# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript

**METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

**BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY**

**WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 27, 2021, 10:20 A.M.**

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. MY NAME IS ALFREDO PEDROZA CHAIR OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. I'M GOING TO CALL TO ORDER THE MTC BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCE AUTHORITY. GOOD MORNING. WE ALREADY HAD ONE MEETING AND ACKNOWLEDGED THAT WE'RE CELEBRATING THE FACT THAT WE'RE IN THE BUILDING. IT'S SO GOOD TO BE HERE. AND ACKNOWLEDGE OUR STAFF. WHO MADE THIS HAPPEN. THIS DOESN'T HAPPEN ON ITS OWN. INCREDIBLE WORK. AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS I SEE IN THE SQUARES THANK YOU FOR TAKING THE TIME. AT THIS POINT, IF WE COULD PLEASE PLAY THE INTRODUCTORY RECORDING? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, IT TEAM, FOR THAT. LET'S MOVE ON TO ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ? COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ? IS ABSENT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** SORRY. I FORGOT TO UNMUTE MYSELF. I'M HERE. VERY EXCITED TO BE HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

**DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY? EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIOCAPINI?

**DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** I'M EXCITED AS NICK TO BE HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM, MR. CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I LOVE THE EXCITEMENT. IT NEEDS TO LAST UNTIL. SO PACE YOURSELF. IF YOU COULD PLEASE JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. FIND A FLAG. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, ALL. LET'S MOVE TO ITEM THREE, COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. KIMBERLY, IF YOU COULD PLEASE THE READ THE ANNOUNCEMENT?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, AND MR. CHAIR, IF I MIGHT MAKE A CORRECTION TO THE ROLL CALL, THE QUORUM IS PRESENT FOR MTC AND BAHFA, AND WITH THAT, I'LL DO THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU'RE WELCOME. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE $100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF $500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. KIMBERLY, AT THIS POINT, WE'RE GOING MOVE TO ITEM FOUR. JOINT MTC AND BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, KIM, VIRTUALLY?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH HAND RAISED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I SEE NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM. I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR OUR CONSENT CALENDAR?

**SPEAKER:** MOVE T.

**SPEAKER:** SECONDS.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND.

**KATHLEEN KANE:** I'M SORRY. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO DO THIS SEPARATELY. THE MOTION WAS FOR MTC?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THAT'S CORRECT.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RESOLUTION 4492. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S MOVE ON TO THE SECOND PART OF THIS ITEM. THIS IS FOR THE BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR. I WILL LOOK FOR A MOTION.

**AMY R. WORTH:** MOVE APPROVAL.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER WORTH.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND BY ABE-KOGA.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY ABE-KOGA. KIMBERLY, ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. I DON'T SEE ANYONE IN THE BOARD CHAMBERS WITH PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. FIRST BY WORTH, SECOND BY ABE-KOGA. ROLL CALL, VOTE, PLEASE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BAHFA RESOLUTION NUMBER THREE. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S MOVE TO ITEM FIVE, PUBLIC COMMENT. I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. INTO THE RECORD. I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES TO PARTICIPATE VIA TELECONFERENCE TO RAISE YOUR HAPPENED OR PRESS STAR NINE? KIMBERLY ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WE HAVE NONE IN THE BOARDROOM WHO WISHES TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU. ITEM SIX, ADJOURNMENT OF BAHFA, THIS AUTHORITY OF THIS MEETING IS NOW ADJOURNED. SO WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE WITH MTC AGENDA. OUR NEXT ITEM IS SEVEN, CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. IT IS WITH HONOR THAT I'M GOING TO PRESENT MTC RESOLUTION 4491 IN APPRECIATION FOR BENJAMIN FOR HIS RETIREMENT. DUE TO LIST OF ACCOMPLISHMENTS I WILL NOT READ THE ENTIRE RESOLUTION BECAUSE IT COULD GO ALL DAY. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT HIS WORK ESPECIALLY IN DEVELOPING ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT ADOPTED PLAN, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THERE WAS QUESTION THAT HE COULDN'T RETIRE UNTIL THAT GOT APPROVED. CONGRATULATIONS BEN. BEGAN HIS CAREER AS BRIDGE AND HIGHWAY OPERATIONS BEFORE TURNING TO TRAVEL MODELING, AND HIGHWAY PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS OVERSAW SUCCESSFUL TRANSITION TO MODERN SPACE DATA COLLECTION METHOD. BEN'S AMBITIOUS REALIZED TRANSIT PROJECTS, OAKLAND, ALAMEDA BART EXTENSION REACHING AS FAR AS GILROY TO SMART EXTENSION OVER THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE TO SAN FRANCISCO RESTORING KEY ROUTE STREETCAR LINE RUNNING ALONG THE SAN PABLO AVENUE EAST BAY AS WELL AS SEEMINGLY THOUSANDS OF ITERATIONS OF MODELING FOR BART AND SAN JOSE, RESOLVED STAFF COMMISSION RESOLUTION,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FOR HIS GENEROSITY COLLABORATIVE EFFORTS WITH THIS RESOLUTION. WE WISH YOU WELL IN COACHELLA VALLEY. WOULD YOU LIKE TO SAY ANY WORDS?

**MATT MALONEY:** BEN COULD NOT BE HERE TODAY HE'S WITH HIS MOM IN PERT OWE RICO DEALING WITH SOME ISSUES. I WILL OFFER SOME WORDS ON HIS REGARDS, BEN'S RULE DEVELOPMENT FOR EACH PROCESS, [INDISCERNIBLE] RINGS TRUE FOR A COUPLE OF REASONS BEN IS DOWN THERE IN PUERTO RICO NOW WITH FAMILY ISSUES AND SOMETIMES THE REASONS PROCESSES GROUND TO HALT IS BECAUSE BEN'S ROLE AND EXPERTISE WAS SO SPECIALIZED AND TRANSLATION OF HIS IDEAS, SOMETIMES NOT FULLY DEVELOPED AND PRESENTING IN OUR TRAVEL MODELS THIS IS BEHIND THE SCENES WORK THAT'S NOT ALWAYS VISIBLE MAYBE TO YOU OR THE PUBLIC, HUGELY IMPORTANT CRITICAL PART, BEN SENDS HIS REGARDS.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GREAT PERSPECTIVE AND GREAT WORDS TO SHARE WE WISH BEN AND HIS FAMILY WELL. AT THIS POINT, COMMISSIONERS DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? COMMENTS? KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANYONE VIRTUALLY THAT WISHES TO MAKE ANY COMMENTS?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, MR. CHAIR. AND I'LL MAKE NOTE THAT BEN SENT A LETTER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF APPRECIATION THAT I WILL DISTRIBUTE TO THE COMMISSIONERS THIS AFTERNOON.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY. WE DON'T HAVE ANY MEMBERS IN BOARD CHAMBERS THAT WISH TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. AT THIS POINT I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO ACCEPT MTC RESOLUTION 4491. FIRST, COMMISSIONER SPERING.

**DAVID RABBIT:** SECT, RABBIT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ITEM EIGHT POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. RANDI KINMAN.

**RANDI KINMAN:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR, THANK YOU. AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONED. AS SOMEBODY WHO CHAIRS A WHOLE BODY IN A HYBRID SITUATION, BRAVO TO THOSE WHO MAKE IT LOOK SEAMLESS TODAY. POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS ACTIVELY WORKING TO COMPLETE ALL WORK THIS YEAR. THIS COHORT WILL BE ENDING ITS TERM WITH ORIGINAL MEMBERS, EXTENDED BY ONE MORE YEAR. WE CHOSE TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

EXTEND OUR JOURNEY AND THAT ALLOWED YOU TO HAVE ON HAND PEOPLE WITH YEARS OF SEASONED EXPERIENCE TO WRAP UP ALL PROJECTS THAT ISSUES IN THE LAST 18 MONTHS HAVE THROWN AT US NOT JUST WITH DEVOTED CREWS, OUR SHIFTING MEETING PROTOCOLS HELPED AND ALLOWS US TO BE EFFICIENT AND MORE ENGAGED I HOPE THAT AS YOU MOVE INTO NEXT YEAR'S WORK PLAN THAT YOU KEEP IN MIND TO BUILD INTO OUR SYSTEM THE FLEXIBILITY TO CONTINUE TO WORK THIS WAY. SPEAKING OF WORK PLANS WE WILL BE SEATING THE NEXT COHORT WHILE WE WERE BUSY WITH PLANNED BAY AREA EIR AND OTHER COMMITTEES WE HAVE ISSUES WE WANT TO RAISE IN THE FUTURE WE WILL BE LOOKING AT CENSUS NUMBERS THROUGH EQUITY LENSES WE KNOW THERE ARE ONGOING PROJECTS BUT GIVEN TIME AND SPACE WE CAN TACKLE A LOT MORE. IF YOU WERE WONDERING WHAT WE COULD COME UP WITH I WILL POINT OUT THE EQUITY ISSUES REGARDING TOLLING HAS BEEN IN OUR WORK PLAN AND ON OUR AGENDAS SINCE ANYBODY OPENED AN HOV LANE IN THE BAY AREA. SAME COULD BE SAID FOR FARE INTEGRATION AND SIGNAGE PROJECTS THAT ARE NOW THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT RECOVERY PLANS AS WE DEVELOP A WORK PLAN SO WILL BE THE NEXT COHORT OF POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS AND I URGE TO YOU THINK ABOUT THE ISSUES ON YOUR WORK PLAN AND HOW THEY CAN BENEFIT FROM BEING RUN THROUGH BODY TRAINED TO PROVIDE INPUT. AGAIN, THAT ENDS MY REPORT. AND THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, RANDI, FOR THAT REPORT. COMMISSIONERS DO WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR RANDI? IS SEEING NONE HERE. KIMBERLY, ANYONE VIRTUAL?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO HANDS RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** RANDI THANK YOU FOR BEING WITH US TODAY. ITEM NINE, OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THERESE MCMILLAN.

