

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 12, 2022 9:35 AM**
4
5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. THIS IS AMY WORTH.
6 I AM CHAIR OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE.
7 I AM JOINED BY OUR VICE CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA. AND IT'S MY
8 PLEASURE TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER. FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO
9 BEGIN WITH THE ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE. [RECORDED MEETING
10 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE
11 CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF
12 ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE
13 BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE.
14 THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND
15 OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND
16 STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
17 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS
18 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO
19 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
20 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE
21 OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
22 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
23 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED
24 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT,
25 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M.,
2 YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED
3 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF
4 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE
5 TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
6 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
7 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD
8 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE
9 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
10 TO DATE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU ARE MUTED.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU KIMBERLY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
15 THAT. NOW I WOULD LIKE TO INVITE EVERYBODY TO JOIN TOGETHER
16 WITH THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. AND MAY I TURN TO OUR SAN MATEO
17 CITIES COMMISSIONER FOR TO LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE OF
18 ALLEGIANCE. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I
21 PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
22 AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
23 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL." THANK YOU SO
24 MUCH FOR THAT. NOW, I WOULD LIKE -- EXCUSE ME -- GOING
25 BACKWARDS. I JUMPED AHEAD OF THE ROLL CALL, FORGIVE ME,



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 KIMBERLY. MAY WE PLEASE HAVE THE ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM THE
2 QUORUM?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. COMMITTEE CHAIR WORTH?

5

6 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMITTEE VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY?

17

18 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILE?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT IS ABSENT. RONEN?

4

5 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I'LL TURN TO COMMISSIONER GLOVER. I SEE YOU
10 HAVE YOUR HAND UP.

11

12 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SORRY ABOUT THAT.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THAT'S FINE. SOMETIMES THESE COMPUTERS HAVE
15 A LIFE OF THEIR OWN. WE HAVE HAD THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE,
16 LET'S MOVE TO THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM
19 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD
20 HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING
21 ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS
22 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR
23 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. MOVING TO THE
2 CONSENT CALENDAR. FIRST I WANT TO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS
3 OF THE COMMITTEE OR STAFF WHO WOULD LIKE TO REMOVE ANYTHING
4 FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR? OKAY. SEEING NONE. THEN LET ME TURN
5 TO OUR CLERK. HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC CORRESPONDENCE WITH
6 REGARDS TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
9 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
10 ON THIS ITEM.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THEN I WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO
13 ADOPT THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** MOVE APPROVAL.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOVED BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** SECOND.

20

21 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. OKAY.
22 KIMBERLY, MAY WE PLEASE HAVE A ROLL CALL FOR THE CONSENT
23 CALENDAR?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. CHAIR WORTH?



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

13

14 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

17

18 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT IS ABSENT.

25 COMMISSIONER RONEN? ROAN YES.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
3 MEMBERS PRESENT.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER
6 FASTRAK REGIONAL CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER BATA PRICES CONTRACT
7 EXTENSION WITH CONDUENT STATE LOCAL AND SOLUTIONS IN THE
8 AMOUNT OF \$286,823,382. SO, MAY I TURN TO STAFF FOR THE REPORT
9 ON THAT ITEM? TURN TO BETH ZELINSKI, I BELIEVE IS OUR STAFF
10 MEMBER WHO IS GOING TO BE PRESENTING THIS ITEM.

11

12 **BETH ZELINSKI:** YES. GOOD MORNING. GOOD MORNING. THIS IS BETH
13 ZELINSKI WITH BATA STAFF. AND THIS ITEM IS TO ENTER INTO A
14 CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER WITH CONDUENT STATE AND LOCAL SOLUTIONS
15 FOR NEW PRICES FOR THE BATA AET INVOICES AND VIOLATIONS AND TO
16 EXTEND THE CONTRACT TERM TO SEPTEMBER 2027 IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO
17 EXCEED 286,200 -- THIS PROVIDES PARTIAL REIMBURSEMENT OF
18 DEFENSE COST FOR RECENT ONGOING LITIGATION IN JANUARY OF 2021
19 BATA DEPLOYED AET ON SEVEN STATE BRIDGES WHILE IN OPERATION ON
20 THE GOLDEN GATE PRIVILEGE NEW PRICES ARE PROPOSED FOR BATA AET
21 TO SUPPORT DIFFERENT OPERATING CONDITIONS. BATA BRIDGES DO
22 HAVE A MORE DIVERSE CUSTOMER BASE. WE'RE SEEING LONGER CALL
23 TIMES. WE REQUIRE MORE NON-ENGLISH SUPPORT SERVICES. THERE HAS
24 BEEN MORE INCOMING AND OUTGOING MAIL, AND A HIGH OUT OF STATE
25 IMAGE REVIEW AND DMV LOOK UP COST. IN ADDITION WE HAVE NEW KEY



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 POSITIONS THAT ARE BEING ADDED TO THE CONTRACT WHICH WILL
2 INCREASE QUALITY MONITORING AND TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER SERVICE.
3 AT THIS TIME BATA'S AET OPERATION ALSO HAS A LOWER PERCENTAGE
4 OF FASTRAK TRANSACTIONS THAN THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE OPERATION.
5 SO ALL OF THESE ITEMS CONTRIBUTE TO HIGHER OPERATING COSTS.
6 THE NEW PROPOSED PRICES ARE 79, \$0.06 PER TRANSACTION FOR
7 INVOICE TRANSACTIONS AND 1.613, \$4 PER VIOLATION THESE WOULD
8 BE RETROACTIVE TO JANUARY 1ST, 2021 WHEN THE AET BEGAN. THE
9 NEW PRICING STRUCTURE INCLUDES TIERING SO THAT AS BATA
10 RECEIVES GREATER MARKET SHARES THE VIOLATIONS AND INVOICE
11 VIOLATION PRICES WILL DECREASE FOR COST SAVINGS CAN BE
12 ACHIEVED TO ACHIEVE THIS GREATER MARKET SHARE BATA PLANS TO
13 DEPLOY A TOLL DIFFERENTLY WITH HIGHER TOTAL AMOUNTS FOR
14 INVOICE AND LICENSE PLATE CUSTOMERS BATA WILL COME BACK TO THE
15 COMMITTEE IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS TO PRESENT THE PLAN FOR
16 A TOLL DIFFERENTLY AND WE ANTICIPATE THE PLAN WILL INCLUDE
17 IMPLEMENTING MORE ROBUST METHODS TO SUPPORT CASH PAYING
18 CUSTOMERS. SO BATA STAFF IS ALSO REQUESTING A THREE AND A HALF
19 YEAR CONTRACT EXTENSION TO SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2027. THE ORIGINAL
20 CONTRACT HAD A BASE OPERATING TERM OF FIVE YEARS UNTIL
21 SEPTEMBER 2019 AND THEN UP TO TEN YEARS OF ANNUAL EXTENSIONS
22 TO 2029. AND THE COMMITTEE APPROVED A TWO AND A HALF YEAR
23 EXTENSION IN 2018, AND A TWO YEAR EXTENSION LAST JULY, 2021,
24 BRINGING THE CURRENT TERM TO MARCH 2024. SO WE'RE NOW
25 REQUESTING ANOTHER THREE AND A HALF YEAR EXTENSION TO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 SEPTEMBER 2027 AND THIS IS ALL WITHIN THE ALLOWABLE TEN YEAR
2 EXTENSION OPTIONS. THIS EXTENSION WILL ALLOW STAFF TIME TO
3 PLAN AND IMPLEMENT NEW PROCUREMENTS FOR THE CSC. THE CSC
4 PROCUREMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION IS A SIGNIFICANT EFFORT, AND IT
5 WILL REQUIRE A LOT OF COORDINATION WITH INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL
6 PARTNERS AND SEVERAL YEARS TO TEST AND DEPLOY A NEW SYSTEM.
7 AND WE CONTINUE TO MONITOR THE TOLLING INDUSTRY FOR
8 IMPROVEMENTS AND INNOVATIONS IN THE WAY TOLL SERVICES ARE
9 DELIVERED AND WE WOULD PLAN TO INCORPORATE THOSE INTO ANY --
10 TO THE UPCOMING PROCUREMENTS. AND THEN FINALLY AS PART OF THIS
11 CONTRACT EXTENSION, CONDUENT HAS AGREED TO PAY BATA AND THE
12 GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE AIR DISTRICT \$7.6 MILLION AND BATA AND
13 GOLDEN GATE WILL USE THIS TO OFFSET DEFENSE COSTS FOR RECENT
14 AND ONGOING LITIGATION. AND THEN GOING FORWARD CONDUENT HAS
15 AGREED TO CONTRIBUTE 50% TOWARD LEGAL FEES UP TO A TOTAL OF
16 \$2.4 MILLION AND THESE COMBINED PAYMENTS ARE DEEMED
17 SATISFACTION OF CONDUENT'S CONTRACTUAL OBLIGATION TO COVER
18 LEGAL COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH THE RECENT SALYANI AND ENRI TOLL
19 BRIDGES LITIGATION CASES. STAFF RECOMMENDS THE COMMITTEE
20 AUTHORIZE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE AND ENTER INTO A
21 CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$286,823,382
22 TO SUPPORT THE NEW PRICES FOR BATA INVOICES AND VIOLATIONS AND
23 TO EXTEND THE CONTRACT TO SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2027. AND WITH THAT,
24 I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.
25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, BETH. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT
2 REPORT. AND I WANT TO BEGIN BY THANKING ALL OF OUR STAFF FOR
3 YOUR TREMENDOUS WORK ON THIS CONTRACT. ADDRESSING CURRENT
4 ISSUES AND ANTICIPATING THE FUTURE AS WE LOOK TO PROVIDING OUR
5 TOLLING AND OUR SERVICES FOR THE BRIDGES. SO, THANK YOU SO
6 MUCH FOR THAT. AND I, FIRST OF ALL, WANT TO COME TO THE
7 COMMITTEE TO ASK IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR STAFF? I'M
8 GOING TO LOOK AROUND. IF I CAN EITHER SEE HAND UP? YES. LET ME
9 TURN TO COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

10

11 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND I RECOGNIZE THIS IS AN AMAZING
12 BULK OF WORK. SO I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE IT. COULD YOU JUST
13 TAKE A MINUTE TO EXPLAIN THE COST -- AND I'M SORRY I'M A
14 LITTLE NEW TO THIS, BUT THE INVOICES PRICES AND THE NOTICE
15 PRICES AS THEY RELATE TO THE OVERALL CONTRACT -- I'M SORRY --
16 BUDDY! (DOG BARKING) -- IN PARTICULAR, I WANT TO BETTER
17 UNDERSTAND HOW IT'S INTEGRATED INTO THE OVERALL PRICING AND
18 WHAT THE COST INCREASE IS RELATED TO.

19

20 **BETH ZELINSKI:** SO, THE INVOICES AND THE VIOLATIONS ARE
21 PROBABLY AROUND 25% OF THE CONTRACT. THE BULK OF OUR
22 TRANSACTIONS ARE FASTRAK AND, AS WE SAID, WE WANT TO INCREASE
23 THAT GOING FORWARD, AND SO, YOU KNOW, THESE ARE PROBABLY ABOUT
24 A TEN OR 15% INCREASE ON THOSE PRICES FROM THE CURRENT PRICES.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND SO IS THAT -- IS THAT -- BECAUSE I READ IN
2 THE STAFF REPORT, IT COMPARES THE UTILIZATION RELATIVE TO
3 FASTRAK TO GOLDEN GATE AND, SO, I GUESS WHAT I'M TRYING TO
4 UNDERSTAND IS, IF YOU COULD JUST BE VERY EXPLICIT ABOUT THE --
5

6 **BETH ZELINSKI:** OH, THE MARKET SHARE? RIGHT.
7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES I'M HAVING A HARD TIME DIGESTING THAT. THANK
9 YOU.
10

11 **BETH ZELINSKI:** SO THE MARKET SHARE IS A LITTLE UNDER 80% RIGHT
12 NOW, AND SO, GOLDEN GATE'S MARKET SHARE IS AROUND 90% FASTRAK,
13 AND SO, YES, SO, WE'RE QUITE A BIT LOWER THAN THEY ARE. AND IT
14 DOES INCREASE THE BURDEN ON THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. YOU
15 KNOW, INVOICE, TRANSACTIONS, AND INVOICE CUSTOMERS, AND
16 VIOLATIONS REQUIRE A LOT MORE WORK TO HANDLE THOSE CUSTOMERS.
17 IN ADDITION, THESE ARE JUST COSTLY PROCESSING WORK. THERE IS A
18 LOT OF MAIL, A LOT OF POSTAGE, A LOT MORE EXPLANATION ONCE
19 PEOPLE BECOME CUSTOMERS THEY UNDERSTAND THE SYSTEM BETTER. AND
20 TYPICALLY, HANDLING THEIR ACCOUNT, IT'S MORE AUTOMATED. SO
21 THAT'S WHAT WE'RE SEEING.
22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** COULD YOU TELL US A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT
24 RELATIVE TO A DISCUSSION MAYBE TO A MEETING OR TWO AGO AROUND
25 DIFFERENT STRATEGIES TO ASSIST CUSTOMERS AND PAYING AND



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ACTUALLY BECOMING FASTRAK MEMBERS? AND WHAT I'M PARTICULARLY
2 INTERESTED THIS IS, GIVEN THE LENGTH OF THIS CONTRACT HOW
3 THOSE CHANGES COULD OR COULDN'T IMPACT THE COST OF THIS
4 CONTRACT IF IN FACT WE HAD ANOTHER MECHANISM FOR SUPPORT IN
5 TERMS OF HELPING PEOPLE PAY THEIR TOLL AND VIOLATIONS. (DOG
6 BARKING) -- I AM SO SORRY.

7

8 **BETH ZELINSKI:** SO I GUESS, THAT IS PART OF THE DISCUSSION OF
9 THE NEXT ITEM. THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF WORK. I MEAN, WE
10 HAVE STARTED SOME OF THAT WORK, AND THERE WILL BE A LOT OF
11 PLANNING WORK TO IDENTIFY THOSE STRATEGIES, AND WE'RE STILL
12 REALLY JUST GETTING INTO THAT TO UNDERSTAND THE CUSTOMER BASE,
13 HOW TO MOTIVATE THEM AND WHAT WILL HELP THEM IN THE GREATEST
14 WAY. SO, AND I THINK A LOT OF THAT WILL BE DISCUSSED IN THE
15 NEXT ITEM.

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I GUESS WHAT I'M HAVING A HARD TIME
18 UNDERSTANDING IS HOW COME THIS -- BECAUSE OF THE LENGTH OF
19 THIS CONTRACT, IT SEEMS LIKE THOSE DISCUSSIONS COULD HAVE A
20 COST IMPACT ON THIS CONTRACT. AND THAT -- SO THAT'S WHAT I'M
21 TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, IF THERE ISN'T -- IF THE STAFF DOESN'T
22 SEE THAT THERE REALLY COULD BE AN IMPLICATION FOR THAT. AND IN
23 PARTICULAR, YOU KNOW, GETTING MORE PEOPLE ON FASTRAK, GETTING
24 PEOPLE ABLE TO PAY MORE EASILY AND ALL OF THAT SEEMS LIKE AN
25 IMPORTANT EMBEDDED PART OF THIS STRATEGY THE STRATEGY, THERE'S



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN THIS CONTRACT RELATIVE TO THAT POINT
2 AND I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WITH REGARD TO THIS CONTRACT ARE
3 WE LOCKED IN FOR THREE YEARS WHAT ARE THE INTERNAL
4 PARTNERSHIPS THAT COULD IMPACT THIS CONTRACT AND IF WE SEE AN
5 IMPACT HOW WOULD WE ADDRESS IT IN THE CONTRACT?

6

7 **BETH ZELINSKI:** SO, THERE ARE PROVISIONS FOR THAT GOING
8 FORWARD. SO, CURRENTLY, WHAT'S BEING PROPOSED IS THERE IS SOME
9 PRICE STRUCTURE DECREASE THE PRICE POINTS AS THERE IS MORE
10 FASTRAK CUSTOMERS. BUT, IN ADDITION, AS WE EVALUATE STRATEGIES
11 GOING FORWARD, WE WOULD LOOK TO NEGOTIATE WITH THE VENDOR ANY
12 COST SAVINGS AS WE INTRODUCE NEW OPPORTUNITIES. SO THIS IS,
13 SORT OF, PRICING TO THE BEST OF OUR KNOWLEDGE RIGHT NOW WITH
14 PROCESSES THAT WE ALREADY HAVE IN PLACE, AND HAVE ALREADY
15 AGREED, TO BUT CERTAINLY THROUGHOUT THE LENGTH OF THE
16 CONTRACT. AND WE HAVE DONE THAT UP UNTIL NOW THAT, WE WILL
17 LOOK TO IMPROVE PROCESSING, THE WAY THINGS ARE DONE, AND,
18 CERTAINLY, IF THERE ARE SOME COST SAVINGS, WE WOULD, YOU KNOW,
19 DISCUSS THAT WITH THE VENDOR ABOUT HOW TO EQUITABLY SHARE ANY
20 COST SAVINGS.

