## METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript





1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	WEDNESDAY, 9:35 A.M., MAY 26, 2021
3	
4	ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. BEFORE WE
5	BEGIN, I WOULD LIKE TO EXTEND OUR CONDOLENCES TO THE SANTA
6	CLARA COUNTY VTA FOR THE TRAGIC SITUATION, OUR HEARTS ARE WITH
7	THEM, OUR COLLEAGUES IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AS MORE
8	INFORMATION BECOMES AVAILABLE, WE'LL KNOW MORE, I WANT TO ECHO
9	WORDS FROM THE ENTIRE COMMISSION, IT'S SO CLOSE TO HOME AND
10	THIS AFFECTS SO MANY FAMILIES NOT JUST IN THE TRANSPORTATION
11	WORLD BUT SO MANY FAMILIES HAVE BEEN IMPACTED BY THIS
12	UNFORTUNATE SITUATION THAT HAS HAPPENED IN OUR BACKYARD. TO
13	OUR COLLEAGUES WHO ARE WITH YOU, WE'RE THINKING OF YOU AND
14	WILL CONTINUE TO HELP ANY WAY WE CAN, OUR RESIDENTS IN THE BAY
15	AREA. WITH THAT MAY I THE INTRODUCTORY VIDEO ANNOUNCEMENT?
16	[RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19
17	THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO
18	THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH
19	SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING
20	IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL
21	UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY
22	NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES
23	BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA
24	WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT
25	THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND





- 1 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK
- 2 SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE
- 3 CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
- 4 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
- 5 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
- 6 SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING
- 7 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS
- 8 RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL
- 9 BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
- 10 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
- 11 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A
- 12 ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS
- 13 AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.
- 15 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU JESS. I WANT TO THANK OUR IT
- 16 STAFF, YOU'RE DOING AN INCREDIBLE JOB. SOMETIMES TAKEN FOR
- 17 GRANTED. IT TAKES A LOT TO DO THIS. THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK
- 18 YOU AND YOUR TEAM DO. ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL PLEASE.
- 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: GOOD MORNING. PEDROZA?
- 22 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: HERE.
- 24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

19

21





1	COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA? ABSENT. AHN?
4	
5	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA?
8	
9	DIR. DAVID CANEPA: HERE.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS ABSENT.
12	CONNOLY?
13	
14	DAMON CONNOLLY: HERE.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
17	
18	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: EL-TAWANSY?
21	
22	DINA EL-TAWANSY: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING?
25	





VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: GIACOPINI? DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE. **CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?** FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: LICCARDO? ABSENT. MILEY? SUP. NATHAN MILEY: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN? GINA PAPAN: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBIT? DAVID RABBIT: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN? DIR. HILLARY RONEN: HERE. 





1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF? COMMISSIONER SCHAFF IS ABSENT. 3 SPERING? 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING: PRESENT. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WORTH? 8 AMY R. WORTH: HERE. 9 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT. 11 12 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, AND THANK YOU 13 COMMISSIONERS FOR JUMPING O LET'S MOVE TO ITEM TWO, THE PLEDGE 14 15 OF ALLEGIANCE. IF COMMISSIONER RABBIT COULD LEAD US IN THE 16 PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE? 17 DAVID RABBIT: GLADLY. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE 18 ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO 19 THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, 20 21 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL." 22 23 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RABBIT. LET'S MOVE TO ITEM THREE, COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. KIMBERLY, IF 24 YOU COULD PLEASE READ THE ANNOUNCEMENT? 25





- 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE
- 3 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY
- 4 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A
- 5 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
- 6 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
- 7 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

- 9 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY FOR THAT. ITEM
- 10 FOUR CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. MY REPORT THIS MONTH WILL BE BRIEF.
- 11 IN TERMS OF SB 629, ASSEMBLYMENBER CHU'S LEGISLATION SOME OF
- 12 US MIGHT HAVE BEEN SURPRISED BY THIS BECOMING A TWO-YEAR BILL.
- 13 WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SAY THIS IS NOT A SET BACK IT'S AN
- 14 OPPORTUNITY. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE ACTION PLAN THAT WILL COME
- 15 OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE, UNDER CHAIRMAN SPERING'S
- 16 LEADERSHIP, THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE DOING INCREDIBLE WORK TO
- 17 ADVANCED IMPORTANT INITIATIVES FOR OUR REGION FOR THE BENEFIT
- 18 OF THE RIDERS. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THE ACTION REPORT. AS
- 19 CHAIR OF MTC, I LOOK FORWARD TO PRIORITIZING THE SHORT-TERM
- 20 OBJECTIVES TO BENEFIT THE RIDERS WHERE WE HAVE THAT AUTHORITY.
- 21 AGAIN LOOKING FORWARD TO THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE CONCLUDING
- 22 THEIR WORK TALKING ABOUT THE NEXT STEPS, SHORT-TERM AND LONG-
- 23 TERM. THANKS TO CHAIR SPERING AND ALL THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS
- 24 AND THEIR INCREDIBLE WORK TAKING A DEEP DIVE INTO THE GOAL OF
- 25 DELIVERING FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE RIDERS, AND THE





- 1 COLLABORATION FROM OPERATORS HAS BEEN GREAT. [INDISCERNIBLE].
- 2 MOVING TO ITEM FIVE, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, RANDI KINMAN
- 3 ISN'T WITH US BUT CYNTHIA IS. GOOD MORNING.

- 5 CYNTHIA MURRAY: GOOD MORNING. OUR REPORT WILL BE AS FOLLOWS:
- 6 WE WERE SIGNIFICANTLY DELAYED IN OUR START OF THE MEETING
- 7 BECAUSE OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE RUNNING
- 8 OVERTIME. WE WERE AN HOUR LATE AND HAD A BIT OF A TRUNCATED
- 9 MEETING. AT OUR MEETING ON MAY 12TH THE COUNCIL RECEIVED THE
- 10 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE UPDATE AND RELEASE OF
- 11 THE DRAFT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. WE ALSO HAD THOUGHTFUL
- 12 DISCUSSION ABOUT THE PROPOSAL TO RENAME COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN
- 13 TO EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND THE COUNCIL VOTED
- 14 UNANIMOUSLY TO REFER A SUPPORT POSITION TO THE PLANNING
- 15 COMMITTEE FOR THE PROPOSAL TO USE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES
- 16 ACROSS THE MTC AND ABAG WORK AND PRODUCTS. AND THE MEETING
- 17 FOLLOWED BY EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE OF MAY 3RD AND
- 18 HEARD UPDATE FROM THE YOUTH INTERNSHIP WORKING GROUP AND
- 19 PROPOSAL TO RENAME COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AND FARE
- 20 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE ON MAY 10TH TO
- 21 RECEIVED UPDATE ON THE PROJECT, USER RESEARCH AND THE UPCOMING
- 22 PROJECT TASKS AND DISCUSSION OF PATHWAYS INTEGRATION TO
- 23 DEVELOP THE ALTERNATIVE FARE POLICIES AND EVALUATION
- 24 FRAMEWORKS AND EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE IS NOT MEETING
- 25 IN JUNE, AND NEXT MEETING JULY 9TH. THE FARE INTEGRATION AND





10

- 1 COORDINATION SUBCOMMITTEE NEXT MEETING IS JUNE 7TH. NEXT
- 2 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING IS JUNE 9TH AND UPDATE ON THE
- 3 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE HIGHLIGHTS OF DRAFT
- 4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DOCUMENT THE EIR IMPLEMENTATION PLAN TO
- 5 LEGISLATIVE UPDATE AND PRESENTATION ON THE REGIONAL TRANSIT
- 6 MAPPING WAYFINDING PROJECT. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

8 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? SEEING NONE.

9 ITEM SIX OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THERESE MCMILLAN.

11 THERESE MCMILLAN: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR, A FEW THINGS TO

- 12 HIGHLIGHT TODAY, EARLIER TODAY, WE RELEASED -- HAD A PRESS
- 13 RELEASE ON DRAFT -- THE DRAFT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 OBVIOUSLY
- 14 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS FOR A LONG TIME, THREE YEARS, IT
- 15 HAS BEEN RELEASED. THE FORMAL DRAFT HAS BEEN RELEASED FOR
- 16 PUBLIC COMMENT, AND WE WILL BE RECEIVING PUBLIC COMMENT
- 17 THROUGH JUNE 20TH. IT IS SLATED -- THE DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL
- 18 REPORT WILL BE RELEASED END EVER NEXT WEEK, AND SO BOTH OF
- 19 THOSE DOCUMENTS WILL BE OUT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT, AND THE
- 20 SUBJECT OF THE -- THE MAIN SUBJECT FOR THE JUNE 11TH JOINT
- 21 PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING, SO SORT OF THE LAST ROUND IN THIS
- 22 REALLY SIGNIFICANT ERST HAS NOW BEEN LAUNCHED. CLIPPER
- 23 LAUNCHED A GOOGLE PAY MOBILE APP FOR THE CLIPPER CARD, SO NOW
- 24 ANDROID PHONES, IN ADDITION APPLE BASED PHONES, NOW CAN
- 25 UTILIZE THE APP. SO, AGAIN, TREMENDOUS SERVICE TO OUR RIDING





- 1 PUBLIC. JUST -- THERE'S A NUMBER OF THINGS IN MY REPORT I'M
- 2 TOUCHING ON JUST A FEW OF THEM. THE FARE COORDINATION AND
- 3 INTEGRATION STUDY WILL -- AND THE GROUP THAT HAS BEEN WORKING
- 4 WITH THAT, WILL HOST A WEBINAR ENGAGING POLICY MAKERS IN THIS
- 5 VERY IMPORTANT EVALUATION THAT WE ARE DOING IN PARTNERSHIP
- 6 WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. ALL BOARD MEMBERS OF EACH BAY AREA
- 7 TRANSIT AGENCY AS WELL AS COMMISSIONERS ARE INVITED TO ATTEND
- 8 THE WEBINAR WHICH WILL BE HELD MAY 26TH AT 3:30 P.M., AND
- 9 AGAIN, THIS IS JUST TO BRING FOLKS UP TO SPEED ON ONE OF THE
- 10 HIGHLIGHT AREAS THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE HAS BEEN
- 11 FOCUSED ON, BY THE WAY. THE OTHER THING I WOULD HIGHLIGHT IS
- 12 THEY ATTENDED A NUMBER OF EVENTS, ZOOM EVENTS, OF COURSE, THIS
- 13 LAST WEEK, ON MONDAY, I WAS PART OF A WEBINAR ADVANCING THE
- 14 THREE PS TO THE BAY AREA FINANCING AUTHORITY, BAHFA, ONE OF
- 15 THE HATS YOU WEAR. THIS WAS IN COLLABORATION WITH OUR PARTNERS
- 16 IN THE PHILANTHROPIC ARENA, AS WELL AS OTHER MEMBERS OF LOCAL
- 17 GOVERNMENT, PANELISTS INCLUDED MTC COMMISSIONER LIBBY SCHAAF,
- 18 AND ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER, JESSE ARREQUIN, AND, AGAIN,
- 19 MYSELF, AND STAFF, PRESENTED INFORMATION ON OUR EXPANDED
- 20 REGIONAL HOUSING PORTFOLIO, WHICH HAS BEEN LAYING THE GROUND
- 21 WORK FOR SIGNIFICANT IMPROVEMENTS IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR
- 22 THE BAY AREA. I HOSTED A PANEL MAY 19TH ASSEMBLY DAVID CHIU
- 23 WAS A SPEAK AS WELL AS WELL AS REPRESENTATIVES FROM SAN
- 24 FRANCISCO FOUNDATION AND URBAN HABITAT TOGETHER WE ADDRESSED
- 25 REGIONAL OPERATIONAL LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE CASA PROCESS AS





