ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS

Meeting Transcript

ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS

ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 24, 2021, 9:00 A.M.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: GOOD MORNING. I'M MAYOR JESSE ARREQUIN, THE CHAIR OF THE ASSOCIATION BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER AND ASK STAFF TO PLAY THE COVID-19 RECORDING. THANK YOU. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE ABAG WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WILL THE ABAG CLERK OF THE BOARD CONDUCT A ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM QUORUM.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR ARREGUIN.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR ECKLUND?

PAT ECKLUND: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR FLIGOR?

NEYSA FLIGOR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR HUDSON?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID E. HUDSON: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR LEE IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

KAREN MITCHOFF: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RABBIT? SUPERVISOR RABBIT IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

BELIA RAMOS: GOOD MORNING. HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MAYOR ROMERO?

CARLOS ROMERO: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR WILSON IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: AND SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS PRESENT. GOOD MORNING.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: QUORUM IS PRESENT. ITEM TWO PUBLIC COMMENT. WE WILL BE TAKING PUBLIC COMMENT ON EACH APPEAL BUT THIS IS OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS. IS THERE ANYONE WHO WISHES TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS. IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. MR. CASTRO, ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT COMPLETES THIS ITEM. WE'LL GO ITEM THREE COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. ARE THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. IF SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND AT THIS TIME. SEEING NO RAISED HANDS. I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM THREE, COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO MEMBERS OF ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO COMMENTS WERE SUBMITTED.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THAT COMPLETES THIS ITEM. WE'LL GO TO ITEM 4, THE CHAIR'S REPORT. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK MY COLLEAGUES FOR BEING HERE TODAY THIS IS AN IMPORTANT MEETING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THIS IS THE FIRST OF SEVERAL HEARINGS ON THE APPEALS REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION PLAN I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME REPRESENTATIVES FROM JURISDICTIONS TO THIS RHNA APPEALS PUBLIC HEARING. A STATE-MANDATED PROCESS TO IDENTIFY JURISDICTION ACCOMMODATION OF HOUSING ELEMENT GENERAL PLAN HCD DETERMINED THAT BAY AREA COMMUNITIES OVER THE NEXT YEARS MUST PLAN FOR 441,176 NEW HOUSING UNITS FROM 2023 TO 2031. ON MAY 20TH, 2021 ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVED THE FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY AND DRAFT ALLOCATIONS. WHICH INITIATED THE APPEALS PHASE OF THE RHNA PROCESS. ABAG RECEIVED APPEALS FROM THE BAY AREA JURISDICTIONS BY THE DEAD NINE AND ABAG IS REQUIRED TO HOLD A PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER ALL APPEALS FILED. PROVIDING OPPORTUNITY FOR JURISDICTIONS THAT FILED APPEALS TO PROVIDE TESTIMONY BEFORE THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE AS PART OF THE COMMITTEE'S DELIBERATION ON APPEALS. TODAY IS THE FIRST DAY OF THE PUBLIC HEARING WHICH WILL BE CONTINUED OVER SIX MEETINGS OVER SEPTEMBER AND OCTOBER. IN LATE AUGUST AND EARLY SEPTEMBER LEGAL NOTICES WERE PUBLISHED IN MULTIPLE LANGUAGES, IN NEWSPAPERS IN EACH OF THE NINE COUNTIES OF THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA. ANNOUNCING THE DATES OF THE PUBLIC HEARING AND DETAILS ON FUTURE MEETING DATES ARE AVAILABLE ON THE ABAG WEB SITE. THERE ARE SEVEN APPEALS WHICH WILL BE HEARD TODAY AND WRITTEN COMMENTS REFERENCING ALL RHNA APPEALS ARE ATTACHED UNDER AGENDA ITEM SIX THE COMMITTEE WILL CONSIDER EACH JURISDICTION'S APPEAL SUBSEQUENTLY WE EXPECT TO TAKE A LUNCH

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BREAK AFTER THE THIRD APPEAL AND AFTER WILL RECONVENE THE PARTIAL HEARING AND CONTINUE WITH THE APPEALS I MAY CALL A BRIEF RECESS AT ANY POINT DURING THE DAY. FOR EACH JURISDICTION THE HEARING BEGINS WITH THE JURISDICTION'S PRESENTATION OF ITS APPEAL. THE INFORMATION AND ARGUMENTS PRESENTED BY THE APPELLANT SHOULD BE LIMITED TO WHAT WAS PRESENTED IN THE WRITTEN APPEAL SUBMITTED. WE CANNOT CONSIDER NEW INFORMATION THAT WAS NOT SUBMITTED IN THE WRITTEN APPEAL. THIS IS FOLLOWED BY A RESPONSE FROM ABAG MTC STAFF REGARDING THE APPEAL AND THEREAFTER THE APPLICANT HAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO ARGUMENTS OR EVIDENCE THAT ABAG MTC STAFF PRESENTED. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL THEN HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT ON THE ARGUMENTS PRESENTED ON EACH APPEAL. BASED ON APPEAL PROCEDURES ADOPTED BY ABAG WHICH WERE POSTED TO THE APPEAL PAGE WEB SITE SPEAKERS WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES FOR PUBLIC COMMENT BUT THE CHAIR HAS DISCRETION TO ADJUST TIME IF NEEDED TO ENSURE ORDERLY CONDUCT OF THE MEETING TO BE FAIR JURISDICTIONS TO ENSURE APPEAL ARE HEARD IN A TIMELY MANNER ON THE DAY THEY WERE NOTICED EACH SPEAKER WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE TO SPEAK AND IF THE TOTAL TIME FOR PUBLIC COMMENT RELATING TO A JURISDICTION APPEAL EXCEEDS 30 MINUTES CONSIDERATION OF JURISDICTION'S APPEAL MAY BE SUSPENDED TO CONTINUE LATER IN THE DAY UNTIL AFTER THE APPEALS FROM OTHER JURISDICTIONS HAVE BEEN HEARD TO ENSURE THAT WE KEEP ON TIME BECAUSE WE HAVE A NUMBER OF APPEALS WE'RE CONSIDERING TODAY. FOLLOWING PUBLIC

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMENT THE COMMITTEE WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS THE APPEAL AND ROLLED ROLL CALL ON A PRELIMINARY DECISION ON THE APPEAL THE COMMITTEE WILL HOLD A FINAL VOTE ON THE APPEALS AT A MEETING AFTER THE CLOSE OF PUBLIC HEARING TO ENSURE UNIFORM DECISION MAKING AND ABAG WILL THEN ISSUE A FINAL INCORPORATION AND ANY ADJUSTMENTS IF NEEDED. THE FINAL RHNA PLAN IS SCHEDULED FOR DECEMBER 2021. THAT CONCLUDES MY REPORT AND I'LL ASK IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS.

PAT ECKLUND: WE'RE GOING TO HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO ASK QUESTIONS AND ARE WE GOING TO BE LIMITED ON THE NUMBER OF QUESTIONS WE'RE ALLOWED TO ASK?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: NO. BUT WE TRY TO BUDGET AN HOUR FOR EACH PUBLIC HEARING. SO DEPENDING ON THE LENGTH AND DISCUSSION OF PUBLIC COMMENT THAT JUST MEANS WE'LL PROBABLY GO PAST 5:00 BUT WE WANT TO BE SURE WE HAVE AMPLE TIME FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AS WELL AS DISCUSSION BY THE COMMITTEE BEFORE WE MAKE A PRELIMINARY DECISION.

PAT ECKLUND: GREAT THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE? IF NOT I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? MR. CASTRO?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. -- I'M SORRY -- THERE IS ONE MEMBER WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ONE MOMENT PLEASE. TIME LIMIT IS TWO MINUTES. CARMEN, IF YOU CAN UNMUTE AND GO AHEAD, PLEASE?

SPEAKER: IS THIS TIME TO ADDRESS THE RHNA NUMBERS FOR THE CITY OF ALAMEDA?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: NO. I'LL ANNOUNCE THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD SHORTLY.

SPEAKER: OKAY THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I WAS JUST GOING OVER THE PROCEDURES FOR THE CONDUCT OF TODAY'S HEARING.

SPEAKER: OKAY. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I WILL ANNOUNCE WHEN WE'RE TAKING PUBLIC COMMENT. ARE THERE ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENCE ON ITEM, FOR THE CHAIR'S REPORT?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THAT COMPLETES THIS ITEM. ITEM FIVE, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. MS. MCMILLAN.

THERESE MCMILLAN: GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I DO NOT HAVE A REPORT THIS MORNING BUT WANT TO EXTEND MY APPRECIATION FOR EVERYONE PARTICIPATING TODAY.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ITEM SIX THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION APPEALS PUBLIC HEARING ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WILL HEAR APPEALS FROM JURISDICTIONS AND RESPONSES TO ISSUES RAISED BY THE ABAG AND MTC STAFF JURISDICTION SCHEDULE FOR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THIS MEETING ARE LISTED ON THE PUBLISHED AGENDA THE HEARING IS SCHEDULED TO CONTINUE TO A SPECIAL MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ON SEPTEMBER 29TH, 2021 AT 9:00 A.M. I WOULD LIKE TO OPEN THE HEARING ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS A SHORTHAND CERTIFIED REPORTER IS TRANSCRIBING THE PROCEEDINGS FOR THE RECORD. WHEN IT'S TIME FOR PUBLIC COMMENT IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE TO BE CALLED UPON. FIRST APPEAL REPORT ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF ALAMEDA. START WITH 6A, THE REPORT ON THE APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF ALAMEDA A PRELIMINARY ACTION ITEM AND WE WILL FIRST HEAR FROM THE CITY OF ALAMEDA FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT THEIR PALE WHO WILL BE REPRESENTING THE CITY OF ALAMEDA TODAY.

ANDREW THOMAS: THAT WOULD BE ME.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: FORMER CITY OF BERG BERKELEY.

SPEAKER: YES.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: EACH APPELLANT WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT TO THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. MR. CASTRO YOU WILL BE KEEPING TIME?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, SIR.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: AND NOTIFYING WHEN TIME IS ELAPSED?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES AND THERE WILL BE AN AUDIBLE SIGNAL.

ANDREW THOMAS. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE COMMITTEE FOR CONSIDERING OUR APPEAL THIS MORNING. WE UNDERSTAND HOW IMPORTANT THIS ISSUE IS TO THE REGION, AND WE WANT TO JUST START OFF BY THANKING ABAG, THE ABAG STAFF, AND ALL OF YOU FOR THIS IMPORTANT WORK. THERE IS NO IMMEDIATE ISSUE PROBABLY MORE IMPORTANT TO THE REGION THAN THIS. AND WE KNOW THAT ALL YOU REALLY HEAR IS COMPLAINTS. SO, I WANT TO START OFF THIS LONG SERIES OF HEARINGS THAT YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE BY SAYING THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING YOU HAVE DONE TO DATE ON THIS ISSUE. WE ALSO WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW, THE CITY OF ALAMEDA, WE DO BUILD HOUSING IN ALAMEDA. WE ARE ON TRACK TO MEET OUR TOTAL HOUSING ALLOCATION FOR THE CURRENT CYCLE, AND WE WILL MEET WHATEVER NUMBER YOU ASK US TO MEET IN OUR NEXT CYCLE. THIS IS AN IMPORTANT ISSUE, AND WE UNDERSTAND THAT LOCAL AGENCIES HAVE A RESPONSIBILITY TO THE LARGER REGION. BUT WE ALSO UNDERSTAND, AND WE UNDERSTAND THAT, AS LOCAL AGENCIES, WE RELY ON AND DEPEND UPON THE REGION FOR YOUR SUPPORT ON THESE REGIONAL ISSUES. AND OTHER REGIONAL ISSUES, SUCH AS TRANSPORTATION, AND OF COURSE, THE UPCOMING CRISIS THAT WE'RE ALL STARTING TO DEAL WITH, WHICH IS THE CLIMATE CHANGE CRISIS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE REALLY WANT TO FOCUS OUR APPEAL ON THE ISSUE OF CLIMATE CHANGE. AS I SAID, WE REALLY SEE THIS AS WE'RE DEALING WITH TWO MAJOR REGIONAL PLANNING ISSUES THAT ARE RIGHT IN FRONT OF US. ONE IS HOUSING CRISIS, IT'S VERY IMMEDIATE, WE SEE IT EVERY DAY AS WE WALK IN OUR PARKS AND AS WE DRIVE DOWN OUR STREETS. AND, BUT THERE IS ALSO THIS OTHER CRISIS THAT WE HAVE TO BE THINKING ABOUT, AND WE HAVE TO BE PLANNING FOR, AND IT HAS TO BE DONE AT A REGIONAL LEVEL. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ON THIS SECOND ISSUE OF CLIMATE CHANGE, IF YOU THINK OF THE BAY AREA AS, LIKE, A FAMILY OF CITIES AND COUNTIES, WE'RE GOING TO BE YOUR PROBLEM CHILD. WE'RE GOING TO BE THAT CHILD THAT NEEDS THE EXTRA HELP. WE ARE AN ISLAND, WE ARE FLAT AS A PANCAKE. THERE IS NOWHERE TO RETREAT, NO HILLS TO RETREAT TO. THE WATER IS RISING AROUND US, AND WE WILL NEED TO BUILD PERIMETER DIKES AND LEVEES. THERE IS GROUNDWATER RISING UNDER US IN FACT IMPACTS SEA LEVEL RISE WILL FIRST BE FELT IN ALAMEDA BY RISE OF GROUNDWATER AND RISING GROUNDWATER RISES SO WILL HAZARDOUS MATERIALS THAT HAVE BEEN TRAPPED OVER THE YEARS UNDER THE CURRENT SURFACE OF THE EARTH. IT WILL BE MORE THAN JUST BUILDING SEA WALLS IT'S GOING TO BE UPGRADING THE ENTIRE INFRASTRUCTURE ALL OF THE CITY STORM DRAINS CITYWIDE WILL NEED TO BE UPGRADED. EVERY ASPECT OF OUR INFRASTRUCTURE IS GOING BE IMPACTED BY SEA LEVEL RISE. THE ABAG STAFF REPORT IN RESPONSE TO OUR APPEAL WAS VERY RATIONAL, AND THOROUGH. THERE WAS ONE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ISSUE THAT, SORT OF, RAISED OUR EYEBROWS IN ESSENTIALLY SAYING --

>>CLERK OF THE BOARD: ONE MINUTE.

ANDREW THOMAS: LET'S KEEP MOVING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. QUESTION FOR THE REGION, ARE YOU SURE YOU WANT US GROWING? TO SPEED UP OUR GROWTH? ARE WE SURE THAT RETREAT IS NOT THE PLAN FOR ALAMEDA? LOOKING FORWARD OVER THE NEXT 20 TO 30 YEARS. IF THE REGION SAYS NO, DON'T WORRY ABOUT RETREATING ALAMEDA, JUST KEEP GROWING THEN THAT'S WHAT WE WILL DO, BUT WHAT WE ASK THE REGION IS, IF THAT'S YOUR DECISION, THEN, PLEASE, LET US KNOW THAT YOU WILL BE THERE FOR US, FINANCIALLY, WHEN WE NEED TO START DEALING WITH THE IMPLICATIONS OF SEA LEVEL RISE TO THIS COMMUNITY. IT'S A REGIONAL DECISION. ALAMEDA CAN'T MAKE THE DECISION WHETHER TO STAY OR GO. IT'S A REASONABLE DECISION. IF YOU ASK US TO KEEP GROWING AND STAY, WE WILL. NEXT SLIDE. LAST THING TO FOCUS ON -- IS THAT MY FIVE MINUTES. -- STOP ME IF IT'S MY TIME.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: IT'S TIME.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAKE YOUR FINAL POINT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: IF YOU FEEL THAT ALAMEDA NEEDS TO BE PART OF THE SOLUTION FOR THIS CYCLE AND THE NEXT CYCLE AFTER THIS, WE HAVE A FEDERAL CAP ON HOUSING. ONE OF THE REGION'S LARGEST HOUSING OPPORTUNITY SITES, AND THAT'S ALAMEDA. WE'RE GOING TO RUN THROUGH THAT CAP IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS AND ALL THE HOUSING IS GOING HAVE TO STOP. IT'S A FINANCIAL CAP. WE'RE ASKING FOR YOUR HELP ON THIS -- HELP WITH THIS CAP, HELP US WORK WITH THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO RELIEVE US OF THIS CAP. WITH THAT, NEXT SLIDE, I THINK IS MY GRAND FILL ANNIE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION. WE UNDERSTAND WHAT A HARD JOB THIS IS FOR BAGGING AND FOR THE REGION. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION. WE'RE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. AND THANK YOU FOR THE EXTRA 30 SECONDS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YOU WILL HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO STAFF'S PRESENTATION AFTER THE PRESENTATION. WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO TURN TO ABAG MTC STAFF FOR THEIR RESPONSE TO ALAMEDA'S APPEAL.

GILLIAN ADAMS: PULL UP THE SLIDES PLEASE. THANK YOU. I'M JILL YAM -- GILLIAN, REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS MANAGER. NEXT PHASE ALAMEDA REQUESTING REDUCTION OF 200703 UNITS REPRESENTS REDUCTION OF ABOUT 50% OF ITS DRAFT ALLOCATION STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO DENY THE APPEAL. ALAMEDA PROHIBITION ON THE MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING WHICH IS NOT A VALID BASIS FOR A RHNA

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

APPEAL BECAUSE HOUSING ELEMENT LAW SPECIFICALLY STATES THAT RESIDENTIAL BUILDING PERMIT CANNOT BE A JUSTIFICATION ARE FOR REDUCING THE CITY'S SHARE OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEED. THE IMPACT FEE THAT IS MENTIONED IS NOT A VALID BASIS FOR APPEAL BECAUSE HOUSING ELEMENT LAW STATES THAT ABAG IS NOT LIMITED IN CONSIDERATION OF SUITABLE SITES FOR THE HOUSING THROUGH CITY'S EXISTING ZONING LAND USE RESTRICTIONS AND JURISDICTION MUST CONSIDER PLANNED OPPORTUNITIES FOR INFILL DEVELOPMENT AND INCREASE RESIDENTIAL DENSITIES AS A COMPONENT OF AVAILABLE LAND FOR HOUSING IN ALAMEDA AND THE CITY'S LARGEST OPPORTUNITY SITE ALAMEDA HAS NOT DEMONSTRATED THAT IT CANNOT ACCOMMODATE ITS RHNA ALLOCATION. NATURAL HAZARDS ESPECIALLY WITH SEA LEVEL RISE HOWEVER WITH SMALL EXCEPTION HOUSING ELEMENT LAW DOES NOT IDENTIFY AREAS AT RISK FOR NATURAL HAZARDS AS A CONSTRAINT TO HOUSING. SIMILAR TO A PREVIOUS JURISDICTION -- -- IN ITS COMMENT LETTER ON APPEALS HCD SPECIFICALLY NOTE THAT HOUSING PLANNING CANNOT BE LIMITED TO VACANT LAND AND EVEN COMMUNITIES THAT VIEW THEMSELVES AS BUILT OUT OR LIMED DUE TO NATURAL CONSTRAINTS SUCH AS FIRE AND FLOOD RISK AREAS MUST PLAN FOR HOUSING FOR MEANS SUCH AS REZONING MIXED COMMERCIAL AND UPZONING NON-VACANT LAND. AND GIVEN THE VARIETY OF NATURAL HAZARD RISKS IN THE BAY AREA, IT'S NOT POSSIBLE TO ADDRESS THE REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS AND COMPLETELY AVOID PLANNING FOR NEW HOMES IN PLACES AT RISK. HOWEVER WHEN PLANNING FOR HOUSING ALAMEDA CAN CHOOSE LOCATIONS WITH THE LOWEST HAZARD RISK OR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INCREASE BUILDING STANDARDS FOR SITES AT RISK AREAS. THE CITY DOES NOT PROVIDE EVIDENCE THAT IT IS UNABLE TO CONSIDER THESE STRATEGIES FOR ACCOMMODATING ITS RHNA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN DEVELOPING THE RHNA METHODOLOGY THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE CONSIDERED INCLUDING A FACTOR RELATED TO NATURAL HAZARDS BUT ULTIMATELY DECIDED NOT TO LARGELY BECAUSE THESE RISKS ARE ADDRESSED IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT THAT IS USED AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION FOR THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. THE FINAL BLUEPRINT ASSUMES ONE FOOT OF SEA LEVEL RISE BY 2035 AND 2 FEET OF RISE BY 2050 INCLUDING ADAPTATIONS WITH TWO FEET OF RISE INCLUDING LOCATION IN ALAMEDA ADAPTATION INVESTMENT IN THE PLAN PROTECT AREAS IN ALAMEDA OF SEA LEVEL RISE WITH PROTECTED AREAS SHOWN IN BLUE ON THE MAP IMPORTANTLY THE SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE PRODUCED BY THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA SUGGEST THAT IT IS UNLIKELY THAT THERE WILL BE SEA LEVEL RISE OVER THE NEXT FEW DECADES THAT IS MORE EXTREME THAN LEVELS ASSUMED IN PLANNED BAY AREA AS SOLUTIONS TO ADDRESS INUNDATION FROM THE BAY SOLUTIONS TO ADDRESS GROUNDWATER WILL BE NECESSARY. A -- MITIGATING RISKS MAY BE EASIER WITH NEW DEVELOPMENT WITH SOLUTIONS DESIGNED DIRECTLY INTO DEVELOPMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ONE MINUTE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GILLIAN ADAMS: HOUSING ELEMENT LAW DOESN'T INCLUDE TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS AS A FACTOR TO BE CONSIDERED IN THE METHODOLOGY. NOT A VALID BASIS FOR APPEAL. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 INCLUDES HALF A MILLION DOLLARS TO THE FUTURE OF TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS ENCOURAGING ALTERNATIVES TO DRIVING TO LESSEN THE IMPACTS OF HOUSEHOLD GROWTH IN THE CITY OF ALAMEDA. MTC STAFF RECOMMENDS THE COMMITTEE DENY ALAMEDA'S APPEAL REQUESTING REDUCTION OF 200703 UNITS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE THE CITY OF ALAMEDA A CHANCE TO RESPOND TO THE STAFF'S PRESENTATION IF THEY SO CHOOSE.

ANDREW THOMAS: WE HAVE NO RESPONSE. NO NEED. AGAIN, I THINK OUR -- BRIEFLY, OUR ISSUE IS, WE CAN BUILD THE 5300 UNITS. WE'RE ASKING, ARE YOU SURE YOU WANT US TO. AND, GIVEN THE PROSPECT OF WHAT WE ARE THEN GOING TO BE TURNING AROUND AND ASKING THE REGION FOR, WHAT WE DON'T WANT TO HEAR IS, IN TEN YEARS, HEY, ALAMEDA, YOU SHOULD BE PLANNING FOR A RETREAT. YOU SHOULD BE NOT BUILDING. WE HAVE CHANGED OUR MIND. IT'S -- YOU SHOULD -- WHY ARE YOU ALL STAYING ON THIS ISLAND? YOU SHOULD BE GETTING OUT. WE CAN'T AFFORD TO HELP YOU AS A REGION. IF THE REGION IS SAYING, DON'T WORRY ABOUT THAT, ALAMEDA, WE'LL BE THERE FOR YOU, THEN, WE HAVE NO -- WE'LL BUILD THOSE UNITS. WE DON'T DEBATE ANY OF THE STAFF'S CONCLUSIONS. WHAT WE'RE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ASKING IS THAT ABAG, AS THE REGIONAL PLANNING AGENCY, LAST CALL. ARE YOU SURE ABOUT THIS? BECAUSE IF YOU'RE SAYING FORTIFY, THEN LET'S FORTIFY, AND PROTECT AGAINST SEA LEVEL RISE. BUT IT'S GOING TO BE A MAJOR MAJOR INVESTMENT FOR THE REGION. AND IT'S NOT LIKE BERKELEY OR SAN FRANCISCO, WHERE WE CAN RETREAT TO THE HILLS AND JUST BUILD THERE. WE WILL BE BUILDING IN FLOOD PRONE AREAS. BECAUSE EVERY PART OF ALAMEDA IS GOING TO BE SUSCEPTIBLE TO -- AND AFFECTED AND IMPACTED BY THE RISING SEAS. WITH THAT, I HAVE NOTHING ELSE TO ADD.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO I WOULD NOW LIKE TO OPEN THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD ON THE RHNA APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF ALAMEDA. IF ANYBODY FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE CITY OF ALAMEDA'S APPEAL PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONE INTO OUR MEETING. MR. CASTRO PLEASE CALL THE SPEAKERS.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: EACH SPEAKER HAS TWO MINUTES. FIRST SPEAKER IS CARMEN. GO AHEAD AND PROCEED, PLEASE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: CARMEN, YOU ARE CURRENTLY UNMUTED.

SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YES WE CAN.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I AM A LONG-TERM RESIDENT IN THE CITY OF ALAMEDA AND I RESPECTFULLY REQUEST A REDUCTION OF OUR RHNA NUMBERS BASED ON THIS HAZARD ZONE EXEMPTION. ALAMEDA IS AN ISLAND WITH LIMITED INGRESS AND EGRESS WITH ONE TUBE AND FOUR BRIDGE AND IN THE EVENT OF A TSUNAMI MAJORITY OF THE ISLAND WOULD BE UNDER WATER AND DENSITY HOUSING WOULD LIKELY BE IN THOSE HOUSING ZONES AND WITH LIQUEFACTION DURING AN EARTHQUAKE COULD POTENTIALLY AFFECT OUR RESIDENTS. THERE WAS ALSO A RECENT GROUNDWATER STUDY THAT WAS RELEASED LAST SUMMER AND THAT SUPPORTS THIS ROBUST ANALYSIS THAT THIS IS A VERY SERIOUS ISSUE. WE ALREADY HAVE EXISTING FLOODING ISSUES IN MANY OF OUR BASEMENTS. AND I ASK THAT YOU PLEASE RECONSIDER AND PLEASE REDUCE OUR ALLOCATION OF OUR RHNA NUMBERS, AND APPROPRIATELY ADDRESS THESE VERY IMPORTANT ISSUES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR WORK.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN KNOX. PLEASE GO AHEAD.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU MAYOR ARREGUIN AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I'M JOHN KNOX CITY COUNCILMEMBER FOR THE CITY OF ALAMEDA I AM A YIMBY AND THREE OF THE COUNSEL MEMBERS WHO VOTED IN FAVOR OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE APPEAL THAT WAS FILED. I CALLED IN TO FIRST THANK YOU FOR ALL OF YOUR WORK AND TO ADD MY VOICE TO MR. THOMAS' PRESENTATION. OUR APPEAL WAS NOT ENTIRELY AN APPEAL TO JUST REDUCE NUMBERS AND REDUCE HOUSING. IT WAS TO ASK A QUESTION, WHICH I THINK ANDREW PUT FORTH, AND WHICH I DON'T BELIEVE HAS BEEN ANSWERED CORRECTLY, OR APPROPRIATELY AT THIS POINT IN TIME. I FULLY UNDERSTAND THAT THERE ARE NATURAL HAZARDS EVERYWHERE. BUT, AS AN ISLAND CITY, WHO IS ON, YOU KNOW, INGRESS, AND EGRESS, IS IMPACTED VERY EARLY ON BY CLIMATE CHANGE. WE DO HAVE A SPECIAL, UNIQUE NEED, THAT IS DIFFERENT THAN OTHER CITIES. OUR LIQUEFACTION IS UNLIKE OTHER CITIES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ONE MINUTE.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. WE ARE REALLY ASKING FOR A REEVALUATION OF WHETHER YOU WOULD LIKE TO US BUILD, AND AS ANDREW SAID, IF NOT, WE WOULD LIKE THIS COMMITTEE TO RECOMMEND THAT THERE BE LANGUAGE IN THE DENIAL THAT SPECIFICALLY CALLS OUT THE REGION'S COMMITMENT TO HELPING OUR ISLAND. IN THE LAST TEN YEARS THERE HAS BEEN SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTION AND MITIGATION WORK THAT HAS BEEN DONE IN WHICH ALAMEDA IS OUTSIDE DIKE, NOT SEEN AS PERSON. AND WE -- BECAUSE THE COST FIREFIGHTER OUR CITY TO FIX THIS ISSUE IS GOING TO BE OUTSIDE OF THE LEVEL OF OUR ABILITY TO DO IT ALONE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK AND WANTED TO THANK YOU FOR SPENDING THE TIME GIVE ME A CHANCE TO SPEAK.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU.

SPEAKER: I AM SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF ALAMEDA'S CITIZEN TASK FORCE OUR PRIMARY OBJECTION TO THE CURRENT RHNA ALLOCATION IS A FAILURE OF ABAG TO CONSIDER OUR UNIQUE NATURAL HAZARD CONSTRAINTS IN ABAG STAFF POSITION ENTIRE BAY AREA IMPOSSIBLE TO DIFFERENTIATE BETWEEN CITIES AS PART OF THE ALLOCATION. THIS POSITION IS CONTRADICTED BY THE METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE STUDY OF THE VARIATIONS OF NATURAL HAZARD IMPACTS -- -- THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, WHICH PRODUCE THE MAP THAT USES THE METRIC OF THE PERCENTAGE OF THE CITY'S URBANIZED AREA THAT IS OUTSIDE OF A NATURAL HAZARD ZONE IT DEMONSTRATES WHY VARIATIONS FROM CITY TO CITY PLACES ALAMEDA IN THE MOST IMPACTED CATEGORY OF HAVING 57% OF ITS LAND OUTSIDE OF A NATURAL HAZARD ZONE. MORE OVER MOST AVAILABLE VACANT LAND IS A JAYS TONIGHT WATER WITHIN THOSE BAY AREA HAZARD ZONES. PLANNED BAY AREA PROMISES FUTURE FUNDING TO MITIGATE THIS GIVES ME NO SOLACE BECAUSE IT PROVIDES NO GUARANTEE WHATSOEVER OF THAT FUNDING OR THE SOURCE THEREOF. ALAMEDA IS A HIGH-RESOURCE CITY --

CLERK OF THE BOARD: 30 SECONDS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: -- CLOSE TO JOBS AND TRANSPORTATION WHICH PLACES A FACTOR OF SIGNIFICANT ALLOCATION ON US. HOWEVER ALAMEDA HIS STRONG SIGNIFICANT ISSUES OF THAT ALLOCATION. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS TRISHA SPENCER.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU ALL FOR YOUR SERVICE. I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. SO I'M ON CITY COUNCIL, I'M FORMER MAYOR, I HAVE BEEN ON SCHOOL BOARD, AS SOMEONE THAT SITS ON THAT DAIS AND MAKES THESE DECISIONS OF WHERE TO PUT THIS HOUSING, IT IS VERY CHALLENGING AND DIFFICULT TO CONTINUE TO PUT HOUSING WHERE WE KNOW WE ARE PUTTING TEAM IN HARM'S WAY. AND I APPRECIATE ALL THE LEGAL COMMENTS FROM ABAG STAFF OF WHAT THEY CAN AND CANNOT CONSIDER, BUT WE KNOW, MUCH OF ALAMEDA IS LANDFILL. IT'S LANDFILL. IT LIQUIFY IN EARTHQUAKES WE HAVE TO BE PREPARED FOR THAT. SADLY THERE ARE MANY TIMES THAT WE KNOW WE'RE NOT PREPARED. WE NEED SOLUTIONS IF YOU'RE GOING TO ASK US TO PUT HOW LONG IN HARM'S WAY. IF WE HAVE FLOODING, AND NOW THE LATEST MAPS, MUCH OF IT IS RED, WHICH MEANS, AND WHERE WE WOULD WE PUT THE HOUSING? WE WILL IN FACT BE PUTTING IT ON LANDFILL. WE WILL -- [INDISCERNIBLE] FLOOD ZONES, AND SADLY, WE WOULD -- WE'RE A SMALL CITY, LESS THAN 80,000. WE DO NOT HAVE THE MONEY TO BUILD ALL THESE WALLS TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRY TO PROTECT OUR COMMUNITY. WE ARE A FORMER BASE, THE CONTAMINATION, WE CAP IT, BUT OUR STAFF MEMBER SHARED THAT'S A BIG PART OF WHERE WE ARE PUTTING HOUSING, WITH THE GROUNDWATER RISING. THE SEALANTS, WE KNOW THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO PROTECT US. AND SO WE WILL DESPERATELY NEED HELP FROM YOU ALL, IF YOU'RE GOING TO DEMAND US TO CONTINUE TO PUT HOUSING IN HARM'S WAY. IT IS A VERY SERIOUS PROBLEM. PEOPLE WILL, IN FACT, LOSE THEIR LIVES WHENEVER THIS CATASTROPHE HAPPENS. WE ARE NOT PREPARED, AS A REGION. WE ARE DEFINITELY NOT PREPARED AS A COMMUNITY. SO WE REALLY NEED YOUR HELP TO ACTUALLY PULL BACK ON THE NUMBERS UNTIL YOU HELP US SOLVE THE PROBLEM, SO THAT WE ARE SAFELY BUILDING HOUSING.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU COUNCILMEMBER. AS I ANNOUNCED AT THE BEGINNING OF THE HEARING AND AS STATED TO THE APPELLANTS. IF THERE ARE FIVE OR MORE SPEAKERS, WE WILL REDUCE SPEAKER TIME TO ONE MINUTE. I'LL ASK IF THERE ARE ANY OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO SPEAK ON THE CITY OF ALAMEDA'S APPEAL. IF SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND AT THIS TIME. I BELIEVE THIS IS THE FIFTH SPEAKER, MR. CASTRO, CORRECT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. NEXT SPEAKER. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I AM MUTING THIS PERSON. SORRY ABOUT THAT.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I SENT A LETTER IN THAT COVERED MOST OF THE RHNA APPEALS. I AM AGAINST THIS APPEAL. I AM AN ALAMEDA CITIZEN, AND I AM AGAINST ALL OF THE APPEALS EXCEPT FOR THE SMALLER SONOMA APPEAL SPECIFICALLY THIS ONE DOESN'T RAISE TO THE STANDARD OF WHAT'S ALLOWABLE IN APPEAL AROUND HCD'S MEMO. THE METHODOLOGY IS NOT AN ACCEPTABLE APPEAL. BUT THAT'S THE SUMMARY OF MY COMMENTS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. DON'T SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ONE MORE RAISED HAND.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ONE LAST CALL FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE CITY OF ALAMEDA'S APPEAL. IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK, PLEASE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RAISE YOUR HAND AT THIS TIME. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RICK HMM -- HAMER.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU FOR HEARING ME. I DISAGREE WITH THIS APPEAL. I FEEL THERE IS HIGH ENOUGH LAND TO REPLACE SOME OF THE EXISTING STRUCTURES WITH HIGH DENSITY HOUSING WE DON'T HAVE TO UTILIZE THE THREATENED ORDER TO COMPLY WITH THE RHNA NUMBER. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU, SIR. OKAY. ONE LAST CALL FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK ON THE CITY OF ALAMEDA APPEAL, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. WE HAVE ONE MORE RAISED HAND. ROSALINDA. PLEASE GO AHEAD. DO YOU WISH TO SPEAK ON THE CITY OF ALAMEDA APPEAL?

