

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



September 8, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**
3 **WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 8, 2021, 1:30 P.M.**
4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WELCOME TO THE SEPTEMBER 8TH,
6 2021 MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I WOULD LIKE TO
7 ROLL THE BROADCAST ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE. [RECORDED MEETING
8 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE
9 CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE
10 GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN
11 REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST
12 ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS,
13 PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT
14 THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING
15 COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND
16 ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
17 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
18 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD
19 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR
20 WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
21 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
22 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE
23 THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION
24 IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
25 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



September 8, 2021

1 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE
2 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
3 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL
4 BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD
5 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE INTO AGENDA ITEM
8 NUMBER THREE, WHICH IS CONFIRMING OUR QUORUM. AGENDA ITEM TWO,
9 PLEASE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BALDINI IS EXCUSED. BURNETT? RICHARD
12 BURNETT? CASTELLANOS? CARLOS CASTELLANOS? COATS?

13

14 **RICK COATES:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. ELDRED. VEDA?

17

18 **VEDA FLOREZ:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLOVER? GOTUACO?

21

22 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** PRESENT.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HERNANDEZ? KALLINS?

25



September 8, 2021

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HAPPY NEW YEAR BY THE WAY. LOPEZ?

8

9 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MADDEN?

12

13 **MARC MADDEN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MENDOZA?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RAHMON MOMOH? MURRAY?

20

21 **CYNTHIA MURRAY:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BEN SCHWENG IS EXCUSED. SCOTT?

24

25 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.



September 8, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FRANK WELTE.

3

4 **FRANK WELTE:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WALTER WILL BE LATE. GOING DOWN AGAIN.

7 BALDINI? NOT JOINED. BURNETTE? CASTELLANOS YOU HAVE JOINED US

8 YET? NO. ELDRED. GLOVER? HERNANDEZ? RAHMON? WITH THAT WE HAVE

9 A QUORUM

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE ARE GOING TO KICKOFF THE CHAIR'S

12 REPORT WITH THE HELP OF OUR BROADCAST TEAM. WHENEVER THE

13 BROADCAST TEAM IS READY, GO AHEAD AND ROLL. [MUSIC]

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HI. I LIVE IN PLEASANTON CALIFORNIA MY PLANNED BAY

16 AREA 2050 STRATEGY IS PROVIDING INCENTIVES TO EMPLOYERS TO

17 SHIFT JOB LOCATION TO HOUSING-RICH AREAS THAT ARE WELL SERVED

18 BY TRANSIT. THE REASON I LIKE THIS IS BECAUSE PEOPLE LIKE MY

19 MOM WHO IS LONG COMMUTES TO WORK, AND THESE COMMUTES AREN'T

20 SERVED BY PUBLIC TRANSIT USUALLY HAVE TO DRIVE VERY LONG HOURS

21 DAY IN AND DAY OUT THIS WOULD HELP NOT ONLY REDUCE THE AMOUNT

22 OF CARS BEING USED BUT ALSO REDUCE THE STRESS OF LOTS OF THESE

23 WORKERS.

24



September 8, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** HEY, MY NAME IS URIEL CAR DOSE A I AM FROM PITTSBURG
2 IN THE BAY AREA AND MY PLANNED BAY AREA STRATEGY IS
3 MAINTENANCE OF URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES THIS IS A CONSPIRE
4 IMPORTANT STRATEGY ESPECIALLY IN INLAND CITIES LIKE MINE FOR
5 BIODIVERSITY IT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE BAY AREA WE NEED TO
6 RECOGNIZE SPECIES DISCIPLINES WILDLIFE THAT ARE WITHIN OUR
7 ENVIRONMENT. WE NEED TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR BAY
8 AREA RESIDENTS THROUGH THAT FOCUS.

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** CAN YOU TURN THE VOLUME UP?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HI. I THINK THIS HELP BECAUSE SOME PEOPLE SLEEP ON
13 THE FLOOR BUT THEY DON'T HAVE TO SLEEP ON THE FLOOR IF THEY
14 GET A HOUSE, THEY HAVE TO FIND A BED.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** OUT OF EVERYTHING OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 I AM MOST
17 EXCITED ABOUT THE COMPLETE STREETS NETWORK ONCE CONSTRUCTED
18 THIS WILL PROVIDE BAY AREA RESIDENTS TRANSPORTATION
19 ALTERNATIVES AND IMPROVE QUALITY OF LIFE PROVIDING A MOBILE
20 STREET ENVIRONMENT AND ALLOW FOR FASTER TRANSPORT. I HOPE THAT
21 BY 2050 BAY AREA RESIDENTS WILL HAVE MORE TRANSPORTATION
22 OPTIONS AND WILL SEE CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE URBAN LANDSCAPE.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** I AM FROM BURNING GAME WHAT I LIKE MOST IS THE RAIL
25 ELECTRIFICATION HAPPENING NOW IN THE FUTURE WE WILL SEE LINK



September 8, 2021

1 21 OR VALLEY RAIL WHICH ARE EXCITING PROPOSALS WHICH WILL HELP
2 TAKE PEOPLE OFF THE ROAD AND INTO ELECTRIFIED TRAINS THAT'S
3 GOOD FOR OUR EMERGENCY WE'RE IN RIGHT NOW.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M HILLARY FROM HERCULES CALIFORNIA ONE OF MY
6 FAVORITE STRATEGIES ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS EXPANDING
7 YOUR LIABILITY AND FREQUENCY OF BUSES, IN FACT, THERE IS
8 ACTUALLY A BUS RIGHT THERE, AND ACROSS THE STREET THERE'S A
9 BUS STOP THIS WILL HELP PEOPLE GET TO WORK AND SCHOOL ON TIME
10 AND COULD HELP COMBINE BUSES INTO CLEAN AIR VEHICLES SO THEY
11 CAN REDUCE THE IMPACT OF POLLUTION. [MUSIC]

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I LOVE HAVING A LOOK AT THE
14 FUTURE OF OUR COMMUNITY. AND, YES, BIG APPLAUSE FOR THAT. CAN
15 STAFF TELL ME HOW THAT CAME ABOUT? ANYBODY ON STAFF THAT WAS
16 HERE FOR THAT? >DAVE VAUTIN: HI, THIS IS DAVE VAUTIN WITH THE
17 REGIONAL PLANNING TEAM. I'M HAPPY TO TAKE THAT QUESTION. AS
18 PART OF OUR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, IN
19 OUR LATEST ROUND WE HAVE BEEN DOING YOUTH ENGAGEMENT AND WE
20 HELD KIND OF A YOUTH VIDEO CHALLENGE OVER THE COURSE OF THE
21 SUMMER WHERE WE HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO ENGAGE WITH YOUTH
22 DIRECTLY, AND THEN THEY SUBMITTED THESE VIDEOS BASED ON
23 REVIEWING THE PLAN, THE STRATEGIES THEY FELT WERE MOST
24 CRITICAL TO IMPROVE THEIR COMMUNITIES. I BELIEVE WE GOT
25 SEVERAL DOZEN DIFFERENT SUBMISSIONS SO THIS WAS REALLY KIND OF



September 8, 2021

1 A HIGHLIGHT REAL OF WHAT WE SAW. AND YOU CAN SEE ALL OF THE
2 VIDEOS ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA WEB SITE.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WHAT I'M GOING TO
5 SAY IS, AS THE ADULTS IN THE ROOM, WE NEED TO SET AN EXAMPLE
6 FOR THE YOUTH OF OUR COMMUNITY, AND LET'S BE MORE AWARE OF HOW
7 WE ENGAGE WITH STAFF. OUR LAST MEETING WAS A LITTLE HARSH WITH
8 STAFF. AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE RECOGNIZE THAT, AND
9 THAT WE -- SO WHAT I HAVE TO SAY TO YOU IS, YOU DON'T NEED TO
10 SAY THE SAME COMMENT SIX TIMES IN A MEETING, OR SAY IT THREE
11 TIMES IN A SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING, AND THREE TIMES AT OUR
12 MEETING. YOUR VOICE COUNTS, AND THE MORE TIMES YOU SAY IT, IT
13 DOESN'T COUNT MORE. SO I JUST WANT US TO BE A LITTLE MORE
14 GENTLE WITH STAFF THAN WE WERE LAST MONTH. WE HAVE DONE AN
15 EXCELLENT JOB. I KNOW EVERYBODY IS EXCITED. WE'RE GETTING
16 TOWARDS THE END OF OUR TERM HERE. LET'S END IT WITH A BIG
17 BANG. I SEE FRANK WELTE'S HAND IS UP.

18

19 **FRANK WELTE:** ARE THE VIDEOS THAT ARE POSTED ON THE WEB SITE,
20 DO THEY HAVE AUDIO DESCRIPTIONS FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE BLIND?

21 >DAVE VAUTIN: FRANK, THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. I WILL CHECK
22 WITH OUR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT STAFF AND GET BACK TO YOU.

23

24 **FRANK WELTE:** THANK YOU.

25



September 8, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES?

2

3 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I WANT TO SAY I LOST VIDEOS OF THOSE YOUNG
4 PEOPLE AND I DON'T KNOW HOW ANYBODY CAN BE SKEPTICAL ABOUT OUR
5 FUTURE WHEN WE HAVE BRIGHT YOUNG PEOPLE LIKE THAT. I WAS
6 REALLY TOUCHED BY T.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO FINISH UP THE
9 CHAIR'S REPORT AND GO INTO ITEM NUMBER FOUR.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
12 THEIR HAND RAISED.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IF THERE IS, GO AHEAD, MEMBER OF THE
15 PUBLIC.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** TIM FRANK, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. UNMUTE
18 YOURSELF.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'M GETTING AHEAD OF MYSELF. I CAN WAIT FOR THE
21 PLANNED BAY AREA DISCUSSION.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.



September 8, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THERE WILL AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT CORRECT?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU CAN COMMENT OVER AGENDA ITEM.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WITH THAT LET'S GO TO ITEM FOUR APPROVAL
7 OF THE JULY 24TH, 2021 MEETING MINUTES.

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** MOVE THE JULY 24TH MEETING MINUTES.

10

11 **CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR:** SECOND.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** COMMENTS OR DISCUSSION? ANY ORAL
14 COMMUNICATION FROM THE PUBLIC ON THIS?

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
18 ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT MAY WE HAVE A ROLL
21 CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. AND AGAIN THE MOTION WAS BY HEDGES
24 AND SECOND BY MURRAY. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
25 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT



September 8, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM FIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON
3 BUSINESS NOT ON TODAY AGENDA OPPORTUNITY FOR THE MEMBERS OF
4 THE PUBLIC TO RAISE AN ISSUE THAT IS NOT ON OUR AGENDA BY
5 USING THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIALING STAR NINE. DO WE HAVE
6 ANY COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON
9 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
10 HAND RAISED.

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM SIX, SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT.
13 WE'LL GO WITH THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE FIRST. VEDA?

14

15 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON VEDA FLOREZ, I'M THE CHAIR OF THE
16 EQUITY AND ACCESS, THAT WAS OUR LAST MEETING WE DID NOT HAVE A
17 MEETING IN AUGUST. WE WILL HAVE A MEETING ON OCTOBER 4TH AT
18 2:00 P.M. AND IN FULL DISCLOSURE, I WANT TO [AUDIO
19 DIFFICULTIES] [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT VICE CHAIR ANNE OLIVIA
20 ELDRED AND I HAD A POLICY BRIEF FROM PIERCE, AND I'LL PULL
21 THAT UP. THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE, CHAIR. PIERCE GOULD GAVE
22 US A POLICY BRIEFING ON THE TOLL DISCOUNT PILOT PROGRAM PRIOR
23 TO HIS MEETING WITH THE BAIFA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. PLEASE
24 JOIN US ON OUR FOURTH.

25



September 8, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION
2 SUBCOMMITTEE. ADINA?

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. SO WE HAVE A MEETING THAT'S COMING UP
5 ON FRIDAY AND, I BELIEVE, 2:00 P.M., WHERE THERE IS GOING TO
6 BE THE FIRST PRESENTATION OF THE DETAILED RECOMMENDATIONS OF
7 THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY THAT WILL INCLUDE
8 THE DETAILED BUSINESS ANALYSIS AND THE DETAILED USER RESEARCH.
9 SO, ANYONE WHO IS EAGER TO GET A FIRST VIEW OF THE DETAILS OF
10 THAT, FEEL FREE TO JOIN US ON FRIDAY. FOLLOWING THAT, IT IS,
11 ACCORDING TO THE SCHEDULE, IT IS EXPECTED TO COME TO THE FARE
12 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ON SEPTEMBER THE 20TH. AND THE FARE
13 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IS, AT LEAST ACCORDING TO THE CURRENT
14 SCHEDULE, EXPECTED TO TAKE A VOTE ON OCTOBER THE 18TH, AND IN
15 BETWEEN THOSE TWO DATES, THERE IS EXPECTED TO BE A TRANSIT
16 AGENCY SERIES OF PRESENTATIONS. I HAVE ATTEMPTED TO FIND OUT
17 WHEN THOSE TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEETINGS ARE GOING TO BE, IN
18 LATE SEPTEMBER, AND THROUGH THE MIDDLE OF OCTOBER, IF THERE
19 ARE ANY STAFF MEMBERS WHO HAPPEN TO KNOW WHAT THAT TIMELINE IS
20 FOR THIS BODY, DURING THIS MEETING, THAT WOULD BE EXTREMELY
21 WELCOME, AND IF NOT, SENDING IS IT TO US AFTERWARD WOULD ALSO
22 BE WELCOME. BECAUSE, AS REPRESENTATIVES FROM AROUND THE
23 REGION, MULTIPLE OF US MAY BE INTERESTED IN REACHING OUT OR
24 WATCHING THOSE BOARD MEETINGS. I BELIEVE I REPORTED IN THE
25 PREVIOUS OUR LAST MEETING WAS AFTER WE GOT AN UPDATE ON THE



September 8, 2021

1 LIKELY RECOMMENDATIONS. I'LL RECAP THEM QUICKLY, THE
2 EXPECTATION IS RECOMMENDATIONS ARE LIKELY TO INCLUDE A
3 COMBINATION OF FREE OR REDUCED PRICE TRANSFERS, HAVING A FARE
4 RECAPING WITH A DAY, WEEK, OR MONTH MAXIMUM, GO ANYWHERE
5 TRANSIT PASSES FOR INSTITUTIONS, SUCH AS FOR EMPLOYERS,
6 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS AND OTHER KINDS OF
7 ORGANIZATIONS, POSSIBLY STANDARDIZED REGIONAL FARES, AND
8 PROBABLY NOT STANDARDIZING LOCAL FARES. THOSE ARE PRECISELY,
9 AND THE SPECIFIC DETAILED RECOMMENDATIONS WITH SUPPORT
10 INFORMATION IS GOING TO BE OUT BY LATER THIS WEEK. SO, WITH
11 THAT, I WOULD BE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS FROM PEOPLE THAT
12 ARE INTERESTED IN THE STUDY THAT IS RAPIDLY MOVING FORWARD.
13 IS

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
16 FOR EITHER OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
19 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT
20 SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY DOES ANYBODY HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR
23 ADINA? WELL, THERE WOULDN'T BE ANY FOR A DONA, BECAUSE WE
24 DIDN'T HAVE A MEETING. STAFF, I ADOPT TO PUT A GREAT BIG
25 CHECK MARK, STAR, WHATEVER, NEXT TO ADINA'S COMMENTS ABOUT THE



September 8, 2021

1 SCHEDULING FOR APPEARING BEFORE THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. IT'S
2 REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE A SCHEDULE OF WHEN THEY ARE
3 GOING TO BE ON TRANSIT AGENCY'S AGENDAS, AND TO GET THAT OUT
4 TO US AS SOON AS POSSIBLE.

5

6 **MARTI PASCHAL:** MARTI PASCHAL, STAFF TO THE COUNCIL. I WILL
7 CHECK WITH STAFF AND GET THAT TO THE COUNCIL.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WANT TO ADD ONE MORE THING FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE
10 INTERESTED IN -- IF THERE IS ANY RECOMMENDATIONS, WHEN THEY
11 ARE APPROVED, WHEN THEY WOULD ROLL OUT, AND THERE IS LIKELY TO
12 BE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR A PHASED ROLL OUT WITH POTENTIAL FOR A
13 PILOT AS SOON AS NEXT YEAR FOR SOME ELEMENT OF THE
14 RECOMMENDATIONS THEN ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS THAT CAN BE
15 IMPLEMENTED IN 2023 WITH CLIPPER 2.0, AND RECOMMENDATIONS THAT
16 MAY REQUIRE FUTURE FUNDING.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, SEEING NO MORE
19 HANDS RAISED. WE'LL MOVE TO THE NEXT ITEM, NUMBER SEVEN
20 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN FROM THE BLUE RIBBON
21 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE. AND I SEE MELANIE, ARE YOU
22 PRESENTING?

23

24 **MELANIE CHOY:** I AM. GOOD AFTERNOON POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
25 MEMBERS. MELANIE CHOY WITH MTC STAFF. I THINK THERE IS A



September 8, 2021

1 PRESENTATION -- I'LL START WHILE THE PRESENTATION IS KICKING
2 OFF, TO PROVIDE SOME CONTEXT. IN MARCH OF 2020, AS THE
3 MAGNITUDE OF COVID WAS SINKING IN, WE SAW TRANSIT
4 RIDERSHIP SEEMINGLY COLLAPSE OVERNIGHT. NEXT SLIDE. AND SO,
5 WITH THAT URGENCY, TO RESPONSE TO THE IMMEDIATE CRISIS, BUT
6 ALSO IMPORTANTLY, THE COMMISSION ALSO SIMULTANEOUSLY
7 RECOGNIZED THAT THE TIME OF THIS CRISIS COULD OFFER AN
8 OPPORTUNITY TO TRANSFORM FOR LONG-TERM IMPROVEMENT THE
9 COMMISSION WILL MOVE QUICKLY SO IN APRIL THEY STASHED A 32
10 PERSON BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE LED BY CHAIR
11 SPERING, AND COMPOSED OF STAKEHOLDERS, REPRESENTATIVES FROM
12 THE STATE, TRANSIT INDUSTRY, INTEREST GROUPS AND WE WANT TO
13 THANK RANDI FOR SERVING ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
14 REPRESENTATIVE ON THE BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE. THIS
15 SLIDES RESPECTS OVERVIEW OF THE WORK OF THE TASK FORCE
16 STRUCTURED AROUND THREE STAGES OF WORK. TO THE RIGHT, THERE IS
17 RECOGNITION THAT THE TASK FORCE WORK CONTINUES, THAT THE
18 ADOPTION OF THE ACTION PLAN DOESN'T MEAN THAT THE WORK
19 CONTINUES BUT THAT THE TASK FORCE MIGHT HAVE ENDED, BUT THE
20 WORK HAS SET THE FOUNDATION FOR MORE ACTIONS TO FOLLOW. NEXT
21 SLIDE. AND IN EVALUATING OR DESCRIBING EACH OF THE THREE
22 STAGES FOR THE TASK FORCE IN PARTICULAR THEY EACH HAD A FOCUS.
23 STAGE ONE SURVIVAL FOCUSED ON PROVIDING GUIDANCE TO THE
24 DISTRIBUTION OF THE 500 MILLION THAT WAS REMAINING IN THE
25 FEDERAL CARES ACT RELIEF FUNDS IN THAT TIME PERIOD IN SPRING



September 8, 2021

1 OF 2020. AND THEN STAGE TWO WAS FOCUSED ON SUPPORTING THE
2 OPERATORS RECOVERY PLANNING WHICH INCLUDED THE HEALTHY TRANSIT
3 DASHBOARD AS WELL AS RETURN TO TRANSIT CAMPAIGN THAT HAS BEEN
4 IN THE WORKS AND PLANNING FOR THE LAST YEAR OF SO. LAST ONE IS
5 TODAY'S PRESENTATION, TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THIS
6 IS THE TASK FORCE'S MOST COMPLEX ASSIGNMENT OVER TEN MONTHS
7 THE TASK FORCE FOCUSED ON CRITICAL BUILDING BLOCKS TO INFORM
8 THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ACTION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE GETTING
9 INTO THE HEART OF THE ACTIONS PLAN, I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT SOME
10 OF THE FOUNDATIONALSAL WORK OF SOME OF THE TASK FORCE THAT LED
11 AND SHAPED THE ACTIONS. ON THE SLIDE IS A LIST OF THE APPROVED
12 GOALS OF THE TASK FORCE. AND AS THE TASK FORCE SHIFTED FROM
13 STAGE TWO, AND STAGE 1 AND 2 DISCUSSIONS TO STAGE THREE, THEY
14 DEVELOPED APPROVED FOUR GOALS AND OBJECTIVES. THIS REALLY
15 ANCHORED THE STAGE THREE WORK. GOAL ONE WAS FOCUSED ON
16 RECOGNIZING RECOVERY AND CHALLENGES THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE
17 FACING. GOAL TWO IS TO MAKE SURE THAT EQUITY IS AN IMPORTANT
18 COMPONENT THROUGHOUT THE DISCUSSION OF THE TASK FORCE, AND
19 GOAL THREE WAS TO REITERATE THAT THE INTENT WAS TO IDENTIFY
20 SOME TANGIBLE STEPS TOWARD NETWORK MANAGEMENT CHANGES
21 THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS, AND THEN THE LAST GOAL WAS THAT WE
22 HAD CURRENT INITIATIVES ONGOING, AND THE FOCUS WAS TRYING TO
23 FIGURE OUT HOW TO ADDRESS -- WAS TO ADDRESS -- TO FIGURE OUT
24 HOW TO ADDRESS THIS CHALLENGE -- HOW THESE SHOULD ADVANCE AND
25 INTEGRATE WITH ONGOING NETWORK MANAGEMENT DISCUSSIONS UNDER



