

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



November 10, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 10, 2021, 9:45, A.M.**
4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH AND WELCOME TO THE
6 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. MTC, I'M CHAIR DAVID
7 RABBIT JOINED BY GINA PAPAN, OUR VICE CHAIR. THIS IS OUR
8 MEETING OF NOVEMBER 10TH, 2021. CAN WE PLEASE ROLL THE
9 ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
10 ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
11 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL
12 361, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT.
13 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR
14 WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER
15 SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE
16 THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
17 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED
18 ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.
19 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM
20 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE OR DIAL
21 *9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
22 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
23 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
24 SPEAKERS IS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING
25 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS



November 10, 2021

1 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL
2 BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
3 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
4 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO AND
5 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT
6 THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
7 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO ATTENDEES.
8 IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE
9 YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. CAN WE ASK THE CLERK
12 TO CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM OR QUORUM?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. ABE-KOGA?

15

16 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

23

24 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

25



November 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY? COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT.

2 RABBIT?

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

7

8 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

11

12 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

15

16 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE

17 THAT. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM TWO, WHICH IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

18 CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY INCLUDES SIX ITEMS, 2A 32F, AND I

19 UNDERSTAND STAFF WOULD LIKE TO PULL AGENDA ITEM 2C FROM THE

20 CONSENT CALENDAR TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE. WITH THAT SAID, DO I

21 HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE REMAINDER OF THE

22 CONSENT CALENDAR?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

25



November 10, 2021

1 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. WE I HAVE MOTION AND A SECOND. IS
4 THERE ANYONE FROM THE COMMITTEE THAT HAS ANY QUESTIONS,
5 COMMENTS, OR CONCERNS ON CONSENT? I CAN ASK THE CLERK TO READ
6 ANY THINGS RECEIVED ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, MR.
9 CHAIR, AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
10 RAISED.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WITH THAT SAID, CAN WE HAVE ROLL CALL NOW
13 FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR FOR ALL ITEMS EXCEPT FOR 2C?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORRECT. ABE-KOGA?

16

17 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

24

25 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES. MILEY IS ABSENT. PAPAN?



November 10, 2021

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

9

10 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

13

14 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** CAN I TURN TO STAFF -- I'M NOT SURE WHOM,
19 TO ADDRESS ITEM 2C.

20

21 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I WILL GIVE AN UPDATE ON THIS ITEM. THIS ITEM
22 ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR REALLY IS JUST THE CONTINUING
23 ALLOCATION OF SOME OF OUR TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDS, BUT GIVEN
24 THAT VTA IS ONE OF THE AGENCY'S RECEIVING OF TRANSPORTATION
25 DEVELOPMENT ACT FUND THIS MONTH WE PULLED THIS ITEM TO BRING



November 10, 2021

1 TO YOU AN ISSUE THAT HAS BEEN BROUGHT TO OUR ATTENTION VERY
2 RECENTLY AND ONE THAT HAS NEGATIVE FINANCIAL CONSEQUENCES FOR
3 VTA AS WELL AS THE CITY OF SAN JOSE, THE DEPARTMENT OF TAX AND
4 FEE, SERVED A LETTER TO THE DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE NOTICING
5 THAT SOME TAX REVENUE INCLUDING TDA QUARTER CENT SALES -- AND
6 TRANSACTIONS FOR EBAY HAD BEEN ALLOCATED TO THE CITY OF SAN
7 JOSE SHOULD HAVE BEEN TO POINT OF DELIVER GOODS BEING SOLD NOT
8 POINT OF SALE THAT DATES BACK TO THE FOURTH QUARTER OF
9 CALENDAR YEAR 2019 THROUGH JUNE OF 2021. THE UNFORTUNATE
10 RESULT IS THAT THERE WILL LIKELY NEED TO BE A SIZABLE
11 RECISSION IN ORDER TO REMEDY THE ERROR IN ORDER OF
12 APPROXIMATELY \$17 MILLION GOING FORWARD TDA REVENUE GENERATION
13 IN SANTA CLARA WILL BE SOMEWHAT LOWER. THE CITY OF SAN JOSE
14 WILL LIKELY SEE A HIT TO ITS GENERAL FUND OF ABOUT 30 TO \$35
15 MILLION. WE WILL HAVE MORE INFORMATIONS IN THE COMING --
16

17 **CAROL KEUSTER:** IT DEPENDS -- IT DEPENDS.

18

19 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WE WILL HAVE MORE INFORMATION WAS IN THE
20 COMING WEEKS AND WILL PROVIDE MORE DETAIL IN A FUTURE MEETING
21 STAFF ARE IN THE PROCESS OF SCHEDULING A MEETING WITH THE
22 DEPARTMENT OF TAX AND FEE ADMINISTRATION TO WORK OUT OPTIONS
23 FOR ADDRESSING THIS SITUATION. WITH THAT BEING SAID, I WOULD
24 ASK THAT THIS COMMITTEE REFER ITEM 2C TO THE COMMISSION FOR



November 10, 2021

1 FULL APPROVAL BUT I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU WERE ALERTED
2 TO THIS ISSUE.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WE APPRECIATE THAT UPDATE VERY MUCH. NOT
5 THE NEWS, BUT JUST THE INFORMATION. VERY UNFORTUNATE TO HAVE
6 THAT HAPPEN THAT WAY, AND TO FIND OUT AFTER THE FACT AND TO
7 HAVE TO RECTIFY THOSE DOLLARS. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES TO
8 SEE IF THERE IS QUESTIONS, COMMENTS OR CONCERNS ON THIS
9 PARTICULAR ITEM, 2C? I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. SO IF I
10 COULD GET A MOTION AND SECOND TO FOR APPROVAL OF 44 SCORE
11 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL

12

13 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** MOVE APPROVAL.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. SECOND?

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SECOND.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. I WILL LOOK TO
20 COLLEAGUES FOR DISCUSSION OR COMMENT FROM MEMBERS OF THE
21 PUBLIC?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
25 ON THIS ITEM.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL PLEASE ON ITEM 2C?

3

4 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

7

8 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

9

10 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

15

16 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

17

18 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL

21 MEMBERS PRESENT.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. MOVING TO

24 ITEM 3A ONE BAY AREA GRANT OBAG THREE PROPOSE THE FRAMEWORK. I



November 10, 2021

1 THINK MELANIE ATKINSON WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. MELANIE? I'M
2 SORRY. MALLORY.

3

4 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** I'M MALLORY PRESENTING INFORMATION ITEM
5 TODAY WITH THE UPDATE ON PROPOSED FRAMEWORK FOR THE NEXT CYCLE
6 OF THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM OBAG THREE. MY NEIGHBOR JUST
7 TURNED ON A WOOD CHIPPER I'LL SPEAK UP AND DO MY BEST. THIS
8 PRESENTATION WILL GO OVER FOCUS AREAS PROJECT POLICY PROVISION
9 AND WHERE WE SEE OBAG FITTING IN WITH THE INVESTMENT STRATEGY
10 TO ADVANCE PRIORITIES COMING OUT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THE
11 BLUE RIBBON ACTION PLAN AND OTHER EFFORTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
12 IN DEVELOPING THIS PROGRAM WE ESTIMATE 188 MILLION PER YEAR
13 OVER OBAG THREE WITH THE INFRASTRUCTURE BILL THAT'S NOW
14 AWAITING SIGNATURE FROM THE PRESIDENT WE ANTICIPATE ANNUAL
15 REVENUES TO INCREASE SLIGHTLY BUT WE'LL NEED TO WAIT FOR THE
16 FINAL NUMBERS FROM CALTRANS AND FHWA TO KNOW HOW MUCH OF AN
17 INCREASE WE CAN EXPECT FROM THESE FUNDED PROGRAMS FOR
18 REFERENCE INTERNALLY WE'RE ESTIMATING 10 MILLION A YEAR AT
19 THIS POINT INCREASED OVER WHAT WE HAVE PLANNED HERE. TO BETTER
20 ALIGN OUR FEDERAL FUND PROGRAMMING WITH PLANNED BAY AREA GOING
21 FORWARD STAFF IS PROPOSING TO SHIFT FROM A FIVE YEAR OBAG
22 PROGRAM TO A SHORTER FOUR YEAR PROGRAM STARTING WITH OBAG
23 THREE IN FISCAL YEAR '23. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE STP CMAQ
24 FUNDS ACCOUNT FOR A SMALL SHARE OF REVENUE WE HAVE IN THIS
25 REGION 1.3% OF ALL TRANSPORTATION REVENUES THAT WE HAVE



