METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 13, 2021, 9:50 A.M.

DAVID RABBIT: GOOD MORNING I'M GOING TO CALL THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS MEETING TO ORDER. I'M DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR, ALONG WITH MY VICE CHAIR GINA PAPAN. IF WE COULD ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE. DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS ASSEMBLY BILL 361. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. KIMBERLY, PLEASE CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS PRESENT. EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THANK YOU. MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: HERE.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: HERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: RABBIT?

DAVID RABBIT: HERE.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: RONEN? COMMISSIONER RONEN IS ABSENT. WORTH?

AMY R. WORTH: HERE.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: QUORUM IS PRESENT.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM TWO IS CONSENT CALENDAR. FOUR ITEMS, 2A THROUGH 2D. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, OR CONCERNS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY?

CINDY CHAVEZ: MOVE APPROVAL.

DAVID RABBIT: MOTION BY CHAVEZ? IS THERE A SECOND?

GINA PAPAN: PAPAN.

DAVID RABBIT: SECOND BY PAPAN. KIMBERLY ANY COMMENT ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

DAVID RABBIT: ROLL CALL ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUS.

DAVID RABBIT: MOVING TO ITEM 3A. RESOLUTION 4450 REVISED FUND ESTIMATE TERENCE LEE IS HERE TO PRESENT.

SPEAKER: REVISES RESOLUTION 4450, INCLUDES REVENUES AND STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS IN FY2021 AND UPDATES REVENUE FORECAST FOR SAME PROGRAMS IN FY2022 DETAILS OF CHANGES ARE INCLUDED IN THE STAFF SUMMARY TO THE GEN ITEM AND RECOMMENDATION FROM STAFF TO REFER MTC RESOLUTION 4450 REVISED TO THE FULL COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

DAVID RABBIT: ANY QUESTIONS? NOT SEEING ANY? I SEE VICE CHAIR PAPAN HAS HER HAND RAISED. GO AHEAD.

GINA PAPAN: OKAY. I MAY BE OFF HERE. IS THIS -- PLEASE CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG, IT SLIPPED ME HERE -- SO IS THIS THE OBAG FUNDING -- WHERE ARE WE? SORRY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TERENCE LEE: MTC RESOLUTION 4450.

DAVID RABBIT: TAKING FUNDING INTO TELL US?

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. I'M DONE.

DAVID RABBIT: ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY COMMENTS? NO PHONE CALLS. [LAUGHTER] SO IS THERE ANYONE -- KIMBERLY ANYONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM BEFORE WE TAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE?

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

DAVID RABBIT: GREAT. I CAN GET A MOTION TO APPROVE ITEM 3A THE REVISED 4451 -- TO BE APPROVED.

DIR. HILLARY RONEN: SECOND.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: I THINK I HEARD RONEN FOR THE SECOND?

DAVID RABBIT: CHAVEZ?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBIT: ROLL CALL ON THIS, PLEASE.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: MOTION WE CHAVEZ AND SECOND BY RONEN. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

DAVID RABBIT: ITEM 4A AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN PHASE TWO NEXT STEPS. INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. STAFF DIRECTION GOING FORWARD. WE HAVE THERESA ROMMEL TO MAKE A PRESENTATION ON THIS.

THERESA ROMMELL: YES GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS. THIS INFORMATION ITEM IS BEING PROVIDED TO UPDATE YOU ON RECENT ACTIVITY RELATED TO THE AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ACT OR ARP FUNDING. COVID RELIEF FUNDING FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. WE WANT TO LET YOU KNOW HOW STAFF IS PROPOSE MTC TO RESPOND TO RECENT DEVELOPMENTS LATER THIS MONTH. JUST LAST MONTH IN SEPTEMBER THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION RELEASED A NOTICE OF FUNDING OPPORTUNITY FOR $2.2 BILLION ARP DISCRETIONARY PROGRAM INTENDED FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS THROUGHOUT THE NATION THAT REQUIRE ADDITIONAL COVID RELIEF TO SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS THROUGH FEDERAL FISCAL YEAR 2023. OPERATORS SEEKING A SHARE OF THE 2.2 BILLION WOULD NEED TO SUBMIT AN APPLICATION BY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1 NOVEMBER 8TH. THE KEY ISSUE WITH THIS NOTICE OF FUNDING
2 OPPORTUNITY IS THAT OPERATORS APPLYING F A SHARE OF THESE
3 ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE FUNDS WOULD NEED TO SUBMIT EVIDENCE OF
4 HOW MUCH TOTAL COVID RELIEF FUNDING THEY HAVE BEEN ALLOCATED
5 FROM THE FULL ASSORTMENT OF COVID RELIEF PACKAGES INCLUDING
6 CARES CRRSAA AND ARP. FURTHER FD WILL CONSIDER ANY UNALLOCATED
7 AMOUNTS OF COVID RELIEF FUNDING REMAINING IN THE URBANIZED
8 AREAS AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT OPERATORS WHO ARE APPLYING FOR
9 ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE THE PORTION OF THE TOTAL AMERICAN RESCUE
10 PLAN ACT COVID RELIEF FUN WERE APPORTIONED TO THE BAY AREAS.
11 THE MAJORITY OF 1.7 BILLION RECEIVED TO AGENCIES TO SUSTAIN
12 OPERATIONS AND ALSO SET-ASIDE 10% OF FUNDING TO BE USED FOR
13 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY AND HARDSHIPS FOCUSED ON RECOVERY
14 STRATEGIES. CURRENTLY THERE ARE 611 MILLION FUND TO BE
15 DISTRIBUTED TO TRANSIT OPERATORS AND 121 MILLION SET-ASIDE
16 FUNDS TO ADVANCE TRANSIT RECOVERY. WE CALLED THIS APPROACH TO
17 BE A PHASED APPROACH OF ARP FUNDS IN ORDER BE PRUDENT AND
18 ALLOW BETTER DATA ABOUT THE PANDEMIC AND DISTRIBUTION OF THE
19 REQUIREMENT. WE HAD PLANNED TO RELEASE THE REMAINDER OF THE
20 ARP FUNDS IN THE JANUARY OR DECEMBER TIME FRAME HOWEVER
21 WAITING UNTIL THAT TIME WOULD LIKELY PRECLUDE OPERATORS FROM
22 OUR REGION TO COMMITTEE FOR THE SHARE OF THE $2.2 BILLION IN
23 ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE FUNDING. WE DON'T KNOW HOW LARGE OF A
24 SHARE THE $2. BILLION FOR REGION OPERATORS WOULD BE COMPETING
25 FOR AS A DISCRETION PROGRAM AND ULTIMATELY DECIDING --

