OUR REGION OVER THE NEXT 2 3 30 YEARS F WE'RE GOING TO IMPLEMENT MANY OF THE HOUSING POLICIES THAT WE HAVE OUTLINED WE NEED TO HAVE INCENTIVES FOR 4 5 PEOPLE TO COMPLY AND IF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE NOT GOING TO MEET THOSE BENCHMARKS THEN OTHER COMMUNITIES THAT ARE, ARE 6 GOING TO BE AWARDED AND ARE GOING TO BE ELIGIBLE FOR THESE 7 8 FUNDS. I WOULD SAY AS PRESIDENT OF ABAG I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT'S BEING DONE THIS IS A CRITICAL IMPLEMENTATION 9 ACTION TO HELP US REALIZE THE GOALS OF PLANNED BAY AREA. AND 10 TO THAT I WANT TO MAKE A REQUEST TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR 11 WHILE ABAG HAS A NO VOTE ON THIS, I THINK OUR FEEDBACK COULD 12 BE HELPFUL TO STAFF AT THE MTC COMMISSION, AS MTC IS 13 EVALUATING THIS POLICY AND I WANT TO RESPECTFUL OF REQUEST TO 14 15 MS. MCMILLAN IF WE COULD GET A PRESENTATION OF TO THE 16 EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE EXECUTIVE BOARD CAN PROVIDE WHATEVER COMMENTS TO STAFF TO SHARE WITH THE MTC COMMISSION. BECAUSE I 17 THINK THIS IS REALLY IMPORTANT. AND IT DOES ACTUALLY HELP US 18 REALIZE THE GOALS AND REOUIREMENTS OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING 19 NEEDS ALLOCATION, WHICH AS WE KNOW ARE VERY DIFFERENT FROM 20 21 PREVIOUS RHNA CYCLES WAS NOT JUST LIMITED TO FOCUSING ON PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS BUT LOOKED AT TRANSIT-RICH AREAS 22 AND HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS AS WHERE ADDITIONAL HOUSING COULD BE 23 ACCOMMODATED. AND I THINK IF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE GOING TO 24 HAVE TO MEET THOSE RHNA REQUIREMENTS, AND ARE GOING TO HAVE TO 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

REZONE SITES, THEY SHOULD BE REWARDED FOR THEIR WORK WITH 1 POTENTIAL PLANNING GRANTS OR OTHER DISCRETIONARY FUNDS. THAT'S 2 3 HOW WE ARE GOING TO GET LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO NOT ONLY IMPLEMENT THOSE REOUIREMENTS, BUT ALSO TO BUILD THE HOUSING, 4 5 OUICKLY, AFFORDABLE HOUSING THAT WE NEED IN OUR REGION. BUT THERE IS A LOT TO CONSIDER. THERE ARE COMMUNITIES THAT ARE NOT 6 READY TO IMPLEMENT THIS. AND SO WHAT ARE WE GOING TO DO TO 7 8 HELP WORK WITH THEM PROVIDING RESOURCES AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE THAT THEY CAN BE IN A POSITION TO BE ABLE TO BE 9 COMPETITIVE. THAT'S GOING TO BE PART OF THE PHASING 10 CONVERSATION. BUT I THINK THE GOALS OF THIS POLICY ARE GOOD. 11 THEY'RE CRITICAL FOR US TO ACHIEVE OUR GREENHOUSE GAS 12 REDUCTION GOALS TO ACHIEVE OUR AFFORDABILITY GOALS. AND MAKE 13 THE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING INVESTMENTS IN AREAS WHERE WE HAVE 14 GOOD DENSITIES, GOOD POPULATION DENSITY, AND WE ARE -- AND WE 15 16 HAVE GOOD TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY AS WELL. SO, THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR ALL YOUR WORK. LOOK FORWARD TO A PRESENTATION AT ABAG. WE 17 LOOK FORWARD TO PROVIDING OUR FEEDBACK FOR THE COMMISSION TO 18 CONSIDER. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT. AND I THINK IF DONE RIGHT 19 COULD HAVE A REALLY TRANSFORMATIVE IMPACT ON OUR REGION. THANK 20 21 YOU

22

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANKS JESSE. DAMON CONNOLLY,
THEN ONE OF MY FAVORITE MAYORS, MAYOR SCHAFF. DAMON?

25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

DAMON CONNOLLY: APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION AND GOALS THAT WE'RE 1 TRYING TO ACHIEVE. WE'RE STARTING TO GET QUESTIONS LOCALLY, SO 2 3 REALLY APPRECIATE THE SIGNAL THAT THIS IS THE START OF A CONVERSATION AND WE'LL BE BRINGING LOCALITIES TO THE CALLING 4 5 OF THE CONVERSATION. I WANT TO BRING BACK A POINT, I THINK IT WAS BY COMMISSIONER FLEMING, ABOUT SITUATIONS IN THE NORTH 6 BAY, FOR EXAMPLE, WHERE YOU HAVE A LARGER REGIONAL TRANSIT 7 8 CENTER SERVING MULTIPLE COMMUNITIES, AT THE SAME TIME, BEING ADJACENT TO SMALLER TOWNS OR CITIES, SO, THE JUXTAPOSITION OF 9 10 FINDING FOR THAT CENTER OR INCREASED SERVICE THAT ARE BEING TIED TO PLANNING DECISIONS GOING ON A HYPER-LOCAL BASIS. SO, 11 THE OUESTION IS, KIND OF, WILL WHATEVER WE ULTIMATELY ADOPT 12 ACTUALLY INCENTIVIZE TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS AND THE CONCERN 13 ABOUT HOLDING REGIONAL PROJECTS OR REGIONAL FUNDING 14 15 ACCOUNTABLE, IF YOU WILL, TO, REALLY, HYPER-LOCAL PLANNING 16 DECISION-MAKING. IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE NEED TO, AT LEAST, WORK THROUGH. WHAT SORTS OF FUNDS WILL BE AFFECTED. THAT NEEDS 17 TO CONTINUED TO BE WORKED THROUGH. I AM REMINDED THAT WE DID 18 HAVE A ROBUST DISCUSSION AS A COMMISSION ABOUT THE ISSUE OF 19 CONDITIONING. I THINK WE LANDED IN SOME SOLID PLACES ON THAT. 20 SO, KEEPING THAT IN MIND, AND OF COURSE, FLEXIBILITY, AS FOLKS 21 HAVE NOTED. AND THEN I'M ALSO HEARING THE QUESTION THAT HAS 22 BEEN TEED UP TODAY ABOUT WHAT POTENTIAL AREAS ARE WE TALKING 23 ABOUT BEYOND PDAS IN TERMS OF THE APPROACHES HERE. AND OF 24



COURSE, HEAVY-DUTY COORDINATION WITH LOCAL TRANSIT OPERATORS 1 2 AND COMMUNITIES. THANKS. 3 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, DAMON. AND AFTER 4 5 MAYOR SCHAFF WILL BE AMY WORTH. MAYOR SCHAFF? 6 7 LIBBY SCHAAF: THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. MY FAVORITE CHAIR. 8 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: [LAUGHTER] 9 10 LIBBY SCHAAF: WELL, I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF. I THINK THEY HAVE 11 DONE AN AMAZING JOB. AND I KNOW THAT NOW IS THE TIME, OR THE 12 DEVIL IS IN THE DETAILS, AND I ENCOURAGE YOU TO CONTINUE 13 WORKING WITH THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE. I DO HAVE ONE 14 15 QUESTION. YOU DON'T HAVE TO ANSWER IT, BUT JUST FOR YOUR 16 CONSIDERATION, I SAW, KIND OF, "CREDIT" FOR HAVING, SORT OF, INCLUSIONARY ZONING POLICIES, BUT I DID NOT SEE MENTION OF 17 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IMPACT FEES. IN OAKLAND WE HAVE AFFORDABLE 18 HOUSING IMPACT FEES WITH AN IN LIEU OPTION TO INCLUDE THE UNIT 19 IN THE PROJECT. SO IT'S ALMOST THE SAME THING AS INCLUSIONARY 20 21 WITH AN IN LIEU FEE OPTION. WE JUST DID IT THE OTHER WAY FOR SEVERAL REASONS. SO IF YOU COULD LOOK INTO THAT, IT'S ONE OF 22 THOSE DETAILS. I WANT TO ECHO A LITTLE BIT OF WHAT SOME OF MY 23 COLLEAGUES HAVE SAID. YOU KNOW, THE TIME TO BE SCARED OR HAVE 24 THE BEJEEBERS SCARED OUT OF YOU IS PAST. WE ALREADY DID THE 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