November 10, 2021

1 FORECAST IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IT'S IMPORTANT TO THINK OF
2 THE ABAG PROGRAM ITSELF AS ONE PART OF A COMPREHENSIVE
3 REGIONAL INVESTMENT STRATEGY AND I'LL TALK MORE ABOUT THAT
4 THROUGHOUT THE PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS JUST
5 A REMINDER OF THOSE EARLY PROGRAM CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE
6 SHARED WITH THE COMMITTEE BACK IN JULY I SUMMARIZE THEM AS
7 RETAINING MOST EFFECTIVE ELEMENTS OF THE FRAMEWORK WITH
8 STRATEGICS CHANGE NEEDED TO ADVANCE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO
9 ADAPT TO CURRENT CONDITIONS AND EMERGING POLICY FOCUS AREAS
10 ADDING TO ADDITIONAL EMPHASIS AREAS TO THE BOTTOM OF THE LIST
11 COORDINATE THE PROGRAM WITH DEVELOPMENT AND NEAR-TERM REVENUE
12 SOURCES AND REFLECTION IN THE PROGRAM THAT MTC CANNOT ACHIEVE
13 ANY GOALS OF THE PROGRAM ALONE AND WE NEED ACTIONS AND SUPPORT
14 FROM LOCAL JURISDICTIONS OF COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES,
15 TRANSIT AGENCIES, TO CONSTRUCT AND IMPLEMENT PROJECTS BUT ALSO
16 TO ADOPT SUPPORTIVE POLICIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE STAFF
17 PROPOSAL FOR OBAG THREE SEEKS TO COORDINATE THE PROGRAM WITH A
18 FEW COMPLIMENTARY FUND SOURCES IN ORDER TO MAXIMIZE OUR
19 COLLECTIVE IMPACT FROM EACH INDIVIDUAL SOURCE. SO IN ADDITION
20 TO THE FEDERAL FUNDS WE'RE REFERENCING IN OBAG THREE THIS
21 INCLUDES THE 85 MILLION IN ONE TIME FUNDING FOR NEAR-TERM
22 PROJECTS COMING OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON PROCESS AND ESTIMATED
23 100 MILLION ANTICIPATED ONE TIME STATE REVENUES COMING FROM
24 THE STATE BUDGET SURPLUS LAST YEAR TO IMPLEMENT THE REGION'S
25 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY STRATEGY, AND ANOTHER ESTIMATED 60



November 10, 2021

1 MILLION IN NEW FHWA FORMULA FUNDING TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS
2 EMISSIONS. SO COORDINATING ALL OF THESE THREE -- OR FOUR
3 PROGRAMS TOGETHER WE'RE LOOKING AT TOTAL ESTIMATED FUNDING
4 ENVELOPE OVER 1 BILLION WHICH EXPANDS THE IMPACT WE HAVE WITH
5 OBAG THREE ALONE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE PROPOSED OBAG
6 THREE FRAMEWORK FOCUSES INVESTMENTS POLICIES AND PROGRAM
7 CATEGORIES INCLUDING PLANNING IMPLEMENTATION FRAMEWORK
8 IMPLEMENTATION CLIMATE INITIATIVE CONSERVATION COMPLETE
9 STREETS COMMUNITY CHOICE MULTI-MODAL SYSTEMS IS OPERATIONS AND
10 PERFORMANCE SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS CATEGORIZE BETTER SUITED
11 FOR REGIONAL IMPLEMENTATION SUCH AS CATEGORY FOR ASSISTANCE
12 OPERATIONS AND PERFORMANCE AND OTHERS RELY HEAVILY ON LOCAL
13 AGENCIES SUPPORT FROM OTHER PARTNERS IMPLEMENTATION
14 SPECIFICALLY COMPLETE STREETS AND COMMUNITY CHOICE CATEGORY
15 FRAMEWORK BUT ALL DESIGNED TO INCORPORATE PARTNERSHIP
16 APPROACHES THROUGHOUT. I'LL GET MORE INTO THAT ON THE NEXT
17 SLIDE. WE PROPOSED TO MAINTAIN AND GROW THE COLLABORATIVE
18 RELATIONSHIPS WE HAVE BUILT TO DELIVER IN AREAS THAT RELY ON
19 ACTIONS FROM OUR PARTNERS SPECIFICALLY IN PLANNING FOR FUTURE
20 GROWTH THAT WE NEED IN PDAS IN OTHER GROWTH AREAS AND
21 DEVELOPING PLANS AND POLICIES TO ENSURE THAT WE HAVE TRANSIT
22 SUPPORTIVE HOUSING DENSITY AFFORDABILITY GOALS ARE BEING MET
23 AND REALIZED WE NEED MODE AND SAFETY SHIFT TOWARDS COMMUNITIES
24 AND WORK WITH LOCAL COMMUNITIES TO IDENTIFY DEVELOP PROJECTS
25 AND IMPROVE MOBILITY CONNECTIVITY AT THE NEIGHBORHOOD LEVEL.



November 10, 2021

1 IN THE COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAM WHICH WAS IN A PREVIOUS CYCLE,
2 WE JUST REFER TO AS THE COUNTY PROGRAM WE PROPOSE KEEPING
3 FLEXIBILITY IN THE PROJECT TYPES WHILE CONTINUING TO FOCUS ON
4 GEOGRAPHIES IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES WE WANT TO
5 EMPHASIZE IN THIS ROUND MORE BIKE PED PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS,
6 SAFETY EFFORTS, FIRST AND LAST MILE ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS TO
7 EXTEND THE REACH OF TRANSIT HUBS AND IN RECOGNITION OF
8 INVESTMENT NEEDS IN ALL AREAS COVERED WE PROPOSE TO INCREASE
9 RELATIVE SIZE OF THE SCALE OF THE COUNTY PROGRAM FROM 545% TO
10 50% OF THE PROGRAM TOTAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. 50% OF THE
11 PROPOSED PROGRAM FOR THE COUNTY AND LOCAL PROJECTS REMAINING
12 50% ARE RESERVED FOR PROGRAMS AND PROGRAMS IMPLEMENTED AT THE
13 REGIONAL LEVEL I HAVE INCLUDED COMPARISON OF OB 3 AND 2
14 PROGRAMS SHOWING ANNUAL INVESTMENT LEVELS IN THE NUMBER OF
15 YEARS FOR EACH PROGRAMS DIFFERENCE TO HIGHLIGHT 50% OF THE
16 PROGRAM PROPOSED FEE IMPLEMENTED AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL SOURCES
17 AVAILABLE FOR THE REGIONAL PROGRAMS WILL REMAIN FLAT ON AN
18 ANNUAL BASIS OR SLIGHTLY LEVEL OR LESS WITH THE OBAG TWO
19 LEVELS HOWEVER WITH THE INFRASTRUCTURE BILL AND SLIGHT
20 INCREASE IN REVENUES THAT WE'RE ANTICIPATING THIS WILL CHANGE
21 SLIGHTLY BUT OUR OVERALL REVENUES ON THE REGIONAL PROGRAM SIDE
22 WILL REMAIN SOMEWHAT FLAT. SO A FEW OTHER HIGHLIGHTS ABOUT
23 THESE REGIONAL PROGRAMS I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT FIRST STAFF COST
24 TO IMPLEMENT OBAG PROJECTS HAVE BEEN POOLED INTO A SINGLE
25 CATEGORY RATHER THAN BEING SPREAD OUT TO INDIVIDUAL PROGRAMS