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

[INDISCERNIBLE] SO TO MAXIMIZE FUNDING THAT MAY COME TO THE REGION WE ARE PROPOSE TO MOVE UP OUR PLANNED ALLOCATION OF THE REMAINING ARP FUNDS FROM DECEMBER OR JANUARY TO OCTOBER IN ORDER TO MEET THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE NOTICE OF FUNDING OPPORTUNITY FOR ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE BY THE NOVEMBER 8TH DEADLINE. THIS DOESN'T LEAVE US A LOT OF TIME TO COME TO CONSENSUS ON A NEW DISTRIBUTION FOR THE REMAINING ARP FUNDS THEREFORE STAFF WILL LIKELY RECOMMEND DISTRIBUTING THE REMAINING FUNDS INTENDING FOR OPERATION SUPPORT BASED ON METHODOLOGIES USED TO DETERMINE OPERATOR SHARES IN THE PHASE ONE DISTRIBUTION ACTED ON LAST JULY. FURTHER, WHILE WE HAVE ALREADY SET A PORTION OF THE FUNDS ASIDE TO SUPPORT BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES AND ADDRESS OTHER HARDSHIPS AND FOCUSED RECOVERY STRATEGIES WE WOULD PROPOSE TO FORMALLY PROGRAM SET-ASIDE FUNDS TO MTC TO SATISFY THE TECHNICALITY TO MAKE SURE ALL FUNDS AVAILABLE TO THE REGION ARE FORMALLY ASSIGNED TO ELIGIBLE RECIPIENTS. EXPENDITURE OF SET-ASIDE FUND FOR BLUE RIBBON INITIATIVES COULD BE DETERMINED IN THE COMING MONTHS AND NECESSARY SUBSEQUENT PROGRAMMING ACTION COULD BE TAKEN TO REPROGRAM THE FUN TO ELIGIBLE OPERATORS AT A LATER DATE. WE BELIEVE THIS COURSE OF ACTION WOULD SATISFY THE FTA REQUIREMENTS FOR ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE. THE PROPOSED DISTRIBUTION OF REMAINING ARP FUNDS IF THIS APPROACH IS FOLLOWED CAN BE FOUND IN ATTACHMENT A OF THIS ITEM. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH OUR BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS ON NEXT STEPS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FOR THE REMAINDER OF ARP FUNDS A COUPLE OF ALTERNATIVE IDEAS INCLUDE INCREASING SET-ASIDE TO MTC TO SET AS ADDITIONAL PERFORMANCE FUNDING FOR OPERATORS AFTER THE ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE GRANTS HAVE BEEN AWARDED AND RENEGOTIATING DISTRIBUTION FORMULA USED IN PHASE TWO. THE ITEM BEFORE YOU TODAY IS INFORMATION AND NOT ACTION, WE WANT MORE TIME TO EXPLORE THESE ALTERNATIVE TO BUILD A STRONG CONSENSUS IN THE REGION BEFORE TAKING ACTION ON THE DISTRIBUTION. ALTHOUGH A RHNA NEGOTIATION IN SUCH A DISTRIBUTION IN A SHORT TIME FRAME WILL BE CHALLENGING TO COME TO FULL AGREEMENT O WE PLAN TO RECOMMEND A DISTRIBUTION OF THE OCTOBER 27TH COMMISSION MEETING LATER THIS MONTH. AND DELAYING ACTION PAST OCTOBER WOULD RESULT IN THE LOSS OF OPPORTUNITY FOR BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS TO COMPETE FOR ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE FROM THE FTA. THAT CONCLUDES MY REPORT AND I AM HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD JUST SAY THAT WE'RE -- WE WERE THROWN A HIGH VELOCITY CURVEBALL WHICH IS IN KEEPING WITH WHAT'S GOING ON AROUND US WITH THE GIANTS IN THE PLAY OFF AND WHAT NOT. APPRECIATIVE OF THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMPETE FOR THE 2.2 WANT TO MAKE SURE WE MAXIMIZE THE DOLLARS RETURNING TO THE BAY AREA AND RECOGNIZING THAT THE ACCELERATED TIME FRAME IS GOING TO -- WE JUST HAVE TO DEAL WITH IT. BUT I KNOW THERE ARE SOME ISSUES OUT THERE THAT PEOPLE WANT TO TALK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ABOUT, AND I HAVE HILLARY RONEN TO TALK. GO AHEAD COMMISSIONER.