September 8, 2021

1 GOAL THREE. NEXT SLIDE. SO THROUGHOUT THE TASK FORCE, THE
2 TASK FORCE MEMBERS SOUGHT TO ADDRESS EQUITY IN ITS WORK AND
3 HIGHLIGHT THE IMPORTANCE OF SERVING RIDERS WHO ARE CURRENTLY
4 USING TRANSIT DURING THE PANDEMIC, ESPECIALLY, AND THOSE THAT
5 MAY HAVE BEEN DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTED THE MOST DURING THAT
6 TIME. AND THE ONE REASON THIS ONE IS CALLED OUT IN PARTICULAR
7 IS THAT, UNDER GOAL TWO, THE TASK FORCE DID PRIORITIZE OR
8 FOCUS ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF PRINCIPLES IN THAT SPIRIT. SO
9 BASED ON THE TASK FORCE DISCUSSIONS AND INPUT FROM COMMUNITY-
10 BASED ORGANIZATIONAL LEADERS, THESE WERE FIVE EQUITY
11 PRINCIPLES THAT WERE ADOPTED, AND THE GOAL WAS THAT THESE
12 PRINCIPLES SERVE NOT ONLY AS A COMPASS TO THE TASK FORCE
13 ITSELF FOR THE WORK BUT ALSO TO POINT TO PUBLIC AGENCIES AND
14 COMMUNITIES TOWARD EQUITABLE AND LASTING RECOVERY. NEXT SLIDE.
15 AND LASTLY BEFORE DIVING INTO THE ACTION PLAN, I WANT TO CALL
16 OUT THAT THERE WAS A DEFINITION TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION THAT
17 GUIDED THE ACTION PLAN WORK AND THESE LAY OUT THE FIVE
18 OUTCOMES AND THE 27 ACTIONS IN THE ACTION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE
19 PLEASE. AS CONTEXT FOR THE ACTION PLAN, THIS IS KIND OF A
20 STATUS UPDATE TO KIND OF GIVE EVERYONE A SNAPSHOT OF THE
21 CURRENT RIDERSHIP LEVELS. AS OF JUNE RIDERSHIP STILL
22 REMAINDERS SIGNIFICANTLY LOWER FROM PREPANDEMIC LEVELS. WHAT'S
23 SHOWN HERE IS THE LAST TWO AND A HALF YEARS OF RIDERSHIP
24 TRENDS INDICATING RIDERSHIP IS STILL DOWN FROM PRECOVID
25 LEVELS. SOME OF THE RIDERSHIP DECLINE PRIOR WAS DUE TO



September 8, 2021

1 EXTERNAL FORCES OUTSIDE OF THE CONTROL OF OUR TRANSPORTATION
2 INFLUENCES HOWEVER THROUGHOUT TASK FORCE WORK THERE WAS
3 DISCUSSION ABOUT THE CHALLENGES THAT WITHIN OUR INDUSTRY WE
4 CAN LOOK TO ADDRESS T WHAT'S HIGHLIGHTED ARE THOSE CHALLENGES,
5 THESE ARE CENTRAL TO TACKLING AND LED TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF
6 THE FIVE OUTCOMES. NEXT SLIDE. ON THIS SLIDE, THESE ARE THE
7 OUTCOMES THAT WAS BORNE OUT OF AWFUL THOSE CHALLENGES, PROBLEM
8 STATEMENTS DISCUSSIONS AND OUTCOMES ARE REALLY FOCUSED ON FIVE
9 CORE AREAS EACH OF THE ACTIONS IN THE ACTION PLAN ARE ALIGNED
10 WITH EACH WITH AN OUTCOME. WITH THE FIRST OUTCOME, FARES AND
11 PAYMENT, CUSTOMER INFORMATION HAVE BEEN CITED AS THE MOST
12 VISIBLE AND KEY IN PROVIDING TANGIBLE AND POSITIVE BENEFITS TO
13 THE RIDER. THIRD, THE TRANSIT NETWORK AREA IS FOCUSED -- IS
14 IMPORTANT -- IT'S FOCUSED ON ESTABLISHING A MORE UNIFYING,
15 NIMBLE, AND TRANSIT FOCUSED SYSTEM AND NOT JUST BEING A SUM OF
16 ITS PARTS. THE FOURTH CATEGORY FOCUS WAS ADDRESSING
17 ACCESSIBILITY CONCERNS AND NEEDS EVER VULNERABLE POPULATIONS
18 THROUGHOUT THE TASK FORCE AND SO IT'S IMPORTANT TO CALL THAT
19 OUT SPECIFICALLY AS A STANDALONE OUTCOME. LAST ONE IS FUNDING,
20 PLAYING A PART IN SHAPING A LOT OF THIS AND MAKING THIS
21 HAPPEN. THERE ARE SOME OVERARCHING ELEMENTS UNDERLYING THIS
22 PLAN AND SEVERAL IMPORTANT FEATURES ARE BUILT INTO THIS ACTION
23 PLAN. FIRST IS THE ONGOING COLLABORATION, WHICH IS A
24 CONTINUATION OF THE EXISTING COLLABORATION THAT WE HAVE SEEN
25 OVER THE LAST YEAR AND A HALF, BUT ALSO JUST CONTINUATION OF



September 8, 2021

1 THAT COLLABORATION, AND ADVANCING IT. NOT JUST AMONG
2 OPERATORS, MTC, BUT ALSO, INCLUDING THE SPECTRUM OF
3 STAKEHOLDERS. THIS IS ALL ESSENTIAL IN TERMS OF ACHIEVING
4 COMMON VISION, AND IT'S ESSENTIAL FOR THE SUCCESS OF THIS
5 ACTION PLAN. THE SECOND PIECE IS THE ACTIONS OUTLINED IN THIS
6 DOCUMENT IS REALLY FOCUSED ON THE ONE-TO-3 YEAR TIME FRAME.
7 AND THAT WAS INTENDED TO BE NEAR-TERM ACTIONS THAT WE COULD
8 ACHIEVABLY TACKLE IN THE NEAR-TERM. AND THEN THE OTHER
9 COMPONENT IS DECISIONS ON FUNDING, EXISTING OR NEW FUNDING. IT
10 NEEDS TO, DECISIONS ON THESE EXISTING AND NEW FUNDING NEEDS TO
11 BE MADE TO ADVANCE THESE INITIATIVES. AND LASTLY THE PLAN
12 COMPONENTS ARE AMBITIOUS FOR TARGETING REFINEMENTS AS WE
13 PROCEED. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE HAVE COLLAPSED AND SUMMARIZED ALL
14 OF THE ACTIONS ON THE NEXT FOUR SLIDES, AND GIVEN THE LIMITED
15 TIME, I'LL JUST PROVIDE SOME HIGHLIGHTS OF THESE ACTIONS. BUT
16 FOR MORE DETAILS, THERE IS MORE DETAILS IN THE ACTION PLAN
17 REPORT ITSELF, AS WELL AS SOME HIGH LEVEL SCHEDULE OUTLOOK
18 TABLES THAT ARE CONTAINED IN THE PLAN. SO WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO
19 CALL OUT IS THE ACTION PLAN DOES INCLUDE SOME ACCELERATED
20 ACTIONS, AND THEY ARE DISTINGUISHED TO ELEVATE AND FOCUS THE
21 EFFORTS ON THESE SPECIFIC ACCELERATED ACTIONS AND THESE AREAS
22 WERE PROCEEDING PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC AND THIS ACTION PLAN
23 OUTLINES SOME WAYS TO GET THESE INITIATIVES TO THE NEXT STEP.
24 WHAT YOU'RE SEEING HERE IS THE FIRST TWO CATEGORIES OF THOSE
25 ACCELERATED ACTIONS. AND THE TASK FORCE IS RECOMMENDING TO



September 8, 2021

1 ELEVATE THESE CREATING STRONG PRIORITY FOR THEM TO BE
2 ACHIEVED. FIRST FOCUSING ON FARES AND PAYMENT AND MUCH OF THE
3 WORK OF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IS CAPTURED IN THIS
4 FIRST AREA AND THE SECOND CATEGORY IS THE CUSTOMER INFORMATION
5 FOCUSED ON THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING EFFORTS THAT HAS BEEN
6 UNDERWAY FOR, I THINK, THE LAST TWO YEARS. SO THIS INVESTS IN
7 SOME PILOT PROJECTS AS WELL AS ADVANCING SOME REGIONAL WORK IN
8 THAT AREA. NEXT SLIDE. AND THE THIRD AREA FOR ACCELERATED
9 ACTION IS BUS TRANSIT PRIORITY. IN PARTICULAR, WITH RESPECT TO
10 SPEED AND RELIABILITY. THIS HAS WORKED ON IMPROVING BUS SPEED
11 AND RELIABILITY FOR QUITE SOMETIME. MORE WORK IS NEEDED IN
12 THIS AREA AND IT CONTINUALLY EVOLVES. THIS WAS A TOPIC OF
13 CONVERSATION AND INTEREST OF THE TASK FORCE. AND SO SOME
14 SPECIFIC ACTIONS ON HOW TO TACKLE IT, AND TAKE IT TO THE NEXT
15 LEVEL, IS ENCOMPASSED BY THESE ACTIONS HERE. NEXT SLIDE
16 PLEASE. SO, THESE ACTIONS ARE OTHER ACTIONS, AND THESE ARE
17 ALSO PART OF THE TRANSIT NETWORK. THAT ARE CRITICAL AND
18 ACTIVELY PROCEEDING, AS WELL. SO AROUND THE TRANSIT NETWORK,
19 THERE IS A LOT OF PLANNING, REALLY IMPORTANT PLANNING EFFORTS
20 UNDERWAY, AND ALSO ENCOMPASSED IN A LOT OF THESE ACTIONS HERE,
21 AND IN PARTICULAR, I WOULD LIKE TO CALL OUT THE NETWORK
22 MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE WORK IT'S PART OF THESE DISCUSSIONS
23 AND IS ACTIVELY BEING PURSUED AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE SO THIS LAST
24 SLIDE SUMMARIZES THE LAST SET OF ACTION UNDER ACCESSIBILITY
25 UNDER THE FOCUS AREA THE REGION HAS EXISTING NATIVE PUBLIC



September 8, 2021

1 TRANSIT AND HUMAN SERVICES PLAN AND MANY ACTIONS WILL STAY
2 FOCUSED ON BUILDING THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THAT PLAN AND
3 PULLING OUT SOME SPECIFICS FROM THE PLAN ALSO THE SET OF
4 ACTIONS CALLS FOR IMPROVING INTEGRATING MORE PARATRANSIT
5 CONSIDERATIONS AND DEVELOPMENT OF THAT PLAN AND ADDITIONALLY
6 THE ONE THING ALSO TO HIGHLIGHT IS THE IMPORTANCE OF ADVANCED
7 PARATRANSIT ON CLIPPER NEXGEN AND UNDERFUNDING. THESE TWO
8 ACTIONS HERE FOCUS ON BEST USE OF RESOURCES IN CONJUNCTION
9 WITH NEW FUNDS TO BE INCORPORATED ON THE HORIZON. AND SETTING
10 FRAMEWORK FOR ANY FUTURE BALLOT MEASURE. AND THAT SUMMARIZED
11 ALL OF THE ACTIONS AT A REALLY HIGH LEVEL. I'M GOING TO JUST
12 MAYBE SUMMARIZE BY CLOSING OUT THAT, AS THE PLAN HAS BEEN
13 ADOPTED, THE TASK FORCE TEAM APPROVED OF THESE ACTIONS AND AS
14 THIS NEXT STEP, THE PLAN IS AVAILABLE, AND WE ARE PRESENTING
15 THE PLAN TO THE OPS COMMITTEE, MTC'S OPERATIONS COMMITTEE.
16 NEXT SLIDE. BUILDING OFF OF THE MOMENTUM OF THE TASK FORCE
17 ACTIONS AT THEIR FINAL MEETING IN JULY. THESE ARE PLANS, MTC
18 IN SEPTEMBER IS GOING TO CONSIDER SUPPORTING THE ACTIONS IN
19 THIS ACTION PLAN, IT'S FIRST GOING TO THE OPERATION'S
20 COMMITTEE ON FRIDAY WITH THE FULL COMMISSION CONSIDERING
21 ACTION ON THIS, CONSIDERING SUPPORT ACTION ON THIS. AND IN
22 PARALLEL, THE COMMISSION IS ALSO WORKING TO ACT BE ON AN
23 ADVISORY GROUP TO SERVE AS A MULTI-STAKEHOLDER TECHNICAL
24 SOUNDING BOARD FOR THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE
25 ANALYSIS AND SUPPORTS THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT REFORM AND



September 8, 2021

1 PROCEEDING WITH THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE WORK. IN
2 SEPTEMBER WHAT'S ON THE HORIZON, THERE IS TWO PATHS, THE
3 ACTION PLAN IMPLEMENTATION WORK AND DISCUSSION ABOUT DETAILING
4 HOW SOME OF THESE ACTIONS WILL BE IMPLEMENTED. IN OCTOBER, THE
5 COMMISSION WORKSHOP IS PLANNED TO FOCUS ON DISCUSSING AND
6 PROVIDING MORE DETAILED DIRECTION ON KEY ASPECTS FOR HOW TO
7 IMPLEMENT THE PLAN. AND THEN SECONDLY WE WILL ALSO KICK START
8 AND CONVENE THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE WORK. THE
9 COMMISSION IS EXPECTED TO SELECT A CONSULTANT TEAM THAT WILL
10 TAKE THE NEXT STAGE OF THE BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS, AND THE
11 BUSINESS CASE IS ANTICIPATED TO TAKE, AROUND, 8 TO 9 MONTHS.
12 AND, THEN, LASTLY, WE ANTICIPATE ON CONVENING THE FIRST
13 MEETING OF THE BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP. AND I THINK THAT
14 IS THE LAST SLIDE. IN CLOSING, SIGNIFICANT MOMENTUM WAS
15 CREATED BY THE WORK OF THE TASK FORCE, AND THROUGH ALL THESE
16 EFFORTS TASK FORCE WORK IS GOING TO CONTINUE AND WE LOOK
17 FORWARD TO CONTINUING ONGOING DISCUSSIONS ON NETWORK
18 MANAGEMENT.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICK?

21

22 **RICK COATES:** IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT YOU ARE NEGOTIATING
23 THE POLITICAL AND FINANCIAL MINE FIELDS THAT IT REPRESENTS. I
24 AM HAVING SOME COGNITIVE DISSIDENCE TRYING TO GET MY MIND
25 AROUND ALL THE VARIOUS PROGRAMS AND HOW THEY INTEGRATE AND I'M



September 8, 2021

1 WONDERING HOW THIS PROGRAM INTEGRATED WITH PLANNED BAY AREA
2 2050. IS THERE OVERLAP? OR DID THEY INTERDIGITATE? OR JUST HOW
3 DO THEY FUNCTION TOGETHER. AND I WAS WONDERING WHAT THE VIA
4 ARCHITECTURE TEAM WAS? I LOST THAT. I AM WONDERING IF VIA IS A
5 CONSULTANT PERHAPS. THERE IS A PROJECT IN JERSEY CITY CALLED
6 VIA TRANSIT, IT REALLY, SORT OF, WORKS INTO THIS QUESTION OF
7 THE BUS PRIORITY THAT YOU MENTIONED. TRANSFORMATION OF THAT
8 MIGHT MEAN TRANSFORMATION AWAY FROM THE ENTIRE CONCEPT OF BUS
9 ROUTES TO GETTING TO ON DEMAND SERVICE WHICH IS WHAT JERSEY
10 CITY HAS SUCCESSFULLY ADDED AND I WANT TO ENCOURAGE YOU TO
11 RESEARCH THAT IF YOU ARE NOT LEARNED AWARE. IT'S BEEN DONE IN
12 CALIFORNIA IN PLACES LIKE TRUCKEE, AND THEN OUTCOMES, WITH 3
13 AND 4. I HOPE TO SEE THIS IN THE WORK COMING FORWARD.

14

15 **MELANIE CHOY:** WOULD YOU LIKE ME TO ANSWER THAT.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OUR AGENDA IS HUGE TODAY. IF THERE IS ANY
18 PARTICULAR QUESTIONS, PLEASE ASK. AND I'LL ASK STAFF, TO
19 ARTICULATE. GO AHEAD.

20

21 **MELANIE CHOY:** VIA WAS DOING A NETWORK MANAGEMENT EVALUATION
22 WHICH IS BEING FINALIZED IN THE REPORT IT'S NOT PART OF THE
23 DRAFT YET, THE DRAFT IS PART OF THE BLUE RIBBON PACKET THE
24 WORK IS FEEDING INTO THIS NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE AND
25 IS HIGHLIGHTED IN THE PRESENTATION. THERE IS A LINKAGE BETWEEN



September 8, 2021

1 THE PLANNED BAY AREA IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND THIS WORK. I KNOW
2 THAT PLANNED BAY AREA STAFF HAVE LOOKED AT INTEGRATING THE
3 TWO, AND HAVE DONE SOME ADDRESSING AND INCORPORATION OF THESE
4 ACTIONS IN THEIR WORK. BUT, MATT, OR DAVE MIGHT HAVE A LITTLE
5 BIT MORE TO ADD, BUT I WILL BE BRIEF AND END THERE.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE HAVE PLANNED BAY AREA COMING UP, SO
8 THEY CAN ANSWER IT IN THAT SECTION. THANK YOU. ADINA.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IT'S REALLY EXCITING TO
11 SEE ALL OF THE ACTIONS THAT ARE QUEUED UP BASED ON THE HARD
12 AND ROBUST WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. I HAVE THREE
13 COMMENTS ABOUT THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. FIRST OF ALL,
14 THAT IN COVERING TRANSIT TOPICS AROUND THE REGION, I'M SEEING
15 THAT THIS TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IS ALREADY STARTING TO
16 HAVE AN IMPACT WHEN THINGS ARE BROUGHT UP IN TRANSIT PRIORITY
17 AND BUS LANES OR THE ONE MOBILITY ACTION PLAN WHERE WHEN
18 SOMETHING IS COMING UP IN THE DOMAIN OF THESE RECOMMENDATIONS,
19 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IS CITED AS A POSITIVE
20 MOTIVATION TO MOVE FORWARD THAT TO REALLY TAKE THIS KIND OF
21 IMPROVEMENT SERIOUSLY. SO, I AM JUST OBSERVING ON, THIS IS
22 ALREADY HAVING A GOOD IMPACT. SECOND POINT IS WANTING TO BE
23 REALLY SUPPORTIVE OF THE SERVICE VISION FOR BUS AND RAIL,
24 HAVING FUNDING BEING SEEN AS AN IMPORTANT FACTOR, HAVING A
25 SERVICE VISION IS SOMETHING THAT'S REALLY HELPFUL IN TERMS OF



September 8, 2021

1 INSPIRING THE PUBLIC AS TO WHAT THEY WOULD VOTE FOR. HAVING
2 WORKED, FOR EXAMPLE, ON, YOU KNOW, MEASURE RR FOR CALTRAIN,
3 AND THE FACT THAT THERE WAS A BUSINESS PLAN AND A SERVICE
4 VISION WAS REALLY INSPIRING TO VOTERS. SO FOR THE SAME THING,
5 HAVING A SERVICE VISION IS SOMETHING THAT WILL BE HELPFUL FOR
6 THE REGION OVERALL, AND IN PART, IN TERMS OF BRINGING SUPPORT
7 FOR FUNDING. AND SPEAKING OF FUNDING, ON THE SLIDE THAT HAD
8 THE TIMELINE, ONE CONCERN THAT I HAD IS THAT IT TALKED ABOUT
9 CONVENING STAKEHOLDERS TO DISCUSS A PORTABLE FUNDING MEASURE
10 LATER IN 2023 FOR A BALLOT MEASURE IN 2024. AND HAVING WORKED
11 ON COUNTY LEVEL BALLOT MEASURES THAT HAVE PUBLIC MULTI-
12 STAKEHOLDER PROCESS, STARTING IN LATE 2023, IS EXTREMELY LATE.
13 THAT WOULD BE AN APPROPRIATE TIME FRAME IF THE MEASURE WAS
14 DEVELOPED USING THE KIND OF OLD SCHOOL MANNER OF HAVING
15 EVERYTHING WORKED OUT BEHIND THE SCENES, AND THEN HAVING A
16 SERIES OF PRESENTATIONS ABOUT WHAT THE MEASURE ACTUALLY WILL
17 BE. BUT, IF WE ACTUALLY WANT MULTIPLE STAKEHOLDERS FROM AROUND
18 THE REGION TO GIVE FEEDBACK ON WHAT A MEASURE SHOULD BE, AND
19 TO BUILD SUPPORT, THAT WOULD REALLY NEED TO SUPPORT -- TO
20 START MUCH EARLIER AND RECOMMEND THAT STAFF LOOK AT THE
21 TIMELINES FOR THINGS INCLUDING MEASURE B IN SANTA CLARA
22 COUNTY, AND MEASURE W IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, WHICH WAS GOOD, BUT
23 IN ITSELF STARTED LATE, AND TO REALLY THINK ABOUT AN
24 APPROPRIATE TIMELINE THAT WOULD START SIGNIFICANTLY EARLIER
25 THAN 2023. THANK YOU.



