METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE

MONDAY, 2:00, MAY 10, 2021

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE WEBCAST. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING AND REQUEST THAT THE BROADCASTING TEAM ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19 THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR THAT RECORDED ANNOUNCEMENT. WELCOME TO THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING. I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO HELP CALL THE ROLL. ACTUALLY, DOES THE ROLL CALL HAPPEN, THOUGH WE DO NOT HAVE A QUORUM YET?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. I'LL TAKE THE ROLL.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ADINA LEVIN?

ADINA LIVIN, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: WENDI KALLINS?

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ALAN IS ABSENT. COCHRAN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ABIGAIL COCHRAN: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: CORDES IS ABSENT. ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED IS ABSENT. IAN GRIFFITHS IS ABSENT. TISHA DEE HARTMAN IS ABSENT. RICH HEDGES?

RICHARD HEDGES: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: JONATHON KASS?

JONOTHON KASS: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: RANDI KINMAN IS EXCUSED, ADRIAN MENDOZA IS EXCUSED, AND BRIAN STANKE? WE DO NOT HAVE A QUORUM. WE WILL HAVE TO POSTPONE APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES TO THE NEXT MEETING.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: FIRST ITEM FARE COORDINATION INTEGRATION STUDY AND BUSINESS CASE PROJECT STATUS UPDATE. AND WE'LL GET AN UPDATE FROM WILLIAM BACON AND MIKE EISEMAN PROJECT MANAGERS WHO WILL GIVE STATUS ON THE PROJECT INCLUDING PATHWAYS TO INTEGRATION WITH ALTERNATIVE FARE POLICY EVALUATION FRAMEWORKS. LOOKING FORWARD TO THE UPDATE.

WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU CHAIR LEVIN. IF YOU COULD BRING THE SLIDES UP. MY NAME IS BILL BACON, MTC CO-PROJECT MANAGER, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MIKE EISEMAN FROM BART FOLLOW PROJECT MANAGER IS HERE AS WELL AND WE'LL BE PRESENTING THIS ITEM TO YOU THIS AFTERNOON. I'M GOING TO BRIEFLY GIVE AN INTRODUCTION HERE AND THEN TURN IT OVER TO MIKE TO GIVE A SUBSTANTIVE DISCUSSION ABOUT THE OPTIONS WE'RE GOING TO BE STUDYING OVER THE NEXT MONTH, MONTH AND A HALF FOR MOLDING WORK. NEXT SLIDE. THE FOCUS OF TODAY'S MEETING IS REALLY TWOFOLD. IT'S TO WALK THE SUBCOMMITTEE THROUGH THE FINAL, SORT OF, DETAIL OPTIONS THAT WE'RE INTENDING TO MODEL AND ANALYZE IN DETAIL THAT WILL REALLY LEAD TO THE FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS OF THIS PROJECT LATER THIS SUMMER. SO THIS IS REALLY AN OPPORTUNITY FOR THE SUBCOMMITTEE TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND SORT OF THE LAST OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL DIRECTION TO STAFF ABOUT SPECIFIC THINGS YOU WOULD LIKE TO SEE INCLUDED IN THE OPTIONS, AND THE DETAILED, SORT OF, VARIANCE OF EACH OPTION. AND MAKE SURE WE CAN INCLUDE THAT IN WHAT WE ULTIMATELY MODEL. AND THEN THE SECOND PIECE OF INFORMATION WE REALLY WANT TO FOCUS ON TODAY IS SHARING WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE THE PROPOSED BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION METHODOLOGY. SO, TOGETHER WITH OUR CONSULTANT TEAM, WE ARE UNDERTAKING NOT JUST A MODELING ANALYSIS, BUT ALSO A BUSINESS CASE PROCESS TO LOOK AT WHAT REALLY IS THE RATIONALE FOR ENHANCING FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION ACROSS THE REGION, WHAT ARE THE BENEFITS FROM A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT SORT OF LENSES. AND THAT WILL BE PRESENTED IN OUR FINAL REPORT AS PART OF A BUSINESS CASE APPROACH. SO WE'RE GOING TO WALK THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SUBCOMMITTEE THROUGH THE SORT OF PRELIMINARY STRUCTURE OF THAT APPROACH AND WE'RE VERY OPEN TO YOUR FEEDBACK AND THOUGHTS ABOUT WHAT WE HAVE LAID OUT. IF WE BE COULD GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. HERE, WE'RE JUST HIGHLIGHTING SORT OF THE KEY PROJECT ACTIONS AND MILESTONES BETWEEN NOW AND END OF THE SUMMER. THERE IS A LOT OF STUFF HAPPENING BETWEEN NOW AND SEPTEMBER. IT'S A LITTLE EASY TO LOSE TRACK SORT OF WHERE WE ARE AND WHAT'S OCCURRING SINCE THESE NEXT FEW MONTHS ARE GOING TO BE KIND OF A WHIRL WIND. BUT I WANTED TO LAY THIS OUT HERE AND HIGHLIGHT THAT NEXT MONDAY A WEEK FROM TODAY THERE WILL BE ANOTHER MEETING OF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. THEY HAVE BEEN TRADITIONALLY MEETING EVERY MONTH, THEY IN THE LAST APRIL BUT THEY'RE MEETING MONDAY MAY 17TH TO TALK ABOUT THE FINAL OPTIONS THAT WILL BE STUDIED IN THE MODEL PROJECT THAT'S WHY WE'RE TALKING TO YOU TODAY BEFORE WE FINALIZE OPTIONS NEXT WEEK FOR THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. FINALLY A WEEK LATER ON MAY 24TH, THERE WILL BE A PRESENTATION AT THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE AGAIN WRITING AN UPDATE ABOUT THIS PROJECT. ON MAY 26TH IN THE AFTERNOON, THERE WILL BE WHAT WE'RE CALLING THE POLICY MAKER WEBINAR ON FARE INTEGRATION. SOME OF YOU MAY BE FAMILIAR THAT WHEN THIS PROJECT WAS ESTABLISHED THERE WAS A COMMITMENT AS PART OF THE FUNDING ALLOCATION OF MEASURE TWO BRIDGE TOLL FUNDS THAT WITH SUPPORTING THIS PROJECT THAT WOULD BE A MECHANISM THROUGH THE WORK ENGAGING AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS OVER THE COURSE OF THE WORK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND THE PANDEMIC IS A WRINKLE IN OUR ORIGINAL TENT OF THE WORK AND IN-PERSON SEMINARS WITH THE AGENCY BOARD MEMBERS. MAY 26TH WE'RE HOSTING A WEBINAR THAT IT WILL BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC AND A BROWN ACT MEETING AND EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY AND BOARD MEMBER FROM MTC AND COMMISSIONERS FROM THE AREA OF TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE BEEN INVITED TO LEARN ABOUT THE PROJECT AND ASK QUESTIONS AND OUR INTENT IS TO ENGAGE BOARD MEMBERS BETWEEN THEN AND THE END OF THE PROJECT. JULY 19TH IS A KEY MILESTONE FOR THE PROJECT THAT'S WHEN WE'RE ANTICIPATING PRESENTING DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE BASED ON THE PROJECTS ANALYSIS AND MODELING WORK. THERE WILL BE AN IMPORTANT MILESTONE FOR THE PROJECT GOING FORWARD. AND JULY INTO AUGUST WE'LL BE MEETING WITH TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS OR SHOULD SAY PRESENTING TO THE TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS IF THEY'RE INTERESTED IN HEARING AN UPDATE ON THE PROJECT AND ITS RECOMMENDATIONS AT THAT POINT THE TEAM WILL BE TRAVELING AROUND A FEW PRESENTATIONS TO AGENCIES AT THEIR REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETINGS AND SEPTEMBER THAT'S WHEN WE'RE ANTICIPATING THERE BEING A FINAL REPORT READY FOR ADOPTION BY THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. UNLESS THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THE TIMELINE I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MIKE EISEMAN TO GO OVER THE NEXT PORTION THERE BUT I'LL PAUSE FOR QUESTIONS ABOUT THE TIMELINE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS ABOUT THE TIMELINE YET BUT I DO HAVE TWO QUESTIONS ABOUT THE TIMELINE. ONE OF THEM IS THAT, AS THERE ARE GOING TO BE PRESENTATIONS MADE TO LOCAL AGENCIES, AND I KNOW THAT THE MEMBERS OF THIS BODY ARE LOCATED IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION, WILL THE DATES OF THOSE BE SHARED TO THE MEMBERS OF THIS BODY SO PEOPLE MIGHT ABLE TO ATTEND MEETINGS THAT ARE POTENTIALLY IN THEIR GEOGRAPHY THAT THEY'RE INTERESTED IN? AND THE OTHER QUESTION IS THAT, ON WEDNESDAY, MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE WILL BE LOOKING AT A SET OF PRINCIPLES FOR THE AARP FUNDING AND HAVING SYSTEM CONVENIENCE TO HAVE PEOPLE COME BACK TO TRANSIT IS, I THINK, WITHIN THE SCOPE OF THAT, AND I AM WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY INTERSECTION BETWEEN OUTPUTS OF THIS PROJECT AND THAT GOAL AND, IF SO, WHERE MIGHT THAT INTERSECT?

