METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript





1	FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
2	MONDAY, 1:05 P.M., APRIL 19, 2021
3	
4	MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYBODY I'M MIKE HURSH
5	WITH FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IT'S MY PLEASURE TO CALL THE
6	MEETING OF APRIL 19TH TO ORDER. BROADCAST TEAM, CAN WE ROLL
7	THE VIDEO ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
8	ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
9	AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S
10	EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF
11	THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
12	SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS,
13	STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK
14	CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR
15	REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH
16	THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE
17	VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
18	PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED
19	HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
20	THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL
21	BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.
22	IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
23	ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.
24	WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY
25	5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND



ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF 1 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, 2 3 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT 4 5 THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. 6 7 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MADAM SECRETARY CAN 8 YOU CALL THE ROLL. 9 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WILL DO. CHAIR HURSH? 10 11 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: PRESENT. 12 13 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR MULLIGAN? I SEE 14 YOU. THANK YOU. MEMBER HALLS? 15 16 DARYL HALLS: HERE. 17 18 19 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. MEMBER KRANDA? 20 21 BETH KRANDA: HERE. 22 23 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MEMBER MAU? 24

25

SPEAKER: HERE.





I	
2	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MCMILLAN?
3	
4	THERESE MCMILLAN: HERE.
5	
6	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: POWERS?
7	
8	ROBERT POWERS: HERE.
9	
10	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MEMBER RAMACIER?
11	
12	RICK RAMACIER: HERE.
13	
14	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MEMBER TRAN.
15	
16	SPEAKER: FRANKLIN WONG ATTENDING FOR MEMBER TRAN.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MEMBER TREE?
19	
20	SPEAKER: [INDISCERNIBLE] ATTENDING FOR MICHAEL TREE.
21	
22	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. MEMBER TUMLIN?
23	
24	SPEAKER: MONIQUE WEBSTER FOR JEFF TUMLIN.





1 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WE HAVE A QUORUM.

2

- 3 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME CARTER MAU. WE
- 4 WISH JIM HARTNETT THE GREATEST SUCCESS ON THE NEXT CHAPTER OF
- 5 HIS LIFE. THANK YOU, JIM, FOR GIVING ME CHAIR OF THE
- 6 COMMISSION. CARTER WELCOME TO THIS VERY IMPORTANT TASK FORCE.
- 7 WE HAVE A VERY IMPORTANT STUDY AND LOOK FORWARD TO THE
- 8 INFORMATION TO BE PRESENTED HERE TODAY. WITH THAT I MOVE TO
- 9 THE CONSENT CALENDAR DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE
- 10 THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

11

12 RICK RAMACIER: MOVE.

13

- 14 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: MOVED BY RAMACIER? SECOND. I DIDN'T
- 15 CATCH THAT?

16

17 KATE MILLER: KATE.

18

- 19 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: MOVED BY RAMACIER AND SECOND BY KATE.
- 20 MADAM CLERK DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATE WITH THIS
- 21 ITEM?

- 23 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 25 ON THIS ITEM.





1 2 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: WITH THAT PLEASE CALL THE ROLL. 3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. 4 5 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU EVERYONE THAT MOVES US TO 6 7 AGENDA ITEM 4A POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND 8 INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND COMMITTEE REPORT. MADAM CLERK DO 9 10 WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. 11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 12 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 13 14 ON THIS ITEM. 15 16 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: ADINA? 17 ADINA LEVIN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANTED TO GIVE A BRIEF 18 19 UPDATE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION 20 21 SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION AND ALSO A QUICK 22 UPDATE FROM LAST WEEK'S POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING DISCUSSION AS IT RELATES TO THE OBJECTIVE OF THIS BODY AND 23 THIS COMMITTEE. SO, THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION 24

SUBCOMMITTEE MET AND GAVE -- GOT A REALLY ROBUST PRESENTATION





- 1 FROM STAFF ON THE USER RESEARCH, WENT THROUGH A VALUE
- 2 SOLICITATION EXERCISE TO ELICIT VALUES RELATING TO IMPORTANT
- 3 DECISIONS ABOUT COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION TO PROVIDE
- 4 FEEDBACK ON THEIR POLICY OPTIONS I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT KEY
- 5 PIECES OF FEEDBACK THAT CAME FROM THAT BODY SUBCOMMITTEE
- 6 MEMBERS -- IMPORTANCE OF CAPTURING VOICES FROM THE POPULATION
- 7 AND RESEARCH ACTIVITIES SUPPORTING THE PROJECT TEAM'S EFFORT
- 8 TO REWEIGH SURVEY DATA TO EMPHASIZE VOICES IN THE COMMUNITIES
- 9 OF CONCERN AND WILLINGNESS TO PARTICIPATE AND REACH OUT TO
- 10 COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE RELATIONSHIPS TO BRING THOSE USER
- 11 RESEARCH ACTIVITIES IN TERMS OF VALUE SOLICITATION BALANCE
- 12 SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS HAD A HIGH VALUE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] COST
- 13 RECOVERY FOR OPERATORS AND STRUCTURAL EQUITY OVER PROGRAMMATIC
- 14 EQUITY AND THERE WAS A MIX OF KNOWLEDGE BASE PRICES VERSUS
- 15 [INDISCERNIBLE] WHILE THERE IS VERY ENGAGED DISCUSSION ON THIS
- 16 TOPIC, WE ALSO FELT LIKE THE FRAMING WAS FAIRLY ABSTRACT AND
- 17 WE'RE REALLY EAGER TO MOVE ON TO THE NEXT PHASE WHICH WAS TO
- 18 GET FEEDBACK ON MORE CONCRETE FARE POLICY OPTIONS AND SO THAT
- 19 IS WHAT WE WILL BE DOING AT OUR NEXT MEETING, WHICH IS TO
- 20 RECONVENE WHEN THERE ARE OPTIONS THAT ARE FURTHER REFINED AND
- 21 ALSO TO MEET FREQUENTLY EVERY MONTH AS THE STUDY NEARS
- 22 COMPLETION TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE PROVIDING ROBUST FEEDBACK
- 23 ON THE OPTIONS AS THEY ARE COMING FORWARD. THE OTHER ITEM
- 24 THAT I WOULD LIKE TO REPORT IS THAT THE POLICY ADVISORY
- 25 COUNCIL, WHICH IS THE OVERARCHING BODY THAT DOES FARE



- 1 COORDINATION SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS UP TO DECIDED AT ITS MEETING
- 2 LAST WEEK TO VOTE TO ENDORSE A.B. 629, WHICH IS A BILL COMING
- 3 FORWARD FROM ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHU WHICH HAS A VARIETY OF
- 4 FEATURES REGARDING SEAMLESS RESILIENT TRANSIT 1 OF WHICH
- 5 RELATES TO THE TOPIC OF THIS STUDY IN THAT IT WOULD REQUIRE
- 6 MTC TO CREATE A PILOT PROGRAM BY JULY 1ST, 2023 TO IMPLEMENT A
- 7 PASS AMONG MULTIPLE OPERATORS, THAT IS AN ACCUMULATOR PATH
- 8 THAT OTHER PROVISIONS OF THAT BILL SUPPORT INITIATIVES ON
- 9 REGIONAL MAPPING AND WAYFINDING REALTIME TRANSIT PRIORITY
- 10 TRANSIT NETWORK AND OTHERS AND THESE FEATURES OF INTEGRATED
- 11 TRANSIT REALLY WAS SOMETHING THAT THERE WAS A LOT OF
- 12 ENTHUSIASM AMONGST POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS AND
- 13 THEREFORE PEOPLE DECIDED THAT THEY WANTED TO TAKE THAT VOTE
- 14 AND DO THAT ENDORSEMENT FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. AND
- 15 I WILL BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS, AND THAT CONCLUDES MY
- 16 REPORT.
- 17
- 18 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU ADINA WE CERTAINLY APPRECIATE
- 19 THE HARD WORK OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE. ARE THERE ANY TASK FORCE
- 20 MEMBERS WITH QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE ANY HAND
- 21 RAISED. AGAIN, ADINA THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING MOVE US TO
- 22 ITEM 5A STUDY PROGRESSES AND OPTIONS PREVIEW. THIS IS AN
- 23 INFORMATION ONLY ITEM. BEFORE WE GET TO THAT, MADAM CLERK ARE
- 24 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?





