

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



June 11, 2021

1 **JOINT MTC PLANNING WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE**

2 **FRIDAY, 9:40 A.M., JUNE 11, 2021**

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESS. DO YOU WANT ROLL
5 THE GOVERNOR'S ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
6 ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
7 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S
8 EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF
9 THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
10 SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS,
11 STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK
12 CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR
13 REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH
14 THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE
15 VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
16 PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED
17 HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
18 THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL
19 BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.
20 IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
21 ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.
22 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY
23 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND
24 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF
25 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,



June 11, 2021

1 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR
2 ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT
3 THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, JESS. I WOULD LIKE TO
6 CALL THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
7 COMMITTEE TO ORDER. AND, JESS, IF IT'S OKAY WITH YOU I'LL DO
8 THE MTC ROLL CALL AND CONSENT CALENDAR, THEN HAND IT OVER TO
9 YOU IF THAT'S OKAY?

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** YES.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT, WITH THAT MARTHA TAKE
14 THE MTC COMMITTEE'S ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR SPERING?

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AHN?

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA?

25



June 11, 2021

1 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CONNOLLY?

4

5 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLEMING? GIACOPINI NON-VOTING? LICCARDO?

12

13 **SAM LICCARDO:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCHAFF? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO MTC

18 COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR FOR MTC. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR

19 COMMENTS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR? IF NOT, I'LL ENTERTAIN A

20 MOTION.

21

22 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** I'LL MOVE THE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS.

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND BY DUTRA-VERNACI.

25



June 11, 2021

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ANY PUBLIC
2 COMMENT ON THIS MARTHA?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS SUBMITTED ON THIS
5 ITEM. AND THERE'S -- THAT'S NOT A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC. OKAY.
6 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD AND TAKE THE ROLL,
9 PLEASE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOLD ON. THERE IS -- ANTHONY, DID YOU
12 WANT TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM? IF SO, YOU CAN RAISE YOUR HAND
13 AGAIN? NO? OKAY. AND, AGAIN, IT WAS MOTION BY CANEPA, SECOND
14 BY DUTRA-VERNACI? [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
15 MEMBERS PRESENT.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. I'M GOING TO PASS IT OFF TO
18 MAYOR ARREGUIN. JESS, YOU HAVE THE NEXT COUPLE OF ITEMS.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. WE'LL
21 MOVE TO ITEM TWO, THE COMPENSATION -- ACTUALLY A QUORUM FIRST
22 OF THE ABAG MEMBERS IF THE CLERK COULD PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** FLIGOR?

25



June 11, 2021

1 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HUDSON?

4

5 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEE? ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS

8 ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF? RABBIT?

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, MTC V. CHAIR:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RAMOS IS ABSENT. RAM IT'S?

13

14 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILSON? ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

17

18 **OTTO LEE:** SUPERVISOR LEE, I'M HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** I GOT YOU.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE

25 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG BOARD IN



June 11, 2021

1 ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN
2 AMOUNT OF \$100 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH
3 EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING NOW
6 TO ITEM THREE, THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE CONSENT
7 CALENDAR. CONSISTING OF ITEM 3A APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MAY
8 14TH, 2021 MEETING. MOTION TO APPROVE?

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MOVE. THIS IS MAYOR EKLUND.

11

12 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** SECOND BY MITCHOFF.

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE
15 CONSENT CALENDAR. PUBLIC COMMENT? SEEING NO RAISED HANDS.
16 PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED?

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NONE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** ROLL CALL PLEASE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
23 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

24



June 11, 2021

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH TURN BACK TO
2 CHAIR SPERING.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM FIVE, INFORMATION
5 ITEM DRAFT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND KAREN MITCHOFF, YOU SAID
6 YESTERDAY, IT WAS A LOT TO ABSORB. WE'RE DOING THIS FOR YOUR
7 BENEFIT. SO WE'LL BE GOING THROUGH THESE AGAIN.

8

9 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH JIM. AND THOSE
10 WHO HAVEN'T SEEN T YOU WILL KNOW WHY I SAID THAT.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** WELL, JESS AND I ARE SEEING IT
13 FOR THE THIRD TIME. SO, WITH THAT, DAVE VAUTIN, ARE YOU READY?
14 >DAVE VAUTIN: YES, I AM.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** HE COULD DO IT IN HIS SLEEP.
17 THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD MORNING BOARD MEMBERS DAVE
18 VAUTIN WITH PLANNING COMMITTEE MTC/ABAG I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
19 THE DOZENS OF STAFF ACROSS PLANNED BAY AREA DRAFT, AND I AM
20 JOINED BY CHIRAG RABARI, AND RALEIGH MCCOY, AND ADAM NOELTING.
21 I WILL PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF DRAFT PLAN BAY AREA 2050
22 ADVANCED TO THE COMMISSION AND BOARD IN JANUARY AND SECOND
23 HALF FOCUSING ON THREE PRIMARY DELIVERABLES RELATED TO DRAFT
24 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THE IMPLEMENT DOCUMENT THE DOCUMENT AND
25 ENVIRONMENT IMPACT REPORT EIR ALL OF THESE REPORTS ARE



June 11, 2021

1 AVAILABLE ON PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG AND WE'RE ACCEPTING COMMENTS
2 THROUGH JULY 20TH. NEXT SLIDE. AS YOU'RE ALL AWARE WE'RE IN
3 THE FOURTH YEAR OF A FOUR YEAR LONG PLANNING PROCESS TO
4 ENVISION THE FUTURE OF THE BAY AREA OVER THAT TIME THE PUBLIC
5 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT HAS BEEN AN ELEMENT OF THAT PROCESS
6 WITH 290 PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS AND EVENTS USING DIVERSE
7 TECHNIQUES TO ATTRACT PARTICIPANTS FOR ENGAGEMENT WITH YOUTH,
8 NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS AND PERSONS WITH LOW INCOME. YIELDING
9 OVER 200,000 COMMENTS FROM 19,000 PARTICIPANTS PROCESS BEGAN
10 IN 2018 WITH THE LAUNCH OF THE HORIZON INITIATIVE WHERE WE
11 ACKNOWLEDGE THE FUTURE IS HIGHLY UNCERTAIN AND WE NEED
12 RESILIENT AND EQUITABLE STRATEGIES TO MAKE OUR REGION
13 SUCCESSFUL IN THE DECADES AHEAD. LITTLE DID WE KNOW A GLOBAL
14 PANDEMIC WOULD UNDERSCORE THE IMPORTANCE OF EXPLORING FORCES
15 LIKE THOSE EXPLORED IN HORIZON THINGS LIKE EXPONENTIAL GROWTH
16 AND TELECOMMUTING CONCERNS RELYING ON SHARED TRANSPORTATION
17 MODES AND RESIDENTIAL COMMERCIAL PREFERENCES AND MORE. SO
18 COVID UNDERSCORED WHY PLANNING FOR UNCERTAINTY NEEDS TO BE THE
19 NEW NORM. GENERATING DOZENS OF STRATEGY IDEAS THROUGH
20 PERSPECTIVE PAPERS THAT WERE THEN STRESS TESTED THROUGH
21 MULTIPLE ROUNDS OF FUTURES PLANNING, LOOKING AT WHAT IF
22 SCENARIOS FOR THE REGION AND HONING IN ON INDIVIDUAL
23 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS, WE WERE ABLE TO UNDERSTAND IF THESE
24 STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS WOULD HOLD UP UNDER UNCERTAINTY AND
25 OUT OF THAT CAME THE 25 RESILIENT STRATEGIES THAT BECAME THE



June 11, 2021

1 FOUNDATION OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA DRAFT BLUEPRINT ADVANCED IN
2 2020 AND MODELED THROUGH THE SPRING. AS WE ALL KNOW THE DRAFT
3 BLUEPRINT ADVANCED GOALS OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND FELL
4 SHORT ON KEY ISSUES INCLUDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, CONGESTION
5 AND CROWDING, DISPLACEMENT RISK GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND
6 JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE ALL WHICH WERE IMPROVED IN THE FINAL
7 BLUEPRINT WHICH REVISED AND AUGMENTED STRATEGIES INTO A FINAL
8 SET OF 35 STRATEGIES WHICH WERE ADVANCE IN FALL OF 2020. WE
9 STUDIED THOSE THROUGHOUT THE FALL AND THAT CULMINATED IN THE
10 RELEASE OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AT THE END OF LAST CALENDAR
11 YEAR AND THE ADVANCEMENT OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT INTO THE
12 ENVIRONMENTAL PHASE IN JANUARY. SO, WITH THE BLUEPRINT
13 PROCESS, AND THE YEAR 2020 IN THE REAR-VIEW MIRROR, WE HAVE
14 TURNED OUR EFFORT TO THE ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS THIS WINTER,
15 CRAFTING EIR ALTERNATIVES BASED ON SCOPING COMMENTS AND
16 DOCUMENTING THE DRAFT PLAN THROUGH THE OFFICIAL PLAN DOCUMENT
17 AND SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS. AND AS WE REPORTED TO THIS
18 COMMITTEE IN THE PAST FEW MONTHS WE HAVE BEEN DEVELOPING THE
19 NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AS WELL TAKING THE 35 STRATEGIES
20 AND TRANSLATING TO 70 IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS FOR MTC AND ABAG
21 THAT NEST UNDERNEATH THE STRATEGIES. THIS RECENT RELEASE OVER
22 THE LAST COUPLE OF WEEKS WILL LEAD US INTO THE FINAL PLANNED
23 BAY AREA 2050 WHICH WILL BE CONSIDERED FOR ADOPTION BY MTC AND
24 ABAG IN THE FALL. I'LL RECAP WHAT'S IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OR
25 AS WE NOW REFER TO IT, "THE DRAFT PLAN." NEXT SLIDE. QUICK



June 11, 2021

1 REFRESHER THE PLAN VISION OF COURSE IS TO ENSURE THAT BY 2050
2 THE BAY AREA IS MORE AFFORDABLE CONNECTED DIVERSE HEALTHY AND
3 VIBRANT FOR ALL THE FOUR ELEMENTS TRANSPORTATION HOUSING
4 ECONOMY AND ENVIRONMENT INCLUDE STRATEGIES THAT COULD BE
5 ADVANCED ON THE COUNTIES LOCAL REGIONAL OR STATE LEVELS AND
6 ARE FUNDED WITH IDENTIFIED REVENUES TO KEEP THE PLAN FISCALLY
7 CONSTRAINED. NEXT SLIDE. OF COURSE AT THE CORE OF THE PLAN
8 THINKING ABOUT WHERE WE GROW AND JUST AS IMPORTANTLY WHERE DO
9 WE NOT GROW. AREAS IDENTIFIED FOR GROWTH ARE KNOWN AS GROWTH
10 GEOGRAPHIES IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PLAN AND ACCOMMODATE THE
11 FORECASTED INCREASE OF 1.4 MILLION NEW HOUSEHOLDS AND JOBS
12 SUSTAINABLE EQUITABLE GROWTH FOCUSING ON GROWTH IN AREAS WITH
13 HIGHER QUALITY TRANSIT AND WHAT WE CALL HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS IN
14 COMMUNITIES WITH LOW RESOURCE SCHOOLS AND GREAT ACCESS TO
15 JOBS, PARKS, SCHOOLS, AND MORE. THE MAP SHOWS PRIORITY
16 DEVELOPMENT AREAS, PRIORITY PRODUCTION, AREAS AS WELL AS
17 REGIONALLY DESIGNATED TRANSIT RICH AREAS AND HIGH RESOURCE
18 AREAS ALL COMBINED THE FOUR DIFFERENT GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES
19 PUBLISHED FOR EACH CLIMATE AND EQUITY GOALS. AND BY FOCUSING
20 GROWTH IN THESE PLACES WE PROTECT PARKS OPEN SPACE AG-LANDS
21 AND MORE AT THE REGION'S PERIPHERY FROM DEVELOPMENT AND
22 PRESERVE THEM FOR FUTURE GENERATIONS TO ENJOY AND FOCUS GROWTH
23 AWAY FROM UNMITIGATED HIGH HAZARD AREAS PLACES WITH FIRE RISK
24 AND SEA LEVEL RISE. STRATEGIES ARE AT THE CORE OF THE PLAN NOT
25 JUST ABOUT WHERE WE GROW IN THE REGION BUT HOW DO WE GROW IN



June 11, 2021

1 THESE PLACES THAT'S WHAT THE STRATEGIES ARE ALL ABOUT. 35
2 STRATEGIES IN TOTAL NEST UNDER THE 11 THEMES ACROSS THE FOUR
3 ELEMENTS. THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT FOCUSES ON MAINTAINING
4 AND OPTIMIZING THE EXISTING SYSTEM WHILE CREATING HEALTHY AND
5 SAFE STREETS FOR ALL ROADWAY USERS AND BUILDING OUT A NEXT
6 GENERATION TRANSIT NETWORK THE HOUSING ELEMENT OF THE DRAFT
7 PLAN FOCUSES ON THE THREE PS OF HOUSING PROTECTION
8 PRESERVATION AND PRODUCTION WHILE WORKING TO CREATE MORE
9 INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES ECONOMY OF THE PLAN INCLUDES STRATEGIES
10 FOCUSED ON CREATING ECONOMIC MOBILITY BY CREATING PATHWAYS TO
11 THE MIDDLE CLASS AND SHIFTING LOCATION OF JOBS TO ACHIEVE
12 BETTER JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE WITHIN THE REGION AND LAST BUT NOT
13 LEAST ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT INCLUDES STRATEGIES TO REDUCE
14 HAZARDS FROM EARTHQUAKE, SEA LEVEL RISE, EXPAND ACCESS TO
15 PARKS AND REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS THROUGH ELECTRIFICATION AND
16 DEMAND MANAGEMENT TRANSFORMING COMMUNITIES TO REALIZE THE PLAN
17 WILL REQUIRE FINANCIAL RESOURCES THE BOLD STRATEGIES IN THE
18 DRAFT PLAN REQUIRE NEARLY \$1.4 TRILLION IN REVENUES OVER THE
19 NEXT DECADES SPREAD OVER THE FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN
20 EXISTING FUND SOURCES FOR TRANSPORTATION OVER THE NEXT 30
21 YEARS WOULD BE ABLE TO FUND 80% OF THE INVESTMENT IN THAT
22 ELEMENT AND THE REMAINDER RELIES ON NEW REVENUES AS WELL AS
23 REVENUES GENERATED BY THE PLAN'S STRATEGIES. FUNDING GAPS ARE
24 MORE SIGNIFICANT FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
25 AND ENVIRONMENTAL RESILIENCE AND THE REGION MAY NEED TO STEP