DIR. HILLARY RONEN: THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBIT, AND I APPRECIATE THE CHALLENGE BEFORE US, AS WELL, BUT I AM NOT HAPPY WITH -- WHAT'S ANOTHER WAY TO SAY IT? WITH ADDRESSING THIS CHALLENGE BY USING THE FORMULA WE HAVE USED IN THE FIRST TRANCHE. AND I WANT TO EXPLAIN WHY. YOU KNOW, SAN FRANCISCO, AND, CERTAINLY, COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND I, YOU KNOW, ARE CONSTANTLY CHALLENGING OURSELVES, AS WE ALL ARE, I KNOW, TO REMAIN REGIONAL, OUR THINKING, AND GOOD TEAM PLAYERS, THE WAY THAT WE WORK AS A BODY, I THINK, IS A REFRESHING CHANGE FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, WHERE WE DUKE IT OUT ON EVERY SINGLE ISSUE, I LOVE THE CONSENSUS NATURE OF THIS BODY AND THAT'S WHY, EXCITE THE FACT THAT SAN FRANCISCO WAS PROBABLY DISADVANTAGED BY THE FORMULA THAT WAS USED DURING THE FIRST TRANCHE, WE WENT ALONG WITH IT, AND WE WENT ALONG WITH IT, BECAUSE WE WERE, BASICALLY PROMISED THAT THE SECOND TRANCHE WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED IN A WAY THAT WOULD TAKE INTO GREATER CONSIDERATION, THE PERCENTAGE OF TRANSIT RIDERS IN THE REGION. AND I WANT TO EXPLAIN WHY SAN FRANCISCO RIDERS LOSE OUT WHEN REVENUE LOSS IS THE BASIS UPON WHICH RELIEF MONEY IS DISTRIBUTED. SAN FRANCISCO HEAVILY, HEAVILY SUBSIDIZES MEDIAN FARES TO KEEP IT LOW AND THE CITY DIDN'T LOWER THAT SUBSIDY DURING THE PANDEMIC DESPITE FINANCIAL ISSUES. SO DESPITE THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FACT THAT MUNI CARRIES 55% OF ALL OF THE REGION'S RIDERS, THE FORMULA THAT WE USED FOCUSED HEAVILY ON REVENUE LOSS AND SAN FRANCISCO DIDN'T FARE AS WELL AS OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE REGIONS. AS I SAID, SUPPORTED BEFORE KNOWING HOW MONEY WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED IN THE FUTURE, AND BASED ON OUR CALCULATIONS, KIND OF EXPERIMENTING WITH DIFFERENT FORMULAS, WITH THE MTA AND OUR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, IF WE USE THE SAME FORMULA TO DISTRIBUTE THE SECOND TRANCHE THAT WOULD MEAN ANYWHERE FROM 40 TO $90 MILLION LESS TO MTA, DEPENDING ON HOW HEAVILY THE PERCENTAGE OF RIDERSHIP IS TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION IN THE FORMULA. AND THIS IS AT A TIME WHEN MUNI IS AT LESS THAN 75% OF OPERATION, PRECOVID, WITH MANY BUS LINES THAT ARE STILL OUT OF OPERATION, COMPLETELY. MEANWHILE, AND WONDERFULLY, AND VERY HAPPILY, MANY OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES AROUND THE REGION, WHICH WE'RE VERY JEALOUS OF, BUT ALSO ARE HAPPY ABOUT ARE AT 100% OF PRECOVID OPERATION AND GIVEN THAT SAN FRANCISCO CARRIER, MUNI 55% OF REGION'S RIDERSHIP WHICH PRECOVID WAS 50% LOW-INCOME PEOPLE OF COLOR WE'RE ABSOLUTELY SURE WE DON'T WANT HAVE THE EXACT NUMBERS, BUT BEING AN AGENCY THAT'S ONLY AT 75% OF PREVIOUS SERVICE LEVEL USING THE SAME FORMULA, DOESN'T MEET OUR GOALS THAT WE TALK ABOUT ALL THE TIME AND HAVE BEAUTIFULLY ARTICULATED ON OUR WEB SITE. IT'S JUST NOT RIGHT. AND EVEN THOUGH I, TOO, CHAIR RABBIT WANT ALL OF US TO BE ABLE TO ACCESS THOSE HARDSHIP FUNDS AND FTA NEEDS TO BE ABLE TO ACCESS THEM ON TOP OF WHATEVER DISTRIBUTION VTA GETS IN THE SECOND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANCHE DOESN'T MAKE SENSE FOR US TO NOT HOLD ON TO THE PROMISE THAT WE WERE GOING TO HAVE FURTHER CONSIDERATION IN THE SECOND TRANCHE PULLS THE RUG RIGHT OUT FROM UNDER US. THERE NEEDS TO BE CONSENSUS AND GREATER EQUITY AND UPHOLDING ISSUES. I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS ASK TALK ABOUT IT BUT THIS IS OF GREAT CONCERN TO ME AS A COMMISSIONER AND TO THE CITY OF AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO AND VTA. THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR CONTINUING TO BE THE, SORT OF, FEDERAL FUNDING WIZARDS THAT YOU ARE, AND, LIKE, SORT OF, BEING ABLE TO TAKE THE, SORT OF, COMPLEX FUNDING STREAMS AND ACCESS THEM AND DISTRIBUTE THEM AND ESPECIALLY MOMENTS LIKE THIS WHERE YOU HAVE TO ACT SO QUICKLY. SO I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT. ON THE OTHER HAND I WANT TO REITERATE SOME OF RONEN'S CONCERNS THAT SHE RAISED, THERE WAS EXPECTATION IN SAN FRANCISCO THAT IN THE FINAL TRANCHE THE ARF FUNDING WAS GOING TO BE FOCUS ON EQUITY AND MORE OF A FOCUS ON RIDERSHIP AND BECAUSE THERE ISN'T FOR REASONS THAT I FULLY UNDERSTAND, A NEW ADJUSTED FORMULA IS BEING PUT IN PLACE THAT SIGNIFICANTLY DISADVANTAGED SFMTA, LIKE OTHER AGENCIES AROUND THE REGION, FOCUSING ON BRINGING BACK SERVICE FOCUSED ON DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES AND SFMTA'S FARE BOX REVENUES LACK IN RIDERSHIP INCREASES. I WANT TO REITERATE, IF THERE IS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OPPORTUNITY FOR STAFF TO SIT DOWN WITH SFMTA AND OTHER OPERATORS AS WELL AND, SORT OF, UNDERSTAND WHETHER THERE IS A POSSIBILITY FOR MTA'S SPECIFIC CIRCUMSTANCES TO ENGENDER A HARDSHIP CLAIM, WHICH I THINK PERSONAL IS JUSTIFIED, AND MAYBE BRINGING BACK SOMETHING AS A RECOMMENDATION WHEN IT COMES BACK TO THE FULL COMMISSION, I THINK THAT WOULD MAKE A REALLY BIG DIFFERENCE. BECAUSE, IF WE COULD FIND A WAY -- NOT -- BECAUSE WE -- TO, SORT OF, MOVE ALL THIS FORWARD, AND STILL ACKNOWLEDGE SFMTA'S UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU, CHAIR. I JUST WANT TO THANK STAFF, AND IN PARTICULAR, MS. ROMMELL FOR MOVING SO QUICKLY AND ADJUSTING TO THE CHANGES THAT WE'RE RECEIVING FROM THE FEDERAL -- AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL. AS YOU KNOW, MY FOCUS WOULD BE FROM WHAT WE DID LAST MONTH ON THE HARDSHIP AND FOCUS RECOVERY FUNDS. I WANT TO CONFIRM THAT WHAT WE DID LAST MONTH WILL STAY, AND I BELIEVE, IN THAT HARDSHIP RECOVERY FUND WAS ANOTHER 30 MILLION REMAINING, SO WILL THAT ALSO CONTINUE IN THAT FUND? IS IT BEING RENAMED AS -- ON OR REDIRECTED TO MTC, BUT REMAIN AS THE HARDSHIP RECOVERY UNDERFUND AVAILABLE FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION AND DISTRIBUTION?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THERESA ROMMELL: IF I CAN RESPOND TO THAT QUICKLY. YES. THE HARDSHIP FUNDS THAT WERE PROGRAMMED LAST MONTH ARE SAFE. THEY'RE ALLOCATED ALREADY. THERE IS A REMAINING 30 MILLION IN SO-CALLED HARDSHIP FUNDING. THAT'S THE AMOUNT ABOVE 5% OF WHAT WAS SET-ASIDE AS THE MINIMUM FOR THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT INITIATIVES. SO IF WE DO NOT HAVE A RECOMMENDATION TO PROGRAM THOSE HARDSHIP FUNDS LATER THIS MONTH, THEN WE WOULD LIKELY PROGRAM THOSE TO MTC, TO OURSELVES, THAT, AND THEY COULD BE REDISTRIBUTED, HOPEFULLY LATER. SO THAT'S THE INTENT. BUT, YOU KNOW, I THINK THERE'S A GOAL TO DISTRIBUTE AS MUCH OF THE FUNDING AS WE POSSIBLY CAN.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. I HAVE A QUESTION RELATED TO THOSE FUNDS. I SAW THAT HARDSHIP FUNDS WERE APPLIED TO CERTAIN AGENCIES THAT HAVE RECEIVED THEM. HOW DOES THAT AFFECT THE AGENCY'S ABILITY, OR THE AMOUNT THAT THEY COULD POTENTIAL RECEIVE FROM THE NOFO PROCESS?

