

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



November 15, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD**
3 **MONDAY, NOVEMBER 15, 2021, 1:30 P.M.**
4
5 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WELCOME, EVERYBODY, TO THE
6 CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING OF NOVEMBER 15TH, 2021. I'M
7 CHAIR RICK RAMACIER, AND ALSO WITH OUR VICE CHAIR ROBERT
8 POWERS. WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE THE TEAM TO ROLL THE
9 ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
10 ANNOUNCEMENT]
11 DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM
12 WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH
13 SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING
14 IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
15 COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME,
16 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE
17 GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST
18 AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
19 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
20 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
21 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
22 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
23 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
24 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
25 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS



November 15, 2021

1 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
2 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
3 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
4 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
5 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE
6 THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
7 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
8 ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE
9 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM
10 EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

11

12 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT.

13 MARTHA, COULD YOU PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:**

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR POWERS?

18

19 **ROBERT POWERS, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER GONOT?

22

23 **CAROLYN GONOT:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER HURSCH.



November 15, 2021

1

2 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER KRANDA?

5

6 **BETH KRANDA:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MAU?

9

10 **CARTER MAU:**

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:**

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MULLIGAN?

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER TUMLIN?

21

22 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

25



November 15, 2021

1 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** ITEM TWO, CONSENT CALENDAR. MOTION AND
2 SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

3

4 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** MOVE.

5

6 **BETH KRANDA:** SECOND.

7

8 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** MOTION FROM MULLIGAN, SECOND BY KRANDA.
9 MARTHA, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
12 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
13 ON THIS ITEM.

14

15 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL PLEASE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR RAMACIER?

18

19 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR POWERS?

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS, V. CHAIR:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER GONOT?



1

2 **CAROLYN GONOT:** YES. MEMBER HURSCH?

3

4 **MICHAEL HURSCH:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER KRANDA?

7

8 **BETH KRANDA:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MAU?

11

12 **CARTER MAU:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MCMILLAN.

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MULLIGAN?

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** TUMLIN?

23

24 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES.

25



November 15, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** ITEM 3A UPDATE ON OUR TWO YEAR BUDGET
5 AND WORK PLAN. I BELIEVE, ED, THAT YOU'RE GOING TO PRESENT
6 THIS FOR US, PLEASE?

7

8 **EDWARD MENG:** YES. THANK YOU, CHAIR RAMACIER. IF YOU WILL
9 RECALL THIS BOARD APPROVED THE TWO YEAR CLIPPER BUDGET AND
10 WORK PLAN AT ITS APRIL 2021 MEETING AT THAT MEETING WE
11 COMMITTED TO UPDATING THE BOARD SEMI ANNUALLY ON THE CLIPPER
12 BUDGET. THIS IS THAT UPDATE. ATTACHED TO THIS MEMO IS THE
13 UPDATED CLIPPER OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET AS OF, I BELIEVE,
14 OCTOBER, AND THEN WE ALSO INCLUDED THE BUDGET THAT WAS
15 APPROVED BY THE BOARD IN APRIL AS REFERENCE IN ATTACHMENT TO
16 THIS MEMO AS WELL. I BELIEVE THAT'S ATTACHMENT A AND B IN THE
17 PACKET. OVERALL THE BUDGET HAS REMAINED RELATIVELY STABLE AS
18 THE CLIPPER PROGRAM CONTINUES TO MOVE FORWARD. OPERATING
19 ACTUALS WERE ACTUALLY A LITTLE BIT LESS THAN PREVIOUSLY
20 ESTIMATED. WHEN WE ESTIMATED OUR NEED FOR COVID-19 RELIEF IN
21 2020. THE CARES FUNDS ALLOCATED TO THE CLIPPER PROGRAM
22 ACTUALLY KEPT US AFLOAT A COUPLE MONTHS LONGER THAN ORIGINAL
23 ANTICIPATED. MTC'S PORTION OF OPERATING EXPENSES ACTUALLY
24 REMAINED RELATIVELY STABLE FROM NON-COVID IMPACT YEARS WHILE
25 TRANSIT OPERATING TRANSIT AGENCY OPERATING EXPENSES WERE DOWN



November 15, 2021

1 NEARLY 75% FROM TRADITIONAL NON-COVID IMPACTED YEARS AND
2 THAT'S MAINLY A FUNCTION OF HOUR CURRENT MOU COST SHARING
3 FORMULAS ARE WORKING, EXPENSES FOR ACTUALS FOR FY 2021 WERE
4 ALSO LESS THAN BY THE DATE OF THE MOBILE APP RELEASE AND WE
5 EXPECTED TO RELEASE THE APP EARLIER IN THE YEAR AND IT WAS
6 ACTUALLY RELEASED IN APRIL. FURTHER OVER THIS TIME OF COVID,
7 MORE FUNDS BECAME INACTIVE LIKELY DUE TO A LARGE PORTION OF
8 THE PUBLIC NOT RIDING TRANSIT THIS YEAR OVER THE PAST YEAR AND
9 WE'LL CONTINUE TO MONITOR THESE FUNDS AS TRANSIT RIDERSHIP
10 ACROSS THE REGION BEGINS TO RETURN. FROM LAST APRIL'S BUDGET
11 TO THIS MONTH'S UPDATE, WE ALSO, NOW, HAVE BETTER -- MUCH
12 BETTER CAPITAL ESTIMATES FOR THE ADDITIONAL THREE CONTRACTS.
13 THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER, PAYMENT SERVICES, AND THE FARE
14 MEDIA CONTRACTS. AND WE HAVE REFLECTED THESE EXPECTED AMOUNTS
15 FOR THE SYSTEM INTEGRATOR CONTRACT BASED ON THE MOST RECENT
16 PROJECT SCHEDULE SUBMITTED BY CUBIC AS WELL. THOSE HAVE BEEN
17 THE MAIN UPDATES ON THE CAPITAL END. I THINK IN GENERAL, THE
18 MAIN MESSAGE IS THAT THE CLIPPER OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET
19 CONTINUE TO BE RELATIVELY STABLE DURING A TIME OF RELATIVE
20 INSTABILITY, I GUESS. BUT WE WILL PLAN TO RETURN TO THIS BOARD
21 IN ROUGHLY HALF A YEAR TO REQUEST APPROVAL OF THE NEXT CLIPPER
22 TWO YEAR BUDGET. IF THERE ARE ANY MAJOR CHANGES OR IMPACTS TO
23 THE BUDGET, WE WILL INFORM THE BOARD AS NECESSARY, AS WELL.
24 SO, WITH THAT, I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY
25 HAVE.



November 15, 2021

1

2 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ED. DO WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS
3 OR COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS AT THIS TIME? SEEING NONE.
4 MARTHA ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
7 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
8 ON THIS ITEM.

9

10 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU, ED, FOR THE
11 REPORT THAT. BRINGS US TO ITEM --

12

13 **EDWARD MENG:** CHAIR RAMACIER, THING IS A RAISED HAND.

14

15 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** YOU'RE RIGHT. CAROLYN, GO AHEAD. SORRY.

16

17 **CAROLYN GONOT:** SORRY. THIS IS MORE OF A REQUEST. I APPRECIATE
18 -- I MET WITH CAROL, AND I THINK, JASON, EARLY ON, WHEN I
19 FIRST CAME ON TO THE BOARD TO GET SOME UNDERSTANDING. CAN YOU
20 EXPLAIN THE STAFF? IN GENERAL, STAFF COSTS AND HOW WE
21 DETERMINE OUR COST ON THE CAPITAL SIDE? BECAUSE THE STAFF GOES
22 AND THE CONSULTANTS GO DOWN SOMEWHAT ON THE CAPITAL SIDE, WERE
23 ABLE TO MAKE THE SWITCH? JUST CURIOUS.

24



November 15, 2021

1 **EDWARD MENG:** CORRECT. SO, BECAUSE RIGHT NOW IT'S A VERY
2 CAPITAL DELIVERY INTENSIVE PROGRAM AND WE RECOGNIZE THAT ONCE
3 WE KIND OF START DEPLOYING ASPECTS OF THE SYSTEM MORE STAFF
4 RESOURCES WILL BE NEEDED AND WILL SHIFT TO OPERATING EXPENSES.
5 AND THERE WILL BE LESS OF A NEED FOR CAPITAL CONSULTANTS. SO
6 THAT'S JUST KIND OF THE NATURE OF THE DELIVERY OF THE PROGRAM.

7

8 **CAROLYN GONOT:** THAT'S WHAT I WAS WONDERING. THAT'S WHAT IT
9 LOOKED LIKE TO ME. THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT.

10

11 **EDWARD MENG:** NO PROBLEM.

12

13 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS? OKAY. I THINK NOW
14 WE CAN MOVE ON TO ITEM 3B, UPDATE ON THE CURRENT CLIPPER
15 OPERATIONS PERFORMANCE. AND I THINK, JASON, YOU HAVE THIS.