June 11, 2021

1 UP TO THE PLATE IN AN EVEN GREATER MANNER IN THESE POLICY
2 AREAS TO MAKE THE NECESSARY HEADWAY. ULTIMATUM MADLY END OF
3 THE DAY FOCUSING THE ADVANCE VISION OF THE DRAFT PLAN WILL
4 REQUIRE NEW FEDERAL, STATE, REGIONAL, OR LOCAL REVENUE
5 MEASURES. NEXT SLIDE. BASED ON THE EXISTING LAND USE PATTERN
6 IN THE REGION, OVERALL HOUSEHOLD AND JOB GROWTH FORECASTS AT
7 THE REGIONAL SCALE, THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND MOST IMPORTANT
8 OF ALL, THE 35 STRATEGIES THAT INFLUENCE THE LOCATION OF
9 HOUSEHOLDS AND EMPLOYMENT, WE HAVE DEVELOPED PROJECTIONS FOR
10 WHERE HOUSING AND JOBS MIGHT BE LOCATED OVER THE NEXT THREE
11 DECADES. WE KNOW THAT THE FUTURE IS HIGHLY UNCERTAIN BUT THIS
12 GROWTH PATTERN HELPS US UNDERSTAND THE TYPES OF PLACES THAT
13 WOULD SEE MORE GROWTH IF THE STRATEGIES ARE MORE FULLY
14 IMPLEMENTED IN THE YEARS AHEAD. THE GROWTH PATTERN FOR HOUSING
15 ON THE LEFT SHOWS THAT THE PLAN FULLY ACCOMMODATES THE 1.4
16 MILLION NEW HOUSEHOLDS WITH UNITS AT ALL INCOME LEVELS THE
17 BUBBLE SHOWS THE SIZE OF GROWTH IN EACH COUNTY WITH THE SHARE
18 INDICATED ON THE BUBBLES. YOU WILL NOTE SANTA CLARA COUNTY IN
19 THE DRAFT PLAN WOULD TAKE THE LARGEST SHARE OF HOUSING GROWTH
20 THIRD OF ALL NEW UNITS, EAST BAY ANOTHER THIRD AND THE
21 REMAINDER LOCATED PRIMARILY IN SAN FRANCISCO AND THE
22 PENINSULA, NORTH BAY, ON THE OTHER HAND, WOULD SEE LESS THAN
23 10% OF FUTURE HOUSING OVER THE 30 YEAR TIME PERIOD. ROUGHLY
24 43% OF GROWTH WOULD BE IN THE BIG THREE CITIES OF SAN JOSE,
25 SAN FRANCISCO, AND OAKLAND, WITH FOUR OUT OF FIVE NEW HOMES



June 11, 2021

1 LOCATED WITHIN A QUICK WALK OF FREQUENT HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT.
2 ALL NEW HOUSING COULD BE ACCOMMODATED WITHIN EXISTING URBAN
3 GROWTH BOUNDARIES. WHEN IT COMES TO FUTURE JOBS THE PATTERN ON
4 THE RIGHT SHOWS THE STRATEGIES SUCCESSFULLY ALIGN WITH THE
5 LOCATION OF NEW JOBS WITH THE LOCATION OF NEW HOMES. NOTICE
6 THE SIMILARITY OVERALL, IN THE SIZE OF THE BUBBLES FOR JOBS
7 AND HOUSING BETWEEN THE TWO MAPS. JUST LIKE HOUSING, ROUGHLY
8 A THIRD OF ALL NEW JOBS WOULD BE LOCATED IN THE SOUTH BAY AND
9 STRATEGIES WERE SUCCESSFUL AT SHIFTING A GREATER SHARE OF NEW
10 JOBS TO HOUSING-RICH COMMUNITIES IN PLACES LIKE ALAMEDA AND
11 SOLANO COUNTY TO CREATE BETTER JOB HOUSING BALANCE. THREE OUT
12 OF FIVE NEW JOBS WOULD BE LOCATED WITHIN A WALK TO TRANSIT. AT
13 THE END OF THE DAY MOST IMPORTANT ARE OUTCOMES FOR BAY AREA
14 RESIDENTS. KEY OUTCOMES INCLUDE THE FIVE SHOWN ON THE SCREEN.
15 OF COURSE, PERHAPS MOST IMPORTANT IS IMPROVING AFFORDABILITY
16 GIVEN OUR REGION'S HOUSING, LONGER STANDING HOUSING CRISIS. IN
17 2015 THE AVERAGE HOUSEHOLD SPENT 58% OF THEIR ANNUAL INCOME ON
18 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION WELL ABOVE THE NATIONAL AVERAGE THE
19 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN BRING THAT DOWN BY 13% POINT WITH 45%
20 OF HOUSEHOLD ANNUAL ITEM BY 2050 CLOSELY MATCHING AT NATIONAL
21 AVERAGE LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS GREATER GAINS WITH
22 TRANSFORMATION STRATEGIES TARGETED TO PROVIDE RELIEF TO INCOME
23 BASED DISCOUNTS AND TOLLS TRANSIT FARES HOUSING STRATEGIES
24 PRIORITIZED DEED RESTRICTED HOUSING AND PROVIDING MORE INCOME
25 SECURITY FOR THE HOUSEHOLDS. THE DRAFT PLAN MAKES THE BAY AREA



June 11, 2021

1 CONNECTED WITH ALL MODES OF TRANSPORTATION WITH FREQUENT AND
2 SEAMLESS TRANSIT NETWORKS FOR COMMUNITIES AND THOUSANDS OF
3 MILES OF BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN PATHS ENABLING 20% OF WORKERS
4 TO SHIFT AWAY FROM AUTO COMMUTING AND ENABLING NEARLY HALF OF
5 HOUSEHOLDS AND 75% OF ALL LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS TO LIVE WITHIN
6 A HALF MILE OF FREQUENT TRANSIT. THE PLAN PROVIDES MORE
7 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN HISTORICALLY EXCLUSIONARY JURISDICTIONS
8 AND CREATES MORE CHOICE IN HOUSING LOCATIONS FOR LOW INCOME
9 HOUSEHOLDS ENABLING MORE DIVERSE AND INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES. AS
10 WE KNOW FAMILIES WITH LOW INCOMES MANY OF WHOM HAVE BEEN
11 DISPLACED AT THE REGION'S PERIPHERY WILL HAVE OPTIONS TO
12 RELOCATE. RENTER PROTECTION THAT ENABLE MORE RESIDENTS TO STAY
13 IN PLACE AND REDUCE THE RISK OF DISPLACEMENT AND ASSISTANCE
14 FOR HOME OWNERSHIP PROGRAMS WOULD HELP LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS
15 BUY THEIR FIRST HOME ALSO THE PLAN HELPS MEET THE STATE-
16 MANDATED GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGET BY ADVANCING
17 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN RESIDENTS WILL BE FORECASTED TO BE
18 HEALTHIER SAFER BETTER ACCESS TO PARKS BETTER AIR QUALITY SAVE
19 THE FROM COLLISIONS REDUCED RISK OF EXPOSURE TO EARTHQUAKES
20 AND WILDFIRES AND FINALLY THE PLAN MAKES THE MORE VIBRANT IN
21 THE YEARS AHEAD IMPROVING JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE IN THE BAY AREA
22 AND BRINGING MORE JOBS TO HOUSING-RICH COMMUNITIES IN THE
23 NORTH BAY AND EAST BAY AND HOMES TO THE COMMUNITIES IN THE
24 WEST BAY AND SOUTH BAY YIELDING SHORTER COMMUTES FOR WORKERS.
25 ROBUST ECONOMIC OUTPUT JOB GROWTH NEGOTIATORS SUGGEST THE BAY



June 11, 2021

1 AREA WOULD THRIVE UNDER THE DRAFT PLAN BY REINVESTING IN THE
2 REGIONAL REVENUE SOURCES BACK INTO THE CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE
3 NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE WE JUMP INTO THE NEXT HALF FOR
4 SPECIFIC DELIVERABLES INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT PLAN RELEASE WE
5 HAVE A SHORT VIDEO THAT SPOTS LIGHTS THE PURPOSES ON THE DRAFT
6 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FROM ELECTED OFFICIALS. [VIDEO PLAYING
7]

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PLANNED BAY AREA IS A FUTURE WHERE IT LOOKS
10 AT LOCAL COMMUNITIES IN OUR COUNTIES AND CITIES HOW ARE WE
11 GOING TO GROW TOGETHER WHERE JOBS MIGHT BE HOUSING COULD BE
12 BUILT WHERE INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENTS ARE NEEDED THAT WE NEED
13 EXACTLY AFTER A PANDEMIC. CLIMATE CHANGE IS REAL. WHAT PLANNED
14 BAY AREA DOES IS CREATES STRATEGIES AT THE LOCAL LEVEL THAT
15 THE PUBLIC UNDERSTANDS.

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** BERKELEY HAS MANY THINGS BUT THE
18 ADOPTION OF SINGLE FAMILY ZONING IN ORDER TO EXCLUDE AFRICAN
19 AMERICANS FROM AN EXCLUSIVE NEIGHBORHOOD WE TOOK A BOLD ACTION
20 TO COMMIT TO END EXCLUSIONARY ZONING IN BERKELEY BY 2022.
21 CORRECTING MANY GENERATIONS OF EXCLUSION AND LACK OF
22 OPPORTUNITY.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** WE ARE STANDING AT PASEO ESTERO PART OF 211
25 AFFORDABLE UNITS BRAND-NEW RIGHT ON OAKLAND'S GORGEOUS



June 11, 2021

1 WATERFRONT. PLANNED BAY AREA WOULD MAKE THIS TYPE OF BEAUTIFUL
2 DEVELOPMENT AVAILABLE FOR MORE BAY AREA RESIDENTS. I'M REALLY
3 EXCITED THAT THE PLAN TALKS ABOUT GUARANTEED INCOME. IN
4 OAKLAND, WE JUST LAUNCHED ONE OF THE LAW ENFORCEMENT
5 GUARANTEED INCOME DEMONSTRATIONS IN THE COUNTRY.

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** IT WILL HELP TRANSFORM THIS CITY OF SAN JOSE
8 THAT WAS BUILT FOR AUTOMOBILES INTO A CITY BUILT FOR PEOPLE.
9 WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO CREATE THE NATION'S FIRST MAJOR
10 CITY, HIGH SPEED RAIL STATION RIGHT HERE IN SAN JOSE. HIGH
11 SPEED RAIL HAS THE OPPORTUNITY TO CREATE EXTRAORDINARY
12 ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY FOR MILLIONS OF CALIFORNIA'S.

13

14 **AMY R. WORTH:** PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS GOING TO ACHIEVE A
15 SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION IN GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IN THE BAY
16 AREA OVER THE NEXT 25 YEARS. INCREASED TRANSIT PROVIDING
17 FUNDING FOR BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN INVESTMENTS IN OUR COMMUNITY,
18 AND PROVIDING INCENTIVES FOR PEOPLE TO SHIFT THEIR MODE OF
19 TRAVEL. SUCH AS THIS CHARGING STATION YOU SEE HERE AT THE BART
20 STATION.

21

22 **BELIA RAMOS, ABAG V. CHAIR:** PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS THE
23 REGION'S COMMITMENT FOR SOLVING EQUITY CRISIS AND
24 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE PROBLEM. THE NORTH BAY LOOKS AT



June 11, 2021

1 THE INDIVIDUAL NEEDS OF THE AREA WITH A GREATER PURPOSE FOR
2 THE REGION IT MEANS IT'S NOT A COOKIE CUTTER APPROACH FOR ALL.
3

4 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** WHAT WE'RE DOING OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS
5 IS ENVISIONING OVER \$400 BILLION OF ADDITIONAL INVESTMENT IN
6 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO IS
7 COMMITTED TO ADDRESSING HOUSING AFFORDABLE, AND DEALING WITH
8 SEA LEVEL RISE. ON THE SOUTHEASTERN WATERFRONT, THERE ARE
9 THOUSANDS OF NEW AFFORDABLE HOMES THAT ARE GETTING BUILT.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WHEN WE HAVE ABOUT 2 MILLION PEOPLE
12 MOVING TO THE BAY AREA OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS HOUSING IS AN
13 ISSUE THAT HADN'T BEEN ADDRESSED. WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE
14 TECHNOLOGY AND SILICON VALLEY AND NAPA WITH THE WINE INDUSTRY,
15 SOLANO COUNTY WITH ITS OPEN SPACE AND AGRICULTURE. ALL NINE
16 COUNTIES, IN THIS PLAN PRESERVES THE UNIQUE INDUSTRIES MAKING
17 IT AFFORDABLE CONNECTED FOR EVERYBODY ELEVATES A QUALITY OF
18 LIFE FOR EVERYBODY THAT LIVES HERE NO MATTER WHAT YOUR INCOME
19 IS. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS TO ALL THE ELECTED OFFICIALS WHO
20 PARTICIPATED IN THE DRAFT PLAN RELEASE VIDEO. CONTEXT SETTING
21 ON WHAT THE DRAFT PLAN IS, JUST REFRESHING ALL THE ACTIONS
22 THAT YOU HAVE TAKEN OVER THE PAST YEARS LET'S TURN TO THE
23 DELIVERABLES ASSOCIATED WITH THE DRAFT PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. FIRST
24 AND PERHAPS MOST CENTRAL IS THE DRAFT PLAN DOCUMENT IT'S THE
25 CORE OF THE PLAN WEAVES TOGETHER ALL THE THINGS THAT WE SPOKE



