## METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript





1	POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
2	WEDNESDAY, 1:00, MAY 12, 2021
3	
4	RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR JOINING THE POLICY ADVISORY
5	COUNCIL MEETING OF MAY 12TH, 2021. PLEASE RUN THE
6	ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE
7	TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR
8	PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER
9	N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT.
10	THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR
11	WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER
12	SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE
13	THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
14	PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED
15	ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.
16	COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM
17	WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL
18	STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
19	APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED
20	UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS
21	REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
22	ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.
23	WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY
24	5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND
25	ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF





- 1 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,
- 2 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
- 3 ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE
- 4 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL
- 5 BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF
- 6 THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN
- 7 REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST
- 8 ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS,
- 9 PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT
- 10 THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING
- 11 COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND
- 12 ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
- 13 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
- 14 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD
- 15 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR
- 16 WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
- 17 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
- 18 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE
- 19 THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION
- 20 IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
- 21 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO
- 22 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE
- 23 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
- 24 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL





BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WELCOME TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING. ROLL CALL PLEASE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: KINMAN. RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MURRAY? CYNTHIA MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: HERE COATS? RICK COATES: HERE BARNETT? RICHARD BURNETT: HERE. SPEAKER: COCHRAN? ELDRED? ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: FLOREZ?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.

Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience

only and is not an official record of any action taken.

VEDA FLOREZ: HERE.





CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: GLOVER? GOTUACO? CHRISTINA GOTUACO: PRESENT. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: HERNANDEZ? CALLINS. WENDI KALLINS: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: LEVIN? ADINA IS HERE BUT SHE'S MUTED. CHAVEZ? CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MENDOZA? ADRIAN MENDOZA: HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MOMOH IS EXCUSED. RAHMON MOMOH: I'M HERE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: BEN SCHWENG? BENJAMIN SCHWENG: HERE. 





1 2 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: SCOTT? 3 TERRY SCOTT? PRESENT. 4 5 >>CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WELTE? 6 7 8 FRANK WELTE: HERE. 9 10 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WILSON IS EXCUSED. WE HAVE A QUORUM. 11 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: ITEM THREE, THE CHAIR'S REPORT. AS YOU 12 ALL HAVE SEEN WE GOT OFF TO A LATE START TODAY DUE TO THE 13 EXTENSION OF MEETINGS WHICH ALL OF THE MORNING MEETINGS 14 STARTED LATE SINCE THERE WAS SOME TECHNICAL DIFFICULTIES AND 15 16 WE STILL WOULD HAVE STARTED LATE IN ANY CASE. WITH THAT, IT JUST SPEAKS TO MY QUESTIONING ABOUT THE OVERALL BUDGET AND 17 BEING ABLE TO DO THIS IN THE FUTURE WITH MULTIPLE AGENCIES 18 MEETING IN THE BUILDING. SO, WITH THAT I HAVE DISCUSSED WITH 19 STAFF THE PLANNED BAY AREA ON TODAY AGENDA IS GOING TO BE 20 21 CONDENSED, IT WILL NOT TAKE 40 MINUTES. I PROMISE IT WILL JUST TALK A FEW MINUTES. THAT'S A MAKE UP OF TIME. BUT WE, TODAY'S 22 MEETING NEEDS TO BE RUN PRECISELY AND OUICKLY. THIS MORNING'S 23 MEETINGS HAD A LOT TO DO WITH BUDGETS SO I ADVISE PEOPLE TO 24 TUNE INTO THOSE MEETINGS AS WE GO FORWARD. AND I WANT TO 25





- 1 ADVISE THE COUNCIL THAT I WILL -- I MAY NOT MAKE IT THROUGH
- 2 THIS ENTIRE MEETING BECAUSE -- AND I MAY NOT BE AT A COUPLE OF
- 3 FUTURE MEETINGS. I HAVE SOME FAMILY ISSUES THAT REQUIRE ME
- 4 LEGALLY TO BE IN ANOTHER CITY AND WHERE I'M HAVE TO GO TO AS I
- 5 DISCOVERED LAST WEEK HAD NON-EXISTENT WI-FI AND MOST OF IT IS
- 6 AREAS THAT I'M WORKING IN. SO WITH THAT, WE'LL GO INTO ITEM
- 7 NUMBER FOUR APPROVAL OF THE APRIL 14TH MEETING MINUTES. DO I
- 8 HAVE A MOTION TO APPROVE?

10 RICHARD HEDGES: MOVE APPROVAL.

12 MICHAEL BALDINI: SECOND.

13

11

- 14 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: HEDGES AND BALDINI. DISCUSSION ON THE
- 15 MINUTES OF LAST MONTH. SEEING NO HAND RAISED. CALL FOR THE
- 16 VOTE, PLEASE.

17

- 18 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 20 ON THIS ITEM. [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES WITH THREE
- 21 ABSTENTIONS.

- 23 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. BEFORE WE GO TO PUBLIC
- 24 COMMENTS, I WANT TO ADVISE YOU ALL TO CHECK YOUR VACATION
- 25 SCHEDULES IF YOU ARE LEAVING TOWN IN THE NEXT THREE OR FOUR





11

14

18

22

- 1 MONTHS SEPTEMBER AND OCTOBER. NOTIFY MARTHA AS SOON AS
- 2 POSSIBLE BECAUSE WE NEED TO MAKE QUORUM FOR UPCOMING MEETINGS
- 3 AND WE ARE MEETING EVERY MONTH FROM NOW UNTIL THE END OF THE
- 4 YEAR. PLEASE, MAKE SURE WE KNOW WHAT YOUR AVAILABILITY IS,
- 5 PUBLIC COMMENTS, ITEM FIVE, ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS?
- 6 AND/OR ARE THERE ANY HANDS RAISED?

7

9 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH

- 10 ON THIS ITEM. ALSO ABIGAIL COCHRAN IS EXCUSED.
- 12 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: MOVING TO SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS WE HAVE
- 13 THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT UP FIRST. VEDA?
- 15 VEDA FLOREZ: THANK YOU CHAIR KINMAN. MY REPORT IS ACTUALLY
- 16 ITEM SIX. SO FOR EFFICIENCY SAKE WOULD YOU LIKE ME TO READ THE
- 17 MEMO OR SHOULD WE JUST WAIT UNTIL THEN?
- 19 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I DON'T BELIEVE WE NEED TO HAVE THE MEMO
- 20 READ. WE CAN JUST HAVE A STATEMENT BECAUSE THE MEMO IS
- 21 INCLUDED IN THE PACKET.
- 23 VEDA FLOREZ: YES ON MAY THE THIRD WE HAD AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM
- 24 ON THE NOMENCLATURE OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, THE



SUBCOMMITTEE IS IN FAVOR OF FORWARDING TO THE PAC ITS APPROVAL 1 2 OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. 3 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WERE THERE ANY OTHER ITEMS ON 4 5 YOUR AGENDA TO DISCUSS OR ADVISE US OF? 6 7 VEDA FLOREZ: NOT AT THIS TIME. WE WILL NOT BE MEETING IN MAY -8 - I MEAN --9 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: JUNE? 10 11 VEDA FLOREZ: NOT BE MEETING IN JUNE. YES. 12 13 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO THE FARE 14 15 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT. ADINA? 16 ADINA LEVIN: THE SUBCOMMITTEE MET THIS WEEK ON MONDAY, GAVE 17 18 FEEDBACK TO STAFF ON THE SET OF OPTION THAT IS GOING TO BE STUDIES IN DEPTH WITH USER RESEARCH AND BUSINESS ANALYSIS. THE 19 -- IF ANYBODY IS INTERESTED IN GIVING FEEDBACK ON THOSE 20 OPTIONS TO STAFF BEFORE THEY ARE DECIDED BY -- TO STUDY BY THE 21 22 FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATIONS TASK FORCE, WILL MAKE THOSE DECISIONS ON MONDAY PLEASE TAKE A LOOK AT THE STAFF REPORT 23 FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND SEND YOUR FEEDBACK TO STAFF. 24





- 1 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. DUE TO THE CIRCUMSTANCES THAT
- 2 I FIND MYSELF IN AND HAVING TO COMPRESS TIME, I WILL BE
- 3 WITHDRAWING FROM MY SEAT ON THE FARE INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE.
- 4 I HAVE ASKED CHRISTINA GOTUACO TO TAKE MY PLACE AND PENDING
- 5 HER OKAY, WE HAVE BEEN GOING BACK AND FORTH THIS MORNING, SHE
- 6 WILL BE APPOINTED TO THAT COMMITTEE. SO, WITH THAT, WE WILL
- 7 GO INTO ITEM NUMBER SEVEN, THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY
- 8 TASK FORCE UPDATE.

