

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



September 10, 2021

1                                   **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**  
2   **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**  
3                                   **FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE**  
4   **FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 10, 2021, 2:00 P.M.**

5  
6   **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO, GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. AT THIS TIME,  
7   STAFF WILL CALL THE ROLL.

8  
9   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR LEVIN.

10  
11   **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** HERE.

12  
13   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR KALLINS.

14  
15   **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

16  
17   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER ALLEN. MEMBER ALLEN? NEW MEMBER,  
18   ZACK DEUTSCH. CAN YOU SAY IT AGAIN?

19  
20   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER ELDRED? MEMBER ELDRED IS EXCUSED.

21  
22   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER GOTUACO.

23  
24   **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** HERE.  
25



September 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER GRIFFITHS: IAN GRIFFITHS.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER

4

5 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER HEDGES.

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER KASS.

12

13 **JONATHON KASS:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER LITVAK. MEMBER LITVAK. MEMBER

16 MALLON

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER MENDOZA:

19

20 **ADRIAN MENDOZA:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND MEMBER STANKE.

23

24 **BRIAN STANKE:** HERE.

25



September 10, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM

2

3 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO, THAT IS EXCITING. SO, WITH THE QUORUM,  
4 WE WOULD LIKE TO START OFF WITH AGENDA ITEM THREE, APPROVING  
5 THE MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 2ND.

6

7 **RICHARD HEDGES:** MOVE APPROVAL OF THE AUGUST 2ND MINUTES. DID  
8 YOU CATCH THAT? MOVE APPROVAL?

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** IS THERE A SECOND FOR THE MOTION TO  
11 APPROVE THE MINUTES?

12

13 **JONATHON KASS:** SECOND

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO, CAN THE CLERK HELP US WITH THE VOTE?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON  
18 THIS ITEM, AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
19 HANDS RAISED.. THE MOTION WAS BY HEDGES AND SECOND BY KASS.  
20 [ROLL CALL VOTE].

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PASSED UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. SO, WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO THE  
25 MOMENT THAT WE HAVE ALL BEEN WAITING FOR, WHICH IS WHERE STAFF



September 10, 2021

1 WILL PRESENT THE RESULTS OF THE FARE COORDINATION AND  
2 INTEGRATION STUDY INCLUDING THE DETAILED RECOMMENDATIONS FROM  
3 THE STUDY. AND -- DO WE ASK FOR THE PUBLIC COMMENTS NOW OR ASK  
4 FOR THAT AFTER THE STAFF DOES THE PRESENTATION OF THE STAFF  
5 REPORT?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AFTER

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. GREAT. WE ARE GOING TO NOW HERE  
10 THE RESULTS OF THE STUDY. LOOKING FORWARD TO HEARING THAT FROM  
11 STAFF.

12

13 **WILLIAM BACON:** GOOD AFTERNOON, EVERYBODY. BILL BACON FROM THE  
14 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM. IT IS GREAT TO SEE YOU ALL TODAY AND  
15 I HOPE YOU HAD A NICE HOLIDAY WEEKEND LAST WEEKEND. IF WE  
16 COULD GO AHEAD AND BRING THE SLIDES UP. OKAY. WELL AS WAS  
17 ALLUDED A FEW MINUTES AGO, IT IS A VERY LONG PRESENTATION. WE  
18 HAVE A LOT OF CONTENT WE WANT TO TALK ABOUT. WE WANT TO GET  
19 STARTED SO WE COULD GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS THE CHAIR  
20 WAS JUST ALLUDING TO WE ARE GOING TO BEGIN SHARING DRAFT  
21 RECOMMENDATIONS WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE FOR YOUR FEEDBACK AND  
22 ANALYSIS. SO, THIS SLIDE HERE WE ARE JUST TRYING TO PROVIDE A  
23 QUICK OVERVIEW OF WHERE THE PRESENTATION WILL TAKE US TODAY.  
24 WE WANT TO PROVIDE SOME BACKGROUND AGAIN TO REMIND FOLKS ABOUT  
25 SOME OF THE ANALYSIS WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE TO GET TO WHERE WE



September 10, 2021

1 ARE NOW, GUIDE YOU THROUGH THE BUSINESS CASE APPROACH, WHICH  
2 IS REALLY CORE TO THIS STUDY AND THE ANALYSIS THAT WE HAVE  
3 BEEN DOING. REALLY DIG INTO OUR EMERGING FINDINGS AND TALK IN  
4 QUITE A BIT OF DETAIL ABOUT THE ANALYSIS THAT HAS LED TO THOSE  
5 FINDINGS. AGAIN, SUMMARIZE HOW THE BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS  
6 PROCESS LED US TO OUR RECOMMENDATIONS. AND TALK AGAIN A LITTLE  
7 BIT ABOUT WHAT OUR RECOMMENDED NEAR TERM ACTIONS ARE AND HOW  
8 THAT FITS INTO SORT OF THE BROADER PICTURE OF RECOMMENDATIONS  
9 FROM THE PROJECT. WE CAN GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AND  
10 THEN ACTUALLY PROCEED ONE MORE AS WELL. MOST OF YOU HERE WILL  
11 BE FAMILIAR ON THE SUBCOMMITTEE WITH THE CONSENT ON THIS  
12 SLIDE. IF YOU GO WAY BACK TO LAST YEAR WHEN THE PROJECT WAS  
13 GETTING GOING, WE DEFINED A PROBLEM STATEMENT AND THERE WERE  
14 FOUR KEY ISSUES, CUSTOMER VALUE, THE PAYMENT EXPERIENCE,  
15 EQUITY AND FUTURE TRANSIT. REALLY MEANING FUTURE INVESTMENTS  
16 IN OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WERE CORE TO THE PROBLEM OF HOW DO  
17 FARES WORK IN THE BAY AREA AND HOW CAN THIS STUDY TO MAKE FARE  
18 POLICY A PART OF A MORE INTEGRATED SYSTEM OF TRANSIT IN OUR  
19 REGION. THE NEXT SLIDE ROW HERE ON THIS SLIDE AFTER QUITE A  
20 BIT OF WORK, ABOUT 8-10 MONTHS AGO, THE PROJECT TEAM BEGAN TO  
21 SHORTEN THE LIST ACTION FOR OUR BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS. AND  
22 YOU CAN SEE THOSE LISTED THERE AS NUMBER ONE THROUGH SIX. AND  
23 THEN I THINK AT OUR LAST MEETING WE TALKED QUITE A BIT ABOUT  
24 THE FOUR DIFFERENT TIERS OF INTEGRATION. I THINK THIS IS  
25 PROBABLY THE SIMPLEST WAY TO REAL THINK ABOUT TODAY'S MEETING,



September 10, 2021

1 ARE THESE FOUR TIERS. FIRST BEING OVERLAYS ON TOP OF OUR  
2 EXISTING FARE POLICY STRUCTURE, SPECIFICALLY PAST PRODUCTS AND  
3 CAPS, EITHER PRICE BASED CAPS OR NUMBER OF TRIPS BASED CAPS.  
4 THE NEXT BEING DISCOUNTS WHEN CUSTOMERS TRANSFER BETWEEN  
5 AGENCIES. FREE TRANSFERS FROM LOCAL SERVICES OR DISCOUNTED  
6 TRANSFERS BETWEEN REGIONAL SERVICES AND LOCAL SERVICES. THE  
7 NEXT LEVEL BEING REGIONAL CHANGE WHERE ALL THE REGIONAL  
8 TRANSIT SERVICES WOULD BE BROUGHT INTO A COMMON FARE STRUCTURE  
9 AND THEN THE FINAL TIER BEING REGIONAL AND LOCAL CHANGE THAT  
10 WOULD BRING ALL TRANSIT SERVICES IN THE BAY AREA INTO A COMMON  
11 FARE STRUCTURE. SO, THESE FOUR TIERS ARE REALLY FUNDAMENTAL TO  
12 UNDERSTANDING THE ANALYSIS THAT WE WILL BE PRESENTING THIS  
13 AFTERNOON. WE CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHERE ARE WE  
14 NOW? SO, TODAY WE ARE GOING TO BE PRESENTING RECOMMENDATIONS.  
15 AND THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS, AS I MENTIONED A MINUTE AGO, WILL  
16 BE PRESENTED THROUGH THE FRAMEWORK OF OUR BUSINESS CASE  
17 PROCESS WHICH HAS A STRATEGIC LENS, COST BENEFIT OR ECONOMIC  
18 LENS, THE DELIVERABILITY LENS AND A CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE LENS.  
19 WE ARE SEEKING YOUR FEEDBACK AS THE SUBCOMMITTEE TODAY ABOUT  
20 THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS AND HOW THEY ALIGN WITH OUR PROJECT  
21 GOALS THAT WE INITIALLY SET OUT WHEN THE PROJECT BEGAN. HOW  
22 THE RECOMMENDATIONS ALIGN WITH A VISION FOR LONG-TERM CHANGE  
23 OF REGIONAL FARE POLICY, HOW THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS ALIGN WITH  
24 THE NEEDS OF TRANSIT OPERATORS TO CONTINUE TO SUSTAIN SERVICE  
25 AND BE ABLE TO DELIVER A ROBUST AND EVER IMPROVING TRANSIT



September 10, 2021

1 LEVEL OF SERVICE. AND OUR CAPACITY TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER THE  
2 RECOMMENDATIONS. SO, THESE ARE ALL QUESTIONS THAT WE WANT THE  
3 SUBCOMMITTEE TO THINK ABOUT WHEN YOU'RE PROVIDING FEEDBACK ON  
4 THE RECOMMENDATIONS. AND FINALLY, WHAT WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO  
5 ANSWER ARE HOW CAN THOSE FOUR FARE INTEGRATION TIERS SET THE  
6 STAGE FOR THE LONG-TERM RECOMMENDATIONS OF FARE POLICY CHANGE  
7 IN THE REGION THAT COME OUT OF THIS PROJECT AND THE POSSIBLE  
8 IMMEDIATE ACTIONS THE PROJECT RECOMMENDS THAT THE REGION MOVE  
9 FORWARD WITH RIGHT NOW. AND THOSE COULD BE IN THE FORM OF  
10 DEMONSTRATIONS OR PILOTS THAT WOULD BE IMPLEMENTED IN THE VERY  
11 NEAR TERM. YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS GETS A  
12 LITTLE BIT TO THE PUNCH LINE RIGHT AT THE BEGINNING TO HELP  
13 FOLKS THINK ABOUT IT. THE RECOMMENDATIONS WE ARE GOING TO BE  
14 TALKING ABOUT TODAY ARE IN THE VERY NEAR TERM, AS IN THE NEXT  
15 FEW MONTHS. CONDUCT A PILOT OF WHAT WE ARE CALLING A BULK  
16 INSTITUTIONAL PASS PRODUCT. WE WILL TALK IN A LOT MORE DETAIL  
17 ABOUT WHAT THAT MEANS LATER ON. AND I THINK WE TALKED A BIT  
18 ABOUT IT AT PAST MEETINGS. BUT IT WOULD BE A PRODUCT THAT  
19 WOULD AVAILABLE INITIALLY TO EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS TO  
20 PROVIDE STUDENTS WITH ACCESS TO THE ENTIRE TRANSIT SYSTEM IN  
21 ITS FIRST PHASE AND EXPANDING THAT COULD INCLUDE EMPLOYERS AND  
22 AFFORDABLE HOUSING THAT WOULD FOLLOW SEVERAL MONTHS AFTER THE  
23 INITIAL LAUNCH. THE SECOND RECOMMENDATION WE WANT TO TALK  
24 ABOUT TODAY IS IN THE MEDIUM TERM ONCE THE CLIPPER SYSTEM IS  
25 AVAILABLE IN FALL OF 2023, DEPLOY REGION-WIDE FREE TRANSFER.





September 10, 2021

1 IF YOU TRANSFER BETWEEN BUSES IT WOULD BE ONE SYSTEM. YOU  
2 WOULD NOT BE PAYING A SECOND FARE. AND THEN COUPLED WITH THAT,  
3 CREATE A ROBUST DISCOUNT FOR TRANSFERS BETWEEN REGIONAL  
4 SERVICES AND LOCAL SERVICES. I'M SORRY. YES. BETWEEN REGIONAL  
5 SERVICES AND LOCAL SERVICES. SO, IN EFFECT WHAT THAT COULD  
6 MEAN IS THAT IF YOU TRANSFER BETWEEN SAMTRANS AND CALTRAIN,  
7 THE LOCAL FARE IS THAT YOU PAID FOR SAMTRANS WOULD BE DEDUCTED  
8 OFF YOUR CALTRAIN FARE. IN THE LONGER TERM, CONTINUE TO  
9 EVALUATE THE REGION'S CAPACITY TO DELIVER THAT THIRD TIER OF  
10 INTEGRATION WHICH IS BRINGING ALL THE REGIONAL SERVICES INTO A  
11 COMMON FARE STRUCTURE AND SYSTEM. THESE REGIONAL SERVICES MEAN  
12 AGENCIES LIKE BART, CALTRAIN, REGIONAL EXPRESS BUS SERVICE,  
13 THE FERRIES, THOSE TYPES OF SERVICES. WE ARE GOING TO BE GOING  
14 INTO A LOT OF DETAIL ABOUT ALL THESE RECOMMENDATIONS WITH YOU  
15 TODAY AND THE ANALYSIS FOR HOW WE CAME TO THESE  
16 RECOMMENDATIONS. THIS BACKGROUND SECTION I AM GOING TO GO  
17 THROUGH QUITE QUICKLY AND THEN I WILL TURN THE PRESENTATION  
18 OVER TO MIKE EISEMAN FROM BART WHO WILL WALK YOU THROUGH A LOT  
19 OF THE DETAIL.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** BILL, CAN I GET A QUICK CLARIFICATION  
22 BECAUSE I JUST GOT CONFUSED.

23

24 **WILLIAM BACON:** YES.

25



September 10, 2021

1 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** IF YOU COULD GO BACK TWO SLIDES. SO,  
2 IN NUMBER TWO, COULD YOU KIND OF RUN THROUGH THAT AGAIN  
3 BECAUSE I DIDN'T -- IT GOT CONFUSING BECAUSE YOU STUMBLED A  
4 BIT THERE.

5

6 **WILLIAM BACON:** MY APOLOGIES. WE ARE GOING TO GO INTO THIS IN A  
7 LOT OF DETAIL IN THE PRESENTATION.

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** OKAY.

10

11 **WILLIAM BACON:** BUT VERY QUICKLY FREE TRANSFERS FROM LOCAL TO  
12 LOCAL SERVICES. IF YOU ARE GOING FROM A SAMTRANS BUS TO A VTA  
13 BUS, YOU DON'T PAY A SECOND FARE. AS A USER YOU WOULD  
14 EXPERIENCE ONE SYSTEM. YOU WOULD PAY ONE FARE. THIS IS PERHAPS  
15 WHERE I STUMBLED. I'M SORRY IF I MISSPOKE. THE SECOND PART OF  
16 THIS SECOND RECOMMENDATION IS THAT THERE WOULD BE A COMMON  
17 DISCOUNT BETWEEN LOCAL AND REGIONAL SERVICES OR BETWEEN  
18 REGIONAL SERVICES.

19

20 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** OKAY.

21

22 **WILLIAM BACON:** THAT WAS THE EXAMPLE I SAID ABOUT SAMTRANS AND  
23 CALTRAIN. WE WILL TALK MORE IN DETAIL ABOUT THE PRESENTATION.  
24 I HOPE THAT CLARIFIES IT A LITTLE BIT. BUT IF WE COULD  
25 CONTINUE ALONG FOR NOW UNTIL WE GET INTO THE DETAIL PROBABLY



September 10, 2021

1 IN THE INTEREST OF TIME. SO, AGAIN, I THINK MOST OF THE  
2 SUBCOMMITTEE IS FAMILIAR WITH THE PROJECT PROBLEM STATEMENT --  
3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** HANG ON FOR A MOMENT. THERE IS AN EMAIL  
5 FROM MEMBER LITVAK WHO HAS NOT RECEIVED THE PANELIST LINK FOR  
6 THE MEETING. CAN SOMEONE ON THE STAFF TEAM GET --

7  
8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IT WAS RESENT TO HER EARLIER TODAY. IF SHE  
9 IS STILL HAVING ISSUES, SHE SHOULD CONTACT ME DIRECTLY

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WILL DO.

12

13 **WILLIAM BACON:** I THINK MOST OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS WILL  
14 REMEMBER THE PROJECT PROBLEM STATEMENT AND WHY WE ARE FOCUSING  
15 ON FARE INTEGRATION. I TOUCHED ON THE FOUR KEY ISSUES EARLIER  
16 IN THE PRESENTATION BUT THESE ARE THE KEY USE GUIDING THIS  
17 WORK. THINKING ABOUT CUSTOMER VALUE. HOW FARES CONNECT WITH  
18 THE VALUE THAT CUSTOMERS PLACE ON THEIR TRIP AND WHAT THAT  
19 TRIP MEANS TO THEM. THE PAYMENT EXPERIENCE. HOW THE FARES AND  
20 PRODUCTS THAT ARE CURRENTLY OFFERED ALIGN WITH THE  
21 TECHNOLOGIES AND OUR ABILITY TO DELIVER A PAYMENT EXPERIENCE  
22 THAT REALLY MEETS CUSTOMERS' NEEDS AND ALLOWS THEM TO BENEFIT  
23 FROM THE BREADTH OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM. THE FUTURE TRANSIT,  
24 REALLY MEANING HOW DO OUR FARES ALLOW US TO OPTIMIZE THE  
25 BENEFITS FROM OUR CAPITAL ONE INVESTMENTS IN THE SYSTEM. EVEN



September 10, 2021

1 MAJOR CAPITAL PROJECTS OR INCREASES IN FREQUENCY. HOW CAN WE  
2 REALLY LEVERAGE OUR FARE SYSTEM TO ALLOW THOSE CAPITAL  
3 INVESTMENTS TO PERFORM TO THEIR HIGHEST POTENTIAL. AND  
4 UNDERLYING EVERYTHING IS EQUITY. HOW CAN OUR CURRENT FARE  
5 POLICIES AND CHANGES THAT WE MAKE REALLY CONSISTENTLY MEET THE  
6 NEEDS OF THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES IN OUR REGION AND  
7 REALLY ALLOW USERS TO HAVE ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY AROUND THE  
8 BAY AREA. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AGAIN, THIS IS INFORMATION  
9 THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN THE PAST. BUT IF YOU LOOK BACK  
10 BEFORE THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC, SO, THIS IS UP TO FEBRUARY 2020,  
11 THERE WERE ABOUT 57,000 TRIPS EACH DAY THAT WERE MADE USING  
12 CLIPPER CARDS THAT TOUCHED MULTIPLE TRANSIT OPERATORS. AND  
13 WHAT WE'RE SHOWING IN THIS TABLE IS THE MIX OF WHERE THOSE  
14 TRIPS WERE TAKING PLACE BETWEEN AGENCIES. SO, YOU CAN SEE IF  
15 YOU FOCUS ON BART WHICH HAS THE LARGEST BAR THERE. YOU CAN SEE  
16 THE PAIRINGS OF WHERE BART CUSTOMERS WERE TRANSFERRING TO OR  
17 FROM. YOU CAN SEE AC TRANSIT IN RED. SORT OF ONE OF THE LARGER  
18 TRUNKS AND THE BART TRANSFERS TO MUNI. YOU COULD SEE THE  
19 LARGEST GROUPINGS ARE BETWEEN BART, MUNI, AC TRANSIT AND  
20 SMALLER EAST BAY OPERATORS. I THINK WHAT WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT  
21 AGAIN HERE IS JUST THERE'S A RELATIVELY SMALL GROUP OF  
22 OPERATORS THAT ARE REALLY CARING BY FAR THE LARGEST CHUNK OF  
23 THOSE INTERAGENCY TRANSFERS. HOW CAN ANY POLICY  
24 RECOMMENDATIONS WE MAKE REALLY BENEFIT THOSE TYPES OF USERS IS  
25 AN IMPORTANT LENS TO THINK ABOUT. WE CAN CAN GO FORWARD



September 10, 2021

1 ANOTHER SLIDE. SO, WHEN WE THINK ABOUT WAYS THAT CHANGES TO  
2 FARE POLICY THROUGH A LENS OF INTEGRATION CAN HELP IMPROVE THE  
3 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, WHAT ARE THE REAL WAYS THAT WE CAN  
4 ACTUALLY MAKE AN IMPACT THROUGH CHANGES TO POLICY? SO, THERE  
5 ARE THREE MAIN AREAS THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THROUGH THIS  
6 PROJECT. WE HAVE TALKED AGAIN ABOUT SOME OF THIS IN THE PAST.  
7 PRIORS BARRIERS, LEARNIBILITY AND LEGIBILITY OF THE SYSTEM AND  
8 EQUITY. I THINK IT IS CLEAR THROUGH OUR WORK THAT FARE  
9 INTEGRATION CAN MAKE A DIFFERENCE. SORT OF OUTSIDE THE SCOPE  
10 OF THIS PROJECT IS THE CORE QUESTION OF AFFORDABILITY IN TERMS  
11 OF HOW AFFORDABLE BAY AREA TRANSIT IS FOR ALL INCOME LEVELS.  
12 IT IS CONNECTED TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS ULTIMATELY AND IS  
13 CONNECTED TO OTHER ONGOING PROGRAMS SUCH AS CLIPPER START THAT  
14 ARE REALLY SOLELY FOCUSED ON TACKLING THAT. REDUCING PRICE AND  
15 MAKING SURE IT IS COMPETITIVE FOR ALL TYPES OF TRIPS. MAKING  
16 SURE IT IS EASY TO UNDERSTAND AND LEARN HOW TO NAVIGATE OUR  
17 FARE STRUCTURE AND OUR FARE SYSTEM AND ENSURING THAT OUR  
18 PRICING AND THE STRUCTURE OF FARES IS EQUITABLE FOR ALL USERS  
19 ARE REAL THE CORE FOCUSES OF WHAT WE ARE THINKING ABOUT HERE.  
20 WE CAN GO FORWARD ANOTHER SLIDE. AT THIS POINT, I'M GOING TO  
21 TURN IT OVER TO MIKE WHO IS GOING TO BEGIN TO WALK THROUGH  
22 SOME OF THE VERY CORE DATA ANALYSIS PORTIONS WE WANT TO SHARE  
23 WITH YOU TODAY AND I WILL BE BACK A LITTLE BIT LATER IN THE  
24 PRESENTATION.  
25



September 10, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THANKS, BILL. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYBODY. MIKE  
2 EISEMAN HERE FROM BART. WE WILL JUST DIVE IN HERE TO THE NEXT  
3 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, JUST TO RECAP HERE OUR ANALYSIS APPROACH.  
4 THIS IS HOW WE STRUCTURED IT IN A BUSINESS CASE FORMAT. FOUR  
5 MAIN EVALUATION CRITERIA. OUR STRATEGIC DIMENSION. THAT FIRST  
6 ONE IS IN BLUE. BASICALLY MEETS THE POLICY GOALS. TO WHAT  
7 DEGREE DOES EACH OPTION MEET THE POLICY GOALS IN OUR PROBLEM  
8 STATEMENT. ON THE TOP RIGHT, TRYING TO QUALIFY THE  
9 SOCIOECONOMIC BENEFITS AND COSTS OF EACH OPTION. ON THE BOTTOM  
10 LEFT IS THE FINANCIAL DIMENSION. THAT IS WHERE WE ASSESS RISKS  
11 AND FINANCIAL IMPACTS TO THE OPERATING TRANSIT AGENCIES. ON  
12 THE BOTTOM RIGHT DELIVERABILITY AND OPERATIONS CONSIDERATIONS.  
13 WE WILL WALK THROUGH A BUNCH OF INFORMATION RELATED TO SEVERAL  
14 OF THOSE CRITERIA TODAY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. JUST TO REMIND  
15 YOU REAL QUICKLY, THE CATEGORIES OF WORK THAT HAVE FED INTO  
16 THIS, CERTAINLY FORECASTING AND MODELING IS A BIG FACTOR THAT  
17 WE WILL TALK ABOUT TODAY. USER RESEARCH COMPONENT WITH  
18 TECHNICAL EXPERTISE OF OUR SUB CONSULTANT OXD. A LOT OF  
19 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT INCLUDING WITH MEMBERS OF THIS  
20 COMMITTEE AS WELL AS OTHER STAKEHOLDERS. AND THEN  
21 CONTRIBUTIONS FROM ALL OF THE AGENCIES INVOLVED. SO, A LOT OF  
22 DIFFERENT STREAMS OF INFORMATION FEEDING IN HERE. NEXT SLIDE,  
23 PLEASE. SO, ONCE AGAIN TO RESTATE THE FRAMEWORK THAT WE HAVE  
24 COME TO HERE, BILL DID A GOOD JOB OF LAYING THIS OUT. I WILL  
25 JUST SHOW IT AGAIN FOR YOU HERE. OVERLAYS TO THE FARE



September 10, 2021

1 STRUCTURES, PASSES AND CAPS IS PERHAPS THE SIMPLEST STEP OF  
2 FARE INTEGRATION. NEXT IN BLUE, TRANSFER DISCOUNTS OF VARIOUS  
3 KINDS AS BILL LAID OUT. AND THEN MOVING INTO THE GREEN BOX  
4 THERE, REGIONAL CHANGE AND FINALLY TO THE TIER FOUR IN RED,  
5 LOCAL AND REGIONAL CHANGE. AND IT IS PERHAPS HELPFUL IN THE  
6 CONTEXT OF THESE RECOMMENDATIONS TO THINK OF THESE AS  
7 POTENTIALLY BUT NOT NECESSARILY PROGRESSIVE. YOU COULD MOVE  
8 THROUGH EACH STEP TO THE NEXT OR YOU COULD SORT OF JUMP TIERS.  
9 BUT IT IS AT TIMES HELPFUL TO THINK OF THESE AS POTENTIALLY  
10 PROGRESSIVE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, JUST TO REMIND EVERYONE  
11 OUR PRIMARY TOOL HERE FOR THE RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE ANALYSIS  
12 IS THE REGIONAL TRAVEL MODEL WHICH CONSIDERS THE EXISTING AND  
13 TRANSIT NETWORK. IT HAS INFORMATION AND EDUCATED ASSUMPTIONS  
14 ABOUT TRAVEL TIMES, POPULATION AND DEPLOYMENT, TRIP PATTERNS  
15 AND FARES AND WE USE IT TO RUN SCENARIOS WHERE WE ADJUST FARES  
16 AND DOCUMENT THE IMPACT ON THOSE METRICS WE ARE INTERESTED IN.  
17 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, AGAIN, THIS IS A NETWORK MODEL.  
18 INDIVIDUAL HOUSEHOLDS AND TRAVELERS ARE REPRESENTED IN THE  
19 MODEL WITH THE CHOICE OF TRAVEL MODES. EACH VIRTUAL TRAVELER  
20 GETS A CHOICE ABOUT THEIR MODE AND ROUTE THEY TAKE BASED ON  
21 FACTORS LIKE TRAVEL TIMES, RELIABILITY WAIT TIMES AND COSTS.  
22 AND AGAIN, WE HOLD MOST OF THESE FACTORS CONSTANT WITH TARGET  
23 AND PRICE CHANGES TO EVALUATE THE OPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.  
24 WHY DON'T WE SKIP THIS ONE. GO TO THE NEXT ONE, PLEASE. SO,  
25 OUR CONSULTANT TEAM WITH A LOT OF SUPPORT FROM THE MODELERS AT



