

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 12, 2022 9:45 AM**

4
5
6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WELCOME TO THE PROGRAMMING AND
7 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE OF JANUARY 12TH, 2022. I'M DAVID RABBIT
8 YOUR CHAIR JOINED BY GINA PAPAN OUR VICE CHAIR. AND CAN WE
9 HAVE THE BROADCASTING TEAM ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE?
10 [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19,
11 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO
12 THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN
13 REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST
14 ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS,
15 PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT
16 THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING
17 COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND
18 ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
19 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
20 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
21 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
22 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
23 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
24 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
25 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
2 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
3 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
4 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
5 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR
6 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
7 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
8 PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
9 NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
10 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IF WE COULD
13 HAVE ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR RABBIT.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

24

25 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY? ABSENT.

7 COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

12

13 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

16

17 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH? COMMISSIONER WORTH? IS

20 HERE. QUORUM IS PRESENT

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. MOVING TO

23 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THE CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY INCLUDES TEN

24 ITEMS, I BELIEVE, 2A THROUGH 2J. DO I HAVE ANYONE WITH ANY

25 QUESTIONS, COMMENTS OR CONCERNS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR THIS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 MORNING? I AM NOT SEEING ANY OF MY COLLEAGUES WITH THEIR HAND
2 RAISED. CAN I GET A MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** MOVE, CHAVEZ.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AND A SECOND BY.

7

8 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SECOND.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** SECOND BY GLOVER. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO
11 READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM INTO THE
12 RECORD.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
15 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
16 ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WITH THAT SAID CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL
19 VOTE, PLEASE FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR, THIS MORNING?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. CHAIR RABBIT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

13

14 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

17

18 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

21

22 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
4 MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. MOVING TO
7 AGENDA ITEM 3A THE ONE BAY AREA GRANTS OR OBAG 3 FRAMEWORK.
8 AND WE HAVE MALLORY ATKINSON TO PRESENT THIS ITEM. MALLORY?

9

10 **MALLORY ATKINSON.** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MAY NAME IS
11 **MALLORY ATKINSON I'LL BE PRESENTING THE PROPOSED FRAMEWORK FOR**
12 **THE OBAG 3 PROGRAM FOR CONSIDERATION AND APPROVAL. STARTING IN**
13 **FISCAL YEAR 2023 WITH ESTIMATED 750 MILLION THAT WILL BE**
14 **AVAILABLE. REVENUES AVAILABLE FOR THIS PROGRAM ARE EXPECTED TO**
15 **INCREASE SOMEWHAT WITH THE ANNUAL APPROPRIATIONS COMING FROM**
16 **THE RECENT INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT AND JOBS ACT OR IIJA OR**
17 **BILL. SO WE WILL BE RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION IN COMING**
18 **MONTHS TO PROGRAM THESE ADDITIONAL FUNDS ONCE THOSE AMOUNTS**
19 **ARE AVAILABLE FROM FHWA AND CALTRANS. AND I ALSO WANTED TO**
20 **REMINDE EVERYONE THAT THE REVENUES THAT ARE PROGRAMMED THROUGH**
21 **THE OBAG PROGRAM ARE FEDERAL SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK**
22 **GRANT FUNDS AND CONGESTION MITIGATION AIR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT**
23 **FUNDS OR STP AND CMAQ I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT WHILE THESE FUNDS**
24 **REPRESENT A SMALL AMOUNT OF FUNDS THAT ARE AVAILABLE FOR OUR**
25 **REGION FOR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS THESE FUNDS ARE FLEXIBLE**



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ENABLING US TO PROGRAM BEST TO MEET OUR REGION'S ABILITY
2 MOBILITY NEEDS AND OUR AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES FOR PLANNED BAY
3 AREA 2050. NEXT SLIDE. A REMINDER OF CONSIDERATIONS THAT HAVE
4 GONE INTO THE DEVELOPMENT EVER PROPOSED PROGRAM FRAMEWORK
5 SUMMARIZING AS RETAINING MOST EFFECTIVE LIMITS OF OUR EXISTING
6 OBAG PROGRAMS WITH STRATEGIC CHANGES TO BEST ADVANCE THE
7 LATEST PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STRATEGIES AND ADAPT TO CURRENT
8 CONDITIONS AND HELP FOCUS ON EMERGING POLICY FOCUS AREAS. AND
9 WE'RE ALSO COORDINATING THE PROGRAM WITH OTHER NEAR-TERM AND
10 COMPLIMENTARY REVENUE SOURCES AND THAT'S BEEN AN IMPORTANT
11 CONSIDERATION THROUGHOUT, AS HAS REFLECTING THE PARTICIPANT IN
12 PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. .
13 OBAG 3 FRAMEWORK FOCUSES INVESTMENTS AND POLICIES ACROSS FIVE
14 PROGRAM CATEGORIES PLANNING AND PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION, GROWTH
15 FRAMEWORK IMPLEMENTATION, CLIMATE INITIATIVES, CONSERVATION
16 AND RESILIENCE, COMPLETE STREETS AND COMMUNITY CHOICE, AND
17 MULTI-MODAL SYSTEMS OPERATIONS AND PERFORMANCE. AND THESE
18 CATEGORIES PROVIDE A COMMON FRAMEWORK FOR THE OBAG 3 PROGRAMS
19 REGIONAL PROGRAM AND ITS COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE
20 PLEASE. SO STARTING WITH THE REGIONAL PROGRAMS, THIS
21 REPRESENTS 50% OF THE PROPOSED OBAG 3 FRAMEWORK FOR REGIONAL
22 PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS WITH -- THAT WILL BE IMPLEMENTED REGION-
23 WIDE. THE SLIDE ILLUSTRATES THAT THE REGIONAL PROGRAMS ARE
24 LARGELY UNCHANGED SINCE THE NOVEMBER PRESENTATION TO THIS
25 COMMITTEE WITH THE INITIAL FRAMEWORK, BUT THERE ARE A COUPLE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 OF UPDATES TO HIGHLIGHT. FIRST IS THE REGIONAL PROGRAM
2 IMPLEMENTATION CATEGORY HAS INCREASED DUE TO REFLECT OBAG 3
3 SHARE OF IMPLEMENTATION RESOURCE THAT IS NEEDED AND HAVE BEEN
4 IDENTIFIED FOR THE NEAR-TERM BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES. AND ALSO
5 TO REFLECT THE RESOURCES FOR FOUR NEW POSITIONS THAT WERE
6 AUTHORIZED IN THE PRIOR -- OR THIS YEAR'S BUDGET BUT WERE NOT
7 APPROPRIATELY CAPTURED IN THE NOVEMBER DRAFT PROPOSAL. SO TO
8 ACCOMMODATE THIS INCREASE IN PLANNING AND PROGRAM
9 IMPLEMENTATION, THERE'S A CORRESPONDING DECREASE IN THE AMOUNT
10 AVAILABLE FOR PROJECTS IN THE MULTI-MODAL SYSTEMS OPERATIONS
11 AND PERFORMANCE CATEGORY. WITH THAT NOTE JUST WANT TO
12 UNDERSCORE THAT THE ANNUAL RESOURCES FOR THE OVERALL REGIONAL
13 PROGRAMS 94 MILLION PER YEAR SHOWN IN THE TABLE REMAIN FLAT
14 RELATIVE TO OBAG TWO LEVELS FOR REGIONAL PROGRAMS. BUT WITH A
15 SUBSTANTIAL WORKLOAD THAT'S OUTLINED IN PLANNED BAY AREA
16 2050'S IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, THE RESOURCES WILL BE NEEDED
17 OUTSIDE OF THIS PROGRAM TO DELIVER ON PRIORITIZED REGIONAL
18 INITIATIVES. SO THAT TRANSITIONS WELL TO THE NEXT SLIDE,
19 PLEASE. WITH THE REITERATION HEREOF THE IMPORTANCE OF
20 COORDINATING THIS PROGRAM WITH COMPLIMENTARY NEAR-TERM FUND
21 SOURCES IN ORDER TO MAXIMIZE THE COLLECTIVE IMPACT OF EACH
22 PROGRAM, PARTICULARLY IN THE AREAS OF CLIMATE STRATEGIES,
23 IMPLEMENTING THE GROWTH FRAMEWORK FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,
24 AND ALSO THE CAPITAL INTENSIVE INVESTMENTS THAT ARE EMERGING
25 AND TRANSIT PRIORITIES IMPROVEMENTS MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. 85



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 MILLION FOR FUNDS FOR PRIVATE PROJECTS COMING OUT OF THE BLUE
2 RIBBON PROCESS 100 MILLION ANTICIPATED IN THE ONE TIME STATE
3 BUDGET SURPLUS TO SUPPORT THE IMPLEMENTATION OF OR REGION'S
4 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES STRATEGY I'LL BE SPEAKING ABOUT THIS
5 SPECIFIC FUND SOURCE ON THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM AND ALSO
6 ESTIMATED 60 MILLION OF A NEW FEDERAL FORMULA PROGRAM TO
7 REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS THAT SHOULD BE COMING THIS
8 YEAR. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, NOW MOVING TO THE OTHER 50% OF
9 THE PROPOSED OBAG 3 PROGRAM. COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAMS. THE
10 FRAMEWORK FOR OBAG 3 ESTABLISHES BASELINE AMOUNTS FOR COUNTY-
11 WIDE PLANNING AND PROGRAMMING ACTIVITIES WITH THE REMAINING
12 340 MILLION AVAILABLE FOR A CALL FOR PROJECTS PROCESS. AND
13 THAT PROCESS BROADENS THE FLEXIBILITY AND PROJECT TYPES FOR
14 LOCAL COMMUNITIES WHILE FOCUSING INVESTMENT IN PRIORITY
15 DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND OTHER NEW GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND EQUITY
16 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. A FEW UPDATES TO THE
17 COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAMS SINCE THE NOVEMBER INITIAL PROPOSAL,
18 I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT FIRST, WE HAVE DEVELOPED A UNIFORM
19 DEFINITION FOR IDENTIFYING PROJECTS THAT ARE CREDITED TOWARDS
20 A COUNTY'S PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREA INVESTMENT TARGET. AND
21 THAT IS PROJECTS THAT ARE LOCATED WITHIN ONE MILE OF A PDA AND
22 WITH ALLOWANCE FOR SPECIFIC EXCEPTIONS. WE HAVE ALSO
23 ESTABLISHED A \$25 MILLION REGION-WIDE FOR SAVE ROUTES TO
24 SCHOOL INVESTMENTS REPLACING COUNTY SPECIFIC TARGETS WE HAVE
25 HAD IN PREVIOUS CYCLES. WE HAVE MAINTAINED THE \$200 MILLION



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 STRETCH TARGET FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS FOR THIS
2 PROPOSAL BUT STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO CONSIDER THIS TARGET
3 WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF INCREASED TRANSPORTATION REVENUES THAT
4 ARE ANTICIPATED FROM VARIOUS STATE AND FEDERAL FUND SOURCES
5 THIS YEAR AND MAY RECOMMEND ADJUSTING THIS PROGRAM SPECIFIC
6 TARGET ACCORDINGLY. THE FRAMEWORK ALSO INCLUDES THE NEW
7 REQUIREMENT, ADDITIONAL OF A NEW REQUIREMENT FOR LOCAL
8 JURISDICTIONS TO HAVE COMPLETE A LOCAL ROADWAY SAFETY PLAN OR
9 OTHER EQUIVALENT SAFETY PLAN THIS MIRRORS THE STATE A HIGHWAY
10 AND SAFETY INVESTMENT PROGRAM OR HSIP, WHICH WILL REQUIRE THE
11 PLANS STARTING WITH CYCLE 11 LATER THIS YEAR AND REINFORCES
12 OUR REGION'S COMMITMENT TO SAFETY WHILE HELPING KEEP OUR CITY
13 ELIGIBLE FOR IMPORTANT STATE AND SAFETY INVESTMENTS. FINALLY
14 THE FRAMEWORK ESTABLISHES DEADLINES FOR DEMONSTRATING
15 COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAM REQUIREMENTS AND INCLUDES A COST
16 EFFECTIVENESS ASSESSMENT FOR CMAQ ELIGIBLE PROGRAMS. NEXT
17 SLIDE PLEASE. I WANTED TO REITERATE A FEW CHANGES TO THE
18 COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAMS CALL FOR PROJECTS THAT ARE BEING
19 MADE TO ADDRESS FEDERAL REQUIREMENTS. SO IN ADOPTING THE
20 GUIDELINES FOR THE CALL FOR PROJECTS LATER THIS YEAR, MTC WILL
21 ESTABLISH PROJECT NOMINATION TARGETS FOR EACH COUNTY. AFTER
22 MTC RELEASES A CALL FOR PROJECTS, CTAS, THE COUNTY
23 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES WILL ASSIST WITH OUTREACH AND INITIAL
24 SCREENING OF PROJECTS WITHIN THEIR COUNTIES BEFORE SUBMITTING
25 A PRIORITIZED LIST OF PROJECT NOMINATIONS TO MTC FOR



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CONSIDERATION. MTC WILL THEN SELECT A PROGRAM OF PROJECTS FROM
2 THOSE NOMINATIONS INCORPORATING ADDITIONAL REGIONAL
3 CONSIDERATIONS INTO THE FINAL PROJECT SELECTION. THIS PROCESS
4 DIFFERS FROM PRIOR CYCLES BY CLARIFYING ROLES BETWEEN MTC'S
5 AND OUR CTA PARTNER BY NO LONGER GUARANTEEING SPECIFIC AMOUNTS
6 TO EACH COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN ADDITION TO THE PROGRAM
7 CATEGORIES AND REGIONAL AND LOCAL COUNTY COMPONENTS OF THE
8 PROGRAM ANOTHER CRITICAL COMPONENT OF THE FRAMEWORK ARE POLICY
9 PROVISIONS WOVEN THROUGHOUT PROPOSING TO MAINTAIN A FOCUS ON
10 INVESTING RESOURCES IN PDAS AND ALSO ENFORCING OR EMPHASIZING
11 NEW GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. WE WILL CONTINUE TO USE PROGRAM
12 FUNDING AS AN INCENTIVE FOR JURISDICTIONS TO ADOPT LOCAL
13 POLICIES THAT SUPPORT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, MOST NOTABLE IS
14 WITH RESPECT TO COMPLIANCE WITH STATE HOUSING LAW AND ADDED
15 REQUIREMENT FOR LOCAL SAFETY PLANS. THE CATS ARE FIGHTING
16 BEHIND ME BUT I'M GOING TO KEEP GOING. [LAUGHTER] AS NOTED
17 PREVIOUSLY WE WILL BE INCORPORATING EMISSIONS BENEFITS
18 CONSIDERATIONS MORE DIRECTLY INTO THE PRIORITIZATION PROCESS
19 FOR CMAQ FUNDS AND THAT'S TO ADDRESS FEDERAL GUIDANCE. NEXT
20 SLIDE. IMPORTANT YOU ADDITIONS TO HIGHLIGHT, OBAG DOES
21 INCREASE RESOURCES DEDICATED FOR COMMUNITY PLANNING EFFORTS
22 PROJECT DEVELOPMENT AND PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION WITHIN EQUITY
23 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, BUT THERE ARE CONTINUED EFFORTS THAT
24 WE'LL BE TAKING TO INCORPORATE EQUITY THROUGHOUT THE PROGRAM
25 AS WE FURTHER DEVELOP AND REFINE THE SPECIFIC ELEMENTS OF THE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PROGRAM. AND I ALSO WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE ALIGNMENT OF THE
2 OBAG 3 PROGRAM WITH TWO IMPORTANT REGIONAL POLICY UPDATES THAT
3 ARE UNDERWAY. THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN UPDATE AND THE
4 TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT OR TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES
5 POLICY UPDATE. AT THE TIMING OF THESE UPDATES FOLLOWING AFTER
6 THIS MONTH'S HOPEFUL APPROVAL OF THE OBAG 3 FRAMEWORK STAFF
7 MAY RETURN IN THE COMING MONTHS TO RECOMMEND FURTHER REVISIONS
8 TO THE FRAMEWORK IF NEEDED TO BETTER ALIGN THIS PROGRAM WITH
9 THE RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF THESE IMPORTANT POLICY
10 UPDATES. BUT WHAT WE KNOW SO FAR, AND WHAT WE HAVE ALREADY
11 INCLUDED IN OBAG 3 TO SUPPORT BOTH OF THESE UPDATES, FIRST FOR
12 THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN UPDATE, WE HAVE INCLUDED OR
13 MAINTAINED THE OBAG 3 CHECKLIST ADOPT CHECKLIST BEING UPDATED
14 AS PART OF THE TRANSPORTATION PLAN UPDATE AND INCLUDE SAID
15 INVESTMENT TARGETS AFTER TRANSPORTATION. WHILE WE'RE STILL
16 WAITING TO SEE WHAT THE SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS ON ARE FROM
17 THE UPDATE WE KNOW THAT ADDITIONAL RESOURCES AND SIGNIFICANT
18 RESOURCES WILL BE REQUIRED OF LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO MEET THE
19 DENSITY STANDARDS THAT ARE ANTICIPATED TO COME FROM THAT
20 POLICY UPDATE SO WE DON THAT REGIONAL PLANNING GRANTS
21 ASSISTANCE WILL BE NEEDED THROUGH OBAG 3. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
22 SO FOLLOWING THE APPROVAL OF THE OVERALL PROGRAM FRAMEWORK BY
23 THE FULL COMMISSION ANTICIPATED LATER THIS MONTH THERE ARE
24 ADDITIONAL MILESTONES FOR IMPLEMENTING THE PROGRAM THROUGHOUT
25 THE SPRING. SO WE PLAN ON RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION WITH A