- 10 MELANIE CHOY: GOOD AFTERNOON POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS.
- 11 MELANIE CHOY WITH MTC STAFF AND I'LL PROVIDE A BRIEF OVERVIEW
- 12 OF WHAT HAPPENED LAST MONTH AT THE BLUE RIBBON AS WELL AS A
- 13 LOOK AHEAD AT OUR UPCOMING MAY MEETING. SO LAST MONTH, WE MET
- 14 ON APRIL 26TH, AND PROBABLY YOU ALSO GOT A PREVIEW FROM
- 15 THERESA ROMMEL LAST MONTH. BUT THERE WAS THREE PRESENTATIONS
- 16 THAT WAS GIVEN TO THE BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE AND THE
- 17 FIRST PRESENTATION WAS FOCUSED ON EMC'S WORK WHO IS A
- 18 CONSULTANT OF MTC AND WHAT THEY PRESENT SIDE THEIR OVERVIEW OF
- 19 THEIR APPROACH ON POLLING AND GETTING THE RIDER INPUT,
- 20 FEEDBACK, AND ASSESSMENT OF ALL INFORMATION THAT HAS BEEN
- 21 COLLECTED THUS FAR. SO THEIR WORK REALLY HAS BEEN FOCUSED ON
- 22 INFORMATION THAT FEED THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSFORMATION WORK AS
- 23 WELL AS THE RETURN TO TRANSIT RECOVERY. ON THOSE TWO FRONTS,
- 24 WHAT THEY HAVE DONE IS ESSENTIALLY WORK ON A MARKETING
- 25 CAMPAIGN THAT'S A RETURN TO TRANSIT CAMPAIGN AND SECOND PIECE





- 1 IS TRANSFORMATION WHICH IS MORE ABOUT THE INFORMATION WITH THE
- 2 POLLING, SURVEYING, AND COLLECTING INFORMATION FROM FOCUS
- 3 GROUPS. AND IN ADDITION, ALL OF THEIR POLLING, SURVEYING, AND
- 4 FOCUS GROUPS WORK, COMMUNITIES BASED FOCUS GROUP WORK, THEY
- 5 HAVE ALSO DONE A SCAN OF DOCUMENTS THEY DID THAT IN OCTOBER
- 6 AND AGAIN THEY DID THAT IN MAY, REGARDING STUDIES FROM TRANSIT
- 7 AGENCIES AS WELL AS THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES SO WITH
- 8 THAT INFORMATION ALL OF THESE PIECES ARE GOING TO FEED INTO
- 9 GUIDING THE ACTION PLAN FOR THE BLUE RIBBON. CURRENTLY THEY
- 10 DO HAVE ADDITIONAL EMPLOYER POLLING OUT ON THE STREETS AND
- 11 ADDITIONAL COMMUNITIES BASED FOCUS GROUPS THAT THEY HAVE
- 12 CONDUCTED AND THE RESULTS OF THAT WILL BE PRESENTED TO THE MAY
- 13 TASK FORCE MEETING. THE SECOND TOPIC THAT WAS PRESENTED WAS
- 14 FOCUS ON THE ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE NETWORK
- 15 MANAGEMENT DISCUSSION AND PART OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
- 16 EVALUATION WHICH AN INDEPENDENT CONSULTANT WILL BE REVIEWING
- 17 AND THERE WAS A FOCUS ON REALLY A LIST OF ROLES AND
- 18 RESPONSIBILITIES HAVING SHARED WITH THE STAFF OVER THE LAST
- 19 SEVERAL MONTHS AND THIS MEETING IN APRIL IS FOCUSED ON
- 20 NARROWING DOWN WHAT ARE THE NEAR-TERM PRIORITIES FOR
- 21 DISCUSSION FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT. THERE IS A LOT OF STUFF ON
- 22 THE TABLE AND THEY'RE ALL RELATED TO NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUT
- 23 WHAT ARE THE SOCIAL CORE PIECES TO FOCUS ON IN THE NEAR-TERM.
- 24 IT'S A PRIORITIZATION OF THAT LONG LIST. SO THE THREE
- 25 CATEGORIZATIONS FIRST ONE WAS NEAR-TERM AND SECOND





- 1 CATEGORIZATION WE HAD COLOR CODED BLUE RELATED TO NEAR-TERM
- 2 AND SECOND CATEGORIZATION WAS COLORED IN YELLOW AND THINGS
- 3 THAT ARE CURRENTLY HAPPENING AND THAT COULD BE INCLUDED IN THE
- 4 NETWORK MANAGEMENT EVALUATION LATER ON. AND THERE WAS A THIRD
- 5 CATEGORY AND THAT CATEGORY WAS JUST -- THE CATEGORY WAS
- 6 FOCUSED ON DEFERRING FOR A LATER TIME, A TBD KIND OF TIME
- 7 FRAME IT WAS FURTHER OUT THE MEETING WAS FOCUSED ON INPUT FROM
- 8 THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS. AND WE'RE LOOKING AT THE FEEDBACK. OUR
- 9 CONSULTANTS WILL LOOK AT THAT LIST AS L EVALUATION CONSULTANTS
- 10 AND WE PLAN TO COME BACK TO THE MAY MEETING WITH A LIST OF
- 11 JUST THE BLUES AND TAKE THAT ACTION IN MAY. THE LAST
- 12 INFORMATION THAT WAS GIVEN TO THE TASK FORCE LAST MONTH AND
- 13 FOCUSED ON AN UPDATE WHAT IS HAPPENING IN SONOMA COUNTY.
- 14 SONOMA COUNTY DID A STUDY IN 2019 LOOKING AT SOME THINGS IN
- 15 TERMS OF COORDINATION, COLLABORATION, INTEGRATION,
- 16 EFFICIENCIES, AND BASED ON THE PANDEMIC LAST YEAR, THEY
- 17 CONVENED A TRANSIT AD-HOC MEETING SO THEY PRESENTED THEIR WORK
- 18 THAT THEY HAVE DONE TO DATE TO KIND OF ADVANCE THE
- 19 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THAT STUDY AND THAT WAS REALLY KIND OF
- 20 SHOWCASING AN EXAMPLE OF COLLABORATIVE WORK HAPPENING IN THE
- 21 REGION. AND SO MOVING INTO THIS MONTH, FOR THE BLUE RIBBON
- 22 RECOVERY TASK FORCE MEETING, WE WILL, AS I MENTIONED EARLIER,
- 23 RECEIVE AN, UH, DATE ON THE EMC POLLING RESULTS AND ALSO THE
- 24 FOCUS GROUP RESULTS SO THERE WILL BE A SHORT PRESENTATION ON
- 25 THAT THERE WILL ALSO BE AN APPROVAL ACTION ON THE ROLES AND





