METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
3	WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 13, 2021, 1:30 P.M.
4	
5	CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: GOOD AFTERNOON. THIS IS THE
6	MEETING OF OCTOBER 13TH OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL.
7	WELCOME. WE'LL CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER AND WE WOULD
8	APPRECIATE IT IF THE BROADCASTING TEAM WOULD ROLL THE
9	ANNOUNCEMENT. DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
10	AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL
11	361 WHICH SUSPENDED CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT.
12	THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR
13	WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER
14	SPEAKERS BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY ASK STATE
15	THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
16	PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED,
17	ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.
18	COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
19	WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE.
20	TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
21	DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. PARTICIPANTS ARE ASKED TO STATE
22	THEIR NAME AND ORGANIZATION BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
23	VOLUNTARY. COMMENTS RECEIVED BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE
24	POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA BUT NOT READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS
25	OF THE CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK THEY SHOULD RAISE



1	THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALLED UPON THEM AT THE
2	APPROPRIATE TIME. ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTIVE
3	ITEMS, AND CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE IN ORDER TO GET THE FULI
4	ZOOM EXPERIENCE PLEASE MAKE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP-TO-DATE.
5	
6	CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: APOLOGIES FOR THE LATE START.
7	ROLL CALL.
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR MURRAY.
10	
11	CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: HERE.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: BALDINI?
14	
15	MICHAEL BALDINI: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CASTELLANOS IS EXCUSED. COATES?
18	
19	RICK COATES: HERE.
20	
21	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ELDRED? FLOREZ?
22	
23	VEDA FLOREZ: HERE.
24	
25	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: GLOVER?



1		
2	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE	1.
3		
4	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: H	EDGES?
5		
6	RICHARD HEDGES: HERE.	
7		
8	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: G	OTUACO?
9		
10	CHRISTINA GOTUACO: HERE	
11		
	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: H	EDGES?
13		
	RICHARD HEDGES: HERE.	
15	CIEDE MADMUA CIIVED. U	ERNANDEZ IS EXCUSED. KALLINS?
17	CHERRY MARTINA STEVERS. 11	ENNANDEZ 15 ENCOSED. NAUDINS:
	WENDI KALLINS: HERE.	
19		
20	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: L	EVIN?
21		
22	ADINA LEVIN: HERE.	
23		
24	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: L	OPEZ?
25		



1	CARLOS LOPEZ: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ADAMS?
4	
5	SPEAKER: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MOMOH?
8	
9	RAHMON MOMOH: HERE.
10	
11	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: BEN SCHWENG?
12	
13	BENJAMIN SCHWENG: HERE.
14	
15	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WELTE?
16	
17	FRANK WELTE: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WILSON? WE HAVE A QUORUM.
20	
21	CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. ITEM THREE, OUR
22	CHAIR'S REPORT. OUR CHAIR IS NOT ABLE TO BE HERE TODAY. THERE
23	IS NO CHAIR'S REPORT. ITEM FOUR, APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES
24	MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES?



RICHARD HEDGES: MOVE APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES. 1 2 3 VEDA FLOREZ: SECOND. 4 5 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: HEDGES APPROVES. AND HEDGES SECONDS. ALL THOSE IF FAVOR SAY AYE? 6 7 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ROLL CALL VOTE. 9 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: ROLL CALL VOTE. I WISH. 10 11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 12 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 13 14 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL NOW 15 16 ASK THE CLERK TO READ THE NAMES OR ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED AT 17 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD 18 I'LL ALSO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC 19 PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WHO HAVE COMMENTS ON ITEMS NOT 20 ON TODAY AGENDA TO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND USING THE RAISED 21 22 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL ASTERISK NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO 23 SPEAK WHEN I CALL UPON YOURSELF PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF OR DIAL ASTERISK, OR STAR SIX. IS THERE ANY CORRESPONDENCE? 24



CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 1 2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 3 ON THIS ITEM. 4 5 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU, STAFF. AGENDA ITEM SIX, SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. WE'LL BEGIN WITH VEDA FLOREZ, WHO 6 WILL REPORT ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY & ACCESS 7 8 SUBCOMMITTEE AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. VEDA? 9 VEDA FLOREZ: GOOD AFTERNOON THIS IS VEDA FLOREZ FROM THE 10 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. ON OCTOBER 4TH WE HAD AN 11 UPDATE ON THE INTERSTATE 880 EXPRESS LANE TOLL DISCOUNT PILOT 12 PROGRAM. AND THIS WAS A CUSTOMER RESEARCH FEEDBACK 13 INFORMATIONAL ITEM ON HOW IT AFFECTS THE PILOT. AND WE 14 15 RECEIVED INFORMATION ON POTENTIAL DISCOUNTS FROM 75% TO 50%. 16 AND WE ALSO RECEIVED INFORMATION ON THE OUTREACH THAT HAD BEEN DONE THEY SURVEYED 75 PEOPLE AND OUR SUBCOMMITTEE WAS 17 CONCERNED ABOUT THE FEEDBACK. MANY PEOPLE FELT STAFF DIDN'T 18 REACH OUT TO ENOUGH AFRICAN AMERICAN COMMUNITIES IN THE AREA 19 AND RELIED HEAVILY ON HISPANIC COMMUNITY MEMBERS. THERE WAS 20 21 ALSO FEEDBACK WE HEARD ABOUT THOSE WITH DISABILITIES THERE WASN'T ENOUGH INFORMATION THAT HAD BEEN TAKEN, AND THERE 22 WASN'T ENOUGH INFORMATION THAT HAD BEEN RECEIVED FROM THE 23 DISABLED COMMUNITY. WE WERE ALSO INTERESTED THAT CLEAN AIR 24

VEHICLES WOULD GET A FREE RIDE IN THIS PILOT PROGRAM, AND WE



- 1 WERE INTERESTED TO LEARN IF THERE WAS ANY ATTACHMENT TO TIME
- 2 FRAME OR DOLLAR AMOUNTS. AND, SO THIS WAS AN INFORMATIONAL
- 3 ITEM, HOW THEY WOULD PROCEED, AND MANY OF OUR COMMENTS WOULD
- 4 GO INTO, AND HOPEFULLY THE FEEDBACK WILL BE RECEIVED AND TAKEN
- 5 INTO ACCOUNT FOR THE NEXT GO AROUND. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND
- 6 OUR NEXT MEETING WILL BE HELD IN NOVEMBER. WE'RE PLANNING FOR.
- 7 AND I'M GOING TO ASK MARTHA TO HELP US OUT. OH I SEE IT'S
- 8 NOVEMBER 19TH, EQUITY AND ACCESS.

9

- 10 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN WILL
- 11 PROVIDE A REPORT ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE
- 12 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND
- 13 INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION
- 14 SUBCOMMITTEE. ADINA?

- 16 ADINA LEVIN: YES. SO, OUR LAST MEETING WAS -- OH RATS -- I'M
- 17 LOOKING AT THE -- AM I LOOKING AT THE RIGHT -- I'M TRYING TO
- 18 REMEMBER THE LAST MEETING. THE LAST MEETING, OFF THE TOP OF MY
- 19 HEAD, AND FAILING -- BUT WE DID MEET -- OH, WE MET ON
- 20 SEPTEMBER 10TH, WHICH WAS PRIOR TO THE MEETING OF THE FARE
- 21 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE WHICH WAS ON 20TH AND WE GOT A CHANCE
- 22 TO REVIEW THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE REGIONAL FARE
- 23 COORDINATION INTEGRATION STUDY AND THAT INCLUDE TWO PROPOSALS
- 24 FOR POTENTIAL NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION OF PILOT TRANSIT PASS
- 25 TO USE FOR ORGANIZATIONS SUCH AS EMPLOYER'S, AFFORDABLE



- 1 HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS SCHOOLS, AND UNIVERSITIES AS WELL AS FREE
- 2 OR FULLY SUBSIDIZED TRANSFERS, THE FIRST COULD ROLL OUT AS
- 3 SOON AS NEXT YEAR, AND IN 2022, AND THE SECOND COULD ROLL OUT
- 4 IN 2023, WITH THE ROLL OUT OF CLIPPER 2.0. THOSE TWO ARE A
- 5 POTENTIAL SOURCE OF FUNDING IS A SLICE OF AMERICAN RESCUE
- 6 FUNDS, RELIEF FUNDS MTC HAS HELD FOR THE USE BLUE RIBBON
- 7 TRANSIT TASK FORCE WITH RECOMMENDATIONS TO HELP RECOVERY
- 8 TRANSIT FROM THE IMPACTS OF COVID THOSE TWO RECOMMENDATIONS
- 9 WOULD NOT REQUIRE GOVERNANCE OR FARE STRUCTURE CHANGES. THERE
- 10 WERE ADDITIONAL TIERS THAT WERE STUDIED, WHICH WOULD BE
- 11 POTENTIALLY STANDARDIZING REGIONAL FARES LIKE CALTRAIN,
- 12 FERRIES, REGIONAL BUS SERVICE AS WELL AS POTENTIAL FOR A FULLY
- 13 UNIFIED FARE SYSTEM. AND THE SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS WERE
- 14 GENERALLY SUPPORTIVE OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WERE COMING
- 15 FORWARD AND WANTED, AS USUAL, TO ENCOURAGE AGENCIES TO LOOK
- 16 BEYOND THE STATUS QUO, AND TAKE THE STEPS THAT ARE NEEDED TO
- 17 HAVE FARES THAT ARE EQUITABLE AND THAT HELP BRING RIDERS BACK
- 18 TO TRANSIT. LET'S SEE. ONE MORE THING. I WOULD WELCOME ANYBODY
- 19 ELSE WHO WAS THERE TO CHIME IN AND MENTION ANY IMPORTANT
- 20 THEMES THAT I MAY HAVE MISSED. THE ITEM IS GOING TO A SERIES
- 21 OF TRANSIT BOARDS, INCLUDING TWO TRANSIT BOARD MEETINGS THIS
- 22 WEEK. AC TRANSIT, STARTING AT 5:00 TODAY, AND THE BART BOARD
- 23 STARTING AT 9:00 TOMORROW. POWER THOSE OF YOU WHO USE THOSE
- 24 AGENCIES, AND/OR ARE PART OF COMMUNITIES THAT USE THOSE
- 25 AGENCIES, I WOULD RECOMMEND SPEAKING UP AT THOSE BOARD



- 1 MEETINGS WITH YOUR THOUGHTS ON THIS TOP YOU CAN. AND THIS IS
- 2 COMING FOR POLICY DIRECTION TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
- 3 ON MONDAY THE 18TH. ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS?

4

- 5 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? SEEING
- 6 NONE. NEXT ITEM 72021 LEGISLATIVE SCORECARD REBECCA LONG AND
- 7 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. THIS IS AN
- 8 INFORMATION ITEM AND NO ACTION REQUIRED BY THE COUNCIL.
- 9 REBECCA AND GEORGIA PLEASE BEGIN.

10

- 11 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU CHAIR MURRAY. MTC REBECCA LONG. IN
- 12 YOUR PACKET -- OH GOSH, I HAVE WAY TOO MANY PDFS OPEN.
- 13 BASICALLY EVERY YEAR WE TAKE OUR ADVOCACY PROGRAM TO YOU, AND
- 14 WE, AT THE END OF THE YEAR KIND OF COMPARE WHAT ACTUALLY GOT
- 15 DONE. SO IF I CAN JUST FIND IT. I JUST OPENED IT TWO SECTIONS
- 16 AGO.

- 18 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: TAKE YOUR TIME. OKAY. SO I'M
- 19 NOT GOING TO READ THE ENTIRE THING BUT WANT TO HIT SOME HIGH
- 20 POINTS AND SOME DISAPPOINTMENTS. STARTING ON THE STATE SIDE,
- 21 IF YOU ARE KIND OF FOLLOWING ALONG, LOOKING AT PAGE TWO.
- 22 RELATED TO ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. WE HAD A GOAL OF SECURING
- 23 ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, BICYCLE AND
- 24 PEDESTRIAN FACILITIES IMPROVEMENTS, WE WERE EXCITED THAT THE
- 25 STATE BUDGET ORIGINALLY INCLUDED AN AUGMENTATION OF 500





- 1 MILLION FROM THE GENERAL FUND FOR THIS PROGRAM, BUT ONE OF THE
- 2 BIG DISAPPOINTMENTS AT THE END OF THE YEAR WAS THAT THE HIGH
- 3 SPEED RAIL FUNDING FELL APART, AS FAR AS NEGOTIATIONS THERE,
- 4 AND A LOT OF ADDITIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDS HAD, SORT OF,
- 5 BEEN HITCHED TO THAT, TRAIN, IF YOU WILL. AND SO THOSE WERE
- 6 ULTIMATELY REPEALED FROM THE BUDGET. SO, YOU KNOW, WE THOUGHT
- 7 WE WERE GOING TO GET ANOTHER 500 MILLION THEN WE DIDN'T. SO
- 8 WE'RE HOPEFUL THAT WE CAN START OVER AND REALLY NOT START
- 9 OVER, BUT KIND OF CONTINUE THAT PROPOSAL, STARTING IN JANUARY,
- 10 WHEN THE LEGISLATURE STARTS DISCUSSING THE BUDGET AGAIN. BUT
- 11 ON THE WIN SIDE, THEY DID INCLUDE A NEW PROGRAM REFERRED TO AS
- 12 REAP 2.0. I THINK YOU HEARD ABOUT THE FIRST REAP. THAT WAS
- 13 FOCUSED ON HOUSING, PLANNING AND KIND OF PREPARING LOCAL
- 14 GOVERNMENTS TO DELIVER ON THE RHNA COMMITMENTS, AS FAR AS
- 15 UPDATING NEW ZONING AND ALL OF THAT. AND THOSE FUNDS HAVE BEEN
- 16 THROUGH ABAG. THIS SECOND VERSION OF REAP IS A LITTLE BIT MORE
- 17 FOCUSED ON TRANSPORTATION, AND THE FUNDS WILL COME THROUGH
- 18 MTC, AND IT'S VERY FLEXIBLE. IT'S REALLY FOCUSED ON HELPING US
- 19 IMPLEMENT PLANNED BAY AREA, AND WE EXPECT TO SEE ABOUT 100
- 20 MILLION COMING TO THE REGION FOR THAT, AND ACTIVE
- 21 TRANSPORTATION WILL BE ELIGIBLE, ALONG WITH HOUSING RELATED
- 22 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND REALLY ANYTHING THAT IS ESTIMATED TO
- 23 REDUCE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. SO THAT WAS EXCITING. AND A
- 24 BIG WIN. ALSO JUST WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT, THERE WAS A
- 25 SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING FUNDING THAT IS IN



- 1 THE BUDGET. SO, ON PAGE FOUR, ITEM A, THERE WAS ABOUT 1.7
- 2 BILLION ADDED TO THE HOUSING PROGRAM AND MULTI-FAMILY, AND 300
- 3 MILLION FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRESERVATION AND WE'RE HAPPY TO
- 4 SEE LEGISLATURE PRIORITIZING HOUSING. WE DID TAKE A SUPPORT
- 5 POSITION ON A.B. 1401 THAT WOULD HAVE ELIMINATED MINIMUM
- 6 PARKING REQUIREMENTS FOR RESIDENTIAL AND COMMERCIAL
- 7 DEVELOPMENT WITHIN CLOSE PROXIMITY TO HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT
- 8 THIS IS A PRETTY BOLD BILL AUTHORED BY THE ASSEMBLY
- 9 TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE CHAIR. IT DID ENCOUNTER A LOT OF
- 10 OPPOSITION AS HAPPENS SOMETIMES AND BECAME CONTROVERSIAL AND
- 11 DIDN'T EMERGE FROM THE SENATE APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE. NOT
- 12 SURPRISINGLY, UNFORTUNATELY. THAT SB10 THAT SENATOR WIENER
- 13 BILL THAT ALLOWS ZONING UPDATES FOR RELATIVELY MODEST MULTI-
- 14 FAMILY HOUSING UNITS FOR UP TO TEN UNITS PER PARCEL IF YOU'RE
- 15 MAKING ZONING CHANGE YOU DO NOT HAVE TO PUT THAT ZONING
- 16 ORDINANCE THROUGH THE PROCESS THAT SIMPLIFIES THE ZONING AT
- 17 RELATIVELY A MODEST SCALE WITH INFILL AREAS AND WAS SIGNED BY
- 18 THE GOVERNOR. THERE WERE A NUMBER OF HOUSING BILLS THAT DID
- 19 GET SIGNED THAT WE DON'T TAKE POSITIONS O I'M SURE YOU'RE
- 20 FAMILIAR WITH. IS IT IS B THREE? SORRY FORGETTING THE NUMBER.
- 21 IT'S THE ATKINS BILL THAT DOES ELIMINATE SING FAMILY ZONING
- 22 WITH A LOT OF EXCEPTIONS. WE'RE STILL ANALYZING THAT BUT THAT
- 23 WAS THE BIGGEST HOUSING BILL. THE OTHER BIG WIN WAS ON THE BAY
- 24 AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. BECAUSE THERE WAS A LOT OF
- 25 BUDGET SURPLUS THAT YEAR, WE SPECIFICALLY PURSUED A FUNDING





- 1 ALLOCATION FOR BAHFA. AGAIN, THIS IS THE -- OUR NEW HAT THAT
- 2 MTC HAS AUTHORIZED TO PURSUE A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE ON THE
- 3 BALLOT, GIVEN THAT THE PROSPECTS FOR THAT WEREN'T LOOKING SO
- 4 GOOD. WE COULDN'T DO IT IN NOVEMBER 2000. WE WANTED TO PURSUE
- 5 SOME PILOT PROJECTS, AND WE DID GET \$20 MILLION IN THE STATE
- 6 BUDGET TO BEGIN THOSE PILOTS. LET'S SEE. MOVING RIGHT ALONG.
- 7 ON SB 375 IMPLEMENTATION AND REFORM. THIS WAS A BIG FEATURE OF
- 8 OUR ADVOCACY PROGRAM. WANTING TO REALLY SEE THE STATUTE MOVE
- 9 MORE TOWARDS, KIND OF, ACTION, AND INCENTIVIZING GREENHOUSE
- 10 GAS REDUCTION IN THE NEAR-TERM, RATHER THAN A VERY RIGID FOCUS
- 11 ON LONG-TERM MODELING. SENATOR CORTESE INTRODUCED A BILL
- 12 RELATED TO SB 375. IT BECAME A TWO-YEAR BILL WE EXPECTING THAT
- 13 TO BE TAKEN UP NEXT YEAR AND THERE WERE A NUMBER OF OTHER
- 14 BILLS THAT LEGISLATURE WERE CONSIDERING. HOPEFULLY NEXT YEAR.
- 15 ELECTRIFYING THE VEHICLE FLEET. THIS WAS DEFINITELY A BIG
- 16 PRIORITY FOR THE LEGISLATURE. THERE WAS A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT
- 17 OF FUNDING GOING INTO THE CLEAN VEHICLE REBATE. SO FOR
- 18 PASSENGER VEHICLES, BUT ALSO FOR TRANSIT AND TRUCKS, AS WELL.
- 19 AND LET'S SEE. AND THEN ANOTHER BIG AREA WHERE -- OF FOCUS AND
- 20 WHERE WE DID SEE REAL PROGRESS THIS YEAR IS CLIMATE ADAPTATION
- 21 AND RESILIENCE. THE BUDGET INCLUDES \$35 MILLION THIS YEAR FOR
- 22 REGIONAL AND LOCAL CLIMATE ADAPTATION PLANNING AND
- 23 IMPLEMENTATION. THAT'S A STATEWIDE AMOUNT, OBVIOUSLY 35
- 24 MILLION IS JUST A SMALL DOWN PAYMENT. BUT THERE WAS A
- 25 COMMITMENT MADE IN A SUBSEQUENT TRAILER BILL FOR 225 MILLION



- 1 IN FUTURE YEARS FOR THAT PURPOSE. SO, I THINK IT'S GREAT
- 2 PROGRESS THAT THE LEGISLATURE IS STARTING TO SET-ASIDE FUNDS
- 3 SPECIFICALLY FOR THAT PURPOSE. AND THEN ON PEDESTRIAN SAFETY.
- 4 WE SUPPORTED A.B. 43. THIS WAS, AGAIN, ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION
- 5 CHAIR FRIEDMAN'S BILL THAT REPEALS THE 85TH PERCENTILE. YOU
- 6 PROBABLY REMEMBER FOLKS TALKING ABOUT THAT. AND THAT IS,
- 7 BASICALLY IT'S A CONSTRAINT ON LOCAL GOVERNMENT'S ABLE TO
- 8 LOWER SPEED LIMITS AND THAT BILL DID GET SIGNED INTO LAW THIS
- 9 WEEK. SO THAT'S A BIG WIN. WITH THAT, I THINK I WILL TURN IT
- 10 OVER TO GEORGIA. SHE IS ON THE LINE TO GIVE YOU A RECAP OF
- 11 WHERE WE LANDED ON THE FEDERAL LEVEL.