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PROPOSED DETAILED CALL FOR PROJECTS GUIDELINES AND COUNTY
2 NOMINATION TARGETS FOR THE COUNTIES AND LOCAL PROGRAM AND ALSO
3 ON A SIMILAR TIMELINE WE WILL BE RETURNING TO PRESENT DETAILS
4 ON THE VARIOUS REGIONAL PROGRAMS AS WELL. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT
5 FIRST YEAR OF FUNDING AVAILABILITY FOR OBAG 3 FOR 2023 WILL
6 BEGIN FIRST OF OCTOBER AND FIRST YEAR FUNDS PRIORITIZATION FOR
7 ONGOING PROGRAMS PLANNING ACTIVITIES FOR BOTH REGION PARTNERS
8 AND RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION TO ADOPT COUNTY AND LOCAL
9 PROGRAM OF PROJECTS IN JANUARY OF 2023. NEXT SLIDE. I WANT TO
10 CONCLUDE THIS PRESENTATION BY EMPHASIZING THE ROLE OF THE
11 PROGRAM WITHIN THE BROADER REGIONAL INVESTMENT STRATEGY TO
12 ADVANCE WITH OUR PRIORITIES COMING OUT OF PLANNED BAY AREA
13 2050 AND BLUE RIBBON ACTION PLAN AND OTHER EFFORTS. WE'LL BE
14 RETURNING IN MARCH AND APRIL FOR ACTIONS AND NEXT STEPS. FOR
15 THE BLUE RIBBON EFFORT IN FEBRUARY AND MARCH THERE WILL BE
16 PROGRAMMING ACTIONS ANTICIPATED FOR THE FUNDING EXCHANGE FOR
17 THE 85 MILLION IN AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN FUNDS THAT WERE
18 APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION IN OCTOBER AND PROGRAMMING ACTIONS
19 TO ASSIGN THOSE FUNDS TO SPECIFIC BLUE RIBBON PROJECTS THIS
20 SPRING. THE REAP PROGRAM WHICH I'LL BE PROVIDING AN OVERVIEW
21 FOR THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM WE ANTICIPATED RETURNING TO THE
22 COMMISSION IN MARCH AND APRIL WITH INITIAL FUNDING PROPOSAL
23 THERE. AND WITH THE CARBON REDUCTION PROGRAM TIMING AND NEXT
24 STEPS ARE DEPENDENT UPON THE RELEASE OF THE AMOUNTS AND
25 ADDITIONAL GUIDELINES FROM FHWA AND THE STATE ANTICIPATED THIS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 YEAR AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO AS A REMINDER, THE ACTION
2 TODAY IS RECOMMENDED AS THE REFERRAL OF RESOLUTION -- MTC
3 RESOLUTION 4505 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL WHICH ADOPTS
4 THE OVERALL FRAMEWORK FOR THE OBAG 3 FRAMEWORK AND MAKES
5 ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING ACTION TO PROVIDE FUNDING FOR ONGOING
6 PLANNING PROGRAMMING ACTIVITIES 49.5 MILLION FOR REGIONAL
7 PLANNING PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION AND 35.2 MILLION FOR COUNTY-
8 WIDE PLANNING AND PROGRAMMING ACTIVITIES AND WITH THAT I'M
9 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

10

11 >>DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT MALLORY. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I'LL
12 LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR QUESTIONS COMMENTS OR CONCERNS FOR
13 MALLORY ON THE OBAG FRAMEWORK? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. MALLORY, I THOUGHT YOU DID A
16 REMARKABLE JOB, GIVEN THE FIGHT THAT WAS GOING ON AROUND YOU.
17 ONE THING THAT I WANTED TO SAY IS I REALLY APPRECIATED THE
18 LAST SLIDE THAT YOU HAD. IT'S SO HELPFUL TO SEE THESE DOLLARS
19 IN CONTEXT. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT. IT WAS JUST REALLY, REALLY
20 HELPFUL. I HAVE TWO QUESTIONS. ONE IS, THE PDA INVESTMENT
21 TARGETS. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE 70%
22 DIRECTED TO PDAS FOR SOME COUNTIES, AND 50% INVESTMENT FOR
23 OTHERS. COULD YOU MAYBE JUST EXPLAIN THE HISTORIC NATURE OF
24 THAT?

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** HAPPY TO ATTEMPT THAT. IN THE PAST WE HAVE
2 ESTABLISHED THESE TARGET RECOGNITION OF THE AMOUNT OF PDAS IN
3 THE URBAN AREAS WITHIN THE DIFFERENT COUNTIES AND DIFFERENT
4 SIZES I BELIEVE THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES HAVE LOWER PDA
5 INVESTMENT TARGETS IN RECOGNITION OF SMALLER URBAN AREAS WITH
6 SMALLER AMOUNT OF PDAS IN THOSE COUNTIES WHEREAS THE REST OF
7 THE BAY AREA HAS THE HIGHER 70% THRESHOLD.

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M CURIOUS IS THAT SOMETHING WE REVISITED WITH
10 OUR COUNTY PARTNERS? EVEN OF THE COMMISSIONERS? THE REASON I'M
11 ASKING THE QUESTION S REALLY, AS I THINK ABOUT THE DISCUSSIONS
12 WE HAD, IN, SORT OF, HAVING AROUND RHNA TRYING TO ALIGN THOSE
13 RHNA DISCUSSIONS WITH OPPORTUNITIES TO SUPPORT US MEETING
14 THOSE HOUSING GOALS ON AN ONGOING BASIS, SO I'M COMPANY MOVING
15 FORWARD. I JUST WOULD ASK TO MAKE SURE THAT STAFF IS AT LEAST
16 TALKED TO, YOU KNOW, TO OUR NORTH BAY PARTNERS TO SEE IF THAT
17 NUMBER IS STILL HELPFUL FOR THEM? BECAUSE I DO STILL THINK
18 THAT FOR SOME COMMUNITIES, I'M JUST THINKING ABOUT SOME OF THE
19 CITIES IN OUR COUNTY, LIKE, WE HAVE SOME CITIES THAT ARE --
20 JUST, THEY UNDERSTAND THAT THEY JUST NEED TO HIT A NUMBER, WE
21 HAVE OTHER CITIES THAT NEED MORE INCENTIVE. I LIKE THE 70%
22 BECAUSE I THAT GIVES US OPPORTUNITY TO INVENT SOME BEHAVIOR
23 THROUGHOUT THE COUNTY SO I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE
24 COMFORT WITH THAT AND THAT THEY DON'T NEED A CHANGE FOR THEIR
25 OWN OUTCOMES. AND THEN FOR THE CHART THAT YOU HAVE, I'M



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CURIOUS ABOUT THE CARBON REDUCTION RESOURCES. IS THAT STATE --
2 IS THAT STATE REVENUE?

3

4 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** THE NEW CARBON PROGRAM IS A NEW FHWA PROGRAM
5 COMING FROM THE IHJA SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BILL AND WE'RE
6 STILL AWAITING ADDITIONAL GUIDANCE FROM THE STATE ON HOW THOSE
7 FUNDS WILL ROLL OUT AND WHAT ROLE MTC MIGHT HAVE IN
8 DISTRIBUTING THOSE FUNDS.

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THOSE ARE ALL OF MY QUESTIONS. THANKS
11 COLLEAGUES.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
16 WORKING SO CLOSELY WITH THE CTAS ON THIS AND REALLY INCLUDING
17 IN THE DIFFERING GEOGRAPHIC RESTRICTIONS SOME OF US ARE UNDER.
18 THAT IS GREATLY APPRECIATED. AND I NEED TO ASK, HERE, THE
19 LOCAL ROADS SAFETY PLANS, AS I HAVE BEEN INFORMED, ONE
20 JURISDICTION, IN PARTICULAR, MINE, IS A LITTLE BEHIND ON THAT
21 ONE. WE WOULD GREATLY APPRECIATE CONSIDERATION FOR JUST
22 EXTENDING THE TIME FRAME. I GUESS IT'S 2023, OR SOMETHING LIKE
23 THAT AT THIS POINT IN TIME. WE MAY NEED ADDITIONAL TIME TO
24 COMPLY. BECAUSE AS I UNDERSTAND IT, THERE ARE 20 JURISDICTIONS
25 THAT ARE NOT IN COMPLIANCE AND TEN HAPPEN TO BE WITHIN MY



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 JURISDICTION. SO WE WANT TO COMPLY OF THE DON'T GET US WRONG.
2 BUT WE WOULD LIKE TO WORK CLOSELY WITH YOU ALL, BUT I BELIEVE
3 WE ANTICIPATE NEEDING A LITTLE MORE TIME TO COMPLY WITH THAT
4 ONE REQUIREMENT. SO I HOPE THAT YOU ALL WILL BE OPEN TO MAYBE
5 A LITTLE EXTRA TIME ON THAT FRONT? BECAUSE IT WOULD BE HELPFUL
6 TO US, AS I'M SURE THE OTHER JURISDICTIONS WHO MAY BE OUT OF
7 COMPLIANCE, AS WELL. SO I WOULD ASK THAT WE PLEASE CONSIDER
8 THAT. THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER OF MY COLLEAGUES
11 HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, OR CONCERNS FOR MALLORY BEFORE
12 WE -- I'M SORRY. COMMISSIONER SPERING. PLEASE, GO AHEAD.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MALLORY. GREAT PRESENTATION. I
15 DON'T KNOW IF THIS QUESTION IS FOR THERESE OR FOR ALIX. BUT,
16 YOU KNOW, WHERE DOES THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREAS AND
17 PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS FOR FIT INTO THIS PLAN THERE IS NO
18 MENTION OF THAT AT ALL. AS YOU ALL THE KNOW PCAS ARE REALLY
19 IMPORTANT TO THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES.

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. ALIX BOCKELMAN
22 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR POLICY. THE PCA PROGRAM IS PART
23 OF THE REGIONAL PROGRAM SO WHEN MALLORY PROVIDED THE ROADMAP
24 IN COPYING MONTHS WE'LL BE BACK TO TALK A LOT MORE ABOUT THAT
25 IN MARCH SO WE'LL TALK ABOUT THE PCA PROGRAM. I KNOW THERE IS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 A LOT OF INTEREST IN THE WHOLE REGION, BUT IN PARTICULAR, THE
2 NORTH BAY. SO THAT'S WHAT WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT MORE ABOUT
3 THAT PROGRAM.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SO ALIX, THAT MONEY WILL BE AVAILABLE. IS
6 THAT CORRECT?

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YES WE PLAN TO HAVE A PCA PROGRAM. YES.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THE OTHER QUESTION, AND I'M LOOKING AT THE
11 LETTER THAT YOU GOT FROM ALL OF THE CTAS, HOW DOES ALL THIS
12 FEDERAL MONEY, YOU KNOW, THE INFRASTRUCTURE MONEY THIS'S
13 COMING FROM THE FEDS, HOW DOES THAT FIT INTO ALL OF THIS?

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'LL TAKE THAT. WE'LL BE COMING TO THE
16 COMMISSION SHORTLY. BECAUSE THAT'S A MILLION DOLLARS QUESTION.
17 MAYBE BILLION DOLLARS QUESTION, RIGHT?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH.

20

21 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WE'RE ACTUALLY LOOKING AT WHAT A STRATEGIC
22 PROGRAM LOOKS LIKE TO LEVERAGE OPPORTUNITIES AT THE FEDERAL
23 LEVEL WITH THE INVESTMENT OPPORTUNITIES, YOU KNOW, WITH THE
24 STATE, AND HOW TO USE -- AND PART OF THE CHALLENGE THAT WE'RE
25 LOOKING AT AND WE'LL, YOU KNOW, RETURN TO THE COMMISSION



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 SHORTLY ON, IS BEING ABLE TO LOOK AT FORMULA PROGRAMS WHERE WE
2 KNOW WE HAVE A GUARANTEED PLUS-UP THAT WOULD BE UNDER OUR
3 CONTROL, VERSUS HOW DO WE USE THE DISCRETIONARY PROGRAMS,
4 WHERE WE MAY NOT HAVE, YOU KNOW AN ABSOLUTE CALL, WHEREAS OF
5 COURSE IF WE ARE SUCCESSFUL IN TAPPING INTO THOSE PROGRAMS IN
6 BRINGING MONEY TO THE REGION THAT CAN COMPLEMENT AND/OR
7 ADVANCE A NUMBER OF INITIATIVES. AND COMMISSIONER SPERING, I
8 DON'T HAVE THE SLIDES UP NOW, BUT WE HAVE THOSE INVESTMENT
9 PRIORITY CATEGORIES THAT WERE LISTED, THOSE ARE THE GUIDE POST
10 AND I THINK WHAT WE'RE LOOKING TO IS TO SEE HOW ALL OF THESE
11 DIFFERENT PROGRAMS CAN MOVE THOSE FORWARD, OBAG BEING ONE OF
12 THEM.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THERESE, THANK YOU FOR THAT. ON THE
15 DISCRETIONARY, JUST ABOUT EVERY ONE OF THE COUNTIES HAVE DONE
16 A LOT OF PLANNING AND WE HAVE A LOT OF PROJECTS THAT ARE TEED
17 UP AND READY TO GO. I HOPE THERE IS EMPHASIS ON DELIVERING
18 SOME OF THE STUFF THAT WE HAVE BEEN PLANNING AND PUTTING A LOT
19 OF EFFORT INTO, AND SO THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT. AND
20 I JUST HOPE STAFF KEEPS LOOKING AT THAT. BUT, I THINK -- I
21 REALLY LIKE THE OBAG 3 APPROACH THAT WE'RE TAKING, THE WAY
22 WE'RE WEAVING IN THE BLUE RIBBON AND MANY OF THE OTHER THINGS
23 THAT WE HAVE BROUGHT FORWARD THIS PAST YEAR. SO, GOOD
24 PRESENTATION, AND GOOD STRATEGIES MOVING FORWARD.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

2

3 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I JUST WANTED TO REALLY
4 CONCUR WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING. I THINK HE RAISED THE
5 QUESTIONS THEY HAD. AND I REALLY WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
6 WORKING SO CLOSELY WITH THE -- ALL THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
7 AUTHORITIES AND COMING UP WITH THIS OBAG 3. YOU KNOW, THESE
8 FUNDS ARE SO IMPORTANT. AND THEY'RE -- THE WORK THAT THEY DO
9 IS SO EVIDENT IN THE COMMUNITIES. AND THE IMPORTANT WORK OF
10 THE RHNA THESE INVESTMENTS ARE GOING TO BE REALLY VITAL TO THE
11 COMMUNITIES WHEN WE LOOK TO IMPLEMENT -- FIRSTS GOING THROUGH
12 THE HOUSING ELEMENT PROCESS AND SUBSEQUENTLY TO ACTUALLY DO
13 THE ZONING AND THE CONSTRUCTION. SO I REALLY CONCUR THAT THE
14 MORE MONEY THAT WE CAN PUT INTO THIS PROGRAM AS WE MOVE
15 FORWARD WITH THESE ADDITIONAL FEDERAL DOLLARS, I THINK WE'RE
16 GOING TO SEE, JUST, THE HUGE, HUGE BENEFIT TO OUR -- ALL OF
17 OUR COMMUNITIES AND THE REGION AND ACHIEVING THOSE OVERALL
18 GOALS OF OUR PLANNED BAY AREA. SO, THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY
19 MUCH.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** DAVID?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** YES, GO AHEAD.

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** JUST TO THE QUESTION FOR THE 50% TO THE
2 NORTH BAY COUNTIES. WE DON'T HAVE THE DENSITIES THAT MOST OF
3 THE OTHER COUNTIES V SO WHEN YOU RESTRICTED 70% IT WASN'T AS
4 PRODUCTIVE. WE INVEST A LOT OF THAT MONEY INTO FEEDING INTO
5 THESE LIMITED TRANSPORTATION HUBS THAT WE HAVE AND IT REALLY
6 INCENTIVIZES BUILDING HOUSING SO IT'S THAT INFRASTRUCTURE THAT
7 WE MAKE THAT CONNECTION WHERE WE NEED THE FLEXIBILITY. IF YOU
8 LOOK AT THE PROJECTS THAT THE NORTH BAY HAVE BEEN DELIVERING
9 THEY HAVE BEEN EFFECTIVE IN PROMOTING PUBLIC TRANSIT AND TYING
10 PEOPLE INTO A SYSTEM. AND YOU KNOW IN COUNTIES WE'RE TRYING TO
11 BRING ALL OF THE OPERATORS TOGETHER AND THE WAY THIS GOES THE
12 SPLIT REALLY HELPS FACILITATE THAT. I WANTED TO CLARIFY THAT.
13 THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANKS, JIM. BECAUSE IN A WAY WHAT YOU'RE SAYING
18 IS IT'S ALMOST LIKE A PRE-PDA, WHICH TOTALLY MAKES SENSE,
19 RIGHT? AND SO, YEAH, I THINK THAT'S HELPFUL. AND I KNOW WHEN
20 YOU ALL, STAFF REPORT-OUT, THAT YOU EDUCATE US A LITTLE BIT
21 ABOUT EACH OTHER'S REGIONS. BUT I DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO
22 CALL OUT THE SUCCESSES AND WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED BECAUSE I
23 THINK, ONE, IT WILL HELP US ALL BETTER UNDERSTAND THE NINE BAY
24 AREA COUNTIES, BUT NUMBER TWO, I THINK WE NEED TO LAY THE
25 GROUNDWORK FOR MORE INTENSIVE USES IS CHALLENGING FOR US. AND



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 I THINK WE'RE ALL DOING THAT IN OUR REGIONS SO THANK YOU, JIM,
2 I APPRECIATE THAT. THAT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. I'M REALLY -- I THINK THIS IS
7 GREAT. THIS IS SUCH A SIGNATURE MTC PROGRAM. AND I THINK IT'S
8 UP, YOU KNOW, KIND OF -- BEING RESPONSIVE TO THE CHALLENGES
9 WE'RE FACING SO IT'S GREAT TO SEE IT SO TIED INTO WITH PLANNED
10 BAY AREA 2050 AS WELL AND, SORT OF, DRIVING TOWARDS THE
11 OUTCOMES THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THERE. SO, CONGRATULATIONS
12 FOR, SORT OF, BEING VERY CLOSE TO LANDING THIS. ONE TINY
13 QUESTION. I THINK IT'S GREAT, AND, SORT OF, BUILDS ON
14 PRECEDENT, THAT CITIES -- THAT JURISDICTIONS ARE GOING TO BE,
15 SORT OF, REQUIRED TO BE IN COMPLIANCE WITH STATE HOUSING LAW.
16 THERE WAS ONE STATE HOUSING LAW THAT -- A.B. 1483, IT'S ABOUT
17 FEE TRANSPARENCY THAT WASN'T ON THE LIST. IT'S SOMETHING I
18 HAVE BROUGHT UP BEFORE. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT WAS INTENTIONAL.
19 THERE WERE A LOT OF STATE HOUSING LAWS. I, YOU KNOW, I WOULD
20 REALLY LOVE IT. I THINK IT'S NOT A PARTICULARLY BURDENSOME LAW
21 AND I THINK IT WOULD BE GREAT TO HAVE THAT INCLUDED.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANKS NICK. ANYTHING FROM ANYONE ELSE? I
24 JUST WANT TO SAY AGAIN ON BEHALF -- I KNOW HAVE HEARD FROM THE
25 NORTH BAY CTAS, HOW COLLABORATIVE THE WORK WAS AND HOW GREAT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 IT WAS TO ALL GET ON THE SAME PAGE TOGETHER SO THANK YOU TO
2 ALL STAFF FOR THAT. AND TO REITERATE, WHAT COMMISSIONER
3 SPERING SAID, IT'S INTERESTING, I THINK WE ALL FEEL AS
4 ELECTED'S WITH THE IJJA PASSING ESPECIALLY AFTER A NUMBER OF
5 YEARS IT TOOK TO GET THERE, THERE IS THIS PENT-UP DEMAND TO
6 SEEING THINGS UNDERWAY YESTERDAY. THERE WAS A LOT OF PLANNING
7 THAT WAS DONE IN ANTICIPATION WHATEVER WE CAN DO TO CONTINUE
8 THAT GOING FORWARD WOULD BE GREAT. AND THROUGH CINDY AND JIM'S
9 CONVERSATION I CAN TELL YOU AS CHAIR OF SMART UP HERE IN NORTH
10 BAY AND SONOMA, FOUR-YEAR-OLD RAIL SYSTEM WE STILL HAVE EMPTY
11 LAND NEXT DOOR TO OUR STATIONS THAT IS PRIME FOR PLANNED
12 DEVELOPMENT AND WE'RE WORKING HARD TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN
13 GET THAT GOING FORWARD. AND IT PLAYS INTO THOSE RATIOS THESE
14 ARE GOOD THINGS ON THE HORIZON AND REALLY EXCITED TO MOVE THEM
15 FORWARD. WITH THAT, I KNOW THIS IS TO ACCEPT THE FRAMEWORK FOR
16 THE OBAG 3 PROGRAM. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES IF THERE'S A
17 MOTION TO APPROVE?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MOVE APPROVAL.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CHAVEZ SECOND. I'M NOT SURE WHO THE FIRST IS.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY DID YOU GET THAT.

