

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



February 10, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**
3 **WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 10, 2021, 1:35 PM**

4
5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND WELCOME TO THE
6 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
7 MEETING OF FEBRUARY 10TH, 2021. I'M RANDI KINMAN CHAIR OF THE
8 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. WE WILL GO INTO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
9 TWO, ROLL CALL, PLEASE

10
11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI? YOU MAY HAVE TO UNMUTE
12 YOURSELF. THANK YOU.

13
14 **RICHARD BURNETT:** HERE.

15
16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CASTELLANOS? I SEE YOU. COATS IS HAVING
17 TROUBLE JOINING. COCHRAN?

18
19 **ABIGAIL COCHRAN:** HERE.

20
21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED? ANNE OLIVIA?

22
23 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

24
25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLOREZ?



February 10, 2021

1

2 **VEDA FLOREZ:** HERE .

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLOVER?

5

6 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** HERE .

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOTUACO?

9

10 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** HERE .

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HEDGES?

13

14 **RICH HEDGES:** HERE .

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HERNANDEZ? **SPEAKER:** HERE .

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

19

20 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE . **KINMAN?**

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HERE .

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

25



February 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE .

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LOPEZ?

4

5 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** HERE .

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MADDEN?

8

9 **MARC MADDEN:** HERE .

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MENDOZA .

12

13 **ADRIAN MENDOZA:** HERE .

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MOMOH?

16

17 **RAHMOM MOMOH:** HERE .

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MURRAY?

20

21 **CYNTHIA MURRAY, VICE CHAIR:** HERE .

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BEN SCHWENG?

24

25 **BENJAMIN SCHWENG:** HERE .



February 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

3

4 **TERRY SCOTT:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND WILSON IS EXCUSED. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

7

8 **RICK COATES:** I WANT TO SAY I GOT MY SOUND WORKING FINALLY. NOT
9 SURE WHY.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WELCOME RICK. WE'LL GO INTO ITEM NUMBER
12 THREE CHAIR'S REPORT. I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE WE'RE SEEING A
13 LARGE TURN OVER IN THE COMMISSION NOW WHICH IS UNUSUAL AFTER
14 AN ELECTION CYCLE SO FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVE NEW
15 COMMISSIONERS YOU MIGHT WANT TO SEND THEM A QUICK NOTE AND SAY
16 HOWDY. ALSO I WANT TO LET YOU KNOW, THOSE WHO HAVE BEEN AROUND
17 FOR A WHILE, WE ARE GOING TO BE SEEING JAKE MACKENZIE AND
18 SCOTT HAGGERTY AT THEIR LAST MEETINGS FOR MTC, WHICH, THEY'RE
19 THE ONLY -- THEY'RE A COUPLE OF THE ONES WHO HAVE BEEN AROUND
20 FOR AS LONG AS I HAVE. SO YOU CAN ALWAYS POP INTO THE MEETING,
21 THE COMMISSION MEETING, JUST TO GREET THEM OR SAY GOODBYE AND
22 THAT MEANS WE WILL HAVE A CHANGE IN THE COMMISSION CHAIR AT
23 THAT MEETING. I DO WANT TO LET PEOPLE KNOW I'M GOING TO ASK
24 PEOPLE TO BOOK EXTRA TIME INSTEAD OF THE NORMAL TWO HOURS FOR
25 THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS. NEXT MONTH, NOT SO MUCH, BUT APRIL,



February 10, 2021

1 MAY, JUNE, WE ARE TRYING TO WRAP UP A LOT OF PROJECTS THAT ARE
2 IN THE HOPPER, WITH SOME REALLY DENSE MATERIAL, MAY AND JUNE,
3 ESPECIALLY, PLAN ON BEING AT A LONGER MEETING, IF YOU CAN.
4 BECAUSE WE REALLY NEED TO COMPLETE ALL THIS. AND IT'S EASIER
5 TO EXTEND THESE MEETINGS THAN IT IS TO TRY AND FIGURE OUT HOW
6 TO HOLD A COMPLETELY SEPARATE MEETING WITH THE RESTRICTIONS
7 THAT WE HAVE. BECAUSE WE ARE BROADCASTING EVERYTHING THIS WAY
8 DURING COVID. SO THAT IS THE ONLY THINGS I HAVE TO OFFER FOR
9 CHAIR'S REPORT. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO ITEM FOUR APPROVAL OF
10 THE JANUARY 13TH, 2021 MEETING MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION?

11

12 **RICHARD HEDGES:** APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.

13

14 **VEDA FLOREZ:** SECOND.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WAS THAT RICH HEDGES WHO JUMPED IN FIRST?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RICH HEDGES MOTION AND MICHAEL BALDINI
19 SECOND.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE WERE JUST A LOT OF
22 VOICES THERE ON MY END. IS THERE ANY COMMENTS THAT WE HAVE
23 RECEIVED? ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC -- AND THE
24 PUBLIC SHOULD REMEMBER TO USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL
25 STAR NINE IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK.



February 10, 2021

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
3 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
4 HANDS RAISED.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO A VOTE,
7 PLEASE.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VOTE BY HEDGES, SECOND BY BALDINI. [ROLL
10 CALL VOTE] ANNE OLIVIA IS RAISING HER HAND. I COUNTED YOU AS
11 AN AYE. DO YOU STILL WANT TO TALK OLIVIA?

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I THINK THAT IS YES.

14

15 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I'M HAVING TROUBLE UNMUTING. YOU ARE
16 CORRECT.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WITH THAT ITEM FIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ITEMS
19 NOT ON THE AGENDA, HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT OR ARE
20 THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM
23 AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

24



February 10, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ITEM SIX SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT EQUITY AND
2 ACCESS IS UP FIRST.

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON I'M VEDA FLOREZ FROM MARIN COUNTY
5 THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MET ON JANUARY 13TH WE HAD
6 TWO ITEMS THAT WE DISCUSSED. THE FIRST WAS AN UPDATE FROM THE
7 -- RANDI KINMAN ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. WE THEN HAD A
8 ROBUST CONVERSATION ON THE INTERNSHIP PROGRAM THE REIMAGINE
9 INTERNSHIP PROGRAM FOR 2021 WILL BE A SMALLER COHORT THIS
10 YEAR, AND JUST TO HAVE 11 PEOPLE FOR THE 2021 COLLEGE COHORT.
11 WE HAD A LOT OF SUPPORT FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND IT'S
12 UNFORTUNATE THIS YEAR WE HAVE IT PAIRED DOWN BUT IF WE COULD
13 GET ONE PERSON, ONE STUDENT FROM EACH COUNTY I THINK IT WOULD
14 BE A FANTASTIC THING. THERE IS ALSO A HIGH SCHOOL INTERNSHIP
15 PROGRAM, BUT THIS YEAR IT WILL BE JUST A SERIES OF JUST ZOOM
16 INFORMATION ONLY CALLS. SO WE COULD HAVE MORE STUDENTS
17 PARTICIPATE, BUT THAT WILL NOT BE A PAID INTERNSHIP PROGRAM.
18 SO THE NEXT EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL MEET ON MARCH
19 1ST. WHERE WE WILL DISCUSS THE PLANNED BAY AREA EQUITY
20 ANALYSIS. AND ANOTHER UPDATE FROM THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE.
21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS FOR
24 THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE? FROM THE COUNCIL? I SEE



February 10, 2021

1 NONE. NO HAND RAISED. WITH THAT, ADINA, THE POLICY ADVISORY
2 FARE COORDINATION INTEGRATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. GREAT. THE SUBCOMMITTEE MET AND
5 DISCUSSED A VERY ROBUST AND COMPREHENSIVE PICTURE FROM STAFF
6 ABOUT A WIDE VARIETY OF OPTIONS FOR FARE COORDINATION AND
7 INTEGRATION AND GOT OUR COMMENTS ON THE OPTIONS, AND STAFF IS
8 TAKING OUR INPUT INTO ACCOUNT, AND IS PRESENTING A STREAMLINED
9 SET OF OPTIONS FOR THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IN THE --
10 THEIR UPCOMING MEETING ON FEBRUARY THE 16th. THE FARE
11 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IS A BODY THAT IS COMPOSED OF GENERAL
12 MANAGERS REPRESENTING LARGE AND SMALL AGENCIES WHO WILL WEIGH
13 IN ON THE SET OF OPTIONS THAT WILL BE COVERED FOR PEOPLE WHO
14 ARE INTERESTED IN THAT, THAT MEETING IS NEXT WEEK, TUESDAY.
15 AND THAT IS MY REPORT.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS OR
18 COMMENTS ON THE FARE INTEGRATION? MARTHA IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
19 COMMENT?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
22 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
23 HAND RAISED.

24



February 10, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL GO INTO ITEM
2 NUMBER SEVEN THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE
3 UPDATE AND I THINK WE HAVE MELANIE CHOY ON DECK WITH THAT.

4
5 **THERESA ROMMELL:** IT'S ACTUALLY ME AGAIN, THIS IS THERESA.

6
7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HI THERESA.

8
9 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I'M PRETTY MUCH THE REGULAR WITH THIS ITEM.
10 AS USUAL, HELLO EVERYBODY, THERESA ROMMEL WITH THE FUNDING
11 POLICY AND PROGRAMS. AND AS IN PAST MEETINGS MY PLAN FOR THIS
12 UPDATE IS TO KIND OF RECAP THE LAST BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
13 RECOVERY TASK FORCE MEETING THAT HAPPENED IN JANUARY AND ALSO
14 GIVE A PREVIEW OF UPCOMING MEETINGS. IN JANUARY THE TASK FORCE
15 TOOK UP TOPICS RELATED TO THE TASK FORCE GOALS OF EQUITY,
16 CURRENT INITIATIVES AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT. ON THE EQUITY
17 FRONT, FIVE DRAFT PRINCIPLES WERE PRESENTED WHICH INCLUDE
18 INVEST EQUITABLY, INCREASE ACCESSIBILITY, BE INCLUSIVE, USE
19 DATA TO INFORM DECISIONS, AND ADVANCED HEALTH AND SAFETY, AND
20 OF COURSE THOSE ARE THE TITLES AND THERE ARE CORRESPONDING
21 DESCRIPTIONS AS TO WHICH -- WHAT THOSE MEAN. I WANT TO
22 HIGHLIGHT THAT IN DRAFTING THESE PRINCIPLES, THERE WERE -- WAS
23 SIGNIFICANT OUTREACH CONDUCTED, NOT ONLY WITH TASK FORCE
24 MEMBERS, BUT ALSO TO RIDERS THROUGH COMMUNITY-BASED
25 ORGANIZATIONS, AND THE COMMENTS MADE THROUGH FOCUS GROUPS,



February 10, 2021

1 COORDINATED BY THESE CBOS OR THESE COMMUNITY-BASED
2 ORGANIZATIONS WERE INCLUDED WITH THE MEETING MATERIALS AND
3 THERE WAS PRETTY UNANIMOUS AGREEMENT THAT THE COMMENTS WERE
4 INSIGHTFUL AND WILL HELP THE TASK FORCE GOING FORWARD BEYOND
5 THE EQUITY PRINCIPLES. THE EQUITY PRINCIPLES WERE CONFIRMED
6 WITH A COUPLE OF CHANGES TO THE DESCRIPTIONS OF TWO OF THE
7 PRINCIPLES ONE OF WHICH WAS TO BE SURE TO INCLUDE SENIORS AS
8 ONE OF THE GROUPS OF RIDERS THAT SHOULD BENEFIT FROM INCREASED
9 ACCESSIBILITY SO THAT WAS AN ADDITION MADE DURING THE TASK
10 FORCE MEETING. NEXT ON THE AGENDA WAS A PRESENTATION ON
11 CURRENT INITIATIVES, SHOWCASING THREE, IN PARTICULAR,
12 INCLUDING FARE INTEGRATION, REGIONAL MAPPING, AND WAYFINDING,
13 AND TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS. THE PURPOSE OF THESE
14 PRESENTATIONS WAS TO SET CONTEXT FOR PAST AND ONGOING WORK
15 THAT WOULD HELP INFORM THE ACTION PLAN ALSO TO HELP THE TASK
16 FORCE TO CONSIDER RESPONSIBILITIES AND ROLES WHERE
17 CENTRALIZING DECISION MAKING COULD BENEFIT RIDERS AND CONSIDER
18 ENDORSEMENT OF INITIATIVES EFFORT ANDS AND INCLUSION IN THE
19 ACTION PLAN. RETURNING TO NETWORK MANAGEMENT NEXT UP ON THE
20 AGENDA WAS THE REVIEW OF THE DRAFT PROBLEM STATEMENTS
21 CONSTRUCTED BY AN AD-HOC WORKING GROUP PRIOR TO THE TASK FORCE
22 MEETING. THE WORKING GROUP WAS COMPRISED OF STAFF NOMINATED BY
23 TASK FORCE MEMBERS. THE DRAFT PROBLEM STATEMENT INCLUDED FOUR
24 MAIN AREAS INCLUDING ORGANIZATIONAL OR INSTITUTIONAL
25 CHALLENGES, YOU KNOW, HOW DO LOCALLY ORIENTED GOVERNANCE, HOW



February 10, 2021

1 DOES THAT MAKE IT DIFFICULT TO ACHIEVE REGIONAL CONSENSUS AND
2 COOPERATION, HOW NIMBLE CAN SO MANY OPERATORS ABOUT IN
3 COORDINATED RESPONSES AND HOW DO THESE CHALLENGES, YOU KNOW,
4 HINDER CONSOLIDATED PLANNING AND SERVICE DELIVERY. SO THAT WAS
5 THE ORGANIZATIONAL AND INSTITUTIONAL CHALLENGES CATEGORY OF
6 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE WAS ANOTHER CATEGORY, TRANSIT IS TOO SLOW
7 AND UNRELIABLE TRIPS EVER CONFUSING LACK OF TRIP PLANNING REAL
8 AND PERCEIVED SECURITY CONCERNS, NEXT CATEGORY IS CURRENT AND
9 PAST DISPARITIES AND THE FINAL CATEGORY WAS TRANSIT COSTS AND
10 FUNDING. SO THERE WAS, AGAIN, DISCUSSION WITH A PARTICULAR
11 FOCUS ON FUNDING. YOU KNOW, THE FACT THAT, YOU KNOW, SOME
12 PERSPECTIVES ARE THAT A LOT CAN BE DONE WITHIN THE EXISTING
13 FUNDING AND AUTHORITY, AND THE NEED FOR THE PUBLIC TO SEE
14 SIGNIFICANT CHANGE IN EXCHANGE FOR INCREASED FUNDING SUPPORT.
15 UP NEXT WAS A DISCUSSION OF POTENTIAL ROLES AND
16 RESPONSIBILITIES FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT, THESE WERE GROUPED
17 INTO CUSTOMER-FACING AND INTUITIONAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE
18 CATEGORIES. THERE WAS A LOT OF DISCUSSION HERE AS WELL AS TO
19 WHAT'S MISSING, WHAT SHOULD BE PRIORITIZED, ET CETERA. AND THE
20 NEXT UP IN THIS DISCUSSION WILL OCCUR AT ANOTHER AD-HOC
21 WORKING GROUP MEETING BUT THIS ONE WILL BE COMPRISED OF TASK
22 FORCE MEMBERS AND THAT'S SCHEDULED FOR FEBRUARY 17TH. SO
23 HOPEFULLY THE WORKING -- THAT WORKING GROUP WILL BE SUCCESSFUL
24 IN KIND OF REFINING THE PREFERABLE'S AND RESPONSIBILITIES AND
25 WILL COME BACK TO THE TASK FORCE FOR CLARITY AND DISCUSSION



February 10, 2021

1 WHICH WILL CONTINUE IN THE COMING MONTHS. THAT'S KIND OF A
2 RECAP OF THE LAST MEETING. THE NEXT BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
3 MEETING IS SCHEDULED FOR FEBRUARY 22ND. AND THAT AGENDA WILL
4 LIKELY BE FOCUSED ON NETWORK MANAGEMENT IN TOTALITY INCLUDING
5 FINALIZE OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT PROBLEM STATEMENT THAT WAS
6 DISCUSSED IN JANUARY. A DISCUSSION OF WHAT COMES OUT OF THAT
7 FEBRUARY 17TH AD-HOC WORKING GROUP ON THE POTENTIAL SCOPE OF
8 NETWORK MANAGEMENT, WHAT ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES MIGHT BE
9 INCLUDED, AND ALSO A PREVIEW OF THE DRAFT SCOPE OF WORK FOR A
10 CONSULTANT WHO WOULD BE ENGAGED TO ASSIST IN THE NETWORK
11 MANAGEMENT WORK BETWEEN MARCH AND JUNE. SO WE HOPE, AT THIS
12 POINT, TO HAVE A MORE DEFINED SCOPE OF WORK ON WHAT THAT
13 CONSULTANT WOULD BE ABLE TO ASSIST WITH. THAT'S MY REPORT AND
14 I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WERE YOU AT THE MEETINGS WITH
17 THE LARGE AND SMALL OPERATORS THAT WERE HELD IN BETWEEN?

18

19 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I DID LISTEN INTO THOSE. YES.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY.

22

23 **THERESA ROMMELL:** DID YOU WANT ME TO GIVE ANY PERSPECTIVE?
24 INSIGHT?

25



February 10, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH, IF YOU HAVE SOME.

2

3 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I THINK THE SMALL OPERATOR MEETING WAS VERY
4 INFORMATIVE AND IT WAS REALLY TO GET THERE, THE BOARD MEMBERS
5 PROGRAM ON HAVING WHY SOME LOCAL CONTROL OVER SYSTEMS AND
6 THEIR OPERATIONS THERE IS SO IMPORTANT PRIMARILY BECAUSE
7 EVERYBODY HAS DIFFERENT PRIORITIES WITH THEIR TRANSIT SERVICE
8 WHAT THEY'RE TRYING TO PROVIDE WHETHER SCHOOL SERVICE OR ON
9 DEMAND THEY ALL HAVE SEEMINGLY DIFFERENT NEEDS AND PRIORITIES
10 WHICH IS WHY THEY'RE A LITTLE BIT MORE PROTECTIVE OF THE LOCAL
11 CONTROL ELEMENT. I THINK THAT WAS KIND OF THE THEME THEY HEARD
12 FROM THE SMALLER OPERATOR MEETINGS, AND THE LARGER OPERATOR
13 BOARD MEMBERS, I THINK, WERE ALSO WARY ABOUT GIVING UP CONTROL
14 OF THEIR SYSTEMS, BUT, YOU KNOW, THEIR JUSTIFICATION FOR THAT
15 IS THAT, YOU KNOW, HONESTLY, WHO IS GOING TO BE ACCOUNTABLE,
16 REALLY, IF AC TRANSIT LEAVES SOMEBODY BEHIND AND THEY MISS
17 THEIR MEETING OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT, WHO IS THAT PERSON GOING
18 TO COME AND COMPLAIN TO IF IT'S JUST ONE BIG ORGANIZATION, OR
19 DO THEY GO TO AC TRANSIT AND COMPLAIN. YOU KNOW, OTHER THINGS
20 WERE LIKE, HOW NIMBLE COULD A BIG ORGANIZATION BE TO ADJUST
21 CHANGING PRIORITIES AND NEEDS. YOU KNOW, IN SAN FRANCISCO, FOR
22 EXAMPLE, HOW COULD A BIG REGIONAL AGENCY BE REALLY NIMBLE
23 ENOUGH TO RESPOND TO EVENTS ARE OR SUCCESSES WITHIN THE CITY
24 ITSELF. THAT OF COURSE, AND THEN FUNDING IS A BIG ISSUE, IF
25 FUNDING IS NOT AVAILABLE AND THERE IS SOME SORT OF NETWORK



