METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL

FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE

MONDAY, AUGUST 2, 2021, 10:00 A.M.

DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. GOOD MORNING AND WELCOME TO EVERYBODY. WE'LL START WITH THE CLERK CALLING THE ROLL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. CHAIR LEVIN?

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR KALLINS.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ALLEN? COCHRAN HAS RESIGNED FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EFFECTIVE IMMEDIATELY. MEMBER CORDES? MEMBER ELDRED?

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER GOTUACO? MEMBER GRIFFITHS?

IAN GRIFFITHS: HERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER HARTMAN?

TISHA DEE HARTMAN: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: HEDGES?

RICHARD HEDGES: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: KASS?

JONOTHON KASS: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: LITVAK?

GWEN LITVAK: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MALLON? MEMBER MALLON? I HEAR YOU. OKAY. MEMBER MENDOZA?

ADRIAN MENDOZA: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: AND MEMBER STANKE? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GREAT. SO, MOVING ON TO ITEM NUMBER THREE, APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES MARCH 12TH, AND MAY 10TH. IS THERE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES?

IAN GRIFFITHS: MOTION, GRIFFITHS?

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: SECOND, ELDRED.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. CAN STAFF HELP US WITH -- ACTUALLY, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. CAN THE CLERK HELP WITH THE VOTE?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: TERRIFIC. WE'LL NOW MOVE TO THE AGENDA ITEM THAT WE ARE WAITING FOR, WHICH IS THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY AND BUSINESS CASE PROJECT CITED UPDATE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND FIRST LOOK AT RECOMMENDATIONS. WHERE WE WILL HEAR FROM STAFF WITH THE START OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE STUDY.

WILLIAM BACON: EVERYBODY. AND THANK YOU CHAIR LEVIN TOWER FOR YOUR TIME BEING HERE AND BEING PART OF THIS SUBCOMMITTEE. MY NAME IS BILL BACON MTC PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE FARE COORDINATION STUDY AND MIKE EISEMAN IS JOINING US TODAY AND WE'RE GOING TO WALK YOU THROUGH THE PRESENTATION AND SLIDES AND LOOK FORWARD TO DISCUSSION WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND BEING ABLE TO ADDRESS YOUR QUESTIONS AND ALLOWING TO SHAPE THE FINAL WORK THAT THE PROJECT IS FOCUSING ON RIGHT NOW AS WE PREPARE TO MAKE OUR DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE, WHICH AS MANY OF YOU WILL RECALL IS THE GOVERNING BODY FOR THIS PROJECT MADE UP OF THE GENERAL MANAGERS FOR A NUMBER OF OUR LARGE OPERATORS AS WELL MTC. TODAY THE TEAM IS HERE TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE STUDY AND BEGIN DISCUSSION OF THE PROJECTS FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS WE WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOU ALL YOUR PARTICIPATION IN THE PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BEFORE I DIG INTO THE CONTENT OF THIS MORNING'S PRESENTATION, I WANT TO QUICKLY LAY OUT THE KEY POINTS WE'RE GOING TO FOCUS ON TODAY. FIRST WE WANT TO UPDATE THE SUBCOMMITTEE ON OUR LATEST PROJECT SCHEDULE OF WHICH THERE HAVE BEEN SOME CHANGES BOTH SINCE OUR LAST INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING AND SINCE WE LAST SPOKE TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE A COUPLE OF MONTHS AGO. THIS FOCUSES ON THE IMPORTANT ONGOING WORK AND ANALYSIS TASKS WHICH

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WILL REALLY ENABLE THE PROJECT TEAM TO BRING FORWARD OUR RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE TASK FORCE WHEN THEY MEET IN SEPTEMBER. WE ALSO HAVE FRAMEWORK OF INTEGRATION TIERS WHICH PROVIDE STRUCTURE TO OUR DISCUSSION AND STUDY RECOMMENDATIONS AND TO FRAME HOW WE MAKE OUR RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE STAKEHOLDERS THE PUBLIC, THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ET CETERA. WE WILL WALK THE SUBCOMMITTEE THROUGH OUR INITIAL DELIVERY ASSESSMENT AND FIRST LOOK AT RECOMMENDATIONS TO DETAIL WITH THIS GROUP ABOUT WHAT THOSE LOOK LIKE. OUR SCHEDULE HAS CHANGED A BIT SINCE THE LAST SUBCOMMITTEE WE MET IN JULY, TWO WEEKS AGO, UNFORTUNATELY DUE TO CHALLENGES WITH THE TRAVEL DEMAND MODELING WE WERE UNABLE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE RECOMMENDATION OR MAKING THE RECOMMENDATIONS PUBLIC IN JULY. THAT WAS A SLIGHT DELAY IN OUR SCHEDULE, BUT I THINK MIKE EISEMAN AND I FEEL IT WAS THE APPROPRIATION TO LAY RELEASING THE RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE TASK FORCE UNTIL WE ALLOW THE ANALYTICAL TECHNICAL WORK TO CONTINUE SO WE'RE SETTING THE PROJECT UP FOR ITS BEST CHANCE. AS NOTED BY THE FIRST ITEM ON THIS TIMELINE YOU WILL SEE WE'RE GOING TO PROVIDE THE SUBCOMMITTEE WITH A FIRST LOOK AT THE RECOMMENDATIONS. OVER THE COURSE OF THE MONTH OF AUGUST, THE PROJECT AND CONSULTANT TEAM ARE GOING TO CONTINUE TO REFINE THE RECOMMENDATIONS AND UPDATE OUR ANALYSIS BASED ON FEEDBACK THAT WE HEAR FROM STAKEHOLDERS AS WE PREPARE TO PRESENT THE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ON JULY -- I'M SORRY -- ON SEPTEMBER 10TH, AS YOU WILL SEE NOTED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IN THE ORANGE BOX ON THE LEFT. I'M SORRY -- I'M GETTING THIS WRONG. THERE IS A LABELING ERROR HERE. SO THE -- LET ME CORRECT MYSELF. SO, YEAH. SORRY FOR -- THIS IS MY CONFUSION AND MY NOTES ARE OFF HERE. SO MY APOLOGIES. ON SEPTEMBER 10TH AS YOU WILL SEE IN THE ORANGE BOX IT SHOULD BE LABELED DIFFERENTLY, SO MY APOLOGIES. THIS IS SUPPOSED TO SAY THE SCIF SUBCOMMITTEE, THIS GROUP THAT'S MEETING NOW, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A SECOND MEETING OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE BEFORE THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE NEXT MEETS. THE SO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IS IN THE SECOND BOX TO THE RIGHT MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 10TH BUT SEPTEMBER 10TH, WE'RE GOING TO CONVENE WITH THIS SUBCOMMITTEE TO GIVE A FINAL DRAFT RECOMMENDATION BEFORE THEY ARE PRESENTED TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. ON 20TH, THE RECOMMENDATIONS GO TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AND THE PROJECT TEAM WILL PROVIDE UPDATES AND PRESENTATIONS AT INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEETINGS CONTINUING FROM THE PERIOD OF SEPTEMBER 10TH THROUGH THE END OF OCTOBER. WE'RE STARTING TO SCHEDULE PRESENTATIONS AND AGENCY MEETINGS FOR THAT TIME. OCTOBER 18TH THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE WILL MEET AND PRESENT PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS I CAN'T SAY FOR CERTAIN THEY WILL ACT TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATIONS AT THAT MEETING A LOT WILL DEPEND HOW RECOMMENDATIONS ARE RECEIVED BY STAKEHOLDERS AND HOW THE TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD PRESS PROCEED BUT THAT IS FIRST OPPORTUNITY ON OCTOBER 18TH FOR THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FORCE TO ACT. THE MTC COMMISSION IS GOING TO BE HOLDING A WORKSHOP ON OCTOBER 27TH, AND 28TH AND THAT WORKSHOP FOCUSES ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE ACTION PLAN AND HOW THE AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN OR ARP FUNDING MIGHT AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT SOME OF THE DELIVERY OF SOME OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN ITEMS COMING OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. FARE INTEGRATION IN THIS PROJECT ARE ONE OF THE KEY ITEMS IDENTIFIED AT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AS EARLY ACTIONS THROUGH THE EARLY ACTION PLAN SO THE PROJECT TEAM IS FOCUSED ON ENSURING THAT OUR RECOMMENDATIONS ARE READY FOR ALL OF THE POLICY MAKERS AND DECISION MAKERS TO HAVE AVAILABLE FOR THEIR REVIEW IN ADVANCE OF THAT COMMISSION WORKSHOP, SHOULD THE COMMISSION CHOOSE TO MAKE AMERICAN RESCUE PLANS AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT THE DELIVER OF SOME OF THIS PROJECT'S RECOMMENDATIONS. SO WE CAN TALK MORE ABOUT THAT LATER IN THE PRESENTATION BUT THAT'S AN IMPORTANT MILESTONE IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO DELIVER SOME OF OUR INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS AND ENSURING THAT THERE IS FUNDING AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT THAT DELIVERY. AND THEN, AS THE FAR RIGHT HERE ON THE SCHEDULE UPDATE SLIDE NOTES, THE DELIVER OF DEMONSTRATION PROJECTS AND LONGER TERM ACTIONS WILL CONTINUE WITH SOME ACTIONS LIKELY TO HAPPEN IN THE VERY NEAR-TERM, AND THEN OTHER ACTIONS TAKING A LONGER PERIOD OF TIME AND WE'LL TALK ABOUT THAT IN THE NEXT SLIDE -- SUBSEQUENT SLIDES. ADINA, I SEE YOUR HAND RAISED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: BEFORE WE MOVE ON, I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS ABOUT THE SCHEDULE. AND FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR FIXING THE TYPO OVER THE WEEKEND. [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] VERSION -- WITH THE TYPO. AND THE QUESTION I HAVE IS, AT THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING, WHEN THE GENERAL MANAGERS REACTED TO THE TIMELINE, THERE WERE SEVERAL WHO SAID, HMM... YOU KNOW, IF WE GET THE RECOMMENDATIONS IN SEPTEMBER, AND THEN WE ARE SLATED TO VOTE IN OCTOBER, IT MAY TAKE US LONGER TO BE ABLE TO MAKE A DECISION, AND I CAN SEE WHY IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR THE SCHEDULE, BECAUSE 10/18 IS BEFORE 10/27, AND 10/28 WHERE MTC WOULD CONSIDER FUNDING SOME OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS. WHAT WOULD HAPPEN TO THE TIMELINE IF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE SAYS WE WANT ANOTHER MONTH AND WE WANT TO MAKE A DECISION IN NOVEMBER WHAT WOULD HAPPEN WITH THE FUNDING IF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WORKSHOP IN OCTOBER?

WILLIAM BACON: I CAN'T SAY EXACTLY WHAT THE MTC COMMISSION WOULD DO IN THAT SITUATION. AT THAT TIME THE COMMISSION WOULD HAVE THE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS AVAILABLE IT'S POSSIBLE THAT THE COMMISSION AT THEIR WORKSHOP COULD CHOOSE TO PROPOSE A PATH FORWARD THAT WOULD FUND SPECIFIC ACTIONS THAT THEY WERE VERY SUPPORTIVE OF. I DON'T THINK THAT'S THEIR PREFERRED POSITION. I THINK THE PREFERRED POSITION WOULD BE TO HAVE THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ADOPT THE ACTIONS AND STUDY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RECOMMENDATIONS BEFORE THE MTC COMMISSION CHOOSES TO INVEST IN SOMETHING. ONE THING I NOTICED IS I DON'T BELIEVE THE COMMISSION WORKSHOP THERE WILL BE AN OFFICIAL ACTION TO PROGRAM FUND TO A SPECIFIC THING. I SHOULD SAY, TO A SPECIFIC PROJECT, YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S MORE LIKELY THAT THERE WOULD BE AN ACTION -- A RECOMMENDATION, AND DISCUSSION ABOUT DIRECTING A SPECIFIC AMOUNT OF MONEY TO A BLUE RIBBON IMPLEMENTATION ACTION PLAN, FOCUS AREA, ONE OF WHICH IS FARE INTEGRATION SO THEY MIGHT CHOOSE TO SAY WE WOULD LIKE TO INVEST X AMOUNT OF MONEY IN FARE INTEGRATION AND X AMOUNT OF MONEY IN TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY OR TRANSIT NETWORK PRIORITY. SO IT'S A LITTLE BIT HARD FOR ME TO ANSWER THE QUESTION. I THINK THE DETAIL THAT YOU MIGHT WANT, BUT, YOU KNOW, OUR GOAL IS TO PROVIDE ALL OF THE DECISION MAKERS, BOTH ON THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE, TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS, AND MTC COMMISSION WITH THE FULL DETAILS OF WHAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE IN SEPTEMBER, SO THAT THERE IS, YOU KNOW, AT LEAST A MONTH FOR DISCUSSIONS. HOPEFUL TOW A POINT WHERE STAKEHOLDERS CAN SAY, YOU KNOW, WE'RE SUPPORTIVE OF THIS. THERE IS A LOT OF DETAILS THAT NEED TO BE DISCUSSED AND FIGURED OUT IN TERMS OF IMPLEMENTATION BUT THAT WE SUPPORT THIS CONCEPT AND THESE VISIONS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GREAT. AND ARE THERE ANY OF THE BOARD AGENDA ITEMS THAT HAVE BEEN YET SCHEDULED AND CAN THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INFORMATION BE SENT TO THIS BODY AS THOSE SCHEDULING DATES ARE DETERMINED?

WILLIAM BACON: YES WE CAN AND I KNOW THE BART IMPLEMENTATION IS SCHEDULED.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: I BELIEVE IT'S SCHEDULED -- THE BART BOARD MEETING IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE 20TH, WHICH I BELIEVE IS THE SEPTEMBER 20TH -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I'LL CONFIRM THAT.

WILLIAM BACON: THE SAME WEEK THERE, ADINA.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: FANTASTIC. DOES ANYBODY HAVE QUESTIONS ABOUT THE SCHEDULE BEFORE WE MOVE ON?

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: QUICK QUESTION ABOUT THE 9/10 MEETING, DO WE HAVE A TIME FOR THAT YET?

WILLIAM BACON: I BELIEVE WE DO. . BEAR WITH ME. IT'S AT 2:00 P.M.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: IT'S LISTED AT THE END OF TODAY AGENDA.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU.

