



BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE

Meeting Transcript



JULY 16, 2021

BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE GOVERNING BOARD

JULY 16, 2021

AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, JESSE, THANK
YOU FOR KEEPING US ON ALL THESE ZOOM MEETINGS. AND I
AM IN THE PROCESS OF FINDING OUT, WHERE IS THE WI-FI
ON THE OREGON COAST FOR OUR BARC MEETING IN
SEPTEMBER. [LAUGHTER] SO, OKAY, WELL, GOOD MORNING,
IT'S MY PLEASURE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE
BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE, AND I'M AMY WORTH,
CHAIR, MAY I FIRST TURN TO OUR STAFF TO -- OH WAIT A
MINUTE. FIRST LET'S RUN THE COVID ANNOUNCEMENT,
PLEASE? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT]
DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A
ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE
GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS
CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING
IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE BARC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR
WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND
OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK
CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS
OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND
ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT
THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.
COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING



JULY 16, 2021

1 BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND
2 FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
3 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
4 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS
5 OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
6 SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT
7 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN
8 PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY
9 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE
10 AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE
11 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
12 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO
13 DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION
14 ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE
15 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND
18 WELCOME EVERYONE, AND NOW I WOULD LIKE TO TURN TO OUR
19 CLERK FOR THE CALLING OF THE ROLL AND TO CONFIRM THE
20 QUORUM.

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR.
23 ARREGUIN?

24

25 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** PRESENT.



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** RABBIT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** RAMOS? BARRETT?

7

8 **DIR. TERESA BARRETT:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT? HUDSON?

11

12 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ROSS?

15

16 **DIR. MARK ROSS:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GIOIA?

19

20 **JOHN GIOIA:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PINE? WAGENKNECHT?

23

24 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** HERE.

25



JULY 16, 2021

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN?

2

3 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** EL-TAWANSY? CHAVEZ? PEDROZA?
6 SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WORTH?

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MADAM CHAIR, WE HAVE A QUORUM.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH SERENA, AND NOW
17 LET'S MOVE ON TO GOVERNING BOARD ANNOUNCEMENTS. ARE
18 THERE ANY --

19

20 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** CHAIR WORTH, MAY I INTERRUPT. I
21 APOLOGIZE FOR A SECOND? LUCIAN, I SENT MY LINK, I
22 SENT TO ZACK WHO IS NOW LABELED AS ME. I HAVE NO IDEA
23 IF THAT IS A PROBLEM FOR ANYBODY -- I'M SURE IT'S A
24 PROBLEM FOR ZACK THE LAST PERSON HE WANTS TO BE IS



JULY 16, 2021

1 ME. I DON'T KNOW HOW IT WORKS. I JUST WANT TO MAKE
2 SURE YOU ALL ARE OKAY?

3

4 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** I THINK I CAN DO IT.

5

6 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** LARRY, I CAN'T IMAGINE ANYONE WHO
7 WOULDN'T WANT TO BE YOU FOR A DAY.

8

9 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** TELL THAT TO MY MOTHER?

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ZACK IS NOW ZACK. LET'S SEE IF
12 THERE ARE ANY BOARD ANNOUNCEMENTS? OKAY SEEING NONE,
13 I WILL MOVE ON TO THE CHAIR'S REPORT. AND I REALLY
14 DON'T HAVE A FORMAL REPORT. I JUST REALLY WANT TO
15 THANK ALL OF YOU FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION ON THIS
16 BOARD, AND, REALLY REFLECTING ON THE FACT THAT WHEN
17 BARC, OR, ORIGINALLY AS THE REGIONAL ADVISORY WORKING
18 GROUP POLLS COUNCIL, I CAN'T REMEMBER WHAT THE NAME
19 WAS --

20

21 **ALLISON BROOKS:** REGIONAL POLICY COMMITTEE.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I SHOULD KNOW SHOULD I PUT THIS
24 TOGETHER. GOING ON WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THE MULTIPLE
25 THREATS, WITH THE GLOBAL CHANGE, AND THE SEA LEVEL



JULY 16, 2021

1 RISE, IT'S IMPACTING US, AS WELL AS THE FIRE RISKS,
2 AND OF COURSE, WE READ ABOUT THE DEVASTATING FLOODING
3 IN EUROPE, YESTERDAY, YOU KNOW, HOW IMPORTANT THE
4 WORK OF BARC IS, IS WE COME TOGETHER TO DISCUSS THESE
5 TOPICS IN BRINGING OUR REGIONAL AGENCIES TOGETHER TO
6 ADDRESS THIS. SO, I KNOW WE HAVE GOT OUR WORK CUT OUT
7 FOR US AT TODAY'S MEETING. I THINK IT WILL BE REALLY
8 HELPFUL FOR BARC TO GIVE FEEDBACK ON, KIND OF, NEXT
9 STEPS, AND WE'RE ALSO, ESPECIALLY -- YOU KNOW,
10 FORTUNATE IN THIS ORGANIZATION TO HAVE NOT ONLY THE
11 ELECTED REPRESENTATIVES OF EACH AGENCIES, BUT THE
12 EXECUTIVE STAFF OF EACH OF THE REGIONAL AGENCIES, THE
13 WATER QUALITY BOARD AS WELL AS THE COASTAL
14 CONSERVANCY I THINK WE'RE POSITIONED TO BE A CLEARING
15 HOUSE IN A DISCUSSION POINT IN THE MEETING OF THE
16 MINDS FOR THESE AGENCIES AND WORK ON THESE CRITICAL
17 ISSUES. REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR BEING A PART OF
18 THIS WORK. NEXT IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, THE MINUTES
19 FROM THE MAY 21ST AGENDA. LET ME ASK IF THERE ARE ANY
20 CORRECTIONS TO THE MINUTES? IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
21 COMMENT ON THE MINUTES? I DON'T SEE ANY.

22
23 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS.



JULY 16, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WILL
2 ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

3

4 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** MOVED.

5

6 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOVED BY COMMISSIONER WASSERMAN --
7 I'M TRYING TO THINK OF YOUR TITLE, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
8 WASSERMAN.

9

10 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** I DON'T THINK I HAVE EVER BEEN THAT.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU BRAD. WE HAVE A SECOND.
13 ROLL CALL VOTE?

14

15 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]

16

17 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THE MOTION PASSES.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ITEM FIVE, THE
20 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S BARC UPDATE. MAY WE PLEASE BEGIN
21 WITH MIKE MONTGOMERY IN THE WATER QUALITY CONTROL
22 BOARD.

23

24 **MICHAEL MONTGOMERY:** GREAT. THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING.
25 OUR FOCUS AS OF LATE HAS BEEN MOSTLY ON DROUGHT, AND



JULY 16, 2021

1 MESSAGING OUT A LOT OF THE STATE BOARD MESSAGING
2 AROUND CONSERVATION EFFORTS. WE'VE MET WITH MARIN
3 WATER DISTRICT. WE'RE DOING SOME EMERGENCY PERMITTING
4 TO ALLOW THEM TO DISINFECT SECONDARY TREATED
5 WASTEWATER FOR USE FOR PEOPLE IN THEIR YARDS IN LIEU
6 OF USING THE DRINKING WATER SUPPLY, AND NOW WE'RE
7 TALKING LONGER RANGE WITH THEM ON EMERGENCY WATER
8 SUPPLIES. WE HAVE ALSO BEEN TALKING, YOU KNOW, BEYOND
9 JUST THE MARIN REGION WITH WASTEWATER OPERATORS ABOUT
10 OTHER EMERGENCY MEASURES THAT WE COULD BE TAKING TO
11 INCREASE WATER SUPPLY, FROM WATER RECYCLING. AND THE
12 OTHER BIG DEAL THAT'S HAPPENING STATEWIDE IS RACIAL
13 EQUITY DRAFT RESOLUTION THAT THE STATE BOARD RELEASED
14 ON JUNE 24TH. THIS HAS BEEN UNDERWAY FOR A NUMBER OF
15 MONTHS THERE WERE PUBLIC SESSIONS, LISTENING SESSIONS
16 INTERNALLY WITHIN THE WATER BODE ENTERPRISE WITH 400
17 STAFF PARTICIPATING THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF INPUT AND
18 THAT DRAFT RESOLUTION IS OUT FOR COMMENT AND WILL
19 LIKELY BE ADOPTED BY THE STATE BOARD IN SEPTEMBER. WE
20 HAVE ALSO BEEN WORKING ON OUR OWN RACIAL EQUITY
21 EFFORTS. I WANT TO THANK THE AIR DISTRICT AND
22 VERONICA EADY, THEY HAVE BEEN LEADING THE CHARGE
23 REGIONALLY AND SPENT TIME TALK WITH OUR FOLKS AND WE
24 HAVE LEARNED A LOT FROM THAT CONVERSATION, AND I WANT
25 TO THANK ALLISON FOR THE FORMS SHE PULLED TOGETHER



JULY 16, 2021

1 WHERE ALL OF THE BARC AGENCIES GOT A CHANCE TO TALK
2 ABOUT THIS WORK, AND IT'S REALLY ENCOURAGING. WE'RE
3 GOING TO BE DOING, SORT OF, AN UPDATE TO THE WORK
4 THAT WE'RE DOING IN THE FALL. SO I'M EXCITED. IT'S
5 GOING TO FALL ON EFFORTS OF THE STATEWIDE RESOLUTION
6 ONCE IT'S ADOPTED. AND THAT IS MOST OF WHAT I HAVE TO
7 SHARE. I HAVE SOME GOOD NEWS. YOU KNOW, A WHILE BACK,
8 I MENTIONED, THERE WAS A BOAT THAT WAS STRANDED ON
9 THE COAST OFF OF WEST MARIN, I'M HAPPY TO HEAR THAT
10 THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, WORKING WITH STATE LANDS, HAS
11 COBBLED TOGETHER A FUNDING AND A STRATEGY FOR
12 REMOVING THAT VESSEL. AND, SO I JUST THOUGHT I WOULD
13 CIRCLE BACK, BECAUSE I HAD MENTIONED IT A WHILE BACK
14 AT ONE OF THE PRIOR BARC MEETINGS, AND IT'S GREAT TO
15 SEE THAT TYPE OF COLLABORATION BETWEEN THE STATE AND
16 FEDERAL AGENCIES. AND, THANKFULLY, WE DIDN'T HAVE TO
17 GET THAT INVOLVED. IT'S GREAT TO SEE THAT COME
18 TOGETHER. THERE IS ALSO SOME OTHER EFFORTS ON
19 DERELICT VESSELS, I KNOW BCDC HAS BEEN LEADING THE
20 CHARGE ON THAT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR REPORT
23 ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS? THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LARRY,
24 BCDC?

25



JULY 16, 2021

1 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT ONE
2 THING, WHICH IS SOME REALLY GOOD NEWS. A NUMBER OF
3 YEARS AGO THE CALIFORNIA STATE AUDITOR RELEASED AN
4 AUDIT ON THE BCDC ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM EFFORTS WHICH
5 WAS FAR LESS THAN FLATTERING WITH BCDC, BASICALLY
6 TOLD THE COMMISSION, STATE AUDITOR IS THAT WE
7 DISAGREE WITH YOUR CHARACTERIZATION AND
8 RECOMMENDATIONS. BCDC STAFF BECAUSE OF THE STATE OF
9 CALIFORNIA WAS ABLE TO PROVIDE FUNDING TO BCDC TO
10 HIRE AN ENFORCEMENT MANAGER FOR THE FIRST TIME AND
11 ATTORNEY FOR THE FIRST TIME, RESPONDED TO THE AUDIT,
12 OF THE 20 OR SO RECOMMENDATIONS THAT THE AUDIT MADE.
13 BCDC HAS ADOPTED VERSIONS OF PROBABLY 16 OR 17 OF
14 THEM. AND, SO THE AUDIT HAS TURNED OUT TO BE VERY
15 USEFUL IN TERMS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS. BUT, THE
16 POINTS OF WHAT I'M SAYING, REALLY, IS THAT IT, REALLY
17 GOES TO WHOM YOU HIRE. BECAUSE, YESTERDAY, AT THE
18 BCDC COMMISSION MEETING, IN WHAT IS A, SORT OF
19 REGULAR EVERY ENFORCEMENT UPDATE -- ALTHOUGH IT WAS A
20 MONTH BEHIND BECAUSE OF ISSUE NOT RELATED TO
21 ENFORCEMENT. THE COMMISSION WAS TOLD THAT AT THE END
22 OF 2020, THERE WERE 211 ENFORCEMENT CASES THAT WERE
23 ACTIVE. AS OF JUNE 30TH, THAT NUMBER HAD DROPPED BY,
24 BASICALLY, A THIRD. AND THE NUMBER OF CASES THAT HAD
25 BEEN OPENED AND CLOSED, ALSO, HAD BEEN DROPPING BY



JULY 16, 2021

1 SIGNIFICANT AMOUNTS, AND THAT IS BECAUSE THE FOLKS
2 THAT WE HIRED TO FILL THOSE TWO NEW POSITIONS HAVE
3 DONE AN ABSOLUTELY TREMENDOUS JOB AT MAKING A PROCESS
4 ACTUALLY WORK. AND TO DO THAT, THEY ACTUALLY HAD TO
5 DEVELOP A PROCESS, AND IN DEVELOPING THE PROCESS,
6 WHAT THEY HAVE SAID, AND WHAT THEY WILL CONTINUE TO
7 SAY, IS THAT THERE ARE FOUR PARTS TO ANY ENFORCEMENT
8 PROGRAM. DETERRENCE TO REMOVE THE INCENTIVE TO
9 VIOLATE THE LAWS AND POLICIES, TRANSPARENCY TO
10 CLEARLY COMMUNICATE EXPECTATIONS, ENSURE PROCESSES
11 ARE KNOWN AND UNDERSTOOD, CONSISTENCY E MAINTAINING A
12 CLEAR DOCUMENTED ENFORCEMENT PROCESS THAT'S PUBLICLY
13 TRANSPARENT AND CONSISTENT, AND FAIRNESS TO TREAT
14 VIOLATION SIMILAR IN NATURE AND IMPACT THE BAY IN
15 PUBLIC ACCESS SIMILARLY AND WITH ALL OF THAT I CAN
16 TELL THAT YOU THE COMMISSION, I THINK, HAS REALLY
17 RESPONDED VERY WELL, INDEED THE ENFORCEMENT COMMITTEE
18 OF THE COMMISSION, WHICH WAS LED UNTIL A COUPLE OF
19 WEEKS AGO BY GREG SCHARFF OF PALO ALTO WHO IS NOW
20 BCDC'S NEW GENERAL COUNSEL, AND NOW MARIE GILLMOR WHO
21 IS THE FORMER MAYOR OF ALAMEDA HAS BEEN ABSOLUTELY
22 TREMENDOUS IN PROVIDING LEADERSHIP. I WANTED TO GIVE
23 YOU AN UPDATE ON ONE ASPECT OF WHAT BCDC DOES. THANK
24 YOU.