BIG BOLD THING AND ADOPTED PLANNED BAY AREA. AND REMEMBER THAT 1 2 THE MODELING IN THAT PLAN RESPOND TO STATE OF CALIFORNIA 3 MANDATED GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS. THIS IS NOT AN OPTION. WE ARE RESPONDING TO A STATE MANDATE. IF YOU NEED TO BLAME 4 5 SOMEONE BESIDES MTC OR ABAG. WE ALREADY AGREED TO THESE DENSITIES. THIS IS NOW, ACTUALLY, MAKING THAT COMMITMENT REAL 6 BY PUTTING AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AROUND T WE WILL NOT BE ABLE 7 8 TO REACH THE GOALS THAT WE COMMITTED TO IN THE PLAN WITHOUT THIS POLICY. I AM CONVINCED OF THAT. LEADERSHIP IS ABOUT 9 MAKING PEOPLE UNEMPLOYMENT. BUT IT'S BECAUSE WE ARE THE ONLY 10 ONES WHO ARE EQUIPPED WITH THE DAMAGE AND THE TOOLS, THE 11 ACTUAL AUTHORITY, TO FUTURE-PROOF OUR BELOVED COMMUNITIES. SO 12 THINK OF THIS AS AN ACT OF LOVE. BECAUSE THE FUTURE IS 13 DEPENDING ON IT. I WANT TO, ALSO, SPECIFICALLY, APPRECIATE 14 15 THAT ALL THREE P'S ARE COVERED IN THIS PLAN, PRODUCTION, 16 PRESERVATION, AND PROTECTION. THE BAY AREA HAS STRONG 17 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND ANTI-DISPLACEMENT GOALS. THESE ARE IN THE PLAN AND THESE POLICIES ARE IMPORTANT TO ACHIEVING THE 18 GOAL'S PLAN. AND I CAN JUST BECOME OAKLAND'S EXPERIENCE, 19 HAVING THESE TYPES OF POLICIES HAS NOT DISCOURAGED 20 21 DEVELOPMENT, CERTAINLY, IN OUR CITY. WE HAVE SEEN THE LARGEST DEVELOPMENT BOOM, WE BELIEVE, SINCE THE 1906 EARTHQUAKE, WE 22 HAVE ADDED 17,000 NEW UNITS OF HOUSING TO OUR CITY IN THE LAST 23 SEVEN YEARS. IT'S PRETTY PHENOMENAL. AND SO, THAT IS, AT 24 LEAST, A PROOF POINT. I JUST WANT TO, AGAIN, END BY SAYING 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

THAT, PERSONALLY, I LOVE THE BOLDNESS, BUT I WANT TO ASSURE 1 YOU, I WILL LISTEN TO MY COLLEAGUES. I WILL DO MY BEST TO KEEP 2 3 AN OPEN MIND TO A WELL JUSTIFIED RECOMMENDATIONS, TO PHASE THIS IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IN OVER TIME. BUT, I DO CAUTION US 4 5 THAT TIME IS OF THE ESSENCE. CLIMATE CHANGE WILL NOT WAIT FOR ANY OF US. AND I ALSO WANT TO MENTION THAT MANY OF US ARE 6 UPDATING OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS RIGHT NOW. SO, IT'S A PERFECT 7 8 TIME TO INCORPORATE THIS IMPLEMENTATION PLAN SO THAT IT CAN ACTUALLY MAKE IT INTO THE WORK THAT WE'RE EACH DOING WITH OUR 9 HOUSING ELEMENTS. SO, THOSE ARE MY THOUGHTS. BUT THAT IS ALSO 10 MY COMMITMENT TO KEEP AN OPEN MIND TO PHASING. AND I LOOK 11 FORWARD TO WORKING THROUGH THIS LEADERSHIP CHALLENGE THAT HAS 12 BEEN GIVEN TO EACH AND EVERY ONE OF US, AS WE FUTURE-PROOF OUR 13 BELOVED COMMUNITIES. 14

15

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, MAYOR SCHAFF. YOUR
 OPEN-MINDEDNESS HAS BEEN RESPECTIVE. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

18

19 AMY R. WORTH: OPEN-MINDEDNESS, I DON'T THINK THERE IS ANYBODY 20 WHO IS MORE PASSIONATE ABOUT PRODUCING HOUSING AND OUR 21 OBLIGATION TO DOING THAT. YOU'RE REPRESENTING 19 CITIES OF 22 DIVERSE SIZES, AND THERE IS A LOT IN THIS PLAN THAT CAN BE 23 IMPLEMENTED AND BENEFITTED IN LIGHT OF THE FACT THAT ALL OF 24 OUR CITIES ARE UNDERTAKING THE RHNA PROCESS. WITH THAT BEING 25 SAID, WHAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT, AS WE LOOK AT THIS PLAN AND WE

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

MOVE FORWARD, THAT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE INCORPORATION 1 2 OF A LOT OF THESE POLICIES, ONE INCLUDES THE ACTIVE ENGAGEMENT 3 OF OUR CITY PLANNING DIRECTORS. I KNOW THAT MOST DIRECTORS, THIS IS NOW COMING ON THEIR RADAR SCREENS, IT HAS NOT BEEN ON 4 5 THEIR RADAR SCREENS, THEY HAVE BEEN GRAPPLING WITH RHNA, AND I APPRECIATE THE FUNDING THAT ABAG HAS PROVIDED THROUGH THE REAP 6 PROGRAM FOR CITIES TO DO THE KINDS OF PLANNING NEEDED TO 7 8 ACCOMMODATE THESE SIGNIFICANTLY LARGER RHNA NUMBERS. SO, CITIES ARE GOING TO BE PLANNING AND ZONING FOR SIGNIFICANT 9 CHANGES OVER THE NEXT YEAR. BUT I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT 10 THAT ANY OF -- THE POLICIES THAT WE EVENTUALLY ADOPT DO NOT 11 EITHER PREVENT THE DEVELOPMENT OF HOUSING, OR PUT CITIES IN A 12 POSITION WHERE THEY ARE IMPLEMENTING THEIR RHNA REQUIREMENT, 13 BUT BECAUSE THEY DON'T CROSS THE T'S AND DOT THE AYES YOU'RE 14 GOING TO BE SEEING SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN HOUSING DENSITIES 15 16 WITHOUT DOLLARS TO PROVIDE THE TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE NEEDED TO ACCOMMODATE THOSE. WE HAVE BEEN GRAPPLING WITH THE 17 HOUSING CHALLENGES AND SURPLUS CAPACITY INCLUSIONARY DENSITY 18 IS A GOAL WE ALL WANT TO HAVE HAPPEN, BUT AT SOME POINTS THE 19 PROJECTS DON'T PENCIL. I AM PARTICULARLY CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. 20 21 AND RECOGNIZING THAT ONE SIZE DOES NOT FIT ALL IN THESE DENSITY REQUIREMENTS, THAT ARE OUTLINED, SO, I REALLY THINK 22 THAT THE CITY PLANNING DIRECTORS WHO ARE GRAPPLING RIGHT NOW 23 WITH THIS VERY ISSUE OF HOW DO WE -- YOU KNOW, WHAT DO WE NEED 24 TO INCORPORATE THESE PLANNING GOALS IN OUR COMMUNITY AND WHAT 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

IT'S GOING TO LOOK LIKE. AND SO I REALLY APPRECIATE THE 1 PERSPECTIVE OF OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND OUR CHAIR, OUTLINING 2 3 THE FACT THAT THIS IS THE BEGINNING OF A DISCUSSION ABOUT THESE POLICIES. AND THE PDA AND OBAG POLICIES HAVE REALLY 4 5 POSITIONED OUR REGION REALLY WELL. BUT I ALSO THINK THAT IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE'RE ABLE TO MEET THESE HOUSING GOALS. 6 AND IN OUR COUNTY WE HAVE CITIES THAT HAVE ENTITLED PROJECTS, 7 8 MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING PROJECT THAT ARE NOT BEING BUILT BECAUSE THEY CANNOT PENCIL S I REALLY THINK WE NEED TO BE MINDFUL AS 9 WE LOOK INTO THESE POLICIES, WHAT FITS WITHIN OUR COMMUNITIES, 10 BUT ALSO HOW DO WE ACHIEVE THE GOAL OF ACTUALLY PRODUCING THE 11 HOUSING THAT IS DESPERATELY NEEDED. FINAL PIECE. AND THEN I'LL 12 CONCLUDE I APPRECIATE THE ELEMENT IN THIS THAT TALK ABOUT 13 PROVIDING AND ENCOURAGING THE MOVEMENT OF JOBS THROUGHOUT THE 14 REGION. AND I THINK THAT THIS IS ONE OF THE HUGE CHALLENGES 15 16 THAT WE SHOULD HAVE FOR OUR GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS IS THAT WE HAVE PEOPLE TRAVELING LONG DISTANCES FROM HOME TO JOBS AND IF 17 WE CAN MOVE MORE JOBS INTO MORE COUNTIES WHERE WE HAVE 18 POPULATION CENTERS AND A WORKFORCE THAT IS THERE TO FILL THOSE 19 JOBS, I THINK THAT CAN GO A LONG WAY, ALSO. SO, IN ACHIEVING 20 THESE GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS. SO I LOOK FORWARD TO 21 CONVERSATIONS, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THE OPPORTUNITY FOR NOT 22 ONLY THE N THAT CHART, NOT ONLY THIS COUNTY TRANSPORTATION 23 AUTHORITY'S PLANNING DIRECTORS ENGAGE, BUT I REALLY THINK THAT 24 THE CITY PLANNING DIRECTORS ALSO CAN PROVIDE REALLY IMPORTANT 25



