

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



November 10, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 10, 2021, 9:40 A.M.**

4
5 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** WELCOME ALL TO THE ADMINISTRATION
6 COMMITTEE, WITH MR. FEDERAL GLOVER, OUR CHAIR, WHO IS HAVING
7 SOME TECHNICAL DIFFICULTIES SO I WILL BE STEPPING IN TO KEEP
8 THE MEETING MOVING. I'M GOING TO CALL OUR MEETING TO ORDER AND
9 ASK THAT THE COVID MESSAGE RECORDING BEING PLAYED. [RECORDED
10 MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING
11 WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS
12 OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF
13 THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
14 SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS,
15 STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK
16 CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR
17 REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH
18 THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE
19 VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
20 PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE "RAISE
21 HAND" FEATURE OR DIAL *9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT
22 THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED
23 UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS
24 REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS IS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
25 ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.



November 10, 2021

1 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY
2 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND
3 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF
4 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,
5 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE
6 CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL
7 CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS
8 SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO
9 GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR
10 APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL ASK THE
13 CLERK IF YOU WOULD TAKE ROLL?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. ABE-KOGA?

16

17 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

24

25 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MILEY?

3

4 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

15

16 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

19

20 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ITEM TWO, OUR

25 CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2E. ARE THERE ANY



November 10, 2021

1 QUESTIONS FROM MY COLLEAGUES ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. ANY
2 ADDITIONS, OR ANY OTHER SHENANIGANS. I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
3 COMMENT ON 2C BUT LEAVE IT ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. AND THAT
4 IS THEY WANT TO CONFIRM THAT THE 2019 PLAN FOR SPECIAL
5 LANGUAGE SERVICES AND LIMITED LANGUAGE LIMITED ENGLISH
6 PROFICIENCY POPULATION GUIDE IS EMBEDDED IN THE CONTRACT AND
7 THE SPECIFIC LANGUAGE IN THE CONTRACT REFLECTING OUR DIVERSITY
8 GOALS BE EXPRESSED AND THAT CONTRACT AFTER IT'S SIGNED AND
9 AWARDED BE SENT TO THIS COMMITTEE FOR AFFIRMATION. WITH THAT,
10 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IF THERE'S A MOTION AND SECOND FOR THE
11 CONSENT CALENDAR?

12

13 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU MARGARET.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** SECOND.

18

19 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU GIN A WE HAVE A MOTION AND
20 SECOND. NO PUBLIC SPEAKERS. ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS, KIMBERLY?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** SEE NO HANDS RAISED.

25



November 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION AND SECOND. ABE-KOGA?

2

3 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** AYE. COMMISSIONER GLOVER MARKING

6 ABSENT FOR THIS ONE. MILEY?

7

8 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PAPAN?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

15

16 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

19

20 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

23

24 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

25



November 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
2 WITH ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** ALSO, I VOTE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
7 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH WE'RE GOING MOVE
10 TO ITEM 3A A CONTRACT WITH REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
11 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION AGREEMENT. AND WHO IS GOING TO KICK
12 THIS OFF?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SAW HER A MOMENT AGO.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** SHE MAY BE HAVING TECHNICAL
17 DIFFICULTIES ALSO.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUITE PROBABLY. I DON'T SEE HER FRAME ANY
20 MORE ON THE SCREEN.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** PERHAPS, IS THERE ANOTHER STAFF PERSON
23 WHO IS LEAD US THROUGH THIS?

24

25 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I BELIEVE ALIX OR THERESA?



November 10, 2021

1

2 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YES. I CAN TRY. I JUST RECEIVED COMMUNICATION
3 HER COMCAST DIED ON HER.

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** IT'S A GREMLIN. IF YOU COULD LEAD THAT
6 WOULD BE GREAT.

7

8 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THIS REQUEST IS FOR APPROVAL TO ENTER INTO
9 CONTRACT WITH VIAS, PERKINS STUDIO FIRM TO ENTER INTO CONTRACT
10 NOT TO EXCEED \$750,000 TO CONDUCT REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
11 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION AS YOU RECALL IN MAY OF 2020MTC
12 CREATED THE RECOVERY TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE TO GUIDE
13 RECOVERY OF PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE REGION AND AS IT ADJUSTS TO
14 NEW CONDITIONS RESULTING FROM THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC. AS PART
15 OF ITS WORK THE TASK FORCE EXPLORED NEAR-TERM ACTIONS TO
16 IMPLEMENT LONG-TERM NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE REFORMS
17 TO OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM AND INITIAL EVALUATION OF PUBLIC
18 TRANSIT NETWORK MANAGEMENT REFORMS NEEDED TO ACHIEVE THE TASK
19 FORCE'S TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION GOALS WAS UNDERTAKEN. TO
20 CONTINUE THE WORK TO BE DONE UNDER THE TASK FORCE AND IN
21 COLLABORATION WITH PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS THIS PROJECT
22 WOULD ASSESS THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTABILITY AREAS,
23 EVALUATION CRITERIA, AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE
24 ALTERNATIVES THEN CONDUCT ANALYSIS OF SELECT STRUCTURED
25 ALTERNATIVES TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION OF THE PREFERRED



November 10, 2021

1 ALTERNATIVE. THAT PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE WOULD BE THE MOST
2 LIKELY TO ACHIEVE THE NEAR-TERM AND LONGER RANGE REGIONAL
3 GOALS. ON SEPTEMBER 15TH, MTC ISSUED A REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS
4 TO FIVE FIRMS WHO ARE PREQUALIFIED ON THE 2020 BAY AREA
5 TRANSIT COORDINATION AND STRUCTURE CONSULTANT BENCH UNDER
6 CATEGORY C, WHICH WAS ESTABLISHING NEW SUBREGIONAL AND
7 REGIONAL GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION. ONLY ONE PROPOSAL WAS
8 RECEIVED FROM VIA. A PANEL OF MTC, CALTRAIN, AND SAN FRANCISCO
9 BAY AREA WATER EMERGENCY TRANSIT AUTHORITY OR WETA STAFF
10 EVALUATED PROPOSALS BASED ON SEVERAL CRITERIA INCLUDING
11 CALCULATIONS AND TEAM EXPERIENCE, APPROACH TO COMPLETING THE
12 PROJECT, COST EFFECTIVENESS AND PRESENTATION. BASED ON THAT
13 EVALUATION, THE PANEL RECOMMENDED THE TEAM LED BY VIA. THE
14 STRENGTHS THAT VIA PROPOSAL INCLUDED WERE EXPANDED TEAM THAT
15 PROVIDED NETWORK MANAGEMENT EVALUATION THAT ADDRESSED BUSINESS
16 CASE FOCUSED EXPERTISE AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT. THE TEAM
17 HAD SIGNIFICANT EXPERIENCE ACROSS ALL THE PROJECT AREAS. THEY
18 HAVE A KNOWLEDGE OF THE TRANSIT LANDSCAPE IN THE BAY AREA
19 ACROSS THE STATE, COUNTRY, AND INTERNATIONALLY WITH MAJOR
20 TRANSIT SYSTEMS. THEY PROVIDED A THOUGHTFUL AND COMPREHENSIVE
21 PLAN FOR UNDERRECORDING THE PROJECT, THEY DEMONSTRATED A CLEAR
22 UNDERSTANDING OF THE GOALS AND CHALLENGES. AND THEY HAVE A
23 SIGNIFICANT KNOWLEDGE OF THE WORK COMPLETED TO DATE. THEIR
24 PROPOSAL CAME IN AT THE BUDGETED AMOUNT, AND IT WAS CLEAR AND
25 UNDERSTANDABLE. VIA'S PROPOSAL INCLUDED THREE, DBE



