



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

**Meeting Transcript**



October 27, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WORKSHOP**

3 **WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 27, 2021, 1:30 P.M.**

4

5 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GOOD AFTERNOON. EVERYONE. WE'LL GET  
6 STARTED MOMENTARILY. ALL RIGHT. ARE WE READY TO GO?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YES, SIR. WE'RE READY.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE.  
11 IT'S WITH GREAT HONOR THAT I'M GOING TO CALL TO ORDER THE  
12 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WORKSHOP WHICH HAS BEEN  
13 TALKED ABOUT AT LENGTH, AND I AM FOR ONE VERY EXCITED ABOUT  
14 THIS DAY. KIMBERLY I DON'T BELIEVE WE NEED TO DO ROLL CALL.  
15 BECAUSE THIS IS JUST A WORKSHOP. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A FEW  
16 THINGS AND PROVIDE REMARKS, AND THE THEME IS "BUILDING TRANSIT  
17 FUTURE TOGETHER." I WANT TO THANK MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS FOR  
18 ENGAGING IN THE TWO-DAY WORKSHOP WHERE WE WILL BE TALKING  
19 ABOUT HOW TO ENSURE THE VARIOUS TRANSIT AGENCIES RECOVERIES  
20 FROM THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC AND COME BACK BETTER THAN BEFORE  
21 AND ACKNOWLEDGE TREMENDOUS LEADERSHIP BY COMMISSIONER SPERING  
22 WHO LED THE TASK FORCE THROUGH 18 MONTHS OF DIFFICULT  
23 CONVERSATIONS ARRIVING AT A CONSENSUS, AND I WANT TO PAUSE TO  
24 APPLAUD COMMISSIONER SPERING. [APPLAUSE] THANK YOU, JIM FOR  
25 THAT COMMITMENT TO LOOK INTO THE FUTURE. THIS PAST YEAR HAS



October 27, 2021

1 DELIVERED THE GREATEST SHOCK TO THE BAY AREA AND ITS HISTORY,  
2 WITH MANY SYSTEMS LOSING MORE THAN 80% OF THEIR RIDERS  
3 OVERNIGHT, AND THE \$4 BILLION IN ASSISTANCE FROM CONGRESS LED  
4 BY SPEAKER PELOSI FOR THE REGION'S TRANSIT OPERATORS, WILL  
5 KEEP SERVICES RUNNING, AND PROVIDE OPPORTUNITY TO BE CREATIVE  
6 ABOUT THE TRANSIT FUTURE. THERE IS TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF  
7 UNCERTAINTY FACING PUBLIC TRANSIT TODAY, AND I APPRECIATE THE  
8 ENGAGEMENT OF LEADERS AND THE CONVERSATION. I APPRECIATE YOUR  
9 COMMITMENT TO WORKING TOGETHER, AND TO BRINGING DEFINITION TO  
10 THE WORD CONSENSUS IN A MOMENT AND TIME WHEN IT COULD HAVE  
11 BEEN EASIER TO SAY NO. BUT YOU CHALLENGE YOURSELF TO SAY YES.  
12 AND WE THANK YOU FOR THAT. RIDERSHIP IS STILL DEPRESSED AMONG  
13 OUR MOST RELIANT SYSTEMS. OPERATORS AND ADVOCATES ALIKE WANT  
14 TO TALK ABOUT MORE RESOURCES AND WHERE THEY COME FROM AND HOW  
15 TO SUSTAIN THAT INTO THE FUTURE. DISCUSSION ABOUT A POTENTIAL  
16 NEW REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE IS A CRITICAL COMPONENT TO THE  
17 CONVERSATION. AND I HAVE DIRECTED STAFF TO PUT TOGETHER A  
18 PUBLIC LISTENING SESSION ON THAT TOPIC ABOUT A REGIONAL  
19 MEASURE ON THE AFTERNOON OF FRIDAY, DECEMBER 10TH. PURPOSE OF  
20 TODAY'S WORKSHOP IS TWOFOLD, GIVING THE CHANCE TO HEAR FROM  
21 STAFF AND THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN  
22 TO FRUITION AND BRING FORWARD QUESTIONS AND PRIORITIES TO  
23 GUIDE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS. WE TALK ABOUT CONSENSUS AND I  
24 HOPE ALL OF US TODAY IN PERSON AND VIRTUALLY CHALLENGE  
25 OURSELVES MOVE ON FROM COMMITMENT AND THAT COMMITMENT IS



October 27, 2021

1 WHAT'S GOING ALLOW US TO DELIVER OUTCOMES THAT'S GOING TO  
2 REQUIRE ALL OF US TO COME OUT OF THIS WORKSHOP WITH THAT  
3 COMMITMENT TO DELIVERING AND ADVANCING THOSE OUTCOMES. IT'S A  
4 LONG RANGE PLAN, AND IN THE LONG RANGE PLAN THERE ARE OUTCOMES  
5 THAT WE WANT TO STRIVE FOR AND WE WANT TO BE PIVOTAL IN TERMS  
6 OF HAVING CONVERSATION AROUND THE AUTHORITY WE HAVE AND  
7 TOMORROW WILL BE CRITICAL ABOUT TAKING STEPS AND DISCUSSING  
8 PROCESSES AND RESOURCES IT'S GOING REQUIRE FOR THE BETTERMENT  
9 OF OUR TRANSIT USER IN OUR REGION. SO, WITH THAT, AGAIN, I  
10 WOULD LIKE TO ECHO SPERING'S DIRECTION OF THE TASK FORCE TO  
11 "BE BOLD AND UNFLINCHING" AND TO CARRY THAT FORWARD. I'M GOING  
12 TO WELCOME ASSEMBLYMEMBER DAVID CHIU, A TRUE CHAMPION OF THE  
13 BAY AREA'S TRANSIT SYSTEM. A SEAMLESS VISION. ASSEMBLYMEMBER  
14 CHUI HAS PROVIDED US THE OPPORTUNITY TOGETHER INTRODUCTION OF  
15 LEGISLATION AIMED AT FIXING CHALLENGES AND RIDERSHIP SPACE TO  
16 NAVIGATE THE TRANSIT SYSTEM AND WITHOUT HIS LEADERSHIP  
17 PROVIDING US THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE BOLD AND ALSO CHALLENGING  
18 US TO BRING ABOUT THE FUTURE. YOU HAVE BEEN PROMOTED YOU HAVE  
19 A NEW OPPORTUNITY HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO AS A CITY ATTORNEY,  
20 AND WHAT A GREAT TUNE THE FOR YOU, SACRAMENTO IS GOING TO MISS  
21 YOU AND WE'RE GOING TO MISS YOU BUT THANK YOU FOR JOINING US  
22 TODAY. AT THIS POINT, ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU DO YOU HAVE ANY  
23 REMARKS?  
24



October 27, 2021

1   **DAVID CHIU:** I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING EVERYONE SOON IN PERSON.  
2   IT'S BITTER SWEET TO BE WITH ALL OF YOU FOR WHAT WILL BE MY  
3   LAST ENGAGEMENT WITH THIS BODY AS A MEMBER OF THE CALIFORNIA  
4   STATE ASSEMBLY. IT'S BEEN AN INCREDIBLE HONOR TO WORK WITH SO  
5   MANY OF YOU OVER THE YEARS AS A STATE LEGISLATOR AND I WANT TO  
6   THANK IN PARTICULAR CHAIR PEDROZA FOR ALLOWING ME TO SAY A FEW  
7   WORDS AND SOME FINAL THOUGHTS AS YOU KICK OPEN THIS VERY  
8   IMPORTANT WORKSHOP. AND LET ME ALSO JUST SAY TO MY COLLEAGUES  
9   FROM THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, WELCOME BACK, THANK YOU FOR  
10   ALL OF YOUR TIME, AND I PARTICULARLY WANT TO ABSOLUTE JIM  
11   SPERING FOR YOUR INCREDIBLE LEADERSHIP IN STEWARDING THIS  
12   PROCESS. FOR THOSE OF WHO YOU DIDN'T SIT ON THE TASK FORCE,  
13   YOU HAVE BEEN DELIVERED A SET OF SHORT-TERM AND MID-AND LONGER  
14   TERM PRIORITIES TO IMPLEMENT SOME LONG WAITED INCREDIBLY  
15   EFFECTIVE TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS AND INTEGRATION PLANS TO  
16   HOPEFULLY BUILD BACK RIDERSHIP AND IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF TRIP  
17   FOR ALL OF OUR BAY AREA CONSTITUENTS. THESE ARE PLANS THAT ARE  
18   GOING TO TAKE COMMITMENTS. THEY'RE GOING TO BE EXPENSIVE  
19   MULTI-YEAR EFFORTS THAT WILL REQUIRE COLLABORATION AND  
20   OWNERSHIP ONE I WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE COST OF ACTION IT'S NOT  
21   SOMETHING THAT OUR REGIONAL ECONOMIES CAN AFFORD ECONOMY IS  
22   AFFORD AND THE BAY AREA CAN AFFORD AND NOT SOMETHING OUR  
23   PLANET CAN AFFORD SO APPRECIATE ALL OF YOU AS WE ARE ABOUT TO  
24   EMBARK ON WHAT WOULD BE THIS MULTI-YEAR CONVERSATION. IT'S A  
25   FACT THAT OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS IN THE BAY HAVE BEEN DISJOINTED



October 27, 2021

1 AND THE BURDEN HAS FALLEN ON OUR LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS,  
2 SENIORS, THOSE WITH MOBILITY IMPAIRMENTS. WE KNOW THESE ARE  
3 OUR CONSTITUENTS, AND NEIGHBORS WHO HAVE BEEN RELEGATED TO THE  
4 BACK SEAT LITERALLY FIGURATIVELY BECAUSE OF A CULTURE OF  
5 AUTOMOBILE DEPENDENCE FOR DECADES, AND IF WE'RE GOING TO  
6 IMPLEMENT THINGS LIKE BUS PRIORITIES, FARE INTEGRATION, HUB  
7 AND STATION IMPROVEMENTS FARE AND SCHEDULE REFORM  
8 COORDINATION, THIS IS GOING TO BE A HUGE BENEFIT TO ALL OF US  
9 ESPECIALLY THOSE WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND WILL BE ABLE TO  
10 DRAW PEOPLE OUT OF CARS AND INTO TRANSIT IN THE FIRST PLACE.  
11 SOS ARE GIVEN ALL THIS, WHAT ARE WE GOING TO DO TO GET THERE?  
12 HOW DO WE GET THERE? I WISH I COULD GIVE YOU AN EXACT SEQUENCE  
13 OF EVENTS THAT NEED TO UNFOLD WITH DATES AND THERE AMOUNTS AND  
14 DECISIONS ALL SPELLED OUT. BUT I WANT TO TACK A MOMENT TO  
15 THANK AMAZING STAFF WHO HAVE BEEN ENGAGED FROM MANY OFFICES  
16 ESPECIALLY MTC WHO HAVE BEEN ENGAGED IN TRYING TO FIGURE OUT  
17 THESE MATERIALS THAT YOU'RE GOING TO LOOK AT TODAY AND  
18 TOMORROW. FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, ECHOING ALFREDO, I THINK KEY  
19 COMPONENTS TO GETTING THIS DONE ARE COLLABORATION,  
20 COLLABORATION, AND COLLABORATION. A REAL COMMITMENT FROM ALL  
21 OF THE KEY ACTORS INVOLVED. KEY FROM EXECUTIVE LEADERSHIP,  
22 ELECTED OFFICIALS, COMMUNITY, STAKEHOLDERS, A WILLINGNESS TO  
23 TAKE A STEP BACK AND SEE THIS AT A REGIONAL LEVEL. AND I SAY  
24 THIS AS SOMEONE WHO HAS BEEN A LOCAL OFFICIAL BEEN A STATE  
25 OFFICIAL AND NOW GOING BACK TO LOCAL GOVERNMENT. I WANT TO



October 27, 2021

1 REALLY IMPRESS SOMETHING BECAUSE WE ALL KNOW AS WE SERVE ON  
2 THESE BODIES TOGETHER THAT WE HAVE GOT TO LOOK AT THIS AT A  
3 REGIONAL LEVEL AND THINK ABOUT ALL OF THE WAY IN WHICH THE  
4 STATUS QUO HAS WORKED TO PROTECT ITSELF AND THINK ABOUT HOW  
5 CAN WE, AS STAKEHOLDERS WHO HAVE DIFFERENT CONSTITUENCY, HOW  
6 DO WE BEND AND COMPROMISE WHAT WE NEED TO, AND PERSEVERE IN  
7 THE FACE OF WHAT WE KNOW WILL BE NAYSAYERS AND SKEPTICS. THERE  
8 WILL BE MANY TRADEOFFS IN THESE POLICY CONVERSATIONS,  
9 PARTICULARLY ONE THAT IS THIS AMBITIOUS, AND I THINK WE HAVE  
10 THE OPPORTUNITY WITH THE LEADERSHIP THAT'S REPRESENTED HERE TO  
11 REALLY PILOT THINGS, LEARN FROM SUCCESSES AND FAILURES, AND  
12 PROTECT THE SCARCE BUDGETS OF OUR OPERATORS, AND I ALSO THINK  
13 THAT WE MAY NOT GET AN OPPORTUNITY LIKE THIS FOR DECADES. ONE  
14 OF THE THINGS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT AT THE TASK FORCE IS THE  
15 FACT THAT AS A STATE LEGISLATOR, I AM ONE OF MANY, ALONG THE  
16 LINES OF LITERALLY 50 YEARS OF HISTORY FROM A STATE THAT TRIED  
17 TO PUSH THIS CONVERSATION TO SEE IT NOT SUCCEED. I DON'T THINK  
18 WE HAVE A CHOICE AT THIS MOMENT OF SEEING THE CONTINUANCE OF  
19 STATUS QUO OF CONTINUING TO SUFFER FROM THE IMPACTS OF CLIMATE  
20 CHANGE. AND MY REAL ASK TO EACH OF YOU IS, WE DON'T GET TOO  
21 MANY OF THESE CHANCES IN OUR PROFESSIONAL CAREERS AND WE DON'T  
22 HAVE MUCH TIME FOR OUR REGION TO GET THIS RIGHT AND I REALLY  
23 HOPE THAT WE'RE GIVING YOU THE BALL TO RUN WITH, WE HOPE YOU  
24 CAN TAKE IT, RUN WITH IT, NOT SQUANDER THIS OPPORTUNITY. I  
25 WILL TELL YOU IN MY NEW ROLE AS CITY ATTORNEY FOR SAN



October 27, 2021

1 FRANCISCO WHATEVER I CAN DO TO HELP THIS ALONG, I WANT TO. I'M  
2 ALREADY STARTING TO HAVE CONVERSATIONS WITH MY LEGISLATIVE  
3 COLLEAGUES ABOUT OUR BILL AND CONTINUING THE CONVERSATION. MY  
4 HOPE IS IN THE COMING YEARS WE WILL BE ABLE TO LOOK BACK AT  
5 THIS MOMENT AND SAY THIS IS THE MOMENT WHERE WE MADE THINGS  
6 HAPPEN.

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING  
9 WITH YOU. ROUND OF APPLAUSE TO ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU, PLEASE.  
10 [APPLAUSE] THANK YOU, ASSEMBLYMEMBER. AND I NOW WANT TO ASK  
11 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN WHO HAS SOME REMARKS.

12

13 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR, AND ASSEMBLYMAN FOR  
14 THOSE INSPIRATIONAL REMARKS, AND REMIND THAT THE LONG ROAD  
15 AHEAD IS NOT GOING TO BE EASY BUT WE ALL HAVE TO TROD FORWARD  
16 TOGETHER. IN MY REPORT THIS MORNING TO THE COMMISSION, I NOTED  
17 THE ADOPTION OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE SEISMIC CHANGE  
18 FOR THE REGION, AND IMPORTANTLY THE CRITICAL LINK THAT WE HAD  
19 WITH AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN ELEMENT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
20 AND HOW THE WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, AND  
21 SPECIFICALLY IMPLEMENTING THE TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN IS AN  
22 EXAMPLE, AGAIN, OF THE WORK AHEAD, AND CLEARLY THE SUBJECT OF  
23 THIS WORKSHOP. SO, AS WE CONVENE TODAY, IN OUR HYBRID  
24 ENVIRONMENT, SOME REMOTE, SOME IN PLACE, THE REAL OPPORTUNITY  
25 THAT WE HAVE HAD TO PIVOT, ONE OF THE THINGS WE HAVE LEARNED



October 27, 2021

1 THROUGHOUT THIS PANDEMIC IS TO EXPECT THE UNEXPECTED. WHETHER  
2 IT'S YET ANOTHER SURGE OR WHETHER IT'S THE REMARKABLE  
3 RESILIENCE THAT WE SEE FROM OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS, FROM OUR  
4 ESSENTIAL WORKERS. YOU KNOW, YOU MAKE THE LONG LIST. IT IS  
5 IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT ONE OF THE THINGS WE NEED TO PLAN  
6 FOR IS UNCERTAINTY. AND YET WITH ALL THE WORK WE DID WITH  
7 PLANNED BAY AREA AND SOME OF THE REALLY FORWARD LOOKING  
8 SCENARIO BUILDING WE HAD IN LOOKING AT DIFFERENT FUTURES AND  
9 THE LIKE, ONE THING WAS A CONSTANT, AND THAT WAS THAT PUBLIC  
10 TRANSIT IS A CORNERSTONE OF THE REGION'S ABILITY TO ACHIEVE  
11 OUR ECONOMIC EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL GOALS, NO MATTER WHAT  
12 THE FUTURE MAY HOLD. SO, THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, YOU  
13 KNOW, AGAIN, IN LOOKING AT THAT, ALSO PICKED UP AN INCREDIBLY  
14 IMPORTANT THREAD THAT WAS CRITICAL, AND I WOULD SAY A THEMATIC  
15 FOREFRONT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND OUR WORK HERE WHICH  
16 WAS EQUITY AND THE TASK FORCE RECOGNIZED HOW CRITICAL TRANSIT  
17 IS TO OUR REGION'S RESIDENTS FOR LOW-INCOME. EXCUSE ME --  
18 WITH LOW-INCOME, AND MORE SPECIFICALLY THOSE THAT DON'T HAVE  
19 THE TRAVEL OPTIONS THAT MANY OF US DO, WHERE PUBLIC TRANSIT  
20 REALLY BECOMES A LIFELINE FOR THEM IN TERMS OF REALLY  
21 ACHIEVING WHAT THAT I WANT, YOU KNOW, ON A DAY-TO-DAY BASIS  
22 AND CONNECTING IN THE WAYS THAT, YOU KNOW, REALLY SPELL  
23 QUALITY OF LIFE FOR SO MANY OF US. AND, THE PANDEMIC, MORE  
24 THAN ANYTHING, THREW A HOTSPOT LIGHT ON THAT, WHEN WE REALLY  
25 UNDERSTAND THE FOLKS THAT KEPT RIDING THE BUSES THE FOLKS THAT



October 27, 2021

1 TOOK BART IN THE EARLY MORNING HOURS WERE THE ESSENTIAL  
2 WORKERS, FOLKS THAT WERE GOING TO MEDICAL APPOINTMENTS BY  
3 TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY DID NOT HAVE A CAR TO DO THAT. THEY WERE  
4 THE ONES WHO CONTINUED TO MAKE OUR SYSTEMS -- TO UNDERSCORE  
5 THE RELEVANCE OF THEM EVEN DURING SOME OF THE MOST DISRUPTIVE  
6 TIMES THAT WE HAVE HAD. AND IN RECOGNIZING THAT, ONE OF THE  
7 THINGS THE TASK FORCE DID AFTER COLLECTING INPUT FROM  
8 DISADVANTAGED RIDERS AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION LEADERS WAS  
9 DEVELOP AND ADOPT FIVE EQUITY PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE THE WORK OF  
10 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND THOSE WILL BE REVIEWED LATER ON  
11 IN THE SUMMARY OF WHAT THE TASK FORCE DID AND THE ACTION PLAN  
12 ITSELF. WHAT WAS CRITICAL THERE, THOUGH, IS A RECOMMENDATION,  
13 COMING FROM THE TASK FORCE THAT MTC ADOPT TRANSIT EQUITY  
14 PRINCIPLES, MUCH AS REFLECTED WITH THE BLUE RIBBON, AND TO  
15 DEVELOP A PROCESS FOR INTEGRATING THAT IN ACTIONS COMING  
16 BEFORE IT. I, CERTAINLY, AM COMMITTED TO WORKING WITH POLICY  
17 ADVISERS, STAKEHOLDERS, PARTNERS TO BRING FORWARD VERY  
18 SPECIFIC WAYS THAT THESE TRANSIT EQUITY PRINCIPLES CAN BE  
19 INTEGRATED INTO THE BROADER EQUITY PLATFORM THAT THE  
20 COMMISSION HAS ADOPTED AND WHICH HAS GUIDED OUR WORK.  
21 ACKNOWLEDGING THE DEEP DISRUPTION, THOUGH, THAT WAS CAUSED BY  
22 THE RIDERSHIP LOSSES AND THE ATTENDANT SERVICE CUTS, AND WE'RE  
23 GOING TO HAVE A PRESENTATION FROM OUR TRANSIT PARTNERS ON  
24 THAT, AND WHAT RECOVERY HAS LOOKED LIKE. ONE OF THE THINGS  
25 THAT WE REALIZED IS THAT WE WERE GOING TO HAVE AS MUCH, AS



October 27, 2021

1 CLOSE TO A CLEAN STATE AS POSSIBLE ON WHICH TO REBUILD AND NOT  
2 ONLY TO REBUILD BUT TO COME BACK BETTER AND DIFFERENT. AND AS  
3 ASSEMBLYMAN CHIU STATED, STATUS QUO CANNOT BE THE OBJECTIVE IN  
4 THAT EFFORT. IT'S MOVING BEYOND THAT WITH INTENTION. THAT  
5 DROVE THE VISION THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE PUSHED  
6 FORWARD FOR A FASTER MORE CONVENIENT AND MORE EQUITABLE PUBLIC  
7 TRANSIT EXPERIENCE, AND CHARTING A PATH TO REACH THERE WITH  
8 SPECIFIC ACTIONABLE STEPS THAT HAD, AS CHAIR PEDROZA HAS SAID,  
9 CONSISTENTLY, THE OUTCOMES THAT CAN BE MEASURED IN TERMS OF  
10 CHANGE AND HOW THAT IMPACTS THE LIFE OF THOSE THAT WE'RE  
11 TRYING TO SERVE. WITH THAT, WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO IS ORIENT  
12 YOU TO THE NEXT DAY AND A HALF, THAT WILL BE BUSY, AND IF THE  
13 TEAM COULD PULL UP A FEW SLIDES ON THE AGENDA, I'LL WALK  
14 THROUGH THOSE QUICKLY, AS A STAGE SETTING CLOSE FOR MY REMARK.  
15 SO, I BELIEVE THEY'RE BEING BOUGHT UP. THERE WE GO. OKAY. SO  
16 IF WE COULD GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. ONE OF THE THINGS, YOU  
17 KNOW, AGAIN, AND WE'LL BE HEARING THIS THROUGHOUT THE  
18 PRESENTATION, IS WE WANT TO RECEIVE COMMISSION GUIDANCE, IN  
19 FACT, I WOULD MAKE THAT MUCH SHARPER. WE WANT TO RECEIVE  
20 COMMISSION DIRECTION ON HOW THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION  
21 PLAN IS GOING TO BE CARRIED OUT. AND I'M GOING TO JUST LIFT UP  
22 WHAT ASSEMBLYMAN CHIU SAID, COLLABORATION, COLLABORATION,  
23 COLLABORATION. THIS IS SOMETHING THAT NO ONE AGENCY, NO ONE  
24 PERSON, NO ONE LEADER, NO ONE STAKEHOLDER IS GOING TO DO ALONE  
25 WE ALL NEED TO PULL TOGETHER IN IMPLEMENTING THIS PLAN,



October 27, 2021

1 PARTICULARLY GIVEN THE CONTINUING CHALLENGES THAT A COVID-19  
2 ENVIRONMENT HAS PRESENTED US. WE WILL BE LOOKING TO MTC'S  
3 LEGISLATIVE ESTABLISHED RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE COORDINATION OF  
4 PUBLIC TRANSIT ON ITS FACE. THAT'S A NATURAL SPRING BOARD TO  
5 WORK FROM, BUT I THINK THERE IS AN ASSESSMENT OF HOW WE WERE  
6 DOING IN THAT SPACE. SHOULD WE BE DOING SOMETHING DIFFERENTLY  
7 WITH THE AUTHORITY WE HAVE, OR SHOULD THE AUTHORITY BE  
8 MODIFIED IN ANY WAY. WE WANT TO CONFIRM THE NEAR-TERM ACTION  
9 PLAN IMPLEMENTATION, AS I RECALL, THERE IS 27 DIFFERENT  
10 ACTIONS THAT ARE LISTED, BUT IN FOCUSING ON HOW TO MOVE  
11 SWIFTLY IN, YOU KNOW, IN TERMS OF CHANGE, WE WANT TO FOCUS ON  
12 A CORE FEW EFFORTS THAT WE CAN REALLY GET GOING QUICKLY AND  
13 SEE IMPACT AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. AND THEN, FINALLY, WE HAVE  
14 THE GOAL OF DISCUSSING A VERY IMPORTANT CONCEPT THAT WAS  
15 DISCUSSED WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, AND WAS THE SUBJECT  
16 OF SOME CONSULTANT ASSISTANCE, WHICH WAS THE TRANSIT NETWORK  
17 MANAGEMENT CONCEPT AND PARADIGM, AND THE BUSINESS CASE  
18 ANALYSIS THAT MTC IS ADVANCING AND DISCUSS WITH YOU THE  
19 COMMISSION, WHAT IS THAT BUSINESS CASE PURPOSE, SCOPE,  
20 PROCESS, AND TIMELINE. NEXT SLIDE. SO HERE IS OUR AGENDA FOR  
21 THE DAY, AND ONE WAY TO THINK ABOUT IT IS THAT TODAY IS REALLY  
22 GOING TO BE ABOUT GETTING OUR ARMS AROUND WHERE WE ARE NOW,  
23 TODAY, ON A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT ELEMENTS. VERSUS TOMORROW,  
24 WHICH IS, WHERE DO WE WANT TO GO AND HOW DO WE GET THERE? SO  
25 WITH RESPECT TODAY, WE'LL START OUT WITH A REALLY IMPORTANT



October 27, 2021

1 DISCUSSION BACK TO THE UNCERTAINTY OF TIMES IS, WHAT ARE THE  
2 CURRENT TREND THAT WE'RE SEEING? WHAT ARE THE PERSPECTIVES OF  
3 OUR BUSINESS AND INDUSTRY, STAKEHOLDERS, AND PARTNERS IN TERMS  
4 OF PUBLIC TRANSIT AND WHAT WE HAVE EXPERIENCED TO DATE, AND  
5 WHERE MIGHT IT BE GOING. OUR TRANSIT AGENCY PARTNERS WILL DO A  
6 PRESENTATION ON THE CRITICAL RECOVERY PERSPECTIVE. WE ARE NOT  
7 OUT OF THIS PANDEMIC. THERE ARE STILL LONG-REACHING IMPACTS  
8 THAT WE'RE WORKING THROUGH, AND THAT WILL AFFECT, CLEARLY, OUR  
9 SUCCESS, AND DEFINE SOME OF THE CHALLENGES GOING FORWARD. AND  
10 THEN WE'LL HAVE, YOU KNOW, PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT. THEN WE'LL  
11 HAVE A BREAK AND PIVOT, WHEN WE RETURN, TO MTC AS A  
12 TRANSFORMATION HUB OF, ONE MIGHT SAY, YOU WE KIND OF PUT  
13 FORWARD THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, AND THROUGH THE WORK OF SO  
14 MANY COMMISSIONERS, AND AGAIN, CRITICALLY IMPORTANT THE WORK  
15 OF COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING, AND CARRYING THE BLUE RIBBON  
16 COMMISSION AND STEWARDING US THROUGH SOMETIMES TURBULENT  
17 TIMES. WE WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT FOR THOSE COMMISSIONERS, NOT  
18 INTIMATELY PART OF THE BLUE RIBBON EFFORT, WHAT THE TRANSIT  
19 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN REALLY LOOKS LIKE. BECAUSE THAT WAS  
20 A LOT OF WORK. TO HIGHLIGHT THE ALIGNMENT WITH OUR CURRENT  
21 COORDINATION RULE, AND WITHIN THAT, DEEP DIVE, AGAIN, INTO  
22 WHAT STATUTORY AUTHORITIES ARE IN PLACE TODAY, AND HOW THOSE  
23 HAVE MANIFESTED IN OUR WORK. AFTER THAT, WE'LL BE ABLE TO  
24 REFLECT ON THAT, YOU KNOW, IN THE EVENING, IN THE MORNING, AND  
25 COME BACK AND TALK ABOUT, GIVEN ALL OF THAT OF WHERE WE ARE,