WILLIAM BACON: OKAY. WE CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS THE PROJECT HAS PROGRESSED OVER THE COURSE OF WHAT'S BEEN PROBABLY THE MOST CHALLENGING YEAR FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE HISTORY OF OUR MODERN PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM, ONE IMPORTANT THEME THAT IS CENTRAL TO OUR SCOPE OF WORK REALLY STANDS OUT AND WE WANT TO REMIND ALL OF US AS WE THINK ABOUT IT AND THAT'S THAT FARE POLICY SHOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE TRANSIT USE. AND THAT'S SORT OF ULTIMATELY WHAT ONE OF OUR MAIN GOALS ARE IN THIS PROJECT IS TO ENCOURAGE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND MAKE THE SYSTEM EASIER FOR USERS FARE POLICY SHOULD COMPLEMENT OPERATIONAL CAPITAL INVESTMENTS IN THE TRANSIT NETWORK AS A WHOLE AND ENSURE THAT POLICIES AND FARE STRUCTURES DON'T CREATE A BARRIER TO TRANSIT. THESE HAVE BEEN IMPORTANT TOUCH STONES FOR THE PROJECT TEAM AND OUR CONSULTANTS THROUGHOUT OUR WORK AND I WANT TO REMIND US THAT THAT'S ONE OF THE REASONS WE TOOK ON THIS STUDY AND WHY WE'RE HERE TO TRY TO IMPROVE THE USER EXPERIENCE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, FARE POLICY IS ONE OF MANY ISSUES THAT HAVE IMPACTED THE LEVEL OF TRANSIT USAGE IN THE BAY AREA, BOTH BEFORE THE COVID-19 AND OVER THE LAST 16 MONTHS. THE FARE POLICIES WE HAVE TODAY ARE NOT THE RESULT OF RANDOM POLICY ACTIONS AND RATHER THEY USUALLY REFLECT THE TRANSIT FUNDING AND DECISION MAKING MODELS IN THE REGION AT THE LOCAL LEVEL, WHICH INCENTIVIZE FARE POLICIES THAT FOCUS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MOSTLY ON LOCAL TRIPS OR TRIPS WITHIN THE NETWORK OF A SINGLE OPERATOR. SO THESE ISSUES THAT YOU SEE ON THIS SLIDE ARE CAPTURED ON OUR PROJECT PROBLEM STATEMENT WHICH HAS HELPED SHAPE OUR ANALYSIS. WE HAVE TOUCHED ON THESE KEY ISSUES, CUSTOMER VALUE, PAYMENT EXPERIENCE, FUTURE OF TRANSIT, WHICH IS REALLY FOCUSED ON CAPITAL PROJECTS AND EXPANSION AND EQUITY WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE BEFORE, BUT THESE CORE ELEMENTS OF HOW -- BUT THESE REALLY ARE THE CORE ELEMENTS OF HOW THE TEAM WILL BE FRAMING OUR RECOMMENDATIONS LATER IN THE PRESENTATION, AND TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE NEXT MONTH. SO EACH OF THESE ISSUES HAS LIKELY TAKEN ON EVEN MORE IMPORTANCE, BECAUSE OF THE IMPACTS OF THE PANDEMIC. AND, AGAIN, I THINK IT'S JUST IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE THIS SORT OF REFRESH ABOUT WHAT ARE THE KEY ISSUES THAT ARE SHAPING THIS STUDY. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, ON THIS SLIDE, I WANT TO SPEAK A BIT MORE ABOUT HOW THIS PROJECT CAN HELP INFORM AND INFLUENCE ACTIONS THAT REALLY DELIVER FOR USERS AND THAT USER EXPERIENCE. THE THREE SECTIONS ON THE LEFT-HAND SIDE OF THIS SLIDE ARE REALLY AREAS THAT ARE CORE TO THE FOCUS OF THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY, AND AFFORDABILITY, ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE IS NOT TECHNICALLY A PART OF OUR SCOPE OF WORK, BUT SAY REALLY IMPORTANT AND CONNECTED ISSUE, WHICH I WANT TO TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE IN TERMS OF HOW THIS PROJECT CAN DIRECTLY IMPACT USERS IS PRICE BARRIER WHATEVER LEVEL OF COST RECOVERY OR FARE BOX RECOVERY THAT WE'RE TARGETING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THROUGH A FARE ACTION WE WANT TO MAXIMIZE COMPETITIVENESS FOR ALL TYPES OF TRIPS. WE DON'T WANT RIDERS TO BE DETERRED FROM RIDING OR PICK A ROUTE THAT'S LESS ACCESSIBLE FOR THEM. CHANGE OR FARE RECOMMENDATION ELIMINATES PRICE BARRIERS THIS SOMETHING THAT WE WANT TO SEE VALIDATED IN OUR MODELS AND USER RESEARCH. THE NEXT SECTION IN THE MIDDLE, LEARN ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY. SECOND SET OF CONCEPTS WE'RE FOCUSED ON INCLUDES HOW EASY IT IS TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE FARE SYSTEM WORKS, AND HOW LEGIBLE IT IS FOR USERS FROM DIFFERENT BACKGROUNDS AND DIFFERENT EXPERIENCES. SO IS OUR OVERALL TRANSIT SYSTEM EASY TO LEARN AND UNDERSTAND IN A WAY THAT ENCOURAGES PEOPLE TO ADOPT TRANSIT AND USE IT FREQUENTLY AND IMPORTANCE ON LEGIBILITY THAT FARE RULES NEED TO BE STANDARDIZED ACROSS THE REGION OR TO WHAT DEGREE CAN WE HELP RIDERS UNDERSTAND THE SYSTEM THRUWAY FINDING, COMMUNICATION, AND OTHER STRATEGIES THIS IS WHERE STAKEHOLDERS DURING THE PROJECT HAVE ARTICULATED DIFFERENT VIEWS AND PRIOR STUDIES DO NOT OFFER A CLEAR GUIDE OF WHAT THE BEST ANALYSIS. WHAT WE SEE THROUGH ANALYSIS AND TRAVEL DEMAND MODELING IS SOMETHING WE'RE INVESTIGATING IN DEPTH THROUGH USER RESEARCH AND NOT THROUGH A TECHNICAL MODELING PROCESS. ON EQUITY, WE'RE ASSESSING THE DEGREE TO WHICH INTEGRATION PROPOSALS AND RECOMMENDATIONS WOULD PROVIDE A BENEFIT TO EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATIONS. WE'RE ALSO GRAPPLING WITH THE QUESTION OF WHETHER REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION OR LOCAL CONTROL OF EQUITY FOCUSED STRATEGIES,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FOR EXAMPLE, DISCOUNTED PRODUCTS FOR O DIFFERENT TYPES OF USERS CAN BEST OPTIMIZE THE OVERALL IMPACT OF THE PROJECT AND ITS RECOMMENDATIONS. HERE, AGAIN, WE HAVE HEARD A WIDE RANGE OF VIEWS. AND THEN FINALLY, AFFORDABILITY. SO, OUR PROJECT SCOPE OF WORK DOES NOT SPECIFICALLY SAY THAT THE GOAL OR A GOAL OF THIS STUDY IS TO MAKE THE SYSTEM MORE AFFORDABLE FOR USERS. SO, YOU KNOW, THAT -- THE QUESTION OF WHAT IS AFFORDABLE TRANSIT AND WHAT DOES AFFORDABILITY MEAN TO USERS IS A REALLY COMPLICATED ONE, BECAUSE EACH PERSON PLACES A DIFFERENT VALUE ON A DIFFERENT KIND OF TRIP, AND INDIVIDUALS ARE WILLING TO PAY DIFFERENT AMOUNTS FOR DIFFERENT TYPES OF JOURNEYS AT DIFFERENT TIMES OF THE DAY FOR DIFFERENT TIMES IN THEIR LIFE FOR DIFFERENT PURPOSES AND PEOPLE RIDING TRANSIT COME IF A WIDE RANGE OF INCOMES AND THE DEFINITION OF AFFORDABILITY IS COMPLICATED IN THIS CONTEXT WHICH IS WHY IT'S NOT SPECIFICALLY SCOPE OF OUR WORK BUT IS A CORE RELATED ISSUE TO WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. THERE ARE REALLY IMPORTANT QUESTIONS OUTSIDE OF THE SCOPE RELATED TO AFFORDABILITY THAT WE CARE B SO WHAT ARE THE APPROPRIATE LEVEL OF FARE BOX RECOVERY OR COST RECOVERY THAT INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES SHOULD SEEK TO GENERATE FROM FARES? ARE THERE LEVELS THAT ARE MAYBE TOO HIGH THAT AGENCIES ARE TRYING TO ACHIEVE OR IS THERE A MINIMUM LEVEL THAT ALL AGENCIES SHOULD TRY TO MEET. IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, FOR MANY DECADES HAS MANDATES THERE ARE A MINIMUM FLOOR OF FARE BOX RECOVERY THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES MUST ACHIEVE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TYPICALLY 20% OF COST OF OPERATING THEIR SERVICE THEY NEED TO ACHIEVE THROUGH THE FARE BOX AND OVER THE COURSE OF 50 YEARS THAT THAT'S BEEN STATE POLICY, NOT AS MUCH IN THE BAY AREA, BUT GENERALLY, ACROSS THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA THAT'S REALLY CONSTRAINED THE ABILITY OF TRANSIT OPERATORS TO CHANGE THEIR FARES, OR TO MAKE TRANSIT MORE AFFORDABLE FOR CERTAIN GROUPS OF USERS USING THEIR SYSTEM, THAT'S STATE MANDATED TO REQUIRE A CERTAIN LEVEL OF FARE BOX RECOVERY. THANKFULLY IN THE BAY AREA, MOST OF OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE FLEXIBLE LEGAL ABILITY THAT DOESN'T CONSTRAIN THEM TO THE RECOVERY STANDARD THAT THE STATE IMPOSES BUT WE'RE FORTUNATE THAT WE HAVE MORE FLEXIBILITY IN TERMS OF WHAT LEVEL OF FARE BOX RECOVERY AN AGENCY NEEDS TO TARGET. ANOTHER IMPORTANT POINT I MENTIONED A MINUTE AGO IS WHAT LEVEL OF LOCAL FLEXIBILITY IS REALLY IMPORTANT IN BEING ABLE TO MAINTAIN TO ENSURE THAT OPERATORS CAN RESPOND TO QUESTIONS ABOUT AFFORDABILITY WITHIN THEIR LOCAL CONTEXT. SO, YOU KNOW, THAT IS ALSO DIRECTLY TIED TO WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. WHETHER THE FARE SYSTEM IS BROADLY AFFORDABLE TO PEOPLE OF ALL INCOME LEVELS, WHAT ROLE CLIPPER START SHOULD PLAY IN ADDRESSING AFFORDABILITY, THESE ARE THE KINDS OF ISSUES THAT GRAPPLING WITH IN THIS AREA OF BROAD AFFORDABILITY IN THE FARE POLICY. NEXT SLIDE. ON THIS SLIDE WE WANT TO REFRESH US ALL THE ON THE WORK THAT'S BEEN COMPLETED AND WHERE THE DELAY HAPPENED WHERE WE WERE NOT ABLE TO BRING FORWARD OUR RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE FARE TASK FORCE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LAST MONTH CALLING THAT OUT IN 5 AND 6 YOU SEE THE TEST OF INDIVIDUAL VARIANTS WE HAVE DESIGNED THAT HAVE BEEN RUNNING THROUGH OUR TRAVELING MODELING TOOLS. YOU CAN SEE THAT WORK WRAPPING UP THIS PAST WEEKEND WITH OUR TRAVEL DEMAND MODELS AND THE SERVERS THEY WORK ON RUNNING OVER THE WEEKEND, THAT WORK IS CONCLUDING. THAT WAS ABOUT A MONTH BEHIND SCHEDULE, UNFORTUNATELY, THAT WAS A SIGNIFICANT POINT OF DELAY ORIGINALLY SCHEDULED TO WRAP UP IN JUNE OF 2021. NOW HERE WE ARE IN AUGUST, OUR CONSULTANT TEAM ARE CONCLUDING THE FINAL BUSINESS CASE FRAMEWORK AND THAT EVALUATION OF ALL OF THE MODELING DATA AND USER RESEARCH RESULTS AND FEEDBACK THAT WE HAVE HEARD FROM USERS OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS, AND SYNTHESIZING THAT INTO OUR BUSINESS CASE AND RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. I WANT TO QUICKLY FOCUS HERE THREE KEY AREAS OF WORK THAT THE PROJECT TEAM IS FOCUSING ON RIGHT NOW, WHICH ARE REALLY CRITICAL TO DELIVERING OUR RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. SO, I HAVE TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT TRAVEL DEMAND MODELING THAT'S AN IMPORTANT PART OF IT, TALKING ABOUT EXACTLY WHAT WE'RE DOING AND WHAT IT MEANS FOR USER RESEARCH AND HOW THAT BUSINESS CASE PROCESS WE'RE FOCUSING ON NOW BRINGS US TO THE RECOMMENDATION FOR THE TASK FORCE. FIRST ON THE TRAVEL DEMAND MODELING OUR WORK IS USING THE SAME TRAVEL DEMANDS MODEL THAT WAS USED IN DEVELOPING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND IT HAS A CREATIVE NAME OF TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL 1.5 AND THE OUTPUTS FROM THAT MODEL WILL ANSWER KEY QUESTIONS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ABOUT RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE IMPACTS AND POLICY CHANGES AS WELL AS INVESTMENTS IN POLICY CHANGE COMPARED TO OTHER INVESTMENTS IN THE SYSTEM FOR EXAMPLE, FREQUENT BUS SERVICES. SECOND IS RESEARCH ON PROTOTYPE TESTING RESEARCH HAS BEEN CENTRAL TO INFORMING OUR WORK OVER THE DURATION OF THE STUDY AND THE PROJECT TEAM CONSULTANTS HAVE BEEN IN THE PROCESS OF WRAPPING UP THE FINAL CORE USER RESEARCH TASK WHICH HAS BEEN PROTOTYPE TESTING AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS WITH USERS AND NON-USERS ALL WORK HAS BEEN TAKING PLACE DESPITE THE RELAXATION OF PUBLIC HEALTH MEASURES OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS AND HAVE IMPLEMENTING USER RESEARCH IN A REMOTE PLATFORM FOCUSED ON RECRUITING DIVERSE REPRESENTATIVES FROM A SAMPLE OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS TO BE PART OF THIS PROTOTYPE TESTING AND ACTUALLY HIRED A MARKET RESEARCH FIRM TO HELP WITH RECRUITMENT IN TERMS OF DEMOGRAPHICALLY DIVERSE AND -- THIS IS NOT A SURVEY SO IT'S NOT A REPRESENTATIVE SAMPLE BUT IT'S AS CLOSE TO A REPRESENTATIVE GROUP OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS AS WE CAN DO THROUGH THIS WORK. AND WE TOOK THAT ROUTE OF ENGAGING A MARKET RESEARCH FIRM TO HELP US SO WE COULD HAVE AS BROAD A GROUP OF STAKEHOLDERS AS POSSIBLE DURING THIS UNUSUAL TIME TO DO PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT FOR A REGIONAL THAT COVERS THE HUGE AREA OF ALL NINE COUNTIES. AND THE THIRD SECTION ON THIS BUSINESS IMPLEMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS ANALYSIS BUSINESS CASE PROCESS IS REALLY THROUGH POLICY KEY CONCEPTS STUDIED IN MODELING AND THROUGH PRIOR WORK AND USER RESEARCH INTO THE PRACTICAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IMITATION FOR STRATEGIES THAT DETAIL THE FARE CONSIDERATION AND ADOPTION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS THE LAST SLIDE IN THIS PRESENTATION, AND THEN MIKE EISEMAN WILL SPEAK TO SOME OF THE SUBSEQUENT SLIDES BEFORE WE GET INTO MORE DISCUSSION RECOMMENDATIONS LATER ON. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO FRAME HOW THIS PROJECT HAS APPROACHED SORT OF THE DECISION MAKING PROCESS IN TERMS OF FARE POLICY IN TERMS OF DEVELOPING POSSIBLE ACTIONS TO CHANGE THE FARE SYSTEM, WHAT IS BEING ADDRESSED HERE THROUGH THIS WORK WHAT HAS HAPPENED ALREADY AND WHAT WILL HAPPEN IN THE FUTURE. THE TOP LEFT OF THE SLIDE, YOU CAN SEE DECISION THIS IS WE HAVE ALREADY MADE AS A REGION, YOU KNOW, WE'RE UNDERTAKING THIS EFFORT, WHICH IS A SIGNIFICANT FIRST MAJOR EFFORT OVER A DECADE TRYING TO IMPROVE THE SYSTEM WE HAVE SPENT A LOT OF TIME IN THE BEGINNING OF THE PROJECT DEFINING A PROBLEM STATEMENT AND COMING TO CONSENSUS AROUND A BROAD LIST OF POSSIBLE FARE CHANGES WE WANTED TO STUDY. WE STILL HAVE, IN THE FUTURE, TO REALLY FOCUS ON HOW OUR DECISIONS CAN BE SHAPED BY THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THIS PROJECT. SO, LOOKING BEYOND THE CONCLUSION OF THE PROJECT, WE HAVE SPECIFIC -- THE SPECIFIC PRICING FOR INDIVIDUAL ACTION THAT IS RECOMMENDED BY OUR STUDY, THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WILL LIKELY STILL BE A POINT FOR FUTURE DECISION MAKING AND DISCUSSION AFTER THE PROJECT CONCLUDES. THE TIMELINE AND THE PROCESS TO DELIVER THE RECOMMENDATIONS IS ALSO SOMETHING WHERE THERE WILL PROBABLY BE SOME FLUIDITY AND FUTURE DECISIONS WILL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NEED TO BE MADE BASED ON THE DELIVERY OF THINGS LIKE CLIPPER TWO, WHICH WE ANTICIPATE IN 2023, BASED ON THINGS LIKE THE AVAILABILITY OF FUNDING OR FUTURE FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES THAT MIGHT SUPPORT FARE INTEGRATION, AND YOU KNOW, VERY TECHNICAL DETAILS LIKE REVENUE ALLOCATION MODELS FOR THE DELIVERY OF VARIOUS FARE POLICY CHANGES AND REVENUE ALLOCATION MEANING BETWEEN TRANSIT OPERATORS. SOME OF THOSE DETAILS OF DELIVER TYPE OF ACTION IS SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN IN THE FUTURE. AND ON THE BOTTOM OF THE SLIDE WHAT WE'RE FOCUSING ON NOW AND WANT TO ENGAGE WITH YOU ALL ON TODAY ARE WHAT FARE INTEGRATION TIER AND WE'RE GOING TO DETAIL THESE TIERS IN JUST A FEW MINUTES, YOU KNOW, WHAT TIER SHOULD REALLY INFORM, SORT OF, OUR ULTIMATE DELIVERY GOAL AND OUR DELIVERY PLAN. AND IT COULD BE MULTIPLE TIERS, TOO. AND WHAT DEMONSTRATIONS AND EARLY ACTIONS SHOULD BE IMPLEMENTED IN THE SHORT-TERM TO LAY THE GROUNDWORK FOR DELIVERY OF A LONGER TERM FARE STRUCTURE. THESE ARE QUESTIONS TO KEEP IN MIND AS WE CONTINUE THROUGH THE PRESENTATION. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MIKE, UNLESS THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS? THEN I'LL BE BACK TO CHAT WITH YOU MORE. I DO SEE SOME HANDS. ADINA, I'LL LET YOU CALL ON FOLKS

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: RICH HEDGES HAS HAD HIS HAND UP FOR A WHILE. THIS IS A GOOD PAUSING POINT. AND I WILL HAVE QUESTIONS TOO. RICH?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RICHARD HEDGES: AM I UNMUTED?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, RICH.

RICHARD HEDGES: OKAY. THANK YOU, MARTHA. JUST A COUPLE OF THINGS. FIRST OF ALL, HOUSEKEEPING, WHEN I WAS TOLD THE NEXT MEETING WOULD BE IN SEPTEMBER, I PUT IT IN MY CALENDAR AND NOTICED THAT THE EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED ON THE SAME DAY AND SAME TIME. I AM SURE THAT CAN BE WORKED OUT. I JUST WANT TO ALERT EVERYBODY TO THAT.

WILLIAM BACON: RICH, THE EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE MEETING IS CANCELED. IS THAT MY UNDERSTANDING?

KATHLEEN KANE: THAT'S CORRECT.

RICHARD HEDGES: I'LL PULL IT IN MY CALENDAR. THANK YOU. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE TESTING AND [INDISCERNIBLE] AND BILL, EXCUSE ME FOR HARPING ON THIS, I'M NOT ASKING FOR FORGIVENESS, I'M JUST GIVING YOU A HEADS UP. WE REALLY NEED A DAY PASS OVER SEVERAL OF THE SIX -- THE BIG SIX, AND I JUST HAVE A FEELING THAT'S GONE ON DEAF EARS. DO YOU WANT ME TO TAKE A SECOND TO TELL YOU WHY? I SEE PEOPLE STRUGGLING TO FIGURE OUT THE SYSTEM. I HELP THEM ALL THE TIME, ESPECIALLY WITH BART WHERE TO GO HOW TO TRANSFER HOW MUCH IT'S GOING TO COST AND HAVING A

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAY PASS WOULD MAKE SO MUCH EASIER FOR SECOND AND FIRST TIME USERS TO GET THEM ON TRANSIT, AND MY QUESTION S IN THE TESTING AND LIABILITY HAVE YOU BEEN TESTING A DAY PASS OR A REGIONAL PASS FOR FARE INTEGRATION? THANK YOU.

WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU, RICH, FOR YOUR QUESTION. IT CERTAINLY HAS NOT FALLEN ON DEAF EARS. I KNOW YOU HAVE MADE THAT COMMENT IN THE PAST AT OTHER SUBCOMMITTEE MEETINGS AND AS WE'LL WALK THROUGH IN LATER SLIDES, WE ARE VERY MUCH TESTING A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT PASSES, INCLUDING DAY PASS OR A ACCUMULATOR OPTIONS. SO THAT HAS BEEN A CORE PART OF OUR WORK. YOU KNOW, I THINK WE'LL TALK MORE ABOUT WHERE WE HEADING WITH RECOMMENDATIONS LATER. BUT I THINK THAT'S A VERY STRONG CANDIDATE, YOU KNOW, OF REGIONAL PASS PRODUCT.

RICHARD HEDGES: IF I COULD JUST EXPLAIN MY FIRST INTRODUCTION THAT WAS IN [INDISCERNIBLE] IT MADE LEARNING THE SYSTEM MUCH EASIER, AND I CAN GO ANYWHERE IN LA ON PUBLIC TRANSIT ON THE SYSTEM, BUT THE DAY PASS GOT ME STARTED. THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GREAT. AND MY QUESTION IS ABOUT THE TOP RIGHT SECTION ON THIS PAGE, THIS FUTURE DECISION WHERE IT LOOKS LIKE THERE ARE -- THERE IS A BODY OF WORK IN TERMS OF PRICE POINTS AND TIMELINES AND RESOURCES AND SO O SO, WILL THERE BE FOLLOW-ON WORK, YOU KNOW, ASSUMING -- LIKE, IF THERE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ARE RECOMMENDATIONS MOVING FORWARD FROM THIS STUDY -- WHICH HOPEFUL THREE WILL BE -- THEN WILL THERE BE FOLLOW-ON BODY OF WORK TO DO THE THINGS IN THE TOP RIGHT BOX?

WILLIAM BACON: THE BEST WAY FOR ME TO ANSWER THE QUESTION, ADINA, IS IF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE REGION DECIDE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH DELIVERING FARE POLICY CHANGES, THERE ARE A LOT OF DETAILS UNDER ANY INDIVIDUAL FARE POLICY CHANGE, SOME MORE THAN OTHERS, THAT WOULD REQUIRE MORE WORK TO FULL OF DELIVER. SO, TECHNICAL QUESTIONS, VARIOUS PRICING DETAILS, YOU KNOW, DELIVERY QUESTIONS IN TERMS OF HOW YOU GET A FARE PRODUCT INTO THE CUSTOMERS HANDS, AND ALL OF THAT WOULD POTENTIALLY REQUIRE ADDITIONAL WORK, SO THERE WOULD BE, YOU KNOW, THERE WOULD BE AN EFFORT TO AT LEAST DO THAT. I CAN'T SAY EXACTLY WHAT THE STRUCTURE OF THAT WOULD LOOK LIKE, WHO EXACTLY WOULD LEAD IT, BUT, YES, THERE WOULD NEED TO BE A PROCESS TO DEPLOY INDIVIDUAL ACTIONS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: UH-HUH. GREAT. THANK YOU. AND I SEE THAT THERE IS A HAND FROM A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, AND I WANT TO ASK, WE'RE ABOUT TO DIVE INTO AN OUTLINE OF THE KINDS OF RECOMMENDATIONS THEMSELVES, SO, IF I CAN ASK MEMBER BALDINI IF THIS IS GOING TO BE A QUESTION ABOUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS THEMSELVES? IN WHICH CASE I WOULD LIKE TO GET THROUGH THAT. OR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IS THIS A QUESTION ABOUT THE GOALS AND PROCESS TO DATE, IN WHICH CASE, PLEASE MAKE YOUR COMMENT NOW.

MICHAEL BALDINI: THANK YOU, BOARD CHAIR. THE QUESTION REVOLVES ON THE TRAVEL DEMAND, WOULD THAT INCLUDE PRICING FLEXIBILITY, AS AN EXAMPLE, ON BART ANY TIME OF THE DAY IT'S THE SAME FARE BETWEEN TWO POINTS, WOULD THAT ALLOW THE TRANSIT OPERATOR DO SOME DEMAND PRICING AS FAR AS THE FARE STRUCTURE? AS YOU LOOK AT THIS STUDY GOING FORWARD? THANK YOU.