16

17 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANKS CHAIR RAMACIER AND BOARD MEMBERS. WITH
18 RESPECT TO TRANSACTIONS AND SALES THIS MONTH THIS PAST MONTH
19 OF OCTOBER 2021, WE CONTINUE TO SEE SLIGHT INCREASE IN
20 TRANSACTIONS EACH MONTH THIS YEAR, AND, AGAIN, THIS IS NO
21 EXCEPTION. WE PROCESSED JUST UNDER 9 MILLION TRANSACTIONS IN
22 OCTOBER, AND SETTLED JUST UNDER \$19 MILLION IN REVENUE. JUST
23 AS PINT OF REFERENCE, PREPANDEMIC, WE WERE AROUND 22 TO 24
24 MILLION TRANSACTIONS A MONTH AND ABOUT 55 OR SO MILLION
25 DOLLARS OF REVENUE. IN TERMS OF MOBILE APP PERFORMANCE AND



November 15, 2021

1 USAGE: NOW WE HAVE OVER 150,000 PLASTIC CARD THAT HAVE BEEN
2 TRANSFERRED TO WALLETS AND JUST UNDER 170,000 NEW MOBILE CARDS
3 HAVE BEEN CREATED. SO, REMEMBER YOU TRANSFERRED YOU HAVE A
4 PLASTIC CARD PUT IT ON YOUR PHONE NEW CARDS IS SOMETHING YOU
5 JUST GOT DIRECTLY DIGITALLY AND NEVER HAD A PLASTIC CARD. SO
6 TOGETHER IT'S ALMOST 320,000 CARDS ON MOBILE. AND OF THOSE
7 320,000 CARDS THERE HAS BEEN APPROXIMATELY 3.6 MILLION TRIPS
8 TAKEN. AND IT'S, AS WE HAVE MENTIONED IN PREVIOUS MONTHS, THIS
9 IS APPROACHING NINE% OF THE TOTAL TRIPS TAKEN SINCE MID-APRIL,
10 AND WE CONTINUE TO SEE SLIGHT INCREASES EACH MONTH WITH JUST
11 OVER 11 AND A HALF% OF CLIPPER TRIPS BEING ON MOBILE IN
12 OCTOBER. IN TERMS OF OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE FARE CHANGES.
13 IN THE MEMO, WE HAVE DISCUSSED A QUARTERLY FARE CHANGE
14 SCHEDULE WHICH WE HAVE VETTED WITH TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF. AND
15 WE JUST WANTED TO BE CLEAR THAT THIS WOULD BE, IN EFFECT,
16 UNTIL THE START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION, WHEN WE MOVE TO THE
17 ACCOUNT-BASED SYSTEM. WE'RE TRYING TO LIMIT WHAT WE'RE DOING
18 IN OUR CARD-BASED WORLD SO THAT WE CAN -- THAT'S SEPARATE, AND
19 INDEPENDENT FROM ANY ROUTE AND OTHER CHANGES. THIS IS JUST FOR
20 FARE CHANGES. SO, THAT IS IN YOUR MEMO. I'M GOING TO PASS IT
21 OVER TO CAROL AT THE MOMENT TO TALK ABOUT SOME CHALLENGES THAT
22 WE'RE HAVING WITH RESPECT TO THE CURRENT CUSTOMER SERVICE
23 CENTER. CAROL?
24



November 15, 2021

1 **CAROL KUESTER:** OKAY. SURE. I'M -- JASON, WE WANT TO PAUSE FOR
2 A SECOND AND LET FOLKS ASK QUESTIONS ABOUT YOUR COMMENTS FIRST
3 THEN TRANSITION --

4

5 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SURE.

6

7 **CAROL KUESTER:** YOU HAVE A CONCERN IN YOUR PACKET FROM A
8 CUSTOMER, AND WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT SIGNIFICANT PROBLEMS
9 THAT OUR CUSTOMERS SERVICE CENTER ARE HAVING.

10

11 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** DENIS?

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I USE MOBILE APPS FOR LOTS OF THINGS AND LIKE
14 THEY CAN PAY FOR TRANSIT WITH IT THE DIFFERENCE IS OTHER
15 MOBILE APPS I DON'T USE TO PAY FOR THINGS I DON'T PAY FOR THE
16 APP, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT WE'RE GOING TO PAY TO DOWNLOAD
17 THE MOBILE APP DOES IT MAKE SENSE FROM A CUSTOMER SERVICE
18 PERSPECTIVE WE'RE TRYING TO PUSH THIS OUT TO CUSTOMERS AND WE
19 WANT TO ENCOURAGE IT AND WE'RE NOT PUTTING OUT THOSE PLASTIC
20 CARDS ANYMORE.

21

22 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** GREAT QUESTION. I WANT TO MAKE SOME
23 DISTINCTIONS HERE AND THERE IS PROBABLY SOME STUFF THAT WE
24 NEED TO DO TO HAVE FURTHER CONVERSATION ABOUT THE CARD FEE.
25 THE CLIPPER MOBILE APP YOU DO NOT CHARGE FOR THE APP ITSELF,



November 15, 2021

1 YOU CAN DOWNLOAD THE APP ON GOOGLE PLAY OR IOS APP STORE, FOR
2 FREE. YOU CAN MANAGE YOUR CARD AND DO WHATEVER YOU NEED TO DO
3 AS IT RELATES TO USING THE APP. IF YOU WANT TO USE YOUR PHONE
4 FOR PAYMENT, JUST LIKE A CLIPPER CARD, ANY CARD THAT YOU
5 PURCHASE, THERE IS A \$3 FEE. AND WE HAD AN INTRODUCTORY PERIOD
6 OF TIME WHERE WE WERE WAIVING THAT \$3 FEE, DENIS, BUT THAT
7 PERIOD OF TIME ENDED. I THINK SIX MONTHS AFTER WE LAUNCHED IN
8 MID-OCTOBER. ANYBODY WHO BUYS A CARD WHETHER IT BE ON CLIPPER
9 OR YOUR PHONE OR A PLASTIC ONE, IT'S \$3. THERE ARE TITLE SIX
10 IMPLICATIONS AS IT RELATES TO THIS AND STAFF IS LOOK INTO
11 THAT.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I APOLOGIZE. I HAD MISSED IT. I DIDN'T REALIZE
14 THIS UNTIL RECENTLY THAT IF YOU WANT TO USE YOUR PHONE TO PAY
15 FOR CLIPPER YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PAY THREE BUCKS, ONE TIME.
16 I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD SHOULD TALK
17 ABOUT. MAYBE AGENDAIZE FOR A FUTURE MEETING. IT JUST SEEMS
18 ODD. WE SHOULDN'T BE DIFFERENT FROM OTHER WAYS PEOPLE LIVE
19 THEIR LIVES. PEOPLE PAY FOR LOTS OF THINGS WITH THEIR PHONE
20 AND I THINK IT CREATES FRICTION FOR ENCOURAGING PEOPLE TO USE
21 THEIR PHONE. IF YOU HAVE GOT TO PAY THREE BUCKS, WHY NOT JUST
22 GET THE CARD. THAT'S MY TWO CENTS AND IF WE COULD TALK ABOUT
23 THIS AT A FUTURE MEETING THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

24

25 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WE COULD. SURE. STAFF STANDS AT THE READY.



November 15, 2021

1

2 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** MIKE?

3

4 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I WANT TO SECOND DENIS. THIS CAUGHT ME OFF
5 GUARD. I WAS NOT AWARE OF THAT. I'VE ALWAYS THOUGHT THE \$3 FEE
6 WAS THE CARD EXPENSE, HARDWARE IN THAT CARD, THE PLASTIC AND
7 PRINTING AND WHAT NOT. THIS SEEMS LIKE A POLICY DECISION. I
8 DON'T RECALL IT GOING TO THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD. I
9 DEFINITELY WOULD REQUEST THIS ITEM BE AGENDAIZED AND SEE WHAT
10 THE ACTUAL COST IS AND RATIONAL FOR THE CHARGE IS.

11

12 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I'LL REMIND THE BOARD, WE JUST BROUGHT AN
13 ITEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL FOR \$50 MILLION OVER THE COURSE OF THE
14 NEXT 12 YEAR TO PAY MOBILE PASS THROUGH FEE. IT ISN'T FREE,
15 NECESSARILY THROUGH THE PROGRAM EVEN THOUGH THERE IS NO
16 PHYSICAL PLASTIC COST.

17

18 **CAROL KUESTER:** WE CAN CERTAINLY BRING AN ITEM BACK. AS JASON
19 IS POINTING OUT THERE ARE A NUMBER OF POLICY ITEMS THAT WE
20 WOULD HAVE TO NAVIGATE, INCLUDING THE PARITY WITH THE COST OF
21 THE PHYSICAL PLASTIC CARD. THERE IS A COST TO THE MOBILE CARD,
22 AS WELL. BUT WE CAN BRING BACK AN ITEM WITH MORE DETAIL ON ALL
23 OF THOSE POINTS. NOT A PROBLEM.

24

25 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU.



November 15, 2021

1

2 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** YEAH. I THINK THAT'S PROBABLY A GREAT
3 IDEA, CAROL AND JASON. AN UPDATE AND REMINDER WHERE WE'RE AT
4 AND WHERE WE HAVE COME FROM WITH THESE FEES AND MAYBE SOME
5 THOUGHTS ON MOVING FORWARD IF THERE IS INTEREST ON THIS BOARD
6 TO ESSENTIALLY MAKE THIS -- I THINK WHAT I'M HEARING FROM MY
7 COLLEAGUES IS THE CUSTOMER SHOULD NOT SEE THE FEE. AND SO, IF
8 THERE IS AN EXPENSE, THERE IS PROBABLY SOME OTHER OPTIONS WE
9 CAN COVER THAT WITH, IN THE PROGRAM, TOO. SO, MAYBE SOME
10 THOUGHTS ON THAT, AS WELL. AND I'M NOT SEEING ANY OTHER HANDS
11 AT THE MOMENT FROM BOARD MEMBERS. SO, I THINK AT THIS TIME,
12 MARTHA, WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

13

14 **CAROL KUESTER:** CHAIR?

