



# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript



April 14, 2021

**PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**

**WEDNESDAY, 9:45 A.M., APRIL 14, 2021**

**DAVID RABBIT:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE I'M DAVID RABBIT SERVING AS VICE CHAIR ALONG WITH GINA PAPAN, VICE CHAIR, I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE OF APRIL 14TH, 2021. PLEASE ROLL THE INTRODUCTION TO THE COVID ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT [INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV) BY



April 14, 2021

1 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND  
2 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF  
3 AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK,  
4 THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR  
5 ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT  
6 THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MADAM CLERK,  
9 YOU CAN PLEASE CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. ABE-KOGA?

12

13 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY?

20

21 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER? COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS HERE.

24 MILEY?

25



April 14, 2021

1     **SUP. NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

2

3     **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

4

5     **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

6

7     **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

8

9     **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** HERE.

10

11    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

12

13    **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

14

15    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

16

17    **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

18

19    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU QUORUM IS PRESENT.

20

21    **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AGENDA ITEM TWO, CONSENT CALENDAR, TODAY

22    HAS ITEMS 2A THROUGH TWO J. DO ANY OF MY COLLEAGUES HAVE

23    QUESTIONS, COMMENTS OR CONCERNS OR WOULD ANYONE LIKE A CONSENT

24    CALENDAR PULLED? NOT SEEING ANYONE STEP UP. CAN I HAVE A

25    MOTION TO APPROVE AND A SECOND FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY?



April 14, 2021

1

2 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** MOVE APPROVAL. GLOVER.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** SECOND, PAPAN.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND SECOND  
7 BY VICE CHAIR PAPAN. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO READ ANY PUBLIC  
8 COMMENTS RECEIVED ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM ON THE RECORD.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND I  
11 SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. CAN WE TAKE A ROLL VALUE VOTE ON  
14 THE CONSENT CALENDAR, PLEASE?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE]

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 3A, MTC RESOLUTION  
21 4402 AND 4412 REVISED ADOPT SP ONE ALTERNATE FUNDING PLAN IN  
22 RM3 FUNDS AND LETTERS OF NO PREJUDICE, AND I BELIEVE THAT  
23 KENNETH KAO WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

24



April 14, 2021

1   **KENNETH KAO:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, ITEM THREE ACTION  
2   ITEM TO ADOPT ALTERNATE FUNDING PLAN. THE CALIFORNIA  
3   TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION APPROVED \$407 MILLION IN SENATE BILL  
4   ONE COMPETITIVE FOUNDING FOR BAY AREA REPRESENTING ABOUT 20%  
5   OF 2 BILLION AVAILABLE STATEWIDE PROJECTS SHOWN IN TABLE ONE  
6   ATTACHMENT ONE OF YOUR MEMO. AMONG THE PROJECTS OF THE BAY  
7   AREA FIVE PROJECTS HAVE REGIONAL MEASURE THREE FUNDS COMMITTED  
8   IN THE FUNDING PLANS REGIONAL MEASURE THREE FUNDS IS UNDER  
9   LITIGATION AND NOT AVAILABLE TO MATCH FUNDS IN THE NEAR-TERM.  
10  MTC HAS ISSUED LETTERS OF NO PREJUDICE TO ALLOW SPONSOR TO  
11  SPEND OTHER FUNDS TO BE REPAYED IF RM3 IS CLEARED BY THE COURTS  
12  FOR CURRENT YEAR CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS SP ONE FUNDING TO US101  
13  MARIN SONOMA NARROWS PROJECT SPONSORED BY THE TRANSPORTATION  
14  AUTHORITY AND SOLANO 880 EXPRESS LANES PROJECT SOLANO  
15  TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY THERE IS NO LOCAL FUNDS TO BACK. CTC  
16  SELECTIVE PROGRAMMING MILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO THESE PROJECTS SO  
17  DELAY COULD DAMAGE THE REGION'S STRONG PROJECT TRACK RECORD  
18  AND NEGATIVELY IMPACT PERFORMANCE IN FUTURE STATEWIDE FUNDING  
19  COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS. SECOND SCHEDULE DELAYS TRANSLATE TO  
20  ESCALATION COSTS NOT ACCOUNTED FOR AND FOR WHICH FUNDING IS  
21  NOT YET IDENTIFIED. FINALLY ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS MAY EXPIRE  
22  IF THE PROJECT IS DELAYED BEYOND THE PERMIT VALIDITY DATE.  
23  THEREFORE TO KEEP THESE CONSTRUCTION READY SP ONE PROJECTS  
24  READY STAFF IS RECOMMENDING \$175 MILLION IN FEDERAL  
25  TRANSPORTATION FUNDS FOR PROJECTS IN MARIN AND SOLANO.



April 14, 2021

1 REPRESENTING ABOUT A YEAR'S WORTH OF THE REGION'S FEDERAL MAX  
2 CAPACITY RECOMMENDATION. MTC OBAG TYPICALLY LAGS BEHIND  
3 FEDERAL APPROPRIATIONS BY YEAR OR MORE AND FEDERAL FUNDS WOULD  
4 HAVE NO ACCUMULATIVE IMPACT THROUGH FUNDING AS LONG AS IT'S  
5 PAID BACK TO MTC. \$176 MILLION TO MARIN AND 100 MILLION TO  
6 SOLANO AND STP CMAQ AND TIP FUNDING REPAYMENT PROFILES WILL BE  
7 RETURNED. [INDISCERNIBLE] AND CAN BE USED FOR A VARIETY OF  
8 GREATER PROJECTS. FUNDING WILL ENSURE THE REGION DELIVERS ALL  
9 FEDERAL FUNDS AVAILABLE TO THE REGION THIS YEAR WHICH WILL  
10 ENSURE REGION'S ELIGIBILITY TO RECEIVE ADDITIONAL FEDERAL  
11 FUNDS NOT USED BY OTHER STATES KNOWN AS REDISTRIBUTION. THE  
12 RELIEF SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATIONS ACT KNOWN AS CRRSAA  
13 PROVIDES ABOUT \$912 MILLION TO CALIFORNIA ADMINISTERED BY THE  
14 FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION. LAST MONTH CTC APPROVED  
15 DISTRIBUTING 40% OF THIS MONEY TO THE REGION SPLIT BETWEEN THE  
16 STIP AND STGP FORMULA THROUGH THE STIP MARIN SONOMA COUNTIES  
17 WILL COMMIT SHARES TO THE FUNDING GAP PLUS FUNDS FOR PLANNING  
18 PROGRAMMING AND MONITORING. TOTALS ABOUT 3 MILLION AND CAN BE  
19 REPAID. HOWEVER IF PROJECTS DELAYED BEYOND 2023MTC REFERS THE  
20 RIGHT TO CHARGE INTEREST ON THE LOAN FEDERAL FUNDS DEDUCTED  
21 FROM THE STIP SUBJECT TO FUNDING AGREEMENT. FINALLY  
22 RECOMMENDING LOCAL FUNDS AND THE TABLE THREE IN YOUR MEMO  
23 SUMMARIZED PROPOSED PROJECTS. STAFF NOTES FOR YOUR  
24 CONSIDERATION THE PROPOSAL ASSUMES RM3 WILL BE ALLOWED BY THE  
25 COURTS AND THE REGIONAL FUNDS TO TWO PROJECTS IN THE NORTH BAY



April 14, 2021

1 IS BALANCE SAID BY THE REPAYMENT OF NON-FEDERAL FUNDS TO MTC  
2 WHICH WILL BE REDISTRIBUTED BY THE O BAG THREE FRAMEWORK THAT  
3 BENEFITS THE ENTIRE REGION. IF RM3 BROKE DOWN BY THE COURTS  
4 LOAN FUNDS WILL LIKELY NOT BE REPAID. THE TWO SIGNIFICANT  
5 IMPROVEMENTS LEVERAGES SUBSTANTIAL STATE COMPETITIVE FUNDING  
6 ADDITIONAL CONDITIONS SHOULD BE MEMORIALIZED IN FUNDING  
7 AGREEMENTS BETWEEN MTC AND STA TO BE CONSIDERED IN UPCOMING  
8 MEETINGS. NOTING APPLICATION FOR FEDERAL GRANT FUNDING PENDING  
9 SUCCESS WILL BE ADJUSTED TO ACCOUNT FOR THE FUNDING AND  
10 FINALLY THE PROPOSAL WILL BE FOCUSED TO BE REDISTRIBUTED AMONG  
11 ALL MODES AND WILL BE BENEFICIAL TO ADVANCE ALL MODES  
12 INCLUDING TRANSIT AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION SINCE THEY WON'T  
13 NEED TO FOLLOW FEDERAL CONTRACTING AND ENVIRONMENTAL  
14 REQUIREMENTS. STAFF RECOMMENDS REFERRING MTC RESOLUTIONS 4202  
15 REVISED AND 4212 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. I  
16 WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS FROM  
19 STAFF ON THIS ITEM? I SEE COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

20

21 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. SO I'M ALWAYS AMAZED  
22 AT HOW STAFF CAN FIND WAYS TO MOVE PROJECTS FORWARD. YOU KNOW,  
23 REGARDLESS OF THE SLINGS AND ARROWS THAT GET THROWN AT US OR  
24 GET THROWN AT THE PROJECTS. AND THESE ARE TWO PROJECTS THAT  
25 HAVE LONG BEEN IN THE WORKS IN THE MARIN SONOMA NARROWS. IS



April 14, 2021

1 THAT RIGHT? WHEN I DRIVE NORTH I FEEL LIKE THERE IS A NEW  
2 CONSTRUCTION PROJECT ON THAT HIGHWAY. AND SO I NEED A  
3 REGIONALLY IMPORTANT PROJECTS. SO I THINK IT'S TERRIFIC THAT  
4 WE'RE FINDING A WAY TO MOVE THESE FORWARD. I WANT TO PICK UP  
5 ON SOMETHING THAT WAS RAISED IN THE MEMO, WHICH I DIDN'T --  
6 WHICH I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR ME TO UNDERSTAND BETTER  
7 FOR THE REST OF THE COMMITTEE, ARE THESE LOANS THAT ARE BEING  
8 MADE? AND I THINK THAT CERTAINLY THERE IS PROBABLY -- THERE'S  
9 PROBABLY NOT LIKE HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS LAYING  
10 AROUND IF RM3 DOESN'T -- LOSES IN THE COURTS, BUT COULD YOU  
11 JUST KIND OF HELP EXPLAIN TO ME WHAT WOULD HAPPEN IF RM3 DOES  
12 FAIL TO THESE F THEY ARE LOANS? THERESE? OR KENNETH?