WILLIAM BACON: GOOD QUESTION.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: IN THE MODEL RUNS WE'RE DOING -- SORRY -- MIKE EISEMAN FROM BART. IN THE MODEL RUNS NOW WE'RE NOT SPECIFICALLY TESTING TIME OF DAY PRICING. THAT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE POLICY QUESTIONS BUT IT'S NOT FOCUS OF THE FARE ANALYSIS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANKS. UNLESS THERE ARE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS ABOUT THE MATERIAL PRESENTED TO DATE, LOOKING FORWARD TO GETTING THE PRESENTATION ABOUT THE OPTIONS BEING CONSIDERED.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. I WILL PICK IT UP HERE, IF THAT'S ALL RIGHT WITH THE CHAIR? OKAY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: UH-HUH.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. ALL RIGHT. THANKS EVERYBODY. THANKS BILL. STARTING WITH BATA'S CONTEXT WE'RE GOING TO ASK YOU TO BE THINKING ABOUT OPTION IN TERMS OF TIERS. IF YOU COULD JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THOSE OF YOU WHO TUNED INTO THE LAST FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING WILL BE FAMILIAR WITH THESE CONCEPTS BUT I WANT TO RECAP HERE. SO, WE'RE SORT OF REFORMATTING OPTIONS INTO FOUR TIERS OF INTEGRATION LAID OUT HERE. TIER ONE HERE IN GRAY, THAT INCLUDES OVERLAYS OF EXISTING FARE STRUCTURE, SUCH AS PASSES OR CAPS, OR ACCUMULATORS, CAPS ALSO ACCUMULATORS. THIS WOULD NECESSARILY REQUIRE ANY CHANGES ON THE UNDERLYING STRUCTURE BUT WOULD REQUIRE INTER-AGENCY AGREEMENTS ON PRICING AND REVENUE ALLOCATION AS WELL AS POTENTIALLY NEW -- [INDISCERNIBLE] TIER TWO, LOW OR NO COST TRANSFERRING BETWEEN SERVICES OPERATED BY MULTIPLE AGENCIES AGAIN WE WOULDN'T NEED TO CHANGE THE UNDERLYING SINGLE RIDE FARE STRUCTURE BUT INTER-AGENCY AGREEMENTS AND ALLOCATION FARE PRICING BUT WE WOULD NEED SOME COMBINATION OF RIDERSHIP INCREASES OR NEW SUBSIDY TO OFFSET LOSS REVENUE. OUR TEAM BELIEVES AT THIS STAGE WE COULD ACHIEVE TIER ONE OR TWO INTEGRATION USING THE EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURES MOST LIKELY. THERE ARE ALSO SUFFICIENT TIERS 1 AND 2 TO ELIMINATE PRICE BARRIERS AND ASSOCIATED RIDERSHIP. PARTIAL DEVELOPED CLIPPER ONE PLATFORM BUT DEFINITELY FULL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

EXECUTION OF CLIPPER TWO WOULD BE REQUIRED. AND TIER 3 AND 4 ARE LEARN ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY OBJECTIVES. TIER THREE IS REGIONAL SERVICES SHARING STRUCTURE, FERRY, RAIL, AND EXPRESS BUS WE WOULD NEED PRICING AGREEMENTS BETWEEN RELATIVELY SHORT LIST OF AFFECTED AGENCIES BUT DEFINITELY NEED NEW LEVEL AGENCY COORDINATION. DEFINITELY THE FULL CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM AND ALMOST CERTAINLY A SIGNIFICANT DEGREE OF INSTITUTIONAL REFORM TO MAINTAIN A STABLE SYSTEM AND DEFINE LOCAL REGIONAL SERVICES. WE NEED AGENCY TO BE INVOLVED IN THE AGREEMENTS. THE STEP FROM TIER 3 TO 4 WOULD REQUIRE THE GREATEST INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE. AND PROBABLY MORE MODEST RETURN IN TERMS OF LEARN ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY IN TERMS OF TIER 2 TO 3 STEP. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO E HERE WE ALIGN THE STUDY SHORT LIST OF OPTIONS WITH THE INTEGRATION TIERS. TIER ONE WE'RE LOOKING AT LEVEL OF BENEFIT WE CAN UNLOCK WITH OVERLAYS ALONE. SO THAT'S WHAT WE PREVIOUSLY DESCRIBE AS OPTION ONE PASSES AND CAPS. TIER TWO INCLUDES WHAT WE PREVIOUSLY DESCRIBED AS OPTION TWO WHICH IS DISCOUNTS FOR ALL LOCAL TO LOCAL AND LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRIPS. AND IT ALSO INCLUDES OUR WHAT WE PREVIOUSLY DESCRIBED AS OPTION 3A IS DISCOUNTS TRANSFERRING BETWEEN REGIONAL SERVICES. TIER THREE, WHAT WE PREVIOUSLY DESCRIBED AS OPTION 3B WHICH IS A REGIONAL DISTANCE BASED FARE NO CHANGES WOULD BE REQUIRED TO THE LOCAL BUS FARES. AND FINALLY IN TIER FOUR, WE HAVE THREE DIFFERENT FARE STRUCTURE OPTIONS FOR BRINGING LOCAL FARES INTO THE COMMON FARE STRUCTURE, EITHER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WITH A COMMON LOCAL FLAT FARE OR WITH A SINGLE REGIONAL ZONE SYSTEM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, EACH TIER AND ITS ASSOCIATED OPTION HAVE A DISTINCT POLICY DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES. I'M GOING TO SKIP OVER THE SUMMARY BECAUSE WE'RE GOING TO DISCUSS THOSE IN DETAIL IN THE LAST SECTION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BEFORE WE GET TO THE POINT DETAILS A FEW WORD HERE ABOUT HOW THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE BEING BUILT. NEXT SLIDE. THANKS. ALONGSIDE THE TIERS OF INTEGRATION WE THINK IT'S HELPFUL NOW TO THINK ABOUT THE TIME FRAME CHANGES. WE HAVE DIVIDE THOSE UP INTO FOUR DISTINCT PHASES HERE. FIRST IS PRE-CLIPPER TWO, SO WHAT CAN WE DO, WHAT SHOULD WE DO NOW WITH THE LIMITED SET OF TOOLS THAT ARE LISTED IN CLIPPER ONE. WE'RE LOOKING FOR ONE OR MORE DEMONSTRATION PROJECTS, NEAR-TERM ACTIONS THAT WILL SUPPORT LONGER TERM DIRECTION. WE WANT THEM TO PROVIDE DATA THAT CAN BE USED TO DESIGN MORE PERMANENT CHANGES AND ALSO IDEALLY TO SUPPORT THE REGION'S COVID CONCERNS. NEXT PLAN FOR FALL OF 2023 ABILITY TO IMPLEMENT ANY VERSION OF TIERS ONE OR TWO THAT WE THINK MEETS THE REGION'S GOALS AND WE THINK IT'S HELPFUL AFTER THAT TO THINK ABOUT A POTENTIAL THIRD OR FOURTH PHASE, AND TO THINK ABOUT REGIONAL OR SUBREGIONAL STANDARDIZATION WOULD BEST SERVE THE LEARN ABILITY AND LEGIBILITY REFORM. THEY WOULD NEED TO OCCUR IN PHASES AFTER FALL OF 2023 BUT WE WANT TO THINK NOW ABOUT WHAT INFORMATION IS NEEDED TO SUPPORT ONGOING CHANGE AND HOW INTERACT. AND NEAR-TERM ACTIONS TO BE SUPPORT. BUSINESS CASE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WORK IS STILL UNDERWAY. FOUR COMPONENTS OF THE BUSINESS CASE, STRATEGIC DIMENSION ASSESSING PERFORMANCE AGAINST POLICY GOALS RIDERSHIP SOCIO-ECONOMIC DIMENSIONS WHERE WE LOOK AT OVERALL COST SOCIAL COST BENEFIT FINANCIAL DIMENSIONS AND DELIVERABILITY DIMENSIONS LOOKING AT OPERATIONS. GOING TO FOCUS ON THAT IN THE NEXT SLIDE OF THE PRESENTATION. NEXT WORKING ON BRINGING TOGETHER TECHNICAL, IN THE BLUE WE HAVE FORECASTED MODELLING AND OUR USER RESEARCH THAT'S REALLY FOCUSED ON LEARNABLE AND LEGIBILITY, AND ON THE PEOPLE SIDE WE CONTINUE TO ENGAGE AS MUCH AS WE CAN WITH TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF AS WELL AS STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING YOURSELVES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. SO NOW WE WANT TO TAKE A LITTLE BIT OF TIME TO TALK THROUGH SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT WE'RE WORKING THROUGH AS FAR AS THE DELIVERABILITY AND IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSION OF THE BUSINESS CASE. I'M GOING TO KICK IT OFF HERE AND TURN THINGS OVER TO BILL. SEVERAL ISSUES WE'RE CONSIDERING HERE MANAGEMENT CHALLENGES AND RISKS INCLUDING CHANGE MANAGEMENT OVER TIME DELIVERABILITY ISSUES INCLUDING PROCUREMENT, OPERATIONAL ISSUES, REGULATORY ISSUES AND THE FOCUS THERE IS TITLE SIX, AND THEN FOR EACH OF THOSE AREAS WE'RE FOCUSED ON THE TYPES OF RISK THAT COME ALONG AND WAYS TO MITIGATE OR MANAGE THOSE RISKS. ACTUALLY, WHY DON'T WE GO AHEAD AND SKIP THE NEXT SLIDE AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO BILL. ACTUALLY, CAN WE SKIP AHEAD. YEAH. RIGHT THERE. GO AHEAD, BILL.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WILLIAM BACON: THANKS MIKE. SO THIS SLIDE BUILDS UPON WHAT MIKE WAS SPEAKING TO IN TERMS OF THE FOUR DIFFERENT TIERS. YOU CAN SEE THAT WE HAVE TRIED TO MAP SORT OF DIFFERENT IMPLEMENTATION CONSIDERATIONS TO THE BEEN. SO YOU WILL SEE THE FIRST IS CLIPPER, NEXT IS INSTITUTIONAL MEASURE THAT IT WOULD LIKELY NEED TO CHANGE FOR IMPLEMENTATION, THE THIRD IS, SORT OF, THE AGENCY, UNIQUE AGENCY CHANGES THAT WOULD NEED TO HAPPEN AND, SORT OF, THE IMPLEMENTATION BARRIERS THAT AGENCIES WOULD EXPERIENCE BECAUSE OF THEIR UNIQUE OPERATIONAL MODEL OR DELIVERY OF SERVICE MODEL. AND THE LAST ONE IS REALLY FOCUSING ON CHANGES TO USERS. SO, HOW, SORT OF, CHANGE MANAGEMENT, FROM A CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE, HOW WOULD YOU NEED TO TACKLE THAT. AND YOU WILL SEE OVERLAYS WITH THE FIRST TIER, AS MIKE MENTIONED A MINUTE AGO, THERE ARE NO CHANGES TO THE ACTUAL STRUCTURE OF HOW FARES ARE SET OR ARE MANAGED IN THE REGION. YOU KNOW, PASSES AND CAPS, OVERLAYS TO OUR EXISTING SYSTEM DON'T REALLY REQUIRE THAT TYPE OF CHANGE. AND AS A RESULT, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF DELIVERY METHODS TO BRING A CAP OR A PASS TO USERS THAT DON'T REQUIRE SIGNIFICANT CHANGE TO OUR EXISTING WAY OF DELIVERING FARES. THERE ARE A NUMBER OF PAST PRODUCTS THAT COULD BE DELIVERED IN THE CLIPPER ONE SYSTEM, TECHNOLOGY, DOESN'T NECESSARILY REQUIRE SIGNIFICANT INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE. THE IMPACT ON INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES, WAY OF SORT OF DOING BUSINESS, IS A BIT VARIED DEPENDING ON WHAT YOU ABOUT. BUT IT'S ACHIEVABLE AND FINALLY FROM A MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER FOCUS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PERSPECTIVE IT, SORT OF, DEPENDS ON WHAT TYPE OF PRODUCTS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IN TIER TWO, TRANSFER DISCOUNTS AND CREATING FREE OR NO -- LOW COST TRANSFERS BETWEEN DIFFERENT AGENCIES AND DIFFERENT SERVICES IT STARTS TO BE A LITTLE BIT MORE COMPLICATE FROM A TECHNICAL STANDPOINT IN TERMS OF ABILITY TO DELIVER THAT THROUGH CLIPPER, OUR CURRENT SYSTEM DOES HAVE SOME LIMITATIONS IN TERMS OF WHAT WE CAN DO, THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM THAT'S COMING IN 2023 WILL MAKE THE DELIVERY OF TRANSFER DISCOUNTS OR FREE TRANSFERS MUCH SIMPLER. THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE LIKELY FOCUSED ON AS A C2 NECESSARY CONCERN TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER ALL OF THE SECOND TIER, SORT OF, RECOMMENDATIONS. IN TERMS OF INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE, IT VARIES AGAIN. THERE ARE CERTAIN EXISTING TRANSFER AGREEMENTS AND DISCOUNTS THAT EXIST BETWEEN TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND THERE ARE DOZENS OF THOSE BETWEEN, SORT OF, A WEB OF DIFFERENT AGENCIES. BUT THERE IS NO, YOU KNOW, COMPREHENSIVE, YOU KNOW, CONSISTENT APPROACH TO TRANSFER DISCOUNTS ACROSS THE REGION. SO, IF YOU WERE TRYING TO DELIVER A RECOMMENDATION THAT DID FOCUS ON REDUCING OR ELIMINATING THE TRANSFER COST BETWEEN AGENCIES, ONE INSTITUTIONAL CONSIDERATION YOU WOULD WANT TO THINK ABOUT IS IF YOU TRY TO DELIVER THAT THROUGH A SINGLE REGIONAL AGREEMENT OR MOU, WHAT WOULD BE THE BEST WAY -- WHAT WOULD BE THE BEST APPROACH TO BE TO MANAGE THAT? WOULD IT BE A SINGLE ORGANIZATION? WOULD THERE BE MULTIPLE AGENCIES, SORT OF, MANAGING A SINGLE MOU, OR WOULD YOU TRY TO DELIVER IT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THROUGH THE EXISTING STRUCTURE OF MANY DIFFERENT MOUS BETWEEN AGENCIES? THAT'S, SORT OF, THE TASTE OF KIND OF INSTITUTIONAL QUESTION THAT WE'RE TRYING TO GRAPPLE WITH IN THE PROJECT IN TERMS OF HOW TO, YOU KNOW, BRING EFFECT TO A DELIVERY RECOMMENDATION AND WHAT THAT MIGHT MEAN FOR OUR INSTITUTIONAL MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE. THE LAST TWO LINES HERE IN TERMS OF THE AGENCY, SORT OF, BUSINESS APPROACH AND THEIR -- THE IMPACTS ON THEIR STRUCTURE AND OPERATION, AGAIN, IT'S A RELATIVELY LOW IMPACT CHANGE IN TERMS OF REDUCING OR ELIMINATING BARRIERS TO TRANSFER SO IT'S NOT TOO MUCH OF AN IMPACT THERE, AND FROM A CUSTOMER CHANGE MANAGEMENT PERSPECTIVE, THERE ARE, ACTUALLY, PRETTY SIGNIFICANT CONSIDERATIONS IN TERMS OF HOW DO YOU COMMUNICATE TO USERS, WHAT A FREE TRANSFER REALLY MEANS, FOR EXAMPLE, WHAT DISCOUNT DO YOU RECEIVE IF YOU TRANSFER BETWEEN BART AND CALTRAIN, IF YOU TRANSFER BETWEEN SAMTRANS AND CALTRAIN, HOW WOULD YOU TALK ABOUT THOSE DISCOUNTS TO USERS? SO THAT'S SOMETHING TO FOCUS ON FROM A CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE PERSPECTIVE. THE THIRD AND FOURTH TIERS AS MIKE TALKED ABOUT REQUIRE MORE SIGNIFICANT CHANGES FROM AN INSTITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVE, AND I THINK THAT'S PROBABLY THE MOST IMPORTANT THING TO CALL OUT HERE F WE WERE TO TRY TO BRING THE REGIONAL OPERATORS, SO THESE ARE AGENCIES THAT OPERATOR, SORT OF, THE CORE SPINE OF OUR REGIONAL NETWORK, REGIONAL RAIL SERVICE, FERRY SERVICE, REGIONAL BUS SERVICE, EXPRESS BUS SERVICE, IF ALL THOSE SERVICES WERE TO BE BROUGHT UNDER A COMMON FARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STRUCTURE THERE'S AN INDIVIDUAL DEPARTURE FROM INDIVIDUAL AGENCY BOARDS HAVING FULL AUTONOMY TO DECIDE WHAT THEIR FARE STRUCTURE AND POLICIES ARE THAT WOULD REQUIRE AN INSTITUTIONAL CHANGER FROM THE WAY THINGS ARE DONE NOW ALSO WOULD REQUIRE OUR CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM TO BE DEPLOYED IN ORDER TO GIVE US FLEXIBILITY TO BRING THOSE AGENCIES TOGETHER. FROM AN INFRASTRUCTURE AND OPERATION STANDPOINT IT DEFINITELY RAISES QUESTIONS ABOUT THE METHOD OF A FARE PAYMENT ON TRANSIT SERVICES, SO, FOR EXAMPLE, DO CUSTOMERS NEED TO TAG ON AND TAG OFF? WE HAVE AN OPEN TRANSIT SYSTEM, LIKE MOST OF OUR AGENCIES ARE IN THE SENSE THAT THERE IS NO FARE GATES ON THE PLATFORM OR AT STATIONS OR STOPS. HOW DO YOU INCLUDE THAT AS A CONSIDERATION IN TERMS OF THE ABLE TO DELIVER A COMMON FARE STRUCTURE AND WHAT THAT MEANS FOR AN AGENCY'S OPERATIONS. AND, FINALLY, FROM A CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE, IF YOU WERE TO DELIVER A TIER THREE, LIKE, COMMON REGIONAL STRUCTURE, THERE ARE LIKELY SIGNIFICANT CHANGES, YOU KNOW, FOR USERS, AND HOW YOU TALK ABOUT THAT TO THE PUBLIC, HOW DO YOU COMMUNICATE THE BENEFITS OF MAKING THAT TRANSITION, AND WHAT OTHER CONSIDERATIONS TO THINK ABOUT FOR DIFFERENT KINDS OF USERS IN TERMS OF HOW THEY USE REGIONAL SERVICE AND WHAT THAT WOULD MEAN FOR THEM. AND FINALLY A FOURTH TIER WHERE YOU INCLUDE LOCAL TRANSIT SERVICE, LOCAL BUS SERVICE LOCAL LIGHT RAIL SERVICE IN A COMMON FARE STRUCTURE ALONG WITH REGIONAL FARE POLICY -- SORRY -- POLICY FOR REGIONAL TRANSIT SERVICES. HOW MUCH ADDITIONAL CHANGE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MANAGEMENT WOULD THAT REQUIRE. AND, THIS IS WHERE THERE IS A REALLY SIGNIFICANT LEAP IN THE NUMBER OF AGENCY THAT IS IMPACTED. IN TIER THREE, WE'RE REALLY TALKING ABOUT, SORT OF, A HANDFUL OF AGENCIES THAT OPERATE THAT CORE SPINE OF OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK. IN TIER FOUR, YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY IN THE BAY AREA. SO THE INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE THAT WOULD BE NECESSARY TO CREATE A COMMON LOCAL TRANSIT FARE AND A COMMON SET OF LOCAL TRANSIT. TRANSIT FARE POLICIES IS MUCH MORE SIGNIFICANT. YOU HAVE MORE THAN TWO DOZEN OPERATORS WHO ARE INVOLVED, TWO DOZEN DIFFERENT GOVERNANCE APPROACHES AND MODELS THAT WOULD BE INVOLVED, AS WELL. AND SIMILAR TO TIER THREE, THERE ARE CHANGES IN TERMS OF THE CLIPPER SYSTEM THAT ARE NECESSARY TO REALLY BE ABLE TO FULLY DELIVER THAT. YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO OVER THESE NEXT FOUR SLIDES IS REALLY WALK THE SUBCOMMITTEE THROUGH IN MY DETAIL WHAT WE HAVE BEEN STUDYING IN EACH OF THESE FOUR TIERS. AND SOME OF THE, SORT OF, DELIVERY CONSIDERATION -- DELIVERY CONSIDERATION CONCERNS THAT WE HAVE BEEN THINKING ABOUT, AND WE HAVE TRIED TO CLASSIFY THEM ABOUT WHETHER THEY'RE, SORT OF, LOWER OR HIGH MARKET. THIS MAPS A LITTLE BIT TO WHAT I WAS JUST TALKING ABOUT IN TERMS OF THE FOUR CATEGORIES THAT ARE SPECTRUMS AT THE BOTTOM OF THE LAST SLIDE. AS WE WERE DISCUSSING, THE OVERLAYS WHICH ARE REALLY PASSES OR CAPS ARE SOMETHING THAT CAN EXIST WITHIN OUR EXISTING FARE STRUCTURE, AND OUR EXISTING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FARE POLICY MANAGEMENT APPROACHES ACROSS THE REGION. SO, WE, AS A PROJECT TEAM, HAVE BEEN STUDYING SIX, YOU KNOW, OPTIONS, REALLY, UNDER THIS FIRST TIER AND LISTED IN OPTIONS ON OF THE LEFT OF THE SLIDE, PASS OPTION THAT IS A CUSTOMER BUYS UP FRONT OR AN ORGANIZATION BUYS UP FRONT AND A CAP OR A ACCUMULATOR IS SOMETHING THAT DIFFERENT REQUIRE UPFRONT COMMITMENT FROM A USER OR ORGANIZATION, BUT SOMETHING THAT BENEFITS A USER ONCE A CERTAIN THRESHOLD IS MET. SO, I'LL WALK YOU THROUGH ON THOSE SIX DIFFERENT OPTIONS AND EXPLAIN WHAT THEY ARE WITHIN THIS FIRST TIER. SO THE FIRST IS AN ALL AGENCY INDIVIDUAL FIXED PRICE PASS. WHAT WE MEAN BY THAT IS A PRODUCT THAT IT WOULD BE AVAILABLE TO USERS THAT THEY WOULD PURCHASE UP FRONT FOR A SINGLE PRICE THAT WOULD COVER TRANSIT SERVICE ACROSS THE BAY AREA ON ALL AGENCIES FOR ONE PRICE. THIS IS SIMILAR TO PAST PRODUCTS THAT EXISTED IN PLACES LIKE NEW YORK CITY WHERE THERE IS A SINGLE PRODUCT THAT PROVIDES VARIED WIDE RANGING ACCESS ACROSS THE NEW YORK CITY TRANSIT SYSTEM SUBWAYS AND BUSES IT DOES NOT INCLUDE SERVICE ON NEW YORK'S EXTENSIVE SUBURBAN RAIL NETWORK. IT'S NOT EXACTLY THE SAME, BUT IT'S A SINGLE PRICE PRODUCT THAT GIVES YOU VERY EXTENSIVE TRANSIT USE. AND AS WE HAVE BEEN STUDYING IT, IT WOULD COVER ALL SERVICE IN OUR REGION, FERRY, BUS, RAIL, ALL OF THEM, THE CHALLENGES WE FACE IN THAT PRODUCT IN OUR REGION IS WE HAVE A WIDE RANGE OF FARES ACROSS OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS IF YOU WERE TO SELL A PRODUCT LIKE THIS FOR A SINGLE PRICE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SOMEONE WHO MIGHT BE INTERESTED IN JUST RIDING LOCAL BUS SERVICE IN THEIR COMMUNITY MIGHT NOT FIND THIS PRODUCT APPEALING BECAUSE THEY WOULD BE REQUIRED, ESSENTIALLY, TO PAY A PRICE THAT COVERS SERVICE ACROSS THE ENTIRE REGION INCLUDING FOR VERY LONG TRIPS. THE NEXT OPTION HERE, IS VERY SIMILAR TO THE ONE ABOVE, BUT RECOGNIZES THAT DIFFERENCE IN TERMS OF WHAT INDIVIDUAL USERS MIGHT WANT WHEN THEY PURCHASE A PASS, THE TYPE OF TRANSIT THAT THEY WANT TO BUY. RATHER THAN HAVING A SINGLE PRICE THAT COVERS SERVICE ACROSS THE ENTIRE AREA, PRICE COULD SET AT DIFFERENT TIERS BASED ON WHAT USERS NEED AND WHAT REALLY BENEFITS THEM. THIS, AGAIN, IS A PRODUCT THEY CUSTOMER WOULD BUY UP FRONT BUT ITS PRICE WOULD BE BASED ON WHAT WE CALL A TRIP MULTIPLIER MODEL THIS IS SIMILAR TO THE PUGET SOUND OR WASHINGTON, D.C. AREA. HOW THIS WOULD WORK IN PRACTICE, EASIEST WAY TO THINK ABOUT IT IS IF YOU WOULD PURCHASE A PASS THAT WOULD COVER ALL TRANSIT TRIPS UP TO $3 OF REGULAR CASH FARE. IF YOU PURCHASE THAT PASS FOR -- I'M GOING TO MAKE UP AN EXAMPLE AND SAY THAT PASS COSTS $70 A MONTH AND YOU PURCHASE THAT PASS, ANY TRANSIT TRIP IN THE BAY AREA THAT COSTS $3 OR LESS WOULD BE INCLUDED IN YOUR PASS. IF YOU TOOK A TRANSIT TRIP THAT COST $4 FROM A CASH FARE PERSPECTIVE, YOUR PASS PRODUCT WOULD COVER THE FIRST $3 OF THAT FARE, OF THAT $4 FARE, AND THERE WOULD BE $1 THAT YOU WOULD HAVE TO HAVE DEBITED FROM YOUR PASS BALANCE ON YOUR CARD, AND USERS CAN CHOOSE TO PURCHASE A PASS LEVEL THEY FOUND APPROPRIATE FOR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THEIR NEEDS, YOU COULD HAVE A PASS PRICE AT EVERY $0.10 INCREMENT ALL THE WAY BETWEEN THE LOWEST AND HIGHEST FARE CHARGED FOR TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA THAT WOULD COVER ALL TRIPS. THIS WOULD COVER ALL AGENCY. THE THIRD PASS OPTION THAT WE HAVE BEEN FOCUSING ON IN OUR STUDY IS A SIMILAR, SORT OF, ALL AGENCY PRODUCT THAT WOULD COVER ALL SERVICES. THIS PRODUCT WOULD BE SOLD AS A BULK PRODUCT TO ORGANIZATIONS AND INSTITUTIONS. THE BAY AREA -- AND WE HAVE TALKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THIS IN THE PAST -- THE BAY AREA IS AN OUTLIER IN THE SENSE THAT WE DON'T OFFER INSTITUTIONS LIKE UNIVERSITIES, HOUSING DEVELOPERS, AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS, EMPLOYEES THE ABILITY TO ACTUALLY GIVE DIRECTLY THEIR CONSTITUENTS A TRANSIT PASS. SO WHAT WE HAVE BEEN STUDYING IS COULD WE DEVELOP A MODEL FOR ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE BAY AREA TO HAVE A SINGLE, SORT OF, INSTITUTIONAL PASS PRODUCT. SO THIS BUILDS OFF A LOT OF INDIVIDUAL, SORT OF, PRODUCTS THAT AGENCIES HAVE RIGHT NOW, SO, FOR EXAMPLE, CALTRAIN HAS A GO PASS THAT THEY SELL TO ORGANIZATIONS ALONG THE PENINSULA, PRIMARILY, WHERE THE PASSES ARE SOLD IN BULK TO AN ORGANIZATION, YOU KNOW, AN EXAMPLE IS A MAJOR EMPLOYER, OR A UNIVERSITY, AND THEN THE COMMUNITY MEMBERS OF THAT ORGANIZATION BENEFIT FROM UNLIMITED RIDES ON CALTRAIN. SO THIS WOULD BE, SORT OF, TAKING THAT MODEL, REGION-WIDE, AND ALLOWING USERS OF THE PRODUCT TO BENEFIT FROM SERVICE ACROSS THE BAY AREA ON ALL OPERATORS, NOT JUST ON CERTAIN AGENCIES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THERE ARE A LOT OF DIFFERENT PRICE CONSIDERATIONS ABOUT THIS. THAT WE HAVE BEEN CONSIDERING AND LOOKING AT. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, WOULD YOU HAVE A SINGLE PRICE REGARDLESS OF WHERE AN EMPLOYER OR ORGANIZATION OR INSTITUTION WAS LOCATED IN THE BAY AREA? WOULD IT MAKE SENSE TO CHARGE THE SAME AMOUNT TO AN ORGANIZATION IN DOWNTOWN OAKLAND OR DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO AS IT WOULD BE TO AN ORGANIZATION IN A RURAL PART OF THE BAY AREA THAT WAS NOT VERY WELL SERVED BY TRANSIT. [INDISCERNIBLE] [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] WOULD IT MAKE SENSE THAT THE ORGANIZATION PAY THE SAME AMOUNT ON RELATIVELY LOW-LEVEL SERVICE PROVIDED TO YOU AS OPPOSED TO LOCATION PLACED TRANSIT THERE IS A LOT OF POTENTIAL IN AN INSTITUTIONAL PRODUCT AS A WAY TO LEARN ABOUT HOW USERS WOULD BENEFIT FROM ALL AGENCY PASSES. I THINK THIS IS AN AREA THAT THE PROJECT IS LIKELY TO ENCOURAGE THE REGION TO TRY DEMONSTRATION PROJECTS AND TO TRY PILOTS AND TO REALLY BEGIN TO EXPLORE HOW TO GET AN ALL AGENCY PRODUCT ON THE GROUND IN THE HANDS OF USERS, SO WE CAN REALLY GET MEANINGFUL DATA ABOUT HOW CUSTOMERS EXPERIENCE A TRANSIT SYSTEM WITH NO BARRIERS BETWEEN AGENCIES. I THINK THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WE'RE LIKELY TO REALLY CONTINUE TO EXPLORE AND TO PUSH FORWARD WITH AS THE PROJECT CONCLUDES. THE LOWER PORTION HERE, ON THE CONSIDERATIONS OF THE -- I'M SORRY -- OF THE PRODUCTS WE HAVE BEEN CONSIDERING FOCUSES ON CAPS AND ACCUMULATORS. AND I'M QUICKLY GO THROUGH THOSE. THE, SORT OF, TWO DIFFERENT TERMS THERE, TRIP BASED OR COST BASED CAP A ACCUMULATOR, WHAT WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MEAN BY TRIP BASED CAP IS A CAP THAT, RATHER THAN BEING BASED ON THE PRICE OF YOUR TRIP -- I'M SORRY -- OF YOUR TRIP -- RATHER THAN THE CAP BEING BASED ON A PRICE LEVEL, SO AFTER SPENDING $100, YOU HIT THE CAP, FOR EXAMPLE, IT WOULD BE BASED ON NUMBER OF TRIPS TAKEN, FOR EXAMPLE, IF YOU TAKE 36 TRIPS OVER A MONTH ALL TRIPS AFTER THAT WOULD BE FREE. COST APPROACH WOULD BE BASED ON PRICE AS OPPOSED TO THE NUMBER OF TRIPS. SO THERE ARE THOSE TWO DIFFERENT OPTIONS THAT, SORT OF, PARALLEL THE PATHS UNDER CONSIDERATION. IT WOULD COVER ALL AGENCIES AND THEY WOULD BE BASED ON TRIPS OR COST. ONE SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT APPROACH, THOUGH, WOULD BE A COST BASED CAP, AVAILABLE JUST TO CLIPPER START CARD HOLDERS. SO, CLIPPER START CARD HOLDERS ARE CUSTOMERS WHO HAVE VERY LOW INCOMES, AND WE ARE STUDYING THE POSSIBILITY OF A CAP THAT REALLY WOULD BE TARGETED JUST AS THOSE USERS JUST SO THAT VERY LOW-INCOME TRANSIT RIDERS CAN BENEFIT FROM A CAP WHICH DOESN'T REQUIRE ANY UPFRONT COMMITMENT OR INVESTMENT AT THE BEGINNING OF A MONTH OR BEGINNING OF ANY TIME PERIOD THEY WOULD ALSO BE GIVEN THE BEST PRICE FOR THEIR TRIPS AND IT WOULD ENCOURAGE THEM TO USE THE APPROPRIATE TRANSIT SERVICE FOR THEIR NEEDS AND NOT REALLY TO MAKE THAT DETERMINATION BASED ON COST OF THE TRIP. ON THE RIDE HAND SLIDE HERE, ARE SOME OF THOSE DIFFERENT CONSIDERATIONS, MANAGEMENT, TECHNOLOGY, AGENCY INFRASTRUCTURE AND CUSTOMERS I'M NOT GOING TO GO THROUGH EVERY SINGLE THING. I TOUCHED ON MANY CONCERNS AS WE WENT THROUGH BUT GENERALLY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OVERLAYS AND IMPACT IN TERMS OF HOW DIFFICULT IT IS TO DELIVER THESE FOUR USERS. I AM GOING TO PAUSE. I SEE SOME HANDS RAISED, AND THEN I'LL CONTINUE ON TO THE NEXT TIER WITH MIKE. ADINA?

