October 27, 2021

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION 1 JOINT MEETING WITH THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY 2 3 WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 27, 2021, 10:05 A.M. 4 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. MY NAME IS 6 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. 7 8 I'M GOING TO CALL TO ORDER THE MTC BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. GOOD MORNING. WE ALREADY HAD ONE MEETING AND 9 ACKNOWLEDGED THAT WE'RE CELEBRATING THE FACT THAT WE'RE IN THE 10 BUILDING. IT'S SO GOOD TO BE HERE. AND ACKNOWLEDGE OUR STAFF 11 WHO MADE THIS HAPPEN. THIS DOESN'T HAPPEN ON ITS OWN. 12 INCREDIBLE WORK. AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS I SEE IN THE SQUARES, 13 THANK YOU FOR TAKING THE TIME. AT THIS POINT, IF WE COULD 14 15 PLEASE PLAY THE INTRODUCTORY RECORDING? 16 [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO 17 THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN 18 REOUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST 19 ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, 20 21 PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT 22 THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND 23 ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR 24 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS 25

October 27, 2021

OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD 1 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL 2 3 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR 4 5 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS 6 7 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT 8 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE 9 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD 10 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE 11 THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE 12 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL 13 ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE 14 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM 15 16 EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE. 17 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, IT TEAM, FOR THAT. LET'S 18 MOVE ON TO ROLL CALL, PLEASE. 19 20

21 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA?

22

23 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: YES.



CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ? COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ? IS 1 2 ABSENT. 3 NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR: SORRY. I FORGOT TO UNMUTE MYSELF. 4 5 I'M HERE. VERY EXCITED TO BE HERE. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. ABE-KOGA? 8 9 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE. 10 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN? 12 13 EDDIE AHN: HERE. 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA? 15 16 DAVID CANEPA: HERE. 17 18 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ? 20 21 CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE. 22 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CONNOLY? 24 DAMON CONNOLLY: HERE. 25



```
1
2
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
3
    CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.
4
5
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: EL-TAWANSY? EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.
6
7
    COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
8
9
    VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE.
10
11
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: GIOCAPINI?
12
13
    DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
14
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?
15
16
    FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
17
18
19
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: LICCARDO?
20
    SAM LICCARDO: I'M EXCITED AS NICK TO BE HERE.
21
22
23
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. PAPAN?
24
    GINA PAPAN: HERE.
25
```



1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY? 2 3 NATHAN MILEY: HERE. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBIT? 6 7 8 DAVID RABBIT: HERE. 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SPERING? 10 11 JAMES P. SPERING: HERE. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WORTH? 14 15 16 AMY R. WORTH: HERE. 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE A QUORUM, MR. CHAIR. 18 19 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I LOVE THE EXCITEMENT. IT 20 NEEDS TO LAST UNTIL. SO PACE YOURSELF. IF YOU COULD PLEASE 21 22 JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. FIND A FLAG. [ PLEDGE OF 23 ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, 24



ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE 1 2 FOR ALL." 3 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, ALL. LET'S MOVE TO ITEM 4 5 THREE, COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. KIMBERLY, IF YOU COULD 6 PLEASE THE READ THE ANNOUNCEMENT? 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, AND MR. CHAIR, IF I MIGHT MAKE A CORRECTION TO THE ROLL CALL, THE OUORUM IS PRESENT FOR MTC AND 9 BAHFA, AND WITH THAT, I'LL DO THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. 10 11 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU'RE WELCOME. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE 14 LAW I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE 15 16 BOARD HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS 17 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR 18 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. 19 20 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. KIMBERLY, AT 21 22 THIS POINT, WE'RE GOING MOVE TO ITEM FOUR. JOINT MTC AND 23 BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, KIM, VIRTUALLY? 24 25



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND I
2	SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH HAND RAISED.
3	
4	ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: I SEE NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM. I'LL
5	ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR OUR CONSENT CALENDAR?
6	
7	SPEAKER: MOVE T.
8	
9	SPEAKER: SECONDS.
10	
11	ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: MOTION AND SECOND.
12	
13	KATHLEEN KANE: I'M SORRY. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO DO THIS
14	SEPARATELY. THE MOTION WAS FOR MTC?
15	
16	ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THAT'S CORRECT.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RESOLUTION 4492. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES
19	UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
20	
21	ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S MOVE ON TO
22	THE SECOND PART OF THIS ITEM. THIS IS FOR THE BAHFA CONSENT
23	CALENDAR. I WILL LOOK FOR A MOTION.
24	
25	AMY R. WORTH: MOVE APPROVAL.



1 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: FIRST BY COMMISSIONER WORTH. 2 3 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SECOND BY ABE-KOGA. 4 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: SECOND BY ABE-KOGA. KIMBERLY, ANY 6 7 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 9 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 10 11 ON THIS ITEM. 12 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. I DON'T SEE ANYONE IN THE 13 BOARD CHAMBERS WITH PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. FIRST BY 14 15 WORTH, SECOND BY ABE-KOGA. ROLL CALL, VOTE, PLEASE. 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: BAHFA RESOLUTION NUMBER THREE. [ROLL CALL 17 VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 18 19 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S MOVE TO 20 21 ITEM FIVE, PUBLIC COMMENT. I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ANY 22 ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. INTO THE RECORD. I'LL ASK 23 IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES TO PARTICIPATE 24



VIA TELECONFERENCE TO RAISE YOUR HAPPENED OR PRESS STAR NINE?
 KIMBERLY ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

3

4 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
6 ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: WE HAVE NONE IN THE BOARDROOM WHO WISHES TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU. ITEM SIX, 9 ADJOURNMENT OF BAHFA, THIS AUTHORITY OF THIS MEETING IS NOW 10 ADJOURNED. SO WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE WITH MTC AGENDA. 11 OUR NEXT ITEM IS SEVEN, CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. IT IS WITH HONOR 12 THAT I'M GOING TO PRESENT MTC RESOLUTION 4491 IN APPRECIATION 13 FOR BENJAMIN FOR HIS RETIREMENT. DUE TO LIST OF 14 ACCOMPLISHMENTS I WILL NOT READ THE ENTIRE RESOLUTION BECAUSE 15 16 IT COULD GO ALL DAY. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT HIS WORK ESPECIALLY IN DEVELOPING ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT ADOPTED PLAN, PLANNED 17 BAY AREA 2050 AND THERE WAS OUESTION THAT HE COULDN'T RETIRE 18 UNTIL THAT GOT APPROVED. CONGRATULATIONS BEN. BEGAN HIS CAREER 19 AS BRIDGE AND HIGHWAY OPERATIONS BEFORE TURNING TO TRAVEL 20 21 MODELING, AND HIGHWAY PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS OVERSAW 22 SUCCESSFUL TRANSITION TO MODERN SPACE DATA COLLECTION METHOD. BEN'S AMBITIOUS REALIZED TRANSIT PROJECTS, OAKLAND, ALAMEDA 23 BART EXTENSION REACHING AS FAR AS GILROY TO SMART EXTENSION 24 OVER THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE TO SAN FRANCISCO RESTORING KEY 25

October 27, 2021

ROUTE STREETCAR LINE RUNNING ALONG THE SAN PABLO AVENUE EAST
 BAY AS WELL AS SEEMINGLY THOUSANDS OF ITERATIONS OF MODELING
 FOR BART AND SAN JOSE, RESOLVED STAFF COMMISSION RESOLUTION,
 FOR HIS GENEROSITY COLLABORATIVE EFFORTS WITH THIS RESOLUTION.
 WE WISH YOU WELL IN COACHELLA VALLEY. WOULD YOU LIKE TO SAY
 ANY WORDS?

7

8 MATT MALONEY: BEN COULD NOT BE HERE TODAY HE'S WITH HIS MOM IN PERT OWE RICO DEALING WITH SOME ISSUES. I WILL OFFER SOME 9 WORDS ON HIS REGARDS, BEN'S RULE DEVELOPMENT FOR EACH PROCESS, 10 [INDISCERNIBLE] RINGS TRUE FOR A COUPLE OF REASONS BEN IS DOWN 11 THERE IN PUERTO RICO NOW WITH FAMILY ISSUES AND SOMETIMES THE 12 REASONS PROCESSES GROUND TO HALT IS BECAUSE BEN'S ROLE AND 13 EXPERTISE WAS SO SPECIALIZED AND TRANSLATION OF HIS IDEAS, 14 15 SOMETIMES NOT FULLY DEVELOPED AND PRESENTING IN OUR TRAVEL 16 MODELS THIS IS BEHIND THE SCENES WORK THAT'S NOT ALWAYS VISIBLE MAYBE TO YOU OR THE PUBLIC, HUGELY IMPORTANT CRITICAL 17 PART, BEN SENDS HIS REGARDS. 18

19

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: GREAT PERSPECTIVE AND GREAT WORDS TO
SHARE WE WISH BEN AND HIS FAMILY WELL. AT THIS POINT,
COMMISSIONERS DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? COMMENTS?
KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANYONE VIRTUALLY THAT WISHES TO MAKE ANY
COMMENTS?