- 1 WELL AS SIGNIFICANT REFLECTION ON IMPROVED PARTNERSHIPS. AND
- 2 TACKLING THE CRISIS OF HOUSING AFFORDABILITY AND NEED FOR MORE
- 3 EFFECTIVE RESPONSIVE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND HOW ALL OF THAT
- 4 WILL REQUIRE US WORKING TOGETHER IN A MORE COLLABORATIVE WAY.
- 5 SUMMER ACADEMY THIS, IS A UNIQUE MANIFESTATION OF OUR SUMMER
- 6 INTERNSHIP PROGRAM FOR HIGH SCHOOL STUDENTS, WHICH WILL BE A
- 7 MENTORED, REMOTE PROGRAM. WE HAVE 38 STUDENTS WHO HAVE APPLIED
- 8 TO PARTICIPATE THIS SUMMER. APPLICANTS FROM EIGHT OF THE NINE
- 9 COUNTIES, STILL WAITING TO GET SOME EAGER STUDENTS FROM SONOMA
- 10 COUNTY. SO WE HAVE EXTENDED THE DEADLINE APPLICATION TO
- 11 INCLUDE MORE RECRUITMENT PARTICULARLY TO HAVE PARTICIPANTS
- 12 FROM ACROSS THE REGION. I WOULD EXTEND GRATITUDE FOR THE
- 13 REOPENING REMARKS OF CHAIR PEDROZA. YOU KNOW, OUR TRANSIT
- 14 OPERATORS PREPARE FOR THE WORST EVERY DAY, AND WHEN IT HITS,
- 15 THEY'RE READY TO RESPOND AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO
- 16 RECOGNIZE THEIR WORK IS IMPORTANT AND SUPPORTING THEM IN THESE
- 17 CRITICAL TIMES IS CRITICAL SO I WILL BE REACHING OUT TO MY
- 18 FRIENDS AND COLLEAGUES AT VTA LATER ON TO SEE WHAT WE CAN DO
- 19 TO EXTEND OUR HELP AS INFORMATION COMES IN.
- 21 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU. AND WE ARE READY TO LEND
- 22 SUPPORT ANY WAY WE CAN. WE ARE ONE REGION. THANK YOU FOR THAT.
- 23 COMMISSIONERS, ANY COMMENTS FOR OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR? SEEING
- 24 NONE. I AM LOOKING FORWARD TO THE WEBINAR WILL BE ATTENDING
- 25 MYSELF IMPORTANT WORK HAPPENING IN THAT SPACE. THANK YOU.





- 1 KIMBERLY I DON'T SEE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
- 2 RAISED, DO WE HAVE -- WE HAVE TWO. WHY DON'T WE ALLOW MEMBERS
- 3 OF THE PUBLIC TO COMMENT?

5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. WOULD YOU LIKE TO ALLOW TWO MINUTES?

6

7 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: YES.

8

- 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN. MS. LEVIN GO
- 10 AHEAD AND UNMUTE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. SHE LOWERED HER HAND
- 11 NEXT SPEAKER IS JOE --

12

- 13 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: I'LL REMIND FOLKS WE HAVE GENERAL
- 14 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THE NORMAL TIME BUT AGAIN IF THERE IS
- 15 SOMETHING SPECIFIC ABOUT WHAT WAS SAID, GO AHEAD.

16

- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ADINA LEVIN, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF YOU
- 18 HAVE TWO MINUTES. ARE YOU THERE?

19

20 SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME.

21

22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU NOW.

- 24 SPEAKER: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO
- 25 SHARE A MOMENT OF MORNING FOR THE EVENTS AT VTA THIS MORNING.





- 1 THIS HAS BEEN SUCH A HARD YEAR FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND
- 2 EVERYBODY WORKING IN THE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, AND I
- 3 JUST WANTED TO AND THEN ALSO IN ADDITION FOLLOWING UP TO THE
- 4 REMARKS FROM THE VICE CHAIR OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND
- 5 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR -- I'M SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, BUT AS A
- 6 MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THE CHAIR OF THE
- 7 ADVISORY BODY OF FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY, ONE
- 8 OF THE THINGS THAT WE DO IN THOSE BODIES IN THOSE ROLES IS TO
- 9 HELP OUR COMMUNITY MEMBERS UNDERSTAND WHAT'S GOING ON IN SOME
- 10 OF THE ARCANE THINGS THAT ARE HAPPENING AT MTC AND THE VARIOUS
- 11 IMPORTANT BUT SOMETIMES OBSCURE DECISIONS THAT GET MADE, AND
- 12 SOMETIMES IT'S DIFFICULT FOR PEOPLE ESPECIALLY THOSE WHO HAVE
- 13 CHILD CARE RESPONSIBILITIES AND WORK RESPONSIBILITIES TO BE
- 14 ABLE TO COME INTO THE BOARDROOM AND MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. COVID
- 15 HAS ALLOWED MANY MORE PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY, AND JUST
- 16 SAW YESTERDAY, A BART STATING THAT THEY WOULD BE PROVIDING FOR
- 17 REMOTE PUBLIC COMMENT WHEN THEY COME BACK TO MEET IN PERSON,
- 18 AND I WOULD HOPE THAT THIS IS SOMETHING THAT MTC IS
- 19 CONSIDERING, AND WILL BE ABLE TO DO. MTC HAS SUCH A WIDE
- 20 GEOGRAPHIC COVERAGE THAT IT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL TO BE --
- 21 TO ENABLE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO CONTINUE TO PARTICIPATE
- 22 AFTER THE PANDEMIC RESTRICTIONS ARE ENDED AND THE MEETINGS ARE
- 23 IN THE BOARDROOM. THANK YOU.





- 1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, ALETA DUPRE,
- 2 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. MS. DUPREE, ARE YOU THERE?

- 4 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR AD-FRED -- ALFREDO PEDROZA. ALETA
- 5 DUPREE, SHE AND HER, THE WRITTEN REPORT WHICH INCLUDES THE
- 6 COMPREHENSIVE REPORTS OF THE CLIPPER, FERRIES, AND CLIPPER
- 7 STATISTICS ALSO FASTRAK AND LOOKS LIKE WE DOING WELL WITH OUR
- 8 FASTRAK AND BRIDGE TRAFFIC CERTAINLY A LOT MORE TO DO WITH OUR
- 9 TRANSIT SIDE OF THE HOUSE I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE REPORTS
- 10 DONE LIKE THIS GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

11

- 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER, JOE KUNZLER PLEASE UNMUTE
- 13 YOURSELF.

- 15 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. FIRST, THOUGHTS, PRAYERS, AND DEEP CONCERN
- 16 AND REQUESTS FOR BIG STRUCTURAL CHANGE GO IN THE WAKE OF LAST
- 17 NIGHT'S EVENT IN SAN JOSE, MAY GOD CONTINUE TO PROTECT OUR
- 18 BRAVE TRANSIT PUBLIC SERVANTS. ALSO SINCE ADINA LEVIN BROUGHT
- 19 IT UP, I'LL BRING IT UP AS L THIS WILL BE MY ONLY COMMENT AND,
- 20 I HOPE THAT MTC IS CONSIDERING ALL THE GREAT REGIONAL
- 21 DISCUSSIONS ON A TRANSIT MANAGER, AND ON MORE COORDINATION
- 22 BETWEEN THE BAY AREA TRANSIT'S AGENCIES TO REMAIN IN ONLINE
- 23 MEETINGS TO ALLOW DIVERSE THOUGHTFUL PUBLIC INPUT. I WANT TO
- 24 MAKE THAT REQUEST, PLEASE I ENCOURAGE TO YOU FOLLOW THE WORK
- 25 OF SEAMLESS BAY AREA, I AM A DONOR AND I GOT A WONDERFUL NOTE





- 1 FROM THE CMAS SAYING PLEASE TESTIFY TODAY ABOUT KEEPING REMOTE
- 2 TESTIMONY. SO I WANT TO EXPRESS MY CHOICE FOR THAT. THANK YOU
- 3 FOR LISTENING, AND AGAIN, MAY GOD CONTINUE TO PROTECT OUR
- 4 GREAT TRANSIT OPERATORS.

6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER ROLAND LEBRUN.

7

- 8 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. WITH DUE RESPECT I WOULD LIKE TO BRING TO
- 9 YOUR ATTENTION THAT ACCORDING TO THE GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION
- 10 54954.3 -- TAKING PUBLIC COMMENT AFTER THE ITEM IS NOT
- 11 OPTIONAL HOWEVER YOU DO HAVE THE OPTION OF INTERRUPTING PUBLIC
- 12 COMMENT THAT DOES NOT SPEAK TO THE ITEM. THANK YOU.

13

- 14 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: KIMBERLY, DO WE HAVE ANYONE ELSE WHO
- 15 WISHES TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT?

16

- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO. THANK YOU. HE WAS THE LAST SPEAKER,
- 18 THANK YOU.

- 20 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH KIMBERLY, WE
- 21 TYPICALLY ALSO ALLOW MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO COMMENT AND WE
- 22 HAVE ONE AREA FOR THE PUBLIC TO COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT ON
- 23 TODAY'S AGENDA, AND I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING AND
- 24 BEING ENGAGED. SEEING NO OTHER COMMENT FROM COMMISSIONERS OR
- 25 PUBLIC DISCUSSION WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM SEVEN WHICH IS





- 1 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. ANY COMMENT FROM COMMISSIONERS SEEING
- 2 NONE. ITEM FIVE CONSENT CALENDAR. WE HAVE THREE ITEMS ON
- 3 CONSENT. IF THERE IS NO DISCUSSION, I WILL ENTERTAIN A MOTION
- 4 FOR THE CONSENT.

6 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

7

- 8 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE FIRST BY
- 9 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI. I WILL LOOK FOR A SECOND.

10

11 JAMES P. SPERING: SPERING WILL SECOND.

12

- 13 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: SECOND BY SPERING. ALL RIGHT,
- 14 KIMBERLY, DID WE RECEIVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH
- 15 THIS ITEM?

16

- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 19 ON THIS ITEM.

20

- 21 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH,
- 22 KIMBERLY, WITH THAT IF WE COULD PLEASE DO ROLL CALL VOTE.

- 24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THANK YOU. THE
- 25 MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.



May 26, 2021

1 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU KIMBERLY. ITEM NINE, 2 3 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. CHAIR RABBIT, TAKE IT AWAY. 4 5 DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE PROGRAMMING AND 6 ALLOCATION COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY MAY 12TH, 2021 AND REFERRED 7 8 THE FOLLOWING ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. ITEM 9A, MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4463 ADOPTS THE \$45.4 MILLION 9 FISCAL YEAR 2021, '22, RM2 OPERATING AND MARKETING ASSISTANCE 10 PROGRAM, AND I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4463. 11 12 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN SECONDS. 13 14 15 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT WE HAVE FIRST BY CHAIR 16 RABBIT, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, KIMBERLY? 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR 19 20 HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING ON THIS 21 ITEM. 22 23 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. IF WE CAN PROCEED WITH A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE? 24





1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

2

3 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU.

4

- 5 DAVID RABBIT: MTC RESOLUTION 4202, REVISED. A PROPOSED
- 6 FRAMEWORK FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF HIGHWAY INFRASTRUCTURE
- 7 FUNDING PROVIDED THROUGH THE FEDERAL CORONAVIRUS RESPONSE AND
- 8 RELIEF SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATIONS ACT (CRRSAA), INCLUDING A
- 9 \$34.4 MILLION AUGMENTATION TO THE SAFE AND SEAMLESS MOBILITY
- 10 [INDISCERNIBLE] REVISED. MOVE APPROVAL.