25



JULY 16, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATE.
2 THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS? OKAY. MOVING ON TO OUR NEXT
3 ITEM, THE AIR DISTRICT, VERONICA MAY I TURN TO YOU,
4 PLEASE?
5
6 **VERONICA EADY:** ABSOLUTELY, THANK YOU, CHAIR. FIRST
7 OF ALL, SOME OF YOU HAVE HEARD I'M STANDING IN FOR
8 JACK BROADBENT WHO COULDN'T BE HERE TODAY. JUST A
9 QUICK UPDATE, A COUPLE EVER -- OF THINGS. FIRST I
10 WANT TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION NEXT WEEK ON THE 21ST
11 OUR BOARD IS GOING TO TAKE UP AND HOPEFULLY FINALIZE
12 RULE 6-5 WHICH IS A VERY HIGH PROFILE AND
13 CONTROVERSIAL RULE ON REFINERIES HAVING TO DO WITH
14 THE FLUID CATALYTIC CRACKING UNITS, THE PARTICULATE
15 MATTER FROM REFINERIES, THE CHEVRON REFINERY IN
16 MARTINEZ, IT'S A MATTER THAT'S BEEN CONTINUED, AT OUR
17 BODE MEETING, IN JUNE WE HAD ABOUT 260 COMMENTERS.
18 IT'S REALLY SIGNIFICANT. HOPEFULLY THE BOARD WILL BE
19 ABLE TO WRAP IT UPCOMING UP ON THIS WEDNESDAY. AND
20 JACK HAS BEEN KEEPING ALL OF YOU ABREAST OF OUR
21 COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL EFFORT, SO WE ARE IN THE
22 PROCESS OF SEATING A COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE
23 THAT WILL ADVISE STAFF, AS WELL AS THE BOARD ON
24 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AND OTHER EQUITY OTHER AND
25 THINGS THAT ARE IMPACTING THEIR COMMUNITIES. WE ARE -



JULY 16, 2021

1 - YOU KNOW, INCHING TOWARDS HAVING THIS PANEL SEATED.
2 IT'S VERY TRICKY. I AM SURE THAT, LARRY, YOU AT BCDC
3 KNOW HOW TRICKY THIS IS, AND WE'RE ACTUALLY REALLY
4 GRATEFUL THAT WE ARE ABLE TO LEARN SOME LESSONS FROM
5 YOU. AND SEATING YOUR AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
6 ADVISORS. WE'RE LOOKING TOWARDS HAVING ABOUT 15
7 MEMBERS, RIGHT NOW WE'RE WORKING WITH THE BOARD TO
8 FIGURE OUT HOW MANY MEMBERS COME FROM EACH ONE OF THE
9 NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. SO IT'S SOMEWHAT COMPLICATED.
10 AND ON A RELATED MATTER, WE'RE ALSO PUTTING TOGETHER
11 A POLICY ON STIPENDS. YES. WE HAVE HEARD FROM OUR EJ
12 STAKEHOLDERS AGAIN AND AGAIN, BUT IT'S REALLY
13 IMPORTANT TO COMPENSATE THEM FOR THE TIME THAT THEY
14 SPEND, BASICALLY E TEACHING US, AND TEACHING US HOW
15 TO WORK WITH THEM. SO WE'RE WORKING ON THAT. ONE
16 THING WORTH NOTING IS THAT THE CALIFORNIA AIR
17 RESOURCES BOARD, CARB, RECENTLY UPPED THEIR STIPENDS
18 FOR THE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE COMMITTEE FROM \$100 PER
19 MEETING TO \$500 PER MEETING. THAT'S REALLY PUSHING US
20 IN A PARTICULAR DIRECTION. ALTHOUGH THAT'S NOT AT ALL
21 TO SUGGEST THAT EVERY ENCOUNTER THAT WE HAVE, EVERY
22 BIT OF ADVICE THAT WE GET FROM COMMUNITY JUSTICE --
23 FROM ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVOCATES ARE ALSO GOING
24 TO GET THAT \$500 STIPEND. IF WE DO ADOPT THAT, IF THE
25 BOARD ADOPTS IT, THAT WILL CERTAINLY BE ON THE HIGH



JULY 16, 2021

1 END. SO THAT'S SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT. THE LAST
2 THING I WANT TO MENTION IS THE SUMMER YOUTH ACADEMY
3 WHICH WE'RE PARTNERING WITH MTC ON, WE'RE REALLY
4 EXCITED. WE KICKED IT OFF THE LAST WEEK, AND HAVE A
5 REALLY GREAT GROUP OF YOUTH. AND SO WE'RE REALLY
6 EXCITED TO BE ABLE TO PARTNER WITH MTC ON THAT.
7 FINALLY, I JUST WANT TO PUT, LIKE, A LITTLE BUG IN
8 YOUR EAR THAT, YOU US EPA HAS KICKED OFF A REALLY
9 INTERESTING SPEAKER SERIES CALLED POLLUTION AND
10 PREJUDICE. I THINK THUS FAR, THEY HAVE HAD ONE
11 SESSION WITH SPEAKERS TALKING -- AND IT MIGHT
12 ACTUALLY HAVE BEEN THE DEPARTMENT OF TOXIC SUBSTANCE
13 CONTROL AND CAL EPA -- BUT WE'RE GOING TO BE FEATURED
14 ON AUGUST 19TH AND REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO IT. SO,
15 AS MORE INFORMATION ON THAT IS AVAILABLE, WE WOULD BE
16 HAPPY TO SHARE IT YOU CAN. SO THAT'S IT

17

18 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THAT REPORT.
19 AND WHEN YOU HAVE THE DETAILS ABOUT THE SEMINAR,
20 PLEASE FORWARD IT TO ALL -- ALL THE AGENCIES, AND WE
21 CAN GET IT OUT TO EVERYONE THAT'S INVOLVED IN THE BAY
22 AREA REGION. SO, IT'S GREAT TO SEE OUR WONDERFUL AIR
23 DISTRICT HIGHLIGHTED NATIONALLY. SO, TERRIFIC, AS YOU
24 ALWAYS ARE, A LEADER IN THIS FIELD. BUT I WANT TO SEE



JULY 16, 2021

1 IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS. AND I SEE ZACK HAS A
2 QUESTION.

3

4 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** IT'S NOT FULLY A QUESTION. IT'S A
5 COMMENT. I ABSOLUTELY UNDERSTAND WHY STIPENDS FOR
6 MEMBERS OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE COMMUNITIES ARE
7 CRITICAL TO THEIR PARTICIPATION. AND, I THINK IT
8 WOULD BE VERY EASY TO ARGUE THAT 250, AS AN EXAMPLE,
9 IS NOT ENOUGH. I AM A LITTLE WORRIED ABOUT THE LAW OF
10 UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES. THIS COULD AFFECT THE CARB'S
11 ACTION YOU DESCRIBED, IT COULD AFFECT NOT JUST SIMPLY
12 EJ ADVISORY COMMITTEES, IT COULD AFFECT STIPENDS
13 ACROSS THE BOARD, AND MAYBE IT SHOULD. I MEAN, MAYBE,
14 STIPENDS FOR ANY NUMBER OF PARTICIPATING
15 ORGANIZATIONS, WHETHER FROM IMPACTED COMMUNITIES, OR
16 THOSE OF YOU ON THIS ZOOM MEETING, WHO MAY SIT ON
17 BOARDS, WHERE PER DIEMS, OR STIPENDS ARE
18 SIGNIFICANTLY LESS THAN THAT, I HOPE THAT AS PART OF
19 THE OVERALL DIALOGUE, THIS IS NOT OF THE AIR DISTRICT
20 PER SE ALTHOUGH YOU ARE IMMEDIATELY IMPACTED. JUST A
21 NOTE OF CAUTION THERE THAT IT OUGHT TO BE CONSIDERED
22 AND DISCUSSED.

23

24 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENT. JOHN?

25



JULY 16, 2021

1 **JOHN GIOIA:** I WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT JUST SO IT'S
2 HELPFUL. ZACK, I HEAR WHAT YOU'RE SAYING.
3 REPRESENTING AN EJ COMMUNITY, I THINK THERE IS A REAL
4 DISTINCTION THAT WE CAN ALL MAKE. THERE ARE MANY OF
5 THESE COMMUNITY BODIES THAT ARE SETUP, AND WHAT OFTEN
6 HAPPENS IS THAT THE BUSINESS REPRESENTATIVES ARE ALL
7 PARTICIPATING -- BUSINESS AND INDUSTRY
8 REPRESENTATIVES PARTICIPATE IN THESE VARIOUS BODIES,
9 SOMETIMES, AND THEY'RE ALL BEING PAID, RIGHT? BECAUSE
10 THEY'RE DOING IT AS PART OF THEIR JOB. AND THEN THE
11 COMMUNITY MEMBERS, WHO ARE ALSO EXPERTS IN THEIR
12 COMMUNITY, ARE DOING THIS AS VOLUNTEER, WHILE
13 BALANCING THEIR OTHER WORK AND FAMILY COMMITMENTS.
14 AND THEN I GET, FOR -- SO, AS TO THOSE KINDS OF
15 COMMUNITY ADVISORY BODIES, WHICH WE'RE TALKING ABOUT,
16 IT SEEMS THERE HAS BEEN THIS DISPARITY WITH, YOU
17 KNOW, BUSINESS PEOPLE ON THESE -- BECAUSE THERE ARE
18 SOME BUSINESS PEOPLE ON THE COMMUNITY STEERING
19 COMMITTEE, AB 617 STEERING COMMITTEE, THE ONE FOR
20 RICHMOND, AND THEY'RE GETTING PAID. BECAUSE THEY'RE
21 DOING THIS PART OF THEIR JOB. BUT THE RESIDENTS ARE,
22 ON AN EQUAL LEVEL, PROVIDING INPUT FROM THEIR
23 COMMUNITY, AND ARE NOT. AND I THINK MORE AND MORE,
24 WE'RE SEEING THE IMPORTANCE OF, SORT OF, PROVIDING
25 SOME EQUITY THERE. SO I'M JUST PROVIDING INFORMATION



JULY 16, 2021

1 SO WE CAN ALL HAVE A RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT YOU
2 MADE. I THINK IT -- AND I GET FOR THOSE OF US -- I
3 DON'T THINK IT FORMS A PRECEDENT FOR THOSE OF US ON
4 THESE, AND I THINK FOR US AS COUNTY SUPERVISORS ARE
5 PAID A FULL-TIME WAGE FOR A JOB CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS
6 ARE NOT. BUT I DO THINK THERE IS A DISTINCTION ON
7 THESE COMMUNITY BODIES. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT.
8 BECAUSE WE HEAR FROM -- I THINK, FRANKLY, AND I HAVE
9 SAID THIS TO THE AIR DISTRICT, I THINK THE STIPENDS
10 WE PAY ON SOME OF THESE ARE UNDERPAID, AND THESE ARE
11 FOLKS SPENDING AN ENORMOUS AMOUNT OF THEIR TIME TO
12 GIVE EXPERT INPUT ON BEHALF OF THEIR COMMUNITIES, AND
13 THEY DESERVE TO BE PAID.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SINCE THIS ISN'T ON OUR AGENDA, I
16 THINK IT'S PROBABLY PRUDENT WE CAN BRING IT BACK TO
17 HAVE A NOTICED DISCUSSION ABOUT IT. DAVE S THAT ALL
18 RIGHT? I SEE YOUR HAND UP. WHY DON'T WE KEEP GOING. I
19 THINK WE'RE RAISING GOOD POINTS, AND I THINK EACH
20 AGENCY IS GOING TO BE GRAPPLING WITH ANY OF THE
21 ISSUES THAT WE DISCUSS HERE TODAY. IF WE CAN DO THAT,
22 KEEP GOING. AND ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS,
23 VERONICA? OKAY. THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR YOUR REPORT.
24 THANKS OKAY. AND OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS THERESE
25 MCMILLAN TO COVER THE REPORT FROM ABAG AND MTC.



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH, CHAIR
3 WORTH. AND HELLO EVERYONE. I WILL BE BRIEF BECAUSE
4 THERE IS LOTS THAT WE NEED TO JUMP INTO ON THE AGENDA
5 TODAY. THREE POINTS. OUR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLAN
6 AND ITS ACCOMPANYING EIR IS APPROACHING THE END OF
7 THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD, WHICH CLOSSES ON JULY 20TH
8 OF 2021. WE'RE -- HAD A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF
9 OUTREACH, IN THIS INTERVENING PERIOD, AND WE'RE
10 LOOKING FORWARD TO -- FINGERERS CROSSED -- OF A
11 SUCCESSFUL ADOPTION OF THIS WORK THAT YOU WILL HEAR
12 ABOUT TODAY. IT REALLY PROVIDES A DIFFERENT, AND
13 FOUNDATIONALLY DIFFERENT BASIS FOR REGIONAL WORK
14 GOING FORWARD, ON A WHOLE NUMBER OF FRONTS. SO, IT'S
15 BEEN THREE -- ALMOST THREE YEARS IN THE MAKING, AND I
16 JUST WANT TO THANK EVERYONE HERE, PARTICULARLY
17 COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS, WHO
18 PUT AN EXTRAORDINARY AMOUNT OF TIME INTO KEEPING THIS
19 EFFORT MOVING FORWARD. ANOTHER REGION -- JUST FULL
20 OF REGIONAL INITIATIVES -- THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
21 ASSESSMENT PROCESS, AND I SEE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN HERE
22 FROM ABAG, IS ALSO APPROACHING A MILESTONE, THE
23 NUMBERS HAVE BEEN RELEASED LAST MONTH, AND THERE IS A
24 PERIOD -- I GUESS IT WAS IN MAY -- GOSH, THE TIME
25 FLIES -- THERE WAS A PERIOD OF APPEALS TO BE MADE TO



JULY 16, 2021

1 THE ASSIGNED REGIONAL NUMBERS, THAT CLOSED ON JULY
2 THE 9TH, AND WE RECEIVED 28 APPEALS FROM
3 JURISDICTIONS ON THE NUMBERS THAT ABAG HAD ASSIGNED
4 TO THEM. BY AUGUST 30TH, THERE IS A DEADLINE FOR
5 COMMENTS ON THE APPEALS, AND THEN WE WILL INITIATE A
6 HEARING PROCESS THAT PRESIDENT ARREGUIN WILL BE
7 OVERSEEING. SO, THAT IS A -- AS YOU ALL KNOW, A
8 REALLY SIGNIFICANT EIGHT-YEAR-CYCLE, ON BASICALLY
9 SETTING OUT THE NEXT PATH OF COMMITMENT TO DEALING
10 WITH OUR HOUSING CRISIS HERE IN THE REGION. SO, THAT
11 IS, AGAIN, ANOTHER SIGNIFICANT EFFORT. FINALLY, I
12 WANT TO COMMENT ON THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY
13 TASK FORCE AND THE WORK THAT THAT AD-HOC WORKGROUP
14 HAS BEEN DOING. AND COMMISSIONER SPERING IS THE CHAIR
15 OF THAT GROUP. THAT, ALSO, IS APPROACHING A MAJOR
16 MILESTONE. THE FINAL MEETING FOR THAT GROUP IS ON
17 JULY THE 26TH. I WOULD SAY THAT IT'S THE CLOSE OF THE
18 FIRST PHASE. [LAUGHTER] THERE IS SIGNIFICANT WORK
19 AHEAD FOR THE COMMISSION, PURSUING RECOMMENDATIONS
20 THAT WILL BE COMING FROM THAT, BUT AS A REMINDER,
21 THIS WAS INITIATED WHEN COVID HIT, BACK IN, YOU KNOW,
22 THE SPRING OF 2020, AND THE TRANSIT COMMUNITY, ACROSS
23 THE NATION, AND CERTAINLY HERE IN THE BAY AREA, HAD
24 EXPERIENCED SEISMIC, YOU KNOW, DECLINES IN TRANSIT
25 RIDERSHIP, AND THEY HAVE BEEN, YOU KNOW, ON A REALLY



JULY 16, 2021

1 DIFFICULT JOURNEY BACK. THE HEALTH OF OUR TRANSIT
2 COMMUNITY IS A CRITICAL PART OF OUR ECONOMIC
3 RECOVERY, AND SO THE WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
4 FORCE IN LOOK AT HOW WE CAN COME BACK BETTER AND
5 STRONGER, WITH A MUCH MORE IMPACTFUL FOCUS ON OUR
6 TRANSIT CUSTOMERS IS A CRITICAL PART OF ONGOING WORK.
7 SO, JUST WANTED TO MENTION THAT THAT'S ALSO HAPPENING
8 IN JULY. [LAUGHTER] SO, A LOT OF MILESTONES, WITH A
9 LOT OF WORK, AND MANY OF YOU HAVE BEEN PART OF THAT.
10 AND WE THANK YOU FOR YOUR PAST AND CURRENT
11 COMMITMENTS TO SEEING THIS FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU,
12 CHAIR.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU THERESE FOR THAT REPORT.
15 ANY QUESTIONS? MOVING ON. AMY IS HERE FROM THE
16 COASTAL CONSERVANCY?

17

18 **ALLISON BROOKS:** UNABLE TO JOIN US.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YES, EXACTLY. WE KNEW THAT IN
21 ADVANCE. SO WE WILL LOOK TO THAT REPORT IN SEPTEMBER.
22 AND THEN, MOVING ON, NEXT, TO OUR EXECUTIVE -- BEFORE
23 WE GET TO ITEM SIX, WHICH IS OUR BARC EXECUTIVE
24 DIRECTOR, LET ME JUST ASK, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
25 COMMENT ON ITEM FIVE?



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I DON'T SEE ANY. TERRIFIC. WE
5 RECEIVED NO CORRESPOND, AS WELL, IN ADVANCE OF THE
6 MEETING?

7

8 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** CORRECT.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** WE'LL MOVE TO ALLISON BROOKS OUR
11 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR HER REPORT.

