ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS

Meeting Transcript

ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS

ABAG SAN FRANCISCO BAY TRAIL STEERING COMMITTEE

MONDAY, OCTOBER 4, 2021, 12:00 P.M.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THIS IS A SPECIAL MEETING OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE FOR THE BAY TRAIL PROJECT. FIRST THING OF ORDER, HAVE THE STAFF -- THERE IS A RECORDED MESSAGE ABOUT COVID-19 PROCEDURES AND HOW THIS MEETING IS HANDLED. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE ABAG WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED SIDES ASKED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL ROLL CALL.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: JULIE BONDURANT?

JULIE BONDURANT: HERE.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: BRENDA BUXTON? IS ABSENT. SEAN DOUGAN?

SEAN DOUGAN: HERE.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: LEO DUBOSE? IS ABSENT. ETHAN LAVINE IS ABSENT. STEVE MCADAM?

STEVE MCADAM: HERE.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: JUAN RAIGOZA IS ABSENT.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: JOHN WOODBURY.

JOHN WOODBURY: PRESENT.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: ANDREA GAFFNEY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANDREA GAFFNEY: PRESENT.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MOIRA MCENESPY.

MOIRA MCENESPY: PRESENT.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SUSAN WILSON IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OKAY. FIRST ITEM OF BUSINESS IS PUBLIC COMMENT. ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I SEE IN THE ATTENDEE, ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE? WE USUALLY GIVE TWO MINUTES.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THREE MINUTES. PLEASE.

LEE HUO: BRENDA IS ABLE TO CONNECT. CAN SOMEONE SEND THE LINK TO HER. BRENDA BUXTON.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: BAY PROGRAM ACCOUNT, WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT? THE ATTENDEE WITH BAY PROGRAM ACCOUNT NAME.

BRENDA BUXTON: THAT'S ME.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO WRITTEN COMMENT WAS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: NEXT IS STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. ANYONE WHO WANTS TO SPEAK, I GUESS, SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND. AND

ERIK: GENE FINNEY IS NOT ON THE ROSTER.

SPEAKER: HE HUO: GENE IS NOT A MEMBER OF THE COMMITTEE.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: NO OTHER MEMBERS WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: HOW ABOUT FROM STAFF?

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I SEE NO STAFF MEMBERS WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OKAY. WE'RE MOVING RIGHT ALONG THEN.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: EXCUSE ME, UNFORTUNATELY, WE'LL NEED TO CALL FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON EACH ITEM.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: WELL, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I DON'T SEE ANY ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO WRITTEN COMMENT HAS BEEN RECEIVED.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. LET ME GET MYSELF ORGANIZED HERE. ASSOCIATION FOR -- BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC, WE HAVE HAD NO REGULAR MEETINGS FOR QUITE A WHILE NOW, AND THIS IS A GOOD EXAMPLE FOR THIS MEETING WHERE IT'S A LITTLE DIFFICULT TO GET EVERYONE INVOLVED, GIVEN PEOPLE'S COMPLICATED SCHEDULES. SO I WOULD LIKE TO PROPOSE THAT WE, BASICALLY, TOGETHER WITH STAFF, WORK OUT A REGULAR TIME FOR THE STEERING COMMITTEE MEETINGS, MAYBE ON A BIMONTHLY BASIS SO PEOPLE CAN PLAN AHEAD IN TERMS OF WHERE THEY DO THEIR OTHER MEETINGS AND OTHER ACTIVITIES THAT THEY CAN AVOID THE TIME THAT WE SET-ASIDE FOR THE STEERING COMMITTEE MEETINGS. AND ALONG THOSE LINES, ALSO, FOR THE FULL BOARD MEETINGS, WE NEED TO EITHER SETUP A STANDARD TIME FOR THOSE, OR GIVE A LOT OF ADVANCE TIME IN TERMS OF PLANNING FOR THOSE. DOES ANYONE FROM STAFF, TOSHI OR ANYONE HAVE SOME THOUGHTS AS TO HOW WE SHOULD DO THIS?

LY HUO: CHAIR, I HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH FRED RAFT ROW FOR A TIMELINE ON THE 2022 STEERING COMMITTEE AND BOARD MEETINGS. WE'RE A LITTLE RESTRICTED IN SLOTS THAT WE'RE WORKING WITH IN TERMS OF NEW REQUIREMENTS FOR HAVING MEETINGS NOT CROSS OVER WITH EACH OTHER BECAUSE OF THE NECESSITY TO HAVE BOTH ZOOM AND PHYSICAL SPACE IN CASE PEOPLE DO WANT TO VISIT SO WE HAVE TIMES WE HAVE ALREADY DETERMINED FOR THESE MEETINGS FOR 2022. WE ARE WORKING TO PUT TOGETHER A MESSAGE, AND WE'LL HAVE THAT SENT OUT TO THE FULL BOARD SOMETIME THIS WEEK.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: ALSO IN TERMS OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS, MAYBE IN THE FUTURE, THE LAST ITEM OF THE MEETING SHOULD BE A DISCUSSION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS SO THERE IS OPPORTUNITY FOR OTHER MEMBERS LIKE MYSELF TO WEIGH IN THERE. MY OWN THOUGHTS ON THIS IS, WE SHOULD, AS A STANDARD ITEM FOR STEERING COMMITTEE MEETINGS, HAVE A STAFF UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF THE WORK PROGRAM SO WE CAN HELP -- HELP US TO TRACK WHAT WE'RE WORKING ON, WHAT WE'RE NOT ABLE TO WORK ON, JUST SO WE ALL KIND OF KNOW WHAT THE PLAN IS, GOING FORWARD. PART OF THAT IS THE CHALLENGE OF MEETINGS AND THE BROWN ACT, SIX MONTHS AGO WE FORMED AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE OF INTERESTED MEMBERS, LESS THAN A FULL QUORUM OF THE BOARD AND STEERING COMMITTEE SO WE COULD HAVE DISCUSSIONS ABOUT WHERE WE WANT TO GO FROM HERE IN TERMS OF WHAT THE ROLE OF THE PROJECT IS, NON-PROFIT, WHAT THE ROLE OF STAFF S WHAT OUR RELATIONSHIPS ARE, THE BYLAWS, ALL OF THOSE ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS AND THE NORMAL PROCESS OF SCHEDULING MEETINGS TO HAVE THIS DISCUSSION HAVE PROVEN VERY DIFFICULT. AT THIS POINT THERE, IS NOTHING TO REPORT FROM THE AD-HOC COMMITTEE IN TERMS OF ANY DECISIONS OR DIRECTION. THE ISSUES THAT THE AD-HOC COMMITTEE IS LOOKING AT, INCLUDE, WHAT IS THE ROLE OF THE NON-PROFIT, WHAT ABOUT THE BYLAWS, HOW DO WE UPDATE THOSE? THOSE ARE BASICALLY A COMBINATION OF WHAT THE -- WHAT IT WAS THEN ABAG, NOW MTC, AND THE NON-PROFIT, THEIR RELATIONSHIP, HOW WE WORK TOGETHER, WHAT'S THE ROLE OF STAFF IN SUPPORTING THE NON-PROFIT VERSUS WHAT'S ROLE OF THE NON-PROFIT BEING INDEPENDENT AND HAVING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ITS OWN SUPPORT STRUCTURE. WE DON'T HAVE ANYTHING TO REPORT FROM THAT DISCUSSION SO FAR. BUT, IF ANYONE, WHO IS ON THE FULL BOARD, OR THE STEERING COMMITTEE, WHO IS NOT PART OF THE AD-HOC COMMITTEE, OR FROM STAFF WANT TOS TO WEIGH IN WITH ISSUES, OR GIVE THOUGHTS, PLEASE GIVE ME A CONTACT, AND I'LL BE HAPPY TO FIGURE OUT A WAY TO INCLUDE THAT IN OUR DISCUSSIONS. I THINK THAT'S IT IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS?

SPEAKER:

TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA: I THINK HAVING A DISCUSSION, THAT WOULD BE USEFUL IF WE ARE HAVING MEETINGS EVERY TWO MONTHS THROUGH THE STEERING COMMITTEE WE NEED TO KNOW THOSE ITEMS A WEEK OR TWO AFTER EACH COMMITTEE MEETING WRAPS UP. SO I THINK THAT'S GREAT TO HAVE THAT DISCUSSION AT THE END OF EACH.

BRUCE BEYAERT: I THOUGHT THE STEERING COMMITTEE WOULD BE INTERESTED IN THE PLANS AFOOT IN THE CITY OF RICHMOND TO JOIN THE NEW NATIONAL TRAINS COMMON GROUND, OR KIND MOVEMENT BEING PROMOTED BY AMERICAN TRAILS AND A WIDE VARIETY OF NATIONAL REGIONAL TRAIL USERS GROUP. THE BAY TRAIL IN RICHMOND HAS BECOME POPULAR WITH OPENING OF THE CENTER FOR BRIDGE TRAIL AND OF COURSE WITH ALL THE STAY AT HOME DURING THE COURSE OF THE PANDEMIC THIS HAS LED TO A LOT OF CONFLICTS BETWEEN USER GROUPS, WITH SPEEDING RECKLESSLY DRIVING AND MOTORCYCLES AND MOTORIZED VEHICLES AND MOTORCYCLES AND GO CARTS. THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE HAVE MADE PLANS TO WIDEN SHOULDERS IN CERTAIN PARTS OF THE TRAIL SECTION TO GIVE PEDESTRIAN AND JOGGERS A WAY TO GET AWAY FROM THE BICYCLE TRAFFIC AND USING SIGNAGE. THE EAST BAY REGIONAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PARK DISTRICT HAS ROUTE 38 WITH BICYCLES AT 15 MILES AN HOUR, THE CITY OF [INDISCERNIBLE] HAS NO SUCH ORDINANCE. THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECIDE THAT RATHER THAN TAKING A REGULATORY APPROACH WE WOULD TAKE A SOFTER APPROACH REALIZING THE CITY OF RICHMOND DO NOT HAVE RESOURCES FOR OFFICERS WITH SPEED GUNS, PROPOSAL FOR IMPLEMENTATION IS A NEW SIGNAGE PROGRAM, IF YOU COULD SCREEN SHARE, YOU CAN ALL SEE THIS?

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: IT'S A PRETTY PICTURE.

BRUCE BEYAERT: THESE ARE MOCK-UPS, PROFESSIONAL GRAPHIC ARTIST IS PREPARING IMAGINES.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: WE SEE A PICTURE OF THE -- OF MOUNTAINS AND A LIKE.

BRUCE BEYAERT: THAT'S NOT IT.

SPEAKER: IT'S A NATIONAL PARK. IT'S VERY PRETTY.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I CAN SHARE MY SCREEN.

BRUCE BEYAERT: THANK YOU, FRED. THIS IS A MOCK-UP. DON'T PAY ATTENTION TO THE IMAGES OR ARRANGEMENTS. THIS IS A SIGN TO BE PUT UP AT THE TRAIL HEAD BAY TRAIL ALSO ON THE RICHMOND GREENWAY THIS HAS SEVEN SUGGESTIONS FOR MAKING THE TRAIL COMMON GROUND HELPING EVERYBODY GET ALONG. THIS IS A SIMPLER ONE, PRINCIPLES, BE KIND, SAY HELLO, AND RIDE SLOW. SO THIS IS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BEING -- PROFESSIONAL SIGNS ARE BEING DEVELOPED, AND WILL BE FAB RATED BY THE TEA OF RICHMOND AND INSTALLED IN CERTAIN LOCATIONS WE'LL KEEP YOU APPRAISED OF HOW THIS GOES SHARE FINAL SIGNS AND SEE IF THERE IS ANY MEASURABLE IMPROVEMENT IN BEHAVIOR AND LETTING EVERYBODY ENJOY THE BAY TRAIL IN PEACE WITHOUT CONFLICT. THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS?

