

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



February 16, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE**

3 **TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 16, 2021, 1:00 PM**

4

5 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** GOOD AFTERNOON. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE
6 FEBRUARY 16, 2021 FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING TO
7 ORDER. I WOULD LIKE THE BROADCAST TEAM TO ROLL THE
8 ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
9 ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
10 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR, PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER
11 N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT.
12 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR
13 WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER
14 SPEAKERS BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE
15 THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
16 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS
17 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO
18 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING
19 VIA ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE
20 OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
21 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
22 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED
23 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT
24 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC
25 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M.



February 16, 2021

1 YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO
2 THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE
3 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO
4 DO SO, AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
5 UPON THEM ON THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
6 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE THAT THE
7 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE
8 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
9 TO DATE.

10

11 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** MADAM SECRETARY, IF YOU WOULD PLEASE CALL
12 THE ROLL.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. CHAIR HARTNETT?

15

16 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR HURSCH?

19

20 **MICHAEL HURSCH, VICE CHAIR:** PRESENT.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HALLS?

23

24 **DARYL HALLS:** HERE.

25



February 16, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER KRANDA? MEMBER KRANDA IS HERE.

2 MEMBER MCMILLAN?

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MILLER?

7

8 **KATE MILLER:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MULLIGAN?

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** PRESENT.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER POWERS? MEMBER RAMACIER? MEMBER

15 TRAN?

16

17 **EVELYNN TRAN:** FRANKLIN WONG ATTENDING ON BEHALF OF MEMBER

18 TRAN.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** JENNIFER ATTENDING ON BEHALF OF MICHAEL TREE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER TUMLIN? DIANA HAMMONS IS HERE FOR

25 MEMBER TUMLIN. WE HAVE A QUORUM.



February 16, 2021

1

2 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MADAM SECRETARY. I WOULD LIKE,
3 FIRST, TO START WITH AGENDA TWO, MY INTRODUCTORY REMARKS. AND
4 I WOULD LIKE TO THANK YOU AND WELCOME BETH KRANDA OF SOLANO
5 COUNTY TRANSIT AND EVELYNN TRAN OF VTA AS NEW MEMBERS TODAY.
6 AND I'M SURE WE ALL LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU, AS WE
7 HAVE DONE IN THE PAST ON OTHER MATTERS. BUT, THANK YOU FOR
8 YOUR ATTENDANCE, TODAY. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO ADVISE YOU THAT
9 THIS WILL BE MY LAST FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING. I
10 WILL BE, AS YOU KNOW, LEAVING MY RESPONSIBILITIES AT THE
11 AGENCY AS OF APRIL 9TH, AND THE NEXT FARE INTEGRATION TASK
12 FORCE MEETING IS SCHEDULED FOR THEREAFTER, IF THE CURRENT
13 SCHEDULE COMES TO PASS. SO I -- IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE TO WORK
14 WITH ALL OF YOU ON THIS TASK FORCE AND ON OTHER MATTERS, AND I
15 KNOW I'LL BE SEEING MOST YOU AT OTHER MEETINGS IN BETWEEN AND
16 IN ANY CASE I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION AND DUE
17 DILIGENCE ON THIS TASK FORCE I WANT TO THANK PROJECT MANAGERS
18 BILL BACON AND MIKE EISEMAN WHO HAVE DONE A GREAT JOB AND
19 GREAT TO WORK WITH IN THE BACKGROUND, IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE AND
20 I LOOK FORWARD TO WHAT WE LEARN AT TODAY'S MEETING. WITH THAT,
21 WE HAVE QUITE A SUBSTANTIVE AGENDA. AND WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO
22 DO FOR PUBLIC COMMENT IS TO, BECAUSE OF THE EXPECTED NUMBER OF
23 COMMENTERS, AND DISCUSSION THAT I HOPE WILL ENSUE WITH THE
24 TASK FORCE AS WELL AS THE LENGTH OF THE PRESENTATION, I WOULD
25 LIKE TO LIMIT THE PUBLIC COMMENT TO ONE MINUTE PER PERSON. AND



February 16, 2021

1 MADAM SECRETARY, AS WE ARE CALLING ON EITHER TASK FORCE
2 MEMBERS OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME, I
3 WON'T BE ABLE TO SEE ALL THE HANDS UP AND NUMBER, SO I WOULD
4 ASK FOR YOUR HELP AND ASSISTANCE IN THAT REGARD. THAT GETS US
5 TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR, AGENDA ITEM THREE. BEFORE I ASK FOR A
6 MOTION, MADAM CLERK, MADAM SECRETARY DO WE HAVE ANY COMMENTS
7 ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM WE SHOULD MENTION FOR THE RECORD AND
8 DO WE HAVE ANY RAISED HANDS?

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND I HAVE
11 NO HAND RAISED.

12

13 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SECOND.

16

17 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** MOTION BY MULLIGAN AND SECOND BY
18 MCMILLAN. CALL THE ROLL PLEASE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASS UNANIMOUSLY BY
21 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

22

23 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MADAM SECRETARY THAT BRINGS US
24 TO AGENDA ITEM 4A POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION
25 AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION



February 16, 2021

1 SUBCOMMITTEE INTEGRATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE. WE HAVE A WRITTEN
2 SUMMARY FROM PROJECT MANAGERS ADINA LEVIN WILL PRESENT THIS
3 ITEM THIS IS INFORMATION ONLY AND NO ACTION IS REQUIRED TO BE
4 TAKEN BY THE TASK FORCE AT THIS TIME.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ADINA, IF YOU ARE ONE OF THE ATTENDEES,
7 CAN YOU RAISE YOUR VIRTUAL HAND, AND I WILL MOVE YOU OVER? SHE
8 MAY BE HAVING TROUBLE ACCESSING THE UNIQUE THAT WAS SENT TO
9 HER. CAN WE COME BACK TO THIS ITEM?

10

11 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** SURE. MAYBE WE CAN SEE IF THERE IS ANY
12 PUBLIC COMMENT ON IT AT THIS TIME, EITHER RECEIVED IN WRITING
13 OR IF WE HAVE ANY RAISED HANDS.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
16 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
17 HAND RAISED.

18

19 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** OKAY. WE CAN COME BACK TO THIS ITEM. WE
20 HAVE IT IN SUMMARY AND CAN TAKE IT AFTER ITEM FIVE IF MS.
21 LEVIN IS ABLE TO JOIN US. THAT GETS US TO ITEM 5A PROJECT
22 UPDATE AND DISCUSSION OF PROPOSED FARE SCENARIOS FOR A
23 DETAILED ANALYSIS. OUR PROJECT MANAGERS BILL BACON AND MIKE
24 EISEMAN WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. THIS ITEM ALSO IS PRESENTED



February 16, 2021

1 FOR INFORMATION ONLY AND NO ACTION IS REQUIRED OR TO BE TAKEN
2 BY THE TASK FORCE. BILL AND MIKE? TAKE IT AWAY.

3

4 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU CHAIR HARTNETT. CAN EVERYONE HEAR ME
5 OKAY SO, GOOD AFTERNOON TASK FORCE MEMBERS MY NAME IS BILL
6 BACON COPROJECT MANAGER OF MTC AND JOINED BY MICHAEL EISEMAN
7 PROJECT MANAGER FOR BART I WANT TO WELCOME ALL TASK MEMBERS
8 HERE TODAY AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONTINUED INVOLVEMENT IN
9 THIS PROJECT I'M GOING TO COVER THE FIRST HALF OF THE
10 PRESENTATION TODAY AND THEN TURN THE SLIDES OVER TO MIKE. IF
11 YOU CAN BRING UP THE SLIDES, WE CAN GO ON THE NEXT SLIDE,
12 PLEASE. IN TODAY'S PRESENTATION THE PROJECT TEAM IS GOING TO
13 PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF WHERE WE ARE IN THE PROJECT TIMELINE,
14 HOW THE TEAM WENT ABOUT DEVELOPING A LONG LIST OF FARE POLICY
15 CONCEPTS TO CONSIDER FOR FURTHER STUDY AND HOW WE SCREEN DOWN
16 THE LONG LIST TO DEVELOP A SHORT LIST OF POLICY ALTERNATIVES
17 FOR STAFF ANALYSIS THAT'S THE DARK BLUE CIRCLE ON THE RIGHT.
18 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS I MENTIONED, IN A BIT MORE DETAIL WE
19 WANT TO MAKE SURE WHERE WE ARE IN OUR TIMELINE ARE CONSISTENT
20 WITH STAFF EXPECTATIONS AND CONSISTENT WITH DETAIL LATER IN
21 THE PRESENTATION WE'RE SEEKING DIRECTION ABOUT HOW TO PROCEED
22 WITH THE DETAILED BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS OF THE FARE POLICY
23 ALTERNATIVES THAT ARE ON OUR SHORT LIST I ALSO WANT TO CALL TO
24 ATTENTION THE APPENDIX IN THE PRESENTATION WHICH CONTAINS
25 DETAILS TO THE DOCUMENT THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE TIME TO