INPUT IN TERMS OF HOW THESE POLICIES CAN BE -- HOW THEY IMPACT
 OUR ABILITY TO PRODUCE HOUSING THAT IS SO MUCH NEEDED. THANK
 YOU VERY MUCH.

4

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU. AMY. GINA YOUR OUT
LAST COMMENT.

7

8 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU TO STAFF. THE QUESTION IS HOW WE GET THERE AND HOW IT ACTUALLY WORKS. I CANNOT EMPHASIZE ENOUGH 9 INCLUDING IN YOUR TECH ADVISORY COMMITTEE SOME OF THE 10 JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN PUT THROUGH SOME OF THIS. 11 BECAUSE WHAT THIS POLICY DOES IS, IT DOES NOT HOLD THE TRANSIT 12 OPERATORS ACCOUNTABLE. SO, I THINK I INDIVIDUALS BEFORE, I 13 MEAN, IN MY JURISDICTION -- AND THANK YOU FOR PUTTING UP 14 15 PICTURES FROM THREE DIFFERENT CITIES IN MY JURISDICTION, YOU CAN SEE WE'RE TRYING TO ACCOMMODATE. WE ARE BUILDING. BUT, 16 RIGHT NOW, WE'RE BEING INTERFERED WITH BY HIGH SPEED RAIL AND 17 SOME OTHER TRANSIT OPERATORS. SO THEY ARE NOT NECESSARILY OUR 18 FRIENDS. THERE IS AN EXISTING TRANSIT-RICH AREA. WE GET THAT. 19 THAT'S WONDERFUL. BUT THEY'RE NOT HELPFUL. YOU HAVE A PORTION 20 21 THAT SAYS ACCESS. AGAIN, THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE NOT CONCERNED WITH ACCESS. PARKING, IF YOU CANNOT PARK AT A MAJOR 22 MODAL CENTER, YOU ARE NOT GOING TO TAKE TRANSIT. THIS IS 23 PROBLEMATIC. AND YOU CAN LOOK, RIGHT NOW, AT THE BART 24 DEVELOPMENT IN MY CITY, THE FACT THAT THERE IS NO PARKING FOR 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

THE COMMERCIAL PART IS REALLY BECOMING DIFFICULT. IT'S A 1 BEAUTIFUL COMMERCIAL AREA THERE, IN ADDITION TO THE HOUSING, 2 3 BUT THE BUSINESSES, LIKE A RESTAURANT WON'T GO IN THERE BECAUSE THEIR CUSTOMERS CAN'T PARK. AND NO, YOU CAN'T PARK AT 4 5 BART UNLESS YOU GO INTO THE BART STATION, GETTING PARKING THING FROM THERE, SO, THESE ARE THE KIND OF NUANCES THAT NEED 6 TO BE WORKED OUT. AND WE NEED YOUR HELP, MTC, IN HELPING US 7 8 BUILD MORE, AND NOT, KIND OF, STRANGLEHOLDING US, WHICH SOME OF THIS APPEARS TO BE. PLANNED BAY AREA IS GREAT. I THINK SOME 9 OF IT IS ALREADY OUT OF DATE. THERE IS A LOT OF HOUSING LAWS 10 THAT WERE JUST PUT INTO PLACE THAT ARE IMPACTING OUR ABILITIES 11 TO BUILD HOUSING, TO BE SUSTAINABLE, ALL KINDS OF STUFF. WE 12 HAVE UPZONED. WE WILL CONTINUE TO UPZONE. DON'T THINK WE'RE 13 NOT; WE ARE DOING THAT. BUT WHEN YOU ADD IN HERE RENT 14 15 STABILIZATION, JUST CAUSE EVICTIONS, TENANT-RIGHT COUNCILS. I 16 BELIEVE THE LEGISLATURE HAS ALREADY WEIGHED IN ON THAT. SO IT SEEMS LIKE WE'RE TELLING THEM, NO, YOU DIDN'T DO IT RIGHT, AND 17 NOW YOU HAVE GOT TO DO THIS. IT WAS POINTED OUT BY ANOTHER 18 SPEAKER THAT WE DON'T HAVE THE ABILITY -- SOME OF US SMALLER 19 JURISDICTIONS -- TO DO THAT. SO, WHEN YOU HAVE YOUR AFFORDABLE 20 21 PROTECTION AND NEIGHBORHOOD STABILIZATION PORTION IN THERE, AND YOU'RE GOING TO CONDITION FUNDING ON EVERY SINGLE -- I 22 REPRESENT 20 CITIES -- IF WE DON'T HAVE THAT, WE'RE NOT 23 ELIGIBLE FOR THE ENTIRE ELECTRIFICATION OF CALTRAIN WITHIN OUR 24 JURISDICTION? I MEAN, THAT IS -- THAT'S NOT GOING TO LET US 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

ACHIEVE THE GOALS WE WANT. WE WANT TO BUILT. WE WANT TO MAKE 1 ALL THIS HAPPEN. WE NEED YOUR HELP. SO I'M KIND OF LOOKING FOR 2 3 MORE POLICY OR PORTIONS OF THIS THAT ACTUALLY HELP US GET TO BUILDING MORE AND NOT INTERFERE WITH WHAT'S CURRENTLY 4 5 HAPPENING HERE. SO, YOU KNOW, IF YOU HAD SOMETHING IN THEREABOUT HIGH SPEED RAIL NOT STEALING THE LAND WHICH WE HAVE 6 ALREADY APPROVED FOR 488 HOUSING UNITS FOR STREET LEVEL 7 8 PARKING, I GOT NO PROBLEM WITH THAT. THAT'S WONDERFUL. TELL THEM. THAT'S IMPOSSIBLE, AND I CAN GO AHEAD WITH TEN STORIES, 9 10 48488 HOUSING UNITS. WE WANT TO BUILD. SO, PLEASE, I THINK YOU NEED TO BRING IN THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. SOME OF US HAVE THE 11 EXPERIENCE TO SAY THIS IS WHAT WORKS, THIS IS WHAT DOESN'T 12 WORK. BECAUSE LET ME TELL YOU RIGHT NOW, A PERSON TRYING TO 13 GET A LOAN, A DEVELOPER FOR A COMMERCIAL/HOUSING I DON'T THINK 14 THEY CAN GET THE LOAN UNLESS IT INCLUDES SOME PARKING AND 15 YOU'RE SAYING, NO. NOTHING. WE CAN TRANSITION OUT. 16 [INDISCERNIBLE] IS GREAT, THEY'RE BUILDING A BIG PARKING 17 STRUCTURE, BUT WITH THE FUTURE OF TRANSFORMING THAT, SO WE CAN 18 MAKE ALL THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENTS WORK, THOSE ARE THE TYPE 19 OF THINGS HERE THAT I WOULD LOVE TO SEE. AND WE WANT TO GET 20 21 THERE. WE WANT TO REDUCE THE GREENHOUSE GAS. WE ALL HAVE THE SAME GOAL. IT'S JUST KIND OF HOW THE POLICY IS CURRENTLY 22 WRITTEN HERE. SO, I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD BE CONTRADICTING THE 23 LEGISLATURE. I'M REALLY -- I THINK THERE ARE NEW WAYS THAT WE 24 CAN BE BOLD AND MAKE ALL OF THIS HAPPEN. BECAUSE WHAT WORKS IN 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 14, 2022

A BIG CITY, LIKE MAYOR SCHAFF'S, OR SAN FRANCISCO, DOESN'T 1 2 NECESSARILY WORK IN OUR CITIES. SO, PLEASE LET US BE A PART OF 3 THIS PROCESS. AND, REALLY MAKING IT WORK IN THE FUTURE, HERE, WE REALLY -- I MEAN, WE COULD USE LEGISLATION THAT, IF WE HAVE 4 5 AN OLD BUILDING, WE CAN -- THAT WAS AT ONE TIME HOUSING, BUT HASN'T BEEN FOR FIVE YEARS, IF WE COULD COUNT THAT IN OUR RHNA 6 NUMBERS. WE WANT TO MAKE THINGS WORK HERE, BUT THEY DON'T 7 8 ALLOW US TO DO THAT. SO, HELP US. AND WE CAN WORK TOGETHER. I REALLY WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY. I SUGGEST THE TECH ADVISORY 9 10 COMMITTEE BE EXPANDED TO SOME OF OUR LOCAL AND SMALLER JURISDICTIONS BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT TO REPEAT THE MISTAKES OF 11 THE PAST. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. 12

13

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU, GINA. MARTHA, HOW
MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?

