METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
3	MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 20, 2021, 12:30 P.M.
4	
5	MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THIS IS MIKE HURSH, CHAIR OF THE FARE
6	INTEGRATION TASK FORCE JOINED BY MY VICE CHAIR DENIS MULLIGAN.
7	IT'S MY PLEASURE TO CALL THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
8	MEETING TO ORDER OF SEPTEMBER 20TH, 2021. MADAM CLERK, MARTHA
9	SILVER, MAY WE PLEASE ROLL THE BROADCAST VIDEO? DUE TO COVID-
10	19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT
11	TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20
12	WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS
13	MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL
14	CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS
15	BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES
16	BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA
17	WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT
18	THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND
19	MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK
20	SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE
21	CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
22	TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
23	DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
24	SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING
25	SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY WRITTEN DUBLIC COMMENTS



- 1 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL
- 2 BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
- 3 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
- 4 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A
- 5 ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS
- 6 AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.
- 7 [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19
- 8 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO
- 9 THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH
- 10 SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING
- 11 IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL
- 12 UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY
- 13 NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES
- 14 BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA
- 15 WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT
- 16 THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND
- 17 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK
- 18 SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE
- 19 CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
- 20 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
- 21 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
- 22 SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING
- 23 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS
- 24 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL
- 25 BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT



1	WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
2	CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A
3	ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS
4	AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.
5	
6	MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU BROADCAST TEAM. MADAM
7	SECRETARY, IF I COULD GET THE ROLL CALL.
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR HURSH?
10	
11	MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: HERE.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MULLIGAN?
14	
15	DENIS MULLIGAN, V. CHAIR: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: BOUCHARD?
18	
19	SPEAKER: PRESENT.
20	
21	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: GONOT? MEMBER HALLS?
22	
23	DARYL HALLS: HERE.
24	



CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MR. MAU? DERRICK, I CAN'T HEAR YOU, BUT 1 2 DERRICK IS HERE FOR MEMBER MAU. MEMBER MCMILLAN? 3 THERESE MCMILLAN: HERE. 4 5 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MAU? 6 7 8 CARTER MAU: HERE. 9 10 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: POWERS? 11 ROBERT POWERS: HERE. 12 13 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: TREE? TUMLIN? WE HAVE A QUORUM. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: THIS IS JULIE CURVE I'M HERE FOR JEFFREY TUMLIN. 17 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU JULIE. THANK YOU MARTHA. I 18 19 HAVE NO FORMAL REMARKS. VEHICLE EVERYONE. HOPING EVERYONE IS HAVING A SAFE AND PRODUCTIVE MONDAY. THIS IS OUR 10TH MEETING. 20 I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK OF THE TASK FORCE. I'LL MOVE US ON 21 22 TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR. BEFORE I CALL FOR A MOTION AND 23 SECOND. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS? 24



CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS 1 ITEM AND THERE IS NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THIS HAND 2 3 RAISED. 4 5 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: MOTION FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR? 6 7 MICHAEL TREE: MOTION. 8 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: REFLECTING MR. TREE IS HERE NOW. 9 10 THERESE MCMILLAN: SECOND, MCMILLAN. 11 12 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: SECONDED BY MCMILLAN, IF WE COULD GET 13 THE ROLL CALL, PLEASE? 14 15 16 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: [ROLL CALL VOTE] 17 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 18 19 PRESENT. 20 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT TAKES US TO 21 22 AGENDA ITEM 4A. GOOD AFTERNOON ADINA, THIS IS THE POLICY 23 ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE 24

COORDINATION INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT.



1	
2	ADINA LEVIN: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO THE TASK FORCE
3	MEMBERS AND STAFF PRESENT. ADINA LEVIN WITH THE POLICY
4	ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION
5	SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE WHERE
6	WE RECEIVED AN UPDATE FROM STAFF THAT WE'LL BE INTRODUCED HERE
7	TODAY GIVING A LOOK AT THE RECOMMENDATIONS AND IMPLEMENTATION
8	ASSESSMENT FOR THE STUDY. AND THE SUBCOMMITTEE WAS LARGELY
9	SUPPORTIVE OF THE EMERGING RECOMMENDATIONS, PARTICULARLY THE
10	PASS PRODUCTS AND THE PILOT THAT ARE BEING CONSIDERED FOR
11	NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATIONS. THERE WAS A LOT OF INTEREST IN
12	CONTINUING TO CONSIDER EQUITY IN DESIGNING AND PRICING THE
13	PAST PRODUCTS, INCLUDING CONTINUING TO CONSIDER THE FARE BASED
14	PATH, WHICH MIGHT BE ABLE TO HAVE SOME EQUITY REFINEMENTS TO
15	THAT. SO, AND, IN ADDITION THE PASSES AND PILOTS FOR THE
16	BEING RECOMMENDED FOR EARLY IMPLEMENTATION, THERE WERE SEVERAL
17	SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO VOICED SUPPORT FOR THE HIRE TIERS OF
18	INTEGRATION RELATING TO THE SIGNIFICANT BENEFITS THAT WERE
19	SHOWED FROM THE STUDY, AND DESPITE THE LARGER IMPLEMENTATION
20	NEED AND THE COST, THE SENSE FOR A NUMBER OF MEMBERS IN THAT
21	GROUP WAS THAT GREATER INTEGRATION WAS WORTH STRIVING FOR, AND
22	THERE WOULD BE BENEFITS INHERENT TO HAVING THE MORE
23	CENTRALIZED MANAGEMENT THAT WOULD ENABLE, NOT ONLY THE
24	INTEGRATIVE FARES BUT OTHER SOURCES OF INTEGRATION, AS WELL,
25	AND IN TERMS OF THE WANTING TO ACHIEVE THOSE LEVELS OF



- 1 INTEGRATION WHICH WOULD HAVE A HIRE COST, THERE WAS ALSO A
- 2 HIGHLIGHT THAT IT WOULD HAVE THE HIGHER BENEFITS AND
- 3 CORRELATION WITH THE FUNDING THAT MTC IS GOING TO BE
- 4 CONSIDERING FOR FUTURE YEARS. SO, YES IT WILL REQUIRE FUNDING
- 5 AND THAT SHOULD BE A -- CONSIDERED FOR FUNDING. AND LASTLY,
- 6 SUCK COMMITTEE MEMBERS DID RECOMMEND THE DEVELOPMENT OF MORE
- 7 FUSER FRIENDLY MATERIALS FOR FUTURE MEETINGS AND STAKEHOLDER
- 8 PRESENTATIONS. DID TAKE US A WHILE TO GO OVER THE MATERIALS
- 9 BECAUSE OF THE ROAST BUST INFORMATION THAT WAS PRESENTED TO
- 10 US, AND GENERAL A POPULAR TOPIC AND IT'S HELPFUL TO NOT THE
- 11 CONTENT FOR THE PUBLIC'S INTEREST. THAT'S MY REPORT. THANK
- 12 YOU.

13

16

- 14 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MARTHA IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
- 15 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?
- 17 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 19 ON THIS ITEM.
- 21 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS US TO
- 22 THE KEYNOTE OF THE MEETING. ITEM 5A FARE COORDINATION
- 23 INTEGRATION STUDY DRAFT FINDINGS RECOMMENDATIONS. AGAIN THIS
- 24 IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. NO ACTIONS REQUIRED BUT I'LL TURN IT



- 1 OVER TO COPROJECT MANAGERS WILLIAM BACON AND MICHAEL EISEMAN.
- 2 GOOD AFTERNOON.

- 4 WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU CHAIR HURSH GOOD AFTERNOON TASK FORCE
- 5 MEMBERS MY NAME IS BILL BACON MTC STAFF AND ONE OF THE PROJECT
- 6 MANAGERS FOR THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY
- 7 JOINED BY MY FELLOW PROJECT MANAGER MIKE EISEMAN. THIS IS
- 8 PRESENTATION IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY AND THERE IS NO ACTION
- 9 BEING ASKED TODAY. WE'RE REQUESTING FEEDBACK AND AVAILABLE TO
- 10 ANSWER OUESTIONS. WE HAVE PATRICK MILLEN FROM STEER WHO IS
- 11 AVAILABLE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS DURING TODAY MEETING I'M GOING
- 12 TO TAKE US THROUGH THE FIRST PORTION OF THE PRESENTATION
- 13 BEFORE TURNING OVER TO MIKE WHERE HE WILL TALK ABOUT NEXT
- 14 STEPS AND UPCOMING WOK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS AFTERNOON
- 15 WE'RE GOING PRESENT KEY FINDINGS RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEAR-TERM
- 16 ACTIONS BASED ON THE WORK OF THE FARE COORDINATION STUDY I'M
- 17 GOING TO PROVIDE BACKGROUND AND FRAMING FOR THE
- 18 RECOMMENDATIONS. DELVING INTO KEY METRICS BY WHICH THE STUDY
- 19 CONDUCTED ANALYSIS. I WANT TO CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO AN
- 20 APPENDIX WHICH IS ATTACHED TO THIS AGENDA ITEM, NUMBER FIVE IN
- 21 YOUR PACKET. CONTAINING A GREATER LEVEL OF TECHNICAL DETAIL
- 22 THAN WE CAN COVER IN THIS PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 23 OVER THE NEXT FIVE SLIDES I WOULD LIKE TO REFRESH THE TASK
- 24 FORCE ON KEY QUESTIONS AND APPROACHES THE STUDY HAS USED TO
- 25 FRAME OUR TECHNICAL ANALYSIS AND OUR RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT



