

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



November 10, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 10, 2021, 9:35 A.M.**
4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING. THIS IS AMY WORTH, CHAIR OF
6 THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. I AM HAPPY TO
7 CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER. I AM JOINED BY MY VICE CHAIR
8 MARGARET ABE-KOGA. AND I WOULD LIKE TO REQUEST THE BROADCAST
9 TEAM ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
10 ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
11 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL
12 361, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT.
13 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR
14 WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER
15 SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE
16 THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
17 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED
18 ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.
19 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM
20 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE OR DIAL
21 *9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
22 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
23 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
24 SPEAKERS IS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING
25 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS



November 10, 2021

1 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL
2 BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
3 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
4 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO AND
5 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT
6 THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
7 ACTION ITEMS. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE,
8 PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU ARE MUTED MADAM CHAIR.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK
13 FOR PLEASE OUR CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER
24 IS ABSENT. MILEY IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

25



November 10, 2021

1 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

8

9 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. NEXT. OKAY. SORRY ABOUT

18 THAT. LET ME JUST GET BACK TO WHERE WE NEED TO BE. OUR NEXT

19 ITEM I WOULD LIKE EVERYBODY TO JOIN IN THE PLEDGE OF

20 ALLEGIANCE, AND I MAY TURN TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN TO LEAD US IN

21 THAT PLEDGE?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** GLADLY. THANK YOU. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I

24 PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,



November 10, 2021

1 AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
2 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. WE'LL MOVE ON
5 NOW TO OUR COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
8 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
9 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
10 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
11 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
12 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. NEXT ITEM IS THE
15 CONSENT CALENDAR. I WANT TO ASK, FIRST OF ALL, IF THERE ARE
16 ANY MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE WHO WOULD LIKE TO REMOVE ANY
17 ITEMS FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR. KIMBERLY YOU HAVE RECEIVED
18 COMMENTS OR REQUESTS TO RESUME ANY ITEMS FROM THE CONSENT
19 CALENDAR.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
22 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
23 ON THIS ITEM.

24



November 10, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I SEE NO COMMITTEE MEMBERS WITH THEIR HAND
2 RAISED. I WOULD LOVE TO ENTERTAIN A MOTION AND SECOND TO
3 APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVES APPROVAL.

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CHAVEZ SECONDS.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. SECOND BY
10 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. MAY WE PLEASE HAVE ROLL CALL.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:**

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS ABSENT.

19 COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

24

25 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
5 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ITEM 5A UPDATE ON THE BAY AREA FASTRAK
8 EQUITY ACTION PLAN AND THE FASTRAK POLICY CHANGES. LYSA HALE
9 WILL BE PRESENTING THIS ITEM. NOW MAY I PLEASE TURN TO STAFF
10 FOR THE PRESENTATION.

11

12 **LYSA HALE:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONER. I AM HAPPY TODAY TO TALK
13 ABOUT BAY AREA EQUITY TOLLING. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE
14 DETAILED ACTION THE PLAN IS EXPLORING. AS YOU RECALL WE WERE
15 HERE LAST MONTH AND YOU TOOK THE IMPORTANT STEP OF REDUCING
16 VIOLATION PENALTIES. WE ALSO HEARD FROM YOU ABOUT YOUR
17 PRIORITIES I AM HERE TO ASK YOU TO APPROVE ACTION ON THREE
18 ITEMS THAT WE MENTIONED TO YOU IN OCTOBER AND UPDATE YOU ON
19 THE NEXT SET OF PLANS WE WILL BE BRINGING TO YOU. NEXT SLIDE.
20 NEXT I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT WHAT WE HEARD FROM COMMISSIONERS
21 AND THE PUBLIC. WE WANT TO YOU KNOW THAT WE HEARD WHAT YOU
22 SAID. AND WE'LL USE THIS TO HELP INFORM THE NEXT STEPS OF THIS
23 PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT WE HEARD FROM YOU IS THAT PENALTIES
24 AND FEES CAN GROW TO UNAFFORDABLE LEVELS AND CUSTOMERS NEED
25 OPTIONS TO RESOLVE ISSUES AND MANAGE THEIR DEBT. WE MUST MAKE



November 10, 2021

1 DELIBERATE EFFORTS TO EVERY ONE GAUGE PRIORITY COMMUNITIES ON
2 THE POLICIES THAT WE PROPOSE. OUR POLICIES MUST UPON HELP
3 THOSE GREATEST IN NEED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE KEEPING COST
4 BENEFIT ANALYSIS IN MINDS AND USING BASELINE DATA TO HELP WITH
5 OUR DECISION MAKING AND TOOLS TO ALLOW MEASURING EFFECTIVENESS
6 AND ACTIONS. WE NEED TO STREAMLINE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCES AND
7 COMMUNICATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. SO NOW I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE ON TO
8 THE ACTIONS THAT WE'RE ASKING YOU TO TAKE TODAY. NEXT SLIDE.
9 WE'RE HERE TODAY TO GET APPROVAL TO MAKE THREE IMPORTANT
10 POLICY CHANGES TO MAKE FASTRAK MORE AFFORDABLE AND TO MOVE
11 PEOPLE AWAY FROM VIOLATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THERE ARE THREE
12 POLICIES THAT WE'RE RECOMMENDING BE CHANGED. THE FIRST IS
13 REDUCING THE FASTRAK TOLL TAG DEPOSIT FROM \$20 TO \$5. THOSE
14 WHO HAVE ALREADY PAID THE HIGHER AMOUNT FOR THEIR TAG DEPOSIT
15 WILL BE CREDITED THE DIFFERENCE IN THEIR ACCOUNT, \$15. SECOND
16 CHANGES REDUCING OPENING BALANCE REQUIRED OF CASH USERS FROM
17 \$50 TO \$25 WHICH IS THE SAME AS CREDIT CARD USERS. AND THE
18 THIRD ELIMINATES FEES FOR USING THE CASH PAYMENT NETWORK.
19 STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THESE CHANGES IN RESOLUTION 52 REVISED,
20 THE DOCUMENT THAT GUIDES OUR FASTRAK POLICIES BE REFERRED TO
21 THE FULL AUTHORITY FOR APPROVAL. NEXT SLIDE. NOW, WE NEED
22 CONDUENT OUR FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER CONTRACTOR TO
23 IMPLEMENT THESE CHANGES. SO WE'RE ASKING TO YOU APPROVE A
24 CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER IN THE AMOUNT OF \$150,000. THIS AMOUNT
25 WILL FUND SYSTEM AND WEB SITE CHANGES, CHANGES TO



November 10, 2021

1 CORRESPONDENCE AND REPORTING, TESTING AND DEPLOYMENT, AND THE
2 TAG DEPOSIT CREDIT PROCESS THEY MENTIONED EARLIER. STAFF IS
3 RECOMMENDING THAT THIS COMMITTEE APPROVE THIS CONTRACT CHANGE
4 ORDER. NEXT SLIDE. NOW, I WOULD LIKE TO DIRECT YOUR ATTENTION
5 TO FUTURE ACTIONS. THERE ARE A LOT OF OTHER THINGS THAT WE'RE
6 GOING TO BE LOOKING AT IN THIS PROCESS, AND THAT'S WHAT I
7 WOULD LIKE TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT TODAY. BUT FIRST, I WOULD
8 LIKE TO SET A LITTLE CONTEXT. NEXT SLIDE. LOOKING AT WHERE
9 WE'RE SENDING VIOLATIONS, WE'RE SEEING AN OVERLAP WITH EQUITY
10 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. IT'S POTENTIALLY HARDER FOR THEM TO DEAL
11 WITH VIOLATIONS AND THAT UNDERSCORES THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING
12 HERE TODAY. WE LOOKED AT DATA FROM THE FIRST FOUR MONTHS OF
13 THIS YEAR, AND ABOUT 58% OF INVOICE WERE SENT TO A BAY AREA
14 ADDRESS. ABOUT HALF THOSE INVOICES WERE PAID, BUT THE OTHER
15 HALF RECEIVED A VIOLATION. OF THOSE, 1/3 WERE SENT TO AN
16 ADDRESS IN ONE OF MTC'S EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. THIS MAP
17 SHOWS THE TOP TEN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES WHERE VEHICLES
18 WITH VIOLATIONS ARE REGISTERED BY NUMBER OF VIOLATIONS. WE
19 PLAN TO DIG DEEPER INTO THE DATA TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THE
20 ISSUE. NEXT SLIDE. AS I ALREADY DESCRIBED, THIS MONTH'S
21 PROPOSED CHANGES ARE DESIGNED TO INCREASE AFFORDABILITY. AS
22 YOU RECALL, LAST MONTH, WE DISCUSSED MAKING TOLLING MORE
23 ACCESSIBLE, ESPECIALLY BY REDUCING THE VIOLATION PENALTIES.
24 WE HAVE NOW KNOCKED OUT THE NEXT BATCH OF ASSESSMENTS WE'RE
25 ARE UNDERTAKING POTENTIALLY EXTENDING PAYMENT DUE DATES



November 10, 2021

1 POTENTIALLY ESTABLISHING A HARDSHIP CLAIM PROGRAM AND A
2 PAYMENT PROGRAM. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT WHAT WE NEED TO BE DOING
3 IN OUR ASSESSMENTS. NEXT SLIDE. FIRST WE NEED TO LOOK AT OUR
4 GUIDING PRINCIPLES. WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THE FOLLOWING. MUST BE
5 MEANINGFUL CHANGE, FAIRNESS, PROTECTION FROM FRAUD, AND A COST
6 BENEFIT BALANCE. THEN WE NEED TO LOOK AT HOW WE OPERATIONALIZE
7 POLICY ASKING QUESTIONS SUCH AS HOW DO WE PRIORITIZE THIS WORK
8 AND HOW DO WE TAKE IDEAS TO REAL LIFE OPERATIONS. ARE THERE
9 PITFALLS AND HOW CAN OUR VISION OF OPERATIONS INFORM THE
10 DEVELOPMENT OF SOUNDS POLICIES? NEXT SLIDE. WE NEED TO TAKE A
11 NUMBER OF FACTORS INTO CONSIDERATION WHEN WE CONDUCT OUR
12 ASSESSMENTS. WHAT WILL IT COST? AND WHERE WILL THIS FUNDING
13 COME FROM? WHAT'S THE IMPACT ON REVENUE, AND ARE THERE LEGAL
14 IMPLICATIONS TO THIS CHANGE. WILL IT REQUIRE CHANGES TO LEGAL
15 DOCUMENTS SUCH AS OUR USER AGREEMENT. WHAT WE NEED TO CHANGE
16 IN OUR EXISTING CONTRACT OR DEVELOP A NEW ONE. PRIVACY OR DATA
17 SECURITY IMPLICATIONS. HOW WILL THIS CHANGE BENEFIT EQUITY
18 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND CHANGE IMPACT IN CALIFORNIA AGENCIES
19 AND FINALLY INPUT FROM EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES ABOUT THIS
20 CHANGE. NEXT SLIDE. I WANTED TO USE OUR NEXT THREE BATCHES OF
21 POLICY ASSESSMENTS TO ILLUSTRATE SOME OF THE QUESTIONS WE NEED
22 TO ANSWER, STARTING WITH GIVING PEOPLE MORE TIME TO PAY THEIR
23 INVOICES AND VIOLATIONS SUCH AS GIVING EVERYONE 45 DAYS TO
24 PAY. SOME OF THE QUESTIONS ARE, "HOW LONG THE EXTENSION PERIOD
25 SHOULD BE?" "HOW WOULD CUSTOMERS BENEFIT?" "DOES THIS IMPACT



