

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



July 14, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, JULY 14, 2021, 9:45 A.M.**
4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. AND TOGETHER WITH
6 VICE CHAIR PAPAN I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE PROGRAMMING AND
7 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE COMMITTEE MEETING OF JULY 14TH, 2021 TO
8 ORDER. IF STAFF COULD PLEASE ROLL THE COVID RECORDING?
9 [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19
10 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO
11 THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH
12 SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING
13 IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL
14 UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY
15 NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES
16 BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA
17 WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT
18 THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND
19 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK
20 SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE
21 CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
22 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
23 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
24 SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING
25 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS



July 14, 2021

1 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL
2 BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
3 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
4 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A
5 ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS
6 AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL
9 MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO, THE CONSENT CALENDAR. TODAY
10 THE CONSENT CALENDAR INCLUDES 12 ITEMS LABELED --

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M SORRY, MR. CHAIR, BEFORE WE DO THAT,
13 CAN WE DO A ROLL CALL?

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** OH, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. CAN THE CLERK
16 PLEASE CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

25



July 14, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY?

2

3 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS HERE. MILEY.

6

7 **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** SORRY ABOUT THAT. I WAS TRYING TO GET

20 DOWN TO BUSINESS. THE CONSENT CALENDAR, 12 ITEMS, 2A THROUGH

21 L, ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS WITH TODAY'S CONSENT

22 CALENDAR?

23

24 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** I WOULD MOVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

25



July 14, 2021

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION FROM GLOVER AND SECOND FROM
2 DIRECTOR?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CHAVEZ.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I CAN ASK THE CLERK
7 TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM, INTO
8 THE RECORD?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
11 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
12 ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. CAN WE CALL THE ROLL, PLEASE, TO
15 VOTE FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR, TODAY?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY GLOVER, SECOND BY CHAVEZ. [ROLL
18 CALL VOTE]. THE MOTION PASS UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
19 PRESENT.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. WITH THAT
22 WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM 3A, MTC RESOLUTION 481 AMERICAN
23 RESCUE PLAN OF 2021 PHASE ONE DISTRIBUTION PROPOSES
24 PROGRAMMING OF APPROXIMATELY 912 MILLION AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN
25 ACT FOR 2021 FUNDING TO BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS TO PROVIDE



July 14, 2021

1 FUNDING RELIEF FOR REVENUE LOSSES AND ONGOING FINANCIAL
2 UNCERTAINTY AS A RESULT OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC. BEFORE I
3 INTRODUCE THERESA ROMMEL, I WANT TO SAY, THIS IS THE THIRD
4 TIME THROUGH THESE PANDEMIC DISTRIBUTIONS AND STAFF HAS DONE
5 TREMENDOUS WORK TO GET THE DOLLARS TO WHERE THEY'RE NEEDED AND
6 THIS IS A UNIQUE CYCLE THAT WE'RE GOING TO SEE PROBABLY THE
7 LAST CYCLE THAT WE'RE GOING TO SEE FOR THE FISCAL YEARS, AND
8 WE HAVE SOME MINOR TWEAKS TO DISCUSS BUT WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE
9 TO THERESA ROMMEL TO PRESENT.

10

11 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT. AND GOOD MORNING
12 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. WE DO HAVE A PRESENTATION FOR THE ITEM
13 THERE. WE GO. TODAY WE'LL BE PROPOSING A PARTIAL DISTRIBUTION,
14 OF WHAT WE'RE CALLING PHASE ONE OF AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ACT
15 FUNDING. PRIOR TO DISCUSSING STAFF'S PROPOSED DISTRIBUTION, I
16 WOULD LIKE TO WALK YOU THROUGH A BIT OF THE LEAD-UP TO TODAY'S
17 RECOMMENDATION. AS BACKGROUND, LAST MARCH, THE AMERICAN
18 RESCUE PLAN ACT OF 2021 APPROPRIATED 31 AND A HALF BILLION OF
19 PANDEMIC RELIEF FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT OF WHICH THE BAY AREA
20 RECEIVED NEARLY 1.7 BILLION IN TRANSIT FORMULA ASSIGNED FOR
21 THE 12 FEDERALLY DESIGNATED URBANIZED AREAS OR UZAS, MTC IS A
22 DESIGNATED RECIPIENT OF FUNDS AND IS RESPONSIBLE FOR
23 PROGRAMMING THEM. THE COMMISSION ADOPTED A SET OF PRINCIPLES
24 TO GUIDE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDING PRINCIPLES SUMMARY INCLUDES
25 STABILIZED AND SUSTAINED TRANSIT, I THINK WE WENT -- THERE WE



July 14, 2021

1 GO. STABILIZE AND SUSTAINED TRANSIT FUNDS SHOULD BE USED TO
2 ENSURE THE FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY AND STABILITY OF THE
3 REGION'S TRANSIT OPERATORS. NUMBER TWO RESTORE AND REIMAGINE
4 SERVICE, RESTORING AND RECOVERING DEMAND AND NUMBER THREE
5 IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. FUNDS SHOULD BE USED TO PROMOTE
6 AND SUSTAIN TRANSIT USAGE IN THE REGION FOR THE LONG-TERM IN A
7 WAY THAT BOTH ATTRACTS AND RETAINS TRANSIT RIDERS THROUGH
8 INVESTMENTS TO IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. NEXT SLIDE
9 PLEASE. IN JUNE, COMMISSIONERS HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO HEAR
10 DIRECTLY FROM TRANSIT OPERATORS ON THEIR EXPERIENCES DURING
11 THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC. AS WELL AS THEIR OUTLOOKS FOR FISCAL
12 YEAR 2022 AND BEYOND, AT A SPECIAL PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
13 WORKSHOP THAT WAS HELD. AS WAS HEARD AT THE WORKSHOP, THERE
14 WAS OPTIMISM OVER THE RETURN OF RIDERS, BUT THAT WAS BALANCED
15 WITH CONCERN OVER THE PACE OF RECOVERY AND CONTINUED
16 UNCERTAINTY OVER PAST PANDEMIC COMMUTE PATTERNS AND CONTINUED
17 PATTERNS ON CONTINUE IMPACT ON OPERATOR FINANCES. AS YOU CAN
18 SEE FROM THIS SLIDE AS OF MAY RIDERSHIP REMAINED DEPRESSED
19 WITH ONLY 71% OF COVID RIDERSHIP ON AVERAGE AND OF COURSE
20 THERE IS QUITE A BIT OF VARIABILITY AMONG AGENCIES IN TERMS OF
21 RIDERSHIP OPERATORS ARE PLANNING TO DELIVER A LEVEL OF SERVICE
22 THAT WILL OUTPACE THE EXPECTED RIDERSHIP DEMAND IN THE COMING
23 FISCAL YEAR THERE IS SOME OF THE CONCERN TO OVERCOMMITTING
24 SERVICE AND STAFFING LEVELS THAT CANNOT BE FINANCIALLY
25 SUSTAINED IF THE PANDEMIC'S RECOVERY IS NOT ROBUST. FOLLOWING



July 14, 2021

1 THE WORKSHOP IN JUNE STAFF PRESENTED SEVERAL RECOMMENDATIONS
2 BASED ON TAKE-AWAY'S FROM THE SPECIAL WORKSHOP. NUMBER ONE WE
3 RECOMMEND THAT ARP FUNDING BE DISTRIBUTED IN MULTIPLE TRANCHES
4 TO ALLOW FOR NEAR-TERM SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS BUT ALSO
5 FLEXIBILITY TO GAUGE THE RECOVERY'S PROGRESS AND FUND
6 SUSTAINABLE SERVICE THAT BEST FITS CUSTOMERS NEEDS. NUMBER
7 TWO, MAINTAIN A NEEDS BASED FRAMEWORK THAT IS CONDUCIVE TO
8 SUSTAINING BAY AREA OPERATORS IN A UNIQUE AND UNPRECEDENTED
9 EMERGENCY DRIVEN FRAMEWORK, AND NUMBER THREE RECOMMENDED TO
10 SET-ASIDE FUTURE FUNDS FOR ALLOCATION TO BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
11 RECOVERY TASK FORCE INITIATIVES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WITH
12 THAT LEAD-UP, WE ARE READY TO RECOMMEND A FIRST PHASE OF ARP
13 FUNDING DISTRIBUTION AND SET ASIDES. WE'RE RECOMMENDING
14 PROGRAMMING APPROXIMATELY 912 MILLION IN ARP FUNDING FOR
15 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN ADDITION A SET-ASIDE OF LESS THAN 10% OF
16 TOTAL ARP FUNDS FOR BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE INITIATIVES AND
17 OPERATOR HARDSHIPS FOCUSED RECOVERY STRATEGIES AND I'LL
18 DESCRIBE DISTRIBUTION APPROACH FOR THE \$912 MILLION INNEED
19 RECOMMENDED PHASE FUNDING HOWEVER YOU CAN FIND ADDITIONAL
20 DETAIL IN THE ATTACHMENTS TO YOUR SUMMARY ITEM. WE RECOMMEND
21 DISTRIBUTING 60% OF THE ARP FUNDS LESS SET-ASIDES NOW AND
22 PRESERVING THE REMAINDER FOR LATER DISTRIBUTION IN ORDER TO
23 PRESERVE THE REGION'S ABILITY TO RESPOND TO CHANGING
24 CIRCUMSTANCES. WE ALSO WANT TO MAINTAIN FINANCIAL NEED AS A
25 CENTRAL PART OF THE DISTRIBUTION. THE DISTRIBUTION SHOULD



July 14, 2021

1 PROVIDE OPERATORS WITH NEEDS BASED RELIEF TO REPLACED LOST
2 REVENUES IN KEEPING WITH LEGISLATIVE INTENT AND OUR PAST
3 APPROACH TO BOTH CARES AND CRRSAA. NEXT, THE DISTRIBUTION
4 INCENTIVIZES SERVICE RESTORATION BY PROVIDING A FUNDING
5 INCENTIVE TO RESTORE SERVICE LEVELS ON TOP OF BACKFILLING
6 FORECASTED REVENUE LOSSES OVER THE COMING FISCAL YEAR. I WANT
7 TO EMPHASIZE THE WORD INCENTIVE HERE. WE'RE NOT TRYING TO
8 DISTRIBUTE AN EXACT AMOUNT NEEDED BY EACH OPERATOR TO RESTORE
9 SERVICE LEVELS BUT RATHER PROVIDE A CUSHION ON TOP OF
10 BACKFILLING REVENUE LOSSES TO PRECOVID BUDGET LEVELS MOVING
11 INTO FISCAL YEAR 2022. NEXT THIS APPROACH WOULD HELP TO LEVEL
12 THE FINANCIAL FUNDING AMONG OPERATORS BY ENSURING ALL
13 OPERATORS RECEIVE ARP FUNDING ALLOCATION BUT ALSO TAKE INTO
14 CONSIDERATION THE TOTAL AMOUNT OF FEDERAL RELIEF FUNDS
15 OPERATORS RECEIVED RELATIVE TO THEIR LOSSES. NEXT IN RESPONSE
16 TO DIRECTION FROM COMMISSIONERS THIS APPROACH SETS ASIDE A
17 PORTION LESS THAN 10% OF ARP FUNDS FOR A COMBINATION OF BLUE
18 RIBBON TASK FORCE INITIATIVES SPECIFIC OPERATOR HARDSHIPS AND
19 DISPARITIES AND FOCUS RECOVERY EFFORTS. LAST BUT NOT LEAST
20 THIS DISTRIBUTION APPROACH REINFORCES COORDINATION EFFORTS
21 WITH SOLANO AND SONOMA COUNTIES BY ALLOWING OPERATORS AND CTAS
22 TO COLLABORATE ON HOW BEST TO DISTRIBUTE FUNDS TO OPERATORS
23 YOU WILL SEE DISTRIBUTION AMOUNTS FOR OPERATORS AND SOLANO AND
24 SONOMA COUNTIES HAVE BEEN COMBINED INTO LUMP SUM WHICH IS WE
25 ANTICIPATE BEING ABLE TO PROGRAM TO SPECIFIC OPERATORS IN



July 14, 2021

1 SEPTEMBER. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. IN THE WEEKS PROCEEDING
2 TODAY'S RECOMMENDATION, MTC STAFF WORKED WITH TRANSIT
3 OPERATORS, STAKEHOLDERS, IN AN ATTEMPT TO BUILD CONSENSUS ON
4 THE PROPOSED DISTRIBUTION APPROACH AND OPERATOR FUNDING
5 SHARES. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF SUPPORT AMONG TRANSIT
6 OPERATORS, AND I BELIEVE AS PART OF THIS ITEM'S MATERIALS, YOU
7 WILL FIND A LETTER OF SUPPORT SIGNED BY SIX OUT OF SEVEN OF
8 OUR LARGE OPERATORS PLUS SEVERAL SMALLER OPERATORS. SAID THAT,
9 NO MODELING IS GOING TO BE PERFECT FOR EVERYONE AND THIS SLIDE
10 SUMMARIZES SOME OF THE ONGOING CONCERNS THAT WE HAVE HEARD
11 EXPRESSED. FIRST OF ALL REMAINING CONTINUED CONFLICT WITH SOME
12 OPERATORS IN THE PROPOSED NEEDS BASED FOCUS IN THAT IT DOESN'T
13 FULLY ALIGN TO HAVE FUNDS APPORTIONED TO WITHIN URBANIZED
14 AREAS STAFF MAINTAINING THAT DISTRIBUTING ARP FUNDS ON A NEEDS
15 BASIS IS IN ALIGNMENT WITH THE INTENT OF THE FEDERAL
16 GOVERNMENT USE OF THESE FUNDS AND CRITICAL TO MAINTAINING
17 OPERATOR FINANCIAL YOU SUSTAINABILITY GOING FORWARD. THERE HAS
18 ALSO BEEN CONSTERNATION THAT THE INCENTIVE FUNDING THAT I HAD
19 MENTIONED THAT WAS ADDED TO THE REVENUE BACKFILL COMPONENT OF
20 THE DISTRIBUTION FORMULA IS NOT BASED ON THE EXACT COST OF
21 RESTORING SERVICE. THE CALCULATION USED TO ESTABLISH THE
22 INCENTIVE FUNDING AMOUNTS IS BASED ON EACH OPERATOR'S COST PER
23 SERVICE HOUR CAPPED AT THE HIGHEST COST OF THE SEVEN LARGEST
24 OPERATORS. I WOULD ADD THAT THE COST REVENUE PER HOUR IS USING
25 THE SAME COVID INFORMATION PROVIDED BY OPERATORS THAT WAS USED



