

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



July 9, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE**
3 **COMMITTEE**
4 **FRIDAY, JULY 9, 2021, 9:40 A.M.**

5
6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** JESS, ARE YOU GOING TO RUN
7 THE MEETING NOTICE? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
8 ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
9 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S
10 EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF
11 THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
12 SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS,
13 STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK
14 CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR
15 REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH
16 THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE
17 VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
18 PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE
19 HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
20 THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL
21 BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.
22 IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
23 ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.
24 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY
25 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



July 9, 2021

1 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF
2 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,
3 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR
4 ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT
5 THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

6

7 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU, JESS. MAYOR
8 ARREGUIN, WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS I'LL CALL THE MTC MEETING
9 TOGETHER. I'LL TAKE OUR ROLL CALL THEN TURN IT OVER TO YOU TO
10 DO YOUR ROLL CALL, COMPENSATION, AND CONSENT CALENDAR. IF
11 THAT'S OKAY WITH YOU

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** SOUNDS GREAT.

14

15 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** FRED. TAKE THE ROLL CALL FOR
16 THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CHAIR SPERING?

19

20 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** PRESENT.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** PRESENT.

25



July 9, 2021

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

2

3 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

6

7 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT.

14 COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING.

15

16 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

19

20 **SAM LICCARDO:** PRESENT.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS

23 PRESENT.

24



July 9, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU, FRED. AND I'LL
2 TURN IT OVER TO MAYOR ARREGUIN. JESS?

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU, CHAIR
5 SPERING. FRED WILL YOU PLEASE CALL THE ROLL OF THE ABAG
6 MEMBERS?

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES, SIR. MAYOR ARREGUIN?

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** PRESENT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR EKLUND?

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** FLIGOR? I SEE YOU. YOU'RE HERE. THANK YOU.
17 MAYOR HUDSON?

18

19 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR LEE? SUPERVISORS LEE IS ABSENT.
22 SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN? SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS ABSENT. SOME
23 MITCHOFF?

24

25 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** HERE.



July 9, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ? IS ABSENT.

3 SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR RAMOS? SUPERVISOR

8 RAMOS IS ABSENT. MAYOR ROMERO?

9

10 **CARLOS ROMERO:** HERE

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR WILSON IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY

15 MUCH. ITEM TWO, THE ABAG COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. MR. CASTRO

16 IF YOU COULD PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES, SIR. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM

19 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG

20 BOARD IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE

21 PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF \$100 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING

22 FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK

23 YOU.

24



July 9, 2021

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY
2 MUCH. MOVING TO ITEM THREE, THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE
3 CONSENT CALENDAR.

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MOVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR, THIS IS MAYOR
6 EKLUND.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MOVED BY
9 MAYOR EKLUND. IS THERE A SECOND?

10

11 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** SECOND, HUDSON.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** SECOND HUDSON.
14 COLLEAGUES ANY DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION? PLEASE RAISE YOUR
15 HAND. SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. I'M NOT SEEING
16 ANY RAISED HANDS, MR. CASTRO

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
20 ON THIS ITEM.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** OKAY. PLEASE CALL
23 THE ROLL ON THE MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

24



July 9, 2021

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES, SIR. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES

2 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. [INDISCERNIBLE]

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** MOTION CARRIES.

5 BACK TO YOU CHAIR SPERING.

6

7 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** NEXT ITEM MTC PLANNING

8 COMMITTEE, CONSENT CALENDER.

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** MOVE BY DUTRA-VERNACI.

11

12 **EDDIE AHN:** SECOND.

13

14 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** PUBLIC COMMENT ON OUR

15 CONSENT, FRED?

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH

18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED

19 ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** I SEE NO HANDS RAISED BY

22 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. COULD YOU TAKE THE ROLL, PLEASE?

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

25 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT



July 9, 2021

1

2 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MOVING TO ITEM
3 FIVE INFORMATION ITEM SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION INITIATIVES
4 AND ACTIONS. MATT MALONEY ARE YOU GOING TO KICK THIS OFF?

5

6 **MATT MALONEY:** TODAY WE'RE TAKING A BREAK IN THE ACTION FROM
7 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I KNOW YOU'RE ALL DISAPPOINTED IN THAT,
8 AND AS YOU KNOW WE'RE IN A PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD RIGHT NOW IN
9 THE PLAN SO WE'RE WORKING TO ENGAGE PUBLIC AND PARTNERS ON THE
10 PLAN WE'RE GOING TO BE BACK IN SEPTEMBER FOR UPDATE ON THAT
11 AND BACK IN OCTOBER ADOPTION OF THE PLAN. I WANT TO SET
12 CONTEXT FOR SPECIFIC INITIATIVES THAT WILL RELATE TO THE
13 STRATEGIES IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. BOTH OF THESE ARE IN
14 THE ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT THE FIRST ONE IS SEA LEVEL RISE ACTION
15 AND SECOND ONE IS PARK WHICH IS A KEY PART OF TRANSPORTATION
16 DEMAND MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES. ADAPTING TO CLIMATE CHANGE AND
17 REDUCING GHG EMISSIONS ARE ALL ALONG WITH THE COBENEFIT WE
18 TACKLING ALL SIDES OF THE CLIMATE SPECTRUM TODAY. I WANT TO
19 FOCUS ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION BECAUSE THIS IS AN
20 ISSUE THAT IS NOT ON AGENDA FOR THE JOINT BODY PREVIOUSLY. YOU
21 HAVE SEEN OUR WORK AS PART OF THE HORIZON PLANS AND FRONT AND
22 CENTER FOR US PLANNED BAY AREA WORKS TO INTEGRATE INFORMATION
23 ON SEA LEVEL RISE VULNERABILITY AND A STEP FURTHER IN TAKING
24 STEPS TO QUANTIFY WHAT IT WILL TAKE IN INVESTMENT REQUIRED TO
25 PROTECT OUR COMMUNITIES AND TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM WE BELIEVE



July 9, 2021

1 THAT FIGURE IS UPWARDS OF 20 BILLION OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS. I
2 BELIEVE IT'S A FAIR QUESTION TO ASK WHAT IS THE ROLE OF MTC
3 AND ABAG IN THIS SPACE AND WHEN WE CONSIDER NEXT STEPS ON THIS
4 ISSUE AND WHY WE SHOULD BE INVOLVED IN LEADING ASPECTS OF IT,
5 I WOULD SUGGEST, THAT ONE, AS MTC ARE REGIONAL STATE YOUR NAME
6 FOR THE RECORDS OF THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AND THAT SYSTEM
7 IS IN GREAT PERIL IF WE DO NOT ACT IN A PROACTIVE FASHION ON
8 THIS ISSUE. AND SECOND ABAG THE COUPLE OF GOVERNMENT WE HAVE
9 THE MOST ROBUST LOCAL REPRESENTATION AND ARE WELL SUITED TO
10 BRING FOLKS TOGETHER TO ENGAGE REGIONALLY THIS IS AN ISSUE
11 THAT IS APPROPRIATE BECAUSE OF THE RISING TIDES THAT ARE
12 UNLIKELY TO PAY ANY ATTENTION TO JUNCTIONAL BOUNDARIES. ONE
13 CONVERSATION WE WANT TO HAVE WITH YOU IS MTC AND ABAG
14 STRATEGIC ROLE IN SOME OF THIS WORK MOVING FORWARD. OUR PITCH
15 IS THAT WE TAKE A NARROW IMPORTANT SLICE OF THIS ISSUE WHICH
16 IS DEVELOPMENT OF A FUNDING AND INVESTMENT STRATEGY FOR SEA
17 LEVEL RISE AND ADAPTATION A NEW ROLE OF LEADERSHIP FOR MTC IN
18 THE ABAG PLANNING REALM ON THIS ISSUE INCLUDING WORKING
19 CLOSELY WITH PARTNERSHIPS, AND ENTITIES, LOCAL JURISDICTIONS
20 AND COUNTY'S BCDC AND OTHER AGENCIES, OUR PLANNING TEAM IS
21 HERE TODAY, DAVE VAUTIN IS HERE AS WELL I'M GOING TO TURN IT
22 OVER TO MICHAEL GERMERAAD WHO WILL LEAD US OFF TODAY.

23

24 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** THANK YOU. TOGETHER RACHEL AND I WILL SHARE
25 AN UPDATE ON SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATIONS IN THE BAY AREA. NEXT



July 9, 2021

1 SLIDE. OR -- AM I SHARING SLIDES? THERE WE GO. GO AHEAD AND
2 JUMP TO THE NEXT ONE. IN OUR UPDATE WE'LL COVER THREE TOPICS
3 START BY REVIEWING HOW SEA LEVEL RISE WAS INTEGRATED INTO
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THEN TOUCH ON OTHER REGIONAL SEA LEVEL
5 RISE INITIATIVES AND HOW WE'RE COLLECTIVELY HEADED TOWARDS
6 IDENTIFYING ROLES AND PARTNERSHIPS FOR ADAPTATION IN THE
7 REGION AND CLOSE WITH DISCUSSION ON HOW WE PLAN TO MAKE
8 PROGRESS ON ADAPTING OUR SHORELINE IN THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR. WE
9 WANT TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO REVISIT SOME OF THE
10 GROUNDBREAKING WORK THAT WENT INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
11 STARTING BACK WITH HORIZON INTEGRATING THE BEST AVAILABLE
12 MAPPING INTO THE PLANNING PROCESS IDENTIFYING PARCELS AND
13 TRANSPORTATION ASSETS THAT WOULD FLAG WITH EACH FOOT OF SEA
14 LEVEL RISE HORIZON IMAGINE DIFFERENT RATES OF SEA LEVEL RISE
15 HIGHLIGHTING SIGNIFICANT IMPACTS AT ANY LEVEL WHETHER ONE OR
16 THREE, LEVERAGING ANALYSIS DONE BY BCDC AS WELL AS ADAPTING
17 RISING TIDES PROGRAM WE AND IN PARTNERSHIP WITH ESTUARY
18 INSTITUTE IMAGINING POSSIBLE SHORELINE ADAPTATION SOLUTIONS
19 ARRIVING AT A STRATEGY IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THE RANGE OF
20 ADAPTATIONS ACTIONS ACROSS THE REGION TO MEET SEA LEVEL RISE
21 PRESENTS A REGIONAL STRATEGY THAT GIVES THE REGION A REALISTIC
22 MARKER THAT WILL TAKE -- OF WHAT IT WILL TAKE TO MANAGE THE
23 WORST IMPACT IN OUR REGION. THERE ARE MANY DIFFERENT
24 ADAPTATION OPTIONS ENVISIONED FOR THE SHORELINE MARSH
25 RESTORATION ELEVATED ROADWAYS SUITE OF OPTIONS INCLUDING



July 9, 2021

1 GREATER HABITAT AND ECOSYSTEM BENEFITS ALSO CEDING THE NEED
2 FOR SEA WALLS AND SOME URBAN LOCATIONS. PRIORITIZING NATURE
3 INTO THE SOLUTION. RACHEL WHO WILL SPEAK IN A MOMENT LED OUR
4 WORK TO DEVELOP OUR REGIONAL COST ESTIMATE WORKED TO SORT
5 THROUGH LOCAL STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING SOURCES TO UNDERSTAND
6 EXISTING REVENUE AVAILABLE TO ADDRESS OUR \$19 BILLION NEED.
7 OUR INITIAL ESTIMATE IS THAT WE CAN ANTICIPATE ABOUT \$3
8 BILLION IN EXISTING REVENUE LEAVING US WITH A \$16 BILLION GAP
9 TO FILL THROUGH LOCAL AND REGIONAL ACTION AS WELL AS THROUGH
10 LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACY AND PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP. NEXT SLIDE.
11 TOGETHER, THE ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE STRATEGY AND PLANNED BAY
12 AREA 2050 PROTECTS MOST AT-RISK COMMUNITIES AND JOB CENTERS
13 AND ACHIEVES THE REGIONAL GOAL OF 100,000 ACRES OF MARSH
14 RESTORATION SUPPORTS ADAPTATION OF LOW-LYING HIGHWAY AND RAIL
15 LINES LIKE HIGHWAY 37 AND CAPITAL CORRIDOR. NEXT SLIDE.
16 DURING -- NEXT SLIDE -- DURING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050'S
17 DEVELOPMENT OTHER EFFORTS LED BY OUR PARTNERS HAVE FOCUSED
18 NARROWLY ON SEA LEVEL RISE. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE PUT TOGETHER A
19 BIT OF A CELESTIAL GRAPHIC HERE THAT ILLUSTRATE HOW SEA LEVEL
20 RISE HAS BEEN A MAJOR TOPIC OF THREE EFFORTS IN THE REGION.
21 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BAY ADAPTIVE INITIATIVE LED BY BCDC AND
22 THE ESTUARY BLUEPRINT. PLANNED BAY AREA IS A COMPREHENSIVE
23 PLAN IS GRAPPLING WITH HOUSING TRANSPORTATION ECONOMIC AND
24 OTHER ENVIRONMENTAL CONDITIONS. BAY ADAPT HAS DEVELOPED A
25 JOINT PLATFORM OF PRIORITY ACTIONS TO ADVANCE LONG-TERM SEA



July 9, 2021

1 LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION, CURRENTLY THE JOINT PLATFORM IS MADE UP
2 ARE NEARLY TWO DOZEN PRIORITY ACTIONS. BAY ADAPT RECENTLY
3 REACHED A MILESTONE WHEN ITS 35 PERSON LEADERSHIP ADVISORY
4 GROUP AGREED TO ADVANCE THE JOINT PLATFORM TOWARD
5 IMPLEMENTATION. MEANWHILE SFEPA HAS BEGUN AN UPDATE OF THE
6 ESTUARY BLUEPRINT. STAFF AT ALL AGENCIES HAVE WORKED CLOSELY
7 TO ALIGN EFFORTS AND AS EACH TURNS TOWARD IMPLEMENTATION THE
8 FOCUS IS SHIFTING TO QUESTIONS OF ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES
9 TO ADVANCE THE ACTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS BROAD AGREEMENT
10 IN THE REGION THAT DETERMINES ROLES AT THIS POINT IS CRITICAL
11 TO MAKING PROGRESS. THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION
12 PLAN INCLUDES AN ACTION TO PURSUE THE ESTABLISHMENT OF CLEAR
13 ROLES AND RESPONSIBLE IN THE SEA LEVEL RISE SPACE. BAY ADAPT
14 IS SHIFTING DISCUSSION FROM WHAT ACTIONS ARE NEEDED REGIONALLY
15 TO WHO SHOULD LEAD THOSE ACTIONS. MEANWHILE ACTION ON THE
16 STATE BUDGET AND AT THE STATE LEGISLATURE HAS FURTHER
17 ENCOURAGED DISCUSSION. A.B. 897 CALLS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF
18 REGIONAL ADAPTATION NETWORKS AND ADAPTATION PLANS WITHOUT
19 ASSIGNING SPECIFIC ROLES WHILE A.B. 1500 COULD RAISE OVER \$700
20 BILLION STATEWIDE FOR ADAPTING A FUNDING 100 MILLION OF WHICH
21 COULD GO TO THE BAY AREA PRIORITY IDENTIFIED IN A REGIONAL
22 ADAPTATION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. THROUGH THE PROCESS TO CRAFT THE
23 DRAFT IMPLEMENT PLAN MTC/ABAG HAS PROPOSED SOME INITIAL ROLES.
24 LEANING ON EXPERIENCE WITH TRANSPORTATION FUNDING IN OUR
25 RECENT WORK ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA SEA LEVEL RISE NEEDS AND