February 16, 2021

1 GO OVER DURING THIS PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE. OVER THE NEXT
2 COUPLE OF SLIDES I'LL PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF PROJECT TIMELINE
3 AND WHERE WE ARE IN RELATION TO OUR SCOPE OF WORK. NEXT SLIDE.
4 SINCE THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE LAST MET IN EARLY
5 DECEMBER THE PROJECT TEAM HAS BEEN FOCUSED ON REFINING A LIST
6 OF POLICY ALTERNATIVES WHICH WE WILL DISCUSS TODAY. WE ALSO
7 PRESENTED AN OVERVIEW OF THE PROJECT TO THE BLUE RIBBON
8 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE IN JANUARY AND PLAN TO FOCUS OVER
9 THE COMING MONTHS IN DETAILED ANALYSIS OF THE SHORT LIST WITH
10 GOALS OF PRESENTING A DRAFT REPORT TO YOU LATER IN THE SUMMER.
11 NEXT SLIDE. ON THIS SLIDE THE SEVEN MAIN TASK ELEMENTS OF OUR
12 PROJECT SCOPE OF WORK ARE SHOWN ON THE LEFT. WE HIGHLIGHT WHAT
13 WORK HAS BEEN COMPLETE SINCE THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROJECT
14 LAST SPRING DEVELOPMENT OF PROBLEM STATEMENT AND EXISTING
15 CONDITIONS BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS AND CONTINUED EXTENSIVE USER
16 RESEARCH. NEXT SLIDE. THESE FOLLOWING SLIDES ARE GOING TO
17 PROVIDE A REFRESHER OF THE TASK FORCE OF HOW THE TEAM HAS
18 APPROACHED THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE FARE POLICY ALTERNATIVES AND
19 HOW THE ALTERNATIVES WILL BE USED IN FORTHCOMING ANALYSIS.
20 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE CORE OF TODAY'S MEETING IS FOCUSED ON
21 IDENTIFYING A SHORT LIST OF FARE POLICY ALTERNATIVES AND
22 OPTIONS. WHAT THE PROJECT TEAM MEANS BY OPTIONS ARE HIGH LEVEL
23 FARE STRUCTURES THAT FACILITATE COORDINATION, WITHIN EACH OF
24 THE OPTIONS ARE A RANGE OF STILL TO BE DEFINED VARIANCE THAT
25 INCORPORATE DETAILS OF EXACT PRICE AND FARE PRODUCT AND WHAT



February 16, 2021

1 OPERATORS OR GROUPS OF OPERATORS WILL BE COVERED IN DIFFERENT
2 OPTIONS. THE PROJECT TEAM LOOKED AT 23 DIFFERENT HIGH LEFT
3 OPTIONS TO DEVELOP OUR LIST AND THESE INCLUDE DIFFERENT
4 QUADRANTS OF INTEGRATION MANAGEMENT PATHWAYS WE TALKED ABOUT
5 IN DECEMBER WHICH I'LL GO OVER IN A SECOND. NEXT SLIDE. I WANT
6 TO PROVIDE A REMINDER OF THE SIX KEY ELEMENTS OF FARE
7 INTEGRATION COORDINATION THAT THE PROJECT TEAM HAS DEVELOPED
8 THUS FAR A FRAMEWORK OF ANALYZE TYPES OF DECISIONS THAT NEED
9 TO BE MADE TO MOVE TO ORDER A COORDINATED SYSTEM OF TRANSIT
10 FARES IN THE BAY AREA. FIRST STRATEGIC ELEMENTS INTEGRATION
11 MODEL MEANING WHICH TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE BAY AREA SHOULD BE
12 COVERED BY A PARTICULAR APPROACH TO INTEGRATING FARES. NEXT IS
13 THE GOVERNANCE OR FARE MANAGEMENT MODEL WHICH IS FOCUSED ON
14 HOW DECISIONS ARE MADE TO SET FARE POLICY APPROACHES TO
15 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION. NEXT THE CUSTOMER-FACING
16 ELEMENTS LEADING WITH THE PRICING MODEL FOCUSING ON WHAT
17 PRICES ARE USED FOR TRANSIT USERS FOR A PARTICULAR PRODUCT
18 NEXT MODEL EXPLORING DIFFERENT TYPES OF FARES RESULTING IN A
19 SYSTEM OF DAILY, WEEKLY OR CAPS RATHER THAN REQUIRING UPFRONT
20 PASS, LIKELY MOVING INTO IMPLEMENTATION ELEMENTS ON THE RIGHT
21 HAND SIDE WE HAVE A FUNDING MODEL FOCUSING ON FINANCIAL
22 RESOURCES NEEDED TO MAKE A COORDINATED INTEGRATED FARE SYSTEM
23 WORK IN THE BAY AREA AND DELIVERING MODEL WHICH INCLUDES
24 DELIVERY SYSTEM COORDINATION IN THE BAY AREA HOW IT MIGHT
25 PHASED OVER TIME AND PIGGYBACKING ON EXISTING WORK SUCH AS



February 16, 2021

1 DEPLOYMENT OF THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM IN THE NEXT
2 FEW YEARS. NEXT SLIDE. THIS GRAPHIC SHOWS THE FOUR MANAGEMENT
3 PATHWAYS TO FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION WAS FIRST SHARED
4 WITH THE TASK FORCE BACK IN DECEMBER LOOKING AT THE QUADRANT
5 IN THE BOTTOM RIGHT YOU SEE THE BAY AREA'S CURRENT APPROACH
6 WHERE FARE POLICY HAS MULTIPLE DIFFERENT STRUCTURES AND
7 VARYING LEVELS OF INTEGRATION AND MANAGEMENT APPROACHES. ON
8 THE LEFT AXIS WE MOVE TOWARDS A SINGLE BAY AREA FARE POLICIES
9 AND THROUGH TO DECISION MAKING PROCESS TOWARDS COORDINATED
10 DECISION MAKING PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. A BIT MORE DETAIL
11 ABOUT WHAT EACH QUADRANT MEANS WE TRY TO CREATE TWO PATHWAYS
12 TO KEY CHARACTERS WHICH YOU SEE IN EACH QUADRANT AND WHAT EACH
13 PATHWAY MEANS TO A SYSTEM MANAGEMENT PERSPECTIVE. I'M NOT
14 GOING TO GO INTO EVERYTHING ON THE SLIDE, BUT THE BIG MULTIPLE
15 CAMP SIGN PATHWAYS ARE THE OVERALL PACKAGE OF OPTIONS THAT
16 MAKE UP THE SHORT LIST THAT WE'LL PRESENT LATER TODAY. WE WANT
17 TO KEEP THESE FOUR DIFFERENT PATHWAY IN MIND AS WE TALK ABOUT
18 OPTIONS LATER IN THE PRESENTATION AND REFERENCE BACK TO THIS
19 SLIDE IF YOU HAVE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS OR YOU WANT TO SORT OF
20 TOUCH BASE ON WHAT EXACTLY IS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE BIG
21 TENT AND THE GREAT ALLIANCE. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
22 BEFORE WE GET DEEPER INTO THE PRESENTATION, WE WANTED TO
23 DEFINE A FEW KEY TERMS FIRST IS FARE STRUCTURE WHICH WE DEFINE
24 AS A SET OF RULES AND POLICIES TO DETERMINE HOW FARES OF SET.
25 OPTIONS WE'RE GOING TO DISCUSS WITH YOU TODAY DEFINE VARIOUS



February 16, 2021

1 APPROACHES USED TO PRICE A TRIP OR MOVEMENT WITHIN A TRANSIT
2 SYSTEM. AN EXAMPLE STRUCTURE WOULD BE FARE ZONES AND FINALLY
3 WITHIN EACH STRUCTURAL OPTION ARE THE ACTUAL PRICING VARIANCE
4 WITHIN A FARE STRUCTURE. THESE INDIVIDUAL VARIANTS WE'LL BE
5 WORKING TO DEFINE OVER THE COMING WEEKS AND THAT'S WHAT WILL
6 BE SUBJECT TO THE DETAILED BUSINESS CASE MALLS PROCESS WHICH
7 WE'LL BE LOOKING AT FINANCIAL RIDERSHIP AND USER EXPERIENCE
8 IMPACTS OF THE DIFFERENT PRICING AND STRUCTURAL VARIANCE. GO
9 ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO EACH OF THE FARE POLICY OPTIONS ON
10 THE PROPOSED SHORT LIST WHICH WE'LL TALK ABOUT IN A MINUTE
11 WILL HAVE A RANGE OF FARE POLICY THAT ARE MODELS USING ZONES
12 USING ZONE SIZE, SHAPE, RULES THAT WOULD APPLY TO TRAVEL
13 WITHIN OR BETWEEN ZONES, ALONG WITH A PRICE THAT YOU WOULD BE
14 CHARGED FOR USING TRANSIT WITHIN A ZONE BASED SYSTEM. SO
15 THEORIZE ALL OF THE DIFFERENT VARIANTS THAT WILL THEN UNDERGO
16 DETAILED ANALYSIS ONCE THEY'RE PACKAGED TOGETHER WITHIN THE
17 OPTIONS. SO THE TEAM WILL EVENTUALLY SELECT A WHAT WE'RE
18 CALLING A REFERENCE CONCEPT OR CONCEPTS FOR EACH OF THE
19 OPTIONS TO FURTHER EXPLORE BASED ON HOW EACH OF THOSE
20 DIFFERENT CONCEPTS RELATE TO THE PROJECTS POLICY GOALS AND THE
21 CONSTRAINTS WITHIN EACH OF THOSE GOALS WHICH I'LL TALK ABOUT
22 IN THE NEXT SLIDE. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO THE TEAM IS
23 DEVELOPING VARIANTS FOR EACH OPTION GUIDED BY THREE KEY
24 LIVERS, POLICY GOALS RIDERSHIP PROMOTING A RETURN TO TRANSIT
25 POLICY CONSTRAINTS LEVEL OF FUNDING AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT