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. SORRY ABOUT THAT. I NEEDED TO DIAL BACK IN ON THE AUDIO, BECAUSE MY AUDIO HAS -- RICH HAD A HAND UP FIRST?

RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU, ADINA. BILL, JUST A COMMENT, FOR THE ALL AGENCY INSTITUTIONAL PASS SEEMS TO ME A GREAT ITEM FOR CITIES AND COUNTIES FOR WORKING WITH TRIP DEMAND MANAGEMENT IT GIVES THEM THEIR OWN INCENTIVE TO GET EMPLOYERS TO ENCOURAGE THEIR PEOPLE TO RIDE PUBLIC TRANSIT. THAT'S THE BEAUTY OF [INDISCERNIBLE] COUNTY AND THE CALTRAIN AND THEIR GO-PASS AND REASON WHY ALL AGENCY IDEAS, AGREE IT'S A GOOD IDEA. THANK YOU. [INDISCERNIBLE]

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GWEN?

GWEN LITVAK: FIRST I WANT TO SAY THAT WHEN WE THINKING ABOUT WHO PAYS, HOW THINGS ARE PAID FOR, AND WHO TAKES TRANSIT, I HOPE WE'RE ACTUALLY THINKING ABOUT STARTING FROM A SERVICE VISION ABOUT HOW THE WHOLE REGION IS SERVED AND NOT WHERE EXISTING SERVICE IS GIVEN THE TRAIN CHANGE IN TRANSIT PATTERNS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ARE GOING TO SEE A CHANGE OF UP TO 50% OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS ELIGIBLE FOR REMOTE WORK. AND SECOND, WHO IS TAKING TRANSIT AND WHERE PEOPLE ARE TAKING TRANSIT THAT'S A BETTER INCENTIVE BASED APPROACH. I WOULD SAY BEHAVIOR BASED APPROACH IN TERMS OF WHERE BUSINESSES ARE CURRENTLY LOCATED, AS WE ALL KNOW TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND BUSINESSES, NEITHER ENTITY ACTUALLY HAS THE ABILITY TO CONTROL LAND USE OR HOUSING DECISIONS IN THE BAY AREA. SO I WOULD HATE TO SEE BAY AREA LAND PATTERNS FOR GROWTH DETERMINED UPON THINGS THAT NEITHER TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE ANY CONTROL OVER AND I WILL SAY THE WORK THE BAY AREA COUNCIL HAS DONE SPEAKING TO A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT BUSINESS SIZES ABOUT RETURN TO THE OFFICE, VERY FEW BUSINESSES, JUST THE VERY LARGE BUSINESSES AMONG US HAVE TRANSIT PLANNERS AND OF COURSE THE COUNCIL SUPPORTS AND EMPLOYERS AND EMPLOYEES TAKING TRANSIT, THE PURCHASING OF TRANSIT PASS, THE EASIER IT'S GOING TO BE FOR THE EMPLOYER TO BUY T OF COURSE IT MAKES SENSE BASED ON THE SERVICE LEVEL WE'LL END UP BEING JUST BEING MORE CONFUSING IN TERMS OF AN EMPLOYER BEING ABLE TO SAY X IS THE COST FOR ALL OF MY EMPLOYEES AND CALL IT A DAY THERE. SO THOSE ARE A FEW COMMENTS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: UH-HUH. THANKS. ANNE OLIVIA?

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU. LET'S SEE IF I CAN -- MY INTERNET HAS BEEN A LITTLE SHAKY. SO I'M TRYING TO GET ALL OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE SOUNDS WELL ALSO WHILE WATCHING THE SCREEN. THANK YOU. THIS IS REALLY GREAT. AND I GOT KIND OF CONFUSED ON ONLY ONE PART. BUT BEFORE I GO INTO THERE, THE INSTITUTIONAL PASS IS A GREAT IDEA. JUST BIG SUPPORT FOR THAT. IT WOULD BE GREAT IF WE CAN TAKE A LOOK AT THESE INSTITUTIONAL PASSES WITH AN EQUITY LENS, ESPECIALLY IF WE CAN LOOK AT REALLY SMALL SCALE EMPLOYERS, ESPECIALLY THOSE WITH A WHOLE LOT OF EMPLOYEES LIKE RESTAURANT AND BAR WORKERS OR AIRPORT WORKERS PEOPLE IN JANITORIAL SERVICES THAT KIND OF STUFF. FOLKS WHO MAY HAVE A HARDER TIME USING PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION BECAUSE OF THE TERRIBLY LIMITED HOURS WHEN IT COMES TO RELATIONSHIP TO THEIR WORK. BUT, ARE GOING TO BE GOING BACK AND FORTH AND ALL THAT KIND OF STUFF. SO IT WOULD BE GREAT IF WE COULD TAKE A LOOK AT THAT, AND IF IT NEEDS TO BE NARROWED, LOOKING AT MONOLINGUAL NON-ENGLISH SPEAKING RESTAURANTS AND BARS AND THOSE KINDS OF THINGS. THOSE EMPLOYEES WOULD BE TARGETS. I HAVE TWO SCREENS GOING HERE, I APOLOGIZE, IT SOUNDS LIKE IN THE TIERS OF INTEGRATION THAT YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT ON TIER THREE, IT -- JUST TO CLARIFY, THE BUSES THAT PEOPLE TAKE TO GET TO THINGS LIKE FERRIES, AND BART, AND ALL THAT KIND OF STUFF, THOSE WOULD BE INCLUDED IN THIS PROCESS?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: IT WOULD BE --

WILLIAM BACON: GO AHEAD, MIKE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: IN TIER THREE IT WOULD BE INCLUDED IN THE SENSE YOU WOULDN'T PAY TWICE. SO YOU WOULD PAY YOUR LOCAL BUS FARE AND THEN YOU WOULD CONNECT TO THE REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM. AND YOU WOULD HAVE A TRANSFER DISCOUNT. SO YOU WOULD GET THE DISCOUNT EQUAL TO THE COST OF YOUR LOCAL BUS TRIP. BUT, THEY WOULDN'T NECESSARILY -- ALL THE LOCAL BUSES WOULDN'T NECESSARILY HAVE THE SAME PRICE. SONOMA COUNTY BUSES AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY BUSES MIGHT BE DIFFERENT FROM EACH OTHER.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: OKAY.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: WHEN YOU GET TO TIER FOUR THAT'S WHEN ALL THE BUSES WOULD HAVE THE SAME PRICES.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: OKAY. THAT MAKES SENSE. AND IS THERE ANYTHING IN THERE TO ADDRESS THIS SHOCKINGLY INEQUITABLE FARE -- FARES BASED ON DISTANCE THAT YOU'RE WRITING SOMETHING LIKE PEOPLE WHO ARE PUSHED OUT BEING ABLE TO LIVE IN CITY CENTERS WHERE THEY CAN WALK TO WORK OR ACTUALLY -- ARE WE ADDRESSING THAT OR NOT TOUCHING IT YET?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: IN EACH OF THE OPTIONS WE HAVE PUT ON THE TABLE TODAY ZONE BASED AND DISTANCED BASED YOU WOULD CONTINUE TO PAY MORE THE MORE YOU USE THE SERVICE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: BUT THE ZONE-BASED IS AT LEAST AN OPTION IN THERE. SORRY. THE SOUND WAS CUTTING OUT.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: JUST TO CLARIFY ON THAT. I'M NOT SURE I ANSWERED YOUR QUESTION. EITHER ZONE BASED OR DISTANCED BASED, IF YOU TRAVEL LONGER DISTANCES YOU WOULD PAY MORE.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: GOING 1 TO 3 AS OPPOSED TO THE MORE STOPS YOU WOULD GET THE MORE MONEY YOU'RE SPENDING, THAT'S LOGICAL.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH THEY'RE SIMILAR ZONES JUST BIGGER CHUNKS, I GUESS.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: YEAH. I HAVE MORE, BUT I'LL WAIT UNTIL THE END THERE. THANKS.