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. CHAIR. I WILL NOTE THAT I AM IN HYBRID MODE TODAY, HOPEFULLY WILL SEE YOU ALL TOMORROW IN PERSON. I WANT TO QUICKLY START WITH A NOD TO BEN. FOR ANYONE WHO HAS BEEN INVOLVED WITH PLANNING, YOU KNOW THAT GOOD MODELERS ARE A GOLDEN TREASURE, AND WE HAVE GREAT MODELERS, AND I WISH HIM GOOD LUCK AND CONGRATULATIONS TO HIM. LAST WEEK WAS A MOMENTOUS WEEK, AND I AM, SORT OF, STATING THE OBVIOUS BUT IT'S WORTH MENTIONING AS PART OF THE ED REPORT FOR THE MONTH THAT WE ADOPTED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. [LAUGHTER] BY UNANIMOUS VOTE BOTH BY THE COMMISSION AND OF ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. IT REALLY WAS A MILESTONE THAT WAS YEARS IN THE MAKING. WE HAVE CONGRATULATED STAFF PROFUSELY. BUT, AGAIN, WE WOULD NOT HAVE GOTTEN THAT VOTE WITHOUT THE UNBELIEVABLE SACRIFICE AND COMMITMENT OF TOO MANY PEOPLE ON STAFF TO MENTION, AS WELL AS YOU. AND THE SUPPORT THAT YOU ALL GAVE US,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AGAIN, FOR MANY STICKY ISSUES, YOU STOOD BEHIND US AS WE WORKED THROUGH THEM. YOU GAVE US GREAT COUNSEL ON MANY ISSUES AND CHALLENGES THAT WE SAW ALONG THE WAY. SO I HOPE WE ALL CONTINUE TO DRAW GREAT SATISFACTION FROM THIS, BUT NOTING, AS WELL, THE WORK IS NOT DONE. NOW WE LAUNCH INTO THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, WHICH IS REALLY SPEAKING TO HOW ARE WE GOING TO CARRY OUT MANY OF THE AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES THAT ARE AHEAD. AND THE COMMISSION WORKSHOP WE'LL BE TAKING THAT ON, ON SOME SPECIFIC ONES. SO JUST WANTED TO USE THE OPPORTUNITY TO STAGE THAT FOR YOU. SECOND POINT, AND, AGAIN, SORT OF, TYING -- OR CONNECTING DOTS TOGETHER ON THOSE NEXT STEPS, AS ONE EXAMPLE OF THE SUPPORT TOOLS THAT WE HAVE FOR THE BROADER PORTFOLIO PLANNED BAY AREA, INCLUDING HOUSING, THE REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM, UNDER THE GUIDANCE OF OUR TEAM, HAS RELEASED A HOUSING ELEMENT SITE SELECTION TOOL. A LOT OF WEBINARS HAVE BEEN CONDUCTED WITH A LOT OF PARTICIPATION. BUT THIS REALLY IS A PRETTY GROUND-BREAKING TOOL FOR ASSISTING OUR JURISDICTIONS TO DETERMINE WHICH SITE MEETS STATE REQUIREMENTS FOR ZONING. THIS IS ALL WITHIN THE PURVIEW OF IMPLEMENTING RHNA AND THE HOUSING ELEMENT. SO, AGAIN, THIS INVOLVED A LOT OF FEEDBACK FROM LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ON WHAT THEY NEEDED AND HERE IS AN EXAMPLE WHERE THEY ACTUALLY HAVE PROVIDED SOMETHING OF GREAT VALUE. THE THIRD THING I WOULD LIKE TO MENTION IS ON OCTOBER THE 25TH, WHICH WAS JUST MONDAY, FTA ANNOUNCED A LETTER OF INTENT, OR AN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOI, BECAUSE WE LOVE ACRONYMS FOR VTA BART SILICON VALLEY PROJECT, PHASE TWO, ANNOUNCING THE PROJECT WAS SELECTED FOR FUNDING THROUGH THE EXPEDITED PROJECT DELIVERY PILOT PROGRAM PUT FORWARD BY THE LAST ADMINISTRATION. IT IS AN IMPORTANT STEP TOWARDS SECURING A FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT FROM FTA, AND, SO WE'RE VERY GRATEFUL FOR THAT WORK, AND, OF COURSE, AMONG MANY PARTNERS, WE WILL BE WORKING ON VTA ON THE PATH AHEAD. I WOULD NOTE THAT AT THE REQUEST OF ASSEMBLYMAN -- STATE ASSEMBLYMAN TING, AND SENATE -- SENATOR NANCY SKINNER CHAIRS OF THE RESPECTIVE ASSEMBLY AND SENATE BUDGET COMMITTEES, WE DISCUSSED TRANSIT PRIORITIES FOR THE REGION WITH BOTH OF OUR LEGISLATORS WHO ARE WANTING TO GET AHEAD OF THE CONTINUING DISCUSSION THAT WILL BE ATTACHED TO THE NEXT STATE BUDGET, AND THE REMAININGS OF CARRY OVER ISSUES ATTACHED TO TRANSPORTATION, INCLUDING HIGH SPEED RAIL, AND HOW THE BUDGET SURPLUS, WHICH BY ALL ACCOUNTS, CONTINUES TO BE REFINED, AND INCREASED IN TERMS OF ESTIMATES FROM THE LAO. WANTING TO MAKE SURE, VERY MUCH, LIKE LA HAS DONE, TO HAVE A CLEAR SENSE OF WHAT OUR PROGRAMMATIC AND PROJECT PRIORITIES MAY BE. IT WAS A VERY GOOD DISCUSSION. I WOULD SAY ONE OF SEVERAL, AND WE CERTAINLY WILL BE KEEPING THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE APPRISED OF THIS FLUID SITUATION AS IT PROCEEDS. SO, MR. CHAIR, THAT CONCLUDES MY REPORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH THERESE. AND I JUST WANT TO CALL ATTENTION TO THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WEB PORTAL. I THINK THAT'S AN INCREDIBLE TOOL, THERESE, THAT COULD BE SCALEABLE. YOU KNOW, ONE THING AS MAYOR ARREGUIN AND I HAVE BEEN LISTENING, WE HAVE THE ABILITY TO GET MORE HOUSING UNITS APPROVED BUT THERE IS BACKLOG BECAUSE OF PLANNING. I THINK FOCUSING ON THAT ABAG SPACE COULD BE INSTRUMENTAL AND A ROLE ABAG COULD PLAY TO GET MORE UNITS BUILT IF THERE IS CAPACITY. I WANT TO CALL ATTENTION TO THAT I THINK IT'S A GREAT TOOL FOR MUNICIPALITIES. ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARDROOM? SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY ANY VIRTUALLY?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE ONE HAND RAISED. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, MR. CHAIR. MR. LEBRUN. PLEASE UNMUTE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**SPEAKER:** THANK YOU GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY. AS SOME OF YOU KNOW I HAVE BEEN WRITING TO THE COMMISSION ABOUT PROJECT, INCLUDING THE MAINTAINING PHASE 1 AND 100% TWO AND A HALF BILLION DOLLARS OVER BUDGET FOR PHASE ONE. THE QUESTION IS, YOU KNOW THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT HAVE NOW INCREASED THE ESTIMATE FOR PHASE ONE BY $2.2 BILLION. SO THE QUESTION IS, IS THIS THE SAME AMOUNT? ARE WE TALKING ABOUT THE SAME MONEY HERE? IF NOT, I THINK THERE IS ABSOLUTELY NO WAY THE VTA IS ANYWHERE NEAR THE FINANCIAL CAPACITY TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

EMBARK ON THIS PROJECT, LET ALONE TO BRING IT TO SOME KIND OF A SUCCESSFUL COMPLETION. SO, IN INTEREST OF TIME, LET ME WRAP UP HERE AND GET STRAIGHT TO THE POINT HERE. I'M RESPECTFULLY REQUESTING THAT THE COMMISSION -- THAT THE COMMISSION, IMMEDIATELY ENGAGE IN THE OVERSIGHT OF THIS PROJECT. STARTING WEATHER EXPEDITED PROJECT FUNDING, THAT CAPS FEDERAL CONTRIBUTIONS AT 25% IS APPROPRIATE, WHETHER THE VTA SHOULD BE -- SHOULD COME TO SEE THE TRANSITIONING TO A FEDERAL USE START APPLICATION, WHICH CAPS FEDERAL FUNDING AT 50 -- 5-0%. THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HAND RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND, THANK YOU, ROLAND. SEEING NO FURTHER QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS. I'LL MOVE TO ITEM TEN, COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? KIMBERLY SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS VIRTUALLY

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SEEING NONE.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM 11 CONSENT CALENDAR, IF THERE IS NO QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR OUR CONSENT CALENDAR.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES FOR CONSENT CALENDAR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** DUTRA-VERNACI MAKES THE MOTION.