October 27, 2021

1 WHERE DO WE WANT TO GO. AND WE'LL BE VERY SPECIFIC IN TERMS OF  
2 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPLEMENTING THE ACTION PLAN IN THE NEAR-  
3 TERM, PARTICULARLY THE ACCELERATED PRIORITIES OF WHICH THERE  
4 ARE THREE. AND THEN OTHER ACTIONS THAT WILL BE, SORT OF, ON  
5 DECK FOR LACK OF A BETTER SPORTS ANALOGY. BUT, REALLY  
6 IMPORTANT, AS WELL, WHAT ARE THE FUNDING NEEDS. WE ALL KNOW  
7 THAT RESOURCES HAVE TO BE BROUGHT TO BEAR FOR CHANGE. IN SOME  
8 CASES IT WILL BE EXISTING RESOURCES, BUT CLEARLY THERE WILL BE  
9 NEW RESOURCES THAT ALSO WE WILL NEED TO CONSIDER. WE'LL TAKE A  
10 BREAK AFTER THAT DISCUSSION, AND THEN PICK UP WITH HOW WE  
11 ENSURE TRANSFORMATION OVER THE LONG-TERM FOR A MORE  
12 ORGANIZATIONAL LENS. AND THAT HAS TO DO WITH, AGAIN, A REVIEW  
13 OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE, AND, AS WELL AS, FOR  
14 THE COMMISSIONERS, PARTICULARLY, HOW WILL WE MANAGE THIS  
15 REALLY AMBITIOUS PORTFOLIO THROUGH THE COMMISSION STRUCTURE  
16 ITSELF, AND THEN HOW DO WE ENSURE THE ENGAGEMENT OF OUR PUBLIC  
17 AS PART OF THAT. SO, WITH THAT, THAT'S THE DAY AHEAD. AND I  
18 WANT TO NOTE IF WE CAN BRING THE SLIDES DOWN, AND RETURN TO  
19 SHARING SCREEN WITH EACH OTHER. I WOULD LIKE TO NOTE THAT  
20 KATE -- WHOOPS -- THAT'S A LOT OF FEEDBACK -- THAT KATE WHITE  
21 IS WITH FOLKS IN THE ROOM FACILITATING THE FOLKS THAT HAVE  
22 GATHERED IN-PERSON. MANY OF YOU KNOW -- MAY KNOW KATE AS A  
23 LONG-TERM BAY AREA TRANSIT SUPPORTER. SHE HAD A VERY IMPORTANT  
24 ROLE AS THE DEPUTY SECRETARY AT CALSTA IN GOVERNOR BROWN'S  
25 ADMINISTRATION, AND SHE'S NOW A POLICY LEADER WITH AIR UP IN



October 27, 2021

1 ITS SAN FRANCISCO OFFICE AND SHE WILL BE FACILITATING AT 375  
2 BEALE WE'RE ALSO JOINED BY SHIPLEY, A PARTNER AT CIVIC EDGE  
3 CONSULTING. WAVE YOUR HAND. THERE IS AMBER. AND SHE WILL BE  
4 FACILITATING FOR THOSE OF US THAT WILL BE PARTICIPATING  
5 REMOTELY. ONCE IT'S TIME FOR QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSIONS WE'LL  
6 LOOK TO AMBER TO HELP GUIDE US THROUGH THAT AND ENSURE THAT WE  
7 HEAR FROM EVERYONE ONLINE AND IN PERSON, WE'RE EXPECTING A LOT  
8 OF PARTICIPATION, AND THE COMMISSIONERS IN THE ROOM, IF YOU  
9 WILL -- IN THE ROOM, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, PLEASE STAND  
10 UP THE NAME CARD OR PUSH YOUR MICROPHONE BUTTON THAT HAS A  
11 LIGHT TO INDICATE THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO SHARE. ON ZOOM, WE'LL  
12 USE THE, NOW INCREDIBLY FAMILIAR "RAISE YOUR HAND" FEATURE,  
13 THAT I AM SURE ALL OF YOU HAVE MASTERED AFTER 18 MONTHS BEING  
14 INVOLVED WITH ZOOM. WITH THAT I'LL HAND IT OVER TO KATE WHITE  
15 FOR HOUSING KEEPING AND ADDITIONAL HYBRID MEETING INFO.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU THERESE. GREAT TO BE HERE. I HAVE BEEN  
18 FOLLOWING THE GREAT WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE OVER  
19 THE LAST 18 MONTHS AND AM REAL EXCITED TO SEE IT ADVANCING  
20 TODAY. I HAD ONE HOUSING KEEPING THING IN ADDITION WHAT  
21 THERESE SAID, FOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ATTENDING. IF YOU ARE  
22 ATTENDING IN PERSON HERE ON BEALE STREET, YOU CAN FILL OUT A  
23 BLUE CARD THAT'S AVAILABLE IN THE FRONT OF THE ROOM, RIGHT  
24 OUTSIDE THE CONFERENCE ROOM, AND YOU CAN HAND IT TO ANY OF THE  
25 STAFF OR MYSELF, AND WE'LL MAKE SURE THAT THE CHAIR HAS IT AND



October 27, 2021

1 CAN CALL ON YOU. IF YOU ARE A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, WHEN WE  
2 GET TO PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE, AGAIN, PLEASE USE THE RAISE HAND  
3 FEATURE OR YOU CAN DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CLERK WILL CALL ON  
4 YOU. THANK YOU. CHAIR PEDROZA?

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S BUCKLE UP, AND LET'S  
7 GO. OUR NEXT ITEM IS ROUTING TRANSIT'S TRANSFORMATION THROUGH  
8 UNCERTAIN TIMES. WE'RE GOING TO KICKOFF THIS AFTERNOON BY  
9 DOING SOME LEVEL SETTING ABOUT WHAT THE TRANSPORTATION  
10 LANDSCAPE LOOKS LIKE TODAY AND HOW IT'S CHANGED OVER THE  
11 COURSE OF THE PANDEMIC WE'LL HEAR FROM REPRESENTATIVES FROM  
12 BUSINESSES COMMUNITY AND HOW REMOTE WORK PATTERNS BEGUN DURING  
13 THE PANDEMIC AND HOW THEY MAY BE WITH US INTO THE LONG-TERM  
14 AND ALSO GOING TO HEAR FROM TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT DELIVER  
15 SERVICE EVERY DAY AND THE CHALLENGES THEY FACE PLANNING FOR  
16 THE UNCERTAIN FUTURE IF RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE. FIRST  
17 PRESENTATION WILL BE FROM DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDREW  
18 FREMIER. WE'LL HEAR FROM ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS. FIRST ANDY.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU CHAIR  
21 PEDROZA THE GOAL OF THIS PRESENTATION IS TO BOTH PROVIDE  
22 BACKGROUND AND BASELINE INFORMATION ABOUT THE CURRENT TRENDS  
23 THAT IMPACT TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IN THE BAY AREA. I BELIEVE WE  
24 HAVE A PRESENTATION THAT SHOULD BE WORKING ITS WAY UP FOR  
25 THOSE FOLKS IN THE BOOTH. LOOKING AT TRAVEL PATTERNS PRIMARILY



October 27, 2021

1 ON THE ROAD WISE AS THE REGION GRADUALLY RECOVERS FROM COVID-  
2 19 LOCKDOWN AND WORK-FROM-HOME ORDERS. I THINK WE RECOGNIZE  
3 HOW HARD OPERATORS HAVE BEEN WORKING IN THIS SPACE, AND  
4 ADJUSTING TO THESE TRYING CONDITIONS AND HOPEFULLY INFORM TO  
5 SET THE STAGE GOING FORWARD. METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION  
6 COMMISSION TASK FORCE WORK DID EXTENSIVE RESEARCH ABOUT BAY  
7 AREA RESIDENTS CURRENT ATTITUDES AROUND PUBLIC TRANSIT TO  
8 ENSURE WE WERE FOCUSING ON THINGS EVER PRIORITY TO THE PUBLIC  
9 RESEARCH INCLUDING STATISTICALLY VALID POLLS OF THOUSANDS OF  
10 BAY AREA RESIDENTS CONDUCTED IN APRIL AND AT COMMUNITY FOCUS  
11 GROUPS, LANGUAGES IN ENGLISH, SPANISH, CANTONESE AND WENT TO  
12 EMPLOYER FOCUSED GROUPS ACROSS THE BOARD CONSISTENTLY HEARD  
13 FROM BAY AREA RESIDENTS AND TRANSIT OFFERS. WE FOUND THE BAY  
14 AREA RESIDENTS WERE NOD SATISFIED WITH TRANSIT BEFORE THE  
15 PANDEMIC AND THAT I WANT CHANGES NOW AS WELL. RELIABILITY,  
16 FREQUENCIES OF USE AND SAFETY WERE ALL IN NEED OF IMPROVEMENT  
17 AND OVERWHELMING MAJORITY BELIEVE THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT IS  
18 IMPORTANT TO THE BAY AREA AND SUPPORT ITS -- IS STRONG AMONG  
19 RIDERS AND TRANSIT USERS ALIKE. COORDINATION OF TRANSIT  
20 SEAMLESS MULTI-MODAL SYSTEMS IS VERY POPULAR CONCEPTS WHICH  
21 RECEIVED ABOUT 89% SUPPORT ACROSS THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. BAY  
22 AREA RESIDENTS ARE UNIFIED IN WANTING A MORE SEAMLESS PUBLIC  
23 TRANSIT SYSTEM. THEY WANT TO SEE REALTIME INFORMATION ON WAIT  
24 TIMES AND VEHICLE LOCATION. THAT I WANT BETTER SUPPORT FOR  
25 TRANSIT DEPENDENT POPULATIONS AND THAT I WANT MORE DIRECT



October 27, 2021

1 SERVICE AND FARE COORDINATION. NEXT SLIDE. A SUPER MAJORITY  
2 OF RESIDENTS AGREE ON WHAT'S IMPORTANT. EASY TO USE MAPS AND  
3 SIGNAGE, A SINGLE MOBILE APP FOR PAYMENT AND PLANNING  
4 PURPOSES, SINGLE SET OF FARES PASSES AND DISCOUNTS AND  
5 DEDICATED TRAVELING TO SPEED UP TRANSPORTATION. WITH THAT  
6 BACKGROUND OPINION IN CONTEXT WE'LL LOOK AT WHAT'S GOING ON IN  
7 TRAVEL PATTERNS TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE SHOWED THIS SLIDE AT  
8 THE BEGINNING OF SOME OF OUR WORK AND HAVE ADDED A CURRENT  
9 SLIDE ON THE RIGHT. BUT AS A REMINDER, THE BLUE, THE DARKER  
10 BLUE REPRESENTS HOW MUCH TRAFFIC HAS DISSIPATED FROM WHAT IS  
11 NORMAL. AND WHAT WE HAVE TREATED AS NORMAL THROUGHOUT THESE  
12 PRESENTATIONS IS SEPTEMBER 2019. SO AS YOU SEE IN THE LEFT  
13 CHART WITH ALL THE BLUE RIGHT AFTER THE SHELTER-IN-PLACE TOOK  
14 HOLD TRAFFIC WAS REALLY VERY MUCH DISAPPEARED THROUGHOUT THE  
15 REGION. BUT BY DECEMBER OF 2020 AS YOU SEE AREAS IN THE MIDDLE  
16 OF THE MAP THAT ARE DARK RED INDICATE THE TRAFFIC PATTERNS ARE  
17 BACK TO THE 2019 LEVELS IN THOSE AREAS AND BY SEPTEMBER 2021  
18 TRAFFIC VOLUMES HAVE COMPLETELY RETURNED, AND YOU SEE THE RED  
19 PERMEATES THE ENTIRE REGION. THE GEOGRAPHIC VARIATION IS  
20 OBVIOUS. TRAFFIC HAS BEEN SLOWEST TO RETURN IN THE SILICON  
21 VALLEY LIKELY TO HIGHER RATES OF WORKING FROM HOME, THE  
22 TRAFFIC HAS RETURNED THE FASTEST ON THE BARR CORRIDOR, I80,  
23 880, HIGHWAY 24 AND THE BAY BRIDGE LIKELY PEOPLE SWITCHING  
24 AWAY FROM TRANSIT AND INTO HIGH-OCCUPANCY VEHICLES WE'RE ALSO  
25 SEES THE PERIPHERY CORRIDORS AND RURAL AREAS LEADING OUT OF



October 27, 2021

1 THE REGION ARE SHOWING SIGNS OF THE TRAFFIC AS WELL. NEXT  
2 SLIDE. YOU WILL SEE IN THIS PRESENTATION REPRESENTATION OF A  
3 STORY FOR A LOT OF FOLKS. AS WAY OF REFERENCE AGAIN WE HAVE  
4 GOT 100% REPRESENTING WHAT TRAFFIC WAS LIKE IN 2019 AND  
5 EVERYTHING COMPARED AGAINST THAT. THE DARK BLUE CHART LINE  
6 WHICH IS THE HOCKEY LOOKING STICK THING REALLY SHOWS WHAT  
7 HAPPENED IN 2020. YOU CAN SEE THE LARGE DIP AROUND SHELTER-IN-  
8 PLACE, AND THEN A SLOW RISE FROM THAT POINT FORWARD. THE LIGHT  
9 BLUE LINE PART WAY THROUGH REPRESENTS WHAT IS HAPPENING THIS  
10 YEAR. AGAIN, THERE IS SOME GROWTH, BUT THE GROWTH IS PRETTY  
11 SLOW IN TERMS OF FOLKS GETTING BACK ON TO OVERALL BAY AREA  
12 TRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE IS TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT USE  
13 AND HOUSEHOLD INCOME. AND WHAT WE SEE HERE IS A SERIES OF  
14 DIFFERENT TRAVEL MODES, LOCAL BUS ON THE LEFT, FERRIES IN THE  
15 MIDDLE AND RAIL ON THE RIGHT. 100% REPRESENTS ALL OF THE  
16 TRAVELERS IN THIS TIME PERIOD AND THE COLORS REPRESENT INCOME  
17 LEVELS THE DARKER THE COLOR THE LOWER THE INCOME LEVEL. THE  
18 DIFFERENCE ACROSS AREAS OF TRANSIT RECOVERY CAN BE EXPLAINED  
19 LIE LOOKING AT PASSENGER SURVEY DATA FOR THE REGION THAT SHOWS  
20 THIS INCOME DATA FOR THE RIDERS. THE DARKER BLUE LINES  
21 REPRESENTS INCOME HOUSEHOLDS THAT YOU CAN SEE ARE ALMOST ON  
22 ALL LOCAL BUSES AND HIGHER INCOME RIDERS AREN'T COMING BACK TO  
23 THE OTHER SYSTEMS LIKE THE FERRY. BUT WE ARE SEEING THAT LOCAL  
24 INCOME -- LOWER INCOME RIDERS ARE MORE LIKELY TO BE WORKING IN  
25 PERSON AND RELY ON THE TRANSIT TO GET TO THEIR DESTINATION.



October 27, 2021

1 NEXT SLIDE. SO MOVING TO THE ROADWAYS, THIS MAP ILLUSTRATES  
2 WHAT'S HAPPENING ON OUR VARIOUS BRIDGES. THE RED LINES  
3 INDICATE WHERE TRAFFIC IS CLOSE TO THE 2019 LEVELS AND YOU SEE  
4 TWO PROFILES HERE SAN FRANCISCO OAKLAND BAY BRIDGE RICHMOND  
5 BRIDGE CARQUINEZ IN BENICIA 50% RETURNED TO THEIR VEHICLES, TO  
6 JUST ABOUT 90% IN THE SOUTHERN BRIDGES AND GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE  
7 DROPPED ABOUT 60% TO 70% AFTER SHELTER-IN-PLACE AND ARE STILL  
8 DOWN MORE THAN 20% ALL DUE LIKELY TO THE FACT THAT SOME AREAS  
9 ARE WORKING FROM HOME. NEXT SLIDE. IT'S ALSO WORTHWHILE  
10 LOOKING AT THE BAY BRIDGE CORRIDOR. WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT  
11 THIS CORRIDOR FOR YEARS IN THE REGION AND AGAIN IF YOU LOOK AT  
12 THE FAR LEFT THAT ZERO LINE WHERE EVERYTHING KIND OF CONVERGES  
13 TOGETHER IS WHAT IT WAS LIKE IN 2019 AND AS YOU CARRY THE  
14 GRAPHS ACROSS THE RIGHT, BOTTOM AXIS IS TIME GOING THROUGH AT  
15 THE LAST YEAR OR SO. WHAT WE DO SEE, THOUGH, IS THAT TRAFFIC  
16 IN THIS MULTI-MODAL CORRIDOR, THE TOP REDLINE INDICATES THAT  
17 WE HAVE GOT MORE CARS ON THE PROJECT THAN WE HAD IN 2019, BUT  
18 THEY'RE NOT HOV DRIVERS, WE SEE CONSIDERABLE DROP IN HOV LANE  
19 VOLUMES IN THE GREEN CHART, WHICH WAS ABOUT 70% OF 2019 AND  
20 BART RIDERSHIP AT 19% INCLUDING THE FARE DISCOUNTS SHOWN AT  
21 THE BOTTOM. THE COMBINED BRIDGE AND BART TERRIFIC REALLY  
22 REPRESENT RECOVERY AT ABOUT 50% OF PRECOVID IN THE MULTIMODAL  
23 CORRIDOR. NEXT SLIDE. CONGESTION IS RETURNING DIFFERENTLY AND  
24 IT'S POINTING OUT IN THIS MAP THAT PROVIDES A SNAPSHOT OF  
25 CONGESTION DURING COMMUTE HOURS ACROSS THE REGION. IN



October 27, 2021

1 COMPARISON, WE SEE IN 2019 THE TRAFFIC IS WORSE THAN BEFORE ON  
2 THE EASTBOUND DIRECTION I-880 PEOPLE AVOIDING TRANSIT IN HIGH-  
3 OCCUPANCY VEHICLE TRAVEL AND CONGESTION CREEPING BACK IN THE  
4 NORTH BAY AND REMAINS. STILL COMING BACK CONNECTING TO SILICON  
5 VALLEY IN THE HIGH RATES OF WORKING FROM HOME.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ANDY. WE'LL NOW HAVE GWEN  
8 LITVAK FROM THE SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP, FOLLOWED BY  
9 JASON TO TALK ABOUT THE BUSINESS INDUSTRY AND PERSPECTIVES.

10

11 **GWEN LITVAK:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR HAVING JASON AND MYSELF  
12 TODAY. THE SURVEY DATA WE'RE SHARING WITH YOU TODAY TRACKS THE  
13 PACE OF CHANGE IN EMPLOYER ATTITUDES ABOUT RETURNING TO THE  
14 OFFICE AND RETURNING TO TRANSIT. WE'LL SHARE A SUBSET OF OUR  
15 FINDINGS BUT THE FULL SURVEY IS YOUR WORKSHOP PACKET. THE  
16 COUNCIL SURVEY OF THE RESULTS I'LL SHOW YOU HERE, WAS SENT TO  
17 OVER 500 EMPLOYERS ACROSS THE REGION OF DIFFERING SIZES AND  
18 SECTORS. WE HAD ABOUT 240 RESPONDENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO  
19 THIS QUESTION ASKED ABOUT CURRENT IN-OFFICE ATTENDANCE. AS YOU  
20 CAN SEE, ALMOST 32% OF EMPLOYERS HAVE PEOPLE IN THE OFFICE AN  
21 AVERAGE OF ZERO DAYS PER WEEK WHILE 25% OF EMPLOYERS HAVE  
22 PEOPLE BACK IN THE OFFICE FIVE DAYS PER WEEK WITH VARYING  
23 ATTENDANCE IN THE MIDDLE. WE THINK THIS IS A DISTINCTION  
24 BETWEEN ESSENTIAL AND NON-ESSENTIAL EMPLOYEES WHILE FOLKS IN  
25 THE MIDDLE ARE ESTABLISHING A NEW ROUTINE AND FIGURING OUT HOW



October 27, 2021

1 MANY DAYS THEY DO WANT TO BE IN THE OFFICE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
2 THIS QUESTION ASKED ABOUT RETURN TO OFFICE ONCE THE PANDEMIC  
3 IS BEHIND US. SO, OVER 40% OF EMPLOYERS BELIEVE THAT THEIR  
4 EMPLOYEES WILL COME TO THE OFFICE THREE DAYS PER WEEK, AND  
5 AROUND 22% OF EMPLOYEES THINK THEY EMPLOYEES WILL COME INTO  
6 THE OFFICE AN AVERAGE OF LESS THAN THREE DAYS PER WEEK. AS YOU  
7 CAN SEE REGARDLESS OF VACCINE, KIDS RETURNING TO SCHOOL OR ANY  
8 OTHER FACTOR THREE DAYS PER WEEK HAS BEEN THE STAPLE. THIS  
9 QUESTION ASKED EMPLOYERS ABOUT WHICH DAY OF THE WEEK THAT I  
10 THINK EMPLOYEES WILL COME INTO THE OFFICE. EMPLOYERS BELIEVE  
11 THAT ONLY 50% OF THEIR EMPLOYEES WILL COME TO THE OFFICE ON  
12 MONDAY, LESS THAN 50% ON FRIDAY, AND AROUND 60% TUESDAY,  
13 WEDNESDAY, AND THURSDAY. NEXT SLIDE. THIS QUESTION ASKED  
14 EMPLOYERS WHEN THEY WILL START BRINGING BACK NON-ESSENTIAL  
15 EMPLOYEES TO THE OFFICE. YOU SEE IN THE TOP LINE OVER 50% OF  
16 EMPLOYERS SAY THAT I HAVE BEGUN BRINGING BACK NON-ESSENTIAL  
17 EMPLOYEES TO THE OFFICE. AND YOU SEE THE VARYING 1 TO 2, 3 TO  
18 4, ALL THE WAY TO 6% THAT THINK IT WILL TAKE A YEAR BEFORE  
19 THEY START BRINGING BACK PEOPLE TO THE OFFICE. NEXT SLIDE  
20 PLEASE. THIS QUESTION ASKED EMPLOYERS WHEN THEY EXPECT THEIR  
21 OFFICE WILL HAVE ACHIEVED THE NEW NORMAL. 29% SAID THAT THEY  
22 ARE OPERATING AT THE NEW NORMAL. THIS IS THE MOST SINCE THE  
23 SURVEY BEGAN IN APRIL. SO THAT'S EXCITING. ABOUT 66% OF  
24 EMPLOYERS THINK THAT THEY OFFICE WILL THE NEW NORMAL BY  
25 JANUARY 2022, AND ONLY FOUR% SAID THEY DON'T PLAN TO BRING



October 27, 2021

1 EMPLOYEES BACK TO THE WORKPLACE AT ALL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
2 THIS QUESTION ASKED SPECIFICALLY ABOUT COVID SAFETY. THE GOOD  
3 NEWS IS THAT ONLY 15% OF EMPLOYER IN OCTOBER WERE CONCERNED  
4 ABOUT COVID SAFETY ON TRANSIT. YOU WILL SEE IN YOUR PACKET  
5 THAT THERE ARE OTHER SAFETY CONCERNS ON TRANSIT OVERALL. NEXT  
6 SLIDE PLEASE. HERE IS CASTLE, WHICH IS AN OFFICE SECURITY  
7 COMPANY BACK TO WORK BAROMETER. THIS IS BASED ON OFFICE KEY  
8 SWIPES, DATA IS COMPILED WEEKLY. SAN FRANCISCO METRO AREA AND  
9 SAN JOSE METRO AREA HAVE THE LOWEST OFFICE VACANCY FOR THE  
10 WEEK OF OCTOBER 13TH. AND UNFORTUNATELY SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN  
11 JOSE HAVE TRADITIONALLY LAGGED BEHIND THE AGENCY WHICH IS  
12 AROUND 30%. HERE YOU CAN SEE 36.2% WEEK OVER WEEK. JASON?  
13

14 **JASON BAKER:** THANKS GWEN. MY NAME IS JASON BAKER, I HAD THE  
15 TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND HEALTH PORTFOLIO FOR THE SILICON  
16 LEADERSHIP GROUP AND WE HAD NEARLY 400 MEMBERS THROUGHOUT THE  
17 BAY AREA WE HAVE A LONG HISTORY OF SUPPORTING TRANSPORTATION  
18 IN THIS REGION INCLUDING A SERIES OF SUCCESSFUL BALLOT  
19 MEASURES TO BRING BART TO SAN JOSE, SANTA CLARA AND HELPING,  
20 WORKING WITH YOU ALL, ON RM3 AND MOST RECENTLY [INDISCERNIBLE]  
21 MEASURE RR LAST NOVEMBER TO BRING AN ESTIMATED \$3 BILLION  
22 DOLLARS TO SUPPORT CALTRAIN FOR DECADES TO COME. BECAUSE OF  
23 THAT I'LL BE AS BRIEF AS I CAN. I'LL HIT A FEW HIGHLIGHTS.  
24 WHAT THE DATA SHOWS IS THAT TRANSFORMATIONAL CHANGES IN HOW  
25 AND WHERE PEOPLE WORK ARE LIKELY TO STAY. TWO THIRDS OF



October 27, 2021

1 RESPONDENTS REPORTED THAT WORKERS WOULD BE ALLOWED TO WORK  
2 REMOTELY BETWEEN 3 TO 5 DAYS A WEEK EVEN ONCE THE PANDEMIC  
3 WANES. EVEN IN THESE UNCERTAIN TIMES 64% OF RESPONDENTS WERE  
4 CONFIDENT THAT IT'S GOING TO STAY THAT WAY. GIVEN CHANGE IN  
5 EFFECTS OF HISTORIC LEVEL PANDEMIC WHERE OUR INNOVATION  
6 MEMBERS HAVE TRADITIONALLY BEEN SUPPORTERS OF TRANSIT WHEREIN  
7 CONTINUING TO SUPPORT TRANSIT ENCOURAGING AND INCENTIVIZING  
8 EMPLOYEES TO USE TRANSIT. WE STARTED SURVEYING MEMBERS ON  
9 THESE ISSUE IN 2020, AND IT WASN'T GOOD NEWS. 8% OF  
10 RESPONDENTS SAID THEY WOULD SUPPORT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION EVEN  
11 AFTER SHELTER-IN-PLACE ORDERS WERE OVER. ESSENTIALLY AT THIS  
12 POINT IN THE PANDEMIC NO ONE WAS IN A MOOD TO SUPPORT ANYTHING  
13 THERE WAS FEAR AND RISK. NEXT SLIDE. SAME QUESTION TO ASK THIS  
14 MONTH OCTOBER 2021 THE NEWS IS MUCH BETTER WE ASKED WHEN THE  
15 PANDEMIC IS BEHIND US WHICH TRANSPORTATION MODES WOULD YOU  
16 ENCOURAGE AND INCENTIVIZE AND TWO THIRDS OF RESPONDENTS SAID  
17 YES BUSINESS IS STILL THERE FOR TRANSIT GOOD NEWS NOT TAKEN  
18 FOR GRANTED AND WILL MEAN MORE RIDERS, YOU SEE THE 84% IN THE  
19 TOP LINE THAT EMPLOYERS WOULD ENCOURAGE TELEWORK  
20 OVERWHELMINGLY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BOTH SURVEYS SHOW  
21 SUSTAINABLE SHIFT TOWARD REMOTE WORK TRANSFORMING HOW AND  
22 WHERE PEOPLE WORK AND CHANGES ARE HERE TO STAY WE IN THE  
23 BUSINESS COMMUNITY ARE READY TO ENGAGE AND SUPPORT TRANSIT,  
24 READY TO BUILD BACK TRANSIT TOGETHER WITH YOU AND AS WE DO  
25 THAT WE ENCOURAGE YOU TO BE BOLD AND TRANSFORM OUR TRANSIT



October 27, 2021

1 SYSTEM TO MEET THIS MOMENT IN HISTORY. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME  
2 AND ATTENTION AND YOUR VERY IMPORTANT WORK DURING THIS  
3 HISTORIC TIME.