- 1 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 3 ON THIS ITEM.

- 5 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BILL, MIKE, GO
- 6 AHEAD.

- 8 WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU CHAIR HURSH IF WE CAN GO AHEAD AND
- 9 BRING THE SLIDES UP. THANKS. GOOD AFTERNOON TASK FORCE MEMBERS
- 10 MY NAME IS BILL BACON WITH MTC STAFF FARE COORDINATION
- 11 COORDINATOR FOR THE INTEGRATION STUDY I'M JOINED BY MIKE
- 12 EISEMAN MY PROJECT MANAGER THANKS TO ALL TASK FORCE MEMBERS
- 13 AND CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR FOR YOUR SUPPORT ON THIS PROJECT.
- 14 TODAY'S WILL PREVIEW 6 OPTION FRAMEWORKS AND KEY DETAILS AND
- 15 CONSIDERATIONS THAT THE STUDY IS CONSIDERING IN OUR
- 16 EVALUATION. WE ALSO WANT TO PROVIDE THE TASK FORCE AN UPDATE
- 17 ON SOME OTHER WORK THAT IS ONGOING AND ROADMAP TO CONCLUDING
- 18 THE STUDY THIS SUMMER. NEXT SLIDE. THE FOLLOWING SECTION
- 19 WE'RE GOING TO ORIENT YOU ALL ABOUT WHERE WE ARE IN THE
- 20 PROJECT AND HOW THE WORK UNDERWAY SETS US UP TO DELIVER OUR
- 21 DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS AND IMPORTANT
- 22 THINGS WE WANT THE TASK FORCE TO CONSIDER IN THE NEXT COUPLE
- 23 OF MONTHS AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. EARLIER THIS YEAR THE PROJECT
- 24 TEAM DEVELOPED 6 HIGH LEVEL FARE STRUCTURE FRAMEWORKS THAT
- 25 COULD BE REALISTICALLY IMPLEMENTED WITHIN MANAGEMENT





- 1 STRUCTURES OF VARYING LEVELS OF MORE CENTRALIZED OR
- 2 DECENTRALIZED DECISION MAKING. SINCE THE TASK FORCE LAST MET
- 3 IN FEBRUARY THE PROJECT TEAM AND STAFF WORKING GROUP HAVE BEEN
- 4 FOCUSED ON DEVELOPING THE DETAILS OF DIFFERENT VARIANTS TO
- 5 MODEL AND TEST. THESE DETAILS ARE PRICE OF INDIVIDUAL FARE CAP
- 6 OR PASS DIDN'T WAYS TO DRAW ZONES ON THE MAP FOR A ZONE BASED
- 7 SYSTEM, AND WHICH DIFFERENT TRANSIT OPERATORS MIGHT BE
- 8 INCLUDED IN THE CAP AND PASS. IN A COUPLE OF WEEKS WE'LL MOVE
- 9 INTO THE MODELING PHASE OF DIFFERENT OPTIONS AND DETAILED
- 10 VARIANCE WHICH WILL LOOK AT POSSIBLE IMPACTS TO RIDERSHIP AND
- 11 DEMAND AS WELL AS FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS OF POSSIBLE CHANGES
- 12 TO FARE POLICY. ALL OF THIS WILL FEED INTO OUR BUSINESS CASE
- 13 EVALUATION AND OUR DRAFT REPORT FOR YOU TO CONSIDER THIS
- 14 SUMMER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. USE AS MENTIONED ON THE PREVIOUS
- 15 SLIDE THE STAFF WORKING GROUP HAS BEEN FOCUSED ON DEVELOPING
- 16 DETAILED VERSIONS OF THE FRAMEWORKS AND VARIANTS AND
- 17 DEVELOPING COLLABORATION BETWEEN THE CONSULTING TEAM AND
- 18 PROJECT MANAGEMENT AND STAFF WORKING GROUP. WE HAVE DONE THIS
- 19 THROUGH A SERIES OF WORKSHOPS FOCUSED ON DETAIL OF SERVICE
- 20 CATEGORIES DEFINING REGIONAL AND LOCAL SERVICE WHAT ZONES
- 21 COULD LOOK LIKE IF WE HAD A ZONE BASED SYSTEM HOW PASSES OR
- 22 FARE ACCUMULATORS WOULD WORK IN THE BAY AREA AND HOW DIFFERENT
- 23 GROUPS OF OPERATORS IN DIFFERENT SUBREGIONS WITHIN THE BAY
- 24 AREA COULD BE GROUPED TOGETHER TO OFFER COMPELLING PRODUCTS
- 25 FOR AGENCIES. WE'RE HOSTING A WORKSHOP NEXT WEEK WITH THE





- 1 STAFF WORKING GROUP WITH DETAILED OPTIONS AND VARIANTS THAT WE
- 2 HAVE BEEN WORKING ON OVER THE LAST 6 WEEKS AND ONCE WE HAVE
- 3 FEEDBACK FROM THE STAFF WORKING GROUP THOSE OPTIONS WILL BEGIN
- 4 TO GO INTO OUR MODELING AND ANALYSIS PROCESS. I'M GOING TO GO
- 5 AHEAD AND NOW TURN IT OVER TO MIKE EISEMAN FROM BART WHO WILL
- 6 GIVE A PREVIEW OF COORDINATION AND FARE INTEGRATION OPTIONS
- 7 THE PROJECT WILL BE ANALYZING. NEXT SLIDE.

- 9 MICHAEL EISEMAN: THANKS A LOT BILL. GOOD AFTERNOON TASK FORCE,
- 10 MIKE EISEMAN FROM BART. IN THIS SECTION I'LL GIVE A PREVIEW OF
- 11 FARE STRUCTURE OPTION VARIANTS THAT WE'RE WORKING ON THAT BILL
- 12 DESCRIBED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE GRAPHICS ON THIS SLIDE
- 13 SHOULD LOOK FAMILIAR WE REVIEWED THEM IN PRIOR MEETINGS. ON
- 14 THE LEFT SIDE OF THE SLIDE, YOU CAN SEE THE 6 FARE STRUCTURE
- 15 OPTIONS THAT WE REVIEWED IN MARCH. THAT WE'RE NOW DEVELOPING.
- 16 I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT WE HAVE RENUMBERS OF THE OPTIONS SO
- 17 THEY'RE NOW LISTED IN ORDER OF DEGREE OF CHANGER IN THE FARE
- 18 RULES LEAST AT THE TOP MOST CHANGE AT THE BOTTOM OF THE LIST.
- 19 OPTIONS 1 AND 2 IMPLEMENT FARE DISCOUNTS ONLY. PASSES AND CAPS
- 20 ALSO KNOWN AS ACCUMULATORS OPTION 1, AND DISCOUNTED FARES JUST
- 21 MEANS REDUCING CHARGES FOR TRANSFERRING BETWEEN AGENCIES,
- 22 THAT'S OPTION 2. OPTION 3 INCLUDES DISCOUNTS FOR INTER-AGENCY
- 23 TRANSFERS BUT IMPLEMENTS USING AGENCY GROUPINGS AT A
- 24 SUBREGIONAL LEVEL. WE HAVE 2 VERSIONS OF THAT APPROACH THAT
- 25 WE'LL DISCUSS IN A MOMENT. OPTIONS 4 THROUGH 6 ALL ENVISION