15

16 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** SORRY. CAROL?

17

18 **CAROL KUESTER:** I WAS GOING TO COVER REAL QUICKLY, SO, JUST TO
19 ACKNOWLEDGE, WE HAVE BEEN HAVING SIGNIFICANT PROBLEMS AT OUR
20 CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. LONG WAIT TIMES, DROPPED CALLS. IN
21 NOVEMBER, SO FAR, OUR AVERAGE WAIT TIME IS 40 MINUTES AND
22 THAT'S FAR OUTSIDE OF WHERE WE ARE TYPICALLY AND WHERE WE
23 REQUIRE CUBIC TO BE. SO, SOME OF THIS IS, YOU KNOW, RELATED TO
24 PEOPLE RETURNING TO TRANSIT. SOME OF IT IS RELATED TO
25 CUSTOMER SERVICE REPRESENTATIVES, YOUR CSRS. WE WERE DOWN TO



November 15, 2021

1 13 CSRS EARLIER THIS SUMMER RIGHT WHEN CALLS WERE BEGINNING TO
2 GO UP SO WE WEREN'T ABLE TO KEEP UP WITH DEMAND. WE HAVE HAD
3 PROBLEMS, AS HAS EVERYONE IN THE CALL CENTER INDUSTRY WITH
4 RECRUITING, TRAINING, AND RETAINING CSRS. I AM SURE YOU'RE
5 HEARING NEW STORIES ABOUT THAT. SO CUBIC IS UNDERTAKING
6 SEVERAL INITIATIVES TO ADDRESS THIS SITUATION, INCLUDING A
7 CALL BACK SYSTEM WHERE PEOPLE CAN LEAVE A MESSAGE AND GET A
8 CALL BACK SO THEY DON'T HAVE TO ACTIVELY WAIT ON THE PHONE. AT
9 THE SAME TIME WE HAVE HAD TECHNICAL PROBLEMS WITH CALLS BEING
10 DROPPED WHEN THEY'RE WAITING OR A CALL OR WITH CSR, CUBIC IS
11 ADDRESSING THAT TECHNICAL PROBLEM AS WELL. WE HAVE TIMOTHY
12 MORRISON HERE TODAY CUBIC CALL CENTER LEAD. I WOULD LIKE TO
13 TURN IT OVER TO HIM. TIM IF YOU COULD TALK ABOUT ANY POINTS
14 YOU WOULD LIKE AND THEN WE'LL TAKE QUESTIONS.

15

16 **TIMOTHY MORRISON:** I'M TIMOTHY MORRISON SERVICE OPERATOR FOR
17 THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. WE'RE CONTINUING AS ALONG WITH EVERYBODY
18 ELSE, TO STRUGGLE WITH HIRING BUT MEANWHILE WE'RE IN THE
19 PROCESS OF ADDING ENHANCEMENTS TO IVR THAT IN SHORT-TERM WILL
20 HELP GREATLY FIRST IS THE CALL BACK FEATURE THE WAY CAROL
21 MENTIONED AND THE WAY THAT WORKS IS AFTER TEN SECONDS THE
22 CUSTOMER IS PROVIDED WITH A POSITION IN LINE AS OPPOSED TO THE
23 EXPECTED WAIT TIME WE FEEL THAT IS MORE ACCURATE TO ALLOW
24 SOMEONE TO GAUGE HOW LONG THEY WOULD BE ON HOLD. THEY WILL
25 THEN BE OFFERED THE OPPORTUNITY TO RECEIVE A CALL BACK OR TO



November 15, 2021

1 RECEIVE -- OR TO LEAVE A VOICEMAIL. AND THEN ONCE THAT
2 POSITION MAKES IT TO A CSR, THEY WILL RECEIVE THAT CALL BACK.
3 SO IT COULD BE, CURRENTLY OUR WAIT TIMES ARE ABOUT AN HOUR AT
4 THE WORST SO OPPOSED TO HAVING TO SIT ON HOLD YOU WILL GET
5 THAT CALL WITHIN AN HOUR ONE THING I WOULD LIKE TO ADD IS ONCE
6 THE CALL CENTER CLOSES THEY WON'T GET CUT OFF WE WILL CLEAR
7 OUT THAT QUEUE, EVEN IF CALLS CALLERS ARE HOLD FOR AN HOUR AT
8 6:00 SOMEONE WILL STILL GET THEIR CALL BACK. THAT SCHEDULE IS
9 TO BE IMPLEMENTED DECEMBER SECOND, THREE WEEKS FROM NOW. WE
10 ALSO HAVE ADDITIONAL CHANGES THAT WILL HELP THAT IS GOING TO
11 BE IMPLEMENTED AT THE SAME TIME THAT'S GIVING US THE ABILITY
12 TO SEPARATE CALLS INTO COMPLEXITY SO THAT WE CAN SKILL THOSE
13 OVER TWO A MORE EXPERIENCED CSR. SO THEY CAN ANSWER THOSE
14 CALLS MORE QUICKLY. WHAT WE THEN DO IS TAKE THE EASIER CALLS
15 QUEUE INTO THE NEW CSRS SO THEY DON'T STRUGGLE THROUGH A CALL
16 THEY CAN ANSWER CALLS MORE QUICKLY. FINALLY THE ISSUE CAROL
17 BROUGHT UP WITH DROPPED CALLS WHICH IS SOMETHING PLAGUING US
18 FOR SEVERAL MONTHS I AM HAPPY TO SAY WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THE
19 SECTION OF THE CODE WHERE IT WAS HAPPENING THAT IS IN THE
20 HANDLER PART UP FRONT RELATED TO THE POST CALL SURVEY. WE HAVE
21 REMOVE THAT SURVEY BUTTON FROM THE CSRS DESKTOP CLIENT. AND
22 THAT HAS FOR ALL INTENTS AND PURPOSES ELIMINATED THE DROPPED
23 CALLS WE'RE WORKING WITH OUR IVR SYSTEM INTEGRATOR AND THE
24 PROVIDER TO FIND THE ROOT CAUSE OF THAT ONCE THAT IS ADDRESSED
25 WE WILL RETURN TO THE FORMER STATE WHICH WILL ALLOW THE



November 15, 2021

1 SURVEY. WITH THAT, I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS RELATED TO
2 THESE FEATURES.

3

4 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** CAROL, DID YOU WANT TO ADD ANYTHING ELSE
5 BEFORE I OPEN IT UP TO BOARD MEMBERS FOR QUESTIONS?

6

7 **CAROL KUESTER:** NO. SORRY. I WAS HAVING TROUBLE DISTINGUISHING
8 BETWEEN CAROLYN AND CAROL.

9

10 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** DENIS.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS FOR THE CALL BACK FEATURE I THINK
13 THAT'S GOOD CUSTOMER SERVICE MY CONCERN IS THE LONG WAIT TIMES
14 AND DROPPED CALLS HAS THERE BEEN DIFFERENCE WITH ENGLISH AND
15 NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS?

16

17 **TIMOTHY MORRISON:** NOT THAT I HAVE BEEN MADE AWARE OF DENIS. I
18 THINK 98% OF OUR CALLS ARE ENGLISH CALLS, TO BEGIN W SO, YOU
19 KNOW, IF THAT WERE THE CASE, IT WOULD BE NEGLIGIBLE TO BE
20 HONEST.

21

22 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** CAROLYN?

23

24 **CAROLYN GONOT:** WHEN I CAME BACK, I ACTUALLY PROBABLY WASTED
25 PART OF CAROL AND JASON'S TIME TRYING TO WALK ME THROUGH



November 15, 2021

1 GETTING MY MOBILE APP UP AND RUNNING AND MY CART IT IS
2 CONFUSING IN GENERAL AND I CALLED CUSTOMER SERVICE AND THERE
3 WAS A LONG WAIT SO I HUNG UP. BUT I WILL SAY JUST OVERALL IT
4 WOULD BE GOOD FOR PEOPLE WHO WANT TO GET THE MOBILE APP AND
5 WHO HAVE BEEN USING A PLASTIC CARD SOME OF THE DIRECTIONS ARE
6 NOT EASY AND THEY SEEM TO BE IN TWO PLATFORMS IN THE APP SO IT
7 MAY BE WORTH HAVING A VIDEO TO BE ABLE TO SHOW IT THE OTHER
8 THING IS I'M NOT SURE HOW MUCH WE HAVE IN OTHER LANGUAGES THAT
9 CAN BE -- LIKE, OH YEAH, SOMETHING STUPID LIKE A YOUTUBE VIDEO
10 THAT JUST SHOWS YOU HOW YOU TRANSFER OR MOVE TO THE MOBILE APP
11 WOULD BE GOOD, FROM THE PLASTIC CARDS AND HAVING THAT DONE IN
12 ANOTHER LANGUAGE, AS WELL. BECAUSE I FIND IT DIFFICULT. AND
13 I'M NOT -- NOT -- I MEAN, I DON'T FIND MYSELF INCAPABLE OF
14 USING TECHNOLOGY. SO I JUST WANT TO MAYBE HAVE SOMEONE WALK
15 THROUGH -- OR WALK -- HAVE SOMEONE WORK THROUGH HOW YOU --
16 WHAT YOU LOOK UP TO BE ABLE TO DO THAT. YOU HAVE GOT TO
17 DOWNLOAD IT ONE PLACE AND THEN ADD THE CARD, OR WHATEVER.
18 THANKS.