November 10, 2021

1 REVENUE COLLECTION?" AND "DO POLICIES NEED TO BE REGIONAL?"
2 NEXT SLIDE. "FOR A FINANCIAL HARDSHIP CLAIM PROGRAM, HOW WILL
3 HARDSHIP POLICIES BE ADMINISTERED TO ENSURE PEOPLE WHO NEED IT
4 THE MOST ACTUALLY BENEFIT?" "WHAT MEASURES SHOULD WE PUT INTO
5 PLACE TO ENSURE FAIRNESS?" AND "HOW IS HARDSHIP DEFINED?" "WHO
6 WILL MANAGE AND OVERSEE THE HARDSHIP CASES?" NEXT SLIDE.
7 FINALLY, WE'RE CONSIDERING OFFERING A PAYMENT PLAN FOR THOSE
8 WITH SUBSTANTIAL TOLL DEBT. WHAT TYPE OF PAYMENT PLAN OR PLANS
9 WILL BENEFIT THE MOST PEOPLE WHO NEED RELIEF? WHO WILL QUALIFY
10 FOR THIS PROGRAM? HOW WOULD A PAYMENT PLAN BE STRUCTURED TO
11 ALLOW PEOPLE TO AFFORDABILITY PAY DOWN DEBT? AND WHAT HAPPENS
12 TO CUSTOMERS WHO NEED TO CONTINUE TO USE THE TOLL FACILITIES?
13 THESE ARE JUST SOME OF THE QUESTIONS THAT WE'LL NEED TO
14 EXPLORE AND ANSWER AS WE WORK ON THESE THREE AREAS. NEXT
15 SLIDE. I WILL JUST CLOSE BY SHARING THE TIMELINE SLIDE WITH
16 YOU AGAIN. NOTE THAT WE ARE STILL IN THE INITIAL ACTIONS
17 PLANNING PHASE, BUT THE FIRST CHANGES WILL GO INTO EFFECT IN
18 EARLY DECEMBER WHEN VIOLATION PENALTIES ARE REDUCED. WE PLAN
19 TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON THE PLANNING AND DEPLOYMENT IN PHASES
20 THROUGH THIS PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE. FOR OUR NEXT STEPS, WE
21 WILL CONTINUE TO WORK TO ESTABLISH BASELINES TO HELP INFORM
22 OUR EVALUATION. WE'RE CLOSE TO SECURING A COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
23 CONSULTANT, AND WE WILL CONTINUE OUR POLICY REVIEW FOR THESE
24 ADDITIONAL CHANGES AS WELL AS OTHERS. WE WILL REPORT BACK IN



November 10, 2021

1 JANUARY WITH AN UPDATE ON WHERE WE ARE. NEXT SLIDE. AND WITH
2 THAT, I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** LYSA, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT
5 PRESENTATION. I WILL FIRST TURN TO THE COMMITTEE TO SEE IF
6 YOU HAVE QUESTIONS, COMMISSIONER RONEN, JOSEFOWITZ, AND
7 CHAVEZ, JUST WATCHING THOSE HANDS POP-UP.

8

9 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FIRST OF ALL, I'M SO
10 EXCITED AND IMPRESSED BY THIS WORK. I KNOW THERE HAS BEEN A
11 LOT OF WORK PUT INTO THIS. THERE HAS BEEN MANY LEADERS BOTH ON
12 THE COMMISSION AND STAFF HAVE DONE THIS, AND I JUST WANT TO
13 REALLY THANK YOU FROM THE BOTTOM OF MY HEART. THIS IS REAL
14 EQUITY WORK. AND I APPRECIATE THAT. THERE IS ONE THING THAT I
15 AM PARTICULARLY CONCERNED ABOUT, BROUGHT IT UP A NUMBER OF
16 TIMES THAT I WANTED TO GET SOME CLARITY ON TODAY, AND THAT IS,
17 I REALLY BELIEVE IN THE PAYMENT PLAN PROCESS FOR PEOPLE WHO
18 HAVE ACCUMULATED DEBT. YOU KNOW, I HAVE DONE A LITTLE BIT OF
19 WORK IN THIS AREA. I KNOW THAT THESE PAYMENT PLANS WORK, THAT
20 WHEN YOU ACTUALLY TREAT PEOPLE THAT ARE HAVING FINANCIAL
21 PROBLEMS, AS HUMAN BEINGS THAT WILL EVENTUALLY PAY THEIR DEBT
22 WHEN THEY CAN PAY THEIR DEBT AND DO IT IN WAYS -- AND MEET
23 THEM WHERE THEY'RE AT THAT, IT ACTUALLY WORKS. THERE HAVE BEEN
24 STUDIES, ONE FROM THE WATER ALLIANCE ANALYZED A PAYMENT PLAN
25 SYSTEM IN LOUISVILLE KENTUCKY IN THEIR WATER SYSTEM, AND IN



November 10, 2021

1 LOUISVILLE, THE WATER SYSTEM INCREASED THEIR ACCOUNTS PAYABLE
2 BY TWO THIRDS WHEN THEY INITIATED A PAYMENT PLAN PROCESS. SO,
3 THERE IS REAL DATA OUT THERE THAT, NOT ONLY IS THIS BETTER FOR
4 INDIVIDUALS, BUT IT'S MUCH BETTER FOR THE AGENCY IN TERMS OF
5 THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT WE'RE ABLE TO COLLECT. SO IT'S A WIN-
6 WIN WIN PROPOSITION. SO I AM PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN THE
7 PAYMENT PLAN WORK GOING FORWARD, AND I WANT TO MAKE CLEAR THAT
8 I BELIEVE THAT THAT PAYMENT PLAN SHOULD BE AVAILABLE TO PEOPLE
9 WITH ACCUMULATED DEBT, AND THAT IT SHOULD BE AVAILABLE ON ALL
10 DEBT, THAT THERE SHOULD BE NO DIFFERENCE BETWEEN, YOU KNOW,
11 DEBT THAT IS ACCUMULATED BASED ON SCIENCE, AND DEBT THAT'S
12 ACCUMULATED BASED ON THE UNDERLYING TOLL. TO AN INDIVIDUAL
13 THAT HAS DEBT THERE, IS NO DIFFERENCE. AND SO THERE SHOULD BE
14 NO DIFFERENCE, YOU KNOW, TO THIS AGENCY. AND IF WE MEET PEOPLE
15 WHERE THEY'RE AT, IF WE GIVE THEM PAYMENT OPTIONS THAT THEY
16 CAN MEET, THEN WE'RE GOING TO RECOVER MUCH MORE MONEY THAN
17 OTHERWISE. AND SO, IT'S JUST NOT CLEAR TO ME IN THE DOCUMENTS
18 THAT YOU GAVE US TODAY, THAT THAT'S WHAT WE'RE STUDYING, AND
19 THAT'S WHAT WE'RE CONSIDERING, AND THAT THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
20 CONSIDERING GOING FORWARD. AND THAT IS -- THAT'S SOMETHING
21 THAT IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO ME, AND I ABSOLUTELY THINK WE
22 SHOULD MAKE CLEAR AND SPECIFIC, THIS THAT'S THE PLAN MAKING
23 GOING FORWARD.
24



November 10, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, AND I
2 SEE AFTER COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ THAT CHAIR PEDROZA ALSO HAS HIS
3 HAND UP.

4
5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU, CHAIR WORTH. AND SIMILAR
6 SENTIMENTS TO COMMISSIONER RONEN. I THINK THIS IS REALLY
7 EXCITING TO SEE THIS WORK GO FORWARD, AND I KNOW THAT STAFF
8 HAS PUT IN A HUGE AMOUNT OF WORK INTO THIS AND, SORT OF,
9 DEEPLY THOUGHT ABOUT IT, AND YOU KNOW, WE BOTH NEED TO MOVE
10 FAST AND DO IN A WAY WHICH IS RIGHT. AND SO I THINK THAT IT'S
11 -- I'M EXCITED TO SEE SOME OF THESE OPTIONS COME BACK IN
12 JANUARY WITH MORE DETAIL AROUND THEM. I WANTED TO ECHO WHAT
13 COMMISSIONER RONEN SAID ABOUT PAYMENT PLANS. I THINK IT IS --
14 NO ONE -- VERY FEW PEOPLE ARE GOING TO WANT TO -- GO ON AN MTC
15 PAYMENT PLAN JUST BECAUSE THAT I WANT A LITTLE BIT OF SHORT-
16 TERM DEBT. THE PEOPLE GOING ON MTC PAYMENT PLANS ARE GOING ON
17 THE PAYMENT PLANS BECAUSE THEY CAN'T AFFORD TO PAY THE MTC
18 BALANCES. SO I THINK IF WE MAKE PEOPLE JUMP THROUGH A HUGE
19 NUMBER OF HOOPS IN TERMS OF INCOME QUALIFICATIONS AND THINGS
20 LIKE THAT, I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE, SORT OF, SHUTTING OUT A
21 NUMBER OF PEOPLE -- A LOT OF PEOPLE OUT FROM BEING ABLE TO
22 BENEFIT FROM THESE. AND MAKING THAT FIRST PAYMENT AS SMALL AS
23 POSSIBLE, OR AT WHATEVER LEVEL THE PEOPLE CAN PAY, I SHOULD
24 SAY -- NOT SMALL AS POSSIBLE, BUT A PAYMENT PLAN WHERE YOU CAN
25 GET PEOPLE ON TO THE PAYMENT PLAN BECAUSE THEY MOVE FROM



November 10, 2021

1 HAVING AN INVOICE WHICH THEY CAN'T PAY AND FEEL THEY CAN NEVER
2 PAY TO AN INVOICE TO WHICH THAT FIRST PAYMENT OF A PAYMENT
3 PLAN THAT SEEMS MANAGEABLE. THAT'S THE MOST IMPORTANT STEP OF
4 A PAYMENT PLAN. AND, SO, I HOPE THAT, YOU KNOW, AS STAFF IS
5 ANALYZING A, SORT OF, WHAT I THINK COMMISSIONER RONEN
6 DESCRIBED, AS WHAT IS BEST PRACTICE, WITH, SORT OF, UTILITIES,
7 AND OTHERS WHO HAVE A LOT OF CUSTOMERS ON PAYMENT PLANS, AS
8 PART OF WHAT -- AS PART OF WHAT'S GOING TO COME BACK, I THINK
9 THAT IT'S TERRIFIC THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT, SORT OF, HARDSHIP,
10 AND GIVING PEOPLE THE OPPORTUNITY TO, LIKE THEY DO WHEN THEY
11 GO TO -- WHEN THEY GOT TRAFFIC TICKETS, TO CLAIM HARDSHIPS, I
12 THINK THAT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT ELEMENT. I HOPE AGAIN WE CAN
13 RELY AND LOOK TO BEST PRACTICES ELSEWHERE AND A CALIFORNIA
14 COURT SYSTEM HAS A PROGRAM WHERE IT HAS AUTOMATED HARDSHIP
15 CLAIMS FOR TRAFFIC TICKETS. AND I THINK IT WORKS PRETTY WELL.
16 THE FEEDBACK YOU GET FROM GROUPS WHO REPRESENT IMPACTED
17 POPULATIONS SAY THAT IT WORKS REALLY WELL, AND I HOPE WE CAN,
18 SORT OF, DRAW ON THOSE BEST PRACTICES AROUND HARDSHIP CLAIMS
19 AND NOT TRY TO REINVENT THE WHEEL. THE BEST REINTERVENTION OF
20 THE REAL, THE BEST, WHEN WE LOOK TO THE TOLL SPACE AND BAY
21 AREA, WHO HAVE DONE EACH OF THESE THINGS SUPER WELL. AND THIS
22 DOESN'T HAVE TO COME BACK IN JANUARY, MAYBE IT COMES BACK IN
23 MARCH OR ONE OF THE OTHER QUARTERLY UPDATES I KNOW THERE IS A
24 LOT OF TEED UP WORK IN JANUARY, PART OF PEOPLE GETTING AWAY
25 FROM VIOLATIONS IS FIGURING OUT A BENEFIT NOTIFICATION SYSTEM.