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** I'LL SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY GLOVER. KIMBERLY ANY COMMENT FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WE HAVE A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI, AND SECOND BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S MOVE ON TO COMMITTEE REPORTS. ITEM 12, PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. CHAIR RABBIT, TAKE IT AWAY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY ON OCTOBER 13TH, 2021 AND REFERRED THE FOLLOW ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4450 REVISED FISCAL YEAR 2021 '22 FUND ESTIMATE. UPDATES TO FUND ESTIMATE TO REFLECT ACTUAL FISCAL YEAR '21 -- EXCUSE ME -- 2020, 2021 REVENUE FOR THE STATE TRANSIT, STA STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAMS AND REVISES FISCAL YEAR 2021, '22 REVENUE ESTIMATES ACCORDINGLY AND I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4450 REVISED.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY CHAIR RABBIT. LOOK FOR A SECOND.

**GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. KIMBERLY HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONERS, IF THERE IS NO FURTHER QUESTIONS. WE HAVE A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND I BELIEVE THE SECOND WAS COMMISSIONER PAPAN. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBIT. WE'RE GOING MOVE TO ITEM 13, COMMISSION APPROVAL 13AMTC RESOLUTION 4481 REVISED AMERICAN RESCUE ACT PHASE TWO PROGRAMMING RECOMMENDATION. I'M GOING TO TURN THIS OVER TO THERESA.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** THE ITEM BEFORE YOU TODAY IS A PROGRAMMING PROPOSAL FOR PHASE TWO AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ACT ARP COVID RELIEF FUND FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. AS YOU RECALL AT THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING STAFF PROVIDED BACKGROUND ON THE RECENT FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION'S FUNDING OPPORTUNITY FOR 2.2 BILLION IN ADDITIONAL OPERATING ASSISTANCE. THESE FUNDS ARE COMPETITIVE AND AT FTA'S DISCRETION TO DISTRIBUTE. ONE OF THE REQUIREMENTS OF APPLICANTS FOR THIS ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE FUNDING IS THAT THEY DEMONSTRATE THE LEVEL OF OPERATING ASSISTANCE THE OPERATOR HAD RECEIVED FROM ALL THREE COVID RELIEF PACKAGES, THAT INCLUDES CARES, CRRSAA AND ARP. PROBLEMATIC FOR MTC THE GOVERNMENT HAS SAID UNPROGRAMMED AMOUNTS OF COVID-19 FUNDING REMAINING IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

URBANIZED AREA FOR THE APPLICANTS WOULD BE ELIGIBLE CONSIDERED AVAILABLE AS FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE FOR OPERATOR APPLICATION FOR ADDITIONAL SYSTEMS DUE IN EARLY NOVEMBER WE INTENDED FOR THE PROGRAM PHASE TWO DECEMBER OR JANUARY TIME FRAME TO ALLOW FOR DISTRIBUTION INFORMED BY THE PACE AND EXTENT OF THE PANDEMIC RECOVERY WE INFORMED THAT WE WOULD BE COMING BACK TO YOU AT THE COMMISSION MEETING TO PROGRAM REMAINING FUND TO OPERATORS THIS MONTH AND HAD FURTHER INTENDED PROGRAM REMAINING FUND THAT HAD BEEN SET-ASIDE FOR BLUE RIBBON INACTIVES AS WELL AS SPECIFIC HARDSHIP FOCUSED RECOVERY STRATEGIES TO MTC FOR LATER DETERMINATION ON HOW FUNDS WOULD BE EXPENDED. FOLLOWING THE OCTOBER PACT MEETING WE HAD ADDITIONAL CONVERSATIONS WITH FTA WHO INDICATE THAT PROGRAMMING ANY FUND TO BE USED FOR BLUE RIBBON OR UNSPECIFIED PURPOSES INSTEAD OF ON DIRECT TRANSIT OPERATING SUPPORT MAY HARM THE COMPETITIVENESS OF BAY AREA OPERATORS APPLYING A SHARE OF THE 2.2 BILLION IN ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE. STAFF HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS OVER THE PAST COUPLE OF WEEKS TO DEVELOP A REFINED RECOMMENDATION FOR ARP PHASE TWO PROGRAMMING. OUR RECOMMENDATION APPROACH, TODAY, WOULD DISTRIBUTE THE ARP FUNDS TO ALL BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES FOR OPERATING RELIEF USING THE FORMULA DEVELOPED FOR THE JULY 2020 PROGRAMMING OF PHASE ONE. IT WOULD RESPOND TO SPECIFIC HARDSHIP REQUESTS FROM SFMTA AND VTA AND FULLY CORRECT FOR DATA INCONSISTENCY THAT IMPACTED THE CALTRAIN AND WETA DISTRIBUTION. AND THAT HAS CARRIED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FORWARD TO PHASE TWO. THIS APPROACH WOULD ENSURE THAT TRANSIT FUNDING PLANNED FOR NEAR-TERM COMMISSION PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATION INCLUDING STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE AND FTA FORMULA FUNDING WOULD BE AVAILABLE FOR BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES AT THE MINIMUM AMOUNT OF $85 MILLION. AND, LASTLY, THE APPROACH WOULD FULFILL THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE FTA'S NOTICE OF FUNDING OPPORTUNITY FOR THE 2.2 BILLION IN COMPETITIVE COVID RELIEF IN ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE AND ENSURE THAT BAY AREA OPERATORS WOULD BE ABLE TO COMPETE WELL FOR THOSE FUNDS. YOU CAN FIND A SUMMARY OF STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWING THIS APPROACH IN ATTACHMENT A TO THIS ITEM. IN REGARD TO HARDSHIP FUNDING, DUE TO COMMISSIONER INPUT AT THE OCTOBER PACT MEETING AND ON ACCOUNT OF SFMTA SHARE OF BAY AREA TRANSIT RIDERSHIP STAFF IS PROPOSE TO PROGRAM $29.7 MILLION OF REMAINING HARDSHIP TO SFMTA TO LIMIT THE IMPACT OF REDUCED SERVICE LEVELS ON TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS AND TO FURTHER ADDRESS IMPACTS OF 2021 TRAGEDY REMAINING $1.8 MILLION REMAINING HARDSHIP FUNDS TO BE PROGRAMMED TO VTA SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS WOULD ASSIST ARE REVENUE LOSSES ASSOCIATED WITH TEMPORARY LIMITATION OF LIGHT RAIL SERVICE RESULTING FROM THE TRAGEDY AND BRING TOTAL HARDSHIP PROGRAM TO VTA TO $30.4 MILLION. AND STAFF RECOMMENDING PROGRAM TOTAL $2.4 MILLION HARDSHIPS FUNDS TO CALTRAIN AND WETA TO RECONCILE UNDER DISTRIBUTION FUNDING CAUSED BY DATA INCONSISTENCY CARRIED OVER FROM PHASE ONE DISTRIBUTION. I WANT TO ERIC SIZE RECOMMENDATIONS PLAN FOR ENSURING SUFFICIENT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FUNDING AVAILABLE TO TRANSIT FOR BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE INITIATIVES ALTHOUGH PROSING DISTRIBUTION OF $85 MILLION INTENDED TO BE USED FOR INITIATIVES TO OPERATORS AS PART OF PHASE OPERATORS APPLYING F ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE WE ANTICIPATE REPLACING ARP FUNDS WITH ALTERNATE NEAR-TERM REVENUE SOURCES SUCH AS STATE AND FEDERAL FUND TRANSIT FUNDING IN PROPORTION TO OPERATORS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WITH EXCEPTION OF THE HARDSHIP FUNDING AUGMENTATION THIS DOESN'T CHANGE OVERALL NET FUNDING FOR OPERATORS IT SIMPLY ADJUSTS TIME FRAME AND SERVICES AVAILABLE TO FINISHED BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES FOR PURPOSES OF EXPEDITING DISTRIBUTION OF ARP FUNDING AND WE KNOW WE HAVE OPERATOR SUPPORT FOR THIS RECOMMENDATION. STAFF BELIEVE THIS IS RECOMMENDATION POSITION FOR THE BAY AREA TO BE COMPETITIVE FOR THE $2.2 BILLION IN ASSISTANCE FUNDING AND WILL ALSO PRESERVE THE ABILITY TO DELIVER ON GOALS AND OUTCOMES DEVELOPED THROUGHOUT BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE RENEWAL PROCESS AND OPERATORS TO APPLY FOR THE $2.2 BILLION IN ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE IS NOVEMBER 8TH THEREFORE WE REQUEST ACTION ON THIS PROPOSAL THIS MONTH THEREFORE ASK FOR SUPPORT IN RESOLUTION NUMBER 4481 REVISED AND STAFF TO WORK WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS TO RESERVE EQUIVALENT AMOUNT FUNDING INTENDED FOR BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES APPROXIMATELY $85 MILLION FROM PROGRAMMING APPLICATIONS AND ACTIONS. WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. ALSO WITH THE STASH. ANY COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU THERESA FOR FINDING A SOLUTION TO BLUE RIBBON. THOSE NEAR-TERM PROJECTS ARE CRITICAL TO THE TRANSIT RECOVERY. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THE VTA AND SFMTA SOLUTION. I THINK THAT WAS A GOOD APPROACH. AND I WANT TO COMPLEMENT STAFF FOR FINDING THAT BALANCE.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS IN THE ROOM. KIMBERLY, IF WE COULD GO VIRTUALLY, I KNOW WE HAVE VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, AND I SEE COMMISSIONER GLOVER RAISING HIS REAL HAND.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. MR. CHAIR, IF YOU WOULD LIKE I'LL CALL ON COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND GO DOWN THE LIST FOR YOU.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY.

