

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



January 10, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP**
3 **MONDAY, JANUARY 10, 2022, 10:00 A.M.**
4
5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS ALIX BOCKELMAN. I'M
6 MTC'S DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR POLICY AND I'LL BE FACILITATING THIS
7 PORTION OF THE MEETING UNTIL WE ELECT OUR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR
8 AND THEN THEY WILL TAKE OVER. I WOULD WANT TO CALL THIS
9 MEETING TO ORDER THANK YOU FOR THE YOUR PARTICIPATION IN
10 NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE BUSINESS ADVISORY GROUP. AND
11 WE WILL BEGIN WITH A VIDEO ON OUR ZOOM MEETING REQUIREMENTS.
12 IF YOU CAN ROLL THE VIDEO, PLEASE? [RECORDED MEETING
13 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE
14 CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF
15 ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE
16 BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE.
17 THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND
18 OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND
19 STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
20 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS
21 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO
22 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
23 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE
24 OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
25 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON



January 10, 2021

1 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED
2 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT,
3 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC
4 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M.,
5 YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED
6 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF
7 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE
8 TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL
9 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL
10 BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD
11 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE
12 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
13 TO DATE.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WALLY, CAN YOU CALL THE ROLL
16 AND CONFIRM A QUORUM?

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** SURE. ALTERNATE, [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR
19 MEMBER BOUCHARD?

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK THAT'S FOR MEMBER TUMLIN? IS THAT?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YEP.

24



January 10, 2021

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** OH. TIM LAWSON WAS FOR TUMLIN. OKAY. I'M
2 SORRY. I GOT IT MIXED UP, THEN.

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** WALLY, QUICKLY, BEFORE WE START, JUST TO BE
5 CLEAR, I BELIEVE WE GOT CORRESPONDENCE THAT JIM LAWSON WILL BE
6 HERE FOR MEMBER CAROLYN GONOT TODAY AND JULIE KIRSHBAUM FOR
7 MEMBER JEFF TUMLIN.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER LAWSON IS FOR GONOT? RIGHT?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I AM PRESENT. REPRESENTING VTA. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. MEMBER CHURCHILL? MEMBER
14 CURRIER?

15

16 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ALTERNATE GONOT -- OR ALTERNATIVE
19 LAWSON? SORRY.

20

21 **JIM LAWSON:** STILL HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER HURSH?

24

25 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** HERE.



January 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

3

4 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** HERE .

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER LEVIN?

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE .

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER LINDSAY?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT .

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER MCMILLAN?

15

16 **TERESE MCMILLAN:** HERE . MULLIGAN?

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** PRESENT .

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** POWERS?

21

22 **ROBERT POWERS:** PRESENT .

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER SMITH?

25



January 10, 2021

1 **SUZANNE SMITH:** PRESENT.

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER TUMLIN?

4

5 **JULIE KIRSHBAUM:** JULIE HERE FOR TUMLIN.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** AND JUST FOR THE RECORD, MEMBER BOUCHARD IS
10 PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** AND MEMBER WUNDERMAN IS HAVING TROUBLE -

13 -

14

15 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I'M HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO THERESE SHE CAN
20 DO THE WELCOME, AND AFTER THAT I WILL GO THROUGH A FEW
21 ORGANIZING SLIDES.

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** HELLO EVERYONE. HAPPY 2022. IT'S SHAPING UP
24 TO BE QUITE ANOTHER YEAR, AND WE'RE INCREDIBLY GRATEFUL FOR
25 YOUR PARTICIPATION ON THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE.



January 10, 2021

1 YOUR EXPERTISE, WHETHER IT BE TRANSIT, BUSINESS, LABOR, OR
2 EQUITY, IS REALLY ESSENTIAL AS WE KICK OFF THIS ANALYSIS WITH
3 OUR CONSULTANT PARTNERS. AND ULTIMATELY FOR ALL BAY AREA
4 TRANSIT RIDERS. SO, AGAIN, DEEP APPRECIATION FOR YOUR WORK
5 THAT IS AHEAD. AGAIN, WE'RE, SORT OF, REFLECTING AS SOME OF
6 US WERE THIS MORNING. COVID IS WITH US. OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS
7 ARE STILL FACING AN EXTRAORDINARY CHALLENGE FROM THE SHOCK OF
8 LOSING UPWARDS OF, IN SOME CASES, 80% OF RIDERSHIP AND WHILE
9 WE'RE STILL BUILDING BACK THERE IS THE CURRENT OMICRON VIRUS
10 WHICH IS CONTINUING TO PUT A, YOU KNOW, WINDOW OF UNCERTAINTY
11 ON OUR WORK. WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO KEEP MOVING FORWARD, LARGE
12 BECAUSE OF THE FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE FROM CONGRESS AND THE
13 CALIFORNIA STATE GOVERNMENT. AND YOU KNOW, WE HAVE AN
14 OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT WHAT TRANSIT'S FUTURE SHOULD BE, EVEN
15 THOUGH THE UNCERTAINTIES AHEAD OF US SOMETIMES DON'T MAKE THAT
16 CLEAR. AND THIS BUSINESS CASE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO DELVE INTO
17 SOME OF THOSE QUESTIONS ANTICIPATING A NEW FUTURE, A NEW
18 NORMAL, WHATEVER THAT'S GOING TO BE. SO, I WANT TO OFFER MY
19 SPECIAL APPRECIATION FOR THE TRANSIT LEADERS HERE
20 PARTICIPATING IN THIS EFFORT, EVEN GIVEN ALL OF THE STRESSES
21 AND RESPONSIBILITIES THAT YOU HAVE ON A DAY-TO-DAY BASIS. AND
22 TO BE PART OF THIS TABLE IN DISCUSSING HOW TO SERVE OUR
23 CUSTOMERS BETTER GOING FORWARD IS TRULY IMPORTANT AT THIS
24 TIME. AS YOU RECALL, THIS QUICK TABLE SETTING, THE BLUE
25 RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE HAD DEFINED A VISION FOR TRANSIT



January 10, 2021

1 TRANSFORMATION. YOU KNOW, SEVERAL RECOMMENDATIONS IN THAT, TO
2 SERVE THE REGION OVER THE LONG-TERM, EVEN AS WE'RE GRAPPLING
3 WITH SHORT-TERM CHALLENGES. AND, THERE WAS A BROAD CONSENSUS
4 ON WHAT WAS NEEDED TO MAKE TRANSIT MORE CONNECTED, MORE
5 EFFICIENT, EQUITABLE, AND CUSTOMER-FOCUSED. BUT A LOT OF
6 DIFFERENT OPINIONS ON HOW TO GET THERE. AND THIS IS WHAT, YOU
7 KNOW, THIS EFFORT IS INTENDED TO FOCUS ON. AND, A PRELIMINARY
8 NETWORK MANAGEMENT EVALUATION FOR OUR CONSULTANTS HAD DURING
9 THE CONCLUDING SIX MONTHS OR SO OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
10 IDENTIFIED TWO GENERAL PATHWAYS. ONE WAS THE IDEA OF AN
11 IMPROVED AND MORE EFFECTIVE MANAGEMENT MODEL. THE OTHER PART
12 OF THE SPECTRUM, IF YOU WILL, WAS A NEW MANAGER ENTITY WITH
13 DESIGNATED POWERS AND AUTHORITIES. AND IF YOU VIEW THOSE AS
14 ENDS OF A SPECTRUM CLEARLY THERE IS THE POTENTIAL FOR HYBRID
15 COMBINATIONS IN BETWEEN. BUT THE COMMISSION APPROVED
16 PROCEEDING WITH THIS NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS
17 TO REALLY DEEP DIVE INTO WHAT ARE THE FACTORS THAT SHOULD BE
18 CONSIDERED, WHAT WILL BE RESOLVED, AND WHAT ORGANIZATIONAL
19 STRUCTURE MIGHT OFFER THE BEST ROUTE FOR IMPROVING SERVICE TO
20 COURT OF MERS, AND THE COMMISSION IS INTENDING TO ACT ON THE
21 CONSULTANT'S RECOMMENDATIONS OF THIS. AND I BELIEVE THE
22 PRESENTATION THAT'S FORTHCOMING THAT TIMELINE WILL BE LAID OUT
23 FOR EVERYONE. THIS ADVISORY GROUP WILL SERVE AS A MULTI-
24 TALENTED SOUNDING BOARD TO INFORM AND RESPOND TO THE
25 CONSULTANT' WORK. AND THROUGH IT WILL BE YOUR RESPONSIBILITY



January 10, 2021

1 AS MEMBERS TO MAKE A CLEAR RECOMMENDATION TO COMMISSION AND
2 IMPORTANTLY SOLICIT FEEDBACK FROM OTHER MEMBERS OF THE GREATER
3 COMMUNITY AND BRING THOSE BACK TO THE TABLE. SO, THE
4 PERSPECTIVES THAT YOU REPRESENT ARE FULLY VETTED, AS MUCH AS
5 WE CAN. THERE WILL BE SEVERAL OPPORTUNITIES OVER THE COURSE OF
6 THE INITIATIVE TO REPORT DIRECTLY TO THE COMMISSION ON OUR
7 PROGRESS AND ANY CONCERNS THAT MAY ARISE. SO, YOU KNOW, WE
8 CAN'T EXPECT WE'RE ALL GOING TO AGREE WITH THE CONSULTANTS'
9 ULTIMATUM MATS SUBMITTAL BUT WE CAN MAKE SURE ALL OF THE
10 PERSPECTIVES THAT NEED TO BE CONSIDERED ARE BROUGHT FORWARD,
11 ARE FAIRLY CONSIDERED, AS THEY SAY SHOULDER--SHOULDER AND THAT
12 PROVIDES INFORMATION NEEDED FOR THE COMMISSION TO MAKE
13 DECISIONS DOWN THE ROAD. AGAIN, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
14 OFFERING TO SERVE ON THIS PANEL, AND LET'S GET GOING. SO, I
15 WILL TURN IT BACK OVER TO ALIX.

16

17 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU THERESE, AND IF WE COULD JUST PULL
18 UP THE SLIDE DECK, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. SO, AND IF WE CAN GO
19 TO SLIDE TWO. I THINK THIS REALLY ORIENTS YOU TO TODAY'S
20 MEETING, THE AGENDA, AND YOU CAN SEE THAT WE'RE ALREADY
21 THROUGH THE BEGINNING AND SOME OF THE LOGISTICS THAT WE NEED
22 TO GET ORGANIZED AND SETUP. WE'RE GOING TO SPEND TIME ON THE
23 OVERVIEW FROM THE VIA TEAM WHICH IS ITEM FIVE ON THE NETWORK
24 MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE AND WE REALLY HOPE TO HEAR YOUR
25 FEEDBACK TODAY AS WELL AS PUBLIC COMMENT. THAT'S WHAT WE PLAN



January 10, 2021

1 TO DO TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. JUST AS A REMINDER TO ALL OF YOU THAT
2 HAVE AGREED TO PARTICIPATE, SEVEN TRANSIT OPERATORS AND THEN
3 SEVEN -- SO THE NON-TRANSIT OPERATORS, STAKEHOLDERS, SO WE
4 REALLY APPRECIATE YOU ALL BEING HERE AND BEING WILLING TO
5 SERVE ON THIS ADVISORY GROUP. WITH THAT, IF WE CAN MOVE TO
6 OUR FIRST ACTION ITEM OF OUR NEWLY FORMED ADVISORY GROUP. NEXT
7 SLIDE. OKAY THAT'S FINE. ACTUALLY, NO, SORRY. CAN WE PUT UP
8 THE SLIDE FOR THE ELECTION OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR,
9 PLEASE? AGAIN, THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. AND THIS SLIDE JUST
10 GIVES A LITTLE SENSE OF THE RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE CHAIR AND
11 THE VICE CHAIR OF THIS GROUP. AND I THINK MTC STAFF IS PROPOSE
12 THAT IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE ONE REPRESENTATIVE FROM THE
13 TRANSIT GENERAL MANAGERS, AND ONE REPRESENTATIVE FROM THE
14 OTHER STAKEHOLDERS SERVING IN, ONE IN CHAIR AND ONE IN VICE
15 CHAIR. AND I THINK YOU'RE ALL FAMILIAR WITH THE
16 RESPONSIBILITIES OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR, AND AS SOON AS WE
17 GET DONE WITH THIS, I'LL BE HANDING IT OVER TO THE CHAIR TO
18 LEAD THE REST OF THE MEETING. SO I WOULD BE HAPPY IF THERE IS
19 ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THIS. OTHERWISE, IF THERE AREN'T ANY
20 QUESTIONS, WE CAN GO TO NOMINATIONS. LET'S SEE, I GUESS I
21 WILL ASK BOTH MEMBER HURSH AND MEMBER LEVIN, DO YOU HAVE A
22 CLARIFYING QUESTION, OR DO YOU WANT DO A NOMINATION?

23

24 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** WE --

25



January 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** SORRY --

2

3 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** GO AHEAD, ADINA. I JUST WANT TO NOMINATE.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A CLARIFYING QUESTION. A COUPLE OF OTHER
6 BODIES WHERE I SERVE AS CHAIR, THE WAY THAT THE AGENDA SETTING
7 WORKS IS THAT THERE'S A MEETING WITH STAFF AND THE CHAIR AND
8 THE VICE CHAIR. AND I'M WONDERING WHETHER THAT MAKES SENSE TO
9 DO IN THIS BODY, TOO?

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YEAH. I THINK THAT WE WOULD CERTAINLY, AS
12 STAFF WOULD BE OPEN TO THAT. SO I THINK WHOEVER BECOMES THE
13 CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR OF THAT IF THAT IS THEIR PLEASURE, THEN
14 THAT IS WHAT STAFF WILL DO. AND SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT
15 REMINDER OF HOW THAT WORKS IN SOME OTHER BODIES. ARE THERE
16 ANY OTHER CLARIFYING QUESTIONS? OKAY. IF NOT, I'M GOING TO
17 ASK THAT WE HAVE NOMINATIONS FOR THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR, AND
18 YOU CAN EITHER NOMINATE FOR BOTH POSITIONS, OR ONE AT A TIME.
19 AND WITH THAT, I GUESS I'M GOING TO GO IN ORDER OF HANDS
20 RECEIVED. SO I'LL ANY TOW MEMBER MIKE HURSH.

21

22 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** THANKS ALIX. I WANT TO NOMINATE DENIS MULLIGAN
23 AS CHAIR AND ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE AS VICE CHAIR.

24



January 10, 2021

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OKAY. LET'S SEE, I GUESS I'M LOOKING FOR A
2 SECOND. BUT MAYBE I'M NOT -- ACTUALLY, I HAVE NEVER DONE THIS,
3 I REALIZE. I AM GOING TO GO TO MEMBER LEVIN TO SEE AND WE HAVE
4 A SECOND OR IF WE ARE TAKING OTHER NOMINATIONS. MAYBE WE'RE
5 TAKING OTHER NOMINATIONS STILL. ADINA?

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** NO. I DIDN'T HAVE ANY.

8

9 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** IS THERE A SECOND?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

12

13 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OKAY WE HAVE A MOTION. A NOMINATION, AND I
14 BELIEVE, A MOTION FOR DENIS MULLIGAN TO BECOME THE CHAIR, AND
15 ALICIA B, TO BECOME THE VICE CHAIR, AND WE HAVE A SECOND. ARE
16 THERE ANY OTHER NOMINATIONS OR ANY OTHER COMMENTS? OKAY. I
17 SEE A FEW HANDS. I'LL LISTEN TO THAT, AND BEFORE WE DECIDE
18 WE'RE GOING TO TAKE A ROLL CALL VOTE. I'LL GO TO JIM LAWSON

19

20 **JIM LAWSON:** I WOULD MOVE TO CLOSE NOMINATIONS.

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ADINA, DID YOU FURTHER
23 COMMENTS?

24



January 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WANT TO COMMENT THAT WORKING FROM THE ADVOCACY
2 ANGLE ON A FARE INTEGRATION AND FARES FOR A WHILE, HAVING
3 WATCHED DENIS MULLIGAN BE THE CHAIR OF THE CLIPPER BOARD
4 HAVING NAVIGATED EARLIER THROUGH AN IMPORTANT SET OF
5 MILESTONES I APPRECIATED HOW HE FOSTERED A VERY COLLABORATIVE
6 PROCESS SO I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT. AND THEN ALSO WANTED TO
7 THANK YOU FOR THE DISCUSSION ABOUT THE BEGINNING. BECAUSE ONE
8 OF MY CONCERNS IN PUBLIC COMMENT AS WAS STARTED AND RANDI
9 KINMAN TOO THE WAY THIS IS SETUP AS STAKEHOLDERS AND RIDERS DO
10 HAVE A MINORITY ON THE BOARD SO HAVING PEOPLE REPRESENTING THE
11 PUBLIC AND THE REGION BEING PART OF THE SETTING IS A REALLY
12 WELCOME IDEA. THANK YOU.