- 1 BRINGING THE WHOLE REGION UNDER 1 FARE STRUCTURE AND OPTION 4
- 2 REGIONAL OR LONGER DISTANCE SERVICES WILL ALL SHARE A SINGLE
- 3 FARE BY DISTANCE STRUCTURE WHILE ALL LOCAL SERVICES WOULD ALL
- 4 USE A SINGLE FLAT FARE. OPTIONS 5 AND 6 ARE VARIATIONS OF
- 5 SHARED REGIONAL ZONE SYSTEM. 1 OF THE REASONS WE HAVE
- 6 REORDERED THEM IN THIS WAY IS TO EMPHASIZE THERE IS
- 7 POSSIBILITY OF IMPLEMENTING 1 OR MORE OF THE DISCOUNT OPTIONS
- 8 IN THE NEAR-TERM. FOR EXAMPLE, IN COMBINATION WITH CLIPPER 2
- 9 ACCOUNT-BASED ROLL OUT AND POTENTIALLY MOVING TOWARD 1 OF THE
- 10 FULLY INTEGRATED OPTIONS OVER TIME SHOULD REGION GOALS AND
- 11 SHOWING OPTIONS ALIGN WITH THE POTENTIAL MANAGEMENT PATHWAYS.
- 12 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR SOME OF THE OPTIONS WE NEED TO
- 13 DIFFERENTIATE BETWEEN DIFFERENT CATEGORIES OF SERVICE IN THIS
- 14 TABLE WE LAY OUT SERVICE FRAMEWORK LIST IN THE LEFT COLUMN,
- 15 ROUTE CATEGORIES DEFINED BY OUR COLLEAGUES ON THE PLANNING AND
- 16 OPERATION SUBCOMMITTEE TRANSIT OPERATOR CAUCUS FOR THE
- 17 PURPOSES OF THIS WORK WE HAVE GROUPED THE 7 CATEGORIES INTO 3.
- 18 INTERCITY ROUTES LABELED IN GRAY SUCH AS CAPITAL CORRIDOR ANDS
- 19 A BEYOND OUR SCOPE OF STUDY BUT CATEGORIES SHOWING IN BLUE
- 20 INTER-REGIONAL INCLUDING RAIL FERRY SOME LONG DISTANCE BUS
- 21 ROUTES COMMUTER EXPRESS BUS SERVICES ALL OFFERING SERVICES OR
- 22 LONG DISTANCES AND CURRENTLY USE FARE BY DISTANCE BASED FARES
- 23 AND PREMIUM FLAT FARE COMPARED TO SHORTER ROUTES. ORANGE
- 24 CATEGORIES IDENTIFYING ALL THOSE LOCAL SERVICES INCLUDING BUS
- 25 LIGHT RAIL SERVICES GENERALLY TODAY THOSE ARE ALL OFFERED AT A





- 1 LOW FLAT FARE. I'LL TOUCH BRIEFLY ON EACH OF THE FARE
- 2 STRUCTURE OPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OPTION 1 IS PASSES AND
- 3 CAPS, AND WE ARE TESTING A RANGE OF REGIONAL PASS AND CAP
- 4 PRODUCTS THAT COULD BE OVERLAID ON THE EXISTING FARE
- 5 STRUCTURE. THESE BREAK DOWN INTO 2 PRIMARY CONCEPTS SHOWN HERE
- 6 IN THE FIRST 2, ORANGE AND BLACK PASS OFFERS UP FRONT PRICE AS
- 7 MOST LOCAL BUS AGENCIES DO WE ARE TESTING A REGIONAL ONE PRICE
- 8 PASS PRODUCT WITH RANGE OF PRICE LEVELS. ONE MAJOR CHALLENGE
- 9 FOR THIS TRADITIONAL PASS OFFERING THAT BY REQUIRING AMOUNT UP
- 10 FRONT PAY, IT DOES EXCLUDER RIDERS WHO CANNOT AFFORD TO PAY UP
- 11 FRONT. FARE CAP ALSO CALLED AN ACCUMULATOR DOES NOT REQUIRE
- 12 ANYTHING UP FRONT RATER PAID BY TRIP UNTIL YOU GET TO A
- 13 THRESHOLD OF FARE VALUE, AFTER WHICH FURTHER TRAVEL IS FREE OF
- 14 CHARGE. AGAIN, WE ARE TESTING REGIONAL ONE1 PRICE ACCUMULATOR
- 15 PRODUCTS AT A RANGE OF THRESHOLDS. AT THE BOTTOM HALF OF THE
- 16 SLIDE WE'RE TESTING 2 IMPORTANT VARIATIONS ON THESE PRIMARY
- 17 CONCEPTS FIRST IS TIERED PRICING RIDERS COULD BE OFFERED
- 18 PASSES ON A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT PRICE TIERS COVERING DIFFERENT
- 19 DISTANCES AND AMOUNTS FOR SERVICES AND STUDY GOALS INCLUDE
- 20 REVENUE AND EQUITY THAT'S BECAUSE CURRENTLY DIFFERENT SUBSETS
- 21 OF RIDERS HAVE DIFFERENT PRICE POINTS IF YOU JUST COMPARE
- 22 MONTHLY PRICE TODAY FOR A TYPICAL LONG DISTANCE COMMUTER WITH
- 23 A TYPICAL LOCAL BUS RIDER YOU GET A SENSE OF COMPLEXITY THERE.
- 24 WE'RE TESTING PASSES FOR EMPLOYERS OR INSTITUTIONS SO
- 25 UNIVERSAL TRANSIT PASSES OR ECO PASSES SIMILAR TO PRODUCTS





- 1 OFFERED TODAY BY CALTRAIN AND SMART WOULD OFFER INSTITUTIONS
- 2 OR EMPLOYERS A DISCOUNT FOR PURCHASING PASSES FOR ALL
- 3 EMPLOYEES, STUDENTS OR STAFF. THIS STRATEGY CAN OFFER
- 4 PREDICTABLE REVENUE FOR AGENCIES WHILE PROVIDING EMPLOYEES AN
- 5 INCENTIVE TO USE TRANSIT MORE OFTEN FOR THEIR COMMUTE WHICH
- 6 MAY -- COULD BE AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE COVID RECOVERY
- 7 STRATEGY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO OPTION 2, AS DISCOUNTED
- 8 DOUBLE FARES SIMPLY REDUCING OR ELIMINATING THE PRICE PREMIUM
- 9 CURRENTLY CHARGED FOR TRANSFERRING BETWEEN AGENCIES REDUCING
- 10 MOST BASIC FARE BARRIERS TO USE MULTIPLE SYSTEMS WITHOUT THE
- 11 GOVERNMENT'S INSTITUTIONAL BARRIERS PHASE BY BROADER TRANSFORM
- 12 TRANSPORTATION, AND THE SELECTING AGENCY PAIRS ON THE RIGHT
- 13 AGENCIES WITH HIGH LEVEL OR CURRENT POTENTIAL FOR DEMAND OR
- 14 OFFER BETTER OPTION FOR RIDERS CURRENTLY MAKING CERTAIN SINGLE
- 15 OPERATOR TRIPS. NEXT SLIDE. OPTION 3 WE'RE LOOKING AT
- 16 NEIGHBORING AND CONNECTING AGENCY INTEGRATION WE HAVE 2
- 17 VERSIONS OF THIS OPTION FIRST HERE IS 3A AND IT'S REALLY A
- 18 BROAD IMPLEMENTATION OF DISCOUNTS DOUBLE FARES BUT 1 IN WHICH
- 19 WE'RE LOOKING TO DIVIDE THE REGION INTO SUBREGIONS THAT OFFER
- 20 CONSISTENT DISCOUNTS BETWEEN ALL OF THE OPERATOR IN THAT
- 21 SUBREGION. TO CLARIFY THAT, JUST LOOK ON THE NEXT SLIDE,
- 22 PLEASE. SO THIS MAP HERE SHOWS POTENTIAL SUBREGIONS,
- 23 BOUNDARIES HERE ARE STILL IN DEVELOPMENT AND ACTUALLY YOU MAY
- 24 NOTICE THAT WE SWAPPED A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT ZONE BOUNDARIES
- 25 FROM THE 1 THAT WAS IN YOUR ORIGINAL PACKET HERE. THIS IS