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** THANK YOU. YOU CAN TALK ABOUT SMALL OPERATORS.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** IN TERMS OF THE $85 MILLION DISTRIBUTION?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** AS NOTED VERY LITTLE OF THE 85 MILLION DISTRIBUTION WILL BE GOING TO THE SMALL OPERATORS AND OUR INTENTION IS ONLY TO TAKE A LIKE AMOUNT FROM AVAILABLE NEAR-TERM REVENUE SOURCES. SO WE DON'T BELIEVE THAT WE WILL BURDEN ANY SMALL OPERATORS WITH THIS PROPOSAL.

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** OKAY. BUT, ARE WE GOING TO BE ABLE TO DO ANYTHING IN TERMS OF ENHANCEMENTS?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** OH, I SEE. I BELIEVE THAT THE BLUE RIBBON ACTION PLAN INCORPORATES IMPROVEMENTS FOR THE ENTIRE REGION, BUT I'LL DEFER TO ANYBODY ELSE WHO WANTS TO PROVIDE INPUT ON THAT.

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** JIM, IS IT ANY -- COMMISSIONER SPERING, IS THERE ANYTHING THAT YOU COULD ADD TO THAT?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** NO. I -- YOU KNOW, I THINK THE BLUE RIBBON, HOPEFULLY, IS GOING TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE ISSUES, I THINK, THAT YOU'RE RAISING. THAT IS THE INTENT. THEY PLAY A VERY IMPORTANT ROLE. AND, BUT IT -- YOU KNOW, THIS IS A BALANCING ACT, AS THERESE IS SAYING. WE'RE JUST TRYING TO FIND COMMON GROUND THAT SERVES ALL OF THE OPERATORS AND I THINK THIS PLAN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DOES IT. BUT THE SMALL OPERATORS ARE NOT GOING TO BE NEGLECTED AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS.

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** ABSOLUTELY. ALL RIGHT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I ALSO WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THEIR CONTINUED WIZARDRY IN HOW THEY'RE KIND OF LIKE MAKING SURE THAT OUR REGION IS REALLY COMPETITIVE FOR FEDERAL FUND AND DOING IT IN A WAY WHICH IS FAIR TO TRANSIT OPERATORS. AND I PARTICULARLY WANT TO THANK STAFF AND COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND CHAIR PEDROZA FOR, SORT OF, HELPING MAKE SURE SFMTA'S HARDSHIP WAS RECOGNIZED. AND JUST VERY APPRECIATIVE OF THAT. AND I KNOW THAT OTHER AGENCY'S HARDSHIPS WERE RECOGNIZED IN THE PREVIOUS ROUND, AND THEY'RE ALSO GETTING RECOGNIZED IN THIS ROUND AND THAT'S ALSO IMPORTANT. THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RONEN?

**DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. SIMILARLY, I WANTED TO THANK STAFF, BUT, PARTICULARLY, COMMISSIONER SPERING AND OTHER COMMISSIONERS AT THE PLANS AND PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE WHO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

REALLY STOOD UP FOR MTA IN SAN FRANCISCO, AND UNDERSTANDING THAT, YOU KNOW, THE FORMULA THAT'S BEING USED TO DISTRIBUTE THE ARP FUNDS DISADVANTAGED MTA AND THE PROMISE MADE IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF EARLIER FUNDS TO THE DISTRIBUTION WOULD BE WEIGHTED IN THE SECOND ROUND TOWARD RIDERSHIP BUT ULTIMATELY, I FEEL THE SITUATION TAKES EVERYONE'S NEEDS INTO CONSIDERATION INCLUDING THE FASTER DISTRIBUTION OF THESE FUNDS MAKES SENSE. I THINK THAT WHEN WE KEEP OUR PROMISES TO ONE ANOTHER, WHEN WE THINK REGIONALLY, AND LOOK OUT FOR THE WELL-BEING OF THE ENTIRE SYSTEM AND NOT JUST THE SYSTEMS THAT ARE INDIVIDUAL CITIES, THAT THAT'S -- THAT'S WHEN WE'RE AT OUR BEST. AND I JUST CAN'T APPRECIATE ENOUGH ALL THE COMMISSIONERS THAT STOOD UP FOR MTA AT PLANS AND PROGRAMMING. IT MEANS A LOT. AND IT FOSTERS THAT SPIRIT THAT, I THINK WE ALL WANT TO CONTINUE TO OPERATE WITH HERE ON THIS BODY. SO, THANKS A LOT.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. HOPEFULLY I HAVE MY -- OH, MY MUTE IS OFF. THANK YOU. I JUST HAD A QUESTION ABOUT THE INITIAL ALLOCATION -- I'M SORRY -- LET ME REPHRASE THAT. THE QUESTION ABOUT HOW FEDERAL [INDISCERNIBLE] DOLLARS WERE DISTRIBUTED TO BEGIN WITH. WHAT WAS THE FORMULA THAT THE FEDS USED TO DECIDE WHICH MPOS WOULD GET HOW MUCH MONEY? DESCRIBE JUST SOME OF THE BASIC ELEMENTS OF THAT FORMULA?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** I CAN TRY. I BELIEVE WHAT THEY LOOKED AT WAS, WITHIN AN URBANIZED AREA, WHICH OPERATORS HAD RECEIVED A CERTAIN PERCENTAGE ABOVE THEIR OPERATING EXPENSE AND THERE WAS A CUT OFF LINE. SO ANY OPERATORS, I BELIEVE IT WAS 135% OF THEIR OPERATING EXPENSES WERE ELIGIBLE FOR FUNDING AND THE FUNDS WERE DISTRIBUTED PROPORTIONATELY AMONG THE UZAS.

**SAM LICCARDO:** OKAY. SO IT'S BY UZA, NOT BY MPO, IS THAT RIGHT?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** THAT'S RIGHT.

**SAM LICCARDO:** SO THERE WAS MONEY DISTRIBUTED TO THE SAN FRANCISCO OAKLAND UZA, IS THAT RIGHT?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** THAT'S RIGHT.

**SAM LICCARDO:** AND SEPARATE ALLOCATION TO SAN JOSE METRO UZA.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** SEPARATE PORTION DISTRIBUTED.

**SAM LICCARDO:** COULD YOU DESCRIBE WHAT WAS ALLOCATED TO THE SAN JOSE METRO UZA?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** I WILL HAVE TO LOOK THAT UP BUT I CAN PROBABLY GET THAT TO YOU RELATIVELY QUICKLY.

**SAM LICCARDO:** OKAY. IF YOU WANT MAYBE WE CAN GO TO OTHER QUESTIONS WHILE YOU'RE LOOKING THAT UP. I'M HAPPY TO WAIT.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'LL CALL ON COMMISSIONER AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** YEAH, JUST BRIEFLY. I WAS FOLLOWING THIS ITEM, EVEN THOUGH I WASN'T PRESENT AT THE COMMITTEE MEETING WHEN THIS WAS DISCUSSED, AND I WANT TO, AGAIN, THANK STAFF, AS WELL AS RECOGNIZE THE LEADERSHIP OF COMMISSIONERS RONEN, SPERING, AND JOSEFOWITZ FOR HELPING US FIND A FAIR RESOLUTION ON THIS. THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT COMMISSIONER IS ABE-KOGA.

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR, THANK YOU STAFF, FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK ON THIS. I APPRECIATE THE CHALLENGES AND TRYING TO JUGGLE AND FIND BALANCE AMONGST ALL OF OUR DIFFERENT CONSTITUENCIES. I JUST HAD ONE QUESTION. IN REGARDS TO THE HARDSHIP FUNDS, WAS THERE A FORMULA THAT WAS USED TO DECIDE? OR, HOW DID YOU COME UP WITH THE NUMBERS FOR, IN PARTICULAR, VTA, AND SFMTA'S APPORTIONMENT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** THERE WAS NO FORMULA USED. MOST OF THE HARDSHIP FUNDS WERE DISTRIBUTED BASED ON INPUT FROM COMMISSIONERS AND SPECIFIC REQUESTS ON ACTUAL -- ON ACTUAL LOSSES RESULTING FROM A SPECIFIC HARDSHIP.