July 14, 2021

1 IN THE CARES AND CRRSAA DISTRIBUTIONS. STAFF FELT IT'S BEST TO
2 MAINTAIN AN EXISTENT BASIS OF INFORMATION IN DETERMINING ARP
3 DISTRIBUTION RATHER THAN SWITCHING TO ALTERNATIVE SOURCES.
4 ANOTHER CONCERN WAS THAT THE INCENTIVE FUNDING DOESN'T
5 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT SOME OPERATORS KEPT SERVICE HOURS HIGH
6 THROUGHOUT THE PANDEMIC. WE DO KNOWLEDGE THAT SOME OPERATORS
7 PROVIDED HIGHER LEVELS OF ONGOING SERVICE DURING THE PANDEMIC
8 THAN OTHERS HOWEVER THERE IS JUST NOT A GOOD WAY OF GAUGING
9 WHETHER ADJUSTMENTS TO SERVICE WERE WARRANTED TO ACCOMMODATE
10 DEMAND OR EVEN WISE GIVEN AVAILABLE RESOURCES. THERE IS NO ONE
11 SIZE FITS ALL PATH RELATED TO SERVICE ADJUSTMENTS. GIVEN THAT
12 THE INCENTIVE FUNDS ARE ON TOP OF WHAT IS NEEDED TO BACKFILL
13 LOST REVENUES TO PREPANDEMIC LEVELS AND THE PACKET FACT THAT
14 ALL OPERATORS ARE GUARANTEED A MINIMUM LEVEL OF FUNDING IN OUR
15 PROPOSAL WE DID NOT FEEL THIS CONCERN WARRANTED CHANGE IN THE
16 PROPOSAL. SEVERAL OPERATORS EXPRESSED IMPORTANCE OF USING
17 ACTUAL OR MORE INFORMED FORECAST OF REVENUE LOSSES AS WELL AS
18 EVALUATION OF SERVICE RESTORATION AND KEY CONSIDERATIONS IN
19 FUTURE FUNDING. WE AGREE THAT DISTRIBUTION OF FUTURE PHASES
20 SHOULD BE INFORMED BY ACTUAL RECOVERY AND HOW WELL RESTORED
21 SERVICE ALIGNS WITH CUSTOMER NEEDS AND REVIEW ASSUMPTIONS ON
22 ACTUAL OCCURRENCES PRIOR TO DISTRIBUTION OF FUSE PHASES. THIS
23 SLIDE SHOW SUMMARIZES DISTRIBUTION AMOUNTS FOR THE LARGE
24 OPERATORS AND SMALLER OPERATORS COMBINED NOTE WITH THE
25 APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED DISTRIBUTION SHOWN IN PEACH ON THE



July 14, 2021

1 SLIGHTLY NEARLY 3.2 BILLION IN COVID RELIEF WILL HAVE BEEN
2 DISTRIBUTED SINCE THE START OF THE PANDEMIC. NEXT SLIDE. IN
3 TERMS OF NEXT STEPS AND REMAINING PROGRESS IN SUMMER AND
4 UPCOMING FALL WE WILL BE CONTINUING TO MONITOR STATUS OF
5 RIDERSHIP SERVICE LEVELS AND REVENUE IN ADDITION FOLLOWING
6 COMPLETION OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE
7 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN WE WILL WORK WITH THE COMMISSION TO
8 DEVELOP INVESTMENT PLANS FOR A PORTION OF THE PROPOSED 157
9 MILLION SET-ASIDE FOR BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE INITIATIVES AND
10 ALSO WORK WITH THE COMMISSION AND TRANSIT OPERATORS TO ADDRESS
11 A UNIQUE OPERATOR HARDSHIP FOCUSED RECOVERY EFFORTS REMAINING
12 SET-ASIDE FUNDS LATER IN THE FALL OR EARLY WINTER WE PLAN TO
13 RETURN TO THIS COMMITTEE WITH AN UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF
14 RIDERSHIP AND FINANCIAL RECOVERY AND WILL BE DEVELOPING A
15 PROPOSAL FOR PHASE TWO DISTRIBUTION FOR SOME OR ALL OF THE
16 REMAINING ARP FUNDS. THAT'S MY PRESENTATION. I ASK THAT THE
17 COMMITTEE REFER RESOLUTION 4481 TO THE FULL COMMISSION FOR
18 APPROVE AND I AM HAPPY TO RESPOND TO QUESTIONS.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE
21 THAT. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR QUESTIONS COMMENTS AND
22 CONCERNS. DIRECTOR ABE-KOGA?

23

24 **DIR. MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU VERY
25 MUCH, FOR THE PRESENTATIONS. I APPRECIATE STAFF'S HARD WORK ON



July 14, 2021

1 THIS ITEM. I PARTICIPATED IN THE WORKSHOP AND IT WAS VERY
2 INSIGHTFUL FOR ME AS A NEW BOARD MEMBER TO HEAR FROM THE
3 VARIOUS AGENCIES, AND THE UNIQUE CHALLENGES EACH ONE FACES. I
4 HAVE TO CALL OUT, THOUGH, I CANNOT CALL OUT OUR CHALLENGE HERE
5 IN THE SOUTH BAY WITH VTA, AND AS YOU ALL KNOW WE FACED A
6 WORLD WISE NEWS-MAKING TRAGEDY, RECENTLY, AND I GUESS I WAS
7 JUST STRUCK BY THE FUNDING DISTRIBUTION, AND I GUESS MY
8 QUESTION IS WOULD THAT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE ARE FISTING
9 BRINGING BACK LIGHT RAIL SERVICE AND TRYING TO BRING THAT BACK
10 AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE AND HARDSHIP PERHAPS IN THE NEXT PHASE
11 OF FUNDING FOR MORE ASSISTANCE BECAUSE THE INVENTORY OF WHAT
12 THE NEEDS ARE IS STARTING TO COME TO FRUITION, AND I
13 DEFINITELY BELIEVE WE WILL BE NEEDING EXTRA ASSISTANCE, SO
14 COULD WE BE COUNTING ON THAT IN FUTURE PHASES? THANK YOU.

15

16 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. APPRECIATE THAT. ANYONE
17 ELSE FROM THE COMMISSION? FROM THE COMMITTEE. I'LL TRY TO GO
18 IN ORDER OF HANDS THAT WERE RAISED. DIRECTOR CONNOLLY?

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** THANK YOU. I THINK JIM MAY HAVE BEAT ME OUT.
21 BUT APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY, AS WELL AS I'M NOT ON THIS
22 COMMITTEE, BUT I JUST WANTED TO QUICKLY FLAG A COUPLE OF
23 ISSUES, AND ALSO THANK STAFF FOR THE GREAT PRESENTATION. AND
24 OBVIOUSLY THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT'S GONE INTO THE ALLOCATION
25 PROCESS. SO, SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF SMALLER OPERATORS IN THE



July 14, 2021

1 NORTH BAY, NAMELY IN MARIN AND SONOMA COUNTIES, SOME OF THE
2 ISSUES HAVE BEEN FLAGGED, BUT JUST WANTED TO GO OVER A COUPLE
3 OF SPECIFICS, AND REALLY START WITH THE OPERATORS ARE VERY
4 GRATEFUL FOR THE CONTINUED FEDERAL SUPPORT. IT REALLY HAS
5 ALLOWED THEM TO MAKE UP FOR LOST LOCAL AND STATE REVENUE, AND
6 TO CONTINUE TO PROVIDE VITAL SERVICES DURING THE PANDEMIC.
7 SO, THE COUPLE EVER CONCERNS. ON THE DISTRIBUTION FORMULA FOR
8 MARIN AND SONOMA SMALL OPERATORS, THERE ARE DATA
9 INCONSISTENCIES, AND THE FORMULA DOES NOT SEEM TO ACCOUNT FOR
10 CASES SUCH AS IN THE CASE OF MARIN TRANSIT, WHERE OPERATORS
11 HAVE ACTUALLY ADDED SERVICE DURING THE PANDEMIC IN ORDER TO
12 MEET DEMAND. AND IN THE CASE OF SMART WHERE NEW SERVICE WAS
13 ADDED, JUST PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC, AND IS NOT REFLECTED IN THE
14 2019 NTD DATA GREATER RESOURCES ARE NEEDED TO MAINTAIN SERVICE
15 LEVELS GOING FORWARD. SO IN REQUEST JUST TO GET TO THE POINT
16 WOULD BE TO RESPECTFULLY ASK MTC STAFF AND THE COMMISSION TO
17 CONSIDER ADDRESSING THESE SITUATIONS BY USING A PORTION OF THE
18 10% SET-ASIDES, HARDSHIP OR DISPARITIES ALLOWANCE GOING
19 FORWARD. MARIN TRANSIT IS REQUESTING AN ADDITIONAL \$2.4
20 MILLION FOR A TOTAL 7.2 MILLION FROM ARP. THIS IS THE AMOUNT
21 NEEDED TO MAINTAIN THE CURRENT ADJUSTED SERVICE LEVELS, I.E.,
22 INCREASED SERVICE LEVELS FOR TWO YEARS, ACCOUNTING FOR REVENUE
23 AND EXPECTED SERVICE COST INCREASES. AND THEN SONOMA COUNTY
24 TRANSIT AGENCY IS REQUESTING AN ADDITIONAL 7.7 MILLION FOR A
25 TOTAL OF 23.2 MILLION NEEDED. THIS IS TO RESTORE 100% OF



July 14, 2021

1 PREPANDEMIC SERVICE FOR THREE YEARS ACCOUNTING FOR REVENUE
2 LOSS AND SERVICE COST ESCALATION. SO JUST WANTED TO GET THAT
3 INTO THE RECORD. THANK YOU.

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** I APPRECIATE THAT VERY MUCH. DIRECTOR
6 SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. AND THERESA, THIS
9 IS EXCELLENT WORK AND GREAT PRESENTATION. SO, THANK YOU. I
10 WANT TO KIND OF PIGGYBACK ON COMMISSIONER CONNOLY'S COMMENTS.
11 I THINK THE NORTH BAY HAS SOME VERY SPECIFIC CHALLENGES, AND I
12 HOPE STAFF LOOKS AT THAT. BUT, CHANGING THE SUBJECT HERE, I'M
13 GOING TO PUT ON MY BLUE RIBBON CHAIRMAN HAT. SONOMA COUNTY HAS
14 MADE A REQUEST FOR SEVEN HUNDREDS \$50,000 TO CONTINUE THAT
15 TRANSIT INTEGRATION EFFORT. AND YOU KNOW, WITH ALL THE WORK
16 THAT THE BLUE RIBBON IS DOING, WE'RE TRYING TO GET THESE
17 SMALLER OPERATORS TO CONSOLIDATE, HIGHER COORDINATION, HIGHER
18 COOPERATION, THIS PHASE TWO, AND SONOMA COUNTY IS DEALING WITH
19 THE WAYFINDINGS, FARE INTEGRATION, YOU KNOW, THE SCHEDULING,
20 TRANSFERRING, THE VERY THINGS WE'RE ASKING THE SMALL OPERATORS
21 TO DO. MAYBE THIS QUESTION IS FOR ALIX. I REALLY WANT LIKE TO
22 SEE THAT KIND OF SEPARATED FROM ALL OF THIS DEBATE ON THE
23 OTHER MONEY. BECAUSE IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY START
24 BRINGING THOSE SMALLER OPERATORS TOGETHER. SOMETHING WE HAVE
25 BEEN WORKING ON AT THE COMMISSION FOR 20, 30 YEARS. YOU KNOW,



July 14, 2021

1 SO ALIX, OR THERESE, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN RESPOND TO THAT.
2 BUT I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO BE ABLE TO IDENTIFY EITHER THE SET-
3 ASIDE FOR THE BLUE RIBBON, OR SOME OTHER FUNDING SOURCE, THAT
4 WE ACTUALLY MAKE THAT COMMITMENT TO THAT EFFORT, FOR THAT
5 PHASE TWO INTEGRATION OF THE TRANSIT EFFORTS. ASSOCIATION
6 ALIX? OR THERESE, COULD SOMEBODY RESPOND TO THAT?