11

12 GINA PAPAN: SECOND.

13

- 14 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE,
- 15 PLEASE.

16

- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
- 18 MEMBERS PRESENT

19

20 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU KIMBERLY.

- 22 DAVID RABBIT: LAST ITEM WE HAVE IS AGENDA ITEM 9C. PROPOSED
- 23 PRINCIPLES AND APPROACH TO THE DISTRIBUTION OF TRANSIT FUNDING
- 24 FROM THE AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ACT OF 2021 UPDATE ON MTC'S
- 25 APPROACH TO THE DISTRIBUTION OF TRANSIT FUNDING FROM THE





- 1 AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ACT AND PROPOSED PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE THE
- 2 DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS. I MOVE APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED
- 3 PRINCIPLES AND APPROACH TO DISTRIBUTION OF TRANSIT FUNDING
- 4 FROM THE AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ACT OF 2021.

6 JAMES P. SPERING: SECOND.

7

- 8 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: MOTION AND SECOND. PUBLIC COMMENT ON
- 9 THIS ITEM.

10

- 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 12 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 13 ON THIS ITEM.

14

- 15 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: NO OTHER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. ROLL
- 16 CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

17

- 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES
- 19 WITH ONE ABSTENTION.

- 21 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU. THANK YOU TO CHAIR RABBIT.
- 22 I KNOW WE HAD GREAT DISCUSSIONS AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL AROUND
- 23 THESE ITEMS AND IT'S GREAT TO SEE OUR MONEY GOING TO LOCAL
- 24 COMMUNITIES. ITEM TEN, JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH ABAG
- 25 ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. CHAIR SPERING, TAKE IT AWAY.





- 2 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. THE JOINT PLANNING
- 3 COMMITTEE AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MET MAY 14TH AND
- 4 MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE REFERRED ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR
- 5 APPROVAL AGENDA ITEM 10A, MTC RESOLUTION 4202 REVISED ONE BAY
- 6 AREA GRANT PROGRAM SECOND ROUND OBAG 2 BUDGET SELECTION
- 7 CRITERIA PROGRAMMING AND POLICY PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS
- 8 PLANNING GRANTS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PDAS APPROVAL OF
- 9 APPROXIMATELY 7.86 MILLION IN TDA PLANNING TECHNICAL
- 10 ASSISTANCE GRANTS AND SUPPORTIVE STUDIES AND THERE WAS
- 11 DISCUSSION ENCOURAGING STAFF TO EXPLORE ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR
- 12 PROJECTS THAT COULD NOT BE FUNDED THIS ROUND DUE TO
- 13 OVERSUBSCRIPTION TO THE PROGRAM. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC
- 14 RESOLUTION 4202 REVISED GRANT PROGRAM SECOND ROUND PROJECT
- 15 SELECTION CRITERIA PROGRAM POLICY DEVELOPMENT AREAS PLANNING
- 16 GRANT AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE.

17

- 18 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: FIRST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING.
- 19 ENTERTAIN A SECOND?

20

21 DIR. DAVID CANEPA: SECOND.

- 23 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: CANEPA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AT THIS
- 24 POINT WE HAVE A MOTION. I SEE COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS.
- 25 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.





COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: JOSEFOWITZ I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO BE OPEN 2 3 TO LOOK INTO ADDITIONAL FUNDS FOR ADDITIONAL PLANNING GRANTS THIS IS INCREDIBLY HIGH LEVERAGE FUNDING TO BE ABLE TO HELP 4 5 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO ENCOURAGE THEM TO DO WHAT WE WANT THEM TO DO. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR REFLECTING ON THAT AND THE 6 REPORT-OUT AND BEING OPEN TO LOOKING FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING 7 8 FOR THAT. 9 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. ANY 10 FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT? NONE. KIMBERLY DID WE RECEIVE ANY 11 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS? 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 14 15 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 16 ON THIS ITEM. 17

2021

RAISED. COMMISSIONER AHN?

18

19

22 EDDIE AHN: JUST BRIEFLY CHAIR PEDROZA. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. I'M GOING TO BRING IT BACK

TO THE COMMISSION. I SEE A FELLOW COMMISSIONER WITH THEIR HAND

- 23 CAME UP IN THE COMMITTEE HEARING JUST TO HIGHLIGHT IS THAT
- 24 THERE MAY BE THE ADDITIONAL FUNDING COMING DOWN THE PIPELINE
- 25 AND IF THAT'S THE CASE THERE, ARE HOPEFULLY GEOGRAPHIC AREAS





- 1 THAT WILL RECEIVE PRIORITY, INCLUDING SAN FRANCISCO, THAT
- 2 WEREN'T FUNDED IN THIS ROUND, BUT I'LL BE SUPPORTING THIS
- 3 TODAY.

- 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER AHN. ALL
- 6 RIGHT. WE HAD A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING. SECOND BY
- 7 COMMISSIONER CANEPA, SEEING NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT.
- 8 KIMBERLY, IF WE COULD PLEASE DO A ROLL CALL VOTE?

9

- 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE]. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
- 11 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

- 13 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, AND THANK YOU
- 14 CHAIR SPERING FOR THE REPORT-OUT. ITEM 11, JOINT MTC/ABAG
- 15 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE, TYPICALLY CHAIRED BY SAM LICCARDO,
- 16 COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS NOT HERE TODAY I'M GOING TO FILL IN
- 17 AND DO DOUBLE DUTY. I KNOW COMMISSIONER PAPAN HAS A QUESTION
- 18 ON ONE ITEM. WHEN WE GET TO THE ITEM WE'LL PAUSE FOR
- 19 OUESTIONS. THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG
- 20 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE LEGISLATION MET MAY 14TH THE MTC
- 21 COMMISSION REFERRED ITEM BILL 897 MECHANIC MULLIN REGIONAL
- 22 CLIMATE NETWORK AUTHORIZED ESTABLISHMENT OF REGIONAL CLIMATE
- 23 NETWORK ADAPTION OF REGIONAL CLIMATE ACTION PLAN REOUIRES
- 24 OFFICE OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH TO ADOPT GUIDELINES AS TO HOW
- 25 ELIGIBLE ENTITIES MAY FORM SUCH A NETWORK ITS GEOGRAPHIC





- 1 BOUNDARIES AND CONTENTS OF GOVERNMENT I SUPPORT TO MOVE SEEK -
- 2 [INDISCERNIBLE] EQUITY PROVISIONS DELL GAITED GUIDANCE ON
- 3 ACTION PLANS AND I MOVE THIS ITEM FOR APPROVAL AND I WILL
- 4 ENTERTAIN A SECOND.

6 GINA PAPAN: SECOND.

7

- 8 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: FIRST BY PEDROZA. SECOND BY PAPAN.
- 9 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY DID WE RECEIVE
- 10 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

11

- 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 14 ON THIS ITEM.

15

- 16 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. BRING IT BACK TO THE
- 17 COMMISSION. FIRST BY PEDROZA SECOND BY PAPAN ROLL CALL VOTE
- 18 PLEASE.

19

- 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE]. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
- 21 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

- 23 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, MOVING TO ITEM
- 24 11B. ASSEMBLY BILL 1500 (GARCIA): SAFE DRINKING WATER,
- 25 WILDFIRE PREVENTION, DROUGHT PREPARATION, FLOOD PROTECTION,



May 26, 2021

- 1 EXTREME HEAT MITIGATION, AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT BOND ACT OF
- 2 2022 AUTHORIZES THE ISSUANCE OF A \$7 BILLION CLIMATE
- 3 ADAPTATION GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND. I MOVE TO SUPPORT AND SEEK
- 4 AMENDMENT POSITION TO ASSEMBLY BILL 1500 TO BROADEN LOCAL
- 5 GOVERNMENT ACCESS TO PROGRAMS MODIFY THE TRANSFORMATIVE
- 6 CLIMATE COMMUNITIES ALLOCATION AND MAKE ONSITE STORMWATER AND
- 7 WATER EFFICIENCY MEASURES MORE PROMINENT I MOVE SUPPORT AND I
- 8 WILL ENTERTAIN A SECOND.

9

10 VICTORIA FLEMING: FLEMING SECONDS.

12 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: FIRST BY PEDROZA, SECOND BY

- 13 COMMISSIONER FLEMING. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS?
- 14 QUESTIONS? SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY DID WE RECEIVE PUBLIC COMMENT
- 15 ON THIS ITEM?
- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 19 ON THIS ITEM.
- 21 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. BRING IT BACK TO THE
- 22 COMMISSION. SEEING NO FURTHER QUESTIONS. PLEASE DO ROLL CALL
- 23 VOTE.

24

11

16





- 1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THANK YOU. THE MOTION
- 2 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

- 4 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND
- 5 THE RECORD REFLECTS COMMISSIONER VOTED AYE. LAST ITEM 11C.
- 6 ASSEMBLY BILL 1401 (FRIEDMAN): RESIDENTIAL AND COMMERCIAL
- 7 PARKING REQUIREMENTS NEAR TRANSIT PROHIBITS MINIMUM PARKING
- 8 REQUIREMENTS FROM APPLYING TO COMMERCIAL OR RESIDENTIAL
- 9 BUILDINGS LOCATED WITHIN ONE-HALF MILE OF A MAJOR TRANSIT STOP
- 10 OR HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT CORRIDOR. REQUESTING AMENDMENT TO THE
- 11 BILL TO ENSURE THAT PREEXISTING AGREEMENTS THAT WAIVE THE
- 12 REDUCED PARKING REQUIREMENTS IN ADDITION BENEFITS BEING
- 13 PROTECTED. MOVE SUPPORT AND SEEK AMENDMENTS OF ASSEMBLYMEMBER
- 14 BILL 1401 AS PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED. I KNOW THAT THERE ARE SOME
- 15 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS ON THIS. SO, BEFORE -- LET ME JUST,
- 16 FIRST, BEFORE WE TAKE COMMENTS, IS THERE A SECOND ON THIS?
- 17 THEN WE'LL TAKE COMMISSIONER COMMENTS.

18

19 DIR. DAVID CANEPA: I'LL SECOND.

20

- 21 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: FIRST BY PEDROZA, AND SECOND BY
- 22 CANEPA. COMMENTS? DUTRA-VERNACI.

- 24 SPEAKER: AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL, I VOTED AGAINST THIS BILL. I
- 25 WILL VOTE AGAINST IT TODAY FOR THE SAME REASON. WHAT I DID





- 1 YESTERDAY WAS CALLED MY REP FOR THE LEAGUE OF CALIFORNIA
- 2 CITIES BECAUSE THE LEAGUE IS OPPOSED TO THIS BILL SO I THOUGHT
- 3 I WOULD SEE IF SHE HAD ANY NEW INFORMATION THEY MIGHT NOT HAVE
- 4 HAD AND SHE DID NOT. SO THE LEAGUE'S POSITION, AND I AGREE
- 5 WITH IT, IS THAT WE CANNOT TAKE A ONE SIZE FITS ALL APPROACH,
- 6 BECAUSE EACH CITY IS DIFFERENT, AND HAS DIFFERENT GEOGRAPHIES,
- 7 LANDSCAPES, WHAT YOU HAVE. BUT SHE ALSO TALKED ABOUT ELECTRIC
- 8 VEHICLES, AS WE KNOW, AND BY 2035, VEHICLES ARE ALL SUPPOSED
- 9 TO BE ELECTRIC. PEOPLE ARE GOING TO WANT THEIR VEHICLES AND
- 10 ELECTRIC CARS TO HAVE SOMEWHERE TO BE PARKED AS WELL. ANOTHER
- 11 EXAMPLE THAT SHE GAVE IS THAT THE FOLKS THAT DO WANT TO LEAVE
- 12 BY TREES TRANSIT CENTERS, FOR EXAMPLE, IF THEY WANT TO USE
- 13 TRANSIT TO GET TO WORK WOULD STILL NEED A CAR, AS AN EXAMPLE,
- 14 IF THEY HAD DAYCARE, A CHILD THEY HAD TO TAKE ACROSS TOWN TO
- 15 DAY CARE BEFORE THEY JUMP ON TRANSIT AND IN UNION CITY, I
- 16 MENTIONED THAT AT THE COMMITTEE MEETING WE HAVE DONE ALL THE
- 17 RIGHT THINGS AROUND OUR BART STATION REDUCED PARKING AND AS A
- 18 RESULT OF THAT PEOPLE THAT LIVE APPROXIMATE THOSE BUILDINGS
- 19 ARE NOW LOOKING FOR PARKING AT OUR PUBLIC LOTS BECAUSE THEY
- 20 HAVE THE VEHICLES. SO FOR THOSE REASONS I WILL NOT BE
- 21 SUPPORTING THIS BILL. IT IS WELL INTENDED BUT I THINK THERE IS
- 22 STILL A LOT OF ISSUES WHERE YOU NEED TO LET LOCAL CONTROL
- 23 RULE. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.