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WELL LET ME PAINT THE BROAD PICTURE HERE.  
15 FIRST OF ALL, IF RM3 IS NOT AFFIRMED BY THE COURTS, WE HAVE A  
16 PORTFOLIO OF ISSUES THAT IS NOT BIGGER AND BROADER THAN JUST  
17 THIS. SO I THINK THAT'S JUST AN IMPORTANT, YOU KNOW,  
18 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT THAT THAT IN AND OF ITSELF PRESENTS A  
19 SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGE FOR THE COMMISSION TO WAGER. SO I THINK  
20 THAT'S SORT OF AN IMPORTANT START. IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE,  
21 AND I THINK -- AND BRIAN MAY WANT TO WEIGH IN -- WHEN WE TALK  
22 ABOUT LOANS, IT'S REALLY IN THE CONTEXT OF, AGAIN, THIS LARGER  
23 LONP STRUCTURE THAT WE HAVE SETUP, YOU KNOW, FOR RM3, BUT FOR  
24 THE NUMBER OF OTHER PROJECT SPONSORS WHEREIN, SORT OF AT RISK,  
25 THE PROJECT SPONSOR SAYS I'M GOING TO, FOR EXAMPLE, ADVANCE MY



April 14, 2021

1 LOCAL SALES TAX MONEY TO KEEP PROJECT X MOVING FORWARD, I DO  
2 THAT AT RISK KNOWING THAT IF RM3 DOES NOT GET PAID, I'M  
3 BASICALLY ON THE HOOK. TO A LARGE DEGREE THAT'S WHERE THE  
4 REGION IS WITH THESE FEDERAL FUNDS, AS WELL. AND, YOU KNOW,  
5 THE EXPECTATION AS WITH ANY LONP, IF THE RM3 WOULD BE  
6 SUCCESSFUL AND SO WE HAVE AN AGREEMENT THAT, SWAP. DONE, WE'RE  
7 ALL GOOD. IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE, WE'RE JUST ACKNOWLEDGING  
8 THAT THIS ISN'T JUST RELATED TO A SINGLE PROJECT SPONSOR WITH,  
9 YOU KNOW, ALTERNATIVE FUNDS, FOR LACK OF A BETTER TERM, THAT'S  
10 AT THEIR DISPOSAL BUT THAT THIS IS DRAWING ON A REGIONAL  
11 PROGRAM. SO THE QUESTION WOULD BECOME HOW WOULD THAT PROGRAM  
12 GET REPLENISHED IF IN A WORST-CASE SCENARIO RM3 IS NOT THERE.  
13 I THINK THE BROAD QUESTION S WE'RE NOT SURE. WE DON'T KNOW.  
14 AND, YOU KNOW, I THINK THE IMPORTANT THING GOING FORWARD IS,  
15 AGAIN, AS THE COMMISSION PROBABLY, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, HAS TO  
16 UNTANGLE ALL OF THE CASCADE OF ISSUES THAT A NON-CONFIRMED RM3  
17 WOULD OUTLINE, ONE OF THEM WOULD BE, YOU KNOW, WHAT OPTIONS  
18 WOULD WE HAVE TO REFRESH A VERY VALUABLE FEDERAL FLEXIBLE  
19 PROGRAM THAT THE REGION HAS PUT IN A LOT OF STOCK IN FRONT OF  
20 DEALING WITH ISSUES. THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS LOOKING WITH A  
21 NEW ADMINISTRATION TO HAVE A MUCH MORE ROBUST PROGRAM OF  
22 FUNDS, INCLUDING, WE'RE ADVOCATING OURSELVES, AS A NUMBER OF  
23 OTHER PARTIES TO HAVE A MUCH HIGHER LIFT IN FTP FUNDS, OR SORT  
24 OF AN EQUIVALENT FLEXIBLE FUNDS COMING OUT OF REAUTHORIZATION,  
25 COMING OUT OF THE FEDERAL STIMULUS, ET CETERA, SO I THINK WITH



April 14, 2021

1 A VERY UNCERTAIN FUTURE ATTACHED TO THIS THAT COULD BE ONE  
2 PLACE TO RECONCILE THE OUTCOME OF AN RM3, BUT I THINK THE  
3 SHORT ANSWER IS, IT'S UNCLEAR, AND AGAIN, JUST REPRESENTS THE  
4 AT-RISK SITUATION THAT ANY LONP ATTACHED TO THE PROGRAM WOULD  
5 CARRY.

6

7 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO, BUT IT'S A -- IF IT'S A LOAN, WHICH,  
8 IF THAT'S RIGHT THERE, IS A SORT OF -- EVEN IF IT DOESN'T --  
9 THEY'RE NOT GOING TO WANT TO -- THESE ARE SIGNIFICANTLY  
10 REGIONAL PROJECTS, WITH MY PERSPECTIVE AS A COMMISSIONER I  
11 WOULDN'T WANT TO GO INTO A LOAN AND THE PROJECT GOES INTO  
12 BANKRUPTCY OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT, IS THERE A KIND OF  
13 DISCUSSION ABOUT WHAT THE OPTIONS ARE AVAILABLE TO KIND OF, AT  
14 LEAST MAYBE IN PART, TO REPAY THE REGION SOME OF THESE FEDERAL  
15 FLEXIBLE FUNDS?

16

17 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'M GOING TO ASK BRIAN TO SUPPLEMENT WHAT I  
18 SAY. I THINK THE EXPECTATION THAT THERE WOULD BE A DISCUSSION  
19 ABOUT WHAT OPTIONS ARE OUT THERE IS A FAIR ONE, IN TERMS OF A  
20 DISCUSSION, BUT THERE IS -- YOU KNOW, AGAIN, LIKE EVERYTHING  
21 ELSE, THERE IS NO LEGAL DOCUMENT THAT, YOU KNOW, PUSHES THE  
22 PROJECT SPONSOR TO SAY, YOU ARE NOW LEGALLY LIABLE FOR X, Y,  
23 Z. BUT, AGAIN, THAT'S NOT UNCOMMON WITH AN LONP STATION FOR  
24 THESE CIRCUMSTANCES. WHEN WE ENTER INTO AN LONP WITH ANOTHER  
25 PROJECT, THE ALAMEDA CTC, WHICH IS ON THAT LIST OF FIVE, THEY



April 14, 2021

1 HAVE AN LONP WITH THEIRS THAT SAYS WE'RE PUTTING OUR SALES TAX  
2 MONEY UP FRONT AT RISK. THAT'S THE CASE BUT THIS IS A SIMILAR  
3 SITUATION. BRIAN DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT? ^

4

5 **BRYAN ALBEE:** ^

6

7 **BRIAN STANKE:** ^

8

9 **BRIAN MAYHEW:** CONCEPT OF THIS LONP ANTICIPATES THE PROJECT  
10 GETS STUCK, THE PROJECT ITSELF IS AUTHORIZED TO GET ANOTHER  
11 FUNDING SOURCE AND THEN WHEN RM3 IS CLEARED THEN THE PROJECT  
12 ITSELF CAN REPLENISH ITS FUNDING SOURCE THAT IT GOT TO  
13 SUBSTITUTE RM3 THAT'S THE VERY CONCEPT OF LONP. IN THIS SENSE  
14 FEDERAL GRANTS ARE A LOAN IT'S OUR OBLIGATION TO REPLENISH THE  
15 SUBSTITUTE SOURCE IN THIS INSTANCE IT WOULD BE AN MTC FUNDING  
16 SOURCE. IF ON THE OTHER HAND THE RM3 FAILS AND WE DON'T GET  
17 IT. THEN THE ANTICIPATION OF AN LONP IS THAT THE FUNDING  
18 SOURCE IN AND OF ITSELF, THAT THE LOCALS OR IN THIS CASE MTC  
19 PUT ON, IN THE PROJECT, IS AT RISK, AND THAT DECISION HAS BEEN  
20 MADE. THERE ARE NO LOANS. WE DON'T BOOK A RECEIVABLE. WE DON'T  
21 BOOK A LOAN. WE DO BOOK AN AGREEMENT THAT SAYS IF THIS HAPPENS  
22 AND THAT HAPPENS AND THAT HAPPENS, YOU WILL REPLENISH -- YOU  
23 WILL REPLENISH YOUR FUNDING SOURCE. WHETHER IT'S FEDERAL -- IN  
24 THIS INSTANCE, FTA FUNDS, OR IN THE CASE OF LOCAL SALES TAXES,



April 14, 2021

1 WE'RE INDIFFERENT TO THAT IN THE SENSE OF THAT'S WHAT THE LONP  
2 CONTEMPLATES. DID I GET THAT RIGHT?

3

4 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THAT'S HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND. AND I  
5 GUESS MY QUESTION WOULD BE TO COMMISSIONER SPERING OR  
6 COMMISSIONER CONNOLY, WOULD THERE BE OPENNESS TO HAVING THESE  
7 DISCUSSIONS IF RM3 FAILS, WHICH HOPEFULLY IT DOESN'T.

8

9 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. I'LL GO TO  
10 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** FIRST OF ALL, THESE ARE NOT LOCAL PROJECTS.  
13 THESE ARE PROJECTS OF REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE. AND YOU KNOW,  
14 WHAT IS BEING DONE TODAY, HISTORICALLY, MTC HAS DONE THIS. I  
15 MEAN, WE HAVE SENT DISCRETIONARY DOLLARS, MILLIONS OF DOLLARS  
16 TO SAN FRANCISCO, SAN JOSE, OAKLAND, EVERY COUNTY IN THE  
17 REGION AND IT'S AMONG US COMMISSIONERS WE ADVANCE PROJECTS  
18 THAT ARE READY TO GO IT SAVES MILLIONS OF DOLLARS AND MAKES  
19 CAPACITY FOR OTHER JOBS AND FOR SOLANO TO GUARANTEE REPAYMENT  
20 I DON'T THINK IS JUSTIFIED. AND YOU KNOW, IT -- YOU KNOW, THE  
21 LOAN IS AGAINST RM3 BEING APPROVED. IF IT'S APPROVED, THAT'S  
22 FINE. THESE ARE TWO PROJECTS THAT ARE HIGH PRIORITIES FOR THE  
23 CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, CALTRANS, AND AS I SAID,  
24 REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE. AND THEY'RE READY TO GO, A LOT OF  
25 COUNTIES HAVE INVESTED STAFF TIME AND MONEY AND RESOURCES TO



April 14, 2021

1 GET THESE PROJECTS READY TO GO. THIS IS NOT JUST TO SOLANO,  
2 MTC HAS ALWAYS SUPPORTED PROJECTS LOOK AT THE EXPRESS LANES WE  
3 PUT IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, THERE IS NO GUARANTEE OR ANY  
4 REPAYMENT AGREEMENT. I MEAN, WE -- AND I COULD LIST NUMEROUS  
5 PROJECTS GOING BACK. AND MILLIONS OF DOLLARS. YOU LOOK AT  
6 TRANSBAY TERMINAL, THERE IS A CLASSIC EXAMPLE. AND I THINK  
7 IT'S VERY UNREASONABLE TO ASK SOLANO OR MARIN TO SAY YEAH  
8 WE'LL DO THAT. I WILL ASSURE YOU THAT IS WITH ANY OTHER COUNTY  
9 OR ANY OTHER PROJECT THAT BECOMES AVAILABLE AND IS READY TO GO  
10 I HAVE SUPPORTED IT, DAMON HAS SUPPORTED IT, BOTH OUR COUNTIES  
11 HAVE BEEN VERY SUPPORTIVE OF ADVANCING ANY PROJECT THAT'S  
12 READY TO GO. AND SO I'M NOT QUITE SURE WHAT, YOU KNOW,  
13 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IS ASKING FOR, OTHER THAN, YOU KNOW  
14 THIS COMMISSION HAS ALWAYS WORKED TOGETHER TO ADVANCE PROJECTS  
15 AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO DO THAT. BUT TO ASK COUNTIES WITH VERY  
16 LIMITED RESOURCES TO MAKE SOME COMMITMENT TO PAY BACK AND NOT  
17 TO DELIVER FUTURE REGIONAL PROJECTS, YOU KNOW, IT JUST ISN'T  
18 SOMETHING THAT MTC HAS DONE IN THE PAST. THANK YOU MR.  
19 CHAIRMAN.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'LL GO TO VICE CHAIR PAPAN,  
22 AND THEN TO COMMISSIONER CONNOLY.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO  
25 REITERATE WHAT COMMISSIONER SPERING HAD SAID HERE. THE



April 14, 2021

1 IMPORTANCE OF MOVING THESE PROJECTS ALONG, SIGNIFICANT  
2 REGIONAL PROJECTS, IS SO VERY IMPORTANT INTO SAVING MONEY INTO  
3 THE FUTURE. THESE LETTERS OF PREJUDICE HAVE BEEN GIVEN OUT ALL  
4 THE TIME AND THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS COMMISSION IS OUR JOB IS  
5 TO MOVE PROJECTS ALONG SIGNIFICANT PROJECTS WE DO THEM FOR  
6 EVERY JURISDICTION. REGIONAL MEASURE THREE TIED UP IN THE  
7 COURTS, I BELIEVE THAT LIKE EVERY ELECTED PERSON IN THIS  
8 REGION IT'S GOING TO BE SUCCESSFUL THE FUNDS WILL BE RELEASED  
9 THEN WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO FIND FUNDS SOMEWHERE ELSE BUT I  
10 THINK WE NEED TO KEEP THIS PROJECT MOVING.