- 1 RESPONSIBILITIES THAT ARE FOR NEAR-TERM PRIORITIZATION. WE
- 2 WILL ALSO INTRODUCE THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT CONSULTANT
- 3 EVALUATION CONSULTANT AND THE LAST ITEM WE'LL BE BRINGING TO
- 4 THE TASK FORCE IS AN UPDATE ON THE ONGOING INITIATIVES THAT
- 5 WOULD THEN ALSO FEED INTO THE FINAL CONTENT FOR THIS -- THE
- 6 ACTION PLAN THAT WILL BE ADOPTED IN JULY AT THE TASK FORCE.
- 7 AND BEFORE I PAUSE AND TAKE OUESTIONS, I ALSO WANT TO CALL OUT
- 8 TWO INFORMATION SESSIONS THAT WE ARE PLANNING ON HOLDING. AND
- 9 ONE IS, THERE WILL BE A PRESENTATION FROM THE EMC ON THE
- 10 POLLING RULES OF LAWS AND FOCUS GROUP RESULTS BUT WE'RE ALSO
- 11 WORKING ON SCHEDULING A SESSION THAT'S JUST FOCUSED ON FOLKS
- 12 WHO ARE INTERESTED IN LEARNING MORE ABOUT THE RESULTS AND
- 13 HAVING A DEEPER DIVE ON THAT TOPIC SO WE'RE SETTING UP A
- 14 SEPARATE MEETING ON THAT AND SECONDLY DOING ANOTHER ROUND OF
- 15 OUTREACH TO THE TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS AND THESE MEETING ARE
- 16 NOTICED ON OUR WEB SITE AND THOSE DATES HAVE BEEN DETERMINED
- 17 WE'LL BE DOING THAT END OF MAY EARLY JUNE. I'LL TAKE QUESTIONS
- 19 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: WHEN YOU HAVE THE DATES YOU CAN PLEASE
- 20 PASS THEM OUT SO WE DON'T HAVE TO KEEP CHECKING THE WEB SITE?
- 22 MELANIE CHOY: I'LL SEND THEM THROUGH MARTI.
- 24 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: QUESTIONS FROM THE COUNCIL? I DON'T SEE
- 25 HANDS BEING RAISED. THAT'S KIND OF UNUSUAL FOR YOU GUYS. I

21





- 1 HAVE TWO THINGS TO SAY, THE FIRST JUST ANSWERING THE IDEA OF
- 2 WHO OR WHAT A NETWORK MANAGEMENT TEAM PERSON WOULD LOOK LIKE
- 3 THAT'S STILL BEING DEVELOPED BASED ON ALL THE INPUT SO UNTIL
- 4 WE ACTUALLY GET ANALYSIS AND AGREEMENT ON THAT WE CAN'T
- 5 ACTUALLY GO FORWARD ON THAT. I FIND IT VERY -- I THINK THAT
- 6 IT'S JUST BEEN AN INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF WORK TO GET TO THIS
- 7 POINT. SO I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT WORK. AND THE SECOND THING
- 8 IS, FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DIDN'T HEAR THE MEETING PRECEDING
- 9 OURS, I KNOW THAT THERE IS A LOT OF DISCUSSION ON BUDGETS
- 10 REGARDING THE LATEST ROUND OF MONEY THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED, AND
- 11 HOW THAT AFFECTS EVERYBODY AND I'M HOPING THAT WE CAN GET --
- 12 WE CAN GET SOME OF THOSE LITTLE SNIPPETS, ESPECIALLY THERESE'S
- 13 LAST COMMENTS ABOUT HOW THAT MONEY IS BEING ALLOCATED, KIND OF
- 14 BOOKMARKED AND SENT OUT TO PEOPLE BECAUSE I THINK IT SUMMED UP
- 15 PRETTY REALISTICALLY AS TO HOW FUNDS ARE BEING DISTRIBUTED.
- 16 OKAY OF THE LAST CALL FOR COUNCIL MEMBERS TO COMMENT. THERE
- 17 ARE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?
- 19 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 20 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 21 ON THIS ITEM.
- 23 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU MELANIE.
- 25 MELANIE CHOY: OKAY. THANK YOU.

22





1 2 **RANDI K**I

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE INTO ITEM NUMBER

3 EIGHT, THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT PLAN RELEASE

4 ANNOUNCEMENT, DAVE VAUTIN.

5

6 MELANIE CHOY: AND I WILL RESPECTFULLY STEP AWAY. >DAVE

7 VAUTIN: GOOD AFTERNOON DAVE VAUTIN DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS AS

8 PROMISED WE'RE GOING KEEP THIS BRIEF BECAUSE IT'S AN UPDATE ON

9 THE STATUS OF THE LONG RANGE PLAN AS YOU ARE LIKELY AWARE IN

10 JANUARY MTC/ABAG APPROVED THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR PLANNED BAY

11 AREA 2050 AS THE PREFERRED EIR ALTERNATIVE SINCE THEM OUR TEAM

12 HAS BEEN WORKING ON DEVELOPING THE DRAFT PLAN DOCUMENT

13 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN YOU ALL HEARD ABOUT CORRESPONDING

14 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT AND FINALLY DRAFT

15 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORTS A WHOLE SUITE OF MATERIAL RELATED

16 TO THE DRAFT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND WE ANNOUNCED THE GOOD

17 NUANCE THE DRAFT PLAN WILL BE RELEASED BY END OF MAY. WE WILL

18 CONDUCT PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT THIS FALL KICKING OFF IN JUNE WITH A

19 SERIES OF PUBLIC WORKSHOPS AND HEARINGS WE CAN SHARE THE DATES

20 WITH YOU FOR THOSE EVENTS OCCURRING IN MID-JUNE, MID-JULY AND

21 THEY WILL CONTINUE BEING VIRTUAL EVENTS GIVEN THE EVOLVING

22 PUBLIC HEALTH SITUATION. THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD FOR DRAFT

23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WILL GO THROUGH JULY 20TH AND WE'LL

24 REPORT BACK ON THE PLANNING ADMIN COMMITTEE IN AUGUST AS WELL

25 AS THE COUNCIL WITH FEEDBACK RECEIVED DURING THE PUBLIC





- 1 ENGAGEMENT AS WELL AS POTENTIAL REVISIONS TO THE VARIOUS
- 2 DOCUMENTS PRIOR TO THE ADOPTION IN THE FALL AND WE'LL BE BACK
- 3 NEXT MONTH FOR THE DEEP DIVE PRESENTATION ON THE DRAFT PLAN
- 4 AND WITH THAT I'LL BE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY OUESTIONS.

6 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: RICK COATES?

7

- 8 RICK COATES: I AM WONDERING IF YOU ARE EXPERIENCING ANY
- 9 SIGNIFICANT OPPOSITION TO THE ADOPTION OF THIS PLAN ONCE YOU
- 10 GET TO THE EIR STAGES IT BECOMES RATHER CRITICAL. DO YOU HAVE
- 11 A BULLETPROOF EIR? OTHERWISE YOU COULD END UP SNARLED IN COURT
- 12 FOR A LONG TIME IF THERE IS SIGNIFICANT OPPOSITION. JUST
- 13 CURIOUS IF YOU HAVE HEARD ANYTHING ON THAT FRONT? >DAVE
- 14 VAUTIN: I WOULD SAY WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON PLANNED BAY AREA
- 15 2050 FOR OVER THREE YEARS NOW, THIS IS THE FOURTH AND FINAL
- 16 YEAR OF THE PROCESS THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF ROBUST DISCUSSIONS
- 17 CERTAINLY ON THE VARIOUS STRATEGIES THAT GO INTO THE PLAN,
- 18 REFINING THEM OVER A SERIES OF CYCLES. I'M SURE WE'RE GOING TO
- 19 HEAR LOTS OF COMMENTS STARTING NEXT MONTH DURING THE PUBLIC
- 20 COMMENT PERIOD I'M SURE SOME WILL BE IN SUPPORT IS SOME WILL
- 21 BE IN OPPOSITION BUT WE'LL BE FOCUSING ON TAKING THAT FEEDBACK
- 22 AND PUTTING THE FINAL TOUCHING ON THE PLAN-BASED ON WHAT WE
- 23 HEAR THIS SUMMER.