November 10, 2021

1 THAT'S WHY YOU SEE -- INVESTMENT INCREASE FROM 2 MILLION ON
2 THE LEFT TO 10 MILLION IN OBAG THREE ON THE RIGHT. IN THE
3 PROGRAMS INCLUDING CONSERVATION AND RESILIENCE AS WELL AND
4 THERE IS A DECREASED PROGRAM INVESTMENT SHOWN IN THE MULTI-
5 MODAL SYSTEMS OPERATIONAL AND PERFORMANCE THAT'S IN
6 PRIORITIZING COMPLEMENTARY FUNDS SOURCES TO DELIVER ON SOME OF
7 THOSE PROGRAMS AND NOT A DECREASED PRIORITY TO THE AGENCY FOR
8 THOSE. AND FINALLY THIS ALSO CREATES A NEW EMPHASIS AREA TO
9 SUPPORT EFFORTS IN COMPLETE STREETS GOING BEYOND PAYMENT
10 CONDITION TO PROVIDING ASSISTANCE AND TOOLS AND POLICIES TO
11 IMPROVE LOCAL ROAD SAFETY, ENCOURAGE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION,
12 AND IMPROVE THE SUSTAINABILITY AND RESILIENCE OF LOCAL
13 STREETS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO ADVANCING PRIORITIES IN THESE
14 AREAS WILL REQUIRE SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT AND WE THINK IT GOES
15 BEYOND THE OBAG PROGRAM ITSELF SO THE BAR CHART ON THE RIGHT
16 ILLUSTRATES INVESTMENT LEVELS PROPOSED FOR THE OBAG THREE
17 REGIONAL PROGRAMS BY CATEGORY AND FOCUS AREA AND HOW MUCH MORE
18 WE THINK WE COULD ADVANCE IN THOSE AREAS IN THE NEAR-TERM IF
19 COMPLIMENTARY FUND SOURCES ARE TARGETED AND REALIZED FOR THOSE
20 TARGET PROGRAMS. THE INCREASE THAT YOU SEE IN THE BAR CHART
21 ARE PARTICULARLY IN THE AREAS OF REACHING OUR CLIMATE GOALS
22 IMPLEMENTING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 GROWTH FRAMEWORK, AND THE
23 CAPITAL INTENSIVE TRANSIT INVESTMENTS THAT ARE EMERGING FROM
24 THE BLUE RIBBON ACTION PLAN IN THE AREAS OF TRANSIT PRIORITY
25 AND MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO IN



November 10, 2021

1 ADDITION TO THE PROGRAM CATEGORIES AND INVESTMENT LEVELS AND
2 OTHER CRITICAL COMPONENT OF THE OBAG THREE FRAMEWORK OR POLICY
3 PROVISIONS WOVEN THROUGHOUT WE ARE PROPOSING TO MAINTAIN FOCUS
4 ON INVESTING RESOURCE IN PDAS AND NEW GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND
5 CONTINUING TO USE PROGRAM FUNDING AS AN INCENTIVE FOR
6 JURISDICTIONS TO ADOPT POLICIES THAT SUPPORT PLANNED BAY AREA
7 2050 AND MOST NOTABLY IS WITH RESPECT TO COMPLIANCE WITH THE
8 CURRENT STATE HOUSING ELEMENT LAW. SO FOR OBAG THREE ARE
9 PROPOSING TO CONTINUE THAT EXISTING REQUIREMENT THAT
10 JURISDICTIONS MUST ADOPT A CERTIFIED HOUSING ELEMENT AND DO
11 HOUSING REPORTING IN ORDER TO MAINTAIN ELIGIBILITY FOR PROGRAM
12 FUNDS SO REQUIREMENTS DUE TO CHANGES IN HOUSING POLICY WILL
13 MAKE THE WORK MEANINGFUL AND REQUIRE SIGNIFICANT EFFORT FROM
14 CITIES AND COUNTIES TO ACHIEVE THIS ON THE COMPLETE STREETS
15 SIDE WE HAVE EXISTING COMPLETE STREETS POLICY FOR LOCAL
16 JURISDICTIONS AND THOSE POLICY REQUIREMENTS ARE BEING UPDATED
17 AS PART OF OUR REGIONAL ACTION TRANSPORTATION PLAN UNDER
18 DEVELOPMENT SO THAT'S ANOTHER AREA WHERE JURISDICTIONS WILL
19 NEED TO CONTINUE TO COMPLY UPDATED POLICY TO MAINTAIN
20 ELIGIBILITY FOR FUNDING AND THE CMAQ MITIGATION AIR QUALITY
21 FUNDING SPECIFICALLY PROPOSING TO UPDATE OUR PROJECT PROCESS
22 TO INCORPORATE EMISSIONS BENEFITS IN CONSIDERATIONS FOR THESE
23 FUNDS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. A FEW OTHER IMPORTANT PROVISIONS TO
24 HIGHLIGHT WE'RE WORKING TO INCORPORATE AN EQUITY LENS
25 THROUGHOUT THE PROGRAM AS WE FURTHER DEVELOP AND DEFINE THE



November 10, 2021

1 SPECIFICS OF THE PROGRAM CATEGORY INCREASING RESOURCES
2 DEDICATED TO COMMUNITY PLANNING EFFORTS PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
3 AND PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND
4 ALSO PRIORITIZING PROJECTS WITHIN THOSE EQUITY PRIORITY
5 COMMUNITIES FOR CORE PROJECTS THAT BENEFIT DISADVANTAGED AND
6 HISTORICALLY MARGINALIZED POPULATIONS IN THE CORE PROJECTS
7 INCREASING EMPHASIS ON ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION ROAD SAFETY
8 INCLUDES PROPOSED REGIONAL WIDE INVESTMENT FOR THE TARGET
9 PROGRAM OF 200,000,001 QUARTER OF THE PROGRAM PROPOSING TO
10 BETTER ALIGN THE PROGRAM WITH BETTER MANAGEMENT CONTROLS FOR
11 SAFETY ASSET MANAGEMENT AND SYSTEM PERFORMANCE AND MODE SHIFT.
12 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WANTED TO QUICKLY WALK THROUGH THE
13 PROPOSED PROCESS FOR THE 50% OF THE OBAG THREE FUNDING
14 PROPOSED FOR THE REGION-WIDE CALL FOR LOCAL COUNTY AND
15 PROJECTS AS THIS IS A DEPARTURE FROM PRIOR CYCLES AND BEING
16 PROPOSED TO ADDRESS OUR 2020 FEDERAL CORRECTIVE ACTION FOR
17 STP, C MAC PROGRAM FUNDING HOW WE SEE THIS WORKING NEXT YEAR
18 MTC, A CALL FOR PROJECTS CONSISTENT WITH THE ABAG THREE
19 PROGRAM GUIDELINES CANYON COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES
20 ASSISTING IN LOCAL OUTREACH TO JURISDICTIONS AND TRANSIT
21 OPERATORS FOR SCREENING FOR PROJECTS IN COUNTIES WITH LOCAL
22 PLANS FOR PRIORITIES AND NOMINATE A PRIORITIZED LIST TO MTC
23 FOR FINAL PROJECT SELECTION. HOW MUCH EACH COUNTY'S ETA WOULD
24 NOT NAME WOULD BE BASED ON COUNTY GROWTH SIMILAR TO OBAG TWO
25 AND SIMILAR IN REWARD TO INCREASE CITIES FOR HOUSING