June 11, 2021

1 ABOUT, THE VISION, STRATEGIES, GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, THE
2 OUTCOMES, THE IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS AND MORE, INTO A SINGLE
3 DOCUMENT. INCLUDES A CHAPTER FOR EACH OF THE FOUR ELEMENTS OF
4 THE PLAN STARTING WITH LAND USE, INCLUDING THE HOUSING AND
5 ECONOMY CHAPTERS AND TRANSITIONING INTO THE SUPPORTIVE
6 INFRASTRUCTURE AND INVESTMENTS IN THE TRANSPORTATION
7 ENVIRONMENT CHAPTERS INCLUDES FORECASTS AND FUTURE OUTCOMES OF
8 THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION. THE PLAN COMES IN AT 100 PAGES BUT
9 THERE IS ALSO HUNDREDS OF MORE PAGES OF SUPPORTING
10 DOCUMENTATION THAT COULDN'T FIT INTO THE CORE DOCUMENT YOU
11 WILL SEE A LIST OF VARIOUS SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS ON THE LEFT
12 SIDE THAT FILL THOSE GAPS AND LATER AUGMENTED BY THE AIR
13 QUALITY CONFORMITY REPORT BEING PRODUCED BY BOTH THE DRAFT
14 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM.
15 NEXT SLIDE. IT WILL BE GREAT TO SPOTLIGHT EACH REPORT ALTHOUGH
16 WE DON'T HAVE TIME TO DO SO TODAY, I WOULD BE REMISS IF I
17 DIDN'T ADDRESS THE DRAFT EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT GIVEN THE
18 CENTRALITY OF THE EQUITY. PROVIDING AN ADDITIONAL SPOTLIGHT ON
19 ANALYSIS KEY FINDING IN THE EQUITY REPORT SHOW THAT THE DRAFT
20 PLAN STRATEGIES DISPROPORTIONATELY BENEFIT LOW INCOME
21 HOUSEHOLDS AND HOUSEHOLD IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES
22 PREVIOUSLY CALLED COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AND THIS FINDING
23 APPLIES TO EACH OF THE FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN. AS SHOWN ON
24 THE RIGHT SIDE YOU WILL SEE A TABLE SUITE OF EQUITY METRICS
25 OUTCOMES FOR UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS AND WHETHER THE



June 11, 2021

1 DISPARITIES IN THE METRICS ARE REDUCED. UNDERSERVED HOUSEHOLDS
2 SEE IMPROVED OUTCOMES IN ALL METRICS AND REDUCES EXISTING
3 DISPARITIES. LAST BUT NOT LEAST THE REPORT SHOW IN DOCUMENTS
4 HOW THE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT IN THAT ELEMENT OF THE PLAN
5 FULFILL FEDERAL TITLE SIX AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
6 REQUIREMENTS. TURNING NOW TO THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WHERE WE
7 TAKE THE 35 LONG RANGE STRATEGIES OVER 35 YEARS AND SPECIFIED
8 A NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION ACTION THROUGH 2025. THE PLAN
9 SERVES AS CAP STONE TO THE DOCUMENT FEATURING IN ITS FINAL
10 CAPACITOR ALSO A SERIES OF IMPLEMENTATION PLAN BRIEFERS THAT
11 PROVIDE MORE CONTEXT. FOR EACH STRATEGY THE PLAN IDENTIFIES
12 SECTORS MTC AND ABAG HAVE TODAY FINANCIAL AUTHORITY RESOURCES
13 TECHNICAL CAPACITIES AND TECHNICAL AND POLITICAL SUPPORT AND
14 ALSO WHAT POTENTIAL ROLE THE ORGANIZATIONS COULD TAKE ON
15 WHETHER THAT'S LEADING, PARTNERING, OR PLAYING MORE OF A
16 SUPPORT ROLE. BUT OF COURSE FOR EVERY STRATEGY, PARTNERSHIP,
17 COLLABORATION WILL BE KEY SO EVEN FOR STRATEGIES WHERE MTC AND
18 ABAG IS SUGGESTED AS THE LEAD IT DOESN'T MEAN WE WOULD LEAD
19 ALONE. NEXT SLIDE. TO DATE THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IS
20 FOCUSED ON THE ACTIONS THAT MTC AND ABAG WOULD TAKE ON OVER
21 THE NEXT FIVE YEARS. WE'LL BE CONTINUING TO REVISE THOSE IN
22 THE FINAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. SOME HAVE ASKED, WHY THE FOCUS
23 ON MTC AND ABAG? MANY ORGANIZATIONS WILL BE NECESSARY TO
24 ADVANCE THE PLAN, AND WE AGREE. THE FOCUS TO DATE HAS BEEN
25 DRIVEN BY AN INCREASED INTEREST ON THE STATE LEVEL TO



June 11, 2021

1 UNDERSTAND WHAT MTC AND ABAG ARE DOING SPECIFICALLY TO ADDRESS
2 AND ADVANCE STRATEGIES SUCH AS THE CLIMATE NEXUS WHICH ARE
3 MANY STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN IMPORTANT FROM ACCOUNTABILITY
4 PERSPECTIVE WHAT IS THE REGION DOING TO ADDRESS THESE
5 STRATEGIES. WE BELIEVE KEY PARTNERSHIPS AND EFFORTS BEYOND MTC
6 AND ABAG BE INTEGRATED AND REFLECT THAT THESE CAN FURTHER
7 ACCELERATION IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS AND THAT'S WHY THE FINAL
8 PHASE OF THE PLANNING PROCESS WILL EXPAND THE IMPLEMENTATION
9 PLAN'S FOCUS BEYOND MTC AND ABAG UNDERSCORING THE IMPORTANCE
10 OF PARTNERSHIPS AS WE HEARD IN THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WORK SO
11 FAR. THE INITIAL DISCUSSION OF PROPOSED PARTNERSHIP ROLES,
12 SELECT INITIATIVES IN THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, AND SOME
13 KEY FOCUS AREAS FOR FUTURE COLLABORATION. WE'LL BE TAKING INTO
14 ACCOUNT PARTNER'S FEEDBACK DISCUSSING FEEDBACK WITH THEM IN
15 LATE JULY AND AUGUST AS WE WORK ON THE FINAL IMPLEMENTATION
16 PLAN WORKING WITH OPPORTUNITIES FOR PARTNER ORGANIZATIONS AND
17 PLANNING SEVERAL WEBINARS TO SHAPE INITIATIVES AND
18 RECOMMENDATIONS. WE'RE WORKING TO CONTINUE TO INTEGRATE
19 FEEDBACK RECEIVED AS THIS IS ONE OF THE MOST DYNAMIC IN THE
20 FINAL MOMENTS OF THE PLANNING PROCESS. LET'S TURN TO THE DRAFT
21 EIR. EIRS ARE REQUIRED UNDER THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL
22 QUALITY ACT, CEQA DISCLOSURE DISCOURAGEMENT WHERE IS WE
23 ANALYZE AND DISCLOSURE THE ENVIRONMENTAL EFFECTS OF THE
24 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE DRAFT PLAN TO INFORM DECISION MAKERS
25 LIKE YOURSELVES PARTNER AGENCIES AND THE PUBLIC AT-LARGE THE



June 11, 2021

1 EIR PUBLISHED LAST WEEK MEASURES SIGNIFICANT ADVERSE IMPACTS
2 AND EXPLORES REASONABLE RANGE OF ALTERNATIVES. THIS IS NOT
3 YOUR STANDARD PROJECT LEVEL EIR THAT YOU MIGHT SEE FOR A NEW
4 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT OR NEW TRANSIT PROJECT FOR A REGIONAL PLAN
5 OF THIS TYPE THE PROGRAM EIR IS CONDUCTED AT A HIGHER LEVEL
6 LOOKING AT BROADER IMPACTS AS OPPOSED TO SITE SPECIFIC IMPACTS
7 FOR SPECIFIC INDIVIDUAL INVESTMENT. NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT EIR
8 EXPLORED 14 DIFFERENT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS SHOWN IN THE TABLE
9 ON THE RIGHT SIDE. IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT THE EIR ANALYSIS
10 IS CONDUCTED BY COMPARING PRECOVID BASELINE CONDITIONS WITH
11 FUTURE DRAFT PLAN CONDITIONS. AND THIS MEANS THAT THE IMPACTS
12 FROM FUTURE GROWTH ARE CAPTURED IN THE CEQA ANALYSIS. EVEN IF
13 THE FUTURE GROWTH PATTERN THROUGH FOCUSED GROWTH IS -- HAS
14 FEWER ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS THAN A NO PROJECT STATUS QUO
15 TRAJECTORY. BECAUSE THAT OVERALL GROWTH, TOTAL GROWTH, IN THE
16 REGION, IS CAPTURED IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS, YOU WILL
17 SEE THERE ARE A NUMBER OF SIGNIFICANT AND UNAVOIDABLE IMPACTS
18 FOR ALL THE VARIOUS EIR ALTERNATIVES AS WELL AS THE DRAFT
19 PLAN. THE DRAFT EIR IDENTIFIES MITIGATION MEASURES FOR EACH OF
20 THE SIGNIFICANT AND UNAVOIDABLE IMPACTS AND THE TABLE SHOWS
21 THE IMPACTS PRIOR TO INTEGRATING THE MITIGATION MEASURES. MORE
22 DETAIL IN THE DRAFT EIR. NEXT SLIDE. TURNING TO THE TOPIC OF
23 THE ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS. THROUGH THE SCOPING PROCESS, MTC
24 AND ABAG STAFF DEVELOPED TWO ALTERNATIVES TO THE DRAFT PLAN
25 INCORPORATING THAT FEEDBACK THAT CREATE A REASONABLE RANGE.



June 11, 2021

1 THE TWO ALTERNATIVES AUGMENT THE NO PROJECT ALTERNATIVE
2 REQUIRED UNDER CEQA. SO IN THE NO PROJECT ALTERNATIVES
3 STUDIED, WE LOOKED AT WHAT THE BAY AREA WOULD LOOK LIKE IF THE
4 DRAFT PLAN IS NOT ADOPTED THIS MEANS NO TRANSPORTATION OR SEA
5 LEVEL RISE INVESTMENTS BEYOND THOSE THAT ARE COMMITTED, A
6 FOCUS ON GENERAL PLAN LAND USE, AND URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARY
7 EXPANSION, BASED ON HISTORICAL TRENDS. ALTERNATIVE ONE AND
8 ALTERNATIVE TWO BUILD UPON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES, BUT
9 MAKE MEANINGFUL MODIFICATIONS TO ACHIEVE DIFFERENT REGIONAL
10 OUTCOMES WITH A SIMILAR GOAL OF MINIMIZING ENVIRONMENTAL
11 IMPACTS. ALTERNATIVE ONE SHOWN ON THE SCREEN, OR SOMETIMES
12 REFERRED TO AS THE TRANSIT-RICH AREA OR DRA FOCUS ALTERNATIVE,
13 WOULD CONCENTRATE GROWTH IN AREAS THAT CONTAIN HIGH QUALITY
14 TRANSIT SERVICES, AND TO SUPPORT THIS MORE URBAN ORIENTED
15 GROWTH PATTERN ADDITIONAL CORE CAPACITY TRANSIT INVESTMENTS
16 WOULD BE FUNDED IN LIEU OF HIGHWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS THAT ADD
17 LANE-MILEAGE TO THE SYSTEM. TO EXPLAIN A FEW OF THE SPECIFICS
18 HERE, THE ALTERNATIVE MODIFIES FOUR HOUSING STRATEGIES FURTHER
19 CONCENTRATING HOUSING GROWTH IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS
20 SPECIFICALLY BY INCREASING THE DEVELOPMENT CAPACITIES,
21 FOCUSING MORE ON THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING MONEYS IN TRANSIT-RICH
22 AREAS AND PRIORITIZING TRANSIT-RICH AREAS IN MALL AND OFFICE
23 PARK PUBLIC LAND PROJECTS AND MODIFYING STRATEGIES FOR
24 INCREASED AVAILABILITY CAPACITY FOR JOBS IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS
25 AND ADDS ECONOMY STRATEGY TO CHARGE AN OFFICE DEVELOPMENT



June 11, 2021

1 BASED WORKPLACE RELATED. ATTRACTING URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES
2 WITH EN FOUR TO ALIGN CITY LIMES CONSTRAINING GROWING OUTSIDE
3 EXISTING BOUNDARIES TO REDUCE DEVELOPMENT FOOTPRINT ON FOCUS
4 GROWTH ON TRANSIT CITY CENTERS ON THE TRANSPORTATION FRONT
5 MODIFYING STRATEGIES PROJECTS ELIMINATING INTERCHANGE
6 EXTENSIONS, 680, WIDENING S 44 AND 239 AS WELL AS WIDENING
7 EXPRESS LANE PROJECTS. USING MONEY ON LOCAL TRANSIT FREQUENCY
8 BOOSTS LIKE MUNI, VTA, AND AC TRANSIT. ALTERNATIVE TWO
9 MODIFIES THE STRATEGIES AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN A DIFFERENT
10 WAY WE REFER TO THIS AS THE HIGH-RESOURCE AREA OR HRA FOCUS
11 ALTERNATIVE FOCUSING SUBSTANTIALLY HIGHER SHARE OF GROWTH IN
12 HRAS ESPECIALLY THOSE IN JOB RICH EXCLUSIONARY CITIES AND
13 NEIGHBORHOODS LOCATED IN THE SOUTH BAY. TO SUPPORT THE GROWTH
14 PATTERN IN REGIONAL EQUITY GOALS INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING FOR
15 MAJOR REGIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL RAIL EXPANSION PROJECTS WOULD
16 BE REDUCED AND GREATER FUNDING PROVIDED TO LOCAL BUS FREQUENCY
17 AND INCREASED EXPRESS EXPANDED TRANSIT FARE DISCOUNT PROGRAMS
18 ENHANCED NON-MOTORIZED INFRASTRUCTURE. SPECIFICALLY THE
19 ALTERNATIVE MODIFIES A SUITE OF STRATEGIES H3 TO ENABLE
20 GREATER CAPACITY INCREASE IN JOB RICH EXCLUSIONARY CITIES AND
21 THEIR NEIGHBORS WHILE BANNING CAPACITY INCREASES BEYOND LOCAL
22 ZONING IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. MODIFIES THREE MORE
23 HOUSING STRATEGIES TO SHIFT THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION
24 TO HRAS AND SCALES BACK MALL, OFFICE, AND PUBLIC LAND PROJECTS
25 OUTSIDE OF HRSS. AND TO MAXIMIZE DEVELOPABLE LAND FOR HOUSING