July 9, 2021

1 REVENUE ASSESSMENT WE BELIEVE WE CAN TAKE ON THE
2 RESPONSIBILITY OF WORKING WITH PARTNERS TO REFINE OUR LONG-
3 TERM REVENUE AND COST ESTIMATES. BECAUSE OF OUR CURRENT ROLE
4 IN ADVANCING HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE THROUGH THE REAP
5 PROGRAM AT ABAG, WE ALSO BELIEVE THAT THE AGENCY COULD BE A
6 GOOD CONDUIT FOR BROADER TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE. TODAY, WE DO
7 NOT HAVE THE RESOURCES NEEDED TO LAUNCH A SEA LEVEL RISE OUR
8 BROADER RESILIENCE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE EFFORT IN THE REGION
9 HOWEVER IF FUNDING WERE AVAILABLE WE BELIEVE WE COULD AUGMENT
10 THE PLATFORMS WE HAVE BUILT TO DIRECT THE COLLECTIVE EFFORTS
11 OF OUR PARTNERS TO THE LOCAL LEVEL. BAY ADAPT IS IN THE EARLY
12 STAGES OF CONSIDERING ROLES FOR THEIR ACTIONS BUT HAS
13 IDENTIFIED MTC ABAG AS A POTENTIAL FIT IN THESE ROLES. ALL
14 ROLES FOR THE AGENCY IN THIS SPACE WOULD BE COLLABORATIVE IN
15 NATURE WORKING HAND IN HAND WITH PARTNERS AT SFEP BARC AND
16 BCDC. I'LL HAND IT OVER TO RACHEL MY PARTNER ON REGIONAL
17 PLANNING TO COVER THE TOPIC OF THE PRESENTATION.

18

19 **RACHAEL HARTOFELIS:** THANK YOU MICHAEL. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE'RE
20 GOING TO SHIFT THE CONVERSATION, NOW, TO DISCUSS THE SPECIFIC
21 ACTIONS WE CAN TAKE IN THE NEXT YEAR TO ADVANCE THE ADAPTIVE
22 SEA LEVEL RISE STRATEGY. NEXT SLIDE. THE PLANNED BAY AREA
23 2050 DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN INCLUDES FIVE SPECIFIC ACTIONS
24 FOR ADAPTING TO SEA LEVEL RISE. TODAY, WE HAVE NARROWED OUR
25 FOCUS IDENTIFYING WAYS TO ADDRESS THE FOLLOWING HIGHLIGHTED



July 9, 2021

1 ACTIONS THAT WE PLAN TO ADVANCE OVER THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR.
2 YOU WILL SEE HERE WE HAVE HIGHLIGHTED ONE, WHICH IS TO SEEK
3 NEW REVENUE FOR THE FULL RANGE RESILIENCE NEEDS. TO ADVOCATE
4 FOR REFORMS TO BETTER ADDRESS RESILIENCE GOALS AND ESTABLISH
5 CLEAR ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES FOR SEA LEVEL RISE, AND TO
6 DEVELOP A SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING PLAN TO SUPPORT ADAPTATION.
7 WE WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT ACTION FOUR IN PARTICULAR AS WE
8 PLAN TO MOVE FORWARD IN THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. A
9 SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING AND INVESTMENT STRATEGY WILL BUILD OFF
10 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 NEEDS AND REVENUE ASSESSMENT THAT
11 WE MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY IDENTIFYING A \$16 BILLION SEA LEVEL
12 RISE FUNDING GAP AND ADVANCE OUR REGIONAL UNDERSTANDING OF
13 COST AND REVENUES. IN ADDITION BEING IDENTIFIED AS A KEY
14 PRIORITY BY THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION
15 PLAN, IT'S ALSO ACTION NUMBER SIX AND BCDC'S BAY ADAPT EFFORT.
16 MTC AND ABAG WORKING WITH PARTNERS LIKE BCDC IS WELL
17 POSITIONED TO DEVELOP A FUNDING INVESTMENT STRATEGY THAT WILL
18 GIVE THE REGION MORE ROBUST TECHNICAL BASE TO FORMAT STATE AND
19 FEDERAL EFFORTS GUIDING PARTNERS TO CONTRIBUTE TO THE EFFORT
20 WITH STRENGTH RESOURCES AND RELATIONSHIPS TO ENSURE WE
21 ACCOMPLISH OUR REGIONAL GOALS TOGETHER. NEXT SLIDE. WE
22 FORESEE THE PLAN BEING SPLIT INTO TWO DISTINCT PHASES
23 THROUGHOUT A FOUR YEAR VISION PHASE ONE WOULD TAKE PLACE NEXT
24 FISCAL YEAR WORK FOCUSING ON IMPROVING OUR BASELINE ADAPTATION
25 STRATEGY DATA AND INFORMATION. THIS WOULD INCLUDE INVENTORYING



July 9, 2021

1 RECENTLY DEVELOPED LOCAL STRATEGIES AS WELL AS CLOSE
2 COLLABORATION WITH OTHERS TO BETTER UNDERSTAND PROJECT COST
3 BOTH WITH COLLEAGUES AT THE AGENCY AND SFEP, COASTAL AUTHORITY
4 AND BCDC WORKING GROUP. IT WOULD ENTAIL PROPOSAL FOR
5 CONTINUING DATA IN THE LONG-TERM. IN SPRING FOCUS WOULD SHIFT
6 TO EXPLORE ADAPTATION REVENUE OPTIONS WORK WILL INCLUDE
7 CLARIFYING OUR UNDERSTANDING OF CURRENT AVAILABLE REVENUES
8 INCLUDING POTENTIAL STATE AND FEDERAL RESOURCES AND WOULD
9 BUILD OFF OF THE REVENUE RESEARCH CONDUCTED AS PART OF BCDC
10 FUTURE WORK. ALSO STUDYING TRADEOFFS WITH DIFFERENT POTENTIAL
11 REVENUE MEASURES ANALYZED BY TYPE AND SCALE IN ORDER TO
12 DETERMINE WHAT MEASURES MAY BE MOST EQUITABLE FOR THE REGION.
13 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PHASE TWO OF THE STRATEGY WOULD BE DIRECTLY
14 INFORMED BY THE ANALYSIS IN PHASE ONE AND WOULD NOT BEGIN
15 UNTIL THE FALL OF THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR. PHASE TWO WOULD SHARE
16 PHASE ONE STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING GOVERNMENT COMMUNITY MEMBERS
17 AND NETWORK OF ADAPTATION STAKEHOLDERS AFTER DISCUSSION WITH
18 STAKEHOLDERS STAFF WOULD SUMMARIZE FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS IN
19 SPRING OF 2023 IN THE FINAL PERIOD OF THE STRATEGY WE WOULD
20 PRESENT POSSIBLE PATHS FOR THE REGION TO TAKE AND TO RAISE
21 REVENUE TO MEET SEA LEVEL RISE. NEXT SLIDE. PHASE ONE OF
22 FUNDING AND INVESTMENT STRATEGY IS ANTICIPATED TO KICKOFF
23 LATER THIS FALL EARLY WORK WILL INCLUDE FORMATION OF A
24 TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE PURSUING CONSULTING EXISTENCE,
25 AND KICKING OFF THE COST ASSESSMENT ANALYSIS. AS THIS PROJECT



July 9, 2021

1 DEVELOPS WE'LL CONTINUE TO BRING UPDATES TO THIS COMMITTEE AS
2 WELL AS TO PARTNERS AT THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD AND AS WELL AS
3 BCDC'S WORKING GROUP. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE WE WRAP UP, WE WOULD
4 LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT A POSSIBLE ROLE FOR THE AGENCY THAT COULD
5 HELP ADVANCE A NUMBER OF SEA LEVEL RISE IMPLEMENTATION
6 ACTIONS. AS REFERRED TO EARLIER, MTC/ABAG COULD TAKE A LEAD
7 ROLE IN MANAGING SEA LEVEL RISE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE. IF
8 MTC/ABAG TOOK ON THIS RESPONSIBILITY IT WOULD BUILD ON
9 EXISTING EFFORTS LIKE THE REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL
10 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM. WE IMAGINE THAT THIS WOULD BE A
11 COLLABORATIVE SPACE PULLING IN THE WORK AND EXPERTISE OF MANY
12 ORGANIZATIONS. HOWEVER, WE DO NOT HAVE THE RESOURCES TO
13 ADVANCE THIS ACTION IN THE NEAR-TERM. MTC/ABAG AND THE REGION
14 WOULD NEED TO ADVOCATE FOR AND SECURE A DEDICATED FUNDING
15 STREAM. THERE ARE SEVERAL OPPORTUNITIES IN THE UPCOMING FISCAL
16 YEAR THAT STAFF CAN FOLLOW INCLUDING STATE BUDGET AS WELL AS
17 POTENTIAL LEGISLATION DISCUSSED UNDER A.B. 97. THOUGHTS FOR
18 DISCUSSION FEEDBACK ON THE PROPOSED FUNDING STRATEGIES AND
19 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE IMPLEMENTATION ACTION MORE BROADLY
20 WE APPRECIATE FEEDBACK ON REGIONAL ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES
21 IN THE SEA LEVEL RISE SPACE. BOTH FOR MTC/ABAG AND AS WELL AS
22 OTHER REGIONAL AGENCIES. RIGHT NOW WE WOULD LIKE TO OPEN UP
23 FOR QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSION.
24



July 9, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MATT, I MENTIONED
2 TO YOU EARLIER, ON SLIDE NINE WHERE YOU SAY FUNDING LEAD IS
3 MTC/ABAG. I FEEL STRONGLY THAT BCDC SHOULD BE PART OF THAT AND
4 THE COUNTIES THAT HAVE COMMUNITIES AND THAT WILL BE THREATENED
5 BY SEA LEVEL RISE SHOULD BE PART OF THAT THE BROADER FUNDING
6 ADVOCACY THE MORE EFFECTIVE WE'RE GOING TO BE AND MAKING SURE
7 EVERYBODY IS FOCUSING ON THE SAME STRATEGY IS HOW WE GO AFTER
8 FUNDING. YOU KNOW, SO THAT'S ONE AREA. I LIKE THE IDEA, I
9 THINK IT WAS ON SLIDE 13, WHERE YOU SHOWED BCDC, BARC, AND
10 THOSE AGENCIES COMING INTO THE STRATEGY. I THINK THAT'S A GOOD
11 APPROACH. AND THAT BROADENS THAT NET THAT WE'RE FILLING OUT.
12 BUT I THINK IT IS SHORT SIGHTED WHERE WE DON'T HAVE THE
13 COUNTIES AND BCDC AS PART OF THAT MTC AND ABAG LEAD ON
14 FUNDING. ESPECIALLY WITH ABAG'S, YOU KNOW, DIRECT LINK TO
15 CITIES AND COUNTIES. I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THEY'RE
16 SITTING AT THE TABLE AND TAKE PART OF THAT RESPONSIBILITY.
17 THEY HAVE PROJECTS THAT ARE BEING DEVELOPED AS YOU HAD ON ONE
18 SLIDE, THE MENU OF OPTIONS WHERE MONEY IS GOING TO BE RAISED.
19 I THINK THE COUNTIES AND CITIES NEED TO BE CONNECTED DIRECTLY
20 TO WHAT WE SEEK FUNDING. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. AND I
21 MENTIONED THIS TO MATT BEFORE. MATT IF THAT COULD AT LEAST
22 HAVE SOME CONSIDERATION.

23

24 **MATT MALONEY:** ABSOLUTELY. IT WILL, COMMISSIONER. AND AS
25 MICHAEL AND RACHEL MENTIONED WHATEVER WE DO IN THIS SPACE IS



July 9, 2021

1 GOING TO BE EXTREMELY COLLABORATIVE AND WILL HAVE ALL AGENCIES
2 AT THE TABLE. THERE IS A BIT OF THOUGHT IN THAT WE DO, HAVE A
3 HISTORY, SPEAKING FOR MTC FOR A MINUTE WE HAVE A HISTORY OF
4 PUTTING TOGETHER LONG RANGE INVESTMENT STRATEGIES STEWARDS TO
5 THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THEN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HAVE HAD
6 OUR HANDS IN THE PROCESS SEA LEVEL RISE IS A ROLE FOR US TO
7 PLAY ON THE PLANNING SIDE LOOKING AT DIFFERENT REVENUE SOURCES
8 AND COST OUT THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF INVESTMENTS THAT MIGHT BE
9 REQUIRED AROUND THE REGION AND REALLY PUT TOGETHER A PLAN IN
10 COLLABORATION WITH OUR PARTNERS SO THAT WHEN FUNDING DOES
11 BECOME AVAILABLE ON THE CAPITAL SIDE WE CAN MOVE QUICKLY AND
12 BE PROACTIVE ON IT.

13

14 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** AGAIN, I STILL FEEL THAT
15 THOSE TWO BODIES SHOULD BE A PART -- IN THE FRONT END OF THIS,
16 NOT SORT OF AN AFTERTHOUGHT. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO. MAYOR?

17

18 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANKS JIM. REALLY APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION.
19 FORGIVE MY VIDEO PROBLEMS. I HAD A QUESTION AND A COMMENT.
20 THE QUESTION REALLY GOES BACK TO, I THINK IT'S SLIDE NUMBER
21 FOUR DESCRIBES THE GEOGRAPHY OF WHAT'S PROTECTED AND WHAT'S
22 NOT. COULD WE GO TO THAT SLIDE? I WANT TO UNDERSTAND. IS THIS
23 REFLECTIVE OF WHAT HAPPENS AFTER WE SPEND \$19 BILLION, WE
24 PROTECT THE TURQUOISE AREAS, AND THE PURPLE AREAS ARE NOT
25 PROTECTED AREAS? IS THAT WHAT WE SHOULD GATHER FROM THIS?



July 9, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THAT IS CORRECT.