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ALIX BOCKELMAN
9 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR PUBLIC POLICY. IN JUNE THE
10 COMMISSION SET-ASIDE 6 MILLION TO SUPPORT SOME BLUE RIBBON
11 EFFORTS OUT OF YOUR SAFE AND SEAMLESS QUICK STRIKE MONEY, AND
12 WE WERE AWARE OF, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, THE GOOD WORK THAT'S
13 HAPPENING IN SONOMA AND SOLANO WITH RESPECT TO SOME OF THESE
14 INTEGRATION EFFORTS THAT REALLY DO ALIGN VERY WELL WITH SOME
15 OF THE ACCELERATED ACTIONS THAT ARE COMING OUT OF BLUE RIBBON.
16 SO I THINK WHAT WE WERE HOPING TO DO IS COME BACK AS EARLY AS
17 SEPTEMBER WITH A RECOMMENDATION TO USE SOME OF THAT MONEY TO
18 FUND THOSE EFFORTS. SO, OBVIOUSLY WE WOULD LIKE TO HEAR MORE
19 FROM THE COMMISSION THAT THAT IS WHAT, THOUGHTS THAT STAFF HAD
20 ABOUT THAT.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** ALIX IT SEEMS LIKE ALL THE WORK THEY DID IN
23 THE FIRST PHASE THAT THE SECOND PHASE REALLY BRINGS ALL THE
24 WORK TOGETHER AND IT ALIGNS WITH ALL OF THE GOALS AND
25 OBJECTIVES OF THE BLUE RIBBON. AND WHAT THIS COMMISSION HAS



July 14, 2021

1 ADOPTED IN THE PAST, AND YOU KNOW, I JUST WANT THINK THAT IT'S
2 AN OPPORTUNITY THAT SHOULD NOT BE SQUANDERED, AND FOR THIS
3 VERY MEAGER, ROUNDING ERA IT'S GOING TO PRODUCE SOME BENEFITS
4 IN SONOMA COUNTY FOR TRANSIT INNOVATION AND I HOPE STAFF LOOKS
5 AT IT IN THE WAY IN A CONCLUSION OF A MODEL PROJECT FOR
6 SOMETHING THAT OTHER COUNTIES CAN DO AND CONTRA COSTA COUNTIES
7 HAS DONE A LOT OF THIS WORK AND I HATE TO SEE THIS EFFORT FALL
8 SHORT ESPECIALLY WITH SUCH A MODEST INVESTMENT AND I WOULD
9 LIKE STAFF TO CONSIDER THAT AND SINGLE IT OUT IN MAKING SURE
10 THAT PROJECT IS FUND SAID. THANK YOU.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AS COUNTY SUPERVISOR FOR SONOMA COUNTY I
13 WHOLEHEARTEDLY AGREE WITH YOU. IT IS IN LINE WHAT WHAT WE'RE
14 TALKING ABOUT AND WE NEED TO PUT IT IN LINE AND FUND IT AND
15 WALK THE TALK, IN MY WORDS, AND WHERE IT COMES FROM, ALIX, I
16 LEAVE THAT UP TO YOU AND YOUR MAGIC BOOKS.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIR, I MUST MENTION, THAT YOU AND I
19 HAVE BEEN BOTH ADVOCATES FOR THIS AT THE BLUE RIBBON. THANK
20 YOU FOR THE COMMENTS.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** IN SONOMA COUNTY WE GOT TO THE PLACE TO
23 BE ABLE TO TRULY MOVE FORWARD BEYOND WHERE WE ARE AT NOW IT
24 WILL TAKE SOME ADDITIONAL RESOURCES AND EVENTUALLY AS WE DO
25 HOPEFULLY, DO CONSOLIDATE WHERE IT MAKES SENSE TO BECOME MORE



July 14, 2021

1 EFFICIENT, THAT'S GOING TO BE THE CASE AGAIN AND REPLICATE
2 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. SO I LOOK FORWARD TO THAT.
3 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK THIS IS
6 REALLY TERRIFIC WORK, AND I AM CONSTANTLY IMPRESSED HOW STAFF
7 HAS MANAGED TO KIND OF, YOU KNOW, ADDRESS SO MANY -- SUCH A
8 COMPLEX SITUATION IN SUCH A QUICK AMOUNT OF TIME OVER THE
9 COURSE OF THESE VARIOUS FEDERAL RELIEF PACKAGES. AND IN
10 PARTICULAR, I WANTED TO JUST CALL OUT HOW I THINK THIS IS --
11 IT'S REALLY THE RIGHT DECISION TO BE DOING THESE DISTRIBUTIONS
12 BASED ON NEED. AND HOW I KNOW THAT IT'S SORT OF -- THAT'S NOT
13 ALWAYS THE EASIEST THING TO DO AND IT'S RELATIVELY COMPLEX.
14 BUT I THINK THAT'S WHAT'S GOING TO SERVE THE TRANSIT RIDERS
15 BEST AND WHAT'S GOING TO SERVE THIS REGION BEST. I HOPE THAT
16 AS WE GO FORWARD INTO THE NEXT AND FINAL ROUNDS OF FEDERAL
17 DISTRIBUTIONS, THAT WE CAN DO EVEN MORE TO TRY AND ALIGN THE
18 DISTRIBUTIONS WITH, KIND OF THE FUTURE STATE OF OUR TRANSIT
19 SYSTEMS. AND THAT, AS WE -- AS IT BECOMES CLEARER AND CLEARER,
20 THAT WE'RE NOT GOING BACK TO THE PREPANDEMIC, LIKE, WHATEVER
21 WE GOING, TO IT'S NOT GOING TO BE BACK TO WHAT IT WAS BEFORE.
22 IF WE CAN KIND OF BE, FINDING WAYS TO SUPPORT AGENCIES
23 TRANSITIONING TO THAT FUTURE STATE AND LOOKING AT THE NEED OF
24 THAT FUTURE STATE AND NOT JUST LOOKING BACKWARDS. AND I KNOW
25 AS THESE DISTRIBUTIONS HAVE GONE ON WE CAN BALANCE THAT AND



July 14, 2021

1 HOPE WE CONTINUE TO DO THAT. AND I DON'T KNOW EXACTLY HOW TO
2 DO THAT, BUT I AM SURE YOU WILL FIGURE IT OUT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HELLO, AND THANK YOU FOR HEARING ME, AS I'M
7 NOT A MEMBER OF THIS SUBCOMMITTEE. BUT I WANT TO LIFT UP AND
8 ECHO THE COMMENTS OF A FEW OF THE COMMISSIONERS WHO HAVE
9 SPOKEN BEFORE ME, CONNOLY, SPERING, AND RABBIT, AND I DO AGREE
10 THAT THE NEEDS-BASED ASSESSMENT IS THE WAY TO GO FOR KEEPING
11 THE WHOLE REGION GOING. IN MARIN AND SONOMA COUNTIES, A
12 RELATIVELY SMALL INVESTMENT WOULD GO SUCH A LONG WAY FOR US
13 AND OUR TRADITION RIDERS. AND I HOPE THAT YOU CONSIDER THIS
14 REQUEST AND CONSIDER IN THERE THAT WE HAVE WORKED REALLY HARD
15 AND WILL PUT IT TO GOOD USE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME TODAY.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHAIR PEDROZA?

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBIT. AND I DO WANT TO
20 THANK ALIX, YOU HAVE BEEN DOING THIS THREE TIMES, NOW, ALIX,
21 AND YOU FIND A WAY TO FIND COMPROMISE THAT'S EQUITABLE AND
22 FAIR AND THAT MOST FOLKS CAN REALLY FEEL GOOD ABOUT WHAT WE'RE
23 DOING. THOSE AREN'T JUST WORDS, THOSE ARE REAL ACTION, ALIX,
24 THANK YOU. IN TERMS OF HARDSHIP, I WANT TO ECHO THE COMMENTS
25 CHAIR OF THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE JIM SPERING MENTIONED,



July 14, 2021

1 TALKING ABOUT LOOKING FORWARD THE BLUE RIBBON IS
2 TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN THAT'S THE FORWARD NATURE THAT WE
3 ALL GOOD EXCITED ABOUT BUT WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE
4 RESOURCING THOSE OBJECTIVES AND OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT TO
5 ACHIEVE THE SET-ASIDE IS IMPORTANT AND WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THE
6 MISSION WORKSHOP TO TALK ABOUT OUTCOMES. I BELIEVE TO
7 COMMISSIONERS POINT THERE IS OPPORTUNITY IN THE HARDSHIP
8 CATEGORY TO RECTIFY SOME CONCERNS THAT ARE BEING RAISED BY
9 OPERATORS AND COMMISSIONERS BUT WE HAVE GOT TO BE SURE THAT WE
10 COLLECTIVELY DON'T REGRESS AND LOSE FOCUS ON WHAT WE TRYING TO
11 ACCOMPLISH WITH THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE BECAUSE THERE IS A
12 LOT OF INTENTIONALITY WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO THERE. AND ALIX
13 WITH THE OPPORTUNITY AND CONCERNS WE'RE HEARING, IN THE SECOND
14 PHASE IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF THIS, IS THERE AN OPPORTUNITY TO
15 RELOOK AT SOME OF THESE THINGS AND SOME OF THE CONCERNS THAT
16 HAVE BEEN RAISED BY COMMISSIONERS AND OPERATORS?

17

18 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** CHAIR PEDROZA, DEFINITELY IN THE SECOND PHASE,
19 WE CAN CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, RE-- YOU KNOW, AS THERESA
20 MENTIONED IN HER PRESENTATION, WE CAN LOOK AT KIND OF EVOLVING
21 SITUATIONS IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP IN TERMS OF HOW THE RECOVERY
22 IS GOING. SO THIS'S DEFINITELY A POSSIBILITY IN THE SECOND
23 PHASE. AND AS YOU NOTED, THERE IS POTENTIALLY, ALSO, SOME ROOM
24 TO ADDRESS THAT WITHIN THE SET-ASIDE THAT WE HAVE, BUT
25 RECOGNIZING, AS YOU NOTED, THAT YOU WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT



July 14, 2021

1 WE'RE REALLY FOCUSING ON THE OUTCOMES AND GETTING THEIR PURPLE
2 RIBBON. THAT'S SORT OF THE BALANCE THAT THE COMMISSION WILL
3 HAVE TO SORT OF ESTABLISH TO BE ABLE TO ACCOMPLISH BOTH OF
4 THOSE.

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I APPRECIATE THAT, ALIX, AND THAT IS A GOOD
7 PATHWAY FORWARD REMINDING COMMISSIONERS OF SOME OF THE
8 OUTCOMES THAT WERE TRYING TO ACCELERATE AND PLANNED ARE
9 SIGNIFICANT RESOURCES THAT ARE PART OF OUR OPERATORS
10 COLLABORATING. THANK YOU FOR THE CONCERNS EXPRESSED. THANK YOU
11 ALIX.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** I WANT TO BE ON RECORD ECHOING THE COMMENTS
16 OF COMMISSIONER SPERING, YOU KNOW, AND OF YOURS, CHAIR RABBIT,
17 FOR THE WORK THAT IS BEING DONE WITH THE SMALL OPERATORS, AND
18 DEFINITELY WANT TO JUST BE ON RECORD IN SAYING THAT MY ISSUES
19 AND CONCERN WERE CERTAINLY HEARTFELT WITHIN HIS COMMENTS.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER
22 CHAVEZ?

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. LET ME START WITH THE LAST POINT THAT
25 WAS RAISED. I THINK, IF WE'RE GOING TO SET-ASIDE MONEY FOR THE



July 14, 2021

1 BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION, I THINK IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE THAT
2 IF WE HAVE OPERATORS THAT ARE DOING WHAT WE'RE ASKING PEOPLE
3 TO DO, WHICH IS TO COMBINE, THAT SHOULD COMPLETELY BE FUNDED.
4 LIKE, I DO NOT -- JIM, IT SHOULD COME OUT OF THAT FUNDS AND
5 IT'S THE PRODUCT OF THE FUTURE OF THE REGION. SO I THINK THOSE
6 ARE REALLY GOOD INVESTMENTS. I'M NOT GOING TO SUPPORT THE
7 ALLOCATIONS PUT FORWARD TODAY AND IT ISN'T BECAUSE STAFF
8 DIDN'T WORK HARD. THEY D AND I DO THINK THAT STAFF REALLY
9 LISTENED. I THINK THEY DID THEIR BEST TO MEET THE NEEDS OF THE
10 ENTIRE COMMUNITY. BUT YOU KNOW, I -- THE IMPACT TO THE VALLEY
11 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OF THESE ACTIONS IS REALLY, IN MY
12 OBSERVATION, A VERY DOWNWARD SPIRAL FOR OUR AGENCY. AND I'M
13 REALLY CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. AND I'M -- AND I HAVE SHARED THIS
14 BEFORE, THAT, THAT THE IMPACT FOR US IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW,
15 HOW WE STAY IN THE BUS BUSINESS, AND THE PROCESS WE'RE GOING
16 THROUGH IN TERMS OF RECOVERING OUR LIGHT RAIL ARE VERY REAL
17 AND VERY MEANINGFUL. AND I KNOW, TO ME, IT FEELS LIKE IT FALLS
18 ON DEAF EARS FOR YOU ALL TO HEAR ME SAY, WHAT, WHAT, WHAT,
19 IT'S NOT THAT. LET ME TELL YOU I'M WORRIED ABOUT THE FUTURE OF
20 OUR ABILITY TO PROVIDE TRANSIT IN WHAT WE THINK OF AS THE
21 HEART OF SILICON VALLEY AND ONE OF THE CHALLENGES FOR ALL EVER
22 US TO BE PART OF MTC, WE ALL NEED TO BELIEVE AND UNDERSTAND
23 HOW WE'RE HELPING EACH OTHER MOVE FORWARD IN A WAY THAT'S IN
24 FACT MORE EQUITABLE AND ALLOWS US TO PLAN, EVEN THROUGH COVID.
25 SO, ONE OF THE REQUESTS I'M GOING TO MAKE IS WE -- AS I AM