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN WITH THE MOTION AND SECOND IS
2 CHAVEZ.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. KIMBERLY CAN YOU
5 RECEIVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM TO THE
6 RECORD BEFORE WE TAKE VOTE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES THERE IS ONE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
9 FROM COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY THAT'S BEEN POSTED ONLINE TO
10 THE AGENDA AND IT WAS DISTRIBUTED TO EACH OF YOU VIA E-MAIL
11 LAST NIGHT. AND I DON'T SEE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
12 THEIR HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME, MR. CHAIR. SPOKE TOO SOON.
13 THERE IS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. FIORI
14 WITH VTA. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. I'M
15 GOING TO SHARE MY SCREEN. THERE YOU GO. PLEASE UNMUTE
16 YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN HEAR YOU.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS CELESTE FIORI, VTA PLANNING AND PROGRAMMING I
23 WANT TO THANK MALLORY FOR WORKING SO CLOSELY WITH NOT ONLY ME
24 BUT THE CTA IN GENERAL FOR REACHING OUT TO US AND GETTING
25 COMMENT ON THAT. AND I ALSO APPRECIATE MALLORY'S



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CLARIFICATION, THERE WAS THE INTENT TO INCLUDE THE IIJA, AND
2 THE OTHER FEDERAL BILL PROGRAM INTO THE PROGRAM. LOOKS LIKE
3 IT'S GOING TO BE ROLLING OUT IN PIECES AS FAR AS THE FUNDS. I
4 ALSO WANTED TO MAKE NOTE THAT IT SEEMS LIKE THE PROCESS IS
5 DEFINITELY CHANGING FROM OBAG 1 AND TWO. AND IT SEEMS LIKE
6 IT'S ALIGNING A LITTLE MORE CLOSELY TO THE SAFE AND SEAMLESS
7 MOBILITY QUICK STRIKE PROGRAM AS FAR AS THE CTAS DO A
8 PRELIMINARY EVALUATION OF THE PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND THEN WE
9 FORWARD IT TO MTC FOR THEIR FINAL APPROVAL. SO I LOOK FORWARD
10 TO THE GUIDELINES AND THAT -- AND SO THAT SANTA CLARA COUNTY
11 CAN GET ON BOARD. WE CAN PROUDLY SAY THAT OUR LOCAL ROADWAY
12 SAFETY PLANS ARE 100% AT THIS POINT. AND SO WE'RE ACTIVELY
13 PURSUING POSSIBLY CHANGING SOME OF OUR PROGRAM CRITERIA FROM
14 THE PREVIOUS TIMES. AND JUST ONE QUESTION IS, WHEN WE INITIATE
15 AND GO THROUGH OUR PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND PRIORITIZATION,
16 WILL THERE BE A REQUIREMENT FOR A BOARD ACTION TO ACCOMPANY
17 THAT? THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
20 RAISED M CHAIR.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. WITH THAT CAN
23 WE HAVE YOU PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. CHAIR RABBIT?



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

17

18 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE. RONEN?

23

24 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

2

3 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREATLY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT

8 WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM 3B THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION

9 PLANNING GRANT OR THE REAP 2.0 PROGRAM, AND WITH THIS WE'LL GO

10 BACK TO MALLORY ATKINSON, AND HER FIGHTING FE LINES. MALLORY?

11 [LAUGHTER]

12

13 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** MALLORY ATKINSON PRESENTING OVERVIEW OF

14 PROPOSED REGIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLAN

15 GRANT PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS FOR INFORMATION AND

16 DISCUSSION. BEFORE GOING ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE I WANT TO GIVE

17 BACKGROUND THAT'S ALSO PROVIDED IN THE MEMO. THE REAP IS A ONE

18 TIME INVESTMENT OF THE STATE'S BUDGET SURPLUS FROM FISCAL YEAR

19 2022, INITIAL AMOUNTS STARTING AVAILABLE THIS MONTH FIRST

20 ROUND OF PROGRAM WERE DISTRIBUTED TO COUNCILS AND GOVERNMENT

21 THROUGHOUT THE STATE AND PLANNING ACTIVITIES ACCELERATES ITS

22 RESOURCE. DISTRIBUTED THROUGH METROPOLITAN PLANNING

23 ORGANIZATION AND SIGNIFICANTLY EXPANSE TYPES OF PROJECTS THAT

24 ARE ELIGIBLE PLANNING PROJECTS DIRECT INVESTMENTS HOUSING ARE

25 NOT ELIGIBLE AS WELL AS REDUCING TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS SO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 NEXT SLIDE. -- -- THIS IS A VISUAL REMINDER WHERE THE REAP
2 PROGRAM FITS IN WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE FUNDING APPROACH TO
3 PRIORITIZE OUR REGIONAL INITIATIVES. NEXT SLIDE. AS A FIRST
4 STEP IN MASK FUNDS WITHIN THIS COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH AND
5 IDENTIFYING PROJECTS FOR THE REAP PROGRAM STAFF IDENTIFIES
6 PRINCIPLES FOR THE PROGRAM FIRST CLEAR CONNECTION TO PLANNED
7 BAY AREA 2050 GOALS SPECIFICALLY FOR GROWTH AFFORDABILITY AND
8 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED REDUCTION. THE PROGRAM SHOULD CONTINUE
9 TO BE COORDINATED WITH COMPLIMENTARY FUNDS TO BE ABLE TO BEST
10 MATCH PROJECTS WITH PROGRAMS WITH MOST APPROPRIATE FUNDING
11 SOURCES THAT'S AVAILABLE GIVEN THE ONE TIME NATURE OF THIS
12 PROGRAM WITH FIXED AND ACCELERATED DEADLINES PROPOSE PROJECTS
13 BE ABLE TO DELIVER IN ADVANCE OF PROPOSED DEADLINES AND THAT
14 THE OVERALL PROGRAM SHOULD AIM TO ELIMINATE THE ADMINISTRATIVE
15 BURDEN ON THE AGENCY FOR EXAMPLE, BY FOCUSING ON FEWER AND
16 LARGER PROJECTS TO GET THIS ALL DELIVERED QUICKLY. NEXT SLIDE
17 PLEASE. SO PROPOSED FOCUS AREAS FOR THIS PROGRAM, THE FIRSTS
18 AND THE BULK OF THE PROGRAM WOULD BE FOCUSED ON THE GROWTH
19 WORK IMPLEMENTATION. IN THE PREVIOUS ITEM 25 MILLION IN OBAG 3
20 FUNDS ARE PROPOSED TO BE CARRIED OUT THROUGH PLANNING EFFORTS
21 FOR THE OBAG PLANNING PROGRAM WE KNOW THERE'S A BACKLOG FOR
22 PLANNING PROGRAM AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT BASED ON CALL SUPPORT
23 FOR PROPOSALS. WE ARE PROPOSE FOR 2.0 TO FOCUS ON GETTING
24 AHEAD START ON LOCAL PLANNING NEEDS TO IMPLEMENT THE 2050
25 FRAMEWORK AND INCLUDING OPPORTUNITY HERE TO ALIGN WITH THE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 FORTHCOMING TRANSIT ORIENT THE COMMUNITY POLICY UPDATE AS WELL
2 THESE FUNDS PROVIDE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE DIRECT INVESTMENTS
3 THROUGH AFFORDABLE HOUSING EITHER THROUGH EXPANSIONS TO LOAN
4 PROGRAMS NEW LOAN PROGRAMS OR CLOSING FUNDING GAP ON WHAT
5 WOULD PROBABLY BE A LIMITED NUMBER OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING
6 PROJECTS. SO STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO DEVELOP A DETAILED
7 PROPOSAL FOR THIS AREA OF THE FUNDS SOURCE IN CLOSE
8 COORDINATION WITH OUR PARTNER AGENCIES AND STAKEHOLDERS AS
9 WELL AS THROUGH THE JOINT PLAN -- MTC PLANNING AND BAG
10 ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. NEXT COMMUNITY CHOICE PROGRAMS
11 COMPARED WITH INVESTMENTS AND COMMUNITIES CHOICE PROGRAMS
12 PROPOSED FOR OBAG 3 WE'RE PROPOSE TO USE A PORTION OF THE
13 PROGRAM TO ALASKA CELL RATE IMPLEMENTATION OF PROJECTS AND
14 PROGRAMS IDENTIFIED IN THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES THAT
15 HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED AND PRIORITIZING COMPLETED COMMUNITY-LED
16 TRANSPORTATION PLANS AND ALSO JUMP-START ON THE NEXT ROUND OF
17 COMMUNITY PLAN EFFORT IN EQUITY IDENTIFIED CURRENT LIST OF
18 OPPORTUNITIES AND PROJECTS THAT ARE IN A BETTER POSITION FOR
19 UPCOMING REGIONAL STATE AND GRANT OPPORTUNITIES. BLUE RIBBON
20 MANY PRIORITIZED PROJECTS APPEAR TO BE A FIT FOR THE PROGRAM
21 PROVIDING OPPORTUNITY TO TRANSFORM REGIONAL MOBILE OPTIONS AND
22 REDUCTION OF VMT PROPOSE PULLING A PORTION OF PROGRAM FUNDS
23 THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED BY THE COMMISSION WITH BLUE RIBBON
24 IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS TO COMPLETE FUNDING PLAN FOR THE
25 HIGHEST PRIORITY NEAR-TERM PROJECTS AND PROPOSE A SMALL AMOUNT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 FOR PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SUPPORT ACTIVITIES. NEXT SLIDE. TO
2 CONCLUDE I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THE NEXT STEPS FOR THIS PROGRAM
3 AND HOW THE TIMELINE LINES UP WITH THE OTHER COMMISSION
4 ACTIONS ON SIMILAR FUND PROGRAMS. SPECIFICALLY FOR REAP, STAFF
5 ANTICIPATES RETURNING TO THIS COMMITTEE IN MARCH OR APRIL WITH
6 A FUNDING PROPOSAL FOR THE INITIAL 10% OF THE REAP FUNDS WHICH
7 ARE AVAILABLE NOW AND STAFF WILL RETURN WITH A FULL FUNDING
8 PROPOSAL AFTER GUIDELINES HAVE BEEN PROVIDED BY THE STATE AS
9 WELL AS AFTER RECEIVING INPUT FROM THE JOINT MTC PLANNING
10 COMMITTEE AND ABAG ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. THIS IS AN
11 INFORMATION ITEM TODAY WE ARE SEEKING FEEDBACK AND DIRECTION
12 FROM THIS COMMITTEE ON THE PROPOSED FRAMEWORK FOR THE REAP 2.0
13 FUNDING PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, MALLORY. I THOUGHT
16 THERE WAS -- I BELIEVE I SAW COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S HAND UP
17 FIRST.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. EXCITING THAT WE'RE LAUNCHING ON
20 THIS. CAN I -- THERE WAS A LOT OF EXTRA DEMAND FOR PLANNING
21 GRANTS. AND I AM SURE THIS'S GOING TO CONTINUE TO INCREASE. DO
22 YOU THINK THIS IS GOING TO MEET -- IS THIS SIZED TO MEET THE
23 DEMAND? OR IS THERE STILL GOING TO BE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF
24 EXCESS DEMAND AROUND THE REGION AFTER, SORT OF, YOU KNOW, THE
25 COMBINATION OF THE OBAG AND THE REAP PLANNING GRANTS?



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** VICE CHAIR, JOSEFOWITZ, ALIX BOCKELMAN DEPUTY
3 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR POLICY. I THINK THAT'S A REALLY GOOD
4 QUESTION. YOU KNOW, LOOKING AT THE LAST PDA PLANNING CYCLE,
5 YOU KNOW, IT CERTAINLY COULD -- IT CERTAINLY IS SIZED TO
6 ADDRESS THOSE PROJECTS THAT CAME IN, BUT WE KNOW THAT THERE IS
7 A LOT MORE WHEN YOU ADD IN THE, SORT OF, PLANNING THAT WE'RE
8 DOING WITH THE REAP FUNDING. SO I THINK THAT WE WOULD NEED TO
9 GET BACK TO YOU, AND THAT'S PART OF THE REASON THAT WE WANT TO
10 CLOSELY COORDINATE THIS EFFORT WITH KIND OF THE WORK THAT THE
11 PLANNING AND ADMIN AND ABAG ADMIN COMMITTEE ARE DOING, AND
12 ALSO IN CLOSE COORDINATION, BECAUSE ABAG IS THE ONE THAT HAS
13 BEEN ADMINISTERING THE REAP 1.0 PROGRAM WHICH HAS BEEN SOLELY
14 FOCUSED ON THE HOUSING PLANNING. SO THERE IS NOT A CLEAR
15 ANSWER TO THAT BUT I THINK IT WOULD GO A LONG WAY BUT I ASSUME
16 THE DEMAND COULD STILL BE GREATER.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. I WOULD APPRECIATE GETTING SOME SENSE
19 OF IT EVEN THE NEXT TIME THIS COMES BACK, EVEN IF IT'S TO KIND
20 OF, A GUEST MAT. BECAUSE, I THINK IT IS REALLY, REALLY
21 IMPORTANT THAT WE ARE PROVIDING, TO THE EXTENT THAT WE CAN,
22 COMMUNITIES WITH THE RESOURCES TO MEET YOU KNOW, THE GOALS
23 THAT WE'RE SETTING FOR THEM, ON PLANNED BAY AREA TWIT AROUND
24 BAY AREA COMMUNITIES OR WHATEVER IT IS. AND I THINK HOPEFULLY
25 THIS IS GOING TO GO A LONG WAY TO THAT BUT IT WOULD BE GREAT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 TO UNDERSTAND THAT IN A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL. AND I HOPE
2 THAT WE CAN -- I THINK YOU MENTIONED THIS MALLORY, THAT WE ARE
3 REALLY KIND OF COORDINATING THIS GRANT MAKING PROGRAM WITH THE
4 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY STRATEGY SO THAT WE'RE MAKING SURE
5 THAT THE GRANT PROGRAMMING IS GOING HELP JURISDICTIONS KIND
6 OF, YOU KNOW, MEET THEIR REGIONAL OBLIGATIONS, AND THE, SORT
7 OF, THE GOALS WE HAVE SET AROUND PLANNED BAY AREA. THE LAST
8 COMMENT I HAVE IS, YOU KNOW, THERE IS -- ONE OF THE -- SB743,
9 THE KIND OF -- IS, SORT OF, THE CHANGE IN HOW TRANSPORTATION
10 IMPACTS CAN BE CALCULATED ON THE CEQA CAME INTO EFFECT, SORT
11 OF, RELATIVELY RECENTLY, AND PART OF THE FEEDBACK THAT I'M
12 HEARING IS THAT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT SB743 ENVISIONS IS A
13 STREAMLINED PATHWAY FOR ALL SORTS OF DEVELOPMENT IN WHAT IS,
14 SORT OF, DESCRIBED AS LOW VMT COMMUNITIES. AND A LOT OF
15 JURISDICTIONS, AND COUNTIES, MTC, HAVE NOT, SORT OF, BEEN
16 CLEAR AROUND WHAT THE, SORT OF, THE -- OF WHERE THOSE LOW VMT
17 COMMUNITIES ARE, WHICH IS KIND OF BEEN LEFT UP TO EACH PROJECT
18 DEVELOPER TO DO THEIR OWN, SORT OF, VMT MODEL ASKS KIND OF
19 FIGURE OUT WHERE THEY IF THEY COULD, SORT OF, FIGURE OUT HOW
20 TO CONVINCED PEOPLE THEY'RE IN A LOW VMT COMMUNITY AND THAT
21 PROVIDES A BUNCH OF THINGS BUT IT CREATES A LOT OF
22 UNCERTAINTY. SO I DON'T KNOW IF THERE'S A WAY TO THINK ABOUT
23 IN THE CONTEXT OF PLANNING GRANTS FOR PDAS FOR TRANSIT
24 ORIENTED COMMUNITIES TO ALSO KIND OF GET, SORT OF, ASK THE
25 COUNTIES AND CITIES TO KIND OF DESIGNATE PLACES, THOSE LOW VMT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 COMMUNITIES TO DO THAT KIND OF MODELING WORK, MAYBE FEEDING
2 OFF OF REGIONAL MODELS, SO HAD TO THOSE AREAS THAT WE'RE
3 PRIORITIZING FOR GROWTH CAN BENEFIT FROM A CERTAIN DEGREE OF
4 CEQA STREAMLINING ON THE TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS OF THE NEW
5 DEVELOPMENT THERE. THANK YOU.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANKS NICK. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES, JUST TO FOLLOW UP ON THE LAST POINT THAT
10 NICK RAISED. THAT'S A REALLY INTERESTING IDEA. BECAUSE YOU'RE
11 RIGHT. THAT, ONE, IT'S COSTLY, IT TAKES A LOT OF TIME, AND,
12 TWO, IT'S HARD TO ASSESS PROJECTS BASE ON THAT. AND WE HAVE
13 SOME MONEY FOR PROJECTS THAT WE THINK WILL REDUCE VMT AND THE
14 WAY WE ADDRESS THAT IS BY BUILDING THE PROJECTS CLOSE TO
15 TRANSPORTATION. BUT I KNOW THAT WE'RE SEEING NEW INFORMATION
16 THAT SAYS BUILDING JOBS NEAR TRANSPORTATION IS MORE EFFECTIVE
17 THAN BUILDING HOUSING. SO I THINK THAT'S A REALLY, REALLY
18 IMPORTANT POINT AND SOMETHING THAT'S WORTH A DIVE INTO. THE
19 OTHER QUESTION I HAVE IS AS WE LOOK AT THE STAFF REPORT AND
20 THAT, THE PIE, MY QUESTION IS, AS IT RELATES TO THE DECISION
21 BETWEEN THE WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION AND THEN OTHER
22 PROGRAMS THAT ARE BEING MOVED FORWARD, ON THE BLUE RIBBON
23 PRIORITY INITIATIVES, DO WE HAVE OVERALL PRICE TAGS FOR THOSE
24 YET?