September 8, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. FRANK WELTE, AND THEN CARLOS?

3

4 **FRANK WELTE:** FIRST, I WANT TO COMMEND YOU ALL FOR THE
5 EXCELLENT RECOMMENDATIONS THAT YOU HAVE REGARDING IMPROVEMENTS
6 TO PARATRANSIT. THOSE ARE GREAT IDEAS, AND I HOPE THEY CAN BE
7 IMPLEMENTED AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. HOWEVER, THERE IS MUCH
8 MORE TO TRANSIT ACCESS THAN PARATRANSIT THAT, AS IMPROVING
9 ACCESSIBILITY ON THE FIXED ROUTE SYSTEM, IMPROVING ACCESS TO
10 AND FROM BUS STOPS AND TRAIN STATIONS, AND PROVIDING MORE
11 ACCESSIBLE TRANSIT INFORMATION TO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES.
12 YOU CAN ELABORATE ON WHAT THE PLAN HAS TO SAY ABOUT THOSE
13 AREAS OF ACCESS BEYOND PARATRANSIT?

14

15 **MELANIE CHOY:** I'LL JUST BE REALLY QUICK ON THAT. THERE IS ONE
16 ACTION ON THERE THAT IS INTENDED TO FOCUS ON MOBILITY
17 MANAGEMENT, WHICH CAPTURES, I THINK, HOLISTICALLY, MANY OF THE
18 ASPECTS OF WHAT YOU HAVE RAISED, THAT WAS THE INTENT OF THE
19 FIRST ACTION, AND BRANDON SHELTON HAS BEEN INSTRUMENTAL IN
20 HELPING US TRY TO CRAFT THAT ACTION THAT WOULD ADDRESS SOME OF
21 THOSE, AND I THINK THROUGH THE POINT OF YOUR PLAN, THAT COULD
22 ALSO COME UP AND BE EXPANDED OR DELVED INTO, OR DETAILED
23 FURTHER, WHICH IS HAPPENING CURRENTLY, AND HAPPENING NOW.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CARLOS?



September 8, 2021

1

2 **CARLOS CASTELLANOS:** THANK YOU MELANIE AND STAFF, THIS ENDEAVOR
3 THAT'S DONE, I REALLY COMMEND YOU. I WANT TO BRING UP, JUST
4 ONE THING YOU MENTIONED, AND I APPRECIATE YOU MENTIONING IT IS
5 -- AND I WOULD LIKE TO FOCUS ON HOPEFULLY THIS CONNECTIVITY
6 AND HAVING FREQUENCY OF ACCESS TO TRANSIT ALSO CONTINUES INTO
7 THE OFF PEAK TIMES IN FREQUENCY, AND EVEN MENTIONING PRIOR TO
8 THE PANDEMIC THERE WAS ALREADY DROP OFF, I THINK I REMEMBER,
9 IN OFF-PEAK TIME, FOR MANY REASONS, MAYBE YOU ADDRESSED
10 OUTSIDE CONTROL WHETHER IT WAS COMPETITION WITH RIDE HAILING,
11 WHETHER IT WAS SAFETY AND HOMELESSNESS AND A LOT OF OTHER
12 ISSUES THAT WERE GOING ON, AND I'M HOPING THAT TRANSIT
13 AGENCIES WILL LOOK AT HOW TO ENCOURAGE RIDERS -- BECAUSE THERE
14 IS A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO DO RELY ON THAT EVENING OFF-PEAK TIME
15 TO GET AROUND, SO JUST WANTED TO MENTION THAT. THANKS.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
20 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
21 ON THIS ITEM.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MELANIE, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
24 FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING, THIS WAS A LOT OF
25 WORK DONE IN A VERY SHORT AMOUNT OF TIME. SO I AM COMPLETELY



September 8, 2021

1 PLEASED TO SEE THIS COLLATED IN A MANNER OF SMALLER CHUNKS
2 THAT YOU CAN LOOK AT AND ACTUALLY DIGEST. IN MY CONVERSATIONS
3 WITH STAFF, I SEE THIS IS GOING TO CREATE A LOT OF DIFFERENT
4 AVENUES OF WORK TO BE DONE IN ORDER TO GET THIS GOING. THERE
5 IS GOING TO BE A LOT ARE LITTLE PIES FOR US TO GET OUR FINGERS
6 N AND I REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO THAT. THANK YOU MELANIE. I SEE
7 RICH HEDGES WITH HIS HAND UP, AND THAT WILL BE THE LAST
8 PERSON.

9

10 **RICHARD HEDGES:** JUST A QUICK QUESTION. I TRIED TO FIND THE
11 PRESENTATION AND IT WASN'T AVAILABLE. SO IF WE CAN PUT THE
12 MEETING IN AN ATTACHMENT.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RICH IF YOU COULD CONTACT ME OFFLINE IT
15 IS THERE AND IN THE OPS PACKET, SO WE CAN FIGURE OUT WHAT'S
16 GOING ON WITH YOUR COMPUTER.

17

18 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** NEXT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN PARTNERSHIP AND
21 FINAL STEPS I SEE CHIRAG AND DAVE HERE. WHO IS GOING TO TAKE
22 IT AWAY?

23

24 **CHIRAG RABARI:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE MY NAME IS CHIRAG
25 RABARI FROM THE REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM AND I SERVE AS THE



September 8, 2021

1 PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION
2 PLAN. IN TODAY'S PRESENTATION WE'RE GOING TO PROVIDE A RECAP
3 OF IMPORTANT FINDINGS FROM THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN PARTNERSHIP
4 PHASE WHICH TOOK PLACE OVER THE SUMMER AS WELL AS REVIEW KEY
5 REVISIONS THAT HAVE BEEN PROPOSED FOR THE FINAL IMPLEMENTATION
6 PLAN. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WE'RE GETTING VERY CLOSE TO THE
7 END OF WHAT WILL HAVE BEEN ROUGHLY A YEAR-LONG PROCESS IN
8 TERMS OF THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN DEVELOPMENT. AND THIS WILL BE
9 THE FOURTH AND FINAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN SPECIFIC ITEM THAT WE
10 HAVE BROUGHT TO COMMITTEES AND ADVISORY GROUPS SINCE LAST
11 NOVEMBER. LAST NOVEMBER, WE PROVIDED AN OVERVIEW OF THE GOALS
12 AND OBJECTIVES AND PROCESS FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN
13 DEVELOPMENT. IN FEBRUARY WE PROVIDED A RECAP OF WHAT WE HAVE
14 HEARD FROM PARTNERS AND OUTREACH FROM OUR STRATEGY ASSESSMENT
15 AND IMPLEMENTATION ROLE RECOMMENDATIONS IN MARCH WE PROVIDED A
16 PREVIEW OF DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN INCLUDING KEY PROPOSED
17 IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS FOR EACH ELEMENT AND TODAY WE'RE GOING
18 TO PROVIDE A PREVIEW OF THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IN
19 ANTICIPATION OF PLAN RELEASE AND ADOPTION NEXT MONTH. NEXT
20 SLIDE. THE PURPOSE OF THE PARTNERSHIP PHASE WAS TO EXPAND THE
21 PLAN'S IMPLEMENTATION FOCUS BEYOND MTC AND ABAG AND IDENTIFY
22 THE PARTNERS WE'LL NEED TO COLLABORATE WITH TO SUPPORT
23 STRATEGY IMPLEMENTATION AS WELL AS CAPTURE ACTIVITY THAT'S
24 ALREADY HAPPENING ACROSS THE REGION WHERE EXISTING PARTNER LED
25 EFFORTS COMPLIMENT THE PLAN'S GOALS AND STRATEGIES KEY



September 8, 2021

1 ELEMENTS OF THE PARTNERSHIP PHASE INCLUDE A VIRTUAL WORKSHOP
2 IN JULY WHICH INCLUDED 70 ATTENDEES FROM NEARLY 50
3 ORGANIZATIONS ACROSS A DIVERSE RANGE OF SECTORS WE ALSO HAVE
4 THE FORTUNATELY COMMENT PERIOD WHICH WRAPPED UP IN JULY -- --
5 AND THE HUNDREDS OF COMMENTS RECEIVED IN THE DRAFT PLAN AND
6 DRAFT EIR THERE WERE 40 THAT INCLUDED SPECIFIC FEEDBACK ON THE
7 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. WE HAD ONE-ON-ONES AND SMALL GROUP
8 FOCUSED DISCUSSIONS HELD ON AN ONGOING BASIS WITH THE DRAFT
9 PLAN RELEASE BUT I WANT TO SPECIFICALLY CALL OUT THAT WE HELD
10 VIRTUAL OFFICE HOURS FROM LATE JULY AND AUGUST, 30 PLUS
11 MEETINGS WITH 90 ATTENDEES. WE HAD A WEBINAR Q&A LAST MONTH
12 WHICH DREW 200 ATTENDEES AND ALSO HAVE BEEN MEETING INTERNALLY
13 WITHIN THE AGENCY'S TRYING TO SUPPORT CROSS-SECTIONAL
14 COLLABORATION ABOUT THE RESOURCES PRIORITIES, ROLE
15 RESPONSIBILITY, AND PROPOSED IMPLEMENTATION ACTIVITIES. ALL OF
16 THAT FEEDBACK WILL INFORM THE FINAL PLAN TO BE CONSIDERED FOR
17 OPTION IN OCTOBER. AND WE RECEIVED INPUT ON THE OVERALL PLAN
18 STRATEGIES THERE IT WERE REQUESTS FOR REVISION CLARIFICATIONS
19 ON THE TRANSPORTATION AND ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN
20 VERSUS HOUSING AND ECONOMY ELEMENTS. WE HAVE DRAFT VERSIONS OF
21 THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN BRIEFS WHICH PROVIDE 122 PAGE
22 SUMMARIES OF EACH PLAN STRATEGIES AND REVIEW CONSIDERATION AND
23 A HAND OUT WAS DISTRIBUTED. YOU WILL BE ABLE TO SEE PROPOSED
24 ACTION VISIONS AND ADDITIONAL IMPLEMENTATION CONSIDERATIONS
25 AND STRATEGY SPECIFIC PARTNERSHIP DETAILS INCLUDING SELECTED



September 8, 2021

1 HIGHLIGHTED ISSUES. THE PRESENTATION TODAY WILL FOCUS ON FIVE
2 SELECT TOPIC AREAS WHERE WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT HOW THE
3 PARTNERSHIP PHASED IN REFORM AND PROPOSED REVISIONS INCLUDING
4 SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK
5 FORCE WORKFORCE NEEDS AND DEVELOPMENT NEEDS AND OPPORTUNITIES
6 HOUSING ANTIDISPLACEMENT AS WELL AS TRACKING PROGRESS IN THE
7 PLAN. NEXT PLAN. IN RESPONSE TO FEEDBACK WE HEARD FROM PARTNER
8 AGENCIES, ENVIRONMENTAL STAKEHOLDERS AS WELL AS REGIONAL
9 POLICY MAKERS, WE ARE PROPOSING TO CHANGE THE MTC ABAG
10 IMPLEMENTATION ROLE FROM LEAD TO PARTNER. THIS IS AN AREA OF
11 WORK THAT A LOT OF WORK HAS BEEN DONE AND WE THINK THIS WILL
12 REFLECT THE MULTI-DISCIPLINARY NATURE OF THIS WORK AND THE
13 BROAD RANGE OF PARTNER LED EFFORTS ACROSS MANY DIFFERENT
14 SECTORS. CONSISTENT WITH THE SUPPORTIVE BAY ADAPT JOINT
15 PLATFORM WHICH WAS A BCDC LED VOLUNTARY COLLABORATIVE
16 INITIATIVES WHICH SOUGHT TO ESTABLISH A REGIONAL AGREEMENT ON
17 ACTIONS NEEDED TO PROTECT THE BAY AREA, AND FINAL MUTATION
18 PLAN HIGHLIGHTED INTERNAL PARTNERS INCLUDING BAY AREA REGIONAL
19 COLLABORATIVE AND LEGISLATION REFORM AS WELL AS SAN FRANCISCO
20 PARTNERSHIP IN PRIORITIZING SOLUTIONS TO HELP US ADAPT TO SEA
21 LEVEL RISE, AND INCLUDING MTC'S HIGHLIGHTS ON KEY EFFORTS WITH
22 CALTRANS. IN THE TRANSPORTATION REALM ONE OF THE THINGS THAT
23 WE HEARD WAS THE NEED TO IDENTIFY MORE CLEARLY THE
24 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN
25 AND THE WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE AS



September 8, 2021

1 YOU HEARD IN THE PRIOR PRESENTATION THE TASK FORCE RELEASED
2 THEIR TRAPS FORMATION ACTION PLAN WHICH CONTAINED THE 27
3 PRESENTATIONS IN A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT AREAS INCLUDING FARES
4 AND PAYMENT CUSTOMER INFORMATION TRANSIT NETWORK ACCESSIBILITY
5 AND FUNDING CIRCLE WITH FINAL PERMUTATION. THE WORK FITS INTO
6 THE SCOPE OF THE STRATEGIES AND THE IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS
7 THAT WE HAVE PROPOSED AND AT A HIGH LEVEL THE RECOMMENDATIONS
8 OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE NEST AROUND
9 EXISTING THEMES AND STRATEGY IN THE PLAN, PARTICULARLY
10 STRATEGIES SUCH AS ENABLING A SEAMLESS MOBILITY EXPERIENCE
11 REFORMING REGIONAL FARE POLICY ENHANCING LOCAL TRANSIT
12 FREQUENCY AND RELIABILITY AND EXPANDING MODERNIZING REGIONAL
13 RAIL NETWORK. FROM THE ECONOMY ELEMENT WE HEARD FROM A RANGE
14 OF STAKEHOLDERS ON CONCERNS RELATED TO WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT
15 WE HEARD NEED TO ENSURE AN ADEQUATELY SIZED AND SKILLED
16 CONSTRUCTION WORK FOR US TO SUPPORT THE PLAN'S AMBITIOUS
17 HOUSING TRANSPORTATION AND RESILIENCE INFRASTRUCTURE AND
18 CONSTRUCTION GOALS FROM OUR BUSINESS PARTNERS WE HEARD ABOUT
19 STAFFING SHORTAGES, SKILLS GAPS, MISMATCHES AND GENERAL IN
20 CHALLENGING LABOR MARKET CONDITIONS AND ARE CONTINUING AS THE
21 PANDEMIC REMAINS WITH US TO ADDRESS THIS. WE WANT TO ADDRESS
22 THE IMPORTANCE OF APPRENTICESHIP OPPORTUNITIES AND HIGH ROAD
23 CAREER OPPORTUNITIES INCLUDING THROUGH CONSTRUCTION THROUGH
24 REGIONAL ADVOCACY EFFORTS, AND WE WANT TO PARTNER WITH
25 STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING REGIONAL BUSINESS, EDUCATION, AND



September 8, 2021

1 OTHERS ON SUPPLYING WORKFORCE TO THE REGION AND MEGA REGION.
2 ON THE HOUSING FRONT WE IN ORDER HOUSING AND EQUITY ADVOCATES
3 ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF DISPLACEMENT EFFORTS AND MANY OF THE
4 GOOD NEWS WHICH CAME OUT MOST RECENTLY FROM THE CALIFORNIA
5 STATE BUDGET THERE WAS \$20 MILLION ALLOCATIONS TO HELP STAND
6 UP THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY AND BAHFA. THIS IS
7 GOING TO HELP DELIVER SEVERAL PILOT PROJECTS WHICH WAS
8 INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. THE FINAL
9 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IS ABLE TO PROVIDE MORE CLARITY ABOUT THE
10 ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES AND TIMELINE. ACTION LAUNCH PILOT
11 DEVELOPMENT PROJECT STANDARDIZE BEST PRACTICES FOR TENANT
12 PROTECTION PROGRAMS AS WELL AS WORKING OUT POTENTIAL REGIONAL
13 SCALE ANTIDISPLACEMENT PROGRAMS. FINALLY WE HEARD FROM MANY
14 PARTNERS TO TRACK PROGRESS AND SUPPORT ACCOUNTABILITY ONCE WE
15 TRANSITION TO THE STRATEGY LATER THIS YEAR. THIS IS IMPORTANT
16 BECAUSE THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD OVERSIGHT OF OUR
17 PROGRESS ACHIEVING AGGRESSIVE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS
18 REDUCTION ON TARGETS. I THINK THE BAHFA AND THE BLUE RIBBON
19 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE EXAMPLES FROM EARLIER EMPHASIZE
20 THE EXTENT TO WHICH THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IS GOING TO BE A
21 LIVING DOCUMENT AND AS TIME MOVES ON THERE ARE GOING TO BE
22 INTENT AND EXTERNAL TO SUPPORT OUR IMPLEMENTATION GOALS AND
23 UPDATES WILL REFLECT THIS. WE ARE HELPING TO BUILDING VITAL
24 SIGNS OUR REGIONAL PERFORMANCE MONITORING INITIATIVE AS A
25 MEANS TO SUPPORT PERFORMANCE AND TRACKING TO ENGAGE THE



September 8, 2021

1 PROCESS ACTIONS THAT SUPPORT MULTIPLE STRATEGIES AND ELEMENTS
2 OF THE PLAN. WE'RE GOING TO BE PURSUING TO UPDATE THE
3 FRAMEWORK AND MODELING TO IDENTIFY EQUITY COMMUNITIES. NEXT
4 SLIDE. OVERALL ACROSS MANY OF THE DIFFERENT PHASES OF
5 PARTNERSHIP DEVELOPMENTS WE SAW 45 DISTINCT PARTNERS OFFERING
6 POTENTIAL COMMITMENTS TO ADVANCE IMPLEMENTATION OVER THE NEXT
7 1 TO FIVE YEARS IN THE PLAN STRATEGIES, DEDICATION OF OUR
8 PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS AND PUBLIC SHOWN THROUGHOUT THE FOUR
9 YEAR PLANNING PROCESS, AND COLLABORATION AS WE MOVE FORWARD
10 WITH THE SPECIFIC ACTIVITIES IN THE PLAN WHETHER ADVOCACY,
11 INITIATIVES, SPECIFIC PROJECTS AND PLANNING INITIATIVES. I'M
12 GOING TO HAND IT OVER TO DAVE VAUTIN WHO WILL GO OVER THE
13 FINAL STEPS. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS. BEFORE WE WRAP UP TODAY'S
14 PRESENTATION I'M GOING TO PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF THE REMAINING
15 STEPS OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS AHEAD OF THE JOINT
16 COMMISSION ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING SLATED FOR NEXT MONTH.
17 WE ARE EXCITED TO ANNOUNCE THAT WE HAVE SET A DATE, IT WILL BE
18 HELD OCTOBER 21ST AT 5:00 P.M. THIS MONTH'S PREVIEW OF THE
19 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN PROVIDES EARLY OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW
20 FEEDBACK WE RECEIVED OVER THE COURSE OF THE SUMMER AND
21 INTEGRATION OF THE FINAL PRODUCT. WE WANT TO SHARE THE
22 COMPONENTS OF THE IMPLEMENTATION THIS MONTH BECAUSE MANY OF
23 THE SUBSTANTIVE CHANGES BETWEEN MAY 2021 DRAFT PLAN AND BAY
24 AREA NEXT MONTH'S FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ARE SITUATED IN
25 THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN SIZE. OTHER ADDITIONS INCLUDING THE



September 8, 2021

1 FUNERAL PLAN DOCUMENT AND EIR WE WILL SEE A SMALLER SCALE
2 UPDATE BASED ON THE FEEDBACK RECEIVED DURING THE OFFICIAL
3 PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD IN GROUP AND JULY, COMMENTS RECEIVED
4 HAVE BEEN THE PRIMARY FOCUS OF OUR TEAM OVER THE COURSE OF
5 SUMMER AND REVISIONS WHERE APPROPRIATE TO THE PLAN DOCUMENT
6 AND SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS AND ENVIRONMENT IMPACTS REPRESENT.
7 ALL COMMENTS WILL BE RESPONDED TO IN THE FINAL EIR WHEREAS
8 NON-EIR COMMENTS ARE BEING RESPONDED TO ON A ROLLING BASIS.
9 THERE IS A LOT GOING ON THIS SLIDE IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA
10 2050 PROCESS. ANTICIPATION CONSTITUTES THE FINAL PLAN DOCUMENT
11 IMPLEMENTATION SUPPLEMENT WILL BE RELEASED NO LATER THAN THE
12 WEEK OF OCTOBER 4TH. WE WILL CONDUCT A SERIES OF FINAL
13 PRESENTATIONS TO STAKEHOLDERS, THE PUBLIC, INCLUDING REGIONAL
14 ADVISORY GROUP, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND ABAG PLANNING
15 COMMITTEE THESE PRESENTATIONS WILL BE IMPLEMENTED IN THE DRAFT
16 AND FINAL PLAN AND CONTINUE TO PIVOT FROM THE LONG RANGE PLAN
17 TO NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. WE ANTICIPATE GETTING
18 STARTED ON AN INITIAL SET OF THE INITIATIVES REFLECTED IN THE
19 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AS WE MOVE INTO EARLY 2022. AFTER THOSE
20 INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATIONS WE'LL BRING FORWARD FINAL PLANNED
21 BAY AREA 2050 ACTION TO THE JOINT PLANNING AND ADMIN COMMITTEE
22 WE WILL BE REQUESTING THEY ADVANCE THE PLAN TO THE JOINT
23 COMMISSION AND BOARD MEMBER ON THE 21ST OF OCTOBER. SHOULD THE
24 FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BE ADOPTED BY MTC AND ABAG IN
25 OCTOBER OUR TEAM WILL WORK WITH THE FEDERAL STATE PARTNERS AT



September 8, 2021

1 THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION AND FEDERAL TRANSIT
2 ADMINISTRATION CALTRANS CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD AND
3 OTHER ENTITIES TO SECURE THEIR APPROVAL IN FALL OF 2021 AND
4 WINTER OF 2022. OCTOBER WILL BE A VERY BUSY MONTH AS WE MOVE
5 FORWARD TO COMPLETION OF THIS NEARLY FOUR YEAR LONG PLANNING
6 PROCESS FOR TRANSPORTATION HOUSING ECONOMY AND THE
7 ENVIRONMENT. I WANT TO ECHO CHIRAG'S COMMENTS ON THE
8 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN YOUR CONTINUED ENGAGEMENT OVER THE PAST
9 FEW YEARS. AND NOW WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** PLEASE GO AHEAD AND HIT THE RACE HAND
12 FEATURE. VEDA, GO AHEAD.