SPEAKER: YES. I HAVE BEEN A LONG TIME RESIDENT OF ALAMEDA AND I GREW UP AS A MILITARY CHILD, BACK IN THE DAYS WHEN MY FATHER WAS TRANSFERRED TO THE ALAMEDA NAVAL AIR STATION. I HAVE SEEN THE CHANGES THAT ALAMEDA HAS ALREADY BUILT SO MANY OF HOUSING, AND WE ARE INUNDATED PEOPLE ARE GETTING UPSET. THE CITIZENS ARE UPSET ON THE AMOUNT OF NEW HOUSING THAT WE ALREADY HAVE. AND THE ISLAND ITSELF IS UNSAFE AROUND THE SHORELINES TO BUILD ON. JUST LIKE TRISH HERRERA SPENCER HAD PREVIOUSLY SAID. BECAUSE OF THE LIQUEFACTION, AND THE FLOOD ZONES THAT ARE DESIGNATED BY FEMA. THOSE ARE THINGS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DESIGNATED AS UNSAFE BY RESEARCHERS AND WITH THE CLIMATE CHANGE, WE HAVE TO BE MORE PROACTIVE IN BUILDING SAFELY.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME.

SPEAKER: YES --

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: IF YOU CAN PLEASE WRAP UP YOUR COMMENTS.

SPEAKER: I WOULD LIKE THE APPEAL FOR LESS DENSITY IN THE CITY OF ALAMEDA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. OKAY. DO I NOT SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS M CASTRO

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO RAISED HAND AND THERE WERE THREE WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS SUBMITTED THAT WERE POSTED ONLINE AND E-MAILED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. THAT COMPLETES PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE CITY OF ALAMEDA'S APPEAL. IN ORDER FOR THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS AND TAKE ACTION ON THE APPEAL I WOULD LIKE TO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMITTEE THAT HAVE QUESTIONS AT THIS TIME? SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

KAREN MITCHOFF: THANK YOU, MR. ARREGUIN. IT'S UNFORTUNATE THAT SOMEBODY HAS TO GO FIRST. AND SO IT'S, SORT OF, EASY TO BE A BIT CRITICAL. BUT, UNDERSTANDING ALL OF THE ARGUMENTS THAT ALAMEDA IS MAKING, THEY SEEM TO LAY ALL THE BLAME ON ABAG, AND I UNDERSTAND WE DID COME UP WITH A METHODOLOGY. IT WOULD BE HELPFUL IF THESE APPELLANTS WOULD TELL US WHERE THEY WOULD LIKE TO US PLACE THESE HOUSES. IT'S LIKE, JUST DON'T GIVE THEM TO US. AND WHERE WOULD YOU PLACE THEM. THIS IS MORE OF A COMMENT THAN A QUESTION UNLESS ANYBODY FROM THAT COMMUNITY HAS A RESPONSE. THANK YOU, MR. ARREGUIN.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. THANK YOU. SUPERVISORS LEE?

OTTO LEE: YES, THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN. I, ACTUALLY, HAVE MORE OF A QUESTION TO THE PROCESS TODAY, AND I APOLOGIZE TO THOSE WHO HAVE DONE THIS BEFORE. THIS IS NEW TO ME IN TERMS OF PROCESS AND OPTIONS WE HAVE IN TERMS OF A VOTE AND MOTION. TODAY WE'RE HERE TO HEAR APPEALS TO EITHER DENY THE APPEALS, THERE'S CERTAINLY A MOTION OF THAT, OR WE COULD APPROVE THE APPEALS AS LAID OUT. DO WE, ALSO, HAVE THE OPTION OF COMING UP, LIKE, CUT THE BABIES IN HALF, LET'S SAY MAYBE THEY ASK THEM TO REDUCE TWO THOUSAND, BUT WE JUST HAVE A MOTION TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

REDUCE ONLY A THOUSAND FOR THOSE REASONS. ARE THESE ALL ACCEPTABLE POTENTIAL PROPOSALS THAT WE CAN MAKE IN THIS BODY?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: VERY GOOD QUESTION, SUPERVISOR LEE. I'LL ASK OUR GENERAL COUNSEL IF YOU CAN ADDRESS THAT?

KATHLEEN KANE: GENERALLY, YES, YOU HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO ACT WITHIN THE, SORT OF, MAXIMUM REQUEST OF THE APPELLANT. YOU CERTAINLY WOULDN'T WANT TO EXCEED THAT BECAUSE THAT WOULD DENY OTHER JURISDICTIONS THE NOTICE TO COMMENT ON AN APPEAL. GENERALLY SPEAKING, THOUGH, I WOULDN'T DO SOMETHING THAT DOESN'T REST ON THE ARGUMENTS THAT WERE MADE, AND THAT, SORT OF, CORRELATES TO THAT. JUST BECAUSE WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THE WAY THE WHOLE STRUCTURE IS SETUP, THAT OTHER JURISDICTIONS HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO READ THE APPEAL AND DETERMINE WHETHER THEY WANT TO PARTICIPATE, AND SO THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE SHOULD REACH A DECISION THAT'S WITHIN THE ARGUMENTS AND AMOUNTS THAT WERE PUT FORWARD BY THE JURISDICTION AND RESPONDED TO BY STAFF. AND YOU DO NOT WANT TO PICK AN OPTION C THAT IS NEITHER, AND THAT WOULD HAVE DEPRIVED OTHER JURISDICTIONS OF THE OPPORTUNITY TO WEIGH IN.

OTTO LEE: THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: IT IS CORRECT THAT OPTIONS BEFORE US INCLUDE APPROVING THE APPEAL, DENYING THE APPEAL, OR APPROVE WITH MODIFICATIONS.

KATHLEEN KANE: YES. AS LONG AS IT'S WITHIN THAT AMBIT OF WHAT OTHER PEOPLE UNDERSTOOD TO BE IN PLAY WITH THE APPEAL THEN IT'S WITHIN YOUR DISCRETION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU.

OTTO LEE: SO MY FURTHER QUESTION WOULD BE, ON FURTHER OUR DIRECTIONS IN THIS SPECIFIC CASE, ALAMEDA HAS ASKED THAT, HEY, WE CAN BUILD THE UNITS, BUT YOU BETTER DEFEND US WHEN IT COMES -- SEAWATER RISE IS COMING THROUGH AND WE NEED MORE ALLOCATIONS OF FUNDING TO RIGHT THIS CLIMATE CHANGE IS THAT SOMETHING WE COULD ADD TO OUR MOTION AS THIS OTHER ELEMENTS, OR IT'S OUTSIDE THE JURISDICTION THAT WE COULD ADD TO OUR MOTION TODAY?

KATHLEEN KANE: WELL, UNDERSTANDING WHAT'S WITHIN SCOPE AND OUT OF SCOPE FOR THESE HEARINGS YOU'RE HERE TO APPLY THE HOUSING ELEMENT AND RHNA LAW WHICH, SORT OF, DOES NOT INCLUDE PROMISES OF FUTURE FUNDING OR SUPPORT. NOW, HAVING SAID THAT, IF YOU WANTED TO ADD WHAT WOULD AMOUNT TO, SORT OF, A STATEMENT OF UNDERSTANDING OR SUPPORT THAT DOESN'T HAVE ANY BINDING NATURE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO IT, YOU CAN DO THAT. UNDERSTANDING, ALSO, THAT THIS COMMITTEE CAN'T BIND FUTURE ACTIONS OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT. BUT IF THE COMMITTEE WANTED TO RECOGNIZE A SITUATION THROUGH A SEPARATE STATEMENT APPENDED TO THE MOTION, YOU COULD CERTAINLY DO THAT.

OTTO LEE: THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MAYOR ARREGUIN. I HAVE SOME QUESTIONS FOR THE APPLICANT AND I ALSO HAVE QUESTIONS FOR STAFF. WHICH ORDER SHOULD WE GO IN?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WHY DON'T WE START WITH THE APPELLANT?

PAT ECKLUND: OKAY. SO, ANDREW, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR COMMENT. I'M PAT EKLUND, AND I AM A MAYOR OF THE CITY OF NOVATO. I WAS CURIOUS, IN THE STAFF ANALYSIS, THEY INDICATED THAT THE CITY DID NOT RESPOND OR SUBMIT A SURVEY. MOST -- A LOT OF THE CITIES DID, AND COUNTIES, SO I'M CURIOUS AS TO WHY DIDN'T THE CITY SUBMIT A SURVEY IN RESPONDING TO THE AVAILABILITY OF LAND?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANDREW THOMAS: I HAVE TO TAKE PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY POWER THAT. WE'RE STILL LOOKING FOR A SURVEY AS PLANNING DIRECTOR I FIRST BECAME AWARE OF IT ABOUT A MONTH AGO. AND LOOK, WE'RE NOT SUGGESTING THAT ABAG NEVER SENT IT TO US. I AM SURE YOU DID. DID WE NOT FILL IT OUT? IT WASN'T A CONSCIOUS DECISION NOT TO FILL IT OUT.

PAT ECKLUND: GREAT. THANK YOU. SECOND QUESTION IS, CAN YOU HELP ME TO UNDERSTAND WHY YOU'RE APPLICATION DID NOT ADDRESS THE LAND THAT IS AVAILABLE FOR DEVELOPMENT? AND, EXCLUDING THE FEDERAL -- THAT'S ANOTHER QUESTION I HAVE -- BUT, EXCLUDING THE -- CALLED ALAMEDA POINT -- WHY DIDN'T THE APPLICATION FOR AN APPEAL ADDRESS WHETHER OR NOT YOU COULD ACCOMMODATE THE UNITS WITHIN THE LAND THAT IS AVAILABLE FOR DEVELOPMENT?

ANDREW THOMAS: WELL, WE'RE WORKING ON OUR HOUSING ELEMENT NOW WE'RE ALREADY PUBLISHING AND DEVELOPING OUR STRATEGIES FOR ACCOMMODATING THE FULL RHNA. SO, WE ARE ALREADY HAVING PUBLIC MEETINGS ABOUT WHICH NEIGHBORHOODS WE'RE GOING UPZONE, AND WHERE THE SITES ARE GOING TO BE THAT WE'RE GOING TO DO THIS WITHIN OUR NAVY CAPS, WITHIN OUR ZONING. THOSE ARE THE POINT. IF YOU TELL US TO MAKE 5300 WE CAN DO IT. WE'RE NOT MAKING THE CASE IT'S NOT POSSIBLE WE'RE ASKING THE QUESTION ARE YOU SURE YOU WANT US TO. AND IF YOU ADOPT US -- IF YOU ADOPT US TO YOU GOING TO BE THERE FOR US WHEN THE INEVITABLE COMES AROUND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WHICH CAN BE IDENTIFIED AS THE CITIES OUTSIDE REGION SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTION PLAN.

PAT ECKLUND: HELP ME TO UNDERSTAND -- THIS IS THE LAST QUESTION FOR THE APPLICANT, HELP ME TO UNDERSTAND THE AGREEMENT THAT YOU HAVE WITH THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT. I HAPPEN TO HAVE FULL DISCLOSURE, I HAVE WORKED FOR THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT FOR 43 YEARS SEVEN MONTHS AND 11 DAYS NO ONE'S COUNTS AND ALSO FULL DISCLOSURE TOO MY MOM WAS BORN AND RAISED IN ALAMEDA, SHE DIED AT AGE 97. SO I KNOW ALAMEDA VERY WELL. SO HELP ME TO UNDERSTAND THE AGREEMENT WITH THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT. YOU HAVE A CAP. WAS THAT AN AGREEMENT THAT WAS ASSIGNED BY THE CITY, AS WELL AS THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT?

ANDREW THOMAS: IT WAS BASICALLY IMPOSED UPON US -- AND THIS IS A 20 MINUTE CONVERSATION, I'LL DO IT IN TEN SECONDS -- FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, TO REDEVELOP BASES AROUND, ALL THROUGH CALIFORNIA, YOU NEED TO DO A COMMUNITY REUSE PLAN, WE DID A COMMUNITY REUSE PLAN BACK IN 1996 SO THAT THE LAND COULD BE CONVEYED FROM THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO THE CITY. SO IT TOOK THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT --

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WHENEVER YOU'RE DONE WITH THAT COULD YOU GET ME A CUP OF COFFEE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANDREW THOMAS: IT TOOK THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT 20 YEARS TO CLEAN UP THE LAND. 20 YEARS LATER 2014, IT WAS PRETTY OBVIOUS THAT 1500 UNITS EVERYBODY THOUGHT WAS A GOOD AMOUNT OF HOUSING AT ALAMEDA BACK IN 1996, WASN'T ENOUGH BUT THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT SAID HEY WE CAN'T GIVE YOU THIS LAND IF YOUR PLANS FOR THE LAND DON'T COMPLY WITH THE 1996 REUSE PLAN. THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IN 2016 DECIDED IN 2015 WE HAVE A SOLUTION TO THIS PROBLEM BECAUSE WE'RE GIVING TRANSFERRING LAND FOR FREE TO THE CITY IF YOU EXCEED THE NUMBER OF HOUSING UNIT IN 1996 PLAN THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT APPROVED THEN YOU WILL PAY THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT THIS FINANCIAL IMPACT FEE YOU ARE ESSENTIALLY BUYING THAT THAT FEE IS CALLED A CASE SCHILLER INDEX IT'S NOT A TPI COST OF LIVING INCREASE IT'S TIED TO REAL ESTATE VALUE SO IT STARTED AT 50,005 YEARS AGO AND IT'S ALREADY UP TO 100 HALFWAY THROUGH THE RHNA CYCLE IT'S GOING TO BE OVER $150,000 PER UNIT EFFECTIVELY STOPPING ALL HOUSING. SO, WE'RE BASIC -- WE KNOW WE NEED TO GO BACK TO THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO TRY TO FIX THAT PROBLEM. WE THINK IT WILL BE MORE EFFECTIVE IF THE REGION WANTS MORE HOUSING IN ALAMEDA, THAT'S JUST A TASK IN FRONT OF ALL OF US AND IF YOU WANT US TO KEEP GROWING AND BUILDING IN ALAMEDA, WE'RE ASKING FOR REGIONAL HELP WITH THAT ISSUE.

PAT ECKLUND: OKAY. THANK YOU. QUESTIONS FOR STAFF. YOU MENTIONED THAT THE AREAS AT RISK OF NATURAL HAZARDS, LIKE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INCREASING THE HEIGHT OF GROUNDWATER, AS SEA LEVEL RISES, IS ADDRESSED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. YOU CAN HELP ME TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE FUNDING FOR THOSE IMPROVEMENTS TO ADDRESS THE NATURAL HAZARDS OF SEA LEVEL RISE IN ALAMEDA, HOW DOES IT -- HOW DOES PLANNED BAY AREA ADDRESS THE FUNDING OF THOSE IMPROVEMENTS? >DAVE VAUTIN: THIS IS DAVE VAUTIN WITH THE REGIONAL PLANNING TEAM HAPPY TO TAKE YOUR QUESTION. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS A 30 YEAR LONG RANGE PLAN INCORPORATES BOTH EXISTING AND FUTURE FUNDING SOURCES THAT ARE REASONABLY ANTICIPATED IN THE SEA LEVEL RISE SPACE THERE ARE EXISTING MONEY TO HELP WITH THINGS LIKE WETLAND RESTORATION A KEY PART TO OUR STRATEGY FOR SEA LEVEL RISE RECOGNIZING ADDITIONAL FUNDING REQUIRED FUNDING IS GOING TO NEED TO COME FROM A VARIETY OF LOCAL REGIONAL STATE RESOURCES. THE PLAN IS A BLUEPRINT FOR HOW WE CAN MOVE FORWARD ON SEA LEVEL RISE, IN THE PAST WE HAVE NOT INCORPORATED PARTS OF PROTECTIONS AS CRITICAL AS INFRASTRUCTURE IN THIS PLAN WE LOOKED CAREFULLY AT PARTS OF THE REGION WE NEED TO PROTECT, I INCLUDE ALAMEDA IN THIS CATEGORY CRITICAL LOCATIONS FOR A VARIETY OF OTHER PUBLIC POLICY GOALS LIKE REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING CRISIS. AS WELL AS TO IDENTIFY LOCATIONS FOR STRATEGIC RETREAT. IN TERMS OF FILLING THAT GAP NEAR-TERM NEXT STEPS THAT HAVE BEEN SPECIFICALLY CALLED OUT IN THE PLAN WE'RE PROPOSING TO DEAL WITH THE FUNDING AND INVESTMENT STRATEGY FOR SEA LEVEL RISE STARTING NEXT YEAR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GOING THROUGH ALL DIFFERENT TYPES OF FUNDING MECHANISMS AND WHAT IS THE APPROPRIATE GEOGRAPHIC LEVEL FOR DIFFERENT TYPES OF FUNDING MECHANISMS TO START FILLING THOSE GAPS. LAST THING IN RESPONSE TO YOUR REQUEST THIS IS SOMEWHAT AN EXCITING TIME FOR INFRASTRUCTURE ON THE FEDERAL AND STATE LEVEL MONEYS EMERGING FOR THINGS LIKE RESILIENCE EVERY MONTH AND WHILE WE ACKNOWLEDGE NOT EVERY SINGLE DOLLAR OF A 30 YEAR LONG RANGE PLAN IS EMERGING TODAY THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS TO START FILLING THOSE FUNDING GAPS.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE LAST QUESTION I HAVE FOR STAFF IS ON PAGE FIVE. YOU TALK ABOUT THE ABAG, MTC RESPONSE TO THE TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS. IS THAT NOT CONSIDERED IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY, BUT IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DOES ALSO ADDRESS TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS. AND SO HELP ME TO UNDERSTAND ABOUT SOME OF THE TRANSPORTATION CONCERNS THAT MED NEED HAD, AND HOW IS IT ADDRESSED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050? OR IF IT HAS? >DAVE VAUTIN: CERTAINLY. I'LL KEEP MY RESPONSE BRIEF AT THIS POINT. WHAT I WILL SAY IS FIRST OF ALL, THERE IS A WHOLE SUITE OF DIFFERENT FERRY IMPROVEMENTS IN THE LONG RANGE PLAN WE JUST OPENED FERRY SERVICE TO A NEW PORTION OF ALAMEDA FERRIES ARE NOT JUST FOR TRANSPORTATION PURPOSES ALSO FOR EMERGENCY PURPOSES IN THE NAME OF THE WATER EMERGENCY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY FURTHERMORE THERE ARE SPECIFIC INVESTMENTS IN THE PLAN INCLUDING INVESTMENT IN AC

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSIT, IMPROVING THE TUBING THAT CONNECT, I THINK THAT WAS BROUGHT UP IN ONE PUBLIC COMMENT THERE ARE SPECIFIC INVESTMENT IN THE PLAN THAT ARE DESIGNED TO INCREASE THE CAPACITY FOR FOLKS TO GET ON AND OFF THE ISLAND AND TO MOVE AROUND WITHIN THE ISLAND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR EKLUND, I'LL ADD, I SERVED ON THE ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND ONE PROJECT THAT'S IN THE WORK RIGHT NOW IS A PEDESTRIAN BIKE BRIDGE CONNECTION BETWEEN OAKLAND AND ALAMEDA TO ADD ADDITIONAL SAFE CROSSING FOR PEDESTRIAN AND BICYCLISTS MYSELF. I HAVE BIKED IT, IT'S SAFE DEFINITELY DON'T WANT TO GO THROUGH THE TUNNEL, ADDING CAPACITY THROUGH EXPANDED TRANSIT SERVICE BIKE PEDESTRIAN CONNECTION WITH THE FERRIES ARE ALL THINGS UNDER CONSIDERATION. MAYOR HUDSON?

DAVID E. HUDSON: I WANT TO GET SOME CLARIFICATION. FIRST I CAN AGREE WITH EVERY SPEAKER THIS MORNING THAT'S NOT MY JOB. WE VOTED AT ABAG TO TAKE ONE METHODOLOGY AND HCD BLESSED THAT DECISION. I DIDN'T VOTE FOR OPTION EIGHT, IS WHAT WAS BLESSED BY HCD I UNDERSTAND WE ARE TO FOLLOW STATUS AND VOTE ON THE ALLOWABLE REGIONS WITHIN STATUTE. WE AREN'T VOTING ON METHODOLOGY OR HCD'S DECISION I HEARD SOMETHING TODAY LIKE WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COULD GIVE NUMBERS TO OTHER PEOPLE. MY UNDERSTANDING IS THE FULL BOARD VOTED FOR A METHODOLOGY THAT HAS, LIKE, 49 AREAS WHERE THE HIGH -- WHATEVER -- SOME SPECIAL DESIGNATION. IT ISN'T GOING TO BE EVEN IF WE CAN GET THESE NUMBERS TO WHOMEVER. THAT'S CHANGING THE METHODOLOGY AND I DON'T THINK WE'RE ABLE TO DO THAT TODAY. THE CONCERNS I HAVE IS WE'RE TALKING LIKE THAT WHEN WE HAVE A STAFF MEMBER FROM ALAMEDA TELL YOU THAT WE COULD BUILD THE 5300 HOMES, AND YOU HAVE A MEMBER OF THE COUNCIL THAT SAYS, WE SUPPORT THAT DECISION. NOW, IS IT A GOOD DECISION TO BUILD THERE, WHICH IS WHAT WE WERE ASKED? I CAN AGREE WITH YOU PERSONAL, I PROBABLY WOULD VOTE AGAINST PUTTING MORE HOUSING IN ALAMEDA ALSO. BUT THAT CHANGES THE METHODOLOGY AND THERE'S NOTHING IN THE STATUTE THAT I SEE THAT WOULD HAVE US DOING ANYTHING BUT DENY THE APPEAL THAT'S THE PROBLEM IF WE START GOING OUT OF THOSE BOUNDARIES WE'RE GOING TO BE OFF AND ON ALL DAY AND IT ISN'T GOING TO BE DEFENDABLE. I SYMPATHIZE, EMPATHIZE, WHATEVER IT IS, BUT I CAN'T FIND A REASON TO SUPPORT IT. THAT'S THE PROBLEM. SO I WILL BE SUPPORTING A DENIAL OF THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION TO MAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION?

DAVID E. HUDSON: HECK NO. I JUST GOT MYSELF IN ENOUGH TROUBLE WITH THE PEOPLE LISTENING. I DON'T WANT TO BURY MYSELF.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

KAREN MITCHOFF: I WOULD BE HAPPY TO MAKE THAT MOTION, MR. PRESIDENT.

DAVID E. HUDSON: NO. I CAN FIND BETTER WAYS TO COMMIT SUICIDE.

KAREN MITCHOFF: HAPPY TO MAKE THE MOTION MAYOR ARREGUIN.

BELIA RAMOS: SECOND BY RAMOS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MOTION AND SECOND TO DENY THE APPEAL FROM THE CITY OF ALAMEDA. I'LL SAY I'M SYMPATHETIC TO THE CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN ADDRESSED BY THE CITY OF ALAMEDA AND WHAT'S BEEN REQUESTED IS OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THIS PROCEEDING. BUT I WANT TO EXPRESS MY SUPPORT FOR WORKING WITH MODE NEED TO NOT ONLY SECURE THE NECESSARY FUNDING FOR INFRASTRUCTURE TO PROTECT THE CITY OF ALAMEDA FROM THE THREAT OF RISING SEA LEVELS, BUT ALSO AS THE MAYOR'S CONFERENCE AND REPRESENTATIVE FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY TO ABAG, BUT ALSO TO WORK WITH THE CITY OF ALAMEDA AROUND APPROACHING THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO LIFT THE FEDERAL CAP ON THE NUMBER OF UNITS AT ALAMEDA AIR STATION. I'M VERY INTERESTED IN WORKING WITH MAYOR ASHCRAFT AND STAFF TO ADVOCATE FOR THAT THERE IS A GREAT DEAL OF DEVELOPMENT HAPPENING AT THE OLD AIR STATION AND THAT'S REALLY APPROPRIATE PLACE TO BE ABLE TO BUILD DENSITY. WITH THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DISTRIBUTION THAT'S THE DECISION OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA. AS PRESIDENT OF ABAG I WILL BE SUPPORTING A MOTION TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE APPEAL. SUPERVISOR LEE?

OTTO LEE: YES, THANK YOU, MAYOR ARREGUIN. I COMPLETELY AGREE WITH WHAT JUST MENTIONED. WE REALLY NEED TO GET THAT STATEMENT AS PART OF THE MOTION OR MAKE IT VERY CLEAR TO OUR STAFF AND THE CITY OF ALAMEDA THAT IT IS ABSOLUTELY CRUCIAL THAT THIS SEA LEVEL ISSUE IS BEING CONSIDERED WHEN IT COMES TO BUILDING THESE HOUSING. SO, LET'S SEE IF THIS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT NUMBER ONE, THE CAP, AND HOW THE FEE STRUCTURE WITH THE NAVY SHOULD BE ADVOCATED AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL TO MAKE SURE THAT IT DOESN'T MAKE THE COST OF HOUSING UNAFFORDABLE IN THE FUTURE, TO BE BUILT, NUMBER ONE, AND SECOND THAT WE REALLY NEED TO LOOK AT ALLOCATING FUTURE RESOURCES TO MAKE SURE THAT THE SEA LEVEL RISE RISK IS BEING PREVENTED OR MITIGATED IN THE FUTURE BECAUSE IT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT ONE CITY SHOULD BEAR THE BRUNT OF THIS REGIONAL WORLDWIDE PROBLEM. SO IF THAT'S SOMETHING THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDED AS PART OF THE MOTION, I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ADD AS A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT. IF THAT COULD BE UNDERSTOOD BY STAFF I WOULD BE HAPPY TO. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: SUPERVISOR LEE IS PROPOSING A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT TO ADD A STATEMENT THAT WOULD GO TO THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

EXECUTIVE BOARD, YOU KNOW, I GUESS, ONE, URGING ABAG TO SUPPORT ADDITIONAL RESOURCES FOR SEA LEVEL RISE AND CLIMATE ADAPTATION PROJECTS TO ADDRESS THE IMPACTS ON THE CITY OF ALAMEDA, AND MORE OVER TO EXPLORE WORKING WITH ALAMEDA TO REQUEST THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO LIFT THE CAP ON THE NUMBER OF UNITS. I SEE MS. MCMILLAN RAISED HER HAND.

KAREN MITCHOFF: I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM THERESE FIRST, PLEASE.

THERESE MCMILLAN: THANK YOU, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. RESPECTFULLY WHAT I WOULD ADD IN REGARD TO WANTING TO REFERENCE FUTURE INVESTMENTS ON CLIMATE CHANGE STAFF EXPLAINED, DAVE, THIS IS AN ISSUE THAT'S REGION-WIDE, ABAG AND MTC AS OUTLINED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN TO BE CONSIDERED IN OCTOBER WILL NEED TO BE PURSUING A REGIONAL STRATEGY FOR A REGIONAL THREAT TO THE EXTENT THAT ALAMEDA WOULD BE PART AND PARCEL OF THAT REGIONAL RESPONSE, I THINK THAT WOULD BE AN APPROPRIATE STATEMENT, RATHER THAN A LIMITED JURISDICTIONAL COMMITMENT OF FUTURE FUNDING DOWN THE ROAD. I THINK IT NEEDS TO BE RECOGNIZED THAT IT WOULD HAVE TO BE PART OF AN OVERALL REGIONAL STRATEGY CONSIDERATION. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAY I RESPECTFULLY SUGGEST, I THINK, GIVEN THAT, IT'S IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT THIS IN A

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

REGIONAL CONTEXT THIS IS CERTAINLY A COMMUNITY THAT'S GOING TO SEE SIGNIFICANT INUNDATION WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE'RE GOING TO PROTECT THIS OTHER AND COMMUNITIES. SUPERVISORS LEE, I MADE A COMMITMENT ON THE RECORD TODAY IT'S IN THE COURT TRANSCRIPT, I REPRESENT ALAMEDA COUNTY ON ABAG I'M COMMITTED TO WORKING WITH THE CITY OF ALAMEDA ON THESE ISSUES WE CAN WORK INDEPENDENTLY ON ANY PARTICULAR MOTION. I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANCE OF FOCUSING ON THE QUESTION OF THE APPEAL AND THE APPROPRIATENESS THE APPEAL RELATIVE TO THE STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS.

OTTO LEE: IT'S CERTAINLY HELPFUL AND CERTAINLY CLIMATE CHANGE IS NOT ONE CITY OR ONE REGION ISSUE. IT'S CERTAINLY SOMETHING THAT'S FAR GREATER. THANKS FOR BRINGING IT UP. AND SOMETHING WE NEED TO FIGHT FOR. SOMEBODY TOLD ME THAT THIS CLIMATE CHANGE IS A FAD. I SAID IT WILL BE A FAD FOR THE NEXT SIX THOUSAND YEARS. I AGREE IT'S SOMETHING WE NEED TO WORK IN THE REGIONAL FASHION AS WELL. BUT THE OTHER ISSUE I WANT TO MENTION IS I WANT TO SAY THAT REGARDING THIS VERY SPECIFIC FEDERAL CAP WITH THE NAVY ISSUE, I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I DO WANT TO HAVE SOME ACTUAL DIRECTION TO BE MADE. SO THAT EITHER THROUGH OUR FEDERAL DELEGATION OF OUR CONGRESS MEMBERS TO REACH OUT TO THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT THAT THIS IS SOMETHING THAT REALLY NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED BECAUSE OTHERWISE WE CAN APPROVE AS MANY UNITS AS WE WANT BUT AT THE END OF THE DAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT'S UNAFFORDABLE TO BUILD, SO IT'S MUCH ADO ABOUT NOTHING. SO WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S ON THE RECORD.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MS. KANE, BEFORE I GO TO MAYOR ECKLUND. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE CLOSE THE LOOP ON THIS.

KATHLEEN KANE: IF I MAY SUGGEST, MAYBE WHAT WE SHOULD DO IS, IN ORDER TO KEEP THE MOTIONS FOCUSED ON THE BUSINESS AT HAND TODAY, WHICH ARE THE RHNA APPEALS THEMSELVES. WE HAVE THE MOTION JUST RELATE TO THAT, BUT STAFF CAN KEEP A RUNNING LOG OF ISSUES AND IMPRESSIONS THAT THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE IS ENCOUNTERING AND THOSE CAN BE PRESENTED AS A SEPARATE INFORMATIONAL ITEM TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AT THE END OF THIS PROCESS, SO WE DON'T LOSE THESE CONVERSATIONS BUT THEY'RE NOT NECESSARILY PART OF THE MOTION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU KATHLEEN, EXCELLENT SUGGESTION. I THINK THAT'S A GOOD WAY TO PROCEED. JUST TO ENSURE THAT THESE IMPORTANT ISSUES ARE CAPTURED AND WE CAN FOLLOW UP ON IN THE FUTURE. MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: ALL THESE HEARINGS IS NOT TO MODIFY THE METHODOLOGY BUT TO LOOK AT HOW THE METHODOLOGY IS APPLIED WITHIN THE INDIVIDUAL CITIES. I, TOO, AM VERY SYMPATHETIC TO THE CITY AND ISLAND OF ALAMEDA. AND I BELIEVE, STRONGLY, THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HAVING WORKED WITH THE FEDS AND ALL THE STATES IN THE WEST, AND HAVING BEEN A LOCALLY ELECTED OFFICIAL FOR OVER 26 YEARS, I DEFINITELY AM SYMPATHETIC TO THE CITY OF MED NEED'S ISSUES ABOUT FUNDING. AND I WANT TO PUT MY HAND UP AND SAY THAT WE REALLY NEED TO PRIORITIZE THE FUNDING FOR CITIES TO MEET THE RHNA AS WE DEVELOP THAT FUNDING IMPROVEMENT PLAN RELATIVE TO PLANNED BAY AREA. AND I SEE DAVE VAUTIN SHAKING HIS HEAD YES. SO, BUT I THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE NOTED AND THAT'S ACTUALLY ONE OF THE COMMENTS THAT I WAS GOING TO MAKE. BUT, ALAMEDA, MY MOM REMEMBERS WHEN BAY FARM ISLAND WAS JUST A FARM, AND WHEN I DROVE OUT WITH HER RECENTLY SOMETIME LAST YEAR, SHE'S GOING TO BE 95 IN JANUARY SHE COMMENTED THAT IT'S ALL BUILT UP AND I SAID YES IT IS. IT'S QUITE THE CHANGE. I'M GOING TO SUPPORT THE MOTION TO DENY THE APPEAL WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE DISCUSSION ABOUT HOW WE'RE GOING TO HELP THE CITIES TO FUND SOME OF THESE CRITICAL IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE CRITICAL TO ATTAINING THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: AND THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AS WELL. MAYOR ROMERO?