4

5 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, JASON, AND THANK YOU GWEN,  
6 VERY CRITICAL PERSPECTIVE THAT YOU SHARED AND THE GRAPHIC WERE  
7 VERY POWERFUL AS WELL. NEXT UP IS GENERAL MANAGER FOR BART AND  
8 GENERAL MANAGER FOR MARIN TRANSIT, THANK YOU FOR JOINING US.  
9 WE THANK THE TRANSIT OPERATORS FOR YOUR COLLABORATION AND  
10 DEDICATION, AND YOUR DESIRE TO KEEP ADVANCING THESE IMPORTANT  
11 INACTIVES AS A TEAM AND REGION. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO ASK BOB  
12 NANCY TO GIVE THEIR PRESENTATIONS.

13

14 **ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS COMMISSIONER PEDROZA. AGAIN MY NAME IS  
15 BOB POWERS, I AM THE GENERAL MANAGER OF BART, AND THIS DECK IS  
16 GOING TO BE COPRESENTED BY MYSELF NANCY WHELAN WHO IS THE  
17 GENERAL MANAGER OF MARIN TRANSIT. WE HAVE TEN SLIDES HERE,  
18 COMMISSIONER PEDROZA. BUT BEFORE WE GET GOING, A COUPLE OF  
19 THANK YOUS, FROM ALL OF THE OPERATORS. I WANT TO THANK  
20 ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU AND COMMISSIONER SPERING, THANK YOU FOR  
21 CONTINUE TO BE FORWARD LEANING, AND IF ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU  
22 SAID IT ONE TIME HE SAID IT TEN TIMES TO ME, COLLABORATION,  
23 COLLABORATION, COLLABORATION. SO, JUST THANKFUL THAT  
24 COMMISSIONER SPERING AND ASSEMBLY MEMBER CHU SUPPORTED THIS  
25 WORK. AND CHAIR PEDROZA CONTINUING TO PRIORITIZE THE IMPORTANT



October 27, 2021

1 WORK, AND OPERATORS FOCUSING ON OUTCOMES. TWO MORE PEOPLE,  
2 THERESE MCMILLAN, AND STEVE KINZIE YOU HAVE WORKED WITH THE  
3 OPERATORS AND MANY STAKEHOLDERS THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
4 PARTICIPATION AND WILLINGNESS TO HELP US COURSE CORRECT OVER  
5 TIME. AND IT'S IMPORTANT FOR ME TO ACKNOWLEDGE RUBY HORTON WHO  
6 WORKS WITH COUNTY CONNECTION. SHE WAS RESPONSIBLE FOR PULLING  
7 TOGETHER THE OPERATORS TOGETHER ON THIS DECK. AND IT'S AN  
8 EXAMPLE OF WHAT ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU REFERRED TO AS  
9 COLLABORATION SO SHE HEADED UP THIS EFFORT FOR THE OPERATORS  
10 AND GETTING READY FOR THIS WORKSHOP HERE, WORKING FOR COUNTY  
11 CONNECTION, AND HERE I'M PRESENTING, I'M WITH B.A.R.T., NANCY  
12 IS WITH MARIN TRANSIT. SO, JUST AN EXAMPLE OF THAT INTEGRATION  
13 THAT WE HAVE THROUGHOUT THE OPERATORS. THE COLLABORATION WITH  
14 THE LARGE OPERATORS AND THE SMALL OPERATORS HAS NEVER BEEN  
15 BETTER. IT HAS BEEN EXEMPLIFIED OVER THE COURSE OF THIS LAST  
16 19 MONTHS, HEALTHY, SAFETY, TRANSIT PLAN, AND THE RETURN TO  
17 TRANSIT. AND, REALLY, WE HAVE TEN SLIDES HERE ON THE UPDATE OF  
18 THE TRANSIT AGENCY'S RECOVERY THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. NEXT  
19 SLIDE PLEASE.

20

21 **NANCY WHELAN:** THANK YOU. BOB, I THINK THIS IS MINE. AND THANK  
22 YOU COMMISSIONERS FOR HAVING US HERE TODAY. AS YOU KNOW,  
23 PUBLIC TRANSIT NATION-WIDE HAS BEEN HIT HARD BY THE PANDEMIC  
24 AND THE BAY AREA IS NO EXCEPTION. HOWEVER, THROUGHOUT THE  
25 PANDEMIC, FRONTLINE TRANSIT WORKERS ACROSS THE REGION HAVE



October 27, 2021

1 SHOWN UP TO PROVIDE SERVICE TO THOSE WHO NEED IT MOST. THIS  
2 SLIDE SHOWS A YEAR OVER YEAR COMPARISON MONTHLY TRANSIT  
3 RIDERSHIP FOR BAY AREA OPERATORS. SAW SOMETHING SIMILAR IN  
4 JUST THE PREVIOUS PRESENTATION, AND AS WE ALL KNOW RIDERSHIP  
5 PLUMMETED AS SHOWN IN THE YELLOW LINE BUT IS SLOWLY  
6 RECOVERING, IN THE REDLINE 2021. DESPITE SIGNIFICANT LOSS OF  
7 RIDERSHIP MANY RIDERS CONTINUE TO USE OUR SERVICES AND WE  
8 THANK THEM FOR THEIR CONTINUED PATRONAGE, AND SUPPORT  
9 THROUGHOUT THE PANDEMIC AUGUST OF AUGUST 20, 2021 RIDERSHIP  
10 WAS DOWN 61% COMPARED TO PREPANDEMIC TRENDS, AND DURING THE  
11 PANDEMIC FROM NINE AND A HALF MILLION RIDERS IN AUGUST OF 2020  
12 TO 16.3 MILLION RIDERS IN AUGUST OF 2021. WE SHOULD EXPECT  
13 ONGOING AND POTENTIAL PERMANENT SHIFT TO REMOTE WORK AT LEAST  
14 IN SEGMENTS OF THE PUBLIC PROCUREMENT TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, AND  
15 BASED ON SURVEY RESULTS PRESENTED THERE COULD BE UP TO 20% OR  
16 MORE OF THE WORKFORCE WORKING REMOTELY FIVE DAYS A WEEK.  
17 RIDERSHIP IS GOING TO BE DEPENDENT ON ONGOING COORDINATION AND  
18 COLLABORATION. AND I FEEL LIKE I SHOULD SAY THAT THREE TIMES,  
19 COLLABORATION, COLLABORATION, COLLABORATION, FROM ALL OF US,  
20 THE OPERATORS, BUSINESS COMMUNITY, AND MTC AND WHILE WE  
21 CONTINUE TO PLACE EQUITY AT THE CENTER OF THESE DISCUSSIONS,  
22 LET'S KEEP IN MIND THAT BEHIND THESE NUMBERS ARE REAL PEOPLE  
23 THAT DEPENDENT ON TRANSIT FOR THEIR DAY-TO-DAY LIVELIHOOD.  
24 NEXT SLIDE.

25



October 27, 2021

1   **ROBERT POWERS:** THE SLIDE IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION HERE IS  
2   THE YEAR TO YEAR RIDERSHIP DECLINES IN OUR CURRENT SERVICE  
3   LEVELS. LET ME JUST GET YOU ORIENTED HERE A LITTLE BIT. THE  
4   YELLOW BLOCKS ARE MORE FOR THE COMMUTER DEPENDENT AND  
5   PRIMARILY RAIL AND FERRY WITH THE EXCEPTION OF GOLDEN GATE,  
6   WHICH ALSO OPERATES A COMMUTER BUS. THE AGENCIES IN RED THERE  
7   ARE MIXED MODES, AND THE AGENCY IN BLUE ARE BUS-ONLY  
8   OPERATORS. AND GENERAL, I THINK, RIDERSHIP ON RAIL, FERRY,  
9   AND EXPRESS SERVICES IS DOWN MORE THAN LOCAL BUS SERVICE, BUT  
10  THERE ARE LARGE DECREASES ALL AROUND, AND THE RANGE IS BETWEEN  
11  47 AND 87, OR 50 TO 90. BUS SERVICE, IN GENERAL, I THINK HAS  
12  TRADITIONALLY TRANSPORTED A LARGE PERCENTAGE OF TRANSIT  
13  DEPENDENT RIDERS WHICH IS EVIDENT BY THEIR RECOVERY COMPARED  
14  TO RAIL AND FERRY. I THINK WE HEARD A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT  
15  EARLIER IN THE PRESENTATION. AND THE RECOVERY OF FARE  
16  DEPENDENT OPERATORS IS LINKED TO COMMUTERS OTHER THAN IN  
17  LARGE NUMBERS TO THE OFFICE CENTERS. AND YOU HEARD A LITTLE  
18  BIT FROM JASON AND GWEN ON THAT. BUT AS A WHOLE, THESE  
19  RIDERSHIP LOSSES EQUATE TO ABOUT 700 MILLION IN DECREASED  
20  REVENUE ON AN ANNUAL BASIS. AND THEN EVEN MORE TELLING IF WE  
21  LOOK AT THE MOST FARE DEPENDENT AGENCIES, BART, CALTRAIN, AND  
22  WETA, THE TOTAL IS CLOSE TO 5 MILLION THERE IS DISTINCTION  
23  BETWEEN FARE DEPENDENT AND NON-FARE DEPENDENT. ALL THAT BEING  
24  SAID, AS WE WORK THROUGHOUT WORKSHOP HERE AND IN THE COMING  
25  YEARS, YOU KNOW, THE AGENCIES MUST OPERATOR AND DEVELOP OUR



October 27, 2021

1 BUDGET IN CONTEXT WITH THIS UNCERTAINTY MOVING FORWARD. NEXT  
2 SLIDE PLEASE?

3

4 **NANCY WHELAN:** THIS GRAPH IS SIMILARLY ORIENTED RIDERSHIP-WIDE,  
5 AS YOU HAVE SEEN PREVIOUSLY IN THE REDLINE ON THIS GRAPH 2021  
6 TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE INCREASED SERVICE LEVELS COMPARED TO  
7 THE SAME PERIOD LAST YEAR AND WE HAVE BEEN RESPONSIVE TO  
8 SCHOOL SERVICE OPENINGS IN AUGUST, AND OVERALL GROWING DEMAND  
9 FROM TRANSIT SERVICES. TRADITIONAL SOURCES HAVE BEEN IMPACTED  
10 PARTICULARLY TO FARES BY INDEPENDENT PRAYERS, TOLLS, AND TAXES  
11 WHICH SUPPORT SO MANY OF THE SELF-HELP COUNTIES IN OUR REGION  
12 AND ARE INTEGRAL TO THE CONTINUED SUSTAINABILITY TO OUR  
13 CURRENT AND POTENTIAL FUTURE INCREASE IN SERVICE LEVELS. NEXT  
14 SLIDE.

15

16 **ROBERT POWERS:** SO THE -- THE INTENT ON THIS SLIDE IS A COUPLE  
17 FOULED HERE. FIRST, THE RECOVERY EFFORTS IN THE BAY AREA FOR  
18 TRANSIT NEED TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT ITS UNIQUE REGIONAL CONTEXT.  
19 AND SO AS THE OPERATORS PUT FORWARD THEIR NEAR-TERM AND LONG-  
20 TERM PLAN, WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE TAKING IN THIS  
21 REGIONAL CONTEXT. SECONDLY, THE SHIFT IN RIDERSHIP PATTERNS  
22 HAS DEFINITELY CHALLENGED US FROM HISTORICALLY ON HOW TRANSIT  
23 AGENCIES PLAN AND LOOK TO THE FUTURE, THIS FUNDAMENTAL SHIFT  
24 IN RIDERSHIP PATTERNS, IT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED AND WE NEED TO  
25 TAKE THAT INTO ACCOUNT MOVING FORWARD, ESPECIALLY WITH MOST OF



October 27, 2021

1 THE ESSENTIAL SERVICES AND PREPARING FOR WHAT IS AN UNCERTAIN  
2 AND PROLONGED IMPACT ON RIDERS DURING THE PANDEMIC. AND WHILE  
3 THE REGIONAL BENEFITS OF A TRANSIT SYSTEM SERVING A VARIETY OF  
4 NEEDS RANGING FROM INNER CITY WHETHER IN THE CITY AND COUNTY  
5 OF SAN FRANCISCO, TO A REGIONAL LOCAL SERVICE FIRST AND LAST  
6 MILE ALL OF THESE NEED TO BE ACCOUNTED FOR AS THIS WORKSHOP,  
7 AS DISCUSSIONS OF THIS WORKSHOP UNFOLDS, AND WE LOOK AT  
8 IMPLEMENTING THE ACTION PLAN. BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. WHY  
9 DON'T WE MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

10

11 **NANCY WHELAN:** OVER THE LAST SEVERAL MONTHS AND WITH HOPES THAT  
12 RIDERS WOULD OTHER THAN TO TRANSIT, MTC PARTNERS WITH TRANSIT  
13 AGENCY IN A JOINT MARKETING CAMPAIGN CALLED ALL ABOARD BAY  
14 AREA TRANSIT AND STARTED A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF SERVICE TO  
15 WELCOME RIDERS BACK TO TRANSIT WITH OVERALL SERVICE RESTORED  
16 APPROXIMATELY TO 75% OF PRECOVID LEVELS AGENCIES HAVE ENHANCED  
17 FARE PAYMENT METHODS, RESTORED SCHOOL SERVICE, AND PARTNERS  
18 WITH VARIOUS FARE PROMOTIONS, HALF OFF FOR BART AND CALTRAIN,  
19 TRANSIT HAS FREE FARE FRIDAYS IN SEPTEMBER AND OPERATORS HAVE  
20 FREE FARES, AND IN FACT NEARLY EVERY OPERATOR IN THE REGION IS  
21 OFFERING SOME FORM OF FARE PROMOTION TO ENCOURAGE A RETURN TO  
22 TRANSIT. CAPACITY MEASURES ARE LIFTED ON ALL MODES BUT MASKS  
23 ARE REQUIRED, CONTINUE TO BE REQUIRED, AND OUR ENHANCED  
24 CLEANING PROTOCOLS ARE CONTINUING. NEXT SLIDE.

25



October 27, 2021

1 **ROBERT POWERS:** SOME NEAR-TERM CHALLENGES WE WANT TO MAKE SURE  
2 WE'RE TOUCHED ON A LITTLE BIT. FIRST I WOULD LIKE THANK THE  
3 COMMISSION FOR A TIMELY ALLOCATION OF THE CARES FUNDING, THE  
4 CRRSAA FUNDING, AND THE MOST RECENT ARP FUNDING. THEY HAVE  
5 CERTAINLY HELPED DELAY THE FISCAL CLIFF. BUT THE LONG-TERM  
6 VIABILITY BEYOND THIS CURRENT STIMULUS PACKAGE NEEDS TO BE  
7 THOUGHT THROUGH AT A REGIONAL LEVEL AS WE MOVE FORWARD.  
8 DESPITE OUR BEST EFFORTS TO COORDINATE, IT'S THE -- IN MY  
9 OPINION, IT'S THE LONG DRAWN OUT, HOW LONG THE PANDEMIC HAS  
10 IMPACTED US, US, THE OPERATORS IN THE BAY AREA, HAS REALLY  
11 PROVEN TO BE CHALLENGING. JUST THE DURATION OF THAT, AND WE  
12 NEED TO KEEP THAT IN MIND MOVING FORWARD. AND AS PRESENTED  
13 EARLIER, THIS "RETURN TO WORK" THING NEEDS TO BE THOUGHTFULLY  
14 AND LOOKED AT AND WEIGHED IN AND WE NEED TO FACTOR THAT IN AS  
15 WE GO FORWARD HERE. "WE" MEANING THE OPERATORS, MTC, AND ALL  
16 OF YOU, BECAUSE THIS IS A NEW DYNAMIC AND IS GOING TO REQUIRE  
17 NEW PLANNING APPROACHES. SO JUST SOME NEAR-TERM CHALLENGES  
18 HERE. NEXT SLIDE FOR NANCY.

19  
20 **NANCY WHELAN:** WE'RE ALL RESOURCE CONSTRAINED AND EMPLOYEE  
21 SHORTAGE IS WIDELY ACKNOWLEDGED ACROSS ALL SECTORS AND  
22 IMPACTING OUR TRANSIT PROVISIONS IN THE BAY AREA. IT IMPACTS  
23 ALL MODES, WE ARE HAVING TROUBLE HIRING CRANE OPERATORS, BUS  
24 DRIVERS, AND MECHANICS, THE FULL RANGE OF EMPLOYEES, THE  
25 REGIONAL SHORTAGE CURRENTLY EXCEEDS 300 EMPLOYEES AT OUR



October 27, 2021

1 CURRENT SERVICE LEVELS. HIGHLY DEPENDENT ON OPERATOR  
2 AVAILABILITY, AND IN FACT SOME OF OPERATORS HAVE HAD TO CUT  
3 SERVICE DUE TO OPERATOR UNAVAILABILITY. AND OPERATOR WILL BE  
4 EXACERBATED AS SERVICE RETURNS. VACCINE MANDATES HAVE COME  
5 INTO PLAY AND FURTHER IMPACT LABOR AVAILABILITY. THEY WILL  
6 IMPACT THE HIGHER, TRAINING, AND RETAINING CYCLE THAT WE ALL  
7 FACE. AND THEN AT A GLOBAL SCALE, THE INCREASING LABOR AND  
8 CAPITAL COST AND SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES WILL IMPACT AND ARE  
9 IMPACTING OUR LIMITED RESOURCES. WE'RE SEEING IN ALL OF THOSE  
10 AREAS.

11

12 **ROBERT POWERS:** NANCY, I WANT TO ADD ON THAT FIRST -- COULD WE  
13 GO BACK ON WHO IS DRIVING THIS -- LET'S GO BACK TO THAT  
14 OPERATOR SHORTAGE. TO CHAIR PEDROZA WHEN WE STARTED OFF THE  
15 WORKSHOP, HE TITLED IT APTLY, BUILDING TRANSIT FUTURE  
16 TOGETHER. YOU KNOW, MAYBE SOMETHING -- MAYBE NOT FOR THIS  
17 WORKSHOP, LATER ON, "WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT" IT'S NOT B.A.R.T.  
18 OR MARIN TRANSIT, THERE IS A LOT OF WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT IN  
19 THE TRANSIT BROADER TRANSIT COMMUNITY AND BUILDING TRANSIT  
20 TOGETHER THAT'S CERTAINLY AN ELEMENT THERE, NOT TO THROW  
21 ANYBODY ANY CURVE BUT ALSO HERE, IT JUST, WHEN NANCY WAS  
22 TALKING ABOUT IT, I THOUGHT I WOULD BRING THAT UP AND TIE IT  
23 BACK TO CHAIR PEDROZA'S OPENING STATEMENT HERE. IT'S CERTAINLY  
24 A CHALLENGE THAT BART IS HAVING RIGHT NOW. IF WE GO TO THE  
25 NEXT SLIDE. SORRY. SO, THIS IS THE ONGOING COORDINATION. I



October 27, 2021

1 JUST WANTED TO -- NANCY AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE  
2 COMMISSION AND WORKSHOP PARTICIPANTS KNOW THAT THE LARGE AND  
3 SMALLER OPERATORS ARE VERY MUCH CONNECTED AND COMMUNICATING  
4 TOGETHER. WE HAVE OUR WEEKLY GM'S CALL AT 9:00 AND WE WORK  
5 THROUGH MANY TOPICS. DEPENDING ON THE TOP BEING, WE MIGHT HAVE  
6 MTC EXECUTIVE STAFF, AND GENERAL STAFF AT THE MEETINGS. WE  
7 HAVE THESE WORKING GROUPS OF WHICH THE OPERATORS -- MANY OF  
8 THE OPERATOR STAFF PARTICIPATE IN AS WELL AS MTC STAFF, IT'S  
9 PRETTY GOOD ONGOING COMMUNICATION IN THE FIRST BULLET THERE.  
10 AND THE SECOND ONE IS SHARING BEST PRACTICES, WHETHER IT'S  
11 SERVICE PLANNING OR DATA COLLECTION. YOU UPON, THE OPERATORS  
12 ARE SHARING, AND IT MAY NOT BE RELEVANT BUT I'LL SEND IT OVER  
13 TO MIKE HURSH OR DENNIS AT GOLDEN GATE, OR NANCY, AND THE  
14 COORDINATION EFFORTS ARE THERE AND I THINK IT'S NEVER BEEN AS  
15 STRONG AS IT IS RIGHT NOW AND I HAVE BEEN IN THE BAY AREA MY  
16 WHOLE LIFE, A LONG TIME, AND I WOULD ARGUE IT'S NEVER BEEN AS  
17 SOLID AS IT IS NOW, AND IT'S GOING TO CONTINUE, AND WE'LL  
18 BUILD UPON THAT AS WE DELIVER THIS, THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE  
19 ACTION PLAN. SO, IF WE GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE.

20

21 **NANCY WHELAN:** YEAH. BOB, I JUST WANT TO COMMENT ON THAT. I  
22 AGREE COLLABORATION HAS NEVER BEEN QUITE AS STRONG AS IT IS  
23 TODAY AND AS A SMALL OPERATOR, I WANT TO SAY WE REALLY  
24 APPRECIATE THAT, AND IT HELPS SO MUCH BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE  
25 THE STAFFING THAT A LOT OF OTHER OPERATORS HAVE SO IT'S A



October 27, 2021

1 TREMENDOUS BENEFIT TO US TO BE ABLE TO MEET AS REGULARLY AS WE  
2 HAVE TO SHARE THAT INFORMATION. THIS LAST SLIDE WE ARE GOING  
3 TO TALK ABOUT THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN BRIEFLY. WE, THE  
4 OPERATORS SUPPORT THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN PUT FORWARD  
5 BY MTC AND LOOK FORWARD TO PARTNERING COLLECTIVELY TO TAKING A  
6 LEADERSHIP ROLE IN THE PLAN WE'RE IN FAVOR OF ADVANCING THE  
7 ACCELERATED ACTIONS IN ORDER TO PRODUCE IMMEDIATE OUTCOMES AND  
8 BENEFITS AND WORKING CLOSELY TO SEE DEVELOPMENT AND COMPLETION  
9 OF THE BUS TRANSIT PRIORITY ACTION PLAN PARTICULARLY THE  
10 ESTABLISHMENT OF PROGRAMS AND IMPROVEMENTS BASED ON GREATEST  
11 NEED AND EQUITY EFFORTS. ESPECIALLY IMPORTANT FOR SPEED AND  
12 RELIABILITY, AND FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY PILOT  
13 RECOMMENDATIONS IS IMPORTANT RIGHT NOW TO RETAIN EXISTING  
14 RIDERS, AND ATTRACT NEW RIDERS BUT ALSO ENSURE THAT FUND ARE  
15 AVAILABLE TO COVER POTENTIAL SUBSEQUENT OPERATOR REVENUE  
16 LOSSES WE SUPPORT THE DEVELOPMENT AND ROLL OUT OF MAPPING AND  
17 WAYFINDING PROJECTS AND CONTINUING TO WORK WITH TO SEE  
18 EXPEDITION AND IMPLEMENTATION, AND ADVANCING AND SETTING THE  
19 STAGE FOR TRANSFORMATION IN THE ACTION PLAN REGIONALLY,  
20 INCLUDING FINDINGS, EFFECTIVELY DEVELOP THE ACTIVE NETWORK  
21 PLAN IMPROVING DATA COLLECTION COORDINATION ACROSS THE REGION  
22 DEVELOPING REGIONAL DEVELOPING SOLUTIONS WITH PARATRANSIT, AND  
23 COLLABORATION AND PARTNERSHIP LOOKING FORWARD TO ADVANCING  
24 THESE ACTIONS AND IMPROVE THE REGIONAL RIDERSHIP AND EMERGE



October 27, 2021

1 FRAMEWORK. I THINK THAT'S MY LAST SLIDE THANK YOU FOR THE TUNE  
2 TO SHARE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** WONDERFUL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BOB, NANCY, FOR ALL  
5 THAT INFORMATION. WE ARE GOING TO ORGANIZE COMMISSION COMMENTS  
6 AS WELL AS PUBLIC COMMENTS, BACK AND FORTH, BETWEEN ZOOM AND  
7 IN THE ROOM. WE WANT EVERYONE TO KNOW WE WILL GET TO YOU.  
8 PLEASE BE PATIENT. AND EVERYONE IS INCLUDED IN THIS IMPORTANT  
9 CONVERSATION. SO, WE'RE GOING TO START WITH THE COMMISSION  
10 QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. FROM WHAT YOU HEARD, AND WE, FOR THIS  
11 ONE, WE'RE GOING TO START IN THE ROOM FIRST AND SEE IF THERE  
12 IS ANYTHING IN THE ZOOM ROOM. AND AMBER CAN CALL ON YOU.

13

14 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** SO, IF YOU JUST USE THE RAISE YOUR HAND BUTTON  
15 THAT'S AT THE BOTTOM OF ZOOM, WE'LL KNOW THAT YOU WANT TO SAY  
16 SOMETHING, OR YOU HAVE A QUESTION FOR THE PANELISTS, AND FOR  
17 ALL THE FOLKS WHO ARE ATTENDING ON ZOOM, WHEN WE GET TO PUBLIC  
18 COMMENT, YOU CAN KEEP YOUR HAND RAISED BE AND THAT'S HOW WE'LL  
19 KNOW. WE'LL DO THE PUBLIC COMMENT RIGHT AROUND 3:00.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AMBER, WOULD YOU LIKE ME TO CALL ON THEM?  
22 OR ARE YOU GOING TO TAKE CARE OF THAT?

23

24 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** I'M HAPPY TO DO THAT. THANK YOU, KIMBERLY.

25



October 27, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FANTASTIC.

2

3 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** WHEN WE GET TO PUBLIC COMMENT, I WOULD LOVE FOR  
4 YOU TO HANDLE PUBLIC COMMENT. BUT FOR RIGHT NOW, I CAN DO IT.  
5 NOT SEEING ANY RAISED HANDS FROM COMMISSIONERS. OH, COMMISSION  
6 RABBIT.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU ALL FOR THE GREAT PRESENTATION,  
9 APPRECIATE THAT. SOME OF THE INFORMATION IS NOT NECESSARILY  
10 NEW ONLY BECAUSE I SERVE ON A FEW OF THOSE AGENCIES AND I KNOW  
11 FIRSTHAND THE RIDERSHIP LEVELS AND WHAT WE EXPERIENCING, AND  
12 OF COURSE EVERYONE WANTS THAT MAGIC CRYSTAL BALL LOOKING TO  
13 GET BACK TO THE NEW NORMAL AND THE DOLLARS, AND APPROPRIATELY  
14 PLANNING FOR THE FUTURE, AND THAT'S WHY I THINK THE BLUE  
15 RIBBON ADVISORY IS SO VITALLY IMPORTANT. I CAN TELL YOU  
16 YESTERDAY WE HAD A DEEP CONVERSATION ON TELECOMMUTE POLICY AND  
17 FUTURE OF THE WORKPLACE, OBVIOUSLY TO WHAT EXTENT OUR  
18 WORKFORCE WILL BE WORKING REMOTELY, AND QUITE FRANKLY WHAT WE  
19 WILL HAVE TO BUILD ANEW AS WE EMBARK ON A NEW PROGRAM IT'S ALL  
20 BEEN COMING TO A HEAD AND PROBABLY CREATED MORE QUESTIONS THAN  
21 ANSWERS AS WE KIND OF MANEUVER THROUGH THAT SPACE I'M  
22 WONDERING FROM WHAT THE SURVEY SHOWED ON PEOPLE'S INTENT GOING  
23 FORWARD IN THE WORK ENVIRONMENT IS, HOW DOES ONE ACTUALLY TAKE  
24 THAT AND KIND OF EXTRAPOLATE THAT DATA TO REALLY KIND OF TELL  
25 WHAT'S THE IMPACT ON INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT ENTITY IT IS ARE GOING



October 27, 2021

1 TO BE. AND I ALSO KNOW, ESPECIALLY SERVING ON THE GOLDEN GATE  
2 BRIDGE THAT EVEN DAY BY DAY, THOSE NUMBERS VARY GREATLY, WHICH  
3 ALSO MAKES IT HARDER TO PLAN AHEAD AND TO BE EFFICIENT. JUST  
4 CURIOUS ABOUT THE CONNECTION BETWEEN THE TWO OR IS THAT  
5 SOMETHING WE'RE GOING TO DISCUSS OVER THE NEXT SO MANY HOURS  
6 OR WEEKS?