October 27, 2021

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND 1 2 RAISED, MR. CHAIR. AND I'LL MAKE NOTE THAT BEN SENT A LETTER 3 OF APPRECIATION THAT I WILL DISTRIBUTE TO THE COMMISSIONERS THIS AFTERNOON. 4 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY. WE 6 DON'T HAVE ANY MEMBERS IN BOARD CHAMBERS THAT WISH TO PROVIDE 7 8 PUBLIC COMMENT. AT THIS POINT I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO ACCEPT MTC RESOLUTION 4491. FIRST, COMMISSIONER SPERING. 9 10 DAVID RABBIT: SECT, RABBIT. 11 12 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: SECOND BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT. ROLL 13 14 CALL VOTE, PLEASE? 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL 17 MEMBERS PRESENT. 18 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ITEM EIGHT POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL 19 REPORT. RANDI KINMAN. 20 21 22 RANDI KINMAN: GOOD MORNING CHAIR, THANK YOU. AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONED. AS SOMEBODY WHO CHAIRS A WHOLE BODY IN A HYBRID 23 SITUATION, BRAVO TO THOSE WHO MAKE IT LOOK SEAMLESS TODAY. 24 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS ACTIVELY WORKING TO COMPLETE ALL 25

October 27, 2021

WORK THIS YEAR. THIS COHORT WILL BE ENDING ITS TERM WITH 1 ORIGINAL MEMBERS, EXTENDED BY ONE MORE YEAR. WE CHOSE TO 2 3 EXTEND OUR JOURNEY AND THAT ALLOWED YOU TO HAVE ON HAND PEOPLE WITH YEARS OF SEASONED EXPERIENCE TO WRAP UP ALL PROJECTS THAT 4 5 ISSUES IN THE LAST 18 MONTHS HAVE THROWN AT US NOT JUST WITH DEVOTED CREWS, OUR SHIFTING MEETING PROTOCOLS HELPED AND 6 ALLOWS US TO BE EFFICIENT AND MORE ENGAGED I HOPE THAT AS YOU 7 8 MOVE INTO NEXT YEAR'S WORK PLAN THAT YOU KEEP IN MIND TO BUILD INTO OUR SYSTEM THE FLEXIBILITY TO CONTINUE TO WORK THIS WAY. 9 SPEAKING OF WORK PLANS WE WILL BE SEATING THE NEXT COHORT 10 WHILE WE WERE BUSY WITH PLANNED BAY AREA EIR AND OTHER 11 COMMITTEES WE HAVE ISSUES WE WANT TO RAISE IN THE FUTURE WE 12 WILL BE LOOKING AT CENSUS NUMBERS THROUGH EQUITY LENSES WE 13 KNOW THERE ARE ONGOING PROJECTS BUT GIVEN TIME AND SPACE WE 14 CAN TACKLE A LOT MORE. IF YOU WERE WONDERING WHAT WE COULD 15 16 COME UP WITH I WILL POINT OUT THE EOUITY ISSUES REGARDING TOLLING HAS BEEN IN OUR WORK PLAN AND ON OUR AGENDAS SINCE 17 ANYBODY OPENED AN HOV LANE IN THE BAY AREA. SAME COULD BE SAID 18 FOR FARE INTEGRATION AND SIGNAGE PROJECTS THAT ARE NOW THE BAY 19 AREA'S TRANSIT RECOVERY PLANS AS WE DEVELOP A WORK PLAN SO 20 WILL BE THE NEXT COHORT OF POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS AND 21 22 I URGE TO YOU THINK ABOUT THE ISSUES ON YOUR WORK PLAN AND HOW THEY CAN BENEFIT FROM BEING RUN THROUGH BODY TRAINED TO 23 PROVIDE INPUT. AGAIN, THAT ENDS MY REPORT. AND THANK YOU. 24

12



ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, RANDI, FOR THAT REPORT. 1 2 COMMISSIONERS DO WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR RANDI? IS SEEING 3 NONE HERE. KIMBERLY, ANYONE VIRTUAL? 4 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO HANDS RAISED, MR. CHAIR. 5 6 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: RANDI THANK YOU FOR BEING WITH US 7 8 TODAY. ITEM NINE, OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THERESE 9 MCMILLAN. 10 THERESE MCMILLAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. CHAIR. I WILL NOTE 11 THAT I AM IN HYBRID MODE TODAY, HOPEFULLY WILL SEE YOU ALL 12 TOMORROW IN PERSON. I WANT TO OUICKLY START WITH A NOD TO BEN. 13 FOR ANYONE WHO HAS BEEN INVOLVED WITH PLANNING, YOU KNOW THAT 14 15 GOOD MODELERS ARE A GOLDEN TREASURE, AND WE HAVE GREAT 16 MODELERS, AND I WISH HIM GOOD LUCK AND CONGRATULATIONS TO HIM. LAST WEEK WAS A MOMENTOUS WEEK, AND I AM, SORT OF, STATING THE 17 OBVIOUS BUT IT'S WORTH MENTIONING AS PART OF THE ED REPORT FOR 18 THE MONTH THAT WE ADOPTED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. [LAUGHTER] BY 19 UNANIMOUS VOTE BOTH BY THE COMMISSION AND OF ABAG EXECUTIVE 20 21 BOARD. IT REALLY WAS A MILESTONE THAT WAS YEARS IN THE MAKING. WE HAVE CONGRATULATED STAFF PROFUSELY. BUT, AGAIN, WE 22 WOULD NOT HAVE GOTTEN THAT VOTE WITHOUT THE UNBELIEVABLE 23 SACRIFICE AND COMMITMENT OF TOO MANY PEOPLE ON STAFF TO 24 MENTION, AS WELL AS YOU. AND THE SUPPORT THAT YOU ALL GAVE US, 25

October 27, 2021

AGAIN, FOR MANY STICKY ISSUES, YOU STOOD BEHIND US AS WE 1 WORKED THROUGH THEM. YOU GAVE US GREAT COUNSEL ON MANY ISSUES 2 3 AND CHALLENGES THAT WE SAW ALONG THE WAY. SO I HOPE WE ALL CONTINUE TO DRAW GREAT SATISFACTION FROM THIS, BUT NOTING, AS 4 5 WELL, THE WORK IS NOT DONE. NOW WE LAUNCH INTO THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, WHICH IS REALLY SPEAKING TO HOW ARE WE 6 GOING TO CARRY OUT MANY OF THE AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES THAT ARE 7 8 AHEAD. AND THE COMMISSION WORKSHOP WE'LL BE TAKING THAT ON, ON SOME SPECIFIC ONES. SO JUST WANTED TO USE THE OPPORTUNITY TO 9 STAGE THAT FOR YOU. SECOND POINT, AND, AGAIN, SORT OF, TYING 10 -- OR CONNECTING DOTS TOGETHER ON THOSE NEXT STEPS, AS ONE 11 EXAMPLE OF THE SUPPORT TOOLS THAT WE HAVE FOR THE BROADER 12 PORTFOLIO PLANNED BAY AREA, INCLUDING HOUSING, THE REGIONAL 13 HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM, UNDER THE GUIDANCE OF 14 15 OUR TEAM, HAS RELEASED A HOUSING ELEMENT SITE SELECTION TOOL. 16 A LOT OF WEBINARS HAVE BEEN CONDUCTED WITH A LOT OF PARTICIPATION. BUT THIS REALLY IS A PRETTY GROUND-BREAKING 17 TOOL FOR ASSISTING OUR JURISDICTIONS TO DETERMINE WHICH SITE 18 MEETS STATE REQUIREMENTS FOR ZONING. THIS IS ALL WITHIN THE 19 PURVIEW OF IMPLEMENTING RHNA AND THE HOUSING ELEMENT. 20 SO, 21 AGAIN, THIS INVOLVED A LOT OF FEEDBACK FROM LOCAL 22 JURISDICTIONS ON WHAT THEY NEEDED AND HERE IS AN EXAMPLE WHERE THEY ACTUALLY HAVE PROVIDED SOMETHING OF GREAT VALUE. THE 23 THIRD THING I WOULD LIKE TO MENTION IS ON OCTOBER THE 25TH, 24 WHICH WAS JUST MONDAY, FTA ANNOUNCED A LETTER OF INTENT, OR AN 25

October 27, 2021

LOI, BECAUSE WE LOVE ACRONYMS FOR VTA BART SILICON VALLEY 1 2 PROJECT, PHASE TWO, ANNOUNCING THE PROJECT WAS SELECTED FOR 3 FUNDING THROUGH THE EXPEDITED PROJECT DELIVERY PILOT PROGRAM PUT FORWARD BY THE LAST ADMINISTRATION. IT IS AN IMPORTANT 4 5 STEP TOWARDS SECURING A FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT FROM FTA, AND, SO WE'RE VERY GRATEFUL FOR THAT WORK, AND, OF COURSE, 6 AMONG MANY PARTNERS, WE WILL BE WORKING ON VTA ON THE PATH 7 8 AHEAD. I WOULD NOTE THAT AT THE REQUEST OF ASSEMBLYMAN --STATE ASSEMBLYMAN TING, AND SENATE -- SENATOR NANCY SKINNER 9 10 CHAIRS OF THE RESPECTIVE ASSEMBLY AND SENATE BUDGET COMMITTEES, WE DISCUSSED TRANSIT PRIORITIES FOR THE REGION 11 WITH BOTH OF OUR LEGISLATORS WHO ARE WANTING TO GET AHEAD OF 12 THE CONTINUING DISCUSSION THAT WILL BE ATTACHED TO THE NEXT 13 STATE BUDGET, AND THE REMAININGS OF CARRY OVER ISSUES ATTACHED 14 15 TO TRANSPORTATION, INCLUDING HIGH SPEED RAIL, AND HOW THE 16 BUDGET SURPLUS, WHICH BY ALL ACCOUNTS, CONTINUES TO BE REFINED, AND INCREASED IN TERMS OF ESTIMATES FROM THE LAO. 17 WANTING TO MAKE SURE, VERY MUCH, LIKE LA HAS DONE, TO HAVE A 18 CLEAR SENSE OF WHAT OUR PROGRAMMATIC AND PROJECT PRIORITIES 19 MAY BE. IT WAS A VERY GOOD DISCUSSION. I WOULD SAY ONE OF 20 21 SEVERAL, AND WE CERTAINLY WILL BE KEEPING THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE APPRISED OF THIS FLUID SITUATION AS IT PROCEEDS. 22 SO, MR. CHAIR, THAT CONCLUDES MY REPORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 23 24

October 27, 2021

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH THERESE. AND I 1 JUST WANT TO CALL ATTENTION TO THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WEB 2 3 PORTAL. I THINK THAT'S AN INCREDIBLE TOOL, THERESE, THAT COULD BE SCALEABLE. YOU KNOW, ONE THING AS MAYOR ARREGUIN AND I HAVE 4 5 BEEN LISTENING, WE HAVE THE ABILITY TO GET MORE HOUSING UNITS APPROVED BUT THERE IS BACKLOG BECAUSE OF PLANNING. I THINK 6 FOCUSING ON THAT ABAG SPACE COULD BE INSTRUMENTAL AND A ROLE 7 8 ABAG COULD PLAY TO GET MORE UNITS BUILT IF THERE IS CAPACITY. I WANT TO CALL ATTENTION TO THAT I THINK IT'S A GREAT TOOL FOR 9 MUNICIPALITIES. ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARDROOM? SEEING NONE. 10 KIMBERLY ANY VIRTUALLY? 11

12

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. WE HAVE ONE HAND RAISED. I HAVE
14 RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, MR. CHAIR. MR. LEBRUN. PLEASE
15 UNMUTE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

16

SPEAKER: THANK YOU GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU FOR 17 THE OPPORTUNITY. AS SOME OF YOU KNOW I HAVE BEEN WRITING TO 18 THE COMMISSION ABOUT PROJECT, INCLUDING THE MAINTAINING PHASE 19 1 AND 100% TWO AND A HALF BILLION DOLLARS OVER BUDGET FOR 20 21 PHASE ONE. THE QUESTION IS, YOU KNOW THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT HAVE NOW INCREASED THE ESTIMATE FOR PHASE ONE BY \$2.2 BILLION. 22 SO THE OUESTION IS, IS THIS THE SAME AMOUNT? ARE WE TALKING 23 ABOUT THE SAME MONEY HERE? IF NOT, I THINK THERE IS ABSOLUTELY 24 NO WAY THE VTA IS ANYWHERE NEAR THE FINANCIAL CAPACITY TO 25



EMBARK ON THIS PROJECT, LET ALONE TO BRING IT TO SOME KIND OF 1 A SUCCESSFUL COMPLETION. SO, IN INTEREST OF TIME, LET ME WRAP 2 3 UP HERE AND GET STRAIGHT TO THE POINT HERE. I'M RESPECTFULLY REOUESTING THAT THE COMMISSION -- THAT THE COMMISSION, 4 5 IMMEDIATELY ENGAGE IN THE OVERSIGHT OF THIS PROJECT. STARTING WEATHER EXPEDITED PROJECT FUNDING, THAT CAPS FEDERAL 6 CONTRIBUTIONS AT 25% IS APPROPRIATE, WHETHER THE VTA SHOULD BE 7 8 -- SHOULD COME TO SEE THE TRANSITIONING TO A FEDERAL USE START APPLICATION, WHICH CAPS FEDERAL FUNDING AT 50 -- 5-0%. THANK 9 YOU. 10 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HAND 12

13 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

14

15 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND, THANK YOU,
16 ROLAND. SEEING NO FURTHER QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS. I'LL
17 MOVE TO ITEM TEN, COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? KIMBERLY
18 SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS VIRTUALLY

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SEEING NONE.