21

22 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER, ANDREW FREMIER DEPUTY DIRECTOR.
23 THIS BASE CONTRACT IS DOING FASTRAK BUSINESS AND UNTIL WE GET
24 A CUSTOMER INTO FASTRAK AS AN ACCOUNT HOLDER, IT'S VERY
25 EXPENSIVE TO MANAGE THEM AND IT TAKES QUITE A BIT OF HANDLING,



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 BECAUSE WE HAVE MOVED THEM INTO THIS NO CASH PAYMENT OPTION SO
2 QUICKLY. SO THE BASE CONTRACT DOESN'T CHANGE RELATIVE TO THE
3 COST OF A FASTRAK CUSTOMER AND THIS'S JUST DOING BUSINESS AS
4 NORMAL. SO ONE GOAL IS TO GET FOLKS INTO THE SYSTEM. WHAT WE
5 RECOGNIZE, THOUGH, THAT UNTIL WE CAN CREATE AN INCENTIVE FOR
6 THEM TO GET IN THERE, WE CAN'T MAKE A TOLL DIFFERENTLY LIKE
7 THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE HAS WHICH REALLY INCREASES THEIR
8 PENETRATION RATE OF FASTRAK CUSTOMERS. BUT WE ALSO KNOW THAT
9 WITHOUT A REALLY GOOD CASH PAYMENT NETWORK, WE COULDN'T DO
10 THAT TOLL HEIGHT OR TOLL DIFFERENTLY SO OUR FOCUS NOW IS TO
11 GET A GOOD SOLID WAY FOR FOLKS TO PAY CASH THROUGHOUT SYSTEM
12 THAT ALLOWS THEM TO THEN WANT TO BE FASTRAK CUSTOMERS AND THAT
13 CONTRACT ALLOWS FOR SAVINGS AS WE MOVE THEM INTO FASTRAK
14 RELATIVE TO THE QUESTION OF SOME OF THE WORK THAT'S COMING IN
15 THE NEXT ITEM, I THINK THE QUESTION IS STILL ON THE TABLE AS
16 TO WHERE YOU WOULD PUT THOSE SERVICES. THEY MAY OR MAY NOT BE
17 ADDED TO THIS PARTICULAR CONTRACT. THEY MAY BE IN THE ADJUNCT
18 CONTRACT, SO WHERE WE GO TO DMV IF THEY LEAVE CONDUENT
19 CONTRACT AND GO TO OTHER SERVICE PROVIDERS, TO HELP. AND WE
20 AWARE OF GTA AND PARTNERS WHO HAVE INDIVIDUAL ARRANGEMENTS AND
21 BATA CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER THEY HAVE SEPARATE RULES AND
22 REQUIREMENTS AND IT'S COMPLICATE, BUT THE PREMISE HERE IS TO
23 PLACE IN THE NEXT HANDFUL OF YEAR FIGURE OUT WHAT THE TOLLING
24 ENVIRONMENT LOOKS LIKE THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS WE ARE COMMITTED
25 AND SO IS THE CONTRACTOR TO TRY TO REDUCE COST SOME ARE BUILT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 INTO THE CHANGE ORDER AND SOME WE WOULD LIKE TO CONTINUE TO
2 PURSUE AS WE LEARN NEW WAYS TO DO BUSINESS AND I THINK WE'RE
3 CONFIDENT THAT WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO LOOK FOR THOSE
4 OPPORTUNITIES AS THEY COME UP.

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND I THINK THAT WHAT IS A LITTLE --
7 IT FEELS A LITTLE CHICKEN AND EGG TO ME, AND THAT'S WHAT I'M
8 HAVING A HARD TIME RECTIFYING. AND I THINK THE POINT YOU
9 RAISED ABOUT THE CONTRACT OVERALL, JUST SO I UNDERSTANDS THIS,
10 THIS IS A DO NOT EXCEED CONTRACT THAT GIVES YOU THE
11 OPPORTUNITY TO RENEGOTIATE THE CONTRACT. IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE
12 SAYING?

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE ALWAYS HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO EXECUTE
15 CHANGE ORDERS AND WE DO LOOK FOR OPPORTUNITIES TO FIND SAVINGS
16 BOTH US AND THE CONTRACTOR WOULD LIKE TO FIND SAVINGS THERE
17 ARE INCENTIVES IN THE CONTRACT THAT ALLOWS TO MAKE CHANGES AND
18 LOOK --

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THERE IS COST SHARING? ANEMONES WE WOULD LIKE TO
21 HAVE SHARED SAVINGS SO ALL PARTIES CAN INVESTIGATE WAYS TO NOT
22 SPEND THE MONEY AND NOT TO PUT INVESTMENTS INTO THE TOLL
23 BRIDGES AS OPPOSED TO INVESTING IN THE COST OF COLLECTING
24 TOLLS.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** JUST ONE LAST POINT I'LL RAISE AND COLLEAGUES
2 THANK YOU FOR INDULGING ME IN THIS. IT'S SUCH A LARGE CONTRACT
3 THAT I WAS READING THIS, TRYING TO DIGEST, OH MY GOD T IS A
4 LOT OF MONEY, AND IT'S GOT A LOT OF MOVING PARTS TO IT, WHAT I
5 THINK WHAT I'M STILL STRUCK BY EVEN THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA, I
6 WOULD HAVE PREFERRED TO HEAR THE OTHER AGENDA ITEM FIRST
7 BECAUSE IT WOULD HAVE HELPED ELIMINATE A LOT OF THE DISCUSSION
8 BECAUSE THE BOARD HAS WEIGHED IN ON THE IMPORTANCE OF FIGURING
9 OUT HOW WE CAN MAKE SURE TO PROPERLY SERVE EVERYBODY WHO IS
10 USING THE TOLL BRIDGE AND PART OF THE REASON I WAS SO
11 PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN THIS IS THAT I AM VERY INTERESTED
12 IN THE ON-BOARDING HOW FAR YOU GET PEOPLE TO BECOME FASTRAK
13 CUSTOMERS, AND WHETHER OR NOT THOSE -- ANOTHER THAT, OF THE 30
14 PARTY ENTITIES COULD HELP US EASE THAT, AND I KNOW, ALFREDO,
15 YOU AND I HAD A DIFFERENCE OF OPINION ABOUT WHETHER THAT WAS
16 AN APPROPRIATE PROCESS BUT I STILL THINK IT'S SOMETHING VERY
17 WORTH US TESTING. SO AS IT RELATES TO THIS, I WOULD JUST SAY
18 IF THIS IS A "NOT TO EXCEED "AND GIVEN THAT THE EXTENSION IS
19 THREE AND A HALF YEARS, AND I RECOGNIZE WE'RE ASKING THE
20 PROVIDER TO MAKE SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT AND I WANT TO MAKE
21 SURE THERE IS FLEXIBILITY THAT WE HAVE TO MAKE SIGNIFICANT
22 ADJUSTMENTS IF WE SEE NEW OPPORTUNITIES. AND AS, YOU KNOW, AS
23 THE AUTHORITY IS DELEGATED, I THINK IT WOULD BE IMPORTANT TO
24 HAVE A REPORT BACK TO THE BOARD ON HOW THAT WAS ACHIEVED.
25 THANK YOU, COLLEAGUES.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. ANDY,
3 DO YOU HAVE ANY ADDITIONAL CLARIFICATIONS?

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I WANT TO MENTION THE COST TO COLLECT TOLLS IS
6 VERY EXPENSIVE, UP ABOVE 10%. BUT WHAT YOU, I THINK, DON'T GET
7 WITH THIS BIG NUMBER THAT WE SHOW IS THAT WE HAVE ALWAYS BEEN
8 PAYING OVER \$50 MILLION A YEAR FOR MANUAL AND THE FASTRAK
9 CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER, PLUS CHARGES FOR CREDIT CARDS, AND
10 STUFF THAT ARE UP TO ABOUT TEN OR \$15 MILLION. SO THE COST TO
11 COLLECT TOLLS IS ON AVERAGE, IN THE 60 TO \$70 MILLION A YEAR.
12 THAT'S WHY YOU SEE SUCH A BIG NUMBER. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT
13 TO RECOGNIZE THAT.

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YOU KNOW WHAT WOULD BE GREAT? IT WOULD BE GREAT
16 TO SEE A BROKEN-OUT BUDGET BECAUSE YOU HAVEN'T SEEN THAT AND
17 IF THAT'S AVAILABLE ONLINE, IF YOU WOULD SEND US THE LINK THAT
18 WOULD BE GREAT FOR THE CURRENT CONTRACT. THAT WOULD BE
19 HELPFUL.

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE SEE IT IN THE BATA FINANCIAL SUMMARIES
22 EVERY MONTH OR SO, I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SPEND TIME WITH YOU TO
23 HELP ON UNDERSTANDING, IT'S COMPLICATE IT BREAKS OUT THE MAN
24 CULL COLLECTION AND COST OF CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER AS WELL AS
25 COST IN CREDIT CARD COST ET CETERA.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND THE BATA SUMMARY THAT WE RECEIVE IN OUR
3 MEETINGS?

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CORRECT.

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO
8 REVIEW T BECAUSE I THINK THAT EVEN JUST HEARING THIS THAT IT
9 REINFORCES FOR ME THE NEED TO THINK ABOUT A NEW WAY OF GETTING
10 THOSE LOW-INCOME CUSTOMERS ON-BOARDED. AND I APPRECIATE THE
11 POINT YOU RAISED, ALSO, RELATIVE TO THE COST OF DEALING WITH
12 CREDIT INSTITUTIONS. AND YOU CAN ANSWER THIS IN THE NEXT PART
13 OF THE MEETING, BUT I AM INTERESTED IN UNDERSTAND FIGURE THERE
14 WAS ANY CONCERN FROM OUR BOND HOLDING PARTNERS IN TERMS OF US
15 MAKING CHANGES TO HOW WE COULD ON-BOARD PEOPLE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. OKAY. GREAT. LET ME -- THANK YOU VERY
18 MUCH. LET ME TURN TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, AND THEN OUR
19 CHAIR, COMMISSIONER PEDROZA.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU, CHAIR WORTH. AND I WOULD LOVE TO
22 OKAY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ TO SIT IN ON THAT MEETING THAT YOU'RE
23 GOING TO HAVE TO UNDERSTAND THE BREAK DOWN. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW,
24 I THINK THIS IS -- YOU KNOW, I THINK EXTENDING THIS CONTRACT
25 IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO, BUT, YOU KNOW, THE END OF THIS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CONTRACT IS GOING TO BE UPON US BEFORE WE KNOW IT, AND I THINK
2 THIS IS SUCH A LARGE PART OF OUR BUDGET. THEY WOULD REALLY
3 LIKE TO SEE A WORK PLAN FOR HOW, YOU KNOW, WHAT -- WHAT WE
4 NEED TO DO TO BE IN A POSITION IN 20 -- WELL BEFORE 2027 TO BE
5 ABLE TO KIND OF, YOU KNOW, PUT SOMETHING OUT TO -- TO BID.
6 AND, ALSO, I THINK, HAVE MAYBE A LONGER TERM PLAN FOR HOW WE
7 CAN REDUCE THE COST OF COLLECTING TOLLS. AND MAYBE HAVE, YOU
8 KNOW, WHAT SHOULD OUR TARGET BE BY 2030 FOR, LIKE, THE
9 PERCENTAGE OF OUR REVENUE THAT WE SPENT ON TOLL COLLECTION.
10 AND THEN IF WE SET THAT TARGET FOR OURSELVES, HOW CAN WE --
11 YOU KNOW, WHAT ARE THE THINGS THAT WE CAN DO TO TRY AND MEET
12 THAT, AND HOW CAN WE HOLD OURSELVES ACCOUNTABLE TO THAT?
13 BECAUSE I THINK IT IS -- YOU KNOW, I THINK -- THERE'S -- YOU
14 KNOW, EVERYBODY'S DOING A GOOD JOB ON THIS, I'M NOT -- I DON'T
15 WANT -- AT LEAST, WANT THIS TO COME ACROSS AT CRITICAL AT ALL,
16 BUT AS WE GO INTO THIS CONTRACT HOW CAN WE BE THOUGHTFUL ABOUT
17 DRIVING DOWN THESE COSTS. BECAUSE TWO OR 3% IS A HUGE AMOUNT
18 OF MONEY. AND I THINK -- AND SO THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I WOULD
19 REALLY LIKE TO SEE. I WOULD LIKE TO FOLLOW UP ON COMMISSIONER
20 CHAVEZ'S COMMENTS. AND I WANT TO ASK REALLY POINT BLANK, ANDY,
21 YOU KNOW, THE -- THIS CONTRACT WILL ALLOW US TO PUT IN PLACE
22 PAYMENT PLANS THAT AREN'T MANAGED BY CONDUENT?

23

24 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CORRECT.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AND IF WE WANTED TO PUT IN PLACE DOWN THE
2 LINE A SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO OUR NOTIFICATION SYSTEMS, WHICH
3 ARE KIND OF PREVIEWED IN THE NEXT ITEM WHERE WE DON'T JUST
4 SEND THE PEOPLE MAIL, A LETTER, TO AN ADDRESS THAT WE THINK IS
5 THEIRS BUT WE'RE MUCH MORE PROACTIVE ABOUT TRYING TO GET AHOLD
6 OF THEM WHEN THEY HAVE A FINE OR FEE, OR A CONTRACT EXPIRES OR
7 WHATEVER. WOULD THIS CONTRACT ALLOW US TO MAKE THOSE CHANGES
8 IN A WAY THAT DOESN'T, SORT OF, BELOW THE ROOF THROUGHOUT
9 COST?

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I BELIEVE IT DOES. I CAN'T TELL YOU WHAT THE
12 BEST APPROACH IS UNTIL WE UNDERSTAND WHAT IT IS WE'RE TRYING
13 TO ACCOMPLISH. ONE THOUGHT I HAVE IS THE TRANSITION FROM
14 MANUAL TO ELECTRONIC, IT WAS REALLY JUST, SORT OF, MIMICKING
15 WHAT HAPPENS IN THE TOLL BOOTHS INTO THE BACK OFFICE AND
16 THIS'S, SORT OF, THE HISTORY OF ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING.
17 REALLY. WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WHICH IS MUCH MORE FORWARD
18 THINK SUGGEST A WHOLE NEW WAY OF INCENTIVIZING FOLKS TO
19 PROVIDE SYSTEMS THAT ARE MUCH MORE OUTREACHING. THAT,
20 PROBABLY, IS NOT VERY TYPICAL IN THE TOP INDUSTRY TODAY. SO
21 FIRST OF ALL I WOULD SAY OUR COSTS ARE VERY MUCH IN LINE WITH
22 THE TOLL COLLECTION IN THE NATION SIMILAR TO CLIPPER COST OUR
23 GOAL IS TO BECOME MORE EFFICIENT I WOULD RATHER HAVE THAT ONE
24 OR 2% SAVINGS AND PUT THEM BACK INTO BRIDGE REHABILITATION.
25 BUT THE IDEAS THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WITH THIS CONTRACT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 CHANGE ORDER EXTENSION, WE GET STEADY STATE, WE CAN DO THE
2 EXPERIMENTATION AND FIGURE OUT WHAT WE REALLY WANT TO
3 INCORPORATE IN THE NEXT GENERATION OF CONTRACT OVER SERIES OF
4 CONTRACTS IN ORDER TO BEST MEET THOSE GOALS. SO I THINK YOUR
5 PROPOSAL IS EXACTLY WHAT WE'RE RECOMMENDING.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. YES CHAIR PEDROZA?

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH. I WANT TO THANK STAFF
12 FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER. I KNOW IT WAS A LOT OF WORK FROM
13 MULTIPLE INDIVIDUALS. AND I APPRECIATE THE COMMENCE FROM
14 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. YOU KNOW,
15 ASKING THOSE QUESTIONS IS APPROPRIATE. AND YOU SHOULD ASK
16 THOSE QUESTIONS. AND I THINK THE COST OF THE TOLL IS SOMETHING
17 WE SHOULD LOOK AT BUT I ALSO THINK WHAT I SEE FROM THIS IS THE
18 INCENTIVES TO MOVE PEOPLE INTO FASTRAK. TO ME, THAT'S THE
19 WINNER, FOR THE USER, FOR THE AGENCY. AND SO, IN LOOKING AT
20 THAT, ANDY, I THINK THAT JUST UNDERSCORES THAT WE NEED TO BE
21 MORE FORWARD THINKING ON WHAT ENOUGH ARE OUT THERE TO MAKE
22 THAT CONVERSION FOR THE BETTERMENT OF THE USERS BUT THE
23 BETTERMENT OF THIS AGENCY IN TERMS OF WHAT IT'S COSTING US
24 FROM AN INVOICE PERSPECTIVE. THE ONE THING IN TERMS OF
25 REACHING OUT TO INDIVIDUALS WE ABSOLUTELY WANT TO DO THE RIGHT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THING BUT THAT OUTREACH IS NOT FOR FREE. THERE IS A COST TO
2 THAT. SO WE JUST HAVE THE BALANCE, AGAIN, REACHING THE RIGHT
3 PEOPLE AND MEETING WHAT'S APPROPRIATE AT THE SAME TIME WE HAVE
4 TO BE LASER FOCUSED ON THE GOAL IN THE CONVERSION TO FASTRAK.
5 ANDY, IN TERMS OF CUSTOMER SERVICE, WHAT ARE WE DOING TO MAKE
6 SURE THAT WE'RE ALSO IMPROVING CUSTOMER SERVICE FOR THOSE
7 USERS THAT ARE CALLING IN? IS THERE ANY BEST MANAGEMENT
8 PRACTICES THAT WE'RE ABLE TO VET INTO THIS? ANDY OR BETH?