- 1 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER
- 2 CONNOLY, AND THEN COMMISSIONER WORTH.

- 4 DAMON CONNOLLY: THANK YOU, CHAIR. I ALSO JUST WANTED TO FOLLOW
- 5 UP, KIND OF IN A SIMILAR VAIN FROM THE DISCUSSION AT THE
- 6 COMMITTEE LEVEL. I HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO DO SOME ADDITIONAL
- 7 THINKING AND HAVE HEARD INPUT FROM A NUMBER OF CONSTITUENTS
- 8 SINCE VOTING AT THE JOINTS LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE MEETING. I'LL
- 9 BE CHANGING MY VOTE TO NO, TODAY. SO LET ME OFFER SOME BRIEF
- 10 PERSPECTIVE. I DO SEE SOME POSITIVE POLICY OBJECTIVES, HERE,
- 11 AND APPRECIATE THE SENTIMENTS OF THE LEGISLATION. AS SOMEONE
- 12 WHO SUPPORTS WALKABLE AND BIKABLE NEIGHBORHOODS AND REDUCING
- 13 SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLE TRIPS. THERE IS NO QUESTION THAT WE
- 14 WILL NEED TO EMPLOYEE CREATIVE THINKING TO REPURPOSE OVER
- 15 PARKED AREAS, THAT ARE VEST IGES OF THE PAST AND A PROCEDURE
- 16 TO RIGHT SIZE PARKING DEVELOPMENTS FOR THE COMMUNITY AND I
- 17 HAVE HEARD LEGITIMATE CONCERNS ABOUT THE ONE SIZE FITS ALL
- 18 NATURE, WE NEED TO ALLOW LOCALITIES HAVE FLEXIBILITY NOT TO
- 19 HAVE SACRAMENTO DICTATE. A.B. 1401 COULD NEGATIVELY IMPACT THE
- 20 PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THE STATE'S DENSITY BONUS LAW BY
- 21 PROVIDING DEVELOPERS PARKING CONCESSIONS FOR UNITS WITHIN A
- 22 HALF MILE OF TRANSIT WITHOUT ALSO REQUIRING DEVELOPERS TO
- 23 AGREE TO INCLUDE AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS IN THE PROJECT. THE
- 24 PROPOSED AMENDMENT PARTIALLY ADDRESSES THAT BY CARVING OUT
- 25 PROJECTS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN ENTITLED WITH SUCH AGREEMENTS.





- 1 IT DOES NOT ADDRESS NEW PROJECTS, WHICH IS A [INDISCERNIBLE]
- 2 FOR ALL THESE REASONS I'M VOTING NO ON A.B. 1401.

- 4 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSION CONNOLY.
- 5 COMMISSIONER WORTH, GLOVER, AND PAPAN.

- 7 AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I APPRECIATE THE
- 8 OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT TODAY AND RAISE QUESTIONS SINCE I AM ON
- 9 THE WEDNESDAY'S COMMITTEES. AND I GUESS, IN SPENDING A FAIR
- 10 AMOUNT OF TIME LOOKING AT ALL THE ANALYSIS OF THIS BILL,
- 11 VARIOUS POINTS, I GUESS, INCLUDING THE TURNER CENTER'S
- 12 ANALYSIS. ONE OF THE BIPOD I HAVE WHEN I LOOK AT OUR COUNTY,
- 13 CONTRA COSTA HAS THE LARGEST NUMBER OF WORKERS THAT COMMUTE
- 14 OUTSIDE OF OUR COUNTY BECAUSE WE HAVE JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE,
- 15 EGREGIOUS IMBALANCE IT DOESN'T SEEM TO BE SIGNIFICANT EFFORTS
- 16 TO CHANGE IT HUGE WORKERS OF ALL INCOME LEVELS PARTICULARLY
- 17 CONCERNED ABOUT WORKING FAMILIES HAVE TO HAVE A CAR TO GET TO
- 18 OTHER JOBS AND WHEN WE VOTED ON RESOLUTION, REQUIRED CITIES TO
- 19 ZONE FOR TRANSIT NEAR HIGH DENSITY MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING WHICH
- 20 WE HAVE DONE IN CONTRA COSTA SO FAST FORWARD WHERE WE WILL BE
- 21 BUILDING THIS HOUSING WHETHER IT'S MARKET MODERATE AFFORDABLE
- 22 HOUSING IT WILL BE SUBSIDIZED FOR IMPORTANT HOUSING THE
- 23 CHALLENGE NOT FOR PARKING BUT FOR THOSE RESIDENT WHO IS LIVE
- 24 THERE WHO NEED THEIR CARS FOR THE JOB BUT AGAIN THAT CITIZEN
- 25 OVERWHELMING PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE IN OUR COUNTY -- WHO WILL





- 1 NOT HAVE ACCESS TO PARKING. SO I AM REALLY CONCERNED. BECAUSE
- 2 AGAIN, I LOOK -- I SUPPORT THE GOALS. I SUPPORT THE
- 3 ENVIRONMENTAL GOALS OF REDUCING CAR TRAVEL, BUT AT THE SAME
- 4 TIME, I AM VERY CONCERNED ABOUT A POLICY LIKE THIS, ACROSS THE
- 5 STATE, THAT WOULD HAVE A HUGE BURDEN ON LOWER INCOME FAMILIES
- 6 FOR WHOM THE STATISTICS SHOW THAT BEING -- BEING ACCESS TO
- 7 JOBS WITH A CAR IS PHENOMENALLY GREATER THAN OTHER MEANS. I
- 8 WOULD LOVE TO SEE PROGRAMS THAT PROVIDE AN INCREASE INCENTIVES
- 9 FOR LOW INCOME COMMUTERS TO BE ABLE TO HAVE ACCESS TO ELECTRIC
- 10 CARS. AGAIN I THINK WE HAVE TO LOOK AT THE FAMILIES AND
- 11 BUSINESSES OF COMMUTERS THAT THIS IS GOING TO AFFECT. THE
- 12 TESTIMONY I KEEP HEARING IS THERE SEEMS TO BE ASSUMPTION THAT
- 13 IF YOU ELIMINATE A CAR PEOPLE WILL FIGURE OUT A DIFFERENT WAY
- 14 TO GET TO THEIR JOBS, AND LOOKING AT THE COMMUTE PATTERNS,
- 15 IT'S JUST NOT THE CASE. AGAIN, I UNDERSTAND THE ADMIRABLE
- 16 GOALS BUT I HAVE SIGNIFICANT CONCERNS ABOUT IT'S IMPACT.

18 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: GLOVER, PAPAN THEN JOSEFOWITZ.

- 20 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: WITHOUT SOUNDING REDUNDANT, I'M GOING TO
- 21 ECHO THE WORDS OF MY COLLEAGUES AMY WORTH. CONTRA COSTA IS IN
- 22 A VERY UNIQUE SITUATION WHEN IT COMES TO ACCESS TO TRANSIT
- 23 SYSTEMS, AND FOR THE LIFE OF ME, I JUST CANNOT BELIEVE THAT
- 24 THE ADDRESSING OF FIRST AND LAST MILE IS NOT AN ISSUE THAT I
- 25 FIND MYSELF COMFORTABLE, THAT WE'RE ADDRESSING THAT IN A WAY

17





- 1 THAT IT MAKES SENSE FOR A COUNTY SUCH AS CONTRA COSTA TO BE
- 2 ABLE TO SUPPORT THIS TYPE OF LEGISLATION. WE HAVE GONE A LONG
- 3 WAY IN TERMS OF, EVEN WITH E BART, AND THE FACT THAT WE HAVE
- 4 DONE A LOT OF THIS WORK, AND, YOU KNOW, NOW TO SAY THAT THE
- 5 ELIMINATION OF PARKING, IT JUST DOESN'T WORK FOR ALL
- 6 SITUATIONS AND I WANT TO ECHO THE WORDS OF DUTRA-VERNACI WHO
- 7 SAYS ONE SIZE DOESN'T FIT ALL.

9 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: PAPAN JOSEFOWITZ SPERING AND SCHAFF.

- 11 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN? YES. THANK YOU MR. SPERING. I AGREE WITH MY
- 12 COLLEAGUES, AND I WANT TO POINT OUT WE'RE GOT PART OF THE BIG
- 13 I AM A MAYOR REPRESENTING MAYORS OF DIFFERENT CITIES WE
- 14 FORMALLY OPPOSE THIS FOR A VERY SPECIFIC REASON IT HAS AN
- 15 IMPACT ON EXISTING DENSITY BONUS LAWS FOR US WHICH WE HAVE
- 16 BEEN USING REGULARLY TO GET AFFORDABLE HOUSING WITHIN THE
- 17 DEVELOPMENTS HERE THIS IS A FREE PASS FOR DEVELOPING THIS IS
- 18 NEGATIVELY IMPACTING COMMUNITIES AND THE EFFORTS WE'RE MAKING
- 19 TO PROVIDE HIGH DENSITY AROUND TRANSIT WHICH WE'RE DOING AND
- 20 IT'S REALLY KIND OF AN UNFUNDED MANDATE IT'S A FREE PASS FOR
- 21 DEVELOPERS. THEY'RE NOT PROVIDING PARKING AROUND TRANSIT, AND
- 22 THEN MANY IN NEW JURISDICTION, NOT PROVIDING PARKING WE WANT
- 23 TO GET PEOPLE ON TRANSIT WE WANT TO PROVIDE HIGH DENSITY HERE
- 24 SO I REALLY BELIEVE THAT THIS IS SOMETHING THAT DETERRING US
- 25 FROM THAT ONE CARROT WE HAVE, WITH DEVELOPERS, TO SAY, WE'LL





- 1 GIVE YOU A HIGH DENSITY BONUS HERE, WORK WITH US ON THE
- 2 PARKING. AND THE LOCAL RESTRICTIONS AROUND PARKING AND
- 3 EVERYTHING THAT WE ARE TRYING TO DO HERE. NOBODY HAS LEFT THE
- 4 DEVELOPMENT ARENA, IN OUR AREA, BECAUSE THEY HAD TO PROVIDE
- 5 PARKING. WE NEED THIS CARROT, AND THIS IS NOT THE WAY TO DO
- 6 IT. THIS LEGISLATION, I ALSO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT THIS
- 7 LEGISLATION ASSUMES THAT EVERYONE AROUND THE HALF MILE IS
- 8 ABLE-BODIED, AND THEY'RE GOING TO WALK TO TRANSIT, OR THEY'RE
- 9 GOING TO GET THERE SOMEHOW. THIS IS NOT REALISTIC. SO, WE WILL
- 10 BE VOTING NO ON THIS. AND I ENCOURAGE MY COLLEAGUES TO DO SO.
- 11 WE NEED THIS CARROT, AND WE CANNOT TAKE THAT AWAY FROM US.
- 12 THANK YOU.