- 1 SLIDE PLEASE. THIS WILL BE FAMILIAR TO MOST TASK FORCE
- 2 MEMBERS BUT LAST YEAR THE PROJECT TEAM DEVELOPED A STUDY
- 3 PROBLEM STATEMENT THAT ACKNOWLEDGED FACTORS THAT CONTAINED
- 4 LIMITED RIDERSHIP GROWTH OVER THE PAST YEARS AND ONE WAS FARE
- 5 POLICY BECAUSE FARE POLICIES ARE FORMED BY FUNDING GOVERNANCE
- 6 MODELS IT HAS BEEN CHALLENGED FOR A MORE COHERENT VISION FOR
- 7 HOW TO REDUCE BARRIERS BETWEEN TRANSIT AGENCIES. CORE ISSUES
- 8 IDENTIFIED CORE VALUE OR HOW CURRENT POLICIES CAN LEAD TO
- 9 DISCONNECT BETWEEN COST OF TRIP AND VALUE PLACED ON TRIP BY
- 10 CUSTOMERS, TWO PAYMENT EXPERIENCE CURRENT PRODUCTS MAY NOT BE
- 11 AS LOGICAL AS THEY COULD BE TO USER'S FUTURE TRANSIT, THREE
- 12 POLICIES INTRODUCTION BARRIERS THAT LIMIT FULL POTENTIAL OF
- OUR PLANS AND OPERATIONAL INVESTMENTS AND FINALLY EQUITY WHICH
- 14 REALLY UNDERLIES ALL OF THE WORK OF THE PROJECT ON HOW CURRENT
- 15 POLICIES MAY NOT FULLY MEET THE NEEDS OF EQUITY PRIORITY
- 16 COMMUNITIES. AS THE TASK FORCE CONSIDERS PROJECT
- 17 RECOMMENDATION TODAY WE WOULD LIKE TO TASK FORCE TO THINK
- 18 ABOUT THEM LIEU THE LENS OF THE FOUR INTEGRATION TIERS
- 19 FOUNDATIONAL TO HOW THE ROAMS ARE STRUCTURED. NUMBER ONE
- 20 FOCUSED ON THE LEFT SIDE OF THE SLIDE, 2050ING FARE
- 21 INSTRUCTION DO NOT RELY ON CHANGES TO HOW INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT
- 22 AGENCIES PRICE OR MANAGE FARE POLICIES. INSTEAD, FARE POLICIES
- 23 IN TIER ONE INCLUDE OFFERINGS LIKE PASSES CAPS OR ACCUMULATORS
- 24 THAT ARE OVERLAID ON TOP OF EXISTING FARE STRUCTURES BUT
- 25 MEANINGFULLY CHANGE THE WAY USERS EXPERIENCE TRAVELOGUE BAY



- 1 AREA TRANSIT. SECOND TIER IN BLUE NUMBER TWO FOCUSES ON
- 2 CHANGES TO HOW FARE -- CHANGES TO FARE POLICY AT THE POINT
- 3 WHERE USERS CONNECT TO DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES. LIKE TIER
- 4 ONE, THIS TIER DOES NOT REQUIRE CHANGES TO HOW INDIVIDUAL
- 5 TRANSIT AGENCIES PRICE OR MANAGE THEIR FARE STRUCTURES FOR
- 6 TRAVEL WITHIN THEIR OWN AGENCY INSTEAD FOCUSES ON ELIMINATING
- 7 COST TO USERS WITH TRANSFERS BETWEEN LIGHT RAIL SERVICES AND
- 8 BETWEEN LOCAL TRANSIT REGIONAL SERVICES LIKE RAIL, FERRY,
- 9 EXPRESS BUS AND IN BETWEEN THOSE SERVICES. TIER THREE INVOLVES
- 10 SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO FARE POLICY REGIONAL TRANSITS SERVICES
- 11 AGAIN RAIL FERRY EXPRESS BUSES. INVOLVE BRINGING IN SERVICES
- 12 INTO A COMMON DISTANCE ZONE BASED FARE STRUCTURE. TIER THREE
- 13 WOULD REOUIRE CHANGES TO POLICY FOR REGIONAL FARE SERVICES
- 14 TIER THREE WOULD NOT IMPACT HOW FARES ARE MANAGED AND PRICE
- 15 FOR LOCAL TRANSIT AND FINALLY FOURTH FINAL TIER BUILD UPON
- 16 CHANGES IN KEY SERVICES IN THE BAY AREA WITH COMMON DISTANCE.
- 17 REQUIRING MOST SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO HEALTH CARE POLICY
- 18 MANAGED BY EXPERIENCE OF TRANSIT USERS ACROSS THE BAY AREA BY
- 19 MORE THAN TWO DOZEN TRANSIT AGENCIES. FARE POLICY CHANGES
- 20 THROUGH THE FRAMEWORK BUSINESS CASE PROCESS GUIDED BY
- 21 EXPERTISE WE DREW UPON A WIDE RANGE EVER INPUT FROM BUSINESS
- 22 CASE ANALYSIS INCLUDING MODELS TOOLS, TO HELP US BETTER
- 23 UNDERSTAND THE POSSIBLE IMPACTS THE FARE POLICY CHANGES ON
- 24 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND KEY MEASURES. WE
- 25 CONDUCTED A WIDE RANGE OF USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES OVER THE



- 1 COURSE OF THE PROJECT INTERACTING WITH 1400 TRANSIT USERS AND
- 2 NON-USERS THROUGH WORKSHOPS, FOCUS GROUPS, AND TARGETED
- 3 SURVEYS TO SOLICIT USER FARE AND STRUCTURE FARE CHANGE WE
- 4 FOCUSED ON TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF ON OUR STUDY THROUGH WORKING
- 5 GROUP MEETINGS TO FOCUSED GROUP DISCUSSIONS YOUR STAFF HAVE
- 6 BEEN CRITICAL TO HELPING THE PROJECT TEAM UNDERSTAND THE
- 7 UNIQUE CHALLENGES WITHIN AGENCIES AS WE REVIEW FARE POLICY IN
- 8 THE BUSINESS CASE. WE HAVE WORKED ON AN ONGOING BASIS WITH A
- 9 WIDE RANGE OF STAKEHOLDERS FROM THE PUBLIC AT-LARGE, TRANSIT
- 10 ADVOCATES REPRESENTATIVES FOR PEOPLE DISABILITIES, SENIOR,
- 11 YOUTH, BUSINESS COMMUNITY AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT JURISDICTIONS
- 12 JUST TO NAME A FEW. AGAIN THIS MAY BE FAMILIAR TO SOME OF YOU
- 13 AS THE PROJECT TEAM HAS DISCUSSED THE BUSINESS CASE STRUCTURE
- 14 WITH THE STAFF IN THE PAST BUT BUSINESS CASE LOOKS AT POSSIBLE
- 15 CHANGES IN FARE POLICY THROUGH A FOUR DIMENSIONAL FRAMEWORK.
- 16 STRATEGIC DIMENSION FOR CHANGES AND ADVANCE GOALS LIKE
- 17 INCREASED RIDERSHIP OR REDUCE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, BENEFIT-
- 18 COST DIMENSION OR FARE POLICY CHANGE PERFORMED ECONOMIC VALUE
- 19 PERSPECTIVE THINKING ABOUT FORECAST OF COST PER RIDER GIVEN
- 20 FARE POLICY CHANGE. DELIVERY AND OPERATION, MANAGEMENT
- 21 TECHNICAL PERSPECTIVE AND FINANCIAL DIMENSION, REQUIREMENT TO
- 22 DELIVER CHANGE. THIS STRUCTURE ALLOWS US TO BETTER UNDERSTAND
- 23 THE OVERALL BENEFITS OF A FARE POLICY CHANGE AND COMPARATIVE
- 24 BENEFITS OF INDIVIDUAL CHANGES BETWEEN THE FOUR TIERS OF
- 25 INTEGRATION DISCUSSED EARLIER. PROJECTS MODELING AND ANALYSIS



- 1 EXAMINE PERFORMANCE BY FOCUSING ON KEY LEVERS TO BE TESTED
- 2 FIRST FOCUSED CHANGES ON WHAT THE FARE STRUCTURE WOULD LOOK
- 3 LIKE AND WHETHER LOCAL OR REGIONAL FARE STRUCTURES WERE
- 4 MODIFIED, TRANSFERS PASSES ACCUMULATOR CAPS WOULD BE APPLIED
- 5 IN GIVEN SCENARIOS AND IMPACT OF USER EXPERIENCE. REVENUE
- 6 IMPACTS FOR SUBSIDY FOR EACH SCENARIO MODELED. EACH FARE
- 7 STRUCTURE CHANGE CAN EITHER DECREASE OR INCREASE REVENUE
- 8 GENERATED WE WANT TO DEVELOP A COMMON SET OF INVESTMENT THAT
- 9 WILL ALLOW COMPARISON POLICY CHANGES FORECASTED IN PACKS. WE
- 10 ANALYZED EACH OF THE FOUR TIERS AND FARE POLICY SCENARIOS
- 11 WITHIN THE TIERS AT BOTH INVESTMENT LEVEL REPRESENTING 1 TO 2
- 12 AND A HALF OF PRECOVID REVENUE OR ROUGHLY COST OF WHAT IT
- 13 WOULD TAKE FOR FREE COST TRANSFERS AND HIGH INVESTMENT LEVEL,
- 14 LOW-LEVEL INVESTMENT BETWEEN 5 AND 7 AND A HALF% OF PRECOVID
- 15 REVENUE THESE DIFFERENT LEVELS OF INVESTMENT ALLOWED US TO
- 16 TEST TO MINIMIZE INCREASES IN FARES FOR RIDERS TAKING CERTAIN
- 17 TRANSIT. MIKE WILL SPEAK MORE ABOUT HOW THIS WORKED FOR
- 18 INDIVIDUAL TIERS AND FARE POLICY CHANGES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 19 IN THIS SECTION MIKE AND I ARE GOING TO START TO DIVE INTO THE
- 20 STUDIES FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. SO OVERALL
- 21 THE KEY QUESTION MANY OF YOU AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS HAVE BEEN
- 22 ASKING THROUGHOUT THE PROJECT IS, ARE THERE FARE INTEGRATION
- 23 OPTIONS THAT OFFER A COST EFFECTIVE AND EQUITABLE WAY TO
- 24 PROMOTE TRANSIT AND BASIC ANALYSIS OF THE PROJECT TEAM WE
- 25 BELIEVE THE ANSWER IS YES ESPECIALLY WHEN COORDINATED WITH A