16

17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RIGHT NOW WE HAVE TEN SPEAKERS AND18 COUNTING. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE PEOPLE?

19

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: WELL, YOU KNOW, I WOULD LIKE
TO GIVE PEOPLE, LIKE, ONE MINUTE, BUT THEY CAN GO OVER A
LITTLE BIT. BUT BEFORE WE GO TO THE PUBLIC COMMENTS -- STAFF
DID YOU -- I KNOW MAYOR SCHAFF HAD A QUESTION. THERE WASN'T A
LOT OF QUESTIONS AND MORE STATEMENTS. MATT, DID YOU GUYS HAVE
ANYTHING YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO --

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



2 MATT MALONEY: I'M HAPPY TO GIVE A QUICK SUM UP, MAYBE A MINUTE 3 IF THAT'S HELPFUL.

4

1

5 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: GO AHEAD.

6

MATT MALONEY: THERE WAS A QUESTION OR COMMENT ABOUT STAFF 7 8 DOING AN ASSESSMENT OF WHAT'S GOING ON IN THE TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND I THINK THAT'S RIGHT ON THE MARK AND WE ARE PLANNING 9 TO DIG INTO THAT MORE. WE HAVE GOT A LOT OF INFORMATION OUT 10 THERE IN THE EXISTING PDAS PLANS WE CAN DRAW FROM BUT WOE HAVE 11 TO DO MORE RESEARCH ON THAT, THAT IS CERTAINLY PART OF OUR 12 WORK PLAN. I THINK ON THE SUBJECT OF DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES AND 13 SMALLER COMMUNITIES AROUND THE AREA, AND I THINK IT WAS OUR 14 INTENT WITH THE DIFFERENT TIERS THAT WE SHOWED IN THE 15 16 PRESENTATION, TIER ONE, TIER TWO, TIER THREE, YOU KNOW, KIND 17 OF LOOKING AT COMMUTER RAIL SYSTEMS LIKE SMART, YOU KNOW, DIFFERENT FROM HEAVY RAIL SYSTEMS LIKE BART AND CALTRAIN. I 18 THINK THAT'S ALL IN THE MIX AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN 19 CONTINUE TO PLAY WITH AS WE HEAR MORE COMMENTS FROM ALL OF 20 21 YOU. I THINK COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ MADE A POINT ABOUT GETTING MORE PLANNING MONEY TIED TO THIS EFFORT. AND I THINK 22 WE ALSO AGREE WITH THAT, AS WELL. I THINK OBAG THREE IS AN 23 OPPORTUNITY FOR THAT. ALSO THERE IS A NEW VERSION OF REAP. 24 REAP 2.0, THAT I THINK YOU HAVE ALL HEARD ABOUT THAT MIGHT BE 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

OPPORTUNITY TO AUGMENT THE PDA PLANNING FUNDS THAT WE HAVE HAD 1 2 OUT THERE IN THE PAST AND TO HELP MORE JURISDICTIONS. I THINK 3 WE TOTALLY AGREE. THIS IS FOCUSED ON TRAS, RIGHT, REALLY, THOSE TRANSIT-RICH AREAS, AS WELL AS THOSE TRANSIT-RICH PDAS, 4 5 AND THERE WAS A OUESTION ABOUT MAKING SURE WE INCENTIVIZE TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS AND WE DEFINITELY WANT TO DO THAT. THE 6 OTHER PART OF THIS IS WE WANT TO MAKE SURE ANY IMPROVEMENTS 7 8 THAT WE MAKE ARE EFFECTIVE IS HIGH RIDERSHIP AND LOTS OF ACTIVITY. I THINK THAT'S IN THE MIX, AS WELL. IN TERMS OF 9 10 MAYOR SCHAFF'S QUESTION ABOUT AFFORDABLE HOUSING IMPACT FEES WITH IN LIEU OPTIONS, CERTAINLY SOMETHING WE CAN INVESTIGATE 11 IS PERHAPS INCLUDE IT AS PART OF THE MENU OF OPTIONS. I THINK 12 THAT'S MOSTLY THE SUM-UP OF KIND OF WHAT I HEARD. 13 14 15 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. GOOD. THANK YOU. GOOD 16 WRAP-UP. MARTHA, IF WE HAVE TEN SPEAKERS --17

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: IT'S UP TO 13 NOW.

19

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. GIVE A MINUTE AND A HALF. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE SPEAKERS, IF YOU COULD, BE AS CLEAR AND SUCCINCT AS YOU CAN. IF THERE ARE AREAS THAT YOU THINK MORE STUDY SAY THAT, IF YOU THINK THERE ARE AREAS THAT SHOULDN'T BE INCLUDED SAY THAT. BUT JUST TRY TO GET TO YOUR POINT SO WE CAN GET THROUGH THIS AS QUICKLY AS WE CAN.



WITH THAT, MARTHA, GIVE THE SPEAKERS A MINUTE AND A HALF. GO
 AHEAD AND START THE PUBLIC COMMENT.

3

4 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE RECEIVED CORRESPONDENCE BY THE
5 DEADLINE, AND THAT FROM BY TIM SEBRITINI. IT WAS POSTED ONLINE
6 AND THAT WAS DISTRIBUTED TO AND WAS POSTED ONLINE AND
7 DISTRIBUTED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS. FIRST SPEAKER IS JONATHON
8 KASS.

9

JONOTHON KASS: I AM THE TRANSPORTATION POLICY MANAGER AT SPUR 10 11 AND WE SUPPORT THE DIRECTION AND UNANIMOUSLY APPROVE PLANNED BAY AREA FOR EQUITABLE SUSTAINABLE AND LIVABLE COMMUNITIES 12 AROUND TRANSIT AS A MEMBER OF THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE 13 FOR THIS COMMUNITY ALONGSIDE MANY LOCAL JURISDICTIONS BOTH 14 15 SMALL AND LARGE SPUR HAS BEEN ENCOURAGED BY MTC STAFF 16 COMMITMENT TO RHNA AND PLANNED BAY AREA REGIONAL GROWTH TARGETS AS A REMINDER PLANNED BAY AREA JUST BARELY MET THE 17 18 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGETS SET BY THE STATE. TARGET THAT IS SURE TO BE MORE EVEN AMBITIOUS IN THE NEXT 19 ROUND. AS DISCUSSED THE TIMING OF THESE REQUIREMENTS DESERVE 20 CLOSE ATTENTION. WAITING TO QUICKLY WILL CAUSE US TO FALL 21 22 BEHIND ON HOUSING AND JOBS GOALS. AT THE SAME TIME GROWTH 23 TARGETS NEED TO BE REALISTIC AND IT TAKES TIME TO LAY THE GROUNDWORK FOR GROWTH. WE BELIEVE THE POLICY IS OFF TO A GREAT 24



START AND ENCOURAGE TO YOU FOCUS ON DETAILED CHANGES THAT ARE 1 2 NECESSARY TO ENSURE POLICY DELIVERY. 3 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER. 4 5 MARTHA? 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ON IT. NEXT UP IS ANOEIL. 8 SPEAKER: HI I'M A MEMBER OF COMMON GROUND CALIFORNIA FOCUSED 9 ON LAND USE HOUSING TRANSIT AND FINANCING OF PUBLIC SERVICES 10 AND INFRASTRUCTURE THROUGH LAND VALUE TAXES CAPTURE TASTEFUL 11 TO SEE MTC PUTTING TOGETHER POLICY FRAMEWORK WE BELIEVE WILL 12 INCORPORATE PUBLIC LAND ACQUISITION AND VALUE CAPTURE TAXATION 13 SUCH POLICIES ALLOW PUBLIC MUNICIPALITIES TO BUILD 14 15 INFRASTRUCTURE SPENDING GROWING ECONOMY AND INCREASED DEMAND 16 HAD TO THESE AREAS AND PUBLIC ACOUISITION OF LAND WILL ALLOW GOVERNMENTS TO RECEIVE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WITHOUT A STRONG TOC 17 POLICY THERE IS NO HOPE OF MEETING EQUITY AND CLIMATE GOALS. 18 AS SOMEONE GOING TO MEDICAL SCHOOL I UNDERSTAND HOW CRITICAL 19 HOUSING IS TO A PERSON'S PHYSICAL AND MENTAL WELL-BEING AND 20 HOW ACCESS TO HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS IS CRITICAL TO A GROWING 21 ECONOMY. IT'S CRITICAL THAT EQUITY INVESTMENTS NOT ONLY 22 RECAPTURE VALUE, BUT RECAPTURE STRONGER COMMUNITIES. PLEASE 23 ADD PUBLIC LAND ACQUISITION AND TAXATION VALUE RECAPTURE TO 24 THE TOC POLICY. 25



2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS JUSTINE MARCUS AND THEN RICH 3 HEDGES.