- 1 STILL A WORK IN PROGRESS. BUT WE'RE SHOWING HERE SUBREGIONS
- 2 WHERE 75 TO 80% OF THE TRIPS BY ALL MODES THAT HAVE AN ORIGIN
- 3 IN THAT COMMUNITY ALSO HAVE A DESTINATION THERE. THAT'S HOW
- 4 THESE ZONE BOUNDARIES ARE DEFINED. IN OPTION 3A INTER-AGENCY
- 5 TRANSFERS IN THE GRAY EAST BAY SUBREGION FOR EXAMPLE, WOULD
- 6 ALL HAVE CONSISTENT DISCOUNTS. AND THEY WOULDN'T HAVE TO BE
- 7 THE SAME DISCOUNTS OFFERED BETWEEN GREEN OR ORANGE NORTH FACE
- 8 SUBREGIONS AND ALSO SUBREGION MIGHT ALSO HAVE CONSISTENT LOCAL
- 9 FARES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO OUR NEXT 2 OPTIONS APPLY A
- 10 CONSISTENT FARE BY DISTANCE STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES.
- 11 TODAY BART CALTRAIN GOLDEN GATE WETA AND SMART EACH HAVE HIS
- 12 OWN AGENCY SPECIFIC FARE BY DISTANCE STRUCTURE THIS GRAPH
- 13 LISTS PRINCIPLES OUR TEAM IS USING AS WE SEE FIT TO FIND A
- 14 REGIONAL FARE BY DISTANCE MODEL SIMILAR TO GENERATING REVENUE
- 15 THAT WHAT WE GET TODAY WE NEED TO AVOID DISPROPORTIONAL IMPACT
- 16 ON LOW INCOME RIDERS. FIRST APPLICATION OF FARE BY DISTANCE IS
- 17 OPTION 3B YOU WILL RECALL FROM A MOMENT AGO OPTION 3A
- 18 CONSISTENT DISCOUNTS ARE APPLIED BETWEEN LOCAL AGENCIES WITHIN
- 19 SUBREGIONS. SO THIS OPTION WOULD SIMPLY LAYER ON TOP OF THAT
- 20 LOCAL FRAMEWORK A CONSISTENT FARE BY DISTANCE STRUCTURE FOR
- 21 ALL REGION SERVICES. THE STRUCTURE WE'RE GOING TO TEST WITH A
- 22 RANGE OF PRICE CURVES AS WELL AS SUBREGIONAL PRICE DISCOUNTS
- 23 AS IN 3A. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO OPTION 4 IS VERY SIMILAR TO
- 24 OPTION 3B IN THAT IT CREATES A SINGLE FARE BY DISTANCE
- 25 STRUCTURE FOR ALL REGIONAL STRAIGHT SERVICES. BUT IT GOES 1





- 1 STEP FURTHER ON INTEGRATION CREATING SINGLE FLAT FARE FOR ALL
- 2 LOCAL SERVICES AND FREE TRAIN TRANSFER BETWEEN AGENCIES. NEXT
- 3 SLIDE PLEASE. SO OUR LAST 2 OPTIONS 5 AND 6 USE A HONEYCOMB
- 4 ZONE STRUCTURE AS WE DEFINED ZONE BOUNDARIES AGAIN LOOKING TO
- 5 CREATE A STRUCTURE WITH AT LEAST POTENTIAL TO RAISE SIMILAR
- 6 REVENUE TO TODAY'S STRUCTURE AND TRYING TO MINIMIZE ARBITRARY
- 7 BOUNDARIES AVOIDING CREATING NEW FARE PENALTIES PARTICULARLY
- 8 IN LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES AND BALANCE ZONE SIZE AND PRICE. TO
- 9 AVOID ARBITRARY PRICE PREMIUMS WE ARE TESTING OPTIONS USED IN
- 10 OTHER REGIONS SUCH AS SECOND ZONE FREE WE'RE LOOKING TO BE
- 11 INTUITIVE SIMPLE AND CONSISTENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO OPTION
- 12 5 SIMPLY INTEGRATES ALL AGENCIES AND SERVICES LOCAL AND
- 13 REGIONAL AROUND A SINGLE ZONE STRUCTURE. AND YOU CAN LOOK ON
- 14 THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND WE HAVE 2 ZONE MAPS SHOWN HERE.
- 15 ILLUSTRATIVE ZONE APPROACHES FOR NOW TESTING WITH SMALLER
- 16 ZONES AS SHOWN ON THE LEFT AND LARGER ZONES ON THE RIGHT.
- 17 WE'LL TEST AT LEAST 1 SMALL AND 1 LARGE OPTION. NEXT SLIDE
- 18 PLEASE. SO FINALLY OPTION 6, WE CONSIDER A HONEYCOMB ZONE
- 19 STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES BY FLAT FARE FOR LOCAL
- 20 SERVICES THIS OPTION AVOIDS COMPLEXITY OF IMPLEMENTING TAG ON
- 21 TAG OFF FOR LOCAL BUSES. AGAIN WE ASSUME FREE INTER-AGENCY
- 22 TRANSFER IN THIS STRUCTURE. AND JUST TO ILLUSTRATE ON THE NEXT
- 23 SLIDE, THIS IS AN ILLUSTRATIVE ZONE MAP FOR OPTION 6 AND
- 24 BECAUSE LOCAL SERVICES WOULD USE A FLAT FARE THE ZONES IN THIS
- 25 MAP ARE MORE TAILORED TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK. SO THIS MAP IS



- 1 BUILT AROUND EXISTING REGIONAL NETWORK AND CONSIDERS EXISTING
- 2 SOCIAL SECURITY NUMBER AND -- EXISTING ZONES AND DISTANCE.
- 3 THAT CONCLUDES A TOUR OF OUR OPTIONS. BILL WILL DISCUSS USER
- 4 RESEARCH AND ROADMAP FOR THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS WE WOULD
- 5 LIKE TO PAUSE AND SEE IF THE TASK FORCE HAVE QUESTIONS OR
- 6 CLARIFICATIONS ON THE PRESENTATION SO FAR.
- 8 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: TASK FORCE MEMBERS, QUESTIONS OR
- 9 COMMENTS?