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: I HAVE ONE COMMENT. I THINK THIS IS GREAT. I KNOW FROM MY EXPERIENCE WITH NAPA COUNTY, THE VOLUNTARY EDUCATIONAL APPROACH HAS WORKED PRETTY WELL FOR DEALING WITH TRAIL CONFLICTS. AND GIVEN THE FACT THAT THERE IS NO WAY TO HAVE ENFORCEMENT INVOLVED, THIS IS THE ONLY WAY WE HAVE TO GO. SO THIS IS ONE WAY TO GO IN ENCOURAGING THIS. THE ONE THING I HEAR RAISED A LOT ARE PEOPLE USING HEADPHONES, EAR PHONES, LISTENING TO MUSIC IN SUCH A WAY THAT IT BLOCKS OUT SOUND OF ALL OTHER PEOPLE TALKING SO THERE IS NO WAY FOR THEM TO HEAR OTHER PEOPLE SAYING WATCH OUT OR COMING ON YOUR LEFT OR YOUR RIGHT. SOMETHING ALONG THE LINES ENCOURAGING PEOPLE NOT TO USE SOUND CANCELLING HEADPHONES, BUT THERE ARE VARIOUS KINDS OF EAR BUDS THAT ALLOW OUTSIDE SOUNDS TO COME IN AS WELL SO THEY CAN STILL LISTEN TO THEIR MUSIC.

BRUCE BEYAERT: THANK YOU, JOHN. GOOD LUCK IN TELLING PEOPLE TO KEEP OFF THEIR CELL PHONES.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: IT'S NOT JUST CELL PHONES IT'S THE FACT THAT IT BLOCKS OUT ALL OTHER SOWN IF THEY HAVE THE BIG HEADPHONES ON. ANY OTHER THOUGHTS?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: WE HAVE PHILIPPE WITH HIS HAND RAISED.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: PHILIPPE?

PHILIPPE SALES: WE HAVE 13 DIFFERENT PUBLIC AGENCIES WITH A PIECE OF THE VINE TRAIL. WE STARTED INSTITUTING A PROGRAM OF COURTESY SIGNS A COUPLE OF YEARS AGO, TRYING TO DISTILL DOWN THE RULES AND REGULATIONS AND TRYING TO BE A BIT LESS AUTHORITARIAN ABOUT IT, AND I THINK IT'S, SORT OF, PAYING OFF THAT JOHN WAS PART OF A COMMITTEE THAT HELPED US PUT TOGETHER THAT LIST OF ITEMS THAT INCLUDED, ALSO, THE HEAD PHONE ISSUE. SO I'M GLAD YOU TOUCHED ON THAT. WHAT WE HAVE DISCOVERED AND I AM SURE MANY OF YOU ALSO HAVE THIS, THERE ARE OFTEN THINGS THAT ARE, ONE SIGN FITS ALL, FOR PARKS DEPARTMENTS, AND SOMETIMES YOU GET KIND OF BIZARRE SIGNS OUT IN THE MIDDLE OF TRAILS THAT TELL YOU GOLFING ISN'T ALLOWED ON THE TRAIL. BUT YOU CAN'T COVER EVERY SITUATION. BUT WE DID MANAGE TO BOIL IT DOWN TO TEN POINTS AND IT'S WORKED VERY L THANKS. HAPPY TO SHARE IT WITH YOU, BRUCE, IF YOU WANT.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: ANY OTHER THOUGHTS?

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: ANDREA AND JOSEPH HAVE RAISED THEIR HANDS.

ANDREA GAFFNEY: I AM BCDC WE HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING THE COMMON GROUND PRINCIPLES AND WE THINK THAT WILL BE GREAT AND ARE EXCITED TO SEE THAT COMING TO RICHMOND. SO JUST WANTED TO GIVE YOU A SHOUT OF SUPPORT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: AND WHAT WAS THE OTHER COMMENT?

JOSEPH LACLAIR: THANK YOU, JOHN. GREAT PROGRAM. I WANT TO MENTION THAT THE SIGNS THAT THE TRAIL USES, AND BCDC WERE DEVELOPED BY HUNT DESIGN OUT OF LONGEVITY, AND I DON'T KNOW WHO YOU HIRED TO DO THE WORK, BUT I JUST WANTED TO SHARE THAT IN CASE YOU WANTED TO HIRE THEM. THEY DID A FINE JOB OF DEVELOPING THE SHORELINE SIGN PROGRAMS THAT ARE CURRENTLY IN USE AROUND THE BAY, AND JUST WANTED TO MENTION THAT.

BRUCE BEYAERT: THANK YOU. FORTUNATELY WE HAVE A PRO BONO GRAPHIC ARTIST THAT IS DOING A LOT OF THE WORK. IS.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OKAY. IF NO OTHER HANDS UP --

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: CHAIR WOOD BURY, THIS IS FRED. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS ON THE PANELIST LIST AND NO ATTENDEES WITH HANDS RAISED AND NO WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MOVING TO ITEM FIVE, CONSENT CALENDAR, AN ACTION ITEM TO APPROVE THE STEERING COMMITTEE MEETINGS OF NOVEMBER 19TH, 2020 FOR THOSE OF US WHO REMEMBER THAT FAR BACK. IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION? OR A MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES?

JULIE BONDURANT. I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

>>JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. IS THERE A SECOND?

BRENDA BUXTON: I'LL SECOND NOW THAT I'M ON.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: MOTION BY JULIE AND SECOND BY BRENDA. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. AND I CAN TAKE THE ROLL CALL ON THIS MOTION.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: GO AHEAD.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: [ROLL CALL VOTE] FOUR AYES, TWO ABSTENTIONS. MOTION PASSES.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OKAY. MOVING TO ITEM SIX. THIS IS -- FIRST SUBSTANTIVE ITEM HERE ABOUT SAN FRANCISCO BAY TRAIL FUNDING RECOMMENDATION. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM, AND I THINK WE'LL START WITH A PRESENTATION FROM STAFF AS TO THE APPLICATIONS, THE CONSIDERATION PROCESS, AND WHO IS RECOMMENDING. WHO FROM STAFF WILL BE DOING THAT?

LEE HUO: THAT WILL BE ME, JOHN, AND LAURA KRULL. I'M NOT SURE WHO IS GOING TO LOAD THE PRESENTATION.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MTC STAFF WILL BRING IT UP FOR YOU, LEE.

LEE HUO: GREAT. THANK YOU. THANK YOU CHAIR WOODBURY AND FELLOW COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I'M LEE HUO WITH THE BAY TRAIL PROGRAM AT ABAG/MTC AND HERE TO MAKE A PRESENTATION ABOUT THE CURRENT BAY TRAIL GRANT PROGRAM WHICH IS FUNDED BY THE STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY. NEXT A QUICK RUN DOWN IS THE PROCESS FOR CURRENT BLOCK GRANT SIX PART OF THE BAY TRAIL GRANT FUNDING PROGRAM AND DISCUSSION ABOUT SEVERELY DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES AND BAY TRAIL WHICH IS A COMPONENT OF THE CURRENT FUNDING PROGRAM WE'LL GET INTO MORE DETAILS LATER AND GET INTO THE SPECIFICS OF EACH PROJECT THAT WE'RE RECOMMENDING MOVE FORWARD. JUST AS A REMINDER, I KNOW THE STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBERS HAVE HEARD ABOUT BLOCKS GRANTS AND BAY TRAIL GRANTS IN THE PAST BUT IT'S BEEN SUCH A LONG TIME I FEEL LIKE I WILL GET INTO AN OVERVIEW. BLOCK GRANT FUNDING THROUGH PROPOSITION 68 THAT WAS PASSED A FEW YEARS AGO BEING PASSED THROUGH BY THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY PROGRAM AS I MENTIONED EARLIER IT'S A COMPONENT OF PROPOSITION 68 THAT HAS DEFINITIONS THAT DETERMINES FOR SEVERELY DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. THE SLIDE SHOWS IN THE RED HIGHLIGHT WHERE DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ARE LOCATED WITHIN THE BAY AREA GIVEN THE NATURE OF THE BAY AREA AND ITS ECONOMIC ENGINE THERE ARE FEW AREAS WITHIN PROXIMITY OF THE BAY TRAIL THAT ARE CONSIDERED PART OF THE DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. WITH OUR CURRENT GRANT FUNDS PROGRAMS FROM BLOCK GRANT SIX FROM THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY ROUGHLY 955,000 OF THOSE FUNDS ARE COMMITTED TO THE PROJECTS, WITHIN A MILE OR POTENTIALLY SERVING IT IN SOME OTHER WAY THE REMAINDER OF GRANT FUNDS FROM THE CONSERVANCY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

$445,000 ARE OPEN FOR NON-ASSET PROJECT AREAS WHICH HAVE A BROADER SCOPE FOR US TO UTILIZE. AND I'LL TURN TO OVER TO LAURA TO GO OVER THE SPECTRUM ANALYSIS FOR SEVERELY DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES.

SPEAKER: WE MENTIONED OVERLAP OF BAY TRAIL SDAC, THE HIGHLIGHTS ARE WITHIN A MILE OF THE BAY TRAIL OVERALL THIS WAS 2.4% OF THE EXISTING AND PLANNED BAY TRAIL IS WITHIN A MILE OF AN SDAC THIS VARIES BY COUNTY FROM SONOMA AND SANTA CLARA UP TO 4.5% IN NAPA. AND AS LEE MENTIONED SDC COMMUNITIES ARE LIMITED IN THE BAY AREA SINCE SDC USES STATEWIDE MEDIAN INCOME IN THE BAY AREA AND SDC USES HIGHER INCOME OVERALL. WHEN BREAKING DOWN THE PERCENTAGES BY COUNTY YOU WILL NOTICE SOUTH BAY SPECIFICALLY SANTA CLARA AND SAN MATEO HAVE A ZERO PERCENTAGE OF SDCS WITHIN A MILE OF THE BAY TRAIL. I'LL HAND IT BACK TO YOU, LEE.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: BEFORE WE GO ON TO THAT LEE IF WE COULD. I JUST HAVE A COMMENT OR QUESTION. LOOKING AT THE MAP, AND I NOTICE THESE DEFINITIONS ARE NOT LOCAL DEFINITIONS, THEY'RE ONES WE INHERITED, BUT IN NAPA COUNTY WHAT'S IDENTIFIED IS THE SDC IS ONLY THERE BECAUSE OF THE NAPA STATE HOSPITAL WITH PEOPLE WHO CANNOT LEAVE, THEY'RE INCARCERATED, BASICALLY. DO THOSE KIND OF GROUP QUARTERS COUNT FOR THESE INCOME CONSIDERATIONS?

BRENDA BUXTON: HI JOHN THIS, IS BRENDA. I DON'T KNOW OF ANY EXEMPTIONS OR QUALIFYING LANGUAGE IT'S JUST THIS VERY CRUDE INSTRUMENT OF INCOME, HOUSEHOLD INCOME, BY CENSUS TRACK.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: HMM...

BRENDA BUXTON: I MEAN, I WOULD PERHAPS THEN SAY IT'S NOT A HIGH PRIORITY AREA IF PEOPLE ARE INCARCERATED AND CAN'T GET OUT. [LAUGHTER] BUT --

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: NO. I UNDERSTAND THAT. IT JUST, SORT OF, RAISES A BROADER QUESTION. IT'S NOT NEW. WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT THIS FOR MANY YEARS NOW, TO THE EXTENT THAT THERE IS AN ABILITY TO ADVOCATE FOR NEW DEFINITION WHEN THIS COMES UP AGAIN, THIS IS, I THINK, A HIGH PRIORITY FOR THE BAY TRAIL. LOOKING AT THE MAP, YOU CAN SEE THAT LITTLE OF THE BAY TRAIL QUALIFIES UNDER THAT DEFINITION. SOME OF THE THINGS IN THE PAST NOT JUST LOOKING AT THE GEOGRAPHY WHERE PEOPLE LIVE WITH THEIR INCOME BUT WHO ACTUALLY USE THE FACILITY THAT'S BEING BUILT THE OTHER IS MAKE ADJUSTMENT BY REGION BASED ON HIGH COST AREAS IN THE BAY AREA, IN FACT, YOU CAN BE POOR HERE BUT STILL BE RICH IN MODOC COUNTY IN TERMS OF COST OF LIVING. IT'S NOT ON THE AGENDA TODAY BUT I WOULD LIKE TO FLAG THIS TO KEEP TRACK IF WE'RE HOPING TO HAVE STATE FUNDING IN THE FUTURE BE ELIGIBLE FOR BAY TRAIL PROJECTS.