February 16, 2021

1 OPERATIONS AND VARIANTS THAT LOOK AT DIFFERENT LEVELS OF
2 INVESTMENT THIS SYSTEM AND VARIANTS FOR EACH OPTION THAT
3 MAXIMIZES THE OUTCOMES FOR USERS AND THE SYSTEM AS A WHOLE. SO
4 DEVELOPING THE VARIANTS FOR EACH OPTION WE HAVE TO THINK ABOUT
5 HOW THE OUTCOMES AND THE GOALS OF THE PROJECT ARE SHAPED BY
6 WHAT THOSE DIFFERENT VARIANTS ENTAIL. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE
7 AND I'LL TALK MORE ABOUT THAT. WE WANT TO APPROACH THE
8 DEVELOPMENT OF THE VARIANTS OF THE THREE OPTIONS BY DEVELOPING
9 OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT TO TEST IN EASE PROCESS. IN THIS SLIDE
10 WE HIGHLIGHTING THREE OUTCOMES, THEIR RIDERSHIP EQUITY AND
11 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED REDUCTION. AND THE DIFFERENT LEVERS AND
12 CONSTRAINTS THAT WE CAN ADJUST IN EACH VARIANT OF EACH OPTION
13 TO MODEL THE OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS IN OPTION IMPACTS. IF YOU
14 LOOK AT THE SLIDE IN THE GRAPHIC WE'RE HIGHLIGHTS WHAT WE CALL
15 OPTION ONE WHICH WE'LL TALK ABOUT IN A MINUTE BUT THAT RELATES
16 TO ZONES. YOU CAN SEE WHAT ARE THE DIFFERENT LEVERS THAT CAN
17 MOVE TO DETERMINE A VARIANT, ZONE, SHAPE, SIZE, PRICE PER
18 ZONE, PRICE OF FARES FOR ELEMENTS THAT MIGHT NOT BE BASED ON
19 ZONE, FOR EXAMPLE, IF WE HAD A FLAT FARE FOR LOCAL BUS SERVICE
20 AND HOW EACH OF THOSE RELATE TO THE CONSTRAINTS THAT WE HAVE
21 FOR THE LEVEL OF FUNDING THAT MIGHT BE AVAILABLE, OF THE LEVEL
22 OF SUBSIDY THAT MIGHT BE AVAILABLE FROM A PASSENGER STANDPOINT
23 IN TERMS OF PRICE THAT THEY'RE CHARGED. MANAGEMENT APPROACHES
24 APPLICATIONS IN THE VARIANT AND HOW DOES THAT RELATE TO
25 OUTCOMES THE PROJECT IS TRYING TO PROMOTE AND THAT THE PROJECT



February 16, 2021

1 IS TRYING TO ADVANCE. THESE ARE DIFFERENT WAYS OF VARIANTS AND
2 ITERATIONS OF VARIANCES WILL BE MODELED INTO THE ANALYSIS. GO
3 ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE, WHICH I LIKE TO CALL SORT OF
4 THE IPHONE SLIDE, AS AN OVERVIEW OF THE BUSINESS CASE
5 STRUCTURE THAT THE PROJECT TEAM WILL BE UNDERTAKING, YOU CAN
6 SEE THE FOUR KEY ELEMENTS OF THAT BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS, THE
7 STRATEGIC DIMENSION, ECONOMIC DIMENSION, DELIVERY DIMENSION,
8 AND FINANCIAL DIMENSION. AND EACH OF THE DIFFERENT VARIANTS
9 WITHIN THE OPTIONS THAT WE'LL BE ANALYZING IN THE COMING
10 MONTHS WILL BE ANALYZED THROUGH THE FOUR DIFFERENT PATHS IN
11 THE BUSINESS CASE STRUCTURE. SO WE'LL BE REPORTING BACK TO
12 THIS TASK FORCE ON HOW EACH OF THE OPTIONS AND VARIANTS
13 PERFORMS FROM A STRATEGIC DIMENSION SO ADVANCING POLICY GOALS
14 WHETHER IT'S FEASIBILITY TO IMPLEMENT, THE ECONOMIC DIMENSION
15 IN TERMS OF WHAT ARE THE BENEFITS AND COSTS OF CHOOSING THAT
16 PARTICULAR OPTION IN VARIANTS, HOW IT COULD BE DELIVERED, WHAT
17 ARE THE NECESSARY PREREQUISITES TO BEING ABLE TO IMPLEMENT
18 THAT OPTION TO MAKE IT SUCCESSFUL FROM AN AGENCY AND CUSTOMER
19 STANDPOINT. AND FROM A FINANCIAL DIMENSION, WHAT ARE THE
20 FINANCIAL HOURS AND INVESTMENT THAT IT WOULD TAKE TO BRING
21 THAT OPTION TO IMPLEMENTATION AND TO MAKE IT SUCCESSFUL. GO ON
22 TO THE NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE I TURN THE SLIDES OVER TO MIKE
23 EISEMAN TO DETAIL THE SHORT LIST OF OPTIONS I WANT TO
24 HIGHLIGHT THE IMPORTANT USER RESEARCH WORK THE PROJECT HAS
25 UNDERTAKEN SINCE THE START OF THIS YEAR. THE TWO MAIN RECENT



February 16, 2021

1 USER RESEARCH PROJECTS HAVE INCLUDED A SERIES OF IN DEPTH ONE-
2 ON-ONE INTERVIEWS WITH A DIVERSE RANGE OF TRANSIT USERS FROM
3 AROUND THE BAY AREA AS WELL AS AN ONLINE QUANTITATIVE AND
4 QUALITATIVE SURVEY WHERE WE HAVE RECEIVED OVER A THOUSAND
5 RESPONSES WE HAVE ACTUALLY RECEIVED OVER 1200 RESPONSES SINCE
6 I CHECKED LAST WEEK AND THE GOAL OF THIS PHASE OF USER
7 RESEARCH, WHICH IS STILL UNDERWAY AND WE'LL REPORT IN DETAIL
8 AT YOUR NEXT TASK FORCE MEETING HAS HELPED US TO BETTER
9 UNDERSTAND HOW CUSTOMERS PER SEER THE EXISTING PRODUCTS ON
10 OFFER AND THE PAYMENT EXPERIENCE, HOW DOES THE PAYMENT
11 EXPERIENCE CONNECT TO THE BROADER TRANSIT EXPERIENCE, AND
12 USING THE SYSTEM, AND WHAT WORKS WELL AND WHAT ARE THE PAIN
13 POINTS OF THE EXISTING USER EXPERIENCE AND WE'RE FINDING THE
14 EXISTING USER EXPERIENCE IN THE EXISTING TIME POINT AND THE
15 USER SPENCER PRIOR TO COVID. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M NOT GOING
16 TO GO THROUGH ALL OF THESE ANECDOTES FROM THIS USER RESEARCH
17 CALLED OUT ON THE SLIDES BUT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A RANGE EVER
18 COMMENTS WE HEARD AND MAPPED THEM TO AGENCY EXPERIENCE
19 DELIVERING TRANSIT SERVICE AND CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE USING
20 TRANSIT. WE'LL BE BACK IN APRIL AT YOUR NEXT MEETING WITH
21 DETAILS OF WHAT WE HEARD FROM THE USER RESEARCH AND THE
22 DETAILED IN DEPTH REPORT ABOUT THE USER RESEARCH AND WHAT WE
23 HAVE DONE TO DATE AND CONTINUE TO DO AS WE TEST DIFFERENT
24 OPTIONS AND VARIANTS IN THE COMING MONTHS I'M GOING TO TURN IT



February 16, 2021

1 OVER TO MIKE EISEMAN TO DISCUSS THE SHORT LIST OF POLICY
2 OPTIONS.
3
4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I'M MIKE EISEMAN FROM BART. NEXT SLIDE.
5 BEFORE I DIVE INTO THE SHORT LIST OF OPTIONS I WANT TO SAY A
6 WORD ABOUT THE CONTEXT WE'RE CONSIDERING PARTICULARLY COMING
7 OUT OF THE USER RESEARCH THAT BILL DISCUSSED AND ALSO
8 REFERENCING SOME PRIOR RESEARCH THAT WE SHARED PRIOR TO THIS
9 TASK FORCE. WE'RE LOOKING AT FARE BARRIERS AND FARE PAYMENT
10 SERVICE WITH CUSTOMERS BUT WE KNOW THAT TRANSIT RIDERS IN THE
11 REGION FACE BARRIERS AND DECISION MAKING BROADER AND TAKING
12 INTO CONSIDERATION THE BOOED RANGE OF EXPERIENCES AND
13 CONSTRAINTS THAT AFFECT TRANSIT AND MODE CHOICE IN THE REGION.
14 WITH THAT I'LL WALK THROUGHOUT SHORT LIST OF FARE STRUCTURE
15 OPTIONS WE HAVE AND TALK ABOUT THE SCREENING PROCESS WE USED
16 TO GET TO THE LIST. OUR STAFF RECOMMENDATION TODAY IS TO MOVE
17 SIX OPTIONS OF VARYING DEVELOPMENT USING METHODOLOGY WE
18 DISCUSSED AND WHEN WE WRAP UP I'M GOING TO ASK FOR INPUT ON
19 PROPOSED DECISIONS TO THE LIST AND SUGGESTION YOU HAVE ABOUT
20 THE ANALYSIS APPROACH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WE RECENTLY HAVE
21 BEEN EVALUATING A LONG LIST OF FARE STRUCTURE OPTIONS AS BILL
22 MENTIONED DRAWN FROM THE PEER REVIEW IN EARLIER STEPS OF THE
23 STUDY A FULL LIST IS DOCUMENTED IN YOUR APPEND DIX PACKAGE.
24 TWO PARTS FIRST A STRATEGIC SCREEN WHERE WE ASSESS THE FARE
25 STRUCTURE AND HOW IT WOULD IMPROVE THE ISSUES IDENTIFIED IN