WILLIAM BACON: YOU'RE MUTED ADINA.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THE PRESENTATION IS GOING TO COVER SOME OF THE OTHER FARE TYPES, SO IF YOUR QUESTION IS ABOUT ONE OF THE FARE TYPES THAT WE HAVEN'T GOTTEN, TO PLEASE HOLDS UNTIL AFTER STAFF HAS EXPLAINED THOSE CONSIDERATIONS, BUT PLEASE DO ASK YOUR QUESTIONS ABOUT THE THINGS THAT STAFF HAS EXPLAINED TO DATE. EXPLAINED TO DATE. CHRISTINA?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHRISTINA GOTUACO: HI, TEAM. THE FIXED PRICE PASS HAS ADDRESSED SOME OF THE INEQUITIES BROUGHT UP TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND THE INSTITUTIONAL PASS THERE'S GOING TO BE SOME, SORT OF, TRANSIT COMMITTEE MADE UP OF THE AGENCIES, AT AC TRANSIT WE HAD THE EZ PASS THAT SOLD TO INSTITUTIONS AND THEY ALSO PROVIDED TO SOME AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS THEY HAVE GIVEN IT TO RESIDENTS UPON MOVE IN. IT'S NICE TO HAVE THAT OPTION. BUT JUST TAKING WHAT'S OUT THERE, CALTRAIN, AND INCORPORATING IT INTO THIS. THANKS.

WILLIAM BACON: YEAH. THANK YOU, CHRISTINA, ONE OF THE THINGS THE TEAM HAS BEEN FOCUSED ON IS HAVING DISCUSSIONS WITH OPERATORS WHO ALREADY OFFER AN INSTITUTIONAL PRODUCT LEARNING FROM THEIR EXPERIENCE, TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW A REGIONAL ROLL OUT WOULD WORK IN TERMS OF THEIR EXISTING PRODUCTS, THEIR EXISTING USERS. I WON'T SAY IT'S A SUPER STRAIGHT-FORWARD PROCESS, BUT IT ULTIMATELY WOULD DELIVER FOR USERS BECAUSE INSTEAD OF HAVING AC TRANSIT ONLY PASS YOU WOULD HAVE A PASS THAT GIVES YOU AC TRANSIT AND BART THAT PROVIDES SIGNIFICANTLY MORE MOBILITY FOR USERS.

CHRISTINA GOTUACO: I WAS GOING TO SAY I THING HELPS ENCOURAGE THE NOTION THAT THIS IS AN INTERCONNECTED REGIONAL SYSTEM IF YOU DON'T HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT WHICH AGENCY YOU'RE ON.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANKS. WENDI?

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: ONE QUESTIONS THAT CAME UP FOR ME IS, ESPECIALLY WITH THE INDIVIDUAL PASSES IS, IF YOU ARE ALREADY A TRANSIT USER, I COULD SEE HOW THIS WOULD BE VERY BENEFICIAL. IF YOU ARE NOT YET A TRANSIT USER, WOULD YOU WANT TO BE SPENDING A CHUNK OF MONEY FOR SOMETHING YOU ARE NOT YET USING? YOU KNOW? WOULD IT ACTUALLY ENCOURAGE MORE PEOPLE TO TAKE TRANSIT? OF THE INSTITUTIONAL PASS WOULD; I'M NOT SURE IF THE INDIVIDUAL PASSES WOULD.

WILLIAM BACON: THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS OUR MODELS IS TRYING TO HELP US BETTER UNDERSTAND. IT'S A REALLY GOOD COMMENT. YOU KNOW, IT'S GOING TO VARY BY TYPE OF USER.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: DEFINITELY I DEFINITELY AGREE, WENDI, WHAT WE WANT IS A, SORT OF, PACKAGE OF THINGS THAT WOULD OFFER SOMETHING FOR ALL THE DIFFERENT GOALS THAT WE HAVE. THE PASSES ARE ABOUT THE HIGH VOLUME USER MAKING IT SO IT'S BETTER, EASIER, MORE ATTRACTIVE TO BE A HIGH VOLUME TRANSIT PERSON OR ANYBODY WHO DOESN'T NEED TO USE A CAR IN THE REGION. THERE ARE OTHER POLICIES WE'RE LOOKING AT, THE INSTITUTIONAL PASS, ONE OF ITS BIGGEST ADVANTAGES IS TRYING TO MARKET TRANSIT TO A POP THAT DOESN'T NECESSARILY USE IT NOW.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: ALONG THE LINES ONE COULD MAKE USE OF THESE PASSES IS THROUGH AN INDIVIDUALIZED MARKETING PROGRAM WHICH THE CITY OF SEATTLE DOES DO AND THEY USE THEIR PASSES AS PART OF THAT PROGRAM.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: I SEE THAT TISHA HAS A HAND.

TISHA DEE HARTMAN: YES. THANK YOU. WHAT TIER WOULD YOU SAY MOST CLOSELY ALIGNS WITH LA METRO. NOT UNLIKE US IN OUR 26 OPERATORS, THEY HAVE 27 OPERATORS ALTHOUGH THEY SERVE A MUCH LARGER BASE THAN US AND THEY ALSO HAVE AN EZ TRANSIT PASS. WHICH TIER WOULD YOU SAY MOSTLY ALIGNS WITH LA MET? JUST OUT CURIOSITY. BAKE BACK I LOVE THAT QUESTION. YOU SHOULD BE ON OUR PROJECT TEAM. THESE TIERS ARE, SORT OF, WAYS OF DELIVERING CHANGES, AND WHAT I GUESS I WOULD SAY, SORT OF, THE LA METRO HAS ELEMENTS OF TIER ONE AND THEY HAVE PASSES THAT COVER MULTIPLE OPERATORS AND PROVIDE, YOU KNOW, ACROSS THE COUNTY BUS SERVICE THAT YOU CAN GET WITH ONE PASS, LIGHT RAIL AND BUS ARE ALL INCLUDED IN WHAT PASS YOU CAN BUY. THAT'S TIER ONE BECAUSE INDIVIDUALS IN COUNTIES HAVE THEIR OWN FARES FOOTHILL TRANSIT DIFFERENT THAN SANTA MONICA YOU CAN BUY A PASS TO GIVE YOU ACCESS TO ALL OF THAT. THEY HAVE TIER ONE, THEN TIER TWO, DISCOUNTS BETWEEN AGENCIES SIMILAR TO WHAT WE HAVE IN OUR REGION WE HAVE LOTS OF TRANSFER DISCOUNTS BETWEEN AGENCIES. I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DON'T THINK LA METRO HAS A SINGLE CONSISTENT COUNTY-WIDE FREE TRANSFER BETWEEN ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS I DON'T THINK THEY'RE DIFFERENT THAN WE ARE WHEN IT COMES TO EXISTING AGREEMENTS. AND TIER 3 AND 4 THERE ISN'T A SINGLE REGIONAL PRICING APPROACH FOR TRANSIT IN LA. THEY DON'T HAVE AS MANY REGIONAL OPERATORS AS WE DO SO THAT'S A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT. THERE'S METROLINK, THE, SORT OF, CALTRAIN TYPE SERVICE THROUGHOUT SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA THAT SPANS THE WHOLE REGION. SO IT'S A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT WHEREAS IN OUR AREA WE HAVE ACE, CALTRAIN, SMART, AND BART, THAT ARE ALL PROVIDING RAIL SERVICE. SO I DON'T KNOW IF THAT DEFINITELY ANSWERS YOUR QUESTION, BUT THEY DEFINITELY HAVE TIER ONE. I THINK THAT'S A BIG DISTINCTION BETWEEN LA AND THE BAY AREA WE DON'T HAVE REGIONAL PASSES. LA DEFINITELY DOES HAVE REGIONAL PASSES.

TISHA DEE HARTMAN: THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THE COMMENTS ON THE LAST SLIDE -- IT SOUNDED SOMEWHERE IN THIS PRESENTATION, OR AT THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE THAT ONE OF THE QUESTIONS WAS ABOUT WHICH OF THESE, YOU KNOW, WHETHER TO DO PASSES OR CAPS OR BOTH. AND I HAVE A FEW THOUGHTS ABOUT THAT. ONE IS, I THINK THAT INSTITUTIONAL PASSES ARE A GOOD IDEA, BECAUSE THEY BUILD ON SOMETHING THAT WE HAVE THAT IS, YOU KNOW, DEFICIENCY IN, NOT A GOOD WAY, SO, HAVING WATCHED THE MOUNTAIN VIEW PLANNING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1 COMMISSION TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHETHER TO GIVE A BUS PASS OR
2 TRAIN PASS TO A PEOPLE IN A HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT'S THE
3 WRONG QUESTION. PEOPLE SHOULD BE ABLE TO GET A TRANSIT PASS.
4 AND I -- THERE WAS A PREVIOUS -- I THINK IT WAS ANNE OLIVIA
5 WHO TALK ABOUT ENABLING SMALLER EMPLOYEES AND INSTITUTIONS TO
6 BE ABLE TO MAKE IT REALLY ACCESSIBLE. I THINK THAT THERE IS
7 SOME INNOVATION OPPORTUNITIES HERE. BECAUSE ONE OF THE
8 CHALLENGES HISTORICALLY HAS BEEN THESE SORTS OF PASSES HAVE
9 BEEN ACCESSIBLE TO FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES OF LARGE EMPLOYERS AND
10 THAT LEAVES LARGE RANGES OF WORKERS OUT, INCLUDING PEOPLE THAT
11 ARE CONTRACTORS, LIKE THE JANITORIAL AND FOOD SERVICE WORKERS
12 AT THE BIG CORPORATIONS OR CONTRACTORS AND THEY HAVE
13 HISTORICALLY BEEN INELIGIBLE AND CALTRAIN JUST FIXED THAT IN A
14 RECENT POLICY DECISION AS WELL AS TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT
15 ASSOCIATIONS THAT ARE GETTING INFORMED TO BE ABLE TO SERVE A
16 POOL OF SMALLER EMPLOYERS, AND I AM WONDERING WHETHER IT WOULD
17 EVEN BE A THING TO HAVE SOME KIND OF A UNION SUPPORTED SO THAT
18 PEOPLE WHO WERE SCIU WOULD BE ABLE TO HAVE ACCESS. SO THINKING
19 OUT-OF-THE-BOX IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO PROVIDE IT TO A
20 LARGER DIVERSITY OF PEOPLE THAN THE HISTORICAL LARGE
21 EMPLOYERS. I ALSO THINK THAT IN TERMS OF, THERE SHOULD BE, IF
22 -- YOU KNOW, THE REGION IS GOING DOWN THAT ROAD -- WHICH IS
23 GOOD -- THAT WE SHOULD OFFER SOMETHING TO INDIVIDUALS IN
24 ADDITION INSTITUTIONS. THIS IS SOMETHING THEY HAVE HEARD IN
25 TALKING TO COMMUNITY MEMBERS THAT AN INSTITUTIONAL THING IS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GOOD BUT IF IT'S FOR INSTITUTIONS AND NOT INDIVIDUALS, IT FEELS UNFAIR. LIKE WHY DO I NOT HAVE SOMETHING THAT HAS THIS CONVENIENCE. AND IN TERMS OF INDIVIDUALS, A CAP STRUCTURE THAT DOESN'T HAVE THE CASH FLOW BURDEN, AS THE, A PASS, ESPECIALLY IF YOU ARE LOOKING AT A LONGER TIME FRAME, LIKE A MONTHLY OR EVEN A WEEKLY PASS. I'M INTERESTED IN SEEING WHAT THE FINANCIAL MODELLING AND RIDERSHIP MODELING IS SHOWING IN TERMS OF THE COST AND POTENTIAL BENEFITS. SO I'M NOT GOING TO HAVE PERSONALLY, A FINAL OPINION UNTIL SEEING THAT. BUT IN TERMS OF HAVING A DIRECTION FOR INDIVIDUALS AND INSTITUTIONS IS GOOD AND FOR INDIVIDUALS HAVE THINGS FOR PEOPLE ADDRESSING THAT, YOU KNOW, CASH FLOW ISSUE, HAVING A CAP IS GOOD IF IT -- IF THE MATH WORKS ON THAT. AND THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS AT THIS TIME. AND I SEE SOMEONE WHO HAS THEIR HAND RAISED FOR A SECOND COMMENT ON THIS TOPIC. IF ANYONE HAS A NEW COMMENT ON THIS TOPIC RAISE YOUR HAND, OTHERWISE WE'LL GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDES IN THE DECK. THEN WE'LL TAKE MORE QUESTIONS.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: I CAN PICK IT UP HERE WITH THE NEXT SLIDE ON TIER TWO. OKAY. CAN WE MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THANKS. OKAY. SO THINKING ABOUT TRANSFER DISCOUNTS. THIS IS TIER TWO. MORE STRAIGHT FORWARD, I THINK, IN CERTAIN WAYS. SO THE OPTIONS WE HAVE AROUND CONSIDERATION HERE: THERE IS REALLY TWO. NO OR LOW COST TRANSFERS BETWEEN LOCAL TO LOCAL OR LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRIPS. ANOTHER WAY OF SAYING THAT IS FOR THOSE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMBINATIONS OF TRIPS, THE CUSTOMER COST LIMIT IS LIMITED TO THE HIGHEST COST SEGMENT OF THE TRIP. IF YOU ARE RIDING AC TRANSIT TO BART YOU WILL RECEIVE A DISCOUNT EQUIVALENT TO YOUR AC TRANSIT FARE. WORTH NOTING HERE WE HAVE CHOICE IN TERMS OF HOW THAT DISCOUNT IS COMMUNICATED TO USERS AND WHEN IT IS ACTUALLY APPLIED. YOU CAN IMAGINE A SITUATION WHERE THE DISCOUNT IS ALWAYS APPLIED ON, SORT OF, TO THE BUS TRIP, OR YOU CAN IMAGINE THE SITUATION WHERE IT'S, SORT OF, BALANCED. RIGHT? WHERE IN ONE DIRECTION YOU GET A 100% DISCOUNT OFF YOUR BUS TRIP AND THEN ON THE OTHER DIRECTION, YOU GET A DISCOUNT OF A SIMILAR AMOUNT OFF OF YOUR RAIL TRIP. CERTAINLY FROM THE BART PERSPECTIVE, WE SEE ADVANTAGES TO HAVING APPROXIMATE BE MORE BALANCED BOTH IN TERMS OF SIMPLICITY OF THE REVENUE SHARING BACK END BUT ALSO IN TERMS OF HOW IT'S RECEIVED BY THE CUSTOMER SOME CHOICES TO MAKE THERE. SECOND IS LOWER COST TRANSFERS BETWEEN REGIONAL SERVICES, TRANCE BART TO CALTRAIN, THERE IS DISCOUNT THERE, NOT NECESSARILY FULL COST OFF ONE OF THE LEGS BUT MINIMUM OFTEN OF THE FARE TYPICALLY EQUAL TO THE COST OF A TYPICAL LOCAL BUS TRIP. TRANSFERRING FROM BART YOU MAY GET A $2 DISCOUNT YOUR COST ISN'T DIFFERENT THAN IT WOULD BE ONE SYSTEM YOU'RE USING RATHER THAN TWO. I'LL SAY, FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, AT LEAST, PERSONALLY, THAT IT'S CLEAR THAT HAVING BOTH OF THESE THINGS, LOCAL TO LOCAL, LOCAL TO REGIONAL, AND REGIONAL TO REGIONAL IS THE BEST OPTION FOR USERS. SO THE ONLY QUESTIONS HERE IS, WHAT IS THE COST, WHAT IS THE RIDERSHIP

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IMPACT, AND IS THE RETURN ON INVESTMENT GOOD. I THINK FROM OUR STUDIES PERSPECTIVE, THIS IS THE RIGHT MOVE TO MOVE FOR FARE INTEGRATION USERS. ON THE RIGHT SIDE HERE, YOU CAN SEE LISTED OUT SOME OF THE IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES. GENERALLY, YOU THINK OF THESE AS LOWER IMPACT. PROBABLY IMPLEMENTABLE AS JUST THROUGH INTER-AGENCY AGREEMENTS OR IDEALLY THROUGH A BROAD SINGLE MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING OR AGREEMENT BETWEEN ALL OF THE PARTICIPATING AGENCIES. AND OPERATIONALLY, YOU KNOW, THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE FAIRLY STRAIGHT FORWARD TO DELIVER IN CLIPPER TWO. IN CLIPPER ONE, WE DO WANT TO CLARIFY, CURRENTLY SOME AGENCIES HAVE INTER-AGENCY TRANSFERS AND DISCOUNTS AND SOME DON'T AND SOME DIRECTIONS OF TRAVEL INCLUDE INTER-AGENCY DISCOUNTS, IS SOME DON'T. WHAT THE CHIRP SYSTEM ALLOWS US TO DO IS CHANGE THE VALUE OF THOSE DISCOUNTS BUT ADDING NEW INTER-AGENCY DISCOUNTS IS A LARGER PROJECT THAT WE HAVE COME TO UNDERSTAND WOULD PROBABLY DELAY THE CLIPPER TWO ROLL OUT SCHEDULE IF WE WANTED TO GO IN THAT DIRECTION. SO, AT THIS POINT, CHANGES TO INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNTS BEFORE CLIPPER TWO IMPLEMENTATION WOULD BE LIMITED TO THE EXISTING SET OF DISCOUNTS. SO SOME LIMITATIONS THERE. DO WE WANT TO PAUSE HERE FOR QUESTIONS/COMMENTS? OR MOVE ALONG? I'LL ASK THE CHAIR.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: LET'S GO TO THE NEXT 1, 2, AND THEN TAKE SOME MORE QUESTIONS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. NEXT ONE, PLEASE. OKAY. SO TIER THREE, WOULD BE A BIGGER MOVE WHERE WE WOULD STANDARDIZE FARES FOR SOME OR REGIONAL SERVICES, FERRY, RAIL, EXPRESS BUS IS WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE AND WOULD BE ADOPTING EITHER COMMON ZONE OR DISTANCE BASED STRUCTURE PRIMARY GOAL IS LEARN ABILITY OR LEGIBILITY FOR USERS. ON THE MANAGEMENT SIDE, DEPENDING ON THE NUMBER OF OPERATORS INVOLVED THIS COULD BE A LOWER OR MEDIUM IMPACT SHIFT. YOU COULD IMAGINE IT STARTING WITH JUST TWO OPERATORS, THROUGH AN INTER-AGENCY AGREEMENT BUT THROUGH A STABLE MULTI-OPERATOR STRUCTURE YOU MOST CERTAINLY NEED A CENTRAL MANAGEMENT ENTITY WHOM DELEGATING AUTHORITY WOULD BE A DIMENSIONAL STRUCTURE OF LONG-TERM. TECHNOLOGY SIDE WOULD NEED CLIPPER POTENTIAL FOR NEW FARE COLLECTION STAFF TRAINING AND MARKETING MATERIALS SERIOUS CHANGE TO CERTAIN AGENCIES PROCESSES. ON THE CUSTOMER SIDE ALL OF OUR REGIONAL SERVICE EITHER USE ZONES OR FARE DISTANCE BASED SERVICE TODAY FOR THOSE CUSTOMERS WHO IS CURRENT TRAVEL WOULD CHANGE WE WOULD NEED SOME CHANGE MANAGEMENT HELP FOR THOSE FOLKS. SO I'LL PAUSE THERE, AND I THINK BILL HAS GOT THE NEXT SLIDE. WE CAN TALK ABOUT TIER FOUR OR PAUSE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: I WOULD LIKE TO PAUSE AND TAKE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON TIER 2 AND 3.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. LET'S SEE. RICH, THIS IS ON TIER TWO OR THREE?