24

25 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES.



1 RICHARD HEDGES: BASED ON THE LAST COMMENT, ON THE LAST PLAN, I 2 3 THINK WE HAD TWO LAWSUITS, DAVE CAN PROBABLY REMEMBER BETTER THAN ME BUT I'M JUST HOPING THIS DOESN'T GET CONTENTIOUS LIKE 4 5 IT DID LAST TIME. >DAVE VAUTIN: THE FIRST PLANNED BAY AREA DID EXPERIENCE LAWSUITS THE SECOND THERE WAS NO LEGAL 6 LITIGATION THAT OCCURRED WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 BUT AS YOU 7 8 ALL KNOW WE ARE IN A SOCIETY THAT CAN SOMETIMES BE LITIGIOUS IT'S A COMPLEX POLICY ENVIRONMENT IS MAJOR UPDATES TO THE 9 REGIONAL PLAN WE MAKING SURE TO FOCUS ON THE ANALYSIS AND WHAT 10 THE PLAN DOES AND INCLUDE IN THE PLAN IT MEANS FOR THE REGION 11 AND WE'RE FEELING CONFIDENT THAT AND WILL BE PUTTING OUT THE 12 PLAN NEXT MONTH. 13 14 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: WHAT HAS HAPPENED IN THE LAST YEAR IS, I 15 16 THINK THE AGENCIES THAT WE DEAL WITH, AND THE TRANSIT 17 AGENCIES, ESPECIALLY, HAVE PAID MORE ATTENTION ALONG THE WAY. SO I THINK THAT, ESPECIALLY IN THE LAST 15 MONTHS OR SO THERE 18 HAS BEEN MORE INVOLVEMENT FROM WITH THEM ON THE ONGOING PLANS. 19 SO, IN THAT RESPECT, I THINK WE HAVE A MORE ROBUST SUPPORT 20 21 THAN WE HAD IN THE PAST. BECAUSE EVERYBODY'S -- EVERYBODY'S GOT SKIN IN THE GAME, AND THEY HAVE BEEN ATTENDING AND 22 PLAYING. SO. JUST MY OBSERVATION. ARE THERE ANY MORE COMMENTS 23 FROM THE COUNCIL? IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT, MARTHA? 24





1 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH

- 2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

- 5 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH. THANKS DAVE AND THANKS
- 6 FOR KEEPING THAT BRIEF FOR US. WITH THAT WE GO TO ITEM NINE
- 7 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN RECONSIDERING THEIR LANGUAGE. THAT WILL
- 8 BE ANUP.

- 10 ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU RANDY. GOOD AFTERNOON COUNCIL MEMBERS
- 11 HAPPY TO BE HERE AGAIN MY NAME IS ANUP TAPASE A PLANNER IN THE
- 12 REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM AT MTC AND ABAG. CAN I ASK OUR TECH
- 13 TEAM TO BRING UP THE SLIDES, PLEASE? THANK YOU. I'M HERE TODAY
- 14 ON THE TOPIC OF RECONSIDERING OUR LANGUAGE WITH RESPECT TO THE
- 15 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN FRAMEWORK WE USE VERY OFTEN HERE IN I
- 16 WORK AT MTC AND ABAG THIS IS AN ITEM WE DISCUSSED AT THE
- 17 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE THE LAST FEW MONTHS AND AT THE
- 18 REGIONAL EOUITY WORKING GROUP TWICE AND I BELIEVE WE HAVE
- 19 TOGETHER COME UP WITH AN AFFIRMATIVE RECOMMENDATION FOR THE
- 20 COUNCIL TODAY AS WELL AS PLANNING. BACKGROUND ON PAGE TWO.
- 21 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN IS A FRAMEWORK OUR AGENCIES HAVE USED
- 22 SINCE 2001, DESIGNATED GEOGRAPHIES OR CENSUS TRACTS THAT HAVE
- 23 HIGH CONCENTRATIONS OF UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS DEFINITIONS
- 24 BASED ON CALCULATION THRESHOLDS FOR EIGHT DEMOGRAPHIC FACTORS
- 25 INCLUDING RACE AND INCOME WE UPDATE THESE DESIGNATIONS EVERY





- 1 PLAN CYCLE WITH THE MOST RECENT DEMOGRAPHIC DATA IN THIS CASE
- 2 2020. THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE MAP IS FOR REFERENCE. NEXT PAGE. I
- 3 WANT TO MAKE A SPECIFIC POINT NOT TO POINT TO ANY COMMUNITIES
- 4 BUT TO PAINT A PICTURE THAT COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN ARE NOT
- 5 SOME MODEL OF MONOLITHIC TYPE OF COMMUNITIES THESE COMMUNITIES
- 6 ARE RICH AND DIVERSE VIBRANT AND RICH IN CULTURE COMMUNITIES
- 7 ARE RACIALLY AND ETHICALLY DIVERSE. SOME ARE URBAN, RICH IN
- 8 TRANSIT, GREAT ACCESS TO JOBS. SOME ARE RURAL, AGRICULTURAL
- 9 AND SOME AUTO DEPENDENT. AT THE SAME TIME, COMMUNITIES ARE
- 10 CONCERN GRAPPLE WITH VARIOUS ISSUES, RISING RENTS, HOME
- 11 PRICES, AIR POLLUTION FROM PORTS AND REFINERIES SERIOUS HEALTH
- 12 CONCERNS SOME COMMUNITIES HAVE RISK OF FLOODING FROM RISING
- 13 WATER AND CORE INFRASTRUCTURE LIKE ROADS AND HISTORICAL
- 14 POLICIES. LET ME DESCRIBE THE BACKGROUND AND HOW WE USE THE
- 15 FRAMEWORK OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN MUCH. WE USE THE FRAMEWORK
- 16 ACROSS PLANNING EFFORTS, PLANNED BAY AREA PRIMARILY FOR
- 17 PROGRAMMING OF FUNDS AND TO ALIGN PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT RESOURCES.
- 18 THIS FRAMEWORK IS NOT JUST USED BY MTC AND ABAG BUT BY BAY
- 19 AREA AGENCIES INCLUDING COUNTY AND CITY AGENCIES. WITHIN
- 20 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THIS FRAMEWORK IS INTERTWINED WITH THE
- 21 PLAN'S STRATEGIES. FOR EXAMPLE, THEY'RE THE FOCUS OF SOME PLAN
- 22 STRATEGIES SUCH AS SUPPORTING COMMUNITY LED TRANSPORTATION
- 23 ENHANCEMENTS IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN OR PROVIDING TARGETED
- 24 MORTGAGE, RENTAL AND SMALL BUSINESS ASSISTANCE TO HOUSEHOLDS
- 25 AND BUSINESSES IN THE COMMUNITY. WE PRIORITIZE FUNDS WITHIN