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** LET ME ADD TO THAT, COMMISSIONER. AS, YOU KNOW, THERESA SAID, WE -- I DON'T KNOW IF YOUR QUESTION WAS SPECIFIC TO THE SECOND DECISION ON THE HARDSHIP, OR THE PRIOR, BUT AS WE SAID, WITH THE FIRST DISTRIBUTION -- WELL, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE BOTH, BECAUSE THEY WORK IN TANDEM -- WITH THE FIRST DISTRIBUTION AS WAS POINTED OUT, THERE WERE A FEW AGENCIES THAT DID COME FORWARD, OUTLINING PARTICULAR HARDSHIPS RELATIVE TO, ESSENTIALLY, THE AMOUNT OF DISTRIBUTION THAT HAS BEEN APPLIED REGIONALLY, AND THEN, YOU KNOW, BASICALLY, IN ADDITION, THERE IS THESE EXTRAORDINARY, FOR LACK OF A BETTER TERM, EXTRAORDINARY NEEDS THAT NEED TO BE DONE. THAT WAS A SIMILAR SITUATION FOR THE SECOND DISTRIBUTION, WITH THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT THAT THERE WAS A -- YOU KNOW, CONSIDERATION, OF WHO WAS IN THE FIRST TRANCHE, UNDER PHASE ONE. BECAUSE AS THERESE SAID, EXPLAINED EXTREMELY CLEARLY, THERE WAS A VERY QUICK PIVOT THAT WE HAD TO DO, BASED ON THE FTA CIRCUMSTANCES, THAT TOOK US AWAY FROM THE GAME PLAN THAT WE HAD BEFORE. AND IN THE CASE OF BOTH SFMTA, AND VTA, WE DID WORK WITH THE GM'S OF BOTH AGENCIES ON A SPECIFIC REQUEST, AND THAT IS REFLECTED IN THE RECOMMENDATION.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL COMMISSION HANDS RAISED, MR. CHAIR. THERESA, DID YOU WANT TO FOLLOW UP?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH. I DID GET THE ANSWER TO COMMISSIONER LICCARDO'S QUESTION. THE NEARLY 1.7 BILLION IN ARP FUNDS, SAN JOSE'S UZA WAS 259 MILLION.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. APPRECIATE THE INFORMATION. SO, APPRECIATE THAT THIS HAS BEEN A REALLY DIFFICULT PROCESS, AND STAFF HAS CERTAINLY DONE ITS BEST. WHEN THE PHASE ONE ALLOCATION CAME OUT, YOU KNOW, MY UNDERSTANDING WAS THE PHASE ONE AND THE PHASE TWO, USE, WE WERE RELYING ON THE SAME FORMULA ALLOCATION. IS THAT RIGHT THERESA?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** YES YOU'RE RIGHT. WE'RE RELYING ON THE PHASE ONE FORMULA.

**SAM LICCARDO:** TO BE PAROCHIAL, FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY, I WAS CONCERNED WHEN I SAW A COUNTY WITH 25% OF THE POPULATION IN THE REGION WOULD RECEIVE LESS THAN 6% OF THE DOLLARS THAT WOULD BE ALLOCATED ACROSS THE REGION. APPRECIATE THE ADDITIONAL DOLLARS THAT WERE ALLOCATED TO ASSIST IN THE WAKE OF THE HORRIBLE SHOOTING AT GUADALUPE TRANSIT CENTER, AND IF YOU WERE TO LOOK AT THE AGGREGATE DOLLARS YOU WOULD KNOCK IT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OFF BY A COUPLE% OBVIOUSLY THAT WOULD BE A LONG WAY FROM THE PROPORTIONAL FOR THAT MATTER $259 MILLION THAT WERE ACTUALLY ALLOCATED BY THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO SAN JOSE UZA, ALLOCATION SIMULATED TO BE LESS THAN 6% ALLOCATION ACCOUNTING 25% OF THE POPULATION FOR THE WHOLE REGION, AND I KNOW WE DISCUSSED LOOKING AT THIS FORMULA AND I UNDERSTAND STAFF HAS BEEN PUT IN EYE VERY DIFFICULT POSITION HERE BECAUSE OF THE NEWS OF THIS MORE THAN $2 BILLION OPPORTUNITY, NATION-WIDE, STAFF FELT IT IMPORTANT TO BRING THIS FORWARD NOW, AND I UNDERSTAND PROBABLY A TIME FOR EVERYONE TO REVISIT THE FORMULA. I CERTAINLY APPRECIATE THAT A LOT OF FOLKS ARE DOING EVERYTHING IN GOOD FAITH AS BEST THEY CAN. I'M NOT GOING TO SUPPORT BECAUSE WE GET LESS THAN 6% ALLOCATION IN THE REGION IN WHICH WE HAVE 25% POPULATION NOWHERE NEAR WHAT THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT WOULD HAVE ALLOCATED TO US IF WE HAD BEEN A SEPARATE -- IF WE HAD OUR OWN CONTROL OVER OUR OWN UZA, TO PUT IT BLUNTLY. A LOT OF THESE DOLLARS ARE GOING ELSEWHERE. I RECOGNIZE THIS WILL BE APPROVED AND LARGELY SUPPORTED BY THIS BOARD. I WOULD EXPECT THAT TO BE THE CASE. I'M JUST NOT GOING TO VOTE FOR IT. BECAUSE I WOULD HAVE PREFERRED TO SEE A MUCH DIFFERENT FORM LOOKS AND I'M NOT BLAMING ANYBODY. I KNOW STAFF IS DOING THE BEST THEY CAN. STAFF HAS AGREED TO WORK WITH US TO ADDRESS ADDITIONAL OUTSTANDING ISSUES WITH REGARD TO THE NEED FOR CAPITAL REPLACEMENT OVER AT THE GUADALUPE FACILITY, I AM SIMPLY CONCERNED THAT THIS SUPPORTING THIS WOULD BE SETTING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

A PRECEDENT OF SOME SORT FOR HOW WE EXPECT DOLLARS TO BE ALLOCATED GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. CHAIR, I'M SEEING NO OTHER COMMISSIONER HAND RAISED. WOULD YOU LIKE TO GO BACK TO THE BOARDROOM OR TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** LET'S GO TO THE COMMISSIONERS. THEN WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. COMMISSIONER CANEPA AND COMMISSIONER WORTH.

**DAVID CANEPA:** THERESA I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS FOR YOU. IF WE DON'T DO ANYTHING TODAY AND DON'T APPROVE THIS THAT BASICALLY MEANS $2.2 BILLION IN TRANSPORTATION DOLLARS WE WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO APPLY FOR. IS THAT CORRECT?

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** I DON'T KNOW WHETHER YOU SAID THERESA OR THERESE? YOU CAN APPLY BUT YOU WILL BE HIGHLY DISADVANTAGED YOU WILL HAVE A WEAK APPLICATION. THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE BEEN ADVISED.

**DAVID CANEPA:** SO IF WE DON'T DO THAT, WE'RE DISADVANTAGED AND THE HIGH LIKELIHOOD OF US GETTING $2.2 BILLION FOR THE REGION, WE PROBABLY WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO GET THAT FUNDING. IS THAT WHAT I'M HEARING THERESE?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** WE WOULD -- AGAIN, THE 2.2 BILLION IS A NATIONAL NUMBER. JUST TO POINT OUT I'M NOT SURE THAT WAS CLEAR, SO WE WOULD BE COMPETING FOR A PIECE OF IT, AND ANY COMPETITION, THE OUTCOMES ARE NOT, YOU KNOW, GUARANTEED OR CERTAIN, BUT WHAT IS A CLEAR MESSAGE FROM FTA IS ABSENT THIS ACTION BASED ON THE LENSES THROUGH WHICH THEY'RE VIEWING THIS AS A NATIONAL POLICY, OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS WOULD BE DISADVANTAGED IN TERMS OF AN INTERPRETATION OF NEED AGAINST THE SPECIAL FUND. CON

**DAVID CANEPA:** YOU CAN TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE DEADLINE AND THE APPLICATION PROCESS AND MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS ITEM TODAY? WHEN IS THE APPLICATION PROCESS FOR THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT?

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'LL LET THERESE ADDRESS THOSE DETAILS.

**THERESA ROMMELL:** DEADLINE APPLICATION FOR ASSISTANCE IS NOVEMBER 8TH. SO IF YOU WERE NOT TO TAKE ACTION TODAY, THEN, YOU KNOW, WHATEVER IS REMAIN BEING AS AVAILABLE, UNPROGRAMMED FUNDING WITHIN THE URBANIZED AREAS WOULD BE ASSUMED TO BE AVAILABLE FOR FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO ANY APPLICANT, ANY OPERATOR APPLYING IN THAT URBANIZED AREA.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DAVID CANEPA:** I'M SORRY THERESE. I MENTIONED $2.2 BILLION LET ME GET TO THERESE WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE IN TERMS OF FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATOR IN THE REGION?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** WE HAVE DONE SOME BACK OF THE ENVELOPE ESTIMATE IN HOW MUCH OPERATORS HAVE RECEIVED IN COVID-19 VERSUS ANTICIPATE THE ONGOING REVENUE LOSSES AND WE ESTIMATE ANYWHERE BETWEEN 100 MILLION TO 300 MILLION WE COULD LIKELY COMPETE FOR. BUT AS THERESE MCMILLAN SAID, YOU KNOW, IT'S VERY, IT'S VERY -- YOU KNOW, DETERMINED BY -- IT WILL BE DETERMINED BY A LOT OF THE OTHER APPLICANTS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY AND WHAT THEY APPLY FOR AS WELL.