21

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM 11 CONSENT
CALENDAR, IF THERE IS NO QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS I'LL
ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR OUR CONSENT CALENDAR.



CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES FOR CONSENT CALENDAR. 1 2 3 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: DUTRA-VERNACI MAKES THE MOTION. 4 5 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: I'LL SECOND. 6 7 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: SECOND BY GLOVER. KIMBERLY ANY 8 COMMENT FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC? 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 10 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 11 ON THIS ITEM. 12 13 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: WE HAVE A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER 14 15 DUTRA-VERNACI, AND SECOND BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. ROLL CALL 16 VOTE, PLEASE. 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL 18 19 MEMBERS PRESENT. 20 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S MOVE ON TO 21 22 COMMITTEE REPORTS. ITEM 12, PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS 23 COMMITTEE. CHAIR RABBIT, TAKE IT AWAY. 24

October 27, 2021

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE PROGRAMMING AND 1 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY ON OCTOBER 13TH, 2021 AND 2 3 REFERRED THE FOLLOW ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4450 REVISED FISCAL YEAR 2021 '22 FUND 4 5 ESTIMATE. UPDATES TO FUND ESTIMATE TO REFLECT ACTUAL FISCAL YEAR '21 -- EXCUSE ME -- 2020, 2021 REVENUE FOR THE STATE 6 7 TRANSIT, STA STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAMS AND REVISES FISCAL 8 YEAR 2021, '22 REVENUE ESTIMATES ACCORDINGLY AND I MOVE 9 APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4450 REVISED. 10 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: FIRST BY CHAIR RABBIT. LOOK FOR A 11 SECOND. 12 13 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN SECOND. 14 15 16 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: SECOND BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. KIMBERLY HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM? 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 20 21 ON THIS ITEM. 22 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONERS, IF THERE IS 23 NO FURTHER QUESTIONS. WE HAVE A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT 24



AND I BELIEVE THE SECOND WAS COMMISSIONER PAPAN. ROLL CALL 1 2 VOTE, PLEASE. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL 4 5 MEMBERS PRESENT. 6 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBIT. 7 8 WE'RE GOING MOVE TO ITEM 13, COMMISSION APPROVAL 13AMTC RESOLUTION 4481 REVISED AMERICAN RESCUE ACT PHASE TWO 9 PROGRAMMING RECOMMENDATION. I'M GOING TO TURN THIS OVER TO 10 THERESA. 11 12 THERESA ROMMELL: THE ITEM BEFORE YOU TODAY IS A PROGRAMMING 13 PROPOSAL FOR PHASE TWO AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ACT ARP COVID 14 RELIEF FUND FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. AS YOU RECALL AT THE 15 16 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING STAFF PROVIDED BACKGROUND ON THE RECENT FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION'S 17 FUNDING OPPORTUNITY FOR 2.2 BILLION IN ADDITIONAL OPERATING 18 ASSISTANCE. THESE FUNDS ARE COMPETITIVE AND AT FTA'S 19 DISCRETION TO DISTRIBUTE. ONE OF THE REOUIREMENTS OF 20 APPLICANTS FOR THIS ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE FUNDING IS THAT THEY 21 22 DEMONSTRATE THE LEVEL OF OPERATING ASSISTANCE THE OPERATOR HAD 23 RECEIVED FROM ALL THREE COVID RELIEF PACKAGES, THAT INCLUDES CARES, CRRSAA AND ARP. PROBLEMATIC FOR MTC THE GOVERNMENT HAS 24 SAID UNPROGRAMMED AMOUNTS OF COVID-19 FUNDING REMAINING IN 25

October 27, 2021

URBANIZED AREA FOR THE APPLICANTS WOULD BE ELIGIBLE CONSIDERED 1 2 AVAILABLE AS FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE FOR OPERATOR APPLICATION FOR 3 ADDITIONAL SYSTEMS DUE IN EARLY NOVEMBER WE INTENDED FOR THE PROGRAM PHASE TWO DECEMBER OR JANUARY TIME FRAME TO ALLOW FOR 4 5 DISTRIBUTION INFORMED BY THE PACE AND EXTENT OF THE PANDEMIC RECOVERY WE INFORMED THAT WE WOULD BE COMING BACK TO YOU AT 6 THE COMMISSION MEETING TO PROGRAM REMAINING FUND TO OPERATORS 7 8 THIS MONTH AND HAD FURTHER INTENDED PROGRAM REMAINING FUND THAT HAD BEEN SET-ASIDE FOR BLUE RIBBON INACTIVES AS WELL AS 9 SPECIFIC HARDSHIP FOCUSED RECOVERY STRATEGIES TO MTC FOR LATER 10 DETERMINATION ON HOW FUNDS WOULD BE EXPENDED. FOLLOWING THE 11 OCTOBER PACT MEETING WE HAD ADDITIONAL CONVERSATIONS WITH FTA 12 WHO INDICATE THAT PROGRAMMING ANY FUND TO BE USED FOR BLUE 13 RIBBON OR UNSPECIFIED PURPOSES INSTEAD OF ON DIRECT TRANSIT 14 15 OPERATING SUPPORT MAY HARM THE COMPETITIVENESS OF BAY AREA 16 OPERATORS APPLYING F A SHARE OF THE 2.2 BILLION IN ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE. STAFF HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS 17 18 OVER THE PAST COUPLE OF WEEKS TO DEVELOP A REFINED 19 RECOMMENDATION FOR ARP PHASE TWO PROGRAMMING. OUR RECOMMENDATION APPROACH, TODAY, WOULD DISTRIBUTE THE ARP FUNDS 20 TO ALL BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES FOR OPERATING RELIEF USING 21 22 THE FORMULA DEVELOPED FOR THE JULY 2020 PROGRAMMING OF PHASE 23 ONE. IT WOULD RESPOND TO SPECIFIC HARDSHIP REOUESTS FROM SFMTA AND VTA AND FULLY CORRECT FOR DATA INCONSISTENCY THAT IMPACTED 24 THE CALTRAIN AND WETA DISTRIBUTION. AND THAT HAS CARRIED 25

October 27, 2021

FORWARD TO PHASE TWO. THIS APPROACH WOULD ENSURE THAT TRANSIT 1 FUNDING PLANNED FOR NEAR-TERM COMMISSION PROGRAMMING AND 2 3 ALLOCATION INCLUDING STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE AND FTA FORMULA FUNDING WOULD BE AVAILABLE FOR BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES AT THE 4 5 MINIMUM AMOUNT OF \$85 MILLION. AND, LASTLY, THE APPROACH WOULD FULFILL THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE FTA'S NOTICE OF FUNDING 6 OPPORTUNITY FOR THE 2.2 BILLION IN COMPETITIVE COVID RELIEF IN 7 8 ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE AND ENSURE THAT BAY AREA OPERATORS WOULD 9 BE ABLE TO COMPETE WELL FOR THOSE FUNDS. YOU CAN FIND A SUMMARY OF STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWING THIS APPROACH IN 10 11 ATTACHMENT A TO THIS ITEM. IN REGARD TO HARDSHIP FUNDING, DUE TO COMMISSIONER INPUT AT THE OCTOBER PACT MEETING AND ON 12 ACCOUNT OF SFMTA SHARE OF BAY AREA TRANSIT RIDERSHIP STAFF IS 13 PROPOSE TO PROGRAM \$29.7 MILLION OF REMAINING HARDSHIP TO 14 SFMTA TO LIMIT THE IMPACT OF REDUCED SERVICE LEVELS ON TRANSIT 15 16 DEPENDENT RIDERS AND TO FURTHER ADDRESS IMPACTS OF 2021 TRAGEDY REMAINING \$1.8 MILLION REMAINING HARDSHIP FUNDS TO BE 17 18 PROGRAMMED TO VTA SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS WOULD ASSIST ARE REVENUE 19 LOSSES ASSOCIATED WITH TEMPORARY LIMITATION OF LIGHT RAIL SERVICE RESULTING FROM THE TRAGEDY AND BRING TOTAL HARDSHIP 20 PROGRAM TO VTA TO \$30.4 MILLION. AND STAFF RECOMMENDING 21 22 PROGRAM TOTAL \$2.4 MILLION HARDSHIPS FUNDS TO CALTRAIN AND 23 WETA TO RECONCILE UNDER DISTRIBUTION FUNDING CAUSED BY DATA INCONSISTENCY CARRIED OVER FROM PHASE ONE DISTRIBUTION. I WANT 24 TO ERIC SIZE RECOMMENDATIONS PLAN FOR ENSURING SUFFICIENT 25