June 11, 2021

1 IN THESE JOB RICH EXCLUSIONARY JURISDICTIONS AND THE OFFICE
2 DEVELOPMENT CAP STUDIED? HORIZON WOULD BE REVIVED AS A
3 STRATEGY IN THIS ALTERNATIVE WHILE ELIMINATING STRATEGY EC
4 FOUR. LASTLY THE ALTERNATIVE WOULD POSTPONE REGIONAL AND
5 INTER-REGIONAL RAIL PROJECTS SOME OF WHICH HAVE DISPLACEMENT
6 INDUCING IMPACTS IN LIEU OF TARGETED TRANSPORTATION
7 INVESTMENTS TO SUPPORT AFFORDABLE LIFE STYLES IN THESE AREAS
8 THAT ARE PRIORITIZED FOR ADDITIONAL HOUSING GROWTH. EXPANDING
9 STRATEGY ADDITIONAL LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS FUNDING BIKE PED
10 IMPROVEMENT HIGH-RESOURCE COMMUNITIES UNDER STRATEGY TE
11 FUNDING MORE BUS FREQUENCY BOOST CAPACITY EXPANSIONS ON VTA
12 LIGHT RAIL UNDER STRATEGY T10 AND BOOSTING EXPRESS BUS
13 FREQUENCIES ON AC TRANSIT AND EXPRESS BUS LINES FROM VALLEJO
14 TO SAN FRANCISCO. SAN FRANCISCO TO SAN JOSE IN T12. BY
15 INVESTING IN \$33 BILLION DOLLARS ON STRATEGIES TO LOWER VMTS
16 IN URBAN COMMUNITIES, CHANGES WOULD NEED TO BE MADE TO
17 STRATEGY T11 REGIONAL AND INTER-REGIONAL RAIL. THE CHANGES
18 HERE WOULD ADJUST THE PHASING OF INVESTMENTS POSTPONING PERIOD
19 ONE RAIL PROJECTS LIKE CALTRAIN DOWNTOWN EXTENSION, VALLEY
20 LINK AND SOUTH BAY CONNECT TO AFTER 2035 AND BY SHIFTING
21 PERIOD TWO PROJECTS TO THE YEARS BEYOND 2050, OUTSIDE THE
22 PLAN'S SCOPE INCLUDING LINKS TO DUMBARTON RAPID TRANSIT AND
23 CALTRAIN HIGH SPEED RAIL AND IMPROVEMENTS SOUTH OF SAN JOSE.
24 PROJECTS WOULD BE USED PROPORTIONATELY FOR COMMUTERS AND LOCAL
25 TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS WHERE MORE EQUITY ORIENTED ALTERNATIVE



June 11, 2021

1 WOULD BE TARGETED. IF THIS ALTERNATIVE IS SELECTED FOR THE
2 FINAL PLAN DELAYING PERIOD ONE PROJECTS TO PERIOD TWO DO NOT
3 PRECLUDE IMPORTANT PLANNING DESIGN AND ENGINEERING WORK IF NEW
4 REVENUES ARE IDENTIFIED THE PROJECTS COULD BE ADVANCED BACK TO
5 PERIOD ONE THROUGH A PLAN AMENDMENT OR SUBSEQUENT ITERATION OF
6 PLANNED BAY AREA. WITH ALL THAT CONTEXT OUT OF WAY OF
7 CHALLENGES TO ALTERNATIVES. WE MONITOR OUTCOMES. CHANGES
8 TRAJECTORY FOR A FOCUSED GROWTH IN ALTERNATIVE ONE AND A HIGH-
9 RESOURCE AREA FOCUS THE APPROACH IN ALTERNATIVE TWO, HOW WOULD
10 THEY YIELD DIFFERENT LAND USE PATTERNS IN THE POLICY CHANGES.
11 THIS TABLE SHOWS HOW THEY DIFFER FROM THE DRAFT PLAN BOTH IN
12 WHERE HOUSING IS WHERE JOBS ARE AND HOW THAT WOULD EFFECT
13 JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE. THERE IS MORE INFORMATION ON THE
14 SPECIFICS OF THE GROWTH PATTERN IN THE DRAFT EIR LET'S GO
15 THROUGH THE HIGHLIGHTS HERE. IN THE NO PROJECT NOT
16 SURPRISINGLY NOT WITHOUT ANY HOUSING STRATEGIES OR FOCUSED
17 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WE WOULD EXPECT A DISPERSED GROWTH PATTERN
18 OUTSIDE OF URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES MORE GROWTH OCCURRING IN
19 COUNTIES LIKE CONTRA COSTA FOR EXAMPLE. JOB GROWTH MORE
20 CONCENTRATED IN A PROJECT ALTERNATIVE SHIFTING LOCATION OF
21 JOBS TO HOUSING-RICH COMMUNITIES ANTICIPATING JOBS CONTINUING
22 TO CLUSTER TO A GREATER EXTENT IN SAN FRANCISCO AND SILICON
23 VALLEY. OBVIOUSLY THOSE TRENDS ARE PULLING IN OPPOSITE
24 DIRECTIONS WITH THAT SORT OF GROWTH PATTERN WE WOULD SEE
25 CONTINUED IMBALANCES IN TERMS OF JOBS AND HOUSING IN THE EAST



June 11, 2021

1 BAY AND WEST WAY AND NORTH BAY AND SOUTH BAY. LET'S GO TO
2 ALTERNATIVE ONE WITH TRANSIT SET OF ORIENTED CHANGES. GROWTH
3 PATTERN OF HOUSING THAT IS MORE CONCENTRATED WITH MORE GROWTH
4 IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS. MEANS THERE WOULD BE MORE HOUSING IN
5 TRANSIT-RICH PLACES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN MATEO COUNTIES
6 COMPARED TO THE DRAFT PLAN. AS A RESULT, THIS ALTERNATIVE HAS
7 THE HIGHEST SHARE OF GROWTH NEAR TRANSIT OF ANY ALTERNATIVE
8 MORE THAN NINE OUT OF TEN NEW HOMES WOULD BE WITHIN A SHORT
9 WALK OF FREQUENT TRANSIT. JOBS WOULD CLUSTER NETRANSIT IN THE
10 STRATEGY MORE GROWTH ALONG THE CONTRA COSTA COUNTY BART
11 STATION AREAS IN THIS ALTERNATIVE. IN THIS GROWTH PATTERN IN
12 TERMS OF JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE WITH MORE JOBS IN THE EAST BAY
13 AND MORE HOUSING IN THE WEST BAY AREA DOUBLES DOWN ON SOME OF
14 THE SUCCESS AREAS OF THE DRAFT PLAN AND YIELDS A BALANCED
15 GROWTH PATTERN ESPECIALLY IN JOB RICH SAN FRANCISCO AND CONTRA
16 COSTA. FOCUSING ON ALTERNATIVE TWO WITH HIGHS RESOURCE AREAS
17 SHIFTING MORE HOUSING TO THOSE AREAS ESPECIALLY THOSE THAT ARE
18 JOB RICH EXCLUSIONARY PLACES YIELDS MORE GROWTH IN SANTA CLARA
19 COUNTY WITH LESS GROWTH IN COMMUNITIES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO.
20 THAT CAME AT A COST BY BANNING NEW OFFICE BUILDINGS AND LARGE
21 CHUNKS OF SILICON VALLEY CAUSING EMPLOYERS LOOKING FOR
22 COMMUNITIES TO RELOCATE THEIR FUTURE WORKFORCE MANY CHOOSING
23 TO SETTLE IN SAN FRANCISCO INSTEAD OF CREATING MORE
24 CONCENTRATED GROWTH PATTERN IN THE CITY. RESULTING IN A LESS
25 BALANCE PATTERN WITH AN WITH MORE JOB RICH SAN FRANCISCO.



June 11, 2021

1 THERE ARE HUNDREDS OF METRICS INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT PLAN AND
2 EIR: THESE ARE FOUR THAT HELP TELL THE STORY OF THE
3 ENVIRONMENTAL AND EQUITY OUTCOMES RELATED TO THE VARIOUS
4 ALTERNATIVES. STARTING WITH ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES ON THE LEFT,
5 YOU WILL SEE THE GREENHOUSE GAS PERFORMANCE BETWEEN THE DRAFT
6 PLAN AND THE ALTERNATIVES. DIFFERENCES ARE IN JUST THE 10THS
7 OF THE PERCENTAGE POINT WE FOUND ALTERNATIVE TWO IS SLIGHTLY
8 BETTER THAN THE OTHER ALTERNATIVES IN PART BECAUSE IT PAIRED
9 TARGETING VMT REDUCING INVESTMENTS WITH THE ADDITIONAL GROWTH
10 PATTERN ALTERNATIVE. LONGER TERM HOWEVER THE STORY IS
11 DIFFERENT ALTERNATIVE ONE BY THE YEAR 2050 WOULD OUTPERFORM
12 THE ALTERNATIVES FOR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND DOES THE
13 BEST JOB REDUCING VMT. SO BECAUSE THE 2035 GHG TARGET IS ONE
14 OF DOZENS OF ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS AND THE FOOTPRINT OF
15 ALTERNATIVE ONE IS SMALLER THAN THE OTHER ALTERNATIVES,
16 ALTERNATIVE ONE, ULTIMATELY PERFORMED THE BEST ON
17 ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES DUE TO ITS CONTRACTED FOOTPRINT AND
18 ELIMINATION OF ALL HIGHWAY EXPANSIONS. AND SO DESPITE THAT
19 PERFORMANCE ON THE GHG TARGET THE PREPONDERANCE OF THOSE
20 IMPACTS IDENTIFIES THAT ONE IS THE SUPERIOR ALTERNATIVE. LET'S
21 SWITCH GEARS TO EQUITY. ASKING TO YOU HONE IN ON THE TOPIC OF
22 DISPLACEMENT AND GENTRIFICATION AS PART OF THE EIR ANALYSIS AS
23 PART OF ALTERNATIVE TWO AND WE SOME INTERESTING FINDING HERE
24 AS WELL. THREE KEY METRICS TO TRY TO TELL THE STORY OF WHAT IT
25 WOULD BE LIKE TO BE A LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLD IN EACH OF THESE



June 11, 2021

1 DIFFERENT ALTERNATIVES. STARTING WITH AFFORDABILITY WITH THE
2 EXCEPTION OF THE NO PROJECT ALL ALTERNATIVES PERFORMED
3 SIMILARLY ON THIS METRIC SURPRISING GIVEN THEY HAVE SIMILAR
4 FUNDING LEVELS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING SIMILAR STRATEGIES IN
5 AFFORDABILITY ALTERNATIVES START OUT ON A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD
6 FOR THE DRAFT PLAN. LET'S START AT THE THIRD COLUMN SHOWING
7 HOUSEHOLD SHARE IN HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS DOES THE ALTERNATIVE
8 PROMOTE INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES. THE DRAFT PLAN RELEASE THE
9 SHARE OF LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS TO HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS TO 24%
10 ALTERNATIVE 1 AND 2 PERFORM SLIGHTLY BETTER AT 25 AND 27%
11 RESPECTIVELY. BECAUSE LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS HAVE A GREATER
12 OPPORTUNITY TO RELOCATE TO DEED RESTRICTED UNIT IN HIGH-
13 RESOURCE AREAS IN ALTERNATIVE TWO, WE HAVE IDENTIFIED
14 ALTERNATIVE TWO AS RANKING HIGHER ON THIS METRIC. THE LAST
15 METRIC DISPLACEMENT RISK AND EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES THAT
16 HAVE A HIGHER SHARE OF LOW INCOME OR COMMUNITIES OF COLOR.
17 COMPLICATED STORY HERE. FIRST OF ALL, WE KNOW THAT THE LACK OF
18 HOUSING PRODUCTION, ESPECIALLY THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE
19 REGION'S CORE HAS BEEN A KEY DRIVER IN THE DISPLACEMENT OF LOW
20 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND PERSONS OF COLOR TO OUTLYING AREAS.
21 LOOKING AT THESE EIR ALTERNATIVES HELPS US UNDERSTAND THE
22 STRATEGIES AND VARIOUS GROWTH PATTERNS CAN CHANGE THAT GOING
23 FORWARD. WE CAN'T FORECAST DISPLACEMENT IN OUR ANALYSIS
24 BECAUSE IT WOULD REQUIRE KNOWING WHY SOMEBODY MOVES. BUT WE
25 CAN LOOK AT AREAS LOSING LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS OVER THE



June 11, 2021

1 PLANNING PERIOD AND GET A SENSE OF THOSE COMMUNITIES CHANGING.
2 WHAT WE DON'T KNOW IS THE CAUSE OF THE LOSS. WAS THE LOSS OF
3 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS DUE TO GENTRIFICATION PUSHING RESIDENTS
4 OUT OR VOLUNTARILY RELOCATION TO ANOTHER COMMUNITY WITH HIGHLY
5 RANK SCHOOLS. WE CAN SAY THERE ARE FLAGS IN THE CHARACTERISTIC
6 OF THE COMMUNITY AND GIVES A SENSE OF STABILITY OVER TIME AND
7 RAISES A FUNDAMENTAL PUBLIC POLICY QUESTION WHAT SHARE OF
8 AFFORDABLE HOUSING SHOULD BE IN EXISTING PRIORITY COMMUNITIES.
9 WHAT HAVE WE LEARNED HERE NO PROJECT ALTERNATIVE HAS HIGHEST
10 DISPLACEMENT RISK IN THESE COMMUNITIES IN PART BECAUSE IT HAS
11 THE FEWEST AFFORDABLE HOUSING INVESTMENTS DRAFT PLAN FELL IN
12 THE MIDDLE OF THE PACK WITH 40% OF COMMUNITIES SEEING SOME
13 LEVEL OF DISPLACEMENT RISK OR CHANGE BETWEEN 2015 AND 2050.
14 ALTERNATIVE ONE, THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF GROWTH NEAR TRANSIT IN
15 URBAN CORE OF SAN FRANCISCO ACTUALLY RANKED THE BEST FOR THIS
16 METRIC BY BUILDING MORE HOUSING ESPECIALLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING
17 IN TRANSIT-RICH COMMUNITIES WHICH OFTEN OVERLAP WITH EQUITY
18 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. THIS ALTERNATIVE PROVIDED A GREATER
19 LEVEL OF COMMUNITY STABILITY TO RESIDENTS. WHILE ALTERNATIVE
20 TWO PERFORMED WORSE THAN THE DRAFT PLAN, AS MORE AFFORDABLE
21 HOUSING WAS LOCATED OUTSIDE OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES
22 THESE RESIDENTS MIGHT EXPERIENCE GREATER PRESSURE TO RELOCATE
23 TO HIGHER RESOURCE COMMUNITIES OVER TIME. ULTIMATELY IT'S A
24 POLICY TRADEOFF QUESTION. THE TYPE OF MOVING TO OPPORTUNITY
25 DOES YIELD BENEFITS FOR COMMUNITIES AS COMMUNITIES ACROSS THE