**DAVID CANEPA:** SO WHAT I'M HEARING FROM YOU JUST FOR CLARITY IS POTENTIALLY THERE COULD BE 100 MILLION TO $300 MILLION ESTIMATED AT STAKE, IS THAT CORRECT?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** THAT'S CORRECT.

**DAVID CANEPA:** COLLEAGUES, I THINK SUPERVISOR SPOKE ELOQUENTLY ABOUT WHY THIS IS IMPORTANT STAFF HAS COME UP WITH A CONSENSUS BUILDING IDEA I KNOW CALTRAIN IS A RECIPIENT OF THIS DOLLAR, WETA IS, I THINK JIM SPERING MENTIONED COMMENT IN LOGICAL COMMON SENSE. SOMETIMES WE'RE ALWAYS PAROCHIAL, I DO THAT A LOT TOO. BUT THIS IS SUCH AN IMPORTANT ISSUE TO LEAVE 100 TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

$300 MILLION, AND FOR US TO BE DISADVANTAGED, AS A REGION, I THINK WE'RE BETTER THAN THAT. I THINK WE'RE BETTER THAN THAT. AND SO COLLEAGUES, I FULLY SUPPORT THIS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE BAY AREA. I'M NOT GOING TO SUPPORT SOMETHING THAT DOESN'T APPROPRIATELY FUND TRANSIT OPERATORS. WE RECEIVED A LETTER IN OUR PACKET. THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, WE ALL HAVE DIFFERENT OPINIONS. EVEN TRANSIT OPERATORS, THEY'RE IN FULL SUPPORT OF THIS. I THINK WE SHOULD VOTE THIS ITEM UP, BECAUSE IT'S THE RIGHT THING TO DO, AND WE SHOULD SUPPORT EVERY TRANSIT OPERATOR MOVING FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. YOU KNOW, COMMISSIONER CANEPA SAID IT SO ELOQUENTLY. I HAVE TO SAY I COMPLETELY AGREE. I THINK THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS WE'RE FACING RIGHT NOW FIRST OF ALL WE DISCUSSED AT OUR LAST MEETING THE EXPECTATION IN THE FIRST ROUND, ALL OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS CAME TOGETHER, SMALLER OPERATORS, URBAN, SUBURBAN CAME UP WITH A PLAN THAT EVERYBODY IN THE BAY AREA COULD RECEIVE BENEFITS. SO I FEEL THAT THE INTENT IN OUR COMMITMENT WAS TO LOOK AT THIS NEXT ROUND, AND RECOGNIZE THOSE LARGER OPERATORS WITH THE RIDERS. I THINK SAN FRANCISCO POINT OUT, THEY PUT IN ADDITIONAL SUBSIDIES FOR, FROM THE CITY FOR RIDER SERVICES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BUT I THINK THIS DISCUSSION IS TOUCHING ON THIS CHALLENGE WITH THESE, YOU KNOW, URBANIZED AREAS. I HAD THE PRIVILEGE, YESTERDAY, OF SPEAKING TO A GROUP OF GRADUATE UNDERGRADUATE PUBLIC POLICY STUDENTS ABOUT REGIONAL GOVERNMENT AND I THINK ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WE LEARNED DURING THIS COVID PERIOD WHEN WE START LOOKING AT THESE DOLLARS IS HOW THE BAY AREA, THE COOPERATIVE NATURE OF OUR WORK IS DEPENDENT UPON US BEING ABLE TO MAKE THESE KINDS OF DECISIONS. OF THE. AND I THINK THE LAY OUT AND FRAMEWORK OF THE URBANIZED AREAS PROBABLY HAS NOT KEPT UP WITH THE EVOLUTION OF OUR REGION. THAT'S A DISCUSSION, I THINK, FOR A FUTURE TIME. BUT, AGAIN, I THINK WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE CRITERIA FOR THE FACT THAT WE HAVE THESE COMMUTE SHEDS THAT COMMUTE FROM COUNTY TO COUNTY, NORTH, SOUTH, EAST, AND WEST, SO I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE KEEP THAT IN MIND, AS WE COME FORWARD WITH THE NEXT PLAN. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR YOUR EXCELLENT, IN TERMS OF FIGURING OUT A WAY RETAIN THE COMMITMENT TO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE BUT ALSO TO PROVIDE THE DISTRIBUTION OF THESE FUNDS, AND SECOND, TO THE OPERATORS. ALL THROUGH THE COVID, THEY HAVE STAYED TOGETHER, HELPED US TO RESOLVE THESE ISSUES, AND I THINK THAT SPEAKS TO THE FACT THAT THERE HAS BEEN THIS THOUGHTFUL COOPERATIVE DECISION MAKING PROCESS. SO, THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER WORTH. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS IN THE BOARD CHAMBERS AT THIS POINT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YEAH. I THINK I WILL JUST GO AHEAD AND WEIGH IN AND SAY, CERTAINLY, IT'S BEEN POINTED OUT THAT TIME IS OF THE ESSENCE IF THE DEADLINE IS NOVEMBER 8TH, AND THIS IS WHAT'S RECOMMENDED, GETTING A LITTLE BIT IS BETTER THAN GETTING NOTHING AT ALL, SHOULD WE BE SUCCESSFUL.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. I DO SEE ABE-KOGA WITH HER HAND UP. LET'S DO OUR LAST ROUND. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE DO, MR. CHAIR, AND I HAVE RECEIVED ONE LETTER THAT HAS BEEN POSTED ONLINE, AND DISTRIBUTED TO COMMISSIONERS IT'S A LETTER OF SUPPORT FROM THE VARIOUS TRANSIT OPERATORS. AND WE HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. FIRST JEFFREY TUMLIN.

