METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript





1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
3	MONDAY, JULY 19, 2021, 1:30 P.M.
4	
5	MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: GOOD AFTERNOON I'M MIKE HURSH CHAIR OF
6	THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE I AM JOINED BY VICE CHAIR
7	DENIS MULLIGAN. WE'LL CALL THE MEETING OF JULY 19TH FARE
8	INTEGRATION TASK FORCE TO ORDER. ROLL THE BROADCAST
9	ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
10	ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
11	AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S
12	EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF
13	THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
14	SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS,
15	STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK
16	CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR
17	REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH
18	THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE
19	VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
20	PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE
21	HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
22	THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL
23	BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.
24	IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
25	ORCANIZATION BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUMTARY





- 1 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY
- 2 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND
- 3 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF
- 4 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,
- 5 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR
- 6 ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT
- 7 THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

- 9 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: AND THANK YOU BROADCAST TEAM. MADAM
- 10 SECRETARY, CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL?

11

12 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YES. CHAIR HURSH?

13

14 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: PRESENT.

15

16 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR MULLIGAN?

17

18 DENIS MULLIGAN, V. CHAIR: PRESENT.

19

20 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MEMBER BOUCHARD?

21

22 **SPEAKER: PRESENT.**

23

24 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: GONOT? HALLS?





DARYL HALLS: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: KRANDA? BETH KRANDA: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MAU? CARTER MAU: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MCMILLAN? THERESE MCMILLAN: HERE. PERCENT? ROBERT POWERS: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: TREE? MICHAEL TREE: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: TUMLIN? JEFFREY TUMLIN: HERE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WE HAVE A QUORUM.





1 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU, MARTHA, APPRECIATE T JUST 2 3 REAL QUICK, WELCOME TO CAROLYN GONOT SANTA CLARA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION ANTICIPATE GENERAL ENERGY AND CHIEF EXECUTIVE 4 5 OFFICER MICHELLE SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSIT. WE'LL MOVE TO OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, APPROVAL OF THE MAY MINUTES MEETING. 6 7 8 JEFFREY TUMLIN: MOTION FOR APPROVAL. 9 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: TUMLIN, MAY I GET A SECOND? 10 11 MICHAEL TREE: SECOND. 12 13 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: MOTION BY TUMLIN SECOND BY TREE. MADAM 14 CHAIR ROLL CALL -- ACTUALLY I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC 15 16 COMMENT RECEIVED? 17 18 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. 20 21 22 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: NOW WE CAN GO TO THE ROLL CALL VOTE. 23 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: [ROLL CALL VOTE]. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 24

25

ALL MEMBERS PRESENT





- 2 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU MARTHA AND EVERYBODY FOR THE
- 3 QUICK VOTE. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR, THE PROJECT
- 4 UPDATE AND PATHWAY TO POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS. MR. BACON AND
- 5 MR. EISEMAN WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

- 7 WILLIAM BACON: GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR HURSH AND TASK FORCE
- 8 MEMBERS. BRING UP THE SLIDES PLEASE. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS
- 9 BILL BACON, MTC'S CO-PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE FARE COORDINATION
- 10 AND INTEGRATION STUDY, AND THIS AFTERNOON THE PROJECT TEAM IS
- 11 HERE TO PROVIDE A TASK FORCE UPDATE ON THE STUDY AND HELP
- 12 PREPARE FOR DISCUSSION AT YOUR NEXT MEETING FOR THE PROJECT'S
- 13 DRAFT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS. I'M GOING TO PROVIDE THE
- 14 FIRST PART OF THE PRESENTATION AND MY FELLOW PROJECT MANAGER
- 15 MIKE EISEMAN, FROM BART, WILL WALK US THROUGH SECOND PORTION
- 16 OF THE SET OF SLIDES. BEFORE I DIG INTO CONTENT FOR THIS
- 17 AFTERNOON'S PRESENTATION, I WANT LAY OUT KEY POINTS, THE
- 18 LATEST PROJECT SCHEDULE IS IMPORTANT ONGOING WORK AND ANALYSIS
- 19 ENABLING PROJECT TEAM TO BRING FORWARD DRAFT STUDY
- 20 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE TASK FORCE TO CONSIDER. INTRODUCING A
- 21 FRAMEWORK OF INTEGRATION TIERS WHICH WILL HELP PROVIDE
- 22 STRUCTURE TO FUTURE DISCUSSIONS OF STUDY RECOMMENDATIONS.
- 23 PROJECT IS APPROACHING BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS AND DETAILED
- 24 ROADMAP DELIVERING RECOMMENDATIONS. THE TEAM HAS HAD TO DELAY
- 25 THE DRAFT OF RECOMMENDATIONS BECAUSE OF THE NUMBER OF





- 1 CHALLENGES WE HAVE EXPERIENCED WITH THE TRAVEL MODELING AND
- 2 THE OPTIONS SITE. BOTH MIKE AND I DO NOT FEEL COMFORTABLE
- 3 BRINGING FORTH RECOMMENDATIONS UNTIL WE WERE SATISFIED WITH
- 4 THE STATE OF TECHNICAL ANALYSIS UNTIL WE RECEIVED ANSWERS TO
- 5 IMPORTANT QUESTIONS FROM THE TASK FORCE ABOUT HOW BENEFITS OF
- 6 FARE INTEGRATION STACK UP AGAINST OTHER INVESTMENTS. WITH OUR
- 7 REVISED PROJECT SCHEDULE WE INTEND TO PROVIDE A FIRST LOOK AT
- 8 DRAFT PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS TO OUR STAKEHOLDER COMMITTEE ON
- 9 AUGUST 2ND. BASED ON FEEDBACK FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE THE
- 10 PROJECT TEAM WILL PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE DRAFT FOR
- 11 YOUR DISCUSSION AND FEEDBACK SEPTEMBER 20TH PROJECT DRAFT AND
- 12 RECOMMENDATIONS. RIGHT NOUGHT PROJECT TEAM IS WORKING UNDER
- 13 THE ASSUMPTION THAT WE WILL PRESENT A FINAL SET OF
- 14 RECOMMENDATIONS AND OUR REPORT FOR THE TASK FORCE'S ADOPTION
- 15 ON OCTOBER 18TH. GOING ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS THIS
- 16 PROJECT HAS PROGRESSED OVER WHAT HAS BEEN THE MOST CHALLENGING
- 17 YEAR IN THE HISTORY OF MODERN PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THIS COUNTRY
- 18 ONE IMPORTANT THING THAT'S CENTRAL TO THE SCOPE OF OUR WORK
- 19 STANDS OUT THAT TRANSIT POLICY SHOULD ENCOURAGE TRANSIT USE
- 20 THAT FARE POLICY SHOULD COMPLEMENT OPERATIONAL INVESTMENT AND
- 21 TRANSIT NETWORK AS A WHOLE AND ENSURE FARE STRUCTURES AND
- 22 POLICIES OF THE BARE DO NOT CREATE BARRIERS TO TRAVEL THESE
- 23 THEMES IN OUR SCOPE ARE IMPORTANT TOUCH STONES FOR THE PROJECT
- 24 CONSULTANTS I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE THIS IS ONE OF THE
- 25 PRINCIPLES REASONS WE UNDERTOOK THIS STUDY. NEXT SLIDE. AS I