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'LL LET YOU JUMP INTO THAT. YOU'RE MUCH MORE
11 VERSED.

12

13 **BETH ZELINSKI:** THE CONTRACT ALREADY DOES INCLUDE KEY
14 PERFORMANCE INDICATORS AND PAYMENT ASSESSMENT WAS THE
15 CONTRACTOR IS NOT MEETING PERFORMANCE. SO THAT CONTINUES ON.
16 AND THEN WE ARE ADDING SOME STAFF MEMBERS UNDER THIS CONTRACT
17 EXTENSION THAT WILL HELP, YOU KNOW, IDENTIFY SERVICE ISSUES
18 AND IMPROVEMENTS THAT CAN BE DONE TO IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER
19 SERVICE. SO, TO TAKE A MORE FOCUSED APPROACH TO THAT, AND HAVE
20 SOMEBODY REALLY DEDICATED TO, YOU KNOW, LOOKING AT THE DATA,
21 LOOKING AT THE PROCESSES, AND IDENTIFYING IMPROVEMENTS AND
22 KEEPING THE OPERATION FOCUSED ON THAT, AS WELL.

23

24 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THE OTHER THING I WOULD ADD, COMMISSIONER, IS
25 THAT WE DO HAVE QUITE A BIT OF STAFF THAT IS FOCUSED ON



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ASSISTING WITH CUSTOMER PROBLEMS, AS YOU ALL KNOW, BECAUSE YOU
2 HAVE DEALT WITH THEM YOURSELF. THEY ARE ALSO EMBEDDED IN THE
3 WORK PLAN THAT IS THE CUSTOMER SERVICE ARENA AND WE DO VALUE
4 AS WELL AS CONDUENT INPUT THAT IN TERMS OF CONTRACT HAMMERS WE
5 ALSO WORK CLOSELY IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THEM TO TRY TO LOOK FOR
6 NEW WAYS TO IMPROVE AND TO REACT TO PROBLEMS THAT WE HAVE IN
7 CUSTOMER SERVICE AND MAKE ADJUSTMENTS AND WE'RE VERY MUCH
8 COMMITTED, AND THEY'RE COMMITTED TO WORKING TOGETHER ON THOSE
9 IMPROVEMENTS.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, ANDY. THANK YOU, BETH.

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, EVERYONE, FOR YOUR QUESTIONS, AND
14 STAFF FOR PROVIDING ADDITIONAL INFORMATION. IF THERE ARE NO
15 FURTHER QUESTIONS, I WOULD LIKE TO ASK FOR ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.
16 AND I SEE WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER. AND JUST WANTED TO KNOW,
17 KIMBERLY, HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
18 REGARDING THIS ITEM?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
21 THIS ITEM. AND I DO SEE ON ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
22 HAND RAISED.

23

24 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. TERRIFIC.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'LL SHARE MY SCREEN AND START OF TIMER
2 AND CALL UPON ALETA DUPREE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. PLEASE GO
3 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4
5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR, AMY WORTH AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE
6 FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. HAPPY NEW YEAR. IT'S ALWAYS GOODS
7 TO BE BACK WITH YOU. LOTS OF GOOD THINGS HERE, AND IT'S
8 REASONABLE. I'M VERY HAPPY THAT WE ARE TALKING ABOUT THIS. ANY
9 TIME THAT WE HAVE A LARGE CONTRACT, WE NEED TO SPEND SOME TIME
10 TALKING ABOUT IT. SO I'M GOING TO TAKE MY MINUTE AND A HALF
11 LEFT AND TALK ABOUT IT TOO. AND YES THIS IS BIG, BUT DON'T LET
12 IT BE INTIMIDATING. WE'RE STILL SAVING MONEY OVER THE OLD
13 WAYS. AND I DO SUPPORT THE IDEA OF INCENTIVES. I WANT MORE
14 PEOPLE ON FASTRAK. FASTRAK TO ME IS A NO-BRAINER. IF I HAD A
15 CAR, I WOULD HAVE THE FASTRAK AS SOON AS I TOOK TITLE AND GOT
16 THE TAGS ON THE CAR; I WOULD HAVE IT. BUT I DON'T HAVE A CAR.
17 BUT HOPEFULLY CARS I RIDE IN WILL HAVE FASTRAK. FASTRAK IS
18 EASY BECAUSE I HAD A PIKE PASS TO OKLAHOMA AND IT WAS VERY
19 EASY. I SUPPORT THE IDEA OF DIFFERENTIALS IN THE PUBLIC
20 INTEREST NEW YORK THRUWAY HAVE DIFFERENTIALS, WHICH
21 INCENTIVIZE THE USE OF WHAT THEY CALL EZ PASS ON THE COAST.
22 AND I THINK IN NEW YORK CITY, ON THEIR SEVEN BRIDGE -- I THINK
23 IT'S SEVEN OR NINE BRIDGES AND TUNNELS -- I THINK IT'S NINE --
24 THEY'RE RUNNING ABOUT 95% EASY PASS USAGE ON THAT SYSTEM. SO
25 THERE IS A BIG EDUCATION COMPONENT INVOLVED. AND WE WANT TO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 MAKE IT EASY FOR PEOPLE TO DO IT. AND I DO SUPPORT THE CASH
2 NETWORK. THERE IS NO MORE FEES ON THE CASH NETWORK. YOU KNOW?
3 I THINK PEOPLE SHOULD EMPTY THEIR WALLETS AND JARS AND THEIR
4 BOTTLES AND PIGGY BANKS AND BRING THAT MONEY TO THEIR LOCAL
5 STORE WITH THE FASTRAK UNIT AND PUT THAT MONEY TO WORK WITH
6 BATA INSTEAD OF LEAVING IT IN THEIR HOUSE. THANK YOU. I ASK
7 FOR A YES VOTE.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALETA, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
10 COMMENTS. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HAND UP ON THE ATTENDEE LIST.
11 KIM?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I DON'T SEE ANY ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THAT CLOSES PUBLIC COMMENT AND WE'LL BRING
16 IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION AND DECISION.
17 AND THIS IS A COMMITTEE APPROVAL ACTION. SO IF THERE IS NO
18 FURTHER DISCUSSION, I WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR APPROVAL OF
19 THE CONTRACT AS IDENTIFIED IN THE STAFF REPORT IN THE AGENDA.
20 I'M SORRY. SOMEBODY'S MUTED.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I THINK THEY'RE ALL MUTED.

23



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 I THINK THEY'RE ALL MUTED. THERE WE GO. NOW THEY'RE -- YES,
2 PLEASE FEEL FREE TO STEP FORWARD WITH A MOTION TO APPROVE THE
3 CONTRACT.

4

5 >>FEDERAL D. GLOVER: MADAM CHAIR, I WOULD MOVE THE MOTION.

6

7 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

8 IS THERE A SECOND, PLEASE?

9

10 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN SECOND.

11

12 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: OKAY. SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. AND,

13 THEN, NOW, MAY WE PLEASE HAVE A ROLL CALL.

14

15 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, MOTION BY GLOVER, SECOND BY PAPAN.

16 CHAIR WORTH?

17

18 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: AYE.

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

21

22 MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: AYE.

23

24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

4

5 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

8

9 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT IS ABSENT.

16 COMMISSIONER RONEN?

17

18 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL

21 MEMBERS PRESENT.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND, AGAIN,

24 THANK YOU, STAFF, FOR THE REPORTS AND THE TREMENDOUS WORK ON

25 THIS, AND TO THE COMMISSION FOR THE -- YOU KNOW, THE QUESTIONS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THAT YOU HAVE RAISED, AND THAT WERE ANSWERED, AND KNOWING THAT
2 WE HAVE DONE A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK ON THIS, AND WILL
3 CONTINUE TO DO SO. SO I AM ENCOURAGED THAT THIS CONTRACT WILL
4 ENABLE US TO DO THAT. SO, MOVING FORWARD, OUR NEXT ITEM IS AN
5 INFORMATION ITEM. AND THE THAT'S AN UPDATE ON THE BAY AREA
6 TOLLING EQUITY ACTION PLAN. AND I WOULD WELCOME TURNING OVER
7 TO LYSA HALE FOR THAT REPORT, PLEASE? THANK YOU.

8

9 **LYSA HALE:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. AND GOOD MORNING
10 COMMISSIONERS. HAPPY NEW YEAR. I'M LYSA HALE, BATA STAFF. CAN
11 I ASK FOR THE PRESENTATION TO BE BROUGHT UP? THANK YOU. I'M
12 HERE TO GIVE YOU AN UPDATE ON THE BAY AREA TOLLING EQUITY
13 ACTION PLAN. AS YOU RECALL, ABOUT A YEAR AGO STAFF EM BARKED
14 ON AN AMBITIOUS PLAN TO IDENTIFY AND IMPLEMENT CHANGES TO MAKE
15 THE BAY AREA TOLLING MORE EQUITABLE WE PROVIDED UPDATES AND
16 RECEIVED IMPORTANT FEEDBACK FROM YOU ABOUT THE NEED FOR
17 CUSTOMERS TO BE ABLE TO RESOLVE ISSUES AND MANAGE DEBT TO
18 URGENTLY FOCUS ON THOSE WHO NEED IT MOST AND TO INCLUDE
19 BASELINE DATA AND COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS IN ASSESSMENTS OF
20 POTENTIAL POLICY CHANGES. IN RESPONSE TO YOUR FEEDBACK, WE
21 HAVE ALREADY MADE SEVERAL SIGNIFICANT CHANGES INCLUDING
22 DRASTICALLY REDUCING VIOLATION PENALTIES FOR UNPAID BRIDGE
23 INVOICES THAT WENT INTO EFFECT DECEMBER 1ST. WE LOWERED THE
24 PRICE OF BECOMING A FASTRAK CUSTOMER BY REDUCING THE TAG
25 DEPOSIT AND INITIAL OPENING BALANCE FOR THOSE WHO FUND THEIR