THERESA ROMMELL: THE FTA HAS PUT OUT A LIST OF REQUIREMENTS FOR THE APPLICATIONS AND IT REALLY IS LOOKING AT YOUR REMAINING NEED, FINANCIAL NEED, LOOKING AT REVENUE LOSSES THROUGH A POINT IN TIME MINUS WHAT HAS ALREADY BEEN RECEIVED THROUGH COVID RELIEF SO IN SOME WAYS THERE IS A BIT OF INVERSE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN HOW MUCH MONEY THE REGION ALLOCATES VERSUS HOW MUCH THEY'RE ELIGIBLE FOR FROM THE ADDITIONAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ASSISTANCE POT, BUT THE DIFFERENCE IS THE 2.2. BILLION IN ASSISTANCE IS AT FULL DISCRETION OF THE FTA AND WE DON'T WANT KNOW WHAT LEVEL OF NEED IS OUT THERE STILL WITH OTHER AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBIT: VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

GINA PAPAN: THERESA, WE APPLAUD ALL YOUR EFFORTS FOR THE AGENCY TO HAVE ACCESS TO THIS ADDITIONAL FUNDING. IT'S AMAZING ALL THE HARD WORK YOU GUYS ARE PUTTING IN. GREATLY APPRECIATE THAT. AND YOU HAVE SHOWN WORKING WITH ALL THE OPERATORS THROUGHOUT THIS. I KNOW THAT WILL CONTINUE AS WE GET TO CLOSER TO, HOPEFULLY, DISTRIBUTING THIS MONEY. I REALLY WANT TO EMPHASIZE THE PERCENTAGE TO THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE. YOU KNOW, 10% IF WE CAN GET MORE THERE, I THINK THAT WOULD ACHIEVE MANY OF THE GOALS THAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND RONEN HAVE EXPRESSED HERE THROUGHOUT. SO, I WOULD EMPHASIZE AND ARE FEEL COMFORTABLE IF WE COULD COMMIT WHATEVER FUNDING IS LEFT THERE TO MTC TO PUT INTO PLACE SOME OF THE AMAZING PROGRAMS WE HAVE DEVELOPED THROUGHOUT COVID, AND ON OUR PROCEEDING, THE EQUITY DISCUSSION, I THINK WE'RE HEAD IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION, I THINK TO THE BENEFIT OF EVERYONE I SUPPORT THE RECOMMENDATION HERE AND IF WE CAN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMIT THE MONEY TO WHATEVER KIND OF MONEY IS IN THERE TO MTC FOR DISTRIBUTION LATER. I THINK THAT WILL BE WELL EXPENDED AT A FUTURE DATE. SO I WOULD SUPPORT THOSE ASPECTS OF THIS, AND ALSO, IF WE CAN INCREASE THOSE WITH THE BLUE RIBBON, THAT WOULD BE APPRECIATED. THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANYONE ELSE HAVE QUESTIONS? COMMISSIONER SPERING?

JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU. THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE INVESTMENT INTO BLUE RIBBON RECOMMENDATION. I WANT TO ADDRESS THE COMMENTS. WE DID REQUEST SAN FRANCISCO COOPERATE AND GO ALONG AND BE A TEAM PLAYING LOOKING AT REGIONS, AND WE DID SAY WE WOULD REVISIT THIS ISSUE. AND WITH THE ISSUE BEING RAISED WE HAVE GOT TO GIVE IT CONSIDERATION AND COMMISSIONER RONEN IS ABSOLUTELY RIGHT. WE DID MAKE THAT COMMITMENT. AND I FEEL IT'S RIGHT THAT WE FULFILL THAT AND SEE WHAT WE CAN DO TO SIT DOWN AND DEAL WITH THIS ISSUE. BUT I WOULD BE VERY CONCERNED IF WE JUST WENT FORWARD AND IGNORED THE ISSUES BEING RAISED BY SAN FRANCISCO. SO I'M HOPING, THERESA, THAT THERE CAN BE CONSIDERATION OR AT LEAST DISCUSSION WITH THEM. I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO BE A DIFFICULT LENGTHY PROCESS. I FEEL IT'S SOMETHING THAT CAN BE ADDRESSED QUICKLY, BUT THAT INEQUITY NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID RABBIT: ANYONE ELSE BEFORE WE GO TO THE PUBLIC? THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. KIMBERLY CAN YOU LEAD US THROUGH THE PUBLIC?

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: SURE. TWO MINUTES.

DAVID RABBIT: THAT'S FINE. GREAT.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: FIRST SPEAKER IS JEFFREY TUMLIN, UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