SPEAKER: JOHN, IF IT'S OKAY, I WOULD LIKE TO JUMP ON THAT I'M A LITTLE CONFUSED AS TO WHAT IS DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ARE. I'M FAMILIAR WITH SB 535, CALENVIROSCREEN, AND COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, GETTING TO WHAT YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT, BUT I AM CONFUSED AS TO WHY EAST PALO ALTO IS NOT ON THIS MAP.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BRENDA BUXTON: THIS IS BRENDA, THE DEFINITION OF AN SDC IS SET IN PROP 68, THERE WAS A DEFINITION IN PROP ONE AND THOSE DEFINITIONS ARE OFTEN DIFFERENT IN SUBTLE WAYS, AND, YOU KNOW, IT'S -- THAT IS CREATED BY THE PEOPLE PUTTING TOGETHER THE BONDS IN SACRAMENTO. SO YOU HAVE TO LOOK AT, AS THE SAUSAGE IS BEING MADE, TO REALLY LOOK AT THE INGREDIENTS.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: JUST TO BE CLEAR, WE DO HAVE A SEPARATE OPPORTUNITY FOR THE PUBLIC, NON-COMMITTEE MEMBERS TO MAKE COMMENTS, IF YOU WOULD ALLOW THAT?

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: YES. ABSOLUTELY. WE HAVE A HAND UP.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO ADD ON TO WHAT WAS SAID BEFORE WITH THE DEFINITION, IN CASE IT HELPS THE DEFINITION THAT WAS PUT OUT FOR THIS SPECIFICALLY, IT'S THE COMMUNITY WITH THE HOUSEHOLD INCOME WITH LESS THAN 50% OF THE STATEWIDE AVERAGE. I THINK LEE SHARED THAT, BUT THE CONSERVANCY ALSO ALLOWS SDC PROJECTS TO BE IDENTIFIED TO PROVIDE DIRECT BENEFITS, BUT IF IT'S NOT LOCATED WITHIN SDC OR WITHIN ONE MILE IF IT COULD BE SHOWN THAT IT PROVIDES DIRECT BENEFITS TO SDC, WE CAN SPEND THE MONEY THERE TOO.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OKAY. BRUCE?

BRUCE BEYAERT: THAT'S A VERY IMPORTANT POINT. IF YOU LOOK AT THE MAP OF RICHMOND, YOU WILL SEE RICHMOND HAS QUITE A FEW OF SDCS, BUT THEY'RE ALL MORE THAN A MILE FROM THE POINT IN CONSIDERATION. THESE ORGANIZATIONS WERE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

VERY ACTIVE IN THE CITY CORE HAS BEEN VERY STRONG SUPPORTING PRIOR GRANT APPLICATIONS FOR THE POINT MOLATE TRAIL BECAUSE IT WOULD SERVE THEM EASILY BY BICYCLE EVEN MORE THAN A MILE AWAY. IN THE GRANT PROGRAMS IT'S IMPORTANT TO CONSIDER SDCS WHEN YOU ARE MORE THAN A MILE FROM THEM.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OBVIOUSLY THIS IS A TOPIC THAT NEEDS TO BE ON THE TABLE FOR FUTURE DISCUSSION, AS FUTURE BOND MEASURES ARE PUT TOGETHER, WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE A PART OF THOSE DISCUSSIONS AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. ANY OTHER THOUGHTS?

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: PHILIPPE HAS RAISED HIS HAND.

PHILIPPE SALES: BECAUSE NAPA DOESN'T HAVE SDCS CONNECTED TO THE VINE TRAIL IT'S BEEN DIFFICULT FOR US TO QUALIFY FOR ANY GRANT MONEY BUT UNDER THIS PROGRAM WE DO SERVE THE BIGGER COMMUNITY AS THE BAY TRAIL DOES, AND WE HAVE FOLKS LOW AND MODERATE INCOME FOLKS WHO WORK UP IN THE WINERIES AND WE HAVE ESTIMATED 2,000 PEOPLE WHO COULD POTENTIALLY USE THE TRAIL TO GET TO AND FROM WORK BY COMMUTING. WE FEEL [INDISCERNIBLE] BY THE DISCUSSIONS AS WE'RE APPLYING FOR GRANT FUNDS.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: SEAN?

SEAN DOUGAN: WE HAVE BEEN TRYING TO GET AWAY FROM TERMINOLOGY, BUT THIS ONE MILE PROXIMITY RADIUS IS THAT FOR JUST THE SPINE OF THE BAY TRAIL OR DOES IT INCLUDE SPURS? HOW IS THE BAY TRAIL DEFINED IN THIS ANALYSIS HERE?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LEE HUO: I THINK SPUR BAY TRAIL IS A MISNOMER THAT CAME OUT OF 2005 GAP ANALYSIS FROM ALL INTENTS AND PURPOSES, FROM SAVVY AND PERSPECTIVE, SPURS AND SPINES ARE ALL CONSIDERED SPINE IN THE PRIORITY IN TERMS OF THE BAY TRAIL GRANT FUNDING, THE QUESTION IS WHAT WE CALL CONNECTOR PROJECTS WHETHER OR NOT THOSE ARE CONSIDERED PART OF BAY TRAIL OR NOT FOR THE MOST PART WE HAVE MOVED AWAY FROM FUNDING FROM PROJECTS THAT ARE CONSIDERED CONNECTORS IN THE BAY TRAIL IN THE PAST THAT MAY BE DIFFERENT IN THE FUTURE AS WE'RE NOW PART OF THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION GROUP AT MTC AND ARE LOOKING MORE TO MAKE GOOD CONNECTIONS TO THE COMMUNITY WE SERVE AND TO HAVE IT ACTUALLY SERVE AS A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION CORRIDOR, BUT IN THE PAST THE FOCUS HAS ALWAYS BEEN ON SPURS AND SPINES.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? IN WHICH CASE, LEE, BACK TO YOU FOR THE ITEM ITSELF.

LEE HUO: GREAT. THANK YOU, JOHN. WE'LL KEEP MOVING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OH, IF YOU -- YEAH, THERE YOU GO. THANK YOU. SO THIS IS KIND OF AN OVERALL ENCOMPASSING MAP THAT SHOWS YOU THE LOCATIONS OF THE SIX PROJECTS THAT WE'RE PROPOSING TO MOVE FORWARD TO BE FUNDED BY OUR CURRENT BLOCK GRANT SIX BAY TRAIL GRANT PROGRAM. THE ENTIRETY OF THE FUNDING IS NOT GOING TO ENCOMPASS THE FULL AMOUNT ON BOTH ASPECT OR NON-ASPECT POT. STAFF IS GOING TO CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD AND LOOK FOR OPPORTUNITIES TO UTILIZE THOSE FUNDS BUT THESE ARE THE SIX THAT WE'RE RECOMMENDING TO MOVE FORWARD AT THIS POINT. WE STARTED OUT WITH A -- STAFF STARTED OUT EARLIER THIS YEAR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WITH A REQUEST FOR LETTERS OF INTEREST FROM ALL OF OUR TYPICAL PARTNERS. WE HAVE RECEIVED TEN OVERALL AND MOVING FORWARD WITH ANOTHER 64 WERE ASKED NOT TO MOVE FORWARD BECAUSE THEY WERE CONSIDERED EITHER MAINTENANCE PROJECTS ONE DID NOT INCORPORATE ELIGIBLE FUNDING AGENCY OR NON-PROFIT AND ONE WAS CONSIDERED DUPLICATE WORK THAT WAS GOING TO OCCUR IN THE FUTURE ANYWAYS SO THESE ARE THE SIX MOVING FORWARD. THE ONES IN THE YELLOW BARS ARE IN THE ASPECT AREA VERTICAL BARS NON-ASPECT AREA WE HAVE ONE IN VALLEJO, ONE IN MARTINEZ TWO IN RICHMOND ONE IN SAUSALITO AND ONE IN SAN RAFAEL. WE'LL GET INTO DETAILS ABOUT EACH ONE OF THE PROPOSED PROJECTS TO MOVE FORWARD FIRST ONE HERE IS THE MARTINEZ BAY TRAIL PHASE TWO AND WE'RE RECOMMENDING FUNDING OF $200,000. IT'S A TRAIL THAT'S HALF MILE LONG CLASS THAT CONNECTS MARTINEZ INTERMODAL STATION TO THE AMTRAK AND ESSENTIALLY STAGING AREA HOPEFULLY IN THE FUTURE TO CARQUINEZ SCENIC DRIVE WHICH IS PART OF THE BAY TRAIL THIS IS THE BAY TRAIL VINE TRAIL GAP CLOSER SOMETHING WE'RE WORKING WITH THE CITY OF VALLEJO IN THE CHAMPIONSHIP AUTHORITY AS WELL AS VINE TRAIL FOR MANY YEARS NOW WE HAVE HELPED FUND EARLY FEASIBILITY STUDIES AND PARTIALLY THE CURRENT DESIGN OF THIS AREA IT'S AN AREA THAT ENCOMPASSES NORTHERN VALLEJO 3.7 MILES OF POTENTIAL BAY TRAIL WHEN IT'S COMPLETED. THE FUNDING REQUEST WE'RE RECOMMENDING TO MOVE FORWARD FOR IS THE ENTIRE AMOUNT OF $400,000 THE ROUGH TOTAL OVERALL COST IS 8.7 MILLION. THIS IS A SMALL -- BUT I'M GOING TO CHANNEL MAUREEN BECAUSE SHE STARTED THIS WORK SMALL BUT MIGHTY PROJECT PROPOSAL FOR CLASS FOUR BIKEWAY AS IT EXTENDS THE GO AHEAD AND AVENUE IN THE CITY OF SAN RAFAEL IT'S BEING RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING AT $240,000. NEXT SLIDE. THIS ONE IS IN THE CITY OF SAUSALITO. IT'S A COMBINATION PROJECT WHERE IT'S

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BEING PROPOSED TO HAVE BOTH A CLASS TWO AND A CLASS FOUR FACILITY. CLASS TWO FOR SOUTHBOUND, FOUR FOR NORTHBOUND TRAVEL ALONG THE BRIDGE WAY BOULEVARD IN SAUSALITO IT'S AN AREA THAT'S POPULAR WITH LOCALS AND TOURISTS AS THEY RIDE THROUGH THAT SPACE. REASON WHY IT'S A MIXED FACILITY IS BECAUSE IT'S LIMITED RIGHT OF WAY AND WAS FEASIBILITY IN THAT SPACE RECOMMENDING FUNDING AT $67,214. THIS PROJECT IS ACTUALLY A TWO-PARTNER. IT'S A PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE CITY OF RICHMOND AND EAST BAY REGIONAL PARK DISTRICT WE'RE CALLING RICHMOND POINT [INDISCERNIBLE] BAY TRAIL COMBINATION OF TRAILS THAT WILL EVENTUALLY CONNECT EXISTING BAY TRAIL AT RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE AND RICHMOND CONNECT TO POINT MOLATE BEACH IT'S THE FIRST PHASE ESSENTIALLY OF EXTENDING THE ROLL OUT POINT SAN PABLO WHICH IS LONG-TERM VISION OF THE BAY TRAIL PLAN THIS IS CLASS ONE TRAIL, HALF THE COMPONENT BY CITY OF RICHMOND FROM POINT MOLATE BEACH HALFWAY RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE RECOMMENDING FUNDING $150,000. LAST, EAST BAY REGIONAL PARK DISTRICT BEING RECOMMENDED AS WELL $150,000. THAT'S OUR PRESENTATION. AND STAFF RECOMMENDATION WE'RE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS REGARDING THE PROJECTS. I WANT TO NOTE THAT BRENDA BUXTON WHO IS OUR CURRENT LIAISON FOR THE TRAILS HAS WORKED WITH US FOR MANY PROJECTS SHE PROBABLY DOESN'T WANT THE ATTENTION BUT SHE IS RETIRING SOON. I WANT TO THEY THINK HER FOR ALL THE WORK HAVE DONE WITH HER SHE'S BEEN A FANTASTIC PERSON WE'RE GOING TO MISS HER. BUT HELLER WHO IS ON THIS COASTAL CONSERVANCY CALL SHE HAS ALREADY BEEN WORKING WITH BEN FOR MANY YEARS.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: TO START OFF, I HAVE ONE QUESTION LEE. WITH THESE CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS, THE GRANT MONEY WE'RE DOING IS ONLY A SMALL PART OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE TOTAL COST, YOU CAN TALK ABOUT THE SHOVEL READINESS FOR THESE PROJECTS. IS THE FUNDING IN MACE OR IS THIS FUNDING SITTING FOR A LONG TIME BEFORE IT CAN BE USED?