September 10, 2021

1 MTC HAS RUN A LOT OF ITERATIONS OF THIS MODEL AND THEY ARE  
2 CONTINUING TO TWEAK ITERATIONS EVEN TODAY. ONE GOAL IS WE  
3 ITERATE ON THOSE OPTIONS IS GET APPLES TO APPLES IN TERMS OF  
4 SUBSIDIES EACH CONTAINS. IT IS LAID ON THE SLIDE. WE TESTED A  
5 TIER TWO OPTION TO GET A BALL PARK LEVEL OF KNEW SUBSIDY  
6 NEEDED TO ELIMINATE THOSE PRICE BARRIERS BETWEEN AGENCIES.  
7 THEN WE RAN A COUPLE OF SCENARIOS FOR THE SIMPLE ACROSS THE  
8 BOARD GLOBAL FARE DISCOUNT. 2.5% AND 5%. THOSE ARE NOT POLICY  
9 PROPOSALS. THE PURPOSE IS JUST TO ASSESS WHETHER SUBSIDY  
10 TARGETED AND FARE INTEGRATION HAS INCREMENTAL BENEFITS  
11 COMPARED TO JUST LOWERING FARES ACROSS THE BOARD. SO, NEXT WE  
12 DID VERSIONS OF MORE AGGRESSIVE INTEGRATION, MORE TARGETED OR  
13 GLOBAL RATHER INTEGRATION OPTIONS IN TIERS THREE AND FOUR  
14 BASED ON SORT OF SOME CUSTOMER FRIENDLY PRICING SCENARIOS WITH  
15 MORE SUBSIDY. AND THEN WE ITERATED TO BRING THE SUBSIDY IN  
16 LINE WITH OUR TIER TWO OPTIONS. SO, FINALLY, WE ALSO DID SOME  
17 ADDITIONAL TRAVEL AND FINANCIAL ANALYSIS OUTSIDE OF THE MODEL  
18 BASED ON ACTUAL DATA FROM NTD, CLIPPER AND FROM THE AGENCIES.  
19 THAT'S A REALITY CHECK ON WHAT WE ARE SEEING FROM MODEL AND TO  
20 TEST SOME OPTIONS THAT AREN'T READILY TESTABLE IN THE MODEL  
21 SUCH AS PASSES AND CAPS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. MOVING NOW INTO  
22 THE EMERGING FINDINGS. I GUESS AS A WORD OF WARNING, THERE'S A  
23 LOT OF DETAIL IN HERE. WE ARE GOING TO TRY TO HIT THE  
24 HIGHLIGHTS BUT BEAR WITH US AS WE WORK THROUGH SOME  
25 PARTICULARS OF THE DATA ANALYSIS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I WANT





September 10, 2021

1 TO START WITH AN OVERVIEW OF HOW WE ARE SEEING PASSES AND CAPS  
2 IN THIS ANALYSIS. MULTI-AGENCY PASS CAPS PRODUCT OFFERING  
3 WHICH WE DON'T HAVE WOULD POTENTIALLY PROVIDE A LARGE FARE  
4 DISCOUNT WHICH WOULD BE WEIGHTED HEAVILY TOWARDS THE MOST  
5 FREQUENT RIDER AND IMPROVE LEARNIBILITY AND LEGIBILITY FOR  
6 MULTI-AGENCY RIDERS. YOU WILL RECALL THERE'S SORT OF TWO MAIN  
7 CATEGORIES OF OPTIONS HERE. PASSES YOU PAY UP FRONT COVERS  
8 YOUR FARES FOR A PERIOD OF TIME. A CAP OR ACCUMULATOR. YOU PAY  
9 NORMALLY UP TO SOME THRESHOLD AND THEREAFTER YOU RIDE FREE. WE  
10 ARE FOCUSED INITIALLY ON CAPS TO GET A SENSE OF HOW THESE  
11 CHOICES WOULD WORK SORT OF APPLIED TO THE WHOLE POPULATION OF  
12 RIDERS. AND WE CONSIDERED TWO BASIC PRICING MODELS. THE FIRST  
13 IS FARE BASED MEANING YOUR FARES ARE CAPPED AT A PARTICULAR  
14 DOLLAR VALUE FOR THE PERIOD. THE SECOND ONE WOULD BE TRIP  
15 BASED MEANING YOU ARE CAPPED AFTER A DEFINED NUMBER OF TRIPS  
16 DURING THE PERIOD. THE DATA ON THIS SLIDE REPORTS SOME  
17 FINDINGS THAT WE THINK DEMONSTRATE A TRIP-BASED MODEL WHICH IS  
18 SHOWN IN BLUE IS A BETTER FIT FOR OUR EXISTING FARE SYSTEM  
19 THAN A FARE-BASED MODEL WHICH IS IN ORANGE. ON THE LEFT SIDE  
20 IN THE BLUE BARS YOU CAN SEE THE TOTAL DISCOUNTED FARE OR  
21 AGENCY REVENUE ESTIMATED FOR A TRIP-BASED CAP AT EACH OF  
22 SEVERAL MONTHLY THRESHOLDS FROM 35-45 TRIPS. AND WE ARE  
23 ESTIMATING THE NET IMPACT ON REGIONAL FARE REVENUE IS BETWEEN  
24 4-8%. WE ESTIMATED NET IMPACT OF ABOUT 1% RESULTING FROM THOSE  
25 -- THAT POLICY BEING APPLIED. MEANING RIDERSHIP INCREASE OF



September 10, 2021

1 ABOUT 1%. SO, A COMMON BENEFICIARY WOULD BE A HIGH VOLUME MUNI  
2 RIDE WHO ARE TAKES OCCASIONAL BART TRIPS. THE EFFICIENCY IN  
3 TERMS OF ADDED SUBSIDY PER TRIP HERE IS PRETTY GOOD. ALTHOUGH  
4 IT IS NOT AS STRONG AS SOME OF THE TIER TWO OPTIONS WE WILL  
5 SHOW YOU IN A MOMENT. SO, SHOWN HERE IN ORANGE, THE COMPARABLE  
6 FARE-BASED CAP WE ARE SHOWING JUST THIS COULD BE SIMILAR FOR  
7 SINGLE AGENCIES. RIDERSHIP IMPACTS HERE ARE ALSO RANGING UP TO  
8 1% BUT THE POTENTIAL FARE IMPACT IS MUCH GREATER, 16-18%. AND  
9 ALL THE BENEFIT WOULD BE TOWARDS RIDERS WHO TAKE LOTS OF  
10 EXPENSIVE TRIPS. MOSTLY LONG DISTANCE TRIPS. NEXT SLIDE,  
11 PLEASE. BASED ON THAT INSIGHT, WE HAVE THESE RECOMMENDATIONS  
12 DEPRIORITIZED FARE BASED CAPS AND FOCUSED ON TRIP-BASED CAPS  
13 AND PASSES. I WILL SAY THAT BROAD FARE CAPTION IS VERY  
14 ATTRACTIVE TO THE CUSTOMER. OFFERS A GREAT BENEFIT TO THE  
15 CUSTOMER. IT WOULD REQUIRE A LOT OF NEW SUBSIDY TO IMPLEMENT  
16 THE THRESHOLD TO BE MEANINGFUL TO A LOT OF RIDERS. FOR THAT  
17 REASON WE FOCUSED PARTICULAR ATTENTION ON RELATED PAST PRODUCT  
18 THAT WE THINK COULD OFFER A GOOD PROOF OF CONCEPT. WE WILL  
19 REFER TO IT AS PUGET MODEL SINCE IT HAS BEEN USED IN THE PUGET  
20 SOUND REGION. AND IN THIS VERSION, RIDERS ARE OFFERED THEIR  
21 CHOICE OF PASSES AT A PRICE POINT THEY CHOOSE. FOR EXAMPLE, IF  
22 YOUR TYPICAL TRIP COSTS \$3, YOU WOULD BUY A PASS THAT COSTS  
23 THREE TIMES 18 ROUND TRIPS OF \$108. AND ALL TRIPS UP TO \$3 ARE  
24 COVERED. IF YOU TAKE A TRIP THAT COSTS MORE YOU PAY THE  
25 DIFFERENCE. FOR CONTEXT, ABOUT 13% OF THE FARES IN PUGET SOUND



September 10, 2021

1 ARE PAID USING THIS TYPE OF PASS AS WELL AS FARE RAILS IN THE  
2 D.C. METRO RAIL. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I AM GOING TO MOVE NOW A  
3 LITTLE MORE QUICKLY INTO A SUMMARY OF BROADER EMERGING  
4 FINDINGS FROM THE BUSINESS CASE, STARTING WITH THE STRATEGIC  
5 DIMENSION WITH POLICY GOALS LIKE RIDERSHIP, VMT, EQUITY AND  
6 CUSTOMER EQUITY

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I SEE MEMBER HARTMAN HAS HAD A HAND AND  
9 THIS INFORMATION IS REALLY DENSE. I DON'T WANT TO HAVE A  
10 REALLY LONG CONVERSATION BUT THERE FEELS A CLARIFYING QUESTION  
11 THAT MIGHT BE GOOD.

12

13 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** CAN YOU GO BACK TO THE SLIDE -- ONE MORE  
14 SLIDE BACK. OKAY. ANOTHER SLIDE BACK. SO, HERE WHEN YOU ARE  
15 LOOKING AT THE CHANGE IN MONTHLY CLIPPER REVENUE BY CAP TYPE  
16 AND YOU ARE COMPARING TRIP NUMBER VERSUS FARE BASED CAPS,  
17 WHERE DID YOU GUYS PULL THESE FARES OUT OF? BECAUSE IT IS  
18 SHOWING, OBVIOUSLY, A SIGNIFICANT LOSSES IN THE FARE-BASED  
19 CAP. WHERE DID THESE FIGURES COME FROM AS FAR AS THE FARES ARE  
20 COMING FROM?

21

22 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. GOOD QUESTION. THAT \$81 FIGURE IS  
23 ROUGHLY THE 80TH PERCENTILE OF WHAT PEOPLE PAY FOR FARES OUT  
24 OF THE CLIPPER DATA. \$162 IS TWICE THAT FIGURE. THESE ARE ALSO  
25 MORE OR LESS COMPARABLE TO THE RANGE OF PRICES PEOPLE PAY FOR



September 10, 2021

1 PASSES ON THE LARGE LOCAL AGENCIES. MUNI PASSES ARE BETWEEN  
2 \$80 AND \$100.

3

4 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** THIS IS THIS MAJORITY OF WHAT FARES ARE  
5 BEING PAID TODAY?

6

7 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** \$81 IS THE 80TH PERCENTILE FIGURE IF YOU LOOK  
8 AT THE CLIPPER CARDS THAT WE HAVE OVER THE PERIODS WE LOOKED  
9 AT. THE TYPICAL \$80% OF FOLKS PAY UNDER EIGHT IS.

10

11 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** OKAY. AND SO, TO EXPAND THAT, WE WOULD BE  
12 LOOKING AT SIGNIFICANT LOSSES. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE I AM  
13 UNDERSTANDING THIS. THANK YOU.

14

15 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THANKS. GOOD QUESTION AND I DID MEAN TO STOP  
16 FOR QUESTIONS. THANKS FOR INTERRUPTING ME, ADINA

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THERE'S A COUPLE OF PEOPLE THAT HAVE A  
19 HAND. WE WILL SHARE OPINIONS LATER. BUT CLARIFYING QUESTIONS,  
20 MEMBER GRIFFITHS.

21

22 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH. IF YOU GO BACK TO THE SAME SLIDE. WHEN  
23 YOU SAY A TRIP-BASED CAP, THAT MEANS 36 TRIPS BUT ON ANY  
24 AGENCY AND NO MATTER WHAT THE FARE WOULD BE. ONE TRIP COULD BE



September 10, 2021

1 AN \$8 BART TRIP OR \$2.50 LOCAL TRANSIT TRIP. IS THAT -- THAT  
2 IS MY FIRST QUESTION AND YOU ARE NODDING YOUR HEAD.

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** WE THINK OF THESE AS LAYERED ON TOP OF THE  
5 INTERAGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNTS. THIS WOULD BE FARES PAID, NOT  
6 TRIPS TAKEN. IF YOU HAD A FREE FARE, THAT WOULDN'T COUNT  
7 TOWARDS THE TOTAL.

8

9 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THAT WAS MY OTHER QUESTION. DOES THIS ASSUME  
10 THAT A TRIP IS AGAIN IF IT IS A THREE PART TRIP THAT USES  
11 THREE AGENCIES THAT IS STILL ONE TRIP. THAT IS NOT THREE  
12 TRIPS.

13

14 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH.

15

16 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SURE

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GREAT. AND THEN CLARIFYING QUESTIONS,  
21 MEMBER GOTUACO.

22

23 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** YEAH. SAME SLIDE. I WANTED TO KNOW HOW DOES  
24 THE TRIP CAP WORK IN RELATION TO MONTHLY PASSES?

25



September 10, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** LET'S SEE. QUESTION BEING IF YOU HAVE A  
2 MONTHLY PASS, A SINGLE AGENCY MONTHLY PASS, WOULD THAT COUNT  
3 TOWARDS YOUR TRIP COUNT?

4

5 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** YEAH.

6

7 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I THINK GOING WITH THE DEFINITION I LAID OUT  
8 IF YOU ARE NOT PAYING INCREMENTALLY TOWARDS YOUR TRIP, IT  
9 WOULDN'T COUNT TOWARDS THE CAP, MEANING THAT YOU -- BILL, HELP  
10 ME OUT.

11

12 **WILLIAM BACON:** THAT IS RIGHT. THE ASSUMPTION HERE -- IT IS A  
13 GOOD QUESTION. THIS IS ONE OF THE CHALLENGES BUILT INTO OUR  
14 VERY DISPARITY FARE SYSTEM RIGHT NOW. SOME AGENCIES HAVE  
15 PASSES. SOME DON'T. IF YOU HAVE A PASS, YOU'RE NOT PAYING AN  
16 INCREMENTAL COST FOR EACH TRIP YOU ARE TAKING. SO, IT ISN'T  
17 ASSUMED TO BE COUNTED IN THIS. THIS IS A STRENGTH OR WEAKNESS  
18 DEPENDING ON YOUR PERSPECTIVE OF THAT TRIP-BASED MODEL. I WILL  
19 LEAVE IT AT THAT.

20

21 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** ON THAT, LET ME CLARIFY. SOMETIMES THESE  
22 QUESTIONS HAVE TWO DIFFERENT KINDS OF ANSWERS. ONE IS HOW  
23 WOULD THIS WORK IN THE REAL POLICY AND THE OTHER IS HOW DOES  
24 IT WORK IN THE FINANCIAL ANALYSIS OR THE RIDERSHIP ANALYSIS.  
25 WHEN THIS ANALYSIS HERE DOESN'T -- WAS BASED ON THE NUMBER OF



September 10, 2021

1 TRIPS THAT PEOPLE TAKE WITHOUT REGARD TO WHETHER THEY HAD A  
2 PASS OR NOT. SO, IF, FOR EXAMPLE, THE TRIP-BASED CAP ENDED UP  
3 BEING MORE FAVORABLE TO PEOPLE, THEN THE EXISTING PASS SYSTEMS  
4 BASICALLY THIS INTERPRETATION IS THEY WOULD START SWITCHING  
5 OVER TO THE OTHER PASS MODEL AND NOT BUYING PASSES

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I AM NOT SEEING ANY  
8 OTHER CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. SO, MOVE ON TO MORE OF THE  
9 PRESENTATION.

10

11 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SURE. OKAY. LET'S SEE. YOU CAN GO FORWARD TO  
12 -- ONE MORE I THINK. OKAY. ONE CONCEPT AS WE GET INTO THE  
13 RIDERSHIP ANALYSIS, WE WANT TO DISTINGUISH A LITTLE BIT  
14 BETWEEN RIDERSHIP ON MULTI-AGENCY OR INTERCOUNTY TRIPS, WHICH  
15 TO SOME DEGREE REPRESENTS OUR SUCCESS IN INTEGRATING OUR  
16 DIVERSE SYSTEMS. AND SEPARATELY CHANGES TO SITTING AGENCY  
17 TRIPS WHICH WOULD TYPICALLY WOULD BE EITHER THE RESULT OF  
18 ADJUSTMENTS OR NEW FARE SUBSIDY IN THOSE SYSTEMS. BUT NOT  
19 NECESSARILY RELATED TO INTEGRATION WITH THE BROADER SYSTEM.  
20 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS ONE IS PRETTY DENSE. SO, LET ME  
21 JUST POINT OUT A FEW ASPECTS OF THIS. HERE ON THE TOP GRAPHIC,  
22 TEN DIFFERENT MODEL RUNS. IN THE TOP, GRAPHIC ON THE TOP RIGHT  
23 WE HAVE TWO SETS OF GLOBAL DISCOUNT SCENARIOS JUST FOR  
24 COMPARISON. THAT IS OUR 2.5% SCENARIO, WHICH YIELDED 0.9% IN  
25 RIDERSHIP. AGAIN, THIS IS ALL IN PRE-COVID TERMS. SO, BEAR



September 10, 2021

1 THAT IN MIND. MOVING TO THE FAR LEFT OF THE TOP, GRAPHIC, WE  
2 ARE SHOWING OUR OPTION Q. TRANSFER DISCOUNT FOR LOCAL SERVICE  
3 AND OPTION THREE WHERE WE ADD TRANSFER DISCOUNTS FOR REGIONAL  
4 SERVICES AS WELL. YOU SEE THE INTERAGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNTS  
5 GENERATE MEANINGFULLY FOR RIDERSHIP THAN THE GLOBAL DISCOUNTS  
6 AT A COMPARABLE LEVEL. IN THE MIDDLE OF THE GRAPHIC, WE HAVE  
7 THREE BOLDER INTEGRATION PROPOSALS ALL AT 7% SUBSIDY LEVELS.  
8 THAT MEANS 7% LESS FOR THE SYSTEM AS A WHOLE IN PRE-COVID  
9 TERMS. OPTION 3(B), WE HAVE OPTION FOUR WHICH DOES THE SAME.  
10 STANDARDIZES LOCAL FLAT FARES. AND OPTION FIVE WHICH APPLIES  
11 TO SMALL ZONES TO ALL SERVICES BOTH LOCAL AND REGIONAL. OUT OF  
12 THAT GROUP, OPTION 3(B) THAT PRODUCED THE HIGHEST INCREMENTAL  
13 INCREASE OF RIDERSHIP. FROM THAT GROUP NEXT TO THE RIGHT WE  
14 HAVE A VERSION OF OPTION FIVE WHERE THE SUBSIDY IS REDUCED SO  
15 IT IS COMPARABLE TO THE TRANSFER DISCOUNT SCENARIOS. THIS ONE  
16 WE SEE A NET DECREASE IN RIDERS AS WE HAVE SHORT TRIPS THAT  
17 END UP WITH HIGHER FARES THAN THE STATUS QUO. WANT TO POINT  
18 OUT OUR TEAM IS DOING FINAL NUMBERS FOR OPTIONS THREE, FOUR  
19 AND SIX AS WELL. BUT YOU CAN EXPECT GENERAL PATTERN ACROSS  
20 THESE BARS TO HOLD FOR THOSE LOWER SUBSIDY SCENARIOS. ON THE  
21 BOTTOM OF THIS GRAPHIC, YOU SEE THE SAME RESULTS BROKEN OUT  
22 BETWEEN INTERCOUNTY AND INTRA-COUNTY TRIPS GENERATED. MOST OF  
23 THE TRIPS GENERATED ARE INTERCOUNTY SUGGESTING THE SUBSIDY IS  
24 BEING TARGETED TOWARDS INTEGRATION BETWEEN SYSTEMS. AS WE MOVE  
25 INTO THE STANDARDIZED ZONE OPTIONS WE START TO SEE RIDERSHIP





September 10, 2021

1 BEING GENERATED PRINCIPALLY THROUGH LOWER FARES AND SINGLE  
2 AGENCY TRIPS. MAYBE ONE MORE SLIDE HERE AND THEN WE CAN TAKE  
3 SOME CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. JUST LOOKING AT THE VMT REDUCTION.  
4 OPTIONS TWO AND THREE PERFORM EFFICIENTLY AT LOW LEVELS OF  
5 SUBSIDY ON VMT. 3(B) AND FOUR REDUCE A LOT OF VMT. AND OPTION  
6 FIVE AT 7% SUBSIDY GENERATES MOSTLY SHORTER TRIPS. WE SEE A  
7 NET INCREASE IN VMT AT THE LOWER VERSION OF THAT. MAYBE THERE  
8 SHOULD WE TAKE A PAUSE AND SEE IF THERE'S ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT  
9 THIS DATA?

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I SEE A BUNCH OF QUESTIONS. CHRISTIAN.

12

13 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY. YOU SAID THIS  
14 DATA IS PRE-COVID INFORMATION? RIGHT. SO, IT IS MOSTLY  
15 COMMUTER TRIPS AS OPPOSED TO INCENTIVIZING LOCAL?

16

17 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THERE ARE COMMUTER TRIPS IN PRE-COVID WORLD.  
18 ONE THING WE WILL BE LAYERING IN COVID RECOVERY SCENARIOS BY  
19 THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. WHAT WE WILL BE DOING IN  
20 THERE IS HAVING OVERALL SOMEWHAT LOWER RIDERSHIP HERE IN THE  
21 RECOVERY PHASE BUT HAVING LOCAL TRIPS OR NON-COMMUTER TRIPS  
22 RECOVER SUBSTANTIALLY FASTER THAN COMMUTER TRIPS. SO YOU WOULD  
23 SEE A DIFFERENT PATTERN.

24



September 10, 2021

1 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** A DIRECT COMPARISON ON THE COMMUTE SIDE  
2 VERSUS THE NON-COMMUTE SIDE MIGHT BE A HELPFUL WAY TO LOOK AT  
3 THEM

4  
5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** COOL. BRIAN STANKE.

6  
7 **BRIAN STANKE:** THANK YOU, ADINA. ON THIS SLIDE AND THE PREVIOUS  
8 SLIDE, I DON'T KNOW IF I MISSED IT. I THOUGHT YOU TALKED ABOUT  
9 OPTIONS 2-5 BUT I DIDN'T HEAR ABOUT OPTION SIX. AND ON OPTION  
10 SIX, I AM ALSO WONDERING THERE DOESN'T SEEM TO BE A 7% FOR  
11 OPTION SIX.

12  
13 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THERE'S NOT. GOOD CATCH ON THERE. IN FACT,  
14 THERE IS ONE. IT IS JUST STILL IN THE QUEUE THAT NEEDS TO BE  
15 ADDED. OPTION SIX IN OUR INITIAL RUN OF IT HERE CAME OUT AS  
16 CITY SUBSIDY. VERY LARGE SUBSIDY. IT WAS OUR LARGE ZONE OPTION  
17 WITH SORT OF CUSTOMER ATTRACTIVE PRICING FOR LARGER ZONES. AND  
18 THEN -- THOSE ZONES ARE BUILT AROUND THE EXISTING REGIONAL  
19 NETWORK AND IT INCLUDES A LOCAL FLAT FARE. AND IT DOES HAVE --  
20 IT HAS A SUBSTANTIAL DECREASE OF VMT HERE. WE ARE PLANNING TO  
21 ADD IN FOR EACH OF THESE REGION OPTIONS HERE -- FOR FULLY  
22 INTEGRATED OPTIONS A LOW SUBSIDY VERSUS COMPARABLE TO WHAT YOU  
23 SEE FOR OPTION FIVE

24



September 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MEMBER GRIFFITHS. IAN, ARE YOU  
2 MUTED?

3

4 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SORRY. ON THE PRIOR SLIDE, IF YOU CAN GO THERE.  
5 THE LEGEND. I WASN'T SURE IF IT WAS ACCURATE. YOU SAID FOR  
6 EXAMPLE OPTION FIVE SAW A DECREASE IN -- I THOUGHT WHAT YOU  
7 SAID WAS SHORT -- WHAT I WOULD CONSIDER INTRA, MEANING WITHIN  
8 THE SAME COUNTY TRIPS AND AN INCREASE IN INTER, BETWEEN  
9 COUNTIES. BUT THE LEGEND INDICATES THE OPPOSITE. I AM JUST  
10 WANTING -- IS THE LIGHT BLUE BETWEEN COUNTIES AND THE DARK  
11 BLUE WITHIN THE SAME COUNTY?

12

13 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. THAT'S RIGHT. I MAY HAVE FLIPPED MY  
14 TERMS THERE. OPTION FIVE WE GENERATE A LOT OF TRIPS WITHIN THE  
15 SAME COUNTY. PARTICULARLY IN SAN FRANCISCO WHERE PRICES WOULD  
16 BE GOING DOWN.

17

18 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** OKAY. THE LEGEND IS ACCURATE THEN. AND MY  
19 UNDERSTANDING OF INTER AND INTRA IS RIGHT. BECAUSE I NOTICED  
20 THROUGHOUT ABOUT OPTION FIVE JUST IN TERMS OF UNDERSTANDING  
21 HOW IT WAS MODELED, YOU HAD SAID THAT PEOPLE CROSSING SMALL --  
22 FOUR AND SIX SAY THERE'S A FLAT LOCAL FARE. I AM WONDERING WAS  
23 THAT APPLIED TO OPTION FIVE? IT IS NOT WRITTEN INTO THE TEXT  
24 BECAUSE THAT MAKES ME BONDER WHETHER THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN  
25 FOUR AND SIX AND FIVE -- FOUR AND SIX HAVE A FLAT LOCAL FARE



September 10, 2021

1 AND FIVE DOESN'T. AND THE OTHER MAYBE BECAUSE IT IS THE SAME  
2 ANSWER TO THIS QUESTION. WHICH IS THAT THE SMALL ZONES, LIKE,  
3 THERE'S A CONCEPT THAT THE FIRST TWO ZONES WOULD BE THE SAME  
4 PRICE? YOU WOULDN'T BE CHARGED FOR THE FIRST ZONE BOUNDARY. I  
5 WAS WONDERING IF THAT WAS AN ASPECT OF ZONE FIVE AND THE WAY  
6 IT WAS MODELED THAT YOU LIKE THE SMALL ZONES -- YOU WOULDN'T  
7 BE CHARGED JUST FOR CROSSING THAT FIRST BOUNDARY FOR A LOCAL  
8 TRIP.

9

10 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** LET'S SEE. MY UNDERSTANDING OF HOW THIS  
11 PARTICULAR MODEL RUN WORKS IS IT DOES NOT DO THE SECOND ZONE  
12 FREE. THAT IS A GOOD OBSERVATION. AND IT IS -- THAT'S CORRECT.  
13 THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN FIVE AND THEN FOUR AND SIX IS OPTION  
14 FIVE IS ZONES THROUGHOUT. NO FLAT LOCAL FARE IN OPTION FIVE.

15

16 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** AND THE PRICE GOES UP AS SOON AS YOU EXIT THAT  
17 FIRST ZONE INTO THE SECOND ZONE. OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THE  
18 CLARIFICATION

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** MEMBER HARTMAN.

21

22 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** THANK YOU. FIRST QUESTION WITH REGARDS TO  
23 THE DATA IN THIS CHART DO WEST THE COMPETENCE LEVEL AS FAR AS  
24 ACCURACY?

25



September 10, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** MODELS ARE MODELS. I WOULDN'T BE TOO  
2 CONFIDENT IN MODEL RESULTS. FOR ANY MODEL ESPECIALLY IN THIS  
3 UNFAMILIAR WORLD. I THINK IT IS THE BEST TOOL WE HAVE TO  
4 INTEGRATE ALL OF THESE DIFFERENT KINDS OF INFORMATION THAT  
5 WE'RE LOOKING AT HERE. BUT I WOULD SAY TAKE IT WITH A GRAIN OF  
6 SALT FROM ANY MODEL. I WILL SAY IN DEFENSE OF THE MODEL THAT  
7 IT IS THE SAME TOOL THAT IS BEING USED FOR PLAN BAY AREA AND  
8 IN THAT SENSE IT IS COMPARABLE ACROSS DIFFERENT ENOUGH  
9 INVESTMENTS THE REGION IS LOOKING AT. BUT I THINK -- ONE THING  
10 I DO WANT TO EMPHASIZE HERE IS THAT WE THINK -- PART OF WHAT  
11 IS DRIVING OUR RECOMMENDATIONS HERE IS WE'RE TRYING TO GET TO  
12 SOME RECOMMENDATIONS THAT MAKE SENSE IN LIGHT OF ACTUALS, IN  
13 LIGHT OF COMMON SENSE AND BEST PRACTICES FROM CLOSELY RELATED  
14 PEER REGIONS. NOT JUST FROM MODEL FINDINGS.