7

8 **GWEN LITVAK:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. I'LL KICK IT OFF THEN  
9 JASON CAN CHIME IN. OUR ROBUST EXTRAPOLATION DIRECTLY TO  
10 AGENCY BECAUSE WE HAVE EMPLOYERS ANSWER AT HIGH LEVEL FOR ALL  
11 OF THEIR EMPLOYEES WE HAVE COUNTY BY CAN'T BREAK DOWN  
12 EMPLOYERS WHO ARE RESPONDING EMPLOYERS HAVE MULTIPLE COUNTIES  
13 AND BY TEAM -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I WOULD BE HESITANT TO  
14 EXTRAPOLATE PER AGENCY THE SURVEY THAT WE'RE RUNNING IS GOING  
15 TO RUN ANOTHER FIVE MONTHS THAT'S OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO LOOK  
16 AT WHETHER THE PROPOSED RETURN TO NEW NORMAL, JANUARY 20, 2022  
17 IS IN FACT ACTUALLY THAT RETURN TO NEW NORMAL. THEN CONTINUE  
18 AS YOU SAID TO TALK ABOUT THE VARIOUS OPTIONS AS WE MOVE  
19 FORWARD FOR THE REST OF THIS WORKSHOP. I DON'T THINK WE'LL  
20 COME TO AN ANSWER AT THE END OF THIS WORKSHOP, I KNOW EVERY  
21 CITY IS GRAPPLING WITH THE SAME CHALLENGE AND I THINK IT'S  
22 HELPFUL TO LOOK ACROSS CITIES AND AT OUR FEDERAL GOVERNMENT  
23 FOR THE ANSWER TO THESE NEW CHALLENGES WE HAVE. BUT THIS'S  
24 MORE ABOUT HOW THE DATA IS BROKEN DOWN AND WHAT WE DO KNOW.



October 27, 2021

1 WE'RE ALSO HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP WITH INDIVIDUAL FOLKS TO RECEIVE  
2 QUALITATIVE QUESTIONS. JASON

3

4 **JASON BAKER:** WE HAVE SURVEYS ABOUT UNKNOWNNS AND POLICIES AND  
5 WHAT'S HAPPENING. QUESTION IS RIGHT ONCE IN SEVERAL MONTHS  
6 FROM NOW WE MAY HAVE MORE DATA ABOUT NOT JUST PREDICTIONS BUT  
7 WHAT PEOPLE ARE ACTUALLY DOING. BUT WE'RE HAPPY TO WORK WITH  
8 YOU, ON COUNTY DATA OR BREAKING THIS DOWN. I KNOW IT MATTERS A  
9 LOT, LOCATION AND INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS.

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT:** I APPRECIATE THAT VERY MUCH. I THINK IT'S GOING  
12 TO BE EXTREMELY INTERESTING TO SEE HOW THINGS FILTER BACK AND  
13 WHAT COUNTIES ARE AFFECTING MORE SO THAN OTHERS. THANK YOU FOR  
14 THE PRESENTATION, AGAIN.

15

16 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA  
17 WE HAVE TAKE YOUR COMMENT THEN GO BACK TO THE MTC ROOM AND GO  
18 BACK TO VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. MY QUESTION IS FOR JASON. ON ONE  
21 OF YOUR SLIDES, USED ABOUT WHAT EMPLOYERS ARE LIKELY TO  
22 SUPPORT MOVING FORWARD, THE HIGHEST WAS REMOTE WORK, BUT I WAS  
23 CURIOUS. I WAS SURPRISED TO SEE TRANSPORTATION PROVIDED BY  
24 EMPLOYERS BEING SUCH A SMALL PERCENTAGE, SOMEWHAT OF A  
25 CHALLENGE IN COMPETITION BETWEEN PRIVATE SHUTTLE VERSUS PUBLIC



October 27, 2021

1 TRANSPORTATION, AND LOOKING AT THAT I FELT THAT PERHAPS THAT  
2 WAS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR TRANSIT. COULD YOU COMMENT ON THAT  
3 MORE?

4

5 **JASON BAKER:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IT WAS NICE TO  
6 SEE YOUR DOG IN YOUR LAP EARLIER IT'S THE CUTEST DOG IN THE  
7 MTC BUSINESS AS FAR AS I'M CONCERNED. THIS IS FOR MEMBERS  
8 ACROSS ALL OF MEMBERS, WHERE ACTUALLY RUNNING SHUTTLES AND  
9 JUST AREN'T IN A POSITION TO RUN SHUTTLES. I THINK THIS  
10 WORKSHOP IS ABOUT HOW WE CAN ENCOURAGE TRANSIT TO BE MORE  
11 COMPETITIVE WITH CARS AND OTHER THINGS SO THAT OUR COMPANIES  
12 DON'T HAVE TO OR DON'T WANT TO RUN SHUTTLE BUSES NONE ARE  
13 HAPPY ABOUT BEING IN THE SHUTTLE BUSINESS. I CAN TELL YOU  
14 THAT.

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** DO WE HAVE QUESTIONS IN THE ROOM FROM COMMISSIONERS?  
19 IF YOU HAVE ONE YOU CAN PUT YOUR CARD UPSIDE WAYS.  
20 COMMISSIONER, GO AHEAD.

21

22 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES, THANK YOU, WHEN BOB POWERS WAS  
23 TALKING ABOUT THE OPERATOR SHORTAGE, THAT'S WHAT MY QUESTION  
24 IS IN REGARDS TO. BECAUSE WE DO HAVE ALL THE DIFFERENT TRANSIT  
25 AGENCIES. SO, I AM WONDERING IF THERE IS A FEELING THAT ONE



October 27, 2021

1 AGENCY WILL BE HIT HARDER THAN ANOTHER AGENCY IN THE OPERATOR  
2 SHORTAGE?

3

4 **ROBERT POWERS:** I DON'T THINK SO, COMMISSIONER. I WOULD -- YOU  
5 KNOW, TRAIN OPERATOR FOR BART IS A DIFFERENT TRAINING AND A  
6 DIFFERENT SKILL SET THAN A TRAIN OPERATOR IS FOR SFMTA, THERE  
7 MIGHT BE A LITTLE BIT OF OVERLAP ON THE BUS OPERATIONS. YOU  
8 KNOW, WHETHER IT'S AC TRANSIT OR GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE. BUT IN  
9 GENERAL, YOU KNOW, THE OPERATORS, WHICH IS A BROADER TERM,  
10 CERTAINLY THE OPERATORS, THEMSELVES, MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE  
11 THE FRONTLINE MEN AND WOMEN TO OPERATE THE SYSTEMS WITHIN THE  
12 BROADER CONTEXT THE FOLKS THAT ARE IN THE FIELD, THE TRACK  
13 INSPECTORS, MAINTENANCE MEN AND WOMEN, THE QUALITY ASSURANCE  
14 MEN AND WOMEN, THAT BROADER CONTEXT TO MAKE SURE THAT THOSE  
15 FOLKS -- THAT WE, COLLECTIVELY HAVE THOSE FOLKS TO DELIVER FOR  
16 THE BAY AREA.

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** OKAY. SO THANK YOU FOR THAT  
19 CLARIFICATION. I THINK THAT'S WHAT I HEARD THAT IT WASN'T JUST  
20 THE PERSON SITTING AT THE STOP AND GO PART OF THE TRAIN YOU'RE  
21 TALKING ABOUT OVERALL, WHEN YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT THE OPERATORS  
22 AND TRACK INSPECTORS AND THAT TYPE OF THING.

23

24 **ROBERT POWERS:** YES, MA'AM.

25



October 27, 2021

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE  
2 CLARIFICATION.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** CHAIR PEDROZA.

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ANDY, ON ONE OF THE SLIDES YOU TALK  
7 ABOUT THE CHANGES YOU SEE IN SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES THAT  
8 WAS PRETTY POWERFUL, TO SEE THE DECREASE AND PEAK AT 32%  
9 PRECOVID LEVELS AND STILL AT 18% WHILE EVERYTHING TURNED DOWN  
10 AND CLIMBED SLOWLY THAT'S ONE AREA WHERE YOU SEE PEOPLE  
11 SHIFTED TO. WHAT OPPORTUNITIES DO WE HAVE IN THAT SPACE?  
12 THAT'S AN UNDESIRABLE OUTCOME THAT WE'RE SEEING NOW.

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR PEDROZA, EXCELLENT QUESTION. I THINK ONE  
15 THING WE SHOULD RECOGNIZE IN THE BUS PRIORITY PROJECTS IS THAT  
16 WE WILL BE TAKING THE GENERAL PURPOSE LANE OUT OF SERVICE  
17 THEREFORE YOU'RE PUSHING MORE PEOPLE INTO THE REMAINING  
18 GENERAL PURPOSE LANES. I THINK KEY TO MAKING THE BUS PRIORITY  
19 LANES WORK IS TO FILL THEM WITH HOVS IN ADDITION TO THE BUSES  
20 SO THAT YOU CAN REALLY TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THAT. WE DO HAVE A  
21 FEW TOOL SETS AVAILABLE TO US, WE HAVE SWITCHABLE TAGS THEY  
22 HAVE LIMITATION IN WHAT THEY'RE ABLE TO DO BUT WE NEED TO  
23 FIGURE OUT HOW TO MAXIMIZE TIME ADVANTAGES FOR HOVS AT ANY  
24 LEVEL AND I THINK THAT SHOULD BE A FOCUS OF OUR ENERGY.

25



October 27, 2021

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I THINK LOOKING AT TOOLS WE HAVE IN  
2 THAT SPACE. THANK YOU FOR THAT. FOR BOB OR NANCY, I  
3 APPRECIATE YOUR PRESENTATION, IT WAS VERY FOCUSED IN TERMS OF  
4 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN APPRECIATE THE DETAILS ON BUS  
5 TRANSIT PRIORITY FARES MAPPING AND WAYFINDING WHERE DO YOU SEE  
6 OPPORTUNITY TO BRING BACK RIDERS. IN TERMS OF RESOURCES AND  
7 WORKSHOPS AND COMMITMENTS AND OUTCOME THAT WE WANT TO SEE DO  
8 YOU SEE THE SPACE OF FARES, MAPPING AND WAYFINDING AS CRITICAL  
9 AREAS TO TRY TO WIN BACK MORE? OR IS THERE DIFFERENT AREAS  
10 THAT WE SHOULD BE FOCUSING ON?

11

12 **ROBERT POWERS:** I CAN CERTAINLY START, NANCY CAN CHIME IN. I  
13 THINK THOSE ARE THREE CRITICAL AREAS, COMMISSIONER, TO WIN  
14 BACK THE RIDERS. THE OTHER PART OF THAT, I WOULD GO TO WHAT  
15 MR. FREMIER, HE THROUGH SOMETHING UP ON ONE OF THE SLIDES THEY  
16 WROTE DOWN AND I USED THE SAME THING AND HE DIDN'T ASK IF HE  
17 COULD USE PERMISSION JUST THROUGH IT OUT THERE -- THAT'S A  
18 JOKE ANDY. FREQUENT, RELIABLE AND SAFE, SO WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT  
19 TRANSIT, WHEN WE -- HOWEVER THIS REMOTE WORK SHAKES OUT, AND  
20 RETURN TO OFFICE SHAPES OUT, IN MY PERSON, TRANSIT, PUBLIC  
21 TRANSIT, HAS GOT TO BE COMPLIMENTARY TO THAT. SO WHEN I DO  
22 TAKE BART OR TAKE AC TRANSIT OR GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE INTO THE  
23 OFFICE, THAT, I NEED TO BE COMPLEMENTARY, AND WE, COLLECTIVELY  
24 GOT TO BE COMPETITIVE. IT'S GOING TO BE THERE ON TIME,  
25 FREQUENT ENOUGH, CLEAN, SAFE, MAKING SURE THAT IT'S EASY TO



October 27, 2021

1 NAVIGATE IS VERY IMPORTANT AND THEN YOU TIE INTO THOSE OTHER  
2 THREE THAT ANDY HAD UP ON ONE OF HIS SLIDES. AND I THINK  
3 THAT'S A START OF A GOOD DISCUSSION, COMMISSIONER.

4

5 **NANCY WHELAN:** IF I CAN, THIS IS NANCY, I WOULD JUST ADD THAT  
6 BUS PRIORITY IS AN IMPORTANT ONE TO GETTING RIDERS BACK TO  
7 TRANSIT. WHEN YOU SEE THE SLIDE THAT SHOW THERE ARE SO MANY  
8 SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES OUT THERE AND TRAFFIC IS INCREASING  
9 WE WANT MORE PEOPLE TO NATURALLY WANT TO TAKE TRANSIT  
10 ESPECIALLY IF THEY CAN MAKE THE TRIP FASTER MAKING THAT MORE  
11 CONVENIENT FASTER OPTION. FARES ARE GOING TO BE IMPORTANT.  
12 UNDERSTANDABILITY, LEGIBILITY OF FARES WILL BE AN IMPORTANT  
13 PART OF WHAT THESE IMMEDIATE ACTIONS ARE, AND THEN LASTLY,  
14 THERE IS, SOME OF THOSE SMALL THINGS THAT WE TALK ABOUT THAT  
15 WE'RE ALSO WORKING ON THAT COULD ARE VERY CUSTOMER-FACING,  
16 LIKE CHANGING OUR SCHEDULES ALL AT THE SAME TIME SO ALL THE  
17 TRANSIT AGENCIES CAN GET SYNCED UP SO RIDERS CAN KNOW WHEN  
18 SCHEDULES ARE CHANGING ALL ACROSS THE BAY AREA AT THE SAME  
19 TIME. THOSE ARE SUGGESTIONS, THAT ARE THING ARE VERY CUSTOMER  
20 FOCUSED.

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I APPRECIATE THAT, NANCY AND BOB, AND  
23 I LAYER THAT WITH THE PRESENTATION FROM GWEN AND JASON THE  
24 SLIDE AND ORGANIZATIONAL ATTITUDE ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT AT 27%  
25 AND 8% AND THAT WAS DAUNTING BUT TO SEE IN OCTOBER OVER 50%.



October 27, 2021

1 NOW YOU HAVE ORGANIZATIONS AND EMPLOYERS HAVING A POSITIVE  
2 ATTITUDE ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT WIRED WITH THESE OPPORTUNITIES  
3 THAT ARE BEFORE US TALKING ABOUT MAKING THE CHANGE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. WE'LL GO BACK TO ZOOM THEN WE'LL HAVE  
6 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

7

8 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IT'S REALLY STRIKING TO ME THAT CONGESTION  
11 HAS GONE BACK TO NORMAL AND AS OTHER PEOPLE HAVE SAID GOTTEN  
12 WORSE IN SOME PLACES AND THERE IS ACTUALLY FEWER PEOPLE  
13 GETTING TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO THAT'S JUST THE  
14 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM FUNCTIONING WAY LESS EFFECTIVELY THAN IT  
15 WAS PRECOVID BECAUSE THERE IS SO MANY PEOPLE DRIVING ALONE.  
16 AND IT'S JUST, I THINK, JUST SHOWS SUPER CLEARLY HOW A, SORT  
17 OF, TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM BUILT AROUND DRIVING ALONE IN THIS  
18 REGION IS JUST NOT GOING TO WORK AND IT'S NOT GOING TO GET AS  
19 MANY PEOPLE WHERE THEY NEED TO GO. AND I COULDN'T AGREE MORE  
20 WITH ANDY AND OTHERS, WHERE IT'S REALLY -- IT'S GOT TO GET  
21 PEOPLE INTO TRANSIT BUT WE HAVE ALSO GOT TO GET PEOPLE INTO  
22 CARPOOLS IS VAN POOLS JUST INCREASING THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN  
23 PEOPLE'S CARS IS ALSO JUST THIS INCREDIBLE PART OF THE  
24 SOLUTION. AND TWO OF THE KEY WAYS -- ONE OF THE KEY WAYS THAT  
25 WE CAN DO BOTH OF THOSE THINGS IS WITH HOV TRANSIT LANES AND



October 27, 2021

1 HOV LANES AND PRIORITIZING BUS TO INCENTIVIZE PEOPLE TO GET  
2 INTO POOLS IT'S GOING TO BE INCREDIBLE NEXUS TO ENSURE WE HAVE  
3 TRANSIT RECOVERY BUT KIND OF MAKING THE WHOLE TRANSPORTATION  
4 SYSTEM START FUNCTIONING AGAIN. I JUST WANTED TO SHARE THAT  
5 PERSPECTIVE. WHAT I WANT TO ASK THE TRANSIT OPERATORS IS, IS  
6 ABOUT THE FINANCIAL PICTURE BEFORE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND IT  
7 FEELS LIKE WE WANT TO BE SUPPORTING ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES BUT  
8 SOME TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE DIFFERENT KIND OF COST STRUCTURES  
9 THAN OTHERS LESS FLEXIBLE IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO DECREASE  
10 COSTS WHEN REVENUES GO DOWN, THEY OBVIOUSLY HAVE LESS RELIANCE  
11 ON FARES, AND I WAS JUST WONDERING, FROM POWERS NANCY, LIKE,  
12 HOW DO YOU THINK ABOUT, LIKE, SORT OF, THE -- WHAT ARE THE  
13 TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT ARE MOST AT RISK OF, SORT OF, LIKE, NOT  
14 JUST HAVING TO REDUCE SERVICE, BUT, SORT OF, MUCH MORE KIND OF  
15 CATASTROPHIC SITUATION IF WE DON'T SEE RETURN -- IF WE DON'T  
16 SEE, SORT OF, RIDERSHIP RETURN IN A MORE MEANINGFUL WAY, IF  
17 ANY?

18

19 **ROBERT POWERS:** DO YOU WANT ME TO START NANCY?

20

21 **NANCY WHELAN:** GO AHEAD.

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS:** IT'S GOING TO CHALLENGING FIRST AND FOREMOST.  
24 LET ME JUST SAY THAT. YOU KNOW, I THINK FARE DEPENDANT TRANSIT  
25 OPERATIONS ARE REALLY GOING TO START FEELING THAT PRESSURE



October 27, 2021

1 SOONER. AND, YOU KNOW, AS THIS WORKSHOP UNFOLDS, AND AS THE  
2 NEXT 6 TO 9 MONTHS UNFOLD, WE, COLLECTIVELY NEED TO KEEP AN  
3 EYE ON THAT AS TRANSIT OPERATORS PUT FORWARD THEIR BUDGETS,  
4 THEIR ANNUAL BUDGETS TO THEIR BOARDS, HOPEFULLY SOME OF THIS,  
5 YOU KNOW, MODELING FOR, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS THE PERCENT RETURN  
6 TO WORK, AND IS ALL ACCOUNTED FOR AND SO THE BUDGET REFLECTS  
7 REALITY AND WHERE THE ECONOMY IS AT. NICK, I THINK IT'S GOING  
8 TO BE MAINLY BE FELT BY TRANSIT -- I MEAN FARE DEPENDENT. BUT  
9 IT WILL ENCOMPASS EVERYBODY. AND WE LOOK FORWARD -- WE THE  
10 OPERATORS LOOK FORWARD TO A DISCUSSION ON WHAT CITIZEN LONG-  
11 TERM -- WHAT ARE THE LONG-TERM POSSIBILITIES FOR THE SOLUTION  
12 THERE. SO THAT'S KIND OF WHAT I WOULD TEE UP FOR THE  
13 COMMISSION HERE. NANCY?

14

15 **NANCY WHELAN:** YEAH. I WOULD JUST ADD ON THE SALES TAX SIDE,  
16 YOU PROBABLY HAVE SEEN THE CHART MTC PUT TOGETHER IT SHOWED  
17 HOW DIFFERENT EACH OF THE COUNTIES IS IMPACTED BY SALES TAX  
18 CHANGES AND SOME COUNTIES HAVE BEEN IMPACTED HIT VERY HARD BY  
19 IT AND OTHERS NOT THOSE DEPENDENT ON SALES TAX OR LOCAL TAXES  
20 ARE GOING TO SEE VARIED IMPACTS AS WELL. AS BOB SAID THE FARE  
21 DEPENDANT ONES ARE THE ONES THAT ARE CLEARLY GOING TO GET HIT  
22 RIGHT AWAY AND THOSE WHO ARE A LITTLE BIT MORE DEPENDENT ON  
23 OTHER SOURCES AND HAVE MORE DIVERSITY OF SOURCES ARE GOING  
24 FARE A LITTLE BIT BETTER AND WE'RE ALL LOOKING FORWARD TO  
25 HAVING STABLE LONG-TERM SOURCE THAT WE CAN RELY ON AS WELL.



October 27, 2021

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK IT'S THE REGIONAL OPERATORS THAT ARE  
3 FARE DEPENDENT BECAUSE THEY DON'T HAVE A COUNTY TO FALL BACK  
4 ON TO PASS SALES TAX OR OTHER TYPES OF TAX, OR LIKE IN SAN  
5 FRANCISCO CHARGING FOLKS FOR PARKING AND OTHER THINGS. AND I  
6 THINK WE, AS A COMMISSION, HAVE A SPECIAL RESPONSIBILITY TO  
7 THE REGIONAL OPERATORS, AS WELL, TO MAKE SURE THAT, YOU KNOW,  
8 WE'RE KIND OF STAYING IN CLOSE TOUCH WITH THEM TO SEE HOW WE  
9 CAN COLLECTIVELY MAKE SURE THAT THOSE REGIONAL OPERATORS WHO  
10 ARE DEPENDENT ON FARE REVENUE DO HAVE A PICTURE FORWARD THAT  
11 IS FISCALLY SUSTAINABLE AS WELL AS SUPPORTING ALL OF THE LOCAL  
12 OPERATORS. AND THAT'S SOMETHING I HOPE WE CAN WORK ON CLOSELY  
13 WITH OUR TRANSIT PARTNERS AND ALSO BE STAYING ABREAST OF AT  
14 THE COMMISSION LEVEL. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, IT'S DIFFICULT TO  
15 MAGIC MONEY UP IN SHORT PERIODS OF TIME BUT IF YOU KIND OF  
16 HAVE A VISION WHERE YOU NEED TO GO THAT'S MULTIPLE YEARS OUT I  
17 THINK THAT'S THE TYPE OF THING THAT WE SHOULD BE ABLE TO, AS A  
18 REGION, BE ABLE TO KIND OF SUPPORT THEM ALL.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, AND ON AND  
21 PANELISTS. I THINK WE HAVE COMMISSIONER SPERING IN THE ROOM  
22 THEN GO BACK TO ZOOM AFTER THAT.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. THOSE  
25 NUMBERS ARE BORING BUT IT REFLECTS THE NEW NORM. IT'S BECOME A



October 27, 2021

1 QUALITY OF LIFE EMPLOYERS ARE STARTING TO FIND OUT EMPLOYEES  
2 WANT TO DO THAT THEY'RE HAPPIER PRODUCTIVE IT'S BEEN AN  
3 EXPERIMENT THAT'S BEEN FORCED ON US BUT I THINK IT'S SHOWING  
4 POSITIVE RESULTS. I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING TO RECOVER ALL OF  
5 THOSE RIDERS, AND THERE IS DISCUSSION ABOUT NEW RIDERS, NOT  
6 JUST RESTORING EXISTING RIDERS, BUT GENERATING NEW RIDERS,  
7 GOING THROUGH THE BLUE RIBBON STUDY, THE VERY THINGS, SHORT-  
8 TERM, FARE INTEGRATION, WAYFINDING, PRIORITY, ACCESSIBILITY,  
9 EQUITY THOSE ARE THINGS THAT WE HAVE GOT TO BRING FORWARD  
10 WHILE WE HAVE THIS OPPORTUNITY AND WE NEED TO CONSIDER WHO ARE  
11 WE COMPETING WITH, AND I THINK IT'S PEOPLE SITTING IN  
12 CONGESTION, IF YOU CAN GO FROM SOLANO, SAN FRANCISCO 30  
13 MINUTES ON A BUS AND IN A CAR IT TAKES YOU TWO HOURS YOU'RE  
14 GOING START THINKING ABOUT MAKING CHOICES. SO I THINK THE  
15 TRANSIT, BUS PRIORITY, TO ME, MORE THAN ANYTHING ELSE HAS GOT  
16 TO BE ONE OF THE HIGHEST PRIORITIES FOR BOTH US AND THE  
17 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO REALLY START MOVING PUBLIC TRANSIT IN A  
18 VERY EFFICIENT, FAST WAY, THAT'S VERY BENEFICIAL TO THE PEOPLE  
19 THAT ARE USING IT. BOB, YOU HAD TALKED ABOUT THE BUDGET IN  
20 CONTEXT, HOW FAR OUT ARE YOU GUYS PROJECTING? HOW MANY YEARS  
21 ARE YOU LOOKING AT WITH THIS CHALLENGE?

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS:** YEAH, SO WE HAVE A FIVE-YEAR OUTLOOK,  
24 COMMISSIONER SPERING. AND WE HAVE ACTUALLY CHANGED OUR  
25 BUDGETARY PROCESSES THIS YEAR WITH THE LOOKING AT BIENNIAL TWO



October 27, 2021

1 YEAR BUDGET FOCUSING ON THE FIRST YEAR BUT GOOD SOLID DATA ON  
2 THE SECOND YEAR. BUT WE HAVE A FIVE-YEAR OUTLOOK WHERE WE'RE  
3 TRACKING ON WHERE WE'RE GOING TO BE AND WHAT'S RIDERSHIP  
4 LOOKING LIKE, WHAT'S REVENUE LOOKING LIKE. BUT A FIVE-YEAR,  
5 FOR BART, ANYWAY, IS SOMETHING THAT WE FEEL IS AT LEAST IN THE  
6 BALLPARK. YOU KNOW? AND AS YOU GO OUT YEARS 4 AND 5, OBVIOUSLY  
7 IT GETS A LITTLE LESS CERTAIN, BUT ABOUT A FIVE YEAR WINDOW,  
8 SIR.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH. THAT'S GOOD TO KNOW. BECAUSE SOME OF  
11 THE SHORT-TERM IMPROVEMENTS OR GOALS ARE WITHIN THAT TIME  
12 FRAME. SO HOPEFULLY THOSE WILL COINCIDE WITH EACH OTHER. THE  
13 OTHER ISSUE THAT I WANTED TO -- THAT CAME OUT OF ALL OF THIS,  
14 IT'S UNFORTUNATE IT TOOK THIS PANDEMIC, BUT THE TRANSIT  
15 OPERATORS, THE WAY THEY'RE WORKING TOGETHER, AND THE WAY THEY  
16 REALLY HELPED BRING FORWARD THIS AGENDA THAT THE BLUE RIBBON  
17 HAD DEVELOPED IS VERY ENCOURAGING. AND I'M HOPING, BOB, THAT  
18 WE'RE GOING ON SEE THAT LEVEL OF COOPERATION AS WE GO INTO THE  
19 NETWORK MANAGER OR MANAGEMENT, BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S GOING TO  
20 BE AN EXTREMELY IMPORTANT PIECE WHEN YOU START PUTTING ALL  
21 THESE, FARE INTEGRATION WAYFINDING, ALL THAT WE NEED TO START  
22 IMPLEMENTING AND HOPEFULLY BRINGING FORWARD TO THE COMMISSIONS  
23 IN THE NEXT DAY OR TWO IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE NEED TO MAKE  
24 SURE WE HAVE THE COURAGE TO MAKE SOME OF THESE DECISIONS AND  
25 DIRECT THE INVESTMENT TO WHERE IT DOES THE MOST GOOD TO HELP



October 27, 2021

1 RESTORE AND DEVELOP NEW RIDERS. AND I THINK AN EMPHASIS NEEDS  
2 TO BE THERE. THE OTHER PIECE, ANDY IS THAT ON THE TRANSIT  
3 PRIORITY, YOU KNOW, THAT'S GOING TO TAKE LEGISLATION, IT'S  
4 GOING TO TAKE PARTNERS AT THE LEGISLATION, AND IT NEEDS TO BE  
5 A FULL-COURT PRESS BY EVERYBODY INVOLVED TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN.  
6 CALTRANS HAS BEEN LAGGING BEHIND. THEY DON'T REALLY UNDERSTAND  
7 THE URGENCY AND IT REALLY IMPACTS EVERYTHING WE'RE TRYING TO  
8 DO. THE WHOLE PLAN WHEN YOU LOOK AT IT TRANSIT BUS PRIORITY  
9 AND REALLY STREAMLINING THE SYSTEM MAKING IT WORK AS ONE  
10 SYSTEM, THIS'S AN IMPORTANT -- AND TO ME, THAT'S AS IMPORTANT  
11 AS WHEN WE INTRODUCED CLIPPER. I REALLY SEE IT HAVING THAT  
12 TRANSFORMATIVE, IN THE SAME WAY, AND WE HAVE TO MAKE IT A  
13 PRIORITY AND PUT AS MUCH PRESSURE ON ANYONE WE NEED TO, TO  
14 MAKE IT HAPPEN. THANK YOU.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. WE'LL GO TO ZOOM, THERE IS A COMMISSIONER  
17 OR TWO THAT WANTS TO SPEAK ON ZOOM, AND I SEE COMMISSIONER  
18 WORTH IN THE ROOM, AND THEN WE'LL TRANSITION TO PUBLIC  
19 COMMENT.