February 16, 2021

1 OUR PROJECT PROBLEM STATEMENT AND A SECOND IMPLEMENTATION
2 SCREEN LOOKS AT HOW DOES THE OPTION HAVE FATAL FLAWS THAT
3 WOULD PREVENT IT FROM BEING IMPLEMENTED WITHIN ITS PATHWAY.
4 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE SCREENING AT THIS STAGE IS SIMPLE
5 AND QUALITATIVE WE LOOKED AT OPTIONS ACROSS FIVE CRITERIA
6 ASSIGNED SCORES OF 5 TO 3 WITH POSITIVE IMPACTS AND NEGATIVE
7 POINTS FOR UNDESIRABLE IMPACTS. QUICK WORD ON TERMINOLOGY WHEN
8 WE SAY FARE BARRIERS WE MEAN ANY FEATURE STRUCTURE THAT WOULD
9 REDUCE THE USE OF TRANSIT IN THE SYSTEM ESPECIALLY REGIONALLY.
10 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO OUR FIVE SCREENING CRITERIA ARE LISTED
11 HERE ON THE LEFT. THEY INCLUDE BETTER ALIGNING FARES WITH TRIP
12 VALUE, IMPROVING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, MAKING THE FARE SYSTEM
13 MORE EQUITABLE, AND MAKING GOOD USE OF OUR FUTURE TRANSIT
14 INVESTMENT. FOR TRIP VALUE WE'RE LOOKING AT OPTIONS THAT
15 REMOVE -- WE'RE PRIORITIZING OPTIONS THAT REMOVE OR REDUCE
16 EXISTING FARE BARRIERS CONCERNED ABOUT OPTIONS THAT MOVE OR
17 CREATE NEW ONES. FOR CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE GIVING HIGH SCORES
18 FOR OPTIONS THAT OFFER CONSISTENT USER EXPERIENCE ACROSS
19 MULTIPLE AGENCIES AND LOWEST SCORES FOR OPTIONS THAT EITHER
20 DON'T IMPROVE OR INTEGRATE EXPERIENCE OR NEGATIVELY IMPACTING
21 LOCAL TRIPS. A COMPLEX SET OF ISSUES FOR THIS SCREENING WE
22 FOCUSED ON TWO ISSUES FIRST RATED OPTIONS HIGHER IF THEY WOULD
23 CONTRIBUTE TO EXPANDING MODE CHOICE FOR PRIORITY POPULATIONS
24 AND WE RATED OPTIONS LOWER IF THEY CREATE FARE BARRIERS FOR
25 THOSE MAKING LOCAL TRIPS OR CHALLENGES FOR UNBANKED PEOPLE AND



February 16, 2021

1 GAVE HIGHER SCORES FOR FARE STRUCTURES THAT WOULD MAKE IT
2 EASIER FOR CUSTOMERS TO USE NEW TRANSIT AS PART A MULTI-AGENCY
3 TRIP AND SCORES FOR OPTIONS THAT DELIVERED WITH THE FEWEST
4 CHANGES TO THE CLIPPER SYSTEM AND LOW SCORES THAT REQUIRE
5 CHANGES EITHER TO CLIPPER TWO OR [INDISCERNIBLE] NEXT SLIDE
6 PLEASE. THIS TABLE SHOWS THE RESULT PROPOSING SHORT LIST OF
7 FARE STRUCTURE OPTIONS. WHETHER OPTIONS ARE WORKABLE GIVEN
8 WITH THE FARE MANAGEMENT PATHWAY OPTION ONE WE'RE CALLING HONE
9 COMB ZONES JUST A SIMPLE ZONE BASED FARE STRUCTURE WHERE THE
10 REGION IS DIVIDED INTO COMPACT ZONES, THIS IS THE CALTRAIN
11 FARE STRUCTURE THE MODIFIER HONEYCOMB DISTINGUISHES FROM
12 CIRCULAR ZONES IN REGIONS THAT HAVE A LARGE CENTRAL CITY
13 UNLIKE THE BAY AREA. OPTION TWO SAME AS OPTION ONE BUT
14 MODIFIED FOR FLAT FARE FOR LOCAL BUS TRIPS OPTION THREE FARE
15 BY DISTANCE WITH LOCAL FLAT FARE SIMILAR TO THE STRUCTURE THAT
16 BART USES TODAY. OPTION FOUR NEIGHBORING AND CONNECTED
17 AGENCIES CHARGES TARGETED TO REMOVE BARRIERS AND OFFERING
18 BETWEEN AGENCY MOST FREQUENTLY USED IN COMBINATION, LOOKING TO
19 MAKE A SPECIFIC SET OF CHANGES THAT WOULD RESULT IN GREATEST
20 BENEFIT FOR CUSTOMERS THIS IS A CONCEPT THAT REQUIRES FURTHER
21 DEVELOPMENT THROUGH TESTING. OPTION FIVE MORE NARROW IN SCOPE
22 DISCOUNTING DOUBLE FARES BETWEEN AGENCIES TO REDUCE BARRIERS
23 FOR REGIONAL TRIPS. OPTION SIX LAYER OF PASS OR CAP PROGRAM
24 OVER EXISTING FARE STRUCTURE WITH NO OTHER CHANGES. NOTE WE
25 ENVISION TESTING VARIANTS WITH ALL FIVE OTHER STRUCTURE



February 16, 2021

1 OPTIONS AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE INFRASTRUCTURE. THIS SLIDE
2 INCLUDES PATHWAYS OPTION THREE ON THE LEFT SIDE OF THE GRAPHIC
3 ARE WORKABLE EITHER WITHIN THE BIG TENT OR GREAT ALLIANCE
4 PATHWAY. OPTION FOUR NEIGHBORING AND CONNECTED AGENCIES WORKS
5 BEST IN THE MULTIPLE TENTS ONE CAMPSITE PATHWAY AND HERE
6 ESSENTIAL FARE SETTING AUTHORITY CAN SET DIFFERENT STRUCTURE
7 IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION. OPTION FIVE, AGAIN, WE SEE
8 DISCOUNT SUMMER FARES FOR ALL TRANSFERS BETWEEN SERVICES AND
9 THAT FITS BEST WITH AGREEMENTS PATHWAYS AND OPTION SIX WE SHOW
10 IN THE CENTER OF THE GRAPHIC BECAUSE THAT OVERLAY OF CAP OR
11 PASS PROGRAM COULD BE WORKABLE IN ANY OF THE PATHWAYS. NEXT
12 SLIDE PLEASE. IN THE NEXT PHASE OF WORK WE'LL BE DEVELOPING A
13 RANGE OF VARIANTS UNDER EACH FARE STRUCTURE TO TEST AND IN
14 THIS WE SHOW VARIANTS WE INTEND TO EXPLORE FOR EACH SHORT
15 LISTED OPTION. IN THIS TABLE WE SHOW FIRE FARE STRUCTURE
16 OPTIONS WE SCREENED OUT. A RECENT WIDE FLAT FARE WE DEEMED TOO
17 INFLEXIBLE TO SUPPORT FUTURE TRANSIT AND LIKELY REQUIRING
18 HIGHER SUBSIDY OR FARE THAN OUR CURRENT BUS SYSTEM. FARE BY
19 DISTANCE WITHOUT A LOCAL FLAT FARE WE SCREENED OUT BECAUSE OF
20 LIKELY OPERATIONAL IMPACTS ON LOCAL BUS SERVICE. INTEGRATION
21 BY CORRIDOR WE SCREENED OUT BECAUSE WE FELT IT DIDN'T ADDRESS
22 ISSUES IN THE PROBLEM STATEMENT AND POTENTIALLY HAD EQUITY
23 IMPACTS AS WELL. AND SIMPLE PRICE HARMONIZATION WITHOUT
24 FURTHER CHANGES WE SCREENED OUT BECAUSE IT DIDN'T ADDRESS THE
25 FULL RANGE OF ISSUES IN OUR PROBLEM STATEMENT. NEXT SLIDE.



February 16, 2021

1 NEXT ONE. SO, AGAIN OUR RECOMMENDATION HERE IS TO MOVE SIX
2 FARE STRUCTURE OPTIONS INTO VARIANT DEVELOPMENT AND BUSINESS
3 CASE ANALYSIS. WE WOULD WELCOME ANY SUGGESTIONS, ADDITIONS, OR
4 SUBTRACTIONS AND INPUT ON THE APPROACH TO VARIANT TESTING AND
5 I'LL WRAP UP THERE. WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS AND
6 HEAR YOUR DIRECTION.

7

8 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, BILL AND MIKE. WHAT I WOULD
9 LIKE TO DO IF TASK FORCE MEMBERS ARE OKAY, I WOULD LIKE TO
10 TAKE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS FROM TASK FORCE MEMBERS BEFORE TASK
11 FORCE MEMBERS MAKE COMMENTS OR GIVE DIRECTION. AFTER
12 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ARE DONE BY TASK FORCE MEMBERS I WOULD
13 LIKE TO HAVE THE SECRETARY CALL ON THE PUBLIC FOR ANY PUBLIC
14 COMMENT AND THEN AT THE CLOSING OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT, I WOULD
15 LIKE TO REVERT BACK TO TASK FORCE MEMBERS TO MAKE ANY COMMENTS
16 OR GIVE ANY GUIDANCE OR DIRECTION. AND WITH THAT, MADAM
17 SECRETARY, IF YOU CAN HELP ME, IF THERE IS ANY TASK FORCE
18 MEMBERS WHO HAVE THEIR HANDS UP OR OTHERWISE INDICATE THAT I
19 WANT TO TALK AND I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO WELCOME TASK FORCE
20 MEMBER POWERS.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THAT'S CORRECT. FIRST UP IS MEMBER
23 MCMILLAN.

24



February 16, 2021

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S
2 GOING TO BE TOO HARD TO PULL A SLIDE BACK UP BUT IT WOULD
3 CERTAINLY HELP WITH MY QUESTION. THE ONE WHERE YOU HAD THE
4 OVERLAY, IT'S ACTUALLY SLIDE 24, THE -- IT'S THE OPTIONS MAPS
5 AGAINST THE QUADRANTS. BECAUSE I WAS SORT OF ANTICIPATING THAT
6 THIS WAS GOING TO BE -- YEAH. SO FIRST, LET ME JUST SAY THAT
7 THIS WAS SUPER HELPFUL, BECAUSE I BEGAN TO SORT OF BEGIN TO
8 UNDERSTAND THIS OVERLAY OF THESE IMPORTANT CONCEPTS. BUT IF
9 YOU COULD JUST TAKE AN EXAMPLE OF, FOR EXAMPLE, WHY, SAY
10 OPTION TWO, THE HONEYCOMB ZONES AND LOCAL FLAT FARE ONE, JUST
11 DESCRIBE WHY THAT WOULDN'T WORK IN THE MULTIPLE TENTS, ONE
12 CAMPSITE OR TRADE AGREEMENT. JUST AS AN ILLUSTRATION, JUST TO
13 FIGURE OUT HOW THIS IS WORKING.