- 1 TOUCHED ON FARE POLICY IS ONE OF MANY ISSUES THAT IMPACTED THE
- 2 LEVEL OF TRANSIT USE KNOWLEDGE IN THE BAY AREA BOTH BEFORE THE
- 3 PANDEMIC AND OVER THE LAST 16 MONTHS. FARE POLICIES WE HAVE
- 4 TODAY ARE NOT THE RESULT OF RANDOM POLICY ACTIONS RATHER
- 5 REFLECT THE TRANSIT FUNDING AND DECISION MAKING MODELS IN THE
- 6 REGION WHICH INCENTIVIZE FARE POLICY AND LOCAL TRIPS OR WITHIN
- 7 SERVICE OF TRIPS OF A SINGLE OPERATOR. WE HAVE TOUCHED ON KEY
- 8 ISSUES, CUSTOMER VALUE, EXPERIENCE, TRANSIT, EQUITY, THESE
- 9 CORE ELEMENTS OF HOW THE TEAM WILL BE FRAMING OUR
- 10 RECOMMENDATIONS OVER THE NEXT -- THESE ARE CORE ELEMENTS OF
- 11 HOW THE CORE PROJECT WILL BE FRAMING OUR RECOMMENDATIONS OVER
- 12 THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS, IN ESSENCE HOW MIGHT A POTENTIAL
- 13 FARE POLICY ACTION ADDRESS THESE KEY ISSUES? EACH OF THESE
- 14 ISSUES IS LIKELY -- HAS LIKELY TAKEN ON EVEN MORE IMPORTANCE
- 15 BECAUSE OF THE ONGOING IMPACTS OF THE PANDEMIC IN OUR REGION.
- 16 NEXT SLIDE. FOR THIS SLIDE WANT TO SPEAK TO HOW THIS PROJECT
- 17 CAN REFORM AND INFLUENCE ACTIONS TO DELIVER TO USERS FIRST ON
- 18 THE LEFT ARE PRICE BARRIERS THE FIRST CONCEPT WE WANT TO
- 19 EMPHASIZE, AND WHENEVER LEVEL OF OVERALL COST RECOVERY WE'RE
- 20 TARGETING WE WANT A FARE STRUCTURE THAT MAXIMIZING
- 21 COMPETITIVENESS FOR ALL TYPES OF TRIPS WE WANT IT TO BE
- 22 CONVENIENT. IF A FARE STRUCTURE ELIMINATES PRICE BARRIERS THIS
- 23 SHOULD SHOW UP IN OUR MODELING RESULTS. NEXT HERE IS
- 24 LEARNABILITY AND LEGIBILITY. THE SECOND -- OUR OVERALL TRANSIT
- 25 -- I GUESS WHAT I'M TRYING TO SAY IS OUR OVERALL TRANSIT





- 1 SYSTEM IS EASY TO LEARN AND EASY TO UNDERSTAND IN ADOPTION OF
- 2 TRANSIT AND FREQUENCY, HOW IMPORTANT IS IT FOR LEARNING
- 3 ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY FOR RIDERS TO UNDERSTAND THE FARE
- 4 SYSTEM AND WAYFINDING. WE HAVE RECEIVED ARTICULATED DIFFERENT
- 5 VIEWS, THE LEARN ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY BENEFITS OF OUR FARE
- 6 STRUCTURE OPTIONS WILL NOT NECESSARILY SHOW UP IN OUR MODELING
- 7 RESULTS WE ARE INVESTIGATING HOW THESE DO IMPACT THE USER
- 8 EXPERIENCE THROUGH OUR USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES WHICH I'LL
- 9 TOUCH ON IN A MOMENT. AND PERHAPS MOST IMPORTANTLY IS EQUITY.
- 10 SO, FOR EQUITY, WE'RE ASSESSING THE DEGREE TO WHICH THE
- 11 INTEGRATION PROPOSALS THAT WE'RE STUDYING WOULD BENEFIT IMPACT
- 12 EOUITY PRIORITY POPULATION IN OUR REGION ALSO GRAPPLING WITH
- 13 THE QUESTION OF WHETHER REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION OR LOCAL
- 14 CONTROL OF EQUITY STRATEGIES FOR EXAMPLE, DISCOUNTED FARE
- 15 PRODUCTS THAT ARE AVAILABLE TO CERTAIN TYPES OF USERS CAN BEST
- 16 OPTIMIZE THE OVERALL IMPACT OF ANY FARE POLICY CHANGES AND
- 17 HERE AGAIN WE HAVE HEARD A RANGE OF VIEWS FROM DIFFERENT
- 18 STAKEHOLDERS ON THE FAR RIGHT ON THIS SLIDE I WILL NOTE THERE
- 19 IS A SEPARATE BUT RELATED ISSUE THAT ISN'T DIRECTLY WITHIN OUR
- 20 SCOPE OF WORK AND THAT'S THE QUESTION OF AFFORDABILITY THERE
- 21 ARE A LOT OF IMPORTANT QUESTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED AS WE
- 22 HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS PROJECT OVER THE LAST YEAR ABOUT
- 23 AFFORDABILITY, SUCH AS THE APPROPRIATE OVERALL LEVEL OF COST
- 24 RECOVERY FROM FARES, WHETHER THE SYSTEM IS BROADLY AFFORDABLE
- 25 TO PEOPLE AT ALL INCOME LEVELS AND WHAT'S ROLE OF CLIPPER





- 1 START IN ANY LONG-TERM FARE POLICY ACTIONS THAT RELATE TO
- 2 AFFORDABILITY. SO, AS I NOTED, AFFORDABILITY ISN'T A DIRECT
- 3 FOCUS OF OUR SCOPE OF WORK BUT IT IS DIRECTLY CONNECTED TO
- 4 WHAT WE'RE EXAMINING IN OUR PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE. ON THIS
- 5 SLIDE WE WANTED TO REFRESH US ALL ON THE WORK THAT WE HAVE
- 6 ALREADY COMPLETED AND EXACTLY WHERE THE POINT OF DELAY HAS
- 7 TAKEN PLACE IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO DELIVER OUR
- 8 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE TASK FORCE. SO I'LL CALL YOUR FOCUS TO
- 9 NUMBERS 5 AND 6 TO THE RIGHT HAND SIDE OF THIS SLIGHT FOR
- 10 VARIANT TESTING AND BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION WE HAVE
- 11 ENCOUNTERED CHALLENGES WITH OUR TRAVEL DEMAND MODELING WHICH
- 12 IS AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE TESTING PROCESS WHICH FEEDS INTO
- 13 THE BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION WE'RE RIGHT NOW ON TRACK TO
- 14 CONCLUDE OUR MODELING RESULTS IN JULY 2021 AND CONCLUDE OUR
- 15 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION IN AUGUST AND BRING AFTERWARD
- 16 RECOMMENDATIONS AFTER THAT. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE I TURN THE
- 17 PRESENTATION OVER TO MIKE, I WANTED TO FOCUS ON THE THREE KEY
- 18 AREAS OF WORK WHICH THE PROJECT TEAM IS IN THE FINAL STAGE
- 19 RIGHT NOW. AND I JUST TOUCHED ON THIS A LITTLE BIT A MOMENT
- 20 AGO, BUT ANSWERING AND CONCLUDING THE QUESTIONS THAT THIS AREA
- 21 -- THESE AREAS OF WORK FOCUS ON IS CRUCIAL TO OUR ABILITY TO
- 22 MAKE WELL SUPPORTED POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE TASK FORCE.
- 23 THE FIRST ON THE LEFT IS OUR TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL. OUR TRAVEL
- 24 DEMAND MODEL WORK IS USING THE SAME TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL IN
- 25 DEVELOPING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WILL ANSWER SOME QUESTIONS