13 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU REBECCA. AND GEORGIA,

14 GO AHEAD.

12

15

- 16 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: FOR THE SAKE OF TIME, AS YOU CAN SEE IN
- 17 OUR SCORECARD, MOST OF, ALL OF THE ACTION FOR THE FEDERAL
- 18 LEVEL IS WEARING CONGRESS ACTION ON A BIPARTISAN PACKAGE AND
- 19 SUPPLEMENTAL RECONCILIATION BILL IF THOSE TWO PIECES OF
- 20 LEGISLATION MOVE THAT WOULD BE A SLAM DUNK ON OUR PORTION OF
- 21 THE LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACY AGENDA THIS YEAR. AND, AGAIN, FOR THE
- 22 SAKE OF TIME, I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT E.
- 24 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: DOES THAT COMPLETE YOUR REPORT?

25



GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: THAT COMPLETES OUR REPORT AND I'M OPEN 1 2 FOR QUESTIONS. 3 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: I SEE MARK HAS HIS HAND UP. 4 5 MARK? DO YOU WANT UNMUTE? 6 MARC MADDEN: I THINK RICHARD WAS IN FRONT OF ME. BUT I WOULD 7 8 BE HAPPY TO TALK. 9 RICHARD HEDGES: GO FOR IT MARC. 10 11 MARC MADDEN: THE SO-CALLED CLIMATE ADAPTATION FUNDS AND FUTURE 12 IS THAT SPECIFICALLY INCLUDING SEA LEVEL RISE IMPLICATIONS OR 13 IS THAT DIFFERENT CATEGORY OF FUNDS? 14 15 16 REBECCA LONG: PLANNING TO SEA LEVEL RISE AND IMPLEMENTATION RELATING TO SEA LEVEL RISE I'M SURE WOULD BE ELIGIBLE BUT IT'S 17 NOT SPECIFIC TO SEA LEVEL RISE. THERE IS, ALSO, I THINK, SOME 18 FUNDING RELATED TO SAN FRANCISCO BAY. SO THERE'S A FEW 19 DIFFERENT AREAS WHERE SEA LEVEL RISE COULD BE ADDRESSED. BUT I 20 21 THINK THAT THE REAL MAJOR CAPITAL FUNDS ARE GOING TO, 22 HOPEFULLY E COME IN FUTURE YEARS. THERE WAS AN OVERALL BIG 23 PACKAGE OF CLOSE TO THE \$3 BILLION THAT WAS COMMITTED TO. BUT, AGAIN, IS GOING TO REQUIRE APPROPRIATION IN FUTURE YEARS. 24



- 1 MARC MADDEN: I WOULD MENTION A REPORT WAS ISSUED THIS VERY DAY
- 2 INDICATING THAT IF TEMPERATURE INCREASES BY MORE THAN TWO
- 3 MAYBE THREE DEGREES LARGELY SAN FRANCISCO WILL BE UNDERWATER.
- 4 SO SOONER RATHER THAN LATER.

5

- 6 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: NEXT UP IS RICH THEN FRANK THEN
- 7 WENDI. RICH, GO AHEAD.

8

- 9 RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU. REBECCA, THIS QUESTION IS FOR YOU.
- 10 I JUST GOT A SCORECARD FROM JOSH BECKER AND HE WAS POSITIVE ON
- 11 SB NINE BUT NEGATIVE ON SB10 AND I WANT TO KNOW WHY. MAYBE YOU
- 12 CAN PROVIDE SOME DETAILS. MINDING IS THAT TEN UNIT IS WITHIN
- 13 HALF A MILE OF TRANSIT WHICH IS A GREAT SOLUTION. FOR SOME
- 14 SMALL LOTS NEAR CALTRAIN STATION IN SAN MATEO. YOU CAN TELL ME
- 15 WHY HE MIGHT FEEL THAT WAY?

16

- 17 REBECCA LONG: OFTENTIMES FOLKS ARE NOT SUPPORTIVE OF ANYTHING
- 18 THAT EXEMPTS CEOA, SO IT COULD BE -- I DON'T WANT TO SPECULATE
- 19 ON EXACTLY WHERE HE'S COMING FROM, BUT IT COULD BE THAT'S HIS
- 20 POSITION.

- 22 RICHARD HEDGES: HE'S AN ENVIRONMENTALIST. MAYBE THAT COULD BE
- 23 IT. I WOULD SAY IT'S A GOOD BILL I GET ALL THE REQUESTS FOR
- 24 EXPANDING HOMES OR TEARING THEM DOWN AND I GOT MY FIRST
- 25 REQUEST TO TEAR DOWN A HOUSE AND BUILD A DUPLEX.



1 REBECCA LONG: IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE NEAR TRANSIT IT PARTICULAR 2 3 BE URBAN AND INFILL SITE NOT JUST TOD. 4 5 RICHARD HEDGES: NOT JUST SINGLE FAMILY NEIGHBORHOODS? 6 7 REBECCA LONG: PARTICULAR BE REZONING. SB10 IS ABOUT REZONING. 8 RICHARD HEDGES: OKAY. BOTH HE AND MARK BUT MAN GOT TREMENDOUS 9 PUSH BACK FROM CK UNANIMOUSLY THEY SENT A LETTER BOTH OF THEM 10 UNANIMOUS ABOUT THEIR VOTE ON SB NINE. 11 12 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: FRANK? 13 14 FRANK WELTE: I HAVE A COUPLE OF OUESTIONS REGARDING PEDESTRIAN 15 16 SAFETY, WITH SB3 LIMITED ABILITY OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO LOWER SPEED LIMITS IT WOULD SEEM TO ME MOST OF THE TIME GOVERNMENTS 17 WOULD WANT TO LOWER THEIR SPEED LIMITS IN ORDER TO PROTECT 18 PEDESTRIAN, AND IT SEEMS COUNTERPRODUCTIVE IN APPROACH TO 19 LIMIT THEIR ABILITY TO DO THAT. SECOND CONCERN I HAVE IS I WAS 20 21 READING ABOUT THE REPORT ABOUT A BILL THAT WAS SPONSORED BY 22 THE CALIFORNIA COUNCIL OF THE BLIND WHICH IS HOLDING SCOOTER 23 SHARING COMPANIES ACCOUNTABLE FOR THE DAMAGE THAT IRRESPONSIBLE SCOOTER RIDERS ARE DOING TO PEDESTRIAN LIKE 24 PARKING THEIR SCOOTERS ON THE SIDEWALK AND BLADE PEDESTRIAN



- 1 FALL OVER THEM AND MTC HAS BEEN VERY MUCH IN FAVOR OF A LOT OF 2 THE MICRO MOBILITY GROWTH AND I DON'T FEEL LIKE MTC IS TAKING
- 3 ENOUGH CONSIDERATION FOR THE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES TO
- 4 PEDESTRIAN THAT SOME OF THESE MICRO MOBILITY SOLUTIONS IMPOSE.

5

- 6 REBECCA LONG: THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF I COULD RESPOND TO THE
- 7 FIRST QUESTION ABOUT THE BILL RELATED TO SPEED LIMITS?

8

9 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: PLEASE.

- 11 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU. I WANTED TO CLARIFY, A.B. 43 GIVES
- 12 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS MORE FLEXIBILITY RELATIVE TO LOWER SPEED
- 13 LIMES CURRENT LAW USES SOMETHING WHICH IS REFERRED TO AS THE
- 14 85TH PERCENTILE AND THAT LIMITS THE ABLE. TODAY LOCAL
- 15 GOVERNMENTS BASICALLY HAVE TO SET THE SPEED LIMIT BASED ON
- 16 WHAT 85% OF THE CARS ARE DRIVING IT CAN'T BE LOWER THAN THAT.
- 17 UNFORTUNATELY IT CREATES A CYCLE WHERE SOMETIMES LOCAL
- 18 GOVERNMENTS HAVE TO RAISE THE SPEED LIMIT TO KEEP PACE WITH
- 19 CARS DRIVING FASTER. SO IT'S VERY MUCH IN FAVOR OF PEDESTRIAN
- 20 AND BICYCLE SAFETY, THAT BILL. WITH REGARD TO THE OTHER ONE,
- 21 YOU KNOW, WE UNDERSTAND THAT, YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY, MICRO
- 22 MOBILITY COMPANIES HAVE A VERY IMPORTANT RESPONSIBILITY WITH
- 23 RESPECT TO SAFETY, AND PARTICULARLY, AS IT RELATES TO PERSONS
- 24 WITH DISABILITIES WE CHOSE NOT TO TAKE A POSITION ON THAT
- 25 BILL. BECAUSE IT IS COMPLICATED AND WHAT IT DEALT WITH



- 1 PRIMARILY WAS INSURANCE AND THAT'S NOT OUR AREA OF EXPERTISE.
- 2 BUT I DO APPRECIATE YOU RAISING IT.

3

4 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. WENDI KALLINS.

5

- 6 WENDI KALLINS: I HAVE TWO QUESTIONS. ONE, CAN YOU EXPLAIN WHY
- 7 THE 500 MILLION WAS TIED TO HIGH SPEED RAIL? I DO NOT OUITE
- 8 UNDERSTAND THAT ONE. AND THEN THE SECOND QUESTION, A.B. 43,
- 9 WHICH I DID TRY TO READ THE BILL AND IT'S NOT REALLY CLEAR
- 10 WHAT CRITERIA YOU CAN USE FOR PEDESTRIAN AND BICYCLISTS TO BE
- 11 ABLE TO LOWER THE SPEED LIMIT, AND, ALSO, TO CLARIFY THAT IT
- 12 DOESN'T ACTUALLY COME INTO EFFECT UNTIL JUNE 24TH, IS THAT
- 13 CORRECT?

- 15 REBECCA LONG: I WOULD NEED TO DOUBLE CHECK ON THAT. I CAN DO
- 16 THAT AS WE'RE CONTINUING TO TALK. IT WAS DEFINITELY A
- 17 COMPLICATE BILL TO GET THROUGH THE LEGISLATURE. I WOULD
- 18 IMAGINE, THERE WAS GOING TO NEED TO BE SOME DETERMINATIONS
- 19 MADE, RIGHT, BY LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ABOUT HOW TO EXACTLY
- 20 IMPLEMENT IT, AND I THINK THERE WERE SPECIFIC LOCATIONS,
- 21 RIGHT? WITH CRITERIA APPLICABLE TO THOSE THAT HAD TO DEAL WITH
- 22 CERTAIN LEVELS OF COMMERCIAL ACTIVITY AND THINGS LIKE THAT,
- 23 WHERE IT APPLIES. SO IT'S NOT, YOU KNOW, IN EVERY PART OF A
- 24 JURISDICTION. BUT I -- YOU KNOW, I CAN'T -- IT'S A VERY
- 25 COMPLEX BILL THEY CAN'T JUST EXPLAIN IN TWO SECONDS RIGHT NOW.



- 1 FOR THE 500 MILLION, IN A NUTSHELL, THE GOVERNOR, IN HIS MAY
- 2 REVISE, HE REQUESTED 4.2 BILLION FOR HIGH SPEED RAIL, AND AS
- 3 PART OF THAT, HIS TRANSPORTATION PACKAGE ALSO INCLUDED 500
- 4 MILLION FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, ABOUT 2 BILLION FOR PUBLIC
- 5 TRANSIT, SO IT WAS PRESENTED AS A PACKAGE, AND BASICALLY IT
- 6 WAS, YOU HAVE GOT AN ALL OR NOTHING. SO THERE WERE STRING
- 7 ATTACHED TO THE 500 MILLION IN THE BUDGET LANGUAGE THAT SAID
- 8 IT DIDN'T DIRECTLY SAY "HIGH SPEED RAIL" BUT IT DID SAY YOU
- 9 HAVE TO ENACT OTHER LEGISLATION SO WHEN THE HIGH SPEED RAIL
- 10 NEGOTIATION COLLAPSED THAT MEANT THOSE FUNDS WERE ALSO
- 11 ESSENTIALLY TIME LIMITED AND THE OTHER LEGISLATION WAS NOT
- 12 ENACTED SO THEY REVERTED TO THE GENERAL FUND.
- 14 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. DON'T SEE ANY OTHER
- 15 HANDS RAISED. BY THE COUNCIL? I'LL ASK MARTHA IF YOU WOULD
- 16 READ IF THERE WAS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS
- 17 ITEM, INTO THE RECORD
- 19 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 20 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 21 ON THIS ITEM.
- 23 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL MOVE
- 24 TO ITEM EIGHT, THE FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I FEEL LIKE WE
- 25 SHOULD HAVE FIREWORKS AND CONFETTI FOR THE GRAND FINALE. WE'LL

13

18



- 1 HAVE DAVE VAUTIN. WE MADE IT TO THE FINAL REPORT. YOU'RE ON
- 2 MUTE. THANK YOU. PLEASE BEGIN. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD AFTERNOON
- 3 I'M DAVE VAUTIN ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOR MTC AND ABAG. I'M
- 4 PLEASED TO PRESENT FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH YOU ARE
- 5 ALL AWARE OF WHICH IS THE REGIONAL PLAN FOR TRANSPORTATION,
- 6 HOUSING, ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
- 7 AND THANK MANY OF THE MTC AND ABAG STAFF WHO CONTRIBUTED TO
- 8 HORIZON AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 OVER THE YEARS. TODAY I'M
- 9 JOINED BY A FEW OF THEM. ADAM NOELTING WHO LED THE EIR PROCESS
- 10 CHIRAG RIBARI IMPLEMENTATION PLAN DEVELOPMENT, RALEIGH MCCOY
- 11 PLAN DOCUMENT DEVELOPMENT AND URSULA VOGLER OUR PUBLIC
- 12 ENGAGEMENT TEAM. NEXT SLIDE. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HAS GONE
- 13 THROUGH EXTENSIVE PLAN DEVELOPMENT PROCESS SPANNING NEARLY
- 14 FOUR YEARS FROM HORIZON INITIATIVE IN 2018 AND 2019 MTC AND
- 15 ABAG EXPLORED FUTURES FOR THE REGION FOCUSING ON RESILIENT
- 16 STRATEGIES SPECIFICALLY POLICIES AND INVESTMENTS THAT ADVANCED
- 17 EQUITABLE OUTCOME IN AN UNCERTAIN FUTURE UNDERSTANDING HOW
- 18 STRATEGIES FAIRED UNDER WIDE RANGING CONDITIONS SET US ON A
- 19 FIRMER FOUNDATION WHEN COVID HIT IN EARLY 2020 DURING THE
- 20 BLUEPRINT PROCESS PLANS TO INCREASE PLAN'S PROGRESS TOWARDS
- 21 KEY OBJECTIVES FURTHERING PUBLIC INPUT AND INTEGRATING
- 22 EMERGING ISSUES RELATED TO POST-COVID RECOVERY, IN JANUARY
- 23 2021 THE BOARD VOTED TO ADVANCE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT INTO THE
- 24 ENVIRONMENTAL PROCESS AS THE PREFERRED PLAN. THIS FOUR YEAR
- 25 PROCESS CREATED A COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL VISION WITH ELEMENTS



- 1 FOCUSSED ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ENVIRONMENTAL RESILIENCE
- 2 COMPLEMENTING WORK AND EXPANDING INTO THE TRANSPORTATION AND
- 3 HOUSING SPACES. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 REPRESENTS A MAJOR
- 4 EVOLUTION OF A REGIONAL VISION COMPARED TO PAST ITERATIONS A
- 5 STRATEGIC PIVOT AWAY FROM PREDICTING THE FUTURE AND TOWARDS
- 6 EMBRACING UNCERTAINTY AND PREPARING FOR IT PLACED EQUITY FRONT
- 7 AND CENTER AND CRAFT EACH STRATEGY WITH EQUITY FIRST MINDSET.
- 8 IT INTEGRATED NEW AND DYNAMIC FORMS OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT LIKE
- 9 GAMES, MAYOR THE BAYVILLE AND POP-UP EVENTS AT LIBRARIES AND
- 10 FARMERS MARKETS. WITH THE INTEGRATED TEAM OF FORMER MTC AND
- 11 ABAG STAFF COMING TOGETHER IN 2017 DEMONSTRATE YOU EFFECTIVE
- 12 REGIONAL PLANNING. LAYING OUT SPECIFIC STRATEGIES, AND
- 13 BRINGING DOWN THE HIGH COST OF LIVING INTRODUCING STRATEGIES
- 14 TO ADDRESS TRANSPORTATION CHALLENGES AND ACHIEVE STATE-
- 15 MANDATED AMBITIOUS AND GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS FROM ROADWAY
- 16 PRICING TO SPEED LIMIT REDUCTIONS. FOR THE FIRST TIME RATHER
- 17 THAN JUST ANALYZING SEA LEVEL RISE AS AN ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
- 18 IT LAYS OUT A VISION OF PROTECTIONS BOTH GREEN AND GRAY
- 19 RINGING THE BAY AND ALONG THE PACIFIC COAST TO MITIGATE NEARLY
- 20 ALL IMPACTS TO PLAN 2050, AND THE OF IMPLEMENTATION FOR
- 21 PLANNED BAY AREA SPECIFIES ACTION MTC AND ABAG WILL ADVANCE
- 22 OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS NOT JUST A HANDFUL OF STRATEGIES BUT
- 23 ALL 35 OF THEM. NEXT SLIDE. CREATING THIS PLAN WOULD NOT HAVE
- 24 BEEN POSSIBLE WITHOUT DEEP SUSTAINED ENGAGEMENT FROM THE
- 25 PUBLIC ACROSS OUR DIVERSE REGION. MORE THAN 450 MEETINGS AND



EVENTS TARGETED TO THE PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDERS WERE HELD OVER 1 THE NEARLY FOUR YEAR LONG PROCESS AND BY USING INNOVATIVE AND 2 3 TARGETED ENGAGEMENT TECHNIQUES WE WERE ABLE TO INCREASE PARTICIPATION AND INPUT BY ORDER OF MAGNITUDE COMPARED TO 4 5 PRIOR LONG RANGE PLANS ULTIMATELY RECEIVING MORE THAN 300 COMMENTS AND MORE THAN 23,000 PARTICIPANTS BEING ENGAGED IN 6 7 THE PLANNING PROCESS. FROM THE START OF THE PROCESS WE 8 EMPHASIZED HEARING FROM THOSE VOICES WHO HAVEN'T BEEN HEARD FROM ENOUGH IN PROCESSES OF THE PASS. WE TARGETED 60% OF 9 EVENTS AND ACTIVITIES IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES OR 10 FOCUSED THEM ON UNDERSERVED GROUPS. OUR OUTREACH INCLUDED 11 LISTEN SUPPORTING LEARNING FROM THE NEXT GENERATION THE VERY 12 PEOPLE WHO WILL BE LEADING THIS REGION IN 2050. AND RATHER 13 THAN TELLING YOU WHAT THEY'RE EXCITED ABOUT, WE'RE GOING TO 14 GIVE THEM THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO THEMSELVES BY VIDEO THIS 15 16 AFTERNOON. WE'RE GOING TO HIGHLIGHT THE SUMMER OF 2021 YOUTH VIDEO CHALLENGE. AND I'LL ASK STAFF TO ROLL THE CLIP. 17 18 19 SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS MINIM AND I LIVE IN PLEASANTON CALIFORNIA MY FAVORITE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STRATEGY IS 20 PROVIDING INCENTIVES TO EMPLOYERS TO SHIFT JOB LOCATION TO 21 HOUSING-RICH AREAS THAT ARE WELL SERVED BY TRANSIT THE REASON 22 I LIKE THIS IS BECAUSE PEOPLE LIKE MY MOM DRIVE LONG COMMUTES 23 DAY IN AND DAY OUT THIS WOULD HELP REDUCE THE AMOUNT OF CARS 24

BEING USED AND ALSO REDUCE STRESS OF LOTS OF THESE WORKERS.



1 SPEAKER: HEY. MY NAME IS UR YELL CARDOZA FROM PITTSBURG HERE 2 3 IN THE BAY AREA AND PLY FAVORITE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS MAINTAINING URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES IT'S AN IMPORTANT STRATEGY 4 5 ESPECIALLY FOR CITIES LIKE MINE WHERE THERE IS A LOT OF OPEN PLOTS OF LAND IT WOULD ALLOW US TO DECREASE BIODIVERSITY WHICH 6 IS TO CONTINUE TO DEVELOP BAY AREA AND WE NEED TO RECOGNIZE 7 8 SPECIES AND WILDLIFE FOR THE ENVIRONMENT AND MAINTAIN FOCUS ON COMMUNITIES THAT ARE ALREADY IMPROVING OUALITY OF LIFE FOR BAY 9 10 AREA RESIDENTS. 11 SPEAKER: HI. THE STRATEGY I LIKE IS KEEPING AFFORDABLE 12 HOUSING. I LIKE IT BECAUSE SOME PEOPLE SLEEP ON THE FLOOR, BUT 13 THEY DON'T HAVE TO SLEEP ON THE FLOOR IF THEY GET A HOUSE. 14 THEY CAN SLEEP ON THE BED. 15 16 SPEAKER: OUT OF EVERYTHING FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 I AM MOST 17 18 EXCITED OF THE COMPLETE STREETS NETWORK WHEN COMPLETED THIS 19 WILL HELP BAY AREA RESIDENTS BY PROVIDING ALTERNATIVE TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS TO IMPROVE QUALITY OF LIFE AND COMPLETE 20 STREETS NETWORK WILL ALLOW FOR IMPROVEMENTS IN ROAD SAFETY AND 21 22 PROVIDE FOR LIVABLE STREET ENVIRONMENT AND ALLOW FOR FASTER 23 TRANSPORT BY 2050 BAY AREAS WILL HAVE MORE OPTIONS.