13

14 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THERESE?

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES, JUST FOR PROCEDURE, I WANTED TO SECOND
17 JIM LAWSON'S MOTION TO CLOSE NOMINATIONS, AND LAY THE PATH
18 FORWARD.

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** WE ARE MOVING TO THE VOTE, DENIS MULLIGAN AS
21 CHAIR AND ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE AS VICE CHAIR. WITH THAT, WALLY
22 COULD YOU PLEASE DO A ROLL CALL VOTE? WALLY, I THINK YOU'RE
23 ON MUTE.

24

25 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER BOUCHARD?



January 10, 2021

1

2 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CHURCHILL?

5

6 **BILL CHURCHILL:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CURRIER.

9

10 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER LAWSON?

13

14 **JIM LAWSON:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER HURSH.

17

18 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE?

21

22 **ALICIA JOHN BAPTISTE:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** LINDSAY?

25



January 10, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MCMILLAN.

4

5 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** POWERS?

8

9 **ROBERT POWERS:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER.

12

13 **SUZANNE SMITH:** SMITH AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER WUNDERMAN.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

24



January 10, 2021

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR SUPPORT IN THE BUSINESS
2 MANAGEMENT ADVISORY GROUP. THE ORGANIZATION NETWORK MANAGEMENT
3 BUSINESS CASE SHRUTI IS GOING TO BE THE STAFF PERSON ON THAT.
4 TAKE IT AWAY CHAIR MULLIGAN.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE GROUP FOR
7 YOUR CONFIDENCE IN ME AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ON
8 ALL THIS IMPORTANT ENDEAVOR. WITH THAT NEXT ITEM IMPORTANT
9 ENDEAVOR NETWORKS MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE. SHRUTI.

10

11 **SHRUTI HARI:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO OUR NEWLY
12 ELECTED CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS AND
13 EVERYONE LISTENING INTO THIS CONVERSATION TODAY I'M SHRUTI
14 HARI BUSINESS STAFF. I WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE THE ADVISORY
15 MEMBERS A RECAP OF THE BACKGROUND, PURPOSE, AND PROCESS FOR
16 THE INITIATIVE AHEAD OF US. SOME OF THE FOUNDATIONAL WORK
17 LEADING UP TO THIS POINT BEGAN WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
18 RECOVERY TASK FORCE AND AS THERESE MENTIONED THE TASK FORCE
19 DEFINED A VISION FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION TO SERVE OUR
20 REGION OVER THE LONG-TERM. AND ADOPTED GOALS FOR THE TRANSIT
21 TRANSFORMATION WHICH ARE FOCUSED ON NETWORK MANAGEMENT REFORM.
22 FOLLOWING THIS THE TASK FORCE REQUESTED THAT AN INDEPENDENT
23 PRELIMINARY ASSESSMENT OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT BE COMPLETED
24 PRIOR TO THE TASK FORCE TO SERVE AS THE FOUNDATION FOR AN IN
25 DEPTH BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION AS A RESULT THE SUMMARY REPORT



January 10, 2021

1 THAT PROVIDED A PRELIMINARY COMPARISON OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT
2 GOVERNANCE MODELS ARTICULATED A STRONG POLICY CASE FOR
3 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT ENTITY AND THAT THE BUSINESS CASE
4 SHOULD DETERMINE ITS EXTENT OF AUTHORITY AND BEST FORM. SO IF
5 YOU COULD MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THAT BRINGS US TO
6 WHERE WE ARE TODAY AND THIS BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS WILL BUILD
7 ON THE TASK FORCE WORK AND MAKE A RECOMMENDATION OF THE
8 PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE OF NETWORK REGIONAL MANAGEMENT THAT'S
9 THE GOALS OF THE BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS THE RECOMMENDATION OF
10 PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT MOST LINE TO
11 ACHIEVE NEAR-TERM AND LONG RANGE REGIONAL GOALS THIS
12 RECOMMENDATION WOULD HAPPEN AFTER A DETAILED BUSINESS CASE
13 ANALYSIS TO CAREFULLY EVALUATE THE BENEFIT-COST RISK OPTIONS
14 AND PRESENTS RATIONALE AND PREFERRED SOLUTION THE ADVISORY
15 GROUP CREATED BY MTC TO PROVIDE GUIDANCE AND INPUT, CONSULTING
16 AND RECOMMENDATIONS HOPING THIS WOULD HAPPEN BY SEPTEMBER OF
17 THIS YEAR. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WANT TO RECAP THE PROCESS,
18 AFTER THE SLIDE I'LL TURN IT OVER TO THE CONSULTING TEAM. MTC
19 WILL EFFORT WITH SUPPORT FROM THE CONSULTING TEAM
20 COLLABORATION WILL BE FUNDAMENTAL TO SUPPORT WITH THIS
21 ADVISORY GROUP PROVIDING VALUABLE GUIDANCE AND INPUT ON THE
22 PROJECT. THESE MEETINGS WILL BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC FOR
23 COMMENT. MTC STAFF HOPES TO COLLABORATE WITH LARGE AND SMALL
24 OPERATOR STAFF AND PROVIDE UPDATES FOR TRANSIT AGENCY
25 LEADERSHIP THROUGHOUT THIS ANALYSIS. I ALSO WANT TO NOTE HERE



January 10, 2021

1 THAT MTC WILL CLOSELY COLLABORATE WITH AN OPERATOR APPOINTED
2 ADVISER WHO WILL REPRESENT THE INTEREST OF THE TRANSIT
3 OPERATORS. THE ENGAGEMENT OF THIS ADVISOR SHALL BE AIMED AT
4 PROVIDING DIRECT FEEDBACK DIRECT TO THE PM AND CONSULTANT ON
5 FOUNDATIONAL INFORMATION REGARDING TRANSIT AGENCY OPERATIONS,
6 FINANCES, PROJECT COMMITMENTS AND DELIVERY, BOARD STRUCTURE
7 AND PROCEDURES AND ANY OTHER DATA AND INFORMATION THAT WOULD
8 BE CRITICAL TO UNDERSTANDING THE CONTEXT FOR NETWORK PROPOSALS
9 AND EVALUATING THEM. THIS WILL ALLOW THE TECH ADVISOR TO
10 UPDATE TRANSIT OPERATORS REGULARLY ON PROJECT DELIVERABLES AND
11 PROGRESS KEEPING OPERATORS ENGAGED THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS.
12 WITH THAT UPDATE, I'M EXCITED TO BEGIN WORK ON THIS PROJECT
13 AND PASS THIS ON TO THE CONSULTANT TEAM WHO WILL NEXT
14 INTRODUCE THE TEAM, WALK US THROUGH SCOPE AND TIMELINE FOR THE
15 PROJECT, TALK THROUGH THE HIGH-LEVEL METHODOLOGY AND APPROACH
16 FOR COLLABORATION AND LEAVE US WITH KEY NEXT STEPS FOR THE
17 PROJECT. BEFORE THEY WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT BACK TO THE CHAIR
18 FOR ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU SHRUTI. I DON'T SEE ANY HAND RAISED.
21 I'LL PAUSE TO SEE IF ANY PANELISTS HAVE QUESTIONS COMMENTS ON
22 THE ORGANIZATION OF THIS BUSINESS CASE PROCESS? I DON'T SEE
23 ANY HANDS RAISED. I DON'T SEE ANY ATTENDEES HAVE THEIR HANDS
24 RAISED EITHER. SO, MAYBE WE'LL GO TO AGENDA ITEM 5A WHICH IS



January 10, 2021

1 THE OVERVIEW FROM THE CONSULTANT TEAM. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
2 THE VIA TEAM.

3

4 **TAMIM RAAD:** THANK YOU. WE BE HAPPY TO BE JOINING YOU IN THIS
5 PROCESS ON REFASHIONING REGIONAL TRANSIT GOVERNANCE IN THE BAY
6 AREA TO BE FUTURE READY. MY NAME IS TAMIM PRINCIPLE OF ACCESS
7 PLANNING WE ARE THE LEAD ROLE ON THE PROJECT I WANT THE
8 PROJECT DIRECTOR AND DO A LOT OF WORK WITH LEADERS ACROSS THE
9 NORTH AMERICAN AREA AND HOPEFULLY BRING THAT EXPERIENCE AND
10 LEARNING TO THIS PROJECT I'M JOINED TODAY BY KATE HOWE PROJECT
11 MANAGER BRINGS EXPENSIVE WORK WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCY PROGRAM
12 DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES AND KEVIN OUR ENGAGEMENT LEAD ON THIS
13 PROJECT KEVIN BRINGS EXTENSIVE EXPERIENCE FROM LEADERSHIP AT
14 THE NEW YORK MTA, KING COUNTY METRO AS GENERAL MANAGER AND
15 MOST RECENTLY CEO OF METROLINK IN VANCOUVER AND HOPEFULLY SOME
16 OF THAT EXPERIENCE IN TRANSIT WILL RUB OFF A LITTLE BIT HERE
17 AS WE ADVISE ON THIS PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE, THANK YOU. A BIT
18 ABOUT OUR TEAM. MANY OF YOU KNOW WE LED THE SUMMER 2021 BLUE
19 RIBBON WORK AND WE BUILT OUR TEAM FOR THIS PARTICULAR PURPOSE
20 WE HAVE EVOLVED A LITTLE BIT BUILDING ON THE FOUNDATION OF
21 THAT WORK. MANY OF THE SAME FIRMS VIA IS STILL PROVIDING THE
22 PROJECT MANAGEMENT LEADERSHIP AND DEEP BAY AREA TRANSIT
23 KNOWLEDGE WE'LL BE WORKING ON TRANSIT POLICY GOVERNANCE
24 BUSINESS CASE AND FRAMEWORK FOR THE PROJECT, OVERALL
25 ARCHITECTURE BRINGING OUR EXPERIENCE FROM NORTH AMERICA. WE



January 10, 2021

1 HAVE A PRETTY DEEP BENCH OF SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS BRINGING
2 TRANSIT EXPERTISE AND KEVIN EXECUTIVE LEADERSHIP, STRATEGIES
3 WORKING IN STRATEGIC ADVISORY ROLE IMPLEMENTATION LEGISLATION
4 AND LABOR AND WE HAVE AUGMENTED OUR TEAM ON THIS ROUND WITH
5 KPMG WHO WE'LL BE SUPPORTING IN TERMS OF EVALUATING AND
6 FINANCIAL IMPACT AND FINANCIAL IMPACT AND ORGANIZATIONAL
7 IMPACT AND BUSINESS CASE FRAMEWORK WE HAVE A DEEPER BENCH OF
8 SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS INCLUDING DB SUPPLIERS WHO WILL
9 FOCUSING ON SPECIFIC AREAS OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT. SOME
10 FEATURES THAT WILL BE IMPORTANT TO HIGHLIGHT HERE IS THAT
11 WE'RE PROUD WHEN WE THINK OF AND ARE WORTH HIGHLIGHTING
12 REGIONAL GOVERNANCE IS CORE TO A LOT OF OUR PRACTICE AT
13 INSTITUTIONAL AND PROJECT LEVEL FROM DESIGN THROUGH EXECUTION.
14 WE HAVE A LOT OF NATURAL ADVANTAGES FOR GOVERNANCE BUT ALSO
15 PLACES THAT ARE QUITE COMPLEX FOR THE BAY AREA WE BRING LIVED
16 EXPERIENCE HAVING SPENT TIME IN THE SECTOR AND EXECUTIVE ROLES
17 ACROSS A RANGE EVER ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES FROM WAYFINDING
18 THROUGH MEGA PROJECTS HOPING TO BRING THAT BROAD SPECTRUM
19 PERSPECTIVE AS WELL AS IN DEVELOPING COMPLEX POLICY BUSINESS
20 CASES. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE RECOGNIZE AND THIS WAS
21 TOUCHED ON BY THERESE IN HER OPENING COMMENTS IS THAT THE
22 COMPLEX STAKEHOLDER ENVIRONMENT HERE IS QUITE UNIQUE IN
23 CONVENING INTEREST WILL BE A CHALLENGE THAT IS CORE TO OUR
24 METHOD. WE BELIEVE THAT OUR EXPERIENCE DOING THIS IN OTHER
25 CONTEXT WILL HELP US TO GET TO FASTER CONSENSUS. THIS IS A



January 10, 2021

1 REMINDER WHERE WE LEFT OFF IN THE SUMMER AND MOVING FORWARD IN
2 THE SPRING THE TASK FORCE DEVELOPED A PROBLEM STATEMENT IN
3 CASE FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND IDENTIFIED AREAS OF ROLES
4 WHICH WE FRAMED AS BEING EASY TO HARD BUT ALSO HAD A HIGHER
5 LEVEL OF PRIORITY AND DO ABILITY IN THE NEAR-TERM OUR
6 PERSPECTIVE IS THAT NETWORK MANAGEMENT NEEDED TO ADDRESS ALL
7 OF THOSE IN A MATTER OF HOW QUICKLY YOU COULD GET THERE IN
8 TERMS OF THE ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE. IN A COMPRESSED PERIOD
9 OF TIME WE SUPPORTED THE TASK FORCE TO HELP TO UNDERSTAND WATT
10 KEY PATHS AND CHOICES ISSUE IN ORGANIZING NETWORK MANAGEMENT
11 AND I THINK THE SHRUTI USED IS THAT IT'S IMPORTANT TO COME UP
12 WITH NOT JUST STRUCTURES BUT MODELS IN PATHS DISCUSSED EARLIER
13 MANAGEMENT VERSUS MANAGEMENT FEDERATED ROLE COLLABORATIVE
14 AGENCIES AND CENTRALIZED MODEL FOR INDEPENDENT AUTHORITIES TO
15 ACT DECISION-MAKING FUNDING AND AUTHORITY. SECOND, WHETHER
16 OVERSIGHT FOR THOSE BODIES WAS HELD WITHIN THE MTC OUTSIDE OF
17 THE MTC. WE KNOW THERE IS A LOT OF DETAILS AND VARIANTS THAT
18 COULD BE PURSUED LOOKING AT CONSOLIDATION IN PARTED BUT WE
19 FELT THESE ARE TWO MAIN FORKS IN THE ROAD AND THERE ARE A
20 NUMBER OF TRADEOFFS IN TERMS OF COST AND LIMITATION AND SCOPE
21 AND THAT FUNDING IN ALL OF THESE WAS CRITICAL. WHAT'S REALLY
22 IMPORTANT IS BECAUSE OF THE AMOUNT OF TIME WE HAVE THESE WERE
23 NOT FULLY DEVELOPED OR OPTIMIZED OPTIONS THERE ARE IS LIMITED
24 DATA AND TOUCH POINTS FOR ENGAGEMENT IT LEFT A LOT OF
25 DEVELOPMENT FOR LATER STAGES I WANT TO TAKE A MOMENT HERE TO



January 10, 2021

1 ACKNOWLEDGE AT THE TIME THERE WAS A SENSE BY THE OPERATORS
2 PARTICIPANTS THAT THE MANAGEMENT PROPOSAL THAT WE WERE
3 DEVELOPING THAT LOOKED AT THAT FEDERATED MODEL OF MANAGEMENT
4 WAS BLENDED INTO OTHER CONCEPTS OF OVERSIGHT. AND THAT WAS
5 DONE BECAUSE OF, AT THE TIME, BECAUSE OF JUST NOT HAVING
6 ENOUGH INFORMATION TO CLEARLY IDENTIFY THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN
7 THEM. A LOT OF TIME HAS PASSED AND THERE HAS BEEN SOME NEW
8 INFORMATION AND PERSPECTIVES AND MORE DEVELOPMENT DONE BY THE
9 OPERATORS ON THAT PROPOSAL, AND WE'RE VERY KEEN TO INCORPORATE
10 SOME OF THOSE -- THAT NEW THINKING INTO AN OPTIMIZED
11 MANAGEMENT CONCEPT AND JUST BROADLY LOOKING AT THIS AS A
12 BASELINE OF THE OPTIONS OR MODELS TO EXAMINE LOOKING TO INVITE
13 THE ADVISORY GROUP TO HELP TWEAK AND OPTIMIZE THEM AND HELP
14 THEM EACH PUT THEIR BEST FOOT FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. SO NOT
15 REINVENTING THE WHEEL. IN ADDITION TO THE OPTIMIZATION OF
16 OPTIONS THE NEED TO OPTIMIZE OPTIONS WE BEGIN WITH OUTCOMES
17 AND SOLVE PROBLEMS. THE BIGGEST PROBLEMS THAT ARE GETTING IN
18 THE WAY OF THE MOST IMPORTANT OUTCOMES. FIGURE OUT,
19 IMPORTANTLY, HOW TO MEASURE THE IMPACTS AND WHAT THE CRITERIA
20 SHOULD BE, BE ABLE TO DESCRIBE OR QUANTIFY OR MONETIZE THOSE
21 TO LEVEL THE PLAYING FIELD BETWEEN THE OPTIONS. THERE IS A
22 COMPLEX WEB OF FUNDING OF POLICY AND LABOR ACCOUNTABILITIES
23 THAT ARE ENTRENCHED IN LAW THESE ARE DIFFICULT TO BREAK. THIS
24 IS ONE OF THE UNIQUE FEATURES OF GOVERNANCE IN THE BAY AREA
25 AND TO REALLY UNDERSTANDS THOSE BOUNDARY CONDITIONS OF WHAT