11

12 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I'M NOT SUGGESTING THAT WE DON'T KEEP  
13 THESE PROJECTS MOVING OF THE I DON'T WANT ANYBODY TO THINK I'M  
14 SAYING THAT. I HOPE I DIDN'T MISINTERPRET WHAT I WAS SAYING.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** AGAIN, I DON'T THINK THAT THIS REPAYMENT  
17 OF LOAN THING HAS COME UP BEFORE.

18

19 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AND I'M ALSO NOT ASKING FOR IT TO BE A  
20 LOAN. I WAS JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND. AND THE ONLY THING I  
21 WOULD BE INTERESTED THIS IS SOMEONE -- IS SOME SORT OF  
22 COMMITMENT THAT WE COULD SIT DOWN AND TALK ABOUT THIS AFTER,  
23 BECAUSE IN MY BRIEFING, YOU KNOW, I DON'T WANT TO -- AND I  
24 UNDERSTAND THAT THERE IS NO MONEY TO REPAY THE REGION ON THIS,  
25 EVEN IF WE WANTED TO. SO I'M NOT ASKING THAT EITHER BECAUSE



April 14, 2021

1 THAT WOULD NOT BE A REASONABLE ASK. SO I DON'T WANT EVERYBODY  
2 TO JUMP ON ME FOR SOMETHING I DIDN'T SAY.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** IT'S A HUGE CONGRESSIONAL FOR SOLANO COUNTY IF WE  
5 WERE TO HAVE THOSE DISCUSSIONS IN THE FUTURE. IT IS GREAT TO  
6 HEAR YOU SUPPORT MOVING AHEAD.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** CONNOLLY?

9

10 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** TO ASSOCIATE WITH THE REMARKS OF COMMISSIONER  
11 SPERING AND PAPAN, MARIN AND SOLANO ARE ALIGNED ON THE  
12 APPROACH, NAMELY TO SUPPORT WHAT SAVVY AND HAS COME FORWARD  
13 WITH, AND REALLY APPRECIATE THE LEVEL OF WORK THAT WENT INTO  
14 IT, AS HAS BEEN SUGGESTED. AND EVERYONE IS WELL AWARE OF, IN  
15 PARTICULAR WITH THE MARIN SONOMA NARROWS PROJECT. THIS PROJECT  
16 HAS BEEN GOING ON FOR A LONG TIME, AND IN FACT IS NEAR THE  
17 FINISH LINE. THIS IS THE FINAL SEGMENT ON THE MARIN SIDE  
18 CALLED B7. IT HAS RECEIVED AN SB1 GRANT, AND AS WE KNOW RM3  
19 FUNDING WHICH WE'RE TALKING ABOUT BACKFILLING NOW. BUT JUST  
20 FOR CONTEXT THE OVERALL PROJECT REPRESENTS OVER 700 MILLION IN  
21 INVESTMENTS ALONG US101. IT COMPLETES A CONTINUOUS CARPOOL  
22 LANE BETWEEN MARIN AND SONOMA COUNTIES. IT'S BEEN A GREAT  
23 PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN MTC, CALTRANS, CTC, AND SONOMA AND MARIN  
24 COUNTIES. B7 ALONE WILL CREATE OVER A THOUSAND JOBS IS WHAT'S  
25 BEING PROJECTED AND AS COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAID, EARLY DELIVERY



April 14, 2021

1 OF SHOVEL READY PROJECTS IS WHAT WE'RE ALL ABOUT AND AS WE ALL  
2 KNOW DELAY OF THESE PROJECTS WOULD BE MORE COSTLY. BOTTOM LINE  
3 IT'S WELL STATED WE'RE TALKING ABOUT A COUPLE OF SITUATIONS  
4 WHERE THE SMALLEST COUNTIES IN THE MTC FAMILY ARE ACTUALLY  
5 PUSHING FOR THE LARGER REGIONAL IMPACT PROJECTS THROUGH THIS.  
6 WE'RE ON BOARD, AS WAS NOTED WITH THE LONP PROCESS. WHAT WE  
7 ARE PUSHING BACK, AGAIN, SO I'LL STATE IT HERE AS PLAINLY AS  
8 POSSIBLE, AND I THINK THIS IS WHERE WE'RE NERVOUS ABOUT  
9 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S DIRECTION IS WE'RE NOT IN A POSITION  
10 TO CONDITION REPAYMENT OF THESE FUNDS IN ANY MANNER IF RM3  
11 GOES DOWN, AND OBVIOUSLY WE'RE ALL HOPING THAT IT DOES NOT.  
12 SO, ANY AMBIGUITY LEAVING ROOM FOR ANY TYPE OF INTERPRETATION  
13 OF CONDITIONING, ACCEPTANCE OF THESE FUNDS ON REPAYMENT,  
14 OUTSIDE OF RM3 IS SOMETHING WE CANNOT AGREE TO.

15

16 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I'LL GO TO  
17 COMMISSIONER WORTH, AND THEN TO OUR CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA.

18

19 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I THINK THAT ONE OF THE  
20 THINGS THAT COVID HAS DONE IS IT HAS POINTED OUT STRUCTURAL  
21 PROBLEMS WE HAVE IN THIS REGION WHICH IS TOWARD WHERE DOLLARS  
22 COME FROM, WHERE THEY GO. WHEN THE CITIES OF CALIFORNIA  
23 DECIDED THEY WEREN'T GOING TO FUND TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS  
24 ANYMORE, THEY SAID WE'LL GIVE YOU THE AUTHORITY TO FUND THEM  
25 WHAT HAPPENED WITH THE 901 COUNTIES AND CITIES IS



April 14, 2021

1 IDENTIFICATION OF PROJECTS WITHIN A LOCAL COUNTY SOME HAVE  
2 EQUITY SOME HAVE A HALF CENT AND THAT'S GOING TO BE EXPIRING  
3 SOON. THE RESIDENTS THAT LIVE IN THOSE COUNTIES ARE NOT  
4 GETTING THEIR FAIR SHARE OF FEDERAL OR STATE DOLLARS BECAUSE  
5 THEY DON'T HAVE THE MATCHES. THEY WILL NEVER HAVE THE MATCHES.  
6 THIS POINTS OUT THE FACT THAT WE HAVE MANY PROJECTS IN OUR  
7 REGION THAT ARE IN FACT REGIONAL THEY HAPPEN TO BE IDENTIFIED  
8 WITH A PARTICULAR PROJECT BUT THE CAPACITY TO SAY TO HOLD  
9 COUNTIES -- SOME COUNTIES ADVERTISE -- SOME COUNTIES HAVE  
10 MONEY, SOME COUNTIES SAY WE HAVE SALES TAX REVENUE WE CAN PUT  
11 ON THE TABLE, OTHERS DON'T. I APPRECIATE STAFF EFFORTS TRYING  
12 TO KEEP THESE PROJECTS MOVING FORWARD BUT I THINK IT  
13 RECOGNIZES THAT THESE ARE REGIONAL PROJECTS, THEY MAY HAVE  
14 LOCAL SPONSORS, BUT IN FACT, WE JUST FINISHED OUR DISCUSSION  
15 OF OUR REGIONAL EXPRESS LANE NETWORK. WE NEED TO COMPLETE  
16 THESE PROJECTS SO WE CAN GET OUR EXPRESS BUSES WORKING  
17 EFFICIENTLY. BUT I DO THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, AND FRANKLY IF  
18 RM2, OR RM3 DOES NOT PASS, THE CONCERNS THAT WE'RE DISCUSSING  
19 TODAY WILL BE MINE OUT IN COMPARISON TO THE CRISIS THAT WE  
20 WILL FACE IN THE REGION WITH THE FUNDING EXPECTATIONS FOR ALL  
21 OF OUR COUNTIES THAT HAVE EXPECTATIONS ABOUT HOW RM3 WILL  
22 ENABLE US TO LEVERAGE DOLLARS FOR PROJECTS IN OUR CORRIDORS.  
23 SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S ALWAYS HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND WHERE  
24 WE ARE AND BE CLEAR ABOUT IT. BUT I WOULD CONCUR THAT, TO  
25 SUPPORT THESE EFFORTS, TO MOVE THIS FORWARD, AND FRANKLY, IF



April 14, 2021

1 RM3 DOES NOT PREVAIL, WE HAVE A MUCH BIGGER CONVERSATION THAT  
2 WE ARE GOING TO HAVE TO HAVE.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. CHAIR PEDROZA?

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT. AND I THINK  
7 COMMISSIONER WORTH FRAMED IT VERY WELL. I THINK THE  
8 CONVERSATION WON'T BE HAD IF RM3 DOES NOT SUCCEED AND IT'S A  
9 BIGGER CONVERSATION THAN I THINK THIS COMMISSION WANTS TO  
10 HAVE. SO I THINK FOR ANYONE WHO IS CONCERNED STAFF HAS  
11 OUTLINED CONCERNS. THAT'S MEMORIALIZED AGAIN IF THE SCENARIO  
12 HAPPENS WITH RM3 DOES NOT SUCCEED. THE CONVERSATION WITH THE  
13 COMMISSIONERS THAT SPOKE ABOUT THESE PROJECTS YOU'RE RIGHT  
14 THEY ARE REGIONAL PROJECTS OF SIGNIFICANCE AND ALSO WHEN WE  
15 WANT TO SEE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND RECOVERY LOOKING AT  
16 INFRASTRUCTURE DOLLARS AS A CATALYST TO CREATE JOBS. DAMON  
17 SAID THEY'RE CREATING 1,000 JOBS THAT'S REAL INVESTMENT TO  
18 COMMUNITIES THAT NEED IT MOST. AND COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ  
19 RAISED A QUESTION OUTLINED IN THE STAFF REPORT AND IF RM3 IS  
20 NOT SUCCESSFUL WE'RE GOING ON TO HAVE THAT CONVERSATION AS A  
21 COMMISSION. I THINK IT'S CRITICAL THAT WE MOVE FORWARD ON  
22 THESE PROJECTS THAT ARE READY. AND I THINK EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
23 THERESE, PROVIDING THE STATUS UPDATE ON RM3 AND WHAT THAT  
24 LOOKS LIKE AND WHERE WE HAVE COMMITTED DOLLARS TO I THINK A  
25 GLOBAL OVERVIEW OF THAT WOULD SERVE OUR COMMISSION WELL BUT



April 14, 2021

1 AGAIN SUPPORTIVE OF SEEING THESE PROJECTS MOVE FORWARD FOR  
2 MULTIPLE REASONS.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER.