June 11, 2021

1 REGION BECOME MORE INTEGRATED BUT IT MIGHT LEAD TO CHANGES IN
2 COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTIC IN TODAY'S EQUITY PRIORITY
3 COMMUNITIES AS THEY EXPERIENCE GENTRIFICATION AS HOUSEHOLDS
4 RELOCATE. AND IT COMES BACK TO THE FUNDAMENTAL QUESTION OF
5 BALANCE, WHERE SHOULD FUTURE AFFORDABLE HOUSING BE IN THE
6 REGION? AND WHAT'S THE RELATIVE PRIORITY BETWEEN STABILIZING
7 COMMUNITIES AT RISK OF DISPLACEMENT AND CREATING NEW
8 AFFORDABLE COMMUNITIES IN TRADITIONALLY EXCLUSIVE PLACES. SO
9 IF EACH OF THESE ALTERNATIVES STRIKES A DIFFERENT BALANCE BUT
10 ARGUABLY ALTERNATIVE ONE PERFORMED THE BEST. THANK YOU FOR
11 YOUR PATIENCE WITH ALL OF THE DETAILS ON THE DRAFT PLAN TODAY
12 I'LL UNDERSCORE I'M NOT GOING TO RUN THROUGH ALL, ON THIS
13 SLIDE, THE FINAL FINDINGS THE PLAN VERSUS THE NO PROJECT WE
14 SEE HUGE BENEFITS OF THE STRATEGIES AND PUTS THE REGION ON A
15 BETTER PATH. ALTERNATIVE ONE, IN PARTICULAR WITH FOCUS ON
16 SHRINKING URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES AND SCALING BACK HIGHWAY
17 INVESTMENTS WOULD HAVE THE LEAST ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS AND
18 ALSO HAVE THE LOWEST DISPLACEMENT RISK, AND ALTERNATIVE TWO,
19 SHOWED US HOW THE REVISED STRATEGIES THERE, COMBINED WITH
20 COMPLIMENTARY TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT CAN ALLOW FOR MORE LOW
21 INCOME RESIDENTS TO RELOCATE TO HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS. NEXT
22 SLIDE. SO WHAT'S NEXT AFTER THIS MILESTONE? NEXT SLIDE. THE
23 PUBLIC REVIEW PERIOD IS NOW UNDERWAY, IF YOU GO TO THE NEXT
24 SLIDE, PLEASE. COMMENTS ARE DUE BY 5:00 P.M. JULY 20TH. THERE
25 IS MORE INFORMATION ON PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG. WE'RE HOLDING FOUR



June 11, 2021

1 WORKSHOPS AND THREE 2-PART PUBLIC HEARINGS, INCLUDING A TWO
2 PART PUBLIC HEARING AFTER THIS ITEM TODAY WHERE WE CAN TAKE
3 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC. VIDEOS ONLINE, YOUTH VIDEO CHALLENGE
4 AND A VIRTUAL TRIBAL SUPPLEMENT AND BOTTOM LINE THERE ARE A
5 LOT OF OPPORTUNITIES BETWEEN NOW AND JULY 20TH FOR THE PUBLIC
6 TO MAKE ALL OF THEIR VOICES HEARD ON THE PUBLIC COMMENT. THIS
7 LAST SLIDE PROVIDES CONTEXT WHAT HAPPENS NOW AND BETWEEN THE
8 FALL. AS WE GO INTO SUMMER, IN JULY WE WILL WRAP UP PUBLIC
9 WORKSHOPS AND REVIEW COMMENTS RECEIVED AND SEND A REPORT-OUT
10 TO ALL OF YOU IN AUGUST ON THE FEEDBACK RECEIVED. THE
11 PARTNERSHIP PHASE FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WILL BE REALLY
12 AT THE CENTER OF THE STAGE, AS NOTED EARLIER, WITH CONTINUED
13 DISCUSSIONS WITH PARTNERS TO SOLIDIFY ROLES AND PARTNERSHIPS
14 THROUGH EARLY SEPTEMBER. THE FINAL EIR WILL REQUIRE
15 DISCUSSIONS AND DECISIONS. FUNDAMENTALLY WITH THE BOARD AND
16 COMMISSION WE'LL NEED TO DECIDE WHETHER TO DRAFT PLAN AS THE
17 FINAL PLAN OR SELECT AN ALTERNATIVE. IT'S NOT POSSIBLE TO MIX
18 AND MATCH THE ALTERNATIVES AT THE 11TH HOUR BUT THE COMMISSION
19 AND BOARD COULD CHOOSE TO APPROVE ANY OF THE ALTERNATIVES OR
20 DIRECT STAFF TO STUDY HYBRID SET OF STRATEGIES AS ALTERNATIVE.
21 STRATEGIES WITH ALTERNATIVE 1 AND 2 WOULD LIKELY REQUIRE
22 ADDITIONAL MONTHS ASSUMING NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT
23 WHERE THE LATTER APPROACH MIXING AND MATCHING STRATEGIES WOULD
24 LIKELY DELAY PLAN ADOPTION AND PROJECT SPONSORS AND COUNTIES
25 AND CITIES WOULD BE IMPACTED DURING THE GRAY PERIOD DURING



June 11, 2021

1 WHICH THE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM CANNOT BE
2 AMENDED. THIS WOULD HAVE IMPACTS ON THE ABILITY OF SOME
3 PROJECT SPONSORS TO ADVANCE THEIR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND
4 COULD ALSO PUT THE REGION AT RISK FOR NOT BEING ELIGIBLE FOR
5 FEDERAL AND STATE FUNDS DURING THAT PERIOD. HOWEVER IF THE
6 DRAFT PLAN IS ADVANCED WE WOULD REMAIN ON TRACK FOR FALL
7 ADOPTION AND WE ARE SCHEDULED TO BRING THE FINAL PLANNED BAY
8 AREA 2050 TO MTC AND ABAG IN OCTOBER AND SUBMIT THE PLAN FOR
9 FINAL APPROVAL BY FEDERAL AND STATE AGENCIES. THANK YOU FOR
10 YOUR PATIENCE WITH THE PATIENCE TODAY. AND I WOULD BE HAPPY TO
11 TAKE QUESTIONS

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVID, DO YOU HAVE A QUESTION?

14

15 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I MISSED IT, ALMOST LIKE YOU SAID,
16 ALTERNATIVE THREE, BUT THE EXTENSION, TIME FRAME, EXTENSION,
17 FOR VALLEY LINK TO 2035 WAS WHICH ALTERNATIVE? >DAVE VAUTIN:
18 THAT'S ALTERNATIVE TWO.

19

20 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** RAFAEL, MANDELMAN.

23

24 **RAFAEL MANDELMAN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS
25 ABOUT THE PLAN, ITSELF, AND A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS ABOUT THE



June 11, 2021

1 EIR. ON THE PLAN, I WANT TO CONFIRM SOME THINGS THAT HAVE BEEN
2 -- I BELIEVE, STATED TO OUR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY STAFF,
3 BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE ACTUALLY CORRECT. ONE OF MY
4 QUESTIONS IS ON THE DRAFT TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST THE
5 OTHER IS ON THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREAS. ON THE
6 TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST, OUR CTA STAFF HAVE INDICATED THAT
7 THERE WERE SEVERAL CHANGES TO THE LIST FROM THE VERSION THAT
8 WAS APPROVED IN SEPTEMBER 2020, THAT THERE WERE SOME IMPORTANT
9 SAN FRANCISCO PROJECTS THAT APPEARED TO DROP OFF INCLUDING OUR
10 TRAIN CONTROL SYSTEM. WE UNDERSTAND THAT AT MTC STAFF HAVE
11 GIVEN ASSURANCES THAT THE SAN FRANCISCO PROJECTS LISTED IN THE
12 PREVIOUSLY APPROVED LIST ARE STILL INCLUDED, AND THAT YOU'RE
13 WORKING WITH CTA STAFF TO SPECIFICALLY NAME THOSE PROJECTS AND
14 THAT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO INCREASE OUR CHANCE OF GETTING
15 FEDERAL AND STATE FUNDING FOR THOSE PROJECTS, AND I JUST WANT
16 TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR STAFF'S UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT IS GOING
17 ON IS CORRECT. >DAVE VAUTIN: THAT'S CORRECT. WE WILL BE
18 MAKING SURE THAT THOSE PROJECTS ARE LISTED IN THE DESCRIPTION.
19 THOSE PROJECTS ARE CONTINUED TO BE INCLUDED AND THERE HAVE
20 BEEN NO CHANGES TO THE ACTUAL INVESTMENT IN THE PLAN. WE'LL
21 MAKE SURE THAT THE PROJECT DESCRIPTION ACKNOWLEDGES THOSE
22 SPECIFIC PROJECTS.
23
24 **RAFAEL MANDELMAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU. AND SIMILAR CONFIRMATIONS
25 ON THE SAN FRANCISCO'S PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREAS, HAVE NOT



June 11, 2021

1 BEEN INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT MAP, AND THAT INCLUDES TREASURE
2 ISLAND, EXCELSIOR, LAKES, OCEAN BEACH, WATERFRONT AND CENTRAL
3 WATERFRONT AND WE THINK THAT'S AN OVERSIGHT, STAFF THINKS IT'S
4 AN OVERSIGHT THAT'S GOING TO BE ADDED TO THE FINAL MAP BUT I
5 WANT TO ENSURE THAT A CORRECT UNDERSTANDING ON OUR STAFF'S
6 PART. >DAVE VAUTIN: SURE. WE FOUND A BIG WHERE THE DATA LAYER
7 FROM 2019 THIS APPLIES TO ALL COUNTIES IN THE PROCESS AND WILL
8 BE CORRECTED IN THE FINAL.

9

10 **RAFAEL MANDELMAN:** A LITTLE BIT FUNKY ABOUT WHAT GOT SPIT OUT
11 IN THE FINAL MODELING, THE ALTERNATIVE CONCENTRATING HOUSING
12 GROWTH IN JOB RICH AREAS AND RESULTS IN LESS HOUSING IN SAN
13 FRANCISCO AND DELAYS WHAT WE THINK ARE PRETTY IMPORTANT
14 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT IN SAN FRANCISCO ALSO RESULTS IN
15 MORE JOBS IN SAN FRANCISCO AND THAT STRUCK US AS BIZARRE, AND
16 WEIRD. AND CAN YOU TALK A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT WHY THAT IS?
17 AND HOW THAT MAKES SENSE? >DAVE VAUTIN: YEAH. IT'S A GREAT
18 QUESTION. BECAUSE, A FIRST REACTION IS, CERTAINLY, WHY IS
19 THERE THIS IMBALANCE. TWO THINGS. ONE, IN ORDER TO ENABLE THE
20 MAXIMUM AMOUNT OF HOUSING GROWTH IN THAT ALTERNATIVE IN THE
21 JOBS RICH EXCLUSIONARY PLACES, THERE WAS AN OFFICERS
22 DEVELOPMENT CAP PLACED ON MUCH OF SILICON VALLEY. AND WHAT
23 THAT BASICALLY MEANT IS NO OFFICE BUILDINGS COULD BE BUILT IN
24 THOSE PLACES SO IF YOU ARE A MAJOR TECH COMPANY AND YOU ARE
25 LOOKING TO LOCATE YOUR WORKFORCE SOMEWHERE, YOU WILL NEED TO



June 11, 2021

1 LOOK AT OTHER LOCATIONS BECAUSE IN THAT ALTERNATIVE, THAT
2 STRATEGY PRECLUDES NEW OFFICE IN CERTAIN CITIES. AND SO, MANY
3 OF THOSE EMPLOYERS IN OUR MODELING INDICATES THAT MANY OF THEM
4 WOULD SHIFT SOME OF THEIR FUTURE OFFICE DEVELOPMENT PLANS TO
5 SAN FRANCISCO, IT'S AN ATTRACTIVE LOCATION FOR A LOT OF THOSE
6 TYPES OF JOBS, AND THAT SOME OF THOSE FUTURE BUILDINGS WOULD
7 BE BUILT IN SAN FRANCISCO AS OPPOSED TO IN THE SOUTH BAY. THE
8 OTHER THING WE SAW IS BECAUSE THE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT
9 CAPACITIES WERE LOWER IN SAN FRANCISCO IN THAT ALTERNATIVE
10 BECAUSE OF THE VARIOUS STRATEGIES, ON CERTAIN PARCELS, INSTEAD
11 OF BEING BUILT UP AS HOUSING, MAYBE AT A DENSER LEVEL THAN THE
12 DRAFT PLAN, IT'S NOW BEING BUILT UP AS OFFICE SPACE OR JOB
13 SPACE, INSTEAD. AND THAT'S ULTIMATELY BECAUSE, WHEN WE LOOK AT
14 THE FORECAST FOR DIFFERENT PARCELS, THE DEVELOPER HAS TO MAKE
15 A CHOICE IF THEY'RE ONLY ALLOWED TO BUILD A CERTAIN NUMBER OF
16 UNITS AND IT'S A LOWER LEVEL THEY MIGHT GO WITH OFFICE USE OR
17 MIXED USE THOSE ARE THE TRADE-OFFS WE SAW IN THAT ALTERNATIVE.

18

19 **RAFAEL MANDELMAN:** I'M SORRY, THE VMT BASED FEE WAS PUT INTO
20 ALTERNATIVE TWO, BUT NOT ONE? >DAVE VAUTIN: VMT BASED FEE WAS
21 IN ALTERNATIVE ONE AND THE OFFICE DEVELOPMENT CAP IS
22 ALTERNATIVE ONE. OFFICE DEVELOPMENT CAP IS A MORE AGGRESSIVE
23 STRATEGY ON THAT FRONT.