January 10, 2021

1 COULD CHANGE AND WHAT'S VERY DIFFICULT OR IMPOSSIBLE TO CHANGE
2 BECOMES A KEY DESIGN CONSIDERATION OR CONSTRAINT. AND OF
3 COURSE WE ALL WANT SOME FORM OF REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT TO
4 SUCCEED IN SOME FORM. AND I THINK WE SEE THIS IN PROJECTS,
5 GENERALLY, IS THAT WHEN YOU WANT SOMETHING TO HAPPEN, IT'S
6 SOMETIMES EASY TO APPROACH IT WITH ROSE-TINTED SPECTACLES AND
7 WE WANT TO BRING A HEALTHY DOSE OF CRITICISM TO MAKE SURE
8 WE'RE ARE CHOOSING THE RIGHT OPTIONS AND REALLY INTERROGATE
9 THESE AND DEFINE SUCCESS AND REALLY TAKING LONG-TERM VIEW OF
10 PROSPECT REACHING NETWORK MANAGEMENT RESPONSIBILITIES BUT SOME
11 OF THE MORE CHALLENGING ONES MIGHT BE THE ONES THAT HOLD THE
12 BIGGEST OUTCOME OR IMPACT AND WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THE
13 GOVERNANCE OPTIONS SUPPORT THOSE. ATTAINMENT OF THOSE OVER
14 THE LONGER TERM. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE. OKAY. SO HOW DO WE DO
15 THIS IN THE NEAR-TERM ON THIS PROJECT THINKING ABOUT KEY
16 CHALLENGES. WE KNOW THERE IS LOTS OF STAKEHOLDERS THAT IT'S A
17 COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONAL LEGAL AND FISCAL LANDSCAPE AS I
18 MENTIONED. WE NEED TO AGREE ON THE GOALS AND OPTIONS AND
19 EVIDENT EVIDENTIARY BASIS WHEN STAKEHOLDERS HAVE A NUMBER OF
20 DIFFERENT VIEWS ON WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE THIS CAN MAKE IT A
21 CONTESTED ENVIRONMENT FOR DIALOGUE. OUR VISION IS TO SUPPORT
22 THAT DIALOGUE TO EXPOSE THOSE AREAS OF AGREEMENT AND POINTS OF
23 CONVERGENCE AND DIVERGENCE TO BE CLEAR ABOUT WHY THERE IS
24 DISAGREEMENT NOT THE PROBLEM OF DISAGREEMENT BUT IT'S
25 IMPORTANT TO BE CLEAR AND HAVE AN OPEN CONVERSATION ABOUT



January 10, 2021

1 THAT. IMPORTANTLY AT THE FRONT ENDS IS BUILDING CONSENSUS ON
2 THE GOALS AND METHODS OF STUDY AND HOW WE'RE GOING TO ANALYZE
3 THAT. THAT'S THE FOUNDATION OF THIS PROJECT AND WE WANT TO
4 MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE BUILDING A SOLID ONE FOR IT THAT CAN HOLD
5 THE HOUSE LATER ON. AND REALLY IMPORTANTLY, THIS IS ABOUT
6 THOSE BOUNDARY CONDITIONS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT EARLIER. IT'S
7 NOT A CHOICE BETWEEN LOCAL AND REGIONAL CONTROL, WE REALLY
8 DON'T LOOK AT IT THAT WAY. IT'S NOT A ZERO SUM GAME IT'S ABOUT
9 AFFIRMING THE RESPECTIVE INTEREST AND ROLES OF LOCAL AND
10 REGIONAL AND WHERE THEY'RE VALID AND IMPORTANT TO ADVANCING
11 BOTH LOCAL AND REGIONAL GOALS AND ACHIEVING BOTH. IT'S NOT AN
12 EITHER/OR, IT'S A BOTH/AND. AND THIS PROCESS AFFORDS TIME FOR
13 DIALOGUE AND HOPEFULLY THIS WILL HELP BUILD UNDERSTANDING AND
14 TRUST WHICH IS OUR AIM. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE. I'LL QUICKLY GO
15 THROUGH THESE LAST COUPLE HERE. KEY FEATURE OF OUR PROPOSAL:
16 FOCUSING ON THIS THEME OF ENGAGEMENT. I WON'T GO THROUGH ALL
17 OF THESE BOXES BECAUSE THOSE ARE THE TECHNICAL STEPS BUT
18 IMPORTANTLY THE BLUE ONE DOWN BELOW OUR FOCUS IS COLLABORATIVE
19 ENGAGEMENT WITH THE ADVISORY GROUP, WITH THE OPERATORS, KEY
20 INTERESTS, TO ENSURE AT THOSE KEY INFLECTION POINTS KEY
21 MILESTONES IN THE PROJECT WE'RE BUILDING CONSTITUENCY
22 AWARENESS WE'RE HAVING OPEN DIALOGUE AND HEALTHY DEBATE
23 THROUGHOUT THE EVALUATION SO THOSE POINTS OF AGREEMENT AND
24 THOSE RUBS ARE CLEARLY IDENTIFIED AND WORKED THROUGH. THIS IS
25 PART OF THAT APPROACH OF TRYING TO BUILD CONSTITUENCY FOR THE



January 10, 2021

1 END RESULT THAT COMES IN THE FALL. ALL THE KEY STAGES ARE
2 OUTLINED HERE, BUT THE ONE THEY DID WANT TO HIGHLIGHT HERE IS
3 THE TRADE OF OPTIMIZED OPTIONS. BECAUSE WE TALKED ABOUT THIS
4 EARLIER IS THAT SENSE THAT WE LEFT THE SUMMER WITHOUT FULLY
5 EXPLORING SOME OF THOSE OPTION IN OUR APPROACH AND OPTIONS TO
6 REALLY ADDRESS THE WAY IN WHICH THEY ARE EACH WEEK AND TO
7 FULLY OPTIMIZE THEM TO HELP PUT THEIR BEST FOOT FORWARD
8 IDENTIFYING SHORTCOMINGS AND STRUCTURES THAT ARE POSSIBLE AND
9 LEAVING THOSE THINGS THAT ARE NOT ABLE TO BE RESOLVED AS THE
10 ELEMENTS THAT ARE SUBOPTIMAL ABOUT THEM AND THEN WE CAN HAVE A
11 DISCUSSION. WE WANT TO MAXIMIZE THE ABILITY OF EACH OF THESE
12 TO MAKE, ENACT, A CLEAR REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT TO BE AS
13 STRONG AS POSSIBLE AND WORK WITH STAKEHOLDERS ON THAT. NEXT
14 SLIDE. HIGH-LEVEL OVERVIEW OF THE WORK PROGRAM. WE WANT TO
15 HIGHLIGHT THE KEY POINTS OF FEEDBACK IN THE PROCESS. THOSE ARE
16 THE DOTS, KEY PROJECT MILESTONES ARE THE DOTS DOWN BELOW, AND
17 WE'LL WANT TO WORK WITH THIS ADVISORY GROUP ON REVIEWING THE
18 REGIONAL NETWORK MANagements EVALUATING GOALS AND OUTCOMES AND
19 ALSO THE METHODS THAT WE'RE USING TO EVALUATE THOSE, THE
20 PROGRESS TOWARDS THOSE OUTCOME, REVIEWING THE DRAFT ANALYSIS,
21 AS WELL AS THE RECOMMENDED ALTERNATIVES AND THE IMPLEMENTATION
22 STEPS ALL TO SUPPORT MTC ACTION, AS THERESE WAS HIGHLIGHTING,
23 IN THE FALL OF 2022. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S IMPORTANT AS WE
24 STATED EARLIER IS ALIGNMENT ON THE METHODOLOGY IS VERY
25 IMPORTANT, THE FOUNDATION IN THE PYRAMID BELOW, AND I'LL



January 10, 2021

1 ADDRESS THAT IN THE NEXT SLIDE. THE FINAL SLIDE HERE, OUR
2 INTENT FOR THAT, THAT WORK PLAN AND COMPONENT IS TO REALLY
3 WORK THROUGHOUT JANUARY AND FEBRUARY IN A SERIES OF
4 COLLABORATIVE WORK SESSIONS WITH THE TECHNICAL STAFF AND TEAMS
5 AND ALSO EXTENDED STAKEHOLDER INTERESTS TO REALLY PROVIDE
6 FEEDBACK ON THAT METHODOLOGY THAT WE'RE USING THROUGHOUT THE
7 PROCESS. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THERE IS GOOD FEEDBACK AND
8 GENERAL CONSENSUSES ON THE METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH WE'RE
9 TAKING, AND WORK TO SET UP CONTEXT OF THE MESSAGE AND ENSURING
10 THE ALIGNMENT OF THE GRANTS STUDY THAT AN ALSO UNDERWAY IN
11 PARALLEL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO
12 YOU, MR. CHAIR, TO HANDLE THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM. THANKS

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR THOUGHTS
15 OR GROUP MEMBERS ON THE PRESENTATION. I SEE THE FIRSTHAND UP
16 IS JULIE FROM SFMTA.

17

18 **JULIE KIRSHBAUM:** THIS DOESN'T TALK ABOUT THE ROLE OF TECHNICAL
19 ADVISER AND HOW THE TECHNICAL ADVISER WILL BE INTERACTING. I'M
20 NOT SURE IF THAT'S A CONSULTANT QUESTION OR MTC QUESTION. I
21 WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND THE RELATIONSHIP.

22

23 **SHRUTI HARI:** THERESE HAS HER HAND RAISED.

24

25 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THAT WAS FOR A DIFFERENT POINT.



January 10, 2021

1

2 **SHRUTI HARI:** I CAN ANSWER THAT. THIS TECHNICAL ADVISOR WOULD
3 BE APPOINTED BY THE OPERATORS, IT WOULD BE A 2-WAY STREET
4 WHERE THE OPERATOR WOULD BE FULLY ENGAGED WITH ALL THE
5 MEETINGS AND THE MATERIALS WE DEVELOP AND THE PROGRESS ON THIS
6 PROJECT WE'LL BE UPDATING THE OPERATORS ON THE PROGRESS OF
7 THIS PROJECT. BUT ALSO WE'LL BE UPDATING THE PROJECT
8 MANAGEMENT TEAM WHICH IS MYSELF AND THE CONSULTING TEAM ON THE
9 FEEDBACK FROM THE OPERATORS. SO WE ARE HOPING THAT THE
10 OPERATOR ADVISER TECHNICAL ADVISER, AS WE'RE CALLING IT, WOULD
11 CONTINUE TO STAY ERNE GAUGE ENGAGED ON THE PROJECT WITH THE
12 CONSULTING TEAM AND BE INVOLVED IN MEETINGS IN THE REVIEWING
13 AND DELIVERABLE FROM THE BEGINNING TO THE END OF THIS PROCESS.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR CLARIFYING.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** JIM WUNDERMAN?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I THOUGHT THAT WAS A GOOD PRESENTATION AND
20 SUMMATION OF A LOT OF THE WORK AHEAD. I THINK IT'S A STRONG
21 CASE FOR LOOKING AT A LOT OF COMPLEX FACTORS WHICH IS NEVER
22 EASY IN A SITUATION LIKE THIS. I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT A LOT -
23 - YOU KNOW, THIS IS A SPECIAL MOMENT IN TIME, IN WHICH WE'RE
24 DOING THIS, IN WHICH TRANSIT, IN GENERAL, IS FACED WITH MAJOR
25 MAJOR QUESTIONS IF WE COULDN'T GET PEOPLE USING TRANSIT AGAIN.



January 10, 2021

1 AND SO A LOT OF GOOD, REALLY GOOD WORK HAS GONE INTO KEEPING
2 OUR AGENCIES AFLOAT, AND ALLOWING A PATH OF RECOVERY TIME, BUT
3 THIS VIRUS SEEMS PRETTY RELENTLESS, AND MAYBE TIME IS ON OUR
4 SIDE, AND MAYBE IT'S NOT. BUT I THINK WITH ALL THE WORK THAT'S
5 GONE INTO THIS, WE SHOULDN'T LOSE THE POWER OF THE MOMENT, AND
6 I THINK THIS, YOU KNOW, THE PLACE THAT WE HAVE COME TO, AND I
7 REALLY WANT TO THANK CHAIR SPERING FOR HIS LEADERSHIP ON IT,
8 AS WELL. WE NEED TO BE BOLD HERE. AND SOMETIMES IT'S HARD WHEN
9 YOU'RE WORKING TO BUILD, WHEN YOU'RE DOING A LOT OF ANALYSIS
10 AND YOU'RE WORKING TO BUILD CONSENSUS THAT OVER TIME, THE
11 IMPETUS TO BE BOLD, SORT OF, WANES IN THE FACE OF A LOT OF
12 THINGS THAT PEOPLE SAY, ALL OF WHICH MAKE A GOOD DEAL OF
13 SENSE. AND THE MORE THAT YOU ANALYZE, THE MORE THAT YOU DEAL
14 WITH THE RISKS INHERENT OF WHATEVER IT IS YOU'RE TRYING TO DO.
15 BUT IN ORDER TO MAKE MAJOR CHANGE, THERE IS A CERTAIN AMOUNT
16 OF RISK THAT IS INVOLVED, THAT YOU CAN MAKE A MISTAKE. AND I
17 THINK THERE HAS TO BE SOME -- THERE HAS TO BE SOME ROOM LEFT
18 FOR BEING ABLE TO DO THAT. OR ELSE WHAT WILL HAPPEN IS, I
19 THINK THE PROCESS WILL SUCCUMB TO, SORT OF, THE WAY THAT
20 GOVERNMENT TENDS TO WORK WHICH IS TO BE PRETTY AVERSE. NOT TO
21 SAY THAT WE SHOULD DO ANYTHING THAT'S FOOLHARDY IN A WAY
22 THAT'S IN EXCESS OF THE TOLERANCE OF THE SYSTEM TO ABSORB I'M
23 NOT TRYING TO INTERJECT ANYTHING HERE THAT'S IRRATION OR
24 SUGGEST ANYTHING LIKE THAT. A COUPLE OF THE POINTS WOULD BE
25 THAT ONE OF THE REQUIREMENTS OF LOOKING AT A CERTAIN OPTION



January 10, 2021

1 WOULD BE MONEY AVAILABLE TO DO IT. SO YOU KNOW, WE NEVER HAVE
2 ENOUGH MONEY TO DO ANYTHING. BECAUSE COMPETING NEEDS FOR
3 FUNDS. I THINK AFTER ALL OF THIS IF THIS GROUP CONCEDES THAT
4 WE NEED TO GO IN A CERTAIN DIRECTION AND THERE IS NOT MONEY ON
5 THE TABLE THAT DAY TO SAY HOW WE'RE GOING TO PAY FOR IT. I
6 DON'T THINK THAT THAT SHOULD BE A HUGE OBSTACLE. AT LEAST TO A
7 CERTAIN DEGREE. WE SHOULD FIND THE MONEY TO DO IT. WE SHOULD
8 FIND THE MONEY TO IMPLEMENT WHAT'S THE BEST CASE FOR THIS. AND
9 THERE IS THE POINT ON OPTIMISM BIAS. SO, YOU KNOW, I GREW UP
10 IN A HOUSEHOLD WHERE THERE WAS PESSIMISM BIAS. SO I'M ALWAYS
11 WATCHFUL OF THAT, I THINK THERE'S A PROCESS OF PESSIMISM
12 THIS'S BUILT INTO THIS. YOU KNOW, WE TRIED THAT BEFORE, HOW
13 WILL THAT REALLY WORK? HOW IS THAT GOING TO HAPPEN? ALL OF
14 THESE ISSUE. I THINK WE HAVE TO BE CONSCIOUS. I AGREE THERE IS
15 OPTIMISM BIAS THAT WE CAN GO THROUGH THIS, THIS IS GOING TO BE
16 GREAT, BUT WE HAVE TO BE EQUALLY AWARE OF THE PESSIMISM BIAS.
17 AND I'LL QUOTE HERE FROM THE GREAT EULOGY OF TED KENNEDY FROM
18 WHEN HIS BROTHER BOBBY KENNEDY WAS KILLED HE SAID "SOME SEE
19 THINGS AS THEY ARE AND SAY WHY. I DREAM OF THINGS AS THEY
20 NEVER WERE AND ASK WHY NOT." THIS IS ONE OF THOSE MOMENTS
21 WHERE WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO PUT FORWARD A VISION OF WHAT
22 POSSIBLY COULD BE AND REALLY CHASE IT AND USING BASEBALL
23 ANALOGY, THIS IS LIKE GETTING UP TO THE 8TH OF THE 9TH INNING
24 AND LAST CHANCE AT BAT. IF WE FAIL TO HIT IT PROPERLY IT'S NOT
25 LIKE WE GET TO COME UP IN ANOTHER INNING. ANYWAY, THAT'S ALL



January 10, 2021

1 I HAVE TO SAY. THIS IS THE PROCESS, I WANT TO DO THIS AS, SORT
2 OF, NOT THE HEADS OF AN AGENCY, AND SITTING AS AN OUTSIDER TO
3 THIS, BUT AS AN IMPORTANT -- YOU KNOW, THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY,
4 STAKEHOLDER, I HAVE ASKED OUR BUSINESS COMMUNITY ASSOCIATES
5 FOR THEIR VIEWS ON THIS, BECAUSE I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT
6 WHAT WE'RE DOING, AND YOU KNOW, THAT'S SOME OF THE FEEDBACK
7 THAT I HAVE HAD, IS DON'T LOSE THIS OPPORTUNITY. SO, ANYWAY,
8 THANK YOU FOR THIS AND GETTING THIS GOING. I APPRECIATE IT
9 VERY MUCH.