- 1 BROADER USER FOCUSED STRATEGY TO MAKE TRANSIT WORK BETTER FOR
- 2 ALL USERS. STUDIES WORK AND MODELS HIS FOUND THAT FARE
- 3 STRUCTURE CHANGES HAS THE POTENTIAL TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP
- 4 BETWEEN 2 AND 6% OF PREPANDEMIC LEVELS DEPENDING ON THE TIER
- 5 ADVANCED AND THE FUNDING LEVELS AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT
- 6 IMPLEMENTATION. SECOND, FURTHER TO THOSE POSSIBLE RIDERSHIP
- 7 GAINS FARE POLICY CHANGES CAN BE VERY COST EFFECTIVE RELATIVE
- 8 TO OTHER TRANSIT SYSTEM INVESTMENTS WITH THE INVESTMENT COST
- 9 FOR EACH NEW TRIP IN THE BALLPARK OF 2 TO \$3 PER NEW TRIP.
- 10 THIRD ANALYSIS SUGGESTS THAT FARE INTEGRATION CAN HELP THE BAY
- 11 AREA REALIZE MEANINGFUL REDUCTION IN VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED
- 12 WITH CORRESPONDING BENEFITS TO GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, AIR
- 13 POLLUTION AND TRAVEL TIME. AND FOURTH, THE RECOMMENDATIONS
- 14 WE'RE PUTTING FORWARD ARE ALSO COMPATIBLE WITH THE BAY AREA'S
- 15 EOUITY GOALS AND VALUES AND OUR ANALYSIS SHOWS THE
- 16 RECOMMENDATIONS WOULD PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT AND PROPORTIONATE
- 17 BENEFITS TO EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND FINALLY I DO NEED
- 18 TO NOTE THAT THERE IS AN INHERENT LEVEL OF UNCERTAINTY IN OUR
- 19 MODELING WORK AS IMPACTS OF THE PANDEMIC TO INDIVIDUALS AND
- 20 THE ECONOMY MAKE IT IMPOSSIBLE TO FULLY FORESEE HOW A POLICY
- 21 CHANGE WOULD MANIFEST IN A FUTURE WHERE COVID-19 HAS BEEN
- 22 MANAGED AND IMPACTS HAVE BEEN REDUCED. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE I
- 23 TURN IT OVER TO MIKE TO ADDRESS THE DETAILED INVESTIGATIONS WE
- 24 WOULD LIKE TO ADDRESS QUESTIONS MANY STAKEHOLDERS HAVE HAD FOR
- 25 THE PROJECT TEAM AND THAT IS WHAT REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION



- 1 RIDERSHIP THROUGH LEARN ABILITY OR LEGIBILITY OF THE SYSTEM
- 2 UNFORTUNATELY DESPITE A SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT IN PROJECT
- 3 OURSELVES USER RESEARCH AND WORKING DIRECTLY WITH TRANSIT
- 4 USERS FINDINGS ARE INCONCLUSIVE. CONSISTENT WITH TIER FOUR
- 5 COULD IMPROVE FLEXIBILITY FARES FOR SOME TYPES OF USERS BY
- 6 CURRENT OR NON-USERS RESEARCH INDICATED MANY EXISTING TRANSIT
- 7 USERS WOULD BE SKEPTICAL OF CHANGES TO FARE STRUCTURE
- 8 ESPECIALLY FOR LOCAL SERVICE. AS NOTED ON THE LAST SLIDE THE
- 9 IMPACTS OF THE PANDEMIC AND THE LIMITATIONS IT PLACED ON THE
- 10 TYPE OF USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES WE COULD UNDERTAKE MAY HAVE
- 11 COLLUDED SOME OF THE OPINIONS WE HEARD FROM USERS IN OUR
- 12 RESEARCH. AS I ALLUDED TO ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE, THE BENEFITS
- 13 OF REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION OF FARE POLICY LIKE THOSE
- 14 CONDITION WITH TIER THREE OUR FOUR MAY BE STRONGER IF
- 15 CONNECTED WITH OTHER CHANGES SUCH AS MAPPING WAYFINDING OR
- 16 BRANDING CONCEPTS DISCUSSED AT THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
- 17 RECOVERY TASK FORCE. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO MIKE NOW TO
- 18 WALK US THROUGH THE DETAILED RECOMMENDATIONS.
- 20 MICHAEL EISEMAN: THANK YOU, BILL. MIKE EISEMAN HERE WITH BART.
- 21 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO HERE, I'LL START WITH AN OVERVIEW OF
- 22 PROJECT TEAM RECOMMENDATIONS THEN WALK THROUGH EACH IN A BIT
- 23 MORE DETAIL. THE STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS INCLUDE FARE
- 24 INTEGRATION STEPS OVER PHASES OF IMPLEMENTATION SHOWN HERE. IN
- 25 CALENDAR YEAR 2022 WE RECOMMEND PILOTING AND ALL AGENCY



1	INSTITUTIONAL EMPLOYER TRANSIT PASS NEXT PHASE BEGINS IN FALL
2	OF 2023 WITH CLIPPER TWO THAT'S WHEN WE RECOMMEND ADDING FREE
3	OR REDUCED COST INTER-AGENCY TRANSFERS REGION WIDE. ALSO
4	SECOND PHASE WE RECOMMEND CONTINUING TO EXPLORE OPTIONS FOR
5	INDIVIDUAL REGIONAL PASS PRODUCTIONS AND OR CLIPPER START FARE
6	CAPPING. I'LL PRESENT THE PASS OPTION OUR TEAM THINKS IS MOST
7	PROMISING AT THIS TIME BUT WE THINK THE REGION SHOULD LOOK AT
8	THE FINDINGS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL PILOT BEFORE COMMITTING TO A
9	SPECIFIC PATH. FINALLY IN GREEN ON THE RIGHT IS OUR LONG-TERM
10	RECOMMENDATION WE RECOMMEND CONTINUING TO INVESTIGATE THE COST
11	AND BENEFITS OF A SHARED FARE STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES,
12	RAIL FERRY EXPRESS BUS WE CONTINUE TO DEVELOP THIS OPTION AS
13	PART OF A BROADER PLAN AND COWER FUNDING STRATEGIES. STARTING
14	WITH OUR CORE STRUCTURAL CHANGE WE RECOMMEND FREE AND REDUCED
15	COST IN INTER-AGENCY TRANSFERS UNDER THIS POLICY CUSTOMERS
16	LIKING LOCAL TO LOCAL OR LOCAL TO REGIONAL CONNECTIONS, PAY
17	JUST ONE FARE COMPARED TO THE MOST EXPENSIVE SEGMENT. REGIONAL
18	CONNECTIONS BART TO CALTRAIN WOULD RECEIVE A FIXED DISCOUNT
19	EQUAL TO THE PRICE OF A LOCAL BUS FARE OR MINIMUM BART FARE.
20	WE'RE AIMING TO REMOVE THE BARRIER BETWEEN AGENCIES AND MAKE
21	THE TRANSIT TRIPS MORE PRICE COMPETITIVE THIS ALLOWS INTER-
22	AGENCY CONNECTION TO WORK LIKE SINGLE AGENCY CONNECTIONS AND
23	ALLOW OUR REGIONAL SERVICES TO BETTER FUNCTION AS COMPONENTS
24	OF THEIR LOCAL NETWORKS. IN OUR REMODELLING THIS DRIVES A TWO%
25	INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP REVENUE IMPACT 22.5 MILLION PER YEAR,



- 1 AND COST GENERATED \$2.25 WHICH IS THE BEST COST EFFICIENCY OF
- 2 ALL OPTIONS TESTED. INCOME LEVELS WITH HIGH MIDDLE AND LOW-
- 3 INCOME TRANSIT RIDERS BENEFIT ROUGHLY PROPORTIONAL OPTION IS
- 4 DELIVERABLE IN THE CLIPPER SYSTEM. WE BELIEVE SINGLE STRUCTURE
- 5 MOU BETWEEN PARTICIPATING EXISTING TRANSFER AGREEMENT COULD
- 6 ALLOW US -- [INDISCERNIBLE] COULD BEGIN IN CALENDAR YEAR 2022
- 7 LIKE EXISTING SING AGENCY INSTITUTIONAL PRODUCTS LIKE CALTRANS
- 8 GO PASS AND AC TRANSIT PASS THIS WOULD BE AN ALL YOU CAN RIDE
- 9 SO LOW INSTITUTION PASS WE MODELING IN THE PUGET SOUND
- 10 BUSINESS PASSPORT PROGRAM. WE EXPECT PRICING WOULD BE BASED ON
- 11 EMPLOYER'S LOCATION SO COST WOULD BE COMMENSURATE WITH
- 12 OUANTITY AND OUALITY OF SERVICES OFFERED. EVALUATING BARRIER
- 13 FREE ALL AGENCY PASS AND ENGAGE BAY AREA BUSINESSES IN
- 14 COMMUNITY TRANSIT RECOVERY PROGRAM. SUBSIDY PARITY WITH A
- 15 BROADER FARE SYSTEM HOWEVER WE BELIEVE SUBSIDY WILL BE NEEDED
- 16 TO BACKSTOP POTENTIAL REVENUE IN [INDISCERNIBLE] PILOT. THIS
- 17 IS POSSIBLE FOR THE PRODUCT TO BENEFIT OFFICE WORKERS AND WE
- 18 NEED TO BE SHUT TO INCLUDE POLICY IN OUR PRODUCT. USING THE
- 19 EVENTS PASS, WE SHOULD NOTE THAT THIS EXISTING PRODUCT IS AN
- 20 ALL AGENCY PRODUCT. SO THE MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PROPOSAL ALL
- 21 AGENCIES ON CLIPPER WOULD NEED TO AGREE TO PARTICIPATE. NEXT
- 22 SLIDE PLEASE. NEXT, WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT THE REGION
- 23 CONTINUE TO EVALUATE A MULTI-AGENCY INDIVIDUAL PASS AND CAP
- 24 BOTH INDIVIDUAL PASS AND CAP PRODUCTS WITH POTENTIAL
- 25 DEPLOYMENT IN CLIPPER TWO. GENERALLY THE AIM OF ANY PASS OR