February 10, 2021

1 MANAGEMENT, YOU KNOW, REQUIREMENT IT'S KIND OF LIKE AN FUNDED
2 MANDATE, HOW DO THE INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS RESPOND TO THAT
3 WITHIN THEIR BUDGETS AND IF THEY HAVE TO CUT SERVICE BECAUSE
4 THEY DON'T HAVE ENOUGH MONEY HOW DOES THAT WORK WITHIN
5 IMPROVING THE SYSTEM. THOSE ARE THE KIND OF PERSPECTIVES THAT
6 WE HEARD AT THOSE MEETINGS AND RANDI I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WANT
7 TO ADD ANYTHING TO THAT.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH, I'M NOT AN EMPLOYEE, SO I CAN BE
10 LESS DISCRETE. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO WEREN'T AWARE, THE TASK
11 FORCE HELD TWO RAPID MEETINGS WITH THE SMALL OPERATORS AND THE
12 LARGE OPERATORS, LIKE, BACK TO BACK, TWO WEEKS AGO -- LAST
13 WEEK? WHAT I FOUND REALLY INTERESTING, ACROSS THE BOARD, WAS
14 THE -- THE ABSOLUTE LACK OF UNDERSTANDING THAT THE TASK FORCE
15 HAS BEEN MEETING. IT SEEMS LIKE THE INFORMATION FROM THE TASK
16 FORCE ISN'T BEING FED DIRECTLY TO THE OPERATORS APPROPRIATELY,
17 WHICH I AM KIND OF CONCERNED ABOUT. FROM THE SMALL OPERATORS
18 IT WAS, WE'RE REALLY NIMBLE, WE MANAGED TO MAKE A LOT OF
19 CHANGES, NO PROBLEMS HERE, EXCEPT THAT AT, YOU KNOW, RIDERSHIP
20 IS DOWN. AND, OH, BY THE WAY, WE USED TO HAVE -- AND WE STILL
21 HAVE ONGOING CONNECTION PROBLEMS. BUT THEY WERE REALLY FOCUSED
22 ON THEIR LOCAL ISSUES. AND I -- AND IT WAS A REALLY GOOD
23 DISCUSSION. THE LARGE OPERATORS, HOWEVER, IT WAS A, YOU'RE NOT
24 GOING TO TAKE OUR TOYS KIND OF THING. IT WAS -- THERE WAS SOME
25 HOSTILITY, AND I WILL CALL IT HOSTILITY, BECAUSE IT -- AND,



February 10, 2021

1 AGAIN, I WANT TO SAY THAT THIS WAS A LACK OF UNDERSTANDING
2 THAT, WHAT IS DRIVING THIS IS AN HONEST DESIRE TO RESPONSIVE
3 TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC, WHO, TIME AFTER TIME, NO MATTER HOW
4 MANY TIMES WE PULL, SAY THE SAME THINGS WE COULDN'T MAKE
5 CONNECTIONS WE CAN'T GET ACROSS THE DISTRICT, WE COULDN'T --
6 YOU KNOW, ALL OF THESE COMPLAINTS HAVE BEEN FUNNELED INTO
7 THIS, SO THAT AS WE GO FORWARD, WE'RE ADDRESSING THOSE
8 COMPLAINTS AS WE GO. IT'S NOT -- THERE WAS A LOT MUCH MTC IS
9 NOT GOING TO TAKE OVER OUR BUSINESS, TYPE THING. SO I REALLY
10 WAS KIND OF TAKEN ABACK BY THAT ASPECT OF IT IN THAT I REALLY
11 DIDN'T THINK THAT THEY HAD A GOOD GRASP OF THE REALITY OF
12 THIS, OF WHAT -- IT -- YOU GET TO SAY, YEAH, WE HAVE BEEN
13 DOING GOOD, IT'S JUST THIS NASTY LITTLE PANDEMIC THAT IS
14 REALLY SCREWED US UP; WHEN ALL THE POLLING IS SHOWING THAT'S
15 NOT THE CASE AND WE HAVE THIS BACKLOG OF CUSTOMER COMPLAINTS.
16 TO ME THAT WAS THE REAL DISCONNECT AND PART OF THAT IS BECAUSE
17 THEIR RESPONSIBILITY IS TO LOOK AT THEIR NETWORK AND I DON'T
18 THINK THAT THEY HAVE REALLY BEEN INVESTED IN THE CONNECTIVITY
19 THAT IS REQUIRED TO GET THROUGH THE REGION SO THAT'S WHERE, I
20 THINK, SOME OF THE MISUNDERSTANDINGS COME FROM. BUT IT WAS
21 REALLY -- I THOUGHT THAT THE TWO MEETINGS HAD TWO COMPLETELY
22 DIFFERENT FLAVORS TO THEM. IT WAS -- IT WAS KIND OF -- IT WAS
23 DIFFERENT. IT WAS AMAZING. BUT WITH THAT I'M GOING TO START
24 TAKING COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS FROM THE ADVISORY COUNCIL. RICH
25 HEDGES, YOU'RE UP FIRST.



February 10, 2021

1
2 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. MY COMMENTS ARE GOING TO CENTER
3 AROUND SOME OF YOUR ALREADY MADE COMMENTS, RANDI, ESPECIALLY
4 WITH THE BIG PROVIDERS AND THEIR RELUCTANCE WHICH HAS BEEN
5 ONGOING FOR YEARS WHEN MTC IS TRYING TO RATIONALIZE THIS
6 SYSTEM. I'M REALLY PUT OUT WITH BART, FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS.
7 QUITE FRANKLY, BART MAKES DECISIONS FOR TWO COUNTIES, YOURS
8 AND MINE, WHO ARE TOO STUPID TO TAKE PART IN THE ORIGINAL
9 SYSTEM, BUT NOW FUNNEL MILLIONS AND MILLIONS OF DOLLARS A YEAR
10 TO BART WITHOUT ANY SAY IN THE OPERATION OF BART. MY COUNTY
11 SENDS MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OUT AND IS THERE ANY PLACE WHERE WE
12 PAY A MUCH HIGHER FARE TO GET ON THE BART SYSTEM, AND I THINK
13 YOU PROBABLY DO TOO IN SAN JOSE, BUT I DON'T KNOW THAT FOR
14 SURE, BUT \$90 MILLION ALONE WAS SYPHONED OFF OF MEASURE TWO
15 FUNDS FOR THE DUMBARTON RAIL TO THE SOUTHWARD EXPANSION OF
16 BART TO SAN JOSE. SO, BUT STILL, WE HAVE NO VOICE ON THE
17 OPERATION OF BART. AND THAT NEEDS TO CHANGE, NUMBER ONE.
18 NUMBER TWO, IT'S NOT JUST THE ISSUE OF CONNECTIONS. PEOPLE
19 WERE VOTING WITH THEIR FEET ON BART, ESPECIALLY, BEFORE THIS
20 PANDEMIC, AND LEAVING BART BECAUSE OF SAFETY CONCERNS. AND,
21 QUITE FRANKLY, I'M NOT GOING TO NAME ANY NAMES, BUT EMPLOYEES
22 OF THIS COMMISSION HAVE TOLD ME THEY NO LONGER RIDE BART OFF
23 PEAK BECAUSE OF SAFETY CONCERNS. I HAVE NOT GONE THAT FAR. I
24 TAKE CHANCES. I'M ONLY NOT RIDING IT NOW BECAUSE OF THE
25 PANDEMIC, I'M NOT GOING TO GIVE UP ON TRANSIT. BUT MANY, MANY



February 10, 2021

1 PEOPLE ARE. SO BART NEEDS TO HAVE A DOSE OF REALITY. AND IF
2 IT'S NOT GIVEN, THE RIDERSHIP WHICH FUNDS A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT
3 OF THEIR OPERATION WILL NOT COME BACK. THANK YOU.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA AND THEN VEDA, GO AHEAD
6 ADINA.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO HAVING LISTENED TO ALL OF THE LARGE OPERATOR
9 AND PART OF THE SMALL OPERATOR DISCUSSION, IT SEEMED LIKE
10 THERE WAS SOME, YOU KNOW, VALID CONCERNS RAISED ABOUT
11 PROPOSALS THAT HAVE NOT BEEN MADE. SO THERE WERE CONCERNS, YOU
12 KNOW, WILL THERE BE A CENTRALIZED ENTITY DISGUISED --
13 DECIDING WHERE TO PUT A BUS STOP. AND THE GOOD NEWS IS, THAT
14 IS NOT A PROPOSAL THAT ANYBODY HAS MADE, AND AS THERE ARE
15 PROPOSALS COMING FORWARD, IT WOULD BE GOOD TO STATE, YOU KNOW,
16 WHAT THE SEPARATION OF CONCERN SHOULD BE THAT YOU WANT TO HAVE
17 LOCAL AGENCIES DECIDING, YOU KNOW, WHERE THE BUS STOP IS, AND
18 SO ON, AND CONCERNS ABOUT THINGS LIKE, YOU KNOW, TAKING AWAY
19 MONEY FROM LOCAL TRANSIT TO FUND REGIONAL TRANSIT AND GOING
20 AHEAD WITH AN UNFUNDED MANDATE TO SAY, DO EXPENSIVE THINGS
21 WITHOUT ANY NEW MONEY. FORTUNATELY, THERE ARE NO SUCH
22 PROPOSALS TO DO THOSE BAD THINGS, AND IT WOULD BE GOOD AS ANY
23 PROPOSALS COME FORWARD TO TAKE THAT INTO ACCOUNT AND SAY, ANY
24 PROPOSAL SHOULD NOT DO THESE THINGS THAT ON, YOU KNOW,
25 AGENCIES HAVE SAID ARE VALID CONCERNS. THAT SAID, THE



February 10, 2021

1 CONVERSATION ABOUT FUNDING BEING NEEDED, IS, I THINK, LIKE,
2 GETTING THE WRONG ORDER OF THE HEAD AND THE TAIL OF THE DOG.
3 BECAUSE, LIKE, FOR EXAMPLE, ON HOUSING, IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO
4 SETUP A REGIONAL HOUSING FUNDING, THERE IS AN INSTITUTION THAT
5 WAS SETUP, A BUCKET TO POWER OF ATTORNEY MONEY INTO, AND THEN
6 TO BE ABLE TO SPEND THE MONEY AFTER, YOU KNOW -- SO -- INSTEAD
7 OF JUST POURING THE MONEY ON THE GROUND THERE IS A THING SET
8 UP TO CATCH THAT MONEY AND USE IT IN AN APPROPRIATE MANNER.
9 YOU KNOW, SIMILARLY, SINCE HAVING AN INTEGRATED SYSTEM IS SO
10 POPULAR, AND IS A -- MANY PEOPLE ARE SAYING THIS IS A
11 PREREQUISITE FOR REGIONAL FUNDING, HAVING A PLAN FOR HOW THAT
12 COORDINATION WOULD BE MANAGED AND MAKING A WAY FOR MAKING THAT
13 SYSTEM COORDINATED IS A GOOD IDEA AND IS THE OPPOSITE OF AN
14 UNFUNDED MANDATE. AND I THINK ANOTHER -- AND SO ALSO IN TERMS
15 OF ACCOUNTABILITY THERE IS THINGS MISSING BECAUSE IF YOU HAVE
16 A PROBLEM WITH A TRANSFER OR PROBLEM WITH HAVING TO PAY AN
17 EXPENSIVE FARE IF YOU USE WHO TWO OR THREE DIFFERENT COLORS OF
18 VEHICLE, YOU KNOW, WHERE DO YOU GO? DO YOU GO TO THREE
19 AGENCIES AT MTA? I'M SORRY -- AT MTC? SO, THERE IS A MISSING
20 PIECE OF ACCOUNTABILITY FOR ISSUES THAT ARE CROSS AGENCY TRIPS
21 THEY THINK THIS THOUGHT PROCESS CAN HELP TO CREATE FOR A PLACE
22 TO GO FOR RIDERS WHO ARE TRYING TO GET FROM PLACE TO PLACE
23 VERSUS, YOU KNOW, LIKE VERSUS EACH AGENCY. THOSE WERE SOME OF
24 THE POINTS THAT I WANT TO SHARE.
25



February 10, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VEDA THEN WENDI.

2

3 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION IT'S ALWAYS GREAT TO
4 HEAR AN UPDATE ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. I WAS PLEASED
5 THAT THE EQUITY PRINCIPLES WERE MOVED FORWARD, UNLIKE THE
6 ADDITION OF SENIORS. SENIORS WERE BEING LEFT OUT AND I WANT TO
7 APPLAUD MTC FOR INCLUDING THAT ASPECT, ESPECIALLY COMING FROM
8 THE EQUITY AND ACCESS GROUP. I ALSO WANTED TO MOVE FORWARD ON
9 THE IDEA, ON THE ADVANCED HEALTH AND SAFETY. I THINK IT WAS
10 ITEM NUMBER FOUR OR FIVE, THAT WE ALSO INCLUDE THE CLEANLINESS
11 OF OUR BUS STATIONS AND OUR BUS STOPS. I BROUGHT THE ISSUE TO
12 SOME OF OUR LOCAL PROVIDERS IN MY COUNTY, AND THEY DIDN'T
13 REALLY WANT TO TALK ABOUT THAT ISSUE. AND I THINK IT'S
14 IMPORTANT, ESPECIALLY DURING COVID TIMES THAT, WE ARE AWARE
15 THAT THERE ARE A LOT OF NASTY GERMS THAT ARE OUT THERE THAT
16 NEED TO BE CONSIDERED, BEYOND THE TRANSIT ITSELF. BEYOND THE
17 BUS, BEYOND THE TRAIN. SO IF YOU COULD BRING THAT FORWARD, I
18 WOULD APPRECIATE IT.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WENDI, AND THEN RAHMON.

21

22 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATES. I HAVE BEEN GOING TO
23 THE BLUE RIBBON, OF COURSE I HAVE BEEN ATTENDING THE FARE
24 INTEGRATION BEING ON THE ADVISORY COUNCIL. BUT I DIDN'T GO TO
25 THE MAJOR OPERATORS, AND I APPRECIATE HEARING THE REPORT ON



February 10, 2021

1 THEIR MEETING. I DON'T SEE WHY WE WOULD BE SURPRISED AT THEIR
2 RESPONSE TO WHAT'S BEING DISCUSSED, BECAUSE, OF COURSE, AS
3 EVERYONE HAS BEEN SAYING, WE HAVE BEEN TRYING TO DO THIS FOR
4 HOW MANY YEARS NOW? DECADES, REALLY. AND SO I THINK, AND YOU
5 LOOK AT SOME OF THE MAJOR OPERATORS LIKE BART, WHICH HAS A
6 REAL DEPENDENCY ON THEIR FARES, AS A MAJOR PART OF THEIR
7 FUNDING, UNLIKE A LOT OF THE SMALL OPERATORS, SO THE QUESTION
8 S REALLY, HOW DO WE GET THEM ON BOARD. BECAUSE, I THINK THAT,
9 YOU KNOW, THEY MIGHT HAVE THE ABILITY TO BLOCK THIS -- I GUESS
10 MY QUESTION IS, DO THEY HAVE THE ABILITY TO BLOCK, YOU KNOW,
11 THE FORWARD MOTION, OF GETTING AN OPERATOR. AND IF SO, HOW DO
12 WE GET THEM ON BOARD SO THAT THEY WILL NOT BLOCK IT?

13

14 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I CAN QUICKLY ANSWER THAT. I THINK THAT THE
15 MOMENTUM OF THE TASK FORCE IS TOWARDS SOME SORT OF LEGISLATION
16 WHICH WOULD BE, YOU KNOW, EITHER INSTITUTING SOME NETWORK
17 MANAGER ENTITY OR AT LEAST PROVIDING A DATE IN THE FUTURE WHEN
18 SOME SUCH AN ENTITY SHOULD BE ESTABLISHED, AND THAT WOULD KIND
19 OF -- THAT WOULD, YOU KNOW, HELP WITH THOSE AUTHORITY
20 QUESTIONS, WHETHER OR NOT BART HAS THE ABILITY TO, YOU KNOW,
21 STANDALONE AND SAY I'M NOT PART OF THIS, OR NOT.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND I THINK THAT WHAT WE'RE SEEING NOW IS
24 AN INITIAL REACTION, A HOT TAKE ON CHANGE, WHICH IS ALWAYS --
25 IT'S NEVER LIKE, YEAH, CHANGE. THAT NEVER HAPPENS. SO I THINK



February 10, 2021

1 THAT THE CONVERSATIONS NEEDED TO HAVE THAT KIND OF A DUMP. YOU
2 KNOW. AT THOSE TWO MEETINGS WHICH WAS STRATEGICALLY A REALLY
3 GOOD WAY OF DOING IT, BECAUSE NOW IT BRINGS THEM INTO THE
4 CONVERSATION. NOW THAT -- I KIND OF -- IT'S KIND OF LIKE, WE
5 HAVEN'T BEEN PAYING ATTENTION TO THIS TASK FORCE BECAUSE WE
6 DON'T WANT TO, AND NOW THERE IS NO -- THERE IS NO WAY OF
7 GETTING AROUND OF THE WE DON'T WANT TO TYPE THING, SO I REALLY
8 THINK THAT THIS OPENED UP A LOT OF -- A LOT OF AVENUES FOR
9 DIALOGUE. SO THERE IS THAT. RAHMON, AND THEN RICK COATES.

10

11 **RAHMON MOMOH:** THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THAT PRESENTATION. --
12 WENDI, AS PART OF THE QUESTIONS WE ASK, DO WE HAVE SMALL
13 OPERATORS AND LARGE OPERATORS -- BECAUSE I'M NOT SURE IF MY
14 TRI DELTA IS ONE OF THE SMALL OPERATORS, THAT WOULD BE NICE
15 FOR, YOU KNOW, SOMEONE LIKE ME TO KNOW. AND ALSO AGAIN
16 FOLLOWING UP ON THE LAST QUESTION IS THE RESISTANCE FROM THE
17 LARGE OPERATOR OR THE SMALL OPERATOR? BECAUSE I PRESUME THAT
18 OUR ISSUE WITH THE SMALL OPERATORS FROM GIVING UP CONTROL BUT
19 IT SEEMS LIKE WHAT I HAVE TODAY SEEMS TO BE THE REVERSE. I
20 MEAN, MAYBE YOU COULD HELP ME ON THAT ONE.

21

22 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WELL, FOR YOUR FIRST QUESTION, THERE
23 DEFINITELY ARE LISTS. I WILL SAY THERE ARE ONLY SEVEN SYSTEMS
24 THAT WE CONSIDER LARGE OPERATORS AND ALL THE REST OF THE 25 TO
25 27 ARE SMALL OR MEDIUM SIZE. TRI DELTA IS IN THE SMALLER



February 10, 2021

1 CATEGORY. BUT THE LARGE SEVEN, WHICH ARE, YOU KNOW, AC
2 TRANSIT, BART, MUNI, CALTRAIN, SAMTRANS, GOLDEN GATE, AND VTA,
3 THOSE ARE THE SEVEN LARGE ONES. THEY COMPRISE 95 PERCENT OF
4 THE RIDERSHIP. THEY CARRY 95 PERCENT OF THE REGION'S RIDERS AT
5 LEAST PREPANDEMIC NOT SURE WHAT IT IS NOW AND 95 PERCENT OF
6 THE OPERATING COSTS ARE WITH THOSE SEVEN LARGE OPERATORS. SO I
7 THINK THE, WITH LOCAL CONTROL WITH THE SMALLER OPERATORS ARE
8 ALMOST MORE ACCEPTABLE TO PEOPLE, BECAUSE IT'S SUCH A SMALL
9 KIND OF NICHE SERVICE IN A LOT OF CASES EVEN THOUGH IT'S
10 REALLY IMPORTANT FOR THE REGION AS A WHOLE, THOSE SMALL
11 OPERATORS. BUT I THINK WE'RE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT THE LARGE
12 OPERATORS, AND, YOU KNOW, THE NEED DO SOMETHING FOR THOSE 95
13 PERCENT OF TRANSIT RIDERS WHO RIDE THOSE SYSTEMS.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICK COATES, AND THEN RICH
16 HEDGES?

17

18 **RICK COATES:** YEAH. I'M GLAD TO HEAR FROM THERESA THAT THE
19 MOMENTUM IS TOWARDS STATE LEGISLATION. BECAUSE MY ASSESSMENT
20 IS THAT THAT'S THE ONLY WAY IT'S REALLY GOING TO HAPPEN. I
21 DON'T THINK THAT POWER GIVES UP POWER VERY EASILY. SO, I WOULD
22 ENCOURAGE MORE ON THAT FRONT. IS

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I THINK, THERESA DON'T WE HAVE A PLACE
25 MARC HOLDING BILL BECAUSE OF PARTICIPATION AT THE STATE LEVEL?



February 10, 2021

1

2 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERE IS WHAT I THINK THEY CALL A SPOT BILL
3 BEING DEVELOPED AND IT WOULD BE KIND OF A PLACE HOLDER THAT
4 COULD BE REFINED I THINK BETWEEN NOW AND AUGUST IS THE
5 DEADLINE FOR IT TO BE COMPLETED. BUT YEAH, SECRETARY -- NOT
6 SECRETARY -- ASSEMBLYMAN CHU ACTUALLY IS A TASK FORCE MEMBER
7 AND HE'S THE ONE LEADING THIS LEGISLATIVE APPROACH.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES, AND THEN CYNTHIA.