July 19, 2021

ABOUT RIDERSHIP REVENUE IMPACTS AND POLICY CHANGES AND

INVESTMENTS TO POLICY COMPARED TO OTHER SYSTEM INVESTMENTS 2 3 BEING CENTER. OUR PROJECT TEAM CONSULTANTS RIGHT NOW ARE IN THE PROCESS OF CONCLUDING RESEARCH TASK WHICH IS HAS BEEN 4 5 PROTOTYPING AND TESTING POLICY FARE RECOMMENDATIONS WITH TRANSIT USERS AND NON-USERS AROUND THE BAY AREA. AND FINALLY 6 AND PERHAPS MOST IMPORTANT HERE IS TIME FOR ALL OF OUR WORK 7 8 OVER THE PAST YEAR SO THE ANALYSIS OF THE BUSINESS CASE PROCESS IS KEY TO TURNING THE POLICY CONCEPTS THAT WE HAVE 9 BEEN STUDYING INTO PRACTICAL ACTIONS WHERE DETAILED 10 IMPLEMENTATION CONSIDERATIONS AND BEEN DOCUMENTED AND 11 PROCESSES SET FORTH WHICH WOULD HOPEFULLY SYNTHESIZE INTO A 12 SET OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE TASK FORCE TO EVALUATE, PROVIDE 13 FEEDBACK, AND CONSIDER ACTING UPON. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO 14

17

15

16

PRESENTATION.

18 MICHAEL EISEMAN: THANKS BILL. MIKE EISEMAN HERE FROM BART.

TURN THE SLIDES OVER TO MIKE FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE

- 19 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO I'LL BEGIN HERE BY RECAPPING THE
- 20 DECISIONS THAT YOU HAVE MADE SO FAR AND THE DECISIONS I WOULD
- 21 LIKE TO ASK TO YOU CONSIDER IN YOUR UPCOMING MEETINGS. AS YOU
- 22 KNOW THE PROJECT HAS DEFINED A PROBLEM STATEMENT AND
- 23 EVALUATION FRAMEWORK WE HAVE CONSIDERED A LONG LIST OF FARE
- 24 STRUCTURE OPTIONS AND NARROWED DOWN TO A SHORT LIST. FROM HERE
- 25 OUR FOCUS WILL BE DEFINING WHAT TIER OF INTEGRATION WE'LL





- 1 TARGET AS A LONG-TERM OUTCOME AND THAT CONCEPT OF TIERS IS NEW
- 2 BILL MENTIONED IT AND I'LL TALK MORE ABOUT IT IN A MOMENT.
- 3 WE'LL ASK TO YOU WEIGH IN ON THE NEAR-TERM PLAN AND DIRECTION
- 4 OF THE GOAL AND DEFINE NEAR-TERM ACTIONS TO MOVE FORWARD W
- 5 THIS STUDY WILL NOT BE THE FINAL WORD ON FARE INTEGRATION WE
- 6 ARE DOCUMENTING OPTIONS IN A WAY THAT WILL INFORM FUTURE
- 7 DECISION MAKING ON OUESTIONS SUCH IS PRICE POINTS, TIMELINES,
- 8 RESOURCE SUBSIDY LEVELS AND REVENUE ALLOCATION MODEL. NEXT
- 9 SLIDE. WE'RE ASKING YOU NOW TO BEGIN THINKING IN FORMS OF
- 10 FOUR TIERS OF POTENTIAL FARE INTEGRATION COORDINATION LAID OUT
- 11 HERE ON THIS SLIDE TIER ONE ON THE LEFT OVERLAYS OF EXISTING
- 12 FARE STRUCTURE SUCH AS PASSES AND CAPS THIS WOULD NOT REQUIRE
- 13 UNDERLYING STRUCTURE BUT WOULD REQUIRE INTER-AGENCY AGREEMENTS
- 14 ON PRICING AND ALLOCATION AS WELL AS POTENTIAL SUBSIDY. TIER
- 15 TWO TRANSFER DISCOUNTS ALLOWING LOW OR NO COST TRANSFERRING
- 16 BETWEEN AGENCIES AND SERVICE OPERATOR BY MULTIPLE AGENCIES. WE
- 17 WOULD NEED INTER-AGENCY AGREEMENTS ON REVENUE ALLOCATION
- 18 PRICING. SOME COMBINATION OF RIDERSHIP INCREASES, NEW SUBSIDY
- 19 AND OTHER FARE CHANGES WOULD BE NEEDED TO OFFSET REVENUE LOSS.
- 20 OUR TEAM BELIEVES THAT TIERS 1 AND 2 BELIEVABILITY IS COULD BE
- 21 ACHIEVED USING THE EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURES TIERS 1
- 22 AND 2 ARE SURF TO ELIMINATE PRICE BARRIERS, AND TO ATTEND MOST
- 23 OF THE ASSOCIATED RIDERSHIP BENEFITS THEY COULD PARTIALLY BE
- 24 DEPLOYED IN THE EXISTING CLIPPER ONE PLATFORM BUT FULL
- 25 EXECUTION REQUIRES CLIPPER TWO. LEARNING ABOUT ELIGIBILITY