- 1 THE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN SUCH AS COMPLETE STREETS INCUBATOR
- 2 PROGRAM AND PARKS ET CETERA. SEVEN% OF OUR WORKSHOPS ARE IN
- 3 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AND MOST OF THE COMMUNITY BASED
- 4 ORGANIZATIONS WE PARTNER WITH ARE IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN
- 5 AND FINALLY EOUITY ANALYSIS WHERE WE DISCOVER OUTCOMES OF
- 6 DISPARITIES MEASURED FOR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN RELATIVE TO
- 7 THE REST OF THE REGION. NEXT PAGE. COMING TO THE TOPIC WHAT'S
- 8 IN THE NAME. THE YEAR 2020 WAS THE OPPORTUNITY FOR RECKONING
- 9 IN OUR REGION AND BEYOND. IN THE MIDDLE OF LAST YEAR, WE BEGAN
- 10 RECONSIDERING THE NOMENCLATURE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AS WE
- 11 FELT DISCOMFORT USING THIS TERM. OVER THE LAST MANY MONTHS
- 12 THROUGH AN INCLUSIVE PROCESS WE CONSULTED WITH THE REGIONAL
- 13 EOUITY WORKING GROUP ADVISORY COUNCIL AND EOUITY AND ACCESS
- 14 SUBCOMMITTEE TO DISCOVER WITH UNDERREPRESENTED COMMUNITIES TO
- 15 DISCUSS FACILITATED BY COMMUNITY DISCUSSIONS THERE WAS A
- 16 RESOUNDING DESIRE TO CHANGE THE NAME COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN.
- 17 THE NAME WAS DEMEANING MAKES A SOUND LIKE THE COMMUNITY FAULT
- 18 AND IS NEGATIVE AND DOESN'T ADDRESS THE STRUGGLE THAT
- 19 COMMUNITIES FACE. THAT I WANT THE TERM TO BE EMPOWERING
- 20 FORWARD LOOKING AND POSITIVE. THEY SAID THEY ALREADY KNOW THE
- 21 COMMUNITIES ARE MARGINALIZED THE TERM SHOULD SHOW WHAT WE'RE
- 22 GOING TO DO ABOUT IT AND THE COMMUNITIES ARE CONSTANTLY
- 23 CHANGING SO THE TERM SHOULD NOT BE STAGNANT AND MENTIONED THE
- 24 WORD SHOULD NOT BE TOO LONG AND SHOULD BE UNDERSTOOD ACROSS
- 25 AUDIENCES. NEXT PAGE. ALSO NOMENCLATURE ON WHAT OTHER AGENCIES





- 1 USE, SQL, AND LOS ANGELES USES ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AREAS AS
- 2 WELL AS COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. SACOG AND SACRAMENTO USES
- 3 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE COMMUNITIES, MET COUNCIL TWIN CITIES
- 4 USES AREAS OF CONCENTRATED POVERTY, HISTORICALLY MARGINALIZED
- 5 COMMUNITIES AND EOUITY FOCUS AREAS ARE TERMS OREGON METRO USES
- 6 AND TRANSPORTATION EQUITY ZONES FOR BOSTON REGION AND EQUITY
- 7 EMPLOYMENT AREAS. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. BASED ON ALL CONVERSATIONS
- 8 WE HAVE HAD SO FAR WITH THE DIFFERENT GROUPS, ACKNOWLEDGE THE
- 9 LANGUAGE AND WORDS CAN SHAPE PEOPLE ACTIONS AND CULTURE WE
- 10 RECOMMEND CHANGING THE NAME FROM PRIORITIES OF CONCERN TO
- 11 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES THIS IS BASED ON FEEDBACK WE
- 12 RECEIVED FROM THE COMMUNITIES THEMSELVES AND EQUITY PRIORITY
- 13 COMMUNITIES WERE WELL LIKED ACROSS A WIDE RANGE. THE
- 14 SUGGESTIONS ARE LISTED ON THE PAGE AND THE COMMUNITIES
- 15 SUGGESTED WHAT THEY WANT TO SEE IN THE NAME, ACTION ORIENTED
- 16 PRIORITY, SHORT AND EASILY UNDERSTOOD. RECEIVING STRONG
- 17 SUPPORT AT THE REGIONAL EQUITY WORKING GROUP AS WELL AS EQUITY
- 18 AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE THE WORD PRIORITY SENDS OUT A CLEAR
- 19 MESSAGE THAT REGARDLESS OF THE REASON THESE COMMITTEES ARE
- 20 LEFT BEHIND IN THE PLANNING PROCESS WE ARE ACKNOWLEDGING THAT
- 21 THEY ARE PRIORITY IN OUR PLANNING PROGRAMMING AND PUBLIC
- 22 ENGAGEMENT. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. BEYOND THE NOMENCLATURE WE WANT
- 23 TO RECOGNIZE THAT DEFINING AND MEASURE BEING IS A CONTINUOUS
- 24 ONGOING EFFORT AS WE ENVISION AT THE EQUITY PLATFORM IN THE
- 25 NEAR-TERM THAT IS WITHIN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE ARE





- 1 PROPOSING TO REVISE THE NOMENCLATURE AND ARE ALSO AUGMENTS THE
- 2 FRAMEWORK BY LOOKING AT DISPARITIES FOR POPULATION SUBGROUPS
- 3 AS WELL RATHER THAN JUST GEOGRAPHIC COMMUNITIES. IN THE LONGER
- 4 TERM, WE WANT TO REEXAMINE THIS FRAMEWORK THAT HAS BEEN IN USE
- 5 FOR ALMOST TWO DECADES NOW. THIS REEXAMINATION WAS NOT
- 6 POSSIBLE WITHIN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TIMELINE, BUT WE
- 7 KNOW THERE ARE KNOWN ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED SEVERAL
- 8 TIMES IN THE PAST AND WE ALSO HAVE SOME INITIAL THOUGHTS BASED
- 9 ON SOME FEEDBACK WE HEARD. PERHAPS WE MIGHT THINK ABOUT
- 10 REVISING THE OVERALL FRAMEWORK TO BE MORE ISSUE SPECIFIC FOR
- 11 EXAMPLE, CALLING OUT RENT BURDENED COMMUNITIES OR FOOD DESERTS
- 12 GIVEN HOW DIVERSE THE STRUGGLES IN THE COMMUNITIES ARE.
- 13 HOWEVER THERE ARE KNOWN GAPS IN THE METHODOLOGY WE NOTICED
- 14 RELATED TO DEFINITIONS OF LOW INCOME OAR HOW CONCENTRATION, OF
- 15 UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS MIGHT DECREASE DUE TO DISPLACEMENT OF
- 16 POPULATIONS AND [INDISCERNIBLE] CAPTURED OF THE POPULATIONS
- 17 CONCENTRATION IS LOWER AND AT A MORE MACRO LEVEL RECOGNIZING
- 18 THIS IS A PLACE-BASED FRAMEWORK RECOGNIZING DIMENSION OF
- 19 EOUITY AND SENIOR OR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND DISPERSION
- 20 THROUGHOUT THE REGION SIGNIFICANT POPULATION AND COLOR. WE
- 21 WANT TO INCLUDE THIS IN THE EQUITY PLATFORM. TODAY WE ARE
- 22 SEEKING YOUR APPROVAL TO RENAME COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AS
- 23 EOUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES FOR USED ACROSS OUR WORK PRODUCTS
- 24 AND PROJECTS. WE ARE SEEKING APPROVAL FROM THE JOINT PLANNING
- 25 AND ADMIN COMMITTEE ON FRIDAY. THIS SMALL BUT MEANINGFUL





- 1 CHANGE CAN COMMUNICATE TO THE COMMUNITY AND REGION AT-LARGE
- 2 THAT MTC AND BAG WILL INTEND TO PRIORITIZE THESE HISTORICALLY
- 3 UNDERSERVED AND STILL UNDERREPRESENTED COMMUNITIES TO ADVANCE
- 4 EOUITABLE OUTCOMES. WE ACKNOLWEGE THERE IS MUCH WORK TO BE
- 5 DONE IN THE YEARS AHEAD BEYOND JUST CHANGING TH NOMENCLATURE
- 6 AND THERE MUST BE CONCERTED EFFORT ACROSS OUR AGENCIES TO
- 7 TRULY ACHIEVING EQUITABLE OUTCOMES. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT
- 8 BACK TO YOU RANDI. THANK YOU.

- 10 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. PLEASE RAISE YOUR HANDS IF YOU
- 11 HAVE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. RICH HEDGES IS UP FIRST.