4

1

5 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JUSTINE MARCUS POLICY DIRECTOR WITH ENTERPRISE COMMUNITY PARTNERS WE'RE EXCITED TO 6 SEE THE DRAFT FRAMEWORK PRESENTED TODAY AND WANT TO THANK 7 8 STAFF FOR THEIR WORK PUTTING IT TOGETHER AND HAVING THE ROBUST ENGAGEMENT WITH THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE WHICH WE 9 SERVE O WE STRONGLY SUPPORT MOVING FORWARD WITH A POLICY THAT 10 WILL SET US ON THE COURSE TO IMPLEMENT THE GOALS OF PLANNED 11 BAY AREA BALANCING AS MANY OF YOU HAVE MENTIONED THE URGENCY 12 OF OUR NEEDS AND REALLY BEING REALISTIC ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION. 13 I ALSO WANT TO ECHO THE POINT THAT MAYOR ARREGUIN BROUGHT UP 14 WHICH IS THAT POLICY HAS OPPORTUNITY TO SUPPORT AND REWARD 15 16 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO DELIVER ON THEIR RHNA GOALS. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT TWO ASPECTS OF THE POLICY FOR CONSIDERATION AS IT IS 17 FURTHER REFINED. THE FIRST IS REALLY GOING DEEP ON THE THREE 18 PS, THE PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION, AND PROTECTIONS ASPECTS OF 19 THE POLICY WITH A FOCUS ON ANTI-DISPLACEMENT BOTH FOR 20 21 RESIDENTS AND LOCAL SMALL BUSINESSES. AND SECOND IS TO REALLY 22 REMAIN FOCUSED ON OUR COMMITMENTS TO AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING AS WE GO ABOUT DESIGNING THE DENSITY THRESHOLDS. 23 FINALLY WE KNOW THAT THIS POLICY WILL NEED COMPLEMENTARY 24 25 FUNDING AND OUR ORGANIZATION AND BAY AREA HOUSING ADVOCATES



ARE COMMITTED TO CONTINUING WORKING WITH YOU ALL THROUGH BAHFA
 AND OTHER OTHERS TO SECURE THE NECESSARY FUNDS. THANK YOU VERY
 MUCH FOR YOUR TIME.

4

5 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANK YOU.

6

7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RICH HEDGES FOLLOWED BY AARON ECKHOUSE. GO
8 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I WANTED TO COMMENT JUST BRIEFLY ABOUT 10 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. I GREW UP IN ONE AS A CHILD. 11 ACCESS TO A STREETCAR HALF A BLOCK AWAY. ALL THE POSSIBLE 12 SERVICES WE NEEDED WITHIN WALKING DISTANCE AND I BRING THIS UP 13 BECAUSE IT PUT ME IN THE FIGHT TO DEVELOP IT. ODS, BECAUSE I 14 HAD LIVED IN SOMETHING LIKE A TOD. I LIKE OUR CHANGE IN POLICY 15 16 TOWARD TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. I THINK IT WILL FULFILL WHAT WE HAVE BEEN TRYING TO DO. BUT WHAT I WANT TO RECOMMEND 17 IS, IF YOU REALLY WANT TO CUT DOWN ON TRIPS, WE HAVE TO HAVE 18 THESE SERVICES AND WE HAVE TO FOCUS ON THAT. BECAUSE ONLY A 19 SMALL PART OF GETTING PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CARS IS TRIPS TO 20 21 WORK AND BACK. SO, PLEASE, LOOK CAREFULLY AT THIS. I ALSO HAVE A QUESTION I WOULD LIKE A RESPONSE TO. I THINK THAT SB10 MAY 22 HELP, ESPECIALLY WITH THE COMMUNITIES WHERE WE HAVE 35 TO 50% 23 DENSITY OF HOUSING. AND MAYBE NOT MORE THAN THAT. BUT I WOULD 24 LIKE TO KNOW HOW THAT MAY AFFECT OUR GOALS FOR COMMUNITIES AND 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

TOCS. SO, ONE THING I WOULD LIKE TO SAY I THINK WE DO HAVE TO 1 2 HAVE DIVERSE LOOKS AT DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES, THE RURAL 3 COMMUNITIES DO NOT HAVE THE SAME ASPECTS AS OUR MORE URBANIZED COMMUNITIES AND WE NEED TO TREAT IT AS SUCH. AND JUST ONE LAST 4 5 COMMENT, REALLY A CARROT IS BEST USED IF IT'S A STICK PAINTED 6 ORANGE. THANK YOU. 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, RICH. NEXT UP IS AARON ECKHOUSE 9 FOLLOWED BY DERRICK SAGEHORN. 10 SPEAKER: HELLO. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS AARON ECKHOUSE I'M THE 11 REGIONAL POLICY MANAGER WITH CALIFORNIA YIMBY, YES IN MY 12 BACKYARD. WE ARE BIG SUPPORTERS OF TRANSIT ORIENTED 13 DEVELOPMENT AND WE APPRECIATE STAFF IS MOVING THIS FORWARD AS 14 15 WELL AS OPPORTUNITY WE HAVE HAD TO ENGAGE WITH THEM ON POLICY 16 DEVELOPMENT. OVER THE YEARS HAS BEEN A GROWING RECOGNITION FOR A COORDINATED REGIONAL APPROACH ON HOUSING AS WELL AS WAY IN 17 WHICH HOUSING POLICY LANDS USE POLICY AND TRANSPORTATION 18 POLICY ARE ALL DEEPLY CONNECTED WHICH WE SEE IN PLANNED BAY 19 AREA 2050. PROPOSED POLICY FRAMEWORK REFLECT THOSE IN AN 20 EXCITING WAY. HOUSING CRISIS IN THE BAY AREA IS TOO BIG FOR 21 22 ANY CITY TO SOLVE ALONE THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES IS FRAMEWORK ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING CRISIS IN A NECESSARY SCALE 23 IN A COMPREHENSIVE AND EQUITABLE WAY IT'S APPROPRIATE WU WE'RE 24 MAKING SIGNIFICANT REGIONAL INVESTMENT IN TRANSPORTATION AND 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

POLICIES IN PLACE TO ENSURE SUCCESS AND COORDINATION WITH 1 REGIONAL POLICY GOALS. WE CANNOT AFFORD TO FAIL ON OUR HOUSING 2 3 GOALS AS A REGION THE STAKES ARE TOO HIGH. I AM ENCOURAGED BY WHAT STAFF PUT FORWARD AND I HOPE MTC WILL MOVE FORWARD 4 5 TOWARDS A ROBUST TRANSIT COMMUNITIES PROGRAM THAT WILL ENSURE WE MEET OUR GOALS IN THE REGION. THANK YOU. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: DERRICK FOLLOWED BY JUSTIN. 9 SPEAKER: THIS IS DERRICK SAGEHORN FOR EAST BAY FOR EVERYONE. 10 11 I'M CALLING IN SUPPORT OF THE DRAFT TOC POLICY FROM STAFF. I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE ALIGN OUR PLANNED BAY AREA 12 GOALS WITH OUR -- THE FUNDING. YOU KNOW? MTC HAVING THE POWER 13 OF THE PURSE IN TERMS OF DETERMINING DISCRETIONARY GRANTS IT'S 14 15 IMPORTANT WE GET OUR TRANSPORTATION PLANNING LINED UP I 16 APPRECIATE THE FACT OF DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN DIFFERENT LEVELS OF INTENSIVE OF TRANSPORTATION AND INVESTMENT INCLUDING 17 PARKING POLICY. AS WELL AS STATION ACCESS THAT'S GOING TO BE 18 CRITICAL. I'LL ECHO COMMENTS I THINK IT'S NECESSARY TO GET OUT 19 AHEAD OF SPECULATORS ESPECIALLY WITH THE NEW TRANSIT STATIONS 20 I WOULD ENCOURAGE STAFF TO LOOK AT SOME TYPE OF PRESERVATION 21 AND PUBLIC HOUSING WITH PUBLIC LAND ACQUISITION IS MAKING SURE 22 23 TOOLS ARE AVAILABLE FOR CAPTURING UPLIFT FROM PROPERTY OWNERS NEARBY IN TERMS OF FUNDING BOTH AFFORDABILITY AND 24 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS AND THAT'S NOT SIMPLY THROUGH 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

VALUE CAPTURE FOR PLANNING BUT ALSO MAKING SURE THAT PROPERTY
 OWNERS WHO ARE SIMPLY SPECULATING AND NOT DEVELOPING THEIR
 PROPERTIES ALSO PAY THEIR FAIR SHARE FOR THESE PUBLIC CRITICAL
 HOURS. THANK YOU.