November 10, 2021

1 SUBCONSULTANTS FOR INFORMING THE WORK INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT
2 SUMMARY CONSULTANTS SMALL BUSINESS AND STATUS. COMMITTEE
3 AUTHORIZES EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO CONTRACT WITH VIA
4 IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED 750,000 FROM NOVEMBER 2021 TO MARCH
5 2023 TO CONDUCT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CASE
6 EVALUATION. -- --

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR PITCHING IN
9 THERE. I KNOW MOST OF US READ THE STAFF REPORT OR HAD AN
10 OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT. I'M GOING TO SEE IF THERE ARE ANY
11 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC. I SEE NO HANDS RAISED FROM THE
12 PUBLIC. KIMBERLY, DID WE RECEIVE ANY NOTICES?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING,
15 AND AGREE THAT THE NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE ANY OF MY
18 COLLEAGUES WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ISSUE? SEEING NONE.
19 MAY I ASK FOR A MOTION?

20

21 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION TO APPROVE, ABE-KOGA.

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU MARGARET. DO I HAVE A
24 SECOND?

25



November 10, 2021

1 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SECOND, GLOVER.

2

3 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, FEDERAL. WITH THAT WE HAVE
4 A MOTION AND SECOND. AND I REQUEST ROLL CALL.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY ABE-KOGA AND SECOND BY GLOVER?
7 [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE GOING TO
10 MOVE TO ITEM 3B, AN EVALUATION OF THE REGIONAL MEANS BASED
11 TRANSIT FARE PILOT. AND JUDY -- JUDIS, IS THAT RIGHT?

12

13 **JUDIS SANTOS:** YES.

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** GREAT. WE SEE YOU. AND COMCAST HASN'T
16 GOTTEN.

17

18 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THANK YOU CHAIR CHAVEZ. STAFF, PLEASE PULL UP
19 THE PRESENTATION. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE MY NAME IS JUDIS
20 SANTOS, PROGRAM MANAGER WITH THE MTC LIFELINE PROGRAM
21 MANAGEMENT I'LL BE PRESENTING ON THE EXTENSION OF EVALUATION
22 SERVICES FOR ANOTHER YEAR IN RESPONSE TO THE PILOT'S
23 ADDITIONAL YEAR EXTENSION. I'M HERE WITH DR. TRACY MCMILLAN
24 CONSULTANT WHO WILL PRESENTING A HIGH LEVEL OVERVIEW OF YEAR
25 ONE CLIPPER START PILOT EVALUATION RESULTS DETAILS ARE



November 10, 2021

1 PROVIDED IN THE PACKET NEXT SLIDE PLEASE KEY MOTIVATION BEHIND
2 CLIPPER START PILOT PROGRAM IS TO ADDRESS THE SYSTEMIC
3 CHALLENGES IN THE REGION RELATED TO SOCIETAL INEQUITIES
4 EXPERIENCED BY INDIVIDUALS OF LOW-INCOMES AND OVERCOMING
5 BARRIERS TO TRANSIT ACCESS THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM PROVIDES
6 DISCOUNTED SINGLE RIDE FARES FOR LOW-INCOME ELIGIBLE RIDERS
7 THROUGHOUT DISCOUNT THE PROGRAM SEEKS TO ELIMINATE COST
8 BARRIER PROVIDING AFFORDABLE TO TAKE TRANSIT THERE ARE BY
9 INCREASING ACCESS TO JOBS AND OPPORTUNITY FOR AN INDIVIDUAL TO
10 DRIVE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE PROGRAM IS A THREE YEAR PILOT
11 FOR LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS AGE 19 TO 64 AT OR NEAR THE POVERTY
12 LEVEL. [INDISCERNIBLE] INDIVIDUALS APPLIED FOR THE DISCOUNT
13 ONLINE AT CLIPPERSTART.COM OR PAPER BROW SHOWER THROUGH SOCIAL
14 SERVICE AGENCIES ONCE ELIGIBILITY IS APPROVED THEY WILL
15 RECEIVE CLIPPER START CARDS VIA MAIL WITHIN 30 DAYS GOALS OF
16 THE PROGRAM INCLUDE MAKING TRANSIT AFFORDABLE TO ALL
17 INDIVIDUALS INCLUDING LOW-INCOME, AND THE PROGRAMS ARE VIABLE
18 AND ADMINISTRATIVELY FEASIBLE AND THE SOLUTION MOVES US TOWARD
19 A CURRENT REGIONAL STANDARD FOR FARE AND DISCOUNTS. THE GOAL
20 OF A PARTICIPATING TRANSIT OPERATOR PROVIDE A 20% DISCOUNT ON
21 THE LEFT AND A 50% DISCOUNT ON THE RIGHT. FOR TRANSIT
22 OPERATORS LAUNCHED IN JULY 2020 IDENTIFIED AS COHORT ONE AND
23 COHORT TWO WITH 17 OPERATORS WITH EXPANSION OF THE PILOT
24 LAUNCHING IN NOVEMBER 2020 AND JANUARY 2021. MTC'S GOAL IS TO
25 HAVE 100% PARTICIPATION FROM TRANSIT OPERATORS ON THE CLIPPER