12

- 13 RICHARD HEDGES: YES. I'M UNMUTED. WE HAD A DOCUMENT UNDER THE
- 14 EQUITY AND ACCESS REPORT WHERE WE HAD APPROVED THIS LANGUAGE
- 15 AND I MAKE A MOTION THAT WE MOVE THIS TO THE COMMITTEE ON
- 16 FRIDAY, AND ON TO ANY OTHER COMMITTEES ARE WHERE IT'S
- 17 CONSIDERED.

18

19 VEDA FLOREZ: AND I WILL SECOND THAT MOTION. FLOREZ.

20

- 21 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. FIRST AND SECOND. RICH, DID
- 22 YOU WANT TO SPEAK ON THE MOTION?

- 24 RICHARD HEDGES: WE DISCUSSED IT THOROUGHLY AT THE MEETING THE
- 25 ONLY CAVEAT IS WE PUT IN A SENTENCE NOT IN THE TERM BUT IN



SETTING IT FORWARD THAT WE -- THE CHANGE IN LANGUAGE DOESN'T 1 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE SOLVED THE PROBLEM. I COULD READ THE 2 3 EXACT LANGUAGE TO YOU IF YOU WANT. 4 5 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: NO. WE HAVE IT ON FILE. THANK YOU. 6 CHRISTINA, GO AHEAD. AND THEN ADRIENNE. 7 8 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I WANT TO SAY I DON'T THINK IT'S SHORTER AND EASIER BUT I APPRECIATE THE 9 REFLECTION THAT WENT INTO THIS PROCESS AND I THINK IT CAME OUT 10 WITH A GREAT OUTCOME. I REALLY LIKE THE NEW NOMENCLATURE. 11 THANKS. 12 13 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ADRIENNE AND THEN VEDA. 14 15 16 ADRIAN MENDOZA: THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. I WANT TO REITERATE AND REVISIT THE SUGGESTION THAT I HAVE GIVEN AT A 17 PREVIOUS MEETING, AND THAT WAS FOR THE JUSTICE ACTION ZONE OR 18 JAZ, JAZ FOR SHORT, WHICH I THINK JUSTICE IS, I BELIEVE --19 WHAT I BELIEVE IS WHAT WE'RE ALL SEEKING. AND ACTION IS 20 POSITIVE. AND ZONE IS, YOU KNOW, A -- WHETHER IT BE A 21 METAPHORICAL OR AN ACTUAL ZONE. I THINK COVERS A LOT OF SO I 22

JUST WANTED TO THROW THAT OUT THERE IT'S SOMETHING THAT HAD

BEEN BROUGHT UP BEFORE AS AN ALTERNATIVE. I KNOW THERE IS A

23





- 1 DIFFERENT QUESTION AT HAND BUT I WANTED TO TOSS THAT OUT THIS
- 2 ONE MORE TIME. THANK YOU.

4 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. VEDA THEN CARLOS.

5

- 6 VEDA FLOREZ: THANK YOU ANUP IT'S GREAT TO SEE ALL THE WORK
- 7 DONE I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IT MOVE FORWARD. A QUICK QUESTION.
- 8 WAS THERE IDENTIFIABLE NOMENCLATURE USED PRIOR TO COMMUNITIES
- 9 OF CONCERN LIKE BACK IN THE '90S?

10

- 11 ANUP TAPASE: NOT THAT I KNOW OF IT'S JUST BEEN REFERRED TO AS
- 12 LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES OR COMMUNITIES OF COLOR.

13

- 14 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: AND JUST HAVING BEEN AROUND FOR THAT
- 15 TRANSITION, WE DID ONLY CLARIFY IT IN SPECIFIC WAYS AND I
- 16 THINK THAT THE REALIGNMENT OF THE COUNCIL AND COMMITTEES I
- 17 THINK ALLOWED US, WE AT MULTIPLE BODIES INSISTED ON WAS BEING
- 18 ABLE TO ADDRESS SENIORS WHO AREN'T BROKEN OUT OF
- 19 CLASSIFICATION BUSINESS DISTRICTS AND THINGS LIKE THAT SO I
- 20 THINK THAT'S HOW WE CAME UP WITH THAT SOMEBODY CAME WITH IT
- 21 BEFORE. CARLOS AND WENDI.

- 23 CARLOS CASTELLANOS: THANK YOU ANUP, AND ALSO THE SUBCOMMITTEE
- 24 FOR ALL YOUR THOUGHT INTO THIS. I SUPPORT THE RENAMING OF
- 25 THIS. IT'S A GOOD FORWARD-THINKING NEW NAME FOR THE AREAS THAT





- 1 WE REALLY ARE TRYING TO FOCUS ON. AND I WOULD JUST ADD MAYBE
- 2 THIS ISN'T THE PLACE BUT I HEARD ANUP, I HEARD YOU SAY THAT
- 3 YOU'RE ALL, POSSIBLY IN THE FUTURE, THINKING OF MAKING THE
- 4 AREAS MORE ISSUE SPECIFIC. I WOULD JUST PUT MY TWO CENTS IN TO
- 5 KEEP IT MORE HOLISTIC IN THE SENSE THAT I THINK EVEN THIS LAST
- 6 YEAR WE HAVE SEEN HOW THE INEQUITIES AFFECT OUR NEIGHBORHOODS
- 7 AND COMMUNITIES SUCH AS THE PANDEMIC THEY'RE A WIDE RANGE OF
- 8 ISSUES THAT COME TOGETHER SO IN SEPARATING THEM OUT, YOU KIND
- 9 OF DILUTE IT INSTEAD OF HAVING IT IN ITS TOTALITY SO WHETHER
- 10 IT'S HOUSING OR FOOD DESERTS OR WHATEVER IT MAY BE. I THINK
- 11 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE LOOK AT THESE COMMUNITIES IN THEIR
- 12 TOTALITY. AND I THINK THAT THIS YEAR, THIS LAST YEAR HAS
- 13 REALLY EXPOSED THAT. I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD TO -- AND THE
- 14 OTHER THING I WAS GOING TO MENTION, AGAIN, THIS IS NOT PART OF
- 15 THE MOTION, BUT IT WOULD BE INTERESTING TO SEE HOW THIS GETS
- 16 ADOPTED. I HEARD YOU MENTION THAT OTHER COUNTIES AND OTHER
- 17 JURISDICTIONS WOULD ADOPT THIS, AND I KNOW IN THE LAST COUPLE
- 18 OF YEARS, AT LEAST IN THE HOUSING WORLD, THERE HAS BEEN A LOT
- 19 OF TALK ABOUT HOW TO LOOK AT THE NEIGHBORHOODS THAT SHOULD
- 20 RECEIVE FOCUS IN TERMS OF FOCUS ON FINANCE OPPORTUNITIES AND I
- 21 USED TO LOBBY, LOOK AT THE MTC MAPS AND THERE ARE ALWAYS OTHER
- 22 MAPS OUT THERE, SO I WOULD REALLY URGE THE STAFF TO -- AND ALL
- 23 OF US TO SEE HOW WE CAN MERGE THAT IN SO WE CAN REALLY BE
- 24 COORDINATED ON A STATEWIDE LEVEL OF WHAT KIND OF FUNDS COME
- 25 INTO OUR AREA HERE. THANK YOU.