- 1 CAP IS TO INCLUDE AFFORDABILITY AND PREDICTABILITY FOR HIGHER
- 2 VOLUME RIDERS MULTI-AGENCY PASS CAP WOULD REDUCE FRICTION FOR
- 3 MULTIAGENCY RIDERS AS WELL. OUTSIDE OUR INSTITUTIONAL PASSES
- 4 BROAD APPLICATION OF PASSES DID NOT BENEFIT-COST EFFICIENT
- 5 STRATEGIES. WE'RE WE PROVIDE A STAGING IN THIS PRODUCT THE
- 6 USER CAN SELECT A MONTHLY PASS BASED ON TYPICAL TRIP COST
- 7 MULTIPLIED BY A STANDARD FACTOR. FOR EXAMPLE, THE RIDER'S
- 8 TYPICAL FARE IS \$3 PRICE OF A MONTHLY PASS THREE TIMES 36
- 9 TRIPS \$3 TIMES 36 TRIPS ALL TRIPS WOULD BE RECOVERED AND A \$4
- 10 TRIP WOULD REOUIRE ANOTHER ONE THERE IN CASH. WE REFER TO THIS
- 11 AS THE PUGET PASS MODEL USED TODAY IN THE PUGET SOUND REGION
- 12 AS WELL AS ON METRORAIL. ENSURING ADDITIONAL SUBSIDIES WE
- 13 PROVIDE IS NOT OVERRATED TO RIDER WHO IS MAKE MOST EXPENSIVE
- 14 TRIPS MEANING RAIL AND FERRY RIDERS ALSO BENEFITS HIGH VOLUME
- 15 BUS RIDERS AND PARTICULAR THOSE WHO MAKE AT LEAST SOME
- 16 REGIONAL TRIPS OFFERING A 1.5% REVENUE INCREASE AND \$34
- 17 MILLION PER YEAR, \$4.35 PER TRIP PRODUCT THAT REQUIRES UP
- 18 FRONT PAYMENT AND POTENTIAL EXCLUSION OF LOW-INCOME RIDERS
- 19 BENEFITS AS MITIGATION WOULD RECOMMEND CONSIDERATION OF --
- 20 [INDISCERNIBLE] WOULD REQUIRE MULTI-AGENCY REVENUE SHARING
- 21 STRUCTURE WE BELIEVE THIS IS THE INDIVIDUAL PASS OR CAP
- 22 OFFERING THAT LOOKS MOST PROMISING AT THIS TIME WE RECOMMEND
- 23 INTERNAL CONSIDERATION AND FINDINGS BASED ON THE INSTITUTIONAL
- 24 PASS PILOT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OUR LAST RECOMMENDATION IS TO
- 25 CONTINUE EVALUATING COSTS AND BENEFITS FOR MOVING TO TIER



- 1 THREE FARE INTEGRATION IN 2024 OR LATER. WE THINK THAT LEARN
- 2 ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY OF OUR SYSTEM WOULD BENEFIT FROM A
- 3 SHARED DISTANCE OR ZONE BASED FARE STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL
- 4 SERVICES MEANING RAIL FERRY AND EXPRESS BUS PARTICULARLY
- 5 COMBINED WITH A BROADER FOCAL STRATEGY OUR ANALYSIS SUPPORTS
- 6 SHARE FARE STRUCTURE WITH CONTINUING EVALUATION OF RIDER
- 7 PATTERNS. OUR BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS INCLUDES TWO SCENARIOS
- 8 FOR THIS OPTION HIGH INVESTMENT OPTION IS MODELED BY EXTENDING
- 9 THE FARE REGIONALLY WITH 4.7% INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP AND
- 10 REVENUE REDUCTIONS OF \$79 PER YEAR COST EFFICIENCY A BIT LESS
- 11 THAN TRANSFER DISCOUNT ALONE ALSO WE HAVE A LOWER INVESTMENT
- 12 OPTION SLIGHTLY MORE EXPENSIVE FARE REVENUE REDUCTION AND
- 13 TRANSFER DISCOUNTS. MULTI-PARTY AGREEMENTS NETWORK MANAGEMENT
- 14 MODELS AND GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES TO IMPLEMENT STABLE FARE
- 15 STRUCTURE. UPDATING MAJOR CHANGE MANAGEMENT EFFORT WOULD BE
- 16 NEEDED TO IMPLEMENT THIS CHANGE. IT IS REASONABLE TO THINK
- 17 THAT THE SHIFT COULD BE EXECUTED IN STRATEGIES FOR EXAMPLE,
- 18 REGIONAL RAIL FARE STANDARDIZES BEFORE CONSIDERING INTEGRATION
- 19 OF FERRY OR EXPRESS BUS. NEXT SLIDE. WE DO NOT HAVE A
- 20 RECOMMENDATION AT THIS TIME FOR TIER FOUR INTEGRATION OPTION
- 21 IN ANALYSIS HAD HIGHER INVESTMENT ANALYSIS AND LOWER COST
- 22 EFFICIENCY. AND DELIVERABILITY REQUIREMENTS WITH RECOMMENDED
- 23 STRATEGIES WITH NEW AGREEMENTS WITH GOVERNING STRUCTURES
- 24 NEEDED SPANNING ALL AGENCIES AS WELL AS CHANGE IN MANAGEMENT
- 25 REQUIRED FOR A BROADER RANGE OF CUSTOMERS. NEXT SLIDE. TWO



- 1 TABLES ON THE NEXT TWO SLIDES THAT SUMMARIZE FOR YOUR
- 2 REFERENCE THE BUSINESS CASE FINDINGS FOR THE FULL SET OF
- 3 POLICIES THAT WE CONSIDERED. AS BILL SAID THESE ARE PROVIDED
- 4 IN DETAIL IN THE APPENDIX. NEXT SLIDE. TO ORIENT YOU TO THE
- 5 TABLE WE HAVE ROWS SUMMARIZED IN EACH OF 16 SCENARIOS COLUMNS
- 6 PROVIDE MODEL PERCENTAGE CHANGE IN RIDERSHIP, REVENUE IMPACT
- 7 OR SUBSIDY REQUIRED AND COST PER RIDER. BOTTOM TWO ROWS
- 8 COLORED IN GRAY SHOW THE IMPACT [INDISCERNIBLE] WITHOUT FARE
- 9 INTEGRATION. TAKE AWAY HERE IS IN OUR MODELING TIER TWO
- 10 INTEGRATION TRANSFER DISCOUNTS AND TIER THREE INTEGRATION
- 11 STANDARDIZING REGIONAL SERVICES ONLY OFFER BETTER COST
- 12 EFFICIENCY THAN -- [INDISCERNIBLE] NEXT SLIDE. ON THE NEXT
- 13 PAGE YOU WITH SEE THE SAME OPTIONS WITH SUMMARY RATINGS EQUITY
- 14 ECONOMIC BENEFIT AND DELIVERABILITY. WE RATE TRANSFER
- 15 DISCOUNTS BECAUSE POSITIVE GENERALLY BALANCED BENEFITS ACROSS
- 16 GROUPS WOULD ENSURE THAT NO ONE WOULD SEE A FARE INCREASE ALL
- 17 OPTIONS ARE RATED ON MIXED EQUITY BECAUSE WE SEE BENEFITS
- 18 AMONG GROUPS BUT STANDARDIZED FARES WOULD HAVE A MIX OF
- 19 INCREASES AND DECREASES FOR EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES.
- 20 SOCIO-ECONOMIC BENEFITS REPORTED HERE AT FIVE YEAR VALUE
- 21 REDUCTIONS AND TRAVEL SAVINGS ASSOCIATED WITH INCREASED
- 22 RIDERSHIP WE NOTE THE HIGHER INVESTMENT VERSION IN OUR
- 23 RECOMMENDED TIER THREE OPTION MODELED AS FARE BY DISTANCE FOR
- 24 REGIONAL SERVICES SCORES HIGHEST ON SOCIO-ECONOMIC EVALUATION.
- 25 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NOW WE'LL FINISH UP WITH NEAR-TERM ACTION