15

16 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** THANK YOU. TO FOLLOW THAT WHAT IS THE  
17 CONFIDENCE OR CHALLENGES IN OBTAINING SOME OF THESE ADDITIONAL  
18 SUBSIDY? HOW CONFIDENT IS THE TEAM SAY IF WE WENT WITH OPTION  
19 C AND WE NEEDED A 7% INCREASE IN SUBSIDIES WHAT IS THE  
20 LIKELINESS OF THAT HAPPENING? WHAT ARE THE CHALLENGES? CAN YOU  
21 GET SOME COLOR TO THAT?

22

23 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. THAT IS A SUBJECT WE THINK ABOUT A LOT  
24 HERE IN MY DAY JOB, BART AND FINANCIAL PLANNING. THE REALITY  
25 AS YOU GUYS KNOW WE CAN'T REALLY SUSTAIN THE SERVICE THAT WE



September 10, 2021

1 HAVE WITHOUT THE RETURN OF A LOT OF FARE PAYING CUSTOMERS.  
2 WHEN AND IF THAT IS GOING TO HAPPEN, WE HAVE GUESSES ONLY. SO,  
3 RIGHT NOW I THINK THE BIGGER QUESTION IS NOT JUST SUBSIDY  
4 RELATED TO FARE INTEGRATION BUT HOW DO WE PAY FOR THIS NETWORK  
5 THAT WE HAVE AND THE NETWORK THAT WE NEED. I WOULD SAY SOME  
6 STEPS ARE GOING TO HAVE TO BE TAKEN TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN  
7 PAY FOR THIS NETWORK. AND I THINK THESE PROPOSALS ARE JUST  
8 GOING TO HAVE TO FIT INTO THAT FRAMEWORK.

9

10 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** MY FINAL QUESTION, THANK YOU. I SEE WHERE  
11 IN THE VERY BEGINNING YOU ADDRESSED THE BULK INSTITUTIONAL  
12 PASSES AND INITIALLY ROLLING THAT OUT TO STUDENTS. BUT I  
13 DIDN'T SEE WHERE WE TOUCHED ON HOW THESE -- HOW THIS PROPOSAL  
14 THAT YOU GUYS ARE RECOMMENDING TODAY IS GOING TO SERVE THE  
15 SENIORS, THE DISABLED AND OTHER ECONOMICALLY DISADVANTAGED  
16 GROUPS. WHAT AM I MISSING THERE?

17

18 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THAT IS A GOOD QUESTION. WE WILL GET INTO A  
19 LOOK AT EQUITY ISSUES AS TO LOWER AND HIGHER NORTH CAROLINA  
20 FOLKS AND THOSE THESE PROPOSALS AFFECT THEM. THERE IS A  
21 BROADER QUESTION ABOUT SYSTEM AFFORDABILITY THAT IS RELATED TO  
22 BUT NOT THE SAME. WHETHER OUR CURRENT LEVEL OF SENIOR DISCOUNT  
23 OR CLIPPER SMART DISCOUNT IS ADEQUATE TO THE CHALLENGE OF  
24 THOSE POPULATIONS IN THIS AREA IS IMPORTANT, BUT OUTSIDE OF  
25 OUR SCOPE.



September 10, 2021

1

2 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** OKAY.

3

4 **WILLIAM BACON:** THIS IS BILL. I WILL CHIME IN QUICKLY. WHEN I  
5 MENTIONED THAT EARLIER AS WELL, TISHA, IT WAS IN THE SPECIFIC  
6 CONTEXT OF SORT OF AN EARLY PILOT OR DEMONSTRATION PROJECT  
7 SOMETHING IN THE NEAR TERM. WE WILL TALK MORE ABOUT THAT LATER  
8 IN THE PRESENTATION AS WELL. BUT I THINK THAT IS SOMETHING WE  
9 ARE SEEKING FEEDBACK FROM THIS GROUP ON AS WELL. THAT WHEN WE  
10 DETAILED THAT PROPOSAL, WE WILL TALK ABOUT AN INITIAL PHASE  
11 ONE BEING FOCUSED ON STUDENTS AND THEN A PHASE TWO THAT WOULD  
12 FOLLOW THAT, INCLUDING A BROADER RANGE OF INSTITUTIONS AND  
13 ORGANIZATIONS THAT WOULD HAVE THIS SORT OF ALL YOU CAN USE BAY  
14 AREA TRANSIT PASS THAT HAS NEVER EXISTED BEFORE. BUT WE WOULD  
15 BE OPEN TO HEARING THE COMMITTEE'S THOUGHTS ABOUT IS THAT AN  
16 APPROPRIATE GROUP TO START WITH AND WE CAN TALK ABOUT OUR  
17 REASONS FOR WHY WE ARE THINKING ABOUT THAT AND WHY THAT IN OUR  
18 OPINION MAKES SENSE TO START WITH THAT GROUP. BUT THAT IS WHAT  
19 WE WANT TO HEAR FROM YOU.

20

21 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. MEMBER KALLINS, CLARIFYING  
24 QUESTIONS ONLY. COMMENTS AT THE END.

25



September 10, 2021

1 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** GOING BACK TO OPTION SIX WHICH HAS  
2 THE HIGH RATE OF SUBSIDY, IT OBVIOUSLY, ALSO HAS THE HIGHEST  
3 TRIP INCREASE AND DECREASE IN VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. SURE  
4 THAT HAS TO DO WITH THE HIGH RATE OF SUBSIDY. IN YOUR  
5 PRESENTATION YOU DIDN'T REALLY TOUCH ON THAT ONE. IS THAT  
6 BECAUSE THE RATE OF SUBSIDY IS UNREALISTIC? AND IF SO WHY ARE  
7 WE KEEPING IT IN THERE IF IT IS AN UNATTAINABLE?

8

9 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** APOLOGIES IF THAT IS NOT QUITE READY TO GO  
10 HERE. I THINK FOR -- ONE THING I AM PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN  
11 THAT WE WILL TALK ABOUT IN JUST A MINUTE IS THE EFFICIENCY IN  
12 TERMS OF COST FOR A NEW RIDER FOR EACH OF THESE. THERE'S  
13 PROBABLY AN INFINITE LEVEL OF SUBSIDIES THAT YOU COULD CHOOSE  
14 DEPENDING ON THE RESOURCES AVAILABLE.

15

16 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** IF HYPOTHETICALLY WE PASSED NEW  
17 FUNDING SOURCES THAT ACTUALLY MADE IT POSSIBLE TO GIVE THIS  
18 LEVEL OF SUBSIDY, THIS WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT WE COULD  
19 CONSIDER?

20

21 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. CERTAINLY WE CAN CONSIDER IT. I THINK -  
22 - WELL, WE WILL TALK ABOUT COST EFFICIENCY, RETURN ON THE  
23 DOLLAR A LITTLE BIT IN JUST A MINUTE.

24

25 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. THANKS.





September 10, 2021

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I'M GOING TO SAY IT WRONG NOW. MEMBER  
3 DEUTSCH.

4

5 **ZACH DEUTSCH:** WALK ME THROUGH THE DISTANCE HAVING INTERCOUNTY  
6 RIDERSHIP.

7

8 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** IT DOES. IT DEPENDS ON WHOSE FARE IS GOING UP  
9 AND WHOSE IS GOING DOWN. PARTLY WHAT IS HAPPENING IN THESE  
10 SCENARIOS THAT GENERATED LOTS OF INTRACOUNTY TRIPS IS WE END  
11 UP WITH A SOMEWHAT LOWER FARE IN SAN FRANCISCO THAT HAS A  
12 LARGE SHARE OF REGIONAL RIDERSHIP.

13

14 **ZACK DEUTSCH:** THANK YOU. BUT IT IS NOT ENDEMIC OF THE MODELS.  
15 IT IS ABOUT THE PRICE LINK GOING UP OR DOWN.

16

17 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** MEMBER HEDGES.

20

21 **RICHARD HEDGES:** MY QUESTION IS REGARDING THE TRANSFER  
22 DISCOUNTS. AND MOST PEOPLE, ESPECIALLY ON THE PENINSULA IF  
23 THEY ARE COMMUTING TO WORK TAKE MORE THAN ONE MODE. SO, I AM  
24 GOING TO LAY OUT A TRIP THAT SOMEONE MIGHT TAKE, I HAVE TAKEN.  
25 FROM SAMTRANS TO CALTRAIN, TO BART, TO THE FERRY TO VALLEJO,



September 10, 2021

1 TO SOUL TRAINS, HOW WOULD THOSE DISCOUNTS WORK ON THOSE  
2 MULTIPLE TRIPS? [LAUGHTER].

3

4 **WILLIAM BACON:** I CAN TRY TO TAKE THAT ONE. RICH, WE WILL TALK  
5 A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT THIS LATER IN THE PRESENTATION, TOO.  
6 BUT I THINK IN THAT EXAMPLE, AND I MIGHT HAVE MISSED ONE LINK.  
7 ANY TYPE OF SERVICE THAT IS CONSIDERED A LOCAL TRANSIT  
8 SERVICE, THAT IS PRIMARY LOCAL BUS, LOCAL LIGHT RAIL,  
9 GENERALLY IN OUR AREA IS A FLAT FARE RIGHT NOW IN OUR CURRENT  
10 SYSTEM. YOU WOULD BE PAYING ONLY THAT VERY FIRST FARE. IF YOUR  
11 FIRST TRIP WAS ON SAMTRANS AND THAT FARE WAS \$2.25, THAT IS  
12 WHAT YOU WOULD PAY AND YOU WOULDN'T PAY ANOTHER LOCAL FAREMENT  
13 IF YOU WERE TAKING A SOUL TRANS LOCAL BUS AT THE END, YOU  
14 WASN'T BE PAYING ANOTHER SAMTRANS FARE. WHEN YOU GOT ON  
15 CALTRAIN OR BART, YOU WOULD BE GETTING A DISCOUNT FOR THAT  
16 LOCAL FARE THAT YOU PAID. IN THE CASE IF IT WAS \$2.25 FOR  
17 SAMTRANS, YOU WOULD BE GETTING \$2.25 OFF THE CALTRAIN FARE.  
18 YOU COULD BE GETTING THAT DISCOUNT ON WHATEVER CHANGE YOU MADE  
19 IN THE REGIONAL SERVICE. WE COULD TRY TO TALK ABOUT THAT MORE  
20 LATER IN THE PRESENTATION, TOO.

21

22 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HOW ABOUT CALTRAIN TO BART? TAKE A SHUTTLE TO  
23 CALTRAIN.

24



September 10, 2021

1 **WILLIAM BACON:** STILL -- IN A REGIONAL SCENARIO, AGAIN WE WILL  
2 DETAIL THIS IN THE PRESENTATION, THERE WOULD BE -- THERE'S --  
3 COULD BE A DIFFERENT AMOUNT. BUT THERE WOULD BE A FIXED  
4 DISCOUNT FOR REGIONAL TO REGIONAL TRANSFERS. AND THAT'S WHERE  
5 YOU COULD SET IT AT DIFFERENT LEVEL, DEPENDING ON WHAT YOU ARE  
6 TRYING TO ACHIEVE.

7

8 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** AND THE QUESTION THAT I HAD, HAD TO DO  
11 WITH THE INTRACOUNTY AND INTERCOUNTY. AND THE CLARIFYING  
12 QUESTIONS IN THAT SPACE ARE WHEN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT  
13 INTRACOUNTY, IS THIS STILL MULTI-AGENCY? FOR EXAMPLE, IF I AM  
14 TAKING -- IF I LIVE IN EAST PALO ALTO AND I AM GOING TO EAST  
15 SAN MATEO SO I TAKE CALTRAIN, I GUESS THAT WOULD WIND UP GOING  
16 TO PALO ALTO. PRETEND IT IS IN ONE COUNTY BUT STILL  
17 MULTIAGENCY, IS THAT WHAT IS BEING DESCRIBED HERE OR IS IT  
18 INTRACOUNTY AND ONE AGENCY VERSUS INTRACOUNTY AND TWO  
19 AGENCIES? CAN YOU EXPLAIN ARE YOU ALSO LOOKING AT INTRACOUNTY,  
20 MORE THAN ONE AGENCY?

21

22 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** WHAT IS BEING REPORTED HERE, THE METRIC IS  
23 INTRA-AND INTERCOUNTY. WE ARE USING IT AS A PROXY FOR MULTI-  
24 AGENCY, ALTHOUGH THEY ARE MANY CASES WHERE PEOPLE USE MULTIPLE  
25 AGENCIES ALL WITHIN ONE COUNTY



September 10, 2021

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO, IT IS BEING USED AS A PROXY. IS THERE  
3 ANY DATA ABOUT THE EXTENT OF INTRACOUNTY MULTI-AGENCY TRIPS? I  
4 REMEMBER SESSION COUNTY CONNECTION HAVING A STAT THAT SHOWED A  
5 LARGE NUMBER OF MULTI-AGENCY INTRACOUNTY TRIPS.

6

7 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** IT IS NOT THE EASIEST THING TO REPORT FROM A  
8 MODEL RUN. I WOULD RELY MORE ON ACTUALS FOR THAT TO THE EXTENT  
9 THEY ARE AVAILABLE

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANKS. I'M NOT SEEING ANYMORE  
12 HANDS. SO, WE CAN GO ON TO MORE OF THE ROBUST INFORMATION IN  
13 THIS PRESENTATION. WE --

14

15 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** WE COVERED SLIDE 25 ALREADY. SO FOR THE  
16 EQUITY ANALYSIS, OUR CONSULTANT TEAM IS STILL REVIEWING THE  
17 FINAL NUMBERS ON A RANGE OF METRICS. WHAT WE WANTED TO GIVE  
18 YOU HERE IS A LOOK AT THE RESULTS HIGHLIGHTING EQUITY  
19 PERFORMANCE FOR ONE OPTION, WHICH IS TIER TWO. INTRA-AGENCY  
20 TRANSFER DISCOUNTS, TO GIVE YOU A SENSE OF HOW WE ARE  
21 MEASURING AND REPORTING EQUITY TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK. SO, HERE  
22 WE SHOW THE ESTIMATED ON THIS SLIDE PERCENT CHANGE IN FARES IN  
23 OUR TIER TWO INTRA-AGENCY DISCOUNTS. THE METRIC REPORTING IS  
24 PERCENT CHANGE IN FARE IS BALANCED. AND THAT \$30,000 TO  
25 \$60,000 HOUSEHOLD INCOME LEVEL IS GETTING THE LARGEST PERCENT



September 10, 2021

1 SUBSIDY HERE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ANOTHER WAY TO LOOK AT  
2 EQUITY ACROSS INCOME GROUPS IS WHICH GROUP WOULD GET THE MOST  
3 TOTAL DOLLARS IN SUBSIDY. AGAIN, WE ARE FAIRLY BALANCED HERE.  
4 ALTHOUGH YOU CAN SEE ON THE FAR RIGHT ABOUT 36% SAME OPTION,  
5 TIER TWO, IS GOING TO RIDERS WITH HOUSEHOLD INCOMES OVER  
6 \$100,000. ALTHOUGH NOTE THAT THAT GROUP NUMERICALLY CLOUDS 36%  
7 OF THE RIDERS SO IT IS NOT A BAD MATCH. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.  
8 JUST IN THE INTEREST OF TIME, MAYBE WE WILL SKIP OVER THIS  
9 ONE. ACTUALLY, BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, IS  
10 THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR CLARIFICATIONS ON THOSE EQUITY SLIDES?  
11 ALL RIGHT. FOR CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, THE MODEL GIVES US  
12 INFORMATION OR TRIES TO GIVE US INFORMATION ABOUT TRADE-OFFS,  
13 TIME AND COST. BUT IT DOESN'T REALLY SPEAK TO THE QUALITY OF  
14 THE EXPERIENCE. THE BEST OPTIONS SHOULD BE ONES THAT HELP  
15 IMPROVE LEARNIBILITY AND LEGIBILITY AS BILL MENTIONED. WE  
16 DISCUSSED A LOT OF OUR USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES WITH THIS  
17 GROUP. BUT HERE I JUST WANT TO BRIEFLY RECAP SOME SUMMARY  
18 FINDINGS OUT OF THE USER RESEARCH. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AGAIN,  
19 WE HAD SEVERAL DIFFERENT KINDS OF USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES LED  
20 BY A SPECIALTY, OXD, THAT HELPED US OUT. WE WANTED TO TRY TO  
21 UNDERSTAND HOW CUSTOMERS RESPONDED TO DIFFERENT OPTIONS IN  
22 TERMS OF VALUE, LEGIBILITY AND FAIRNESS. ON PASSES AND CAPS,  
23 GENERALLY THE EXPERIENCE AND THE REACTION FROM USERS WAS  
24 POSITIVE TO MOST OF THE PROPOSALS. AS WAS THE PERCEPTION OF  
25 FAIRNESS ACROSS OPTIONS. SOME OF THE PASS AND CAP OPTIONS ARE



September 10, 2021

1 EASY TO UNDERSTAND AND SOME, PARTICULARLY THE USER PASS OPTION  
2 PRESENTS CHALLENGES FOR SOME CUSTOMERS TO UNDERSTAND IN THE  
3 FIRST DESCRIPTION. IT IS AN OVERALL BACK THERE WAS MIXED.  
4 GENERALLY CUSTOMERS WERE STRONGLY POSITIVE ABOUT TRANSFER  
5 DISCOUNT OPTIONS. FINDING THEM TO BE A GOOD VALUE AND READILY  
6 UNDERSTANDING THE PROPOSALS. ON OPTION 3(B) STANDARDIZE FARE,  
7 WE HAD GENERALLY POSITIVE FEEDBACK ON VALUE AND FAIRNESS. SOME  
8 RIDERS NEEDED ASSISTANCE IN DETERMINING THE STRUCTURE TO GET  
9 TO THEIR FARE. AND ON OPTION FIVE, THE SMALL ZONE STRUCTURE,  
10 WE GOT MIXED FEEDBACK. SOME USERS RAISED VALUE CONCERNS  
11 RELATED TO CONVERTING FLAT LOCAL FARES TO MULTI-ZONE TRIPS.  
12 AMONG THOSE BOLDER INTEGRATIONS, OPTION FOUR AND SIX WERE EASY  
13 ON LEGIBILITY. SOME RAISED FAIRNESS CONCERNS WHEN THEY SAW THE  
14 POTENTIAL FOR A FARE INCREASE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, JUST TO  
15 SUMMARIZE ACROSS THE STRATEGIC DIMENSION, WE GENERALLY SEE  
16 POSITIVE RIDERSHIP IMPACTS AND POSITIVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE  
17 BENEFITS FROM FARE INTEGRATION MORE BROADLY IS ONE CONCLUSION.  
18 HIGHER LEVELS OF SUBSIDY, OF COURSE, PRODUCE THE GREATEST  
19 RIDERSHIP GAINS. BUT WE SEE NOTABLE RIDERSHIP GAINS JUST FROM  
20 OPTION TWO WITH JUST 2.5%. WE HAVE MORE EQUITY NUMBERS TO ADD  
21 HERE BUT SORT OF TWO POTENTIAL EQUITY CONCERNS I WANT THE  
22 RAISE. ONE ON OPTIONS WHERE WE SEE FARE INCREASES FOR  
23 SIGNIFICANT NUMBERS OF SINGLE AGENCY BUS RIDERS. AND THE OTHER  
24 WOULD BE ON PASSES WHERE THE NEED TO PAY UP FRONT COULD  
25 EXCLUDE LOWER INCOME RIDERS FROM BENEFITS. EITHER ONE OF THOSE



September 10, 2021

1 WOULD REQUIRE SOME MITIGATION FOR EQUITY IMPACTS, PERHAPS.  
2 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I THINK WE SORT OF DISCUSSED MOST OF THE  
3 KEY FINDINGS HERE. SO, MAYBE WE CAN PAUSE THERE AND SEE IF  
4 THERE ARE NEED FOR MORE CLARIFICATION?

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I AM NOT SEEING ANYMORE CLARIFYING  
7 QUESTIONS. SO, I THINK WE CAN MOVE ON.

8

9 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** OKAY. SO, ON THE NEXT SLIDE I WILL MOVE INTO  
10 OUR FINANCIAL DIMENSION. HERE WE ARE LOOKING AT TOTAL SUBSIDY  
11 REQUIRED WHICH WE DISCUSSED AT SOME LENGTH AS WELL AS COST  
12 EFFICIENCY COST PER NEW RIDER. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS  
13 STARTING WITH A DIFFERENT VIEW OF REQUIRED SUBSIDY FOR EACH OF  
14 THOSE OPTIONS. ONCE AGAIN, WE ARE TALKING ABOUT PRE-COVID FARE  
15 REVENUE AS A STARTING PLACE. WE HAVE ALREADY DISCUSSED TOTAL  
16 SUBSIDY LEVELS FOR EACH OPTIONS BUT I WILL JUST SAY HERE WE  
17 ARE TALKING ABOUT A BASE OF ABOUT A BILLION DOLLARS A FARE.  
18 JUST UNDER A BILLION IN PRE-COVID TERMS. WE HAVE GOT OPTIONS  
19 RANGING FROM 12-25 MILLION FOR LOWER SUBSIDY ALL THE WAY UP TO  
20 115 MILLION FOR HIGHEST SUBSIDY FULL INTEGRATION SCENARIO.  
21 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. HERE'S WHERE WE SHIFT TO COST EFFICIENCY  
22 USING COST PER NEW RIDER AS OUR METRIC. ONE THING I WANT TO  
23 EMPHASIZE, OUR ANALYSIS DOES SUGGEST THAT FARE INTEGRATION  
24 STRATEGIES ARE REASONABLY EFFICIENT GENERATORS OF RIDERSHIP  
25 COMPARED TO GLOBAL DISCOUNTS. THERE'S A SMALL PREMIUM FOR



September 10, 2021

1 INTEGRATION. AND THE OVERALL SUBSIDY LEVEL, ALSO EFFICIENT  
2 COMPARED TO THE OVERALL SUBSIDY LEVEL OF THE EXISTING TRANSIT  
3 SYSTEM OR COMBINED CAPITAL COST. GENERALLY OUR ANALYSIS  
4 SUPPORTS FARE INTEGRATION STRATEGIES BROADLY. THE MOST  
5 TARGETED OPTIONS HERE ON THE LEFT OF THIS GRAPHIC ARE THE MOST  
6 EFFICIENT IN THIS ANALYSIS. THE TARGETED OPTIONS TWO AND 3(A).  
7 COST EFFICIENCY TENDS TO DECREASE AS THE SCALE INTEGRATION  
8 DECREASES BECAUSE THE FARE IS ACROSS A WIDER POOL ACROSS FOR  
9 SOME THESE LIMITED RIDERSHIP. FARE DECREASE, SOME CUSTOMERS  
10 WHO SEE A FARE INCREASE THAT CAN BE PRICED OFF OF TRANSIT.  
11 MAYBE I WILL JUST PAUSE ON THE NEXT SLIDE WHICH KIND OF GIVES  
12 A SUMMARY OF THAT VIEW AND SEE IF THERE'S CLARIFYING  
13 QUESTIONS.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I MAY NOT BE THE ONLY PERSON WHO IS  
16 READING THIS AND DIGESTING THIS SO YOU WOULD WELCOME ANOTHER  
17 FEW SECONDS ON THIS.

18

19 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SURE. OF COURSE.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. AND I SEE THAT MEMBER STANKE HAS A  
22 HAND.

23





September 10, 2021

1 **BRIAN STANKE:** YEAH. CLARIFYING QUESTION. FOR THE OTHER SUBSIDY  
2 LEVELS OF OPTION SIX, DO YOU KNOW WHEN THOSE WOULD BE  
3 AVAILABLE?

4

5 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SOON. CERTAINLY BEFORE WE -- WE HAVE GOT OUR  
6 FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING IN TEN DAYS HERE. SO,  
7 BEFORE THAT.

8

9 **BRIAN STANKE:** BECAUSE IT IS HARD TO LOOK AT THESE FINANCIAL  
10 THINGS WHEN YOU ARE COMPARING APPLES, ORANGES AND, COMKWATS

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** A FEW CLARIFYING QUESTIONS AND WE WILL  
13 COMPANIES ON RECOMMENDATIONS. MEMBER GOTUACO.

14

15 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** THERE IS AN ASSUMPTION THERE WILL BE  
16 DIFFERENT PRICE TIERS FOR THIS PASS AT THE END OF THE DAY? IT  
17 IS NOT JUST ONE.

18

19 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. YES. LET'S SEE. I THINK THE SINGLE  
20 REPORTED METRIC HERE ON THE PASS IS A LITTLE MISLEADING. I  
21 WOULD ACTUALLY ASK YOU TO SET THAT ASIDE. I THINK BASED ON  
22 THIS CONVERSATION I WOULD PROBABLY PRESENT THAT A LITTLE  
23 DIFFERENTLY NEXT GO-ROUND. THERE'S SEVERAL DIFFERENT KINDS OF  
24 PASSES. WE TESTED, AS I SAID, BOTH FARE AND TRIP-BASED CAPS.  
25 WE THINK THAT THE LIKELIEST PERFORMANCE OF THE PUGET PASS



September 10, 2021

1 WOULD BE SIMILAR TO AN INDIVIDUAL RIDER LEVEL. VERY SIMILAR TO  
2 THE BROAD FARE CAPTION, SLIGHTLY MORE AGENCY FRIENDLY IN TERMS  
3 OF REVENUE. THE EXACT AMOUNT OF RIDERSHIP GENERATED, FRANKLY,  
4 IS HARD TO PIN DOWN AT THIS POINT. IT IS ONE OF THE REASONS  
5 OUR RECOMMENDATIONS REALLY EMPHASIZE A PILOT OF THE PASS  
6 PRODUCT

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS.

9

10 **ZACK DEUTSCH:** THANK YOU. WHAT IS THE COST OF THE RIDER IN THE  
11 STATUS QUO AND ARE EACH OF THESE THINGS IN ADDITION TO THAT  
12 COST PER RIDER OR IS THAT FACTORED IN?

13

14 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. COST PER INCREMENTAL NEW RIDER IS WHAT  
15 IS BEING REPORTED HERE. THE EXISTING SYSTEM SORT OF IF YOU USE  
16 NTD DATA TO DO TOTAL COST IS BETWEEN \$5 AND \$6 FOR BOTH RAIL  
17 AND BUS. OPERATING SUBSIDY PLUS CAPITAL COSTS. RAIL IS TILTED  
18 IN THE CAPITAL DIRECTION. BUS IN THE OPERATING DIRECTION.

19

20 **ZACK DEUTSCH:** SO, THIS IS TALKING ABOUT \$2 TO \$4 INCREASE IN  
21 ADDITION TO THAT?

22

23 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I WOULD SAY IT A LITTLE DIFFERENTLY. IF WE  
24 ADD NEW SUBSIDY INTO THE SYSTEM COORDINATED WITH FARE



September 10, 2021

1 INTEGRATION, HOW MANY NET NEW RIDERS -- HOW MANY NEW DOLLARS  
2 OF SUBSIDY DOES OUT COST FOR EACH NEW RIDER.

3

4 **ZACK DEUTSCH:** THANK YOU

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** MEMBER HEDGES.