November 10, 2021

1 AND RIGHT NOW WE'RE SENDING PEOPLE MAIL NOTICES. AND THAT
2 DOESN'T WORK. AND WE HAVE TO DO THAT BY LAW. AND I KNOW,
3 UNLESS WE CHANGE THE LAW WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO KEEP ON DOING
4 THAT. BUT THAT SHOULD BE THE VERY -- THE PACE LINE. BECAUSE
5 MAIL VIOLATIONS DON'T WORK REALLY WELL FOR YOUNG PEOPLE, FOR
6 LOW-INCOME PEOPLE WHO ARE MOVING AROUND A LOT, THEY CERTAINLY
7 DON'T WORK FOR UNHOUSED PEOPLE. AND I NOW BECAUSE I SPEAK UP A
8 LOT IN THESE MEETINGS I HAVE PEOPLE WHO MAIL ME COMPLAINTS
9 ABOUT BATA VIOLATIONS SO I'M IN THAT WORK NOW, I'M ONE OF THE
10 CUSTOMER SERVICE AGENTS SOMETIMES. AND YOU HAVE PEOPLE WHO ARE
11 CHANGING THEIR ADDRESS AT THE DMV, BUT THEY ONLY CHANGE IT ON
12 THEIR LICENSE, NOT ON THEIR VEHICLE REGISTRATION. AND THEY
13 NEED -- AND, LIKE, YOU KNOW -- YOU HAVE FIGURE OUT YOU HAVE TO
14 CHANGE YOUR ADDRESS IN TWO PLACES BECAUSE THAT'S THE DATABASE
15 WE PULL, FROM WE PULL FROM THE VEHICLE REGISTRATION DATABASE,
16 NOT LICENSE DATABASE. SO THEY'RE LIKE, I HAVE UPDATED MY
17 ADDRESS WITH DMV, AND IT'S LIKE, NO YOU HAVEN'T NOT AT THE
18 RIGHT PLACE AT DMV. NEW JERSEY HAS REALLY PIONEERED THE
19 TOLLING SPACE IF WE CAN GET, FIND WAYS TO BE PROACTIVE ABOUT
20 PEOPLE THE WAY COLLECTION AGENCIES ARE, THEY LOOK PEOPLE UP IN
21 THE PHONE BOOK, YOU KNOW? THEY TRY AND FIND PEOPLE ONLINE.
22 THEY LOOK AND SEE IF THEY HAVE HAD A CHANGE OF ADDRESS WITH
23 THE US POSTAL SERVICE, YOU KNOW, THERE IS LOTS OF WAYS THAT WE
24 CAN BE PROACTIVE ABOUT TRYING TO FIND PEOPLE, AND THEN LETTING
25 THEM KNOW, BEFORE WE -- YOU KNOW, AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE, THAT



November 10, 2021

1 THEY HAVE CROSSED THE BRIDGE, AND THEY HAVE -- AND THEY DON'T
2 HAVE A -- AND THEY HAVEN'T SIGNED UP TO HAVE AN AUTOMATIC
3 PAYMENT OR THEIR CREDIT CARD IS EXPIRED OR WHATEVER IT IS, I
4 THINK THAT'S GOING TO KEEP PEOPLE OFF THE VIOLATION TRACK, AND
5 UNFORTUNATELY SOME OF THE SYSTEMS WE DON'T HAVE CONTROL OVER,
6 BUT I HOPE AT SOME POINT THAT COMES BACK AS WELL AS SOMETHING
7 THAT GETS ANALYZED.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS. AND I
10 KNOW -- UNDERSTAND, THAT WE ALL GET CALLS FROM CUSTOMERS TO
11 RAISE ISSUES. SO, ABSOLUTELY. THANK YOU FOR THOSE SUGGESTIONS.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I'LL FORWARD MY CALLS TO YOU, COMMISSIONER
14 WORTH.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I KNOW, ABSOLUTELY. SO, THANK YOU. THANK YOU
17 FOR THOSE COMMENTS. WELL TAKEN IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT NEXT
18 STEPS. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO START BY JUST TALKING
21 ABOUT THE OCTOBER KEY TAKEAWAYS THEN I WANT TO COME BACK TO
22 THE DISCUSSION WE'RE HAVING RIGHT NOW. THERE ARE TWO ISSUES
23 THAT WE HEARD LOUD AND CLEAR ONE OF THEM IS MAKING IT VERY
24 EASY FOR PEOPLE TO SIGN UP IN THE FIRST PLACE. AND I KNOW
25 CHAIR PEDROZA SAID THAT ABOUT 13 TIMES. AND THE REASON I'M



November 10, 2021

1 ADDING IT IN HERE IS I THINK ANY SCOPE OF WORK SHOULD BE
2 INCLUSIVE. SCOPE OF WORK ESPECIALLY LOOKING AT CURRENT OR NEW
3 CONTRACTOR THAT THERE IS A MECHANISM FOR AUTOMATION. FOR
4 EXAMPLE, IF YOU GET A FINE OR WE'RE GOING SEND YOU A LETTER
5 TELLING YOU OWE US MONEY WE SHOULD AUTOMATICALLY SIGN UP THERE
6 SHOULD BE MECHANISM FOR OPTING IN OR OUT WHATEVER WE LEGALLY
7 ARE ALLOWED TO DO TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR PEOPLE, LIKE AMAZON
8 WOULD, YOU CAN BARELY AVOID THEM. AND THE SECOND THING I
9 WANTED TO ADD TO THAT LIST IS THAT YOU WROTE HERE A STREAMLINE
10 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND COMMUNICATIONS ARE CRITICAL. I THINK
11 MORE DIRECTLY WHAT PEOPLE WERE TELLING US WAS WE NEEDED
12 IMPROVED CUSTOMER SERVICE. PERIOD. AND WE SHOULD JUST SAY IT
13 THAT WAY. BECAUSE PEOPLE NEED TO UNDERSTAND THAT WE HEARD
14 THEM. THAT OUR PROCESSES ARE DIFFICULT, AND E-MAILS AND FOLKS
15 THAT WE'RE GETTING FROM THEIR INTERACTION ARE -- YOU KNOW,
16 PEOPLE ARE -- I MEAN, IF E-MAILS COULD YELL, THE E-MAILS --
17 AND YOU MUST BE GETTING THEM TOO. WE REALLY NEED TO BE UPFRONT
18 WE NEED TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER SERVICE AND THESE ARE THE AREAS WE
19 NEED TO DO IT. TO GO BACK TO THE AREA HOW TO ADDRESS FOLKS
20 WITH LITTLE RESOURCES. IS IT -- YOU KNOW, EVEN PUTTING \$25 IN
21 A BANK FURNISHINGS DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW TO DO IT, CAN BE VERY
22 CHALLENGING. SO I -- I THINK THAT, AS WE'RE LOOKING AT A
23 PARTNER TO HELP ON A PAYMENT PLAN THAT, WE SHOULD BE INCLUDING
24 THE TOLLS, AND ANY FINES OR FEES THAT ARE PART OF THAT
25 PACKAGE, AS -- AND I THINK IT WOULD BE EASIER THEN, TO SEND



November 10, 2021

1 SOMEONE -- THE READER, AND THEN TO GET PEOPLE SIGNED UP, AS
2 ALFREDO HAS ASKED US TO DO. AND THAT THE -- AND THAT WE
3 PRIORITIZE THIS. THE CUSTOMER SERVICE COMPONENT, AND THE
4 MANAGED PAYMENT PLAN, TO ME, ARE JOB, 1 AND 2, THAT NEED TO BE
5 PRIORITIZED. SO, I -- I'M VERY ANXIOUS THAT -- THAT WE
6 DEMONSTRATE THAT WE'RE LISTENING TO PEOPLE BY ACTUALLY
7 RESPONDING TO THEM AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. AND THEN, THE LAST
8 THING I JUST WANT TO ADD, I THINK THE POINT -- NICK, I HADN'T
9 THOUGHT OF THE POINT YOU RAISED ABOUT NOTIFICATION -- AND I
10 WOULD ACTUALLY TRY TO EMBED THAT INTO THE SCOPE OF WORK FOR
11 THE -- EITHER THE CURRENT SERVICE PROVIDER THAT WE HAVE THAT'S
12 MANAGING THE SYSTEM THAT WE'RE DOING THOSE RECORDS MATCHING OR
13 THAT THE FOLKS WHO ARE DOING THE PAYMENT PLAN COLLECTION WORK
14 FOR US INCLUDE THAT IN THEIR BODY OF WORK. I KNOW THAT WE HAVE
15 SIMILAR PROCESSES AT OUR COUNTY FOR OUR HEALTH CARE SYSTEM,
16 WHERE WE'RE -- WE HAVE BOTH THE HARDSHIP PROGRAM, BUT WE ALSO
17 WORK WITH OUTSIDE VENDORS TO HELP US FIND INFORMATION FOR
18 PEOPLE, SO WE CAN AT LEAST COMMUNICATE WITH THEM BEFORE
19 ANYBODY'S CREDIT GETS DAMAGED, ESPECIALLY BECAUSE FOLKS ARE
20 SERVING SO LOW-INCOME. SO I WOULD JUST REALLY ENCOURAGE US TO
21 SEE IF WE CAN'T EMBED THAT INTO THE SCOPE OF WORK OF A NEW
22 PARTNER. THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THE RESEARCH. THIS WAS
23 REALLY EXCEPTIONALLY DONE. THANK YOU.
24



November 10, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ FOR
2 YOUR COMMENTS, AND ALSO FOR THE OPPORTUNITY -- YOU KNOW, THE
3 SUGGESTIONS IN TERMS OF WHAT WE CAN INCORPORATE AS WE MOVE TO
4 THE NEXT STEPS. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. TURNING TO CHAIR
5 PEDROZA?

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH. AND, AGAIN, THANK YOU,
8 STAFF. I THINK THE PRESENTATION CAME OUT VERY WELL IN TERMS.
9 JUST ON FASTRAK NO SURPRISE FIRST GOAL CONVERSION HOW DO WE
10 GET FOLKS ON TO FASTRAK, I THINK THAT IS THE UNIVERSAL GOAL. I
11 THINK REDUCING THE FEE TO 25, BUT REALLY TAKING THE TIME TO
12 UNDERSTAND THOSE FOLKS WHO HAVE NOT BEEN ABLE TO CONVERT, WHAT
13 ARE THE INCENTIVES? WHAT ARE THE HINDRANCES? IS IT OPENING UP
14 A BANK ACCOUNT? WHAT IS IT THAT'S STANDING IN THE WAY? I THINK
15 TAKING A DEEP DIVE IN TERMS OF FOCUS GROUPS WOULD BE VERY
16 VALUABLE BECAUSE I KNOW THERE COULD BE ASSUMPTIONS OR
17 PERCEPTIONS AROUND UNDOCUMENTED COMMUNITY MEMBERS NOT BEING
18 ABLE TO OPEN UP AN ACCOUNT OR HAVE A CREDIT CARD OR DEBIT CARD
19 THERE ARE FINANCIAL CONSTITUTIONS THAT WOULD BE WILLING TO DO
20 THAT WE BANK WITH MANY OF THEM TO CREATE SOME TYPE OF PROGRAM
21 TO MINIMIZE THE FIERCE OF BECOMING BANKABLE. IF WE'RE TALKING
22 ABOUT THE UNBANKABLE COMMUNITY. REALLY INTERESTED IN TAKING A
23 DEEP DIVE ON THAT CONVERSION TO FASTRAK. ON THE PAYMENT PLAN,
24 YOU KNOW, LOOK, I THINK THIS IS IMPORTANTLY THE RIGHT THING TO
25 DO ON MANY LEVELS. I DO DIFFERENTIATE BETWEEN FEES AND TOLLS.