- 14 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN.
- 15 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?
- 17 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. SO, I JUST WANTED TO CLEAR UP
- 18 SOME MISCONCEPTIONS ABOUT THIS BILL. AND THEN SORT OF TALK
- 19 ABOUT WHY I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. FIRST OF ALL, THIS BILL IS
- 20 NOT ABOUT ELIMINATING PARKING AROUND TRANSIT STATIONS IT'S
- 21 ABOUT ELIMINATING PARKING MINIMUMS. IT'S REALLY ABOUT TWO
- 22 THINGS. THERE IS A LOT OF EVIDENCE TO SHOW THAT IN CITIES LIKE
- 23 SACRAMENTO BERKELEY OAKLAND, SAN FRANCISCO, LA, SAN DIEGO AND
- 24 OTHERS THAT HAVE ELIMINATING PARKING MINIMUMS THERE IS STILL A
- 25 SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF PARKING THAT GETS DONE BY DEVELOPERS





- 1 PEOPLE KNOW THAT LIVING RIGHT NEXT TO A TRANSIT STATION OFTEN
- 2 STILL NEED CARS. SO WE'RE GOING TO PROVIDE THAT AMENITY TO
- 3 THEIR RESIDENTS. THEY'RE JUST NOT GOING TO BE FORCED TO
- 4 PROVIDE MORE PARKING THAN IS ACTUALLY USED. AND SO WHEN THERE
- 5 HAVE BEEN STUDIES IN THE BAY AREA OF THE USAGE OF PARKING AT
- 6 MULTI-FAMILY DEVELOPMENTS NEAR TRANSIT, THE STUDIES HAVE
- 7 FOUND, OVER AND OVER AGAIN, THAT ABOUT 20 TO 30% OF THE
- 8 PARKING GOES UNUSED. SO CITIES ARE REQUIRING PARKING MINIMUMS,
- 9 ARE IN EFFECT REOUIRING PRECIOUS LAND AROUND TRANSIT OF WHICH
- 10 THERE IS NOT THAT MUCH IN THE BAY AREA TO BE USED FOR PARKING
- 11 WHICH IS NOT BEING USED. I THINK WE CAN AGREE THERE IS NO
- 12 BENEFIT TO BUILDING PARKING THAT IS NOT USED. I ALSO WANT TO
- 13 CLEAR UP THE NOTION THAT THIS WOULD ELIMINATE ADA PARKING. IT
- 14 DOESN'T. THE BILL WOULD REQUIRE THE SAME AMOUNT OF ADA PARKING
- 15 IN DEVELOPMENTS AS IS REQUIRED TODAY. BECAUSE THE COMMENTS
- 16 MADE BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND OTHERS ARE VALID THAT WE STILL
- 17 NEED TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE ADA PARKING TO FOLKS WHO HAVE
- 18 DISABILITIES. I ALSO WANT TO CLEAR UP AROUND EV PARKING THE
- 19 SAME PROVISIONS APPLY FOR EV PARKING SAME EV PARKING IS
- 20 REQUIRED UNDER THIS BILL THAT WOULD BE REQUIRED TODAY. SO
- 21 THIS, IN NO WAY, WOULD PREVENT PEOPLE WHO ARE LOOKING TO MAKE
- 22 TRANSITION TO AN ELECTRIC VEHICLE, WHO HAVE AN ELECTRIC
- 23 VEHICLE TODAY FROM HAVING THE PARKING LOT THAT THEY NEED TO
- 24 RECHARGE THEIR ELECTRIC VEHICLE IN A MULTI-FAMILY BUILDING. I
- 25 ALSO WANT TO CLEAR UP THE ISSUE AROUND DENSITY BONUS. ALMOST





- 1 ALL RESTRICTIONS IN THE BAY AREA THAT HAVE WHAT THIS WOULD
- 2 APPLY TO OR ALREADY HAVE INCLUSIONARY REQUIREMENTS OR SIMILAR,
- 3 SO THIS WOULD ACTUALLY -- SO THEY WOULD BE THOSE DEVELOPMENTS
- 4 WOULD BE ACCESSING DENSITY BONUS ANYWAY ON THE RESIDENTIAL
- 5 SIDE AND SO THIS WOULD NOT IMPACT THAT. IN FACT, THERE WAS A
- 6 STUDY THAT WAS JUST RELEASED ABOUT WHAT HAPPENED WHEN SAN
- 7 DIEGO ELIMINATING PARKING MINIMUMS NEAR TRANSIT AND IT
- 8 ACTUALLY INCREASED THE USE OF DENSITY BONUS BY FIVE TIMES, AND
- 9 SO ELIMINATING PARKING MINIMUMS ACTUALLY INCREASES THE USE OF
- 10 DENSITY BONUS BECAUSE THE REAL VALUE OF THE DENSITY BONUS IS
- 11 THE DENSITY AND NOT THE ADDITIONAL OPPORTUNITIES TO CAN BE
- 12 BUILT, NOT THE PARKING. AND YOU KNOW, REDUCING THE AMOUNT OF
- 13 PARKING, ESPECIALLY UNUSED PARKING NEAR TRANSIT HAS BEEN SHOWN
- 14 TO INCREASE TRANSIT. ALSO ONE MORE THING I WANT TO CLEAR UP,
- 15 THIS IS NOT ABOUT COMMUTER PARKING THIS IS ABOUT PARKING
- 16 WITHIN RESIDENTIAL AND COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENTS SO IF YOU WOULD
- 17 LIKE BART TO HAVE ARE -- THIS IS ABOUT RESIDENTIAL AND
- 18 COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENTS. THERE IS A LOT OF EVIDENCE TO SHOW
- 19 THAT IF YOU REDUCE PARKING YOU CAN FIT MORE PEOPLE IN TRANSIT
- 20 AND REDUCE COST OF HOUSING BECAUSE YOU HAVE GOT TO PAY FOR
- 21 THAT PARKING IT REDUCES THE COST OF GOODS AND SERVICES THAT
- 22 ARE PROVIDED BY BUSINESSES BECAUSE IF YOU PROVIDE TOO MUCH
- 23 PARKING AT MALLS YOU HAVE TO PAY MORE FOR THE GOODS OF THOSE
- 24 MALLS. AND THIS MEETS OUR EQUITY AND OUR CLIMATE GOALS, AND I
- 25 DON'T THINK THIS IS A PARTICULARLY RADICAL IDEA. IT WAS





- 1 SUPPORTED BY ABAG, WHICH IS ONE OF THE WAYS THAT I KNOW THAT
- 2 IT'S NOT A PARTICULARLY RADICAL IDEA, BECAUSE IF ABAG
- 3 SUPPORTED IT, OVERWHELMINGLY IT CAN'T BE. AND I REALLY URGE MY
- 4 COLLEAGUES TO SUPPORT THIS LEGISLATIONTHANK YOU COMMISSIONER
- 5 JOSEFOWITZ. COMMISSIONER SPERINGING AND COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

- 7 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU. IN FEAR OF RUINING MY POLITICAL
- 8 CAREER I'M IN AGREEMENT WITH COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. I'M NOT
- 9 GOING TO REPEAT THE THINGS HE SAID HE DID CLARIFY MANY OF THE
- 10 POINTS I WANTED TO MAKE, ALSO. FOR ME THIS IS A QUALITY OF
- 11 LIFE ISSUE. SURVEYS SHOWING, WE DID ONE UP HERE IN SOLANO
- 12 COUNTY, THIS NEXT GENERATION THEY'RE NOT DEPENDENT ON
- 13 AUTOMOBILES THEY'RE LOOKING FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT AND THEY'RE
- 14 LOOKING FOR THOSE CONVENIENCES. AND WE REALLY SHOULD -- YOU
- 15 LOOK AT ALL THE WORK THAT MTC AND ABAG IS DOING WITH HOUSING,
- 16 WE SHOULDN'T BE BUILDING PARKING SPACES WE SHOULD BE TRYING TO
- 17 BUILD HOUSING UNITS AND PEOPLE CHOOSE TO LIVE IN THESE AREAS
- 18 SO IT'S JUST ONE PART OF YOUR COMMUNITY THAT HAS SORT OF AN
- 19 AUTO FREE ZONE SO TO SPEAK, AND YOU KNOW TO ELIMINATE THOSE
- 20 CHOICES OR AT LEAST NOT TO ENCOURAGE THEM I THINK IS VERY
- 21 SHORT SIGHTED, AND IF YOU LOOK AT ALL THE BENEFITS OF THIS, IT
- 22 HELPS REDUCE TRAFFIC, STUDIES SHOW IT HELPS REDUCE TRAFFIC,
- 23 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, AND, YOU KNOW, AND IT HELPS BUILD
- 24 RENTAL UNITS, WHICH ARE DESPERATELY NEEDED IN THIS REGION. AND
- 25 THERE IS A LOT OF BENEFITS TO THIS. AND MANY OF THE POINTS





- 1 THAT PEOPLE ARE MAKING, YOU KNOW, AREN'T NECESSARILY CORRECT.
- 2 ESPECIALLY ON THE PARKING MINIMUM AND SO FORTH. IT DOESN'T
- 3 REALLY RESTRICT COMMUTES FROM BUILDING THIS PARKING AND TO ADD
- 4 TO YOUR COMMUNITY THAT I THINK REALLY NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED
- 5 AND I'M GOING TO SUPPORT THE BILL. LET'S DON'T LOSE SIGHT.
- 6 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TRANSPORTATION CORRIDORS WE'RE NOT TALKING
- 7 ABOUT THROUGH THE YOUR COMMUNITY. THIS IS WHERE PUBLIC TRANSIT
- 8 IS EXISTING. IT'S NEEDS ADDITIONAL RIDERS IF WE'RE GOING TO
- 9 MAKE IT SUSTAINABLE. IT HAS TREMENDOUS BENEFITS AND I'M GOING
- 10 TO CERTAINLY SUPPORT THE BILL, AND I HOPE MY COLLEAGUES AT
- 11 LEAST RECONSIDER IT AND GIVE IT AN OPPORTUNITY TO HELP PRODUCE
- 12 THE DESPERATE HOUSING THAT WE NEED. THE PRACTICE AS WE HAVE
- 13 DONE IN THE PAST HAVE JUST FAILED THIS REGION AND WE HAVE TO
- 14 DO SIMILAR CHANGES THAT THIS BILL IS PROPOSING. AND I
- 15 CERTAINLY HOPE THAT, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE RECONSIDER. THANK YOU
- 16 MR. CHAIRMAN.