14

15 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SURE. LET ME GIVE IT A SHOT. THE BIG
16 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN BIG TENTS AND MULTIPLE, AND ONE CAMPSITE IS
17 WHETHER THERE'S A WHOLE LOST STRUCTURE THAT APPLIES TO ONE
18 REGION AT ONCE THAT'S BIG TENT AND IF WE'RE HAVING DIFFERENT
19 FARES STRUCTURE IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION THAT'S
20 DEFINED AS MULTIPLE TENTS ONE CAMPSITE. AND WHAT'S THE SAME
21 BETWEEN THOSE TWO BOXES IS THAT THERE IS A CENTRAL SET OF FARE
22 AUTHORITY. THE HONEYCOMBS FOR EXAMPLE, WE HAVE DEFINED THAT AS
23 SOMETHING THAT APPLIES TO THE WHOLE REGION WHEREAS IF YOU WANT
24 TO SET DIFFERENT FARE STRUCTURES FOR DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE



February 16, 2021

1 REGION, THAT'S REALLY OPTION FOUR, NEIGHBORING CONNECTED
2 AGENCIES.

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** OKAY. SO MAYBE I'M FINALLY UNDERSTANDING THE
5 MULTIPLE TENTS, ONE CAMPSITE WHERE THERE IS SOME CENTRALIZED
6 DECISION-MAKING STRUCTURE, BUT IT WOULD, BY DEFINITION, SORT
7 OF BREAK THE REGION UP INTO DIFFERENT DECISION-MAKING NODES?
8 I'M NOT --

9

10 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YES. THAT'S WHAT MAKES IT THE GREEN BOX AS
11 OPPOSED TO THE BLUE BOX. BLUE BOX EVERYONE HAS THE SAME FARE
12 STRUCTURE.

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** OKAY. IN -- OKAY. SO, JUST AGAIN, JUST
15 TOTALLY CRYSTALLIZE IT IN MY HEAD, IF FOR EXAMPLE, THE
16 DECISION MAKING STRUCTURE WERE TO SAY WE HAVE A NORTH BAY,
17 EAST BAY, WEST BAY, SOUTH BAY BREAK-UP, AND FOR WHATEVER
18 REASONS THEY'RE GOING TO BE TREATED IN DISTINCT WAYS,
19 SOMETHING THEN LIKE A HONEYCOMB ZONE WHICH WOULD PRESUMABLY
20 CROSS THOSE QUADRANTS, WOULDN'T WORK, POTENTIALLY.

21

22 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** RIGHT.

23

24 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** OKAY. I THINK I GOT IT. THANK YOU.

25



February 16, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SURE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION CHAIR
4 ADINA LEVIN? ADINA, YOU GOT TO UNMUTE.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO I'LL BE HAPPY TO PRESENT THE GROUP'S
7 FEEDBACK AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME, IN THIS MEETING. JUST WANTED
8 TO LET YOU KNOW THEY HAVE SORTED OUT MY ZOOM ISSUES.

9

10 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER MILLER?

13

14 **KATE MILLER:** OKAY. SO I'M JUST GOING TO BE BUILDING A LITTLE
15 BIT ON THERESE'S QUESTIONS. BECAUSE I DIDN'T QUITE GET IT
16 EITHER. THE HONEYCOMB IDEA, IF I'M UNDERSTANDING THIS
17 CORRECTLY, BASICALLY SUBDIVIDES THE REGION INTO SUBREGIONS.
18 AND SO THEN I DON'T -- SO, BUT -- THEY WOULDN'T ALL
19 NECESSARILY HAVE TO BE THE SAME, RIGHT? BUT IT WOULD BE KIND
20 OF THE CONSISTENT APPROACH, MAYBE, A BETTER WAY OF DESCRIBING
21 IT? IS THAT RIGHT?

22

23 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** LET ME CLARIFY THAT. SO THE HONEYCOMB ZONE
24 CONCEPT IS NOT SO MUCH TO SUBDIVIDE THE REGION INTO DIFFERENT
25 CHUNKS THAT HAVE DIFFERENT FARE STRUCTURES, IT'S MEANT TO BE



February 16, 2021

1 ONE SINGLE FARE STRUCTURE. THE ZONE SYSTEM EXISTS ON A MAP,
2 THE MORE ZONES YOU HAVE TRAVEL THE THROUGH, THE HIGHER YOUR
3 FARE. AS OPPOSED TO, SO SIMILAR TO WHAT CALTRAIN USES TODAY,
4 THOSE TYPES OF ZONES, AS OPPOSED TO THE DISTANCE-BASED
5 STRUCTURE THAT BART USES TODAY. WHEREAS THE NEIGHBORING AND
6 CONNECTED AGENCIES COULD BE, YOU KNOW, BART AND AC TRANSIT ARE
7 FREQUENTLY USED IN COMBINATION, THEY MIGHT HAVE A DISCOUNTED
8 TRANSFER, PERHAPS, YOU KNOW, MUNI, AND SAMTRANS, OR CALTRAIN
9 ARE FREQUENTLY USED IN COMBINATION THEY MIGHT HAVE A SEPARATE
10 TRANSFER RELATIONSHIP.

11

12 **KATE MILLER:** OKAY. SO THIS ALMOST DESCRIBES A SUBSET IN A
13 SENSE.

14

15 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** UH-HUH.

16

17 **KATE MILLER:** I ASKED BILL VIA E-MAIL AND MAYBE I'LL ASK YOU, I
18 LOST VISUALS IT'S MUCH EASIER FOR ME TO KIND OF GRASP CONCEPTS
19 IF WE COULD GET A COPY OF THE POWERPOINT PRESENTATION. THAT
20 WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

21

22 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YES, OF COURSE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HURSCH?

25



February 16, 2021

1 **MICHAEL HURSCH, VICE CHAIR:** THANKS BILL AND BIKE -- MIKE FOR
2 THE GREAT PRESENTATION. IT OCCURS TO ME AS I WAS RUNNING
3 THROUGH IT TODAY, IN NEIGHBORHOOD FIVE, AND CONNECTED APPEARS
4 TO BE SIMILAR TO WHAT WE HAVE TODAY WHICH LORD KNOWS IS SUPER
5 COMPLICATED. A SUGGESTION AS WE GO THROUGH THIS EXERCISE THAT
6 AS WE FLUSH THIS OUT WE POINT OUT IF IT'S CLOSE TO TODAY OR
7 EVEN DISTANT FROM TODAY, KEY POINT OUT EXACTLY WHAT THE
8 DIFFERENCE IS SO AS WE GO FORWARD WE MAKE A DECISION THAT
9 DIDN'T CREATE THE CONFUSION THAT WE HAVE TODAY. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ARE THERE ANY MORE COMMITTEE MEMBERS
12 THAT WANTED TO SPEAK? OKAY. ADINA, GO AHEAD.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO NOW BEING UNMUTED, I WANTED TO SHARE THE
15 COMMENTS THAT WERE MADE BY THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
16 SUBCOMMITTEE. SO, WE GOT A BACKGROUND REPORT ON THE USER
17 RESEARCH PATHWAYS TO INTEGRATION, AND THE ALTERNATIVE FARE
18 STRUCTURES, AND GAVE SOME COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN, HOPEFULLY
19 HAVE BEEN INTEGRATED INTO THE CHOICES THAT ARE BEFORE YOU
20 TODAY. SO FIRST OF ALL IN TERMS OF THE USER RESEARCH, WE WERE
21 HAPPY WITH THE ROBUST USER RESEARCH TO DATE, AND WANTED TO SEE
22 STAFF CONTINUE TO INVITE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO PARTICIPATE
23 IN FUTURE USER RESEARCH THROUGH AN ONLINE DATABASE OF
24 INTERESTED PARTICIPANTS AS THIS STUDY MOVES FORWARD. BECAUSE
25 THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO BE ABLE TO, YOU KNOW, ASSESS HOW



February 16, 2021

1 USERS ARE REACTING TO THE OPTIONS AS THEY ARE CONSOLIDATED AND
2 MOVE FORWARD. IN TERMS OF THE PATHWAYS TO INTEGRATION, THE
3 SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS WERE GENERALLY SUPPORTIVE OF THOSE
4 PATHWAYS THAT WOULD FOSTER A MORE CONSISTENT AND UNIFIED FARE
5 POLICY FOR THE BAY AREA, AND THEY WERE ALSO INTERESTED HAD
6 FINISHING HOW THE DIFFERENT MANAGEMENT APPROACHES MIGHT
7 DOVETAIL WITH THE DISCUSSIONS THAT ARE UNDERWAY IN THE BLUE
8 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE IN TERMS OF WHAT OPTIONS
9 MAY BE NOT POSSIBLE NOW, BUT MIGHT BE ENABLED WITH SOME FUTURE
10 WORK TO MAKE THEM POSSIBLE. AND THEN LASTLY, IN TERMS OF THE
11 ALTERNATIVE FARE STRUCTURES AND EVALUATION FRAMEWORK, THERE
12 WERE NUMEROUS COMMENTS ON THESE, INCLUDING SIGNIFICANT SUPPORT
13 FOR THE CONCEPT OF THE ACCUMULATOR CAPS, AND A FARE POLICY
14 SYSTEM THAT MAKES IT EASIER TO TRANSFER BETWEEN THE SYSTEMS.
15 THERE WAS SUPPORT FOR CENTERING EQUITY IN THE ANALYSIS, AND
16 HAVING FARE POLICY CHANGES TO HELP BETTER SERVICE FOR PEOPLE
17 WHO NEED TRANSIT THE MOST. THERE WAS CONCERN ABOUT POSSIBLE
18 EQUITY IMPACTS THAT WERE A ZONE OR DISTANCE BASED STRUCTURE.
19 AND OVERALL, THE CONSENSUS WAS THAT THE PROJECT SHOULD ANALYZE
20 AND FAVOR THE OPTIONS THAT WOULD DELIVER SIGNIFICANT
21 IMPROVEMENTS IN THE USER EXPERIENCE, RATHER THAN FOCUSING ON
22 THE POLICIES THAT MIGHT BE MORE EASILY IMPLEMENTED IN THE
23 CURRENT FARE POLICY MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK IN THE BAY AREA. AND
24 THAT IS A SUMMARY OF THE COMMENTS OF THE ADVISORY
25 SUBCOMMITTEE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH ADINA, MUCH APPRECIATE YOUR