November 10, 2021

1 MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE TALK ABOUT PG&E, WATER
2 SERVICES, THOSE ARE PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE A CHOICE. AND IT'S
3 LIFE SAFETY. AND WE DO OFFER PAYMENT PLANS, IN THE SERVICE
4 CHARGE, I THINK TOLLS ARE A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT. FOLKS HAVE A
5 CHOICE IT DOESN'T MEAN WE DON'T NEED TO LOOK AT IT BUT WE NEED
6 TO BE MINDFUL OF THE IMPACTS TO THE ORGANIZATION WHEN WE TALK
7 ABOUT CREATING THE PAYMENT PLAN REVENUE WHAT DOES THAT DO TO
8 THE CREDIT WORLD WHEN THEY SEE THAT. WE HAVE TO MEASURE TWICE
9 AND CUT ONCE ON THIS. I THINK THE FEES AND VIOLATIONS
10 ABSOLUTELY WE HAVE GOT TO GET THAT GOING IT'S THE RIGHT THING
11 TO DO FOR ALL OF THE REASONS THAT HAVE BEEN OUTLINED BUT AGAIN
12 ON THE TOLLS I'M A LITTLE BIT MORE APPREHENSIVE OF DOING IT
13 TOO SOON -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ORGANIZATION. IF OTHER AGENCIES
14 ARE DOING IT, OTHER TOLL AGENCIES ARE DOING IT. IT WOULD BE
15 GREAT TO UNDERSTAND HOW THEY DID IT AND ANY CONCERNS THEY HAD.
16 AGAIN, IN TERMS OF THOSE COMMENTS, THE RIGHT THING TO DO.
17 MAYBE, CHAIR WORTH, I COULD ASK OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, IN
18 TERMS OF THE PLAN THAT'S LAID OUT RIGHT NOW, THERESE, IS IT
19 ALL ENCOMPASSING OR WE'RE DECIDING ABOUT TOOLS OR FEES
20 ANALYSIS?

21

22 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.
23 YOU'RE ASKING ABOUT OUR THINKING ON THE PAYMENT PLAN
24 SPECIFICALLY?

25



November 10, 2021

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CORRECT.

2

3 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SO, THE FOCUS OF THE PAYMENT PLAN IS ON
4 MANAGING THE A ACCUMULATED FEES. I THINK THERE IS A QUESTION
5 THAT'S BEEN RAISED ABOUT HOW TO DEAL WITH THE FACT THAT WE
6 HAVE A COMBINED INVOICE. AND SO -- AND SO, ON THAT SCORE, AND
7 THIS, SORT OF, GETS BACK, TO I THINK, A BROADER WRAP OF
8 QUESTIONS, WRAP UP SUMMARY I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE AFTER WE HEAR
9 FROM COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND OTHERS, IS, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A
10 WHOLE SERIES OF DUE DILIGENCE WE NEED TO DO. AND WHAT I WANT
11 TO, YOU KNOW, ARTICULATE AT THE END OF THIS IS, WHAT I EXPECT
12 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BRING TO YOU, WHAT OUR RESPONSIBILITY
13 AS STAFF WOULD BE TO BRING TO YOU IN TERMS OF DUE DILIGENCE ON
14 A NUMBER OF FACTORS MUCH OF WHICH WOULD ADDRESS THE POINTS
15 THAT YOU HAVE RAISED, IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, A SUGGESTED
16 APPROACH, WHAT THE IMPACTS ARE, AND HOW WE WOULD RECOMMEND THE
17 COMMISSION DEAL WITH THEM. AND THAT IS ONE WHERE THIS
18 DISTINCTION ABOUT, WHAT ARE ALL THE FACTORS ON THAT
19 DIFFERENTIATION BETWEEN A BASE TOLL VERSUS TOLLS AND PENALTIES
20 IN DIFFERENT CIRCUMSTANCES WOULD CLEARLY FIT INTO THAT
21 ANALYSIS THAT WE WOULD BE DOING. SO WE'RE VERY CLEAR ON WHAT
22 POTENTIAL IMPACTS WOULD BE.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOT IT. THANK YOU THERESE. THANK YOU CHAIR
25 WORTH.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOOD. THANK YOU CHAIR. THANK YOU THERESE. I
3 KNOW WHEN WE FINISH ALL THE COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND
4 QUESTIONS YOU WILL KIND OF COME BACK AND PROVIDE SOME WRAP UP
5 CLARIFICATIONS IN SUMMARY. SO, THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND LET ME
6 TURN TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN, AND I SEE COMMISSIONER RONEN ALSO
7 HAS HER HAND UP.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH. AND THANK YOU, STAFF, THIS
10 IS AMAZING WE'RE HEADING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. AS NOTED BY
11 MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS, WE DO HAVE A LONG WAY TO GO, I THINK.
12 I DO THINK THE SUCCESS OF THIS DEPENDS ON THE DATA WE COLLECT.
13 AND I THINK WHAT WAS POINTED OUT HERE, TOO, IS THE HUMANITY OF
14 HOW WE APPROACH THIS. SO, ONE THING, IF YOU'RE CROSSING A
15 BRIDGE, AND OH, LIKE, I FORGOT MY FASTRAK OR SOMETHING LIKE
16 THAT -- IT'S JUST LIKE A NOTIFICATION -- IS THERE A HOTLINE OR
17 WEB SITE YOU CAN SEE GOING IN THIS DIRECTION AND THAT
18 DIRECTION WHERE SOMEBODY COULD REACH OUT TO SAY, OH, YOU KNOW,
19 IN FEAR OF PENALTIES AND FEES AND ALL OF THAT, JUST ANOTHER
20 WAY TO COMMUNICATE WITH PEOPLE AND TRY THE OUTREACH HERE. WE
21 DO HAVE A PARTNERSHIP WITH THE DMV SO THAT THEY ARE TELLING
22 PEOPLE WHO CHANGED THE ADDRESS ON THEIR LICENSE REMINDING THEM
23 THEY SHOULD DO THAT ON THEIR VEHICLE REGISTRATION AS WELL.
24 COMMUNITY OUTREACH, OR ACTUALLY, IN THE DATA ASPECT, TOO, I
25 HOPE WE ARE TRACKING LANGUAGE BARRIERS, IF SOMEONE IS



November 10, 2021

1 CONTACTING US WHO -- WHAT LANGUAGE NEEDS DO THEY HAVE. BECAUSE
2 THAT MAY SHOW US A PATTERN OF SOME SORT, AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
3 TRYING TO ACHIEVE HERE AS WELL. I AM VERY INTERESTED IN THE
4 COMMUNITY OUTREACH CONSULTANT. BECAUSE WE HAVE DIFFERENT
5 COMMUNITIES OF NEED, AS WAS POINTED OUT BY SOME OF THE
6 COMMISSIONERS. SO, I WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN THAT WORKS,
7 AND HOW WE AS JURISDICTIONS CAN HELP ALONG THOSE LINES. WE SEE
8 COUNTY FAIRS. DO WE HAVE A BOOTH THERE? DO WE -- JUST
9 ANYTHING, CHURCH FESTIVALS. THE MORE PEOPLE WE CAN REACH THE
10 MORE SUCCESS WE CAN HAVE HERE. I HOPE THAT COMES BACK TO US AS
11 WE MOVE FORWARD HERE. I REALLY APPLAUD EVERYBODY HERE AND THE
12 EFFORTS MADE TO WORK TOGETHER AND ALWAYS MAKING THIS BETTER.
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU, THANK YOU COMMISSIONER.
16 TURNING BACK TO COMMISSIONER RONEN AND THEN COMMISSIONER
17 SPERING.

18

19 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU. IS IT OKAY IF I SPEAK AGAIN?

20

21 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** PLEASE DO ABSOLUTELY.

22

23 **HILLARY RONEN:** I UNDERSTAND I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE EVERYBODY A
24 CHANCE TO SPEAK FIRST. THANK YOU FOR THE FOLLOW UP, WITH ALL
25 DUE RESPECT TO OUR INCREDIBLE CHAIR, I JUST COULDN'T DISAGREE



November 10, 2021

1 MORE. AND I REALLY DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW YOU CAN DIFFERENT THE
2 FEE FROM THE UNDERLYING TOLL? I MEAN THE REASON THAT WE'RE ALL
3 ON MTC IS BECAUSE WE UNDERSTAND THAT TRANSPORTATION IS AS MUCH
4 OF A BASIC HUMAN NEED AS WATER. SO IF YOU LIVE ON ONE SIDES OF
5 THE BRIDGE AND YOU NEED TO GET TO WORK ON THE OTHER SIDE OF
6 THE BRIDGE, I HATE TO SAY IT, BUT IT'S AS EXPENSIVE TO TAKE
7 BART AND WHATEVER BUS YOU'RE TAKING THAN IT IS TO CROSS THE
8 BRIDGE AND WRAP UP THAT TOLL FEE. AND UNFORTUNATELY WE KNOW
9 HOW MANY -- NOT ONLY CALIFORNIANS, BUT BAY AREA IANS, BUT
10 AMERICANS LIVE PAYCHECK TO PAYCHECK. WE HEAR THE AWFUL
11 STATISTICS, I JUST LOOKED AT MY PHONE FOR THE LATEST ONE, ONLY
12 39% OF AMERICANS CAN AFFORD AN UNEXPECTED THOUSAND DOLLARS
13 BILL. THAT THE VAST MAJORITY OF AMERICANS CAN'T AFFORD THAT.
14 BECAUSE THE POVERTY, THE INEQUALITY, IN OUR REGION IS SO
15 EXTREME, ONLY GETTING WORSE, AND REALLY BAD. AND THAT'S WHY WE
16 HAVE THIS EQUITY PLAN. AND SO, TO SOMEONE WHO IS IN DEBT, TO
17 SOMEONE WHO CAN'T PAY THEIR BILLS, THE THERE THAT THEY'RE
18 PAYING FOR THE UNDERLYING TOLL IS THE SAME TO THEM AS THE
19 DOLLAR THEY'RE PAYING FOR THE FEE. THERE IS NO DIFFERENCE IN
20 THEIR MIND. THEY'RE DROWNING IN DEBT. SO IF WE ARE TRYING TO
21 CREATE AN EQUITY PLAN TO MAKE THEIR LIFE EASIER TO ADDRESS
22 THIS PROBLEM, IT -- THERE IS NO DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE AMOUNT
23 OWED IN TOLLS, IN THE AMOUNT OWED IN FEES. IN THAT PERSON'S
24 MIND AND WORLD. AND SO, YOU KNOW, TO ME, THIS IS SUCH AN
25 ESSENTIAL PART OF A PAYMENT PLAN PROGRAM THAT WE'RE



November 10, 2021

1 DEVELOPING, AND NOT ONLY IS THIS HUMANE AND TRUE EQUITY, BUT
2 ON TOP OF THAT, ALL THE STUDIES SHOW THAT WE WILL COVER MORE
3 MONEY AS MTC IF WE GIVE A PAYMENT PLAN THAN IF WE DON'T. SO
4 IT'S JUST REALLY, NO MATTER WHICH WAY YOU CUT IT OR LOOK AT
5 IT, IT MAKES SENSE TO CREATE THE PAYMENT PLAN FOR THE ENTIRE
6 DEBT, NO MATTER WHERE IT ORIGINATED, THAT DEBT ORIGINATED
7 FROM, AND ALSO, AND CINDY KEEPS REMINDING ME OF THIS, ALSO,
8 SHE GETS THE CREDIT FOR THIS POINT, IS THAT WE TOOK AWAY THE
9 CASH OPTION. SO THE WAY POOR PEOPLE LIVE IS, YOU KNOW, THEY
10 MIGHT HAVE FIVE BUCKS IN THEIR POCKET, THEY DO NOT HAVE ANY
11 MONEY IN THEIR BANK ACCOUNT, SO IF THEY'RE PASSING THE TOLL
12 BRIDGE THAT DAY THEY MIGHT BE ABLE TO PAY THE TOLL WITH THAT
13 \$5 IT JUST MEANS THEY'RE NOT GOING TO EAT DINNER THAT NIGHT.
14 BUT WE TOOK AWAY THAT OPTION SO THEY'RE ACCUMULATING THAT
15 DEBT, SO THAT NIGHT THEY'RE SPENDING MONEY BUYING DINNER. THEY
16 NO LONGER HAVE THAT FIVE BUCKS. THEY NO LONGER HAVE THE LUXURY
17 OF DIFFERENTIATING BECAUSE THEY ARE MEETING BASIC NEEDS ON A
18 DAY-TO-DAY BASIS AND GIVING UP BASIC NEEDS ON A DAY-TO-DAY
19 BASIS, BASED ON THE CASH THAT THEY HAVE IN THEIR POCKET AND
20 THE REALITIES THAT THEY'RE FACING FOR THE DAY. YOU KNOW, THERE
21 IS THAT SAYING, IT'S EXPENSIVE TO BE POOR. YOU KNOW,
22 EVERYTHING -- IT'S JUST, YOU ACCUMULATE DEBT MORE SO THAN
23 PEOPLE THAT CAN PAY, BECAUSE YOU'RE LITERALLY MAKING LIFE AND
24 DEATH DECISIONS EVERY DAY WITH WHAT TO DO WITH YOUR MEASLY 15
25 THERE PAYCHECK. YOU KNOW? [LAUGHTER] THAT DOESN'T EVEN MEET