November 10, 2021

1 SYSTEM. WHILE THE SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY
2 HAS ITS OWN SMART PASS PROGRAM WHICH IS DEEPLY DISCOUNTED
3 ANNUAL PASS FOR INSTITUTIONS, MTC STAFF STILL SEES VALUE FOR
4 VTA AND ITS CUSTOMERS TO HAVING THE AGENCY PARTICIPATE IN
5 CLIPPER START AS IT ALLOWS DISCOUNTS ON CONNECTING SYSTEMS
6 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. MTC STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH
7 VTA ON THEIR POTENTIAL PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAM. NEXT
8 SLIDE PLEASE. TODAY'S RESULTS FOCUS ON HIGH LEVEL YEAR ONE
9 OUTCOMES. THE RESULTS BUILD UPON THE VISION FROM THE 20S 17
10 MEANS BASED STUDY WITH THE PROGRAM LAUNCHED IN JULY 2020 IN
11 THE MIDDLE OF THE PANDEMIC WE WERE AT YEAR ONE IN THE BLUE
12 WITH THE DOTTED LINE WILL RETURN TO THE COMMISSION AT THE END
13 OF YEAR TWO THIS TIME NEXT YEAR TO INFORM POLICY DISCUSSIONS
14 PRIOR TO THE I UNDERSTAND OF THE PILOT IN JUNE -- -- JUNE 2023
15 ON THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM. I'LL HAND IT TO TRACY TO CONFIRM
16 THE EVALUATION RESULTS.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. THE EVALUATION ACHIEVES ACHIEVE. ACROSS
19 GOALS SHOWN ON THE OUTCOMES SHOWN ON THE SCREEN FOUR FOCUSED
20 ON PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION TWO FOCUSED ON PROGRAM IMPACT ON
21 PARTICIPANTS. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF DISCUSSION TODAY ALREADY
22 ABOUT DATA. FOR THE EVALUATION OF THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM
23 THUS FAR WE HAVE USED ENROLLMENT DATA, TRIP DATA, PARTICIPANT
24 FOCUS GROUPS SURVEYS AGENCY DATA TO DETERMINE PROGRESS ON
25 THOSE OUTCOMES. AS JUDIS MENTIONED THE PROGRAM LAUNCHED IN



November 10, 2021

1 JULY 2020 IN THE MIDST OF THE PANDEMIC WHICH HAS AND-A-HALF
2 IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP. SINCE LAUNCH, RIDER -- -- REGIONAL
3 TRANSIT THANK YOU FOR SWITCHING THE SLIDE. THE REGIONAL
4 TRANSIT SIX MONTH AVERAGE INCREASE IS 11% WHILE CLIPPER
5 START'S AVERAGE MONTHLY INCREASE HAS BEEN 22%. LAUNCHING
6 CLIPPER START DURING THE PANDEMIC HIGHLIGHTED THE CRITICAL
7 ROLE TRANSIT PLAYS FOR MANY BAY AREA RESIDENTS. THE RESULTS
8 THAT FOLLOW HIGHLIGHT THE IMPORTANCE OF THE PROGRAM ON EQUITY,
9 ECONOMICS, ACCESSIBILITY, AND MOBILITY, TRIAL PROVIDING A
10 LIFELINE FOR RIDERS DURING THE SHELTER-IN-PLACE PANDEMIC. NEXT
11 SLIDE PLEASE. APPROXIMATELY 7,000 PEOPLE HAVE APPLIED TO
12 CLIPPER START TO DATE. 4,000 OF THOSE INDIVIDUALS ARE ACTIVE
13 USERS IN THE PROGRAM HAVING TAKEN OVER 250,000 TRIPS IN THE
14 FIRST YEAR. PROGRAM UPTAKE IS APPROXIMATELY 3 TO 10%
15 INDICATING THERE IS MUCH ROOM FOR PROGRAM GROWTH IN THE REGION
16 WHICH WE'LL DISCUSS FURTHER WHEN CONSIDERING YEAR TWO. THE
17 MARKETING CAMPAIGN FOR THE PROGRAM WAS -- HAS BEEN DELIVERED
18 IN FOUR LANGUAGES THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA USING ADVERTISEMENTS
19 ON THE WEB SITE, SOCIAL MEDIA, TRANSIT, AND E-MAIL.
20 INCORPORATING WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES COMMUNITY BASED
21 ORGANIZATIONS AND HUMAN SOCIAL SERVICE AGENCIES. THE CAMPAIGN
22 HAS PROVEN EFFECTIVE WITH HIGH ENROLLMENT AND VERIFICATION
23 RATES IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. APPLICANTS ARE HEARING
24 ABOUT THE PROGRAM MORE FREQUENTLY THROUGH E-MAILS AND WEB SITE
25 SOCIAL MEDIA TRANSIT ADVERTISEMENT AND WORD OF MOUTH WITH SOME



November 10, 2021

1 VARIATIONS SEEN BY PARTICIPANT ENROLLMENT AND RACE AND
2 ETHNICITY APPLICANTS REPRESENT PEOPLE WITH HOUSEHOLD INCOMES
3 LESS THAN 20,000. IN THE LAST COMMITTEE MEETING MAKING THE
4 PROCESS STRAIGHT FORWARD IS AN IMPORTANT GOAL OF THIS PROGRAM
5 AS WELL. THE APPLICATION PROCESS FOR THE CLIPPER START SO FAR
6 IS EASY OR VERY EASY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M SORRY TO NOT BE
7 CUING YOU FOR SLIDES. NEXT SLIDE. MTC RESOLUTIONS ESTABLISH
8 THE FINANCIAL STRUCTURE OF THE PROGRAM WHICH IS A MIX OF
9 REGIONAL FUNDS MTC SUBSIDIZES UP TO 10% AND REIMBURSES TRANSIT
10 OPERATORS REVENUE UP TO 10% CONTRIBUTION IS \$10,000 PER MONTH
11 AND OPERATOR REIMBURSEMENT. IN THE LAST SIX MONTHS FARE
12 DISCOUNTS COST THE AGENCY A COMBINED TOTAL OF 33,000 PER MONTH
13 OF FOREGONE REVENUE. FOREGONE REVENUE PER AGENCY VARIED BY
14 AGENCY HOWEVER OVERALL IMPACT REPRESENTS LESS THAN ONE% OF
15 OVERALL AGENCY REVENUE IN FISCAL YEAR 2021. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
16 THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM INVOLVES TEAMS
17 ACROSS MULTIPLE PROGRAMS INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SERVICES,
18 FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAMS WITH INPUT FROM FINANCE
19 LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS INVOLVES INTERNAL PARTNERS SUCH
20 AS 21 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE PROGRAM CBOS AND HUMAN SOCIAL
21 SERVICE AGENCIES SIFTING WITH PROMOTION AND ENROLLMENT AND
22 COMPANIES SIFTING WITH TECHNOLOGY MARKETING AND EVALUATION.
23 MTC FUNDS ADMINISTRATIVE COST FOR THE PROGRAM ONE EXPENDITURES
24 REPRESENT 1/3 OF THE THREE YEAR ADMINISTRATIVE BUDGET FOR THE
25 OVERALL PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AFFORDABILITY SAY KEY



November 10, 2021

1 PARTICIPANT IMPACT OUTCOME OF THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM
2 AVERAGE FARE DISCOUNT FOR PARTICIPANTS WAS \$1.20 PER TRIP
3 ENABLING MORE RIDERS TO TAKE MORE TRIPS OVERALL TRIPS ARE
4 HIGHEST AMONG PARTICIPANTS WITH HOUSEHOLD INCOME BETWEEN 10
5 AND \$20,000. NEXT SLIDE. INCREASE ACCESS MOBILITY IS ANOTHER
6 KEY PARTICIPANT IMPACT OUTCOME FOR THE PROGRAM. PUBLIC USAGE
7 HAS INCREASED SINCE THE PROGRAM LAUNCH UP TO 10,000 WEEKLY
8 TRIPS REPORTED IN JULY 2021 WHICH WAS THE END OF YEAR ONE.
9 WITH MOST TRIPS IN THE FIRST YEAR OF THE PILOT PROGRAM
10 OCCURRING ON MUNI, BART, AC TRANSIT, AND SAMTRANS. THE DATA
11 SHOWS THAT WOMEN AND ASIAN OR HISPANIC APPLICANTS ARE USING
12 THE PROGRAM AT THE HIGHEST RATE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PROGRAM
13 PARTICIPANTS ARE TAKING AN AVERAGE OF 5.5 TRIPS PER WEEK WHICH
14 IS STEADILY INCREASED OVER THE FIRST YEAR OF THE PROGRAM
15 CONSISTENT WITH OVERALL INCREASES IN RIDERSHIP ACROSS THE BAY
16 AREA TRANSIT SYSTEMS. I'LL NOW PASS IT BACK TO JUDIS. NEXT
17 SLIDE.