JEFFREY TUMLIN: THANK YOU. MY NAME IS JEFFREY TUMLIN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF SFMTA SUGGESTION OF FUNDING AND FINANCIAL NEED. MEANS PAYING FOR EMPTY SEATS NOT FOR PRIORITIZING ACTUAL PASSENGER NEEDS. EXPECTING A LOSS OF 40% ESPECIALLY FOR PROFESSIONAL SERVICES MEANWHILE URBAN OPERATORS AC TRANSIT AND MUNI ARE FACING DEEP LONG-TERM FINANCIAL LOSSES AND AT THE SAME TIME ARE FACING STRONG RIDERSHIP THAT HAS RESULTED IN CRUSHED LOADS RIDERS LEFT BEHIND AT CURVES AND MANY LINES NOT YET RESTORED. WE'RE ASKING FOR CONSIDERATION AND IT SHOULD BE CLEARLY STATED THAT PHASE ONE DISTRIBUTION WHILE EXPEDIENT DISPROPORTIONATELY AWARDS FUND TO MTC NOT TO PASSENGERS. GUIDING DECISIONS IS NOT PERFECT HOWEVER I'M DISAPPOINTED THAT BECAUSE OF THE RUSH TO MEET FEDERAL FUNDING DEADLINES EQUITY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FACTORS WILL NOT BE CONSIDERED IN THE WAY THAT IT WAS PROMISED URN THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES. THE SITUATION IS LIKELY TO BE AMPLIFIED UNDER THE NEW FEDERAL FUNDING OPPORTUNITY FTA HAS PUT FORWARD IT'S UNLIKELY MUNI WILL QUALIFY FOR FEDERAL FUNDING BECAUSE THE CRITERIA THERE FAVOR FUNDING EMPTY SEATS AND NOT THE NEEDS OF RIDERS. I ASK STAFF TO TACKLE THE DIFFICULT CHALLENGE OF CENTERING EQUITY IN OUR DECISIONS. THANK YOU.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ZACK. TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: MY NAME IS ZACK. I AM THE ADVOCATE DIRECTOR WITH SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. WE REPRESENT 700,000 RIDERS THAT DEPEND ON TRANSIT EVERY DAY HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO I'M CALLING OUT OF CONCERN OF COMMISSIONERS ALLOCATING PHASE ONE METHODOLOGY FOR FUNDING. ARF FUNDS 55% OF TRANSIT CHIPS HOWEVER BAY AREA -- [INDISCERNIBLE] GUIDING ARP ALLEGATION WITH INTENTION THAT ALLOCATION OF PHASE TWO METHODOLOGY WOULD NEED TO BE ADAPTED TO REFLECT CHANGING LANDSCAPE AND NEEDS IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THE SECOND DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS REFLECT PRINCIPLES AND CURRENT RIDERSHIP. SFMTA NOW IS ONLY ABLE TO DELIVER 75% OF PREPANDEMIC SERVICE OTHER AGENCIES AT 100% MANY SAN FRANCISCO RIDERS WILL CONTINUE WAIT LEFT AT THE CURB WITHOUT EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION OF THESE FUNDS. REIMAGINE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSIT SERVICE PRIORITIZING EQUITY ACCESS BUT THERE IS ONLY SO MUCH THEY CAN DO WITHOUT ADDITIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING. PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES IN SAN FRANCISCO ARE COUNTING ON THESE FUNDS TO RESTORE SERVICE THAT'S STILL SUSPEND SFUSD STUDENTS ARE COUNTING ON THESE FUNDS CROWDED TRANSIT RIDERS ARE COUNTING ON THESE FUNDS TO RESTORE RELIABLE SERVICE THAT GETS THEM TO WORK ON TIME I UNDERSTAND THE DIFFICULTY OF CREATING A NEW FUNDING FORMULA ON THE TIMELINE THAT MAXIMIZES ACCESS, BUT STICKING WITH THE PHASE ONE METHODOLOGY FOR SECOND PHASE OF ARP FUNDS WOULD DO A DISSERVICE TO HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF RIDERS THAT ARE COUNTING ON THESE FUNDS TO RESTORE SERVICE. LET'S FIND A WAY TO ADDRESS EQUITY TO THE NEEDS OF RIDERS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CHRISTOPHER PETERS. UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS CHRISTOPHER PETERSON I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO. I RELY ON MUNI FOR MOBILE. THE CURRENT 75% SERVICE LEVELS THAT MUNI IS ABLE TO PROVIDE SIMPLY TO NOT ADDRESS MY NEEDS IN A WAY THAT ARE COMPARABLE TO THE NEEDS OF PEOPLE WHO ARE ABLE TO DRIVE ON A DAILY BASIS. FOR EXAMPLE, I HAVE BEEN PASSED UP BY OVERCROWDED BUSES, AND I HAVE BEEN ON OVERCROWDED BUSES MULTIPLE TIMES THAT HAVE HAD TO PASS UP MANY PASSENGERS STANDING AT THE CURB. SO, I STRONGLY ENDORSE THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMENT BY COMMISSIONERS RONEN AND JOSEFOWITZ. I'M VERY CONCERNED THAT THE STAFF PROPOSAL TO DIVVY UP THE REMAINING AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN FUND ON THE BASIS OF OUTDATED FORMULAS. THE FUNDING SHOULD, INSTEAD, BE ALLOCATED ON THE BASIS OF CURRENT FINANCIAL NEEDS FOR RESTORING SERVICE TO PREPANDEMIC LEVELS. MUNI, IN PARTICULAR, HAS NOT RECEIVED THE FUNDING THAT IT NEEDS IN ITS ROLE AS BY FAR THE REGION'S LARGEST TRANSIT PROVIDER, AND LARGEST PROVIDER OF TRANSIT SERVICE TO RIDERS WITH -- FROM LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. SO PLEASE REVISE THE FUNDING FORMULA TO ADDRESS THOSE NEEDS. THANK YOU.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS PETER STRAUSS. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I'M PETER STRAUSS, I'M ON THE BOARD OF SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. I WON'T TAKE A LOT OF TIME HERE TO REPEAT THE ARGUMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE BY COMMISSIONERS RONEN AND JOSEFOWITZ. AND I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER SPERING CHIMING IN HIS SUPPORT. CLEARLY, SAN FRANCISCO EXPECTED THAT THE FORMULAS WOULD BE REVISED. YOU KNOW, AND WE FEEL FRANKLY SOMEWHAT BETRAYED BY WHAT IS BEING PROPOSED AT THIS TIME. I APPRECIATE THAT STAFF IS REALLY SCRAMBLING HERE. BUT SAN FRANCISCO CARRIES OVER HALF OF THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT RIDERS BUT IS PROPOSED TO BE ALLOCATING LESS THAN 1/3 OF THE REMAINING FUND. WE FEEL THIS IS UNFAIR, AND WE REALLY ASK THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STAFF TO DEVELOP SOME ALTERNATIVE PROPOSAL BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN THIS RETURNS TO THE FULL COMMISSION. THANK YOU.