October 27, 2021

FUNDING AVAILABLE TO TRANSIT FOR BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY 1 TASK FORCE INITIATIVES ALTHOUGH PROSING DISTRIBUTION OF \$85 2 3 MILLION INTENDED TO BE USED FOR INITIATIVES TO OPERATORS AS PART OF PHASE OPERATORS APPLYING F ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE WE 4 5 ANTICIPATE REPLACING ARP FUNDS WITH ALTERNATE NEAR-TERM REVENUE SOURCES SUCH AS STATE AND FEDERAL FUND TRANSIT FUNDING 6 IN PROPORTION TO OPERATORS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WITH EXCEPTION 7 8 OF THE HARDSHIP FUNDING AUGMENTATION THIS DOESN'T CHANGE OVERALL NET FUNDING FOR OPERATORS IT SIMPLY ADJUSTS TIME FRAME 9 AND SERVICES AVAILABLE TO FINISHED BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES FOR 10 11 PURPOSES OF EXPEDITING DISTRIBUTION OF ARP FUNDING AND WE KNOW WE HAVE OPERATOR SUPPORT FOR THIS RECOMMENDATION. STAFF 12 BELIEVE THIS IS RECOMMENDATION POSITION FOR THE BAY AREA TO BE 13 COMPETITIVE FOR THE \$2.2 BILLION IN ASSISTANCE FUNDING AND 14 WILL ALSO PRESERVE THE ABILITY TO DELIVER ON GOALS AND 15 16 OUTCOMES DEVELOPED THROUGHOUT BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE RENEWAL PROCESS AND OPERATORS TO APPLY FOR THE \$2.2 17 18 BILLION IN ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE IS NOVEMBER 8TH THEREFORE WE 19 REQUEST ACTION ON THIS PROPOSAL THIS MONTH THEREFORE ASK FOR SUPPORT IN RESOLUTION NUMBER 4481 REVISED AND STAFF TO WORK 20 WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS TO RESERVE EQUIVALENT AMOUNT FUNDING 21 22 INTENDED FOR BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES APPROXIMATELY \$85 MILLION 23 FROM PROGRAMMING APPLICATIONS AND ACTIONS. WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. 24

25



ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. ALSO 1 2 WITH THE STASH. ANY COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? 3 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU THERESA FOR FINDING A SOLUTION TO 4 5 BLUE RIBBON. THOSE NEAR-TERM PROJECTS ARE CRITICAL TO THE TRANSIT RECOVERY. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THE VTA AND SFMTA 6 SOLUTION. I THINK THAT WAS A GOOD APPROACH. AND I WANT TO 7 8 COMPLEMENT STAFF FOR FINDING THAT BALANCE. 9 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. I 10 DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS IN THE ROOM. KIMBERLY, IF WE 11 COULD GO VIRTUALLY, I KNOW WE HAVE VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, AND 12 I SEE COMMISSIONER GLOVER RAISING HIS REAL HAND. 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. MR. CHAIR, IF YOU WOULD LIKE I'LL 15 16 CALL ON COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND GO DOWN THE LIST FOR YOU. 17 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. 18 19 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: THANK YOU. YOU CAN TALK ABOUT SMALL 20 21 OPERATORS. 22 23 THERESA ROMMELL: IN TERMS OF THE \$85 MILLION DISTRIBUTION? 24 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES. 25

October 27, 2021

1 THERESA ROMMELL: AS NOTED VERY LITTLE OF THE 85 MILLION 2 DISTRIBUTION WILL BE GOING TO THE SMALL OPERATORS AND OUR 3 INTENTION IS ONLY TO TAKE A LIKE AMOUNT FROM AVAILABLE NEAR-4 5 TERM REVENUE SOURCES. SO WE DON'T BELIEVE THAT WE WILL BURDEN ANY SMALL OPERATORS WITH THIS PROPOSAL. 6 7 8 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: OKAY. BUT, ARE WE GOING TO BE ABLE TO DO ANYTHING IN TERMS OF ENHANCEMENTS? 9 10 THERESA ROMMELL: OH, I SEE. I BELIEVE THAT THE BLUE RIBBON 11 ACTION PLAN INCORPORATES IMPROVEMENTS FOR THE ENTIRE REGION, 12 BUT I'LL DEFER TO ANYBODY ELSE WHO WANTS TO PROVIDE INPUT ON 13 14 THAT. 15 16 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: JIM, IS IT ANY -- COMMISSIONER SPERING, IS THERE ANYTHING THAT YOU COULD ADD TO THAT? 17 18 JAMES P. SPERING: NO. I -- YOU KNOW, I THINK THE BLUE RIBBON, 19 HOPEFULLY, IS GOING TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE ISSUES, I THINK, 20 21 THAT YOU'RE RAISING. THAT IS THE INTENT. THEY PLAY A VERY IMPORTANT ROLE. AND, BUT IT -- YOU KNOW, THIS IS A BALANCING 22 ACT, AS THERESE IS SAYING. WE'RE JUST TRYING TO FIND COMMON 23 GROUND THAT SERVES ALL OF THE OPERATORS AND I THINK THIS PLAN 24



DOES IT. BUT THE SMALL OPERATORS ARE NOT GOING TO BE NEGLECTED 1 2 AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS. 3 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: ABSOLUTELY. ALL RIGHT. 4 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? 9 NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. I ALSO WANT TO THANK 10 STAFF FOR THEIR CONTINUED WIZARDRY IN HOW THEY'RE KIND OF LIKE 11 MAKING SURE THAT OUR REGION IS REALLY COMPETITIVE FOR FEDERAL 12 FUND AND DOING IT IN A WAY WHICH IS FAIR TO TRANSIT OPERATORS. 13 AND I PARTICULARLY WANT TO THANK STAFF AND COMMISSIONER 14 15 SPERING, AND CHAIR PEDROZA FOR, SORT OF, HELPING MAKE SURE 16 SFMTA'S HARDSHIP WAS RECOGNIZED. AND JUST VERY APPRECIATIVE OF THAT. AND I KNOW THAT OTHER AGENCY'S HARDSHIPS WERE RECOGNIZED 17 IN THE PREVIOUS ROUND, AND THEY'RE ALSO GETTING RECOGNIZED IN 18 THIS ROUND AND THAT'S ALSO IMPORTANT. THANK YOU. 19 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RONEN? 21 22 DIR. HILLARY RONEN: THANK YOU SO MUCH. SIMILARLY, I WANTED TO 23 THANK STAFF, BUT, PARTICULARLY, COMMISSIONER SPERING AND OTHER 24 COMMISSIONERS AT THE PLANS AND PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE WHO 25

1

October 27, 2021

REALLY STOOD UP FOR MTA IN SAN FRANCISCO, AND UNDERSTANDING

THAT, YOU KNOW, THE FORMULA THAT'S BEING USED TO DISTRIBUTE 2 3 THE ARP FUNDS DISADVANTAGED MTA AND THE PROMISE MADE IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF EARLIER FUNDS TO THE DISTRIBUTION WOULD BE 4 5 WEIGHTED IN THE SECOND ROUND TOWARD RIDERSHIP BUT ULTIMATELY, I FEEL THE SITUATION TAKES EVERYONE'S NEEDS INTO CONSIDERATION 6 INCLUDING THE FASTER DISTRIBUTION OF THESE FUNDS MAKES SENSE. 7 8 I THINK THAT WHEN WE KEEP OUR PROMISES TO ONE ANOTHER, WHEN WE THINK REGIONALLY, AND LOOK OUT FOR THE WELL-BEING OF THE 9 ENTIRE SYSTEM AND NOT JUST THE SYSTEMS THAT ARE INDIVIDUAL 10 CITIES, THAT THAT'S -- THAT'S WHEN WE'RE AT OUR BEST. AND I 11 JUST CAN'T APPRECIATE ENOUGH ALL THE COMMISSIONERS THAT STOOD 12 UP FOR MTA AT PLANS AND PROGRAMMING. IT MEANS A LOT. AND IT 13 FOSTERS THAT SPIRIT THAT, I THINK WE ALL WANT TO CONTINUE TO 14 OPERATE WITH HERE ON THIS BODY. SO, THANKS A LOT. 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO? 17 18 SAM LICCARDO: THANK YOU. HOPEFULLY I HAVE MY -- OH, MY MUTE 19 IS OFF. THANK YOU. I JUST HAD A OUESTION ABOUT THE INITIAL 20 21 ALLOCATION -- I'M SORRY -- LET ME REPHRASE THAT. THE QUESTION ABOUT HOW FEDERAL [INDISCERNIBLE] DOLLARS WERE DISTRIBUTED TO 22 BEGIN WITH. WHAT WAS THE FORMULA THAT THE FEDS USED TO DECIDE 23 WHICH MPOS WOULD GET HOW MUCH MONEY? DESCRIBE JUST SOME OF 24 THE BASIC ELEMENTS OF THAT FORMULA? 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

October 27, 2021

1 THERESA ROMMELL: I CAN TRY. I BELIEVE WHAT THEY LOOKED AT 2 3 WAS, WITHIN AN URBANIZED AREA, WHICH OPERATORS HAD RECEIVED A CERTAIN PERCENTAGE ABOVE THEIR OPERATING EXPENSE AND THERE WAS 4 5 A CUT OFF LINE. SO ANY OPERATORS, I BELIEVE IT WAS 135% OF THEIR OPERATING EXPENSES WERE ELIGIBLE FOR FUNDING AND THE 6 7 FUNDS WERE DISTRIBUTED PROPORTIONATELY AMONG THE UZAS. 8 9 SAM LICCARDO: OKAY. SO IT'S BY UZA, NOT BY MPO, IS THAT RIGHT? 10 THERESA ROMMELL: THAT'S RIGHT. 11 12 SAM LICCARDO: SO THERE WAS MONEY DISTRIBUTED TO THE SAN 13 FRANCISCO OAKLAND UZA, IS THAT RIGHT? 14 15 16 THERESA ROMMELL: THAT'S RIGHT. 17 SAM LICCARDO: AND SEPARATE ALLOCATION TO SAN JOSE METRO UZA. 18 19 THERESA ROMMELL: SEPARATE PORTION DISTRIBUTED. 20 21 22 SAM LICCARDO: COULD YOU DESCRIBE WHAT WAS ALLOCATED TO THE SAN 23 JOSE METRO UZA? 24



THERESA ROMMELL: I WILL HAVE TO LOOK THAT UP BUT I CAN 1 2 PROBABLY GET THAT TO YOU RELATIVELY QUICKLY. 3 SAM LICCARDO: OKAY. IF YOU WANT MAYBE WE CAN GO TO OTHER 4 5 OUESTIONS WHILE YOU'RE LOOKING THAT UP. I'M HAPPY TO WAIT. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I'LL CALL ON COMMISSIONER AHN? 8 EDDIE AHN: YEAH, JUST BRIEFLY. I WAS FOLLOWING THIS ITEM, EVEN 9 THOUGH I WASN'T PRESENT AT THE COMMITTEE MEETING WHEN THIS WAS 10 DISCUSSED, AND I WANT TO, AGAIN, THANK STAFF, AS WELL AS 11 RECOGNIZE THE LEADERSHIP OF COMMISSIONERS RONEN, SPERING, AND 12 JOSEFOWITZ FOR HELPING US FIND A FAIR RESOLUTION ON THIS. 13 14 THANK YOU. 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT COMMISSIONER IS ABE-KOGA. 17 18 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR, THANK YOU 19 STAFF, FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK ON THIS. I APPRECIATE THE CHALLENGES AND TRYING TO JUGGLE AND FIND BALANCE AMONGST ALL 20 OF OUR DIFFERENT CONSTITUENCIES. I JUST HAD ONE QUESTION. 21 ΙN REGARDS TO THE HARDSHIP FUNDS, WAS THERE A FORMULA THAT WAS 22 USED TO DECIDE? OR, HOW DID YOU COME UP WITH THE NUMBERS FOR, 23 IN PARTICULAR, VTA, AND SFMTA'S APPORTIONMENT? 24 25

October 27, 2021

THERESA ROMMELL: THERE WAS NO FORMULA USED. MOST OF THE
 HARDSHIP FUNDS WERE DISTRIBUTED BASED ON INPUT FROM
 COMMISSIONERS AND SPECIFIC REQUESTS ON ACTUAL -- ON ACTUAL
 LOSSES RESULTING FROM A SPECIFIC HARDSHIP.