- 1 THAT IS OUR TEAM RECOMMENDS. NEXT SLIDE. A FEW MORE WORDS
- 2 ABOUT THE PILOT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH MTC STAFF AND
- 3 AGENCIES PENDING INPUT FROM STAKEHOLDERS AND BUSINESS GROUPS
- 4 AS WE LOOK TO PUT IN PLACE MECHANICS FOR A POTENTIAL PILOT.
- 5 INCLUDING BARRIER FREE ALL AGENCY PASS ACCESSORY PASS TRAVEL
- 6 BAY AREA COLLECTING DATA TO BE USED FOR BUSINESS CASE MODEL
- 7 AND PERMIT PROGRAM. AND TITLE SIX. WE PROPOSE TWO PHASES PHASE
- 8 ONE WE HOPE CAN BEGIN IN EARLY 2022 FOCUSING ON COLLEGES AND
- 9 UNIVERSITIES. LOOKING TO LEVERAGE EXISTING TRANSIT AGENCY
- 10 INSTITUTIONAL PASS RELATIONSHIPS. WE WOULD ALSO PROPOSE A
- 11 SMALL SCALE DEMONSTRATION PROJECT WITH RESIDENTS AND HOUSING
- 12 [INDISCERNIBLE] WE PROPOSE INCLUDING PRIVATE EMPLOYERS AND A
- 13 BROADER GROUP OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING [INDISCERNIBLE] WE WOULD
- 14 HOPE TO PARTNER WITH BUSINESS ORGANIZATIONS AND PROPERTY
- 15 MANAGERS TO EXPAND BEYOND CURRENT INSTITUTIONAL PASS
- 16 CUSTOMERS. WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE SOME CHALLENGES TO
- 17 DELIVERING A PILOT LIKE THIS FIRST THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS ARE
- 18 VERY ADMINISTRATIVE AND COMPLEX AND TIME INTENSIVE FROM A
- 19 STAFF PERSPECTIVE. AND NEXT I WANT TO EMPHASIZE ONCE AGAIN IF
- 20 WE'RE GOING USE THE AVAILABLE CLIPPER PASS PRODUCT ALL
- 21 AGENCIES WOULD NEED TO CONSENT. GOAL IS TO ESTABLISH PRICE
- 22 STRUCTURES WITH NO ADD SUBSIDY WE BELIEVE FUNDING WILL BE
- 23 REQUIRED FOR THE PILOT TO PAY FOR ADMINISTRATION AND TO
- 24 BACKSTOP REVENUE IMPACTS. WE THINK THIS MAY BE A GOOD
- 25 CANDIDATE FOR THE USE OF REGIONAL RECOVERY FUNDS AS SET-ASIDE



FOR THE BRTF ACTIONS. I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO BILL FOR FINAL 1 2 SLIDE AND NEXT STEPS. 3 WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FINALLY, HERE FOR 4 5 OUR LAST SLIDE I WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS A FEW NEXT STEPS FOR THE TASK FORCE. WE'RE HERE TODAY ON SEPTEMBER 20TH PRESENTING 6 THE TASK FORCE WITH THE 50 LOOK OF THE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS. 7 8 NEXT OVER THE COMING WEEKS THE PROJECT TEAM WILL BE MAKING PRESENTATIONS TO A NUMBER OF TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEETING IN 9 RESPONSE TO REQUESTS FROM TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF. DEPENDING ON 10 THE FEEDBACK OF THE TASK FORCE TODAY, TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS 11 AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS OVER THE COMING MONTH TASK FORCE MAY 12 WANT TO CONSIDER SOME TYPE OF ACTION RELATED TO THE DRAFT 13 RECOMMENDATION BY YOUR NEXT MEETING OCTOBER 18TH AND 14 15 ESPECIALLY IN CONSIDERATION OF THE POSSIBLE PILOT. ON OCTOBER 16 27TH AND 28TH THE MTC COMMISSION WILL BE MEETING IN A WORKSHOP FOLKS WHERE THEY'LL HEAR PRESENTATIONS FROM THE STUDY TEAM 17 ALONG WITH THE UPDATES ON THE PRIORITIES IDENTIFIED IN THE 18 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE'S TRANSFORMATION 19 ACTION PLAN. AND PRIORITIZATION OF USE OF THE AMERICAN RESCUE 20 21 PLAN FUNDS THAT HAVE BEEN SET-ASIDE TO SUPPORT THE 22 IMPLEMENTATION OF TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN ITEMS OF WHICH

FARE INTEGRATION IS ONE OF THEM. I WANT TO TAKE A MOMENT TO

TO UNDER TAKE THIS STUDY ESPECIALLY OUR CONSULTING TEAM AT

THANK SOME OF THE PEOPLE WHO WORKED SO HARD OVER THE LAST YEAR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

23

24



- 1 STEER PATRICK MILLER AND KEITH BRIDGES, CHRISTY
- 2 [INDISCERNIBLE] OF BART AND CHRISTY WAGNER SAMTRANS AND LISA
- 3 ZORN. WE HAVE HIGHLIGHTED ON THE RIGHT HAND SLIDE UNDER KEY
- 4 ACTIONS TO CONSIDER A VARIETY OF TOPICS MAYBE TO PROMPT SOME
- 5 DISCUSSION OR FEEDBACK FROM THE TASK FORCE TODAY, AGAIN, THERE
- 6 IS NO ACTION ITEM ON THE AGENDA. THIS IS JUST AN INFORMATION
- 7 ITEM FOR DISCUSSION. SO, THANK YOU AGAIN. AND I'LL CONCLUDE
- 8 THE PRESENTATION.

9

- 10 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. AND I WOULD ADD BILL BACON
- 11 AND MICHAEL EISEMAN. CLEARLY COMPLEX AND A LOT OF THOUGHT
- 12 HEADS GONE -- THOUGHT HAS GONE INTO THIS. THIS IS NOT AN
- 13 ACTION ITEM IT'S FOR INFORMATION I WANT TO TURN TO THE TASK
- 14 FORCE FOR QUESTIONS COMMENTS RECOMMENDATIONS THOUGHTS I DON'T
- 15 SEE ANY HANDS RAISED BUT IT LOOKS LIKE OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
- 16 MCMILLAN FOLLOWED BY MR. TUMLIN.

- 18 THERESE MCMILLAN: GREAT THANK YOU SO MUCH CHAIR HURSH. I AM
- 19 INCREDIBLY IMPRESSED WITH THE OUALITY OF THE WORK AND
- 20 PARTICULARLY THE PARTNERS PROJECT MANAGEMENT FOR THIS EFFORT,
- 21 WHICH, I THINK, IS A MODEL TO THINK FORWARD, AS WE GO THROUGH
- 22 THE LARGER BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS AND THE
- 23 LIKE, AND JUST APPRECIATE THE TEAM APPROACH. I THINK FOR ANY
- 24 OF US IN THE BAY AREA, THIS WAS A BIG STEP FOR US. WE HAVE
- 25 BEEN TALKING ABOUT MAJOR INTEGRATION EFFORTS ON A NUMBER OF



- 1 PLANES FOR A LONG TIME. AND I THINK, NOW, WITH THESE
- 2 RECOMMENDATIONS, OF COURSE WE'RE NOT TAKING ACTION YET, I
- 3 THINK THE IMPORTANT THING TO RECOGNIZE FROM MY PERSPECTIVE IS
- 4 THAT, BEYOND, SORT OF, A CONCEPTUAL COMMITMENT TO BETTER
- 5 INTEGRATION PARTICULARLY IN THIS FARE SPACE, IT'S REALLY ABOUT
- 6 MOVING TO A DEMONSTRATED COMMITMENT FOR REALLY PURSUING FARE
- 7 INTEGRATION IMPROVEMENTS TO THE BENEFIT OF OUR CUSTOMERS. AND
- 8 I THINK THE OUTLINE OF WHAT WE CAN DO WOULD REALLY GET US INTO
- 9 THAT PLACE. I'M JUST ENCOURAGING THAT. I BELIEVE THE FIRST TWO
- 10 POINTS IN THE GRAY BOX, ONE THING CROSSES MY MIND,
- 11 PARTICULARLY FOR THE PILOT, LIKE THE PILOT IDEA, AND I THINK
- 12 IT'S -- IF I'M UNDERSTANDING IT CORRECTLY AND, MIKE AND BILL,
- 13 YOU CAN POINT IT OUT, ONE, IN TERMS OF TIMING, THE FARE
- 14 TRANSFER TIMING HAS TO BE ALIGNED WITH CLIPPER II SO THAT'S
- 15 ONE OF THE REASONS WHY IT'S PUSHED OUT SO THE RECOMMENDATIONS
- 16 FOR THE PILOT UP UNTIL THAT TIME, THIS IS SOMETHING WE COULD
- 17 DO RIGHT NOW. IS THAT A FAIR ASSESSMENT? OKAY. JUST WANTED TO
- 18 MAKE SURE THAT WAS THE CASE. ONE THOUGHT, AND I COMPLETELY
- 19 APPRECIATE IN PARTICULARLY FOR A PILOT WANTING TO BUILD, ON
- 20 THE EQUITY SPACE IF WE WERE TO INCLUDE COMMUNITY COLLEGES AND
- 21 THE POPULATION ATTACHED THERE, I THINK YOU BROUGHT IN THE
- 22 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY SIGNIFICANTLY. AND WOULD URGE THAT
- 23 WE TRY TO INCORPORATE THAT. EVEN IF IT'S ONE COMMUNITY COLLEGE
- 24 DISTRICT WITHIN THE LARGER BAY AREA AS AN EXAMPLE. THAT WOULD
- 25 BE REALLY IMPORTANT. SOMETHING A LITTLE AMBITIOUS JUST A