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CHAVEZ THANK YOU. AND I KNOW THIS IS A VERY  
7 NERVE TOUCHY SUBJECT, AS I CAN HEAR FROM FOLKS. BUT JUST A  
8 COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS I WANT TO MAKE. ONE IS THAT WE ALL  
9 REFERENCE KIND OF A BIGGER CONVERSATION THAT WE NEED TO HAVE  
10 AND THAT SOUNDS LIKE THAT NEEDS TO BE AGENDAIZED AT ONE OF OUR  
11 COMMITTEES I THINK THE POINT IS WELL TAKEN THAT THERE ARE  
12 CHALLENGES IN THIS AREA THAT WILL BE CHALLENGES WITH MANY  
13 PROGRAMATIC AREAS IN THE COMMUNITY THROUGHOUT THE REGION. I  
14 HOPE WE DO AGENDAIZE IT. THE SECOND POINT FOR US TO THINK  
15 ABOUT ESPECIALLY AS WE HOPE TO GET MORE FEDERAL DOLLARS FOR  
16 PROJECT READY ACTIVITIES OR INFRASTRUCTURE IS TO BETTER  
17 UNDERSTAND HOW WE'RE BOTH PROTECTIVE OF THE AGENCY AND FRANKLY  
18 THE PROJECTS THAT WE'RE ABLE TO FUND. AND AMY, I HAVE SORT OF  
19 A DIFFERENT TAKE ON THE POINT YOU RAISED ABOUT, YOU KNOW, HOW  
20 LOCAL REGIONS ARE ABLE TO OR ARE UNABLE TO MATCH, YOU KNOW TO  
21 MATCH GRANTS, BECAUSE IN SOME AREAS, WE HAVE ELECTORATES THAT  
22 ARE MORE OPEN TO TAXES FOR TRANSPORTATION OTHER ELECTORATES  
23 ARE MORE OPEN TO THAT, AND ONE OF THE CHALLENGES THAT I FIND  
24 MYSELF FOR MY OWN AREAS IS THAT WE HAVE REALLY TAXED OURSELVES  
25 QUITE A LOT FOR TRANSPORTATION. WE ARE SPENDING \$56 MILLION A



April 14, 2021

1 YEAR WITH CALTRAIN IN OUR PARTNERSHIP AND ANOTHER \$50 MILLION  
2 AND WE TOO HAVE A HALF CENT SALES TAX. I THINK THE POINT  
3 YOU'RE RAISING IS ALL OF US HAVE VERY COMPLICATED FUNDING  
4 FRAMEWORKS AND THOSE ARE ALL FRAMEWORKS THAT I THINK THROUGH  
5 THE BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION WE'RE TRYING TO MORE DEEPLY  
6 UNDERSTAND SO WE CAN BETTER FIGURE OUT HOW TO INVEST IN THE  
7 REGIONAL AND MEGA PROJECTS IN AN EFFICIENT WAY. I'M  
8 APPRECIATIVE THAT YOU BROUGHT UP THE POINT, WE NEED TO  
9 AGENDAIZE THE DISCUSSION AND I APPRECIATE THE FRAMEWORK YOU  
10 LAID OUT FOR US, I CAN'T REMEMBER WHAT MEETING THIS WAS IN,  
11 BUT I THOUGHT IT WILL HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND HOW DIFFERENTLY  
12 SITUATED WE ALL ARE, AND THAT WOULD HELP US BE MORE STRATEGIC.  
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS?  
16 I'M NOT SEEING ANY MORE HANDS RAISED. THIS IS NEAR AND DEAR  
17 FOR MYSELF. THIS IS AN EXCELLENT CONVERSATION AND GOOD ONE TO  
18 HAVE. AT SAME TIME THE ISSUE ON WHAT'S LOCAL VERSUS REGIONAL  
19 OBVIOUSLY THIS BOARD IF ANYONE KNOWS THE IMPORTANCE OF THESE  
20 LARGER PROJECTS AND WHILE IT'S LOCALLY SPONSORED IT IS  
21 DEFINITELY REGIONAL. AND IN FACT SOME OF OUR RM3 WERE SHIFTED  
22 TO MARIN TO MAKE SURE WE GET THIS GAPPED CLOSED BECAUSE QUITE  
23 FRANKLY WHILE MARIN IS THE SPONSOR OF THIS PARTICULAR GAP  
24 SONOMA COUNTY AND PARTS OF NORTH WILL BENEFIT EVEN MORE SO.  
25 THERE ARE FEW PEOPLE LIVING IN THAT SECTION OF MARIN COUNTY



April 14, 2021

1 TRYING TO GET THROUGH IT'S THE ONE GAP, THE 700 MILLION PLUS  
2 INCLUDING THE WORK THAT WAS DONE FURTHER NORTH OF SANTA ROSA,  
3 AND OBVIOUSLY 101 IS NOT A MARIN SONOMA HIGHWAY. IT IS A  
4 GATEWAY UP TO THE OREGON BORDER ALONG THE COAST AS IS 80, THE  
5 IMPORTANCE -- I DON'T NEED TO TELL YOU -- GOING EAST. I THINK  
6 IT'S INTERESTING HOW LOCALLY SPONSORED REGIONAL PROJECTS THAT  
7 WE ALL BENEFIT FROM OVER THE COURSE OF TIME HAS KIND OF  
8 EVOLVED INTO WHAT WE HAVE TODAY. I ALSO WANT TO THANK STAFF  
9 FOR THE WORK THAT THEY HAVE DONE IN ORDER TO MAKE THIS HAPPEN  
10 GOING FORWARD. AND I CAN TELL YOU, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, 101, FOR  
11 INSTANCE, IT WASN'T THAT LONG AGO THAT 101 WAS TRULY A HIGHWAY  
12 WITH MULTIPLE DRIVEWAYS, LEFT TURN POCKETS, AND EVERYTHING  
13 ELSE, WHICH IS JUST UNBELIEVABLE TO ME, AND THE AMOUNT OF  
14 TRAFFIC ACCIDENTS THAT IT SAW, AND THE FATALITIES AND THE  
15 INJURIES THAT OCCURRED BECAUSE OF THAT, BECAUSE WE WERE LATE  
16 GETTING THAT IMPROVEMENTS GOING, AND SO NOT ONLY IS IT ADDING  
17 THAT THIRD LANE, TO ME, REALLY ONE OF THE MORE IMPORTANT  
18 THINGS IS THE SAFETY CONSIDERATIONS, AND FIXING THE HORIZONTAL  
19 AND VERTICAL CURVES FOR INSTANCE AND MAKING SURE THE SIGHT  
20 LINES ARE THERE, AND THAT ALL THE ISSUES ARE BROUGHT UP TO  
21 STANDARD. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO THAT, AND I APPRECIATE THE  
22 WORK DONE BY STAFF GOING FORWARD. AND I DO SEE COMMISSIONER  
23 SPERING'S HANDLED UP.  
24



April 14, 2021

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, JUST REAL BRIEFLY. TO  
2 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ'S COMMENTS, IN SOLANO COUNTY WE TRIED  
3 SALES TAX AND MISSED BY 1%. CITIES HAVE COME TOGETHER AND WE  
4 HAVE A FEE ON EVERY STRUCTURE THAT GOES UP IN SOLANO COUNTY TO  
5 THE BOARD OF TRANSPORTATION AND IT DOES A LOT OF COUNTY  
6 PROJECTS THAT TAKES TRAFFIC OFF THE I-880 AND OFF OUR MAJOR  
7 ARTERIALS, AND SONOMA COUNTY IS CONTRIBUTING IN A DIFFERENT  
8 WAY I DON'T WANT TO SET THE IMPRESSION THAT NOBODY'S DOING  
9 ANYTHING IN OUR COUNTY BECAUSE WE ARE WE LEVERAGE EVERY DOLLAR  
10 IN OUR PROJECTS YOU LOOK AT THE TRUCK SCALES AND MANY BENEFITS  
11 FOR THE REGION. IT'S VERY COMPLEX BUT NOT UNUSUAL FOR MTC TO  
12 ADVANCE PROJECTS WITHOUT ANY REAL COMMITMENT TO BE PAID BACK  
13 AND IT'S ALWAYS WORKED OUT. COMMISSIONERS HAVE ALWAYS WORKED  
14 TOGETHER. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAIRMAN.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** COULD I RESPOND TO THAT?

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** SURE.

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** JIM, YOU REINFORCED THE POINT ABOUT HOW  
21 DIFFERENTLY SITUATED WE ALL ARE, AND I THINK THAT'S A REALLY  
22 IMPORTANT ISSUE. BECAUSE THE OTHER THING WE'RE ALL GOING TO  
23 HAVE TO THINK ABOUT IS, WHAT ARE THE NEW WAYS WE'RE GOING TO  
24 HAVE TO APPROACH EACH OF OUR REGIONS TO FURTHER INVESTMENTS  
25 THAT WE KNOW WE NEED TO MAKE. SO I APPRECIATE THE POINT YOU



April 14, 2021

1 RAISED AND THIS ISN'T AN ACCUSATION THAT PEOPLE AREN'T DOING  
2 THEIR FAIR SHARE IT'S JUST RECOGNITION THAT WE'RE ALL  
3 DIFFERENTLY SITUATED.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I AGREE.

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** I APPRECIATE THAT. ANYONE ELSE HAVE  
8 ANYTHING BEFORE WE TURN IT -- NOT SEEING ANY HAND RAISED.  
9 I'LL -- PERHAPS WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT THEN BRING IT BACK  
10 FOR A MOTION. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS  
11 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM INTO THE RECORD. GO AHEAD.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, AND I  
14 DO SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, MR.  
15 ROLAND LEBRUN, WOULD YOU LIKE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, ROLAND LEBRUN. I  
18 PERSONALLY DON'T HAVE -- FIRST OF ALL, I APPRECIATE THE  
19 DISCUSSION THAT JUST TOOK PLACE. AND I DO NOT HAVE ANY  
20 PROBLEMS WITH THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. HOWEVER, I WOULD LIKE  
21 TO ATTRACT YOUR ATTENTION TO AN ITEM IN TABLE ONE. WE SEE  
22 SANTA CLARA US101 AND SOUTH 25 INTERCHANGE WHICH IS BASICALLY  
23 A SMALL CHANGE IN THE LATEST CHAPTER IN OF THE PLANNING  
24 DICHOTOMY. LET ME EXPLAIN WHAT THIS IS ABOUT. STATE ROUTE 25  
25 IS IN SAN BENITO COUNTY NOTHING [INDISCERNIBLE] COUNTY IT'S



April 14, 2021

1 GOING TO BE WINDING IN TWO LANES IN EACH DIRECTION DUMPING  
2 INTO THE TWO LANES OF THE ONE VERY ONE MAKING FOUR LANES OF  
3 TRAFFIC NOW EMPTYING INTO THREE LANES OF 101 TRAFFIC BETWEEN  
4 MORGAN HILL AND GILROY. AND I BROUGHT THIS UP IN PLANNING,  
5 THIS IS PUTTING THE CART BEFORE THE HORSE THERE IS NO WAY WE  
6 CAN DUMP MORE TRAFFIC INTO THE 101 UNTIL WE ADDRESS THE ISSUE  
7 OF THE MISSING HOV LANE, NOT JUST WITHIN MORGAN HILL AND  
8 GILROY BUT WE SHOULD BE GOING ALL THE WAY DOWN TO THIS  
9 INTERCHANGE. LASTLY, THIS COST OF \$55 MILLION IS NEARLY THE  
10 SAME AS THE COST IT WOULD TAKE TO BUILD THE HOV LANES. MY TIME  
11 IS UP, RIGHT? OKAY. SO, LET ME WRAP UP HERE. PLEASE REVISIT  
12 WHAT'S GOING ON DOWN THERE, AND HAVE THE VTA PRIORITIZE THE  
13 PROJECT. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO FURTHER HAND RAISED,  
16 MR. CHAIR.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL BRING IT BACK  
19 TO THIS BODY AND SEE IF THERE IS A MOTION.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** I HAVE --

24

25 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** GLOVER SECOND.



April 14, 2021

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN WITH THE MOTION AND  
3 COMMISSIONER GLOVER WITH THE SECOND. KIMBERLY, ROLL CALL,  
4 PLEASE?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE].