July 14, 2021

1 SURE THE BOARD WILL TAKE ITS FINAL ACTION TO APPROVE THIS --
2 IS TO TAKE TO HEART WHAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA HAS ASKED FOR
3 IN TERMS OF HOW WE THINK ABOUT THE FUTURE. AND I DO -- HAD
4 REQUESTED THIS A WHILE AGO, BUT I WANT TO ASK STAFF, AGAIN, TO
5 SEND OUT THE EXAMINATION YOU DID OF ALL OF THE FUNDING THAT
6 ALL OF OUR REGIONS GET. IT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT DOCUMENT. I
7 HAVEN'T RECEIVED IT BACK, AND I COULDN'T FIND IT IN MY E-
8 MAILS, BUT IT'S ONE THAT YOU SHOWED US, IT MIGHT HAVE BEEN
9 PART OF THE EARLY BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION FOUNDATIONAL WORK.
10 BUT IT WAS VERY, VERY GOOD AND IT REALLY SHOWED HOW DIFFERENT,
11 HOW ALL OF OUR AGENCIES ARE FUNDED. IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR
12 ME, AT LEAST, AS WE GET INTO THIS LAST PHASE OF FUNDING. THANK
13 YOU.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND TO MY COLLEAGUES, I
18 THINK WE ARE REALLY TRYING TO WORK TOGETHER AS BEST WE CAN,
19 AND LISTEN TO EACH OTHER AND EACH OTHER'S NEEDS, AND THAT WILL
20 BE ONGOING. I WANT TO THANK THE OPERATORS FOR WORKING TOGETHER
21 ON ALL OF THIS, AND REALLY, ALIX, AND THE STAFF, FOR GETTING
22 THE MONEY OUT THEIR, AND WORKING TO MOVE FORWARD SO WE CAN
23 MAKE TRANSIT BETTER. WE UNDERSTANDS THE EMERGENCY THAT A LOT
24 ARE GOING THROUGH, AND IT'S GOING TO TAKE A LOT OF EFFORT. SO,
25 AS TO COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, AND ABE-KOGA THE TRAGEDY THAT



July 14, 2021

1 HAPPENED AT VTA HAS IMPACTED US ALL, ON OUR HEARTS, BUT I
2 THINK WE REALLY NEED TO WORK TOGETHER MOVING FORWARD, AND
3 FUNDING, LIKE THIS, NEEDS TO BE PUT TO USE AS QUICKLY AS
4 POSSIBLE. BUT, AGAIN, TOTALLY WORKING TOGETHER AND
5 COMMUNICATING ALL THESE NEEDS. THANK YOU, EVERYBODY.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE FROM THE COMMITTEE
8 -- COMMISSION? NOT SEEING ANY HANDS RAISED. WHY DON'T WE GO TO
9 OUR ATTENDEES FOR PUBLIC COMMENT, THEN WE'LL BRING IT BACK FOR
10 ACTION. AND KIMBERLY, I SEE ROLAND WITH HIS HANDS UP.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. AND BEFORE WE GO TO HIM, MR. CHAIR,
13 I WOULD LIKE TO NOTE THAT THERE WERE THREE LETTERS OF
14 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED. THE FIRST WAS FROM BAY AREA TRANSIT
15 GENERAL MANAGERS, THE SECOND FROM CITY OF EMERYVILLE, AND THE
16 THIRD FROM JAMES SCHMIDT AND MICHAEL ARNOLD, ALL OF THESE HAVE
17 BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA, AND WITH THAT, THE FIRST
18 PUBLIC SPEAKER IS ROLAND LEBRUN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU
19 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBIT, AND COMMISSIONERS, FOR YOUR
22 COMMENTS. AS YOU KNOW, I LIVE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND I
23 NEED THE VTA LIGHT RAIL TO GET TO CALTRAIN, BECAUSE WE DON'T
24 GET CALTRAIN SERVICE HERE, EVEN THOUGH WE HAVE GOT THE STATION
25 A MILE AND A HALF FROM MY HOUSE. I SYMPATHIZE WITH SUPERVISOR



July 14, 2021

1 CHAVEZ AND MEMBER ABE-KOGA'S REQUEST FOR FINANCIAL SUPPORT, OR
2 VTA DURING A TIME OF EXCEPTIONAL HARDSHIP. HAVING SAID THAT,
3 I'M OPPOSED TO ANY FURTHER ARP ALLOCATIONS TO AGENCIES WHO
4 HAVE ACCUMULATED A TOTAL OF HALF A BILLION DOLLARS IN UNSPENT
5 CRRSAA FUNDING INCLUDING ONE HUNDREDS \$10 MILLION OF VTA. AND
6 THE LAST COMMENT I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE IN CLOSING IS THAT UNDER
7 CONSENT EARLIER TODAY, YOU HAVE JUST APPROVED HUNDREDS OF
8 MILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN VTA, IN TDA, STA, AND OTHER FUNDING
9 SOURCES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS FROM
12 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. BUT THERE IS ONE COMMISSIONER WITH
13 THEIR HAND RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. I APPRECIATE THAT.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** DID YOU WANT TO TAKE RANDI KINMAN FIRST FOR
20 COMMENT.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WE'LL GO TO RANDI. GO AHEAD, RANDI.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN:** I WANTED TO CHIME IN ON THE -- ON A SPECIFICALLY
25 LOOKING AT WHAT COVID HAS TAUGHT US WHEN WE COME TO CLOSE



July 14, 2021

1 COLLAPSE OF TRANSIT SYSTEMS AND WHAT THE RECENT TRAGEDY WITH
2 VTA HAS SHOWN US WHEN THAT'S EXACERBATED BY SOMETHING ELSE. IN
3 OUR LONG-RANGE PLANNING, WE HAVE NEVER PLANNED, TO MY
4 KNOWLEDGE, FOR COLLAPSE OF A SINGLE TRANSIT AGENCY, NOR HAVE
5 WE LOOKED AT THE CASCADE EFFECT THAT THAT CAN HAPPEN. I'M
6 HOPING THAT SOMEWHERE ALONG THE LINE WE NESTLE IN THE FUNDS TO
7 DO AN ANALYSIS. BECAUSE MY CONCERNS QUITE HONESTLY IS, IN THE
8 PAST, WHAT HAS BEEN WHEN THE NORTH BAY FIRE WIPES OUT THE BUS
9 YARD FOR THE TRANSIT AGENCY WHAT HAPPENS IF IT WIPES OUT --
10 SOMETHING HAPPENS AND IT WIPES OUT THE STORAGE YARD FOR AC
11 TRANSIT, OR FOR ANY OF THE MAJOR HAULERS, AND WE HAVE LEARNED
12 WITH VTA THAT THIS DOES HAVE A CASCADE EFFECT, AND THAT WE
13 NEED TO PLAN FOR IT. AND IF WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT LONG-TERM
14 RESILIENCY WE NEED TO TAKE THAT ACCOUNT INTO MOVING FORWARD.
15 SO HOWEVER WE MAINTAIN ENOUGH FUNDING TO LOOK AT THAT, WOULD
16 BE MY SUGGESTION. THANK YOU.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I DO SEE ONE
19 ADDITIONAL RAISED HAND ON OUR ATTENDEES LIST. WE'LL GO AHEAD
20 AND TAKE THAT IF IT'S OKAY WITH MY COLLEAGUES, WRAP UP PUBLIC
21 COMMENT THEN BRING BACK TO THE BOARD FOR FINAL DELIBERATION.
22 KIMBERLY?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VEDA FLOREZ, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO UNMUTE
25 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.



July 14, 2021

1

2 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD MORNING THANK YOU FOR TAKING MY COMMENTS AS
3 SORT OF A LADY ADDITION. I WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT ABOUT THE
4 NORTH BAY COUNTIES. IN 2018 TO '20, OUR MARIN, SONOMA, NAPA
5 COUNTIES, HAVE MADE HUGE STRIDES IN CREATING A CLEAN SAFE
6 ENVIRONMENT IN OUR TRANSPORTATION NETWORK AND REALLY PROVIDING
7 THAT SYSTEM OF ENGAGEMENT TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR LATINX
8 COMMUNITY, OUR GROWING LATINX COMMUNITY HAS OPPORTUNITIES FOR
9 BUS AND TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. AND MANY OF OUR LATINX COMMUNITIES
10 WORK IN RESTAURANTS, THEY ARE NURSES, THEY PROVIDE CHILD CARE,
11 AND ARE TRANSPORTATION DRIVERS AS WELL. AND I THINK IT'S VERY
12 IMPORTANT FOR MTC TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT ALL THE WORK THAT WAS
13 DONE PRIOR TO COVID, AND REALLY CREATE SOME ADDITIONAL FUNDING
14 FOR THIS AREA. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A SYSTEM THAT WAS LACKING,
15 UP HERE IN THE NORTH BAY, IN OUR NORTH BAY COUNTIES, IN THAT
16 THE WORK THAT WAS DONE NEEDS TO BE ACKNOWLEDGED AND NEEDS TO
17 BE BROUGHT FORTH SO THAT EVERYBODY KNOWS THAT WE'RE TRYING, UP
18 HERE, IN THE NORTH BAY, THAT WE DON'T HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY FOR
19 BART, AND WE HAVE GOT TO MAINTAIN OUR -- THE TRANSPORTATION
20 SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE, WITH THE -- EVEN WITH THE EXPANSION OF A
21 SMART TRAIN, TO PROVIDE REGIONAL NETWORK TRANSPORTATION. THANK
22 YOU VERY MUCH.

23



July 14, 2021

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. AND, THAT WILL
2 CONCLUDE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM. I WILL BRING
3 IT BACK TO THE BOARD, AND I'LL GO TO COMMISSIONER SPERING.

4
5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. I HOPE STAFF CAN
6 RESPOND TO COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ COMMENT. HISTORICALLY, THIS
7 COMMISSION HAS ALWAYS LOOKED BEYOND THE NUMBERS AND FORMULAS.
8 THERE IS A LOT OF CHALLENGES THAT FACE TRANSIT OPERATORS, THAT
9 WE CAN'T MEASURE, AND I THINK WHAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS
10 RAISING IS A VERY VALID POINT. AND I HOPE THAT STAFF CAN
11 RESPOND. AND IS THERE A WAY THAT WE CAN ADDRESS THAT ISSUE
12 THAT'S BEING RAISED? AND IS THE FLEXIBILITY IN WHAT'S BEING
13 PROPOSED? YOU KNOW? DO WE HAVE THAT FLEXIBILITY IN THIS
14 PROPOSAL? AND AS WE ALLOCATE THIS MONEY WE ALL KNOW IT GOES TO
15 PLACES WHERE IT PROBABLY WOULD HAVE BEEN BETTER INVESTED
16 SOMEWHERE ELSE. AND WE NEED TO REALLY SHARPEN THAT PENCIL. BUT
17 I THINK THE ISSUES BEING RAISED BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ NEEDS
18 TO BE ADDRESSED AND WE NEED TO KNOW THAT WE HAVE THE
19 FLEXIBILITY TO ADDRESS THAT CHALLENGE. THAT'S A MAJOR TRANSIT
20 OPERATION IN THIS REGION. AND IT'S ONE THAT WE HAVE TO REALLY
21 LOOK AT WHAT THIS -- THAT RECENT TRAGEDY, THE IMPACT THAT ITS
22 HAD. THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN'T MEASURE BUT IT IMPACTS OUR
23 ABILITY TO PROVIDE SERVICES. I HOPE STAFF CAN ADDRESS AND
24 RESPOND TO THAT AND ASSURANCE.

25



July 14, 2021

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I WANT TO RESPOND TO COMMISSIONER SPERING. I
2 VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS THAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ
3 RAISED AND ALSO COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AT THE BEGINNING OF THE
4 COMMENTARY. COMMENTARY. THE TRAGEDY THAT BEFELL VTA WAS
5 EXACTLY THE TYPE OF HARDSHIP THAT WE WERE ANTICIPATING, AND AS
6 STAFF EXPLAINED, WE DID CARVE OUT A SPECIFIC AMOUNT OF FUNDING
7 FOR THE TYPES OF THINGS THAT DON'T FIT NEATLY INTO, I WILL
8 CALL THIS -- I'M SEARCHING FOR A TERM -- BUT, WHEN WE APPROACH
9 THE PANDEMIC, WHAT WE, AS STAFF, TRIED TO DO IN THIS VERY
10 COMPLEX AND DIVERSE AREA WAS TALK ABOUT HOW WE COULD STRUCTURE
11 A PANDEMIC RELATED RESPONSE THAT WE KNEW WAS IMPACTING
12 OPERATOR IN DIFFERENTLY WAYS, BUT WHAT THAT SHARED IN COMMON
13 IS THAT THERE WAS A COMPLETE, FALL-THROUGH-THE-FLOOR RIDERSHIP
14 OF OTHER THINGS DUE TO THIS UNIQUE INDUCED SITUATION AND WE
15 HAVE BEEN THROUGH THAT WITH THREE DIFFERENT TRANCHES NOW, OVER
16 A YEAR. AND, AGAIN, KUDOS TO THE OPERATORS FOR WORKING WITH US
17 AS WE TRY TO SET THAT UNIQUE FRAME, WITH UNIQUE FUNDING SOURCE
18 TO DEAL WITH THAT. BUT AS RANDI KINMAN AND OTHERS HAPPENED,
19 IT'S NOT LIKE THE WORLD STOPS, JUST BASED ON THAT PARTICULAR
20 IMPACT, AND IN VTA'S CASE, THERE WAS A CLEAR EXAMPLE OF OTHER
21 EVENT HAPPENING THAT WE NEED TO DEAL WITH. SO TWO THINGS. A,
22 THE AMOUNT THAT WE HAVE FROM THE ARP AMOUNT IS REMARKABLY
23 ROBUST, LET'S ALL RECALL, \$1.7 BILLION IS A LOT OF MONEY. AND
24 WE'RE LUCKY IN THIS REGION TO BE ABLE TO HAVE THAT ROBUSTNESS
25 THAT WOULD ALLOW US IN, TO DO THE TYPE OF CARVE-OUT WE SAID,