12

13 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR WORTH. I
14 APPRECIATE YOUR LEADERSHIP. WHAT I'M GOING TO DO
15 TODAY IS REALLY, KIND OF, SET US UP FOR A
16 CONVERSATION, AND INTRODUCE, HAND IT OVER SHORTLY TO
17 BCDC, WHO IS GOING TO PRESENT ON THE BAY ADAPT JOINT
18 PLATFORM, WHICH IS A MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PROCESS THAT
19 OUTLINES A SET OF HIGH LEVEL ACTIONS TO MANAGE OUR
20 SEA LEVEL RISE IN THE REGION, AND I SERVED ON THE
21 LEADERSHIP ADVISORY GROUP ON THAT. HOPEFULLY ALL OF
22 HAD YOU A CHANCE TO SEE THE ARTICLE, JOHN KINGS
23 ARTICLE IN THE CHRONICLE TODAY. HE IS BACK TO DOING A
24 SERIES OF ARTICLES ON SALE LEVEL RISE, TODAY IT WAS
25 ABOUT HIGHWAY 37, AND IT WAS REALLY WELL DONE. AND I



JULY 16, 2021

1 THINK IT HIGHLIGHTED, ALREADY, THE WORK THAT'S
2 HAPPENING ACROSS OUR AGENCIES AROUND MULTI-HAZARDS,
3 IN THIS CASE, SEA LEVEL RISE. AND YOU KNOW, HAS
4 INTERVIEWS AND QUOTES FROM A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT WE'RE
5 WORKING WITH ALREADY. BUT I THINK HIGHLIGHTED, YOU
6 KNOW, THIS IS JUST REALLY -- LET'S JUST CALL HIGHWAY
7 37 THE CANARY IN THE COAL MINE, IF YOU WILL, IT'S
8 JUST THE FIRST SET OF PROJECTS THAT WE'RE GOING TO
9 HAVE TO IMPLEMENT ACROSS THE REGION TO REDUCE OUR
10 RISK TO SEA LEVEL RISE, AND IT'S -- IT'S INSTRUMENTAL
11 THAT WE WORK TOGETHER. THERE IS NO ONE AGENCY, NO ONE
12 ORGANIZATION OR ENTITY THAT CAN MANAGE CLIMATE
13 CHANGE, AND THE IMPACTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE, AND
14 CERTAINLY THE MITIGATION SIDE, AS WELL. I THINK THE
15 PURPOSE OF TODAY IS REALLY TO REINFORCE THE VALUE OF
16 OUR WORK TOGETHER ACROSS OUR AGENCIES. AND, YOU KNOW,
17 WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM -- ABOUT BAY ADAPT, BUT ALSO
18 AT THE STATEMENT TIME, WHICH THERESA, ALLUDED TO,
19 PLANNED BAY AREA AND IMPLEMENTING STRATEGIES AROUND
20 SEA LEVEL RISE HAPPENING CURRENTLY THESE ARE
21 HAPPENING IN AN ALIGNED AND INTEGRATED WAY AND
22 DEMONSTRATING THAT WE'RE DEVELOPING A JOINT WORK PLAN
23 TOGETHER TO TACKLE THIS THREAT IN A HIGHLY
24 COORDINATED WAY MORE SO THAN WE EVER HAVE BEFORE, AND
25 I WOULD ALSO SAY HOW IMPORTANT IT IS, AS REGIONAL



JULY 16, 2021

1 AGENCIES, TO REALLY DEVELOP A SYMBIOTIC -- A
2 PRODUCTIVE RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
3 BECAUSE ULTIMATELY THAT'S WHERE THE RUBBER HITS THE
4 PROVERBIAL ROAD. YOU KNOW? WE NEED RESOURCES AND
5 TECHNICAL SUPPORT FLOWING TO WHERE THE IMPLEMENTATION
6 PLANS AND WORK HAPPENS, AND THAT'S ON THE GROUND. OF
7 COURSE, WE HAVE BIG INFRASTRUCTURE LIKE OUR
8 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS THAT CROSS MULTIPLE
9 JURISDICTIONS THAT REQUIRE REGIONAL APPROACHES AND
10 REGIONAL COORDINATION AROUND THAT, AS WELL. SO, YOU
11 KNOW, AT THE SAME TIME, TOO, WE HAVE -- AND THIS IS
12 SNAG WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON ACROSS AGENCIES -- IS TO
13 INFLUENCE LEGISLATION. YOU KNOW, WE CURRENTLY HAVE
14 THE STATE BUDGET INCLUDED, 3.7 BILLION FOR MULTI-
15 HAZARD RESILIENCY AND HAZARD PLANNING, FIGURING OUT
16 THE DETAILS OF THAT, POSITIONING OURSELVES AS
17 AGENCIES WORKING TOGETHER TO MAXIMIZE THOSE RESOURCES
18 TO HELP US MEET OUR GOALS AND THEN THERE IS SOME
19 LEGISLATION MOVING FORWARD, ASSEMBLY BILL 897 WHICH
20 IS AROUND BUILDING MULTI-HAZARD REGIONAL CLIMATE
21 ADAPTATION NETWORKS. I PAUSE IT THAT BARC IS REALLY
22 MADE TO SERVE THAT FUNCTION FOR OUR REGION, AND THE
23 WORK WE'RE DOING TOGETHER TO POSITION OURSELVES TO
24 HELP ADVANCE STRATEGIES AROUND ADAPTATION LIKE WHAT
25 WE'RE GOING HEAR FROM BCDC, AND THEIR LEADERSHIP ON



JULY 16, 2021

1 HELPING TO DEVELOP A SET OF STRATEGIES AROUND SEA
2 LEVEL RISE. SO, YOU KNOW, WE'LL HEAR FROM BCDC, BUT
3 WE'VE ALSO WORKED TOGETHER TO FACILITATE A DISCUSSION
4 AROUND NEXT STEPS ON -- AND IN THE MEMO, YOU RECEIVED
5 FROM ME, SOME RECOMMENDATIONS FOR HOW WE CAN MOVE
6 THIS FORWARD, AND REALLY FORMALIZE. A LOT OF WORK
7 WE'RE ALREADY DOING, WHICH WAS HIGHLIGHTED IN JOHN
8 KING'S ARTICLE, WE ALREADY ARE, IN MANY WAYS, AHEAD
9 OF THE CURVE IN COLLABORATION, IN OUR INTEGRATED WORK
10 TOGETHER, BUT THAT THIS WOULD BE A WAY FOR US TO JUST
11 FORMALIZE IT FURTHER AND DEVELOP, PERHAPS, A
12 RESOLUTION TO BRING FORWARD IN SEPTEMBER, A MORE
13 INTEGRATED JOINT WORK PLAN TO HIGHLIGHT WHAT EACH
14 AGENCY IS CONTRIBUTING TO THE WHOLE IN TERMS OF
15 HELPING OUR CLIMATE ADAPTATION EFFORTS. AND THEN,
16 JUST, BEFORE I HAND IT OVER, I THINK ZACK IS GOING TO
17 HELP INTRODUCE THE ITEM FOR BCDC. YOU KNOW, IT'S
18 JUST, THE DECIDE AND CONQUER APPROACH IT MAY HAVE
19 WORKED AT ONE POINT BUT EACH -- I THINK WHAT WE WANT
20 TO SEE IS EACH AGENCY IS TAKING ON PERHAPS DISCRETE
21 ASPECTS OF IT, BUT WE'RE WORKING IN CONCERT TOGETHER
22 TO UNDERSTAND HOW ANY ACTIVITY IS WORKING TOGETHER
23 WITH THE ACTIVITIES OF OTHER AGENCIES TO REALLY
24 DELIVER OUTCOMES AROUND ADAPTATION AND ADDRESS
25 CLIMATE CHANGE IN A COHERENT AND STRATEGIC WAY. I



JULY 16, 2021

1 THINK THAT'S THE NATURE OF THE CONVERSATION, MADAM
2 CHAIR, THAT WE'RE HOPING TO HAVE TODAY. AND GETTING
3 SOME CLARITY ON THOSE ROLES, AND GETTING BACK TO THE
4 EQUITY PIECE, AS WELL. YOU KNOW, HOW IMPORTANT THIS
5 COORDINATED WORK AROUND MAKING SURE OUR MOST
6 VULNERABLE IN OUR FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES ARE FRONT AND
7 CENTER IN OUR STRATEGIES IS ALSO CRITICALLY
8 IMPORTANT. WITH THAT, I'M HAPPY TO FILL IN QUESTIONS.
9 BUT I THINK WE COULD MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM AND
10 HAVE BCDC GIVE THEM SOME TIME TO SHARE THE WORK THEY
11 HAVE BEEN LEADING ON THE BAY ADAPT PLATFORM.

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, ALLISON. THANK YOU VERY MUCH
14 FOR YOUR REPORT AND YOUR LEADERSHIP AND BRINGING ALL
15 OF US TOGETHER. YOU HAVE DONE A PHENOMENAL JOB. THERE
16 HAS BEEN A LOT OF TIME THAT HAS GOTTEN TO THIS POINT
17 IN TERMS OF TALKING ABOUT ISSUES HOW WE COME TOGETHER
18 AND BARC AND ALL THE REGIONAL AGENCIES AND THE
19 EXCELLENT WORK THAT THEY DO IN BRINGING THAT
20 TOGETHER. BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM, LET ME
21 JUST ASK IF THERE IS ANY QUESTIONS ON ALLISON'S
22 COMMENTS? I KNOW WE'LL HAVE MORE TO DISCUSS WHAT SHE
23 HAS JUST PRESENTED. LET ME ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC
24 COMMENT? OKAY. GREAT. THEN WE'LL BRING IT BACK TO
25 ITEM SEVEN. AND I THINK, AS ALLISON HAS INDICATED,



JULY 16, 2021

1 WE'LL START WITH THE BCDC DISCUSSION, THE
2 PRESENTATION, AND THEN THE NEXT PIECE OF OUR
3 DISCUSSION WILL BE KIND OF LOOKING AT THE BROADER
4 ISSUES OF HOW, YOU KNOW, BARC CAN BE ENGAGED, AND HOW
5 ALL OF OUR AGENCIES CAN WORK TOGETHER ON THIS ISSUE.
6 YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE POINTS THAT JOHN KING MADE IN
7 THIS SEMINAR THAT HE MODERATED BEFORE THE BAY
8 PLANNING COALITION IS, IN FACT, THE CHALLENGE OF THE
9 ISSUES OF CLIMATE CHANGE, BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, HOW DO
10 YOU MAINTAIN THE URGENCY? MAINTAIN THE URGENCY E
11 KEEPING THE WORK MOVING FORWARD AND KEEPING THE WORK
12 IN THE PUBLIC EYE. I'M REALLY GRATEFUL WE CAN HAVE
13 THIS DISCUSSION TODAY AND CONTINUE THE WORK THAT WE
14 DO. SO I'M GRATEFUL FOR THE BCDC REPORT, FOR US TO
15 DISCUSS. SO, MAY I TURN, NOW, TO ITEM SEVEN, WHICH IS
16 THE REPORT ON BAY ADAPT, AND THE CLIMATE ADAPTATION
17 GOVERNANCE. SO, MAY I FIRST TURN TO JESSICA FOR THE
18 BCDC REPORT ON THIS ASPECT OF THIS ITEM?

19

20 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** I THINK I ACTUALLY GET TO START OFF.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OH, I'M SORRY, MR. CHAIR. FORGIVE
23 ME. OH MY GOSH. I'M SORRY, ZACK.

24

25 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** THAT'S ALL RIGHT.



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I KNEW ZACK'S WIFE LONG BEFORE I
3 KNEW ZACK. [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU, SIR.

4

5 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** THANK YOU ALL FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO
6 MAKE THIS PRESENTATION, AND THANK YOU, AMY AND
7 ALLISON FOR SETTING IT UP SO WELL. I WILL COME BACK
8 TO YOUR REMARKS IN JUST A MOMENT. BCDC HAS BEEN
9 LEADING THE EFFORT ON HOW WE'RE GOING TO ADAPT TO
10 RISING SEA LEVEL IN THE BAY FOR A GOOD AMOUNT OF
11 TIME. IT DEPENDS ON WHERE YOU WANT TO SET YOUR
12 MARKER. YOU CAN EASILY SET IT ABOUT 12 OR 13 YEARS
13 AGO, WHEN THEY BEGAN THE PROCESS FOR ADOPTING THE
14 AMENDMENT TO THE BAY PLAN, OUR GOVERNING DOCUMENT, TO
15 ADDRESS RISING SEA LEVEL. BUT CERTAINLY EFFORTS HAVE
16 INCREASED OVER THAT TIME AND INCREASED SIGNIFICANTLY
17 OVER THE LAST 18 MONTHS. WHAT WE REALLY WANT TO DO
18 WITH THIS DISCUSSION, AND I'M GOING TO PROBABLY BE A
19 LITTLE LONGER THAN I WOULD LIKE, BUT I'M GOING TO
20 MAKE IT FOR YOU, IS ENGAGE YOUR INPUT ON HOW WE CAN
21 BEST INVOLVE LEADERS AT THE LOCAL LEVEL, AS WELL AS
22 HOW WE CAN BEST COORDINATE EVEN MORE THAN WE HAVE, SO
23 FAR, WITH OUR OTHER REGIONAL AGENCIES, BOTH OF THOSE
24 ARE GOING TO BE ABSOLUTELY CRITICAL TO SUCCESS. THE
25 LAST 18 MONTHS, IN PARTICULAR, HAS BEEN A VERY HIGHLY



JULY 16, 2021

1 COLLABORATIVE EFFORT. WE HAVE HAD, LITERALLY,
2 HUNDREDS OF STAKEHOLDERS FROM CITIES, NON-PROFITS,
3 COMMUNITY GROUPS, AND THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY
4 PARTICIPATING IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF BAY ADAPT THAT
5 JESSICA IS GOING TO DESCRIBE TO YOU, PRIMARILY,
6 THROUGH A 35-PERSON LEADERSHIP ADVISORY GROUP
7 REPRESENTING THOSE. AND THAT GROUP, REALLY, ACHIEVED
8 A MILESTONE LAST MONTH, BECAUSE THEY UNANIMOUSLY
9 AGREED TO ADOPTION OF A PLATFORM THAT IS -- IS BAY
10 ADAPT, THAT WILL BE PRESENTED FOR YOU. AND WHEN WE
11 SAY PLATFORM, IT'S REALLY THE FRAMEWORK TO LEAD US TO
12 ADOPTING THE REGIONAL PLAN TO DO THE ADAPTATION THAT
13 WE NEED TO DO, TO ADDRESS RISING SEA LEVEL, TO
14 PROTECT OUR NATURAL ENVIRONMENT AND OUR BUILT
15 ENVIRONMENT, AND OUR PEOPLE FROM WHAT WE KNOW IS
16 INEVITABLY GOING TO HAPPEN. IN ADVANCE OF THIS
17 MEETING, WE DID MEET WITH A NUMBER OF REGIONAL
18 LEADERS, CHAIRS OF SOME OF THE GROUPS REPRESENTED
19 HERE, TO START DEALING WITH THE QUESTIONS THAT WE
20 WANT TO PRESENT TO YOU AND HELP REFINE THEM. AND THE
21 SORT OF TWO BIG QUESTIONS ARE, WHAT'S BEST WAY --
22 WHAT ARE THE BEST MECHANISMS AND APPROACHES THAT WE
23 CAN USE TO ENSURE THAT LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIALS ARE
24 KNOWLEDGEABLE, ENGAGED, AND LEADING LOCAL EFFORTS TO
25 ACHIEVE OUR REGIONAL RISING SEA LEVEL ADAPTATION



JULY 16, 2021

1 GOALS. BECAUSE THE ADAPTATION ACTIONS THAT NEED TO BE
2 TAKEN WILL PRIMARILY BE TAKEN BY CITIES AND COUNTIES,
3 AND A FEW SPECIAL DISTRICTS. AND, SECOND, HOW DO WE
4 CREATE BOTH EFFECTIVE COORDINATION, BUT ALSO
5 ACCOUNTABILITY, AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL, INCLUDING
6 LOCAL AGENCIES, AND DO WE NEED SOME FORMAL MECHANISMS
7 FOR THAT. AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN GET INPUT ON THAT,
8 BECAUSE ALL OF THIS IS INTERESTING, HOW WE INCREASE
9 THE INTEREST IN ADAPTATION TO RISING SEA LEVEL
10 AMONGST THE REGIONAL BOARD, AS WELL AS AT THE LOCAL
11 LEVEL AND WE DID RECEIVE A NUMBER OF DISCUSSIONS,
12 SOME OF WHICH WILL BE REPEATED HERE TO INVOLVE
13 CITIES, INCLUDING, ABSOLUTELY, ABAG, BOTH THE MAYOR'S
14 COUNCILS, AND THE CITY MANAGER'S COUNCILS, COUNTY
15 SUSTAINABILITY DEPARTMENTS, LEAGUE OF CITIES, AS WELL
16 AS PERHAPS A DIVISION OR TWO OF CSAC. AND CERTAINLY
17 WE NEED TO CONTINUE TO SHARPEN OUR COMMUNICATIONS,
18 SHARPEN WHAT WE ARE STATING OUR GOALS AND THE NEEDS
19 ARE, AND ENSURING WE'RE DOING THIS THAT WE'RE
20 LISTENING TO THE LOCAL OFFICIALS JUST AS WE HAVE, AND
21 MUST CONTINUE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE LISTENING TO
22 THOSE WHO ARE REPRESENTING THE MOST IMPACTED
23 COMMUNITIES. WITH THAT, I DON'T KNOW IF LARRY WANTS
24 TO MAKE ANY INTRODUCTORY REMARKS, IF HE DOES NOT
25 WE'LL TURN IT OVER TO JESSICA TO GO THROUGHOUT SLIDE



JULY 16, 2021

1 PRESENTATION, WHERE WE WILL HEAR AGAIN QUICKLY AND
2 HOPEFULLY, PRIMARILY THE EFFORT.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GREETINGS EVERYONE I AM THE PLANNING
5 DIRECTOR AT BCDC, AND I AM PLEASED TO BE HERE WITH
6 YOU TODAY, AND THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO
7 SHARE AN UPDATE ON THE BAY ADAPT PROCESS, THE
8 REGIONAL INITIATIVE TO DEVELOP A CONSENSUS DRIVEN
9 STRATEGY TO ADDRESS A RISING BAY. I LAST PRESENTED TO
10 YOU, I BELIEVE IT WAS IN SEPTEMBER OF LAST YEAR, AND
11 WE HAVE CERTAINLY COME A LONG WAY SINCE THEN, AND I
12 AM JOINED TODAY BY DANA BRECHWALD WHO LEADS BCDC'S
13 RISING TIDES PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. WE JUST HEARD AN
14 OVERVIEW FROM BCDC'S CHAIR, AND I I'LL BE GOING
15 THROUGH WHAT BAY ADAPT IS, THE JOINT PLATFORM THAT
16 WAS SHARED WITH YOU IN ADVANCE OF TODAY'S MEETING,
17 TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION AND LEADERSHIP
18 CHALLENGES AS WELL AS NEXT STEPS.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** JESSICA I'M SORRY TO INTERRUPT BUT
21 IT SOUND LIKE WE'RE GETTING SOME FEEDBACK. I DON'T
22 KNOW IF IT'S COMING FROM ANOTHER ZOOM ON THE CALL?
23 OR?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** LET ME SEE.