RICHARD HEDGES: I ACTUALLY HAVE COMMENT ON 2 AND 3 AND ON THE REGIONAL TRANSIT PASS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: EXCELLENT. GREAT. RICHARD, GO AHEAD.

RICHARD HEDGES: I'LL START WITH -- ACTUALLY, I THINK EXPERIENCE WOULD BE HELPFUL ON THE RESULTS PASSES. I RIDE THE SYSTEM FREQUENTLY, AND I DID AN EXPERIMENT, LA OFF-PEAK FARES ARE CHEAP AND I DID A WHOLE DAY FROM LONG BEACH TO THE MUSEUM THE SQUARE AND BACK TO HOLLYWOOD LATER IN THE DAY AND BACK TO LONG BEACH. I WANTED TO SEE IF A DAY PASS WAS CHEAPER EVEN WITH OFF-PEAK CHARGES. SOME OF THE RIDES WERE NOT OFF-PEAK, BUT MOST WERE AND I FOUND, NOT ONLY WAS EXHAUSTING TO FIGURE OUT ALL THOSE DIFFERENT FARES FOR THE DAY BUT AT EACH SYSTEM I HAD TO RECHARGE THE CARD BECAUSE AT THE BEGINNING I WASN'T SURE HOW MUCH MONEY I WOULD NEED RATHER THAN A DAY PASS. DAY PASS ARE FOR DISABLED AND SENIORS $2.50, $7.00 ALL DAY. I'M TRYING TO MAKE MY COMMENT AS FAST AS POSSIBLE. ON THE STANDARD REGIONAL SERVICE I THINK IT'S A GOOD IDEA BUT THE PROBLEM IS GOING TO BE HOW DANGEROUS AGENCIES SEE THE LOSS OF REVENUE OR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WHETHER WE'RE GOING TO HAVE SOME MONEY IN THE KITTY TO BE ABLE TO BACKFILL IN IF THEY HAVE A LOSS AND CAN DEMONSTRATE IT IN ORDER TO GET THIS STARTED. IN OTHER WORDS, SOME KIND OF A SUBSIDY SYSTEM. AND I JUST KNOW WHAT HAPPENED IN TRYING TO GET TRANSLINK CARD IN, THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVE BEEN THERE FOR THE LAST 15 YEARS KNOW WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT, BEFORE WE HAD CLIPPER, AND RUNNING INTO THE SAME PROBLEMS IN GETTING THIS TO ROLL OUT. OWE SUBSIDY MIGHT BE A GOOD IDEA FOR SYSTEMS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: DOES STAFF HAVE ANY COMMENT ON THE FINANCIAL TRANSITION AT THIS TIME?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: JUST WANT TO SAY THANKS RICH. I'LL SPEAK FROM AN OPERATOR STAFF PERSPECTIVE. YOU KNOW, WE -- THERE IS THE QUESTION OF -- ONE WAY TO THINK ABOUT THIS IS HOW DO YOU REPLACE LOST REVENUE AND IN CONTEXT OF RECOVERY, HOW DO YOU PAY FOR THE REGIONAL SERVICES AT ALL. BART IS SPENDING 300 MILLION IN FEDERAL MONEY TO OPERATOR THIS YEAR. AND SO TO ME THE QUESTION IS, HOW CAN WE -- HOW SHOULD WE THINK OF THIS TYPE OF CHANGES IN THE CONTEXT OF BROADER FUNDING PLANS AND RECOVERY PLANS AND SERVICE PLANS FOR THESE SERVICES. BECAUSE THERE IS NOT A PLAN RIGHT NOW FOR HOW TO CONTINUE TO OPERATE IN OUR PRESENT SERVICE. SO I DON'T THINK -- AT LEAST, FROM THE BART PERSPECTIVE, I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE IN A POSITION IN THE NEXT SEVERAL MONTHS TO COMMIT TO CHANGING OUR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FARE STRUCTURE. BUT I THINK WE WILL HAVE TO COMMIT TO CHANGING OUR FARE STRUCTURE, FOR EXAMPLE, TO ZONE BASED FARES. THAT'S GOING TO HAVE TO BE SOMETHING THAT THESE AGENCIES CONTINUE TO STUDY OVER TIME IN THE CONTEXT OF COVID RECOVERY. THAT WOULD BE MY VIEW OF IT RIGHT NOW FROM THE AGENCY STAFF PERSPECTIVE. BUT WE DON'T -- YEAH, OF THE FUNDING PLAN FOR THE REGIONAL SERVICES RIGHT NOW IS AN OPEN QUESTION. AND I THINK IF WE'RE STUDY -- IF WE ARE GOING HAVE TO LOOK AT ALL OF OUR OPTIONS FOR HOW WE'RE GOING TO CHANGE OVER TIME.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANKS. CHRISTINA?

CHRISTINA GOTUACO: I THINK I HEARD CORRECTLY ON FARE TWO THERE IS THE POTENTIAL OPTION, IF YOU TRANSFER, YOU ONLY GET CHARGED THE DIFFERENCE ON THE SECOND FARE [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT SOUNDS AMAZING. I NEVER HEARD OF THAT BEFORE. BUT I JUST HAD A QUESTION ON TIER THREE, ALSO, IF, JUST, LIKE, WHAT'S FEASIBILITY OF T OF HOW OTHER AGENCIES ARE REACTING, AND THEN A COMMENT ALSO, THAT I WAS REGIONALLY RIDING TRANSIT IN SEATTLE AND TAKING THE LINK, AND THE SOUNDER AND THE BUSES AND THE ORCA PASS AT THE BEGINNING OF MY TRIP, AND EACH BUS THEY GOT ON, WAS KIND OF LIKE, DO I HAVE ENOUGH MONEY ON MY CARD JUST TAG IT TO SEE IF YOU GET A FREE TRANSFER, YOU'RE STANDING AT A STOP AND YOU DON'T NECESSARILY HAVE THE INFRASTRUCTURE TO RELOAD YOUR CARD AND IF YOU'RE RUNNING LOW ON FUNDS IT'S

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HELPFUL KNOW IN ADVANCE OF YOUR TRIP HOW MUCH IT WOULD HAVE COSTED; LUCKILY I MADE IT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: TISHA?

TISHA DEE HARTMAN: I WANT TO MESH THAT I'M CLEAR IN MY UNDERSTANDING THAT SO FAR TIER ONE OFFERS ONLY TRANSIT PASSES, TIER TWO, ONLY THE LOW NO COST TRANSFER AND TIER THREE STANDARDIZED REGIONAL PRICING SO AT THIS POINT IT'S EITHER/OR BETWEEN THESE IMPROVEMENTS WE DON'T HAVE AN OPTION ON THE TABLE THAT INCORPORATES TRANSIT PASSES AND LOW COST TRANSFERS AND STANDARDIZED REASONABLE APPRISE PRICING STRUCTURE TOGETHER WHICH IS WHAT I WOULD CONSIDER TO BE A ROBUST STRUCTURE WHICH WOULD OFFER EASE OF USE, COMPREHENSIBILITY, AND ENSURING EQUITY ACROSS THE USERS AND GROWING RIDERSHIP LONG-TERM. JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE I'M CLEAR ON THAT.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: I COULD IN BUILDING I SUPPOSE YOU COULD DO IT WITHOUT TIER ONE BUT WE'RE TRYING TO PUT TOGETHER A PACKAGE OF OPTIONS FOR FOLKS TO CONSIDER THAT INCLUDES CHOICES FROM BOTH 1 AND 2 AND 3 WOULD BUILD -- AND WE WOULD WANT TO BUILD ON THAT IN A LONGER TERM PLAN TO STANDARDIZE SOME OF THE STRUCTURES AND I THINK WE WOULD WANT TO CHOOSE OPTIONS FROM ONE OR TWO FOR NEARER TERM IMPLEMENTATION THAT FIT WELL AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MADE SENSE WITH ANY VERSION OF TIERS THREE OR FOUR THAT WE ARE TARGETING.

TISHA DEE HARTMAN: I WANT TO MAKE SURE I'M CLEAR, TIER TWO INCORPORATES TIER ONE AND TIER THREE INCORPORATES ELEMENTS OF TIER 1 AND 2. IS THAT WHAT I HEARD?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: THEY CERTAINLY CAN. PUGET SOUND, CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG, BILL, MY UNDERSTANDING IS THEY HAVE A WELL INTEGRATED PACKAGE OF REGIONAL PASS OPTIONS BUT I DON'T BELIEVE THEY HAVE A STANDARDIZED INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNT. AND ACTUALLY, I THINK BILL YOU JUST SAID THIS, WELL. A THE SAME. I'M NOT AN EXPERT ON LA. YOU DON'T HAVE TO HAVE BOTH BUT WE WANT PEOPLE TO HAVE OPTIONS AND PACKAGE THEM TOGETHER.

TISHA DEE HARTMAN: THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: WENDI?

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: LOOKING FOR MORE INFORMATION FROM WHAT YOU WERE JUST SPEAKING ABOUT WITH RICH. IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT BART, OF ALL THE AGENCIES, HAS THE HIGHEST RECOVERY RATE, OR DID IN THE BEFORE TIMES. AND SO YOU WOULD HAVE THE MOST TO LOSE WITH THE STANDARDIZED FARE ACROSS THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

REGION. WHAT WOULD BART REQUIRE AND SOME OF THE OTHER HIGH -- SOME OF THE OTHER AGENCIES THAT HAVE HIGH RECOVERY RATES. WHAT WOULD IT REQUIRE TO EVEN THINGS OUT SO THAT YOU DON'T ACTUALLY HAVE A LOSS IF WE GO TO A REGIONAL FARE?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: WELL, I THINK WHAT IT WOULD REQUIRE IS A SUSTAINABLE FUNDING MODEL. OF SOME KIND. RIGHT? AND THAT'S ONE OF THE REASONS WHY I TEND TO THINK OF THIS SIZE A PROCESS WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO START NOW RATHER THAN ONE WE'RE GOING FINISH NOW BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT SUSTAINABLE FUNDING MODEL IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE IN TERMS OF COVID. IN TERMS OF DOLLARS AND SHIFT, IF WE EXECUTE ONE OF THOSE CHANGES, THAT'S THE ANSWER WE'RE LOOKING FOR OUT OF THE MODELING, OBVIOUSLY THEY'RE GOING TO BE IMPRECISE, AND SUBJECT TO SCENARIO PLANNING AS WE LOOK AT DIFFERENT LEVELS OF RECOVERY. BUT THE OPERATORS WENT INTO THIS WITH THE PERSPECTIVE THAT FARE INTEGRATION IS POTENTIALLY QUITE VALUABLE BUT NOT SOMETHING WE WANT TO CUT SERVICE OVER. WHAT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE IS THAT WE HAVE A SUSTAINABLE FUNDING MODEL THAT DELIVERS SERVICE PEOPLE NEED FIRST AND FOREMOST.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANKS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: HAVE A FEW COMMENTS BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO TIER FOUR. IN TERMS OF TRANSFER DISCOUNTS FROM LOCAL AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

REGIONAL AS A USER MY RESPONSE TO THAT IS A HECK YES. AND SOMEONE WHO USES A RANGE OF TRIP COMBINATIONS, SO, CALTRAIN TO BART OR TRANSBAY BUS TO BART OR SOMETHING, HAVING THEM BE YOU KNOW, LIKE DOING SOMETHING THAT SEEMS PEOPLE WHO USE TRANSIT MAY HAVE VARIED TRIPS JUST LIKE SOMEBODY WHO DRIVES DOES, IS A GOOD HEALTHY-FORWARD LOOKING ASSUMPTION. AND, IN TERMS OF REGIONAL STANDARDIZATION, ALSO, AS A USER, HECK YES. SO, JUST LIKE THINKING OF IT AS A USER, AND TRYING TO THINK HOW MUCH DIFFERENTLY I'M PAYING FOR CALTRAIN VERSUS BART, LIKE, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A REGIONAL RAIL SYSTEM, AND ARGUABLY A RAIL TRANSIT SYSTEM WITH MULTIPLE OPERATORS, AND WHY THEY SHOULD BE DIFFERENT IS SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE OPAQUE TO A USER, AND I WOULD BE INTERESTED TO HEARING THE RESULTS OF THE USER RESEARCH ABOUT HOW MANY OTHER PEOPLE FEEL THE SAME WAY FROM A USER PERSPECTIVE THERE IS GREATER LEGIBILITY AND CLARITY FROM DOING THAT KIND OF STANDARDIZATION, AND THEN IN TERMS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL IMPLICATIONS, HAVING WATCHED TRANSFERS COME AND GO AND COME AND GO AND COME AND GO AND COME AND GO THEY'RE LIKE SEEMING EASY TO SETUP AND AS TO UNWIND AND, LIKE, HAVING WATCH THAT WOULD BE STRONGLY ENCOURAGING A STRUCTURE THAT WOULD PROVIDE STABILITY, SO WE DIDN'T HAVE SOMETHING THAT ROLLED OUT AND LOOKED PRETTY, AND THEN JUST GENERALLY DEGRADED WHENEVER THERE WAS ANY KIND OF CHANGE IN THE WINDS TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO SET SOMETHING UP THAT WOULD BE STABLE FOR USERS. AND THEN, THE LAST COMMENT I WOULD WANT TO MAKE -- AND THIS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GOES BACK TO THE THINGS ON THE PASSES AND WHAT THEY SHOULD COVER -- FEEL PRETTY STRONGLY ABOUT HAVING CONVENIENT AND AFFORDABLE STRUCTURES THAT DO INCLUDE THE REGIONAL SERVICES. I REMEMBER HEARING STAFF AT REGIONAL AGENCY THAT IS NOT AT THOSE REGIONAL AGENCIES ANYMORE. THIS IS NOT A CORRELATIVE JUST LIKE PEOPLE THAT HAVE MOVED ON, PROUDLY ABOUT THE FACT THAT THEIR PRODUCT WITH THE HIGH PRICE THEREFORE THEY ATTRACTED AN ELITE AUDIENCE AND TOUT A PREMIUM PRODUCT AND ARE PROUD OF THAT FACT MY REACTION IS THEY CAN'T COME UP WITH SOMETHING MORE POLITE THAN REPREHENSIBLE WHERE WE HAVE A PUBLIC TRANSIT SERVICE IT SHOULD BE ACCESSIBLE TO PEOPLE. I HAVE DONE SOME READING OF HISTORY WHERE THERE IS REALLY DOCUMENTED HISTORY THAT SOME OF THE REGIONAL SERVICES WERE DESIGNED TO BE SEGREGATED WHERE THE DESIGNER WOULD WANT TO KEEP THE LOW-INCOME PEOPLE OFF THE REGIONAL SERVICES, AND, LIKE, WANTING TO KEEP THE USERS OF DIFFERENT TYPES OF SERVICES SEPARATE FROM EACH OTHER. AND SO HAVING SOMETHING THAT SEES OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM COMING AS A PUBLIC INVESTMENT AND THAT'S AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC IS, I THINK, A POINT OF VALUES THEY WOULD WANT TO MAKE AS A COMMENT. AND I'LL LEAVE IT THERE. AND RANT. DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY COMMENT? OR JUST, STAFF, HAS ANY REACTIONS TO ANY OF THIS, THAT WOULD BE WELCOME, AND IF I DON'T SEE ANY MORE HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PANEL, WE'LL MOVE ON TO THE OPTION FOUR. ANNE OLIVIA, IF YOU WANT TO JUMP IN NOW ABOUT THE STUFF WE HAVE SEEN TO DATE, GO AHEAD.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: ABSOLUTELY. THE ONE THING I WOULD SAY, I REALLY DO LIKE THE IDEA OF THE DISCOUNT BEING WHATEVER IS ADDITIONAL FROM THE THING BEFORE. BUT I WOULD REALLY LIKE YOU ALSO TO CONSIDER A CAP ON THAT. ROOMMATE'S KID LIVES IN CROCKETT. HE IS TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND I ASKED HIM IF HE COULD HELP WITH SOMETHING AND THAT TRIP WAS GOING TO COST HIM $32 IN EACH DIRECTION AND SO HE COULDN'T. THERE IS ANOTHER MEMBER OF OUR COUNCIL WHO TAKES TRANSIT TO WORK AND IT COSTS THEM $100 A WEEK. AND SO JUST TO KEEP -- AND, SO, YEAH, TO HAVE THAT KIND OF DISCOUNT WOULD BE GREAT, BUT TO ALSO CONSIDER A CAP ON IT WOULD REALLY IMPACT FOLKS, ESPECIALLY THE FOLKS WHO HAVE GOTTEN PUSHED OUT AND HAVE TO TAKE NON-INTUITIVE ROUTES. HE HAS TO RIDE FOUR DIFFERENT FORMS OF TRANSPORTATION TO GET FROM HIS KID'S HOUSE TO OUR HOUSE. AND -- AND THIS IS MORE AND MORE COMMON FOR LOW-INCOME FOLKS, BUT NOT NECESSARILY ONLY THE FOLKS THAT FALL INTO THIS PRETTY -- NOT PRETTY AT ALL, ACTUALLY -- THAT FALLS INTO THAT SCALE THAT WE GIVE THOSE KINDS OF DISCOUNTS FOR. RIGHT? LIKE, IF YOUR TRANSPORTATION COSTS ARE $32 EACH DIRECTION, THE AMOUNT OF INCOME YOU HAVE TO MAKE TO HAVE THAT BE SOMETHING THAT'S CHILL IS A LOT HIGHER THAN THAT FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL. SO, JUST TO CONSIDER A CAP IN ADDITION THE WAY THAT WE DO THOSE THINGS TO ADJUST THE NEEDS OF THOSE FOLKS TO REALLY IMPACTING.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GREAT. AND CHRISTINA.

CHRISTINA GOTUACO: I WILL SAY TO ANNE OLIVIA'S POINT, YEAH, LOW-INCOME, AND ALL INCOMES THAT WOULD BENEFIT FROM THAT CAP, BECAUSE THAT'S ALSO WHAT PUSHES PEOPLE AWAY FROM TAKING TRANSIT AND USING THE CAR. FOR INSTANCE FOR ME TO VISIT RELATIVES IT WOULD TAKE THREE OR FOUR LEGS OF TRANSIT WITHIN THE BAY AREA THAT'S ASTRONOMICALLY EXPENSIVE IN TERMS OF COST AND TIME AND I END UP ON TRAINS AND BUSES THAT WILL EVENTUALLY GET ME THERE IN TWO HOURS. BUT THE CAP WOULD BE A BENEFIT TO EVERYBODY IN THE BAY AREA.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: COOL. ANY COMMENTS FROM STAFF BEFORE WE GO ON TO THE OPTION FOUR?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: WE'RE LISTENING. GOOD POINTS EVERYBODY. WE'RE KEEPING TRACK OF COMMENTS. IT'S HELPFUL.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THERE IS ONE MORE OPTION TO WALK US THROUGH TO TALK ABOUT BENEFITS AND DRAWBACKS?