19

20 **TIMOTHY MORRISON:** THANK YOU. THOSE ARE GOOD SUGGESTIONS. I
21 WILL TAKE THAT BACK TO MY TEAM AND WE'LL WORK WITH THAT.

22

23 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THERESE?

24



November 15, 2021

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU, RICK. AND THANK YOU, TIM,
2 FOR BEING HERE ALWAYS APPRECIATE HAVING THE ACTUAL CONTRACTOR
3 PRESENCE TO ANSWER OUR QUESTIONS. I WAS INTRIGUED WITH THE
4 TRIAGE APPROACH YOU HAD ABOUT SEPARATING HARDER CASES FROM
5 THOSE THAT MAY BE MORE SIMPLE. HOW DOES THAT SCREENING HAPPEN?
6 TO MAKE THAT DECISION TO BUCKED THEM?

7

8 **TIMOTHY MORRISON:** I HAVEN'T SEEN THE ACTUAL IVR SCRIPT. BUT
9 THE WAY THAT I HAVE WORKED WITH THAT IN THE PAST IS TAKING
10 SOMETHING THAT IS A -- YOU BUCKET YOUR YOU TRANSACTIONS BASED
11 ON QUANTITY AND THE AVERAGE TIME TO PROCESS. AND SOMETHING MAY
12 BE, FOR EXAMPLE, I MAY JUST WANT TO RELOAD MY CARD. AND THAT,
13 NORMAL E IS A VERY STRAIGHT FORWARD TRANSACTION. SO, SAY, YOU
14 WANT TO RELOAD YOUR CARD, PRESS ONE. PRESS THAT AT FRONT OF
15 THE IVR SCRIPT I'M GOING TO PRESS ONE AND THAT AUTOMATICALLY
16 PULLS THAT OUT. SO WHAT YOU LEAVE ARE COMPLEX CALLS FOR ALL
17 OTHER OPTIONS PRESS FIVE. THOSE GET TO BUCKETS THAT IS MORE
18 COMPLEX THAT CAN'T BE BUCKETED -- BUCKET THOSE THAT CAN'T BE
19 BUCKETED INTO ALL OTHER AND THOSE GO TO YOUR MORE COMPLEX
20 CALL, CATEGORY, AND THEN YOU HAVE YOUR SENIOR CSRS TO ANSWER
21 THOSE.

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IT REALLY PIVOTS ON SOMEONE USING THE IVR
24 SYSTEM AT THE OUTSET? MORE NOTARY'S CORRECT.

25



November 15, 2021

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** AS OPPOSED TO SOMEONE WHO CALLS AND SITS AND
2 WAITS FOR SOMEONE TO GET -- PICK UP THEIR MESSAGE?

3

4 **TIMOTHY MORRISON:** YES. GOOD POINT. ONE OF THE THINGS IT DOES
5 REQUIRE, AND THIS SOMETIMES CAUSES SOME ANGST IS THAT YOU HAVE
6 TO FORCE PEOPLE TO USE THE IVR. A LOT OF TIMES THERE IS
7 REQUEST TO JUST LET THEM GO IMMEDIATELY TO ZERO. BUT IF THAT'S
8 THE INITIAL PART OF THE IVR THEN YOU LOSE ALL ABILITY TO
9 CONTROL AND BUCKET THOSE CALLS.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GOT IT. THANKS.

12

13 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** BOB?

14

15 **ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR:** [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]

16

17 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** BOB. WE CAN'T HEAR YOU. WHY DON'T WE GO
18 JEFF. I THINK PROBABLY BOB WILL BE FIXED IN A FEW MINUTES.
19 HE'S BEEN HAVING THIS ALL DAY. JEFF? GO AHEAD

20

21 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** SOMETIMES WE DON'T HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT
22 ON CUSTOMER SERVICE ISSUES LIKE THIS. I AM A WEEKLY CLIPPER
23 USER AND I AM FAIRLY SAVVY WITH TECHNOLOGY. I HAVE TRIED TWICE
24 AND FAILED TO ACTIVATE MY CLIPPER MOBILE. I SPEND A FARE
25 AMOUNT OF TIME IN OUR STATIONS AND HAVE TO DEAL WITH CONFUSED



November 15, 2021

1 CUSTOMERS PARTICULARLY AT POWELL AND CIVIC CENTER STATIONS
2 WHERE PEOPLE CAN'T FIGURE OUT HOW TO USE THE CLIPPER CARD
3 VENDING MACHINES AND HAVE FAILED REPEATEDLY TO DOWNLOAD AND
4 ACTIVATE THE CLIPPER MOBILE. WE MAKE IT REALLY PUNISHING TO
5 TRY TO USE TRANSIT. THIS IS THE WORST ELECTRONIC MEDIA
6 CUSTOMER SERVICE I HAVE EVER EXPERIENCED. IT'S REALLY
7 UNACCEPTABLE, AND I EXPECT US TO DO BETTER. I DON'T HAVE A
8 PARTICULAR REQUEST OTHER THAN TO CONTINUE TO WORK AT PUTTING
9 THE CUSTOMER FIRST AND MAKING IT EASY TO ACTUALLY BE ABLE TO
10 PAY FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT.

11

12 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** BOB, ARE YOU BACK?

13

14 **ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR:** YEAH. AUDIO CHECK?

15

16 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** YEAH. GO, PLEASE.

17

18 **ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR:** CAROL, JUST A COMMENT. I DON'T
19 THINK THAT IT'S ACCEPTABLE, EITHER. THREE WEEKS UNTIL WE FIX
20 THIS CALL BACK FUNCTIONALITY OF THIS THING? THAT'S THREE MORE
21 WEEKS OF PEOPLE BEING ONLINE, AND THEY HAVE GOT WAIT FOR 49
22 MINUTES. THAT'S NOT GOING TO WORK. IT JUST -- I MEAN -- YOU DO
23 WHATEVER YOU WANT WITH IT. BUT THAT'S -- WE KIND OF GLOSSED
24 OVER THAT. IT'S THREE WEEKS UNTIL DECEMBER 2ND. WHY? THAT
25 DOESN'T SEEM RIGHT?



November 15, 2021

1

2 **CAROL KUESTER:** TIM, DO YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO THAT?

3

4 **TIMOTHY MORRISON:** I CAN. AND I WOULD LOVE TO INSTITUTE
5 SOMETHING LIKE THAT TOMORROW. IT'S A MATTER OF TAKING CODE,
6 REWRITING THE CODE AND THE CODE HAS TO BE TESTED TO MAKE SURE
7 IT DOESN'T BREAK ANYTHING ELSE IN THE IVR THEN IT GOES THROUGH
8 CHANGE MANAGEMENT AND IT'S DEPLOYED.

9

10 **ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR:** AND, CAROL, HOW LONG HAVE WE KNOWN
11 ABOUT THIS?

12

13 **CAROL KUESTER:** ABOUT THE DECLINING -- THE LENGTHENING WAIT
14 TIMES OR THE DROPPED CALLS.

15

16 **ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR:** THE LENGTHENING WAIT TIMES OR THE
17 NEED TO HAVE THIS CALL BACK FEATURE, LIKE, WE BETTER HAVE THIS
18 THING. AND HOW LONG HAVE WE BEEN WORKING ON THIS?

19

20 **CAROL KUESTER:** IT'S BEEN MONTHS AND I WILL TELL YOU WE'RE
21 HAVING THE SAME PROBLEMS ON THE FASTRAK SIDE AS WELL. IT DOES
22 TAKE TIME TO IDENTIFY THE ISSUES PROPOSE SOLUTIONS AGREE ON
23 THEM AND GET THEM EXECUTED.

24



November 15, 2021

1 **ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR:** THAT FEEDS RIGHT INTO TUMLIN'S
2 COMMENTS. SO, ANYWAY, JUST -- JUST -- ANYWAY -- IT'S JUST A
3 COMMENT, I GUESS, CAROL, AS WE MOVE FORWARD.

4

5 **CAROL KUESTER:** OKAY. WELL -- I MEAN, ONE -- THERE IS A COUPLE
6 OF POINTS I WANT TO MAKE, AND I WANT LISA TO SPEAK TO,
7 SPECIFICALLY THE GLOBAL COMMENT ABOUT CUSTOMER SATISFACTION
8 CUSTOMER SERVICE AND THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE MOBILE APP AND
9 ADDING A CARD TO WALLET, WHICH IS -- I PERSONALLY GET FEEDBACK
10 THAT IT'S EXTRAORDINARILY SIMPLE. BUT BEFORE WE GO TO THAT,
11 LET ME JUST POINT OUT THAT ONE THING THAT WE DID, AND AGAIN
12 THIS IS NOT NEAR-TERM; THIS IS THE LONGER TERM -- BUT UNDER
13 NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM WE REMOVED THE CUSTOMER SERVICE
14 FROM THE CUBIC CONTRACT. RIGHT? RECALL THE CUBIC HAS SOUP TO
15 NUTS WORK FROM SYSTEM INTEGRATOR THROUGH CUSTOMER SERVICE AND
16 WE PULLED THAT PIECE OUT AND PROVIDE CUSTOMER SERVICE SO PART
17 OF THE STRATEGIES DRIVE THE BEST POSSIBLE CUSTOMER SERVICE
18 SOLUTIONS AND I THINK THE APPROACH WAS CORRECT IN THAT REGARD
19 IT'S NOT AN IMMEDIATE SOLUTION BUT I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT
20 THIS BOARD THIS PROGRAM IS NOT SITTING IDLY BY ON CUSTOMER
21 SERVICE. OVER TO YOU LISA TO TALK ABOUT WHAT WE KNOW FROM OUR
22 CUSTOMERS TODAY.