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN
3 FOCUS ON YOUR PRESENTATION.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** IS THAT BETTER?

6

7 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YES.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. IT WAS MY AIR CONDITIONER.

10

11 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SORRY. I HOPE IT DOESN'T GET TOO
12 HOT FOR YOU.

13

14 **ALLISON BROOKS:** NOW YOU'RE REALLY IN THE HOT SEAT.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THAT'S RIGHT. ON THESE ZOOM CALLS
17 WE HAVE MECHANICAL THINGS, GRANDCHILDREN, AND DOG
18 GROOMERS COMING INTO THE ROOM. THAT'S THE RAREST ONE
19 I HAVE HEARD. [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU, AGAIN, JESSICA.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, NO MATTER -- SO WE
22 ALL THAN WE SHOULD CARE ABOUT CLIMATE CHANGE, BUT WHY
23 SHOULD WE CARE ABOUT IT REGIONALLY? RECENTLY, ABOUT A
24 YEAR AGO, BCDC CAME OUT WITH -- MTC AND BARC CAME OUT
25 WITH A REPORT CALLED ADOPTING THE RISING TIDES WHICH



JULY 16, 2021

1 PROVIDED A COMPREHENSIVE LOOK AT INTERCONNECTED
2 SYSTEMS ACROSS THE BAY. IT DOESN'T MATTER IF YOU LIVE
3 CLOSE TO THE SHORE LINE OR NOT, SEA LEVEL RISE NEAR
4 THE SHORE LINE IS SOMETHING THAT WILL IMPACT EVERYONE
5 IN THE BAY AREA. THERE IS AN INCREASING AMOUNT OF
6 GOOD LOCAL PLANNING GOING ON FOR SEA LEVEL RISE
7 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. CITIES, COUNTIES, SPECIAL
8 DISTRICTS, PRIVATE SECTOR, IT'S A LOT OF STUFF IS
9 HAPPENING. BUT THE PREMISE OF BAY ADAPT IS REALLY
10 THAT LOCAL ACTION IS NOT ENOUGH TO DEAL WITH THIS
11 PROBLEM. THIS IS NOT SOMETHING THAT ONE CITY CAN DEAL
12 WITH ALONE CITIES FACE TRADEOFFS DEALING WITH HOUSING
13 CRISIS AND COVID RECOVERY BUT EVEN AMONGST THE
14 CLIMATE NEEDS TODAY NEAR-TERM DRIVE TO THE WILDFIRES,
15 SEA LEVEL RISE. IT DOESN'T CARE WHERE LOCAL
16 JURISDICTIONAL BOUNDARIES LIE. WE SEE A COMPETITION
17 RATHER COLLABORATION FOR A LIMITED AMOUNT OF FUNDING.
18 OUR WETLANDS, ECOSYSTEMS MOST AT RISK OF SEA LEVEL
19 RISE ARE UNDER THREAT, AND WE HAVE NO WAY TO REALLY
20 MEASURE OUR COLLECTIVE PROGRESS ON THIS ISSUE. NEXT
21 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO ABOUT 18 MONTHS AGO, BCDC
22 APPROACHED A GROUP OF OVER 30 BAY AREA LEADERS WITH A
23 HYPOTHESIS, CAN WE COME TOGETHER AS LEADERS ACROSS A
24 WIDE VARIETY OF SECTORS TO COME UP WITH A STRATEGY
25 THAT LAYS OUT ACTIONS NECESSARY TO MEET BAY AREA



JULY 16, 2021

1 RISING SEAS TO PROTECT PEOPLE, TALKING TO HUNDREDS OF
2 PEOPLE GETTING THOUSANDS OF IDEAS AND SUGGESTIONS WE
3 CAME UP WITH A SET OF ACTIONS THAT I AM PLEASED TO
4 SAY AS ZACK MENTIONED WAS WIDELY ENDORSED AT OUR
5 LEADERSHIP ADVISORY GROUP MEETING IN JUNE. NEXT
6 SLIDE. HERE IS A LIST OF THE NUMBERS PARTICIPATING IN
7 OUR LEADERSHIP ADVISORY GROUP. MANY OF YOU, WHO ARE
8 ON THIS MEETING TODAY, AS WELL AS MANY OTHERS. NEXT
9 SLIDE. SO, THE BAY ADAPT APPROACH IS LARGELY
10 COMPRISED OF THREE ELEMENTS. THE FIRST THING WE DID
11 IS CREATE GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR BAY AREA ADAPTATION
12 TO RISING SEA LEVEL, THE NEXT THING WAS DEVELOPING
13 THIS JOINT PLATFORM OF SHARED PRIORITY ACTIONS, AND
14 THEN WHERE WE REALLY ARE NOW IS IN PHASE THREE,
15 ADOPTING THE JOINT PLATFORM BY COMMITTING TO ACT AND
16 ACT TOGETHER. THROUGHOUT BCDC'S ROLE HAS REALLY BEEN
17 TO LEAD DIALOGUE NOT TO ARTICULATE THE FINAL WORD.
18 NEXT SLIDE. HERE ARE THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES THAT WE
19 CAME UP WITH, THEY INCLUDE -- SORT OF A CHECK TO
20 ENSURE THAT AS WE DEVELOP THE ACTIONS, WE'RE
21 ADEQUATELY MEETING THE REGION'S GOALS AND COVERING
22 AREAS WE SHOULD BE COVERING INCLUDING THINGS LIKE
23 SUPPORTING VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES PRACTICING
24 INCLUSIVE COMMUNITY GOVERNANCE AND DECISION MAKING
25 AND SUPPORTING EXISTING EFFORTS PLANNING FOR THE



JULY 16, 2021

1 LONG-TERM SOLVING MULTIPLE PROBLEMS TOGETHER AND
2 FINALLY PICKING THE RIGHT STRATEGY TO THE RIGHT PLACE
3 AND THE RIGHT TIME. NEXT SLIDE. OVER THE COURSE OF
4 THIS PROCESS WE DID EXTENSIVE OUTREACH BOTH WITH WORK
5 GROUPS THAT PUT PENCIL TO PAPER TO CRAFT THE JOINT
6 PLATFORM WE CONDUCTED TEN FOCUS GROUPS INCLUDING ONES
7 WITH FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES IN EAST PALO ALTO,
8 VALLEJO, BUSINESS COMMUNITY GROUP ENVIRONMENTAL
9 COMMUNITY GROUP AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT GROUP. WE ALSO
10 DID OVER 50 PRIMER PRESENTATIONS AROUND THE REGION,
11 AS YOU CAN SEE ON THIS MAP, REACHING ALL NINE
12 COUNTIES AND BEYOND. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHAT DID WE
13 HEAR? A LOT. I'LL POINT OUT A FEW OF THE MAIN THEM
14 SELF. WE HEARD THAT OUR FIRST DRAFT WAS A LITTLE BIT
15 TO PROCESS. IT NEEDS TO BE MORE OUTCOME ORIENTED. WE
16 HEARD FROM FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES THAT THERE ARE SO
17 MANY ISSUES THAT ARE CAUSING HARM, HOW CAN THEY KIND
18 OF RECONCILE THIS? WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT SEA LEVEL
19 RISE WITH ALL THE OTHER ISSUES CONFRONTING THEIR
20 COMMUNITIES. WE HEARD IN IT, WHAT'S IN IT FOR ME?
21 WHAT DOES MY JURISDICTION GET OUT OF THIS? GET TO THE
22 POINT; IT'S TOO LONG. ACT NOW. WE HEARD FROM THE BAY
23 ECOSYSTEMS THAT WE NEED TO BE MORE CENTERED AND THAT
24 GOOD INTENTIONS WILL NOT STOP BAD PROJECTS AND THAT
25 WE NEED TO BALANCE JOB ADAPTATION WITH HOUSING



JULY 16, 2021

1 GROWTH. NEXT SLIDE. SO THE JOINT PLATFORM THAT WE
2 SHARED WITH YOU TODAY DOESN'T SPECIFY SPECIFIC
3 PROJECTS AROUND THE SHORELINE, RATHER THE PLATFORM'S
4 AIM BEING TO LEVERAGE THE POWER OF COLLECTIVE ACTION
5 TO ENABLE THE REGION TO ADOPT FASTER AND BETTER TO
6 HORIZON BAY. ORGANIZED TO FIGURE CATEGORIES AND
7 PEOPLE ENSURING ALL VOICES ARE AT THE TABLE WORKING
8 TOGETHER IN A REGIONAL APPROACH MAKING SURE THAT THE
9 PEOPLE AND PUBLIC AND PRACTITIONERS HAVE THE
10 KNOWLEDGE THEY NEED AT THEIR FINGER TIPS, PLANS LOOKS
11 AT PROACTIVE AND REGIONAL PLANNING AND FUNDING.
12 PROJECTS IS ALL ABOUT GETTING EXCELLENT PROJECTS
13 APPROVED AND BUILT AND PROGRESS TRACKS HOW WE'RE
14 DOING AGAINST A REGIONAL VISION SO WE CAN CONTINUALLY
15 IMPROVE AND ADJUST. NEXT SLIDE. SO PLEASE BEAR WITH
16 ME AS A DIVE INTO THE DETAILS. FIRST THE REGION
17 NEEDS TO COME TOGETHER TO COLLECTIVELY VISION FOR THE
18 FUTURE. THIS VISION MUST BE BUILT ON GRASSROOTS
19 ENGAGEMENT FROM START TO FINISH WITH A DEEP
20 UNDERSTANDING OF LOCAL NEEDS AND UNIQUE SOCIAL AND
21 PHYSICAL REQUIREMENTS AT SPECIFIC PLACES BUT BE
22 MARRIED TO REGIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL HOUSING
23 TRANSPORTATION ECONOMIC PRIORITIES SUCH AS THOSE LAID
24 OUT IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA AND HABITAT GOALS RESULTS
25 INCLUDE REGIONAL, SUBREGIONAL OBJECT IS AND METRICS



JULY 16, 2021

1 AND GUIDELINES TO INFORM HOW WE'LL GET THERE AND
2 ACTIONS TO INCLUDE STARED ONGOING LEGISLATIVE AGENDA
3 SO WE CAN ADVOCATE FOR THE REGION'S NEEDS MORE
4 EFFECTIVELY TO THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT.
5 ENSURING COMMUNITY VOICES ESPECIALLY FRONTLINE
6 COMMUNITIES ARE NOT JUST HEARD BUT ARE GUIDING
7 ADAPTATION. 2.1 FOCUSES ON IMPROVING DECISION MAKING
8 PROCESSES BY EMPOWERING COMMUNITIES TO TRAIN
9 GOVERNMENT ABOUT WHAT THEY NEED AND INCREASING
10 COMMUNITY CAPACITY. 2.2 CALLS FOR ONGOING STABLE
11 FUNDING SOURCES TO SUPPORT THE EXPERTISE OF COMMUNITY
12 MEMBERS AND CBOS THROUGH FORMAL PROFESSIONAL
13 CONTRACTS AND STIPENDS. IT WAS INSPIRING TO HEAR WHAT
14 THE AIR DISTRICT SINGLING ABOUT IN THIS SPACE. ACTION
15 THREE SEEKS TO INCREASE PUBLIC AWARENESS OF SEA LEVEL
16 RISE AND THE REGION'S FUTURE THROUGH PUBLIC STORY
17 TELLING AS WELL AS WORKING WITH SCHOOLS TO CREATE A
18 ROBUST CLIMATE FOCUS CURRICULUM AND JOB TRAINING
19 PROGRAM INCREASE ACCESS TO RESEARCH SCIENTIFIC DATA
20 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PRACTITIONERS ENSURE THAT THEIR
21 PLANS PROJECTS BASED IN THE MOST UP TO DATE SCIENCE
22 INCLUDING COMMUNITY BASED KNOWLEDGE AND UTILIZING
23 PRACTICES AND GOALS. INCENTIVES FOR LOCAL PLANS THAT
24 ALIGN WITH THE GUIDANCE AND BEST PRACTICES. LOOKS AT
25 MYRIAD OF STATE-MANDATED PLANNING REQUIREMENTS FOR



JULY 16, 2021

1 GENERAL PLANS AND LOCAL HAZARD MITIGATION. ACTION SIX
2 IS ABOUT -- SORRY -- IS ALL ABOUT FUNDING. IT'S ABOUT
3 BETTER UNDERSTANDING OUR NEEDS, OUR EXISTING SOURCES
4 OF FUNDING, THE GAPS THAT EXIST, OUTLINING A
5 POTENTIAL REGIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR AGGREGATING,
6 GENERATING AND DIRECTING FUNDING EQUITABLY THROUGHOUT
7 THE REGION AND PROVIDING EXPERTISE AND CAPACITY TO
8 HELP JURISDICTIONS FILL GAPS LOCALLY THROUGH
9 FINANCING AND GRANTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ACTION
10 SEVEN, SO THE NEXT GROUP IS AROUND PROJECTS. SO
11 ACTION SEVEN IS ABOUT FACILITATING PERMITTING FOR
12 PROJECTS THAT MEET OUR REGIONAL GOALS. COULD THIS BE
13 SOMETHING LIKE OUR CURRENT BRRIT OR EXPANDED BRRIT,
14 THE BAY RESTORATION REGULATORY INTEGRATION TEAM. I
15 HOPE I GOT THAT RIGHT. AND LOOKING AT THE MANY OTHER
16 ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATIONS AND POLICIES THAT SET THE
17 FRAMEWORK FOR SHORELINE PROJECTS IN THE BAY MANY
18 WHICH WERE NOT DEVELOPED WITH SEA LEVEL RISE IN MIND
19 TO BE ADJUSTED TO FACILITATE BETTER PROJECTS. ACTION
20 EIGHT FINANCIAL PERMITTING INCENTIVES FOR PROJECTS TO
21 ALIGN WITH GUIDANCE AND PRACTICES CALLS FOR
22 SUBREGIONAL WORKING GROUPS TO HELP FACILITATE
23 COLLABORATION ON LANDSCAPE SCALE SHORELINE PROJECTS
24 AND JOHN KING'S ARTICLE ON HIGHWAY 37 IS AN EXAMPLE
25 OF THAT. OUTLINING NUMBER OF CONSTRUCTION BARRIERS