7

8 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU, ADINA. JUST TO COMMENT BEFORE MY  
9 QUESTION, SEEMS TO ME WE NEED TO HIT A SWEET SPOT WITH ALL OF  
10 THESE DIFFERENT EXAMPLES TO GET THE MOST EQUITY AND GET THE  
11 OPERATORS TO AGREE BECAUSE THAT IS THE FINAL ANALYSIS. THE  
12 OPERATORS HAVE TO AGREE. THEY'RE NOT GOING TO AGREE TO  
13 SOMETHING THAT BANKRUPTS THEM. SO, WITH MY QUESTION ON THIS IS  
14 IT SEEMS TO ME THERE MAY NOT BE A LOT OF DIFFERENCE BETWEEN  
15 THE \$11 SUBSIDY AND THE \$115 SUBSIDY BECAUSE IT IS SHARED WITH  
16 FOR MORE AGENCIES. AM I RIGHT ON WITH THAT?

17

18 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** LET ME JUST CLARIFY WHAT IS BEING REPORTED  
19 HERE. THOSE ARE IN MILLIONS. THE OPTION TWO, DISCOUNTS ON  
20 LOCAL SERVICES ONLY FOR INTERAGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNTS \$11  
21 MILLION ANNUALLY ALL THE WAY UP TO \$115 MILLION ANNUALLY  
22 ACROSS THE WHOLE SYSTEM.

23



September 10, 2021

1 **RICHARD HEDGES:** RIGHT. IT SEEMS THE COST OF THE SUBSIDY WOULD  
2 FALL ON MULTIPLE AGENCIES. SO, PER AGENCY, IT MAY NOT BE ANY  
3 WORSE THAN THIS SUBSIDY ON THEIR BOTTOM LINE.

4

5 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I THINK THE WAY WE WOULD ENCOURAGE FOLKS TO  
6 THINK ABOUT IT NOW IS WHAT IS THE TOTAL -- HOW DO THESE COSTS  
7 AND BENEFITS RELATE TO THE WHOLE SYSTEM. THERE WOULD BE A LOT  
8 OF WORK TO DO ON REVENUE SHARING OR IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES  
9 AROUND REVENUE TO MAKE THESE THINGS WORK. BUT OVERALL THIS IS  
10 ABOUT A \$3 BILLION SYSTEM TO OPERATE. PRIOR TO COVID WE WERE  
11 RUNNING ABOUT A BILLION DOLLARS IN FARE REVENUE. I WOULD PUT  
12 THE NUMBERS IN THAT CONTEXT.

13

14 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I APPRECIATE WHAT YOU ARE SAYING. MOST OF THE  
15 OPERATORS ARE GOING TO LOOK AT WHAT IT COSTS THEM.

16

17 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** CERTAINLY.

18

19 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I WANT TO MAKE THIS HAPPEN IS WHY I AM TELLING  
20 YOU. I HAVE BEEN HERE WHEN WE WERE WORRYING ABOUT --  
21 [INDISCERNIBLE]. AND ONLY GOT BART TO IMPLEMENT IT. THANK YOU

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBER GRIFFITHS.

24



September 10, 2021

1 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THE RIDERSHIP MODELING, IS THERE ANYTHING THAT  
2 WAS USED IN THE MODEL PROCESS? I'M PRETTY SURE I KNOW THE  
3 ANSWER. BUT I WANT TO CLARIFY. DIDN'T JUST KIND OF USE THE  
4 MODEL OF BAY AREA IS LIKE THIS RIGHT NOW. LET'S PLAY WITH  
5 PRICES. LET'S PLAY WITH THESE THINGS AND LET'S MODEL IT. WAS  
6 THERE ANY COMPARISON TO REGIONS IN OTHER PLACES THAT HAVE  
7 OVERALL HIGHER RATES OF -- WHERE THESE SYSTEMS ARE IN PLACE  
8 AND WHERE THERE'S AN ASSOCIATED HIGHER RATE OF TRANSIT  
9 RIDERSHIP? AND THE REASON I AM ASKING IS I THINK THERE'S SOME  
10 THINGS THAT WOULD BE VERY HARD FOR A MODEL TO PICK UP ON, LIKE  
11 -- ESPECIALLY -- I THINK SOME OF THIS MIGHT COME OUT IN THE  
12 USER RESEARCH YOU DID. BUT THE SIMPLICITY OF A SYSTEM FOR THE  
13 USERS WOULD IDEALLY TRANSLATE INTO RIDERSHIP. BUT I WOULD  
14 QUESTION WHETHER THE MODEL IS ABLE TO PICK UP ON THAT OR  
15 ESTIMATE THAT. I AM PRETTY SURE THE RESPONSE IS GOING TO BE NO  
16 THAT IS NOT IN THIS MODEL.

17

18 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YOU'RE RIGHT. IT IS NOT IN THE MODEL. TO THE  
19 EXTENT THAT THERE'S RIDERSHIP GAIN FROM LEARNIBILITY,  
20 LEGIBILITY BENEFITS, IT IS ADDITIONAL TO OR EXTERNAL TO WHAT  
21 THE MODEL IS SHOWING.

22

23 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU.

24



September 10, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I WOULD SAY ON THAT -- WE WILL GET TO A  
2 LITTLE MORE ON USER RESEARCH. I GUESS WE ALREADY SUMMARIZED  
3 IT. BUT NOT TOTALLY -- I WOULDN'T CALL IT CONCLUSIVE FROM OUR  
4 USER RESEARCH. BUT CERTAINLY SOME USERS INDICATE A PREFERENCE  
5 FOR MORE STANDARDIZED OR HARMONIZE SYSTEMS.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I DON'T SEE  
8 ANYMORE HANDS. SO, IT WOULD BE GREAT TO MOVE ON.

9

10 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** OKAY. LET'S SEE. WHERE WERE WE HERE? NEXT  
11 SLIDE, PLEASE. FINALLY HERE ON OUR DELIVERABILITY DIMENSION,  
12 LOOKING FOR CHALLENGES, RISKS AND OPPORTUNITIES RELATED TO  
13 SYSTEM MANAGEMENT, TECHNOLOGY AND OPERATIONS INFRASTRUCTURE  
14 AND CHANGE MANAGEMENT FOR CUSTOMERS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO,  
15 WE HAVE GOT A LITTLE BIT OF DETAIL ON EACH OPTION IN THIS  
16 DECK. TO SORT OF GIVE THE OVERALL VIEW HERE IN OUR TIERS  
17 FRAMEWORK. MOST PASS AND CAP OPTIONS LOOK TO US TO BE PRETTY  
18 STRAIGHTFORWARD TO DELIVER IN THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM TO LAUNCH  
19 IN FALL 2023. WE HAVE ONE EXISTING AGENCY PASS OPTION THAT  
20 ALREADY EXISTS IN THE CLIPPER ONE SYSTEM AND THAT IS PLAN WE  
21 ARE PROPOSING TO USE AS A BASIS FOR THE PILOT WHICH WE WILL  
22 DISCUSS MORE IN A MOMENT. TIER TWO IN BLUE, TRANSFER DISCOUNTS  
23 IS READILY DELIVERABLE IN CLIPPER TWO. IN THE CLIPPER TWO  
24 SYSTEM -- CLIPPER ONE SYSTEM, WE HAVE THE ABILITY TO ADJUST  
25 BUT NOT EASILY ADD NEW DISCOUNTS. WE THINK VERSIONS OF TIERS



September 10, 2021

1 ONE AND TWO COULD BE IMPLEMENTED WITHIN THE EXISTING  
2 INSTITUTIONAL AND MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE FOR TRANSFERS IN OUR  
3 REGION. WE COULD DO SO GOVERNED BY BROAD INTERAGENCY MOUS AND  
4 EXECUTED BY AGENCY STAFF. SIMILAR ARRANGEMENTS EXIST IN TIER  
5 REGIONS IN THIS COUNTRY. TIER THREE INTEGRATION, THAT IS  
6 STANDARDIZED FARES FOR REGIONAL SERVICES WOULD REQUIRE CHANGES  
7 TO THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM BEYOND WHAT IS CURRENTLY SPECKED.  
8 BUT MORE SIGNIFICANTLY CLOSER INTEGRATION OF MANAGEMENT  
9 BETWEEN REGIONAL OPERATORS. INCLUDING ADJUSTMENTS TO OR  
10 DELEGATION OF FARE SETTING AUTHORITY BY AGENCY BOARDS. WE  
11 WOULD NEED SOME ADJUSTMENTS TO INFRASTRUCTURE EQUIPMENT FOR  
12 SERVICES THAT SWITCHED FROM FARE -- DISTANCE-BASED FARES TO  
13 ZONE OR VICE VERSA. REGIONAL BUSES WOULD REQUIRE TAG ON, TAG  
14 OFF CAPABILITY. FINALLY, TIER FOUR SIMILAR SET OF CHALLENGES  
15 APPLY ACROSS ALL AGENCIES. THAT IS MUCH MORE EXPANSIVE  
16 IMPLEMENTATION EFFORT. ALSO THERE A LARGER NUMBER OF EXISTING  
17 TRANSIT CUSTOMERS WOULD REQUIRE CHANGE MANAGEMENT SUPPORT.  
18 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I GUESS ACTUALLY I AM GOING TO PASS IT  
19 BACK TO BILL. THIS IS JUST A SUMMARY OF OUR -- WHAT I JUST  
20 DESCRIBED. BUT I WILL OPEN IT UP AND SEE IF ANYONE HAS  
21 CLARIFICATIONS.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I AM NOT SEEING ANY HANDS.

24

25 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** BILL, TAKE IT AWAY.



September 10, 2021

1  
2 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU. WE COULD GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT  
3 SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS NEXT SECTION IS GOING TO TRY TO WALK  
4 THROUGH A BUSINESS CASE LENS OF EACH OF THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS  
5 AND TALK A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT WHAT WE ANALYZED AND SOME OF  
6 THE SEE PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES WHEN VIEWED THROUGH THE BUSINESS  
7 CASE LENS. I WILL RIGHT OFF THE BAT, THOUGH, SAY THE ECONOMIC  
8 PORTION OF THE ANALYSIS, WHICH IS REALLY FOCUSED ON PRESENT  
9 VALUE SORT OF COST BENEFIT CALCULATION IS STILL BEING REFINED  
10 BY THE CONSULTANT TEAM. SO, YOU WON'T SEE THE RESULTS OF THAT  
11 YET. BUT WE ARE WORKING AS FAST AS WE CAN TO TRY TO GET THAT  
12 FINALIZED. WE CAN GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS FIRST ONE  
13 TALKS ABOUT OPTION ONE WHICH IS WITHIN TIER ONE. THESE ARE THE  
14 PASSES AND CAPS. AS THE CONVERSATION WAS GETTING AT JUST A FEW  
15 MINUTES AGO, THERE ARE A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT PASSES AND CAPS  
16 THAT WE HAVE ACTUALLY ANALYZED. CAPS AND PASSES THEMSELVES ARE  
17 QUITE DIFFERENT IN TERMS OF HOW THEY ARE STRUCTURED. IS IT A  
18 TRIP BASED CAP OR A PRICE-BASED CAP? IS IT A TIERED PASS?  
19 THERE ARE DIFFERENT STRUCTURES FOR EACH OF THESE. WHAT IS  
20 SHOWN HERE IS SIMPLIFICATION BECAUSE THERE'S A LOT OF  
21 DIFFERENT VARIABLES AND WE ARE STILL WORKING TO FIGURE OUT HOW  
22 BEST TO COMMUNICATE THIS INFORMATION, I THINK. BUT I THINK THE  
23 KEY MAIN TAKE-AWAYS HERE IS THAT BASED ON ALL OF THE MODELING  
24 FOR THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS WE ARE TALKING ABOUT PROBABLY KNIT  
25 RANGE OF 25,000 NEW DAILY TRIPS FROM OFFERING SOME TYPE OF A





September 10, 2021

1 PASS PRODUCT. IT'S A LITTLE BIT HARDER TO KNOW I THINK FROM A  
2 CAP BECAUSE IT IS GOING TO IMPACT PEOPLE'S BEHAVIOR IN A  
3 VARIETY OF DIFFERENT WAYS DEPENDING ON IF IT IS A TRIP-BASED  
4 CAP OR PRICE-BASED CAP. BUT I THINK IT IS SAFE TO ASSUME WE  
5 ARE IN THAT BALL PARK OF AROUND 25,000 NEW TRIPS PER DAY. AND  
6 THE FINANCIAL QUADRANT HERE ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE YOU COULD  
7 SEE ESTIMATES FOR WHAT IT MIGHT COST IN TERMS OF NEW SUBSIDY  
8 TO THE SYSTEM TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER A CAP. YOU COULD SEE OUR  
9 THINKING IS AROUND \$40 MILLION FOR A PUGET PASS TYPE TIERED  
10 PASS. THIS WOULD BE AVAILABLE AGAIN TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC. IF  
11 WE HAD A TRIP-BASED CAP, AGAIN IT DEPENDS ON WHERE YOU SET THE  
12 PRICE. IT IS VERY VARIABLE IN TERMS OF THE SUBSIDY NEEDED. IT  
13 COULD BE UP TO \$80 MILLION. IT COULD BE LOWER. AND THEN IF WE  
14 ARE TALKING ABOUT JUST A MORE EQUITY FOCUSED CAP AND THIS IS  
15 SOMETHING WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE IN THE  
16 PAST. IF WE WERE TO OFFER CLIPPER START CARD HOLDERS A FARE  
17 CAP THAT WOULD COVER THE ENTIRE BAY AREA, WE THINK THAT IS  
18 SOMETHING ACHIEVABLE. DELIVERING A CAP OR PASS THE RELATIVELY  
19 STRAIGHTFORWARD. IT IS LAYERED -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES].  
20 CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM WILL MAKE THE DELIVERY OF A CAP VERY  
21 STRAIGHTFORWARD. RIGHT NOW IT WOULD BE VERY CHALLENGING TO DO  
22 THAT IN CLIPPER ONE. PASS PRODUCTS TO SOME EXTENT ARE  
23 DELIVERABLE RIGHT NOW IN THE CURRENT CLIPPER SYSTEM WHICH GETS  
24 AT WE THINK IT IS IMPORTANT TO MOVE FORWARD WITH A  
25 DEMONSTRATION OR PILOT WITH A PASS PRODUCT SO WE COULD



September 10, 2021

1 IMPLEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THIS PROJECT WITHIN OUR  
2 EXISTING TECHNOLOGY CAPACITY TO BEGIN TO ALSO GET A BETTER  
3 SENSE OF HOW USERS ACTUALLY REACT TO HAVING A PASS PRODUCT. I  
4 THINK THAT REALLY WILL INFORM THE WORK AS WE MOVE FORWARD OVER  
5 THE COMING MONTHS AND YEARS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT'S THE RIGHT  
6 BALANCE IN TERMS OF PRICE AND SUBSIDY IN TERMS OF OR A PASS OR  
7 A CAP. WHAT TYPE OF STRUCTURE WE WANT TO PURSUE WITHIN A CAP  
8 OR A PASS OFFERING. WE CAN GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THE  
9 SLIDE IS REALLY NOW FOCUSING ON WHAT FITS WITHIN TIER TWO. SO,  
10 THESE ARE OPTIONS TWO AND 3(A). YOU CAN SEE WHAT WE TESTED.  
11 OPTION TWO, THIS REPRESENTS A FULL DISCOUNT FOR ALL LOCAL TO  
12 LOCAL TRANSFERS. AND THEN OPTION 3(A) IS A FULL DISCOUNT FOR  
13 ALL LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRIPS. I'M SORRY. LOCAL TO REGIONAL  
14 TRANSFERS. THIS AGAIN SPEAKS TO SOMETHING WE WERE TALKING  
15 ABOUT EARLIER DURING THIS MEETING WHICH WAS IF YOU WERE MAKING  
16 A TRANSFER FROM SAMTRANS TO CALTRAIN THAT COULD BE CREDITED TO  
17 YOU. YOU WOULD BE GETTING THE DISCOUNT, THE \$2.25. IF YOU LOOK  
18 AT THE BENEFITS, THEY ARE PRETTY SIGNIFICANT. IF YOU SEE  
19 OPTION TWO WHICH REQUIRES RELATIVELY SMALL SUBSIDY, ONLY ABOUT  
20 11 TO \$12 MILLION ANNUALLY, YOU WOULD GET BETWEEN 11 AND  
21 12,000 NEW TRIPS PER DAY. AND OPTION THREE WHERE AGAIN YOU ARE  
22 PROVIDING BOTH LOCAL TO LOCAL AND LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRANSFERS  
23 AND DISCOUNTS, YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT UPWARDS OF 25,000 NEW  
24 TRIPS PER DAY. FROM AN EQUITY PERSPECTIVE, THERE ARE LIKELY TO  
25 BE PRETTY MEANINGFUL SAVINGS FOR EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATIONS.



September 10, 2021

1 ALTHOUGH IT IS WORTHWHILE NOTING THERE COULD BE SOME  
2 ADDITIONAL SUBSIDY TO HIRE INCOME RIDERS. THOSE WOULD BE  
3 RECIPIENTS OF THE TOTAL NEW SUBSIDY THAT WOULD BE REQUIRED.  
4 YOU LOOK AT THAT FINANCIAL BOX TO THE RIGHT AT THE BOTTOM. YOU  
5 WILL SEE AGAIN THE COST PER NEW RIDER OF OPTION TWO AND THREE  
6 IS RELATIVELY LOW. ESPECIALLY IF YOU LOOK AT OPTION THREE. 25  
7 CENTS PER RIDER. THIS TIES BACK TO SOME OF THE CONTENT MIKE  
8 WAS SPEAKING ABOUT A FEW MOMENTS AGO. OPTION TWO AND THREE  
9 FROM A RIDER PERSPECTIVE ARE QUITE HIGH PERFORMING. I WILL  
10 NOTE WE KNOW FROM PRE-COVID RIDERSHIP THAT THERE'S REALLY  
11 STRONG DEMAND FOR LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRANSFERS. THE MAJORITY OF  
12 INTERAGENCY TRANSFERS IN OUR REGION INVOLVES THOSE TYPES OF  
13 TRIPS. CUSTOMERS TRANSFERRING FROM A LOCAL SERVICE TO AND FROM  
14 BART, FROM A LOCAL TO AND FROM FERRIES OR CALTRAIN. THOSE  
15 TYPES OF TRANSFERS REALLY ARE THE CORE OF THESE EXISTING OR  
16 PRE-PANDEMIC INTERAGENCY PATTERNS. SO, IF WE ARE TRYING TO  
17 TARGET OUR WORK AND OUR FARE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS TO BENEFIT  
18 A REALLY SIGNIFICANT SEGMENT OF RIDERSHIP, THIS IS THE AREA  
19 THAT IS WORTHWHILE -- [INDISCERNIBLE].

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I WANT TO QUICKLY JUMP IN AND CONFIRM THAT  
22 I UNDERSTAND. I THINK ANOTHER PERSON ASKED THIS QUESTION. I  
23 WANT TO MAKE SURE I UNDERSTAND IT. SO THIS \$2.84 IS -- SO, IF  
24 YOU WERE GOING TO EXTEND THE LINE, IT WOULD BE MORE \$5 TO 69



September 10, 2021

1 PER NEW RIDER AND IF YOU WERE IMPLEMENTING -- AM I  
2 UNDERSTANDING THAT CORRECTLY?

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I WILL JUMP IN.

5

6 **WILLIAM BACON:** GO AHEAD, MIKE.

7

8 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** TO CLARIFY THE EARLIER COMMENTS. THE FIVE OR  
9 \$6 FIGURE WAS TAKING THE TOTAL COST OF THE SYSTEM AS EXPRESSED  
10 IN NTD AND DIVIDING IT BY THE TOTAL NUMBER OF RIDERS. SO, BIG  
11 PICTURE, THAT'S WHAT THAT FIGURE WAS. IN TERMS OF LIKE  
12 EXTENSIONS OF THE SYSTEM, IF YOU LOOK AT PLAN BAY AREA,  
13 THERE'S JUST A VERY WIDE RANGE OF COSTS INVOLVED IN THE VERSUS  
14 KIND OF PROPOSED PROJECTS. WE HAVE SOME DIFFERENT SNAPSHOTS WE  
15 ARE GOING TO SHOW WHAT THE CATEGORIES ARE. BIG PICTURE THESE  
16 MORE EFFICIENT FARE INTEGRATION PROPOSALS ARE TOWARDS THE  
17 BOTTOM OF THE SCALE THERE NEVER COST PER NEW RIDER. HIGH  
18 PERFORMING

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** LOW COST HIGH PERFORMING. THANK YOU.

21

22 **WILLIAM BACON:** I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT THESE  
23 OPTIONS TWO AND 3(A) HERE AS SOMETHING THAT, AGAIN, FITS  
24 WITHIN OUR EXISTING FARE POLICY MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE. SO,  
25 AGENCIES WOULD BE ABLE TO CONTINUE TO SET THEIR OWN FARES AND



September 10, 2021

1 HAVE THEIR OWN PRICE LEVELS. BUT THERE WOULD BE SOME FRAMEWORK  
2 AND WE NOTE ON THIS SLIDE A MULTI-AGENCY MOU OR SOME TYPE OF  
3 AGREEMENT THAT WOULD SET THESE FREE TRANSFERS FOR LOCAL  
4 SERVICES AND THE LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRANSFER DISCOUNT THAT YOU  
5 WOULD RECEIVE AND VICE VERSA. REGIONAL TO REGIONAL REGIONAL TO  
6 LOCAL. BUT IT DOESN'T NECESSARILY REQUIRE A SIGNIFICANT CHANGE  
7 IN HOW FARE POLICY IS SET IN THE REGION. IT IS ALSO READILY  
8 DELIVERABLE WITHIN THE CLIPPER TWO FRAMEWORK THAT WILL BE  
9 AVAILABLE IN 2023. WE CAN GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. NOW WE  
10 ARE LOOKING AT TIER THREE WHICH GETS AGAIN TO BRINGING ALL OF  
11 THE REGIONAL SERVICES WITHIN SOME TYPE OF COMMON FARE  
12 STRUCTURE. AND AGAIN, THESE ARE SORTED ADDED AND BUILDING.  
13 WHILE MAINTAINING THE LOCAL TO LOCAL TRANSFERS WE TALKED ABOUT  
14 IN THE EARLIER TIERS. WHAT WE TESTED SPECIFICALLY AGAIN WAS A  
15 FREE LOCAL TO LOCAL TRANSFER. LOCAL TRIPS PAYING ONE FARE  
16 REGARDLESS OF THE AGENCIES. SAME THING AGAIN APPLYING FOR  
17 LOCAL TO REGIONAL SERVICES. BUT NOW REGIONAL SERVICES, BART,  
18 CALTRAIN, FERRIES, EXPRESS BUS SERVICES ARE ALL BROUGHT INTO A  
19 SINGLE EITHER DISTANCE-BASED OR ZONE STRUCTURE. WE TESTED A  
20 BART TYPE DISTANCE-BASED STRUCTURE FOR ALL SERVICES. BUT IN  
21 ESSENCE A ZONE-BASED SYSTEM OR DISTANCE-BASED SYSTEM FROM A  
22 FINANCIAL PERFORM STANDPOINT IS SIMILAR. IT IS MORE USER  
23 EXPERIENCE AND COMMUNICATION PERSPECTIVE WHERE THERE'S  
24 DIFFERENCES. IF YOU LOOK AT THE PERFORMANCE AND IMPACT OF  
25 THIS, IT IS AGAIN RELATIVELY HIGH PERFORMING. IT IS PERHAPS A



September 10, 2021

1 LITTLE BIT MORE EXPENSIVE IN THE SENSE OF THE TOTAL SUBSIDY  
2 REQUIRED ON AN ANNUAL BASIS. ABOUT 70 MILLION PER YEAR. BUT IN  
3 TERMS OF THE NUMBER OF NEW TRIPS IT IS A RELATIVELY  
4 SIGNIFICANT NUMBER. A LITTLE LESS THAN 70,000 TRIPS PER DAY.  
5 THIS IS A LARGE AMOUNT OF NEW SUBSIDY. UP TO \$70 MILLION A  
6 YEAR. SO, WHILE ALL RIDERS WOULD BENEFIT TO SOME EXTENT FROM  
7 THE KNEW REGIONAL FARE STRUCTURE, THERE'S THE POTENTIAL THAT  
8 SOME LOWER INCOME RIDERS MIGHT SEE THEIR FARES INCREASE TO  
9 FACILITATE THAT REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION. IF ALL OF THOSE  
10 REGIONAL SERVICES WERE ON A COMMON DISTANCE-BASED FARE  
11 STRUCTURE OR A ZONE-BASED STRUCTURE, SOME INDIVIDUALS MIGHT  
12 SEE THEIR FARE GO UP TO ALLOW IT TO ALL COME INTO ONE  
13 STRUCTURE. THAT IS SOMETHING THAT IS IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT.  
14 WHERE WE MOVE THE FARE STRUCTURE INTO A NEW SYSTEM. SOME  
15 CUSTOMERS HAVE TO SEE THEIR FARES GO UP AND SOME HAVE TO SEE  
16 THEIR FARES GO DOWN IF YOU CREATE A STANDARD STRUCTURE IN MOST  
17 SUBSTANCES WITH THE LEVEL OF SUBSIDY THAT IS WITHIN THE  
18 FINANCIAL CAPACITY WE LIKELY HAVE. SOME KEY THINGS AGAIN TO  
19 NOTE HERE ABOUT WHAT WE LEARNED FROM ANALYZING THIS OPTION IS  
20 IT DOES HAVE A SIGNIFICANT ABILITY TO GROW OUR RIDERSHIP ABOVE  
21 WHAT WE TALKED ABOUT IN TIER TWO. TIER THREE WHERE WE ARE  
22 HERE, REALLY IS PROBABLY WORTHWHILE EXAMINING MORE AND  
23 THINKING SERIOUSLY ABOUT OPPORTUNITY THAT -- IF WE WERE TO  
24 IMPLEMENT A TIER THREE FRAMEWORK, WHAT THAT COULD REALLY DO  
25 FOR RIDERSHIP AND WHAT THAT COULD MEAN FOR CUSTOMERS. FROM OUR



September 10, 2021

1 USER RESEARCH, CUSTOMERS IDENTIFIED A TIER THREE OPTION AS  
2 GENERALLY BEING FAIR AND REFLECTS THE VALUE OF THE TRIPS THEY  
3 WERE TAKING. AND IS GENERALLY RELATIVELY SIMPLE TO UNDERSTAND.  
4 I THINK THE BIGGEST SORT OF QUESTION MARK AND THING TO REALLY  
5 THINK ABOUT HERE ALONG WITH THE NEW SUBSIDY WOULD BE REQUIRED  
6 ARE THE DELIVERY REQUIREMENTS IN TERMS OF CHANGES OUR  
7 STRUCTURE, FARE POLICY GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT. RIGHT NOW  
8 ALL THESE REGIONAL AGENCIES HAVE THEIR OWN FARE STRUCTURES AND  
9 OWN FARE POLICIES. IF WE WERE TO MOVE INTO TIER THREE THAT  
10 WOULD REQUIRE NEW AGREEMENTS OR STRUCTURE TO ALLOW THOSE  
11 REGIONAL AGENCIES TO TRANSITION INTO A COMMON STRUCTURE. MOST  
12 OF THE TECHNOLOGY ON CONSIDERATIONS WITH DEPLOYING TIER THREE  
13 WOULD BE MET THROUGH THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM. BUT  
14 THERE ARE LIKELY SOME ADDITIONAL TECHNOLOGY COSTS WE WOULD  
15 LIKELY NEED NEW ADDITIONAL CLIPPER READERS. I THINK MIKE  
16 MENTIONED EARLIER REGIONAL EXPRESS BUS SERVICES WOULD LIKELY  
17 NEED A TAG ON TAG OFF CAPACITY ON ALL OF THOSE SERVICES. THERE  
18 ARE SOME CONSIDERATIONS THERE AS WELL. AND IT WOULD REQUIRE  
19 FOLKS WHO ARE TRAVELING ON REGIONAL SERVICES TO LEARN A NEW  
20 STRUCTURE IN THAT TRANSITION. I DON'T KNOW IF I SEE THERE'S A  
21 HAND RAISED IF THERE'S A CLARIFYING QUESTION ABOUT THE SLIDE,  
22 I COULD STOP AND ANSWER THAT OR I COULD CONTINUE FORWARD. GO  
23 AHEAD.  
24



September 10, 2021

1 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** SORRY. I DO. I WAS GOING TO ASK DOES  
2 REGIONAL IMPLY TRAINS AND LOCAL IMPLY BUSES OR NOT REALLY?  
3 BECAUSE IF NOT, I FEEL LIKE IT WILL BE CONFUSING FOR  
4 PASSENGERS TO UNDERSTAND IF THEY ARE ON A REGIONAL OR LOCAL.