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD CONVERSATION.  
11 ON TO AGENDA ITEM 3B, MTC RESOLUTION 4403 REVISED APPROVES  
12 2021 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM ATP CYCLE FIVE  
13 PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND KARL ANDERSEN IS HERE TO PRESENT THIS  
14 PROJECT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** KARL ANDERSON STAFF ACTION ITEM FOR THE ADOPTION OF  
17 PROJECTS FOR 2021 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM ALSO  
18 KNOWN AS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ACTIVE FORMS OF TRANSPORTATION  
19 LIKE WALKING AND BIKING PROGRAM SLIT INTO STATEWIDE PROGRAM  
20 AND COMPETITIVE PROGRAM REGIONAL COMPETITIVE PROGRAM STATE  
21 APPROVED \$51 MILLION TO 5 PROJECTS IN THE BAY AREA STATEWIDE  
22 PROGRAM 242,000,021% OF THE STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM  
23 SPECIFICALLY WENT TO TWO PROJECTS IN ALAMEDA COUNTY ONE IN  
24 CONTRA COSTA COUNTY ONE IN SANTA CLARA AND ONE IN SOLANO  
25 COUNTY. NEW FOR THE ATP CYCLE FIVE CTC ADOPTED A QUICK BUILD



April 14, 2021

1 PILOT PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AT THE END OF LAST YEAR. CTC AWARDED  
2 2.2 MILLION TO 4 PROJECTS IN THE MTC REGION TOTAL PROGRAM 4.4  
3 MILLION, 50% OF THE TOTAL THERE. WENT TO ONE PROJECT IN  
4 BERKELEY RICHMOND SAN CARLOS AND SAN JOSE. STATEWIDE PROGRAM  
5 OF PROJECTS ARE DETAILED IN ATTACHMENT ONE FOR THE REGIONAL  
6 PROGRAM MTC HAD 37 MILLION AVAILABLE FOR PROGRAMMING MTC  
7 RECEIVED 61 APPLICATIONS REQUESTING 356 MILLION IN RESPONSE TO  
8 THE REGIONAL CALL FOR PROJECTS. TO SCORE THE PROJECTS MTC  
9 ENLISTED A 21 MEMBER MULTI-DISCIPLINARY EVALUATION COMMITTEE  
10 TO SCORE RANGE OF APPLICATION REVIEWING COMMITTEE USED SAME  
11 EVALUATION FORM IN SCORING CRITERIA FOR STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE  
12 PLUS ADDITIONAL TEN MAXIMUM POINTS FOR MTC REGIONAL  
13 PRIORITIES. USING THE CONSENSUS SCORE STAFF USES FUNDING  
14 PROJECTS FOR A TOTAL OF \$37 MILLION. SEVEN OF THE EIGHT  
15 PROJECTS PROPOSED WILL BENEFIT DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES  
16 SPECIFICALLY 96% OF REGIONAL PROGRAM FUNDS EXCEEDING THE 25%  
17 STATE TARGET STAFF RECOMMENDS ADOPTING THE LIST OF PROJECTS  
18 DETAILED IN ATTACHMENT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT ADDITIONAL ITEMS  
19 PROJECTS FOR SFMTA REQUESTING 12 MILLION IN FUNDS HOWEVER ONLY  
20 7 MILLION REMAINED AFTER FUNDING HIGHER SCORING PROJECTS  
21 THEREFORE STAFF RECOMMENDS FUNDING PROJECTS AT \$7 MILLION  
22 SFMTA -- [INDISCERNIBLE] STAFF EXPECTS SFMTA TO DELIVER THE  
23 FULL BENEFIT PROJECTS AS OUTLINED IN THEIR APPLICATION. NEXT I  
24 WANT TO HIGHLIGHT MTC TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM NEW FOR  
25 THIS CYCLE MTC CREATED AN APPLICATION TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE



April 14, 2021

1 PROGRAM TO IMPROVE OVERALL QUALITY AND COMPETITIVENESS OF  
2 APPLICATION FOR THE REGION. MTC STAFF LED PROGRAM SUPPORT FROM  
3 CONSULTANT REVIEWED SEVEN APPLICATIONS ASSESSING OVERALL  
4 QUALITY ELIGIBILITY CONSISTENCY AND TECHNICAL DETAILS STATE  
5 AWARDED FUNDS TO PROJECTS IN THE STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM  
6 AND STAFF RECOMMENDS TWO PROJECTS IN THE REGIONAL PROGRAM.  
7 STAFF WORKING ON NEXT PHASE OF THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE  
8 PROGRAM INCLUDING PROGRAM EVALUATION REPORT AND UPDATE  
9 COMMITTEE. STAFF EXPECTS CYCLE SIX TO BEGIN EARLY NEXT YEAR  
10 WITH THAT STAFF RECOMMENDS 4403 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR  
11 APPROVAL AND DIRECT STAFF TO TRANSMIT RECOMMENDED PROJECT LIST  
12 TO CTC FOR APPROVAL. I IT TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** ANY QUESTIONS FOR STAFF ON THIS  
15 PARTICULAR ITEM? NOT SEEING ANY HAND RAISED. I'LL LOOK TO  
16 COLLEAGUES TO SEE IF THERE IS A MOTION TO APPROVE.

17

18 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** MOVE APPROVAL. CHAVEZ.

19

20 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** SECOND RONEN.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND A  
23 SECOND BY COMMISSIONER RONEN. AND BEFORE WE TAKE OUR VOTE,  
24 I'LL LOOK TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS  
25 PARTICULAR ITEM. MADAM CLERK?



April 14, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
3 HANDS RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS  
4 ITEM.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE].

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE  
11 TO AGENDA ITEM 3C, MTC RESOLUTION 3430 REVISED AND 4431  
12 REVISED ALLOCATES 124 MILLION IN FISCAL YEAR 2020 AND 2021  
13 TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT PDA STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE OR  
14 STA FUNDS TO VARIOUS OPERATORS. WE HAVE TERENCE LEE TO  
15 PRESENT. TERENCE LEE: GOOD MORNING. POLICY PROGRAMS REVISES  
16 MTC RESOLUTIONS 4430 AND \$4,431,124,000,000 FOR FISCAL YEAR  
17 2021 AND DEVELOPMENT TAX FOR STATE TRANSIT, \$47.5 MILLION  
18 INITIAL APPLICATION TO SAMTRANS AND TO TRANSIT OPERATORS IN  
19 ADDITION ALLOCATES \$76 MILLION TO SUPPLEMENTAL TDA FUNDS AND  
20 OPERATORS WERE PREVIOUSLY LIMITED TO 75% OF THE REGIONAL TDA  
21 FORECAST TO ACCOUNT FOR ANTICIPATED PANDEMIC RELATED IMPACTS  
22 HOWEVER AS PART OF THE DEVELOPMENTS OF THE FISCAL YEAR '22  
23 FUND ESTIMATE THE NINE COUNTY AUDITOR OFFICES REVISED FY  
24 '21ESTS OF IT DA REVENUES TO SHOW SUBSTANTIALLY SMALLER  
25 DECREASE SHOWING REVENUES FROM 40 TO 25% AS A RESULT OF THESE



April 14, 2021

1 CHANGES OPERATORS ARE ELIGIBLE TO CLAIM ADDITIONAL FUN IN THE  
2 CURRENT YEAR. STAFF RECOMMENDS REFERRING RESOLUTIONS 4430 AND  
3 4431 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THANK YOU. AND  
4 I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. COMMISSIONERS, ANY  
7 QUESTIONS ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM. DO I WANT SEE ANY HAND  
8 RAISED. PRIOR TO GO TO THE PUBLIC, IS THERE A MOTION APPROVE?

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** MOVE APPROVAL. GLOVER.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SECOND.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER, AND A  
15 SECOND BY?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.  
20 I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED  
21 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM, AND I SEE ONE HAND RAISED AS WELL.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND MR.  
24 LEBRUN HAS HIS HAND RAISED. GO AHEAD MR. LEBRUN.

25



April 14, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO CIRCLE BACK AND TALK ABOUT THE \$45 MILLION  
2 FOR SAMTRANS AND IN ADDITION I WOULD LIKE TO CIRCLE BACK TO  
3 THE DISCUSSION WE HAD ABOUT PLANNING INFRASTRUCTURE BANK. AND  
4 MOVING FORWARD, I ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO COMMUNICATE TO  
5 SAMTRANS THAT THE REGION IS ENTRUSTED IN ACQUIRING THE  
6 DUMBARTON [INDISCERNIBLE] CORRIDOR CAPABLE OF DEVELOPING ON  
7 THEIR OWN AND WHEN THEY COME BACK TO THE COMMISSION BECAUSE  
8 THEY'RE EXPERIENCE SOMETHING KIND OF FUNDING CHALLENGES, WE'RE  
9 HAPPY TO HELP THEM OUT, UP, IF THEY'RE WILLING TO PART WITH  
10 THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR. THANK YOU.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.  
13 I'LL LOOK TO THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE].

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO AGENDA  
20 ITEM 4A, MTC RESOLUTIONS 4456, 57, AND 69 REVISED PROGRAMS  
21 [INDISCERNIBLE] MILL UNTIL FDA FORMULA REVENUES BRIDGE TOLLS  
22 PROJECTS PROPOSED PLAN FOR FINANCING AGAINST FUTURE FTA  
23 REVENUES, AND CRAIG BOSMAN WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

24



April 14, 2021

1 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** PROGRAMMING TRANSIT CAPITAL PROGRAMS AND AS WELL  
2 AS THE FY16 THROUGH 20 PROGRAM PROPOSING 506 MILLION IN  
3 FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION STA FUNDS FOR STATE OF GOOD  
4 REPAIR AND BUS FACILITIES PROGRAMS AS WELL AS COMPLEMENTARY  
5 REGIONAL PRIVILEGE TOLL FUNDS IN FORM 664 PROJECTS. -- -- HAS  
6 BEEN AUTHORIZED BY CALTRANS TO SELECT FUNDING ALLOCATIONS FOR  
7 THE SMALLER URBANIZED AREAS PER CTC COMMISSION ADOPTED IN  
8 JANUARY -- CERTAIN MAINTENANCE AND OPERATING COST. THE  
9 PROPOSED PROGRAM HAS BEEN DEVELOPED BASED ON A CALL FOR  
10 PROJECTS ISSUED BY MTC AND IN COOPERATION WITH TRANSIT  
11 OPERATORS OVER THE LAST SEVERAL MONTHS. PROJECTS WERE INCLUDED  
12 IN THE PROPOSED PROGRAM BASED ON IT. CP POLICY AND URBANIZED  
13 AREA ELIGIBILITY SUBJECT TO FUNDING CONSTRAINTS REFLECTING  
14 COMMISSION PRIORITIES IN PLANNED BAY AREA WITH EMPHASIS ON  
15 VEHICLE REPLACEMENT INFRASTRUCTURE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR AND  
16 PROGRAMMING COVERS MAJOR FUNDING NEEDS FOR SELLER OF THE  
17 BEHAVIOR'S HIGHEST PRIORITY CAPITAL TRANSIT PROJECTS PROVIDES  
18 SUPPORTIVE FLEXIBILITY FOR OPERATORS IN AN UNCERTAIN CLIMATE  
19 AND SUPPORTS THE CHALLENGE GRANT COMMITMENT. MAJOR INVESTMENT  
20 IN THE PROGRAM INCLUDE BART'S RAIL CART REPLACEMENTS SFMTA CAR  
21 REPLACEMENT AND SYSTEMS NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM AND  
22 MAJOR VEHICLE REPLACEMENT PROGRAMS SETTING ASIDE OPERATING  
23 ASSISTANCE. THESE PROGRAMS ARE DESCRIBED IN YOUR MEMO. TO MEET  
24 THE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR NEEDS IN THE REGION OVER THE NEXT  
25 SEVERAL YEARS FINANCING AGAINST FUTURE FTA REVENUES WILL NEED



April 14, 2021

1 TO BE USED MTC HAS REVVED AN ALL RIGHT OF NO PREJUDICE FROM  
2 FDA FOR FINANCING THE BART PROJECTS. [INDISCERNIBLE]. STAFF OF  
3 MTC AND BART ARE IN DISCUSSIONS TO FINALIZE THE FINANCING PLAN  
4 WHICH WILL BE BROUGHT TO YOU FOR CONSIDERATION TO YOU AT A  
5 LATER DATE. CURRENT POLICY INCLUDES ADDITIONAL FLEXIBILITY TOU  
6 FUNDS FOR EMERGE OPERATING RELIEF. HOWEVER, THE THREE RELIEF  
7 FUNDING PACKAGES PASSED BY CONGRESS APPEAR TO HAVE AVOIDED THE  
8 NEED FOR EMERGENCY OPERATING ASSISTANCE VIA TCP FOR THIS YEAR.  
9 THE PROGRAM DOES INCLUDE ADDITIONAL OPERATING ASSISTANCE  
10 FUNDING FOR THREE OPERATORS AS PART OF THE CRRSAA FUND SWAP  
11 APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION LAST MONTH. FOR THE FY17 THROUGH  
12 FY '20 PROGRAM CHANGES INCLUDE A REPROGRAMMING OF \$35 MILLION  
13 FROM DEBT SERVICE SET-ASIDE TO PUT IT DIRECTLY ON THE BART  
14 RAIL CAR REPLACEMENT PROJECT SIMILAR TO THE STRATEGY FOR FY  
15 '21, AND OTHER PROPOSED CHANGES THAT OPERATORS REQUEST AND IN  
16 ACCORDANCE WITH POLICY. STAFF WILL RETURN IN THE FUTURE WITH  
17 PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE PROGRAM AS WELL AS ANY ACTION WITH  
18 FINANCING. STAFF RECOMMENDATION TODAY REFER MTC RESOLUTION  
19 4456, 4457, 4169 REVISED AND 4270 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION  
20 FOR APPROVAL. THANK YOU. I'LL TAKE QUESTIONS.