- 1 PERSPECTIVES, RECALL THAT REGIONAL SERVICE IN OUR FRAMEWORK
- 2 INCLUDE REGIONAL RAIL, FERRY, AND MOST EXPRESS BUSES THIS MOVE
- 3 WOULD REQUIRE PRICING REVENUE AGREEMENTS FROM A SHORT LIST OF
- 4 EFFECTIVE AGENCIES AS WELL AS A NEW LEVEL OF INTER-AGENCY
- 5 COORDINATION AND OUR TEAM BELIEVES THIS STEP WOULD REQUIRE
- 6 BOTH THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM AND SOME LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONAL
- 7 CHANGE. AND THEN FINALLY TIER NOW WOULD INTEGRATE LOCAL AND
- 8 REGIONAL SERVICES INTO A COMMON FARE STRUCTURE ALL 27 AGENCIES
- 9 WOULD NEED TO BE INVOLVED IN THE AGREEMENTS. STEP FROM TIER 3
- 10 TO 4 WOULD REQUIRE GREATEST INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE BUT PROVIDE
- 11 MODEST BENEFIT IN TERMS OF LEGIBILITY AND LIABILITY COMPARED
- 12 TO TIER FIVE. ON THE LIST ARE STRUCTURE OPTIONS INTEGRATION,
- 13 LOOKING AT LEVEL OF BENEFIT WE CAN UNLOCK, AND TWO FARE
- 14 CAPPING FOR ALL USERS OR CLIPPER START USERS, BROADLY
- 15 AVAILABLE, ALL AGENCY PASS BOX OR ALL AGENCY INSTITUTIONAL
- 16 EMPLOYER [INDISCERNIBLE] PASSES. TIER TWO MODELING IS DOCUMENT
- 17 LEVEL OF BENEFIT IS UNLOCKED WITH NO OR LOW COST INTER-AGENCY
- 18 TRANSFERS. OPTION TWO INCLUDES THOSE DISCOUNTS FOR ALL LOCAL
- 19 TO LOCAL OR LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRIPS WHILE OPTION THREE LAYERS
- 20 ON OPTION 3A, PARDON ME -- LAYERS DISCOUNTS FOR TRANSFERRING
- 21 BETWEEN REGIONAL SERVICES. TIER THREE, WE ARE LOOKING AT WHAT
- 22 ADDITIONAL LEARN ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY BENEFITS WE WOULD SEE
- 23 FROM ALL REGIONAL SERVICES ON A SHARED FARE STRUCTURE. HERE WE
- 24 HAVE OPTION 3B WHICH IS A REGIONAL-BASED DISTANCED BASED FARE.
- 25 AND FINALLY, IN TIER FOUR WE HAVE THREE OPTIONS TO LOOK AT





- 1 WHETHER FURTHER LEARN ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY BENEFITS --
- 2 [INDISCERNIBLE] BY BRINGING ALL LOCAL FARES INTO A COMMON FARE
- 3 STRUCTURE, EITHER FLAT FARE OR SINGLE REGIONAL SYSTEM. NEXT
- 4 SLIDE. OH, YES -- OKAY. EACH TIER AND ASSOCIATED OPTION HAVE
- 5 DISTINCT IMPORTANT POLICY DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES
- 6 HERE WE HAVE A SAMPLE OF ISSUES OUR TEAM IS WORKING THROUGH
- 7 TIER ONE ALL AGENCY OVERLAY WORK BEST ON A CAP OR ACCUMULATOR
- 8 MODEL OR UP FRONT PASS OR CAN THESE BE COMBINED. CRUCIAL FOR
- 9 AGENCIES CONSIDERING PARTICIPATION, REVENUE SHARING FOR ONE OF
- 10 THESE [INDISCERNIBLE] -- FOR TRANSFER DISCOUNTS WE NEED TO
- 11 UNDERSTAND REVENUE IMPACT IN LIGHT OF EXISTING AGENCY
- 12 DISCOUNTS AND TRANSFER AGREEMENTS AND WE NEED TO DESIGN NOT
- 13 JUST HOW THE BACK END WOULD WORK BUT HOW THESE CHANGES WILL BE
- 14 COMMUNICATED TO RIDERS TO MAXIMIZE THEIR IMPACT. MOVING TO
- 15 TIER THREE, WE HAVE CRUCIAL OUESTIONS WHAT MANAGEMENT
- 16 APPROACHES WOULD BE NECESSARY TO STAND UP THE ARRANGEMENT AND
- 17 MAINTAIN IN A STABLE WAY. AND ON THE POLICY DESIGN FRONT,
- 18 COULD AGENCIES USE THE SAME STRUCTURE SUCH AS DISTANCE AND
- 19 ZONE BASED BUT HAVE DIFFERENT PRICES WITHIN THAT STRUCTURE OR
- 20 IS FULL STANDARDIZATION NEEDED TO REALIZE THE FULL BENEFITS.
- 21 TIER FOUR, WE NEED TO CONSIDER THE QUESTION OF RECOGNIZING
- 22 LOCAL FUNDING LEVELS GOALS AND POLICY MANDATES WITH THE GOALS.
- 23 [INDISCERNIBLE] NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. BEFORE WE WRAP UP I WANT
- 24 TO REMIND YOU OF OUR BUSINESS FRAMEWORK AND COMPONENTS
- 25 INCLUDING STRATEGIC DIMENSION ACCESSING PERFORMANCE AGAINST



MAIN POLICY GOALS SUCH AS INCREASING RIDERSHIP AND REDUCING 1 VMT, SO YO ECONOMIC DIMENSION LOOK AT SOCIAL COST BENEFIT 2 3 FINANCIAL DIMENSION LOOKING AT REQUIREMENTS IMPACTS TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND FINALLY DELIVERABILITY WHERE WE'RE 4 5 LOOKING, MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS. BY OUR SEPTEMBER MEETING OUR GOAL IS TO BE ABLE TO DOCUMENT THIS FRAMEWORK IN THIS 6 FRAMEWORK THE OVERALL BENEFIT OF INTEGRATION POTENTIAL COST 7 8 AND BENEFITS WITHIN EACH TIER AND THEN THE HIGHEST PERFORMING OPTION IN EACH TIER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'LL WRAP UP HERE BY 9 SHOWING YOU OUR REVISED SCHEDULE AGAIN AS BILL SAID WE'RE 10 PREPARING DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS FOR OUR SEPTEMBER TASK FORCE 11 MEETING AND FOLLOWING THAT MEETING WITH PRESENTATIONS TO THE 12 AGENCY FOR FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS ADOPTION TO THIS BODY IN 13 OCTOBER. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO THE CHAIR. 14 15 16 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU, BILL, AND MICHAEL, IT'S VERY INTERESTING HOW EACH MEETING, EACH PRESENTATION, THE PICTURE 17 GETS A LITTLE BIT CLEARER, I KNOW IT'S A HEAVY LIFT, AND I 18 APPRECIATE THE WORK. BEFORE WE GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT I'LL ASK 19 FOR COMMENTS OR OUESTIONS FROM THE TASK FORCE. DON'T SEE ANY 20 HANDS RAISED. OKAY. WELL, I HAVE ONE. SORRY TO PUT YOU ON THE 21 SPOT BUT YOU CAN GO INTO WHAT THE PROBLEMS ARE WITH THE TRAVEL 22 DEMAND MODELING ARE? I AM CURIOUS BECAUSE OF COVID WE'RE NOT 23 SURE IN THE FIRST FEW YEARS WHAT THE NUMBERS ARE GOING TO BE 24



- 1 MICHAEL EISEMAN: CERTAINLY THERE IS A CHALLENGE AND THE COVID
- 2 ANALYSIS IS GOING HAPPEN OFF MODEL WE HAVE CONFIDENCE IN THE
- 3 WAY THE MODELING APPROACH IS GOING, AND I THINK IT'S
- 4 PROGRESSING, IT'S JUST PROGRESSING SLOWER THAN WE HAD HOPED.
- 5 IN PARTICULAR, JUST GETTING THE MODEL TO RUN WITH OUR
- 6 CONSULTANTS, HONESTLY, TOOK A WEEK OR TWO LONGER THAN WE HAD
- 7 HOPED. SO, I HOPE THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVE BEEN IN PROJECTS THAT
- 8 INVOLVE TRAVEL DEMAND MODELING IN THE PAST CAN REMEMBER A FEW
- 9 SIMILAR CHALLENGES, BUT, I WOULD SAY, OVERALL, WE CONTINUE TO
- 10 HAVE CONFIDENCE IN THE ANALYTICAL APPROACH WE HAVE JUST MADE
- 11 SLOWER PROGRESS THAN WE HAD HOPED.