5

6 **WILLIAM BACON:** VERY GOOD QUESTION. AND I THINK THIS IS  
7 SOMETHING THE TRANSIT OPERATIONERS HAVE REALIZED OVER THE  
8 PANDEMIC. IT IS NOT CLEAR TO USERS. FOR THE PURPOSES OF OUR  
9 STUDY, WE USED A FRAMEWORK THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATIONERS  
10 DEVELOPED OVER THE LAST YEAR THAT CLASSIFIES LOCAL SERVICES  
11 AND REGIONAL SERVICES AND WHAT IS ONE AND WHAT IS THE OTHER.  
12 BUT YOU'RE ABSOLUTELY RIGHT. USERS TODAY DON'T HAVE A GOOD  
13 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT THAT MEANS.

14

15 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** THAT FRAMEWORK IS BASED ON THE PRE-EXISTING  
16 SYSTEM OF FARES, RIGHT?

17

18 **WILLIAM BACON:** YEAH. IT IS NOT FARES. IT IS BASED ON THE  
19 SERVICES. AND TO REALLY ANSWER YOUR QUESTION, WHAT A LOCAL  
20 TRIP IS CONSIDERED IN OUR ANALYSIS ARE ESSENTIALLY ALL OF THE  
21 LOCAL BUS SERVICES THAT ARE OPERATED BY MOST OF TRANSIT  
22 OPERATORS.. THESE ARE SERVICES WITHIN A SINGLE SERVICE AREA.  
23 THEY ARE GENERALLY NOT CROSSING COUNTY LINES. REALLY A FLAT  
24 FARE FOR MOST OPERATORS. THESE ARE YOUR AC TRANSIT OR VTA  
25 TRIPS. IF YOU ARE ON MUNI OR VTA, IT IS LIGHT RAIL.





September 10, 2021

1

2 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** SO LIKE THE GOLDEN GATE BUSES WOULD BE --

3

4 **WILLIAM BACON:** THAT IS A GOOD QUESTION. THERE ARE SERVICES  
5 CONFUSING AND THIS IS ONE OF THE TECHNOLOGY CHALLENGES WE HAD  
6 TO THINK ABOUT. GOLDEN GATE OPERATES SERVICES IN MULTIPLE  
7 COUNTIES. SOMETIMES THOSE SERVICES FUNCTION AS A LOCAL SERVICE  
8 WITHIN A SINGLE COUNTY. AC TRANSIT IS SIMILAR. TAKE THE NL,  
9 FOR EXAMPLE, IN OAKLAND, PEOPLE RIDE IT AS A LOCAL BUS. BUT  
10 YOU COULD STAY ON AND GO TO THE TRANSBAY TERMINAL IN SAN  
11 FRANCISCO. HOW DO YOU COMMUNICATE TO CUSTOMERS THAT THOSE  
12 TYPES OF SERVICES WOULD SORT OF BE BOTH REGIONAL AND LOCAL?  
13 THESE ARE SOME OF THE NITTY-GRITTY IMPLEMENTATION QUESTIONS  
14 YOU HAVE TO GET AT THE YOU TRY TO DEPLOY A TIER THREE OPTION.  
15 AND I DON'T THINK WE HAVE THE ANSWER TO EVERY SINGLE UNIQUE  
16 CIRCUMSTANCE RIGHT NOW THAT EXISTS. BUT I DON'T THINK IT IS SO  
17 WIDESPREAD THAT IT IS IMPOSSIBLE TO OVERCOME. THERE AREN'T A  
18 HUNDRED DIFFERENT THINGS THAT FIT IN THAT CATEGORY. IT IS A  
19 RELATIVELY MANAGEABLE NUMBER OF CHALLENGES AND SERVICES THAT  
20 EXIST NOW THAT WE COULD TACKLE. MIKE, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU HAVE  
21 ANYTHING TO ADD.

22

23 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I WAS THROWING A PERSONAL GUESS. IF WE WERE  
24 GOING TO DO THIS, IF OUR SYSTEM OVER THE YEARS PROGRESSED IN  
25 THIS DIRECTION, LONGER TERM, LET'S SEE HOW WE DO



September 10, 2021

1 RECOMMENDATION IN OUR FRAMEWORK, THAT IT WOULD START WITH RAIL  
2 FIRST BECAUSE -- AND THEN THE EXPRESS BUS ISSUES ARE  
3 DIFFERENT. THEN IT WOULD PROBABLY EXPAND OUTWARD FROM THERE.  
4 BUT THAT'S JUST REALLY A GUESS.

5

6 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** CAN I ASK ONE MORE QUESTION WHICH IS HOW  
7 MANY RIDERS PARTICIPATED IN THE USER RESEARCH? BECAUSE I FEEL  
8 LIKE THE LONG DISTANCE TRAVELER SAYING THEY FEEL LIKE IT IS  
9 WORTH THEIR TIME OR MONEY PAYING MORE IS KIND OF COUNTER TO  
10 WHAT HAS COME OUT OF THE EQUITY DISCUSSIONS ON THE POLICY  
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL IN TERMS OF PEOPLE GETTING PUSHED OUT INTO  
12 LONGER COMMUTES. RIGHT NOW I THINK IN OUR SYSTEM PEOPLE HAVE  
13 DIFFERENT OPTIONS OF MODES THAT THEY CAN TAKE. IF THEY ARE  
14 WILLING TO TAKE MORE TIME, THEY COULD STILL PAY A LOWER FARE.  
15 BUT IF THERE'S ONLY ONE REGIONAL DISTANCE BASED, EVERYONE  
16 DISTANCE WISE WOULD HAVE TO PAY THE SAME AMOUNT.

17

18 **WILLIAM BACON:** THERE IT WOULD BE TWO PRICE STRUCTURES. FERRY  
19 OR BUSES. TAKE A LOCAL BUS. AN EXAMPLE WOULD BE IN THE EAST  
20 BAY IF YOU WERE TRAVELING FROM OAKLAND TO FREMONT, YOU COULD  
21 TAKE BART OR TRANSIT. THEY ARE RUNNING PARALLEL. THEY WOULD  
22 STILL HAVE THREE FARE STRUCTURES IN OPTION THREE. CONCEIVABLY  
23 THE LOCAL BUS FARE MIGHT BE LESS EXPENSIVE THAN THE NEW COMMON  
24 REGIONAL DISTANCE-BASED FARE THAT WOULD APPLY IN OPTION THREE  
25 OR REGIONAL ZONE STRUCTURE. THERE COULD STILL BE TWO DIFFERENT



September 10, 2021

1 ONES. THAT WAS PART OF YOUR QUESTION. I THINK THE OTHER PART  
2 OF YOUR QUESTION WAS HOW MANY USER PARTICIPANTS DID WE HAVE. I  
3 SHOULD KNOW THE ANSWER. BUT I BELIEVE SAY IT IS PROBABLY IN  
4 THE LOW HUNDREDS PLUS PEOPLE WHO WE HAVE ENGAGED WITH OVER THE  
5 COURSE OF THE PROJECT. WE HAD A FOCUS GROUP A COUPLE OF NIGHTS  
6 AGO. IT IS SOMETHING WE ARE STILL CONTINUING TO TEST AND  
7 ENGAGE THESE PROPOSALS AND CONCEPT WITH RIGHT NOW. I CAN'T  
8 TELL YOU A SPECIFIC NUMBER. I DON'T ACTUALLY KNOW IF WE EVEN  
9 HAVE THAT NUMBER READILY AVAILABLE. WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT  
10 SLIDE. THIS SLIDE AND A COUPLE OF HERE'S WILL FOCUS ON OPTION  
11 FOUR. THIS AGAIN IS THE OPTION THAT REQUIRES THE MOST  
12 SIGNIFICANT CHANGE. FOR THE FIRST OPTION WE ARE TALKING ABOUT  
13 IS OPTION FOUR IN TIER FOUR. THE MOST SIGNIFICANT CHANGE TO  
14 BOOST REGIONAL AND LOCAL FARES. AND IN OPTION FOUR WE LOOK AT  
15 A FARE BY DISTANCE STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES, SIMILAR TO  
16 WHAT WE WERE JUST TALKING ABOUT IN OPTION THREE. THIS COULD  
17 BRING ALL THE LOCAL BUSES AND RAIL INTO A SINGLE PRICE. WE  
18 WOULD BE MERGING THE NINE DIFFERENT LOCAL FARES THAT EXIST  
19 ACROSS OUR OPERATORS INTO ONE FARE. SOME AGENCIES WOULD SEE  
20 THEIR PRICES COME UP LIKELY. AND SOME WOULD SEE THEIR FARE  
21 PRICES COME DOWN, LOCAL FARES. AS A RESULT OF THAT, YOU WOULD  
22 HAVE FREE TRANSFERS BETWEEN SERVICES BECAUSE THERE WOULD ONLY  
23 BE ONE LOCAL FARE. THE SUBSIDY IS RELATIVELY CLOSE. IT IS  
24 ABOUT \$75 MILLION PER YEAR. THE COST PER NEW RIDER DOESN'T  
25 PERFORM AS WELL [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]. PER NEW RIDER. I THINK



September 10, 2021

1 ONE OF THE BIGGEST CONCERNS IS THE EQUITY NUMBER OF RIDERS AND  
2 -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] IT IS LIKELY SOME RIDERS WITH LOWER  
3 INCOMES WOULD SEE THEIR FARES INCREASE FOR LOCAL TRANSIT TRIPS  
4 TO ACHIEVE THAT REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION. SOME OF OUR LARGEST  
5 TRANSIT OPERATORS, MUNI, VTA HAVE SOME OF THE HIGHEST LOCAL  
6 FARES AND A NUMBER OF OUR SMALLER BUS OPERATORS HAVE  
7 SIGNIFICANTLY LOWER FARES. WE WILL LIKELY TO TO INCREASE THE  
8 LOCAL FARES IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE STANDARDIZATION OF LOCAL  
9 FARES. AND THAT PRESENTS A LOT OF CHALLENGING QUESTIONS ABOUT  
10 WHAT'S EQUITABLE AND WHAT THAT MEANS FOR THOSE LOCAL  
11 COMMUNITIES. AND IS A SIGNIFICANT HURDLE LIKELY FOR  
12 IMPLEMENTATION IF WE WANTED TO BRING ALL THE OPERATORS INTO  
13 ONE SYSTEM. YOU COULD SET ASIDE SOME OPERATORS AND SAY WE ARE  
14 NOT GOING TO INCLUDE THEM. BUT FOR THE PURPOSES OF THIS  
15 ANALYSIS, WE ARE TALKING ABOUT THE WHOLE BAY AREA AND ALL OF  
16 OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS. SO, THAT IS AN IMPORTANT THING TO  
17 CONSIDER HERE. THIS ALSO DOVETAILS INTO THE QUESTION OF FARE  
18 POLICY MANAGEMENT IN GOVERNANCE WHERE IN OPTION 3(B) YOU HAVE  
19 RELATIVELY LIMITED NUMBER OF AGENCIES THAT HAVE TO RESTRUCTURE  
20 THEIR FARE POLICY. HERE WE HAVE ALL TWO DOZEN WHO WOULD BE  
21 COMPACTED IN TERMS OF HOW THEY SET THEIR FARE POLICY AND HOW  
22 THEIR INDIVIDUAL AGENCY BOARDS WOULD HAVE TO CHANGE HOW THEIR  
23 AUTHORITY TO SET FARES. WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AGAIN,  
24 THERE ARE SEVERAL SLIDES HERE THAT TALK ABOUT TIER FOUR. I  
25 WILL KIND OF GO THROUGH THESE RELATIVELY QUICKLY. THIS OPTION



September 10, 2021

1 LOOKS AT ZONES FOR ALL SERVICE AND I THINK THIS IS SOMEWHAT  
2 COMPARABLE TO WHAT BAY AREA PUT FORWARD. YOU CAN SEE THERE A  
3 SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF ZONES. ASSUMED IN THE ZONAL MAP WE USED.  
4 FARES INCREASE BASED ON THE NUMBER OF ZONES THAT YOU TRAVEL  
5 THROUGH. AND THAT THERE'S A COMMON ADDITIONAL FARE FOR TRAVEL  
6 ACROSS ZONES FOR ALL DIFFERENT MODES. WE TESTED A VARIETY OF  
7 DIFFERENT SUBSIDY LEVELS AND YOU CAN SEE THE POTENTIAL  
8 RIDERSHIP GAINS OR IN THE LIST SUBSIDY LEVEL, ACTUALLY A LOSS  
9 OF TRIPS THAT WERE MODELED. YOU CAN SEE THIS DOES GENERATE A  
10 LOT OF NEW TRIPS AT A HIGHER LEVEL OF SUBSIDY. THE HUNDRED  
11 MILLION DOLLARS A YEAR WOULD GENERATE AROUND 75,000 NEW TRIPS  
12 PER DAY. AND YOU CAN SEE THAT THE LEVEL -- AS THE LEVEL OF  
13 SUBSIDY DECLINES, THE LEVEL OF TRIPS PROJECTED DECREASES.  
14 AGAIN, IF YOU LOOK AT THE COST PER RIDER -- SORRY, COST PER  
15 NEW RIDER AS THE METRIC TO THINK ABOUT THE FINANCIAL IMPACTS,  
16 AGAIN, IT'S -- MAY BE A MODERATE PERFORMER AT THE 10% LEVEL  
17 AND RELATIVELY EXPENSIVE PER NEW TRIP AS YOU WORK DOWN THE  
18 AMOUNT OF SUBSIDY THAT WILL BE AVAILABLE. THE DELIVERY IMPACTS  
19 ARE QUITE SIMILAR TO WHAT WE JUST TALKED ABOUT ON THE LAST  
20 SLIDE. THIS TOUCHES ALL AGENCY. EVERY AGENCY WOULD HAVE TO  
21 RESTRUCTURE THEIR FARE POLICY. WE CAN GO ON ONE MORE SLIDE. I  
22 HAVE TO NOTE I THINK THERE'S AN ERROR HERE IN THE FIRST  
23 BULLET. I'M SORRY ABOUT THAT. THE NUMBER OF ZONES THAT WERE  
24 TESTED IS NOT 81 ZONES HERE. THESE ARE -- IN OPTION SIX, WE  
25 ARE LOOKING AT LARGE ZONES JUST FOR THE REGIONAL TRANSIT



September 10, 2021

1 SYSTEM AND THEN A LOCAL FLAT FARE SIMILAR TO WHAT WE SAW TWO  
2 SLIDES AGO. SO, HERE THE REGIONAL SERVICES, INSTEAD OF HAVING  
3 FARE BY DISTANCE, HAVE ZONE MAP THAT WOULD APPLY. AND THERE  
4 ARE I THINK AROUND 25 ZONES. IT IS A SMALLER NUMBER OF ZONES  
5 THAT WERE ANALYZED FOR THAT SORT OF BIG ZONE MAP FOR REGIONAL  
6 SERVICES. AND THEN THERE'S A LOCAL FLAT FARE. IT IS VERY  
7 SIMILAR TO WHAT WE TALKED ABOUT IN OPTION FOUR. AGAIN, YOU CAN  
8 SEE THERE'S A RELATIVELY HIGH LEVEL OF SUBSIDY THAT WOULD  
9 LIKELY BE NEEDED TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER THIS OPTION AND THAT  
10 ALSO, AGAIN, CORRESPONDS TO A SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF PASSENGERS  
11 THAT THE EXISTING SYSTEM SORT OF NEEDING TO SEE THEIR FARES GO  
12 UP OR DOWN DEPENDING ON WHICH DIRECTION THEIR FARES NEEDED TO  
13 GO TO ACHIEVE THAT COMMON STANDARDIZATION. WE CAN GO FORWARD  
14 ONE MORE SLIDE. I THINK THIS SUMMARY TABLE IS A WAY TO LOOK AT  
15 THIS. THERE'S A LOT OF INFORMATION THAT WE JUST SHARED. I WILL  
16 START BY SORT OF WALKING YOU THROUGH THE KEY METRIC COLUMNS.  
17 YOU CAN SEE THIS IS ORGANIZED BY THE FOUR DIMENSIONS OF OUR  
18 BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS. STRATEGIC, ECONOMIC, FINANCIAL AND  
19 IMPLEMENTATION. AND THEN WITHIN STRATEGIC, THERE'S ARE THE  
20 METRICS THAT MIKE WALKED US THROUGH EARLIER IN THE  
21 PRESENTATION. RIDERSHIP, VMT, EQUITY AND THE CUSTOMER  
22 EXPERIENCE. AS YOU CAN SEE THE RIDERSHIP NUMBERS THERE, THESE  
23 ARE NEW DAILY BOARDINGS. YOU CAN SEE THE COMPARISON BETWEEN  
24 THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS. GREEN IS REPRESENTING STRONGER  
25 PERFORMANCE. SORT OF THE RIDER ORANGE IS MODERATE AND RED



September 10, 2021

1 REPRESENTS WEAKER PERFORMANCE. THE VMT CATEGORY REPRESENTS  
2 CHANGES IN VMT. THESE ARE EITHER POSITIVE OR NEGATIVE  
3 DEPENDING ON THE OPTION. EQUITY, THIS IS ACTUALLY SOMETHING WE  
4 WOULD LIKE TO TALK WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE A LITTLE BIT MORE  
5 ABOUT IN TERMS OF IF WE WERE TO HAVE A TABLE LIKE THIS, WHAT  
6 ARE SOME OF THE BEST MEASURES TO REFLECT EQUITY IMPACTS. WE  
7 COULD TALK ABOUT THE EQUITY IMPACTS THAT WE HAVE ANALYZED AND  
8 THAT WE HAVE SEEN SORT OF INDIVIDUALLY BY OPTION. BUT WE  
9 WEREN'T EXACTLY SURE WHAT THE BEST WAY TO REFLECT IT WAS IN --  
10 [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]. COME BACK AND ASK FOR YOUR INPUT. AND  
11 THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE HERE IS FOCUSED ON WHAT WE HAVE HEARD  
12 THROUGH OUR USER RESEARCH WORK. AS I NOTED THE ECONOMIC, THE  
13 BENEFIT COST RATIO, THAT IS WHAT BCR STANDS FOR AND THAT  
14 PRESENT VALUE AND PV, THAT WORKING IS WRAPPING UP RIGHT NOW  
15 WITH OUR CONSULT TEAM. AND YOU CAN SEE THE COST PER NEW RIDER  
16 AND THE TOTAL SUBSIDY THAT WOULD BE REQUIRED ALONG WITH OUR  
17 ASSESSMENT OF WHAT THE IMPLEMENTATION SORT OF HURDLES MIGHT  
18 BE. WHETHER THE TECHNOLOGY OR AGENCY MANAGEMENT GOVERNANCE  
19 CHANGES THAT WOULD BE NECESSARY TO DELIVER LOW, MEDIUM OR HIGH  
20 IMPACT. I WILL STOP THERE AGAIN SINCE THERE'S A LOT OF CONTENT  
21 AND SEE IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I SEE THAT MEMBER GOTUACO HAS A HAND.

24



September 10, 2021

1 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I WANTED TO ASK WHAT THE BENEFITS ARE OF  
2 ZONES THAT YOU'RE PROPOSING OPTIONS FIVE AND SIX. YEAH. I  
3 THINK FIVE AND SIX.

4

5 **WILLIAM BACON:** DO YOU MEAN THE BENEFITS OF ZONES RELATIVE TO A  
6 FARE BY DISTANCE MODEL?

7

8 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** UM, YEAH. FARE BY DISTANCE OR BY AGENCY AND  
9 ARE THE ZONES BASED ON BY AGENCY OR NOT REALLY?

10

11 **WILLIAM BACON:** IT IS A VERY GOOD QUESTION. IN THE EXAMPLE  
12 WHERE THERE WERE OVER 80 ZONES, I'M NOT SURE IF YOU ARE  
13 FAMILIAR WITH THE MAP THAT SEAMLESS BAY AREA THAT RELEASED  
14 THAT HAD THE BAY AREA DIVIDED UP INTO AROUND 80 ZONES. I THINK  
15 THE BENEFITS THAT WE HAVE SEEN FOR USER RESEARCH AT LEAST OF  
16 ZONES IS THAT PEOPLE CAN LOOK AT THE MAP AND UNDERSTAND A  
17 ZONE-BASED STRUCTURE TO SYSTEM EXTENT. I THINK ONE OF THE  
18 CHALLENGES WE SAW THREW USER RESEARCH IS THAT AS YOU GOT MORE  
19 AND MORE ZONES, IT WASN'T IMMEDIATELY INTUITIVE TO PEOPLE  
20 THAT, YOU KNOW, AM I CHARGED EVERY TIME? HOW DOES OUT WORK?  
21 THERE'S JUST A LOT OF ZONES. AND IT BECAME CHALLENGING FOR  
22 PEOPLE TO INTERPRET THAT. DOES THAT MEAN THAT PEOPLE CAN'T  
23 UNDERSTAND THAT OR THEY CAN'T GET TO A PLACE OF COMFORT WITH  
24 THAT TYPE OF ZONE-BASED SYSTEM? NO. THERE ARE MANY OTHER  
25 REGIONS AROUND THE WORLD THAT HAVE VERY COMPLICATED ZONE





September 10, 2021

1 STRUCTURES AND PEOPLE UNDERSTAND IT VERY WELL AND IT WORKS  
2 VERY WELL. IT ISN'T TO SAY THAT THAT'S -- BUT IT IS SOMETHING  
3 TO THINK ABOUT. THERE'S A LEARNING CURVE AND THERE'S A  
4 TRANSITION IF YOU MOVE TO A REGION-WIDE ZONE STRUCTURE. A LOT  
5 OF PEOPLE THROUGH OUR USER RESEARCH SEEM TO INTUITIVELY  
6 UNDERSTAND SORT OF A DISTANCE-BASED MODEL AND THEY DID  
7 GENERALLY TEND TO BELIEVE THAT SORT OF THE LONGER YOU TRAVEL,  
8 THERE'S SOME FAIRNESS IN PAYING MORE. BUT IT KIND OF DEPENDS.  
9 AND THAT I THINK GETS TO YOUR QUESTION. AS PEOPLE WITH LOWER  
10 INCOMES HAVE BEEN DISPLACED FURTHER AND FURTHER OUT IN THE BAY  
11 AREA, IS IT EQUITABLE THAT THEY ALWAYS HAVE TO PAY MORE? AND  
12 AGAIN, DO WE OFFER PRODUCTS LIKE CAPS OR PASSES THAT REALLY  
13 HELP ADDRESS SOME OF THOSE ISSUES. I'M NOT SURE IF I AM FULLY  
14 ANSWERING YOUR QUESTION BUT THAT IS WHAT I AM TRYING TO GET  
15 AT.

16

17 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** PARTIALLY WHY NOT CITIES AND COUNTIES AND  
18 ZONES.

19

20 **WILLIAM BACON:** YEAH. MIKE, YOU CAN CHIME IN HERE, TOO. THAT IS  
21 SOMETHING WE SPENT A LOT OF TIME EARLY IN THE STUDY THINKING  
22 ABOUT IS CAN YOU HAVE JURISDICTIONAL BASED BOUNDARIES OR ZONES  
23 AT THE COUNTY OR CITY LEVEL. IN SOME WAYS, THAT IS NOT THAT  
24 DIFFERENT THAN WHAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW. WE TEND TO HAVE THESE  
25 TRANSIT SERVICE AREAS THAT MOSTLY, YOU KNOW, ALIGN TO



September 10, 2021

1 JURISDICTIONAL BOUNDARIES. NOT ALWAYS COUNTY BOUNDARIES. BUT  
2 TYPICALLY CITY BOUNDARIES OR GEOGRAPHIC BOUNDARIES IN TERMS OF  
3 HILLS OR VALLEYS THAT SEPARATE PLACES. SO, WE HAVE THAT SORT  
4 OF EXISTING BREAKDOWN. THE ISSUE AGAIN IS HOW DO WE BRING  
5 MULTIPLE AGENCIES WITH DIFFERENT STRUCTURES INTO THAT COMMON  
6 SYSTEM? AND I THINK THROUGH WHAT WE'RE PUTTING FORWARD HERE,  
7 WE'RE SAYING IS THAT MAYBE FOR THOSE LOCAL SERVICES IN  
8 PARTICULAR, IT ISN'T SO MUCH ABOUT THE MAP AND ZONE-BASED  
9 STRUCTURE. IT IS MORE ABOUT THE DISCOUNTS BETWEEN AGENCIES AND  
10 WHERE DO YOU GET THE BIGGEST RIDERSHIP BANG FOR YOUR SUBSIDY  
11 INVESTMENT. I THINK WHAT WE ARE GENERALLY SAYING HERE IS THAT  
12 YOU GET A BIGGER BANG THROUGH THAT FREE TRANSFER BETWEEN  
13 AGENCIES RATHER THAN BRINGING ALL OF THOSE LOCAL SERVICES INTO  
14 A SINGLE ZONE SYSTEM

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. MEMBER ALLEN.

17

18 **BOB ALLEN:** THANKS, EVERYONE, FOR ALL THIS INFORMATION. I KNOW  
19 IT IS LOT TO DIGEST. I APPRECIATE IT. JUST ONE CLARIFYING  
20 QUESTION ON THE COST PER NEW RIDER AND YOUR FINANCIAL PIECE.  
21 GOING BACK EARLIER I THINK FORMULATION MOST OF US ARE FAMILIAR  
22 WITH THE COMBINED SUBSIDIES OVERALL, RAIL BEING A LITTLE MORE  
23 ON THE CAPITAL SIDE. AND THE BUSES BEING MORE HEAVY ON THE  
24 OPERATING SIDE. IN MY NOTES I HAD -- IF THIS IS TOO  
25 COMPLICATED, I COULD TAKE IT OFFLINE. DID YOU SAY YOUR WORKING



September 10, 2021

1 ASSUMPTION WAS THE SAME LEVEL OVERALL SUBSIDY COMBINED  
2 OBVIOUSLY WITH THE BREAKDOWN BEING DIFFERENT BETWEEN DIFFERENT  
3 OPERATORS OR MODES OR DID I MAKE THAT NOTE WRONG? WHAT I --  
4

5 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** ALL OF THE COSTS OF ALL THE SYSTEMS IN OUR  
6 REGION ADDED TOGETHER AS REPORTED TO NTD.  
7

8 **BOB ALLEN:** I WILL FOLLOW UP. I DON'T WANT TO TAKE TIME. THAT  
9 IS HELPFUL, MIKE. THANK YOU.  
10

11 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SURE  
12

13 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** MEMBER GRIFFITHS.  
14

15 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I WANT TO CLARIFY HOW LONG WE ARE GOING FOR  
16 BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T REALLY BEEN ASKED TO GIVE FEEDBACK AND I  
17 HAVE A BUNCH OF IT. BUT I ALSO -- ADINA, CAN YOU CLARIFY WHAT  
18 WE ARE DOING TO DO AS FAR AS TIMING? ARE WE GOING TO HAVE TIME  
19 FOR ACTUAL SUBSTANTIVE FEEDBACK VERSUS JUST CLARIFYING  
20 QUESTIONS?  
21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** YES. HOW CLOSE TO -- HOW LONG CAN STAFF  
23 RUN THIS? THIS IS OBVIOUSLY A REALLY SUPER COMPLICATED  
24 PRESENTATION. I DON'T WANT TO BE TAKING US THROUGH 9:00 AT  
25 NIGHT. WHAT IS REASONABLE FOR STAFF?