21  
22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE VICE CHAIR PAPAN HAS HER  
23 HAND UP.



April 14, 2021

1 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THE NEW CARS BUT IS THERE A  
2 PLAN BUILT IN FOR THE OLD CARS WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO BE  
3 STORED? I DON'T EXPECT AN ANSWER NOW BUT I HOPE THAT IS PART  
4 OF THE DISCUSSION AS WE MOVE FORWARD.

5

6 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** I BELIEVE WE HAVE SOME RESEARCH ON THAT AND CAN  
7 PROVIDE THAT INFORMATION TO YOU.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. THANK YOU VERY  
10 MUCH.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. DOES ANYONE ELSE HAVE QUESTIONS OF  
13 STAFF? SEEING NO OTHER HAND RAISED. BEFORE WE GO TO TAKE A  
14 MOTION WHY DON'T WE GO TO PUBLIC COMMENTS. HAVE THERE BEEN ANY  
15 PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM INTO THE  
16 RECORD? AND THEN TO THOSE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I'LL  
17 LOOK TO OUR CLERK.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC  
20 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM AND I DO HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
21 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. FIRST ROLAND LEBRUN. PLEASE UNMUTE  
22 YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. COMMISSIONER PAPAN, WE HAVE GOT  
25 AN EMPTY PARKING LOT NEAR THE RAIL STATION 125 PARKING SPACES



April 14, 2021

1 WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO SEND SOME [INDISCERNIBLE] OUT THERE TO  
2 PROVIDE NEEDED HOUSING. TO THE COMMISSION I'M ASKING FOR A  
3 SMALL CHANGE TO THE [INDISCERNIBLE] ON STAGE FIVE. ON FRIDAY  
4 VTA WILL INTRODUCE THE DRAFT BIENNIAL BUDGET WHICH INCLUDES  
5 THE ELIMINATION OF \$10.8 MILLION ANNUALLY FOR CALTRAIN. I'M  
6 ASKING THAT MTC MAKE CALTRAIN WHOLE BY REDUCING VTA'S REQUEST  
7 BY THE SAME AMOUNT WHILE THE TAXPAYERS OF SANTA CLARA CAN'T  
8 CONTEMPLATE A CLASS ACTION LAWSUIT FOR WHAT THEY -- BASICALLY  
9 GOING TO ASK VTA TO COMPLY FOR WHAT THEY VOTED FOR BACK IN  
10 2,000. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPREE, PLEASE  
13 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR DAVID RABBIT AND MEMBERS. ALETA  
16 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. LOTS OF GOOD THINGS HERE. I DEFINITELY  
17 SUPPORT THE INVESTMENTS IN CLIPPER AND PARTICULATE MACHINE  
18 MAINTENANCE AND VARIOUS OTHER MISCELLANEOUS CAPITAL  
19 IMPROVEMENTS, AND ALSO EMPHASIZING THE IMPORTANCE OF POWER  
20 TRANSIT SET-ASIDE, WE MUST NEVER -- WE MUST NOT SACRIFICE THAT  
21 ONE BIT. BECAUSE PARATRANSIT HELPS A LOT OF PEOPLE. I AM  
22 CONCERNED THAT WHEN I READ ABOUT BUS REPLACEMENT, I SEE AN  
23 ITEM FOR REPLACEMENT OF AC TRANSIT BUSES. IS IT IN THIS PLAN,  
24 WE ARE STILL FUNDING THE PURCHASE OF STRAIGHT DIESEL BUSES. IT  
25 LOOKS LIKE THIS IS IN CONTRADICTION TO THE EVOLVING MINDSET OF



April 14, 2021

1 BUYING ZERO-EMISSION VEHICLES. I CERTAINLY THINK THIS MATTER  
2 SHOULD BE EXAMINED. I THINK THAT EVERYTHING THAT WE SHOULD  
3 SPEND GOING FORWARD SHOULD NOT BE USED TO CONTINUE OPERATING  
4 VEHICLES THAT YOU USE STRAIGHT PETROLEUM DIESEL. I COULD LIVE  
5 WITH COMPRESSED NATURAL GAS, OR A RENEWABLE DIESEL PROJECT. SO  
6 I HOPE THAT'S NOT AN OVERSIGHT HERE. BUT AS WE LOOK AT THESE  
7 GRANTS, WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT ALL OF OUR PURCHASES AND  
8 ALLOTMENTS ARE GOING FOR PRODUCTS AND SERVICES THAT ARE  
9 CLIMATE FORWARD. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED FROM THE  
12 PUBLIC, AND WE DO HAVE SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS WITH THEIR HAND  
13 RAISED.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HAD THREE, NOW I HAVE TWO. I  
16 ASSUME THAT ONE WENT DOWN ON PURPOSE. AND FIRST UP IS  
17 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

18

19 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU ALETA, FOR THOSE COMMENTS. I  
20 WAS JUST WONDERING IF WE HAD A SORT OF A PLAN FOR HOW TO --  
21 HOW TO HELP OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES TRANSITION TO ALL ELECTRIC  
22 FLEETS, IN COMPLIANCE WITH SORT OF STATE REGULATION? AND --

23



April 14, 2021

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THIS IS THERESA FROM MTC'S POLICY AND PROGRAM  
2 SECTION. I THINK YOU WERE FINISHED WITH YOUR QUESTION,  
3 COMMISSIONER?

4

5 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

6

7 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WE ARE LOOKING AT AND STUDYING THE QUESTION  
8 OF CONVERTING THE FLEET AS REQUIRED BY LAW. IT IS A  
9 SIGNIFICANT COST ASSOCIATED WITH THAT, AN INCREMENTAL COST  
10 ABOVE AND BEYOND REPLACEMENT OF VEHICLES AT THE ENDS OF THEIR  
11 USEFUL LIFE. WE HAVE STAFF WORKING ON QUANTIFYING WHAT THAT  
12 COST WILL BE AND WE'LL FURTHER WORK TOWARD THE PLAN FOR COST  
13 FOR THAT.

14

15 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I UNDERSTAND IT'S AN INFRASTRUCTURE PLAN  
16 AND TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE FACING THIS ALL OVER THE COUNTRY IT'S  
17 A BIG MASSIVE PRIORITY AND COST FOR SFTA AS WELL. SO I  
18 APPRECIATE IF THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO BRING THAT BACK SO  
19 THERE'S MORE THINKING ABOUT THAT TO GRAB WELL IT COLLECTIVE.  
20 IF WE DO IT INDIVIDUALLY WE'LL DO IT ONE WAY AND IF WE PUT OUR  
21 HEADS TOGETHER WE MIGHT DO IT DIFFERENTLY.

22

23 **THERESA ROMMELL:** GREAT.

24

25 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?



April 14, 2021

1

2 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR RAISING THIS  
3 ISSUE. I RECOGNIZE IT. I SIT ON A TRANSIT BOARD AS WELL AS ON  
4 THIS COMMISSION SO WE HAVE HAD A LOT OF DISCUSSIONS ABOUT THIS  
5 VERY ISSUE. FIRST I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT AC TRANSIT HAS BEEN  
6 ONE OF THE EARLY LEADER IN TERMS OF UTILIZING FUNDS TO DEVELOP  
7 ALTERNATIVE FUEL OPTIONS FOR TRANSIT. SO, BUT THE -- SO THEY  
8 HAVE, YOU KNOW, THE HYDROGEN BUSES, AND THE OTHER WAYS THAT WE  
9 CAN FUND NON--- YOU KNOW, EMISSIONS FOSSIL FUEL  
10 TRANSPORTATION. YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S AN EXCELLENT IDEA AND  
11 SUGGESTION OF VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZES THAT WE DO LOOK AT THIS  
12 COMPREHENSIVELY. BECAUSE THE CHALLENGE IS -- AND I HAVE SPENT  
13 A LOT OF TIME TALKING ABOUT PEOPLE IN THE ENERGY FIELD -- IS  
14 THAT WE DO HAVE A STATE MANDATE. HOWEVER, YOU KNOW, WE ALSO  
15 HAVE A RESPONSIBILITY TO DELIVER RELIABLE TRANSIT. UPHILLS,  
16 DOWN HILLS, OVER THE BRIDGE, IN NEIGHBORHOODS, ON A WIDE  
17 VARIETY. AC IS PROBABLY A GREAT EXAMPLE OF THE TRANSIT  
18 FACILITY ALONG WITH COUNTY CONNECTION WHERE THEY DELIVER  
19 SERVICES THAT HAVE TO BE RELIABLE. WE HAVE HAD THE EXPERIENCE  
20 OF HAVING AN ELECTRONIC TROLLEY IN OUR SERVICE AND WE HAVE  
21 LEARNED FIRSTHAND SOME OF THE CHALLENGES IN WORKING WITH  
22 TECHNOLOGY MAKING NEW ENERGY TRANSIT BUSES WORK. THAT BEING  
23 SAID, I THINK THAT CALIFORNIA HAS TO REALLY FACE THIS ISSUE OF  
24 PROVIDING THE POWER FOR THIS. YOU KNOW, I KNOW BUS COMPANIES  
25 ARE WORKING ON DEVELOPING TECHNOLOGY SO THESE VEHICLES WILL BE



April 14, 2021

1 AVAILABLE. I KNOW MOST OF OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE LOOKING AT  
2 PHASING IN NON-DIESEL. BUT IT'S REALLY A HYBRID. SO THERE IS A  
3 COMBINATION OF -- YOU KNOW, A BALANCE THAT CAN BE PROVIDED IN  
4 THIS EARLY PERIOD. BUT I THINK WE AS A REGION REALLY HAVE TO  
5 GRAPPLE WITH THE FUNDING. BECAUSE AT THIS POINT THERE IS NO  
6 FUNDING ALLOCATED TO, NOT ONLY PRODUCE ADDITIONAL POWER, BUT  
7 ALSO TO DELIVER THE POWER. SO THE INFRASTRUCTURE THAT'S  
8 REQUIRED, YOU KNOW, TO HAVE THOSE INDUCTION CHARGING STATIONS,  
9 OR TO DEVELOP THE ABILITY TO UTILIZE HYDROGEN AND SOME OF THE  
10 OTHER TOOLS THAT ARE USED. SO, I THINK IT WOULD BE AN  
11 EXCELLENT IDEA. BECAUSE THESE TRANSIT -- OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS  
12 ARE LOOKING AT THIS FUTURE -- THESE GOALS, AND THESE  
13 REQUIREMENTS, BUT WE AS A REGION HAVE TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER  
14 THE ENERGY TO THESE BUSES SO THAT THEY CAN OPERATE IN  
15 ACCORDANCE WITH THESE GOALS, WHICH ARE VERY IMPORTANT. AND IT  
16 IS VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE MOVE TO NON-FOSSIL FUEL VEHICLES.  
17 BUT WE HAVE TO REALLY BE CANDID AND FORTH RIGHT AND FORWARD  
18 LOOKING ABOUT HOW WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT FROM A FINANCIAL  
19 STANDPOINT.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE  
22 THAT. VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. I AGREE WITH  
25 WORTH THIS IS THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS I THINK WE NEED



April 14, 2021

1 TO SHIFT OUR FOCUS TO PURSUING JUST THAT. MY JURISDICTION HAD  
2 ONE HYDROGEN VEHICLE. IT'S OUTRAGEOUSLY EXPENSIVE AND FOR, TO  
3 REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES, I KNOW WE'RE ARE ALSO LOOKING AT THE  
4 INFRASTRUCTURE COST, AND COMPLETELY ELECTRIFYING. SO I THINK  
5 THAT'S A MOVE THAT WE SHOULD, THIS COMMITTEE SHOULD REALLY  
6 TAKE A HARD LOOK AT SO WE CAN GET GOING RIGHT IN THE RIGHT  
7 DIRECTION INSTEAD OF SPENDING FUNDS THAT MAY NOT BE AS  
8 BENEFICIAL FOR AIR QUALITY AND THE MOVEMENT OF PEOPLE, SOONER  
9 RATHER THAN LATER. AS A SECONDARY NOTE THERE WAS AN  
10 INTERESTING COMMENT ON REDUCTION TO CALTRAIN. IF I COULD GET  
11 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON THAT IN A FUTURE DATE, I WOULD  
12 APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU.