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ACCOUNT BY CASH AND CHECK. WE ALSO ELIMINATED CASH PAYMENT
2 NETWORK FEES IN COORDINATION WITH THESE CHANGES WE WILL BE
3 IMPLEMENTING A REGION-WIDE CAMPAIGN TO PROMOTE FASTRAK
4 ADOPTION. TODAY, I WILL TALK ABOUT THE WORK WE'RE DOING TO
5 UNDERSTAND THE ISSUES THAT NEED TO BE ADDRESSED TO SUPPORT THE
6 NEXT BATCH OF PROPOSED CHANGES. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE JUST GETTING
7 STARTED. IN PERFORMING THE BACKGROUND WORK, STAFF REALIZED
8 THAT BATA CANNOT ADDRESS PROBLEMS IT DOES NOT FULLY
9 UNDERSTAND. AND THAT DECISIONS ABOUT POLICY CHANGES MUST BE
10 BASED ON DATA AND NOT SOLELY ANECDOTAL INFORMATION. IN AN
11 EFFORT TO GET AT THE INFORMATION WE NEED TO MAKE POLICY
12 RECOMMENDATIONS WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THE FOLLOWING KEY
13 QUESTIONS: NUMBER ONE. HOW ARE WE DEFINING PROBLEMATIC UNPAID
14 VIOLATIONS AND PENALTIES? WHAT IS THE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO
15 SOLVE? NUMBER TWO. WHO ARE WE TRYING TO HELP? THIS IS AN
16 IMPORTANT QUESTION AS IT PROVIDES US FOR DIRECTION FOR BOTH
17 OUR DATA ANALYSIS AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT. THREE. WHO IS
18 HAVING THE MOST DIFFICULTY? AGAIN, THIS WILL HELP DRIVE OUR
19 DATA ANALYSIS AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT. WE ALREADY HAVE SOME
20 OF THE DATA WE NEED FOR THIS. BUT WE NEED MORE. FOUR. WHAT ARE
21 THE MAIN REASONS FOR THE ACCUMULATION OF UNPAID TOLLS AND
22 VIOLATIONS AND PENALTIES? WE COULDN'T TELL THIS FROM THE DATA.
23 SO THIS WILL BE THE SUBJECT OF MUCH OF OUR COMMUNITY
24 ENGAGEMENT. AND, FINALLY, FIVE, WHAT DATABASED ACTIONS CAN BE
25 TAKEN IN THE SHORT AND LONG-TERM TO ADDRESS THE PROBLEM? WHILE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ANECDOTAL INFORMATION FROM A FEW PEOPLE CAN SEEM COMPELLING,
2 IT IS NOT THE WHOLE PICTURE. AND THAT'S WHAT WE NEED TO
3 UNDERSTAND BEFORE WE CAN MOVE FORWARD. WE NEED TO KNOW WHAT
4 PROGRAMS WILL ACTUALLY HELP THE TARGET AUDIENCES WE WILL
5 IDENTIFY IN ANSWERING THE SECOND AND THIRD QUESTIONS ABOVE.
6 NEXT SLIDE. TO ILLUSTRATE OUR APPROACH TO ANSWERING THE
7 QUESTIONS, I WANT TO PRESENT AN EXAMPLE OF THE SUBQUESTIONS
8 AND DATA SOURCES THAT WE WILL PURSUE. JUST BY LOOKING AT
9 AGGREGATE DATA READILY AVAILABLE TO US THROUGH THE CUSTOMER
10 SERVICE CENTER, WE CAN ANSWER QUESTIONS ABOUT HOW MANY UNPAID
11 VIOLATIONS DRIVERS HAVE ACCUMULATED SINCE ALL ELECTRONIC
12 TOLLING STARTED, WHERE THESE VIOLATIONS ARE IN TERMS OF STAGE,
13 AND HOW MUCH THESE DRIVERS OWE. NEXT SLIDE. WE CAN ALSO ANSWER
14 QUESTIONS ABOUT HOW MANY VEHICLES ARE POTENTIALLY GOING TO DMV
15 HOLD, HOW MUCH OWNERS OF THESE VEHICLES OWE, AND HOW LONG
16 THERE HAS BEEN AHOLD. WHEN WE COMBINE CUSTOMER SERVICE DATA
17 WITH CENSUS DATA WE CAN GET CLOSER TO ANSWERING THE QUESTION
18 ABOUT HOW MANY VEHICLES ARE OWNED BY PEOPLE WHO ARE CONSIDERED
19 LOW-INCOME OR EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY. NEXT SLIDE. CUSTOMER
20 SERVICE DATA CAN ALSO ANSWER QUESTIONS BREAKING OUT VIOLATION
21 INFORMATION ACROSS BATA BRIDGES, THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE AND
22 EXPRESS LANES. THESE ARE ALL DATA-DRIVEN QUESTIONS, BUT THERE
23 ARE SOME QUESTIONS THAT CAN'T BE ANSWERED BY DATA. THESE NEED
24 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT TO GAIN A BROADER PERSPECTIVE OF THE
25 REGION'S RESPONSES. SOME EXAMPLES ARE: ARE THEIR BARRIERS TO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 USING FASTRAK AND TO WHAT EXTENT DO PEOPLE HAVE CREDIT OR
2 DEBIT CARDS TO BE ABLE TO AUTOLOAD A FASTRAK ACCOUNT. DO THEY
3 HAVE ACCESS TO CASH PAYMENT NETWORK LOCATIONS AND ARE THEY
4 AWARE THAT THIS SEASONAL OPTION. EXTENT OF AFFORDABLE ISSUES,
5 IN OTHER WORDS WHAT THAT I WANT TO PAY. WE HAVE A COMMUNITY
6 ENGAGEMENT TEAM BOARD AND THEY'RE WORKING ON A STRATEGY TO
7 ENGAGE PEOPLE TO ANSWER THESE QUESTIONS ALSO WORKING ON
8 EXPLORING POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS ON HOW THOSE WOULD WORK FOR MOST
9 PEOPLE. NEXT SLIDE. I MADE REFERENCE ABOUT THE QUESTION OF
10 LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS AND ONE OF THE THINGS WE WILL NEED TO
11 DO IS MAKE A RECOMMENDATION ABOUT WHO BE CONSIDERED LOW-
12 INCOME. FOR EXAMPLE, THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM USES THE SAME
13 DEFINITION AS CAL-FRESH AND OTHER STATE BENEFIT PROGRAMS. 200%
14 OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL OR BELOW. STAFF HAS RECOMMENDED
15 THE UPCOMING TOLL DISCOUNT PILOT ON INTERSTATE 880 USE THE
16 SAME THRESHOLD THIS IS ALSO THE SAME NUMBER USED IN THE
17 AGENCY'S DEFINITION OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. HOWEVER,
18 NOT ALL AGENCIES ARE USING THE SAME THRESHOLD. THE SAN MATEO
19 COUNTY EXPRESS LANES PLAN TO USE 60% OF THE AVERAGE MEDIAN
20 INCOME WHICH IS A MUCH HIGHER THRESHOLD. THE TREASURE ISLAND
21 TRANSPORTATION AFFORDABILITY PROGRAM HAS BROKEN IT OUT INTO
22 VERY LOW-INCOME AND BETWEEN MODERATE AND LOW-INCOME, WHICH IS
23 A DIFFERENT APPROACH. WE PLAN TO COME BACK WITH A
24 RECOMMENDATION FOR OUR DEFINITION AT A FUTURE MEETING. NEXT
25 SLIDE. BEFORE CONTINUING, I WANTED TO REMIND YOU OF THE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PROCESS FOR NON-FASTRAK TOLL PAYERS. FIRST THEY RECEIVE THEIR
2 INVOICE. IF THEY DON'T PAY IT WITHIN 21 DAYS, THEY WILL
3 RECEIVE A FIRST NOTICE OF VIOLATION THAT REQUIRES THEM TO PAY
4 THE ORIGINAL TOLL PLUS A \$5 PENALTY. IF THEY DO NOT PAY WITHIN
5 30 DAYS, THEY WILL RECEIVE A SECOND NOTICE FOR THE ORIGINAL
6 TOLL PLUS A \$15 LATE PENALTY. IF THEY DO NOT PAY THIS WITHIN
7 45 DAYS THEY WILL GO TO A VEHICLE REGISTRATION HOLD WITH DMV
8 OR COLLECTIONS. I'LL TALK MORE ABOUT THOSE IN A MINUTE. WITH
9 THE \$25 IN TOLLS PENALTIES AND FEES PER CROSSING. WHAT DOES
10 THIS MEAN IN A REAL-WORLD SCENARIO. THIS TABLE SHOWS PENALTIES
11 COMBINED WITH ORIGINAL TOLLS DEPENDING ON THE NUMBER OF
12 CROSSINGS IF SOMEONE CROSSES A BRIDGE FIVE TIMES SUCH AS YOU
13 MIGHT IF DRIVING TO WORK EVERY DAY YOUR ORIGINAL TOLLS WOULD
14 BE \$35 IF YOU DO NOT PAY THOSE TOLLS THE \$5 PENALTY FOR EACH
15 TOLL NOT PAID IS ADDED AT THE FIRST VIOLATION NOTICE BRINGING
16 YOUR TOTAL AMOUNT OWED TO \$60. IF YOU STILL DID NOT PAY YOU
17 WOULD RECEIVE A SECOND VIOLATION NOTICE WITH AN ADDITIONAL \$10
18 FOR EACH TOLL NOT PAID, BRINGING THE TOTAL AMOUNT OWED TO
19 \$110. WHEN THE UNPAID SECOND VIOLATION NOTICE IS FORWARDED TO
20 DMV REGISTRATION HOLD, YOU WOULD OWE \$125, BECAUSE THE DMV
21 ADDS ON A \$3 FEE FOR EACH TOLL. WE WOULD HAVE SENT YOU A TOTAL
22 OF THREE NOTIFICATIONS A MONTHLY INVOICE FOR THE FIVE BRIDGE
23 TOLL CROSSING FIRST VIOLATION NOTICE AND A SECOND VIOLATION
24 NOTICE. IF YOU LOOK AT THE REST OF THE TABLE, YOU CAN SEE HOW
25 PENALTIES WOULD ADD UP IF THE CUSTOMER CONTINUES TO CROSS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 WITHOUT PAYING THE TOLLS. THE COLUMN AT THE RIGHT IS TO
2 ILLUSTRATE HOW MANY TIMES WE WOULD HAVE TRIED TO CONTACT YOU,
3 ALL VIA MAIL TO THE ADDRESS PROVIDED TO THE DMV AS PER
4 STATUTE. WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE SLIDE IT CAN LOOK LIKE REALLY
5 BIG NUMBERS AS YOU CAN SEE ON THE NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. THIS
6 SLIDE SHOWS BREAK DOWN OF UNPAID VIOLATIONS FOR ELIGIBLE DMV
7 HOLDER BY VEHICLE LICENSE PLATE DATA FOR THE FIRST NINE MONTHS
8 OF 2021 DATA SHOWS THE SCOPE OF THE PROBLEM IS POTENTIALLY
9 RELATIVELY SMALL THE VAST MAJORITY 85% OF PEOPLE WITH UNPAID
10 VIOLATIONS HAD TEN OR FEWER. IN TERMS OF THE AMOUNT OF
11 PENALTIES OWED YOU CAN SEE 43% OWE \$15.42% OWE UP TO 150.
12 REMEMBER THAT THIS IS OVER THE COURSE OF NINE MONTHS. IT'S THE
13 REMAINING 15% THAT WE'RE INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING BETTER.
14 WE WOULD LIKE TO KNOW HOW MANY OF THESE ARE ACTUALLY LOW-
15 INCOME AND HOW MANY ARE FLOUTING THE SYSTEM. NEXT SLIDE. I
16 MENTIONED EARLIER COLLECTIONS AND DMV REGISTRATION HOLDS.
17 THESE STEPS IN THE PROCESS ARE KEY TO ENSURING THAT BATA
18 COLLECTS ITS TOLLS. HOW DO COLLECTIONS WORK? AND WHAT IS SENT
19 TO COLLECTION? YOU CAN HAVE A REVOKED FASTRAK ACCOUNT. THIS
20 MEANS YOU ALLOWED YOUR ACCOUNT TO GO NEGATIVE, DIDN'T PAY YOUR
21 FIRST AND SECOND VIOLATION NOTICES AND DIDN'T ADD FUNDS FOR 90
22 DAYS SO YOUR ACCOUNT WAS CLOSED OR REVOKED. UNPAID VIOLATIONS
23 COULD ALSO GO TO COLLECTIONS IF THE VEHICLE IS FROM OUT OF
24 STATE. ANOTHER SITUATION IS IF A LICENSE PLATE HAS MORE THAN
25 75 VIOLATIONS ON DMV HOLD. ANY VIOLATIONS OVER 75 WOULD GO TO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 COLLECTIONS. AND, FINALLY, IF YOU HAD VIOLATIONS BUT SOLD YOUR
2 VEHICLE, YOU WOULD NO LONGER BE REGISTERING THAT VEHICLE SO
3 UNPAID VIOLATIONS WOULD BE SUBJECT TO COLLECTIONS. HOWEVER OUR
4 COLLECTIONS PROCESS IS GENERALLY CUSTOMER FRIENDLY COMPARED
5 WITH OTHER COLLECTION PROGRAMS FOR EXAMPLE, PAYMENT PLANS ARE
6 AVAILABLE AND YOU CAN CHOOSE TO PAY BY PHONE MAIL OR ONLINE NO
7 ADDITIONAL FEES OR INTEREST ARE ADDED TO THE AMOUNT YOU OWE.
8 THE COLLECTION AGENCY ALSO DOESN'T REPORT YOU TO CREDIT
9 REPORTING AGENCIES SO IT DOESN'T AFFECT YOUR CREDIT BUT THE
10 COLLECTIONS AGENCY CAN TAKE FROM ANY REFUNDS DUE TO YOU FROM
11 THE FRANCHISE TAX BOARD. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES
12 WHAT HAPPENS IF UNPAID VIOLATIONS ARE SENT TO DMV REGISTRATION
13 HOLD. THIS MEANS YOU CAN'T REGISTER YOUR VEHICLE UNTIL TOLLS
14 PENALTIES AND FEES ARE PAID. AND AS MENTIONED EARLIER THE DMV
15 ADDS A \$3 PER VIOLATION FEE. NO ADDITIONAL PENALTIES ARE ADDED
16 AT THIS STAGE. NEXT SLIDE. BATA OFFERS A DISPUTE PROCESS IN
17 CASE SOMEONE AS A CONCERN ABOUT WHAT THEY OWE. INFORMATION ON
18 THIS PROCESS IS INCLUDED ON INVOICES AND VIOLATIONS ON OUR WEB
19 SITE AND BY CALLING THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. WE ARE,
20 HOWEVER, TALKING ABOUT WAYS THAT WE CAN MAKE THIS INFORMATION
21 MORE TRANSPARENT. NEXT SLIDE. CIRCLING BACK TO COMMUNITY
22 ENGAGEMENT, I WANT TO ILLUSTRATE THE KINDS OF SOLUTIONS WE CAN
23 EXPLORE DEPENDING ON THE FEEDBACK WE GLEAN FROM TALKING WITH
24 THE COMMUNITY. IF YOU CROSS A BRIDGE, WE WILL SEND YOU AN
25 INVOICE. THERE IS A POSSIBILITY YOU MAY NOT GET THE INVOICE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 IF, FOR EXAMPLE, YOU HAVE MOVED, OR YOU HAVEN'T UPDATED YOUR
2 ADDRESS WITH DMV WHICH PROVIDES THE ADDRESS WE USE TO CONTACT
3 YOU. THIS IS PER CALIFORNIA STATUTE. IF YOU DO GET THE
4 INVOICE, YOU MAY PAY IT OR NOT. IF YOU DON'T PAY, THERE COULD
5 BE ANY NUMBER OF REASONS. MAYBE YOU ARE LOW-INCOME AND CANNOT
6 AFFORD TO PAY. MAYBE YOU'RE IN A TEMPORARY SITUATION WHERE YOU
7 CANNOT PAY. YOU COULD HAVE FORGOTTEN TO PAY, AND OF COURSE,
8 YOU COULD CHOOSE NOT TO PAY. WE CAN'T TELL ANY OF THIS
9 INFORMATION BY LOOKING AT CUSTOMER SERVICE DATA BUT WE CAN GET
10 A BETTER SENSE ON A REGIONAL BASIS FROM THE COMMUNITY
11 ENGAGEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. AS PART OF THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT,
12 WE CAN EXPLORE POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS TO THE VARIOUS PROBLEMS. WE
13 CAN ENCOURAGE TO YOU SIGN UP FOR FASTRAK WHICH WE DO ALREADY
14 AND WILL BE DOING AGAIN THROUGH OUR CAMPAIGN, BUT FEEDBACK
15 COULD PERHAPS HELP US DO IT DIFFERENTLY OR BETTER. IF YOU'RE
16 NOT RECEIVING OUR NOTICES, WE COULD EXPLORE WAYS TO REACH YOU
17 AS ALLOWED BY LAW. FOR EXAMPLE, AN ONGOING PUBLIC CAMPAIGN TO
18 LET PEOPLE KNOW THEY NEED TO CALL US IF THEY CROSSED A BRIDGE
19 BUT DID NOT RECEIVE AN INVOICE. FOR PEOPLE WHO CAN'T AFFORD TO
20 PAY, EITHER PERMANENTLY, OR TEMPORARILY, WE COULD LOOK AT A
21 HARDSHIP PROGRAM FOR PENALTIES. IF YOU HAVE FORGOTTEN TO PAY,
22 PERHAPS WE COULD DO MORE TO TRY AND REMIND YOU. AND FOR THOSE
23 WHO CHOOSE NOT TO PAY, MAYBE WE CAN PROVIDE SOME KIND OF
24 INCENTIVE TO PAY, OR A STRONGER DISINCENTIVE TO IGNORE THE
25 NOTICES. NEXT SLIDE. I HAVE THREE EXAMPLES AT HOW WE PLAN TO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 APPROACH THE DEVELOPMENT OF POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS. EACH IS AN
2 ILLUSTRATION OF IMPORTANT USER DISTINCTIONS AFFECTING ABILITY
3 TO PAY AND ULTIMATELY THE POLICY CHANGES THAT WE IMPLEMENT. IN
4 THIS EXAMPLE, JOE IS A 53 YEAR-OLD LANDSCAPER. HE RECENTLY
5 MOVED AND HAS AN INCOME OF \$60,000 A YEAR. HE DOESN'T HAVE
6 FASTRAK AND HE OWES FIVE HELPED DOLLARS. THERE COULD BE
7 SEVERAL SOLUTIONS TO HIS SITUATION. PERHAPS HE WOULD BENEFIT
8 FROM A PAYMENT PLAN. MAYBE HE NEEDS MORE AWARENESS OF THE
9 DISPUTE PROCESS SEE THIS HIS PENALTIES ARE WAIVED. NOW THAT WE
10 HAVE MOVED TO AN INVOICE SYSTEM WE HAVE A FIRST TIME WAIVER
11 PROGRAM FOR WHEN PEOPLE DON'T UNDERSTANDS THE VIOLATION NOTICE
12 THEY RECEIVE. MAYBE WE CAN EXPLORE OTHER WAYS TO NOTIFY PEOPLE
13 AS ALLOWED BY LAW. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT WE HAVE A YOUNG COLLEGE
14 STUDENT WHO LIVES AT HOME, WHICH MEANS HER HOUSEHOLD INCOME IS
15 HIGH. SHE DOES HAVE FASTRAK, BUT SHE HAS A NEGATIVE BALANCE.
16 SHE DOESN'T KNOW ABOUT THE CASH PAYMENT NETWORK. MAYBE SHE
17 COULD BENEFIT FROM MORE TIME TO PAY HER INVOICES, OR INCREASED
18 AWARENESS OF THE CASH PAYMENT NETWORK. MAYBE SHE NEEDS TO KNOW
19 MORE ABOUT THE DISPUTE PROCESS OR OTHER WAYS TO PAY. NEXT
20 SLIDE. NEXT WE HAVE A SMALL BUSINESS OWNER WITH A HIGH
21 HOUSEHOLD INCOME. HE DOESN'T HAVE FASTRAK, AND HE OWES \$6,500.
22 HE COULD POTENTIALLY BENEFIT FROM A PAYMENT PLAN OR INCREASED
23 AWARENESS OF THE DISPUTE PROCESS. THESE ARE JUST A FEW
24 EXAMPLES. WE PLAN TO CONSTRUCT A VARIETY OF USER SCENARIOS TO
25 HELP US MAKE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS. WHY DON'T WE MAKE ALL



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THESE CHANGES NOW? WELL, YOU ASKED US TO KEEP COST BENEFIT IN
2 MIND, AND WE COULDN'T MAKE ALL THE CHANGES FOR THIS REASON.
3 THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT COST, BOTH FINANCIAL AND OTHER
4 RESOURCE-BASED TO MANY OF THESE SOLUTIONS. AND THEY MAY ONLY
5 HELP A SMALL NUMBER WHEN OTHER ALTERNATIVES ARE AVAILABLE.
6 THERE ARE ALSO LEGAL ISSUES TO NAVIGATE. WE NEED TO FIGURE OUT
7 THE BEST ALTERNATIVES THAT WILL WORK FOR THE PEOPLE WE ARE
8 TRYING TO HELP. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHERE DOES THAT TAKE US?
9 BETWEEN NOW AND NEXT JUNE, WE WILL BE CONCENTRATING ON OUR
10 DATA COLLECTION AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT. WE ALSO WILL BE
11 MONITORING THE RESULTS OF LOWERING THE PENALTIES FOR
12 VIOLATIONS. IS THIS PILOT NETTING A HIGHER RATE OF VIOLATION
13 PAYMENT, FOR EXAMPLE? WE ALSO WILL ALLOW THE OTHER
14 IMPROVEMENTS THAT YOU APPROVED TO DESIGN TO IMPROVE
15 IMPEDIMENTS TO OPENING A FASTRAK ACCOUNT. BETWEEN JULY AND
16 DECEMBER WE WILL START LOOKING AT OTHER PILOTS WE MAY WANT TO
17 RECOMMEND TO CONTINUE PLANNING FOR LONGER TERM
18 IMPLEMENTATIONS. FROM NEXT JANUARY THROUGH ENDS OF 2023 WE
19 WILL STAY PRIORITIES AND PLAN TO START IMPLEMENTATION ON ONE
20 OR MORE PILOTS WE WILL REVIEW EVALUATION RESULTS AND DETERMINE
21 IF WE NEED TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS AND POST DECEMBER 2023, WE WILL
22 WORK ON IMPLEMENTING LONGER TERM CHANGES. NEXT SLIDE. AND WITH
23 THAT, I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. COMMISSIONER, I THINK
24 YOU'RE MUTED.
25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU. LISA THANK YOU VERY
2 MUCH FOR THAT REPORT NOT ONLY FOR THE REMINDER BUT ALSO
3 REMEMBERING US WHAT WE HAVE DONE SO FAR IN THE POLICY CHANGES
4 AND THE WORK ON THE TOLLING SYSTEM THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THE
5 CUSTOMER INTERFACE. I WILL GO TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO HAVE
6 QUESTIONS. I'LL START WITH COMMISSIONER RONEN AND THEN
7 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

8

9 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH CHAIR WORTH. I'M SORRY
10 I'M NOT TURNING ON MY CAMERA. AS OF THIS MORNING, WE'RE A
11 FAMILY IN QUARANTINE, SO OUR LIVES ARE TURNED A LITTLE BIT
12 UPSIDE DOWN. SO BARE WITH ME. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THIS
13 REPORT. I APPRECIATE IT. A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. SO, THE
14 PAYMENT PLAN OPTION THAT WE HAVE AVAILABLE NOW, HOW DOES THAT
15 WORK?

16

17 **LYSA HALE:** SO THAT IS PART OF THE COLLECTIONS PROCESS. SO IF
18 YOU GET TO THE POINT WHERE YOU HAVEN'T PAID YOUR INVOICE, YOU
19 HAVEN'T PAID YOUR FIRST NOTICE, YOU HAVEN'T PAID YOUR SECOND
20 NOTICE, AND THEN IT GOES TO COLLECTIONS, ONCE YOU'RE IN THE
21 COLLECTIONS PROCESS, YOU CAN SETUP A PAYMENT PLAN. BUT IT
22 WOULD BE AFTER ALL OF THOSE OTHER STEPS.