JULY 16, 2021

1 SUCH AS CONTRACTORS, BUILDING BETTER NATION BASED
2 SOLUTIONS PRIORITIZING MINORITY OWNED BUSINESS
3 PLANNING FOR SEDIMENT, PROVIDING REPORT CARD ON
4 REGULAR BASIS THAT WE CAN ADJUST COURSE NEEDED TO
5 CONTINUE TO SUPPORT AND EXPAND MONITORING INNOVATIVE
6 PROJECTS SO WE CAN LEARN FROM THOSE EFFORTS. NEXT
7 SLIDE. BEFORE WE MOVE ON I WANT TO TOUCH ON HOW THIS
8 FITS WITH OTHER REGIONAL PLANNING EFFORTS. YOU MAY
9 HAVE SEEN THIS GRAPH BEFORE IT'S ONE OF MY FAVORITES,
10 COORDINATING WITH STAFF AND BCDC, AND BAY AREA AND
11 SAN FRANCISCO ON PARTNERSHIP AROUND UPCOMING ESTUARY
12 BLUEPRINT UPDATE. OUR RECOMMENDATIONS REALLY SPEAK TO
13 ALL OF THEM, I THINK THE DRAFT BAY AREA MEETS INROADS
14 INTO BRINGING SEA LEVEL RISE INTO THE PLAN AND THE
15 JOINT PLATFORM CAN BE VIEWED AS A MORE REFINED
16 IMPLEMENTATION SCHEME OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA TO SEA
17 LEVEL RISE STRATEGY. I'M NOW GOING TO SHARE -- THAT
18 WAS AN OVERVIEW OF THE CONTENT OF THE PLATFORM. AT
19 THIS POINT WE'RE TRANSITIONING TO START THINKING
20 ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION. AND AS YOU CAN SEE FROM WHAT I
21 JUST PRESENTED, OUR LEADERSHIP ADVISORY GROUP ASKED
22 US TO BE COMPREHENSIVE, AND YOU CAN SEE THAT THAT'S
23 THE CASE. WE LAID OUT A VERY AMBITIOUS PROGRAM OF
24 WHAT NEEDS TO GET DONE. AND IT'S A LOT TO UNDERTAKE.
25 SO WE'RE STARTING TO SHIFT TO IMPLEMENTATION, HOW TO



JULY 16, 2021

1 GET IT DONE LEVERAGING THE POWER OF THE REGION WHILE
2 STAYING CONNECTED ON OUR LOCAL NEEDS. THERE HAVE BEEN
3 A NUMBER OF BIG PICTURE CHALLENGES THAT HAVE BEEN
4 IDENTIFIED TOPICS THAT TRANSCENDS THE SPECIFIC
5 ACTIONS AND HAVE MORE TO DO WITH HOW WE WORK ACROSS
6 OUR SILOS TO MAKE SURE WE'RE TALKING WITH THE RIGHT
7 PEOPLE, SO GOVERNANCE STUFF. WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THAT
8 REGIONAL AGENCIES MUST BE ACCOUNTABLE AND COORDINATED
9 ON BAY ADAPT IMPLEMENTATION. WE HEARD FOLKS SAYING WE
10 NEED A QUARTER BACK, A SHEPHERD SOMEONE WHO IS GOING
11 TO OWN THIS. WE HEARD THAT FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES MUST
12 HAVE LEADERSHIP ROLES AT ALL LEVELS IS THAT LOCAL
13 GOVERNMENTS NEED TO ENGAGE AND LEAD LOCALLY AND
14 REGIONALLY. AND FINALLY, THE MULTI-SECTOR LEADERSHIP
15 THAT HAS BEEN CRITICAL TO THE CREATION OF THE BAY
16 ADAPT JOINT PLATFORM MUST KIND OF GUIDE OUR NEXT
17 STEPS. SO HERE ARE A FEW IDEAS IN TERMS OF SOME
18 POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS TO THESE CHALLENGES. IN TERMS OF
19 REGIONAL AGENCY ACCOUNTABILITY AND COORDINATION, WE
20 CAN THINK ABOUT ASSIGNING LEAD AGENCIES FOR CLIMATE
21 ADAPTATION BASED ON EXPERTISE, FOR EXAMPLE, BCDC ON
22 SEA LEVEL RISE, MTC AND ABAG FOR MULTI-HAZARD
23 COORDINATION, AND THE AIR DISTRICT AROUND FIRE AND
24 HEAT AND BARC AS A CONVENER. WE CAN PROACTIVELY AGREE
25 TO COLLABORATE AS A MULTI- HAZARD CLIMATE



JULY 16, 2021

1 COLLABORATIVE OR JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY, ANTICIPATING
2 PERHAPS SOME OF THAT STATE LEGISLATION THAT ALLISON
3 MENTIONED. WE CAN ASK OUR REGIONAL BOARDS TO ADOPT
4 THE PLATFORM TO ITS IMPLEMENTATION AND MAXIMIZE
5 ALIGNMENT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA IMPLEMENTATION. THESE
6 ARE IDEAS HOW WE CAN ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS. IN TERMS OF
7 FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES, WE COULD FUND AND ESTABLISH OR
8 SUPPORT AN EXISTING REGIONAL CLIMATE EQUITY
9 CONSORTIUM FOCUSED SPECIFICALLY ON EQUITY ISSUES AND
10 COMPRISED OF FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES TO WORK ON A RANGE
11 OF REGIONAL CLIMATE EFFORTS. WE CAN ENSURE THERE IS
12 DIVERSE REPRESENTATION OF FRONTLINE VOICES THROUGHOUT
13 IMPLEMENTATION OF ALL OF THIS AND WE CAN ALSO SEEK
14 PRIVATE PHILANTHROPIC RESOURCES IN THE NEAR-TERM.
15 THERE WAS A GROUP OF FOLKS FROM OUR LEADERSHIP
16 ADVISORY GROUP WHO ARE INTERESTED IN PURSUING THAT.
17 IN TERMS OF HOW WE ENGAGE WITH OUR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS
18 WE HEARD THAT WE COULD THINK ABOUT A REGIONAL WIDE
19 CALL TO ACTION MAYORS, MANAGERS, LEAGUE OF CITIES
20 WHERE WE ASK CITIES TO SIGN O WE COULD ALSO THINK
21 ABOUT ESTABLISHING AND REPURPOSING AN EXISTING GROUP
22 TO ACT AS A LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIAL CLIMATE ADAPTATION
23 COMMITTEE COMPRISED OF LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIAL WHO IS
24 CAN ADVISE AND WORK CLOSELY IN THE IMPLEMENTATION
25 PHASE OF THIS REPRESENTING THE DIVERSITY OF DIFFERENT



JULY 16, 2021

1 PLACES THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. AND FINALLY WE HAVE
2 SEVERAL IDEAS RELATED TO HOW WE MOVE FORWARD IN TERMS
3 OF COORDINATION, INCLUDING CONTINUING A VERSION OF
4 THIS LEADERSHIP ADVISORY GROUP THAT HAS BEEN
5 INSTRUMENTAL SO FAR, CONVENING VARIOUS WORKING GROUPS
6 TO HELP REALLY FLESH OUT SOME OF THESE ACTIONS, AND
7 EXPANDING ON THE PILOT LEGISLATIVE WORKING GROUP THAT
8 ALLISON AND MTC HELPED TO LEAD THIS PAST YEAR TO
9 PROACTIVELY ADVOCATE FOR BAY AREA ADAPTATION PRIORITY
10 AREAS AND FUNDING. NEXT SLIDE. SO IN CONCLUSION A
11 FEW NEXT STEPS. WE WILL BE HOLDING PUBLIC FORUMS ON
12 BAY ADAPT TOWARDS THE END OF AUGUST. WE'LL SHARE THE
13 DATES FOR THOSE, JUST A CHANCE TO KIND OF BROADEN AND
14 OPEN UP TO A WIDER PUBLIC AUDIENCE AND START AT A 30
15 DAY FEEDBACK PERIOD. AS I MENTIONED, WE'RE FOCUSING
16 ON IMPLEMENTATION AND GOVERNANCE PLAN DEVELOPMENT
17 RIGHT NOW. WE WOULD LIKE TO BRING THIS ALL BACK TO
18 OUR LEADERSHIP ADVISORY GROUP ONE MORE TIME, AND
19 THEN, WE'RE ALSO CONSIDERING HOW TO BEST APPROACH
20 LOCAL JURISDICTION OUTREACH. SO, WITH THAT, I THINK
21 THERE IS ONE MORE SLIDE, JUST TO KICKOFF ANY
22 CLARIFICATION QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE ABOUT THE JOINT
23 PLATFORM. DID WE MISS ANYTHING? IS THERE ANYTHING
24 THAT STANDS OUT TO YOU? SO THIS IS, REALLY, ANYTHING
25 ABOUT THE PLATFORM CONTENT ITSELF, AND THEN WE'LL



JULY 16, 2021

1 MOVE ON TO MORE OF A CONVERSATION ABOUT SOME OF THE
2 GOVERNANCE CHALLENGES THAT ALLISON LAID OUT. THANK
3 YOU. IS

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** LET ME JUST MOVE THE SCREEN, SO I
6 CAN SEE EVERYONE'S HANDS. JOHN, I SEE YOU HAVE A
7 QUESTION.

8

9 **JOHN GIOIA:** WHEN YOU SAY WHAT DID YOU LEAVE OUT, I
10 WANT TO MAKE SURE I'M SPEAKING AT THE RIGHT TIME. I
11 HAVE COMMENTS ON THE SOLUTION SLIDE.

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** LET ME JUST ASK, ALLISON, AND, YOU
14 KNOW, LET ME FIND OUT WHAT IS BEST TO MOVE FORWARD IN
15 TERMS OF THE --

16

17 **ALLISON BROOKS:** YEAH, I WONDER --

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AND JESSICA, SEE WHAT WOULD BE MOST
20 HELPFUL TO YOU.

21

22 **ALLISON BROOKS:** WELL WE HAVE ONE MORE SLIDE, WHICH IS
23 MAYBE WHAT MEMBER GIOIA IS -- WE COULD BRING UP THE
24 DISCUSSION SLIDE, BUT YOU KNOW, WE COULD GO INTO THAT
25 MAYBE JUST BRING IT UP?



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** DO YOU HAVE THE SLIDE? LET'S BRING
3 IT UP. JOHN I'LL CALL ON YOU FIRST AND THEN WE CAN GO
4 FORWARD.

5

6 **ALLISON BROOKS:** WOULD YOU MIND? I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S
7 JESS OR WHO IS RESPONSIBLE FOR BRINGING IT BACK UP.
8 BUT THERE IS ONE LAST -- THE NEXT SLIDE.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT.

11

12 **ALLISON BROOKS:** IF YOU COULD BRING IN THE NEXT SLIDE.
13 OH, THE SLIDE AFTER THAT, PLEASE. [LAUGHTER]

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT.

16

17 **ALLISON BROOKS:** SO THE IDEA HERE, AND THANK YOU
18 JESSICA, SO, FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN. BUT THAT WE WOULD
19 PIVOT SOME FROM THE SOLUTIONS, WHICH THEY'RE VERY
20 MUCH ALIGNED. MANY OF THOSE IDEAS THAT JESSICA SHARED
21 FIT NICELY WITH THESE KIND OF SERIES OF QUESTIONS
22 THAT WE'VE LAID OUT HERE, JUST IN TERMS OF BARC'S
23 ROLE, AND HOW WE WANT TO HELP -- HOW BAY ADAPT IS AN
24 EXAMPLE OF THE TYPE OF PROCESS WE CAN WORK ON
25 TOGETHER TO HELP IMPLEMENT, THROUGH THE LEADERSHIP OF



JULY 16, 2021

1 ONE OF OUR MEMBER AGENCIES, WHICH -- AND THEN HOW DO
2 WE, ACROSS OUR AGENCIES, HELP IN THE FACILITATION AND
3 IMPLEMENTATION OF THAT. SO.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. TERRIFIC. WE'RE READY TO
6 TAKE COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE. I
7 WANT TO CONFIRM THAT THERE IS NO ADDITIONAL
8 INFORMATION TO PRESENT?

9

10 **ALLISON BROOKS:** NO.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** -- AT THIS POINT -- AND YOU ALL
13 RECEIVED A MEMO FROM ALLISON THAT TALKS ABOUT BARC
14 AND THE ROLE WE CAN PLAY. JOHN?

15

16 **JOHN GIOIA:** THANKS JESSICA FOR THE PRESENTATION, AND
17 ALL THE WORK THAT'S HAPPENED. JUST A COUPLE OF MINOR
18 POINTS, ON THE SOLUTION SLIDE WHEN YOU SAY SEEK
19 PRIVATE PHILANTHROPIC RESOURCES IN THE NEAR-TERM FOR
20 FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES HAVING LEADERSHIP. WE NEED TO
21 DO MORE THAN JUST GET PRIVATE FUNDING, THE PUBLIC
22 FUNDING IF WE'RE SAYING YOU KNOW PUBLIC ISSUE BUT
23 WE'RE GOING TO COME UP AND IDENTIFY PRIVATE FUNDING
24 TO GIVE FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES LEADERSHIP THAT'S NOT
25 MUCH OF A COMMITMENT REALLY IN EQUITY FRONTLINE



JULY 16, 2021

1 COMMUNITY SORT OF PUTS THEM AS SECOND CLASS CITIZENS
2 IF WE'RE JUST LOOKING FOR PRIVATE FUNDING. I THINK
3 THAT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT POINT. AND I WOULD LIKE TO
4 SEE THAT ELEMENT ADDED THAT PUBLIC FUNDING MUST BE
5 PART OF IT I HEAR FROM COMMUNITY FOLKS ALL THE TIME
6 IT'S LIKE, WELL, YOU GIVE US SCRAPS TO DO THIS WORK.
7 SO I DON'T THINK THAT'S SUFFICIENT. ON THE REGION-
8 WIDE CALL TO ACTION THE MAYORS AND CITY MANAGERS, YOU
9 HAVE SORT OF LEFT OUT COUNTIES. COUNTIES PLAY A HUGE
10 ROLE IN THIS IN LARGE AREAS SO I THINK YOU SHOULD
11 INCLUDE COUNTIES AS PART OF THAT, AS WELL. AND,
12 REALLY, MY LARGER COMMENT IS THAT, THIS IS REALLY
13 GOOD, IN A LOT OF REALLY GOOD REGIONAL, SUBREGIONAL
14 EFFORTS, BUT THERE'S -- AND ALL OF THESE AGENCIES
15 ARE, YOU KNOW, REGIONAL AGENCIES ARE DOING THIS WORK
16 THROUGH THEIR PLANNING FUNCTIONS, BCDC, YOU KNOW,
17 MTC, ABAG, AIR DISTRICT, AGENCIES LIKE THE AIR
18 DISTRICT AND BCDC ALSO CAN HAVE A REGULATORY ROLE.
19 AND I THINK WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT WHAT ROLE THE
20 REGULATORY FUNCTION OF REGIONAL AGENCIES CAN PLAY.
21 JUST LIKE BCDC WAS FORMED, YOU KNOW, TO ISSUE PERMITS
22 REGARDING THE BAY OR THE 100 FOOT SHORELINE BAND FROM
23 GETTING THE SMALLER, OR EXPLORE BCDC'S EXISTING
24 POTENTIAL EXPANDED REGULATORY ROLE IN PREVENTING THE
25 BAY FOR GETTING TOO BIG AND SEA LEVEL RISE AND THE



JULY 16, 2021

1 SAME ISSUE WITH THE AIR DISTRICT. I THINK ALL OF THIS
2 IS BEING APPROACHED SO FAR, WHAT I SEE AS SORT OF
3 VOLUNTARY, GET EVERYBODY TOGETHER TO DO THE RIGHT
4 THING ROLE, BUT AT SOME LEVEL, WE NEED TO THINK
5 ABOUT, YOU KNOW, REGULATORY AND MANDATORY ACTION.
6 BECAUSE WHAT HAPPENS IN ONE PART OF THE BAY AFFECTS
7 ANOTHER. AND THE REGIONAL WATER BOARD CAN PLAY A ROLE
8 IN THIS AS WELL. SO I WOULD -- I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE
9 US INCLUDE, AND MAYBE THAT BARC IS A GOOD PLACE FOR
10 THAT DISCUSSION TO OCCUR, BECAUSE WE HAVE
11 REPRESENTATIVES FROM ALL THE REGIONAL AGENCIES, WHERE
12 DOES MORE REGULATORY ACTION COME INTO PLAY ON A
13 REGIONAL LEVEL? SO, I WOULD LIKE TO ADD THAT TO,
14 SORT OF SOMETHING THAT BART/BARC CAN DEAL WITH OTHER
15 THAN START ENCOURAGING COLLABORATION THIS IS A
16 SERIOUS ISSUE WHERE WE MAY NEED TO SEE MORE REGIONAL
17 REGULATORY ACTION.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** RECOGNIZING THE ROLE THE REGULATORY
20 AUTHORITY IS A VERY IMPORTANT PART OF THEIR ROLE AND
21 WHAT MIGHT HELPFUL IS TO HAVE A DISCUSSION AT BARC SO
22 PEOPLE COULD REALLY UNDERSTAND THE EXISTING LEVELS OF
23 AUTHORITY SO THAT WE CAN, YOU KNOW, KIND OF KNOW THE
24 FRAMEWORK OF WHAT WE CAN DO. SO I THINK THAT ONE OF
25 THE IMPORTANT THINGS WAS TO DO THAT, TO RECOGNIZE



JULY 16, 2021

1 THAT THE AGENCIES HAVE AUTHORITY. AND SPEAKING OF ONE
2 WHO HAS AUTHORITY, I WANT TO JUST TURN -- I KNOW,
3 MIKE MONTGOMERY, YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP. MIKE?