3

4 **SAM LICCARDO:** APPRECIATE THAT. I KNOW WE'RE ALL FAMILIAR WITH
5 THE CHALLENGE OF THIS AND THE CHALLENGE OF COLLECTIVE ACTION
6 HERE. A JURISDICTION THAT MIGHT HAVE LEVY OR SEA WALL WILL
7 SIMPLY PULL THE NEIGHBORING WALL TO A JURISDICTION THAT WON'T.
8 I HATE TO SAY IT BUT I HAVE SEEN THIS MOVIE BEFORE SAN
9 FRANCISCO WILL BE ABLE TO GET BOND FUNDING AND INFLUENCE IN
10 BCDC AND EAST PALO ALTO IN HAYWARD WILL BE STRUGGLING
11 MIGHTILY. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT AN APPROACH THAT SAYS LET'S GO
12 FIND A LOT OF WAYS TO DO A LOT OF PROJECTS AT \$19 BILLION --
13 WHICH WE ALL KNOW ABOUT CAPITAL PROJECTS, EVERY ONE OF THESE
14 PROJECTS ARE GOING TO GO THROUGH ITS OWN CEQA AND THERE IS
15 GOING TO BE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS FOR EACH PROJECT AND EQUITY
16 IMPACTS WILL BE CONSIDERABLE BECAUSE TIMING WILL MATTER IN WHO
17 GETS THEIR PROJECTS BUILT FIRST AND COST IS OBVIOUSLY
18 ENORMOUS. AND THE QUESTION S I KNOW NEXT TO NOTHING ABOUT
19 THIS, OTHER THAN TO SAY, I THINK THIS IS CRITICALLY IMPORTANT
20 FOR OUR REGION. BUT WHY AREN'T ALL OF OUR ENERGIES FOCUSED ON
21 THE ONE LOCATIONS WHERE WE ARE EXPOSED TO SEA LEVEL RISE? AND
22 THAT IS THE GOLDEN GATE. WHY AREN'T WE EXPLORING A SINGLE
23 PROJECT WHERE WE REGIONALLY ALL INVEST, WITH A SINGLE EIR THAT
24 ACTUALLY PROTECTS THE ENTIRE BAY AT THAT POINT?

25



July 9, 2021

1 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** I CAN PROVIDE A QUICK ANSWER. UNFORTUNATELY
2 I'M NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO GIVE YOU A GOOD ANSWER ON WHETHER
3 OR NOT THAT'S A VIABLE APPROACH IT'S SNAG WE COULD EXPLORE
4 WITH CHARGE WHICH SAY COLLECTION OF FLOOD CONTROL AGENCIES
5 WITHIN THE REGION. IT'S SOMETHING THEY HAVE HEARD A FEW YEARS
6 AGO, IT'S A POSSIBLE STRATEGY BUT ONE THAT HAS A LOT OF
7 ENVIRONMENTAL CHALLENGES ASSOCIATED WITH T BUT, MAYBE WE CAN
8 FOLLOW UP AND, WITH SOME OF THE FLOOD CONTROL AGENCIES, JUST
9 TO UNDERSTAND IF THAT IS A VIABLE APPROACH THAT THE REGION CAN
10 CONSIDER.

11

12 **SAM LICCARDO:** MICHAEL, I APPRECIATE T BECAUSE I'M CERTAIN THAT
13 YOU'RE RIGHT THAT THERE ARE ENVIRONMENTAL CHALLENGES, BUT JUST
14 WAIT UNTIL WE HAVE ENVIRONMENTAL CHALLENGES FOR 35 SEPARATE
15 PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE BAY. [LAUGHTER] AND EACH ONE OF THOSE
16 EIRS WILL TAKE ABOUT THREE YEARS OF LITIGATION AND SEA LEVEL
17 WILL RISE ANOTHER TWO FEET. I THINK THE PIECEMEAL APPROACH FOR
18 FINDING MONEY FOR INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS IS GOING TO BE A WINNING
19 STRATEGY. I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK YOU'RE DOING I KNOW THERE
20 ARE A LOT SMARTER PEOPLE THAN ME IN THIS -- -- BUT I CAN'T
21 HELP WHY AREN'T WE SIMPLY FOCUSING ON ATTENTION AND ENERGY ON
22 ONE SOLUTION RATHER THAN ON DOZENS OF SOLUTIONS? THANK YOU.

23

24 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU MAYOR. PAT EKLUND.

25



July 9, 2021

1 **PAT ECKLUND:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR SPERING.
2 APPRECIATE IT. I'M PROBABLY ONE OF THE RAREST ELECTED
3 OFFICIALS. I WORK FOR THE ARMY CORP OF ENGINEERS FOR EIGHT
4 YEARS, AND I ALSO WORKED FOR THE U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION
5 AGENCY FOR 35 YEARS OF WHICH ONE OF THE ROLES I HAD WAS I WAS
6 CHIEF OF THE ESTUARY PROGRAM, WHICH IS WHEN WE STARTED THE
7 ESTUARY PROJECTS AROUND REGION NINE, SPECIFICALLY. AND I
8 COULDN'T AGREE WITH CHAIR SPERING MORE. I REALLY DO NOT THINK
9 THAT ABAG AND MTC SHOULD EVEN BE PROMOTING OR SAYING THAT WE
10 SHOULD BE IN CHARGE OR THE KEY ORGANIZATION THAT GETS ALL THIS
11 FUNDING. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF STUDIES ALREADY BEEN DONE ON
12 SAN FRANCISCO BAY, AND THE DELTA. YOU KNOW, EVEN THE FEDERAL
13 GOVERNMENT. FEMA WAS INVOLVED IN LOOK BACK TO 2015 THERE WAS A
14 PRODUCED REPORT LOOKING AT FUTURE LAND USE PLANNING PERCEIVED
15 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES IN WHICH THEY LAID OUT A WHOLE BUNCH
16 OF THINGS THAT NEEDED TO BE DONE. EVEN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
17 ADOPTED CLIMATE ADAPTATION STRATEGIES AND IT WAS FIRST IN
18 2009, 2014, THEY DID AN ACTION PLAN IN 2016, AND THEY'RE DOING
19 AN UPDATE NOW. AND I DID SEE THAT THEY'RE -- AND I HAVE BEEN
20 PARTICIPATING IN THOSE, AND I DID SEE THAT THERE WAS AN ABAG
21 REPRESENTATIVE THERE, WHICH WAS GREAT. AND THEN, OF COURSE,
22 BCDC, WITH THEIR ADAPTING TO RISING TIDES DOCUMENTS THAT THEY
23 DID, AND THE BAY ADOPT -- OR BAY ADAPT -- BUT YOU HAVE ALSO
24 GOT OTHER REGIONAL AGENCIES, THE REGIONAL WATER EQUAL CONTROL
25 AGENCY US EPA OTHER FEDERAL AGENCIES INVOLVED WITH THIS AND



July 9, 2021

1 MORE IMPORTANTLY A LOT OF NON-PROFITS. AND THE COASTAL
2 CONSERVANCY THEY'RE DOING ONE OF THE LARGEST WETLAND
3 RESTORATION PROJECTS HERE IN NOVATO, IN THE NORTH BAY WE NEED
4 MORE MONEY TO IMPLEMENT WHAT HAS ALREADY BEEN IDENTIFIED THAT
5 IS CRITICAL FOR SEA LEVEL RISE AROUND SAN FRANCISCO BAY. AND
6 WHAT ARE THE ISSUES THAT WE'RE GRAPPLING WITH, NOT ONLY IN SAN
7 FRANCISCO ESTUARY PROGRAM, BUT ALL THE NON-PROFITS AND BCDC,
8 AND THE REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD, IS WE DON'T HAVE
9 ENOUGH SEDIMENT IN ORDER FOR US TO BE ABLE TO CREATE SOME OF
10 THESE WETLANDS THAT ARE CRITICAL FOR THE RESILIENCY OF THE SAN
11 FRANCISCO BAY. AND SO, FOR AN EXAMPLE, MARIN COUNTY, AND I
12 BELIEVE A LOT OF OTHER COUNTIES HAVE ALREADY DEVELOPED REALLY
13 DETAILED MAPS UP TO A 12 FOOT SEA LEVEL RISE, WHAT IS
14 THREATENED. AND THE MAPS THAT WERE SHOWN ON THE SLIDES THAT
15 MAYOR -- SAM WANTED TO SEE -- IT DOESN'T EVEN IDENTIFY THOSE
16 AREAS THAT DON'T HAVE ENOUGH MONEY IN ORDER TO IMPLEMENT THE
17 MEASURES THAT ARE CRITICAL TO PROTECT THE AREAS THAT ARE SAID
18 THEY'RE PROTECTED; WELL THEY'RE NOT REALLY PROTECTED UNTIL THE
19 WETLANDS ARE RESTORED AND CREATED. SO I THINK WHAT'S REALLY
20 MISSING HERE -- AND I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD GO FORWARD WITH
21 THIS UNTIL WE GET INPUT FROM OUR SISTER OR BROTHER AGENCIES,
22 AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL, BUT ALSO AT THE STATE LEVEL, MAYBE EVEN
23 THE FEDERAL LEVEL, AS WELL, BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY, LOCAL
24 GOVERNMENT. WHAT DO THE CITIES AND COUNTIES REALLY NEED FOR US
25 TO BE SUCCESSFUL? WE DON'T NEED MORE PLANNING. THAT'S BEEN



July 9, 2021

1 DONE ALL OVER THE PLACE. BUT WHAT'S MISS SUGGEST THAT WE
2 REALLY NEED TO DEVOTE MORE FUNDS TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS, CITIES,
3 AND COUNTIES, DIRECT FUNDING, AND IF ABAG AND MTC WANT TO GET
4 MONEY FROM STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO DO SOME ADDITIONAL
5 SUPPLEMENTAL MONEY, THAT IT WOULD BE GREAT. BUT ALSO, NON-
6 PROFITS. WE HAVE SOME GREAT NON-PROFITS THAT ARE ENGAGED IN
7 SAN FRANCISCO BAY, AND THEY'RE STRUGGLING TO GET THE MONEY.
8 AND FOR SOME REASON NON-PROFITS ARE NOT EVEN RECOGNIZED OF
9 WHAT THEY'RE CONTRIBUTING HERE. AND I KNOW IT'S A BIG ISSUE.
10 BUT, I'M VERY PASSIONATE ABOUT THIS. AND, ALSO, I HAVE A
11 TECHNICAL BACKGROUND ESPECIALLY WITH MY SECOND MASTERS IN
12 ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT AND SCIENCE. SO, IT'S A -- I THINK WE
13 REALLY NEED TO BE VERY CAREFUL, AND I AGREE WITH CHAIR
14 SPERING, WE SHOULD NOT BE SAYING THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE TAKING
15 THE LEAD. THIS IS NOT AN ISSUE OF WHO IS TAKING THE LEAD. IT'S
16 AN ISSUE OF, WE NEED ALL THE PARTNERS TO WORK TOGETHER TO BE
17 ABLE TO IMPLEMENT WHAT HAS ALREADY BEEN IDENTIFIED THAT NEEDS
18 TO BE DONE. SO, SORRY FOR MY PASSION ABOUT THIS ISSUE. BUT, I
19 JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PEOPLE UNDERSTOOD THAT I DO
20 NOT REALLY THINK THAT THIS IS IN THE BEST INTEREST OF ABAG
21 MTC.

22

23 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU, PAT. DAVID CANEPA?

24



July 9, 2021

1 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR SPERING. YOU
2 KNOW, I SUPPORT THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND PARTICIPATING IN
3 THE PLANNING DESIGN AND THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE REGIONAL
4 LOCAL PROJECTS. I MEAN, OBVIOUSLY, BECAUSE OF THE SUBSTANTIAL
5 SEA LEVEL RISE, BUT THE OTHER THING IS I THINK THE TECHNICAL
6 ASSISTANCE RESOURCES, ESPECIALLY IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND OTHER
7 COUNTIES WHERE UPSTREAM GREEN INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS WILL
8 REDUCE STORMWATER FLOWS IN THE 100 YEAR IMPACTS POTENTIALLY
9 REDUCE DOWNSTREAM INFRASTRUCTURE REQUIREMENTS. SECOND
10 QUESTION, WHICH HAS BEEN SORT OF DEBATED IS AROUND THIS ISSUE
11 OF MORE BROADLY, WHAT ROLES DO YOU SEE THE OTHER REGIONAL
12 AGENCIES NEEDING TO PLAY IN THE SEA LEVEL RISE SPACE SUCH AS
13 BCDC AND BARC ALL I WOULD ASK FOR IS FOR MTC TO REALLY WORK
14 SPECIFICALLY IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, I KNOW THERE IS OTHER
15 DISTRICTS, BUT WITH THE SAN MATEO COUNTY FLOOD AND SEA LEVEL
16 RISE RESILIENCY DISTRICT TO ENSURE THAT THE REGIONAL PLANS AND
17 STRATEGIES ARE COORDINATED AND INCORPORATED WITH LOCALISTS
18 TAKE INTO ACCOUNT CITIES LIKE FOSTER CITY AS WELL AS SFO WHICH
19 IS HUGE AND FACING HUGE CHALLENGES. I THINK WHAT STAFF
20 PRESENTED BEFORE US MAKES SENSE. I THINK THIS BOARD, ON OTHER
21 ISSUES, HAS A HISTORY OF WORKING EFFECTIVELY, REGIONALLY, SO,
22 I MEAN, US MOVING FORWARD, TO ME, THIS MAKES A LOT OF SENSE AS
23 A REGION. I THINK MTC/ABAG PLAYS A SIGNIFICANT ROLE IN MOVING
24 THINGS FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

25



July 9, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. EDDIE AHN?

2

3 **EDDIE AHN, V. CHAIR:** THANKS. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE CHAIR
4 SPERING'S COMMENTS THAT BCDC SHOULD BE A CENTRAL PARTNER WITH
5 MTC IN THESE EFFORTS. I SERVE AS BCDC REP TO MTC AND THEY HAVE
6 BEEN APPRISED OF THEIR ONGOING WORK AROUND BAY ADAPT, IN
7 PARTICULAR, AROUND A BIG MILESTONE LAST WEEK AGREED THE JOINT
8 PLATFORMS NINE ACTIONS 21 TASKS TRYING TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE.
9 ANOTHER PROCESS TO HIGHLIGHT IS OUR PARTNERSHIP WITH
10 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE WORKING GROUP AS WELL AS LOOKING AT SEA
11 LEVEL RISE AFFECTS AND PRIORITY EQUITY COMMUNITIES AND TRYING
12 TO GET A HANDLE ON CONTEXT OF EQUITY ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AND
13 IT'S IMPORTANT AROUND COMMENTS OF ADDRESSING GOLDEN GATE ONE
14 OF THE THINGS WE LEARNED AT BCDC THROUGH UPCOMING WORK IS IT'S
15 PROJECTED RIGHT NOW 1/3 OF THE COASTLINE IN CALIFORNIA IS
16 ACTUALLY IN THE BAY AREA AND THAT THE BAY AREA ITSELF IS
17 PROJECTED RIGHT NOW TO SUSTAIN TWO THIRDS OF THE FINANCIAL
18 DAMAGE PROJECTED FOR ALL OF CALIFORNIA SO THIS IS AN
19 ASTONISHING PROBLEM I THINK WILL REQUIRE REGIONAL
20 COLLABORATION AMONGST ALL OF THE GOVERNMENT AGENCIES. THANKS.