20

21 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANK YOU. KATE, IF YOU WANT TO MAKE PUBLIC  
22 COMMENT RAISE YOUR HAND SEE WE CAN GAUGE HOW MUCH TIME WE  
23 NEED. POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL RANDI KINMAN YOU HAVE YOUR HAND  
24 UP.

25



October 27, 2021

1   **RANDI KINMAN:** RANDI KINMAN, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, I HAD A  
2   COUPLE OF QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS, FIRST SLIDE NINE THAT  
3   COMPARES THE INCOME LEVELS OF RIDERSHIP NOW, WITH EACH AGENCY,  
4   IT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL, TO ME, FOR ME, TO SEE THAT AS A  
5   VISION VISUAL CHANGE, LIKE WHAT WAS IT BEFORE, NOT JUST WHAT  
6   IS IT NOW. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S EXTREMELY HELPFUL TO JUST  
7   HAVE PACKAGED IN ONE SLIDE. AND NOT HAVE TO DIG THROUGH DATA.  
8   MY QUESTION ABOUT THE INPUT THAT WE'RE RECEIVING FROM THE  
9   BUSINESS COMMUNITIES IS MORE OF A CONCERN OF TWO THINGS. AND  
10   WHEN THEY REPORT -- IF YOU REPORT IT, 48% OF YOUR -- THE  
11   PEOPLE THAT WORK FOR YOU ARE BACK IN THE OFFICE AND IT'S  
12   BUSINESS AS USUAL, DOES THAT MEAN 100% OF YOUR MAINTENANCE  
13   STAFF AND OTHERS? DOES IT MEAN YOUR JANITORIAL STAFF AND  
14   OTHERS? OR IS THERE A WAY THAT THEY CAN ACTUALLY BREAK THAT  
15   DOWN? I MEAN, YOU CAN'T DO JANITORIAL AND MAINTENANCE WORK AND  
16   BE REMOTE UNLESS YOU ARE IT SOMETIMES. THAT'S A HELPFUL  
17   INDICATOR OF, REALLY, WHO, AT THE ECONOMIC LEVEL IS THERE AND  
18   WHO ISN'T. AND IT MAY GIVE US A BETTER UNDERSTANDING, JUST AS  
19   KNOWING WHEN THEY REPORT-OUT THAT INFORMATION, IF THEIR  
20   EMPLOYERS COMMUTING -- IF YOU TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT WOULD IT BE  
21   A LONG MULTIPLE TRANSIT AGENCIES BECAUSE I FEEL THAT WOULD  
22   MAKE A DIFFERENCE IF YOU COULD TAKE ONE TRANSIT AGENCY AS  
23   OPPOSED TO THREE DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES THERE'S A  
24   DIFFERENTIAL THERE. AND MY LAST COMMENT -- AND I WANT TO SAY  
25   I'M EXTREMELY IMPRESSED WITH HOW THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, THROUGH



October 27, 2021

1 ALL OF THIS, HAVE COME TOGETHER AND THEY'RE WORKING TOGETHER.  
2 AND THEY'RE REALLY THINKING OUTSIDE THE BOX ON HOW TO DELIVER  
3 SERVICES AND THAT IS, REALLY, TO ME, A GREAT THING. I WANT TO  
4 MAKE SURE WE'RE INCLUDING IN THE FORMULA THERE IS THE PUBLIC  
5 PARTICIPATION, OR AT LEAST THE PUBLIC NOTIFICATION. BECAUSE IF  
6 ALL THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE TALKING TO EACH OTHER, THE  
7 GENERAL PUBLIC DOES NOT KNOW THAT. SO THEY DO NOT KNOW THAT  
8 WE'RE WORKING ON HUB DESIGNS MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. THEY  
9 DON'T KNOW THAT WE'RE WORKING, POSSIBLY, ON PARA TRANSIT  
10 CROSSOVERS BETWEEN AGENCIES. SO WE REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE  
11 THAT WE'RE CREATING A PLACE HOLDER FOR THE PUBLIC TO COME IN  
12 AND PARTICIPATE, OR AT LEAST GIVE AN OPINION ON THINGS AS WE  
13 GO. BECAUSE WE MAY BE DESIGNING WITH THE BEST INTEREST, THINGS  
14 THAT -- THAT IS NOT FUNCTIONAL, OR NOT USABLE FOR A GROUP OF  
15 PEOPLE. AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE CAPTURING THAT  
16 ALONG THE LINE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MS. KINMAN. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

19

20 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO  
21 ECHO THE THANKS OF THE COMMISSIONERS TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES.  
22 I REALLY FEEL THAT ONE OF THE GREATEST THINGS THAT'S COME OUT  
23 OF THIS CRISIS IS THE FACT THAT WE HAVE HAD ALL THE AGENCIES  
24 WORKING SO CLOSELY TOGETHER, SMALL AGENCIES, LARGER REGIONAL  
25 AGENCIES, AND I -- YOU KNOW, I JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK ALL



October 27, 2021

1 OF THE AGENCIES THAT HAVE REALLY STEPPED FORWARD EITHER  
2 THROUGH YOUR GENERAL MANAGERS OR THROUGH YOUR PLANNING STAFF.  
3 BOB, THANK YOU FOR RECOGNIZING RUBY, IT SHOWS THE TREMENDOUS  
4 CALIBER OF TRANSPORTATION PROFESSIONALS THAT WE HAVE IN THE  
5 BAY AREA, AND PLANNERS, AND NOT ONLY IN THIS GENERATION BUT IN  
6 THE NEXT GENERATION OF PEOPLE WHO REALLY HAVE TALENTS TO HELP  
7 US, AND PART OF IT IS HELPING TO UNDERSTAND WHERE WE ARE, AND  
8 LOOKING AT THOSE NUMBERS IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP IS PRETTY  
9 STAGGERING. AND I THINK WE NEED TO BE LOOKING AT NEW RIDERS,  
10 AND THIS IS WHERE OUR CONVERSATIONS WITH BOTH WILL THE BLUE  
11 RIBBON TASK FORCE AND THE BATA RECOVERY TASK FORCE REALLY COME  
12 TOGETHER. IN TERMS OF TRANSIT PRIORITY, PROVIDING -- YOU  
13 KNOW, COMMISSIONER SPERING HAS BEEN TALKING ABOUT CONGESTION  
14 ON THE 80 THROUGH SOLANO FOR DECADES. WELL, MAYBE THIS IS THE  
15 TIME. AND WE HEARD, ALSO, SUGGESTION RECEIVED ON CARPOOLING ON  
16 THE BRIDGES. CAN WE EXTEND THE CARPOOLING HOURS SO THAT  
17 FAMILIES CAN GET ON THE BRIDGE AND CARPOOL. FRIENDS ARE GOING  
18 TO GET TOGETHER, STRANGERS AREN'T GETTING TOGETHER YET, BUT  
19 MAYBE WE CAN GET FRIENDS TOGETHER AND START BUILDING BACK THAT  
20 CARPOOL NETWORK. ONE OF THE BIGGEST CHALLENGES WE HAVE IS  
21 WORKING WITH VARIOUS AGENCIES, STATE AND FEDERAL AGENCIES.  
22 AND, YOU KNOW, I THINK THAT WE DO NEED TO AGREE COMPLETELY  
23 WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING THAT, WE DO NEED A FULL COURT PRESS  
24 IN SACRAMENTO. WE HAVE GOT TO GET THE HELP FROM THE GOVERNOR'S  
25 OFFICE TO SAY THESE ARE THE ISSUES WE'RE DEALING WITH RIGHT



October 27, 2021

1 NOW TRANSIT SYSTEM IS HEMORRHAGING THE ONLY WAY WE CAN GET  
2 BACK TO REDUCE CONGESTION IS BY SOME OF THESE INITIATIVES  
3 WE'RE PROPOSING AND WE NEED HIS SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION,  
4 HEAD OF CALTRANS TO REALLY GET TOGETHER WITH US AND SAY, HOW  
5 CAN WE DO THIS. WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT A 3 TO 5 YEAR PROJECT  
6 WE REALLY NEED TO BE DOING THIS NOW. BECAUSE WHEN WE DO LOOK  
7 AT THE PROJECT PROJECTIONS AND WE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT IT,  
8 PARTICULARLY, THE FUTURE SUSTAINABILITY OF TRANSIT WITHOUT  
9 RIDERSHIP. AND SO, I -- I BELIEVE THAT WE HAVE GOT SOME GREAT  
10 IDEAS. WE JUST HAVE TO OVERCOME. WE HAVE TO GET TOGETHER WITH  
11 THE STATE, AND GET THEIR CONCURRENCE AND WORK WITH THEM TO  
12 SAY, HOW CAN WE DO THIS. AND I THINK THAT BECAME CLEAR IN  
13 TERMS OF THE TASK FORCE DISCUSSIONS FROM THE CALSTA, THAT THEY  
14 SHARE OUR PRIORITIES. SO, MAYBE THAT'S A BIG PART OF THE NEXT  
15 STEP, IS TO REALLY SIT DOWN AND WHAT WE FEEL ARE THE MOST  
16 STRATEGIC PROGRAMS AND INVESTMENTS AND THEN REALLY ENHANCE  
17 THAT PARTNERSHIP WITH THE STATE TO BE ABLE TO IMPLEMENT THESE  
18 ISSUES SOON. AS OPPOSED TO, YOU KNOW, THE TYPICAL LONG-TERM  
19 PLANNING PROCESS. SO, AGAIN, THANK YOU TO EVERYBODY. AND, FOR  
20 THIS OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY HIGHLIGHT WHERE -- WHAT  
21 OPPORTUNITIES WE HAVE RIGHT NOW AND THE URGENCY. THANK YOU.  
22  
23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, COMMISSION ARE WORTH. SO WE'RE GOING TO  
24 TRANSITION TO PUBLIC COMMENT IN A MINUTE. AND I THINK WE'RE



October 27, 2021

1 GOING TO START IN THE ROOM. AND I HAVE ONE SPEAKER, IAN  
2 GRIFFITHS, IF YOU COULD COME UP HERE IS SPEAK. CHAIR PEDROZA?  
3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** LET'S ROLL RIGHT INTO PUBLIC COMMENT.  
5

6 **SPEAKER:** IF PEOPLE COULD KEEP -- WE HAVE SEVERAL COMMENTS ON  
7 THE ZOOM AS WELL, IF YOU COULD KEEP IT TO ABOUT TWO MINUTES  
8 THAT WOULD BE GREAT, IS THEN WE'LL TAKE A BREAK.

9  
10 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** IS THAT ON? GREAT. HELLO COMMISSIONERS. GOODS  
11 TO BE BACK HERE IN PERSON, AND THANK YOU, AND CONGRATS TO  
12 HOLDING YOUR FIRST HYBRID MEETING. I WAS A MEMBER OF THE TASK  
13 FORCE AND A POLICY DIRECTOR OF SEAMLESS BAY AREA, AND I FIRST  
14 WANT TO COMMEND MTC STAFF COMMISSIONERS, SPERING, KINZIE, AS  
15 WELL AS ALL OF THE MEMBERS OF THE TASK FORCE FOR WHAT I THINK  
16 IS AN EXCELLENT PLAN, AND I'M REALLY EXCITED, I THINK RIDERS  
17 IN GENERAL ARE REALLY EXCITED TO SEE THIS LEVEL OF ATTENTION  
18 TO SOME OF THE STRUCTURAL ISSUES THAT ARE GOING TO BE SO  
19 IMPORTANT TO MOVING FORWARD. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO THE  
20 DISCUSSION OVER THE COMING DAYS. I WAS STRUCK IN THE SLIDES.  
21 THE THING I WANTED TO COMMENT ON THAT WAS JUST PRESENTED. YOU  
22 COULD SEE THAT THE POLLING, IT'S ENCOURAGING TO SEE EMPLOYERS  
23 SUPPORTING TRANSIT. IT'S ENCOURAGING TO SEE SUPPORT FROM THE  
24 PUBLIC, 87% OF PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA SEE THAT TRANSIT IS  
25 IMPORTANT THAT'S GOING TO BE SO IMPORTANT FOR FUNDING BECAUSE



October 27, 2021

1 WE HAVE ALL ACKNOWLEDGED WE'RE ALREADY TALKING ABOUT HOW MORE  
2 FUNDING WILL BE NEEDED HOWEVER WE ALL SEE SUPPORTING 84% FOR  
3 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER THAT CAN SET FARES, ALIGN ROUTES,  
4 SCHEDULES, STANDARDIZE INFORMATION, OVERWHELMING SUPPORT FOR  
5 THESE REFORMS THAT PEOPLE VIEW AS IMPORTANT. AND IT'S NATURAL  
6 FOR PEOPLE TO UNDERSTAND THAT TO ACHIEVE THOSE OUTCOMES, YOU  
7 NEED ACCOUNTABILITY AND YOU NEED THE LEVEL OF FOCUS THAT CAN  
8 DELIVER ON THOSE THINGS. SO THOSE ARE REAL THINGS THAT I THINK  
9 ARE GOING TO BE IMPORTANT FOR US TO BUILD THE PUBLIC SUPPORT  
10 FOR FUNDING AND OVER THE NEXT COME DAYS, I WOULD REALLY  
11 ENCOURAGE YOU TO SUPPORT THAT DIRECTION AND THE WORK IN  
12 LOOKING AT A NETWORK MANAGER STRUCTURE THAT CAN SET US ON THE  
13 COURSE, SO THAT WHEN WE'RE ASKING FOR VOTERS FOR MONEY IN  
14 2024, THEY WILL FEEL CONFIDENT THAT THE MONEY IS GOING TO LEAD  
15 TO OUTCOMES WE'RE TELLING THEM IT WILL.

16  
17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. KIMBERLY, DO YOU WANT -- THAT'S THE ONLY  
18 COMMENT IN THE ROOM. DO YOU WANT TO TAKE COMMENT ON THE ZOOM?

19  
20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. IF YOU HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED, I'LL  
21 ASK ATTENDEES, WHO HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED TO SPEAK WHEN YOU  
22 CALL YOU UNMUTE YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK. FIRST SPEAKER  
23 IS ROLAND LEBRON PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.



October 27, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU FOR THE  
2 OPPORTUNITY SO, I REALLY APPRECIATE ALL THE CONVERSATION  
3 AROUND TRANSIT. I HAVE NO ISSUES. BUT, ONE I WANT TO TALK TO  
4 IS THE PEOPLE WHO DO NOT HAVE LINES OF TRANSIT, PARTICULARLY  
5 SANTA CLARA COUNTY I'M GOING TO SPEAK ON ANDY'S SLIDE NUMBER  
6 SEVEN, YOU CAN SEE THE GREAT BIG RED AREA HEADED SOUTH TOWARD  
7 GILROY, AND IF YOU LOOK AT WHAT'S GOING ON THERE, ACTUALLY,  
8 YOU CAN SEE MORE -- NO, ACTUALLY, IF YOU LOOK, YOU CAN SEE,  
9 BASICALLY THE PENINSULA IS, YOU KNOW, IT'S FINE, IT'S LIKE WE  
10 NEVER HAD ANY KIND OF TRAFFIC THERE, AND THAT'S BASICALLY  
11 BECAUSE THE MAJORITY OF PEOPLE WORKING IN THE PENINSULA ARE  
12 WORKING FROM HOME. AND WHEN YOU TRANSITION TO SLIDE 12, YOU  
13 CAN SEE THE SAME KIND OF PATTERN THERE, BUT WHAT I DON'T FULLY  
14 UNDERSTAND WHEN IT SAYS THAT THE TRAFFIC BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND  
15 GILROY IS NOW 15 TO 30% FASTER THAN BEFORE, I DO NOT REALLY  
16 UNDERSTAND WHAT HAPPENED THERE. BECAUSE THAT DOES NOT, YOU  
17 KNOW, CORROBORATE WITH WHAT WE'RE SEEING DOWN HERE. BUT IN  
18 WRAPPING UP, WHAT I WANT TO YOUR ATTENTION TO, AND IT'S THE  
19 PROBLEM WITH PLANNED BAY AREA, FROM THE BEGINNING, I'M LOOKING  
20 AT THE LINK 21 SLIDE TO THE -- IT'S A PRESENTATION TO THE BART  
21 BOARD, IT WAS EITHER IN MARCH OR IN MAY, WE CHOSE REGIONAL  
22 TRIPS, WHICH IS A 28 MILLION TRIPS A DAY. BUT THEN, CIRCLE  
23 HALO COUNTIES AND THE BAY AREA, AND WHAT I'M PARTICULARLY  
24 INTERESTED IN IS THE TRIPS BETWEEN THE MONTEREY BAY AREA, AND



October 27, 2021

1 SILICON VALLEY, AND I'M SEEING 135,000 INBOUND TRIPS FROM THE  
2 MONTEREY BAY AREA AND INTO SILICON -- IS MY TIME UP?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** AND 85,000 ROUND TRIP TRIPS THESE NEED TO BE  
7 ADDRESSED WE DON'T HAVE TRANSIT DOWN HERE, WE CAN'T TAKE  
8 [INDISCERNIBLE] THOUSAND CARS A DAY. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SEAMLESS BAY  
11 AREA. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS ADINA LEVIN  
14 HAVING FORGOTTEN, AGAIN, TO LOG OUT AND LOG BACK N I'M ON THE  
15 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND HAVE BEEN SHARING THE FARE  
16 INTEGRATION ADVISORY GROUP, AND I'LL SPEAK A LITTLE BIT WITH  
17 THAT, AND ALSO WITH ADVOCACY HATS, FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN, AND  
18 SEAMLESS, WHERE WORKING ON THAT FARE STUDY THAT REALLY  
19 CONNECTS WITH A THEME TODAY IN TERMS OF THE OPPORTUNITY TO  
20 BRING BACK TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, IN A WAY THAT IS COGNIZANT OF  
21 THE NEW TRAVEL PATTERNS, BUT ALSO PROVIDING ACCESS TO PEOPLE  
22 WHO DIDN'T HAVE ACCESS BEFORE. SO ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I  
23 HAVE BEEN DOING WITH ADVOCACY HATS IS WORKING WITH PEOPLE IN  
24 COMMUNITY COLLEGES AND YOUTH WHO ARE REALLY EXCITED ABOUT  
25 INTEGRATED FARES TO BE ABLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF



October 27, 2021

1 OPPORTUNITIES. YOU KNOW, JOB OPPORTUNITIES, FOR EXAMPLE, THAT  
2 THEY WERE NOT ABLE TO AFFORD BEFORE. LAST WEEK, I GAVE A TALK  
3 AT AFFORDABLE HOUSING DAY WITH HOUSING LEADERSHIP COUNCIL,  
4 WITH EDEN HOUSING, WHERE THEY ARE GIVING OUT SINGLE AGENCY  
5 TRANSIT PASSES TO RESIDENTS, AS PART OF THE ASIC PROGRAM, AND  
6 THEY ARE REALLY EAGER FOR THE ALL AGENCY TRANSIT PASS BECAUSE  
7 RESIDENTS HAVE JOB OPPORTUNITIES, FAMILY OPPORTUNITIES, OTHER  
8 TRAVEL NEEDS THAT THEY HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO ADDRESS BEFORE. SO  
9 THE OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE INTEGRATED AND AFFORDABLE FARES, AS  
10 WELL AS THE OTHER IMPROVEMENTS TO SCHEDULES AND BUS LANES,  
11 HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE MORE MOBILITY OPTIONS TO  
12 PEOPLE THAN IT HAD BEFORE AND HOPEFULLY LATER IN THIS WORKSHOP  
13 YOU WILL HEAR FROM MORE OF THE PEOPLE THAT WE HAVE BEEN  
14 WORKING WITH OVER THE LAST MONTHS TO, IN PAYING ATTENTION TO  
15 THE FARE STUDY. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER -- PARDON ME -  
18 - THE NEXT -- SORRY -- THE NEXT SPEAKER IS VAUGHN. PLEASE  
19 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HOPE YOU CAN HEAR ME. A COUPLE OF THINGS UP FRONT IS  
22 TRANSIT PRIOR TO COVID WASN'T ALL THAT GOOD ANYWAYS. TRANSIT  
23 CARRIED 10% BART EVEN AT HEIGHT WHEN CARRYING 440,000 RIDERS  
24 WAS LESS THAN 10% OF MTC BART DISTRICT AREA POPULATION YOU  
25 MENTIONED RELIABLE FREQUENT AND SAFE WAS NOT FAST THERE IS



October 27, 2021

1 PEOPLE DOING 200 MILES AN HOUR ON THE HIGHWAY WHEN THEY  
2 WEREN'T SO BUSY. CALTRAIN WHEN WENT TO BABY BULLET WERE  
3 FULLEST AND MOST HEAVILY USED AND DOUBLED RIDERSHIP YOU'RE NOT  
4 TALKING ABOUT FAST YOU'RE STILL TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT, AND THE  
5 PROBLEM IN THE BAY AREA, AND THE BARRIER, IT'S EMBARRASSING  
6 YOU HAVE 27 DIFFERENT AGENCIES AND THERE IS ANOTHER ONE BEING  
7 BUILT OUT HERE IN PLEASANTON NO PURPOSE OTHER THAN LESS THAN  
8 10% OF THE PEOPLE TO GO THROUGH 580 TO GET OVER TO THE BART  
9 STATION AND THE PAIN PROBLEM IS PEOPLE IN THEIR CARS HAVE NO  
10 CHOICE THEY CAN EITHER BUMBLE ALONG AND GET THROUGHOUT  
11 CONGESTION AND GET TO WHERE THAT I WANT TO GO AND LEAVE WHEN  
12 THAT I WANT TO BUT THERE IS NO REAL A SERVICE 110125 MILES AN  
13 HOUR ACCORDING TO THE STATE RAIL PLAN THAT'S BEING DEFEATED BY  
14 VALLEY LINK WE HAVE THE PROBLEM FROM SOLANO CAN'T INTO SAN  
15 FRANCISCO WHAT ABOUT 110 MILE AN HOUR TRAINS INTO SAN  
16 FRANCISCO MONEY IS BEING SPENT BILLIONS OF DOLLARS PER MILE  
17 FOR BART TO SAN JOSE IN BART EXTENSIONS BART CAN'T GO ANY  
18 FASTER CAN'T RUN EXPRESS TRAINS THAT DOESN'T GIVE YOU FASTER  
19 SERVICE AND THE MAJOR FUNDING, THE LAST 70 YEARS, THE FUNDING  
20 FOR NATIONAL AND STATE HAS BEEN FOR HIGHWAYS, 90% IS FOR  
21 HIGHWAYS. THE LAST BROWN BUDGET I SAW WAS ONE AND A HALF  
22 MILLION FOR HIGHWAYS ONE AND A HALF BILLION FOR STREETS AND  
23 ROADS AND 800 MILLION FOR TRANSIT. HOW ARE YOU GOING TO GET  
24 OUT OF THAT HOLE WITH THAT KIND OF SPENDING? THANK YOU.  
25



October 27, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS GERALD CAUTHEN.

2 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I'M GERALD CAUTHEN PRESIDENT OF THE BAY AREA

5 TRANSPORTATION WORKING GROUP. I'M HERE TODAY BECAUSE THIS IS

6 THE EXACT KIND OF THING WE HAVE BEEN ADVOCATING FOR OURSELVES

7 SINCE OUR INCEPTION IN 2012 AND SOME A LOT LONGER THAN THAT, I

8 CAN'T REALLY COMPLAIN ABOUT THIS LOVE THE EMPHASIS ON SHORT-

9 TERM LOWER COST CHANGES THAT COULD IMMEDIATELY HAVE IMPACT,

10 AND I CERTAINLY AM IN FAVOR OF PRIORITY FOR BUSES, AND

11 IMPROVEMENTS IN RAIL, AND IMPROVEMENTS IN THE BUS SYSTEM SO

12 THAT MORE OF THE POPULATION CAN ACTUALLY BENEFIT FROM TRANSIT,

13 AS IT PREVIOUS SPEAKER SAID, BENEFITTING EVEN BEFORE COVID.

14 I'M GOING TO RAISE ONE QUESTION, HOWEVER. I HAVEN'T HEARD VERY

15 MUCH ABOUT THE CAPITAL. I'M SORRY. THE CAPITAL SIDE OF THINGS.

16 SOME PROJECTS ARE OUT THERE QUIETLY BEING MOVED ALONG IN THE

17 EARLY STAGES, PLANNING, SCOPE DOCUMENT EIRS OR PARTS OF EIRS

18 ALTERNATIVE ANALYSIS THAT WERE CONCEIVED WAY BACK BEFORE COVID

19 HIT. AND AS WE HAVE ALL HEARD TODAY, THERE ARE SOME DRAMATIC

20 AND VERY LIKELY LONG-TERM CHANGES THAT ARE GOING TO OCCUR IN

21 RIDERSHIP, REGARDLESS OF WHAT IS DONE. SO NOT TAKING AWAY FROM

22 THE LOCAL THINGS, BUT HAS THERE BEEN ANY ATTEMPT TO EVALUATE

23 SOME OF THOSE VERY COSTLY PROJECTS THAT MAY OR MAY NOT BE

24 NEEDED NOW AND SEEING WHAT CAN BE DONE ABOUT THAT SITUATION?

25 THANK YOU.



October 27, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE FINAL SPEAKER IS RICHARD  
3 HEDGES. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4

5 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I HAVE BEEN VERY HAPPY  
6 WITH WHAT I HAVE BEEN HEARING TODAY. I HAVE NO QUALMS ABOUT  
7 IT, BUT I WILL SPEAK ON A SUBJECT OF SAFETY. IF WE DON'T GET  
8 THE RIDERSHIP BACK, AND WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT IS WE'LL ALWAYS  
9 GET THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE OTHER OPTION BUT THEY'RE NOT GOING TO  
10 FUND THE SYSTEM. I WATCHED AS RIDERSHIP DROPPED OFF BEFORE THE  
11 PANDEMIC, AND I HAVE TWO PEOPLE THAT I TRAVEL TRAINED, THAT  
12 QUIT RIDING BECAUSE OF THE CONNECTIONS TO BART THAT FELT  
13 UNSAFE AND I THINK BART IS A GOOD SYSTEM. IT GETS YOU THERE ON  
14 TIME, IT OFTEN WAS VERY CROWDED, I DIDN'T MIND THAT IN FACT I  
15 ENJOYED TALKING WITH PEOPLE ON BART AND FINDING OUT ABOUT  
16 OTHER PEOPLE IT'S A GREAT WAY TO TRAVEL. I'LL NEVER STOP  
17 TAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT. BUT I HAVE NEIGHBORS WHO WON'T GO WITH  
18 ME TO SAN FRANCISCO NOW IF THEY HAVE TO CONNECT TO BART. AND  
19 THEY FEEL UNSAFE. SO IF WE DON'T MAKE PEOPLE FEEL UNSAFE ABOUT  
20 THEIR HEALTH AND SAFE ABOUT THEIR SECURITY FROM VIOLENCE. I  
21 HAVE ONLY HAD THREE TIMES IN ALL MY TIMES RIDING BART THEY  
22 FELT I WAS IN DANGER. BUT THIS'S NOT A GOOD FEELING. SO  
23 USUALLY YOU ONLY NEED THAT ONE TIME WITH A PERSON AND IF THEY  
24 HAVE OTHER OPTIONS THEY WON'T RIDE. SO WE HAVE TO GET THAT  
25 UNDER CONTROL, AND I DON'T THINK WE'LL EVER COMPLETELY CONTROL



October 27, 2021

1 IT BUT WE HAVE TO DO A BETTER JOB THAN WE HAVE DONE BEFORE.  
2 BART IS A WONDERFUL SYSTEM AND WE HAVE GOT TO GET PEOPLE ON  
3 IT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT'S RIGHT, KIMBERLY ON THE  
6 PUBLIC COMMENT?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I DO SEE ADDITIONAL HANDS THAT WERE RAISED  
9 AFTER WE CALLED FOR THE FINAL SPEAKER. BUT BEFORE WE MOVE ON,  
10 I DO WANT TO MAKE NOTE THAT WE DID RECEIVE WRITTEN PUBLIC  
11 COMMENT FROM JOE KUNZLER THAT HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE  
12 AGENDA I'M NOT SURE HOW YOU WANT TO ADDRESS THE TWO ADDITIONAL  
13 RAISED HANDS.