13

14 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANKS DAVE. I ALSO WANT TO THANK YOUR COWORKER -
15 - AND I'M GOING TO MESS UP HIS NAME, CHEUNG, AND I WANT TO SAY
16 THANK YOU FOR THE WORK YOU HAVE DONE OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS
17 TO BRING THIS TOGETHER. AS WE MOVE FORWARD I'M GOING TO ASK
18 YOU TO LOOK INTO YOUR CRYSTAL BALL, WHAT DO YOU SEE AS THE
19 FIRST STEPS ONCE THIS PLAN HAS BEEN ADOPTED, WHAT DO YOU SEE
20 AS FIRST STEPS YOU WILL TAKE, AND PLEASE BE BRIEF. >DAVE

21 VAUTIN: THERE ARE A WHOLE SERIES OF ONGOING INITIATIVES AT MTC
22 AND ABAG THAT IT WILL BE CONTINUING AND ONGOING OVER TIME, THE
23 ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROM WILL BE CONTINUING, THE BLUE RIBBON
24 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE IMPLEMENTATION WORK THERE IS WORK
25 WE'RE DOING IN THE HOUSING SPACE AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND



September 8, 2021

1 STUFF ALL OF THOSE ARE EXPECTED TO CONTINUE TO GROW IN THE
2 NEXT FEW YEARS. IN TERMS OF INITIATIVES WE ANTICIPATE STUDIES
3 KICKING OFF IN 2022, LOOKING AT THE FREEWAYS STUDY LOOKING AT
4 THE PRICING STRATEGY AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WORKING TO MOVE
5 THAT FORWARD THROUGH DEEP COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND LOOKING AT
6 THOSE MAJOR LEVEL RISE AND CONSERVATION SPACES THAT HAVE BEEN
7 IDENTIFIED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN THERE'S A LONG LIST OF
8 ACTIONS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN BUT WE DO HAVE SEVERAL
9 WHERE WE HAD TO JUMP RIGHT IN AT THE BEGINNING OF 2022.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** FRANK WELT?

12

13 **FRANK WELTE:** FRANK WELTE HERE. I NOTICED AS I WAS GOING
14 THROUGH BOTH PLANS, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AS WELL AS THE
15 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, THERE WERE REPEATED REFERENCES TO THE
16 PLAN FOCUSED ON THREE GROUPS IN PARTICULAR, MARGINALIZED
17 GROUPS, ECONOMICALLY DISADVANTAGED GROUPS AND PEOPLE WITH
18 DISABILITIES. AND I WAS PLEASED TO SEE THAT THE PLAN HAD
19 NUMEROUS VERY EXCITING RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ADDRESSING ISSUES
20 FOR THE FIRST TWO OF THOSE GROUPS, BUT THE THIRD GROUP WAS
21 LARGELY IGNORED. I WANT TO GIVE SOME EXAMPLES OF THAT AND I
22 WOULD LIKE TO SEE ALL OF YOUR COMMENTS ON THAT. THE COUNSELING
23 SECTION WHICH HAD RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ADDRESSING HOUSING
24 ISSUES WAS SILENT ON SPECIFIC ISSUES OF PEOPLE WITH
25 DISABILITIES. THERE IS A CONSIDERABLE SHORTAGE OF WHEELCHAIR



September 8, 2021

1 ACCESSIBLE HOUSING UNIT, AND THAT WAS NOT ADDRESSED IN THE
2 PLAN. IN THE AREA OF EMPLOYMENT AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY,
3 THERE WERE A LOT OF GREAT RECOMMENDATIONS IN TERMS OF
4 CONNECTING UP PEOPLE WITH JOBS, BRING BEING ECONOMIC
5 OPPORTUNITY TO ECONOMICALLY DEPRESSED AREAS, BUT EVEN THOUGH
6 THE DISABILITY UNEMPLOYMENT RATE IS 70 PERCENT, WHICH IS
7 PROBABLY THE SINGLE HIGHEST UNEMPLOYMENT RATE OF THE SEGMENT
8 OF THE BAY AREA POPULATION THERE WERE NO SPECIFIC
9 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR BRIDGING THAT GAP IN THE PLAN AND IT'S
10 CLEAR THAT GIVEN UNEMPLOYMENT RATES FOR PEOPLE WITH
11 DISABILITIES HAVE NOT BEEN IMPROVED OVER THE 30 YEARS SINCE
12 THE INFORMATION OF THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT, I
13 EXPECT THESE PLANS SUCH AS THIS ONE ARE VERY EXPLICIT IN
14 COMING UP WITH CREATIVE SOLUTIONS TO THE DISABILITY PROBLEM
15 THAT WILL BE LOOKING AT 70% UNEMPLOYMENT RATE IN 2050 HOW MUCH
16 ACCESSIBILITY TO TRANSPORTATION AS WELL AS TO THE BUILT
17 ENVIRONMENT THAT PREVENTS US FROM ACCESSING THOSE
18 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANK YOU FOR YOUR
19 QUESTION. WE DEFINITELY RECOGNIZE AS WE'RE REFINING THE FINAL
20 PLAN DOCUMENT THAT WE NEED TO HAVE A GREATER RECOGNITION AND
21 CALL OUT OF THE NEEDS OF FOLKS WITH DISABILITY. SO I WOULD
22 POINT OUT THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS ALIGNED WITH THE
23 COORDINATED TRANSPORTATION HUMAN SERVICES PLAN WHICH IS A
24 PARALLEL EFFORT THAT MTC ENGAGES IN AND LOOKS AT THE MOBILITY
25 NEEDS OF A WIDE VARIETY OF FOLKS INCLUDING THOSE OF LOW-



September 8, 2021

1 INCOME, SENIORS WITH DISABILITIES, AND VETERANS THERE IS A
2 NEXUS WITH SEVERAL PLAN STRATEGIES INCLUDING ROADWAY SAFETY
3 TRANSIT FARE REFORM ET CETERA, BUT WE RECOGNIZE THE FEEDBACK
4 PROVIDED AND WE ARE LOOKING AT WAYS OF BRINGING THAT FORWARD
5 IN THE BEGINNING OF OCTOBER, AND LOOKING TO TOUCH THOSE TOPICS
6 SIGNIFICANTLY IN THE FINAL.

7

8 **FRANK WELTE:** THANK YOU. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** HI THERE. SO I HAVE A QUESTION AND A COMMENT
13 ABOUT THE POSITIVE INTERSECTION BETWEEN THE IMPLEMENTATION
14 PLAN AND THE RECOMMENDATION THAT IS COMING FORWARD FOR THE
15 FARE INTEGRATION -- FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY.
16 SO, IN PARTICULAR THE POTENTIAL FOR A GO ANYWHERE TRANSIT PASS
17 IS SOMETHING THAT COULD BE VERY POSITIVELY RELATED TO THE
18 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS IN PLANNED
19 BAY AREA WHERE EMPLOYERS, HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS, EDUCATIONAL
20 INSTITUTIONS, AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS COULD POTENTIALLY BE
21 PARTNERS ON A STRATEGY TO MAKE USE OF THIS GO ANYWHERE TRANSIT
22 PASS TO INCREASE TRANSIT USE AND THAT ALSO OPENS UP THE
23 POTENTIAL FOR ADDITIONAL SOURCES OF FUNDING I SHOULD ALSO
24 MENTION CITIES AND TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATIONS THAT
25 ARE ALSO INTERESTED IN REDUCING CAR TRAFFIC AND THAT, SORT OF,



September 8, 2021

1 GO ANYWHERE TRANSIT PASS. THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO OPEN UP THE
2 DOOR TO ADDITIONAL RESOURCES OF FUNDING AND TO ADDITIONAL
3 PARTNERS. THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THAT STUDY, THE DETAILS ARE
4 GOING TO BE OUT TOMORROW, SO IT WAS A LITTLE BIT EARLY TO MAKE
5 THAT RECOMMENDATION, IT SEEMED LIKE, WHEN -- AND I'M WONDERING
6 IF IT IS NOW TOO LATE TO MAKE THAT RECOMMENDATION, OR WHETHER
7 BECAUSE THAT RECOMMENDATION IS GOING TO SURFACE ON FRIDAY,
8 WHETHER IT'S NOT TOO LATE TO RECOMMEND WEAVING IN, THE TRANSIT
9 PASS WITH STRATEGIES AND ALL POTENTIAL PARTNERS THAT FACTOR IN
10 TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF IT?

11

12 **CHIRAG RABARI:** I'M NOT SURE WHAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE GO
13 ANYWHERE TRANSIT PASS ARE GOING TO BE BUT I WOULD LOVE TO TAKE
14 A LOOK AT IT. THERE'S A POINT WHERE WE WILL HAVE TO KIND OF
15 CALL TIME ON WHAT WE ARE PUTTING INTO THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN,
16 BUT I THINK, YOU KNOW, WHAT I WAS TRYING TO RAISE EARLIER THAT
17 WE DO SEE THIS AS A LIVING DOCUMENT, AND WE DO SEE THAT THERE
18 WILL BE OPPORTUNITIES TO, SORT OF, COME BACK EVERY YEAR TO
19 TRACK THE INITIATIVES THAT ARE HAPPENING, AND CONTINUALLY,
20 SORT OF, CALIBRATE THE ACTIONS THAT ARE BEING TACKLE. I THINK,
21 SPECIFICALLY WITH RESPECT TO TDM, ONE OF THE KEY ACTIONS THAT
22 HAS BEEN PROPOSED FOR THE FINAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, WITH
23 REALLY TRYING TO COORDINATE SOME OF OUR EXISTING OPERATIONAL
24 TDM PROGRAMS TO SUPPORT, SORT OF, A SHARED REGIONAL VISION FOR
25 IT. DM, AND REALLY WORKING TO CONVENE, YOU KNOW, OUR PARTNERS



September 8, 2021

1 ACROSS THE REGION, AND I THINK, YOU KNOW, AS PART OF THAT
2 EFFORT, I THINK IT WOULD CERTAINLY MAKE SENSE FOR US AS STAFF,
3 TO BE MINDFUL OF EFFORTS SUCH AS THE ONE THAT YOU'RE RAISING
4 AND REALLY BRING THAT TO THE TABLE ALONG WITH -- I'M SURE, A
5 HOST OF OTHER IDEAS WHERE WE COULD TRY TO HAVE A SHARED
6 REGIONAL VISION AROUND TDM AND PURSUE IT IN A MORE EFFECTIVE
7 AND EFFICIENT WAY.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** A KEY PIECE ABOUT WHAT THAT RECOMMENDATION IS
10 GOING TO BE IS GOING TO LAND ON OR BEFORE FRIDAY. SO, IF THAT
11 RECOMMENDATION IS IN LINE WITH WHAT IT WAS PROPOSED TO BE IN
12 THE POLITICAL RECOMMENDATIONS IN EARLY AUGUST, YOU KNOW, WOULD
13 IT BE HELPFUL TO HAVE A LETTER THAT DRAWS THOSE CONNECTIONS?
14 YOU KNOW, VERY SWIFTLY AFTER THAT STAFF REPORT MEETING ON THE
15 10TH LANDS?

16

17 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH. WE CAN DEFINITELY TAKE A LOOK AND FOLLOW
18 UP AS TO WHAT AN APPROPRIATION WILL BE FOR THE FINAL
19 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY MORE COMMENTS OR
24 QUESTIONS FROM THE COUNCIL? IF NOT, ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS OR
25 QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?



September 8, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
3 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. TIM FRANK, DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK ON
4 THIS ITEM? THIS IS THE PLANNED BAY AREA ITEM. I DON'T SEE YOUR
5 HAND RAISED. I'LL TAKE THAT AS A NO. OH, THERE IT IS. OKAY.
6 TIM, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I WANTED TO -- I'M REPRESENTING, TODAY, THE BUILDING
9 AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCILS FROM THE NINE COUNTIES OF THE
10 BAY AREA, AND I WANTED TO FIRST THANK THE STAFF FOR THE
11 REVISIONS TO THE EC2 WHICH WE BELIEVE TO BE HEADING IN THE
12 RIGHT DIRECTION, I HAD A FEW ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDED CHANGES
13 THAT I THINK WOULD BRING IT AROUND TO WHERE IT NEEDS TO BE.
14 I'LL JUST RUN THROUGH THOSE QUICKLY. TO START WITH, THE
15 STRATEGY ITSELF, EC2 WOULD BE TO ENHANCE CONSTRUCTION
16 WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT CONNECTED TO PUBLIC WORKS AND EXPAND
17 INCUBATOR PROGRAMS IN THE SECOND BULLET YOU HAVE GOT THERE.
18 YOUR CURRENT SLIDE DIDN'T HAVE A STRATEGY OBJECTIVE OR
19 STRATEGY DESCRIPTION IN PREVIOUS ITERATIONS OF THE PLAN YOU
20 ACTUALLY HAD THOSE SO I HAVE SOME PREPARED TEXT REGARDING
21 THOSE TOO, THE STRATEGY OBJECTIVE WOULD BE PREPARE WORKERS FOR
22 CREATE MIDDLE WAGE CONSTRUCTION CAREER PASS CONNECTED TO
23 PUBLIC WORK AND CREATE NEW SMALL BUSINESS COMMUNITIES WITH
24 MORE LIMITED EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES AND THE STAGING
25 DESCRIPTION WOULD BE EQUIVALENT UNION SPONSORED



September 8, 2021

1 PREAPPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMS AND WORK WITH UNIONS TO DEVELOP
2 PUBLIC POLICIES WITH EMPHASIS ON RECRUITING WOMEN, VETERANS
3 FORMERLY INCARCERATED MINORITIES AND REPRESENTATIVES OF
4 TARGETED COMMUNITIES. AND WE WILL WORK ON KEEPING THE SECOND
5 PARAGRAPH THAT YOU HAD IN YOUR PREVIOUS MATERIALS STARTING
6 WITH FUNDING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR ESTABLISHING NEW
7 BUSINESSES, ..SO THAT WOULD BE OUR RECOMMENDATION. WE THINK
8 THIS IS HEADING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AND IF WE ACTUALLY
9 ADDRESS THE WORKFORCE CHALLENGES THEY WILL BE MUCH MORE LIKELY
10 TO SUCCEED --

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU TIM.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IN THE CONSTRUCTION PROGRAM.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, TIM. I'M GOING TO CIRCLE BACK
17 AROUND WITH MY COMMENTS HERE AND REELEVATE FRANK'S COMMENTS
18 ABOUT HOUSING FOR THE DISABLED, AND IT'S SOMETHING THAT RICH
19 HEDGES HAS BEEN TALKING ABOUT FOR YEARS OUR LACK OR ABLE TO
20 CREATE HOUSING THAT WILL ACCOMMODATE A DIFFERENT TYPE OF
21 LIVING THAN HOUSING DEVELOPERS GENERALLY DO. SO, I THINK THAT
22 THAT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT GOING FORWARD AT ALL INCOME LEVELS.
23 IT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO BUILD UPON. THE OTHER THING I WANT
24 TO BRING UP IS, THERE IS A LOT OF DISCUSSION ABOUT THE BIG
25 ISSUES, NETWORKS, AND CONNECTIVITY, AND LOOKING AT THROUGH IT



September 8, 2021

1 -- THROUGHOUT LENS OF THE TDA, THROUGH THE TRANSIT AGENCIES,
2 BUT I WANT TO -- AND THIS WILL TIE INTO THE COMMUNITY-BASED
3 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING -- I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE
4 LEAVING ROOM FOR THE SMALLER DOWN-ON-THE-GROUND LOOK THAT
5 WE'RE NOT JUST CREATING ROUTES THAT, WE'RE NOT JUST LOOKING AT
6 CREATING STANDARDS, BUT THAT WE'RE GIVING PEOPLE ON THE GROUND
7 A WAY TO LOOK AT THEIR NEIGHBORHOODS OR THEIR DISTRICTS
8 INVOLVED IN THIS PROCESS, AND GET -- AND I WILL GO BACK TO MY
9 EXAMPLE, IT'S BEEN A 20 YEAR PROCESS FOR ME, TO GET SOMETHING
10 DONE, BECAUSE IT DOESN'T FALL UNDER THE BIG PICTURE HEADING,
11 AND IT CERTAINLY DOESN'T FALL UNDER THE LITTLE PICTURE
12 HEADING, IT JUST FALLS OFF THE MAP UNTIL I START YELLING ABOUT
13 IT AGAIN. SO JUST TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE ELEVATING SOME OF
14 THOSE ISSUES A LITTLE BIT MORE. I THOUGHT I SAW A HAND GO UP.
15 RICH HEDGES, GO AHEAD.

16

17 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I WAS JUST GOING TO THANK YOU FOR RAISING THE
18 HOUSING ISSUE. IF ANYBODY IS INTERESTED THERE WAS A REPORT
19 THAT WE DID TO MTC MARTIAL LAW A NUMBER OF YEARS, ADDRESSING
20 ADEQUACY OF HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT STATIONS HAVING HOUSING IN
21 SOME CASES, TOWN HOMES BUILT WITH ACCESS FOR THE DISABLED
22 RIGHT NEXT TO THE TRANSIT STATION SO THAT'S NO SECRET. MTC DID
23 TAKE ACTION ONCE THAT REPORT WENT IN AND WOULD NO LONGER DO
24 IT. LC GRANTS FOR STATIONARY IF IT DIDN'T INCLUDE DISABLED
25 HOUSING.



September 8, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AGAIN. DON'T LIKE USING
3 PERSONAL ANECDOTES BUT IT'S ONE THEY WILL KEEP GOING BACK, TO
4 ONE OF OUR FIRST LOANS WAS FOR A SENIOR HOUSING DEVELOPMENT
5 THAT IS NO LONGER ON A TRANSIT ROUTE OF ANY KIND, THEY WITH
6 WAVE AT LIGHT RAIL WHEN IT STARTS RUNNING AGAIN, BUT THERE IS
7 NO STATION FOR A HALF MILE IN EITHER DIRECTION IT'S SENIOR
8 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND IT DID NOT INCLUDE A LARGE AMOUNT OF
9 ACCOMMODATIONS FOR MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY WHO ARE BOTH LOW-
10 INCOME, SENIORS, AND THEN ADDING DISABLED TO IT. I WANT TO
11 MAKE SURE THAT AS WE ARE GOING FORWARD ARE DEVELOPING POLICIES
12 AROUND WHAT NEEDS TO HAPPEN THAT, WE ARE UTILIZING OUR
13 SUBCOMMITTEES AND GROUPS TO HAVE FULLER DISCUSSIONS ON THIS.
14 I'M NOT SAYING FIX IT NOW, I'M SAYING, WE HAVE THE MEANS AND
15 THE OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY BRING THE COMMUNITY IN TO HAVE THESE
16 DISCUSSIONS AND IT NEEDS TO BE DONE SOONER RATHER THAN LATER.
17 VEDA, AND THEN WE'LL WRAP THIS UP.