September 10, 2021

1

2 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I CAN STAY AS LONG AS FOLKS CAN STAY.

3

4 **WILLIAM BACON:** WE ARE AVAILABLE.

5

6 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THIS IS A GOOD LITTLE TEST RUN FOR US HERE,  
7 GUYS. WE DIDN'T MEAN TO TALK -- TAKE UP ALL YOUR TIME. THANKS  
8 FOR BEARING WITH US HERE ON A LONG PRESENTATION

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** IF WE CAN RUN LIKE UP TO 5:00 AT A MAX, I  
11 REALLY -- WE REALLY DO WANT TO BE ABLE TO SHARE COMMENTS WITH  
12 YOU, WHICH IS OUR MISSION AS A GROUP. WE WANT TO LISTEN TO  
13 WHAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE.

14

15 **WILLIAM BACON:** WE ONLY HAVE A FEW SLIDES LEFT. WOULD IT BE  
16 HELPFUL IF WE SORT OF GO THROUGH AND FINISH THE PRESENTATION?  
17 WE ONLY HAVE MAYBE FOUR OR SO SUBSTANTIVE SLIDES YES

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** YES, PLEASE.

20

21 **WILLIAM BACON:** OKAY. WE CAN COME BACK AND LOOK AT THIS AGAIN  
22 WHEN WE GO TO COMMENTS. WE CAN GO FORWARD ONE MORE SLIDE. THIS  
23 IS TRYING TO SUM RISE AND WRAP UP, AGAIN, THOSE DIFFERENT  
24 TIERS AND HOW THEY PERFORM THROUGH THE BUSINESS CASE FRAMEWORK  
25 AND WE'RE TALKING ABOUT SORT OF STRENGTHS AND POTENTIAL ISSUES



September 10, 2021

1 AND WEAKNESSES FOR EACH OF THEM. THIS IS SUMMARIZING WHAT WE  
2 HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT FOR THE LAST COUPLE OF HOURS. BUT  
3 GENERALLY OVERLAYS -- PASSES AND CAPS RELATIVELY SIMPLE AND  
4 EASY FOR FOLKS TO UNDERSTAND AND EASILY DELIVERABLE RIGHT NOW  
5 WITHIN OUR EXISTING STRUCTURE. POTENTIAL WEAKNESSES ARE  
6 FOCUSED ON IF OUR GOAL IS TO GROW RIDERSHIP AND MAKE THE  
7 SYSTEM BETTER FOR USERS, NOT EVERYONE WILL BENEFIT FROM A CAP  
8 IF YOU DON'T HIT THE CAP. AND NOT EVERYONE BENEFITS FROM A  
9 PASS IF YOU DON'T PURCHASE A PASS. SO, THINKING ABOUT THAT.  
10 FOR TIER TWO WHEN YOU LOOK AT TRANSFER DISCOUNTS, IT REALLY  
11 DOES ADDRESS A LOT OF THOSE INTEGRATION BARRIERS WE HAVE RIGHT  
12 NOW. IT COULD BE SIMPLE TO COMMUNICATE IF YOU TELL FOLKS THAT  
13 YOU ARE NEVER GOING TO PAY MORE THAN ONE LOCAL FARE A DAY. I'M  
14 SORRY. PER TRIP.

15

16 **WILLIAM BACON:** WHAT WE'RE SAYING IS YOU GET A BIGGER BANG  
17 THROUGH FREE TRANSFER BETWEEN AGENCIES RATHER THAN BRING ALL  
18 OF THOSE LOCAL SERVICES INTO A SINGLE ZONE AND IT REALLY  
19 CREATES MORE COHESIVE ON SORT OF THE BAY AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT  
20 BACKBONE AND WEAKNESSES AGAIN IT MORE CHALLENGING THAN PLANNED  
21 BECAUSE THE GOVERNMENT'S CONSIDERATION OR WITH TIER FOUR, I  
22 WON'T BELABOR THIS, THERE IS A LOT OF COMPLEXITY IN TERMS OF  
23 BRINGING TWO DOZEN AGENCIES UNDER A COMMON STRUCTURE AND WHAT  
24 THAT MEANS FROM A GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT PERSPECTIVE. WE  
25 CAN GO FORWARD ONE MORE SLIDE. COMING BACK TO WHAT WE TALKED



September 10, 2021

1 ABOUT EARLIER, DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS AS WE STAND RIGHT NOW AND  
2 CONTINUE TO EVALUATE THE BEST WAY TO HAVE A TIERED PASS OR TOP  
3 PRODUCT AVAILABLE TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC. THAT'S THE VERY NEAR-  
4 TERM IN TERMS OF MONTHS THAT'S THE TIME FRAME THAT WE'RE  
5 THINKING ABOUT. PHASE B, SORT OF, WHAT COMES NEXT REALLY GETS  
6 AT TIER TWO, SO THIS IS TRYING TO DEPLOY, ALONG WITH CLIPPER  
7 TWO, OR NEAR THE LAUNCH OF THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM IN 2023,  
8 FREE DISCOUNT -- I'M SORRY -- FREE TRANSFERS TWO LOCAL  
9 SERVICES, AND THE DISCOUNTED TRANSFER BETWEEN LOCAL AND  
10 REGIONAL SERVICES. SO OPTION 3A THAT WE TALKED ABOUT IN THE  
11 PRESENTATION. AND THEN MOVING FORWARD, TIER THREE, IN THE  
12 LONGER TERM, AFTER THE DEPLOYMENT OF C2, REALLY CONTINUING TO  
13 WORK TOWARDS THAT COMMON REGIONAL STRUCTURE, FOR ALL OF OUR  
14 REGIONAL SERVICES. SO THE BUSES -- I'M SORRY -- REGIONAL  
15 EXPRESS BUS SERVICE, FERRIES, RAIL SERVICE, AND BRINGING THAT  
16 EITHER INTO A COMMON DISTANCE-BASED OR ZONAL STRUCTURE,  
17 DEPENDING ON WHERE WE WANT TO GO. THE IMPORTANT THING, AGAIN,  
18 IN THERE TO REMEMBER, ARE THE CONSIDERATIONS AROUND GOVERNANCE  
19 FOR INDIVIDUAL FARE POLICIES AND THE AMOUNT OF SUBSIDY THAT'S  
20 AVAILABLE TO OPERATE ARE SUBSYSTEM NOT IN A BROADER SENSE, BUT  
21 JUST TO, SORT OF, DELIVER THE MODEL CALCULATED NUMBER WE  
22 TALKED ABOUT HERE, BUT IN THE LONGER TERM, YOU KNOW, AS THE  
23 BAY AREA, HOPEFULLY RECOVERS FROM THE PANDEMIC HOW MUCH  
24 FUNDING IS AVAILABLE TO OPERATE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM TO SUSTAIN



September 10, 2021

1 OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AS IT LOOKS TODAY. I'M GOING TO TURN IT  
2 OVER TO MIKE THEN WE'LL BE DONE.

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NEXT ONE AFTER THAT,  
5 PLEASE. SO, I JUST WANT TO TAKE A MINUTE TO FOCUS ON OUR  
6 NEAR-TERM ACTION PROPOSAL. SIENNA HAS BEEN PUTTING A LOT OF  
7 EFFORT INTO FIGURING OUT THE LOGISTICS. THE PROPOSAL IS TO  
8 PILOT TEST ORIGINAL INSTITUTIONAL EMPLOYER PASS PROGRAM ALL  
9 AGENCY RIDE PASSES OFFERED TO INSTITUTIONS TO BUY-IN BULK.  
10 ULTIMATELY THE GOAL OF THE PROGRAM WOULD BE TO ACHIEVE ROUGH  
11 SUBSIDY PARITY OFFERED WITH OTHER FARES AROUND THE REGION. THE  
12 MODEL, WE'RE, SORT OF, MODELING OUR EFFORTS HERE ON THE  
13 REGION'S CORE PASS, THIS HAS BEEN IN PLAY SUCCESSFULLY IN  
14 SEVERAL AGENCIES HERE IN THE BAY AREA, CALTRANS, VTA IS DOING  
15 IT AS WELL. WHAT'S DIFFERENT ABOUT THE PASS IN THE PUGET SOUND  
16 REGION IS MULTI-AGENCY THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO HERE.  
17 WE'RE SETTING UP THE PRICING MODEL BASED ON LOCATION OF THE  
18 BUSINESS TRYING TO OFFER PASSES TO DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE  
19 REGION. WITH OUR PILOT THE AGENCY PASS BUILDING TOWARD BROADER  
20 INTEGRATION. WE ALSO WANT TO TRY TO ENGAGE THE INSTITUTIONS IN  
21 THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY AND TRANSIT SUCCESS AS WE LOOK FORWARD  
22 TO COVID RECOVERY TO THE EXTENT THAT WE CAN, AND THENALLY LOOK  
23 AT THE DATA THAT CAN BE USED AS THE BASIS FOR REVENUE MODEL  
24 PERMANENTLY. WE, SORT OF, SPLIT THIS OUT AS WE WORK THROUGH  
25 THE LOGISTICS INTO TWO POTENTIAL PHASES. FIRST ONE AIMING TO



September 10, 2021

1 START IS EARLY IN 2022, AS WE CAN, ALTHOUGH THERE IS A LOT OF  
2 GROUND TO COVER TO GET THIS UP AND RUNNING. WE WOULD LIKE TO  
3 FOCUS ON COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES AND LEVERAGE RELATIONSHIPS  
4 THAT OUR AGENCIES HAVE WITH THEIR EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL  
5 CUSTOMERS, AS QUICKLY AS CAN. FROM THERE LEARN AS MUCH FROM  
6 THE INITIAL PILOT PHASE, AND THE INTENT WOULD BE TO WORK WITH  
7 PRIVATE -- WE THINK THERE IS A LOT OF POTENTIAL CONSIDERING  
8 WHAT PUGET SOUND HAS DEVELOPED OVER DECADES WITH THE SYSTEM  
9 AND THE WAY PEOPLE COMMUTE IN THE REGION. IT'S A LOT OF  
10 POTENTIAL AND WORTH INVESTMENT. CHALLENGES, THERE IS GOING TO  
11 HAVE TO BE A FOCUS ON GETTING EQUITY BALANCE. THESE PROGRAMS  
12 NATURALLY TEND TOWARDS WHITE COLLAR WORKERS SO WE NEED TO  
13 FOCUS ON BALANCE THERE IS A LOT OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND STAFFING  
14 REQUIREMENTS. THIS IS A HIGH INVESTMENT ADMINISTRATIVELY TYPE  
15 OF PROGRAM, WE NEED ALL OF THE AGENCIES TO SIGN ON TO IT. IT'S  
16 AN ALL AGENCY PASS INCLUDED INTO ONE. AND THEN THERE IS SOME  
17 REVENUE RISK FOR THE AGENCIES, AND SO THERE WILL HAVE TO BE  
18 SOME KIND OF FUNDING BACKSTOP. I'LL LEAVE OFF THERE, AND I  
19 THINK BILL IS GOING WRAP UP HERE.

20

21 **WILLIAM BACON:** WE CAN GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THANKS  
22 MIKE. VERY QUICKLY HERE, THE NEXT STEPS. AS MIKE MENTIONED,  
23 IN ABOUT TEN DAYS, WE'RE SCHEDULED TO PRESENT TO OUR FARE  
24 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE THE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS, SO, SORT OF,  
25 SUMMARIZED VERSION OF THIS PRESENTATION, TO THEN TO REALLY





September 10, 2021

1 START THE DISCUSSION AT THE GENERAL MANAGER LEVEL OF THE  
2 TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND THE EXECUTIVE MANAGEMENT LEVEL.  
3 STARTING RIGHT AFTER THAT, ACTUALLY, THAT FOLLOWING WEEK,  
4 WE'RE INTENDING TO BEGIN A SERIES OF PRESENTATIONS TO TRANSIT  
5 AGENCY BOARD MEETINGS, AND WE WILL SHARE THE MEETINGS THAT  
6 CURRENTLY ARE AGENDAIZED WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEES SO YOU CAN ALL  
7 SEE THE DATES OF THOSE MEETINGS, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF  
8 DIFFERENT BOARD MEETINGS OR COMMITTEE MEETINGS THAT ARE ON THE  
9 SCHEDULE OR ARE ABOUT TO BE. THAT WILL GIVE OPPORTUNITY FOR  
10 THE AGENCY'S BOARDS TO LEARN MORE ABOUT THE PROJECT AND  
11 RECOMMENDATIONS IN A MUCH MORE CONDENSED FORMAT THAN WHAT YOU  
12 SAW TODAY. ON OCTOBER 18TH, THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE  
13 WILL MEET AGAIN AND THAT WILL BE FIRST OPPORTUNITY TO CONSIDER  
14 ADOPTING SOME RECOMMENDATIONS OR TAKING, SORT OF, A POSITION  
15 ABOUT WHAT DIRECTION THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE WOULD  
16 LIKE TO GO. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT WILL BE THE FINAL MEETING OF  
17 THE TASK FORCE OR NOT, IT'S VERY POSSIBLE THERE COULD BE  
18 SUBSEQUENT MEETINGS OF THE TASK FORCE BEYOND OCTOBER 18TH, BUT  
19 THAT'S, SORT OF, THE DATES THAT ARE CURRENTLY ON THE CALENDAR.  
20 ONE OTHER THING I WILL CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO, THAT IS  
21 IMPORTANT TO THIS PROJECT IS, ON OCTOBER 27TH AND 28TH, THE  
22 COMMISSION WILL BE HAVING A WORKSHOP THAT WILL BE FOCUSED  
23 SIGNIFICANTLY ON THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE  
24 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, AND, SORT OF, THE KEY STRATEGIES  
25 THAT WERE IDENTIFIED THERE. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO AREN'T AS



September 10, 2021

1 FAMILIAR, SOME OF THE KEY STRATEGIES THAT WERE IDENTIFIED ARE  
2 THIS PROJECT, THE FARE COORDINATION, INTEGRATION OPPORTUNITY  
3 THAT IS AVAILABLE TO THE REGION THROUGH THE WORK THAT WE HAVE  
4 BEEN DOING HERE, TRANSIT NETWORK PRIORITY IN TERMS OF ALLOWING  
5 BUSES, IN PARTICULAR, TO MOVE MORE RELIABLY AND FASTER ON THE  
6 ROAD SYSTEM, THE FREEWAY SYSTEM. AND MAPPING AND WAYFINDING OF  
7 OUR SYSTEM. SO, AT THAT WORKSHOP, THIS PROJECT WILL HAVE AN  
8 OPPORTUNITY TO, AGAIN, PRESENT ITS RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE  
9 COMMISSION, WHERE THE COMMISSION WILL REALLY HAVE AN  
10 OPPORTUNITY TO WEIGH IN ABOUT WHAT FINANCIAL COMMITMENTS MIGHT  
11 BE ABLE TO BE MADE TO ALLOW PILOTS TO BE DELIVERED TO ALLOW  
12 EARLY ACTIONS TO TAKE PLACE. AGAIN, FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO  
13 HAVEN'T BEEN FOLLOWING THIS AS CLOSELY, THE AMERICAN RESCUE  
14 PLAN, WHICH IS THE FEDERAL COVID RELIEF PACKAGE APPROVED IN  
15 APRIL OF THIS YEAR, THE MTC COMMISSION HAS SET-ASIDE FUNDS IN  
16 THE BAY AREA TO SUPPORT DELIVERY OF THOSE BLUE RIBBON  
17 TRANSFORMATION ACTIONS. THOSE THINGS NETWORK PRIORITY,  
18 WAYFINDING, THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO HELP SUPPORT THE DELIVERY  
19 OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THIS WORK, AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT  
20 WILL LIKELY BE ON THE AGENDA AT THAT MEETING ON THE 27TH AND  
21 28TH OF OCTOBER. THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION. THANK YOU  
22 ALL. I'M SORRY IT'S GONE SO LONG. BUT WE ARE LOOKING FORWARD  
23 TO THOSE OF YOU WHO CAN STAY, TO HEARING YOUR COMMENTS AND  
24 FEEDBACK.

25



September 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** WE WANTED TO REALLY EXPRESS GRATITUDE  
2 TOWARDS STAFF AND THE CONSULTANTS TO REALLY DOING A LOT OF THE  
3 WORK ON SOMETHING THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT, AND DESIRED BY A  
4 LOT OF PEOPLE. IN TERMS OF TAKING COMMENTS, WHAT I WOULD LIKE  
5 TO DO, IF THERE IS ANYONE WHO HAS A HARD STOP, SOONER RATHER  
6 THAN LATER, CAN -- I WOULD LIKE THEM TO BE ABLE TO GO FIRST.  
7 SO, I'M SORRY -- ANYBODY WHO HAS A HAND RAISED, WHO HAS A HARD  
8 START MOMENTARILY? RICH? IS THAT -- ARE YOU SAYING THAT YOU  
9 HAVE A HARD STOP? CAN'T HEAR YOU. HEDGE I'M AWAITING A CALL  
10 FROM STANFORD ON SOME ISSUES.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GOT IT.

13

14 **RICHARD HEDGES:** WELL, I JUST HAVE A SIMPLE QUESTION.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

17

18 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. IT SEEMS TO ME IN LOOKING -- AND I  
19 THINK EQUITY IS OUR PRIME ISSUE HERE, THAT PROBABLY, WE REACH  
20 THE MOST PEOPLE ON AN EQUITY BASIS WITH LOCAL TO LOCAL. AND  
21 THEN THE REST, LOCAL TO REGIONAL. IS THERE ANYONE, INCLUDING  
22 STAFF, THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THAT?

23

24 **WILLIAM BACON:** YEAH I THINK YOU'RE PROBABLY RIGHT, RICH, IN  
25 THE SENSE THAT LOCAL TO LOCAL TRANSFERS ARE A SIGNIFICANT PART



September 10, 2021

1 OF IT ONE THING I WOULD CALL FOLK'S ATTENTION TO AGAIN IS IF  
2 YOU LOOK AT PRECOVID, THE TYPES OF INTER-AGENCY TRANSFERS THAT  
3 WERE TAKING PLACE MOST INVOLVED REGIONAL SERVICE, BART,  
4 CALTRAIN, SOME TYPE OF WHAT WE CALL REGIONAL TRANSIT. SO I  
5 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER, YOU KNOW, HOW CAN WE BENEFIT  
6 THOSE USERS, AS WELL. SO, I DON'T KNOW, THAT'S MY ONLY  
7 COMMENT. I MEAN, NUMERICALLY, MOST PEOPLE OF COURSE ARE RIDING  
8 THOSE SERVICES, MUNI, AC TRANSIT, VTA, A LOT OF THOSE  
9 TRANSFERS WHERE PEOPLE EXPERIENCE FRICTION IN OUR FARE SYSTEM  
10 INVOLVE REGIONAL AGENCY.

11

12 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I'M LOOKING AT THIS IN THE PORK CHOP GUY THAT  
13 I AM THAT I CAN AFFORD FARES ON A PERSONAL LEVEL, THE PEOPLE  
14 WHO RIDE SAMTRANS WORKING DOWNTOWN AND SERVICE JOBS ARE  
15 GETTING OFF AND I SEE THEM GETTING OFF IN EQUITY PRIORITY  
16 COMMUNITIES SO I'M, SORT OF, CONCENTRATED ON THOSE FOLKS.  
17 THAT'S MY MAIN COMMENT. I UNDERSTAND WE NEED TO OPERATE A  
18 WHOLE SYSTEM BUT I WANT TO SECURE AS MUCH EQUITY AS POSSIBLE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I CAN JUST THROW IN A COMMENT, ARE YOU CONSIDERING  
21 THE PILOTS MAYBE IN ORDER TO BE FLIPPED SO THAT THE AFFORDABLE  
22 HOUSING GROUPS GETS PILOTED FOR STUDENTS JUST TO SEE WHERE  
23 PEOPLE ARE ACTUALLY TRAVELING SO WE CAN HAVE THIS DATA?

24



September 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THAT WAS GOING TO BE ONE OF MY  
2 RECOMMENDATIONS, AFFORDABLE HOUSING WILL BE SERVING A BROADER  
3 RANGE OF EQUITY PRIORITY PEOPLE. SO, YEAH. I'LL HAVE MORE  
4 COMMENTS, BUT THANK YOU FOR MAKING THAT COMMENT. AND,  
5 CHRISTINA, DO YOU HAVE MORE COMMENTS? OR IS THAT THE ONE THAT  
6 YOU HAD? ALL RIGHT. TISHA DEE HARTMAN.

7

8 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** I UNDERSTAND YOU WENT INTO OVER TIME AND I  
9 WANT TO THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK THAT'S GONE INTO THAT. WHEN  
10 I LOOK AT SLIDE 38 AND SEE THE RECOMMENDATION FOR MOVING  
11 THROUGH THE TIERS, I CAN'T HELP FEEL LIKE WE'RE MISSING A  
12 COMPONENT THERE. I FEEL 3D IS THE SWEET SPOT FOR THE SHORT-  
13 TERM IN MY MIND IT WOULD BE SHORT-TERM OBVIOUSLY GOT SOME  
14 SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP COUPLED WITH SIZABLE  
15 DECREASES IN VMT MOSTLY POSITIVE FEEDBACK AND MID-LINE ON  
16 IMPACTS FINANCIALLY OF COURSE THAT'S THE SWEET SPOT BUT AS WE  
17 LOOK TO THE SHORTER TERM IN CALIFORNIA AND LONGER TERM MOVING  
18 INTO THE FUTURE REACHING BEDROOM COMMUNITIES AND CONTINUE TO  
19 GROW AND HOUSING GETS PUSHED, ON THE TABLE OUR LONGER TERM,  
20 AND LOSING SITE OF THE LONGER TERM INITIATIVE AND BRINGING  
21 CALIFORNIA TO A MORE UNIFIED CONNECTED STATE AS A WHOLE. AND  
22 MY NEXT COMMENT REGARDING TIER THREE WE'RE CLEAR ON ROLLING  
23 OUT TIER 1 AND 2, BUT I DIDN'T GET A CLEAR TIMELINE FOR TIER  
24 THREE.

25



September 10, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** GOOD OBSERVATION ON THAT. I THINK, I MEAN, TO  
2 ME -- AND THIS IS, I THINK, REALLY COMING FROM A BART  
3 PERSPECTIVE HERE, THAT WHAT HAPPENS NOW IS THAT THERE IS A  
4 BUNCH OF DIFFERENT BROADER CONVERSATIONS BEYOND JUST FARE  
5 INTEGRATION, THAT THIS IS GOING HAVE TO BE A PART OF. ONE,  
6 BECAUSE IT'S MY DAY JOB, AND ONE I'M MOST FOCUSED ON IS HOW  
7 ARE WE GOING TO PAY FOR SERVICE IN TWO OR THREE YEARS. IF  
8 HYBRID REMOTE WORK BECOMES STANDARD, THE FUNDING MODEL IS  
9 GOING TO HAVE TO SHIFT. FUNDING IS IMPORTANT AND GOVERNANCE  
10 CONVERSATIONS UNDERWAY RELATED TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK. THIS  
11 IS NOT A STAND ALONE AFTER THIS PROJECT IS OVER. IT BECOMES  
12 PART OF THE BROADER COORDINATION AND NEEDS TO BE A SET OF  
13 SOLUTIONS. SO I DON'T THINK OUR PROPOSAL HERE DOES NOT COMMIT  
14 TO ANY PARTICULAR OUTCOME OR TIMELINE, INTENTIONALLY, BUT  
15 CERTAINLY, OPEN TO YOUR FEEDBACK ON THAT.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I AM SURE THAT THERE  
18 ARE OTHER MEMBERS, IN ADDITION ME, THAT HAVE COMMENTS TO MAKE.  
19 MEMBER GRIFFITHS?

20

21 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SURE. I WAS GOING TO -- IF ANYONE ELSE HAS HAD  
22 TIME TO STOP I'LL LET THEM GO FIRST BUT IT SOUND LIKE THOSE  
23 PEOPLE HAVE GONE. SO, I'LL SAY A FEW OF MY COMMENTS THEN  
24 PAUSE IF THERE IS TIME AND FOLLOW UP AFTER IN E-MAIL I'LL TRY  
25 TO GET TO THEM ALL BUT IN LEVEL OF PRIORITY. IN GENERAL, I



September 10, 2021

1 SUPPORT THE NEAR-TERM RECOMMENDATIONS, AND I THINK THAT'S  
2 REALLY EXCITING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, FREE TRANSFERS, AND  
3 INSTITUTIONAL PASSES, THAT SOUNDS GREAT. I'M A LITTLE -- I  
4 WILL SAY, I WAS JUST -- IT WAS FRUSTRATING TO ONLY GET THESE  
5 MATERIALS AT MIDNIGHT LAST -- YOU KNOW, LIKE, NOT HAVING A LOT  
6 OF TIME TO REVIEW T BECAUSE IT IS SOMETHING THEY WISH WE WOULD  
7 HAVE HAD MORE TIME TO LOOK INTO PRIOR TO THIS MEETING TODAY,  
8 AND I'M A LITTLE BIT CONCERNED ABOUT THE WAY, ABOUT SOME OF  
9 THE THINGS I'M SEEING IN TERMS OF HOW OPTIONS 4 AND 6 ARE  
10 BEING MODELED, AND THE TIME -- AND THE FACT THAT WE DON'T --  
11 WE MAY NOT HAVE TIME TO MAKE -- IT SOUND LIKE THERE IS  
12 PROBABLY NOT TIME TO REDO ANY OF THAT IN ADVANCE OF THIS BEING  
13 BROUGHT TO THE TASK FORCE, AND THEN TO THE, YOU KNOW, THE SET  
14 VARIOUS BOARD MEETINGS THESE ARE GOING TO BE DISPLAYED AT. SO  
15 SOME OF THE THINGS I'M THINKING IS. ONE CUSTOMER INSURANCE  
16 CHARACTERIZATION EVALUATION, IT'S ALL A WASH IN TERMS OF  
17 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IF YOU LOOK AT COLOR CODING IT'S LIKE, 2,  
18 3, YOU KNOW, ALMOST ALL OF THEM ARE, LIKE, BETTER THAN NOW,  
19 SLIGHTLY BETTER THAN NOW AND THEN OPTION FIVE IS WORSE NOW.  
20 THAT'S KIND OF HOW IT COMES OFF, AND I CAN'T, FOR THE LIFE OF  
21 ME, FIGURE -- SEE HOW THAT WOULD BE TRUE. BECAUSE I THINK THE  
22 MORE COMPREHENSIVE OPTIONS, I THINK, EARLIER ON, WE AS A  
23 GROUP, SORT OF, EVALUATED THOSE AS BEING SIMPLER TO UNDERSTAND  
24 FOR USERS. AND I AM SURPRISED THAT THE USER -- IT'S HARD TO  
25 KNOW EXACTLY HOW THE USER RESEARCH WAS DONE BUT IT SEEMS



September 10, 2021

1 SURPRISING THAT THERE WAS NO NET BENEFIT SEEING AS IN THOSE  
2 THAT'S SHOWING UP, OF ANY VALUE. THAT'S NOT SHOWING UP AS AN  
3 ADVANTAGE FOR THOSE MORE COMPREHENSIVE OPTIONS, EVEN THOUGH  
4 THEY PERFORM DIFFERENTLY ON RIDERSHIP. I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT  
5 WAS DONE. I DON'T KNOW WHY WAS THE CASE. BUT IT'S SURPRISING  
6 HOW UNIVERSALLY ADOPTED THOSE POLICIES ARE IN YOUR REGIONS OF  
7 HIGH TRANSIT USE AND THE ARGUMENT THAT THERE ARE SIMPLER  
8 OPTIONS FOR RIDERS. I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS MORE NUANCE THAT  
9 CAN BE ADDED TO THAT. MAYBE YOU WERE BEING CONSERVATIVE TO HOW  
10 YOU WERE PRESENTING THOSE ASSESSMENTS, BUT IT SEEMS UNFAIR TO  
11 SUGGEST AND INACCURATE TO SAY OPTION TWO IS PERFORMED EQUALLY  
12 IN TERMS OF USER SIMPLICITY AND USER INTUITIVENESS AND  
13 OPTIONS. THE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] SHOULD BE HIRE ON THE  
14 COMPREHENSIVE OPTIONS AND USER EXPERIENCE IS NOT BEING MODELED  
15 AT ALL IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP. SO THE USER EXPERIENCE IS  
16 TRANSLATING TO A 5% RIDERSHIP INCREASE OR A 10% RIDERSHIP  
17 INCREASE THAT WE JUST WANT DON'T KNOW ABOUT, THAT WOULD  
18 TOTALLY CHANGE THE RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE PROJECTIONS FOR THE  
19 COMPREHENSIVE OPTIONS. CURRENTLY THIS MAKES OPTIONS 4 AND 5 --  
20 3, 4 AND 5 -- OR 4, 5, AND 6 LOOK, PRESENTED -- IF YOU DON'T  
21 REALLY LOOK INTO IT SEEMS LIKE THOSE AREN'T WORTH PURSUING AND  
22 LET'S JUST FOCUS ON THE NEAR-TERM OPTIONS AND THE THIRD THING  
23 I'LL SAY AND I'LL LET SOMEONE ELSE MAKE SOME COMMENTS IS THAT,  
24 OBVIOUSLY I'M PARTIAL TO OPTION FIVE, BECAUSE WE KIND OF  
25 DEVELOPED IT, AND YOU KNOW, PROPOSED IT, I DO NOT REALLY FEEL





September 10, 2021

1 LIKE -- TO ME OPTION FIVE IS SOMEWHERE BETWEEN 4 AND 6. FOUR  
2 IS FARE BY DISTANCE, SIX IS HUGE THOUGH. FIVE IS SMALL THOUGH,  
3 SO IT'S KIND OF A STEPPINGSTONE BETWEEN THE THREE. BUT THAT'S  
4 NOT THE WAY THOSE THREE WERE MODELED. YOU HAVE A LOCAL FLAT  
5 FARE IN 4 AND 6 THEN A TOTALLY DIFFERENT ASSUMPTION IN FIVE.  
6 AND IT DOESN'T SEEM LIKE AN APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON  
7 BETWEEN THOSE. I DON'T FEEL LIKE WE HAVE A GOOD OPTION THAT  
8 HAS SMALL ZONES THAT COULD BE BACKED UP AGAINST THE FARE BY  
9 DISTANCE AND THE LARGE ZONES FOR ONE. AND THAT, MAYBE, I THINK  
10 THE ISSUE THAT POINTED OUT BEFORE, OR THAT YOU CLARIFIED  
11 ABOUT, BASICALLY, YOU'RE ASSUMING THAT YOU DON'T, YOU KNOW,  
12 YOU PAY EXTRA, EVEN IN THOSE SMALL ZONES, THE FIRST ZONE THAT  
13 YOU'RE PAYING MORE THAT'S A BIG DEAL AND NOT PART OF THE  
14 PROPOSAL THAT WE CAME UP W TO ME, I WOULD WANT TO SEE THAT  
15 FIXED AND 4, 5, AND 6 BE MORE APPLES TO APPLES IN THE  
16 PRESENTATION OF THOSE OPTIONS TO, YOU KNOW, VARIOUS TRANSIT  
17 AGENCY BOARDS ARE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT THESE AND MAKING AN  
18 ADJUSTMENT EARLY ON ABOUT WHAT THEY SEE AND WRITING OUT THOSE  
19 OPTIONS OVER THE LONG-TERM. I'LL STOP THERE. [LAUGHTER] THANK  
20 YOU.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. AND MEMBER KASS?