5

6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, DERRICK. JUSTIN FOLLOWED BY7 LISA. GO AHEAD.

8

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JUSTIN WANG ADVOCACY 9 MANAGER AT GREEN COMPLIANCE ENVIRONMENTAL NON-PROFIT 10 ENCOURAGING OPEN SPACE AS WELL AS DIRECT INVOLVEMENT WITH 11 GROWTH IN THE COMMUNITY. A STRONG TOC CLIMATE SMART POLICY IS 12 NECESSARY IN THE BAY AREA TO MEET OUR HOUSING GOALS REDUCE 13 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND MAKE SURE LOCAL RESIDENTS ARE 14 ABLE TO GROW AND THRIVE IN THEIR OWN COMMUNITIES AS HOUSING 15 16 COSTS RISE EVERY SINGLE BAY AREA REGION MUST PLAY THEIR PART TO INCREASE HOUSING STOCK PARTICULARLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO 17 MAKE SURE THE WORKFORCE CAN AFFORD TO LIVE CLOSE TO JOBS 18 SCHOOLS AND SERVICES THIS POLICY IS A GREAT STEP IF THAT 19 DIRECTION ESPECIALLY IF LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ARE LOOKING TO 20 21 UPDATE HOUSING ELEMENTS NOW TO ACHIEVE GOALS IDEALLY WITH AN EYE TOWARDS TRANSIT ORIENTATION. AS A REGION WE HAVE ALWAYS 22 LED THE WAY, WE PASSED PLANNED BAY AREA AND NEED A TOC POLICY 23 THAT WORKS TO ACHIEVE OUTCOMES OUTLINED IN THAT PLAN CREATING 24 THE 30 YEAR WINDOW THE TRANSIT ORIENT THE COMMUNITIES IS LONG. 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

MTC SHOULD INCENTIVIZE DEVELOPMENT SOONER RATHER THAN LATER
 ESPECIALLY WITH FUNDING I URGE TO YOU CONTINUE MOVING IN THE
 RIGHT DIRECTION WITH YOUR FULL SUPPORT OF THE TOC POLICY
 BEFORE YOU TODAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME.

5

6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. LISA FOLLOWED BY ROBERT ALAN OR
7 BOB ALAN. LISA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE.

8

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS LISA BORDERBRUGEN 9 REPRESENTING BUILDING INDUSTRY ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA AND I 10 APPRECIATE ALLOWING ME TO SERVE ON THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY 11 COMMITTEE THROUGH THIS PROCESS AND WORKING WITH YOUR TALENTED 12 STAFF. IT'S A LITTLE BIT LIKE MANY OF YOU GETTING A GRASP ON 13 THE FULL STOVE OF WHAT IMPACTS WOULD BE IF AND WHENEVER THIS 14 15 POLICY IS ADOPTED IN WHATEVER FORM IT COMES OUT IN WE 16 APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS BY JIM AND THERESE ABOUT TAKING A PHASED APPROACH AND ANALYTICAL APPROACH OUR MEMBERS ARE ON THE 17 FRONTLINE OF DELIVERING THE HOUSING THAT MANY OF YOU ARE 18 PLANNING TO BUILD AND WE CAN SPEAK FROM EXPERIENCE THAT BAY 19 AREA CITIES ARE LIKE SNOW FLAKES, EVERY SINGLE ONE OF THEM IS 20 21 DIFFERENT AND TRYING TO WORK WITHIN EACH COMMUNITY AND MEET 22 THE NEEDS OF EACH COMMUNITY THAT THEY'RE LOOKING FOR IN 23 ADDITION REGIONALLY IS A DIFFICULT PROCESS TO NAVIGATE. WE'RE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH MTC AND THE TOC AND HELPING ENSURE 24 THAT WELL-MEANING POLICIES DON'T INCREASE THE COST OF HOUSING 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

OR MAKE IT MORE COSTLY TO BUILD HOUSING BUT ACTUALLY GET US TO 1 WHERE WE WANT TO BE IN TERMS OF INCREASING THE DENSITIES 2 3 AROUND TRANSIT. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK THIS AFTERNOON. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. ROBERT ALAN FOLLOWED BY BOB 6 7 BIN. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. ROBERT ALAN. 8 SPEAKER: BOB ALAN FROM URBAN HABITAT. I WANT TO COMMENT AND 9 SAY THIS IS AN IMPORTANT UPDATE. SORRY. I'M NOT SURE WHAT 10 HAPPENED THERE. 11 12 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: GO AHEAD ROBERT. 13 14 SPEAKER: SORRY ABOUT THAT. JUST TO EMPHASIZE, I THINK THE 15 16 TENANT PROTECTION AND SUITE OF COMMUNITY STABILIZATION POLICIES FAR FROM BEING AN IMPEDIMENT TO HOUSING PRODUCTION 17 AND MARKET RATE HOUSING PRODUCTION ARE NECESSARY TO MEET 18 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS OF PLANNED BAY AREA. WE HAVE 19 GOT TO STABILIZE PEOPLE TO BUILD HOUSING WORKING TO ENSURE AND 20 PRESERVE AS MUCH HOUSING AS POSSIBLE AND ROBUST EFFORTS 21 22 STARTING WITH THE STATE ON SOCIAL HOUSING I DON'T THINK THE 23 MARKET WHETHER IT'S UNCONSTRAINED OR NOT IS GOING TO PROVIDE HOUSING FOR THE VAST MAJORITY OF THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS BUT 24 COMMUNITY STABILIZATION POLICIES AND KEEPING AS MANY PEOPLE IN 25

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 14, 2022

PLACE IS A CRITICAL STARTING POINT TO RELIABLE TRANSIT RIDERS
 WHO HAVE STAYED ON THE SYSTEM THROUGHOUT THE PANDEMIC I WANT
 TO MAKE THAT POINT AND LOOK HEARD TO ENGAGING IN THE UPDATE OF
 THE POLICY AS WE GO FORWARD. THANK YOU.

5

6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. BOB VINN FOLLOWED BY LAURA7 FOOTE.

8

SPEAKER: I'M BOB CITY ENGINEER FOR THE CITY OF LIVERMORE SINCE 9 VALUING STATIONS OF AT THE TOP OF THE LIST FOR IT. OC 10 IMPLEMENTATION I WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE ISABEL PLAN ADOPTED A 11 LITTLE OVER A YEAR AGO IN NOVEMBER 2020, IT WAS A MULTI-YEAR 12 EFFORT, COST A LOT OF MONEY, HAD LOTS OF STAKEHOLDER 13 ENGAGEMENT AND RESULTED IN A PLAN THE COMMUNITY OF LIVERMORE 14 15 COULD SUPPORT. CITY COUNCIL OF LIVERMORE ADOPTED IT 16 UNANIMOUSLY AND IT INCLUDES THE HIGHEST DENSITY IN ALL OF LIVERMORE THE TALLEST BUILDINGS LOWEST PARKING REQUIREMENT AND 17 HIGHEST AFFORDABLE HOUSING REQUIREMENTS AS WELL. WE MODELED 18 THIS AFTER THE PREVIOUS -- OR THE CURRENT TOD POLICY AND 19 RESOLUTION 3434 EVEN THOUGH IT WASN'T CLEAR IT WOULD APPLY IN 20 21 FACT UR DENSITIES EXCEED WHAT WOULD BE TIER ONE EVEN THOUGH VALLEY LINK IS A TIER THREE PROJECT HOWEVER AT FIRST IT 22 DOESN'T APPEAR THE ISABEL PLAN WILL COMPLY, AND MEANWHILE 23 WE'RE TAKING IN APPLICATIONS FOR HOUSING. WE ARE WORKING WITH 24 A LARGE DEVELOPMENT ON DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT FOR MOST OF THE 25



VACANT LAND AND I THINK IF THIS PLAN HAS TO APPLY IN THE
 ISABEL AREA IT WILL RESULT IN A SLOWING OF THE HOUSING
 PRODUCTION. SO I REQUEST THAT MTC STAFF PLEASE REACH OUT TO
 LIVERMORE, STUDY OUR PLAN AND MEET WITH US SO WE CAN TALK
 ABOUT WHAT IMPLEMENTATION WOULD REALLY MEAN. THANK YOU.