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. IT TOOK ME A SECOND TO GET -- I
12 JUST WANTED TO COMMENT ON THE LEGISLATION ISSUE. I ACTUALLY
13 WAS GOING TO COMMENT AT MY FIRST -- AND I LEFT IT OFF WITH MY
14 DIATRIBE ON CARD I WAS INVOLVED SOMEWHAT PERIPHERALLY IN THE
15 LAST ATTEMPT TO PUT TOGETHER THE BIG FIVE IN SOME FORM WITH
16 MTC AND IT BLEW UP ON THE LAUNCHING PAD WITHIN A FEW MONTHS. I
17 HAVE SAID AT THESE MEETINGS THAT THE ONLY WAY TO RATIONALIZE
18 THIS IS DOING WHAT TORLAKSON DID WHEN INFORMING WETA, YOU
19 CAN'T DO IT NOW BECAUSE OF LEGISLATION BUT AT MIDNIGHT THEY
20 PUT A BILL THEY PUT TOGETHER THE FERRIES UNDER WETA AND THE
21 NEWSPAPER ARTICLE AS SOON AS THAT HAPPENED QUOTED THE MAYOR OF
22 VALLEJO SAID I WOKE UP THIS MORNING AND I WAS NO LONGER IN
23 CHARGE OF OUR FERRY. THAT'S GOING TO HAVE TO HAPPEN. IT'S JUST
24 NOT GOING TO HAPPEN ANY OTHER WAY. WE HAVE SEEN THIS OVER AND
25 OVER AGAIN ESPECIALLY WITH THE ELECTED BOARDS THAT WE HAVE AND



February 10, 2021

1 EVEN WITH CALTRAIN, BECAUSE LOOK AT THE PROBLEMS WE HAD
2 GETTING RR ON THE BALLOT. SO IT'S JUST -- AND I UNDERSTAND WHY
3 IT'S DIFFICULT. IT'S ALWAYS HARDER TO GIVE UP POWER THAN IT IS
4 TO GET IT. SO, ANYWAY, THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SPEAK AGAIN.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CYNTHIA AND THEN ADINA.

7

8 **CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR:** I'M NOT SURE IF MY COMMENTS ARE
9 APPROPRIATE FOR THIS MATTER SO CUT ME OFF IF I'M GOING IN THE
10 WRONG DIRECTION. I AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE -- EVERYTHING I'M
11 READING ABOUT HOW MUCH REMOTE WORK IS GOING TO CONTINUE AND
12 HOW THAT'S GOING AFFECT TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND HOW THAT'S
13 PLAYING OUT IN DOING STRATEGIC PLANNING SUCH AS UPGRADING THE
14 FLEET, WHICH I HOPE THAT'S BEING CONSIDERED TO MOVE TO ALL
15 ELECTRIC TO HELP WITH OUR CLIMATE CHANGE ISSUES, AND NOT ONLY
16 ALL ELECTRIC, BUT MAYBE IF WE'RE GOING TO HAVE DIFFERENCES IN
17 THE RIDERSHIP, WE'LL NEED SMALLER VEHICLES RATHER THAN THE BIG
18 LONG ONES BECAUSE WE'LL HAVE MORE PEOPLE COMING FROM DIVERSE
19 PLACES RATHER THAN TO A CENTRAL PLACE. ANYWAY, I'M NOT SURE
20 ALL OF THAT IS TRUE. BUT, IS THAT KIND OF PLANNING IN YOUR
21 COMMITTEE? AND I HAVEN'T HEARD ANYTHING ABOUT THAT.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO I THINK THAT THERE IS AN
24 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT THAT WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN AND
25 SO TRYING TO COVER ALL THE BASES IS DEFINITELY PART OF THE



February 10, 2021

1 CONVERSATION GOING, AS WE HAVE BEEN GOING ALONG. AND THERE IS
2 A REALLY BIG CONCERN OVER WE DON'T KNOW WHAT WE DON'T KNOW. WE
3 DON'T KNOW HOW THE WORKFORCE IS GOING RETURN. I WAS RATHER
4 SURPRISED TO HEAR ONE OF THE BOARD MEMBERS OF A LARGE OPERATOR
5 SAY, YOU KNOW, WE'RE GOING TO GO BACK TO BUSINESS AS NORMAL,
6 PEOPLE ARE GOING TO PUT THEIR KIDS BACK IN SCHOOL BECAUSE
7 THEY'RE TIRED OF HAVING THEM AT HOME. AND I WAS THINKING ABOUT
8 THE LAST RECESSION AND THOUGHT YOU'RE NOT ONE OF THE PEOPLE
9 THAT SUFFERED DURING THE LAST RECESSION, AND THIS IS NOT LIKE
10 IT. I DON'T THINK EVERYBODY IS AWARE HOW IT'S GOING TO CHANGE
11 THE LANDSCAPE.

12

13 **CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR:** I HOPE THAT MEANS THEY'RE NOT
14 GOING TO BE MAKING BIG INVESTMENT IN THE FLEET IF THEY'RE NOT
15 SURE WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO NEED AND ALL THAT STUFF IF THEY
16 CAN'T CONSOLIDATE THE LEAST MAYBE THEY CAN INVOLVE IN
17 PURCHASING FOR THOSE TYPES OF THINGS. AND ALSO THE DECLINE IN
18 SALES TAX AND TAX REVENUE AND TRYING TO FIGURE OUT OTHER
19 REVENUE SOURCES FOR THAT?

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** FLEET CAME UP IN THE -- I WANT TO SAY THE
22 SMALL OPERATORS, AND MAYBE THE LARGE OPERATORS CONVERSATION
23 TOO. YES TO ALL OF YOUR QUESTIONS. ADINA?

24



February 10, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH, SO QUICKLY, A SECOND BITE OF THE APPLE
2 HERE, BUILDING ON THE LAST COMMENT ONE POTENTIALLY FRUITFUL
3 THING TO BE THINKING ABOUT IS IN THE INTEREST OF BRINGING BACK
4 RIDERS TO TRANSIT TO TRANSIT OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS
5 THINKING OF SOME INNOVATIVE PROGRAMS THAT INVOLVE MULTIPLE
6 AGENCIES AND BETTER CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE USING RECOVERY FUNDING
7 THERE MIGHT BE SOME OPPORTUNITIES TO INNOVATE IN THAT MANNER,
8 THAT WOULD BE A HELPFUL TO PIONEER SOME OF WHAT WE ARE TALKING
9 ABOUT. AND THEN LASTLY, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT STRUCK ME IN
10 WATCHING THE SMALL AND LARGE OPERATOR DISCUSSIONS IS, ON THE
11 TASK FORCE ITSELF, THERE'S BEEN SIGNIFICANT CONVERSATION ABOUT
12 WHAT IS A NETWORK MANAGER AND WHAT ARE THE EXAMPLES ALL AROUND
13 THE WORLD OF HIGH PERFORMING TRANSIT SYSTEMS THAT HAVE AN
14 ENTITY THAT IS IN CHARGE OF DOING THAT COORDINATION. IT'S A
15 UNIVERSAL FEATURE OF THESE COORDINATED SYSTEMS THAT THERE IS
16 FUNCTION THAT'S IN CHARGE OF THAT COORDINATION, WHICH WE LACK
17 IN THE BAY AREA. AND SO I THINK THE PEOPLE ON THE TASK FORCE
18 HAVE GOTTEN FAMILIAR WITH THAT CONCEPT, AND IT REALLY STRUCK
19 ME THAT THE -- THERE ARE MANY AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS THAT
20 HAVEN'T GOTTEN THAT BACKGROUND, THAT IT WAS NEW TO THEM AND
21 THEY'RE LIKE, WHY DO I NEED TO HAVE ANYBODY IN CHARGE OF
22 COORDINATION, LIKE WHY DOES ANYBODY NEED TO DO THIS? AND IT
23 SEEMED MAYBE FOR STAFF, THE THINGS THAT HAVE BEEN COMING TO
24 THE BOARD HAS BEEN A PRESENTATION PUT TOGETHER BY AGENCY
25 STAFF, REALLY FOCUSING ON THAT LOCAL CONTROL. AND NOT SO MUCH



February 10, 2021

1 BUILDING UP THAT PICTURE OF, HERE IS THESE COMMON PRACTICES
2 AROUND THE WORLD THAT WE'RE NOT SO GOOD AT, SO I WONDER WHERE
3 THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO BRING SOME MORE OF THAT BACKGROUND
4 TO BOARD MEMBERS TO HAVE THAT PERSPECTIVE. BECAUSE THAT WAS
5 CLEARLY A PIECE THAT THE TASK FORCE HAD GOTTEN OVER TIME, AND
6 MANY AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS HAD NOT.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND THAT WILL BE ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I
9 BRING UP, BECAUSE I WAS TEXTING BACK AND FORTH WITH SOMEBODY
10 WHO SITS ON TWO BOARDS, WHO, REALLY, I KNOW THIS PERSON WELL
11 ENOUGH TO KNOW THAT THIS PERSON DOES HOMEWORK. AND TO HAVE TO
12 BE EXPLAINING IT BY TEXT, BECAUSE IT WAS NEW, THAT WAS WHERE I
13 THINK THAT THE BIG -- THAT WAS -- YOU'RE RIGHT, THAT WAS WHERE
14 THE BIG ISSUE WAS, WAS THE BOARD MEMBERS AREN'T AS FULLY
15 INFORMED AS WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE. BECAUSE THEY'RE THE ONES
16 THAT ARE GOING TO MAKE THE DECISIONS. I SEE NO MORE HANDS UP
17 SO I'M GOING TO ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT IF THERE IS ANYBODY IN
18 THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES TO COMMENT ON THIS, USE THE RAISE YOUR
19 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANYBODY? DO
20 WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
23 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
24 HANDS RAISED.

25



February 10, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU THERESA. AS ALWAYS THESE
2 ARE FAST MOVING REPORTS. WITH THAT WE'RE GOING TO GO INTO
3 AGENDA ITEM EIGHT MTC RESOLUTION 4453 PROGRAMMING OF
4 CORONAVIRUS RESPONSE AND RELEASE SUPPLEMENTARY APPROPRIATIONS
5 ACT OF 2021. I'M GUESS THAT'S THERESA AGAIN.

6

7 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I'M GUESSING THE AGENDA DESCRIPTION MIGHT BE
8 AHOLD OVER FROM LAST MONTH.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I THINK SO TOO.

11

12 **THERESA ROMMELL:** UPDATE, WE TOOK AN ITEM TODAY ON PROGRAMMING
13 AND ALLOCATIONS ON THIS TOPIC AND THAT ITEM WAS TO PROVIDE AN
14 OUTLINE OF WHAT STAFF INTENDS TO BRING BACK TO THE FEBRUARY
15 COMMISSION MEETING ON, YOU KNOW, OPERATOR FINANCIAL STATUS,
16 AND SERVICE STATUS, KIND OF LIKE AN OVERVIEW OF HOW OPERATORS
17 ARE COPING WITH THE PANDEMIC AND HOW THEY ARE PLANNING KIND OF
18 FOR RECOVERY OR ONGOING COPING WITH THE PANDEMIC, DEPENDING ON
19 HOW FAST WE RECOVER. SO WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH TRANSIT
20 OPERATORS OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF WEEKS, AND CONTINUING ON
21 NOW, TO KIND OF GATHER AND COMPILE INFORMATION ON THE AREAS
22 OF, LIKE, RIDERSHIP, SERVICE, AND FINANCES, IN ORDER TO
23 PROVIDE THAT MORE COMPREHENSIVE OVERVIEW. THE INTENT OF THAT
24 INFORMATION, THAT WE'LL BE PRESENTING TO THE COMMISSION, IS
25 INTENDED TO PROVIDE SOME CONTEXT FOR THE FUTURE DISTRIBUTION



February 10, 2021

1 OF THE CRRSAA FUNDING WHICH IS COVID RELIEF FUNDING THAT
2 INFORMATION WILL INFORM THAT DISTRIBUTION BUT MAY OR MAY NOT
3 LINK DIRECTLY TO ON THE SPECIFIC DISTRIBUTION FORMULA THAT
4 WILL ULTIMATELY BE USED. SO WE WANT TO -- SOME OF THE
5 INFORMATION WE'RE GATHERING RELATES TO HOW THE PRE AND POST
6 PANDEMIC PROPORTIONAL RIDERSHIP BY SYSTEM MAY HAVE SHIFTED
7 BETWEEN OPERATORS, AND WE KNOW IT HAS SHIFTED WHERE AC TRANSIT
8 NOW CARRIES MORE RIDERS THAN BART DOES WHICH IS KIND OF
9 AMAZING. AND HOW MUCH A RETURN TO HIGHER LEVELS OF RIDERSHIP
10 ON CERTAIN SYSTEMS MAY BE BASED ON WHEN SCHOOLS ARE BACK IN
11 SESSION. HOW MUCH DOES SCHOOL SERVICE IMPACT RIDERSHIP FOR
12 VARIOUS SYSTEMS. WE'LL ALSO BE LOOKING AT CHANGES IN SERVICE
13 INCLUDING ROUTES, FREQUENCY, AND HOURS OF OPERATION. ARE
14 OPERATORS ABLE TO MEET EXISTING DEMAND DESPITE REVENUE LOSSES
15 AND SOCIAL DISTANCING REQUIREMENTS? WE KNOW FOR A FACT IN SOME
16 PLACES THERE ARE WHAT WE CALL PASS UPS, QUITE A FEW OF THEM
17 HAPPENING. AND IMPORTANTLY WE'LL BE LOOKING AT HOW NIMBLE OUR
18 TRANSIT SYSTEMS WILL BE IN RESPONDING TO A RETURN OF RIDERS ON
19 A SIGNIFICANT SCALE. IN OTHER WORDS, WHEN RIDERS ARE READY TO
20 OTHER THAN, WILL OUR SYSTEMS BE READY FOR RIDERS? BECAUSE WE
21 DO KNOW THAT IN SOME CASES IT TAKES MONTHS TO EFFECT A
22 SIGNIFICANT CHANGE IN SERVICE. AND WE'LL ALSO BE EXAMINING
23 REVENUE LOSSES CAUSED BY THE PANDEMIC WHAT DEFICITS MAY LOOK
24 LIKE IN THE CURRENT AND FISCAL YEARS AS WELL AS WHAT OPERATORS
25 HAVE BEEN DOING TO CUT OPERATING COSTS AS WELL AS AVOIDING



February 10, 2021

1 FURLOUGHS AND LAYOFFS. THAT'S INFORMATION WE'RE GATHERING IT
2 WILL BE A COMBINATION OF QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE
3 INFORMATION CONSISTENT INFORMATION ON ALL OF THESE MEASURES
4 ACROSS OPERATORS IS MORE OFTEN THAN NOT VERY DIFFICULT TO
5 OBTAIN THAT'S WHAT WE'RE PLANNING FOR THE FEBRUARY COMMISSION
6 MEETING REPORT. JUST A QUICK UPDATE ON WHAT WE'RE DOING IN
7 REGARD TO THE CRRSAA COVID FUNDING AS A REMINDER 180 MILLION
8 WAS DISTRIBUTED LAST MONTH LEAVING 800 LEFT TO BE PROGRAMMED
9 AND WE'RE TARGETING THE MARCH PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
10 MEETING TO PROPOSE A DISTRIBUTION FOR THOSE FUNDS. SO THAT'S
11 KIND OF MY REPORT ON THIS ITEM. AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
12 QUESTIONS.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND WILL WE GET A PREVIEW OF
15 WHAT WE'RE TAKING TO THE COMMISSION MEETING NEXT MONTH?

16

17 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WELL, THE REASON WE'RE TAKING IT TO
18 COMMISSION RATHER THAN TRYING TO RUSH AND BRING IT TO
19 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS WAS ALSO TO GIVE THE OPERATORS A
20 CHANCE TO PREVIEW THE INFORMATION, SINCE IT IS LARGELY GOING
21 TO BE THEIR INFORMATION, WE JUST WANTED TO LET THEM HAVE AN
22 OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT IT BEFORE IT GOES TO COMMISSION. I
23 DON'T KNOW -- I MEAN IT'S GOING TO BE MAILED OUT SHORTLY, SO
24 PROBABLY THE NEXT WEEK.

25



February 10, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE MARC MADDEN WITH HIS
2 HAND UP FIRST. MARC, YOU BEAT RICH HEDGES WHO IS COMING UP
3 AFTER YOU. UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4

5 **MARC MADDEN:** MY QUESTION TO THERESA IS, WHEN UBER REPORTED
6 PROFITS YESTERDAY, ASTONISHINGLY, THEY MADE MORE MONEY MOVING
7 FOOD AROUND THAN PEOPLE. AND MY QUESTION O A PARALLEL BASIS
8 IS, IF, WHAT YOU SAY -- AND I DON'T DISMISS OR DISTRUST WHAT
9 YOU SAY -- BUT IF IN FACT BART IS NOT MOVING RELATIVELY MANY
10 PASSENGERS HAVE THEY EVER GIVEN ANY THOUGHT TO USING THEIR
11 CAPACITY TO MOVE STUFF?

12

13 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. I HAVEN'T THOUGHT
14 ABOUT THAT WHETHER OR NOT THEY COULD USE PASSENGER RAIL FOR --

15

16 **MARC MADDEN:** EXACTLY. THE OBVIOUS THING OF COURSE IS
17 PARTICULARLY ADDING CARS OR TRAINS, BOTH NOW ON PEAK, AND
18 EVEN, CERTAINLY, OFF PEAK, IT'S OCCURRED TO ME FOR YEARS TO
19 MOVE THINGS LIKE WASTE AND ALSO GOODS, IS, THEY COULD DO THAT,
20 LARGELY TO SERVE THE METROPOLITAN AREA, WHICH IS WHERE, OF
21 COURSE MOST OF THE TRAFFIC VOLUME IS AS WELL IN A CONGESTED
22 AREA. SO I'M ASKING IF STAFF WOULD KINDLY CONSIDER ASKING BART
23 IF THEY HAVE EVER THOUGHT ABOUT THAT?

24

25 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WE'LL ASK.



February 10, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RICH HEDGES AND THEN
3 RICK COATES.

4

5 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. JUST A COMMENT ON MARC COMMENT,
6 FIRST, IS THAT, THAT'S ACTUALLY BEEN TALKED ABOUT, ACTUALLY,
7 ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL YEARS AGO, AND THERE IS SOME
8 PRECEDENT TO THAT KEY SYSTEM TO MAKE DELIVERIES. ONE OF THEM
9 WAS FUEL OIL TO THAT BEAUTIFUL HOTEL IN THE BERKELEY HILLS. I
10 CAN'T REMEMBER THE NAME. BUT THEY DELIVER GOODS AND IN NEW
11 YORK CITY THEY DELIVER GOODS AS WELL. BART WILL EVENTUALLY
12 TOUCH ALL OF THE REGIONAL AIRPORTS IT WOULD BE SO EASY FOR
13 THEM TO DELIVER AIR FREIGHT TO AREAS CLOSE TO BART IN THE
14 METROPOLITAN AREAS. AND IT WOULD LIGHTEN THE TRUCK TRAFFIC ON
15 THE ROADS. IT JUST MAKES PERFECT SENSE TO DO THAT. AND SO I
16 THINK MARC HIT UPON SOMETHING THAT'S VERY, VERY GOOD. NOW, I
17 HAVE A QUESTION ON THE DISBURSEMENT OF THE COVID FUNDING. AND
18 THIS IS NOT A NEGATIVE COMMENT. IT'S JUST A QUESTION OF WHY
19 CALTRAIN GOT SUCH A SMALL AMOUNT THAT EFFECTS TWO COUNTIES,
20 WHERE DURING PEAK TIMES OF FAIRLY HIGH RIDERSHIP IN THE PAST?
21 I THINK THEY ONLY GOT 6 MILLION OUT OF THIS PARTICULAR
22 TRANCHE. SO, CAN SOMEBODY GIVE ME THE THINKING BEHIND THAT? I
23 WOULD REALLY LIKE TO KNOW. THANK YOU.