February 16, 2021

1 LEADERSHIP ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND YOUR FRAME
2 SUMMARY OF THE COMMENTS. MADAM SECRETARY, I THINK THAT GETS TO
3 OVERALL PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE ITEM. CAN YOU ADDRESS THE ISSUE
4 OF ANY PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM, IN
5 WRITING, AS WELL AS CALL UPON THOSE FOLKS WHO MAY HAVE THEIR
6 HANDS RAISED?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
9 THIS ITEM, AND THERE ARE A FEW MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
10 THEIR HANDS RAISED. REMINDER, YOU ONLY HAVE ONE MINUTE TO
11 SPEAK, AND IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, PRESS STAR
12 NINE, OR USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE. FIRST UP IS ADAM. ADAM,
13 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M ADAM BUCHBINDER, FOR A BETTER FUTURE
16 FOR BUS AND ORANGE LINE LIGHT RAIL IN SUNNYVALE. I AM HAPPY TO
17 SEE THE ADVANCEMENT OF FARE INTEGRATION WHATEVER DESIGN YOU
18 SETTLE ON I'M EXCITED TO SEE TRANSIT ACCESSIBILITY WORLD
19 EXTENDED OUTWARD AND PRIMARILY VEHICLES ARE A PRIMARY
20 CONTRIBUTOR TO CALIFORNIA'S CLIMATE ISSUES, GOOD LUCK AND
21 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ARMAN FOLLOWED BY
24 RICH HEDGES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

25



February 16, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS ARMAND, I HAVE LIVED IN THE BAY AREA MY
2 ENTIRE LIFE AND HAVE TAKEN EVERY BUS AND TRAIN IMAGINABLE IN
3 THIS REGION AND I WOULD LIKE TO SAY I'M REALLY EXCITED AND
4 SUPPORTIVE OF SUPPORTING TRANSIT REGIONAL COORDINATION BETTER
5 FARE COORDINATION, IT'S SO FUNDAMENTAL. I GREW UP GETTING LOST
6 AND CONFUSED ON SO MANY DIFFERENT BUSES AND TRAINS AND I KNOW
7 FOLKS WHO END UP PAYING WAY MORE TO OWN A CAR. SOMETIMES
8 THEY'RE AFRAID OF GETTING HIT BY A FEE THEY'RE NOT EXPECTING.
9 A ZONE OR DISTANCE BASED FARE OR FLAT LOCAL BUS FARE OR BUDGET
10 FRIENDLY CAPS OPTION DONE IN AN EQUITABLE WAY CAN BE AN
11 ENORMOUS DRIVER AND I'M SUPER EXCITED TO SUPPORT SEAMLESS
12 TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA AND OTHER EFFORTS ON THIS AS WELL.
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. RICH, GO AHEAD AND YOU WILL
16 BE FOLLOWED BY KARL, WITH A K.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I RIDE BART, MUNI, AC TRANSIT, AND VTA AND
19 MY QUESTION IS VERY SIMPLE. I HAVE HEARD NOTHING ABOUT A
20 REGION-WIDE DAILY FARE, I FIND SOMETIMES IT'S MORE EXPENSIVE I
21 FIX MY PRICE FOR THE DAY I DON'T HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT
22 CONSTANTLY FIGURING FARES I'M WONDERING OUTSIDE OF THE
23 POLITICS AND THE DIFFICULTY OF DEALING WITH ALL THE TRANSIT
24 AGENCIES WHY WE COULDN'T HAVE A DAILY FARE OR EVEN A WEEKLY



February 16, 2021

1 FARE IF PEOPLE CAN SUBSCRIBE TO THAT WHICH FIXES THEIR FARE
2 FOR THE WEEK OR THAT DAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KARL FOLLOWED BY WENDI.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS KARL VOELKER FROM SUNNYVALE. THE CURRENT
7 EXPERIENCE OF RIDES IS THE MOST IMPORTANT THING AND THE
8 JURISDICTIONAL BOUNDARIES OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM DON'T ADD
9 VALUE THEY MAKE THE EXPERIENCE MORE COMPLICATED AND EXPENSIVE
10 THAT'S ABOUT THE FARE TRIP FROM POINT A TO POINT B SHOULD
11 NOT DEPEND ON THE BOUNDARY LINES IT SHOULD BE PREDICTABLE AND
12 AFFORDABLE THIS IS A MATTER OF EQUITY FOR CURRENT RIDERS WITH
13 HIGH FARES. WE NEED TO END UP IN THE BIG TENT QUADRANT. I URGE
14 TO YOU PURSUE OPTIONS ON THE PROPOSED SHORT LIST THAT CAN GET
15 US TO THAT BIG TENT. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WENDI.

18

19 **WENDI KALLINS:** MY NAME IS WENDI KALLINS VICE CHAIR OF THE
20 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL INTEGRATION AS WELL AS FARE
21 INTEGRATION. I AM TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHICH OF THESE OPTIONS
22 WILL INCREASE RIDERSHIP IN THE FUTURE THIS HAS TO DEAL WITH
23 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND A LOT OF THE CRITERIA THAT'S ALREADY
24 BEEN LAID OUT. BUT ONE OF THE OTHER WAYS WE CAN LOOK AT THAT
25 IF THE FEE -- IF WE'RE LOOKING AT AREAS THAT HAVE USED CERTAIN



February 16, 2021

1 STRATEGIES, WHICH ONE OF THESE AREAS HAVE THE HIGHEST
2 RIDERSHIP? AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT PIECE OF
3 INFORMATION TO ADD TO THE MIX. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MARC FOLLOWED BY JOTI.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** I'M MARC M. I'M WITH SILICON VALLEY USA COMMON KNOW
8 GROUND CALIFORNIA AND MORE. I WANT TO SAY MANY -- MANY PEOPLE
9 ARE SAYING MODE SHARE IS IMPORTANT. -- UNFORTUNATELY WE DON'T
10 HAVE THOSE STICKS WITH US TODAY BUT WE DO NEED TO MAKE TRANSIT
11 ATTRACTIVE AND COMPETITIVE. IT NEEDS TO BE SIMPLE AND THIS
12 BASICALLY IS A BETTER OPTION THAN CARS AND BIG TENT REALLY IS
13 WHAT PEOPLE NEED. I CAN'T EXPRESS HOW MANY PEOPLE USE CARS
14 JUST BECAUSE THEY'RE A BIT BAFFLED BY HOW THEY CAN INTEGRATE
15 ALL THESE SERVICES INTO THEIR DAILY NEEDS AND, YOU KNOW, A
16 UNIFIED SYSTEM WOULD BE A NECESSARY STEP, NOT A SUFFICIENT
17 STEP. I THINK WE CAN DO FAR MORE, BUT WE ABSOLUTELY NEED
18 INTEGRATION. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT IS JOTI FOLLOWED BY ROB.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS JOTI D. A MEMBER OF EAST BAY DSA. I AM A
23 BIG SUPPORTER OF THIS STUDY AND I'M GLAD THIS IS HAPPENING. I
24 LIVE IN OAKLAND AND MAKE THE JOURNEY TO BAYVIEW. IF I MAKE THE
25 JOURNEY I GO THROUGH THREE AGENCIES AND PAY OVER \$8 AND I



February 16, 2021

1 OFTEN CHOOSE TO DRIVE AND PAY WHATEVER THE BRIDGE TOLL IS
2 MAYBE \$6. I AM A SUPPORTER OF THE STUDY. I HOPE IT LEADS TO
3 LOWER FARES. I HOPE TO SEE MAYBE THERE IS A DAILY CAP I THINK
4 SOMETHING MORE THAN 250 MIGHT BE A LOT FOR SOME PEOPLE, AND
5 SOMEWHERE AROUND THAT AMOUNT, I NOTICED YOU CANCEL ONE FARE
6 GETTING THROUGH THE REGION SO DEPENDING ON HOW THE HONEYCOMB
7 PRICING COMES OUT I FEEL A HIGH TIER WILL DISCOURAGE RIDERSHIP
8 WITH HOW MUCH ONE IS WILLING TO PAY.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS ROB FOLLOWED BY RICK.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI I'M ROB NIELSEN I LIVE IN PALO ALTO. I WANT TO
17 THANK EVERYBODY FOR THEIR EFFORTS ON THE FARE INTEGRATION. I
18 THINK IT'S BOTH NECESSARY FOR FIGHTING CLIMATE CHANGE AND
19 PURSUING EQUITY IN THE BAY AREA. I STRONGLY URGE TO YOU MOVE
20 FORWARD ON ALL SIX SCENARIOS THAT YOU BROUGHT UP TODAY. I
21 MOVED HERE IN 1983. I HAVE LIVED ALONG THE SAN MATEO SANTA
22 CLARA BORDER IN ALL THAT TIME, MENLO PARK IN PALO ALTO. IF
23 IT'S NOT DONE BY CALTRAIN IT'S GOING TO BE A BIG HASSLE. I
24 THINK WE NEED TO DO SOMETHING TO BREAK THE HABIT OF PEOPLE.