1 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WENDY AND THEN RICK COATES. 2 3 WENDI KALLINS: I WANT TO ADD MY VOICE. IN MANY OF MY FUNCTIONS 4 5 IN MY DAY JOBS, I AM CONSTANTLY COMING UP AGAINST THIS AND REALLY HATING ALL OF THE DIFFERENT WAYS OF DESIGNATING THESE 6 COMMUNITIES AND I AM JUST REALLY GRATEFUL THAT YOU HAVE COME 7 8 UP WITH SOMETHING THEY CAN FEEL GOOD ABOUT WHEN I'M REFERRING TO THOSE COMMUNITIES. SO THANK YOU. 9 10 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RICK COATES AND THEN TERRY 11 SCOTT? 12 13 RICK COATES: YEAH. I THINK IT'S A DEFINITE IMPROVEMENT IN THE 14 15 LANGUAGE BUT I STILL WANT TO COMMENT THAT IT DOESN'T SOLVE THE 16 PROBLEM. AND, I THINK THE PROBLEM IS TYING IT TO GEOGRAPHIC AREAS. I THINK ALL OF THE SO-CALLED COMMUNITIES AREN'T TIED TO 17

21

18

19

20

22 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: SO IF I COULD ASK FOR A CLARIFICATION, IS

A SPECIFIC GEOGRAPHIC AREA. AND I AM A LITTLE UPSET THAT WE

HAVE TO WAIT IN THE NEXT TIME AROUND BEFORE THIS IS TRULY

23 THE -- IS -- IS IT YOUR FEELING THIS -- THIS IS BEING

ADDRESSED. WHICH COULD BE YEARS.

- 24 DESIGNATED AS SPECIFIC GEOGRAPHIC COMMUNITIES BECAUSE WE HAVE
- 25 USED OUR MAPS AND HAVE USED OUR DATA TO NOT JUST TARGET A



- 1 SPECIFIC COMMUNITY BUT TO SAY, FOR INSTANCE, ACROSS THE BOARD,
- 2 LOW INCOME RIDERS NEED TRANSIT SERVICE ON OFF PEAK HOURS AND
- 3 TO TRACK THAT. AND I DO NOT SEE THAT CHANGING UNLESS ANUP IS
- 4 GOING TO TELL ME THAT THAT'S CHANGING.

5

- 6 ANUP TAPASE: IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE HAVE TAKEN THE
- 7 APPROACH OF NOT CONFINING OURSELVES TO GEOGRAPHIC COMMUNITIES
- 8 BUT TALKING ABOUT POLICIES SERVING PEOPLE OF COLOR OR PEOPLE
- 9 OF LOW INCOME AT-LARGE WHERE THEY MIGHT BE. THAT'S PART OF ONE
- 10 THING WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE DO NOT WANT TO RELY ON
- 11 PLACE-BASED FRAMEWORK NOT TO SAY PLACE-BASED FRAMEWORK IS NOT
- 12 IMPORTANT OF COURSE IT'S IMPORTANT WHEN WE TALK ABOUT PHYSICAL
- 13 INVESTMENTS FOR EXAMPLE, BUT WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE BOTH TYPES
- 14 OF FRAMEWORK IN THE FUTURE.

15

16 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. AS WE HAVE BEEN DOING.

17

18 ANUP TAPASE: YEAH.

19

- 20 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO CLEAR
- 21 THAT BEFORE WE WENT ANY FURTHER. DOES THAT ANSWER YOUR
- 22 QUESTION, RICK?

23

24 RICK COATES: SORT OF.





- 1 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. I'LL SETTLE FOR SORT OF. TERRY AND
- 2 THEN RAHMON?

- 4 TERRY SCOTT: THANK YOU CHAIR KINMAN. FIRST I WANT TO AGREE
- 5 WITH THE COMMENTS THAT CARLOS MADE. TRYING TO GET TOO SPECIFIC
- 6 BECOMES VERY, VERY, VERY DIFFICULT, AND IT -- I THINK IT'S
- 7 BEEN WELL ADDRESSED BY WHAT ANUP AND THE STAFF HAS COME UP
- 8 WITH, SO I'M QUITE HAPPY WITH THAT TERMINOLOGY. I THINK IT
- 9 WORKS AND ENCOMPASSES ALL OF THE VARIOUS LITTLE THINGS THAT WE
- 10 COULD ADDRESS. BUT I THINK, YOU KNOW, TIME AND ACTION IS OF AN
- 11 ESSENCE, AND I THINK THIS ALLOWS US TO MOVE FORWARD, AND I
- 12 RECOMMEND THAT WE DO SO.

13

14 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RAHMON AND THEN BEN?

15

- 16 RAHMON MOMOH: I JUST WANT TO JOIN EVERYONE IN COMMENDING THE
- 17 STAFF FOR THEIR GREAT WORK IN GETTING TO A NICE NAME, EQUITY
- 18 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. MY OUESTION S IS THERE A PLAN LIKE TEN
- 19 YEARS IN THE FUTURE TO REVIEW THIS AGAIN IN CASE THINGS
- 20 CHANGE, DESIGNATE TO EVALUATE THE APPROPRIATENESS OF THE NAME
- 21 IN THE NEAR FUTURE, MAYBE IN THE FEW OF, EVERY FIVE YEARS,
- 22 EVERY TEN YEARS. SOMETHING LIKE THAT.

- 24 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: ANUP, DO YOU WANT MAKE A NOTE OF THAT?
- 25 OR?





1 ANUP TAPASE: YES. NOTED. 2 3 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. 4 5 ANUP TAPASE: I AM SURE WE CAN COME BACK TO IT IF IT COMES UP 6 7 AGAIN OR YOU ALL PROPOSE IT. 8 9 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. BEN AND THEN ANNE OLIVIA. 10 BENJAMIN SCHWENG: MY COMMENT IS THAT I THINK FOR THOSE IN 11 THOSE COMMUNITIES, PARTICULARLY THE NON-NATIVE ENGLISH 12 SPEAKERS WHO, YOU KNOW, MIGHT INTERACT WITH AN ABAG OR AN MTC 13 KIND OF THING, TWICE, YOU KNOW, EVERY TWO YEARS, WHEN 14 SOMETHING, YOU KNOW, IS IMPORTANT TO THEM, I THINK NAME 15 16 CHANGES CAN BE INCREDIBLY CONFUSING. YOU KNOW, THAT A NAME CHANGE MAY NOT SEEM LIKE A REBRANDING AND LIKE AN OH, IS THIS 17 SOMETHING DIFFERENT. AND I THINK GOING FORWARD MAYBE IN THE 18

19 NEXT TWO YEARS YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE ALMOST LIKE AN ASTERISK

20 THAT THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY IS THE SAME THING AND BE

21 DEFINING THAT FOR PEOPLE IN THE COMMUNITY, PARTICULARLY FOR

22 PEOPLE WHO ARE LESS EDUCATED OR ARE NON-NATIVE ENGLISH

23 SPEAKERS WHAT THAT REALLY MEANS OR THAT THE SAME THING

24 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN SO THEY KNOW HOW TO INTERACT WITH THAT.





1 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA AND THEN MICHAEL?

2

- 3 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: MY COMMENT HAS BEEN SAID. I'LL LOWER MY
- 4 HAND.

5

- 6 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. MICHAEL AND THEN RICH
- 7 HEDGES AGAIN.

8

- 9 MICHAEL LOPEZ: I WANT TO ECHO WHAT EVERYONE SAID THIS IS
- 10 UPLIFTING NOMENCLATURE BUT I AGREE WITH WHAT BEN SAID PEOPLE
- 11 MAY BE CONFUSED BY RECOGNIZING IT INITIALLY BUT OTHERWISE I
- 12 THINK IT'S A GREAT PRESENTATION AND A GOOD CHANGE.

13

14 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: RICH HEDGES?

15

- 16 RICHARD HEDGES: IS MTC PLANNING ON MOVING THIS OUT TO OTHER
- 17 AGENCIES, SO THERE IS NOT A CONFLUENCE OF DIFFERENT TERMS USED
- 18 FOR THE SAME THING. COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN TOOK HOLD AND IT'S
- 19 NOT GOING TO GO EASILY UNLESS WE MAKE IT VERY PUBLIC.

20

- 21 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: ANUP DO YOU WANT SPEAK TO THE MARKETING
- 22 PLAN FOR THIS?