24



February 10, 2021

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I CAN ANSWER THAT QUESTION. THE FIRST TRANCHE
2 OF THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE CRRSAA WAS REALLY A TRUE-UP FOR THE
3 CARES ACT FUNDING IF YOU REMEMBER THE REGION GOT 1.3 BILLION
4 IF FUNDING THROUGH THE CARES ACT AND WE HAD A DISTRIBUTION
5 FORMULA THAT WAS BASED PRIMARILY ON REVENUE LOSS ASSUMPTIONS
6 BETWEEN MARCH AND DECEMBER. SO WE HAD KIND OF AGREED WHEN WE
7 DISTRIBUTED THE LAST DISTRIBUTION OF CARES ACT FUNDING THAT WE
8 WOULD DO A TRUE-UP IF THERE WAS ANY OTHER FEDERAL FUNDING MADE
9 AVAILABLE. SO THAT'S WHAT WE DID WITH THAT 180 MILLION LOOKED
10 AT REVENUE LOSSES FORECASTED, RERAN THE CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION
11 AND WHERE ANYBODY GOT A NEGATIVE OR HAD RECEIVED LESS CARES
12 ACT FUNDING THAN THEY WERE DUE BASED ON THESE INACCURATE
13 FORECASTS, THEN THEY GOT MADE WHOLE. THEY GOT BROUGHT UP. SO
14 CALTRAIN WAS BASICALLY SHORTED 6 MILLION OF CARES ACT FUNDING,
15 AND THEY GOT THAT MADE UP IN THE FIRST DISTRIBUTION OF THE
16 CLIPPER FUNDING. AS TO WHY IT WAS ONLY 6 MILLION IT DEPENDS ON
17 THEIR REVENUE MIX. SO THEY DO GET A LOT OF FARES, OBVIOUSLY,
18 BUT WHEN YOU PUT THOSE IN PROPORTION TO BART AND MUNI, THEIR
19 SHARE OF THE REVENUE LOSSES IS MUCH SMALLER.

20

21 **RICHARD HEDGES:** WHAT IS MEANT BY TRUE-UP?

22

23 **THERESA ROMMELL:** SO, AGAIN, IF THEY -- WHEN WE RAN THE CARES
24 ACT DISTRIBUTION WE HAD ESTIMATES OF REVENUE LOSSES THAT HAD
25 NOT YET OCCURRED WE PROJECTED WHAT WE THOUGHT WAS GOING HAPPEN



February 10, 2021

1 WITH SALES TAXES AND FARES. WE PROJECTED LONG BECAUSE WE
2 DIDN'T EXPECT THE PANDEMIC WOULD LAST THIS LONG. THE OPERATORS
3 THAT ARE MORE HEAVILY FARE DEPENDENT LIKE BART AND CALTRAIN
4 AND EVEN DEGREE DID NOT GET ENOUGH MONEY IN THE CARES ACT
5 DISTRIBUTION BECAUSE THOSE FORECASTS WERE INCORRECT. SO WITH
6 CRRSAA WHEN WE RERAN THE CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION WITH ACTUAL
7 REVENUE LOSSES AS OPPOSED TO FORECASTED, WE FOUND THAT BART,
8 MUNI, CALTRAIN, GOLDEN GATE ARE HEAVILY FARE DEPENDENT OR
9 DEPENDENT ON REVENUE FROM THE CITY DID NOT GET A SUFFICIENT
10 SHARE OF THE CARES ACT FUNDING SO WE MADE -- [AUDIO
11 DIFFICULTIES] [INDISCERNIBLE].

12

13 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THAT ACTUALLY IS A PRETTY GOOD EXPLANATION. DO
14 YOU MIND, THERESA, BECAUSE I HAVE GOT A COUPLE OF BOARD
15 MEMBERS AT CALTRAIN THAT HAVE BEEN VERY NEGATIVE ABOUT THIS. I
16 WOULD LIKE TO GIVE THEM SOME INFORMATION. WOULD YOU SEND HE ME
17 -- WHICH I WON'T SEND THEM YOUR E-MAIL -- BUT SEND ME A SHORT
18 E-MAIL SO I DON'T GET ANYTHING WRONG?

19

20 **THERESA ROMMELL:** SURE.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** NEXT UP IS RICK COATES AND THEN VEDA?

23

24 **RICK COATES:** YEAH. I WANTED TO SAY THAT I REALLY LIKE MARC'S
25 IDEA. AND I THINK WE'RE GETTING AROUND THAT NOT NORTH BAY WITH



February 10, 2021

1 SMART. SMART JUST TOOK OVER THE FREIGHT OPERATIONS OF THE
2 NORTHWESTERN PACIFIC. SO THEY'RE UNIFYING THE PROCESS. I THINK
3 THEY WILL BE ABLE TO DO BOTH. I DON'T KNOW WHETHER THEY'RE
4 PLANNING TO PUT ANY FREIGHT ON -- UNDER POPULATED TRAINS OR
5 NOT, COMMUTER TRAINS. IT'S AN INTERESTING IDEA. BUT LET'S GO
6 FOR IT. [LAUGHTER]

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RICK. VEDA?

9

10 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT, AGAIN. I'M CONCERNED
11 ABOUT SOME OF OUR SMALLER OPERATORS. AND I'M WONDERING IF THE
12 CRRSAA DISTRIBUTION FUNDING FORMULA WAS ADJUSTED FOR SOME OF
13 THE SMALLER OPERATORS THAT ARE ON THAT SLIPPERY SLOPE, AND IF
14 WE WOULD CONSIDER GIVING THEM A GREATER PIECE OF THE PIE? THE
15 SMALLER OPERATORS IN SOME OF OUR RURAL COUNTIES ARE ONLY ONE
16 AREA OF DISTRIBUTION. SO THEY ONLY HAVE ONE SOURCE OF
17 TRANSPORTATION. AND I'M WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY WAY THAT WE
18 ACCOUNT PROTECT THE SMALLER OPERATORS BY CREATING A -- AN
19 ADDED EXTRA BIT OF FUNDING IN THE DISTRIBUTION FORMULA?

20

21 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH, I CAN ADDRESS THAT. I THINK EVEN IN THE
22 CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION, WE DID TRY TO ACCOMMODATE THE SMALLER
23 OPERATORS A LITTLE BIT, ESPECIALLY BECAUSE THEY'RE ALL
24 PRIMARILY BUS OPERATORS WITH -- BY APPLYING WHAT WE CALL THE
25 EQUITY ADJUSTMENT. AND THAT DID HAVE THE EFFECT OF WEIGHTING



February 10, 2021

1 MORE OF THE FORMULA TOWARDS THE SMALLER OPERATORS JUST BECAUSE
2 THEY HAVE A VERY HIGH PERCENTAGE OF LOW-INCOME RIDERS SO
3 THAT'S THE EFFECT WITH CARES ACT AND I IMAGINE WE'LL BE DOING
4 SOMETHING SIMILAR WITH THIS DISTRIBUTION AS WELL.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO GO TO THE PEOPLE
7 WHO HAVEN'T ASKED THEIR QUESTIONS YET AND THEN I'LL CIRCLE
8 BACK TO THE PEOPLE WHOSE HANDS ARE UP. RAHMON THEN CHRISTINA.

9

10 **RAHMON MOMOH:** THANK YOU. JUST TO FOLLOW UP ON THE SUGGESTION
11 TO USE BART AS A FREIGHT TRAIN. I'M KIND OF CONCERNED ABOUT
12 THAT. I MEAN, MOST PEOPLE USE BART GOING TO THE OFFICE. SO
13 UNLESS THERE IS A -- DURING THEIR OFF PEAK HOUR, THAT I WANT
14 TO DEDICATE THE LINE FOR FREIGHT, I THINK IT'S REALLY GOING TO
15 BE DIFFICULT. BUT IT WOULD BE INTERESTING IF THAT COULD BE
16 LOOKED INTO. BUT I WOULD NOT THINK THAT SHOULD BE THEIR
17 PRIMARY GOAL OF LOOKING AT FREIGHT, OR EVEN SECONDARY GOAL.
18 BUT AGAIN, IT'S WORTH LOOKING INTO. ON THE FUNDING, SO THE
19 SECOND ROUND METHODOLOGY HAS NOT BEEN DEVELOPED? BECAUSE I'M
20 JUST TRYING TO VERIFY IF THAT IS BEING TALKED ABOUT RIGHT NOW?

21

22 **THERESA ROMMELL:** NO WE'RE WORKING INTERNALLY TO PUT TOGETHER A
23 PROPOSAL FOR THE 800 MILLION DISTRIBUTION. THAT'S NOT BEEN
24 FINALIZED.

25



February 10, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** CHRISTINA AND THEN BEN.

2

3 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I THINK DISH JUST WANT TO SAY, I FEEL LIKE
4 THE FREIGHT DISCUSSION IS A DISTRACTION AND THAT THE LOW
5 RIDERSHIP RIGHT NOW IS TEMPORARY AND IT'S STILL THE FIRST
6 QUARTER AND SOME COMPANIES HAVE, YOU KNOW, THEY HAVE MADE
7 ANNOUNCEMENTS IN ADVANCE THAT THEY'RE NOT GOING TO GO BACK
8 INTO THE OFFICE UNTIL JUNE OR JULY OR OCTOBER. BUT, AS SOON AS
9 THAT HAPPENS, PEOPLE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THE DECISION TO TAKE --
10 - THE ONES THAT ARE ABLE TO WORK-FROM-HOME RIGHT NOW AND I
11 THINK RIGHT NOW PEOPLE ARE MAKING DUE BECAUSE NOT EVERYONE HAS
12 BEEN VACCINATED AND THEY STILL HAVE RELATIVES AND HOUSEHOLD
13 MEMBERS THAT THEY HAVE TO BE CONCERNED ABOUT AND SO THEY'RE
14 JUST CARPOOLING OR WALKING AND DOING THINGS THAT THEY WOULDN'T
15 NORMALLY BE DOING ESPECIALLY IF THEY HAVE A TIME CRUNCH ON
16 THEIR SCHEDULE AS KIND OF NORMALCY RESUMES. SO I JUST THINK
17 THAT RIGHT NOW SHOULD BE THE TIME TO BE KIND OF RUNNING TESTS
18 WHILE RIDERSHIP IS LOW ON CREATING BETTER CONNECTIVITY AND
19 CONNECTIONS AMONG THE AGENCIES WITHIN THE REGION WHILE THE --
20 YOU KNOW, JUST WHILE THE FLOW IS LOW AND THERE IS THE
21 OPPORTUNITY DO MORE OF AN EXPERIMENTATION WITH LESS PEOPLE ON
22 SOME OF THE ROUTES.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHRISTINA. BEN?

25



February 10, 2021

1 **BENJAMIN SCHWENG:** MY THOUGHT ABOUT BART IS WITH THE LOW
2 RIDERSHIP NOW AND IN THE FUTURE, IF WE COULD -- IF BART COULD
3 LEAN INTO CYCLING MORE. THERE ARE MORE PEOPLE RIDING AND
4 BUYING BIKES. I THINK THAT THERE IS A WAY TO USE THIS LOW
5 RIDERSHIP TO INCREASE ACCESSIBILITY ON THE TRAINS, AND CREATE
6 MORE SPACE FOR CYCLING, THAT IF WE'RE -- YOU KNOW, WE MAY NOT
7 HAVE FULL RIDERSHIP FOR YEARS, BUT WE HAVE REALLY SORT OF
8 PUSHED CYCLING TO THE MARGINS OF BART IN A LOT OF WAYS BOTH IN
9 PARKING AND SECURING BIKE ZONES. BUT THERE IS THE TRAIN IF
10 BART IS WILLING TO RUN TRAINS THAT HAVE TWO PEOPLE ON THEM, WE
11 SHOULD BE ABLE TO CREATE A LITTLE MORE SPACE FOR BIKES AS THEY
12 COME BACK ON IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARC, AND THEN TERRY SCOTT.

15

16 **MARC MADDEN:** THANK YOU. AS USUAL, RICK IS ABOUT THREE STEPS
17 AHEAD OF ME, PARTICULARLY SINCE MY NEXT FOLLOW UP QUESTION
18 WOULD HAVE BEEN ABOUT SMART AND ITS CAPABILITY OF MOVING
19 FREIGHT BECAUSE THEY SHARE THE RIGHT OF WAY WITH THE EXISTING
20 OR ORIGINAL RAILROAD LINE. BUT TO CHRISTINA'S QUESTION, GOOD
21 QUESTION, BUT I'M NOT EXPECTING, FRANKLY, FOR BART TO EVER GET
22 THEIR RIDERSHIP BACK TO PEAKS PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC, BECAUSE A
23 NUMBER OF COMPANIES -- AS YOU WELL KNOW -- HAVE PRETTY MUCH
24 DECIDED THAT THEY DON'T NEED TO HAVE PEOPLE COMMUTING
25 PHYSICALLY TO THEIR OFFICES WHICH OF COURSE BEGS THE QUESTION



February 10, 2021

1 OF IT'S NOT MY PROBLEM, BUT WHY APPLE BUILT THIS ENORMOUS
2 PALACE IN THE FIRST PLACE. BUT THAT'S ANOTHER MATTER FOR TIM
3 COOKE TO DECIDE FOR HIMSELF. BUT ALL I WOULD SAY IS, TAKE
4 ANOTHER EXAMPLE, UNITED AIRLINES IS SPENDING SOME MONEY TO
5 TAKE A LOT MORE MONEY, ACTUALLY WITH AIR FREIGHT, PARTICULARLY
6 AS A MATTER OF FACT WITH VACCINATIONS THAT'S WHAT THEY'RE
7 DOING ON BEHALF OF THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT. LAST THING I WANT
8 TO SAY IS, THAT THE PURPOSE OF BART, FROM A FISCAL POINT OF
9 VIEW, IS LEAVING ASIDE FREIGHT OR PEOPLE IS TO STAY
10 FINANCIALLY VIABLE. THEIR ENORMOUS INVESTMENT ON BEHALF OF US,
11 AS TAXPAYERS, NEEDS TO BE JUSTIFIED BY A REVENUE SOURCE, AND
12 IF IT'S NOT GOING TO BE CUSTOMERS, I MEAN, RIDERS, I SHOULD
13 SAY, THEN IT NEEDS TO BE SOMETHING ELSE.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND I'M GOING ASK THAT WE STOP
16 TALKING ABOUT BART AND FREIGHT FOR THE MOMENT. BECAUSE NUMBER
17 ONE THIS ISSUE WILL COME BACK TO US. NUMBER TWO, WE'RE RUNNING
18 REALLY LONG AND WE HAVE A HUGE AGENDA ITEM COMING UP. SO
19 UNLESS SOMEBODY HAS A MAGIC WAND ABOUT THE BART AND FREIGHT, I
20 THINK THAT THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN SET-ASIDE FOR NOW. TERRY,
21 GO AHEAD.

22

23 **TERRY SCOTT:** MY COMMENTS ARE BRIEF, AND THEY KIND OF TAG ALONG
24 TO MARC'S, AND THAT IS AT THIS POINT WE DON'T KNOW WHAT NORMAL
25 IS. WE ARE LOOKING AT A NEW NORMAL. AND UNTIL WE HAVE



February 10, 2021

1 EXPERIENCED THAT NEW NORMAL, WE DON'T KNOW WHAT IT IS. IT'S
2 GOING TO BE BASED ON HOW NOT ONLY TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS
3 ADJUST, BUT IN LARGE, MEASURED BY HOW BUSINESS ADJUSTS, IN
4 GENERAL. SO IT'S PREMATURE TO MAKE DETERMINATIONS ON LONG-TERM
5 TRANSPORTATION CONCEPTS UNTIL WE GET TO A POINT WHERE WE HAVE
6 A BETTER FEEL, AND HANDS-ON ON WHAT THE NEW NORMAL IS, AND
7 THEN WE CAN MAKE ADJUSTMENTS, NOT ONLY IN TERMS OF MOVING
8 FUNDS AND SO FORTH, BUT ALSO IN LOOKING AT VARIOUS
9 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS AND CHANGING, POTENTIALLY, WHETHER IT'S
10 SOLELY FOR PEOPLE, IT'S FOR GOODS, IT'S FOR, YOU KNOW, REFUSE,
11 OR WHAT HAVE YOU. I THINK WE HAVE TO BE A LITTLE BIT PATIENT
12 HERE.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHRISTINA.

15

16 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I DON'T THINK THAT
17 THE -- OR, I HOPE THAT'S NEW NORMAL IS WE DO GET A NATURAL
18 KIND OF TRANSIT DEMAND MANAGEMENT STRATEGY POST-COVID. NOT
19 NECESSARILY TO GET BACK TO BART PRECOVID LEVELS UNDER EACH
20 OTHER'S ARM PITS IT WAS JUST INSANE AT PEAK BART. IDEALLY,
21 IT'S JUST COMFORTABLE.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DO WANT TO RAISE UP BEN'S
24 COMMENT ON THE ADAPTABILITY. IF WE'RE GOING TO SERIOUSLY
25 REDUCE OUR GHG, WE HAVE TO CALL OUT ALL THE AGENCIES TO BE



February 10, 2021

1 BETTER RESOURCES FOR PEOPLE WHO USE BIKES. I HAVE MORE BIKE
2 CAPACITY ON A LIGHT RAIL TRAIN THAN A BART CAR, DOWN HERE IN
3 VTA LAND. SO, I REALLY WANT TO RAISE THAT UP. AND STEVE KINSEY
4 WHO IS CHAIR TO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, I LIKE WHAT HE
5 SAYS IS WE'RE NOT GOING BACK -- IT'S NOT A NEW NORMAL, IT'S A
6 NEW DIFFERENT. SO I THINK WITH THAT IN MIND, WE NEED TO LOOK
7 AT IT THAT WAY. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO CALL FOR PUBLIC
8 COMMENT. ANYBODY IN THE PUBLIC WHO HAS A COMMENT OR QUESTION
9 PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. MARTHA.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
12 THEIR HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THREE MINUTES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GO AHEAD, PERSON THAT'S A DOT. YOU CAN
17 UNMUTE YOURSELF?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** DAVID PILPEL FROM SAN FRANCISCO. I AGREE WITH THE
20 IDEA FROM CHRISTINA ABOUT TRYING OUT NEW THINGS I THINK NEW IS
21 THE TIME TO EXPERIMENT IN BAY AREA TRANSIT THERE ARE
22 OPERATORS, VEHICLES, THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES. AND MAYBE THAT
23 POSITIONS THINGS TO DO BETTER POST RECOVERY IF THERE IS SUCH A
24 TIME, OR AS THE NEW NORMAL SETS IN. ON THIS QUESTION ABOUT
25 GOODS MOVEMENT ON BART I THINK THAT WOULD BE A GREAT TOPIC TO



February 10, 2021

1 BRING BACK TO THIS COUNCIL IN THE FUTURE. I WOULD NOTE THAT
2 BART MAY HAVE LEGAL POLICY OR REGULATORY CONSTRAINTS, BUT IT'S
3 AN ABSOLUTELY GOOD QUESTION. YES, SMART JUST TOOK OVER FREIGHT
4 OPERATIONS FROM NWP, AND FOR THOSE WHO KNOW THE HISTORY OF
5 TRANSIT IN LOS ANGELES, THE PACIFIC ELECTRIC WAS BOTH A
6 SIGNIFICANT PASSENGER CARRIER AND ALSO A SIGNIFICANT FREIGHT
7 OPERATION, IN THAT AREA. AND JUST, FINALLY, PLEASE REMEMBER
8 THAT NOT EVERYONE HAS DIGITAL ACCESS, GOOD INTERNET SERVICE OR
9 USING E-MAIL. I FOR ONE DO IT'S NOT USE E-MAIL. WE SHOULD TRY
10 TO MEET PEOPLE WHERE THEY ARE. I HAVE HAD GREAT DIFFICULTY IN
11 ACTUALLY REACHING A LIVE PERSON AT MTC, SO IF THERE IS A GOOD
12 PHONE NUMBER TO REACH SOMEONE, YOU KNOW, IN PERSON, THAT MAYBE
13 FORWARDS TO A CELL PHONE OR SOMETHING, THAT WOULD BE GREAT TO
14 HAVE, BECAUSE IT'S BEEN VERY CHALLENGING TO ACTUALLY GET A
15 HUMAN BEING THESE DAYS. THANKS.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARC, I'M GOING TO CLOSE OUT
18 THIS ITEM. IS THERE SOMETHING LIKE -- ARE YOU OKAY WITH THAT?
19 THANK YOU. AND WE'RE GOING MOVE INTO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER NINE,
20 WHICH IS A LONG ITEM, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION
21 PLAN UPDATE. CHIRAG, ARE YOU AVAILABLE THERE?

22

23 **MARC MADDEN:** RANDI BEFORE WE GO, I WANT TO ADD A FOOTNOTE TO
24 SIMPLY INCLUDE WETA, SINCE SOMEBODY MENTIONED IT, FERRY
25 SERVICE FOR FREIGHT SERVICE. THANK YOU.