February 16, 2021

1 AND WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT GOING BIG TO THE FARE INTEGRATION
2 AND ALSO SCHEDULED INTEGRATION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. RICK FOLLOWED BY ROLAND. RICK, GO
5 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI. I ALSO LIVE IN PACIFICA, I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE
8 INVOLVED IN BRINGING THESE OPTIONS TOGETHER ON THE CONCEPT OF
9 NETWORK MANAGER I REALLY FEEL IT'S AN ORGANIZATION THAT SHOULD
10 BE USEFUL TO DELIVERING REGIONAL SERVICE. AS SUCH THE PROJECT
11 MANAGERS MIKE AND BILL BE INCREDIBLY VALUABLE BECAUSE THEY'RE
12 THE ONLY TWO PEOPLE IN THE UNIVERSE WHOSE BRAINS ARE WRAPPED
13 AROUND -- PER BART DIRECTOR'S MESSAGE TO DO IT INCREMENTALLY.
14 IT TAKES ABOUT THREE HOURS PLUS \$24 ROUND TRIP TO GO FROM HALF
15 MOON BAY TO GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE 30 MILES IF YOU DON'T DO IT
16 PERHAPS A SCENARIO WHERE YOU HAVE ONE BUS FROM NOVATO TO
17 PESCADERO TO LOOK AT INTERCONNECTIONS AND EXPERIMENT AND TEST
18 AWFUL THE OPTIONS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ROLAND FOLLOWED BY A ALETA.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I LIVE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND WE HAVE WONDERFUL
23 INTEGRATION INCLUDING SATURDAY BETWEEN GILROY AND MORGAN HILL
24 INCLUDING FREE TRANSIT BETWEEN VTA BUSES AND LIGHT RAIL. WE
25 ALSO HAVE THE LOWEST RIDERSHIP AND FARE BUS RECOVERY IN THE



February 16, 2021

1 NATION AND PROBABLY THE ENTIRE WORLD. MEANWHILE, FARE BOX
2 RECOVERY PRECOVID IN LONDON, 60% ON BUSES THERE WERE MULTIPLE
3 OPTIONS BETWEEN HEATHROW AND PADDINGTON WHICH VARIED BETWEEN 3
4 AND \$30. I REST MY CASE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ALETA.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** ALETA DUPREE, FOR THE RECORD, I WOULD SAY THAT THERE
9 ARE SEVERAL ITEMS TO DRAW UPON. THE EZ TRANSIT PASS IN LOS
10 ANGELES, BASICALLY CHOOSES OWN AND RIDE UNLIMITED, NOT TO BE
11 CONFUSED WITH EZ PASS TOLL SYSTEM ON THE EAST COAST AND ALSO
12 LOOKING AT PORTLAND OREGON WHICH HAS AN ELEMENT OF FARE
13 CAPPING TO IT, AND CHICAGO AS WELL, WHICH COMBINES THE CTA IN
14 THE CASE. I THINK WE SHOULD HAVE A CHOOSE YOUR DISTANCE WITH A
15 FARE CAPPING SO THAT WAY YOU DON'T HAVE TO THINK ABOUT HOW
16 MUCH FARE TO BUY. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, ALETA. PHONE NUMBER ENDING IN
19 2739 FOLLOWED BY OUR LAST SPEAKER, IAN. PHONE PERSON, CAN YOU
20 UNMUTE YOURSELF?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JEFF CARTER FROM MILLBRAE.
23 LONG TIME CALTRAIN RIDER. I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE YOU'RE TAKING
24 THIS STEP. FARES NEED TO BE INTEGRATED SO TRANSIT IS MORE
25 USEFUL AND USER FRIENDLY. I PREFER TO SEE DISTANCE-BASED FOR



February 16, 2021

1 THE REGIONAL RAIL, AND TO HAVE A FLAT FARE FOR THE LOCAL BUS
2 SYSTEM ALONG WITH FARE CAPS FOR DAILY, A FARE CAP FOR WEEKLY,
3 AND ALSO A, YOU KNOW, FARE CAP OR MONTHLY PASS PRICED AT A
4 GOOD DISCOUNT FOR, TO ENCOURAGE USE. HOPEFULLY WE'LL HAVE
5 SOMETHING IN WRITING AT SOME POINT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS IAN. AND ALL MEMBERS OF THE
8 PUBLIC PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND NOW IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK.
9 THIS IS THE LAST CALL. IAN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HELLO THIS IS IAN GRIFFITHS WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA. I
12 WANT TO MAINLY COMMEND STAFF FOR THE EXCELLENT WORK ON THIS
13 REPORT. I THINK IT'S REALLY RICH IN DETAIL AND OF COURSE I
14 ENCOURAGE THE TASK FORCE TO ADVANCE ALL OF THE OPTIONS BEING
15 PROPOSED. I WOULD ALSO JUST STATE THAT I HOPE THERE IS A WAY
16 WITHIN THE BUSINESS CASE TO HIGHLIGHT OTHER POTENTIAL
17 COBENEFITS OF HAVING SOME KIND OF CENTRALIZED DECISION MAKING
18 THAT COULD OVERSEE A FARE STRUCTURE. BECAUSE THE CASE FOR
19 SETTING THAT UP WOULD HAVE MANY BENEFITS BEYOND JUST BEING
20 ABLE TO IMPLEMENT INTEGRATED FARES THAT COULD SERVE AS AN
21 IMPORTANT THING THAT CAN INCREASE RIDERSHIP AND IMPROVE
22 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IN MANY WAYS AND IT WOULD BE GREAT IF THAT
23 COULD BE SOMEHOW REFLECTED WITHIN THIS BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS.
24 THANK YOU.

25



February 16, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. AND NOW JORDAN WITH A J
2 FOLLOWED BY TIFFANY. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS JORDAN WING RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO.
5 I WANT TO FIRST THANK THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS FOR WORKING
6 TOGETHER DURING THESE UNIQUE TIMES AND TO STAFF FOR PUTTING
7 TOGETHER A GREAT PRESENTATION. I WANT TO ECHO COMMENTS, AGENCY
8 BOUNDARIES CAUSE NEEDLESS CONFUSION AND ADDITIONAL COST, I
9 WOULD LIKE TO ENCOURAGE YOU TO USE ALL SIX OPTIONS STAFF
10 RECOMMENDED. AS SOMEONE WHO HAS TWICE NOW LIVED NEAR TRANSIT
11 BART STATION IN SAN FRANCISCO I HAVE A PROBLEM WITH
12 TRANSFERRING FROM BART AND MUNI DAILY TRIPS DOUBLING MY FARE.
13 THESE ARE PROBLEMS STAFF IS WELL AWARE OF AND I WANT TO
14 ENCOURAGE YOU TO KEEP THE OUTPUT OF THIS SIMPLE AND UNIFORM
15 ACROSS THE REGION. THANKS.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND OUR FINAL SPEAKER, REALLY, THIS
18 TIME, IS TIFFANY RODRIGUEZ.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS TIFFANY TDM MANAGER AT SAN JOSE STATE
21 UNIVERSITY FIRST I WANT TO SAY I APPRECIATE THE ATTENTION
22 EFFORT ON THIS ISSUE IT'S GREATLY NEEDED AND EXTREMELY
23 VALUABLE. THE OUTCOME OF THIS CAN GREATLY IMPACT THE FUTURE OF
24 TRANSIT, COMPLICATE FARES ADD UP QUICKLY IT'S A HUGE
25 DISINCENTIVE TO TRANSIT RIDERS DRIVING SHOULD NOT BE CHEAPER



February 16, 2021

1 THAN TAKE TRANSIT AND IF WE ARE ABLE TO MAKE TRANSIT EASY AND
2 AFFORDABLE WE WANT TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO TAKE TRANSIT TO WORK
3 OR SCHOOL, THEY WILL BECOME LIFETIME USERS OF TRANSIT AND
4 FUTURE GENERATIONS WILL BE VIEWED AS TAKING TRANSIT AS THE
5 NORM. I ENCOURAGE TO YOU PURSUE ALL SIX OPTIONS AND IF THAT'S
6 NOT POSSIBLE LOOK AT THE ONES THAT IMPROVE RIDER EXPERIENCE
7 AND THAT ARE EQUITABLE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** TIFFANY WAS OUR LAST SPEAKER.

10

11 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MADAM SECRETARY.
12 THANK YOU FOR TAKING CARE OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT AS YOU DO SUCH
13 A WONDERFUL JOB ON THE AGENDA AND ALL THE OTHER ITEMS AND I
14 WANT TO THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL THAT YOU DO. WITH THAT, IF
15 YOU CAN HELP ME WITH RESPECT TO ANY OF OUR TASK FORCE MEMBERS
16 WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE ANY FURTHER COMMENTS OR PROVIDE ANY
17 SUGGESTIONS OR GUIDANCE. I HAVE A FEW COMMENTS, BUT I WOULD
18 LIKE TO KEEP THEM UNTIL THE OTHER TASK FORCE MEMBERS COMPLETE
19 THEIRS.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. FIRST UP IS MEMBER POWERS.