November 10, 2021

1 YOUR HOUSING COST, LET ALONE YOUR FOOD NEEDS, AND
2 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS, AND YOUR UTILITY NEEDS AND KIDS NEEDS. I
3 REALLY HOPE IN THE TRUE SPIRIT OF EQUITY, THAT WE ARE LOOKING
4 AT THE SITUATION FROM THE POINT OF VIEW OF THE DEBT HOLDER,
5 WHO IS NOT WANTING THE VAST MAJORITY OF DEBT HOLDERS WOULD
6 LOVE TO PAY THEIR DEBT, THEY LITERAL CAN'T, THAT'S WHY THEY'RE
7 NOT PAYING. BECAUSE THEY LITERALLY DON'T HAVE THE MONEY. SO WE
8 HAVE TO THINK ABOUT IT FROM THAT POINT OF VIEW. IS TO THEM OF
9 THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN DEBT FOR FEES AND DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
10 DEBT FOR TOLLS IS IRRELEVANT.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER RONEN. AND I
13 THINK THAT WE'RE ALL MOVING IN THE SIMILAR DIRECTION, WHEN
14 SOMEBODY ACCUMULATES DEBT, HOW CAN WE EITHER HELP THEM LEARN
15 EARLY AND BEGIN PAYING FOR IT. SO I THINK WE MAY BE GETTING A
16 LITTLE BIT OF A MISCONNECTION IN TERMS OF WHAT PEOPLE'S INTENT
17 ARE. IN OTHER WORDS, WITH THE WHOLE COMMITTEE, SO I THINK WE
18 ARE ALL LOOKING AT THAT BROADER PICTURE, BECAUSE IF THEY OWE
19 MONEY FOR TEN TOLLS AND MONEY FOR FINES, WE NEED TO HELP
20 PEOPLE PAYING IT. THANK YOU FOR THAT, FOR THOSE COMMENTS. -- --
21 - WE'LL HAVE A CHANCE TO WRAP UP, TOO, TO KIND OF SEE WHERE WE
22 WANT TO GO. LET ME TURN TO COMMISSIONER SPERING.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, CHAIR WORTH. YOU KNOW, I THINK
25 THE TIMING OF THIS IS REALLY GOOD. YOU KNOW? INFLATION IS JUST



November 10, 2021

1 DEVASTATING OUR LOW-INCOME, AND MODERATE INCOME FAMILIES. IT'S
2 JUST -- AND IT'S SOMETHING THAT NOBODY HAS CONTROL OVER AND
3 WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE COST OF FOOD AND GASOLINE ALL OF THE
4 THINGS THAT ARE LOW INCOME FAMILIES DEPEND O IT'S JUST
5 ESCALATING SO THIS IS JUST ONE WAY TO HELP MANAGE THAT. I
6 DON'T AGREE WITH FINANCING THE TOLL ITSELF. YOU KNOW? IF YOU
7 REALLY HAVE A CONCERN ABOUT LOW-INCOME FAMILIES, YOU KNOW,
8 GOING ACROSS THE BRIDGE AND FINANCING THAT FOR THEM, JUST GIVE
9 THEM A LOWER RATE. YOU KNOW? TO ASSUME THAT BECAUSE YOU'RE
10 LOW-INCOME, THAT YOU'RE NOT VESTED INTO THE SYSTEM -- YOU WANT
11 TO SEE THE BRIDGE MAINTAINED, YOU WANT TO SEE THE TRAFFIC
12 FLOWING, YOU HAVE ALL THE SAME ASPIRATIONS THAT ALL OF REST OF
13 US DO, AND YOU WANT TO PAY YOUR FAIR SHARE. THAT'S THE KEY,
14 PAY YOUR FAIR SHARE. HISTORY SHOWS US THAT WHEN YOU LOOSEN
15 FINANCE IT'S EASY FOR PEOPLE TO ENCOURAGE DEBT LOW-INCOME AND
16 MODERATE INCOME FAMILIES SUFFER MOST IN THIS COUNTRY WITH THE
17 HOME MORTGAGE FEES AND CREDIT CARDS AND WE HAVE GOT TO BE
18 CAREFUL THAT WE DON'T BUILD THAT TRAP. AND I KNOW, IF WE ARE
19 GOING TO EXPLORE THIS ON THE TOLL ITSELF, I HOPE WE REALLY
20 TAKE OUR TIME AND LOOK AT IT VERY CLOSELY, BECAUSE WE HAVE A
21 RESPONSIBILITY TO SEE THAT ARE BRIDGES ARE MAINTAINED WE NEED
22 OUR DEBT SERVICE BECAUSE IF THOSE BRIDGES AREN'T MAINTAINED IT
23 HURTS POOR PEOPLE MORE THAN ANYBODY ELSE. I JUST CAUTION LET'S
24 TAKE OUR TIME LOOKING AT IF YOU'RE GOING TO TRY TO FINANCE
25 TOLLS, LET'S TAKE OUR TIME AND LOOK AT IT REALLY CLOSELY. I



November 10, 2021

1 THINK THERE IS IMPACT THAT WE AREN'T CONSIDERING TODAY. THANK
2 YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER SPERING. FOR
5 THOSE COMMENTS. LET ME SEE IF THERE ARE COMMITTEE COMMENTS.
6 LET ME TURN TO THE COMMITTEE DISCUSSION PHASE. AND THEN WE'LL
7 GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. THERESE WOULD YOU OFFER COMMENT?

8

9 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** ABSOLUTELY. THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH FOR THAT,
10 AND TO ALL OF THE COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR THOUGHTFUL COMMENTS.
11 I WOULD SAY, YOUR IMPASSIONED COMMENTS. OBVIOUSLY THIS IS
12 SOMETHING THAT YOU'RE OUTLINING AN AMBITIOUS AND NEEDED
13 AGENDA. SO WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO IS MAYBE WRAP UP FROM A
14 STAFF PERSPECTIVE HOW WE CAN BEST SERVE YOU IN, YOU KNOW,
15 FOLLOWING THAT. AS I SAID BEFORE, I'M GOING TO USE THE TERM,
16 AND USE IT VERY INTENTIONALLY, WE NEED TO DO DUE DILIGENCE FOR
17 YOU AS DECISION MAKERS ON A WHOLE NUMBER OF FRONTS IN THIS
18 SPACE. AND MAYBE ONE WAY TO THINK ABOUT IT, I THINK, AGAIN,
19 THE STAFF PRESENTATION DID A REALLY GOOD JOB OF OUTLINING T
20 BUT MAYBE I'LL RESTACK IT JUST A BIT TO PICK UP SOME OF THE
21 OBSERVATIONS YOU MADE. IS WE NEED TO DO DUE DILIGENCE IN THE
22 ADMINISTRATIVE SPACE FINANCIAL SPACE TECHNICAL SPACE AND LEGAL
23 SPACE. AS AN EXAMPLE, ADMINISTRATIVELY, OUR CUSTOMER SERVICE
24 CENTER. [LAUGHTER] WHICH WE HAVE BEEN COMING TO YOU ON
25 NUMEROUS POINTS -- WE'RE WORKING VERY HARD, AND, YOU KNOW, IT



November 10, 2021

1 CONTINUES TO NEED A LOT OF ATTENTION, AS WE KNOW, ON HOW OUR
2 CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER IS WORKING, WHAT CHANGES NEED TO BE
3 MADE, AS YOU ARE WELL AWARE IT'S BEEN INCREDIBLY STRESSED
4 BECAUSE OF COVID AND A NUMBER OF OTHER THINGS. WE KNOW WE NEED
5 TO WORK IN THAT SPACE. THERE IS A LOT OF ADMINISTRATIVE
6 CONSIDERATIONS IN THERE. AND I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ
7 THAT WITH ANY OF THIS, IN TERMS OF A CUSTOMER TO CUSTOMER
8 FACE, THAT IS GOING TO BE A FRONT FACING NEED. SO THAT'S JUST
9 ONE EXAMPLE, AGAIN, ADMINISTRATIVELY. WITH RESPECT TO THE
10 FINANCES, I THINK WE DO NEED TO BRING BACK TO YOU, AND, AGAIN,
11 I'M NOT MAKING A ADJUSTMENT BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE
12 IMPACT IS, BUT WE NEED TO TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT A PAYMENT PLAN
13 WOULD HAVE ON CASH FLOW OR OTHER NEEDS RELATED TO THE BRIDGES.
14 THE IT MAY BE MINOR, BUT WE NEED TO LOOK AT IT, AND WE NEED TO
15 TELL YOU. SO, I THINK THAT'S, YOU KNOW, AN EXAMPLE, AGAIN, OF
16 WHERE DUE DILIGENCE IS REALLY IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF EVERYONE
17 HAVING THE INFORMATION. THAT'S ONE. BRIAN WOULD HAVE OTHERS TO
18 MAKE SURE WE WANT TO COVER. AND THERE IS A LOT TECHNICAL
19 THERE, AND I AGREE, I APOLOGIZE -- I DON'T KNOW IF IT WAS
20 COMMISSIONER PAPAN WHO WAS FOCUSING ON DATA AND OTHERS, BUT
21 THAT IS A SPACE THAT IS ABSOLUTELY CRUCIAL. ONE OF THE THINGS
22 WE HAVE TO KNOW, AND BE ABLE TO BRING BACK TO YOU IS HOW DO WE
23 IDENTIFY THOSE WHO MOST NEED ASSISTANCE IN THIS SPACE? WE DO
24 NOT HAVE A PERFECT WAY OF DOING THAT TODAY. WE SIMPLY DON'T.
25 BUT GETTING THE RIGHT DATA FROM, YOU KNOW, WHERE DO WE GET IT?