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I CAN JUMP IN, THIS IS THERESA WITH MTC
2 FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAMS WE HAVE ESTIMATES ESPECIALLY FOR
3 NEAR-TERM ACCELERATED ACTIONS WHICH INCLUDE FARE TRANSIT
4 PRIORITIES MAPPING AND WAYFINDING AND SOME PROJECTS WE'RE
5 SEEKING TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS COMBINATION OF FUNDING
6 BETWEEN OBAG AND REAP AND THE BLUE RIBBON. AND WE DID HAVE
7 SOME ESTIMATES THAT WERE PRESENTED AT THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
8 A MONTH OR TWO AGO. SO WE CAN ACTUALLY DIG THOSE UP AND SEND
9 THOSE OUT FOR YOU IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SEE WHAT THE FUNDING
10 PLANS ARE.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WOULD JUST RECOMMEND THAT AS WE LOOK TO PEEL
13 OFF RESOURCES MUCH FOR THOSE PROGRAMS, THAT IT'S CLEAR TO THE
14 BOARD WHICH OF THE PROGRAMS IS BEING -- I'M SORRY -- WHICH OF
15 THE PROJECTS ARE ACTUALLY GOING TO BE FULLY FUNDED, HOW
16 THEY'RE GOING TO BE PRIORITIZED. BECAUSE I THINK THERE IS I
17 STRONG AGREEMENT IN UNDERSTANDING IN PARTICULAR WHAT WE THINK
18 ABOUT WAYFINDING AND THE OTHER TOP PROJECTS BUT I THINK THE
19 OTHER PROJECTS WILL NEED TO BE WEIGHED AGAINST, YOU KNOW,
20 EMERGING PROJECTS OR PROJECTS THAT ARE ALREADY IN EXISTENCE,
21 AS WELL. SO I THINK THAT BEING ABLE TO PUT A PRICE TAG ON THEM
22 AND THEN PRIORITIZE THEM WOULD JUST BE HELPFUL. BECAUSE WHEN I
23 LOOK AT THIS, IT MAKES SENSE TO ME BECAUSE WE HAVE AN AGREED
24 UPON PRIORITIES BUT I DON'T KNOW HOW CLOSE THIS GETS US TO
25 NUMBER ONE, NUMBER TWO, AND NUMBER THREE. AND I WOULDN'T KNOW



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THAT. AND THEN THE OTHER QUESTION I WOULD ASK, OR JUST A
2 RECOMMENDATION I WOULD MAKE IS THAT, AGAIN I REALLY LIKE THE
3 ALIGNMENT WITH THESE STUDIES THAT WE HAVE ALREADY DONE. WE
4 HAVE ALREADY GOT PLANS. I THINK THAT IS EXACTLY THE RIGHT WAY
5 TO GO. I, AGAIN, WOULD JUST ASK, THAT AS WE'RE TAGGING
6 PRIORITIES IN 2050 THAT, WE'RE REALLY ABLE TO SAY THAT THESE
7 ARE THE AREAS YOU GUYS AS STAFF ARE SAYING THE REASON WE'RE
8 PUTTING THIS MONEY ASIDE IS THESE ARE THE ONES AGAIN THAT WE
9 FEEL ARE THE MOST IMPORTANT TO ACCOMPLISH P THERE ARE SO MANY
10 PLANS, FOR YOU KNOW EXACTLY WHAT YOU'RE THINKING ABOUT BUT I
11 THINK IT WOULD BENEFIT US A GREAT DEAL IN TERMS OF SAYING THIS
12 MAKES SENSE OR IT DOESN'T AND/OR ARE THERE THINGS THAT NEED TO
13 BE PUSHED UP AS A HIGHER PRIORITY. I DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO
14 THAT BUT I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR ME AS A BOARD
15 MEMBER. SO THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT. VERY
16 THOUGHTFUL.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** ALIX BOCKELMAN?

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO COMMENT, SINCE
21 BOTH VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ BROUGHT UP
22 THE REALLY IMPORTANT WORK THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE AROUND 743 FOR
23 STREAMLINING. I DID WANT TO NOTE THAT WE ARE KICKING OFF,
24 WE'RE LAUNCHING SOME WORK GROUPS WITH THE COUNTIES THIS
25 SPRING. SO, TO REALLY TRY TO HELP ANSWER THIS QUESTION AND



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE KIND OF DOING IT IN A COORDINATED FASHION
2 SO THAT EVERYONE DOESN'T HAVE TO DO THE WORK INDEPENDENTLY AND
3 WE'RE GOING TO TRY TO -- AND WE'RE PUTTING RESOURCE TO THAT,
4 SO I JUST WANTED TO NOTE THAT AND WE'RE GOING TO GET YOU MORE
5 INFORMATION IN THE COMING MONTHS.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANKS ALIX. APPRECIATE THAT. ONE LAST
8 CHANCE FOR COLLEAGUES, COMMENTS, QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS FOR
9 MALLORY AND STAFF ON THIS ISSUE? AGAIN THIS IS AN INFORMATION
10 ISSUE. I'M GOING TO ASK THE CLERK TO READ ANY COMMENTS
11 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM INTO THE RECORD AND ASK IF THERE IS
12 ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE NOT RECEIVED WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
15 FOR THIS ITEM. DO I HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
16 RAISED. I'LL CALL UPON THEM LET ME SHARE MY SCREEN. FIRST IS
17 BOB ALAN. UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. BOB ALAN URBAN HABITAT I WANT TO
20 ACKNOWLEDGE THE TREMENDOUS NEEDS WE HAVE IN THE REGION OF
21 COURSE BOTH ON HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION SIDES OF THE HOUSE
22 AND YOU KNOW WHILE WE'RE HAVING INTERESTED IN, AS AN
23 ORGANIZATION, AND ALSO WITH OUR PARTNERS SEEING HOW THESE
24 FUNDS CAN GO TO SUPPORT SOME OF THOSE TRANSPORTATION NEEDS I
25 KNOW WE'RE KEENLY INTERESTED IN THE CONVERSATION THAT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 HOPEFULLY WILL HAPPEN ON THE ABAG SIDE ESPECIALLY AROUND
2 BAHFA. AND PARTICULARLY AROUND THE PRESERVATION STRATEGIES
3 THAT ARE CURRENTLY BEING IMPLEMENTED TO THE BAY AREA WE'RE
4 WORKING LOCALLY WITH VALLEJO TO STAND UP A CLT FOR EXAMPLE,
5 WITH THE JUSTICE COALITION AND WITH A NUMBER OF PARTNERS THIS
6 PROPOSAL IS DETAILED, I CAN CERTAINLY UNDERSTAND THE EXISTING
7 NEED, SPENDING SO MUCH TIME TALKING ABOUT TRANSPORTATION NEEDS
8 BUT WE HOPE THERE IT WILL BE CONSIDERATION GIVEN -- I KNOW
9 REAP 1.0 WENT DIRECTLY TO JURISDICTIONS THIS IS A DIFFERENT
10 FUNDING ALLOCATION AND CONFIGURATION SOME OF THE NEEDS THAT
11 BAHFA WILL HAVE AND SOME OF THE PRIORITIES, INTERSECTING
12 HIGHLIGHTING PRESERVATION THINGS THAT CAN BE DONE TO
13 STABILIZE, THE MOST LOYAL WILL TRANSIT RIDERS WHO HAVE
14 DEMONSTRATED THROUGHOUT PANDEMIC TO STAY WITH THE SYSTEM WON'T
15 BE IN THE BAY AREA. THINGS LIKE PRESERVATION CAPITAL,
16 ORGANIZATION, CAPACITY BUILDING WILL BE CONSIDERED ALONG WITH
17 PDA AND PLANNING GRANT WITH SOME OF THE PROPOSALS FROM THE
18 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE SOME OF WHICH COULD HAVE OTHER FUNDING
19 SOURCES. HOPEFULLY THIS IS THE BEGINNING OF CONVERSATION,
20 THERE IS LOTS OF NEEDS AND HOPEFULLY THIS WILL INTERSECT WITH
21 THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE LATER THIS MONTH. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JUSTINE MARCUS.
24 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. JUSTINE MARCUS,
25 ARE YOU THERE?



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN HEAR YOU.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JUSTINE MARCUS THE POLICY
7 DIRECTOR WITH ENTERPRISE COMMUNITY PARTNERS. THANKS TO STAFF
8 FOR ALL OF THEIR WORK IT'S CLEAR THERE IS A LOT OF THOUGHT AND
9 STRATEGY THAT WENT INTO THIS PROPOSED FRAMEWORK OUR TEAM HAS
10 BEEN WORKING ACROSS THE STATE AS WELL WITH STATE
11 ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES TO SHAPE THIS PROGRAM TO BE AS
12 EFFECTIVE AS IT CAN BE THIS IS OPPORTUNITY TO USE
13 DISCRETIONARY RESOURCES TO BEGIN TO TAKE PLANNED BAY AREA FROM
14 A VISION TO A REAL PLAN FOR INVESTMENTS ON THE GROUND THAT THE
15 BAY AREA COMMUNITIES WILL SEE AND CAN BENEFIT FROM. WE ARE
16 SUPPORTIVE OF THE INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK PROPOSED BY STAFF TODAY
17 WE THINK IT REFLECT THIS IS APPROACH AND WILL ACHIEVE THE
18 OUTCOMES THAT THE STATE PUT FORWARD, REALLY REDUCING VMTS AND
19 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION THROUGH INTEGRATED HOUSING AND
20 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS. AND I JUST WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT HOW
21 FOUNDATIONAL INVESTING IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS TO THIS
22 APPROACH. AS YOU UNDERScoreD IN PLANNED BAY AREA THE CREATION
23 OF PRESERVATION IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN TRANSIT IN
24 OPPORTUNITY RICH LOCATION ACHIEVES THE MULTIPLE BENEFITS THAT
25 THE COMMISSION AND THE STATE ARE WORKING TOWARDS EXPANDS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 HOUSING AFFORDABILITY ACCESS AND OPPORTUNITY TO LOW-INCOME
2 RESIDENTS DISPROPORTIONATELY PEOPLE OF COLOR IT INCREASES
3 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS REDUCES OUR CLIMATE IMPACT. AS YOU
4 CONTINUE TO WORK ON THIS EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK WE ENCOURAGE
5 EXPLORE THE WAYS THE FUNDS CAN BE USED TO ACCELERATE
6 AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS AT SCALE THAT SUPPORT EQUITABLE
7 REGIONAL STRATEGIES AND DEVELOPMENT IT'S ESSENTIAL FOR BOTH
8 PLANNED BAY AREA AND RHNA GOALS WE LOOK FORWARD TO PARTNERING
9 WITH YOU AND ENSURE INVESTMENTS ARE SUCCESSFUL AND ON THE
10 GROUND. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT IS JAMES PEREZ. PLEASE UNMUTE
13 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HI CAN YOU HEAR ME.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN HEAR YOU.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS JAMES PEREZ PROJECT MANAGER WITH EAST BAY
20 AGENTS LOCAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION OAKLAND BASE THE
21 COMMUNITY DEVELOPER AND EXCITED ABOUT THE PROSPECT OF REAP 2.0
22 TO SUPPORT A TRANSFORMATIVE TRANSIT ORIENTED AFFORDABLE
23 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT GOALS OUTLINED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
24 PLEASED TO SEE FRAMEWORK PRESENTED BY STAFF TODAY PARTICULARLY
25 THRILLED ABOUT THE POTENTIAL USE OF 2.0 FUNDS FOR DIRECT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 HOUSING INVESTMENTS PARTICULARLY TO FILL FUND GAPS ON MIXED
2 USE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECT AT IT. OD. THERE ARE A NUMBER
3 OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS IN THE PIPELINE ACROSS THE
4 REGION MANY OF WHICH ARE INNOVATIVE PARTNERSHIPS BETWEEN LOCAL
5 NON-PROFIT DEVELOPERS LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCY MUNICIPAL PARTNERS
6 AND NEIGHBORHOOD STAKEHOLDERS. MANY OF THESE PROJECTS ALSO
7 INCLUDE SUBSTANTIAL COMMERCIAL WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT AND JOB
8 GENERATING COMPONENTS. WE WANT TO ENCOURAGE MTC STAFF AND
9 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE TO LOOK INTO HOW TO
10 PORTION 2.0 FUNDS TO DIRECTLY SUPPORT IMPORTANT PROJECTS THAT
11 WE'RE SEEING IN MANY REGIONS SUCH AS L.A., SEATTLE, AND
12 CHICAGO TO IMPLEMENT EQUITABLE TOD PLANS WE ENCOURAGE MTC TO
13 CONTINUE TO BUILD ON PAST SUCCESSES AND HOW THE BAY AREA CAN
14 CONTINUE TO BE A LEADER IN THIS FIELD. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SHANNON DODGE.
17 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS SHANNON DODGE AND I AM WITH
20 BART. I WORK WITH BART'S TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT GROUP AS
21 A PRINCIPLE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT OFFICER BART HAS BEEN
22 INVOLVED IN SHAPING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SO WE'RE EXCITED TO
23 SEE THAT REAP 2.0 MAY OFFER A CHANCE TO START IMPLEMENTING AND
24 DELIVERING ON KEY ELEMENTS OF PLANNED BAY AREA. AS A REGIONAL
25 TRANSIT PROVIDER, WE'RE IN A POSITION TO SEE THAT MANY



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 JURISDICTIONS HAVE COMPLETED THOUGHTFUL AND EVEN VISIONARY
2 PLANNING EFFORTS YET THEY NOW FACE CHALLENGES IN REALIZING
3 THOSE PLANS DUE TO RESOURCE SHORTFALLS. IT'S OUR HOPE THAT
4 REAP 2.0 CAN HELP FILL SOME OF THOSE SHORTFALLS. WE STRONGLY
5 SUPPORT THE FRAMEWORK STAFF SHARED ESPECIALLY PROPOSAL TO PUT
6 LARGE PORTION OF 2.0 FUNDS TOWARDS DIRECT HOUSING INVESTMENT
7 IN COORDINATION WITH MOBILITY RELATED INVESTMENTS PLEASED TO
8 SEE POTENTIALLY FUNDING GAPS AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS ON
9 TRANSIT AGENCY TOD PROJECTS UNDER SCORING IMPORTANCE OF
10 INVESTING SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF 2.0 TO ADVANCE AFFORDABLE
11 HOUSING SOLUTIONS IN TRANSIT-RICH AND LOW-INCOME AREAS.
12 PARTNERING WITH MTC LOCALITIES WITH SUPPORT FOR ACCELERATED
13 HIGH QUALITY MIXED INCOME HOUSING AROUND OUR STATIONS IN
14 TANDEM WITH MOBILITY IMPROVEMENT AND STABILIZING OUR
15 STRUGGLING LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS ESSENTIAL WORKFORCE
16 INCREASING TRANSIT RIDERSHIP REDUCING OUR REGION'S CLIMATE --

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO FURTHER SPEAKERS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** NEXT ITEM 4A UPDATE ON CALTRAIN
21 GOVERNANCE DISCUSSIONS AND THE PENINSULA CORRIDOR
22 ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT AND ALIX BOCKELMAN AND KENNETH ARE
23 GOING TO PRESENT THIS ITEM. ALIX, OR KEN?