7

10

16

21

- 11 THERESE MCMILLAN: THIS IS THERESE. I HAVE 1. AND I WAS DEALING
- 12 WITH SPILLED TEA SO YOU MIGHT HAVE COVERED IT WHILE I WAS
- 13 MONTH UP THE FLOOR. AS YOU HAVE LAID OUT THESE OPTIONS, DO YOU
- 14 HAVE A SET OF SORT OF THE BASIC CRITERIA WITH WHICH THEY WOULD
- 15 BE SCORED OR RATED?
- 17 MICHAEL EISEMAN: WE DO. AND THAT'S THE BUSINESS CASE
- 18 FRAMEWORK. BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE --
- 19 AND WE'LL TALK ABOUT IT IN DETAIL, I BELIEVE, IN THE MAY
- 20 MEETING.
- 22 THERESE MCMILLAN: OKAY.
- 24 MICHAEL EISEMAN: TO GIVE YOU A HIGH LEVEL OVERVIEW, THERE ARE
- 25 4 DIMENSIONS TO THE EVALUATION, STRATEGIC DIMENSION WHICH



- 1 COVERS SORT OF TRANSPORTATION -- LIKE FIRST ORDER
- 2 TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS AND FISCAL IMPACTS AND THEN SORT OF
- 3 SECOND ORDER IMPACTS ON SORT OF THE REGIONAL OUTCOMES, LIKE
- 4 THE ECONOMY AND THE ENVIRONMENT. AND THEN THE SECOND 1 IS
- 5 ECONOMIC DIMENSION WHERE WE TRY TO SORT OF PUT IN THERE TERMS
- 6 THE BENEFITS OR DISBENEFITS. THEN WE HAVE GOT A DETAILED
- 7 FINANCIAL DIMENSION CAPITAL COST OPERATING COST, REVENUE, ET
- 8 CETERA, AND THEN IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSION, SO HOW DIFFICULT OR
- 9 EASY IS THIS TO IMPLEMENT WITHIN THE TECHNOLOGY SYSTEMS AND
- 10 CAPITAL SYSTEMS THAT WE HAVE.
- 12 THERESE MCMILLAN: GREAT.
- 14 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: OTHER TASK FORCE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?
- 16 CARTER MAU: COUPLE OF CLARIFYING QUESTIONS, ON PAGE 6 YOU
- 17 MENTIONED FARES FOR SHUTTLES MANY OF THOSE OPERATE FOR FREE IS
- 18 THAT SOMETHING YOU'RE TRYING TO TICK UNDER THIS FARE
- 19 INTEGRATION UMBRELLA? AND THE OTHER OUESTION WOULD BE ON PAGE
- 20 13, YOU MENTIONED THE TACTICAL AND LIMITED USES OF SURCHARGES.
- 21 I KNOW SOME OF THOSE ARE SERVICES. WONDERING HOW YOU'RE
- 22 ATTEMPTING TO PULL THIS INTO THE ANALYSIS.
- 24 MICHAEL EISEMAN: WE DO LIST OF THE SHUTTLES AS 1 OF THE
- 25 OPTIONS UNDER FIRST LAST MILE THESE DETAILS ARE GIVEN FURTHER

23

11

13



- 1 COMPLETENESS IN THE FRAMEWORK THAT THE PLANNING OPS GROUP PUT
- 2 TOGETHER BUT I IMAGINE WE DON'T TAKE A CURRENT FREE SHUTTLE
- 3 AND FOLD IT INTO THE FARE FRAMEWORK NECESSARILY. ALTHOUGH WE
- 4 HAVEN'T TALKED ABOUT THAT IN ANY DETAIL. AND THEN -- LET'S
- 5 SEE, THE REVENUE SHARING OR COST SHARING APPROACH IS OBVIOUSLY
- 6 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO THE IMPLEMENTIBILITY OF ANY OF THESE
- 7 AND CERTAINLY THE NEXT PHASE OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF OPTIONS
- 8 THAT WE DON'T HAVE DETAILS FOR YOU TODAY. BUT YEAH FOR
- 9 EXAMPLE, THE SAN MATEO COUNTY SURCHARGE ON BART IS 1, YOU
- 10 KNOW, IT'S NOT LISTED HERE AS 1 OF OUR TACTICAL SURCHARGES, SO
- 11 IF THAT WENT AWAY IN AN INTEGRATE THE FARE STRUCTURE THERE
- 12 WOULD BE SOME THINKING OF HOW IT WOULD BE REPLACED IN THE
- 13 REGION'S OPERATING COST AND CAPITAL COST AND REVENUE
- 14 STRUCTURE. YEAH, WE HAVE TO WORK THROUGH THE DETAILS. WE
- 15 HAVEN'T FULLY WORKED THROUGH THEM YET.
- 17 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: I WANT TO THANK BILL AND MIKE, IN
- 18 PARTICULAR, THERE IS A LOT OF MOVING PIECES NICE TO SEE DETAIL
- 19 COMING TOGETHER WE'RE DEFINITELY LOOKING FORWARD TO NEXT
- 20 MONTH'S MEETING. I'M GOING TO CLOSE THIS AND MOVE TO ITEM 6
- 21 PUBLIC COMMENT.
- 23 MICHAEL EISEMAN: BILL HAD A COUPLE OF ADDITIONAL COMMENTS.

24

22



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION
Meeting Transcript

- 1 WILLIAM BACON: WE HAVE A FEW MORE SLIDES WE WOULD LIKE TO RUN
- 2 THROUGH IF THAT'S AGO.

3

- 4 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE WE'RE RUNNING
- 5 UP AGAINST THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD IF WE CAN MOVE ALONG.

6

- 7 WILLIAM BACON: IF IT'S OKAY WITH THE TASK FORCE, WE CAN GO ON
- 8 TO THE NEXT SLIDE HERE.

9

10 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: PLEASE DO.

- 12 WILLIAM BACON: SLIDE 21 IS WHERE WE NEED TO BE. THANK YOU.
- 13 I'LL BRIEFLY WALK US THROUGH THIS IN THE INTEREST OF TIME. BUT
- 14 THE FOLLOWING SECTION WE WANT TO QUICKLY UPDATE TASK FORCE
- 15 ABOUT THE EXTENSIVE OUTREACH RESEARCH THE PROJECT HAS
- 16 UNDERTAKEN OVER THE COURSE SO FAR I'LL CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO
- 17 THE ATTACHMENT THAT'S INCLUDED IN TODAY'S PACKET CONTAINING A
- 18 DETAILED REPORT ON USER RESEARCH. USEFUL INFORMATION CONTAINED
- 19 IN THIS ATTACHMENT WE THINK IT WILL BE INTERESTING TO STAFF A
- 20 LOT OF INSIGHTS FROM THE EXTENSIVE WORK WE HAVE DONE. THE GOAL
- 21 OF OUR RESEARCH TASKS IS TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THE MOTIVATIONS
- 22 GOALS AND NEEDS OF TRANSIT USERS AND NON-USERS WHEN THEY TAKE
- 23 A -- WHEN THEY CHOOSE OR CHOOSE NOT TO USE TRANSIT. OUR WORK
- 24 THUS FAR HAS BEEN SEEKING TO FOCUS BETTER ON CUSTOMER VALUE
- 25 HUMAN EXPERIENCE EQUITY AND SYSTEMS THAT USERS EXPERIENCE WHEN