12

- 13 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: I APPRECIATE THE TRANSPARENCY AND I KNOW
- 14 WE'RE ALL EXCITED BUT I REALLY WANT US TO GET THIS RIGHT. THIS
- 15 HAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY REVOLUTIONIZE THE WAY WE DO
- 16 PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. AGAIN, I APPRECIATE THE
- 17 TRANSPARENCY AND WE'RE EAGER, BUT KEEP THE SHARP PENCILS AND
- 18 HOPEFULLY THE MODEL WILL PAY OFF. LAST CHANCE FOR TASK FORCE
- 19 MEMBERS QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

20

21 ROBERT POWERS: BOB POWERS, BART.

22

23 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: HEY, BOB.



ROBERT POWERS: BILL, YOU CAN OR MIKE EISEMAN GO BACK TO THE 1 2 TIMELINE SLIDE? 3 WILLIAM BACON: COULD WE BRING THE SLIDES BACK UP, PLEASE? 4 5 ROBERT POWERS: YEAH. JUST ONE MORE TIME ON THIS SLIDE SO I GET 6 IT IN MY HEAD. SO THE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS ARE AT THE 9/20, 7 8 THE SEPTEMBER 20TH MEETING THAT HURSH IS RUNNING HERE, RIGHT? THEN THE FINAL ONES ARE, WHERE? 9 10 MICHAEL EISEMAN: ON THIS TIMELINE WE'RE TARGETING THE OCTOBER 11 MEETING. SO THE NEXT MEETING FOR FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS. I WILL 12 SAY, DEPENDING ON HOW THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE RECEIVED, AND 13 HOW MUCH ADDITIONAL CONVERSATION IS NEEDED, THAT COULD 14 15 CERTAINLY GET PUSHED. 16 ROBERT POWERS: YEAH, THAT'S THE POINT, MIKE, YOU WERE VERY 17 18 INTUITIVE. THAT WOULD BE GREAT. YOU AND BACON WORKED THE SCHEDULED OUT AS BEST YOU CAN, BUT ALSO KEEP IN MIND GIVE 19 YOURSELF ENOUGH TIME -- THIS IS A COMMENT, NOT DIRECTION, SO 20 21 I'M JUST ONE OF MANY BOARD MEMBERS HERE, THAT AFTER THE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS, THERE WILL BE MANY AGENCIES OUT THERE WHO 22 23 WILL WANT YOU AND MR. BACON TO PRESENT AT THE, YOU KNOW, BART BOARD, AC TRANSIT BOARD, WHEREVER, AND SOLICIT FEEDBACK FROM 24





- 1 THE ACTUAL BOARD MEMBERS, AS WELL. SO, JUST MAKE SURE THAT YOU
- 2 BUILD THAT IN, THAT VARIABLE INTO YOUR CALCULUS HERE.

- 4 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANKS, BOB, APPRECIATE IT. THERESE?
- 5 YOU ARE BACK ON MUTE.

6

- 7 THERESE MCMILLAN: YES, I AM. [LAUGHTER] SO THANK YOU, MIKE,
- 8 AND ALSO THANK YOU TO THE TEAM. I JUST WANT TO REITERATE THAT,
- 9 YOU KNOW, GETTING IT RIGHT AND BEING ABLE TO BRING AS MUCH
- 10 DATA AND FACTUAL INFORMATION TO BEAR IN THE PRESENTATION OF,
- 11 YOU KNOW, THE OPTIONS AND THE ANALYSIS, I THINK IS ESSENTIAL,
- 12 AND IF IT NEEDS A LITTLE TIME IT NEEDS A LITTLE TIME. THAT'S
- 13 OPENER. THE ONE THING I HAD THE ADVANTAGE OF -- AND IF YOU
- 14 WANT TO GO TO THE SLIDE THAT IS THE LAST OF THE FOUR COLORED
- 15 BOXES -- GO UP -- LET'S SEE. IT WAS -- LET ME SEE IF I GET A
- 16 NUMBER. THE DEVIL IN THE DETAILS SLIDE. YES. THIS ONE. YOU CAN
- 17 EXPLAIN -- BECAUSE IT WAS HELPFUL FOR ME TO UNDERSTAND -- THE,
- 18 SORT OF -- I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE TERM I'M LOOKING FOR IS, SORT
- 19 OF, THE THRESHOLDS THAT ALLOWS A CERTAIN VERSION TO BE USED
- 20 UNDER THE CURRENT CLIPPER SYSTEM VERSUS WHEN WE NEED TO IF GO
- 21 GET THE PLATFORM THAT IS CLIPPER TWO. YOU CAN GO OVER THAT FOR
- 22 US?

- 24 WILLIAM BACON: I CAN TRY TO ANSWER THE QUESTION, THERESE, THE
- 25 FIRST SORT OF THRESHOLD FOR US IS THE TECHNICAL DELIVERABILITY