CARLOS ROMERO: YES, WITH ALL DUE RESPECT, I WOULD LOVE TO CALL THE QUESTION.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YOU ARE THE LAST SPEAKER. THERE ARE NO OTHER RAISED HANDS. SO, I'LL NOW CALL FOR A VOTE ON THE MOTION TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE CITY OF ALAMEDA'S APPEAL.

KATHLEEN KANE: THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF I MAY, THIS IS A PROCEDURAL POINT SINCE WE HAD AN ISSUE IN A PREVIOUS -- SOMETIME AGO ABOUT CALLING THE QUESTION AND WHETHER THAT ITSELF A MOTION I WOULD JUST LIKE TO CLARIFY IT WAS NOT A MOTION; IT WAS JUST A REQUEST; IS THAT CORRECT, MAYOR ROMERO?

CARLOS ROMERO: THAT'S CORRECT.

KATHLEEN KANE: THANK YOU. THEREFORE THE MOTION IS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ACTION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I'LL ASK MR CASTRO TO PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. THANK YOU MR. THOMAS. WE WILL BE IN TOUCH ON THE ISSUES WE DISCUSSED. I WANT TO NOTE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THIS IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION, FINAL ACTION WILL BE TAKEN AT A FUTURE MEETING AFTER THE CLOSE OF THE APPEAL.

ANDREW THOMAS: THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK. GOOD LUCK WITH THE REST OF THE DAY, YOU HAVE A LONG DAY AHEAD OF YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO 2B REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS FOR THE CITY OF DUBLIN THIS IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION ITEM AND WE'LL FIRST HEAR FROM THE CITY OF DUBLIN WHO WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT THEIR PALE AND BEFORE I BEGIN I'LL ASK WHO WILL BE PRESENTING FOR THE CITY OF DUBLIN?

MICHAEL CASS: MICHAEL CASS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I SEE WE ALSO HAVE THE CITY MANAGER. GOOD MORNING. YOU MAY PROCEED AT ANY TIME.

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING MEMBERS OF THE ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MY NAME IS MICHAEL CASS, AND I AM A PLANNER FOR THE CITY OF DUBLIN. PASS PERFORMANCE AND LACK OF SUITABLE LAND WATER SUPPLY AND DROUGHT POPULATION DECREASE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS AND OPPORTUNITY AREAS. OUR POPULATION INCREASED BY 44% BY 2010 AND 2019 AND INCREASED FROM APPROXIMATELY 46,000 RESIDENTS TO OVER 66,000 RESIDENTS MAKING DUBLIN ONE OF THE FASTEST GROWING COMMUNITIES IN CALIFORNIA SPECIFICALLY WITHIN THE CURRENT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HOUSING ELEMENT CYCLE THE CITY HAS ISSUED BUILDING PERMITS FOR 4,420 UNITS COMPARED TO OUR CURRENT ALLOCATION OF 200285 UNITS SPECIFICALLY WE HAVE A 6.91 TIMES OUR ABOVE MODERATE INCOME CATEGORY FOR THE CURRENT CYCLE. BEYOND THE PERMITS THAT HAVE BEEN ISSUED WE ALSO HAVE 200723 UNITS WITHIN THE PIPELINE WHICH INCLUDE A NUMBER OF AFFORDABLE UNITS TO FACILITATE THAT EFFORT THE CITY HAS SECURED A LOCAL HOUSING TRUST FUND GRANT OF $3.33 MILLION WE ALSO HAVE PROVIDED CLOSE TO $15 MILLION IN CITY HOUSING FUNDS AND BOND FUNDS AS WELL AS PROVIDED ALLOCATION OF A FEW MILLION DOLLAR IN TERMS OF LAND WE WANT TO MAKE IT CLEAR A SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF DUBLIN IS NEW CONSTRUCTION MAKING IT MORE CHALLENGING FOR REDEVELOPMENT IN THE COMMUNITY COMPARED TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS. SECOND ARGUMENT IN REGARDS TO WATER SUPPLY AND DROUGHT. CITY CONTRACTS WITH ZONE SEVEN FOR OUR WATER SERVICES WHICH TENTATIVELY EXPIRES IN 2024. DUBLIN IS FULLY DEPENDENT ON IMPORTED WATER SOURCES MOST NOTABLY 90% OF OUR TREATED WATER COMES FROM THE STATE WATER PROJECT WHICH IS ANTICIPATING FUTURE SUPPLY DEFICIT INCREASED DEMAND WITH ADDITIONAL HOUSING WILL FURTHER COMPOUND THAT PROBLEM ON TOP OF THAT DROUGHT AND THOSE IMPACTS ARE UNKNOWN BUT BASED ON PAST BEHAVIOR WE HAVE SEEN THAT COMMUNITIES THAT RELY ON DELTA WATER LIKE THE CITY OF DUBLIN WILL BE GREATER IMPACTED BECAUSE DELTA WATER HAS ISSUES WITH ENDANGERED SPECIES AS WELL AS HEAVY USE BY THE AGRICULTURAL INDUSTRY THIS WILL BE A PROFOUND POTENTIAL IMPACT WITH GROWTH ON OUR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMUNITY IN ADDITION POPULATION DECREASE DUBLIN POPULATION DECREASED BY 466 RESIDENTS OR .7% 1.5 TIMES THE STATE AVERAGE MAKING A DISPROPORTIONATE AT CHANGE COMPARED TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS THROUGHOUT THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA POPULATION TRANSLATES TO HOUSEHOLDS FOR THE METHODOLOGY AND COULD CONTINUE TO RESULTS OF FEWER HOUSEHOLDS THAN ESTIMATED BY ABAG STAFF FOR 2050. ONE OF THE MAIN PURPOSES OF HOAS IS TO AVOID FURTHER SEGREGATION AND CONCENTRATION OF POVERTY AND ENCOURAGE ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY THROUGH AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROGRAMS THE MAPS THAT WERE USED TO CREATE THE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS DO NOT FACTOR IN DEMOGRAPHIC DATA FROM THE AMERICAN COMMUNITY SURVEY TO POINT OUT OF INTEREST DUBLIN IS A DIVERSE COMMUNITY AND 61.1% OF OUR DUBLIN POPULATION IN 2019 RACIALLY IDENTIFIED AS MINORITIES OR MULTI-RACIAL. WHILE THE CITY BELIEVES THAT FACILITATING THE PRODUCTION OF HOUSING FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLD IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS IS LAUDABLE HOWEVER THE DRAFT ALLOCATION ASSIGNED APPROXIMATELY 1400 UNITS TO DUBLIN WHILE IN GENERAL ADDITIONAL UNITS HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO AVOID FURTHER DIVERSITY -- HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO FURTHER OUR DIVERSITY GOALS ASSIGNING MORE MARKET RATE HOUSING TO DUBLIN DOESN'T ACTUALLY ACHIEVE THAT PURPOSE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FINAL ARGUMENT IS IN REGARDS TO LAND USE AUTHORITY THE CITY HAS POINTED OUT TEN PARCELLED THAT ARE OWNED BY THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ALAMEDA COUNTY AND SCHOOL DISTRICT PROPERTY WE WANT TO ENSURE THOSE PROPERTIES DO NOT HAVE A UNIT ATTRIBUTED TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THEM THAT ARE PASSED ON TO THE CITY OF DUBLIN THOSE AREAS WE HAVE CALLED OUT COMPRISE OVER 36% OF TOTAL ACREAGE IN IT DUBLIN WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S CONSIDERED WE DO NOT HAVE CONTROL OVER THOSE PARCELS AND HOUSING UNIT THAT IS ATTRIBUTED. IN TERMS OF REALLOCATION ABOVE MODERATE INCOME UNITS THE CITY REQUESTS ADDITIONAL 818 UNIT OF LOW AND VERY LOW TO MODERATE INCOME CAN THE GORE TO ENSURE [INDISCERNIBLE] IN CONCLUSION CITY REQUESTS DUBLIN'S ABOVE MODERATE INCOME UNITS BE ALLOCATED TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS BASED UPON PAST PERFORMANCE LACK OF SUITABLE LAND AND AREA AND REQUEST LOW-INCOME UNITS BE REALLOCATED DUE TO THE CITY NOT HAVING AUTHORITY.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. I'LL NOW ASK MTC STAFF TO PRESENT THE RESPONSE TO THE CITY OF DUBLIN'S APPEAL. YOU WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES.

GILLIAN ADAMS: THANK YOU. PULL UP THE SLIDES, PLEASE. YOU CAN GET THE SLIDES PULLED UP FOR THE RESPONSE TO DUBLIN? THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THE CITY OF DUBLIN IS REQUESTING A REDUCTION OF 200267 UNIT WHICH IS REPRESENTS THE REDUCTION OF 61% FROM ITS DRAFT ALLOCATION. STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO DENY THE APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN RESPONSE TO DUBLIN'S REQUEST FOR A REDUCTION OF ITS ABOVE MODERATE INCOME ALLOCATION BECAUSE PAST PERFORMANCE HAS CREATED A LACK OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AVAILABLE LAND FOR NEW DEVELOPMENTS WE COMMEND THE CITY'S TRACK RECORD IN BUILDING NEW HOMES HOWEVER HOUSING ELEMENT LAW STATES THAT ABAG MAY NOT LIMIT CONSIDERATION OF SUITABLE SITES FOR HOUSING TO A CITY'S EXISTING ZONING AND LAND USE RESTRICTIONS AND A JURISDICTION MUST CONSIDER UNDERUTILIZED PLANNED LAND AND INFILL DEVELOPMENT -- [INDISCERNIBLE] UNABLE TO CONSIDER THESE STRATEGIES TO ACCOMMODATE ITS RHNA NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO STAFF UNDERSTANDS THE CITY'S CONCERNS ABOUT THE DROUGHT CURRENTLY BE EXPERIENCED BY THE BAY AREA. STATUTE DEFINES WATER CONSTRAINTS TO PRECLUDE A JURISDICTION'S PROVIDING NECESSARY INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENTS DURING THE RHNA PERIOD. DUBLIN SITES INFORMATION FROM WATER SERVICE PROVIDER URBAN WATER MANAGEMENT PLAN ABOUT POSSIBLE WATER SUPPLY ISSUE EXERCISE CHALLENGES PROPOSED BY FUTURE GROWTH THE CITY HAS NOT DEMONSTRATE THAT IT IS PRECLUDED FROM MEETING ITS RHNA ALLOCATION BECAUSE OF A DECISION BY ITS WATER SERVICE PROVIDER. AS HCD NOTES IN HIS COMMENT ON-SITE DROUGHT ISSUES DO NOT AFFECT ONE CITY COUNTY OR REGION -- KEY TO ADAPTING MORE INTENSE DROUGHT CYCLES AND WILDFIRE SEASONS METHODOLOGY DIRECTS GROWTH TOWARD INFILL AND EXISTS COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE MORE RESOURCES TO PROMOTE CLIMATE RESILIENCE. DOESN'T MEALTIME THE BAY AREA'S LACK OF HOUSING AFFORDABILITY NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. REGARDING THE POPULATION HOUSING ELEMENT LAW STATES THAT POPULATION NUMBERS CANNOT BE USED AS A JUSTIFICATION FOR REDUCING A JURISDICTION'S RHNA. NOT BY ITSELF EVIDENCE THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THERE IS NO NEED FOR ADDITIONAL HOMES IN THE COMMUNITY. THEY MAY INSTEAD BE A SIGN OF AN UNHEALTHY HOUSING MARKET WHERE INDIVIDUALS AND FAMILIES LACK AFFORDABLE HOUSING CHOICES AND MUST LEAVE THE JURISDICTION TO FIND HOUSING ELSEWHERE. DUBLIN SITES A POPULATION DECLINE THAT HAS HAPPENED OVER ONE YEAR THE YEAR IMPACTED BY COVID-19 DUBLIN HAS NOT PROVIDED EVIDENCE THAT ITS POPULATION WILL CONTINUE TO DECLINE LONG-TERM OR THERE'S BEEN A REDUCTION IF THE JURISDICTION'S NEED FOR HOUSING DURING THE PERIOD. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. REGARDING DUBLIN'S ISSUES WITH ACCESS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS FACTOR THE CITY IS CHALLENGING THE FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY ADOPTED BY ABAG AND APPROVED BY HCD WHICH FALLS OUTSIDE OF SCOPE OF THE APPEALS PROCESS STAFF HAVE INCORPORATED THE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREA MAPS DEVELOPED BY THE STATE AS DEFINED BY THE STATE HCD HAS THE AUTHORITY IF THE RHNA METHODOLOGY FURTHERS STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND FOUND THE METHODOLOGY DOES FURTHER THE OBJECTIVES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. REGARDING DUBLIN'S ARGUMENT ABOUT FORECASTED GROWTH ON PARCELS WHERE THE CITY DOES NOT HAVE LAND USE AUTHORITY MOST PEOPLE LIVING ON THESE PARCELS RESIDE IN CREW QUARTERS SUCH AS CORRECTIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND MILITARY HOUSING THAT ARE NOD INCLUDED IN THE BLUEPRINT FORECAST. ACCORDING TO INFORMATION FROM THE CITY HOMES THAT WERE BUILT IN 2017 IN CAMP PARKS AND THE CITY OF DUBLIN'S SIZE THE IMPACT OF THESE TEN HOUSEHOLDS ON THE CITY'S DRAFT ALLOCATION IS DEEMED NEGLIGIBLE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS A

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RESULT, ABAG MTC STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE COMMITTEE DENY THE APPEAL FILED BY THE CITY OF DUBLIN REQUESTING REDUCTION OF 200267 UNITS. THANK YOU. THAT COMPLETES MY PRESENTATION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU MS. ADAMS. WE'LL NOW GIVE THE CITY OF DUBLIN OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO THE STAFF'S PRESENTATION. YOU WILL HAVE THREE MINUTES.

SPEAKER: I HAVE A QUICK RESPONSE AND THEN TURN IT OVER TO OTHER STAFF MEMBERS IN CASE THEY HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD.

MICHAEL CASS: THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. I DIDN'T HAVE A CHANCE TO SAY THAT DURING THE PRESENTATION AND I APPRECIATE STAFF'S RESPONSE THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS. THE ONE QUESTION I HAVE IN RESPONSE TO THE INFORMATION ABAG STAFF HAS PUT FORWARD IS IN REGARD TO THE LAND USE AUTHORITY YOUR STAFF ADMITS THERE WERE ERRORS IN INFORMATION CALCULATED IS HOW UNITS WERE ATTRIBUTED WHAT WE WOULD BE REQUESTING IS THAT IN ORDER FOR THE COMMITTEE TO MAKE A DETERMINATION TODAY, THAT YOU ACTUALLY SEE THE DATA ON THE PARCEL BY PARCEL BASIS FOR THE TEN PARCELS THAT THE CITY HAS BROUGHT OUT IN QUESTION THE INFORMATION PUBLICLY AVAILABLE AT THIS POINT IS BROKEN DOWN INTO A SUBREGION BASIS MAKING IT IMPOSSIBLE TO ANALYZE THAT INFORMATION STAFF HAS ADMITTED THERE WAS AN ERROR, YOU SHOULD HAVE ACCURATE INFORMATION TO MAKE THE DECISION TODAY. I'LL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TURN IT OVER TO OUR CITY MANAGER AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR IN CASE THEY HAVE ANYTHING THEY WOULD LIKE TO ADD.

LYNDA SMITH: THANK YOU MICHAEL AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS YOU TODAY. I THINK FOR THE CITY OF DUBLIN LAND USE ISSUE IS PROBABLY OUR PRIMARY ISSUE GIVEN IT COMPRISES 36% OF OUR LAND MASS WHEN WE WERE TRYING TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE WE COULDN'T FIND ANY DATA THAT WOULD HELP US TO MAKE A CLEAN ARGUMENT AND THAT'S BECAUSE THE DATA WASN'T READILY ADVISABLE TO US. SO WE JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S CLEAR AND TRANSPARENT THAT THESE LAND MASSES THAT WE ABSOLUTELY HAVE NO CONTROL OVER WERE NOT A FACTOR IN THE ESTABLISHMENT OF OUR RHNA NUMBERS. WE CAN MAKE ALL THE OTHER ARGUMENTS. I KNOW WE PROBABLY WON'T BE SUCCESSFUL IN MAKING THOSE ARGUMENTS. DUBLIN HAS BEEN A GOOD STUART OF DEVELOPING HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA, GREAT STEWARD OF DOING THAT FOCUSED OVER PLANNING PRINCIPLE DONE EVERYTHING THAT WE'RE SUPPOSED TO BE DOING AND CERTAINLY ARE PROUD OF THE WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE, AND WE'RE REACHING OUR BUILD-OUT NOW WITH A LOT OF NEW HOUSING AND IT'S VERY DIFFICULT FOR US TO ARGUE THAT WE NEEDED TO HAVE OUR PLAN IN PLACE. WE ARE WORKING ON OUR PLAN ON HOW TO ADDRESS THESE UNITS, BUT WE DON'T HAVE THAT PLAN YET AND OVER 50% OF OUR LAND MASS IS BRAND-NEW HOUSING IN THE LAST 15 YEARS. SO.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: 30 SECONDS.

LYNDA SMITH: IN ANY EVENT I APPRECIATE THE TIME AND OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE COMMITTEE. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MR. CASTRO, HOW MANY MORE SECONDS?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: 20 SECONDS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ANYONE WANT TO SPEAK FOR 20 SECONDS? OKAY. WELL, THANK YOU TO THE CITY OF DUBLIN FOR YOUR PRESENTATION, AND THERE MAY BE QUESTIONS. SO WE'RE NOW GOING TO PROCEED TO THE PUBLIC COMMENT PORTION OF THIS HEARING. THE I'LL ASK IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISHES TO TESTIFY ON THE CITY OF DUBLIN'S APPEAL OF THE CITY RHNA DRAFT ALLOCATIONS IF SO RAISE YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING INTO THE MEETING. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. -- SPOKE TOO SOON. WE HAVE ONE RAISED HAND. JOSH. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: CITING REASONS LIKE LACK OF WATER AND LACK OF AVAILABLE LAND WHILE REQUESTING VERY LOW AND LOW MODERATE ALLOCATION TO BE SIGNED SEEMS INCONSISTENT BECAUSE THAT GROUP USES THE MOST WATER AND MOST LAND TYPICALLY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. ANY MORE PUBLIC COMMENTS ON DUBLIN'S APPEAL OF ITS RHNA DRAFT ALLOCATION. SEEING NO RAISED HANDS. MR. CASTRO?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE RECEIVED OFFICIAL PUBLIC COMMENT THAT WAS POSTED ONLINE AND E-MAILED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY THANK YOU. THAT COMPLETES PUBLIC COMMENT. ORDER FOR THE COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS AND TAKE ACTION PRELIMINARY ACTION ON THIS APPEAL. I WOULD LIKE TO START WITH A QUESTION. IT WAS STATED IN THE CITY OF DUBLIN'S PRESENTATION THAT THERE WAS AN ERROR IN THE DATA FOR THE CITY OF DUBLIN WITH RESPECT TO TEN PARCELS, AND I THINK THIS WAS ADDRESSED IN THEIR PRESENTATION, TEN PARCELLED THE CITY DOESN'T HAVE AURAL OVER? >DAVE VAUTIN: I'LL RESPOND TO THAT. FIRST OF ALL OUR RESPONSE WOULD BE WE DO NOT AGREE WITH THE CITY CHARACTERISTIC THAT THERE WAS AN ERROR. WE LOOKED AT ALL TEN PARCELLED THEY IDENTIFIED THE CITY HAS HAD OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW BASELINE DATA AS PART OF OUR BASIS LAND USE REVIEW THESE ARE EXISTING HOUSES. THEY EXISTED BEFORE THE START OF THE RHNA PERIOD, AND IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY, WE LOOK AT THE 2050 TOTAL HOUSEHOLDS. SO THERE IS NO ADDITIONAL PROJECTED GROWTH DUE TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THESE ARE EXISTING HOMES THAT WERE PART OF THE REVIEW PROCESS IN 2019 AND 2020 AS WAS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MENTIONED IN GILLIAN'S PRESENTATION. THE HOUSING UNITS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE WERE BUILT IN 2017 AND THEY'RE ON THE CAMP PARCEL. ALL THE OTHER PARCELS HAVE ZERO HOUSEHOLDS AND MANY OF THEM ARE GROUP QUARTERS LOCATIONS AND GROUP QUARTERS APPROPRIATELY ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THE TOTAL HOUSEHOLDS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR. VAUTIN. I WANTED STAFF TO RESPOND TO THE STATEMENT THERE WERE ERRORS IN THE UNDERLYING DATA TO CLARIFY THE RECORD. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO MY COLLEAGUES ON THE COMMITTEE. MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU. I HAVE A QUESTION FOR STAFF ON THE GROUP QUARTERS, AND THE TEN PARCELS. YOU MENTIONED THAT THE DATA DOES NOT INCLUDE ANY PROJECTED GROWTH ON THOSE PARCELS WHERE THERE ARE EXISTING HOUSES THAT WERE BUILT IN 2017, BUT THE OTHER QUESTION THAT WAS RAISED WERE ON THE PARCELS WHERE THERE IS NO HOUSING DID OUR DATA INCLUDE PROJECTED HOUSING GROWTH ON THOSE OTHER PARCELS THAT THEY DO NOT HAVE LAND USE -- OVER? >DAVE VAUTIN: NO PROJECTED LAND USE GROWTH ON ANY OF THE TEN PARCELS, THE PARCELS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE ARE EXISTING HOUSING UNITS.

PAT ECKLUND: THE OTHER QUESTION I HAD IS, CAN WE SEE THAT DATA? OR CAN IT BE INCLUDED AS PART OF THE PACKAGE THAT GOES

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD? >DAVE VAUTIN: I THINK WE INCLUDED SOME OF IT. WE ARE MORE THAN HAPPY TO SHOW A TABLE OF THEIR TEN PARCELS AND ZERO HOUSE HOLES ON ALL OF THEM, EXCEPT FOR THAT ONE PARCEL THAT HAS THE TEN UNIT WHICH IS WE HAVE INCLUDED THE APN FOR THAT SPECIFIC PARCEL.

PAT ECKLUND: THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THE -- AND I HAVE COMMENTS ON THE APPLICATION, BUT IF THERE -- I SEE SOME OTHER QUESTIONS, OTHERWISE I WAS GOING TO MOVE THAT WE DENY THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ARE YOU MAKING A MOTION AT THIS TIME MAYOR EKLUND?

PAT ECKLUND: YES.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: A MOTION TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE APPEAL OF THE CITY OF DUBLIN.

BELIA RAMOS: SECOND, RAMOS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR HUDSON? YOU'RE -- YOU'RE MUTED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID E. HUDSON: I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR MAKING THE MOTION AND SECOND AND I DON'T HAVE TO DO IT BECAUSE I HAVE TO FACE MELISSA HERNANDEZ. I WANT TO CLARIFY, THE REQUEST FROM DUBLIN IS TO TRANSFER OUT ABOVE MODERATE AND THE SPEAKER SAID WHY WERE YOU KEEP -- OKAY. THE NOD OF THE HEAD ANSWERS MY QUESTION. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: FLIGOR.

NEYSA FLIGOR: I HAVE TO ADMIT WHEN I WENT THROUGH THE DUBLIN PRESENTATION I WAS INITIALLY CONFUSED WHETHER THEY WERE SEEKING TO INCREASE THEIR REALLOCATION NUMBER OR DECREASE IT BECAUSE OF THE GROWTH THEY EXPERIENCED BETWEEN 2010 AND 2019 AND EVERYBODY KNOWS THAT 2020 WAS AN ANOMALY. DAVE THIS QUESTION IS FOR YOU DO YOU HAVE THE PROJECTED POPULATION GROWTH FOR DUB LONE OVER THE NEXT NINE YEARS? >DAVE VAUTIN: WELL, I WOULD SAY THE RHNA ALLOCATION IS OUR NEXT DECADE OF THE PROJECTED HOUSING GROWTH WE HAVE THE LONGER TERM 30 YEAR PROJECTIONS FOR THE TRI-VALLEY WHICH IS PART OF THE ADOPTED GROWTH PATTERN I'M HAPPY TO PULL THAT UP.

NEYSA FLIGOR: I'M SURE THAT YOU CAN CONFIRM THAT IT WILL CONTINUE TO INCREASE.

DAVE VAUTIN: THAT'S CORRECT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ANY OTHER COMMENTS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE? MAYOR EKLUND I BELIEVE YOU WANTED TO ADDRESS THE MOTION?

PAT ECKLUND: YES. I DID WANT TO MAKE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS, THOUGH THAT DUBLIN'S COMMENTS ABOUT WATER AVAILABILITY. I DO BELIEVE THAT THE REGION DOES HAVE A CARRYING CAPACITY, ESPECIALLY FOR PORTABLE WATER AND I HOPE THAT PLANNED BAY AREA HAS SOME ISSUE IN THERE THAT WE CAN TRY TO ADDRESS THAT AS WE PROGRESS WITHIN THE BAY AREA. BECAUSE I THINK IT'S APPLICABLE TO ALL CITIES, 101 CITIES AND NINE COUNTIES IN THE BAY AREA. SECONDLY, IS THAT I AGREE -- I DID NOT SUSPECT THE METHODOLOGY, PRIMARILY BECAUSE OF THE INCORPORATION OF HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS OR HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS, WHICH ARE ONE IN THE SAME. BUT I THINK IF WE'RE GOING TO USE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS IN THE FUTURE, THAT WE NEED TO LOOK AT TRYING TO RECONCILE THE DIFFERENCE OF THE DEMOGRAPHIC DATA WITH OTHER DATA SOURCES LIKE THE AMERICAN COMMUNITIES SURVEY. AND THIS, OBVIOUSLY, WE HAVE TO HAVE SOME DISCUSSION ABOUT AS A FULL COMMITTEE AND EXECUTIVE BOARD. SO THOSE ARE THE TWO THAT I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE PUT ON THAT LIST FOR FUTURE DISCUSSION. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. OKAY. UNLESS THERE IS ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS, THE MOTION IS TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE RHNA APPEAL FROM THE CITY OF DUBLIN. AND I'LL ASK MR. CASTRO TO CALL THE ROLL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION BY EKLUND, SECOND BY RAMOS. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO THE CITY OF DUBLIN FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. THIS IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WILL MEET AT THE CONCLUSION OF OUR PUBLIC HEARING TO TAKE FINAL ACTION ON ALL THE APPEALS. AND THAT WILL FORM THE BASE OF THE FINAL RHNA PLAN THAT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL VOTE ON IN DECEMBER. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. OKAY WE WILL NOW PROCEED TO ITEM C, THE REPORT ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS FOR THE CITY OF PLEASANTON. THIS IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION ITEM. FIRST WE WILL HEAR FROM THE CITY OF PLEASANTON WHO WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT ON THEIR APPEAL. WHO WILL PRESENTING ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF PLEASANTON?

SPEAKER: ELLEN CLARK: ELLEN CLARK.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. WE SERVED ON THE COMMITTEE TOGETHER.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ELLEN CLARK: GOOD MORNING MEMBERS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE I WOULD ECHO REMARKS OF SOME OF THE EARLIER PRESENTERS TO OFFER OUR APPRECIATION FOR THE WORK OF STAFF THROUGH THIS LENGTHY AND DIFFICULT PROCESS AS WELL AS THE OPPORTUNITY TO PRESENT OUR APPEAL ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF PLEASANTON TODAY MY NAME IS ELLEN CLARK DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT FOR THE CITY OF PLEASANTON CITY MANAGER NELSON, AND [INDISCERNIBLE] ARE ALSO HERE WITH ME TODAY. I WILL ADDRESS KEY POINTS OF APPEAL IN MY PRESENTATION I WOULD REFER TO THE COMMITTEE TO OUR APPEAL LETTER SUBMITTED IN JULY FOR MORE INFORMATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PLEASANTON'S APPEAL INCORPORATES THREE BASIS IN ACCORDANCE WITH THOSE ALLOWED UNDER THE GOVERNMENT CODE INCLUDING CONCERNS OVER FAILURE TO ACCOUNT FOR LOCAL CONDITIONS, WATER SUPPLY AND LAND AVAILABILITY, CHANGED CIRCUMSTANCES, AND HIGHLIGHTED ON THIS SLIDE ARE THE -- IS THE ITEM THEY WILL FOCUS ON THE MAJORITY OF MY PRESENTATION TODAY METHODOLOGY AND APPLICATION AND PERFORMANCE WITH STATUTORY OBJECTIVES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BEFORE GOING ON I DID WANT TO NOTE AND ACKNOWLEDGE SOME OF PLEASANTON'S EFFORT IN RECENT YEARS TO ADDRESS THE REGION'S HOUSING CHALLENGE. OVER THE LAST SIX YEARS ALONE WE HAVE REZONED SITES AND PROPOSED 2,000 HOUSES IN THE CITY AND DEDICATED TO LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. THE CITY HAS INDIVIDUALLY MADE SIGNIFICANT FINANCIAL CONTRIBUTIONS TO SUPPORT AFFORDABLE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HOUSING IN THE CITY, INCLUDING A COUPLE OF PROJECTS THAT WE'RE VERY PROUD, A 185 UNIT SENIOR PROJECT AS WELL AS A 1,031 UNIT PROJECT FOR DEVELOPMENTALLY DISABLED ADULTS I SAY THIS TO MAKE IT CLEAR THAT PLEASANT'S REQUEST IN THE CYCLE IS NOT TO BE RELIEVED OF OUR OBLIGATION TO ADDRESS THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEED BUT TO RECEIVE AN ALLOCATION THAT IS FAIR REALISTIC AND PROVIDED IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE OBJECTIVES IDENTIFIED BY STATE LAW. AS MENTIONED OUR APPEAL INCLUDES OTHER BASIS. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE MOST SIGNIFICANT ISSUES AROUND CONFORMANCE WITH STATE DEFINED STATUTORY OBJECTIVES NUMBER TWO, DEPARTMENTAL RESOURCES TO ENCOURAGE DEVELOPMENTAL PATTERNS AND REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS. I APPRECIATE THE METHODOLOGY IS AROUND SCRUTINY TODAY BUT IT STEMS BACK TO EARLIER COMMENTS, WE ALONG WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS RAISE SERIOUS QUESTIONS ABOUT THE BASELINE CHOICE USED IN THE OVERALL RHNA ALLOCATION METHODOLOGY. THERE ARE FACTORS WE KNOW THAT COME INTO PLAY BUT OVERALL THE BASELINE HAS THE PROFOUND EFFECT ON THE DISTRIBUTION OF RHNA ACROSS THE REGION. UNFORTUNATELY THAT SELECTED BASELINE HAD THE WHAT WE WOULD CONSIDER THE FATAL FLAW OF SIGNIFICANTLY ALLOCATING RHNA IN A METHOD AND MANNER CONTRADICTORY TO OBJECTIVE TWO BY UNDERALLOCATING UNITS IN THE SOUTH BAY THAT HAVE PRODUCED A LARGE NUMBER OF JOBS OVER THE PAST DECADE AND CONVERSELY OVERALLOCATING RHNA TO THE SUBURBS AND TRANSPORT COMMUNITIES INCLUDING PLEASANTON. EXACERBATES COMMUTE FLOWS FROM EAST AND SOUTH BAY FROM PLEASANTON TO OTHER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMUNITIES AND JOB CENTERS BECAUSE [INDISCERNIBLE] HIGHEST JOB COUNTIES FOR MAKING THE DEMAND GENERATED BY EMPLOYMENT BASE AND DOCUMENTED IN THE EIR, THAT DOCUMENT INCLUDES SIGNIFICANT UNAVOIDABLE IMPACTS AROUND GHG AND VMT. WE SAW CHANGES IN OUR METHODOLOGY THAT WERE CONCERNING THAT THERE WAS LIMITED OPPORTUNITY IN OUR VIEW TO SCRUTINIZE THAT RESULTED IN A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN RHNA'S IN THE LAST WEEKS OF THE PROCESS AND THOSE CHANGES FURTHER [INDISCERNIBLE] AS MENTIONED OF THEIR OBLIGATION TO PROVIDE HOUSING EXACERBATE THE DEGREE OF [INDISCERNIBLE] WITH THE STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND ARE OF SIGNIFICANT CONCERN TO THE CITY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'LL SKIP OVER THIS BRIEFLY SINCE MY TIME IS SHORT. AND THIS HIGHLIGHTS A COUPLE OF THE OTHER POINTS RAISED IN OUR APPEAL LETTER WHICH I WILL REFER YOU. NEXT SLIDE. IN CONCLUSION AS I NOTED, THE CITY IS COMMITTED TO MEETING ITS OBLIGATION TO PLAN AND ZONE FOR NEW HOUSING. THE RHNA METHODOLOGY, AS LOCALLY APPLIED, THE UNDER LYING BASELINE AND RESULTS OF RHNA FAILS TO PROPERLY ACCOUNT FOR LOCAL CONDITIONS AND UNDER MINES A KEY STATUTORY OBJECTIVE RELATED TO GHG PROTECTION AND RESOURCES. THEREFORE THE CITY IS REQUESTING REDUCTION IN RHNA BY 1,193 UNITS EQUIVALENT TO THE INCREASE WE SAW AT THE END OF THE PROCESS THAT FURTHER WORSENED THE IMBALANCE. THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING OUR PRESENTATION TODAY. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. THERE MAY BE QUESTIONS AT THE CONCLUSION OF PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE STAFF TO PRESENT THE RESPONSE TO THE CITY OF PLEASANT'S APPEAL.