November 10, 2021

1 HOW DO WE MAINTAIN IT? WHERE IS IT STORED? THERE IS A LOT
2 THERE. AND WE NEED, TO AGAIN, I LOVE THE MEASURE TWICE CUT
3 ONCE, WE NEED TO KNOW THAT. AND HOW MUCH, FRANKLY, THAT WILL
4 COST. IT'S PROBABLY WORTH THE INVESTMENT TO DO IT BUT IT'S NOT
5 GOING TO BE FREE. SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE BRINGING THAT
6 TO YOU TOO, AS ANOTHER EXAMPLE. AND ANOTHER ON THE TECHNICAL
7 NOTIFICATION SIDES. I THINK AS STAFF WE WANT TO COMMIT AND I
8 WANT TO WORK WITH STAFF AND WE WILL DO THROUGH A CONTRACTOR OR
9 WHATEVER, BUT WE DO WANT TO ACCESS PRACTICES THAT EXIST, NOT
10 ONLY PERHAPS IN THE TOLL INDUSTRY, BUT ELSEWHERE, BUT HAVE,
11 AGAIN, A VERY THOUGHTFUL AND ANALYTICAL APPROACH TO WHAT COULD
12 CARRY OVER TO OUR PARTICULAR CIRCUMSTANCES, VERSUS NOT. THAT'S
13 WHAT WE OWE YOU. AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST, THE LEGAL SIDE. ONE
14 OF THE REASONS WE BROUGHT THE BASE VERSUS TOLL AND AGAIN I'M
15 NOT MAKING AN ADJUSTMENT AT WHAT POINT IN TERMS OF MANIFEST
16 POLICY THOSE ARE ONE OF THE THINGS I WANT TO BRING BACK TO
17 YOU, BUT THERE ARE BOND COVENANTS, THERE ARE PRIVACY ISSUES,
18 THERE IS A NUMBER OF THINGS IN THE LEGAL SPACE, THAT, AGAIN,
19 IT WOULD BE VERY IMPORTANT FOR US TO LOOK AT, ASSESS RISK. I
20 MEAN, A LOT OF THIS MAY BE RISK MANAGEMENT ON THE PART OF BATA
21 ON HOW WE WANT TO MOVE FORWARD IN THIS SPACE. AND THEN, LET ME
22 WRAP UP FINALLY WITH SUBMISSION THAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ SAID.
23 WE ALSO -- AS I SAID, THIS IS AN AMBITIOUS AGENDA. THIS IS A
24 LOT OF CHANGE THAT I AGREE, PARTICULARLY IN THE EQUITY SPACE
25 WE NEED TO LOOK AT BUT WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO DO



November 10, 2021

1 EVERYTHING IN THE SAME TIME OVERNIGHT. THAT SAID WE ALSO NEED
2 TO HAVE A SENSE FROM YOU WITH OUR THOUGHTS, WHAT ARE THE
3 PRIORITIES OF ALL OF THE CHANGES THAT WE MAY WANT TO MAKE? HOW
4 DO WE STACK THEM UP? WHERE IS THE MOST IMMEDIATE BENEFIT? AND
5 HOW -- AND WITH THE RESOURCES WE HAVE AVAILABLE, HOW DO WE
6 LINE THAT UP IN TERMS OF AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN ONCE WE FIGURE
7 OUT WHAT THE OVERALL GAME PLAN LOOKS LIKE. THAT'S MY TAKE AWAY
8 OBSERVATIONS FROM THIS RICH DISCUSSION. I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE
9 EVERYONE'S INPUT AND I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO YOU CHAIR
10 WORTH.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN FOR
13 THOSE COMMENTS. I APPRECIATE THAT. YOU ALWAYS DO A GREAT JOB
14 OF PROVIDING SOME CLARITY IN TERMS OF OUR THOUGHT PROCESS IN
15 MOVING FORWARD. SO, I SEE TWO MORE HANDS UP. MAY I PLEASE
16 CALL ON CHAIR PEDROZA AND THEN COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH. AND I APPRECIATE THE
19 SUMMARY THAT THERESE PROVIDED. VERY WELL DONE. AND I THINK WE
20 ALSO ARE JUST UNDER THE PERSPECTIVE, A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO WE
21 MET WITH CREDIT AGENCIES FOR OVER 12 HOURS AND GOT TO HEAR
22 THEIR PERSPECTIVE ABOUT WHAT IT MEANS TO HAVE THE FINANCES TO
23 TAKE ON THESE INITIATIVES THAT WE'RE TAKING O I AGREE WITH
24 COMMISSIONER RONEN. THE PERSON DOESN'T DIFFERENT
25 DIFFERENTIATE. YOU ARE ABSOLUTELY RIGHT. BUT THROUGH OUR LENS



November 10, 2021

1 HOW TO MAKE SURE WHAT WE DO DOESN'T COMPROMISE OUR INITIATIVES
2 AND WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO AND WHAT THAT'S WHAT I HEARD
3 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ SHARE REMEMBERING THE TOLL AND AGENCY WE
4 HAVE A FISCALLY RESPONSIBILITY TO DO THAT. ALSO ON EQUITY,
5 THIS DRAWS UP THAT WE HAVE TO LOOK AT EQUITY ACROSS EVERYTHING
6 WHETHER EQUITY IN EXPRESS LANES, ACROSS THE BRIDGE, DIFFERENT
7 TRANSIT OPERATORS WE NEED TO LOOK AT IT GLOBALLY. WE ARE DOING
8 IT AND THAT'S WHAT THIS COMMISSION IS BEING BOLD ON. THE TOLLS
9 CAN'T SHOULDER IT ALL AND NO ONE IS SAYING THAT BUT WE NEED TO
10 LOOK AT IT AS A WHOLE SYSTEM AND WE'RE ON THAT PATH. THIS HAS
11 BEEN INCREDIBLE CONVERSATION. I LOOK FORWARD TO STAFF COMING
12 BACK WITH SOME OF THE DATA, THERESE, AND I THINK YOU'RE
13 COMMITTED TO THAT, SO THAT WE CAN BE INFORMED ABOUT WHAT THE
14 IMPACTS AND INTENDED AND UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES SO WE CAN
15 HAVE A ROBUST CONFERENCE CONVERSATION. I APPRECIATE THE
16 SUPPORT TODAY AND THANK YOU CHAIR FOR LEADING THIS INITIATIVE.

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA. AND LET ME TURN
19 BACK TO VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. AND THEN WE'LL MOVE ON TO
20 PUBLIC COMMENT.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. AND, YES, THANK YOU FOR SUMMING
23 UP, AND THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS, CHAIR. THE COMMENTS
24 CHAIR PEDROZA AND COMMISSIONER SPERING HAD, I THINK THE
25 CONCERNS ARE TOTALLY VALID CONCERNS. I WANT TO CONFIRM,



November 10, 2021

1 THERESE, AND I HEAR THIS AND MIGHT BE LOOKING FOR IT IN
2 SOMETHING SPECIFIC AND HAVEN'T HEARD IT BUT ARE YOU GOING TO
3 BE COMING BACK LOOKING AT BOTH OF THE PAYMENT PLAN OPTIONS AND
4 HELPING US UNDERSTAND THE PROS AND CONS OF EACH OR ARE YOU
5 GOING TO COME BACK WITH ONE RECOMMENDATION? BECAUSE I THINK IT
6 WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL TO HAVE, TO, SORT OF, UNDERSTAND, BUT,
7 YOU KNOW, BOTH THE PAYMENT PLAN, MAYBE THERE ARE MORE, MAYBE
8 THERE ARE THREE OR FOUR THAT WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT?

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YEAH. I THINK WHAT I HEARD IS THAT WE'RE
11 GETTING MORE INPUT ON WHAT A SCOPE OF A PAYMENT PLAN WOULD
12 WRAP AROUND. THAT'S WHAT I'M HEARING TODAY. AND WE CAN BRING
13 THAT BACK TO YOU. AND I THINK, AGAIN, WHAT WOULD BE IMPORTANT
14 IN BEING LOOKING AT THAT SCOPE IS THE -- IS CLARIFYING, FOR
15 YOU, THE CONSIDERATIONS, AGAIN, AS I, YOU KNOW, INDICATED O
16 YOU KNOW, IN MY, SORT OF, SUMMARY, OF WHAT -- WHAT IT MAY MEAN
17 TO DO THAT. YOU KNOW? THERE IS DIFFERENCES BETWEEN A PAYMENT
18 PLAN AND A DISCOUNT PLAN. THERE'S, YOU KNOW, AN ISSUE OF WHO
19 GETS TO PARTICIPATE IN A PAYMENT PLAN, AND SO ALL THOSE
20 QUESTIONS, THINK ARE WHAT WE WOULD WANT TO OUTLINE FOR AND YOU
21 COME BACK WITH A RECOMMENDATION OR IT MAY BE CHOICES YOU COULD
22 DO THIS, THIS, HERE'S THE RISK, THE CONSIDERATIONS, ET CETERA.
23 WHAT WE DO YOU WANT TO DO? I'M REALIZING THAT THERE IS A
24 BROADER SET OF ANALYSIS, NOW, THAN MIGHT HAVE BEEN TWO MONTHS



November 10, 2021

1 AGO. AND WE NEED TO OUTLINE HOW WE RESPOND TO THAT. DOES THAT
2 HELP?

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IT DOES. AND I HOPE ONE OF THE CONSIDERATIONS
5 YOU LOOK AT IS ONE WE HAVE SPOKEN ABOUT WHICH IS A PAYMENT
6 PLAN FOR THE WHOLE DEBT, WHOLE PEOPLE'S DEBT OR PAYMENT PLAN
7 FOR THE FINES AND FEES DEBT. BECAUSE THAT'S AN ISSUE LIKE WE
8 HAVE DISCUSSED HERE, AND I THINK IT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL TO
9 GET THE RESEARCH ON AND KIND OF HAVE THOSE TRADEOFFS LAID OUT
10 MORE EXPLICITLY. THANK YOU.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THERESE, THANK YOU, AND COMMISSIONER
13 JOSEFOWITZ, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND JUST TO SUM UP, AND THEN
14 WE'LL GO PUBLIC COMMENT, BUT MY SENSE IS STAFF IS TAKING ALL
15 OF THE COMMENTS FROM THIS COMMITTEE AND WE'RE GOING TO LOOK AT
16 ALL OF THOSE AND THEN COME BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE WITH, YOU
17 KNOW, WITH OPTIONS, KIND OF, THIS IS WHAT WE HAVE. AND I THINK
18 THIS GROUP HAS DONE AN EXCELLENT JOB OF LAYING OUT THE NUANCE
19 OF THE PROBLEM. AND AS YOU KNOW, COMING FROM CONTRA COSTA
20 COUNTY WHERE WE HAVE A LOT OF TOLL DRIVERS -- TOLL PAYERS, AND
21 DRIVERS, AND THEY'RE DOING IT BECAUSE THAT'S THE ONLY OPTION
22 THEY HAVE. THIS IS MINDFUL AND THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA LOOKING
23 AT TOLLING. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THE BRIDGES SUPPORTED BY THE
24 STATE OF CALIFORNIA SO PEOPLE CROSSING BRINGS IS WHAT THEY PAY
25 FOR OTHER CORRIDORS IS THROUGH TAXES OR GAS TAX. THAT'S MY



November 10, 2021

1 PHILOSOPHY. BUT I JUST WANTED TO SAY, I THINK ALL OF THE
2 COMMENTS HAVE BEEN MADE AND AFTER WE HEAR PUBLIC COMMENT WE
3 MAY WANT TO ADD ADDITIONAL COMMENT SO WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
4 EVERYBODY FEELS CONFIDENT THAT THE POINTS YOU HAVE RAISED
5 WHICH ARE THOUGHTFUL AND EXCELLENT ARE INCORPORATED INTO THE
6 THOUGHT PROCESS. SO, GOOD THING ABOUT ZOOM, TOO, I'M GOING TO
7 GO BACK AND WE'RE GOING TO REMEMBER, FOLLOW-THROUGH WITH WHAT
8 EVERYBODY HAS SUGGESTED SO WE CAN DO THAT ANALYSIS RECOGNIZING
9 WE HAVE FINITE RESOURCES, OUR OPERATION STAFF, AS YOU WELL
10 KNOW IS RUNNING THE OPERATION AS WELL AS DOING THE ANALYSIS.
11 THE CHALLENGING THING IS THAT'S ADDING WORK TO OUR EXISTING
12 STAFF RESOURCES. ON THE OTHER HAND THIS, IS THE GROUP THAT
13 REALLY UNDERSTANDS AND HELPS US KIND OF IDENTIFY THE ISSUES
14 AND HOW WHAT WE END UP DOING WILL WORK THE BEST TO ACHIEVE THE
15 EQUITY GOALS THAT WE ALL SHARE. SO, THANK YOU. SO, WITH THAT,
16 LET ME TURN TO KIMBERLY TO SEE IF WE HAVE EITHER ANY WRITTEN
17 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, HERE,
18 WHO WOULD LIKE TO SHARE COMMENTS TO THIS COMMITTEE?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WE DID RECEIVE TWO WRITTEN
21 CORRESPONDENCE. THE FIRST IS FROM SPUR ALONG WITH OTHER
22 VARIOUS ORGANIZATIONS, AND THE OTHER IS FROM ALETA DUPREE BOTH
23 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND DISTRIBUTED TO THE COMMITTEE.
24 I SEE SEVERAL MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.