- 18 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING.
- 19 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

- 21 LIBBY SCHAFF: THANK YOU. YOU KNOW, I ALSO FEEL LIKE THE BILL
- 22 HAS BEEN MISUNDERSTOOD BASED ON THE ARGUMENTS THAT I JUST
- 23 HEARD. THIS BILL INCREASES FLEXIBILITY AND CHOICE. IT'S THE
- 24 ANTITHESIS OF ONE SIZE FITS ALL. WHAT IT DOES IS IT ALLOWS
- 25 DEVELOPERS TO INCLUDE THE AMOUNT OF HOUSING THAT THEY FEEL IS





- 1 NEEDED IN THEIR PROJECT. AND NOT BE SUBJECT TO ARBITRARY
- 2 REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE NOT ACTUALLY NEEDED. I CAN PROMISE YOU,
- 3 IN OAKLAND, PLENTY OF PARKING IS STILL GETTING BUILT, EVEN
- 4 THOUGH WE ALREADY HAVE THIS POLICY IN PLACE. PLENTY OF PARKING
- 5 IS GETTING BUILT. THIS DOES NOT ELIMINATE PARKING. I PROMISE
- 6 YOU. YOU ALL HAVE TALKED ABOUT THE NEED FOR FLEXIBILITY. THIS
- 7 ENHANCES FLEXIBILITY. AND THE ARGUMENT THAT FORCING SOMEONE --
- 8 OR ALLOWING SOMEONE TO NOT BUILD UNNEEDED PARKING, IS THE MOST
- 9 EFFECTIVE WAY TO INCREASE AFFORDABLE DEVELOPMENT, AFFORDABLE
- 10 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT, SIMILARLY DOES NOT MAKE SENSE. THERE ARE
- 11 MUCH BETTER WAYS TO INCENTIVIZE AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT
- 12 THAN BY RANSOMING UNNEEDED PARKING, AS PART OF A POLICY
- 13 APPROACH. I REALLY FEEL LIKE THIS BILL IS BEING MISUNDERSTOOD
- 14 BY PEOPLE WHO I HAVE JUST HEARD EXPLAIN WHY THEY WILL BE
- 15 VOTING NO. IT JUST DOESN'T MAKE SENSE, AND I REALLY BEG TO YOU
- 16 RECONSIDER. I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER SPERING, HIS LOGIC, HIS
- 17 ANALYSIS OF THIS. I PROMISE YOU, THIS DOES NOT ELIMINATE
- 18 PARKING. IT JUST ELIMINATES ARBITRARY REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE
- 19 NOT, IN FACT, NEEDED. SO I URGE EVERYONE TO EITHER VOTE YES OR
- 20 AT THE VERY LEAST ABSTAIN BECAUSE I AM FEELING LIKE THE
- 21 IMPACTS OF THIS BILL ARE NOT WELL UNDERSTOOD BY THE
- 22 OPPOSITION. THANK YOU.
- 24 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SCHAFF.
- 25 COMMISSIONER CANEPA THEN COMMISSIONER RONEN.





- 2 DIR. DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMING FROM CITY
- 3 COUNCIL FOR EIGHT YEARS, I SORT OF UNDERSTAND WHERE MY
- 4 COLLEAGUES ARE COMING FROM. I UNDERSTAND, YOU KNOW, THEIR
- 5 CONCERN. I WILL SAY ONE THING. AND I HAVE SEEN IT HAPPEN A
- 6 COUPLE OF TIMES. I HAVE SEEN DEVELOPERS WHO ARE INTERESTED IN
- 7 PROJECTS, RUNNING AWAY TO BE QUITE HONEST WITH YOU, BECAUSE OF
- 8 THE PARKING RESTRICTIONS. AND SO I HAVE SEEN THAT. I WOULD
- 9 JUST SUGGEST TO THE GROUP, THIS, IS THAT, IF WE'RE REALLY
- 10 CONCERNED ON A MACRO LEVEL AROUND HOUSING, AND WE KNOW,
- 11 THROUGH THE THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, HOW MANY PEOPLE GO
- 12 UNHOUSED, THE COMMUNITY I REPRESENT SAN MATEO COUNTY I
- 13 MENTIONED THIS A COUPLE OF TIMES PEOPLE WHO GROUP HERE CAN'T
- 14 AFFORD TO STAY HERE. I THINK THE AVERAGE HOME IS ABOUT \$2
- 15 MILLION. SO IF WE REALLY WANT TO DIG INTO PROBABLY ONE OF THE
- 16 MOST IMPORTANT ISSUE IN OUR LIFETIMES, AND I WAS ALWAYS TOLD
- 17 BY ONE OF MY COLLEAGUES, YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT ABOUT THE
- 18 DECISIONS WE MAKE FOR TODAY IT'S ABOUT DECISIONS WE MAKE FOR
- 19 THE FUTURE. THAT SPEAKS TO WHAT SUPERVISOR SPERING HAD SAID,
- 20 SO WELL. WE'RE DEALING WITH, YOU KNOW, IF IT'S GENERATION Z,
- 21 WE'RE DEALING WITH THE MILLENNIALS, THE WAY THEY GO ABOUT
- 22 HOUSING IS MUCH, MUCH DIFFERENT. IT'S ABOUT CONVENIENCE,
- 23 WHAT'S EASY, HOPPING ON TO BART, HOPPING ON TO TRANSPORTATION,
- 24 THAT'S WHAT YOUNG PEOPLE ARE DOING, WHETHER IT'S UBER, THAT'S
- 25 THE FUTURE. AND SO I THINK WHAT THIS VOTE REPRESENTS, IT





- 1 REALLY REPRESENTS HOW WE LOOK AT THIS ISSUE, NOT ABOUT WHAT'S
- 2 HAPPENING TODAY, BUT ABOUT WHAT'S THE PLANNING FOR THE FUTURE.
- 3 AND THAT'S WHY I'M GOING TO SUPPORT THIS. I DO THINK WE HAD A
- 4 REALLY ROBUST CONVERSATION AT THE LEDGE LEVEL. WE HEARD, YOU
- 5 KNOW, SEVERAL DIFFERENT VIEWPOINTS, BUT WHEN WE LOOK AT IT ON
- 6 ITS MERIT, AND I THINK MAYOR SCHAFF TOUCHED UPON IT, THERE IS
- 7 PARKING. RIGHT? THERE IS THE OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE PARKING. NOW,
- 8 IF I'M FROM A CITIES PERSPECTIVE, AND THERE IS THE DEVELOPMENT
- 9 PIECE, RIGHT? WE'RE TALKING STRICTLY ABOUT DEVELOPMENT, WHAT
- 10 LEVERAGE DO I HAVE AS A CITY, POTENTIALLY, IF THERE IS NO
- 11 PARKING IS THERE AN OPPORTUNITY, RIGHT NOW IT'S A BIG ISSUE
- 12 AROUND MAYBE HAVING A DEVELOPER LOOK AT CREATING A CHILD CARE
- 13 SPACE IS THERE COMMUNITY BENEFITS THAT CAN BE ASCERTAINED.
- 14 FROM A COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVE, I WOULD LIKE AT THIS AS
- 15 SUPPORTING THIS BUT MAYBE SEEING WHAT THIS LEGISLATION, WHAT
- 16 COMMUNITY BENEFITS THEY COULD GET FROM THE DEVELOPER. SO I'LL
- 17 BE SUPPORTING THIS. AND I THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

- 19 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CANEPA,
- 20 COMMISSIONER RONEN, FLEMING, AND RABBIT.

- 22 DIR. HILLARY RONEN: THANK YOU SO MUCH CHAIR PEDROZA MY
- 23 INTERNET IS UNSTABLE. I WANT TO ECHO AND APPRECIATE THE
- 24 COMMENTS OF COMMISSIONER SCHAFF, CANEPA, JOSEFOWITZ, AND
- 25 SPERING, BUT ALSO, JUST COME AT THIS FROM AN ENVIRONMENTAL





- 1 PERSPECTIVE. IN ELIMINATING MINIMUM PARKING REQUIREMENTS, IT
- 2 IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT FOR OUR CLIMATE FUTURE. WE HAVE TO
- 3 START MAKING CHANGES SO THAT WE ARE LESS RELIANT ON CARS AND
- 4 MORE RELIANT ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND THIS IS SUCH A
- 5 SIMPLE WAY OF DOING THAT. AND IT'S TO NOT OVER CREATE PARKING
- 6 AND GIVING MORE FLEXIBILITY FOR PEOPLE TO USE LIMITED SPACE IN
- 7 WAYS THAT PROMOTE THE USE OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN TRANSIT-
- 8 RICH AREAS. SO I WILL BE SUPPORTING THIS LEGISLATION AND HOPE
- 9 MY COLLEAGUES WILL FOLLOW SUIT. THANKS SO MUCH.

11 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RONEN. FLEMING

12 AND THEN RABBIT.

10

13

14 VICTORIA FLEMING: YEAH, I WANTED TO CHIME IN HERE AND SHARE

15 BOTH MY EXPERIENCE MAKING POLICY AND WORKING WITH DEVELOPERS

16 IN OUR DOWNTOWN, AND A LITTLE BIT ON MY PERSONAL EXPERIENCE

17 WITH THIS, WHICH IS THAT THE DEVELOPERS THAT I'M WORKING WITH

18 ARE EAGER TO HAVE LESS PARKING AS HAS BEEN NOTED, BUT ARE

19 STEPPING FORWARD IN OFFERING THINGS LIKE CHILD CARE SPACE AND

20 MIXED USE SPACE AND TAKING THE LEAD. TO MY MIND IT SEEMS LIKE

21 AN AMAZING OPPORTUNITY AND FROM MY PERSONAL EXPERIENCE, I'M A

22 LOWER INCOME SINGLE PARENT WITH A CHILD WHO IS SIX YEARS OLD,

23 AND I WOULD PREFER THAT I HAD HOUSING THEY COULD AFFORD THAN A

24 PLACE TO PARK MY VEHICLE. AND I UNDERSTAND THAT WE HAVE THESE

25 FEARS ABOUT THESE CHANGES, BUT THE EVIDENCE THEY HAVE SEEN



May 26, 2021

- 1 REALLY DOESN'T BEAR IT OUT, AND THE NEW CREATIVE THINGS WE'RE
- 2 DOING WHETHER IT'S HOUSING ACCELERATOR FUNDS, OR WORKING WITH
- 3 DEVELOPERS WHO ARE NOW PROSOCIAL AND INSIST ON GETTING BETTER
- 4 REALLY DOES -- IT IS STARTING TO WORK AND WE ARE STARTING TO
- 5 SEE MORE UNITS THAT ARE GOING TO BE BUILT IN THE NEXT FEW
- 6 YEARS, SO I WILL BE NOT ONLY SUPPORTING THIS AS A POLICY
- 7 MAKER, BUT SUPPORTING THIS AS AN INDIVIDUAL WHO REALLY NEEDS
- 8 MORE HOUSING. AND I WOULD RATHER BE ABLE TO USE THAT 16% IN
- 9 ORDER TO BUY A HOUSING, RATHER THAN BUY A PLACE TO PARK THIS
- 10 VEHICLE THEY REALLY WISH I DIDN'T V AND AS FAR AS, LIKE, THE
- 11 IDEA OF GETTING MY CHILD PLACES, THERE IS LOTS OF CREATIVE
- 12 THINGS TO DO AND I HAVEN'T HAD TOO MUCH DIFFICULTY FIGURING
- 13 OUT HOW TO GET MY KID PLACES, AND IT IS DIFFICULT WHEN THEY
- 14 ARE REALLY LITTLE, I DO GET THAT, BUT WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT
- 15 TAKING AWAY ALL PARKING. SO I KNOW THAT FOR MANY FAMILIES IF
- 16 THIS COULD MAKE A DIFFERENCE NOT HAVING TO WORK THAT SECOND
- 17 JOB OR STAY UP LATE, THEY WOULD FIGURE OUT A WAY TO LIVE
- 18 CLOSER TO THEIR CHILD CARE OR MAYBE THE CHILD CARE WOULD BE IN
- 19 THE BUILDING INSTEAD OF PARKING. SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT.
- 20 THANK YOU.
- 22 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER FLEMING I
- 23 APPRECIATE THE PERSONAL NARRATIVE YOU PUT OUT THERE.
- 24 COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