- 1 SPEAKER: HI, I'M DAVE, RESIDENT OF BURLINGAME. I APPRECIATE
- 2 THE MODERNIZATION OF RAIL IN THE FUTURE WE'LL SEE SECOND
- 3 TRANSBAY TWO, VALLEY LINK WHICH WILL TAKE CARS OFF THE ROAD
- 4 AND BRING PEOPLE INTO ELECTRIFIED TRAINS THAT'S GOOD FOR OUR
- 5 CLIMATE EMERGENCY WHICH WE'RE IN RIGHT NOW.

- 7 SPEAKER: HI. I'M HILLARY, AND I'M FROM HERCULES CALIFORNIA.
- 8 ONE OF MY FAVORITE STRATEGIES ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS
- 9 EXPANDING RELIABLE AND FREQUENCY OF BUSES IN FACT I SEE A BUS
- 10 RIGHT THERE AND ACROSS THE STREET THERE IS A BUS STOP THIS
- 11 WOULD HELP WITH PEOPLE GETTING TO WORK AND SCHOOL ON TIME AND
- 12 COULD BE COMBINED WITH CONVERTING MORE OF THESE BUSES INTO
- 13 CLEAN AIR VEHICLES SO THEY CAN REDUCE THE IMPACT OF POLLUTION.
- 14 >DAVE VAUTIN: I WANT TO THANK ALL OF THE YOUTH WHO WORKED WITH
- 15 US OVER THE PAST FOUR YEARS, THEIR CREATIVITY AND IDEAS HAVE
- 16 GIVEN US A LOT OF HOPE FOR THE FUTURE AND A LOT OF ENERGY AS
- 17 WE MOVE FROM PLANNING TO IMPLEMENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 18 I'M GOING TO PROVIDE A BRIEF RECAP ON THE FINAL PLAN. I KNOW
- 19 MANY OF YOU HAVE SEEN NUMEROUS PRESENTATIONS ON PLANNED BAY
- 20 AREA 2050 OVER THE PAST FOUR YEARS. THIS WILL JUST DO A QUICK
- 21 OVERVIEW THEN TURN TOWARDS MINOR UPDATES AND ENHANCEMENTS THAT
- 22 WERE MADE IN RESPONSE TO FEEDBACK RECEIVED IN THIS SUMMER'S
- 23 COMMENT PERIOD. AS YOU WILL RECALL IN 2019 ABAG COMMISSION AND
- 24 BOARD ADOPTED A PLAN VISION GUIDING PRINCIPLES TO ENSURE THAT
- 25 BAY AREA BY 2050 IS MORE AFFORDABLE CONNECTED DIVERSE AND



- 1 HEALTHY AND VIBRANT FOR ALL DRIVEN BY THE STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT
- 2 OVER THE PLANNING PROCESS NESTED WITHIN THE ELEMENTS SHOWN ON
- 3 THE SCREEN IN TRANSPORTATION HOUSING ECONOMY AND ENVIRONMENT
- 4 IN THE 35 STRATEGIES AT THE CORE OF THE PLAN TRANSPORTATION
- 5 ELEMENT FOCUSES ON MAINTAINING AND OPTIMIZING THE EXISTING
- 6 SYSTEM CREATING HEALTHY AND SAFER STREETS FOR ALL FOR A 10,000
- 7 MILE PLUS PROTECTED BIKEWAY AND PATH NETWORK AND BUILDING A
- 8 HUNDRED BILLION DOLLARS NEXT GENERATION TRANSIT NETWORK
- 9 HOUSING ELEMENT FOCUSES ON ALL THREE PS OF HOUSING,
- 10 PROTECTION, PRESERVATION, AND PRODUCTION. STARTING FIRST WITH
- 11 PROTECTION AND PRESERVATION OF EXISTING AFFORDABLE UNITS
- 12 INCLUDES STRATEGIES TO SPUR NEW HOUSING CONSTRUCTION AT ALL
- 13 INCOME LEVELS WHILE WORKING TO CREATE INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES.
- 14 STRATEGIES FOCUSED ON IMPROVING ECONOMIC MOBILITY CREATING
- 15 PATHWAYS TO THE MIDDLE CLASS AND SHIFTING LOCATION OF JOBS TO
- 16 GET TO A BETTER BALANCE WITHIN THE REGION. AND THE
- 17 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT OF THE PLAN INCLUDES STRATEGIES TO REDUCE
- 18 RISK FROM HAZARDS LIKE EARTHQUAKES AND SEA LEVEL RISE, EXPAND
- 19 ACCESS TO PARKS, RECREATION, OPEN SPACE FACILITIES AND REDUCE
- 20 CLIMATE EMISSIONS THROUGH EDUCATION AND DEMAND MANAGEMENT
- 21 STRATEGIES HELP TO ACCOMMODATE ESTIMATED 1.4 HOUSEHOLDS AND
- 22 JOBS THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 CRITICAL REQUIREMENT
- 23 ESTABLISHED IN SB 375. NEXT SLIDE. AS DISCUSSED PREVIOUSLY, AS
- 24 WELL TRANSFORMING OUR REGION WILL REQUIRE \$1.4 TRILLION OVER
- 25 THE NEXT 30 YEARS. WHILE MOST TRANSPORTATION MONEYS ARE



- 1 EXISTING WITH THE REMAINDER REASONABLY ANTICIPATE FROM NEW
- 2 TOLLS PARKING REVENUES AND OTHER SOURCES THERE ARE NOTABLE
- 3 FUNDING GAPS IN THE HOUSING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
- 4 ENVIRONMENTAL SPACES THAT WOULD NEED TO BE FILLED WITH MU NEW
- 5 MONEYS TO REALIZE THE PLAN'S VISION. GOOD NEWS IS REVENUES ARE
- 6 FLOWING FROM DC AND SACRAMENTO TO HELP FILLING THESE FINANCIAL
- 7 GAPS WITH POTENTIALLY MORE ON THE WAY IN THE YEARS AHEAD.
- 8 LEVEL AND REGIONAL ACTION TO GENERATE NEW REVENUES WILL BE
- 9 LIKELY IN THE NEXT DECADE TO TACKLE BIG CHALLENGES THAT OUR
- 10 REGION FACES. NEXT SLIDE. I'LL QUICKLY HIGHLIGHT KEY OUTCOMES
- 11 OF THE PLAN RECOGNIZING THAT WHILE WE COULDN'T PREDICT THE
- 12 FUTURE WE CAN ESTIMATE HOW THESE STRATEGIES WOULD INFLUENCE
- 13 THE REGIONAL TRAJECTORY. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, IF
- 14 IMPLEMENTED, WOULD SIGNIFICANTLY IMPROVE AFFORDABILITY FOR ALL
- 15 BAY AREA RESIDENTS. BRINGING DOWN THE SHARE OF HOUSING AND
- 16 TRANSPORTATION COSTS FOR AN AVERAGE HOUSEHOLD FROM 58% OF
- 17 HOUSEHOLD INCOME WHICH IS WELL ABOVE THE NATIONAL AVERAGE BY
- 18 13% POINTS. SIMILARLY WE WOULD SEE EVEN GREATER REDUCTIONS FOR
- 19 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLD MISS THIS SPACE. THE IMPLEMENTATION OF
- 20 THE PLAN WOULD MEDICATE AREA MORE CONNECTED BY ALL MODES OF
- 21 TRANSPORTATION WITH MORE FREQUENT AND SEAMLESS TRANSIT NETWORK
- 22 CONNECTING COMMUNITIES THOUSANDS OF MILES OF BICYCLE AND
- 23 PEDESTRIAN PATH ROUTES AND WITHIN 4 AND 5 NEW HOMES WITHIN
- 24 SHORT WALK OF FREQUENT TRANSIT USING SUSTAINABLE MODES.
- 25 PROVIDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN EXCLUSIONARY JURISDICTIONS AND



- 1 INCREASING CHOICES FOR HOUSING IN LOCATIONS ALLOWING DIVERSE
- 2 AND INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES. FAMILIES IS LOW-INCOMES MANY WHO
- 3 HAVE BEEN DISPLAYED TO THE NATION'S PERIPHERY WOULD ALLOW
- 4 OPPORTUNITY FOR RELOCATION IN AREAS RICH WITH TRANSIT SCHOOLS
- 5 AND PARKS INFRASTRUCTURE. THE PLAN MEETS THE STATE-MANDATED
- 6 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGET WHILE CURRENTLY PROTECTING
- 7 NEARLY ALL HOMES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE IMPACTS THROUGH 2050. THE
- 8 PLAN LOOKS TO MAKE THE BAY AREA MORE VIBRANT IMPROVING
- 9 JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE TO COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA
- 10 CREATING MORE JOBS IN HOUSING RICH COMMUNITIES AND NORTH AND
- 11 EAST BAY AND CREATING MORE HOMES IN JOB RICH COMMUNITIES IN
- 12 THE WEST. AND SOUTH BAY, YIELDING SHORTER COMMUTES FOR ALL
- 13 WORKERS. NEXT SLIDE. AS YOU MAY HAVE NOTICED FROM THE OVERVIEW
- 14 OF THE STRATEGIES, FUNDING, AND OUTCOMES THE CORE OF THE FINAL
- 15 PLANNED BAY AREA REMAINS THE SAME AS THE DRAFT THAT YOU SAW
- 16 THIS SUMMER. BUT THERE ARE MINOR UPDATES THAT REFINE
- 17 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME AS WELL AS RESPONSES AND REVISIONS TO THE
- 18 FINAL IN PUBLIC COMMENT SHARED IN AUGUST 2021. -- --
- 19 TRANSPORTATION PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES AND FUNDING LEVELS, FOR
- 20 EXAMPLE, THE SHARE OF TRIPS TAKEN BY EACH MODE OF
- 21 TRANSPORTATION DO HAVE SOME SLIGHT DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THE
- 22 DRAFT PLAN AND FINAL PLAN. THIS IS DRIVEN BY THREE MAIN
- 23 UPDATES. FIRST, WE MADE SOME MINOR TWEAKS TO STRATEGY FUNDING
- 24 LEVELS AS WELL AS CATEGORIZATION AS SPECIFIC TRANSPORTATION
- 25 PROJECTS NESTED WITHIN. MOST NOTABLE WAS STRATEGY EN EIGHT



- 1 RELATED TO ELECTRIC VEHICLES AND THEIR INFRASTRUCTURE AND
- 2 SUBSIDIES. IN THIS CASE, CARB, THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES
- 3 BOARD REQUIRED MTC AND ABAG TO GIVE THE STATE CREDIT FOR A
- 4 PORTION OF GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS COMING FROM REGIONAL
- 5 ELECTRIFICATION INVESTMENTS. IN RESPONSE TO THIS REQUEST,
- 6 STAFF SHIFTED MORE FUNDING FROM PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES
- 7 TOWARDS STRATEGY EN EIGHT TO OFFSET ANY POTENTIAL LOSSES FROM
- 8 THE STATE'S NEW REQUEST. THIS ENABLED THE STRATEGIES POSITIVE
- 9 IMPACTS TO REMAIN CONSTANT BETWEEN DRAFT AND FINAL. SECOND,
- 10 STAFF CORRECTED A TECHNICAL ISSUE IN THE TRAVEL DEMAND
- 11 MODELING THAT ASSUMED AN INCREASE IN VACATION, SICK, AND
- 12 PERSONAL DAYS TAKEN BY WORKERS IN 2050. SINCE THERE IS NO
- 13 STRATEGY IN THE PLAN TO MANDATE GREATER PAID TIME OFF FOR
- 14 WORKERS, STAFF -- SORRY -- FINAL PLAN MODELING MORE
- 15 CONSERVATIVELY ASSUMES THAT THIS EX-ORIGIN NEWS ASSUMPTION
- 16 REMAINS CONSTANT IN 2050 RESULT IS THAT WITH FEWER BAY AREA
- 17 RESIDENTS ABLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF EXTRA VACATION TIME
- 18 JETTING OFF TO REGIONS OUTSIDE OF REGION AND GENERATING
- 19 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IN THOSE PLACES INSTEAD THOSE
- 20 RESIDENTS INSTEAD CONTRIBUTE MORE EMISSIONS TO THE BAY AREA
- 21 THROUGH COMMUTE AND NON-COMMUTE TRIPS TAKEN ON DAYS THEY WOULD
- 22 OTHERWISE TAKE OFF. THE IMPACT OF 1 TO 2 GREENHOUSE PERCENTAGE
- 23 POINTS AFFECTS ALTERNATIVES ACROSS THE BOARD FROM THE NO
- 24 PROJECT AND PROPOSED PLAN TO EIR ALTERNATIVES 1 AND 2. LASTLY
- 25 STAFF FIXED CODING ERRORS FOR A HANDFUL OF TRANSPORTATION



- 1 PROJECTS BASED ON EXTERNAL FEEDBACK FROM OUR TRANSPORTATION
- 2 PARTNERS AND FINAL ROUND OF QUALITY CONTROL UPDATES RELATED TO
- 3 TRANSPORTATION MODELING NO CHANGES WERE MADE TO HOUSING AND
- 4 LAND USE PATTERNS REMAINS EXACTLY THE SAME AS IN JANUARY 2021.
- 5 NEXT SLIDE. MINOR UPDATES TO TRAVEL MODEL OUTPUTS WERE FOLDED
- 6 INTO THE ON FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT CLARIFYING
- 7 ANALYSIS FROM THE DRAFT RELEASED IN EARLY JUNE AND THE
- 8 ANALYSIS RESPONDING TO APPROXIMATELY 150 EIR RELATED COMMENTS
- 9 DURING THE COMMENT PERIOD IN A MANNER CONSISTENT WITH CEOA
- 10 REQUIREMENTS MANY COMMENTS RELATED TO A KEY ISSUE AREAS. WE
- 11 RESPONDED TO THESE FOR CONSISTENCY PURPOSES KNOWN AS WHAT ARE
- 12 MASTER RESPONSES. YOU WILL SEE EIGHT RESPONSES BELOW ON TOPICS
- 13 RANGING FROM COVID-19 FORECAST WATER SUPPLY ALTERNATIVES TO
- 14 SEA LEVEL RISE ABAG ROLES AND AUTHORITY FISCALLY CONSTRAINED
- 15 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND TRAVEL REFINEMENTS. A LINK HAS
- 16 BEEN PROVIDED AND IT'S AVAILABLE ON PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG EIR.
- 17 THREE KEY TAKEAWAYS IN CASE YOU DON'T WANT TO POUR THROUGHOUT
- 18 HUNDREDS OF PAGES IN THE FINAL EIR ISSUE FIRST NO NEW
- 19 SIGNIFICANT INFORMATION HAS BEEN ADDED INTO THE DRAFT EIR THAT
- 20 WARRANTS RECIRCULATION ALL REVISIONS REFINEMENTS TO COMMENTS
- 21 SERVE TO CLARIFY AND AMPLIFY PAST ANALYSIS. SECOND EIR DID NOT
- 22 IDENTIFY ANY NEW ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS RELATIVE TO THE DRAFT
- 23 AND THERE ARE NO SUBSTANTIAL INCREASES IN THE SEVERITY OF ANY
- 24 SIGNIFICANT IMPACT. IMPORTANTLY, EIR ALTERNATIVE ONE REMAINS
- 25 THE ENVIRONMENTALLY SUPERIOR ALTERNATIVE. AND, THIRD, THE



- 1 FINAL EIR DOES NOT MAKE A RECOMMENDATION ON WHICH ALTERNATIVE
- 2 TO ADVANCE. ULTIMATELY THE JOINT COMMITTEE OF THE MTC PLANNING
- 3 AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEES IN THE LAST WEEK
- 4 RECOMMENDING THAT THE PROPOSED PLAN MOVE FORWARD. AND THAT IS
- 5 SHAPING THE CEQA FINDINGS AND OVERRIDING CONSIDERATION FOR THE
- 6 OCTOBER 21ST JOINT MEETING OF THE COMMISSION AND ABAG BOARD.
- 7 NEXT SLIDE. AS WAS MENTIONED STAFF RECOMMENDED TO THE JOINT
- 8 PLANNING AND ADMIN COMMITTEE LAST WEEK THAT THE COMMISSION AND
- 9 BOARD CERTIFY THE FINAL EIR, AND STAFF RECOMMENDED THAT THE
- 10 JOINT PLANNING ADMIN COMMITTEE RECOMMEND THE PROPOSED PLAN AS
- 11 THE FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. KEY RATIONALE SHOWN ON THE
- 12 SCREEN HERE AND WE ARE CURRENTLY WEAVING THESE INTO THE CEOA
- 13 FINDINGS AND STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS WHICH
- 14 DEFINES SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC FACTORS THAT SUPPORT APPROVE OF
- 15 THE PROPOSED PLAN. REASONS INCLUDE THE FOLLOWING: FIRST THE
- 16 PROPOSE THE PLAN REFLECTS GREATER PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDER INPUT
- 17 THAN THE OTHER EIR ALTERNATIVES. STRATEGIES THAT DRIVE THE
- 18 PLAN ALL 35 OF THEM WERE GENERATED, ITERATED, REVIEWED BY THE
- 19 PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDERS AND REVISED CONTINUOUSLY FROM FUTURES
- 20 TO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. STRATEGIES IN
- 21 THE EIR ALTERNATIVES WERE IN RESPONSE RECEIVES DURING SCOPING
- 22 CONFLICTED WITH STAKEHOLDER AND PUBLIC INPUT RECEIVED EARLY IN
- 23 THE PLANNING PROCESS THIS INCLUDES DEFERMENT OF ALL FREEWAY
- 24 EXPANSION PROJECTS IN ALTERNATIVE, AND INCONSISTENT WITH VOTER
- 25 APPROVED COUNTY SALES TAX MEASURES AND INCLUSION OF OFFICE



- 1 DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES AND EIR ALTERNATIVE IN CONFLICT WITH
- 2 COMMISSION BOARD DIRECTION ECONOMICALLY STRATEGIES PROVIDED
- 3 THROUGHOUT THE ARE CAL GEAR YEAR 2020. AND STRESS TEST HORIZON
- 4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT PHASE AND IN CONTRAST TO THE
- 5 35 STRATEGIES THAT WERE HOPED AND REFINED TO MAXIMIZE
- 6 EFFICACY. THIRD, PROPOSES ALL FIVE GUIDING PRINCIPLES AT THE
- 7 START OF THE PLANNING PROCESS IN 2019 WHILE MEETING FEDERAL
- 8 AND STATE REQUIREMENTS. NOTABLY THE NO PROJECT ALTERNATIVE
- 9 FAILS TO MEET MOST OBJECTIVES AS WELL AS EIR ALTERNATIVE TWO
- 10 DOESN'T ADVANCE VIBRANT GUIDING PRINCIPLES AS EXACERBATES JOBS
- 11 HOUSING IMBALANCES. AND FINALLY PROPOSED PLAN IS BEST ADDITION
- 12 TO ADVANCE THE IMPLEMENTATION DUE TO THE BUY-IN STRATEGIES AND
- 13 EXTENSIVE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. WITH THE 35 STRATEGIES WILL
- 14 ENABLE MTC AND ABAG TO HIT THE GROUND RUNNING WITH
- 15 IMPLEMENTATION NEXT YEAR. WITH THE FINAL PLAN DOCUMENT AND
- 16 VARIOUS SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS THAT UNDERGIRD IT THIS COMPONENT
- 17 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT DESIGNED TO CLARIFY THE
- 18 PLAN TO RESPOND AND RECEIVED INCLUDED IN THE FINAL PLAN
- 19 DOCUMENT NEW AND INCLUDED SIDE BARS OF CRITICAL ISSUES LIKE
- 20 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE'S WORK AS WELL AS
- 21 CONTACTS HIGHLIGHTING HOW COVID-19 WAS INTEGRATED INTO THE
- 22 PLAN IN 2020 AND 2021, INCLUDING IMPORTANT ISSUES LIKE PARKS,
- 23 RECREATION CONSERVATION AS WELL AS COMPREHENSIVE LOOK AT
- 24 EXPRESS BUS FUNDED STRATEGIES AND ADDITIONAL CLARITY ADDED TO
- 25 KEY ISSUES, MORE REFLECTION ON DISABLED AND ELDERLY IN EACH