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THEY HAVE THEIR HAND RAISED RIGHT NOW,  
16 KIMBERLY?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THEY JUST RAISED THEM.

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WORRIES. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS JONATHON  
23 KATZ. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24



October 27, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** SORRY FOR THE LATE HAND. I AM JONATHON KATZ THE  
2 TRANSPORTATION POLICY MANAGER AT SPUR. I WANT TO EXPRESS  
3 GRATITUDE FOR EVERYONE'S WORK ON THE ACTION PLAN WHICH HAS A  
4 STRONG SET OF PRACTICAL RECOMMENDATIONS. I WANT TO AGREE WITH  
5 COMMISSIONER SPERING AND NANCY WHELAN ON THE IMPORTANCE OF  
6 TAKING COORDINATED ACTION ON BUS TRANSIT PRIORITY. THESE  
7 IMPROVEMENTS OFFER REAL OPPORTUNITY TO GROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP.  
8 IT'S CLEAR THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE NOT GENERALLY NOT IN A  
9 POSITION TO DRIVE THESE BUS PRIORITY PROJECTS FORWARD IN THE  
10 BOLD FASHION THAT WE NEED. -- -- THIS HAS BEEN PARTICULARLY  
11 CHALLENGING ON MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL REGIONAL CORRIDORS.  
12 POTENTIAL BENEFITS ARE CLEAR BECAUSE SFMTA WHICH HAPPENS TO BE  
13 A JURISDICTION WHERE TRANSIT AGENCY CONTROLS THE ROADS HAS  
14 BEEN ROLLING OUT BUS PRIORITY IMPROVEMENTS AT A FACE PACE AND  
15 ARE SEEING DRAMATIC RESULT IN SPEED IS RELIABILITY  
16 IMPROVEMENTS THE PROPOSED CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN AND THE  
17 NOTION OF A REGIONAL TRANSIT PRIORITY NETWORK IS A GREAT  
18 OPPORTUNITY ACCELERATE BUS PRIORITY PROJECTS AND PROJECT  
19 DELIVERY AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO THE WORK IN THIS AREA. THANKS  
20 SO MUCH.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS JAMES  
23 SCHMIDT. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. MR. SCHMIDT IF YOU ARE  
24 THERE, WE CAN'T HEAR YOU. YOU HAVE BEEN UNMUTED ON OUR END,  
25 MR. SCHMIDT.



October 27, 2021

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE OTHER  
3 OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC COMMENT, AS WELL, KIMBERLY. MAYBE MR.  
4 SCHMIDT CAN JOIN US AT A LATER TIME. THANK YOU, KATE FOR YOUR  
5 ASSISTANCE AS WE NAVIGATED HERE. AT THIS POINT, I WANT TO  
6 THANK ALL OF THE COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR THOUGHTFUL COMMENTS,  
7 TO GWEN, TO BOB, TO NANCY, TO JASON THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
8 PRESENTATIONS. WE'RE GOING TO TAKE A BREAK. WE'RE A BIT BEHIND  
9 SCHEDULE BUT WE'LL COME BACK AT 3:35 AND BEGIN OUR MTC  
10 TRANSFORMATION AS A HUB. I'LL SEE YOU AT 3:35 THANK YOU,  
11 AGAIN, EVERYONE. [ BREAK ] [MEETING WILL RESUME SHORTLY]

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I THINK WE'RE GOING TO RECONVENE IF THE COMMISSIONERS  
14 CAN COME BACK. KATE, CAN YOU HEAR ME? I JUST WANT TO CHECK MY  
15 AUDIO.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YEP.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. THANK YOU.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I KNOW I APPRECIATE THE CHOCOLATE IN THE ROOM.  
22 WHOEVER IS PROVIDING THAT. THANK YOU.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, IS EVERYONE BACK ON,  
25 VIRTUALLY?



October 27, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WE CAN ONLY SEE THREE OF YOU SO FAR.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCREENS ARE HIDDEN AT THE MOMENT.

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** NOT THAT THERE IS ANYTHING WRONG WITH  
9 THAT. I KNOW THERE IS MORE PEOPLE IN ATTENDANCE. WE WANT TO  
10 GET STARTED ON TIME. THANK YOU KATE AND EVERYONE FOR HELPING  
11 FACILITATE THAT DISCUSSION. WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE BUILDING  
12 OFF OF WHAT WE JUST HEARD. NEXT ITEM IS MTC TRANSFORMATION  
13 HUB. WE'RE GOING TO HEAR A PRESENTATION FROM MTC STAFF ABOUT  
14 HOW MTC CAN SERVE AS A TRANSFORMATION HUB. AFTER THE  
15 PRESENTATION, WE'LL HAVE ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY TO ASK QUESTIONS  
16 AND ENGAGE IN ANOTHER THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSION AS WE FIRST DID.  
17 MELANIE CHOY IS GOING TO PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF THE ACTION  
18 PLAN AND HOW IT RELATES TO ONGOING WORK FOLLOWED BY REBECCA  
19 LONG TO DESCRIBE MTC TRANSITION COORDINATION AUTHORITY AND HOW  
20 WE USE IT IN OPTIONS AS WE TRANSITION INTO THE IMPLEMENTATION  
21 PHASE OF THE ACTION PLAN. GET READY TO START THINKING ABOUT  
22 THAT AUTHORITY. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO MELANIE, FOLLOWED  
23 BY REBECCA TO GIVE A PRESENTATION AND ONCE AGAIN WE'LL WILL  
24 FOLLOW WITH Q&A.

25



October 27, 2021

1 **MELANIE CHOY:** GOOD AFTERNOON MELANIE CHOY WITH POLICY AND  
2 PROGRAMS GROUP AT METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION I'LL  
3 BE PROVIDING AN OVERVIEW OF TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
4 PLAN. I WILL TRY TO HIGHLIGHT AS MUCH AS I CAN. NEXT SLIDE  
5 PLEASE. THE TASK FORCE WAS ESTABLISHED IN 20112020 AS THE  
6 PANDEMIC WAS UNFOLDING THIS IS A TWOFOLD RESPONSE AND I WANT  
7 TO UNDERSCORE EVEN THOUGH THIS HAS BEEN REPEATED IT WAS IN  
8 RESPONSE TO THE IMMEDIATE CRISIS WHILE SIMULTANEOUSLY  
9 RECOGNIZING THAT TIMES OF CRISIS CAN OFFER OPPORTUNITY TO  
10 TRANSFORM TRANSIT FROM LONG-TERM RESILIENCE. THE TASK FORCE  
11 BROUGHT TOGETHER 32 KEY STAKEHOLDERS WHO MET MONTHLY OVER A 15  
12 MONTH PERIOD FROM MAY 2020 TO JULY 2021. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
13 HERE THE WORK OF THE TASK FORCE WAS STRUCTURED AROUND THREE  
14 STAGES EACH HAD A PARTICULAR FOCUS. NOTABLY ALL THREE OF THESE  
15 STAGES ARE STILL RELEVANT TODAY. STAGE ONE WAS ARRIVAL AND THE  
16 TASK FORCE PROVIDED GUIDANCE FOR THE SECOND DISTRIBUTION FOR  
17 THE FEDERAL CARES FUNDING BUT TODAY WE'RE STILL VERY MUCH IN  
18 SURVIVAL MODE AND ADDITIONAL FEDERAL AID HAS BEEN PROVIDED  
19 THROUGH CRRSAA AND ARP FUNDING ACTS. STAGE TWO SUPPORTS  
20 OPERATORS RECOVERY PLANNING. THIS INCLUDED OPERATORS HEALTHY  
21 TRANSIT MAN DASHBOARD AS WELL AS RETURN TO TRANSIT CAMPAIGN  
22 WORK. AND LASTLY, STAGE THREE, THIS WAS FOCUSED ON TRANSIT  
23 TRANSFORMATION, WHICH WAS THE TASK FORCE'S MOST COMPLEX  
24 ASSIGNMENT AND OVER THAT TEN MONTH PERIOD, TOWARDS THE END,  
25 THE TASK FORCE REACHED CONSENSUS ON CRITICAL BUILDING BLOCKS



October 27, 2021

1 THAT INFORMED THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE FINAL ACTION PLAN. NEXT  
2 SLIDE PLEASE. AND SO HERE WE START OUT WITH ONE OF THE FIRST  
3 BUILDING BLOCKS THE TASK FORCE ADOPTED IN FALL OF 2020 THE  
4 TASK FORCE SHIFTED FROM THE FIRST AND SECOND STAGES INTO STAGE  
5 THREE, THE TRANSFORMATION WORK. AND THIS FIRST SET OF BUILDING  
6 BLOCKS WAS APPROVED. THERE WERE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES TO ANCHOR  
7 THE STAGE THREE WORK. FIRST GOAL WAS FOCUSED ON RECOVERY,  
8 SECOND GOAL FOCUSED ON EQUITY. THIRD GOAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
9 AND GOVERNANCE AND THE FOURTH GOAL WAS UPLIFTING CURRENT  
10 INITIATIVES THAT WERE CURRENTLY ONGOING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
11 AND THROUGHOUT THE TASK FORCE AND ECHOED TODAY IN MANY OTHER  
12 PREVIOUS PRESENTATIONS THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS SOUGHT TO  
13 ADDRESS EQUITY IN ITS WORK. UNDER GOAL TWO, THE DEVELOPMENT OF  
14 THE PRINCIPLES WAS PRIORITIZED AS AN IMPORTANT BUILDING BLOCK  
15 AND THESE FIVE PRINCIPLES WERE DO WANTED INVEST EQUITABLY,  
16 INCREASE ACCESSIBILITY, BE INCLUSIVE USE DATA TO INFORM  
17 DECISIONS AND ADVANCE HEALTH AND SAFETY. AS THERESE MENTIONED  
18 IN HER OPENING REMARKS, THIS SERVES AS A COMPASS TO THE TASK  
19 FORCE BUT IT ALSO CONTINUALLY GUIDES LEADERS, PUBLIC AGENCIES,  
20 AND ADVOCATES AND COMMUNITIES TOWARDS EQUITABLE AND LASTING  
21 RECOVERY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS THE LAST BUILDING BLOCK  
22 I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT WHICH IS THE DEFINITION OF TRANSIT  
23 TRANSFORMATION WAS ADOPTED AND THIS LAYS THE GROUPED WORK FOR  
24 OUTCOMES AND ACTIONS THAT WILL FOLLOW. COMPONENTS OF THIS  
25 DEFINITION CALL OUT ADEQUATELY INVEST EFFECTIVELY MANAGE



October 27, 2021

1   EQUITABLE SYSTEM INTEGRATE CUSTOMER-FACING FEATURES AND THIS  
2   IS WITH THE GOAL OF INCREASING RIDERSHIP AND TRANSIT AND  
3   REDUCING THE VMT. THE OUTCOMES ON THIS SLIDE ARE CENTRAL TO  
4   THIS PLAN AND SERVE AS THE NORTH STAR. 27 ACTIONS ARE ALIGNED  
5   TO THE FIVE OUTCOMES. THE FIRST TWO OUTCOMES, FARES AND  
6   PAYMENT AND CUSTOMER INFORMATION HAVE BEEN CITED AS KEY AND  
7   MAKING IT EASIER FOR RIDERS TO NAVIGATE THE SYSTEM AND THIRD  
8   OUTCOME IS FOCUSED ON TRANSIT NETWORK AND IMPORTANCE OF  
9   ESTABLISHING A UNIFIED, NIMBLE, AND EFFECTIVE TRANSIT SYSTEM.  
10   THE FOURTH OUTCOME IS A FOCUS ON ACCESSIBILITY AND ADDRESSING  
11   THE NEEDS OF VULNERABLE POPULATIONS. AND, LASTLY, THE FIFTH  
12   OUTCOME IS FUNDING. WHERE USING EXISTING RESOURCES EFFECTIVELY  
13   AND ALSO SECURING NEW REVENUES ARE IMPORTANT FOR MEETING THE  
14   NEEDS OF THE REGION AND THIS ACTION PLAN.   NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
15   SO, THE ACTION PLAN IS VERY SPECIFIC, BUT THERE ARE SOME KEY  
16   OVERARCHING ELEMENTS UNDERPINNING THE PLAN, AND SEVERAL  
17   IMPORTANT FEATURES ARE BUILT INTO THE ACTION PLAN  
18   COLLABORATION AS MENTIONED MANY TIMES, AMONG STAKEHOLDERS IS  
19   ESSENTIAL.   AND, ALSO, EACH OF THE ACTIONS IS ALIGNED TO AN  
20   OUTCOME.   AND THE FOCUS OF THIS ACTION PLAN WORK IS A 1 TO 3  
21   TIME FRAME SO IT'S REALLY FOCUSED ON THE NEAR-TERM. DECISIONS  
22   ON FUNDING, AND ALIGNMENT OF EXISTING OR NEW FUNDING IS NEEDED  
23   TO ADVANCE THESE INITIATIVES, AND LASTLY, THESE ACTIONS MAY BE  
24   AMBITIOUS AND AS WE BEGIN WORKING TOWARDS IMPLEMENTATION, THE  
25   DATES AND TIMES THAT WE OUTLINED ARE SUBJECT TO REFINEMENT.



October 27, 2021

1 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND, SO THESE NEXT FOUR SLIDES ALL  
2 SUMMARIZE THE 27 ACTIONS IN THE ACTION PLAN. SOME OF THEM HAVE  
3 ALREADY BEEN MENTIONED. THE FIRST SET OF ACTIONS I WILL  
4 HIGHLIGHT, OR CATEGORIZE, AS ACCELERATED ACTIONS, AND SO,  
5 THESE ARE CONSIDERED ACCELERATED TO DISTINGUISH THEM AND  
6 ELEVATE THE FOCUS ON THESE EFFORTS, WHEREBY PROVIDING  
7 RESOURCES AND CREATING A STRONG PRIORITY FOR THEM TO ACHIEVE  
8 THEM AS BEING ELEVATED. SO THE ACCELERATED CATEGORIES INCLUDE  
9 FARES AND PAYMENT AND UNDER THE FARES AND PAYMENTS THERE IS  
10 THREE ACTIONS THAT ARE ALIGNED TO THE COORDINATION AND  
11 INTEGRATION STUDY WORK SECOND CATEGORY ACCELERATED ACTIONS  
12 CUSTOMER INFORMATION AND THIS IS FOCUSED ON MAPPING AND  
13 WAYFINDING AND THREE THAT FALL UNDER THIS ACCELERATION ACTION  
14 CATEGORY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. UNDER TRANSIT NETWORK THERE IS A  
15 SUBCATEGORY OF SIX TRANSIT PRIORITY ACTIONS THAT HAVE BECOME  
16 ELEVATED. THIS CONTINUES TO BE BROUGHT UP AS A PRIORITY FROM  
17 THE TASK FORCE WITH WIDESPREAD SUPPORT AND INCLUDES ACTIONS ON  
18 HIGHWAY AND ROADWAY SYSTEM. THESE ARE LAST OF THE ACCELERATED  
19 ACTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE CONTINUES THE TRANSIT NETWORK  
20 CATEGORY OF THE OTHER ACTIONS THAT FALL UNDER THIS, NOT  
21 FALLING UNDER ACCELERATED ACTIONS BUT IS A BROADER CATEGORY  
22 AROUND SUBCATEGORIES, INCLUDING NETWORK MANAGEMENT REFORM  
23 NETWORK PLANNING AND DATA, ADDITIONAL AREAS OF THIS WORK IS  
24 ALREADY UNDERWAY, AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE WORK  
25 WAS A FOCAL POINT OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE DISCUSSION.



October 27, 2021

1 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THE FOURTH OUTCOME THAT WE HAVE HERE IS  
2 THE FOCUSED ON ACCESSIBILITY WITH FIVE ACTIONS. AND THE RANGE  
3 OF ACTIONS SPAN FROM IMPROVING ACCESS AND MOBILITY ON PUBLIC  
4 TRANSIT TO PARATRANSIT SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS. IT'S IMPORTANT --  
5 THE LAST OUTCOME IS FUNDING AND IMPORTANT TO ACHIEVING THE  
6 OUTCOMES IS ALSO THIS LAST CATEGORY. SO THE TWO ACTIONS THAT  
7 FALL UNDER FUNDING FOCUS ON EVALUATING EXISTING SOURCES IN  
8 CONJUNCTION WITH ANY NEW FUNDING AND ADDITIONALLY IT CALLS OUT  
9 THE IMPORTANCE OF BRINGING TOGETHER STAKEHOLDERS TO IDENTIFY  
10 PRIORITIES AND ALSO TO EFFECTIVELY SET A FRAMEWORK FOR A  
11 FUTURE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING BALLOT MEASURE. AND THE TASK  
12 FORCES UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THESE 27 ACTION IN JULY, 2021, AND  
13 SUBSEQUENTLY THE COMMISSION TOOK FORMAL ACTION IN SEPTEMBER TO  
14 RECEIVE AND SUPPORT THE ACTION PLAN. AND NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
15 HOWEVER THESE ACTIONS ARE NOT ISOLATED THEY COMPLEMENT THE  
16 ONGOING WORK IN THE REGION AS WELL AS AT MTC AND I WANT TO  
17 HIGHLIGHT A FEW THINGS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OVER THE LAST  
18 SEVERAL DECADES AS TRANSIT EVOLVES AND CHANGES WE HAVE PURSUED  
19 A MULTITUDE OF INITIATIVES PROGRAMS TO MEET THE CHANGING  
20 CONDITIONS, SPANNING FROM COORDINATION EFFORTS OPERATIONS AND  
21 CUSTOMER SERVICE, 511 ASK CLIPPER AND CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT  
22 PROGRAMS. ALL OF THESE EFFORTS HAVE ONE THING IN COMMON ALL  
23 WORKING TOWARDS ACHIEVING FLEXIBLE AFFORDABLE CUSTOMER FOCUSED  
24 WELL FUNDED TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT MORE PEOPLE WILL USE FOR MORE  
25 TRIPS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THE ACTION PLAN FOCUSES ON



October 27, 2021

1 REVITALIZING TRANSIT TOWARDS FULFILLING GOALS OF PLANNED BAY  
2 AREA 2050 HAVING A STRONG TRANSIT SYSTEM IS ESSENTIAL FOR  
3 LONG-TERM GOALS OF CLIMATE CHANGE TRANSPORTATION LINKAGES AND  
4 RELIABLE ROBUST SYSTEMS. THE 20 ACTIONS HAVE BEEN INTEGRATED  
5 DIRECTLY INTO PLANNED BAY AREA'S IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. NEXT  
6 SLIDE PLEASE. ANOTHER REGIONAL PLAN THAT WE UPDATE EVERY FOUR  
7 YEARS IS THE REGIONAL COORDINATED PLAN FOCUSING ON THE NEED  
8 FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, LOW-INCOME, AND VETERANS.  
9 FOCUSING ON KEY ELEMENTS OF THE 2018 COORDINATING PLAN SUCH AS  
10 MOBILITY MANAGEMENT PARATRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS. THE UPDATED PLAN  
11 IS CURRENTLY UNDERWAY WHICH GIVES US PRIME OPPORTUNITY TO  
12 RESPOND TO THE BLUE RIBBON ACTIONS BY INCREASING OUTREACH AND  
13 FOCUSING ON TOPICS SUCH AS ADDITIONAL PARATRANSIT  
14 RECOMMENDATIONS. THE COORDINATED PLAN IS SCHEDULED FOR  
15 COMPLETION IN LATE 2022, ABOUT A YEAR FROM NOW. AND I BELIEVE  
16 NEXT SLIDE IS THE FINAL SLIDE. SO, HAPPILY, THE MOMENTUM OF  
17 THE TASK FORCE'S WORK CONTINUES, AND THE TASK FORCE'S WORK  
18 OVER THE PAST YEARS HAS LAID THE FOUNDATION FOR  
19 IMPLEMENTATION, INCLUDING PROCESS, RESOURCES COLLABORATION AND  
20 OPPORTUNITIES THAT WILL BE THE FOCUS OF TOMORROW'S  
21 PRESENTATION. AND THAT CONCLUDES MY OVERVIEW.

22  
23 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU. REBECCA LONG MANAGER OF GOVERNMENT  
24 RELATIONS. I'M GOING TO PICK UP WHERE MELANIE LEFT OFF. IF THE  
25 MTC TEAM COULD MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE. FOLLOWING THAT



October 27, 2021

1 PRESENTATION ON THE GOALS AND SCOPE OF THE TRANSFORMATION  
2 ACTION PLAN I AM AIMING TO CONNECT THE DOTS BETWEEN THE ACTION  
3 PLAN AND MTC'S EXISTING TRANSIT COORDINATION AUTHORITY AND  
4 PROVIDE AN EXAMPLE OF HOW THIS AUTHORITY COULD BE USED TO  
5 MAXIMIZE CHANCES OF SUCCESS. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT EACH OUTCOME  
6 AREAS OF THE PLAN HAS A DIRECT CONNECTION OUR EXISTING  
7 STATUTORY AUTHORITY. ON FARES AND PAYMENTS FOR INSTANCE MTC IS  
8 REQUIRED BY STATE LAW TO ADOPT RULES TO PROMOTE THE  
9 COORDINATION OF FARES ACROSS ALL OPERATORS. ON ACCESSIBILITY,  
10 WE'RE REQUIRED BY FEDERAL LAW TO DEVELOP A HUMAN SERVICES  
11 TRANSPORTATION PLAN WHICH MELANIE JUST DESCRIBED, AND ON  
12 FUNDING WE'RE RESPONSIBLE FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF STATE AND  
13 FEDERAL TRANSIT FUNDS. SO WE NATURALLY PLAY A CRITICAL ROLE IN  
14 ANY FUTURE CONVERSATION ABOUT A BALLOT MEASURE. SQUARELY  
15 WITHIN OUR SCOPE OF AUTHORITY EVEN A SUCCESS WILL HEAVILY  
16 DEPEND UPON STRONG PARTNER COLLABORATION AND IMPLEMENTATION BY  
17 OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDES. MTC'S ROLE AS THE REGIONAL ENTITY  
18 RESPONSIBLE FOR TRANSIT COORDINATION EVOLVED OVER MANY DECADES  
19 AND HAS CERTAINLY BEEN A TOPIC OF NUMEROUS STUDIES AND  
20 LEGISLATION. AS YOU CAN SEE HERE. NEXT SLIDE. SINCE WE WERE  
21 ESTABLISHED IN 1970 WE HAVE BEEN GIVEN INCREASED LEVELS OF  
22 RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE COORDINATION OF PUBLIC TRANSIT AND THE  
23 PRIORITIZATION OF PROJECTS. IN THE '80S AND '90S THE  
24 LEGISLATURE STRENGTHENED MTC' ROLE BY TYING DIRECT CONNECTION  
25 BETWEEN OUR TRANSIT COORDINATION AUTHORITY AND THE STATE



October 27, 2021

1 TRANSIT FUNDING SO THE LAW ACTUALLY REQUIRES US TO CONDITION  
2 OPERATOR ACCESS TO STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE OR STA OR SPCA IN  
3 COMPLIANCE WITH MTC TRANSIT COORDINATION RULE. IN 2003 THE  
4 CENTER AUTHORED LEGISLATION AUTHORIZING RETURN MEASURE TO  
5 REQUIRE A REGIONAL TRANSIT CONNECT PLAN. FUNDAMENTALLY THAT  
6 ARE TWO DIMENSIONING TO OUR TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY AUTHORITY  
7 DIRECTLY IN CONSULTATION WITH OPERATORS AND CONDITIONS FUNDS  
8 TO ENSURE COMPLIANCE AND INDIRECTLY AUTHORITY FUNDING OUR  
9 DISCRETION TO MAKE INVESTMENTS DIRECTLY TO IMPROVED TRANSIT  
10 CONNECTIVITY SUCH AS CLIPPER 511 SIGNAGE AND SO ON. OUR  
11 CURRENT TRANSIT COORDINATION RULES ARE INCLUDED IN RESOLUTION  
12 3866 THIS POLICY INCORPORATES THE VARIOUS ELEMENTS LISTED HERE  
13 INCLUDING CLIPPER, 511, REGIONAL TRANSIT INFORMATION AND SO O  
14 NEXT SLIDE. IT WAS LAST UPDATED IN 2015, AND THE RESOLUTION  
15 DETAILS THAT OPERATORS MUST COMPLY AS A CONDITION OF  
16 ELIGIBILITY FOR TRANSIT FUNDING ADMINISTERED BY MTC AND  
17 SPECIFIES A GENERAL RULE THAT MTC IS EXPECTED TO COVER THE  
18 REGIONAL COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH CONNECTIVITY PROGRAMS, AND  
19 OPERATORS ARE EXPECTED TO COVER THEIR OWN DIRECT COSTS. AND  
20 YOU CAN SEE, WE HAVE MENTIONED STA, THAT'S EXPLICITLY PROVIDED  
21 FOR IN THE STATUTE, AS FAR AS MTC CONDITIONING, BUT OTHER  
22 TRANSIT FUNDING SOURCES ARE ALSO CONNECTED TO RESOLUTION 3866  
23 COMPLIANCE. NEXT SLIDE. THE MOST SIGNIFICANT ACHIEVEMENT OF  
24 RESOLUTION 3866 WAS ACCELERATION OF CLIPPER AS A FARE PAYMENT  
25 METHOD. IN 2010 THE RESOLUTION WAS UPDATED TO INCORPORATE



October 27, 2021

1 DEADLINES FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES TO MIGRATE THEIR PAPER TICKETS  
2 OVER TO CLIPPER. THE DEADLINES WERE CHALLENGING, AND AS AN  
3 EXAMPLE WHEN BART BEGAN RESISTING MUTUALLY AGREED UPON  
4 DEADLINE MTC ISSUED A FORMAL WARNING LETTER REMINDING THE  
5 AGENCY OF ITS COMMITMENT AND THAT ULTIMATELY RESULTED IN A  
6 NEWLY NEGOTIATED TIMELINE WHILE HELPING TO KEEP MIGRATION ON  
7 AFFAIRS ON CLIPPER MOVING FORWARD YOU CAN SEE RAPID GROWTH IN  
8 CLIPPER TRANSACTIONS BY ENSUING FIRM DEADLINES THAT WERE  
9 ARTICULATED IN RESOLUTION 3866. WHILE RESOLUTION 3866 INCLUDES  
10 NUMEROUS REQUIREMENTS MTC ACTUALLY HAS MORE AUTHORITY THAN IS  
11 COVERED BY THE RESOLUTION AT THIS TIME. THE STATUTE'S  
12 AUTHORIZED MTC ABILITY TO SET RULES AND FARES SCHEDULES, BUT  
13 TODAY POLICIES HAVE REALLY ONLY DEALT WITH PAYMENT AS IN  
14 CLIPPER NOT FARE RATES. THERE IS NO POLICY RELATED TO SCHEDULE  
15 COORDINATION AND REVENUE SHARING PROVISIONS, THE RESOLUTION  
16 DOESN'T INCLUDE ANYTHING RELATED TO TRANSFERS COST SAVINGS OR  
17 SERVICE STATUTORY AUTHORITY. TO SUMMARIZE OVER ITS 50 YEAR  
18 HISTORY MTC HAS CERTAINLY DELIVERED MEANINGFUL CONNECTIVITY  
19 IMPROVEMENTS FOR RIDERS, CLIPPER, 511 AND HUB SIGNAGE. WE  
20 HAVEN'T FULLY UTILIZED OUR EXISTING AUTHORITY, ENFORCEMENT IS  
21 CHALLENGING AND ULTIMATELY IMPLEMENTATION OF TRANSIT  
22 COORDINATION DEPENDS ON STRONG PARTNERSHIP AND A COOPERATION  
23 OF OPERATORS. WITH CONSENSUS ACHIEVED AT BLUE RIBBON TASK  
24 FORCE THE COMMISSION HAS A REAL OPPORTUNITY ARGUABLY AN  
25 OBLIGATION TO UPDATE RESOLUTION 3866 TO HELP IMPLEMENT THE