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER CYRUS.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO THE COMMENT MY NAME IS VIRUS. I AM A SAN FRANCISCO RESIDENT AND MEMBER OF SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS I WANT TO COMMENT ON THE ALLOCATION OF THE PHASE TWO IN THE SAME MANNER. I WANT TO CALL TO ATTENTION THE FUNDS IN TERMS OF DAILY RIDERSHIP ON THE VITAL SIGNS WEB SITE AND THE PROPOSED FUNDING APPENDIX IN TODAY AGENDA THE LEVEL OF SUPPORT FUNDING IN DOLLARS FOR DAILY RIDER, BETWEEN 618 WE SEE 1200 FOR BART IT WOULD MAKE SENSE IF EACH SIGNIFICANT VARIATION PER DOLLAR PER DAILY RIDER IS DISTRIBUTED AS EACH AGENCY HAS UNIQUE CHALLENGES. I URGE MTC TO TAKE A LONG-TERM RIDERSHIP RECOVERY VIEWPOINT. WHEN DOING PHASE TWO BY INCREASING THE PRIORITY GIVEN TO INCENTIVIZING FULL SERVICE RESTORATION. THIS SERVICE, THIS SHIFT IN ALLOCATION PRIORITY WAS ORIGINALLY PROPOSED FOR PHASE TWO BUT WITH THE LACK OF TIME FOR OPERATORS TO REACH AGREEMENT HAS SEEMINGLY INSTALLED OUT. I URGE MTC TO ADOPT IT ANYWAY, USING PHASE ONE METHODOLOGY WILL WOULD IN INEQUITABLE TABLE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS AND WILL PENALIZE SFMTA WHO SUBSIDIZES SERVICE SAN FRANCISCO RISKS A LONG-TERM DECLINE IN RIDERSHIP HAVING AN UNLOCK ON EFFECT TO THE REST OF THE REGION INCLUDING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSIT OPERATORS LIKE BART. WE CANNOT SIT BY AS MAJOR TRANSIT AGENCIES DOES NOT RESTORE SERVICE. THANK YOU.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT ALAN. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: THANKS MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. BOB ALLEN WITH URBAN HABITAT. I ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH COMMENTS MADE BY SF TRANSIT RIDERS, AS WELL AS SUPERVISOR RONEN. WE KNOW THAT THERE IS SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES TO GETTING THE FUNDS WE NEED TO RESTORE SERVICE. THOSE OF US WHO HAVE BEEN PUSHING FOR MORE OPERATOR MONEY FOR A LONG TIME AT THIS BODY UNDERSTAND THE CRISIS. WE NEED TO RAISE FUNDS AND DON'T WANT TO PUT AGENCY AGAINST AGENCY, BUT WE CERTAINLY CAN'T DISADVANTAGE THE OPERATOR THAT MOVES MOST OF THE RIDERS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA AND IS KIND OF THE LYNCH PIN FOR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND THAT'S SFMTA WHILE MANY WANTED THIS MONEY TO GO OUT THE DOOR FASTER DESPITE PROMISES OR HOPES OF RECONCILING FORMULAS THAT HASN'T TAKEN PLACE WE THOUGHT IT WAS A RISKY STRATEGY FOR A VARIETY OF REASONS BUT THAT'S NOT THE POINT TODAY. THE POINT IS FIGURING OUT A WE TO MOVE EQUITABLY AND GEOGRAPHICALLY, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY, AND SENIORS AND MEETING THE NEEDS -- WITH THE STRUCTURAL CRISIS AND TRYING TO GET A BALLOT MEASURE IN THE REGION FOR A FUTURE THAT DEALS WITH SOME OF THESE STRUCTURAL ISSUES IN AN ONGOING WAY. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND LEBRUN. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. FIRST OF ALL, I ABSOLUTELY AGREE WITH ALL OF THE POINTS THAT WERE RAISED BY MOON I. BUT I THINK MOVING FORWARD THE BEST WAY TO APPROPRIATE FUNDING, IS TO ACTUALLY COME UP WITH ACCURATE DATA. AND IF YOU CAN ACTUALLY PROVE HOW MANY THOUSANDS OF VTA BUS RIDERS ARE GETTING PASSED, I THINK YOU HAVE A STRONGER CASE. IN CLOSING MY RECOMMENDATION WOULD BE TO REACH OUT TO VTA AND LEARN ABOUT THE TECHNOLOGY THAT'S USE TO COUNT THE NUMBER OF PASSENGERS THAT THEY ARE PASSING EVERY DAY. AND ON MY END, I WILL RESEND A LETTER I WROTE TO THE COMMISSION SIX MONTHS AGO EXPLAINING HOW THAT WORKS AND BY THE WAY USING THAT SAME TECHNOLOGY WE CAN PROVE THAT VTA BUS RIDERS ARE NO LONGER GETTING PASSED UP. THANK YOU.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS GERALD. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: YES. THIS IS GERALD KAUFMAN I REPRESENT BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION WORKING GROUP AND I LIVE IN OAKLAND. WE ALSO VERY STRONGLY APPROVE OF AND SUPPORT THE COMMENTS THAT WERE MADE BY SUPERVISOR RONEN AND DIRECTOR JOSEFOWITZ. I WOULD JUST ADD ONE MORE THING AND THAT IS, THAT AMONG THE PROBLEM THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MUNI HAS, IT'S NOT JUST THAT IT'S OVER CROWDED IT'S ALSO THAT IT'S IMPEDED IN THIS TRAVEL BECAUSE OF TOO MANY PEOPLE COMING INTO SAN FRANCISCO BY CAR. I THINK IT'S UNIQUELY, ADVERSELY AFFECTED WITHIN THE CITY LIMIT. I REALIZE IT'S NOT THE ONLY PLACE, BUT IT'S A BAD SCENE, AS ANYBODY KNOWS THAT HAS TRIED TO DRIVE THERE CLOSE TO THE PEAK HOURS AND SOMETIMES THOSE PEAK HOURS LAST ALL DAY I WOULD SUGGEST MTC SHOULD STEP UP THE PRIORITY OF DOING EVERYTHING IT CAN TO ATTRACT SUBURBAN PEOPLE TO TAKING TRANSIT AND MAKING TRANSIT MORE ATTRACTIVE THEY WOULD EVENTUALLY BE AT THE SAME LEVEL THAT MUNI DESERVES TODAY.