- 1 ELEMENT OF THE PLAN CHAPTERS. LAST BUT NOT LEAST WE'LL TURN TO
- 2 THE FINAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND HOW MTC AND ABAG CAN PIVOT
- 3 FROM THIS FOUR YEAR LONG PLANNING EFFORT TO THE FOUR EFFORTS
- 4 IMPLEMENTED. STAFF PROVIDED A PREVIEW OF THE FINAL
- 5 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IN EARLY SEPTEMBER, AND NOW WE HAVE WOVEN
- 6 THAT INTO THE FINAL CHAPTER OF THE 2050 DOCUMENT. THE
- 7 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WAS A MORE FOCUSED EFFORT THAT LASTED
- 8 THROUGH THE FINAL YEAR OF THE PROCESS. THE PARTNERSHIP PHASE
- 9 TOOK PLACE THIS SUMMER AND THAT LEAD TO SIZABLE REVISIONS TO
- 10 INTEGRATE STAKEHOLDER AND PUBLIC FEEDBACK BETWEEN DRAFT AND
- 11 FINAL IN CONTRAST TO MOST OTHER SPECKS OF PLANNED BAY AREA
- 12 2050. THE 80 PLUS ACTIONS IN THE FINAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN
- 13 PROVIDED ADDITIONAL SPECIFICITY ON HOW MTC AND ABAG WILL PLAY
- 14 A ROLE IN THE NEAR-TERM INCLUDING GENERAL TIME FRAMES AND
- 15 WHETHER A LEAD, PARTNER OR SUPPORT APPROACH IS MOST
- 16 APPROPRIATE. THE PLAN ACKNOWLEDGES MANY OF THE POTENTIAL
- 17 PARTNERS THAT WILL BE ESSENTIAL TO REALIZING THE PLAN'S WIDE
- 18 RANGING VISION WITH EXPANDED REFLECTIONS ON THE ROLES THAT
- 19 IMPORTANT LABOR ORGANIZATIONS CAN PLAY. WE'RE NOT GOING TO RUN
- 20 THROUGH ALL ACTIONS TODAY, WE WANT TO GIVE YOU A FLAVOR OF
- 21 WHAT'S NEXT IN 2022, SPECIFICALLY, WHEN IT COMES TO
- 22 IMPLEMENTING EACH ELEMENT OF THE PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. STARTING
- 23 WITH HOUSING. THERE IS A LOT GOING ON IN THE REGIONAL HOUSING
- 24 SPACE RIGHT NOW AS WE WORK TO ASSIST LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WITH
- 25 THE UPDATE OF IMPORTANT HOUSING ELEMENTS. GOING INTO 2022



- 1 WE'RE GOING TO DO WORK TO ADVANCE THE EXPANDED REGIONAL
- 2 HOUSING PORTFOLIO WHICH WILL ENABLE MTC AND ABAG TO MAKE
- 3 PROGRESS ON A REGIONAL HOMELESSNESS PREVENTION SYSTEM THE
- 4 DOORWAY OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING PLATFORM AND MORE. AND TRANSIENT
- 5 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT POLICY UPDATE WILL FORWARD WITH GUIDANCE
- 6 FOR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ON CRITICAL LAND USE AND TRANSIT
- 7 CONNECTIONS. 2022 PROVIDES OPPORTUNITIES FOR MTC AND ABAG TO
- 8 WORK WITH PARTNERS TO ACCELERATE REGIONAL ECONOMIC RECOVERY
- 9 AND WITH PROGRAMS LIKE ONE BAY AREA GRANT CYCLE THREE AND REAP
- 10 2.0, THESE ARE PRESENT OPPORTUNITIES TO POTENTIAL FUND WORK ON
- 11 THE PILOT PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREA PROGRAMS AND IT'S A WINDOW
- 12 TO UPDATE OUR AGENCY'S ADVOCACY PLATFORM TO REFLECT EMERGING
- 13 ECONOMIC PRIORITIES. AND OPPORTUNITY TO PROGRESSION BAY AREA
- 14 TRANSIT FOR SUCCESS IN YEARS AHEAD AND BLUE RIBBON
- 15 IMPLEMENTATION FURTHER PROGRESS ON THE PROJECT INVOLVEMENT AND
- 16 COMPLETION AND FARE COORDINATION STUDY ALL PLAY A ROLE HERE.
- 17 SEX IN GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY WILL KICKOFF IN 2022 AND THAT
- 18 WILL INVOLVE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT TO FURTHER EXPLORE TO
- 19 TRANSFORM THE REGION'S 20TH INDUSTRY FREEWAY NETWORK WITH
- 20 EQUITABLE PRICING AS WELL AS A KEY PIECE OF THE PUZZLE. NEXT
- 21 SLIDE. IN 202022 BEYOND SEA LEVEL RISE AND FUNDING INVESTMENT
- 22 STRATEGIES SPECIFICALLY IDENTIFIED IN PRIORITY PLAN BAY AREA
- 23 2050 AM BCDC PROGRAM IS GOING TO KICKOFF REFINED SHORELINE
- 24 SOLUTIONS ENVISIONED IN THE PLAN WHILE EXPLORING FUNDING
- 25 SOURCES IN THIS SPACE AND AIR DISTRICT PARTNERS NEXT YEAR TO



- 1 ACCELERATE IMPLEMENTATION CRITICAL CLIMATE STRATEGIES FROM
- 2 SUSTAINABLE COMMUTES AND STRATEGIES EN7 AND INCREASED ELECTRIC
- 3 VEHICLE SUBSIDIES AND MARKETING THAT ARE ACCEPT AND ESSENTIAL
- 4 TO MEET THE GREENHOUSE TARGET. HELPING TO BRING THE LONG RANGE
- 5 PLAN TO LIFE THAT YOU HAVE SEEN SHAPED OVER THE PAST FOUR
- 6 YEARS. THOUSANDS OF RESIDENTS HAVE CHIMED IN DURING THE
- 7 CREATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO
- 8 CONTINUE ENGAGING THEM DEEPLY IN IMPLEMENTATION ALL
- 9 ACTIVITIES. WITH A COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL VISION IT'S GOING TO
- 10 REOUIRE DELIBERATE AND SUSTAINED PARTNERSHIP AND BY FOCUSING
- 11 ON PARTNERSHIP WE BELIEVE THAT MTC AND ABAG CAN MAKE
- 12 MEANINGFUL PROGRESS ON THE BOLD 30 YEAR STRATEGIES LAID OUT IN
- 13 THIS REGIONAL PLAN IN THE MONTHS AND YEARS AHEAD. NEXT SLIDE.
- 14 BEFORE WE MAKE THIS TRANSITION TO 2022, WE ARE ASKING THAT THE
- 15 COMMISSION AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, NEXT WEEK, ADOPT
- 16 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO SERVE AS THE OFFICIAL REGIONAL PLAN.
- 17 AS YOU CAN SEE ON SCREEN, WE'LL BE BRINGING FORWARD SIX
- 18 RESOLUTIONS TO MTC AND ABAG. THESE INCLUDE THE AIR OUALITY
- 19 CONFORMITY ANALYSIS, THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT, THE
- 20 FINAL PLAN ITSELF, AND THE 2021 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT
- 21 PROGRAM WHICH SYNCS UP OUR NEAR-TERM TRANSPORTATION
- 22 INVESTMENTS WITH THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT IN PLANNED BAY
- 23 AREA 2050. LASTLY, I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO ALL OF THE
- 24 COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO HAVE PLAYED A KEY ROLE IN INFORMING AND
- 25 SHAPING IN PLAN OVER MULTIPLE YEARS WE APPRECIATE ALL OF YOUR



TIME, EFFORT, AND INPUT, AND I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS 1 2 AT THIS TIME. 3 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH DAVE. THAT 4 5 WAS AN AMAZING WRAP UP OF COORDINATE WORK OVER A YEAR LONG. THANK YOU TO ALL OF WHO YOU PLAYED A PART. WE ARE EXCITED IT 6 GOES TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL NEXT WEEK. DO WE HAVE 7 8 QUESTIONS. FRANK, I SEE YOU HAVE A HAND UP. PLEASE BEGIN. 9 SPEAKER: TWO QUESTIONS. FIRST OF ALL, CAN YOU SPEAK TO 10 11 SPECIFIC CHANGES THAT HAVE BEEN MADE IN THE FINAL PLAN TO ADDRESS CONCERNS REGARDING PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES? AND THEN 12 MY SECOND OUESTION IS, WHAT ROLE CAN THE -- THE POLICY 13 ADVISORY COUNCIL PLAY IN TERMS OF THE SUCCESSFUL 14 15 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PLAN? >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS FRANK. FOR 16 YOUR FIRST QUESTION I'M GOING TURN IT OVER TO RALEIGH MCCOY WHO LED THE PLAN DOCUMENT FOR THOSE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS. 17 18 RALEIGH MCCOY: JUST TWO THINGS TO NOTE, ONE, WE CLARIFIED SOME 19 LANGUAGE IN HOW THE STRATEGIES OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WOULD 20 21 BENEFIT PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES SUCH AS TRYING TO BE MORE CLEAR WHEN TALKING ABOUT OUR PARK STRATEGY AND HOW 22 MODERNIZATION TO ENSURE BETTER ACCESSIBILITY WAS AN ELEMENT 23 AND CLARITY ON THE FOUR CHAPTERS, HOUSING ECONOMY ENVIRONMENT 24 AND TRANSIT THE STATEMENT WITHIN THE GOALS MADE REALLY CLEAR 25



THE IMPORTANCE OF IMPROVING ACCESSIBILITY FOR PEOPLE WITH 1 DISABILITIES IN EACH OF THOSE FOUR ELEMENTS. >DAVE VAUTIN: 2 3 CONTINUING TO INFORM A MAJOR ROLE IN OUR IMPLEMENTATION WORK AS WE MOVE INTO 2022. AS I MENTIONED IN MY PRESENTATION, THERE 4 5 ARE 80 PLUS NEAR-TERM ACTIONS INN VISIONED COMING OUT OF THIS PLAN NOT ALL MOVING FORWARD IN THE NEXT COUPLE EVER MONTHS BUT 6 ENVISIONED OVER THE COMING YEARS A LOT OF THEM ARE GOING TO 7 8 REQUIRE DELIBERATION AND INPUT. WHAT YOU CAN SPECK AS A MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS WE SPENT A LOT OF TIME 9 BRINGING UPDATES TO ALL OF YOU IN PLAN 2050 FOR FOUR YEARS 10 NOW, GOING INTO 2022, WE WILL MAKE A MORE DIVERSE SET OF 11 IMPLEMENTATION INITIATIVES WHETHER THAT'S THE WORK ON THE NEXT 12 GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY OR SOME OF THE TRANSIT IMPLEMENTATION 13 WORK THAT'S ONGOING WITH BLUE RIBBON, THERE WILL BE REALLY A 14 15 BROADER SUITE OF NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES THAT WILL 16 COME FORWARD BEFORE THE COUNCIL. AND WE'LL BE LOOKING FORWARD TO YOUR INPUT TO HELP SHAPE EACH OF THOSE OF INDIVIDUAL 17 EFFORTS COMING OUT OF THIS LONG RANGE PLAN. 18 19 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, RICH 20 21 HEDGES, AND THEN VEDA. 22 RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU, DAVE, THIS HAS BEEN A LOT OF WORK 23

FOR YOU GUYS. TAKE A VICTORY LAP. IT LOOKS PRETTY GOOD. I HAVE

SOME DETAILED QUESTIONS FOR YOU. COULD YOU BE MORE SPECIFIC

24



- 1 ABOUT UPDATES TO THE TOD PART OF THE PLAN, AND THE SECOND ONE,
- 2 THAT MOVED JOBS AWAY FROM SILICON VALLEY, BUT I THINK IT WAS
- 3 LESS INCREDIBLE TO THE ENVIRONMENT. IF YOU COULD JOG MY MEMORY
- 4 ON THAT PART OF THE PLAN I WOULD APPRECIATE IT. AND WHAT THE
- 5 FINAL DECISION WAS. SO AGAIN, MORE DETAIL ON THE CHANGES TO
- 6 THE TOD ISSUE, AND THE MODERNIZATION TO THE TOD PROGRAM, AS
- 7 WELL. THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: LET ME TAKE YOUR SECOND
- 8 QUESTION FIRST. FIRST OF ALL, THANKS RICH. AND I THINK FOR THE
- 9 FIRST PART ON THE TOD POLICY, I'M GOING TO PASS IT ALONG TO.

- 11 MATT MALONEY: OUR PLANNING DIRECTOR. BUT ON YOUR SECOND
- 12 QUESTION ABOUT WHERE WE LANDED IN TERMS OF LOCATION OF JOBS
- 13 AND THE STRATEGIES ON THAT FRONT, YOU KNOW, IN 202020, YOU
- 14 KNOW, THERE WAS WE REALLY STARTED THE YEAR OVER THE DEBATE, IN
- 15 A RANGE OF ECONOMIC STRATEGIES YOU WILL RECALL THE WORKSHOP IN
- 16 DUBLIN, BEFORE COVID-19 IN SPECTRUM OF LOCATION OF JOBS AND
- 17 HOUSING AT THE TIME THERE WAS DIRECTION NOT TO PURSUE OFFICE
- 18 DEVELOPMENT CAPS BUT WE INCLUDED A FEE BASED STRATEGY. AS
- 19 COVID HIT WE HEARD PEOPLE WANTED TO MOVE TOWARD A BASED
- 20 APPROACH TO INCENTIVIZE TO ENCOURAGE JOBS CLOSER TO HOUSING.
- 21 STATE MANDATE DIDN'T TARGET GREENHOUSE GAS BUT THE FINAL
- 22 BLUEPRINT DID. IT'S TAKING ON A THIRD OF THE REGION'S FUTURE
- 23 HOUSING GROWTH A THIRD OF FUTURE JOB GROWTH SO IT STILL
- 24 REMAINS A MAGNET FOR JOBS AND HOUSING IN THE FINAL PLAN. GOING
- 25 THROUGH THAT PROCESS WE WERE ABLE TO INTEGRATE A MIDDLE GROUND



- 1 IN TERMS OF STRATEGIES IN TERMS OF LOCATION AND JOBS AND
- 2 LOCATION OF HOUSING AND THE ULTIMATE PLAN AS A RESULT WAS
- 3 MEETING GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS TRYING TO FIND THAT RIGHT
- 4 BALANCE.

5

- 6 RICHARD HEDGES: BIOTECH ARE LANDING IN SAN CARLOS NOW. THE
- 7 HAVE RUN OUT OF ROOM IN SOUTH CITY. THERE IS HUGE DEVELOPMENTS
- 8 PLANNING AND SHORE DEVELOPMENT AND THE CITY IS ENCOURAGING IT.

9

10 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: VEDA?

11

12 RICHARD HEDGES: ARE WE GOING TO GET SOME ISSUES ON IT. ON TOD?

- 14 MATT MALONEY: MATT MALONEY DIRECTOR OF REGIONAL PLANNING. AS
- 15 YOU KNOW, RICH, WE HAVE A TOD POLICY ON THE BOOKS, WHICH HELPS
- 16 THE AGENCY, HELPS GUIDE DISCRETIONARY INVESTMENTS.
- 17 HISTORICALLY THAT'S BEEN USED FOR NEW, SORT OF, BIG HEAVY RAIL
- 18 PROJECTS, RAIL EXCEPTIONS, THINGS LIKE THAT. WE ARE, AT THE
- 19 MOMENT, PREPARING AN UPDATE OF THAT POLICY, A TOD POLICY
- 20 UPDATE WHICH IS IN THE WORKS WE WENT TO THE COMMISSION TO
- 21 DISCUSS THAT ONCE WE'LL BE GOING AGAIN PRETTY SOON AND WE LOOK
- 22 TO MAKE CHANGES TO THAT POLICY LIKELY LOOKING MORE AT EXISTING
- 23 CORRIDORS, AND STATIONARIES. SO MAYBE NOT JUST NEW
- 24 INVESTMENTS, BUT ALSO LOOKING AT EXISTING CORRIDORS IN TERMS
- 25 OF WHAT WE CAN DO. AND ALSO THE RHNA NUMBERS ARE HIGHER. ALL



- 1 OF THE HOUSING NUMBERS ARE HIGHER, AND WE JUST NEED TO KEEP
- 2 PACE WITH OUR TOD POLICY, AS WELL. SO THAT'S KIND OF WHAT THAT
- 3 UPDATE IS ABOUT, AND IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS, WE'LL COME TO THE
- 4 COUNCIL AND PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THAT, AS WELL.

5

- 6 RICHARD HEDGES: WE HAVE USED IT PRETTY EFFECTIVELY IN SAN
- 7 MATEO, THE OLD POLICY WE HAVE ABOUT 3,000 UNITS BETWEEN HILLS
- 8 DALE AND HAYWARD PARK.

9

10 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. VEDA?

- 12 VEDA FLOREZ: I DO WANT TO GIVE YOU, DAVE, AND TEAM, AND THE
- 13 REST OF MTC, AND MATT, A PAT ON THE BACK, THIS HAS BEEN AN
- 14 AMAZING FEAT FOR THE LAST FOUR YEARS FOR YOUR WORK THROUGH ALL
- 15 OF THE DETAILS AND BRINGING US THIS INFORMATION EVERY STEP OF
- 16 THE WAY. THE HOPE FOR THE FUTURE FOR THE PUBLIC ADVISORY
- 17 COUNCIL IS YOU RELY ON US A LITTLE BIT MORE. WE SPEND A LOT OF
- 18 TIME GOING TO MEETINGS, NOT JUST THREE A MONTH, BUT MANY TIMES
- 19 CLOSER TO 5, 6, 7, 8, AS WE GOT CLOSER AND THROUGH COVID, YOU
- 20 CAN RELY ON US AS A TRUSTED MESSAGE IN THE EQUITY SPACE NOT
- 21 ONLY TAKING OUR ADVICE ON WHO TO OUTREACH TO BUT LETTING US
- 22 MAKE THAT PHONE CALL FOR INCREASED PARTICIPATION IN COMMUNITY.
- 23 THAT'S MY COMMENT. AND MY SECOND QUESTION S ARE YOU PLANNING
- 24 ON MORE PAPERS IN THE FUTURE? THAT TURNED OUT TO BE A GREAT
- 25 RESOURCE AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S PLANNED INTO THE FUTURE



- 1 FOR THE NEXT FOUR YEARS. IT MADE A BIG DIFFERENCE IN MY
- 2 COMMUNITY, AND I HAVE USED THEM MYSELF, SO I AM EAGER TO SEE
- 3 MORE OF THE PAPERS AND THE PRESENTATIONS ON THE PAPERS. THANK
- 4 YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS FOR THOSE COMMENTS. WE'RE ALWAYS
- 5 TRYING TO AMP UP OUR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT WORK. AND I THINK WE
- 6 HAVE DONE A LOT THIS CYCLE IN TERMS OF INCREASING
- 7 PARTICIPATION, AND WE'RE EAGER TO DO EVEN MORE GOING FORWARD.
- 8 I CERTAINLY THINK YOU WILL SEE MORE REPORTS, AND WHITE PAPERS
- 9 PRESENTATIONS FROM US, AS SOON AS NEXT YEAR. WE HAVE GOT A LOT
- 10 ON OUR PLATE IN TERMS OF WHAT I DISCUSSED DIGGING IN AND
- 11 TRANSIT HOUSING IMPLEMENTATION AND PRICING AND SEA LEVEL RISE,
- 12 AND I AM SURE YOU WILL SEE A WHOLE NEW SUITE AS WE PIVOT OUR
- 13 FOCUS FROM 30 YEARS INTO THE FUTURE TOWARDS THE NEXT YEAR OR
- 14 TWO AND DELIVERING FOR THE REGION.

15

16 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. ADINA?