18

19 **JUDIS SANTOS:** EVALUATING THE PILOT DURING COVID OFFERED A
20 UNIQUE LOOK TO GETTING TO A SUSTAINABLE REGIONAL PEOPLE
21 PERMANENT PROGRAM THE GENERAL EVALUATION THEME TO YEAR ONE IS
22 THAT THERE IS MUCH MORE TO LEARN EXPLORE AND APPLY TO THE
23 PROGRAM. WE SAW THAT THERE ARE UPWARD TRENDS AND OPPORTUNITIES
24 FOR IMPROVEMENT LIKE HOW DO WE HARNESS MARKET TRENDS FOCUSED
25 ON THE ARE INTENDING TO SERVE TO BUILD A SUCCESSFUL PROGRAM.



November 10, 2021

1 STAFF PROPOSES WORKING WITH OPERATORS TO USE DEMOGRAPHIC DATA
2 AND TRAVEL BEHAVIOR OF TARGET AUDIENCE IN ADDITION MARKETING
3 STRATEGIES BASED ON FINDINGS SECONDLY WE LEARNED THAT COVID
4 MAC IMPACTS VARIED ACROSS AGENCIES AND GEOGRAPHIES UPON
5 FURRING EXPLORATION IS CAPTURING LOW-INCOME MARKET SHARE BY
6 TRANSIT OPERATOR TO INFORM MTC AND TRANSIT OPERATOR DECISION
7 MAKING ON FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY. YEAR TWO WILL BUILD UPON
8 FINANCIAL UNDERSTANDING AND RESPONSE TO VARIABILITY IN
9 RECOVERY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE LEARNED THAT MOST APPLICANTS
10 AND USERS ARE VERY LOW-INCOME, FEMALE, AND IDENTIFY AS ASIAN
11 OR HISPANIC. HOW CAN THE PROGRAM CONTINUE TO ADDRESS GAPS IN
12 AFFORDABILITY, ACCESS AND MOBILE? WHY ARE CERTAIN GROUPS USING
13 THE PROGRAM MORE THAN OTHERS. FOR YEAR TWO EXAMINE PROGRAM
14 IMPORTANCE AND GAPS DEMOGRAPHICS BY USING QUANTITATIVE
15 QUALITATIVE DATA AND UTILIZING FOCUS GROUPS LASTLY
16 MULTIPRONGED STRATEGIES TO REACH AUDIENCES. HOW CAN MTC
17 DIVERSIFY MARKETING AND STRATEGIES TO REACH RIDERS AND
18 INFORMING MARKING ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES WITH QUANTITATIVE AND
19 QUALITATIVE EXPERIENTIAL DATA STRENGTHENING RELATION WITH
20 PARTNERSHIPS AND COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATION FOR BROADER
21 CULTURAL REACH AND ENGAGEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. FOR TODAY STAFF'S
22 RECOMMENDATION IS FOR THE COMMITTEE TO FORWARD TO COMMISSION
23 FOR APPROVAL CONTRACT AMENDMENT TO EXTEND BY 12 MONTHS AND ADD
24 72,000 TO NYGAAR CONSULTING SOLUTIONS AND ASSOCIATIONS IN



November 10, 2021

1 EXISTING CONTRACT TO PROVIDE EVALUATION SERVICES. THANK YOU.
2 WE'RE HAPPY TO ADDRESS ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT.
5 AND KIMBERLY IF THERE IS ANYTHING WE NEED TO NOTE THAT WAS
6 SENT TO US THEN GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE
9 UNMUTE YOURSELF, MS. DID YOU PREEMPT YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CHAVEZ. ALETA DUPREE SHE AND HER.
12 THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT TO ME. AND I DON'T KNOW THEY HAVE EVER
13 SPOKEN BEFORE ADMINISTRATION. SO, PLEASE INDULGE AND BE
14 PATIENT WITH ME. I HAVE SUPPORTED THIS PROGRAM FROM THE START.
15 IT'S A GOOD PRESENTATION. I THINK THIS ONE CHART, THOUGH, WITH
16 THE ORANGE PART AND THE PURPLE LINE, IT NEEDS SOME
17 CLARIFICATION, I SEE MILLIONS ON ONE SIDE AND THOUSANDS ON THE
18 OTHER. SO, WE SHOULD CLARIFY THAT. BUT, CLIPPER START REALLY
19 IS ABOUT RELATIONSHIPS. I'M A REDUCED FARE USER, BUT FOR
20 DIFFERENT REASONS, BUT BELIEVE ME, REDUCED FARE MAKES A
21 DIFFERENCE. WHEN I'M OUT IN THE WORLD USING TRANSPORTATION
22 SYSTEMS AND I SEE PEOPLE USING THE OLD LEGACY SYSTEM USING
23 PAPER TICKETING I THINK TO MYSELF THIS IS PROBABLY A PERSON
24 WHO COULD BE A CLIENT OF CLIPPER START AND SAVE MONEY, AND
25 BESIDES ATM FEES FOR DRAWING CASH OUT ARE VERY EXPENSIVE. SO I



November 10, 2021

1 ASK THAT WE REALLY NEED TO HAVE THE EDUCATION COMPONENT WITH
2 THIS. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE 100%, AND I THINK THAT WE'RE GOING
3 TO MAKE THAT MONEY UP IN OTHER WAYS. ESPECIALLY WITH
4 EFFICIENCY OF FARE COLLECTION THROUGH CLIPPER WE'RE GOING TO
5 GET SOME OF THAT BACK. SO, KEEP UP THIS GOOD WORK, BUT WE HAVE
6 TO GET THE WORD OUT TO THE WORLD. IF PEOPLE DON'T KNOW ABOUT
7 IT, THEN IT'S NOT GOING TO BE OF ANY HELP. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
10 RAISED, MADAM CHAIR, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING
11 FOR THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. GINA, DID YOU WANT
14 TO JUMP IN FIRST? DID I SEE YOUR HAND EARLIER? YOU'RE ON
15 MUTE.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH. SORRY ABOUT THAT. YES. I AGREE WITH THE
18 LAST SPEAKER, THERE, THAT, I JUST DON'T FEEL LIKE WE'RE
19 GETTING TO THE PEOPLE WE NEED TO GET TO. DO WE HAVE NUMBERS
20 THAT ACTUALLY COMPARE THE CASH TICKET PURCHASES TO SOMEONE WHO
21 GETS THE CLIPPER CARD? I MEAN, WHAT'S THE PERCENTAGE AS TO THE
22 COMMUNITIES IN NEED? AND ARE WE SECONDARILY, ARE WE ACTUALLY
23 ADVERTISING ON THE BUSES OR THE TRAINS? OR AT THE STOPS? I
24 KNOW WE HAVE DONE THE COMMERCIALS AND EVERYTHING ELSE. COULD
25 ANYBODY ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS?