November 10, 2021

1 FIRST IS ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO
2 MINUTES MR. DUPREE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH, ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD,
5 SHE AND HER. I HOPE YOU GOT TO READ MY LETTER. FOR SOME REASON
6 WHEN I PULL UP THE AGENDA ON THE WEB SITE IT'S NOT SHOWING THE
7 MATERIAL THAT I SENT TO YOU. MAYBE THERE IS A TECH ISSUE HERE.
8 THERE IS A LOT OF WORK IN THIS. A LOT OF EDUCATION NEEDS TO BE
9 DONE. THE CASH OPTION IS NOT GONE. I FOUND A MAP OF SEVERAL
10 HUNDRED CASH PAYMENT LOCATIONS ALL OVER THE STATE OF
11 CALIFORNIA. IN, NOT ALL OF THE 58 COUNTIES, BUT IT LOOKS LIKE
12 PRETTY CLOSE. EVEN IN A LOT OF RURAL AREAS. SO, THANK YOU FOR
13 TAKING AWAY THE FEES FOR MAKING CASH TRANSACTIONS. SO THIS
14 WILL BE A WAY THAT PEOPLE WITH THEIR \$5 BILLS CAN SLIDE THOSE
15 INTO A KIOSK BEFORE THEY GET ON THE BRIDGE. AND HOPEFULLY
16 PEOPLE CAN GIVE THE GIFT OF BAFTA, TAKE THEIR COFFEE CANS,
17 JARS, AND WATER CANS OF MONEY BRINGING IT TO US AND PUTTING TO
18 WORK ON TOLLS. WE HAVE TO MAKE A PROCESS EASIER FOR PEOPLE AND
19 THEY ARE DOING SO I ALWAYS ENJOY THE PRESENTATIONS OF LYSA IN
20 THIS WORK. THERE IS ALWAYS GOING TO BE QUESTIONS WHEN PEOPLE
21 SIGN UP. THE VAST MAJORITY OF PEOPLE ARE WILLING TO PAY THEIR
22 TOLLS WE JUST HAVE TO MAKE IT MORE APPROACHABLE. PEOPLE
23 SHOULDN'T BE INTIMIDATED BY COMPLICATED FORMS AND WEB SITES
24 AND THINGS WHEN IT SHOULD BE A FEW KEY STROKES AND MAYBE JUST
25 SLIDING SOME BILLS INTO A KIOSK AT THEIR LOCAL GROCERY STORE.



November 10, 2021

1 AND THERE ARE MANY BANKS AND CREDIT UNIONS THAT WELCOME PEOPLE
2 OF MODEST MEANS. I BELONG TO A CREDIT UNION WHERE ANY
3 HONORABLY DISCHARGED VETERAN OR ACTIVE SERVICE MEMBER CAN
4 JOIN. IT'S THAT EASY. SO, I APPRECIATE IT. I HOPE YOU PASS
5 THIS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
8 COMMENTS, ALETA.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ELAINA
11 BINDER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS ALIANA BINDER,
14 WE ARE GRATEFUL FEES ARE GOING FROM 70 TO \$20 STARTING JANUARY
15 2022. THANK YOU FOR YOUR RESPONSIVENESS AND LEADERSHIP ON THIS
16 ISSUE THIS IS AN IMPORTANT STEP TOWARDS MEANINGFUL REFORM.
17 HOWEVER, MDC FINANCIAL PENALTY SYSTEM IS STILL FLAWS AND
18 INEQUITABLE TABLE. TOLL FINES AND FEES CONTINUE TO BE HARMFUL
19 COSTLY AND COUNTERPRODUCTIVE BURDENING THOSE WHO ARE MORE
20 VULNERABLE DEBT MUCH WHICH HAVE IS UNCOLLECTIBLE MANY CLIENTS
21 HAVE INCOMES THAT ARE TOO LOW TO SHOULDER DEBT FROM FINES AND
22 FEES. EXACTING TOLL FINES AND FEES ESPECIALLY WHEN THEY
23 DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACT THOSE STRUGGLING TO MEET THEIR OWN
24 BASIC NEEDS FURTHER PERPETUATES CYCLES OF POVERTY ACROSS THE
25 BASIS AND DOESN'T ALIGN WITH MTC'S EQUITY PLATFORM. WE URGE TO



November 10, 2021

1 YOU BUILD UPON REFORMS IMPLEMENTED DURING THE PANDEMIC AND
2 CONSIDER FURTHER CHANGES, INCLUDING A NOTIFICATION SYSTEM
3 OVERHAUL TO REDUCE THE INTENDED HARMS AND ENSURE PEOPLE KNOW
4 WHEN THEY OWE A TOLL. WE ASK THAT YOU CAP FINES LEVIED PER
5 DRIVER AND FINES FOR PEOPLE WITH LOW-INCOMES. PAYMENT PLANS,
6 INCLUDING REMINDERS TO PAY CONTINUING SUSPENSION OF DMV HOLDS
7 MODERNIZING A NOTIFICATION SYSTEM IS PROVIDE RELIEF BY BANKING
8 ALL EXISTING UNPAID FINES TOLLS AND FEES WORKING
9 COLLABORATIVELY WITH ADVOCATES USING RECOMMENDATIONS. MTC CAN
10 CREATE STRIDES IN TRANSIT EQUITY TO CREATE SYSTEMS THAT WORK
11 FOR ALL BAY AREA DRIVERS. THANK YOU.

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. ELAINA, THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS JACOB DENNY. PLEASE UNMUTE
16 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. ARE YOU THERE, MR. DENNY?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THERE. NOW I HAD THE OPTION TO UNMUTE. THANK YOU.
19 FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THEIR PRESENTATION TODAY AND
20 COMMISSIONERS FOR THEIR CONVERSATION. WE ARE SO GRATEFUL TO
21 HEAR YOU ALL ENGAGING WITH THESE DIFFICULT ISSUES AND TALKING
22 ABOUT THEM IN DEPTH. MTC HAS SHOWN A COMMITMENT HERE IN
23 LEADERSHIP TO EQUITY THAT I HOPE THAT OTHER AGENCIES ACROSS
24 THE COUNTRY WILL ALSO EMBRACE AND GRAPPLING WITH THESE
25 DIFFICULT ISSUES. PROPOSED CHANGES IN THIS PRESENTATION ARE



November 10, 2021

1 MEANINGFUL QUALITY OF LIFE CHANGES THAT WILL MAKE THINGS
2 BETTER FOR LOW-INCOME AND WORK PEOPLE WHO ARE CROSSING OUR
3 BRIDGES NOW TO WORK NECESSARY JOBS DURING THE CONTINUED
4 PANDEMIC. AS STAFF ENGAGES IN THIS SYSTEM TO ASSESS PAYMENT
5 PLANS, NOTIFICATIONS, AND ABILITY TO PAY DETERMINATIONS OR
6 HARDSHIP DETERMINATIONS, YOU WOULD SAY, WE YOU ENCOURAGE YOU
7 TO COMMITMENT IN DEPTH WITH THE PROCESS I KNOW MYSELF AND
8 PARTNERS WOULD LOVE TO HELP OUT ANY WAY WE CAN IN VOLUNTEERING
9 OUR TIME AND EXPERTISE IN THIS PROCESS. AND, ALSO, AGAIN, TO
10 REITERATE THE POINTS MADE BY COMMISSIONERS, THE IMPORTANCE OF
11 A PAYMENT PLAN THAT INCLUDES TOLLS AS WELL AS FINES AND FEES
12 TO MAKE IT SO THAT PEOPLE CAN REASONABLY PAY THEIR DEBT AND
13 STAY OUT OF A SYSTEM THAT HARMS THEM AND DOESN'T HELP MTC, AND
14 ALSO EMBRACING A NOTIFICATION SYSTEM THAT GOES BEYOND WHAT IS
15 STATUTORILY REQUIRED AND INSTEAD MOVERS INTO A 21ST CENTURY
16 MODEL THAT MEETS PEOPLE WHERE THEY ARE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO
17 COMMIT TO HELP MTC IN ANY WAY WE CAN TO MAKE SURE THERE IS
18 ACCESS TO DATA AND INFORMATION WHETHER AT THE STATE LEVEL. WE
19 LOOK FORWARD TO ENGAGING AND WORKING WITH YOU.

20

21 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MICHELLE MAU.

24



November 10, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT MY NAME IS
2 MICHELLE I AM WITH THE FINANCIAL JUSTICE PROJECT IN SAN
3 FRANCISCO TREASURERS OFFICE WE COMMEND THE REDUCTION OF FINES
4 AND FEES FROM 70 TO \$20 THIS WILL BRING MEANINGFUL RELIEF WE
5 UNDERSTAND THE SYSTEM FOR COLLECT UNPAID TOLLS
6 DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTS LOW-INCOME PEOPLE AND PEOPLE OF
7 COLOR THANKS TO RESEARCH FROM SPUR AND OTHER ADVOCACY GROUPS
8 IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE THIS WAY. IN OUR WORK AT THE FINANCIAL
9 JUSTICE PROJECT WE IN GOVERNMENT SO WHEN IT'S MAKES IT EASIER
10 FOR PEOPLE TO PAY RIGHT SIZES FINES AND FEES BOTH PEOPLE AND
11 GOVERNMENT BENEFIT. FOR EXAMPLE, IN 2015 THE SAN FRANCISCO
12 COURT BECAME FIRST IN CALIFORNIA TO STOP SUSPENDING PEOPLE'S
13 DRIVER'S LICENSE WHEN THEY COULDN'T PAY TRAFFIC TICKETS
14 DESPITE CONCERNS ABOUT REVENUE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ACTUALLY
15 INCREASED SINCE THE COURT STOPPED SUSPENDING LICENSES.
16 SIMILARLY WHEN COURTS STOPPED SUS SPENDING LICENSES TO PAY
17 COLLECTIONS WENT UP MUCH LIKE DMV HOLD MAKES IT HARDER FOR
18 PEOPLE TO MAKE A LIVING AND HARD FOR PEOPLE TO PAY IN THE
19 FIRST PLACE. THERE ARE GENTLER WAYS TO ENCOURAGE PAYMENT WE
20 FOUND REMINDER NOTICES AND PAYMENT PLANS ARE MORE EFFECTIVE
21 THAN PENALTIES FINES AND FEES. WE KNOW THAT MTC CAN FULFILL
22 ITS COMMITMENT TO RACIAL EQUITY LIKE STOPS HOLDS OF DMV USE
23 ESTABLISHING ABLE TO PAY DISCOUNTS ON TOLL FINES AND FEES.
24 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND MY TEAM AT FINANCIAL JUSTICE
25 PROJECT IS HAPPY TO BE A RESOURCE FOR INFORMATION.



November 10, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS IF YOU HAVE
3 IDEAS OR THOUGHTS ON RESOURCES PLEASE DON'T HESITATE TO REGION
4 REACH OUT TO US. ONE OF THE WONDERFUL THINGS THAT CAME OUT OF
5 THIS CONVERSATION IS FIGURING OUT BEST PRACTICES, IN
6 IDENTIFYING OPPORTUNITIES. THANK YOU SO MUCH. KIMBERLY? CALL
7 ON THE NEXT PERSON

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RICHARD HEDGES.
10 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. MR. HEDGES.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THIS HAS BEEN GREAT DISCUSSION
13 THIS MORNING. VERY THANKFUL FOR WHAT MTC IS TRYING TO DO. I
14 WANT TO PUT THIS IN PERSPECTIVE OF THE CASH PEOPLE HAVE AT \$15
15 AN HOUR SALARY THAT'S 31,000 A YEAR ABOUT \$2,500 A YEAR COMES
16 OUT FOR SOCIAL SECURITY AND MEDICARE PAYMENTS AND THEN ADD
17 ANOTHER \$1,600 A YEAR FOR A FULL-TIME PERSON ON A BRIDGE AND I
18 COULD GO ON AND ON, YOU CAN SEE WHAT THE LEVEL OF REVENUE IS
19 FOR PEOPLE WHO PAY FINES ON THEIR INABILITY TO HAVE -- AND
20 THEIR INABILITY TO HAVE A MECHANISM TO PAY THEM. I'M WONDERING
21 WHAT PERCENTAGE INCREASE WE HAD IN PEOPLE GETTING FINES AND
22 LETTERS SAYING THAT THEY HAVE NOT PAID THEIR TOLL, BECAUSE WE
23 HAVE DONE AWAY WITH THE CASH BOOTHS. MY SUSPENSION IS THAT'S
24 GONE UP APPRECIABLY. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE A PERCENTAGE ON THAT
25 IF SOMEBODY HAS IT. BUT IF WE'RE HEADED TOWARD THE RIGHT



November 10, 2021

1 DIRECTION, I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY AT MTC FOR UNDERSTANDING
2 THAT THIS IS A PROBLEM AND FOR WORKING ON IT DILIGENTLY. THANK
3 YOU.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, RICH, VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
6 COMMENTS.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS, MS.
9 MADAM CHAIR.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, AND I ASSUME WE DON'T
12 HAVE ANY ADDITIONAL WRITTEN COMMENTS.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING FURTHER.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO WE CLOSE THE PUBLIC COMMENT
17 PERIOD AND I'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE, FIRST
18 COMMISSIONER GLOVER WHO HAS HIS HAND UP.