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS ALIX BOCKELMAN
2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR POLICY. IF STAFF COULD PULL UP THE
3 PRESENTATION. THIS IS THE CALTRAIN GOVERNANCE RIGHT OF WAY
4 REPAYMENT PORTION WHERE WE'RE LOOKING TO THE COMMITTEE FOR
5 DIRECTION TO INFORM THE SCOPE TO ENROLL THE RIGHT OF WAY
6 REPAYMENT FOR COMMISSION ACTION LATER THIS MONTH I'LL THEN
7 TURN IT OVER TO KEN WHO WILL PROVIDE UPDATED INFORMATION ON
8 THE CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT WE'RE ALSO JOINED BY
9 MICHELLE BOUCHARD ACT BEING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR CALTRAIN
10 JOINT POWERS BOARD WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE OPENING REMARKS
11 ON CONTEXT SETTING FOR ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT AND OTHER
12 PRESENTATIONS SHE CAN AND HER STAFF ARE AVAILABLE FOR COMMENTS
13 OR QUESTIONS ON EITHER PART OF THE PRESENTATION ONCE WE GET
14 THERE. NEXT SLIDE. THE JOINT POWERS BOARD IS CURRENTLY
15 CONCLUDING A GOVERNANCE STUDY THAT EVALUATED STRUCTURAL
16 GOVERNANCE OPTIONS FOR DELIVERING CALTRAIN PROJECTS AND
17 SERVICE. JPB PRESENTED DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE STUDY AT
18 ITS MEETING LAST WEEK AND WILL CONSIDER ADOPTING FINAL
19 RECOMMENDATIONS AT ITS FEBRUARY MEETING. IN A RELATED EFFORT,
20 I THINK, AS MANY OF YOU KNOW, MTC IS JUST KICKING OFF A RAIL
21 GOVERNANCE STUDY THAT WILL EXAMINE GOVERNANCE AND PROJECT
22 DELIVERY STRUCTURES ON THIS CORRIDOR, BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY,
23 LOOK AT IT FROM A REGIONAL STANDPOINT. CENTRAL TO THE YEAR
24 LONG JPB GOVERNANCE CONVERSATION HAS BEEN THE REPAYMENT OF
25 CALTRAIN RIDE OF WAY FUNDS FRONTED BY SAMTRANS. IMPORTANTLY



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 RELATED TO THIS JPB GOVERNANCE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WERE
2 PRESENTED AND ARE UNDER CONSIDERATION ASSUME MTC WILL PROVIDE
3 19.6 MILLION TO ADDRESS THE OUTSTANDING PRINCIPLE BALANCE FROM
4 A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT DATING TO 2007 AND 2008. GIVEN THAT THE
5 AGREEMENT, AT THE TIME, RELIED ON A FUND SOURCE THAT NO LONGER
6 EXISTS, THE COMMISSION WILL NEED TO RECONSIDER ITS ROLE IN THE
7 RIGHT OF WAY REPAYMENT AND EVALUATE POTENTIAL --
8 [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT COULD BE AVAILABLE TO ADDRESS THIS
9 REPAYMENT. NEXT SLIDE. AS AN IMPORTANT BACKDROP THE NEXT
10 SEVERAL SLIDES ATTEMPT TO SUMMARIZE WHAT IS A VERY COMPLICATED
11 SERIES OF AGREEMENTS AND TRANSACTIONS RELATED TO THE CALTRAIN
12 RIGHT OF WAY. THIS INFORMATION IS ALSO SUMMARIZED IN
13 ATTACHMENT A FOR THOSE OF YOU THAT MIGHT WANT TO GO A LITTLE
14 DEEPER OR STUDY IT LATER THIS EVENING. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE
15 ORIGINAL 1991 PURCHASE OF THE CALTRAIN MAIN LINE RIGHT OF WAY
16 FOR 212 MILLION. THE FUNDING PLAN INCLUDED OVER 120 MILLION IN
17 STATE PROP 116 FUNDS, 10 MILLION CREDIT FOR THE CONSTRUCTION
18 OF THE MAINTENANCE FACILITY, AND, IMPORTANTLY, THE 82 MILLION
19 PAID BY SAMTRANS. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE ORIGINAL
20 AMOUNT OF THE RIGHT OF WAY PURCHASE THAT WAS ATTRIBUTABLE TO
21 THE OTHER TWO JPB PARTNERS AT 43 MILLION, WITH ROUGHLY 83%
22 ATTRIBUTED TO SANTA CLARA VAL TRAWL AUTHORITY AND 20%
23 ATTRIBUTED TO SAN FRANCISCO. IT ALSO SHOWS THE COMPOUNDED
24 INTEREST THAT HAD ACCRUED PRIOR TO A RESET IN AN AMENDMENT TO
25 THE REAL PROPERTY AGREEMENT IN 2008 OF 48.5. IN 2007 AND 2008



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 WHEN THE PARTIES AND MTC SOUGHT TO FULFILL THIS OUTSTANDING
2 RIGHT OF WAY OBLIGATION OWED TO SAMTRANS WITH STATE MONEYS
3 THAT WERE AVAILABLE AT THE TIME, THE AMOUNT OWED TO SAMTRANS
4 WITH INTEREST WAS 91.5 MILLION. THROUGH AN AMENDMENT TO A REAL
5 PROPERTY AGREEMENT SIGNED BY THE JOINT POWERS BOARD MEMBERS,
6 THAT'S THREE COUNTIES, THE AMOUNT OF OUTSTANDING RIGHT OF WAY
7 PAYMENT WAS RESET TO 53 MILLION. WITH FORGIVENESS OF 38.2
8 MILLION OF THE INTEREST IN EXCHANGE FOR SAMTRANS CONTINUING AS
9 MANAGING AGENCY FOR AS LONG AS IT CHOSE TO DO SO. THERE WON'T
10 BE A QUIZ ON THIS LATER. I PROMISE. NEXT SLIDE. AS OF TODAY,
11 PAYMENT OBLIGATIONS ARE SET FORTH IN A 2007 SETTLEMENT AND
12 2008 REAL PROPERTY OWNERSHIP AGREEMENT AMENDMENT, AND INCLUDES
13 A REMAINING 19.8 MILLION PRINCIPLE BALANCE OWED TO SAMTRANS.
14 MTC WAS A PARTY, ALTHOUGH NOT ONE OF THE SIGNATORIES, TO THIS
15 2,007 AGREEMENT, AND AGREED TO TAKE ON A MAJORITY OF THE
16 OBLIGATION OF THE COUNTIES WITH NEW AND UNEXPECTED STATE SPILL
17 OVERFUNDING THAT WAS AVAILABLE AT THAT TIME. UNFORTUNATELY,
18 THAT UNENCUMBERED SOURCE OF FUNDING WAS ELIMINATING THROUGH
19 STATE ACTION PRIOR TO ACHIEVING FULL REIMBURSEMENT AS THE
20 OUTLINED AGREEMENT AND THERE IS A BALANCE THAT REMAINS. YOU
21 CAN SEE IN THE TABLE THE EPA HAS SATISFIED THE 8 MILLION THAT
22 WAS PART OF THE AGREEMENT TO PAY AND SAN FRANCISCO HAS MET
23 THEIR OBLIGATION WITH THE EXCEPTION OF 200,000. THE PART MTC
24 AGREED TO TAKE ON THERE IS STILL A \$19.6 MILLION BALANCE. NOTE
25 THAT THE FUNDING PROVIDED BY MTC TO DATE HAS BEEN IN THE FORM



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 OF PROGRAMMING CAPACITY NOT A STRAIGHT CASH. WE DON'T DEAL IN
2 CASH HERE, VERY MUCH, AND NOT MY SECTION, ANYWAYS, FOR
3 SAMTRANS, AND THAT CAN BE EXPECTED FOR ANY FUTURE
4 CONTRIBUTIONS THE COMMISSION MIGHT APPROVE. AS WELL, IT IS
5 IMPORTANT TO ESTABLISH AT THE OUTSET THAT MTC DOES NOT BELIEVE
6 THAT ANY INTEREST PAYMENTS ARE CONTRACTUALLY ATTACHED TO THE
7 OUTSTANDING BALANCE, THIS 19.6 MILLION OUTSTANDING BALANCE,
8 AND IS NOT RECOMMENDED TO BE FACTORED INTO ANY REPAYMENTS BY
9 THE COMMISSION. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT COMPLEX HISTORY UNDER
10 OUR BELTS, THIS COMMITTEE AND ULTIMATELY THE COMMISSION, WILL
11 NEED TO CONSIDER THE FUNDING TRADEOFFS RELATED TO THE 19.6
12 MILLION REPAYMENT ALONGSIDE THE REGIONAL INTEREST IN
13 ADDRESSING SPECIFIC ELEMENTS OF CALTRAIN GOVERNANCE THAT HAVE
14 CAUSED TENSIONS AMONG THE THREE MEMBER COUNTIES OVER OF THE
15 JPB OVER THE YEARS. GOVERNMENTS RECOMMENDATION TO MAINTAIN
16 SAMTRANS AS THE CALTRAIN MANAGING ENTITY IN THE NEAR-TERM
17 WHILE INCLUDING SEVERAL KEY GOVERNANCE CHANGES RIGHT OF WAY
18 REPAYMENT PROVISIONS STAFF BELIEVES THESE CHANGES WILL LAY
19 FOUNDATION TO ADDRESS ONGOING CHALLENGES CALTRAIN FACES IN THE
20 NEXT FEW YEARS ONE OF WHICH WE WILL HEAR ABOUT IN THE SECOND
21 PART OF THE PRESENTATION THAT'S COMPLETION OF THE
22 ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT ALSO BELIEVE THIS IS TIME FOR THE
23 ASSESSMENT OF LONGER TERM STRUCTURAL CHANGES IN A REGIONAL
24 CONTEXT TO BETTER FACILITATE GOVERNANCE ADMINISTRATION PROJECT
25 DELIVERY ALONG THE CORRIDOR AND THROUGHOUT THE REGIONS NETWORK



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 MORE LONG-TERM. WITH THE REGIONAL INTEREST IN MIND BOTH
2 LOOKING TO FUTURE STAFF PROPOSES THAT THE COMMISSION CONSIDER
3 PAYMENT BY MTC SAMTRANS OF THE \$19.6 MILLION PRINCIPLE BALANCE
4 AS ENVISIONED IN THE JPB RECOMMENDATIONS SUBJECT TO SEVERAL
5 CONDITIONS THAT ARE NOTED ON THIS SLIDE. THE FIRST ONE REALLY
6 BEING THAT THIS PRINCIPLE PAYMENT WOULD CONSTITUTE FULL
7 PAYMENT BY MTC TO SAMTRANS AND THAT THERE WOULD BE NO
8 EXPECTATION OF ANY FUTURE CONTRIBUTIONS BY THE COMMISSION. THE
9 SECOND BULLET REALLY, SORT OF, LINKING BACK WITH, SORT OF, THE
10 WORK THAT THE COMMISSION IS DOING, YOU KNOW, COMING OUT OF THE
11 BLUE RIBBON, WOULD ASK THAT THERE BE A POLICY STATEMENT
12 AFFIRMING THAT THE AGREEMENT DOES NOT PRECLUDE RECOMMENDATIONS
13 THAT MIGHT BE FORTHCOMING FROM THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS
14 CASE AND/OR THE REGIONAL RAIL STUDY. AND THE THIRD BULLET,
15 HERE, AND CONDITION, REALLY IS RELATED TO THE SECOND, WHICH IS
16 THAT SHOULD IN, SORT OF, FUTURE EVALUATION, RECONVENING
17 RELATED TO THE MOU BETWEEN SAMTRANS AND JPB, THAT THERE BE
18 SOME CONSULTATION WITH MTC ABOUT WHERE, WHAT, SORT OF,
19 RECOMMENDATIONS MAY HAVE COME OUT OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
20 WORK AT THAT TIME. SO, IN, SORT OF, YOUR DISCUSSION TODAY AND
21 AS WE GET YOUR FEEDBACK, I THINK WE ARE WANTING TO KNOW
22 WHETHER YOU WOULD LIKE TO CONSIDER THESE CONDITIONS IN FULL OR
23 IN PART. IT'S DEFINITELY FEASIBLE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE
24 FIRST ONE WITHOUT, SORT OF, THE LINK TO THE REGIONAL
25 GOVERNANCE CONVERSATION SO WE CAN HEAR FROM YOU ON THAT. NOTE,



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 WE DID RECEIVE A COMMENT LETTER FROM SAMTRANS ACTING GENERAL
2 MANAGER CARTER MAU NOTING THAT PROGRAMMING CAPACITY, OR AT
3 LEAST AS I READ THE LETTER, WAS -- COULD BE AN ACCEPTABLE
4 PAYMENT TO SAMTRANS BUT NOTING SAMTRANS WAS NOT SUPPORTIVE OF
5 OTHER PAYMENT CONDITIONS ASSOCIATED WITH REPAYMENT. WITH THAT
6 THIS MEATY TOPIC OF RIGHT OF WAY REPAYMENT WE'RE GOING TO
7 TRANSITION TO CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION AND OBVIOUSLY COME BACK
8 FOR DISCUSSION.

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** ACTUALLY, THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN,
11 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ALIX, I THINK IT MIGHT BE A GOOD TIME TO
12 HAVE Q&A ON THIS TOPIC WHILE IT'S STILL FRESH IN COMMISSIONERS
13 MINDS AND THEN WE CAN MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ONE.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OKAY. WITH THAT I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE
16 THAT IT WAS CLEAR THAT WE'RE ARE LOOKING FOR, SORT OF,
17 COMMITTEE'S INPUT TODAY SO THAT WE COULD THEN MAKE ANY
18 REVISIONS NECESSARY TO SOMETHING THAT WE WOULD BRING TO THE
19 COMMISSION LATER THIS MONTH FOR FINAL ACTION.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALIX. I APPRECIATE THAT. AND IF
22 WE CAN MAYBE JUST FOR A SECOND STOP SHARING THE SCREEN SO I
23 CAN SEE MY COLLEAGUES. I SEE THAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ HAS HER
24 HAND RAISED.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK THE STAFF FOR WHAT IS
2 SUPER COMPLICATE, GETTING IT DOWN TO THE NUMBER OF SLIDES THAT
3 YOU DID IS ALMOST AN FESTIVUS MIRACLE. THANK YOU FOR THAT.
4 FESTIVE US -- -- I THINK DRIVING A HARD LINE BETWEEN THE 19.6
5 MILLION AND THE ELECTRIFICATION AND WHAT I WANT TO SAY IS THAT
6 EARLY ON, I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT THE REPAYMENT OF
7 THAT 19.6 MILLION HAVE VERY LIMITED TO NO-STRINGS ATTACHED TO
8 IT IN PART BECAUSE IT'S PART OF AN OLD AGREEMENT BETWEEN
9 MULTIPLE PARTIES. AND I THINK THAT ONE OF THE OPPORTUNITIES WE
10 HAVE GOING FORWARD IS THAT I BELIEVE THAT THE CALTRAIN BOARD
11 WILL, WORKING WITH ALL OF ITS PARTNERS, HAVE AN AGREEMENT
12 RELATIVE TO GOVERNANCE. AND I THINK THAT KEEPING IT AS
13 UNCOMPLICATED AS WE CAN IS REALLY CRITICAL TO US BEING ABLE TO
14 RESOLVE THOSE GOVERNANCE ISSUES. COLLEAGUES, I RECOGNIZE THE
15 WORK AS IT RELATES TO THE FUTURE WAY THAT MTC IS SEEING ITS
16 ROLE IN THE COMMUNITY IS ONE THAT'S VERY WORTH HAVING AND NOT
17 JUST AS IT RELATES TO CALTRAIN BUT ANY OTHER REVENUES AND
18 RESOURCES THAT WE'RE CONSIDERING, YOU KNOW, CONTRIBUTING TO.
19 SO, THAT'S JUST TO LAY THE GROUNDWORK, THAT I DO THINK THESE
20 ARE VERY DISTINCT ACTIONS. ONE IS RELATED TO PAST AGREEMENTS
21 THEY WANT TO MAKE SURE STAY UNCOMPLICATED. THE OTHER IS
22 RELATED TO FUTURE ENDEAVORS WHICH I THINK ARE PART OF A BIGGER
23 DISCUSSION RELATIVE TO THE FUTURE OF MTC.
24
25 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I THINK COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ SAID IT
3 ELOQUENTLY. I AGREE ALONG THE SAME LINES. I ACTUALLY REMEMBER
4 VTA'S REPAYMENT WHEN I WAS BACK ON THE VTA BOARD IN 2008, 2010
5 TIME FRAME. SO IN LIGHT OF THIS BEING A COMMITMENT, OVERDUE,
6 MAYBE, I THINK WE CAN SAY THAT MTC SHOULD JUST MOVE FORWARD
7 AND JUST CLOSE IT OUT AND I HOPE THAT THAT WOULD HELP IN HELP
8 MOVING FORWARD IN FUTURE DISCUSSIONS AND CALTRAIN STRUCTURE
9 AND I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATIONS BEING BIFURCATED BECAUSE I
10 BELIEVE THE SECOND PIECE ON ELECTRIFICATION IS A DIFFERENT
11 TOPIC.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

14

15 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I REALLY APPRECIATE STAFF
16 BRINGING THIS FORWARD TO US. YOU KNOW, WHEN I RECALL THE LAST
17 EFFORT TO COMPLETE THE RIGHT OF WAY PURCHASE DEAL THIS'S
18 REFERENCED IN THE STAFF REPORT AND MTC STAFF WAS INVOLVED
19 FIRST OF ALL I THINK THIS RIGHT OF WAY IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT
20 HAD THAT NOT BEEN DONE THEN WE WOULD NOT HAVE A TRAIN TODAY
21 GIVEN THE EXTRAORDINARY COST OF LAND AND ALSO THE DEVELOPMENT
22 OF THAT CORRIDOR. I DIDN'T REALIZE THAT THIS LINE IS ONE OF
23 THE OLDEST RAILROAD LINES IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND IN
24 LOOKING AT ITS HISTORY IT'S KIND OF ONE HISTORIC COUNTIES
25 COOPERATING TO BUILD THIS AND MAINTAIN AND MANAGE THIS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CORRIDOR. THAT SAID, IF YOU LOOK AT, FOR EXAMPLE, THE
2 DEVELOPMENT OF SAN MATEO COUNTY IN TERMS OF JOB CENTERS,
3 WHETHER IT'S SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO OR REDWOOD CITY JUST AS AN
4 EXAMPLE OF TWO OF THE ONES WITH LARGEST CORPORATION IN THEM
5 THIS CORRIDOR LIKE MANY OF THEM IS LIKE THE OAKLAND FORK IT'S
6 A 5050 CORRIDOR, PEOPLE GO UP AND GO DOWN. LIKE OAKLAND PORT
7 HALF OF GOODS COME IN AND HALF GO OUTS. IT'S REALLY INCUMBENT
8 UPON US TO SUPPORT THIS. I SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION.
9 I'M CONCERNED THERE HAS BEEN SO MUCH TIME IN THE EXPECTATION
10 OF COURSE BY MTC AND EVERYONE THAT IN THE AGREEMENT IN TERMS
11 OF THE MANAGEMENT OF THE CORRIDOR WOULD HAVE OCCURRED IN THE
12 PAST AND IT HASN'T OCCURRED YET, AND I HEAR COMMISSIONER
13 CHAVEZ WHO SPIRIT TO THOSE DISCUSSIONS EXPRESSING CONFIDENCE
14 THAT AN AGREEMENT WILL BE REACHED SOON. SO I GUESS I AM
15 HOPEFUL AND I WOULD BE VERY CONCERNED THAT MTC WOULD FULFILL
16 THIS COMMITMENT AND I CONCUR THAT THIS WOULD BE THE FINAL
17 COMMITMENT TO MTC. IT'S INTERESTING WHEN IT GOES FROM ONE
18 POCKET TO THE OTHER POCKET OF THE TAXPAYER AND WE COULD ARGUE
19 THAT SAMTRANS TAXPAYERS HAVE BENEFITTED FROM THOSE DOLLARS
20 BEING USED IN THE RIGHT OF WAY OVER THE YEARS THAT THIS
21 AGREEMENT HAS BEEN IN PLACE. I WOULD CONCUR WITH THE PROPOSAL
22 BUT WOULD LIKE REASSURANCE THAT THE MANAGEMENT OF THE
23 GOVERNANCE ISSUES ARE ON TRACK TO BE COMPLETED. BECAUSE I
24 THINK THAT WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE WAY IT'S CURRENTLY STRUCTURED
25 YOU HAVE TWO DIFFERENT BOARDS MANAGING ONE SYSTEM AND I CAN