24



June 11, 2021

1 **RAFAEL MANDELMAN:** IT WOULD BE INTERESTING TO SAY, YOU COULD
2 MODEL THIS IN DIFFERENT WAYS BUT IT WOULD ALSO BE INTERESTING
3 TO SEE WHAT WOULD HAPPEN WITH THAT OFFICE FEE IN ALTERNATIVE
4 TWO. >DAVE VAUTIN: ACTUALLY THAT WAS THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT, IF
5 YOU RECALL IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE LOOKED AT THAT OFFICE,
6 THE VMT BASED DEVELOPMENT FEE AND IT WAS ONE OF THE DRIVERS
7 THAT CAUSED THE SOUTH BAY TO SEE MORE HOUSING IN THAT
8 ALTERNATIVE. THE OFFICE DEVELOPMENT CAP IS A MORE AGGRESSIVE
9 APPROACH TO TRY TO MAXIMIZE CAPACITY IN THOSE JURISDICTIONS.

10

11 **RAFAEL MANDELMAN:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** PAT EKLUND.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR SPERING. I HAVE TWO
16 QUESTIONS. ONE, ON THE EIR, AND ONE ON THE IMPLEMENTATION
17 PLAN. I'M GOING TO TAKE THE LATTER FIRST. ON PAGE 117, THERE
18 IS A SENTENCE, IT SAYS "THE ACTION PLAN FOCUSED ON AREAS WHERE
19 THE PLAN'S PERFORMANCE WAS MOVING SIGNIFICANT WRONG DIRECTION
20 AND SOUGHT TO ADDRESS EMERGING POLICY ISSUES SUCH AS HOUSING
21 AND RESILIENCE." WHERE IS THE ANALYSIS OF THAT, THAT LEADS US
22 TO THAT STATEMENT? >DAVE VAUTIN: I BELIEVE THAT'S REFERRING
23 TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 ACTION PLAN, THIS IS FOUR YEARS
24 AGO, THERE WERE A COUPLE OF ISSUE AREAS WHERE THE PLAN
25 PERFORMANCE METRICS WEREN'T MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AND



June 11, 2021

1 THAT WAS THE ANALYSIS THAT LEAD TO THE ACTION PLAN
2 PRIORITIZING THOSE TOPICS WITH THIS CYCLE WITH THE
3 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WE LOOKED COMPREHENSIVE ACROSS THE ENTIRE
4 PLAN AND IDENTIFIED IMPLEMENTATIONS OPTIONS FOR ALL THE
5 STRATEGIES.

6

7 **PAT ECKLUND:** CAN YOU ACCEPTED ME A LINK TO WHERE THE MATERIAL
8 IS? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES.

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHAT SPECIFICALLY WAS GOING
11 IN THE WRONG DIRECTION. SO THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND THEN,
12 SECOND QUESTION, IS, IF ABAG, MTC, CHOSE THE ENVIRONMENTALLY
13 SUPERIOR ALTERNATIVE, AND I KNOW THAT THERE IS A LOT OF, YOU
14 KNOW, ISSUES WITH THAT, WOULD IT CHANGE THE HOUSING
15 DISTRIBUTION IN THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA? SO WOULD WE HAVE
16 TO REDO THE METHODOLOGY? OR, WHAT IMPLICATIONS, FOR THE
17 HOUSING NUMBERS, WOULD THAT HAVE IF WE CHOSE THAT ENVIRONMENT
18 ALTERNATIVE. >DAVE VAUTIN: THE ABAG APPROVED THE FINAL
19 METHODOLOGY WHICH BAKES IN THE DRAFT PLAN. THESE TWO PROCESSES
20 ARE NOW PROCEEDING ON SEPARATE TRACKS ANY CHANGES TO THE
21 PREFERRED -- WHATEVER PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE IS SELECTED FOR
22 THE FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WOULD NOT FEEDBACK INTO THE
23 RHNA PROCESS THE ALLOCATIONS HAVE BEEN ISSUED AND THE APPEALS
24 ARE UNDERWAY.

25



June 11, 2021

1 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS? I SEE NO
4 OTHER HANDS. MARTHA, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BY ANY CHANCE, DID YOU WANT TO READ THAT
7 NOTE BEFORE I TOOK PUBLIC COMMENT?

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I'M NOT FOLLOWING YOU. COUNSEL,
10 JUST TELL US WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT?

11

12 **MATT MALONEY:** CHAIR SPERING. MATT MALONEY, DIRECTOR OF
13 REGIONAL PLANNING, WE'RE ON ITEM FIVE, AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM
14 DISCUSSING THE PLAN AND EIR. PUBLIC HEARING IS ITEM SIX.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I KNOW THE PUBLIC HEARING. I'M
17 JUST SAYING, DO WE TAKE -- IS THERE ANYBODY WANTS TO COMMENT
18 ON WHAT WAS JUST PRESENTED? THAT'S WHAT I'M ASKING. DO WE HAVE
19 ANYBODY THAT WANTS TO COMMENT ON WHAT WAS JUST PRESENTED? I'M
20 GOING TO OPEN THE PUBLIC HEARINGS IN A MINUTE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE A FEW MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
23 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. FIRST UP IS TIM FRANK. GO AHEAD AND
24 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. CHAIR SPERING? TWO
25 MINUTES?



June 11, 2021

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES. TWO MINUTES.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** TIM FRANK, GO AHEAD.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** PERFECT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO COMMENT
7 SPECIFICALLY ON SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT WERE RAISED IN THE
8 PRESENTATION JUST HEARD. JUST BY WAY OF INTRODUCTION, I'M TIM
9 FRANK, AND I'M REPRESENTING THE BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION
10 TRADES COUNCIL OF ALAMEDA COUNTY. AND WE HAVE BEEN TRACKING
11 THE PLANNED BAY AREA FOR YEARS, AND BELIEVE OURSELVES TO BE A
12 SIGNIFICANT STAKEHOLDER IN THE SUCCESS OF THIS PLAN. AND WE'RE
13 REALLY EXCITED ABOUT WHAT WE THINK IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO
14 PARTICIPATE WITH YOU IN THE FINAL FEW MONTHS IN CORRECTING
15 WHAT WE THINK ARE SOME DEFICIENCIES HERE IN THE PLAN THAT ARE
16 WORTHY OF ATTENTION. SO, I JUST BRING YOUR ATTENTION TO THE
17 FACT THAT DAVE NOTED THAT HORIZON PLAN, WHICH IS SORT OF THE
18 ORIGINAL STUDY OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN THE BAY AREA AND THE
19 CHALLENGES IT FACES, PRODUCED A REPORT THAT HAD 25 STRATEGIES,
20 AND IT WAS RECOGNIZED BY ALL TO BE SEVERELY DEFICIENCY AND IT
21 NEEDED CONTINUAL WORK. AND IT FELL SHORT ON A NUMBER OF
22 FRONTS. IT IDENTIFIES, FOR INSTANCE, THE BOOM AND BUST CYCLE,
23 ASSOCIATED WITH CERTAIN SECTORS BEING A PROBLEM BUT DIDN'T
24 HAVE STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THAT. IF YOU LOOK AT THE FINAL 35
25 STRATEGIES INTRODUCED IN THE FALL OF 2020, THEY STILL,



June 11, 2021

1 ACTUALLY, DON'T HAVE THE STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THAT SPECIFIC
2 ISSUE. AND IT'S ACTUALLY SOMETHING OF A DEFICIENCY, WHICH WE
3 WOULD LIKE TO LOOK AT. AND IT IS INTERESTINGLY ENOUGH,
4 SOMETHING THAT WAS DISCUSSED EXTENSIVELY DURING THE CASA
5 PROCESS WHERE THE BUILDING TRADES PROVIDED AMPLE INPUT BUT
6 DIDN'T REALLY GET REFLECTED IN ANY OF THE STRATEGIES
7 INCORPORATED IN THE CURRENT DOCUMENT. SO THE BUILDING AND
8 CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCIL WOULD LIKE TO OFFER OUR SERVICES
9 AND PARTNER, A FORMAL PARTNER, WORKING WITH THE STAFF, AND
10 CONSIDERING STRATEGIES THAT MIGHT --

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, TIM. THAT'S TIME.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, SIR.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS ROLAND. ROLAND, GO AHEAD AND
19 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AND GOOD MORNING. YOU HAVE PROBABLY HEARD
22 THIS FROM ME, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN BRING BACK SLIDE NUMBER
23 SEVEN, AND I HAVE MENTIONED THIS BEFORE. IT'S IN THE SCOPING
24 COMMENT, YOU HAVE TO MOVE THOSE TWO MASSIVE BUBBLES BACK TO
25 THE CENTER OF THE MAP. BECAUSE IF YOU DON'T, YOU ULTIMATELY



June 11, 2021

1 GOING TO HAVE THE NO PROTECT ALTERNATIVE SANTA CLARA COUNTY.
2 AND THIS IS HAPPENING RIGHT NOW. THIS IS ABSOLUTELY MASSIVE
3 AFFORDABLE HOUSING GROWTH. NONE EXISTENT JOB GROWTH, AND
4 FREEWAY WIDENING WHICH CURRENTLY WE HAVE A MASSIVE CHOKE POINT
5 SOUTH OF GILROY, BECAUSE THEY'RE WIDENING FREEWAYS IN SAN
6 BENITO COUNTY. AND WE IN SANTA CLARA GET ALL OF THE MASSIVE
7 GROWTH. IN CLOSING, THERE ARE 21 COUNTIES IN 21, BUT WE'RE
8 ONLY PLANNING FOR NINE HERE. MAYBE WE CAN HAVE THIS DISCUSSION
9 LATER AT THE LEG COMMITTEE, BUT WHEN ARE WE GOING TO START
10 INTRODUCING LEGISLATION ADDRESSING THIS. IN CLOSING I'M GOING
11 TO READ AN E-MAIL I GOT FROM DAVE IN AUGUST 2020, AND IT
12 BASICALLY SAYS IN THE LONGER TERM PERHAPS SOME DAYS THERE WILL
13 BE ONE MPO FOR THE CALIFORNIA MEGA REGION OF COURSE SUPPORT
14 FROM ELECTED OFFICIALS ACROSS MANY CITIES AND COUNTIES, I'M
15 GOING TO TELL YOU WHAT ALTERNATIVE IS, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A
16 SEPARATE MPO IN THE SOUTH BAY IF SOMETHING IS NOT ADDRESSED
17 ANY TIME SOON. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU ROLAND. NEXT UP IS RICH
20 HEDGES. RICH, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. THIS IS GOING TO BE TAKEN FOR COMMENT BOTH
23 ON 5 AND 6. I SPOKE WITH DAVE DURING THE PACT MEETING
24 YESTERDAY, AND I BELIEVE ALTERNATIVE ONE IS A SUPERIOR
25 ALTERNATIVE, NOT ONLY FOR THE COUNTIES NEAR AND WITHIN WHICH I



June 11, 2021

1 LIVE, BUT ALSO FOR THE WHOLE BAY AREA. IT HAS THE MORE
2 POSITIVE ASPECTS WITH FEWER OF THE NEGATIVES OF ANY OF THE
3 OTHER PLANS. SO, I WOULD SUBMIT TO YOU THAT WE NEED DO
4 ALTERNATIVE ONE. THANK YOU. I'LL KEEP THIS SHORT.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, RICH. NEXT UP IS PHONE
7 NUMBER ENDING IN 5555. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES, WE CAN, KEN.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I THINK THIS WHOLE PLAN IS REALLY A DISASTER,
14 ESPECIALLY'S ECONOMIC'S THE CONCEPT OF NOT CAPTURING
15 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS THAT MAKE WAY MORE VALUABLE IS
16 REALLY WRONG WE'RE GIVING MILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO MAKE
17 DEVELOPABLE PROPERTY MORE VALUABLE AND THE PUBLIC IS PAYING
18 FOR THAT, AND THE PEOPLE THEY -- PAYING FOR IT. IF YOU DON'T
19 HAVE ANY FORM OF VALUE RECAPTURE THEN WE'RE GOING TO BE
20 RAISING TAXES IN PERPETUITY BECAUSE WE'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE
21 MONEY TO DO ANYTHING IF WOE HAD A FUND TO COLLECT AND CREATE
22 [INDISCERNIBLE] THEN WE COULD BALANCE THE BUDGET. WHO IS GOING
23 TO PAY FOR ALL THIS STUFF IN WHERE DO YOU SEE EQUITY. ALL LANE
24 TOLLING? WHAT'S THAT GOING TO DO? MAKE THE PRICE OF EVERYTHING
25 MORE EXPENSIVE WE'RE ON THE SAME PATH MAKING EVERYTHING MORE



June 11, 2021

1 EXPENSIVE DRIVING LOW INCOME PEOPLE OUT AND WHERE IS THE
2 PARTICIPATION? WHEN THIS MODEL WAS INTRODUCED THE URBAN SIM
3 WAS GOING TO BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC AND ELECTED
4 OFFICIALS AND THAT HASN'T HAPPENED. THE ONLY ONE THAT HAS
5 ACCESS IS STAFF. THAT DOESN'T MAKE A LOT OF SENSE. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LASTLY, ANTHONY. UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. I'M VERY THANKFUL THAT THIS PLANNED BAY
10 AREA IS MOVING FORWARD, AND I REALLY AGREE WITH THE
11 COMMISSIONERS THAT WE DEFINITELY NEED TO INVEST IN A MUCH
12 BETTER FUTURE, ESPECIALLY, YOU KNOW, LIKE FOR TRANSPORTATION
13 PLANNING, LIKE YOURS, TRULY. HOWEVER, I AM PARTICULARLY
14 CONCERNED ABOUT THE ELECTRIC VEHICLES PORTION OF THE PLAN,
15 WHEREIN, AS YOU MENTIONED IN THE DRAFT PLANNED BAY AREA PLAN,
16 YOU ARE AL KATHY \$4 BILLION. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK, HOW MUCH OF
17 IT WILL GO TOWARDS ELECTRIFYING OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
18 NETWORK? ESPECIALLY WHEN THERE ARE, LIKE, WHEN THERE IS
19 ALREADY A MANDATE FROM THE STATE, THAT, YOU KNOW, LIKE, ALL
20 TRANSIT VEHICLES BEING PROCURED FROM, I BELIEVE THIS FISCAL
21 YEAR, MOVING FORWARD, TO BE ALL ELECTRIC, AND HOW FLEXIBLE IS
22 THE MTC TOWARDS, YOU KNOW, LIKE, ALLOCATING MORE MONEY TOWARDS
23 PURCHASING THESE ALL ELECTRIC VEHICLES? SO THAT WE CAN, YOU
24 KNOW, LIKE, WE CAN MOVE FORWARD WITH A GREENER AND MORE
25 SUSTAINABLE FUTURE, ESPECIALLY FOR ALTERNATIVE PUBLIC