7 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. HAUSCAR CASTRO.

8

SPEAKER: HI. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE I'M HAUSCAR ASSOCIATE 9 DIRECTOR OF HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION POLICY WORKING 10 PARTNERSHIP USA THANK YOU STAFF FOR YOUR WORK GRATEFUL FOR ALL 11 THE WORK YOU HAVE DONE WE ARE EAGER TO WORK TOGETHER TO CRAFT 12 THE FINAL POLICY IN SAN JOSE COUNTY AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY WE 13 ARE ADVOCATING DAY IN AND DAY OUT RELATED TO HOUSING JUSTICE 14 15 AND A SUSTAINABLE ECONOMY WE ARE PLEASED TO SEE MTC'S EFFORTS 16 TO OFFER SOLUTIONS AS THE ENTIRE REGION CONTINUES TO GRAPPLE WITH VARIOUS HOUSING CHALLENGES WE LOOK FORWARD TO SUPPORTING 17 18 THIS AGENCY ON ANTI-DISPLACEMENT ISSUES AND PRESERVATION EFFORTS. EMPHASIZING IMPORTANCE FOR SMALL BUSINESS 19 PROTECTIONS, IN PARTICULAR PUBLIC MARKETS LOCATED NEAR OR 20 21 AROUND TRANSIT STATIONS PUBLIC MARKETS OR FLEA MARKETS THAT 22 SERVICE REAL ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY TO THOUSANDS OF VENDORS 23 THROUGHOUT THE REGION TO MAKE A LIVING FOR THEIR FAMILIES AND PUTTING FORTH ACTIONS AND POLICIES TO ENSURE VENDORS CONTINUE 24 TO HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY AS THEY'RE OUT THERE. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. DARYL HALLS. 2 3 DARYL HALLS: DARYL HALLS METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY 4 5 I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER SPERING AND NORTH AND EAST BAY COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF FOR CLARIFYING OUR COUNTY OF COURSE 6 SAY COUNTY OF MOSTLY MEDIUM AND SMALL SIZED CITIES A LOT ARE 7 8 WORKING ON PDA PLANS WE HAVE ADOPTED OUR RHNA NUMBERS WE HAVE MOVED FORWARD AND HAVE TWO FERRY STATIONS AND TERMINALS WE 9 APPRECIATE THE GENERAL DIRECTION GOING FORWARD AND WE WOULD 10 APPRECIATE TIME TO HAVE DIALOGUE WITH STAFF IT WOULD BE 11 HELPFUL. THANK YOU. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT IS NICO NAGLE. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE I'M NICO SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE HOUSING COALITION I'LL BE QUICK I WANT TO REITERATE 17 POINTS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN MADE. ONE, THANK YOU TO MTC 18 STAFF FOR THE WORK ON THE TOC POLICY RECOGNIZING THIS MASSIVE 19 UNDERTAKING FOLKS HAVE COMMITTED LOTS OF TIME AND RESOURCES TO 20 21 MAKE SURE WE HAVE A PLAN FOR A SUCCESSFUL FUTURE. SECONDLY, I WANT TO REITERATE THE IDEA THAT MEETING THE SCALE OF THIS 22 CHALLENGE IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT MOVING FORWARD WITH URGENCY 23 AND THE TOC POLICY THAT ADDRESSES THE IMMENSE NUMBER OF HOMES 24 WE REALLY NEED IS NOT ONLY IMPORTANT FOR OUR SHARED HOUSING 25

JANUARY 14, 2022

SITUATION BUT IN TERMS OF BUILDING NEAR TRANSIT STOPS, IT'S
 IMMENSELY IMPORTANT FOR MEETING OUR SHARED CLIMATE GOALS.
 AGAIN, THINGS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN KNOWN. I THINK FOLKS HERE
 ARE -- YOU KNOW, MOSTLY ON THE SAME PAGE OF THESE THINGS. BUT
 MOVING FORWARD, URGENTLY IS A PRIORITY. I APPRECIATE ALL OF
 YOUR TIME. THANK YOU.

7

8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. AND LAST, WE HAVE LAURA. GO
9 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

10

SPEAKER: HI. LAURA FOOTE FROM YIMBY ACTION AND SPEAKING ON 11 BEHALF OF ALL OF OUR BAY AREA CHAPTERS. WE'RE OBVIOUSLY 12 PROHOUSING AND ARE GOING TO BE FOLLOWING THIS POLICY CLOSELY 13 AS IT EVOLVES AND LOVE ALL THE WORK STAFF IS PUTTING INTO IT. 14 15 SO MANY GREAT COMMENTS HAVE BEEN MADE AND SIN I'M LAST I'M NOT 16 GOING TO REPEAT ANY OF THEM. ONE VERY SMALL THING THAT MIGHT BE WORTH NOTE SUGGEST WE ALSO TALK ABOUT THE CHALLENGES WITH 17 INCLUSIONARY POLICIES WITH PUTTING THE INCLUSIONARY RATE TOO 18 HIGH AND THAT COULD DISINCENTIVIZE HOUSING ONE THING TO TAKE 19 INTO ACCOUNT IS GIVING CITIES CREDIT WHEN THEY DIRECTLY 20 SUBSIDIZE HOUSING WHETHER THAT'S THROUGH LAND GRANTS OR 21 ACQUIRING THERE IS A LOT TO BE DONE TO GET CITIES MORE CREDIT 22 23 WHEN THEY'RE MORE DIRECTLY SUBSIDIZING HOUSING RATHER THAN PURSUING INCLUSIONARY POLICIES WHICH CAN BE COMPLICATE. RIGHT 24 NOW THIS IS GOING TO BE A COMPLICATE SPRAWLING AMAZING HOPEFUL 25



PRODUCING NOT SPRAWLING POLICY. APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK AND
 LOOK FORWARD TO FOLLOWING ALONG AS IT DEVELOPS.

3

4 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. LAST CALL PLEASE DIAL STAR NINE
5 OR USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE. JORDAN GRIMES.

6

7 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES LEAD MEMBERS OF THE 8 PENINSULA FOR EVERYONE GRASSROOTS HOUSING AND TRANSIT ADVOCACY GROUP IN SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY REALLY APPRECIATE 9 ALL THE COMMENTS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND COUNCILMEMBER 10 ROMERO. WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT HOW THE DRAFT FRAMEWORK HAS TURNED 11 OUT AND SUPPORT THE EMBRACE OF THIS GOOD SMART AND VISIONARY 12 PUBLIC POLICY WHICH IS COMPLETELY NECESSARY FOR THE BAY AREA'S 13 FUTURE. THERE HAS BEEN SIGNIFICANT DISCUSSION OF COST TO THE 14 15 MUNICIPALITIES TODAY SO I WANT TO TOUCH ON THIS QUICKLY WE 16 NEED TO WEIGH IN AND KEEP AT TOP OF MIND THE SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL COST OF NOT EMBRACING AND IMPLEMENTING THESE 17 POLICIES. COSTS LIKE RISING SEAS, RAGING WILDFIRES AND THE 18 CONTINUED OUT-MIGRATION OF WORKING AND MIDDLE CLASS FAMILIES 19 FROM THIS STATE AND FROM THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA 20 21 SPECIFICALLY. THIS FRAMEWORK REALLY GIVES WORKING AND MIDDLE 22 INCOME FOLKS A FIGHTING CHANCE AT HAVING A FUTURE HERE WHILE I 23 UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF REGIONAL PLANNING I KNOW CLIMATE CHANGE AND DISPLACEMENT ARE NOT TAKING A PHASED APPROACH I 24 WANT TO ENCOURAGE US TO MOVE FORWARD WITH A SENSE OF URGENCY 25



THAT THE PROBLEMS WE FACE DESERVE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
 YOUR TIME TODAY.