November 10, 2021

1 INCREASING THE AMOUNT OF PROJECTS FOR COUNTY PROJECT SELECTION
2 AND ENSURES APPROPRIATELY SIZED POOL OF PROJECTS ARE IT
3 NOMINATED FOR COUNTY SELECTION TO ENSURE WE SUFFICIENTLY
4 INVEST THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA BUT THESE NOMINATION TARGETS DO
5 NOT GUARANTEE AN IMPLIED AMOUNT OR ENSURE SAY SHARE FOR ANY
6 ONE JURISDICTION. NEXT SLIDE. I WANT TO CONCLUDE BY
7 EMPHASIZES THE COMPONENTS OF THE FRAMEWORK ARE DESIGNED TO
8 WORK TOGETHER TO ADDRESS THOSE OVERARCHING PROGRAM
9 CONSIDERATIONS I OUTLINED AT THE BEGINNING OF THE PRESENTATION
10 AND ALSO INTENDED TO WORK AS PART OF A COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL
11 INVESTMENT STRATEGY AND VARIOUS REGIONAL INITIATIVES WILL NEED
12 TO BE GIVEN TOP PRIORITY IN DEVELOPING THOSE COMPLEMENTARY
13 PROGRAMS IN ORDER TO DELIVER ON WHAT WE HOPE TO ACHIEVE. NEXT
14 SLIDE PLEASE. AS A REMINDER THIS, IS AN INFORMATION ITEM
15 TODAY AND STAFF WILL RETURN IN JANUARY WITH A PROPOSED
16 DETAILED PROGRAM FRAMEWORK FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION AND APPROVAL
17 BUT WE'RE HERE TODAY TO GET INPUT AND FEEDBACK ON THE INITIAL
18 PROPOSED FRAMEWORK AND TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MALLORY, APPRECIATE THE
21 PRESENTATION, VERY MUCH. AND I SEE A COUPLE OF HANDS UP, AND
22 I'LL GO TO OUR COMMISSIONERS. FIRST UP IS OUR VICE CHAIR GINA
23 PAPAN. COMMISSIONER?

24



November 10, 2021

1 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR, AND THANK YOU TO
2 STAFF, APPRECIATE YOU WORKING WITH THE CTAS IN DEVELOPING THIS
3 NEW PROGRAM. FULLY SUPPORT THE 5050 SPLIT. IT'S VERY HELPFUL.
4 ALSO SUPPORT PRIORITIZING THE PROJECT FOR COUNTY PROJECTS. SAN
5 MATEO COUNTY IS UNIQUELY LINEAR ALONG EL CAMINO AND CALTRAIN.
6 WE HAVE 24 SEPARATE PDAS, AND WE REALLY WOULD LIKE TO CONTINUE
7 TO WORK WITH STAFF TO GET SOME FLEXIBILITY IN DEFINING WHAT IS
8 CONSIDERED APPROXIMATE TO A PDA THIS WOULD ENABLE US TO
9 IMPLEMENT AND TAKE ACTION ON THESE PROJECTS MORE SO. WE'RE
10 KIND OF AT A DISADVANTAGE BECAUSE THAT FLEXIBILITY IS NOT
11 THERE AND WE FEEL LIKE SOME OF THE BIGGER JURISDICTIONS REALLY
12 ARE ABLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THAT, BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THAT
13 FLEXIBILITY. OUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS RELY ON IMPLEMENTING
14 THEIR PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050.
15 SO, WHEN MTC MAKES THIS FINAL DECISION, BASED ON REGIONAL
16 CONSIDERATIONS, GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION, IT'S ONGOING AND VERY
17 IMPORTANT TO US THAT WE MAINTAIN THAT FLEXIBILITY. SO WE'RE
18 HOPING, BECAUSE WE REALLY WANT THIS TO BE IMPACTFUL AND TAKE
19 ADVANTAGE OF THIS, SO, AGAIN, THANK YOU TO STAFF. AND I HOPE
20 WE CAN GET SOME FLEXIBILITY BUILT IN HERE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

23

24 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. FIRST OF ALL I REALLY WANT
25 TO THANK STAFF FOR THIS REPORT. MALLORY, YOU REALLY LAY IT OUT



November 10, 2021

1 IN SUCH A CLEAR WAY, AND I WANT TO START BY SAYING FIRST OF
2 ALL, I THINK OBAG IS ONE OF THE MOST SIGNIFICANT PROGRAMS WE
3 DO. SEEING IT ON THE STREETS, SEEING THE OVERALL GOALS AND
4 SEEING HOW IT'S ENABLING CITIES ACROSS OUR REGION WITH THE
5 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS TO ACHIEVE THESE GOALS AND WHEN WE
6 HAVE THE INITIAL DISCUSSIONS ABOUT THE HOUSING ELEMENT
7 REQUIRING A STATE APPROVED ELEMENT I KNOW THOSE WERE TOUGH
8 NEGOTIATIONS AND IN THE END WHEN IT CAME DOWN TO IT, THE BAY
9 AREA IS 100% COMPLIANT. SO I THINK THE REPORT WITH OUR NEW
10 HOUSING ELEMENT WITH RHNA IS GOING TO BE A SIGNIFICANT
11 CHALLENGE FOR CITIES AND I KNOW THEY'RE WORKING HARD TO FIND
12 SPOTS FOR ALL THE UNITS IDENTIFIED IN RHNA. AND THIS PROGRAM
13 IS REALLY GOING TO HELP CITIES AND THE COUNTIES TO DEVELOP THE
14 KINDS OF INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENTS THAT ARE URGENTLY NEEDED
15 TO SUPPORT HOUSING AND ZONING FOR THIS. IT'S A VERY IMPORTANT
16 PROGRAM. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM TO CONSIDER, FIRST OF ALL
17 THE OVERALL GOALS ARE FANTASTIC, YOU CAN GO ACROSS THE REGION
18 IN EVERY COUNTY YOU CAN SEE THE IMPACT OF THESE, AND WITH THE
19 INCREASED RHNA THESE PROGRAMS, PROJECTS ARE GOING TO BE MUCH
20 MORE IMPORTANT TO BE ABLE TO IMPLEMENT THE RHNA. YOU KNOW, I
21 THINK THAT THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS, AND I RECOGNIZE THAT
22 THERE IS A DELICATE BALANCE BETWEEN LOCAL IDENTIFICATION OF
23 PROJECTS AND PRIORITIES AND THEN THE KNITTING THEM TOGETHER
24 WITH THE REGIONAL GOALS OF OUR GREENHOUSE REDUCTION TARGETS,
25 INCREASING MODE SHIFT TO TRANSIT, BIKE PED, YOU KNOW THOSE



November 10, 2021

1 KINDS OF THINGS. I AGREE WITH THE BIKE PED INVESTMENT
2 PRIORITIES. ALL OF OUR COMMUNITIES ARE LOOKING REALLY CLOSELY
3 ABOUT HOW TO IMPROVE BIKE PED ACCESS, SAFETY, PROGRAMS, AND
4 ALSO WITH EMPHASIS ON THINGS LIKE SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL AND
5 SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT. BUT I THINK, ONE OF -- A COUPLE OF
6 THINGS I WANT US TO LOOK AT, ONE IS THE COST OF THESE PROJECTS
7 AND PROGRAMS. YOU KNOW, WE -- I ASSUME THAT STAFF MAKES
8 ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT HOW MANY PROJECTS WE CAN GET FOR THE FUNDING
9 THAT WE'RE ALLOCATED. AND I GUESS IT WOULD BE HELPFUL IF STAFF
10 TOOK A MINUTE TO LOOK AT WHAT WOULD HAPPEN TO THESE PROJECTS
11 IF THE COSTS SUDDENLY INCREASED SIGNIFICANTLY? WHAT WOULD THAT
12 DO TO OUR OVERALL GOAL IN TERMS OF VMT, GHG, IMPACTING THE
13 CITIES ACROSS THE REGION? BUT THE SECOND THING IS, IS THERE A
14 WAY FOR -- IN OUR -- YOU KNOW, WHEN WE FIRST STARTED THIS --
15 FORGET MY BLANK COMMENTS -- WHEN I FIRST STARTED THIS, MTC
16 IDENTIFIED THE PROGRAM HERE ARE THE PDAS AS WE MOVE FORWARD WE
17 HAVE SHIFTED, INSTEAD WE INDIVIDUALS LET'S SET THE RULES AND
18 LET'S LET THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES PUT TOGETHER THE
19 PROJECTS THAT THEY FEEL ARE THE MOST HIGH PRIORITY, WHETHER
20 IT'S, YOU KNOW, ALLOCATING THE FUNDS FROM AN EQUITABLE WAY,
21 ACROSS THOSE COUNTIES, OR, YOU KNOW, KNOWING WHAT THE RULES
22 ARE FOR MTC, AND THEN BRINGING BACK A LIST THAT WE WOULD FEEL
23 CONFIDENT WOULD ACHIEVE THE GOALS AND THE RULES THAT HAVE BEEN
24 SET OUT. WHAT -- SO -- I REALLY FINISHING WE'RE LOOKING AT
25 THAT NEEDLE, IT'S REALLY, I THINK, IMPORTANT THAT WE RECOGNIZE