13  
14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I ALSO APPRECIATE IT. I, LIKE  
15 YOU SIT ON OTHER BOARDS AND THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT  
16 INVOLVED WITH GOING ELECTRIC ON THE BUSES ALSO QUITE FRANKLY  
17 NOT NECESSARILY A ONE FOR ONE REPLACEMENT IN TERMS OF THE  
18 BELIEVE ABILITIES, AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE'RE ALL  
19 GRAPPLING WITH AS WELL. THE SOONER WE CAN HAVE CONVERSATION  
20 THE MORE UNIFORM WE COULD BE THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA AND  
21 BETTER OFF. I WILL ASK IF THERE IS A MOTION AND SECOND FOR  
22 ITEM 4A?

23  
24 **AMY R. WORTH:** I'LL MOVE THE MOTION. COMMISSIONER WORTH.



April 14, 2021

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION BY WORTH AND SECOND BY?

2

3 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CHAVEZ.

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MADAM CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE].

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO AGENDA

12 ITEM 5A CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION CTC ASK STATE

13 FUNDING PROGRAMS UPDATE, AND WE HAVE KENNETH KAO BACK WITH US

14 AGAIN. KENNETH?

15

16 **KENNETH KAO:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBIT. INFORMATION FOR THE CTC

17 UPDATE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION FOR MARCH AND

18 COVERING A FEW ITEMS. FIRST I WANT TO MENTION THE COVID RELIEF

19 FUNDS CRRSAA CTC DID APPROVE AS I MENTIONED 40% OF THE 912

20 MILLION GOING TO THE REGIONS SPLIT BETWEEN STPG AND THE STIP.

21 THAT TRANSLATES TO ABOUT 65 AND A HALF MILLION TO THE REGION.

22 SO ABOUT 30.9 MILLION TO THE STIP AND 34.6 MILLION TO THE

23 SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM FORMULA. MTC STAFF

24 WILL BE RETURNING TO THIS COMMITTEE IN MAY WITH FURTHER

25 RECOMMENDATIONS ON THOSE FUNDS. WE ALSO APPROVED THE ACTIVE



April 14, 2021

1 TRANSPORTATION STATEWIDE COMPONENT COVERED EARLIER INCLUDED 51  
2 MILLION FOR PROJECTS IN THE REGION AS WELL AS PREVIOUSLY FOR  
3 QUICK BUILD PROJECTS. SO DEFINITELY SOME GREAT NEWS THERE FOR  
4 OUR REGIONAL PROJECTS. CTC AND ALSO RECEIVED UPDATES FROM  
5 CALTRANS AND THE CALIFORNIA STATE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY ABOUT  
6 SOME OF THE STATE MANNING DOCUMENTS AND POLICIES. A NUMBER OF  
7 ONE OF WHICH WAS THE DRAFT CLIMATE ACTION PLAN FOR  
8 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE OR CAPTI SETTING PRIORITIZE  
9 PRINCIPLES FOR STATE FUNDING PROGRAMS TO MEET THE STATEWIDE  
10 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGETS AND MTC STAFF WILL  
11 BE PRESENTING AN ITEM ON CAPTI TO THE PARTNERSHIP BOARD LATER  
12 THIS MONTH. FINALLY I DID WANT TO MENTION THAT THE GOVERNOR  
13 DID APPOINT GRISBY TO CTC LAST MONTH CREATING A VACANCY BY  
14 RETIREMENT. WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. THE  
15 NEXT CTC MEETING WILL BE ONLINE SCHEDULED FOR MAY 12TH AND  
16 13TH.

17  
18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANY QUESTIONS  
19 FOR KENNETH ON THAT ITEM? NOT SEEING ANY. THAT WAS  
20 INFORMATIONS. I'LL GO TO MADAM CLERK TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY  
21 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT WANTS TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

22  
23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND I  
24 SEE NO HANDS RAISED.



April 14, 2021

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AGENDA ITEM SIX PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK  
2 THE CLERK TO READ THE NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL  
3 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS REVEREND AT INFO BAYAREAMETRO.GOV, TO  
4 BE READ INTO THE RECORD ALSO ASK IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE  
5 PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE TO SPEAK ON GENERAL  
6 PUBLIC COMMENT.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I DID NOT RECEIVE ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC  
9 COMMENT FOR GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF  
10 THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. MADDIE GRACE, PLEASE RAISE  
11 YOUR HAND. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS MADI REPRESENTING THE  
14 PEOPLE'S ALLIANCE AND I WAS LOOKING FORWARD TO ATTENDING THIS  
15 MEETING LIKE MANY RESIDENTS AND TRANSIT USERS IN THE BAY AREA  
16 I HAVE BEEN CONCERNED ABOUT THE STATE OF TRANSIT IN THE BAY.  
17 SERVICE IS DOWN AND RIDERSHIP IS REDUCED NOT A WHOLE LOT  
18 REDUCED AND EVEN IF THINGS START TO REOPEN AND PEOPLE DO HAVE  
19 RELIABLE SERVICE TO GET ON WITH THEIR LIVES AS YOU KNOW  
20 PRESIDENT BIDEN PASSED THE AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN ALLOCATING AN  
21 ENORMOUS AMOUNT NEARLY \$2 BILLION TO VARIOUS TRANSIT AGENCIES  
22 INCLUDING MTC THIS IS GREAT NEWS ESPECIALLY WITH AGENCIES  
23 CURRENTLY PLANNING THEIR BUDGETS FOR THE NEXT YEAR. SO I WAS  
24 HOPING TO HEAR HOW MTC WILL BE USE THEIR PORTION OF THAT HUGE  
25 SUM TO HELP MITIGATE THE DAMAGE OF COVID AND TO BEGIN TO HEAL



April 14, 2021

1 OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM BUT WHEN I LOOKED AT THE AGENDA FOR THE  
2 MEETING I WAS SHOCKED TO SEE THERE WAS NO ITEM WHATSOEVER  
3 DISCUSSING THIS IMPORTANT ISSUE AND I DID LOOK AT OTHER  
4 MEETINGS TO MAKE SURE YOU HADN'T MISSED SOMETHING. AS I  
5 MENTIONED TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE SETTING THEIR BUDGET IN JUNE.  
6 AND IN ORDER TO DO SO THEY NEED TO KNOW HOW MUCH FUNDING THEY  
7 HAVE TO WORK WITH. GIVEN IT'S APRIL THIS IS THE RIGHT TIME TO  
8 DISCUSS THIS CRITICAL ISSUE AND ALLOCATION AMOUNTS WOULD BE  
9 TODAY. I'M OUT OF TIME? WHY IS THERE NOTHING ON THE AGENDA  
10 REGARDING THIS ESSENTIAL FUNDING WHICH MTC EFFECTIVELY HAS  
11 RIGHT NOW. WHAT'S JUSTIFICATION FOR NEGLECTING TO TAKE  
12 IMMEDIATE ACTION ON THIS CRITICAL ISSUE. AND SECONDLY, WHEN IS  
13 THE MTC PLANNING TO DISCUSS AND ALLOCATE THESE FUNDS? THANK  
14 YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ALETA  
17 DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR DAVID RABBIT, AND MEMBERS. ALETA  
20 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. GOOD MEETING LOTS OF STUFF GOING ON. I  
21 TEND TO LOOK AT THE WORK OF THIS COMMITTEE AND MTC IN GENERAL  
22 AS AN ORDINARY USER OF TRANSPORTATION AND OTHER SERVICES. ME  
23 NOT HAVING A CAR GIVES ME A LOT OF BENEFIT. IT SAVES ME \$700 A  
24 MONTH. BUT, I ALSO NEED TO HAVE THE SERVICES TO REPLACE THAT.  
25 AND CLIMATE WORK IS VERY IMPORTANT. IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT SAVING



April 14, 2021

1 GREENHOUSE -- CUTTING OUT GREENHOUSE GASSES BUT PARTICULATES.  
2 I KNOW WHAT IT'S LIKE TO BREATHE BAD AIR. SO I TEND TO BE  
3 ASPIRATIONAL MY IDEAS FOR ELECTRIC BUSES FIXING OUR TRAIN  
4 SYSTEMS AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT IMPROVEMENTS SUCH AS  
5 UPGRADING STATIONS AND BUS STOPS. THOSE ARE ALL THINGS THAT  
6 ARE NEAR AND DEAR TO ME. CLIPPER AND OPEN PAYMENTS ARE CLIMATE  
7 FORWARD BECAUSE THEN YOU DON'T HAVE TO CARRY AROUND A DUFFLE  
8 BAG OF MONEY IN TRUCKS THAT HAVE TO BE HEAVILY SECURED. ALL OF  
9 THESE THINGS, I BELIEVE, ARE EQUITY FORWARD. BECAUSE THE WAY  
10 WE HELP PEOPLE IS THROUGH INCLUSION AND THE BENEFITS OF THE  
11 FUTURE, INSTEAD OF HANGING ON TO THINGS OF THE PAST. I LOOK  
12 FORWARD TO THE NEXT MEETING. LET'S CONTINUE TO BE ASPIRATIONAL  
13 IN OUR WORK AND HOW WE ALLOCATE. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ANDRE LO.  
16 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS ANDREA PART OF EAST BAY DSA AND  
19 PEOPLE'S TRANSIT ALLIANCE. I'M HERE TO ASK WHY THERE ISN'T AN  
20 AGENDA ITEM RELATED TO THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE AMERICAN RESCUE  
21 PLAN FUNDS. IT SEEMS THERE HAS BEEN A BIT OF PATTERN ON MTC  
22 INSTALLING ON DISTRIBUTING MONEY GIVEN BY THE FEDERAL  
23 GOVERNMENT. AND I BELIEVE IT'S IMPORTANT TO RELEASE THESE  
24 FUNDS QUICKLY BECAUSE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE HESITANT TO RESTORE  
25 SERVICE UNTIL THEY KNOW WHEN MONEY WILL IN. IT'S CRUCIAL TO



April 14, 2021

1 RESTORE SERVICE AS SOON AS POSSIBLE THE TRANSIT AGENCIES MAY  
2 LOUIS RIDERS PERMANENTLY WHEN SERVICE IS UNAVAILABLE. AC  
3 TRANSIT PLANS TO WAIT UNTIL 2022 TO FULLY RECOVER SERVICE  
4 WHICH IS TOO LONG FOR PEOPLE WHO RELY ON THE BUS SYSTEM RIGHT  
5 NOW PEOPLE ARE BEING PASSED UP REPORTS OF OVERCROWDING. GIVING  
6 THE IMPRESSION THAT AC TRANSIT IS NOT RELIABLE. WE DON'T WANT  
7 TO GIVE THE PUBLIC THE MESSAGE THAT TRANSPORTATION WON'T BE  
8 THERE AFTER THE PANDEMIC GOES AWAY. LAST POINT I WANT TO MAKE  
9 IS THAT A BIG PART OF MTC PLATFORM IS CONCERNED WITH EQUITY  
10 AND WHEN PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS NOT AVAILABLE IT HURTS  
11 ESSENTIAL WORKERS AND LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES WHO DON'T HAVE  
12 MEANS TO TRAVEL BY CAR THE MOST. THAT COULD LEAD TO  
13 INEQUITABLE TABLE SYSTEM. I HOPE YOU'LL RELEASE FUNDS AS SOON  
14 AS POSSIBLE SO THEY CAN BE INCLUDED IN THE BUDGET FOR THE  
15 COMING NEAR. THANK YOU.