ELI KAPLAN: PULL UP THE SLIDES PLEASE. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE MY NAME IS ELI KAPLAN REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS STAFF. THE CITY OF PLEASANTON IS REQUESTING A REDUCTION OF 1,193 UNITS REPRESENTING A REDUCTION OF 20% FROM THEIR DRAFT ALLOCATION AND STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO DENY THE APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, PLEASANTON ARGUES THAT ABAG FAILED TO PRESENT INFORMATION ABOUT THE SURVEY OF WATER SUPPLY BUT PLEASANTON DID NOD INCLUDE THIS SPECIFIC INFORMATION IN THEIR SURVEY ALSO STATUTE DEFINES WATER SUPPLY CONSTRAINTS AS THOSE THAT PRECLUDE THE JURISDICTION FROM PROVIDING NECESSARY INFRASTRUCTURE FOR DEVELOPMENT DURING THE RHNA PERIOD BUT PLEASANTON DOESN'T DEMONSTRATE IT'S UNABLE TO PROVIDE NO, SIR INFRASTRUCTURE FOR DEVELOPMENT DURING THE 2023 TO 2031 PLANNING PERIOD AS THE CITY NOTES IN ITS PALE POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS TO THE CURRENT PRODUCTION OF WATER SUPPLY THE CITY STATES MAY BE ABLE TO BRING BACK WELLS ONLINE AS EARLY AS 2025 WHICH IS TWO YEARS INTO THE EIGHT YEAR RHNA CYCLE. PLEASANT DOESN'T DEMONSTRATE THAT ITS WATER SUPPLY CANNOT PROVIDE THE NECESSARY WATER REQUIRED FOR ADDITIONAL DEVELOPMENT TO MEET ITS RHNA ALLOCATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PLEASANTON ALSO ARGUES THAT ABAG FAILED TO CONSIDER INFORMATION SUBMITTED IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOCAL JURISDICTION SURVEY ABOUT SHORTAGE EVER LAND SUITABLE FOR CONVERSION TO RESIDENTIAL USE HOWEVER THE RHNA METHODOLOGY CONSIDERS THE CONSTRAINTS NAMED IN THIS APPEAL BY INCORPORATING DATA FROM THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION. IN DEVELOPING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT ABAG MTC STAFF WORKED WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO GATHER INFORMATION ABOUT LOCAL PLANS, ZONING, AND PHYSICAL CHARACTERISTIC THAT MIGHT AFFECT DEVELOPMENT STRENGTH OF THE LAND USE MODEL USED FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FORECASTING IS IT ASSESSES FEASIBILITY IN COST OF REDEVELOPING A PARCEL FURTHERMORE ABAG LIMITING CONSIDERATION FOR SOCIAL HOUSING SITES JURISDICTIONS EXISTING ZONING AND LAND USE RESTRICTIONS. UNABLE TO CONSIDER -- [INDISCERNIBLE] NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PLEASANTON IN ITS APPEAL ARGUES THE RHNA METHODOLOGY DOESN'T FURTHER THE STATUTORY OBJECTIVE RELATED TO THE EFFICIENT DEVELOPMENT OF PATTERNS IN GREENHOUSE REDUCTION AS DISCUSSED TODAY THE ARGUMENT CHALLENGES THE FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY AND CHALLENGE THE METHODOLOGY FALLS OUTSIDE OF SCOPE OF THE PROCESS. HCD FOUND THAT ABAG'S METHODOLOGY DOES FURTHER THE OBJECTIVES. HCD DETERMINED THAT JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LOWEST VMT RECEIVED MORE RHNA THAN THOSE WITH THE HIGHEST VMT AND HCD INCLUDED METHODOLOGY ALLOCATES MORE RHNA UNITS TO MORE JURISDICTIONS WITH MORE JOBS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PLEASANTON CITES POPULATION DECLINE IN COVID-19 IS ISSUE THAT REPRESENTS CHANGE IN CIRCUMSTANCES MERITING REDUCTION IN ITS RHNA HOWEVER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STATUTE STATES THAT STABLE POPULATION NUMBERS CANNOT BE USED AS A JUSTIFICATION FOR REDUCING A JURISDICTION'S RHNA THE CITY CITES POPULATION DECLINE. [INDISCERNIBLE] CONTINUE TO DECLINE LONG-TERM OR REDUCTION IN THE JURISDICTION'S HOUSING NEED FOR THE RHNA PLANNING PERIOD. ABAG APPRECIATES THE CITY'S CONCERNS ABOUT THE SIGNIFICANT ECONOMIC AND SOCIETAL CHANGES RESULTING FROM COVID-19 HOWEVER AS HCD INDICATE IN ITS COMMENT LETTER ON THE RHNA APPEALS CHANGE IS CAUSED BY COVID-19 DO NOT FALL WITHIN THE APPEAL CRITERIA DEFINED BY STATUTE IMPORTANT HE IMPACTS OF COVID-19 ARE NOT UNIQUE TO ANY SINGLE JURISDICTION THEY ARE ISSUES THAT THE ENTIRE REGION IS GRAPPLING WITH. LASTLY, PLEASANTON'S APPEAL RAISES QUESTIONS ABOUT THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION CALCULATED BY HCD BUT THE DEADLINE TO APPEAL THAT CALCULATION IS LONG PASSED AND THAT ALSO DOESN'T FALL WITHIN THE STATUTORY GROUNDS FOR AN APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN CONCLUSION ABAG MTC STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE COMMITTEE DENY PLEASANTON'S APPEAL THE METHODOLOGY ADEQUATELY CONSIDERS INFORMATION FROM THE LOCAL JURISDICTION SURVEY AND PLEASANTON HAS NOT PROVED THE INFORMATION FROM THE SURVEY DEMONSTRATES THE CITY CANNOT -- THE CITY HAS NOT IDENTIFIED ANY CHANGES IN CIRCUMSTANCES THAT MERIT A REVISION OF ITS RHNA THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE THE CITY OF PLEASANTON OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO MTC STAFF PRESENTATION. IF YOU SO CHOOSE.

ELLEN CLARK: I'LL NOTE A COUPLE OF POINTS AND I WELCOME OUR CITY STAFF HERE TODAY TO ADD TO THAT. WITH RESPECT TO THE MAIN ITEM THAT WE RAISED TODAY, WE DO HAVE A CONCERN. I APPRECIATE THE METHODOLOGY, REGIONALLY SPEAKING, CHECKS THE BOXES RELATIVE TO STATUTORY OBJECTIVES, HOWEVER, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THAT SAME ASSUMPTION AND THOSE APPLICATIONS ON A LOCAL BASIS, ALMOST THE ENTIRE CITY OF PLEASANTON IS IN A HIGH VMT AREA. THAT WILL MAKE IT LOCALLY CHALLENGING FOR US TO ADOPT A HOUSING ELEMENT THAT DOES NOT COME WITH ITS OWN SET OF SIGNIFICANT ENVIRONMENTAL -- SIGNIFICANT AND UNAVOIDABLE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS, REALISTICALLY, AND THAT JUST APPEARS TO BE IN DIRECT CONTRADICTION TO THE STATUTORY OBJECTIVE THAT'S RAISED, PARTICULARLY WHEN YOU CONSIDER A SIMILAR PATTERN WILL BE PLAYED OUT ACROSS MANY OTHER CITIES IN THE BAY AREA. THAT'S ONE POINT I WANTED TO RAISE IN REBUTTAL AND BRIAN, OR NELSON, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO ADD, PLEASE DO.

BRIAN DOLAN: I WAS WONDERING IF ABAG STAFF COULD ARTICULATE FOR THE COMMITTEE WHAT IT WAS THAT HAPPENED IN THE LAST TWO WEEKS OF THE PROCESS THAT ADDED A THOUSAND UNITS TO OUR NUMBER?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE CAN ADDRESS THAT AFTER THE PUBLIC COMMENT PORTION. I COULD ACTUALLY RESPOND TO YOUR QUESTION PRETTY SIMPLY. WE CAN ELABORATE AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT. WHEN THE FINAL GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WERE ISSUED, THAT DID RESULT IN CHANGES TO THE DISTRIBUTION. THIS WAS SOMETHING THAT WAS DISCUSSED EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE EXTENSIVELY AT THE JANUARY AND DECEMBER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETINGS. STAFF CAN ELABORATE AFTER THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. I DON'T WANT TO TAKE UP MORE OF YOUR TIME. OTHER COMMENTS FROM THE CITY OF PLEASANTON ON STAFF'S PRESENTATION? THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. I'LL OPEN THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD FOR THE CITY OF PLEASANTON APPEAL OF ITS RHNA ALLOCATION. IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES TO TESTIFY PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING INTO OUR MEETING? OKAY. I SEE ONE RAISED HAND. MR. CASTRO?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: JORDAN GRIMES. GO AHEAD. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WANTED TO QUICKLY RESPOND TO -- I WANT PLANNING ON SPEAKING BUT I QUICKLY WANT TO RESPOND TO THE POINT ABOUT PLEASANTON'S JOB GROWTH AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HOUSING. YES, SILICON VALLEY ABSOLUTELY HAS TO BUILD MORE HOUSING. I PERSONALLY WISH OUR RHNA'S NUMBER WAS HIGHER. ACCORDING TO DATA FROM HUDSON AND CENSUS DATA PLEASANTON ADDED 2100 JOBS BETWEEN 2010 AND 2018 WHILE PERMITTING JUST 3,324 NEW HOMES SO THAT ARGUMENT DOESN'T REALLY HOLD WATER. THEY'RE CLEARLY BEHIND. I THINK THE RHNA ALLOCATION IS EMINENTLY REASONABLE. AND JUST WANTED TO PUT THAT OUT THERE. THANKS SO MUCH.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE CITY OF PLEASANTON'S RHNA APPEAL? IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONE INTO OUR MEETING. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS MR. CASTRO ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED POST AFTER THE OFFICIAL PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD, THAT WAS POSTED ON THE ONLINE AGENDA AND E-MAILED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IT'S NOW IN ORDER FOR THE COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS AND TAKE PRELIMINARY ACTION ON THE APPEAL. BEFORE I RECOGNIZE MAYOR EKLUND, I WOULD LIKE TO ASK STAFF, YOU HAVE BEEN ADDRESSED THE QUESTION THAT WAS RAISED BY THE CITY OF PLEASANTON AROUND THE CHANGE IN THE FINAL NUMBERS. I DID BRIEFLY ADDRESS IT WITH RESPECT TO THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FINAL GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES ISSUED IN DECEMBER WE DID SEE AN ADJUSTMENT IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE NUMBERS THIS WAS DISCUSSED EXTENSIVELY AT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. MR. VAUTIN, AS YOU ARE LEADING THE PLANNED BAY AREA PROCESS, YOU THINK YOU CAN ELABORATE ON THIS ISSUE AND PROVIDE CONTEXT. >DAVE VAUTIN: LET ME GIVE A 1 TO 2 MINUTE EXPLANATION FOR THIS QUESTION. I KNOW IT'S AN IMPORTANT ONE. THE BOARD AND COMMISSION APPROVED A SET OF STRATEGIES AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT IN FEBRUARY 2020 THE TEAM ANALYZED THE GROWTH PATTERN BASED ON STRATEGIES OVER THE COURSE OF SPRING 2020 AND RELEASED A BLUEPRINT FINDING OF THE GROWTH PATTERN DRIVEN BY THOSE GEOGRAPHIES AND STRATEGIES IN SUMMER 2020 -- GROWTH PATTERN DID NOT MEET THE STATUTORY GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGETS. -- INCLUDED THINGS ON THE TRANSPORTATION FRONT BUT ALSO ON THE LAND USE STRATEGIES AS WELL ASK AND WHEN THE BOARD APPROVED A SERIES OF CHANGES AND ADDITIONS TO THE STRATEGIES IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT IN SEPTEMBER 2020 SO THE EARLY RONA NUMBERS WHICH WERE NOTED AS DRAFT AND WE UNDER SCORED THAT THEY WERE USING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DATA WAS SHARED IN SUMMER 2020 WERE RECOMMENDED DRAFT, AND SHARED THAT THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WOULD COME OUT AT THE END OF 2020 ASK LEAD TO UPDATES THE BOARD IN SEPTEMBER ALONG WITH THE COMMISSION APPROVED CHANGES TO THE STRATEGY SPECIFICALLY TO TARGET MORE GROWTH AND TOWARDS TRANSIT-RICH HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS INCLUDING PLACES SURROUNDING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE BART STATION IN PLEASANTON AND OTHER LOCATIONS ACROSS THE REGION WE ANALYZED THOSE STRATEGIES THROUGHOUT THE FALL AND RELEASED AN UPDATE THE GROWTH PATTERN IN DECEMBER 2020, WHICH WAS DISCUSS AND SAID ADOPTED IN JANUARY OF 2021 ONCE ADOPTED IT FED INTO THE RHNA METHODOLOGY AND IT DID UPDATE THE RHNA NUMBERS AS WELL THAT'S BASICALLY THE LINEAGE IN TERMS OF STEP-BY-STEP, THERE WAS A CLEAN ACKNOWLEDGEMENT WITH THE EARLY NUMBERS THEY WERE A DRAFT AND BASED ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND THE FINAL NUMBERS REFLECT THE BLUEPRINT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU MR. VAUTIN. MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS FOR THE APPLICANT. I DID NOT UNDERSTAND THE HIGH VEHICLE MILE ISSUE. AND THAT YOU WOULD BE OUT OF COMPLIANCE. I DIDN'T UNDERSTAND THAT. IF YOU CAN HELP EXPLAIN THAT.

ELLEN CLARK: CERTAINLY. ALAMEDA COUNTY CTC HAS BEEN WORKING ON SB -- I FORGET -- 375 IMPLEMENTATION AROUND CEQA THRESHOLDS. AS PART OF THAT, THEY HAVE DONE MAPPING OF HIGH -- RELATIVELY HIGH AND LOW VMT AREAS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTY INCLUDING FOR PLEASANTON. WHAT THEIR MAPS SHOWS IS THAT, AS YOU CAN IMAGINE, WE HAVE LOWER VMT AREAS AROUND OUR FARM STATIONS WHICH ARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PRIMARILY HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT IN THE CITY AND HIGH VMT RELATIVELY ELSEWHERE IN THE MAJORITY OF THE CITY, WHAT THAT MEANS IS IN ORDER FOR US TO ACHIEVE APPROPRIATE VMT LEVELS WE HAVE TO SITE MORE HOUSING NEAR BART. SOME OF THAT IS ACHIEVABLE. WE COMPLETELY AGREE, BUT THE IDEA THAT WE CAN PLACE ALL OF THAT HOUSING IN A LOW VMT AREA IS JUST NOT FEASIBLE IN THE CITY'S VIEW. SO THE OUTCOME OF THAT, WE BELIEVE, IS VERY LIKELY TO BE SIGNIFICANT, UNAVOIDABLE VMT AND GHG ISSUES BECAUSE WE DO NOT HAVE THE TRANSIT INFRASTRUCTURE TO MITIGATE AGAINST THOSE VMT IMPACTS. THAT'S THE CONCERN. WHAT HAPPENS IN PLEASANTON ON THE LOCAL LEVEL WILL BE REPLICATED ACROSS THE REGION AND THAT APPEARS CONTRARY TO THE IMPORTANT STATUTORY OBJECTIVE AROUND ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY.

PAT ECKLUND: YOUR PRESENTATION TALKS ABOUT LACK OF VACANT LAND AND REPURPOSING COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES NEAR TRANSIT. I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY YOU DON'T -- REPURPOSING COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES, WHY IS THAT DIFFICULT FOR THE CITY?

ELLEN CLARK: AGAIN, WE DON'T CONTEND THAT THERE IS NO POSSIBILITY THAT COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES CAN BE REPURPOSES WE DO HAVE A NUMBER OF AGING COMMERCIAL CENTERS AND AS PART OF OUR HOUSING UPDATES WE ARE LOOKING AT THOSE SORTS OF SITES OF NEW HOUSING OPPORTUNITY SITES. IT'S A QUESTION OF DEGREE OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

REALIST SET OF ASSUMPTIONS HOW THAT HOUSING CAN BE ACCOMMODATED. WE HAVE VIBRANT AND VIABLE COMMERCIAL WITHIN THE CITY OF PLEASANTON AND THROUGHOUT HOUSING ELEMENT PROCESS WE HAVE TO MAKE THE CASE TO HCD THAT SITES THAT ARE UNDERUTILIZED IN PARTICULAR ARE ACTUALLY VIABLE. IT'S A CHALLENGE WE QUESTION FEASIBILITY AND TO THE EXTENT THAT WHICH ALL THAT HOUSING DEMAND CAN BE ABSORBED ON EXISTING COMMERCIAL SITES.

PAT ECKLUND: LAST QUESTION. STAFF INDICATED THAT YOUR CONCERNS ABOUT WATER SUPPLY WEREN'T INCLUDED IN THE SURVEY. I WAS CURIOUS AS TO WHY IT WASN'T?

ELLEN CLARK: THE ANSWER THERE IS ONE OF THE ISSUES WAS AN EARLY EMERGING ISSUE IN 2020, WITH THE PFOS CONTAMINANTS IN ONE OF OUR LOCAL GROUNDWATER WELLS WE WERE COMING TO GRIPS WITH THAT ISSUE BECAUSE WE DIDN'T HAVE ALL THE FACTS AT OUR DISPOSAL AT THIS POINT THAT WAS ONE REASON. LOCAL SURVEY IN GENERAL, IT WAS A LENGTHY SURVEY, IT WAS BROADLY WRITTEN I WOULD SAY THAT NOT AS THE STAFF HONOR HELPING TO FILL IT OUT I DREW THE CONNECTION BETWEEN OUR INFORMATION ABOUT THAT SURVEY AND OUR ABLE TO RAISE THOSE SAME ISSUES TWO AND A HALF YEARS LATER IN THIS APPEALS PROCESS AND IF WE WERE TO DO IT AGAIN I THINK I WOULD REQUEST THAT BE MADE MORE EXPLICIT IN THE LOCAL SURVEY PROCESS THAT THAT'S WHAT THE CONSEQUENCE OF THAT INFORMATION IN THAT LOCAL SORRY HAVE AN IS, IS THOSE ARE THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BASIS FIREFIGHTER YOUR APPEAL IN THE FUTURE I'M NOT SURE THAT WAS CLEAR TO ME AND POSSIBLY TO OTHER CITIES AS WELL IN THE PROCESS.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR ANSWERS AND I DO HAVE COMMENTS ONCE THE MOTION IS MADE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. MAYOR HUDSON IN.

DAVID E. HUDSON: YEAH. I WOULD WARN EVERYBODY AHEAD OF TIME I DID THE SAME PROBLEM WHEN I LOST THE ARGUMENT FOR 6A THAT'S YOUR ANSWER BRIAN. THERE WAS A CHANGE WHEN WE DIDN'T ACCEPT THE OPTIONS THAT WERE AHEAD OF US, AND I'LL LET THE MAYOR GET INTO IT FURTHER. BUT UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT, WE HEARD WHERE THERE WAS DISPARITY IN PLEASANTON. THEY TOOK IN ALL THESE JOBS AND ONLY BUILT SO MANY HOMES. I CAN WARN YOU AHEAD OF TIME EVERY TIME I HEAR THIS I'M GOING PULL OUT THE SAME THING I TOLD YOU IN THAT 6A ARGUMENT BETWEEN 1995 AND 1997 SANTA CLARA COUNTY ADDED 126,005 JOBS AND ONLY BUILT 7,150 HOMES BY THAT STANDARD PLEASANTON IS ANGELIC THERE IS ABSOLUTELY NO WAY WE CAN MAKE UP WHAT WE'RE DOING IN THE PAST, WHAT WE'RE DOING RIGHT NOW, EXCEPT THAT'S NOT WHAT'S IN FRONT OF US, AND UNFORTUNATELY, IT'S BACK TO THE SAME THINGS I WAS SAYING, WE HAVE TO STAY WITHIN THE STATUS AND EVERYTHING WE'RE SUPPOSED TO BE LOOKING AT TODAY. IF I WERE TO WRITE AN APPEAL I WOULD

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WRITE THE APPEAL THAT PLEASANTON HAD, AND I FULLY ACKNOWLEDGE I WOULD LOSE. PFAS IS A REAL PROBLEM. AND I WILL BE WATCHING TO SEE HOW THE OTHER APPEALS GO THROUGHOUT THIS FIVE-DAY -- I TOP CALL IT AN ORDEAL I GUESS I SHOULDN'T. I SHOULD FIND SOME PRETTY LITTLE NAME FOR T BUT THROUGHOUT THE RHNA PROCESS TO SEE WHAT IS MAKING SENSE TO OUR MEMBERS AND WHAT ISN'T. BUT CLEARLY THERE IS NOTHING THEY SEE HERE THAT WOULD ALLOW US TO UPHOLD THIS APPEAL. AND, I MOON, I LOVE THE APPEAL THAT YOU WROTE, BUT I CAN'T SUPPORT IT. I'M SORRY.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU.

DAVID E. HUDSON: AND I'M NOT GOING TO MAKE THE MOTION, JESSE. THESE ARE MY NEIGHBORS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: UNDERSTOOD. ANY QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ON THE CITY OF PLEASANTON'S APPEAL? I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. IF NOT, A MOTION IS IN ORDER TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO EITHER APPROVE, DENY, APPROVE WITH MODIFICATIONS.

KAREN MITCHOFF: MOVE TO TAKE THE PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. MOVED BY MITCHOFF.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: SECOND THE BY FLIGOR? FLIGOR DO YOU WISH TO SPEAK ON THE MOTION?

NEYSA FLIGOR: I WAS SECONDING ON THE MOTION. I WAS GETTING READY TO MAKE THE MOTION BUT I SECOND THE MOTION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT ON THE MOTION. I DID WANT TO STATE THEY DID NOT SUPPORT THE METHODOLOGY AND THE CHANGE OF FOCUSING MORE GROWTH IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS AND TRANSIT. SO I AM VERY SYMPATHETIC TO THE APPLICANT. BUT THAT IS THE METHODOLOGY THAT WAS APPROVED. SO I AM GOING TO BE SUPPORTING THE MOTION TO DENY IT EVEN THOUGH I DON'T AGREE WITH IT. I WANT TO ADD TO THE LIST FOR US TO TALK ABOUT THE LOCAL SURVEY. BECAUSE I, PERSONALLY, WAS TRYING TO GET THE CITIES AND THE COUNTY, AND MARIN AND OTHER CITIES THAT I AM CLOSE TO, TO REALIZE THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THAT SURVEY. AND I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO RETHINK THIS FOR THE NEXT RHNA CYCLE. AND THAT NEEDS TO BE A TOPIC OF DISCUSSION ABOUT HOW CAN WE IMPROVE THAT IN THE FUTURE. SO THEN AND MY OTHER COMMENT ABOUT POPULATION DECLINE, SINCE WE'RE SEEING THAT IN A LOT OF APPLICATIONS, MY COMMENT THERE IS THAT I JUST DON'T THINK IT NECESSARILY POSSIBLE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FAILURE IN HOUSING. WE'RE SEEING A DECLINE OF A NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT LIVE IN A HOUSE HOLE. SO PEOPLE ARE LIVING LONGER, THEY ARE LIVING IN THEIR HOMES, LIKE MY MOTHER, SHE LIVES IN A FOUR BEDROOM HOUSE AND SHE WANTS TO DIE THERE AND THAT'S OUR JOB AS KIDS TO HELP MAKE THAT HAPPEN, AND I THINK THAT IS PREVALENT AROUND THE BAY AREA. SO I THINK THERE IS OTHER REASON FOR IT, BUT THAT IS NOT PART OF THE METHODOLOGY. SO, ANYWAY, THOSE COMMENTS, AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALLOWING ME TO MAKE THOSE COMMENTS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. SOME MANDELMAN?

RAFAEL MANDELMAN: THANK YOU CHAIR ARREGUIN. I HAVE SOME SYMPATHY WITH PLEASANTON ARGUMENTS AND FRUSTRATION WITH THE LAST MINUTE SHIFT AT THE END DECEMBER WITH THE SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF UNITS AND PARTICULARLY SHIFTING THEM AWAY FROM SANTA CLARA, AND THE SOUTH BAY. THAT SAY TREMENDOUS FRUSTRATION THAT SAN FRANCISCO SHARES. THAT SAID, I DO NOT BELIEVE THAT THERE IS THE BASIS TO UPHOLD THIS APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. BEFORE WE VOTE, I JUST WANT TO ALSO SAY, I CERTAINLY SYMPATHIZE WITH THE POINTS THAT THE CITY OF PLEASANTON HAS RAISED, AND I AGREE WITH MAYOR EKLUND'S COMMENT THAT GOING FORWARD I DO THINK THAT WE HAVE TO PROVIDE MORE INFORMATION ON THE LOCAL JURISDICTION'S SURVEY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND IMPLICATIONS. I'LL NOTE THE GOVERNMENT CODES REFERENCED THE LOCAL JURISDICTION SURVEY, AND THAT IS BASIS FOR AN APPEAL. BUT WITH RESPECT TO THE SEVEN CYCLE, I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT JUST EMPHASIZING THE IMPORTANCE OF PEOPLE PARTICIPATING AND THE IMPLICATIONS OF INFORMATION SUBMITTED. I HOPE STAFF WILL ADD THAT TO THE LIST OF SOMETHING WE DISCUSS RELATIVE TO THE NEXT PROCESS. BUT RESPECTFULLY, I -- WE HAVE ARE CONSTRAINED TO CONSIDER THE APPEAL ON THE BASIS OF THE STATUTE. AND THERE IS NOT A LOT OF FLEXIBLE. WE HAVE TO EVALUATE THIS RELATIVE TO, DOES DID MEET THE STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND IS THERE ADEQUATE INFORMATION AND JUSTIFICATION ON GRANT THE APPEAL BASED ON THE THREE FACTORS AND I DO AGREE WITH STAFF'S CONCLUSION AND I WILL BE SUPPORTING THE MOTION RESPECTFULLY. UNLESS THERE ARE ANY FURTHER COMMENTS, I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION BY MITCHOFF, SECOND BY FLIGOR. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. ONCE AGAIN, THIS IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION. WE WILL BE TAKING FINAL ACTION AT THE CLOSE OF THE PUBLIC HEARING, AND WE'LL PROVIDE AMPLE NOTICE OF THAT MEETING DATE. AND AFTER WHICH TIME, THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL VOTE ON THE FINAL PLAN IN DECEMBER 2021. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO THE CITY OF PLEASANTON FOR THE THOUGHTFUL APPEAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND PRESENTING TODAY. WE CAN PROCEED. WE'RE TECHNICALLY SUPPOSED TO TAKE A LUNCH BREAK NOW BUT WE ARE MAKING GREAT PROGRESS. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK, THE NEXT APPEAL IS FOR THE CITY OF CLAYTON. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK IS THERE ANYONE PRESENT FROM THE CITY OF CLAYTON WHO WAS GOING TO BE PRESENTING? RAINA, YOU'RE PRESENTING ARE?

REINA SWARTZ: I'M READY TO PRESENT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION FOR THE CITY OF CLAYTON. MRS. SWARTZ YOU WILL BE PRESENTING ON BEHALF FOR THE CITY OF CLAYTON? IS THERE A SLIDE DECK?

REINA SWARTZ: YES. THANK YOU.

NEYSA FLIGOR: CHAIR, BEFORE THE CITY OF CLAYTON PRESENTS I HAVE A POINT OF ORDER QUESTION THE PACKET THAT THE NOTICE THAT WE WOULD TAKE A LUNCH BREAK AND I KNOW THE CLAYTON REPRESENTATIVE SAID THAT WE'RE FINE GOING NOW BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO ARE EXPECTING US TO TAKE A LUNCH BREAK AND MAYBE WHEN WE GET BACK FROM WHENEVER THAT LUNCH BREAK IS THAT WE CAN ACCOMMODATE THEM IN CASE THEY'RE LOOKING AT THE AGENDA?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: GOOD POINT. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK OUR GENERAL COUNSEL OR STAFF IF THEY COULD RESPOND? WHAT DO YOU ADVISE?

KATHLEEN KANE: I THINK IT'S A FAIR POINT. WHAT I MIGHT ADVISE IS THAT WE -- IN THE WORDS OF, I THINK, SUPERVISOR LEE, "SPLIT THE BABY," IF CLAYTON IS ABLE AND WILLING TO PROCEED NOW, AND GET THROUGH THEIR PRESENTATION AND STAFF'S RESPONSE AND MAYBE QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE THEN WE CAN TAKE A LUNCH BREAK. IF THERE ARE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WANT TO COMMENT YOU CAN CONTINUE TO COMMENT OVER THE LUNCH BREAK AND MAKE SURE WE CAPTURE ANYBODY ON THE BACK END.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: IS THAT ACCEPTABLE TO THE CITY OF CLAYTON?

SPEAKER: ABSOLUTELY THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE CAN PROCEED IN THAT FASHION. WE'LL NOW HEAR FROM THE CITY OF CLAYTON REGARDING THEIR PRESENTATION. THEN HAVE STAFF COMMENTS.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE I'M REINA SWARTZ, CITY MANAGER FOR THE CITY OF CLAYTON AND I HAVE LAURA WITH US WHO IS ASSISTING ON THIS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

EFFORT I APPRECIATE STAFF'S EFFORT AS WELL AS ABAG COMMITTEE. WE HAVE FOUR MAJOR AREAS IN OUR REQUEST FOR AN APPEAL. YOU CAN SEE THOSE THERE, AND I WILL JUST GO THROUGH THEM BRIEFLY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE FIRST IS REALLY THE ISSUE OF JOBS AND HOUSING AND LACK OF MULTI-MODAL TRANSPORTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THANKS. SO, CLAYTON IS A SMALL COMMUNITY WITH VERY FEW JOBS AND VERY LITTLE LAND THIS'S DEDICATED TOWARD ANY COMMERCIAL ENDEAVORS IT IS PRIMARILY A RESIDENTIAL COMMUNITY. WHAT THAT MEANS IS THE VAST MAJORITY LEAVE THE COMMUNITY PRIMARILY BY AUTO IN ORDER TO COMMUTE TO A JOB. WHAT THIS MEANS IS THAT WE HAVE RELATIVELY LITTLE TRANSIT, RELATIVELY FEW PEOPLE COMING IN, AND ADDING A SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF HOUSES DOES NOT IMPROVE THE OVERALL BALANCE FOR GREENHOUSE GASSES OR VMT. THIS IS SIMILAR TO WHAT OTHER COMMUNITIES HAVE TALKED ABOUT ALREADY THIS MORNING. WE DO HAVE MINIMUM BUS SERVICE THAT MEETS THAT 30 MINUTE HEADWAY BUT IT DOESN'T SERVE THE DESIRE COMMUNITY AND IT'S QUITE A MINIMAL LEVEL FOR US AND DOESN'T HELP US REALLY CONTRIBUTE TO EFFICIENT DEVELOPMENT WHICH I'LL TALK ABOUT IN A MOMENT. IF I COULD HAVE THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SECOND IS THAT CLAYTON IS NOT IDENTIFIED AS A GROWTH GEOGRAPHY IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. IF YOU LOOK IN THE MIDDLE OF CONTRA COSTA COUNTY IT'S KIND OF AN EMPTY AREA IN THE CENTER WITH NOT A LOT OF ANTICIPATED JOB GROWTH OVER THE PLANNING PERIOD ASSOCIATED WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AS STAFF AS NOTED, CLAYTON IS IDENTIFIED AS A HIGH-RESOURCE AREA

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND SO IT DOES HAVE THAT, THAT IS PART OF THE METHODOLOGY ON WHICH THE HOUSING NUMBERS WERE BASED. BUT IT'S STILL ISN'T A PLACE WHERE WE EXPECT TO SEE A LOT OF JOB GROWTH AND THE IDEA OF REMAINING CONSISTENT WITH THAT UNDER LYING BASIS IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DOES NOT LEND ITSELF WELL TO SIGNIFICANT HOUSING GROWTH IN CLAYTON IF WE ARE TRYING TO KEEP HOUSES AND JOBS CLOSE TO ONE ANOTHER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE THIRD AND ONE OF THE BIGGEST CONCERNS FOR CLAYTON, WHILE WE HAVE HEARD IN THE STAFF'S RESPONSE AND AS IN THE STATUTE AND THE HOUSING ARRANGEMENTS THAT WE SIMPLY CANNOT RELY ON THE PACKET THAT CURRENT LAND USE UNDER OTHER DESIGNATIONS PRECLUDE HOUSING OR DEVELOPMENT FOR HOUSING WE HAVE TO THINK BEYOND THAT IF WE'RE GOING TO MEET THE HOUSING IN OUR COMMUNITIES. HOWEVER, CITIES ALSO HAVE A REQUIREMENT AND A DUTY TO PROTECT RESIDENTS. AND SO WHERE THE RECOMMENDATION IS, WELL, OKAY, YOU HAVE GOT THESE HIGH RISK AREAS, YOU JUST HAVE TO SOMEHOW MITIGATE IT IN ORDER TO HAVE MORE HOUSING THERE OR FIGURE OUT HOW TO BE MORE DENSE ELSEWHERE. AS YOU CAN SEE THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT ON THIS -- I KNOW THIS WAS ON PRELIMINARY DATA BUT MAYBE A THIRD OF THE CITY IS LOCATED IN AN ABATEMENT DISTRICT WE KNOW THIS IS AN AREA PRONE TO SLIDES THERE IS A CONCERN FOR US ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT INCREASING DEVELOPMENT IN THIS AREA WOULD MAKE SENSE. YES WE CAN BE -- WE CAN'T JUST ELIMINATE IT OUT OF HAND BUT BY THE SAME TOKEN IT MAY NOT BE RESPONSIBLE TO DEVELOP IN THOSE AREAS AND THAT'S A HUGE CONCERN FOR US. NEXT SLIDE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PLEASE. THIS IS LAST POINT, THE HAZARD STATEMENT -- I MISSPOKE, THIS IS A GEOLOGIC HAZARD STATEMENT, IT CONTROLS AREAS OF GOLF COURSE AND SOME DEVELOPMENT, A CONCERN FOR YOU US IN TERMS OF DEVELOPMENT. THE CONTRA COSTA WATER DISTRICT CURRENT WATER MANAGEMENT PLAN DOESN'T PLAN FOR THE KIND OF HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT IS ANTICIPATED THROUGH THE NUMBERS, WHILE THE NUMBERS CAN ACCOMMODATE GROWTH IT ISN'T UNDER CLAYTON'S GROWTH IT'S AROUND THE DISTRICT'S CONTROL WE FEEL STRONGLY THERE ISN'T THE ABILITY TO SAY YES WE HAVE THE CAPACITY TO DO THAT FROM A WATER STANDPOINT. NEXT SLIDE. I BELIEVE THAT WAS MY LAST CONTENT SLIDE. BASED ON THE INFORMATION PRESENTED WE HAVE REQUESTED A REDUCTION OF 285 UNITS IN THE RONA ALLOCATION FOR CLAYTON MUCH APPRECIATE THE COMMITTEE'S TIME AND I LOOK FORWARD TO ANSWERING ANY QUESTIONS

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO ASK MTC/ABAG STAFF TO SUBMIT THEIR RESPONSE TO CLAYTON'S APPEAL?