- 1 THEY CHOOSE TO USE TRANSIT. SO YOU CAN SEE HERE, IN THE
- 2 ARROWS TOWARD THE BOTTOM OF THE SLIDE HIGHLIGHT THE DIFFERENT
- 3 STEPS WE HAVE TAKEN TO LOOK AT OUR USER RESEARCH SCOPE SO FAR.
- 4 SO INITIALLY WE, IN OUR PRELIMINARY RESEARCH WE FOCUSED ON
- 5 NARRATIVE WORKSHOPS FOCUS GROUPS WITH CUSTOMERS WITH SPARED
- 6 DETAILS ABOUT PERSONAL EXPERIENCE USING THE SYSTEM FOLLOWING
- 7 ON THAT TO UNDERSTAND BARRIERS TO ACCESSING TRANSIT AND WHAT'S
- 8 MOST IMPORTANT FOR USERS IN TERMS OF USING THE SYSTEM DID THAT
- 9 ON A SERIES OF 1-ON-1 INTERVIEWS AND THROUGH A SURVEY DONE
- 10 ONLINE AND WE'RE MOVING INTO THE CORE FOCUS OF A LOT OF OUR
- 11 WORK OVER THE COMING 2 MONTHS WHICH IS REALLY CODESIGNED AND
- 12 PROTOTYPING. AND THAT'S WHERE DETAILED OPTIONS THAT MIKE JUST
- 13 WALKED US THROUGH WE'RE GOING TO BE ACTUALLY CODESIGNING THEM
- 14 WITH USERS SO WE'LL ACTUALLY COME UP WITH MOCK-UP IN TERMS OF
- 15 HOW A USER WOULD EXPERIENCE THESE DIFFERENT FARE POLICY
- 16 OPTIONS, HOW DOES IT WORK FOR THEM DOES IT MAKE SENSE IS IT
- 17 PRACTICAL FOR THEM DO PRICES ENCOURAGE THEM TO USE THE SYSTEM
- 18 IN DIFFERENTLY WAYS THAN THEY DO TODAY. THIS IS THE CODESIGN
- 19 PROTOTYPING WORK WHICH IS HONESTLY ABOUT HALF OF OUR TOTAL
- 20 USER RESEARCH SCOPE STILL TO COME JUST IN THE LAST FEW MONTHS
- 21 OF THE PROJECT SO THERE IS A LOT OF WORK WE'RE GOING TO BE
- 22 DOING IN THE NEXT FEW WEEKS. MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AND
- 23 AGAIN JUST OUICKLY SUMMARIZING THE SORT OF KEY USER RESEARCH
- 24 FINDINGS FROM THOSE 4 MAIN AREAS CUSTOMER VALUE USER
- 25 EXPERIENCE AND EQUITY IN THE SYSTEMS I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT IS





- 1 THAT CUSTOMERS DON'T JUST THINK ABOUT TRANSIT IN ITS OWN WORLD
- 2 THAT I THINK ABOUT HOW TRANSIT RELATES TO OTHER PARTS OF THEIR
- 3 LIVES WHAT IT COSTS RELATIVE TO OTHER THINGS THAT THEY
- 4 EXPERIENCE COST OF LIVING IN THE BAY AREA COST OF FOOD COST OF
- 5 ALTERNATIVE MEANS OF TRAVEL IN THE REGION. TRANSIT IS JUST 1
- 6 PART OF AN ECOSYSTEM BENCH MARKED AGAINST A LOT OF OTHER
- 7 THINGS THAT CUSTOMERS EXPERIENCE. FROM A PAYMENT STANDPOINT,
- 8 PEOPLE EXPERIENCE FARES IN SEVERAL DIFFERENT WAYS NOT JUST THE
- 9 ACTUAL COST OF PAYING WHEN THEY GET ON A BUS OR ANOTHER
- 10 TRANSIT VEHICLE OR A STATION BUT I THINK ABOUT IT TO SOME
- 11 EXTENT WHEN THEY'RE PLANNING THEIR JOURNEY AS WELL WHAT'S THE
- 12 BEST COST EFFECTIVE WAY FOR ME TO GET TO WHERE I NEED TO GO IN
- 13 THE TIME I VALUE AS EFFICIENTLY AS POSSIBLE. FROM AN EQUITY
- 14 STANDPOINT THERE WAS 1 THING THAT STOOD OUT TO THE PROJECT
- 15 TEAM IN OUR USER RESEARCH THUS FAR WHICH IS THAT A LOT OF
- 16 USERS REALLY EXPRESS THEIR PREFERENCE FOR HAVING FARES THAT
- 17 ARE EQUAL FOR ALL TYPES OF CUSTOMER RATHER THAN FOR
- 18 DIFFERENTIATED CATEGORIES THIS IS PRETTY CLEAR DIVERGENCE FROM
- 19 OUR USER RESEARCH WORK FROM WHAT WE HAVE HEARD FROM STAFF OR
- 20 TRANSIT PROFESSIONAL PERSPECTIVE WHERE THERE IS MORE OF A
- 21 PREFERENCE FOR DIFFERENTIATING BETWEEN DIFFERENT CATEGORIES OF
- 22 USERS AND TO BE ABLE TO OFFER GENERALLY LOWER FARES TO CERTAIN
- 23 TYPES OF USER BASED ON THEIR INDIVIDUAL NEEDS AND FINALLY
- 24 CUSTOMERS DO RECOGNIZE THAT THE BAY AREA IS A COMPLICATED
- 25 SYSTEM OF TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND NOT EVERY USER UNDERSTANDS OR





- 1 WANTS TO UNDERSTAND HOW TRANSIT WORKS IN A PART OF THE REGION
- 2 WHY THEY DON'T TRAVEL REGULARLY. SO, HOW DO YOU SORT OF
- 3 BALANCE THAT MIX DESIRE FOR UNDERSTANDING WITH TRYING TO MAKE
- 4 THE CUSTOMER FARE EXPERIENCE AS COORDINATED AND INTEGRATED AS
- 5 POSSIBLE. SO IN THE INTEREST OF TIME IF WE CAN GO AHEAD TO
- 6 SLIDE 30. THE SLIDE WE WALKED THROUGH PROVIDES A SUMMARY OF
- 7 WHAT YOU WILL FIND IN THE ATTACHMENT WHICH IS OUR USER
- 8 RESEARCH REPORT AND I ENCOURAGE YOU TO PAGE THROUGH IT AND YOU
- 9 WILL FIND INTERESTING TIDBITS THERE THAT WILL ENLIGHTEN YOUR
- 10 WORK ON THIS PRESENTLY AND OTHER ASPECTS OF YOUR AGENCY
- 11 OPERATION. LAST COUPLE OF SLIDES I WANT TO PROVIDE THE TASK
- 12 FORCE AN UPDATE ON OUR APPROACH TO ENGAGING POLICY MAKERS IN
- 13 OUR WORK AND ROAD MAPS FOR FINAL REPORT THIS SUMMER. NEXT
- 14 SLIDE. AS MANY OF YOU MAY BE AWARE WHEN THE PROJECT SCOPE AND
- 15 FUNDING PLAN FOR OUR WORK WERE DEVELOPED BACK IN FALL OF 2019
- 16 THE PROJECT STAKEHOLDERS AND MTC COMMISSION AS THE FUNDING
- 17 PARTNER FOR THIS STUDY AGREED ON THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING A
- 18 VENUE FOR POLICY MAKERS, TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS AND MTC
- 19 COMMISSIONERS TO REMAIN ENGAGED IN THE WORK OF THE STUDY AND
- 20 PRIOR TO THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC, THE PROJECT TEAM HAD
- 21 ENVISIONED CONVENING 2 TO 3 POLICY MAKER FORUMS WHERE 2
- 22 GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS FROM EACH OF THE AGENCIES REPRESENTED
- 23 ON THIS TASK FORCE WOULD BE ASKED TO PARTICIPATE. BUT GIVEN
- 24 THE LIMITATIONS ON IN-PERSON EVENTS AND AFTER CONSULTATION
- 25 WITH CHAIR HURSH THE PROJECT ENGAGEMENT TEAM WILL HAVE 2