WILLIAM BACON: YEAH. WE CAN -- THIS IS BILL BACON, AGAIN, I'LL COVER OPTION -- TIER FOUR, EXCUSE ME. IF WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. TIER FOUR IS REALLY, SORT OF, THE ULTIMATE EXTENT OF, SORT OF, FARE INTEGRATION IN THE SCOPE OF WHAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE'RE STUDYING INCLUDING ALL OPERATOR IN THE BAY AREA BRINGING THEM UNDER THE, SORT OF, THREE DIFFERENT OPTIONS WE'RE CONSIDERING YOU SEE NOTED ON THE LEFT EITHER COMMON DISTANCE BASED STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES WITH A LOCAL FLAT FARE AND THAT MEANS THERE WOULD BE A SINGLE PRICE FOR LOCAL TRANSIT ACROSS THE BAY AREA. SO THE COST OF A LOCAL TRANSIT TRIP IN NAPA WOULD COST THE SAME AS A LOCAL TRANSIT TRIP IN SAN JOSE. THE SECOND OPTION IS THE SAME, BUT INSTEAD OF DISTANCE BASED FOR THE REGIONAL SERVICE IT WOULD BE ZONED BASED. YOU HAVE A COMMON ZONE MAP THAT WOULD APPLY ACROSS THE BAY AREA. AND THE THIRD OPTIONS WHAT IF WE APPLIED A COMMON ZONE BASED STRUCTURE FOR ALL SERVICES ACROSS THE ENTIRE BAY AREA, RATHER THAN ONLY APPLYING THAT ZONE BASED STRUCTURE TO THE REGIONAL SERVICES, AS IN THE PRECEDING OPTION. SO THOSE ARE THE THREE OPTIONS THAT WE HAVE BEEN STUDYING, AND IN THE RIGHT HAND PORTION OF THE SLIDE IS THE IMPACT OF THIS IS RELATIVELY SIGNIFICANT FOR ALL OF THE KEY, SORT OF, MEASURES THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT, FROM A MANAGEMENT PERSPECTIVE, THE FARE SETTING AUTHORITY WOULD REALLY NEED TO BE TRANSITIONED INTO SOME TYPE OF CENTRAL MANAGING ENTITY TO REALLY EFFECTIVELY DELIVER A SINGLE FARE STRUCTURE FOR MORE THAN TWO DOZEN AGENCIES. THAT WOULD ALSO REQUIRE AN OVERHAUL THE WAY THAT FARE REVENUE IS COLLECTED AND DISTRIBUTED BETWEEN AGENCIES AND OR THE SUBSIDY AND, SORT OF, FUNDING OF SERVICE GENERALLY. SO SIGNIFICANT IMPACT. FROM A TECHNOLOGY PERSPECTIVE, THE IMPACTS ARE MAYBE A LITTLE BIT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MORE ACHIEVABLE. BUT C2 IS REALLY A PREREQUISITE TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER THAT SINGLE STRUCTURE FOR ALL OF THE REGIONAL SERVICES, SO THAT IS, SORT OF, A REQUIREMENT COMING FROM TIER THREE. AND THEN, YOU KNOW, REGION-WIDE ZONES, IN MOST SCENARIOS, THE THIRD OPTION ON THE RIGHT HERE, THAT WOULD REQUIRE CUSTOMERS TO TAP OFF LOCAL BUS SERVICES, FOR EXAMPLE, AND THAT'S A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT FROM A TECHNOLOGY STANDPOINT IN TERMS OF THE NUMBER OF CLIPPER MACHINES THAT ARE LOCATED ON BUSES, IF THEY'RE AT THE FRONT DOOR AND BACK DOOR AND ANY ADDITIONAL DOORS ON BUSES. FROM AN INFRASTRUCTURE STANDPOINT, I JUST NOTED FARE COLLECTION INFRASTRUCTURE CLIPPER MACHINES, THEY'RE QUITE EXPENSIVE AND IT'S TECHNICALLY COMPLEX TO DEPLOY THEM ACROSS THE SYSTEM SO THAT'S A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT. COMMUNICATION AND MARKETING, STAFF TRAINING, ALL OF THAT REALLY IS SIGNIFICANTLY IMPACTED. AND THEN FROM A CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE THE IMPACTS IS DEPENDABLE AND THERE ARE PERSPECTIVES THAT YOU CAN LOOK AT THIS FROM AND WE'RE COGNIZANT OF THAT. WHILE HAVING A SINGLE LOCAL FARE PRICE IS VERY EASY AND SIMPLE FOR USERS TO UNDERSTAND, I THINK ONE OF THE QUESTIONS WE HAVE BEEN TRYING TO WHERE IS HOW MUCH BENEFIT DOES THAT PROVIDE USERS HAVING A SINGLE PRICE IN NAPA AND IN SAN JOSE, AS OPPOSED TO THE BENEFITS THAT USERS ACCRUE FROM HAVING FREE TRANSFERS BETWEEN AGENCIES. SO AS AN EXAMPLE WHERE SYSTEMS MAY BE JOINED TOGETHER, IF YOU ARE TO RIDE IN VTA BUS TO PALO ALTO AND BOARD A SAMTRANS BUS, IN TIER FOUR, YOU WOULD

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PAY A SINGLE PRICE FOR THAT TRIP IN THEORY BECAUSE ALL OF THE LOCAL FARES WOULD BE UNDER A SINGLE FLAT FARE, BUT YOU WOULD ALSO PAY A SINGLE PRICE UNDER TIER TWO BECAUSE THERE WOULD BE A FREE TRANSFER BETWEEN AGENCIES. SO THE QUESTION, I THINK, FOR THE TEAM IS, DOES TIER FOUR ACCRUE A LOT MORE BENEFIT TO USERS BY INCLUDING LOCAL SERVICE TO THE DEGREE THAT OVERCOMES THE SIGNIFICANT MANAGEMENT AND TECHNOLOGY HURDLES THAT WE LIKELY FACE IN DEPLOYING TIER FOUR, ESPECIALLY THE MANAGEMENT HURDLES, POLITICALLY OVERHAULING TWO DIFFERENT AGENCY FARE POLICY MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES IS A MAJOR HURDLE, AND WE DON'T -- WE WANT OUR RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF THIS PROJECT TO BE SUCCESSFULLY DEPLOYED. SO THAT'S A CONSIDERATION THAT I THINK WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT, AND WANT TO WEIGH, SERIOUSLY, IN DEVELOPING OUR RECOMMENDATIONS THAT GO BEFORE THE TASK FORCE. SO I KNOW WE JUST OVER TIME. SO I STOP THERE ON THIS SLIDE. IF WE CAN QUICKLY GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. WE'LL WRAP UP THE PRESENTATION THEN WE CAN DO QUESTIONS IF FOLKS ARE ABLE. ONE MORE SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THIS, AGAIN, JUST AS A REFRESH ON THE SCHEDULE, THIS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL MEET AGAIN ON SEPTEMBER 10TH, IN THE AFTERNOON, TO SEE THE DRAFT MATERIALS, ESSENTIALLY THE ROAD TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ON SEPTEMBER 20TH, PENDING YOUR COMMENTS AND GUIDANCE WE WANT TO ENGAGE THE SUBCOMMITTEE ONE MORE TIME BEFORE WE GO TO THE TASK FORCE. WE'LL BE PRESENTING TO THE AGENCY BOARDS IN LATE SEPTEMBER AND OCTOBER, THE MTC COMMISSION WORKSHOP SEPTEMBER 27TH AND 28TH

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND IMPORTANT RELATED DISCUSSION ABOUT THE AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN FUNDS IN THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND FINALLY THE DELIVER OF PROJECTS PILOTS IN THE BEGINNING TO MEDIUM TERM BEFORE DEPLOYMENT OF THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM. AND TOP RIGHT NOTING A COUPLE OF OTHER RELATED INITIATIVES THAT REALLY DO CONNECT IN SOME WAY WITH THIS WORK, FIRST IS BAY AREA REGIONAL RAIL PARTNERSHIPS, DELIVERY AND GOVERNANCE STUDY THAT WILL BE KICKING OFF SOON, THAT IS ESPECIALLY INTERESTING WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT TIER THREE, IF WE'RE TRYING TO CONSIDER BRINGING REGIONAL SERVICES UNDER A SINGLE STRUCTURE. SO I THINK IT'S LIKELY THAT THAT STUDY WILL HAVE SOME NEXUS TO ANY RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE PUT FORWARD THROUGH THIS WORK THAT RELATE TO TIER THREE. AND THEN THE TRANSIT NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE GROWING OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. OBVIOUSLY, IT'S VERY FOCUSED ON HOW THE SYSTEM WORKS TOGETHER AND HOW THE NETWORK IS COORDINATED AND FARE POLICY IS A KEY PART OF THAT. SO, ACROSS ALL OF OUR TIERS, THERE ARE QUESTIONS AROUND WHAT'S MOST EFFICIENT WAY TO MANAGE AN MOU, OR THE MOST EFFICIENT WAY TO MANAGE REVENUE DISTRIBUTION AND HOW WOULD A NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE APPROACH SOME OF THOSE CHALLENGES. SO I THINK, AGAIN, OUR STUDY WILL PUT FORWARD SOME OF THOSE CONSIDERATIONS, AND AREAS WHERE NETWORK MANAGEMENT COULD HAVE A ROLE. BUT WE'LL LOOK TO THAT FUTURE WORK FROM THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE TO HELP ANSWER SOME OF THE DETAILS ABOUT WHAT TYPE OF STRUCTURE THAT SHOULD BE AND HOW AN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ORGANIZATION COULD OR WOULD DO SOMETHING LIKE THAT. SO I THINK THAT WRAPS UP OUR PRESENTATION. AND I KNOW THERE ARE A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS. SO, APOLOGIES THAT WE HAVE GONE A BIT OVER.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: AND FOLKS, I HAVE TO APOLOGIZE. I HAVE ANOTHER COMMITMENT THEY HAVE TO JUMP OFF FOR. MY COLLEAGUE LISA RAFFETTO FROM BART IS O AND I AM HEAL TO TALK TO ANYBODY WHO WANTS TO TALK FURTHER. THANK YOU GUYS VERY MUCH. APOLOGIZE, I HAVE TO LEAVE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: SO I WANT TO TAKE QUESTIONS FROM THE MEMBER OF THE ADVISORY GROUP, AND FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. SO, IAN HAS HAD A HAND RAISED.

IAN GRIFFITHS: YES. THANK YOU. AND I AM ALSO GOING TO HAVE TO JUMP AS SOON AS I MAKE THIS COMMENT. BUT THANK YOU FOR ALL OF THIS GREAT WORK. THIS IS EVERYTHING I HAVE HEARD SO FAR, INCLUDING OPTION FOUR, FIRST I WANT TO ECHO THE CONCERN RAISED BY ADINA ABOUT HOW THE TRANSFER DISCOUNT, THE OPTION TWO, REALLY, LIKE UNIVERSAL TRANSFER DISCOUNT, LIKE, THE SLIDES EXPRESS THAT YOU CAN HAVE UNIFORM TRANSFER DISCOUNTS WITHOUT HAVING CENTRALIZED, YOU KNOW, NETWORK MANAGEMENT, THAT THAT IS IN THEORY POSSIBLE, BUT TO ME, I QUESTION, IS IT LIKELY? IS IT AN EFFECTIVE -- IS THAT REALLY THE MOST EFFECTIVE WAY OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRYING TO ACHIEVE FREE TRANSFERS. I THINK THE EXPERIENCE IN THE BAY AREA HAS BEEN VERY DIFFICULT IT HAS NOT BEEN A DURABLE SITUATION AND TRANSFERS GO INTO EFFECT AND OFTEN GET RATTLED A COUPLE OF YEARS LATER WHEN NO ONE'S PAYING ATTENTION, I THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE REFLECTED ON THE CLEAR ADVANTAGE OF CENTRALIZED NETWORK MANAGEMENT FOR EVEN THE DELIVER OF OPTION TWO I DON'T THINK IT'S A FAIR ASSESSMENT TO SAY THERE IS NO ADVANTAGES OF CENTRALIZED NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND FOR THAT -- MAYBE THAT'S NOT WHAT YOU WERE SAYING BUT I THINK THAT NUANCE DOES NEED TO BE REFLECTED ESPECIALLY FOR OPTION ONE AS AN ADVANTAGE AND EVEN BEING ABLE TO UPDATE THOSE TRANSFERS OVER TIME AND KEEP THEM GOING AS POTENTIALLY THERE IS TURN OVER AT DIFFERENT AGENCIES AND PEOPLE INVOLVED AT THOSE AGENCIES WEREN'T THERE FOR THOSE CONVERSATIONS WHEN THEY COMMITTED TO THOSE DISCOUNTS AND THAT I WANT TO UNDO THEM BECAUSE THEY DON'T SEE THE BENEFIT ANYMORE. I WANT TO COMMENT ON, JUST A SUBTLE TEE OF OPTION 3 AND 4 YOU, SORT OF, IMPLY THERE IS THIS BIG, OPTION THREE, STANDARDIZED REGIONAL SERVICES AND OPTION FOUR AS THE NEXT JUMP WHEREBY ALL 27 LOCAL AGENCIES HAVE TO HAVE THE COMMON FARE STRUCTURE. THING IS ACTUALLY POTENTIAL VALUE, AND IT'S A MUCH LIGHTER LIST TO STANDARDIZE A VAST MAJORITY OF LOCAL FARES BY FOCUSING ON FOUR AGENCIES INSTEAD OF ALL 27. MUNI, SAMTRANS, VTA, AND AC TRANSIT. PROBABLY COVER 95% OF LOCAL BUS TRIPS. [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] AS WELL AS LIGHT RAIL TRIPS IN THE BAY AREA. IF YOU COULD GET THOSE FOURS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AGENCIES TO AGREE ON A LOCAL FARE, YOU WOULD CAPTURE THE VAST MAJORITY OF TRANSFERS WITH OTHERS AND WHEN YOU COVER WITH REGIONAL SERVICES OF BART AND GOLDEN GATE YOU HAVE A CHUNK OF IMPACT AND THAT HAS SIGNIFICANTLY LESS GOVERNANCE AND INSTITUTIONAL IMPACT THAN TRYING TO GET ALL 27 AGENCIES TO AGREE ON SOMETHING. IF THAT COULD BE A STEPPINGSTONE TOWARDS FOUR DOESN'T UPEND AGENCIES AND INSTITUTIONAL AUTONOMY. I WOULD SAY FIRST TIME IN YOUR EXPLANATION THE DEPENDENCY POTENTIAL FOR ADVANTAGE BETWEEN OPTION TWO, THE UNIFORM TRANSFER DISCOUNTS, AND OPTION FOUR. BASICALLY WHAT I HEARD YOU SAY IS IT CAN GET REALLY COMPLICATED OFFERING FREE TRANSFERS UNDER OPTION TWO WHEN YOU HAVE A LOT OF DIFFERENT LOCAL FARES ARE YOU GIVING 2.05 SENSE OFF LOCAL FARES VTA SAMTRANS IS GOING TO OFFER A DOESN'T DISCOUNT VTA, [INDISCERNIBLE]. LOCAL FARE AT LEAVES AMONG THE MOST COMMON OF AGENCY -- APOLOGIZE FOR GOING THROUGH ALL OF THIS TOGETHER -- BUT TRYING TO BE EFFICIENT WITH TIME HERE. JUST ON OPTION FOUR, I KIND OF -- THE ASSESSMENT OF IMPACTS ON CUSTOMER -- OR THE IMPACTS THAT, SORT OF, YOU'RE RATING MEDIUM, LOW AND HIGH IMPACT, FIRST OF ALL, SOMETIMES THE HIGH IMPACT CAN BE GOOD SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE -- I'M NOT SURE EXACTLY WHAT THAT'S SUPPOSED TO BE CAPTURING, IMPLIED HIGH IMPACT IS BAD, HIGH IMPACT IS HARDER THEREFORE, WE SHOULD BE -- AND MAYBE THAT'S NOT INTENDING TO CAPTURE THE BENEFITS, SO THAT'S JUST AN OVERALL COMMENT IN TERMS OF HOW IT'S PRESENTED TO GENERAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MANAGERS LIKE THIS IS HARDER BUT LET'S KEEP IN MIND BENEFITS. I ALSO POTENTIALLY DISAGREE WITH HOW FOUR WAS PRESENTED WITH BEING SO MUCH MORE SIGNIFICANTLY DIFFICULT THAN THREE IN SOME AREAS, IN PARTICULAR, YOU LIST ITERATIONS OF OPTION FOUR AS, YOU KNOW DISTANCED BASED FARE ZONE BASED, AND THEN A LOCAL FLAT FARE AS ONE OF THE ITERATIONS THAT IS SIGNIFICANTLY EASIER AND HAS ALMOST IDENTICAL STRUCTURAL IMPLICATIONS TO, LIKE, OPTION THREE. I THINK. LIKE, IF YOU DON'T APPLY THE ZONE BASED FARE STRUCTURE TO LOCAL TRIPS AND YOU BASICALLY DON'T REQUIRE USERS TO TAP ON AND OFF FOR EVERY LOCAL TRIP BUT HAVE TO DO FOR REGIONAL TRIPS WHICH MOST AGENCIES DO WITH THE EXCEPTION OF CALTRAIN, NO. YOU HAVE TO DO THAT AS WELL. I THINK THAT IS MAYBE -- THE ASSESSMENT AS YOU PRESENTED IT IS MAKING IT MORE DIFFICULT THAN MAYBE IT IS PARTICULARLY GIVEN SOME OF THE SUBITERATIONS OF OPTION FOUR THAT YOU LISTED, INCLUDING HAVING A STANDARDIZED LOCAL FLAT FARE THAT WOULDN'T NECESSARILY REQUIRE PEOPLE TAPPING OFF. SO I JUST ASK FOR YOU TO TAKE A CLOSER LOOK AT THOSE AND MAKE SURE THAT IT'S FAIR OR THAT IT'S BEEN APPROPRIATELY NUANCED AS IT'S CHARACTERIZING THOSE IMPACTS ON ALL THE DIFFERENT THINGS. THAT'S IT THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANKS IAN. MOVING ON TO TISHA.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TISHA DEE HARTMAN: THANK YOU. TO ECHO ON WHAT SOME OF WHAT IAN SAID AND HOW SOMEONE STATED EARLIER THAT IT'S BEEN OVER TEN YEARS SINCE AN UNDERTAKING OF THIS NATURE HAS BEEN DONE AND KEEPING WITH THE FUTURE IN MIND AS IT RELATES TO SEAMLESSNESS OF THE SYSTEM AND RIDERSHIP AND NAVIGATING TRIPS AND FARES AND DELIVERING STRONGER VALUES TO TRANSIT RIDERS THAN OFFERED BY CAR WHILE ADDRESSING EQUITY AND TRANSPORTATION NETWORK ACROSS ALL CALIFORNIA BOTH TODAY AND IN THE LONG RUN I SEE THE FUTURE OF BAY AREA AND THE STATE IN GENERAL IT'S GOING TO BE CONNECTED WITH TRANSPORTATION THE COST OF LIVING IS GOING UP EXPONENTIALLY PUSHING POPULATIONS FARTHER AND FARTHER OUT IF WE LOOK AT THIS PROBLEM FROM THE LENS OF WHAT WE KNOW TODAY WE'RE CUTTING US OFF AT THE KNEES WE KNOW OUR POPULATION IS GOING TO PUSH OUTWARD WE'RE MAKING DECISIONS ABOUT DOES IT REALLY MAKE SENSE TO CHANGE FARES ACROSS THE REGION BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO IMPACT A SMALL PERCENTAGE OF RIDERS IN SACRAMENTO TODAY WE'RE LOOKING AT THIS WITH SHORT SIGHTEDNESS, I THINK IT'S BEST TO BITE THE BULLET NOW AND UNDERTAKE THE LEVEL OF OVERHAUL NEEDED AS OPPOSED TO PUSHING THE CAN DOWNED ROAD AND DEALING WITH IT DECADES FROM NOW UNTIL WE DECIDE TO UNDERTAKE THIS KIND OF PROJECT AGAIN WE'RE AFRAID OF THE FEAR OF THE LABORIOUSNESS AND PAIN INVOLVED WITH GETTING ALL OPERATORS ON BOARD IN AGREEMENT. IT WOULD BEHOOVE US TO LAY DOWN THE PROPER GROUNDWORK NOW AND ENSURE THAT WE CAN OFFER ALL THE BEST PRACTICES IN OUR FINAL SOLUTION AS WE HAVE GONE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DOWN THIS JOURNEY TOGETHER WE CAN AGREE IN PART OR WHOLE THAT WE WANT TRIP CAPS PASSES FOR DALE USERS THAT WE WANT STANDARDIZED FARES BE WHETHER IT BE ACROSS REGION OR OPERATOR TYPES DISCOUNTS FOR SENIORS STUDENTS, DISABLED AND ALL OTHER ECONOMICALLY DISADVANTAGED GROUPS. I HEARD STAFF TALKING ABOUT THE LABORIOUSNESS OF TIERS THREE AND. WE HAVE TO TAKE THAT OFF THE TABLE AND DO WHAT'S RIGHT NOT EASY AND COMFORTABLE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: WIND?

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU FOR PROVIDING THE SLIDE THAT'S SITTING IN THE APPENDIX. ON THE -- THE TRANSFERS. IT INFORMATIVE. CAN YOU THROW THAT UP FOR JUST A MINUTE SO I CAN LOOK AT IT.