**JEFFREY TUMLIN:** MY NAME IS JEFFREY TUMLIN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF SFMTA. I WANT TO DRAW YOUR ATTENTION TO THE LETTER INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET TODAY, SUPPORTS STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DISTRIBUTE REMAINING ARP FUNDS BASED ON THE PHASE ONE METHODOLOGY AND WE SUPPORT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BLUE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RIBBON TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN TO BENEFIT ALL TRANSIT RIDERS INCLUDING USING UP TO $85 MILLION IN NEAR-TERM REVENUE SOURCES TO DELIVER A PLAN. THIS IS A CRITICAL TIMELINE BY OPPORTUNITY TO COMPLETELY THE $2 BILLION FUNDING RECENTLY ANNOUNCED BY THE EARLY NOVEMBER DEADLINE. FEDERAL RELIEF HAS PROVIDED A LIFELINE TO OUR AGENCIES TO RESERVE THE REGION'S TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE FACE OF DEVASTATING RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE LOSSES ENSURING SURVIVAL OF OUR AGENCIES AND DIVERTING LAYOFFS AND ENABLING SAFE TRANSIT SERVICE FOR ALL THOSE WHO DEMAND LOCAL SERVICES. TRANSIT RETURN HAS CONTINUED TO BE SLOW, AND FINAL ALLOCATION OF ARP FUNDS WILL CONTINUE TO SERVE TRANSIT FOR THE PUBLIC WE SERVE DURING THIS LONGER THAN ANTICIPATED TRANSIT RECOVERY. AND I WANT TO EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION TO STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS FOR RECOMMENDING THAT SFMTA RELIEF HARDSHIP FUNDS TO SUPPORT SERVICE TO THE LARGE NUMBER OF LOW-INCOME TRANSIT USERS WHO RELY ON US EVERY DAY. THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND LEBRUN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**SPEAKER:** HELLO, AGAIN, DIRECTORS. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ADD MY VOICE AND EXPRESS, FIRST OF ALL, THANKS, AND STRONG SUPPORT FOR STAFF RECOMMENDATION. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS THE SANTA CLARA DISCUSSION IN CONTEXT, SPECIFICALLY VTA RIGHT NOW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IS SITTING ON A SURPLUS OF APPROXIMATELY $130 MILLION IN CARES AND CRRSAA FUNDING, WHICH THEY HAVE EAR MARKED FOR THE OPERATIONS STRUCTURAL DEFICIENCY -- DEFICIT, WHICH, QUITE FRANKLY IS CAUSED BY THE BARC PROJECT, THERE IS NO TWO-WAYS ABOUT IT. ONE THING I WANT TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION, I HOPE I'M NOT OUT OF CONTEXT HERE, IT'S WHAT JUST HAPPENED LAST WEEK. NOT ONLY VTA ARE RECOVERING AND NO LONGER PASSING UP PASSENGERS, THEY'RE ADDING NEW LINES BETWEEN DIRIDON STATION AND THE GILROY STATION, CALLED THE 568. COST IS THREE AND A HALF MILLION DOLLAR. TWO AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS IS COMING OUT OF LOCAL TAXES LET'S NOT FORGET VTA GENERATES MORE REVENUE THAN THE REST OF THE BAY AREA COMBINE. BUT THE ISSUE IS THE $1 MILLION THAT'S REMAINING. IT'S THAT THEY'RE TAKING AWAY LIFELINE MONEY. THEY'RE MISAPPROPRIATING $1 MILLION OF LIFELINE MONEY, WHICH IS EAR MARKED FOR THE 22 LINE, WHICH IS THE MOST DESPERATE LINE IN THE ENTIRE SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AND THEY'RE TRYING TO REALLOCATE IT TO THIS 568 LINE. AND THAT IS GROSSLY INAPPROPRIATE, AND WE DO HAVE ANOTHER LIFELINE THAT RUNS PARALLEL TO THE 568, BUT IT'S NOT RAPID. IT'S CALLED THE 68. THE 68 GOT A 15 MINUTE HEADWAY, AND THE 568 HAS A 30 MINUTE HEADWAY. THE 568 -- LET ME WRAP UP -- THE 568, BASICALLY IT'S NICE TO HAVE, LET'S NOT TAKE ANY MONEY FROM LIFELINE. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MR. GROSS. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS ZACK GROSH ADVOCACY DIRECTOR WITH SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS I'M CALLING TODAY TO THANK MTC STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS AND TRANSIT OPERATORS FOR WORKING TOGETHER IN CONSENSUS ON THE PROPOSAL. FOR THE ALLOCATION OF FUNDING TO SFMTA THAT REFLECTS THE NEED OF THE BAY AREA RIDERSHIP. THIS WILL CONTINUE TO RESTORE SERVICE NEEDED TO IDENTIFY NEW LOCAL SOURCES OF FUNDING. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND COMMITMENT ON THIS ISSUE AND FOR CONTINUING TO SUPPORT TRANSIT THROUGHOUT THE REGION. THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC RAISED HANDS, MR. CHAIR. IF YOU WOULD LIKE, I WILL CALL ON THE VIRTUAL MEMBERS?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** PLEASE. AND THEN WE'LL GO TO THE BOARD.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU GOT IT. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CLERK. THANK YOU, CHAIR. I JUST WANTED TO, AGAIN, THANK EVERYONE FOR THEIR HARD WORK ON THIS. BUT, I WILL ALSO NOT BE SUPPORTING THE MOTION. AND IT'S NOT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BECAUSE I DON'T SUPPORT PURSUING THE FEDERAL FUNDING. I COMPLETELY SUPPORT THAT. I, ALSO, SUPPORT REGIONAL WORK, REGIONAL GOVERNANCE, THAT'S WHY I'M HERE. BUT, FOR ME, I THINK, AS COMMISSIONER LICCARDO MENTIONED, THE CHALLENGE HERE HAS BEEN HOW THE SOUTH BAY HAS BEEN CONSIDERED, AND IT SOUND LIKE -- AND THIS WAS BEFORE MY TIME JOINING THE COMMISSION, BUT, THE ORIGINAL FORMULA SEEMS TO HAVE HAD SOME, FRANKLY, SOME CONCERNS FROM THE SOUTH BAY, AND, YOU KNOW, I DO VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE HARDSHIP FUNDS. I REALLY DO. BUT IN LIGHT OF THE TRAGEDY -- AND I KNOW I SOUND LIKE A BROKEN RECORD, BUT IT HAS BEEN A REAL -- A REAL SET BACK FOR VTA. OUR STAFF CONTINUES TO STRUGGLE. FRANKLY THE PRICE TAG FOR REBUILDING GUADELOUPE FOR $150 MILLION IS GREAT. AND I APPRECIATE THE CONSIDERATION FRANKLY, I WISH WE COULD HAVE RECEIVED MORE CONSIDERATION AND IT'S JUST AN ONGOING CHALLENGE. I DO BELIEVE IN REGIONALIZATION BUT IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THE SOUTH BAY AS 25% OF THE POPULATION. WE ARE WHERE GROWTH IS HAPPENING ALONG WITH ALAMEDA COUNTY. AND I JUST WOULD APPRECIATE RECOGNITION OF THAT. SO, FOR THAT, I WILL NOT BE SUPPORTING THIS MOTION. THANK YOU.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANKS. I JUST WANTED TO ASK A QUESTION ABOUT THE $2.2 BILLION. JUST TO BE CLEAR, THERE HAD BEEN DISCUSSION

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ABOUT TAKING A DEEP LOOK AT PHASE ONE ALLOCATION FORMULA, AS I UNDERSTAND IT, WE DIDN'T GET THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT IN PHASE TWO BECAUSE OF THE $2.2 BILLION OPPORTUNITY. AND MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT'S A COMPETITIVE PROGRAM THAT THE FEDS HAVE. IS THAT RIGHT?

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** THAT'S CORRECT.

**SAM LICCARDO:** DO WE HAVE ANY SENSE ABOUT WHAT WE THINK WE COULD GET BASED ON WHATEVER WE KNOW ABOUT ALLOCATIONS OR CRITERIA? OR?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH. ABOUT 100 TO 300 MILLION IS OUR ESTIMATE, BACK OF THE ENVELOPE.

**SAM LICCARDO:** WE THINK WE COULD GET AS MUCH AS 100 MILLION OR $300 MILLION OF A FEDERAL PROGRAM THAT WOULD BE SPREAD 2.2 BILLION NATION-WIDE?

**THERESA ROMMELL:** THAT'S OUR ESTIMATE.

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** THERESA, BEFORE YOU -- LET ME MAKE A PARTICULARLY CLARIFYING THING HERE. THE 2.2 BILLION IS, AGAIN, A COMPETITIVE PROGRAM THAT'S GOING TO BE BASED ON, LARGELY, THAN -- AND THERESA CAN CORRECT ME, BUT I WANT TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1 KEEP IT AT A HIGH LEVEL, LARGELY POSITIONING OF ANY TRANSIT
2 AGENCY APPROACHING A FISCAL CLIFF WITH RESPECT TO THEIR
3 RECOVERY. SO, ESSENTIALLY, THE COMBINATION OF CARES, PLUS
4 CRRSAA, PLUS THE ARP, THAT THE IMPACT -- THE COLLECTIVE IMPACT
5 OF THAT, VARIES ACROSS THE COUNTRY. BUT, FOR A NUMBER OF
6 AGENCIES, THAT IS DETERMINED TO STILL BE INSUFFICIENT FROM
7 PREVENTING THEM FROM HITTING AND TUMBLING OVER A FISCAL CLIFF,
8 AND WITH, IN THE VERY NEAR-TERM, REDUCING SERVICE ON THE
9 GROUND. THAT IS, BASICALLY, WHY THE 2.2 BILLION HAS BEEN SETUP
10 AS AN ADDITIONAL ADD, BEYOND THE FORMULA FUNDS THAT WERE
11 CARES, CRRSAA AND ARP. SO, I THINK THAT THE IMPORTANT THING
12 HERE IS THAT NOT EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY WILL BE ABLE TO MEET
13 THAT CASE -- OR MAKE THE CASE -- MAKE A COMPELLING CASE. SO
14 FOR US IN REACHING OUR ASSESSMENT OF WHAT IT MIGHT TAKE, AND
15 TALKING, AGAIN, VERY CLOSELY WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, THERE
16 IS A HANDFUL OF OPERATORS WHO BELIEVE THAT THEY WOULD BE ABLE
17 TO MAKE THAT COMPELLING CASE, AS LONG AS WE TOOK THE STEPS
18 THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT NOW. SO I JUST WANT TO PRESENT THE,
19 YOU KNOW, AN ADDITIONAL INSIGHT, AS TO THE, SORT OF, NATURE OF
20 THIS PARTICULAR COMPETITIVE PROGRAM, AND WHY THE, YOU KNOW,
21 100 TO 300 -- FOR LACK OF A BETTER TERM, MAKE SENSE BECAUSE
22 WE'RE HAVING TO MAKE SOME ASSESSMENTS OF HOW COMPETITIVE OTHER
23 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE ACROSS THE COUNTRY, AS OPPOSED TO THE
24 HUNDREDS OF THEM, THAT, YOU KNOW, RECEIVE FEDERAL FUND. WHAT I
25 WOULD SAY, TOO, IT'S NO SURPRISE THAT THE MAJOR DRIVING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CIRCUMSTANCE IN THIS SITUATION IS NEW YORK, NEW JERSEY. AND I'M NOT SPEAKING OUT OF TURN, BECAUSE IT'S BEEN IN THE NEWSPAPERS.