November 10, 2021

1 THAT THE LOCAL COUNTIES HAVE THE ABILITY TO MAKE THE SAME
2 KINDS OF DECISIONS WE DO HERE. AND I AND, SO I THINK THAT THE
3 50/50 IS GREAT. AND I HOPE WE COULD HAVE A SELECTION PROCESS
4 THAT ENABLES, REALLY, THE LOCAL COUNTIES TO MAKE THOSE
5 DETERMINATIONS AND THEN BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION SO
6 THAT WE CAN, OF COURSE, WE MAKE THE FINAL APPROVAL, WE
7 UNDERSTAND HOW THE FINAL LAWS WORK, BUT WE DO IT IN
8 PARTNERSHIP AND IN COLLABORATION WITH ALL OF THE CTAS AROUND
9 THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. SO, WITH THAT, AGAIN, I AM SO
10 THRILLED THAT OUR STAFF HAS IDENTIFIED ADDITIONAL FUNDS TO PUT
11 INTO THIS PROGRAM. IT MAKES SUCH A HUGE DIFFERENCE. AND I
12 THINK THAT THE CITIES AND THE COUNTIES, AND THE MTC, THIS IS I
13 GREAT PARTNERSHIP. CONGRATULATIONS TO COMMISSIONER SPERING,
14 WHO I'M GOING TO GIVE CREDIT FOR HIS WONDERFUL IDEA, DECADES,
15 OKAY, RIGHT? I THINK IT'S REALLY GROWN INTO A TERRIFIC,
16 TERRIFIC PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MTC VICE CHAIR, COMMISSIONER
19 JOSEFOWITZ?

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANKS. I -- THIS IS A TERRIFIC PROGRAM. AND
22 THIS -- SORT OF, THE LEVEL OF THOUGHT THAT GOES INTO THIS IS
23 JUST TERRIFIC. I HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS. IS THE IDEA THAT,
24 LIKE, THE POLICY REQUIREMENTS ALSO APPLY TO THE COUNTY'S SHARE
25 OF DISTRIBUTION? SO, THE JURISDICTIONS ARE NOT GOING TO GET



November 10, 2021

1 COUNTY SHARE DISTRIBUTIONS IF THEY DON'T HAVE HOUSING
2 COMPLIANT ELEMENT FOR INSTANCE?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YES. YOU HAVE TO HAVE HOUSING ELEMENT COMPLIANCE.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** CAN YOU EXPLAIN HOW THE POLICY REQUIREMENT
7 WORKS THERE WASN'T UNDER THE POLICY REQUIREMENT BUCKET, SORT
8 OF, AN INDICATION FOR THE TABLE FOR THE VISION REQUIREMENTS?

9

10 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR
11 POLICY WE ARE GOING TO BE COMING TO THE JOINT -- I'M TRYING TO
12 REMEMBER THE JOINT PLANNING COMMITTEE IN DECEMBER TO GIVE YOU
13 A PRESENTATION ON OUR UPDATE TO THE COMPLETE STREETS POLICY
14 THAT WILL ALSO HAVE, YOU KNOW, RELATIONSHIP TO VISION ZERO. SO
15 I THINK THAT WILL HELP TO BETTER DEFINE HOW WE SEE COMPLETE
16 STREETS AND VISION ZERO, SORT OF, BEING UPDATED AND CARRIED
17 OUT THROUGH THIS PROGRAM. SO WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT BEFORE WE
18 COME BACK TO APPROVE THIS PROGRAM.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. AND THEN THE LAST QUESTION I HAD IS
21 VERY SIMILAR TO THAT. WE'RE DOING -- MY UNDERSTANDING IS WE'RE
22 UPDATING OUR TOD POLICY, AND AS A WAY TO HELP, SORT OF,
23 ACHIEVE A LOT OF THE THINGS WE'RE HOPING TO ACHIEVE THROUGH
24 OBAG THREE WHICH IS TRYING TO DELIVER ON PLANNED BAY AREA,
25 SORT OF, GROWTH, HOW ARE YOU PLANNING ON INTEGRATING, SORT OF,



November 10, 2021

1 THE TOD UPDATE INTO O BAG THREE? BECAUSE THAT SEEMS LIKE A,
2 SORT OF, A VERY POWERFUL, SORT OF, COMBINATION TO MAKE, AS
3 WELL.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD QUESTION. WE ARE WORKING CLOSELY WITH STAFF
6 LEADING THAT POLICY, AND AS THE RECOMMENDATIONS GET MORE,
7 FURTHER ALONG IN THAT, WE WILL MAKE SURE THAT THEY ARE
8 MIRRORED UP IN TERMS OF INITIAL THINGS THAT WE THINK WE COULD
9 DO, OR IN THE PDA, WHICH IT WOULDN'T BE CALLED THE PDA
10 PLANNING GRANT, THE PLANNING GRANT GROWTH WORK IMPLEMENTATION
11 MAKING SURE THAT THOSE PDA PLANNING GRANTS THAT ARE ISSUED
12 ALSO SUPPORT WHATEVER THE PLANNING GOALS ARE THAT COME OUT OF
13 THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES TOD POLICY UPDATE THOSE ARE
14 ONE OF THE LINE UPS AND ALSO WORKING CLOSELY FIGURING OUT WHAT
15 THE ROAMS FOR THE TOD POLICY UPDATE ARE BEFORE WE MIRROR THEM
16 TOGETHER BUT WE ARE WORKING CLOSELY TOGETHER TO DO THAT.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** DO THE TIMELINES WORK OUT TO DO THAT?

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THE TIMELINE -- SORRY -- ALIX BOCKELMAN DEPUTY
21 DIRECTOR FOR POLICY THE TIMELINE FOR UPDATING COMPLETE STREETS
22 AND TOD POLICY I BELIEVE WILL BE LATER THIS SPRING AND
23 RELATING TO INFORMING BOTH THE REGIONAL SIDE AND COUNTY CALL
24 FOR PROJECTS I THINK THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO MARY. AND I THINK
25 YOU WILL BE SEEING UPDATE ON THE JOINT PLANNING COMMITTEE NEXT



November 10, 2021

1 MONTH. IN JANUARY. TO MAKE SURE YOU GET THE UPDATES ON THOSE
2 PROGRAMS BEFORE YOU ADOPT OBAG.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** TERRIFIC. I THINK IT WOULD BE GREAT TO LINK
5 ALL OF THESE THINGS UP THE POWER OF OBAG IS THAT IT BRINGS IT
6 ALL TOGETHER AND TO DO THAT IT HAS TO BRING IT ALL TOGETHER.
7 AND I KNOW THAT'S THE CHALLENGE THAT YOU ALL FACE, AND I KNOW
8 YOU'RE GOOD AT THAT. ASSOCIATION THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. MALLORY, FIRST,
13 GREAT PRESENTATION. VERY CLEAR. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
14 WORKING WITH THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES, AND THE FEEDBACK
15 I'M GETTING IN MY COUNTY IS, IT'S BEEN A GREAT WORKING
16 RELATIONSHIP WITH THE MTC STAFF. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT. TWO,
17 APPRECIATE THE INVESTMENT IN THE BLUE RIBBON. WE'RE SERIOUS
18 ABOUT HELPING TRANSIT RIDERS AND BRINGING RIDERS BACK TO
19 TRANSIT, WE NEED TO INVEST IN THOSE STRATEGIES. THE 50%
20 INVESTMENT IN THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES THAT'S EXTREMELY
21 IMPORTANT THAT GIVES US THE FLEXIBILITY TO INVEST IN THE MUCH
22 NEEDED PROJECTS THAT FEED INTO OUR PDAS. OUR DYNAMIC IN THE
23 NORTH BAY IS MORE DIFFERENT THAN AN URBANIZED AREA. AND I
24 THINK THAT'S EVERYTHING ON MY LIST. SO, BUT THIS IS JUST A
25 GOOD APPROACH. THE WORKING RELATIONSHIP HAS BEEN THE BEST I