November 10, 2021

1

2 **JUDIS SANTOS:** YES. WE ARE PROVIDING ADVERTISING ON SHELTERS AS
3 WELL AS BUS ADDS. TRACY, DID YOU ALSO WANT TO COMMENT ON THAT?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YES. THE ADVERTISING HAS BEEN QUITE EXTENSIVE, AND
6 ACROSS THE REGION, AND ACROSS VARIOUS PLATFORMS, TO TRY TO
7 INCREASE THAT RANGE, AND ALSO, IN FOUR DIFFERENT LANGUAGES,
8 AND WORKING WITH COMMUNITY PARTNERS. AS JUDIS MENTIONED DURING
9 THE PRESENTATION, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE FEEL THAT WOULD BE
10 GOOD TO DO IS TO LOOK FURTHER AT HOW TO REFINE THAT MARKETING
11 IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO REACH INDIVIDUALS WHERE THEY ARE, AND
12 THROUGH THE CHANNELS THAT WORK MOST EFFECTIVELY FOR THEM,
13 LIKE, FOR SOME GROUPS WE FOUND THAT WORD OF MOUTH, PEOPLE RELY
14 ON VARIOUS SOURCES OF INFORMATION, AND THEY TRUST THEM MORE TO
15 RECEIVE THAT INFORMATION. SO WORD OF MOUTH MAY WORK FOR ONE
16 POPULATION GROUP, WHEREAS ANOTHER POPULATION GROUP MAY FEEL
17 THAT SEEING SOMETHING ON A TRANSIT ADVERTISEMENT IS -- PEAKS
18 THEIR CURIOSITY, AND THEY GO AHEAD AND LOOK INTO THE PROGRAM.
19 REGARDING THE DATA ABOUT CASH UTILIZATION VERSUS CLIPPER
20 START, WE HAVE NOT LOOKED AT THAT, AND WE APPRECIATE THE
21 SUGGESTION AND WILL DO THAT.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD JUST SO LOVE TO SEE THIS GET OUT THERE. I
24 KNOW YOU WOULD TOO. [LAUGHTER] I JUST WISH WE HAD A SOLUTION



November 10, 2021

1 FOR THAT. DO WE HAVE THE CODE THAT PEOPLE CAN DOWNLOAD? I KNOW
2 THAT'S KIND OF ADVANCED. WHAT IS THAT? HR --

3

4 **SPEAKER:** QR CODE.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** QR. SOMETIMES IT'S HELPFUL IF PEOPLE CAN TAKE THE
7 INFORMATION WITH THEM IF THEY'RE GOING TO PASS THE WORD ON,
8 IT'S THAT CONNECTION WHEN WE'RE CAMPAIGNING, TOO, IF THERE IS
9 SOMETHING THEY CAN TAKE WITH THEM, THAT'S HELPFUL. SO MY
10 COMPLIMENTS IF WE CAN FIND THAT ONE THING THAT GETS IT OUT
11 THERE SO PEOPLE CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS. THANK YOU VERY
12 MUCH.

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NICK THEN ALFREDO.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT THAT IT'S UP AND RUNNING. YOU KNOW, ONE
17 OF THE THINGS THAT I THINK WOULD BE REALLY INTERESTING IS
18 UNDERSTANDING THE SUCCESS OF THIS PROGRAM, AND THE CONTEXT OF
19 THE OTHER EQUITY PROGRAMS THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE. BECAUSE
20 THE 3 OF 10% NUMBER, WHEN I SAW THAT, I WAS, LIKE, OH MY GOD
21 THIS, IS SO LOW. [LAUGHTER] THIS IS SO LOW. BUT THEN, YOU
22 KNOW, I IMAGINED, I KNOW THE SAN FRANCISCO CASE BEST, BUT IN
23 SAN FRANCISCO MUNI HAS A BUNCH OF FARE EQUITY PROGRAMS SO YOU
24 WOULDN'T EXPECT 100% OF LOW-INCOME RIDERS TO BE ON THIS
25 PROGRAM BECAUSE THERE ARE SO MANY THAT ARE ON OTHER PROGRAMS.



November 10, 2021

1 SO I THINK IT WOULD BE MAYBE -- IT WOULD SHOW A BETTER -- IT
2 WOULD -- I THINK WE WOULD GET A BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF HOW
3 WELL THIS PROGRAM IS WORK FIGURE WE DIDN'T JUST LOOK AT IT IN
4 ISOLATION BUT LOOKED AT IT IN CONJUNCTION WITH ALL THE OTHER
5 EQUITY PROGRAMS THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE, AND UNDERSTAND
6 WHAT PERCENTAGE OF RIDERS ARE SIGNED UP TO AN EQUITY PROGRAM,
7 OR ELIGIBLE RIDERS ARE SIGNED UP TO AN EQUITY PROGRAM RATHER
8 THAN JUST OURS. AND THEN THE SECOND THING IS, ARE WE REACHING
9 OUT DIRECTLY TO PEOPLE WHO WE THINK MIGHT BE ELIGIBLE FOR THIS
10 PROGRAM WHO ALREADY HAVE CLIPPER? AND SAY, HEY, ARE YOU
11 ELIGIBLE FOR THE -- YOU KNOW, LIKE, YOU MIGHT BE ELIGIBLE FOR
12 THIS PROGRAM, OR ARE WE BAND FROM DOING THAT BY STATE LAW THAT
13 HELPS PEOPLE? BECAUSE PUTTING AN AD AT A BUS STOP IS ONE
14 THING, BUT IF YOU ARE MESSAGING PEOPLE, DIRECTLY, IT MIGHT BE
15 MORE POWERFUL. AND THE THIRD THING IS, HAVE WE THOUGHT ABOUT
16 CHANGING THE NAME? BECAUSE CLIPPER START DOESN'T INSTINCTIVELY
17 TELL ME WHAT THIS IS LIKE WITH GENERAL MOTORS, YOU KIND OF
18 KNOW WHAT IT IS. BUT ANYWAY.

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. JUDIS DO YOU WANT TO
21 RESPOND TO THAT.