25





- 1 DAVID RABBIT: WE BUILD IN SAN FRANCISCO IT'S TRANSIT-RICH,
- 2 FIRST PRIORITY AND YOU BASICALLY HAVE TO GET A CUP IN ORDER TO
- 3 PROVIDE MORE PARKING THAN THE ABSOLUTE MINIMUM WHICH IS FINE.
- 4 IT WORKS. AND I APPRECIATE THE MOVING TOWARDS FLEXIBILITY AND
- 5 WHAT I WAS GOING TO SAY TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, WELL, WHY
- 6 ELIMINATE THEM ENTIRELY, AND WHY NOT JUST REDUCE TO 20 TO 30%
- 7 OF THE PARKING REQUIREMENT IF THAT'S THE VACANCY THAT'S OUT
- 8 THERE. I DO THINK THAT IT'S IMPORTANT TO PROVIDE THE
- 9 FLEXIBILITY. I'LL BE SUPPORTIVE IN THAT VEIN. I'M NOT SURE IF
- 10 ELIMINATING ENTIRELY IS THE TOTAL ENDGAME OF PROVIDING THAT
- 11 FLEXIBILITY TO JURISDICTIONS. I THINK IT'S -- THE
- 12 JURISDICTIONS ARE STILL, SHOULD BE AT THE ABLE TO KIND OF
- 13 FIGURE OUT TOGETHER WITH THE DEVELOPER WHAT THAT AMOUNT OF
- 14 PARKING NEEDS TO BE AND HOW -- AND WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE, AND AS
- 15 YOU LOOK AT THE PRESENTATION TODAY, THERE IS THE FIRST PICTURE
- 16 ON THE POWERPOINT, AND ACTUALLY A PLACE WHERE I JUST HAD
- 17 COFFEE LITERALLY AN HOUR AGO WITH A FRIEND OF MINE, IS A PLACE
- 18 THAT HAS CENTRALIZED PARKING ACROSS THE STREET, IN A PARKING
- 19 GARAGE STRUCTURE, NO PARKING ON-SITE FOR THE UNITS THAT ARE
- 20 THERE OR FOR THE OFFICE SPACE TO ME THAT'S A GOOD SOLUTION AND
- 21 HOPEFULLY THAT PARKING STRUCTURE MIGHT BE TORN DOWN OR
- 22 REMODELED INTO ANOTHER SPACE AS CARS GO FORWARD. I'M
- 23 SUPPORTIVE BUT I THINK THE ABILITY TO FIND FLEXIBILITY IN
- 24 ABILITY TO FIND THAT RIGHT NUMBER. SAN FRANCISCO IS DIFFERENT
- 25 THAN THE OUTLYING AREAS. MARKET RATE DEVELOPERS WANT A





- 1 MARKETABLE SOLUTION, AND THE OTHER THING THAT HAPPENS IS 40 OR
- 2 \$50,000 COST OF A PARKING SPACE WILL GET TACKED ON TO RENT NO
- 3 MATTER WHAT, SO IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE SURE WE'RE LOOKING
- 4 AFTER THE BOTTOM LINE OF RENTERS THAT CHOOSE NOT TO WANT TO
- 5 PARK A CAR IN A SPACE THAT COSTS AS MUCH AS THEIR SQUARE FOOT
- 6 OF THEIR RENT. SO I'M SUPPORTIVE. I JUST REALLY TRULY WANT AS
- 7 MUCH FLEXIBILITY AS POSSIBLE, AND SOME NUANCES IN THERE AS
- 8 WELL, THE DIALOGUE WITH THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO BE SURE
- 9 THAT WHATEVER'S BEING ADDED TO THE COMMUNITY IS AN ATTRIBUTE
- 10 NOT A DETRIMENT. THANK YOU.

- 12 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RABBIT. BEFORE
- 13 WE DO SECOND ROUND OF COMMENTS -- AND I SEE COMMISSIONER
- 14 GLOVER -- LET ME MAKE MY COMMENTS AS WELL. I WAS A FORMER
- 15 COUNCILMEMBER SO I UNDERSTAND THE PERSPECTIVE OF BEING A LOCAL
- 16 ELECTED AND COUNCILMEMBER AND LOCAL CONTROL BUT RECOGNIZING
- 17 HOW WE GREW UP, THE GENERATIONS WE ARE FACING A DIFFERENT SET
- 18 OF ISSUES AND THESE TYPE OF POLICIES AND OBJECTIVES TO PRODUCE
- 19 THE OUTCOMES WE NEED. THE CONVERSATIONS ILLUSTRATE THE VISION
- 20 THAT WE'RE DRIVING THE BAY AREA TO OBVIOUSLY WE'RE GOING TO
- 21 SEE PROJECTS GET BUILT THAT ARE STILL ATTRACTIVE FOR FAMILIES
- 22 WE NEED TO CREATE COMMUNITIES THAT PEOPLE WANT TO LIVE IN AND
- 23 RETIRE BUT WE NEED TO KNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE A DIFFERENT SET
- 24 OF PRESSURES THAN PREVIOUS GENERATIONS DID THAT'S WHY I SEE
- 25 THIS AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO INCENTIVIZE THAT FUTURE WHERE WE'RE





- 1 TRYING TO MEET THE GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS, INCENTIVIZE
- 2 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND HAD IS PART OF IT IT'S FLEXIBILITY
- 3 IT'S NOT COMPLETELY ELIMINATING PARKING BUT PROVIDING THAT
- 4 VISION FOR THE FUTURE OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT TO SEE AND THAT TO
- 5 ME IS WHAT IS BEING ACCOMPLISHED HERE, SO IT'S VERY EASY,
- 6 SOMETIMES TO SAY NO. BUT I THINK WUI HAVE TO CHALLENGE
- 7 OURSELVES TRY TO PAINT THAT PICTURE FOR WHAT TOMORROW LOOKS
- 8 LIKE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT I ALWAYS TELL MY SON, WHEN I WENT TO
- 9 HIGH SCHOOL THERE WAS A BIG SURFACE LOT HE SHOULD NOT BE GOING
- 10 TO HIGH SCHOOL WITH A BIG SURFACE LOT DIFFERENT PARKING
- 11 CONVERSATION BUT ACKNOWLEDGEMENT THAT WE HAVE POLICIES THAT
- 12 HAVE TO CHANGE. GREAT DISCUSSION. BUT I BELIEVE WE HAVE TO --
- 13 AND GET UNEMPLOYMENT ABOUT HOW WE WANT TO CREATE FUTURE
- 14 COMMUNITY TO ADDRESS FUTURE GENERATIONS. THANK YOU.

- 16 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT MOST OF US ARE
- 17 BOLD AND READY TO MAKE CHANGES BUT WHEN WE SET POLICY WE MUST
- 18 SET THAT POLICY THAT IT IS VERY MUCH WITH WHAT'S HAPPENING IN
- 19 ALL OF OUR COMMUNITIES. YOU HAVE SOME TRANSIT-RICH PARTS OF
- 20 THE REGION THAT IT MAKES SENSE. PEOPLE, AND THE MOST PART, DO
- 21 NOT HAVE CHOICE IN TERMS OF WHERE THEY LIVE. THEY'RE LIVING
- 22 WHERE THEY CAN AFFORD TO LIVE. AND SO WHEN WE START DRAWING
- 23 THESE DIFFERENT ANALYSIS, LET'S BE REALISTIC IN TERMS OF THE
- 24 TYPE OF POLICIES THAT WE'RE LOOKING TO PUT IN PLACE. AND WE
- 25 HAVE TO BE VERY INCLUSIVE OF WHAT'S GOING ON IN OTHER PARTS OF





- 1 OUR REGION, NOT JUST THOSE THAT ARE THE GREATER URBANIZED
- 2 PARTS OF THE DISTRICT THAT MAY HAVE THOSE TRANSIT
- 3 OPPORTUNITIES. AND NOT HAVE THE BIGGER DISCUSSION IN TERMS OF
- 4 HOW DO WE ALSO PUT INTO POLICY, HOW WE WILL ADDRESS THE NEED
- 5 OF THOSE PARTS OF THE REGION THAT DO NOT HAVE THE TRANSIT
- 6 OPPORTUNITY THAT PEOPLE ARE LIVING IN PLACES THAT THEY MAY NOT
- 7 WANT TO LIVE, BUT BECAUSE IT'S AFFORDABLE, AND THEY HAVE NO
- 8 OTHER CHOICES. SO I'M -- I WILL NOT SUPPORT THIS. I THINK THAT
- 9 THERE IS -- THAT THERE IS LANGUAGE THAT COULD BE IMPLEMENTED
- 10 AND TO EVERY POLICY THAT WE MAKE, THAT WILL LEAD US TO MAKING
- 11 SURE THAT OUR FUTURE IS MUCH DIFFERENT THAN WHAT THE
- 12 CONDITIONS THAT WE'RE LIVING IN TODAY. AND UNLESS WE CAN BE
- 13 INCLUSIVE IN THAT, THEN WE ARE OMITTING THE VARIOUS PEOPLE
- 14 FROM A PROCESS THAT REALLY NEED TRANSIT THAT THEY NEED AN
- 15 OPPORTUNITY TO LIVE IN PLACE THAT'S CLOSE TO TRANSIT WHERE WE
- 16 CAN ELIMINATE CARS, IN PARTICULAR. SO I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT.
- 17 BUT I AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN STATED BY PEOPLE
- 18 BUT IT IS NOT ALL-INCLUSIVE AND WE CAN'T CONTINUE TO MAKE
- 19 POLICY ON THINGS THAT ARE NOT LOOKING AT THE BIGGER PICTURE
- 20 THAT'S GOING TO BE ACCOMMODATING THAT WE MINIMIZE THE RISK OF
- 21 COMMUNITIES THAT ARE NOT ADEQUATELY SUPPLIED WITH THE TRANSIT
- 22 NEEDS THAT SHOULD BE. THANK YOU. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. AND
- 23 AGAIN, I THINK THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO THIS RIGHT. WE
- 24 DON'T NEED TO FIND OURSELVES IN A POSITION WHERE WE'RE JUST





- 1 TAKING WHAT'S IN FRONT OF OUR FACE. BECAUSE WE FIGURE THAT
- 2 THERE IS NO OTHER WAY OUT.

- 4 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSION GLOVER. I SEE
- 5 COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I WANT TO DO PUBLIC COMMENT AND BRING IT
- 6 BACK TO COMMISSIONERS. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

7

- 8 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU CHAIR, AND COMMISSIONER GLOVER.
- 9 WONDERFULLY SAID. IT'S WONDERFUL THAT OAKLAND HAS A BUNCH OF
- 10 PARKING STRUCTURES THAT'S GREAT. OUR JURISDICTION DISAPPOINT
- 11 HAVE THOSE AND WE ARE DEVELOPING AND WE ARE INCLUSIVE IN OUR
- 12 AFFORDABILITY THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO AND WE NEED THIS
- 13 CARROT THIS IS A REMOVAL OF LOCAL CONTROL WHICH REALLY
- 14 NEGATIVELY IMPACTS THOSE OF US WHO REALLY ARE BUILDING HIGH
- 15 DENSITY AROUND TRANSIT, AND SECONDARILY, HERE, WHEN WE TALK
- 16 ABOUT PARKING SPACES, THERE ARE DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF PARKING
- 17 HERE, TOO. BUNDLING. SO YOU CAN RENT A PLACE WITHOUT BEING
- 18 CHARGED FOR THE PARKING. SO TO JUST ASSUME, BECAUSE THERE ARE
- 19 A -- THERE'S A PARKING MINIMUM OR NEGOTIATIONS ARE NOT BEING
- 20 DONE AND THEREFORE YOUR RENT IS GOING TO GO UP, THAT'S NOT
- 21 APPROPRIATE FOR MANY JURISDICTIONS HERE. SO THANK YOU, I JUST
- 22 WANTED TO CLARIFY THOSE POINTS.