23

24 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AND DO YOU KNOW HOW THAT COLLECT -- HOW
25 THE COLLECTIONS PROCESS PAYMENT PLAN WORKS? IS IT, SORT OF, A



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ONE SIZE FITS ALL, OR DOES IT WORK WITH THE INDIVIDUAL AND
2 CREATE TERMS BASED ON THEIR SITUATION? DOES IT -- IS IT EASY
3 TO ENROLL? YOU KNOW? ALL OF THOSE QUESTIONS ABOUT FACILITY OF
4 USE?

5

6 **LYSA HALE:** YOU KNOW, I CAN'T ACTUALLY ANSWER THAT QUESTION BUT
7 I WONDER IF BETH ZELINSKI IS STILL ON THE CALL? BETH, CAN YOU
8 ANSWER THAT QUESTION?

9

10 **BETH ZELINSKI:** I CAN'T ANSWER ALL OF THE DETAILS. IT IS A
11 PAYMENT PLAN THAT'S HANDLED BY THE COLLECTION AGENCY, SO THEY
12 HAVE SOME PARAMETERS OF WHAT THEY OFFER. SO, BUT, WE COULD GET
13 DETAILS.

14

15 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** I WOULD LOVE TO HAVE THOSE DETAILS IF
16 POSSIBLE. AS YOU KNOW, BECAUSE I HAVE MENTIONED THIS BEFORE, I
17 BELIEVE WE SHOULD, YOU KNOW, ENTER INTO A PAYMENT PLAN FOR
18 ANYONE THAT WANTS TO -- WANTS THE PAYMENT PLAN REGARDLESS OF
19 INCOME. UNLIKE SOME OF THE COMPARISONS THAT YOU SHOWED US OF,
20 YOU KNOW, DIFFERENT LEVELS OF WHAT IS CONSIDERED LOW-INCOME,
21 WHEN IT COMES TO DISCOUNTS AND THOSE TYPES OF PROGRAMS. THAT'S
22 ONE THING. BECAUSE WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE USING LIMITED
23 RESOURCES TO BENEFIT THE LOWEST INCOME MEMBERS OF OUR
24 COMMUNITY. BUT WHEN IT COMES TO PAYMENT PLANS AND DEBT, YOU
25 KNOW, PEOPLE OF ANY INCOME LEVEL COULD BE IN A FINANCIAL, YOU



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 KNOW -- NOT IN A GREAT FINANCIAL STATE FOR ANY NUMBER OF
2 REASONS, WHETHER IT'S, YOU KNOW, SOMETHING UNAVOIDABLE LIKE A
3 MEDICAL EMERGENCY, OR FOR WHATEVER REASON, AND IF THEY'RE
4 WILLING TO ENTER A PAYMENT PLAN SO THAT THEY CAN PAY OFF A
5 DEBT -- THEIR DEBT IN A WAY THAT WORKS FOR THEM, I THINK WE
6 SHOULD ALLOW ANYONE WHO NEEDS TO DO THAT TO DO -- TO DO THAT
7 AUTOMATICALLY. I JUST DON'T -- IT -- ALL THE EVIDENCE THAT I
8 HAVE SEEN IS THAT WHEN THERE ARE EASY TO ENROLL PAYMENT PLANS,
9 WHERE THERE ARE REMINDERS WHEN THEY'RE BASED ON THE REALITY OF
10 THE INDIVIDUAL AND WHAT THEY CAN PAY, AND FLEXIBLE, THAT THEY
11 WORK, THAT THEY OVERWHELMINGLY WORK TO COLLECT DEBTS. AND ALL
12 OF THE INFORMATION YOU'RE STUDYING IS GREAT AND REALLY
13 INTERESTING AND HELPFUL, I'M JUST WONDERING, YOU KNOW, WHY WE
14 ARE WAITING TO IMPLEMENT A PAYMENT PLAN OPTION FOR EVERYONE
15 THAT NEEDS ONE? IT -- JUST, TO ME IT MAKES SENSE IN EVERY WAY
16 SHAPE OR FORM AND WILL LIKELY BRING IN MORE REVENUE FOR BATA,
17 WHICH IS SOMETHING THAT, OF COURSE, WE NEED. IF SOMEONE COULD
18 ANSWER THAT QUESTION? I MEAN, I WAS EVEN CONSIDERING
19 INTRODUCING A RESOLUTION WHICH I HAVE NEVER SEEN HAPPEN AT MTC
20 OR BATA BEFORE, BUT TO SAY LET'S JUST DO IT. YOU KNOW? WE CAN
21 CONTINUE TO STUDY IT, BUT I'M NOT SURE WHAT WE GAIN BY
22 WAITING.

23

24 **LYSA HALE:** OKAY. I'LL DO MY BEST TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **LYSA HALE:** I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS WE WANT TO KNOW IS THAT
4 THE BEST SOLUTION. AND WE DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO THAT
5 QUESTION RIGHT NOW. THAT'S WHY WE NEED TO TALK TO PEOPLE AS
6 OPPOSED TO RELYING ON ANECDOTAL INFORMATION. ONE OF THE THINGS
7 THAT WE WILL LOOK AT IS HOW PAYMENT PLANS ARE WORKING IN OTHER
8 PLACES. WE ARE IN THE PROCESS OF COLLECTING THAT INFORMATION.
9 WILL THE COST OF OFFERING A PAYMENT PLAN BE OFFSET BY THE
10 TOLLS THAT WE'RE ABLE TO COLLECT? WE DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO
11 THAT QUESTION, BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW HOW MUCH THE PAYMENT PLAN
12 IS GOING TO COST. AND IF WE OFFER A PAYMENT PLAN ON A PILOT
13 BASIS AND FIND THAT IT DOESN'T WORK AND WE NEED TO DO IT A
14 DIFFERENT WAY, THAT GETS TO THAT COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS THAT I
15 WAS TALKING ABOUT. AND IT GOES BACK TO THE QUESTION OF, IS
16 THIS THE BEST WAY TO SETUP, OR ADDRESS THE PROBLEMS THAT
17 PEOPLE HAVE, AND WHAT IS THE BEST WAY TO SETUP A PAYMENT PLAN.
18 GOING TO THE EARLIER QUESTION ABOUT HOW PAYMENT PLANS WORK IN
19 THE COLLECTIONS PROCESS, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE DIFFERENT WAYS
20 THAT IT MIGHT BE SETUP. YOU KNOW, MAYBE IT'S A ONE SIZE FITS
21 ALL TYPE THING, MAYBE IT'S CUSTOMIZED BASED ON THE INDIVIDUAL
22 CIRCUMSTANCES OF PEOPLE. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING TO WORK
23 BEST AND WE NEED TO GET MORE INFORMATION ABOUT THAT BEFORE WE
24 EMBARK ON SETTING UP A PAYMENT PLAN.

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IF I COULD, TO MAKE -- SUPPLEMENT THAT,
2 BECAUSE I THINK THERE'S A COUPLE OF IMPORTANT QUESTIONS,
3 COMMISSIONER RONEN, YOU RAISED IN YOUR COMMENTS. YOU KNOW, ONE
4 IS THE BASIC QUESTION BACK TO, WHO ARE WE TRYING TO SERVE. WE
5 HAD BEEN WORKING ON THE ASSUMPTION THAT THE FOCUS WAS ON FOLKS
6 WHO, AS YOU INDICATED, HAD AN INCOME HARDSHIP OF SOME LEVEL,
7 WHETHER IT'S TEMPORARY, OR MORE OF A STRUCTURAL THING, IS ONE
8 OF THE DISTINCTIONS WE WANT TO MAKE, BUT THE BASIC ISSUE WAS,
9 IT WASN'T BECAUSE YOU JUST LOST IT ON YOUR COFFEE TABLE WITH
10 THE, YOU KNOW, CHRISTMAS CARDS FROM LAST YEAR. THAT, IN FACT,
11 THERE IS A REASON WHY, I HARDSHIP DRIVEN REASON WHY, TEMPORARY
12 OR NOT, THAT YOU DIDN'T PAY. SO, THAT WAS WORKING -- THAT'S A
13 FUNDAMENTAL WORKING ASSUMPTION THAT WE HAVE. AND SO, YOU KNOW,
14 I THINK THIS'S SOMETHING TO BE CONFIRMED BY THE COMMITTEE
15 BECAUSE IT DOES REALLY DIRECT, I THINK, THE FOCUS THAT WE HAVE
16 BEEN TAKING ON THE ADDITIONAL INFORMATION, AS LISA WAS SAYING,
17 THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO GET.

18

19 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** SURE. I THINK A CORE VALUE OF BATA AND
20 THIS COMMISSION IS, OF COURSE, THAT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
21 WE ARE BEST SERVING THE LOWEST INCOME RESIDENTS, OR, THAT WE
22 SERVE, WITHOUT A DOUBT, ABSOLUTELY. OFTENTIMES WHAT HAPPENS IS
23 WHEN YOU INCOME CHECK PEOPLE AND YOU -- AND YOU CREATE ALL
24 THESE BARRIERS TO ENTRY, THEN IT HARMS LOWER INCOME PEOPLE THE
25 MOST. SO I DON'T WANT TO OBSESS. I THINK PEOPLE CAN SELF



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ATTEST, FOR EXAMPLE, TO FINANCIAL HARDSHIP AND THAT WE
2 SHOULDN'T HAVE TO, YOU KNOW, BE CHECKING THEIR PAY STUBS IN
3 ORDER TO SAY THAT I CAN ENTER INTO A PAYMENT PLAN. THIS'S ALL
4 I'M SAYING. I WORK IN THIS AREA A LOT IN SEVERAL DIFFERENT
5 AREAS AND I JUST KNOW THAT THE MORE YOU INCOME CERTIFY AND THE
6 MORE YOU CREATE ADDITIONAL BARRIERS TO ENTRY IN ANY PROGRAM,
7 THAT PEOPLE THAT SUFFER THE MOST ARE LOWER INCOME PEOPLE.
8 THAT'S WHY I'M SAYING, YOU KNOW, DOES IT REALLY MATTER HOW
9 MUCH THE INCOME LEVEL IS OF PEOPLE IF THEY'RE SAYING THAT THEY
10 HAVE A FINANCIAL HARDSHIP AND WANT TO PAY THEIR DEBT AND WANT
11 TO ENTER INTO A PAYMENT PLAN, RIGHT? AND SO I GUESS WHAT I
12 WOULD ASK -- AND, AGAIN, I SO APPRECIATE ALL OF -- THE
13 PRESENTATION TODAY, AND ALL OF THIS WORK. IT'S NOT TO
14 CRITICIZE THAT AT ALL, OR NOT TO SUGGEST THAT WE STOP THAT
15 INQUIRY, AND THAT STUDY, BUT JUST TO ADD TO IT ALL THE DETAILS
16 THAT I'M TALKING TO YOU ABOUT THE PAYMENT PLANS. ABOUT,
17 BASICALLY, CAN WE HAVE MORE INFORMATION ABOUT WHAT THE
18 COLLECTIONS PAYMENT PLAN OPTIONS LOOK LIKE? CAN WE COMPARE
19 THAT TO OTHER PROGRAMS THAT MIGHT BE OUT THERE THAT, YOU KNOW,
20 THAT I HAVE HEARD OF, THAT DO A REALLY GREAT JOB IN TREATING
21 PEOPLE -- LIKE, THEY'RE RESPONSIBLE HUMAN BECOMES FIRST AND
22 FOREMOST AND WANT TO BE THERE AND ARE HAVING TREMENDOUS
23 SUCCESS IN DOING THAT. IF WE COULD GET THAT INFORMATION, I
24 DON'T KNOW IF IT'S POSSIBLE, I DON'T KNOW, THERESE, OR CHAIR -
25 - CHAIR WORTH, TO HAVE THAT INFORMATION AT OUR NEXT MEETING,



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 BECAUSE I WOULD LOVE TO SEE WHAT THE COST AND SUCCESS IS OF
2 DIFFERENT PROGRAMS AND SEE IF WE CAN JUST GET ONE GOING SOONER
3 RATHER THAN LATER IF THAT MAKES SENSE?

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** IF I COULD JUST JUMP IN, COMMISSIONER -- AM
6 I OFF MUTE -- YES, ANYWAY, I THINK THOSE BEST PRACTICES ARE
7 VERY MUCH A PART OF THE INFORMATION THAT WE WILL BE GETTING
8 AND THAT WE NEED. SO, EXCELLENT POINT. COMMISSIONER RONEN, IF
9 YOU -- I DIDN'T WANT TO CUT YOU OFF IF YOU WEREN'T FINISHED,
10 BUT I JUST WANTED TO OFFER THAT INFORMATION.

11

12 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** YES. THANK YOU. I WOULD SO GREATLY
13 APPRECIATE GETTING, SORT OF, A COMPARISON OF DIFFERENT PAYMENT
14 PLAN OPTIONS AND COMPANIES THAT PROVIDE THAT SERVICE.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YES. OKAY. SO, I THINK THAT WILL BE
17 INCORPORATED INFORMATION WE GET BACK. SO, AND I KNOW THAT
18 WE'RE APPROACHING A LOT -- ALL OF THIS WITH A SENSE OF
19 URGENCY. SO, IF WE CAN ASK STAFF TO INCORPORATE THAT, IN THE
20 WORK THAT COMES BACK, I THINK THAT WILL BE REALLY HELPFUL.
21 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND THEN VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA, AND THEN
22 OUR CHAIR PEDROZA.

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR PUTTING THIS
25 TOGETHER. I AM SYMPATHETIC WITH COMMISSIONER RONEN'S COMMENTS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 IF THIS WAS UP TO ME WE WOULD BE PUTTING INTO PLACE PAYMENT
2 PLANS NOW BUT I UNDERSTANDS THERE IS A -- IT IS IMPORTANT TO
3 DO THIS IN A WAY THAT, SORT OF, BUILDS A CONSENSUS AROUND T
4 AND THIS IS AN IMPORTANT THING TO DO. SO, I APPRECIATE STAFF
5 BEING SO THOUGHTFUL ABOUT IT. AND WITH THE KIND OF APPROACH
6 THAT IS IN A DATA-DRIVEN WAY. I JUST WANTED TO ASK A FEW
7 QUESTIONS. WHEN YOU SAY COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT, YOU CAN JUST
8 KIND OF EXPLAIN A LITTLE BIT WHAT THAT MEANS IN THIS CONTEXT?
9 WHO ARE WE USING TO DO THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT? AND HOW IS
10 THAT COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT HAPPENING? BECAUSE YEAH.

11

12 **LYSA HALE:** UNDER A SUBCONTRACT WITH OUR MARKETING CONTRACTOR
13 WE'RE WORKING VERY CLOSELY WITH DAVIS AND ASSOCIATES, WHICH IS
14 A FIRM THAT IS ALSO ON OUR EQUITY BENCH. AND THEY DO A LOT OF
15 THIS TYPE OF WORK. AND I CAN TELL YOU, I HAVE SEEN -- I
16 HESITATE TO SAY THIS, BECAUSE IT'S ONLY A DRAFT THEY HAVE
17 GIVEN ME. THEY HAVE GIVEN ME A DRAFT PROPOSAL THAT INCLUDES
18 DOING A SURVEY AND THEN WORKING WITH IDENTIFIED COMMUNITY-
19 BASED ORGANIZATIONS, AND THEN DOING OUTREACH ON AN INDIVIDUAL
20 BASIS, SO WORKING WITH, LIKE, FOCUS GROUPS, AND GETTING
21 FEEDBACK FOR -- FROM ACTUAL PEOPLE. BUT, A RANGE OF PEOPLE.
22 AND, YOU KNOW, SO ONE OF THE AREAS THAT WE WILL BE LOOKING AT
23 IS LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS BUT WE WILL ALSO BE LOOKING AT OTHER
24 PEOPLE, AS WELL. SO, EVEN THOUGH WE HAVEN'T FULLY DEFINED LOW-
25 INCOME INDIVIDUALS. DOES THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. THAT'S HELPFUL. ONE OF THE -- I'M
3 GLAD THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT, SORT OF, BEST PRACTICE -- PAYMENT
4 PLANS BEST PRACTICES, BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S -- IN SAN
5 FRANCISCO, AS COMMISSIONER RONEN SAID, WE HAVE DONE A LOT OF
6 WORK ON THIS, AND I KNOW THERE ARE OTHER PLACES AROUND THE
7 REGION, AROUND THE STATE, AROUND THE COUNTRY WHO HAVE DONE A
8 LOT OF WORK AND I WOULD HATE TO HAVE TO, SORT OF, REINVENT THE
9 WHEEL ON THAT WHEN OTHER GOVERNMENT AGENCIES HAVE DONE SO
10 MUCH. SO I'M NOT SO THRILLED ABOUT THAT. ONE OF THE THINGS
11 THEY WOULD BE INTERESTED IN INCLUDING IN THIS RESEARCH WHICH I
12 DON'T THINK WAS IN THE SLIDES, BUT I MAY BE MISTAKEN, WAS
13 UNDERSTANDING WHAT THE IMPACT OF DMV HOLDS, AND GOING TO
14 COLLECTIONS ARE ON LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, AND OF, SORT OF, MORE
15 BROADLY, THE IMPACTS OF TOLL DEBT ON LOW-INCOME PEOPLE.
16 BECAUSE I THINK THAT WOULD BE A VERY APPROPRIATE THING TO BE,
17 KIND OF, ENGAGING OUR CUSTOMERS ON, AND I THINK THIS THAT'S
18 SOMETHING I THINK I HAVE -- IN THE PEOPLE I TALK TO, I THINK I
19 HAVE A PRETTY CLEAR UNDERSTANDING OF THE NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF
20 GOING TO DMV HOLD BUT I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR YOU TO
21 KIND OF ADDRESS IN YOUR WORK. I ALSO THINK THAT IT WOULD BE
22 HELPFUL WHEN WE, SORT OF, TRY TO PULL THE QUANTITATIVE
23 DEMOGRAPHIC DATA ON THE VIOLATORS, FOR THE PEOPLE WHO ARE
24 FACING TOLL VIOLATIONS TO, SORT OF, COMPARE IT TO THE
25 DEMOGRAPHIC DATA OF OUR TOLL USERS, OF ALL OF OUR USERS.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 BECAUSE I HAVE ACTUALLY NEVER SEEN A DEMOGRAPHIC BREAK DOWN OF
2 OUR BRIDGE USERS. AND THAT WOULD BE REALLY INTERESTING, I
3 THINK, TO UNDERSTAND. AND I ASSUME THAT IT'S JUST A CROSS
4 SECTION, JUST LIKE, YOU KNOW, LIKE THE BAY AREA AVERAGE
5 DEMOGRAPHICS.