November 10, 2021

1 HAVE SEEN IT IN A LONG TIME. THANK YOU. AND AGREE WITH VICE
2 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ ABOUT TRYING TO LINK A LOT OF THIS TOGETHER I
3 THINK WE WILL BE ABLE TO DELIVER MUCH NEEDED PROJECTS IF WE'RE
4 ABLE TO DO THAT. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR PAPAN? YOU HAVE
7 YOUR HAND UP?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** YEAH. SORRY. MALLORY, BOY, YOU TALK
10 FAST. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I JUST WANT TO
11 EMPHASIZE, AS WE DID GOING THROUGH THE ENTIRE BLUE RIBBON
12 PROCESS HERE, THERE ARE A LOT OF ELEMENTS. AND THEY'RE REALLY
13 IMPORTANT. SO, SOME TODS ARE DIFFERENT THAN OTHERS. AND,
14 THUS, ONE AREA WHERE WE TALKING, LIKE, MULTI-MODAL AREAS, IN
15 ORDER TO MAKE TRANSPORTATION WORK THROUGHOUT CERTAIN ELEMENTS,
16 REALLY NEED TO BE MAINTAINED. SO THAT WE CAN DO ALL THE
17 DEVELOPMENT AND EVERYBODY HAS ACCESS TO THE DIFFERENT MODES.
18 SO, JUST WANT TO BE VERY CAREFUL, AS WE PROGRESS, THAT NOT ALL
19 TODS ARE EXACTLY THE SAME, AND, HOPEFULLY, WE CAN REALLY MAKE
20 ALL THIS WORK. IT'S JUST PUTTING THE PIECES TOGETHER. SO,
21 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY
24 FINAL COMMENTS? I JUST WANT TO ECHO A FEW THINGS THAT WERE
25 SAID AS WELL, GRATEFUL FOR THE 50/50 SPLIT GREAT STEP FORWARD



November 10, 2021

1 ESPECIALLY FOR THE NORTH BAY HELPS OUT SIGNIFICANTLY AND I
2 WANT TO SAY EVERYTHING I HAVE HEARD AS WELL FROM STAFF ABOUT
3 HOW WELL WORKING TOGETHER, APPRECIATE THAT, IN COLLABORATION
4 TO OUR VICE CHAIR'S COMMENT REGARDING THE POWER OF OBAG
5 ESPECIALLY WITH THE DOLLARS AND ALL THE DIFFERENT ELEMENTS
6 BROUGHT TOGETHER IS EXCITING AND REALLY EXCITING TO GET
7 PROJECTS DONE. SO LOOK FORWARD TO THAT. AND THANK YOU FOR ALL
8 THE WORK. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. AND IF THERE IS NOT
9 ANY OTHER COMMISSION COMMENTS, WE WILL TURN TO THE PUBLIC. I
10 SEE ONE HAND UP. KIM, DO YOU WANT TO LEAD US IN PUBLIC
11 COMMENT, PLEASE?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. I SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14 THEIR HAND RAISED. AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.
15 JONATHON KATZ, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO
16 MINUTES.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS JONATHON KATZ TRANSPORTATION
19 POLICY MANAGER FOR SPUR. THE O BAG THREE PROGRAM IS A VITAL
20 TUNE TO SUPPORT PROGRAM COMMITMENTS. STRONG HOUSING GROWTH IN
21 STRAIGHT RICH AREAS 1.2 MILLION NEW HOUSING UNITS 530,000
22 AFFORDABLE UNITS AND ALSO DECREASING THE DRIVE ALONE COMMUTE
23 RATE IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS DOWN TO 6% AND DELIVERING THESE
24 AMBITIOUS GOALS IS GOING TO REQUIRE FUNDING SUPPORT AND
25 PLANNING INFRASTRUCTURE IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS. NOT THAT



November 10, 2021

1 PROPOSED OBAG THREE FRAMEWORK GOES FAR NUMB IN SUPPORTING
2 THESE GOALS THIS REPRESENT A SMALL PERCENTAGE OF OVERALL
3 FUNDING THIS IS ONE OF THE FEW FUNDING SOURCES DESIGNED TO
4 FOCUS ON SUPPORTING PLAN GROWTH AND MODE SHIFT IN TRANSIT-RICH
5 AND PLAN DEVELOPMENT -- PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. SO, I
6 WOULD SUGGEST YOU CONSIDER INCREASING THE PERCENTAGE OF
7 INVESTMENTS THAT NEED TO BE WITHIN OUR CONNECTED TO TRANSIT
8 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. AND, WE ALSO SUPPORT THE PROPOSAL
9 FOR A UNIFORM AND STRONG DEFINITION OF WHAT INVESTMENTS
10 QUALIFY AS BEING WITHIN OR CONNECTED PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT
11 AREAS. AND, AS COMMISSIONER WORTH SAID, DOING AS MUCH AS
12 POSSIBLE TO ENSURE THAT COUNTY DECISIONS ARE DELIVERING THE
13 GROWTH AND MODE SHIFT RESULTS THAT THE REGION NEEDS. FINALLY,
14 THERE WILL BE MUCH MORE NEED FOR NEW AND UPDATED PLANNING FOR
15 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS. THE PROGRAM SHOULD BE DESIGNED TO ENSURE
16 THAT MTC HAS THE FUNDING TO SUPPORT LOCAL PLANNING WHICH IS
17 NECESSARY TO MEET THE DENSITY AND MODE SHIFT TARGETS. WE ALSO
18 SUPPORT CONNECTING THE TIMING OF THIS PROGRAM WITH THE TOD
19 POLICY UPDATE AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR
20 CONSIDERATION.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
23 HANDS, MR. CHAIR.

24



November 10, 2021

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. SO, AGAIN, THIS WAS AN
2 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. WE VERY MUCH APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK.
3 THANK YOU, MALLORY FOR THE PRESENTATION. WE'LL MOVE ON THEN TO
4 ITEM 3B THIS IS AN ITEM, OUR NEXT PAC MEETING DISCUSSION, WE
5 HAVE A WRITTEN UPDATE BUT I'LL CHECK THE TEMPERATURE OF THE
6 COMMISSION HOW YOU WANT TO SPEND YOUR TIME WITH THAT I'M GOING
7 TO GO TO ALIX BOCKELMAN FOR COMMENT AS WELL.

8

9 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS AN UPDATE ON THE CLEAN TRANSIT RULE,
10 AND BOSMAN ISN'T HERE HE WELCOMED A NEW BABY BOSS MAN, BUT WE
11 CAN REFER TO THE WRITTEN REPORT OR COME BACK NEXT MONTH GIVEN
12 THE LATE HOUR IT'S NOT TIME CRITICAL.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** ANY FEEDBACK?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** I THINK IT COULD GO PRETTY FAST BUT THAT'S JUST
17 ONE OPINION.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** IS 3C A QUICK ITEM, AS WELL? ALIX?

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YES.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** OKAY. WHY DON'T WE GO AS QUICKLY AS
24 POSSIBLE THROUGH THE ITEM 3B UPDATE ON THE ZERO-EMISSION BUS
25 FLEET TRANSITION?