- 1 OF WHAT WE COULD DO IN C1 AN EXAMPLE OF THAT WOULD BE IF WE'RE
- 2 TALKING IN OPTION ONE HERE SORT OF THE OVERLAYS, WHAT TYPE OF
- 3 PASS OR CAP PRODUCTS ARE TECHNICALLY DELIVERABLE IN C1. RIGHT
- 4 NOW WE CAN OFFER A CAP WITHIN OUR SINGLE OPERATOR, AND IF
- 5 ANYONE FROM THE CLIPPER TEAM IS ON HERE RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU
- 6 WANT TO CHIME IN. BUT WE CAN OFFER CAP WITHIN A SINGLE AGENCY.
- 7 SOME OPERATORS, EXAMPLE, AC TRANSIT AND SMALLER BUS OPERATORS
- 8 HAVE 15 DAY CAPS THAT WE CAN OFFER IN C1. WHAT WE CAN'T OFFER
- 9 IS A MONTHLY CAP OR A CAP THAT COVERS MULTIPLE AGENCY, FOR
- 10 EXAMPLE, CALTRAIN AND VTA AND SAMTRANS ALL AT THE SAME TIME.
- 11 THAT'S WHERE THERE WOULD BE A SORT OF SHIFT, CAN IT BE
- 12 DELIVERED IN C1 OR DOES IT HAVE TO HAPPEN IN C2. DOES THAT
- 13 ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?
- - 15 THERESE MCMILLAN: TRYING TO UNMUTE MYSELF AGAIN -- YES, IT
 - 16 DOES. AND I THINK IT ALSO MAYBE OPENS UP THE QUESTION OF HOW
 - 17 SOME OF THESE MIGHT BE BUILDING BLOCKS THAT THE COMMITTEE
 - 18 WOULD WANT TO EXPLORE IN TERMS OF HOW, YOU KNOW, YOU WOULD
 - 19 PROCEED. BECAUSE, OF COURSE, ON THE ONE HAND, BUILDING BLOCKS
 - 20 MIGHT BE A LOT OF EFFORT FOR A RELATIVELY SHORT AMOUNT OF
 - 21 TIME, BUT IF THERE IS A LOGICAL WAY OF BEING ABLE TO PURSUE,
 - 22 FOR EXAMPLE, YOU KNOW, A CAP OR A ACCUMULATOR AS A PILOT TO
 - 23 WORK OUT KINKS OR WHATEVER THE CASE MAY BE THAT MIGHT HELP IN
 - 24 MOVING IN ADVANCE TO A CLIPPER TWO DRIVEN CHOICE WHETHER IT'S
 - 25 A TRANSFER DISCOUNT WHICH I PERSONALLY THINK IS A REAL CENTRAL



- 1 CONSIDERATION FOR OUR GROUP TO CONSIDER, VERSUS A STEPPING
- 2 STONE TO SOMETHING MORE ADVANCED AS DEMONSTRATED IN OPTION
- 3 NUMBER THREE. SO, KIND OF A SENSE OF HOW FAR WE CAN GO IN
- 4 ORDER TO GET SOMETHING OUT ON THE STREET AND TEST, OR, AT
- 5 LEAST KIND OF KICK START SOME IMPROVEMENTS FOR OUR CUSTOMERS,
- 6 KNOWING THAT CERTAIN THINGS NEED TO WAIT UNTIL WE HAVE, AGAIN,
- 7 THE BROADER CLIPPER PLATFORM. BUT, ANYWAY, THAT WAS JUST
- 8 THOUGHTS I HAD.

9

- 10 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANKS THERESE. I'LL GO RICK THEN
- 11 CAROLYN.

- 13 RICK RAMACIER: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. MIKE, AND BILL, THIS IS
- 14 REALLY GOOD WORK HERE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO, JUST, LEND MY
- 15 SUPPORT TO WHAT MIKE AND BOB AND THERESE HAVE SAID, IN THAT,
- 16 YOU KNOW, GETTING THIS RIGHT IS REALLY IMPORTANT. IT'S -- IT
- 17 COULD BE -- I THINK IT WAS MIKE WHO USED THE WORD
- 18 "REVOLUTIONARY" I THINK IF WE STAY TO SOME ARTIFICIAL SCHEDULE
- 19 WE MAY MISS SOME OPPORTUNITIES HERE AND THE OTHER THING I
- 20 WOULD OFFER IN TERMS OF MEETING WITH BOARDS, SETTINGS ET
- 21 CETERA I WONDER IF WE COULD SET A DATE ASIDE FOR OUR CHAIRS
- 22 AND VICE CHAIRS MUCH LIKE WE DID WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
- 23 FORCE AND YOU COULD MEET WITH SMALL OPERATORS AT ONE OR TWO
- 24 MEETINGS AS OPPOSED TO 20 SO LET ME KNOW IF THAT WOULD BE





- 1 HELPFUL AND I WOULD BE HAPPY TO WORK WITH MY FELLOW SMALLER
- 2 OPERATORS TO TRY TO DO THAT FOR YOU.

- 4 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. GREAT SUGGESTION LOOKING AT
- 5 SOMETHING SIMILAR FOR THE LARGE OPERATORS. CAROLYN?

6

- 7 SPEAKER: I HAVE A QUESTION ON, AND I AM SURE YOU'RE DOING IT
- 8 WITH THE MODELING EXERCISES, IS PART OF THE NUMBER THREE -- OR
- 9 NUMBER FOUR -- I MEAN, I BLEND OF REALLY LOOKING AT THOSE FARE
- 10 POLICIES THAT MEAN THE MOST WITHIN THE REGION, WHEN WE'RE
- 11 TRYING TO COORDINATE THEM, ARE YOU PICKING CERTAIN PAIRS OF
- 12 AGENCIES OR GROUPS OF AGENCIES THAT SEEM TO MAKE THE MOST
- 13 SENSE THROUGH YOUR MODELING PURPOSES? SO IT MIGHT BE SOMETHING
- 14 THAT'S -- THAT CAN BE SPECIFIC, BASED ON WHAT THE TRAVEL
- 15 PATTERNS LOOK LIKE? OR WOULD BE IN THE FUTURE.

- 17 MICHAEL EISEMAN: YES, WE ARE -- IN EARLIER PHASES OF THE STUDY
- 18 WE DID BRING TO THIS GROUP A SUMMARY OF WHERE THE GREATEST
- 19 NUMBERS OF EXISTING TRANSFERS ARE HAPPENING AND THEN WHERE,
- 20 BASED ON THE OVERALL, ALL MODES TRAVEL PATTERNS WHERE THERE
- 21 MIGHT BE POTENTIAL FOR ADDITIONAL DEMAND, IF THE
- 22 COMPETITIVENESS WAS THERE, AND SO WE ARE CERTAINLY GOING TO
- 23 TRY TO IDENTIFY IF THERE ARE SOME AREAS OF THE REGION THAT
- 24 WOULD BE PARTICULARLY OPEN. I WILL SAY THAT IN A LOT OF OUR
- 25 CONVERSATIONS WE HAVE BEEN TALKING WHETHER THERE ARE A SET OF





- 1 POLICIES THAT COULD BE APPLIED ACROSS THE BOARD. WE WOULD
- 2 CERTAINLY LIKE TO HAVE SOME STRUCTURES THAT ARE -- TO OFFER
- 3 THE TASK FORCE TO CONSIDER THAT ARE REGION-WIDE.

- 5 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANKS CAROLYN. AND JUST AS A REMINDER,
- 6 THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM, NO ACTION REQUIRED. BUT I WANT TO
- 7 GIVE THE PUBLIC THE CHANCE TO WAY IN. MARTHA DID WE RECEIVE
- 8 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT OR ARE THERE ANY HANDS RAISED? I'LL COME
- 9 BACK TO YOU ADINA.

10

- 11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON
- 12 THIS ITEM, AND ADINA HAD HER HAHN RAISED. AND IAN GRIFFITHS.
- 13 DO YOU WANT UNMUTE YOURSELF. CHAIR WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE HIM
- 14 TWO MINUTES?

15

16 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: YES, PLEASE.

17

18 SPEAKER: HELLO, CAN YOU HEAR ME?

19

20 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: YES WE CAN.