June 11, 2021

1 TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS, LIKE BUSES AND BICYCLES? THANK YOU
2 VERY MUCH.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THAT WAS OUR LAST PUBLIC SPEAKER. NO
5 WRITTEN COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OUR NEXT TWO
8 ITEMS ARE PUBLIC HEARINGS. AND, MATT AND MARTHA, I'M GOING TO
9 GO AHEAD AND DO THE INTRODUCTION HERE, AND IF I MISS SOMETHING
10 AT THE END, MAYBE YOU CAN HELP FILL IT IN. I WOULD LIKE TO
11 BEGIN WITH AGENDA ITEM 6A THE PUBLIC HEARING FOR DRAFT PLAN
12 BAY AREA 2050. THE PUBLIC HEARING IS NOW OPEN. I'M OPENING THE
13 PUBLIC HEARING AND IT IS BEING TRANSCRIBED. IF YOU WISH TO
14 TESTIFY PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE IN ZOOM OR PRESS
15 STAR NINE TO BE ADDED TO THE QUEUE. WAIT TO BE CALLED UPON AND
16 WHEN CALLED UPON, UNMUTE YOURSELF OR DIAL STAR SIX WE ASK THAT
17 EACH SPEAKER BE BRIEF, CONCISE, AND KEEP COMMENTS TO NO MORE
18 THAN TWO MINUTES. STAFF JUST PRESENTED A DRAFT PLAN, BAY AREA
19 2050, AND ITS SHARED HIGHLIGHTS OF THE DRAFT PLAN DOCUMENT.
20 DRAFT SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS, THE DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
21 REPORT, AND THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. ALL OF THESE
22 DOCUMENTS ARE NOW POSTED ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA WEB SITES AT
23 PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG. THE DRAFT PLAN DOCUMENT, DRAFT BLUEPRINT
24 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT, AND THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WERE
25 POSTED ON WEDNESDAY, MAY 26TH, AND ALL DOCUMENTS ARE AVAILABLE



June 11, 2021

1 FOR PUBLIC INSPECTION, FOR PUBLIC COMMENT, FOR THE PUBLIC
2 COMMENT PERIOD. WHICH WILL CLOSE AT 5:00 P.M. ON TUESDAY JULY
3 20TH, 2021. AND TO LEARN MORE OF THE VARIOUS WAYS TO SUBMIT
4 COMMENTS, PLEASE VISIT PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/LEARN MORE. IN MAY
5 LEGAL NOTICES WERE PUBLISHED IN MULTIPLE LANGUAGES IN
6 NEWSPAPERS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA ANNOUNCING THE OPENING OF A
7 55 DAY PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD FOR THE DRAFT PLAN, DRAFT
8 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS, AND THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.
9 SECOND IS IDENTIFYING TODAY'S PUBLIC HEARING TO RECEIVE
10 TESTIMONY AND WRITTEN COMMENTS ABOUT THE DRAFT DOCUMENTS AND
11 IDENTIFY TWO ADDITIONAL VIRTUAL PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR
12 JUNE 22ND, AND JULY 7TH FOR DETAILS ON THE TWO ADDITIONAL
13 HEARINGS, VISIT PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/LEARN MORE. WRITTEN
14 COMMENTS CAN BE SUBMITTED UP TO 5:00 P.M. ON TUESDAY, MAY
15 20TH. STAFF WILL SHARE A SUMMARY OF ALL DOCUMENTS IN LATE
16 SUMMER PRIOR TO THE COMMISSION IN ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
17 CONSIDERING ADOPTION OF THE PROPOSED PLAN AND SUPPLEMENTAL
18 REPORTS. EIR AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. THE COMMISSION AND ABAG
19 EXECUTIVE BOARD ARE SLATED TO CONSIDER ADOPTION OF THE FINAL
20 DOCUMENTS IN THE FALL. AGAIN, TO LEARN MORE ON THE VARIOUS
21 WAYS TO SUBMIT COMMENTS, PLEASE VISIT PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/LEARN MORE.
22 THE DRAFT PLAN BAY AREA 2050 DOCUMENT DRAFT
23 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT, THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, HAVE BEEN
24 FORMALLY INTRODUCED AT TODAY'S MEETING. I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
25 MOTION TO WAIVE THE READING OF THE PROPOSED DOCUMENTS. AND



June 11, 2021

1 THIS WILL ALLOW FOR ANY INTEREST OF TIME, I WOULD LIKE TO GO
2 AHEAD AND MOVE THAT WE WAIVE THE READING AND I'LL ENTERTAIN A
3 SECOND.

4

5 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** SECOND, HUDSON.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THIS IS FOR MTC'S SIDE.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THAT'S CORRECT. MTC'S SIDE.

12

13 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** [INDISCERNIBLE] HUDSON.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YOU'RE RIGHT.

16

17 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I'LL SECOND. DUTRA-VERNACI.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND FOR THE RECORD, THE PUBLIC COMMENT
20 PERIOD ENDS JULY 20TH, NOT MAY.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. JULY 20TH. OKAY, WITH THAT,
23 WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. MARTHA WOULD YOU TAKE THE ROLL
24 FOR THE MTC MEMBERS, PLEASE?

25



June 11, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. IT PASSES.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. I'M GOING TO HAND IT OVER
4 TO CHAIR ARREGUIN TO WAIVE THE READING.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO
7 MAKE A MOTION TO WAIVE THE READING OF THE PROPOSED DOCUMENT IN
8 THE ALLOWANCE OF TIME. I WOULD ASK DIRECTOR HUDSON TO MAKE THE
9 MOTION?

10

11 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** NO. BUT I'LL SECOND YOUR MOTION.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MR. CASTRO WOULD YOU PLEASE CALL
14 THE ROLL?

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
17 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** NOW WE'LL BEGIN THE PUBLIC
22 HEARING FOR THE DRAFT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, WHICH INCLUDES
23 THE DRAFT PLAN DOCUMENT, DRAFT SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT, DRAFT
24 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, AND RECEIVE ANY ORAL TESTIMONY ABOUT
25 THESE DOCUMENTS. PLEASE NOTE, UPON THE CONCLUSION OF THIS



June 11, 2021

1 FIRST PUBLIC HEARING, WE HAVE ONE MORE THAT'S GOING TO FOLLOW,
2 WE'LL OPEN UP THE SECOND MEETING AND THIS WILL BE THE DRAFT
3 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT. ONCE AGAIN, IF YOU WISH TO
4 TESTIFY, PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE IN THE ZOOM, OR
5 PRESS STAR NINE TO BE ADDED TO THE QUEUE, AND PLEASE WAIT TO
6 BE CALLED UPON. WHEN CALLED UPON UNMUTE YOURSELF OR DIAL STAR
7 SIX. WE ASK THAT EACH SPEAKER BE BRIEF AND CONCISE AND KEEP
8 THEIR COMMENTS TO NO MORE THAN TWO MINUTES. ALSO, MAKING --
9 WHILE MAKING YOUR COMMENTS, PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME AND
10 ORGANIZATION, IF YOU WISH, FOR THE RECORD, AND BE SURE TO
11 SPEAK CLEARLY INTO THE COMPUTER OR PHONE'S MICROPHONE, SO THAT
12 THE TRANSCRIBER CAN CAPTURE YOUR COMMENT ACCURATELY. SO, WITH
13 THAT, LET'S BEGIN THE HEARING.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FIRST UP IS TIM FRANK. GO AHEAD AND
16 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** YES, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M TIM FRANK REPRESENTING
19 THE ALAMEDA COUNTY BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCIL.
20 AS I NOTED BEFORE, WE BELIEVE OURSELVES TO BE A SIGNIFICANT
21 STAKEHOLDER IN THE SUCCESS OF THE PLAN. THE PLAN IS REALLY
22 BUILT SUBSTANTIALLY AROUND CONSTRUCTION, AND THE AVAILABILITY
23 OF THE SKILLED AND TRAINED WORKFORCE TO ACTUALLY DO THAT WORK
24 IS ACTUALLY A CRITICAL ELEMENT THAT WILL DETERMINE WHETHER
25 YOU'RE SUCCESSFUL OR NOT. BY AND LARGE, THE OUTREACH,



June 11, 2021

1 EXTENSIVE THOUGH IT'S BEEN HAS NOT INVOLVED MUCH OUTREACH FROM
2 THE BUILDING TRADE ALTHOUGH WE DID PARTICIPATE EXTENSIVELY
3 THROUGH THE CASA PROCESS BUT WE THINK THAT'S A SHORTCOMING
4 THAT COULD BE FIXED IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS AND WE'RE
5 READY AND WILLING TO WORK WITH STAFF AND WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE
6 THE KIND OF OUTREACH EXTENDED TO US THAT'S OFFERED TO THE NON-
7 PROFIT COMMUNITY, EMPLOYER COMMUNITY, ET CETERA, THROUGH THE
8 DEVELOPMENT OF THE PLAN. AND I WOULD NOTE THAT A NUMBER OF
9 YOUR MEMBER AGENCIES HAVE ACTUALLY PARTICIPATED IN WITH THE
10 BUILDING TRADES OVER TIME. FOR INSTANCE, THE CITY OF BERKELEY
11 HAS DONE EXTENSIVE WORK WITH THE BUILDING TRADES, IT'S BEEN
12 VERY MUCH APPRECIATED ON OUR PART; BART HAS, SO HAS THE COUNTY
13 OF ALAMEDA. AND WE THINK THESE PARTNERSHIPS HAVE PRODUCED
14 RESULTS THAT ARE VERY CONSTRUCTIVE, AND WE THINK THAT THERE IS
15 AN OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE THE PLANNED BAY AREA, THROUGH A
16 FORMAL PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE REGIONAL AGENCIES AND THE
17 BUILDING TRADES, AND WOULD WELCOME THE OPPORTUNITY.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, TIM. NEXT UP IS ED EVANS.
20 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS ED EVANS WITH NORTHERN CALIFORNIA
23 CARPENTERS REGIONAL COUNCIL. LET'S AGREE ON ONE THING WHEN IT
24 COMES TO IMPLEMENTING A REGIONAL PLAN WITH SUCH A BROAD AND
25 AMBITIOUS VISION. IN ORDER TO MEET THE PLAN'S MOST IMPORTANT



June 11, 2021

1 GOALS, MAINLY, TO ADVANCE THE REGION'S MIDDLE CLASS JOBS AND
2 BUILDING MUCH NEEDED HOUSING WOULD BE CRITICAL TO EXPAND THE
3 REGION'S CONSTRUCTION WORKFORCE NOW THE PLAN PROPOSES TO
4 PROVIDE FUNDING FOR JOB TRAINING PROGRAMS AND INCUBATORS OF
5 NEW BUSINESSES. IF YOU THINK ABOUT IT GOVERNMENT FUNDING FOR
6 CONSTRUCTION CRAFT TRAINING IS UNNECESSARY. STATE CERTIFIED
7 APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMS ARE RUN JOINTLY BY LABOR UNIONS AND
8 ARE SELF FUNDED AND PAID FOR OUT OF THE COMPENSATION PACKAGES
9 OF THE TRADE WORKERS. FOR INSTANCE, THE CARPENTERS HAVE
10 INVESTED OVER \$100 MILLION IN THREE TRAINING CENTERS LOCATED
11 IN THE BAY AREA IN RECENT YEARS AND WE SPEND 20 MILLION
12 ANNUALLY ON TRAINING OPERATIONS. THIS IS WE FEEL THAT THE
13 CORRECT STRATEGY MTC AND ABAG TO CREATE IRON CLAD LINKAGE
14 BETWEEN BAY AREA TAXPAYER BACKED FINANCES INVESTMENT
15 INFRASTRUCTURE HOUSING TO EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES FOR
16 APPRENTICES. JOINT APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMS ARE SUCCESSFUL
17 RECRUITING, TRAINING AND RETAINING THOUSANDS OF BUILDING AND
18 CONSTRUCTION TRADE APPRENTICES. WHAT KEEPS THOSE PROGRAMS
19 GROWING [INDISCERNIBLE] IT'S SIMPLE. WE NEED STEADY
20 OPPORTUNITIES TO EARN WHILE THEY LEARN THROUGH EMPLOYMENT AND
21 SUPERVISION BY QUALIFIED JOURNEY-LEVEL CRAFTS PEOPLE. THE
22 LIMIT ON EXPANSION OF APPRENTICESHIP IS NOT A SHORTAGE OF
23 FUNDS, BUT A SHORTAGE OF DEVELOPER COMMITMENT TO EMPLOY
24 [INDISCERNIBLE] ON HOUSING PROJECTS. A SIMPLE REQUIREMENT TIED
25 PUBLIC ASSISTANCE FOR HOUSING WILL OVERCOME THAT LACK OF