- 18 ADINA LEVIN: HI. YES, I WANTED TO THANK AND CONGRATULATE STAFF
- 19 FOR TAKING THIS BIG PROGRAM UP TO THIS POINT. I HAVE A FAIRLY
- 20 SPECIFIC QUESTION THAT IS COMING OUT OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF
- 21 THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AND THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
- 22 RECOVERY. AND THAT HAS TO DO WITH ONE OF THE SHORT-TERM
- 23 RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH IS A GO ANYWHERE TRANSIT PASS. THE IDEA
- 24 THAT YOU CAN HAVE AN ORGANIZATIONAL PASS THAT SERVES COLLEGES
- 25 THAT, SERVES HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS, THAT SERVES -- I JUST



LEARNED THAT THERE IS A UNION IN OAKLAND THAT GIVES OUT AC 1 TRANSIT PASSES TO THE UNION WORKERS, AND, YOU KNOW, WHAT IF 2 3 THEY BECAME A CUSTOMER FOR A GO ANYWHERE TRANSIT PASS. SO THIS SEEMS TO OPEN THE DOOR FOR POTENTIAL EQUITY BENEFITS AND ALSO 4 5 NEW POTENTIAL AND DIFFERENT FUNDING SOURCES TO IMPLEMENT THE USE OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND GIVE MORE MOBILITY. AND IF 6 THE, KIND OF THE MORE FAMILIAR KIND OF TRANSIT PASSES MORE 7 8 ALONG THE LINES OF WHAT A GO PASSES MORE ALONG THE LINES OF A GO PASS, LIKE WHAT SEATTLE DOES THAT SERVES FULL-TIME 9 EMPLOYEES WITH MAJOR CORPORATIONS THAT HAS EQUITY CHALLENGES 10 BUT THERE IS ALSO IMPLEMENTATION OPTIONS THAT WOULD HAVE 11 EOUITY BENEFITS THAT WOULD SEEM TO FIT REALLY WELL WITH A 12 BUNCH OF DIRECTIONS WITH PLANNED BAY AREA. SO WITH THAT REALLY 13 LONG PREAMBLE, WHERE WOULD THAT LIVE? WITH THE IMPLEMENTATION 14 15 OF THAT STRATEGY WHERE WOULD IT LIVE TO BE ABLE TO FLUSH OUT 16 THE IDEAS AND MOVING THAT PILOT FORWARD AND PURSUING THE AREAS OF POTENTIAL PROMISE IN IT? >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS ADINA. THIS 17 IS SPECIFICALLY AN AREA THAT WE TOUCH ON IN THE IMPLEMENTATION 18 PLAN THROUGH THE INTEGRATION OF THE BLUE RIBBON ACTION PLAN 19 INTO THE BROADER REGIONAL PLAN. I WANT TO TURN IT OVER TO 20 21 CHIRAG R WHO LED THAT EFFORT TO SPEAK MORE ABOUT THIS. 22 CHIRAG RABARI: I WOULD SAY FOR THESE EARLY ACTION AREAS WHAT 23 WE TRIED TO DO IS LINE UP WHERE THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE WITH 24 SOME OF THE KEY STRATEGIES. SO, IN THE CASE OF THE FARE 25



- 1 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY, THIS IS NESTED AROUND OUR
- 2 IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS STRATEGIES T THREE AS WELL AS
- 3 STRATEGIES T FOUR IN LIEU OF MAKING VERY SPECIFIC
- 4 RECOMMENDATIONS, WE DID -- WE BASICALLY SAID, BROADLY, THAT WE
- 5 WANT TO IMPLEMENT THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT COME OUT OF THIS
- 6 EFFORT. AND, FUND SPECIFIC PILOT PROJECTS OVER THE NEXT YEAR.
- 7 SO I THINK WE REALLY WANT TO ALIGN WITH AND MAP TO THE
- 8 SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE COMING OUT OF THOSE EFFORTS,
- 9 INSTEAD OF REINVENTING THE WHEEL AND COMING UP WITH A WHOLE
- 10 NEW SET OF RECOMMENDATIONS. SO WE WILL BE LOOKING TO ALIGN
- 11 WITH THOSE AREAS, AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE.
- 13 ADINA LEVIN: WHO IS THAT WITHIN A DEPARTMENT. WOULD THAN MTC
- 14 WORKING ON THE NEXT STEPS OF THAT?
- 16 ALIX BOCKELMAN: THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF
- 17 MTC, I WOULD NOTE, THE WAY WOULD ANSWER YOUR QUESTION IS
- 18 OBVIOUSLY THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE COMING OUT OF BLUE
- 19 RIBBON ARE VERY IMPORTANT TO THE COMMISSIONERS AND IN FACT THE
- 20 CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION IS HOSTING A WORKSHOP AT THE END OF
- 21 THIS MONTH OCTOBER 27TH AND 28TH, TO DRILL DOWN INTO THE
- 22 ACTION OF THE PLAN AND IN PARTICULARLY THREE ACCELERATED
- 23 ACTIONS TO FOCUS ON, ONE OF THEM BEING FARE INTEGRATION AND
- 24 POLICY GOING TO TALK ABOUT NEXT STEPS AND HOW TO MOVE THAT
- 25 FORWARD AND WHICH MTC COMMITTEES WOULD BE THE APPROPRIATE VEND

12



USE TO TAKE UP AND FOLLOW UP ACTIONS ON THOSE. SO STAY TUNED 1 FOR UPCOMING WORKSHOPS THAT WILL SHED ADDITIONAL LIGHT ON NEXT 2 3 STEPS. 4 5 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. MOVING TO CHRISTINA. 6 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: THANK YOU, DAVE, AND TEAM FOR ALL OF THE 7 8 WORK ON THIS REPORT. I'M NOT SURE IF THE PUBLIC COMMENTS WERE ATTACHED TO THIS ITEM? BUT I BELIEVE THEY WERE. 9 10 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THAT NEXT. 11 12 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: IT WAS ATTACHED, UNDER CORRESPONDENCE 13 14 RECEIVED. 15 16 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: I WANT TO LIFT UP TWO OF THEM, ONE OF THEM WAS A REMINDER WHICH IS THAT ANYTHING THAT'S PER MILE, EXPRESS 17 LANE, TOLLING, AND I WOULD EVEN ARGUE ZONE-BASED FARES KIND OF 18 HARMS THOSE WHO HAVE BEEN DISPLACED OR PUSHED OUT AND HAVING 19 MOVED OUT TO MOUNTAIN HOUSE, MODESTO AND CENTRAL VALLEY AND 20 STILL HAVE A COMMUTE INTO THE BAY AREA FOR THEIR JOBS JUST A 21 22 CONSIDERATION ON THAT COMMENT. AND SOMEONE MENTIONED WAIVING 23 PARKING FEES WHERE I HAD AN EXPERIENCE AT THE BEGINNING OF THE PANDEMIC WHERE I HAD MY CAR BUT NO PARKING SPOT BECAUSE I WAS 24

FORMERLY USING IT TO GO TO WORK. AND FOR A WHILE THE CITY WAS



- 1 WAIVING THE PERMITTING AND THE RESTRICTIONS ON LEAVING YOUR
- 2 CAR PARKED FOR A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF TIME, I'M NOT SURE WHAT ALL
- 3 OF THE JURISDICTIONS ARE DOING BUT SOME WHO ARE POTENTIALLY
- 4 STILL WORKING FROM HOME AND DON'T WANT HAVE A WAY TO GET RID
- 5 OF THEIR CAR IN THE NEAR-TERM, WOULD STILL NEED THAT KIND OF
- 6 CONSIDERATION. THANKS.

7

- 8 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: DAVE, DID YOU WANT TO RESPOND
- 9 TO THAT? >DAVE VAUTIN: NO. I THINK THE POINT IS WELL TAKEN ON
- 10 BOTH OF THOSE FRONTS. I'LL SAY ON THE PRICING, WE TOOK GREAT
- 11 CARE IN TERMS REVISING THAT STRATEGIES OVER AND OVER TO THE
- 12 EQUITY POINT AND ASPECTS WHERE WE ABLE TO MINIMIZE THOSE SORTS
- 13 OF IMPACTS. OBVIOUSLY THERE ARE FOLKS WHO LIVE AT
- 14 [INDISCERNIBLE] WHO ARE WEALTHY AND THOSE WHO ARE LOW-INCOME
- 15 WHO WOULD END UP PAYING MORE UNDER THAT FUNDING SCHEME HOWEVER
- 16 WE WOULD ABLE TO AFFECT INVESTMENTS TOWARDS ADVANCING EQUITY.
- 17 IT'S REALLY ABOUT THE PACKAGE NOT JUST ABOUT PRICING. AND
- 18 THAT'S WHAT THE NEXT GENERATION IS GOING TO LOOK AT IF WE'RE
- 19 GOING TO MOVE FORWARD WITH PRICING CORRIDORS HOW CAN WE REPAIR
- 20 THE HARMS AND TURN INTO MULTI-MODAL GREEN EQUITABLE CORRIDORS
- 21 IN THE REGION. THIS'S GOING TO BE A BIG CHALLENGE. WE NEED TO
- 22 MOVE EQUITY FRONT AND CENTER AND REPAIR HARM THAT WAS DONE IN
- 23 THE LAST INDUSTRY. WE LOOK FORWARD TO DISCUSSIONS IT'S GOING
- 24 TO BE A BIG PRIORITY IN 2022.



- 1 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: IN MUNI THEY HAVE A ONE TICKET SYSTEM FOR
- 2 TRAINS WHERE ONE PERSON FARE COST A CERTAIN AMOUNT AND THE
- 3 REST OF THE TICKET CAN BE FOR A 225 PERSON CHAIR AND THAT'S
- 4 SET AMOUNT, IT EQUALIZE LARGER GROUPS, TRAVELING AS A FAMILY
- 5 AND WHILE STILL LEAVING THE ONE PERSON CAPTURING APPROPRIATE
- 6 FARE. THANK YOU.

7

- 8 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: ANNE OLIVIA. IF THERE ARE ANY
- 9 OTHER SPEAKERS PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. GO AHEAD.

- 11 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU. MY COMMENT HAS JUST CHANGED
- 12 BASED ON WHAT WAS JUST SAID. SO, I THINK IT'S GREAT THAT
- 13 REVENUES CAN BE USED IN THE FUTURE TO ADDRESS HISTORIC HARMS.
- 14 AND I REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING PROPOSALS FOR DOING THAT.
- 15 AND I -- THINKING REALLY CAREFULLY HERE. AND I THINK IT IS
- 16 GOING TO BE ESSENTIAL THAT WE STOP CHOOSING WORDS OUITE AS
- 17 CAREFULLY IN CERTAIN AREAS. CERTAIN POLICIES ARE RACIST. AND
- 18 TOOLS IN ANY FORM BASED ON MILES TRAVELED ARE DISCRIMINATORY.
- 19 AND WE DO NOT HAVE THE LUXURY OF GETTING ALL THE THINGS THAT
- 20 WE WANT, ESPECIALLY IMMEDIATELY, ALL AT ONCE, STARTING TODAY.
- 21 WE KNOW THAT. BUT I THINK WE NEED TO BE REALLY, REALLY CLEAR
- 22 ABOUT, THAT IS HARM, AND IT IS DISPROPORTIONATE HARM, AND IN
- 23 THE FUTURE WE HOPE WE DO BETTER, AND WE USE THESE FUNDS THIS'S
- 24 GREAT. BEING REALLY CLEAR AROUND THAT LANGUAGE IS IMPORTANT. I
- 25 HAVE COMPLETED A CLASS IN ENVIRONMENTAL LAW SCHOOL, AND JUST



- 1 FINISHING, IT'S GREAT. AND WE HAD TO DO EXTENSIVE STUDY ON
- 2 LAND USE POLICY AND RACISM, AND THINGS LIKE SINGLE HOME ZONING
- 3 IS WHAT WAS THE EVOLUTION OF ATTEMPTING TO KEEP REDLINING. SO,
- 4 LIKE, THERE IS REALLY -- THERE IS REALLY BIG ISSUES AT STAKE
- 5 HERE, AND IS NOT GLOSSING OVER OR USING PRETTY LANGUAGE, OR
- 6 ANYTHING ELSE, TO, LIKE, DIMINISH HOW HARMFUL SOME THINGS ARE
- 7 TO CERTAIN POPULATIONS. AND I HAVE SEEN A HUGE AMOUNT OF WORK,
- 8 AND I AM DEEPLY IMPRESSED BY THE STAFF AND THE EVOLUTION OF
- 9 THIS DOCUMENT, AND I REALLY WANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT, BUT,
- 10 HOPING TO RAISE MONEY TO ADDRESS HARMS IN THE FUTURE ARE GOING
- 11 TO REQUIRE REALLY BOLD CURRENT ACTION TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT
- 12 INEVITABLE HARM OF DISCRETIONARY ACTIONS THEY'RE NOT IDEAL AND
- 13 NOT WHAT WE WANTED THEY'RE THING WE MAY CHOOSE TO ADDRESS. AND
- 14 I WANT TO BE CLEAR YOU GUYS HAVE DONE A PHENOMENON JOB. YOU
- 15 HAVE BEEN IMPRESSIVE SUPER RESPONSE I AND I WANT TO RECOGNIZE
- 16 THAT. THANK YOU.

17

18 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU.

19

- 20 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: AND I DON'T REMEMBER WHAT MY ORIGINAL
- 21 COMMENT WAS. I'LL END THERE.

- 23 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: YOU CAN E-MAIL STAFF PERSON
- 24 WHEN YOU THINK OF IT. I ADOPT SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS. I
- 25 HAVE ONE FINAL QUESTION DAVE YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT THE RHNA



- 1 NUMBERS AND I AM HEARING CONFLICTING INFORMATION ON WHEN YOU
- 2 ARE DOING THE HOUSING ELEMENTS IF YOU DON'T HIT YOUR RHNA
- 3 NUMBERS AND YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT, YOU COULD LOSE YOUR
- 4 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING. IS THAT TRUE?

5

- 6 DAVE VAUTIN: THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. YOU KNOW, THERE ARE
- 7 IMPLICATIONS FOR JURISDICTIONS IF THEY DO NOT -- IF THEY
- 8 ACTIVELY DO NOT PLAN FOR THE UNITS THAT ARE ASSIGNED TO THEM,
- 9 THEY CAN BE EXPOSING THEMSELVES TO LITIGATION FROM THE STATE
- 10 OF CALIFORNIA. WE DO HAVE MORE INFORMATION IN TERMS OF PASSING
- 11 ALONG THE IMPLICATIONS OF NOT FORWARD WITH THOSE RHNA
- 12 ALLOCATIONS THROUGH THE HOUSING ELEMENT PROCESS. THERE ARE
- 13 ALSO IMPLICATIONS WITHIN THE HOUSING SPACE, WITH REGARDS TO
- 14 LAWS, SB35, IF YOU ARE NOT PRODUCING AND MAKE PROGRESS ON YOUR
- 15 HOUSING WILL THAT TRIGGER GREATER FLEXIBILITY FOR FUTURE
- 16 DEVELOPMENT. IT MAKES IT EASIER FOR A NEW DEVELOPMENT TO MOVE
- 17 FORWARD. I'M NOT AWARE OF A TRANSPORTATION IMPACT, OTHER THAN
- 18 OUR O BAG PROGRAM, I BELIEVE, HAS A REQUIREMENT THAT YOU HAVE
- 19 A CERTIFIED HOUSING ELEMENT. BUT BEYOND -- AND WE DO HAVE SOME
- 20 PROVISIONS IN OBAG CYCLE TWO THAT REFLECT HOUSING, PLANNING,
- 21 AND PRODUCTION. BUT I WOULDN'T DESCRIBE THAT AS LOSING ACCESS
- 22 TO ALL TRANSPORTATION FUNDS IF YOU'RE NOT PRODUCING YOUR RHNA,
- 23 FOR EXAMPLE.



- 1 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: IN THE DISAPPOINTING NEGOTIATE
- 2 BAY WHICH IS APPEALING A BUNCH OF THE RHNA NUMBERS SAYING THIS
- 3 IS UNFAIR BECAUSE WE WILL LOSE OUR TRANSPORTATION MONEY IF WE
- 4 DON'T HIT THESE NUMBERS. IF THERE IS ANYBODY WHO COULD HELP ME
- 5 DISPEL THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO GET THAT OFF THE TABLE FOR THEM
- 6 TO NOT DO THEIR RHNA NUMBERS. THANK YOU ALL SO MUCH.
- 7 CONGRATULATIONS ON A WONDERFUL JOB COMPLETING A HUGE PROJECT.
- 8 WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING TOGETHER ON THE IMPLEMENTATION.
- 10 RICHARD HEDGES: CYNTHIA, COULD I HAVE ONE MORE QUESTION. IT
- 11 WILL BE REALLY BRIEF.

9

12

14

19

21

- 13 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: WE'RE REALLY SHORT ON TIME.
- 15 RICHARD HEDGES: DAVE. A CITY COUNCIL FOR HOUSING TOLD ME THAT
- 16 SHE WAS CONCERNED ABOUT SB NINE BECAUSE IF THEY REDO THEIR
- 17 GENERAL PLAN TO INCLUDE THE SB REQUIREMENTS THAT IT WILL FILL
- 18 THEIR RHNA --
- 20 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: YOU WENT MUTE AGAIN.
- 22 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YOU ARE MUTED.
- 24 RICHARD HEDGES: WITH PROBABLY LITTLE HOUSING BEING BUILT FROM
- 25 IT. YOU CAN MAKE ME FEEL BETTER ABOUT THAT THAT THERE ARE



3

6

8

11

18

22

October 13, 2021

- 1 THINGS IN SB NINE THAT WON'T ALLOW THAT TO HAPPEN? >DAVE
 2 VAUTIN: RICH, I APOLOGIES, BUT I AM NOT THE EXPERT ON SENATE
- 4 WHO WILL BE HAPPY TO ANSWER YOUR OUESTIONS WHO HAS A BETTER

BILL 79 BUT I AM HAPPY TO PASS YOUR QUESTION ALONG TO STAFF

5 INDEDOMANDING OF MILE DESTITATIONS IN MILE IAM

5 UNDERSTANDING OF THE PROVISIONS IN THAT LAW.

7 RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU.

9 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: MARTHA ANY PUBLIC COMMENT

10 RECEIVED IN ASSOCIATION TO ITEMS.

12 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WHERE IS THIS WAS COMBINED CORRESPOND

- 13 FROM REGIONAL ADVISORY WORKING GROUP JOINT MTC PLANNING
- 14 COMMITTEE ABAG POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. SHERMAN LEWIS, HELEN
- 15 MURRAY, AND CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO WEST BAY CITIZEN'S
- 16 COALITION, MARCIA, AND THEY WERE POSTED ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED
- 17 TO COUNCIL MEMBERS.
- 19 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE HAVE THE FARE
- 20 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE REPORT AND BILL BACON AND MICHAEL
- 21 EISEMAN PROJECT MANAGER TO PRESENT.
- 23 WILLIAM BACON: GOOD AFTERNOON. I AM ONE OF THE PROJECT
- 24 MANAGERS FOR THE COORDINATION FARE COORDINATION AND
- 25 INTEGRATION STUDY. I AM JOINED BY TERENCE LEE WHO HAS BEEN A



- 1 CORE PART OF TEAM FOR THE PROJECT. STUDY JOINTLY MANAGED BY
- 2 BART AND MTC STAFF, AND TERENCE AND I ARE REPRESENTATIVES OF A
- 3 JOINT PROJECT TEAM THAT SPANS NEARLY ALL OF THE BAY AREA AT
- 4 THIS TIME OPERATORS, AND MTC. TERENCE IS GOING TO WALK US
- 5 THROUGH THE PRESENTATION, AND PROVIDE A LITTLE BACKGROUND
- 6 ABOUT THE PROJECT ITSELF AND I'LL COME IN HALFWAY THROUGH AND
- 7 WALK THE COUNCIL THROUGH PROPOSED DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS. WE
- 8 CAN GO AHEAD AND BRING UP THE SLIDE. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MY
- 9 COLLEAGUE TERENCE LEE.

10

11 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: WELCOME.

- 13 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COUNCIL MEMBERS. MY NAME IS TERENCE
- 14 LEE STAFF AND PROJECT MANAGEMENT FOR THE FARE COORDINATION AND
- 15 INTEGRATION STUDY. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM AND THE
- 16 PROJECT TEAM WILL RECEIVE FEEDBACK AND OUESTIONS. I'M GOING TO
- 17 TURN ON TURNOVER TO BILL LATER IN THE PRESENTATION TO PRESENT
- 18 RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS IN GREATER DETAIL. NEXT STEP.
- 19 TODAY I'LL GOING TO PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS NEAR-TERM ACTIONS
- 20 AND FINDINGS, I AM GOING TO PROVIDE BACKGROUND AND FRAMING FOR
- 21 RECOMMENDATIONS BEFORE WE GET INTO DELLS DETAILED DISCUSSION
- 22 ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS ITSELF. DELVING INTO BUSINESS CASE
- 23 METRICS WHICH THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY
- 24 CONDUCTED ANALYSIS. I WANT TO CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO THE
- 25 INDEX, AT THE END OF THIS DOCUMENT WITH A FURL INDEMNITY



- 1 ONLINE AT THE LINK ON THIS PAGE. THIS CONTAINS MUCH GREATER
- 2 TECHNICAL DETAIL THAN WE CAN COVER IN THIS PRESENTATION. NEXT
- 3 SLIDE PLEASE. OVER THE NEXT THREE SLIDES, I WOULD LIKE TO
- 4 PRESENT OVERVIEW OF KEY OUESTIONS AND APPROACHES THE STUDY HAS
- 5 USED TO FRAME OUR ANALYSIS RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THE
- 6 STUDY BEGAN IN MAY OF 2020, WITH THE DEVELOPMENT OF A STUDY
- 7 PROBLEM STATEMENT THAT ACKNOWLEDGED A VARIETY OF FACTORS THAT
- 8 CONTRIBUTED TO LIMITING TRANSIT RIDERSHIP GROWTH OVER THE
- 9 YEARS LEADING UP TO THE PANDEMIC. WITHIN ONE FACTOR WAS 15
- 10 POLICY, GOVERNING MODELS THAT INCENTIVIZES LOCAL FARES THAT
- 11 CHALLENGES A MORE COHERENT VISION OF HOW TO REDUCE FARE
- 12 BARRIERS BETWEEN TRANSIT AGENCIES. AS PART OF THE PROJECT
- 13 PROBLEM STATEMENT THE STUDY HAS IDENTIFIED FOUR KEY ISSUES,
- 14 APPROXIMATE THAT'S OUTLINED IN THE GRAPHIC TO THE RIGHT. FIRST
- 15 CUSTOMER VALUE, OR HOW CURRENT POLICIES CAN LEAD TO A
- 16 DISCONNECT BETWEEN THE COST OF THE TRIP AND THE VALUE PLACED
- 17 ON THE TRIP BY CUSTOMERS. NEXT IS THE PAYMENT EXPERIENCE, OR
- 18 HOW KERN FARE PRODUCTS MAY NOT BE AS LEGIBLE AS THEY COULD BE
- 19 TO USERS THEN THERE FUTURE TRANSIT OR HOW OF BARRIERS AND
- 20 CAPITAL OPERATIONAL INVESTMENTS AND EQUITY WHICH UNDERLAYS ALL
- 21 OF THE WORK OF THE PROJECT AND FOCUSES ON HOW CURRENT POLICIES
- 22 MAY NOT FULLY MEET THE NEEDS OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES.
- 23 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OVER THE COURSE OF THE STUDY THE PROJECT
- 24 TEAM HAS USED FRAMEWORK TO DISCUSS POLICIES FOR THE PROJECT
- 25 RECOMMENDATION TODAY WE WOULD LIKE YOU TO THINK ABOUT THEM