4

5 **MICHAEL MONTGOMERY:** THANK YOU CHAIR. THAT'S AN
6 EXCELLENT QUESTION, COMMISSIONER GIOIA, AND I WOULD
7 SAY WE ARE ALREADY OUT-THE-GATE, USING OUR AUTHORITY.
8 YOU KNOW, BECAUSE WE, BASICALLY, IF SEA LEVEL RISE
9 CAN CAUSE OR CONTRIBUTE TO WATER POLLUTION CONDITION
10 IN THE FUTURE, SO WE'VE ASKED MOST OF OUR REGULATED
11 ENTITIES TO CONDUCT SEA LEVEL RISE, VULNERABILITY
12 ASSESSMENTS AND TO REPORT TO US ON THE STATUS OF
13 THEIR PLANNING TO DO SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION
14 PROJECTS, CONSISTENT WITH THE ADAPTATION ATLAS.
15 USING THE OCEAN PROTECTION COUNCIL GUIDANCE. SO WE
16 HAVE GOT THE WASTEWATER COMMUNITY, AND ALL THE
17 WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANTS THAT ARE IN THE BAY
18 MARGIN, ALL THE WASTEWATER MANAGEMENT UNITS THAT ARE
19 ASSOCIATED WITH INDUSTRIAL OPERATIONS, THE
20 REFINERIES, ALL OF THE ACTIVE AND CLOSED LANDFILLS,
21 NOT ALL OF THEM, BUT SOON ALL OF THEM, UNDER ORDERS
22 TO PRODUCE THOSE STUDIES AND INFORM US AS TO WHAT
23 THEIR PLANS ARE, AND, MOST IMPORTANTLY, HOW THEY'RE
24 WORKING WITH THEIR NEIGHBORS TO DO OPERATION, TO DO
25 LANDSCAPE UNIT SOLUTIONS. SO THAT INFORMATION IS



JULY 16, 2021

1 FLOWING IN, IT'S SORT OF TRICKLING IN NOW, BUT IT'S
2 GOING TO BE COMING IN LARGE AMOUNT IN THE COMING YEAR
3 AND NEXT YEAR, AND THE IMPORTANCE IN THE NEXUS IN BAY
4 ADAPT IS WE NEED SOMEWHERE WHERE WE CAN SOCIALIZE
5 THAT INFORMATION AND THAT KNOWLEDGE IN A WAY THAT
6 STIMULATES COORDINATION AND COLLABORATION ON SEA
7 LEVEL RISE SOLUTIONS. BECAUSE WE, YOU KNOW, THE WATER
8 BOARD HAS, UNFORTUNATELY, NOT A LOT OF CARROTS, BUT
9 WE HAVE A LOT OF STICKS, AND WE'RE USING THAT TO
10 DRIVE THIS FORWARD, AND IT'S IMPORTANT THAT BAY ADAPT
11 AND/OR WHATEVER COMES WITH IT, GETS IMPLEMENTED.
12 BECAUSE WE WANT TO DRIVE, WHAT WE'RE DOING, INTO THAT
13 MODEL. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOOD COMMENT. THAT REALLY DOES MAKE
16 SENSE, MIKE, AND ONE OF THE REASONS I HAVE BEEN
17 RELUCTANT TO TAKE ON ANY FORMAL STRONGER ROLE FOR
18 BARC RELATIVE TO ENFORCEMENT IN SOME OF THE POLICIES,
19 IS THAT THESE REGULATORY AUTHORITY RESTS WITH THE
20 HOSTING AGENCIES. AND, OBVIOUSLY, A LOT OF THIS IS IN
21 STATE AND FEDERAL STATUTE. AND SO IF WE CAN DO
22 EXACTLY AS YOU SUGGESTED, IN TERMS OF BRINGING FOLKS
23 TOGETHER TO KNOW WHAT'S HAPPENING, AND, AS YOU
24 MENTIONED, I LOVE THAT TERM ABOUT SOCIALIZING THE
25 WORK THAT YOU'RE DOING, SO THAT THE COMMUNITIES



JULY 16, 2021

1 UNDERSTAND THIS, AND WE CAN ALL WORK TOGETHER. SO LET
2 ME TURN TO COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND THEN EXECUTIVE
3 DIRECTOR MCMILLAN, AND I THINK ZACK WAS READY TO MAKE
4 A COMMENT. SO WE'LL --

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, AMY. YOU KNOW, ON BARC,
7 THE ONE ROLE I THINK BARC COULD PLAY IS TO BUILD THE
8 REGIONAL ADVOCACY, AND ACTUALLY WORK DIRECTLY WITH
9 THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE AND THE LEGISLATURE. I CAN'T
10 AGREE MORE WITH JOHN, THERE HAS TO BE PUBLIC FUNDING.
11 IT NEEDS TO BE A STATE COMMITMENT TO FINDING THE
12 RESOURCES TO BUILD MANY OF THE PROJECTS THAT HAVE TO
13 BE BUILT. THE OTHER IS, IS THERE ANY CONSIDERATION ON
14 A REGIONAL EIR, SO ALL THE SMALLER PROJECTS DON'T GET
15 TIED UP OR BOGGED DOWN INTO THESE REGULATORY
16 PROCESSES? AND, YOU KNOW, SO THEY ALL FALL UNDER,
17 LIKE, ONE UMBRELLA. AND THE LAST COMMENT IS, DO WE
18 HAVE AN INVENTORY, AS PROJECTS ARE DONE, HOW DOES IT
19 IMPACT OTHER JURISDICTIONS OR OTHER AREAS? AND HOW DO
20 WE MITIGATE THOSE IMPACTS?

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THERESA?
23 THERESE.

24

25 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** [LAUGHTER]



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SORRY. I HAVE A THERESA AND A
3 THERESE IN MY LIFE. FORGIVE ME.

4

5 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** NO PROBLEM. IT WAS A REALLY
6 INTERESTING CONSIDERATION ABOUT THIS SORT OF
7 REGULATORY OVERLAY. SO I JUST WANTED TO REFLECT ON
8 WHAT I HAVE HEARD, IN PARTICULARLY, WHAT CHAIR WORTH
9 AND COMMISSIONER SPERING JUST SAID. YOU KNOW, IN MY
10 EXPERIENCE, A REGULATORY ROLE PRESUMES THAT THERE ARE
11 CLEAR THRESHOLDS OR STANDARDS AGAINST WHICH TO
12 REGULATE. AND, I THINK, WHAT WE HAVE SEEN IS WE
13 DON'T HAVE THOSE IN MANY ELEMENTS RELATIVE TO SEA
14 LEVEL RISE, AND CLIMATE. SO, THIS COORDINATED
15 PLANNING PROCESS THAT WAS REALLY CENTRAL TO BAY ADAPT
16 AND A LOT OF THE WORK IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, I
17 WOULD SAY, COULD BE THAT, YOU KNOW, BASIS WITHIN
18 WHICH YOU COULD ESTABLISH WHAT THOSE STANDARDS AND
19 THRESHOLDS SHOULD BE, BASED ON DATA, AND ANALYSIS,
20 AND A LOT OF THE CRITICAL WORK THAT WOULD UNDERSCORE
21 WHAT THAT IS. AND I THINK THERE IS SOME REALLY
22 INTERESTING QUESTIONS. YOU KNOW, IS IT APPROPRIATE
23 FOR THOSE STANDARDS TO BE ESTABLISHED AT A REGIONAL
24 LEVEL, WOULD THEY NEED TO BE REINFORCED AT A STATE
25 AND FEDERAL LEVEL THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING TO SORT OUT



JULY 16, 2021

1 DOWN THE ROAD BUT BARC I THINK COULD BE A CRUCIAL
2 ROLE IN SITE ASSESSING AND IMPACT AND
3 INTERSECTIONALITY OF ANY REGULATORY FRAMEWORK. THERE
4 IS A LOT OF UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES WHEN REGULATIONS
5 AREN'T MINDFUL OF WORKING, YOU KNOW, IN JUST A LITTLE
6 SILO. I WOULD SAY FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 20501 OF THE
7 THINGS THAT'S COMING UP, THE QUESTIONS THAT DEAL WITH
8 HOW DO YOU DEAL WITH GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION
9 REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS VERSUS WHAT WE SAW ON HOUSING
10 AND THE SITUATION WHERE REGULATIONS CAN COMPETE
11 INSTEAD OF COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER AND BARC COULD HAVE
12 AN IMPORTANT ROLE IN BEING ABLE TO ANTICIPATE THAT
13 BALANCING NEEDS. JUST SOME THOUGHTS ON THAT
14 REGULATORY APPROACH OR CONSIDERATION.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THERESE, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
17 YOUR COMMENTS. ZACK THEN ALLISON, YOU HAVE SOME
18 THOUGHTS TO ADD?

19

20 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** SEVERAL COMMENTS, AND A LITTLE
21 SCATTER-SHOT, I APOLOGIZE. ONE TO JOHN GIOIA A I
22 APOLOGIZE IF IT WAS NOT CLEAR ENOUGH EITHER IN THE
23 SLIDES OR IN MY REMARKS, COUNTIES AS THE LOCAL
24 AGENCIES THAT WE NEED TO REACH OUT TO THE
25 QUESTIONABLY GROUP, AND I THROUGH IN A BRIEF



JULY 16, 2021

1 REFERENCE TO TALKS WITH CSAC AND THE LOCAL REGION. SO
2 THERE IS NO QUESTION THAT THEY'RE THERE. AND, TO THE
3 EXTENT OF COURSE ON YOU CONTACT WITH LOCALITIES,
4 BECAUSE ALL OF THE COUNTIES HAVE REPRESENTATIVES ON
5 BCDC. IN TERMS OF LEADERSHIP, THERE IS NO QUESTION
6 THIS IS A RECURRENT AND EVOLVING ISSUE. BUT, AS I
7 SAID IN THE BEGINNING OF MY REMARKS, BCDC HAS
8 PROVIDED LEADERSHIP IN THIS AREA. AND WE EXPECT TO
9 CONTINUE TO DO SO. THERE MAY COME A TIME WHEN EITHER
10 OUR JURISDICTION NEEDS TO BE CHANGED OR EXPANDED, OR
11 SOME OTHER ORGANIZATION NEEDS TO BE GIVEN A DIFFERENT
12 SENSE. BUT THIS'S LEADERSHIP, NOT CONTROL. I'M BEING
13 VERY CLEAR, THAT THE ONLY WAY WE'RE GOING TO GET THIS
14 DONE, REGARDLESS OF WHAT ADDITIONAL REGULATORY
15 MEASURES WE ADOPT, IS BY GETTING EFFECTIVE
16 COLLABORATION AND COOPERATION AND ACTION BETWEEN AND
17 AMONGST THE REGIONAL AGENCIES AND THE LOCAL GOVERNING
18 AGENCIES, CITIES AND COUNTIES, AND SOME SPECIAL
19 DISTRICTS. THAT'S THE SIMPLE REALITY, OBVIOUSLY,
20 IMPLEMENTING THAT COORDINATION IS NOT NECESSARILY --
21 ISN'T AT ALL, SIMPLE. I THINK IN THAT CONTEXT, THE
22 DISCUSSION ITEMS WE HAVE BEEN FOCUSING ON HERE IN
23 BARC ARE VERY IMPORTANT. THE LINK BETWEEN THE BAY
24 ADAPT AND WHAT IT WILL LEAD TO AND BAY AREA 2050 IS
25 CRITICAL. THE COORDINATION BETWEEN THE VARIOUS



JULY 16, 2021

1 REGIONAL AGENCIES AND ABAG IS ALSO CRITICAL. I THINK
2 THAT ABAG, BECAUSE IT DOES REPRESENT, OR HAVE THE
3 DIRECT REPRESENTATIVES OF ALL OF THE CITIES, AS WELL
4 AS THE COUNTIES, BECOMES A VERY CRITICAL PART OF
5 THESE DISCUSSIONS. THE POINT THAT THERESE MADE
6 ABOUT, YOU CAN'T REALLY REGULATE WITHOUT CLEAR
7 STANDARDS IS, OF COURSE, TRUE. AND IT IS ALSO TRUE
8 THAT SOME OF THE THINGS IN THE BAY ADAPT ARE NOT
9 CLEAR, CRISP STANDARDS OF THE KIND THAT YOU REGULATE.
10 THERE IS EMERGING SOME CLEAR STANDARDS IN THE STATE
11 REGULATIONS, AND IN THE GUIDANCE, IN THAT, CERTAINLY,
12 FOR BCDC PERMITS, AND WE THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE
13 EXPANDED, AND THERE IS BASIS IN THE LAW TO DO THIS,
14 THE LOCALITY IS THEY APPROVE THE PROJECTS ON THE BAY
15 THAT THEY NEED TO ADAPT TO CERTAIN LEVELS OF EXPECTED
16 RISE OF SEA LEVEL. THE CHALLENGE, OF COURSE, IS THE
17 ONES THAT ARE OUT THERE AND SCIENTIFICALLY APPROVED
18 ARE PROBABLY TOO LOW. THE ONE THING WE'RE ALMOST
19 CERTAIN OF, BEYOND THAT THE SEA WILL RISE, IS THAT
20 IT'S ALMOST CERTAIN TO RISE MORE THAN WE THINK, AND
21 PROBABLY QUICKER THAN WE ARE PLANNING. SO THERE ARE
22 SOME STANDARDS THERE, BUT THERE ARE ALSO, WE
23 RECOGNIZE, EVOLVING STANDARDS, AS PART OF THE
24 CHALLENGE THAT ALL OF US FACE AS WE ALL MOVE FORWARD
25 IN THIS EFFORT. AND I ALSO WANT TO BE VERY CLEAR,



JULY 16, 2021

1 THAT IN ADDITION TO THE INPUT THAT WE HAVE HAD SO
2 FAR, WE WELCOME FOLLOW-UP. IF ANYBODY HAS SPECIFIC
3 SUGGESTION ABOUT GROUPS THAT WE OUGHT TO REACH OUT
4 TO, ABOUT OTHER MECHANISMS, AND SOME OF THE OTHER
5 SOLUTIONS, AS JOHN STARTED ADDRESSING, WE WELCOME
6 THOSE, AND PLEASE FOLLOW UP WITH LARRY AND WITH
7 JESSICA. THE LAST POINT THAT I THINK I WANT TO MAKE
8 IS, THIS IS AN EVOLVING PROCESS. WE NEED TO GET ON IT
9 AS QUICKLY AS WE CAN, BECAUSE THE WARMING OF THE
10 SEAS, AND THE OTHER FACTORS ARE NOT WAITING FOR US TO
11 RESOLVE OUR INTER-REGIONAL OR LOCAL PROBLEMS. IT'S
12 COMING INEXORABLY. WE JUST NEED TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO
13 SPEED UP OUR EFFORTS. JIM SPERING'S POINT ABOUT
14 APPOINTING A REGION-WIDE EIR IS INTERESTING. I THINK
15 ONE OF THE DIFFICULT THINGS ON THE TABLE BECAUSE WE
16 NEED TO SPEED THINGS UP AND WE NEED TO SPEED OUR
17 EFFORTS UP. THANK YOU.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. ZACK, THANK YOU FOR YOUR
20 COMMENTS. ALLISON?