10

11 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** JIM, APPRECIATE THE WORDS OF WISDOM AND SAGE
12 ADVICE. THERESE MCMILLAN?

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANKS CHAIR MULLIGAN. MAYBE MY COMMENTS GO
15 IN A DIFFERENT WAY ALONG SOME OF THE LINES THAT JIM WAS
16 POINTING OUT. ONE OF THE -- REFERRING TO THE SAME SLIDE, YOU
17 KNOW, START WITH THE END IN MIND, I THINK WE HAVE ALL BEEN
18 VERY CLEAR THAT AT THE ENDS OF THIS PROCESS, THE OUTCOME IS
19 BETTER SERVICE TO OUR CUSTOMERS. THAT, THAT IS REALLY WHY
20 WE'RE DOING WHAT WE'RE DOING. THAT SAID. [LAUGHTER] -- AND I
21 THINK IT GETS TO HAD YOU EVALUATE THE RISK. A LARGE PART OF
22 THE BUSINESS CASE, AT LEAST AS I HAVE UNDERSTOOD IT, IS NOT
23 ONLY MAKING SURE THAT I WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE AS TO WHAT
24 OUTCOMES WE NEED, WHATEVER IT MAY TAKE TO DELIVER THOSE AS JIM
25 MENTIONED, REVENUE SOURCES WHATEVER IT MAY BE, THAT THERE



January 10, 2021

1 NEEDS TO BE AN INFRASTRUCTURE TO BE ABLE TO WORK AND DELIVER
2 THOSE OUTCOMES. AND THAT, YOU KNOW, SOMETIMES DISPARAGINGLY IS
3 THE BUREAUCRACY THAT'S NEEDED. BUT IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. YOU
4 NEED TO BE ABLE TO RESOURCE WHATEVER EXISTING INSTITUTIONS OR
5 NEW INSTITUTIONS, AGAIN, HOWEVER WE LAND ON THAT, WE NEED TO
6 ASSESS WHAT IT'S GOING TO TAKE TO BE SUCCESSFUL IN DELIVERING
7 THOSE OUTCOMES, WHETHER THAT'S AUTHORITY, OR WHETHER IT'S
8 MONEY, OR STAFFING, TECHNICAL EXPERTISE, WHATEVER THE CASE MAY
9 BE. SO, TO ME, MAYBE YOU AND THE TEAM COULD COMMENT ON THE
10 BUSINESS. HOW DO YOU BALANCE THOSE, IN MY VIEW, EQUALLY
11 IMPORTANT CONSIDERATIONS IN ASSESSING OUTCOMES FOR THE
12 BUSINESS CASE, AND, I THINK, TO USE JIM'S TERM, THE RISK THAT
13 IS ATTACHED. BECAUSE I THINK THERE IS DIFFERENT RISK IN EACH
14 OF THOSE FAMILIES, IF YOU WILL. SO PERHAPS YOU COULD GIVE A
15 BROAD SENSE OF HOW THE BUSINESS CASE TACKLES THAT.

16

17 **TAMIM RAAD:** I BELIEVE IT'S GOING TO COME THROUGH OUR
18 EVALUATION CRITERIA YOU DESCRIBED THAT'S IMPORTANT CRITERIA
19 FOR ASSESSING VARIOUS MODELS AND ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURES TO
20 ACHIEVE THE GOALS. AND ONE OF THE THINGS WE NEED THE REGIONAL
21 NETWORK MANAGEMENT TO DO THROUGH THE PERMUTATION PHASE IS TO
22 BALANCE AND MANAGE THE RISK OF RUNNING AN ORGANIZATION WE WANT
23 THE CRITERIA EVALUATION PROCESS TO CLEARLY IDENTIFY THE
24 IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS AND ONGOING MANAGEMENT BASIS. THAT
25 MIGHT BE A GENERIC RESPONSE BUT WE'RE IN THE EVALUATION STAGE



January 10, 2021

1 AND FIGURING OUT WHAT ARE THE PLUSES AND MINUSES OF THESE
2 VARIOUS MODELS AND BEING ABLE TO MANAGE WHAT IS AN UNCERTAIN,
3 YOU KNOW, HOW TO NAVIGATE PRETTY UNCERTAIN TERRITORY THAT
4 WE'RE GOING THROUGH. THOSE WILL ALL COME OUT IN THE PLUSES AND
5 MINUSES OF THE VARIOUS MODELS. AND KEVIN, DO YOU HAVE ANY
6 PERSPECTIVES ON THAT? WE HAVE KEVIN HERE, AS WELL. AND
7 THERESE, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT WAS TOO HIGH-LEVEL AN ANSWER FOR
8 YOU? OR WHETHER THAT --

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** NO. I THINK WHAT I WAS LOOKING FOR IS,
11 AGAIN, THAT, SORT OF, YOU KNOW, THE TRADEOFFS, THE BALANCES,
12 HOW YOU TILT ONE WAY OR ANOTHER. AND SOMETIMES HOW YOU TILT
13 ONE WAY OR ANOTHER IS A MEASURE OF RISK TOLERANCE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YEAH.

16

17 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** AND, SO, AGAIN, MY EXPERIENCE HAS BEEN THE
18 DEFINING THAT RISK TOLERANCE, IS VERY DIFFERENT WHEN YOU'RE
19 TALKING ABOUT THAT SUPPORTING INFRASTRUCTURE, VERSUS THE RISK
20 TOLERANCES THAT MAY BE ATTACHED TO THE OUTCOMES. AS JIM SAID,
21 PUBLIC AGENCIES, IN PARTICULAR, OFTEN AREN'T ALLOWED TO FAIL.
22 I MEAN THE PRIVATE SECTOR DOES IT ALL THE TIME, OH IT DIDN'T
23 WORK, THEN THEY DO SOMETHING ELSE. OBVIOUSLY I'M MAKING A
24 GENERALIZATION, BUT THE PUBLIC SECTOR IS VERY DIFFERENT
25 STANDARD OF DOING IT RIGHT OUT OF THE GATE THAT'S THE RISK



January 10, 2021

1 ATTACHED TO OUTCOMES. AND THE OTHER FAMILY, IF YOU WILL, THAT
2 I DESCRIBED IS THE RISK TO TASK BEING ABLE TO DEVELOP AND
3 SUSTAIN THE INFRASTRUCTURE NEEDED TO DEVELOP WHATEVER OUTCOMES
4 YOU MAY ADD. AND SO I GUESS I WAS LOOKING TO SEE, A, DID YOU
5 AGREE THOSE ARE TWO RELATED BUT IMPORTANT ELEMENTS AND I'M
6 JUST CURIOUS HOW THE BUSINESS CASE DOES THAT BALANCING ACT, IF
7 YOU WILL.

8

9 **KEVIN DESMOND:** THERESE, THAT'S INSIGHTFUL, THE RISK MANAGEMENT
10 ASSESSMENT IS SUPER IMPORTANT, AND I HOPE THE WAY WE PUT THIS
11 TOGETHER CAN GET TO THAT ULTIMATELY WITH THE FINAL DECISION
12 MAKERS AND OTHER KEY PLAYERS WHERE THE QUANTITATIVE
13 ASSESSMENT, THE HARD INFORMATION AS MUCH DATA THAT WE CAN
14 BRING FORWARD TO HELP WEIGH COST BENEFITS PROS AND CONS
15 BALANCING THAT WITH A LOT OF QUALITATIVE MEASURES, THERE IS
16 CERTAINLY QUALITATIVE MEASURES, AND ALSO THROUGH A LOT OF
17 ENGAGEMENT WITH THIS GROUP, THIS ADVISORY COMMITTEE, AND OTHER
18 STAKEHOLDERS THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO TALK TO AND ENGAGE WITH TO
19 KIND OF UNDERSTAND THE ULTIMATE LAY OF THE LAND AND THE
20 POLITICS OF THE LAY OF THE LAND. THE RISK TOLERANCE IN THE
21 PUBLIC SECTOR, THERESE, IS ALL ABOUT THE POLITICAL LAY OF THE
22 LAND, HOW IS THIS ALL GOING TO SHAPE. I HOPE WE CAN HELP FUSE
23 THOSE THREE TOGETHER WITH QUANTITATIVE QUALITATIVE ASSESSMENTS
24 WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU TO UNDERSTAND THE POLITICAL
25 INTERGOVERNMENTAL PUBLIC OPINION ENVIRONMENT IF YOU WILL. AND



January 10, 2021

1 WE CAN BRING ALL OF THAT INFORMATION TO BEAR TO HELP ALL OF
2 YOU RENDERED REALLY SMART DECISIONS FOR THE REGION.

3

4 **TAMIM RAAD:** JUST TO ADD, THERESE, THIS IS IN THE EVALUATIVE
5 STAGE, AND YOUR QUESTION IS ARE WE GOING TO EVALUATE IT AND
6 THE ANSWER IS YES. ALL OF THE CRITERIA THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE
7 EVALUATING WILL BE A SIMPLE FORMULA OF BENEFIT VERSUS COST AND
8 RISK IMPLIES POTENTIAL COST OR IMPACT. AND WHAT WE WANT TO
9 KNOW IS THAT FOR THOSE THINGS, THOSE AREAS WHERE WE'RE TAKING
10 BIGGER AND BIGGER RISK IS THERE A BIGGER PRIZE THAT'S WORTH
11 THE RISK AND FROM AN EVALUATIVE PERSPECTIVE WE UNDERSTAND FOR
12 THE IMPLEMENTATION PHASE AND ALSO THE MANAGEMENT PHASE THAT'S
13 PART OF OUR EVALUATION FRAMEWORK LOOKING AT THAT AND
14 DEVELOPING THE CRITERIA ON HOW.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS TAMIM, AND KEVIN. THERESE, ANYTHING
17 ELSE?

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THAT WAS HELPFUL.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS ADINA LEVIN.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** A COUPLE OF DIFFERENT THINGS. ONE IS I WANT TO
24 EXPRESS THANKS TO THE COMMENTS FROM JIM WUNDERMAN, AND THERESE
25 MCMILLAN ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF THE MOMENT ABOUT THE



January 10, 2021

1 IMPORTANCE OF BEING BOLD AND THE IMPORTANCE OF PUBLIC SECTOR
2 IN TERMS OF VISION AND RISK-TAKING. OVER THE BREAK, I READ A
3 REALLY INSPIRING BOOK CALLED "MISSION ECONOMY" BY AN
4 INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIST ABOUT THE UNIQUE ABILITY AND CASE
5 STUDIES OF THE PUBLIC SECTOR TAKING THE LEADERSHIP IN AND HOW
6 THAT CAN BE DONE SUCCESSFULLY, WHETHER THERE ARE UNIQUE THINGS
7 WITH CLIMATE AND EQUITY CHALLENGES WHERE WE NEED A PUBLIC
8 SECTOR LEADERSHIP AND WAYS OF AVOIDING THAT TENDENCY TOWARD
9 TIMIDITY AND WAYS OF AVOIDING THAT RISK AVERSION AND BEING
10 ABLE TO TAKE RISKS IN AN EFFECTIVE WAY AND HOW TO BUILD UP THE
11 CAPABILITY OF THE PUBLIC SECTOR TO BE ABLE TO REALLY DELIVER
12 ON A BIG AND BOLD VISION. AND WITH THAT, I HAD A COUPLE OF
13 COMMENTS ON THIS PROCESS. ONE, IS OUT OF THE THINGS THAT WERE
14 ON A SLIDE, THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT MIGHT BE
15 COMPLEMENTED. AND ONE IS, WHAT IS THE PROCESS FOR ASSESSMENT
16 FOR TRANSIT RIDERS AND CUSTOMERS AS TO, HOW DOES THIS PROPOSAL
17 WORK FOR TRANSIT RIDERS AND CUSTOMERS. THIS IS A MULTI-
18 STAKEHOLDER GROUP THAT HAS SEVERAL REPRESENTATIVES AND RIDERS
19 AND STAKEHOLDERS TO GET OUR FEEDBACK, HOWEVER, I'M WONDERING
20 WHETHER THERE IS A -- SOME KIND OF USER EXPERIENCE ELEMENT
21 WHERE IT'S GOING OUT TO RIDERS AND CUSTOMERS SAYING, WILL WHAT
22 WE COME UP WITH WORK FOR YOU, AND GIVE YOU THAT RESPONSIVENESS
23 AND ACCOUNTABILITY. IN THE PROCESS OF WORKING AS AN ADVOCATE
24 FOR FARE INTEGRATION AND WORKING WITH TRANSIT RIDERS HELPING
25 THEM KNOW WHICH OF THE AGENCIES BOARDS TO GO TO AND THE



January 10, 2021

1 REGIONAL BOARDS, IT'S EXTREMELY COMPLICATE AND HAVING
2 SOMETHING WHERE WE CAN REALLY TEST SAYING IS THIS SOMETHING
3 THAT WORKS FOR THE TRANSIT RIDERS AND CUSTOMERS. SO, THAT'S
4 ONE. AND THE SECOND IS, MAYBE THIS IS ALREADY INCORPORATED IN
5 THERE PARTLY IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO GO BACK TO THE
6 DIFFERENT BOARDS, BUT TO -- HOW DO WE MAKE SURE THAT AS WE GO
7 ALONG IN TERMS OF A BOLD VISION, TO BE MAKING SURE THAT WE ARE
8 CONTINUING TO, AND INCREASING, THE PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR THE
9 OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT, THAT WE ALREADY KNOW ARE INCREDIBLY
10 POPULAR AND DESIRED BY THE PUBLIC. HOW DO WE KEEP BUILDING UP
11 THAT SUPPORT IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO GAIN THE RESOURCES THAT WE
12 NEED IN THE CONFIDENCE TO BE ABLE TO MAKE CHANGES THOSE ARE
13 TWO QUESTIONS AND SUGGESTIONS ON THE PUBLIC SUPPORT ON THE
14 RIDER STAKEHOLDER EXPERIENCE IN THIS WORK.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** MAYBE KEVIN OR SHRUTI WANT TO WEIGH IN ON
17 THAT'S REFLECT UPON IT AND WEIGH IN LATER?

18

19 **TAMIM RAAD:** UNLESS THERE IS FEEDBACK AND SPECIFIC QUESTIONS
20 THOSE ARE QUITE THAT ARE INCLUDING EVERYTHING TO BE
21 INCORPORATED INTO THE EVALUATION. FOR SURE.

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP WE HAVE HAYLEY CURRIER.

24



January 10, 2021

1 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I
2 WANT TO HAVE A SPECIFIC REQUEST AND A COUPLE OF COMMENTS
3 REMINDING US THAT THERE IS THE RIDER VOICE THAT IS
4 UNDERREPRESENTED IN THIS SPACE AND I WILL BE DOING MY BEST TO
5 BE CENTERING THE PRIORITIES OF THESE LOW-INCOME RIDERS AND
6 ESPECIALLY PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES I KNOW THAT IS TOP OF MIND
7 FOR MOST OF YOU, AND I THINK WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE
8 EXTRA CENTERING THAT BECAUSE IT IS EASY IN THE WASH OF
9 DIFFERENT PRIORITIES FOR THAT ONE TO BE LOST. IT IS KIND OF A
10 MISSING VOICE. THERE ACTUALLY ISN'T SOMEONE REPRESENTING THOSE
11 WITH DISABILITIES IN THIS SPACE AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
12 IS CENTRAL TO THE WORK WE'RE DOING HERE. ALSO WANT TO THINK
13 ABOUT RISK TOLERANCE AND I'M GLAD THAT YOU BROUGHT THAT UP,
14 THERESE. THAT IS SO MUCH THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. I ALSO WANT
15 TO THINK ABOUT RISK STORY WHO. THERE OF COURSE IS THE
16 FINANCIAL RISK, AND THE POLITICAL RISK, AND ALL SORTS OF RISK
17 FOR THE PEOPLE IN THIS SPACE BUT THERE IS ACTUALLY BIG RISK
18 FOR RIDERS WHEN THEIR NEEDS ARE NOT BEING MET IN TERMS OF HOW
19 THEY'RE GETTING TO WORK OR THE HOSPITAL OR WHEREVER, AND JUST
20 THE COMMENT ABOUT PESSIMISM I THINK HE WAS THE FIRST TO
21 CHANGE. AND MY COMMUNITY PARTNERS CAME UP WITH SOME GOOD
22 EQUITY PRINCIPLES DURING THE TASK FORCE PROCESS, AND I WAS
23 WONDERING IF WE COULD BRING THAT BACK INTO THIS SPACE AND
24 REVIEW THOSE AND MAKE SURE THAT'S GUIDING THIS WORK AS WELL. I
25 THINK IT WAS USEFUL TO HAVE IT. PRINCIPLES ARE AN IMPORTANT



January 10, 2021

1 FRAMEWORK. THEY'RE NOT EVERYTHING, BUT IT IS USEFUL TO KEEP US
2 ON THE SAME PAGE ABOUT WHAT WE MEAN BY EQUITY AND WHAT WE MEAN
3 ABOUT CENTERING THE PRIORITIES OF THOSE POPULATIONS. AND I
4 WILL COMMEND THE PROCESS DONE TO CREATE THOSE EQUITY
5 PRINCIPLES. THAT WAS VERY GOOD.