- 1 THOUGHT. TO THE DISAGREE THAT STUDENTS THAT MIGHT BE AN
- 2 EXTENSION TO THE PASS FOR THEIR FAMILIES AND NOT JUST TO THE
- 3 STUDENT, PARTICULARLY FOR LOW-INCOME RELATED STUDENTS AND
- 4 THEIR FAMILIES, THAT MIGHT BE, AGAIN, ANOTHER WAY TO THINK
- 5 ABOUT BROADENING THE EQUITY BAND. SECOND POINT, GOING
- 6 FORWARD, I WOULD IMAGINE THAT AS THIS STUDY IS DONE, THE FARE
- 7 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ITSELF, ALL OF US ON THIS SCREEN, WOULD
- 8 ESSENTIALLY DISBAND, BUT I THINK THERE IS TWO IMPORTANT TRACKS
- 9 FOR CONTINUING IT. OR, CONTINUING THE MONITORING. ONE WOULD BE
- 10 A TECHNICAL EITHER ESTABLISHING OR CONTINUING IF THERE IS ONE
- 11 ALREADY, A REAL TECHNICAL ADVISORY GROUP FOR THE
- 12 IMPLEMENTATION PHASES. I THINK THAT GOES WITHOUT SAYING WANT
- 13 BUT I THINK THIS'S AN IMPORTANT POINT. WE'RE THE POLICY, BUT
- 14 ONCE WE HAVE LAUNCHED THE POLICY, WE WILL NEED A GROUP TO KEEP
- 15 ADVISING ON THE IMPLEMENTATION. AND I WOULD ALSO NOTE THAT
- 16 THIS IS A HUGE OPPORTUNITY TO CROSSWALK INTO THE NETWORK
- 17 MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE THAT WE WILL BE PURSUING UNDER THE
- 18 AUSPICES OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, WHICH IS LOOKING AT
- 19 GOVERNANCE MODELS. BUT NOW WE HAVE A CRITICAL PROJECT WHERE
- 20 GOVERNANCE ISN'T THE ONLY CONSIDERATION, BUT IT'S ONE OF THE
- 21 CONSIDERATIONS, AS YOU TRACKED, ON THE DIFFERENT TIERS, HOW
- 22 THE GOVERNANCE DEMANDS, IF YOU WILL, OR CHANGES, WILL SHIFT, I
- 23 IMAGINE THERE WOULD BE A WAY TO CONTINUE THAT PIECE OF THE
- 24 DISCUSSION LINKED TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE



THAT'S GOING TO BE ADVANCING SEPARATELY. SO, THANK YOU, MIKE, 1 FOR ALLOWING ME TO PUT THOSE OUT THERE. 2 3 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANKS THERESE. JULIE, SORRY FOR CALLING 4 5 YOU JEFF. AND THEN WE'LL HEAR FROM BOB POWERS. 6 SPEAKER: I AM REALLY GLAD I GOT TO COVER THIS MEETING TODAY IT 7 8 WAS A POWERFUL PRESENTATION. IT'S QUANTITATIVE BUT EASY TO UNDERSTAND AND I THINK IT WILL BE EASY FOR DIFFERENCE BOARDS 9 TO UNDERSTAND BECAUSE IT SPEAKS TO RIDERSHIP AND FINANCE WHICH 10 IS WHAT ALL OF OUR BOARDS ARE STRUGGLING WITH. I, LIKE 11 THERESE, AM VERY EXCITED ABOUT THE IDEA OF A PILOT. I THINK A 12 COMMUNITY COLLEGE WOULD BE REALLY COMPELLING, AND I THINK, 13 PERHAPS, A MOTIVATED REGIONAL BUSINESS PARTNER, I THINK COULD 14 ALSO BE REALLY COMPELLING FOR THE FIRST PHASE. I THINK THAT 15 16 THE BUSINESS ISSUES ARE ACTUALLY REALLY OUITE DIFFERENT THAN THE STUDENT ISSUES, THE TRAVEL TIMES ARE DIFFERENT. THE IMPACT 17 ON THE PEAK IS DIFFERENT. I THINK YOU MIGHT NEED AT LEAST ONE 18 BUSINESS PARTNER BEFORE YOU LOOK AT EXPANDING THIS MORE 19

24 MORE SERVICE THAN A BUSINESS THAT'S IN THE REVERSE COMMUTE. SO

AND I THINK THE COST NEUTRAL IS A GOOD ONE, HOW DID YOU TACKLE

WHERE WE MAY HAVE TO ADD SERVICE, FOR EXAMPLE, IF A BUSINESS

IS BASED IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO COULD POTENTIALLY REQUIRE

I ALSO WANT TO ASK, YOU HAVE LOOKED AT THE PRICING,

20

21

22



1	COULD YOU TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT HOW YOU ANTICIPATE DOING
2	THAT CALCULATION TO GET TO THE POINT ZERO-COST PER PASSENGER?
3	
4	MICHAEL EISEMAN: THE ANALYSIS THAT WE HAVE DONE SO FAR DOES
5	NOT CONSIDER SERVICE CAPACITY. SO PART OF THE REASON THAT THIS
6	FEELS TIMELY IS BECAUSE A LOT OF US HAVE SOME SPARE THE AIR
7	CAPACITY, AND CERTAINLY THAT REALLY SHOULD YOU KNOW, FROM
8	THE BART PERSPECTIVE, THINKING ABOUT THE TRANSBAY CORRIDOR
9	THAT DOES CHANGE [INDISCERNIBLE] THE SUCCESS WITH CAP AND
10	GO PASS HAS BEEN LARGELY SUCCESSFUL FOR CALTRAIN AND AS BEFORE
11	THE PANDEMIC THEY WERE STARTING TO RUN INTO CAPACITY
12	CONSTRAINTS AND THEREFORE STARTING TO RETHINK THE PRICING
13	MODEL FOR THEIR PASS, RIGHT? SO THOSE, WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
14	THAT THOSE ARE IMPORTANT QUESTION, NOT FULLY CONSIDERED YET,
15	ALTHOUGH DURING THE PILOT PHASE, WE IMAGINE CONTINUING TO HAVE
16	SPARE THE AIR CAPACITY FOR SOMETIME. JULIE: I WOULD ENCOURAGE
17	TO YOU MAYBE LEAVE IT AS A POSSIBILITY FOR THE FUTURE
18	ADMINISTRATION OF THESE PASSES, SO THAT, YOU KNOW, IF AND WHEN
19	WE GET BACK TO OUR PRIME WE'RE NOT BUREAUCRATICALLY PROHIBITED
20	FROM TRYING TO RECOVER THOSE TYPE OF COSTS. I DON'T THINK IT'S
21	A PILOT ISSUE. I AGREE.
22	
23	MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: VERY GOOD POINT, JULIE. WE'LL HEAR FROM

24

25

BOB POWERS, AND THEN ADINA.



- 1 ROBERT POWERS: CHAIRPERSON HURSH, THANKS FOR RECOGNIZING ME.
- 2 JUST ONE COMMENT, I THINK, A LITTLE BIT ALIGNS WITH MS.
- 3 MCMILLAN OVER AT MTC, AND SOME OF IT ALIGNS WITH HURSH, I
- 4 DON'T THINK THAT WE'RE BOLD ENOUGH ON THE PILOT, AND EISEMAN,
- 5 YOU AND I CHATTED YOU BRIEFED ME, AND I'M NOT SAYING ANYTHING
- 6 TO YOU THAT I HAVEN'T BEFORE, I THINK WE SHOULD BE A LITTLE
- 7 BIT MORE BOLD ON THE PILOT AND LOOKING AT JUST UNIVERSITIES
- 8 AND COLLEGES, WHETHER IT'S, YOU KNOW, WHAT MCMILLAN SAID, OR
- 9 EXPANDING IT TO KAISER OR SALESFORCE, OR BIG EMPLOYER IN THE
- 10 AREA, YOU KNOW, WHERE -- YOU KNOW, THERE IS DEVELOPMENT AROUND
- 11 A TRANSIT HUB OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. I WOULD CHALLENGE YOU
- 12 AND MR. BACON, MIKE, YOU KNOW, TO THINK THAT THROUGH WITH YOUR
- 13 TEAM. I THINK THAT'S THE WHOLE CONCEPT OF A PILOT. YOU KNOW?
- 14 NOBODY IS GOING TO CUT AND YOU BACON OFF AT THE KNEES ON THIS.
- 15 THIS IS A PILOT. YOU HAVE GOTTEN BUY-IN FROM THE BRTF, YOU
- 16 KNOW, AND WE KIND OF WALKED -- WE, THE OPERATORS AND THE FOLKS
- 17 ON THE BR, I WOULD EXPECT FOLKS TO BE A LITTLE BOLD OR THIS
- 18 PILOT AND THINK THAT THROUGH A LITTLE BIT. ANYWAY. IT'S MORE
- 19 THAN A COMMENT THAN IT IS A DISCUSSION HERE, BUT FOR YOU AND
- 20 MR. BACON TO THINK THROUGH A LITTLE BIT.
- 22 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANKS BOB. ADINA LEVIN, FOLLOWED BY
- 23 DENIS MULLIGAN.