- 22 IAN GRIFFITHS: HI. THIS IS IAN GRIFFITHS OF SEAMLESS BAY AREA
- 23 I CONCUR WITH ALL OF THE COMMENTS OF EXCELLENT WORK HERE FROM
- 24 STAFF. I HAVE TWO COMMENTS, FIRST I APPRECIATE THE DISTINCTION
- 25 OF THESE DIFFERENT TIERS ONE THING THAT I THINK IS IMPORTANT





- 1 WHEN CONSIDERING PERHAPS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE VALUE OF
- 2 TEAR THREE, THE REGIONAL CHANGE, VERSUS TIER FOUR, REGIONAL
- 3 AND LOCAL CHANGE, THE STUDY IS IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE
- 4 ADDITIONAL BENEFITS THAT COME FROM HAVING COORDINATED FARE
- 5 POLICY DECISIONS, HAVING OUR COORDINATED DECISION MAKING
- 6 STRUCTURE FOR ALL FARES INCLUDING LOCAL FARES. I SUSPECT THE
- 7 MODEL MAY SHOW SOME KIND OF MARGINAL ADDITIONAL BENEFIT OF
- 8 COORDINATING LOCAL FARES IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP, BUT I THINK
- 9 IT'S IMPORTANT IN THE STRATEGIC CASE, FOR THIS, TO ACKNOWLEDGE
- 10 THAT WHEN THERE IS A COMMON FARE POLICY WHERE BY 27 TRANSIT
- 11 AGENCIES ALL ADHERE TO THE SAME RULES WHAT OPPORTUNITIES DOES
- 12 THAT OPEN UP, AND HOW MUCH MORE OUICKLY ARE WE ABLE TO MOVE
- 13 AND ADAPT, WITH ADAPTABILITY OF BEING AN IMPORTANT CRITERIA
- 14 MOVING FORWARD? OR ALTERNATIVELY WHAT ARE WE GIVING UP BY
- 15 TRYING TO MAINTAIN THE ABILITY FOR LOCAL AGENCIES TO ALTER
- 16 THEIR FARES BY FIVE SENSE AT A TIME EVERY QUARTER OR \$0.10 AT
- 17 A TIME WHAT COST IS THAT COMING WITH. AND MY SECOND COMMENT IS
- 18 WITH REGARD TO EQUITY. I JUST REALLY LIKE SLIDE SIX, THE
- 19 SENTENCE HERE REGARDING EQUITY, "DO DIFFERENT AGENCY
- 20 APPROACHES TO EQUITY INITIATIVES LIMIT THE OPTIMIZED OR
- 21 OVERALL IMPACT?" I THINK THIS IS AN IMPORTANT QUESTION WHEN WE
- 22 CONSIDER EQUITY BECAUSE THERE ARE AGENCY SPECIFIC POLICIES
- 23 THAT I THINK THE KEY OUESTION HERE IS IF WE'RE TRYING TO HAVE
- 24 THE GREATEST POSSIBLE IMPACT ON EQUITY REGION-WIDE AND AFFECT
- 25 THE MOST NUMBER OF PEOPLE AND PRIORITY POPULATIONS, WHAT





- 1 EQUITY APPROACH, AND WHAT FARE STRUCTURES CAN LEAD TO THE BEST
- 2 POSSIBLE RESULTS? THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK. THANKS.

- 4 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: OKAY. I SEE NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE
- 5 PUBLIC. ADINA I MOVED TOO OUICK. WE'LL GO BACK TO THE TASK
- 6 FORCE. ADINA GO AHEAD. YOU'RE ON MUTE.

7

- 8 ADINA LEVIN: I JUST WANTED TO BRIEFLY SPEAK WITH REGARD TO THE
- 9 ADVISORY GROUP, WHICH IS REALLY EAGER TO BE LOOKING AT THE
- 10 RECOMMENDATIONS ON AUGUST 2ND IN TERMS OF THE VARIOUS
- 11 DIFFERENT OPTIONS THAT HAVE THE FORCIBLE REALLY HAVE MAJOR
- 12 BENEFITS FOR TRANSIT RIDERS AND CUSTOMERS, AND REPORTING FROM
- 13 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WHICH IS CONSISTENTLY REALLY
- 14 INTERESTED IN THIS TOPIC AND WANTING TO SEE A MOVEMENT TOWARDS
- 15 THE CHOICES THAT ARE THE MOST BENEFICIAL TO RIDERS AND
- 16 BENEFICIAL TO EQUITY, MOST BENEFICIAL TO BRINGING PEOPLE BACK
- 17 TO TRANSIT AND TO REALLY BE SUPPORTIVE OF, YOU KNOW, WHATEVER
- 18 NEEDS TO BE DONE IN ORDER TO MAKE THOSE THINGS HAPPEN SO WITH
- 19 THAT JUST REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THOSE
- 20 RECOMMENDATIONS COME FORWARD.

21

22 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANKS ADINA. CARTER?

- 24 CARTER MAU: THANK YOU CHAIR HURSH I WANT TO ECHO THE GOOD WORK
- 25 MIKE AND BILL ARE DOING HERE. WITH THE CLIPPER ONE SYSTEM WE



NEED TO LIM THE NUMBER OF BUSINESS RULES OUT THERE THAT GOVERN 1 ALL OF OUR FARE STRUCTURES. I KNOW THE CLIPPER STAFF PLEADED 2 3 WITH AGENCIES TO REDUCE THE COMPLEXITY OF OUR SYSTEM BECAUSE IT WAS MAKING THE CLIPPER SYSTEM HARD TO OPERATE. I'M 4 5 WONDERING, IS THE COMPLEXITY -- THE RULES WITH THE VARIOUS CRITERIA, HOW DOES THAT AFFECT THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM AND DO 6 WE HAVE THE ABILITY TO BE MORE GRANULAR, YOU KNOW, MORE NOOKS 7 8 AND CRANNIES IN THE NEW SYSTEM, AND CLIPPER TWO WILL WORK FINE UNDER THAT ENVIRONMENT OR IS HAVING ALL THOSE RULES IN PLACE 9 GOING TO BOG DOWN THAT SYSTEM TOO AND DRIVE THE COST AND 10 COMPLEXITY OF THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM GOING FORWARD? AND MAYBE 11 CLIPPER STAFF COULD ANSWER THAT RATHER THAN BILL OR MIKE? 12 13 JASON WEINSTEIN: CHAIR, THIS IS JASON WEINSTEIN WITH CLIPPER 14 15 STAFF, I COULD WEIGH IN IF YOU WOULD LIKE. 16 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: CARTER BRINGS UP A GOOD POINT. WE ARE IN 17 18 THE PROCESS OF WORKING THROUGH THE OPERATORS WHAT THEIR CURRENT BUSINESS RULES ARE SO WE CAN FIGURE OUT WHAT WE WANT 19 THROUGH THE ACCOUNT-BASED SYSTEM EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT GOING TO 20 BE A CARD SYSTEM LIKE IT IS TODAY AND IT WON'T BE PIECEMEALED 21 TOGETHER FROM 1990'S TECHNOLOGY, IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT WE WON'T 22 CREATE ADDITIONAL COMPLEXITY. WE ARE -- OUR TEAM IS IN TOUCH 23 WITH BILL AND THE GROUP THAT'S WORKING ON THE FARE INTEGRATION 24