6

7 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, HAYLEY. NEXT UP IS SUZANNE SMITH.

8

9 **SUZANNE SMITH:** THANKS DENNIS. I WANT TO MAKE A COUPLE OF
10 COMMENTS. I AM A REP ON THE BODY FROM THE COUNTY
11 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES SO WE HAVE THE TASK, OFTEN, OF
12 DOING BOTH TRANSIT AND INFRASTRUCTURE, AND TRANSIT
13 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND WORKING COLLABORATIVELY ACROSS A NUMBER OF
14 GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES. SO I APPRECIATE THIS GROUP THAT IS VERY
15 OBVIOUSLY TRANSIT CENTRIC, INCLUDING A REPRESENTATIVE FROM
16 THAT GROUP. I WANTED TO -- FOR THOSE OF WHO YOU MAY NOT KNOW
17 ME, I AM FROM ONE OF THE SMALLER COUNTIES, SONOMA, SO I'M NOT
18 WITH ONE OF THE BIGGER OPERATORS BUT I HAVE BEEN DOING THIS
19 FOR SOMETIME AND I HAVE A GREAT DEAL OF EXPOSURE TO THE INS
20 AND OUTS OF HOW THE OPERATORS WORK TOGETHER OR DON'T, AND HOW
21 WE'RE A LITTLE BITS OF A MICROCOSM OF THAT IN SONOMA COUNTY.
22 AND ALSO, I RUN A CLIMATE AGENCY. SO I COME AT THIS WITH, SORT
23 OF, A PRIMARY INTEREST IN INCREASING RIDERSHIP. AND I DON'T
24 MEAN JUST INCREASING IT COMING OUT OF A PANDEMIC, I MEAN
25 GETTING PEOPLE OUT OF SINGLE OCCUPANT CARS, ESPECIALLY SPECIAL



January 10, 2021

1 COMBUSTION ENGINE CARS, AND GETTING MORE RIDERS INTO A SYSTEM.
2 SO, TO ME, THAT MEANS MAKING SURE THAT SYSTEM CAN WORK FOR A
3 BROAD GROUP OF RIDERS. I TAKE YOUR POINT, HAYLEY THAT THERE
4 IS GREATER RISK FOR SOME GROUPS OF RIDERS AND WE NEED TO BE
5 COGNIZANT OF THAT, BECAUSE THOSE RIDERS TEND TO BE THE
6 PREDOMINANT GROUP THAT RIDES THE TRANSIT SYSTEM SO BEING
7 PARTICULARLY ATTUNED TO THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT IS IMPORTANT.
8 BUT/AND, WE NEED TO GET MORE PEOPLE ON TO BUSES. AND THAT
9 MEANS IMPROVING SYSTEM, IMPROVING THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE,
10 IMPROVING THE -- YOU KNOW, THE TIMING, AND HOW THINGS
11 INTEGRATE. AND I'M EXCITED TO WORK ON ALL THOSE THINGS. AND IT
12 DOES, I THINK, COMBINE A WHOLE BUNCH OF THINGS THAT MOST OF US
13 ARE VERY ATTUNED TO, AND THAT'S FIGURING OUT MONEY, FIGURING
14 OUT POLICIES, STRUCTURES, AND, ACTUALLY, HOW TO BUILD THINGS.
15 AND I DON'T JUST MEAN LARGE INFRASTRUCTURE, BUT HOW TO BUILT
16 THINGS WITHIN THE COMMUNITY AND HOW TO BUILD INFRASTRUCTURE
17 THAT SUPPORTS THAT. SO, I DO THINK THE RISK ISSUE IS, SORT
18 OF, PARAMOUNT. HOW RISK AVERSE ARE WE GOING TO BE? OR HOW
19 BOLD. AND IT'S OFTENTIMES, I THINK, FOR OPERATORS TO MAKE BIG
20 SHIFTS, BECAUSE THEY HAVE SUCH AN IMPORTANT ROLE FOR THOSE WHO
21 ARE DEPENDENT ON THEM. BUT I THINK THIS GROUP PROVIDES AN
22 OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY PUSH ON THAT, AND PUSH POLICY MAKERS TO
23 TRY SOMETHING THAT MIGHT BE A LITTLE UNCOMFORTABLE. SO THAT'S
24 WHERE I'M COMING FROM ON THIS, AND APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY
25 TO ENGAGE WITH ALL OF YOU AND TO BE PART OF THIS TEAM.



January 10, 2021

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, SUZANNE. NEXT, MICHAEL HURSCH.

3

4 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** THANKS. HAYLEY SAID A LOT OF WHAT I WANTED TO
5 SAY, BUT I'LL SAY FROM A DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE AND REALLY
6 UNDERLINE WITH THE EQUITY ISSUE AND HEARING THE RIDER OF THE
7 VOICE, AND I WOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE THAT THE WORK DONE IN THE
8 FIELD INTERVIEWS, THE STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS, WE LEARN JUST
9 HOW TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND I'M SPEAKING FOR AC TRANSIT, JUST
10 HOW TRANSIT DEPENDENT OUR RIDERS ARE. DURING THE PANDEMIC WE
11 QUITE FRANKLY DIDN'T LOSE RIDERSHIP TO THE VOLUME THAT OTHERS
12 DID, BECAUSE WE DID CARRY ESSENTIAL WORKERS AND TRANSIT
13 DEPENDENT. AND I WOULD ENCOURAGE US TO NOT HAVE WORKSHOPS 8 TO
14 5 MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY WHEN A LOT OF THOSE PEOPLE CAN'T
15 PARTICIPATE. GETTING MESSAGES OUT IN NON-TRADITIONAL WAYS IN
16 LANGUAGE THAT WE'RE REACHING THE RIDER AND EQUITY DEFINITION
17 TO DEFINING WHAT IS EQUITY. AND I HAVE HAD CONCERNS AS I
18 SUPPORT THIS I JUST DON'T WANT TO SEE THE LOCAL RIDER IMPACTED
19 BY ANYTHING WE DO. SECONDLY, LABOR. I REALLY WANT TO MAKE
20 SURE THAT WE ARE INCLUDING LABOR TO THE EXTENT THAT THEY'RE
21 INCLUDED UP FRONT, THE EXTENT THAT WE UNDERSTAND THE
22 LIMITATIONS OF VARIOUS COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS AND
23 TRY TO GET THEM TO WORK WITH US. AN EXAMPLE IS COORDINATING
24 SIGN UPS HOW AGENCIES NEED TO CHANGE HOW MANY HAVE ACKNOWLEDGE
25 AND COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS AND HOW MANY DON'T HAVE



January 10, 2021

1 THE LANGUAGE TO SUPPORT THAT, AND I CONTINUE TO RAISE POSITION
2 ON GOVERNANCE HAVING WORKED WITH THROUGH MAJOR BAY AREA
3 TRANSIT AGENCIES. I KNOW HOW COMPLICATE GOVERNANCE CAN BE, AND
4 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THAT AND THOUGHTS ON
5 HOW THIS WORKS WITH LOCAL BOARDS AND AUTHORITY. AND FINALLY
6 I'LL REMIND EVERYBODY THERE HAS BEEN LITTLE MENTIONED ABOUT
7 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION AND CLIMATE CHANGE. WE ALL AT TRANSIT
8 AGENCIES HAVE THE 2040 MANDATE TO CONVERT TO 0-EMISSIONS.
9 LARGELY UNFUNDED MANDATE. PLEASE CONSIDER AS WE MAKE REGIONAL
10 NETWORK PLANS THE PLANS AND THE TECHNOLOGY, THE OPERATING
11 RANGE OF TECHNOLOGY IS GOING TO CHANGE. WITH STAFF TIME THIS
12 IS DRIVING A LOT OF FACILITY MODIFICATION DECISIONS AND I
13 WOULD ASK THAT WE ACKNOWLEDGE THAT AND HAVE AWARENESS OF IT AS
14 WE PUT SOME MEAT ON THE BONE WITH THIS PROJECT IN FRONT OF US.
15 THANK YOU.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS MIKE. MICHELLE BOUCHARD

18

19 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** THANKS. A SHORT COMMENT. THANKS VERY MUCH
20 FOR THE PRESENTATION. REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING WITH
21 THIS GROUP ON THESE CRITICAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT ISSUES. THE
22 COMMENT OR REQUEST THEY WOULD HAVE TO ME MENTIONED IN THE END
23 OF THE PRESENTATION, THAT THERE ARE A NUMBER OF RELATED
24 EFFORTS THAT ARE BEING TAKEN ON AT MTC THAT MAY HAVE SOME
25 INTERSECTION OR RELATIONSHIP WITH THIS ONE. YOU KNOW, I'M



January 10, 2021

1 MINDFUL OF THE REGIONAL RAIL WORK, BUT I'M SURE THERE ARE
2 OTHER ITEMS IN THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN THAT WILL HAVE
3 SOME RELATIONSHIP ON OR BEARING ON THE WORK THAT WE DO HERE.
4 AS WE WORK THROUGH THIS PROCESS I WANT US TO BE MINDFUL OF HOW
5 WE UNDERSTAND THOSE VARIOUS EFFORTS ARE LINKED TO EACH OTHER
6 OR DEPENDENT ON EACH OTHER, DEPENDING ON THE GIVEN TOPIC.
7 THIS'S ALL. I APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS MICHELLE. DO ANY OTHER ADVISORY GROUP
10 MEMBERS WISH TO WEIGH IN BEFORE WE GO TO THE PUBLIC. SEEING NO
11 HANDS. WE'LL GO TO THE PUBLIC CALLING IN ORDER OF HANDS RAISED
12 WE'LL FIRST GO WITH IAN GRIFFITHS.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHAIR MULLIGAN, CAN I FIRST PLEASE PUT
15 UP THE TIMER FOR THE PUBLIC.

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** YES, WALLY, PLEASE. I APOLOGIZE. YOU ARE
18 RUNNING THE SHOW.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THAT'S OKAY.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AND GOOD MORNING. THIS IS IAN GRIFFITHS
23 FROM SEAMLESS BAY AREA. I PROBABLY WON'T USE THE FULL TWO
24 MINUTES. I JUST WANTED TO REALLY, ON THIS POINT APPRECIATE THE
25 CONVERSATION AROUND RISK BUT ALSO ADD THAT A REALLY IMPORTANT



January 10, 2021

1 RISK TO CONSIDER IN BUILDING OFF OF THE RISKS THAT FACE RIDERS
2 IS REALLY THE RISK OF THE STATUS QUO, THE RISK OF CONTINUING
3 TO, BASICALLY, SEE TRANSIT CONTINUE NOT ONLY ALONG THE PATH IT
4 WAS GOING ON PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC, BUT ALSO THE RISK
5 PRESENTED BY THE PANDEMIC AND THE RISK OF, IF IT FAILS TO YOU
6 KNOW, SORT OF, YOU KNOW, REINVENT ITSELF IN A WAY THAT AN
7 ATTRACTIVE THAT'S A TREMENDOUS RISK TO OUR CLIMATE, TO EQUITY,
8 AND TO THE EXISTENCE OF ROBUST PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE
9 FUTURE. SO, PLEASE THINK OF RISK NOT ONLY IN TERMS OF RISK OF
10 CHANGE FROM HOW THINGS WERE DONE BEFORE, BUT THE RISK OF DOING
11 THE SAME THING, AND CONTINUING, YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, MOST
12 OPTIMISTICALLY TO CONTINUE ALONG THE SAME TRENDS AS THINGS
13 WERE GOING PRIOR TO COVID BUT I THINK THAT NO LONGER EVEN KIND
14 OF -- THERE COULD BE -- THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT LIKELIHOOD THAT
15 WE COULD FAIL TO GET MORE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT IN THE FUTURE IF
16 WE DO NOT MAKE CHANGES THAT CHANGE THE WAY TO MAKE THE CASE OF
17 IMPORTANT PUBLIC INVESTMENT IN PUBLIC TRANSIT FOR VOTERS GOING
18 FORWARD. THANK YOU.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS IAN. WHILE WALLY RESETS THE CLOCK, OUR
21 NEXT SPEAKER IS JILL BORDERS.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HI. THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK TODAY. I
24 HAVE SOME NEW TIME ON MY HANDS, AS MY DAUGHTER HAS GRADUATED
25 HIGH SCHOOL LAST YEAR AND I'M TRYING VERY HARD TO BECOME MORE



January 10, 2021

1 INVOLVED IN WHAT I SEE AROUND ME ARE SOME CONCERNS AND
2 PROBLEMS THAT HAVE A RISEN. I AM VERY CONCERNED THEY LISTENED
3 60 MINUTES, I MADE A NOTE OF IT, AND FOR 60 MINUTES, I HAVE NO
4 IDEA WHAT ANYONE IS TALKING ABOUT. AND I REALIZE I'M COMING
5 INTO THIS COLD, BUT THERE IS SO MUCH JARGON, I LITERALLY HAVE
6 NO IDEA WHAT'S HAPPENING AND IT SOUND TO ME LIKE THERE IS
7 ACTUALLY A LOT OF REALLY BIG THINGS BEING TALKED ABOUT BUT I
8 HAVE NO IDEA WHAT THEY ARE. FOR EXAMPLE, WHAT ARE THE MAJOR
9 CHANGES EVERYONE HAS FEAR AROUND THINGS LIKE, THERE IS SO MUCH
10 RISK AND WE COULDN'T BE SO WORRIED ABOUT RISKS AND WHEN WE
11 HAVE BIG SHIFTS WE HAVE TO LEARN HOW -- EVEN IF IT'S
12 UNCOMFORTABLE TO TALK ABOUT WE HAVE TO START TALKING ABOUT IT
13 AND I'M THINKING ABOUT, WHOA, WHAT ARE WE TALKING ABOUT HERE.
14 FROM THE PUBLIC'S POINT OF VIEW I WANT YOU TO THINK ABOUT, I'M
15 COMING INTO THIS COLD ABOUT I WANT TO BE PART OF THE SOLUTION
16 IN OUR REGION BUT I DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING ON. ZERO IDEA. AS
17 FAR AS CHANGES, THERE ARE PHRASES AND I HAVE JOTTED THEM DOWN,
18 "WE DON'T KNOW IF WE'LL BE ABLE TO YOU FIND THE MONEY FOR
19 QUOTE, THIS" THERE ARE COMPLEX SOLUTIONS -- WE HAVE TO
20 OPTIMIZE THE OPTIONS. LOTS OF JARGON. REALLY NO IDEA WHAT ON
21 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. NO IDEA -- I WANT TO BE PART OF THE
22 SOLUTION BUT IF SOMEBODY COULD BRING IT HOME TO ME WHAT YOU
23 GUYS ARE TALKING ABOUT I WOULD BE REALLY GRATEFUL.
24



January 10, 2021

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, JILL FOR YOUR PERSPECTIVE. I THINK
2 IT'S HELPFUL GOING FORWARD. NEXT SPEAKER IS EUGENE BRADLEY.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THE SILICON VALLEY TRANSIT USERS, I ECHO THE TWO
5 PRIOR TWO COMMENTERS IN PARTICULAR FROM SOMEONE LIKE ME WHO
6 ADVOCATES FOR AND MONITORS AN AGENCY WITH WHOM SOME PEOPLE
7 STILL SEE FALSELY THAT VTA IN SOUTH BAY IS CONSIDERED A SOCIAL
8 SERVICE WHEN IN REALITY IT'S A MASSIVE PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCY
9 AND ROAD BUILDERS AS WELL AS GENERAL TRANSIT PROVIDER DOWN IN
10 SILICON VALLEY. IT'S GREAT THAT THIS COMMITTEE IS WORKING ON
11 GETTING A MUCH NEEDED NETWORK MANAGER, BUT FOR THE AVERAGE
12 USER WHO DOESN'T REALIZE THERE IS 27 DIFFERENT BAY AREA
13 TRANSIT AGENCIES TO HAVE TO USE TO GO FROM PLACE TO PLACE,
14 IT'S VERY DAUNTING. I'M FROM A WORLD, NEW JERSEY, WHERE WE
15 ONLY HAD BASICALLY ONE AGENCY TO WORRY ABOUT, NEW JERSEY
16 TRANSIT, SO COMING TO A PLACE WHERE THERE IS 27 DIFFERENT BAY
17 AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES EACH WITH ITS OWN FARE STRUCTURE,
18 SERVICE LOSS, IT'S DAUNTING. THERE NEEDS TO BE A CAMPAIGN FOR
19 PEOPLE ESPECIALLY OUCH TO HELP INFORM THEM WHAT'S GOING ON TO
20 HELP UNIFY PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. BECAUSE FROM TOO
21 MANY PEOPLE I HAVE TALKED TO IT'S INCONVENIENT, AND ONE
22 QUESTION, WHAT WOULD HELP THEM GET ON A BUS OR TRAIN AND HOW
23 TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN. IT'S GREAT THE DISCUSSION THAT'S GOING
24 ON, BUT THIS DISCUSSION REALLY NEEDS TO BE MADE MORE PUBLIC
25 AND DONE IN MORE PUBLIC TIME, LIKE, AFTER 5:00 P.M., SO THIS



January 10, 2021

1 WAY MORE CITIZENS CAN LEARN WHAT'S GOING ON, AND WHAT THEY CAN
2 DO TO MAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA THE WORLD CLASS
3 THING IT DESERVES TO BE. THANK YOU.