23

24 **LYSA HALE:** CAROL, THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND THANK YOU CHAIR
25 RAMACIER FOR LETTING ME TALK. IN TERMS OF THE GENERAL CUSTOMER



November 15, 2021

1 SERVICE ISSUE, AS CAROL EXPLAINED, THIS IS SNAG WE HAVE BEEN
2 AWARE OF FOR MONTHS. ALTHOUGH IT'S SOMETHING THAT CLIMBED
3 SLOWLY. SO WAS TO DIFFICULT FOR US TO ACTUALLY PUT OUR FINGER
4 ON THE FACT THAT THERE WAS A GROWING PROBLEM UNTIL SUCH TIME
5 THAT WE REALIZED, YOU KNOW, WE NEEDED TO TAKE SOME ADDITIONAL
6 ACTIONS. AND SOME OF THE THINGS THAT TIM TALKED ABOUT, LIKE,
7 THE CALL BACK FEATURE, IS SOMETHING THAT'S BEEN IN DEVELOPMENT
8 FOR SOMETIME. THEY HAVE BEEN WORKING ON IT FOR SEVERAL WEEKS.
9 SO IT'S NOT -- IT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT CAN BE DONE OVERNIGHT,
10 AS WE EXPLAINED. OTHER THINGS THAT WE'RE DOING ARE, TIM DIDN'T
11 GO INTO THE DETAILS ABOUT THIS, BUT THEY HAVE INCREASED THEIR
12 RATE OF PAY FOR CSRS SIGNIFICANT HE, AND HOPING THAT HELPS
13 WITH RECRUITING AND RETAINING CSRS. ALSO, PULLING IN CSRS FROM
14 OTHER PROGRAMS, THAT'S SOMETHING ELSE THAT'S GOING ON. ONCE
15 AGAIN, THAT CAN'T BE DONE OVERNIGHT. CLIPPER IS A COMPLICATED
16 SYSTEM AND THE PEOPLE ANSWERING THE PHONE NEED TO BE ABLE TO
17 ANSWER JUST ABOUT ANY QUESTION. SO IT'S A MATTER OF GETTING
18 THOSE PEOPLE TRAINED. SO WE ARE PLANNING ON GETTING MORE
19 PEOPLE ON THE PHONES BY THE BEGINNING OF DECEMBER. AND I AGREE
20 WITH YOU, THAT IS TOO LONG. BUT IT IS THE BEST THAT WE CAN DO.
21 WE'RE WORKING ON IT AND WE'RE WORKING ON IT ACTIVELY. I CAN
22 JUST ASSURE YOU OF THAT. THE OTHER THING CAROL WANTED ME TO
23 ADDRESS WAS THE MOBILE ISSUE. AND I WOULD JUST SAY, THANK YOU
24 -- THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS ABOUT HOW DIFFICULT IT IS, OR
25 HOW DIFFICULT SOME PEOPLE ARE FINDING IT TO USE MOBILE. I DO



November 15, 2021

1 APPRECIATE IT. AS CAROL SAID. I HAVE HEARD REALLY GREAT THINGS
2 ABOUT PEOPLE USING MOBILE. AND YOU CAN TELL BY 3.6 MILLION
3 TRANSACTIONS, THAT THE VAST MAJORITY OF PEOPLE ARE NOT HAVING
4 A PROBLEM WITH USING MOBILE OR WE WOULDN'T HAVE AS MANY
5 TRANSACTIONS AS WE DO. WE ARE -- WE HAVE DEVELOPED SOME VERY
6 COMPREHENSIVE BUT CLEAR AND CONCISE INFORMATION ON OUR WEB
7 SITE THAT TALKS ABOUT HOW TO USE CLIPPER ON YOUR PHONE. THERE
8 IS A PAGE DEDICATED TO USING IT ON YOUR APPLE PHONE OR WATCH.
9 AND ANOTHER ONE DEDICATED TO USING IT ON YOUR ANDROID PHONE.
10 AND, CAROL CAN SEND OUT THE LINKS TO THESE PAGES AFTER THIS
11 MEETING, SO THAT YOU ALL HAVE THAT. IF YOU LOOK AT THAT, AND
12 YOU HAVE SOME SPECIFIC SUGGESTIONS AS TO HOW WE COULD MAKE
13 IMPROVEMENTS TO THE MATERIALS THAT WE'RE PROVIDING, I WOULD
14 WELCOME THAT. WE'RE ALWAYS LOOKING TO MAKE OUR INFORMATION
15 BETTER. AND CLEARER. THE OTHER THING WANTED TO MENTION IS THAT
16 WE DID PRODUCE TRAINING MATERIALS FOR TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF.
17 BUT MAYBE THERE IS A NEED AND AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO GO BACK
18 AND DO SOME REFRESHER TRAINING SO THAT THEY FEEL MORE
19 CONFIDENT AND MORE CAPABLE OF ASSISTING CUSTOMERS WHO ARE
20 HAVING ISSUES. SO FAR THAT WOULD BE ANOTHER THING FOR US TO
21 CONSIDER. I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS

22

23 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, LYSA. DENIS?

24



November 15, 2021

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I HAVE A QUESTION WITH RESPECT TO RECRUITMENT
2 AND CUSTOMER SERVICE REPRESENTATIVES ARE THEY PEOPLE DOING
3 THIS WORK AT 375 BEALE OR ARE THEY DISPERSED AT OTHER
4 LOCATIONS?

5

6 **LYSA HALE:** THEY ARE DISPERSED AT OTHER LOCATIONS.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** BOB?

11

12 **ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR:** FOLLOW UP COMMENT CHAIR RAMACIER
13 PERHAPS WE COULD GET AN UPDATE AT OUR NEXT MEETING. I THINK
14 IT'S 20, DECEMBER. I THINK IT WARRANTS IT. THERE ARE
15 MILESTONES BETWEEN NOW AND DECEMBER, DECEMBER SECONDING ONE OF
16 THEM, LET'S SEE HOW THE SHORT-TERM FIXES HAVE HELPED THE
17 CUSTOMER. SO IF YOU ARE GAME FOR THAT, MAYBE I COULD GET A
18 SECOND FROM SOMEBODY AND GET AN UPDATE ON THE AGENDA FOR THE
19 20TH?

20

21 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** I THINK THAT'S AN EXCELLENT IDEA.
22 LISTENING TO THE CONVERSATION IT STRIKES ME THAT THIS IS A
23 LARGER ISSUE IN SOCIETY WITH CUSTOMER SERVICE. AND I THINK, AS
24 A BOARD, WE SHOULD BE GETTING AN UPDATE AND HAVING AN
25 OPPORTUNITY TO, PERHAPS, LOOK AT GIVING STAFF FURTHER



November 15, 2021

1 DIRECTION FROM A BROAD SENSE AS WE MOVE FORWARD. BECAUSE, I
2 THINK, CAROL, IT WAS YOU, THAT KNOWS THIS HAS SNUCK UP ON US.
3 AND I CAN IMAGINE HOW THAT HAPPENED. 9, 10 MONTHS AGO, THINGS
4 ARE GOING UP A LITTLE BIT, STAFF SHORTAGES ARE STARTING TO
5 GROW. IT'S VERY SIMILAR TO WHAT I'M SEEING AT MINE WITH THE
6 BUS OPERATORS. YOU KNOW? IT'S -- WE HAVE HAD TWO SUCCESSIVE
7 CLASSES AND ALL WE'RE DOING IS STAYING IN PLACE, WE HAVE HIRED
8 THE 50 BATCH OF OPERATORS AND PLAN TO HIRE THE SECOND BATCH
9 OUR GOAL WAS TO FILL 20 PORTIONS, BUT IN THE MEANTIME 20
10 PEOPLE LEFT PEOPLE ARE QUITTING IN DROVES. I THINK WE NEED TO
11 THINK ABOUT THIS CREATIVELY AND STRATEGICALLY, AND IT'S A
12 MULTI-LEVEL APPROACH THAT WE NEED TO TAKE. I APPRECIATE, TIM,
13 YOU BEING HERE, AND AT LEAST SAYING WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO DO.
14 YOU KNOW, I -- I APPRECIATE THAT EFFORT. I THINK SOME OF THE
15 THINGS WE NEED TO TAKE A LOOK AT. BOB, I THINK THAT'S AN
16 EXCELLENT SUGGESTION. TO START THAT DISCUSSION IN A FOCUSED
17 WAY N DECEMBER. JEFF?