5

THERESE MCMILLAN: LET ME ADD TO THAT, COMMISSIONER. AS, YOU 6 KNOW, THERESA SAID, WE -- I DON'T KNOW IF YOUR QUESTION WAS 7 8 SPECIFIC TO THE SECOND DECISION ON THE HARDSHIP, OR THE PRIOR, BUT AS WE SAID, WITH THE FIRST DISTRIBUTION -- WELL, I THINK 9 10 IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE BOTH, BECAUSE THEY WORK IN TANDEM -- WITH THE FIRST DISTRIBUTION AS WAS POINTED OUT, THERE WERE 11 A FEW AGENCIES THAT DID COME FORWARD, OUTLINING PARTICULAR 12 HARDSHIPS RELATIVE TO, ESSENTIALLY, THE AMOUNT OF DISTRIBUTION 13 THAT HAS BEEN APPLIED REGIONALLY, AND THEN, YOU KNOW, 14 15 BASICALLY, IN ADDITION, THERE IS THESE EXTRAORDINARY, FOR LACK 16 OF A BETTER TERM, EXTRAORDINARY NEEDS THAT NEED TO BE DONE. 17 THAT WAS A SIMILAR SITUATION FOR THE SECOND DISTRIBUTION, WITH THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT THAT THERE WAS A -- YOU KNOW, 18 CONSIDERATION, OF WHO WAS IN THE FIRST TRANCHE, UNDER PHASE 19 BECAUSE AS THERESE SAID, EXPLAINED EXTREMELY CLEARLY, 20 ONE. 21 THERE WAS A VERY QUICK PIVOT THAT WE HAD TO DO, BASED ON THE FTA CIRCUMSTANCES, THAT TOOK US AWAY FROM THE GAME PLAN THAT 22 WE HAD BEFORE. AND IN THE CASE OF BOTH SFMTA, AND VTA, WE DID 23 WORK WITH THE GM'S OF BOTH AGENCIES ON A SPECIFIC REQUEST, AND 24 THAT IS REFLECTED IN THE RECOMMENDATION. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

October 27, 2021

CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL COMMISSION 2 3 HANDS RAISED, MR. CHAIR. THERESA, DID YOU WANT TO FOLLOW UP? 4 5 THERESA ROMMELL: YEAH. I DID GET THE ANSWER TO COMMISSIONER LICCARDO'S QUESTION. THE NEARLY 1.7 BILLION IN ARP FUNDS, SAN 6 7 JOSE'S UZA WAS 259 MILLION. 8 SAM LICCARDO: THANK YOU FOR THAT. APPRECIATE THE INFORMATION. 9 10 SO, APPRECIATE THAT THIS HAS BEEN A REALLY DIFFICULT PROCESS, AND STAFF HAS CERTAINLY DONE ITS BEST. WHEN THE PHASE ONE 11 ALLOCATION CAME OUT, YOU KNOW, MY UNDERSTANDING WAS THE PHASE 12 ONE AND THE PHASE TWO, USE, WE WERE RELYING ON THE SAME 13 FORMULA ALLOCATION. IS THAT RIGHT THERESA? 14 15 16 THERESA ROMMELL: YES YOU'RE RIGHT. WE'RE RELYING ON THE PHASE 17 ONE FORMULA. 18 SAM LICCARDO: TO BE PAROCHIAL, FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY, I WAS 19 CONCERNED WHEN I SAW A COUNTY WITH 25% OF THE POPULATION IN 20 THE REGION WOULD RECEIVE LESS THAN 6% OF THE DOLLARS THAT 21 WOULD BE ALLOCATED ACROSS THE REGION. APPRECIATE THE 22 ADDITIONAL DOLLARS THAT WERE ALLOCATED TO ASSIST IN THE WAKE 23 OF THE HORRIBLE SHOOTING AT GUADALUPE TRANSIT CENTER, AND IF 24 YOU WERE TO LOOK AT THE AGGREGATE DOLLARS YOU WOULD KNOCK IT 25

October 27, 2021

OFF BY A COUPLE% OBVIOUSLY THAT WOULD BE A LONG WAY FROM THE 1 PROPORTIONAL FOR THAT MATTER \$259 MILLION THAT WERE ACTUALLY 2 3 ALLOCATED BY THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO SAN JOSE UZA, ALLOCATION SIMULATED TO BE LESS THAN 6% ALLOCATION ACCOUNTING 4 5 25% OF THE POPULATION FOR THE WHOLE REGION, AND I KNOW WE DISCUSSED LOOKING AT THIS FORMULA AND I UNDERSTAND STAFF HAS 6 BEEN PUT IN EYE VERY DIFFICULT POSITION HERE BECAUSE OF THE 7 8 NEWS OF THIS MORE THAN \$2 BILLION OPPORTUNITY, NATION-WIDE, STAFF FELT IT IMPORTANT TO BRING THIS FORWARD NOW, AND I 9 UNDERSTAND PROBABLY A TIME FOR EVERYONE TO REVISIT THE 10 FORMULA. I CERTAINLY APPRECIATE THAT A LOT OF FOLKS ARE DOING 11 EVERYTHING IN GOOD FAITH AS BEST THEY CAN. I'M NOT GOING TO 12 SUPPORT BECAUSE WE GET LESS THAN 6% ALLOCATION IN THE REGION 13 IN WHICH WE HAVE 25% POPULATION NOWHERE NEAR WHAT THE FEDERAL 14 15 GOVERNMENT WOULD HAVE ALLOCATED TO US IF WE HAD BEEN A 16 SEPARATE -- IF WE HAD OUR OWN CONTROL OVER OUR OWN UZA, TO PUT IT BLUNTLY. A LOT OF THESE DOLLARS ARE GOING ELSEWHERE. I 17 RECOGNIZE THIS WILL BE APPROVED AND LARGELY SUPPORTED BY THIS 18 BOARD. I WOULD EXPECT THAT TO BE THE CASE. I'M JUST NOT GOING 19 TO VOTE FOR IT. BECAUSE I WOULD HAVE PREFERRED TO SEE A MUCH 20 DIFFERENT FORM LOOKS AND I'M NOT BLAMING ANYBODY. I KNOW STAFF 21 22 IS DOING THE BEST THEY CAN. STAFF HAS AGREED TO WORK WITH US 23 TO ADDRESS ADDITIONAL OUTSTANDING ISSUES WITH REGARD TO THE NEED FOR CAPITAL REPLACEMENT OVER AT THE GUADALUPE FACILITY, I 24 AM SIMPLY CONCERNED THAT THIS SUPPORTING THIS WOULD BE SETTING 25



A PRECEDENT OF SOME SORT FOR HOW WE EXPECT DOLLARS TO BE
ALLOCATED GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.
CLERK OF THE BOARD: MR. CHAIR, I'M SEEING NO OTHER
COMMISSIONER HAND RAISED. WOULD YOU LIKE TO GO BACK TO THE
BOARDROOM OR TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT.
ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: LET'S GO TO THE COMMISSIONERS. THEN
WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. COMMISSIONER CANEPA AND
COMMISSIONER WORTH.
DAVID CANEPA: THERESA I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS FOR YOU. IF
WE DON'T DO ANYTHING TODAY AND DON'T APPROVE THIS THAT
BASICALLY MEANS \$2.2 BILLION IN TRANSPORTATION DOLLARS WE
WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO APPLY FOR. IS THAT CORRECT?
THERESE MCMILLAN: I DON'T KNOW WHETHER YOU SAID THERESA OR
THERESE? YOU CAN APPLY BUT YOU WILL BE HIGHLY DISADVANTAGED
YOU WILL HAVE A WEAK APPLICATION. THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE BEEN
ADVISED.
DAVID CANEPA: SO IF WE DON'T DO THAT, WE'RE DISADVANTAGED AND
THE HIGH LIKELIHOOD OF US GETTING \$2.2 BILLION FOR THE REGION,
WE PROBABLY WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO GET THAT FUNDING. IS THAT WHAT
I'M HEARING THERESE?