22

23 **JUDIS SANTOS:** WE ARE CURRENTLY RESPONDING TO INDIVIDUALS
24 DIRECTLY THROUGH SOCIAL MEDIA WE ARE WORKING WITH COMMUNITY



November 10, 2021

1 BASED ORGANIZATIONS AS WELL AS SOCIAL SERVICE AGENCIES TO GET
2 THE WORD OUT.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YOU'RE NOT PICKING UP THE PHONE AND CALLING
5 SOMEONE WHO HAS GOT A CLIPPER CARD AND GOING, HEY, YOU MIGHT
6 BE ELIGIBLE FOR A DISCOUNT? OR?

7

8 **JUDIS SANTOS:** WE CURRENTLY ARE NOT CONTACTING THEM VIA PHONE
9 ALTHOUGH WE MAY BE CONTACTING THEM VIA E-MAIL AS WELL,
10 UTILIZING OUR CBO NETWORKS. TRACY, DID YOU HAVE ANYTHING IN
11 ADDITION ADD?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I THINK, AS YOU SAID, THAT THE -- IN TERMS OF
14 REACHING PEOPLE DIRECTLY, AND THE PEOPLE THAT THE PROGRAM IS
15 TARGETED TO, WORKING WITH CBOS AND HUMAN SOCIAL SERVICE
16 AGENCIES, WHO ARE WORKING WITH THE POPULATIONS THAT MEET THE
17 QUALIFICATIONS IS PROVING EFFECTIVE, AND I KNOW THAT LISA AND
18 HER TEAM ARE IMPLEMENTING THAT PROGRAM AND DOUBLING DOWN ON
19 THAT TO INCREASE ENROLLMENT.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NICK, ANYTHING ELSE?

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THE NEXT UPDATE.

24



November 10, 2021

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. THERESE, DID YOU
2 WANT TO JUMP IN NOW OR DO YOU WANT WAIT UNTIL ALFREDO AND
3 MARGARET GO?

4

5 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'LL WAIT.

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** ALFREDO THEN MARGARET.

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GREAT PRESENTATION. LOOKING AT THE
10 DEMOGRAPHICS AND ANALYTICS WAS SUPER HELPFUL. MY QUESTION IS
11 IN TERMS OF THE CONVERSATION ABOUT EQUITY AND PAYMENT PLANS
12 LOOKING AT WHAT WE COULD DO TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO RIDE
13 TRANSIT AND LOOKING AT MEANS BASED. I DON'T SEE JUST AN
14 AUDIENCE EFFORT IT'S THE ENTIRE UNIVERSE EVEN THOUGH THEY'RE
15 NOT USING THE PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM TODAY HOW DO WE ENCOURAGE
16 THEM? IN TERMS OF HOW THE OUTREACH, WHAT ARE WE DOING TO
17 ENCOURAGE AWARENESS AROUND THIS PROGRAM?

18

19 **JUDIS SANTOS:** I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS. TRACY, DID YOU WANT
20 TO ADDRESS THAT COMMENT REGARDING AWARENESS AND THE VARIOUS
21 VEHICLES WE ARE IMPLEMENTING?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SURE. OBVIOUSLY WE TALKED ABOUT THE WAYS THE PROGRAM
24 IS BEING ADVERTISED, BUT ONE OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE
25 HAVE MADE FOR YEAR TWO IS, THE REGION, AS A WHOLE, OBVIOUSLY



November 10, 2021

1 EXPERIENCED A DROP IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP DUE TO COVID, AND
2 THERE ARE, YOU KNOW, RIDERSHIP IS INCREASING ACROSS AGENCIES,
3 BUT MAYBE NOT COMING BACK AT THE RATE THAT AGENCIES WOULD
4 LIKE, AND MAYBE WAS ANTICIPATED THUS FAR. SO I THINK, AS A
5 WHOLE, WE ALL NEED TO LEARN MORE ABOUT WHAT CHOICES PEOPLE ARE
6 MAKING OR IF THEY HAVE A CHOICE TO MAKE A DECISION REGARDING
7 HOW THEY'RE TRAVELING NOW VERSUS PRECOVID. AND WHAT CAN WE
8 LEARN FROM THAT, THAT CAN ALSO HELP US THINK ABOUT HOW TO
9 MARKET CLIPPER START MORE EFFECTIVELY, AND BE EFFICIENT IN
10 THAT MARKETING. BECAUSE, PERHAPS PEOPLE ARE NOT -- THEY'RE
11 TRAVELING IN A DIFFERENT PATTERN, THEY'RE TRAVELING USING
12 DIFFERENT SOURCES, OR THEY'RE NOT TRAVELING. SO, THINKING
13 ABOUT BEING EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT, AND COST EFFICIENT IN THE
14 WAY THAT WE'RE IMPLEMENTING THE PROGRAM MOVING FORWARD, SO
15 THAT WE ARE TARGETED AND THE PEOPLE THAT WE'RE REACHING OUT
16 TO, AND ENGAGE THEM. LIKE YOU SAID, MAYBE TO, MAYBE THEY'RE
17 NOT EVEN A TRANSIT REQUIRED, NOW -- OR THEY WERE, AND WE WOULD
18 LIKE THEM TO COME BACK, OR THEY WEREN'T, AND WE WOULD LIKE
19 THEM TO GIVE IT A TRY, HAVE THEY EVER HAD A CLIPPER CARD OR
20 ARE THEY A CASH USER AND WE WOULD LIKE TO ENCOURAGE THEM TO A
21 CLIPPER CARD OR CLIPPER START CARD I'M A RESEARCHER AND LOVE
22 THESE QUESTIONS, AND I WOULD LOVE TO HAVE ANSWERS TO BE
23 EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT IN THE PROGRAM TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS.
24



November 10, 2021

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I APPRECIATE THAT, TRACY. AND FOR PEOPLE TO
2 CONSIDER OPTIONS THEY HAVE TO KNOW WHAT THE OPTIONS ARE. IS TO
3 THE CONVERSATION WE HAD EARLIER ABOUT BRIDGE TOLLS IT'S REAL
4 WE ACKNOWLEDGE PEOPLE ARE LIVING PAYCHECK TO PAYCHECK I HAVE
5 TO CREATE AWARENESS AROUND THAT PEOPLE HAVE OPTIONS THAT'S WHY
6 WE COULDN'T LOOK AT EQUITY IN A SILO BUT IF WE ARE LOOKING AT
7 THIS GREAT THING AND NOT CREATING A BROADER NETWORK OF
8 AWARENESS, THAT'S THE OPPORTUNITY HERE. THIS IS A GREAT START,
9 BUT HOW DO WE ENCOURAGE THAT. BECAUSE MY INTEREST IS NOT JUST
10 IN PUBLIC RIDERS TODAY IT'S THOSE THAT ARE NOT THAT WE CAN
11 CONVERT BECAUSE IT MAKES SENSE FINANCIAL SENSE FOR THEM AS
12 WELL.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENT.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARGARET.