18

19 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU, RANDI. YOU JUST BASICALLY SAID WHAT I
20 WAS -- I WANTED TO LIFT UP YOUR COMMENTS, AND LET YOU KNOW
21 THAT THERE ARE BUILDERS OUT THERE WHO ARE WILLING TO ADD ON
22 HOUSING FOR THOSE DISABLED COMMUNITY, THE DISABLED THEY ARE
23 QUIET, PAY THEIR RENT ON TIME, AND THEY DON'T NEED A PARKING
24 SPACE. SO THERE ARE LOTS OF OPPORTUNITIES TO BUILD WITH
25 PARTNERS BUILDERS TO DO THIS WORK AND THERE HAVE BEEN



September 8, 2021

1 ADDRESSED IN THE PAST, WE NEED MAKE SURE THAT ON THE MTC WEB
2 SITE THAT EVERYTHING IS ACCESSIBLE TO BUILD THAT BACK END WITH
3 THE ALTERNATE TEXT, MAKE SURE ALL OF THE MATERIALS, THE PDFS
4 ARE ACCESSIBLE, THAT'S ONE PIECE OF LOW-HANGING FRUIT THAT CAN
5 BE ACHIEVED WITH A MINIMAL AMOUNT OF TIME AND MONEY. THANK
6 YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVE AND CHIRAG. IT'S FOUR
9 YEARS. I'M LOOKING AT MY WATCH, THEY DON'T HAVE ON MY WRIST,
10 AND I KNOW THAT WE'RE JUST GOING, TO LIKE, TURN AROUND IN THE
11 NEXT COHORT IS GOING TO START THE PROCESS ALL OVER AGAIN. BUT
12 THIS HAS BEEN AN EXTREMELY COMPREHENSIVE LOOK, AND I THANK YOU
13 FOR ALL THE INFORMATION AND ALL THE REPORTS. WITH THAT, WE'RE
14 GOING TO MOVE TO THE NEXT ITEM. ITEM NINE, WHICH IS COMMUNITY-
15 BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANNING PROGRAM STATUS UPDATE. AL
16 RALEIGH, I BELIEVE YOU'RE PRESENTING THAT.

17

18 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. MY NAME IS RALEIGH
19 MCCOY, I AM WITH THE REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM AND I AM THE
20 PROGRAM MANAGER FOR THE COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION
21 PLANNING PROGRAM, I AM GOING TO PRESENT AN OVERVIEW FOR THOSE
22 WHO ARE NOT FAMILIAR WITH THE CBT PROGRAM AND PROVIDE A
23 PREVIEW OF THE UPCOMING EVALUATION OF THE PROGRAM ADDITIONALLY
24 SHARING INFORMATION ON CONTENT OF THE CBTPS AND ACKNOWLEDGE
25 THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF ONE OF THE MTC SUMMER MENTORSHIP



September 8, 2021

1 PARTICIPANTS, ANNE MARIE HWANG WHO IS A STUDENT AT SF STATE
2 GETTING HER UNDERGRADUATE DEGREE WHO ASSISTED DURING HER EIGHT
3 WEEKS HERE AND PARTICIPATED IN THE PROGRAM. CBT WAS LAUNCHED
4 IN 2002 AS AN EQUITY FOCUSED IMPLEMENTATION ACTION COMING OUT
5 OF 2001 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN THE PROGRAM HAS
6 EMPHASIZED ENGAGEMENT HISTORICALLY WITH MARGINALIZED
7 COMMUNITIES TO IDENTIFY BOTH MOBILITY BARRIERS AS WELL AS
8 SOLUTIONS FOCUSED ON THE NEEDS OF RESIDENTS WITH EQUITY
9 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND DISADVANTAGED AREAS. IMPORTANT TO
10 NOTE AT THE TOP IS THAT CBTS ARE IMPORTANT PLANNING DOCUMENTS
11 THAT RELY ON VARIOUS SOURCES OF FUNDING FOR IMPLEMENTATION,
12 INCLUDING LIFELINE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM, ACTIVE
13 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM GRANTS AS WELL AS A HOST OF OTHER
14 COUNTY AND CITY FUNDING SOURCES. AS WE AT MTC AND ABAG ARE
15 WORKING TO INTEGRATE EQUITY INTO ALL OF OUR PRODUCTS AS GUIDED
16 BY THE EQUITY PLATFORM IT'S IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE
17 CBT PROGRAM HAS MANY NEXUSES WITH THE FOUR PILLARS OF THAT
18 PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. A QUICK BACKGROUND ON THE PROCESS FOR
19 DEVELOPING CBTS THE PROCESS BEGINS WITH A SET OF GUIDELINES
20 ADOPTED BY MTC, THE MOST RECENT SET OF GUIDELINES WERE ADOPTED
21 IN JANUARY OF 2018 AND COVERED A CYCLE ENDING IN 2021. IN THAT
22 2018 GUIDELINES UPDATE THERE WERE A FEW KEY CHANGES THAT ARE
23 MADE THAT RECOGNIZE THE ONGOING CHALLENGES WITH THE CBT
24 PROGRAM. FIRST THE GUIDELINES ESTABLISHED THE PROCESS IN WHICH
25 FUNDING FROM THE SECOND CYCLE OF THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT



September 8, 2021

1 PROGRAM OR OH BAG WAS ALLOCATED TO THE NINE COUNTY
2 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES, AND IN THAT CYCLE THE FUNDING WAS
3 INCREASED WHEN COMPARED TO PRIOR CYCLES MAKING MORE FUNDING
4 AVAILABLE FOR COUNTIES TO SUCCEED WITH THE CBT WORK. THE GUIDELINES
5 CLARIFY REQUIREMENTS FOR USING THE FUNDING INCLUDING
6 INTRODUCING A USE IT OR LOSE IT PROVISION ENCOURAGING CTAS TO
7 INITIATE PROGRAMS AND IMPLEMENT THEM IN A TIMELY MANNER AS
8 WELL AS INVOLVE COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS OR CBOS MORE
9 ACTIVELY. THE GUIDELINES ALSO ESTABLISH ELIGIBLE GEOGRAPHIES
10 FOR CONDUCTING CBT WORK INCLUDING EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES
11 AND TRANSPORTATION IN DISADVANTAGED AREAS SUCH AS AREAS THAT
12 HAVE BEEN IMPACTED BY WILDFIRE IN THE NORTH BAY, FINALLY OF
13 THE GUIDELINES ESTABLISH KEY COMPONENTS THAT NEED TO BE
14 INCLUDED IN EACH CBT DOCUMENT WHICH PROVIDES STANDARDIZATION
15 AND COMPATIBILITY ACROSS DIFFERENT COUNTY CBTS, AND LASTLY
16 GUIDELINES TO ESTABLISH REQUIREMENTS FOR MTC TO CONDUCT A
17 PROGRAM EVALUATION IN 2021 AND I'LL BE SPEAKING ON THAT MORE
18 IN THE PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE. SO, CBTPS INVOLVE A NUMBER
19 OF DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS EACH OF WHOM HAS A DISTINCT ROLE IN
20 THE PLANNING PROCESS. TO START WITH MTC, PROVIDING PLANNING
21 FUNDS TO COUNTIES AND ESTABLISHING THE GUIDELINES LIKE WE
22 COVERED ON THE PRIOR SLIDE. STAFF WILL SIT ON TECHNICAL
23 ADVISORY COMMITTEES TO PROVIDE REGIONAL PRESENCE AND
24 PERSPECTIVE, AND ADDITIONALLY OUR FUNDING SOURCES ARE ONE KEY
25 PIECE OF THE IMPLEMENTATION PUZZLE FOR IMPLEMENTING



September 8, 2021

1 RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF CBTPS. NEXT COUNTY
2 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES ARE A CRITICAL PARTNER THROUGHOUT THE
3 CBTP PROCESS AND PLAY A ROLE OF DOING ON THE GROUNDWORK OF
4 PRODUCING CBTS. COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES OR CTPAS ARE
5 CHARGED WITH OVERSEES THE CBTP PROCESS AS WELL AS PROVIDING
6 FUNDING TO THEM BY MTC INCLUDING COORDINATING WITH CITIES
7 TRANSIT AGENCIES AND COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS DETERMINING
8 WHICH COMMUNITIES CBT WORK IS INITIATED AND FUNDING
9 RECOMMENDATIONS THROUGH COUNTY CONTROLLED SOURCES SUCH AS
10 SALES TAX MEASURES. RANGING IN VARIOUS CAPACITIES RANGING FROM
11 ADVISORY BOARDS TO ACTUALLY CBT WORK IF THERE IS AN AGREEMENT
12 BETWEEN THE CITY AND CTA. AN EXAMPLE OF THIS SFMTA WAS LEAD
13 AGENCY THAT LEAD THE BAYVIEW CBTP EFFORT ADOPTED IN 2020.
14 CITIES AND TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE FUNDING PARTNERS IN THE CBTP
15 PROCESS THROUGH CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM BUDGET AND
16 SOURCES. FOURTH, COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS PLAY THE
17 IMPORTANT ROLE OF COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT MEMBERS FOR ENGAGEMENT
18 IN STAFF PLANNING AND WORK AND GUIDELINES RECOMMEND THE
19 COMBINATION OF CBOS FOR THEIR WORK WHICH IS REALLY IMPORTANT
20 AND DRAWING EXPERTISE IN COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATION
21 INVOLVING DATA COLLECTION AND MEETING FACILITATION AND
22 ADDITIONALLY COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS ARE OFTEN
23 REPRESENTED ON ADVISORY COMMITTEES. NEXT SLIDE. NOW THAT WE
24 HAVE GONE OVER THE MECHANICS OF HOW CBTPS ARE PRODUCED I'LL
25 PROVIDE A STATUS UPDATE ON WHERE THE PROGRAM CURRENTLY



September 8, 2021

1 STANDARDS THERE ARE 34 COMMUNITIES WITHIN THE BAY AREA WHERE
2 CBTPS HAVE COMPLETED AN UPDATE TO THE CBTP WHICH MAKES
3 RECOMMENDATIONS ALIGNED WITH CURRENT CHALLENGES AND TO GO OVER
4 THE WORK -- THERE WERE [INDISCERNIBLE] TWO COUNTIES TOOK A
5 DIFFERENT APPROACH CONDUCTING COMMUNITIES BASED PLANNING IN
6 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT THEIR COUNTY ALAMEDA
7 AND NAPA REFRESHING CBTP PRIORITIES WITHIN THEIR BOUNDS
8 ADDITIONALLY CBTP FUNDS CONTRIBUTED TO THE COST OF DOING
9 PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING PLANNING WORK AND VALLEJO AND BAYVIEW
10 AND SAN FRANCISCO AND THERE WERE FIVE TRADITIONAL CBTPS
11 COMPLETED IN 2024 IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY CONCORD RICHMOND
12 MARTINEZ PITTSBURG BAY POINT COMMUNITY AS WELL AS SAN
13 FRANCISCO PORTS MOUTH SCARE NEIGHBORHOOD ADDITIONALLY SOME
14 CBTP HAVE RUN ACROSS CHALLENGES WITH ENGAGE DURING COVID-19
15 PANDEMIC BUT SEVERAL WHERE WORK IS CURRENTLY UNDERWAY WHERE
16 THEY PLAN TO INITIATE WORK AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. IN THE NEXT
17 FEW SLIDES I WANT TO PROVIDE CONTEXT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS
18 THAT ARE INCLUDED WITHIN CBTPS AND THIS WILL REPRESENT A
19 SYNTHESIS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF ALL OF THE CURRENT CBTPS
20 SO IT WON'T SPEAK TO CBTPS WHERE AN UPDATE HAS OCCURRED AND
21 THERE IS AN OLDER VERSION. ALL CURRENT CBTPS ARE AVAILABLE FOR
22 DOWNLOAD ONLINE AT THE MTC WEB SITE. TAKE AWAY ON THIS PIE
23 CHART IS THAT CBTPS HAVE A DIVERSE ARRAY OF MOBILITY NEEDS
24 ARTICULATED BY OUR REGION'S UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES. AROUND
25 HALF OF ALL RECOMMENDATIONS ARE CENTERED ON IMPROVEMENTS FOR



September 8, 2021

1 ACTIVE TRAVELS INCLUDING CYCLISTS, PEDESTRIAN --
2 [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS DIVERSITY OF NEEDS REALLY UNDERSCORES
3 HERE THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING A FLEXIBLE AND DIVERSE ARRAY OF
4 FUNDING SOURCES TO SUPPORT THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE
5 RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO IN THE NEXT THREE
6 SLIDES I'LL TOUCH ON THE THREE MODAL CATEGORIES ACTIVE
7 TRANSPORTATION, TRANSIT, AND AUTO. FIRST FOR ACTIVE
8 TRANSPORTATION, THE MOST COMMON RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF
9 CBTPS RELATE TO THINGS LIKE REQUESTS FOR NEW BIKE FACILITIES
10 THAT CAN BE EXTENDED OR NEW BIKE LANE OR MULTI-USE PATH THERE
11 IS ALSO A GREAT DEAL OF INTEREST IN INTERSECTION IMPROVEMENTS
12 THAT ADDRESS ACCESSIBILITY AND SAFETY CONCERNS SUCH AS
13 CROSSWALKS OR CURB RAMPS OTHER SIDEWALK IMPROVEMENTS ARE ALSO
14 COMMON RECOMMENDATIONS INCLUDING SIDEWALK CONNECTIVITY
15 ENHANCEMENTS OR PEDESTRIAN OVERCROSSINGS AT HIGHWAYS AND
16 FINALLY ANOTHER COMMON RECOMMENDATION IN THIS CATEGORY IS FOR
17 COMPLETE STREETS IMPROVEMENTS THINGS LIKE ROAD [INDISCERNIBLE]
18 WHICH HAVE EXCESS OF TRANSIT IN MANY CASES COMMON
19 RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION INCLUDE SAFETY
20 ENHANCEMENTS, LIGHTING, SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL ENHANCEMENTS
21 SECRETE SCAPING THINGS LIKE PEDESTRIAN AMENITIES AND BENCHES,
22 BICYCLE EDUCATION AND MAINTENANCE ACCESS SHARED MOBILITY AND
23 BIKESHARE SCOOTER AND PARKING. THE RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT
24 OF CBTPS ARE COMING OUT OF LOW COST QUICK IMPLEMENTABLE
25 SOLUTIONS TO IMPROVE PASSENGER EXPERIENCE OPPOSED TO TRANSIT



September 8, 2021

1 CAPITAL INTENSIVE MEGA PROJECTS. MOST COMMON RECOMMENDATIONS
2 COMING OUT OF CBTPS INCLUDE BETTER TRAVELER INFORMATION
3 INCLUDING MAKING SURE INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE IN MULTIPLE
4 LANGUAGES, ADDING REALTIME TRAVEL TIMES AT TRANSIT STOPS, AND
5 TRAINING SO PEOPLE CAN LEARN TO USE TRADITIONAL FIXED ROUTE
6 TRANSIT SERVICE AS WELL AS PARATRANSIT ADDITIONALLY CBTPS
7 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENTS AT BUS STOPS TRANSIT STATIONS
8 INCLUDING THINGS LIKE EQUIPPING BUS STOPS WITH BENCHES,
9 SHELTERS MAKING IMPROVEMENTS AT BART STATION PLAZA AND OTHER
10 GENERAL ENHANCEMENTS ANOTHER RECOMMENDATION COMING OUT OF
11 CBTPS ARE MORE FREQUENT SERVICE ON EXISTING ROUTES TO REDUCE
12 WAIT TIMES ADDITIONALLY MANY CBTPS WILL TOUCH ON
13 [INDISCERNIBLE] RECOMMENDED PROGRAMS TO REDUCE COSTS FARES FOR
14 YOUTH BASED INCOMES. AND EXTENDED SERVICE HOURS FOR MORNING
15 AND EVENING SERVICE. TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS THAT WOULD HELP
16 MAKE TRANSIT MORE RELIABLE AND EXPEDIENT AS WELL AS SAFETY
17 IMPROVEMENTS ADDRESSING TRANSIT SAFETY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND
18 FINALLY TURNING TO AUTO RELATED RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH
19 REPRESENT A SMALL BUT IMPORTANT SHARE OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS
20 COMING OUT OF CBTPS. THE MOST COMMON RECOMMENDATION THAT WOULD
21 RELATE TO AUTO INCLUDE REQUESTS FOR MORE DEMAND RESPONSIVE
22 SERVICES, THINGS LIKE VAN POOLS OR VOLUNTARY DRIVERS TO
23 PROVIDE TRANSPORTATION FOR SENIORS OR THOSE ARE ACCESSING
24 HEALTH CARE AND TOUCH INFRASTRUCTURAL IMPROVEMENTS NEEDED AT
25 INTERSECTIONS INCLUDING TRAFFIC SIGNALS TURNING LANES AS WELL



September 8, 2021

1 AS INTERCHANGE IMPROVEMENTS ON HIGHWAYS. MORE RECENT CBTPS AS
2 THERE IS A MORE WIDE ARRAY OF SERVICE IN THIS CATEGORY WE WILL
3 SEE IMPROVEMENTS REQUESTED THAT WOULD ADDRESS THE COST BURDEN
4 OF USING A TAXI OR TRANSPORTATION NETWORK COMPANY OR TNC SUCH
5 AS UBER OR LYFT THESE ARE VOUCHERS OR SUBSIDIES TO MAKE THESE
6 MODES MORE ACCESSIBLE TO PEOPLE WITH LOW-INCOMES. THERE ARE
7 RECOMMENDATIONS TOUCHING ON SAFETY AND DEFINITELY HERE IS A
8 NEXUS AREA WHERE THERE IS OVERLAP IN ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION AS
9 WELL, RECOMMENDATIONS ON FOR SPEED BUMPS, STRIPING
10 IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL AS DRIVER EDUCATION, AND INTERESTINGLY
11 RECOMMENDATION COMING OUT OF CBTPS ARE REQUESTS FOR ASSISTANCE
12 IN ACQUIRING A PERSONAL VEHICLE THROUGH ACCESS TO FINANCING OR
13 SUBSIDIES THAT WOULD REDUCE COST. OTHER RECOMMENDATION IN THIS
14 CATEGORY INCLUDE PARKING IMPROVEMENTS THAT CAN INCLUDE
15 IMPLEMENTING PARKING PRICING IN SOME CASES CAR SHARE EXPANSION
16 ROADWAY WIDENING CARPOOL LANES AS WELL AS ROAD MAINTENANCE TO
17 ADDRESS ISSUES LIKE POT HOLES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NOW, AT THE
18 TOP OF THE PRESENTATION, I REFERENCE THIS PROGRAM EVALUATION
19 THAT'S SET TO OCCUR IN 2021, AND STAFF ARE REALLY EXCITED TO
20 COME TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL NOW WHILE WE'RE IN THE
21 VERY INITIAL STAGES OF THIS PROGRAM EVALUATION TO SHARE MORE
22 INFORMATION ON THE OBJECTIVES THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED BY
23 STAFF FOR THE PROGRAM EVALUATION AND GET THE COUNCIL'S
24 FEEDBACK ON THE QUESTIONS THAT WE'LL BE ASKING AS WE COMPLETE
25 THE PROGRAM EVALUATION THROUGHOUT THE REST OF THE YEAR. AND,



September 8, 2021

1 REALLY, STAFF HAVE IDENTIFIED TO GONE TWO KEY INTEREST AREAS
2 RELATED TO THE CBTP PROGRAM. FIRST GAINING AN INTEREST IN
3 UNDERSTANDING THE OUTCOMES OF CBTPS MORE GENERALLY AND WE
4 ALREADY SAW SOME OF THAT WORK IN THE SLIDES TO QUANTIFY THE
5 MOST COMMON RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF CBTPS AND MOVING
6 FORWARD STAFF PLAN TO EVALUATE LOCAL AND REGIONAL PLANS AND
7 FUNDING AWARDS TO UNDERSTAND THE LANDSCAPE OF FUNDING AND
8 IMPLEMENTATION FOR CBTP RECOMMENDATIONS ARE HOPING TO
9 UNDERSTAND WHERE CBTPS ARE AND AREN'T BE FUNDED AS WELL AS
10 FACTORS THAT INFLUENCE THESE TRENDS AND INFORMING FUTURE
11 FUNDING POLICY AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL TO HELP SUPPORT GREATER
12 DEGREES OF IMPLEMENTATION. AND INVESTIGATION IN HOW CBTPS ARE
13 PRODUCED INTERVIEWING PEOPLE WHO ARE INVOLVED IN PLANNING WORK
14 INCLUDING CBTP STAFF MTC STAFF AND UNDERSTANDING WHERE SUPPORT
15 AND FLEXIBILITY WOULD HELP HAD FINISHING BEST PRACTICES AND
16 OTHER STICKING POINTS RELATED TO UPDATED GUIDELINES IN 2022.
17 NEXT SLIDE. TO WRAP UP HERE. THIS IS MY LAST SLIDE, NEXT STEPS
18 FOR THE PROGRAM AND THE EVALUATION THE PROGRAM EVALUATION WORK
19 WILL BE ONGOING THROUGHOUT THE END OF YEAR AND STAFF
20 ANTICIPATES RETURNING TO THE COUNCIL IN EARLY 2022 TO SHARE
21 FINDING OF THE PROGRAM EVALUATION AS WELL AS TO SHARE GRAFT
22 GUIDELINES FOR THE UPCOMING CBTP CYCLE FINALLY BROUGHT TO THE
23 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL IN SPRING OF 2022 AND UPDATED
24 GUIDELINES WOULD APPLY TO FUTURE CBTP FUNDING PSYCH ELSE. AND
25 FINAL SLIDE, MY INVITATION FOR QUESTIONS AND LOOKING FORWARD



September 8, 2021

1 TO HEARING FROM YOU ALL PARTICULARLY ON THE PROGRAM EVALUATION
2 OBJECTIVES.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO, MEMBERS, JUST START
5 RAISING YOUR HANDS FOR QUESTIONS. CHRISTINA?