February 10, 2021

1
2 **CHIRAG RABARI:** HELLO. I'M HERE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH RANDI, AND
3 GOOD AFTERNOON MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. IF THE TECHNICAL
4 STAFF COULD PULL UP THE SLIDE DECK, PLEASE. GOOD AFTERNOON
5 EVERYONE MY NAME IS CHIRAG RABARI, AND I AM THE PROJECT
6 MANAGER FOR THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.
7 NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS IS JUST AN OVERVIEW OF THE OVERALL
8 TIMELINE, AND SCOPE FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. AS A REMINDER
9 THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WILL FOCUS ON SHORT-TERM TANGIBLE
10 ACTIONS THAT MTC AND ABAG AND THEIR AFFILIATED COLLABORATION
11 PROGRAMS CAN TAKE OVER THE NEXT 25 YEARS TO IMPLEMENT THE PLAN
12 STRATEGIES WITH KEY FOCUS ON PRESERVATION. THIS KEY
13 PRELIMINARY OUTPUTS PHASES 1 AND 2 ON THE IMPLEMENTATION
14 PROCESS WHICH DEALT WITH INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL ENGAGEMENT WHAT
15 WE PRESENT HERE TODAY AND AGAIN NEXT MONTH ARE GOING TO BE THE
16 KEY INPUTS TO THE DRAFT PLAN. SO WE'RE EXCITED TO GET AND
17 INCORPORATE THE FEEDBACK FROM ALL OF YOU, PRIOR TO THE DRAFT
18 BEING RELEASED LATER THIS SPRING. ONE CLARIFICATION I WOULD
19 NOTE IS THAT THIS DRAFT PLAN WILL BE FOCUSED MORE ON ACTIONS
20 THAT MTC AND ABAG ARE PROPOSING TO COMMIT TO DURING THE
21 IMPLEMENTATION PERIOD. BUT PHASE FOUR, THE PARTNERSHIP PHASE,
22 WHICH WILL RUN FROM LATER IN THE SPRING, AND INTO THE SUMMER,
23 WILL BE AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO RECONVENE WITH STAKEHOLDERS
24 TO REALLY FLESH OUT THE PARTNERSHIPS THAT ARE GOING TO BE
25 NECESSARY TO MOVE THE STRATEGY FORWARD, AND THAT MAY INCLUDE



February 10, 2021

1 MUTUAL COMMITMENTS, THE ARTICULATION OF SPECIFIC SPORT OF
2 ACTIONS THAT ARE BEING TAKEN BY PARTICULAR PARTNERS AS WELL AS
3 AREAS OF OPPORTUNITY TO FURTHER DISCUSS COMPLEXITY OR
4 CONTROVERSY AND THE FINAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WILL BE RELEASED
5 LATER IN THE FALL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO OUR EXTERNAL
6 ENGAGEMENT PROCESS KICKED OFF WITH TWO LARGE VIRTUAL
7 STAKEHOLDER SESSIONS IN NOVEMBER. AND WE HAD OVER 150
8 REPRESENTATIVES FROM 100 DIFFERENT ORGANIZATION WHO IS
9 PARTICIPATED IN THOSE MEETINGS AND THAT REPRESENT SAID A BROAD
10 SWATH OF GOVERNMENTAL AND NON-GOVERNMENTAL PARTNERS WITH MANY
11 DIFFERENT SECTORS OF THE -- OF THE PUBLIC REPRESENTED. AND
12 THIS GENERATED A LOT OF FEEDBACK AND IDEAS, AND THAT'S
13 REFLECTED IN WHAT WE'RE PRESENTING TODAY. WE HAD DOZENS OF
14 SMALL GROUP FOCUS DISCUSSIONS WE HELD TEN FOCUS GROUPS AND DID
15 A PUBLIC SURVEY WHICH GENERATED THOUSANDS OF RESPONSES. AND
16 THAT PUBLIC SURVEY WAS FOCUSED ON GETTING THE PUBLIC'S OVERALL
17 PRIORITIES FOR IMPLEMENTATION IN TERMS OF WHICH STRATEGIES
18 THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE PROGRESS IN THE NEXT 1 TO 5 YEARS. NEXT
19 SLIDE PLEASE. THERE ARE THREE KEY THINGS THAT WE'RE GOING TO
20 REVIEW TODAY. FIRST WE'RE GOING TO LOOK AT AN ASSESSMENT OF
21 THE PLAN'S 35 STRATEGIES TO SEE WHERE THEY STAND WITH RESPECT
22 TO KEY FACTORS THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED AS STRATEGIES
23 DETERMINED AS STRATEGY SUCCESS WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT DRAFT
24 RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING THE ROLE THAT MTC AND ABAG SHOULD
25 PLAY IN IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 35 STRATEGIES AND FINALLY GOING



February 10, 2021

1 TO PREVIEW A FEW SELECT IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES AND
2 PRIORITIES AND THERE WILL BE MORE TO COME NEXT MONTH ON THAT
3 FRONT. FOR THE STRATEGY ASSESSMENT WE HAD ONE KEY OVERARCHING
4 GOAL WHICH IS TO BETTER UNDERSTAND WHERE MTC AND ABAG STAND
5 UNDER THESE FOUR KEY FACTOR AUTHORITIES FINANCIAL RESOURCES
6 TECHNICAL CAPACITY PUBLIC AND POLITICAL SUPPORT AND THE
7 QUESTIONS IS WHERE WE ARE TODAY AND A FACTOR GIVEN FOR RELATED
8 PARTIAL OR EXISTING. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHEREAS THE ASSESSMENT IS
9 MORE ABOUT CURRENT CONDITIONS AND WHAT YOU MIGHT TERM RELATIVE
10 STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES, THE ROLE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE MORE
11 FORWARD LOOKING. WHAT SHOULD THE MTC ABAG IMPLEMENTATION ROLE
12 BE AS WE THINK THROUGH THE NEXT 1 TO 5 YEARS AND BEYOND? AND
13 THERE ARE THREE OPTIONS AS MENTIONED, LEADS, PARTNER, AND
14 SUPPORT. NOW IT'S IMPORTANT TO CLARIFY THAT THE PURPOSE OF THE
15 ASSESSMENT WAS TO HELP IDENTIFY AND GUIDE NEEDED ACTIONS. SO
16 WHILE IT'S A CRITICAL COMPONENT OF THINKING THROUGH A
17 POTENTIAL ROLE, THE ASSESSMENT IS NOT EXCLUSIVELY
18 DETERMINATIVE IN IDENTIFYING HOW MTC AND ABAG SHOULD ENGAGE IN
19 MOVING FORWARD. FOR EXAMPLE, THE LEAD ROLE MIGHT INVOLVE
20 WORKING TO SECURE FACTORS THAT WE MAY NOT CURRENTLY HAVE. AND,
21 YOU KNOW, BEING IN A LEAD ROLE DOESN'T MEAN LEADING ALONE IT
22 MAY INVOLVE SERVING AS I CHAMPION OR ACHIEVE ADVOCATE OR
23 RECORDING A LEAD ROLE IN A WIDER COALITION. NEXT SLIDE. SO
24 THIS IS THE DRAFT ASSESSMENT FOR THE PLAN'S TRANSPORTATION
25 STRATEGIES, WHICH ARE FOCUSED MORE ON THE CURRENT SYSTEM. I



February 10, 2021

1 THINK, YOU KNOW, ESPECIALLY PIVOTING OFF OF THE DISCUSSION
2 THAT WAS JUST HAD REGARDING THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY
3 TASK FORCE, YOU KNOW, CLEARLY THAT WORK LOOMED OVER A LOT OF,
4 THIS SO AGAIN THESE ARE DRAFT DESIGNATIONS. AND I THINK THE
5 ONGOING CONVERSATIONS AND ULTIMATE DECISIONS AROUND THE
6 NETWORK MANAGEMENT ROLE MIGHT NECESSITATE ADJUSTMENTS
7 REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION RULES FOR MTC. THAT SAID, A LEAD ROLE
8 HAS BEEN PROPOSED FOR SOME OF THE SYSTEM OPTIMIZATION
9 STRATEGIES IDENTIFIED IN THE PLAN INCLUDING FARES, SEAMLESS,
10 AND TOLLING. SO FOR SEAMLESS AND FARE POLICY, WE HAVE
11 RESOLUTION WHICH LAYS OUT OUR TRANSIT COORDINATION
12 REQUIREMENTS AND COVERS BOTH CONNECTIVITY AND FARES, BUT
13 OBVIOUSLY COORDINATION IS CHALLENGING ACROSS THE TWO DOZEN
14 INDEPENDENT OPERATORS IN THE REGION SO BUILDING OFF OF THE
15 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE CLIPPER START OTHER
16 INITIATIVES WE IMAGINE THAT MTC IS A NATURAL FIT TO TAKE THE
17 LEADERSHIP ROLE IN PUSHING THESE STRATEGIES FORWARD. WITH
18 STRATEGY T5 THE TOLLING CLEARLY THERE ARE LIMITATIONS HERE AND
19 THE WORK MOVING FORWARD WOULD HAVE TO BE FOCUSED ON GENERATING
20 ADDITIONAL PUBLIC AND POLITICAL SUPPORT, SO THAT THERE IS SOME
21 CONSENSUS PATH FORWARD TO MOVING THE STRATEGY TOWARDS
22 IMPLEMENTATION. I WILL NOTE THAT IN OUR PUBLIC SURVEY, YOU
23 KNOW, THIS WAS THE LEAST POPULAR OF THE STRATEGIES SHOWN ON
24 THE SCREEN BUT IT DOES HAVE THAT KEY FLAG REGARDING THE GHG
25 REDUCTION. IT'S ONE OF THE MOST CRITICAL STRATEGIES IN TERMS



February 10, 2021

1 OF BEING ABLE TO MEET THAT AGGRESSIVE GHG REDUCTION TARGET.
2 FOR THE STRATEGY T1, OPERATING THE SYSTEM, THIS IS, YOU KNOW,
3 FIX IT FIRST HAS BEEN OUR LONG-STANDING COMMITMENT IN THIS
4 SPACE AND WE HAVE GOOD EFFECTIVE PARTNERSHIPS WITH CTAS, LOCAL
5 DOTS AND REGIONAL TRANSIT OPERATORS WITH WHICH TO PURSUE
6 IMPLEMENTATION. AND THAT STRATEGY, ALONG WITH THE COMMUNITY
7 LED TRANSPORTATION ENHANCEMENTS AND COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN,
8 THOSE WERE THE TOP TWO IN THE PUBLIC SURVEY REGARDING PUBLIC
9 PRIORITIES FOR IMPLEMENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO FOR THESE
10 STRATEGIES, WHICH FALL UNDER THE HEALTH SAFE STREETS AND NEXT
11 GENERATION TRANSIT THEMES OF THE PLAN, YOU KNOW, FOR
12 STRATEGIES, T8 AND T9, THE COMPLETE STREETS NETWORK AS
13 REGIONAL VISION ZERO POLICY, MTC HAS LIMITED AUTHORITY FOR
14 SPECIFIC INVESTMENTS SUCH AS LOCAL BIKE AND ROAD PROJECTS OR
15 STREET DESIGN OR ROAD SPEEDS AND GENERALLY LIMITED CAPACITY
16 FOR ENGINEERING OR ENFORCEMENT, BUT WE DO HAVE AN IMPORTANT
17 ROLE IN OUR PLANNING, FUNDING, AND COORDINATING CAPACITIES AND
18 FOR VISION ZERO AS WELL WE HAVE SPECIFIC RESPONSIBILITIES WITH
19 RESPECT TO SAFETY. EXISTING INITIATIVES SUCH AS THE REGIONAL
20 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN, WHICH IS UNDER DEVELOPMENT AS WELL
21 AS THE REGIONAL VISION ZERO POLICY PROGRAM WILL BE IMPORTANT
22 WORK PUSHING THIS WORK FORWARD. FOR STRATEGIES T10 AND T11
23 AGAIN OUR PLANNING FUNDING AND COORDINATING CAPACITIES ARE
24 ESSENTIAL BUT CTA AND TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE ULTIMATELY
25 RESPONSIBILITY FOR IMPLEMENTATION. FINANCIAL REVENUES ARE ALSO



February 10, 2021

1 A CHALLENGE AS MANY OF THESE INVESTMENTS RELY ON NEW REVENUES
2 THAT ARE NOT YET SECURED. I WILL ALSO NOTE THAT OF THE
3 STRATEGIES ON THE SCREEN, THE MOST POPULAR WERE THOSE
4 ENHANCING LOCAL TRANSIT AS WELL AS EXPANDING AND MODERNIZING
5 THE REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS, WE'RE
6 MOVING ON TO HOUSING NOW. AND I THINK A FEW THINGS THAT I
7 WOULD DRAW YOUR ATTENTION TO ON THIS SLIDE THE RECENT STANDING
8 UP OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY OR BAHFA WAS
9 REALLY A GAME CHANGER ON THE AUTHORITY FRONT THE LEGISLATION
10 ESTABLISHING BAHFA PROVIDES AUTHORITY TO ACT IN A NUMBER OF
11 AREAS WHERE IN THE PAST AGENCIES WOULD HAVE BEEN MORE LIMITED.
12 THERE IS A LOT MORE GREEN HERE THAN YOU WOULD HAVE SEEN JUST A
13 FEW YEARS AGO. THE QUESTION IS OF COURSE HOW AND WHETHER THIS
14 AUTHORITY MIGHT BE USED, IN ADDITION, FINANCIAL RESOURCES
15 REMAIN A MAJOR CHALLENGE, AND A MAJOR REVENUE, REGIONAL
16 REVENUE MEASURE OF SOME KIND WOULD BE ESSENTIAL TO MAKING
17 PROGRESS HERE TO DEAL WITH SOME OF THE VERY HIGH COST THAT ARE
18 ASSOCIATED WITH SOME OF THESE STRATEGIES. BUT OVERALL, WE DO
19 THINK THAT BAHFA HAS A MAJOR OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE REGIONAL
20 LEADERSHIP IN PUSHING FORWARD AND MAKING A REALITY THE THREE P
21 FRAMEWORK OR PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION, AND PROTECTION, WHICH
22 HAS GUIDED THE HOUSING WORK OF THE AGENCIES FOR SOMETIME. AND
23 A FEW OTHER THINGS I WOULD NOTE IS THAT, YOU KNOW, AGAIN,
24 LEADING EFFORTS IN THESE SPACES DOES NOT MEAN BEING THE ONE
25 AND ONLY EXCLUSIVE LEADER. THE IDEA WOULD BE TO LEAD REGIONAL



February 10, 2021

1 EFFORTS THAT SUPPORT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AND PARTNERSHIP WITH
2 GOVERNMENT AND NON-GOVERNMENTAL PARTNERS. AND WITH RESPECT TO
3 THE STRATEGIES WHERE WE HAVE IDENTIFIED A LEAD ROLE, WHICH ARE
4 H2, H4, AND H SEVEN ON THE SCREAM IS DEVELOPING NEW SOURCES
5 EVER FUNDING THAT'S KEY FOR FUTURE IMPLEMENTATION AND WE FEEL
6 BAHFA IS AN ADVOCATE. HOWEVER I WILL NOTE OF THE STRATEGIES
7 THAT ARE SHOWN ON THE SCREEN IN THE PUBLIC SURVEY THE TWO MOST
8 POPULAR WERE THE TRANSFORMING AGING MALLS AND OFFICE PARK
9 STRATEGY AS WELL AS ACCELERATING THE REUSE OF PUBLIC COMMUNITY
10 LAND. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. MOVING ON TO THE PLAN'S ECONOMY
11 STRATEGIES. CLEARLY THERE IS A LOT OF RED HERE AND THAT'S
12 EVIDENCE OF THE FACT THAT, YOU KNOW, THE ECONOMY STRATEGIES
13 HAVE NOT TRADITIONALLY BEEN WITHIN THE SCOPE OF THE AGENCY'S
14 WORK. AND FOR THE MOST PART WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT THE
15 AGENCIES SUPPORT THE WORK OF OTHER ENTITIES AND ORGANIZATIONS
16 THAT DO HAVE AUTHORITY RESOURCES AND CAPACITY WITHIN THIS
17 SPACE. FOR EXAMPLE, THE UNIVERSITY BASIC INCOME STRATEGY,
18 EC51, THE SUCCESS THERE WOULD DEPEND UPON THE PRESENCE OF A
19 STATEWIDE COALITION THAT COULD REALLY ADVOCATE FOR SOME SORT
20 OF A PILOT TO DESIGN AND TEST THIS IDEA. WHERE WE ARE
21 RECOMMENDING A PARTNERSHIP RECOMMENDATION WOULD BE ON THE HIGH
22 SPEED INTERNET IN UNDERSERVED AND LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES AS
23 WELL AS INDUSTRIAL LANDS THE INVESTMENT WOULD COME FROM
24 REGIONAL STATEWIDE PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS BUT GIVEN THE
25 IMPORTANCE OF FACILITATING BROADBAND ACCESS IN A FUTURE OF



February 10, 2021

1 HIGHER TELEWORK WHICH WE ARE PROJECTING IN THE PLAN. IT'S
2 ESSENTIAL THAT LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES NOT BE LEFT BEHIND. SO I
3 THINK DETERMINING HOW THE AGENCIES CAN PLAY A CONSTRUCTIVE
4 ROLE IN THIS SPACE IS GOING TO BE SOMETHING THAT WERE -- ARE
5 GOING TO BE A FOCUS OF FUTURE PHASES OF THE IMPLEMENTATION
6 PLAN. AND WITH THE KEY INDUSTRIAL LENS STRATEGY, YOU KNOW,
7 WE'RE ENVISIONING A PARTNERSHIP ROLE BECAUSE WE HAVE LAUNCHED
8 A PILOT PROGRAM OF PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS AS PART OF THE
9 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR THE PLAN AND TRYING TO DEVELOP AND
10 IMPLEMENT A HANDFUL OF PILOTS OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS COULD BE
11 A KEY MECHANISM TO BUILD FUTURE CAPACITY. NEXT SLIDE. SO
12 BROADLY SPEAKING WE SEE SOME SIMILAR THEMES ACROSS THE PLAN'S
13 ENVIRONMENT STRATEGIES, WHICH IS THAT THEY'RE VERY POPULAR,
14 BUT THE FINANCES TO SUPPORT THEM ARE LESS SECURE, AND THERE IS
15 A BIT -- IT'S A BIT OF A MIXED BAG ON THE INTERNAL AUTHORITY
16 AND CAPACITY. MOST NOTABLY WE ARE RECOMMENDING A LEAD
17 IMPLEMENTATION ROLE FOR MTC ABAG FOR THE ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL
18 RISE STRATEGY. THERE HAS BEEN VERY STRONG INTEREST FROM
19 STAKEHOLDERS IN SEEING MTC ABAG TAKING MORE ACTIVE
20 COORDINATION AND FUNDING ROLE HERE. ESSENTIALLY REPLICATING
21 SOME OF THE FUNCTIONS THAT MTC PERFORMS IN THE TRANSPORTATION
22 SPACE, BUT FOCUSED ON SEA LEVEL RISE INSTEAD. NOW, AGAIN,
23 OBVIOUSLY PARTNERSHIP WOULD BE ESSENTIAL HERE, BUT I THINK THE
24 FOCUS OF THIS STRATEGY IS REALLY ON DEVELOPING THE QUOTE "GRAY
25 AND GREEN" INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WILL ENABLE AT SEA LEVEL RISE



February 10, 2021

1 ADAPTATION AND THAT'S WHERE THE AGENCY DOES HAVE IMPORTANT
2 CAPACITIES TO BUILT ON. THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP
3 HOUSED WITHIN THE BAY AREA, METRO PROVIDE STAFF SUPPORT TO THE
4 BAY AREA RESTORATION AUTHORITY AND CURRENT CAPACITIES
5 ESPECIALLY ITS RELATIONSHIP WITH CALTRANS ALREADY FUNDING A
6 FAIR AMOUNT OF ADAPTATION WORK. OBVIOUSLY THE LACK OF FUNDING
7 TO SUPPORT THAT STRATEGY IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT AND SOME
8 SORT OF REGIONAL REVENUE OR OTHER REVENUE IS GOING TO BE
9 REQUIRED. BUT IMPORTANTLY IN TERMS OF FUTURE IMPLEMENTATION
10 FACILITATION ON REGIONAL GOVERNANCE AND REQUIRING ROLES AND
11 RESPONSIBILITIES FOR ALL OF THE DIFFERENT LOCAL AND REGIONAL
12 ACTORS TO OPERATE IN THIS SPACE IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT. NEXT
13 SLIDE PLEASE. AND FINALLY, THE PLAN'S CLIMATE STRATEGIES. SO
14 GIVEN THE IMPORTANCE THAT THESE STRATEGIES HAVE IN MEETING OUR
15 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGETS AND THEIR ALIGNMENT
16 WITH EXISTING PROGRAMS SUCH AS BAY AREA COMMUTER BENEFITS
17 PROGRAM AND CLIMATE INITIATIVE PROGRAM WE ARE PROPOSING TAKING
18 A MORE ACTIVE LEADERSHIP ROLE IN THE SPACE WITH PARTNERSHIPS
19 AND AIR DISTRICT BEING ESSENTIAL. WITH COMMUTE TRIP REDUCTION
20 STRATEGIES OR EN7 THE EXISTING BAY AREA COMMUTER BENEFITS
21 PROGRAM DOES NOT HAVE AUTHORITY TO SET SUSTAINABLE TARGETS FOR
22 MAJOR EMPLOYERS SO NEW LEGISLATION WOULD BE REQUIRED TO GIVE
23 MTC AUTHORITY TO DO SO. THE EXISTING PROGRAM HAS SOME FUNDING
24 AS WELL AS LIMITED STAFF RESOURCES FROM THE AIR DISTRICT AND
25 MTC, BUT WOULD REQUIRE FURTHER EXPANSION TO FUND REGULATORY