21

22 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS.
23 NEYSA FLIGOR.

24



July 9, 2021

1 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** MAYOR EKLUND COVERED A LOT OF WHAT I WAS
2 PLANNING TO SAY ECHOING THE FACT THAT THERE IS SO MANY
3 REGIONAL GROUPS AND NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS ALREADY TRYING TO
4 TACKLE THIS ISSUE OBVIOUSLY THERE ARE MISSING LINKS AND
5 STRATEGIES DOCUMENTED THAT HAVE NOT BEEN IMPLEMENTED FOR
6 DIFFERENT REASONS INCLUDING FUNDING AND I WANT TO ADDRESS
7 STAFF I APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION IT'S CLEAR THIS ISSUE
8 DIRECTLY RELATES TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SO I UNDERSTAND WHY
9 IT'S PART OF THE DISCUSSION. BUT I DIDN'T HEAR A COMPELLING
10 REASON WHY MTC/ABAG SHOULD TAKE THIS LEAD ROLE. AND SO I --
11 THAT WOULD BE JUST ONE QUESTION TO STAFF, IF MAYBE YOU COULD
12 EXPLAIN MORE TO THIS COMMITTEE WHY MTC/ABAG FEELS IT NEEDS, AT
13 THIS POINT, TO STEP UP AND PLAY THIS LEAD ROLE AS OPPOSED TO
14 WHAT MAYOR EKLUND SAID, IT'S REACHING OUT TO THESE DIFFERENT
15 GROUPS AND IDENTIFYING WHERE WE COULD ACTUALLY MAKE A
16 DIFFERENCE. WHERE IS THE MISSING LINK THAT WE COULD PLAY A
17 TRUE LEADERSHIP ROLE AND MOVE THE NEEDLE. AND I DO WANT TO
18 ADD, I MEAN, YOU KNOW, FOSTER CITY, BUT OF COURSE EAST PALO
19 ALTO, AND I SEE MY COLLEAGUE MAYOR ROMERO WITH HIS HAND
20 RAISED, AND I AM SURE HE'S GOING TO TALK ABOUT HOW THIS
21 DIRECTLY IMPACTS PALO ALTO AS L ALL CITIES, ALL COUNTIES IN
22 THE BAY AREA REGION IS IMPACTED BY THIS BUT WE ALL KNOW THERE
23 ARE CERTAIN COMMUNITIES THAT ARE MORE IMPACTED. I LOOK FORWARD
24 TO WHAT MAYOR ROMERO HAS TO SHARE. BUT THAT WOULD BE MY
25 QUESTION TO STAFF, SINCE WE ARE DOING QUESTIONS, JUST, YOU



July 9, 2021

1 KNOW, WHAT'S THE COMPELLING? WHAT'S PUSHING STAFF TO BELIEVE
2 THAT WE NEED TO TAKE A BIGGER ROLE HERE AS OPPOSED TO
3 DEFERRING TO THE EXPERTS. AND WE HEARD FROM, YOU KNOW, SOMEONE
4 EARLIER WHO SERVES ON BCDC, ABOUT THE GOOD WORK THEY'RE DOING
5 THERE. SO I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FROM STAFF WHAT'S DRIVING THIS.

6

7 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.

8

9 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THERESE, COULD YOU JUSTICE
10 HANG ON A MINUTE? LET ME TAKE THE COMMITTEE COMMENTS, AND THEN
11 YOU AND STAFF CAN RESPOND.

12

13 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** OKAY.

14

15 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** LET ME JUST FINISH. CARLOS?

16

17 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I HOPE YOU CAN HEAR ME NOW.

18

19 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YES.

20

21 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I WANT TO THANK MAYOR FOR THE SHOUT OUT ABOUT
22 EPA, GOLDEN GATE IS CERTAINLY LOOKING AT ACQUA ISSUES AND THE
23 BARRIERS AND MOKO OPENING TO VENICE IT WOULD BE INTERESTING TO
24 SEE IF INDEED ANY OF THAT TECHNOLOGY CAN BE TRANSFERS OR WHAT
25 WE CAN LEARN FROM THE ITALIANS AND NATIONS DID. BUT SPECIFIC



July 9, 2021

1 TO THIS PROPOSAL BEFORE US PLANNING THIS IDEA OF PARTICIPATING
2 IN THIS DISCUSSION AS MTC AND ABAG, I AGREE THERE PROBABLY
3 SHOULD BE A LARGER BODY, WHETHER IT'S BCDC, PERHAPS MTC/ABAG,
4 COORDINATING A BUNCH OF THESE EFFORTS. BUT, I MEAN, MANY OF
5 US, INCLUDING EAST PALO ALTO AND WE GOT OUR FIRST GRANT TO
6 ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE IN 2011 WE HAVE RECEIVED \$30 MILLION
7 FOR BOTH DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION AND WE HAVE COMPLETED ONE
8 QUARTER OF IT. BASICALLY, IT WILL BE THREE FEET FREE BOARD
9 OVER A 100 YEAR TIED, AND A 20/70 RISE, SEA LEVEL RISE, BASED
10 ON THE PRESENT PROJECTIONS AND WE'RE WORKING IN CONJUNCTION,
11 AS SUPERVISOR CANEPA SAID, THE COUNTY, AND IT'S FORESIGHT IN
12 HELPING SETUP FISLER AND THE ONE SHORELINE PROJECT THAT BRINGS
13 ALL OF US IN THE COUNTY TOGETHER TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE
14 INCLUDING PUTTING SOME SORT OF BALLOT MEASURE, FUNDING MEASURE
15 IN THE NEXT COUPLE, FOUR YEARS, THAT WILL HELP ADDRESS THE
16 INFRASTRUCTURE COST. EAST PALO ALTO HAS BEEN LUCKY GETTING
17 STATE FUNDING FOR ITS APPROACH BUT WE HAVE TO WORK NOT JUST
18 WITH THE STATE BUT CERTAINLY WITHIN OUR OWN MEANS AND IF
19 POSSIBLE, ALONG NATIONAL LINES, AND I SHOULD SAY, WE HAVE TO
20 WORK WITH NO CONTEST, SIR LIKE FACEBOOK AND GOOGLE AND
21 LINKEDIN, PEOPLE WHO ACTUALLY HAVE PROPERTIES THAT ARE ON THE
22 SHORELINE, AND THAT SHOULD BE INDEED CONTRIBUTING SIGNIFICANT
23 AMOUNTS OF MONEY TO THESE EFFORTS THROUGH THE PRIVATE SECTOR
24 GIVEN THAT THEY HAVE TENS OF BILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN EXPOSURE.
25 AGAIN, I'M NOT QUITE SURE, AS SOME OF MY OTHER COLLEAGUES ARE,



July 9, 2021

1 THAT ABAG MTC SHOULD PLAY THE CENTRAL ROLE. I WOULD LOVE TO
2 UNDERSTAND MORE, OR DEVELOP THIS CONCEPT BETTER TO UNDERSTAND
3 HOW WE CAN PLAY IN THIS LARGER SAND BOX OF BCDC COASTAL FOLKS,
4 ALL OF THE VARIOUS AGENCIES LIKE FISLER, AND THE COUNTY WHICH
5 INCLUDES ALL 21 CITIES MUCH BECAUSE WE'RE ALL THINKING ABOUT
6 IT WE'RE ALL DOING LITTLE BITS AND PIECES HERE, COORDINATION
7 WOULD BE HELPFUL. I DO WANT TO UNDERSTAND, THOUGH, HOW WE AS
8 ABAG AND MTC PLAY A ROLE THAT ISN'T SEEN AS AN INTERLOPER, BUT
9 RATHER AS A COLLABORATOR.

10

11 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AMY WORTH?

12

13 **AMY R. WORTH:** AS YOUR REPRESENTATIVE AS ONE OF THE
14 REPRESENTATIVES ON BARC I WANT YOU TO KNOW THESE ARE
15 DISCUSSIONS THAT WE HAVE BEEN HAVING AT BARC, AND A COUPLE OF
16 THINGS, ORIGINALLY, THE WHOLE INTENT OF WHAT BARC USED TO BE,
17 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL THAT CAME OUT OF THE LEGISLATION
18 MANY YEARS AGO THE POINT OF SEA LEVEL RISE IS THAT WE ALL VIEW
19 THIS IS AN URGENT PROBLEM BUT THE BIGGEST CHALLENGE FOR THE
20 REGION IS BRINGING TOGETHER AGENCIES THAT HAVE OPPORTUNITIES
21 EXPERTISE, STAFF AND ACCESS TO RESOURCES SO YOU KIND OF LOOK
22 AT THE WHOLE BARC MENU WE HAVE EXTENDED THAT TO LOOK AT
23 CALTRANS WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD AS WELL AS COASTAL
24 CONSERVANCY PART OF THE BIG CHALLENGE FOR THIS REGION IS WE
25 HAVE ALL THESE AGENCIES THAT HAVE A LOT OF POWER, ELECTED



July 9, 2021

1 REPRESENTATION, WE HAVE GREAT STAFFS, BUT WHAT WE DON'T WANT
2 TO DO IS EITHER DUPLICATE OR COMPETE WITH EACH OTHER, AND WE
3 HAVE TO SET DOWN FUNDAMENTALLY AND MAP OUT WHAT IS THE BEST
4 STRATEGY TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE RESOURCES THAT WE
5 COLLECTIVELY HAVE WITHIN THE REGION. SO THAT'S ONE -- THAT'S
6 KIND OF PART OF THE WORK THAT BART'S GOING TO BE DOING. EDDIE
7 TALKED ABOUT THE PRINCIPLES, THAT'S GOING TO BE COMING TO US
8 AND OUR HOPE IS THAT THIS WILL BE SOMETHING WHERE IT
9 ENCOURAGES AND PROVIDES FRAMEWORK FOR ALL OUR AGENCIES TO
10 ENGAGE IN THIS COMMUNICATION SO WE CAN SHARE THE WORK. AND
11 THAT'S WHAT I AM HEARING SAID THERE ARE A VARIETY OF AGENCIES.
12 I THINK THIS IS A REALLY GOOD DISCUSSION BUT I THINK IT REALLY
13 HIGHLIGHTS THE FACT THAT IN DEALING WITH THE CRISIS, WE
14 COULDN'T HOLD ON TO THESE SILOS, WE REALLY HAVE TO BREAK THEM
15 DOWN AND SAY, HOW BEST CAN WE ALL COME TOGETHER. YOU KNOW? AND
16 NOT TO MAKE THIS MORE COMPLICATED, BUT THE OTHER IMPACTS OF,
17 YOU KNOW, OF GLOBAL CHANGE, YOU KNOW, THE TEMPERATURE RISING,
18 IS THE HUGE -- YOU KNOW, WILDFIRE THREAT IN THE NORTH BAY. SO
19 WE HAVE GOT THESE URGENT THREATS THAT WE'RE FACING, AND I
20 THINK ON THIS, WE CAN CREATE A MODEL FOR REALLY SORT OF A
21 SUBSTANTIVE CORPORATIVE PROCESS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU AMY. MAYOR
24 ARREGUIN?

25



July 9, 2021

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR.
2 CHAIR. ALL OF US HAVE BEEN PART OF BCDC MEETINGS CONVENED
3 AROUND THE BAY AREA AND THAT PROCESS OF MOVING TOWARDS
4 IMPLEMENTATION AND THE QUESTION OF RULES OF REGIONAL
5 GOVERNMENTS IN THE LARGER CONVERSATION AROUND SEA LEVEL RISE
6 RESPONSE AND CLIMATE ADAPTATION HAS BEEN, YOU KNOW, I THINK A
7 TOPIC OF DISCUSSION IN RECENT MONTHS, PARTICULARLY WITH THE
8 MULLIN BILL TO CREATE SORT OF REGIONAL CLIMATE ADAPTATION
9 PLANNING NETWORKS AND THEN THE DISCUSSION AROUND THE STATE
10 BOND, THE FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE PACKAGE. SO I THINK THIS
11 CONVERSATION IS REALLY VERY TIMELY. AND I THINK WE WANT TO BE
12 POSITIONED AS A REGION TO BE ABLE TO DRAW ON SOME OF THOSE
13 POTENTIAL STATE BOND AND FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE DOLLARS SO
14 THAT WE CAN MOVE THESE PROJECTS FORWARD. BUT THE ROLE OF
15 COUNTIES AND THE ROLE OF CITIES, AS PART OF THIS CONVERSATION,
16 IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. SO, YOU KNOW, AS COMMISSIONER WORTH
17 HAD SAID, YOU KNOW, I THINK THERE IS A ROLE FOR BARC TO BE
18 KIND OF A CONVENER ON KIND OF A HIGHER LEVEL POLICY
19 COORDINATIONS, BUT I THINK OUR REGIONAL AGENCIES ALSO PLAY A
20 ROLE. AND ONE THING I THINK THAT'S VERY CLEAR IS THAT -- AND
21 WE LEARNED THIS WITH THE REAP PROGRAM FOR THE HOUSING ELEMENT
22 WORK THAT LOCAL GOVERNMENT ENGAGED WITH. LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE
23 LIMITED IN TERMS OF STAFF AND RESOURCES BUT WE HAVE THESE HUGE
24 NEEDS THAT THE REGIONAL AGENCIES CAN ASSIST AND IDENTIFY
25 FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES AND PROVIDING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE THE



July 9, 2021

1 MORE WE CAN ENSURE THAT THESE PROJECTS THAT ARE HAPPENING AT
2 THE CITY COUNTY LEVEL CAN MOVE FORWARD. I THINK THE STAFF
3 PROPOSAL FOR CREATING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WILL BE EXTREMELY
4 BENEFICIAL AND WILL ENABLE SOME OF THESE PROJECTS IN OUR
5 DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES TO BE ABLE TO DRAW ON THOSE STATE AND
6 FEDERAL DOLLARS. SO, I DO THINK THAT THERE IS A ROLE FOR ABAG
7 AND MTC TO PLAY IN THE FUNDING CONVERSATION. BUT, YOU KNOW, WE
8 NEED TO DO IT IN A COORDINATED WAY WITH ALL THE DIFFERENT
9 NGOS, CITIES AND COUNTIES AND REGIONAL AGENCIES BUT WE HAVE TO
10 KIND OF COME TOGETHER AT SOME POINT AROUND A SHARED SET OF
11 PRINCIPLES AND PRIORITIES AND HAVE A CLEAR UNDERSTANDING ABOUT
12 THE DIFFERENT ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE DIFFERENT
13 AGENCIES. THANK YOU.

14

15 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESS. CAROL AND
16 THERESE. AFTER CAROL I'LL COME BACK STAFF.