July 14, 2021

1 THAT ALLOWS US TO REMEDY THAT. BUT I THINK WHAT COMMISSIONER
2 CHAVEZ IS ALSO POINTING, TO VTA IS FACING A MUCH LONGER
3 QUESTION OF HOW TRANSIT SHOULD EXIST IN THEIR REGION. AND, I
4 WOULD JUST SAY, AT THIS POINT, THIS IS ALSO, YOU KNOW, THIS IS
5 BEYOND THE COVID RECOVERY AND EVERYTHING ELSE, ALTHOUGH OF
6 COURSE, IT WILL IMPACT WHAT THAT FUTURE LOOKS LIKE, AND AS,
7 YOU KNOW, MTC, WHAT WE TRY TO DO IS WORK WITH OUR TRANSIT
8 OPERATORS LOOKING AT A BROAD ARRAY OF WHAT'S AVAILABLE,
9 LOCALLY, AS WELL AS REGIONALLY, TO ADDRESS SOMETIMES THOSE
10 MAJOR SHIFTS. AND I WOULD NOTE THAT THE NEW GM, THAT VTA JUST
11 HIRED, CAROLINE GONAUT, JUST STARTED, I BELIEVE, ON MONDAY. I
12 KNOW CAROLYN VERY WELL, AND ONE OF THE THINGS I WILL DO IS
13 MEET WITH HER AND WE CAN TAKE UP THIS LARGER QUESTION THAT VTA
14 IS GRAPPLING WITH, WHICH IS WHAT IS THE STATE OF PLAY FOR JUST
15 TRANSIT IN THE COUNTY GIVEN A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT ELEMENTS. SO
16 IT'S A BIT OF A BIGGER QUESTION THAT THE PANDEMIC RESPONSE IS
17 A PART OF AND WILL INFLUENCE, BUT I THINK THE CHALLENGE AND
18 THE SOLUTIONS ARE ALSO BIGGER THAN THAT, AND WE'RE DEFINITELY
19 WILLING TO WORK WITH MTC TO SEE HOW WE CAN BE HELPFUL. THAT
20 WAS A LONG RESPONSE, AND I APOLOGIZE, BUT I HOPE THAT GETS TO
21 SOME OF THE QUESTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, YOU KNOW, THERESE, THE ESSENCE
24 OF THE QUESTION S DO WE HAVE ENOUGH FLEXIBILITY TO DO WHAT YOU



July 14, 2021

1 JUST SAID, IN THIS PLAN? THAT'S WHAT I WAS LOOKING FOR, AND
2 FROM WHAT YOU HEAR YOU SAYING, WE DO HAVE IT?

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WE DO HAVE IT, BUT I WOULD SAY THAT THE PLAN
5 CAN CONTRIBUTE TOWARDS SOME OF THE CHALLENGE THAT VTA HAS
6 OUTLINED. BUT I THINK WHAT, YOU KNOW, CINDY'S QUESTION OF, YOU
7 KNOW, HOW ARE WE, AS, YOU KNOW, A COUNTY SYSTEM, REALLY GOING
8 TO SURVIVE IN THE LONGER TERM, THAT MAY INVOLVE MORE THAN THE
9 CAPACITY WE HAVE, WITH THE ARP. AND THAT'S WHERE I THINK WE
10 NEED TO HAVE A MUCH DEEPER DISCUSSION WITH THE NEW GM AND
11 OTHERS TO SEE WHAT IS THAT SCALE, AND WHAT ARE THE OTHER TOOLS
12 AVAILABLE THAT THE REGION MIGHT BRING TO BEAR TO HELP.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
15 CHAIR PEDROZA?

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBIT. I CONCUR WITH WHAT
18 COMMISSIONER SPERING WAS MENTIONING AND KIND OF WHAT THERESE
19 SUMMARIZED, REACHING OUT. THE REASON WE DOES THE WORKSHOPS, AT
20 THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE COMMITTEE WAS TO
21 ACCOMPLISH THIS TO UNDERSTAND THE UNIQUE CHALLENGES OPERATORS
22 ARE FACING. OBVIOUSLY WE WOULD BENEFIT, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ,
23 FROM UNDERSTANDING YOUR SITUATION FURTHER, AND COMMISSIONER
24 ABE-KOGA WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT RESOURCES WE HAVE TO
25 ACCOMPLISH, I'M VERY INTERESTED IN TRYING TO UNDERSTAND THAT



July 14, 2021

1 MORE AND THERESE, IF WE CAN REACH OUT TO THE NEW EXECUTIVE
2 DIRECTOR, UNDERSTANDS THEIR CHALLENGES UNIQUELY AND WHAT
3 RESOURCES ARE AVAILABLE OUT THERE. I THINK THAT'S A GREAT NEXT
4 STEP. AND I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND ABE-KOGA FOR
5 RAISING THAT ISSUE AND UNDERSTANDING THAT WE'RE ALL FACING
6 ADVERSITY DIFFERENTLY SOME ARE RECOVERING GREAT SOME ARE NOT
7 AND ALL OPERATORS RECOVERY WE SHOULD THINK ABOUT THE NEXT
8 STEPS AND KEEPING FLEXIBILITY BUT TO POINT TO UNDERSTANDING
9 THERE IS A RESOURCE WE HAVE IN TERMS OF WHAT WE CAN DO BUT
10 THERE IS A DEEPER QUESTION IN THAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ RAISED.
11 THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I CONCUR, SOME OF
14 THOSE QUESTIONS HAVE BEEN AROUND FOR A WHILE, AND WE NEED TO
15 MAKE SURE THAT WE KIND OF FOLLOW-THROUGH THAT. WITH WHAT'S IN
16 FRONT OF US, I THINK THAT -- AND I KNOW THAT VICE CHAIR PAPAN
17 HAS A HARD STOP COMING UP AND SHE WANTS TO MAKE SURE SHE CAN
18 COMMENT ON THE NEXT ITEM. LOOKING FOR ANY LAST COMMENTS THAT
19 NEED TO BE SAID ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM. I BELIEVE WHAT I'M
20 HEARING IN TERMS WHATEVER PROPOSE, ALIX CORRECT ME IF I AM
21 WRONG, THE SET-ASIDE WILL COME TO US IN SEPTEMBER THAT GETS
22 CARRIED THROUGH THE QUICK STRIKE WE'LL LEAVE THAT TO YOU BUT I
23 THINK THAT'S WHAT I'M HEARING IN CONCURRENCE OF THE COMMITTEE
24 AND I AM UNDERSTANDING THAT THE 10% SET-ASIDE FOR SOME OF
25 THESE ISSUES WE HAVE BEEN IDENTIFYING OBVIOUSLY THE BIGGEST



July 14, 2021

1 REALLY ARE THE ACTUAL NUMBERS AND REFLECTED DISTRIBUTION AND
2 ALLOCATION. I THINK WITH THE SEPARATE TRANSIT AGENCIES THE
3 CHALLENGES ARE DIFFERENT FOR EACH ONE WHETHER IT'S SONOMA
4 COUNTY TRANSIT, OBVIOUSLY AS A SUPERVISOR, SMART COMMUTER RAIL
5 OF WHICH I CHAIR, OR GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT, WHICH I AM THE CHAIR
6 OF FINANCE O ALL HAVE DIFFERENT ISSUES THAT THEY'RE DEALING
7 WITH ON DIFFERENT SCALES AND IT GOES TO THE STAFF'S TRYING TO
8 FIND THAT SWEET SPOT WHICH THEY DO SO WELL, BUT IT'S ALSO,
9 OBVIOUSLY, EVERY AGENCY COULD USE MORE MONEY. YOU KNOW?
10 THAT'S A GIVEN. AND REALLY FINDING HOW WE MOVE FORWARD ON
11 THAT. BUT AS LONG AS WE HAVE THAT FLEXIBLE BUILT IN, I'M
12 CERTAINLY GOOD GOING FORWARD. SO, I APPRECIATE ALL THE
13 COMMENTS, AND I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** APPROVAL.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER] THERE IS A MOTION -- I'LL TAKE
18 THAT AS A MOTION FROM PAPAN, AND A SECOND FROM?

19

20 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** RONEN.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** RONEN. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND WITH
23 THAT, IF EVERYONE IS OKAY TAKING THAT -- CARRYING THAT FORWARD
24 WITH THE IDEA THAT, THAT 10% WILL BE FIGURED OUT WITH SOME OF
25 THESE ISSUES THAT HAVE, KIND OF, PERCOLATED UP, AND WE'LL DEAL



July 14, 2021

1 WITH THESE ISSUES AS WE GO FORWARD, BUT IT WOULD BE GOOD TO
2 GET THIS THING APPROVED TODAY, PASSED ON TO THE COMMISSION AND
3 HAVE THAT DISCUSSION PERHAPS A LITTLE MORE IN THE FUTURE. WITH
4 THAT, CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WITH THE MOTION BY PAPAN, A SECOND BY
7 RONEN. ABE-KOGA? [ROLL CALL VOTE]. MOTION PASSES WITH FOUR
8 AYES, TWO NAYS, AND ONE ABSTENTION AND ONE ABSENT.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE VERY MUCH THE DISCUSSION.
11 THANK YOU EVERYONE. AND I TOTALLY GET WHERE PEOPLE ARE COMING
12 FROM. AND WE JUST HAVE -- WE'LL HAVE CONTINUING ONGOING
13 DISCUSSIONS AND CONVERSATIONS TO TRY TO FIGURE THAT PATH
14 FORWARD. WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM 3B WHICH IS THE ONE
15 BAY AREA GRANT CYCLE THREE. STAFF IS GOING TO GIVE AN OVERVIEW
16 OF THE OBAG THREE INITIAL PROGRAM CONSIDERATIONS AND SCHEDULE
17 FOR COMMITTEE DISCUSSION AND FEEDBACK. SINCE COMMISSIONER
18 PAPAN NEEDS TO LEAVE, SHE HAS COMMENTS TO MAKE IF WE COULD
19 HEAR HER COMMENTS FIRST AND THEN HEAR FROM MALLORY IF THAT'S
20 OKAY?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GREATLY APPRECIATE T FIRST
23 AND FOREMOST, MY JURISDICTION, SPECIFICALLY, APPRECIATES THE
24 ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE GIVEN HERE, RATHER THAN TARGETS, AS A
25 BEST WAY TO IMPLEMENT THE REGION'S VISION, AS WELL AS MEETING



July 14, 2021

1 EACH COUNTY'S PRIORITIES AS WE MOVE FORWARD HERE. WE WOULD
2 LIKE TO SEE -- OR CONTINUE ALLOWING THE COUNTIES TO DEFINE
3 PROXIMATE ACCESS TO THE PDAS. OUR COUNTY HAS ABOUT 22 OF THEM,
4 AND THEY'RE LARGELY LINEAR. SO, ALONG CALTRAIN, AND EL CAMINO,
5 WE NEED TO DEFINE THE DEFINITION OF PROXIMATE ACCESS THAT
6 ALLOWS US TO INVEST IN HOW RESIDENTS AND EMPLOYEES GET TO AND
7 FROM THE PDAS AND IN BETWEEN. AND A SECOND POINT HERE, WE
8 WOULD LIKE TO SEE -- AND I THINK THIS IS KIND OF ALONG THE
9 LINES WITH MOST OF THE COUNTIES HERE -- THAT THE COUNTY SHARE
10 BE 50%, INSTEAD OF THE CURRENT DESIGNATION, WHICH I BELIEVE IS
11 45/55. WE CAN REALLY PUT THE 2050 PLAN PRINCIPLES TO USE IF WE
12 HAVE THAT FLEXIBILITY AND GET THE 50%. AND, AS A FINAL NOTE,
13 WE SUPPORT FLEXIBILITY FOR THE CTAS, WHICH, WE HOPE IN THE
14 FUTURE WILL INCLUDE GREEN INFRASTRUCTURE GOALS OR CRITERIA.
15 AND THAT'S IT THANK YOU SO MUCH MR. CHAIR. I JUST NEEDED TO
16 GET THAT ON THE RECORD.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WE APPRECIATE THAT, AND THANK YOU. AND
19 THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR THAT INDULGENCE. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT
20 OVER TO MS. ATKINSON FOR HER PRESENTATION.