THROUGH THE LENS OF FOUR INTEGRATION TIERS WHICH REALLY 1 APPLIES RECOMMENDATIONS TO STRUCTURE FIRST ONE NUMBER ONE ON 2 3 THE SLIDE FOCUSING ON OVERLAYS TO EXISTING FARE STRUCTURE THAT DO NOT REOUIRE CHANGES TO HOW INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCIES 4 5 PRICE OR MANAGE THEIR FARE POLICIES. INSTEAD FARE POLICY IN TIER ONE INCLUDE OFFERINGS LIKE PASSES, CAPS, OR ACCUMULATORS 6 OVER THE TOP OF EXISTING STRUCTURES CHANGING THE WAY USERS 7 8 EXPERIENCE TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. THE SECOND TIER, NUMBER TWO, FOCUSES ON CHANGES TO FARE POLICY AT A POINT WHERE USERS 9 CONNECT BETWEEN DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES. LIKE TIER ONE, 10 THIS TIER DOES NOT REQUIRE CHANGES TO HOW INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT 11 AGENCIES PRICE OR MANAGE THEIR FARE POLICIES FOR TRAVEL WITHIN 12 THEIR OWN AGENCY. INSTEAD FOCUSES ON ELIMINATING COST TO USERS 13 OF TRANSFERS BETWEEN AGENCIES AND OFFERING CANNOT EASY TO 14 UNDERSTAND AND MEANINGFUL DISCOUNT BETWEEN LOCAL TRANSIT 15 16 REGIONAL RAIL SERVICES BETWEEN RAIL BUS AND FERRY BETWEEN SERVICES. AND SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO FARE POLICY FOR REGIONAL 17 TRANSIT SERVICES AGAIN RAIL, FERRY, AND EXPRESS BUS SERVICES, 18 19 AND WOULD INVOLVE BRINGING THESE SERVICES INTO A COMMON DISTANCE OR ZONE BASED STRUCTURES FOR FARE POLICIES MANAGEMENT 20 OF REGIONAL SERVICES TIER TWO WOULD NOT IMPACT HOW FARES FOR 21 REGIONAL STRUCTURED PRICE FOR LOCAL TRANSIT SERVICES. AND 22 FINALLY FOURTH TIER BUILT ON CHANGES IN TIER THREE AND BRINGS 23

ALL TRANSIT SERVICES INTO A COMMON DISTANCE OR RESUME BASE

SYSTEM AND ESTABLISH COMMON FARE FOR LOCAL TRANSIT SERVICES

24



ACROSS THE REGION, AND SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO HELP FARE 1 POLICIES TO MANAGE PRICE AND EXPERIENCE BY TRANSIT USERS 2 3 ACROSS THE BAY AREA'S TWO DOZEN AGENCIES. OPTIONS WITHIN EACH TIER WERE ANALYZED THROUGH BUSINESS CASE THROUGH A FOUR 4 5 DIMENSIONAL FRAMEWORK. ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE SLIDE YOU SEE FOUR DIMENSIONS STARTING WITH THE STRATEGIC DIMENSION CHANGE 6 ADVANCING GOALS INCREASED RIDERSHIP REDUCED VEHICLE MILES 7 8 TRAVELED BENEFIT-COST DIMENSION FARE POLICY CHANGE REFORMS FROM AN ECONOMIC VALUE PERSPECTIVE ESPECIALLY THINK BEING OF 9 FORECAST FOR NEW RIDER AND GIVEN FARE POLICIES AND DELIVERING 10 11 OPERATION DIMENSION WHAT WOULD IT TACK MANAGEMENT AND TECHNICAL PERSPECTIVE TO BE ABLE TO SUCCESSFULLY DELIVER A 12 FARE POLICY CHANGE AND FINALLY FINANCIAL ISSUE DIMENSION WHICH 13 CONSIDERS THE FINANCIAL REQUIREMENTS TO DELIVER A POLICY 14 CHANGE STRUCTURE ALLOWING BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF FARE POLICY 15 16 CHANGE AND COMPARATIVE BENEFITS OF INDIVIDUAL POLICY CHANGES BETWEEN THE FOUR TIERS OF INTEGRATION. NEXT SLIDE. BILL WILL 17 TAKE OVER THIS ACTION AND GUIDANCE. 18 19 WILLIAM BACON: I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE HOW HARD MANY OF YOU 20 COUNCIL MEMBERS WHO SERVED ON THE FARE COORDINATION AND 21 22 INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE FOR THE PAST 14 OR 15 MONTHS, YOU'RE 23 WORK AND ADVICE AND GUIDANCE TO THE TEAM HAS BEEN FUNDAMENTAL TO SHAPING THE RECOMMENDATIONS AND ANALYSIS THAT WE HAVE TAKEN 24

AS THE COURSE OF THIS WORK ACKNOWLEDGING THE RECOMMENDATIONS



- 1 THAT ARE EDITOR IN CHIEF DEEPLY INFLUENCED BY THE WORK OF THE
- 2 SUBCOMMITTEE. OVERALL THE KEY QUESTION THAT MANY OF YOU AS
- 3 MEMBERS OF THE FARE COORDINATION AND INT CONGRATULATIONS
- 4 SUBCOMMITTEE AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS HAVE BEEN ASKING
- 5 THROUGHOUT THE PROJECT IS, ARE THEIR FARE INTEGRATION OPTIONS
- 6 THAT OFFER A COST EFFECTIVE EQUITABLE WAY FOR TRANSIT RIDERS.
- 7 WE BELIEVE THE ANSWER IS YES ESPECIALLY IF THOSE CHANGES TO
- 8 FARE POLICY ARE FARE COORDINATED. ON THIS SLIDE ARE FIVE KEY
- 9 ISSUES THAT I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT. FIRST THEME, THAT THE
- 10 STUDIES WORK AND MODELING HAS FOUND THAT FARE STRUCTURE
- 11 CHANGES HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IN A
- 12 MEANINGFUL WAY, REALLY BETWEEN 2 AND 6% OF TOTAL PREPANDEMIC
- 13 RIDERSHIP LEVELS DEPENDING ON THE TIER ADVANCED AND FUNDING
- 14 AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT IMPLEMENTATION. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
- 15 BETWEEN 25,060,000 NEW DALE RIDERS ON A TRANSIT SYSTEM BASED
- 16 ON FARE POLICY CHANGE THAT WE ANALYZED THROUGH THIS WORK.
- 17 SECOND, FURTHER TO THOSE POSSIBLE RIDERSHIP GAINS FARE POLICY
- 18 CAN BE COST EFFECTIVE RELATIVE TO OTHER TRANSIT SYSTEM
- 19 INVESTMENTS AND THE INVESTMENT COST FOR EACH NOW TRIP
- 20 GENERATED BY A FARE POLICY CHANGE IS NOT BALLPARK OF ABOUT 2
- 21 TO \$3 PER NEW TRIP. THAT COMPARES VERY FAVORABLY TO ALMOST ALL
- 22 OTHER TRANSIT CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE REGION TALKING ABOUT
- 23 MAJOR TRANSIT EXPANSION PROJECTS MANY INCREASES IN SERVICE. SO
- 24 THESE REGION-WIDE CHANGES TO FARE POLICY HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO
- 25 BE VERY COST EFFECTIVE AND RELATIVE TO OTHER TYPES OF



- 1 INVESTMENTS. OUR ANALYSIS SUGGESTS THAT FARE INTEGRATION CAN
- 2 HELP THE BAY AREA REALIZE MEANINGFUL REDUCTION IN VEHICLE
- 3 MILES TRAVELED WITH CORRESPONDING BENEFITS TO GREENHOUSE GAS
- 4 EMISSIONS, AIR POLLUTION, AND TRAVEL TIME FOR TRANSIT USERS.
- 5 FOURTH, THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE'RE PUTTING FORWARD ARE
- 6 ALSO COMPATIBLE WITH THE BAY AREA'S EQUITY GOALS AND VALUES
- 7 AND OUR ANALYSIS SHOWS THAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS WOULD PROVIDE
- 8 SIGNIFICANT AND PROPORTIONAL BENEFITS TO EQUITY PRIORITY
- 9 COMMUNITIES. AND FINALLY I DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE
- 10 IS INHERENT LEVEL OF UNCERTAINTY IN OUR MODELLING AND ANALYSIS
- 11 GIVEN THE IMPACT ON INDIVIDUALS AND THE BAY AREA AT-LARGE. AND
- 12 IT DOES MAC MAKE IT IMPOSSIBLE TO SEE FARE POLICY IMPACTS
- 13 CHANGE AND POLICY HOW THEY WOULD MANIFEST IN THE FUTURE WHERE
- 14 COVID-19 IS MANAGED AND ITS IMPACTS WERE RECEDED. THE STUDY
- 15 TEAM HAS PROPOSED THREE MAIN AREAS OF THINKING ABOUT THE
- 16 RECOMMENDATIONS. THESE BUILD ON THE TIERS THAT TERENCE WALKED
- 17 THROUGH A MOMENT AGO. WE HAVE PROPOSED FARE INTEGRATION STEPS
- 18 FOR THREE SPANS OF PHASE IMPLEMENTATION FIRST BEGINNING IN
- 19 CALENDAR YEE 2022 WE RECOMMEND PILOTING ALL AGENCY
- 20 INSTITUTIONAL AND EMPLOYER TRANSIT PASS THIS TYPE OF PRODUCT
- 21 WOULD BE GAUGED AT EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS IN BIGGER CITIES
- 22 AND COMMUNITY COLLEGES TO ALLOW BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS AND
- 23 MTC STAKEHOLDER TO GET THE PRODUCT INTO HAND OF CUSTOMERS IN A
- 24 WAY THERE ARE NO BARRIERS TO TRANSFERS IN BETWEEN SYSTEMS
- 25 IMPLEMENTING A PILOT TO BUILT A CASE FOR UNDERSTANDING HOW



- 1 CUSTOMERS USE THE TRANSIT SYSTEM IN BARRIERS BETWEEN AGENCIES
- 2 PROVIDE MEANINGFUL DATA TO HELP INFLUENCE FUTURE DIRECTIONS TO
- 3 DELIVER RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THIS PROJECT WE BELIEVE THAT THIS
- 4 CAN REFER NEW TERM HORIZON AND BEGIN TO ACKNOWLEDGE HOW FARE
- 5 POLICY CAN CHANGE AND MAKE A DIFFERENCE IN THE LIVES OF
- 6 TRANSIT USERS. NEXT PHASE BEGINNING IN FALL OF 2023 WITH THE
- 7 IMPLEMENTATION OF CLIPPER TWO. THIS IS THE BLUE SECTION IN THE
- 8 MIDDLE THAT'S HOW WE RECOMMEND AS A PROJECT TEAM ADDING A FREE
- 9 OR REDUCED COST INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER TO THE BAY AREA'S FARE
- 10 POLICIES. SO, ESSENTIALLY WHAT WE WOULD BE SAYING IS THAT IF A
- 11 CUSTOMER IS TRANSFERRING BETWEEN AN AGENCY, WHETHER IT BE
- 12 LOCAL TO LOCAL, OR LOCAL TO REGIONAL, AND BY REGIONAL, I MOON
- 13 A SERVICE LIKE BART, CALTRAIN, FERRIES, OR BUS SERVICE. THAT
- 14 THE CUSTOMER WOULD EXPERIENCE EITHER A FREE TRANSFER IF IT WAS
- 15 A LOCAL TO LOCAL TRANSFER OR A STANDARDIZED REDUCED FARE WHEN
- 16 RIDERS TRANSFERRING BETWEEN LOCAL SERVICES AND REGIONAL
- 17 SERVICES OR VICE-VERSA, AND SECOND PHASE WOULD RECOMMEND
- 18 EXPLORING OPTIONS FOR INDIVIDUAL REGIONAL TRANSIT PASS
- 19 ESSENTIALLY AN ALL-AGENCY PASS SOLD TO INDIVIDUALS, NOT JUST
- 20 TO INSTITUTIONS AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS WOULD BUILD OFF OF
- 21 THE FINDINGS FROM THE PILOT THAT WE WOULD PUT OUT PRIOR TO
- 22 2023. IF IT WERE TO BE EXPANDED TO COVER ALL AGENCIES IT
- 23 CURRENTLY FUNCTIONS AS A DISCOUNT OFF THE PRICE OF A SINGLE
- 24 TRANSIT TRIP. ONCE CLIPPER TWO LAUNCHES THE PROJECT
- 25 RECOMMENDING CONSIDERATION OF IMPLEMENTING A ACCUMULATOR



- 1 ACCOMPLISHMENT ON TOTAL COST ON A DAILY, WEEKLY, AND MONTHLY
- 2 PASS FOR ELIGIBLE CLIPPER START CARD HOLDERS WHEN USING
- 3 TRANSIT. FINALLY IN GREEN ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE SLIDE IS
- 4 LONG-TERM RECOMMENDATION FOR INVESTIGATING COST AND BENEFITS
- 5 OF SHARED FARE STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES, RAIL, FERRY
- 6 AND EXPRESS BUS. THE BAY AREA SHOULD CONTINUE TO DEVELOP THIS
- 7 OPTION AS PART OF OUR BROADER ASSESSMENT POST-PANDEMIC
- 8 RIDERSHIP PATTERNS, THE ROLE OF REGIONAL TRANSIT IN THE REGION
- 9 AND STRATEGY COORDINATING SERVICES. I'LL MOVE TO POLICY
- 10 PROPOSALS. NEXT SLIDE. I'LL START WITH CORE STRUCTURAL CHANGE
- 11 WE'RE RECOMMENDING, WHICH IS FREE/REDUCED COST INTER-AGENCY
- 12 TRANSFERS IN THE MIDDLE PORTION OF THAT PREVIOUS SLIDE. UNDER
- 13 THIS POLICY, CUSTOMERS MAKING LOCAL TO LOCAL, OR LOCAL TO
- 14 REGIONAL, WOULD PAY ONE FARE. THE COST OF THE MOST EXPENSIVE
- 15 SEGMENT OF THEIR TRIP. AND EXAMPLES OF REGIONAL CONNECTIONS,
- 16 FOR EXAMPLE, A BART TO CALTRAIN CONNECTIN WOULD RECEIVE A
- 17 FIXED DISCOUNT EOUAL TO THE PRICE OF A LOCAL BUS FARE OR
- 18 MINIMUM BART FARE. IN THE BALLPARK OF 2 TO \$3. WERE MOVING TO
- 19 REMOVING THE PRICE BARRIERS BETWEEN AGENCIES AND MAKE THESE
- 20 TYPES OF TRANSIT TRIPS MORE PRICE COMPETITIVE. THIS CHANGE
- 21 ALLOWS INTER-AGENCY CONNECTIONS TOWARD MORE SINGLE AGENCY
- 22 CONNECTIONS AND ALLOW OUR REGIONAL SERVICES TO FUNCTION BETTER
- 23 AS COMPONENTS OF LOCAL NETWORKS. I'LL ALSO NOW NOTE FOR THE
- 24 COUNCIL THAT PRIOR TO THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC ABOUT 65% OF ALL
- 25 CLIPPER CARD USERS WHO MADE A TRANSFER BETWEEN AGENCIES WERE



- 1 RESIDENTS OF HOUSEHOLDS MAKING UNDER \$50,000 PER YEAR, AND
- 2 ACTUALLY ABOUT 75% OF THE CUSTOMERS MAKING TRANSFERS LIVED IN-
- 3 HOUSE HOLDS THAT MADE LESS THAN \$75,000 A YEAR. SO THIS
- 4 IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS STRATEGY PROVIDES A SIGNIFICANT BENEFIT
- 5 TO TRANSIT USERS LIVING IN THE LOWER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS IN OUR
- 6 REGION. IN OUR MODELING THIS POLICY CHANGE DRIVES A TWO%
- 7 INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP. WHICH IS ABOUT 25,000 NEW RIDERS PER
- 8 DAY. THE REVENUE IMPACT WOULD BE ESTIMATED AT AROUND \$22
- 9 MILLION PER YEAR. AND THAT'S BASE ON A PRECOVID BASE. SO
- 10 THAT'S ESSENTIALLY, SORT OF, AN UPPER BOUNDS OF IMPLEMENTING
- 11 WHAT THIS RECOMMENDATION WOULD COST TOTAL TRANSIT REVENUE
- 12 ACROSS THE REGION. AND AGAIN, AS CONTEXT, THE REGION GENERATED
- 13 ABOUT A BILLION DOLLARS OF FARE REVENUE PER YEAR BEFORE THE
- 14 COVID-19 PANDEMIC. THIS OPTION IS DELIVERABLE IN THE CLIPPER
- 15 TWO SYSTEM AND WE BELIEVE THAT WITH SINGLE WELL-STRUCTURED
- 16 MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN PARTICIPATING AGENCIES
- 17 WHICH WILL BE REPLACING EXISTING TRANSFER AGREEMENTS THIS
- 18 OPTION COULD DEPLOY IN A RELATIVELY STRAIGHTFORWARD MANNER.
- 19 NEXT SLIDE. NEXT I'LL BACK UP IN THE TIMELINE AND DISCUSS
- 20 INSTITUTIONAL PAST EMPLOYER PILOT WHICH COULD BEGIN IN THE
- 21 CALENDAR YEAR 2022 LIKE CALTRANS AND EXISTING PASS AND NUMBER
- 22 OF PROJECTS LIKE VTA, A PASS INSTITUTION CONSTITUENTS --
- 23 [INDISCERNIBLE] ON THE ORCA BUSINESS PASSPORT PROGRAM LIKE
- 24 ORCA BUSINESS PASSPORT PROGRAM UP IN SALES WE BELIEVE PRICING
- 25 WOULD BE BASED ON THE INDIVIDUAL EMPLOYER'S LOCATION SO COST



- 1 WOULD BE COMMENSURATE WITH OUALITY AND OUANTITY OF TRANSIT
- 2 SERVICE OFFERED. AGAIN, FOR THE PILOT PERIOD, THE TARGET WOULD
- 3 REALLY BE JUST ON INSTITUTIONS LIKE COMMUNITY COLLEGES AND
- 4 UNIVERSITIES THAT CURRENTLY OFFER A PASS PRODUCT TO THEIR
- 5 COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND TYPICALLY THOSE PASS PRODUCTS ONLY COVER
- 6 A SINGLE TRANSIT OPERATOR. SO THE IDEA HERE WOULD BE, LET'S
- 7 CONVERT THAT EXISTING PASS PRODUCT THAT COVERS ONE OPERATOR TO
- 8 SOMETHING THAT COVERS THE WHOLE REGION. IN A PERMANENT
- 9 PROGRAM THAT MIGHT HAPPEN AFTER THE PILOT WE WOULD AIM FOR
- 10 PRICING THAT ACHIEVES A SUBSIDY PARITY WITH THE BROADER FARE
- 11 SYSTEM WHICH ESSENTIALLY MEANS THAT THE REVENUE GENERATE ORDER
- 12 FROM SELLING THE PASSES TO ORGANIZATIONS WOULD OFFSET ANY
- 13 REVENUE IMPACT RELATIVE TO THE FARE STRUCTURED AS A WHOLE. WE
- 14 CAN DELIVER THIS PILOT PRODUCT IN THE CLIPPER ONE SYSTEM, WITH
- 15 SOME CONSTRAINTS, BUT IT'S POSSIBLE TO DO RIGHT NOW, IN THE
- 16 CLIPPER ONE SYSTEM, BUT A PERM IMPORTANT THAT INSTITUTIONAL
- 17 PROGRAM WOULD NEED TO WAIT UNTIL THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM IS
- 18 AVAILABLE IN 2023. YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. NEXT
- 19 WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT THE REGION CONTINUE TO EVALUATE MULTI-
- 20 AGENCY PASS AND CAP PRODUCTS FOR DEPLOYMENT ONCE THE CLIPPER
- 21 TWO SYSTEM LAUNCHES ARE IN 2023. I'LL NOTE HERE THAT OUTSIDE
- 22 OF THOSE INSTITUTIONAL PASSES THAT BROAD APPLICATIONS OF
- 23 EITHER PASSES OR FARE CAPPING DID NOT RATE AMONG THE COST
- 24 EFFECTIVE STRATEGIES IN THE ANALYSIS. SHOWING DESIGN FOR
- 25 INDIVIDUAL PASS THAT SCORED BETTER THAN MOST PASSES OR CAPS IN