June 11, 2021

1 COMMITMENT. NEXT STEP WE ASK AS STAFF IS TO MEET WITH
2 CARPENTERS AND OTHER BUILDING TRADE REPRESENTATIVES TO
3 IMMEDIATELY GET TO WORK ON PROPOSALS TO AMEND THE STRATEGIES
4 [INDISCERNIBLE] THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KEN BUKOWSKI.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THE MEASURES INCLUDED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ARE
9 UNCONSTITUTIONAL. THE FOUNDATION OF THE AMERICAN REVOLUTION
10 WAS WE WILL DIRECTLY ELECT THOSE WHO TAX US, AND THE PEOPLE ON
11 THE REGIONAL BOARDS ARE NOT DIRECTLY ELECTED. THERE IS NO
12 PROCESS FOR CITIZEN INITIATIVE AND NO PROCESS TO RECOMMEND A
13 REGIONAL DECISION. IN THE SCOPE, I REQUESTED AN ANALYSIS OF
14 THE FINANCIAL BENEFITS TO THE PROPERTY OWNERS WHO RECEIVE THE
15 BENEFIT OF THE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS AND I DON'T SEE ANY
16 SUCH ANALYSIS. THIRDLY, I THINK THAT FREE PUBLIC TRANSIT WOULD
17 GO A LONG WAY TO REDUCE AIR POLLUTION. AND IT WOULD CREATE A
18 REAL EQUITABLE SITUATION. FOR THOSE WHO CAN'T AFFORD TO PAY
19 FOR TRANSIT, WE'RE CREATING CRIMINALS. I DON'T THINK PEOPLE
20 REALLY REALIZE THAT. WHEN YOU CAN'T GO TO WORK AND YOU CAN'T
21 BE PRODUCTIVE, THEN YOU BECOME DISRUPTIVE. AND WHAT'S THE
22 ANALYSIS OF THAT? I DON'T SEE ANY ANALYSIS OF FREE TRANSIT. I
23 DON'T SEE ANY EQUITY THERE. EVERYBODY DESERVES THE RIGHT TO
24 GET WHERE THEY NEED TO GO, AND THAT DOESN'T SEEM TO BE
25 HAPPENING. AND THEN, LASTLY, I GUESS THE ENVIRONMENT, YOU



June 11, 2021

1 KNOW, WHY AREN'T WE SHARING URBAN SIM WITH THE PUBLIC AND WITH
2 THE ELECTED OFFICIALS? INSTEAD WE HAVE THE STAFF HAVING PUBLIC
3 HEARINGS AND THEN REPORTING THE FINDINGS TO THE ELECTED
4 OFFICIALS. THERE IS A BIG FILTER THERE WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
5 WHAT'S MORE POPULAR, BUT EVEN ONE COMMENT COULD BE MORE
6 IMPORTANT THAN OTHERS. I DON'T THINK THE STAFF SHOULD BE
7 HANDLING ALL THE PUBLIC HEARINGS. I THINK ELECTED OFFICIALS
8 NEED TO BE PRESENT SO THEY CAN HEAR THE COMMENTS FOR
9 THEMSELVES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, KEN. RICH HEDGES. YOU'RE UP
12 NEXT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. I JUST WANT TO REMIND THAT MY COMMENTS ON
15 NUMBER FIVE ALSO GO FOR THIS PARTICULAR ISSUE. HELLO?

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** I JUST WANT TO ADD THAT I HAVE GREAT CONFIDENCE IN
20 THE STAFF. THEY WORK VERY HARD. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
23 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

24



June 11, 2021

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. SO I -- MARTHA, I'M GOING
2 TO CONCLUDE THAT THERE IS NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENTS?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THAT IS CORRECT. NO WRITTEN PUBLIC
5 COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY I NOW DECLARE THE HEARING TO
8 BE CLOSED AND LOOK FORWARD TO THE HEARING SUMMARY OF THE
9 PUBLIC COMMENTS, AND THAT WILL BE AT A SUBSEQUENT MEETING
10 LATER THIS FALL. NOW WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 6B, THIS IS ALSO A
11 PUBLIC HEARING. AND THIS IS ON THE DRAFT EIR IMPACT REPORT.
12 AND THE SECOND PUBLIC HEARING IS NOW OPEN, AND ALSO BEING
13 TRANSCRIBED. IF YOU WISH TO TESTIFY, PLEASE USE THE RAISED
14 HAND FEATURE IN THE ZOOM OR PRESS STAR NINE TO BE ADDED TO THE
15 QUEUE, AND PLEASE WAIT TO BE CALLED UPON, AND WHEN CALLED
16 UPON, UNMUTE YOURSELF, OR DIAL STAR SIX. WE ASK THAT EACH
17 SPEAKER BE BRIEF, CONCISE, AND KEEP YOUR COMMENTS TO NO MORE
18 THAN TWO MINUTES. AS NOTED EARLIER, STAFF PRESENTED HIGHLIGHTS
19 OF THE DRAFT EIR, WHICH ARE NOW POSTED ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA
20 WEB SITE IN PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG. THE DRAFT EIR WAS POSTED ON
21 FRIDAY, JUNE 4TH, 2021, AND IS AVAILABLE FOR PUBLIC
22 INSPECTION, FOR THE DURATION OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD.
23 WHICH WILL ALSO CLOSE AT 5:00 P.M. ON TUESDAY JULY 20TH. TO
24 LEARN MORE ON THE VARIOUS WAYS TO SUBMIT COMMENTS ON THE DRAFT
25 EIR, PLEASE VISIT [PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/LEARN MORE](http://PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/LEARN_MORE). IN MAY, LEGAL



June 11, 2021

1 NOTICES ALSO WERE PUBLISHED IN MULTIPLE LANGUAGES AND
2 NEWSPAPERS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA ANNOUNCING THE OPENING OF
3 THE 45 DAY PERIOD, COMMENT PERIOD FOR THE DRAFT EIR,
4 IDENTIFIED TODAY'S PUBLIC HEARING TO RECEIVE ORAL TESTIMONY
5 AND WRITTEN COMMENTS ABOUT THE DRAFT DOCUMENT, AND IDENTIFYING
6 TWO ADDITIONAL VIRTUAL PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR JUNE
7 22ND, AND JULY 7TH, FOR DETAILS ON THOSE TWO ADDITIONAL
8 HEARINGS, AGAIN, VISIT PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/LEARN MORE. WRITTEN
9 COMMENTS CAN BE SUBMITTED UNTIL 5:00 P.M. ON TUESDAY JULY
10 20TH. STAFF WILL RESPOND TO ALL COMMENTS AND EXPERIMENTAL
11 ISSUES PRIOR TO THE COMMISSION IN ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
12 CONSIDERING CERTIFICATION OF THE FINAL EIR, ABAG AND THE
13 EXECUTIVE BOARD CONSIDERING CERTIFICATION OF THE FINAL EIR IN
14 THE FALL AGAIN TO LEARN MORE ABOUT VARIOUS WAYS TO SUBMIT
15 COMMENTS PLEASE VISIT PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/LEARN MORE. I WOULD
16 LIKE TO WAIVE THE READING OF THE PROPOSE DOCUMENT THIS IS IN
17 THE INTEREST OF TIME. I WILL MOVE. IS THERE A SECOND?

18

19 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND. DUTRA-VERNACI.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU CAROL. I WOULD LIKE TO
22 ASK THE CLERK TO PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL CALL OF THE MTC MEMBERS.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. IT PASSES. PASSING TO
25 MAYOR ARREGUIN



June 11, 2021

1

2 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION TO
3 WAIVE THE READING OF THE PROPOSED DOCUMENT OUT LOUD.

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** SECOND.

6

7 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL
8 PLEASE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. MOTION PASSES
11 UNANIMOUSLY

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BACK TO CHAIR SPERING.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MAYOR. WE WILL NOW
16 BEGIN WITH THE SECOND PUBLIC HEARING FOCUSED ON THE DRAFT EIR
17 AND RECEIVE ANY ORAL TESTIMONY ABOUT THE DOCUMENTS. ONCE
18 AGAIN, IF YOU WISH TO TESTIFY PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND
19 FEATURE IN ZOOM OR PRESS STAR NINE TO BE ADDED TO THE QUEUE
20 AND PLEASE WAIT TO BE CALLED UPON. WHEN CALLED UPON, UNMUTE
21 YOURSELF, OR DIAL STAR SIX. WE ASK THAT EACH SPEAKER BE BRIEF,
22 CONCISE, AND KEEP COMMENTS TO NO MORE THAN TWO MINUTES. A
23 REMINDER THAT WHEN YOU ARE MAKING YOUR COMMENTS, PLEASE STATE
24 YOUR NAME, IF YOU WISH, FOR THE RECORD, AND IF YOU -- AND TO
25 BE SURE TO SPEAK CLEARLY INTO YOUR COMPUTER OR PHONE'S



June 11, 2021

1 MICROPHONE SO THAT OUR TRANSCRIBER CAN CAPTURE YOUR COMMENTS
2 ACCURATELY. SO WITH THAT, LET'S BEGIN. MARTHA GO AHEAD AND
3 BEGIN THE PUBLIC TESTIMONY.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FIRST UP IS TIM FRANK. GO AHEAD AND
6 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO BEGIN BY, ONCE AGAIN,
9 INTRODUCING MYSELF. I'M TIM FRANK REPRESENTING THE BUILDING
10 AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCIL OF ALAMEDA COUNTY. AND I
11 WANTED TO COMMENT ON THE IMPORTANCE OF THE REGIONAL
12 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT. IF YOU LOOK AT THE EIR FOR THE
13 PREVIOUS PLANNED BAY AREA, IT IDENTIFIED A STRATEGY OF
14 FOCUSING DEVELOPMENT AROUND WHAT ARE CALLED "PRIORITY
15 DEVELOPMENT AREAS" AS ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT GREENHOUSE GAS
16 REDUCTION STRATEGIES, AND YET, IF YOU LOOK AT ENVIRONMENTAL
17 DOCUMENTS IN THE ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS PROVIDED FOR SPECIFIC
18 PLANS FOR PDAS, THEMSELVES, OR FOR PROJECTS THAT WERE LOCATED
19 WITHIN THOSE SPECIFIC PLAN AREAS, WE HAVE COMMENTED ON PROJECT
20 AFTER PROJECT, WHERE THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ANALYSIS DONE AT
21 THE LOCAL LEVEL ACTUALLY SAID THAT NO PROJECT OR ALTERNATIVE
22 WOULD ACTUALLY BE ENVIRONMENTAL SUPERIOR. WE THINK THIS IS A
23 CONFLICT BETWEEN THE REGIONAL DOCUMENT AND THE LOCAL DOCUMENT.
24 WHEN DAVE SAID THIS IS NOT THE STANDARD PROJECT LOCAL EIR,
25 HE'S RIGHT. IN FACT, THIS IS MORE IMPORTANT DOCUMENT. THIS IS



June 11, 2021

1 THE ONE THAT'S PROVIDING MORE ACCURATE REPRESENTATION OF WHAT
2 THE REAL BENEFITS ARE OF TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT. WE
3 THINK THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO BUILD INTO THE PLAN, A
4 STRATEGY, TO ENCOURAGE TIERING FROM THIS REGIONAL DOCUMENT IN
5 THE ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW THAT'S PROVIDED BY LOCAL GOVERNMENT
6 ON SPECIFIC PLANS, GENERAL PLANS, OR PROJECTS THAT ARE
7 CONSISTENT WITH THE REGIONAL PLAN, AND WOULD ENCOURAGE SOME
8 CONSIDERATION OF THAT TO IMPROVE THE PERFORMANCE OF CEQA,
9 OVERALL, IN HELPING US SUCCEED AND CREATE A SUSTAINABLE BAY
10 AREA. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, TIM. NEXT UP IS KEN BUKOWSKI.
13 KEN? GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. KEN?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. YES. THIS, I FIND THAT PLANNED BAY AREA IS
16 DEFICIENT. IT DOESN'T TALK ABOUT THE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS. THIS
17 REGIONAL TAXATION IS GOING TO TAKE AWAY THE ABILITY FOR LOCAL
18 GOVERNMENTS TO PROVIDE SERVICES. WE'RE ADDING TONS MORE
19 HOUSING AND THE NEED FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT TO PROVIDE SERVICES
20 IS MUCH GREATER THERE'S NO INCREASED REVENUE TO PAY FOR THOSE
21 SERVICES. THE PLAN IS DEFICIENT BECAUSE IT DOESN'T INCLUDE
22 TAXATION FOR THE LARGEST EMPLOYERS. THE HOUSING PROBLEM WAS
23 REALLY CREATED BECAUSE THE BUSINESS SECTOR ADDED SO MANY JOBS
24 AND THERE WAS NO ABILITY TO KEEP UP WITH THE DEMAND FOR
25 HOUSING, SO WHY AREN'T THEY PAYING ANYTHING? WHY DOES THIS



June 11, 2021

1 ALWAYS TAX THE PEOPLE INSTEAD OF THE PEOPLE THAT MAKE HUNDREDS
2 OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS AND DON'T GIVE ANYTHING BACK TO THE
3 COMMUNITY? I THINK THAT'S ANOTHER AREA THAT'S DEFINITELY
4 NEEDED TO BE LOOKED AT. THAT'S IT. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, KEN. AND THERE ARE NO MORE
7 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED AND NO PUBLIC
8 COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED BY 5:00 P.M. ON THIS ITEM.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC
11 SPEAKERS; IS THAT CORRECT?

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CONFIRMED.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I NOW DECLARE THE HEARING TO BE
16 CLOSED AND LOOKING FORWARD TO HEARING RESPONSES TO THE PUBLIC
17 COMMENTS RAISED ON THE ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES IN CONSIDERING THE
18 FINAL EIR FOR CERTIFICATION OF SUBSEQUENT MEETING THIS FALL.
19 WITH THAT, MATT, IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE THAT WE HAVE TO DO
20 OFFICIALLY FOR THESE TWO PUBLIC HEARINGS?

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** NO. WE DID IT. I THANK ALL THE MEMBERS FOR
23 FOLLOWING THE PROCEDURES TODAY. THANK YOU.

24



June 11, 2021

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I APPRECIATE EVERYONE BEING
2 PATIENT. THE COMPUTER I'M ON, THE TYPE IS TWO POINTS. I CAN
3 BARELY READ IT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE. MOVING TO ITEM
4 SEVEN, PUBLIC COMMENTS OR OTHER BUSINESS. ARE THERE ANY OTHER
5 PUBLIC COMMENTS? MARTHA?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENT WRITTEN
8 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND NO MEMBERS OF THE
9 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM COMMITTEE
12 MEMBERS? EITHER MTC OR ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE? SEEING NONE, THEN
13 THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED, AND OUR NEXT MEETING IS JULY 9TH.
14 IS THAT CORRECT? THANK YOU. THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

15 [ADJOURNED]

16



Broadcasting Government