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 IMAGINE THE CHALLENGES WITH THAT. SO I RECOGNIZE YOU'RE
2 PROBABLY AT THE DELICATE POINT IN GETTING TO THE FINISH LINE
3 ON THIS, BUT I WOULD BE VERY CONCERNED THAT WE WOULD PUT IN
4 FUNDING TO COMPLETE THIS RIGHT OF WAY PAYMENT AND THEN HAVE
5 THESE DISCUSSIONS CONTINUE TO LINGER. AND I ALSO SUPPORT THE
6 FACT THAT PART OF THE GOAL OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
7 FUNDAMENTALLY IS TO PROVIDE EXCELLENT SERVICE TO OUR RIDERS.
8 AND WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO KNOW THAT WE'LL BE ABLE TO ACHIEVE
9 THOSE GOALS AROUND THE REGION. AND I KNOW THAT WE'RE -- I
10 THINK IT MAKES SENSE TO SEPARATE THIS DISCUSSION FROM THE
11 ELECTRIFICATION DISCUSSION. SO, WITH THAT, I, YOU KNOW, I'M
12 VERY HOPEFUL THAT WE'LL -- THAT THESE AGREEMENTS WILL BE
13 FORTHCOMING SOON. IS COMMISSIONER PAPAN

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** I AGREE THAT THE GOVERNANCE ISSUES NEED TO BE
16 RESOLVED AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE HERE. THE MAIN GOAL IS TO GET
17 BACK TO THE GAME AND THAT IS MAKING SURE THAT THERE IS
18 ELECTRIFICATION MONEY AND FUNDING. AND I BELIEVE IT'S BEEN A
19 DISTRACTION FOR CALTRAIN STAFF, AND I KNOW THEY HAVE MADE
20 GREAT STRIDES I COMPLIMENT MY COLLEAGUE COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.
21 BUT THIS NEEDS TO HAPPEN. IT DOES NOT LOOK GOOD IF WE'RE ALL
22 TRYING TO GET ELECTRIFICATION MONEY AND THAT HAS NOT BEEN
23 RESOLVED. I THINK MANY ISSUES HAVE BEEN RESOLVED. I DON'T
24 THINK THEY EVEN HAVE AN MOU AT THIS POINT IN TIME. THEY MAY
25 HAVE AGREED ON CERTAIN POINTS, BUT POINT NUMBER THREE, I'M NOT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 SURE MTC WANT TO BE INVOLVED IN THAT ASPECT OF THE BACK AND
2 FORTH WITH GOVERN GOVERNANCE, WHICH SHOULD BE SERIOUSLY
3 RESOLVED. STAFF IS, I BELIEVE PUT TOGETHER, THE NEW LEGAL
4 COUNSEL, AND AUDITOR, AND FROM WHAT I UNDERSTAND, MICHELLE
5 BOUCHARD IS DOING AN EXCELLENT JOB. SO LET'S LET THEM GET TO
6 WORK. I THINK RESOLVING THIS 19.6 MILLION IS JUST ONE LITTLE
7 ASPECT THAT MTC CAN DO BUT WE DO NEED, NOW, TO INSIST ON ALL
8 THESE AGENCIES, ALL 27 AGENCIES COMPLYING WITH WHAT THE BLUE
9 RIBBON COMMITTEE HAS PUT FORTH, WHICH IS LOOKING AT THE
10 NETWORK MANAGEMENT CASE AND REGIONAL STUDY. SO, I DO THINK
11 ADDING THAT INTO THE AGREEMENT IS VERY IMPORTANT FOR NOT ONLY
12 THIS AGREEMENT BUT AGREEMENTS MOVING FORWARD. SO, I THINK THAT
13 IS VERY IMPORTANT AS WE PROGRESS HERE. I APPRECIATE STAFF
14 WORKING SO HARD BECAUSE THERE IS NOT MONEY OUT THERE RIGHT NOW
15 THAT WAS DESIGNATED FOR THIS. SO PUTTING THE MONEY TOGETHER IS
16 GOING TO BE DIFFICULT. BUT THOSE EFFORTS ARE GREATLY
17 APPRECIATED, HOPEFULLY THIS WILL MOVE THE CALTRAIN BOARD
18 FORWARD, AND THINGS, WE CAN ALL GET TO ELECTRIFICATION. SO IF
19 WE CAN MOVE FORWARD WITH THE FUNDING -- TRYING TO GET THE
20 MONEY AND THE INCLUSION OF THE POLICY STATEMENTS, I THINK
21 THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT
24 WE'LL GO TO CHAIR PEDROZA.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT AND THANK YOU TO STAFF
2 FOR BRINGING THIS TOGETHER IN A SHORT AMOUNT OF TIME. I AGREE
3 WITH COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. THE AMOUNT OF DOCUMENTS THEY HAVE
4 HAD TO READ TO GET UP TO SPEED, YOU SUMMARIZED IT WELL, AND
5 ALIX AND THERESE WORKING WITH STAFF. I SUPPORT THE STAFF
6 RECOMMENDATION I HEAR THE CONCERNS EXPRESSED BY COMMISSIONER
7 CHAVEZ AND ABE-KOGA AND I HOPED GOVERNANCE DISCUSSIONS YOU'RE
8 HAVING ADVANCE AND THAT WOULD BE TO THE BENEFIT OF EVERYONE,
9 THE BENEFIT OF THE RIDERS. WHEN I LOOK AT CONDITION 2 AND 3,
10 AND I THINK THREE CAN BE MASSAGED A LITTLE BIT. WHEN WE
11 STARTED THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE I WAS SURPRISED BY THE
12 COLLABORATION AMONG THE OPERATORS AND THEY SHOULD BE COMMENDED
13 AND ACKNOWLEDGE SAID FOR THAT WHEN I LOOK AT THOSE ITEMS 2 AND
14 3 IT'S CONTINUING TO HAVE THE ACTIVE PARTICIPATION ON THESE
15 THINGS THAT WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT THAT WE WANT TO ADVANCE
16 FOR BENEFIT OF THE RIDERS OF THE REGION. AND IF WE'RE
17 COMMITTED TO THAT WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE ACTIVE
18 PARTICIPATION AND WE HAVE COLLABORATION AND TO ME THIS IS I
19 MOMENT IN TIME WHEN WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE WANT TO
20 HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS WITH THOSE AGENCIES FOR THE BENEFIT
21 OF THE RIDERS. I SUPPORT THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS I THINK IT'S
22 THE RIGHT TIME AT THE RIGHT MOMENT BUT ALSO TO SUPPORT THOSE
23 LOCAL AGENCIES AND CONTINUE TO HAVE THOSE GOVERNANCE
24 DISCUSSIONS THERE'S NOTHING THAT PROHIBITS THAT FROM HAPPENING
25 ON THE ACTION OF THE \$19.6 MILLION THAT'S REAL, WE HAVE TO BE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CREATIVE AND IDENTIFY BUT I BELIEVE WE HAVE THE RESPONSIBLE TO
2 MAKE THAT RIGHT AND I SUPPORT THAT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER SPERING.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I SUPPORT AMY WORTH AND THE CHAIR'S COMMENT.
7 I HOPE THIS COMMITTEE MOVES ALL THREE RECOMMENDATIONS. WE WERE
8 NEVER A PARTY TO THE ORIGINAL AGREEMENT; I THINK MYSELF AND A
9 COUPLE OF OTHERS WERE AROUND, MTC IS ALWAYS COMMITTED TO SEE
10 THAT RIGHT OF WAY WAS PURCHASED DOING OUR PART. INCOME THREE,
11 THERE IS NO COMMITMENT THERE AND ITEM THREE SETS TO INCLUDE
12 CONSULTATION WITH MTC AND I DON'T THINK ANYBODY BELIEVES
13 ELECTRIFICATION ISN'T GOING TO TAKE A COMMITMENT FROM THIS
14 REGION AND IT'S GOING TO AFFECT ALL NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES AND
15 THIS CALTRAIN PROJECT IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO THE BAY AREA
16 AND WE ALL HAVE A STAKE. IT WOULD BE SHORT SIGHTED TO PUT ALL
17 THE HARD WORK WE HAVE DONE ON BUILDING THE BLUE RIBBON AND
18 BUILDING CONSENSUS WE CAN'T LOOK BACKWARDS ANYMORE. THIS IS
19 TIME FOR CHANGE AND THIS IMPORTANT OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE
20 COMMISSION TO STAND TALL AND SAY WE'RE GOING TO BE PART OF
21 THIS AND BE A PART OF THESE CHANGES AND SUPPORT ALL THESE
22 RECOMMENDATIONS. WE NEED RESOLUTION ON THE GOVERNANCE AND I
23 HOPE THIS TAKES US ONE STEP CLOSER TO DOING THAT. AND MR.
24 CHAIRMAN I RECOMMEND. I HOPE THE COMMITTEE MOVES ALL THREE OF
25 THESE RECOMMENDATIONS. THANK YOU.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH, I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONERS WORTH AND
5 SPERING AND PEDROZA. I REALLY HOPE THAT WE MOVE ALL THREE OF
6 THESE RECOMMENDATIONS. I THINK IT IS -- YOU KNOW, THIS WAS --
7 THE ORIGINAL AGREEMENT WAS LONG BEFORE MY TIME, AND I THINK I
8 WAS OUT OF COLLEGE AT THAT POINT, BUT IT'S NOT CLEAR. BUT I
9 THINK WHAT IS CLEAR IS THAT MTC WAS NOT A PARTY TO THAT
10 AGREEMENT. AND I THINK THAT AS WE, SORT OF, STANDS HERE TODAY
11 AFTER ALL THE WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE ON THE BLUE RIBBON, I
12 THINK THIS IS NOT MANAGE -- THAT THESE ARE THE TYPES OF
13 CONDITIONS, THIS KIND OF CLOSER INTEGRATION, THIS REAL FOCUS
14 ON HOW WE CAN KIND OF BEST LEVERAGE ALL OF OUR EXPERTISE AND
15 DELIVER PROJECTS ON TIME AND DELIVER A SYSTEM THAT WORKS FOR
16 RIDERS, I THINK WE NEED TO BE THINKING ABOUT HOW WE CAN BE
17 ENCOURAGING NOT JUST CALTRAIN BUT ALL OF OUR OPERATORS TO DO
18 THIS. AND I THINK THIS IS A FIRST STEP. I DON'T THINK THIS IS
19 SINGLING OUT CALTRAIN. I THINK THIS IS JUST THE FIRST STEP OF
20 THIS BECOMING WHAT I HOPE IS JUST, SORT OF, A MORE FREQUENT --
21 A MORE REGULAR WAY OF HOW WE DO BUSINESS.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BACK TO COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR
2 INDULGENCE. I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS THAT THIS
3 PROJECT IS IMPORTANT TO THE ENTIRE BAY AREA, BUT COMING FROM
4 WHERE I COME FROM, ON THE PENINSULA, YOU KNOW, I WOULD SAY --
5 I WOULD JUST SAY THAT THIS IS -- I WOULD SAY PRETTY
6 CONFIDENTLY, THAT THIS IS THE MOST IMPORTANT MAJOR PROJECT FOR
7 MY AREA, AND THE REAL CONCERN FOR US IS THAT IT MOVE AS
8 QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. GETTING CALTRAIN AND GOVERNANCE TOGETHER,
9 AS WELL AS ELECTRIFICATIONS, TO ME, THAT'S THE CONNECTION
10 THERE. BUT FOR ME, IT'S REALLY ABOUT GETTING THIS PROJECT
11 THAT'S ALREADY UNDERWAY, YOU KNOW, MOVING FORWARD AS QUICKLY
12 AS POSSIBLE. AND THAT'S REALLY MY CONCERN. YOU KNOW, I
13 APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS. I BELIEVE THAT CALTRAIN IS A PART OF
14 THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT CONVERSATIONS LEADERS. I THINK THEY'RE
15 ON THE COMMITTEE. SO I DON'T SEE WHAT THE REAL ISSUE IS THERE.
16 THEY'RE ALREADY THERE. THEY WILL CONTINUE TO PARTICIPATE. AND,
17 SO, I WOULD JUST LIKE TO, I GUESS, SIMPLIFY IT, AND KEEP IT AS
18 CLEAN AS POSSIBLE SO WE CAN MOVE IT FORWARD AS QUICKLY AS
19 POSSIBLE. AND I WOULD ALSO SAY I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS ABOUT
20 THIS MAYBE BEING THE FIRST STEP BUT MY QUESTION IS, ARE WE
21 GOING TO CONDITION EVERY PROJECT THAT MTC FUNDS WITH THESE
22 SAME CONDITIONS? AND THEN I WOULD ASK THAT QUESTION TO BE
23 DISCUSSED OR ANSWERED BEFORE WE START MAKING CONDITIONS.
24 THANKS.
25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND I SEE COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.
2
3 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I DEPARTMENT TO ASK A QUESTION OF
4 STAFF. I UNDERSTAND THE -- SO, TWO THINGS I JUST WANT TO BE
5 CLEAR WITH MY COLLEAGUES ABOUT. ONE S I CAN'T EMPHASIZE
6 ENOUGH, THAT ALMOST NONE OF US WERE AROUND WHEN THIS
7 AGREEMENT, WHEN THIS 19.6 WAS AGREED TO BETWEEN MTC AND THE
8 PARTIES. AND I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT MTC DO ITS BEST
9 TO CONVEY THAT RESOURCE TO SAMTRANS AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE AND
10 THAT THIS WAS AN AGREEMENT THAT WAS MADE LONG AGO, AND I
11 APPRECIATE THE POINTS, AND WE COULD TALK ALL DAY LONG ABOUT
12 WHO WAS PARTY TO WHAT BECAUSE FRANKLY THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE BEEN
13 DOING IN THE CALTRAIN GOVERNANCE MEETINGS AND IF ANYONE WANTS
14 TO JOIN. [LAUGHTER] OKAY. BUT, SO ONE S I DO THINK THIS IS
15 PART OF A PAST PARTNERSHIP. AND I KNOW, DIRECTOR SPERING, I DO
16 NOT BELIEVE IT IS BEING SHORT SIGHTED TO ASK MTC FULFILL AN
17 OBLIGATION IT MADE MANY YEARS AGO TO FRANKLY LEVEL SET WHERE
18 CALTRAIN IS RIGHT NOW IN TERMS OF HOW IT'S GOING TO MOVE
19 FORWARD. AND THE OTHER THING I'LL SAY IS THAT I'M NOT SURE IF
20 ITEM THREE ISN'T SIGNIFICANT, THEN WHY IT'S LISTED. I
21 UNDERSTAND THAT THE WAY THE STAFF -- AND I'LL JUST ASK AGAIN,
22 FOR THE STAFF TO BE CLEAR, THAT ITEM TWO IS -- I'M NOT SURE OF
23 THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THAT EITHER IN TERMS OF IT SAYING NOTHING
24 WE DO HERE WILL PRECLUDE US FROM CONTINUING TO DISCUSS ALL
25 OTHER ISSUES THAT MTC IS DISCUSSIONS WITH CALTRAIN AT THE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 TABLE FOR MAYBE THERE IS SOME COMPELLING REASON TO CODIFY THAT
2 AND MAYBE STAFF CAN EXPLAIN THAT. BUT ON ITEM THREE IT'S
3 AMBIGUOUS. I CAN'T EMPHASIZE THIS ENOUGH BUT THE AGREEMENTS
4 THAT GOT US TO THE CONFUSION THAT WE HAVE OVER CALTRAIN
5 GOVERNANCE WAS THE PART ROOTED IN A SERIES OF AMBIGUOUS
6 REQUESTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS THAT SOME OF THEM WERE NOT
7 CODIFIED IN WRITING. TO STAFF I'LL ASK TO RESPOND TO ITEM
8 THREE SPECIFICALLY WHAT IS THE EXPECTATION THAT YOU HAVE FOR
9 CALTRAIN RELATIVE TO THAT ITEM?

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN. LET ME TAKE THAT.
12 POINT NUMBER THREE HAS BEEN RAISED BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND A
13 NUMBER OF OTHERS. LET ME SAY, FIRST, WHAT IT'S NOT. I WOULD
14 SAY IT IS NOT A STATEMENT THAT WE WANT TO BE INVOLVED WITH THE
15 VERY DETAILED DISCUSSIONS HAPPENING RIGHT NOW ABOUT HOW STAFF
16 IS HIRED AND HOW THE, YOU KNOW, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR
17 CALTRAIN IS GOING TO BE, YOU KNOW, SELECTED AND MANAGED AND
18 THERE'S A WHOLE LOT, AS COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAID, ABOUT VERY
19 DETAILED INNER WORKINGS, AND NUMBER THREE WAS NOT INTENDED TO
20 TOUCH ANY OF THAT. IT WAS, IN OUR VIEW, AND, AGAIN, AS
21 COMMISSIONER -- AS CHAIR PEDROZA SAID, IT WAS THE, PERHAPS,
22 PROCEDURAL ACCOMPANIMENT TO NUMBER TWO WHICH WAS TO SAY WE
23 WANT TO MAKE SURE CALTRAIN IS AN ACTIVE AND WILLING
24 PARTICIPANT IN THE DISCUSSION ON REGIONAL GOVERNANCE. WE KNOW,
25 PARTICULARLY, THAT THE REGIONAL RAIL PLAN, YOU KNOW, WHICH



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 FOCUSES ON REGIONAL RAIL OPERATORS OF IMPORTANCE SUCH AS
2 CALTRAIN COME FORWARD IMPORTANT CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE
3 COMMISSION AND OUR PARTNERS THROUGHOUT REGION WE WANT TO USE
4 THIS OPPORTUNITY, IT'S IMPORTANT TO IMMORTALIZE THIS WE HAVE
5 COME A FAR STRETCH WITH THE BLUE RIBBON AND THIS IS A POINT TO
6 REINFORCE THE COMMISSION'S COMMITMENT THAT'S MY PERSPECTIVE.
7 NUMBER THREE WAS INTENDED TO BE THE, SORT OF, PROCEDURAL PIECE
8 OF THAT, AND I HAVE TALKED TO MICHELLE BOUCHARD, AND WE
9 RECOGNIZE THAT THE LANGUAGE WE HAVE IN THERE WE WERE REFERRING
10 TO SOME STEPS THAT HAVE NOT YET BEEN BE FINALIZED IN TERMS OF
11 THE JPB IN TERMS OF DISCUSSIONS BUT WE'RE WILLING TO WORK WITH
12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BOUCHARD TO COME UP WITH THE RIGHT
13 REFERENCE TO WHERE A CONVERSATIONS ON THE OUTCOME OF THE
14 GOVERNANCE DISCUSSIONS AND THE INTERSECTION WITH THE REGIONAL
15 GOVERNANCE DISCUSSIONS NEED TO HAPPEN. THAT WAS THE INTENT TO
16 MAKE SURE THAT THERE WAS A PLACE WHERE WE COULD RECOGNIZE
17 WHERE THOSE TWO JOIN AND THERE IS DIFFERENT LANGUAGE TO
18 ACCOMPLISH THAT. WE CAN LOOK TO WHAT THAT COULD LOOK LIKE
19 BETWEEN NOW AND THE COMMISSION.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** WHEN YOU'RE SPEAK OF REGIONAL GOVERNANCE, ARE
22 YOU SPEAKING OF MTC'S GOVERNANCE? OR ARE YOU SPEAKING ABOUT
23 REGIONAL GOVERNANCE OF ALL OF THE RAIL?