18

19 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO REQUEST SOME CUSTOMER
20 SERVICE SURVEYS THAT WE CAN UNDERSTAND OUR ACTUAL CUSTOMERS
21 EXPERIENCES. I THINK THE NUMBER OF USERS IS NOT A GOOD
22 INDICATOR OF CUSTOMER SERVICE FOR A PRODUCT THAT HAS A
23 MONOPOLY ON ACCESSING PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND I'M REALLY WORRIED
24 THAT WE ARE DRIVING AWAY USERS BECAUSE OF HOW DIFFICULT WE
25 MAKE ACCESSING OUR FARE PRODUCTS. SO IF WE COULD REQUEST AND



November 15, 2021

1 PERHAPS SOMETIME EARLY NEXT YEAR -- IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE THAT
2 COMPLEX -- BUT A USER EXPERIENCE SURVEY TO UNDERSTAND WHAT OUR
3 CUSTOMERS ARE ACTUALLY EXPERIENCING. AND I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO
4 MAKE SURE THAT WE SPECIFICALLY TARGET NON-NATIVE ENGLISH
5 SPEAKERS, AS WELL AS PEOPLE WHO ARE UNBANKED.

6

7 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** LISA, IT LOOKS LIKE YOU WANT TO RESPOND
8 TO JEFF'S REMARK?

9

10 **LYSA HALE:** I DO. THANK YOU. WE DO BIENNIAL CUSTOMER SERVICE --
11 CUSTOMER SURVEYS, AND HISTORICALLY, AND BY "HISTORICALLY" I
12 MEAN FOR THE LAST EIGHT YEARS OR SO, WE HAVE RECEIVED ABOUT
13 THE HIGHEST MARKS THAT WE COULD RECEIVE, LIKE, 95% AND ABOVE
14 FOR CUSTOMER SATISFACTION. THIS NEXT SURVEY THAT WE'RE
15 ACTUALLY ALREADY PLANNING DOING AFTER THE FIRST OF THE YEAR IS
16 GOING TO BE THE FIRST THAT WE HAVE DONE ON WITH MOBILE SINCE
17 IT'S ROLLED OUT THERE ARE SPECIFIC CHALLENGES FOR GETTING
18 FEEDBACK SPECIFICALLY ON MOBILE WE WILL BE DIFFERENTIATING
19 BETWEEN PEOPLE WHO ARE STILL USING PLASTIC WHICH ARE THE VAST
20 MAJORITY OF CLIPPER CARD CUSTOMERS AND PEOPLE WHO ARE USING
21 MOBILE SO WE'LL GET THAT SPECIALIZED DATA SET. AND THE
22 DIVERSITY IN RESPONDENTS TO RESEARCH THAT WE DO.

23

24 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** GREAT. I SUGGEST YOU SURVEY THE METHODOLOGY
25 WITH THE BOARD AS WELL AS QUESTIONS ASKED TO SUPPORT THE



November 15, 2021

1 METHODOLOGY FOR ENSURING THAT WE GET AN ADEQUATE NUMBER OF NOT
2 NATIVE ENGLISH SPEAKERS.

3

4 **LYSA HALE:** THAT MAY DELAY OUR ABILITY TO START THE SURVEY
5 WHEN WE PLANNED, BUT YES, I WOULD BE HAPPY TO DO THAT.

6

7 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** CAROL DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING YOU WANT TO
8 ADD TO THAT BEFORE WE MOVE TO THERESE.

9

10 **CAROL KUESTER:** GOOD POINTS MADE LISA. I WANT TO SAY, RICK,
11 WITH THE CHALLENGES SNEAKING UP ON US, WE HAVE EXTENSIVE KPIS
12 IN THE CUBIC CONTRACT. AND CUBIC HAS NOT BEEN MEETING THE CALL
13 ANSWERING KPI. SO I JUST WANT TO RESPOND TO SAY WE'RE -- WE'RE
14 NOT ASLEEP AT THE WHEEL. WE SEE THAT THAT KPI IS NOT BEING
15 MET. AND WE HAVE BEEN IN DISCUSSION WITH CUBIC ABOUT WHAT TO
16 DO ABOUT IT. UNDER THE CONTRACT, WE HAVE THE RIGHT TO IMPOSE
17 A FINANCIAL PENALTY FOR UNMET KPIS, AND WE, IN FACT, WAIVED
18 THAT TO DATE SO THAT CUBIC CAN TAKE THOSE FUNDS AND APPLY THEM
19 TO HIGHER PAY RATES FOR CSRS. WE DO MAKE ADJUSTMENT CALLS
20 ABOUT WHAT TO BRING TO THIS BOARD SO I'M HAPPY TO TAKE
21 DIFFERENT OR OTHER DIRECTION ABOUT HOW WE SHOULD BE MANAGING
22 THE CONTRACTORS. SO WE'LL -- WE CAN BRING BACK ADDITIONAL
23 DETAIL AND LAY OUT SOME OPTIONS TO GET SOME DIRECTION NEXT
24 MONTH.

25



November 15, 2021

1 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANKS CAROL. THERESE?

2

3 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SURE. THANK YOU, RICK. JUST WITH RESPECT TO
4 JEFF'S OVERARCHING COMMENT ABOUT THE BAY AREA, I SUPPOSE, OR
5 CLIPPER MAKING THINGS MORE DIFFICULT FOR THE CUSTOMER TO USE
6 PUBLIC TRANSIT THAN IT NEED BE, ONE THING WE MIGHT WANT TO DO
7 IS ASK THE TEAM THAT WAS WORKING OUR FARE INTEGRATION STUDY,
8 WHO DID -- WE PAID THE CONSULTANT TO DO EXTENSIVE USER
9 EXPERIENCE SURVEYS PART OF THAT EFFORT, THEY MAY WELL HAVE
10 SOME FINDINGS APROPOS OF THAT, AGAIN, NOT SPECIFICALLY TO
11 CLIPPER, THOUGH, THAT MAY HAVE BEEN TAPPED, BUT SOMETHING THAT
12 WOULD GIVE US INSIGHTS AS TO BARRIERS THAT MIGHT HAVE SOME
13 INTERSECTION WITH THIS PARTICULAR AREA. SO, YOU KNOW, WE COULD
14 TAKE THAT BACK TO OUR FARE -- INTREPID FARE INTEGRATION TEAM.
15 WE JUST TALKED TO EARLIER TODAY. AND SEE IF THEY HAVE
16 INFORMATION ALREADY GLEANED FROM FOCUS GROUPS AND SURVEYS IN A
17 LOT OF THEIR OTHER WORK IN THEIR RESEARCH THAT MAY HAVE SOME
18 BEARING ON THAT QUESTION.

19

20 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERESE. ANY OTHER BOARD
21 COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS AT THE MOMENT? I DIDN'T MEAN TO CUT YOU
22 OFF. BACK TO YOU JASON. IS YOUR REPORT ON THIS OVERALL ITEM 3B
23 COMPLETE?

24

25 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** YES. IT IS.



November 15, 2021

1

2 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** OKAY. I THINK, MARTHA AT THIS TIME, I'LL
3 GO BACK TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE
6 TO GIVE THEM?

7

8 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FIRST UP IS ROLAND, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
11 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. FIRST OF ALL, I WOULD LIKE TO
14 SECOND AND STRONGLY ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH A COMMENT EVERYBODY
15 MADE ABOUT THIS BAT INSANE \$3 CHARGE FOR DOWNLOADING THE
16 CLIPPER APPLICATION. I HOPE WE CAN ADDRESS THIS. NOW, WITH
17 REGARDS TO DIRECTOR TUMLIN'S EXPERIENCE WITH THE CLIPPER
18 MACHINE TRYING TO BUY A CLIPPER CARD, I'LL TELL YOU WHAT MINE
19 IS. I USED TO TAKE THE 181 TO WALNUT SPRINGS AND ONE DAY I HAD
20 A CONVERSATION WITH A LADY AND BY THE TIME WE GOT TO WARM
21 SPRINGS SHE WAS TOTALLY SOLD ON GETTING CLIPPER THAT SHE HAD
22 NEVER HEARD OF BEFORE SHE THEN APPROACHED THE MACHINE AND SHE
23 COULDN'T FIGURE OUT HOW TO BUY A CLIPPER CARD AND ASKED ME FOR
24 ASSISTANCE. I SPENT MANY YEARS OF MY LIFE AS A SOFTWARE
25 ENGINEER AND COULDN'T FIGURE OUT WALKING THROUGH THE MENUS.



November 15, 2021

1 MAYBE [INDISCERNIBLE] ONE THING I WANT TO ADDRESS. I AM
2 CONCERNED ABOUT THE WAY THIS MEETING IS BEING CONDUCTED. NONE
3 OF THE INFORMATION PRESENTED BY STAFF IS IN THE PACKET EITHER
4 AS A REPORT, OR AS IN SLIDES. AND MOVING FORWARD, IF STAFF
5 COULD PLEASE TRY TO SPEND A COUPLE OF MINUTES, DRAFTING A
6 COUPLE OF SLIDES TOGETHER SO THEY CAN TALK THROUGH DURING THE
7 REPORT, THAT WOULD BE MUCH APPRECIATED BY MEMBERS OF THE
8 PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU ROLAND.

11

12 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** NEXT. WHO IS THE NEXT ONE, MARTHA --
13 SORRY. I'LL LET YOU DO THAT, MARTHA.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT IS ADINA. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
16 YOURSELF. MAKE SURE YOU DO IT ON BOTH ENDS.