LEE HUO: IT VARIES BY PROJECT. THE VAST MAJORITY ARE FULLY FUNDED. THE ONLY ONE LOOKING FOR FUNDING IS THE VALLEJO VINE TRAIL BAY TRAIL PROJECT.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: HOW MUCH IS THAT SHORT?

LEE HUO: I DON'T RECALL RIGHT NOW OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD. I APOLOGIES FOR THAT. I CAN LOOK THAT UP AND GET BACK TO YOU ON THAT.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THE QUESTION I HAVE IS, WOULD THROWING SOME MORE MONEY INTO THAT PROJECT MAKE ANY DIFFERENCE IN THE TIME FRAME?

LEE HUO: IT IS OUR BELIEF THAT IT WILL MOVE FORWARD IN TIME. PHILIPPE MIGHT BE ABLE TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION MORE. HE HAS GOT HIS HAND RAISED.

PHILIPPE SALES: YES IT WILL MOVE THE PROJECT FORWARD SIGNIFICANTLY. THE ISSUE FOR US RIGHT NOW IS WE'RE HAVING TO REPAVE MEADOWS DRIVE AS PART OF THE PROJECT AND THE CITY OF VALLEJO IS COMMITTING FUNDING FROM THERE. BECAUSE WE'RE, ESSENTIALLY THE BAY TRAIL IS CREATING LANES ALONG MEADOWS DRIVE, BUT THE WHOLE OF MEADOWS DRIVE HAS TO BE REDONE SO THE CITY OF VALLEJO IS HAVING TO COME UP WITH MORE MONEY TO PAY FOR THAT ROAD SECTION TO BE IMPROVED. THE VINE TRAIL BAY TRAIL PROJECT WILL ONLY PAY FOR THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PAINT AND STRIPING BUT RECONNECTION IS PART OF WHAT THE CITY OF VALLEJO IS COMMITTING. AND THAT MONEY HASN'T BEEN YET CONFIRMED. BUT WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF GETTING THAT RESOLVED. SO, I THINK ALTHOUGH WE ARE SHORT OF FUNDING AT THE MOMENT, THAT GAP IS GOING TO BE FILLED.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. BILL, YOU HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED?

BILL LONG: YES. I JUST WANTED TO SECOND THOSE COMMENTS ABOUT BRENDA BUXTON, SHE HAS ALWAYS BEEN OUR ENTHUSIASTIC PARTNER AT THE RIDGE TRAIL, AS WELL AS HAVE HER PREDECESSORS. SO WE HAVE BEEN DELIGHTED TO WORK WITH ALL OF THEM OVER THE YEARS, AND WE'LL MISS BRENDA BUT WE LOOK FORWARD TO WHOEVER REPLACES IN THE RIDGE VAIL PROJECT. BEST WISHES BRENDA.

BRENDA BUXTON: THANK YOU.

JOSEPH LADAIR: BRENDA IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE WORKING WITH YOU ALL THESE YEARS YOU HAVE DONE AMAZING THINGS AROUND SOUTH BAY THE SALT PONDS WATER TRAIL, RIDGE TRAIL, QUITE A LEGACY. REALLY ENJOYED WORKING WITH YOU. LEE FOR YOU, I JUST WANT TO KNOW WHAT THE PEDESTRIAN FACILITIES WERE LIKE ALONG THE SAN RAFAEL SEGMENT THIS'S PROPOSED FOR FUNDING.

LEE HUO: IT'S ALREADY EXISTING SIDEWALK THERE IS SO IT'S ONE OF THOSE BAY TRAIL COMPONENTS THAT'S GOING TO BE CLASS FOUR WITH SIDEWALKS.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: COULD YOU DEFINE CLASS FOUR.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LEE HUO: A RELATIVELY NEW BIKE FACILITY, A CONCRETE PROTECTED BIKEWAY SEPARATED BY A PHYSICAL BARRIER OF SOME KIND IT CAN BE ONE WAY OR TWO-WAY IN THIS CASE IT WILL BE A CLASS FOUR.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: GOOD WE HAVE SEEN THOSE.

LEE HUO: IT'S SOMETHING THAT BECOME MORE POPULAR AND WE WILL BE SEEING MORE OF THOSE IN THE FUTURE.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: ANYONE ELSE? SEEING -- OH, BRUCE.

BRUCE BEYAERT: YES. I JUST WANTED TO SAY HOW MUCH TRACKERS ENJOYED WORKING WITH BOTH EAST BAY REGIONAL PARK DISTRICT AND THE CITY OF RICHMOND POINT MELATI EACH DISTRICT HAS INDEPENDENT FACILITY AND CHEVRON EASEMENT CONNECTS TO RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE TRAIL AND POINT MOLATE BEACH AND CITIES PROJECT WILL CONNECT BEACH WITH WIND HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT AND BEYOND. THE PROJECTS ARE MORE THAN BAY TRAIL PROJECTS THEY WILL PROVIDE PUBLIC ACCESS, TWO AND A HALF MILES, SAN FRANCISCO BAYSHORE LINE FOR THE FIRST TIME SINCE THE OHLONE PEOPLE LIVED HERE OTHER THAN PARK MOLATE BEACH PARK. I HOPE YOU'RE GOING TO TURN UP FOR THE RIBBON CUTTING CEREMONY IT'S GOING TO BE GREAT PEOPLE COMING FROM THE BAY AREA INCLUDING ACROSS THE TOWER BRIDGE AND NORTH BAY. SEE YOU ALL THERE.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: TOSHI DID YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA: I WANT TO DO A PROPER INTRODUCTION OF LAURA WHO WE WERE LUCKY TO HAVE PROVIDE THIS PRESENTATION SHE IS ON THE OTHER SIDE OF THE BAY TRAIL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION GROUP AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO BE ABLE TO PULL HER INTO FUTURE ANALYSIS AND BUILDING BROADER HER EXPERTISE SO REALLY JUST WANT TO INTRODUCE HER.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU.

BRENDA BUXTON: BILL HAS HIS HAND UP.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. AGAIN? OR IS IT FROM BEFORE? BILL, DID YOU HAVE ANOTHER COMMENT? NO. OKAY.

BRENDA BUXTON: CAN I -- WELL, FIRST, I JUST WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR YOUR KIND WORDS. IT MAKES ME A LITTLE EMOTIONAL. THANK YOU. AND ALSO ON A MORE PRAGMATIC NOTE, CAN I GET A COPY OF THAT GREAT PRESENTATION FOR OUR FILES? THE GRAPHICS WERE REALLY GOOD. I APPRECIATE THOSE. THANK YOU.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OKAY. NO OTHER COMMENTS. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. DOES SOMEONE WANT TO MAKE A MOTION?

BRENDA BUXTON: I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE THESE.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: OKAY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SEAN DOUGAN: I'LL SECOND. THIS IS SEAN DOUGAN.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: MOTION BY BRENDA BUXTON, SECOND BY SEAN DOUGAN. ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION.

LEE HUO: ONE NOTE SINCE SEAN IS REPRESENTING EAST BAY PARK DISTRICT IT MIGHT BE MORE APPROPRIATE IF HE RECUSED HIMSELF FROM THIS PARTICULAR VOTE.

SEAN DOUGAN: THANK YOU, LEE. I'M SUPER EXCITED ABOUT IT.

JULIE: I'LL SECOND.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU JULIE. ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION? IN THAT CASE, I GUESS A ROLL CALL VOTE.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. NO WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM. THE VOTE ON THE MOTION BY BRENDA AND SECOND BY JULIE. JULIE BONDURANT. [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES. FIVE VOTES. TWO ABSTENTIONS.

SEAN DOUGAN: I WAS UNDER THE IMPRESSION THAT SUSAN WILSON IS MY STAFF SHE WAS MY ALTERNATE IS SHE ACTUAL IS SHE ACTUALLY LISTED AS AN OFFICIAL STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBER?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LEE HUO: YOU'RE CORRECT, SEAN, SUSAN IS YOUR ALTERNATE.

SEAN DOUGAN: THANK YOU.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: ITEM SEVEN IS BEING DEFERRED.

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: IT LOOKS LIKE IT DOESN'T AFFECT THE VOTES FOR ITEMS FIVE OR ITEMS SIX.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: AND NICOLA?

NICOLA SZIBBO: GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR WOODBURY. THIS IS NICOLA SZIBBO, PRINCIPAL ENGINEER FOR MTC, PRESENTER. THE ITEM 7A ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN UPDATE IS UNEXPECTEDLY AVAILABLE DUE TO ILLNESS STAFF RESPECTFULLY REQUESTS THAT WE MOVE AGENDA ITEM SEVEN TO THE NEXT MEETING AGENDA.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: UNLESS THERE IS OBJECTION, THAT'S FINE. I SUPPORT THAT.

NICOLA: THANK YOU.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: MOVING ON ITEM EIGHT FUND-RAISING BEST PRACTICES FOR NON-PROFITS CASE STUDIES. INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. BEING PRESENTED BY TOSHI AND NICOLA PLANNING STAFF.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA: I'LL GIVE CONTEXT AND NICOLA CAN INTRODUCE THE ALTA TEAM. IT SEEMS LIKE FOR A LONG TIME THERE HAS BEEN NEED TO LOOK AT HOW CAN WE IDENTIFY ADDITIONAL FINANCIAL RESOURCES FOR THE BAY TRAIL FOR THE PLAN AND DESIGN, DELIVERY AND OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE OF IT. SO, WE HAD A QUICK OPPORTUNITY, IN JUNE, AT THE END OF OUR FISCAL YEAR, WE WERE ABLE TO, WITH FUNDS THAT NEED TO BE UTILIZED, QUICKLY SOLICIT AND BRING ON A CONSULTANT AND BASICALLY WE SELECTED ALTA AS ONE OF THE PREMIER FIRMS IN THIS SPACE AND HAS A LOT OF EXPERTISE BOTH WITHIN THE BAY AREA AND ACROSS THE COUNTRY IN WORKING WITH TRAILS PROGRAMS ON THEIR FULL-TIME RAISING EFFORTS. WITH THAT, I'LL HAND IT OVER TO NICOLA TO INTRODUCE THE TEAM.