November 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI COMMISSIONER RABBIT. I CAN GET THROUGH THIS
5 QUICKLY. AS ALIX MENTIONED THIS IS KENNETH F WITH THE
6 PROGRAMMING STAFF. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF
7 TRANSITIONING THE BAY AREA'S FLEET TO A ZERO EMISSIONS FLEET,
8 AND YOU KNOW SOME OF THE AGENCIES WERE MOVING IN THAT
9 DIRECTION BY THEMSELVES BUT AN IMPORTANT RULE FROM CARB CAME
10 OUT IN 2018 AND JUST TO SUMMARIZE IT'S A GRADUAL TRANSITION
11 THAT IS FROM NOW THROUGH 2040, AND AGENCIES ARE LUMPED INTO
12 TWO GROUPS, LARGE OPERATOR, SMALL OPERATORS, AND STATEWIDE, IT
13 COVERS ABOUT 12,000 BUSES STATEWIDE, WITH THE EXPECTED IMPACTS
14 OF BEING, YOU KNOW, CO2 EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS, SPURRING SOME
15 DOMESTIC MANUFACTURING OF THESE TYPES OF VEHICLES, AND
16 EVENTUALLY HAVING PRICES GO DOWN WITH ECONOMIES OF SCALE. NEXT
17 SLIDE PLEASE. PRETTY SIMPLE ON THE TECHNOLOGIES OF NON-
18 COMPLIANT VERSUS COMPLIANT. WE'RE ELIMINATING THE USE OF
19 DIESEL BUSES AND MOVING TOWARDS AT THE MOMENT TECHNOLOGIES
20 THAT INCLUDE BATTERY, ELECTRIC, AND FUELCELL. NEXT SLIDE
21 PLEASE. THIS IS A SNAPSHOT OF THE CURRENT FLEET OF BUSES IN
22 THE BAY AREA, AND THERE ARE APPROXIMATELY 3,400 FIXED ROUTE
23 BUSES IN THE BAY AREA, AND AS YOU CAN SEE, SOME OF THE
24 AGENCIES GETTING STARTED, LAFTA, NAPA AND SAN FRANCISCO WITH
25 THE MUNI AND TROLLEY HAVE A JUMP-START THERE. THE REQUIRED



November 10, 2021

1 RULE THE LARGER OPERATORS TO ALREADY SUBMIT ROLL OUT PLANS SO
2 THE TRANSITION IS DEFINITELY IN MOTION FOR THEM, AND THERE ARE
3 CHALLENGES THAT REMAIN AND WE'LL GET INTO THOSE RIGHT AWAY.
4 NEXT SLIDE. THE CHALLENGES BASICALLY CAN BE BROKEN DOWN, TO
5 THERE IS THE TYPICAL COST IN FUNDING CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE
6 IN FUNDING ALL OF OUR INVESTMENTS. SO THOSE ARE THERE IN A
7 SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGE HERE. THE OTHER ONES ARE TO DO WITH
8 TECHNOLOGY AND IMPLEMENTATION. WE OBVIOUSLY HAVE A RANGE IN
9 THE BAY AREA WHERE YOU HAVE HILLY TERRAINS. IN SAN FRANCISCO,
10 YOU HAVE SOME LONG ARTERIAL ROADS FOR BUS AND SERVICE
11 PROVIDERS YOU HAVE EXPRESS BUS SERVICE ON FREEWAYS SO WE
12 REALLY HAVE A VARIETY OF CHALLENGES THERE. INFRASTRUCTURE AND
13 FACILITIES IS ALSO A HUGE DEAL SO THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE'LL
14 TALK ABOUT AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, ON THE TOTAL
15 COST, WE HAD AN ESTIMATE SOME YEARS AGO WHERE IN THE MIDDLE OF
16 UPDATING AND VALIDATING THAT, AND WE BELIEVE THE COST TO BE IN
17 THE LOW BILLIONS OF DOLLARS, SOME OF THE FACTORS THAT WILL
18 DETERMINE THAT ARE HOW WE MOVE FORWARD WITH, DO WE NEED A ONE
19 FOR ONE REPLACEMENT, OR WILL THAT VARIABLE BE DIFFERENT. AND
20 THEN, COST GOING UP OR DOWN AND ALSO THE SELECTION AT THE
21 AGENCY LEVEL OF WHAT TECHNOLOGY AND WHAT, SORT OF, CHARGING
22 AND DEPO INFRASTRUCTURES WE MAY HAVE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO,
23 THIS IS A SNAPSHOT OF THE ROLLING STOCK PIECE OF IT. THE
24 ACTUAL PURCHASE OF BUSES. AND REALLY THIS PART IS EASIER TO
25 QUANTIFY. AS YOU CAN SEE -- WELL, ACTUALLY YOU CAN'T SEE,



November 10, 2021

1 BECAUSE IT'S TOO SMALL -- BUT A LOT OF THE COST, INCREMENTAL
2 INCREASES IS MAYBE A 20 -- 25% TO 75% INCREASE OVER THE BUS WE
3 HAVE TODAY, LOOKING FORWARD TO THE ELECTRIC BUSES. IN SOME OF
4 THESE CATEGORIES, IT'S REALLY, YOU KNOW, IT'S CLOSER TO 25%.
5 SO, AGAIN, AS THIS RULE KICKS IN, WE ARE HOPING THAT ECONOMIES
6 OF SCALE WOULD LEAD TO LOWER PRICES ON THE ROLLING STOCK.
7 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE INFRASTRUCTURE IS HARDER TO -- FUND.
8 IT'S ALSO HARDER TO ESTIMATE. THERE IS RECONFIGURING, THERE IS
9 ELECTRICITY BUS DEMANDS SOME YARDS MAY NEED NEW BUS STATIONS
10 FROM PG&E. SO THIS IS AN AREA THAT WE'RE WORKING ON REALLY
11 EDUCATING OUR FUNDING PARTNERS AND LOOKING TO THE STATE IN THE
12 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT FOR HELP ON ADDRESSING THESE LARGE COSTS
13 THAT HAVE TO DO WITH THE INFRASTRUCTURE IN PLACE. NEXT SLIDE
14 PLEASE. SO, JUST QUICKLY, ON THE NEXT STEPS, WITH THE
15 EXCITING NEWS OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE BILL, YOU KNOW, WE'RE
16 GOING TO BE LOOKING FORWARD TO THE FORMULA SIDE OF THE
17 INFRASTRUCTURE BILL, HOW WE, SORT OF, CONTINUE TO OPTIMIZE OUR
18 PROGRAM AND MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PURCHASE OF ZERO-EMISSION
19 BUSES AND INFRASTRUCTURE. ON THE DISCRETIONARY SIDE WE'RE
20 GOING TO PREPARE TO COMPETE AND MAKING SURE WE'RE ABLE TO
21 COMPETE NATION-WIDE. THIS CARB RULE COULD PUT US AHEAD OF THE
22 LINE IN A LOT OF WAYS IN TERMS THE FEDERAL MONEY THAT ARE
23 GOING TOWARD EMISSIONS, WITH THE STATE LEVEL WORKING WITH CARB
24 AND WORKING WITH THE AIR DISTRICT AND CONTINUING OUR ADVOCACY
25 WITH THE PROGRAMS LIKE IT. IRCP WHICH IS PART OF SB1 AND CAP-



November 10, 2021

1 AND-TRADE TO MAKE SURE THEY ARE AWARE OF THIS INFRASTRUCTURE
2 AND FACILITIES NEED THAT WE HAVE. SO THAT'S KIND OF A QUICK
3 UPDATE ON THAT. I THINK WE'LL HAVE MORE FOR YOU IN THE COMING
4 MONTHS AS WE LEARN MORE ABOUT THE INFRASTRUCTURE BILL, AS WELL
5 AS GOING INTO THE TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITY PROGRAM, WHICH YOU
6 WILL SEE THE PROGRAM OF PROJECTS IN THE NEW YEAR. SO THAT'S A
7 QUICK UPDATE, CHAIR RABBIT.