GILLIAN ADAMS: THANK YOU. IF WE COULD PULL UP THE SLIDES, PLEASE? NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE CITY OF CLAYTON IS REQUESTING A REDUCTION OF 285 UNITS WHICH REPRESENTS A REDUCTION OF 50% FROM ITS DRAFT ALLOCATION. STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO DENY THE APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE CITY'S ARGUMENT THAT THE ALLOCATION WILL EXACERBATE JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE CHALLENGES THE FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADOPTED BY THE ABAG PROCESS AND HCD FOUND THAT ABAG METHODOLOGY FURTHERS THE OBJECTIVES. HOUSING ELEMENT LAW REQUIRES THE METHODOLOGY TO IMPROVE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN JOBS AND HOUSING BALANCE NOT JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE IN A PARTICULAR JURISDICTION USING FACTORS RELATED TO JOBS PROGRAM FACTORS MEASURE JOB ACCESS BASED ON COMMUTE SHEDS TO BETTER CAPTURE THE LIVED EXPERIENCE OF RESIDENTS ACCESSING JOBS OUTSIDE OF THEIR JURISDICTION'S BOUNDARIES NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE CITY'S ARGUMENT THAT THE METHODOLOGY DOESN'T FURTHER THE RHNA OBJECTIVE TO FURTHER DEVELOPMENT APPEARANCE CHALLENGES THE RHNA METHODOLOGY WHICH FALLS OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THE APPEALS PROCESS IN DETERMINE OF THE METHODOLOGY HCD DETERMINES RECEIVING [INDISCERNIBLE] ALLOCATES MORE RHNA UNITS TO JURISDICTIONS WITH MORE JOBS. IN ADDITION THE FINAL BLUEPRINT DOES IDENTIFY HIGH-RESOURCE AREA FOR CLAYTON AS SHOWN IN GREEN ON THE MAP HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS ARE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS ARE IDENTIFIED IN THE STATE'S OPPORTUNITY MAP THAT MEET A SERVICE THRESHOLD FOR CLARIFICATION THIS IS BASED ON SERVICE FREQUENCIES ON COUNTY CONNECTION ROUTE TEN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE CITY SITES INFORMATION ON THE SELECTION TOOL BY ABAG IT DOES NOT HAVE SUFFICIENT LAND AVAILABLE TO ACCOMMODATE ITS ALLOCATION AND AS INDICATED THE TOOL SURROUND DEVELOPMENT CONSIDERING DEVELOPMENT CONSTRAINTS IN THE APPEAL BY INCORPORATING THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DEVELOPING THE BLUEPRINT STAFF WORKED WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENTS GATHERING INFORMATION ABOUT LOCAL PLANS AND DEVELOPMENT. [INDISCERNIBLE] ACCESSES FEASIBILITY -- STAFF UNDERSTANDS CLAYTON'S CONCERNS ABOUT NATURAL HAZARDS WITH ONLY A SMALL EXCEPTION HOUSING LAW DOESN'T IDENTIFY AREAS AT RISK OF NATURAL HAZARDS. IMPORTANTLY AS NOTED IN COMMENT LETTER ON APPEALS HOUSING LAW STATES THAT ABAG MAY NOT LIMIT SUITABLE HOUSING SITES TO EXISTING LAND USE RESTRICTIONS AND MUST CONSIDER INCREASED DEVELOPMENT. IN SIMPLE TERMS THIS MEANS HOUSING PLANNING CANNOT BE LIMITED TO VACANT LAND AND COMMUNITIES BUILT-OUT DUE TO OTHER NATURAL CONSTRAINTS SUCH AS FIRE RISK AND FLOOD MUST PLAN FOR HOUSING THROUGH MEANS SUCH AS REZONING COMMERCIAL AREAS AS MIXED USE AREAS AND RUNNING ON VACANT LAND. STAFF UNDERSTANDS CLAYTON'S CONCERNS ABOUT THE DROUGHT CURRENTLY BEING EXPERIENCED IN THE BAY AREA -- HOWEVER -- [INDISCERNIBLE] RHNA PERIOD. THE ARGUMENTS PUT FORTH BY CLAYTON DO NOT MEET THE REQUIREMENTS FOR A VALID RHNA APPEAL ALTHOUGH CLAYTON INDICATES THAT ITS DRAFT ALLOCATION EXCEEDS THE POPULATION GROWTH ASSUMPTIONS IN ITS WATER SERVICE PROVIDERS AND WATER MANAGEMENT PLAN THE CITY HAS NOT DEMONSTRATED ITS PRECLUDED FROM MEETING ITS ALLOCATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE COMMITTEE DENY THE APPEAL BY THE CITY OF CLAYTON. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH MS. ADAMS. WE WOULD LIKE TO GIVE THE CITY OF CLAYTON OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO THE PRESENTATION, IF YOU SO CHOOSE.

REINA SCHWARTZ: JUST A COUPLE OF COMMENTS AND I APPRECIATE STAFF'S WORK ON THIS. I THINK ONE OF THE CHALLENGES FOR ALL OF US IS THE SERIES OF COMPETING OBJECTIVES WE HAVE TO MEET HOUSING, KEEP RESIDENTS SAFE PROMOTE ENVIRONMENTALLY SUSTAINABLE POLICIES ET CETERA, AND THE STRUGGLE IS FOR CLAYTON IS THE RHNA ALLOCATION OF 573 DO WE MAKE THE BEST TRADEOFFS ACROSS THOSE. I WANT TO REITERATE THE IDEA OF HAVING BETTER UTILIZATION OF VACANT LAND OR REUSE OF COMMERCIAL LAND ET CETERA, CLAYTON HAS NO INDUSTRIAL LAND VERY LITTLE COMMERCIAL LAND THERE ISN'T A LOT OF OPPORTUNITY AS THERE IS IN SOME COMMUNITIES TO REUSE THAT LAND FOR HOUSING DEVELOPMENT. SO THAT IS SOMETHING THAT, UNFORTUNATELY, WE DON'T HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO. AND, AS WELL WE WILL CERTAINLY BE CONSIDERING ADDITIONAL DENSITY BUT WE DO HAVE TO TRADE THAT OFF AGAINST WHAT I THINK ARE REASONABLY SIGNIFICANT THREATS DUE TO LAND MOVEMENT. SO, WITH THAT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO OPEN IT UP FOR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE FOR EITHER THE APPELLANT OR STAFF. MAYOR HUDSON?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID E. HUDSON: FOR CLARIFICATION, IF I CAN STAFF, ISSUE ONE PAGE THREE FOURTH BULLET UNDER BATTLE BAG MTC STAFF RESPONSE, AND THIS MAY HELP AS WE GO FURTHER INTO THE APPEALS IT READS HOUSING ELEMENT LAW REQUIRES RHNA METHODOLOGY TO IMPROVE INTRAREGIONAL RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN JOBS AND HOUSING, NOT JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE IN A PARTICULAR JURISDICTION. I'M TRYING TO ENVISION WHAT YOU'RE LOOKING FOR. WOULD THIS BE SOMETHING LIKE CLAYTON'S PROXIMITY TO JOBS IN WALNUT CREEK IN CLAYTON? OR IS THIS, THE REGION IS THE BAY AREA, AND HOW THEY FIT INTO THE WHOLE SCOPE OF THINGS THROUGHOUT THE -- WHAT -- WHAT THE HECK IS INTRAREGIONAL RELATIONSHIP? IS THEY HAVE TO IMPROVE -- WHAT ARE YOU LOOKING FOR THERE? GILLIAN IS LAUGHING AT ME. WHAT ARE YOU LOOKING AT THERE, GILLIAN, I'LL STICK IT ON YOU.

GILLIAN ADAMS: THE STATUTE IS TALKING ABOUT THE REGION AS A WHOLE. SO, HAVE WE --

DAVID E. HUDSON: BAY AREA.

GILLIAN ADAMS: BAY AREA, HAVE WE IMPROVED THE JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE WITHIN THE REGION AS A WHOLE AND I GUESS OUR POINT ABOUT WHAT WE DID IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY IS WE LOOKED AT NOT BY JURISDICTIONAL BOUNDARIES BUT A COMMUTE SHED, WHAT NUMBER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF JOBS YOU CAN ACCESS BY A 30 MINUTE DRIVE OR 45 MINUTE TRANSIT COMMUTE?

DAVID E. HUDSON: THAT WAS THE QUESTION I WAS ASKING, THE INTRAREGION IS, PER SE, ARE THE CONCORD WALNUT CREEK AREA ALSO. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. MAYOR EKLUND?

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU. ONE QUESTION FOR THE APPLICANT. IS THE ABAG RESPONSE INDICATED THAT YOU DID NOT RESPOND TO THE SURVEY? CAN YOU PLEASE HELP ME UNDERSTAND WHY YOU DIDN'T, ESPECIALLY, I BELIEVE YOUR REPRESENTATIVE WAS IN THE LEADERSHIP ROLE. AND KIND OF CURIOUS AS TO WHY.

REINA SCHWARTZ: COUNCILMEMBER PIERCE WAS VERY ACTIVE IN ABAG FOR A LONG TIME UNFORTUNATELY I WASN'T AT THE CITY AT THAT TIME I'M NOT EXACTLY WHY WE DID NOT RESPOND TO THAT. I WANT THERE AT THE TIME. AND I WISH WE HAD. LET ME PUT IT THAT WAY.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR RESPONSE. NO OTHER QUESTIONS. BUT I HAVE A COMMENT AFTER A MOTION IS MADE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: FLIGOR?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NEYSA FLIGOR: MY QUESTION IS FOR STAFF, I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS GILLIAN OR DAVE BUT IT HAS TO DO WITH THE NATURAL HAZARD ARGUMENT RACE RAISED BY CLAYTON, AND I KNOW OTHER JURISDICTIONS HAVE MADE THE SAME ARGUMENT, I UNDERSTAND STAFF'S RESPOND WHETHER OR NOT IT'S SPECIFIC TO CLAYTON OR IF IT'S ACROSS THE BOARD I'M LOOKING IN RESPONSE TO CLAYTON, IS STAFF SAYING, EVEN WITH THOSE IDENTIFIED NATURAL HAZARD AREAS, THERE ARE OTHER SUFFICIENT AVAILABLE LAND AREAS TO BUILD THESE UNITS? OR IS STAFF SAYING THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE THINGS THAT CLAYTON CAN DO TO FORTIFY, OR WHATEVER STEPS THEY NEED TO TAKE, AND CAN BUILD HOUSING IN THESE AREAS THAT THEY ARE CLAIMING ARE NATURAL HAZARD AREAS? >DAVE VAUTIN: HAPPY TO PROVIDE AN INITIAL RESPONSE. AND GILLIAN, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO CHIME IN FURTHER, THAT WILL BE WELCOME. I THINK A COUP OF POINTS ON THIS HAZARD TOPIC. WE ACKNOWLEDGE THERE IS HAZARD RICH REGIONS, WILDFIRES EARTHQUAKES SEA LEVEL RISE, FLOODING WE CAN TALK ABOUT OTHER REGIONS BUT EVERY REGION HAS SOME, SORT OF, HAZARD INCLUDED WITHIN EACH JURISDICTION THERE ARE AREAS THAT ARE COMP REASONABLY LOWER AND HIGHER FIRE HAZARD LOCATIONS AS JURISDICTIONS ARE DEVELOPING THIS HOUSING ELEMENT THAT IS A KEY LAYER THAT NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED IN SITE SELECTION, THAT'S A JURISDICTION SPECIFIC RESPONSIBLE. RISK AND HAZARD ARE DIFFERENT CONCEPTS. THERE ARE HAZARDS THAT EXIST BUT WE CAN WORK TO MITIGATE RISKS THROUGH SPECIFIC POLICIES AND STRATEGIES. WE HAVE INCORPORATED SOME OF THOSE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STRATEGIES INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THOSE HAZARDS AND REDUCE THE RISK AND IT'S ALSO INCUMBENT ON THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AS WEIGHING TRADEOFFS FOR SPECIFIC SITES TO BE THINKING ABOUT STRATEGY AT THE LOCAL LEVEL TO REDUCE RISKS DEPENDING ON WHAT SITES ARE SELECTED. GILLIAN DID YOU WANT TO ADD ANYTHING TO THAT CONTEXT?

GILLIAN ADAMS: I THINK I WOULD SAY IT'S A MIX, AS DAVE SAID, YOU MIGHT CHOOSE A LOCAL JURISDICTION IN YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT TO AVOID CERTAIN LOCATIONS AND YOU MIGHT SITE HOUSING IN THOSE LOCATIONS AND ADOPT POLICIES TO TRY TO MITIGATE OR HARDEN THE HOUSING THAT'S BUILT THERE. AND I WOULD SAY FROM THE RHNA PERSPECTIVE AND APPEALS, IN PARTICULAR HOUSING LAW DOESN'T SAY NATURAL HAZARDS ARE A CONSTRAINT TO HOUSING THAT'S PART OF THE PERSPECTIVE THAT WE'RE BRINGING TO OUR RESPONSES.

NEYSA FLIGOR: THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

BELIA RAMOS: THANK YOU. ALONG THE SAME LINES AS THE COMMENTS, OR THE QUESTIONS OF FLIGOR, I WOULD JUST ADD, FOR PURPOSES OF FOLLOW UP AND LISTS STAFF IS KEEPING THE COUNTY OF NAPA DID SEND A LETTER EXPRESSING CONCERN THERE ARE TWO SEPARATE ISSUES, RHNA ALLOCATION AND HOW THAT METHODOLOGY WAS APPLIED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO THE JURISDICTION. SEPARATELY FROM THAT, HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS, ALTHOUGH THEY INFORMED THAT RHNA ALLOCATION PROCESS, THAT IS NOT THE FORUM. I PERSONALLY, IN FACT, HAVE RAISED CONCERNS WITH HOW HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS WERE NOT -- DO NOT APPEAR TO TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION RISKS, HAZARD, AND OTHER FACTORS. BUT THAT'S A SEPARATE CONVERSATION. I THINK THAT'S FOR STAFF'S LIST WHEN IT COME TO THE METHODOLOGY THAT WAS ADOPTED BY RHNA AND THE QUESTION BEFORE US, IN FACT, IS BASE ON THAT APPROVED METHODOLOGY, WAS IT APPLIED CORRECTLY AND WHETHER ANY OF THESE ISSUES RAISED ON APPEAL ARE VALID POINTS. SO, I JUST -- I WANT TO SEPARATE THAT OUT FOR PURPOSES IT SEEMS LIKE WE KEEP RETURNING TO THE SAME SUBJECT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. AS WE DISCUSSED WE'RE ARE GOING TO GO TO MAYOR ROMERO. BEFORE I GO TO MAYOR ROMERO, AS I DISCUSSED AFTER THIS INITIAL ROUND OF QUESTIONS, WE'RE GOING TO TAKE OUR LUNCH BREAK THEN COME BACK AND DO A PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THE CLAYTON APPEAL

CARLOS ROMERO: I DROPPED MY HAND. I WAS GOING TO MAKE A MOTION, BUT NOT UNTIL AFTER LUNCH.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE NEED TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. MS. KANE?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

KATHLEEN KANE: THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF THERE IS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT CURRENTLY HERE AND WANTS TO COMMENT THEN IT MAY BE BETTER USE OF THEIR TIME TO LET THEM DO THAT, AS LONG AS WE MAKE SURE WE CHECK IN AFTER LUNCH AS WELL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES TO COMMENT ON THE CITY OF CLAYTON'S APPEAL? IF SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING IN. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME ON THE CITY OF CLAYTON APPEAL? I DO NOT SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. SO, WITH THAT WE CAN BREAK FOR LUNCH. I WOULD SUGGEST A 30-MINUTE LUNCH BREAK. SO WE'LL BE BACK AT 12:30.

DAVID E. HUDSON: CAN WE MAKE IT 45? I WOULD LIKE TO GO HOME AND CHANGE JESSE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE'LL DO 45.

DAVID E. HUDSON: THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE'LL BE BACK IN 45 MINUTES AT WHICH TIME, WE CAN FINISH THE CLAYTON APPEAL AND THEN MOVE ON TO THE REST OF THE APPEALS. THANK YOU ALL.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CARLOS ROMERO: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. [LUNCH BREAK] MEETING WILL RESUME AT 12:14. [MEETING WILL RESUME SHORTLY] [MEETING WILL RESUME SHORTLY]

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. IT'S 12:15 OUR 45 MINUTE BREAK HAS ELAPSES AND THE ABAG COMMITTEE IS NOW BACK IN SESSION. BEFORE WE WENT ON OUR LUNCH BREAK, WE HAD HEARD FROM THE CITY OF CLAYTON, AS WELL AS STAFF'S RESPONSE, AND HAD SOME INITIAL DISCUSSION. SO WE WOULD NOW LIKE TO TURN TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE RHNA APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF CLAYTON. IF ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE RHNA APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF CLAYTON, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND, IF YOU ARE ON THE ZOOM PLATFORM OR PLEASE STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING IN.

SPEAKER: I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE AN ERR YOUR I MADE IN MY PUBLIC COMMENT ON DUBLIN, AS MAYOR HUDSON POINTED OUT, I CAN GET IT BACKWARD BUT I AGREE WITH ALL THE REASONS THAT STAFF POINTED OUT FOR DENYING THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE RHNA APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF CLAYTON, IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. MR. CASTRO I DON'T SEE ANY ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WRITTEN COMMENTS AND NO RAISED HAND.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THAT'S IT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. TIME FOR THE COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS AND POTENTIALLY TAKE ACTION ON THE APPEAL WE WILL BE TAKING PRELIMINARY ACTION AT THE FINAL ACTION. MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL TO SUPPORT STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DENY THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR EKLUND MAKES THE MOTION TO DENY THE APPEAL. IS THERE A SECOND? I WILL SECOND THE MOTION.

PAT ECKLUND: AND I HAVE COMMENTS, AS WELL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YOU ARE RECOGNIZED, MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MAYOR ARREGUIN, AND PRESIDENT. FIRST OF ALL, WE ALREADY TALKED ABOUT THE LOCAL SURVEY, SO I THINK THAT'S ON THE LIST. I THINK THAT THE OTHER ISSUE THAT WE NEED TO PUT ON THE LIST, BECAUSE IT IS APPLICABLE TO OTHER APPLICANTS, AS WELL, THAT WE HAVE NOT YET NECESSARILY HEARD FROM, IS THAT NATURAL HAZARDS, NOT ONLY FOR, JUST ALL NATURAL HAZARDS, I THINK THAT WE NEED TO HAVE A DISCUSSION WITH HCD AND/OR THE LEGISLATURE THAT SOMEHOW WE NEED TO FACTOR IN NATURAL HAZARDS IN FIGURING OUT THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STATEWIDE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION AND DISTRIBUTION. NOT ONLY FOR FIRE -- AND I WOULD SAY VERY HIGH FIRE RISK, AS WELL A HIGH FIRE RISK, WHICH WE'LL TALK ABOUT LATER, BUT ALSO OTHER HAZARDS, LIKE HILLSIDES AND STUFF LIKE THAT, BUT I THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE FACTORS THAT COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENT CAN FACTOR INTO, AS WE DEVELOP THE METHODOLOGY. AND I THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE ON THE LIST, BIG-TIME. BECAUSE WE DO HAVE NATURAL HAZARDS, YOU KNOW, SEA LEVEL RISE, AND ALL THAT OTHER KIND OF STUFF THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THAT REALLY NEEDS TO BE FACTORED IN, IN A THOUGHTFUL MANNER, BUT IT NEEDS TO BE -- WE NEED TO HAVE LEGISLATION THAT ALLOWS FOR THAT, I BELIEVE, OR HCD COULD DO IT, I'M NOT SURE IF HCD HAS THE AUTHORITY OR NOT. THAT'S THE ONE COMMENT THAT I WANTED TO ADD TO THE LIST, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, HOPEFULLY WE'LL GET SUPPORT TO DO THAT AS WELL. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ON THE MOTION? IF SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. OKAY. SEEING NONE ADDITIONAL COMMENTS. THE MOTION IS TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE RHNA APPEAL FROM THE CITY OF CLAYTON. ONCE AGAIN, UNLESS THERE IS ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION, I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION BY EKLUND. SECOND BY ARREGUIN. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK YOU, THE CITY OF CLAYTON FOR YOUR THOUGHTFUL PRESENTATION AND APPEAL. THIS IS CHALLENGING FOR EVERY JURISDICTION IN THE BAY AREA. I JUST WANT TO EMPHASIZE THE RESOURCES THAT ABAG HAS AND WILL CONTINUE TO PROVIDE LOCAL GOVERNMENT JURISDICTIONS AS WE WORK TO IMPLEMENT OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS AND I AGREE WITH MANY OF THE COMMENTS THAT ARE MADE WE GOT TO LOOK CAREFULLY AT NATURAL HAZARDS, PARTICULARLY AS WE, NOT ONLY AS HOUSING ELEMENTS ARE DEVELOPED, BUT IN THE NEXT CYCLE, THAT, PARTICULARLY, GIVEN THE IMPACTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE WHICH ARE MORE CATASTROPHIC NOW THAN EVER WE ARE HERE TO SUPPORT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AS WE'RE DOING THE WORK OF UPDATING OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS AND PROVIDING RESOURCES IN BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND PROVIDING INFRASTRUCTURE AS NEEDED. THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. WITH THAT, WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM E, A REPORT ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION APPEAL FOR THE TOWN OF DANVILLE. AND THIS IS PRELIMINARY ACTION ITEM. FIRST WE'LL HEAR FROM THE TOWN OF DANVILLE REGARDING THEIR APPEAL. THEY WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT. WHO WILL PRESENTING ON BEHALF OF THE TOWN OF DANVILLE?

RENEE MORGAN: THAT WOULD BE MYSELF.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WELCOME.

RENEE MORGAN: I'M DANVILLE MAYOR'S RENE MORGAN AND ON BEHALF OF OUR TOWN COUNCIL I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE COMMITTEE FOR THE TIME AND OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE THE APPEAL. TAI WILL BE PRESENTING. AND WE'RE AVAILABLE FOR ANY QUESTIONS. THANK YOU. I WILL NOW TURN OVER TO TAI.

TAI WILLIAMS: THANK YOU. THIS CENTERS AROUND THREE POINTS THAT YOU SEE ON THE SLIDE. THERE HAS BEEN A MODELING ERROR, SECOND IS THAT THE PROCESS OF ALLOCATING RHNA MAY NOT HAVE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION A NUMBER OF LOCAL PLANNING FACTORS THAT HAS REGIONAL IMPACTS AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST WE BELIEVE THERE IS SIGNIFICANT AND UNFORESEEN CIRCUMSTANCE THAT MERITS CONSIDERATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TO THE FIRST POINT, WE'RE KNOW THAT THE MODEL SENDS MUCH OF THE RHNA ALLOCATION TO THE FOUR GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES THAT WERE SHOWN ON THIS SLIDE ONE OF WHICH IS A LOCALLY NOMINATED PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREA OR PDA CONCEPTUALLY IT MAKES COMPLETE SENSE, THE CHALLENGE FOR DANVILLE UNFORTUNATELY IS THAT WE DON'T HAVE A LOCALLY ADOPTED PDAS, AND I THINK THAT THE CONFUSION ARISES FROM THE FACT THAT ABOUT A DECADE AGO, WE DID, IN FACT, INITIATE THE PROCESS OF TRYING TO FORM ONE. BUT WE HAD TO PAUSE THAT FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS, AND FOR MANY YEARS, OUR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LITTLE GEOGRAPHY IN THERE SHOWS THAT WE HAVE A POTENTIAL PDA, AND IT WASN'T REALLY UNTIL RECENTLY, TOWARD THE END OF THIS ENTIRE RHNA PROCESS, THAT WE THOUGHT TO REALLY ZOOM IN ON THIS MAP, AND IF YOU CAN GET TO THE POINT NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE, THAT WE NOTICED THAT OUR GEOGRAPHY IS NO LONGER POTENTIAL, BUT SHOWN AS AN ACTUAL PDA. SO, CONFUSION ASIDE, I THINK THE FACT REMAINS THAT DANVILLE HAS NEVER TAKEN STEP TWO OF A TWO-STEP MANDATORY PROCESS TO ADOPT A LOCALLY MANDATED PDA, AND CONSEQUENTLY IF THE MODEL IS SENDING GROWTH TO A GROWTH GEOGRAPHY THAT DOES NOT EXIST, WE ASK THAT THE COMMITTEE CONSIDER THAT AS A MERIT BASIS FOR OUR APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TO THE SECOND POINT, THE TOWN BELIEVES THAT THE RHNA ALLOCATION PROCESS FAILED TO CONSIDER LOCAL PLANNING FACTORS THAT HAVE REGIONAL IMPLICATIONS LOCALLY YOU CAN SEE ON THE SLIDE THAT THE JOBS BALANCE RATIO IS FALLING BEHIND THOSE OF THE COUNTY AND FAR BEHIND THOSE OF THE ENTIRE REGION AND DEFINITELY BELOW THAT OF THE 1.5 RATIO ADVOCATED BY THE HOME BUILDING'S ASSOCIATION. BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY, AND ACCUMULATIVE, NEXT SLIDE PLEASE, WE BELIEVE THAT ASSIGNING HIGH RHNA ALLOCATION UNITS TO SUBURBAN EDGES OF A METROPOLITAN REGION WOULD ONLY EXACERBATE NOT REDUCE A LONG COMMUTE THAT ARE SHOWN ON THE RED THIN LINES, TO THE MAJOR JOB CENTERS ILLUSTRATED BY THE BRIGHT YELLOW POINT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THOSE JOB CENTERS ARE LOCATION WHERE IS WE KNOW, BECAUSE ABAG HAS SHARED IT WITH US, IN PRIOR YEARS THAT, WE HAVE AN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

EXISTING GAP BETWEEN JOBS AND HOUSING PRODUCTION. AND SO THIS UNDERSCORES THE POINTS AND THE CONCERNS RAISED BY EARLIER SPEAKERS, AND WE WOULD COMPLETELY SUPPORT THAT, THAT, YOU KNOW, MUCH OF THIS ALLOCATION PROCESS WORKS AGAINST SOME OF THE OTHER STATUTORY MANDATES AND OBJECTIVES THAT WE HAVE AS STEWARDS OF OUR COMMUNITIES AND LANDS TO ENSURE THAT THERE ARE CERTAIN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTIONS. LAST SLIDE, PLEASE. AND SO LASTLY, WHILE IT'S NOT UNIQUE TO DANVILLE, WE DO FEEL IT'S IMPORTANT TO ASK THE QUESTION ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT OUR WATER SERVICE PROVIDERS IS ABLE TO SERVE THE TREMENDOUSLY EXTRAORDINARY NEW GROWTH THAT HAS BEEN ASSIGNED TO US, ACCUMULATIVE AND COLLECTIVELY BY OUR STATE. WE WOULD LIKE TO CONCLUDE OUR PRESENTATION BY RECOGNIZING THAT THE COMMITTEE'S TASK IS BY NO STRETCH AN EASY ONE, AND THAT THERE IS, INDEED, A NEED FOR MORE HOUSING. DANVILLE ACKNOWLEDGES THAT, BUT WE ADVANCE THE MOTION THAT THE MAGNITUDE OF THE UNITS ASSIGNED TO THE COMMUNITIES AT THE URBAN FRINGE AND UNDERSERVED TRANSIT MAY NOT SERVE OUR OTHER HIGH PRIORITY OBJECT I THE FOR THE CITY AND STATE. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION AND WE'RE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK MTC STAFF IF THEY CAN PRESENT IN RESPONSE TO THE CITY OF DANVILLE'S APPEAL?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: THE TOWN OF DANVILLE IS REQUESTING REDUCTION OF 1,141 TO 1,641 UNITS WHICH REPRESENTS A REDUCTION TO SCORE TO 73% FROM THEIR DRAFT ALLOCATION. IN STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO DENY THE APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, AS YOU JUST HEARD, THE TOWN ARGUES THAT THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT, INCORRECTLY INCLUDES A PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREA OR PDA IN DANVILLE HOWEVER DANVILLE FORMALLY AUTHORIZED THIS PDA IN 2012 BYPASSING AN OFFICIAL RESOLUTION. MTC/ABAG STAFF RECOMMENDED THE PDA FOR APPROVAL DURING THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MARCH 2012 MEETING PENDING INFORMATION REGARDING TRANSIT SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS DANVILLE STAFF PROVIDED THE REQUIRED INFORMATION RESULTING IN THE FORMAL INCLUSION OF THE PDA IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2013 AND THIS PDA HAS BEEN INCLUDED IN ALL PREVIOUS REGIONAL PLANS IN ADDITION PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPORTANTLY A POTENTIAL PDA JUST MEANS THE LOCAL JURISDICTION ITSELF HAS NOT DONE THE PLANNING FOR THE AREA BUT IT'S STILL OFFICIAL GEOGRAPHY IN TERMS OF ORIGINAL PLANS. PROVIDES NO DOCUMENTATION OF REQUEST TO ABAG TO REMOVE THE PDA OVER THE COURSE OF THE ORIGINAL PLANS OTHER JURISDICTIONS HAVE MADE SUCH REQUEST TO REMOVE PDAS BUT HOWEVER WE HAVE NOT RECEIVED ONE FROM DANVILLE. THEREAFTER THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT CORRECTLY INCLUDES DANVILLE GEOGRAPHY. THE METHODOLOGY USES JURISDICTIONS JOBS/HOUSING RELATIONSHIP BY INCORPORATING THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION. THE METHODOLOGY INCLUDES HALF OF THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

REGION'S RHNA USING FACTORS RELATED TO JOBS/HOUSING PROXIMITY. AND CAPTURES LIVED EXPERIENCE OF FOLKS IN THIS REGION MANY OF WHOM ACCESS JOBS OUTSIDE OF THEIR JURISDICTION. THE RENE DANVILLE CLAIMS THE METHODOLOGY DOESN'T CONSIDER THE AVAILABILITY OF LAND SUITABLE FOR HOUSING BUT AS STATED EARLIER THE FINAL BLUEPRINT INCLUDES INFORMATION FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ABOUT LOCAL PLANS. THE STATUTE FORBIDS ABAG FROM LIMITING CONSIDERATIONS OF SUITABLE HOUSING SITES TO JURISDICTIONS EXISTING ZONING AND LAND USE RESTRICTIONS. DANVILLE STATES -- -- THAT ABAG FAILED TO CONSIDER THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 GROWTH DISTRIBUTION AND OPPORTUNITIES TO MAXIMIZE TRANSIT USE, BUT THE RHNA METHODOLOGY CONSIDERS THESE FACTORS DIRECTLY BY INCORPORATING THE FORECASTED DEVELOPMENT PATTERN FROM THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT OF THE BASELINE ALLOCATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. DANVILLE ARGUES THE RHNA METHODOLOGY DOES NOT FURTHER THE STATUTORY OBJECTIVE RELATED TO OFFICIAL DEVELOPMENT APPEARANCE IN GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION AND DANVILLE CLAIMS THE METHODOLOGY DOES NOT AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR HOUSING BUT AS DISCUSSED TODAY THIS ARGUMENT CHALLENGES THE FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY THAT HAS BEEN ADOPTED BY ABAG AND HCD IN CHALLENGING THE METHODOLOGY ITSELF FALLS OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THE PROCESS. HCD HAS THE AUTHORITY TO DETERMINE IF THE RHNA METHODOLOGY AND STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND HCD FOUND THAT AT THE OF RHNA METHODOLOGY DOES FURTHER THE OBJECTIVES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. DANVILLE REPRESENTS A

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SIGNIFICANT UNFORESEEN CIRCUMSTANCE MERITING REVISION OF ITS RHNA BUT WE HAVE DISCUSSED STATUTE DEFINITIONS OF WATER SUPPLY CONSTRAINTS THAT PRECLUDE JURISDICTIONS FROM PROVIDING NECESSARY INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT DURING THE RHNA STAFF VERY MUCH UNDERSTANDS THE CONCERNS ABOUT THE CURRENT DROUGHT BUT THE ARGUMENTS DO NOT MEET THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE VALID RHNA APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE. ALLOCATION APPEAL EXPLICITLY NOTES THESE ARGUMENTS ARE NOT VALID BASIS FOR THE APPEAL WE HAVE ADDRESSED THESE ARGUMENTS IN DETAIL IN A WRITTEN RESPONSE BUT THERE IS NOT TIME TO GO OVER THEM IN THIS PRESENTATION. STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE COMMITTEE DENY DANVILLE'S APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. NOW WE WILL GIVE DANVILLE OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO STAFF'S PRESENTATION IF YOU SO CHOOSE.