17

18 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I AGREE WITH A LOT OF THE COMMENTS,
19 THE KEY IS TO TRY TO EXPAND THE PROGRAM. THE POLICY ASPECTS,
20 IF IT'S REACHING WOMEN AND ASIAN AND LATINO COMMUNITIES, THOSE
21 ARE THE TARGET COMMUNITIES SO I SEE THAT AS REALLY PROMISING.
22 I'M JUST CURIOUS TO FIND OUT MORE AS TO, YOU KNOW, WHY THOSE
23 COMMUNITIES PICK UP THIS PROGRAM SO QUICKLY. AND I HOPE THAT
24 WE CAN CONTINUE TO CAPTURE THOSE POPULATIONS AS WE LOOK AT
25 WAYS TO EXPAND. ONE THING I'M DISCOVERING MORE OF, IN, LIKE,



November 10, 2021

1 ARE THE ASIANS COMMUNITY, IS THE STRENGTH OF THEIR SOCIAL
2 MEDIA NETWORKS, LIKE, WE CHAT, IT'S A REALLY BIG POPULAR TOOL,
3 AND SO THIS IDEA OF WORD OF MOUTH, AND SOCIAL MEDIA SEEMS LIKE
4 A REALLY GOOD TOOL TOO, THAT'S GROWING IN USE, TO GET
5 COMMUNICATIONS OUT. SO JUST WANTED TO ADD THAT. THANKS.

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANKS MARGARET.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENT.

10

11 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** DO YOU HAVE ANY RESPONSE -- I
12 APOLOGIZE ABOUT JUMPING IN -- ABOUT WHY CERTAIN COMMUNITIES
13 HAVE A HIGHER UPTICK THAN OTHERS?

14

15 **TRACY MCMILLAN:** WE DON'T HAVE A WHY RIGHT NOW. BUT ALSO, WE
16 THOUGHT THAT DATA WAS REALLY VERY INTERESTING, AND AS YOU
17 SAID, PROMISING, AND WE WOULD LOVE TO LEARN MORE ABOUT THE
18 WHY. I THINK THERE IS A LOT TO LEARN ABOUT, AGAIN, YOU KNOW,
19 HOW AND WHY PEOPLE ARE TRAVELING DIFFERENTLY, AND I KNOW
20 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN WAS INVOLVED IN WOMEN'S
21 TRANSPORTATION STUDY WHEN SHE WAS WITH LA METRO, AND I THINK
22 IT WOULD BE AN IMPORTANT EVALUATION TO DO IN THE BAY AREA, AS
23 WELL, WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF CLIPPER START, OVERALL. SO WE HOPE
24 TO BE ABLE TO LOOK --

25



November 10, 2021

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** IS THAT CURRENTLY IN YOUR SCOPE?

2

3 **TRACY MCMILLAN:** IT IS NOT CURRENTLY IN OUR SCOPE.

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERESE?

6

7 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** JUST A COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS AND I THANK
8 JUDIS AND TRACY FOR A GREAT PRESENTATION AND POINTING OUT, YOU
9 KNOW, THE VALUE OF DIVING DEEPER. [LAUGHTER] ON -- AND I THINK
10 THAT'S A GOOD POINT, INsofar AS THE VALUE OF THE FIRST LEVEL
11 OF EVALUATION IS WHERE WE NEED TO ASK THE NEXT QUESTIONS
12 BECAUSE WE WOULD THIS IS A NEW PROGRAM BECAUSE SOMETIMES WE
13 DON'T HAVE ANSWERS BUT THIS IS SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO BE
14 PERCEIVED APROPOS TO THIS POINT IN TIME IS COVID AND
15 COORDINATION. WE JUST CAN'T EMPHASIZE ENOUGH THE FACT THAT
16 COVID'S -- WELL, I WOULD LIKE TO SAY, EXTRAORDINARILY
17 DIFFERENT BUT WE'RE STILL TRYING TO FIND THAT NEW NORMAL, BUT
18 WHAT IMPACT IT'S HAVING ON RIDERSHIP OVERALL, AND THEN BY
19 EXTENSION, THAT GROUP OF TRANSIT RIDERS WHO MOST NEED AND RELY
20 ON, YOU KNOW, A -- OR CLIPPER START, OR REDUCED FARE, OR SOME,
21 SORT OF, HELP, IT'S JUST HARD TO PARSE RIGHT NOW IN LARGE PART
22 BECAUSE THE BASE SYSTEMS ARE STILL OUT THERE SO JUST TO SAY AS
23 WE CONTINUE GOING FORWARD WE NEED TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS AND WHAT
24 NOT IN OUR EVALUATION TO MAKE SURE WE CAN PICK UP THAT THREAD.
25 AND ALSO, THIS WILL RESONATE WITH OUR BLUE RIBBON WORK, THERE



November 10, 2021

1 IS A BIG COORDINATION HERE WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IS A
2 SPECIAL MODIFICATION TO FARES. RIGHT? AND ONE OF THE BIG
3 THINGS -- ONE OF THE TOP THREE ISSUES THAT WE ARE EVALUATING
4 AS PART OF THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN, ONE OF OUR
5 ACCELERATED EVALUATIONS IS FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION.
6 WHAT I WOULD SAY IS, WHATEVER EQUITY-DRIVEN OVERLAY THAT WE
7 WOULD CONTINUE TO PURSUE AS A REGION, WHETHER IT'S A VARIATION
8 OF CLIPPER START OR SOME OTHER PROGRAM, YOU KNOW, WILL NEED TO
9 BE -- WILL NEED, NECESSARILY, TO INTERSECT WITH WHATEVER WORK
10 WE'RE GOING TO DO ON THE LARGER FARE INTEGRATION PROGRAM. I
11 WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT THERE IS A LOT OF INTERESTING NEXT
12 STEPS IN THAT SPACE THAT WE NEED TO BE MINDFUL OF. AND THAT,
13 IN PARTICULAR, I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT ONE OF THE
14 THINGS THAT COVID DID THAT WAS A BENEFIT IS THAT THE REDUCED -
15 - WELL, IT'S -- I DON'T WANT TO CALL IT A BENEFIT NECESSARILY,
16 BUT IT'S AN IMPACT, THE FACT THAT WE HAVE REDUCED RIDERSHIP
17 LEVELS MEAN WE ACTUALLY HAVE MORE MONEY TO DO THE SUBSIDIES
18 THAT UNDERWRITE THIS PROGRAM. AND A BIG QUESTION IS GOING TO
19 BE THAT, AS WE ADVANCE THIS PROGRAM AND, I THINK, MAKE
20 REGIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS OF WHAT AN EQUITY DRIVEN FARE
21 DISCOUNT FOR THE REGION LOOKS LIKE, AND THIS COMES TO
22 COMMISSIONER -- VICE CHAIR'S JOSEFOWITZ'S ASSESSMENT ABOUT
23 OTHER PROGRAMS AND I DON'T WANT TO USE THE -- EQUITY BECAUSE
24 IT'S HELPFUL BUT THE QUESTION IS EFFICIENCY REACHING THE MOST
25 PEOPLE IN TERMS OF NEED THAT AS WE THINKING ABOUT THIS AS A