21

22 **ALLISON BROOKS:** I WOULD REFER US BACK TO SOME
23 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WERE IN MY MEMO, ALONG -- TO
24 RESPOND TO ZACK'S POINT, AND THE OTHER POINTS THAT
25 WERE RAISED, THAT, YOU KNOW, BAY ADAPT, BOTH BAY



JULY 16, 2021

1 ADAPT AND PLANNED BAY AREA ARE -- HAVE SET OUT SOME
2 SPECIFIC STRATEGIES. THIS ROLE AROUND THE REGULATORY
3 ROLE IS A BIG ONE AND IT'S IMPORTANT, AND WHAT WE
4 HAVE RECOMMENDED AND THIS ISN'T JUST ME, THIS IS SAID
5 ACROSS THE AGENCIES, IS THAT WE WOULD BRING FORWARD
6 IN SEPTEMBER, A RESOLUTION THAT STARTS TO LAY OUT --
7 AND WE WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO HAVE THE FULLY DETAILED
8 WORK PLAN BY SEPTEMBER, BUT WE CAN START TO LAY OUT
9 ALL OF THESE THINGS IN WHICH THAT HAVE JUST BEEN
10 BROUGHT UP, A JOINT WORK PLAN WHERE EACH OF THE
11 PARTICIPATING AGENCIES ARE TAKING ON SOME ASPECT OF,
12 YOU KNOW, A ROLE, OR A SET OF ACTIVITIES THAT ARE
13 HELPING TO -- HELP US COLLECTIVELY MEET THIS ACTION
14 PLAN, IF YOU WILL, AROUND CLIMATE ADAPTATION. AND THE
15 FOCUS ON MAXIMIZING AND LEVERAGING THE EXPERTISE OF
16 EACH AGENCY, SO ALONG THE LINES OF BCDC'S REGULATORY
17 ROLE, IT WOULD PERHAPS HONE IN ON THE OPPORTUNITY
18 THERE TO REALLY USE
19 ***** THAT
20 ROLE TO HELP US MEET ADAPTATION STRATEGIES AND DIG
21 INTO THAT A LITTLE FURTHER. WE WOULD BRING FORWARD
22 WORKING ACROSS AGENCIES, SPECIFIC WAYS IN WHICH
23 INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES ARE TAKING ON TASKS TO MEET THIS,
24 AND FORMALIZE THAT THROUGH A RESOLUTION. AND SOME OF
25 THAT IS -- FOR EXAMPLE, THIS WAS BROUGHT UP IN A



JULY 16, 2021

1 PREVIOUS MEMO, LAST JULY, THAT THE BOARD APPROVED,
2 YOU KNOW, ACKNOWLEDGING THAT MTC AND ABAG ARE, YOU
3 KNOW, MTC IS AN ENTITY THAT'S USED TO RECEIVING BIG
4 CHUNKS OF MONEY AND DISTRIBUTING IT BACK OUT THE
5 DOOR. IF WE EXPECT THAT THERE MAY BE FEDERAL OR STATE
6 RESOURCES COMING THROUGH TO SUPPORT CLIMATE
7 ADAPTATION, WE COULD IDENTIFY THE AGENCIES THAT ARE
8 TAKING ON THAT ROLE, TO FIND WHAT WE MEAN BY LEAD I
9 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE UNDERSTAND AN AGENCY MAY BE
10 TAKING ON THE SHEPHERDING ROLE BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN
11 THEY'RE DOING IT SOLELY WITHOUT NOT BEING IN
12 COLLABORATION WITH THEIR PARTNERS. SO I THINK WE
13 COULD -- IN MY -- THERE IS THIS JOINT WORK PLAN
14 THERE, IS THE IDEA OF HAVING PRINCIPLES, MAYBE WE
15 COULD BUILD ON THE PRINCIPLES THAT WERE IN THE BAY
16 ADAPT, BUT COULD FOCUS ON WHAT IT MEANS BY
17 COLLABORATION, HOW THE AGENCIES KIND OF -- THE WAYS
18 IN WHICH WE'RE WORKING TOGETHER, HOW WE'RE -- I
19 WANTED TO BRING UP, THE EXAMPLE I BROUGHT UP IN THE
20 MEMO AROUND THIS, THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING
21 GRANTS PROGRAM, THE REAP PROGRAM THAT HAS BEEN
22 SUCCESSFUL, THE FIRST TIME EVER, AND THIS IS PART OF
23 THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION EFFORT. AS YOU
24 KNOW, IT'S A CONTENTIOUS PROCESS THAT HAS BEEN THE
25 MANDATE BY THE STATE, FOR THE FIRST TIME THE STATE



JULY 16, 2021

1 HAS PROVIDED RESOURCES TO REGIONAL AGENCIES AND LOCAL
2 GOVERNMENTS AND ABAG STAFF HAS BUILT OUT TO PROVIDE
3 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO JURISDICTIONS AROUND THE RHNA
4 AND WHAT IT'S BEEN EFFECTIVE IN DOING IS RELEASE A
5 LOT OF THE CONTENTION IN THIS PROCESS BECAUSE NOW
6 THERE IS SOME RESOURCE TO SUPPORT THE RHNA PROCESS.
7 IF WE LOOK AT THE SIMILAR MODEL WHERE WE COULD HAVE
8 RESOURCES COMING THROUGH STATE OR FEDERAL AGENCIES TO
9 OUR REGIONAL AGENCIES AND WE'RE DEVELOPING THE
10 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM TO HELP LOCAL
11 JURISDICTIONS DO THEIR ADAPTATION PLANNING. SO, YOU
12 KNOW, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE APPROACH THIS FROM A
13 MULTI-HAZARD PERSPECTIVE, AND WE OUTLINE MORE
14 SPECIFICALLY -- BECAUSE I DO THINK WE NEED A SENSE OF
15 URGENCY, HOW WE'RE GOING TO EXECUTE ON THIS, VERY
16 MUCH IN THE NEAR-TERM. HOW ARE WE GOING TO EXECUTE
17 THIS WHAT IS IT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS GOING TO DO
18 TO HELP IMPLEMENT SOME OF THE BAY ADAPT STRATEGIES.
19 WE CAN GET INTO THE DETAILS OF THIS, AND WE CAN
20 ASSIGN RESPONSIBILITIES TO INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES AND
21 RECOGNIZE EXPERTISE AND THE CAPACITY THAT EACH
22 INDIVIDUAL AGENCY BRINGS TO THE ABLE TO ADDRESS THIS
23 ISSUE AND WE CAN MAP THAT OUT IN A WORK PLAN.
24



JULY 16, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT, ALLISON, THANK YOU FOR
2 CLARIFYING THAT, AND PUTTING A DIRECTION. I KNOW,
3 BOTH YOUR MEMO, AND THE OUTLINE QUESTIONS WE HAVE FOR
4 THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD RAISE THOSE ISSUES AND GIVE
5 DIRECTION TO CLARIFY. LET ME TURN TO JESSE THEN MARK.

6 **

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** I WANT TO THANK THE BOARD
9 FOR THE DISCUSSION AND THANK ALLISON FOR THOSE
10 COMMENTS AND I WANT TO SECOND A LOT OF WHAT SHE SAID.
11 I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE ALSO THINK OF THIS
12 FROM A MULTI-HAZARD PERSPECTIVE. AND WHILE OUR
13 DISCUSSION TODAY IS FOCUSED ON SEA LEVEL RISE, WE
14 KNOW IN THE BAY AREA WE FACE MANY THREATS, FIRE RISK
15 IN THE WILDLAND AND INTERFACE AND IT'S CERTAINLY MANY
16 ISSUES WE HAVE DEALT WITH OVER THE YEARS AND OTHER
17 SORT OF NATURAL HAZARDS THAT HAVE BEEN EXACERBATED BY
18 CLIMATE CHANGE. TO THAT END -- AND I THINK THAT DOES
19 ALIGN WITH THE, YOU KNOW, ASSEMBLY BILL 897, LOOKING
20 AT MORE HOLISTICALLY AT MULTI-HAZARD REGIONAL CLIMATE
21 ADAPT EDUCATION PLANNING THAT I THINK OUR FOCUS HERE
22 SHOULD JUST NOT BE LIMITED TO SEA LEVEL RISE BUT
23 LOOKING AT SOME OF THESE OTHER ISSUES AS WELL AND NOT
24 JUST HOW WE CAN LEVERAGE THE RESOURCE THAT IS COMING
25 THROUGH THE STATE BUDGET OR ADDRESSING SEA LEVEL



JULY 16, 2021

1 RISE, BUT ALSO, YOU KNOW, FIRE MITIGATION, AND OTHER
2 CLIMATE ADAPTATION PLANNING AND WORK THAT NEEDS TO BE
3 DONE. I WANT TO JUST EMPHASIZE THAT AS WELL AS
4 WHATEVER WORK WE DISCUSS HERE AT BARC, I THINK THAT'S
5 IMPORTANT. SUPERVISOR RABBIT RAISED HIS HAND HE COULD
6 SPEAK TO THE IMPORTANCE OF US TALKING ABOUT HOW WE
7 CAN LEVERAGE RESOURCES AND DO REGIONAL PLANNING
8 AROUND, YOU KNOW, PARTICULARLY THE FIRE RISK ISSUES
9 WE FACE IN THE WILDLAND URBAN INTERFACE. I SEE BARC'S
10 ROLE AS THE CONVENER IN BRINGING ALL THE AGENCIES
11 TOGETHER. BUT ALLISON'S SUGGESTION OF US PLAYING A
12 ROLE AS A MULTI-HAZARD REGIONAL CLIMATE ADAPTATION
13 COLLABORATIVE CONSISTENT WITH THE LEGISLATION THAT'S
14 BEING CONSIDERED, I THINK IS A GOOD SUGGESTION. YOU
15 KNOW, BECAUSE THIS IS WHERE ALL THE REGIONAL AGENCIES
16 COME TOGETHER, AND WE HAVE SPECIFICALLY FOCUSED ON
17 CLIMATE CHANGE, AND CLIMATE ADAPTATION AS A KEY FOCUS
18 OF OUR BOARD. SO I THINK THIS IS WHERE WE COME
19 TOGETHER. I THINK, YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, DEVELOPING
20 SOME GOALS AND PRIORITIES. AND THEN HAVING THE BOARD
21 BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO REPORT BACK AND WHERE WE'RE AT,
22 HAVING THE BOARD PLAY A ROLE IN ADVOCACY AS
23 SUPERVISOR SPERING TALKED ABOUT, I THINK IS EXTREMELY
24 IMPORTANT. HOW WE CAN LEVERAGE THE MONEY COMING FROM
25 THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, CURRENTLY, AND



JULY 16, 2021

1 ANTICIPATE IN THE FUTURE. YOU KNOW, A COUPLE OF OTHER
2 THINGS. YOU KNOW, WE DO NEED, WITH RESPECT TO BAY
3 ADAPT WE NEED TO LOOK AT INGRAINED PRINCIPLES IN ALL
4 THE WORK WE'RE DOING, AND I TALKED TO OUR EXECUTIVE
5 DIRECTOR AT MTC ABOUT LINKING PLANNED BAY AREA INTO
6 THIS IMPLEMENTATION PLAN THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE
7 WORKING ON OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS. I THINK
8 SUPERVISOR SPERING'S IDEA OF HOW WE CAN BREAK DOWN
9 THE REGULATORY BARRIERS FOR US BEING ABLE TO
10 PARTICULARLY BEING ABLE TO ADVANCE SEA LEVEL RISE
11 WORK IS IMPORTANT. THE IDEA OF AN EIR WAS REALLY
12 INTERESTING THERE WAS WORK WITH THE ARMY CORP OF
13 ENGINEERS, AND STREAMLINED WORK ORIENTED TO MAKE
14 THESE PROJECTS HAPPEN SO WHEN THE MONEY DOES COME
15 THAT WE'RE POSITIONED TO LEVERAGE IT LASTLY I WANT TO
16 LIFT UP WHAT WAS BROUGHT UP BY ALLISON HOW WE CAN
17 SUPPORT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO GET THE BUY-IN OF LOCAL
18 GOVERNMENTS NOT JUST WORK AROUND HOW WE ALIGN CLIMATE
19 ADAPTATION WITH LAND USE PLANNING BUT HOW WE CAN
20 SUPPORT THEM ON INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS FOR THEIR
21 COMMUNITIES THAT ARE ALIGNED WITH BROAD REGIONAL
22 GOALS AND PRINCIPLES. WHAT WE HAVE DONE WITH THE REAP
23 LEAP PROGRAM IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT AND MAYBE THAT'S
24 A REQUEST WE CAN MAKE WITH THE STATE GOVERNMENT IS
25 SOMETHING WE CAN DO WITH RESOURCES



JULY 16, 2021

1

2 AVAILABLE TO THE STATE BUDGET TO PROVIDE EXPERTISE
3 AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO DO THE PLANNING PROJECTS
4 THAT WE CAN GET FUNDED AND HAVE THOSE PROJECTS ALIGN
5 WITH THE REGIONAL STRATEGY. THAT'S IMPORTANT. A VALUE
6 ADD THAT WE CAN SELL TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS. WE DON'T
7 WANT TO TAKE MONEY AWAY FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENTS OR
8 POWER AWAY FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AND COUNTY
9 GOVERNMENTS THAT'S A DISCUSSION, RATHER I THINK WE
10 CAN HAVE A COORDINATOR REGIONAL APPROACH AND LOCAL
11 GOVERNMENTS PLAY A VERY CRITICAL ROLE AND SUPPORTING
12 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS WORK TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR THEM.
13 THIS IS A HIGH LEVEL THOUGHTS I WANTED TO SHARE ABOUT
14 THE REQUESTED ACTION.

15

16 >>AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MARK ROSS?

17

18 DIR. MARK ROSS: I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR AN
19 EXCELLENT REPORT. IT WAS VERY DETAILED AND THOROUGH.
20 IT'S GOING TO GUIDE US TO BEING EARLY ADAPTERS HERE
21 IN THE BAY AREA. BUT HOW DO WE GET THERE? AND AS
22 JESSE WAS MENTIONING HOW TO GET THE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS
23 TO IMPLEMENT THIS. THIS ASSEMBLED GROUP IS VERY
24 KNOWLEDGEABLE, WE WORK ON LOCAL LEVELS WITH MORE
25 MUNDANE THINGS ON CITY COUNCILS, AND TRYING TO GET A



JULY 16, 2021

1 CITY COUNCIL TO ADAPT OR TO EMBRACE A STRATEGY,
2 AMONGST ALL THE OTHER THINGS THEY HAVE TO DEAL WITH,
3 IS TOUGH. AND I TRY TO LIKEN IT TO ENDING SYSTEMIC
4 RACISM. YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE TO WORK WITH PEOPLE
5 INDIVIDUALLY AND THE GOVERNMENTS THAT GOVERNANCE
6 THEM, AND FIND THE SOLUTIONS TO SYSTEMIC RACISM. BUT
7 THE ACTIONS THAT ARE GOING TO DO THE MOST GOOD ARE
8 THE PERSONAL CHOICES THAT ARE MADE. AND THEN THE
9 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS THAT ARE THERE, OVERSEEING THOSE
10 PEOPLE, SO TO END -- YOU KNOW, YOU CAN PASS ALL THE
11 CONGRESSIONAL RESOLUTIONS YOU WANT, IF THEY COULD
12 EVER DO THAT, BUT IT REALLY TAKES A BOTTOM-UP
13 APPROACH, EDUCATING PEOPLE INDIVIDUALLY TO TAKE
14 INDIVIDUAL ACTIONS. TO END SYSTEMIC WARMING, YOU HAVE
15 TO TAKE THAT SAME APPROACH, AND HOW DO WE MAKE THAT,
16 MENU OF CHOICES EASY FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO DISCUSS
17 AND PEOPLE TO EMBRACE? THAT'S THE KEY TO SUCCESS. THE
18 TOP LEVEL PROTOCOL AND 200 PAGE BOOKLET OF HOW TO DO
19 THIS IS GREAT FOR THE COGNIZATE THAT IS ASSEMBLED,
20 AND WE HAVE TO HAVE A BOTTOM-UP APPROACH THAT
21 INCLUDES A MENU OF HERE IS HOW TO ALLEVIATE WARMING,
22 HOW TO ADAPT YOUR WATER LINE. AND MAKE THE LIST
23 SHORTER AND EMBRACEABLE SO THAT MAYBE YOU CAN GET 50
24 OF THE 100 CITIES TO DO SOMETHING AND TO TRY TO NOT
25 HAVE THE UNIFIED GRANT THEORY OF THE UNIVERSE BE



JULY 16, 2021

1 EMBRACED BY EVERYBODY WHETHER IT'S THE STREAM THEORY
2 OR WHATEVER ELSE, IT'S JUST GOING TO GET PUSHED OFF
3 TO THE FUTURE. AND THE LAST THING IS, I WOULD ALSO
4 LIKE TO SAY, TO FUND THIS STUFF, WHATEVER YOU'RE
5 TALKING ABOUT, IT'S GOING TO NEED MONEY. AND I HAVE
6 BEEN A LONG ADVOCATE OF CARBON TAXATION. AND PRICING
7 CARBON, AND YOU SEE WHAT THE EUROPEAN UNION IS
8 CONSIDERING, VERY RECENTLY, IN THEIR CARBON PRICING
9 EFFORTS, AND WHILE WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO
10 IMPLEMENT IT, PER SE, HERE, WE COULD DO SOME MODELING
11 THAT WOULD SHOW THE COST OF CARBON, WHAT IT COULD BE,
12 TO GET THAT IN PLACE, SO THAT PEOPLE GET AN IDEA,
13 THIS IS THE COST OF CARBON TO THE ENVIRONMENT, AND TO
14 YOUR LIVES, AND THIS IS THE COST OF WHAT -- HOW WE
15 COULD ACTUALLY IMPLEMENT SOME TYPE OF CARBON REVENUE,
16 NEUTRAL, OF COURSE YOU HAVE TO HAVE EQUITY INVOLVED
17 IN THAT. A CARBON STREAM OF REVENUE, THAT CAN FUND
18 SOME OF THESE ADAPTATION MEASURES. AND ALLEVIATION
19 AND PREVENTATIVE NATURE. SO THAT'S A COMPLICATED TASK
20 TO DO THAT TYPE OF MODELLING AND PRESENT THAT TO THE
21 BAY AREA AS AN INFORMATIVE PROCEDURE, OR PRACTICE,
22 BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE OF VALUE. AND IT WOULD ALSO
23 INFORM THE OTHER EFFORTS THAT ARE MORE TANGIBLE AND
24 PRACTICAL AS EVERYTHING -- THERE IS A HIDDEN EMBEDDED
25 COST, AND IF WE DON'T DO THEM, THE COSTS ARE GOING TO