6

7 **LYSA HALE:** WE COULD USE THAT AS A PROXY BUT REALLY DON'T KNOW
8 THE DEMOGRAPHICS OF PEOPLE WHO ARE CROSSING THE BRIDGES.

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MAYBE THAT'S A DIFFERENT DISCUSSION. NOT THIS
11 DISCUSSION BUT KIND OF FOR EVERYTHING WE'RE DOING.

12

13 **LYSA HALE:** MAYBE WE COULD GET SOME OF THAT THROUGHOUT SURVEY
14 THAT WE PLAN TO DO?

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** ANYWAY, I -- PROBABLY ANOTHER DISCUSSION,
17 BECAUSE I THINK THAT IMPACTS MANY, MANY MORE THINGS THAN THIS
18 EQUITY CONVERSATION, YOU KNOW, HAVING A BETTER UNDERSTANDING
19 OF THE PEOPLE WHO USE OUR BRIDGES ARE. AND, THEN I THINK, YOU
20 KNOW, TO, SORT OF, THE FINAL COMMENT I HAVE IS BASED ON
21 COMMISSIONER RONEN -- SORT OF, VERY SIMILAR TO WHAT
22 COMMISSIONER RONEN SAYS, I THINK, IN A PLACE LIKE LITHUANIA,
23 WHERE THE GOVERNMENT BASICALLY SUCKS UP ALL OF YOUR INCOME AND
24 BANK ACCOUNT DATA, JUST, SORT OF, SEAMLESSLY, AND THEN, SORT
25 OF, SPITS OUT IMMEDIATELY WHAT PROGRAMS YOU'RE ELIGIBLE FOR IN



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 REALTIME, I THINK IT IS VERY EASY FOR PEOPLE TO KIND OF INCOME
2 QUALIFY. FOR -- IN CALIFORNIA, THAT'S NOT HOW IT WORK. AND WE
3 KNOW IN LOOKING AT OTHER PROGRAMS, THAT LOW-INCOME PEOPLE FACE
4 HUGE BARRIERS TO QUALIFYING FOR INCOME -- FOR INCOME-BASED
5 PROGRAMS. LIKE FOOD STAMPS, 30% OF PEOPLE WHO ARE ELIGIBLE FOR
6 FOOD STAMPS IN THE BAY AREA, IN SAN FRANCISCO WHO ARE GOING
7 HUNGRY -- AND I DON'T KNOW THE NUMBERS IN EVERYBODY ELSE'S
8 COUNTIES, 30% OF PEOPLE IN SAN FRANCISCO GOING HUNGRY SUPPOSED
9 TO GET FOOD STAMPS ACTUALLY CAN'T GET FOOD STAMPS BECAUSE OF
10 HOW COMPLICATE THAT ENROLLMENT PROCESS IS. I THINK IT WOULD BE
11 WORTHWHILE, WHILE YOU'RE DOING THIS RESEARCH EITHER THROUGHOUT
12 COMMUNITIES OUTREACH OR, SORT OF, BEST PRACTICES ELSEWHERE, TO
13 REALLY UNDERSTAND THAT ISSUE OF, IS THERE -- EVEN THOUGH WE'RE
14 TRYING TO TARGET PEOPLE WHO ARE STRUGGLING, DOES THE KIND OF,
15 THE REQUIREMENT FOR THEM TO PROVE THAT THEY ARE STRUGGLING,
16 PUT IN PLACE A BARRIER WHICH IS VERY HIGH. AND I THINK, MY
17 INSTINCT AND MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT IT DOES, BUT I THINK IT
18 WOULD BE GREAT FOR YOU TO KIND OF, YOU KNOW, LOOK INTO THAT
19 AND GET BACK TO US. AND THAT THE RISK OF KIND OF ALLOWING SOME
20 PEOPLE WHO MAY BE -- SOME OF US WHO MAY NOT THINK ARE WORTHY
21 OF HELP, OR GETTING THE HELP, MAY BE THE PRICE THAT WE NEED TO
22 PAY TO MAKE SURE THAT EVERYBODY WHO DOES NEED THE HELP CAN GET
23 IT AND CAN GET IT AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH
24 FOR THIS WORK AND FOR COMMITTING TO DOING THIS EQUITY WORK, TO
25 MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NOW MAY I TURN TO VICE CHAIR ABE-
3 KOGA FOR YOUR COMMENTS?

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU
6 VERY MUCH FOR THE IN DEPTH PRESENTATION. I HAVE ACTUALLY BEEN
7 GOING BACK AND LOOKING AT THE SLIDES TO TRY TO UNDERSTAND THEM
8 BETTER, AND I HAVE ACTUALLY PROBABLY A PRETTY BASIC QUESTION.
9 FOR SLIDES 7 AND 8 IN REGARDS TO THE SCALE, I GUESS, AND THEN
10 THE BREAK DOWN OF VIOLATIONS, IS IT SUCH -- SO, IT LOOKS LIKE
11 THE 85% ARE THOSE THAT GO TO DMV HOLD, AND SO THEY WOULD PAY
12 AT THE TIME OF THEIR ANNUAL REGISTRATION -- REREGISTRATION --
13 IS THAT RIGHT?

14

15 **LYSA HALE:** I'M NOT SURE I UNDERSTAND YOUR QUESTION.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** I GUESS I WAS -- I WAS TRYING TO
18 FIGURE OUT, SO MY UNDERSTANDING, IF THIS IS RIGHT IS THAT,
19 EVENTUALLY IT WOULD -- 85% OF THE VIOLATIONS GO TO THE DMV
20 HOLD SO AT THE TIME OF THEIR ANNUAL VEHICLE REGISTRATION, THEY
21 WOULD BE ABLE TO CLEAR THE DEBT THAT'S ALREADY --

22

23 **LYSA HALE:** THANK YOU. I THINK I UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE ASKING.
24 SO THAT CHART -- AND I'M SORRY I DON'T HAVE IT RIGHT IN FRONT
25 OF ME -- THAT CHART IS BASICALLY BREAKING DOWN EVERYBODY WHO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 COULD POTENTIALLY BE GOING TO DMV HOLD. AND OUR POINT OF --
2 OH, THANK YOU SO MUCH -- IT'S ACTUALLY DOWN A COUPLE OF
3 SLIDES.

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SLIDE NINE.

6

7 **LYSA HALE:** THANK YOU, RIGHT THERE. OUR POINT IN SHOWING THIS
8 IS TO DEMONSTRATE THAT IT'S ONLY 15% OF THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE
9 HIGH BALANCES, THAT, FOR THE MOST PART, THE VAST MAJORITY OF
10 PEOPLE THAT COULD GO TO DMV HOLD OR COLLECTIONS OWE A
11 RELATIVELY SMALL AMOUNT OF MONEY. 43% OF THEM ONLY OWE \$15 SO
12 THAT'S MAYBE SOMEBODY WHO CROSSED ONE TIME, GOT AN INVOICE,
13 DIDN'T PAY IT MAYBE NOT A REGULAR BRIDGE USER. THEN THERE'S A
14 GROUP THAT CROSSED TEN TIMES AND GOTTEN A VIOLATION, THAT'S
15 42% OF THE PEOPLE. SO THAT'S 85% OF THE PEOPLE HAVE RELATIVELY
16 SMALL AMOUNTS OF PENALTIES THAT THEY OWE. IT ISN'T UNTIL YOU
17 GET INTO THOSE NEXT FOUR CATEGORIES THAT YOU START SEEING
18 HIGHER AMOUNTS OF. SO THAT'S THE POINT OF THIS SLIDE WAS TO
19 DEMONSTRATE THE PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE WHO OWE HIGHER AMOUNTS IS
20 ONLY 15%. AND WE WANT TO KNOW MORE ABOUT THEM.

21

22 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** YES. GREAT. SO THEN, I GUESS WAS
23 TRYING TO CONNECT THIS, AND MAYBE THERE IS NO CONNECTION TO
24 THE PREVIOUS SLIDE. SO, DO ALL OF THESE FOLKS EVENTUALLY GO TO
25 DMV HOLD SO THAT THEY DO HAVE THAT, I GUESS, YOU KNOW,



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 BACKDROP OF HAVING TO CLEAR THEIR DEBT TO BE ABLE TO REGISTER
2 THEIR CAR WITHIN THAT YEAR? OR, I THINK, AS LOOKING AT THE
3 PREVIOUS SLIDE WHERE IT LOOKED LIKE THERE WERE SOME THAT HAD
4 VIOLATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN OVER TWO OR THREE OR FOUR YEARS
5 TIME? OR IS THAT -- AM I READING THAT --

6

7 **LYSA HALE:** WELL, FIRST OF ALL, THIS SLIDE IS ALL PEOPLE FROM
8 JANUARY THROUGH SEPTEMBER OF LAST YEAR. WE AREN'T SENDING
9 VEHICLES TO DMV HOLD RIGHT AT THIS PERIOD, BUT THESE ARE ALL
10 THE VIOLATIONS PER PLATE THAT WOULD HAVE GONE TO DMV HOLD.
11 WE'RE HOLDING OFF ON THAT RIGHT NOW. SO THAT'S THIS SLIDE. IF
12 YOU COULD GO TO THE PREVIOUS SLIDE?

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AND THE REASON I'M ASKING, I
15 GUESS I'M LOOKING FOR THAT BACKSTOP, AT WHAT POINT IS -- YOU
16 KNOW, IS THERE JUST THAT POINT WHERE FOLKS HAVE TO PAY, YOU
17 KNOW, TO CLEAR THEIR DEBT TO BE ABLE TO, LIKE, FOR INSTANCE,
18 BEING ABLE TO REGISTER THEIR VEHICLE?

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IN OTHER WORDS, LISA, I THINK WHAT
21 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS ASKING, HOW DO YOU EVEN GET TO A 24
22 MONTH? WOULDN'T YOU HAVE GONE TO DMV HOLD BEFORE THAT? SO IS
23 THIS REALLY JUST A HYPOTHETICAL CHART? OR IS IT REALLY
24 POSSIBLE TO GETS TO 24 AND 48?

25



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU THERESE.

2

3 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I GOT WHAT YOU WERE SAYING. [LAUGHTER]

4

5 **LYSA HALE:** YEAH THIS, SAY HYPOTHETICAL CHART PROJECTING WHAT
6 WOULD HAPPEN OVER A 48 MONTH PERIOD. MOVING FORWARD WITH THESE
7 LOWER VIOLATION US THAT APPROVED A COUPLE OF MONTHS AGO. SO,
8 YOU KNOW, THIS S IF YOU CROSSED FIVE TIMES, LIKE, WHEN YOU
9 WOULD CROSS IN A WEEK, YOU WOULD OWE \$35, AND THEN IF YOU
10 DIDN'T PAY THAT -- THOSE TOLLS, WE WOULD ADD ON \$5 PER
11 VIOLATION, AND THAT WOULD BRING YOU UP TO \$60 AND SO ON AND SO
12 ON. SO, IF YOU CROSSED 1,040 TIMES OVER A 48 MONTH PERIOD,
13 MOVING FORWARD, THAT'S HOW YOU COULD END UP OWING A TOTAL OF
14 \$26,000.

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** BUT THE IMPORTANT OVERLAY JUST SO WE DON'T
17 CONFUSE, THE MECHANISM, THE BACKUP WHEN IS THE DMV HOLD WHICH
18 TO CLARIFY ARE IF THE COMMISSIONERS WAS A ROUTINE PROCESS
19 UNTIL WE WENT INTO THE EMERGENCY ACCELERATED PROVISIONS WITH
20 COVID, AND WE HAVE NOT BEEN SENDING THEM -- AND CAROLE CAN
21 JUMP IN WITH THE CLARITY BETWEEN SENDING -- THERE IS A
22 DECISION BETWEEN SENDING DMV HOLDS FROM THE CASH ONLY PERIOD
23 THAT WAS FROM MARCH 2020 TO DECEMBER 2020 VERSUS THE HOLES
24 THAT ARE -- THE DMV HOLDS THAT HAVE NOT BEEN SENT SINCE
25 JANUARY. AND THAT'S BEEN AN EXPLICIT DECISION BY A PROCEDURAL



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION BY STAFF AT YOUR DIRECTION OF TRYING
2 TO SORT OUT WHAT IT MEANS TO RECEIVE T SO WE'RE, SORT OF, IN
3 THIS INTERESTING POINT ABOUT SENDING IT. BUT YOUR IMPORTANT
4 QUESTION, COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, IS, ONCE WE SETTLE ON WHAT
5 WE'RE SUPPOSED TO DO, THERE ARE TWO REALLY PERSONALITY POINTS
6 WHERE THERE IS IMPACT. ONE IS DMV HOLDS AND THE OTHER IS A
7 COLLECTIONS. AND THE SLIDES ON COLLECTIONS WE DON'T REALLY
8 NEED TO BRING IT, THERE ARE VERY DISCRETE POINTS WHERE THAT
9 HAPPENS. YOU KNOW? IT'S MOSTLY DMV HOLDS IS THE MAJOR
10 BACKSTOP, IF YOU WILL, BUT COLLECTIONS DEALS WITH OTHER
11 CIRCUMSTANCES. SO THOSE ARE IN PLACE. AND, SO, YEAH, IT'S NOT
12 DESIGNED TO HAVE SOMEONE BE ABLE TO CROSS THE BRIDGE, NOT
13 PAYING ANYTHING FOR FIVE YEARS, AND THEN SUDDENLY, YOU KNOW,
14 GET CAUGHT, SO TO SPEAK.

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU FOR THAT
17 CLARIFICATION. AND THEN I WOULD JUST ADD IN TERMS OF COMMENTS,
18 I APPRECIATE THE OTHER COMMISSIONERS. AND, CERTAINLY, FOR ME,
19 MY INTEREST WOULD BE TO, YOU KNOW, TRY TO ASSIST THOSE WHO
20 NEED ASSISTANCE, AND I UNDERSTAND THAT SOMETIMES THERE ARE
21 BARRIERS TO GETTING THE ASSISTANCE AND, YOU KNOW, I WOULD BE
22 INTERESTED IN LEARNING MORE ABOUT WHAT THOSE ARE. I THINK
23 THAT, FRANKLY, MY OWN PERSONAL EXPERIENCES, RECENTLY, THINGS
24 HAVE -- TECHNOLOGY SEEMS TO HAVE MADE THINGS EASIER, YOU KNOW,
25 FOR INSTANCE, I'M APPLYING -- I'M HELPING MY DAUGHTER APPLY



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 FOR FINANCIAL AID, AND COLLEGE APPLICATIONS, AND THAT PROCESS
2 IS NOW ALL AUTOMATED, AND MUCH SIMPLER TO DO, SO I WONDER IF
3 WE COULD IMPLEMENT TECHNOLOGIES TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR FOLKS
4 WHO NEED THE ASSISTANCE TO GET IT. BECAUSE, I GUESS I LOOK AT
5 THE FLIP SIDE, AND WHEN WE JUST OPEN IT UP, YOU KNOW, A LOT OF
6 FOLKS WHO DON'T NEED IT, GET IT. AND SOMETIMES I WONDER IF THE
7 FOLKS WHO NEED THE ASSISTANCE THE LEAST BENEFIT THE MOST OUT
8 OF SOMETHING LIKE THAT, SO I JUST WANT TO BE REALLY CAREFUL
9 ABOUT THAT, AND IF WE'RE LOOKING AT THAT 15%, IT SEEMS LIKE
10 IT'S REALLY WHAT WE'RE FOCUSING ON, I THINK WE COULD GET -- IT
11 SOUNDS -- SEEMS LIKE STAFF IS WORKING REALLY HARD AND I
12 APPRECIATE YOUR WORKING AND TRYING TO REALLY UNDERSTAND AND
13 IDENTIFY WHO THOSE PEOPLE ARE, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING
14 MORE OF THAT INFORMATION. THANK YOU.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. I NOW TURN
17 TO OUR CHAIR COMMISSIONER PEDROZA, AND COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND
18 PAPAN.