November 10, 2021

1 TRANSIT SYSTEM IN OUR REGION, THAT IS SERVING FOLKS WHO, YOU
2 KNOW, HAVE NEED-DRIVEN, YOU KNOW, NEED-DRIVEN ELEMENTS IN
3 TERMS OF THEIR ABILITY TO USE THE SYSTEM ON AFFORDABILITY, AND
4 ACCESS AND THE LIKE, HOW DOES THAT ALL COORDINATE TOGETHER?
5 SO, JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT ONE OF THE THINGS I TAKE AWAY FROM
6 THIS, IN THE LOOK AHEAD IS THAT NOW WE DO HAVE THIS LENS OF
7 THE BLUE -- YOU KNOW, THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN RELATED
8 WORK AND THE LARGER COORDINATION QUESTION AND HOW THESE EQUITY
9 DRIVEN PROGRAMS WILL FIT INTO THAT LENS. SO, THANK YOU FOR THE
10 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE THOSE COMMENTS.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** GREAT. ANY OTHER COLLEAGUES? I WILL
13 ASK FOR A MOTION IN A MOMENT. I WANT TO LIFT UP WHAT I HEARD
14 MY COLLEAGUES ASK ABOUT, AND ONE OF THEM WAS THIS BETTER
15 UNDERSTANDING OF WHETHER OR NOT WE'RE EXPANDING THE NUMBER OF
16 RIDERS, AND I THINK THAT'S A VERY IMPORTANT POINT. IS THIS AN
17 OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP AND BRAND-NEW
18 CUSTOMERS? SECOND WAS, HOW DO WE REACH DEEPER INTO THE
19 COMMUNITY BOTH, YOU KNOW, USING SOCIAL MEDIA, BUT ALSO, ONE
20 THING I WOULD LIKE TO RECOMMEND IS THAT THE -- THAT MTC REACH
21 OUT TO THE SOCIAL SERVICES AGENCIES ACROSS THE COUNTY TO
22 SPECIFICALLY FOR CAL-WORKS AND OTHER PROGRAMS THAT THE
23 ALIGNMENT IN TERMS OF THEIR ABILITY TO ACCESS THIS PROGRAM AND
24 THEIR INCOME LEVELS ARE ALREADY VETTED AND THAT SHOULD BE --
25 AND THERE ARE THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE, AND ANYBODY WHO GETS CAL-



November 10, 2021

1 FRESH, AND I UNDERSTAND THAT THE ISSUES AROUND CONFIDENTIALITY
2 BUT I UNDERSTAND WE FIND WAYS TO COMMUNICATE VERY EFFECTIVELY
3 WHEN WE KNOW THERE IS A PROGRAM THAT SHOULD BE AVAILABLE TO
4 FOLKS. AND I AM HAPPY TO MAKE SURE, YOU HAVE A LOT OF BOARD OF
5 SUPERVISORS ON THIS BOARD THAT YOU COULD CHOOSE ONE OF THEM TO
6 START WITH, THAT WE ASK STAFF TO CONSIDER WHETHER OR NOT THE
7 SCOPE OF THIS WORK NEEDS TO CHANGE SLIGHTLY TO BETTER
8 UNDERSTAND WHERE WE HAVE HAD SUCCESSES, IN PARTICULAR, IN
9 COMMUNICATIONS AND ACCESS. AND THEN, LAST, THAT WE WOULD LIKE
10 A, AT A FUTURE MEETING, A PROGRAM PRESENTATION OF ALL OF THE
11 EQUITY PROGRAMS IN THE COUNTIES THAT ARE ALREADY PART OF THIS
12 PROGRAM. SO THERE IS A BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF SUCCESS,
13 FAILURE, OR HOW PEOPLE ARE CHOOSING WHICH PROGRAM, I THINK
14 WHAT NICK WAS ASKING ABOUT, WHICH I THOUGHT WAS A GREAT POINT.
15 WITH THAT, WITH THOSE REQUESTS FOR DIRECTION, AND INFORMATION,
16 IF I COULD ASK SOMEONE TO MAKE THE MOTION WITH THE -- THE
17 COMMENTS OF MY COLLEAGUES EMBEDDED IN IT.

18

19 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** MADAM VICE CHAIR, I WOULD GO AHEAD AND
20 MAKE THAT MOTION.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THANK YOU, CHAIR.
23 AND DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

24

25 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** SECOND FROM MARGARET. THANK YOU VERY
3 MUCH. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. AND HAVE HEARD FROM THE
4 PUBLIC. ROLL CALL VOTE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY GLOVER, SECOND BY ABE-KOGA?

7

8 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

11

12 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

13

14 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** YES RONEN.

17

18 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

19

20 **AMY R. WORTH:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON
25 ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA BUT ARE WITHIN PURVIEW OF THE BOARD.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
3 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
4 ON THIS ITEM. ALETA DUPREE, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CHAVEZ. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD,
7 SHE AND HER. I SPEAKER GENERALLY AS I LEARN MORE ABOUT
8 ADMINISTRATION, AND AS I SEE THE WORK OF MTC, HOW CAN WE LET
9 ALL THESE SUBAGENCIES, ALL THESE TRANSIT OPERATORS, ET CETERA,
10 KNOW THAT AT MTC, WE ADMINISTER THINGS. WE'RE VERY GOOD AT
11 ADMINISTERING THINGS AT MTC, SUCH AS CLIPPER AND FASTRAK, AND
12 VARIOUS OTHER THINGS AND MTC HAS ECONOMIES OF SCALE. IF I WAS
13 RUNNING A TRANSIT AGENCY, I WOULD WANT MTC TO ADMINISTER A LOT
14 OF MY BUSINESS, SUCH AS THE FARE COLLECTION IN A TURN KEY TYPE
15 OF A SITUATION AS OPPOSED TO TRYING TO FIGURE IT OUT MYSELF. I
16 HAVE LOTS OF THINGS IN MY LIFE THEY ADMINISTER, AS OPPOSED TO
17 ME DOING IT MYSELF. SO I DON'T KNOW IF WHAT I'M SAYING IS
18 GERMANE TO THE WORK OF THIS SPECIFIC COMMITTEE. BUT I ASK THAT
19 YOU REMEMBER THE IMPORTANCE OF ADMINISTRATION IN TRYING TO GET
20 THE VARIOUS TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES TO BE WILLING TO TAKE
21 ADVANTAGE OF THESE PROGRAMS, ECONOMIES OF SCALE, AND
22 EFFICIENCY, MAKES THINGS MORE AFFORDABLE AND EQUITABLE FOR THE
23 REST OF US. THANK YOU.

24



November 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS,

2 MADAM CHAIR.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR:** THANKS, KIMBERLY. OUR LAST ITEM IS

5 GOING TO BE OUR ADJOURNMENT. OUR NEXT MEETING OF OUR COMMITTEE

6 IS DECEMBER 8TH. THANK YOU ALL. [ADJOURNED]

7



Broadcasting Government