24



- 1 ADINA LEVIN: HI THERE. I WANTED TO ADD SOME COLOR, THAT TEAM
- 2 UP AND ADVISORY GROUP AS WELL AS OTHERS DOING OUTREACH
- 3 RELATING TO THIS STUDY. ONE IS, GLAD TO SEE -- AT LEAST
- 4 INCORPORATING THE FEEDBACK FROM THE ADVISORY GROUP THAT
- 5 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS MENTIONED IN AN EARLIER PHASE OF THE
- 6 PILOT, YOU KNOW, WITH ADVOCACY AND OUTREACH HAT ON, AS SOON AS
- 7 THE INITIAL RECOMMENDATION ABOUT THE GO ANYWHERE TRANSIT PASS
- 8 CAM OUT. I WOULD DISCLOSE I REACHED OUT TO A FEW HOUSING
- 9 ORGANIZATIONS AND SAID HEY THIS SEEMS LIKE SOMETHING YOU'RE
- 10 RESIDENTS WOULD BE INTERESTED IN AND I GOT RESPONSES IS
- 11 BASICALLY IMMEDIATELY WITH A LOT OF ENTHUSIASM. BECAUSE IN
- 12 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, A COMMON EXAMPLE IS, FIRST COMMUNITY
- 13 HOUSING GIVES OUT VTA PASSES AND THE RESIDENTS DON'T HAVE
- 14 ACCESS TO, FOR EXAMPLE, BART AND CALTRAIN, SO THERE WAS JUST
- 15 IMMEDIATELY VISIBILITY AS SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE BENEFICIAL
- 16 TO REPORTS IN TERMS OF MOBILITY AND OPPORTUNITY. LOVE THE IDEA
- 17 OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGES ADDING THAT, AS WELL. IN TERMS OF,
- 18 ALSO IN TERMS OF THE PILOT AND THE EQUITY ISSUE,
- 19 TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATIONS HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO
- 20 ADDRESS SOME OF THE CRITIQUE THAT PASSES HAVE HISTORICALLY
- 21 GONE TO FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES AS MAJOR CORPORATIONS, AND THERE
- 22 ARE A NUMBER OF TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATIONS AROUND
- 23 THE REGION THAT SEEK TO PROVIDE BENEFITS TO A GREATER
- 24 DIVERSITY OF WORKERS. AND THAT WOULD BE A GOOD THING TO
- 25 INCLUDE SOMEWHERE IN THE ROLE-OUT. ANOTHER POINT RELATING TO



EOUITY IS, I CERTAINLY UNDERSTAND THE ORIENTATION TO BEING --1 TO MODELING THE PRICING LEVELS IN A WAY THAT WILL FINANCIALLY 2 3 PROTECT THE AGENCIES BUT ALSO THE CONCLUSION, WILL THE FARES GO UP FOR SOME AND DOWN FOR OTHERS. IN THE REGION WHERE WE 4 5 THINK ABOUT THE CONTEXT OF FUNDING WE SHOULD ALSO BE THINKING ABOUT POTENTIAL INVESTMENT IN LOWERING FARES THAT, IS A VALUE-6 BASED CONVERSATION, A POLICY-BASED CONVERSATION RATHER THAN 7 8 DRAWING CONCLUSIONS THAT IS A FARE LEVEL FINANCIAL ASSUMPTION, THAT WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE AS A VARIABLE INTO A VALUES-BASED 9 CONVERSATION IN THE CONTEXT OF A REGIONAL MEASURE AND I'M 10 SAYING THAT IN CONTEXT OF TRANSIT ADVOCATES VOICES FOR PUBLIC 11 TRANSPORTATION THAT REALLY URGENCY A VALUE-BASED COORDINATION 12 TO BE INCLUDED. LASTLY THE FEEDBACK FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY 13 COUNCIL I WAS GLAD TO SEE THE WAY FINDING AND BRANDING 14 15 CORRELATION BEING MADE AND GOING BACK TO THE WAY FINDING AND 16 BRANDING STUDY THAT IS COMING FORWARD IN OCTOBER, WE SAW AT THE ADVISORY COUNCIL THIS SHOWED THE WAYFINDING AND MAPPING 17 INTEGRATION HAS HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OF ADDITIONAL 18 BENEFIT THAT WOULD ONLY BE REACHABLE WITH THE DEEPEST LEVEL OF 19 FARE INTEGRATION THEREFORE THAT'S SOMETHING TO MAKE SENSE IN 20 VALUE AND EASE OF USE THAT WOULD BE ACHIEVED WITH THE FULL 21 FARE INTEGRATION WHICH DOES HAVE MORE ADMINISTRATIVE BURDENS, 22 AND DOES HAVE MORE COST AND ADDITIONAL BENEFIT THOSE WOULD BE 23 GOOD THINGS TO CONSIDER. 24



MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I'LL TURN TO VICE CHAIR MULL 1 BEGIN. I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE THIS A BIT FASTER WE HAVE GENERAL 2 3 PUBLIC COMMENT. 4 5 DENIS MULLIGAN, V. CHAIR: I WOULD LIKE TO THANK STAFF ON THIS. IT'S A GREAT WORK PRODUCT I AM EXCITED TO HAVING MY BOARD 6 7 REVIEW THIS. AND I WANT TO ECHO POWERS' COMMENTS. 8 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: I AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS ABOUT 9 COMMUNITY COLLEGE COULD BE FURTHER EXPANDED AND I BELIEVE WITH 10 BIG BUSINESS TECH INDUSTRY AND LOOKING AT SHUTTLES. WITH THE 11 UPDATE ON CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD WE WANT TO KEEP AN EYE ON 12 THIS. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENT. 13 14 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WE RECEIVED CORRESPONDENCE, FIRST NAMES, 15 16 FROM GRANT, SARA, RACHEL, MARTIN, DAVIS, JOE, JEFFREY, AND A GROUP CORRESPONDENCE FROM SEAMLESS BAY AREA, SAN JOSE STATE 17 UNIVERSITY, RICHMOND PROGRESSIVE ALLIANCE, CENTER FOR 18 INDEPENDENT LIVING, EAST BAY FOR EVERYONE, CHOICE FOR AGING, 19 AND SILICON VALLEY INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTERS FOR URBAN 20 21 ENVIRONMENTALISTS, STREETS FOR PEOPLE BAY AREA, FRIENDS OF CAL 22 TRAIN, ASSOCIATED STUDENTS OF UC, PEOPLE OF BAY AREA, SAN FRANCISCO, LEAGUE CONSERVATION VOTERS. WE HAVE FIVE ATTENDEES 23 THERE HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE? 24



1	MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: ONE MINUTE.
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ROLAND.
4	
5	SPEAKER: GETTING THIS IN ONE MINUTE IS GOING TO BE TOUGH. I
6	THINK WE NEED TO START THINKING ABOUT THE CAPITAL NEEDS OF THE
7	VARIOUS SYSTEMS. PROBLEMS WITH FARE ZONES FREE TRANSIT ET
8	CETERA FOR BUS AND LIGHT RAIL I BELIEVE THAT'S AN ISSUE FOR
9	HEAVY CAPITAL SYSTEMS LIKE BART AND CALTRAIN. I'M GOING TO
10	GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE. I'M USING A WEB SITE HERE CALLED ROAM TO
11	RIO. OKAY? IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, YOU CAN GO FROM GILROY TO
12	PALO ALTO IN ABOUT, FOR TWO AND A HALF BUCKS, IT'S A 50 MILE
13	TRIP IN TWO HOURS AND 50 MINUTES. THAT INCLUDES FREE TRANSIT
14	HOW COULD THAT BE SUSTAINABLE A 50 MILE TRIP TWO AND A HALF
15	HOURS ON BART [INDISCERNIBLE] BUCKS. IF YOU GIVE THEM THIS
16	DISCOUNT WHEN THEY TRANSFERRED BETWEEN THE TWO SYSTEMS IN
17	CALTRAIN IN THE MORNING EVERYBODY'S GOING TO
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU ROLAND.
20	
21	SPEAKER: FREE TRIP TO MARKET STREET. THANK YOU MARTHA.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: FIRST UP IS ADAM HALL THEN WENDI.



- 1 SPEAKER: THANK YOU FOR THE STUDY. I'M A STUDENT AT SAN JOSE
- 2 STATE, AN ALUMNI OF SAN FRANCISCO STATE, AND THIS PROGRAM
- 3 WOULD HEAVILY IMPROVE THE LIVES OF STUDENTS AT BOTH
- 4 UNIVERSITIES BECAUSE BOTH ARE RELIANT ON BART FOR STUDENTS TO
- 5 GET IN FROM OUTSIDE OF THE COUNTY, BUT NEITHER UNIVERSITY
- 6 ACTUALLY HAS A BART STATION. AND RELIES ON TRANSFERS TO LOCAL
- 7 PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND BETWEEN BART BEING EXPENSIVE AND NOT
- 8 HAVING MONTHLY PASSES AND NEEDING TO TRANSFER TO LOCAL BUS, WE
- 9 JUST NEED A LOT MORE FARE INTEGRATION TO GET FEWER STUDENTS
- 10 DRIVING TO SCHOOL, BECAUSE WE COULDN'T PROVIDE THE PARKING FOR
- 11 THEM.

12

- 13 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: I GUESS HE FINISHED. THANK YOU ADAM.
- 14 NEXT UP WE HAVE WENDI FOLLOWED BY JOE KENSLER. WENDI?

- 16 WENDI KALLINS: THIS IS WENDI KALLINS, I'M VICE CHAIR OF THE
- 17 FARE INTEGRATION POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SUBCOMMITTEE. I AM
- 18 VERY HAPPY TO SEE PEOPLE WANTING TO GO BOLDER ON THE PILOT
- 19 STUDY. I WOULD URGE YOU TO GO BOLDER ON THE OTHER
- 20 RECOMMENDATIONS AS WELL. THE FREE TRANSFERS, AND ALSO THE
- 21 REGIONAL INTEGRATION, AND REALLY, YOU KNOW, LOOKING TOWARDS
- 22 THAT THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE IS LOOKING TO RECOMMENDATIONS
- 23 FROM THIS COMMITTEE TO REALLY TAKE A CLOSER LOOK, AS ADINA
- 24 SAID, IN THE COMBINATION OF WAYFARING AND FARE INTEGRATION AND