February 10, 2021

1 OVERSIGHT AND ENFORCEMENT. AND ALTHOUGH PUBLIC SUPPORT IS
2 STRONG, IT'S UNCLEAR HOW WILLING MAJOR EMPLOYERS WILL BE TO
3 ADOPT, TRACK AND REPORT HOW THEY'RE MEETING THESE SUSTAINABLE
4 TARGETS. I WILL NOTE THAT EN7 TRIP REDUCTION STRATEGY WAS THE
5 MOST POPULAR AMONGST THESE STRATEGIES IN OUR PUBLIC SURVEY,
6 AND FINALLY FOR THE TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT
7 INITIATIVES, THE AFOREMENTIONED PROGRAMS PROVIDE STRONG
8 FOUNDATION WHICH MTC CAN EXPAND WORK AND TRANSPORTATION
9 SERVICES ALTERNATIVES THAT WOULD REDUCE GHG AND ONE KEY
10 COMPONENT REGIONAL PARKING FEE PROGRAM MAY PRESENT UNIQUE
11 CHALLENGES SPECIFIC TO CHALLENGES RELATED TO OVERALL PUBLIC
12 AND SPLIT SUPPORT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE'RE PUT -- THESE
13 ARE JUST SOME SELECT IMPLEMENTATION PRIORITIES THAT WE HAVE
14 IDENTIFIED. WE'LL BE RETURNING NEXT MONTH WITH MORE DETAILED
15 IMPLEMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS. BUT OVERALL WE'RE PUTTING
16 THESE RECOMMENDATIONS INTO THREE BROAD BUCKETS OF EITHER
17 ADVOCACY OR LEGISLATION, NEW, EXISTING OR RESTRUCTURES
18 INITIATIVES AS WELL AS PLANNING OUR RESEARCH. AND THESE ARE
19 JUST SOME EARLY HIGH LEVEL IDEAS THAT HAVE RISEN TO THE TOP. I
20 THINK CLEARLY FIRST AND FOREMOST WITH THE \$1.4 TRILLION PLAN,
21 FIGURING OUT HOW TO ADVANCE THE FUND THAT'S GOING TO BE NEEDED
22 TO SUPPORT THE DIFFERENT HOUSING TRANSPORTATION AND RESILIENCE
23 STRATEGIES IS GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT. YOU KNOW,
24 IMPLEMENTING THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
25 RECOVERY TASK FORCE. WE HAVE OUR OBAG 3 PROGRAM WHICH GUIDES A



February 10, 2021

1 LOT OF THE FEDERAL FUNDING FOR TRANSPORTATION AND OTHER NEEDS
2 IS GOING THROUGH AN UPDATE PROCESS THIS YEAR SO ALIGNING SOME
3 OF THE ELEMENTS ACROSS THE DIFFERENT PRIORITIES WITH THE
4 UPDATE OF THAT PROGRAM WILL BE IMPORTANT. AND ALSO, YOU KNOW,
5 AS WE MENTIONED WITH THE CHALLENGES OF THE ROAD PRICING, AND
6 ITS POLITICAL AND PUBLIC SUPPORT CHALLENGES, LEADING A REGION
7 STUDY AND DOING SOME DEEP ENGAGEMENT WITH BOTH THE PUBLIC AND
8 POLICY MAKERS POTENTIAL BENEFITS OF THAT STRATEGY WILL BE
9 IMPORTANT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO AS MENTIONED WE ANTICIPATE
10 OTHER THANKING TO THE COMMITTEES AND WORKING GROUPS NEXT MONTH
11 AFTER INCORPORATING THE FEEDBACK WE RECEIVE TODAY AND WE WILL
12 PRESENT DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EACH STRATEGY
13 AS WELL AS KEY POLICY AND STRATEGY CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE WANT
14 OUR AGENCY AS WELL AS OUR PARTNERS TO BE THINKING ABOUT AS WE
15 MOVE FORWARD. WE'RE ALSO TRYING TO LOOK AT SOME OF THESE
16 ACTIONS THAT SPEAK ACROSS MULTIPLE STRATEGIES AND MULTIPLE
17 ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN, PARTICULARLY THROUGH AN EQUITY AND
18 RESILIENCE LENS. AND, YOU KNOW, ONE ACTION THAT MAY COME OUT
19 OF THIS IS TO SORT OF BUILD AN ADVOCACY PLATFORM THAT CROSSES
20 ACROSS ALL OF THE DIFFERENT SECTIONS OF THE PLAN. WE'LL ALSO
21 BE WORKING CONTINUOUSLY ON A RESOURCE AND PRIORITIZATION
22 ASSESSMENT JUST MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE THE INTERNAL CAPACITY
23 TO DELIVER ON THE WORK THAT WE'RE COMMITTING TO, AND THAT IT
24 ALIGNS WITH EXISTING PROGRAM PRIORITIES WITHIN THE AGENCY. AND
25 THEN, AS I MENTIONED, THE DRAFT WILL BE RELEASED LATER IN THE



February 10, 2021

1 SPRING TO BE FOLLOWED BY THE PARTNERSHIP PHASE OF THE PLAN.
2 AND, NEXT SLIDE. SO, YOU KNOW, THANKS -- THANK YOU ALL FOR
3 STICKING WITH US ON THE PRESENTATION. I KNOW IT WAS A LOT OF
4 DENSE INFORMATION. BUT, WE WOULD LOVE TO GET SOME FEEDBACK
5 FROM MEMBERS POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL INCLUDING IF YOU HAVE ANY
6 THOUGHTS ON WHICH STRATEGIES ARE YOUR HIGHEST PRIORITIES FOR
7 ACCELERATION. IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS ON THE DRAFT
8 ASSESSMENT, AND ALSO IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS ON THE ROLE
9 RECOMMENDATIONS, WHETHER THERE ARE AREAS WHERE YOU THINK IT
10 WOULD MAKE SENSE FOR THE AGENCY TO MAYBE TAKE A MORE ACTIVE
11 ROLE OR PERHAPS NOT. AND WITH THAT, HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
12 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS OR TAKE COMMENTS.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE WILL START WITH ADINA. GO
15 AHEAD.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION ABOUT HOW
18 THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IS STARTING TO SHAPE UP. I HAVE A FEW
19 SUGGESTIONS BUILDING ON WHAT IS HERE, AND ONE IS IN THE
20 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND AREA WHERE IT IS BEING PROPOSED FOR MTC
21 TO TAKE THE LEAD. THE WAY THAT THAT WAS FRAMED IN THE INITIAL
22 DRAFT HAD REALLY BEEN FOCUSED ON LARGE COMPANIES WHICH HAVE
23 BEEN THE FOCUS, PREVIOUSLY, ON OF TRANSPORTATION DEMAND
24 MANAGEMENT INITIATIVES BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE THE MOST
25 ORGANIZATION AND RESOURCES HAVE BEEN. HOWEVER, THERE HAS BEEN



February 10, 2021

1 SOME -- THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES TO DEMOCRATIZE THAT KIND OF
2 PROGRAM, THE PALO ALTO TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION
3 WHICH IS AN INNOVATIVE EXAMPLE OF CTA THAT SERVE A SET OF
4 SMALLER BUSINESSES THAT HAVE MANY LOW INCOME WORKERS IN
5 SERVICE JOBS, AND ALSO HISTORICALLY SOME OF THE LARGE COMPANY
6 TDM PROGRAMS HAVE SERVED, YOU KNOW, FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES, AND
7 THOSE LEAVE OUT THE CONTRACTORS WHO DO THE LOWER INCOME, YOU
8 KNOW, JANITORIAL AND FOOD SERVICE, AND SO ON, JOBS, WITH BIG
9 CORPORATIONS. SO THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK BEYOND THE
10 PROGRAMS AT THE BIG COMPANIES AND THINK ABOUT MECHANISMS THAT
11 COULD INCLUDE LOWER INCOME WORKERS, AND SMALLER COMPANIES. AND
12 THEN HAVE WAYS OF STRATEGIES TO FUND THOSE INITIATIVES. SECOND
13 THOUGHT ON THE FUNDING AND THE TRANSIT SERVICE IS THAT THE
14 DRAFT TALKED ABOUT RESTORING TRANSIT FUNDING AND SERVICE TO
15 PRECOVID LEVELS BY 2035. AND THAT IS TOO LATE. AND SO, YOU
16 KNOW, GLAD TO SEE THE INTEREST IN REGIONAL FUNDING AND
17 ACCELERATING THAT, AND A STRONG SUGGESTION WOULD BE TO HAVE
18 THAT NOT ONLY FUNDING RESTORATION, BUT TO HAVE SERVICE LEVELS
19 THAT ARE A HIGHER, THAT CAN HELP GENERATE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP
20 FOR BEST PRACTICES AROUND THE WORLD. IN TERMS OF THE --
21 ADVANCING THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT
22 AND ADVANCING THE FARE INTEGRATION, THAT IS GREAT. AND I SEE
23 THAT MTC HAS IDENTIFIED ITSELF AS A LOGICAL ENTITY THAT PLAYS
24 A LEAD ROLE THERE, AND THAT IS ONE OF SEVERAL INSTITUTIONAL
25 LOGICAL OPTIONS FOR THAT TO HAPPEN. AND SO I'M NOT TOTALLY



February 10, 2021

1 SURE HOW TO MAKE THIS COMMENT, BUT IN TERMS OF THE
2 INSTITUTIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
3 AND FARE TASK FORCE, YOU KNOW, THERE MAY BE MORE THAN ONE WAY
4 FOR EITHER MTC TO LEAD, OR FOR SOME TRANSIT OPERATOR
5 CONSORTIUM JOINT VENTURE ENTITY TO LEAD AND FOR MTC TO
6 SUPPORT. AND SO THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MICHAEL LOPEZ AND THEN
9 CHRISTINA.

10

11 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** YES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION.
12 AS I WAS READING THROUGH THE REPORT, ITSELF, AND I WENT
13 THROUGH THE STRATEGIES, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT HIT ME WAS THE
14 LITTLE TREE, THE GHG REDUCTION STRATEGY. AND ON THOSE, MOST OF
15 THEM HAVE THE RECOMMENDED IMPLEMENTATION AS BEING LEAD OR EVEN
16 PARTNER, BUT JUST A FEW THEY THOUGHT WERE LISTED AS SUPPORTED,
17 AND I THINK THEY WERE IN THE ECONOMY AND IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL
18 RANGE, AND THEY WERE SUPPORT, AND I THOUGHT TO MYSELF, WELL
19 THIS SEEMS A LITTLE BIT OUT OF WHACK IF IT'S SOMETHING WE'RE
20 STRESSING AS BEING IMPORTANT. AND AS I READ ALONG, I WENT
21 THROUGH, AND I WOULD READ THE STRATEGY AND THEN I WOULD LIKE
22 AT THE CURRENT CONDITIONS AND I WOULD TRY TO REASON, IS THIS
23 GOING TO BE A PARTNER OR A LEAD OR A SUPPORT AND THOSE JUST
24 DIDN'T MAKE SENSE TO ME. BECAUSE I THOUGHT IT WAS SOMETHING WE
25 WANTED TO PUSH. AND I THOUGHT, IF YOU'RE TALKING STRONG,



February 10, 2021

1 MEDIUM, AND NOT SO STRONG, EVERY TIME YOU SAID SUPPORT, IT WAS
2 MORE LIKE, NOT SO STRONG. SO THAT'S MY COMMENT. IT JUST SEEMED
3 A LITTLE BIT OUT THE WHACK FOR ME.

4

5 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT COMMENT. AND I
6 THINK ONE CLARIFICATION THAT, YOU KNOW, I WOULD OFFER, IS
7 THAT, YOU KNOW, IN SOME CASES IN DOING THE ASSESSMENT,
8 ALTHOUGH WE MAY LACK CAPACITY, I THINK THERE MIGHT BE AN
9 ASSESSMENT THAT THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY, YOU KNOW, A GOOD
10 OPPORTUNITY TO PURSUE CHANGES THAT MIGHT IMPROVE OUR
11 CAPACITIES OR AUTHORITY. I THINK, SPECIFICALLY FOR, YOU KNOW,
12 ONE OF THE KEY GHG REDUCTION STRATEGIES IN THE ECONOMY ELEMENT
13 OF THE PLAN, THAT'S, YOU KNOW, ALLOWING GREATER COMMERCIAL
14 DENSITIES AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, THE KEY THERE IS THAT WE
15 LACK THE LOCAL LAND USE AUTHORITY TO ACTUALLY ENABLE GREATER
16 DENSITIES IN THOSE LOCATIONS. SO, I THINK THE REASON FOR THE
17 SUPPORT IS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE WANT TO BE ABLE TO HELP
18 FACILITATE THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. YOU KNOW, MAYBE PERHAPS
19 THROUGH OUR PDA PLANNING PROGRAM, AS THEY LOOK TO, YOU KNOW,
20 DEVELOP A GREATER COMMERCIAL DENSITY IN THEIR PDA AND
21 POTENTIALLY OTHER AREAS. BUT, YOU KNOW, I THINK THE ASSESSMENT
22 IS THAT'S NOT AN AREA WHERE WE ARE LIKELY TO GAIN AUTHORITY TO
23 REALLY HAVE CONTROL OVER THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE STRATEGY. I
24 THINK SIMILARLY, WITH THE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES, AND THE
25 ENVIRONMENT SECTION, YOU KNOW, IT'S JUST NOT AN AREA WHERE WE



February 10, 2021

1 HAVE THAT AUTHORITY AND ARE VERY UNLIKELY TO GET THAT
2 AUTHORITY. BUT HOPEFULLY THERE ARE THINGS THAT WE CAN DO THAT
3 ARE IMPACTFUL, AND MEANINGFUL TO SUPPORT THE LOCAL
4 JURISDICTIONS, AS THEY EXERCISE THEIR DUE AUTHORITY.

5

6 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** I WOULD NEVER SUGGEST A LEAD, BUT I WOULD SAY A
7 PARTNER MIGHT BE MORE OF A STATEMENT. I RECOGNIZE THE
8 AUTHORITY AND THE FINANCES AND THE POLITICAL OPPORTUNITIES MAY
9 NOT BE THERE, BUT I JUST THOUGHT OF IT AS BEING MORE OF A
10 STATEMENT. AND THAT'S ALL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHRISTINA AND THEN WENDI.

13

14 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** HI CHIRAG THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I
15 AGREE WITH MICHAEL ABOUT MORE OF A PARTNER THAN SUPPORT. AND I
16 ALSO HAVE TWO OTHER COMMENTS. I THINK WHAT'S MISSING FROM THIS
17 VISUAL IS WHAT WERE THE PRIORITIES OF THE PUBLIC FROM THOSE
18 ROUNDS OF FEEDBACK AND FOCUS GROUPS THAT YOU COLLECTED SINCE
19 IT SEEMS LIKE THEY WOULD HIGHLIGHT TWO SPECIFIC THINGS. BUT
20 IT'S KIND OF NOT SHOWN HERE SIDE BY SIDE WITH WHAT YOUR SEEING
21 ARE MTC'S PRIORITIES, OR MIGHT BE, AND THAT COULD KIND OF GO
22 ALONG WITH THE EQUITY LENS FOCUS THAT YOU WERE GOING TO
23 INFLUENCE ON THIS. AND THE OTHER THING ON THIS IS THAT EC5
24 ABOUT THE INCENTIVES TO EMPLOYERS ABOUT THE HOUSING-RICH AREAS
25 SEEMS LIKE THE MACRO VERSION OF EN7, WHICH WAS THE PRODUCTION



February 10, 2021

1 PROGRAM AT MAJOR EMPLOYERS. SO I THINK THOSE ALSO, THE STATUS
2 SHOULD BE MORE CLOSELY ALIGNED.

3

4 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT COMMENT,
5 CHRISTINA, AND, YEAH, I THINK TO YOUR POINT, AND MICHAEL'S
6 EARLIER POINT, IT'S IMPORTANT THAT, YEAH, THESE ARE ALL DRAFT
7 DESIGNATIONS AND I THINK HEARING THAT KIND OF FEEDBACK IS
8 GOING TO BE, YOU KNOW, VERY HELPFUL AS WE LAND ON AN
9 APPROPRIATE FINAL RECOMMENDATION. AND I ALSO -- I REALLY
10 APPRECIATED YOUR POINT ABOUT THE PUBLIC SURVEY, AND THAT NOT
11 BEING REPRESENTED. I KNOW, YOU KNOW, I WOULD JUST APOLOGIZE
12 AND SAY THAT THE -- IT WAS JUST THE TIMING -- A TIMING ISSUE,
13 AND THAT THE SURVEY IS ACTUALLY, YOU KNOW, WAS JUST WRAPPING
14 UP, AND WE DON'T HAVE COMPLETE RESULTS AT THIS TIME THIS SLIDE
15 DECK WAS PUT TOGETHER. BUT THERE -- YOU KNOW, THERE IS, IN THE
16 ATTACHMENT TO THE COMMITTEE PACKET, IT DOES PRINT OUT ALL THE
17 SURVEY RESULTS THIS IS THE DRAFT PRESENTATION AND AS THE
18 IMPLEMENTATION MOVES FORWARD WE WILL HAVE MORE FORMAL PRESS OF
19 THE MATERIAL -- PRESS OF THE MATERIAL AND WE WILL INCLUDE
20 PRESENTATIONS OF PUBLIC PRIORITIES JUST SO THAT'S CLEAR FOR
21 EVERYONE AS WELL.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WENDI THEN RICK HALL.

24



February 10, 2021

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** A QUESTION WHERE YOU HAVE SEAMLESS
2 TRANSPORTATION AND FARE INTEGRATION YOU'RE LISTING MTC AS THE
3 LEAD AGENCY. ARE YOU SPEAKING IN TERMS OF THE FACT THAT YOU
4 ARE FACILITATING THE TASK FORCES THAT ARE ONGOING RIGHT NOW OR
5 ARE YOU ANTICIPATING YOU'RE GOING TO BE THE LEAD AGENCY WHEN
6 ALL THOSE THINGS ARE COMPLETED?

7

8 **CHIRAG RABARI:** WELL, I THINK THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. AND I
9 THINK THERE IS, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A LITTLE BIT OF
10 ANTICIPATION IF TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, WHAT RECOMMENDATIONS COULD
11 COME DOWN, ALTHOUGH OBVIOUSLY, YOU KNOW, WE DO NOT KNOW. I
12 THINK IT IS ALSO JUST AN ASSESSMENT OF, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS THE
13 GOAL OF THE STRATEGY. AND WHO WOULD BE BEST POSITIONED TO
14 ACTUALLY HELP REALIZE THE PROMISE AND THE BENEFITS OF THAT
15 STRATEGY. AND I THINK WITH BOTH SEAMLESS AND REFORMING
16 REGIONAL FARE POLICY, I THINK WE DO SEE MTC AS A NATURAL FIT
17 GIVEN ITS CURRENT ROLE TO HELP LEAD. BUT I THINK YOUR POINT IS
18 CORRECT THAT OBVIOUSLY, YOU KNOW, THE CIRCUMSTANCES WILL
19 DEPEND ON THE ULTIMATE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE MADE BY THE
20 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE AND THE FARE
21 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. SO, AGAIN, THAT IS SOMETHING THAT MAY
22 EVOLVE AND CHANGE DEPENDING ON WHERE THESE BODIES ULTIMATE
23 LAND.