WILLIAM BACON: TO THE BROADCASTING TEAM YOU CAN BRING THE SLIDE UP AND BRING THE LAST SLIDE IN THE PRESENTATION UP? THANK YOU.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: ONE MORE SLIDE. ONE MORE. THIS GIVES US AN UNDERSTANDING OF WHO IS TRANSFERRING TO WHERE, AND IN THIS SLIDE, IT REALLY SHOWS THAT MOST OF THE TRANSFER TRIPS, THEY START LOCAL OR THEY END LOCAL. AND THEY GO TO A REGIONAL. SO I THINK THAT THE -- THE NOTION THAT WE HAVE TO SEPARATE REGIONAL AND LOCAL, AND THIS BELIES THAT, BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY IF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SOMEBODY'S INITIATING A TRIP OR ENDING A TRIP, IT'S GOING TO BE ON A LOCAL SERVICE SO WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO HAVE SOME KIND OF INTEGRATION, AND AS IAN HIS POINTED OUT THE BULK OF THE LOCAL TRIPS ARE EITHER SAN FRANCISCO OR THE EAST BAY -- I NOTICED YOU DIDN'T HAVE MARIN IN THERE. I'M SORRY WE DON'T COUNT. [LAUGHTER] BUT --

WILLIAM BACON: WIND E JUST SO YOU KNOW MARIN TRANSIT IS INCLUDED WITH GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT BECAUSE WITHIN CLIPPER IT'S CONSIDERED ONE AGENCY. SO THAT'S WHERE MARIN TRANSIT IS.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: BUT IT'S GOING TO BE THE SAME, YOU START ON A LOCAL BUS AND THEN TRANSFER TO A REGIONAL BUS. SO I THINK IT IS -- AND YOU CAN STOP SHOWING THE SLIDE RIGHT NOW. I JUST WANTED PEOPLE TO TAKE A LOOK AT IT. AND I ALSO WANT TO AGREE WITH TISHA THAT, YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT GOING TO GO THROUGH THIS WHOLE EXERCISE AND THEN JUST DO SOMETHING SIMPLE. CERTAINLY, IF WE WANT TO INITIATE SOME THINGS RIGHT NOW, WE MIGHT DO SOME OF THE EASY THINGS FIRST, BUT AS FAR AS WHERE WE'RE GOING WITH THIS WHOLE EXERCISE, WE'RE LOOKING FOR AN INTEGRATED SYSTEM. WE'RE LOOKING FOR A SYSTEM WHERE I CAN GET ON MY LOCAL BUS AND THEN TRANSFER TO A REGIONAL BUS AND HAVE A FAIRLY GOOD IDEA THAT I'M NOT GOING TO BE SPENDING $35 FOR THE TRIP. AND SO, IF WE'RE GOING TO BE MAKING A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT REALLY DOES WORK FOR EVERYONE, WE HAVE TO DO SOMETHING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THAT IS INCORPORATING BOTH THE LOCAL TRANSIT AND THE REGIONAL TRANSIT, AND IF THERE ARE STEPS THAT WE TAKE ALONG THE WAY IN ORDER TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN, THAT'S FINE. BUT WE HAVE TO CONTINUE ON TO WHAT THE ULTIMATE GOAL S.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: I WANT TO MAKE A FEW COMMENTS AND GET ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THIS BODY IS THEN TAKE COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC BEFORE WE FINISH UP. SO, I HAVE A QUESTION FOR STAFF ABOUT HOW THIS INTERACTS WITH THE WAYFINDING STUDY, SO WHEN THE WAYFINDING STUDY WAS PRESENTED TO THE POLL POLLS, THERE WAS AN INTRIGUING BUT KIND OF VAGUE COMMENT THAT THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF BENEFIT FROM THE WAYFINDING PROJECT WOULD BE ACHIEVED IF IT HAD ONE OF THE -- SOME OF THE FARE INTEGRATION, BUT THEY DIDN'T ACTUALLY CONNECT DOTS AND SAY WHICH LEVEL OF FARE INTEGRATION WOULD ACTUALLY MAKE THE WAYFINDING EASIER. IS THIS SOMETHING THAT THE PEOPLE DOING THOSE STUDIES CURRENTLY KNOW? AND IS THERE AN ANSWER NOW? OR WILL THERE BE AN ANSWER TO THAT QUESTION?

WILLIAM BACON: I CAN'T SPEAK SPECIFICALLY BECAUSE I WASN'T THERE TO HEAR WHAT THEY WERE REFERRING TO. MY SENSE OF THE COORDINATION WE HAVE DONE WITH THE WAYFINDING STUDY IS THAT IF YOU HAVE FOR EXAMPLE, A SINGLE REGIONAL TRANSIT BRAND SOME OF THE HIGHEST LEVELS, I FORGET THE EXAMPLE, TIERS IN THE WAY OF FINDING STUDY THE MAXIMUM TIER OF INTEGRATION OF WAYFINDING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND BRANDING THAT YOU WOULD LIKELY WANT TO HAVE A COMMON FARE STRUCTURE IF ALL OF YOUR TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA WAS BRANDED AS ONE, IF THAT MAKES SENSE. SO I THINK THAT'S WHAT THEY'RE GETTING AT. IF YOU WERE TO HAVE A SINGLE BRAND ACROSS ALL SERVICE IN THE BAY AREA IF YOU WANT TO DO THAT YOU WOULD HAVE TO HAVE A SINGLE LOCAL BUS FARE BECAUSE THE BUS IN SANTA ROSA WOULD LOOK EXACTLY THE SAME AS THE BUS IN SAN JOSE SO YOU WANT POLICIES TO MATCH THE BRANDING. I BELIEVE THAT'S WHAT THE WAY FINDING AND MAPPING STUDY HAS LOOKED AT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. I SUSPECT THAT -- I'M NOT REMINDING IT REALLY CLEARLY. I THINK THERE MIGHT HAVE BEEN ANOTHER NUANCE IN THERE. THEY NOT EXPLAINING IT CLEARLY BUT SAYING REALLY DEPENDING UPON THE RESULTS OF THE FARE STUDY WHICH WE CAN'T SPEAK TO. I WOULD LOVE IF IT WERE POSSIBLE FOR WHEN THE RECOMMENDATIONS COME BACK TO US IN MORE DETAIL IN SEPTEMBER, IF THERE IS A CLEAR ANSWER TO THAT QUESTION. AND ONE OF THE REASONS FOR THAT IS THAT WAYFINDING WAS ALSO ONE OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND WAS SEEN AS A PIECE OF LOW-HANGING FRUIT THAT HAD NO DEPENDENCIES, BUT IT SEEMED LIKE FROM THE WAYFINDING STUDY, THERE WERE HIGHER LEVELS OF BENEFIT THAT DID HAVE DEPENDENCIES, AND SO I CLEAR ANSWER TO THAT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL IN TERMS OF FIGURING OUT WHAT TO DO THERE. SO, IF THAT WOULD BE POSSIBLE, THAT IT WOULD BE REALLY WELCOME. ANOTHER THOUGHT IN HERE, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ESPECIALLY IN TERMS OF THE OPTION FOUR IS, YOU KNOW, SOME OF -- LIKE, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT THIS STUDY IS NOT GOING TO GET TO YET IS PRICING LEVELS. AND BUT KNOW, ONE OF THE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS THAT GETS MADE IS ABOUT WANTING TO REDUCE OR EVEN ZERO OUT THE COST OF LOCAL TRIPS AND THERE IS ALL KINDS OF QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT, THE RELATIVE BENEFIT OF THAT TO RIDERSHIP COMPARED TO THE BENEFIT OF INCREASING SERVICE FREQUENCY, THAT IS KIND OF A CONTESTED QUESTION. HOWEVER, IF IT DID TURN OUT TO BE BENEFICIAL, AND THEN THERE WAS SOME KIND OF A, HEY, LET'S, YOU KNOW, SET LOCAL BUS AND ZONE ONE ON REGIONAL TRANSIT TO $1. I'M, YOU KNOW, AS A RANDOM SELECTION, THAT THAT COULD BE A PIECE OF AN OVERALL PUZZLE IF THERE WAS, LIKE I AT THE TIME THAT FARES ARE BEING LOOKED AT, THAT I THINK THAT IS A QUESTION THAT MIGHT BE WORTH ASKING. AND TWO MORE COMMENTS. ONE IS THAT, IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT THE WAY THAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE BEING PRESENTED, THIS IS -- THERE IS A LOT OF NUANCE HERE ABOUT THE IMPLEMENTATION AND HOW EASY IT IS, AND THE FEASIBILITY OF IMPLEMENTATIONS, WHICH, AS THE PRIMARY DECISION-MAKERS HERE, THE AGENCIES AND THE GENERAL MANAGERS IS IN NEED RELEVANT TO CONSIDER. I TOOK THE STAFF REPORT THAT CAME OUT OVER THE WEEKEND AND WAS WORKING ON EXPLAINING IT TO MORE TRANSIT RIDERS AND TRANSIT ADVOCATES AND THE WAY THE SLIDES ARE DONE ARE NOT VERY USER FRIENDLY FOCUSED IT KIND OF TAKES EXPLAINING AND SIMPLIFYING IT TO EXPLAIN TO A GROUP OF TRANSIT USERS AND I'M WONDERING THAT BY THE TIME

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THINGS COME BACK AROUND IN THE MONTHS AHEAD TO THE GENERAL MANAGERS WHETHER IT WOULD BE POSSIBLE TO HAVE AT LEAST A PIECE R PIECE OF THE PRESENTATION THAT'S SUFFICIENTLY USER FRIENDLY THAT COULD BE CIRCULATED TO MAKE SENSE TO PEOPLE TO INTUITIVELY UNDERSTAND AND WEIGH IN, WHEN IT COMES TO THE TRANSIT BOARDS FOR SOMEONE TO BE ABLE TO LOOK AT THE REPORT AND SAY HERE IS A THING I -- AND WANT TO TELL THE BOARD THEY SHOULD BE ABLE TO FIGURE THAT OUT AND MAKE THAT COMMENT WHICH RIGHT NOW IS NOT IN A STATE THAT'S EASY TO DO. AND IN TERMS OF THE LAST SLIDE ABOUT HOW MUCH PEOPLE DO TRANSFERRING I THINK THAT HAS A LITTLE BIT OF AN ELEMENT OF HOW MANY PEOPLE SWIM THE RIVER BEFORE I BUILD A BRIDGE. AND THERE IS, IN THE REPRESENTATIVE COUPLE OF MONTHS, I HAVE TALK TO SOME PEOPLE AT LUNA, THERE IS A GROUP IN EAST SAN JOSE THAT'S DOING TRANSIT ADVOCACY WITH A LARGELY LATINO POPULATION A GROUP IN BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT, A BUNCH OF STUDENT GROUPS, AND THE PEOPLE THEY WAS TALKING TO THEIR FOLKS LARGELY USE LOCAL TRANSIT AND DON'T DO LOTS OF TRANSFERS AND ALSO HAVE A DESIRE FOR MORE MOBILITY THAN THEY CURRENTLY HAVE ACCESS TO. SO I WOULD CAUTION US FROM LOOKING AT THE AMOUNT OF TRANSFERRING THAT WE'RE SEEING AS A REFLECTION OF WHAT PEOPLE WANT, VERSUS WHAT THE SYSTEM AFFORDS, AND HOPEFULLY THE USER RESEARCH WILL SHED A LOT OF LIGHT ON TO THAT QUESTION. AND I THINK THAT IS WHAT I HAD TO SAY. DO WE HAVE ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PANEL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BEFORE WE GO TO THE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC? I AM NOT SEEING ANY. SO, I SEE THAT ROLAND HAS A HAND. ROLAND?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ROLAND, I CAN'T HEAR YOU.

SPEAKER: YES, I KNOW.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO REALLY SAY A HUGE THANK YOU TO BILL, MIKE, AND THE MTC STAFF FOR THE EXTRAORDINARILY AND RESPONSIBLE APPROACH THEY ARE TAKING ADDRESSING THESE COMPLEX ISSUES. I REALLY BELIEVE THAT WE'RE IN GOOD HANDS HERE. THE ONLY QUESTION I HAVE THROUGH THE CHAIR, THOUGH, IS WHETHER WE ARE LOOKING AFTER INTEGRATION, INCLUDING CLIPPER, FOR [INDISCERNIBLE] AND CAPITAL CORRIDOR, AND IF NOT, WHY NOT? A COMMENT IS, IN LONDON, I CAN USE MY CARD WHICH IS SAME AS CLIPPER TO GET ON TO HIGH SPEED RAIL TO MAKE TRIPS WITHIN THE ZONE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHY WE CANNOT DO THE SAME THING WITHIN THE BAY AREA.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANKS. AND I'M GOING TO TOSS IN ONE MORE THING FOR STAFF BEFORE ADDRESSING THAT QUESTION. AND I WANT TO PICK UP ON SOMETHING THAT ANNE OLIVIA HAD SAID EARLIER IN TERMS -- AND A COUPLE OF OTHERS, IN TERMS OF THE FLATNESS IF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE HAD SOMETHING AT ZONE BASED OR DISTANCED BASED. THERE IS TWO DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS, ONE IS, DO YOU HAVE A COMPLETE FLAT FARE WHICH I THINK IS NOT BEING LOOKED AT, OR DO YOU HAVE A SLOPE OF THE CURVE, AND THE OTHER IT'S A DIFFERENT QUESTION, HOW MUCH SHOULD THAT SLOPE BE AND WHEN FARE LEVELS ARE LOOKED AT, IS THERE AN EQUITABILITY AND DIMENSION TO FLAT THE SLOPE. AND IN TERMS OF THE QUESTION OF THE OTHER AGENCIES I WOULD HAVE TO COMMENT IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT INTERNATIONAL AGENCIES PRACTICES, WHEN REGIONS GET TO A COORDINATED INTEGRATED STATE WHAT OFTEN HAPPENS IS THEY START A CERTAIN TYPE OF GEOGRAPHY AND CERTAIN SCOPE AND EXPAND IF THERE'S SOMETHING THAT WE'RE NOT DOING INITIALLY, YOU KNOW, MAYBE THERE WOULD BE FOLLOWING STIPULATES TO CONSIDER A BROADER GEOGRAPHICAL SCOPE AND MAYBE STAFF HAS THOUGHTS ON THAT.

WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND COMMITMENT TO THIS PROJECT. TO ADDRESS THE GOOD QUESTION ABOUT THE CONCLUSION OF CAPITAL CORRIDOR AND ACE AND INTER-REGIONAL SERVICES, THE SHORT ANSWER TO THE QUESTION IS THEY'RE NOT INCLUDED IN OUR SCOPE OF WORK, AND I THINK ADINA'S POINT ABOUT MAKING PROGRESS WITHIN OUR REGION AND TRYING TO EXPAND OUTWARD TO INCLUDE SERVICES THAT ARE NOT WITHIN OUR SCOPE IS PROBABLY THE APPROACH WE'RE TAKING. I CAN'T SPEAK TO ALL OF THE HISTORIC REASONS WHERE CAPITAL CORRIDOR, FOR EXAMPLE, IS NOT INCLUDED WITHIN THE, SORT OF, BAY AREA AND FARE STRUCTURE, FARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STRUCTURE MORE GENERALLY AND WHY HISTORICALLY IT'S BEEN TREATED AS AN INTERCITY RAIL SERVICE AND HISTORY WITH AMTRAK AND CALTRANS MANAGING THAT SERVICE. MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT CAPITAL CORRIDOR IS MOVING TO CHANGE SOME OF THEIR FARE POLICIES, AND FARE COLLECTION EQUIPMENT, AND IS WORKING WITH THE CALIFORNIA INTEGRATED TRAVEL PROJECT WHICH IS A CALTRANS PROGRAM. I THINK THE MOVES THAT SOME OF THE -- THOSE INTER-REGIONAL AGENCIES ARE MAKING ON THEIR OWN OR THROUGH STATEWIDE EFFORTS WOULD MAKE IT A LOT EASIER TO INCORPORATE THEM INTO WHEREVER THE BAY AREA ENDS UP GOING, HOPEFUL E AS A RESULT OF THIS WORK. SO THAT'S NOT A VERY SATISFYING ANSWER, I THINK, BUT THAT'S KIND OF THE SITUATION WHERE WE FIND OURSELVES. SO I THINK OUR FIRST FOCUS HERE IS TRYING TO MAKE PROGRESS WITH THE 27 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN OUR SCOPE HERE WHICH IS PROOF BY VACCINE BUT IT'S BY NO MEANS WHAT STAFF IS LIMITED TO. WE'RE AWARE OF BROADER ISSUES. THANK YOU VERY EVERYONE'S HELPFUL INPUT. IT'S APPRECIATED.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: AND THANKS TO STAFF FOR ADDRESSING THIS PROBLEM AND STARTING TO COME UP WITH REALLY GOOD RECOMMENDATIONS THAT HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO BE REALLY BENEFICIAL. THANKS SO MUCH TO STAFF FOR MOVING THIS FORWARD AND LOOKING FORWARD TO THE NEXT STEP HERE. AND, LET'S SEE, I THINK WITH THAT, THERE IS ANOTHER ELEMENT IN HERE IN THIS AGENDA, WHICH IS FIVE NEW BUSINESS MEMBERS MAY BRING UP NEW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO A FUTURE AGENDA. IS THERE ANYTHING WE HAVE IN TERMS OF NEW BUSINESS? I AM NOT SEEING ANY HANDS. AND I AM NOT SEEING ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON NEW BUSINESS. SO, OKAY. SO NOW, AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX IS GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT ON OTHER BUSINESS. AND FOR THE CLERK TO READ THE NAMES OR ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED BY 5:00 YESTERDAY, AND ANY GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS THAT ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ROLAND GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: I WANT TO TOUCH A LITTLE BIT ABOUT VARIOUS DISCUSSIONS ABOUT FARE BOX RECOVERY. THERE ARE TWO ELEMENT IN FARE BOX RECOVERY FIRST OF ALL IS REVENUES, IN WHICH THIS CASE ARE DRIVEN, BY THE RIDERSHIP, SO IF WE HAVE GOT HIGH RIDERSHIP YOUR FARE BOX RECOVERY GOING TO IMPROVE. BUT IT'S ALSO DRIVEN BY EXPENDITURES. AND IF YOUR EXPENDITURES RUNNING YOUR TRANSIT SYSTEM ARE BASICALLY OUT OF CONTROL, IT DOESN'T MATTER HOW MUCH RIDERSHIP YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE, THE FARE BOX RECOVERY IS NOT GOING TO BE VERY GOOD. I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE, ONCE AGAIN, THIS IS LONDON BECAUSE IT'S WHERE I COME FROM, AND THE ENTIRE LONDON BUS NETWORK IS PRECOVID AT FARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BOX RECOVERY OF 60 -- 6-0 PERCENT AND YOU HAVE TO WONDER HOW IS THAT POSSIBLE THERE ARE 15 COMPANIES AND THEY'RE OWN PRIVATE COMPANIES THAT RUN THE LONDON BUS SYSTEM ON BEHALF OF TRANSPORT FOR LONDON AND THE FACT IS THESE 15 COMPANIES ARE MORE EFFICIENT ABOUT HOW THEY OPERATE MAINTAIN AND MANAGE THEIR INDIVIDUAL PARTS OF THE TRANSPORT SYSTEM AND WE HAVE GOT TO START LOOKING AT THIS IN THE BAY AREA. AND THIS IS HOW WE'RE GOING GET HIGH FARE BOX RECOVERY AND WE'RE GOING TO HAVE LITERALLY HUNDREDS OF MILLION, IF NOT BILLIONS OF DOLLARS THAT ARE GOING TO BECOME AVAILABLE TO START, YOU KNOW, EXPANDING OUR NETWORK, WORKING ON NEW CAPITAL PROJECTS, ET CETERA. THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. AND I'M NOT SEEING ANY OTHER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS. SO, WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO ADJOURN TO THE NEXT MEETING WHICH IS GOING TO BE FRIDAY SEPTEMBER 10TH AT 2:00 IN THE AFTERNOON BY WEBCAST. AND THANKS TO EVERYBODY FOR ALL OF THE REALLY GREAT RICH INFORMATION AND GREAT COMMENTS TODAY. GOOD AFTERNOON. BYE.
[ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NTT

Broadcasting Government