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO ECHO THE COMMENTS OF
21 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, YOU HIT IT SPOT ON IN TERMS OF WE KNOW
22 WHO WE WANT TO HELP BUT HOW WE DO IT TO MAKE SURE IT DOESN'T
23 CREATE BARRIERS TO HELPING. JUST TO BE THOUGHTFUL IN THOSE
24 BARRIERS AND CREATING ENROLLMENT ISSUES THAT'S WHERE I THINK
25 THE OUTREACH IS GOING TO BE HELPFUL THAT WE'RE CREATING



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PROGRAMS THAT EVERYONE WANTS TO BE ABLE TO USE NO ONE WANTS TO
2 LOOK BACK A YEAR FROM NOW THAT WE CREATE A PROGRAM THAT NO ONE
3 USES. I SEE A LOT OF VALUE IN BEING THOUGHTFUL AROUND THIS AND
4 CONCUR WITH VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. IN TERMS OF COMMUNITY
5 OUTREACH I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE DO IT FOR ALL THE RIGHT
6 REASONS BUT I'M VERY ALSO FOCUSED ON THE FASTRAK ENROLLMENT.
7 BECAUSE THE PEOPLE THAT WE'RE ACTUALLY TRYING TO TOUCH BASE
8 WITH ARE THE PEOPLE WE CAN ACTUALLY HELP ENROLL AND BENEFIT
9 GET THE BENEFIT OF ENROLLING IN FASTRAK SO I WOULD HOPE THIS
10 COMMUNITY OUTREACH IS STRONG ON THAT ELEMENT. THAT IS NOT JUST
11 A QUESTION THAT WE SPEND TIME IDENTIFYING THE, WHAT IS IT, AND
12 DON'T PUT BOUNDARIES ON THE UNIVERSE OF WHAT, WHAT INCENTIVES
13 ARE OUT THERE THAT CAN MOVE THE POPULATION INTO THAT AND IF
14 IT'S COST OR WHATEVER IT WILL BE, I AM INTERESTED IN GETTING
15 THAT RAW DATA SO WE CAN POTENTIALLY HAVE THE RIGHT INCENTIVES
16 TO MOVE FOLKS INTO THAT ELEMENT. SO, AGAIN, THANK YOU TO
17 STAFF. I THINK THIS IS A STEP IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

20

21 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** ON THAT SAME THEME, I WANT TO FIRST OFF
22 THANK YOU FOR THE WORK THAT'S TAKING PLACE, AND REALLY EXCITED
23 ABOUT WHAT THE CONTINUATION OF THAT WORK IS GOING TO BE,
24 BECAUSE THE THEME OF MAKING SURE THAT WE ARE REACHING THE
25 RIGHT POPULATIONS OF PEOPLE THAT NEED THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 AND, YOU KNOW, I'M SPEAKING OF CONTRA COSTA, IN PARTICULAR,
2 BECAUSE, AS WE KNOW, IT'S A HUGE, HUGE PAYING THE TOLLS FOR,
3 YOU KNOW, MANY AREAS THAT DON'T USE IT AS MUCH, SO I JUST WANT
4 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE REACHING OUT TO THOSE COMMUNITIES OF
5 NEED AND THAT WE HAVE POCKETS THEN THAT CONTRA COSTA REGION
6 AND EASTERN WESTERN PORTION IN PARTICULAR OF HUGE TOLL USERS,
7 AND SO, I THANK YOU FOR THE WORK AND I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE
8 THAT WE'RE ALL-INCLUSIVE OF ALL OF OUR AREAS, AND NOT JUST THE
9 ONES WITHIN THE INNER CONNECTIVITY CITY.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER GLOVER.
12 NOW, WE HAVE COMMISSIONER PAPAN, AND I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS
13 RAISED FROM THE COMMITTEE AFTER COMMISSIONER PAPAN, BUT PLEASE
14 DO IF YOU WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT TOO.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MADAM CHAIR. COULD YOU BRING
17 UP THE SLIDE ON THE DMV -- WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE? AND WHILE
18 YOU'RE DOING THAT, I REALLY WANT TO COMPLIMENT STAFF AND MY
19 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS. GREAT COMMENTS, AND I REALLY THINK WE'RE
20 HEADING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION, BUT THIS INPUT IS REALLY
21 IMPORTANT. DO YOU HAVE THAT ONE SLIDE? THE ONE WITH THE RED
22 INK?

23

24 **LYSA HALE:** NO. NO. THE NEXT SLIDE. THE OTHER DIRECTION. THERE
25 YOU GO.



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. SO I SEE THAT, AND THAT'S THE DMV FEE. IF I
3 GOT SOMETHING LIKE THAT, MY QUESTION WOULD BE HOW DO I CLEAR
4 THAT? WHAT INFORMATION IS GIVEN TO THE PERSON THAT REACHES
5 THIS POINT IN TIME? SO IF WE'RE COLLECTING DATA, I THINK THAT
6 WOULD BE REALLY IMPORTANT BECAUSE, OKAY, SO, I'M PAYING MY DMV
7 THING, I'LL PAY THE \$3, BUT WHAT ELSE -- HOW DO I CLEAR MY
8 RECORD? I THINK THAT WOULD BE IMPORTANT TO THE AVERAGE PERSON.
9 AND ALSO, IF WE'RE LOOKING AT THIS IN THE FUTURE AND GETTING
10 FASTRAK OUT THERE, YOU KNOW, CAN WE GET PARTNERSHIPS WITH DMV?
11 OR CAR DEALERS OR RENEWALS? IT'S KIND OF OFF THE SUBJECT HERE,
12 BUT AS WE HEAD DOWN THIS PATH, AND I REALLY WANT TO THANK
13 STAFF AND MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS FOR GREAT COMMENTS. I AM
14 EAGER TO SEE THESE BEST PRACTICES, AS FAR AS COLLECTIONS GO.
15 BECAUSE, I MEAN, AS FAR AS I KNOW IT SOMETIMES IF SOMETHING
16 GOES TO COLLECTIONS THE AGENCY IS GOING TO TRY TO GET AS MUCH
17 MONEY AS THEY CAN TO GET THEIR PERCENTAGE UP. SO BEST PRACTICE
18 IS REALLY WHAT INTERESTS ME THE MOST. SO TO MY COLLEAGUES IN
19 SAN FRANCISCO, I'M VERY EAGER TO SEE ALL OF THAT. THANK YOU SO
20 MUCH.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. MOVING ON,
23 WE HAVE COMMISSIONER SPERING AND COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR, I APPRECIATE A LOT
2 OF THE COMMENTS AND I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT YOU WANT TO
3 MAKE DECISIONS ON DATA. AND SO THAT REALLY IS EXTREMELY
4 IMPORTANT. THIS IS A VERY EMOTIONAL ISSUE, AND WE ALL FEEL
5 THAT WE SHOULD MAKE CERTAIN DECISIONS, BUT WE CAN'T LOSE SIGHT
6 OF WHO WE REALLY ARE SERVING. THAT'S THE PEOPLE THAT ARE GOING
7 ACROSS THOSE BRIDGES THAT ARE PAYING THOSE FEES THAT ARE
8 EXPECTING THOSE BRIDGES TO BE MAINTAINED AND FOR US TO MEET
9 THAT SERVICE. I THINK WE REALLY HAVE TO FOCUS ON WHO NEEDS
10 HELP, IF IT'S THAT LOW-INCOME PERSON. AND THAT'S WHAT OUR
11 WHOLE FOCUS SHOULD BE IS WHO NEEDS HELP. I DO NOT SUPPORT
12 PAYMENT PLANS FOR EVERYBODY. BECAUSE WE'RE NOT A LENDING
13 INSTITUTION. AND WE REALLY DON'T HAVE THE LUXURY OF CARRYING
14 THIS DEBT AND NOT MAINTAINING THE BRIDGES OR MEETING OUR DEBT
15 SERVICE. AND SO, THOSE ARE VERY IMPORTANT COMPLEX ISSUES. AND,
16 YOU KNOW, THERE ARE PEOPLE THAT NEED HELP. WE SHOULD DO THAT.
17 BUT IT JUST CAN'T BE A BLANK CHECK TO ANYBODY THAT WANTS TO
18 HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN OR, YOU KNOW, REALLY, CHEAT THE SYSTEM.
19 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT CHEAT THE SYSTEM IF
20 WE DON'T HAVE A GOOD PROGRAM TO IDENTIFY WHO ACTUALLY NEED THE
21 HELP. I ENCOURAGE STAFF TO CONTINUE LOOKING AT THE GOOD DATA
22 AND LET'S TRY TO IDENTIFY THE PEOPLE THAT DO NEED THAT HELP
23 AND PUT PROGRAMS AND APPLICATIONS THAT ARE SIMPLE TO FILL OUT,
24 EASY -- EVEN IF WE HAD A NAVIGATOR TO HELP THESE PEOPLE GO
25 THROUGH THAT PROCESS, I THINK THAT WOULD BE A WORTHWHILE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 INVESTMENT. BUT WE JUST CANNOT LOSE SIGHT OF THE FACT THAT WE
2 HAVE TO MAINTAIN THESE BRIDGES WE HAVE TO MEET OUR DEBT
3 SERVICE. AND THESE PROGRAMS CAN'T BE THE ANCHOR THAT REALLY
4 PUTS THOSE TWO ISSUES IN JEOPARDY. SO I WOULD JUST CAUTION
5 THAT WE REALLY FOCUS ON THE PEOPLE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO HELP.
6 THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

7

8 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. COMMISSIONER. AND NOW
9 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

10

11 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU COLLEAGUES FOR THE
12 THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSION. I WANT TO ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH TWO
13 SPECIFIC COMMENTERS. I THINK COMMISSIONER SPERING IS RIGHT,
14 THAT, YOU KNOW, OUR HIGH -- REALLY, OUR HIGHEST OBLIGATION IS
15 MAKING SURE THAT WE MEET OUR DEBT SERVICE THAT AND WE HAVE THE
16 RESOURCES TO MAINTAIN HEALTHY BRIDGES. I THINK THE POINT THAT
17 HILLARY STARTED US OFF WITH WAS, WHAT IS THE BEST PRACTICE TO
18 GET PEOPLE TO MAKE PAYMENTS AND TO DO THAT IN A WAY THAT'S
19 RESPECTFUL. I MEAN THOSE ARE THE TWO ISSUES WE'RE TRYING TO
20 ADDRESS. I ALSO WANT TO SAY TO HILLARY THAT I AGREE THAT, YOU
21 KNOW, THAT ONE OF THE CHALLENGES THAT WE'RE HAVING IS, I THINK
22 WE'RE OPERATING WITHOUT INFORMATION AND WITHOUT BEST
23 PRACTICES. I THINK COMMISSIONER PAPAN RAISES A GOOD POINT. AND
24 ONE. THINGS THAT I'LL TELL YOU THAT WE ARE SEEING ACROSS THE
25 COUNTRY IS THAT USING PROGRAMS THAT CREATE OPPORTUNITIES FOR



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PAYMENT PLANS THAT GIVE THE PERSON WHO IS BEING CHARGED THE
2 FLEXIBILITY INCREASES THE AMOUNT OF PAYMENTS RECEIVED. WE'RE
3 SEEING THAT IN CHILD SUPPORT. WE'RE SEEING THAT WITH PARKING
4 CITATIONS, WE'RE SEEING THAT WITH COURT CITATIONS. THAT IS
5 WHAT IS HAPPENING ACROSS THE COUNTRY. AND SO WE DO HAVE A BEST
6 PRACTICE. AND I THINK THAT THE QUESTION, REALLY, FOR STAFF, IS
7 HOW TO ATTACH THAT BEST PRACTICE TO THIS PARTICULAR PROGRAM,
8 AND WHAT I WOULD RECOMMEND THAT WE DO IS, I THINK IT'S VERY
9 GOOD TO TALK TO OUR CUSTOMERS. I ALSO THINK WE NEED TO TALK TO
10 EXPERTS IN THE FIELD AND CREATE WHETHER THAT'S AN RFQ OR RFI,
11 OR A PROCESS BY WHICH WE CAN GAIN INFORMATION, I THINK THAT
12 WOULD BE IDEAL. THE OTHER THING I WANT TO COMMENT IS THAT AT
13 OUR LAST MEETING, I THINK, ANDREW, I THINK IT MIGHT HAVE BEEN
14 YOU, RAISED THE ISSUE -- PARDON ME -- IT MIGHT NOT HAVE BEEN --
15 -- I'M SORRY -- NOT ENOUGH COFFEE, BUT I'LL GET THERE -- THAT
16 THE ISSUE THAT WE NEEDED TO ENGAGE OUR BOND COUNCIL AND THE
17 ISSUE I WANT TO RAISE WITH ALL OF YOU, THAT I THINK IS VERY
18 VALUABLE, BECAUSE I THINK OUR BOND COUNCIL MAY HAVE EXPERIENCE
19 THAT IS OUTSIDE JUST OF OUR PARTICULAR AREA, AND IT WOULD BE
20 IMPORTANT TO ASK THEM WHETHER OR NOT THERE IS ANY RISK TO BOND
21 RATINGS OR ANY OF THAT. MY BELIEF IS THAT CAN'T POSSIBLY BE
22 TRUE IF THERE ARE PROCESSES THAT ARE MORE EFFECTIVE AND
23 EFFICIENT THAN OLD FASHIONED COLLECTION AGENCY AND THAT'S THE
24 DISCUSSION WE'RE HAVING. WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO USE
25 SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO HAVE A PARTICULAR FRAMEWORK AND



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 APPROACH THAT HAS A CERTAIN LEVEL OF EFFECTIVENESS OR ARE WE
2 GOING TO TRY SOMETHING THAT WILL INCREASE EFFECTIVENESS AND IN
3 A MORE EQUITABLE WAY. I WANT TO ENCOURAGE STAFF TO THINK ABOUT
4 RFQ'S, RFI'S FOR THE PURPOSE OF GETTING IN SOME NEW FRAMEWORK
5 AND IDEAS AND I RECOGNIZE THERE IS COST IN THE SENSE THAT WE
6 DON'T WANT TO ELIMINATES SOMEBODY WHO COULD APPLY TO WORK WITH
7 US, SO OBVIOUSLY I LEAVE THAT TO STAFF'S INFORMATION. AND JUST
8 MY CLOSING COMMENT ON THIS -- AS I LOOK THROUGH A COUPLE OF,
9 NOW, BINDERS -- AND I CAN'T FIND, ANDREW, THE FRAMEWORK YOU
10 WERE TALKING ABOUT, IF YOU COULD JUST SEND THAT OUT TO
11 EVERYBODY TODAY. I WOULD LOVE IT. I APOLOGIZE I COULDN'T FIND
12 IT. I'M NOT GOOD AT DOING TWO THINGS AT ONCE.

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IT'S PART OF THE QUARTERLY -- WE CALL IT A
15 QUARTERLY -- IT'S THE QUARTERLY BATA FINANCIALS. THE DECEMBER
16 -- KIM IS WORKING ON SENDING IT TO YOU.