4

5 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, EUGENE. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS WENDI
6 KALLINS.

7

8 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. THIS IS WENDI KALLINS, I SERVE ON
9 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND SERVE ON THE FARE INTEGRATION
10 SUBCOMMITTEE. I BELIEVE THIS WORK IS CRUCIAL IN DETERMINING
11 HOW THE MANAGEMENT TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL WORK. AND ECHOING THE
12 REMARKS OF MANY PEOPLE OF SERVING THE USERS, I WANT TO POINT
13 OUT THAT THERE ARE REALLY TWO MAJOR USERS THAT YOU'RE LOOKING
14 TOWARDS, ONE IS THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT, WHICH ARE BASICALLY
15 LOW-INCOME AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT SERVICE WORKERS, AND ALSO,
16 THE PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT YET USING TRANSIT FOR THE MANY REASONS
17 THAT MANY SPEAKERS HAVE SPOKEN OF, BUT COULD POTENTIALLY BE,
18 CONVINCED TO USE PUBLIC TRANSIT, IF IT WAS EASIER TO USE. AND
19 I DON'T THINK THESE TWO USER GROUPS ARE IN CONFLICT. AND IN
20 FACT, DEVELOPING A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WORKS FOR BOTH USERS
21 REALLY DEVELOPS A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WORKS FOR EVERYBODY. SO
22 LOOK FORWARD TO OBSERVING YOUR WORK AND GETTING TO YOUR
23 OUTCOMES. THANK YOU.

24



January 10, 2021

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, WENDI. NEXT SPEAKER IS LAURA
2 TOLKOFF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS LAURA TOLKOFF TRANSPORTATION
5 POLICY DIRECTOR FOR SPUR. WE'RE REALLY GRATEFUL FOR ALL OF YOU
6 FOR YOUR SERVICE THIS ADVISORY GROUP THE WORK YOU'RE DOING IS
7 INTENDED TO HELP TRANSIT NOT JUST SURVIVE BUT THRIVE THROUGH
8 THIS CHALLENGING TIME AND YOU'RE MAKING GOVERNANCE CHANGE A
9 PART OF YOUR JOB. WE BELIEVE THAT ESTABLISHING A NETWORK
10 MANAGER FOR REGIONAL TRANSIT IS REALLY ESSENTIAL FOR IMPROVING
11 THE SYSTEM THAT WE ALL THE KNOW, BUT ALSO TO ENABLING OUR
12 ABILITY TO ACHIEVE THE TRANSIT GROWTH THAT THIS REGION NEEDS,
13 INCLUDING NEARLY DOUBLING THE NUMBER OF COMMUTER TRIPS ON
14 TRANSIT AND THE BUILD-OUT OF THE NETWORK. WE WOULD LIKE TO
15 EMPHASIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF ENDING WITH A CONCRETE
16 RECOMMENDATION ABOUT HOW WE WILL ACTUALLY STANDS UP THIS WORK
17 AND START ACTIVATING IT, SO THAT THE NETWORK MANAGER CAN
18 REALLY START DOING ITS WORK AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. WE REALLY
19 SEE THIS AS BEING ABLE TO HELP TO GROW PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN
20 TRANSIT, MAKING THIS FUNDAMENTALLY AN EXISTENTIAL -- AN
21 EXISTENTIALLY IMPORTANT EFFORT. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO REITERATE
22 AND SUPPORT THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN STATED BEFORE ABOUT
23 FOCUSING ON THE RIDER AS WE MOVE THROUGH THIS PROCESS AND
24 ELEVATING RIDERS NEEDS. THANK YOU.

25



January 10, 2021

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, LAURA. NEXT UP IS GEORGE SPIES.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HELLO, HOPEFULLY YOU CAN HEAR ME. THANK YOU FOR
4 ALLOWING THE PUBLIC COMMENT HERE. AND ALSO THANK YOU FOR THE
5 COMMENTS OF ALL THE FOLKS ON THE COMMISSION. BECAUSE I HEARD A
6 LOT OF THINGS THAT I'M REALLY HAPPY TO HAVE HEARD. SO, I AM
7 PHONING IN AS A TRANSIT USER. I AM AN OPEN RESIDENT WHO USES
8 AC TRANSIT. I USE BART, I USE SF MUNI, AND I HOPE TO CONTINUE
9 TO USE OTHER SYSTEMS AS WELL, CAPITAL CORRIDOR, CALTRAIN, ET
10 CETERA. I AS WELL AS WETA. AS A THIRD CATEGORY USER, I AM
11 VOLUNTARY TRANSIT DEPENDENT. I'M ONE OF THOSE PEOPLE WHO GOT
12 RID OF MY CAR OUT OF BOTH DISTASTE FOR DRIVING BUT ALSO
13 CLIMATE CONCERNS. AND YOU KNOW, I THINK THAT, AS A USER, I CAN
14 SEE THAT THE THING THAT IS GOING TO BRING MORE USERS INTO THE
15 SYSTEM, OVERALL, WHETHER THEY'RE COMMUTERS OR TRANSIT
16 DEPENDENT FOLKS OR PEOPLE WITH CLIMATE CONCERNS OR STUDENTS,
17 OR WHOMEVER, EASE OF USE. AND I REALLY FEEL LIKE IN TERMS OF
18 THE CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN EXPRESSED ABOUT MONEY OR, LIKE,
19 PLEASE RESIST CONCERNS ABOUT MONEY, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT
20 INTEGRATION, AND THIS KIND OF WORK IS GOING TO BE GREAT FOR
21 DELIVERING VALUE TO YOUR USERS WITHOUT MASSIVE INFRASTRUCTURE
22 SPENDING, RIGHT? I MEAN, THIS IS, IN A SENSE, BUDGETARILY, LOW
23 HANGING FRUIT. AS COMPLEX AS IT IS, THIS IS VALUABLE WORK. AND
24 I SUPPORT IT 100%. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

25



January 10, 2021

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** NEXT UP IS DAVE SORRELL.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE DAVID SORRELL TRANSPORTATION
4 DEMAND MANAGEMENT ADMINISTRATOR FOR UC BERKELEY ALSO PRESIDENT
5 OF THE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA COMMUTER TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
6 I WANT TO THANK YOU FIRST AND FOREMOST FOR EVERYONE BEING HERE
7 AND FOR PROVIDING CONSTRUCTIVE COMMENT IN REGARDS TO THE NEED
8 OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT REFORM. THE COUPLE OF COMMENTS FROM ME,
9 CONSIDERING THE FACT THAT WE HAVE GOT ON MY CAMPUS, A GOOD
10 CHUNK OF STUDENTS. OUR CAMPUS HAS 50,000 FOLKS, AT MINIMUM,
11 THAT COME TO THE CAMPUS, MANY OF THOSE FOLKS DO NOT
12 NECESSARILY LIVE WITHIN THE CITY LIMITS SO THEY DO RELY ON
13 MULTI-MODAL EFFORTS COMING IN FROM SAN FRANCISCO, MARIN,
14 SOLANO, AS WELL AS ALONG THE 680 CORRIDOR, AND IT'S IMPORTANT
15 TO ENSURE THEY HAVE THOSE NECESSARY OPTIONS TO GET TO AND FROM
16 CAMPUS. BUT WHAT IT COMES DOWN TO ALSO IS GETTING THE SUPPORT
17 FROM THE INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCIES AND EVEN LABOR. AS
18 GENERAL MANAGER HURSH MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY WHICH IS A GOOD
19 POINT TO NOT LEAVE THEM OUT OF THE EQUATION. I THINK THIS IS
20 GOING TO BE A LONG BUT VERY WELL DESERVED JOURNEY FOR ALL OF
21 US, ESPECIALLY IF WE WANT TO INSTILL THE PUBLIC TRUST IN FUNDS
22 BEING EX-PENED BUT ALSO TO THINK WITH A REGIONAL LENS. AS
23 LONG AS WE CONTINUE TO WORK ON THOSE EFFORTS I LOOK FORWARD TO
24 COLLABORATING WITH YOU ALL ON HOW WE CAN GET BUSINESS OWNERS



January 10, 2021

1 AND RIDERS TRANSIT DEPENDENT TO GET WHERE THEY NEED TO GO.

2 THANK YOU. HAVE A WONDERFUL DAY.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU. THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC COMMENT ON

5 THIS ITEM. I SEE JILL HAS HER HAND RAISED AGAIN. WE HAVE

6 ANOTHER UPCOMING ITEM NUMBER WE'RE GOING FOR DISCUSSION. YOU

7 ARE OFFERED TO SPEAK ONCE ON EACH ITEM. YOU CAN ALSO SUBMIT

8 COMMENTS IN WRITING, THEY'RE RECEIVED IN THE SAME WAY AND

9 GIVEN THE SAME BENEFIT AS THOSE WHO ARE SPOKEN VERBALLY AT THE

10 MEETINGS. WITH THAT WE'RE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 6A, WITH THAT I

11 TURN IT BACK THE VIA TEAM.

12

13 **KEVIN DESMOND:** THANK YOU. IF YOU COULD PUT UP SLIDE 16? WE

14 HAVE HAD LOTS OF INPUT FROM THE MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY GROUP.

15 THINK OF THIS AS A BIT OF CONTINUATION OF THE PEEK AND INPUT.

16 HOPEFUL YOU HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO TAKE A LOOK AT THESE TWO

17 SLIDES, AND THE QUESTIONS THIS WE HAVE POSED. I HOPE THAT, AS

18 WELL, THAT YOU HAVE GOT A GOOD GENERAL OVERVIEW OF WHAT THAT

19 PHASE OF WORK IS GOING TO BE OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. AND OF

20 COURSE WE ARE GOING TO HAVE MANY, MANY OPPORTUNITIES WITH THIS

21 COMMITTEE IN THE MONTHS AHEAD TO BOUNCE OFF IDEAS, GET YOUR

22 WISDOM AND HELP US BRING THIS TO A VERY SMART CONCLUSION. AS

23 WE HEARD FROM THERESE AT THE OPENING WHERE WE LEFT OFF IN THE

24 PROJECT AT THE BEGINNING OF FALL IS THERE SEEMS TO BE

25 CONSENSUS ABOUT WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE. WE HAVE HEARD FROM



January 10, 2021

1 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THEIR COMMENTS AND SOME OF YOU
2 ALREADY ON THE WHAT. AND THE WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE IS A VERY
3 SHARP FOCUS ON THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE REGIONALLY AND SETTING
4 THE CONDITIONS FOR NOT ONLY RIDERSHIP RECOVERY POST-COVID BUT
5 LONG-TERM RIDER SHIP GROWTH THAT'S THE EVIDENCE ON THE RECENT
6 PROGRESS YOU HAVE MADE ON THE REGIONAL FARE INTEGRATION AND
7 REGIONAL WAYFINDING SIGNAGE THE CHALLENGE OF COURSE IS HOW TO
8 ACCOMPLISH THIS. WE HAVE HEARD FROM SEVERAL OF YOU HOW
9 CHANGING IN GOVERNANCE IS RISKY IT'S TOUGH TO WHICH THE REGION
10 IS WILLING TO BE BOLD TO WORK TOWARDS THOSE OUTCOMES. SO FOR
11 THE NEXT 15 TO 20 MINUTES WE WANT TO CONTINUE THE DISCUSSION
12 WITH YOU, GET A VERY GOOD SENSE TO A CERTAIN DEGREE ON WHAT
13 THE EXPECTATIONS OUGHT TO BE FOR THIS PROCESS AND WHAT SUCCESS
14 LOOKS LIKE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, IF YOU CONTINUE TO
15 RUMINATE A LITTLE BIT ON THOSE QUESTIONS HOPEFULLY WE CAN HEAR
16 FROM EVERY EVERYBODY ON THE ADVISORY GROUP. WE HAVE HEARD FROM
17 HALF YOU ALREADY SO THOSE OF WHO YOU HAVEN'T HAD A CHANCE TO
18 RAISE YOUR HAND WE'RE INTERESTED IN YOUR PERSPECTIVES, AS
19 WELL. FROM A TECHNICAL STANDPOINT, ARE WE FOCUSED ON THE
20 RIGHT THINGS? DO YOU HAVE ANY TOP OF MIND THOUGHTS ABOUT THE
21 TECHNICAL ASPECTS OF THE PROGRAMS SO THEY BECOME -- THEY SET
22 THE CONDITIONS FOR, ULTIMATELY, THE MTC TO HAVE AN ACTIONABLE,
23 OR ACTIONABLE SOLUTIONS. AND THEN, SECOND, WHAT ELSE, TOP-OF-
24 MIND ARE YOU LOOKING FOR, FOR THIS BUSINESS CASE TO ADDRESS.
25 SEVERAL OF YOU HAVE ALREADY SPOKEN TO THAT AT SOME LEVEL. SO



January 10, 2021

1 WE'RE INTERESTED IN WHAT THE REST OF YOU HAVE TO SAY, OR IF
2 YOU WANT TO SHARPEN YOUR POINTS TO THESE PARTICULAR QUESTIONS.
3 AND IN ADDITION, WHAT CRITERIA, YOU KNOW, FROM THAT COST
4 BENEFIT ANALYSIS, THE EVALUATION, THE QUALITATIVE AND
5 QUANTITATIVE ELEMENTS OF THE EVALUATION. WHAT ARE THE CRITERIA
6 THAT COME TO MIND THAT ARE MOST RELEVANT FACTORS FOR VEHICLE.
7 SO WITH THAT, CHAIR, MAYBE WE COULD PUT THE GRID UP FIRST. AND
8 THOSE WHO HAVE FEEDBACK RELATIVE TO THOSE QUESTIONS, OR IF YOU
9 HAVE OTHER POINTS THAT YOU WANT TO BRING FORWARD TO HELP GUIDE
10 US FOR THIS WORK TO COME?