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THE SPEAKING ABOUT THE REGIONAL GOVERNANCE
2 DISCUSSIONS THAT ARE HAPPENING IN TWO FORUMS. ONE IS THE
3 NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE, WHICH WAS THE DIRECT OUTCOME
4 OF THE BLUE RIBBON WORK. THAT'S ONE FORUM. AND THAT HAS
5 LAUNCHED. AND AS WAS NOTED, CALTRAIN IS 1 OF 7 OPERATORS WHO
6 ARE ON A NETWORK ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR THAT PARTICULAR GROUP.
7 AND YOU KNOW, SO, AGAIN, THAT'S AN IMPORTANT RECOGNITION. THE
8 SECOND IS A REGIONAL RAIL GOVERNANCE STUDY THAT MTC HAD -- AND
9 THAT ALIX CAN REMIND ME -- I WANT TO SAY TWO YEARS AGO OR SO,
10 CALTRANS HAD APPROVED IT WAS A COMPETITIVE GRANT FOCUSING
11 AMONG OTHER THINGS, COORDINATION ON PROJECT DELIVERY AND OTHER
12 THINGS THAT OUR REGIONAL RAIL OPERATORS SHARE CONCERNS AND
13 POSSIBLE IMPROVEMENTS WITH. THAT IS ANOTHER ISSUE. BUT THE TWO
14 WE EXPECT THAT THOSE TWO PLACES ALSO HAVE AN INTERSECTION AND
15 WE'RE WORKING TO CLARIFY THAT WITH BOTH THE PARTICIPATING
16 PARTNERS AND THE COMMISSION. BUT, THOSE ARE THE ANTICIPATED
17 PLACES WHERE ACTIVE AND WILLING JPB PARTICIPATION WOULD BE
18 ASKED FOR.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYTHING ELSE, COMMISSIONER
21 CHAVEZ, BEFORE I GO TO OUR VICE CHAIR? NOT HEARING IT. I'LL GO
22 TO VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU THERESE. I APPRECIATE THE
25 CLARIFICATION HERE. AS I SEE IT, HERE, THE INCLUSION OF THESE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 TWO CONDITIONS IS SOMETHING THAT IS ACTUALLY HAPPENING AND IN
2 THE PROCESS. AND THERESE, MAYBE WE CAN HEAR FROM THE EXECUTIVE
3 DIRECTOR OF CALTRAIN, MICHELLE BOUCHARD, AS TO HER
4 PARTICIPATION IN THESE PLANS THAT ARE ALREADY UNDERWAY. BUT --
5 AND I HOPE WE DO HEAR FROM HER -- BUT I ALSO SEE THIS AS, WE
6 DEAL WITH A LOT OF BOARDS AND TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. THE
7 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AND THE MANAGERS ARE A PART OF THESE
8 ONGOING PROCESSES. AND I THINK BY THIS CONDITIONAL LANGUAGE
9 WE'RE ACTUALLY GIVING THEM A SUPPORT IN THEIR PARTICIPATION
10 ALONG THESE LINES. AND TO ANSWER COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, I
11 WOULD LIKE TO SEE MANY MORE OF THESE ON CONDITIONS APPLY TO ON
12 OTHER TRANSIT OPERATORS PROGRESSED AND FUNDING BECAUSE WE NEED
13 THAT COMMITMENT SOMETIMES WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET IT FROM THEIR
14 BOARDS. I THINK THE LANGUAGE IS IMPORTANT IN THAT COMMITMENT.
15 SO IT'S ON THE RECORD AS SUCH. AND I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM
16 MICHELLE BOUCHARD MORE CLARIFICATION AND WITH CALTRAIN GETTING
17 THROUGH THIS PROCESS TO MAKE SURE THIS HAPPENS AND THEY'RE
18 DONE WITH GOVERNANCE QUICKLY SO WE CAN GET ON TO
19 ELECTRIFICATION.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MICHELLE?

22

23 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** HELLO APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT
24 AND APPRECIATE HOW STAFF HAS BOILED DOWN THE ISSUE. I ALSO
25 APPRECIATED THERESE'S CONVERSATION WITH US, VERY QUICKLY, AS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 WE OURSELVES HAVE JUST RECENTLY HAD A GOVERNANCE DISCUSSION AT
2 THE CALTRAIN BOARD AS OF LAST THURSDAY. I WANT TO SAY
3 REGARDING THE SPECIFIC CONDITIONS PROPOSED BY STAFF, THE JPD
4 BOARD TOGETHER AS A WHOLE HAS NOT HAD OPPORTUNITIES TO REVIEW
5 AND CONTEMPLATE THEM. HAVING SAID THAT I WANT TO CONFIRM THAT
6 CALTRAIN HAS BEEN AND IS COMMITTED TO BEING AN ACTIVE
7 PARTICIPANT IN THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS ADVISORY
8 COMMITTEE, WHICH THERESE REFERENCED WHICH KICKED OFF ON MONDAY
9 IN EARNEST. AND I THINK THE SECOND THING IS THAT STAFF HAS
10 BEEN WORKING WITH MTC STAFF TO REALLY ORGANIZE ITSELF TO HAVE
11 A LEADERSHIP POSITION IN THE REGIONAL RAIL STUDY THAT, I
12 BELIEVE, ALIX'S TEAM IS MOVING FORWARD ON. AND I THINK IT'S
13 IMPORTANT TO SAY THAT -- AND THIS IS, SORT OF, A BIT OF A
14 SHAMELESS PLUG, BUT, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE TALKED AT THE CALTRAIN
15 BOARD AROUND THE IMPORTANCE OF RESOLVING THE GOVERNANCE ISSUE
16 IN MANY RESPECTS. BUT IN CERTAINLY WITH RESPECT TO PROVIDING
17 CALTRAIN STAFF THE ABLE TO MORE FULLY EMBARK WITH MTC OTHER
18 AND AGENCIES ON THE REGIONAL RAIL WORK. AND SO WITH RESPECT TO
19 THAT, WHEN I THINK ABOUT THE \$19.6 MILLION IT'S A FUNDAMENTAL
20 PRECONDITION TO BRING ABOUT THE RESOLUTION OF GOVERNANCE WHICH
21 WOULD ALLOW US TO MORE FULLY PARTICIPATE IN A LEADERSHIP ROLE
22 AT THE REGIONAL TABLE. I HOPE THAT'S HELPFUL.

23

24 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. APPRECIATE THAT VERY MUCH.
25 I'LL BRING IT BACK TO MY COLLEAGUES AND SEE IF THERE IS ANY



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 OTHER COMMENTS, QUESTIONS, OR CONCERNS. I WOULD JUST SAY FOR
2 MYSELF, IN THE DISCUSSION, I KNOW THAT TAKING CARE OF THIS
3 ISSUE IS AN IMPORTANT ONE AND ALIX, YOU DID A GREAT JOB OF
4 GOING THROUGH THE HISTORY AND DISTILLING IT TO THE FACTS. OFF
5 THE TABLE I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT ONE FOR SAMTRANS AND
6 CALTRAIN SO THAT'S POSITIVE. IN I A WAY I LOOK AT THE TWO
7 OTHER BULLET POINTS AFFIRMING IT'S WORK THAT'S DONE OR
8 UNDERWAY AND THE OTHER REALLY A COMMITMENT TO CONTINUED
9 COLLABORATION AND THEN I TRY TO UNDERSTAND AND LISTEN INTENTLY
10 WHY THOSE TWO WOULD BE PROBLEMATIC I DON'T SEE WHY THEY WOULD
11 BE IN MY OPINION. AND I'LL BE HONEST DO WE REALLY FUND MANY
12 THINGS WITHOUT SOME, SORT OF, CONDITION? AND EVEN IF THE
13 CONDITION IS RELATIVE TO CONTINUING TO HAVE REGIONAL
14 COLLABORATION, BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT WE'RE ALL ABOUT, AND YOU
15 KNOW, WITH THAT, I'M SUPPORTIVE OF STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION
16 GOING FORWARD. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK THAT THOSE PROHIBIT US
17 FROM DOING ANYTHING. JUST MAKE SURE -- WE WANT TO MAKE SURE
18 THAT WE'RE ALL AT THE TABLE WORKING TOGETHER FOR THE
19 BETTERMENT OF THE ENTIRE COMMUNITY GOING FORWARD. AND I THINK
20 THAT WE DO WANT TO FORAGE AHEAD AND WE DON'T WANT TO SLIP
21 BACKWARDS, AND I THINK WE HAVE MADE GREAT STRIDES BECAUSE OF
22 THE TIMING OF THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE AND THE OPPORTUNITY
23 THE PANDEMIC QUITE FRANKLY AFFORDED US. AND THERE IS SOME
24 POSITIVE -- THERE IS A LOT OF POSITIVE THERE IS THAT WOULD
25 COME OUT OF SOMETHING THAT WOULDN'T NECESSARILY BE KNOWN FOR



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THAT. SO WITH THAT, I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES AND ASK IF
2 THERE IS A MOTION TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ON THE
3 MTC'S CONTRIBUTION INVOLVEMENT IN THE RIGHT OF WAY REPAYMENT
4 TO SAMTRANS, NOTWITHSTANDING THE FACT THAT -- AND I'LL TURN IT
5 BACK TO ALIX. ALIX, GO AHEAD.

6

7 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I WANT TO CLARIFY, ARE YOU GOING TO TAKE THE
8 MOTION ON THIS THEN WE'LL GO BACK TO THE CALTRAIN
9 ELECTRIFICATION INFO UPDATE.

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** YES.

12

13 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I JUST WANTED TO GET CLARIFICATION.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** IF THAT'S OKAY WITH YOU. TO JUST WRAP UP
16 THIS THEN MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM IF THAT'S OKAY.

17

18 **AMY R. WORTH:** COMMISSIONER WORTH I'M HAPPY TO MAKE A MOTION TO
19 SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND AGAIN WITH APPRECIATION.
20 AND I REALLY AM HEARTENED TO HEAR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
21 BOUCHARD'S COMMENTS. THIS PAYMENT IS FOUNDATIONAL. IT'S AN
22 IMPORTANT PRECONDITION FOR THE AGREEMENTS, THESE GOVERNANCE
23 AGREEMENTS TO BE REACHED. SO, I AM VERY APPRECIATIVE, AND WILL
24 MAKE THAT MOTION.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AND I WILL SECOND THAT MOTION.

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. SO WE DO HAVE A MOTION AND A
4 SECOND. AND I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
5 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM INTO THE RECORD.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, MR. CHAIR, WE DID RECEIVE ONE WRITTEN
8 LETTER FROM CARTER MAU OF SAMTRANS, THAT IT'S BEEN POSTED TO
9 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND DISTRIBUTED VIA E-MAIL TO COMMISSIONERS.
10 DO YOU WANT TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME?

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. CALLER -- LET'S SEE. IT'S ALETA D,
15 PLEASE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF AND I WILL SHARE MY
16 SCREEN.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD
19 SHE AND HER. I SPEAK ON THE BASIC PRINCIPLE THAT DEBT CAN BE A
20 HINDRANCE AND AN ENCUMBRANCE TO MOVING FORWARD AND WE HAVE A
21 CHANCE TO CLEAR THE SLATE IF YOU WILL. I DON'T LIKE BORROWING
22 MONEY, AND I DON'T LIKE BEING OWED MONEY, AND I ADVOCATE THAT
23 THIS DEBT PAYMENT TO SAMTRANS WHICH GO TO SAMTRANS FREE AND
24 CLEAR SO THAT THE SAMTRANS BOARD CAN DO WHAT THEY SEE FIT WITH
25 IT. SAMTRANS HAS THEIR PRIORITIES. THEY ARE, AS YOU KNOW, A



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCY THAT PRIMARILY RUNS A BUS NETWORK THEY
2 HAVE USED ON OCCASION. I HAVEN'T USED IT MUCH BECAUSE I DON'T
3 GO TO THE PENINSULA MUCH. BUT IT'S VERY IMPORTANT. SO WHILE
4 CALTRAIN IS ALSO VERY IMPORTANT AND I DO USE IT FAIRLY OFTEN
5 IN THE BAY AREA, WE COULDN'T FORGET ABOUT SAMTRANS, ITSELF,
6 AND THEIR BUS SYSTEM. AND I AM SURE THAT THIS MONEY CAN GO
7 HELP TO PROGRAM THINGS THAT SAMTRANS NEEDS TO DO, SUCH AS
8 ENSURING THAT THE BUS SYSTEM RUNS AND PROVIDES SERVICE TO THE
9 PEOPLE OF THE SAMTRANS REGION AND BEYOND. SO, I FEEL THIS IS
10 WORTHY OF A YES VOTE. THE IDEA OF SIMPLIFYING THINGS AND
11 PAYING OFF DEBTS AND BUYING OUT OLD LEASES AND CONTRACTS IS
12 NOT NEW. LAST YEAR THE MTA IN NEW YORK, FINALLY BOUGHT THE
13 GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL FOR THEMSELVES FROM A LANGUAGE TIME
14 PRIVATE OWNER. SO LET'S MAKE IT HAPPEN. THANK YOU

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS M
17 CHAIR.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'LL BRING THAT BACK. AND
20 AGAIN I BIFURCATED THIS PARTICULAR ISSUE THAT COMMENTS WAS
21 STRICTLY ON THE FIRST FEAT AS WE MOVE ON THIS PIECE. WE HAVE A
22 MOTION AND SECOND AND PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO
23 CONDUCT ROLL CALL VOTE OF THE COMMITTEE.

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY WORTH SECOND BY GLOVER. CHAIR
2 RABBIT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

11

12 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ? IS ABSENT.
15 COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN IN.

24

25 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

3

4 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. WITH THE
9 INDULGENCES OF MY COLLEAGUES I'M GOING TO ASK -- I'M GOING TO
10 ASK OUR VICE CHAIR TO TAKE THE MEETING OVER AND RUN. WE HAVE A
11 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS SPECIAL MEETING THIS WEEK ALL WEEK. AND I
12 SNUCK OUT BUT I NEED TO GET BACK. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER
13 TO THE VICE CHAIR FOR THE CONTINUING ELECTRIC VACATION
14 CONVERSATION.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. OKAY. CONTINUING
17 ON WITH ELECTRIFICATION.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR PAPAN. WE'RE
20 GOING TO START BY HEARING A FEW OPENING COMMENTS FROM MICHELLE
21 BOUCHARD AND THEN WE'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO KENNETH.

22

23 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** THANKS SO MUCH FOR ALLOWING MYSELF AND MY
24 COLLEAGUES, TO SPEAK BEFORE THE PRESENTATION. BOTH OF THESE
25 TOPICS ARE KEY PRIORITIES FOR CALTRAIN GOVERNANCE AS WELL AS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THE ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAM MY NAME IS MICHELLE BOUCHARD
2 SERVING IN THE POSITION OF ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR
3 CALTRAIN AT WHAT IS A VERY EXCITING TIME IN THE LIFE OF THE
4 ORGANIZATION. AND, REALLY, IN TERMS OF THE ELECTRIFICATION
5 PROGRAM, WE ARE AT A CRITICAL JUNCTURE NEARING THE COMPLETION
6 OF THE CIVIL AND INFRASTRUCTURAL WORK WHICH WILL, HAVING
7 COMPLETED THAT REMOVES SIGNIFICANT PROJECT RISKS AND WE'RE ON
8 THE CUSP OF SOME VERY EXCITING MILESTONES WHICH INCLUDE THE
9 FINAL FOUNDATION. SO, MORE THAN 3,000 FOUNDATIONS HAVE BEEN
10 INSTALLED CORRIDOR WIDE. THE FINAL FOUNDATION IS GOING TO BE
11 IN PLACE THIS MONTH. IN THE SPRING, THE ELECTRIC TRAINS ARE
12 GOING TO ARRIVE ON PROPERTY, AND I WILL SAY, CASEY AND I BOTH
13 HAVE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO GO OUT TO THE COLORADO DESERT
14 WHERE THEY'RE BEING TESTED, AND I THINK THEY'RE GOING TO BE
15 JUST A MONUMENTAL INCREASE IN THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FOR
16 CALTRAIN RIDERS. AND THEN, YOU KNOW, FINALLY, THIS SUMMER, ALL
17 OF THE POLES, WIRES, WHICH CONSTITUTE THE TRACTION POWER
18 SYSTEM, ALSO THE FACILITIES, THEY WILL BE COMPLETED. SO WHILE
19 WE HAVE BEEN IN CONSTRUCTION SINCE 2017, WE ARE REACHING SOME
20 KEY MILESTONES. IT IS TO SAY THAT WE DO HAVE A LOT OF COMPLEX
21 WORK COMING UP, AND THAT NEXT PHASE HAS TO DO WITH THE SIGNAL
22 SYSTEM AND SYSTEMS INTEGRATION AS WELL AS TESTING AND
23 COMMISSIONING TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE REVENUE SERVICE IN THE
24 CORRIDOR. YOU MAY HAVE SEEN SOME REPORTS. WE HAVE GONE THROUGH
25 A PERIOD OF ASSESSMENT OVER THE COURSE OF THE LAST 90 DAYS,