TASK FORCE AND WE ARE EAGERLY AWAITING SORT OF THE DIRECTION



FROM THIS GROUP AND THE OTHER BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY 1 TASK FORCE SO WE CAN UNDERSTAND THE KINDS OF THINGS WE NEED TO 2 3 ASK THE SYSTEM TO DO TO WORK WITH CUBIC TO GET IT DONE. WE'LL START TESTING IT WILL BE DIFFERENT THAN THE WAY WE DO IT TODAY 4 5 BUT STILL WE JUST NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE NOT OVERLY COMPLICATING THINGS IN A WAY THAT MAKES IT CHALLENGING TO 6 ADMINISTER. THAT BEING SAID, WE WILL HAVE FLEXIBILITY IN A 7 8 WAY, WITH THE NEW SYSTEM THAT WE DON'T TODAY. SO THAT'S GOOD. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT 100% ANSWERS YOUR OUESTION CARTER, BUT --9 10 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: HEY, JASON, IT LOOKS LIKE YOUR BOSS HAS 11 HER HAND RAISED. 12 13 14 JASON WEINSTEIN: CAROL. 15 16 CAROL KEUSTER: WHAT JASON SAID IS CORRECT. IT'S NEVER THE TECHNOLOGY -- TAKE THAT BACK, UNDER. C1, THERE WERE TECHNOLOGY 17 CONSTRAINTS. UNDER C2 THE CASE THAT TECHNOLOGY IS NOT THE 18 CONSTRAINT BUT I THINK YOU ALL AND I THINK THE FOLKS LEADING 19 THIS PROGRAM IN PARTICULAR ARE BEING REALLY MINDFUL OF THE 20 FACT THAT EVEN IF WE COULD HAVE INCREDIBLE COMPLEXITY AND 21 CHANGE FARES EVERY HALF HOUR BASED ON USER CATEGORY THERE'S A 22 POINT WHERE THAT CEASES TO MAKE SENSE AND BE SIMPLE AND 23 COMMUNICABLE TO CUSTOMERS CARTER I WOULD SAY RIGHT NOW IS THE 24

TIME WHEN WE'RE ASKING TRANSIT AGENCIES TO BRING ON ALL THEIR



- 1 IDEAS, AND THAT IS GOING WELL, AND OF COURSE, ONCE WE THROUGH
- 2 THE DESIGN PHASE THAT DOESN'T MEAN THE DOOR IS SHUT AND THERE
- 3 CAN BE NO MORE THINKING BUT THE GOOD NEWS IS THERE HAS BEEN A
- 4 LOT OF GREAT THINKING FROM EXISTING CLIPPER OPERATIONS AND ALL
- 5 OF THE CONSTRAINTS AND NEW THINGS WE WANT TO SEE THOSE ARE
- 6 BEING BUILT INTO THIS SYSTEM SO I THINK THE SYSTEM IS REALLY
- 7 READY TO HANDLE A LOT OF FARE PAYMENT SCHEMES. IT'S ALSO
- 8 IMPORTANT TO BE MINDFUL OF HOW THOSE PAN OUT TO ANY INDIVIDUAL
- 9 USER, THOUGH, BECAUSE THAT COMPLEXITY ALSO HAS TO BE
- 10 COMMUNICATED, AND IT'S JUST ONE MORE STEP FOR SOME PEOPLE TO
- 11 WADE THROUGH. SO WE DON'T WANT TO CREATE NEW BARRIERS TO
- 12 TAKING TRANSIT.

13

- 14 JASON WEINSTEIN: SORRY, CHAIR HURSH -- I WANT TO ADD ONE QUICK
- 15 THING TO THAT. I WANT TO BE TRANSPARENT WHEN I SAY THAT WE'RE
- 16 DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN TO CLUE INTO THE DESIGN PROCESS THAT
- 17 WE HAVE NOW. BUT ONCE WE SORT OF LOCK IT DOWN IN THE FALL,
- 18 WHICH IS PROBABLY BEFORE THERE WILL BE DEFINITIVE ANSWERS WITH
- 19 REGARD TO THIS, PATH, THAT DOESN'T MEAN WE CAN'T MAKE CHANGES
- 20 BUT IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT THEY WILL BE NECESSARILY WITHOUT COST
- 21 EITHER.
- 23 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: GOT TO GET THAT HOOK IN THERE, JASON,
- 24 THANK YOU. I SEE WE HAVE ONE HAND RAISED FROM PUBLIC COMMENT.
- 25 LET'S GET THAT DONE.



1 2 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: RICH, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU 3 HAVE TWO MINUTES. 4 5 RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU MARTHA. SHORT COMMENT, I UNDERSTAND THE DIFFICULT PROBLEMS AND CHALLENGES THAT DIFFER BETWEEN THE 6 TWO AGENCIES AND I REMEMBER THE DIFFICULTY WITH INITIATING 7 8 TRANSLINK, I THINK BART IS THE ONLY ONE THAT EVENTUALLY USED IT AND THEN GETTING CLIPPER PUT IN PLACE A LOT OF THAT HAS TO 9 DEAL WITH WHAT WE'RE DEALING WITH NOW AND THAT'S THE 10 11 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE VARIOUS ENTITIES THAT HAVE TO USE IT. THE FINAL ANALYSIS THE SYSTEM HAS TO BE SIMPLE AND AFFORDABLE 12 AND I HOPE WE GET AT LEAST A DAILY PASS BETWEEN THE BIG FIVE 13 THAT ALLOWS THEM TO SHARE THE REVENUE AND MAKE IT EASIER FOR 14 USERS ESPECIALLY PEOPLE TRYING TO UNDERSTAND THIS COMPLEX 15 16 SYSTEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 17 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU RICHARD. THIS WAS ITEM 4A, 18 19 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. BILL AND MIKE GREAT WORK I THINK YOU HAVE HEARD CLEARLY FROM THE TASK FORCE I APPRECIATE THE 20 TRANSPARENCY IN THE APPROPRIATENESS OF THE SCHEDULE. LET'S 21 22 MOVE TO ITEM FIVE PUBLIC COMMENTS ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA. 23 MARCY ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED?



- 1 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

- 5 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: OKAY. WELL, AN EFFICIENT MEETING. THANK
- 6 YOU EVERYONE. AGENDA ITEM SIX IS ADJOURNMENT AND OUR NEXT
- 7 MEETING, THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IS SCHEDULED TO MEET
- 8 MONDAY AUGUST 16TH AT 1:05 I SUSPECT WE WILL STILL BE
- 9 REMOTELY. AND I WISH EVERYBODY GOOD AFTERNOON, BE WELL, AND
- 10 GET VACCINATED. GOODBYE EVERYONE. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government