21

22 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH COMMISSIONERS. I'LL I'LL
23 BE GIVING A PRESENTATION ON THE COMMITTEE POLICY INVESTMENT
24 PRIORITIES FOR THE NEXT CYCLE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM. WE
25 HAVE A PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS A REMINDER AND TO



July 14, 2021

1 SET THE CONTEXT FOR THIS PROGRAM, THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT OR
2 OBAG PROGRAM IS THE POLICY FRAMEWORK THAT THE COMMISSION HAS
3 USED IN RECENT YEARS TO DISTRIBUTE THE REGION'S SHARES OF
4 FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION FUNDS SPECIFICALLY FROM THE
5 SURFACE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM AND THE CONGESTION MITIGATION
6 QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM OR CMAQ. THE PROGRAM FRAMEWORK
7 DOES PROVIDE THE COMMISSION WITH A VALUABLE OPPORTUNITY TO USE
8 THESE FLEXIBLE FUNDS TO TACKLE SEVERAL INTERCONNECTED REGIONAL
9 OBJECTIVES, HOWEVER THESE SPECIFIC FEDERAL FUND SOURCES
10 ACCOUNT FOR ONLY A SMALL SHARE OF THE AVAILABLE REVENUES OR
11 1.3% OF ALL TRANSPORTATION REVENUES PLANNED FOR PLANNED BAY
12 AREA 2050. SO THEREFORE IT'S IMPORTANT TO THINK OF THE ROLE
13 OF THE OBAG PROGRAM AS ONE PART OF A COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL
14 INVESTMENT STRATEGY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR CONTEXT, AS A
15 REMINDER, WHAT WE HAVE DONE FOR THE OBAG PROGRAM FOR THE LAST
16 TWO CYCLES WHEN WE REFER TO THE OBAG PROGRAM IT REFERS TO THE
17 COUNTY PROGRAM TO INVEST IN COMMUNITY-BASED PRESERVATION
18 PROJECTS TO REINFORCE OUR REGIONAL GROWTH OBJECTIVES BUT ALSO
19 A REGIONAL PROGRAM WITH FUNDING FOR NEW INITIATIVES AND PILOTS
20 AND PROJECTS THAT ARE WELL SUITED FOR REGION-WIDE
21 IMPLEMENTATION AND ALL COMPONENTS HAVE WORKED TOGETHER TO
22 SUPPORT OUR PLANNED BAY AREA. LOOKING AT THE COUNTY PORTION OF
23 THE PROGRAM SPECIFICALLY WITHIN THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT CYCLE
24 THE HOUSING FOCUS WOVEN THROUGHOUT THIS PROGRAM WITH THE
25 HOUSING FACTORS INCLUDED IN THE FORMULA FOR DISTRIBUTING FUNDS



July 14, 2021

1 BETWEEN COUNTIES YOU CAN SEE IN THE PIE CHART TOP RIGHT WITH
2 RHNA AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION INCLUDED IN
3 DISTRIBUTION HOUSING AUTHORITY INCLUDED IN THE SCORING
4 CRITERIA USED TO EVALUATE PROJECTS AND CTAS REQUIRED TO FOCUS
5 INVESTMENTS WITHIN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS WITHIN EACH
6 COUNTY AND IMPORTANTLY WITHIN THE COUNTY PROGRAM IT REQUIRES
7 CITIES TO DEMONSTRATE COMPLIANCE WITH PRIORITY STATE HOUSING
8 LAWS IN ORDER TO MAINTAIN ELIGIBILITY FOR PROGRAM FUNDING.
9 ANOTHER IMPORTANT PROGRAM OR ELEMENT OF THE COUNTY PROGRAM IS
10 THE UNIQUE AND VALUABLE PARTNERSHIP THAT WE HAVE WITH OUR
11 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES, THE CTAS THROUGH WHICH WE HAVE
12 GIVEN THEM FLEXIBILITY TO IDENTIFY AND RECOMMEND WITHIN THOSE
13 PROJECTS WITHIN THEIR COUNTIES THAT BEST SUPPORT OUR REGIONAL
14 OBJECTIVES WHILE ALSO MEETING THEIR LOCAL COMMUNITY NEEDS.
15 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ON TO THE REGIONAL PROGRAM WITHIN THE OBAG
16 TWO. THESE FUNDS ARE USED TO ADVANCE PROGRAMS THAT DIRECTLY
17 ADDRESS OUR PLAN GOALS AND REQUIREMENTS FOR FOCUSED GROWTH AND
18 EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS. SPECIFICALLY THROUGH THE CLIMATE
19 INITIATIVES PROGRAM, ADDITIONAL PDA PLANNING AND INVESTMENT IN
20 PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREAS, AND LAUNCHING INNOVATIVE EFFORTS
21 ON THE HOUSING FRONT, AND WITHIN OBAG TWO, THAT WAS USED TO
22 LAUNCH OUR HOUSING INCENTIVE POOL, AND ALSO THE BAY AREA
23 PRESERVATION PILOT. THE REGIONAL PROGRAM ALSO FOCUSES ON
24 MAKING PROGRESS ON OTHER PLAN STRATEGIES AT A REGIONAL SCALE
25 SUCH AS BART CAR REPLACEMENTS, CLIPPER AND VARIOUS BRIDGE



July 14, 2021

1 FORWARD INVESTMENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO AT THE CURRENT O
2 BAG TWO FRAMEWORK IN MIND SHIFTING AHEAD TO LOOK AT THE NEXT
3 CYCLE RECOGNIZING THAT A LOT HAS CHANGED SINCE THE PROGRAM WAS
4 ADOPTED WE HAVE IDENTIFIED SEVERAL OVERARCHING CONSIDERATIONS
5 TO GUIDE THE DEVELOPMENT OF OBAG THREE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO
6 FIRST OFF, STAFF RECENTLY COMPLETED A COMBINED ASSESSMENT OF
7 OUR PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND ONE BAY AREA GRANT, WHICH
8 CONCLUDED WITH THE RECOMMENDATIONS TO CONTINUE GOING FORWARD
9 WITH AN OVERALL APPROACH TO FOCUS OUR INVESTMENTS IN PRIORITY
10 GROWTH AREAS. AND TO GIVE MORE TIME TO ALLOW FOR AN EVALUATION
11 OF HOW EFFECTIVE THAT MIGHT BE OVER A LONGER TIME PERIOD. AND
12 ALSO TO CONTINUE TO LEVERAGE PROGRAM FUNDING AS A MECHANISM TO
13 ENCOURAGE JURISDICTIONS TO ADOPT PRIORITY POLICIES, AND IN THE
14 PAST WE HAVE DONE THAT TO ENCOURAGE CITIES TO COMPLY WITH
15 EXISTING STATE LAWS AND STATE DIRECTIVES. THE STUDY ALSO
16 RECOMMENDS TO STRENGTHEN THE EFFECTIVENESS OF FUTURE CYCLES BY
17 ESTABLISHING CLEAR GOALS FOR THE OVERALL PROGRAM AT THE OUTSET
18 WHICH WILL ALLOW US TO BETTER EVALUATE THE SUCCESS OF OUR
19 PROGRAM AND THEN WITHIN THE COUNTY SIDE, TO STANDARDIZE HOW
20 COUNTIES EVALUATE -- OR STANDARDIZE THE EVALUATION PROJECT
21 PROCESSES BETWEEN EACH COUNTY AND THERE IS ADDITIONAL
22 INFORMATION ON THE RECOMMENDATION TO FINDINGS FROM THE STUDY
23 INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ANOTHER
24 CONSIDERATION IS WITH THE ADOPTION OF THE NEW PLAN IN THE NEXT
25 COMING MONTHS THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM NEEDS TO CONSIDER WHAT



July 14, 2021

1 CHANGES MIGHT BE NEEDED TO SUPPORT OUR STANDING PLANS AND
2 PRIORITIES MAINTAINING OPTIMIZING EXISTING TRANSPORTATION
3 SYSTEM BUT ALSO ADAPT TO NEW STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN THE PLAN
4 SUCH AS CLIMATE ADAPTATION AND RESILIENCE. AND OF COURSE A
5 SINGLE PROGRAM LIKE ABAG WILL BE INSUFFICIENT TO MAKE PROGRESS
6 ON ANY ONE STRATEGY LET ALONE 35 STRATEGIES THE PROGRAM CAN
7 PLAY AN IMPORTANT ROLE IN ITS FOCUS AND COMPLEMENT WITH OTHER
8 SOURCES AS PART OF THE OVERALL STRATEGY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
9 THE COMMISSION HAS UNDER TAKEN SEVERAL MAJOR POLICY INITIATIVE
10 IN CONSIDERATION WITH OBAG THREE DEVELOPMENT OF DIRECTION AND
11 CONNECTING TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO HOUSING AND THE ADOPTION OF
12 A REGIONAL SAFETY EFFICIENCY ERA POLICY AND EQUITY PLATFORM
13 AND RECENT APPROVAL OF THE EXPRESS LANE STRATEGIC PLAN AND
14 FORTHCOMING TRANSIT TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN IN ADDITION
15 VARIOUS POLICY INITIATIVES IN MOBILITY LANDSCAPE OF THE BAY
16 AREA HAVE CHANGED AND WE'LL NEED TO CONSIDER CHANGES IN THE
17 EXISTING PROGRAM TO ADAPT TO THOSE CHANGING TRAVEL BEHAVIORS
18 TO MEET THE NEEDS OF RESIDENTS AND COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT THE
19 PANDEMIC AND THEN AFTER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE OBAG THREE
20 PROGRAM PROVIDES OPPORTUNITY TO ADVANCE EQUITY BY INVESTING
21 OUR RESOURCES THROUGH THE PROGRAM AT A MEANINGFUL SCALE TO
22 ADDRESS OR TO SUPPORT TO SYSTEMATICALLY AND UNDERSERVED
23 MARGINALIZED GROUPS TO ADVANCE THE VALUES OF OUR EQUITY
24 PLATFORM A CONSIDERATION EVER EQUITY WILL BE NEEDED TO BE
25 WOVEN THROUGHOUT THE PROGRAM IN PROGRAMS REGIONALLY AND COUNTY



July 14, 2021

1 INVESTMENTS AND POLICIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND FINALLY MTC'S
2 FEDERAL RECERTIFICATION REVIEW LAST YEAR HIGHLIGHTED A NEED TO
3 DEMONSTRATE THAT OUR PROCESSES FOR THE OBAG PROGRAM FOR
4 PROGRAMMING OF STP AND CMAQ FUNDS ARE CONSISTENT WITH FEDERAL
5 REQUIREMENTS. WE BELIEVE MUCH OF THIS CAN BE ADDRESSED THROUGH
6 IMPROVED DOCUMENTATION AND CLARIFICATION OF OUR PROGRAM
7 PROCESSES. HOWEVER WE WILL NEED TO CONSIDER SOME CHANGES IN
8 FOUNDERING DISTRIBUTION AND PROJECT SELECTION PROCESSES. NEXT
9 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WITH THAT CONTEXT OF THE EXISTING OBAG
10 FRAMEWORK AND THE KEY CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE HAVE BEEN
11 THINKING THROUGH THIS SPRING, WE ARE ASKING FOR COMMISSION
12 INPUT AND DIRECTION IN A FEW YEARS WHICH WE'RE POSING TO YOU
13 TODAY AS A SET OF QUESTIONS 50 QUESTION IS FOCUSED ON A SET OF
14 POLICY PRIORITIES WHICH AIM TO GET AT WHAT ARE THE KEY
15 PRIORITIES AND DESIRED OUTCOMES FOR THE COMMISSION FOR THE
16 NEXT OBAG PROGRAM, WHAT ARE THE ELEMENTS OF THE EXISTING
17 FRAMEWORK OBAG SHOULD WORK TO CONTINUE AND SHOULD BE
18 EMPHASIZED AND HOW BEST TO INCREASE OUR PRIORITY OUTCOMES
19 THROUGH OUR SHARED REGIONAL COUNTY FRAMEWORK AND PARTNERSHIP
20 WITH OUR CTAS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SHIFTS TO QUESTIONS TO
21 DEAL WITH OBAG IN CONTEXT IN TERMS OF OTHER OR FUTURE
22 REVENUES. HOW SHOULD COMPLIMENTARY REVENUE SOURCES INFLUENCE
23 THE PRIORITIES FOR OBAG AND DOES THE INFLUX OF ARP FUNDING OR
24 THE UPCOMING, TO BE DISTRIBUTED STATE SURPLUS, DO THOSE CHANGE
25 THE PRIORITIES FOCUS FOR OBAG THREE? AND WITH A NEW FEDERAL



July 14, 2021

1 SURFACE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORIZATION IN THE WORKS, HOW SHOULD
2 ANY ADDITIONAL FUNDING PROGRAMS DISTRIBUTED TO THE REGION
3 EITHER THROUGH NEW FEDERAL PROGRAMS OR INCREASED REVENUE
4 LEVELS HOW SHOULD THOSE BE LEVERAGED THROUGHOUT OBAG PROGRAM
5 EITHER THROUGH NEW PROGRAMS THAT ARE ALREADY IN THE PROGRAM OR
6 STRATEGIC INCREASES TO THE EXISTING PROGRAMS. AND FINALLY A
7 NOTE THAT ONGOING EFFORTS THROUGH OBAG AS WELL AS ANY NEW
8 INITIATIVE THAT IS PRIORITIZED BY THE COMMISSION WILL NEED
9 SUSTAINABLE STAFFING LEVELS IN ORDER TO BE EFFECTIVE GOING
10 FORWARD. SO THE LAST SLIDE, PLEASE? I'LL CONCLUDE MY PORTION
11 OF THIS PRESENTATION WITH A LOOK AHEAD AT THE SCHEDULE FOR THE
12 DEVELOPMENT OF THE FRAMEWORK. WITH YOUR INPUT TODAY, AND
13 ADDITIONAL ENGAGEMENT WITH OUR PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS
14 THROUGHOUT THE SUMMER, STAFF WILL DEVELOP A DRAFT FRAMEWORK TO
15 BRING BACK TO THE COMMISSION THIS FALL -- WE'RE TARGETING
16 OCTOBER -- WITH A PROGRAM ADOPTION IN DECEMBER. AS A
17 REMINDER, THIS ITEM TODAY IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY. BUT WE ARE
18 ASKING FOR YOUR FEEDBACK AND INPUT ON THE INVESTMENT AND
19 POLICY PRIORITIES THAT WE SHOULD BE FOCUSING ON AND DEVELOPING
20 THE OBAG THREE FRAMEWORK. WITH THAT, I OPEN IT UP FOR
21 DISCUSSION.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE
24 THAT. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES. TO SEE IF THERE ARE
25 QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, OR CONCERNS? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?