- 1 COST EFFICIENCY ALTHOUGH NOT AS STRONG AS FARE DISCOUNT
- 2 PROPOSAL DISCUSSED A MOMENT AGO. A USER CAN SELECT A MONTHLY
- 3 PASS BASED ON TRIP COST MULTIPLIED BY SPECIFIC FACTOR FOR
- 4 EXAMPLE, IF THE RIDER TYPICAL FARE IS \$3 THE PRICE OFF A
- 5 MONTHLY PASS COVERING THE REGION MIGHT BE THREE TIMES 36
- 6 TRIPS. DURING THAT MONTH ALL TRIPS UP TO \$3 WOULD BE COVERED
- 7 BY THE PASS AND ANY \$4 TRIP FOR EXAMPLE, WOULD REQUIRE ONE
- 8 THERE FROM A CUSTOMER'S E CASH. WE REFER TO THIS AS THE PUGET
- 9 PASS MODEL BECAUSE IT'S ALSO USED TODAY IN THE PUGET SOUND
- 10 REGION AS WELL AS IN THE WASHINGTON, D.C. AREA AND IT'S TENDED
- 11 TO WORK WELL WITH MULTIPLE REGIONS THAT HAVE TRANSIT OPERATORS
- 12 AND REGIONS THAT HAVE MULTIPLE OPERATORS WITH SOME DISTANCE
- 13 BASED FARE STRUCTURE. OUR ANALYSIS OFFERS ONE AND A HALF%
- 14 RIDERSHIP INCREASE WITH COST PER TRIP AT ABOUT \$4.35. ANY
- 15 PRODUCT THAT REOUIRES UP FRONT PAYMENT HAS THE POTENTIAL TO
- 16 EXCLUDE LOW-INCOME RIDERS FROM BENEFITS ALTERNATIVE APPROACH
- 17 IS REGIONAL PASSPORT RECOMMENDING A FARE CAP. THIS IS
- 18 SOMETHING THAT WOULD NOT HAPPEN UNTIL AFTER LAUNCH OF CLIPPER
- 19 TWO AND IN LIGHT OF CONCLUSION OF THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM.
- 20 THIS WOULD LIKELY REQUIRE A TYPE OF MULTI- AGENCY REVENUE
- 21 SHARING STRUCTURE TO DISTRIBUTE REVENUE GENERATED BY THE PASS.
- 22 NEXT SLIDE. OUR LAST RECOMMENDATION IS TO CONTINUE EVALUATING
- 23 COSTS AND BENEFITS OF MOVING TO TIER THROUGH INTEGRATION IN
- 24 2024 OR LATER. TIER THREE FOCUSES ON CREATING A SHARED
- 25 STANDARD FARE STRUCTURE EITHER DISTANCED BASED OR ZONE BASED



- 1 FOR REGIONAL SERVICES LIKE RAIL, FERRY AND EXPRESS BUS
- 2 SERVICES WE FEEL THE LEARN ABILITY OF OUR SYSTEM WOULD BENEFIT
- 3 FROM A FARE STRUCTURE AT THIS TIME PARTICULARLY IF COMBINED
- 4 WITH A BROADER USE FOCUSED STRATEGY AROUND MAPPING AND
- 5 WAYFINDING AND OTHER CUSTOMER FOCUSED SUPPORTS ANALYSIS
- 6 SUPPORTS AND CONTINUING EVALUATING A BROADER ASSESSMENT OF
- 7 WHAT COVID POST-COVID IN THE PATTERN IN REGIONAL SERVICES. AND
- 8 FUNDING STRATEGY CONTINUING TO OPERATE SERVICES IN THE LONG-
- 9 TERM BEYOND THE PANDEMIC. OUR BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS INCLUDES
- 10 TWO SCENARIOS FOR THIS OPTION A HIGHER INVESTMENT OPTION WOULD
- 11 YIELD ABOUT 4.5 TO 5% INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP WITH A REVENUE
- 12 IMPACT OF AROUND \$70 MILLION A YEAR. THIS IS ACTUALLY WON OF
- 13 THE MOST COST EFFECTIVE STRATEGIES AND THAT IT WOULD COME AT A
- 14 COST PER RIDER OF ABOUT \$2.84 PER REQUIRED. IT'S ONLY A BIT
- 15 LESS EFFICIENT THAN THE TRANSFER DISCOUNT OPTION THEY
- 16 DISCUSSED EARLIER. SO FOR AN APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON WE
- 17 ALSO HAVE A LOWER INVESTMENT OPTION WHERE A SLIGHTLY MORE
- 18 EXPENSIVE FARE CURVE FOR THE SHARED STRUCTURE YIELDS JUST
- 19 ABOUT THE SAME AS THE TRANSFER DISCOUNTS ALONE WITH SIMILAR
- 20 COST EFFICIENCY IN TERMS OF COST PER RIDER. SO OUR REGIONAL
- 21 AGENCIES WOULD LIKELY NEED A NEW MULTI-PARTY AGREEMENT NETWORK
- 22 MANAGEMENT MODEL OR GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE CHANGES TO IMPLEMENT
- 23 A STABLE COMMON FARE STRUCTURE ACROSS MULTIPLE OPERATORS. SOME
- 24 OF OUR EQUIPMENT MIGHT NEED TO BE UPDATED AND THERE WOULD BE A
- 25 MAJOR CHANGE MANAGEMENT TO EDUCATE CUSTOMERS ABOUT NEW



- 1 STRUCTURE COVERING MULTIPLE STRATEGIES. AND FINALLY WE DON'T
- 2 WANT HAVE A RECOMMENDATION AT THIS TIME FOR INTEGRATION THESE
- 3 OPTIONS AND ANALYSIS GENERALLY HAD HIGHER INVESTMENT
- 4 REQUIREMENTS AND LOWER COST EFFICIENCY AND A MUCH HIGHER
- 5 DELIVERABILITY REQUIREMENT THAN OUR MORE TARGETED OPTIONS.
- 6 THEY HAVE A MUCH HIGHER DELIVERABILITY REQUIREMENTS THAN THE
- 7 RECOMMENDED STRATEGIES THAN NEW AGREEMENTS BECAUSE OF. NEXT
- 8 SLIDE. I'M GOING BRIEFLY AGAIN PROVIDE CONTEXT ABOUT THE
- 9 PROPOSE THE PILOT AND THEN WRAP UP WITH SOME OF THE NEXT STEPS
- 10 FOR THE WORK. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AS WE LOOK TO PUT IN
- 11 PLACE MECHANICS FOR POTENTIAL PILOT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
- 12 CLOSELY WITH A WIDE RANGE OF STAKEHOLDERS IN PARTICULAR
- 13 CLOSELY WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS THAT PROVIDE A PASS PRODUCT TO
- 14 INSTITUTIONS. SO AGAIN, INSTITUTIONS LIKE AC TRANSIT,
- 15 CALTRAIN, AND VTA. THE OBJECTIVE OF THE PILOT WOULD BE A
- 16 BARRIER FREE AGENCY PASS, ACCESS IMPACT ON CUSTOMER TRAVEL
- 17 BEHAVIOR AND TO COLLECT DATA THAT COULD BE THE BASIS FOR A
- 18 REVENUE MODEL AND PERMANENT PROGRAM AND PERMANENT DIRECTOR
- 19 CUSTOMER PASS PRODUCT AND ALSO ALLOW US TO COMPLETE A TITLE
- 20 SIX ANALYSIS TO FACILITATE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF OUR PERMANENT
- 21 PROGRAM. WE HAVE PROPOSED THAT THE PILOT WOULD HAVE TWO
- 22 PHASES. PHASE ONE, WHICH AGAIN WE WOULD HOPE TO BEGIN IN 2022
- 23 WOULD FOCUS ON COLLEGES, UNIVERSITIES AND COMMUNITY COLLEGES.
- 24 WE WOULD BE LIKE LOOKING TO LEVERAGE INSTITUTION
- 25 RELATIONSHIPS, INSTITUTIONS LIKE UC BERKELEY, SAN FRANCISCO



- 1 STATE, SAN JOSE STATE AND A NUMBER OF OTHER COMMUNITY COLLEGES
- 2 OFFERING A TRANSIT PASS TO THEIR STUDENTS, AND LOOKING TO
- 3 BUILD ON EXISTING RELATIONSHIPS WITH RESIDENTIAL OF AFFORDABLE
- 4 HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS. AND SECOND PHASE WE PROPOSE THAT PRIVATE
- 5 EMPLOYERS AND A BROADER GROUP OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING RESIDENTS
- 6 BE INCLUDED IN THE PILOT PROGRAM. WE WOULD HOPE TO PARTNER
- 7 WITH BUSINESS ORGANIZATIONS AND PROPERTY MANAGERS AT BOTH
- 8 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND MARKET RATE HOUSING TO BE ABLE TO
- 9 EXPAND BEYOND THE EXISTING POOL OF INSTITUTIONAL PASS
- 10 CUSTOMERS. WE DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE SOME SIGNIFICANT
- 11 CHALLENGES TO DELIVERING THE PILOT. 50, THESE TYPES OF
- 12 PROGRAMS CAN BE ADMINISTRATIVELY COMPLEX AND TIME INTENSIVE
- 13 WHICH IS WHY WE'RE FOCUSING ON EXISTING RELATIONSHIPS THAT
- 14 EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS HAVE WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS AND TO
- 15 EMPHASIZE IF WE'RE GOING TO USE THE EXISTING CLIPPER SYSTEM
- 16 THAT'S AVAILABLE TODAY, ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS WOULD NEED TO
- 17 PARTICIPATE IN THE PILOT PROGRAM. AGAIN WHILE THE GOAL HERE
- 18 IS TO ESTABLISH A PRICE STRUCTURE THAT REQUIRES NO ADDED
- 19 SUBSIDY IN THE LONG-TERM, THERE MAY BE SOME FUNDING NEEDED TO
- 20 SUPPORT THE DEPLOYMENT OF THE PILOT AND TO PAY FOR
- 21 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ADMINISTRATION OF AN INITIAL PILOT
- 22 PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. SO, FINALLY, TO WRAP UP, THE PROJECT
- 23 TEAM HAS BEEN ON A BIT OF A ROAD SHOW FOR THE LAST MONTH OR
- 24 SO. WE HAVE BEEN PRESENTING TO A NUMBER OF TRANSIT AGENCY
- 25 BOARDS. AS ADINA LEVIN, THE CHAIR OF THE POLICY ADVISORY



- 1 COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION PRESENT PERIOD
- 2 EARLIER IN HER REMARKS ON THE PROJECT THE TEAM IS PRESENTING
- 3 LATER TODAY AT THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS OF AC TRANSIT TOMORROW
- 4 AND BOARD OF DIRECTORS FOR BART NEXT WEEK WE'LL HAVE A
- 5 PRESENTATION, AND GOLDEN GATE BOARD OF DIRECTORS, AS WELL AS
- 6 PRESENTATIONS IN TERMS OF OPPORTUNITY FOR TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD
- 7 MEMBERS TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK ABOUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS AND TO
- 8 PROVIDE MORE CONTEXT FOR EACH INDIVIDUAL COUNTIES UNIQUE
- 9 CHALLENGES AND PERSPECTIVES WHEN IT COMES TO CHANGING FARE
- 10 POLICY AND NECESSARY ACTIONS. THAT ROAD SHOW HAS BEEN
- 11 CONTINUING FOR THE LAST MONTH OR SO. NEXT MONDAY, ON OCTOBER
- 12 18TH, THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE WHICH IS THE GOVERNING
- 13 BODY FOR THIS PROJECT THAT'S MADE UP OF THE GENERAL MANAGERS
- 14 OF ALL OF THE LARGE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND A NUMBER OF THE
- 15 SMALLER OPERATORS AS WELL ALONG WITH MTC'S EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR,
- 16 THAT TASK FORCE WILL BE MEETING TO CONSIDER TAKE SOME TYPE OF
- 17 ACTION AROUND A POLICY VISION FOR WHERE FARE POLICY IN THE BAY
- 18 AREA MIGHT WANT TO GO IN THE FUTURE IN TERMS OF POSSIBLE
- 19 CHANGES THAT MIGHT BE MADE. SO THAT PACKET WILL BE POSTED
- 20 SOON. AND THAT OCTOBER 18TH MEETING WILL BE THE NEXT
- 21 OPPORTUNITY FOR THE TASK FORCE TO WEIGH IN ON THE WORK OF THE
- 22 PROJECT. ON OCTOBER 27TH AND 28TH, THE MTC COMMISSION WILL BE
- 23 MEETING IN A WORKSHOP FORMAT WHERE THEY WILL ALSO HEAR AN
- 24 UPDATE ON THE PRESENTATION FROM THE STUDY TEAM, AND THAT WILL
- 25 BE IN THE CONTEXT OF OTHER PRIORITIES IDENTIFIED AS PART OF



THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE. SO, AS WE NOTED 1 HERE ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE OF THE SLIDE, WE'RE SEEK FEEDBACK 2 3 FROM THE COUNCIL ON THE POLICY DIRECTION TODAY, YOUR FEEDBACK ON GOALS FOR A PILOT, AND, JUST, A GENERAL OUESTION ABOUT HOW 4 5 THE COUNCIL WOULD LIKE TO REMAIN ENGAGED IN THIS DISCUSSION IN THE COMING MONTHS AND YEARS AS HOPEFULLY THE PROJECT MOVES 6 FORWARD WITH SOME LEGISLATION WITH SOME OF THE PILOT ACTIONS 7 8 AND I KNOW THE COUNTY IS PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN THIS TOPIC AND WANTED TO PUT THAT ON THE AGENDA FOR DISCUSSION. THANK YOU 9 10 VERY MUCH. 11 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU ARE THE FOR THE 12 PRESENTATION. I HAVE THREE PEOPLE IN THE QUEUE. FIRST IS 13 MICHAEL BALDINI THEN WENDI KALLINS, THEN FRANK. 14 15 16 MICHAEL BALDINI: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. YOU MENTIONED REVENUE DISTRIBUTION DOES THAT SUPPORT ANY MANDATES REGARDING 17 FARE BOX RECOVERY THAT EACH OF THE PARTICIPATING AGENCIES 18 HAVE, AND SECONDLY, THE FARE BOX INTEGRATION WOULD GO HAND IN 19 HAND WITH SCHEDULED INTEGRATION AS WELL TO MAKE THIS A 20 21 SEAMLESS JOURNEY. THANK YOU. 22 WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU. I THINK WE RECOGNIZE AGAIN WE'RE 23

COORDINATING FARE POLICY ACTIONS WITH OTHER CUSTOMER FOCUSED



CHANGES TO THE SYSTEM LIKE SCHEDULE COORDINATION. SO WE AGREE 1 2 WITH THAT. 3 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: WIND? CALIFORNIA --4 5 WENDI KALLINS: FIRST I WANT TO APPLAUD AND THANK YOU, WHEN YOU 6 PRESENTED TO OUR COMMITTEE, OUR SUBCOMMITTEE, ONE OF MY 7 8 COMMENTS WAS TO CREATE A PRESENTATION THAT WAS A LITTLE CLEARER AND IN PLAIN ENGLISH, AND I REALLY LIKE THE WAY YOU 9 10 HAVE REARRANGED THE PRESENTATION. IT REALLY, I THINK, IS MUCH MORE INFORMATIVE. AND I'M GLAD -- I'M ASSUMING THIS IS THE ONE 11 YOU'RE TAKING ON THE ROAD. YEAH. THIS IS GREAT. SO, THANK YOU. 12 THANK YOU FOR THAT. I WANTED TO -- I HAD SPOKE WITH THE HEAD 13 OF OUR LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCY, AND IT DOES NOT LOOK LIKE THERE 14 15 IS ANY PRESENTATIONS PLANNED FOR LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES. 16 KNOW WHEN THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE WAS DOING THEIR ROAD SHOW, THEY DID A PRESENTATION TO ALL OF THE LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES 17 AT ONE TIME. AND I'M WONDERING IF YOU HAVE ANY PLANS TO DO 18 THAT AND IF NOT I RECOMMEND YOU TRY TO ORGANIZE SOMETHING LIKE 19 THAT SO THEY CAN SEE THAT. 20 21 WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU FOR THAT WENDI. WE AS THE PROJECT 22 TEAM HAD OFFERED PRESENTATIONS TO THE AGENCIES OF EACH OF THE 23 TEAM MEMBERS OF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE, THAT DOESN'T 24

INCLUDE A NUMBER OF SMALL OPERATORS, WHO ARE NOT PART OF THE



TASK FORCE WE'RE INTERESTED AND WOULD LIKE TO MAKE OURSELVES 1 2 AVAILABLE FOR THAT. 3 WENDI KALLINS: I AVAILABLE TO ALL LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES. I 4 5 GUESS YOU'RE GOING TO THEIR MEETING. THAT WOULD BE DIFFICULT IF BOARD MEMBERS AREN'T PRESENT. 6 7 8 WILLIAM BACON: IT'S ON THE BLUE RIBBON. 9 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: FRANK. 10 11 FRANK WELTE: IS THERE A PLACE WHERE I CAN FIND A SUMMARY OF 12 THE VARIOUS SCENARIOS THAT YOU HAD IN YOUR REPORT BECAUSE I'M 13 TRYING TO READ THE DOCUMENT MEETING SCREEN WRITING SOFTWARE 14 AND IT'S IMPOSSIBLE TO IDENTIFY WHICH NUMBERS CORRESPOND TO 15 16 WHICH SCENARIO. I THINK BECAUSE OF THE TERRIBLE FRAGMENTATION OF THE FARE STRUCTURES IN THE BAY AREA I THINK ANY PROPOSAL IS 17 GOING TO BE AN IMPROVEMENT OF WHAT WE HAVE HERE NOW, MY GUT 18 FEELING IS THEY'RE STILL ON THE TABLE BEING TOO COMPLEX. 19 20 WILLIAM BACON: WE CAN SHARE A SUMMARIZED VERSION OF THE 21 22 RECOMMENDATIONS AND I APOLOGIZE THAT IT DIDN'T TRANCE LAWSUIT

WELL INTO SCREEN READING SOFTWARE BUT HOPEFULLY WE CAN FOLLOW

UP AND SHARE SOMETHING THAT HOPEFULLY WILL WORK BETTER.

25

23



CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. CHRISTINA AND TERRY. 1 2 3 SPEAKER: HI BILL. I JUST WANTED TO SAY THANK YOU FOR A GREAT PRESENTATION. AND I AGREE WITH WENDI THAT FROM WHAT WE SAW 4 5 BEFORE UNTIL NOW, THIS HAS BEEN AN AMAZING TRAJECTORY OF THE 6 PROCESS FOR REACHING THESE FARE STRUCTURE PROPOSALS. 7 8 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: AND I WAS JUST CURIOUS, TWO THINGS. ONE WAS, WHAT HAS BEEN THE INITIAL REACTIONS FROM THE AGENCIES 9 THAT YOU HAVE BEEN PRESENTING TO? AND THEN I JUST WANTED TO 10 THROW IN YOUR QUESTION -- ON YOUR QUESTION OF THE GOALS FOR 11 THE PILOT. I THINK YOU HAD MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY ABOUT SEEING 12 HOW RIDERS WOULD BEHAVE WITHOUT THE BARRIERS AND IT WOULD BE 13 GREAT TO SEE ESPECIALLY HOW LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS. BAY AREA 14 WOULD TRAVEL AND USE TRANSIT IF COST WERE NOT AN ISSUE AND 15 16 SAME FOR STUDENTS AND WORKERS. AND IT WAS KIND OF IN THE DATA 17 THAT YOU CITED, THAT WAS GREAT ABOUT, LIKE, WHAT WAS THE HOUSEHOLD INCOMES OF PEOPLE WERE TRANSFERRING AND I THINK IT 18 WOULD BE NICE TO NOTE BEGINNING AND END POINTS AS WELL AS HOW 19 MANY TRANSFERS PEOPLE ARE TAKING AND KIND OF WHAT TIMES OF THE 20 21 DAY, SO JUST TO HAVE THAT KIND OF DATA, I THINK, WOULD BE REALLY VALUABLE. BUT I AM CURIOUS ABOUT THE REACTIONS. 22 23 WILLIAM BACON: REQUESTED QUESTION. WE PRESENTED TO A NUMBER OF 24

BOARDS TRYING TO LIST THE NUMBERS, CALTRANS, SFMTA, CAL



- 1 TRAINS, TOO, A COMMITTEE OF CALTRAIN, AS WELL, YOU KNOW, I
- 2 THINK THE REACTION IS ABOUT WHAT WE EXPECTED. THERE WAS, SORT
- 3 OF, INITIAL CONCERN FROM MANY TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS
- 4 ABOUT ANY TRANSFER OF LOCALLY GENERATED FUNDING TO ANOTHER
- 5 PART OF THE BAY AREA, OR TO ANOTHER TRANSIT OPERATOR, WANTING
- 6 TO ENSURE THAT THEIR RESPONSIBILITY TO THEIR LOCAL VOTERS TO
- 7 SUPPORTING A SALES TAX MEASURE OR SOME OTHER TYPE OF TRANSIT,
- 8 TYPICALLY TAX INVESTMENT, YOU KNOW, GOES TO BENEFIT THEIR
- 9 VOTERS. I THINK THAT'S, SORT OF, AN INITIAL CONCERN THAT THE
- 10 PROJECT HAS HEARD AND WE EXPECT THAT TO SOME EXTENT. AND I
- 11 THINK ONE OF THE GOALS OF OUR WORK HAS BEEN TO PROVIDE MORE
- 12 CONTEXT TO TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS ABOUT HOW THEIR RIDERS ARE
- 13 RIDERS OF OTHER SYSTEMS AS WELL, AND HOW THEIR RIDERS WOULD
- 14 BENEFIT FROM BUILDING STRONGER CONNECTIONS WITH THE REGION,
- 15 AND WITH EXPANDED ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY. EXPANDED ACCESS TO
- 16 EDUCATION THAT COMES WITH BETTER INTEGRATION BETWEEN THE
- 17 SYSTEMS. SO, YOU KNOW, I'LL BE VERY HONEST THAT I THINK OUR
- 18 PRESENTATIONS HAVE -- WE HAVE, SORT OF, HAD A DIFFICULT START,
- 19 AND I THINK MAYBE SOME OF YOU WHO MIGHT HAVE TUNED INTO SOME
- 20 OF THOSE MEETINGS WILL KNOW WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT. I SEE
- 21 ADINA SMILING. AND THAT INITIAL FEEDBACK FROM AT LEAST SOME OF
- 22 THE BOARDS, HAS BEEN REALLY HELPFUL, FOR THE PROJECT TEAM, IN
- 23 TERMS OF REFINING OUR MESSAGE TO REALLY ZERO IN ON THE ISSUES
- 24 THAT THESE BOARD MEMBERS WHO AGAIN ARE TYPICALLY LOCAL ELECTED
- 25 OFFICIALS, ARE PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN. AND, MY SENSE IS



- 1 THAT THE PRESENTATIONS HAVE GOTTEN BETTER WITH, SORT OF, EACH
- 2 SUBSEQUENT MEETING THAT WE HAVE DONE. AND I THINK, GENERALLY,
- 3 THE REACTION WE HAVE HEARD FROM BOARD MEMBERS HAS BEEN
- 4 POSITIVE, AS WELL. SO WE'LL SEE HOW THAT PROGRESSES. AND THE
- 5 ONE THING I'LL NOTE IS, ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WE HAVE HAD IS
- 6 THAT BOARD MEMBERS FROM DIFFERENT AGENCIES HAVE HAD VERY
- 7 DIFFERENT LEVELS OF ENGAGEMENT WITH THE PROJECT OVER THE LAST
- 8 YEAR AND A HALF. SOME AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS KNOW EXACTLY WHAT
- 9 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT BEING ENGAGED AND HAVE ENGAGED THROUGH
- 10 SOME OF OUR ACTIVITIES. SOME BOARD MEMBERS, SORT OF, HAVE A
- 11 BASELINE THAT IS AT A DIFFERENT PLACE THAN OTHER BOARD MEMBERS
- 12 ON THIS SUBJECT. AND THAT ALSO CREATES SOME CHALLENGES IN
- 13 TERMS OF THEIR INITIAL REACTIONS. BUT IT'S BEEN A REALLY
- 14 POSITIVE PROCESS AND I'M FRAME THAT THE BOARDS HAVE BEEN PART
- 15 OF THE TEAM.