EVALUATE THE LOCAL TO REGIONAL TO SEE IF IT SCORES BETTER. 1 2 THANK YOU. 3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU WENDI. JOE KUNZLER FOLLOWED BY 4 5 DAVID TERRELL. 6 SPEAKER: THIS IS JOE KUNZLER. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR TAKING 7 8 MY WRITTEN LETTER I AGREE WITH TRANSIT FABIO -- SORRY --DIRECTOR POWERS, YOU NEED TO GO BOLD ON FARES AND REACH OUT TO 9 CHAMBERS OF COMMERCE AND TOURISM OUTREACH AGENCIES WE DON'T 10 WANT TO CLOG UP THE ROADS WITH UBER AND LYFT IN CAR RENTALS WE 11 WANT PEOPLE TO WALK OFF THE PLANE PARTICULATE ON TRANSIT THAT 12 SHOULD BE THE GOAL. THANK YOU. DAVID FOLLOWED BY TIFFANY THEN. 13 14 SPEAKER: HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON ALLEGE. DAVID SORREL 15 16 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT ADMINISTRATIVE FOR UC BERKELEY AND THE PRESIDENT OF THE NORTHERN CAL CHAPTER FOR 17 ASSOCIATION OF TRANSPORTATION. SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE 18 MAJORITY OF COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES, WE ARE MAKING SURE 19 TRANSIT IS SAFE FOR ALL OF OUR EMPLOYEES AND STUDENTS. I'M 20 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE UC BERKELEY CAMPUS WE HAVE 50,000 21 22 STUDENTS MANY ON THE PASS PROGRAM FOR AC TRANSIT THANK YOU FOR 23 THAT OPPORTUNITY. WE NEED TO GO FURTHER, BOLDER, FASTER TOGETHER THAT MEANS WE SHOULD BE ABLE TO PARTNER WITH NOT ONLY 24

THE UNIVERSITIES BUT ALSO THE BUSINESSES WE NEED TO HAVE



OPPORTUNITY TO GET TO AND FROM CAMPUS AS WELL AS PARKING 1 ISSUES WHICH THIS WOULD FIX LEVELS OF VMT AS WELL AS THE 2 3 NEEDED PARKING DEMAND. 4 5 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. THANK YOU MR. SORRELL. 6 7 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: TIFFANY RODRIGUEZ. 8 SPEAKER: I AM STEPHANIE RODRIGUEZ REPRESENTING ASSOCIATED 9 STUDENTS AT SAN JOSE UNIVERSITY WE SUPPORT THE RECOMMENDATIONS 10 FOR THE PILOT PROGRAM, REGIONAL TRANSFERS AND WE SUPPORT 11 MOVING FORWARD WITH THE RECOMMENDATIONS TO SUPPORT 12 INVESTIGATION FOR FULL TIER INTEGRATION [INDISCERNIBLE] 13 STUDENTS CAN'T AFFORD TO COMMUTE ON CALTRAIN AND AS A RESULT 14 THAT HAS NEGATIVE IMPACTS ON OUR ENVIRONMENT TRAFFIC AND 15 16 EXASPERATES OUR PARKING PROBLEM AT THE UNIVERSITY AS TRAFFIC AND PARKING PROBLEMS WORSEN MORE STUDENTS ARE NEGATIVELY 17 IMPACTED BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO ARRIVE TO CLASS TWO HOURS 18 EARLIER TO GET A PARKING SPACE AND ARE OFTEN LATE TO THEIR 19 CLASSES WE ALWAYS HAVE STUDENTS AND EMPLOYEES ASKING FOR 20 21 CALTRAIN AND BART DISCOUNTS STUDENTS WANT TO UTILIZE THESE 22 TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS BUT THE SYSTEM DOESN'T MEET THEIR NEEDS 23 FOR HOUSING STUDENTS OUR PERMITS SELL OUT AND WE'RE FORCED PROVIDE ADDITIONAL PARKING SPACES FROM OUR COMMUTER GARAGES. 24



1

September 20, 2021

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS KRISTIN FOLLOWED

2 BY RICH HEDGES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 3 SPEAKER: KRISTINE FITZGERALD SILICON VALLEY INDEPENDENT LIVING 4 5 CENTER. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR WORK, AND WE ENCOURAGE EVERYBODY TO LOOK AT THE STANDPOINT OF LOW-INCOME, VERY LOW 6 INCOME, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES WHO MAY NOT WORK WITHIN A 7 8 PARTICULAR REGION, AND I'M HOPING THE STUDY INCLUDED SANTA CLARA COUNTY VERY STRONGLY IN THE PROCESS AS WELL AS LOOKING 9 AT EVALUATING FARES THAT PEOPLE WHO HAVE DISABILITIES INCUR 10 FROM TRANSFERRING FROM ONE TYPE OF SERVICE SAY CALTRAIN TO 11 BART OR THE LIKE EVEN LOOKING AT PARATRANSIT. GOING FROM ONE 12 REGION TO ANOTHER, IT WOULD BE IDEAL FOR WORK, PLAY --13 [INDISCERNIBLE] ET CETERA. 14 15 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. NEXT UP RICH HEDGES. 16 17 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. VERY HOPEFUL WHAT I HAVE SEEN TODAY. TOO 18 WOULD LIKE TO SEE THINGS BOLDER ONE SAY REGIONAL DAY PASS I 19 DON'T THINK THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN FROM WHAT I'M SEEING. WE 20 21 DON'T WANT TO REDUCE FUNDING FOR MAINTENANCE FOR CLEANING BECAUSE THAT WILL ALSO REDUCE RIDERSHIP IF WE LET THAT GO. SO 22 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO REALLY FOCUS ON GETTING FUNDING THROUGH 23 STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS, AS WELL AS TRYING TO SET-ASIDE 24 MONEY THAT COMES IN REGIONAL TO MAKE SURE THE MAINTENANCE IS 25



- 1 DONE. I REALLY LIKE THE IDEA OF NOT HAVING TRANSFERS ON LOCAL
- 2 TRANSPORTATION. I THINK THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. IT REALLY WAS
- 3 JAMMING UP THE COST. SAMTRANS HAS ALREADY DONE AWAY WITH
- 4 TRANSFER COMFORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I WANT TO THANK YOU
- 5 FOR ALL THE EFFORTS YOU HAVE BEEN DOING.

6

- 7 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU RICH. IAN UNMUTE YOURSELF
- 8 FOLLOWED BY JIM SMITH.

9

- 10 IAN GRIFFITHS: GOOD AFTERNOON IAN GRIFFITHS SEAMLESS BAY AREA.
- 11 I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THE EXCELLENT WORK ON THIS AND
- 12 REALLY IMPORTANT HIGHLIGHTING THE TIER THREE HERE STAFF REPORT
- 13 RECOMMENDS TRANSFER DISCOUNTS, TIER TWO, TIER ONE, BUT IT SAYS
- 14 TON EVALUATE TIER THREE. EVEN THOUGH THE BENEFITS ARE REALLY
- 15 TREMENDOUS. I MEAN, RIDERSHIP BENEFITS OF 4 TO 5% VERY
- 16 COMPETITIVE COST FOR NEW RIDER. ONE OF THE MOST COST EFFECTIVE
- 17 THINGS WE COULD DO AND BIGGEST IMPACT THE IN TERMS OF VMT, AND
- 18 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT TURNED INTO A RECOMMENDATION TO HAVE
- 19 TIER THREE, AND NOT A CONTINUE TO EVALUATE. AND OF COURSE
- 20 THERE ARE A LOT OF QUESTIONS THAT NEED TO BE ANSWERED THERE
- 21 BUT HAVING IT BE A CLEAR RECOMMENDATION WOULD BE FOR THE TASK
- 22 FORCE TO IDENTIFY IN THE FALL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES.

23

24 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. LASTLY, JIM SCHMIDT.



SPEAKER: I ENDORSE THE IDEA OF PILOTS EVERYTHING SHOULD BE 1 PILOT WITHIN THE LEARNING EXPERIENCE THAT GO ALONG WITH THE 2 3 WORK BEING DONE HERE. AND THE EVALUATIONS LOOKS TO ME LIKE THE BENEFIT IS CALCULATED AT FIVE YEARS AND FINANCIAL COST IS 4 5 ANNUAL COST SO KIND OF BIASES THE RESULTS. AND I WOULDN'T CAUTION TOO MUCH EXPERIMENTATION HERE UNTIL WE CAN GET OUR 6 OVERALL COST DOWN TO NEARLY \$6 PER PASSENGER SUBSIDY THAT 7 8 PREVAILS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA CURRENTLY. THANK YOU. 9 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBER MEMBERS OF THE 10 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED FOR THE THIS ITEM. 11 12 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU MARTHA. ITEM 6A PUBLIC 13 COMMENTS FOR THIS NOT ON TODAY AGENDA. I SEE ONE HAND RAISED. 14 15 WRITTEN COMMENT MARTHA? 16 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: NO WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED AND THERE IS 17 18 ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. JOE KUNZLER. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. 19 20 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I WILL MAKE THIS REMARK BRIEF. BUT IN 21 GENERAL, AND THIS IS ABOUT AN ISSUE WE DEALT WITH TODAY, I 22 WOULD APPRECIATE IT THAT TRANSIT AGENCY HEADS AND TRANSIT 23 ADVOCACY GROUPS IN GENERAL DO IN THE GET INTO IT WITH THE 24

PRESS OR SNIPE AT EACH OTHER AND RESOLVE DIFFERENCES IN



PRIVATE AND I THINK MOST PEOPLE KNOW WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT SO 1 I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT. THANK YOU FOR TAKING MY GENERAL PUBLIC 2 3 COMMENT. 4 5 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: OKAY. ONE MORE. ROLAND, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 6 7 8 SPEAKER: YES, THANK YOU. MY COMMENT IS THAT HAVING A COUNT 9 DOWN CLOCK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT WOULD BE MOST APPRECIATED. THANK YOU. 10 11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC 12 13 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. 14 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: ADJOURNMENT. NEXT MEETING WILL BE MONDAY 15 16 OCTOBER 18TH, 1230 P.M. MOST LIKELY VIRTUAL BUT STAY TUNED. THANK YOU EVERYBODY FOR A GREAT MEETING TODAY. WE'RE 17 18 ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government