8

9 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU KENNETH. APPRECIATE
10 THAT. VICE CHAIR PAPAN

11

12 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** GREAT KENNETH APPRECIATE YOU THROWING
13 THAT OUT THERE. HOPING THERE WILL BE REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION
14 IN THESE BUSES AS WELL AS INFRASTRUCTURE AND SPEED IN WHICH
15 THE CHARGING OCCURS. PG&E IS WORKING WITH A NEW COMPANY, AND
16 THE TRANSITION, OR THE ACCESS TO SOME OF THESE COURTYARDS MAY
17 GO FASTER AND LESS EXPENSIVE THAN EVER BEFORE. SO, I KNOW,
18 WITH ALL THE SOLAR THAT'S HAPPENING, UPGRADING THE DELIVERY
19 SYSTEM, THERE IS NEW TECHNOLOGY OUT THERE. SO, HOPEFULLY WE
20 CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THAT AND MOVE QUICKLY THROUGHOUT THIS.
21 AND I'M HOPING MTC, WE CAN GET A BRIEFING ON THAT, AS WELL.
22 SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE IT.

23

24 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. DID ANYONE ELSE HAVE
25 ANYTHING? IF NOT, I'LL TURN IT TO KIMBERLY. AND I SEE AT



November 10, 2021

1 LEAST ONE HAND RAISED. YOU CAN LEAD US IN PUBLIC COMMENT ON
2 THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OF COURSE. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
5 WRITING AND I SEE ALETA DUPREE WITH HER HAND RAISED. PLEASE
6 UNMUTE YOURSELF, MS. DUPREE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR DAVID RABBIT ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
9 RECORD SHE AND HER THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT WORK IT'S BETTER
10 SOONER THAN LATER BUSES ARE GOING TO COST MONEY IT'S NOT A
11 MATTER OF IF BUT WHEN. IT IS TRUE THAT WHILE THESE ZERO
12 EMISSIONS BUSES COST MORE UP FRONT, THEY COST LESS TO OPERATE
13 OVER TIME. SO, WE GET A BETTER RESULT WITH HOMEGROWN CLEAN
14 ENERGY AND LOWER COSTS OVER TIME, WITH THESE NEW BUSES, WHICH
15 IS ONE OF THE MANY REASONS WHY I SUPPORT THIS WORK. I HOPE
16 THAT WE CAN BE ABLE TO SOLVE THE INFRASTRUCTURE PROBLEMS, AND
17 I THINK, WE HERE AT MTC, CAN DRIVE THAT FUNDING TOWARD IT. I
18 SEE LOTS OF LARGE INFRASTRUCTURE GOING IN ALL AROUND THE
19 COUNTRY WHICH HAS MORE ELECTRIC DEMAND THAN MANY OF THESE
20 CHARGING STATIONS SO I THINK WE CAN DO IT HERE IN CALIFORNIA
21 IT'S JUST SOMETIMES I WONDER FROM SOME OTHERS IT SOUNDS LIKE
22 I'M HEARING MORE EXCUSES RATHER THAN -- IT TAKES MORE ENERGY
23 TO NOT DO SOMETHING THAN TO DO SOMETHING. SO, I THINK THAT WE
24 CAN GET THIS DONE. AND I ASK THAT YOU, AS A COMMITTEE, PUT
25 YOUR WEIGHT BEHIND IT, SO WE CAN GET THE INFRASTRUCTURE, AND



November 10, 2021

1 SO WE CAN PUT THESE BUSES ON THE ROAD. THIS IS A WORTHY
2 PROGRAM, AND I ASK YOUR CONTINUED SUPPORT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
5 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THANK
8 YOU, EVERYONE. THIS, AGAIN, WAS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY NO
9 ACTION IS REQUIRED. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM 3C CALIFORNIA
10 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION UPDATE AND KENNETH KAO IS HERE FOR
11 AN UPDATE.

12

13 **KENNETH KAO:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS KENNETH KAO MT I WANT TO
14 HIGHLIGHT THE MEETINGS FROM OCTOBER ALLOCATION EVER \$50
15 MILLION FOR THE NAPA CONJUNCTION PROJECT A GREAT MILESTONE
16 CALTRANS BEGINNING WORK NEXT YEAR CONGRATULATIONS TO NAPA
17 FOLLOW UP ON THE QUESTION REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION OF A
18 CLIMATE ACTION PLAN FOR TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS OR CAPTI,
19 WE ARE WORKING WITH CALSTA AND STAFF TO INCLUDE THE CAPTI
20 RECOMMENDATIONS AND THE VARIOUS SB1 PROGRAMS AND I HAVE
21 WRITTEN SOME FURTHER INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT. WITH
22 THAT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE. THANK
23 YOU.

24



November 10, 2021

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KENNETH. ANYONE HAVE QUESTIONS
2 FOR KENNETH ON THAT?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU KENNETH.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ? THAT WAS IT?

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THAT WAS IT.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE IT. KIMBERLY ANY PUBLIC
11 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
15 ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. WE'LL SAY THANK YOU TO KENNETH.
18 THIS WAS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM NUMBER
19 AGENDA FOUR, WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT. AND, AGAIN, I'LL LOOK
20 TO KIMBERLY TO LEAD US THROUGH ON PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS
21 COMMITTEE?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS
24 OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC
25 COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** I THINK WE HAD A LATE --

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WE GO. ROLAND LEBRUN. PLEASE UNMUTE
5 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT, RIGHT? SO, WHAT I WOULD LIKE
8 THE COMMISSION IS TO BE AWARE OF WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THE VTA
9 PROJECT. AND WHY I'M PUSHING, URGENTLY FOR MEGA PROJECT
10 OVERSIGHT. THERE ARE CHALLENGES I HOPE THEY'RE LOOKING AT
11 WHAT THEY'RE DOING DOWN THERE BUT I WANT TO TALK ABOUT
12 FINANCING. ON TOP OF THE \$2.2 BILLION THAT FTA CAME UP WITH
13 LAST WEEK, BUT THE ROOT OF THE PROBLEM IS INTERNALLY, THERE
14 ARE ABSOLUTELY NO FINANCIAL CONTROLS IN PLACE, WHATSOEVER. AND
15 THE SUPERVISION OF THE BOARD. BASICALLY BURNING AROUND \$50
16 MILLION A MONTH RIGHT NOW THE BOARD DOESN'T KNOW ABOUT IT. BUT
17 THE ONE THING I REALLY WANT THIS COMMISSION TO FOCUS ON IS THE
18 COMPLETELY DYSFUNCTIONAL FUNDING PLAN FOR THE PROJECT.
19 SPECIFICALLY THAT EVERY SINGLE VTA SALES TAX THERE LEVERAGES
20 LESS THAN ONE THERE IN MATCHING FUNDS. THEN I WANT YOU TO
21 COMPARE THAT TO SAN FRANCISCO THEY DON'T HAVE A HALF CENT
22 SALES TAX IT'S CALLED PROP K EVERY ONE MATCHES 4 AND \$7 FROM
23 FUNDING SOURCES I WANT THE COMMISSION TO FOCUS ON ACTUALLY I'M
24 AT THE POINT WHERE I WILL START PRODUCING DATA SHEETS AND BAR
25 CHARTS WHICH SHOULD HAD BEEN REQUESTED BY STAFF. THANK YOU.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
3 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, IF THERE IS NOTHING ELSE,
6 UNDER ITEM FIVE IS ADJOURNMENT. NEXT MEETING OF THE
7 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD
8 WEDNESDAY DECEMBER 10TH, 2021 AT 9:45 A.M. REMOTELY AND BY
9 WEBCAST ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO
10 THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR ALL THE GREAT WORK AND
11 THANK YOU TO MY COMMISSIONERS. AND SEE YOU SOON. [ADJOURNED]

12



Broadcasting Government