3

4 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
5 THEIR HAND RAISED.

6

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY THANK YOU MARTHA. I WANT
TO THANK ALL THE SPEAKERS. THAT WAS VERY GOOD INFORMATION IN A
MINUTE AND A HALF WE HEARD ALL THE OF YOU LOUD AND CLEAR AND
THE CLARITY OF THE TESTIMONY IS VERY HELPFUL. THANK YOU. MATT,
DID YOU HAVE ANYTHING FROM THE PUBLIC COMMENTS OR
COMMISSIONERS THAT YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO BEFORE I CLOSE THIS
UP?

14

MATT MALONEY: NO. I JUST AGREE. I APPRECIATE ALL OF THE 15 16 COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS TODAY OF COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IT'S SUPER HELPFUL FOR US AS 17 STAFF WE HAVE OUR WORK CUT OUT FOR US OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS 18 AND CERTAINLY ON THE ENGAGEMENT FRONT WE DEFINITELY HEAR YOU 19 ABOUT ENGAGING MORE DEEPLY WITH LOCALITY JURISDICTIONS. THERE 20 21 WAS A REQUEST TO GO TO THE FULL ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD BY THE CHAIR. WE CAN CERTAINLY DO THAT. AND, ALSO, I THINK THERE IS 22 AN OPPORTUNITY TO USE THE, WHAT WE HAVE SETUP THROUGH THE 23 REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROCESS WHERE WE HAVE 24 JUST A LOT OF AVENUES WITH LOCAL PLANNING DIRECTORS TO KIND OF 25



USE THAT AS A VENUE TO HAVE MORE ACTIVE DISCUSSION ABOUT THIS
 ESPECIALLY AS ALL THE HOUSING ELEMENT WORK PROCEEDS. SO I
 THINK THAT'S A GREAT IDEAS. THOSE ARE MY TAKE-AWAY'S. AND
 WE'LL BE BACK IN A FEW MONTHS WITH MORE.

5

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OKAY. JUST SOME CLOSING 6 OBSERVATIONS. AND FIRST I WANT TO SAY THAT THIS IS A FIRST 7 8 STEP IN A LONG JOURNEY THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE O BUT A VERY IMPORTANT STEP. AND I APPRECIATE STAFF BRINGING ALL OF THESE 9 ISSUES FORWARD. AND AS I SAID, THEY'RE IN OUR PLAN. THEY ALL 10 NEED TO HAVE CONSIDERATION. I WANT TO THANK PRESIDENT 11 ARREGUIN. YOU KNOW, HIS SUGGESTION OF ENGAGING ABAG IS, I 12 THINK, ABSOLUTELY CRITICAL. ABAG TOUCHES EVERY CITY AND EVERY 13 COUNTY AND TO ENGAGE THEM INTO THIS PROCESS IS REALLY 14 IMPORTANT. FOR US TO HAVE SUCCESS, WE HAVE GOT TO HAVE BUY-IN. 15 16 SO JESS THANK YOU FOR THAT SUGGESTION. THAT'S GOING TO BE VERY HELPFUL. STAFF, I WOULD LIKE TO AT LEAST WE CONSIDER TWO 17 PHASES. THERE IS SO MANY STRATEGIES THAT NEED TO BE 18 IMPLEMENTED RIGHT AWAY. SOME WE HAVE BROAD CONSENSUS, WE OUGHT 19 TO PUT THOSE IN PLACE RIGHT AWAY, AND THE SECOND PHASE ARE 20 21 PROBABLY GOING TO NEED A LITTLE BIT MORE ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION AND MORE CONSENSUS BUILDING. SO TAKE A LOOK AT THAT 22 AND MAYBE GIVE US A TIMELINE OF HOW THESE STRATEGIES CAN BE 23 IMPLEMENTED. THE THIRD IS THAT, I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT 24 WHEN YOU COME BACK THAT YOU IDENTIFY WHAT FUNDING SOURCES 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. IF THERE IS ONE QUESTION THEY HAVE BEEN 1 ASKED THIS PAST WEEK SINCE THIS HAS BEEN RELEASED IS, WHAT 2 3 FUNDING ARE YOU GUYS GOING TO CONDITION THIS TO. WE NEED TO HAVE CLARITY ON THAT. THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. NUMBER FOUR, 4 5 THERE IS A LOT OF PLANNING MONEY COMING INTO THIS REGION BUT WITH ALL THE CITIES AND COUNTIES WE HAVE DONE ONE HELL OF A 6 LOT OF PLANNING AND WE HAVE GOT PROJECTS THAT ALREADY NEED NO 7 8 BE DELIVERED WE HAVE GOT TO GET TO THE POINT WHERE WE'RE STARTING TO DELIVER PROJECTS WE CAN'T JUST BE STUDYING AND 9 PLANNING WE HAVE GOT TO HAVE DELIVERY ON SOME OF THESE THINGS 10 IT'S REALLY PERSONALITY. AND LASTLY WE NEED TO BE AWARE THAT 11 WE SHOULD DO NO HARM. TALKING TO SOME OF THE DEVELOPERS SINCE 12 THIS CAME OUT, THEY HAVE INCREASES BETWEEN 20 AND 30% OF 13 MATERIALS. THE CONDITIONS THAT CITIES AND COUNTIES ARE LAYING 14 15 ON DEVELOPMENT, WE HAVE GOT TO BE CAREFUL THAT WE DON'T MAKE 16 IT SO DIFFICULT THAT NOBODY'S BUILDING AND ESPECIALLY THAT NOBODY'S BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE DESPERATELY NEED THAT 17 WORKFORCE AND AFFORDABLE LOW-INCOME HOUSING AND WE NEED TO 18 HAVE INCENTIVES THAT REALLY HELP DEVELOPERS AND HELP THE 19 COMMUNITIES PRODUCE THAT HOUSING. THOSE ARE MY CLOSING 20 21 COMMENTS, COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. I CAN'T THANK YOU ENOUGH FOR THE INPUT TODAY IT'S VERY ENCOURAGING. STAFF YOU 22 GOT MY ATTENTION BUT THE WAY THIS IS BEING BROUGHT FORWARD AND 23 PHASED AND THE OUTREACH AND THE WILLINGNESS TO HAVE MORE 24 DISCUSSION ON THIS IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. PEOPLE ARE NOT 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 14, 2022

GOING TO FEEL THREATENED BY WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. BUT THIS 1 IS AN EXTREMELY IMPORTANT FIRST STEP. AND TO BRING ALL OF 2 THESE ISSUES FORWARD AND PUT THEM IN THE LIGHT, I THINK HAD TO 3 BE DONE. AND SO, STAFF, THANK YOU FOR THAT. I'M GOING TO BE 4 5 VERY CAUTIOUS IN THE FUTURE WHEN I ASK YOU TO BE BOLD AND UNFLINCHING, THAT I'M GOING TO TEMPER THAT A LITTLE BIT. AND 6 THERESE, I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU, FOR UNDERSTANDING AND 7 8 SENSITIVITY OF THIS, AND YOUR INTRODUCTION, I THINK IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. FOR THAT, THANK YOU. WITH THAT, UNLESS 9 10 ANYBODY HAS ANY LAST BURNING COMMENTS, I THINK WE'RE AT THE END OF OUR AGENDA. MARTHA IS THAT CORRECT? 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAT IS CORRECT. WE JUST NEED TO TAKE 13 14 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. 15 16 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: CHAIR, I WANT TO MAKE AN ANNOUNCEMENT FOR THE ABAG MEMBERS. 17 18 JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: OH YEAH. I WAS GOING TO ASK 19 YOU ABOUT THAT. 20 21 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR: WE HAVE THE 22 ADVANCING CALIFORNIA FINANCING AUTHORITY. THAT SHOULD BE QUICK 23 THEN WE'LL DO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING. SOME PEOPLE 24

25 ARE WAITING TO GET INTO THE ZOOM BUT JUST WANTED TO -- AS SOON



AS WE'RE DONE WITH THIS, TO GO TO THE ZOOM LINK FOR THE ABAG
 MEETING.

3

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: THANKS JESS. I WAS GOING TO
ASK YOU ABOUT THAT I'M GLAD YOU REMEMBERED. WITH THAT DO WE
HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT?

7

8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
9 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
10 ON THIS ITEM.

11

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. GREAT. IT SOUNDS LIKE WE DID A GOOD JOB, TEAM. SO, THANK YOU. SO WITH THAT, YOU KNOW, KEEP WORKING AND MONITORING THIS CLOSELY, BUT I THINK THIS IS A GOOD FIRST STEP. THANK YOU EVERYONE. AND THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government