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

October 27, 2021

1 THERESE MCMILLAN: WE WOULD -- AGAIN, THE 2.2 BILLION IS A 2 3 NATIONAL NUMBER. JUST TO POINT OUT I'M NOT SURE THAT WAS CLEAR, SO WE WOULD BE COMPETING FOR A PIECE OF IT, AND ANY 4 5 COMPETITION, THE OUTCOMES ARE NOT, YOU KNOW, GUARANTEED OR CERTAIN, BUT WHAT IS A CLEAR MESSAGE FROM FTA IS ABSENT THIS 6 ACTION BASED ON THE LENSES THROUGH WHICH THEY'RE VIEWING THIS 7 8 AS A NATIONAL POLICY, OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS WOULD BE DISADVANTAGED IN TERMS OF AN INTERPRETATION OF NEED AGAINST 9 10 THE SPECIAL FUND. CON 11 DAVID CANEPA: YOU CAN TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE DEADLINE AND 12 THE APPLICATION PROCESS AND MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS ITEM 13 TODAY? WHEN IS THE APPLICATION PROCESS FOR THE FEDERAL 14 15 GOVERNMENT? 16 THERESE MCMILLAN: I'LL LET THERESE ADDRESS THOSE DETAILS. 17 18 THERESA ROMMELL: DEADLINE APPLICATION FOR ASSISTANCE IS 19 NOVEMBER 8TH. SO IF YOU WERE NOT TO TAKE ACTION TODAY, THEN, 20 21 YOU KNOW, WHATEVER IS REMAIN BEING AS AVAILABLE, UNPROGRAMMED 22 FUNDING WITHIN THE URBANIZED AREAS WOULD BE ASSUMED TO BE AVAILABLE FOR FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO ANY APPLICANT, ANY 23 OPERATOR APPLYING IN THAT URBANIZED AREA. 24



DAVID CANEPA: I'M SORRY THERESE. I MENTIONED \$2.2 BILLION LET 1 ME GET TO THERESE WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE IN TERMS OF FUNDING 2 3 FOR TRANSIT OPERATOR IN THE REGION? 4 5 THERESA ROMMELL: WE HAVE DONE SOME BACK OF THE ENVELOPE ESTIMATE IN HOW MUCH OPERATORS HAVE RECEIVED IN COVID-19 6 VERSUS ANTICIPATE THE ONGOING REVENUE LOSSES AND WE ESTIMATE 7 8 ANYWHERE BETWEEN 100 MILLION TO 300 MILLION WE COULD LIKELY COMPETE FOR. BUT AS THERESE MCMILLAN SAID, YOU KNOW, IT'S 9 VERY, IT'S VERY -- YOU KNOW, DETERMINED BY -- IT WILL BE 10 DETERMINED BY A LOT OF THE OTHER APPLICANTS THROUGHOUT THE 11 COUNTRY AND WHAT THEY APPLY FOR AS WELL. 12 13 DAVID CANEPA: SO WHAT I'M HEARING FROM YOU JUST FOR CLARITY IS 14 15 POTENTIALLY THERE COULD BE 100 MILLION TO \$300 MILLION 16 ESTIMATED AT STAKE, IS THAT CORRECT? 17 THERESA ROMMELL: THAT'S CORRECT. 18 19 DAVID CANEPA: COLLEAGUES, I THINK SUPERVISOR SPOKE ELOOUENTLY 20 21 ABOUT WHY THIS IS IMPORTANT STAFF HAS COME UP WITH A CONSENSUS BUILDING IDEA I KNOW CALTRAIN IS A RECIPIENT OF THIS DOLLAR, 22 WETA IS, I THINK JIM SPERING MENTIONED COMMENT IN LOGICAL 23 COMMON SENSE. SOMETIMES WE'RE ALWAYS PAROCHIAL, I DO THAT A 24

25 LOT TOO. BUT THIS IS SUCH AN IMPORTANT ISSUE TO LEAVE 100 TO

October 27, 2021

\$300 MILLION, AND FOR US TO BE DISADVANTAGED, AS A REGION, I 1 THINK WE'RE BETTER THAN THAT. I THINK WE'RE BETTER THAN THAT. 2 3 AND SO COLLEAGUES, I FULLY SUPPORT THIS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE BAY AREA. I'M NOT GOING TO SUPPORT SOMETHING 4 5 THAT DOESN'T APPROPRIATELY FUND TRANSIT OPERATORS. WE RECEIVED A LETTER IN OUR PACKET. THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, WE ALL HAVE 6 DIFFERENT OPINIONS. EVEN TRANSIT OPERATORS, THEY'RE IN FULL 7 8 SUPPORT OF THIS. I THINK WE SHOULD VOTE THIS ITEM UP, BECAUSE IT'S THE RIGHT THING TO DO, AND WE SHOULD SUPPORT EVERY 9 TRANSIT OPERATOR MOVING FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR 10 11

12 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER 13 WORTH?

14

AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. YOU KNOW, COMMISSIONER 15 16 CANEPA SAID IT SO ELOOUENTLY. I HAVE TO SAY I COMPLETELY AGREE. I THINK THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS WE'RE FACING RIGHT 17 NOW FIRST OF ALL WE DISCUSSED AT OUR LAST MEETING THE 18 EXPECTATION IN THE FIRST ROUND, ALL OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS 19 CAME TOGETHER, SMALLER OPERATORS, URBAN, SUBURBAN CAME UP WITH 20 21 A PLAN THAT EVERYBODY IN THE BAY AREA COULD RECEIVE BENEFITS. SO I FEEL THAT THE INTENT IN OUR COMMITMENT WAS TO LOOK AT 22 THIS NEXT ROUND, AND RECOGNIZE THOSE LARGER OPERATORS WITH THE 23 RIDERS. I THINK SAN FRANCISCO POINT OUT, THEY PUT IN 24 ADDITIONAL SUBSIDIES FOR, FROM THE CITY FOR RIDER SERVICES. 25

October 27, 2021

BUT I THINK THIS DISCUSSION IS TOUCHING ON THIS CHALLENGE WITH 1 THESE, YOU KNOW, URBANIZED AREAS. I HAD THE PRIVILEGE, 2 3 YESTERDAY, OF SPEAKING TO A GROUP OF GRADUATE UNDERGRADUATE PUBLIC POLICY STUDENTS ABOUT REGIONAL GOVERNMENT AND I THINK 4 5 ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WE LEARNED DURING THIS COVID PERIOD WHEN WE START LOOKING AT THESE DOLLARS IS HOW THE BAY AREA, THE 6 COOPERATIVE NATURE OF OUR WORK IS DEPENDENT UPON US BEING ABLE 7 8 TO MAKE THESE KINDS OF DECISIONS. OF THE. AND I THINK THE LAY OUT AND FRAMEWORK OF THE URBANIZED AREAS PROBABLY HAS NOT KEPT 9 UP WITH THE EVOLUTION OF OUR REGION. THAT'S A DISCUSSION, I 10 THINK, FOR A FUTURE TIME. BUT, AGAIN, I THINK WHEN YOU LOOK AT 11 THE CRITERIA FOR THE FACT THAT WE HAVE THESE COMMUTE SHEDS 12 THAT COMMUTE FROM COUNTY TO COUNTY, NORTH, SOUTH, EAST, AND 13 WEST, SO I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE KEEP THAT IN MIND, AS 14 WE COME FORWARD WITH THE NEXT PLAN. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR 15 16 YOUR EXCELLENT, IN TERMS OF FIGURING OUT A WAY RETAIN THE COMMITMENT TO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE BUT ALSO TO PROVIDE 17 THE DISTRIBUTION OF THESE FUNDS, AND SECOND, TO THE OPERATORS. 18 ALL THROUGH THE COVID, THEY HAVE STAYED TOGETHER, HELPED US TO 19 RESOLVE THESE ISSUES, AND I THINK THAT SPEAKS TO THE FACT THAT 20 THERE HAS BEEN THIS THOUGHTFUL COOPERATIVE DECISION MAKING 21 PROCESS. SO, THANK YOU. 22

23



ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER WORTH. I 1 DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS IN THE BOARD CHAMBERS AT 2 3 THIS POINT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI? 4 5 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YEAH. I THINK I WILL JUST GO AHEAD AND WEIGH IN AND SAY, CERTAINLY, IT'S BEEN POINTED OUT THAT TIME 6 IS OF THE ESSENCE IF THE DEADLINE IS NOVEMBER 8TH, AND THIS IS 7 8 WHAT'S RECOMMENDED, GETTING A LITTLE BIT IS BETTER THAN GETTING NOTHING AT ALL, SHOULD WE BE SUCCESSFUL. 9 10 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. I DO SEE 11 ABE-KOGA WITH HER HAND UP. LET'S DO OUR LAST ROUND. KIMBERLY 12 DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES WE DO, MR. CHAIR, AND I HAVE RECEIVED 15 ONE LETTER THAT HAS BEEN POSTED ONLINE, AND DISTRIBUTED TO 16 COMMISSIONERS IT'S A LETTER OF SUPPORT FROM THE VARIOUS 17 TRANSIT OPERATORS. AND WE HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. FIRST 18 JEFFREY TUMLIN. 19 20 JEFFREY TUMLIN: MY NAME IS JEFFREY TUMLIN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR 21 OF SFMTA. I WANT TO DRAW YOUR ATTENTION TO THE LETTER INCLUDED 22 IN YOUR PACKET TODAY, SUPPORTS STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO 23 DISTRIBUTE REMAINING ARP FUNDS BASED ON THE PHASE ONE 24 METHODOLOGY AND WE SUPPORT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BLUE 25

October 27, 2021

RIBBON TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN TO BENEFIT ALL TRANSIT 1 RIDERS INCLUDING USING UP TO \$85 MILLION IN NEAR-TERM REVENUE 2 3 SOURCES TO DELIVER A PLAN. THIS IS A CRITICAL TIMELINE BY OPPORTUNITY TO COMPLETELY THE \$2 BILLION FUNDING RECENTLY 4 5 ANNOUNCED BY THE EARLY NOVEMBER DEADLINE. FEDERAL RELIEF HAS PROVIDED A LIFELINE TO OUR AGENCIES TO RESERVE THE REGION'S 6 TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE FACE OF DEVASTATING RIDERSHIP AND 7 8 REVENUE LOSSES ENSURING SURVIVAL OF OUR AGENCIES AND DIVERTING LAYOFFS AND ENABLING SAFE TRANSIT SERVICE FOR ALL THOSE WHO 9 DEMAND LOCAL SERVICES. TRANSIT RETURN HAS CONTINUED TO BE 10 SLOW, AND FINAL ALLOCATION OF ARP FUNDS WILL CONTINUE TO SERVE 11 TRANSIT FOR THE PUBLIC WE SERVE DURING THIS LONGER THAN 12 ANTICIPATED TRANSIT RECOVERY. AND I WANT TO EXPRESS MY 13 APPRECIATION TO STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS FOR RECOMMENDING THAT 14 15 SFMTA RELIEF HARDSHIP FUNDS TO SUPPORT SERVICE TO THE LARGE 16 NUMBER OF LOW-INCOME TRANSIT USERS WHO RELY ON US EVERY DAY. THANK YOU. 17

18

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND20 LEBRUN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

21

22 SPEAKER: HELLO, AGAIN, DIRECTORS. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ADD MY 23 VOICE AND EXPRESS, FIRST OF ALL, THANKS, AND STRONG SUPPORT 24 FOR STAFF RECOMMENDATION. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS THE 25 SANTA CLARA DISCUSSION IN CONTEXT, SPECIFICALLY VTA RIGHT NOW