SPEAKER: I THING WE WOULD LIKE TO CLARIFY IS THE CONFUSION WITH REGARD TO THE PROCESS WITH REGARD TO PDAS. IT IS CLEAR TO US THAT IN ORDER TO CREATE A LOCALLY NOMINATED PDA, WE NEEDED TO HAVE COMPLETED A TWO-STEP PROCESS. I BELIEVE IT'S STILL ON THE ABAG WEB SITE. SO TO THE POINT THAT WAS MADE EARLIER IF WE DIDN'T COMPLETELY STEP NUMBER TWO, WE WEREN'T UNDER THE IMPRESSION WE NEEDED TO TAKE THE EXTRA STEP TO FORMALLY WITHDRAW.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. THANK YOU. DOES THE MAYOR OR ANY OTHER REPRESENTATIVES OF THE TOWN OF DANVILLE LIKE TO OFFER ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS?

SPEAKER: I THINK THAT WE HAVE PRETTY MUCH WELL REPRESENTED THAT. DAVID, DID YOU HAVE ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO MAKE? AND/OR JOE? OKAY. TAI? OKAY.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WELL, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, MAYOR EKLUND, BEFORE I GO TO YOU, I'M GOING TO OPEN UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. IF THAT'S APPROPRIATE. SO, THAT COMPLETES THE PRESENTATIONS. WE'LL NOW OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE RHNA APPEAL FROM THE TOWN OF DANVILLE, IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK ON THE APPEAL, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. IF YOU ARE ON THE ZOOM PLATFORM, OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING INTO OUR MEETING. ONCE AGAIN, I'LL ASK IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE RHNA APPEAL FROM THE TOWN OF DANVILLE, IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS, MR. CASTRO.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO RAISED HANDS, NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM, THERE WERE PUBLIC COMMENTS SUBMITTED AFTER THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD THOSE WERE POST THE ONLINE AND E-MAILED TO THE COMMITTEE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. WE'LL TAKE COMMITTEE DISCUSSION.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU MAYOR ARREGUIN. MY QUESTION IS TO STAFF, SINCE THE PDA WAS APPROVED IN 2013, SINCE THEN, THOUGH, HAS THERE BEEN -- HAVE WE EVER SENT A LETTER TO THEIR CITIES THAT HAVE NOT DONE THE" SECOND STEP" TO FIND OUT IF THEY'RE STILL SUPPORTIVE OF THAT PDA? BECAUSE YOU CAN IMAGINE FROM 2013 TO 2020 -- YOU KNOW, THAT SEVEN YEARS, SO YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE CHANGES IN STAFF, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE CHANGES IN THE ELECTED OFFICIALS, AND SO A LOT OF TIMES, THOSE KINDS OF THINGS ARE LOST. SO, HAS ABAG OR -- HAS ABAG ACTUALLY SENT THE LETTER TO DANVILLE IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE ASKING THEM THAT THEY WANT TO CONTINUE WITH THE PDA FOR THIS 2050 PLANNED BAY AREA? >DAVE VAUTIN: I'M HAPPY TO TAKE THIS QUESTION. I CAN'T RECALL A SPECIFIC LETTER WHERE WE WOULD GO AND ASK IF THAT I WANT TO KEEP A PDA, HOWEVER, WE HAVE, THROUGH OUR PROCESSES, ANALYZED ALL THE PDAS, LOOKED AT AND SURVEYED JURISDICTIONS ABOUT WHETHER THEY HAVE COMPLETED THE REQUIRED PLANNING WORK I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE REQUIREMENT OF A PLAN IS NOT A PREREQUISITE TO ESTABLISH THE PDA BUT CERTAINLY ONCE THE PDA IS ESTABLISHED THAT IN THE YEARS AHEAD A JURISDICTION IS EXPECTED TO COMPLETE THE LOCAL PLAN. AS PART OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS, WE IDENTIFIED A SMALL -- A RELATIVELY SMALL MINORITY OF ALL PDAS THAT STILL LACK THOSE SORTS OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOCAL PLANS, AND IN FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050'S IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, THERE IS A SPECIFIC IMPLEMENTATION ACTION TO GET ALL THOSE PDAS WITH A LOCAL PLAN BY 2025. AND, IN FACT, THE RECENT FUNDING, THE VARIOUS HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FUNDING IS HELPING TO CLOSE THAT GAP AND FUND MANY OF THE REMAINING PDA PLANS IN THE REGION ULTIMATELY IT'S A JURISDICTION'S RESPONSIBILITY TO REQUEST IF THAT I WANT A PDA REMOVED TO CONTACT US IT'S SOMETHING THAT WAS APPROVED BY THE BOARD, THIS SPECIFIC PDA, AND IT'S BEEN INCLUDED IN MAPS AS MENTIONED FOR EVERY SINGLE PLANNED BAY AREA ITERATION, MULTIPLE ITERATIONS OF THE DRAFT OF THE PLAN AND MULTIPLE GEOGRAPHIES HAVE BEEN ADOPTED FOR THIS BY THE BOARD THREE TIMES.

PAT ECKLUND: I HAVE A COMMENT. JESSE DID YOU WANT ME TO WAIT UNTIL THE COMMENT PERIOD TO COMMENT ON THAT? I'LL WAIT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: NO. PLEASE PROCEED.

PAT ECKLUND: DAVE, I THINK THAT THERE MAY BE SOME VALUE TO HAVING ABAG MTC STAFF DO, MAYBE, AN INTERN FOR A FEW MONTHS WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT. BECAUSE, I HAVE TO TELL YOU THAT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS JUST DO NOT HAVE ENOUGH STAFF TO KEEP ON TOP OF REGIONAL PLANS, LIKE THIS, ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU HAVE, YOU KNOW, POTENTIAL STAFF CHANGES, ELECTED OFFICIAL CHANGES, AND THERE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IS A LOT OF MOVEMENT, ESPECIALLY NOW, DUE TO COVID, A LOT OF ELECTED OFFICIALS ARE RESIGNING, SAME WITH APPOINTED STAFF. SO I REALLY THINK IT'S UNFORTUNATE THAT THE ABAG, WE DIDN'T ASK -- I KNOW THIS WAS A QUESTION THAT I HAD BEEN ASKING AT THE REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE FOR A LONG TIME, IS THAT, YOU KNOW, HOW DO WE COMMUNICATE AND VALIDATE THAT THAT JURISDICTION STILL WANTS TO PROCEED WITH THAT. SO, I THINK THAT THIS MAY HAVE BEEN A MISSED OPPORTUNITY. AND MAYBE IT'S A FAULT, PROBABLY OF BOTH, ABAG MTC, AS WELL AS DANVILLE BUT ANYWAY, I JUST -- I WILL HAVE IN COMMENTS ON THIS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR US TO PUT IN THE LIST. IT'S REALLY UNFORTUNATE BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY 2013 TO 2020. THAT'S A LOT OF YEARS. SO WE HAD LOTS OF OPPORTUNITY, BUT SO DID DANVILLE TOO. THANKS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. MAYOR HUDSON?

DAVID E. HUDSON: I THINK YOU MIGHT WANT TO CLARIFY SOMETHING. I DON'T THINK TAI WILLIAMS IS GOING TO GET TO SPEAK AGAIN. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I WANTED TO BRING TO EVERYBODY ATTENTION, THAT THE APPEAL BY THE TOWN OF DANVILLE IS NOT TO REDUCE THE RHNA ALLOCATION BY 1441 UNITS TO 1641 UNITS. IT'S SOMEWHERE BETWEEN 1441 AND 1641 TO BE BETWEEN 60800. IT ISN'T EXACTLY CLEAR THERE. I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO MAKE A DIFFERENCE. PROBABLY THE ANSWER TO THE QUESTION THAT PAT'S BEEN ASKING IS, IS IT REALLY GOING TO MAKE A DIFFERENCE WHETHER OR NOT THERE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IS A PDA IN DANVILLE TO THE NUMBER THEY WERE ALLOTTED? AND I'M NOT SURE, FROM WHAT I HAVE BEEN HEARING TODAY, IF THAT MADE A DIFFERENCE, DAVE, WHETHER OR NOT THE PDA WAS, OR WASN'T -- WAS THAT SPECIFICALLY TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT WHEN THE NUMBER OF THERE? AND IF IT'S TAKEN AWAY, IT MAKES A DIFFERENCE. >DAVE VAUTIN: BOARD MEMBER HUDSON, THAT'S AN EXCELLENT QUESTION. LET ME ADDRESS IT HERE. FIRST OF ALL THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WERE LOCATED WHERE ADOPTED WHERE JOG FEES AND STRATEGIES WERE APPLIED IN THOSE LOCATION IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SO IT DOES MATTER WHAT GEOGRAPHIES ARE ON THE MAP HOWEVER THE BOARD APPROVED A GROWTH GEOGRAPHY DEFINITION THAT SAID A JURISDICTION THAT HAS IDENTIFIED PDAS IN AT LEAST 50% OF THEIR PDA ELIGIBLE LANDS WOULD NOT HAVE ADDITIONAL TRANSIT-RICH AREAS OR HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS ADDED TO THEIR GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. SO FOR A JURISDICTION LIKE DANVILLE REMOVING THE PDA MAY HAVE TRIGGERED THE CREATION OF NEW GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN THE SIMILAR LOCATION TO THEIR DOWNTOWN DANVILLE PDA NOT TO SAY THAT IT HAS NO IMPACT, BUT IN FACT, IF DANVILLE IN THE FUTURE ENDED UP REMOVING THAT PDA FOR A FUTURE ITERATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA IT MAY LEAD TO NEW GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES BEING REGIONALLY IDENTIFIED IN THEIR JURISDICTION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR HUDSON, DO YOU HAVE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID E. HUDSON: NO. I LOWERED MY HAND. I GOT IT. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. SO I'LL ASK TAI, I'LL ASK YOU A QUESTION, BECAUSE AT THIS JUNCTURE, WE'RE JUST ASKING QUESTIONS. IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE YOU WOULD LIKE TO ADD? I WILL GIVE THE OPPORTUNITY BECAUSE YOU WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT.

TAI WILLIAMS: THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. I WANT TO THANK -- THE QUESTIONS THEY HAVE BEEN ASKED, I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THAT FOR A SMALL COMMUNITY WITH TWO PLANNERS IT IS DIFFICULT FOR US TO MAINTAIN AND MONITOR ALL MAPS. I WILL SHARE WITH YOU THAT, ANY OPPORTUNITY THAT WE HAVE HAD TO COME ACROSS THEM, WE DO TRY TO CHECK THEM WHICH IS PRESENTATION, I HAVE ATTEMPTED TO CHECK IT AND SPECIFICALLY I WANT TO SHARE RECENTLY THE OBAG GRANTS THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED ARE IN THE CATEGORY OF THOSE THAT ARE GRANTED TO CITIES WITHOUT PDAS THAT'S WHY WE BELIEVE AND WERE UNDER THE IMPRESSION THAT WE DO NOT HAVE A PDA, SO ALL OF THAT CONFUSION ASIDE IS THE REASON WHY WE RAISED THE ISSUE AND WE WOULD GREATLY APPRECIATE A MUCH MORE OPEN DIALOGUE WITH OUR ABAG PARTNERS ABOUT THESE REGIONAL PLANS. WE, YOU KNOW, IT -- YOU KNOW, TIES BACK TO THE COMMENTS ABOUT THE SURVEYS EARLIER. THE SURVEYS, WE REALIZE AFTER THE FACT ARE CRITICALLY IMPORTANT TO THIS PROCESS BUT WHEN WE'RE TRYING TO DIVIDE UP HOW MUCH TIME WE SPEND, TWO PLANNERS SPEND ON EVERYTHING IT'S

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NOT NECESSARILY SOMETHING THAT RISES TO THE TOP OF OUR PRIORITY LIST. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO AUGMENT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. MAYOR ROMERO

CARLOS ROMERO: QUESTION TO STAFF ABOUT THE PDA, I BELIEVE THE REPORT ITSELF DOES MENTION THAT THE CITY DID RELY ON THE PDA DETERMINATION FOR A PREVIOUS APPLICATION, OR AT LEAST THIS SUBMISSION OF A PREVIOUS APPLICATION. IS THAT CORRECT? OR AM I RECALLING INCORRECTLY?

GILLIAN ADAMS: IT IS OUR UNDERSTANDING THAT THE TOWN DID RECEIVE OBAG FUNDING BASED ON THE INCLUSION OF THE PDA. HOWEVER, I DON'T KNOW THE DETAILS OF THE SPECIFIC OBAG FUNDING SOURCE OR TYPE OF FUNDING THIS -- THAT THEY RECEIVED.

SPEAKER: I CAN ANSWER THAT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: COLLEAGUES, IT'S IN ORDER FOR US TO TAKE PRELIMINARY ACTION. ARE THERE ANY ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS? INFORMATION NEEDED? OR IS THERE A MOTION? MAYOR EKLUND

PAT ECKLUND: MAYOR ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT, I THINK THAT. AI WILLIAMS SAID THAT SHE COULD ANSWER THAT QUESTION THEY GOT FROM OBAG FUNDING. I THINK WE WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM HER.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THAT'S A QUESTION OF IT AI?

PAT ECKLUND: YES. IT'S A QUESTION TAI.

SPEAKER: THERE ARE TWO POTS 70% DEDICATED TO CITIES WITH A PDA OR PROJECTS PROXIMITY TO PDA THERE IS A PROXIMITY POT FOR ALLOWANCE OF CITIES WITHOUT PDAS OR POSSIBLE PDAS TO COMPETE FOR WE HAVE THE BENEFIT THAT FELL INTO THE 30% OBAG POT WHICH MEANS WE DON'T HAVE A PDA AND THE OTHER ONE THAT HUDSON MENTIONED IS THE PROJECTS WITH PROSPECTS, BECAUSE OF THAT -- -- ARE USED TO VALIDATE WHETHER OR NOT WE THOUGHT WE HAD A PDA.

PAT ECKLUND: SO WITH THAT THEN I WILL MOVE THAT WE APPROVE -- MAKE AN INTERIM DECISION TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DENY THE APPEAL. AND IF I GET A SECOND, THEN I'LL MAKE SOME COMMENTS, AS WELL.

CARLOS ROMERO: I SECOND THE MOTION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR EKLUND?

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. OBVIOUSLY, I THINK VERY STRONGLY -- I COULDN'T AGREE WITH THE MAYOR, RENEE, AS WELL AS TAI WE'RE A SMALL CITY, WE JUST DO NOT HAVE THE BANDWIDTH AT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE STAFF LEVEL TO KEEP UP WITH ALL OF THE REGIONAL AGENCIES. AND I WISH THAT WE COULD JUST GET ONE STAFF PERSON JUST TO, IN EVERY SINGLE SMALL CITY JUST TO FOLLOW WHAT THE REGIONAL AGENCIES ARE DOING BUT WE DON'T HAVE THAT CAPABILITY SO I REALLY THINK THAT THE REGIONAL AGENCIES HAVE TO WORK A LITTLE BIT HARDER TO REACH OUT TO THE LOCAL AGENCIES AND VALIDATE, ESPECIALLY IF THERE HASN'T BEEN ANY PARTICULAR MOVEMENT ON A SPECIFIC PDA. AND I THINK THAT WAS THE CASE HERE IN DANVILLE. AND SECONDLY I WANT TO SAY I'M VERY SYMPATHETIC TO DANVILLE'S APPEAL AND I TOTALLY AGREE WITH THEM THAT UPZONING LAND AND BUILT-OUT COMMUNITIES ADDS ECONOMIC VALUE FOR LAND OWNERS AND YIELDS NEGLIGIBLE AMOUNT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNFORTUNATELY THAT'S WHAT STATE LAW IS DOING, WHETHER YOU LOOK AT SB35, OR SB 9-10, IT'S ABSOLUTELY RIDICULOUS AND THAT'S WHY SOME OF US ARE PURSUING A STATEWIDE INITIATIVE. SECOND AND THIRD COMMENT IS THAT, I THINK ABAG MTC, WE REALLY NEED TO GET THE WATER AGENCIES TOGETHER. I HAVE RAISED THIS AT THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY, I BELIEVE IT WAS 2013, OR 2014, THAT WE HAVE A CARRYING CAPACITY, ESPECIALLY FOR WATER, AND I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO GET THE WATER AGENCIES, WHICH ARE SEPARATE, IN SOME AREAS, FROM THE CITIES OR LAND USE ORGANIZATIONS, WE NEED TO GET THEM TOGETHER. AND REALLY FACILITATE A DIALOGUE. DO WE HAVE A CARRYING CAPACITY IN THE REGION? AND IF SO, HOW IS THAT GOING TO AFFECT OUR LAND USE. THIS IS REALLY A SIGNIFICANT ISSUE, AS WE HAVE MORE FIRE HAZARDS, BECAUSE WHAT DO THEY USE PRIMARILY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FOR FIGHTING FIRES THAT'S PORTABLE WATER, NOT NECESSARILY RECYCLED WATER THAT'S ONE OF THE IMPROVEMENTS WE CAN LOOK AT. UNFORTUNATELY ALSO, SOME OF THE POINTS THAT ARE RAISED WITHIN THIS APPEAL ARE NOT REALLY WITHIN OUR JURISDICTION. BUT, ANYWAYS, SO I -- AS I SAID BEFORE, I DIDN'T SUPPORT THE METHODOLOGY. AND, BUT, I NEED TO SUPPORT WHAT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVED FOR THE METHODOLOGY. SO THAT'S WHY I'M SUPPORTING THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MEMBERS? MAYOR HUDSON?

DAVID E. HUDSON: YEAH. IT'S -- YOU KNOW, WE HAVE BEEN THROUGH, WHAT? 5, 6 OF THESE THINGS TODAY, AND AS ADVOCATES WE COULD PROBABLY BUILD CASES FOR EACH ONE IN WHATEVER DIRECTION THEY WANT TO GO, AND TO ME THIS WAS LOST, AND PAT ALLUDED TO IT BUT I WASN'T GOING TO SAY ANYTHING, WE'RE GOING TO ASSIGN NUMBERS THAT CAN'T BE DONE WITHOUT CHANGING THE CHARACTERISTIC OF TWO CITIES. ONE'S CALLED A TOWN BUT THE REALITY IS THEY'RE TWO CITIES AND THEY HAVE SPENT THEIR ENTIRE LIFE WORKING TOWARDS WHAT THEY HAVE GOT AND WE'RE HITTING WITH THESE NUMBERS. THEY LAUGHED AT THE WORK AND CHUCKLED WHEN I SAID YOU SHOULDN'T HAVE TO BUILD ANY BUT THAT'S NOT WHAT WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO. WE'RE IN THE POT OF REALLOCATION AND I END UP WITH MORE THAN YOU STARTED WITH. BUT THE REALITY IS WE HAVE GOT TO STICK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO THE CHORE THAT'S IN FRONT OF US WHICH IS, DOES THIS MEET THE METHODOLOGY THAT THE ABAG MEMBERS VOTED FOR. AND I DO NOT LIKE T BUT I'M GOING TO STICK TO IT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. I'LL SEND OUT, HCD DID DOUBLE THE NUMBER OF UNITS THAT THE BAY AREA REGION HAS TO PLAN FOR, AND THAT IS ALSO REALLY A CRITICAL FACTOR AS TO WHY EVERY JURISDICTION HAS TO PLAN FOR MORE. MY CITY, WE'RE GETTING A 202% INCREASE, AND IT'S GOING TO BE A BIG IMPACT. THERE IS NO QUESTION ABOUT IT. AND SO I'M VERY SYMPATHETIC TO THE POINTS THAT YOU RAISED, AND TO THE IMPACT THIS IS GOING TO HAVE ON YOUR COMMUNITY. BUT WE DO NEED TO, YOU KNOW, EVALUATE THIS, AND MAKE A DECISION ON THE BASIS OF THE METHODOLOGY THAT'S ADOPTED AND ON THE STATUTE. SO, RESPECTFULLY, I WILL BE SUPPORTING THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. BUT ONCE AGAIN, I WANT TO REITERATE OUR COMMITMENT TO WORK WITH YOU, AS YOU'RE DOING THE WORK TO UPDATE YOUR HOUSING ELEMENTS AND WE HAVE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF RESOURCES THAT WE HAVE AVAILABLE. AND, WE RECOGNIZE THAT WE NEED TO SUPPORT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS THROUGH THE TRANSIT HOUSING AND OTHER INFRASTRUCTURE TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT THE GROWTH THAT THE STATE IS REQUIRING THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS HAVE TO PLAN FOR. SO, UNLESS THERE ARE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS, I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO PLEASE CALL THE ROLL ON THE MOTION, WHICH IS TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE APPEAL FROM THE TOWN OF DANVILLE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION FROM EKLUND, SECOND BY ROMERO, ON THE MOTION. [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES WITH ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. NINE VOTES AYE. MOTION CARRIES.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: SO, GREAT WOLFF, ARE YOU WITH DANVILLE IN OR? MADAM MAYOR AND STAFF OF THE CITY OF DANVILLE THANK YOU FOR COMING FORWARD TODAY AND FOR THE THOUGHTFUL PRESENTATION. IT'S NOT AN EMPTY STATEMENT WE WANT TO REITERATE OUR COMMITMENT TO WORK WITH YOU. IT'S GOING TO BE A BIG CHANGE. THANK YOU FOR COMING TODAY.

RENEE MORGAN: WE VERY MUCH APPRECIATE IT. I KNOW YOU HAVE YOUR HAND TIED. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE WILL PROCEED TO ITEM F WHICH IS THE REPORT ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION FOR THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE. AND THIS IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION. WE'LL HEAR FROM THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE WHICH WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT ON THE APPEAL. WHO WILL BE PRESENTING ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE. GREG WOLFF. AND I SEE WE HAVE SUSAN AS WELL.

SPEAKER: QUICK QUESTION ON PROCESS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YES?

SPEAKER: WE HAD ASKED FRED IF GREG IS PRESENTING IF I CAN ENTER IN A TWO MINUTE PUBLIC COMMENT?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: YES. THERE IS ALSO TIME FOR REBUTTAL AFTER THE STAFF PRESENTATION. SO IF THERE IS ANYTHING ADDITIONAL TO ADD THAT PROVIDES OPPORTUNITY AS WELL.

SUSAN KANDEL: THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: GINA DOBSON, ARE YOU WITH LAFAYETTE AS WELL?

SPEAKER: SHE IS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: SUMMARIZING WITH HOW THE OTHER HEARINGS WERE CONDUCTED, THE APPELLATE JURISDICTION WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT AFTER WHICH TIME WE'LL HEAR FROM MTC/ABAG STAFF AND OPPORTUNITY FOR REBUTTAL APPEALING JURISDICTION. SO WITH THAT I'LL TURN THE FLOOR OVER TO THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE TO BEGIN THEIR PRESENTATION.

GREG WOLFF: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. REPRESENTING LAFAYETTE OUR MAYOR SUSAN KANDELL. LAFAYETTE HAS A LONG HISTORY OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SUPPORTIVE HOUSING AND CERTIFIED HOUSING ELEMENT AND GENERAL PLAN DEMONSTRATE THIS ALL OF THE APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED LAST 20 YEARS CITY HAS APPROVED 99% OF THOSE PROJECTS RECENT PROJECT APPROVALS 164 NEW UNITS WITH ANOTHER 190 CURRENTLY UNDER CONSTRUCTION. THIS MAP SHOWS ALMOST HALF THE CITY IS IN A HIGH FIRE SEVERITY HAZARD ZONE. 46% OF THE CITY IS IN A VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONE IDENTIFIED BY CAL FIRE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. YOU ARE WELL AWARE THAT ONLY THREE FACTORS GO INTO THE RHNA METHODOLOGY AND IN PART, THIS IS BECAUSE THE BASELINE FOR THE RHNA ALLOCATION IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH ADDRESSED THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE'S CONCERNS ABOUT THE NATURAL HAZARDS BY EX-CHEWING HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES IN AREAS OF UNMITIGATED SEA LEVEL RISE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. CONTRA COSTA COUNTY IS SHOWN TO GROW BY 12% ON AVERAGE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE PERCENTAGE OF EACH CONTRA COSTA COUNTY JURISDICTION LAFAYETTE INCREASED 28% BETWEEN THE PRELIMINARY PROPOSED DRAFT AND THE DRAFT ALLOCATION IN MAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE SAME INFORMATION SHOWN HERE, A FUNCTION OF EXISTING POPULATION, YOU CAN SEE LAFAYETTE'S DISPROPORTIONAL INCREASE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS MAP FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT SHOWS LAFAYETTE'S PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREA, TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AROUND THE BART STATION AND VERY FIRE HAZARD AREAS NORTH OF HIGHWAY 24. THE FINAL BLUEPRINT SHOWS THE SAME INFORMATION ALBEIT WITHOUT THE HIRE FIRE HAZARD LIGHTS TURNED ON, THE FOLLOWING AREAS ARE EXCLUDED FROM THE MAP HIGH WILDFIRE AREAS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOCALLY ADOPT WUI. NOTES ON PAGE 36 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES EXCLUDE CALIFORNIA DESIGNATED CAL FIRE HIGH FIRE ZONES, AND WUIS. AND STRATEGIES FOCUSED FUTURE GROWTH AWAY FROM THE HIGHEST FIRE RISK. THE JANUARY 2021 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING TRANSCRIPT READ IN PART WHEN WE'RE TRYING TO ACCOMMODATE 1.5 MILLION HOMES ACROSS THE REGION IT'S HARD TO TAKE EVERYTHING OFF THE TABLE WE HAVE TAKEN OFF THE TABLE LARGE PARTS OF THE REGION THAT ARE NOT GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WE'RE PROTECTING PUBLIC BUILDINGS, PUBLIC PARKS AND OPEN SPACES ALL THOSE THINGS ARE PROTECTED. WE TOOK OFF THE TABLE HIGH RISK FIRE AREAS AND OTHER AREAS THAT WOULDN'T BE PROTECTED SEA LEVEL RISE. ABAG'S RESPONSE IN YOUR PACKET TODAY STATES THAT THROUGHOUT THE REGION IT'S ESSENTIALLY IMPOSSIBLE TO AVOID ALL HAZARDS WHEN CITING NEW DEVELOPMENT BUT JURISDICTIONS CAN THINK CRITICALLY ABOUT WHICH AREAS OF THE COMMUNITY HAVE THE HIGHEST HAZARD RISK AND WE AGREE WITH THIS IT'S CLEAR THAT ABAG DID PRECISELY THIS AT A REGIONAL SCALE WHEN IT EXCLUDED HIRE FIRE HAZARD ZONES FROM GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WE RESPECTFULLY SUBMIT THAT AN ERROR WAS MADE INCLUDING PUBLIC LANDS WHICH LIE WITHIN HIGH FIRE ZONES STAFF IS ACKNOWLEDGING THIS WE ASK FOR CORRECTION REDUCING LAFAYETTE ALLOCATION BY THE NUMBER OF UNITS ATTRIBUTABLE TO PUBLIC LAND THAT ARE IN HIGH FIRE RISK AREAS. THE REUSE OF PUBLIC LAND STRATEGY IN THE FINAL GROWTH STRATEGIC DEES DIDN'T ACKNOWLEDGE LAFAYETTE'S HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES, THE BLUEPRINT STATES THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE STRATEGIES FOCUSED -- [INDISCERNIBLE] LAWSUITS FILED BY THE ATTORNEY GENERAL SUPPORT THIS POLICY AND WE BELIEVE IT'S GOOD PLANNING. LAFAYETTE RESPECTFULLY REQUESTS THAT UNITS PROJECTED ON PUBLIC LANDS IN HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES TO BE DETECTED TO ALIGN WITH THE POLICY DECISION OF THE HOUSING AUTHORITY COMMITTEE AND EXECUTIVE BOARD WHICH BASE DECISIONS ON THE UNDERSTAND TAG GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES EXCLUDE VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES AND PUBLIC LAND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. AND LAFAYETTE HAS RESPONDED TO 2 THROUGH 4 AND IN THE INTEREST OF TIME WE ARE WILLING TO ACCEPT ABAG'S RESPONSE AND STAFF'S RESPONSE TO THOSE SO THE DISCUSSION CAN FOCUS ON ISSUE NUMBER ONE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. THERE WILL BE AN OPPORTUNITY, AFTER THE STAFF PRESENTATION FOR REBUTTAL OR ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS. WE'LL GO TO THE ELECTED OFFICIALS WHEN WE GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. IF THAT'S APPROPRIATE. SO, I WOULD NOW LIKE TO ASK MTC ABAG STAFF TO PRESENT THEIR RESPONSE TO THE LAFAYETTE APPEAL.

GILLIAN ADAMS: THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE IS REQUESTING A REDUCTION OF 822 UNITS WHICH REPRESENTS A REDUCTION OF 39% FROM ITS DRAFT ALLOCATION AND STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO DENY THE APPEAL. CONSISTENT WITH WHAT THE CITY JUST SAID, I'M HAPPY TO TALK ABOUT THE FIRST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ISSUE RAISED IN THE JURISDICTION IN THE PRESENTATION, AND WE CAN SKIP THE OTHERS UNLESS THERE IS A REQUEST FROM THE COMMITTEE TO CONTINUE WITH THOSE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. REGARDING THE CITY'S ARGUMENT ABOUT EXCLUDING VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES IN THE PLAN'S 2050 PUBLIC LAND STRATEGY, WITH SMALL EXCEPTION WE HAVE NOTED BEFORE THAT IDENTIFIED AREAS AT RISK FROM NATURAL HAZARDS AS A CONSTRAINT TO HOUSING, AS SUBMITTED IN THE LETTER ON APPEALS HOUSING ELEMENT LAW STATES THAT ABAG LIMITS CONSIDERATION OF SUITABLE HOUSING SITES TO EXISTING LAND AND ZONING USE RESTRICTIONS AND CONSIDER POTENTIAL INCREASED DEVELOPMENT AROUND ALTERNATIVE ZONING AND LAND USE RESTRICTIONS SIMPLE TERMS THIS MEANS HOUSING PLAN CANNOT BE LIMITED TO COMMUNITIES -- [INDISCERNIBLE] NON-VACANT LAND. AS NOTED PREVIOUSLY GIVEN THE VARIETY OF NATURAL HAZARD RISKS THAT THE BAY AREA FACES IT'S NOT POSSIBLE TO ADDRESS THAT REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS AND AVOID PLANNING FOR NEW HOMES IN ALL PLACES AT RISK. THE CITY HAS THE AUTHORITY TO PLAN FOR HOUSING IN PLACES WITH LOWER RISK IN ITS HOUSING ELEMENTS THE FINAL GROWTH BLUEPRINT GEOGRAPHIES EXCLUDE HIGH FIRE HAZARD SEVERITY ZONES BUT THE POLICY ADOPTED BY ABAG BOARD IN SEPTEMBER 2020 IS NOT CONSTRAINED BY THE SAME CRITERIA. THE BART STATION PARKING LOTS AND OTHER PUBLIC LANDS WITHIN VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD SEVERITY ZONES ARE NOT EXCLUDED FROM THE PUBLIC LAND STRATEGY AS THESE SITES REPRESENT LOCATIONS FOR WALKABLE TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT LAFAYETTE HAS NOT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PROVIDED EVIDENCE THAT IT IS UNABLE TO CONSIDER UNDERUTILIZED LAND OPPORTUNITIES FOR INFILL DEVELOPMENT INCREASED RESIDENTIAL DENSITY AND OTHER PLANNING TOOLS TO ACCOMMODATE ITS RHNA WITH THAT I'LL CONCLUDE THE PRESENTATION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. MR. WOLFF, OR ANY STAFF FROM LAFAYETTE, YOU HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO AFTER COMMENTS TO THE STAFF PRESENTATION, IF YOU SO CHOOSE?

GREG WOLFF: WHAT WE HEARD IS THAT AUTO NOT A STATUTORY REQUIREMENT TO CONSIDER NATURAL HAZARDS, WHICH WE AGREE WITH. THERE IS VERY LITTLE NATURAL HAZARD. I THINK IT'S ONLY A FLOOD ZONE, AND ABAG STAFF COULD ADVISE FURTHER, THAT IS NOT A REQUIREMENT TO CONSIDER THOSE, HOWEVER, AS A POLICY MATTER, AND GOOD PLANNING, THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND THE EXECUTIVE BOARD CLEARLY DID SO LOOKED AT NATURAL HAZARDS AND EXCLUDED BY MEANS OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND MAPPING, HIGH FIRE HAZARD IN AREAS OF UNMITIGATED SEA LEVEL RISE. SO IT'S CLEARLY A POLICY DECISION WITHIN YOUR PURVIEW. AND IT'S OUR UNDERSTANDING, OUR RESEARCH FIND NO EVIDENCE IN THE RECORD THAT THERE WAS AN AFFIRMATIVE DISCUSSION, A DECISION MADE, TO INCLUDE PUBLIC LANDS IN VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES IN STRATEGY EIGHT. ALL THE EVIDENCE IS TO THE CONTRARY THAT, THAT IT STATED ALL THE DOCUMENTS, MAPS, STATED THAT PUBLIC LANDS WERE IN GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES EXCLUDED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES SO THE INFORMATION THAT THE EXECUTIVE BOARD HAD WHEN IT MADE ITS DECISION ON THE RHNA ALLOCATION SUPPORTS OUR CLAIM.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. THANK YOU. UNLESS THERE IS ANYTHING ELSE YOU WOULD LIKE TO ADD WE CAN PROCEED TO PUBLIC COMMENT. FIRST RECOGNIZING MAYOR SUSAN KANDEL FROM LAFAYETTE

SUSAN KANDEL: YOU HAVE HEARD THE FACTS, THE PRIORITY OF HIGH FIRE ZONES WAS NOT FRONT IN THE GROWTH STRATEGY ADDED LAST WINTER HOWEVER EVERY MEETING EVERY PRINTED WORD AS WELL AS STAFF REPORTS STATEMENT IN JANUARY AFTER PUBLIC LAND WERE INCLUDED ABOUT HOW VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES WERE REMOVED FROM EVERY STRATEGY IN LAND THAT SHOULD BE EXCLUDED MORE IMPORTANTLY, IN SEPTEMBER INDICATES A SIGNIFICANT POLICY CHANGE AS OUR ERRATA WAS SO COMPLETELY DIFFERENT THAN THE OTHER MINISTERIAL INPUTS. TO SAY PUBLIC LANDS ARE SOMEHOW OKAY TO BE IN VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD AREAS COMPARED TO PRIVATE LANDS IS COUNTER TO EVERY DIRECTION WE'RE HEARING FROM OUR PLANNERS AND STATE LEGISLATURE WE ALL KNOW THERE IS NO TERMS OF DIFFERENCE COMPARING PUBLIC SAFETY AND PRIVATE LANDS I WOULD CHARGE THAT THIS BODY OR THE ABAG COMMITTEE WOULD HAVE AT LEAST ONE VOTE ON THE SIGNIFICANT POLICY CHANGE -- EXCUSE ME --

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I MUTED THE PERSON.