6

7 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** JUST WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR THE
8 INTERESTING RECOMMENDATION SUMMARY CHARTS. THE I WAS WONDERING
9 ARE ALL OF THE INFLUENCING TRANSIT THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
10 ACTION PLAN? IT JUST SEEMS LIKE FROM MELANIE'S PRESENTATION A
11 LOT OF WHAT WAS IN THE ACTION PLAN ACTUALLY DIDN'T MAKE IT
12 INTO THE PRESENTATION, AND I FEEL LIKE A LOT OF WHAT'S
13 DOCUMENTED HERE AND IN THE ACTION PLAN IS COMMUNITY NEEDS THAT
14 HAVE BEEN ASSESSED BY MTC, OR THAT HAVE BEEN SHARED BY RIDERS
15 AND PASSENGERS, AND THAT IT WOULD BE NICE TO HAVE THIS
16 COMPARISON BETWEEN THE NEEDS AND HOW A LOT OF THESE ACTIVITIES
17 THAT MTC IS PLANNING ARE GOING TO MEET THE NEEDS AND SOME OF
18 THE THINGS THAT ARE HIGHLIGHTED BY THE ACTION PLAN, FOR
19 EXAMPLE, -- OR BY THE PRESENTATION, ARE MORE ALONG THE LINES
20 OF THE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS AND THINGS THAT PASSENGERS
21 HAVE PUT AS LESSER PRIORITIES AS COMPARED TO REALTIME
22 INFORMATION AND SOME OF THESE OTHER THINGS THAT WERE
23 EXPRESSED. I THINK, OH, LIKE SIDEWALK IMPROVEMENTS AND SAFETY
24 IMPROVEMENTS IN OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS. THANKS.

25



September 8, 2021

1 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** JUST TO RESPOND BRIEFLY, I THINK IT'S A REALLY
2 GREAT QUESTION TO ASK HOW THE CBTPS ARE INFORMING LARGER
3 PLANNING EFFORTS SINCE THESE ARE SUCH LOCALIZED
4 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE REALLY FOCUSED ON THE EQUITY PRIORITY
5 COMMUNITY THAT'S PRODUCING THEM, IN GENERAL. WE HAVEN'T
6 REALLY EXPLORED EXPANDING OUT THE CBTP RECOMMENDATIONS TO
7 INFORM OTHER PLANNING EFFORTS LIKE BLUE RIBBON BEFORE, BUT I
8 THINK THAT YOU RAISE A REALLY GREAT POINT ABOUT THE NEED TO
9 SHARE THIS INFORMATION WITH THE WIDE ERR MTC AND ABAG PLANNING
10 STAFF.

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE
13 DIRECTOR F POLICY. IF I CAN ADD ON TO WHAT WAS MENTIONED YOU
14 WILL HEAR A PRESENTATION FROM MALLORY ON THE PROGRAM WE THINK
15 THAT'S ANOTHER REALLY GREAT OPPORTUNITY FOR A LOT OF CBTP
16 PRIORITIES AND ARE LOOKING AT THESE PRIORITIES THAT ARE IN THE
17 CONTEXT OF BLUE RIBBON SO WE'RE TRYING TO CONNECT TO THE DOTS
18 THERE IS ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMMING THERE'S QUITE A BIT
19 OF MONEY TO FUND A LOT OF WHAT YOU'RE SAYING. WE'RE LOOKING AT
20 MAKING SURE THERE'S ENOUGH ASSISTANCE FOR THE PROJECTS. YOUR
21 COMMENTS ARE REALLY WELL TAKEN AND WE'RE TRYING TO CONNECT THE
22 DOTS. THANK YOU.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VEDA THEN FRANK.

25



September 8, 2021

1 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON. THANK YOU RALEIGH FOR AN
2 EXCELLENT PRESENTATION. THE INFORMATION THAT YOU HAVE RECEIVED
3 IS, FEELS TO ME LIKE IT'S FROM SOME OF THE LARGER COUNTIES,
4 AND I'M WONDERING, BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE CBOS IN THE NORTH BAY
5 AND MARIN, SONOMA, AND NAPA, IF WE REALLY DO HAVE ENOUGH
6 FEEDBACK FROM THE SMALLER COUNTIES WITH SMALLER TRANSPORTATION
7 AGENCIES TO GIVE YOU ENOUGH DETAILS. SO, I'M WONDERING IF YOU
8 HAVE REACHED YOUR OBJECTIVE OUTCOMES BY, YOU KNOW, NOT HAVING
9 THE CBOS IN THE NORTH BAY, AND IN THE FUTURE, WHEN YOU START
10 BUILDING YOUR UPDATED GUIDELINES, IF YOU CAN REALLY MAKE AN
11 EFFORT AND WORK WITH STAFF AND COME TO OUR PUBLIC ADVISORY
12 COUNCIL TO HELP FIND CBOS IN THE NORTH BAY AND OTHER
13 COMMUNITIES, I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE REALLY
14 HITTING ENOUGH BASES TO FIND THE OUTCOME THAT WORKS FOR THE
15 ENTIRE BAY AREA. AND I'M ALSO INTERESTED TO FIND OUT IF THE
16 UPDATED GUIDELINES, THE -- WILL HAVE INTERSECTIONALITY WITH
17 THE MOBILITY MANAGER POSITION, OR ANY MOBILITY MANAGEMENT
18 ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE IN OUR DIFFERENT COUNTIES. THANK YOU.

19

20 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** YES. THANK YOU FOR YOUR QUESTION, IF I COULD
21 QUICKLY RESPOND. IN THE NORTH BAY THE COMMUNITY-BASED
22 TRANSPORTATION PLANS DO ENGAGE WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
23 ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE IDENTIFIED BY THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
24 AGENCIES. SO, I JUST WANTED TO ASSURE YOU THAT CBOS ARE REALLY
25 INTEGRAL IN PRODUCING EVERY CBTP INCLUDING THE ONES IN THE



September 8, 2021

1 NORTH BAY, AND TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION ON THE MOBILITY
2 MANAGERS, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR BRINGING UP THAT POINT,
3 WE'RE IN THE INITIAL STAGE EVER UNDERSTANDING THE
4 CONSIDERATIONS FOR THIS NEXT GUIDELINES UPDATE. SO, TAKING
5 INTO ACCOUNT THESE MOBILITY MANAGERS, IT'S A REALLY GREAT
6 FEEDBACK TO RECEIVE AT THIS EARLY STAGE.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HAVE FRANK, THEN ADINA, THEN
9 CARLOS.

10

11 **FRANK WELTE:** FIRST I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR PRESENTING TODAY.
12 THIS AREA OF CBTPS IS SOMETHING I'M NEW TO HEARING ABOUT, AND
13 I AM DEFINITELY APPRECIATING THIS INFORMATION, LOOKING FORWARD
14 TO READING A LOT MORE ON THE MTC WEB SITE. YOU CAN SPEAK TO
15 THE ROLE THAT CBTPS PLAY IN TERMS OF HOW THEY INFLUENCE,
16 PERHAPS, THE IMPROVEMENTS IN DISABILITY ACCESS IN THE LOCAL
17 AREAS?

18

19 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** YES, SO, THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. MANY OF THE
20 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE SAW COMING OUT OF THE CBTPS, I THINK,
21 HAVE A DIRECT NEXUS ON IMPROVING DISABILITY WHETHER IT'S
22 PEOPLE ADVOCATING FOR WELL MAINTAINED SIDEWALKS, SAFE
23 INTERSECTIONS AND OTHER IMPROVEMENTS LIKE THAT, AND I THINK
24 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT AS WE WORK WITH OUR COUNTY
25 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY PARTNERS THAT ARE DOING THE ENGAGEMENT



September 8, 2021

1 WORK IN PRODUCING CBTPS TO ENCOURAGE THEM TO CONSULT WITH A
2 WIDE VARIETY OF STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY
3 THEMSELVES, AND I THINK FOR THE GUIDELINES, THAT'S A REALLY
4 IMPORTANT PIECE TO CONSIDER.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA, CARLOS, THEN RICH
7 HEDGES.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. I'M REALLY GLAD THAT SOMEBODY BEFORE
10 ME ALSO MADE A RECOMMENDATION TO DOVETAIL THIS WITH THE BLUE
11 RIBBON TASK FORCE. I HAD OPPORTUNITY TO TALK WITH SOME LEADERS
12 AT THE BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT COMMUNITY ADVOCATE GROUP A NUMBER
13 OF WEEKS AGO, AND THEY WERE REALLY EXTREMELY INVOLVED IN THE
14 COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN FOR BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT
15 AND IN A COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN ONE OF THE
16 RECOMMENDATION THAT CAME FORWARD FROM THE COMMUNITY THAT GOT
17 INTO THE STUDY WAS BETTER MORE AFFORDABLE CONVENIENT ACCESS TO
18 REGIONAL TRANSIT INCLUDING BART AND CALTRAIN, HOWEVER THAT
19 PLAN WHICH HAD MANY OF ITS RECOMMENDATIONS -- MANY OF THE
20 RECOMMENDATIONS HAD NEXT STEPS. THEY HAD NEXT STEP
21 OPPORTUNITIES IDENTIFIED FOR PEDESTRIAN SAFETY. THEY HAD NEXT
22 STEPS OPPORTUNITY FOR IDENTIFIED FOR LOCAL TRANSIT, FOR BUS
23 SHELTERS. MANY, MANY DIFFERENT THINGS WHERE THEY HAD NEXT
24 STEPS IDENTIFIED. BUT THERE WEREN'T ANY NEXT STEPS IDENTIFIED
25 FOR THAT BETTER, MORE COORDINATED TRANSIT, BECAUSE THE AGENCY



September 8, 2021

1 THAT WAS RUNNING IT WAS, ONLY ONE AGENCY AND THEY DID NOT HAVE
2 THE POWER ON THEIR OWN TO MAKE THOSE CONNECTIONS, SFMTA -- --
3 SO I DOVE TAILING THIS WITH THE COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION
4 PLAN RECOMMENDATIONS THAT HAVE A MULTI-AGENCY ASPECTS TO THEM
5 TO BE IMPLEMENTED WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL IN TERMS OF
6 FULFILLING THE MISSION OF THIS PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CARLOS AND RICH.

9

10 **CARLOS CASTELLANOS:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. THE I WANT
11 TO POINT OUT, FROM MY NEXT OF THE WOODS HERE, IT WAS
12 INTERESTING IT WAS POINTED OUT THAT ALAMEDA COUNTY DID A
13 COUNTY-WIDE ASSESSMENT OF THE CBTPS, AND I THINK, LOOKING IT
14 OVER, IT LOOKS LIKE THEY'RE TRYING TO BREAK OUT THE DIFFERENT
15 COMMUNITIES, AND I'M SPEAKING SPECIFICALLY FOR OAKLAND, AND I
16 THINK THIS MIGHT BE A GOOD RECOMMENDATION FOR MTC TO FOLLOW
17 UP, ONE THING, I THINK THEY DID A GOOD JOB OF PROVIDING DATA
18 OF WHAT'S HAPPENING AT THE COMMUNITY LEVEL, AND I DIDN'T GET
19 THE SENSE THAT YOU'RE JUST TALKING ABOUT CBOS, THERE IS REALLY
20 A LOT OF COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION BECAUSE IT WAS DONE IF A
21 DIFFERENT WAY BUT IT DIDN'T SEEM VERY SPECIFIC TO WHAT THE
22 COMMUNITY WAS REALLY LOOKING FOR, AND IT DIDN'T COME OUT THIS
23 IS WHAT THE COMMUNITY SAID THEY NEED. SO I WOULD RECOMMEND
24 THESE ARE COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS THAT
25 ENCOURAGING THE COUNTIES OR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO SHOW WHAT



September 8, 2021

1 THEY HAVE REALLY DONE IN TERMS OF -- AND THE RESPONSE BE THAT,
2 YOU KNOW, THEIR PRODUCT HAVE THAT IN IT, THAT SAYS THIS IS
3 WHAT THE COMMUNITY HAS IDENTIFIED. I THINK THE DATA IS REALLY
4 GOOD. YOU KNOW? IT SHOWED DISPARITIES, AND I JUST WANT TO BE
5 SURE THAT IT'S ALSO HEARING THE COMMUNITY AND THEN ON TOP OF
6 THAT, I WOULD JUST SAY THE -- I THINK AT MTC, I THINK I HEARD
7 YOU SAY, MAYBE YOU CAN CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG, THAT THE
8 POLICY USED TO BE USE IT OR LOSE T AND I KIND OF -- AND I KNOW
9 THIS DID TAKE A LONG TIME TO GET UPDATED. I THINK IT WAS DONE
10 AT THE VERY BEGINNING OF THE PROGRAM, AND PROBABLY UPDATED IN
11 2020. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THESE F POSSIBLE, BE DONE IN CYCLES,
12 LIKE FIVE YEARS, AND SAYING THIS IS WHAT'S HAPPENED SINCE
13 THOSE PREVIOUS RECOMMENDATIONS AND TRY THAT, I REMEMBER THOSE
14 USED TO BE LINKED TO FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES AND I WANT TO MAKE
15 SURE WE'RE USING THESE DOCUMENTS TO REALLY RESOLVE ISSUE THAT
16 IS HAPPENING AT THE COMMUNITY LEVEL AND IF MTC COULD, ALMOST
17 LIKE A STICK VERSUS CARROT APPROACH, I DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT
18 IS, BUT THEY NEED TO DO IT IN A REGULAR CYCLE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES, AND THEN TERRY
21 SCOTT.

22

23 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I DID A CHECK OF PAGES ON THE WEB SITE OF
24 COMMUNITY-BASED PLAN TRANSPORTATION WITH ABOUT 7 TO 10 SO
25 THERE IS A LARGE NUMBER OF PLANS OUT THERE, AND I WANT TO



September 8, 2021

1 MENTION THAT SAN MATEO HAS A TAXI PROGRAM THAT DOESN'T TAKE IN
2 DISABLED PEOPLE UNDER 65, BUT IT'S FOR SENIOR AND DISABLED,
3 OVER 65, AND IT DOES TAKE A LOAD OFF OF READY WHEELS WHEN YOU
4 HAVE SOMETHING LIKE THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO EXPAND AND WORK ON
5 IT TO ALL DISABLED PEOPLE FOR OUR TRANSPORTATION PLANNING. BUT
6 THE OTHER THING I WANT TO MENTION, I DIDN'T HEAR HERE, WE HAD
7 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING, WE GRANTED MONEY TO SEVERAL SHUTTLE
8 OTHER AND TIMES OF PROGRAMS INCLUDING TAXIS, THAT WOULD BE --
9 SHOULD BE INCLUDED, LIKE EAST PALO ALTO HAS ONE AND WE'RE
10 WORKING ON GRANTING MONEY FOR THEM AND SHOULD BE INCLUDED IN
11 THEIR BAY TRANSPORTATION PLAN, I'M WONDERING IF THOSE LIFELINE
12 PROJECTS ARE INCLUDED BECAUSE THEY REALLY SHOULD BE.

13

14 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** JUST QUICKLY. YES, SO AS I MENTIONED, LIFELINE
15 WILL LOOK TO SEE WHICH PROJECTS ARE RECOMMENDED BY CBTPS, AND
16 AS PART OF THE EXISTING CONDITIONS ANALYSIS IN THE OTHER
17 DIRECTION CBTP SHOULD ACKNOWLEDGE SERVICES LIKE THE ONE THAT
18 YOU'RE MENTIONING AS PART OF THE EXISTING NETWORK.

19

20 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THAT'S A BIG BOOST OF MONEY 6.9 MILLION
21 COMPARED TO THE ONE YOU'RE MENTIONING.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** TERRY SCOTT?

24



September 8, 2021

1 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I ANTICIPATED ASKING THIS
2 QUESTION WITH MALLORY'S PRESENTATION, BUT IT SEEMS TO BE MORE
3 APPROPRIATE TO ADDRESS IT WITH RALEIGH. AND THAT IS REGARDING
4 THE KEY POSITIVE MULTI-COUNTY IMPACTS OF SOME OF THESE
5 TRANSPORTATION DECISIONS. AND I'LL USE IT AS AN EXAMPLE,
6 HIGHWAY 37 THAT DIRECTLY BENEFITS MARIN SONOMA NAPA AND SAN
7 FRANCISCO COUNTIES BECAUSE OF THE COMMUTERS THAT UTILIZE THAT,
8 IT'S A TREMENDOUS BACKUP AND HAS BEEN FOR A NUMBER OF YEARS. I
9 WOULD HOPE THAT WHERE THERE IS POSITIVE MULTI- COUNTY IMPACTS
10 THAT APPROPRIATE CONSIDERATION WOULD BE TO PUTTING THOSE A
11 LITTLE FURTHER AHEAD, PARTICULARLY ONES LIKE 37, WHICH IS, I
12 THINK IS RELATIVELY EASY AND SHOULD BE PRIORITIZED BECAUSE OF
13 THE MULTI-COUNTY BENEFITS THAT IT PROVIDES, AND ALSO THE --
14 AND I REALIZE THERE IS SOME COST INVOLVED THERE, AND SOME
15 WATER CONCERNS, ET CETERA, FLOODING CONCERNS -- BUT ANYHOW I
16 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT -- AND BY THE WAY, I AGREE WITH
17 CARLOS'S COMMENTS AS WELL -- BUT I HOPE THESE COMPREHENSIVE
18 BENEFITS ARE CLEARLY CONCERNED IN YOUR PLANNING PROCESS AND
19 THAT PROJECT ARE APPROPRIATELY RATED AND PRIORITIZED AS SUCH.
20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I DON'T SEE ANY MORE HANDS. SO
22 I'M GOING TO JUMP IN FOR A MINUTE HERE. MY FIRST COMMENT IS,
23 WE STOPPED USING THE TERM ROAD DIET, BECAUSE A DIET IMPLIES
24 THAT YOU'RE TAKING SOMETHING AWAY, AS OPPOSED TO ADDING VALUE
25 TO THAT PARTICULAR STRETCH, AND I WOULD REALLY STRONGLY



September 8, 2021

1 RECOMMEND THAT MTC STOP CALLING THEM ROAD DIETS. THAT'S -- IT
2 JUST HAS A TENDENCY TO MAKE PEOPLE GET ALL UP IN ARMS BECAUSE
3 YOU'RE TAKE AWAY THEIR ABILITY TO DRIVE. NEVER MIND THAT AT
4 THE SAME TIME THEY'RE STILL YELLING ABOUT THEIR KIDS BEING
5 ABLE TO WALK TO SCHOOL SAFELY. WE USE THE TERM RIGHT-SIZING,
6 BUT I AM SURE THERE ARE OTHER TERMS THAT NEEDS TO GO AWAY. THE
7 OTHER THING I WANT TO BRING UP -- AND I'M NOT SURE HOW THIS
8 FITS INTO ALL THE OF THIS -- CBTP SEEMS TO BE DRIVEN FROM THE
9 TOP DOWN. MTC GIVES MONEY TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, THE
10 PLANNING PEOPLE, THE PEOPLE UP AT THAT LEVEL, AND IT'S
11 SUPPOSED TO TRICKLE DOWN AND YOU'RE SUPPOSED TO FIND OUT WHAT
12 THE COMMUNITY WANTS, AND THAT'S SOMETIMES NOT HOW IT HAPPENS.
13 SOMETIMES HOW IT HAPPENS IS THE AGENCY SAYS, OH, WELL, WHAT WE
14 WANT IS TO FINISH UP ALIGNING THINGS. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE
15 THAT WE HAVE TOUCHED BASE, THAT WE QUALIFY FOR FUNDING SO THAT
16 WE TOUCH BASE THE COMMUNITY, THERE'S A NUMBER OF REASONS THEY
17 TO THE COMMUNITY, BUT I'M NOT SEEING CBTP PIECE FROM THE
18 GROUND UP. THE FIRST THING IS GOING TO BE GETTING OUT OF THEIR
19 HOUSE, WALKING DOWN THE STREET AND NOT TRIPPING ON THEIR
20 SIDEWALK OR HAVING SAFE ACCESS TO THE BUS STOP, OR HAVING
21 THEIR CARROT STREET WITHOUT PEOPLING RACING UP-AND-DOWN AND
22 SMASHING IT. BUT SOMEHOW THOSE CONCERNS DON'T HAVE A WAY OF
23 GETTING BUNDLED SLOWING UP OTHER STANDARD FOR STREETS AND
24 SIDEWALKS, BUT IT DOESN'T GIVE THE COMMUNITY RESOURCES THE
25 ABILITY TO HAVE A VOICE TO DRIVE. WE'RE NOT GIVING MONEY TO