17

18 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** JUST WORK ON SENDING IT TO EVERYBODY. FROM
19 LOOKING AT IT -- I'M NOT SURE IF IT'S THE LEVEL OF DETAIL I'M
20 LOOKING AT MAYBE THAT'S WHY IT DIDN'T CATCH ME BUT I LOOK
21 FORWARD TO RECEIVING THAT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. IF THERE ARE NO
24 OTHER QUESTIONS BY THE COMMITTEE. I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE TO



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 PUBLIC COMMENT. FIRST I'LL TURN TO KIMBERLY, HAVE WE RECEIVED
2 ANY ADDITIONAL WRITTEN COMMENTS WITH REGARD TO THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO. WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING
5 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM. AND I DO SEE A NUMBER OF HANDS
6 RAISED FROM THE PUBLIC. IF YOU WOULD LIKE I WILL CALL ON EACH
7 OF THOSE.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THAT WOULD BE LOVELY. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I'LL SHARE MY SCREEN. YOU HAVE
12 TWO MINUTES EACH. FIRST SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE
13 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. MS. DUPREE ARE YOU THERE?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR AMY WORTH. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
16 RECORD SHE AND HER. LOTS OF GOOD INFORMATION IN THIS
17 PRESENTATION. I ALWAYS ENJOY LISA'S PRESENTATIONS. CERTAINLY I
18 DON'T WANT THE DMV HOLD TO BE ROUTINE. SHOULD BE SAFE FOR
19 THOSE WHO DELIBERATELY GO OUT AND EVADE TOLL THERE ARE
20 MECHANISMS FOR DEALING WITH THAT THERE WAS AN INCIDENT IN NEW
21 YORK WHERE THE POLICE STOPPED SOMEBODY FOR EVADING \$80,000 IN
22 TOLLS. I DON'T THINK DMV HOLD SHOULD BE USED ON A FREQUENT
23 BASIS. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE WHAT A PAYMENT PLAN WOULD LOOK
24 LIKE. IT LOOKS LIKE, I THINK THE NORTH TEXAS TOLL WAY
25 AUTHORITY DOES SUCH A PROGRAM. THOUGH I DON'T HAVE MUCH



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 INFORMATION ABOUT IT. BUT I THINK THEY DO. BUT THE THING IS
2 THAT WHENEVER YOU GET INTO FINANCING, THERE IS ALWAYS THE
3 COST. I COULD PROBABLY WALK INTO A FINANCE COMPANY THAT WOULD
4 LEND ME SOME MONEY WITHOUT ASKING FOR MY FINANCIALS. THEY WILL
5 PROBABLY CHARGE ME A VERY HIGH RATE OF INTEREST, AND I DON'T
6 EVEN KNOW IF SUCH -- IF SUCH A CREATURE EXISTS. AND DEBT IS
7 UNFORTUNATELY ONE OF THE MOST INEQUITABLY MARKETED PRODUCT IN
8 THE WORLD. SO IT'S OFTEN EASIEST FOR PEOPLE TO GET DEBT
9 PRODUCTS WHEN THEY NEED THEM THE LEAST. I THINK WE COULD
10 PROBABLY PARTNER WITH A FINANCIAL SOLUTION THAT WOULD WANT TO
11 TAKE ON OUR BOOK OF BUSINESS AT NO RISK TO BATA. BUT I'M NOT
12 PARTICULARLY FOND OF THE IDEA MUCH BATA GETTING IN THE
13 FINANCING BUSINESS. AND HOW MUCH WOULD THE FEES BE? YOU KNOW,
14 THE LAST THING I WANT IS MORE PEOPLE GETTING ON TO THE HAMSTER
15 WHEEL, WHICH OFTEN EVOLVING CREDIT S I THINK WE WANT TO WORK
16 TOWARDS FASTRAK AND MAKING THE PROCESS EASIER ACROSS THE
17 BOARD. THANK YOU.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ALETA THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
20 YOUR COMMENTS.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS SEAN YOUNG.
23 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** HELLO CAN YOU HEAR ME?



JANUARY 12, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** AWESOME. THANK YOU. HI MY NAME IS SEAN YOUNG AND I
5 WORK FOR THE SAN FRANCISCO FINANCIAL JUSTICE PROJECT OFFICE.
6 WHEN GOVERNMENT MAKES IT EASIER TO PAY ELIMINATES FEES THAT
7 DISINCENTIVIZE PEOPLE TO USE PAYMENT PLANS AND PENALIZES BOTH
8 PEOPLE AND GOVERNMENT BENEFIT. WE APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT THE
9 COMMISSION IS PURSUING OTHER REFORMS INCLUDING DESIGNING A
10 PAYMENT PLAN TO HELP PEOPLE PAY THEIR UNPAID TOLLS. MTC HAS AN
11 OPPORTUNITY TO BE A LEADER IN TRANSIT EQUITY. WE URGE MTC TO
12 DESIGN A PAYMENT PLAN THAT IS FREE WITH NO ENROLLMENT FEE
13 AVAILABLE TO ANYONE WHO NEEDS IT THE VAST MAJORITY OF PEOPLE
14 WHO CHOOSE TO ENROLL IN A PAYMENT PLAN ARE THOSE WHO CAN'T
15 AFFORD TO PAY TOLL FINES AND FEES UP FRONT PAYMENT PLANS
16 SHOULD BE AVAILABLE TO ANYONE WHO NEEDS THEM ASKING PEOPLE TO
17 PAY WHEN THEY CAN'T PAY HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF DOLLARS UP
18 FRONT MAKES IT LESS LIKELY PEOPLE WILL ENROLL IN PAYMENT PLANS
19 AND CREATES PAPERWORK. I APPRECIATE THE COMMISSIONERS COMMENT
20 IN ASSURING, NOT DISCOURAGING, PEOPLE IN ENROLLING IN PAYMENT
21 PLANS. WE ENCOURAGE MTC TO PURSUE OTHER FORMS SUCH AS END TO
22 THE USE OF DMV HOLDS THIS HAS BEEN IDENTIFIED BY IMPACTING
23 PEOPLE AS BEING MOST MEANINGFUL FOR THEM. DMV HOLD MAKES IT
24 INCREDIBLY DIFFICULT FOR PEOPLE TO MAKE A LIVING AND WORSENS
25 THE BARRIER WHERE PEOPLE CAN'T PAY IN THE 50 PLACE AND THE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 ABILITY TO AFFORD TO PAY. DMV HOLD COULD LEAD TO HOMELESSNESS
2 IF PEOPLE ARE LIVING OUT OF THEIR CARS BECAUSE THE DMV HOLD
3 SUBJECTS FOLKS TO THE RISK OF BEING TOWED. MUCH LIKE A LICENSE
4 SUSPENSION MAKES IT HARD FOR PEOPLE TO PAY FINES OR FEES.

5 [INDISCERNIBLE] SAN FRANCISCO SUPERIOR COURT STOPPED
6 SUSPENDING LICENSES DESPITE CONCERNS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THANK
7 YOU TO THE MTC EFFORTS TO IMPROVE THE TOLL SYSTEM --
8 [INDISCERNIBLE] FINES AND FEES IN SAN FRANCISCO. THANK YOU.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, SEAN. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
11 COMMENTS. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RICH HEDGES.

12

13 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. I HAVE AGREED WITH SO MUCH OF WHAT
14 I HAVE HEARD TODAY WITHOUT GOING INTO DETAIL I THINK IT WAS
15 SUMMED UP BEST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING, WE DON'T WANT TO
16 BECOME A LENDING INSTITUTION BUT HERE TO HELP THE PEOPLE WHO
17 REALLY NEED IT WITH THE EXPRESS LANE TOLLING WE WERE ABLE TO
18 GET THE WORD OUT TO 300,000 UNION MEMBERS WHICH IS MULTIPLIED
19 MOREOVER BY ALL THE FAMILY AND FRIENDS THAT THEY HAVE. AND ONE
20 OF THE EFFORTS THAT WE NEED TO DO IS MAKE SURE ONCE THIS IS
21 CODIFIED TO GET THE WORD OUT ON THIS, I'M WILLING TO HELP OUT
22 ON THAT AS WELL. BUT I WILL SAY I THINK WE'RE HEADED IN THE
23 RIGHT DIRECTION. THANK YOU.

24



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** RICH, THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY STAFF
2 HAS PUBLISHED A BLOG ON THE CHANGES WITH REGARDS TO OUR TOLL
3 PROGRAM AND FEES AND FINES AND IT'S ACTUALLY HOT OFF THE
4 PRESSES. SO PERFECT TIMING. MAY I TURN TO KIMBERLY FOR
5 ADDITIONAL COMMENTS?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. NEXT SPEAKER IS ILIYANA BINDER.
8 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS ELANA, THANK YOU FOR YOUR
11 CONCERNS WITH THE MTC FINANCIAL PENALTY SYSTEM THE SYSTEM IS
12 STILL FLAWED AND INEQUITABLE FINES AND FEES CONTINUE TO BE
13 HARMFUL COSTLY AND COUNTERPRODUCTIVE. MANY OF GLIDE'S CLIENTS
14 HAVE INCOMES THAT ARE FAR TOO LOW TO SHOULDER THE RESULTING
15 DEBT. EXACTING TOLL FINES AND FEES ESPECIALLY WHEN THEY
16 DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACT THOSE STRUGGLING TO MEET THEIR OWN
17 BASIC NEEDS FURTHER PERPETUATES CYCLES OF POVERTY ACROSS THE
18 BAY AREA AND DOESN'T ALIGN WITH MTC'S EQUITY PLATFORM WE URGE
19 YOU TO BUILD UPON REFORMS IMPLEMENTED DURING THE PANDEMIC AND
20 CONSIDER CHANGES TO ENSURE PEOPLE ACTUALLY KNOW WHEN THEY HAVE
21 A TOLL. FLAWS ARE IMPACTING LOW-INCOME PEOPLE NOW. PEOPLE IN
22 DEBT FROM FINES AND FEES NEED RELIEF NOW NOT IN A YEAR OR MORE
23 WE ASK THAT YOU ENACT FREE PAYMENT PLANS AND DEVELOP
24 ACCESSIBLE INCLUSIVE PAYMENT PLANS THAT DO NOTS CREATE
25 UNNECESSARY ADMINISTRATIVE BARRIERS. ADDITIONALLY, WE URGE YOU



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 TO CAP FINES LEVIED PER DRIVER, ELIMINATE THE SECOND NOTICE
2 FEE AND END FINES FOR PEOPLE WITH LOW-INCOMES. CONTINUE
3 SUSPENSION OF DMV HOLDS MODERNIZE NOTIFICATION SYSTEM AND
4 PROVIDE VIOLATION RELIEF BY VACATING ALL EXISTING UNPAID TOLLS
5 FINES AND FEES BY WORKING COLLABORATIVELY WITH ADVOCATES AND
6 FOLLOWING THESE RECOMMENDATIONS MTC CAN MAKE GREAT STRIDES
7 TOWARDS TRANSIT EQUITY AND CREATE A SYSTEM THAT WORKS FOR ALL
8 BAY AREA DRIVERS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR YOUR COMMENTS.
11 AND TURNING TO OUR STAFF. DO WE HAVE ANY ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS?
12 OR HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY ADDITIONAL WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
13 DURING THIS TIME?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE NOT RECEIVED ANY ADDITIONAL
16 CORRESPONDENCE AND I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED.

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT GREAT. KIMBERLY THANK YOU VERY
19 MUCH FOR THAT. WE WILL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK
20 -- THIS IS NOT AN ACTION ITEM. IT IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. AND
21 I JUST -- IF THERE ARE NO FURTHER COMMENTS, I JUST WANTED TO
22 WRAP UP BY THANKING -- FIRST OF ALL, THANKING STAFF FOR YOUR
23 PRESENTATION AND FOR FORMULATING THE NEXT STEPS TO ADDRESS THE
24 COMMENTS THAT YOU HAVE HEARD TODAY, AND JUST IN LOOKING AT THE
25 LITERATURE, I KNOW WE ARE AHEAD -- THERE IS A PHRASE THAT SAYS



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THE WEST COAST, THREE HOURS BEHIND BUT TEN YEARS AHEAD, AND
2 WHEN YOU LOOK AT OTHER TRANSIT -- YOU KNOW, AGENCIES, I THINK
3 THAT OUR COMMISSION EFFORTS ON EQUITY AND DEALING WITH THESE
4 TOLLING ISSUES AND FEES AND FINES IS REALLY SIGNIFICANT. THE
5 WORK WE HAVE DONE TO DATE, AND THE WORK THAT WE'RE GOING TO GO
6 FORWARD IN DOING, AND LOOKING AT BEST PRACTICES. YOU KNOW, THE
7 CHALLENGE WITH THE BRIDGE TOLL ENTERPRISE IS IT IS THE FEE --
8 YOU KNOW, THE TOLLS ARE THE -- 100% OF OUR REVENUE. SO IT IS -
9 - IT IS VERY DIFFERENT FROM OTHER JURISDICTIONS WHERE, SORT
10 OF, USER FEES ARE A SMALL PORTION OF THE ENTERPRISE. SO, I
11 THINK THAT, TOO, JUST TO POINT OUT, TOO, RELATIVE TO THE
12 QUESTION OF OUR BONDS HOLDERS, THAT WE ARE, THESE POLICIES ARE
13 ALL BEING DEVELOPED IN CONJUNCTION WITH, THROUGH THE BOND
14 COVENANTS IN THE ASSURANCE THAT WE DO HAVE THESE, YOU KNOW,
15 LITERALLY, THESE OBLIGATIONS AND RESPONSIBILITIES RECOGNIZING
16 THAT WE HAVE BORROWED TO DO THE RETROFITS OF THE BRIDGES, AND
17 TO DO A LOT OF THE CAPITAL WORK THAT WE'RE DOING. SO, I AM --
18 YOU KNOW, REALLY ENCOURAGED BY THIS DECISION FROM THE
19 COMMITTEE, AS WELL AS THE STAFF. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO HAVING
20 THIS COME BACK TO US. AND I ALSO APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT
21 STAFF IS PROVIDING THE RESOURCES TO DO THIS ANALYSIS AND
22 BRINGING IT BACK, I THINK, WHAT I HAVE HEARD FROM THE
23 COMMITTEE, TOO, IS A REAL SENSE OF URGENCY, THAT WE WANT TO
24 CONTINUE TO MOVE DELIBERATIVELY TO BRING BACK POLICIES AND
25 PROGRAMS MOVING FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU, ALL. AND I -- WITH



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 THAT, THEN, I'LL PULL BACK MY AGENDA HERE, AND IF THERE ARE NO
2 FURTHER COMMENTS. I'M LOOKING AROUND. THEN WE WILL BRING OUR
3 NEXT ITEM, IT IS GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. ON ANY ITEM BEFORE
4 THIS COMMITTEE. I'LL ASK STAFF IF WE HAVE ANY GENERAL PUBLIC
5 COMMENT?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS ONE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
8 THAT'S BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA. THE NAME IS WITHHELD
9 AT THE WRITERS REQUEST. BUT IT IS POSTED ONLINE. AND THERE IS
10 ONE PERSON WITH THEIR HAND UP. ALETA DUPREE, PLEASE GO AHEAD
11 AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR AMY WORTH. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
14 RECORD. SHE AND HER. GOOD MEETING TODAY. NEVER A DULL MOMENT
15 AT BATA. AND I SPEAK GENERALLY. THINGS HAVE BEEN QUIET AS FAR
16 AS TOLL AGENCIES GO, PROBABLY BECAUSE IT'S WINTER AND NOT A
17 LOT OF CONSTRUCTION IS GOING ON. BUT THE WORK IS CONTINUING.
18 AND THERE IS LOTS OF THINGS THAT WE CAN DO EVEN WHEN IT'S COLD
19 AND SNOWING OUTSIDE IN SOME PLACES, AND WE COULDN'T EXACTLY
20 DIG INTO THE GROUND AND [INDISCERNIBLE] THINGS UP. THAT WILL
21 WAIT UNTIL SPRING. CERTAINLY THE IDEA OF HAVING THE SAFEST AND
22 MOST USER FRIENDLY BRIDGE EXPERIENCE IS PARAMOUNT TO ME. AND
23 IT IS ESSENTIAL THAT EVERYTHING THAT WE DO BE FRAMED IN THE
24 IDEA OF US BEING ABLE TO MAINTAIN THIS NETWORK. I REMEMBER IN
25 APRIL OF 1987, WHEN I LIVED IN ALBANY NEW YORK, HEARING THE



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 NEWS OF THE SCHOHARIE CREEK BRIDGE COLLAPSE THEN THERE WAS THE
2 SHUT DOWN OF INTERSTATE 95 IN CONNECTICUT SEVERAL FOR SEVERAL
3 MONTHS AND A BRIDGE COLLAPSE THAT HAPPENED IN MINNEAPOLIS. I
4 DON'T WANT THAT TO HAPPEN I'M THROWING WORST-CASE SCENARIOS TO
5 YOU, I DON'T OWN A CAR MYSELF AND OTHER PEOPLE ARE PAYING THE
6 TOLLS UNLESS THEY'RE TRANSIT BUSES THEN THEY DON'T PAY TOLLS
7 OR IF I'M NO A RIDE-SHARE THEY PASS THE TOLL ON TO ME ANYWAY
8 AND THAT'S FINE. I'M WILLING TO DO MY PART. BUT WE JUST WANT
9 TO DO THE BEST WE CAN FOR THE SYSTEM. AND I THINK WE ARE THE
10 LEADERS IN INNOVATIONS AND TRANSPARENCY. AND I ASK THAT YOU
11 NOT BE INTIMIDATED BY THE BIGNESS OF EVERYTHING THAT WE DO.
12 BUT WE HAVE A GREAT TRADITION IN HISTORY AND I ASK THAT WE
13 CONTINUE THE GREAT WORK GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALETA FOR YOUR COMMENTS. AND AS WE
16 MOVE THROUGH ADJOURNMENT, I WANT TO CIRCLE BACK. LYSA HALE,
17 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TREMENDOUS WORK ON THIS AND YOUR
18 REPORT TODAY AND JUST MOVING FORWARD IN INCORPORATING THE
19 COMMENTS THAT YOU HAVE HEARD TODAY AND TO ALL OF THE STAFF
20 THAT'S WORKING ON THIS. SO, THANK YOU SO MUCH. YOU GET THE --
21 YOU HAVE THE PLEASURE OF BEING THE FACE OF THE EFFORT. AND I
22 KNOW IT'S A HUGE TEAM EFFORTS BUT I WANT TO THANK YOU VERY
23 MUCH FOR YOUR WORK, AND EVERYONE. LOOK FORWARD TO NEXT STEPS
24 WITH THIS WHEN THIS COMES BACK TO OUR COMMITTEE. THANK YOU ALL
25 VERY MUCH. WITH THAT WE WILL ADJOURN OUR BATA OVERSIGHT



JANUARY 12, 2022

1 COMMITTEE TO OUR NEXT MEETING TO OUR NEXT MEETING ALCOHOL BE
2 WEDNESDAY FEBRUARY 9TH REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST. MEETING IS
3 ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42



Broadcasting Government