23

24 **JONOTHON KASS:** THANK YOU. I'LL TRY TO MAKE A FEW BROAD  
25 COMMENTS. REALLY, AS EVERYONE SAID IT'S AN INCREDIBLE AMOUNT



September 10, 2021

1 OF REALLY, REALLY RICH WORK, AND I AM VERY GRATEFUL FOR  
2 EVERYONE'S QUESTIONS. BECAUSE IT REALLY HELPED ME UNDERSTAND  
3 BETTER, TOO. I THINK I THINK IT'S GREAT THAT WE DID THIS  
4 MODELING IN A QUANTITATIVE PIECE. I WAS FEELING LIKE IT MIGHT  
5 BE HELPFUL TO YOU HAVE, BOTH OF YOU, WHO ARE BETTER THAN WE  
6 CAN BE AT PUTTING THE QUANTITATIVE PIECE IN CONTEXT TO HELP  
7 SAY MORE ABOUT HOW TO THINK ABOUT THE NUMBERS, RELATIVE TO  
8 WHAT'S NOT INCORPORATED. ONE PIECE WAS ALREADY BROUGHT UP  
9 WHICH IS JUST, SORT OF, THE ACCURACY, THE ERROR BAND IN THE  
10 MODEL. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN WAGER, LIKE, WHEN WE NOW SEE  
11 THE DOLLARS PER NEW PASSENGER, YOU KNOW, IF THEY'RE WITHIN% OF  
12 25% OF EACH OTHER, 10% OF EACH OTHER, A SENSE OF RANKING THEM  
13 IN EFFICIENCY SUCH AS THE RANGE OF NATURAL ERROR BAND. RELATED  
14 TO THAT, WE HAVE OBVIOUSLY TALKED A LOT ABOUT THE PANDEMIC  
15 IMPACT, THIS IS ALL PREPANDEMIC AND WE HOPE THAT THERE IS  
16 ONGOING RECOVERY, BUT I THINK WE ALL REALLY KNOW THERE WILL BE  
17 NOT JUST DIFFERENCES, BUT SYSTEMATIC DIFFERENCES IN THE WAY  
18 PEOPLE TRAVEL, AND I'M NOT SMART ENOUGH TO TRY TO -- WE DON'T  
19 KNOW, BUT WE CAN PUT SOME GUESSES AT HOW THE MODELING WILL BE  
20 OFF BASED ON THE KINDS OF CHANGES WE EXPECT. I HAVEN'T BEEN  
21 ABLE TO DO THAT IN MY MIND, BUT IF YOU GUYS HAVE ANYTHING TO  
22 SAY ABOUT THE DIRECTION OF CHANGE, WE MIGHT EXPECT, BASED ON  
23 THE PANDEMIC, THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. A LITTLE BIT RELATED TO  
24 THAT, YOU KNOW, SO MUCH OF THIS BLUE RIBBON TRANSFORMATION  
25 ACTION PLAN EFFORT WAS ABOUT CREATING A SYSTEM THAT'S MORE



September 10, 2021

1 INTEGRATED WHERE MORE PEOPLE ARE GOING TO MAKE MORE TRANSFERS  
2 AND MAKE MORE MULTI-AGENCY REGIONAL TRIPS HAS BEEN, SORT OF,  
3 THE FUNDAMENTAL CONVERSATION IN THERE, AND THAT FARE  
4 INTEGRATION IS ONE PIECE OF THAT, BUT THERE IS A WHOLE BUNCH  
5 OF OTHER PARTS OF THAT. WE DON'T KNOW HOW FAR WE'LL GET WITH  
6 HUB -- INTEGRATED TRANSIT HUBS, AND BETTER SCHEDULED  
7 COORDINATION. BUT THAT, DIRECTLY, OBVIOUSLY, AFFECTS NOT ONLY  
8 HAS HELPED BY FARE COORDINATION, BUT IS AFFECTED BY THE  
9 BENEFITS OF FARE COORDINATION AND I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS A  
10 WAY THAT YOU CAN SUMMARIZE, IF WE SUCCEED AT THAT, WHAT  
11 DIRECTION IT WOULD PUSH SOME OF THESE CHOICES IN. BUT, I COULD  
12 USE GUIDANCE ON THAT, I AM SURE SOME OF THE DECISION MAKERS  
13 COULD USE GUIDANCE ON THAT. SORRY. JUST TWO OTHER QUICK  
14 THOUGHTS. I -- ON THE EQUITY PIECE, I MEAN, THAT'S REALLY  
15 FUNDAMENTAL TO ALL OF THIS, I FEEL LIKE THERE IS A DANGER OF  
16 WALKING AWAY FROM OPTIONS THAT, WHILE THEY BENEFIT, YOU KNOW,  
17 LOWER INCOME RIDERS, THEY MIGHT DISPROPORTIONATELY BENEFIT  
18 MIDDLE INCOME RIDERS. AND I FEEL LIKE, YOU SAID A LOT ABOUT  
19 THAT, MORE WAYS TO THINK ABOUT THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL, IN  
20 PARTICULAR, SINCE IT SEEMS LIKE WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE  
21 IS, BROADLY, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT SOLUTIONS THAT DELIVER MORE  
22 FOR TRANSIT THAN A LOT OF OTHER INTERVENTIONS THAT WE DO. MORE  
23 TO GAIN RIDERS THAN CAPITAL INTERVENTIONS MORE TO GAIN RIDERS  
24 THAN A LOT OF OPERATING INVESTMENTS SO IN THEORY THERE, IS A  
25 BIGGER PIE TO DEVOTE TO THINGS LIKE MEANS BASED FARES, AND



September 10, 2021

1 PACKAGING THIS WITH MEANS BASED FARES IS A GREAT WAY TO DEAL  
2 WITH THE EQUITY CONCERNS. HOWEVER YOU CAN GUIDE PEOPLE AWAY  
3 FROM JUST ASSUMING IF IT'S -- IF IT'S NOT SERVING THE LOW-  
4 INCOME PEOPLE BEST, IT'S NOT AN EQUITABLE SOLUTION, I THINK IT  
5 OPENS UP POSSIBILITIES FOR MORE EQUITABLE SOLUTIONS IF WE'RE  
6 COMMITTED TO PACKAGING THINGS PROPERLY. AND, YEAH, LASTLY,  
7 MORE MINOR, I JUST -- I TOTALLY APPRECIATE WHY OPTION THREE  
8 HAS AN UNCERTAIN TIME FRAME, BECAUSE IT TAKES US INTO A VERY  
9 INTEGRATED ONGOING CONVERSATION. I THINK A LOT OF PEOPLE FIND  
10 IT HARDER TO LET GO OF SOME CONCRETE IMMEDIATE DECISION ABOUT  
11 OPTION THREE, IF WE DON'T KNOW MORE FIRMLY, HOW IT'S GOING TO  
12 COME BACK. AND I IF THERE IS A WAY TO COMMIT TO A DATE THAT  
13 WILL REVIEW THE APPROPRIATENESS OF OPTION THREE ACTION, EVEN  
14 IF IT'S JUST TO SAY IT'S NOT READY YET, IT'S EASIER TO KNOW  
15 THERE IS A CONCRETE DATE THAT WE'RE GOING RECONSIDER. THANK  
16 YOU.

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** DOES STAFF HAVE A REPLY TO ANY OF THOSE  
19 COMMENTS?

20

21 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THANKS FOR THAT JONATHON, THAT'S A LOT OF  
22 REALLY INSIGHTFUL COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS THAT WE WANT TO THINK  
23 ABOUT WHEN WE BUILD INTO OUR NEXT ITERATION OF THIS. WE HAVE  
24 ALREADY TALKED A LOT ALREADY. I WANT TO LEAVE SPACE FOR  
25 OTHERS. FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, AND TAKE THIS AS AGENCY STAFF IS,



September 10, 2021

1 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE HOW THESE INITIAL STEPS GO. AND, YOU  
2 KNOW, HOW THE PILOT GOES, HOW THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE  
3 OTHER MATTERS GO, AND WHAT HAPPENS WITH FUNDING GOVERNANCE, ET  
4 CETERA BEFORE MAKING THAT KIND OF COMMITMENT. BUT THERE MAY BE  
5 OTHER VOICES THAT HAVE DIFFERENT VIEWS.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I WANT TO WEIGH IN, HAVING TRIED TO  
8 REFRAIN FROM TALKING BEFORE, WHICH IS, FIRST I HAVE A  
9 QUESTION, THEN I HAVE OTHER COMMENTS. THE QUESTION IS, THERE  
10 IS A STEP THAT IS RECOMMENDED, AND, AGAIN, I THINK THAT THE  
11 INITIAL RECOMMENDATION IN TERMS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL PASSES  
12 AND THE FREE TRANSFERS ARE GOOD PLACES TO START. THE QUESTION  
13 IS, WITH REGARD TO THE FREE TRANSFERS, IS THERE A SENSE OF,  
14 LIKE, HOW THAT WOULD BE FUNDED? OR IS THAT A FUTURE QUESTION?  
15 GO AHEAD.

16

17 **WILLIAM BACON:** IT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT QUESTION. YOU KNOW, I  
18 THINK, INITIALLY, THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY THROUGH THE AMERICAN  
19 RESCUE PLAN FUNDS TO SUPPORT LAUNCHING SOMETHING LIKE THIS. I  
20 THINK WE DO QUICKLY, KIND OF, GO BACK TO THE BIGGER ISSUES  
21 THAT MIKE WAS RAISING A MINUTE AGO, ABOUT WHAT DOES TRANSIT  
22 LOOK LIKE IN THE BAY AREA IN 2 TO 3 -- OR, YOU KNOW, IN THREE  
23 PLUS YEARS, LET'S PUT IT AT THAT TIME FRAME IN TERMS OF WHAT  
24 IS RIDERSHIP, HOW MUCH REVENUE DO WE HAVE TO SUPPORT THE  
25 OPERATOR SYSTEM, DO WE HAVE NEW FUNDING TO MODEL OR IMPLEMENT



September 10, 2021

1 TO MAKE OUR TRANSIT SERVICE WHAT WE WANT IT TO BE AND TO  
2 SUSTAIN IT IN A LONG-TERM. I DON'T THINK ANY OF US ON THIS  
3 CALL CAN ANSWER WHAT THAT'S GOING TO BE RIGHT NOW. I THINK  
4 THERE IS A LOT OF, YOU KNOW, SMART IDEAS, AND INSIGHTS ABOUT  
5 WHAT IS, MAYBE, MORE LIKELY TO HAPPEN. BUT THAT, WE DON'T HAVE  
6 AN ANSWER TO THAT RIGHT NOW, IF WE HAVEN'T HAD A PANDEMIC, I  
7 THINK WE WOULD HAVE A BETTER ANSWER TO YOUR QUESTION, ADINA,  
8 ABOUT WHETHER THIS WOULD COST LONG-TERM, HOW DO WE GO FORWARD,  
9 BUT I THINK RIGHT NOW BEYOND THREE YEARS IT'S A LITTLE BIT  
10 HARD FOR US TO KNOW HOW MUCH WE'LL HAVE TO OPERATE THE SYSTEM.  
11 WE'RE SAYING LET'S DO THIS NOW, AND KIND OF PUSH FORWARD, AND  
12 KIND OF -- YOU KNOW, CONTINUE TO EVALUATE THIS, AS WE GO  
13 FORWARD.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** UH-HUH. THANK YOU FOR THAT ANSWER. AND  
16 NOW FOR A FLURRY OF COMMENTS, WHICH I MIGHT STOP IN THE MIDDLE  
17 AND, FOR OTHER PEOPLE TO COMMENT, IF THEY RAISE THEIR HAND OR  
18 HAVE THEIR HAND ALREADY RAISED. YEAH, SO, AS I SAID BEFORE, I  
19 THINK THAT INCLUDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN AN EARLY TIER IS  
20 GOOD, HAVING BEEN DOING A LITTLE OUTREACH. I HAVE DONE SOME  
21 OUTREACH TO AFFORDABLE ORGANIZATIONS, AND TO GO ANYWHERE  
22 TRANSIT PASS PROVIDES MORE MOBILITY TO RESIDENTS THAN SAMTRANS  
23 OR VTA PASS. AND THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF ENTHUSIASM FOR THAT,  
24 AND IN TERMS OF THE PERCEPTION OF BOTH -- BOTH THE PERCEPTION  
25 OF THE PROGRAM IS SOMETHING THAT'S HELPFUL FOR EQUITY, AND



September 10, 2021

1 ALSO THE TESTING OF THE DIVERSITY OF PEOPLE WHO WOULD BENEFIT,  
2 I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL IN TERMS OF GETTING THE FEEDBACK  
3 ON THE DIVERSITY OF PEOPLE WHO WOULD BENEFIT, MORE THAN JUST  
4 TRYING OUT WITH STUDENTS THAT ARE VERY SPECIFIC POPULATION.  
5 IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE COMMENTS FROM JONATHON AND IAN, AND  
6 MAYBE SOME OTHER PEOPLE, I THINK THAT THERE ARE, IN TERMS OF  
7 BOTH THE PASSES, AND THEN -- LIKE, THE PASSES AND THE CAPS,  
8 PARTICULARLY, AND THEN MORE OF THE TIER FOUR OPTIONS, THERE  
9 ARE A BUNCH OF ASSUMPTIONS THAT WERE MADE AND TESTED ABOUT  
10 FARE LEVELS. AND, YOU KNOW, LIKE OTHER BAKED IN ASSUMPTIONS  
11 ONCE YOU GET IT MODELED, BUT TO SAY ONCE YOU TEST THIS OTHER  
12 THING THAT MIGHT REVEAL A LITTLE BIT MORE. SO I THINK THAT FOR  
13 THINGS THAT ARE NOT BEING IMPLEMENTED IMMEDIATELY, RATHER THAN  
14 TAKE THINGS OFF THE TABLE THAT ARE NOT, LIKE, OBVIOUSLY  
15 TERRIBLE, THEY'RE -- I THINK THAT THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES TO  
16 DO A LITTLE BIT MORE TESTING OF SOME OF THE, LIKE, FARE  
17 LEVELS, AND ZONE SIZES, AND WHAT NOT. TO BE ABLE TO REALLY  
18 ASSESS THE BENEFITS OF THEM. BECAUSE, LIKE I THINK THAT THERE  
19 ARE A NUMBER OF THINGS WHERE, I FEEL IT WOULD BE PREMATURE TO  
20 TAKE THEM OFF OF THE TABLE. LIKE, BEFORE MORE ASSESSMENT OF  
21 THAT, AND IN PARTICULAR, THE QUESTIONS THAT ARE ABOUT THE  
22 LEVEL. SUBSIDY NEEDED. WHERE YOU HAVE SOMETHING THAT HAS A  
23 PRETTY HIGH BENEFIT, BUT ALSO A HIGHER COST. I DON'T THINK  
24 THAT -- I THINK IT WOULD BE BETTER TO ADDRESS THAT KIND OF A  
25 QUESTION, LIKE, THAT IS A BROADER POLICY QUESTION TO THINK



September 10, 2021

1 ABOUT IN TERMS OF OVERALL SPENDING ON OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND  
2 WHAT'S WORTH DOING IT. SO IF WE HAVE SOMETHING WHERE, INSTEAD  
3 OF, LIKE IF WE WERE WANTING TO BE, SAY, UNIFYING LOCAL FARES,  
4 BUT MAKING IT AT \$1, WHICH WOULD BE EXPENSIVE -- THAT SHOULD  
5 BE A QUESTION TO BE CONSIDERED, KIND OF, YOU KNOW, IN A  
6 BROADER CONTEXT ABOUT WHAT PEOPLE ARE WILLING TO SPEND MONEY  
7 FOR. SO FOR THINGS THAT REQUIRE FUTURE MONEY, LIKE, I THINK IT  
8 WOULD BE GOOD TO CONSIDER IN TERMS OF VALUE AND COMPARATIVE  
9 VALUE TO OTHER IMPROVEMENTS TO THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. WITH  
10 REGARD TO WHAT MEMBER KASS SAID IN TERMS OF CONTINUITY AND THE  
11 TIMELINE, I THINK IT WOULD BE USEFUL TO THINK ABOUT ITEMS THAT  
12 ARE NOT BEING DONE IMMEDIATELY, LIKE, WHAT ARE THE OTHER  
13 STEPS, PARTICULARLY IN THE CONTEXT OF THE TRANSFORMATION  
14 ACTION PLAN, AND THE POTENTIAL FOR FUTURE FUNDING. WHAT  
15 ADDITIONAL ASSESSMENT AND EVALUATION SHOULD BE DONE IN THE  
16 CONTEXT OF WHAT WE DO AS A REGION WANT TO FUND. I THINK THAT  
17 WOULD BE HELPFUL TO NOT HAVE THINGS SIT ON A SHELF AND MOULDER  
18 AND REALLY TIE THINGS INTO THAT ARE REALLY SHORT-TERM TO  
19 MEDIUM TERM THINGS TO THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN FROM THE  
20 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. ONE THING THAT I AM NOT SEEING IN HERE  
21 YET BUT I WONDER WHETHER IT MAKES SENSE TO FIT IN SOMEWHERE IS  
22 THERE WERE SOME ELEMENTS ABOUT THE BENEFITS OF STANDARDIZED  
23 WAYFINDING THAT DEPENDED ON FARE STRUCTURE, AND THERE WERE  
24 PIECES -- THE MORE COMPREHENSIVE BITS OF THE WAYFINDING  
25 RECOMMENDATION, THERE WERE THINGS THAT SAID THAT, LIKE, THAT





September 10, 2021

1 HAVE HUGE BENEFITS BUT WE COULDN'T RECOMMEND THEM BECAUSE THEY  
2 DEPEND ON THE FARE STUDY. SO I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THOSE  
3 BENEFITS REPRESENTED HERE, FIGURE OUT WHERE THEY FIT, AND THEN  
4 SHOW THOSE BENEFITS TO THAT LEVEL OF WAYFINDING. BECAUSE I  
5 THINK THOSE THINGS, LIKE, INTERSECT WITH EACH OTHER. AND --  
6 LET ME SEE IF I HAVE ANY OTHER COMMENTS THAT I CAN DECIPHER  
7 HERE, NOT AT -- JUST ONE MORE THING, IN TERMS OF, THERE IS  
8 DIFFERENT LEVELS OF INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE IDENTIFIED, CERTAINLY  
9 IN TERMS OF STANDARDIZING REGIONAL FARES AND GOING BEYOND  
10 THAT, WHERE, I WANTED TO REPORT, AS A MEMBER OF THE POLICY  
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL THAT WE HAVE PRETTY CONSISTENTLY SAID THAT WE  
12 ARE OKAY WITH RECOMMENDING CHANGE THAT PROVIDES BENEFIT TO  
13 RIDERS, AND THE EXISTENCE OF CHANGE SHOULDN'T BE A REASON NOT  
14 TO GO AHEAD WITH SOMETHING THAT DOES HAVE BENEFIT FOR RIDERS  
15 AND I'LL SAY ONE MORE THING AND THEN OPEN IT UP TO PEOPLE. IN  
16 TERMS OF EQUITY, WE DO KNOW NOW, THAT WE SEE, OBSERVE, THAT  
17 MOST LOCAL TRANSIT RIDERS ARE LOW-INCOME PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND  
18 LOW-INCOME PEOPLE OF COLOR MOSTLY USE TRANSIT FOR SHORT LOCAL  
19 TRIPS. BUT WHAT WE'RE ALSO SEEING AND WHAT I SEE AS AN  
20 ADVOCATE WHEN I AM IN CONVERSATION WITH PEOPLE IN DIFFERENT  
21 COMMUNITIES AROUND THE REGION, LIKE IN TALKING TO LUNA IN EAST  
22 SAN JOSE, PEOPLE SAYING, THEY'RE -- WE WANT BETTER ACCESS TO  
23 THE REGIONAL TRANSIT TO BART AND TO CALTRAIN. SO WE WANT MORE  
24 ACCESS THAN WE GET RIGHT NOW FROM THE SYSTEM. AND SOMEONE WAS  
25 HAVING A CONVERSATION WITH THE BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT ADVOCATES



September 10, 2021

1 WHO GAVE US ONE OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE COMMUNITY-  
2 BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN THAT THEY WANT BETTER ACCESS TO  
3 REGIONAL TRANSIT TO BART AND CALTRAIN AND THAT INCLUDES  
4 SCHEDULES AND ACCESS AND OTHER ELEMENTS SO PEOPLE WHO USE  
5 TRANSIT FOR SHORT LOCAL TRIPS THAT DOESN'T NECESSARILY MEAN  
6 THAT'S ALL PEOPLE WANT AND I WANT TO ENCOURAGE INCLUDING THAT  
7 STUDY IS THAT OPENS UP THE POSSIBILITY TO THINK ABOUT OPENING  
8 UP NOT JUST SUPPORTING THE WAY PEOPLE TAKE TRIPS NOW BUT  
9 OPENING UP OPPORTUNITIES TO WHAT PEOPLE WANT. THANK YOU FOR  
10 TAKING THOSE COMMENTS. CHRISTINA GOTUACO HAS HAD HER HAND UP  
11 FOR A LONG TIME.

12

13 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** TWO COMMENTS. WHAT AY DINA MENTIONS LIKE  
14 WHAT ARE PEOPLE WILLING TO PAY FOR, IF YOU GO TO THE AIRPORT  
15 AND YOU HAVE SOMEONE DROP YOU OFF, YOU ENDS UP USING RIDE-  
16 SHARE, TRANSIT IS MORE EXPENSIVE TO THE AIRPORT, THERE'S A  
17 PREMIUM ON TOP OF IT COMPARED TO SEATTLE FOR EXAMPLE, IF YOU  
18 WERE USING TRAIN PASS, THE SAME STANDARD FARE AS GOING  
19 ANYWHERE ELSE THINKING OF BEING TALKING ABOUT CALIFORNIA AS A  
20 MEGA REGION, MAKING IT MORE CONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE, SFO,  
21 OAKLAND AIRPORT, HIGH SPEED RAIL STATIONS, BASICALLY JUST  
22 BETTER CONNECTING PEOPLE TO BOTH INSIDE AND OUTSIDE OF THE BAY  
23 AREA. NOT TO MAKE YOUR PRESENTATION LONGER, BUT I THINK IT  
24 WOULD BE NICE TO SEE OPTIONS, VISUALIZATION OR PERSONA OF A  
25 REAL PERSON TAKING A TRIP, LIKE, TRYING TO GET FROM LIVERMORE



September 10, 2021

1 TO SAN FRANCISCO, LIKE YOU HAVE TO TODAY LAFTA TO BART, AND I  
2 THINK ONE THING THAT WAS NOT REALLY MENTIONED AT ALL IN THIS  
3 PRESENTATION WAS TOURISTS TOURISM, AND ALSO RIDERS WITH  
4 DISABILITIES ADDING IN THE PERSONA WOULD BE A GOOD WAY TO  
5 MENTION THOSE PEOPLE, THAT THIS IS NOT ABOUT FARES IT'S NOT  
6 NECESSARILY ABOUT SPECIFIC TARGETING BUT JUST MAKE MENTION  
7 SOMETIME IN THE PRESENTATION. AND I THINK MY LAST COMMENT IS,  
8 I WORK IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING AT THE CALIFORNIA HOUSING  
9 PARTNERSHIP AND PREVIOUSLY AT CBH -- [INDISCERNIBLE] SO IF YOU  
10 NEED OUTREACH IN THAT DIRECTION, I CAN SUPPORT OR CONNECT.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND MOVING ON TO TISHA DEE  
13 HARTMAN.