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 AND WE HAVE BROUGHT IN NEW EXPERIENCED LEADERSHIP, AND
2 ADDITIONAL RESOURCES THAT BE DEDICATED TO THE PROJECT TO BRING
3 IT THROUGH THIS FINAL PHASE BRINGING US INTO REVENUE SERVICE
4 WHICH IS STILL TARGETED FOR SEPTEMBER 2024. I THINK EVERYONE
5 IS AWARE THAT AS PART OF THIS ASSESSMENT PROCESS, WE HAVE
6 ESTABLISHED A NEW BUDGET AND SO WE FIND OURSELVES IN NEED OF
7 \$410 MILLION FOR COMPLETION OF THE PROJECT. THIS COST INCREASE
8 ADDRESSES WHAT WE BELIEVE ARE THE PROJECT'S MOST SIGNIFICANT
9 RISKS AND OUTSTANDING CLAIMS. AND WE ARE CONFIDENT ABOUT OUR
10 PROJECT'S PATH FORWARD. TO FILL THE FUNDING GAP, AND I KNOW
11 THIS IS WHAT KENNETH IS GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT LARGELY,
12 WE'RE SEEKING STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES AND WE
13 HAVE HAD VERY POSITIVE CONVERSATIONS WITH OUR FEDERAL AND
14 STATE DELEGATION, GOVERNOR, AND BIDEN ADMINISTRATION
15 OFFICIALS. AND IT'S BECAUSE THIS PROJECT -- AND I APPRECIATE
16 EVERYONE ACKNOWLEDGING ITS IMPORTANCE FOR THE REGION, ALSO
17 IMPORTANT FOR THE STATE, HITS ON THESE KEY PRIORITIES OF
18 REDUCING GREENHOUSE GASSES WITH THE REPLACEMENT OF DIESEL
19 TRAINS CREATING JOBS, WHICH THIS PROJECT HAS DONE IN 28 STATES
20 ACROSS THE COUNTRY. YOU KNOW, WE ARE MORE THAN SHOVEL READY.
21 WE HAVE HAD SHOVELS IN THE GROUNDS FOR FOUR YEARS. WE HAVE
22 DEVELOPED A GROUND SWELL OF GREAT PUBLIC AND PRIVATE PARTNERS
23 WHO ARE CONTINUING TO SUPPORT THE PROJECT. AND OF COURSE, WE
24 ARE PROVIDING THE KEY FOUNDATION FOR FUTURE HIGH SPEED RAIL IN
25 THE CORRIDOR. THE KEY FOCUS OF THE TEAM, WE TALKED ABOUT THE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 \$410 MILLION, OUR DIRECTION FROM THE CALTRAIN BOARD IS TO
2 PRIORITIZE FUNDING THAT WILL REPLACE WHAT IS THIS, \$200
3 MILLION SUPER CONTINGENCY, WHICH I AM SURE KENNETH WILL TALK
4 ABOUT. AND MTC, AMONGST OTHER THREE PARTNERS IS ONE OF THE
5 PARTNERS TO THE TUNE OF \$50 MILLION. WE DO NEED TO SECURE
6 THOSE REPLACEMENT FUNDS. THEY ARE NOT NEEDED IMMEDIATELY. THEY
7 WILL BE NEEDED WITHIN THE NEXT 18 MONTHS, YEAR AND A HALF.
8 AND, SO TO TURN IT OVER TO KENNETH, I JUST WANT TO REMIND
9 EVERYBODY, AND, FRANKLY, WHEN WE TALK ABOUT IT AS A PROJECT
10 TEAM, IT BARE'S REMINDING OURSELVES WHILE IT HAS BEEN A
11 PROCESS AND SOMETIMES A SLOG, WE'RE BUILDING A
12 TRANSFORMATIONAL PROJECT AND IT IS UNIQUE IN THE LIFE OF ANY
13 RAIL VOTE BUT SOMEWHERE IN THE LIFE OF A 150-YEAR-OLD RAILROAD
14 WHICH WE ARE, AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO SHARING THESE
15 MILESTONES WITH YOU CERTAINLY WHEN THE FIRST VEHICLE SHOWS UP.
16 I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE SOME BACKGROUND
17 CONTEXT AND WITH THAT, KENNETH, I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO YOU
18 FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE PRESENTATION. AND, AGAIN, THANK YOU
19 FOR LETTING ME ATTEND THIS MEETING. I APPRECIATE IT.

20

21 **KENNETH FOLAN:** IF YOU CAN PULL UP THE SLIDE PRESENTATION TO
22 SLIDE NUMBER SEVEN. THANKS. I THINK THAT MICHELLE WENT THROUGH
23 A LOT OF THIS SO I'LL TRY TO GO THROUGH AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE
24 AND HIT ON THE KEY POINTS. HERE IS A SNAPSHOT OF THE PROJECT.
25 AND, JUST TO NOTE, I THINK SHE MAY HAVE SAID IT, BUT THIS IS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 RETIRING DIESEL TRAINS FROM EVERYDAY USE FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO
2 SAN JOSE GETTING READY FOR HIGH SPEED RAIL. SO IT'S IMPORTANT
3 TO GET THESE ELECTRIFICATION CARS UP AND RUNNING. AND THERE IS
4 A SNAPSHOT OF THE CARS, IF YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE,
5 PLEASE. WE WANTED TO PROVIDE YOU A SNAPSHOT OF THE EXISTING
6 PRECOST INCREASE FUNDING PLAN, THE \$2 BILLION PLAN THAT YOU
7 SEE HERE. A NOTE THAT THERE IS A LOT OF PARTNERS HERE, BUT THE
8 FEDERAL CONTRIBUTION IS ROUGHLY 50%. THE STATE CONTRIBUTION
9 THROUGH VARIOUS SOURCES IS ANOTHER 40%. SO THERE ARE REALLY
10 BIG PLAYERS IN THIS PROJECT. THAT'S WHY FDA HAS BEEN SO
11 INVOLVED WITH THE PROJECT AND THE PROJECT TEAM AND DOING THE
12 RISK ASSESSMENT THAT LED TO THIS COST INCREASE DISCUSSION.
13 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. MICHELLE DIDN'T MENTION SOME OF THE KEY
14 REASONS FOR THE OVERRUN THAT, IN NOTED ON THE SITE CONDITIONS,
15 THAT FOUNDATIONS IN POLES ARE BEGINNING TO MOVE TO WHERE
16 THEY'RE CLOSE TO COMPLETION. SO, THE DISPUTE WITH THE
17 CONTRACTOR, THAT IS WHAT WENT TO THEIR BOARD, THE CALTRAIN
18 BOARD, LAST MONTH, AND WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE TO GET INTO
19 SOME DETAILS ABOUT THAT. SO, AGAIN, THE COST OVERRUN AT \$462
20 MILLION. THERE IS -- THAT'S A 23% INCREASE. NO CHANGE TO THE
21 REVENUE SERVICE. THIS HAS BEEN ADOPTED BY THE CALTRAIN BOARD
22 AND THEY'RE MOVING FORWARD A WITH A GLOBAL SETTLEMENT. NEXT
23 SLIDE, PLEASE. ON THE FUNDING STRATEGY THE SECURED AMOUNT
24 AGAINST THE 462 MILLION IS THE \$52 MILLION THAT CAME AS PART
25 OF THE FEDERAL RECOVERY ACT, THE LAST ONE. SO, THAT LEAVES



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CASH FLOW THROUGH JUNE OF 2023. THERE ARE SOME FUND SOURCES
2 LISTED HERE THAT WILL BE CANDIDATE SOURCES, AND, AGAIN, THE
3 FINAL, THE 200 MILLION AT THE BOTTOM OF THE SCREEN THERE, MTC
4 DID PASS A RESOLUTION MANY YEARS AGO, RESOLUTION 4267 THAT
5 COMMITTED UP TO \$50 MILLION AS PART OF THAT SUPER CONTINGENCY.
6 BUT AS MICHELLE NOTED, WE ARE ALL GOING TO BE WORKING TOGETHER
7 TO TRY TO SECURE FEDERAL AND STATE FUNDS SO THAT THAT \$200
8 MILLION CONTINGENCY IS NOT HAVE TO BE MET BY THE LOCAL
9 AGENCIES, INCLUDING OURSELVES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I THINK,
10 KIND OF, BRINGING THIS BACK TO SOME OF THE REGIONAL EFFORT
11 THAT IS MOVING FORWARD AT THE MOMENT, WE CAME TO YOU IN
12 SEPTEMBER OF LAST YEAR WITH AN IDEA ABOUT MOVING FORWARD WITH
13 A MEGA PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY. AND AT THAT POINT YOU SAID
14 TO GO FOR IT; IT'S NEEDED. AND WE SHOULD KEEP MOVING. I YOU
15 THINK PILLAR FOUNDATIONS FOR THIS ARE FUNDING PROGRAMS THAT
16 WOULD GO WITH A POLICY, SOME OF THE POLICY ANCHORS THAT YOU
17 TALKED ABOUT EARLIER TODAY WITH THE HOUSING AND TRANSIT
18 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT. AND THEN FINALLY, MAYBE MOST IMPORTANT
19 RELATED TO THIS PROJECT IS SOME, SORT OF, A RISK MANAGEMENT
20 STRATEGY THAT WORKS WITH THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT AND OTHER
21 FUNDING PARTNERS TO MAKE SURE WE IDENTIFY RISK ON PROJECTS
22 EARLIER, AND IN A WAY THAT WE CAN MAKE SURE THAT THOSE RISKS
23 DON'T TURN INTO PROJECT DELAYS AS WELL AS COST INCREASES. SO,
24 WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT THAT. IF YOU
25 COULD GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? AS PART OF THE NEXT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 STEPS HERE WHAT WE ARE RECOMMENDING RELATED TO THE CAPITAL
2 PROJECT DELIVERY AND THE MEGA PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY IS TO
3 BRING FORWARD THE CONCEPT A WORKSHOP IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF
4 MONTHS THAT WE WOULD ADDRESS SPECIFICALLY THE RAIL CAPITAL
5 PROJECT DELIVERY AS WELL AS THE GOVERNANCE, THAT TIES IN
6 GOVERNANCE STUDY AS WELL. I THINK WE STILL PLAN TO DO THAT.
7 THE SECOND BULLET HERE IS COVERED BY THE VOTE THAT YOU DID
8 EARLIER SO THAT IS IN A NUTSHELL WHERE WE'RE AT. BUT WE LOOK
9 FORWARD TO COMING BACK TO YOU WITH THIS WORKSHOP IN THE COMING
10 MONTHS, BUT I'LL LEAVE IT BACK TO YOU, VICE CHAIR.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KENNETH. I'M GOING TO OPEN
13 THIS UP FOR THE COMMITTEE NOW. DO WE HAVE ANY COMMITTEE
14 MEMBERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS ANYTHING PRESENTED? OKAY. I
15 SEE VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, PLEASE?

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU FOR COMING IN AND TALKING TO US
18 ABOUT THIS. YOU KNOW, THIS IS OBVIOUSLY AN UNFORTUNATE
19 SITUATION WITH THE PROJECT GOING SO OVER BUDGET EVEN MORE
20 UNFORTUNATELY, NOT A UNIQUE SITUATION. AND THERE ARE MANY
21 PROJECTS IN THIS REGION THAT ARE SIMILARLY MEGA THAT ARE GOING
22 OVER BUDGET. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE MICHELLE AND KENNETH, HOW
23 OPEN AND TRANSPARENT YOU HAVE BEEN WITH THIS COMMISSION ABOUT
24 THE CHALLENGES THAT YOU'RE FACING. AND I THINK THAT'S AS MUCH
25 AS THE PUBLIC COULD LOSE FAITH IN OUR ABILITY TO DELIVER



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PROJECTS, BEING OPEN AND TRANSPARENT WHEN THEY DO GO OVER
2 BUDGET AND NOT TRYING TO HIDE THE EIGHT BALL IS ESSENTIAL AND
3 REALLY REBUILDING OR KEEPING WHATEVER FAITH WE HAVE WITH THE
4 PUBLIC. AND MY COMMENTS, YOU KNOW, THIS IS NOT THE FIRST TIME
5 THIS PROJECT HAS GONE OVER BUDGET. AND THIS IS NOT THE ONLY
6 PROJECT THAT IS GOING OVER BUDGET AND WE REALLY NEED TO DEAL
7 WITH THIS PROBLEM. LIKE, WE CANNOT BE IN A POSITION WHERE
8 PROJECT AFTER PROJECT, THEY ARE COMING IN COSTING BILLIONS OF
9 DOLLARS MORE, HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS MORE THAN HAD
10 BEEN INITIALLY BUDGETED. THE VOTERS WHO ARE PUTTING MONEY UP
11 FOR THESE PROJECTS AND IT'S NOT RIGHT FOR THE PROJECTS IN THE
12 REGION THAT ARE GOING TO HAVE TO TAKE A BACK SEAT AS WE TRY
13 AND FIND THE MONEY TO COMPLETE THESE PROJECTS THAT ARE ALREADY
14 HAPPENING. IT'S INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT THAT WE COMPLETE THIS
15 PROJECT AS WELL AS MANY OF THE OTHER PROJECTS THAT ARE GOING
16 OVER BUDGET BUT WE HAVE TO FIND A WAY TO MAKE SURE THIS REALLY
17 DOESN'T HAPPEN IN THE SAME WAY IN THE FUTURE. AND I HOPE
18 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT AS PART OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
19 DISCUSSIONS AS PART OF THE REGIONAL GOVERNANCE DISCUSSIONS AS
20 PART OF THIS WORKSHOP, BEYOND, PART OF LEGISLATION, WHATEVER
21 IT NEEDS THAT WE CAN REALLY DO SOMETHING TO DEAL WITH WHAT I
22 THINK IS, LIKE, A REAL COST CRISIS IN OUR TRANSPORTATION
23 PROJECTS AND IMPACTING OUR ABILITY TO DELIVER ON OUR REGIONAL
24 GOALS TO THE PUBLIC.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM COMMITTEE
2 MEMBERS? I WANT TO POINT OUT, MISTAKES HAVE BEEN MADE IN THE
3 PAST, AND HOPEFULLY, LOOKING AT CALTRAIN, THEY HAVE RESOLVED
4 THOSE ISSUES, AND THIS S AGAIN, AS YOU NOTED, TRANSPARENT. SO
5 THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WE WANT TO FOLLOW MOVING FORWARD HERE.
6 AND HOPEFULLY NO FURTHER INCREASES. WE CAN ALWAYS BE HOPEFUL.
7 BUT, THE REALITY IS, A LOT OF THESE THINGS GO OVER. AND I
8 THINK THE WHOLE IDEA OF HAVING EVERYBODY COME TOGETHER IS SO
9 THAT WE DON'T REPEAT MISTAKES FROM THE PAST. AND HOPEFULLY WE
10 CAN GET MORE EFFICIENT AND MORE ACCURATE AND REDUCE COSTS
11 SOMEWHERE ALONG THE LINE. SO LOOKING FORWARD TO ALL OF THAT.
12 SEEING NO OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS. OKAY. WE HAVE ONE
13 ATTENDEE. OPENING IT UP TO THE PUBLIC. ALETA DUPREE, PLEASE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU GINA PAPAN, CHAIR. ALETA DUPREE, SHE AND
16 HER FOR THE RECORD. THANK YOU FOR BRINGING UP THE CALTRAIN
17 PROJECT IT'S NEAR AND DEAR TO ME AND THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME
18 KNOW THAT THE LAST FOUNDATION IS GOING TO BE SET SOON. PERHAPS
19 WE SHOULD PAINT IT GOLD. WE'LL HAVE A GOLDEN FOUNDATION.
20 BECAUSE FOUNDATIONS ARE FOUNDATIONAL. AND WE CAN'T HAVE A
21 RAILROAD WITHOUT FOUNDATIONS. AND I AM SAD WITH ANY PROJECT
22 WHEN I SEE IT GO OVER BUDGET BUT BECAUSE WE CAN'T PREDICT THE
23 FUTURE, I DO ACCEPT THE UNFORTUNATE POSSIBILITY THAT THINGS GO
24 OVER BUDGET. I WISH IT WASN'T SO. JUST AS WHEN I FLY ON
25 AIRPLANES, TURBULENCE ON AIRPLANES IS PRETTY MUCH INEVITABLE.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 I WISH IT WASN'T SO. BUT IT'S TRUE. AND I'M AFRAID OF FLYING
2 ON AIRPLANES AND I HAVE FLOWN 16 TIMES LAST YEAR. THE THING IS
3 WHEN THESE ISSUES COME UP, THE SO-CALLED TURBULENCE WITH THE
4 INCREASE OF COST IN PROJECTS AND I AM SURE COVID HAS HAD A LOT
5 TO DO WITH IT, BUT NOBODY BACK IN 2017 ENVISIONED COVID COMING
6 OUT WHEN WE LAID THE FIRST FOUNDATION FOR THIS NEW ELECTRIC
7 RAILWAY. SEE WE CERTAINLY HAVE TO KEEP OUR EYES ON ALL OF
8 THIS, EXPECT EVERYONE TO PERFORM AT THIS HIGHEST LEVEL. BUT
9 IT'S KIND OF LIKE AIRPLANES, WE COULDN'T PREDICT THE FUTURE.
10 TURBULENCE IS INEVITABLE, BUT IT'S NOT UNSAFE. SO AS WE
11 NAVIGATE THIS WITH OUR PROJECTS, IT'S NOT UNSAFE. IT CAN BE
12 UNCOMFORTABLE, BUT I THINK WE JUST HAVE TO BE DILIGENT IN
13 EVERYBODY WE DO TO MITIGATE COST INCREASES. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS, MADAM
16 CHAIR.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO. THERE WAS NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT
21 RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM, WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE ONES
22 PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED FROM CARTER MAU.

23

24 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. I'M NOT SURE IF THIS IS AN ACTION
25 ITEM.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THIS PORTION OF THE ITEM IS INFORMATION
3 ONLY.

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** OKAY GREAT. WELL, WE HOPE THAT WE GET
6 ANOTHER UPDATE AND EVERYTHING'S MOVING FULL SPEED AHEAD
7 BECAUSE THAT'S THE ONE THING WE HAVE MAJOR AGREEMENT O WE ALL
8 WANT TO SEE THIS HAPPEN. MOVING TO ITEM FIVE CALIFORNIA
9 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND STATE PROGRAM FUNDINGS UPDATE.
10 FINALLY, KENNETH?

11

12 **KENNETH KAO:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. ITEM FOR THE CTC
13 UPDATE IS IN YOUR PACKET GIVEN OF THE TIME. I'M HERE TO ANSWER
14 ANY QUESTIONS.

15

16 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS ON OUR AGENDA. NATHAN
17 MILEY.

18

19 **NATHAN MILEY:** I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF FOR SUPPORT OF FUNDING
20 THE PRESS LANE PROJECT. I JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT FOR
21 ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THANK YOU SO VERY
22 MUCH FOR FULL FUNDING SO WE COULD COMPLETE THIS PROJECT.

23



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER MILEY. ANY OTHER
2 COMMISSIONERS? OKAY. MOVING ON. DO I SEE ANY? OKAY. ANY PUBLIC
3 COMMENTS RELATED TO THIS?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS AND I HAVE RECEIVED
6 NOTHING IN WRITING.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY. OKAY
9 MOVING ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT. COMMENT ON ANY BUSINESS NOT
10 PREVIOUSLY BEFORE US. DO WE SEE, FIRST OFF, ANY WRITTEN
11 CORRESPONDENCE FROM THE PUBLIC?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM.
14 AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AT
15 THIS TIME.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. MOVING RIGHT ALONG ITEM SIX
18 ADJOURNMENT. OUR NEXT MEETING WILL BE WEDNESDAY FEBRUARY 9TH,
19 2022 AT 9:45 A.M. THANK YOU EVERYBODY FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION.
20 HAVE A LOVELY DAY. [MEETING ADJOURNED]

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29



Broadcasting Government