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. NOW, I AM DOUBLE UNMUTED. GOOD
19 AFTERNOON. ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
20 AND THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE SUBCOMMITTEE. AND I AM
21 SPEAKING FOR MYSELF HERE. A COUPLE OF POINTS REGARDING THE
22 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE WITH REGARD TO CLIPPER MOBILE APP. I HEARD
23 STAFF TALK ABOUT A BI-TWICE A YEAR CUSTOMER SURVEY, AND
24 BRINGING IN A CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, IT MIGHT BE USEFUL TO CHECK
25 ON WHAT THE PROCESS IS FOR ASSESSING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE WITH



November 15, 2021

1 MOBILE APPS. FOR EXAMPLE, LYFT AND UBER PROBABLY AFFECT
2 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE ON A FAIRLY CONTINUAL BASIS, NOT TWICE A
3 YEAR. AND THERE PROBABLY ARE THINGS THAT HAVING A DIGITAL
4 CONNECTION WITH CUSTOMER CAN FACILITATE. THAT IS ONE. THE
5 SECOND IS WITH REGARD TO THE NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS AND THE FACT
6 THAT IT'S A VERY TINY, SINGLE DIGIT PERCENT, IF I HEARD RIGHT,
7 OF NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS WHO ARE CALLING IN TO TECH SUPPORT AND
8 SINCE NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS REPRESENT A PROBABLY, MAYBE A
9 LARGER SHARE OF TRANSIT USERS THAN THAT. I AM WONDERING
10 WHETHER THERE IS A CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE ISSUE BURIED IN THERE
11 AS TO WHY A NON-ENGLISH SPEAKER ISN'T CALLING TECH SUPPORT TO
12 BEGIN WITH. THEN BACK TO SOME OTHER TECH SUPPORT ISSUES WITH
13 MOBILE. I AM USING THE CLIPPER MOBILE APP. IT TOOK ME A MONTH
14 OR SO TO GET AN ISSUE WITH A VERY COMMON ANDROID DEVICE
15 UNSCRAMBLED THEN ONCE THAT UPDATED I NEEDED TO FIGURE OUT TO
16 REINSTALL THE APP IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO RELOAD -- IN ORDER TO
17 BE ABLE TO PUT MONEY ON TO IT ONCE I WAS ABLE TO USE IT TO
18 BEGIN WITH.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU ADINA.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO I LOOK FORWARD TO LOOKING INTO THE CUSTOMER
23 SERVICE ISSUE. THANK YOU.

24



November 15, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAST SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPREE. TWO
2 MINUTES.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RICK RAMACIER. ALETA DUPREE SHE AND
5 HER FOR THE RECORD. LOTS OF IMPORTANT THINGS BROUGHT UP. I
6 THINK WE NEED TO WORK TOWARD A GOAL OF NOT CHARGING FOR
7 ENABLING THE MOBILE APP TO BE USED TO OPEN FARE GATES AND
8 ACCESS READERS ON VEHICLES. IT'S NOT NEW. WASHINGTON, D.C.
9 CHARGES \$2 TO TURN ON THAT VIRTUAL CARD FUNCTIONALITY. I THINK
10 WE HAVE TO WORK TOWARD MAKING THAT FREE. YOU KNOW? PEOPLE
11 SHOULDN'T HAVE TO BE FRUSTRATED WITH ACCESSING SOMETHING NEW.
12 YOU KNOW? I HAVE THE APP, AND I DIDN'T HAVE ANY PROBLEMS
13 ADDING MY CARD TO IT. I DON'T USE THE APP FOR FARE PAYMENT,
14 BECAUSE I HAVE A REDUCED FARE CARD, AND SOME OF THE AGENCIES
15 HAVE DIFFERENT LIMITATIONS ON THAT. CERTAINLY, I HAVE HAD MY
16 ISSUES WITH VENDING MACHINES. I RARELY USE THEM BECAUSE I HAVE
17 APPS. BUT VENDING MACHINE PROBLEMS ARE NOT NEW. I GET
18 FRUSTRATED USING THE VENDING MACHINE CARD READERS IN NEW YORK
19 CITY. SO THIS IS NOT A BAY AREA SPECIFIC THING. BUT NO ONE
20 SHOULD HAVE TO WAIT FOR AN HOUR TO GET HELP. AND I DON'T WANT
21 US TO LOSE PEOPLE BECAUSE OF FRUSTRATION. AND THIS IS A
22 PROBLEM WITH THE AIRLINES. FOR PEOPLE HAVING TO ASK QUESTIONS
23 THAT THEY REALLY CAN'T FIND ON A WEB SITE. WE HAVE A LOT OF
24 WORK TO DO AND WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO SOLVE IT TODAY.
25 BUT I DON'T WANT US TO LOSE PEOPLE ALONG THE WAY, ESPECIALLY,



November 15, 2021

1 WE HAVE TO IMPRESS UPON BOARD OF DIRECTORS TO EMBRACE CHANGES.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE

5 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

6

7 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MARTHA. ANY LAST COMMENTS FROM

8 BOARD MEMBERS BEFORE WE MOVE ON?

9

10 **CAROL KUESTER:** RICK, IF I COULD SUMMARIZE WHAT I HEARD?

11

12 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** YES.

13

14 **CAROL KUESTER:** SO IF I UNDERSTAND CORRECTLY, OUR DIRECTION IS

15 TO RETURN WITH ITEMS ON CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER PERFORMANCE.

16 THE ISSUE OF CARD FEES, AND THAT -- THAT WILL INCLUDE PLASTIC

17 AND VIRTUAL CARDS. I THINK WE ALSO HEARD A REQUEST FOR MORE

18 INFORMATION ABOUT CUSTOMER SURVEY METHODOLOGY. AND I WOULD

19 LIKE TO RECOMMEND THAT WE DO, FOR THIS GROUP, A DEMONSTRATION

20 OF WHAT IT TAKES -- OR, SORT OF, THE PROCESS OF USING THE

21 MOBILE APP. AND ADDING A CARD TO WALLET. THOSE ARE -- IT'S

22 EASY TO CONFLATE THE TWO THINGS. THEY'RE SEPARATE, I THINK WE

23 COULD JUST DO A QUICK DEMO FOR THIS GROUP SO THAT YOU ALL CAN

24 BE AMBASSADORED ALONG WITH US. YOU KNOW, THE MOBILE APP IS

25 ONE WAY TO AVOID USING A PARTICULATE VENDING MACHINE. OF



November 15, 2021

1 COURSE, WITH THAT, I THINK ANY FIRST TIME USE INTERFACE
2 REQUIRES A LOT OF THINKING. SO, THOUGH WERE THE ITEMS I HEARD
3 WE ARE TO RETURN W I GUESS, IF I DID NOT GET IT RIGHT, I WOULD
4 LIKE SOMEONE TO LET ME KNOW WHAT ELSE WE SHOULD BE ADDING TO
5 NEXT MONTH.

6

7 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THAT SOUNDS ABOUT RIGHT TO ME, CAROL.
8 THANK YOU FOR THAT. IS THERE ANY BOARD MEMBERS WHO HEARD
9 SOMETHING DIFFERENT?

10

11 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** NO I THINK THAT'S RIGHT. AND SPECIFICALLY
12 AROUND SURVEY METHODOLOGY, WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND, FOR OUR MOST
13 VULNERABLE USERS WHAT THEIR EXPERIENCE IS. TO SAY THAT THE
14 NUMBER OF NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS CALLING INTO THE CALLING NUMBER
15 IS SO SMALL THAT IT DOESN'T MATTER IF THEY'RE HAVING A HARD
16 TIME IS -- YOU MEAN, THAT'S REALLY ALARMING TO ME. THOSE ARE
17 THE PEOPLE WE NEED TO PUT FIRST TO MAKE SURE THE SYSTEMS ARE
18 WORKING FOR THEM. AGAIN I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT WE NEED TO
19 MAKE SURE THAT CUSTOMER SERVICE IS WORKING FOR NON-NATIVE
20 ENGLISH SPEAKERS AND THE UNBANKED. AS WELL AS A BROAD ARRAY OF
21 AGES AND RACES.

22

23 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** OKAY. ANYTHING ELSE? LAST CALL BEFORE I
24 MOVE ON. OKAY. WELL, THANK YOU, STAFF, FOR THE REPORT, AND
25 THE RESPONSE TO A NUMBER OF THE BOARD'S CONCERNS. I APPRECIATE



November 15, 2021

1 THAT GREATLY. WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 3C, WHICH IS
2 AN UPDATE ON THE CLIPPER TWO. AND, JASON, AGAIN, YOU WILL KICK
3 THIS ONE OFFER.