- 24 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. AND GAIN
- 25 WANT TO REMIND THE COMMISSION THAT THIS APPLIES TO AREAS





- 1 WITHIN ONE HALF MILE OF MAJOR TRANSIT STOP OR HIGH OUALITY
- 2 TRANSIT ZONE. AT THIS POINT KIMBERLY IF WE COULD GO TO PUBLIC
- 3 COMMENT.

- 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. THE FIRST SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPRE. GO
- 6 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

- 8 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA. ALETA DUPRE FOR THE
- 9 RECORD, SHE AND HER. I HAVE BEEN IN SUPPORT OF THIS. I AM
- 10 STILL IN SUPPORT OF THIS. I THINK IT IS REASONABLE, AND I AM
- 11 GENERALLY IN ALIGNMENT WITH COMMENTS OF COMMISSIONER
- 12 JOSEFOWITZ AND SPERING. DO I NOT HAVE A CAR, AND I LIVE IN
- 13 RENTED OUARTERS. AND I COULD THINK HOW MANY MORE APARTMENTS
- 14 WOULD I HAVE HERE IF WE DIDN'T HAVE SO MUCH PARKING, AND I DO
- 15 LIVE ABOUT FOUR 10THS OF A MILE FROM A BUS STOP. IT SHOULD BE
- 16 EASIER FOR A PERSON TO GET A HOME TO LIVE IN, THAN TO LIVE IN
- 17 THEIR CAR. MORE AND MORE PEOPLE ARE REALIZING THAT WHEN IT
- 18 COSTS AN AVERAGE OF \$700 A MONTH IN AMERICA TO KEEP A CAR
- 19 THAT'S MONEY THAT CAN BE USED FOR A LOT OF OTHER THINGS. AND I
- 20 DON'T HEAR OF PEOPLE DRIVING A HALF A MILE TO THE 100 25TH
- 21 STREET STATION IN NEW YORK CITY TO RIDE A TRAIN FOUR MILES TO
- 22 GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL. SO I THINK, I DO BELIEVE IN THE
- 23 IMPORTANCE OF STATEWIDE EXPECTATIONS. THAT THIS IS A BILL
- 24 THAT APPLIES TO A SPECIFIC SUBSET. I AM A PERSON WITH
- 25 DISABILITIES AND I VALUE THE FACT THEY LIVE CLOSE TO A TRANSIT





- 1 STOP, YES I HAVE A DRIVER'S LICENSE, AND I CAN DRIVE A CAR BUT
- 2 I ENJOY THE PACKET THAT I'M NOT CAR DEPENDENT AND I THINK THE
- 3 BILL WOULD ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO BE ABLE TO MOVE AWAY FROM CARS
- 4 AND FIND OTHER WAYS TO BE ABLE TO BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND
- 5 NOT SPEND SO MUCH MONEY ON CARS. THANK YOU.

7 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU.

8

- 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND LEBRUN. PLEASE
- 10 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

- 12 SPEAKER: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR, AND I'M GOING TO ECHO THE
- 13 SENTIMENT THAT ONE SIZE DOES NOT FIT ALL. TWO EXAMPLES. LAST
- 14 NIGHT IN SAN JOSE WE APPROVED THE GOOGLE PROJECT 4,000 UNITS
- 15 AROUND THE DIRIDON STATION WITHIN HALF A MILE INCLUDING 1,000
- 16 AFFORDABLE PARKING 4,750 SPACES WITH A GUARANTEED MINIMUM OF
- 17 200750 SPACES IN CONSTRUCTION. JUST SOUTH OF THAT,
- 18 APPROXIMATELY THREE MILES TO TAMIEN STATION, THE DEVELOPER
- 19 GRAND THE ENTIRE PARKING LOT, THEY WERE SUPPOSED TO BE
- 20 BUILDING A PARKING STRUCTURE ON THE OPPOSITE SIDE OF HIGHWAY
- 21 87, CAME BACK SAYS SORRY NUMBERS ARE NOT UP. DEMAND FOR
- 22 CALTRAIN 1,000 CARS A DAY THESE GONE DON'T HAVE TO DRIVE ALL
- 23 THE WAY TO WORK DON'T HAVE ANY OTHER OPTION WE HAVE A MAJOR
- 24 SITUATION DEVELOPING IN GILROY WHERE THE SAME THING IS GOING
- 25 HAPPEN THE DEVELOPER IS GOING TO TAKE OVER THE ENTIRE PARKING





- 1 LOT WITHOUT OFFERING ANY REPLACEMENT AND WE HAVE 2028 CALTRAIN
- 2 BUSINESS PLAN WHICH IS APPROVED BY 1/8 TAX MEASURE TO MAKE
- 3 THAT PLAN HAPPEN AND THE PLAN IS GOING FALL FLAT ON ITS FACE
- 4 BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO BE IMPOSSIBLE FOR PEOPLE TO DRIVE TO
- 5 GILROY CALTRAIN STATION AND PARKING TO GET ON THE TRAIN. I
- 6 REST MY CASE. THANK YOU.

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU ROLAND.

10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER JORDAN GRIMES, YOU HAVE TWO

11 MINUTES.

8

9

12

13 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, JORDAN GRIMES, POLITICAL

14 DIRECTOR OF THE PENNINSULA YOUNG DEMOCRATS. WE'RE A 20 YEAR

15 OLD POLITICAL CLUB HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO PENINSULA FROM DALY

16 CITY TO PALO ALTO. OUR CLUB VOTED UNANIMOUSLY TO SUPPORT AB

17 1401 LAST MONTH. I'LL TRY TO BE BRIEF BECAUSE JOSEFOWITZ AND

18 CANEPA CLEARED UP MOST OF THE UNFORTUNATE MISINFORMATION I

19 HAVE HEARD THIS MORNING ABOUT THE BILL INCLUDING FROM MY OWN

20 REPRESENTATIVES I WANT TO STRONGLY PUSH BACK ON THE MISGUIDED

21 NOTION THAT PARKING MINIMUMS WOULD BENEFIT AFFORDABLE HOUSING.

22 EXACT OPPOSITE THESE REQUIREMENTS ARE INCREDIBLY EXPENSIVE AND

23 DETRIMENTAL TO OUR CLIMATE SUSTAINABILITY AND HOUSING

24 AFFORDABILITY GOALS PER UC BERKELEY CENTER FOR HOUSING THESE

25 REQUIREMENTS AVERAGE COST MORE THAN \$40,000 PER UNIT TO THE





- 1 TOTAL COST OF THE HOUSING PROJECT UNDERGROUND SPACES OFTEN
- 2 COST UPWARDS OF \$75,000, YOU HAVE PARKING THAT GOES UNUSED AND
- 3 PARKING THAT AS STUDIES HAVE SHOWN AFFORDABLE HOUSING
- 4 RESIDENTS RELY CONSIDERABLY LESS ON AS THEY HAVE FOUR
- 5 EXPENSIVE PERSONAL VEHICLES AND WILL RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT
- 6 THESE REQUIREMENTS FURTHER NEGATIVELY IMPACT AFFORDABLE
- 7 HOUSING BY REQUIRING FOR PROFIT DEVELOPERS SUBJECT TO
- 8 INCLUSIONARY ZONING REQUIREMENTS TO SPEND MILLIONS OF DOLLARS
- 9 ON UNUSED PARKING SPACES INSTEAD OF BELOW RATE MARKET HOUSING,
- 10 AND HOUSING PROJECTS NEAR HIGH QUALITY PUBLIC TRANSIT LINES
- 11 WHERE PEOPLE DON'T WANT OR NEED TO USE CARS MAKES SENSE
- 12 REQUIRING SPACE FOR CARS INSTEAD OF PEOPLE DOES NOT MAKE SENSE
- 13 AT ITS CORE THIS IS COMMON SENSE GOOD GOVERNANCE INITIATIVE
- 14 THAT REMOVES ROADBLOCKS TOWARDS THE FUTURE THAT WE NEED LET'S
- 15 SEE SPACE FOR PEOPLE NOT CARS. THANK YOU.

17 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU JORDAN.

- 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN.
- 20 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.
- 22 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN. AND SPEAKING
- 23 AS AN INDIVIDUAL, AND PARTICIPANT IN A FEW LOCAL PROHOUSING
- 24 GROUPS WHERE, AS OUR COMMUNITIES -- I LIVE IN MENLO PARK IN
- 25 SAN MATEO COUNTY, AND AS OUR COMMUNITIES ARE REALLY WRESTLING

16

18





- 1 WITH THE HOUSING ELEMENTS AND HOW WE ARE GOING TO ZONE FOR
- 2 PEOPLE TO LIVE AT ALL INCOME LEVELS, THIS IS REALLY GOING TO
- 3 BE A CHALLENGE, AND PARKING REQUIREMENTS IS ONE OF THE
- 4 BARRIERS TO BEING ABLE TO ACCOMMODATE THE PEOPLE THAT WE DO
- 5 NEED TO ACCOMMODATE. I HAVE SEEN THE STUDIES OF, YOU KNOW,
- 6 SHOWING THAT IN PLACE AFTER PLACE AFTER PLACE, THERE ARE
- 7 DEVELOPMENTS THAT HAVE PLENTY OF UNUSED PARKING, AND AS OTHERS
- 8 HAVE SAID, THIS BILL WOULD NOT PREVENT DEVELOPERS FROM
- 9 BUILDING PARKING, IT WOULD JUST PREVENT REQUIREMENTS FOR MORE
- 10 PARKING THAN PEOPLE WILL USE. I CERTAINLY HEARD WHAT
- 11 COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAID IN TERMS OF WANTING TO HAVE POLICIES
- 12 TO HAVE CHILD CARE AND OTHER AMENITIES THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO
- 13 THE COMMUNITY. AND WILL URGE MY COMMUNITY AND OTHER
- 14 COMMUNITIES TO USE OTHER PLANNING RULES IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO
- 15 ENSURE THAT DEVELOPMENTS MEET THOSE NEEDS OF THE COMMUNITY
- 16 WITHOUT HAVING TO NEGOTIATE AND TRADEOFF ON PARKING AND I
- 17 ENCOURAGE YOU TO SUPPORT THE BILL. THANK YOU.
- 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO ADDITIONAL MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
- 20 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.
- 22 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT THANK YOU VERY MUCH MEMBERS
- 23 OF THE PUBLIC FOR PARTICIPATING I'M GOING TO BRING IT BACK TO
- 24 THE COMMISSION THANK YOU F ALL FOR YOUR COMMENTS, THIS IS
- 25 DEMOCRACY IN ACTION. A LOT OF GREAT POINTS. AT THIS POINT I'M



## May 26, 2021

GOING TO DO A ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE MOTION TO SUPPORT THIS 1 BILL. MOTION MADE BY MYSELF, SECOND BY CANEPA. ROLL CALL VOTE, 2 3 PLEASE? 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THE MOTION PASSES WITH TEN AYES, FIVE NOS, AND THREE ABSENTS. 6 7 8 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR ROLL CALL AND 9 COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR CANDID DISCUSSION WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE THE CONVERSATION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ITEM 12 PUBLIC 10 11 COMMENT. I WOULD ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT AT INFO AT BAY AREA METRO INTO THE RECORD. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 15 16 ON THIS ITEM. 17 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU KIMBERLY. WE'RE GOING TO 18 19 MOVE TO ADJOURNMENT. ADJOURN OUR COMMISSION MEETING TO OUR NEXT MEETING WEDNESDAY JUNE 23RD REMOTELY OR BY WEBCAST ANY 20 21 CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government