16  
17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS WHITLOW.

18  
19 **SPEAKER:** NAME IS NATHAN SPEAKING WITH EAST BAY DSA AND  
20 PEOPLE'S TRANSIT ALLIANCE FOR TWO WEEKS NOW I HAVE BEEN  
21 REFRESHING THE MTC WEB SITE AND BROWSER WAITING FOR  
22 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS MEET AGENDA BEING RELEASED THERE  
23 IS A LOT OF DISCUSSION ABOUT HOW THE \$1.67 BILLION IN TRANSIT  
24 SPECIFIC MONEY FOR TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA IS GOING TO BE  
25 ALLOCATED GIVEN THAT AGENCIES ARE PLANNING BUDGETS FOR



April 14, 2021

1 UPcoming FISCAL YEAR THIS COMING JUNE THIS IS THE MEETING  
2 WHERE THAT MONEY WAS TO BE PROGRAMMED OAR AT THE LEAST  
3 DISCUSSED UPON READING THE AGENDA I WAS SURPRISED TO NOT FIND  
4 A SINGLE ITEM THAT ALLOWED FOR DISCUSSION OF HOW THE ARP MONEY  
5 IS GOING TO BE DISTRIBUTED I HAVE NO IDEA HOW TRANSIT AGENCIES  
6 ARE SUPPOSED TO CONSIDER SIGNIFICANT SOURCE OF FUNDING IN  
7 THEIR BUDGET FOR THE UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR IF THE AGENCY IS NOT  
8 DISCLOSING DISCUSSION ABOUT THIS MONEY IF YOU'RE NOT PLANNING  
9 TO DO SOMETHING WITH THIS MONEY TO LAO TRANSIT AGENCIES TO  
10 KNOW HOW THEY'RE GOING TO USE IT WHAT'S THE POINT OF THIS  
11 COMMITTEE. YOU'RE TASKED WITH PROVIDING EFFECTIVE TRANSIT IN  
12 THE BAY AREA AND SHOULD BE TAKING THE POSITION OF LEADERSHIP.  
13 THIS COMMITTEE'S LACK OF TRANSPARENCY AROUND THIS ISSUE ASKS A  
14 QUESTION, ARE YOU -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THE TRANSIT AGENCIES NEED  
15 MONEY TO HIRE OPERATORS, AND THE SIGNIFICANT SOURCE OF MONEY  
16 IS INTENDED TO BE USED FOR THIS. IF THERE IS ANY WAY TO CAUSE  
17 PERMANENT DAMAGE TO YOUR BAY AREA TRANSIT SYSTEM NOT TALKING  
18 ABOUT ARP APPLICATION IN THE PROGRAMMING ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE  
19 -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WOULD BE A SUPER EFFECTIVE WAY TO DO IT.  
20 THE COMMITTEE'S SILENCE ON THIS COMMITTEE IS SCREECHING LOUD -  
21 - [INDISCERNIBLE] I URGE YOU TO ALLOCATE THE FUNDS AS SOON AS  
22 POSSIBLE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.  
23  
24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT CALLER IS 5555, PLEASE UNMUTE  
25 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.



April 14, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I WANT TO ASK THE COMMISSION AT WHAT POINT ARE  
3 WE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT VALUE RECAPTURE. WE INVEST IN ALL  
4 THESE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROPERTY OWNERS CONTINUE TO  
5 MAKE MONEY AND THE PUBLIC IS SUBSIDIZING THAT. WE NEED TO LOOK  
6 AT THAT AS A SOURCE OF REVENUE VALUE RECAPTURE WE GET TEN  
7 TIMES RESULTS FROM THE TRANSPORTATION -- AND WE COULDN'T ASK  
8 FOR 20% OF IT BACK. I THINK THAT'S WRONG. SO WE NEED TO LOOK  
9 AT THAT AS A SOURCE OF FUNDING. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS,  
12 MR. CHAIR.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BEFORE WE ADJOURN, I  
15 WILL ASK OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR IF SHE WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT  
16 REGARDING THE TIMING OF THE DISCUSSION OF THE ARP? AND PERHAPS  
17 ALSO I CAN ADD, AS SOMEONE ON A REGIONAL BOARD, I CAN TELL YOU  
18 THAT, NO WE'RE NOT LOOKING FOR THE ARP TO BALANCE OUR BUDGET  
19 IN THIS NEXT FISCAL YEAR. THAT WOULD BE BEYOND AND I THINK  
20 THAT'S PROBABLY THE CASE FOR MANY REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION  
21 AGENCIES. DIRECTOR MCMILLAN?

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. AND YES, I THINK IT'S  
24 IMPORTANT TO RESPOND TO THE QUESTIONS THAT WERE RAISED. YOU  
25 KNOW, IMPORTANTLY FOR THE SPEAKERS, JUST LAST MONTH, THE --



April 14, 2021

1 THIS COMMISSION PROGRAMMED THE VAST MAJORITY OF THE CRRSAA  
2 FUNDS, WHICH WAS THE SECOND WAVE OF THE COVID MONEY WHICH  
3 TOTALLED ALMOST A BILLION DOLLARS TO THE REGION. AS PART OF  
4 THE LENGTHY DISCUSSION WE HIGHLIGHTED THE WORK THAT WE HAVE  
5 BEEN PURSUING WITH ALL OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS TO UNDERSTAND  
6 WHAT THEIR NEEDS ARE, AND HOW THEIR NEEDS TRANSLATE INTO THE  
7 DISTRIBUTION OF THE FUNDS. IN FACT THIS COMMISSION HAS HAD  
8 FRONT AND CENTER, OF THE DISTRIBUTION OF THESE CRITICAL  
9 FEDERAL DOLLARS COMING FROM THE COMMISSION ON AN ONGOING BASIS  
10 SO CONTRARY TO THE REPRESENTATION THAT WE HAVE BEEN LAGGING,  
11 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING VERY CLOSELY WITH ALL OF OUR TRANSIT  
12 OPERATORS AND WORKING WITH THEM AND UNDERSTANDING HOW THEIR  
13 NEEDS GOING FORWARD NEED TO BE REFLECTED. IMPORTANTLY ARP  
14 FUNDS OR THIRD WAVE OF COVID RELIEF IS ON THE LINE OF  
15 CONTINUING THE SPECTRUM OF HOW WE CAN WORK WITH THE TRANSIT  
16 AGENCIES, AND IMPORTANTLY THE TRANSIT COMMUNITY TO IDENTIFY  
17 GOING FORWARD HOW THE EMERGING OF RECOVERY TRANSIT SERVICE CAN  
18 BE REFLECTED AND SUPPORTED. SO IT'S OUR PLAN TO BEGIN THAT  
19 DISCUSSION AS AN ARP AS A CONTINUUM OF THE CAPACITY THAT THE  
20 COMMISSION JUST RELEASED FORWARD WITH THE CRRSAA MONEY -- TOO  
21 MANY ACRONYMS. OR THAT SECOND WAVE, NEXT MONTH. AND IN THE  
22 SUBSEQUENT MONTHS, SO IN MAY AND JUNE, WE WILL BE FRAMING UP  
23 THE PROCESS BY WHICH WE WILL BE CONSIDERING THIS 1.7 BILLION,  
24 ROUGHLY, THAT THE REGION HAS ANTICIPATED TO RECEIVE.  
25 IMPORTANTLY, TO THE PATCH, CHAIR, DAVID RABBIT'S OBSERVATION,



April 14, 2021

1 IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE THOUGHTFULLY CONSIDER HOW THESE  
2 FUNDS, NOT ONLY CARRY AND SUSTAIN OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES INTO  
3 THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR, AND AGAIN WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH THEM  
4 NON-STOP ON GETTING IMPORTANT INFORMATION IN THAT REGARD, BUT  
5 BEYOND THAT, AS WELL. THIS COULD BE, YOU KNOW, FOR THE  
6 FORESEEABLE FUTURE, THE LAST MAJOR INFUSION OF FEDERAL  
7 OPERATING ASSISTANCE TO OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS COMING OUT OF  
8 THIS. TO BE PERFECTLY HONEST, THE BIDEN HARRIS ADMINISTRATION  
9 IS TO BE COMMENDED FOR THE EXTRAORDINARY EFFORTS THEY LED WITH  
10 CONGRESS TO MAKING THESE FUNDS AVAILABLE AT ALL. SO IT IS  
11 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT THAT WE CAREFULLY CONSIDER HOW BEST TO USE  
12 THESE FUNDS TO NOT ONLY ESTABLISH CRITICAL INCREASES IN  
13 TRANSIT SERVICE, BUT TO SUSTAIN THEM GOING FORWARD. AND THAT'S  
14 SOMETHING THAT REQUIRES A LOT OF CAREFUL THOUGHT,  
15 DELIBERATION, AND COORDINATION WITH OUR TRANSIT PARTNERS. AND  
16 WE LOOK FORWARD TO BRINGING TO THE COMMISSION NEXT MONTH THE  
17 LAUNCH OF THAT DISCUSSION. THANKS.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GLAD YOU  
20 MADE MENTION OF THAT. IN FACT THERE HAS BEEN NO SLOW WALKING  
21 OR LAGGING. AND I WOULD SAY THAT MTC STEPPED UP, IN THE TRUE-  
22 UP PROCESS, AND ACTUALLY EXPEDITED TO THOSE AGENCIES TO GET  
23 THE DOLLARS IN THEIR HANDS. LIKE I SAID GOING FORWARD OUR  
24 CHALLENGE GOING FORWARD IS WHEN ARE WE GOING TO RETURN BACK TO  
25 NORMAL PRECOVID DAYS AND IN RIDERSHIP AND IN FUNDING SO WE



April 14, 2021

1 HAVE TO DO WHAT IS SUSTAINABLE. AND, AGAIN, AS FOR THE AGENCY  
2 THAT I'M ON, WE HAD 108% OF THE BUDGET RESTORED. SO WE'RE NOT  
3 LOOKING TO -- WE'RE NOT LOOKING FOR THESE DOLLARS TO COME IN  
4 BEFORE OUR BUDGET CYCLE THIS YEAR. BUT WE'RE LOOKING FOR THEM  
5 TO COME IN AS WE GO FORWARD INTO THE NEXT. SO THANK YOU VERY  
6 MUCH ON THAT. AND WITH THAT, IT IS TIME TO ADJOURN. OUR NEXT  
7 MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING  
8 IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY MAY 12TH 9:45 A.M. REMOTELY  
9 BY WEBCAST AS APPROPRIATE DEPENDING ON STATUS OF SHELTER-IN-  
10 PLACE ORDERS WHICH ARE QUICKLY CHANGING BUT UNTIL THEN STAY  
11 SAFE, KEEP YOUR MASK AND WE ARE ADJOURNED. THANK YOU.  
12 [ADJOURNED]  
13



*Broadcasting Government*