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: NO FURTHER SPEAKERS.

DAVID RABBIT: KIMBERLY ANY COMMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM THAT NEEDS TO BE READ INTO THE RECORD?

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING FOR THIS ITEM.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH EVERYONE FOR YOUR COMMENTS. I'LL GO TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN.

THERESE MCMILLAN: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I FEEL IT'S APPROPRIATE FOR MOO ME TO WRAP UP COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM. THIS IS FOR INFORMATION AND WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO YOU. I BELIEVE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSCORE A COUPLE OF THINGS FOR THE COMMISSIONERS IN PARTICULAR CONSIDERATIONS OF CHARACTERIZATION OF DISAPPOINTMENT AND BETRAYAL ENACTED INTO THE CONVERSATION. WHEN WE FOUND OUT ABOUT THE FTA'S CONSIDERATION, AND THE TIME FRAME IMPINGING ON THE PLAN COMMITMENT FOR LOOKING AT PHASE TWO, AND BRING THINK TO THE FOREFRONT, ALLOWING EXTENDED TIME, WE TURNED OVER EVERY POSSIBLE ROCK WE COULD TO TRY TO ACCOMMODATE -- -- YOU KNOW, THE ORIGINAL COMMITMENTS. HAVING SAID THAT, WE ONLY GOT SO FAR, AND IN, AGAIN, THIS SHORT TIME FRAME, WE HAVE BEEN VERY CLEAR WITH ALL OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS THAT HAVE HAD MULTIPLE CONVERSATIONS ON THIS TOPIC AMONG THEMSELVES, AS WELL AS WITH US, WITH MUNI AT THE TABLE ABOUT WHICH OPTIONS ARE AVAILABLE TO US NOW. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU UNDERSTAND, FROM OUR PERSPECTIVE, HOW INCLUSIVE WE HAVE BEEN TO TRY TO START DEVELOPING WHERE OUR OPTIONS EXIST. AND THERE WILL BE TRADE-OFFS. WE WERE PUSHED BETWEEN THE PROVERBIAL ROCK AND THE HARD PLACE WITH RESPECT TO THIS ISSUE. IN THE MEANTIME, BETWEEN NOW AND THE COMMISSION MEETING, WE WILL CONTINUE TO HAVE THESE CONVERSATIONS WITH EVERYONE IN THE ROOM. AND I THINK, MAYBE, TO THINK ABOUT THIS, AND BOB ALE, I THINK, WELL CHARACTERIZED IT. WE WANT TO SEE IF WELL IS AN OUTCOME FOR SFMTA THAT IS RECOGNITION THE RIDERSHIP EVIDENCE ON THE GROUND THAT HAS BEEN WELL COMMUNICATED HERE, WHETHER OR NOT IT -- EVIDENCE ITSELF, AS AN OPTION THAT WE WILL NEED TO BRING BEFORE YOU, AS A REJIGGERING OF THE BASE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FORM LOOKS OR POSSIBLY SOME OTHER WAY, AS WE HIGHLIGHTED IN THE MEMO, WE HAVE TWO OPTIONS THAT WE CAN LOOK AT, THAT WE WILL CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH ALL OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. SO I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT EVEN IN THE SHORT TIME FRAME THAT WE HAVE, WE HAVE A GAME PLAN THAT'S RECOGNIZING THE ISSUE AT ITS CORE THAT WE HAVE THAT AT THE FRONT END OF OUR CONSIDERATIONS AND THE EQUITY CONCERNS ATTACHED TO IT, AND WE AIM TO BRING YOU THE BEST POSSIBLE OUTCOME, GIVEN, THOUGH, THAT THE LIMITATIONS AND OPPORTUNITIES WE SEEK. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALLOWING ME TO MAKE THOSE SUMMARY COMMENTS.

DAVID RABBIT: APPRECIATE THAT VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO COMMISSIONER SPERING.

JAMES P. SPERING: MR. CHAIRMAN, THANK YOU. THERESE, DISAPPOINTMENT AND BETRAYAL, I DON'T THINK THAT'S THE ISSUE. HISTORICALLY THIS COMMISSION AND ALL COMMISSIONERS ARE SUPPORTED PROJECTS THAT DON'T NECESSARILY BENEFIT OR ADVANTAGE THEM BUT THERE IS ALWAYS THIS PROMISE THAT WE WOULD REVISIT THEIR PROJECT OR THEIR CONCERN AND WE HAVE DONE IT. MTC HAS ALWAYS DONE IT IS THAT'S THE CASE HERE. WE ASKED SAN FRANCISCO TO GO ALONG AND IT'S IMPORTANT STAFF MAKES THE EFFORT TO SEE IF WE CAN RESOLVE THIS ISSUE. AND FOR COMMISSIONERS IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE DO THAT SO WE KEEP FACE WITH EACH OTHER.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT'S A VERY IMPORTANT ISSUE HERE, AND I DON'T WANT TO LOSE SIGHT OF THAT, SO THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS, MR. CHAIRMAN.

THERESE MCMILLAN: YOU HAVE OUR COMMITMENT, COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND I WANT TO REITERATE THAT WE HAVE HAD THAT COMMITMENT FROM THE OUTSET AND IT WAS JUST SOME OF THE, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, REFLECTIONS FROM THE STAFF. I DEPARTMENT WANT IT TO BE THOUGHT THAT WE WERE SIMPLY NOT BEING RESPONSIVE TO THE CONCERNS FROM THE BEGINNING THAT YOU HAVE PUT FORWARD. SO WE'RE ON THE SAME PAGE ABOUT WANTING TO COME FORWARD WITH A SOLUTION AS BEST WE CAN. THANKS.

JAMES P. SPERING: THERESE. THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS. THE WORK THAT THERESA IS DOING IT'S OUTSTANDING WORK. BUT IT'S MORE THAN THAT. IT'S THE FACT THAT WE'RE TRYING TO BUILD A CONSENSUS AMONG THIS COMMISSION BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE KEEP FAITH WITH THE PROMISES OR COMMITMENTS THAT WE MAKE. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR AT LEAST GIVING THIS CONSIDERATION AND WORKING ON IT. THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RONEN.

DIR. HILLARY RONEN: YES, THANK YOU. AND I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR YOUR WORDS, AND YOUR SUPPORT. IT MEANS A LOT. AND I WANT TO ECHO COMMISSIONER SPERING AND THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