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANKS JIM. SPEAKING FROM MY ALAMEDA
19 COUNTY I WANT EVERYBODY TO KNOW THAT ALAMEDA COUNTY
20 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION DOES SUPPORT MORE CLEARLY DEFINING
21 NEEDS AND FUNDING STRATEGIES AND ALSO AGREE THAT DEFINING
22 ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES ARE CERTAINLY SOLID NEXT STEPS FOR
23 THE SEA LEVEL RISE CONVERSATION. AND, ALSO, THAT WE NEED TO
24 BETTER UNDERSTAND, AS PAT EKLUND WAS REFERRING TO, THE



July 9, 2021

1 EXPERTISE OF THE AGENCIES IN THIS CONVERSATION, AS WE MOVE
2 FORWARD.

3

4 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU, CAROL. THERESE,
5 I'LL BRING IT BACK TO YOU AND STAFF.

6

7 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. AND, THANK YOU, JIM, FOR MAKING SURE
8 THEY DIDN'T JUMP IN AT THAT POINT, BECAUSE COMMENTS FROM ALL
9 OF YOU HAS BEEN HELPFUL. MAYBE I CAN TRY TO CONNECT SOME OF
10 THE DOTS THEY HEARD HERE, TO BE HELPFUL. YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE
11 THINGS THAT, PERHAPS, WE DIDN'T EXPLAIN AS CLEARLY, AND IT WAS
12 ESTIMATED EVIDENT FROM THE COMMENTS IS THAT WHEN YOU HEAR
13 FUNDING NEED PEOPLE HAVE A DIFFERENT PERCEPTION OF WHAT THAT
14 MEANS. ONE THING, I THINK THE INTERPRETATION THAT PEOPLE WERE
15 HEARING IS THAT MTC/ABAG POTENTIALLY WOULD LEAD IN TERMS OF
16 RECEIVING AND ADMINISTERING FUNDING AT SOME LEVEL. BUT A
17 DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE, ONE MORE ALIGNED FROM WHERE STAFF WAS
18 COMING FROM, IS THAT MTC POTENTIALLY HAS THIS ROLE TO LEAD IN
19 A STRATEGIC FUNDING PLAN TO ADDRESS WHAT MANY OF YOU NOTED IS
20 A CURRENT DISAGGREGATED PLANNING AND INVESTMENT ENVIRONMENT.
21 THAT'S WHAT'S THERE TODAY. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT, YOU
22 KNOW, I WAS THINKING ABOUT IS, IF WE'RE ANTICIPATING \$19
23 BILLION OF NEED -- AND THAT'S LIKELY AN UNDER-COUNT, IT'S
24 DEFINITELY NOT GOING TO BE RECEIVED ALL AT ONE TIME. I MEAN,
25 THERE'S JUST NO WAY THAT THAT IS GOING TO OCCUR. SO THE BIG



July 9, 2021

1 QUESTION THEN IS, HOW DO YOU -- HOW DOES THE REGION SET
2 PRIORITIES FOR WHATEVER FUNDING WOULD BE COMING TO THE REGION?
3 YOU KNOW? WHAT CRITERIA WOULD WE PUT INTO PLACE IN ORDER TO
4 DECIDE WHERE FIRST LEVEL, SECOND LEVEL, TERTIARY INVESTMENTS
5 WOULD HAPPEN? RIGHT? DO YOU CONSIDER EQUITY, DO YOU CONSIDER
6 THE TRADEOFFS BETWEEN GREEN AND GRAY LEVELS OF INFRASTRUCTURE?
7 HOW DOES COST BENEFIT COME INTO PLAY? WHAT ABOUT THE DUAL
8 BENEFITS OF INVESTING IN SOMETHING THAT MIGHT HAVE BENEFITS
9 BEYOND JUST SEA LEVEL RISE, AND PICK UP OTHER INFRASTRUCTURE
10 ELEMENTS? SO, YOU KNOW, ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS HAS TO INVOLVE
11 MULTIPLE PEOPLE -- MULTIPLE PARTIES. I MEAN, ABSOLUTELY.
12 RIGHT? THE TECHNICAL EXPERTS, OTHER REGIONAL AGENCIES, CLEARLY
13 LOCAL GOVERNMENT, WOULD HAVE TO BE INVOLVED IN HELPING TO SET
14 THOSE CONSIDERATIONS AND PRIORITIES. BUT SOMEONE HAS TO
15 QUARTER BACK THAT CONVERSATION. BECAUSE IT'S NOT HAPPENED
16 ORGANICALLY ON ITS OWN. AND I THINK MAYBE THE BEST WAY TO
17 THINK ABOUT WHAT STAFF IS PUTTING FORWARD IS THAT MTC/ABAG MAY
18 BE THE ENTITY THAT ENTITY THAT COULD BEST QUARTER BACK THAT
19 CONVERSATION AND COME TO A SENSE OF COHESION ON HOW YOU WOULD
20 MOVE FORWARD IN A RESOURCE CONSTRAINED ENVIRONMENT WITH A NEED
21 THAT IS SO CRITICAL, BUT IS CHALLENGING BECAUSE IT'S OVER SUCH
22 A LONG PERIOD OF TIME. I OFFER THAT AS CONTEXT THAT HOPEFULLY
23 REFLECTS SOME OF THE COMMENTARY AND OBSERVATIONS THAT YOU ALL
24 MADE.
25



July 9, 2021

1 **MATT MALONEY:** THIS IS MATT. LET ME SAY ONE MORE THING TO
2 AUGMENT WHAT THERESE SAID AND IT GOES TO THE QUESTION OF, I
3 THINK, COLLABORATION AND PARTNERSHIP, AND YOU KNOW, THE ROLE
4 OF THE DIFFERENT AGENCIES. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN
5 THE BAY ADAPT PROCESS FOR BCDC ALL ALONG. SO, YOU KNOW, WE'RE
6 AT THE TABLE THERE. AND BCDC HAS ALSO BEEN VERY INVOLVED IN
7 SHAPING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WITH US AS WELL AS THE
8 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, AND THE TWO THINGS THAT WE SHOWED YOU
9 TODAY ON THE FUNDING AND INVESTMENT STRATEGY AND THE POTENTIAL
10 ROLE IN TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, I JUST WANT TO MAKE THAT CLEAR
11 THAT THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS ROSE UP THROUGH BOTH OF THOSE
12 PROCESSES. SO THE BCDC BAY ADAPT PROCESS HAS LANDED THERE AS
13 WELL. THAT, REALLY, MTC AND ABAG SHOULD TAKE THE LEADERSHIP
14 ROLE -- NOT ALONE -- BUT WITH OTHER ENTITIES IN THIS, SORT OF,
15 NARROW SPACE. AND SO, I JUST KIND OF WANTED TO MAKE CLEAR TO
16 THE MEET THAT THESE ARE ROLLING UP FROM, I THINK, PRETTY
17 ROBUST, DETAILED PROCESSES, WITH A LOT OF PARTNERSHIP. AND
18 THE OTHER THING WANT TO SAY, JUST ABOUT THE, YOU KNOW, MORE
19 PLANNING, IS THAT WE HAVE DONE A LOT OF PLANNING IN THE SEA
20 LEVEL RISE AND VULNERABILITY SIDE, BUT JUST LYING TO THE
21 COMMENTS TODAY FROM MAYOR LICCARDO AND MAYOR EKLUND, THE
22 SOLUTIONS ARE NOT YET CERTAIN. AND WE FOUND THAT THROUGH THE
23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS AS WELL. THERE IS STILL WIDE
24 VARIABILITY IN WHAT THOSE SOLUTIONS COULD BE WHETHER IT'S HARD
25 INFRASTRUCTURE OR WHETHER IT'S MORE OF A RESTORATION TYPE OF



July 9, 2021

1 EFFORT, IT KIND OF RUNS THE GAMUT AND I FEEL THERE ARE OPEN
2 QUESTIONS OUT THEREABOUT HOW WE DO THAT. WE DO THINK IN THIS
3 FUNDING AND INVESTMENT STRATEGY THAT WOULD BE A PLACE FOR US
4 TO GET A LITTLE BIT DEEPER ON THAT AND I THINK ALSO TO TRY TO
5 COST SOME OF THESE THINGS OUT TO SHOW FOLKS SORT OF WHAT IS
6 REQUIRED.

7

8 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MATT. YOU KNOW,
9 MATT, I HOPE STAFF UNDERSTANDS THE WAY THIS WAS PRESENTED,
10 THAT PERCEPTION ISN'T THERE. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK YOU
11 NEED TO CLARIFY THAT. AND YOU KNOW, THE OTHER THING S IT'S
12 VERY SIMILAR TO THE MTC MODEL WHERE WE'RE ADVOCATING FUNDING,
13 THE COUNTIES AND CITIES ARE LOOKING TO US TO HELP FUND THEIR
14 PROJECT THE REQUEST COMES UP AND THAT'S THE WAY THIS IS BEING
15 PRESENTED WHEN SEA LEVEL RISE PROJECTS COME FORWARD THEY'RE
16 LOOKING TO US TO LEAD ON FUNDING THAT'S WHERE THE EXPECTATION
17 NEEDS TO BE BROADENED. IT'S JUST THE PERCEPTION OF THE WAY
18 IT'S BEING PRESENTED. AND WE HEARD A LOT OF THOSE COMMENTS.
19 MAYBE STAFF CAN ADDRESS -- I DON'T THINK WE NEED TO DO IT
20 TODAY -- BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD TO BRING THIS BACK AND
21 ADDRESS SOME OF THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE HEARD. IF YOU
22 COULD DO THAT? YOU KNOW? SOME OF THE QUESTIONS ASKED, I REALLY
23 THINK NEED TO BE EXPLORED. AND, PAT EKLUND. IF STAFF COULD DO
24 THAT, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU. ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON
25 THIS, FRED?



July 9, 2021

1

2 **SAM LICCARDO:** I HAD MY HAND RAISED.

3

4 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** I'M SORRY SAM. I DIDN'T SEE
5 YOU. ALWAYS ROOM FOR U SAM.

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE IT. I WANT TO SAY,
8 FIRST, I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS OF THERESE AND MATT. AND
9 RECOGNIZE I WAS JUMPING TO SOLUTIONS AND WE REALLY FOCUSED ON
10 THE PROCESS, AND I GET THE FACT THEY WAS SKIPPING OVER THE
11 MEAT OF THE DISCUSSION HERE. AND I JUST WANTED TO PUT MY VOTE
12 IN FOR US, ACTUALLY TAKING A LEAD ROLE. AND, OBVIOUSLY, YES,
13 THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF OTHER AGENCIES INVOLVED HERE,
14 BUT THIS IS A PROBLEM THAT DESPERATELY CALLS OUT FOR
15 COORDINATION. AND WHAT WE'RE SEEING WITH THE HOST OF DESPERATE
16 SOLUTIONS THAT ARE BEING ROLLED OUT IN LOTS OF COMMUNITIES
17 ALONG THE BAY IS WHAT I THINK IS A REAL LACK OF COORDINATION,
18 AND PERHAPS A LACK OF -- WE'RE MISSING AN OPPORTUNITY IN A
19 MORE STRATEGIC SOLUTION. ONE THAT MIGHT SAVE US ALL FROM
20 CHASING DOLLARS IN DIFFERENT DIRECTIONS. AND YOU KNOW, I THINK
21 SAN JOSE AND SAN FRANCISCO ARE GOING TO BE FINE. FACEBOOK IS
22 GOING TO PROTECT THEIR CAMPUS. YOU KNOW, I'M WORRIED ABOUT A
23 LOT OF OTHER FOLKS. AND I AM JUST CONVINCED THAT IF WE DON'T
24 WORK TOGETHER ON THIS, WE ARE DEFINITELY GOING TO FAIL
25 COLLECTIVELY. SO, ANYWAY, I APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION. I



July 9, 2021

1 KNOW THERE IS A LOT OF CONCERN ABOUT US STEPPING INTO THIS
2 ROLE BUT I THINK FUNDAMENTALLY THERESE IS RIGHT. WHAT WE HAVE
3 IS REFLECTION OF LACK OF COORDINATION AND WE DESPERATELY NEED
4 IT.

5

6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** SAM, I AGREE. I FELT THAT
7 ABAG AND MTC SHOULD BE THE CONVENER, YOU KNOW, BRINGING THESE
8 PEOPLE TOGETHER, AND WE TAKE THE LEAD ON THIS. BUT MY CONCERN
9 IS, WHEN YOU SAY "FUNDING" LEAD IN A FUNDING, I THINK BCDC,
10 CITIES AND COUNTIES SHOULD BE AT THE TABLE AND ADVOCATE FOR
11 THAT. THAT'S ALL I WAS SAYING. BUT YOUR POINT IS WELL TAKEN,
12 AND BCDC NEEDS TO TAKE THIS ROLE MORE AS A CONVENER AND TAKING
13 THE LEAD. MTC AND ABAG ARE THE BODIES TO DO THAT.

14

15 **SAM LICCARDO:** I AGREE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** AMY?

18

19 **AMY R. WORTH:** I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THE POINTS ABOUT BRINGING
20 ALL THESE AGENCIES TOGETHER. BECAUSE I DON'T WANT TO WASTE
21 TIME AROUND HAVING TURF WARS. I THINK WE ALL UNDERSTAND THIS
22 IS A HUGE CRISIS. THIS IS A PROBLEM. AND SO I THINK, ALSO, I
23 WOULD LIKE TO HAVE OPPORTUNITY AT BARC AND ALL AGENCIES
24 TOGETHER TO TALK ABOUT THIS COORDINATION ISSUE. I ALSO THINK
25 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS FOR ALL OF



July 9, 2021

1 THESE AGENCIES TO KIND OF SIT DOWN AND PERHAPS ALL MAP OUT
2 HOW, COLLECTIVELY -- YOU KNOW, IF THEY WERE GIVEN THIS
3 CHALLENGE, KNOWING EACH AGENCY HAS UNIQUE RESOURCES, ACCESS TO
4 FUNDS, YOU KNOW, ALL THE THINGS THEY DO, WHETHER IT'S PLANNING
5 OR IMPLEMENTATION, WORKING WITH THE CITIES, WORKING WITH THE
6 FEDS, WHATEVER, RATHER THAN ALL OF THESE AGENCIES SPENDING AND
7 GOING IN UNCOORDINATED DIRECTIONS. BECAUSE THERE JUST ISN'T
8 ENOUGH TIME AND THERE ISN'T ENOUGH MONEY FOR US TO BE NOT
9 SUBSTANTIVELY WORKING TOGETHER, I THINK, MORE THAN WE EVER
10 HAVE. AND THE BEAUTY ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA IS IT DOES BRING
11 THIS TOGETHER IN MANY WAYS, BUT WE ALSO HAVE THESE OTHER
12 AGENCIES THAT REALLY DO HAVE A STAKE AND INTEREST. SO I THINK
13 IT HAS TO GO, BROADER THAN JUST THE FOLKS THAT WORK WITH THE
14 WATER, IT HEAD TO INCLUDE THE WATER, THE ROADS, THE HOUSES,
15 THE AIR, AND THAT REALLY BRINGS TOGETHER ALL OF OUR AGENCIES.
16 SO THAT'S MY PITCH, AND I THINK WE CAN REALLY BE EFFECTIVE AS
17 WE MOVE FORWARD, AND REALLY ADDRESSING THIS AS A REGION. SO,
18 THANKS.