22

23 **ROBERT POWERS:** CHAIRPERSON, HARTNETT, THANK YOU FOR YOUR
24 LEADERSHIP, AND VICE CHAIR HURSCH, AGAIN, MY APOLOGIES FOR
25 RUNNING A LITTLE BIT LATE. I HAD A MEETING THAT RAN INTO THIS



February 16, 2021

1 ONE. FIRST I WANT TO THANK THE PUBLIC SPEAKERS AND THE PUBLIC
2 COMMENTERS THERE. THEY'RE VERY INSIGHTFUL COMMENTS TO
3 IMPROVING RIDERSHIP AND ENCOURAGING RIDERSHIP AND MAKE TRANSIT
4 THE PREFERABLE OPTION OUT THERE OVER DRIVING. AND THE OTHER
5 GM'S CAN SPEAK FOR THEMSELVES. I AM DEFINITELY IN SUPPORT OF
6 THOSE COMMENTS AND THOSE THOUGHTS. SO THAT'S FIRST. SECOND,
7 THE -- I AM IN SUPPORT OF MOVING FORWARD WITH ALL OF THE
8 OPTIONS, CHAIRPERSON HARTNETT, AND THE PUBLIC COMMENT THERE,
9 ABOUT MR. BACON'S BRAIN AND MR. EISEMAN'S BRAIN. I WANT TO
10 SECOND THAT COMMENT. YOU GUYS HAVE DONE A GREAT JOB IN PULLING
11 THIS INFORMATION TOGETHER, YOU KNOW, TAKING IT THROUGH AND
12 PUTTING IT INTO A FORMAT THAT'S UNDERSTANDABLE. IT'S NOT AN
13 EASY TASK, BY ANY STRETCH OF THE IMAGINATIONS, AND THE TWO OF
14 YOU HAVE BEEN GREAT AT DOING IT, AND HAVE BEEN A GOOD TEAM,
15 YOU KNOW, FOR THE BAY AREA AND WORKING COLLECTIVELY TOGETHER.
16 JUST A SHOUT OUT TO BOTH OF YOU. AND THEN I DID WANT TO FOLLOW
17 UP, AND EISEMAN AND BACON, DON'T RESPOND IF YOU DO NOT WANT
18 TO, BUT I HOPE THAT WHEN YOU WORK THROUGH THE SCENARIOS, THAT
19 THERE WILL BE A CROSSWALK BACK TO THE EXISTING, YOU KNOW,
20 CONDITIONS THAT ARE NOW, THAT ARE SOME QUALITATIVE AND
21 QUANTITATIVE IN BETWEEN THE OPTIONS AS WELL, THE SIX OPTIONS.
22 I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU'RE THINKING ABOUT DOING THAT BUT IF YOU
23 COMPARE THE SIX TO EACH OTHER AND THEN CROSSWALKS BACK TO THE
24 EXISTING. HOWEVER -- YOU KNOW, I'M NOT GOING TO GET INTO THE



February 16, 2021

1 MIDDLE OF YOUR TWO SMART BRAINS I WOULD DEFER TO YOU ON THAT
2 BUT HOPEFULLY YOU WILL BE LOOKING AT SOME OF THAT.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS DENIS MULLIGAN.

5

6 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I WANT TO THANK MY COLLEAGUES, I HATS OFF TO
7 YOU HARTNETT AND HURSCH AND STAFF AND THE PUBLIC THAT ARE
8 HELPING SHAPE THIS AS WE MOVE FORWARD. IT'S HEARTENING TO SEE
9 THE QUALITY OF WORK BEING DONE AND THE HIGH LEVEL OF INTEREST
10 FROM THE COMMUNITY AT-LARGE HATS OFF TO EVERYBODY. I'M LOOKING
11 FORWARD TO THE JOURNEY MOVING FORWARD.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HALLS.

14

15 **DARYL HALLS:** I WANT TO THANK JIM HARTNETT FOR BEING OUR
16 ESTEEMED CHAIR. I WISH YOU GOOD LUCK IN YOUR NEXT ENDEAVOR. I
17 THINK BILL AND MIKE DID A GREAT JOB IN GIVING US THE SIX
18 OPTIONS, GIVING US A GOOD RANGE OF THINGS AND DATA TO LOOK AT.
19 I REPRESENT A COUNTY WITH FIVE SMALL OPERATORS. SO, WE'LL BE
20 TALKING ABOUT THIS. IT GIVES US SOMETHING GOOD TO WORK WITH. I
21 WANT TO CONGRATULATE THE EFFORT SO FAR.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MORE COMMITTEE MEMBERS WITH
24 THEIR HANDS RAISED.

25



February 16, 2021

1 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MADAM SECRETARY. I DON'T WANT
2 TO REPEAT ALL THE COMMENT OF MY FELLOW TASK FORCE MEMBERS
3 OTHER THAN TO EMPHASIZE A COUPLE OF THINGS, ONE IS MEMBER
4 POWERS TALKING ABOUT CROSSWALKING BACK TO THE EXISTING
5 CONDITIONS, I THINK IS REALLY IMPORTANT. AND SECONDLY, WITH
6 RESPECT TO HIS COMMENTS ON MR. BACON AND MR. EISEMAN, I WAS
7 GLAD TO HEAR THAT THEY CERTAINLY HAVE JOB SECURITY EITHER WHAT
8 THEY'RE DOING NOW OR FUTURE JOBS THAT THEY'RE BEING
9 RECOMMENDED FOR TODAY. BUT THEY'RE WELL WORTH IT. I DO SUPPORT
10 LOOKING AT ALL THE OPTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN PRESENTED. AND ONE I
11 PARTICULARLY LIKED ABOUT WHAT WE'RE DOING, IS I THINK WE'RE
12 GOING TO BE DRIVEN BY DATA. I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT.
13 THE DATA THAT'S BEING DERIVED FROM THE STUDY, BOTH AS IT
14 RELATES TO RIDERSHIP AND COST, AND REALLY PRIORITIZATION OF
15 INVESTMENT. I THINK THIS'S WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IN SOME
16 RESPECTS HERE. WE HAVE TO CONSIDER THE CONTEXT WITHIN WHAT
17 WE'RE OPERATING I THINK IS IMPORTANT AS WE FRAME FINAL
18 DECISIONS THAT THE DECISION IS FRAMED IN THE CONTEXT OF WHAT
19 ARE THE OBSTACLES TO RIDERSHIP BOTH FARE AND NON-FARE. WHERE
20 IS THE BEST INVESTMENT THAT CAN BE MADE THAT WILL INCREASE THE
21 RIDERSHIP, AND WHERE IS THE MONEY GOING TO COME FROM TO DO
22 THAT IF IT IS REQUIRING ADDITIONAL CHANGES TO SERVICE OR COST
23 TO SUPPORT THE SERVICE. WITH THAT I'M VERY HAPPY WITH THE WORK
24 THAT'S BEEN DONE, AND I WILL CONTINUE TO FOLLOW IT, AND I'LL
25 MAKE SURE THAT WHOEVER TAKES MY PLACE ON THE TASK FORCE IS



February 16, 2021

1 WELL INFORMED AND AN ACTIVE PARTICIPANT. SO WITH THAT, MADAM
2 CLERK, I THINK THAT GETS US TO AGENDA ITEM SIX, PUBLIC
3 COMMENTS. AND COULD YOU ADDRESS ANY MATTERS THAT HAVE BEEN
4 BROUGHT TO US BY WRITTEN COMMENT, AND/OR WHETHER OR NOT WE
5 HAVE HANDS UP ON PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS THAT ARE NOT ON THE
6 AGENDA.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE REMINDED TO
9 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE IF THEY WOULD
10 LIKE TO SPEAK ON GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT AND WRITTEN PUBLIC
11 COMMENT THAT WAS SUBMITTED BY THE 5:00 P.M. DEADLINE IT HAS
12 BEEN POSTED ONLINE AND HAS BECOME SUBMITTED TO COMMITTEE
13 MEMBERS SUBMITTED BY JONATHON NOON, JK BINARY, SIMON TAN, SARA
14 BURNHAM, GREG AND BILL, DAVID BARTENOF, DAVID FERRELL AND
15 TYLER PULLIN. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
16 THEIR HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME.

17

18 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MADAM SECRETARY. ARE
19 THERE ANY OTHER MEMBERS WHO HAVE BUSINESS?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ITEM FOUR SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT.

22

23 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** I BELIEVE THAT WAS PRESENTED BY MS. LEVIN
24 DURING THE COURSE OF ITEM 5A.

25



February 16, 2021

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THE REMINDER ON THAT. I
4 THINK WE HAVE A COUPLE OF HANDS UP, MAYBE FROM TASK FORCE
5 MEMBERS.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HURSCH?

8

9 **MICHAEL HURSCH, VICE CHAIR:** YEAH, THANK YOU, CHAIR HARTNETT. I
10 WANT TO THANK FOR VOLUNTEERING ME TO BE YOUR VICE CHAIR, AND
11 FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP. ANY CREDIT THEY GET HAS NOT BEEN EARNED
12 THIS HAS BEEN EXCELLENT LEADERSHIP ON YOUR PART. BILL AND
13 MIKE, THE THREE OF US ARE GOING TO WORK OUR HARDEST TO TRY TO
14 BRING THE KNOWLEDGE THAT JIM HAS BROUGHT TO THIS. I WISH YOU
15 THE BEST ON YOUR ENDEAVORS AND SUCCESS IN ENJOYMENT. I WANT TO
16 SAY THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING YOU HAVE DONE IN YOUR LEADERSHIP
17 AND WILL DO MY BEST TO KEEP THIS THING MOVING FORWARD.

18

19 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MIKE. VERY KIND.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
22 THEIR HAND RAISED.

23

24 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THAT TAKES US TO AGENDA ITEM SEVEN
25 ADJOURNMENT, OUR NEXT MEETING WILL BE SCHEDULED APRIL 9TH,



February 16, 2021

1 2021, AT 1:05 P.M. REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST. THANK YOU ALL VERY
2 MUCH AND TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO COMMENTED AND STOOD WITH
3 US THROUGH THE COURSE OF THE MEETING. AND THANK YOU TASK FORCE
4 MEMBERS. HAVE A GOOD REST OF THE DAY. THANK YOU ALL.

5 [ADJOURNED]

6



Broadcasting Government