October 27, 2021

IS SITTING ON A SURPLUS OF APPROXIMATELY \$130 MILLION IN CARES 1 AND CRRSAA FUNDING, WHICH THEY HAVE EAR MARKED FOR THE 2 3 OPERATIONS STRUCTURAL DEFICIENCY -- DEFICIT, WHICH, QUITE FRANKLY IS CAUSED BY THE BARC PROJECT, THERE IS NO TWO-WAYS 4 5 ABOUT IT. ONE THING I WANT TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION, I HOPE I'M NOT OUT OF CONTEXT HERE, IT'S WHAT JUST HAPPENED LAST 6 WEEK. NOT ONLY VTA ARE RECOVERING AND NO LONGER PASSING UP 7 8 PASSENGERS, THEY'RE ADDING NEW LINES BETWEEN DIRIDON STATION AND THE GILROY STATION, CALLED THE 568. COST IS THREE AND A 9 HALF MILLION DOLLAR. TWO AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS IS COMING 10 OUT OF LOCAL TAXES LET'S NOT FORGET VTA GENERATES MORE REVENUE 11 THAN THE REST OF THE BAY AREA COMBINE. BUT THE ISSUE IS THE \$1 12 MILLION THAT'S REMAINING. IT'S THAT THEY'RE TAKING AWAY 13 LIFELINE MONEY. THEY'RE MISAPPROPRIATING \$1 MILLION OF 14 15 LIFELINE MONEY, WHICH IS EAR MARKED FOR THE 22 LINE, WHICH IS 16 THE MOST DESPERATE LINE IN THE ENTIRE SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AND THEY'RE TRYING TO REALLOCATE IT TO THIS 568 LINE. AND THAT IS 17 GROSSLY INAPPROPRIATE, AND WE DO HAVE ANOTHER LIFELINE THAT 18 RUNS PARALLEL TO THE 568, BUT IT'S NOT RAPID. IT'S CALLED THE 19 68. THE 68 GOT A 15 MINUTE HEADWAY, AND THE 568 HAS A 30 20 MINUTE HEADWAY. THE 568 -- LET ME WRAP UP -- THE 568, 21 BASICALLY IT'S NICE TO HAVE, LET'S NOT TAKE ANY MONEY FROM 22 23 LIFELINE. THANK YOU.

24



CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MR. GROSS. YOU
 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

3

SPEAKER: MY NAME IS ZACK GROSH ADVOCACY DIRECTOR WITH SAN 4 5 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS I'M CALLING TODAY TO THANK MTC STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS AND TRANSIT OPERATORS FOR WORKING TOGETHER 6 IN CONSENSUS ON THE PROPOSAL. FOR THE ALLOCATION OF FUNDING TO 7 8 SFMTA THAT REFLECTS THE NEED OF THE BAY AREA RIDERSHIP. THIS WILL CONTINUE TO RESTORE SERVICE NEEDED TO IDENTIFY NEW LOCAL 9 SOURCES OF FUNDING. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND COMMITMENT ON 10 THIS ISSUE AND FOR CONTINUING TO SUPPORT TRANSIT THROUGHOUT 11 THE REGION. THANK YOU. 12

13

14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC 15 RAISED HANDS, MR. CHAIR. IF YOU WOULD LIKE, I WILL CALL ON THE 16 VIRTUAL MEMBERS?

17

18 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: PLEASE. AND THEN WE'LL GO TO THE19 BOARD.

20

21 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU GOT IT. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

22

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU, CLERK. THANK YOU, CHAIR. I JUST
WANTED TO, AGAIN, THANK EVERYONE FOR THEIR HARD WORK ON THIS.
BUT, I WILL ALSO NOT BE SUPPORTING THE MOTION. AND IT'S NOT

October 27, 2021

BECAUSE I DON'T SUPPORT PURSUING THE FEDERAL FUNDING. I 1 COMPLETELY SUPPORT THAT. I, ALSO, SUPPORT REGIONAL WORK, 2 3 REGIONAL GOVERNANCE, THAT'S WHY I'M HERE. BUT, FOR ME, I THINK, AS COMMISSIONER LICCARDO MENTIONED, THE CHALLENGE HERE 4 5 HAS BEEN HOW THE SOUTH BAY HAS BEEN CONSIDERED, AND IT SOUND LIKE -- AND THIS WAS BEFORE MY TIME JOINING THE COMMISSION, 6 BUT, THE ORIGINAL FORMULA SEEMS TO HAVE HAD SOME, FRANKLY, 7 8 SOME CONCERNS FROM THE SOUTH BAY, AND, YOU KNOW, I DO VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE HARDSHIP FUNDS. I REALLY DO. BUT IN LIGHT 9 OF THE TRAGEDY -- AND I KNOW I SOUND LIKE A BROKEN RECORD, BUT 10 IT HAS BEEN A REAL -- A REAL SET BACK FOR VTA. OUR STAFF 11 CONTINUES TO STRUGGLE. FRANKLY THE PRICE TAG FOR REBUILDING 12 GUADELOUPE FOR \$150 MILLION IS GREAT. AND I APPRECIATE THE 13 CONSIDERATION FRANKLY, I WISH WE COULD HAVE RECEIVED MORE 14 15 CONSIDERATION AND IT'S JUST AN ONGOING CHALLENGE. I DO BELIEVE 16 IN REGIONALIZATION BUT IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THE SOUTH BAY AS 25% OF THE POPULATION. WE ARE WHERE GROWTH IS HAPPENING 17 ALONG WITH ALAMEDA COUNTY. AND I JUST WOULD APPRECIATE 18 RECOGNITION OF THAT. SO, FOR THAT, I WILL NOT BE SUPPORTING 19 20 THIS MOTION. THANK YOU. 21

23

22

24 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANKS. I JUST WANTED TO ASK A QUESTION ABOUT 25 THE \$2.2 BILLION. JUST TO BE CLEAR, THERE HAD BEEN DISCUSSION

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

October 27, 2021

ABOUT TAKING A DEEP LOOK AT PHASE ONE ALLOCATION FORMULA, AS I 1 UNDERSTAND IT, WE DIDN'T GET THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT IN 2 3 PHASE TWO BECAUSE OF THE \$2.2 BILLION OPPORTUNITY. AND MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT'S A COMPETITIVE PROGRAM THAT THE FEDS 4 5 HAVE. IS THAT RIGHT? 6 7 THERESE MCMILLAN: THAT'S CORRECT. 8 SAM LICCARDO: DO WE HAVE ANY SENSE ABOUT WHAT WE THINK WE 9 10 COULD GET BASED ON WHATEVER WE KNOW ABOUT ALLOCATIONS OR 11 CRITERIA? OR? 12 THERESA ROMMELL: YEAH. ABOUT 100 TO 300 MILLION IS OUR 13 ESTIMATE, BACK OF THE ENVELOPE. 14 15 16 SAM LICCARDO: WE THINK WE COULD GET AS MUCH AS 100 MILLION OR \$300 MILLION OF A FEDERAL PROGRAM THAT WOULD BE SPREAD 2.2 17 BILLION NATION-WIDE? 18 19 THERESA ROMMELL: THAT'S OUR ESTIMATE. 20 21 22 THERESE MCMILLAN: THERESA, BEFORE YOU -- LET ME MAKE A 23 PARTICULARLY CLARIFYING THING HERE. THE 2.2 BILLION IS, AGAIN, A COMPETITIVE PROGRAM THAT'S GOING TO BE BASED ON, 24 25 LARGELY, THAN -- AND THERESA CAN CORRECT ME, BUT I WANT TO

October 27, 2021

KEEP IT AT A HIGH LEVEL, LARGELY POSITIONING OF ANY TRANSIT 1 AGENCY APPROACHING A FISCAL CLIFF WITH RESPECT TO THEIR 2 3 RECOVERY. SO, ESSENTIALLY, THE COMBINATION OF CARES, PLUS CRRSAA, PLUS THE ARP, THAT THE IMPACT -- THE COLLECTIVE IMPACT 4 5 OF THAT, VARIES ACROSS THE COUNTRY. BUT, FOR A NUMBER OF AGENCIES, THAT IS DETERMINED TO STILL BE INSUFFICIENT FROM 6 PREVENTING THEM FROM HITTING AND TUMBLING OVER A FISCAL CLIFF, 7 8 AND WITH, IN THE VERY NEAR-TERM, REDUCING SERVICE ON THE GROUND. THAT IS, BASICALLY, WHY THE 2.2 BILLION HAS BEEN SETUP 9 AS AN ADDITIONAL ADD, BEYOND THE FORMULA FUNDS THAT WERE 10 CARES, CRRSAA AND ARP. SO, I THINK THAT THE IMPORTANT THING 11 HERE IS THAT NOT EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY WILL BE ABLE TO MEET 12 THAT CASE -- OR MAKE THE CASE -- MAKE A COMPELLING CASE. SO 13 FOR US IN REACHING OUR ASSESSMENT OF WHAT IT MIGHT TAKE, AND 14 15 TALKING, AGAIN, VERY CLOSELY WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, THERE 16 IS A HANDFUL OF OPERATORS WHO BELIEVE THAT THEY WOULD BE ABLE TO MAKE THAT COMPELLING CASE, AS LONG AS WE TOOK THE STEPS 17 THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT NOW. SO I JUST WANT TO PRESENT THE, 18 YOU KNOW, AN ADDITIONAL INSIGHT, AS TO THE, SORT OF, NATURE OF 19 THIS PARTICULAR COMPETITIVE PROGRAM, AND WHY THE, YOU KNOW, 20 100 TO 300 -- FOR LACK OF A BETTER TERM, MAKE SENSE BECAUSE 21 WE'RE HAVING TO MAKE SOME ASSESSMENTS OF HOW COMPETITIVE OTHER 22 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE ACROSS THE COUNTRY, AS OPPOSED TO THE 23 HUNDREDS OF THEM, THAT, YOU KNOW, RECEIVE FEDERAL FUND. WHAT I 24 WOULD SAY, TOO, IT'S NO SURPRISE THAT THE MAJOR DRIVING 25



CIRCUMSTANCE IN THIS SITUATION IS NEW YORK, NEW JERSEY. AND
 I'M NOT SPEAKING OUT OF TURN, BECAUSE IT'S BEEN IN THE
 NEWSPAPERS.

4

5 SAM LICCARDO: RIGHT.

6

7 THERESE MCMILLAN: AND YOU KNOW, OF COURSE, THEY HAVE A WILDLY
8 DISPROPORTIONATE SHARE OF OVERALL RIDERSHIP NATIONALLY, SO
9 THAT PLAYS INTO THE WHOLE NARRATIVE, AS WELL. SO, THANK FOR
10 BEARING WITH THAT EXPLANATION.