**SAM LICCARDO:** RIGHT.

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** AND YOU KNOW, OF COURSE, THEY HAVE A WILDLY DISPROPORTIONATE SHARE OF OVERALL RIDERSHIP NATIONALLY, SO THAT PLAYS INTO THE WHOLE NARRATIVE, AS WELL. SO, THANK FOR BEARING WITH THAT EXPLANATION.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU, THERESE. AS A REGION WITH MORE THAN 2% OF THE NATIONAL POPULATION, IT'S ASTOUNDING THAT WE WOULD GET -- ASSUMING THAT THERE ARE TRANSIT AGENCIES IN CRISIS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY, PARTICULARLY IN THOSE VERY HIGH RIDERSHIP AREAS AROUND NEW YORK AND NEW JERSEY, IT WOULD JUST ASTOUND ME THAT WE COULD GET 100 MILLION TO $300 MILLION OF A $2.2 BILLION POT KNOWING WE'RE SUCH A SMALL SHARE AND THERE ARE SO MANY AGENCIES, BUT, HEY, ANY YOU GUYS THINK YOU CAN GET IT, THAT'S GREAT. I WANT TO, SORT OF, CLARIFY A POINT THAT WAS MADE BECAUSE I THINK THERE WAS SOME SUGGESTION THAT -- WELL, I -- LET ME JUST SAY THIS. THE $259 MILLION THAT CAME TO THIS REGION, AS A RESULT OF THE SAN JOSE UZA. [LAUGHTER] AS, BY MY CALCULATION, IF WE INCLUDE EVERYTHING FROM PHASE ONE, PHASE TWO, AND THE ALLOCATION TO DEAL WITH THE HARDSHIP OF -- THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE TRAGEDY AT GUADELOUPE, THE TOTAL ALLOCATION THAT OUR COUNTY GETS IS 121 MILLION WHICH IS LESS THAN HALF OF WHAT THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT HAD ALLOCATED BY REASON OF VIRTUE OF THE UZA FORMULA. SO THAT'S REALLY THE CRUX OF THE CONCERN, THAT ESSENTIALLY, $138 MILLION IS GOING TO THE REST OF THE REGION THAT'S FINE THAT MAY BE AN APPROPRIATE THING AS WE'RE LOOKING INTO CONTEXT OF LOTS OF OTHER PROGRAMS WHERE DIFFERENT COUNTIES MAY DO BETTER THAN OTHERS IT'S JUST BEEN A CURRENT CONCERN I THINK FOR MANY EVER US DOWN HERE IN SOUTH BAY ABOUT HOW WE DO GENERALLY IN THESE ALLOCATION FORMULAS. AND IN THIS CASE, IT SEEMS, PARTICULARLY CHALLENGING, AND THAT'S WHY I'M NOT GOING TO SUPPORT THIS PARTICULAR VOTE. I DO EXPECT IT WILL GO THROUGH. I SIMPLY WANTED TO BE CLEAR ABOUT WHAT THE BASIS IS FOR MY NO VOTE.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** HEART. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER LICCARDO. KIMBERLY, I DON'T SEE ANYONE ELSE VIRTUALLY RAISING THEIR HANDS?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. COMMISSIONER RONEN'S HAND IS RAISED.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** OKAY. I WANT TO BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION IN THE BOARDROOM AS WELL.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO EXPLAIN TO MAYOR LICCARDO AND COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS THAT WEREN'T AT THE PLANS AND PROGRAMS COMMITTEE, YOU KNOW, SORT OF, THE DISCUSSION WE HAD THERE, JUST SO WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE GOING FORWARD. I HAVE TO SAY, I WAS VERY DISAPPOINTED, AS WELL, AS A COMMISSIONER ON BEHALF OF SAN FRANCISCO THAT THE -- THE FORMULA USED TO DISTRIBUTE THE REST OF THE ARP FUNDS WAS THE SAME AS THE FORMULA USED TO DISTRIBUTE THE EARLIER FUNDS, FEDERAL FUNDS. THE REASON BEING, IS THAT THE -- THAT FORM LOOKS THE FORMULA THAT WE'RE USING FOR ALL THE FEDERAL FUND IS HEAVY LEAVE WEIGHTED -- -- TOWARDS FARE LOSS REVENUE, AND MTA AND MANY OTHER TRANSIT PROVIDERS, THAT -- IN THE REGION, THAT SERVE A HUGE PROPORTION OF THE RIDERSHIP OF THE REGION, MTA SERVING 55% OF THE RIDERSHIP, DON'T RELY HEAVILY ON FARES FOR THE SUBSIDY THAT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS SUBSIDY -- THAT, YOU KNOW, THE CITY SUBSIDIZES, HEAVILY PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AND DIDN'T REDUCE THAT SUBSIDY DURING THIS FISCAL CRIES, AND SO THE REVENUES PROPORTION TO THE RIDERSHIP THAT SAN FRANCISCO AND MTA LOST, WHAT WAS JUST -- IT -- IT DIDN'T ACCOUNT FOR THE FULL PICTURE, WHEN THE FORMULA IS HEAVILY WEIGHTED TOWARDS FARE LOSS REVENUE, SO WE WERE REALLY HOPING THAT PERCENTAGE OF RIDERSHIP WOULD FACTOR INTO THIS LATEST FORMULA THAT WE WERE USING, AND BECAUSE OF THIS UNEXPECTED 2.2 BILLION ON THE FEDERAL LEVEL,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STAFF DIDN'T FEEL LIKE THERE WAS TIME TO REACH CONSENSUS ON A NEW FORMULA. SO I JUST WANTED TO -- PERHAPS YOU NEW ALL THIS. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ALL UNDERSTAND, SORT OF, HAPPENED AS FAR AS, YOU KNOW, HOW MTA, AS A SOLUTION FOR MTA WAS TO RELY ON THE -- THIS OTHER POT OF FUND THING TO, SORT OF, UPHOLD THAT PROMISE THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES MADE TO ONE ANOTHER, THAT THE LATER FORMULA WOULD BE WEIGHTED HEAVIER TOWARDS RIDERSHIP, AND THAT -- THAT DIDN'T HAPPEN. BECAUSE I -- I HEAR YOU BOTH. I AGREE WITH YOU BOTH. AND WANT TO KNOW THAT IN -- YOU KNOW, IN THE FUTURE THIS WE WILL -- WE WILL KEEP -- WE NEED TO KEEP EACH OTHER IN MIND AS WE MAKE DECISIONS GOING FORWARD.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. KIMBERLY, I DO NOT SEE ANY OTHER VIRTUAL HANDS. I'M GOING TO BRING IT BACK TO THE BOARD HERE. I'LL JUST SAY, I HEARD COMMENT FROM YOU ALL, AND I WAS LISTENING. AND I JUST WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE WORK OF OUR STAFF WHEN WE STARTED THIS WE HAD A NEED TO TALK ABOUT THE FISCAL CLIFF OF OUR OPERATORS WE ENGAGED PROACTIVELY WE HAD PRESENTATIONS FOR OUR OPERATORS TO TALK ABOUT THE FORMULA AND AFTER PHASE WE WOE HEARD COMMENTS ABOUT SHORING UP AND THAT LED TO THE COURSE OF REACHING OUT TO OPERATORS AND EVEN IN THE FACE PROACTIVELY REACHING OUT TO OPERATORS TO UPON TRY TO UNDERSTAND THE NEED. AND FOR REASONS, I AM GOING TO SUPPORT THIS MOVING FORWARD. ONE THING I LEARNED WHEN I FIRST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JOINED THE COMMISSION IS YOU CAN'T ALWAYS KEEP SCORE, YOU HAVE TO ACT LIKE A REGION, FOR THE BETTER OF A REGION. THAT'S WHERE I SEE THIS TODAY. WITH THAT I'LL ASK FOR A MOTION.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIR, I'LL MAKE THE MOTION. IT'S KIND OF DISAPPOINTING THAT SANTA CLARA IS NOT SUPPORTING THIS. BECAUSE A LOT OF US GOT BEHIND THIS HARDSHIP MOTION. BUT I THINK THIS BREATHE PROBABLY ISN'T THE TIME TO DISCUSS THIS BUT I THINK WE HAVE TO BE HONEST ABOUT THE DISCUSSION THAT MAYOR LICCARDO IS RAISING, IS SANTA CLARA BEING TREATED UNFAIRLY? WE HAVE TO UNDERSTAND. I DON'T THINK YOU CAN DISTRIBUTE MONEY JUST ON POPULATION. IT'S NOT REALISTIC. THERE HAS GOT TO BE NEED OPERATION IN SAN FRANCISCO IS MUCH DIFFERENT THAN SANTA CLARA HOPEFULLY, WE SUPPORT THIS, BUT TO SAY I DON'T AGREE WITH THE FORMULA IT'S LIKE SAYING I DON'T AGREE WITH THE HARDSHIP. HOPEFULLY AT A FUTURE MEETING WE CAN ADDRESS THIS ISSUE THAT'S BEING RAISED AND I THINK MAYOR LICCARDO IS LEGITIMATELY RAISING ONE THAT EARNED THAT DISCUSSION AT SOME POINT. AND I WILL MOVE THE ITEM MR. CHAIRMAN.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** I'LL SECOND IT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES WITH 14 AYES, THREE NAYS, AND ONE ABSENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 14, PUBLIC COMMENT. I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS ASSOCIATED WITH PUBLIC COMMENT INTO INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR USE THE START NINE FEATURE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, THERE WAS ONE LETTER, EMAIL, SENT FROM RAMAN PRIETSING, THAT WAS POSTED ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED TO COMMISSIONERS.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** AT THIS POINT, I SEE NO FURTHER BUSINESS TO THE COMMISSION WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN TO OUR NEXT MEETING WEDNESDAY NOVEMBER 17TH 9:35 A.M. REMOTELY OR BY WEBCAST. CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED. THANK YOU EVERYONE. HAVE A THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NTT

Broadcasting Government