NICOLA: I AM EXCITED TO PRESENT OUR PLANNING DESIGN TEAM, DEVON IS A DESIGN PRINCIPLE REGIONAL MANAGER LOCATED IN OAKLAND EXPERIENCED IN DESIGN WHO HAS FACILITATED SOME OF THE LARGEST MULTI-MODAL PATH PROJECTS IN THE COUNTRY SIGNATURE TRAIL PRACTICE AND HIS WORK IN TRAILS ACROSS NORTH AMERICA AND ASIA. EMILY IS A DESIGN PRINCIPLE AND REGIONAL MANAGER LOCATED IN LOS ANGELES CALIFORNIA HELPING COMMUNITIES DESIGN AND IMPLEMENT INNOVATIVE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION SOLUTIONS PROJECTS CONCEPT CONSTRUCTION, PROJECTS INCLUDE COMPLEX MULTI-MODAL TRAILS COMPLETE STREETS DESIGN PROJECTS AND WITH THAT I'LL HAND IT OFF.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. APPRECIATE THE OVERVIEW ON OUR EXPERIENCE THIS IS A SNAPSHOT SOME OF THE TRAIL PROJECTS THAT EMILY AND I HAVE WORKED ON DIRECTLY, EVERYTHING FROM LA RIVER PATH GAP CLOSURE TO WORKING ON PARTS OF THE BELT LINE. WE SPEND TIME WORKING THROUGH CONCEPT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CONSTRUCTION WORKING FROM MASTER PLAN PHASE ALONG WITH SEEING PROJECTS THROUGH IMPLEMENTATION AND OUR HOPE TODAY IS TO BRING YOU SOME OF OUR EXPERIENCE ON SOME OF THE OBSERVATIONS AND WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE ON FUND-RAISING STRATEGIES FOR SOME OF THESE LARGER TRAIL NETWORKS. SO NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

EMILY: FIRST I WANT TO SHARE SOME RECENT TRENDS IN TRAIL DEVELOPMENT AND RAISING STRATEGIES. THERE IS GREATER USE OF PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS YOU ARE AWARE OF VARIOUS DEVELOPMENT OR LARGER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS WALKING TRAILS WE HAVE SEEN SUCCESS. SOMETIMES THAT'S WITH PRIVATE CORPORATIONS AND SOMETIMES IT'S WITH NON-PROFIT. ANOTHER INTERESTING MODEL IS THE ESTABLISHED NETWORK THAT SHARE PARTNERSHIP AND FUND-RAISING BEST PRACTICES. SO ONE EXAMPLE IS THE HIGH LINE NETWORK. IT'S A MODEL THAT BRINGS TOGETHER VARIOUS NON-PROFIT LEADERS ACROSS THE COUNTRY, EVEN IN INTERNATIONAL, MEXICO AND CANADA AND SHARING WITH ORGANIZATIONS OPERATING PUBLIC SPACES AND FOCUSING ON ADDRESSING INEQUALITIES SERVING COMMUNITIES EQUITABLY AND THIS IS A SPACE WHERE FOLKS CAN WORK TOGETHER ACROSS THE COUNTRY IN VARIOUS EXPERTISE. SEEING GROWTH IN LARGER NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS WITH DEDICATED STAFF FOR FUND-RAISING AND PARTNERSHIP DEVELOPMENT A REAL AREA OF EXPERTISE STAFF IS FOCUSED ON AND LARGE ONE TIME AND ANNUAL DONATIONS HELP BODY UP ENDOWMENTS WHICH IS SUSTAIN OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE COST FROM THOSE INVESTMENTS. HIGH LINE IS FULLY SUPPORTED BY FRIENDS OF THE HIGH LINE WHICH IS A NON-PROFIT THAT CURRENTLY HAS ALMOST $100 MILLION IN ENDOWMENT THAT IS WORKING TO SUSTAIN ONGOING OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE. AND FINALLY SOME OF THE NEWER FINANCING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MECHANISMS INCLUDE SPECIFIC TAX DISTRICTS, TRAIL ENDOWMENTS, VARIOUS VALUE CAPTURE MODELS, SOCIAL IMPACT INVESTING OR SMALLER MICRO INVESTMENTS AND ALSO CORPORATE SPONSORSHIP. NEXT SLIDE. WE LOOK AT TIMELINES, THIS IS THE TIMELINE OF WHEN ORGANIZATIONS THAT WE'RE GOING TO TALK MORE ABOUT IN TODAY'S PRESENTATIONS WERE ESTABLISHED. IN NO WAY A COMPREHENSIVE LIST BUT IT HAS BEEN AN EVOLUTION OF TRAIL FUND-RAISING IN THE PAST 20 YEARS. THE BAY TRAIL WAS ESTABLISHED BACK IN THE LATE '80S WE'RE GOING TO SHARE EXAMPLES FROM CIRCUIT AND ATLANTA BELT LINE THAT ARE EMPLOYING SOME OF THESE OTHER TECH INCREASES AND BRINGING SUCCESSFUL DEVELOPMENT AND EXPANDING OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE. I AM GOING TO SHARE IDEAS THAT HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL AND IT STARTS WITH INVESTING IN A STRONG BRAND FOR YOUR TRAIL ESPECIALLY IN THE EARLY CRITICAL FUND-RAISING STAGES WHERE YOU'RE GOING TO REBOOT FOR AN INVESTMENT PUSH. THE ELEMENT THAT BUILDS ON THIS IDEA OF STORY TELLING AND MESSAGING TO ENSURE THAT THE MESSAGE IS REALLY CONSISTENT AND POTENTIAL DONORS CAN UNDERSTAND THE VISION FOR THE TRAIL. ALSO, HAVING A MEMBERSHIP PROGRAM TO REALLY ENCOURAGE ACTIVE PARTICIPATION AT VARIOUS LEVELS OF MEMBERSHIP IS ALSO A SUCCESSFUL TECHNIQUE. MEMBER SUCCESS AND STAKEHOLDER BUY-IN SO THAT EVERYBODY HAS VESTED INTEREST IN PROJECTS AND RECOGNITION OF OPPORTUNITIES WITHIN THE PUBLIC REALM AND WITHIN MARKETING MATERIALS. HOLDING FREQUENT EVENTS, NOT JUST FUND-RAISING BUT GENERATING EXCITEMENT ABOUT THE TRAIL THROUGHWAYS OR WALKS OR OTHER PROGRAMS AND FINALLY DEVELOPING PUBLIC SAFETY AND EASY TO READ ANNUAL REPORTS THAT REALLY CLEARLY DOCUMENT THE PROCESS THAT THE TRAIL PROGRESS HAS MADE OVER THE YEARS THAT LEVEL OF TRANSPARENCY IS REALLY IMPORTANT TO DONORS AND HAS PROVEN TO CREATE THAT WELCOMING EXPERIENCE FOR BRINGING ON

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADDITIONAL AND NEW DONORS AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. THERE ARE A NUMBER OF MODELS USED TO MANAGE TRAILS THAT RANGE FROM A SINGLE AGENCY AND NON-PROFIT TO VARIOUS MULTI-AGENCY STRUCTURES, COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT, JPA AGREEMENTS AND VARIOUS STRUCTURES AND MISSIONS. WE HAVE A GREEN BOX ON THE SLIDE -- NO GREEN BOX TODAY -- WE'RE GOING TO FOCUS ON THE TOP TWO AND CERTAINLY TO ALIGN IMPORTANT MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES WITH THE NEEDS OF INDIVIDUAL TRAIL SYSTEMS YOU SEE KEY CONSIDERATIONS AND QUESTIONS TO THE RIGHT. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS THE GREEN BOX. ON THE NEXT SLIDE, WE'RE GOING TO TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT SOME OF THE PROS AND CONS OF THE PUBLIC AGENCY. GO AHEAD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THANKS. SO ON THE LEFT IS AN EXAMPLE OF AN ORGANIZATIONAL CHART OF HOW FUND CATEGORY FLOW THROUGH A PUBLIC AGENCY. THIS IS FLEXIBLE. THIS IS JUST ONE EXAMPLE THAT WE HAVE UP HERE TO SHARE. AND SOME OF THE PROS AND CONS OF A PUBLIC AGENCY IS THAT, ONE, A REGIONAL PUBLIC AGENCY IS NOT LIMITED TO A TRAIL WITHIN A SINGLE JURISDICTION SO IT'S SUITABLE FOR MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL COORDINATION. AND PUBLIC AGENCIES DO HAVE VERY EXPERIENCED STAFF WHICH IS A REALLY GREAT BENEFIT WITH INVOLVING KEEPING HIGH QUALITY TRAIL DEVELOPMENT AND OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE. HOWEVER, AGENCY STAFF OFTEN HAVE LIMITED STAFF AND REPURPOSE TO FURTHER TRAIL DEVELOPMENT, AND PUBLIC AGENCIES ALSO CAN'T EXPECT PRIVATE DONATIONS ALONE. SO ON THE NEXT SLIDE, WE LOOK AT BRINGING UP NON-PROFITS INTO WORKING HAND IN HAND WITH A PUBLIC AGENCY. AND THIS HAS THE REAL BENEFIT OF THE ABILITY FUNDING FROM A LARGER POOL OF SOURCES SUCH AS INDIVIDUAL AND CORPORATE DONATION. THERE IS PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT ADVOCACY COMMUNICATIONS NON-PROFITS CAN BRING A NIMBLENESS. HOWEVER A NON-PROFIT ALONE DOESN'T HAVE THE AUTHORITY OF AN ELECTED BODY OR LANDOWNER SO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT DOES REQUIRE ONGOING COORDINATION WITH GROUPS THAT DO HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO PARTNER WITH A PUBLIC AGENCY. AND DIFFERENT FROM SPECIAL DISTRICTS OR OTHER LEGISLATIVE-BOUND ORGANIZATIONS, YOU KNOW, THERE IS NO DEDICATED FUNDING SOURCE WITHOUT ASSISTANCE FROM LOCAL, STATE, OR FEDERAL FUNDING MECHANISM AND THAT'S TRUE FOR PUBLIC AGENCY TOO, BUT A COMBINATION FOR NON-PROFIT TO SUPPORT PUBLIC AGENCY DOES PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT BENEFIT IN TERMS OF EXPANDING THOSE TYPES OF DOLLARS THAT CAN BE PUT TOWARDS THAT. I'M GOING TO HAND IT OFF.

SPEAKER: NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OF COURSE, THERE ARE CASE STUDIES THAT WE COULD HAVE CHOSEN AND WE WANTED TO NARROW IT DOWN, AND TODAY WE'LL NARROW IT DOWN EVEN FURTHER. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE A SERIES OF MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL OR REGIONAL TRAILS AND SINGLE JURISDICTION, SINGLE OPERATOR OWNER TRAIL SYSTEMS. AND EVEN WITHIN THERE, THE TEAM LOOKED AT SELF MODELS, WE REALLY FOCUSED IN ON THE RIM TRAIL AS WELL AS CIRCUIT AND ATLANTA BELT LINE AS THE SINGLE OWNER OPERATOR. WE DID LOOK AT GOLDEN GATE NATIONAL PARK CONSERVANCY AND HIGH LINE AS REFERENCE FOR SOME EXHIBITS. WE WANTED TO LOOK AT THESIS EXISTING FUND-RAISING STRATEGIES AND TEASE OUT THE KEY NUGGETS AND ALSO LOOK AT THEM IN TERMS OF SCALE HAVE EXAMPLES FROM AS LARGE AS 750 PLUS MILES TO AS SMALL AS ONE AND A HALF MILES. LET'S DIVE INTO THE TAHOE RIM TRAIL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. YOU SAW IN EMILY'S SLIDE EARLIER, THE TIMELINE, TAHOE RIM TRAIL ASSOCIATION FOUNDED AROUND THE SIMILAR TIME AS THE BAY TRAIL, AND I THINK WHAT'S IMPORTANT IS THAT OVER THE DECADES, THEY HAVE REALLY GROWN TO BECOME A SELF-SUSTAINING ORGANIZATION THAT PROVIDES EXCELLENCE, YOU SEE IN THEIR MISSION HERE, TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INSPIRE STEWARDSHIP AND PRESERVE ACCESS. THEY'RE REALLY MEETING THAT MISSION. THEY HAVE A SUBSTANTIAL OUTDOOR EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS AND THEY ALSO LOG 10S AND HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF HOURS OF VOLUNTEER TIME TO MAINTAIN THE TAHOE RIM TRAIL, THE 160 PLUS MILE TRAIL AROUND THE LIKE. WHAT WE FOUND AS VERY INTERESTING AND JUST THE EVOLUTION OF THE TAHOE RIM TRAIL ASSOCIATION IS THERE IS THIS RECURRING NEED TO IDENTIFY SOME ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR OPERATORS AND MAINTENANCE, THERE IS TECHNICAL POINTS ALONG THE TRAIL AND A NEED TO PRIORITIZE SOME OF THE OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE ALONG THAT SYSTEM. AND JUST FAIRLY RECENTLY THEY SOUGHT TO -- THEY COUCHED IT UNDER THE TAHOE FUND, WHICH IS A LARGER NON-PROFIT THAT WORKS IN SEVERAL BETTERMENT IN SEVERAL AREAS AROUND THE TAHOE REGION BUT THEY SETUP THE TAHOE TRAIL ENDOWMENT, AND THIS ENDOWMENT IS, THEY'RE SEEKING TO RAISE UPWARDS OF $3 MILLION, AND THEY FEEL THAT WITHIN THAT $3 MILLION FROM THAT POINT ON, THERE CAN BE THIS ENDURING OR SUSTAINING MAINTENANCE ACTIVITIES THAT CAN BE ACHIEVED THROUGH THE INCOME BASED ON THAT ENDOWMENT. I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT FOR EVERYONE TO ACKNOWLEDGE. THE ENDOWMENT THAT EMILY MENTIONED ON HIGH LINE WHICH IS OBVIOUSLY VERY SUBSTANTIAL AND HAD SOME VERY LARGE PRIVATE DONORS THE TAHOE TRAIL ENDOWMENT IS MORE GRASSROOTS MORE SEED MONEY AND A SINGLE LARGE TONNER, IT'S A DOLLAR OR FIVE THERE DONATION HERE OR THERE IT'S A LESSON LEARNED IN GAINING STEAM IT'S IMPORTANT TO REALIZE THE THRESHOLD, THE 3 MILLION MARK WAS THERE, OF COURSE DIFFERENT TRAILS REQUIRE DIFFERENT LEVELS OF FUNDING IT'S IMPORTANT TO IDENTIFY AND LAY THAT OUT FIRST. GO TO THE NEXT EXAMPLE. SO JUMPING TO A LARGER NETWORK OF TRAILS, AGAIN TRYING TO TEASE OUT THOSE KEY NUGGETS. BUT THE CIRCUIT, WHICH IS OUT IN THE PHILADELPHIA