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS KEVIN. AND WE DID JUMP THE GUN ON THE
13 LAST ITEM YOU BUT I THINK THAT WAS GOOD AND PRODUCTIVE. SO I'M
14 LOOKING TO SEE WHICH OF MY COLLEAGUES ON THIS GROUP WISH TO
15 WEIGH IN FIRST. PLEASE RAISE YOUR HANDS. SEEING NONE. OH,
16 THERE WE GO. I'LL CALL ON ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE

17

18 **ALICIA JOHN BAPTISTE:** THANK YOU. SORRY IT TOOK ME A MINUTE TO
19 NAVIGATE MY SCREEN. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO APPRECIATE EACH OF
20 YOU FOR BEING PART OF THIS GROUP. I HAVE BEEN LOOKING FORWARD
21 TO THIS SET OF CONVERSATIONS. I THINK THIS IS REALLY KIND OF
22 AN EXTRAORDINARY OPPORTUNITY WITH REALLY INTERESTING CROSS
23 SECTION OF VIEWPOINTS AND STAKEHOLDERS COMING TOGETHER WITH A
24 COMMON PURPOSE WHICH IS MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN ENHANCE OUR
25 TRANSIT OFFERINGS AS A REGION, WHICH WE ALL KNOW IS WHAT'S



January 10, 2021

1 NECESSARY FOR US TO GET TO AS SUSTAINABLE AND PROCESS AN
2 EQUITABLE REGION IN THE LONG RUN. JUST APPRECIATING BEING PART
3 OF THIS CONVERSATION TODAY. I THINK THE QUESTION ON WHAT IS
4 GOING TO DELIVER THE STRONGEST OUTCOME AND PICKING UP ON THE
5 THREADS OF EARLIER DISCUSSION, I THINK TO GET TO SOMETHING
6 THAT'S ULTIMATELY VERY ACTIONABLE, WE WILL -- I, AT LEAST,
7 PERSONALLY, WOULD WANT TO SEE AN EVALUATION OF WHAT BEST
8 DELIVERS AGAINST OUR GOALS, BUT THEN, ALSO, THE NECESSARY
9 COMPONENTS THAT ALLOW US TO GO IN THAT DIRECTION. AND I THINK
10 THAT WILL BE TRUE IN TERMS OF RESOURCING THE STRUCTURES THAT
11 WE NEED TO MAKE REGIONALLY-MINDED DECISIONS, AND ALSO MAKING
12 SURE THAT ANY RISK THAT COMES UP IN TERMS OF OUR CAPACITY TO
13 DELIVER LOCAL SERVICE IS ALSO MITIGATED. SO I WOULD WANT TO
14 SEE SOMETHING THAT NOT ONLY EVALUATES WHAT DIRECTION WE WANT
15 TO GO IN, BUT ALSO GIVES A PRETTY CLEAR ROADMAP FOR WHAT WOULD
16 MAKE US SUCCESSFUL IN GETTING THERE, AS MULTIPLE LEVELS. ONE
17 QUESTION I HAD, I DON'T KNOW IF THIS HAS BEEN THOUGHT THROUGH
18 YET ALREADY, BUT JUST A REFLECTION OF SOME OF THE COMPLEXITY
19 WE ALREADY FACE AS A REGION IS HOW WE'RE THINKING ABOUT
20 INTEGRATING TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS INTO THIS PROCESS AND THE
21 PRETTY MUCH OF EXISTING BOARDS INTO THIS PROCESS. I KNOW SOME
22 OF THAT CAN COME THROUGH THE REPRESENTATIVES ON THE GROUP, BUT
23 I WONDERED IF THERE WAS ANY SPECIFIC THOUGHT ON THAT AS WELL.
24 AND JUST AMPLIFYING WHAT JIM WUNDERMAN WAS SAYING EARLIER,
25 IT'S ON US TO BE AS AMBITIOUS AND ASPIRATIONAL AS WE CAN TO



January 10, 2021

1 TRUST OUR CHASTE AND GENERATE RESOURCES WE NEED TO SUPPORT THE
2 VISION BECAUSE I THINK WE CAN ULTIMATELY DO THAT SUCCESSFULLY.
3 THANK YOU.

4

5 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU ALICIA. NEXT, ADINA LEVIN.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. A FEW THOUGHTS ON THESE
8 QUESTIONS ABOUT A STRONG EVALUATION AND ONE IS BUILDING ON THE
9 PUBLIC COMMENT FROM IAN GRIFFITHS. NOT TO BE BIAS TOWARD THE
10 STATUS QUO AND LOOKING AS WHAT ALICIA SAID IN TERMS OF WHERE
11 IS IT THAT WE WANT TO GO, ANOTHER POINT IS TO REALLY RECOGNIZE
12 AND QUANTIFY THE COSTS OF THE SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE AND QUANTIFY
13 THE EFFICIENCIES. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, WITH FARE INTEGRATION AND
14 MOVING FORWARD ON A PILOT FOR AN ALL-AGENCY TRANSIT PASS, HOW
15 MANY PEOPLE IN THIS REGION ARE WORKING ON TRANSIT PASSES FOR
16 INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES TODAY, AND WHAT EFFICIENCIES WOULD BE
17 GAINED BY HAVING A POOLED GROUP OF PEOPLE WORKING ON
18 DEVELOPING THOSE KINDS OF FARES IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO
19 INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP? WHAT EFFICIENCIES CAN BE GAINED?
20 SPEAKING OF THE RIDER EXPERIENCE AND SKILLS. ONE OF THE
21 LESSONS FROM THE FARE INTEGRATION WORK IS THE UNPRECEDENTED
22 TYPE OF WORK ON USER EXPERIENCE RESEARCH THAT WAS DONE, THAT I
23 THINK OUR REGION HASN'T DONE BEFORE. SO IDENTIFYING WHAT KINDS
24 OF COMPETENCIES NEED TO BE BROUGHT IN NOT ONLY BY HIRING
25 CONSULTANTS BUT BY INCREASING THE SKILLS AND COMPETENCES OF



January 10, 2021

1 THE PUBLIC SECTOR STAFF, OURSELVES, TO BE ABLE TO HAVE THE
2 CAPABILITIES OF DELIVERING THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT SUCCESS.
3 AND THEN A COUPLE MORE THINGS IN TERMS OF BEING SPECIFIC, SO
4 THAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE COME UP WITH CAN MOVE SWIFTLY
5 TOWARDS IMPLEMENTATION. AND, LASTLY, IN A DIFFERENT DIRECTION
6 ALONG ONE OF THE COMMENTS THAT I AND OTHERS HAD MADE EARLIER,
7 AND I THINK WHAT ALICIA HAD SAID, IS ENGAGING WITH ELECTED
8 LEADERS ALONG THE WAY, AND THE PUBLIC, ALONG THE WAY. SO THAT
9 WE HAVE SUPPORT ALL ALONG THE WAY TO BE ABLE TO TAKE THAT
10 ACTION. THANKS.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU ADINA. THERESE MCMILLAN?

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU, DENNIS. YOU KNOW, THIS COMMENT
15 IS NOT SO MUCH AS SPECIFIC CRITERION AS MUCH AS MAYBE MORE
16 APROPOS THE DISCUSSION WE HAD BEFORE, SORT OF, AN OVERRIDING
17 CONCERN, CERTAINLY SOMETHING I HAVE BEEN STRUGGLING WITH,
18 WHICH IS, YOU KNOW, I THINK FOR QUITE SOMETIME THERE WAS THIS,
19 SORT OF, UNDERLYING ASSUMPTION THAT WE WOULD BE ASSESSING AND
20 BUILDING A NEW GOVERNANCE MODEL ON A FOUNDATION OF RECOVERED
21 TRANSIT SYSTEMS. THAT SOMEHOW WE HAD GOTTEN TO THE POINT OF
22 THAT ELUSIVE NEW NORMAL. BUT I THINK AS WE ENTER 2022, A MORE
23 APPROPRIATE QUESTION FOR US IS, HOW DO WE EVALUATE AND
24 SCENARIO-BUILD ANALYSIS IN A CONTINUING SHIFTING ECONOMIC AND
25 MOBILITY ENVIRONMENT. HOW DO WE DO THAT? BECAUSE IF WE, YOU



January 10, 2021

1 KNOW AS WE ALL HAVE BEEN SAYING, WANT TO GRAB THE MOMENT NOW,
2 THAT MIGHT MEAN LETTING GO OF THAT BASIS ASSUMPTION THAT WHAT
3 WE'RE REALLY DOING IS BUILDING ON THE NEW NORMAL, WHATEVER
4 THAT LOOKS LIKE. SO I PUT THAT OUT THERE BECAUSE I THINK IT'S
5 JUST A UNIQUE REFLECTION OF THE TIMES WE'RE IN. I DON'T HAVE
6 AN ANSWER. [LAUGHTER] WHICH IS WHY I'M PUTTING IT OUT THERE,
7 BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR CONSIDERATION, FOR EXPECTATIONS
8 ABOUT HOW DO WE BUILD THIS ANALYSIS.

9

10 **KEVIN DESMOND:** I LIKE TO USE THE WORD AGILITY TO GO WITH THAT
11 THERESE. FOR US TRYING TO WORK ON THIS PROJECT ON YOUR BEHALF,
12 BUT ALSO CLEARLY FROM ACROSS THE SPECTRUM OF THE DIFFERENT
13 GOVERNMENTAL ENTITIES, THE ADVOCACY GROUPS AND VISIONING
14 CHANGE, THE AGILE ENVIRONMENT WE STILL DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT
15 WILL LOOK LIKE TWO OR THREE YEARS FROM NOW AFTER THE REGION
16 HAS COME UP WITH IT GOVERNANCE PREFERENCE. AGILITY IS
17 IMPORTANT I UNDERSCORE THAT IT'S IMPORTANT TO KEEP UP FRONT,
18 NOT NECESSARILY ALL OF THE PATHWAYS TO TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND
19 GROWTH AS WE LOOK AT WHAT THE NEW WORLD MAY LOOK LIKE, POST-
20 COVID.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU FOR THAT COMMENT IT'S QUITE REAL
23 TODAY. HAYLEY CURRIER.

24



January 10, 2021

1 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** THE TOP QUESTIONS THAT NEED TO BE CONSIDERED
2 IS HOW WILL RIDERS BE AFFECT AND SAID WILL THE STRUCTURE THAT
3 WE'RE WORKING ON PROVIDE MATERIALLY FOR RIDERS KEY QUESTION,
4 ACCESSIBILITY AND DECISION MAKERS COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND
5 COMMUNITY MEMBERS BEING CONSULTED PROVIDING INPUT AND WITH MTC
6 IN THE CURRENT STRUCTURE IT'S NOT ACCESSIBLE FOR THE GENERAL
7 PUBLIC IS THERE A WAY WE CAN BE IMPROVING THAT WITH THE SYSTEM
8 WE'RE WORKING ON. WILL STRUCTURE MAKE TRANSIT MORE AFFORDABLE
9 FOR THOSE WITH COST BARRIERS. HOW DO WE ENSURE ALL LOW-INCOME
10 PEOPLE AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY IN THE REGION HAVE IMPROVED
11 OUTCOMES NOT JUST SOME PEOPLE IN THE REGIONS. I DON'T THINK WE
12 SHOULD BE COMPARING THE BEST KIND OF OUTCOME FOR LOW-INCOME
13 PEOPLE IN ONE AREA TO -- LIKE, IT SHOULD BE GENERALLY, HOW WE
14 WOULD BE IMPROVING OVERALL, AND IN TERMS OF CRITERIA, WILL
15 THERE BE BETTER SERVICE FOR LOW-INCOME RIDERS, WILL
16 PARATRANSIT BETTER SERVE THOSE WITH DISABILITIES AND HOW WILL
17 THIS BE ACCOUNTABLE FOR SERVING GENDER, RACE, AND ABILITY, AND
18 WHAT GOVERNMENT IS BEST ABLE TO OVERCOME OR CREATE THOSE
19 OUTCOMES.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU HALEY. ANY OTHERS WHO WISH TO WEIGH
22 IN? I'LL TURN TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. IF YOU WISH TO WEIGH
23 IN RAISE YOUR HAND OR USE THE DIAL NINE FEATURE ON YOUR PHONE.
24 I SEE ONE HAND RAISED. FIRST MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IS MICHAEL
25 ABRAMS SON.



January 10, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I LIVE IN MOUNTAIN VIEW, AND I WILL LIKE
3 TO COMMENT ON THE DESIRED OUTCOMES OF THIS ORGANIZATION. IF
4 YOU LIVED IN THE AREAS WITH GOOD PUBLIC TRANSIT, YOU PROBABLY
5 KNOW WHAT IT TAKES TO MAKE IT REALLY USEFUL. FIRST AND
6 FOREMOST, HIGH FREQUENCY. FIVE MINUTES. TEN MINUTES IT'S MAYBE
7 THE UPPER LIMIT. THEN, YOU NEED TO DIRECT ROUTES BETWEEN THE
8 HIGH DENSITY AREAS AND POPULAR DESTINATIONS THAT WOULD ALSO
9 SERVE ANYONE IN BETWEEN. AND, THEN YOU NEED CONVENIENT
10 TRANSFERS, AND INTEGRATED AND AFFORDABLE FARES. SO THAT'S NOT
11 REAL ROCKET SCIENCE. AND IN ORDER TO DO THIS, YES, OF COURSE,
12 YOU NEED SOME, SORT OF, INTEGRATED MANAGEMENT AND AUTHORITY
13 THAT COULD DEVELOP SUCH A SYSTEM AND CREATE SUCH A SYSTEM. AND
14 ANOTHER IMPORTANT POINT, HAS TO BE MADE IN CLOSE COOPERATION
15 WITH COUNTIES AND CITIES WITH THEIR HOUSING PLANS SO THAT THE
16 HIGH DENSITY HOUSING WOULD BE WHERE THE PUBLIC TRANSIT IS ALSO
17 AVAILABLE. SO THEY HAVE TO GO TOGETHER. THANK YOU.

18

19 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU MICHAEL. NEXT SPEAKER IS JILL
20 BORDERS.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HI. I AM CATCHING ON. OKAY. SO I THINK WE'RE TALKING
23 ABOUT CHANGING GOVERNANCE OF SOME KIND AND THAT YOU WANT SOME
24 KIND OF STRONG EVALUATION AFTER THIS IS ALL OVER FOR THE MTC
25 TO MAKE CHANGES. SO I'M TRYING TO CATCH ON HERE. I WANT TO PUT



January 10, 2021

1 IN MY TWO CENTS ON WHAT I THINK MTC NEEDS KNOW. MTC AND ABAG
2 ARE QUITE A SOAR SUBJECT FOR ME AS I EXPERIENCED ONGOING
3 DISPLACEMENT OUT OF WANTING TO ALWAYS LIVE NEAR TRANSIT AND
4 ALWAYS BEING AT RISK OF DISPLACEMENT AFTER THE '20 AND '40
5 VISION PLAN WHICH I HAVE NOW READ THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
6 WHICH THEY HAVE GOTTEN ON BOARD AND RECOGNIZE THAT
7 HIGHLIGHTING PLACES FOR TRANSIT FOR DEVELOPERS TO JUMP IN AND
8 KICK US OUT WAS KIND OF A BAD IDEA. I'M GOING TO PUT IN MY TWO
9 CENTS EARLY O WHEN MY DAUGHTER WAS LITTLE WE HOME SCHOOLED OUR
10 DAUGHTER UNTIL HIGH SCHOOL WHEN SHE WAS PART OF A HYBRID
11 PROGRAM AND I THOUGHT IT WAS SO IMPORTANT THAT YOU GET
12 CHILDREN ON TRANSIT EARLY THAT'S HOW EVERYBODY LEARNS TO ENJOY
13 TRANSIT SO WE WOULD WALK TO THE BUS THEN WE WOULD GET ON THE
14 BUS AND CALL IT OUR BUS ADVENTURES AND SHE WOULD GET OFF
15 WHEREVER SHE WANTED THEN GET ON AND GET OFF AT THE NEXT STOP
16 IT WAS A WAY TO LEARN AND UNDERSTAND TRANSIT MANNERS. AND IT
17 BECAME UNSAFE. IT WAS ABSOLUTELY NOT A SAFER PLACE FOR A YOUNG
18 CHILD THEN AS A WOMAN LATER ON JUST BY MYSELF EXPERIENCING
19 HARASSMENT AND ISSUES ON TRANSIT. SO MY BIGGEST CONCERN, IF I
20 COULD LEAVE ANYTHING FOR MTC WOULD BE SAFETY, SAFETY, SAFETY.
21 AND ANYTHING WE CAN DO TO MAKE PEOPLE FEEL MORE SAFE IS WHAT I
22 THINK NEEDS TO HAPPEN. THANK YOU.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, JILL. OUR NEXT SPEAKER SUGGEST DAVE
25 SORRELL. I DON'T HEAR DAVE WEIGHING IN. DAVE, DO YOU STILL



January 10, 2021

1 HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED? MAYBE WE'LL COME BACK TO DAVE. IAN
2 GRIFFITHS?

3

4 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU IAN GRIFFITHS WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA.
5 GENERALLY WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR THIS GREAT DISCUSSION.
6 TWO POINTS. ONE IS TO REITERATE THAT THIS IS THE TIME TO BE
7 BOLD AND I THINK I HAVE BEEN DOING READING, ALSO, OVER THE
8 HOLIDAYS ABOUT THE HISTORY OF THE BAY AREA, AND YOU KNOW,
9 EVERY TEN OR 20 YEARS THE BAY AREA GOES THROUGH SOME PROCESS
10 LIKE THIS AND WE DON'T HAVE A GREAT TRACK RECORD OF
11 TRANSLATING BIG REGIONAL VISIONS INTO BIG INSTITUTIONAL
12 CHANGES THAT HAVE A LASTING EFFECT. I REALLY HOPE THIS IS
13 GOING TO BE A DIFFERENT MOMENT IN TIME. AND IT REALLY DEPENDS
14 ON EACH OF YOU. I MEAN, IT DEPENDS ON A LOT OF STAKEHOLDERS
15 BUT YOU'RE ALL GOING TO BE CRITICAL IN THAT AND I HOPE YOU CAN
16 THINK ABOUT WHAT ARE THE SOLUTIONS THAT ARE GOING TO BE BEST
17 FOR THE REGION FOR OUR CHILDREN AND GRANDCHILDREN AND WHAT
18 KIND OF TRANSIT SYSTEM WE WANT TO BE LEAVING FOR THE NEXT
19 GENERATION. AS A DETAILED SPECIFIC COMMENT, I WONDER ABOUT THE
20 POSSIBILITY OF BUILDING IN SOME KIND OF ABILITY FOR OUTSIDE
21 GOVERNANCE EXPERTS OUTSIDE OF THIS PROCESS TO WEIGH IN ON THE
22 REPORT AND THE RECOMMENDATIONS. PEOPLE THAT AREN'T ON THIS
23 TASK FORCE, BUT MAY HAVE EXPERTISE FROM OTHER PARTS OF THE
24 WORLD TO REALLY WEIGH IN AT SOME POINT AND KIND OF OFFER AN