October 27, 2021

1 RIDER FACING ENHANCEMENTS THAT WILL PROVIDE A SIMPLER MORE  
2 UNIFIED EQUITABLE TRANSIT EXPERIENCE COMING OUT OF THE  
3 PANDEMIC. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT ARE THE RISKS IF MTC DOESN'T UPDATE  
4 ITS TRANSIT COORDINATION POLICY WITHOUT CLEAR BENCHMARKS AND  
5 TIMELINES THERE IS ALSO GREATER RISK OF DELAY OR FAILURE AND  
6 IF THAT MEANS LACK OF PROGRESS ON THE CUSTOMER-FACING CHANGES  
7 NEEDED TO BRING BACK RIDERS, THEN THAT COULD SUPPRESS FARE  
8 REVENUE AND ERODE POLITICAL SUPPORT FOR NEW FUNDING FURTHER  
9 JEOPARDIZING TRANSIT SERVICE FOR THOSE WHO DEPEND UPON IT  
10 TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. THERE ARE MANY OPTIONS THE COMMISSION  
11 COULD CONSIDER ADDING TO RESOLUTION 3866 TO HELP MOVE FROM THE  
12 CONSENSUS ACHIEVED AT THE BLUE RIBBON TWO COMMITMENTS. FOR  
13 INSTANCE, ADDING DEADLINES FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF FARE  
14 INTEGRATION OPTIONS. NEW REQUIREMENTS TO HELP ENSURE TRANSIT  
15 OPERATORS STICK WITH THE ENHANCED SCHEDULE COORDINATION THAT  
16 THEY VOLUNTARILY BEGUN DURING COVID. AND SO ON. NEXT SLIDE.  
17 A KEY COMPONENT OF ANY UPDATE TO RESOLUTION 3866 IS  
18 CONSULTATION WITH THE OPERATORS. THE ENHANCED TRUST AND  
19 COMMUNICATION THAT'S OCCURRED BETWEEN MTC AND THE OPERATORS  
20 OVER THE LAST YEAR AND A HALF IS A GREAT FOUNDATION FOR THIS  
21 PROCESS TO BUILD UPON. THERE ARE THREE KEY STEPS. FIRST MTC  
22 STAFF DEVELOPS A PROPOSAL. SECOND, STAFF SEEKS INPUT FROM  
23 TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF, AND THEN GENERAL MANAGERS, AND, FINALLY,  
24 STAFF FORWARDS RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE MTC OPERATIONS COMMITTEE  
25 AND COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. AND THIS IS ALL SET FORTH IN THE



October 27, 2021

1 RESOLUTION. NEXT SLIDE. NOW THAT WE HAVE REVIEWED MTC'S  
2 AUTHORITY AND HOW IT'S BEEN INCORPORATED INTO RESOLUTION 3866  
3 TO DATE, I'M GOING TO BRIEFLY SPOT LIGHT AN EXAMPLE FROM THE  
4 FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY TO HELP SET THE STAGE  
5 FOR YOUR DISCUSSION. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS TWO-YEAR STUDY  
6 WHICH WE'LL HEAR MORE ABOUT TOMORROW DISCUSSES AND ASSESSES  
7 BENEFITS AND COST OF FARE INTEGRATION WITHIN THE REGION AND  
8 ORGANIZE THE CONCEPTS INTO FOUR TIERS OF INTEGRATION. WE'RE  
9 GOING TO LOOK AT ONE OF THOSE OPTIONS. TIER 2. HERE IS THE  
10 TIER TWO SCENARIO, FIRST FREE TRANSFERS FOR RIDERS GOING FROM  
11 BUS TO BUS FROM ONE BUS OPERATOR TRANSFERRING TO ANOTHER, BUS  
12 OPERATOR AND THEN REDUCED COST TRANSFER PROVIDER TRANSFERRING  
13 FROM LOCAL TRANSIT TO REGIONAL SYSTEMS BUS TO BART BUS TO  
14 FERRY BUS TO CALTRAIN IN THE HYPOTHETICAL SCENARIO MOST  
15 OPERATORS SUPPORT IMPLEMENTATION OF TIER TWO BUT ARE CONCERNED  
16 ABOUT REVENUE IMPACTS THEY WOULD LIKE TO SECURE FUNDING TO  
17 OFFSET IMPACTS A FEW DON'T CONSIDER IT A PRIORITY FOR THEIR  
18 RIDERS AT THE SAME TIME THERE IS URGENCY TOW DELIVER BENEFITS  
19 TO THE RIDERS AND NOT DELAY THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER  
20 SCHEDULE. THE STUDY OF THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION  
21 TASK FORCE ESTIMATED THAT THIS POLICY CHANGE WILL DELIVER HUGE  
22 BENEFITS AND THIS IS NOT A HYPOTHETICAL. THIS IS FROM THE  
23 STUDY. ABOUT 20,000 NEW DAILY RIDERS AND IT'S BENEFICIAL TO  
24 LOW-INCOME RIDERS AND THOSE WHO CAN LEAST AFFORD THE FULL  
25 FARES. NEXT SLIDE. HOW DOES THIS POLICY MEASURE UP AGAINST KEY



October 27, 2021

1 ELEMENTS NECESSARY FOR SUCCESSFUL IMPLEMENTATION? IT HAS  
2 STRONG POLITICAL AND PUBLIC SUPPORT TECHNICALLY FEASIBLE  
3 THROUGH CLIPPER AND CAN BE FUNDED IN THE NEAR-TERM. LONG-TERM,  
4 THE COST IS HARDER TO ESTIMATE. MTC HAS THE AUTHORITY TO  
5 ESTABLISH IT AS A NEW POLICY BUT IT WOULD ULTIMATELY REQUIRE  
6 ACTION BY INDIVIDUAL AGENCY BOARDS. NEXT SLIDE. SO HOW MIGHT  
7 MTC APPROACH A SITUATION LIKE THIS? THIS GRAPHIC REPRESENTS  
8 THE VARIED PROPOSE TO IMPLEMENTATION ON A SLIDING SCALE FROM  
9 INCENTIVE AT THE TOP, WHAT WE OFTEN CALLED CARROTS, TO  
10 MANDATES, OR OFTEN REFERRED TO AS STICKS. A CARROT MIGHT BE  
11 SUBSIDIZING IN WHOLE OR IN PART THE COST OF THE NEW POLICY, AT  
12 LEAST FOR AN INITIAL PERIOD. IN THE MIDDLE ARE SOME OTHER  
13 INCREMENTAL OPTIONS SUCH AS PROCEEDING WITH THE WILLING  
14 OPERATORS, OR DELAYING UNTIL EVERYONE AGREES. MANDATE WOULD  
15 INCLUDE CONDITIONING FUNDING ON COMPLIANCE. FOR EXAMPLE. I  
16 HOPE THIS EXAMPLE HAS HELPED ILLUSTRATE THE CHALLENGES AND  
17 OPPORTUNITIES MTC FACES AS WE EMBARK ON IMPLEMENTING THE  
18 ACTION PLAN AND I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO KATE TO  
19 FACILITATE THE DISCUSSION.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. THAT WAS A LOT OF INFORMATION. AND HOPEFULLY  
22 COMMISSIONERS GET YOUR QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS READY. WE  
23 ACTUALLY HAVE A JAM BOARD GOING ON IN THE BACKGROUND. AMBER IS  
24 DOING SOME STICKY NOTES. YOU'RE GOING TO SEE THOSE AT THE END.  
25 HOPEFULLY YOU WILL SEE YOUR COMMENTS REFLECTED THERE ON THE



October 27, 2021

1 VIRTUAL JAM BOARD. AND, SO, WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO NOW IS  
2 WE'RE GOING TO ACTUALLY START IN THE ROOM AND THEN WE'LL GO TO  
3 ZOOM WITH COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS AND IDEAS.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** KATE, I WANTED TO NOTE THAT THERE ARE SOME DISCUSSION  
6 QUESTIONS. I'M NOT SURE IF YOU WANTED TO KICKOFF WITH THOSE?

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I THINK THEY WERE IN THE PRESENTATION,  
9 AS WELL. BUT MAYBE WE CAN PUT THEM UP.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LET'S PUT THEM UP.

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I'LL MAKE SOME COMMENTS. I REALLY  
14 APPRECIATE THIS PRESENTATION, REBECCA, AND MELANIE, AND I WANT  
15 TO CHALLENGE ALL OF THE COMMISSIONERS TO THINK ABOUT THE  
16 QUESTIONS THAT ARE BEING PRESENTED. THIS IS WHAT'S DIFFERENT  
17 ABOUT THIS WORKSHOP. IT'S NOT A ONE WAY INFORMATION IT'S A  
18 REALLY CHALLENGING WAY TO LOOK AT THOSE QUESTIONS AND PROVIDE  
19 SOME THOUGHTS AND DISCUSSION AND COMMITMENTS WHEREOF WE WANT  
20 TO GO. I THINK IT'S AN INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY. BUT TO GET TO  
21 THAT OUTCOME, IT REQUIRES US, AS COMMISSIONERS, VOCALIZING  
22 THAT COMMITMENT TO THAT. SO I JUST WANT TO KICK IT OFF. IN  
23 TERMS OF THE RESOLUTION, YOU KNOW, I THINK ILLUSTRATING WHAT  
24 CLIPPER DID, I THINK THAT'S A GREAT EXAMPLE OF WHY IT NEEDS TO  
25 BE DONE AND HOW IT WORKED. BUT IN TERMS OF QUESTIONS OF, YOU



October 27, 2021

1 KNOW, THE PROCESS, SO REBECCA, IF WE WERE INTERESTED IN  
2 UPDATING THE RESOLUTION 3386, WHAT'S THE TIME FRAME FOR THAT?  
3 AND HOW DOES THAT WORK? YOU KIND OF HAVE THAT VISUAL WORK.  
4 TALKS ABOUT MTC PROPOSAL FEEDBACK, AND TO THE COMMITTEE.

5

6 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA, I THINK IT WOULD BE A  
7 MULTI-MONTH PROCESS GIVEN THAT THERE IS A SUGGESTION. OR THERE  
8 IS DIRECTION THAT STAFF WOULD FIRST BRING IT TO, LIKE, THE  
9 TECHNICAL STAFF, AT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, DISCUSS IT THERE,  
10 AND THEN MOVE ON TO A MEETING WITH THE GENERAL MANAGERS. SO I  
11 THINK IT'S SOMETHING THAT, YOU KNOW, ON THE FASTRAK, COULD BE  
12 DONE IN PROBABLY 2 TO 3 MONTHS.

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** OKAY. AND I JUST REALLY WANT TO FOCUS  
15 ON THE PROCESS. I THINK THAT'S THE RIGHT PROCESS WHERE THE  
16 OPERATORS ARE INVOLVED, THE GMP FEEDBACK, AND THEY WOULDN'T BE  
17 HERE IF THEY WEREN'T COMMITTED AND THAT'S WHAT I TAKE ABOUT  
18 THE CONSENSUS POINT BUT AS A POINT MADE EARLIER WE'RE HAVE TO  
19 PIVOT TO COMMITMENT IT'S A PROCESS I THINK THE BLUE RIBBON  
20 COMMITTEE FRAMED HOW WE WORK TOGETHER. BUT I'M REALLY  
21 INTERESTED IN FOCUSING ON THIS AND MAKING THESE UPDATES  
22 TOMORROW WE TALK ABOUT OUTCOMES BUT IT'S BASED ON US HAVING  
23 THE AUTHORITY TO BE ABLE TO EFFECTUATE THAT OUTCOME. I'M  
24 SUPPORTIVE OF MAKING SURE THAT WE MOVE FORWARD WITH THE WORK  
25 THAT WE NEED TO DO TO MAKE THOSE UPDATES. SO, THANK YOU.



October 27, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. I SEE COMMISSIONER PAPAN. DO I WANT TO JUMP  
3 IN HERE?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** YES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. TO ANSWER THE FIRST  
6 QUESTION THERE, SHOULD WE IMPLEMENT THE PLAN: I THINK THAT'S  
7 BOTH VITAL TO THE RESOLUTION AND HOW WE MOVE FORWARD HERE. I  
8 REPRESENT 20 CITIES IN MY JURISDICTION, AND HAVE SHARED THE  
9 PLAN WITH ELECTED PEOPLE. BUT I THINK IN ORDER FOR THE GENERAL  
10 MANAGERS TO HAVE SUPPORT, I THINK WE NEED TO GET THEIR BOARDS  
11 TO APPROVE THE PLAN AND THE ACTIONS THEREIN, AND THAT MAY BE  
12 TAKING A DOG AND PONY SHOW TO ALL THESE BOARDS AND REALLY  
13 EXPLAINING TO THEM THIS PROCESS, WHICH WE'RE GOING OVER TODAY  
14 AND WHY WE TOOK THIS BOLD MOVE. BECAUSE THE BENEFITS ARE SO  
15 TRANSFORMING. IF WE GET THE SUPPORT OF -- WE HAVE THAT FOR THE  
16 GENERAL MANAGERS, BUT FOR THEIR BOARDS AND WE EDUCATE THEM ON  
17 WHAT'S IN THIS PLAN, BECAUSE TOO MANY BOARD MEMBERS GET A PLAN  
18 AND THEY DON'T READ IT AND IT GOES BYE-BYE AND THEN WE ARE  
19 BACK TRACKING. THIS IS OUR OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY EDUCATE  
20 EVERYONE IN THE TRANSIT ARENA IN OUR AREA, ALL 27 DIFFERENT  
21 AGENCIES. AND THEN FROM THERE, I THINK IT REALLY SETS US UP TO  
22 GO FORWARD WITH WHAT I FEEL IS A REALLY NECESSARY UPDATING OF  
23 THIS RESOLUTION. SO, WE'LL GET EVERYBODY ON BOARD, AND MOVE  
24 AHEAD. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S A VERY, VERY IMPORTANT. WHEN I  
25 SENT THIS OUT TO SOME OF MY CONSTITUENCY, THEY WERE LIKE,



October 27, 2021

1 WHERE DID THIS COME FROM, WHAT DID YOU DO, AND HOW DID THIS  
2 HAPPEN? BUT YOUR GENERAL MANAGERS VOTED FOR THIS, AND THEY  
3 APPROVED T SO I THINK JUST TO GET EVERYBODY ON ONE PAGE,  
4 THAT'S GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT, REBECCA, AND EVERYBODY.  
5 THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION HERE. I THINK WE KNOW WHAT WE  
6 HAVE TO DO BUT I THINK THAT'S PROBABLY GOING TO BE THE BEST  
7 AVENUE TO GET THERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:**

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND WHOEVER POSTED THE  
12 QUESTIONS ON THE BOARD HERE JUST TO FOCUS THE DISCUSSION  
13 LOOKING AT THOUGHTS ON HOW WE SHOULD THE COMMISSION USE ITS  
14 AUTHORITY TO HELP IMPLEMENT THE ACTION PLAN SHOULD RESOLUTION  
15 3866 THAT REBECCA TALKED ABOUT THE UPDATED SUPPORT ACTION PLAN  
16 AND THIRDLY THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND COST OF ACHIEVING  
17 CUSTOMER FOCUSED POLICIES SUCH AS THE TIER TWO PROPOSAL. AND I  
18 SEE COMMISSIONER SPERING.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO AGREE WITH THE CHAIR'S  
21 COMMENCE --

22

23 **SPEAKER:** CALTRANS --

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I THINK THIS IS FUNDAMENTAL --



October 27, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** MOVE YOUR MIC TO YOUR -- THERE YOU GO. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO AGREE WITH THE CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS  
5 IT'S REVISING THIS RESOLUTION IT'S FUNDAMENTAL TO THE  
6 CONSENSUS OVER THE LAST 18 MONTHS AND REALLY TO START  
7 IMPLEMENTING THIS AND PUT THE RECOGNITION ON IT THAT IT'S  
8 SOMETHING THAT WE'RE GOING TO DO WITHOUT REVISING THIS  
9 RESOLUTION I DON'T KNOW HOW WE MOVE FORWARD THIS AGENDA FOR  
10 THIS TRANSFORMATIONAL TRANSIT PLAN. SO FOR ME I THINK IT'S  
11 IMPERATIVE THAT WE REVISE THE RESOLUTION. IT NEEDS TO BE  
12 CONSISTENT WITH THE CONSENSUS THAT WE BUILT, FOR SURE, AND  
13 THEN, YOU KNOW, OUR MEETING WITH THE OPERATORS, THAT REALLY  
14 STARTS TO ACCELERATE THE DISCUSSION ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION AND  
15 HOW WE DELIVER THESE PROJECTS. AND SO I, YOU KNOW, FOR ME IT  
16 WOULD BE YES WE NEED TO UPDATE THE RESOLUTION. THE COMMISSION,  
17 I THINK, NEEDS TO STEP FORWARD AND START USING ITS AUTHORITY  
18 TO IMPLEMENT THIS PLAN. BECAUSE THE DIRECTION IS GOING TO COME  
19 FROM THIS COMMISSION. IT'S NOT GOING TO COME FROM ANYWHERE  
20 ELSE, IN COOPERATION WITH THE OPERATORS. AND I THINK IT'S  
21 REASONABLE TO EXPECT THEIR COOPERATION. BECAUSE I THINK THEY  
22 REALIZE THEY'RE NOT IN THIS BY THEMSELVES THAT IT'S GOING TO  
23 TAKE THIS COORDINATED REGIONAL EFFORT TO START DELIVERING  
24 THESE REGIONAL PROJECTS AND ACROSS MANY JURISDICTIONAL LINES.

25



October 27, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. ANY MORE COMMENTS IN THE  
2 ROOM? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND THEN WE'LL GO TO THE ROOM.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND THIS MAY ACTUALLY BE A QUESTION  
5 FOR THE CHAIR. AND THE -- AND COMMISSIONER SPERING. WHAT I  
6 WOULD BE INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING IS IF THERE IS CONSENSUS,  
7 WHAT'S THE NEED FOR THE AUTHORITY?

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WELL IF YOU DON'T HAVE THE AUTHORITY, HOW DO  
10 YOU IMPLEMENT THE PLAN? IT'S SO FRAGMENTED NOW, AND THE REASON  
11 WE HAVEN'T BEEN -- A LOT OF THESE INITIATIVES AREN'T NEW. WE  
12 HAVE BEEN WORKING ON A LOT OF THESE INITIATIVES FOR TEN YEARS  
13 AND PART OF THIS IS BECAUSE NOBODY'S HAD THE AUTHORITY TO  
14 IMPLEMENT AND MOVE THIS AGENDA: AND LET'S BE HONEST, YOU'RE  
15 GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT THE INVESTMENT YOU'RE GOING TO BE  
16 MAKING IN THIS PRIORITY AND MTC IS GOING TO SET THAT  
17 INVESTMENT POLICY. AND THE COMMISSION IS GOING TO LOOK AT  
18 THOSE AND THAT'S WHY I EMPHASIZE IT'S CONSENSUS ON THE PLAN  
19 THAT WE HAVE APPROVED. EVERYBODY AGREES THESE ARE VERY  
20 IMPORTANT ISSUES. YOU KNOW, THE WAYFINDING, THE BUS  
21 PRIORITIES, AND FARE INTEGRATION. THAT LIST GOES ON, AND THERE  
22 HAS TO BE CLEAR DIRECTIONS, AND I THINK IT COMES FROM THIS  
23 COMMISSION AND THIS RESOLUTION. SOLIDIFIES THIS, IT SAYS YES  
24 THIS IS IMPORTANT TO US AND WE'RE GOING TO EXERCISE OUR



October 27, 2021

1 AUTHORITY TO HELP MAKE THIS HAPPEN IN COOPERATION WITH  
2 OPERATORS.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THIS IS SHORT-TERM AND HONG TERM  
5 FINDING CONSENSUS IS GREAT BUT WE NEED TO SUSTAIN. PEOPLE COME  
6 AND GO BUT THIS IS POLICY THAT'S DRIVING US TO THE FUTURE THAT  
7 WE WANT TO SEE. FOUNDATIONALLY YOU HAVE TO MAKE THIS CHANGE  
8 AND WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO DRIVE TO THE CONSENSUS BUT I  
9 THINK IF WE DON'T DO IT WE'RE ALWAYS SUBJECT TO PEOPLE  
10 CHANGING AND POLICY CHANGING, POTENTIALLY. SO, AGAIN, I THINK  
11 IT'S A MOMENT IN TIME OF US, THE COMMISSIONERS, AND THIS IS  
12 WHERE WE'RE GOING, IN CREATING THE PLATFORM TO SUSTAIN IT OVER  
13 TIME.

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ONE THING I WOULD SAY IS I THINK AS ALL  
16 PROCESSES ARE ITERATIVE, THAT I APPRECIATE THE POINTS THAT  
17 BOTH OF YOU HAVE RAISED I THINK THAT -- AND I DON'T WANT TO  
18 SPEAK FOR ANYBODY BUT MYSELF TO SAY THAT I HAVE NOT FELT AS  
19 MUCH CONSENSUS AS I HAVE FELT THAT WE'RE IN A TOUGH SITUATION  
20 AND WE NEED TO DO SOMETHING AND I'M NOT SURE IF ALL THE THINGS  
21 ARE THE RIGHT THINGS BUT I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT THERE IS A  
22 STAKE IN THE GROUND AND A DIRECTION. THE REASON I RAISE THE  
23 ISSUE AROUND THE AUTHORITY IN THE CONSENSUS IS THAT, AND THE  
24 ISSUE ABOUT THIS BEING ITERATIVE IS THAT THERE ARE KIND OF  
25 TWO, IN MY MIND, TWO BIG OUTSTANDING ISSUES THAT ARE IN THE



October 27, 2021

1 BACK -- I GUESS, TO BE BLUNT, AS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT  
2 POTENTIALLY DOING SOMETHING ON A BALLOT, AND I KNOW THAT WILL  
3 BE DISCUSSED TOMORROW, WHAT I HAVE HAD A HARD TIME  
4 UNDERSTANDING IS HOW THIS ALIGNS WITH THE KIND OF FOCUS THE  
5 OTHER EYE WE HAVE HAD ON HOUSING, AND HOW ALL OF THAT ALIGNS  
6 TO THE -- TO FUND DEVELOPMENT, AND THEN, FRANKLY THE  
7 AVAILABILITY OF FUNDS WHICH WE ALWAYS ARGUE ABOUT, WHICH ASK  
8 MONEY. SO I'M TRYING TO BETTER UNDERSTAND IF THE AUTHORITY --  
9 IF THE AUTHORITY IS REALLY FOUNDATIONAL IN TERMS OF WHERE WE  
10 ARE RIGHT NOW IN TERMS OF OUR MUTUAL RELATIONSHIPS, OR IF IT'S  
11 A LITTLE AHEAD OF THE -- AHEAD OF COURSE. I DO NOT HAVE AN  
12 OPINION ABOUT IT, I GENUINELY DON'T RIGHT NOW THIS, IS A VERY  
13 SINCERE QUESTION ON MY PART.

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND THEN I'M  
16 JUMPING IN, KATE --

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THERE'S A COUPLE OF PEOPLE ON ROOM.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** WE HAVE HAD THE EXISTENCE OF THIS RESOLUTION IN  
21 THE PAST BUT WE HAVEN'T HAD COMPLIANCE WITH IT, IT'S  
22 OPPRESSIVE, COORDINATED SCHEDULE, CALTRAIN IS BART ALL OF A  
23 SUDDEN COVID HAPPENS AND WE'RE DOING IT T AND THAT DOESN'T  
24 APPLY TO THE RESOLUTION SO WE WANT TO GO ON ALL THESE  
25 DIFFERENT LEVELS IS WE PUT EFFORT INTO MAKING THIS RESOLUTION



October 27, 2021

1 AS STRONG AS POSSIBLE -- -- AND STAND BEHIND IT, IF YOU DO NOT  
2 DO THIS YOU'RE NOT GOING TO GET THAT FUNDING BECAUSE WE  
3 BELIEVE IN THE GOAL, LET'S GET PEOPLE ON TRANSIT SO WE CAN  
4 BUILD THE HOUSING MOVE PEOPLE FROM HERE AND THERE. SO MY  
5 EXPERIENCE WITH THIS RESOLUTION, IT DEFINITELY NEEDS TO BE  
6 UPDATED AND STRENGTHENED. THANK YOU.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** AMBER, DID YOU WANT TO CALL ON PEOPLE ON THE ZOOM?

9

10 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** YEAH. THANKS KATE. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, AND  
11 THEN MAYOR SCHAFF?

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MY COMPUTER  
14 CONKED OUT. WHICH IS ONE OF THE REASONS WE SHOULD ATTEND THESE  
15 MEETINGS BY PHONE. IN LISTENING TO THIS PRESENTATION AND  
16 GRAPPLING WITH THIS, I THINK WHAT, SORT OF, STAYS WITH ME IS  
17 HOW THE LEGISLATURE, OVER AND OVER AGAIN, HAS ASKED MTC TO DO  
18 THIS. THEY HAVE ASKED MTC TO PLAY THIS REGIONAL ROLE IN  
19 COORDINATION AND COLLABORATION WITH THE OPERATORS. I SEE THIS  
20 LESS AS AN OPPORTUNITY AND MORE AS A RESPONSIBILITY THAT WE  
21 HAVE. AND THAT WE ARE BEING GIVEN AND THAT WE REALLY HAVE TO  
22 FULFILL TO KIND OF CREATE THIS INTEGRATED TRANSIT NETWORK  
23 AROUND THE REGION. AND I THINK THE WORK THAT THE COMMISSIONER  
24 SPERING HAS LED US ON, AND THE OPERATORS HAVE PARTICIPATED IN,  
25 AS WELL AS WITH ALL THE OTHER STAKEHOLDERS THROUGHOUT BLUE



October 27, 2021

1 RIBBON PROCESS HAS REALLY KIND OF PROVIDED THAT FOUNDATION FOR  
2 US TO LIVE UP TO THAT RESPONSIBILITY THAT WE HAVE TO CREATE  
3 THIS INTEGRATED REGIONAL NETWORK. AND SO -- AND AS CHAIR  
4 PEDROZA SAID, IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT DOING IT NOW AND KIND OF  
5 FINDING A CONSENSUS NOW THAT MAY BE SHORT-LIVED OR MAY NOT BE,  
6 IT'S ABOUT REALLY MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE LIVING UP TO OUR  
7 RESPONSIBILITY, SORT OF, IN THE LONG RUN. AND SO I'M VERY  
8 SUPPORTIVE OF UPDATING RESOLUTION 30 -- I'M GOING TO GET THE  
9 NUMBER WRONG -- ABOUT UPDATING THAT RESOLUTION I'M SURE I'M  
10 GOING TO REMEMBER THE NUMBER AT SOME POINT BECAUSE WE'RE GOING  
11 TO BE TALKING ABOUT IT FOR A WHILE PROBABLY BUT I'M IN FAVOR  
12 OF UPDATING THAT RESOLUTION AND CONTINUING TO DO IT  
13 COLLABORATIVELY WITH OPERATORS AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS AND  
14 REALLY, SORT OF, FULFILLING OUR RESPONSIBILITY ON THIS FRONT  
15 TO THE REGION AND TO TRANSIT RIDERS AROUND THE REGION.

16

17 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR. MAYOR SCHAFF?