September 8, 2021

1 THE PEOPLE UP HERE. WE'RE ACTUALLY ORGANIZING FROM THE BOTTOM-
2 UP AND TOUCHING BASE THAT WAY, WHETHER IT'S ESTABLISHING A
3 COUPLE OF PILOT PROGRAMS TO START THAT WAY AND SEE HOW IT
4 WORKS, PILOTS ARE ALWAYS GOOD, BUT WE HAVE COMMUNITIES THAT
5 DON'T GET REPRESENTED BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT A STRUCTURAL THING.
6 WE HAVE THE DISABLED COMMUNITY THAT NEVER GETS TO GET INVOLVED
7 IN CBTPS. WE HAVE HOMELESS WHO NEVER GET A CHANCE TO GET
8 INVOLVED. THEIR NEEDS ARE VASTLY DIFFERENT. SENIORS. CYCLING
9 GROUPS, PEOPLE WHO ARE STRICTLY BICYCLISTS, TRANSIT USERS,
10 NON-ENGLISH SPEAKING. SO, IF WE HAVE, LIKE, I HAVE A BRAND-NEW
11 VIETNAMESE COMMUNITY CENTER OPENING UP, AND IT WOULD BE REALLY
12 GOOD FOR ME TO HEAR FROM THAT POPULATION WHAT THEIR SPECIFIC -
13 - AND IT'S GOING TO OVERLAP, SO THAT'S GOING TO OVERLAP, YOU
14 KNOW, WITH ANOTHER GROUP, BUT AT LEAST BEING ABLE TO START
15 DRIVING FROM THE BOTTOM-UP, TO BE ABLE TO BRING MORE COMMUNITY
16 INTO -- WE HAVE GOT PLANNING, WE HAVE THOSE PEOPLE -- AND WE
17 HAVE THREE LAYERS OF THOSE PEOPLE, REALLY -- BUT WHAT WE DON'T
18 HAVE IS THE START FROM THE BOTTOM. AND THAT, TO ME, IS
19 SOMETHING THAT I THINK IS REALLY MISSING IN ALL OF THIS.
20 THERE WAS ONE MORE THING, BUT I CANNOT REMEMBER WHAT IT IS.
21 AND AGAIN I'LL GO BACK TO PILOT PROGRAMS. IF YOU LOOK AT THE
22 WAY AGENCIES RUN MEETINGS AND COME IN FROM THE TOP DOWN, IT'S
23 INTIMIDATING FOR PEOPLE, THEY FEEL THEY DON'T HAVE A CHOICE.
24 THEY FEEL THEY HAVE BEEN GIVEN A PREPRINTED MENU OF IDEAS OR
25 THINGS TO DO, AND I CAN'T TELL YOU HOW MANY MEETINGS I HAVE



September 8, 2021

1 BEEN TO WITH PROJECTS IN A SPECIFIC AREA WHERE THE COMMUNITY
2 COMES IN WITH THE EXACT SAME REQUESTS TIME AFTER TIME AFTER
3 TIME AFTER TIME, AND IT'S BASED ON AN INTERSECTION OF
4 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS, AND THEY KEEP GETTING TOLD, WELL, WE
5 DON'T HAVE THE MONEY FOR THAT, BECAUSE THE AGENCY IS ONLY
6 LOOKING FOR PROJECT THAT THEY CAN FIGURE OUT HOW TO FUND OR WE
7 DON'T HAVE THE TIME OR STAFF FOR THAT, AND AGENCIES DO NOT
8 HAVE THE RESOURCES. PERIOD. END OF STORY -- TO DO THAT. AND
9 THE FIRST TO GET CUT. HOW DO WE REACH OUT TO COMMUNITIES FROM
10 THE GROUND UP IS MY QUESTION. I THINK THAT DESERVES MORE OF AN
11 IN DEPTH CONVERSATION. I SEE HAND UP. CHRISTINA?

12

13 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I HAVE A QUICK QUESTION. HOW ARE THESE
14 SESSIONS CONDUCTED? DO THE RECOMMENDATIONS JUST COME FROM
15 COMMUNITY MEMBERS PARTICIPATE SOMETHING OR ARE THEY PRESENTED
16 WITH A LIST THAT THEY CAN ADD ON TO OR VOTE ON?

17

18 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** THE SHORT WHERE IS THE PROCESS VARIES FROM
19 COUNTY TO COUNTY. FROM CBTP TO CBTP, IT'S CBTP FUNDED PLAN
20 SUPPORTED PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING WHICH HAS GRASSROOTS EFFORTS
21 BUT IT ALSO HAS BEEN USED FOR THOSE GRASSROOTS EFFORTS BUT
22 REALLY DOES VARY BASED ON THE COUNTY'S APPROACH.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RICK COATES.

25



September 8, 2021

1 **RICK COATES:** I WANT TO STAND UP AND CHEER AS YOU WERE TALKING,
2 AND MAYBE IF WE WERE ALL MEETING TOGETHER IN ONE ROOM, I WOULD
3 HAVE. IT'S UBIQUITOUS AMONG GOVERNMENT AGENCIES THAT THEY ROLL
4 OUT A DOG AND PONY SHOW, AND SOMEHOW THE PUBLIC DESIRES AND
5 INTEREST GETS SHORT SHIFTS. SO, YES. DEFINITELY.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I DO NOT SEE ANY RAISED HANDS
8 FROM THE PANEL. IS THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMUNICATION?

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
11 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
12 ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING IN THIS IS
15 SOMETHING I'M REALLY PASSIONATE B I HAVE SEEN IT WORK WELL,
16 AND I HAVE SEEN IT NOT WORK AT ALL. I LOVE THAT THE PUBLIC IS
17 ENGAGED IN THIS AND I LOOK FORWARD TO IN DEPTH CONVERSATIONS
18 MOVING FORWARD. NEXT ITEM IS NUMBER 101 BAY AREA EXTRA
19 CONSIDERATIONS. MALLORY.

20

21 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** HELLO I'M MALLORY ATKINSON WITH OUR FUNDING
22 POLICY AND PROGRAM SECTION. WE HAVE A POWERPOINT PRESENTATION.
23 TODAY I'LL PRESENT AN OVERVIEW AND SEEK INPUT FROM THIS GROUP
24 ON THE POLICY -- EXCUSE ME SORRY. ONE SECOND. I AM PRESENTING
25 OBAG THREE CONSIDERATIONS AND ASKING FOR YOUR INPUT POLICY



September 8, 2021

1 PRIORITIES AND DESIRED OUTCOMES FOR THIS NEXT CYCLE OF THE ONE
2 BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. STARTING WITH
3 CONTEXT ON THE PROGRAM, THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT OR POLICY
4 PROGRAM IS THE POLICY FRAMEWORK THE COMMISSION HAS USED IN
5 RECENT YEARS TO DISTRIBUTE OUR REGION'S SHARES OF TWO FUND
6 SOURCES THE SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM FUNDS
7 AND CONGESTION MITIGATION AIR QUALITY PROGRAM FUNDS WHAT WE
8 CALL STP CMAQ IN SHORT THE FUNDS ARE FLEXIBLE FOR FEDERAL
9 FUNDING WHICH PROVIDES VALUABLE OPPORTUNITY TO TACKLE MULTIPLE
10 REGIONAL DIRECTIVES WHICH ARE INTERCONNECTED HOWEVER FUND
11 SOURCES REPRESENT ONLY A SMALL SHARE OF REVENUE. WE HAVE
12 TRANSPORTATION FOR 1.3% OF ALL TRANSPORTATION REVENUES
13 FORECAST AND TALK ABOUT THE ROLE OF THE PROGRAM AS A FLEXIBLE
14 PIECE OF A LARGER REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT STRATEGY.
15 STARTING WITH OUR CYCLE IN 2013 THE OBAG PROGRAM HAS BEEN
16 STRUCTURED INTO A COUNTY AND REGIONAL PROGRAM AND BOTH WORK
17 TOGETHER OR INTEND TO WORK TOGETHER TO SUPPORT PLANNED BAY
18 AREA. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. DIVING IN CLOSER TO THE COUNTY
19 PROGRAM SPECIFICALLY, IN OBAG TWO, THE CURRENT CYCLE, THE
20 THEMES OF HOUSING AND FOCUSED GROWTH ARE WOVEN THROUGHOUT IT,
21 HOUSING FACTORS ARE REFLECTED IN THE FORMULA THAT WE USE TO
22 DISTRIBUTE FUNDS BETWEEN COUNTIES, IT'S ALSO USED IN THE
23 SCORING CRITERIA THAT COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES OR CTAS
24 HAVE USED TO EVALUATE PROJECTS THAT ARE SUBMITTED TO THEM. THE
25 OBAG COUNTY PROGRAM ALSO INCLUDES A REQUIREMENT TO FOCUS



September 8, 2021

1 INVESTMENTS WITHIN EACH COUNTY IN THE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT
2 AREAS, AND ALSO THERE IS A REQUIREMENT FOR CITIES AND COUNTIES
3 TO DEMONSTRATE COMPLIANCE WITH STATE HOUSING LAWS IN ORDER TO
4 MAINTAIN FUNDING ELIGIBILITY FOR THE PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE,
5 PLEASE. SO ON THE REGIONAL SIDE, OBAG FUNDS HAVE BEEN USED TO
6 ADVANCE PROGRAMS THAT DIRECTLY ADDRESS OUR PLANS FOCUSING ON
7 GROWTH EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS SPECIFICALLY PROGRAMS LIKE CLIMATE
8 INITIATIVE, PLANNING GRANTS AND PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA
9 PROGRAM. THE FUNDS ARE ALSO USED TO MAKE PROGRESS IN OTHER
10 STRATEGIES ON A REGIONAL SCALE AND THAT WAS BROUGHT UP IN
11 COMMENTS ABOUT MULTI-COUNTY BENEFIT PROJECTS AND THIS IS WHERE
12 THE OBAG REGIONAL PROGRAM DOES PLAY A ROLE IN PROJECTS THAT I
13 HAVE HIGHLIGHTED HERE, CAR REPLACEMENT EFFORTS CLIPPER AND
14 VARIETY FORWARD PROJECTS AND THE SR PLANNING THAT'S THE TYPE
15 OF PROJECT THAT FITS WELL WITH THIS PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE,
16 PLEASE. LOOKING TO THE NEXT CYCLE RECOGNIZING ALL THAT'S
17 CHANGED SINCE 2013 WITH THE ADOPTION OF O BAG 1 AND 2, WE HAVE
18 IDENTIFIED FACTORS THAT WE'RE TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION AS WE
19 DEVELOP THE FRAMEWORK AND I'LL GO OVER EACH OF THOSE IN THE
20 NEXT SLIDE. THE FIRST ONE PRESERVING THE EFFECTIVE FEATURES OF
21 THE OBAG PROGRAM THAT WE HAVE NOW, EARLIER THIS YEAR STAFF
22 COMPLETED A COMBINED ASSESSMENT OF BOTH PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT
23 IMPLEMENTATION AND ALSO THE OBAG PROGRAM ITSELF AND THAT STUDY
24 CONCLUDED WITH RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE SHOULD CONTINUE WITH
25 OUR OVERALL APPROACH THAT FOCUSES TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT IN



September 8, 2021

1 PRIORITY GROWTH AREAS. WE SHOULD CONTINUE TO LEVERAGE PROGRAM
2 FUNDING TO ENCOURAGE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO ADOPT HOUSING
3 SUPPORTIVE POLICIES. AND THEN TO STRENGTHEN THE EFFECTIVENESS
4 OF FUTURE CYCLES THERE IS A RECOMMENDATION TO ESTABLISH CLEAR
5 GOALS FOR THE PROGRAM TO BETTER ENABLE FUTURE EVALUATIONS AND
6 ALSO TO STANDARDIZE OUR PROJECT EVALUATION PROCESSES AMONG
7 COUNTIES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WITH THE ADOPTION OF A NEW
8 PLAN AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN COMING UP VERY SHORTLY, THE
9 OBAG THREE PROGRAM IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO INCORPORATE SOME
10 CHANGES THAT MAY BE NEEDED TO BETTER SUPPORT OUR LONG-STANDING
11 PLAN PRIORITIES SUCH AS MAINTAINING AND OPTIMIZING OUR
12 EXISTING TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, IT'S ALSO AN OPPORTUNITY TO
13 INVEST IN NEW STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN THE PLAN SUCH AS IN AREAS
14 OF CLIMATE ADAPTATION OR RESILIENCE. BUT OF COURSE, LIKE,
15 HARKENING BACK TO MY FIRST SLIDE THE O BAG PROGRAM ON ITS OWN
16 IS INSUFFICIENT TO MAKE PROGRESS IN THESE AREAS BUT PLAYS AN
17 IMPORTANT ROLE WHEN IT'S FOCUSED AND COMPLEMENTED BY OTHER
18 FUNDING PROGRAMS AND BROADER PLANNING LEGISLATIVE EFFORTS AND
19 PARTNERSHIPS. NEXT SLIDE. ALSO RECENTLY THE COMMISSION HAS
20 UNDERTAKEN SEVERAL NEW MAJOR POLICY INITIATIVES WHICH NEED TO
21 BE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION IN THIS CYCLE INCLUDING
22 COMMISSIONED DIRECTION CONNECTING TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO
23 HOUSING BACK IN JANUARY OF 2020 THE ADOPTION OF A REGIONAL
24 VISION ZERO POLICY AND EQUITY PLATFORM AND RECENTLY THE
25 COMMISSION'S APPROVAL OF THE EXPRESS LANE STRATEGIC PLAN AND



September 8, 2021

1 THE COMPLETION OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN AND
2 ADDITIONALLY MOBILITY LANDSCAPE HAS CHANGED WITH THE PANDEMIC
3 AND BEHAVIORS AND MODES AND THE PROGRAM ITSELF WILL NEED TO
4 EVOLVE TO ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF RESIDENTS AND COMMUNITIES. NEXT
5 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM PROVIDES OPPORTUNITY
6 TO ADVANCE EQUITY BY INVESTING OUR RESOURCES AT A MEANINGFUL
7 SCALE FOR HISTORICALLY MARGINALIZED UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES,
8 AND IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO WEAVE EQUITY AS A CONSIDERATION
9 THROUGHOUT THE ABAG PROGRAMS AND INVESTMENTS IN ITS POLICIES.
10 NEXT SLIDE. AND REVIEW OF STATE AND FEDERAL PARTNERS IN 2020
11 HIGHLIGHTED THESE FEDERAL FUND ARE CONSISTENT WITH
12 REQUIREMENTS AND WE BELIEVE THAT MUCH OF THIS CAN BE ADDRESSED
13 IN IMPROVING OUR DOCUMENTATION AND NEED TO BE SOME CHANGES
14 THAT ARE MADE TO HOW OUR FUNDS ARE DISTRIBUTED IN OUR PROJECT
15 SELECTION PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WITH THESE CONSIDERATION
16 IN MIND AND WITH THE FEEDBACK WE RECEIVED FROM OUR PARTNER
17 AGENCIES IN THE SUMMER STAFF IS NOW SHIFTING TO DEVELOP
18 FRAMEWORK THAT WILL SEEK TO BALANCE AND COORDINATE VARIOUS
19 POLICY AND INVESTMENT PRIORITIES INTO THIS PROGRAM AND ALSO
20 COORDINATE THE PROGRAM WITH OTHER FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES AND
21 LEVERAGING OUR REGIONAL PARTNERSHIPS TO SUCCESSFULLY DELIVER
22 OUR PROGRAM'S OBJECTIVES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BEFORE I TURN IT
23 OVER FOR QUESTIONS AND FEEDBACK, I JUST WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT
24 WHERE WE'RE AT IN THE PROGRAM SCHEDULE. SO WE STARTED THIS
25 SPRING WITH INITIAL CONSIDERATIONS AND OUTREACH TO OUR



September 8, 2021

1 PARTNERS THROUGH THE BAY AREA PARTNERSHIP WORKING GROUPS. THE
2 COMMISSION, WE HAD A PRESENTATION OR PROGRAMMING AND
3 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IN JULY TO GET INITIAL FEEDBACK AND
4 DIRECTION AND WE'RE CURRENTLY IN THE INITIALLY OUTREACH PHASE
5 FROM JULY THROUGH SEPTEMBER AS WE'RE DEVELOPING A DRAFT PLAN
6 FRAMEWORK TO BRING BACK TO THE COMMISSION IN OCTOBER AND THEN
7 SEEKING FINAL APPROVAL OF THAT FRAMEWORK IN DECEMBER. SO TODAY
8 WE'RE SEEKING INPUT FROM THE COUNCIL ON PRIORITIES FOR THE
9 OBAG PROGRAM, DESIRED OUTCOMES, AND WE'LL USE THAT TO INFORM
10 OUR DRAFT PROGRAM FRAMEWORK AND WE'LL BE RETURNING TO THIS
11 GROUP IN OCTOBER. I'LL BE RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION IN
12 OCTOBER, AND TO THIS GROUP IN NOVEMBER, AND AGAIN TO THE
13 COMMISSION IN DECEMBER FOR FINAL APPROVAL. SO, NEXT SLIDE. SO
14 WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO OPEN UP FOR DISCUSSION. AND I HAVE
15 INCLUDED A FEW QUESTIONS HERE FOR GENERAL CONSIDERATION BUT I
16 AM HOPE TO ANY FEEDBACK, AS WELL, BUT JUST FOR CONSIDERATION
17 HERE, THERE ARE SPECIFIC PRIORITIES OR DESIRED OUTCOMES THAT
18 THE COUNCIL SEES FOR THE NEXT ABAG PROGRAM? IS THERE ANYTHING
19 MISSING IN THE CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT AS YOU
20 DEVELOP THIS? AND WHAT ARE THOSE OPPORTUNITIES YOU USE TO
21 OTHER PROGRAMS THAT ARE USED TO COMPLEMENT OTHER EFFORT THAT
22 IS UNDERWAY. SO I'LL OPEN UP FOR QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSIONS.
23 AND LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING FEEDBACK. THANK YOU.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WENDI, THEN ADINA.



September 8, 2021

1

2 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT'S VERY
3 EXCITING TO ADD INPUT TO THE OBAG PROGRAM. I REMEMBER WHEN IT
4 WAS FIRST CREATED TO OVERCOME SOME OF THE EQUITY ISSUES. AND
5 WE HAVE HAD DISCUSSION TODAY ABOUT HOUSING THOSE WITH
6 DISABILITY AND SENIORS. AND I HOPE THAT YOU WOULD PLACE
7 PRIORITY IN HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT WOULD HAVE OPPORTUNITIES
8 FOR THOSE WITH DISABILITIES OR SENIORS SO IF YOU COULD ADD
9 THAT TO A PRIORITY, I WOULD GREATLY APPRECIATE T.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WENDI, AND THEN RICH HEDGES.

12

13 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. I'M NOT EVEN SURE IF THIS WOULD QUALIFY,
14 BUT I WANT TO THROW OUT AN IDEA WHICH WOULD BE TO INCLUDE
15 QUICK BUILD AS ONE OF THE PRIORITIES. THESE ARE LOW COST
16 SOLUTIONS THAT ACTUALLY CAN LEAD TO LONG-TERM SOLUTIONS. I
17 THINK WE HAVE FOUND, WITH WHAT HAPPENED WITH THE -- DURING THE
18 PANDEMIC, WHEN A LOT OF QUICK BUILD POP-UPS HAPPENED THAT THEY
19 BECAME PERMANENT. WITH THE QUICK BUILD YOU GET A LOT OF
20 OBJECTIONS TO CHANGING THE NATURE OF A STREET ESPECIALLY TO
21 ACCOMMODATE BICYCLES AND PEDESTRIAN, WHEN YOU PUT IN A QUICK
22 BUILD AND PEOPLE KNOW THAT IT COULD BE CHANGED BACK THEY FIND
23 THAT IT'S NOT AS BAD AS IT WAS, AND THAT GIVES YOU THE FIRST
24 STEP TO MAKING IT A PERMANENT SOLUTION. SO THAT WOULD BE MY
25 RECOMMENDATION.



September 8, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES, THEN CHRISTINA?