14

15 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO ADDRESS, STAFF HAD  
16 POSED A QUESTION ON METTICS AND MEASURES OF SUCCESS IN EQUITY  
17 IMPLEMENTATION. I WANTED TO GIVE FEEDBACK ON THAT. METRIC ONE,  
18 AND OF COURSE THIS WOULD BE, HOW YOU DO THIS LOGISTICALLY I  
19 THINK THERE WOULD HAVE TO BE SOME WAY TO MEASURE THIS DATA  
20 THAT MIGHT INCORPORATE SOME CHANGE BUT CHANGE IN RIDERSHIP  
21 BROKEN DOWN BY DEMOGRAPHIC, STUDENTS, SENIORS, DISABLED,  
22 ECONOMICALLY DISADVANTAGED, THOSE ON EBT, UNEMPLOYMENT IN A  
23 METRIC AND METRIC TWO, RIDERSHIP RELATION TO THE LOCAL  
24 POPULATION DEMOGRAPHICS, FINDING THAT REACH CAN MEASURE YOUR  
25 REACHING POPULATION GROWTH IN YOUR RIDERSHIP AND BIO METRICS



September 10, 2021

1 FOR SUCCESS IN EQUITY IMPLEMENTATION AND I THINK ADDING THAT,  
2 AFFORDABILITY AND ACCESS HAVE TO BE ONE COMPONENT, MY  
3 GRANDMOTHER WHO WANTS TO GET TO CHURCH, AND SHE CAN'T DRIVE,  
4 SHE'S GOT TO BE ABLE TO GET TO THAT BUS STOP, HOW EASY IS IT  
5 FOR THEM TO GET TO THESE LOCATIONS AND HOW EASY IS IT TO  
6 NAVIGATE AND BUY THAT PARTICULATE. YOU HAVE TO PUT A LOT OF  
7 TIME AND THOUGHT INTO YOUR FOCUS GROUPS AND SENDING OUT ON  
8 DEMOGRAPHICS AND REALLY GETTING INTO THE NITTY GRITTY AND  
9 GRANULAR OF EACH OF THOSE THINGS AND AFFORDABILITY ACCESS FOR  
10 EACH OF THOSE AND DEFINING AND CREATING MEASURING EQUITY  
11 IMPLEMENTATION. AND WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT THE ROLL OUT OF  
12 PROGRAMS AND COST AND HOW WE'RE GOING TO MAKE THAT LEAP IN  
13 TERMS OF GETTING SUBSIDIES, WHEN I LOOK AT DECREASE IN VMT,  
14 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, I THINK THERE IS A LOT OF OPPORTUNITY  
15 THERE BOTH WITH OUR GOVERNOR BOTH IN SUBSIDIES AND OTHER  
16 ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE LOOKING TO DRIVE EXACTLY THAT. WE WANT  
17 A MORE ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY STATE, AND SO THESE  
18 INITIATIVES HERE, YOU LOOK AT INITIATIVE SIX, THESE ARE  
19 SUBSTANTIAL DECREASES IN VMT, AND WE HAVE TO FIND A WAY AS A  
20 TEAM TO LEAN INTO THAT AND TO REACH OUT AND TO GET THE SUPPORT  
21 FROM THOSE ORGANIZATIONS WHO WILL NOT ONLY BACK US UP WHEN WE  
22 GO TO THE GOVERNOR WHEN WE LOOK AT THESE SUBSIDIES BUT ALSO TO  
23 THE ORGANIZATIONS TO PUT THEIR MONEY WHERE THEIR MOUTH IS.  
24 THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS.  
25



September 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. RICH HEDGES?

2

3 **RICHARD HEDGES:** JUST A FINAL COMMENT. I JUST WANT TO EMPHASIZE  
4 THAT THE ISSUES OF EQUITY ARE VERY IMPORTANT. AND THE COMMENTS  
5 WHICH WERE MADE, I AGREE WITH, MOST LIKELY WITH THE HIGHEST  
6 EQUITY FROM LOCAL TO LOCAL TO LOCAL TO REGIONAL. BUT I'M ALSO  
7 INTERESTED IN GETTING RIDERSHIP BACK SO I AM INTEREST SAID IN  
8 A MODEL THAT WILL DO THAT, NOT JUST EQUITY. I DON'T WANT TO  
9 OFFEND ANYBODY, BUT ONE OF THE MAIN ISSUES WITH RIDERS IS  
10 PEOPLE FEELING SAFE AND WE HAVE TO CONVINCED THEM THAT IT'S  
11 SAFE. QUITE FRANKLY IT'S VERY SAFE TO GET VACCINATED AND IF  
12 YOU FEEL UNCOMFORTABLE, AT LEAST WEAR A MASK, AND MAYBE WE DO  
13 SOME SPOTS ON THAT. BUT WE ALSO HAVE ANOTHER ELEPHANT IN THE  
14 ROOM THAT MTC WAS BEGINNING TO TAKE ON BEFORE THE PANDEMIC,  
15 AND THAT'S ALSO SAFETY. I HAVE ALWAYS FELT SAFE ON PUBLIC  
16 TRANSIT, EXCEPT FOR A COUPLE OF INSTANCES WHERE I HAD  
17 UNLEASHED PIT BULLS IN THE SAME CAR I WAS IN, BUT, THERE IS A  
18 FEELING, ESPECIALLY WITH PEOPLE THAT AREN'T NORMALLY RIDING  
19 TRANSIT EVERY DAY, THAT THEY'RE UNSAFE, AND THERE IS SOME  
20 REASONS THEY MIGHT FEEL THAT WAY. WE HAVE GOT TO GET OVER THAT  
21 TOO. AND, SO, I DON'T KNOW THE ANSWERS TO THESE, BUT I WANT  
22 TRANSIT TO WORK. I WOULD MUCH PREFER TAKING TRANSIT EVERYWHERE  
23 I GO THAN DRIVING. IT MAKES THE PLANET CLEANER. THIS IS THE  
24 FIRST STEP BUT WE HAVE THIS HURDLE TO TALK ABOUT AND THERE IS



September 10, 2021

1 THE COUNCIL TO FIGURE IT OUT. THAT'S MY END OF PREACHING FOR  
2 TODAY.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** WENDI KALLINS.

5

6 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** IT'S BEEN ENCOURAGING LISTENING TO  
7 WHAT OTHER PEOPLE HAVE TO SAY. JUST, YOU KNOW, THE NOTION,  
8 THIS IS, AGAIN, AROUND EQUITY, AND, DO WE WANT TO FOCUS ON  
9 LOW-INCOME RIDERS WHEN -- AND I THINK THAT WE WANT TO MAKE THE  
10 EXPERIENCE BENEFICIAL FOR THE LOW-INCOME RIDERS, AND I THINK  
11 THEY'RE THE ONES WHO NEED THE SUBSIDIES THE MOST, BUT WHEN IT  
12 COMES TO ATTRACTING NEW RIDERS, I THINK WE WILL FIND MOST OF  
13 THE NEW RIDERS WE'RE TRYING TO ATTRACT ARE GOING TO BE MIDDLE  
14 AND UPPER INCOME, AND MOSTLY MIDDLE INCOME PEOPLE. AND I'M NOT  
15 SURE HOW MUCH, ESPECIALLY FOR THE UPPER INCOME PEOPLE, THE  
16 SUBSIDIES MATTER MORE THAN FREQUENCY THAN CONVENIENCE. SO  
17 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I THINK WE WOULD NEED TO JUGGLE ON THAT  
18 ONE. THE OTHER THING WAS JUST ABOUT, YOU KNOW, THE  
19 PRESENTATION ITSELF. AND IT'S A HECK OF A LOT OF WORK, AND A  
20 LOT OF INFORMATION, AND YOU HAVE TO BE QUITE A WONK TO REALLY  
21 UNDERSTAND A LOT OF WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. I'M NOT THAT  
22 MUCH WONK MYSELF, AND I THINK FOR PEOPLE WE REALLY NEED SOME  
23 TOP-LINE CONCLUSIONS THAT SUMMARIZES THINGS WHERE YOU HAVE A  
24 REPORT THAT DRILLS DOWN INTO WHERE THAT INFORMATION CAME FROM,  
25 AND WHERE THE DECISIONS CAME FROM, BUT IN THE PRESENTATION,



September 10, 2021

1 ITSELF, STAY WITH, SORT OF, A MORE GENERAL CONCLUSIONS, AND  
2 THE PEOPLE WHO ARE WONKY ENOUGH, THEY'RE GOING TO GO AND LOOK  
3 AT THE REPORT AND DIG DOWN INTO THE DETAILS, SO THAT WOULD BE  
4 A RECOMMENDATION I WOULD MAKE.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I SEE IAN GRIFFITHS HAS A HAND. I WANT TO  
7 TAKE PRIVILEGE SO THEY DON'T WANT FORGET TO ASK STAFF IF THEY  
8 HAVE A SUBSET OF THE TRANSIT AGENCY MEETINGS IF THEY COULD BE  
9 SHARED, LIKE, EVEN TODAY, THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL, LIKE, WITH IT  
10 DOESN'T NEED TO BE IN SPECIAL FORMATTING OR COLOR, IT MATTERS  
11 WHAT ARE MEETING ARE, AND WHATEVER YOU HAVE TO SHARE THEM.

12 IAN GRIFFITHS?

13

14 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** QUESTION THEN COMMENT. ON SLIDE FIVE, THE  
15 DELIVERY AND OPERATION MENTIONED, THERE IS A COLUMN THAT SAYS  
16 CUSTOMERS AND YOU CAN EXPLAIN TO ME -- I THINK I SEE  
17 EVALUATION -- BUT WHAT DOES THAT COLUMN MEAN? WHAT IS THAT  
18 ASSESSING? IF YOU CAN KNOW WHAT I'M REFERRING TO ON SLIDE 39?

19

20 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SORRY FOLKS. THAT IS IMPACT -- LIKE, CHANGE  
21 MANAGEMENT REQUIRED, OR CHANGES REQUIRED FOR EXISTING  
22 CUSTOMERS. SO, IF A LOT OF CUSTOMERS HAVE TO LEARN A NEW  
23 SYSTEM THEN THAT WOULD BE HIGH.

24



September 10, 2021

1 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH. I THINK THIS -- I'M NOT SURE WHAT THE --  
2 I THINK THIS IS A PRETTY UNFAIR ASSESSMENT THAT IS -- YOU'RE  
3 BASICALLY SAYING THIS IS FURTHER FROM THE STATUS QUO, AND  
4 THEREFORE, THE ONES WHO ARE CLOSE TO THE STATUS QUO ARE THE  
5 STRONGER PERFORMERS, AND THE FARTHER AWAY ARE THE ONES --  
6 WHERE YOU GREENS AND REDS SHOW UP, I DON'T THINK -- I THINK  
7 THAT'S PRETTY UNFAIR. IT'S LIKE -- YOU'RE UNFAIRLY PUNISHING  
8 PEOPLE FOR STATUS QUO. I DON'T KNOW WHAT VALUE THAT PROVIDES  
9 OTHER THAN REMINDING PEOPLE THAT OPTIONS 4, 5, AND 6 ARE MORE  
10 CHANGE. BUT, AGAIN, IT WOULD SUGGEST, BASED ON WHAT WE KNOW IN  
11 OTHER PARTS OF THE WORLD THAT THESE ARE ACTUALLY MORE POPULAR  
12 AMONG CUSTOMERS, IF THEY'RE WORKING SO WELL IN OTHER PLACES.  
13 SO, A COUPLE OF OTHER COMMENTS. I HAVE BROUGHT THIS UP BEFORE,  
14 BUT SOMEWHERE IN -- IT FEELS APPROPRIATE IF SOMEWHERE IN --  
15 YOU HAVE FOUR DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF THE BUSINESS CASE,  
16 DIFFERENT LENSES AS YOU LOOK AT IT, THERE IS A BENEFIT OF  
17 THESE MORE COMPREHENSIVE OPTIONS IN THAT THEY ENABLE GREATER  
18 AND DEEPER INTEGRATION IN AREAS THAT GO BEYOND FARES. THE OF  
19 COOLING OF FARE REVENUE AND THE, SORT OF, FINANCIAL FATE OF  
20 EACH AGENCY ACTUALLY ENABLES MUCH MORE RAPID DECISION MAKING  
21 AND COLLECTIVE DECISION MAKING THAT CAN FOCUS ON, LIKE, THE  
22 RIDER, LIKE THE PIECE OF ONE RIDER AT THE END OF THE DAY AS  
23 OPPOSED TO DIFFERENT SETS OF RIDERS. ADINA INDICATED THE  
24 SYNERGIES DELIVERING BETTER WAY FINDING AND UNIFIED BRANDING.  
25 IF YOU GO AND STANDARDIZE ALL FARES, YOU DO NOT NEED AN





September 10, 2021

1 INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT BRAND ANYMORE. YOU GO FROM 27 TRANSIT  
2 BRANDS TO HAVING ONE. AND, AGAIN, THIS IS WHERE, IF YOU WERE  
3 TO PRESENT THE USER EXPERIENCE RESEARCH IN SUCH A WAY WHERE  
4 IT'S TO SAY, HERE IS ALL THESE FARE POLICIES AND THE OVERLAY  
5 THAT'S WITH EXTREMELY SIMPLIFIED BRANDING SYSTEMS, AND  
6 EXTREMELY SIMPLIFIED FARE TABLE, LIKE THEN I WOULD IMAGINE YOU  
7 WOULD SEE SIGNIFICANTLY MORE USERS SAYING, OH MY GOSH, YEAH  
8 THAT IS WAY MORE SIMPLE. I'M NOT ACTUALLY -- I DON'T --  
9 [INDISCERNIBLE] 25 ZONES THAT'S DIFFERENT THAN THE STATUS QUO,  
10 THAT IS HOW IT WOULD BE PRESENTED TO ME AS A USER. SO I FEEL  
11 LIKE THAT SHOULD BE THAT KIND OF COBENEFIT, ENABLING DEEPER  
12 INTEGRATION OF COBENEFITS WITH, YOU KNOW, OTHER KIND OF GOALS  
13 OF -- YOU KNOW, OTHER -- AS AN ENABLER OF OTHER POLICY OF --  
14 THAT OUGHT TO BE A COLUMN SOMEWHERE IN A ROW OR IN THE TABLE  
15 ASSESSMENTS. AND I THINK WHERE THE OPTION THAT DO REQUIRE  
16 INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE AND COLLECTIVE DECISION MAKING WOULD  
17 SCORE BETTER ON THE CRITERIA, AND TO MAINTAIN THE STATUS QUO  
18 AND 20,000 CLIPPER RULES WHATEVER THEY ARE LIKE WE SHOULD BE  
19 REFLECTED ON THE WEEKLY CRITERIA. FOR ME, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE,  
20 GOING BACK TO OPTION THREE, YOU KNOW, OR THE TIER THREE, I  
21 MEAN, LET'S JUST SAY THE RECOMMENDATION IS, ADOPT A REGION  
22 BASED SYSTEM LIKE LET THE RECOMMENDATION BE LET'S CONTINUE TO  
23 EVALUATE THESE. YOU'RE SAYING THEY PROVIDE BENEFIT. I THINK  
24 THE RECOMMENDATION SAY, LET'S DO IT, LET'S CONTINUE TO  
25 EVALUATE WHICH OF THESE OPTIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS SHOULD



September 10, 2021

1 BE THAT WE ADOPTED. I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT BECAUSE THERE IS  
2 A LOT OF REFERRING BACK AND FORTH BETWEEN THE BLUE RIBBON TASK  
3 FORCE AND THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE -- LIKE, STUD E  
4 WHERE THEY'RE SAYING, WELL WE'RE GOING TO LISTEN TO WHAT THE  
5 FARE INTEGRATION STUDIES, AND THE FARE INTEGRATION STUDY IS  
6 SAYING WE'RE GOING TO LISTEN TO THE CONVERSATIONS OF THE BLUE  
7 RIBBON TASK FORCE. I THINK I WOULD PREFER THE RECOMMENDATION  
8 FROM THE TASK FORCE TO THE BOARD SHOULD BE WE SEE THE VALUE IN  
9 THREE WE KNOW THERE IS MORE ANALYSIS THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE  
10 WITH THE RECOMMENDATION, AND SHOULD BE STRONGER THAN IT IS  
11 RIGHT NOW. AND THIS IS MY FINAL COMMENT. ON THE TRIP BASE  
12 VERSUS PRICE BASED CAP ISSUE, I'M HAVING TROUBLE UNDERSTANDING  
13 -- FIRST OF ALL, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT EXISTS ANYWHERE, MAYBE  
14 YOU CAN CLARIFY IT, IF THERE IS AN EXAMPLE OF WHERE THAT  
15 EXISTS, LIKE, I KNOW PRICES CAP I'M NOT SURE WHEREBY A REGION  
16 WHERE YOU WOULD HAVE SUCH CAPS WHERE YOU WOULD HAVE SUCH  
17 VARIATION IN THE DIFFERENT PRICES OF INDIVIDUAL TRIPS THAT  
18 WOULD MAKE THAT CAP. I HAVE A COUPLE OF CONCERNS IN THE  
19 STRATEGY OVERLAYING THAT TRIP BASED CAP ON OUR CURRENT SYSTEM  
20 ONE IS IT DOESN'T NECESSARILY PROVIDE PREDICTABILITY TO THE  
21 RIDER AS TO HOW MUCH THEY'RE GOING TO PAY IN A MONTH IS THE  
22 POINT OF A PRICE CAP. IF YOU ARE BEING CAPPED AT 35 TRIPS AND  
23 THOSE FIRST 35 TRIPS ARE \$8 A TRIP, THEN YOU'RE PAYING A LOT  
24 MORE MONEY A MONTH THAN IF THE FIRST TRIPS YOU TAKE ARE \$2  
25 MONTH. THAT DOESN'T MEET THE CRITERIA PREDICTABILITY. I WOULD



September 10, 2021

1 ALSO IMAGINE TO IT LEADING TO INN PREDICTABLE BEHAVIOR OF  
2 PEOPLE TRYING TO MAKE SURE THEIR FIRST 35 TRIPS ARE ALL ON THE  
3 CHEAPEST SYSTEMS AND FOR THE REST OF THE MONTH USING THE MOST  
4 EXPENSIVE TRIP, LIKE SHIFTING BEHAVIOR IN WAYS LIKE THEY'RE  
5 JUST TRYING TO SAVE MONEY I DON'T THINK THAT SHOULD HAVE BEEN  
6 EFFECTIVE AT THE END OF THE DAY. AND THE PRICE BASED CAP  
7 VERSUS TRIP BASED CAP IT DOES INTERSECT, IT SEEMS LIKE THERE  
8 IS A PRICE BASED CAP AND KIND OF HAS ITS OWN BASE SYSTEM OR  
9 HAVING MORE -- LIKE, IF YOU HAVE OUR EXISTING SYSTEM THEN IT'S  
10 -- LIKE, THEN YOU CAN'T HAVE A -- A PRICE BASED CAP HAS A  
11 BIGGER IMPLICATION LIKE IF YOU HAD A PASS THERE ARE CERTAIN  
12 ZONES FOR THE POTENTIAL SOUTH BAY EAST BAY NORTH BAY AND THAT  
13 BECOMES ANY TRIPS WITHIN THAT SUBREGION THE WAY YOU HAVE THAT,  
14 FOR, LIKE, OPTIONS 6, AND 5, POTENTIALLY E THEN I WOULD  
15 IMAGINE THE RELATIVELY -- THE RELATIVE EXTRA COST OF THE PRICE  
16 BASE LOWER, BECAUSE YOU GET MORE CONTROL OVER WHAT THAT WOULD  
17 BE. I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT COULD BE REFLECTED. AND DESPITE ALL  
18 MY COMMENTS, THANK YOU. I WANT TO EXPRESS THAT, THANK YOU FOR  
19 ALL THE HARD WORK. THIS IS REALLY INTERESTING WORK AND I'M  
20 JUST TRYING TO FOCUS ON THE THINGS --

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** YES. THANK YOU. I DO WANT TO TAKE PUBLIC  
23 COMMENT BEFORE WE HEAR BACK FROM -- DOES ANYBODY HAVE  
24 COMMENTS? I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM ROLAND WHO HAS A HAND.

25



September 10, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. LET ME HELP A LITTLE BIT HERE, PLEASE  
2 GOOGLE LONDON, AS YOU GO CAPS, AND YOU WILL LEARN A LOT ABOUT  
3 CAPS, EITHER DAILY OR WEEKLY. I REALLY WANT TO THANK BILL AND  
4 MIKE FOR BRINGING SOME COMMON SENSE AND SANITY TO THE SEAMLESS  
5 CONVERSATION. I HAVE A QUICK COMMENT AND A COUPLE OF  
6 QUESTIONS. THE COMMENT BILL MADE THAT VTA [INDISCERNIBLE] I  
7 WANT TO YOU CONSIDER THAT VTA, IF YOU PAY TWO AND A HALF  
8 BUCKS, AND YOU PAY, AND YOU USE THREE TRANSFERS, YOU CAN  
9 TRAVEL FROM GILROY TO PALO ALTO, WHICH IS OVER 50 MILES FOR  
10 TWO AND A HALF BUCKS, WHICH IS JUST UNDER \$0.05 A MILE, I  
11 WOULD LIKE TO KNOW OF ANOTHER AGENCY IN THE BAY AREA THAT CAN  
12 DO THIS. AND, SO THE FIRST QUESTION I HAVE GOT, IT'S WHEN YOU  
13 LOOK AT THE COMPLEXITY OF THE ALGORITHMS, IN CLIPPER TWO, IS  
14 WHETHER YOU'RE ALSO KEEPING IN LINE ON THE GPS STANDARD AND  
15 WHETHER IT WOULD BE ABLE TO HANDLE THAT KIND OF COMPLEXITY,  
16 AND IF NOT IT MAYBE WOULD BE A GOOD TIME TO REACH OUT TO  
17 GOOGLE. AND THE REASON I BRING THIS TO YOUR ATTENTION, I AND  
18 PEOPLE WHO COME FROM A BROAD, WHEN THEY ACTUALLY -- BEFORE  
19 EVEN GETTING ON THE PLANE, THEY CLICK ON MAPS AND THEY KNOW  
20 WHERE THAT I WANT TO GO, AND THEY'RE INTERESTED IN TWO THINGS,  
21 HOW LONG THE TRIP IS GOING TO TAKE AND HOW MUCH IT'S GOING TO  
22 COST, AND THAT REALLY IS IMPORTANT. BECAUSE RIGHT NOW, GOOGLE  
23 IS NOT WORKING FOR ME, WHEN I ASK GOOGLE HOW MUCH IS IT GOING  
24 TO COST FOR ME TO GO TO SAN FRANCISCO, FOR INSTANCE. THE OTHER  
25 QUESTION I HAVE, AND I MAY HAVE ASKED THIS QUESTION BEFORE, IS



September 10, 2021

1 WHETHER HIGH SPEED RAIL AND CAPITAL CORRIDOR ARE IN THE  
2 PICTURE. AND IF NOT, WHY NOT? THANK YOU.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** AND IF STAFF COULD -- IF THERE IS TIME FOR  
5 STAFF TO ADDRESS ANY FACTUAL QUESTIONS ON THAT, THAT WOULD BE  
6 WELCOME.

7

8 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** CAPITAL CORRIDOR IS NOT INCLUDED, MOSTLY  
9 BECAUSE WE WERE JUST TRYING TO STICK TO A MANAGEABLE SCOPE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND WE RECEIVED NO CORRESPONDENCE BY THE  
12 NOON DEADLINE.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I SEE THAT  
15 CHRISTINA GOTUACO HAS HAD A HAND. DO WE HAVE TIME TO TAKE THAT  
16 LAST COMMENT FROM MEMBER GOTUACO? CHRISTINA.

17

18 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** YEAH. I FORGOT. I WANTED TO COMMENT  
19 EARLIER, IF YOU COULD JUST LOOK BACK AT YOUR PRESENTATION AND  
20 SEE IN TERMS OF PEOPLE BEING REPRESENTED IN ONE OF THE  
21 COLUMNS, PER IAN'S COMMENT, IF THERE IS A USER EXPERIENCE  
22 VERSUS A -- AN EQUITY IMPACT, SOMETIMES I THINK THEY GOT  
23 PUNCHED INTO THE SAME COLUMN AND THAT IS KIND OF CAUSING  
24 CONFUSION, IS IT HIGH OR LOW AND MAYBE THERE IS A WAY TO  
25 SEPARATE OUT THE EXPERIENCED RIDERS, AND USERS IN TERMS OF



September 10, 2021

1 EXPERIENCED RIDERS IN TERMS OF EQUITY IMPACTS IT MIGHT LAY OUT  
2 DIFFERENTLY IN THE COLOR CODING. AND KIND OF TO WENDI'S  
3 COMMENT, EARLIER, I THINK ESSENTIAL AND NON-ESSENTIAL WORKERS  
4 ARE TWO GROUPS THAT WE MIGHT ALSO WANT TO CONSIDER THINKING  
5 ABOUT IN THAT ESSENTIAL IS THE ONE THAT MAYBE STILL BE USING  
6 TRANSIT A LOT MORE BECAUSE THEY'RE COMMUTERS OF THE FUTURE.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. I WANT TO TOSS IN A LAST  
9 PIGGYBACKING ON TOP OF THE COMMENT ON THE PRICE BASED CAP  
10 VERSUS THE TRIP-BASED CAP. I HAVE THE SAME CONFUSION ABOUT THE  
11 TRIP-BASED CAP. WHO KNOWS IF YOU'RE TAKING 30 TRIPS VERSUS 26  
12 TRIPS I WAS WONDERING IF THERE WAS A WAY TO ACTUALLY TWEAK THE  
13 LEVELS SO THAT IF WE HAD A PRICE-BASED CAP THAT WAS AT, YOU  
14 KNOW, ONE HUNDREDS 50, \$160 FOR ALL AGENCIES, AND THEN DID A  
15 MEANS-BASED DISCOUNT, DOWN, TO LIKE, \$50 FOR VERY LOW-INCOME  
16 PEOPLE, LIKE, WOULD WE GET THE BENEFITS OF THE RIDERSHIP  
17 BENEFITS OF THE -- YOU KNOW, AS WELL AS EQUITY BENEFITS? I  
18 THINK THAT BEAR SOME DIFFERENT LEVER THERE IS TO PULL ON THAT.  
19 WITH THAT, I'M NOT SEEING ANY MORE HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THIS  
20 BODY, OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. I REALLY WANTED TO THANK STAFF  
21 AND THE CONSULTANTS FOR DOING THIS REALLY VERY IMPORTANT  
22 PROJECT AND, YOU KNOW, LOOKING FORWARD TO THE FEEDBACK PROCESS  
23 TO TAKE US TO THE DECISIONS THAT HOPEFULLY INCLUDE THE INITIAL  
24 RECOMMENDATIONS OF THIS. TERRIFIC. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND  
25 HAVE A GOOD EVENING.



September 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** REGULAR OTHER ITEMS BEFORE YOU SIGN OFF,  
3 PLEASE.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I 'M SORRY.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OTHER AND BUSINESS.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** HERE. HANG ON. LET ME NAVIGATE BACK TO THE  
10 AGENDA HERE. YEAH. ON NEW BUSINESS, MEMBERS OF THE  
11 SUBCOMMITTEE MAY BRING UP NEW BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR  
12 ADDITION TO A FUTURE AGENDA. DO WE HAVE ANY SUCH ITEMS? I AM  
13 NOT SEEING ANY OTHER THAN THE VIGOROUS PLEA FOR THE TRANSIT  
14 BOARD ROAD SHOW AS SOON AS HUMANLY -- OR AS SOON AS  
15 PRACTICALLY POSSIBLE. AGENDA ITEM SIX, PUBLIC COMMENTS. WE DID  
16 HEAR ABOUT WHETHER THERE WERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS -- OR WE  
17 DIDN'T HEAR THAT. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT  
18 HAVE COMMENTS ON ITEMS NOT RELATED TO TODAY AGENDA? AND --

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
21 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
22 ON THIS ITEM. BY THE NOON DEADLINE.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THE  
25 NEXT ITEM IS ADJOURNMENT TO THE NEXT MEETING, WHICH IS MONDAY



September 10, 2021

1 OCTOBER THE FOURTH, 2021, AT 10:00, BY WEBCAST. SO, ADJOURN  
2 UNTIL THE NEXT MEETING. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR EVERYONE'S  
3 ATTENTION. [ADJOURNED]  
4





*Broadcasting Government*