19

20 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. THIS
21 HAS BEEN A GOOD DISCUSSION. STAFF HAS A LOT TO WORK WITH. FRED
22 ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED?

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED. THERE ARE
25 TWO HANDS RAISED. FIRST IS ROLAND. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.



July 9, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** FIRST OF ALL, I COME FROM LONDON AND 100% AGREE WITH
3 MAYOR LICCARDO ABOUT LOOKING AT THE POTENTIALLY, THE GOLDEN
4 GATE AS SOME KIND OF FLOOD CONTROL BARRIER. BUT, THIS IS THE
5 BAY AREA. YOU KNOW? THIS IS WHAT WE DID IN LONDON, IT'S CALLED
6 THE NAMES BARRIER IN THE ESTIMATE AREA AND ACTUALLY THINKING
7 OF BUILDING ANOTHER ONE DOWNSTREAM BUT THE BAY AREA IS
8 COMPLICATED AND WE'RE PROBABLY GOING TO NEED A COUPLE MORE IN
9 THE EAST BAY AND A FEW YEARS AGO IT WAS SUGGESTED USING THE
10 DUMBARTON BRIDGE AS POTENTIALLY THE LOCATION FOR ANOTHER
11 BARRIER. BUT THE THING I WANT TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION
12 THAT'S COMPLETELY MISSING FROM THE CONVERSATION, THE
13 CONVERSATION STARTED LAST NIGHT AFTER THE EARTHQUAKE IS
14 TSUNAMIS. TSUNAMIS HAVE TO BE PART OF THE CONVERSATION.
15 BECAUSE NOW YOU HAVE GOT TO START THINKING ABOUT FACEBOOK AND
16 GOOGLE DOING A GREAT JOB PROTECTING THEIR PROPERTIES, AND
17 INADVERTENTLY CREATING A FUNNEL THAT'S POINTED DIRECTLY AT SAN
18 JOSE THIS IS WHY PIECEMEALING IS NEVER GOING TO WORK IN A
19 TSUNAMI SITUATION AND WHY WE HAVE GOT TO ADDRESS THE ENTIRE
20 BAY AREA AS A SINGLE ENTITY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RICHARD HEDGES. GO
25 AHEAD, PLEASE. TWO MINUTES.



July 9, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M REALLY HAPPY ABOUT THIS MEETING. YOU
3 CAN SEE FROM THE PICTURE THAT'S ON THIS SCREEN, THAT'S A
4 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT ACROSS THE LAGOON FROM ME THIS IS AN
5 IMPORTANT ISSUE FOR THE LIVELIHOODS OF 8,000 HOMES IN SAN
6 MATEO THAT WERE IN THE FEMA FLOOD DISTRICT. I WILL TELL YOU
7 THAT I HAVE, WITHIN THREE BLOCKS FROM MY HOUSE, I HAVE WORLD
8 HEADQUARTERS ACROSS THE STREET IS BILLY ILLUMINA, SONY
9 PLAYSTATION HEADQUARTERS THERE ARE COMPANIES HERE THAT WILL
10 HELP US BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO HELP US AND WE SHOULD BE HAVING
11 THEIR REPRESENTATIVES INVOLVED WITH THIS MY COMMUNITY IS AWARE
12 OF THIS I CHAIRED A COMMITTEE IN 2011 THAT DEALT WITH FEMA
13 REGULATION IN SAN MATEO WE RAISED MONEY PUT UP A COMMITTEE
14 WALKED PRECINCTS, AND RAISED MONEY TO HARDEN OUR LEVEES AND WE
15 KNEW THAT IT WAS A TEMPORARY FIX. THERE IS INCENTIVE TO GET
16 HOMEOWNERS INVOLVED BECAUSE THOSE INSURANCE FEES WILL BE QUITE
17 HIGH AND DRIVE MORE OR LESS WELL OFF PEOPLE FROM THE BAY AREA.
18 I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR STARTING THIS. ESPECIALLY THE PARTNERS
19 ESPECIALLY THE BIG ONES THAT HAVE THE FUNDING TO HELP AND
20 AGAIN ROLAND IS RIGHT ABOUT THIS. WE CAN'T PIECEMEAL THIS.

21

22 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. 5B LOCAL PARK
23 POLICY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE. JAMES ARE YOU GOING TO KICK THIS
24 OFF?

25



July 9, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. IF WEEKEND PULL UP THE PRESENTATION? THANK
2 YOU. COMMITTEE MEMBERS, I'M JAMES CHOE WITH THE REGIONAL
3 PLANNING COMMITTEE MTC AND ABAG AND I'M HERE TO PRESENT AN
4 INFORMATION ITEM ABOUT TECHNICAL SYSTEMS THAT WE'RE PROVIDING
5 TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN PARKING POLICY AS PART OF OUR CLIMATE
6 PROGRAM WHILE PARKING IS LOCALLY MANAGED IT HAS IMPORTANT
7 CONNECTIONS TO REGIONAL CHALLENGES AND GOALS. I WOULD LIKE TO
8 START WITH CONTEXT ABOUT PARKING MANAGEMENT TO HIGHLIGHT THOSE
9 AND THEN TALK ABOUT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WE HAVE BEEN
10 PROVIDING FOR MANY YEARS AND UPCOMING ASSISTANCE THAT WE'RE
11 WORKING ON. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE MOST IMPORTANT CONTEXT, AS
12 A REMINDER, OF COURSE, IS THAT PARKING COSTS A LOT. AND I MEAN
13 THIS IN A NUMBER OF WAYS, IN TERMS OF, FOR EXAMPLE,
14 DEVELOPMENT COST. IT COSTS ANYWHERE, AS YOU KNOW, BETWEEN
15 20,000 TO \$75,000 OR MORE PER SPACE JUST TO BUILD PARKING AND
16 THIS COST PROVIDING PARKING MAY PREVENT DEVELOPERS AND
17 FINANCERS FROM BUILDING NEW PROJECTS PARTICULARLY AFFORDABLE
18 HOMES AND IF NEW DEVELOPMENT IS BUILT COST FOR BUILDING THAT
19 PARKING IS PASSED TO COMMERCIAL RESIDENTIAL TENANTS AND OWNERS
20 RAISING COST TO RENT WHETHER THEY HAVE A CAR OR NOT. OR IN
21 SOME CASES CAN PRICE PEOPLE OUT OF LIVING IN THOSE PROPERTIES
22 OR BUSINESSES FROM RENTING THOSE PROPERTIES. IN ADDITION THESE
23 DIRECT COSTS THERE ARE ENVIRONMENTAL AND BROADER SOCIETAL
24 COSTS. HIGHER RATES OF PARKING ARE ASSOCIATED WITH HIGH RATES
25 OF VEHICLE OWNERSHIP AND MORE VEHICLE TRIP MAKING AND THE



July 9, 2021

1 RESULT IS INCREASED VMT AND ALL OF THE DOWNSTREAM IMPACTS SUCH
2 AS INCREASED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS LOCAL AIR POLLUTANT
3 EMISSIONS, HIGHER RISK OF VEHICLE INJURIES AND FATALITIES AND
4 IMPACTS ON CONGESTION AND TRAFFIC. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND
5 THESE COSTS COME AT AN INCREASED LOSS BECAUSE MANY PARKING
6 SPACES GO UNUSED. STUDIES HAVE FOUND THERE IS OFTEN AN
7 OVERSUPPLY OF PARKING IN OUR TOWNS AND CITIES ACROSS THE U.S.
8 LOCALLY IN ONE COMPREHENSIVE STUDY DATA COLLECTED FROM 80
9 MULTI-FAMILY PROPERTIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA FOUND THAT 28% OF
10 THE 14,000 PARKING SPACES WERE UNUSED MANY HOMEOWNERS AND
11 TENANTS ARE PAYING FOR PARKING THAT AREN'T EVEN BE USED OR
12 WOULD BE RESIDENTS MAY NOT BE ABLE TO AFFORD THOSE PROPERTIES
13 BECAUSE OF COST ATTACHED TO PARKING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND,
14 FINALLY, THERE ARE THE OPPORTUNITY COSTS OF PARKING. PARKING
15 IS COMING AT THE EXPENSE OF ALL OTHER USES. PERHAPS MOST
16 CRITICALLY, AT THE EXPENSE OF ADDITIONAL HOUSING UNITS.
17 INVESTMENT IN PARKING ARE DOLLARS IN SPACE THAT COULD GO
18 INSTEAD TO BUILDING MORE HOUSING OR COMMERCIAL UNITS. AND
19 THEN PARKING FOR PERSONAL VEHICLES IS ALSO PROVIDED IN PLACE
20 OF OTHER USES ON OUR LOCAL ROADS SUCH AS PROVIDING ACCESS TO
21 OTHER MOBILITY OPTIONS BIKE LANES BIKE STATIONS BUS STOPS BUS
22 LANES CAR SHARE SPOTS AND PASSENGER PICK UP AND DROP OFF OR
23 DELIVER OF GOODS. AND PARKING IS A PLACE OF ACTIVATION IN
24 PLACE OF OTHER OPPORTUNITIES SUCH AS DINING AND PARKWAYS AND
25 THE TRADEOFF BETWEEN SPACES FOR CARS VERSUS PEOPLE HAS BEEN



July 9, 2021

1 HIGHLIGHTED EVEN MORE IN THE PAST YEAR. BECAUSE OF THESE
2 IMPACTS OF PARKING COST POLICY HAS A KEY ROLE IN ADDRESSING
3 ISSUES ASSOCIATED WITH PARK AND LEVERAGING OPPORTUNITIES TO
4 ACHIEVE GOALS. I WANT TO TAKE A MOMENT TO DISCUSS THE TYPES
5 AND RANGES OF POLICIES AND HOW THEY CUT ACROSS LOCAL
6 DEPARTMENTS AND PARTS OF REGULATIONS AND CODES AT THE LOCAL
7 LEVEL. FOR EXAMPLE, YOU SEE A LIST OF THESE PARKING POLICIES
8 AND THE TYPES OF RELATED POLICIES WHETHER IN TERMS OF THE
9 PROVISION AND SUPPLYING OF PARKING OR MANAGING EXISTING
10 PARKING. AND THE MANAGEMENT OF THIS, OF THESE DIFFERENT
11 PARKING POLICIES CUTS ACROSS DIFFERENT DEPARTMENTS SUCH AS
12 PLANNING, TRANSPORTATION, PUBLIC WORKS, AND ENFORCEMENT. AND
13 THEN ACROSS ALL TYPES OF POLICY TYPES WHETHER IT'S IN YOUR
14 PLANS, IN REZONING AND ORDINANCES, OR OPERATING POLICIES. AND
15 THIS RANGE OF POLICIES BOTH DEMONSTRATE CHALLENGE OF MANAGING
16 PARKING POLICIES BUT ALSO THE OPPORTUNITY BECAUSE THESE
17 POLICIES CAN BE COORDINATED TO IMPACT RESULTS EVEN MORE
18 EFFECTIVELY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY
19 TO ALIGN THESE PARKING POLICIES WITH MTC AND ABAG'S GOALS AND
20 THE VISION OUTLINED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THIS INCLUDES
21 MITIGATING VMT AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, WHICH IS
22 INCREASINGLY CHALLENGING AS THE REGION'S POPULATION AND
23 ECONOMY CONTINUE TO GROW. BUT PARKING POLICY CAN ALSO SUPPORT
24 FOCUS INFILL DEVELOPMENT IN PDAS AND OTHER GROWTH AREAS
25 PARKING POLICY AFFECTS AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT AND



July 9, 2021

1 ACCESS TO MORE AFFORDABLE AND SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION
2 OPTIONS. THESE PRIORITIES ARE ASSOCIATED WITH A NUMBER OF MTC
3 AND ABAG'S PLANS, POLICIES AND PROGRAMS SOME ARE WHICH ARE
4 LISTED ON THE RIGHT. AND SIMILARLY THESE TYPES OF POLICIES CAN
5 SUPPORT THE ACHIEVEMENT OF LOCAL GOALS IN OUR CITIES AND
6 COUNTIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BECAUSE OF THIS CONNECTION TO
7 REGIONAL PRIORITIES MTC AND ABAG HAVE LONG PROVIDED ASSISTANCE
8 TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN THE SPACE OF PARKING POLICY IT TAKES
9 SIGNIFICANT RESOURCES INCLUDING STAFF TIME FOR LOCAL
10 GOVERNMENTS TO DEVELOP NEW POLICIES AND UPDATE EXISTING
11 POLICIES. AND WE RECOGNIZE THAT A LOT OF OUR TOWNS, OUR
12 CITIES, AND COUNTIES DON'T ALWAYS HAVE THE CAPACITY TO FOCUS
13 ON PARKING POLICY. SO OUR PREVIOUS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE HAS
14 INCLUDED POLICY MAKING HAND BOOKS AND GUIDANCE, DATA
15 COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS, AND THEN EDUCATION AND INFORMATION
16 SHARING WORKSHOPS. ADDITIONALLY, WE FUNDED PARKING PLANNING
17 AND POLICY PROJECTS THROUGH PDA AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
18 GRANTS. AND TO HELP US FIGURE OUT OUR NEXT CYCLE OF ASSISTANCE
19 THAT WE COULD PROVIDE WE CONDUCTED INTERVIEWS, PARTICIPATED IN
20 MEETINGS, ADMINISTERED A SURVEY TO CHECK IN WITH LOCAL STAFF
21 AND HEAR WHAT ARE THE BARRIERS TO IMPLEMENTATION AND THE NEEDS
22 ARE. BASED ON THE FEEDBACK WE HEARD, WE INITIATED A PROJECT
23 LATE LAST YEAR WITH CONSULTANT ASSISTANTS TO UPDATE POLICY
24 GUIDANCE THAT IS FOCUSED ON OUR RESOURCES TO HELP IMPLEMENT
25 PARKING POLICY IF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT IS INTERESTED IN DOING



July 9, 2021

1 SO. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WE ARE DEVELOPING WHAT WE'RE
2 CALLING THE "PARKING POLICY PLAYBOOK" THIS BUILDS OFF OF
3 PREVIOUS GUIDANCE THAT DESCRIBES VARIOUS POLICY OPTIONS BUT
4 THIS GUIDE IS THINKING ABOUT INFORMATION RESOURCES THAT LOCAL
5 GOVERNMENTS NEED IF THAT I WANT TO IMPLEMENT POLICY. THIS
6 INCLUDES MORE POLICY SPECIFIC INFORMATION AND IMPLEMENTATION
7 GUIDANCE MODEL CODE LANGUAGE AND POLICY MAKING TEMPLATES CASE
8 STUDY BECAUSE WE KNOW THERE HAVE BEEN A LOT OF MOVEMENT IN THE
9 GOVERNMENT AND AROUND THE BAY AREA IN UPDATING THEIR PARKING
10 POLICIES AND COMMUNICATING GUIDANCE AND RESPONSE TO COMMON
11 QUESTIONS AND CONCERNS AND DATA COLLECTION ON EXISTING PARKING
12 RELATED TO POLICY IN THE BAY AREA. WE HAVE DEVELOPED A DRAFT
13 RESOURCE WITH INPUT FROM A TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE
14 CONVENING FOR THIS PROJECT INCLUDED CCA AND LOCAL JURISDICTION
15 STAFF FROM PLANNING PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS ACROSS THE BAY
16 AREA THE SAMPLE OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS INCLUDED IN
17 MATERIALS. WE WILL MEET AGAIN TO PROVIDE INPUT ON A FINAL SET
18 OF RESOURCES AND THE PLAYBOOK ALONG WITH PREVIOUS TECHNICAL
19 ASSISTANCE RESOURCES WILL BE AVAILABLE FOR DOWNLOAD FROM
20 MTC/ABAG TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PORTAL WE WILL BE PROVIDING
21 WORKSHOPS DIRECTED TOWARDS LOCAL STAFF TO ROLL OUT THE
22 PLAYBOOK RESOURCES AND OFFER A DEEP DIVE INTO SPECIFIC POLICY
23 TOPICS ON LOCAL INTEREST THESE WILL BE OFFERED IN SUMMER AND
24 FALL. HOWEVER OUR ASSISTANCE WILL NOT END WITH THESE WORKSHOPS
25 WE CONTINUE TO WORK ON OPPORTUNITY TO WORK WITH LOCAL



July 9, 2021

1 JURISDICTION IN PARKING DEVELOPMENT AND MANAGEMENT AS
2 PRESSURES RELATED TO DEMAND AND SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION
3 OPTIONS ONLY GROWS IN THE FUTURE. SO, THIS CONCLUDES MY
4 PRESENTATION BUT I WOULD LIKE TO STATE ON THIS SLIDE, FOR A
5 MOMENT BECAUSE I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO OPEN
6 UP TO THE COMMITTEE FOR INPUT ON WHAT THE BAY AREAS NEEDS FOR
7 FUTURE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE MIGHT BE. SO THANK YOU. AND I'M
8 HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS OR DISCUSS THE QUESTIONS LISTED HERE,
9 OR ON THE RELATED TOPICS.