18

19 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR ORGANIZING THIS. THIS  
20 HAS BEEN INTERESTING. I THINK THE ANSWER TO THE THREE  
21 QUESTIONS IS, YES, YES, YES. BUT I WANT TO THROW OUT -- AND  
22 FORGIVE ME, IF THIS IS NOT APPROPRIATE, YOU CAN IGNORE IT --  
23 BUT I WANT TO THROW OUT SOMETHING THAT I THINK IS A  
24 FUNDAMENTAL OR FOUNDATIONAL QUESTION THAT I HAVE NOT SEEN  
25 ANSWERED. AND, YOU KNOW, I CONTINUE TO THINK THAT WE HAVE DONE



October 27, 2021

1 THE BAY AREA A DISSERVICE FOR ALL OF THESE YEARS BY HAVING MTC  
2 AND ABAG SEPARATED, AND I REALLY WANT TO COMMEND, I THINK,  
3 CHAIR CORTESE, NOW, START CORTESE, I THINK LED THE EFFORT TO  
4 AT LEAST INTEGRATE THE STAFF AND START MOVING US TOGETHER. BUT  
5 HAS ANYBODY DONE A THOROUGH STUDY TO ASK PEOPLE WHY THEY  
6 COMMUTE SO LONG? AND I, FOR ONE, DO NOT WANT TO BE COMPLICIT  
7 IN WHAT I THINK IS AN INHUMANE SITUATION THAT WE HAVE SETUP. I  
8 DON'T WANT TO FIX TRANSIT. I WANT TO FIX HOW PEOPLE LIVE AND  
9 WORK. AND IF AN OVERWHELMING NUMBER OF PEOPLE ARE HAVING THESE  
10 INHUMANE COMMUTES, AND WOULD CHOOSE TO LIVE CLOSER TO THEIR  
11 WORK IF THEY COULD AFFORD HOUSING CLOSE TO THEIR WORK, AND  
12 THEY WOULDN'T NEED TO USE COMMUTER RAIL OR TO -- I MEAN, WE  
13 JUST SAW THOSE -- I JUST SAW THE NEW CONGESTION PATTERNS ON  
14 THE FREEWAYS, SPEAKS VOLUMES SHOWS PEOPLE ARE LIVING FARTHER  
15 AND FARTHER AWAY FROM JOB CENTERS. SO I REALLY BELIEVE, BEFORE  
16 WE DO ANYTHING, PARTICULARLY BEFORE WE GO OUT AND ASK VOTERS  
17 TO RAISE THEIR TAXES TO PAY MORE FOR OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT  
18 SYSTEMS, WE NEED TO FIND OUT WHETHER OR NOT PEOPLE WOULD HAVE  
19 SHORTER COMMUTES IF THEY COULD AFFORD TO LIVE CLOSER TO THEIR  
20 WORK, AND IF BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEAR JOBS MIGHT NOT  
21 BE A BETTER INVESTMENT OF THE PUBLIC DOLLAR THAN TO BUILT OUT  
22 COMMUTER RAIL SYSTEMS. I WANT TO THROW THAT OUT AS A  
23 FOUNDATIONAL QUESTION AND ANALYSIS THEY HAVE NEVER SEEN DONE.  
24 AND FORGIVE ME IF I HAVE MISSED IT. BUT AS FAR AS THE THREE  
25 QUESTIONS AROUND THE COORDINATION, ABSOLUTELY. I AGREE WITH



October 27, 2021

1 WHAT NICK SAID. IT'S NOT JUST A GOOD IDEA. IT'S OUR  
2 RESPONSIBILITY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **SPEAKER:**

5

6 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANK YOU MAYOR SCHAFF. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ,  
7 DID YOU WANT TO JUMP BACK IN? CHAIR PEDROZA.

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I THINK WE HAVE COMMISSIONER.

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI THANK YOU. I FELT LIKE YOU  
12 WERE IGNORING ME. IN ANY CASE, THREE QUESTIONS, I WENT BACK TO  
13 SLIDE SEVEN TALKING ABOUT 3866, SAYING THAT IT WAS LAST  
14 UPDATED IN 2015. SO IT IS OUR RESOLUTION THAT, I THINK,  
15 CERTAINLY NEEDS TO BE UPDATED, ESPECIALLY BECAUSE WHAT I'M  
16 READING ON THIS SLIDE, BECAUSE ONE OF THE DISCUSSION QUESTIONS  
17 WAS, SHOULD THE LOCAL OPERATORS SHARE IN THE COST. AND FROM  
18 WHAT I'M READING, THAT WAS OF THE ORIGINAL INTENT. IT SAYS  
19 THAT MTC COVERS REGIONAL COST WHILE THE REGIONAL OPERATORS ARE  
20 EXPECTED TO COVER THE COST TO IMPLEMENT THEIR OWN COORDINATION  
21 ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES. SO, I THINK TO COMMISSIONER  
22 JOSEFOWITZ'S POINT, THAT IT'S REQUIRED THAT WHAT WE'RE DOING  
23 SHOULD WE DO IT OR NOT IT'S WHAT WAS REQUIRED INITIALLY. AND  
24 ON COMMISSIONER SCHAFF'S COMMENCE, I DO AGREE WE SHOULD TRY TO  
25 GET MORE JOBS BY HOUSING, BUT THE REALITY IS, OUR RHNA NUMBERS



October 27, 2021

1 ARE SHOWING THAT THIS REGION IS TO BE DENSIFIED EVEN MORE THAN  
2 IT IS WITH THE HOUSING NUMBERS THAT WE HAVE. SO WE'RE GOING TO  
3 NEED, IN MY OPINION, MORE AND BETTER PUBLIC TRANSIT ANYWAY,  
4 JUST BECAUSE OF THE -- WE CAN'T BLOW THE PLACE UP AND START  
5 OVER AGAIN. PEOPLE AREN'T MAKING DECISION IN ALL CASES ABOUT  
6 HOW CLOSE CAN I GET TO WORK, THEY'RE SAYING WHAT DO I WANT FOR  
7 QUALITY OF LIFE, AND IN ALAMEDA CAN'T THE PEOPLE THAT CHOOSE  
8 TO LIVE OUT IN DUBLIN, PLEASANTON, AND LIVERMORE, WHAT HAVE  
9 YOU, WHERE IT'S STILL MORE OPEN SPACE, IF YOU WILL, THEY'RE  
10 DOING THAT INTENTIONALLY, BUT IF THEIR JOB IS IN SAN FRANCISCO  
11 IT'S STILL BETTER FOR THEIR QUALITY OF LIFE TO USE PUBLIC  
12 TRANSIT INSTEAD OF BEING STUCK ON THE ROADWAY, AND I CAN  
13 ATTEST TO THAT BECAUSE I CHOSE TO DRIVE TO SAN FRANCISCO THIS  
14 MORNING FROM UNION CITY, AND CROSSING THAT BAY BRIDGE IS NUTS.  
15 SO, IN ANY CASE, YES, YES, AND YES FOR ME, FOR THOSE  
16 DISCUSSION ITEMS.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AMBER, DO WE HAVE ANY COMMISSIONERS. I  
19 DON'T SEE ANYONE ELSE IN THE ROOM WITH THEIR HOPEFULLY I'M NOT  
20 MISSING SOMEONE I DON'T THINK.

21

22 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** NO RAISED HANDS.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. SO WE HAVE BEEN -- AS I MENTIONED WE HAVE BEEN  
25 DOING A JAM BOARD, KIND OF, IN THE BACKGROUND. WE CAN SHARE



October 27, 2021

1 THAT NOW. ALSO WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT HERE, AND THEN, HOW  
2 MANY, KIMBERLY, HOW MANY DO WE HAVE IN THE ROOM, ZOOM.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE THREE AT THE MOMENT.

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MAYBE WE CAN DO THE PUBLIC COMMENT,  
7 AND THEN FOR ANY COMMISSIONER THAT IS STILL THINKING ABOUT IT  
8 WE'LL DO ONE LAST ROUND AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** SOUNDS GREAT. OKAY. SO, AGAIN, I HAVE IAN GRIFFITHS  
11 IN THE ROOM, BUT DO YOU WANT START ON ZOOM, KIMBERLY?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. TWO MINUTES. THE FIRST SPEAKER IS  
14 VEDA FLOREZ, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON. WE ALL AGREE THAT THE  
17 FOUNDATIONAL WORK AND THE RESOLUTION IS IMPORTANT. AND WE  
18 AGREE ON THE NEED. AND AS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ADVISORY  
19 COUNCIL AND CHAIR OF THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE, I  
20 HEAR FROM THE COMMUNITY LEADERSHIP, IN MY COMMUNITY, THAT THEY  
21 DON'T KNOW DETAILS OF THE WORK FROM MTC. AND I AGREE WITH THE  
22 COMMISSIONER WHO SAID THAT WE NEED TO REACH OUT TO COMMUNITY  
23 LEADERSHIP. LOCAL COMMUNITY LEADERSHIP NEEDS TO FULLY  
24 UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF INTEGRATED REGIONAL NETWORKS, IS  
25 COORDINATED SCHEDULES. STAFF VISITS TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS



October 27, 2021

1 KEEP EVERYONE IN THE LOOP AS WELL AS CONTINUE TO SUPPORT MTC  
2 OR CREATE OUR VALUE-ADD. THAT BEING SAID, CONTINUED INPUT FROM  
3 THE GENERAL COMMUNITY IS ALSO NEEDED ON A GREATER SCALE. YOU  
4 KNOW? WE MUST HAVE THE GREATER INPUT FROM THE COMMUNITY, NOT  
5 ONLY TO VOTE ON A REGIONAL MEASURE, BUT IT'S ALSO IMPORTANT TO  
6 HAVE THE GREATER OPPORTUNITY FOR MTC TO LISTEN TO THE NEEDS OF  
7 THE COMMUNITY. IS THAT'S ONE THING THAT I DIDN'T SEE AS THE  
8 FIVE TOPICS FOR THE TASK FORCE, IS WE NEED TO HAVE THAT  
9 CONTINUED GREATER LISTENING ABILITY FOR THE NEEDS OF THE  
10 RIDERS OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND I HOPE TO CONTINUE TO  
11 PARTICIPATE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** KIM, DO YOU WANT CALL ON THE NEXT PERSON?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. SIMON TAN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. YES, MY NAME IS SIMON. THANK YOU ALL FOR HAVING  
18 THIS WORKSHOP AND ALLOWING US TO LISTEN IN. SO, JUST TO ADD AN  
19 ANECDOTAL STORY ABOUT, LIKE, WHY REGIONAL -- BETTER REGIONAL  
20 TRANSPORTATION WOULD BE BETTER FOR ME I'M A STUDENT IN SAN  
21 JOSE STATE BUT I SPLIT MY TIME BETWEEN SAN FRANCISCO AND  
22 MILPITAS I ACTUALLY GO AROUND THE BAY A LOT SO THERE IS A LOT  
23 OF THINGS I DO FOR SCHOOL AND WORK THAT MAKE ME NEED TO TRAVEL  
24 AROUND THE BAY. AND SAN JOSE STATE ACTUALLY OFFERS A TRANSIT  
25 PASS FOR STUDENTS BUT THE TRANSIT PASS IS ONLY FOR VTA WHICH



October 27, 2021

1 ISN'T THAT USEFUL FOR ME AS SOMEONE WHO WOULD NEED AT LEAST  
2 SFMTA, BART, OR CALTRAIN TO MAKE IT USEABLE AND I ALWAYS END  
3 UP DRIVING A CAR EVERYWHERE INSTEAD AND EXPENSE IS STRESSFUL  
4 AND UNPREDICTABLE AND I GAME CHANGER FOR SOMEONE LIKE ME, WHO  
5 LIVE OUT IN VALLEJO. IT'S A CONCERN AND I'M HOPING THAT MTC  
6 WILL FIND A WAY OR WILL BASICALLY FUNNEL RESOURCES IN THE  
7 RIGHT DIRECTION TO MAKE THESE PILOTS HAPPEN, AT LEAST THE  
8 FIRST TWO PILOTS IN THE INTEGRATION STUDY RECOMMENDATIONS. SO,  
9 THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS VAUGHN.  
12 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. TWO ISSUES THAT CAME UP, ONE ABOUT THE  
15 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. YOUR PRESENTATION MADE  
16 IT SOUND LIKE YOU'RE DOING LOTS OF THINGS, BUT I THINK TO THE  
17 GENERAL PUBLIC, ALL YOU'RE DOING IS SPENDING LOTS OF MONEY,  
18 AND TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION HAS "IMPROVED SOME" BUT THE  
19 REALITY IS THERE IS MORE TRAFFIC CONGESTION AND MORE CO2  
20 EMISSIONS GOING ON NOW THAN 1970 OR IN 2000 OR 2010, NOTHING  
21 TO DO WITH COVID. IT'S BEEN INCREASING REGARDLESS OF HOW MUCH  
22 MONEY YOU'RE SPENDING. COULD BE AN INDICATION YOU'RE NOT  
23 SPENDING THE MONEY PROPERLY. 27 AGENCIES; WE HAVE 50 STATES  
24 THEY DON'T WORK TOGETHER. THERE IS NO REASON TO EXPECT THAT 27  
25 DIFFERENT AGENCIES ARE GOING TO WORK TOGETHER EXCEPT WHEN



October 27, 2021

1 THEY'RE UNDER THE GUN WHICH WAS BROUGHT UP BY DIRECTOR CHAVEZ.  
2 THEY'RE WORKING TOGETHER BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO NOT BECAUSE THEY  
3 LIKE TO OR WANT TO THE FACT OF EXISTENCE THAT THEY WANT TO NOT  
4 BECAUSE THAT I WANT TO, NOT BECAUSE IT'S THE BEST THING TO DO.  
5 WEALTHY PEOPLE DON'T LIVE DOWNTOWN FOR THE MOST PART. THE  
6 WEALTHY BANKER USED TO LIVE UP IN CONNECTICUT AND LONG ISLAND.  
7 THEY HAVE TRAIN SERVICE AND ARE 85 MILES AWAY FROM AND WITH  
8 US, GROWING UP IN SILICON VALLEY, BEFORE IT WAS SILICON  
9 VALLEY. WEALTHY PEOPLE DON'T LIVE TOGETHER. TRANSIT RIDERS,  
10 LESS THAN 10% OF PEOPLE THAT TRAVEL AROUND THE BAY AREA, JUST  
11 LIKE THE STUDENT, HE TRAVELS ALL OVER AND THERE IS NO  
12 COORDINATED TRANSIT FOR HIM TO GET BACK AND FORTH AND THAT'S  
13 THE SAME FOR EVERYBODY ELSE THE HOUSING THEY TALK ABOUT THE  
14 RHNA NUMBERS ON THE NEWS YESTERDAY THERE IS 100,000 VACANT  
15 HOUSES IN THE BAY AREA. 100,000. THEY'RE NOT FOR RENT, THEY'RE  
16 NOT FOR SALE, THEY'RE NOT AVAILABLE FOR SOMEBODY TO LIVE N  
17 THAT'S A PROBLEM. THE RHNA NUMBERS DON'T EVEN NOTICE THAT.  
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS MYRA  
21 PELAFIO. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU EVERYONE. I AM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR  
24 LUNA LATINOS UNITED FOR A NEW AMERICA. WE SEE LITTLE VALUE IN  
25 FARE INTEGRATION SINCE THERE A LOT OF DIFFERENT BARRIERS FOR



October 27, 2021

1 LATINOS LIVING IN COMMUNITIES EAST SIDE OF SAN JOSE I HEARD  
2 THROUGH THE PANDEMIC PEOPLE WERE NOT ABLE TO GET A DAY PASS  
3 AND WOULD TAKE MULTIPLE TRANSIT TO GET TO THEIR DESTINATION  
4 HAVING FARE INTEGRATION WOULD BE ACCEPTABLE FOR COMMUNITY  
5 MEMBERS ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE WHO DON'T HAVE ACCESS TO  
6 TECHNOLOGY THAT WOULD ALLOW THEM TO BUY FARE PASSES. I FULLY  
7 SUPPORT THIS FARE INTEGRATION. THANK YOU. AND I YIELD MY TIME.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED  
10 HANDS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. ANY COMMISSIONERS IN THE  
13 ROOM?

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** LET'S FINISH UP WITH PUBLIC COMMENT IN  
16 THE ROOM. THEN WE'LL GO BACK TO COMMISSIONERS.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. YEAH. IAN.

19

20 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU. IAN GRIFFITHS WITH SEAMLESS BAY  
21 AREA. YOU KNOW, I ECHO THE COMMENTS MADE FROM COMMISSIONER  
22 JOSEFOWITZ, LIKE, THE SLIDES SHOWING ALL OF THE DIFFERENT  
23 TIMES THROUGHOUT SINCE THE FORMATION OF MTC WHERE THE  
24 LEGISLATOR HAS ACTED TO ASK MTC DIRECTED MTC TO USE ITS  
25 AUTHORITY TO COORDINATE TRANSIT THAT'S WHAT THE LEGISLATE OUR



October 27, 2021

1 WANTS THE ROLE THAT MTC SHOULD PLAY, IF YOU ASK A MEMBER OF  
2 THE PUBLIC THAT I THINK THAT'S WHAT MTC IS HERE TO DO. SO  
3 ABSOLUTELY, THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN HAVE BEEN DISCUSSED  
4 AT LENGTH THERE IS CONSENSUS AROUND THEM AND THE RESOLUTION  
5 SHOULD ABSOLUTELY BE UPDATED MTC SHOULD USE ITS MANDATE THERE  
6 SHOULD BE FUNDING TO OFFSET COST FOR AGENCIES ABSOLUTELY BUT  
7 CLIPPER ADOPTION SHOWED HOW IMPORTANT A MANDATE IS AND  
8 DEADLINES TO ACTUALLY MAKE THESE THINGS HAPPEN. OVER THE LONG-  
9 TERM THOUGH, WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT HOW A NETWORK MANAGER  
10 COULD MAKE THIS PROCESS SIMPLER, AND THERE IS A PROBLEM WITH  
11 MTC'S LEGITIMACY AND IMPLEMENTING PROGRAMS LIKE THIS IS THE  
12 FACT THAT YOU HAVE SEPARATE AGENCY BOARDS AND MTC COMMISSION  
13 AND THERE ISN'T A CLEAN RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THEM AND  
14 REPRESENTATION INSTRUCT AND THERE'S GOING TO BE A PROBLEM  
15 IMPLEMENTING THESE MANDATES UNTIL WE RESOLVE THIS CORE  
16 GOVERNANCE ISSUE, SO LONG-TERM PROJECTS, LET'S USE LONG-TERM  
17 NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE APPROPRIATELY FOR LONG-TERM  
18 SUCCESS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** AMBER, IF YOU DON'T MIND SHARING, YOU CAN KIND OF --  
21 HOPEFULLY YOU SAW MOST OF YOUR COMMENTS REFLECTED HERE IN A  
22 SECOND ON THE STICKY NOTES. VIRTUAL STICKY NOTES.

23

24 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** SURE THING. THANKS KATE.

25



October 27, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** GO AHEAD.

2

3 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** I HEARD PRETTY STRONG CONSENSUS IN THE YES,  
4 YES, YES, AND YES TO THE QUESTION HOW SHOULD THE COMMISSION  
5 USE ITS AUTHORITY TO IMPLEMENT THE ACTION PLAN AND RESOLUTION  
6 SHOULD BE UPDATED, AND FLECTION ON THE ACTION PLAN AND TRANSIT  
7 OPERATORS AND SHARE OF COST ACHIEVING CUSTOMER FOCUSED POLICY  
8 CONVERSATION ABOUT WHY ALIGN WITH A FOCUS ON HOUSING  
9 IMPORTANCE OF HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT. DID THAT ANSWER YOUR  
10 QUESTION?

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THIS IS ALFREDO. I WANT TO THANK  
13 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSIONERS. IT'S TRANSITIONING  
14 FROM CONSENSUS TO COMMITMENT THAT'S WHAT I HEARD TODAY AND  
15 THAT'S VERY GRATIFYING. IN TERMS OF REVENUE THERE HAS BEEN  
16 DISCUSSIONS ABOUT LOOKING AT A SPACE WHERE WE CAN TALK ABOUT A  
17 REGIONAL MEASURE THAT CREATES NEW REVENUE AND I SHARED THAT  
18 EARLIER WE'RE GOING TO CREATE A SPACE AND OPPORTUNITY TO TALK  
19 ABOUT THAT. WE HAVE PUT THAT ON THE TABLE THAT'S SEPARATE AND  
20 APART FROM THE CONVERSATION AT THIS MOMENT IN TIME. I THINK  
21 THE WORDING OF COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IS GREAT IT'S NOT AN  
22 OPPORTUNITY IT'S A RESPONSIBILITY. IT HITS HOME AND RESONATES.  
23 I THINK THE COMMENT ABOUT HOUSING MAYOR SCHAFF MADE PLANNED  
24 BAY AREA WHICH WE ADOPTED EPITOMIZES THE INTERCONNECTEDNESS OF  
25 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION AND JOBS BEING CREATED TO TRY TO



October 27, 2021

1 GRAPPLE WITH THE 35 STRATEGIES IT'S COMMITMENT TO WORK  
2 ENSURING WE HAVE THE AUTHORITY ENSURING PARTNERS LIKE ABAG  
3 LOOKING AT ENCOURAGING HOUSING BEING BUILT AND LOOKING AT JOBS  
4 BEING CREATED. I KNOW THE MAYOR OF ABAG IS COMMITTED TO THIS  
5 MANIFESTED BY HIS LEADERSHIP OF THE HOUSING RHNA ALLOCATION,  
6 WE GOT HIS BOLDNESS OF LEADING THAT ORGANIZATION. SO I THINK  
7 THAT'S WHAT'S BEFORE US. I AM PROUD OF WHAT I HEARD FROM OUR  
8 COMMISSIONERS FOR ACCEPTING THE CHALLENGE TO MOVE ON FROM  
9 CONSENSUS INTO A COMMITMENT AND WE CAN TALK ABOUT CLIPPER AND  
10 HOW THAT HAPPENED AND HOW IT HAPPENED BUT WHAT I SAW IS THEY  
11 ACCEPTED IT, THE OPERATORS ACCEPTED IT AS OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE  
12 IT A SUCCESS. AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT CLIPPER ILLUSTRATED AND  
13 I THINK WE'RE GOING TO LOOK BACK INTO THIS MOMENT AROUND THE  
14 SAME LENS OF, IT WAS A MOMENT WHERE WE WERE ABLE TO LOOK AT  
15 OUR BAY AREA TRANSIT SYSTEM AND MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE  
16 AUTHORITY BUT MAKING SURE IT'S DONE IN A WAY THAT WE WIN BACK  
17 RIDERS WORKING WITH THE OPERATORS. AT THAT POINT THAT'S THE  
18 SUMMARY I WANT TO SHARE BUT I WANT TO SEE IF COMMISSIONERS  
19 HAVE ANY FINAL THOUGHTS BEFORE WE MOVE TO ADJOURNMENT.  
20 COMMISSIONER SPERING?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THIS IS IMPORTANT. AND IF ANY COMMISSIONERS  
23 HAVE RESERVATIONS THIS WOULD BE THE TIME TO SPEAK UP. WHAT  
24 WE'RE ASKING STAFF TO DO IS COME BACK WITH PROPOSED CHANGES IN  
25 REVISING 3866. SO WE'RE NOT ASKING ANYBODY TO BUY INTO



October 27, 2021

1 ANYTHING. IT'S REALLY, GO FORWARD, YOU KNOW, PRESENT THE  
2 REVISIONS TO THE COMMISSION, TO HELP MOVE THIS INITIATIVE. AND  
3 SO, YOU KNOW, I JUST WANT TO EMPHASIZE, THIS IS AN IMPORTANT  
4 DECISION WE'RE MAKING RIGHT NOW TO ASK STAFF TO GO FORWARD  
5 WITH THESE REVISIONS, OR AT LEAST PROPOSE THEM TO THE  
6 COMMISSION. SO IT WOULD BE GOOD IF PEOPLE HAVE CONCERNS, THIS  
7 WOULD BE THE TIME TO SPEAK UP. BECAUSE I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE  
8 STAFF THE GO AHEAD TO START DEVELOPING THESE REVISIONS.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING.  
11 UNDERSCORING CONSENSUS WITH THE DIRECTION WHERE WE'RE GOING  
12 WITH THAT COMMITMENT. IF THERE IS ANY COMMISSIONER THAT WISHES  
13 TO SPEAK. I DO SEE RANDI KINMAN.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AS SOMEBODY WHO HAS SPENT A WHOLE LOT  
16 OF HER TIME RESPONDING TO QUESTIONS WITH MTC, WHEN PEOPLE SAY  
17 SHOULD MTC BE DOING THAT OR COULD BE DOING THAT, WE'RE AT A  
18 TURNING POINT HERE WHERE WE COULD CREATE SOMETHING THAT IS  
19 EQUITABLE FOR EVERYBODY. AND I THINK, SIMPLY ACKNOWLEDGING THE  
20 FACT THAT CONSENSUS DOES NOT GENERALLY LAST PAST THE NEXT  
21 CRISIS OR AN ELECTION CYCLE, ALLOWS US TO LOOK AT ADDRESSING  
22 THE RESOLUTION AND DECIDING WHAT A BETTER RESOLUTION WOULD  
23 LOOK LIKE, AND A BETTER RESOLUTION THAT WOULD INCLUDE A  
24 DISCUSSION ON HOW TO WORK TOGETHER, NOT JUST HOPING FOR  
25 CONSENSUS IN THE FUTURE, BUT NARROWING DOWN THAT LEADS TO A



October 27, 2021

1 BETTER FORMAT FOR CREATING EQUITABLE HOUSING FINANCING AND  
2 TRANSPORTATION RESOLUTIONS SOLUTIONS TO THE MEMBERS THAT EXIST  
3 FOR EVERYBODY FOR THE AGENCIES CITIES COUNTIES AND FOR THE  
4 GENERAL PUBLIC WHO REALLY WANT TO SEE THOSE ISSUES RESOLVED.  
5 THANK YOU.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RANDI. I'M GOING TO CHECK IN  
8 WITH AMBER. WE DON'T SEE ANY ADDITIONAL COMMISSIONERS WHO WISH  
9 TO COMMENT.

10

11 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** NO HANDS RAISED.

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I SEE NONE HERE. I WANT TO THANK  
14 EVERYONE WITH YOUR COMMENTS. REBECCA, WE'RE GOING TO TALK A  
15 BIT ABOUT WHAT WE EXPECT TO COME BACK TO THE COMMISSION.

16

17 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** IS THAT THERESE?

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES. I HAVE BEEN TAKING PHOTOS SUNS 1:30 AND  
20 I HAVE HAD OPPORTUNITY TO DIGEST THOSE SYNTHESIZE THOSE, AND  
21 NEXT STEPS, I WOULD LIKE TO TOUCH ON THAT TOMORROW  
22 PARTICULARLY WITH RESPECT TO THE CONVERSATION ABOUT HOW THE  
23 COMMISSION TAKES UP AND MOVES FORWARD SOME OF THESE QUESTIONS.  
24 THERE MAY BE SOME ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS. IN FACT, THAT'S ONE OF  
25 THE THINGS I'M GOING TO POSE IS I THINK THERE IS SOME



October 27, 2021

1 ADDITIONAL UNPACKING TO THE LARGER QUESTION OF, YOU KNOW, COME  
2 BACK WITH CHANGES TO 3866, AND I THINK OF STAFF ONE OF THE  
3 IMPORTANT THINGS WE NEED TO DO IS SAY WHAT ARE THE ELEMENTS OF  
4 WHAT THAT MEANS REBECCA HAD A GOOD MATRIX, ET CETERA. I WOULD  
5 LIKE TO SUGGEST A PROCESS FOR THAT PARTICULARLY AT THE END OF  
6 THE DAY WHEN WE TAKE UP THE ISSUE OF THE COMMISSION STRUCTURE  
7 ITSELF AND HOW IT'S GOING TO TAKE THESE UP. SO JUST WANTED TO  
8 OFFER THAT AS A SUGGESTION.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, THERESE. AND, AGAIN, I  
11 THINK THE SLIDE THAT WAS ON THERE THAT TALKED ABOUT THE  
12 PROPOSAL OPERATOR, ENGAGEMENT GM ENGAGEMENT AND BEING DONE  
13 WITH PEOPLE I THINK IS CRITICAL. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT. I  
14 DON'T SEE ANY COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS. AND THANK YOU TO  
15 EVERYONE AND REBECCA, AND STAFF FOR FACILITATING AND TO KATE  
16 AND AMBER FOR HELPING US HAVE THIS THOUGHTFUL CONVERSATION. AT  
17 THIS POINT WE HAVE A BIG DAY STARTING TOMORROW AT 9:00 A.M.  
18 WE'RE GOING TO DIVE INTO SPECIFICS AS THERESE OUTLINED, ABOUT  
19 WHAT WE HEARD TODAY IN OUR CONVERSATION. I EXPECT MAYOR  
20 LICCARDO TO ARRIVE WITH THE SAME LEVEL OF ENERGY.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** STARTING TO BE HERE TOMORROW.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** EXACTLY. THANK YOU EVERYONE.  
25 APPRECIATE EVERYONE'S PARTICIPATION. HAVE A GOOD ONE.



*Broadcasting Government*