SPEAKER: FOR TRANSPARENCY YOU MAY NEED TO BE STAT HOLDER REQUIRED, USING THE BODY TO BE CONSISTENT IN EVERY MANNER TO SUPPORT THE POLICY TO ELIMINATE THESE LANDS AND ELIMINATE THE WORDS WITHIN GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES TWO WEEKS AGO VIA AN ERRATA DOCUMENT IS UNACCEPTABLE ON SO MANY LEVELS FOR ABAG DUE TO GOVERNMENT AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS I ESPECIALLY URGE YOU AS A BOARD TO FIX THE ERROR AND RETURN THE 822 UNITS THAT ARE MISTAKENLY INCLUDED IN THIS LAND. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. I'LL GO TO COUNCILMEMBER REGINA DAWSON.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. FOLLOWING UP ON MAYOR KANDEL'S POINT AN IMPORTANT POINT THE STRATEGY FOR DEVELOPMENT ON PUBLIC LANDS IS FOCUSED ON ADDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND POPULATION IF THE LOW TO MODERATE INCOME LEVEL RANK IN THIS HOUSING TARGETS MADE DISPROPORTIONATE RISK TO THEIR SAFETY WITH HIGH DENSITY BUILDING IN THE HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES. THE PARCEL IN THE HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONE IN LOCATIONS WITH A SINGLE INGRESS AND EGRESS AND AUTHOR FURTHER EXACERBATES SAFETY AND TURNS EVACUATION ROUTE IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WE WILL CONTINUE TO INCLUDE THIS FOCUS ON HOUSING INVENTORY IN OUR PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREA HOWEVER FOR SOUND PLANNING AND PUBLIC SAFETY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PLANNING HOUSING PLANNING AND PUBLIC SAFETY PLANNING AND CURRENT LEGISLATIVE ENVIRONMENT REGARDING WILDFIRE PROTECTIONS FOR COMMUNITIES WE RESPECTFULLY ASK FOR A REDUCTION IN UNIT IN PROPORTION TO THE ACCELERATED ALLOCATION RELATIVE TO PUBLIC LAND DEVELOPMENT IN LAFAYETTE SINCE THIS PARTICULAR PARCEL LIES IN A HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONE AND POSSESSIONS POTENTIAL RISK TO THAT POPULATION. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER SCOTT O'NEILL.

SPEAKER: HI. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS SCOTT O'NEILL, I GREW UP IN HALF YET I WANT TO SAY STAFF'S REPORTS TODAY HAVE BEEN EXTREME HE HIGH QUALITY AND LAFAYETTE'S IS NO EXCEPTION. I WOULD LIKE TO ADD COLOR THIS IS A BART STATION LAFAYETTE SHOULD NOT BE LOOKING AT WHAT THEY CLAIM AS UNMITIGATED WILDFIRE EAST OF REGIONAL TRANSIT INFRASTRUCTURE THINKING WE CAN USE THIS FOR RONA. THIS SHOULDN'T BE A HEAVY LIFT AS FAR AS FIRE HAZARDS GO. IF LAFAYETTE CAN SHRINK THE PERIMETER BY EXACTLY ONE LOT WIDTH LAFAYETTE SITE FALLS OUT. ONE MINOR POINT I WANT TO RAISE IS THAT LAFAYETTE'S COMPUTATION OF 822 UNIT IMPACT SEEMS SUSPECT AS AN OUTSIDER IT'S HARD TO FOLLOW THE 2050 BASELINE BUT IT SEEMS UNLIKELY THAT A THIRD OF ITS TOTAL ALLOCATION WILL BE DUE TO EXACTLY THREE LOTS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I WOULD ASK ABAG TO LOOK HARD AT THE REQUESTED REMEDY. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SAM MONK.

SPEAKER: HELLO. EVERYTHING IN THE PUBLIC RECORD STATES THAT GROWTH IS LOCATED IN THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES MTC/ABAG ACKNOWLEDGED THAT VERY HIGH FIRE ZONES SHOULD BE EXCLUDED FROM GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. LAFAYETTE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IS IN A HIGH FIRE ZONE AND SHOULD HAVE NEVER BEEN INCLUDED. WHEN LAFAYETTE POINTED OUT THE HIGH FIRE ZONES MTC CLAIMED FORECASTING AND MODELS REPORT WAS IN ERROR, STRATEGIES AND SITES ARE NOT ACTUALLY CONSTRAINED BY GROWTH 11 DAYS AGO YOU REVISED THAT. THERE ARE MANY QUOTES HERE TO, "WHILE THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WILL DEFINE WHERE GROWTH IS FOCUSED IN THE BLUEPRINT, THE BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES WILL SHAPE WHAT KIND OF GROWTH TAKES PLACE IN THESE GEOGRAPHIES." "WE'RE ALSO ASKING FOR APPROVAL OF THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WHICH ARE PLACES ASSUMED FOR FUTURE HOUSING AND JOB GROWTH, JOB GROWTH IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. IF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES REQUIRE APPROVAL SHOULDN'T AN EXCEPTION REQUIRED TO GO BEYOND THEM REQUIRE APPROVAL AS WELL. I THINK LAFAYETTE'S FIRE ZONES WERE NOT EXCLUDED FROM ANY OF PLANNED BAY AREA'S MODELING, ONLY THE LOCATION SPECIFICITY MADE THIS ERROR OBVIOUS. INSTEAD OF COMING THE ERRONEOUS INCLUSION OF VERY HIGH FIRE ZONES MTC HAS TRIED TO CHANGE THE RECORD TO MAKE THE ERROR IRRELEVANT TO HH. IF THIS APPEAL IS DENIED, I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HOPE MTC IS PREPARED TO DEMONSTRATE LAFAYETTE'S HIGH FIRE ZONES ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES THAT FIT AT THE PLANNED BAY AREA MODELING PROCESS. MTC STILL HAS PUBLISHED MAPS IDENTIFYING GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN VERY HIGH FIRE ZONES IF THESE GEOGRAPHIES DIDN'T FEED THE MODELS THEN WHAT DID? THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. OKAY. AS I ANNOUNCED AT THE BEGINNING OF THIS PROCEEDING, IF THERE ARE FIVE OR MORE SPEAKERS, TIME WOULD BE REDUCED TO ONE MINUTE SO THE REMAINING SPEAKERS HAVE ONE MINUTE THEN I'LL DO ONE LAST CALL FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON LAFAYETTE'S APPEAL. PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING IN. JAY GARFINCKLE.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I PARTICIPATED IN THE METHODOLOGY PROCESS LAST YEAR AND THERE WAS OVERWHELMING SUPPORT FOR INCLUDING NATURAL HAZARD AS A SIGNIFICANT FACTOR. THEN OUT OF THE BLUE, THE ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF CHOSE TO ELIMINATE THIS AS A FACTOR. NOW THE ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF SAYS, WELL, BECAUSE IT'S ELIMINATED, WE CAN'T CONSIDER T I THINK THIS IS RATHER DISINGENUOUS. IT'S UNBELIEVABLE THAT THE PEOPLE IN CHARGE OF THIS STATE WOULD PUT ALL OF THESE HAZARD AREAS, DESIGNATE THEM AS DESIRABLE FOR ADDITIONAL HOUSING. THIS WHOLE PROCESS IS SUSPECT. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THE NEXT SPEAKER IS BOWLING.

SPEAKER: ZACK BOWLING, EAST BAY YIMBY, WE CONCUR WITH A LOT OF THE STATEMENTS AND WANT TO THANK STAFF ON FINDINGS. WE ALSO RECOMMEND THAT YOU MOVE FORWARD WITH DENYING THIS APPEAL. AND I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN GRIMES.

SPEAKER: YES GOOD AFTERNOON AGAIN. I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF ON THEIR COMPLETE DISMANTLING OF LAFAYETTE'S ABSURD ARGUMENTS HERE THE IDEA OF LAFAYETTE HAS ANY KIND OF HISTORY IN BEING IN SUPPORT OF ANY KIND OF HOUSING AFFORDABLE OR OTHERWISE IS TRULY ABSURD I THINK WE'RE ALL AWARE OF THE SAGA THAT'S OCCURRED THERE OVER A DECADE ABOUT THE ATTEMPT TO BUILD ONE SINGLE APARTMENT BUILDING LAFAYETTE IS 80% WHITE HAS A MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME OF 180,000 A YEAR THIS IS THE EXACT KIND OF AFFLUENT EXCLUSIONARY PLACE WHERE WE SHOULD BE BUILDING NEW HOUSING ESPECIALLY ON PARKING LOTS AROUND PUBLIC TRANSIT STATIONS. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ANY OTHER ATTENDEES THAT WISH TO SPEAK? IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ARE PHONING IN. I DO NOT SEE ANY RAISED HANDS, MR. CASTRO. YOU'RE MUTED.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. MR. WOLFF, AT THIS TIME, WE'LL CALL ON YOU IF THERE IS A QUESTION. SO, IT'S NOW IN ORDER FOR THE COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS THE MATTER. I WILL ASK YOU A QUESTION WHICH WILL AFFORD YOU OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND. I'M GOING TO GO FIRST TO MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU, MAYOR, AND PRESIDENT. I GUESS MY QUESTION IS FOR STAFF. I DON'T UNDERSTAND THE DISTINCTION THAT WAS BEING MADE -- AND MAYBE I'M NOT HEARING IT CORRECT FROM LAFAYETTE, THAT IT SOUND AS THOUGH THAT THEIR NUMBER INCLUDED VERY HIGH HAZARD ZONE THAT, FOR LAND THAT ARE DESIGNATED PUBLIC LAND, BUT I THOUGHT THAT WE HAD INCLUDED EXCLUSION FOR VERY HIGH LANDS REGARDLESS OF WHETHER IT'S PRIVATE OR PUBLIC. I WAS ADVOCATING EARLIER ON THAT WE ALSO INCLUDE HIGH FIRE ZONES. AND WUIS, BUT THAT WAS DECLINED BY THE ABAG BOARD. SO, YOU CAN HELP ME UNDERSTAND THE DIFFERENCE HERE? >DAVE VAUTIN: CERTAINLY. I'M HAPPY TO TAKE THAT QUESTION, AND EYE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE THREE PARTS TO THE RESPONSE HERE. SO I THINK, FIRST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF ALL, IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT WE DO PARCEL LEVEL MODELING FOR THE PURPOSES OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, BUT ULTIMATELY WHEN IT COMES TO ALLOCATING GROWTH AND FINDING SITES FOR GROWTH, THAT IS, THESE ALLOCATIONS ARE GIVEN TO JURISDICTIONS ON THE JURISDICTIONAL LEVEL, AND JURISDICTIONS DON'T HAVE TO PLAN FOR THE SPECIFIC SITES THAT ARE ASSUMED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AND THE SECOND POINT IS THAT ALTHOUGH THIS IS THE RHNA APPEALS HEARING, NOT THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HEARING, I WILL SPEAK TO THE FACT THAT THE CITY IS CORRECT THAT THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHY, IN THAT AREA, IS IN THE VERY HIGH FIRE ZONE. AND WE'RE ACTUALLY CORRECTING THAT IN FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THAT GROWTH GEOGRAPHY LAYER WAS USED FOR STRATEGY H3, WHICH BASICALLY HAS ADDITIONAL DEVELOPMENT CAPACITY ON THOSE PRIVATELY OWNED LAND. HOWEVER, THERE WAS NO SIGNIFICANT GROWTH APPROXIMATE THAT -- ON THOSE LANDS IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND IN THIS AREA, NORTHFUL -- NORTH OF 24 AND IN LAFAYETTE ALMOST ALL THE GROWTH WAS ON PUBLIC LAND PARCELS A DIFFERENT STRATEGY IN THE PLAN NOT EVERY NEW DEVELOPMENT IN THE PLAN 2050 IS IN THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHY ROUGHLY FOUR OUT OF FIVE NOW HOMES ARE LOCATED IN THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES THAT OTHER PLACES HAVE A ROLE TO PLAY AS WELL. PLANS WITH REGARDS TO STRATEGY, WHICH WAS REALLY -- A TECHNICAL REPORT RELEASED IN MAY WHICH WAS ERRONEOUS STAFF DID MODELING BASED ON THE BOARD ADOPTED SPECIFIC INFORMATION FOR THE STRATEGY, IF YOU GO TO THE SEPTEMBER AND JUDGING ABAG

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PACKETS FOR THE STRATEGIES THAT WERE APPROVED IN SEPTEMBER THE GROWTH CHART ARE NOT MENTIONED IN THIS STRATEGY. THIS STRATEGY, BASED ON THE BOARD ADOPTED LANGUAGE WAS NOT RESTRICTED TO GROWTH GEOGRAPHY EXERCISE THEREFORE DID NOT HAVE THE SAME -- THE FIRE HAZARD RESTRICTION THAT ARE PLACED UPON THEM.

PAT ECKLUND: DAVE, JUST FOLLOWING UP, CAN YOU DO A YES OR NO ANSWER? WAS THE DRAFT RHNA NUMBERS, INCLUDING THE VERY HIGH PUBLIC LANDS THAT LAFAYETTE IS OBJECTING TO, DID THE RHNA NUMBER INCLUDE THAT AS TOTAL CAPACITY FOR GROWTH? >DAVE VAUTIN: THERE ARE A HANDFUL OF PUBLIC LANDS PROJECTS IN THE STRATEGY H EIGHT THAT ARE IN THE HIGH FIRE RISK AREAS A HANDFUL. THE VAST MAJORITY OF PUBLIC LAND SITES IN THE BAY AREA ARE WITHIN GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND THE VAST MAJORITY ARE NOT IN THE VERY HIGH FIRE RISK AREAS. BUT AGAIN THAT WAS NOT A RESTRICTION PLACED UPON THE STRATEGY BASED ON THE BOARD ADOPTION.

PAT ECKLUND: RIGHT. DETERMINING ON THE RHNA THIS VERY HIGH PUBLIC LANDS AREA WAS INCLUDED AS A POTENTIAL FOR A CAPACITY FOR GROWTH IN DETERMINING THE NUMBER? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES.

PAT ECKLUND: AS A BOARD OR COMMITTEE, CAN WE RECOMMEND THAT THAT BE EXCLUDED? >DAVE VAUTIN: ULTIMATELY THIS HAS THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OPPORTUNITY TO CHANGE STRATEGIES BUT CHANGING A STRATEGY MEANS WE HAVE TO RESIMULATE THE ENTIRE PLAN YIELDING A DIFFERENT LAND USE PATTERN AND MIGHT REQUIRE ADDITIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW.

PAT ECKLUND: THE RHNA HAS TO BE CONSISTENT WITH THE 2050 PLAN? CORRECT? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES.

PAT ECKLUND: AND THAT'S WHY WE WOULD BE JEOPARDIZING ALL THE WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE ON THE 2050 PLAN IF WE WANT TO CHANGE THIS PARTICULAR ASPECT OF IT FOR RHNA? >DAVE VAUTIN: LET ME BE CLEAR, APPROVING A RHNA APPEAL DOESN'T NECESSARILY MEAN THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 NEEDS TO BE REOPENED. SO, LONG AS THE APPEALS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE GENERALLY CONSIST ANTWITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050.

PAT ECKLUND: IS THERE A CORRECT NUMBER THAT WAS APPLIED TO THE PUBLIC LANDS IN THE VERY HIGH FIRE ZONE? I THINK THEY SAID 625 HOUSING UNITS. IS THAT CORRECT? >DAVE VAUTIN: WE PROJECTED A SOMEWHAT HIGHER NUMBER ON THAT PARCEL COMPARED TO WHAT THE CITY IS STATING. THEY'RE CITING THE MINIMUM AMOUNT OF DEVELOPMENT ON THAT PARCEL. BUT, AGAIN, THIS IS LIKE ALL OF THE VARIOUS BART PUBLIC LANDS PROJECTS. THERE IS A NUMBER OF BART STATIONS YOU HAVE SEEN THEM, MAC ARTHUR WALNUT CREEK PLEASANT HILL THESE SORTS OF TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENTS,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE'RE BEING FAIR TO ALL THE JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE UNDER THAT LAW.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR HUDSON.

DAVID E. HUDSON: STAY ON THE SAME VEIN WE JUST DID DUBLIN'S APPEAL EARLIER TOOL THEY'RE BUILDING THE HOUSING ON THE PART WHERE A BART PARKING STRUCTURE WAS GOING TO BE THEY'RE USING THAT HOUSING FOR THEIR NUMBERS DON'T THEY GET TO USE THAT? >DAVE VAUTIN: IF YOU ARE PLEASANT HILL THAT'S THE HOUSING AUTHORITY HOUSEHOLD THERE MIGHT BE SOMETHING UNDER CONSTRUCTION THAT'S REFLECTED AS WELL AS FUTURE PLANNED HOUSING REFLECTED IN LAFAYETTE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THIS IS SUBJECT TO ASSEMBLY BILL 2923, SO YOU HAVE TO ADOPT ZONING THAT CONFORMS TO THE TOD STANDARDS THAT HAS BEEN PROMULGATED WHICH IS GOING REQUIRE THAT YOU HAVE TO PLAN FOR CERTAIN DENSITIES AT THE STATION REGARDLESS OF WHETHER YOU EXCLUDE OR NOT YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO SELL FOR THAT HOUSING. YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO REZONE THIS SITE ANYWAYS AT A CERTAIN DENSITY REGARDLESS IF WHETHER IT'S IN A HIGH FIRE ZONE OR NOT, THE TRANSFER STATION IS THERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GREG WOLFF: YOU'RE RIGHT THIS LOT SUBJECT TO 2923 AND THE MINIMUM SECURITY STANDARDS --

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: WE HAVE THE SAME PROBLEM IN BERKELEY BART JUST ADOPTED IT WE HAVE TO CONFORM.

SPEAKER: 822 IS THE CALCULATION I HEARD THE ASSUMPTION IS BEYOND THAT. BUT IT IS A HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONE AND THERE MAY BE OTHER PROVISIONS TO STATE LAW WHICH ALLOW A JURISDICTION TO NOT UPZONE IN A VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONE WHICH WOULD APPLY TO THIS SITE AND THUS IT'S PREMATURE FOR US.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: SO THAT WOULD PREEMPT 2923?

GREG WOLFF: POTENTIALLY WE'RE STILL RESEARCHING AND INVESTIGATING SO WE CAN COMPLY WITH ALL THE LAWS NOT JUST THE ONE NARROWLY CONSTRUED BECAUSE THERE ARE OTHER LAWS THAT DO FACTOR IN AND SPEAK TO VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONES AND OTHER ZONES.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THAT'S HELPFUL. YOU WANTED TO MAKE A COMMENT?

GREG WOLFF: IT WAS JUST ABOUT THE CALCULATION.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. SO COLLEAGUES, IT'S IN ORDER, UNLESS THERE IS ANY OTHER QUESTIONS, IT'S IN ORDER FOR US TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION. SO I WOULD LIKE TO ASK, IS THERE A MOTION OR ANY ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION IN -- DISCUSSION?

PAT ECKLUND: I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, ABOUT THIS PUBLIC LANDS ISSUE, AND AGAIN, WE DON'T HAVE BART IN MARIN, SO I DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW BART CAN SET -- I GUESS BECAUSE THEY'RE THE LANDOWNER, THEY CAN SET THE ZONING THAT THEY WANT?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: IT WAS BAKED INTO THE BILL ASSEMBLY BILL 23. SO I AM WELL VERSED IN THIS WE'RE IN TOD IN TWO STATION IN BERKELEY. ASSEMBLY BILL 2923 ENABLED BART TO ZONE AND PLAN FOR HOUSING AT VARIOUS STATION IN THEIR SERVICE AREA. AND STAFF HAD PROMULGATED ZONING STANDARDS, PLANNING STANDARDS FOR ZONING DEVELOPMENT IN THEIR DISTRICT IN THEIR SERVICE AREA THAT WAS DONE ADMINISTRATIVELY AND THE BILL BAKED IN THOSE ZONING STANDARDS AS THE STANDARDS THAT LOCAL JURISDICTIONS HAVE TO APPLY WHEN THEY'RE DOING IT. OD IN THEIR COMMUNITIES. SO, THE STAFF LEVEL DECISION ON THE TOD GUIDELINES ARE WHAT WE HAVE TO IMPLEMENT OR WE CAN EXCEED THOSE. BUT AT THE VERY MINIMUM WE HAVE TO DO THE MINIMUM DENSITIES THAT BART PRESCRIBED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PAT ECKLUND: WHAT IS THE LAW THAT WOULD ALLOW A JURISDICTION TO NOT NECESSARILY ADHERE TO WHAT A.B. 2923 SAYS?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I THINK THAT'S A QUESTION FOR LAFAYETTE. I HAVE NOT HEARD THAT. IT SOUND LIKE IT'S SOMETHING THEY ARE EXPLORING.

PAT ECKLUND: I DON'T KNOW SPECIFICALLY WHAT THAT LAW S THEN HOW CAN WE DO ANYTHING BUT DENY THE APPEAL? I GUESS THAT'S MY QUESTION OF STAFF. I DON'T KNOW.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: RESPONSE? I THINK YOU ARE RAISING A LEGAL ISSUE. THE MAYOR OF LAFAYETTE WOULD LIKE TO RESPOND IF YOU WANT TO YIELD TO HER?

PAT ECKLUND: SURE.

SUSAN CANDELL: SB 330 EXEMPTS ZONING OF VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARDS ZONES, SHE DID THAT PUTTING HIGH DENSITY HOUSING IN HER DISTRICT. THESE VERY HIGH FIRE HAZARDS AND SEVERITY ZONES SHOULD BE EXEMPTED FROM THE HOUSING CRISIS ACTS THAT SHE PASSED IN SB 330.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THEY'RE ALLOWING BY RIGHT ADUS?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: NIGHT QUITE AS HIGH DENSITY.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ANY OTHER QUESTIONS?

PAT ECKLUND: I'M DONE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: HUDSON?

DAVID E. HUDSON: I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE PERMANENT NOW I THINK I WOULD BE WORRIED ABOUT THE OTHER LAWS I CAN'T REMEMBER SO MANY NUMBERS AS WE LOOK AT THESE, NUMBER ONE, IF BART COMES IN AND DOES WHAT 38, 43% VERY LOW AND LOW-INCOME, THEY ALSO COULD GO THREE STORIES HIGHER. OR 33 MORE FEET. I MEAN, THIS IS -- THAT ISN'T THE DIRECTION I'M SEEING IN LEGISLATION TO LIMIT THESE THINGS. IN FACT, I DON'T KNOW OF ANYBODY THAT'S ABLE TO STOP WHERE BART IS GOING WITH THIS THING. THE REALITY IS, IF YOU'RE NOT GOING TO DO THE 822 THERE, WHERE IN OUR STATUTES ARE IN WHAT WE CAN USE FOR AN APPEAL DO WE ELIMINATE 822 FROM LAFAYETTE? WE'RE GETTING OFF ON A TANGENT HERE. LAFAYETTE IS STILL ON THE HOOK FOR THESE THINGS UNLESS WE SAY OKAY YOU'RE IN A FIRE HAZARD YOU GOT TO GET RID OF IT PAT EKLUND IS GOING TO BE OVER THERE JUST GLOWING FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO GET TO THE POINT NORTH BAY IF WE DO THAT. THAT'S WHY I ASK THE QUESTION ON DUBLIN ARE WE CANNOT WITH WHAT WE DID WITH THE APPEAL ON DUBLIN AND THEREIN LIES THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PROBLEM UNLESS YOU WANT TO GET OUTSIDE OF OUR SMALL CONSTRAINED WHAT WE CAN LOOK AT, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO MAKE A DETERMINATION TO DENY OR UPHOLD. I THINK THAT'S WHY WE ARE WHEN PAT STARTED TO SPEAK AND I CUT HER OFF.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I JUST WANT TO SAY I THINK THERE'S A DISTINCTION BETWEEN A VACANT LAND THAT IS IN A HIGH FIRE SEVERITY ZONE AND A TRANSIT STATION. AND THE TRANSIT STATION IS STILL THERE. UNLESS WE'RE GOING TO RELOCATE THE TRANSIT STATION TO A PLACE THAT'S NOT IN THE HIGH FIRE SEVERITY ZONE, YOU KNOW, IT'S A TRANSIT STATION. SO, YOU KNOW, I'M VERY CONCERNED, BROADLY, AROUND SITING MORE HOUSING IN AREAS WHERE THERE IS EXTREME FIRE RISK IS AN ISSUE WE'RE DEALING WITH IN MY JURISDICTION BERKELEY, AND I KNOW IT'S AN ISSUE THAT LAMORINDA COMMUNITIES ARE FACING WITH AS WELL. I THINK ASSEMBLY BILL 2923 WANTED TO ENCOURAGE ENABLE BART TO BUILD TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT AT PARKING LOTS AROUND THEIR STATIONS THIS IS PART OF THE REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK IT'S A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT. I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE AN ACTION TO DENY THE APPEAL FROM THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE. IS THERE A SECOND?

BELIA RAMOS: WHO MADE THE MOTION?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I DID.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BELIA RAMOS: I WILL SECOND THE MOTION.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ONCE AGAIN, WE KNOW THIS IS DIFFICULT. THE DECISION ABOUT WHERE YOU PUT THE HOUSING IS A DECISION OF THE LOCAL JURISDICTION. WE'RE NOT TELLING YOU WHERE THE HOUSING NEEDS TO BE BUILT. BUT I JUST THINK GIVEN THAT THIS PARTICULAR PIECE OF PROPERTY AND THE FACT THAT YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO REZONE ANYWAYS, UNDER THIS STATE LAW, MOST LIKELY, YOU KNOW, I AM GOING TO SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION, RESPECTFULLY. MAYOR EKLUND?

PAT ECKLUND: YES. I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE COMMENTS. I TOTALLY AGREE WITH YOUR COMMENT, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN THAT THERE IS A DIFFERENCE BETWEEN EXTREME FIRE RISK, VERY HIGH, AND HIGH FIRE RISK IN AREAS THAT ARE VACANT NOT DEVELOPED NOT DESIGNATED AS A TRANSIT SITE OR EVEN DESIGNATED FOR DEVELOPMENT. AND I GUESS THAT'S THE DIFFERENCE THAT I SEE WHEN DAVE HUDSON SAYS WE'RE GOING LOOK AT THAT FOR MARIN COUNTY. THAT'S NOT TRUE AT ALL BECAUSE DUBLIN AND LAFAYETTE, THEY THOSE CITIES MAY NOT HAVE DESIGNATED THAT AS HOUSING WHERE IN FACT BART OR ANOTHER AGENCY IN FACT DID. AND APPROVAL OF LAFAYETTE STATE BUT THEN STATE LAW DOESN'T ALLOW FOR THAT. TO ME THAT IS A SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE THAN FROM WHAT DAVE HUDSON SAID EARLIER ABOUT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN DUBLIN AND LAFAYETTE. GIVEN THAT, I REALLY SYMPATHIZE WITH LAFAYETTE. AND I DID NOT SUPPORT THAT BILL,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WHAT IT WAS, THE BILL THAT GAVE BART THE AUTHORITY, BECAUSE THAT MEANT THAT ALSO SMART WOULD HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO DO HOUSING ON SMART'S PROPERTY AS WELL WITHOUT OUR APPROVAL. SO I DID NOT SUPPORT THAT LEGISLATION. UNFORTUNATELY THE STATE D SO I, UNFORTUNATELY, HAVE NO CHOICE BUT TO SUPPORT THE MOTION TO DENY THE APPEAL, UNFORTUNATELY.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. ONCE AGAIN, WE KNOW WE'RE ALL DEALING WITH THIS IN OUR JURISDICTIONS. I HAVE A 200% INCREASE IN OUR RHNA ALLOCATIONS THAT WE'RE GOING HAVE TO ABSORB SOMEHOW. AND WE'RE LOOKING AT SOME OF THE VERY ISSUES AROUND DENSITY AND HIGH FIRE RISK AREAS IN THE BERKELEY HILLS. WE'RE DEALING WITH ISSUES AROUND BY RIGHT ADUS AND WHETHER THEY ALLOW ON BAY AREA STREETS AND WHERE THERE WOULDN'T BE PROPER EGRESS. AND WE ALL REMEMBER THE '91 FIRE, THE 30TH ANNIVERSARY IS COMING UP VERY SOON I AM SYMPATHETIC TO CONCERNS AROUND POTENTIALLY PUTTING PEOPLE IN AREAS WHERE THERE IS REAL RISK OF PUBLIC SAFETY BUT WITH ASSEMBLY BILL 2023 YOU'RE LIKELY GOING TO HAVE TO ZONE HERE AND JUST THE FACT THAT THIS IS AT A TRANSIT STATION IT'S PART OF OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK IT'S A DIFFERENT SITUATION. I MADE THE MOTION. I UNDERSTAND THE CHALLENGES YOU'RE DEALING W WE'RE HERE TO WORK YOU AS YOUR IMPLEMENTING YOUR HOUSING ELEMENTS. IDEALS THERE ARE OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MOTION IS TO MAKE A DECISION TO DENY THE APPEAL? ROLL CALL ON THE MOTION?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY WITH ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. NINE VOTES AYE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: ONCE AGAIN THIS, IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION, FINAL ACTION WILL BE TAKEN AT THE CLOSE OF PUBLIC HEARING WE'LL PROVIDE NOTICE OF WHEN THAT IS. IF BART WANTS TO HAVE DEVELOPMENT AT THIS LOCATIONS THEN THEY NEED TO MAKE AN INVESTMENT TO PROTECT HOUSING AND PEOPLE AT LAFAYETTE THROUGH THE VARIOUS FIRE MITIGATION EFFORTS IF IT'S GOING TO BE IN A HIGH FIRE HAZARD ZONE THEY NEED TO TAKE STEPS TO PROTECT THE COMMUNITY AS WELL. THAT'S JUST A STATEMENT THEY WANT TO MAKE ON THE RECORD. THANK YOU FOR YOUR APPEAL AND PRESENTATION. WITH THAT, WE'RE GOING BOW TO OUR LAST APPEAL FOR TODAY WHICH IS ITEM G, REPORT ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL. AND THIS IS A PRELIMINARY ACTION. YES, SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF? YOU'RE MUTED.

KAREN MITCHOFF: I HAVE BEEN VERY QUIET ON ALL THE CONTRA COSTA ONES AS YOU MIGHT IMAGINE. I KNOW THAT I HAVE TO RECUSE MYSELF FROM WHEN THE COUNTY MAKES ITS PRESENTATION, BUT I DO LIVE IN PLEASANT HILL, AND AM A FORMER MEMBER AND MAYOR OF THEIR CITY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COUNCIL. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW, COUNCIL, AND I AM HAPPY TO DO SO, IF I SHOULD RECUSE MYSELF.

KATHLEEN KANE: IT'S NOT REQUIRED UNDER OUR PROCEDURES BECAUSE YOU DON'T CURRENTLY REPRESENT THEM BUT IF YOU FEEL LIKE IT WOULD BE PRUDENT THEN THE DECISION IS UP TO YOU IN TERMS OF WHETHER IT'S DIFFICULT TO MAKE AN UNBIASED DECISION.

KAREN MITCHOFF: IT'S NOT DIFFICULT. IT'S NOT FAIR TO SINGLE OUT ONE COMMUNITY AS I MENTIONED EARLIER. I JUST WANTED COUNSEL'S RECOMMENDATION. THANK YOU. I WILL STAY IN THE MEETING.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: GIVEN THE PROCESS THAT WE HAVE EMPLOYED FOR MANY OF THE OTHER APPEALS TODAY THE JURISDICTION WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES TO PRESENT THEN MTC WILL HAVE RESPOND TO THE APPEAL, THEN OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. WE'LL HAVE THE PRESENTATION FROM THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL. WHO WILL REPRESENTING?

SPEAKER: I WILL BE PRESENTING.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: IS THERE A PRESENTATION?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: WE DON'T HAVE A FORM WILL PRESENTATION IN TERMS OF POWERPOINTS.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE.

SPEAKER: SHOULD I BEGIN?

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: I TURN THE FLOOR OVER TO YOU.