- 1 PROJECTS BETWEEN NOW AND THE SUMMER THE BLUE ON THE UPPER
- 2 SLIDE IS FOR THE PROJECT TEAM TO ORGANIZE A WEBINAR LATE NEXT
- 3 MONTH OR BEGINNING IN JUNE WHERE WE WOULD INVITE EVERY TRANSIT
- 4 AGENCY BOARD MEMBER FROM AROUND THE AREA TO ATTEND THIS
- 5 WEBINAR IF THEY'RE INTERESTED PROVIDING AN OVERVIEW AND UPDATE
- 6 OF THE PROJECT THUS FAR AND PROVIDE DETAILS ABOUT THE OPTIONS
- 7 THAT AT THIS POINT IN TIME WOULD BE UNDER DETAILED ANALYSIS
- 8 AND EVALUATION. THIS WOULD BE A PUBLIC MEETING, A BROWN ACT
- 9 MEETING, OPEN TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC BUT WE WOULD BE
- 10 SPECIFICALLY INVITING ALL TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS TO
- 11 PARTICIPATE AND ASK QUESTIONS AT THIS EVENT. FOLLOWING UP ON
- 12 THAT, IN JULY, AND PERHAPS INTO EARLY AUGUST, OUR DISCUSSIONS
- 13 WITH CHAIR HURSH, WE SETTLED ON RECOMMENDING THE PROJECT
- 14 MANAGERS ATTEND EACH OF THE REGULARLY SCHEDULED BOARD MEETINGS
- 15 FOR ALL OF THE LARGE 7 OPERATORS IN THE BAY AREA TO PRESENT
- 16 OUR DRAFT REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE FULL BOARD OF
- 17 THOSE AGENCIES TO DISCUSS AND PROVIDE FEEDBACK ON AND THEN TO
- 18 MAKE SURE THAT ALL AGENCIES ARE INCLUDED THE PROJECT TEAM
- 19 WOULD ORGANIZE 2 SPECIAL CONVENINGS OF NORTH BAY OPERATORS AND
- 20 OF EAST BAY OPERATORS TO PROVIDE A VENUE FOR THOSE AGENCY
- 21 BOARD MEMBERS TO DISCUSS THEIR PERSPECTIVES ON THE DRAFT
- 22 REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS. SO THAT, I THINK IT WAS IMPORTANT
- 23 TO THE CHAIR AND TO THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM THAT ALL
- 24 GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS FROM THE AGENCIES HAVE AN EQUAL
- 25 ABILITY TO PARTICIPATE AND TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK ON THE PROJECT





- 1 AS WE MOVE FORWARD. AND THEN FINALLY, IF YOU CAN GO ON TO THE
- 2 NEXT SLIDE. WE REALLY WANTED TO SET CLEAR MILESTONES FOR YOU
- 3 ALL TO UNDERSTAND WHERE WE ARE AND WHAT THE ROADMAP LOOKS LIKE
- 4 FOR THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. SO WE ARE HOPING TO CONVENE ANOTHER
- 5 MEETING OF THIS TASK FORCE BEFORE YOU'RE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE
- 6 BOARD MEETING IN MAY TO PRESENT THE FINAL VARIANTS AND TO
- 7 ALLOW YOU ALL TO SEE THOSE EXACT FINAL DETAILS. ON MAY 24TH AS
- 8 IT STANDS RIGHT NOW THE PROJECT HAS BEEN ASKED TO PRESENT TO
- 9 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE AT ITS MAY
- 10 MEETING. I THINK THERE IS SOME POSSIBILITY THAT COULD SHIFT,
- 11 GIVEN THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS NOW CONCLUDING IN
- 12 JULY SO THAT DATE WAS ORIGINALLY SETTLED WHEN THE TASK FORCE
- 13 WAS GOING TO CONCLUDE IN JUNE SO CAVEAT ON THAT 24TH DATE. MAY
- 14 AND JUNE WE'LL BE CONDUCTING OUR DETAILED ANALYSIS OF
- 15 FINANCIAL RIDERSHIP AND USER IMPACTS AND TO REALLY BEGIN TO
- 16 FLUSH OUT THE IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES IN OUR BUSINESS CASE.
- 17 IN THE ENDS OF MAY BEGINNING OF JUNE THE POLICY MAKER WEBINAR
- 18 I JUST DISCUSSED. JULY IS REALLY AN IMPORTANT MONTH IT'S WHERE
- 19 WE TARGETING THE RELEASE OF OUR DRAFT REPORT AND
- 20 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THIS BODY, TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK
- 21 FORCE. JULY MEETING IDEALLY YOU WOULD RECEIVE A DRAFT AND
- 22 LATER THAT MONTH WE WOULD BE SEEKING PUBLIC INPUT AND
- 23 STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK THROUGH A VARIETY OF AVENUES INCLUDING
- 24 PRESENTING TO GOVERNING BOARDS OF THE TRANSIT PRAYERS AS I
- 25 JUST DISCUSSED BUT ALSO ALLOWING FOR GENERAL PUBLIC FEEDBACK





13

- 1 AND COMMENT OVER THE COURSE OF THE MONTHS OF JULY AND AUGUST
- 2 AND IN SEPTEMBER OF THIS YEAR THIS TASK FORCE WOULD BE ASKED
- 3 TO CONSIDER ADOPTING THE FIND REPORT AFTER ABOUT 45 DAYS OF
- 4 PUBLIC COMMENT AND FEEDBACK. SO I THINK THAT WRAPS UP OUR
- 5 PRESENTATION. BUT MIKE AND I ARE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY OUESTIONS
- 6 THAT YOU HAVE, AND THANKS AGAIN FOR YOUR TIME TODAY.

8 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: I'M GLAD YOU HELD US TO -- KEPT MY SEAT

- 9 TO THE FLAMES THERE, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO ILLUSTRATE AND
- 10 GIVE THE CHANCE FOR PUBLIC AND BOARD TO WEIGH IN. I SEE
- 11 DARYL'S HAND RAISED. YOU'RE ON MUTE. DARYL HALLS, WE CAN'T
- 12 HEAR YOU. I'LL ASK IF ANYONE HAS ANY OTHER --

14 DARYL HALLS: I CLICKED THE WRONG BUTTON. MICHAEL AND WILLIAM,

- 15 THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. VERY COMPREHENSIVE. MAY BE A
- 16 QUESTION ON THE OUTREACH. I KNOW YOU HAVE BROKE IT UP BY THE
- 17 BIG 7, THE EAST BAY AND THE NORTH BAY BUT I THINK FROM A
- 18 COMMUTE PATTERN AT LEAST FOR OUR COUNTY WE CONNECT MORE TO
- 19 BART WETA, CAPITAL CORRIDOR AND THE EAST BAY. I'M LOOKING AT
- 20 BETH BUT IT MIGHT BE HELPFUL FOR US TO BE PART OF THAT
- 21 OUTREACH. FOR EXAMPLE, WE DON'T RUN SERVICE TO SONOMA AND
- 22 MARIN THERE ARE GAPS I THINK IT MIGHT BE EASIER I'M LOOKING TO
- 23 BETH AND FAST ALL OF OUR ROUTES GO TO BART AND HALF GO TO WETA
- 24 THERE'S PROBABLY A BETTER CONNECTION. IF YOU WERE ACCEPTING TO
- 25 THAT, THAT MIGHT BE BETTER OUTREACH.