January 10, 2021

1 ALTERNATIVE THIRD PARTY REVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATION. THANK
2 YOU.

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS IAN. WE'LL TRY DAVE SORRELL, AGAIN.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YOU HAVE GOT DAVE NOW. THANK YOU. APOLOGIES FOR THAT.
7 I THINK WITH ALL OF THE CONCEPTS MENTIONED. AT OUR CAMPUS WE
8 HAVE AT LEAST AT THE UC FRONT, I CAN SPEAK FOR OTHER
9 UNIVERSITIES IN THE BAY AREA, WE HAVE FOCUS ON STUDENTS THAT
10 HAVE PROBABLY NOT TAKEN A BUS BEFORE IN THEIR LIVES, A LOT OF
11 FOLKS ARE COMING FROM OTHER PARTS OF THE STATE, OTHER PARTS OF
12 THE COUNTRY WHERE TRANSIT IS NOT A PRIORITY. I THINK THAT WE
13 HAVE TO CONSIDER, NOT ONLY FOR THEM, BUT FOR EVERYONE ELSE,
14 RIGHT, THE TRIPS THAT HAVE NOT BEEN TAKEN. OPPORTUNITIES THAT
15 WOULD ALIGN WITH GETTING FOLKS OUT OF THERE ARE CARTS, AND AT
16 LEAST KIND OF IDENTIFYING ALONG WITH OUR RESPECTIVE
17 TRANSPORTATION PLANS, UC BERKELEY, WE JUST GOT OUR LONG RANGE
18 DEVELOPMENT PLAN WRAPPED UP, AND I'M MAKING REVISIONS TO OUR
19 TDM STRATEGY, AS WE GO ALONG, SAN JOSE STATE IS IN THE PROCESS
20 OF WORKING ON THAT. STANFORD HAS A MAGNIFICENT SYSTEM, EVEN
21 THOUGH I'M NOT ALLOWED TO SAY THAT, BUT IN THE GRAND SCHEME OF
22 THINGS, I THINK WE HAVE TO BE VERY COGNIZANT ABOUT THOSE WHO
23 DO NOT HAVE A CAR. I'M A CHOICE RIDER WHO OPTS TO TAKE
24 TRANSIT, BECAUSE I'M A TRANSIT GEEK. NOT EVERYONE HAS THAT
25 SAME PASSION, HOWEVER, KNOWING THE FACT THAT WE HAVE MAKE SURE



January 10, 2021

1 THAT ANY OF THE GOALS THAT WE MAKE, WHETHER IT BE FIVE YEARS,
2 TEN YEARS, 20 YEARS, HAS A LONG LASTING POSITIVE EFFECT ON
3 GETTING FOLKS WHERE THEY NEED TO GO AND FASTER THAN THE CARS
4 IN THE UBERS AND LYFTS IN FRONT OF THEM. SO I ASK FOR ALL OF
5 US TO CONSIDER MAKING SURE THAT TRANSIT IS STRONGER AND SEXIER
6 THAN THE NEWEST AUTONOMOUS OR ELECTRIC VEHICLE OUT THERE, AND
7 FOR THAT MATTER, I YIELD THE FLOOR.

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, DAVE. THAT CONCLUDES ALL OF THE
10 HANDS THAT I SEE RAISED. I'LL TAKE IT BACK TO OUR ADVISORY
11 GROUP TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY ADDITIONAL THOUGHTS BEFORE WE
12 CONSIDER ADJOURNMENT. SEEING NO HANDS RAISED. I WANT TO
13 THANK ALL OF YOU FOR THE MEETING TODAY, AND FOR THE THOUGHTFUL
14 DISCUSSION. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
15 BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP IS SCHEDULED FOR FEBRUARY 7TH
16 STAFF WILL BE CONFIRMING IN THE COMING WEEKS AND MAY NEED TO
17 SHIFT TIME AROUND A LITTLE BIT BASED ON SCHEDULES. BEFORE I
18 ADJOURN, ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HAS RAISED THEIR HAND ONE
19 LAST TIME. I WOULD BE REMISS IF I DID NOT CALL ON THAT PERSON.
20 IF WE COULD GET THE TIMER UP, WALLY, WE'LL LET ALETA DUPRE
21 SPEAK.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE, FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER.
24 AS I SPEAK IN THE LAST GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT I HAVE BEEN
25 LISTENING TO THE MEETING TODAY IT'S HEAVY AND COMPLEX. RIGHT



January 10, 2021

1 NOW IT'S CLEAR AS MUD BUT WITH FARE INTEGRATION LIKELY IT'S
2 GOING TO BECOME CLEAR OVER TIME AS WE START ON ANOTHER MAJOR
3 PROJECT. I COME TO YOU AS AN ORDINARY USER OF PUBLIC
4 TRANSPORTATION, ABOUT A HALF CENTURY OF THAT, MY RÉSUMÉ OF
5 CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION IS ONLY ABOUT A DECADE AND A HALF.
6 BUT I WAS INTRODUCED TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN NEW YORK CITY
7 ON THEIR RAPID TRANSIT SYSTEM. IT'S CALLED THE SUBWAY. I AM
8 SURE SOME OF YOU HAVE GOTTEN TO SEE IT OR MAYBE EVEN USE IT. I
9 WAS RIDING IT BACK IN, BY MYSELF, WHEN MY AGE WAS IN THE LOW
10 DOUBLE DIGITS, I WOULD SAY. AND I DON'T KNOW IF I'M TRANSIT
11 DEPENDENT, BUT I DON'T HAVE A CAR. I COULD DRIVE A CAR BUT
12 IT'S EXPENSIVE TO KEEP A CAR. I JUST DON'T LIKE HAVING ALL THE
13 ISSUES THAT COME WITH KEEPING A VEHICLE, AND AS THE OLD
14 GREYHOUND ADS WOULD SAY, LEAVE THE DRIVING TO US. I LIVE TO
15 LEAVE THE DRIVING TO THE BUSES AND TRAINS AND I WANT TO HAVE A
16 MORE SEAMLESS AND USER FRIENDLY EXPERIENCE AND I DON'T KNOW
17 WHAT THIS GOVERNANCE IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE. BUT I DO ASPIRE TO
18 THE DAY WHEN I CAN TAKE MY CONTACTLESS DEBIT CARD AND SIMPLY
19 TAP IT ON ALL OF THESE DIFFERENT SYSTEMS AND THEN I'M GOING TO
20 KNOW WHAT I'M GOING TO PAY. YOU KNOW, CLIPPER IS GREAT AT --
21 IT TALLIES IT UP. BUT THIS IS TAKING IT TO THE NEXT LEVEL. SO
22 I HAVE BEEN LISTENING, AND I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO YOUR NEXT
23 MEETING.

24

25 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU ALETA. SHRUTI



January 10, 2021

1

2 **SHRUTI HARI:** THANK YOU TO ALL OF THE MEMBERS FOR YOUR VALUABLE
3 FEEDBACK AND FOR THE CONSULTING PROCESS BUT I'LL TURN TO
4 QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO THE
7 CONSULTING TEAM.

8

9 **KEVIN DESMOND:** I'LL START AND MAYBE YOU MIGHT CHIME IN ON
10 OTHER SPECIFICS AND NEXT STEPS BASED ON THE INFORMATION IN THE
11 SLIDES. BEFORE WE GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE AND PIECES, I THINK WE
12 ALL APPRECIATE ON THE CONSULTANT TEAM IN FEEDBACK WE HAVE
13 GOTTEN TODAY NOT ONLY FROM MEMBERS OF THIS COMMITTEE BUT THE
14 REALLY GREAT PUBLIC FEEDBACK AND PUBLIC COMMENTS, IN TWO
15 ROUNDS OF PUBLIC COMMENTARY, SO I THINK WE HEARD SOME
16 CONSISTENCY AROUND A LOT OF THE THEMES. FIRST AND FOREMOST,
17 STAY FOCUSED ON THE OUTCOMES. AND THE OUTCOME IS CREATING AN
18 ENVIRONMENT OF SUPERIOR CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FOR ALL OF YOUR
19 TRANSIT SYSTEMS AND YOUR TRANSIT SERVICES WITH A REALLY GOOD
20 FOCUS ON CREATING THE CONDITIONS FOR RIDERSHIP GROWTH IN THE
21 REGION. KEEPING TRACK OF, NOT ONLY OUR CONSULTANT TEAM, BUT
22 ALL THE KEY PLAYERS KEEPING AWARE OF THE VOICE OF THE RIDERS,
23 VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER WITH A SHARP FOCUS ON ENSURING ACCESS
24 FOR ALL, BROAD BASED VERY EQUITABLE ACCESS TO ALL TRANSIT
25 INVESTMENTS IN THE REGION REALLY IMPORTANT ELEMENTS THAT WE'RE



January 10, 2021

1 ALL WORKING ON: AND THINKING BOLDLY, BE COURAGEOUS, NOT LOSE
2 THE MOMENT, AS I THINK SOMEONE EARLIER SAID. THERE HAS BEEN A
3 LOT OF MOMENTUM IN THE BAY AREA REGION. THIS PROJECT AND THIS
4 PROCESS CAN MAINTAIN AND MAYBE ACCELERATE SOME OF THAT
5 MOMENTUM. SO IT WOULD BE REALLY IMPORTANT FOR ALL OF US TO BE
6 ABLE TO THINK BIG AND THINK BOLD AND FIGURE OUT HOW IT FITS
7 INTO WITH THE EVALUATION SCHEME. WITH THAT SAID, BALANCE THE
8 RISK. EVALUATE THE RISK PUT THE RISK FORWARD AND BE VISIBLE
9 TALK ABOUT THE RISKS ASSOCIATED WITH MOVING INTO THE UNKNOWN,
10 A NEW GOVERNANCE EXPERIMENT NEW GOVERNANCE PLATFORM FOR THE
11 REGION IN THE CONTEXT OF THIS UNCERTAINTY THAT WE'RE ALL STILL
12 FACING IN THE WORLD, IN THE BAY AREA, WITH MANY ASPECTS OF
13 PLANNING AND DELIVERING TRANSIT SERVICE. SO THAT AGILITY TO
14 THINK ABOUT RISK IN THE CONTEXT OF AN UNCERTAIN NEAR-TERM
15 FUTURE IS VERY IMPORTANT BUT THAT SHOULDN'T STOP THE REGION --
16 STOP THIS PROJECT FROM PUSHING TOWARD REALLY SMART OUTCOMES.
17 I THINK THAT BALANCE, OR THAT COMMENT, AND THAT NOTION OF HOW
18 BEST TO BALANCE REGIONAL AND LOCAL INTEREST IS REALLY
19 IMPORTANT. WE HEARD A LOT ABOUT THAT IN THE FIRST PHASE WE
20 HEARD ABOUT THAT TODAY, THE REGIONAL OBJECTIVE BUT ALL LOCAL
21 INTEREST RIDER AS WELL, I THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE BROUGHT
22 FORWARD IN THE COMPLEXITY OF GOVERNANCE CHANGE AND LASTLY MAKE
23 SURE THIS IS RANKED TO OTHER BROAD POLICY OBJECTIVES. CLIMATE
24 ACTION IS CERTAINLY VERY MUCH A TOP OF MIND. SO THESE
25 OUTCOMES, NOT JUST THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, NOT JUST THE



January 10, 2021

1 CONDITIONS FOR RIDERSHIP GROWTH BUT HOW DOES THIS PROCESS, HOW
2 DOES THIS PROJECT, INITIATIVE, ALSO ADVANCE OTHER LARGER
3 POLICY OBJECTIVES. I THINK WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE
4 COGNIZANT OF THAT, IN THE CONSULTANT TEAM, AND THAT SHOULD BE
5 AN OVERALL CONTEXT FOR ACTION IN THE REGION. WITH THAT, MAYBE
6 JUST TURN IT TO YOU FOR LAST WORD ON KIND OF OUR NEXT STEPS AS
7 A GROUP.

8

9 **TAMIM RAAD:** WITH ENGAGEMENT WITH THE TRANSIT BOARD OFFICIALS
10 PUBLIC AND USING AS A TOUCH STONE FOR PROPOSALS AND IDEAS THAT
11 COME UP, AND THERE WAS A LOT OF DISCUSSION ABOUT RICK AND
12 UNCERTAINTY AND WHAT WE RAISED FROM A LOGICAL PERSPECTIVE, NOT
13 TO HAVE IMMOBILIZE US BUT TO INFORM THE DESIGN OF BOLD ACTIONS
14 THAT WE MIGHT RECOMMENDATION THAT YOU DECIDE TO TAKE AND IT'S
15 REALLY TO SET YOU UP FOR SUCCESS ACKNOWLEDGING THE FIRST PART
16 TO ENSURING THAT THE MODELS THAT WE DESIGN ARE REALLY SETUP
17 FOR LONG-TERM SUCCESS SO THAT'S REALLY THE PERSPECTIVE THAT
18 WE'RE GOING TO BRING AND ALL FACTORS KEVIN HIGHLIGHTED WILL
19 BECOME IMPORTANT EVALUATION CRITERIA AS WE WEIGH PROS AND CONS
20 OF THESE VARIOUS ALTERNATIVES. NEXT STEPS ARE TO TAKE A LOT OF
21 THE INPUT THAT YOU PROVIDED TODAY AND TO GO AWAY AND DEVELOP
22 OUR METHOD REALLY TO DESCRIBE HOW WE'RE GOING TO CONSIDER
23 THESE MULTITUDE OF FACTORS, HOW WE'RE GOING TO DECIDE WHAT'S
24 MOST IMPORTANT AND RELEVANT TO THE DECISION OR CHOICE FOR
25 OPTIONS ONE OR THE OTHER THERE IS A LOT OF INFORMATION OUT



January 10, 2021

1 THERE. THERE IS ONLY A CERTAIN AMOUNT THAT WE CAN ANALYZE AND
2 THAT YOU CAN DIGEST IN TERMS OF MAKING THE INFORMATION. SO
3 IT'S REALLY TO DESCRIBE THE METHOD BY WHICH WE'LL BE MAKING
4 BOTH AN INFORMED EVIDENCE BASED DECISION AND ONE THAT IS
5 ACTUALLY A POLICY BASED DECISION AS WELL THAT REQUIRES
6 STAKEHOLDER AND POLITICAL COURAGE TO ACT. SO THAT'S OUR NEXT
7 STEP AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO REPORTING BACK TO YOU AS WE
8 BEGIN TO DEVELOP THAT METHODOLOGY AND ESTABLISH THAT
9 FOUNDATION GOING FORWARD. WE'RE EXCITED TO WORK ON THIS
10 PROJECT TOGETHER I CAN'T IMAGINE A GOOD MORNING TRANSFORMATION
11 IN NORTH AMERICA THAT IS MORE IMPORTANT AND MORE IMPORTANT
12 EXCITING TO WORK ON WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING WITH THE
13 TECHNICAL TEAM AND ADVISORY GROUP.

14

15 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANYTHING TO ADD?

16

17 **KATE HOWE:** I WANT TO REITERATE WHAT KEVIN AND TAMIM JUST SAID
18 WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ALL AND ACKNOWLEDGE
19 BACK WITH OUR METHODOLOGY APPROACH. THANK YOU.

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** DO ANY ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS HAVE THOUGHTS OR
22 QUESTIONS ON ANYTHING THEY JUST HEARD? THANKS SHRUTI FOR
23 KEEPING ME HONEST AND NOT SKIPPING OVER ITEM EIGHT AGENDA
24 SUMMARY. THIS BRINGS US TO ADJOURNMENT UNLESS I HEAR OTHERWISE
25 FROM STAFF. ONCE AGAIN OUR NEXT MEETING IS TENTATIVELY



January 10, 2021

1 SCHEDULED FOR MONDAY FEBRUARY 7TH MTC STAFF WILL BE CHECKING
2 ON THAT TIME AND DATE MAY CHANGE. THANK YOU ALL FOR EMBARKING
3 UPON THIS JOURNEY. THANKS. AND WE ARE ADJOURNED.

4 [MEETING ADJOURNED]

5



Broadcasting Government