11

SAM LICCARDO: THANK YOU, THERESE. AS A REGION WITH MORE THAN 12 2% OF THE NATIONAL POPULATION, IT'S ASTOUNDING THAT WE WOULD 13 GET -- ASSUMING THAT THERE ARE TRANSIT AGENCIES IN CRISIS 14 15 THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY, PARTICULARLY IN THOSE VERY HIGH 16 RIDERSHIP AREAS AROUND NEW YORK AND NEW JERSEY, IT WOULD JUST ASTOUND ME THAT WE COULD GET 100 MILLION TO \$300 MILLION OF A 17 \$2.2 BILLION POT KNOWING WE'RE SUCH A SMALL SHARE AND THERE 18 ARE SO MANY AGENCIES, BUT, HEY, ANY YOU GUYS THINK YOU CAN GET 19 IT, THAT'S GREAT. I WANT TO, SORT OF, CLARIFY A POINT THAT WAS 20 21 MADE BECAUSE I THINK THERE WAS SOME SUGGESTION THAT -- WELL, I -- LET ME JUST SAY THIS. THE \$259 MILLION THAT CAME TO THIS 22 REGION, AS A RESULT OF THE SAN JOSE UZA. [LAUGHTER] AS, BY MY 23 CALCULATION, IF WE INCLUDE EVERYTHING FROM PHASE ONE, PHASE 24 TWO, AND THE ALLOCATION TO DEAL WITH THE HARDSHIP OF -- THAT 25

October 27, 2021

THE TRAGEDY AT GUADELOUPE, THE TOTAL ALLOCATION THAT OUR 1 COUNTY GETS IS 121 MILLION WHICH IS LESS THAN HALF OF WHAT THE 2 3 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT HAD ALLOCATED BY REASON OF VIRTUE OF THE UZA FORMULA. SO THAT'S REALLY THE CRUX OF THE CONCERN, THAT 4 5 ESSENTIALLY, \$138 MILLION IS GOING TO THE REST OF THE REGION THAT'S FINE THAT MAY BE AN APPROPRIATE THING AS WE'RE LOOKING 6 INTO CONTEXT OF LOTS OF OTHER PROGRAMS WHERE DIFFERENT 7 8 COUNTIES MAY DO BETTER THAN OTHERS IT'S JUST BEEN A CURRENT CONCERN I THINK FOR MANY EVER US DOWN HERE IN SOUTH BAY ABOUT 9 HOW WE DO GENERALLY IN THESE ALLOCATION FORMULAS. AND IN THIS 10 CASE, IT SEEMS, PARTICULARLY CHALLENGING, AND THAT'S WHY I'M 11 NOT GOING TO SUPPORT THIS PARTICULAR VOTE. I DO EXPECT IT WILL 12 GO THROUGH. I SIMPLY WANTED TO BE CLEAR ABOUT WHAT THE BASIS 13 14 IS FOR MY NO VOTE.

15

16 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: HEART. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER
17 LICCARDO. KIMBERLY, I DON'T SEE ANYONE ELSE VIRTUALLY RAISING
18 THEIR HANDS?

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. COMMISSIONER RONEN'S HAND IS RAISED. 21

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: OKAY. I WANT TO BRING IT BACK TO THE
COMMISSION IN THE BOARDROOM AS WELL.

24

25 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN?

1

October 27, 2021

DIR. HILLARY RONEN: THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO EXPLAIN TO MAYOR 2 3 LICCARDO AND COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS THAT WEREN'T AT THE PLANS AND PROGRAMS COMMITTEE, YOU KNOW, 4 5 SORT OF, THE DISCUSSION WE HAD THERE, JUST SO WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE GOING FORWARD. I HAVE TO SAY, I WAS VERY 6 DISAPPOINTED, AS WELL, AS A COMMISSIONER ON BEHALF OF SAN 7 8 FRANCISCO THAT THE -- THE FORMULA USED TO DISTRIBUTE THE REST OF THE ARP FUNDS WAS THE SAME AS THE FORMULA USED TO 9 DISTRIBUTE THE EARLIER FUNDS, FEDERAL FUNDS. THE REASON 10 BEING, IS THAT THE -- THAT FORM LOOKS THE FORMULA THAT WE'RE 11 USING FOR ALL THE FEDERAL FUND IS HEAVY LEAVE WEIGHTED -- --12 TOWARDS FARE LOSS REVENUE, AND MTA AND MANY OTHER TRANSIT 13 PROVIDERS, THAT -- IN THE REGION, THAT SERVE A HUGE PROPORTION 14 15 OF THE RIDERSHIP OF THE REGION, MTA SERVING 55% OF THE 16 RIDERSHIP, DON'T RELY HEAVILY ON FARES FOR THE SUBSIDY THAT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS SUBSIDY -- THAT, YOU KNOW, THE CITY 17 SUBSIDIZES, HEAVILY PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AND DIDN'T REDUCE 18 THAT SUBSIDY DURING THIS FISCAL CRIES, AND SO THE REVENUES 19 PROPORTION TO THE RIDERSHIP THAT SAN FRANCISCO AND MTA LOST, 20 21 WHAT WAS JUST -- IT -- IT DIDN'T ACCOUNT FOR THE FULL PICTURE, WHEN THE FORMULA IS HEAVILY WEIGHTED TOWARDS FARE LOSS 22 REVENUE, SO WE WERE REALLY HOPING THAT PERCENTAGE OF RIDERSHIP 23 WOULD FACTOR INTO THIS LATEST FORMULA THAT WE WERE USING, AND 24 BECAUSE OF THIS UNEXPECTED 2.2 BILLION ON THE FEDERAL LEVEL, 25

October 27, 2021

STAFF DIDN'T FEEL LIKE THERE WAS TIME TO REACH CONSENSUS ON A 1 NEW FORMULA. SO I JUST WANTED TO -- PERHAPS YOU NEW ALL THIS. 2 3 I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ALL UNDERSTAND, SORT OF, HAPPENED AS FAR AS, YOU KNOW, HOW MTA, AS A SOLUTION FOR MTA 4 5 WAS TO RELY ON THE -- THIS OTHER POT OF FUND THING TO, SORT OF, UPHOLD THAT PROMISE THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES MADE TO ONE 6 ANOTHER, THAT THE LATER FORMULA WOULD BE WEIGHTED HEAVIER 7 8 TOWARDS RIDERSHIP, AND THAT -- THAT DIDN'T HAPPEN. BECAUSE I -- I HEAR YOU BOTH. I AGREE WITH YOU BOTH. AND WANT TO KNOW 9 10 THAT IN -- YOU KNOW, IN THE FUTURE THIS WE WILL -- WE WILL KEEP -- WE NEED TO KEEP EACH OTHER IN MIND AS WE MAKE 11 DECISIONS GOING FORWARD. 12

13

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. KIMBERLY, I 14 DO NOT SEE ANY OTHER VIRTUAL HANDS. I'M GOING TO BRING IT BACK 15 16 TO THE BOARD HERE. I'LL JUST SAY, I HEARD COMMENT FROM YOU ALL, AND I WAS LISTENING. AND I JUST WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE 17 WORK OF OUR STAFF WHEN WE STARTED THIS WE HAD A NEED TO TALK 18 ABOUT THE FISCAL CLIFF OF OUR OPERATORS WE ENGAGED PROACTIVELY 19 WE HAD PRESENTATIONS FOR OUR OPERATORS TO TALK ABOUT THE 20 21 FORMULA AND AFTER PHASE WE WOE HEARD COMMENTS ABOUT SHORING UP AND THAT LED TO THE COURSE OF REACHING OUT TO OPERATORS AND 22 EVEN IN THE FACE PROACTIVELY REACHING OUT TO OPERATORS TO UPON 23 TRY TO UNDERSTAND THE NEED. AND FOR REASONS, I AM GOING TO 24 SUPPORT THIS MOVING FORWARD. ONE THING I LEARNED WHEN I FIRST 25



JOINED THE COMMISSION IS YOU CAN'T ALWAYS KEEP SCORE, YOU HAVE
 TO ACT LIKE A REGION, FOR THE BETTER OF A REGION. THAT'S WHERE
 I SEE THIS TODAY. WITH THAT I'LL ASK FOR A MOTION.

4

5 JAMES P. SPERING: MR. CHAIR, I'LL MAKE THE MOTION. IT'S KIND OF DISAPPOINTING THAT SANTA CLARA IS NOT SUPPORTING THIS. 6 BECAUSE A LOT OF US GOT BEHIND THIS HARDSHIP MOTION. BUT I 7 8 THINK THIS BREATHE PROBABLY ISN'T THE TIME TO DISCUSS THIS BUT I THINK WE HAVE TO BE HONEST ABOUT THE DISCUSSION THAT MAYOR 9 10 LICCARDO IS RAISING, IS SANTA CLARA BEING TREATED UNFAIRLY? WE HAVE TO UNDERSTAND. I DON'T THINK YOU CAN DISTRIBUTE MONEY 11 JUST ON POPULATION. IT'S NOT REALISTIC. THERE HAS GOT TO BE 12 NEED OPERATION IN SAN FRANCISCO IS MUCH DIFFERENT THAN SANTA 13 CLARA HOPEFULLY, WE SUPPORT THIS, BUT TO SAY I DON'T AGREE 14 WITH THE FORMULA IT'S LIKE SAYING I DON'T AGREE WITH THE 15 16 HARDSHIP. HOPEFULLY AT A FUTURE MEETING WE CAN ADDRESS THIS ISSUE THAT'S BEING RAISED AND I THINK MAYOR LICCARDO IS 17 LEGITIMATELY RAISING ONE THAT EARNED THAT DISCUSSION AT SOME 18 POINT. AND I WILL MOVE THE ITEM MR. CHAIRMAN. 19

20

21 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: FIRST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING.

22

23 NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR: I'LL SECOND IT.



ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: SECOND BY VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. ROLL 1 2 CALL VOTE, PLEASE. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES WITH 14 4 5 AYES, THREE NAYS, AND ONE ABSENT. 6 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. THANK YOU 7 8 COMMISSIONERS. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 14, PUBLIC COMMENT. I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS ASSOCIATED WITH PUBLIC 9 COMMENT INTO INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR 10 USE THE START NINE FEATURE. 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, 13 THERE WAS ONE LETTER, EMAIL, SENT FROM RAMAN PRIETSING, THAT 14 WAS POSTED ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED TO COMMISSIONERS. 15 16 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: AT THIS POINT, I SEE NO FURTHER 17 18 BUSINESS TO THE COMMISSION WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN TO OUR NEXT MEETING WEDNESDAY NOVEMBER 17TH 9:35 A.M. REMOTELY OR BY 19 WEBCAST. CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED. THANK YOU EVERYONE. HAVE 20 21 A THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY. [ADJOURNED] 22



Broadcasting Government