19

20 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** THANK YOU. AND TO THE COMMISSION, I JUST
21 WANT TO SAY THAT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WAS STATED EARLIER ON
22 IS THAT AS WE LOOK AT EQUITY ISSUES, WE HAVE BE TO LOOK AT ALL
23 POLICIES THAT WE CONTINUE TO MAKE. AS COMMISSIONER WORTH
24 POINTED OUT EARLIER COMING FROM CONTRA COSTA, WE HAVE
25 INDIVIDUALS LEAVING EVERY DAY CROSSING THREE DIFFERENT



November 10, 2021

1 BRIDGES. -- -- SO WE'RE DEFINITELY PAYING THE FAIR SHARE. BUT
2 MOST OF THOSE INDIVIDUALS THAT ARE CROSSING THOSE BRIDGES ARE
3 SERVICE WORKERS. AND SO WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE FACT THAT EQUITY
4 REALLY NEEDS TO BE APPLIED IN A WAY IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT.
5 SO MTC'S POLICY THAT WAS SET EARLY ON IN TERMS OF EQUITY AND
6 HOW WE DEAL WITH THAT IS ALWAYS GOING TO BE A PART OF
7 CONTINUOUS CHANGE IN THOSE POLICIES FOR CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT
8 AND MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE THE RIGHT IMPACTS AS WE DEAL WITH
9 OUR RACIAL EQUITY AND OTHER SOCIAL EQUITY, ALL OUR EQUITY
10 PROBLEMS THAT WE DEAL WITH OUR SOCIETY AS A WHOLE, AND WE ALL
11 KNOW THAT TRANSPORTATION SAY MAJOR ONE. I JUST WANT TO THANK
12 THE STAFF FOR WHAT YOU'RE DOING. AND ALSO JUST MAKE CLEAR THAT
13 WE'LL CONTINUE TO HAVE TO MAKE CHANGES TO ADDRESS THESE
14 ISSUES, AS WE GO FORWARD AND SETTING POLICY. SO, THANK YOU FOR
15 THAT. ACTUALLY, MY HAND WAS WAVED TO ASK THAT VICE CHAIR TAKE
16 THE NEXT MEETING BECAUSE I'M HAVING SOME TECHNICAL ISSUES.
17 BUT, THANK YOU.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER. I JUST WANT
20 TO, IN TERMS OF WRAPPING UP THE COMMITTEE COMMENTS BEFORE WE
21 TAKE THE MOTION, I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT REALLY PROVIDES A
22 GOOD OVERVIEW SUM-UP OF WHERE WE ARE. I REALLY DO THINK THE
23 WORK WE'RE DOING IS REALLY HISTORIC IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT THE
24 COMMITMENT TO EQUITY, THE COMMITMENT TO DEALING WITH OUR, YOU
25 KNOW, COMMUTERS WE'RE RELYING ON, THAT ARE, AS RICH POINTED



November 10, 2021

1 OUT, HAVE LIMITED RESOURCE IN TERMS OF THE COST OF LIVING IN
2 THE BAY AREA, AND I THINK IT'S INCUMBENT UPON US TO DO ALL WE
3 CAN TO HELP IMPROVE THE EXPERIENCES THAT ARE THE INDIVIDUALS
4 ARE EXPERIENCING, AND TO ADDRESS THESE EQUITY AND FEE AND FINE
5 ISSUES. SO, THANK YOU EVERYONE FOR YOUR COMMENTS. I THINK,
6 AGAIN, AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, THOSE WILL ALL BE INCORPORATED
7 IN THE STAFF ANALYSIS AND STAFF RESEARCH SO THESE ISSUES CAN
8 COME BACK TO US. WITH THAT, IF THERE IS NO OTHER COMMENTS, I
9 WANT TO TURN, NOW, TO -- WE ACTUALLY HAVE A MOTION ON THE ABLE
10 TO APPROVE BATA RESOLUTION NUMBER 52, WHICH MOVES US FORWARD
11 IN IMPLEMENTING SOME OF THE POLICIES THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED.
12 SO, I WOULD BE VERY HAPPY TO ENTERTAIN A MOTION AND A SECOND
13 FOR THAT.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN, MOVE APPROVAL.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY.

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

20

21 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. MOVED BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND
22 SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. MAY I TURN TO OUR CLERK FOR
23 THE ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

24



November 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. AND, MADAM CHAIR, JUST TO CLARIFY,
2 THE MOTION AND THE SECOND IS TO FORWARD THE RESOLUTION TO THE
3 AUTHORITIES, AND TO APPROVE THE CONTRACT?

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YES. IT'S TO -- EXACTLY, REFER THE BATA
6 RESOLUTION 52 TO THE AUTHORITY FOR APPROVAL AND APPROVE THE
7 CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER WITH CONDUENT AND STATE AND LOCAL
8 SOLUTIONS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FANTASTIC. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

15

16 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

17

18 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT:** YES.

23

24 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

25



November 10, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND AGAIN I WANT TO
6 THANK STAFF FOR BRINGING THIS FORWARD, CONTINUING TO WORK ON
7 IT A REALLY DETERMINED SCHEDULE TO BRING THESE REFORMS FORWARD
8 TO US. SO, THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH FOR YOUR, YOU KNOW, FOR
9 YOUR WISDOM, FOR YOUR ENGAGEMENT, AND FOR ENABLING US TO MOVE
10 FORWARD WITH THE REFORMS THAT THE COMMISSION REALLY WANTS TO
11 SEE HAPPENING AND CARESS DEEPLY ABOUT, AS WELL AS THE BRIDGE
12 TOLL ENTERPRISE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT I'LL MOVE TO
13 ITEM SIX. THIS IS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. AND WOULD LIKE TO TURN
14 TO OUR CLERK TO SEE IF WE HAVE EITHER RECEIVED ANY WRITTEN
15 PUBLIC COMMENT OR IF WE HAVE ANY INDIVIDUALS WHO WOULD LIKE TO
16 ADDRESS THE COMMITTEE THIS MORNING?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, AND I
19 DO SEE ALETA DUPREE WITH HER HAND RAISED. MS. DUPREE, IF YOU
20 WILL UNMUTE YOURSELF, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. ARE YOU THERE MS.
21 DUPREE?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YES. JUST CAME UP. THANK YOU CHAIR AMY WORTH. ALETA
24 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER. GOOD CONVERSATION. GETTING
25 THINGS DONE LOTS MENTIONED ABOUT NEW YORK AND HUDSON RIVER



November 10, 2021

1 BRIDGE GOING TO OPEN ROAD TOLLING AND THEY'RE DOING THEIR TOLL
2 BOOTH DEMOLITION AND THEIR 300 MILE.

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** TURNPIKE HAS NOW TURNED ON THE ALL ELECTRONIC
5 TOLLING SYSTEM. BUT WE HAVE TO ASK OURSELVES ABOUT A LOT OF
6 WORK BEING DONE ABOUT BEING ABLE TO DECONSTRUCT TOLL PLAZAS SO
7 WE WILL HAVE TRUE OPEN ROAD TOLLING SO WE ELIMINATE THESE
8 OBSTRUCTIONS THAT STILL STAND IN THE WAY OF THIS WORK. AND,
9 WE TALK A LOT ABOUT EQUITY, AND THAT'S IMPORTANT AND I
10 MAINTAIN TO YOU, AN EQUITY THAT TRANSPORTS DEFINITIONS WOULD
11 ASK WHAT WOULD EQUITY WORK LOOK LIKE, I WOULD SAY, "WELL,
12 YOU'RE LOOKING AT ME. I'M WHAT EQUITY LOOKS LIKE." AND THERE
13 ARE MANY THINGS ABOUT ME THAT ARE EQUITY RELATED. SO THIS WORK
14 IS VERY REAL AND PERSONAL TO ME. BECAUSE IT DOES AFFECT ME
15 WHEN I RIDE A BUS OR DO THE OCCASIONAL RIDE-SHARE OVER
16 BRIDGES. AND THE DECOUPLING OF OWNERSHIP AND USE OF VEHICLES
17 IS GOING TO REQUIRE A DEEPER LEVEL OF HOW WE DO THIS WORK OF
18 TOLL COLLECTION, ESPECIALLY WHERE THE CONVENIENCE FEES WITH
19 RENTAL CARS COULD BE VERY EXPENSIVE. I DON'T KNOW MUCH ABOUT
20 BECAUSE I HAVEN'T RENTED A CAR IN, LIKE, TEN YEARS. BUT THERE
21 IS MORE WORK TO DO. I ASK THAT WE DO IT QUICKLY. WE ARE LEADER
22 IN THIS. I HOPE OTHER AGENCIES SEE WHAT WE'RE DOING. AS WE'RE
23 DOING VERY WELL AT IT, AND THE SKY IS NOT FALLING. THANK YOU.
24



November 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO FURTHER HANDS RAISED,
2 MADAM CHAIR.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALETA IF YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS. AND WE WILL
5 NOW -- IF THERE ARE NO FURTHER COMMENTS, EITHER WRITTEN OR IN
6 ATTENDANCE, THEN WE WILL MOVE TO OUR NEXT ITEM TO ADJOURN THIS
7 MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE,
8 AND THE NEXT MEETING IS SCHEDULED TO BE WEDNESDAY DECEMBER
9 8TH, 2021 AT 9:30 A.M. REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST IF THERE IS ANY
10 CHANGE WE WILL NOTICE THE PUBLIC ACCORDINGLY AND
11 APPROPRIATELY. THANK YOU. THANK YOU TO THE COMMITTEE AND THANK
12 YOU EVERYONE FROM THE PUBLIC FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION IN THIS.
13 OVER THIS YEAR WE HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN A LOT OF ISSUES AND I
14 THINK THIS ISSUE IS ONE THAT WE CARE SO DEEPLY ABOUT AND ARE
15 REALLY MOVING -- REALLY HAVE MOVED WITH DELIBERATE SPEED AND
16 NEED TO CONTINUE TO DO THAT. SO I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, WE --
17 AT SAME TIME THAT THIS ISSUE, WE HAVE RAISED, AS WELL AS THE
18 ISSUES OF SUPPORTING, YOU KNOW, THE RESOURCES TO PROVIDE THE
19 MAINTENANCE OF THE BRIDGE, THAT'S THE OTHER SIDE, THAT WILL BE
20 BACK AT US IN DECEMBER. I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR YOUR
21 WORK AND YOUR IMPORTANT CONTRIBUTIONS TO THIS DISCUSSION. SO
22 WITH THAT, THE MEETING IS ADJOURNED. AND I WILL TURN IT NOW TO
23 THE NEXT COMMITTEE. SO, THANK YOU, AGAIN. [ADJOURNED]

24



Broadcasting Government