July 14, 2021

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I'M WONDERING,
3 BASED ON THE COMMENTS THEY KNOW COMMISSIONER -- OUR EARLIER
4 COMMISSIONER MADE BEFORE SHE LEFT -- COULD YOU TALK ABOUT THE
5 ISSUES SHE RAISED RELATIVE TO THE PROXIMITY OF PDAS AND MAYBE
6 HELP US UNDERSTAND MORE ABOUT WHAT SHE WAS RAISING AND WHETHER
7 OR NOT THAT'S AN ISSUE THAT YOU'RE SEEING IN THE NINE BAY AREA
8 COUNTIES OVERALL?

9

10 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** THE ONE ISSUE THAT THE COMMISSIONER RAISED
11 ABOUT ALLOWING COUNTIES TO CONTINUE TO DEFINE PROXIMITY
12 ACCESS. CURRENT PROGRAM FRAMEWORK REQUIRES EACH COUNTY TO
13 FOCUS THEIR INVESTMENTS WITHIN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND
14 THE COUNTY IS GIVEN A TARGET FOR HOW MUCH THEY NEED TO INVEST
15 IN THOSE AREAS PART OF THAT IS EACH COUNTY IS GIVEN
16 OPPORTUNITY TO DEFINE FOR PROJECTS THAT AREN'T DIRECTLY
17 LOCATED IN A PDA TO DEFINE OTHER PROJECTS THAT SUPPORT A PDA
18 BY IMPROVING PROXIMITY OR PROVIDE PROXIMITY ACCESS TO PDA, THE
19 DEFINITION FOR HOW TO DECIDE WHETHER A PROJECT SHOULD BE
20 COUNTED FOR SUPPORTING A PDA TARGET, AND WE HAVE HEARD SIMILAR
21 FEEDBACK FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY AND OTHER COUNTIES, BUT IT IS
22 SOMETHING THAT WE THINK THAT WE NEED TO STANDARDIZE IN ORDER
23 TO BETTER EVALUATE OUR -- THE PROGRAM'S EFFECTIVENESS GOING
24 FORWARD. SO WE ARE HOPING TO WORK WITH OUR CTA PARTNERS TO



July 14, 2021

1 COME UP WITH A DEFINITION FOR WHAT PROJECTS PROVIDE IMPROVED
2 ACCESS TO PDAS THAT WE CAN ALL AGREE ON.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WONDERED. I WAS READING A STUDY -- THIS MIGHT
5 HAVE BEEN I DON'T KNOW IF IT WAS PRECOVID OR POST-COVID BUT
6 IT'S A LITTLE BIT ABOUT HOW FAR PEOPLE ARE WALKING BASED ON
7 USING ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, BASED ON THE ACCESS POINTS, YOU
8 KNOW, WHETHER THAT'S TRAILS OR BRIDGES OR THAT KIND OF
9 CONNECTION. AND I WONDERS IF THERE IS ANY -- FOR LACK OF A
10 BETTER WORD "ACCEPTED RESEARCH" ON THE -- ON HOW FAR SOMEONE
11 REALLY WILL GO IF THE TRAIL IS IMPROVED OR THE WALKWAY IS
12 IMPROVED OR THE LIGHTS ARE SIGNALIZED. SOMETHING THAT WILL
13 GIVE US A LITTLE MORE OBJECTIVE. YEAH, OBJECTIVE OF FRAMEWORK.
14 AND PART OF THE REASON I'M ASKING THE QUESTION IS, IN SOME OF
15 THE AREAS THAT WE HAVE BUILT OUT IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WHERE
16 WE HAVE SEEN A LOT OF DENSITY, WE HAVE HAD GREAT DENSITY, GOOD
17 PROXIMITY, BUT NOT GREAT ACCESS. RIGHT? SO, DAVID, AS AN
18 ARCHITECT, YOU HAVE PROBABLY HEARD THAT, WHERE SOMEONE
19 SINGLING THAT THE OUTCOME IS GOING TO BE PEOPLE WILL EASILY
20 CROSS FROM THIS POINT TO GET TO ANOTHER POINT AND I DO NOT
21 NECESSARILY SEE EVIDENCE OF THAT WITH THE DESIGN RELATED
22 QUESTION IF THERE ARE ANY STANDARDS AROUND THAT?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** I AM SURE THERE ARE AND WE'LL DEFINITELY LOOK AT
25 THOSE STANDARDS LOCKE WE HAVE USED STANDARDS IN THE PAST FOR



July 14, 2021

1 OUR TOD POLICY BUT YOUR QUESTION IS AROUND WHETHER OR NOT
2 THERE IS NEWER INFORMATION WITH THE MOBILITY OPTIONS AND
3 HAVING JUST BEEN THROUGH A PANDEMIC IS THERE SORT OF EVOLVING
4 DATA THAT WOULD SUGGEST THAT PEOPLE ARE WILLING TO GO FURTHER.
5 WE CAN CERTAINLY LOOK INTO THAT. WE HAVE USED LITERATURE IN
6 THE PAST, BUT I THINK THE QUESTION OF WHETHER THE ACCEPTABLE
7 LENGTH HAS GOTTEN LONGER IS A GOOD ONE THAT WE CAN LOOK INTO.

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YOU KNOW, ALIX, PART OF WHAT MADLY THINK ABOUT
10 IT IS HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE USING MOTORIZED BIKES NOW AND
11 MOTORIZED SCOOTERS WHICH ARE DIFFERENCE THAN REGULAR PEDALS.
12 THAT WOULD BE GREAT. AND MY OTHER QUESTION S WHAT IS THE
13 SERIES OF TOOLS USED TO ASSESS WHETHER OR NOT WE ARE IN FACT
14 ADVANCING EQUITY. AND WHAT I REALLY WANT TO UNDERSTAND IS, HOW
15 DO YOU TAKE WHAT YOU KNOW ABOUT A REGION IN ADVANCE OF ANY
16 IMPROVEMENTS TO DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT THE PROJECT ENHANCES
17 EQUITY. AND THEN AGAIN, WHAT IS -- AGAIN, ARE THERE
18 MEASUREMENTS THAT YOU'RE USING THAT ARE RELATIVELY STANDARD
19 FOR POST AND IMPROVEMENT?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I THINK YOU RAISED REALLY GREAT QUESTIONS. I DON'T
22 THINK WE HAVE A LOT OF TOOLS FOR ACCESSING, ESPECIALLY ON THE
23 PROGRAMMATIC SIDE, THE EQUITY IMPACTS OF THE PROGRAM WE DO
24 KNOW THAT INVESTING WITHIN AND SUPPORTING THE COMMUNITY-BASED
25 TRANSPORTATION PLANS AND THEN ACTUALLY INVESTING IN BUILDING



July 14, 2021

1 OUT THOSE PLANS IS ONE WAY THAT WE CAN SUPPORT EQUITY, BUT
2 THERE IS A LACK OF GOOD TOOLS TO EVALUATE THE EQUITY OUTCOMES
3 OF -- ESPECIALLY THE SMALLER SIZED PROJECTS THAT WE SEE IN THE
4 OBAG PROGRAM.

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ONE RECOMMENDATION I WOULD MAKE, AND I DO NOT
7 HAVE AN ANSWER TO THIS. I'M NOT PROPOSING ONE, I WAS
8 INTERESTED BECAUSE I'M INTERESTED IN LEARNING ABOUT HOW
9 INVESTMENTS -- HOW OUR INVESTMENTS ARE IMPACTING ANTI-
10 STRATEGIES? YOU KNOW, THE RIPPLE EFFECTS TO THESE INVESTMENTS
11 THAT WE JUST NEED TO REALLY DEEPLY UNDERSTAND. AND I ASK IT
12 BECAUSE IT SEEMS TO ME ONE AREA THAT WEEKEND PERHAPS IMPROVE
13 IS IN MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE REALLY SPEAKING TO THE IMPACTED
14 COMMUNITIES. I LIKE ONE OF THE POINTS THAT YOU RAISED WAS
15 HAVING COMMUNITY SUPPORT FOR A PROJECT. IN SOME OF THE LOW-
16 INCOME AREAS THEY REPRESENT, GETTING COMMUNITY SUPPORT TAKES A
17 TON OF WORK, BECAUSE THE ENGAGEMENT LEVEL IS SO DRAMATICALLY
18 DIFFERENT, THAT EVEN THAT MAY NEGATE THE ABILITY -- YOU KNOW -
19 - THE ACTUAL EQUITY MEASURE, BECAUSE, REALLY, THE MEASURE S
20 ARE WE SPENDING THE TIME TO GET OUT TO THAT COMMUNITY TO EVEN
21 LIFT THAT PROJECT UP IN THE FIRST PLACE TO BRING IT FORWARD?
22 SO I JUST WANT US TO BE THINKING ABOUT WHO THE LEADERS ARE IN
23 THE DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES SO THAT WE CAN ASK QUESTIONS, AND
24 EVEN IF A SMALLER SEGMENT OF THEM WOULD BE QUANTITATIVE VERSUS
25 QUALITATIVE I'M ASKING BECAUSE I WANT TO KNOW IF YOU HAVE THE



July 14, 2021

1 PLAYBOOK I WOULD LOVE TO TAKE IT. I WOULD BE REALLY INTERESTED
2 IN LEARNING TOGETHER BECAUSE THE AIR QUALITY DISTRICT IS ALSO
3 DOING SOME REALLY INTERESTING WORK AROUND THIS SUBJECT AND
4 THEY'RE CREATING A WHOLE NEW BOARD TO ASSESS THIS AND I MIGHT
5 ROAM THERE WOULD BE VALUE IN BETTER UNDERSTANDING THE PROCESS
6 AND CREATING BOTH THE COMMITTEE AND VERONICA IS FABULOUS, AND
7 JUST WOULD BE A GOOD PARTNER TO THINK WHAT THEY'RE DOING.

8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** TO ADD ON TO A CRITICAL POINT, COMMISSIONER
11 CHAVEZ, YOU JUST RAISED, PARTICULARLY FOR SMALL INFRASTRUCTURE
12 THAT IS COMMUNITY ORIENTED, WHAT WE, AS PLANNERS THINK A
13 COMMUNITY NEEDS, MAY NOT BE WHAT THE COMMUNITY, ITSELF,
14 BELIEVES THAT IT NEEDS, FROM THEIR EXPERIENCE ON THE GROUNDS.
15 IT'S SOMETHING I FELT VERY DEEPLY AT LA METRO AND LEARNED A
16 LOT FROM THAT PROCESS, AND BASICALLY, THAT'S HOW WE LAUNCHED
17 THE EQUITY PLATFORM, IN MANY WAYS, FOR ME. TO YOUR POINT, JUST
18 MAKING SURE THAT, WITH INTENTION, THAT WE INVEST IN THE
19 OUTREACH AND THE ENGAGEMENT, SO WE CAN HEAR FROM COMMUNITY
20 MEMBERS THEMSELVES WHAT WORKS FOR THEM, PARTICULARLY THOSE WHO
21 HAVE NOT HAD A VOICE VERY OFTEN, IN THINGS LIKE
22 INFRASTRUCTURE, DESIGN, AND THE LIKE, OR ACCESS TO, YOU KNOW,
23 MORE TRADITIONAL WAYS OF DESIGNING PROJECTS, I THINK, IS
24 ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL TO INFUSING EQUITY IN THE PROCESSES THAT
25 YOU'RE SPEAKING TO.



July 14, 2021

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YEAH. AND ONE THING I'LL JUST SHARE WITH MY
3 COLLEAGUES, IF YOU WILL PERMIT ME, CHAIR, JUST AN EXPERIENCE
4 THAT WE HAD. WE BUILT OUT A BEAUTIFUL BILINGUAL BICULTURAL
5 LIBRARY IN A VERY, VERY GANG IMPACTED COMMUNITY. AND I WAS SO
6 EXCITED TO GO MEET THE NEIGHBORS, AND I WAS A BRAND-NEW
7 COUNCILMEMBER AND MY PREDECESSOR HAD WORKED ON IT, I WENT OUT
8 TO MEET WITH THE COMMUNITY TO ASK HOW DO YOU LIKE THE GRAND
9 OPENING AND THEY DECIDED TO BOYCOTT IT BECAUSE WHAT THEY HAD
10 ASKED THE CITY FOR WAS TO PUT IN PROPER DRAINAGE ON A STREET
11 THAT'S RIGHT NEXT TO THE LIBRARY, AND THAT IT DIDN'T DRAIN
12 PROPERLY, AND IT WAS THE MAIN INGRESS AND EGRESS TO THE SCHOOL
13 THAT WAS RIGHT BEHIND THIS LIBRARY AND IT WOULD HAVE BEEN THE
14 SECOND MAIN INGRESS TO THE PLAZA THAT WAS BUILT AND THEY
15 COULDN'T BELIEVE THAT THE CITY DIDN'T PUT IN THE PROPER
16 DRAINAGE. THEY WERE UPSET. AND FRANKLY ONCE WE GOT THAT FIX IT
17 WAS SEARCH A MINOR THING, THAT THEY FELT UNHEARD, EVEN THOUGH
18 THIS BIG INVESTMENT HAPPENED, THE CITY WAS, LIKE, WHY ARE THEY
19 SO UPSET. SO A LOT TO LEARN, THERESE, YOUR POINT IS REALLY
20 WELL TAKEN.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THAT VERY MUCH. AND I KNOW
23 STAFF RECEIVED A MEMO, AS WELL, FROM VICE CHAIR PAPAN. I THINK
24 IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, SHE NOTES THERE ARE 22PDAS THAT ARE
25 MOSTLY ALONG THE CALTRAIN AND EL CAMINO CORRIDOR SO HOW DO YOU