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE FOUND INTERESTING CASE STUDIES THE SIDE AND DEPTH AND BREADTH OF THE PARTNERSHIP ON THE NON-PROFIT SIDE THE WAY THEY KICKED OFF THE COALITION OF PARTNERSHIPS THE DELAWARE VALLEY REGIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION IN 2009, 2010 WAS ABLE TO RECEIVE SOME FEDERAL DOLLARS FOR THE TIGER GRANT PROGRAM AND THEY LEVERAGED THOSE FUNDS THEN WHEN THEY WERE ABLE TO RECEIVE IT, ACTUALLY, OF COURSE, TO DO SOME DEVELOPMENT ALONG THE LARGER CIRCUIT TRAIL BUT ALSO TO REALLY BRING TOGETHER UPWARDS OF 30 PARTNERS AND REALLY ESTABLISH THIS LARGER NON-PROFIT PARTNERSHIP ASSOCIATED WITH THIS -- THE DELAWARE VALLEY, DVRPC TRAILS PLANNING COMMISSION TO ACTUALLY SUPPORT THE EFFORTS AND CONTINUE TO BUILD-OUT THAT 750 PLUS MILES. AND WHAT WAS INTERESTING IS THEY USED THOUGH INITIAL FEDERAL DOLLARS AND THEY WERE ABLE TO LEVERAGE THOSE FEDERAL DOLLARS TO A LARGER POT TO GET SOME MONEY FOR THE WILLIAM PENN FOUNDATION AND BE ABLE TO GET SOME DOLLARS TO BE CREATIVE IN THE COALITION ON THE NON-PROFIT SIDE AND BE ABLE TO USE PART OF SPENDING TO PUT TOWARDS BETTERMENT OF A LARGER NETWORK. NEXT SLIDE. LAST EXAMPLE ATLANTA BELT LINE, SINGLE JURISDICTION, BUT KEY TAKEAWAY OR WHAT WE WANT TO PULL OUT OF HERE IT'S ONE OF THE BEST EXAMPLES IF NOT THE BEST EXAMPLE OF TRANSLATING WHAT WOULD BE A TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT APPROACH TO A TRAIL SYSTEM, 30 PLUS MILE ATLANTA BELT LINE, BACK IN 2005 PASSED A NEW SPECIAL TAX DISTRICT, AND THAT WAS -- A LOT OF THEM, ALMOST $100 MILLION OVER THE LIFE OF THAT -- THE TAX, FOR THE SUNSET ON THAT BILL. AND WHAT THEY DID WITH THAT MONEY IS THEY ACTUALLY SETUP, IN A CORPORATION, A DEVELOPMENT CORP, AS WELL AS AN ASSOCIATED PARTNERSHIP OR NON-PROFIT. AND WHAT'S REALLY INTERESTING IS THAT THE PARTNERSHIP SIDE -- SO THERE IS ACTUALLY 43 STAFF THAT PARTICIPATE IN BELT LINE, INC. AND THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PARTNERSHIP, AND 23% OF THAT STAFF IS DEDICATED TO FUND-RAISING SO THEY HAVE EIGHT FULL-TIME FUND-RAISING STAFF THEY HAVE SEEN THE FRUITS OF THEIR EFFORTS WITH ONGOING DONATIONS AND WHERE THEY HAVE SEEN SUCCESS IS IN THEIR NEXT EFFORT AND INTRODUCED LEGISLATION TO CREATE ANOTHER SPECIAL TAX DISTRICT THAT REALLY TIED TO ADDITIONAL PHILANTHROPIC GRANT DOLLARS AND FUND RAISING. A BUCKET BUILD UP OF PHILANTHROPIC DOLLARS THAT WILL BE RELEASED TO THE SPECIFIC DISTRICT AND INCENTIVIZING UPWARDS OF $50 MILLION ON THE GRANT FUNDING SIDE JUST AN INTERESTING WAY TO SETUP THE DEVELOPMENT CORP AND AS WELL AS ASSOCIATED PARTNERSHIPS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AGAIN THIS WASN'T INTENDED TO BE COMPREHENSIVE OR DIVE INTO NUANCES OF CASE STUDIES BUT JUST TO GIVE YOU AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE NEW INNOVATIVE TECHNIQUES THAT DIFFERENT TRAIL GROUPS ARE USING TO RAISE FUNDS. BUT KEY TAKEAWAY S BETWEEN EMILY AND I, PARTNERSHIPS, COALITION OF 30 PLUS YEARS ON THE MULTIPLE FUNDING STREAMS, BELT LINE WHERE THEY'RE LEVERAGING SPECIAL TAX DISTRICTS AND OPPORTUNITY OPERATING STRONG PRIVATE FUND-RAISING RESOURCES AND INCLUDING DEDICATED STAFF, 20% OF THEIR DEDICATED STAFF ARE LOOKING TO HELP WITH FUND-RAISING, AND STRONG BRANDING MESSAGE, COMMUNICATION STRATEGY AND ALL OF THESE ORGANIZATIONS HAVE BUILT GREAT STORIES ABOUT THE TRAILS, AND THOSE STORIES GET ADDITIONAL DOLLARS. NEXT SLIDE. THAT'S THE END OF TODAY'S PRESENTATION. YOU SEE SOME QUESTIONS HERE JUMPING OFF POINT FOR DISCUSSION AND OTHER CASE STUDY, AND GROUPS INTERESTED IN STUDYING FURTHER ELEMENTS. I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO NICOLA AND TOSHI FOR OTHER IMPORTANT TOPICS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: NICOLA: GREAT OVERVIEW. THIS WAS AN EXPLORE TORI FIRST PASS DIGGING INTO SOME OF THIS MATERIAL. SO THAT, I THINK WE CAN OPEN IT UP FOR QUESTIONS AND PASS THE BATON BACK TO JOHN.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: I'LL START WITH A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. ONE IS THAT THE BAY AREA IS MAYBE NOT UNIQUE, BUT CERTAINLY AN OUTLIER IN THE NUMBER OF JURISDICTIONS THAT EXIST, AND THE NUMBER OF ORGANIZATIONS THAT EXIST. WE'RE NOT OPERATING HERE IN A VACUUM. THE REGIONAL NON-PROFIT WHICH THESE DAYS HAS SUCCESSFUL PARTNERSHIP, THE BAY AREA RIDGE TRAIL COUNCIL IT'S BEEN A BIG EFFORT TAKING YEARS TO GET THERE, AND THE -- IF THE BAY TRAIL WERE TO GO THAT ROUTE, AS ITS OWN ORGANIZATION, OWN EFFORT, I'M, ONE, CONCERNED ABOUT COMPETITION, AND MESSAGING, HOW TO DISTINGUISH THE TWO. ON THE OTHER SIDE, WOULD IT BE POSSIBLE TO COMBINE THE EFFORTS INTO MORE OF A REGIONAL TRAIL OF GRAY AND RIDGE TRAIL APPROACH WITH THE WATER TRAIL THROWN IN AS WELL? THAT RAISES ITS OWN SET OF ISSUES? COULD THEY STRETCH FURTHER THAN THEY ALREADY HAVE STRETCHED THEMSELVES HERE? THERE'S NO EASY ANSWER. BUT THE KEY THING HERE IS BEING COGNIZANT AND SUPPORTIVE OF ALL OF THE ORGANIZATIONS AND EFFORTS ONGOING ALREADY. WE CAN'T JUST STEP IN AND SAY WE KNOW THE RIGHT WAY TO DO IT. THE QUESTION ABOUT DONOR RECOGNITION AND USING THAT AS A WAY TO GET SOME FUND-RAISING, WE HAVE HAD SOME DISCUSSIONS ABOUT THAT IN YEARS PASSED. AND THE KEY TAKEAWAY ON ISSUES HERE IN DISCUSSION IS THE BAY TRAIL IS NOT OWNED BY ANY ONE ENTITY, BUT EACH ENTITY, WHETHER IT'S A CITY, COUNTY, OR PARK DISTRICT, OR FEDERAL AGENCIES IN A COUPLE OF CASES, HAS THEIR OWN RULES AND REGULATION. THE IDEA OF DOING DONOR RECOGNITION ALONG THE TRAIL, ON ONE HAND, I THINK THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WOULD BE GREAT. THERE IS LOTS OF POTENTIAL FOR TIE-INS BETWEEN BUSINESS AND VARIOUS SECTIONS OF THE TRAIL, BUT IN ORDER TO GIVE THAT RECOGNITION, WE WOULD HAVE TO HAVE BUY OFF OF EACH CITY, EACH COUNTY, EACH AGENCY, WHICH IS NOT INSURMOUNTABLE BUT GOT AN EASY THING EITHER. SOMETHING THAT WOULD REQUIRE A FAIR AMOUNT OF EFFORT TO SEE WHICH OF THOSE REGULATORY AGENCIES WOULD BE WILLING TO IN SOME WAY PARTNER OR GIVE UP SOME OF THEIR REGULATORY CONTROL IN ORDER FOR THE BAY TRAIL TO GIVE VISIBLE RECOGNITION TO THE VARIOUS BUSINESSES AND OTHER ENTITIES WHICH ARE PROVIDING SUPPORT TO THE TRAIL. WHETHER THAT WOULD BE THE KIND OF CALTRANS, ADOPT A HIGHWAY KIND OF MODEL, OR ANYTHING ELSE, IN TERMS OF MAINTENANCE OR CONSTRUCTION, THIS'S A HUGE HURDLE TO GET OVER. IN TERMS OF ABILITY TO RECEIVE DONATIONS, IT'S NOT ENTIRE TRUE THAT A PUBLIC AGENCY CAN'T GET DONATIONS. DONATIONS TO PUBLIC AGENCIES ARE TAX EXEMPT IN MY EXPERIENCE IN NAPA WE GOT A LOT OF DONATIONS AS A PUBLIC AGENCY BECAUSE WE WORKED WITH DONORS TO SETUP MECHANISMS TO ENSURE THEIR FUNDING WENT TO DO NATIONS THAT THEY CARE ABOUT. AT THE SAME TIME A LOT OF FOUNDATIONS WON'T GIVE TO PUBLIC AGENCIES, THEY WILL ONLY GIVE TO NON-PROFITS. IT'S A MIXED BAG. IT'S NOT TRUE THAT PUBLIC AGENCIES CAN'T ACCEPT DONATIONS ON THEIR OWN.