16

- 17 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: IS THERE A SLIDE FOR CONTEXT IS THIS
- 18 BECAUSE OF THE IMPENDING CLIPPER 2.0?

- 20 WILLIAM BACON: THE LAUNCH OF CLIPPER TWO DOES OPEN A NEW DOOR
- 21 FROM A TECHNICAL STANDPOINT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE CAN DELIVER.
- 22 FOR EXAMPLE, WE COULDN'T VERY EASILY DO A FARE CAPITAL RIGHT
- 23 NOW IN CLIPPER ONE. SO WITH THE AVAILABILITY OF THE CLIPPER
- 24 TWO SYSTEM WE REALLY HAVE A MUCH BROADER SET OF THINGS WE CAN
- 25 IMPLEMENT MORE EASILY. THAT'S PART OF THE ANSWER TO WHY NOW,



- 1 ANOTHER PART OF THAT OUESTION, WHICH IS SOMETHING WE HAVE
- 2 HEARD FROM SOME BOARD MEMBERS IS, BEFORE THE PANDEMIC
- 3 RIDERSHIP IN THE BAY AREA WAS ON THE DECLINE. AND OUR SYSTEM,
- 4 IF YOU BASE IT ON RIDERSHIP AND DEMAND, IT WAS NOT BE MEETING
- 5 THE NEED OF ALL KINDS OF USERS TO THE EXCEPT BE THAT WE THINK
- 6 IT SHOULD. SO FARE POLICY CHANGE IS ONE PIECE OF THE PUZZLE OF
- 7 TRYING TO BUILD A MORE CUSTOMER FOCUSED SYSTEM, AND
- 8 FREQUENCIES, RELIABILITY, TRANSIT PRIORITY, THERE IS A LOT OF
- 9 OTHER PIECES TO THAT PUZZLE, BUT IF WE'RE GOING TO TRY TO
- 10 PROVIDE A SYSTEM THAT BETTER MEETS THE NEEDS OF OUR USERS FARE
- 11 POLICY IS ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE SHOULD CONSIDER MAKING
- 12 CHANGES TO.

13

15

- 14 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: THANK YOU.
- 16 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: TERRY AND ADINA.
- 18 TERRY SCOTT: FIRST LET ME THANK YOU FOR THE COMPREHENSIVE
- 19 PRESENTATION THAT YOU HAVE MADE. AND FORGIVE ME, I WAS OFFLINE
- 20 FOR ABOUT FIVE MINUTES OR SO, AND I MAY HAVE MISSED THE ANSWER
- 21 TO THIS, BUT, HOW WILL INTEGRATED BAY AREA STRATEGIES BE
- 22 UTILIZED TO MINIMIZE, AND DISCOURAGE AUTOMOBILE USAGE AND
- 23 ENCOURAGE LESS IMPACTFUL TRANSPORTATION USAGE SUCH AS THE
- 24 FERRY SYSTEM AND SO FORTH? THIS SEEMS PARTICULARLY CRITICAL
- 25 WHEN COMBINED TO INCLUDE ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES WITHIN A KEY



- 1 TRANSIT LOCATION, LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, WHICH, BASICALLY, IS THE
- 2 STORY OF ALL OF THESE. AND THE ABILITY TO TRANSITION EASILY
- 3 BETWEEN THE DIFFERENTIATE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND FARE BOX, AND
- 4 ALSO, PHYSICALLY, I THINK IS CRITICAL TO THE SUCCESS AND THE
- 5 OVERALL EFFICIENCY OF THE OPERATION. THAT WAS JUST A COMMENT.
- 6 IF YOU COULD ANSWER THE FIRST PART OF THAT?

- 8 WILLIAM BACON: YEAH. TO THE FIRST PART. SO I THINK ONE OF THE
- 9 MAIN THEMES OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS IS TRYING TO BREAK DOWN THE
- 10 BARRIERS THAT EXIST FOR USERS. IF YOU NEED TO TRANSFER BETWEEN
- 11 AGENCIES. RIGHT NOW, IF YOU HAVE TO MAKE A TRANSFER, IT
- 12 REALLY CREATES A LOT OF FRICTION, AND IS A FINANCIAL
- 13 DISINCENTIVE FOR MAKING THAT TRANSFER. SO MANY USERS WHO HAVE
- 14 ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS MAKE THE FINANCIAL RATIONAL CHOICE OF NOT
- 15 USING TRANSIT FOR THAT TYPE OF TRIP, OR PERHAPS TAKING A MODE
- 16 THAT IS NOT AS EFFICIENT FOR THEIR TYPE OF TRIPS OR TAKING A
- 17 SLOWER TYPE TRANSIT AS THERE ARE MULTIPLE OPTIONS AVAILABLE.
- 18 IN OUR MODELING WORK WE USED THE MTC TRAVEL MODEL THAT WAS
- 19 USED FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SO THROUGH THAT INCREASED
- 20 RIDERSHIP USING THE EXAMPLE OF FREE AND REDUCED COST
- 21 TRANSFERRING BETWEEN AGENCIES, THE 25,000 NEW RIDERS PER DAY
- 22 DOES GENERATE A SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION IN GMT BECAUSE A LOT OF
- 23 THOSE TRIPS ARE PEOPLE WHO MIGHT HAVE CHOSEN TO RIDE IN A CAR
- 24 OR BUY A CAR SOMEHOW TO TAKE THAT TRIP SO I THINK EACH



POSSIBLE ACTION HAS ITS OWN CORRESPONDING IMPACTS. DOES THAT 1 2 ANSWER YOUR QUESTION. 3 TERRY SCOTT: YES. WHAT EVER HAPPENED AND WHAT IS THE STATUS TO 4 5 THE PROPOSAL OF HAVING AN OVERALL COMPREHENSIVE SYSTEMS MANAGER WHO WOULD WORK TO INTEGRATE THESE MORE EFFECTIVELY 6 THAN WE CAN DO NOW WITH FIVE DIFFERENT AGENCIES FIVE DIFFERENT 7 8 STAFFS, ET CETERA? WHAT'S THE STATUS? ORIGINALLY LAST YEAR WE WERE TOLD THAT WE'RE TRYING TO FILL THAT POSITION BY FIRST OF 9 APRIL AND BY FEBRUARY OR MARCH WE HADN'T WRITTEN A JOB 10 DESCRIPTION FOR IT. SO OBVIOUSLY IT WASN'T FILLED, BUT WHAT'S 11 THE STATUS OF THAT? 12 13 WILLIAM BACON: WELL I'M PROBABLY NOT THE BEST PERSON TO ANSWER 14 THE OUESTION DIRECTLY BUT I WILL POINT YOU BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT 15 16 RECOVERY TASK FORCE AT THE CONCLUSION OF THAT TASK FORCE THEY ADOPTED A TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND PART OF THAT WAS THE 17 DEVELOPMENT OF A BUSINESS CASE NETWORK MANAGEMENT RESTRUCTURE 18 FOR THE REGION AND ARE THAT WORK IS GETTING UNDERWAY NOW SO 19 THAT PROCESS WILL RESULT IN FURTHER DISCUSSION ABOUT WHAT A 20 21 NETWORK EMERGENCY OR MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE COULD LOOK LIKE IN THE BAY AREA. AND WE DO ACKNOWLEDGE, IN THIS PROJECT, IN THE 22 FARE COORDINATION STUDY, THAT IF WE WERE TO IMPLEMENT OPTIONS 23 LIKE TIER THREE, WHICH, AGAIN, IS A COMMON REGIONAL FARE 24

STRUCTURE FOR SERVICES, OR TIER FOUR, SOMETHING THAT TOUCHED



ALL AGENCIES, IMPLEMENTATION WOULD BE MUCH EASIER IF THERE WAS 1 2 SOME TYPE OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE, AND IT MIGHT EVEN BE A PREREQUISITE DEPENDING ON WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. 3 4 5 TERRY SCOTT: IT WOULD BE CONSIDERABLY EASIER FOR THE USERS, AS WELL. 6 7 8 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. ADINA? YOU'RE MUTED. 9 10 ADINA LEVIN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND KUDOS TO STAFF 11 ESPECIALLY IN DOING THIS GRUELING ROAD SHOW TO MANY AGENCY 12 BOARDS, AND REALLY LEARNING FROM THE FEEDBACK AND TAILORING IT 13 TO BE UNDERSTANDABLE TO THE NEEDS OF THE TRANSIT AGENCY 14 15 BOARDS. SO, FIRST I WANTED TO REITERATE THE POINT THEY MADE IN 16 THE COMMENTS AT THE TOP, WHICH IS THAT IF ANY OF YOU ARE USERS OF AC TRANSIT OR BART, THE AC TRANSIT BOARD IS HEARING THIS 17 ITEM TONIGHT AT THEIR MEETING STARTING AT FIVE, AND THE BART 18 BOARD IS HEARING THE ITEM AT THEIR MEETING STARTING AT NINE. 19 THE BART BOARD IS GOING HAVE A REALLY LONG CLOSED SESSION 20 21 BEFORE IT SO IT WONT BE AT NINE. IT WILL BE SOMETIME IN THE MIDDLE OF THE DAY. ONE THING THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL AND 22 CONSISTENT WITH WHAT THIS BODY HAS BEEN SAYING, CONSISTENTLY, 23

IS -- AND, LIKE, ONE OF THE QUESTIONS THAT COMES UP IS, WILL

FARE INTEGRATION HELP PEOPLE WHO ARE LOW-INCOME? AND BRINGING

24



- 1 THE OBSERVATION THAT MOST LOW-INCOME PEOPLE USE TRANSIT FOR
- 2 SHORT LOCAL TRIPS AND THEREFORE MAYBE THERE ISN'T A NEED FOR
- 3 FARE INTEGRATION BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT WE SEE PEOPLE DOING,
- 4 WHICH OF COURSE, YOU DO NOT BUILD A BRIM BASED ON THE NUMBER
- 5 OF PEOPLE THAT YOU SEE SWIMMING ACROSS A RIVER. AND, SO, FOR
- 6 THOSE WHO HAVE PERSONAL EXPERIENCES, IS THOSE WHO HAVE
- 7 COMMUNITY EXPERIENCES ABOUT THAT, IN PARTICULAR, IT WOULD BE
- 8 HELPFUL TO SAY THAT TO THE AC TRANSIT BOARD. I'M HOLDING THE
- 9 BUSINESS CARD OF A GENTLEMAN THEY MET AT SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT
- 10 RIDERS PARTY. HIS NAME IS LUZ CASTILLO HE IS A COMMUNITY
- 11 ORGANIZING OUTREACH LEADER WITH TENDER LOIN NEIGHBORHOOD
- 12 DEVELOPMENT AND USING THE WHEELCHAIR, AND WHEN I MENTIONED THE
- 13 GO ANYWHERE TRANSIT PASS, HIS FACE LIGHTS UP. HE'S LIKE, HERE
- 14 IS MY SFMTA, CARD, BUT I WOULD LOVE TO VISIT MY FAMILY RIGHT
- 15 NOW IN SAN JOSE. BUT I CANNOT DO IT, IT TAKES MORE TIME
- 16 THERE'S THREE HOURS IF YOU'RE USING LOCAL BUSES. SO MAKING
- 17 THIS POINT TO THE BOARD IS IMPORTANT BECAUSE THIS COMMENT IS
- 18 SOMETHING THAT IS THE CASE AND WE KNOW IT'S THE CASE AND IT'S
- 19 HELPFUL AND IMPORTANT FOR THE BOARD TO KNOW THAT. ONE MORE
- 20 COMMENT I WANT TO MAKE IN TERMS OF MAKING THIS INTUITIVE, IS
- 21 THE RIDERSHIP BENEFITS OF FREE TRANSFERS, 25,000 RIDERS, 2 TO
- 22 3 INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP SOUND SMALL, BUT LOOK AT IT AS THE
- 23 EQUIVALENT OF ADDING ANOTHER BART STATION OR ADDING ANOTHER AC
- 24 TRANSIT BUS ROUTE, IF YOU LOOK AT IT WITH THAT COMPONENT OR
- 25 ADDING THE AMOUNT OF DRIVING IN A REDUCTION IN CALTRAIN



- 1 ELECTRIFICATION. AND THE STANDARDIZED REGIONAL FARES IS
- 2 EOUIVALENT OF FOUR CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION DRIVING REDUCTION
- 3 OR ADDING A WHOLE OTHER CALTRAIN WITH RIDERSHIP. IT'S A SMALL
- 4 PERCENTAGE IN TERMS, BUT IS IMPORTANT. MOST CHALLENGE SUGGEST
- 5 TIER FOUR RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH WOULD ALSO COST MONEY AND
- 6 SHOULDN'T BE DONE UNTIL THERE IS MACHINE TO DO IT. BUT THERE
- 7 ARE SOME BENEFITS THAT ARE NOT FULLY ACCOUNTED FOR IN THIS
- 8 STUDY. SO WE SAW THE WAYFINDING STUDY AT THIS BODY AND IT
- 9 SHOWED, REALLY, SIGNIFICANT BENEFITS FROM THE DEEPEST LEVEL OF
- 10 WAYFINDING INTEGRATION BY HARMONIZING ALL THE SIGNED AND NOT
- 11 HAVING ALL THE BRAND LOGOS. BUT WE COULD ONLY GET THERE IF YOU
- 12 COULD PRESENT TO US STANDARDIZING THE LOCAL FARE. WHEN THIS
- 13 WAS PRESENTED IT'S LIKE, OKAY ARE YOU CONNECTING THIS INTO THE
- 14 BENEFITS OF THE FARE STUDY. AND THAT MENTIONS IT BUT DOESN'T
- 15 REALLY ACCOUNT FOR IT IN TERMS BENEFIT FOR THE FARE STUDY IS.
- 16 AND THE OTHER THING STUDY DOESN'T ACCOUNT FOR IS THE
- 17 INTEGRATION OF STANDARDIZING LOCAL FARES, IT TALKS ABOUT
- 18 SOLVING FOR, FINANCIALLY, AND WHAT THAT WOULD MEAN IS THAT THE
- 19 FARES, IF YOU ARE STANDARDIZING A FARE, IT GOES DOWN FOR SOME
- 20 AGENCIES WHICH WOULD HARM THE FINANCES OF THE AGENCY AND GO UP
- 21 POWER OTHERS AND THEIR HARM SOME LOW-INCOME PEOPLE. THAT IS A
- 22 BAD IDEA. YOU WOULDN'T WANT TO DO THAT. OURSELF HOWEVER THERE
- 23 IS I WAY TO THINK ABOUT IT IN TERMS OF FUTURE FUNDING, A
- 24 SAMPLE, WE'RE DOING REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURES THINKING WE WANT
- 25 TO INVEST IN IT TO BE POSSIBLE TO TAKE SOME MONEY AND BUY --



- 1 [INDISCERNIBLE] THEREFORE PROTECTING THE FINANCES OF THE
- 2 AGENCY'S BUDGET AND THE BUDGETS OF THE LOW-INCOME PEOPLE
- 3 UNLOCKING SIMPLIFIED WAYFINDING IT WOULD BE REALLY EASY TO DO
- 4 AND CONTINUING TO HAVE STUDIES ON VALUES BASED DISCUSSIONS.
- 5 THAT CONCLUDES MY COMMENTS. AND WITH STRUCTURES, WHERE STAFF
- 6 HAS TO GO TO SEVEN BOARDS EXPLAINING SOMETHING TO PEOPLE IN 15
- 7 MINUTES THAT'S BEEN WORKED ON FOR OVER A YEAR IT'S PROBABLY
- 8 NOT AN APT MALL STRUCTURE AND IN THE NETWORK HOPEFULLY THERE
- 9 WILL BE DISCUSSIONS ABOUT MAKING THESE REALLY WEIGHTY POWERFUL
- 10 DECISIONS IN A WAY THAT'S MORE EFFECTIVE FOR THE REGION AND
- 11 LESS GRUELING FOR THE PEOPLE TRYING TO WORK ON IT.

13 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: DO YOU HAVE A RESPONSE TO THAT?

- 14 IT'S GETTING LATE AND WE'RE STARTING TO LOSE PEOPLE.
- 16 LILY MEI: I THINK CONTEXT AROUND PROPOSED POLICY CHANGE AND
- 17 RELIGION TO OTHER TYPES OF INVESTMENTS IS WELL RECEIVED AND
- 18 SOMETHING WE WANT TO COMMUNICATE IN OUR FINAL REPORT AND AS WE
- 19 MOVE FORWARD CONTINUING TO TALK ABOUT DELIVERING THE CHANGES
- 20 AND POLICY MAKERS, AND WE UNDERSTAND THE CONTRACTS FOR THOU
- 21 THESE -- IN TERMS OF GOING TO DEEP, ADINA YOU HAVE PROVIDED A
- 22 LOT OF FEEDBACK AND THIS WAS WELL RECEIVED.
- 24 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: SEEING NO OTHER HANDS. MARTHA
- 25 IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

23

12



1 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 2 3 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. 4 5 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA 6 7 ITEM TEN, STAFF LIAISON REPORT. MARTI? 8 MARTI PASCHAL: GOOD AFTERNOON MARTI PASCHAL STAFF TO THE 9 COUNCIL. I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD TO MY REPORT. 10 11 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM 11, 12 COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS? ANYBODY WHO HAS A REPORT? PLEASE RAISE 13 14 YOUR HAND. 15 16 MARTI PASCHAL: PUBLIC COMMENT, ANYTHING SUBMITTED? 17 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 19 ON THIS ITEM. 20 21 22 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR THAT. NOTHING --23 I SEE NO ONE ON COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS. ANYTHING ON NEW BUSINESS, AGENDA ITEM 12? IS YOUR HAND UP, RICK? NO. ALL 24 RIGHT. OH MICHAEL, YOUR HAND IS UP. 25



1 MICHAEL BALDINI: YES, THANK YOU. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SAY, I 2 3 WOULD BE INTERESTED IN SAYING IT AS SOME, SORT OF, OVERVIEW ON THE COMMERCIAL SIDE, AS FAR AS COMMERCE GOODS, TRUCK TRAFFIC, 4 5 CONTAINERS, WHAT'S HAPPENING ON THAT SIDE. PARTICULARLY, AS IT RELATES TO VISION 2050 AND EVERYTHING FROM ZERO-EMISSION 6 7 VEHICLES TO INCREASING RELIANCE ON ONLINE SHOPPING AND THINGS 8 LIKE THAT. JUST WHAT'S HAPPENING TO OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM 9 AND HOW THAT INTEGRATES WITH THE PUBLIC AGENCIES PROVIDING TRANSPORTATIONS FOR FOLKS. 10 11 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: SO, GOODS MOVEMENT? 12 13 MICHAEL BALDINI: YES. 14 15 16 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: WE HAVE CERTAINLY LOOK AT THAT IN A FUTURE AGENDA, IF YOU COULD MAKE NOTE OF THAT STAFF. 17 APPRECIATE IT. YOU ALL WERE TROOPERS HANGING IN THERE. SORRY 18 WE WENT LATE BUT WE APPRECIATE YOU STICKING WITH US. THANK YOU 19