July 14, 2021

1 GET FROM ONE TO THE OTHER, WHICH IS INTERESTING, THERE ARE
2 MANY CORRIDORS AROUND THE ENTIRE BAY AREA THAT ARE SIMILAR
3 MAYBE FIRST THE PROFESSIONAL MIGHT DIFFERENT BUT IT'S AN
4 INTERESTING PIECE TO WORK ON. I ALWAYS SAY, I'M BIASED AS AN
5 ARCHITECT, THAT IF YOU MAKE IT WALKABLE AND BEAUTIFUL AND IT'S
6 SCENIC PEOPLE WILL WALK FURTHER, IF IT'S A HORRIBLE PLACE TO
7 BE THEY DO NOT WANT TO GO AT ALL. IT'S HUMAN NATURE. I
8 APPRECIATE THAT, PERSONALLY. AND COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I DON'T WANT TO INTERRUPT YOU.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WAS GOING TO RESPOND TO SOME OF THE
15 QUESTIONS YOU PUT OUT, MALLORY, I THINK THIS IS AN IN DEPTH
16 PRESENTATION, AND I HAVEN'T FULLY GONE THROUGH THE REPORT ON
17 THE PREVIOUS BACKGROUNDS, I THINK IT'S GREAT DOING THAT
18 ANALYSIS AND LEARNING FROM IT. I WANT TO REALLY ENCOURAGE TO
19 YOU KIND OF TAKE THE DIRECTION -- YOU KNOW, TO KIND OF OFFER
20 UP SOME OPTIONS, DIRECTIONS THAT WERE IN THE PRESENTATION
21 AROUND INCORPORATING EQUITY DEEPLY INTO THE PROCESS, SORT OF
22 DOING WHAT WE CAN TO MAKE SURE THAT OBAG THREE IS DRIVING PDA
23 OUTCOMES NOT JUST IN TERMS OF THE PROJECT FUNDING BUT THINGS
24 THAT HAVE HIGHLIGHTED SUCCESS AND THROW BACKS TO ENCOURAGE
25 COMMUNITIES TO DO THE RIGHT THING IN THIS ASPECT TO ACCESS



July 14, 2021

1 THIS FUNDING THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO EXTEND THAT AND THE
2 THINGS THAT COMMUNITIES WE NOW KNOW HAVE TO BE DOING IS LAID
3 OUT IN THE DRAFT PLAN ARE DIFFERENT THAN THEY WERE WHEN WE PUT
4 TOGETHER OBAG TWO. SO I HOPE WE CAN BE THOUGHTFUL AS TO HOW,
5 AND COLLABORATIVE IN SORT OF HOW WE UPDATE THAT. AND I THINK
6 THERE ARE SOME SPECIFIC PROGRAMS, YOU KNOW, THAT WORKED REALLY
7 WELL IN OBAG TWO. LIKE THE HIP PROGRAM THAT COMMISSIONER
8 SPERING AND I WORKED ON, AND OTHERS. AND I THINK, YOU KNOW,
9 IT'S JUST A REAL OPPORTUNITY TO CONTINUE, SORT OF, WORKING
10 WITH JURISDICTIONS TO HELP US, KIND OF JUST NOT JUST THINK
11 ABOUT TRANSPORTATION ON ITS OWN BUT THINKING ABOUT COMBINED
12 TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE AROUND ACHIEVING GOALS EQUITABLE
13 AND CLIMATE AND VMT REDUCTION, AND TRAFFIC CONGESTION ET
14 CETERA, IN THE PLAN. I THINK YOU'RE DOING ALL THE RIGHT WORK
15 IF WE COME BACK WITH SOMETHING THAT REFLECTS ALL THE THINGS
16 THAT WERE PUT UP IN THE SLIDE DECK.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT POINT. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANYTHING TO
19 OFFER? THE ONE LAST THING I WAS GOING TO SAY, I ALSO AGREE
20 WITH VICE CHAIR PAPAN. I SEE THAT THE OBAG ONE GRANT CYCLE
21 HAVE FOUR% OF THE COUNTIES, OBAG TWO HAD 45, I THINK WE SHOULD
22 CONTINUE THAT TREND AND HAVE OBAG BE 50. AND I'LL JUST PUT
23 THAT OUT THERE ON THAT PIECE. AND I ALSO THINK THAT OUR CTAS
24 ARE DOING, LIKE, MTC, ADOPTING A WHOLE NEW WORKLOAD THAT ALSO
25 NEEDS TO BE REFLECTED TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE BEST



July 14, 2021

1 INFORMATION AND COORDINATION AT THE LOCAL LEVEL, AS POSSIBLE,
2 AS WELL, TO BE ABLE TO PAY FOR. I APPRECIATE THAT. THIS IS AN
3 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. I'LL LOOK TO KIMBERLY TO SEE IF THERE IS
4 ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RANDI KINMAN HAS HER HAND RAISED AT THIS
7 TIME. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF, MS. KINMAN, YOU
8 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE POLICY
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL I WANT TO REINFORCE THE EQUITY ISSUE FROM ALL
12 LENSES. AND, I THINK THAT WE RECOGNIZE THAT DEVELOPMENT GOES
13 INTO ALREADY DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES QUITE OFTEN. AND WE
14 CAN'T JUST LOOK AT ACCESS TO TRANSIT. WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE
15 THAT ALL THE OTHER THINGS ARE AVAILABLE, CLOSE BY, OR WITHIN
16 THE PDAS THEMSELVES. I AM PERSONALLY SURROUNDED BY, 1, 2, 3,
17 4, PDAS THAT HAVE BEEN APPROVED, AND THAT ARE ONLINE. I HAVE
18 PROBABLY 30 TO 50,000 PEOPLE POTENTIALLY MOVING IN, BUSINESSES
19 MOVING IN. I HAVE NOT ONE SQUARE FOOT OF NEW PARK SPACE. FROM
20 AN EQUITY PERSPECTIVE, FROM A NEIGHBORHOOD THAT IS PRETTY
21 LARGE, THAT HAS NO PARK OR OPEN SPACE, THAT FORM OF LOOKING
22 THROUGH A LENS IS NOT PRESENT. AND I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE
23 THAT WE'RE REINFORCING THINGS LIKE PARKS, ACCESS TO GROCERY
24 STORES, ACCESS TO AMENITIES, AND THAT WE'RE NOT JUST CREATING
25 NEW STRIPS OF NEW DEVELOPMENT. THANK YOU.



July 14, 2021

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. KIMBERLY, I DON'T SEE ANY
3 HANDS RAISED ON OUR ATTENDEE LIST?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
6 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
7 ON THIS ITEM.

8

9 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AND, AGAIN, I WOULD JUST SAY THANK YOU
10 VERY MUCH, MALLORY, FOR THE GREAT WORK. I AGREE WITH
11 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IN TERMS OF APPLYING SOME OF THOSE
12 ISSUES THAT WE HAVE ALREADY KIND OF PUT FORWARD INTO THAT WORK
13 AND GOING FORWARD. VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THAT. THIS IS AN
14 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. SO, WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 4A,
15 THE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION UPDATE. KENNETH KAO
16 WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. KENNETH?

17

18 **KENNETH KAO:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT. KENNETH KAO WITH
19 PROGRAMMING STAFF HERE TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE CALIFORNIA
20 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THE CTC DID MEET JUNE 24TH AND 23RD
21 ONLINE, AND APPROVED A NUMBER OF ITEMS ONE OF WHICH WAS TO
22 APPROVE THE REGIONAL PROGRAMMING FOR THE FEDERAL COVID RELIEF
23 FUNDS. THE REGION GOT ABOUT \$65 MILLION OF THAT, AND THE
24 COMMISSION APPROVED MUCH OF THAT PROGRAMMING LAST MONTH, AND
25 THE CTC APPROVED THAT LAST MONTH AS WELL. THE CTC ALSO



July 14, 2021

1 APPROVED THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM, CYCLE FIVE, THE
2 REGIONAL PROGRAM THAT INCLUDED \$37 MILLION IN NEW FUNDING FOR
3 BAY AREA PROJECTS. AND WE'LL BE WORKING WITH ATP SPONSORS TO
4 DELIVER THOSE PROJECTS VERY SOON. AND I DID WANT TO MENTION
5 THAT THERE IS SOME -- AN APPROVAL IN THE STATE BUDGET OF
6 ADDITIONAL FUNDS, IN AUGMENTATION, THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
7 PROGRAM, THIS IS HOWEVER SUBJECT TO FUTURE LEGISLATION. MTC
8 STAFF IS WORK CLOSELY WITH CALTRANS AND CTC TO LOOK AT
9 ADDITIONAL PROGRAMS THAT COULD BE FUNDED PENDING THE
10 ADDITIONAL LEGISLATION TO ENABLE THE ADDITIONAL ATP
11 AUGMENTATION FUNDS. I WANT TO MENTION THAT AS PART OF THE
12 STATE BUDGET THE BUDGET INCLUDED A LARGE CHUNK OF NEW MONEYS
13 FOR THE STATE HIGHWAY OPERATIONS AND PROTECTION PROGRAM, OR
14 THE SHOP, STATE HIGHWAYS, AND I WANT TO MENTION THAT BAY AREA
15 TOLL AUTHORITY IS WORKING AND HAS SUBMITTED A LETTER TO THE
16 STATE REQUESTING ADDITIONAL FUNDS TO SUPPORT BRIDGE -- SORRY -
17 - BRIDGE MAINTENANCE PROJECTS WHICH ARE USUALLY FUNDED BY
18 TOLLS. BUT AS YOU KNOW TOLL REVENUE HAS BEEN IMPACTED BY
19 COVID-19, AND SO I UNDERSTAND BATA IS LOOKING FOR SOME
20 ADDITIONAL FUNDS, ADDITIONAL HELP FROM THE STATE, TO HELP WITH
21 THOSE PROJECTS. FINALLY, I DID WANT TO MENTION THAT THE 2020
22 -- EXCUSE ME -- THE 2022, STATE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT
23 PROGRAM, OR THE STIP, IS BEGINNING, AND IS UNDER WAY, THE
24 STATE DID RELEASE THE FUND ESTIMATE WHICH SHOWS ABOUT 96, \$97
25 MILLION IN ADDITIONAL FUNDS TO THE BAY AREA OVER THE NEXT FIVE



July 14, 2021

1 YEARS. SO WE'LL BE BRINGING AN ITEM BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE IN
2 SEPTEMBER WITH POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND ENVISIONING ON THE
3 PROGRAM FOR THESE FUNDS. WITH THAT THE NEXT MEETING OF THE CTC
4 WILL BE AUGUST 18TH AND 19TH TO BE HELD ONLINE, AND ALSO IN
5 SACRAMENTO. THANK YOU.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU KENNETH. APPRECIATE THAT.
8 QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, CONCERNS FROM ANYONE? ALWAYS APPRECIATE
9 THE UPDATE. I'LL ASK KIMBERLY IF THERE IS COMMENTS RECEIVED
10 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM OR THE LAST ONE OR IF THERE IS
11 PUBLIC COMMENT FROM ANYONE?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
15 ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE ON THEN
18 TO ITEM FIVE, WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS, AND
19 I'LL LOOK BACK TO KIMBERLY IF THERE IS ANYONE. ONE HAND
20 RAISED. KIMBERLY?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVING IN NO WRITING AND I SEE
23 ROLAND LEBRUN. PLEASE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE
24 TWO MINUTES.

25



July 14, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE PREFACE WHAT I'M
2 ABOUT TO SAY THAT I'M NOT COMFORTABLE WITH WHAT I'M ABOUT TO
3 SAY BUT HERE GOES ANYWAY. ESCHEWING VTA FROM ITS CURRENT
4 PREDICAMENT IS ONE THING, BUT RESCUING A FAILED \$10 BILLION
5 BART PROJECT IS AN ENTIRELY DIFFERENT PROPOSITION. SO TODAY I
6 AM RECOMMENDING THAT MTC INITIATE AN EXTERNAL MANAGEMENT AUDIT
7 OF THE AGENCY. AND THE AGENCY'S TEN YEAR CAPITAL PLAN, IN
8 PARTICULAR, SPECIFICALLY THE DECISION TO SELECT A FEDERAL
9 FUNDING PLAN FOR THE BART EXTENSION THAT REDUCES FEDERAL
10 PROJECT OVERSIGHT OF THE COST OF MAXIMUM 25% FEDERAL
11 CONTRIBUTION TO THE PROJECT. IN CLOSING, I BELIEVE THAT AT
12 THE END OF THE DAY, THIS AUDIT MAY WELL REVEAL SIGNIFICANT
13 ISSUES AT VTA. WHICH ARE LIKELY TO ULTIMATELY IMPACT TRANSIT
14 ACROSS THE ENTIRE REGION, NOT JUST SANTA CLARA COUNTY. I ALSO
15 BELIEVE THERE'S A REMOTE CHANCE OF SUCH AN AUDIT MIGHT REVEAL
16 THAT SUCH A TRAGEDY WAS A SYMPTOM OF INTERNAL PROBLEMS RATHER
17 THAN THE CAUSE OF THE COLLAPSE OF THE AGENCY. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS M CHAIR.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT
22 WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX, WHICH IS OUR
23 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND
24 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD
25 WEDNESDAY SEPTEMBER 8TH 9:45 A.M. REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST AS



July 14, 2021

1 APPROPRIATE DEPENDING ON THE STATUS OF SHELTER-IN-PLACE ORDERS
2 WE MUST BE GETTING CLOSE TO THAT POINT BEING BACK IN THE SAME
3 ROOM TOGETHER. VERY MUCH APPRECIATE AS ALWAYS STAFF'S GOODS
4 WORK AND FOR THE CONVERSATION AND DISCUSSION TODAY'S. OUR
5 MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [MEETING ADJOURNED]
6



Broadcasting Government