4

5 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANKS, CHAIR RAMACIER. SO, AS ALWAYS
6 ATTACHMENT A TO THIS MEMO INCLUDES THE STATUS REPORT THAT WE
7 UPDATE YOU MONTHLY AND IT SHOWS THE HIGH LEVEL SCHEDULE,
8 RECENTLY COMPLETED ACTIVITIES UPCOMING DELIVERABLES.
9 DELIVERABLES TO HIGHLIGHT. FINAL TIME FOR DESIGN WILL CONCLUDE
10 THIS WINTER TESTING SOFTWARE EQUIPMENT OVER NEXT YEAR MAKING
11 SURE ALL PLATFORM DEVICES HAVE NEW CLIPPER EQUIPMENT
12 INSTALLED. AS WE HAVE MENTIONED OVER THE PAST FEW MONTHS CUBIC
13 SUBMITTED A PROJECT SCHEDULE THAT STILL SHOWS SOME DELAYS THAT
14 WE DESCRIBED. THE CURRENT SCHEDULE FOR INSTALLATION OF NEW
15 EQUIPMENT WILL START TOWARDS THE END OF THIS YEAR WITH FLEET
16 WIDE INSTALLATION TO BE COMPLETE BY THE FALL OF NEXT YEAR. I
17 DID WANT TO SAY THAT, YOU KNOW, I THINK WE HAVE TO REALIZE
18 THAT WE'RE IN A WORLD THAT'S, SORT OF, A DIFFERENT PLACE FROM
19 WHEN WE AWARDED THIS CONTRACT IN 2018. SO, AND WE UNDERSTAND
20 HERE IN 2021, AS, HOPEFULLY WE'RE COME OUT OF PANDEMIC, BUT WE
21 DO UNDERSTAND OUR RESPONSIBILITY TO MAINTAIN ACCOUNTABILITY,
22 WHILE WE MAKE SURE THAT WE MAINTAIN THAT WE OBTAIN MEANINGFUL
23 PROGRESS ON THE PROJECT AS WE CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD. TO
24 THIS END, CLIPPER STAFF HAS BEEN WORKING WITH CUBIC TO REFINE
25 AN APPROACH TO MAKE MEANINGFUL SCHEDULE RECOVERY. AND CUBIC'S



November 15, 2021

1 OUTLINE AND APPROACH TO ACHIEVE REVENUE RATE BY THE OCTOBER
2 2022 COMPLETION DATE IN WHICH ACCOUNT BASIS AND FUNCTIONS
3 WOULD BE TESTED AND IMPLEMENTED IN TWO STAGES. ONE, PRIOR TO
4 ACHIEVING REVENUE READY, AND THEN THE SECOND PRIOR TO STARTING
5 THE CUSTOMER TRANSITION INCLUDING A SYSTEM. A MEMO IN YOUR
6 PACKET MENTIONS STAFF HAVING TO UPDATE SCHEDULE IN DECEMBER
7 HOWEVER THIS IS AN ONGOING DISCUSSION AND MAY CARRY OVER INTO
8 JANUARY. SO STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO UPDATE YOU ON THE PROGRESS
9 AND BRINGING RECOMMENDATIONS FOR YOUR GUIDANCE AND APPROVAL AS
10 NEEDED. I WILL PAUSE THERE, IN THE INTEREST OF BREVITY, AND,
11 IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS, I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER THEM.

12

13 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, JASON. QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS
14 FROM BOARD MEMBERS OF JASON? I'M NOT SEEING ANY AT THIS TIME.
15 SO, MARTHA, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
19 ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. LAST CALL FOR
22 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS. OKAY. NOT SEEING
23 ANYTHING, JASON. SO THAT WENT REALLY WELL FOR YOU. [LAUGHTER]
24 LET'S MOVE ALONG THEN TO ITEM FOUR WHICH IS THE EXECUTIVE
25 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. CAROL.



November 15, 2021

1

2 **CAROL KUESTER:** APOLOGIES. SLOW UNMUTE. I HAVE NOTHING MORE TO
3 ADD. THANK YOU.

4

5 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** OKAY. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM SIX. NO.
6 ITEM FIVE. SORRY. AND IT HAS BEEN OUR PRACTICE SINCE THIS
7 BOARD WAS ESTABLISHED. THIS IS THE TIME FOR BOARD MEMBERS TO
8 RAISE ANY ITEMS THEY WISH TO RAISE THAT ARE NOT ON TODAY'S
9 AGENDA THAT WOULD FALL UNDER THE PURVIEW OF THIS BOARD BEFORE
10 WE TURN IT OVER TO GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. IS THERE ANY BOARD
11 MEMBERS WISHING TO RAISE ANYTHING RELATIVE TO OUR SUBJECT
12 MATTER THAT IS NOT ON THE AGENDA TODAY? NOT SEEING ANY.
13 MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? I KNOW WE HAD ONE
14 WRITTEN COMMENT THAT WAS RECEIVED.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. WE DO. FOR THE RECORD, THERE WAS NO
17 PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR AGENDA ITEM FOUR AND I DIDN'T SEE
18 ANYBODY RAISE THEIR HAND WHILE CAROL WAS SPEAKING. WE DID
19 RECEIVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT CORRESPONDENCE FOR AGENDA ITEM FIVE
20 FROM E COOLS, AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
21 HAND RAISED. ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR RAMACIER AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE
24 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD I SPEAK DIRECTLY. WE GET A LOT OF
25 IMPORTANT WORK DONE IN THESE MEETINGS AND IT'S FRUSTRATING



November 15, 2021

1 WHEN THINGS AREN'T MOVING ALONG BUT OVERALL WE ARE STILL
2 MAINTAINING A SENSE OF LEADERSHIP AS I GO TO SOME OTHER PLACES
3 SOME ARE THEM ARE NOT AS FAR ALONG AS WE ARE, BUT MAINTAINING
4 AND A LEADING EDGE PROGRAM REQUIRES US TO SUPPORT IT WHEN
5 COVID HAS BEEN CHALLENGING AS FAR AS HAVING ENOUGH PEOPLE TO
6 ANSWER THE PHONES AND MAKING SURE THAT WEB SITES AND ALL THESE
7 OTHER THINGS ARE RUNNING. BUT WE HAVE TO STAY THE COURSE. I
8 THINK WE CAN IMPROVE OUR PERFORMANCE NUMBERS IF AGENCY BOARDS
9 WOULD BE WILLING TO MOVE MORE TO AN ALL-CLIPPER SYSTEM. AND
10 THAT'S A HARD SELL. SOME PEOPLE ARE REALLY PASSIONATE ABOUT
11 THEIR PAPER TICKETS AND SCRATCH OFFS. AND THEY FEEL LIKE THEIR
12 TOYS ARE BEING TAKEN AWAY. AND HOW CAN WE SELL IT THAT THAT'S
13 NOT REALLY THE CASE. BUT SOME PEOPLE IN NEW YORK STILL WISH
14 BACK TO 1904 WITH BRASS TOKENS AND THE COINS IN THE OLD
15 FASHIONED FARE GATES. SO, I HAVE AN OPEN MIND TOWARD DOING NEW
16 THINGS. AND WE HAVE TO CONTINUE TO SHOW PEOPLE THAT WHAT WE'RE
17 DOING IS VERY GOOD, NOT JUST FROM A BUSINESS STANDPOINT, BUT
18 FROM A PUBLIC SERVICE AND EQUITY STANDPOINT. BECAUSE CLIPPER
19 CREATES A SAFER AND MORE INCLUSIVE SYSTEM. I AM LIVING PROOF
20 OF THAT. BECAUSE WHEN PEOPLE SAY WHAT DOES THAT EXACTLY LOOK
21 LIKE, AND I SAY JUST LOOK AT ME. I'M WHAT EQUITY LOOKS LIKE,
22 ALONG WITH MANY OTHERS. SO I APPRECIATE THE GOOD WORK TODAY
23 AND LOOK FORWARD TO NEXT MEETING. WE HAVE A LOT TO DO. THANK
24 YOU.
25



November 15, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GREAT TIMING ALETA. NEXT UP IS ROLAND.
2 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. SO, AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, I
5 HAVE BEEN SOMEWHAT DISAPPOINTED WITH THE -- HOW SHALL I SAY?
6 COMPLETENESS OF THE MATERIALS PRESENTED HERE. I WOULD LIKE TO
7 SEE THIS BEING ADDRESSED IN FUTURE SO THAT EVERY AGENDA ITEM
8 WILL INCLUDE BOTH THE STAFF REPORT AND A PRESENTATION. THE
9 OTHER THING I WANT TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION IS THE
10 TRANSCRIPT IS REALLY, REALLY DEFICIENT. IF YOU READ IT, YOU
11 ARE ACTUALLY GOING TO REALIZE THAT THE ENTIRE SENTENCES ARE
12 HALF SENTENCES IN THE ENTIRE TRANSCRIPT. AS WE MOVE FORWARD,
13 AND I THINK THIS SHOULD BE ADDRESSED TO MTC STAFF. I WOULD
14 LIKE THEM TO CONSIDER -- OTTER SPELLED O-T-T-E-R FOR
15 TRANSCRIPTS AND INTERESTINGLY, IN PARTICULAR LOOK AT THE LAST
16 CALTRAIN BOARD MEETING AND WHAT OTTER ALLOWS US TO DO IS, IF
17 IT'S UNCLEAR, ON THE TRANSCRIPT, YOU CAN ACTUALLY CLICK ON THE
18 SPECIFIC SECTION OF THE TEXT THAT IS AT ISSUE AND IT WILL TAKE
19 YOU DIRECTLY TO THE VIDEO, AND YOU CAN BOTH WATCH AND LISTEN
20 TO WHAT WAS ACTUALLY SAID. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

21

22 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU TO OUR PUBLIC SPEAKERS.
23 MARTHA, I DON'T SEE ANY MORE.

24



November 15, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THAT IS CORRECT. THERE ARE NO OTHER
2 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

3

4 **RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR:** THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM SIX, WHICH IS
5 ADJOURNMENT. WE'LL ADJOURN TO THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD TO
6 MONDAY DECEMBER 20TH, 2021, AT 1:30 P.M., AND THAT WILL BE
7 DONE REMOTELY AND WEBCAST AS APPROPRIATE. AND I'LL JUST LEAVE
8 YOU WITH ALL, A HAPPY THANKSGIVING. BE SAFE IF YOU TRAVEL.

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. YOU TOO. [ADJOURNED]

11



Broadcasting Government