BRENDA BUXTON: BUT SOMETIMES IT'S JUST A LOT OF WORK TO GET IT OUT THE DOOR FOR A PUBLIC AGENCY.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THAT IS TRUE. AND THEN FINALLY, WE HAVE A COUPLE OF -- IN OUR REGION, A COUPLE OF REGIONAL FUNDING SOURCE AT THIS POINT. RM3 IS THE LATEST, AND I GUESS I HAVE A QUESTION, JUST ON THE SIDE OF THIS IS,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WHAT'S STATUS OF RM3? WHAT'S LEGAL CHALLENGE? AND SECONDLY, IN RM3, THERE IS A POT OF MONEY SET-ASIDE FOR THE BAY TRAIL AND OTHER BIKE/PED FACILITIES F RM3 SUCCEEDS THROUGH THE COURT CHALLENGE THERE WILL NEED TO BE A MECHANISM FOR PRIORITIZING -- MTC WILL NEED TO PRIORITIZE WHICH PARTS OF THE NETWORK GET FUNDED IN WHAT WAY. AND ALSO THE RESTORATION AUTHORITY WHICH COULD BE FUNDING SOURCES FOR SOME BAY TRAIL SEGMENTS. IN MY MIND THE MAIN LIMITATION FOR THE BAY TRAIL IS THOSE FUNDS CAN ONLY BE USED FOR TRAILS WHICH ARE DONE IN CONJUNCTION WITH RESTORATION. SO IF THE AREA DOESN'T NEED RESTORATION, WETLAND RESTORATION OR HAS ALREADY DONE THE RESTORATION, IT'S NOT REALLY NECESSARY TO FUND THE BAY TRAIL. SO MAYBE THERE IS A WAY AT SOME FUTURE POINT TO BROADEN THE AUTHORITY OF THE RESTORATION AUTHORITY, TO BE MORE THAN JUST RESTORATION ITSELF BUT TO LOOK AT THE WHOLE BAY TRAIL IN ALL OF ITS SEGMENTS. WITH THOSE GENERAL COMMENTS, I'LL OPEN IT UP FOR ANY OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS. BRUCE?

BRUCE BEYAERT: YES. DEVON'S PRESENTATION, AS TO CASE STUDIES THAT MIGHT BE CONSIDERED, WE MIGHT NOT HAVE TO LOOK FAR AS YOU MENTIONED HERE IN THE BAY AREA, WE HAVE THE BRIDGE TRAIL ALSO THE EAST BAY REGIONAL PARK COVERING ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA COUNTY TWO OF THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. THEY'RE BOTH VERY DIFFERENT THAN THIS GROUP. RIDGE TRAIL WHICH BILL CAN SPEAK TO IS A MEMBERSHIP BASED GROUP WITH ACTIVE VOLUNTEERS, AND IN SUCCESS, THEY HAVE SPURRED AHEAD OF THE BAY TRAIL IN MILEAGE COMPLETED. SO THEY MUST BE DOING SOMETHING RIGHT. EAST BAY REGIONAL PARK AIR DISTRICT HAS BEEN INCREDIBLY SUCCESSFUL FOR GETTING FUNDS FOR CLOSING BAY TRAIL GAPS IN ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA THEY HAVE ONE GRANT WRITER WHO IS HANDLING ALL OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THEIR GRANT APPLICATIONS TO SUPPORT STAFF. I SUGGEST TAKING A LOOK AT THOSE ORGANIZATIONS WHO ARE COMPLETING THEIR REGISTRATION FOR BAY TRAILS, AND SEAN MAY SPEAK TO REPRESENTATION OF THE SUCCESS OF THE PARK DISTRICT.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: KATHLEEN KANE GENERAL COUNSEL HAS A HAND UP.

KATHLEEN KANE: HI. I JUST WANTED TO QUICKLY GIVE YOU THE NON-UPDATE ON THE RM3 LITIGATION RIGHT NOW. WE'RE IN THE CALIFORNIA SUPREME COURT. WE ARE TRAILING THE ZALEVY CITY OF OAKLAND CASE WHICH PRESENTED SOME SIMILAR BUT NOT IDENTICAL ISSUES TO THE RM3. THAT HAS BEEN FULLY BRIEFED WE HAVE PARTICIPATED AS AMICAS SO WE DON'T HAVE AN ORAL ARGUMENT DATE YET. IT'S SORT OF A WAIT AND SEE MODE RIGHT NOW. DEPENDING ON HOW THAT COMES OUT, YOU KNOW, IDEALLY WE'LL GET A WIN, THAT'S A WIN FOR OAKLAND AND FOR US AND WE DON'T HAVE TO KEEP LITIGATING IT. IF OAKLAND DOESN'T GET A CLEAN SWEEP, THEN WE HAVE OUR OWN ARGUMENTS TO MAKE AND WE'LL BE TRYING TO PRESS THOSE EITHER IN THERE OR IN LOWER COURT.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: ANY TIME FRAME ON THAT.

KATHLEEN KANE: IT'S THE COURT'S TIME FRAME, SO WE CAN WISH THEM EFFICIENCY. BUT OTHER THAN THAT, WE DON'T HAVE A LOT OF CONTROL.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. JOE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JOSEPH LACLAIR: THANK YOU, JOHN. THANKS FOR THE GREAT PRESENTATION. AS BAY TRAIL, WE HAVE NOT HAD MEMBERSHIP OR DUES PROGRAM, OR WE HAVEN'T PRODUCED A RESULT IN ANNUAL REPORT IN MONEY COMING IN OR GOING OUT, BUT WE HAVE DONE A REALLY GOOD JOB BRANDING AND STORY TELLING ABOUT THE TRAIL PROJECTS, INCLUDING THROUGH ADVANCING PROGRAMMING BY GETTING OUT IN THE COMMUNITY AND ENSURING PROGRESS AND LISTENING TO FOLKS AT VARIOUS EVENTS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY THINK ABOUT THE TRAIL AND WHAT THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE. I WAS CURIOUS TO KNOW OF THE EXAMPLES THAT WE WERE SHOWN, IF THERE IS ANY SENSE OF PERCENTAGE OF THE AMOUNT OF CAPITAL MONEY THAT THOSE PROJECTS WERE ABLE TO GENERATE IN ACTUALLY BUILDING TRAIL, BECAUSE THAT'S ALWAYS THE EXPENSIVE PART IS CONSTRUCTION. AND JUST THE EXTENT TO WHICH, YOU KNOW, THE CAPITAL HAS FLOWN THROUGH OR FROM THE NON-PROFIT TO THE CONTRACTORS TO ACTUALLY BUILD THE STUFF.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: BILL?

BILL LONG: THANK YOU. BILL LONG. I HAVE BEEN A BAY TRAIL BOARD MEMBER FOR 20 YEARS AND A RIDGE TRAIL BOARD MEMBER FOR 30 YEARS. SIMILAR ORGANIZATIONS IN TERMS OF WHAT THEY'RE DOING ON THE GROUND, BUT VERY DIFFERENT IN THE WAY THEY'RE ORGANIZED AND FUNDED. THE RIDGE TRAIL RIGHT NOW, IS ABOUT A MILLION DOLLAR A YEAR AND A QUARTER OF THAT COMES FROM THE CONSERVANCY FOR GENERALLY PLANNING. WE HAVE MADE A MAJOR EFFORT, RIGHT FROM THE BEGINNING, TO DEVELOP MEMBERS AND DONOR SUPPORT TO FILL IN THE OTHER THREE QUARTERS OF OUR BUDGET, AND SO I RECOGNIZE, IN THE PRESENTATION, WHICH I THOUGHT WAS EXCELLENT. YOU HAVE DONE A FINE JOB

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THERE RESEARCHING THESE OTHER TRAILS, I RECOGNIZE, IN YOUR FINAL SLIDE, ELEMENTS OF EVERYTHING THE RIDGE TRAIL IS INVOLVED IN RIGHT NOW, TO CONTINUE TO DEVELOP AND TAME ITS BASE OF SUPPORT OF ABOUT 4,000 MEMBERS. AND IT'S POSSIBLE THAT WE COULD HAVE MANY MORE WITH MORE OF AN EFFORT, BUT WE HAVE GOT AN IMBALANCED PROGRAM AT THIS POINT. SO DO I THINK THERE IS POTENTIAL FOR THE BAY TRAIL TO DEVELOP A MEMBERSHIP ORGANIZATION AND A BASE? YES. BUT WHAT YOU'RE UP AGAINST IS THE PERCEPTION THAT, HEY, THE BAY TRAIL IS DOING FINE. WHY DO WE NEED SOMETHING NEW? WHY DO WE NEED A MAJOR EFFORT OR ORGANIZATION TO KEEP THINGS GOING? WE HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL, MILES ON THE GROUND AND NEW PROJECTS ALL THE TIME. SO THAT'S SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT. THERE IS AN AREA, THOUGH, WHERE THE NON-PROFIT COULD MAKE CONTRIBUTIONS. I DON'T THINK THEY WOULD BE ANYTHING LIKE THESE MULTI-MILLION DOLLARS CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT WE HAVE LOOKED AT. BUT THERE ARE AREAS WHERE, FOR EXAMPLE, AMENITIES ALONG THE TRAIL. SIMPLE THINGS, LIKE BENCHES, BIKE RACKS, WHATEVER YOU'RE FAVORITE AMENITY S IT COULD BE A ROLE FOR NON-PROFIT TO COME IN AND MAKE GRANTS OR ACTUALLY CARRY OUT WORK IN SOME CASES, BUT THAT MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WOULD APPRECIATE AND RECOGNIZE AND TO SUPPLEMENT WHAT THE PUBLIC AGENCIES ARE ABLE TO BELIEVE DO WITH THEIR OWN FUNDS. SO THERE ARE PARTNERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES, BUT TO A POINT WHERE YOU COULD CONTRIBUTE MAJOR AMOUNTS OF FUNDING TOWARD CAPITAL PROJECTS I DON'T THINK IT'S REALISTIC. IT'S NOT REALISTIC FOR THE RIDGE TRAIL WHICH HAS BEEN VERY DEPENDENT ON COASTAL CONSERVANCY SUPPORT FOR THE CAPITAL PROJECTS WHICH ARE FUNDED BY PARTNERS. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. YOU HAVE DONE A FINE JOB. I WANT TO INVITE TO YOU TALK TO THE BAY AREA RIDGE TRAIL STAFF WHO HAVE PROFESSIONAL FUNDRAISERS WHO COULD

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SHED ADDITIONAL LIGHT IN PARTICULAR IN THESE SITUATIONS FOR THE BAY AREA FOR FUND-RAISING IN THE BAY AREA.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: JOE, DID YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP AGAIN?

SPEAKER: JOSEPH LACLAIR: I UNDERSTAND THERE MAY NOT BE AN ANSWER TO MY QUESTION RIGHT NOW BUT KNOWING THAT WOULD BE GOOD, IF WE COULD HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF NON-PROFIT FUNDING IN SIGNIFICANCE TO CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS.