24



February 10, 2021

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** RIGHT. AND GIVING YOU CAUTION OF JUMPING THE
2 GUN BECAUSE THAT COULD GET YOU INTO POLITICAL TROUBLE BECAUSE
3 THERE ARE PROBABLY THOSE WHO DON'T WANT MTC TO BE THE LEAD
4 AGENCY AND IF YOU ARE POSITIONING YOURSELF TO BE THE LEAD
5 AGENCY THAT JUST GIVES PEOPLE THE OPPORTUNITY TO PUSH BACK. AS
6 FAR AS THE HOUSING EFFORTS, I HAVE MY FIRSTS. SO, I DON'T KNOW
7 IF YOU REALLY WANT US TO TELL YOU, YOU KNOW, WHICH ONES ARE
8 HIGHEST PRIORITIES BECAUSE SO MANY OF THEM ARE HIGH PRIORITIES
9 BUT PERHAPS, I KNOW THERE HAS BEEN ANALYSIS TO SEE WHICH OF
10 THESE PRIORITIES HAVE THE MOST BANG FOR THEIR BUCK, HOW MUCH,
11 YOU KNOW, ACHIEVE THE GOALS OF GREENHOUSE REDUCTION, EQUITY,
12 AND FINANCIAL FEASIBILITY AND I'M WONDERING IF THERE'S SOME
13 WAY TO SHOW THAT RANKING IN HERE AS PART OF THE DECISION
14 MAKING OF WHERE TO FOCUS THE ATTENTION. SO THAT'S ONE
15 RECOMMENDATION. THE FINAL QUESTION IS, AS FAR AS THE HOUSING
16 IS CONCERNED, HOW MUCH IS THIS DEPENDENT ON THE SUCCESS OF
17 JURISDICTIONS ACTUALLY ACHIEVING THEIR RHNA NUMBERS? HOW MUCH
18 IS THIS TIED INTO RHNA NUMBERS? AND HOW MUCH OF IT IS ALSO
19 TIED INTO SOME OF THE STATE LEGISLATION THAT'S CURRENTLY BEING
20 PROPOSED?

21

22 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SO I THINK ON THE -- AND I'LL LET MY COLLEAGUE
23 DAVE VAUTIN JUMP IN HERE AS WELL. I'LL JUST SAY BROADLY WITH
24 RESPECT TO RHNA, THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT RHNA IS ON A PARALLEL
25 TRACK, AS A PARALLEL PROCESS. THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IS



February 10, 2021

1 REALLY, I WOULD SAY, STRATEGY FOCUSED IN NATURE, AND THAT
2 WE'RE TRYING TO IDENTIFY HIGH IMPACT ACTIONS THAT ARE REALLY
3 GOING TO MOVE THESE STRATEGIES FORWARD OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL
4 YEARS. SO AT THIS STAGE WE HAVEN'T BEEN DRAWING A CLEAR
5 IMPLEMENTATION LINKAGE WITH THE RHNA PROCESS ON THE
6 UNDERSTANDING THAT THAT IS A SEPARATE -- A PARALLEL PROCESS
7 THAT IS GOING TO BE KIND OF PROCEEDING ON ITS OWN TIMELINE.

8 >DAVE VAUTIN: AND I'LL JUST ADD TO WHAT CHIRAG MENTIONED, DAVE
9 VAUTIN PROJECT MANAGER THE STRATEGIES WE BELIEVE ARE MOST COST
10 EFFECTIVE IN TERMS OF ENABLING US TO GET TO THAT GREENHOUSE
11 GAS TARGET JUST REACHED LAST MONTH AND REALLY WHAT THAT
12 INDICATES IS YOU CAN SEE THAT THE STRATEGIES THAT REALLY HELP
13 US GET TO GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS IN A COST EFFECTIVE WAY ARE
14 OFTENTIMES POLICY ACTIONS NOT NECESSARILY INVESTMENTS THEY'RE
15 ABOUT DOING MORE WITH LESS YOU CAN SEE THAT WITH
16 TRANSPORTATION POLICIES THE LAND USE ACTIONS URBAN GROWTH
17 BOUNDARIES AND THE LIKE.

18

19 **WENDI KALLINS:** AND ALSO SOME OF THOSE STRATEGIES ARE PROBABLY
20 THE ONES THAT ARE GOING TO HAVE THE BIGGEST PUSH BACK FROM THE
21 PUBLIC. LIKE THE TOLLING ON THE HIGHWAYS, AND THE MIXING OF
22 DENSITIES?

23

24 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YES. I THINK THAT'S A VERY ASTUTE OBSERVATION.

25



February 10, 2021

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** SO MY FINAL COMMENT WOULD BE IN THINKING IN
2 TERMS OF HOW TO BUILD PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR THINGS THAT ARE
3 CURRENTLY UNPOPULAR BUT COULD BE THE MOST SUCCESSFUL.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES, AND THEN MICHAEL
6 BALDINI.

7

8 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. JUST A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. FIRST, I
9 REALLY APPLAUD THIS EFFORT. THIS IS A VERY DIFFICULT EFFORT IN
10 A TIME WE HAVE RIGHT NOW AND IT MAKES SENSE GOING FORWARD IN
11 THE FUTURE. I BELIEVE THAT TRANSIT WILL BOUNCE BACK THERE WILL
12 BE PEOPLE BACK IN THE OFFICES. I THINK ESPECIALLY FOR TECH AND
13 EVEN MORE SO FOR BIOTECH, COLLABORATION IS AN IMPORTANT ISSUE.
14 AND IT'S OFTEN DONE BETTER WHEN PEOPLE ARE TOGETHER IN A ROOM.
15 I DON'T KNOW IF YOU REMEMBER BACK IN YAHOO DECIDED TO PULL
16 EVERYBODY IN FROM WORKING AT HOME BECAUSE THEY WEREN'T GETTING
17 THE COLLABORATION THAT THEY NEEDED. SO, I APPLAUD YOU FOR
18 TRYING TO WORK THROUGH THIS. I WANT TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT, T
19 TWO AND COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION AND SOME OF THE OTHER
20 IMPORTANT ISSUES. AND I'M GOING GO OFF A LITTLE OF WHAT YOU
21 HAVE ALREADY PROPOSED. I WAS LUCKY ENOUGH TO SPEND ABOUT 15
22 MINUTES TALKING TO LAURA TYSON ONE OF CLINTON ECONOMIC
23 ADVISERS AT A MEETING IN SAN CARLOS JUST SHE AND I TALKING AND
24 WE CENTERED ON THE SALES TAX IN CALIFORNIA, AND FOR A PREAMBLE
25 TO THE SALES TAX CALIFORNIA IS ALMOST ALONE IN THE WAY THAT



February 10, 2021

1 YOU DO SALES TAX. THE COUNTY I COME FROM IN KANSAS, I
2 APOLOGIZE FOR THE -- THAT'S MY E-MAIL COMING IN, AND I DON'T
3 KNOW HOW TO STOP IT -- THE SALES TAX THEY COME FROM, IS TEN
4 AND A HALF PERCENT AND IT'S ON EVERYTHING. SERVICES, EVEN
5 FOOD. UNLIKE CALIFORNIA WHO CHARGES NO SALES TAX ON FOOD,
6 MEDICATION, OR SERVICES. MANY PARTS OF THIS COUNTRY, IN FACT,
7 MOST, CHARGE ON EVERYTHING, AND IT'S A HIGHER RATE IN SOME
8 CASES THAN IN CALIFORNIA. CALIFORNIA IS HELD UP AS A HIGH
9 SALES TAX STATE, BUT IT'S NOT REALLY, BECAUSE IT'S ON ABOUT 20
10 PERCENT OF THE ITEMS OF OTHER STATES. TYSON POINTED OUT TO ME
11 THAT 80 PERCENT OF THE FUTURE ECONOMY IS GOING TO BE WITH
12 SERVICES. WE WERE FORTUNATE WITH THE WAYFAIR DECISION WHICH
13 ACTUALLY IS NOW TAXING ONLINE ITEMS. SO IN MANY CASES IT'S NOW
14 MORE EXPENSES WITH DELIVERY CHARGES TO BUY AT HOME THAN IT IS
15 ONLINE. BUT THE WAY WE WOULD HAVE TO WORK THIS TO CHANGE THE
16 SYSTEM IS WE WOULD HAVE TO LOWER THE OVERALL SALES TAX AND WE
17 WOULD HAVE TO UNRAVEL ALL THESE OTHER LOCAL ADD ORDINANCE --
18 ADD ONES, STARTING WITH THE LOCAL STATE SALES TAX 7.75 PERCENT
19 WHICH I THINK IS THE CITIES 25 PERCENT AMI I MAY BE OFF A BIT.
20 GENERATING A GREAT DEAL MORE SALES TAX TO FUND THESE
21 TRANSPORTATION NECESSITIES, THAN THE OVERALL SALES TAX
22 EXTENDING IT TO SERVICES LEAVING GROCERY AND MEDICATION OUT OF
23 THE MIX TO MAKE IT MORE EQUITABLE. POOR PEOPLE DO NOT USE EYE
24 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF SERVICES I WOULD BET YOU UBER IS NOT
25 DELIVERING TO MARGINALIZE THE HOMES WITH FOOD. SO WE REALLY



February 10, 2021

1 NEED TO LOOK AT REVAMPING SOME BASIC TAXES IN THE STATE OF
2 CALIFORNIA. WE'RE NOT LONGER GOING TO BE ABLE TO ADD ON MONEY
3 TO SALES TAX IT'S JUST NOT GOING TO FLY. IN ORDER TO GET MORE
4 REVENUE WE HAVE TO REVAMP IT. AND I WOULD APPRECIATE ON OUR
5 ADVOCACY LEVEL PUTTING SOMETHING LIKE THAT TOGETHER FOR MTC
6 AND THE OTHER AGENCIES, LOS ANGELES, SACRAMENTO, AND COMING
7 TOGETHER ON THAT. SO THANK YOU.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** MICHAEL BALDINI, AND THEN RICK COATES.

10

11 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** GOOD AFTERNOON AND THANK YOU. I WAS JUST
12 CURIOUS ABOUT THE MTC SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA GOODS MOVEMENT
13 LAND. DOES THIS DOVETAIL IN IT? DOES THIS DRIVE THIS? OR IS
14 THERE ANY INTERFACE WITH THAT PLAN WHICH SEEMS IT HASN'T BEEN
15 UPDATED SINCE FEBRUARY OF 2016? AND HOW IT MIGHT WORK WITH SAY
16 THE CLEAN BAY AREA INITIATIVES AND INDUSTRIAL LANDS SO FORTH.

17

18 **CHIRAG RABARI:** WE WOULD PROBABLY CALL BACK AND REFERENCE THE
19 PREVIOUSLY ADOPTED GOODS MOVEMENT AND PLAN STILL BEING IN
20 FORCE AND EFFECT AND TRYING TO LOOK FOR WAYS TO CONTINUE
21 FURTHERING THE WORK THAT CAME OUT OF THAT PREVIOUSLY ADOPTED
22 GOODS MOVEMENT STRATEGIC PLAN. I THINK THERE IS CERTAINLY
23 OPPORTUNITIES TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO ALIGN DIFFERENT ELEMENTS OF
24 THE IMPLEMENTATION EFFORT WITH SOME OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS
25 THAT PREVIOUSLY CAME OUT OF THAT STUDY.



February 10, 2021

1

2 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RICK COATES AND THEN CARLOS.

5

6 **RICK COATES:** LET'S LOOK AGAIN AT STRATEGY T TEN AND T11, LOCAL
7 TRANSIT FREQUENCY CAPACITY RELIABILITY SOMEHOW AGAIN
8 CONNECTIVITY NEVER GOT IN THERE. AND I THINK THAT'S KEY FOR
9 REDUCTION OF GREENHOUSE GASES AND UNTIL YOU DO THOSE THINGS
10 YOU'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP,
11 AND GET PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR AUTOMOBILES. SO I WOULD ADD THE
12 WORD CONNECTIVITY IN THERE AND I WOULD PUT A GREEN TREE BY IT.
13 SAME AS TRUE FOR T11 EXPAND AND MODERNIZE CORRECT REGIONAL
14 RAIL NETWORKS AND AGAIN IT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE GREENHOUSE
15 ISSUE. COST EFFECTIVE, I DON'T KNOW. BUT I THINK IT'S
16 IMPORTANT. I THINK IT STILL WILL HAVE A GREAT EFFECT. THANK
17 YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CARLOS AND THEN TERRY SCOTT.

20

21 CARLOS CASTELLANOS THANK YOU. AND I APPRECIATE -- THIS IS A
22 VERY COMPLEX MATRIX AND I APPRECIATE ALL THE EFFORT THAT'S
23 GONE INTO IT. AND I WANT TO COMMENT ON SIMPLY ONE STRATEGY,
24 JUST FOR THE SAKE OF TIME. IT'S ON H -- IT'S -- LET'S SEE,
25 IT'S H5, I BELIEVE, THAT'S THE INTEGRATE AFFORDABLE HOUSING



February 10, 2021

1 INTO ALL MAJOR HOUSING PROJECTS. I SEE IT, AND THIS IS KIND OF
2 GOING BACK TO A COUPLE OF OTHER SPEAKERS, A COUPLE OF OTHER
3 COUNCIL MEMBERS THAT SAID, CAN WE PUSH A LITTLE BIT HARDER ON
4 THE IMPLEMENTATION ROLE FOR MTC. AND I COULD UNDERSTAND THAT
5 WE'RE NOT NECESSARILY A LEAD IN THIS, BUT PARTNERING SEEMS
6 MORE IN LINE. PARTICULARLY IF YOU LOOK AT THE ABAG AND MTC
7 TOGETHER, THE WORK THAT WE DO, IN TERMS OF WHETHER IT'S THE
8 RHNA, WHETHER IT'S MAYBE EVEN SOME LIKE HOME TO WORK
9 CALCULATIONS THAT ARE DONE WHERE YOU COULD REALLY BE A PARTNER
10 AS SOME OF THESE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ARE IMPLEMENTING THESE
11 INCLUSIONARY LAWS, AND REALLY, IT'S SUPPORT AND PARTNERING IN
12 TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO REALLY EFFECTIVELY IMPLEMENT THAT
13 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. AND I HAVE SEEN ALSO, I KNOW THAT THE
14 COMMENT, THAT THERE IS STRONG OPPOSITION AND YET WE ARE SEEING
15 EVEN AMONGST COMMERCIAL BUILDERS THAT THERE IS A GROWING
16 INTEREST IN HOW DO WE BUILD OFFICES NEAR HOUSING AND SO THAT
17 REALLY TRYING TO REDUCE THE GREENHOUSE GAS TO MAKE THE
18 OPPORTUNITIES FOR FOLKS TO LIVE NEAR THE COMMERCIAL AND NOT
19 HAVE TO DRIVE IN FROM TWO HOURS AWAY TO BE ABLE TO WORK IN THE
20 JOBS THAT ARE BEING OFFERED IN THE JOB RICH COMMUNITIES. THANK
21 YOU.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY AND THEN VEDA. TERRY,
24 YOU NEED TO UNMUTE YOURSELF.

25



February 10, 2021

1 **TERRY SCOTT:** I APPRECIATE IT AND LARGELY AGREE WITH CHIRAG'S
2 AND HIS PRESENTATION PARTICULARLY THE STRATEGIES AND
3 PRIORITIES THAT HE IDENTIFIED IN HIS DRAFT STRATEGY. I THINK
4 ONE THAT IS VERY WIDELY DISCUSSED AND HIGHLIGHTED LOCALLY ARE
5 THE RHNA NUMBERS THAT ARE PROVIDED FOR EACH OF THE -- EACH OF
6 THE COUNTIES, AND RHNA, THE RHNA NUMBERS ARE TARGETS THAT EACH
7 OF THE COUNTIES OBVIOUSLY ARE WORKING TOWARDS, AND IN MANY OF
8 THEM, THE LARGE CITIES ARE PARTICULARLY IN THE COUNTIES LIKE
9 OURS, THAT'S QUITE RURAL, THE CITIES ARE ABSORBING MANY OF
10 THESE NUMBERS, SPECIFICALLY. AND CLEARLY, LAND USE POLICIES
11 AND DECISIONS ARE THE MOST CHALLENGING AND HIGHLY DEBATED
12 ISSUES AND PRIORITIES WITHIN THE COUNTIES AND CITIES OF OUR
13 COUNTY, AND I SUSPECT OF THE MAJORITY OF OTHERS. THEY'RE VERY
14 CHALLENGING. THEY'RE VERY CONTROVERSIAL, IF YOU WILL, AND ITS
15 -- I GO BACK TO -- I HAVE HAD A NUMBER OF OUR SUPERVISORS, AND
16 INCLUDING A FORMER SUPERVISOR, WHO IS NOW OUR STATE SENATOR,
17 TELL ME THAT LAND USE ISSUES AND DETERMINATIONS ARE THE MOST
18 IMPORTANT AND THE MOST DIFFICULT ONES THAT THEY HAVE DEALT
19 WITH IN THEIR PAST LIVES, EITHER AS CITY OFFICIALS, MAYORS,
20 COUNTY SUPERVISORS, AND AS WELL AS STATE REPRESENTATIVES IN
21 THE ASSEMBLY AND THE SENATE. THOSE ARE -- THOSE ARE SOMEWHAT
22 OVERWHELMING. NO MATTER WHICH WAY YOU GO, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE
23 CHALLENGES AND OPPOSITION. AND SO I THINK THAT IT'S GOOD TO
24 HAVE RECOMMENDATIONS AND A STRATEGY THAT IS PROVIDED BY MTC
25 AND SO FORTH BY ABAG THAT ALLOW THESE CITIES AND COUNTIES TO



February 10, 2021

1 DEVELOP A SUBSTRUCTURE THAT WILL SUPPORT THOSE PRIORITIES. AND
2 I THINK, IN LARGE MEASURE, WE'RE DOING A PRETTY GOOD JOB. ARE
3 THERE ANY COUNTIES THAT ARE REPRESENTED HERE, IN THE COUNCIL,
4 THAT DON'T FIND THE RHNA NUMBERS CHALLENGING? I WOULD LIKE TO
5 HEAR FROM OTHERS. BECAUSE IT'S A CHALLENGE, IN THIS COUNTY,
6 EVERY SINGLE YEAR. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH TERRY FOR THAT FEEDBACK. I
9 WILL SAY BROADLY FOR THE HOUSING STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN, YOU
10 KNOW, WHAT WE WILL IDENTIFY, AS IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS, ARE,
11 YOU KNOW, ACTIVITIES THAT ARE OUR HOUSING AND LOCAL PLANNING
12 TEAM ARE GOING TO BE PURSUING OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS
13 ALONG WITH THE SUPPORT OF THE EXPANDED HOUSING PORTFOLIO
14 THROUGH BAHFA. SO I THINK, SPECIFICALLY WITH RESPECT TO RHNA
15 YOU KNOW, THERE ARE -- THERE IS THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION
16 PLANNING GRANT PROGRAM, AND YOU KNOW, THE INTENTION THERE HAS
17 BEEN ONE TRANCHE OF FUNDING THAT HAS BEEN RELEASED THERE IS A
18 MUCH LARGER TRANCHE OF FUNDING THAT WILL BECOME AVAILABLE ONCE
19 THE RHNA PROCESS COMES TO A CLOSE AND THE JURISDICTIONS BEGIN
20 WORKING ON THEIR GENERAL UPDATES TO THEIR GENERAL PLAN. SO WE
21 ANTICIPATE THERE WILL BE SIGNIFICANT FINANCIAL SUPPORT THAT
22 WILL BE AVAILABLE TO JURISDICTIONS ACROSS THE NINE COUNTY
23 REGION THROUGH TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, THROUGH CONSULTING
24 BENCHES, BEST PRACTICES, YOU KNOW, PLANNING COLLABORATIVES AND
25 COHORTS, TO REALLY SUPPORT THE JURISDICTIONS AS THEY WORK



February 10, 2021

1 THROUGH THEIR GENERAL PLAN UPDATE. SO, YOU KNOW, THAT'S A
2 LITTLE BIT INDIRECT, BUT I DID JUST WANT TO NOTE THAT WE WILL
3 BE CALLING OUT THOSE EFFORTS THAT WILL BE AVAILABLE THAT
4 SHOULD BE SUPPORTIVE OF THE JURISDICTIONS AS THEY'RE GOING
5 THROUGH THEIR RHNA PROCESS.

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** CHIRAG, WE ARE SEEING IN SAN FRANCISCO -- I THINK
8 THERE ARE PROPERTIES THROUGHOUT BAY AREA IN ALL NINE COUNTIES
9 WHERE THOSE ARE REALISTIC OPPORTUNITIES, IF YOU WILL, AND I --
10 IN SOME WAY, THERE SHOULD BE A DIRECT WAY TO UTILIZE THEM TO
11 ASSIST IN PROPERLY DEALING WITH THE HOMELESS ISSUES, THAT EACH
12 OF OUR COUNTIES IS FACING.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VEDA?