10

11 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GOOD PRESENTATION.
12 SAM LICCARDO?

13

14 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. REALLY APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION.
15 I KNOW I HAVE BEEN A BIT OF A BROKEN RECORD ON THIS IN PAST
16 YEARS, BUT FOR THOSE CITIES THAT ARE PUSHING AGGRESSIVELY ON
17 POLICIES, WE'RE NOT OFTEN GETTING THE OUTCOMES ON THE GROUND.
18 AND THAT'S BECAUSE WE KNOW, AT THE END OF THE DAY, NOTHING
19 GETS BUILT IF IT DOESN'T GET FINANCED. AND, I WOULD REALLY
20 WELCOME AN OPPORTUNITY TO SEE HOW, AS A REGION, WE COULD
21 ENCOURAGE, YOU KNOW, A CONSORTIUM OF FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS. I
22 UNDERSTAND THERE IS A LOT OF DIFFERENT SIZED PLAYERS IN THIS
23 FIELD AND HOUSING AND SO FORTH. NO MATTER WHERE WE SET OUR
24 PARKING MAXIMUM, OR WE ELIMINATE OUR MINIMUMS OR WHATEVER, IF
25 THEY SAY LOOK, WE'RE NOT GOING TO FUND THIS PROJECT UNLESS



July 9, 2021

1 IT'S BETTER PARKED, EVERYBODY'S STUCK. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, IF
2 WE WANT TO FIND WAYS TO -- AND I KNOW THIS ISN'T SOMETHING WE
3 CAN SIMPLY MANDATE, BUT IF WE ARE WILLING TO SAY WE'RE WILLING
4 TO GIVE UP ON PARKING BECAUSE WE HAPPEN TO THINK -- IF WE
5 COULD THINK OF SOME REGIONAL ACTION TO TRY TO CONSIDER ACTION
6 IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR LENDING FINANCING STANDARDS THAT WILL
7 ENCOURAGE PEOPLE DESPITE MISGIVINGS, THE MAJORITY OF THE BAY
8 AREA IS STILL FUNDAMENTALLY SUBURBAN SO IT'S A CONSTANT BATTLE
9 I HAVE GONE ON ENOUGH BUT ARE THERE OPPORTUNITIES FOR US TO
10 MEANINGFULLY ENGAGE IN THE FINANCIAL INDUSTRY?

11

12 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** SAM ARE YOU FEVERING TO BOTH
13 CONVERSION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION?

14

15 **SAM LICCARDO:** YEAH, I GUESS, I WAS THINKING MORE ABOUT NEW.
16 BUT YOU'RE RIGHT, JIM, IT COULD EXTEND.

17

18 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YEAH. IT SEEMS LIKE
19 CONVERSION HAS HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES INVOLVED IN IT. AND SO,
20 NEW DEVELOPMENT, YOU KNOW, SHIFTS WHERE THE INVESTMENT N I
21 THINK THOSE ARE GOOD COMMENTS. THANK YOU. DAVE HUDSON?

22

23 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I WANT TO PIGGYBACK ON WHAT BOTH OF YOU ARE
24 SAYING, THE CONVERSION FROM COMMERCIAL TO HOUSING ISN'T JUST A
25 BAY AREA THING. I USED TO FLY A LOT WITH MY WIFE AND WE WOULD



July 9, 2021

1 GO INTO THESE PLACES THEY WOULD BE TALKING ABOUT CINCINNATI
2 DOING THIS AND MANY OTHERS. AND THE PROBLEM STILL COMES DOWN
3 TO EXACTLY WHAT YOU'RE SAYING, YOU CAN'T GET A PROJECT
4 FINANCING IF YOU DON'T HAVE PARKING. AND FOR A COUPLE OF
5 YEARS, NOW, AND PROBABLY HAS BEEN A HEADACHE FOR BRAD, TALKING
6 ABOUT SATELLITE PARKING STRUCTURES, AND FOR BART AND HOW TO
7 CONVERT A HOTEL, WHICH NEVER SEEMS TO HAVE ENOUGH PARKING
8 EITHER, IN THE VERY LOW INCOME INCOMES, TRYING TO THINK
9 OUTSIDE THE BOX, AND I'M WONDERING IF WE AREN'T TALKING ABOUT
10 IN MUNICIPALITIES, SATELLITE BART PARKING AND HOOKING UP WITH
11 TRANSIT SYSTEMS THAT ARE A LITTLE BIT FURTHER AWAY, A COUPLE
12 OF MILES AWAY, NO DIFFERENT FROM THE PARKING FOR SFO OR OTHER
13 PLACES, AND WORKING UNDER THE AREA OF THE COST THAT BART HAS.
14 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT SOMETHING WHO MIGHT NEED THIS SPACE AND
15 THEY HAVE A SPACE FOR 200 DAYS A YEAR IF THEY'RE TAKING THE
16 WHOLE 30 THEY'RE ONLY LOOKING AT \$200 A MONTH I WOULD GET RID
17 OF THE POOL IN AN APARTMENT BUILDING JUST TO BE ABLE TO HAVE
18 PARKING LIKE THAT IF I DIDN'T NEED TO USE THE CAR ALL THE TIME
19 THAT'S WHAT I'M WONDERING ABOUT TALKING ABOUT THE MOBILITY
20 HUBS TO EXPAND AND MAYBE EVEN USING SOME OF THE FINANCING
21 THROUGH THE IFDS. JUST THOUGHTS.

22

23 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AMY?

24



July 9, 2021

1 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PARTICIPATE IN
2 THE DISCUSSION TODAY. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THE
3 PRESENTATION. IN THE UPCOMING RHNA MOST CITIES SUBURBAN
4 COMMUNITIES ARE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT SIGNIFICANT MULTI-
5 FAMILY HOUSING FOR THE FIRST TIME AND LOOKING AT URBAN LIMIT
6 LINES THAT CREATE GROWTH BOUNDARIES THIS IS WHERE THE
7 DEVELOPMENT IS GOING TO GO AND HAVING THE TOOLS TO BE ABLE TO
8 SHARE WITH PLANNING STAFF -- AND THE GREAT THING ABOUT THE
9 WORK YOU'RE DOING IT'S NOT JUST ELIMINATING PARKING SPACES
10 IT'S ACCOMMODATING DEMAND IN DIFFERENT WAYS AND DO IT
11 CREATIVELY. AND I THINK IT'S BEEN REALLY HELPFUL, AND IT WILL
12 BE IMMENSELY HELPFUL AS COMMUNITIES MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS.
13 ONE OF THE POINTS I WANTED TO PICK UP IS THAT WE REALIZE THAT,
14 YOU KNOW, IN CALIFORNIA, AND IN THE BAY AREA, THE REALITY IS
15 THAT A NUMBER OF PEOPLE HAVE THE LUXURY OF BEING ABLE TO USE
16 TRANSIT FROM HOME TO WORK BUT A HUGE NUMBER OF PEOPLE DO NOT
17 HAVE THAT CHOICE. YOU KNOW, THEY JUST DON'T. AND IT'S NOT EVEN
18 THE PEOPLE THAT DON'T CHOOSE, TO IT'S PEOPLE WHO PROBABLY
19 WOULD LIKE TO IF THEY COULD, BUT THERE IS NO BUS ROUTE. THERE
20 IS NO RAIL. YOU KNOW, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE 680 CORRIDOR, FOR
21 EXAMPLE, THERE IS NO RAIL. IT'S A HUGE HOUSING CENTER FROM
22 SOLANO THROUGH ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA. SO, AND I GUESS WHAT I
23 WANTED TO REALLY PICK UP ON IS, IN ADDITION TO THE PARKING
24 POLICIES, YOU HAVE GOT -- WE HAVE GOT BE BUILDING THESE
25 SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS THAT TIE INTO THAT. SO



July 9, 2021

1 THAT, I THINK IS ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S BEEN REALLY
2 PRODUCTIVE THAT'S COME OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS
3 THIS RECOGNITION. AND I KNOW, SONOMA AND SOLANO, AND CONTRA
4 COSTA, WE ARE ALL PUTTING TOGETHER -- AND THOSE ARE THE THREE
5 EXAMPLES THEY KNOW, I KNOW OTHER PLACES IT'S HAPPENING. BUT
6 FOR EXAMPLE, IN OUR COUNTY, ALONG USING THE 680 CORRIDOR AS AN
7 EXAMPLE MOST OF THE PEOPLE THAT LIVE ON THAT CORNER HAVE TO
8 DRIVE BECAUSE THEY HAVE NO CHOICES HOWEVER WHEN THEY OPENED
9 ANTIOCH IT WAS FULL THE FIRST DAY EXCEEDING RIDERSHIP
10 PROJECTIONS CLEARLY THE DESIRE IS THERE. AND I AM TAKING THE
11 PARKING THING A LITTLE BIT FURTHER BUT IT'S GOING TO RISK MORE
12 EFFECTIVELY WITH OUR RESIDENTS IF WE CAN SAY IN ADDITION
13 PARKING WE'RE LOOKING AT THE SUSTAINABLE TRANSIT SYSTEM AND IT
14 REALLY, FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN I LOOK AT CONTRA COSTA AND THE 680
15 CORRIDOR IT INVOLVE THIS IS ROBUST EXPRESS BUS CORRIDOR FROM
16 SOLANO DOWN TO SANTA CLARA AND THEN THE FEEDER BUSES THAT WILL
17 LINK THESE APARTMENTS TO TRANSIT. YOU KNOW, AND THEN IT HAS TO
18 HAPPEN AT THE OTHER END SO WHEN IT GETS TO SAM'S SHOP HIS
19 FOLKS ARE GOING TO HAVE THE BUSES THAT ARE GOING TO GO FROM
20 THE TRAIN OUT TO THE JOB CENTERS. I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL
21 IF WE THINK OF THAT IN THE TOTAL ENVIRONMENT. BECAUSE WE DO
22 WANT TO REDUCE THE SINGLE OCCUPANCY TRIPS AND WE WANT TO
23 REDUCE THE CARS. WE WANT TO DISH LOVE THE PICTURES OF THE PARK
24 LETS AND THE BIKE PATHWAYS IN COMPARISON TO THE CARS PARKED ON
25 THE SIDE OF THE STREET.



July 9, 2021

1

2 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER WORTH HER COMMENTS
5 ARE SPOT ON. YOU CAN'T THINK OF THIS IN A SILO WHEN WE THINK
6 ABOUT WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH HERE I THINK ABOUT SAFE
7 ROUTES TO SCHOOLS ABOUT TRANSPORTATION HUBS THAT'S HOW GET
8 FOLKS COMFORTABLE WITH LESS PARKING. TO ME IF WE'RE GOING TO
9 HAVE THIS CONVERSATION IT SHOULD INCLUDE THAT AND I THINK
10 DEVELOPERS WOULD BE INTERESTED IN THAT AS L THEY KNOW HOW
11 THEY'RE GOING TO MAKE THESE HOUSING UNITS MARKETABLE. THEY
12 KNOW THE MARKET BETTER THAN WE DO IN TERMS OF HOW THEY CAN
13 MAKE THE ECONOMICS WORK BUT IT'S THE INTERCONNECTEDNESS OF
14 AWFUL MOBILITY ALTERNATIVES. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT START TO
15 A GREAT CONVERSATION.

16

17 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CARLOS?

18

19 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I WOULD AGREE WITH MAYOR LICCARDO'S POINT ABOUT
20 THE FINANCING. I THINK THOSE OF YOU THAT HAVE DEVELOPED
21 AFFORDABLE HOUSING OR THOSE THAT ARE WORKING WITH MARKET RATE
22 FOLKS WHO ARE TRYING TO DEVELOP AFFORDABLE HOUSING HAVE HAD
23 OCCASION TO BUMP HEADS WITH LENDERS BECAUSE THEY FEEL THAT
24 BUILDINGS ARE UNDERPARKED AND IF THEY ARE UNDERPARKED THEY DO
25 NOT WANT TO FUND THEM BECAUSE THEY DON'T THINK THEY'RE GOING



July 9, 2021

1 TO REACH STABILIZED OCCUPANCY CAN'T GET THEIR MONEY IN THE
2 END. I THINK WE SHOULD BE THINKING ABOUT THAT ISSUE BUT IN
3 ADDITION THINKING ABOUT HOW UNBUNDLING PARKING FROM
4 DEVELOPMENTS IS INDEED PUTTING MORE MONEY IN THE POCKETS OF
5 DEVELOPERS AND WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT WAYS TO CLAW BACK SOME OF
6 THAT MONEY. BECAUSE IF EACH STALL IS ANYWHERE FROM 30 TO
7 \$45,000, AND IF YOU SAY YOU ONLY HAVE TO DO 50% OF YOUR
8 PARKING OR YOU UNBUNDLING PARK YOU HAVE TO CHARGE FOR THAT
9 PARK IT'S ESSENTIALLY ANOTHER PROFIT CENTER FOR THE DEVELOPER
10 AND WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND THOSE ECONOMICS AND BETTER ALSO
11 UNDERSTAND HOW OUR ENTITLEMENT IN THE PROCESS HOW WE CAN
12 RECAPTURE SOME OF THAT MONEY. BUT I WANT TO SAY FOR LOW INCOME
13 FOLKS HAVING TO PAY BOTH RENT, AS WELL AS THE PARKING CHARGE
14 IS CERTAINLY A -- IT MIGHT BE AN EQUITY ISSUE, AND I THINK WE
15 SHOULD BE REALLY CAREFUL AND CAUTIOUS ABOUT HOW WE APPLY THESE
16 RULES SO THAT WE DON'T HAVE THESE DISPROPORTIONATE NEGATIVE
17 IMPACTS ON LOW INCOME FOLKS BECAUSE WE'RE TRYING TO PUSH A
18 POLICY, WHICH MAKES A LOT OF SENSE ENVIRONMENTALLY, BUT THAT
19 MAY HAVE SOME OTHER NEGATIVE REPERCUSSIONS. SO JUST THOUGHTS
20 THAT WE SHOULD CONTINUE TO THINK ABOUT WHEN WE'RE PUTTING
21 TOGETHER THESE POLICIES. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR CANEPA?