- 2 WILLIAM BACON: I DON'T THINK WE'RE WEDGED DOWN TO THE NORTH
- 3 BAY GROUPED I THINK IT'S JUST TO FACILITATE WITH ENGAGING
- 4 GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS WE'RE HAPPY TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT
- 5 SOLANO AND NAPA.

6

- 7 DARYL HALLS: MONITORING LIKE THAT WOULD BE MORE RELEVANT FOR
- 8 THE ELECTED OFFICIALS. THANK YOU.

9

- 10 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: OKAY. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS
- 11 FROM THE TASK FORCE? OKAY, NOW I'M GOING TO MOVE US TO AGENDA
- 12 ITEM 6, PUBLIC COMMENT.

13

- 14 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR HALL -- I MEAN CHAIR HURSH, THERE
- 15 IS 1 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS
- 16 ITEM.

17

18 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: YOU WANT TO DO THAT FIRST? OKAY.

- 20 SPEAKER: HEY, THANK YOU MIKEY, YOU'RE SUPPOSED TO BE ASKING
- 21 FOR PUBLIC COMMENT EVERY ITEM. BUT ANYWAY, THROUGH THE CHAIR,
- 22 IF IT WAS POSSIBLE TO BACK UP TO SLIDE NUMBER 23, I HAD SOME
- 23 ISSUE WITH THE SECOND BULLET ON THE EOUITY WHICH SAYS THERE
- 24 WAS A STRONG PREFERENCE FOR THE EQUALITY APPROACH THAT FARES
- 25 SHOULD BE THE SAME FOR EVERYONE. THERE'S SOMETHING PROFOUNDLY



- 1 WRONG WITH THAT. SO MY TWO CENTS WOULD BE TO CHANGE THIS, THAT
- 2 THERE WAS A STRONG PREFERENCE FOR THE EQUITABLE APPROACH THAT
- 3 FARES SHOULD BE AFFORDABLE FOR EVERYONE. AND THAT'S MY TWO
- 4 CENTS. THANK YOU.

5

- 6 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU ROLAND. ANY OTHER MEMBERS OF
- 7 THE PUBLIC WANT TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? HEARING NONE SEEING
- 8 NO HANDS RAISED, WE CAN STOP THE SHARE SCREEN. ITEM 6 PUBLIC
- 9 DEPENDENT, OTHER BUSINESS. MADAM SECRETARY ANY NAME. ANYBODY
- 10 COMMENTED BEFORE THE DEADLINE IDEA 5:00 P.M.

11

- 12 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 14 ON THIS ITEM. SPOKE TOO SOON. WE HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
- 15 RAISING THIS HAPPENED FOR THIS ITEM.

16

17 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: I RECOGNIZE ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD.

- 19 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR MICHAEL HURSH AND MEMBERS. AS I
- 20 SPEAK GENERALLY HERE THIS IS BECOMING MORE CLEAR, THANK YOU. I
- 21 HOPE IN FUTURE PRESENTATIONS, WE CAN HAVE A MODEL HYPOTHETICAL
- 22 FARE CHARTS WITH SOME DOLLAR AMOUNTS AND DESTINATIONS THAT IT
- 23 WILL REALLY BRING THIS INTO LIGHT. AND CONCERNING FARES, WITH
- 24 THIS PREVIOUS MENTION OF FARES BEING EQUAL FOR EVERYONE, WELL,
- 25 LEGALLY THAT CAN'T BE DONE BECAUSE REDUCED FARES THAT ARE





- 1 ASSURED BY FEDERAL LAW, FOR SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH
- 2 DISABILITIES. SO OBVIOUSLY WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT
- 3 EVERYTHING THAT WE DO COMPORTS WITH THE REDUCED FARE MANDATE.
- 4 ANY FARE PRODUCT THAT WE HAVE, WHETHER IT BE CAPPING, PASSES,
- 5 ET CETERA, NEEDS TO INCLUDE REDUCED FARE. I DID ADVOCATE THAT
- 6 OUR BEST DIRECTION TO GO IS TO HAVE SOME SEMBLANCE OF FARE
- 7 CAPPING, AND ENSURE THE PUBLIC'S EASY ACCESS TO TECHNOLOGY. SO
- 8 WE REALLY CAN'T DO A SYSTEM LIKE THIS WITH PAPER TICKETS.
- 9 THANK YOU. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THE NEXT MEETING.

11 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU ALETA. OUR NEXT COMMENTER IS

12 STACY BRANDECKER. GO AHEAD STACY.

14 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: STACY, YOU HAVE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16 SPEAKER: SORRY. DID THAT COME THROUGH NOW.

18 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.

20 SPEAKER: I APOLOGIZE FOR THAT. I WANT TO AGREE WITH WHAT BOTH

- 21 ROLAND AND ALETA SAID. THAT WE DO NEED TO TAKE AN EQUITABLE
- 22 APPROACH. AND WE DO NEED TO IRON THIS OUT. I AM A RESIDENT OF
- 23 THE BAY AREA, NAMELY SAN FRANCISCO, FOR 21 YEARS. I HAVE
- 24 PUSHED MYSELF TO TRY AND TAKE TRANSIT AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE, AND
- 25 JUST THINGS AS SIMPLE FROM GETTING FROM SFO TO SAN FRANCISCO,

10

13

15

17



- 1 IT IS -- THERE -- EVERYTHING ABOUT IT SAYS TAKE A CAR. I HAVE
- 2 WORKED IN THE EAST BAY. I HAVE WORKED IN MILPITAS, TAKING BIKE
- 3 AND CALTRAIN AND IF YOU MISS ANYTHING OR MAKE A MISSTEP OR GET
- 4 A FLAT TIRE, IT IS NEARLY IMPOSSIBLE AND WE REALLY NEED TO DO
- 5 MORE TO MAKE THIS AN EVEN APPROACH, AND NOT BREAK THE BANK AND
- 6 THE LAST THING I WOULD SAY IN TERMS OF MAKING THINGS
- 7 EOUITABLE, IF WE WANT ADULTS THAT RIDE TRANSIT, WE NEED TO
- 8 GROW THEM. WE SHOULD HAVE TRANSIT BE HIGHLY SUBSIDIZED IF NOT
- 9 FREE-FOR-ALL CHILDREN. BECAUSE THE BIGGEST BARRIER TO FAMILIES
- 10 TAKING TRANSIT IS HAVING TO PAY FOR ALL THEIR KID AND THERE IS
- 11 NO BETTER WAY TO GETTING ADULTS TO RIDE TRANSIT IF THEY'RE
- 12 DOING IT AS KIDS. THANK YOU. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING WHAT
- 13 THIS REALLY MIGHT LOOK LIKE IN TERMS OF WAY FINDING AND FARES
- 14 IN THE MONTHS TO COME. MY NAME IS STACY, AND I'M DONE
- 15 SPEAKING.

16

- 17 MICHAEL HURSH, CHAIR: THANK YOU STACY. AND I DON'T SEE ANY
- 18 OTHER HANDS RAISED. I BELIEVE THAT WILL CONCLUDE PUBLIC
- 19 COMMENT. UNLESS THERE IS ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM THE TASK
- 20 FORCE MEMBERS? I AM GOING TO MOVE TO ADJOURN OUR BUSINESS IS
- 21 DONE FOR TODAY. THE NEXT FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING
- 22 WILL BE MINUTE MAY 17TH AT 1:05 P.M. THANK YOU EVERYONE.
- 23 [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government