I -- THIS IS NOTHING NEFARIOUS GOING ON. SAN FRANCISCO, NON-MTA BELIEVE THERE IS ANY BAD INTENTIONS. ABSOLUTELY NOT. THAT'S NOT WHY WE'RE BRINGING UP THIS TODAY, AT ALL, AND THERESE, I CAN'T APPRECIATE YOU AND YOUR STAFF ENOUGH. OF COURSE, YOU HAVE BEEN HAVING MANY MEETINGS WITH MTA AND STAFF TRYING TO WORK THIS OUT. I HOPE YOU DON'T TAKE OFFENSE. THAT'S NOT WHAT I MEANT WHATSOEVER. BUT AT THE SAME TIME, AND I KNOW THIS IS NOT A PROBLEM OF YOUR MAKING AT ALL, AND WE WANT ALL WANT A WIN-WIN SOLUTION HERE, YOU KNOW, MTC IS IN DIRE STRAITS. WE HAVE LINES THAT ARE COMPLETELY REMOVED WE HAVE KIDS THAT WOULD TAKE ONE BUS TO SCHOOL NOW TAKING THREE. IT'S AN ON THE GROUND REALLY BAD SITUATION AND SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT, THERE ARE A FEW OF US HARMED BY THIS FORMULA IN A PARTICULAR WAY THAT I THINK WE NEED TO COME TO THE TABLE WITH THE SPIRIT WHICH I LOVE SO MUCH MTC WITH THE REGIONAL THINKING AND COLLABORATION AND SUPPORT OF ONE ANOTHER THAT WE WORK TOGETHER TO FIND THAT RIGHT FORMULA TO EVEN THINGS OUT A LITTLE AND THEN EVERYONE THAT'S STILL IN DIRE STRAITS WHICH WILL BE MUNI AND MTA, WE HAVE GOT TO GO TOGETHER FOR THAT HAZARD CONDITION, CONTINUING HAZARD CONDITION FUNDING. THIS IS ADVOCATING FOR MUNI HERE BUT IN A SPIRIT OF COLLABORATION, AND IN A SPIRIT OF STICKING TO OUR GUNS AND WHAT WE PROMISED EVEN WHEN IT'S HARD AND THE SITUATION CHANGES. BECAUSE THE RESULTS REALLY IMPACT THE LIVES OF INDIVIDUALS IN OUR CITY IN A VERY, VERY SIGNIFICANT AND REAL WAY. AND, SO, AS A SUPERVISOR, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AS A TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY COMMISSIONER, IF WE GET THIS EXTRA MONEY, THEN IT'S INCUMBENTS UPON ME TO GO FIGHT WITHIN MY CITY AND COUNTY TO MAKE SURE THAT MONEY GOES DIRECTLY TO RESTORE LINES IN THE COMMUNITY. AND THAT'S WHAT I'LL DO. I WANT THIS -- IF WE GET ADDITIONAL MONEY BECAUSE OF A FORMULA THAT MORE ACCURATELY REFLECTS OUR PORTION OF RIDERSHIP, I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT RIDERSHIP IMMEDIATELY SEES THAT BENEFIT P I WANT TO MAKE THAT COMMITMENT TO MTC AND TO MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS, THAT THIS REALLY IS A FIGHT FOR THE PEOPLE ON THE STREET WHO NO LONGER HAVE THEIR LINE TO GET TO WORK AND SCHOOL. THANK YOU FOR HEARING US OUT. AND I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR YOUR ALWAYS INCREDIBLE WORK AND WILLINGNESS TO WORK WITH US ALL.

DAVID RABBIT: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RONEN AND COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. I APOLOGIZE IF IT SEEMED OTHER WISE IN MY EARLIER COMMENTS. I APPRECIATE STAFF WORKING AS THEY HAVE, THROUGHOUT ALL OF THIS, AND OPERATORS NEED TO ADDRESS, AND WORKING THIS OUT AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE AND HOPE WE CAN WORK THIS OUT IN A MANNER THAT BENEFITS EVERYONE.

DAVID RABBIT: ANY LAST COMMENTS? I WANT TO THANK STAFF, I KNOW WE HANDED YOU ANOTHER WRANGLING. AND THE SECOND TRANCHE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE ORIGINALLY INTENDED WAS SUPPORTED BY ALL, BUT OF COURSE THE CURVEBALL OF THE ADDITIONAL $2.2 BILLION WE WANT TO GIVE THE OPPORTUNITY FOR AGENCIES TO APPLY FOR THOSE FUNDS -- -- WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT EVERYONE IS AT THE TABLE. AND THE EQUITY ISSUES ARE NOT OWNED BY ANY ONE PARTICULAR OPERATOR AS WE ALL KNOW AND WE KNOW THIS LAST YEAR GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT, SMART TRANSIT, AND PETALUMA TRANSIT AND SANTA ROSA CITY BUS THERE ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS RIDING THOSE OPERATORS FROM DAY ONE IN THIS PANDEMIC AND I KNOW WE ALL HAVE SIMILAR CIRCUMSTANCES. CERTAINLY SAN FRANCISCO'S RELATIVE IN SCALE NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION. I THINK STAFF HAS HEARD LOUD AND CLEAR IN THIS BODY, AT LEAST, GOING FORWARD. SO WITH THAT, IF THERE ISN'T ANY FINAL WRAP UP, OR WORD OF WISDOM BY ANY OF OUR STAFF MEMBERS, WE'LL MOVE O GIVEN HOUR, WE'LL MOVE O AND THAT LEADS US, THEN, TO OUR OTHER BIG ITEM OF THE DAY. AND I'LL TURN TO ALIX BOCKELMAN OR THERESE MCMILLAN TO ASK, GIVEN THE TIME, THIS IS THE OBAG THREE PROPOSED FRAMEWORK. THIS IS ITEM 4B. BUT GIVEN THE TIME, AND REALLY, THIS IS AN IMPORTANT ISSUE THAT WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT TO SEE WHAT THEIR DESIRE IS ON WHEN WE SHOULD TALK ABOUT IT. ALIX?

ALIX BOCKELMAN: THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT. WE WERE HOPING TO HAVE SOME TIME TO GET INTO THE OBAG PROPOSAL, BUT IT IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. SO WE WANT TO CHECK IN WITH YOU AND MAKE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SURE YOU'RE FRESH AND YOU REALLY HAVE SOME TIME TO DIGEST IT ALL. SO WE WOULD BE HAPPY, AT YOUR PLEASURE, WE COULD CONTINUE THIS EITHER TO THE OCTOBER COMMISSION MEETING OR THE NOVEMBER PACK AND WE COULD LOOK AT SCHEDULES AT WHERE WE THINK WE HAVE THE MOST TIME. GIVE US DIRECTION AND WE'LL DO THAT. OTHERWISE MALLORY IS HERE AND SHE CAN LAUNCH IN.

DAVID RABBIT: I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES TO SEE IF THERE IS CONCURRENCE TO SEE IF WE CAN'T -- NOT CONTINUE, BUT POSTPONE TO A TIME WE CAN RELATIONSHIP WRAP OUR HEADS AROUND THAT PARTICULAR IMPORTANT ITEM. THANK YOU MALLORY. AND VALERIE FOR ALL YOUR WORK AS WELL. WE WILL MOVE TO ITEM FIVE, BE PUBLIC COMMENT. KIMBERLY I'LL LOOK TO YOU TO SEE IF THERE IS ANYONE IN ATTENDEES LIST OR CORRESPONDENCE THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED?

KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

DAVID RABBIT: ALL RIGHT. WITH THAT, IF THERE ISN'T ANY OTHER ACTION FOR THIS BOARD, THAT LEADS US TO AN ADJOURNMENT. AND I GUESS WE'LL MEET AGAIN WEDNESDAY NOVEMBER 10TH AT 945 WILL A.M. REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST. AGAIN, THANK YOU EVERYONE FOR THE CONVERSATION TODAY. MUCH APPRECIATE IT. THANKS FOR YOUR PATIENCE, AS WELL. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NTT

Broadcasting Government