JULY 16, 2021

1 RISE, AND HERE THEY ARE. THOSE ARE MY TWO MOLECULES
2 WORTH.

3

4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AND THOSE WORDS, COGNIZATE. I LOVE
5 IT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR COMMENTS, MARK, I
6 THINK THEY'RE ON POINT. I HAVE BEEN TALKING TO
7 SEVERIN BORENSTEIN ABOUT THE IDEAS OF CARBON TAXES
8 AND REVENUES, SO MAYBE WE'LL HAVE SOME HELP AT
9 BERKELEY. THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR RABBIT

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT:** I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK FROM STAFF.
12 EXCELLENT PRESENTATION. GREAT DISCUSSION. I WANTED TO
13 OPINE ON THE -- WHEN COMMISSIONER SPERING MENTIONED
14 THE CEQA DOCUMENTS, I CAN TELL YOU HERE IN OUR OWN
15 COUNTY, AND JESSE TO YOUR POINTS, EXCELLENT, AS WELL,
16 MADE ME THINK ABOUT OUR OWN ATTEMPTS TO -- AS ONE OF
17 MY COLLEAGUES SAYS PREDEFEAT FIRE THROUGH VEGETATION
18 MANAGEMENT. WE ACTUALLY HAVE THE MONEY RIGHT NOW TO
19 MAKE SIGNIFICANT INROADS BUT WE COULDN'T DO ANYTHING
20 WITHOUT CEQA AND IT'S GOING TO TAKE A YEAR AND MAYBE
21 TWO. ACROSS THE BOARD SOME YEARS BACK SONOMA COUNTY
22 WAS RECOGNIZED AS ONE OF THE FIRST TO HAVE A REGIONAL
23 CLIMATE PROTECTION PLAN WE GOT SUED BY CEQA BECAUSE
24 THE DOCUMENT COULDN'T DEFEND IT AT THE TIME, AND
25 WITHOUT THE DOCUMENT YOU CAN'T REALLY IMPLEMENT AND



JULY 16, 2021

1 GO FORWARD ITS NOT LIVING UP TO ITS POTENTIAL. THE
2 NORTH BAY WETLAND EXPANSION THERE CAN LEAD TO A BIG
3 SEA LEVEL CUSHION FOR THE BAY, A BAY LEVEL RISE, BUT
4 YET, WE'RE YEARS AWAY FROM REALLY GETTING THERE,
5 AGAIN, BECAUSE OF OUR OWN PROCESSES. AND WHAT CAN WE
6 DO? IF WE WANT TO SAY THAT IT -- THAT THESE ACTIONS
7 ARE IMPERATIVE THAT WE MOVE FORWARD WITH, BUT WE'RE
8 STUCK IN THAT SAME BUREAUCRATIC PROCESS, ARE WE
9 REALLY PUSHING AS HARD AS WE CAN TO MAKE A DIFFERENCE
10 QUICKER? AND THAT'S ON THE PROJECT SIDE, OF COURSE,
11 AND THE ACTIONS. YOU KNOW? SO MANY THINGS REQUIRE THE
12 ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTS. HERE WE ARE IN THE SECOND
13 YEAR WORST DROUGHT FIRE GOING ON ALL OVER THE PLACE
14 AND WE CAN'T GET ON PROPERTIES BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE
15 A CEQA DOCUMENT THAT COULD TAKE MORE THAN A YEAR.
16 IT'S FRUSTRATING SOME OF THOSE THINGS PERCOLATED
17 THROUGH OUR MEETING TODAY AND I THOUGHT I WOULD MAKE
18 MENTION OF THAT. THANK YOU FOR THE DISCUSSION.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. L DAVID, THANK YOU VERY MUCH
21 FOR YOUR COMMENTS. MAYBE WE HAVE ANOTHER REASON TO
22 TAKE A LOOK AT CEQA. MAYBE FIRE WILL BE THE
23 COMPELLING ONE. LET ME ASK IF THERE ARE ANY -- LET ME
24 JUST MOVE TO SEE, LOOKING AT THE ATTENDEES TO SEE IF
25 THERE ARE ANY -- IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON



JULY 16, 2021

1 THIS ITEM, AND ASK SERENA IF THERE IS ANY WRITTEN
2 CORRESPONDENCE?

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MADAM CHAIR, WE'RE HAVEN'T
5 RECEIVED ANY WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE.

6

7 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** TERRIFIC. LET ME SEE IF WE HAVE ANY
8 PUBLIC COMMENT. I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. OKAY.
9 L WE APPRECIATE THE PUBLIC BEING HERE. AND, JUST WANT
10 TO COME BACK AND BRING IT BACK TO OUR -- THE
11 COMMITTEE FOR NEXT STEPS. IT'S ABOUT 11:45 AND I
12 THINK OUR HOPE WAS TO GET A SENSE OF THIS GROUP IN
13 TERMS OF HOW WE WANT TO MOVE FORWARD. AND, JESSE, LET
14 ME TURN TO YOU, PLEASE

15

16 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** ALLISON, DO YOU NEED A
17 MOTION ON THE RECOMMENDATION?

18

19 **ALLISON BROOKS:** I THINK A RECOMMENDATION FOR WHAT
20 BRINGING FORWARD, A RESOLUTION, RECOMMENDATIONS IN
21 THE MEMO. I GUESS THE QUESTION S DO WE NEED A VOTE ON
22 THAT? OR A CONSENSUS RECOMMENDATION?

23



JULY 16, 2021

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** IF THERE IS CONSENSUS, THEN
2 I THINK WE'RE FINE. THAT'S WHY I WANTED TO CHECK.
3 WHAT ACTION DO YOU NEED FROM US?

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YEAH, AND I THINK -- I'M SORRY,
6 ALLISON. ZACK HAS HIS HAND UP.

7

8 **ALLISON BROOKS:** I THINK THE CONSENSUS, THAT'S THE
9 MOTION THAT PEOPLE AGREE WITH FOR THE ACTION THAT WE
10 WOULD BRING SOMETHING FORWARD IN SEPTEMBER.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MOVE FORWARD. ZACK, YOU HAVE YOUR
13 HAND UP TOO

14

15 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** MOVE FORWARD ON THE RECOMMENDATION.
16 IN OUR PRESENTATION IS NOT A CONSENSUS ACTION BUT ANY
17 REACTION. WHAT WE WANT TO DO IS TAKE THIS PLATFORM
18 OUT TO A RANGE OF OTHER REGIONAL BODIES, AS WELL AS
19 BEYOND THAT TO ESSENTIALLY GET THEM TO SIGN ON. AND I
20 JUST WANT TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY -- ANYBODY SEES ANY
21 BIG ROADBLOCKS FOR THAT OR ANY PARTICULAR SUGGESTIONS
22 FOR THAT? IT'S NOT ON FOR ACTION, FOR [INDISCERNIBLE]
23 ITSELF. THOUGH WE MAY BRING THAT BACK IN THE FUTURE.

24



JULY 16, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ZACK, I WANT TO CLARIFY, THERE WERE
2 TWO MEMOS, THE BAY ADAPT THEN THERE IS THE SECOND
3 JOINT PLATFORM, WHICH, IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE -- JUST TO
4 CLARIFY IN TERMS OF MOVING FORWARD. AND I CERTAINLY
5 AGREE WITH THE VEHICLE, THE WAY TO BRING ALL OF OUR
6 AGENCIES TOGETHER IS TO KIND OF ADOPT A JOINT
7 PLATFORM, AND I THINK WHAT I'M HEARING, TOO, IS THAT
8 IT'S -- YOU GUYS HAVE DONE FANTASTIC WORK ABOUT -- ON
9 THE BAY ADAPT, IN THE BAY, BUT THAT WE WOULD INCLUDE
10 A MULTI-THREAT, KIND OF, INCORPORATION, IN ANY
11 RESOLUTION, BUT WHAT YOU HAVE DONE, TOO, IN THE BAY
12 ADAPT PRESENTATION, IS YOU HAVE KIND OF -- YOU HAVE
13 SUGGESTED SOME FRAMEWORK FOR INPUT AND DISCUSSION AND
14 DECISION. I THINK IT ADDRESSES SOME OF THE POINTS
15 THAT PEOPLE HAVE MADE ABOUT PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND
16 MARKS COMMENTS ABOUT THE MANY LEVELS OF THIS AND HOW
17 DO WE ACTUALLY ACHIEVE THE WORK. SO, DOES THAT MAKE
18 SENSE TO YOU?

19

20 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** IT D BUT I ACTUALLY THINK IT IS BOTH.
21 I THINK, IN ITS BROADEST SENSE, THE RECOMMENDATION IN
22 ALLISON'S MISDEMEANOR OH CERTAINLY INCLUDE WHAT IS WE
23 HAVE DONE. BUT THERE IS ONE OF THE STRUGGLES, AND
24 IT'S NOT JUST OUR STRUGGLE. IT'S OTHER, SORT OF,
25 SLIGHTLY SILOED ENTITIES THAT HAVE A PIECE OF



JULY 16, 2021

1 ADAPTING TO AND MAJOR MITIGATION EFFORTS BEYOND WHAT
2 WE ALL SHOULD BE DOING REGARDING CLIMATE CHANGE, THE
3 WHOLE FIRE PIECE IS INVOLVED IN THAT. BUT IN THAT
4 SORT OF SENSE, I THINK WE NEED AND WANT TO ADVANCE
5 SUPPORT FOR BAY AREA ADAPT ALONG WITH THE BROAD
6 PLATFORM.

7

8 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** EXACTLY. DO THEM BOTH. THEY'RE
9 INCORPORATED. JESS?

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** I WAS GOING TO SAY, THEY'RE
12 ALIGNED, WHAT ALLISON'S PROPOSE WOULD HELP IMPLEMENT
13 BAY ADAPT. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT ALL OF OUR
14 REGIONAL AGENCIES THAT HAVE A ROLE WITH BAY ADAPT
15 THAT, WE DO ENDORSE IT, AND THAT WE HAVE KIND OF A
16 GUIDING FRAMEWORK FOR THE WORK ON SEA LEVEL RISE. SO
17 WE'LL BE BRINGING THIS TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD IN
18 SEPTEMBER. BUT I THINK THE MORE THAT WE'RE ALL
19 ALIGNED AROUND CERTAIN PRINCIPLES AND A FRAMEWORK, I
20 THINK THE MORE IT'S GOING TO BE EASIER FOR US TO DO -
21 - TO GET DOWN AND DO THE WORK, THE PLANNING AND THE
22 ACTUAL IMPLEMENTATION.

23

24 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** YEAH. GREAT. ANY OTHER ADDITIONAL
25 COMMENTS? FIRST OF ALL, AGAIN, I WANT TO THANK STAFF



JULY 16, 2021

1 FOR YOUR INCREDIBLY HARD WORK ON THIS, AND
2 PRESENTATION, IT WAS REALLY FANTASTIC. YOU KNOW, ALL
3 THE -- GIVEN ALL THE EVENTS THAT ARE HAPPENING
4 RECENTLY, I REALLY THINK WE FEEL THIS GREAT SENSE OF
5 URGENCY AND THE WORK YOU ALL ARE DOING AND THE WORK
6 YOU BROUGHT FORWARD TODAY IS REALLY INSPIRING TO SAY,
7 ALL RIGHT, HERE IS A PATHWAY TO DO THIS. AND I ALSO
8 THINK THAT IT'S A GREAT -- THE ADDITION OF THE WATER
9 QUALITY CONTROL BOARD, AND THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY TO
10 THIS BARC GROUP HAS BEEN A FANTASTIC ADDITION IN
11 TERMS OF THE BROADER CONVERSATIONS AROUND WATER, AND
12 I THINK OF CONTRA COSTA COUNTY, WE REALLY DO REFLECT
13 AS MANY COUNTIES DO, THAT WE ALL TOUCH THE BAY, SO WE
14 HAVE GOT ISSUES AROUND THE BAY, THEN WE HAVE HUGE
15 HIGH FIRE AREAS. AND, YOU KNOW, UNDERSTANDING THAT
16 THE FUELS MITIGATION, WE JUST SPENT A YEAR AND A HALF
17 WORKING WITH OUR FIRE CHIEF TO DEVELOP A FUELS
18 COMMUNICATION ORDINANCE WHICH IS A TOUGH ORDINANCE
19 AND I REALIZE THE COMMENTS ABOUT CITIES NEEDING THE
20 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO DO THIS HAD IT NOT BEEN FOR
21 THE WORK OF THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FIRE DISTRICT
22 FIRE PROFESSIONALS THAT FUELS MITIGATION, THE IDEA OF
23 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE REALLY GOING TO BE IMPORTANT TO
24 CITIES WHETHER WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WATER, AIR, OR
25 FIRES. SO IT SOUND LIKE IT MAKES SENSE TO MOVE



JULY 16, 2021

1 FORWARD THE RECOMMENDATIONS ALLISON HAS PUT FORTH
2 IT'S GOING TO BE A WORK IN PROGRESS. BUT THE TENANTS
3 ARE THAT BARC CAN BE AN IMPORTANT COMMUNICATION AND
4 SORT OF COLLABORATION ROLE AND THEN RECOGNITION THE
5 SOLID IMPORTANT ROLES THAT EACH OF THE REGIONAL
6 AGENCY PLAY, WHETHER IT'S PLANNING, OR REGULATORY
7 ROLES, OR FINANCIAL ROLES. AND THEN THE THIRD PIECE,
8 REALLY, I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS ABOUT THE BAY ADAPT
9 STRATEGY, IT REALLY PROVIDES A LOT OF INPUT IN TERMS
10 OF HOW WE REALLY ENGAGE THE PUBLIC IN THIS PROCESS
11 AND BROAD, BROAD STAKEHOLDERS. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK
12 THIS IS REALLY IMPORTANT. AND WE HAVE GOT
13 ORGANIZATIONS LIKE THE BAY PLANNING COALITION, THAT
14 BRINGS TOGETHER A BROAD GROUP OF PEOPLE THAT ARE
15 INTERESTED IN THESE ISSUES, AND CAN PROVIDE INPUT.
16 SO, A LOT OF GOOD FOLKS THAT ARE ENGAGED IN THIS. AND
17 FINALLY, YOU KNOW, THIS IS A TIME WHEN WE DO, WHEN WE
18 ARE SEEING STATE AND FEDERAL RESOURCES COMING TO THE
19 REGION TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES. WHICH, I MEAN, IT'S
20 SO GREAT. THIS IS THE FIRST TIME, AS YOU ALL KNOW, WE
21 HAVE EVER REALLY SEEN THE COMMITMENT, WHETHER IT'S
22 SEA LEVEL RISE, AND WATER, OR FIRE, COMING FROM THE
23 STATE BUDGET TO PROVIDE RESOURCES TO DO THIS. SO, IT
24 SOUND LIKE WE HAVE CONSENSUS. AGAIN, I WANT TO REALLY
25 THANK OUR LEADER ALLISON FOR HER LEADERSHIP AND



JULY 16, 2021

1 WORKING WITH ALL OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AND
2 WORKING WITH THIS BOARD TO HELP MOVE US FORWARD. SO,
3 THANK YOU, VERY, VERY MUCH. AND IF THERE IS NO
4 FURTHER COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, I THINK WE DO HAVE
5 CONSENSUS SO WE'LL MOVE FORWARD TO SEPTEMBER. THANK
6 YOU EVERYONE FOR YOUR ENGAGEMENT AND YOUR COMMENTS.
7 AND WE'LL MOVE NOW TO ANY PUBLIC COMMENT THAT, BEFORE
8 THIS COMMITTEE, THAT WASN'T ON THE AGENDA TODAY. SO,
9 WELCOME ANY GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT? LET ME SEE IF
10 THERE IS ANY GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. SERENA, DO YOU
11 SEE ANY? I DON'T.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I DON'T SEE ANY AT THE MOMENT.

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AND I ASSUME WE HAVE RECEIVED NO
16 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE FROM THE PUBLIC? OKAY.
17 TERRIFIC. WELL WITH THAT, THEN, WE WILL ADJOURN TO
18 OUR -- OH, YES, ZACK, MR. WASSERMAN?

19

20 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** I WAS JUST WAVING GOODBYE.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I THOUGHT YOU HAD MORE COMMENTS.
23 WITH THAT, WE'RE ADJOURNED UNTIL SEPTEMBER. THANKS
24 AGAIN. [ADJOURNED]

25



Broadcasting Government