15

16 **VEDA FLOREZ:** I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO CHIRAG AND DAVE AND
17 THE TEAM FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER AND PACKAGING THE
18 OPPORTUNITIES FOR COURSE CORRECTION WITH THE STRATEGIES AND I
19 WANT TO THANK BAHFA FOR MOVING FORWARD AS A SUPPORT LEAD OH
20 ONE OF THE QUESTIONS THEY HAVE FOR YOU, IS DO YOU SEE THE NEED
21 FOR A REGIONAL -- FOR -- TO -- LET ME LOOK AT MY NOTES. DO YOU
22 SEE A NEED WITHIN THE NEXT FIVE YEARS FOR A REGIONAL REVENUE
23 TAX OR NEW LEGISLATION? TO FUND OUR TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING
24 NEEDS?

25



February 10, 2021

1 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SO I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, THE TIMING OF ANY
2 FUTURE POTENTIAL REVENUE MEASURES, I THINK WILL CERTAINLY BE
3 SOMETHING THAT WILL BE UNDER DISCUSSION. BUT I DEFINITELY WANT
4 TO EMPHASIZE THAT, ULTIMATELY WILL BE THE DECISION OF THE
5 POLICY MAKERS AND THE BOARD AS TO WHETHER THEY'RE COMFORTABLE
6 WITH PUSHING THOSE REVENUE MEASURES FORWARD. I THINK FROM A
7 PLANNING PERSPECTIVE, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE ASSUMED THAT, YOU
8 KNOW, SOME SORT OF REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURES, YOU KNOW, TO
9 SUPPORT HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION WILL OCCUR, YOU KNOW, AT
10 SOME POINT IN, YOU KNOW, THE NEXT TEN OR 15 YEARS, OR
11 THEREABOUTS. BUT I THINK THE EXACT TIMING WILL CERTAINLY BE
12 DETERMINED BY THE POLICY MAKERS. I THINK, YOU KNOW, AT LEAST
13 SOME OF THE INITIAL THINKING THAT I HAVE HEARD AT LEAST ON THE
14 HOUSING SIDE IS THAT THAT MIGHT BE MORE IN THE 5 TO 8 YEAR
15 PERIOD. BUT, AGAIN, I THINK THIS'S SUBJECT TO CHANGE,
16 DEPENDING UPON POLICY MAKER DIRECTION.

17

18 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU. AND THEN THIS CONVERSATION IS SO RICH
19 WITH DETAILS, I COULD SPEAK TO YOU FOR AN HOUR, BUT I'LL JUST
20 HIGHLIGHT ONE ADDITIONAL POINT, AND MAYBE 20, 30 YEARS AGO, WE
21 HAD A CASH FOR KEYS TO CASH IN YOUR OLD CAR AND THEN GET
22 INCENTIVIZED TO BUY A NEW CAR. AND ONE EVER THE PROBLEMS WAS
23 LOW INCOME INDIVIDUALS WEREN'T FIRST TO THE DRAW. AND THE
24 STATE RAN OUT OF FUNDS. SO I'M WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY WAY
25 THAT WE COULD HAVE A, THINKING OUTSIDE THE BOX, CASH FOR KEYS



February 10, 2021

1 OPPORTUNITY TO PARTNER AND HAVE A DEEP DISCOUNT FOR HIGH
2 MILEAGE CARS, HIGH EFFICIENCY VEHICLES. BECAUSE MOST LOW
3 INCOME PEOPLE HANG ON TO THEIR CARS BECAUSE THEY CAN'T AFFORD
4 TO GET NEW ONES SO I THINK THERE IS GREAT OPPORTUNITY THERE
5 WITHIN THE NEXT FEW YEARS.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BEFORE WE GO TO PUBLIC
8 COMMENT, AND THIS IS MY CHANCE TO TELL THE PUBLIC IF YOU WISH
9 TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR
10 NINE. I'M GOING TO ADD MY COMMENTS TO THIS EN SIX MODERNIZING
11 EXPANDING PARK TRAILS RECREATION AND FACILITIES NUMBER ONE
12 DESERVES A LITTLE GREEN TREE SIMPLY BECAUSE PRESERVING LAND
13 ESPECIALLY WITHIN THE URBAN CORES FOR OPEN SPACE AND PARKS IS
14 ONE OF THE QUICKEST WAYS OF KEEPING, AND BIKE TRAILS AND
15 THINGS LIKE THAT, IS ONE OF THE EASIEST WAY OF KEEPING PEOPLE
16 OUT OF CARS TO GO TO RECREATION, TO HAVE THE ABILITY TO DO
17 THAT AND THE ONE THING THE PANDEMIC HAS SHOWN US IS THAT WHEN
18 PEOPLE ARE AT HOME THEY DON'T NECESSARILY HAVE ACCESS TO
19 EXISTING FACILITIES. SO, WHEN WE CLOSED ALL THE PLAY GROUNDS
20 AND WE CLOSED ALL THE PARKS, WE CUT A HUGE CHUNK OF OUR
21 POPULATION OUT OF THE ABILITY TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF ANY OF OUR
22 RECREATIONAL FACILITIES OR JUST TO GET OUT OF THE HOUSE. I
23 MEAN, THERE IS JUST HUGE BENEFIT IN THAT. AND I'M ALSO GOING
24 TO POINT OUT THAT THERE ARE EXTENSIVE STUDIES TO SHOW THAT
25 WHEN YOU HAVE PARKS WITHIN WALKING DISTANCE OF PEOPLE'S HOMES,



February 10, 2021

1 YOU DON'T JUST RAISE THE PROPERTY VALUE OF THE HOMES, YOU MAKE
2 IT -- YOU RAISE THE ABILITY FOR BUSINESSES TO RECRUIT AND
3 RETAIN EMPLOYEES. GOING BACK TO THE '90S THERE IS DATA THAT
4 SHOW THE REASON THAT THE TECH INDUSTRY FIRST WENT THROUGH ITS
5 MIGRATION TO TEXAS ITS FIRST MIGRATION OUT WAS BECAUSE THE CEO
6 SAID THERE IS NOT ENOUGH PARKS AND AMENITIES IN THE BAY AREA
7 FOR US TO REALLY DO RECRUITING AND I REMEMBER SITTING AT
8 STANFORD LISTENING TO THIS GOING, WELL THAT'S REALLY STUPID.
9 AND THE REASON WE DON'T HAVE THAT RIGHT NOW IS BECAUSE IT'S A
10 LAND USE ISSUE THAT IS CONTROLLED BY LOCAL -- IT'S A LOCAL
11 CONTROL THING. SO EVEN IF PEOPLE MEET THEIR RHNA NUMBERS, AND
12 THEY HAVE PARK SPACE ATTACHED TO IT, THAT DOESN'T NECESSARILY
13 MEAN THAT THEY MEET THEIR PARKLAND NUMBERS THAT GO AROUND --
14 THAT GO ALONG WITH BUILDING DEVELOPMENTS. SO I WOULD LIKE US
15 TO FACILITATE A DISCUSSION AROUND THE -- ADDRESSING AREAS
16 WHERE THERE IS A PARK DEFICIT ALREADY. BECAUSE I THINK THAT
17 THAT'S -- THOSE ARE THE AREAS THAT ARE ALREADY DENSELY
18 POPULATED, IN GENERAL, AND THAT HAVE THE LEAST ABILITY TO GET
19 TO OTHER FACILITIES, AND THERE ARE ALSO THE ONES THAT ARE
20 GOING TO BE DEVELOPED AS INFILL DEVELOPMENT, BECAUSE IT'S
21 CHEAPER LAND TO DEVELOP. I WOULD ALSO LOOK A DEFINITION ON
22 MODERNIZING PARKS, BECAUSE THE ONE THING THAT WE DON'T WANT TO
23 DO IS, IS LOOK AT MODERNIZATION, LOCAL PARK DEPARTMENTS LOOK
24 AT MODERN PARKS AS, FROM A MAINTENANCE POINT OF VIEW. SO, YOU
25 WIND UP WITH PARKS, AND YOU WIND UP WITH LARGE SPACES THAT



February 10, 2021

1 DON'T ACTUALLY HAVE ANY GRASS, THAT DON'T HAVE ANY -- THAT
2 DON'T HAVE ANY GREEN. SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE NOT
3 JUST MODERNIZING BUT THAT WE'RE ACTUALLY PRESERVING FOR CARBON
4 CAPTURE, AND DIRT FOR JUST FOR GENERAL PURPOSES AND IT MAKES
5 PEOPLE HEALTHIER. AND I REALLY WANT US TO RAISE UP THE IDEA
6 THAT TRAILS ARE TRANSPORTATION. SO, AGAIN, THAT GOES BACK TO
7 GHG, AND IT ALSO GOES BACK TO THE ABILITY TO COMMUTE. AND I
8 WANT US TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE DEFINING URBAN OPEN SPACES.
9 THE NEW PUSH FOR DEVELOPMENT OF PARK LANDS AND OPEN SPACES IN
10 A LOT OF THE NEW DEVELOPMENTS IS PASEOS AND PLACES WHERE
11 PEOPLE HAVE PLAZAS. AND THAT'S NOT NECESSARILY AN OPEN SPACE,
12 BECAUSE IT'S REGULATED BY THE ADJOINING COMMERCIAL AND
13 RESIDENTIAL AREAS OR ITS IMPACTED BY THOSE. SO IT'S NOT REALLY
14 LIKE I CAN TAKE A SIX-YEAR-OLD THERE, AND HANG OUT. IF I WANT
15 TO GO TO STARBUCKS AND HANG OUT, YEAH IT'S SETUP FOR THAT, BUT
16 JUST A PLACE TO HAVE, YOU KNOW, TO HAVE THAT ABILITY TO DO
17 THAT. SO, MY CONCERN IS, THERE IS NOBODY WITH THE AUTHORITY,
18 RIGHT NOW, IF WE WANT TO DISCUSS LEGISLATION AROUND AIR, WE GO
19 TO BAAQMD IF WE ARE DISCUSSING TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION,
20 THAT'S MTC, HOUSING IS ABAG. THERE IS NO CENTRALIZED LOCATION
21 FOR US TO DUMP ALL OF THESE ISSUES REGARDING PARKS AND OPEN
22 SPACE ESPECIALLY IN THE URBAN AREAS INTO. SO SOMEHOW WE NEED
23 DO THAT AND WE NEED TO ADDRESS THAT. WE NEED TO BRING THOSE
24 PEOPLE TOGETHER SO THAT THOSE -- THAT ISSUE DOESN'T CONTINUE
25 TO WORSEN. BECAUSE RIGHT NOW IT IS A PROBLEM IN THE URBAN



February 10, 2021

1 AREAS. SO THOSE ARE MY -- AND I DON'T EXPECT YOU TO FIX IT OR
2 RESPOND TO THAT, BUT THOSE ARE THINGS I WANT TO PUT ON THE
3 WISH LIST HERE. PUT LITTLE TREES NEXT TO THE PARKS AND PUT
4 DOLLAR SIGNS TOO.

5

6 **CHIRAG RABARI:** I WANT TO RESPOND TO YOUR LATTER POINT ON THE
7 EN6. I THINK BECAUSE THIS IS A SOMEWHAT NEW AREA FOR US, I
8 THINK AT LEAST AT THIS STAGE WHERE WE'RE SORT OF DRAFT, DRAFT,
9 THERE ISN'T THAT MUCH WE CAN REALLY SAY OTHER THAN, YOU KNOW,
10 SORT OF CONTINUING WITH THE EXISTING PROGRAMS THAT WE HAVE
11 THROUGH THE REGIONAL TRAILS PROGRAM AND THE PRIORITY
12 CONSERVATION AREA PROGRAM BUT I THINK YOU'RE FEEDBACK IS
13 HELPFUL IN TERMS OF IDENTIFYING CORE AND KEY ISSUES THAT WE
14 WANT TO EXPLORE IN FURTHER DETAIL DURING THE PARTNERSHIP PHASE
15 OF THE PLAN. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S REALLY WHEN, YOU KNOW, WE
16 WANT TO BRING ALL OF THE, YOU KNOW, ALL OF THE INTERESTED
17 INVESTED PARTIES, AND I THINK ESPECIALLY IN CONSERVATION, YOU
18 KNOW, THERE ARE A LOT OF DIFFERENT PEOPLE THAT WORK IN THIS
19 SPACE, AND I THINK THE IDEA WOULD BE TO REALLY BRING ALL THOSE
20 FOLKS TOGETHER AND MAYBE TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THIS IDEA OR
21 DEVELOPMENT OF SOME KIND OF A REGIONAL VISION. JUST SO THERE
22 IS SOME UNDERSTANDING OF LIKE, YOU KNOW, WHERE ARE WE TRYING
23 TO GET, TO AND HOW CAN WE ALL COLLECTIVELY DO OUR PART TO MOVE
24 THAT FORWARD. SO I THINK I DEFINITELY APPRECIATED ALL OF YOUR



February 10, 2021

1 FEEDBACK AND I'LL MAKE SURE IT'S SOMETHING WE FOCUS ON DURING
2 THAT --

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IT'S A HUGE EQUITY ISSUE, AND I WOULD
5 SUGGEST THAT THAT IN THE FUTURE YOU DO A TARGETED FOCUS GROUP
6 WITHIN EACH COUNTY YOU WILL BE ABLE TO HIT COMMISSIONERS UP
7 AND YOU WILL BE ABLE TO HIT SUPERVISORS UP, AND PEOPLE IN CITY
8 COUNCILS. YOU KNOW, WHAT ARE THEIR IDEAS. YOU KNOW, NOT JUST
9 THE -- AND I HESITATE TO SAY, NOT JUST THE EMPLOYEES AND THE
10 PEOPLE THAT WORK IN DEPARTMENTS, BUT REALLY THE ADVOCATE IN
11 THOSE AREAS YOU NEED TO BRING THEM IN FOR A REGIONAL
12 DISCUSSION. WHAT IS OUR REGIONAL VISION. NOT JUST CONSERVATION
13 BECAUSE THAT TENDS TO BE MORE OF THE CONSERVATION LANDS, AND
14 THE OPEN SPACE LARGE OPEN SPACE DISTRICTS, BUT REALLY BRING
15 THAT DOWN TO THE STREET LEVEL. VEDA, DID YOU HAVE ONE MORE
16 COMMENT?

17

18 **VEDA FLOREZ:** I DO HAVE A VERY SHORT COMMENT. JUST ANOTHER
19 OPPORTUNITY FOR LOW-HANGING FRUIT, OUR LOCAL GOVERNMENT HAS
20 REALLY STEPPED UP TO OVERLOOK THE DIGITAL DIVIDE SO OUR
21 STUDENTS CAN HAVE AT-HOME LEARNING. SO THERE IS SOME
22 INFRASTRUCTURE IN PLACE, AND I THINK THAT WE COULD PUT A GREEN
23 LEAF TO MAYBE EN, EC3, HIGH-SPEED INTERNET AND OVERCOMING THAT
24 DIGITAL DIVIDE. SO THERE IS OPPORTUNITY, AND WE COULD GET THAT
25 DONE IN THE NEXT FIVE YEARS. THANK YOU.



February 10, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC
3 COMMENT NOW. DO I SEE A HAND RAISED. MARTHA?

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** JAMES HALSNER, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
6 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE THREE MINUTES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON AND THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING SOME PUBLIC
9 COMMENT, AND I APOLOGIZE I'M PROBABLY NOT AS SMART AS I SHOULD
10 BE ON SOME OF THE PLAN 2050. I DO HAVE TWO AREAS, ONE IS THE
11 TRANSPORTATION COMPONENT, NUMBER T1 HAS RESTORE, OPERATE, AND
12 MAINTAIN, AND ANYTIME I SEE THE WORD RESTORE, I WONDER RESTORE
13 TO WHAT? OR RESTORE TO WHEN? THE OTHER PROBLEM WITH T1, IS THE
14 SHEER COST IT'S OPERATING SYSTEMS ARE EXPENSIVE AND DOUBLE
15 OTHER THINGS IN THE TRANSPORTATION AND IT'S 80 PERCENT OF ALL
16 THE HOUSING ELEMENTS COMBINED IF WE'RE TRYING TO IMPROVE
17 TRANSPORTATION OR CHANGE HOW PEOPLE TRANSPORT OR CHANGING
18 HOUSING OR CHANGING JOB LOCATIONS OR INCREASING INTERNET SO
19 PEOPLE DON'T HAVE TO GO TO WORK OR HAVE MORE WALKABILITY DO
20 WE, A, WANT TO RESTORE SOMETHING TO WHATEVER IT IS WE'RE
21 TRYING TO RESTORE IT TO BECAUSE WE'RE GOING TO SPEND MONEY
22 DOING THAT, WHEN THE REAL GOAL IS TO HAVE AN INTEGRATED
23 SEAMLESS GOODS MOVEMENT, PEOPLE SYSTEM, WHETHER IT'S WALKING,
24 BICYCLING, WHEELCHAIRING, HOWEVER PEOPLE GET AROUND I WONDER
25 WHETHER THERE'S BEEN THOUGHT ABOUT AND WHAT THAT MEANS AND WHY



February 10, 2021

1 IT'S SO EXPENSIVE. AND THE OTHER THING IS SEA LEVEL RISE AT
2 \$19 BILLION, AND I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S TOTAL COST OF ALL THE
3 PROJECTS OR IF THAT'S THE COST OF HARD STRUCTURE, AIRPORTS,
4 SEWER PLANTS, THE SAN FRANCISCO SEA WALL, ALL VERY EXPENSIVE.
5 WHO IS GOING TO PROTECT THE WETLANDS? THE WETLANDS ARE GOING
6 TO BE FLOODED AND THEY DON'T HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO RETREAT
7 BECAUSE THEY'RE GENERALLY GOING TO BOUNCE AGAINST RAILROAD
8 TRACKS OR FREEWAYS OR HOUSING. AND WHAT DO WE DO FOR HOUSING
9 IN TERMS OF PEOPLE WHO, THE MAJORITY, THEIR EQUITY MAY BE IN
10 THEIR HOUSE AND AT SOME POINT THEIR HOUSE IS GOING TO BE
11 WORTHLESS, AND THEY DON'T HAVE ANY EQUITY. THEY CAN'T MOVE THE
12 HOUSE BECAUSE THERE IS NO PLACE TO MOVE IT TO, THE LAND HAS
13 GOT ZERO VALUE IS HOW ARE WE GOING TO DEAL WITH THOSE FOLKS AS
14 WE MOVE FORWARD. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME. I
15 APPRECIATE IT.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA IS THERE ANY MORE
18 PUBLIC COMMENTS?

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
21 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED FOR
22 THIS ITEM.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHIRAG. THIS WAS GREAT. AND I'M
25 JUST ALWAYS IMPRESSED WITH THE QUALITY OF WORK THAT COMES OUT



February 10, 2021

1 OF MTC. SO GOLD STARS TODAY FOR THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
2 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE INTO ITEM TEN, THE STAFF LIAISON REPORT.
3 MARTI?

4

5 **MARTI PASCHAL:** MARTI PASCHAL, STAFF TO THE COUNCIL. I WANT TO
6 HIGHLIGHT ONE ITEM, THE LAUNCH OF THE TRANSIT FARE
7 COORDINATION SURVEY, THERE'S A LINK IN THE REPORT THE SURVEY
8 IS SEEKING OPINIONS FROM TRANSIT USERS AND ASKING THEM TO
9 SHARE STORIES ABOUT THEIR EXPERIENCES AND THIS SURVEY WILL
10 CLOSE IN APPROXIMATELY TWO WEEKS. WE WOULD APPRECIATE IT IF
11 YOU WOULD SHARE IT WITH YOUR NETWORKS. THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON
14 ITEM NUMBER TEN?

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
17 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
18 HAND RAISED.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM 11 THERE ARE NO MEMBER
21 REPORTS. PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED WITH LOCAL RELEVANT
22 ISSUES OR EVENTS. NO HANDS GOING UP. ITEM 12, NEW BUSINESS, IS
23 THERE ANYTHING KEEPING IN MIND OUR AGENDAS ARE FULL, BUT IF
24 THERE IS ANY NEW BUSINESS TO BRING UP, NOW IS THE TIME. THANK
25 YOU. AND WITH THAT, WE'RE AT ADJOURNMENT. SO THANK YOU



February 10, 2021

1 EVERYBODY. WE RAN A LITTLE LONG. WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO
2 RUN LONG IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS BECAUSE PLANNED BAY AREA
3 IS GOING TO TAKE UP A LOT OF OUR TIME AND SO IS THE TASK
4 FORCE. SO I APPRECIATE YOU ALL HANGING IN THERE AND HAVE A
5 REALLY GOOD WEEKEND. IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE SOME
6 RAIN BUT GO OUT TODAY WHILE THE SUN IS STILL SHINING. THANK
7 YOU. WE'RE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

8



Broadcasting Government