3

4 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU, RANDI. A RECOMMENDATION AND THEN A
5 QUESTION. SO, I REALLY LIKE THE DISCUSSION. I THINK IT WAS
6 VERY GOOD, THE PRESENTATION, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE
7 NOT ONLY LINK TRANSPORTATION WITH THE OBAG MONEY INTO HOUSING,
8 BUT ALSO TO SERVICES. I THINK SINCE MONEY IS LIMITED IT'S VERY
9 IMPORTANT TO GET THE TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING MONEY TOGETHER
10 WITH SERVICES, AS WELL. THAT REALLY DOES LIMIT THE AMOUNT OF
11 DRIVING PEOPLE HAVE TO DO. AND TAKES AWAY, AS YOU WELL KNOW,
12 I'M NOT PREACHING TO THE CHOIR, TAKES AWAY THE NEED FOR AN
13 AUTOMOBILE. THE QUESTION I HAVE IS IN PASSING THE COMMENT THAT
14 YOU HAD IN THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT WANTING US TO UPGRADE OUR
15 DETAILS ON HOW WE DO OBAG MONEY, I WAS WONDER WAS THERE A
16 FEDERAL AUDIT DONE AND DID THEY GIVE SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS
17 TO US? AND IF SO, WHAT ARE THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS?

18

19 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** SURE. I COULD QUICKLY ANSWER THAT QUESTION.
20 AS A METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION OF THIS SIZE, WE'RE
21 REQUIRED TO DO WHAT'S CALLED A CERTIFICATION REVIEW WITH OUR
22 FEDERAL AND STATE PARTNERS EVERY FOUR YEARS. IN 2020 WE
23 COMPLETED OUR LATEST, AND THEY DID HAVE SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS
24 THAT THE WANT TO ADDRESS IN OUR NEXT FEDERAL PROGRAMMING
25 ACTIONS THAT WOULD BE IN THE OBAG PROGRAM SPECIFICALLY THOSE



September 8, 2021

1 ARE IN THE AREAS OF PROJECT SELECTION IN THE PAST WE HAD A
2 REALLY GREAT PARTNERSHIP WITH OUR COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
3 AGENCIES TO HELP IDENTIFY PROJECTS THAT I WANT US TO CLARIFY
4 TO MAKE SURE WE AREN'T DELEGATING MTC'S PROJECT SELECTION
5 AUTHORITY TO OUR PARTNER THAT'S SHOULD GO WE'RE WORKING. AND
6 ANOTHER AREA IS IN THE USE OF FORMULAS TO DISTRIBUTE FUNDING.
7 SO THAT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE ALSO DONE IN THE ABAG PROGRAM IS
8 USE HOUSING AS PART OF OUR FORMULA TO DISTRIBUTE MONEY AND
9 THAT'S THE INTENTION OF THAT IS TO ALIGN OUR SUPPORT PROGRAM,
10 THE COUNTY HAS FOUND INCONSISTENCY WITH FEDERAL LAW AND WE ARE
11 WORKING ON STRATEGY TO ADDRESS THAT IN THE NEXT CYCLE. WE
12 THINK WE CAN SUPPORT OUR PLAN AND ENCOURAGE HOUSING THROUGH
13 OTHER WAYS, AND THEN THE FINAL AREA IS IN -- WE NEED TO DO AN
14 EARLIER CONSIDERATION OF THE AIR QUALITY BENEFITS THAT WE END
15 UP SELECTING FOR CMAQ FUNDING SPECIFICALLY. SO THAT'S
16 SOMETHING WE WILL BE ADDRESSING IN THIS NEXT CYCLE, AS WELL.

17

18 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THE PROGRAM WAS ACTUALLY A PREDECESSOR TO THE
19 ADVISORY COUNCIL RECOMMEND NOT JUST GIVING TRANSPORTATION
20 PLANNING GRANTS TO GO NOWHERE. IT SEEMS, SORT OF, BACKWARD FOR
21 THEM TO SAY THAT'S SOMETHING WE SHOULDN'T BE DOING. BECAUSE
22 YOU SHOULD BE REWARDING PEOPLE THAT PRODUCE, ESPECIALLY WHEN
23 IT COMES TO HOUSING FOR PEOPLE. SO, THANK YOU, THAT'S MY ONLY
24 COMMENT ON THAT. IS.

25



September 8, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHRISTINA AND THEN TERRY
2 SCOTT.

3

4 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I HAD A QUESTION SINCE I'M NOT TOO FAMILIAR
5 WITH THIS. CAN YOU SHARE EXAMPLES OF INVESTMENTS THAT HAVE
6 BEEN FUNDED IN THE PAST.

7

8 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** THERE IS A LOT. I COULD START ON THE COUNTY
9 PROGRAM SIDE. WE DO COUNTIES THAT HAVE, IN THE PAST IDENTIFIED
10 PROJECTS THAT ARE LOCAL PRIORITIES FOR THEM AS LONG AS THEY
11 FIT WITHIN OUR GUIDELINES. THESE COULD BE BIKE PED PROJECTS,
12 WHAT WE CALL TRANSPORTATION FOR LIVABLE COMMUNITIES PROJECTS,
13 STREET SCAPE IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS, ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENT,
14 THINGS LIKE THAT. ON THE REGIONAL SIDE WE HAVE DONE PDA
15 PLANNING PROGRAM IT'S FUNDED THROUGH THIS, CLIMATE INITIATIVES
16 PROGRAM HELP TO REACH OUR GHG EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLANS, AND
17 REGIONAL OPERATIONS MANAGEMENT PROGRAMS INCLUDING THINGS LIKE
18 PRIVILEGE FORWARD. THERE ARE SEVERAL OTHERS. HOPEFULLY THAT
19 GIVES YOU A SENSE OF WHAT'S INCLUDED.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY SCOTT.

22

23 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU MALLORY. MY QUESTION IS TIED TO
24 VEHICULAR TRANSPORTATION IT REPRESENTS ALMOST 50% MUCH THE
25 DIFFERENT MODES OF TRANSPORTATION THAT ARE UTILIZED AND IN THE



September 8, 2021

1 BAY AREA, IS SUFFICIENT PRIORITY GIVEN TO, PARTICULAR
2 APPROACHES SINCE THE ONE I MENTIONED IF UPDATING AND IMPROVING
3 HIGHWAY 37, WHERE IT IMPACTS HALF OR MORE OF THE BAY AREA
4 COUNTIES? AND IN THIS CASE, IT'S THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES. I'M
5 CURIOUS AS TO WHAT -- HOW DO YOU PRIORITIZE THEM?

6

7 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** WELL, I HAVE A COUPLE OF THOUGHTS, I GUESS,
8 ON THAT. AS THIS PROGRAM IS SPLIT INTO TWO COMPONENTS ON THE
9 COUNTY SIDE WE REALLY DO FOCUS THOSE FOUNDATION PROJECTS THAT
10 REDUCE VMT, THAT'S A PRIMARY GOAL OF OUR PLAN. WE USE FUND TO
11 HELP ADVANCE THAT GOAL. THERE ARE FLEXIBILITY FOR IMPROVEMENTS
12 ON LOCAL STREETS, ROAD IMPROVEMENTS MORE MULTI-MODAL STREET
13 IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS BUT ON THE REGIONAL SIDE LOOKING AT WAYS
14 WE CAN IMPROVE THE EFFICIENCY OF PERFORMANCE OF PRIORITY
15 FREEWAYS AND STATE ROUTES SEVEN AS 37 AND THOSE ARE
16 PRIORITIZED THROUGH OUR FREEWAY PERFORMANCE PROGRAM AND OUR
17 BAY AREA FORWARD PROGRAM WE'RE TRYING TO SQUEEZE OUT AS MUCH
18 OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY ON THOSE ROUTES AS WE POSSIBLY CAN.

19

20 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I DON'T SEE ANY MORE RAISED HANDS. IS
23 THERE ANY PUBLIC INPUT ON THIS ITEM?

24



September 8, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MALLORY, I WOULD BE INTERESTED
6 IN HOW, AT A LATER TIME, MAYBE, A BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF HOW
7 WE CAN PROMOTE THE PARKS OPEN SPACE COMPONENT OF THIS. BECAUSE
8 CUTTING THAT DOWN ALLOWS PEOPLE TO TRAVEL LESS. THE MORE OPEN
9 SPACE AND PARKS THAT WE HAVE, ESPECIALLY IN THE URBAN AREAS,
10 THE FEWER MILES PEOPLE HAVE TO DRIVE OR EVEN GET ON TRANSIT TO
11 GET THEIR SCREAMING KIDS OUT OF THE HOUSE, AND IT'S ALWAYS A
12 RELIEF TO HAVE PARKS AND OPEN SPACE. I'M FINDING THAT THE
13 PROGRAMS THAT WE BUILD POWER ACTUALLY HEAVIER -- THEY GET
14 HEAVIER USE IN THE DAYTIME BY PUBLIC SCHOOLS AND SENIORS IN
15 OUR AREA. AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE HOW WE FORMULATE THAT. THANK
16 YOU MALLORY. NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENT. ITEM 11 STAFF LIAISON
17 REPORT, MARTI?

18

19 **MARTI PASCHAL:** I HAVE ONE ITEM. I SENT AN E-MAIL TO THE
20 COUNCIL ON AUGUST 18TH, AND FORWARDED AN E-MAIL ABOUT PLANNED
21 BAY AREA EVENTS TOMORROW IN THE WEBINAR AND EQUITY NEXUS, THE
22 MEETING IMPLEMENTATION PLAN UPDATE WEBINAR IS AT 2 TO 3
23 TOMORROW AND THE EQUITY NEXUS DISCUSSION IS FROM 3:30 TO 4:30
24 AND I'LL FORWARD THE INFORMATION.

25



September 8, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I ASSUME EVERYBODY HAS HEARD
2 THE NEW REGIONAL TRANSIT ADVERTISING THAT'S BEEN GOING ON, AND
3 IT MAKES ME LAUGH AND SMALL ALL THE TIME. ADINA?

4
5 **ADINA LEVIN:** I THINK THIS IS IN THE STAFF REPORT OF THE
6 POTENTIAL EXPIRATION OF THE GOVERNOR'S ORDER AROUND THE BROWN
7 ACT AND THE NEED TO MEET IN PERSON, AND THERE WAS A LINE IN
8 THERE THEY WANT TO ASK ABOUT BECAUSE IT SAID THAT THERE MAY OR
9 MAY NOT -- IT WAS SOME AMBIGUOUS LINE ABOUT, THERE MAY NOT BE
10 ONLINE PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I WANTED TO ASK FOR ANY MORE
11 UPDATES ON THAT. BECAUSE, SINCE THE LAST TIME THAT STAFF
12 UPDATED ON THIS TOPIC SAYING THAT THERE WERE LEGAL CONCERNS
13 AND MTC WOULD BE LOOKING FOR THE BROWN ACT TO BE UPDATED TO
14 ALLOW ONLINE PUBLIC COMMENT. ASSEMBLYMEMBER LEE TRIED TO GET
15 HIS BILL AMENDED TO HAVE A LINE SAYING, YOU KNOW, IT IS LEGAL
16 FOR ANY AGENCY OR JURISDICTION TO ALLOW FOR ONLINE PUBLIC
17 COMMENT. BUT HE WAS NOT ABLE TO GET THAT AMENDMENT INTO HIS
18 BILL. WHICH IS QUEUED UP TO PASS, OR BE VOTED ON BY THE LAST
19 HOUSE TOMORROW, I THINK. HE WASN'T ABLE TO GET THAT AMENDMENT
20 IN, BECAUSE COMMITTEE COUNCIL SAID IT IS ALREADY LEGAL. SO YOU
21 CANNOT ADD AN AMENDMENT TO MAKE IT LEGAL, BUT IT IS ALREADY
22 LEGAL. SO I WAS JUST WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY MORE UPDATE ON
23 THAT LEGAL ASSESSMENT.

24
25 **I BELIEVE WE HAVE A RESPONSE.**



September 8, 2021

1

2 >>**MARTI PASCHAL:** THAT WAS PART OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
3 REPORT WHICH I WAS GOING TO SEND TO STAFF. I BELIEVE OUR
4 GENERAL COUNSEL --

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SHE HAS HERB HAND RAISED.

7

8 **KATHLEEN KANE:** HI EVERYONE. ALL THESE ISSUES ARE STILL PENDING
9 RIGHT NOW WE'RE HOPING FOR SHORT-TERM HELP IN THE INFORM SB
10 361 WHICH IF ANYBODY HAS ANY INFLUENCE USE IT, BECAUSE WE AND
11 EVERYONE ELSE NEEDS AN EXTENSION TO THE EMERGENCY PROTOCOLS.
12 ON THE ISSUE OF HOW TO BETTER ACCOMMODATE PUBLIC COMMENT, WE
13 ARE STILL WORKING ON THAT. THERE IS SOME INTERNAL ATTORNEY
14 CLIENT REVIEW GOING ON WITH OUR RESPECTIVE LEADERSHIP AND
15 GETTING SIGN OFF ON THAT, BUT YOU CAN EXPECT AN UPDATE, AND I
16 AM HAPPY TO SPEAK OFFLINE AS WELL, FOR MORE IN DEPTH, BUT
17 UNTIL WE HAVE THAT CONCLUSION OF ANALYSIS WE CAN'T DAYLIGHT
18 UNTIL WE HAVE DIRECTION. BUT WE'RE LOOKING AT WORKING ON THAT.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE UPDATE AND I WOULD BE
21 HAPPY TO GET AN UPDATE OFFLINE.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I WOULD SAY AS A SOMEBODY WHO CHAIRS A
24 BROWN ACTED SCHOOL BOARD I CONDUCTED MY FIRST HYBRID MEETING
25 LAST NIGHT. THEY HELD THE FIRST ONE WITHOUT ME WHICH WAS FINE



September 8, 2021

1 BECAUSE THEY GOT THE BUGS OUT. WE HAD MORE PEOPLE ONLINE
2 PARTICIPATING THAN WE GET IN PERSON. AND I APPRECIATE THAT. SO
3 I THINK IF MY SCHOOL DISTRICT CAN FIGURE IT OUT, MTC CAN
4 CERTAINLY FIGURE IT OUT. WITH THAT, WE WILL GO -- AND FIGURE
5 IT OUT LEGALLY, BECAUSE OUR COUNSEL CLEARED IT. INTO
6 COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL CAN REPORT ON
7 LOCALLY RELEVANT ISSUES OR EVENTS. RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU HAVE
8 GOT SOMETHING. I SEE NO HANDS. ADINA?

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED TO ANNOUNCE THAT SEPTEMBER IN
11 BAY AREA TRANSIT MONTH, AND THAT IS A REGIONAL CELEBRATION OF
12 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WHERE COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND LEADERS ARE
13 ENCOURAGED TO USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. USE SOCIAL MEDIA TO
14 SHARE YOUR EXPERIENCE AND USE OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AND BE
15 THANKFUL TO THE PEOPLE WHO WORK TO MAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
16 A GO ON A REGULAR BASIS. AND THERE IS THAT CONTEST THAT PEOPLE
17 CAN PARTICIPATE IN, AND I CAN SEND INFORMATION ABOUT THE
18 TRANSIT MONTH ACTIVITIES TO STAFF FOR DISTRIBUTION. THANK YOU.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY, THEN RICK.

21

22 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. RANDI, I JUST WANTED TO SHARE WITH
23 YOU, FOR THOSE WHO MAY NOT BE AWARE, NAPA HOSTED THE BOTTLE
24 ROCK CONCERTS THIS PAST WEEK, AND WE HAD 120,000 PARTICIPANTS
25 IN A COUNTY OF 113,000 RESIDENTS. SO IT'S PRETTY BIG HERE. AND



September 8, 2021

1 WE'RE ON THE 16TH THROUGHOUT 19TH OF SEPTEMBER, WE'RE ALSO
2 HOSTING THE FORTINET PROFESSIONAL GOLF ASSOCIATION TOURNAMENT,
3 A FOUR DAY EVENT THE 16TH THROUGH THE 19TH WHICH WILL PROBABLY
4 BRING IN ANOTHER 100 OR 30,000 PEOPLE TRANSPORTATION RANKS
5 PRETTY HIGHLY IN THE CONCERNS OF PEOPLE COMING INTO NAPA
6 COUNTY AND LEAVING, IT'S BEEN A BIG MONTH.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RICK.

9

10 **RICK COATES:** THOSE INTERESTED IN TRAILS HAVE BEEN SUPPORTING
11 THE GREAT REDWOOD TRAIL LED BY MIKE MCGUIRE. IT'S A RATHER
12 INTERESTING ROADBLOCK RECENTLY WITH REGARD TO TRANSPORTATION
13 IT REQUIRES ABANDONMENT OF A RAIL LINE FROM MARIN THROUGH
14 SONOMA COUNTY AND THEN ALL THE WAY TO HUMBOLDT COUNTY IT'S
15 PRESENTLY BEFORE THEY SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BOARD BUT FOR
16 REAL BANKING AND ABANDONMENT THE OLD LINE NO LONGER IS IN
17 SERVICE, A GROUP WITH CONSIDERABLE FINANCING HAS OPPOSED AND
18 IT'S DELIVERING COAL INSIDE THE HUMBOLDT COUNTY BY TRAIN ALL
19 THE WAY FROM WYOMING THROUGH SACRAMENTO ACROSS HIGHWAY 37
20 CORRIDOR AND THEY SEEM TO THINK THAT THE LINE SHOULDN'T BE
21 ABANDONED AND ACTUALLY WOULD TO IMPROVE IT, THAT I THINK IT'S
22 AN INDIAN TRIBE THAT'S GOING TO PROVIDE THE COAL WHICH IS ON
23 THEIR RESERVATION IT'S CALL KIND OF ISSUES INVOLVED AND IT'S,
24 SORT OF, A HOT POTATO, AND A LOT OF CONFUSION GOING ON RIGHT
25 NOW, BUT PEOPLE MAY WANT TO PAY ATTENTION TO IT, IF FOR NO



September 8, 2021

1 OTHER REASON IT'S INVOLVED IN CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE DELIVERY
2 OF COAL TO CHINA AND INDIA. THANK YOU.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARK?

5

6 **MARC MADDEN:** I WANTED TO ASK RICK, THIS COAL THIS'S GOING TO
7 BE TRANSPORTED, IS IT GOING TO BE CONSUMED IN THE US?

8

9 **RICK COATES:** THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT EXPORT.

10

11 **MARC MADDEN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** VEDA, ARE YOU THERE?

14

15 **VEDA FLOREZ:** SORRY ABOUT THAT. I'M DRIVING. I LOWERED MY HAND
16 SO I WOULD BE PREPARED. I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE THAT THE
17 LAST TWO WEEKS OF SEPTEMBER ARE NATIONAL SEPTEMBER VOTER
18 REGISTRATION WEEK THE 13TH THROUGH THE 20TH AND NATIONAL VOTER
19 REGISTRATION DAY SEPTEMBER 28TH AND THE REASON I BRING THIS UP
20 IS TO INCREASE VOTER PARTICIPATION. IT DOESN'T MATTER WHO YOU
21 VOTE FOR, IT'S IMPORTANT THAT YOU PARTICIPATE IN THE PROCESS.
22 ESPECIALLY AS WE MOVE INTO THE 2022 ELECTION IT'S IMPORTANT
23 THAT EVERY PERSON IS REGISTERED TO VOTE. I WANT TO REMIND YOU
24 IF YOU COULD ADD YOUR CIRCLE OF FRIENDS AND GIVE THEM THE
25 REMINDER THAT VOTING IS IMPORTANT AND YOU CAN TRACK YOUR



September 8, 2021

1 BALLOT ONLINE IF YOU GO TO THE SECRETARY OF STATE'S WEB SITE,
2 YOU CAN SIGN UP FOR TRACK YOUR BALLOT, YOU CAN FIND OUT MORE
3 INFORMATION ON HOW TO PARTICIPATE IN OUR AMERICAN PROCESS. SO,
4 THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND HAVE A GREAT DAY.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHRISTINA.

7

8 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I JUST WANT TO ALERT EVERYONE THAT FRIDAY,
9 SEPTEMBER 24TH, IS THE NON-PROFIT HOUSING ASSOCIATION OF
10 NORTHERN CALIFORNIA'S ANNUAL CONFERENCE. SO REGISTRATIONS ARE
11 BEING ACCEPTED THROUGH THIS WEEK IF ANYONE IS INTERESTED IN
12 ATTENDING.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COULD YOU SEND THAT
15 INFORMATION TO STAFF SO THEY CAN SEND IT OUT WITH THE REST OF
16 THE THINGS THAT ARE GOING OUT? THANK YOU. I SEE NO OTHER
17 HANDS RAISED. IS THERE ANYBODY WHO DARES TO ADD SOMETHING TO
18 NEW BUSINESS? I SEE NO HANDS RAISED THERE. THIS WAS A JAM-
19 PACKED MEETING, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE GETTING THROUGH IT AS
20 CLEANLY AS WE D CHRISTINA, YOUR HAND IS BACK UP?

21

22 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** YEAH. I JUST HAD A QUESTION. ARE WE EVER
23 GOING TO HAVE ANY PRECIS FROM 511?

24



September 8, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GOOD QUESTION. WE'LL PASS THAT ON TO
2 STAFF, AND THEY'LL GET BACK TO US. THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WE
3 WILL ADJOURN THIS MEETING. OUR NEXT MEETING WILL BE OCTOBER
4 13TH AT 1:35 P.M. THEORETICALLY AT BAY AREA METRO STATION, BUT
5 I'M GUESSING REALLY ONLINE. AND EVERYBODY HAVE A GREAT
6 WEEKEND. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]
7



Broadcasting Government