NICOLA SZIBBO: DEVON, DO WE KNOW THE MILEAGE CONSTRUCTED FOR THE EXAMPLES? MAYBE THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE CAN LOOK AT IN OUR NEXT --

DEVON YOUNG: OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD, I DONT. WE CAN CERTAINLY RESEARCH THAT. I CAN TELL YOU TWO EXAMPLES, RAZOR BACK GREENWAY IN ARKANSAS, IT'S A 33- MILE FACILITY AND THE WALTON FOUNDATION PRIVATE MONEY DIRECTLY IMPLEMENTED WAS 30% OF THAT AND THE EMPIRE STATE TRAIL NORTH, SOUTH, EAST, WEST, THEY HAD PHILANTHROPIC DOLLARS, 100,000,200 MILLION CAME FROM STATE OR PUBLIC MONEYS AND THE BREAK DOWN OF WHAT WAS IMPLEMENTATION DOLLARS FOR THE EMPIRE STATE TRAIL I DON'T KNOW OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD I'LL HAVE TO GET BACK TO YOU ON THAT, BUT IT WAS THE VAST MAJORITY OF THOSE DOLLARS, WENT STRAIGHT TO IMPLEMENTATION CONSTRUCTION. SO WE'LL LOOK INTO THAT AND GIVE YOU A MORE REFINED ANSWER FOR THE CASE STUDIES WE HAD TODAY AND SOME OTHER EXAMPLES TOO.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: PHILIPPE THEN RICK.

PHILIPPE SALES: NAPA VALLEY VINE TRAIL HAS BEEN AROUND 62008 AND WE HAVE RAISED ALMOST $9 MILLION FROM PRIVATE PHILANTHROPY FOR THE PROJECT. WE HAVE A MILLION DOLLARS MAINTENANCE FUND IN OUR ENDOWMENT AND THE REST OF THE MONEY -- I THINK, TYPICALLY, YOU CAN'T REALLY MEASURE A PROJECT LIKE WE D BUT WE USE A RUBRIC OF, FOR EVERY THERE WE RAISE, WE, THE GOAL IS, WE GET $4 IF FEDERAL, STATE, OR LOCAL TRANSPORTATION MONEYS. AND THAT'S BEEN HOLDING PRETTY TRUE THROUGH THE WHOLE PROCESS, BECAUSE WE HAVE HELPED SOLANO AND NAPA COUNTY, AND VARIOUS OTHER FOLKS, WE HAVE HELPED WITH GRANTS AND SO FORTH THERE IS 20 MILES NOW IN EXISTENCE WITH ANOTHER 12 MILES UNDER CONSTRUCTION NEXT YEAR. BUT TRYING TO SAY THAT SO MANY DOLLARS BUILT THAT PIECE OF THE TRAIL IS A DIFFERENT THING TO DO BECAUSE THE MONEYS GET BLENDED IN THE END THAT'S ONE OF THE ADVANTAGES. AND THE IDEA OF A FUNDRAISER, WE JUST PROMOTED ONE OF OUR STAFF WHO COMES FROM A MARKETING BACKGROUND, TO BE OUR FIRST FORMAL FUNDRAISER. ACTUALLY DONE A LOT WITH NETWORK AND THE BOARD, SOME POTENTIAL THINGS WEAVE DONE IN PROVIDING BACKGROUND FOR THE LAST 15 YEARS.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RICK?

RICK PARMER: AS MOST OF YOU KNOW, I AM A MEMBER OF THE BOARD. WAS CHAIR FOR 12 YEARS I WORKED IN SENIOR MANAGEMENT AT EAST BAY PARKS AND ALSO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DIRECTOR RED WOODS. I THINK ATTENTION NEEDS TO BE GIVEN BETWEEN GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES AND FUND-RAISING, WHICH ONES WERE MOST EFFECTIVE AND WHY. THAT'S ONE ISSUE. THE OTHER ONE IS THAT, LONG-TERM, AND MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL TRAILS, OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE IS VERY PROBLEMATIC, SO I THINK LOOKING AT GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES THAT LOOK TOWARDS WHAT'S THE BEST FIT FOR THAT, IS AN IMPORTANT QUESTION TO LOOK AT. YOU KNOW, EVERYTHING FROM JPAS TO HOW DO YOU INTEGRATE ALL OF THE ISSUES AND PROBLEM THAT COME UP SO THAT, FOR INSTANCE, BAY TRAIL STAFF OR SOME JURISDICTION WITHIN THE CITY OR COUNTY ISN'T GETTING BOMBARDED WITH COMPLAINTS OR THERE ARE LEGAL ISSUES IN TERMS OF PROBLEMS IN THE TRAIL IN TERMS OF MAINTENANCE, OR LIABILITY. THAT'S ALL.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: ARE THERE OTHER PEOPLE WITH HANDS RAISED? NOT SEEING ANY. SO, JUST, YOU KNOW, JUST TO ADD A LITTLE BIT MORE TO THIS DISCUSSION I DO THINK THERE IS VALUE IN BEING LOOKING AT TRYING TO EXPAND ON THIS O AND M AND AMENITIES IF THERE COULD BE FUND-RAISING DONE FROM LOCAL BUSINESSES AS WELL AS LOCAL ORGANIZATIONS THAT CARE ABOUT DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE TRAIL AND WOULD GET BENEFIT FROM IT. I SUSPECT ALSO THE ONLY WAY YOU COULD GET THE REGULATORY AGENCIES LIKE THE CITIES OR THE COUNTIES ON BOARD WOULD BE TO BE ON THE STANDPOINT THAT, RIGHT NOW, THEY'RE ON THE HOOK FOR THE MAINTENANCE FOR THESE TRAILS, AND IF THEY WERE WILLING TO GIVE UP SOME OF THIS INDEPENDENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY TO HAVE A COMMON PROGRAM FOR FUND-RAISING, BRANDING AROUND THE BAY TRAIL, AND THEN, BASICALLY, THEY WOULD FREE UP SOME OF THEIR O&M OBLIGATIONS BY DOING THAT. THAT MIGHT HAVE SOME LEGS. I DON'T KNOW. IT WOULD REQUIRE SOMEONE SPENDING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

A FAIR AMOUNT OF TIME, PROBABLY AT LEAST A YEARS'S WORK OF TIME, TALKING WITH THE VARIOUS AGENCIES TO SEE WHO IS INTERESTED AND HOW FAR THEY ARE WILLING TO TAKE THIS. TOSHI OR ANY OTHER STAFF, DO YOU HAVE THOUGHTS ABOUT NEXT STEPS ON THIS?

TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA: I THINK WE'RE GOING TO TAKE IN ALL OF THESE GREAT COMMENTS THAT WE HAVE GOTTEN. WE DON'T HAVE A CLEARLY DEFINED SCOPE. WE'RE LOOKING TO GET FEEDBACK ON, SORT OF, TYPES OF THINGS THAT EXTERNAL FUNDING LIKE THIS MIGHT MOST USEFUL FOR AND HAVE THE IDEA THAT REALLY O&M IS PROBABLY THE GREATEST NEED BECAUSE IT'S THE MOST CHALLENGING TO GET PUBLIC FUNDING FOR. I AGREE WITH WHAT RICK SAID. THERE ARE OTHER EXAMPLES OF TRAILS AND MODELS WORTH LOOKING AT AS WE TRY TO IDENTIFY BEST PRACTICES. THERE ARE SOME THINGS THAT MIGHT BE RELEVANT FOR SIMILARLY SIZED TRAILS IN OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY BUT ALSO KNOW THERE ARE THINGS THAT ARE SPECIAL AND UNIQUE ABOUT THE BAY AREA, FOR GOOD AND FOR BAD, SO IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE A MIX OF BOTH. YOU KNOW, WHAT ARE THE THINGS THAT WE CAN LOOK AT TO POTENTIALLY RAISE ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO TACKLE, IN PARTICULAR, AMENITIES, O&M, REHAB. PARTICULARLY, AS THE TRAIL MATURES AND WE JUST HAVE GROWTH LENGTH OF THE BAY TRAIL THAT MAY NEED THAT SUPPORT IS, YOU KNOW, FROM TALKING TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS ABOUT MAYBE A LESS -- BAY TRAIL [INDISCERNIBLE] BUT OTHER TRIBES OF TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS OTHER TYPES OF CAPITAL PROJECTS, IN PARTICULAR AGENCIES THAT HAVE TAKEN ON PROJECTS BECAUSE THEY -- DON'T HAVE CONCERNS LOOKING AT OPPORTUNITY TO ACTUALLY DELIVER A PROJECT BUT WORK WITH THOSE UNDER RESOURCES JURISDICTIONS TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE MAINTAINED AND UTILIZED TO PRESENT OPPORTUNITIES THERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE'RE ALL EARS FOR SUGGESTIONS AND FEEDBACK FROM THE STEERING COMMITTEE. SO IF YOU HAVE OTHER THOUGHTS OR IDEAS IN THE NEXT WEEK OR TWO PLEASE FOLLOW UP WITH US.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: SO WHAT'S THE PLAN GOING FOR FORWARD WITH THE WORK?

TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA: THIS IS A LIST OF CASE STUDIES THAT WE THOUGHT WOULD BE RELEVANT. WE WILL PROBABLY LOOK AT ONES THAT ARE SUGGESTED LIKE EAST BAY PARKS -- NOT BROAD -- [INDISCERNIBLE] A NUMBER OF STATE PARKS HAS THEIR FOUNDATION MAYBE RIDGE TRAIL MAYBE WE'LL FOLLOW UP WITH A SHORTER LIST OF SPECKS THAT MIGHT BE WORTH A DEEPER DIVE FOR. AND ONES THAT HAVE GREATEST NEEDS THAT MAY BE HARDEST TO FUND WITH EXISTING PUBLIC SOURCES.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: ANY OTHER COMMENTS? QUESTIONS?

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THIS IS FRED. JUST FOR THE RECORD, NO ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED. IF I COULD MAKE A CORRECTION ON THE VOTE FOR THE ITEM 5, 5 AYES, TWO ABSTENTIONS, THE ABSENTEES.

TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA: WE WEREN'T ABLE TO HAVE THE ORIGINAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN PRESENTATION TODAY AND HOPEFUL WE'LL HAVE KARA BACK FOR THE NEXT MEETING. IN ADDITION GOING THROUGH THE SCOPE OF IT, I THINK ONE COMPONENT IS A FUNDING PLAN AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IN LOOKING AT THE NEAR-TERM OPPORTUNITIES AS WELL AS FUNDING RESOURCE THAT IS AVAILABLE TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, WHICH THEY ARE INCORPORATING THE TRAILS WORK WITHIN THE SCOPE OF THAT EFFORT. UNFORTUNATELY SHE WASN'T HERE TODAY TO TEE THAT UP BUT THAT WOULD BE INSIGHTFUL AT THE NEXT MEETING.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: IT'S PROBABLY JUST AS WELL BECAUSE WE HAVE ALREADY GONE ALMOST TWO HOURS AND ZOOM MEETINGS ARE EXHAUSTING FOR MORE THAN A COUPLE OF HOURS. SO, ARE THERE ANY FINAL COMMENTS? OR THOUGHTS ABOUT THE NEXT MEETING? JOE?

SPEAKER: WHEN I HEARD LEE TALK IT SOUNDED LIKE IT'S GOING TO BE 2022. OR ARE WE GOING TO HAVE A MEETING IN DECEMBER?

LEE HUO: RIGHT NOW, JOE, THERE ARE NO MORE STEERING COMMITTEE MEETINGS SCHEDULED FOR THE REMAINDER OF THIS YEAR. THE FIRST MEETING, I CAN'T REMEMBER THE EXACT DATE. BUT FRED AND I WILL GET THIS OUT TO THE BEFORE THE END OF THE WEEK. THE FIRST STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING FOR NEXT YEAR IS SCHEDULED FOR JANUARY. I DON'T HAVE THE DATE OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: BRENDA?

BRENDA BUXTON: I WANT TO THEY THINK EVERYONE AND SAY GOOD BY AND WELCOME AUBRA ON AS THE NEXT CONSERVANCY STEERING COMMITTEE REP.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: MY COMMENT IS OLD SOLDIERS NEVER DIE. [LAUGHTER]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BRENDA BUXTON: I KNOW YOU PROBABLY HAVE PLANS FOR ME JOHN. WE'LL TALK LATER. AND JULIE?

JULIE BONDURANT: I JUST WANT TO THANK BRENDA FOR THE WORK SHE'S DONE.

JOHN WOODBURY, CHAIR: WE'RE ADJOURNED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NTT

Broadcasting Government