24



July 9, 2021

1 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR SPERING. YOU
2 KNOW, I'M REALLY NOT SHOCKED BY THE 28% OF PARKING SPACES
3 UNUSED. I JUST HAVE A QUESTION FOR STAFF. I THINK THE WORK
4 THEY'RE DOING AND REACHING OUT TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS IS
5 IMPORTANT. DO WE FACTOR IN UBER, LYFT, AND ALL THESE OTHER
6 RIDE-SHARING SERVICES? AND WHAT ROLE DO THEY SORT OF PLAY IN
7 PEOPLE NOT HAVING -- MAYBE NOT USING THEIR PARKING SPACES LIKE
8 THEY HAVE DONE BEFORE? I'M JUST CURIOUS FROM A STAFF
9 PERSPECTIVE, IF THAT'S TALKED ABOUT.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THE CONSIDERATIONS OF IT NCS UBER AND LYFT
12 AND THESE EMERGING MOBILITY OPTIONS NEED TO BE CONSIDERED
13 THEY'RE GOING TO BE SEEN CHANGING TRANSPORTATION CHOICES AND
14 PREFERENCES FROM PEOPLE, RESIDENTS, AND WORKERS. JUST
15 THROUGHOUT THE U.S. AND PARTICULARLY IN THE BAY AREA. SO I
16 THINK THAT CONSIDERATION NEEDS TO BE THERE. AND THAT'S WHY
17 WE'RE ALSO CONSIDERING, SORT OF, WHAT MIGHT BE OPTIONS IN
18 SUPPORTING LOCAL JURISDICTIONS, THINKING ABOUT MORE BROADLY,
19 BEYOND PARK, BUT HOW THEY MANAGE ALL THE GROWING DEMANDS ON
20 THE CURVE WHETHER FOR PASSENGER PICK UP, DROP OFF, OR OTHER
21 MOBILITY OPTIONS AGAIN BECAUSE A LOT OF THESE POLICIES
22 PARTICULARLY IN DEVELOPMENT WILL RESULT IN BUILDING A PARKING
23 WHERE IN THE CODE NOW WILL BE BUILT FOR DECADES TO COME AND
24 PARKING IS REALLY HARD TO REPURPOSE, AND IF YOU'RE STUCK WITH
25 THIS PARKING DOWN THE LINE MAY BE VERY DIFFERENT SORT OF



July 9, 2021

1 TRANSPORTATION CONTEXT AND THINKING ABOUT THINKING AHEAD
2 CHANGING MOBILITY PREFERENCE AND OPTIONS.

3

4 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** I THINK THE WAY PEOPLE MOVE AROUND IT'S
5 REALLY EVOLVED AND IT'S GOING TO EVOLVE EVEN MORE. AND I HOPE
6 IN THESE CONVERSATIONS THAT ARE TAKING PLACE, THAT WE'RE
7 REALLY ABLE TO ADDRESS WHAT'S HAPPENING TODAY RIGHT NOW, BUT
8 IN THE FUTURE, HOPEFULLY BE ABLE TO TAKE THAT 28% NUMBER AND
9 SEE WHAT WE CAN DO TO ELIMINATE THAT. I APPRECIATE IT, JAMES.
10 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** DAVE, YOU RAISED YOUR HAND.
13 DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK? OKAY? ALL RIGHT. JAMES, DID YOU HAVE
14 ANY OTHER RESPONSE TO ANY OF THE QUESTIONS?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** WELL, IN TERMS OF --

17

18 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I'M SORRY, JIM, I DID. I PUT MY HAND DOWN. I
19 FORGOT I HAD MUTE O I WANT TO TAKE EXCEPTION TO SOMETHING
20 JAMES SAID IT IS EASIER TO REPURPOSE PARKING LOTS.
21 SPECIFICALLY, I'LL GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE IN MY CITY, OF THOR
22 OWNER OF THE BUSINESS PARK BOUGHT BACK AN AT&T BUILDING
23 COMPLEX AND WE JUST APPROVED 4500 HOMES THERE, AND HE IS DOING
24 WHAT I THINK MOST BUSINESS PARKS SHOULD BE THINKING, AND THAT
25 IS FREE SHUTTLES FOR TRANSIT STOPS WITHIN THE BUSINESS PARK



July 9, 2021

1 AND WE JUST INSTITUTED A SHUTTLE TO BART THIS'S MORE OF AN
2 UBER TYPE SETUP IN CONJUNCTION WITH TWO DIFFERENT TRANSIT --
3 OR TWO DIFFERENT TRANSIT ORGANIZATIONS. AND I THINK THAT'S
4 KIND OF WHAT I HAVE BEEN HEARING ALL DAY IS YOU START COMING
5 TOGETHER WITH IDEAS AND MAKE THIS COORDINATED EFFORT TO MAKE
6 THINGS WORK, WE'RE ACTUALLY WAITING FOR YOUR BLUE RIBBON TASK
7 FORCE TO COME THROUGH WITH SOME IDEAS SO THAT WE CAN IMPLEMENT
8 MUCH OF THIS, BUT WE'LL PROBABLY BREAK GROUND AND WE ONLY
9 STARTED TO LOOK AT IT A YEAR AGO. SO IT CAN BE DONE, PUTTING
10 HOUSING ON THE PARKING LOTS, AS LONG AS YOU HAVE ENOUGH
11 PARKING FOR THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN RETAIL, WHEN'S LEFT OF IT -
12 - AND THE HOUSING AND CONNECTIONS TO THE TRANSIT SHUTTLES.

13

14 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DAVID RABBIT.
15 DAVID?

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT:** I FELT LIKE I HAD TO CHIME IN. I CAN TELL YOU AS
18 AN ARCHITECT FOR THE PAST 36 YEARS IT'S BEEN INTERESTING TO
19 SEE THE EVOLUTION OF PARKING. SAN FRANCISCO IS A GOOD EXAMPLE.
20 IT USED TO BE A ONE FOR ONE, IF NOT MORE PARKING REQUIREMENTS
21 IF THE UNITS AND IT'S GONE TO SOMETHING MUCH LESS. NOT ONLY
22 GONE TO MUCH LESS IT'S BECOME MORE COMPLICATED TO GET YOUR CAR
23 ESPECIALLY IF IT'S ON A LIFT OR STORED DOWN BELOW GROUND IT
24 MAKES YOU THINK TWICE AND WHETHER YOU HAVE OPTIONS AND I THINK
25 WE'RE STRUGGLING WITH THE SUBURBS WITH JUST THAT WHEN



July 9, 2021

1 REDEVELOPMENT WAS AROUND HERE IN MY HOMETOWN PETALUMA WE HAVE
2 NO PARKING REQUIREMENTS WITHIN CERTAIN RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS
3 AND THERE IS A COMMON GARAGE THAT WAS BUILT WITH THE FUNDING
4 SOURCE AND WITH DAVE HUDSON'S IDEA I LOVE THAT. IN OUR
5 REBUILDING COUNTY CENTER TALKING ABOUT HOW MANY PARKING SPACES
6 DO WE NEED AND IN THE '50'S IT WAS A MUCH DIFFERENT RATIO AND
7 WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT PROBABLY 60% OF WHAT WE HAVE NOW BUT
8 EVEN WE KNOW CONVERSION IT'S EXPENSIVE TALKING ABOUT FLAT
9 LEVEL PARKING GARAGES NOT BUILT ON RAMPS, BUT THEN YOU STILL
10 HAVE TO BUILD THE RAMP FOR THE CAR SO THEY DO END UP BEING A
11 LITTLE MORE EXPENSIVE THAN THE CHEAPER WAY TO GET PARKING
12 THROUGH, BUT I THINK THAT IT IS ADAPTABLE IN THE FUTURE. SO I
13 SEE THIS IN THE INTERIM PERIOD OF TIME WHERE WE ALL KNOW WE
14 WANT TO GET TO A PLACE WHERE WE'RE ZIPPING AROUND IN OTHER
15 MODES OF TRANSPORTATION MUCH MORE EASILY AND CONVENIENTLY. BUT
16 QUITE FRANKLY WE'RE NOT THERE YET WE'RE NOT THE CITY OF SAN
17 FRANCISCO WITH HEAR HEADWAYS AND WE'RE JUST NOT THERE YET BUT
18 I THINK THAT WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ADAPTABLE GOING
19 FORWARD THIS CRITERIA IS PART OF GETTING US IN THAT DIRECTION
20 I'M SUPPORTIVE OF THAT IT'S AN EXPERIENCE THAT IS STILL
21 PLAYING OUT FOR THE NEXT 10 TO 20 YEARS.

22

23 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANKS FOR THOSE COMMENTS.

24 JAMES I'M GOING TO GIVE THE FINAL WORDS TO WRAP IT UP.

25



July 9, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** I APPRECIATE ALL OF THE INPUT AND THERE IS DEFINITELY
2 INNOVATIONS AROUND PARKING WHETHER ADAPTIVE OR REUSE OTHER
3 ALTERNATIVES, FINANCING HAS BEEN RAISED BY OTHER STAKEHOLDERS
4 POTENTIAL OF EDUCATION OR TOOLS TO HELP LENDERS UNDERSTAND THE
5 TRADEOFF BETWEEN POTENTIAL MOBILITY OPTIONS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU JAMES. PUBLIC
8 COMMENT, FRED?

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS FOR THIS ITEM. TWO
11 MEMBERS OF THE ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ROLAND, GO
12 AHEAD, PLEASE. TWO MINUTES.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER FOR
15 BRINGING UP WHAT HAPPENED IN ANTIOCH WITH THE EXTENSION WIDE
16 OPEN AND \$20 MILLION. WE HAVE TO BE CAREFUL WHAT KIND OF
17 PARKING IT IS WE'RE REPLACING WITH AFFORDABLE HOUSING BECAUSE
18 WHEN YOU START GETTING TO VTA POLICY THAT'S GOT THE BLANKET
19 POLICY OF REPLACING EVERY SINGLE STATION IN CALTRAIN STATION
20 IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WITH AFFORDABLE HOUSING YOU'RE SETTING
21 UP YOURSELVES FOR CATASTROPHE. WHAT HAPPENED IN GILROY IF YOU
22 BUILD 500 UNITS IS EACH MORNING THE PEOPLE WILL HAVE NO OPTION
23 BUT TO FEED THE FREEWAY BOTTOM LINE YOU HAVE TO PUT IN THE
24 INFRASTRUCTURE BEFORE YOU DO THIS TO MAKE IT PUBLIC FOR PEOPLE
25 WHO TRY TO USE CALTRAIN TO BE ABLE TO STILL USE IT. IN



July 9, 2021

1 CLOSING, MY RECOMMENDATION TO YOU WOULD BE FOR MTC TO CONSIDER
2 REACHING OUT TO GOOGLE DEVELOPMENT PARTNER, LAND LEASE, LAND-
3 LEASE AND ASK THEM HOW THEY WERE ABLE TO OBTAIN FOUR AND A
4 HALF THOUSAND PARKING SPACES UNDER DIRIDON INCLUDING TWO AND A
5 HALF THOUSAND 24X SEVEN SHARED PARKING SPACES WITHOUT BREAKING
6 THE BANK? THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES. GO AHEAD. TWO
9 MINUTES.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AGAIN, ANOTHER GREAT SUBJECT TODAY, WITH A
12 LOT OF GOOD IDEAS. AS FAR AS TO MAYOR LICCARDO, I WOULD ADD
13 THAT ONE OF THE PROBLEMS I HAVE HAD WORKING WITH DEVELOPERS --
14 AND I HAVE WORKED WITH MANY TO HELP PROJECTS THROUGH, JUST TO
15 NAME A FEW BAY MEADOWS, STATE PARK GREENWAY HINES AND OTHERS
16 AND PUSHING BACK ON DEVELOPERS THEIR COMMENT WASN'T ONLY
17 FINANCING IT'S THAT THE OTHER PROJECTS IN THE AREA -- AND
18 THERE ARE MANY -- HAVE A LOT OF PARKING, WILL BE DISADVANTAGED
19 IN LEASING. PART OF IT IS THE HISTORIC PARKING LEVELS AND THE
20 FEAR OF NOT BEING ABLE TO LEASE. IT TURNS OUT BAY MEADOWS OVER
21 HALF OF THE USER IN BAY MEADOWS ARE USING PUBLIC TRANSIT AND
22 ARE WAY OVERPARKED. STATION PARK GREEN YOU CAN WALK OUT YOUR
23 BACK DOOR AND GET ON CALTRAIN THERE IS TWO BUS LINES STOP IN
24 FRONT THERE WAS NO REASON TO HAVE THE PARKING THERE. SAME
25 ARGUMENT. HISTORICALLY WE HAVE TO MOVE AWAY FROM THOSE THINGS



July 9, 2021

1 IT'S GOING TO TAKE A LOT OF LOBBYING AND ESPECIALLY WITH
2 FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS AND SOME NEW REGULATIONS BOTH ON
3 FEDERAL BANKING AND ON THE LOCAL LEVEL. THANK YOU. THESE ARE
4 AIL GREAT TOPICS TODAY AND MEET A LOT OF DISCUSSION.

5

6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** JAMES, THANK YOU FOR THE
7 PRESENTATION. FRED, ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR ITEM SIX. NO
10 WRITTEN COMMENTS FOR ITEM SIX, BUT FOR THE RECORD SUPERVISORS
11 MITCHOFF AND MAYOR ROMERO BOTH REGISTERED YES ON THE ABAG
12 COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR.

13

14 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IF THERE ARE NO
15 OTHER COMMENCE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS, THIS MEETING IS
16 ADJOURNED. THANK YOU ALL. [ADJOURNED]

17



Broadcasting Government