- 24 ANUP TAPASE: WE ARE ON DECK TO SHARING OUT WITH
- 25 [INDISCERNIBLE] AND TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT WE ARE OFFICIALLY





- 1 LOOKING TO CHANGE THIS NAME AND WE'RE CONVEYING IT TO THEM AT
- 2 DIFFERENT MEETINGS INCLUDING DIRECTORS MEETING AND WE'LL DO
- 3 WHAT WE CAN TO GET THAT OUT THERE.

- 5 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I WOULD POINT OUT BECAUSE THIS INCLUDES
- 6 ABAG, THAT YOU'RE GOING HAVE TO REACH OUT TO ALL THE CITIES
- 7 BECAUSE THEY HAVE PLANNED APPLYING FOR GRANTS AND THEY
- 8 ACTUALLY HAVE GRANTS IN HAND BASED ON THE OLD NOMENCLATURE.
- 9 SO, IT'S GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT TO DO A BIG REBRAND ON
- 10 THIS. CYNTHIA, GO AHEAD.

11

- 12 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: I JUST WAS GOING TO OFFER THE
- 13 SUGGESTION THAT PERHAPS IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE A GLOSSARY OF
- 14 TERMS ON THE WEB SITE AND MAYBE IN DOCUMENTS WHERE WE'RE GOING
- 15 REFER TO THIS WHERE WE SHOW THE DEFINITION AND WHAT THE CHANGE
- 16 WAS, WHY WE CHOSE TO DO THAT CHANGE, SO THAT PEOPLE AREN'T AS
- 17 CONFUSED.

18

- 19 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY MORE COMMENTS FROM
- 20 COUNCIL. I DON'T SEE ANY MORE HANDS RAISED. PUBLIC COMMENTS
- 21 MARTHA?

- 23 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 25 ON THIS ITEM.





1

- 2 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I WANT TO SUM THIS UP BEFORE WE GO TO A
- 3 VOTE. CARLOS IS RIGHT IN THAT THE COMBINATION OF MAPS HAS
- 4 ALWAYS BEEN ESSENTIAL FOR PLACE-MARKING THINGS. THE AIR
- 5 QUALITY DISTRICT DOES THEIR MAPS OF AREAS THAT ARE HEAVILY
- 6 IMPACTED WHICH HAPPENED TO OVERLAP WITH SOME OF OUR MAPS WHICH
- 7 OVERLAPPED WITH OTHER PEOPLE'S MAPS SO FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE
- 8 TRYING TO PROCESS GRANTS OR WHO ARE TRYING TO DEVELOP PRIORITY
- 9 DEVELOPMENT AREAS, MAPS ARE REALLY IMPORTANT THINGS. HOWEVER
- 10 POLICY ADDRESS FACTS LEARNED THAT THE LAST ROUND OF PLANNED
- 11 BAY AREA, HALF OF OUR LOW INCOME POPULATION DOESN'T LIVE IN A
- 12 CONCENTRATED AREA. AND I APPRECIATE THAT WE'RE HOLDING ON TO
- 13 BOTH METHODS, AND I WOULD FIGHT TOOTH AND NAIL IF WE GO TO ONE
- 14 OR TH OTHER BECAUSE IT'S JUST NOT BENEFICIAL FOR US AS A
- 15 WHOLE. AND THAT MEANS THAT IT'S NOT JUST DISTRICTED. IT'S NOT
- 16 JUST AREAS BUT I ALSO WANT TO SAY I APPLAUD THE FACT YOU HAVE
- 17 ONE PICTURE FOR A RURAL COMMUNITY I SUGGEST THAT YOU DEVELOP A
- 18 COUPLE MORE. WE HAVE THIS TENSION BETWEEN THE URBAN AND RURAL
- 19 COMMUNITIES AND WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THIS AND THE RURAL
- 20 COMMUNITIES ARE THE OFTEN MOST VOCAL ABOUT FEELING LEFT OUT SO
- 21 WHEN THEY SEE THEMSELVES VISUALLY IN OUR PRESENTATIONS IT
- 22 REALLY DOES HELP. IT REALLY DOES LET THEM KNOW THAT WE'RE NOT
- 23 JUST TALKING ABOUT -- AND IT ALSO HELPS PEOPLE PLAN. IT HELPS
- 24 THEM DEVELOP POLICIES. SO THAT IS MY INPUT. AND SINCE THERE IS
- 25 NO PUBLIC COMMENT -- ANUP DID YOU HAVE SOMETHING TO WRAP UP.



1 ANUP TAPASE: I APPRECIATE THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE 2 3 BEING INVOLVED THANK YOU. 4 5 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I AM PLEASED TO SEE THIS HAPPEN. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE. 6 7 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY 9 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 10 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: STAFF WILL BE PREPARING A MEMO I WILL BE 11 ATTACHING TO THE COMMITTEE REPORTS GOING FORWARD ON FRIDAY. 12 WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO ITEM TEN, THE STAFF LIAISON'S REPORT. 13 14 MARTI PASCHAL: MARTI PASCHAL STAFF TO THE COUNCIL. I DON'T 15 16 HAVE ANY ADDITIONS OR CHANGES TO MY REPORT SO I WILL PASS. 17 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. I'M JUST GOING TO SAY 18 19 THAT IF YOU EVER WANT GOOD CHOCOLATE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PERSONS OUT OF STATE, MARTI IS A GOOD PERSON TO ASK. MY 20 MOTHER'S DAY PRESENT WAS WONDERFUL BECAUSE OF SOMETHING SHE 21 RECOMMENDED. I LOVED T ITEM 11 COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS. MEMBERS 22 23 OF THE COUNCIL MAY REPORT ON LOCAL RELEVANT ISSUES OR EVENTS. 24 I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS GOING UP. ANNE OLIVIA?





- 1 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: I WOULD JUST LIKE TO INVITE FOLKS HAVE THE
- 2 21ST OF THIS MONTH, WE ARE HAVING A VIRTUAL RIBBON CUTTING FOR
- 3 A NEW COMMUNITY DEVELOPED TO SERVE CHRONICALLY UNHOUSED
- 4 NEIGHBORS. IT'S IN LIVERMORE. I CAN SEND THE LINK OUT FOR
- 5 PEOPLE WHO WOULD LIKE TO JOIN VIRTUALLY, IT'S THE 21ST FROM 10
- 6 TO 12, AND I HAVE BEEN DEEPLY INVOLVED WITH THIS PROJECT AND
- 7 REALLY EXCITED ABOUT IT. SO I HOPE YOU CAN JOIN.

9 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. YAY. GOOD NEWS. RICH HEDGES?

11 RICHARD HEDGES: WHERE IS. I JUST WANTED SAY I WOULD APPRECIATE

12 A LINK TO THAT.

10

13

14 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL HAVE STAFF PUSH THAT

- 15 OUT. ARE THERE ANY MORE COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL? WITH
- 16 THAT, WE WILL MOVE INTO NEW BUSINESS. NEW BUSINESS FOR
- 17 DISCUSSION ON A FUTURE AGENDA ITEM? AND PLEASE KEEP IN MIND,
- 18 WE ARE MEETING THROUGH THE SUMMER. SEEING NONE. WITH THAT
- 19 WE'LL GO TO ADJOURNMENT THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY
- 20 ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD WEDNESDAY JUNE 9TH, 2021 AT 1:35
- 21 P.M. AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER. NOT. IT WILL PROBABLY BE
- 22 HELD VIRTUALLY, AS I'M NOT GOING UP THERE. SO, WITH THAT, WE
- 23 ARE ADJOURNED. AND THANK YOU EVERYBODY. AND THANK YOU STAFF
- 24 FOR SPEEDING THROUGH THE PRESENTATIONS. I APPRECIATE YOU, LOOK



- 1 AT THAT, WAY ON TIME. THAT WAS A RECORD SETTING MEETING. THANK
- 2 YOU. HAVE A GOOD WEEK. BYE. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government