ETHAN: THANK YOU FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION TODAY, I KNOW IT TAKES A LOT TO SIT THROUGH PUBLIC HEARINGS AND SIT THROUGH THE APPEALS AND ARGUMENTS AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE YOUR WORK AND APPRECIATE IT. I AM HAPPY TO PRESENT OUR CASE TODAY I AM JOINED BY OUR CITY MANAGER JIM CATALANO, AND CRAIG FUJIMOTO, I DON'T KNOW IF MAYOR NOWAK WILL BE ABLE TO JOIN US TODAY SHE HAS A MEETING. LET ME START BY SAYING, THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL WOULD LIKE TO ASSOCIATE ITSELF WITH MANY COMMENTS AND ARGUMENTS RAISED PREVIOUSLY REGARDING RELATED TO CLIMATE CHANGE. AND THE CLIMATE RELATED CONCERNS, WHETHER IT BE SEA LEVEL RISE, OR WILDFIRES, THAT WE JUST HAD IN DISCUSSION OR DROUGHT, AND ALL OF THOSE CONCERNS WE BELIEVE THOSE ARE VALID ARGUMENTS THAT WE BELIEVE SHOULD BE UNDER CONSIDERATION AS WE CONSIDER AS A REGION, BODY OF STATE, AND FUTURE GROWTH. WE ASSOCIATE OURSELVES WITH SOME OF THE ARGUMENTS, THERE ARE EVER PRESENT WILDFIRE DANGERS AND WE HAVE OUR WEST PLANK OF OUR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CITY ADJACENT TO OPEN SPACES THAT MIGHT BE MORE PRONE TO BURNING AND WE WOULD BE HESITANT TO INCREASE DENSITIES NEAR THOSE SORTS OF NATURAL HAZARDS ALSO REGARDING DROUGHT CONDITIONS, THAT'S A REALITY FOR THE ENTIRE REGION WE UNDERSTAND. WE UNDERSTAND PROPOSED SOLUTIONS AS RELATED IN THE ABAG APPEAL RESPONSE LETTER TO OUR APPEAL THE SOLUTION COULD BE INFILL OR GREATER HOUSING DENSITIES FOR EFFICIENCY OF SCALE WE HAVE CONCERNS THAT RELATE TO THAT RELATED TO SALES TAX MEASURES. LET ME ALSO BE CLEAR, AND I'LL STEP BACK FROM THE WHOLE PRECIPICE OF METHODOLOGY. I REALIZE THIS IS NOT AN APPEALS PROCESS. THE METHODOLOGY WAS PRESENTED DURING THE METHODOLOGY PROCESS WE BELIEVE AS MENTIONED THERE ARE SOME FLAWS IN THOSE MEASURES WE BELIEVE THERE IS A JOBS/HOUSING GROWTH IMBALANCE WE BELIEVE HOUSING SHOULD OCCUR WHERE JOBS ARE PREVALENT SOUTH BAY SHOULD HAVE A GREATER CONCENTRATION OF HOUSING CLOSE TO JURISDICTIONS LIKE PLEASANT HILL. HOWEVER I'M NOT HERE TO DEBATE THROUGHOUT THE DAY. I WANT TO TOUCH ON TWO POINTS FROM THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL'S PERSPECTIVE WITH CONSIDERATION, THERE IS AN AIR FIELD LOCATED IN CONCORD AND THE RUNWAYS LEAD TO AND THE AIRPLANES FLY OVER PORTIONS OF THE CITY SUCH THAT THERE ARE CONSTRAINTS IN THAT PORTION OF THE CITY RELATIVE TO DENSITY AND HEIGHT ZONES THAT LIMIT THE REDEVELOPMENT POTENTIAL OF THAT AREA. I ALSO WANT TO TOUCH ON, UNIQUE TO PLEASANT HILL WE HAVE ONE OF THE LOWEST PROPERTY TAX BASES. I THINK WE MAY BE SECOND OR THIRD LOWEST IN THE ENTIRE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COUNTY AND 5.6%. SO WE HAVE THAT AS A BACKDROP. I RAISE THAT, BECAUSE WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT MAINTAINING PROPER JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE OF COURSE AND ROUGHLY 15% OF PLEASANT HILLS EIGHT SQUARE MILES IN THE JURISDICTION ONLY 15% OF THAT IS AVAILABLE FOR COMMERCIAL USE. WE'RE CURRENT GIVEN MAJORITY OF OUR CITY AS HOUSING RELATED RESIDENTIAL WE HAVE 570 ACRES OF COMMERCIAL LAND WITHIN OUR CITY ELEMENTS MANY OF WHICH ARE ALREADY DEVELOPED AND HAVE TENANTS AND MAY NOT BE INCLINED TO CHANGE AND ACCOMMODATE HOUSING GROWTH, FACTORS FOR CHANGE IN OWNERSHIP OR OPPORTUNITY, BUT LESS THAN 60 ACRES IN OUR CITY IS VACANT FOR VARIOUS LAND USE CLASSIFICATIONS THAT WEEKEND REZONE TO ACCOMMODATE POTENTIAL GROWTH. ONE OF THE LOTS IN PARTICULAR IS ABOUT HALF THAT ENTIRE SUM. SO WE HAVE SOME LIMITED RESOURCES AVAILABLE TO US. AND, AGAIN, IT COMES BECOME TO THE WHOLE IDEA OF THE CONVERSION OF COMMERCIAL LANDS FOR RESIDENTIAL USES COULD POTENTIALLY ERODE PLEASANT HILLS SALES TAX BASE BOTTOM LINE ARE THE CONCERN WE HAVE WE THINK IT MERITS CONSIDERATION, LOSS OF SALES TAX COULD HAVE INJURIOUS EFFECTS TO OUR GENERAL FUND WHICH COULD IMPACT SERVICES RELATIVE TO EMERGENCY OTHER AND THINGS WE THINK IT'S A UNIQUE POSITION GIVEN OUR PROPERTY TAX BASE WE WOULD CONSIDER A REDUCTION IN NUMBERS AS NOTED IN OUR LETTER. I RAN OUT OF TIME. I APOLOGIZE FOR GOING OVER.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY FOR REBUTTAL AFTER STAFF PRESENTATION. ANYTHING YOU WOULD LIKE TO ADD. I WOULD LIKE ASK MTC/ABAG STAFF TO PRESENT THEIR RESPONSE TO THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILLS APPEAL.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE, AND THANK YOU TO THE MANY OF THE HILL FOR PRESENTING THEIR ARGUMENTS. AS DISCUSSED THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL IS REQUESTING A REDUCTION OF 119 UNIT WHICH IS REPRESENTS A REDUCTION OF 57% FROM THEIR DRAFT ALLOCATION AND STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO DENY THE APPEAL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND SO PLEASANT HILL HAS ARGUED THAT ABAG FAILED TO CONSIDER THE IMPACTED DEVELOPMENT RESTRICTIONS AROUND THE BUCHANAN APART IMPORTANTLY THE CITY DID NOT SUBMIT A LOCAL JURISDICTION SURVEY PROVIDING ABAG WITH THIS INFORMATION BUT REGARDLESS WE DID LOOK INTO IT AND THEY PROVIDED A LINK TO A BUCHANEN FIELD AIRPORT POLICY DOCUMENT WE REVIEWED THAT AS WELL AS A BLUEPRINT STAFF CONFIRMED THERE IS NO RESIDENTIAL GROWTH FORECASTED IN PLEASANT HILL IN SAFETY ZONES TWO AND THREE WHERE RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT IS PROHIBITED. THE FINAL BLUEPRINT DOES FORECAST GROWTH IN SAFETY ZONE 4. WHICH IS ALLOWED FOR BUILDING LIMITATION OF FOUR STORIES THE FORECASTED TOWNHOME DEVELOPMENT REPLACING EXISTING RETAIL ON A 10.7 ACRE PARCEL WITHIN THIS WOULD CERTAINLY BE WITHIN HEIGHT OF THE REGULATIONS AND NEAR OTHER RETAIL AND RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT STAFF CONCLUDES THAT THE PLANNED BAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT AND FINAL METHODOLOGY ALIGN WITH RESTRICTIONS IMPOSED BY THE BUCHANEN AIRPORT SAFETY ZONES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PLEASANT HILL ARGUES THAT'S RHNA METHODOLOGY FAILS TO CONSIDER THE AVAILABILITY OF LAND SUITABLE FOR HOUSING AND MANY OF THE HILL STATES THAT THE REZONING COMMERCIAL LAND FOR THE HOUSING MEET REQUIREMENTS. AND INCORPORATING DATA FROM THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION DEVELOPING FINAL BLUEPRINTS THAT WORK WITH THE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO GATHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE PLAN. ABAG -- [INDISCERNIBLE] LAND USE RESTRICTIONS. PLEASANT HILL DOES NOT PROVIDE EVIDENCE IT'S UNABLE TO CONSIDER UNDER UTILIZATION OF EXISTING SITES INCREASED DENSITIES AND OTHER PLANNING TOOLS TO ACCOMMODATE ITS ASSIGNED NEED REGARDING JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE USING DATA ABOUT JOBS/HOUSING RELATIONSHIP INCORPORATES DATA FROM THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AND JOB FACTORS THAT INDICATE RHNA BASED ON PROXIMITY TO JOBS AND CONFIRMED THE METHODOLOGY IMPROVES JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE WITHIN THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. HAVEN'T HILL ARGUES THE METHODOLOGY FAILS TO CONSIDER THE AVAILABILITY OF WATER RESOURCES FOR NEW HOUSING DEVELOPMENT AS DISCUSSED TODAY STATUTE DEFINED WATER SUPPLY CON RESTAURANTS DURING ALLOCATION AS THOSE THAT INCLUDE THE JURISDICTION FROM PROVIDING NECESSARY INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT DURING THE RHNA PERIOD. WHILE STAFF UNDERSTANDS CONCERNS ABOUT THE DROUGHT PLEASANT HILL'S ARGUMENTS DO NOT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MEET THE REQUIREMENTS FOR A VALID RHNA APPEAL. CONTRA COSTA WATER DISTRICT MANAGEMENT PLAN DOES NOT ANALYZE THE IMPACT OF HOUSEHOLD GROWTH RESULTING FROM RHNA BUT THE CITY HAS NOT DEMONSTRATED THAT IT'S PREVENTED FROM MEETING IT'S ALLOCATION BECAUSE OF THE DECISION BY THE WATER SERVICE PROVIDER. THE EXISTENCE OF THE DROUGHT DOES NOT CHANGE THE NEED TO ADD MORE HOUSING, TO ADDRESS THE BAY AREA'S LACK OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PLEASANT HILL ARGUES THAT THE RHNA METHODOLOGY DOES NOT MEET FOUR OF THE FIVE OBJECTIVES AND IMPORTANTLY THE ARGUMENT CHALLENGES THE FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY AND WE HAVE ESTABLISHED THAT IT FALLS OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THE APPEALS PROCESS, THAT HCD HAS APPROVED THE METHODOLOGY AND CERTIFIED IT DOES FURTHER THE STATUTORY OBJECTIVES. A WRITTEN RESPONSE TO THE APPEAL GOES INTO MORE DETAILS BUT THERE ISN'T TIME TO COVER THAT IN THIS PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO FAR ABAG MTC STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE COMMITTEE DENY PLEASANT HILLS APPEAL. PLEASANT HILL DID NOT SUBMIT A LOCAL JURISDICTION SURVEY. ARGUMENTS RELATED TO THE INFORMATION SUBMITTED IN THE SURVEY ARE NOT VALID BUT WE DID EXPLORE ARGUMENT IN DETERMINED PLEASANT HILL HAS NOT PROVED IT'S UNABLE TO ACCOMMODATE ITS ASSIGNED HOUSING NEED AND THE ALLOCATION FURTHER STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND HCD HAS CONFIRMED THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO GIVER THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO STAFF PRESENTATION. IF YOU SO CHOOSE.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN I WOULD JUST NOTE AND APOLOGIZE FOR GOING OVER EARLIER BUT JUST A COUPLE OF POINTS AND I RESPECT THE CONCLUSION RELATIVE TO THE METHODOLOGY AND THE RHNA DETERMINATION. RELATIVE TO THE ASSUMPTIONS ET CETERA. I DO WANT TO PUT A FINER POINT ON THE SALES TAX OR TOT TAX AND AS I MENTIONED WE HAVE A VERY -- WE'RE A PREDOMINANTLY RESIDENTIAL COMMUNITY WE HAVE A COMMERCIAL STRIP CONTRA COSTA BOULEVARD AND OTHER NEIGHBORHOODS SERVING SALES TAX REVENUE FUND ROUGHLY 45% OF TAXES CONSTITUTE 45% OF OUR REVENUES AND ANY, SORT OF, REDUCTION, THE EROSION OF THAT TAX BASE IS OF GREAT CONCERN TO THE CITY AND WE BELIEVE IN EFFORT TO MEET THESE NUMBERS WE MAY ACTUALLY END UP COSTING OURSELVES THE ABILITY TO RESPOND TO EMERGENCY SERVICES ARE OR INFRASTRUCTURE UPGRADES OR ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF GENERAL CITY FACILITIES. I'LL PAUSE THERE TO SEE IF MY COLLEAGUES HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD TO THAT POINT. I THINK THAT WOULD CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION OR REBUTTAL UNLESS CITY MANAGER OWE PLANNER WOULD LIKE TO ADD?

SPEAKER: I HAVE NOTHING TO ADD. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: TROY, GO AHEAD.

SPEAKER: I WAS JUST GOING TO SAY I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD.

SPEAKER: I THINK THAT CONCLUDES OUR REBUTTAL. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO CONCLUDE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE RHNA APPEAL FOR THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING IN WE HAVE ONE RAISED HAND. CHRISTY CORELY.

SPEAKER: YES. I HAVE A QUESTION. MAINLY FOR ALL CITIES IN HIGH FIRE ZONES ISN'T CAL FIRE COMING OUT WITH THEIR NEW HIGH VERY HIGH AND HIGH FIRE MAPS FOR CALIFORNIA IN DECEMBER? AND THEN CITIES CAN ADOPT OR NOT ADOPT THOSE. HOW IS ABAG TAKING THAT INTO CONSIDERATION IF IN FACT THE MAPS HAVE NOT BEEN UPDATED IN TEN YEARS, I THINK, 8 TO 10 YEARS. MAYBE TEN YEARS. I'M JUST CURIOUS IF THAT'S BEING CONSIDERED. THANK YOU.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. WE CAN ADDRESS AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE RHNA APPEAL FROM THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL? IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE APPEAL PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU ARE PHONING IN I DO NOT SEE ANY ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS FROM CASTRO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WRITTEN COMMENTS EITHER.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY THANK YOU. I FIRST WANT TO ADDRESS THE QUESTION FROM THE SPEAKER. YES, IT IS CORRECT THAT NEW MAPS ARE GOING TO BE COMING OUT. YOU KNOW, UNFORTUNATELY THAT'S NOT GOING TO -- THAT'S NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO IMPACT THE RHNA ALLOCATION. BUT THAT'S DEFINITELY SOMETHING THAT LOCAL JURISDICTIONS IF I'M NOT MISTAKEN CAN CONSIDER RELATIVE TO WHERE THEY LOCATE THEIR HOUSING IN THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT SITE SELECTION PROCESS. BUT MR. VAUTIN OR MS. ADAMS I DON'T KNOW IF YOU HAVE ANY COMMENT ON THAT. >DAVE VAUTIN: PRESIDENT ARREGUIN I CONCUR WITH EVERYTHING YOU JUST SAID AS SOON AS THE MAPS ARE FINALIZED WHICH I THINK WE HEARD AT ONE POINT AT THE END OF 2021 THERE MAY BE SLIPPAGE ON THE DEADLINE OF THAT, AND WE'LL INCORPORATE THAT INTO FUTURE PLANNING PRODUCTS INCLUDING NEXT ITERATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA BUT OBVIOUSLY WE WEREN'T ABLE TO INCORPORATE SOMETHING THAT WASN'T AVAILABLE TO US AND IT'S NOT FINALIZED INTO THIS ITERATION OF THE PLAN.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: LOCAL JURISDICTIONS HAD A YEAR TO UPDATE THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS AND ANY ASSOCIATED RESOUNDING TO ACHIEVE COMPLIANT HOUSING ELEMENTS. THE STATE HAS INCREASED THEIR A COMPLIANCE OF HOUSING ELEMENT INCLUDING SEEKING LEGAL ACTION AGAINST LOCAL JURISDICTIONS SO WE DON'T WANT TO PUT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN A POSITION ALSO WHERE THEY ARE DOOMED TO FAIL. BUT THIS IS DEFINITELY SOMETHING THAT CAN BE CONSIDERED AS THE HOUSING ELEMENTS ARE BEING DEVELOPED BY EACH RESPECTIVE JURISDICTION. WE'LL GO TO MAYOR EKLUND.

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. FIRST, I WANTED TO ASK THE APPLICANT WHY THEY DIDN'T COMPLETE THEIR SURVEY THAT ABAG SENT OUT.

SPEAKER: I APPRECIATE THE QUESTION. I'M NOT MAKE EXCUSES, I'M RELATIVELY NEW TO THIS CITY I DO REALIZE THAT WHEN TALKING WITH STAFF I ASKED THE QUESTION AND HEARD WE WERE IN A BIT OF TRANSITION ON STAFFING THAT'S AN UNFORTUNATE REALITY BUT UNFORTUNATELY AN EXCUSE. IN PLEASANT HILL WE HAVE A PDA HERE IN TOWN WE PARTICIPATE IN TRANCE PACK ON AND WE'RE GOING TO SUPPORT REGIONAL EFFORTS I THINK THIS IS UNFORTUNATE ON OUR PART I THINK IT WAS EXPRESSED EARLIER IN THE DAY, WITH THE CITY OF DUBLIN PERHAPS THEY HAD KNOWN THE GRAVITY THAT WOULD HAVE BEEN PLACED UPON THAT SURVEY YEARS AGO, PERHAPS WE WOULD HAVE -- WELL, WE MISSED THE OPPORTUNITY SO WE ACKNOWLEDGE THAT BUT WE THINK IT'S WORTH -- THERE IS MERIT TO DISCUSS THE POINTS THAT WE RAISED IN OUR APPEAL.

PAT ECKLUND: THAT SUPPORTS AND REINFORCES A LOT OF THE COMMENTS THEY HAVE BEEN MAKING THROUGHOUT THIS HEARING. TWO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

QUESTIONS FOR STAFF. WHEN IS LACK OF AVAILABLE LAND, AND THEN TO REZONE -- THE NEED TO REZONE COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES, NOVATO IS THE POOREST PROPERTY TAX CITY IN MARIN COUNTY, WE GET $0.70 ON THE DOLLAR PLEASANT HILL GETTING 5.6 CENTS ON THE THERE THAT'S EVEN LESS THAN US. WE RELY ON RETAIL AND COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES TO GET THE SALAX TAX AND TOT TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT OUR COMMUNITY NEEDS SO IS THERE A FACTOR IN DEVELOPMENT -- IN MAKING A DECISION ABOUT HAVING TO REZONE COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES? IS THERE A FACTOR IN THERE THAT THE AVAILABILITY OF -- FOR THOSE CITIES THAT ARE LOW PROPERTY TAX CITIES THERE IS A FEW IN THE STATE, THERE ARE SEVERAL IN THE STATE, ESPECIALLY THOSE CITIES THAT HAVE BEEN FORMED AFTER 1978 AFTER PROP 13, BUT FOR THOSE THAT ARE FOR CITIES THAT WERE FORMED BEFORE 1978 WE GOT CAUGHT WHEN THE MILL RATE WAS FROZEN, FOR CITIES THAT GET FUNDING FROM COMMERCIAL PROPERTY IS THAT STILL VIABLE?

GILLIAN ADAMS: THAT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT IS IDENTIFIED IN HOUSING ELEMENT LAW AS SOMETHING TO BE CONSIDERED WHEN DOING RHNA ALLOCATIONS.

PAT ECKLUND: THIS IS ANOTHER ISSUE. I'LL MAKE IT AROUND COMMENTS INSTEAD OF QUESTIONS. YOU KNOW, THERE IS -- WE NEED STATE LAW TO BE ABLE TO CHANGE THAT, BUT IT'S NOT GOING TO HAPPEN. AT LEAST IN MY OPINION, BECAUSE THE OTHER TAXING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ORGANIZATIONS ARE NOT GOING TO BE INTERESTED IN TRYING TO LOWER THEIR TAX RATE IN ORDER TO MAKE SURE THAT CITIES LIKE PLEASANT HILL NOVATO AND OTHERS CREDIT TAX RATE. BASED ON THE WATER AVAILABILITY MOST CITIES IN THE BAY AREA DO NOT HAVE JURISDICTION OVER WATER WHAT IF A WATER AGENCY A SEPARATE GOVERNMENTAL AGENCY CEASES HOOK UPS BASED ON LACK OF WATER? SO THAT THEY'RE NOT GOING TO APPROVE ANY HOOK UPS, WHAT -- IS THERE A PROVISION IN STATE LAW THAT THEN WOULD RELIEVE THAT CITY OR TOWN FROM THE RHNA? BECAUSE WE COULD NOT ISSUE PERMITS WITHOUT THE AVAILABILITY OF WATER HOOKUPS.

GILLIAN ADAMS: I DON'T HAVE THE EXACT STATUTORY LANGUAGE AT MY FINGER TIPS RIGHT NOW BUT WHAT THE STATUTE SAYS IN GENERAL IS THAT IF A WATER SERVICE PROVIDER WAS TO MAKE A DECISION THAT PRECLUDES THE JURISDICTION FROM MEETING ITS RHNA. SO I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS YOU WOULD HAVE TO CONSIDER IS WHETHER THEY MADE A DECISION THAT LASTS THROUGHOUT THE ENTIRE EIGHT YEAR RHNA PERIOD. WE HAVE HEARD THAT SOME WATER SERVICE PROVIDERS ARE, IN ANTICIPATION OF MAYBE THE CURRENT DROUGHT GETTING WORSE, CONSIDERING THAT IS A POSSIBLE, BUT THE RHNA PERIOD STARTS TWO YEARS FROM NOW, BUT WHAT A JURISDICTION WOULD HAVE TO DEMONSTRATE IS THAT THEY ARE, THROUGH A DECISION THAT'S, SORT OF, OUTSIDE THEIR CONTROL, FULLY PRECLUDED FROM MEETING THE RHNA ALLOCATION.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PAT ECKLUND: THAT DOESN'T QUITE ANSWER MY QUESTION. SO, IF IT'S A HOOK UP, PROHIBITION FOR ONE OR TWO YEARS, IT'S GOING TO DELAY THE PERMIT ISSUANCE, BECAUSE A LOT OF DEVELOPERS ARE NOT GOING TO WANT TO PURSUE DEVELOPMENT IN THAT AREA BECAUSE OF THE WATER HOOK UPS YOU'RE SAYING THAT THE CITY WOULD BE ACTUALLY STILL ON THE HOOK UNLESS THEY GOT, LIKE, STATE LEGISLATION OR SOMETHING TO HAVE MORE OF A FACTOR IN THERE?

GILLIAN ADAMS: I'M NOT ENTIRELY SURE WHAT THE REMEDY WOULD BE. I MEAN, THAT SOUNDS LIKE ONE POSSIBILITY. AGAIN, IF, YOU KNOW, SO THE QUESTION OF WHETHER OR NOT A DEVELOPER MIGHT WANT TO DEVELOP THEIR -- THE REQUIREMENT FOR RHNA IS THAT THE JURISDICTION HAS TO BE ABLE TO PLAN FOR THEIR RHNA ALLOCATION SO I THINK AGAIN YOU WOULD HAVE TO HAVE SOME INDICATION FROM A WATER SERVICE PROVIDER THAT WHATEVER ACTION THEY'RE TAKING WOULD AFFECT A JURISDICTION'S ABILITY TO ACCOMMODATE FOR THE RHNA FOR THE ENTIRE PERIOD. >DAVE VAUTIN: IF I MAY, I WOULD LIKE TO ADD THERE ARE TWO IMPORTANT LENSES HERE GILLIAN HAS BEEN SPEAKING ABOUT IN THE CONTEXT OF RHNA APPEALS, THE ROLE OF ABAG FOR TODAY'S HEARING BASICALLY DOES LOCAL JURISDICTION PRECLUDED OVER THE HORIZON OF THE RHNA PERIOD. AND I THINK YOU RAISED AN IMPORTANT QUESTION AND MAYBE MORE APPROPRIATELY ADDRESSED TO THE STATE WITNESS WE WRAP UP THIS RHNA PROCESS AS AN ORGANIZATION IT THEN DOES PIVOT TOWARDS LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AND HCD AND POTENTIALLY THE STATE OVERSEEING AND ENFORCING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STATE LAWS, AND CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, THEY MAY BE BETTER POSITIONS TO ANSWER HOW THE DROUGHT AND THOSE SORTS OF THINGS AS THEY'RE LOOKING AT HOUSING ELEMENTS PROGRESS TOWARDS HOUSING ELEMENTS THROUGHOUT THE 2020S, HOW THAT MIGHT CONSIDER UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES THAT ARISE, LIKE A MULTI-YEAR PROHIBITION ON MULTI-YEAR HOOK UPS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO DELINEATE THOSE TWO THINGS IN THE ROLE OF ABAG IN THIS SPACE.

PAT ECKLUND: THAT HELPS ME A LOT AND I'LL MAKE SUGGESTIONS ON FOR COMMENCE ON THE MOTION WHEN WE GET THERE.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: MAYOR HUDSON.

DAVID E. HUDSON: I TALKED TO YOUR MAYOR YESTERDAY AT THE CALIFORNIA LEAGUE OF CITIES NOT AT LENGTH ABOUT THIS BUT I TOLD HER I THOUGHT YOU WROTE A VERY GOOD APPEAL I TOLD PLEASANTON THEY WROTE A GOOD APPEAL THE PROBLEM IS WE'RE STRAPPED ON DECISION MAKING YOU CAN HAVE THE GREATEST APPEAL IN THE WORLD BUT WHEN IT COMES DOWN TO FINDINGS. TODAY IT CAME DOWN TO THE SAME THING THEY READ FROM THIS COMMITTEE FOR CLAYTON HOUSING ELEMENT LAW REQUIRES METHODOLOGY TO IMPROVE INTRAREGIONAL HAPPY BETWEEN JOBS AND HOUSING, NOT JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE IN ANY PARTICULAR JURISDICTION. AND NO MATTER WHAT YOU THINK, OR MIGHT WANT TO SAY, PLEASANT HILL IS LITERALLY GROUND ZERO FOR THE INNOVATE 680 PROJECT THAT CCTA IS TRYING TO DO.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT MAY NOT BE PRUDENT FOR ME TO MOVE THE ITEM IT IS COMPELLING TO VOTE DENIAL ON THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS FOR THE APPELLANT OR STAFF? OKAY. IF NOT, I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE OR DENY OR APPROVE WITH MODIFICATIONS.

NEYSA FLIGOR: I MAKE THE MOLE TO DENY THE APPEAL.

SPEAKER: SECOND.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: COMMENTS?

PAT ECKLUND: I WANT TO ADD TO THE LIST FOR ITEMS FOR FUTURE DISCUSSION ONE IS THE ISSUE OF WATER HOOK UPS, AND AFTER THE RHNA IS DETERMINED, AND IF THERE IS A HOOK UP PROHIBITION, CAN WE WORK WITH THE STATE, STATE LEGISLATURE, HCD, TO POSSIBLY GIVE AN EXTENSION ON THE RHNA PERFORMANCE PERIOD OR SOMETHING TO COMMENSURATE WITH THAT WATER HOOK UP? WE JUST NEED TO HAVE -- START SOME DISCUSSION, BECAUSE I ANTICIPATE, UNLESS WE GET A LOT OF WATER THIS WINTER, WHICH I KIND OF DOUBT, WE'RE PROBABLY GOING TO HAVE LIMITATION ON HOOK UPS IN A LOT OF CITIES IN THE BAY AREA OR IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. THE OTHER ISSUE I WOULD LIKE TO ADD IS THIS WHOLE ISSUE OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PROPERTY TAX CITIES, AND THE RHNA FACTOR OF, WELL, YOU DEMONSTRATE LACK EVER AVAILABLE LAND THEN YOU REDESIGN COMMERCIAL PROPERTY BUT THERE IS POTENTIAL SIGNIFICANT IMPACT FINANCIALLY ON THAT CITY AND BEING ABLE TO PROVIDE SERVICES. AND SO, WE ALL KNOW EVERY SINGLE ELECTED OFFICIAL KNOWS THAT SERVES IN A CITY OR A COUNTY, THAT HOUSING DOES NOT PAY FOR ITSELF, AND THAT'S WHY A LOT OF CITIES ARE ISSUING -- DOING MELLO-ROOS. THOSE ARE TWO AREAS I WOULD LIKE TO ADD AND UNFORTUNATELY I'LL HAVE TO SUPPORT THE DENIAL ON THE APPEAL.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: THANK YOU. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? QUESTIONS? I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS. SO THE MOTION IS TO TAKE A PRELIMINARY ACTION TO DENY THE RHNA APPEAL FROM THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL. AND I'LL NOTE THAT THIS IS PRELIMINARY. WE'LL TAKE FINAL ACTION AT THE CONCLUSION MUCH THE PUBLIC HEARING AND PROVIDE NOTICE OF THE DATE OF THAT MEETING. UNLESS THERE IS FURTHER DISCUSSION I'LL ASK THE CLERK FOR ROLL CALL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION BY FLIGOR SECOND ROMERO. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: OKAY. THANK YOU. WELL, THANK YOU TO THE CITY OF PLEASANT HILL FOR COMING TODAY AND FOR YOUR THOUGHTFUL PRESENTATION. THAT COMPLETES THIS ITEM. AND THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMPLETES ALL OF THE APPEALS THAT WE ARE CONSIDERING TODAY. SO WITH THAT, MAYOR EKLUND?

PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, IS IT POSSIBLE FOR STAFF -- BECAUSE WE HAVE MADE A LOT OF SUGGESTIONS HERE FOR US TO LOOK AT, AT A LATER TIME. IS IT POSSIBLE FOR STAFF TO GIVE US A DRAFT LIST BEFORE THE NEXT HEARING SO MAYBE WE DON'T HAVE TO REPEAT SOME OF THESE THINGS AND JUST SAY IT'S ON THE LIST FOR FUTURE DISCUSSION? THAT MIGHT JUST HELP A LITTLE BIT SO THAT WE KNOW THAT IT'S ON THAT LIST. AT LEAST IT WOULD HELP ME. I DON'T KNOW ABOUT OTHERS. BUT IT WOULD HELP ME. THANK YOU. AND I HAVE GOT MAYOR ARREGUIN, YOU DID A FANTASTIC JOB RUNNING THIS HEARING. I WANT TO COMPLEMENT YOU. AND STAFF, I WANT TO THANK GILLIAN AND ELI FOR YOUR OUTSTANDING STAFF WORK. GILLIAN, I HAVE WORKED WITH YOU, EVER SINCE I HAVE BEEN WITH ABAG, AND YOU'RE THE TOP. I MEAN, I HAVE REALLY SEEN THE GROWTH IN THE DEVELOPMENT, AND JUST REALLY AM IMPRESSED WITH YOUR ANALYTICAL AND COMMUNICATION SKILLS. JUST FANTASTIC. AND DAVE, FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP.

DAVID E. HUDSON: THANK YOU.

PAT ECKLUND: AND RESPONSIVENESS. SO, IS THAT OKAY?

DAVID E. HUDSON: IT WAS THERE FOR THE TAKING.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PAT ECKLUND: NOT DAVE HUDSON. I'M TALKING ABOUT DAVE VAUTIN. DAVE F THAT'S DAVE HUDSON, YOU OWE ME BIG. [LAUGHTER] SO, ANYWAY, GREAT JOB, AND KATHLEEN, YOUR GUIDANCE AND CLEAR AND DIRECT AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT AS WELL. YOU GUYS DID A FANTASTIC JOB, AND ALL THE CITIES, MY HEART PLEASED WITH EVERY SINGLE ONE OF THEM. ENOUGH ALREADY.

DAVID E. HUDSON: THAT IS THE FIRST TIME I HAVE SEEN YOU HESITATE. I KNOW YOU WANT TO SAY ADJOURNED. JUST SAY ADJOURNED.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

KAREN MITCHOFF: THANK YOU. I WANT TO REITERATE WHAT PAT SAID. I AM VERY IMPRESSED BY STAFF'S PRESENTATIONS. THEY DIDN'T DO CUT AND PASTE. YOU DID AN IN DEPTH JOB AND REALLY SERVICED EACH CITY'S APPEAL. I FEEL THIS THEY GOT PERSONALIZED AND SPECIALIZED ATTENTION. I JUST REALLY WAS IMPRESSED BY STAFF'S RESPONSE. AND WE JUST CAN'T THANK YOU ENOUGH. I KNOW WE'RE SITTING HERE ALL DAY, WE GET TO DO A LITTLE BIT OF OTHER STUFF. YOU HAVE TO BE RIGHT ON AT ALL TIMES, AND WE KNOW HOW DIFFICULT THAT IS. SO, I JUST WANT TO ADD MY KUDOS THAT I AM SO IMPRESSED, AND SO APPRECIATIVE OF ALL OF YOU STAFF AT ABAG. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT: AND I SECOND THAT. REALLY INCREDIBLE WORK. THROUGHOUT THIS WHOLE PROCESS BUT PARTICULAR HE IN RESPONDING TO THESE APPEALS. AND I APPRECIATE THAT YOU EVEN LOOKED AT THINGS THAT WE CAN'T EVEN CONSIDER. YOU JUST REALLY, YOU KNOW, REALLY LISTENED TO WHAT THE CITY SAID, AND REALLY CONSIDERED OBJECTIVELY. JUST WANT TO THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND TO THE COMMITTEE THIS, IS A BIG COMMITMENT, AND IT'S A LOT OF TIME AND WE WOULD JUST REALLY APPRECIATE, WE'RE ALL ELECTED OFFICIALS, WE HAVE VERY BUSY SCHEDULES. WE REALLY APPRECIATE YOU DEDICATING THE TIME FOR THIS IMPORTANT TASK. SO WE REALLY APPRECIATE IT. SO WITH THAT, THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WILL CONTINUE THIS PUBLIC HEARING ON RHNA APPEALS REMOTELY VIA ZOOM TO WEDNESDAY SEPTEMBER 29TH, 2021. FROM 9 TO 1:00 P.M., AND THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU ALL. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NTT

Broadcasting Government