WILLIAM BACON: I CAN DEFINITELY SPEAK TO YOUR FIRST QUESTION. IN TERMS OF IF THE PROJECT IS ASKED TO SPEAK AT DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEETINGS, ONCE THOSE DATES ARE FINALIZED, WE'LL BE HAPPY TO SHARE THEM WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS. I'LL HAVE TO ADMIT NOW WE'RE NOT ON THE CALENDAR AT ANY SPECIFIC MEETINGS THOSE ARE IN THE PROCESS OF BEING SCHEDULED SO I DON'T HAVE ANY DATES I CAN GIVE YOU YET BUT OVER THE NEXT MONTH OR SO WE'LL BE ABLE TO FINALIZE THEM AND PROVIDE DATES. AND ABOUT THE AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN TRANSIT FUNDING PRINCIPLES

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AT THE MTC PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE WILL BE DISCUSSED WEDNESDAY AND SUBJECT TO THEIR DIRECTION MTC STAFF AND TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF WILL WORK TOGETHER TO DISTRIBUTE THE FUNDS AND PUT THEM TO USE AS INTENDED BY CONGRESS AND THE COMMISSIONERS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THROUGH STAFF, PUBLICIZING TO US WHEN THE TRANSIT BOARD PRESENTATIONS WILL BE HELD, THANK YOU. DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS BEFORE WE MOVE ON? ALL RIGHT. FURTHER PRESENTATION WILL BE WELCOME. THANK YOU.

WILLIAM BACON: IF WE CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MIKE EISEMAN.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: SORRY ABOUT THAT. OFF MUTE NOW. THANK YOU, BILL. OKAY. I'M GOING TO NOW SPEND A FEW MINUTES WALKING THROUGH THE OPTIONS, THE FARE STRUCTURE OPTION AND THE VARIANT OPTIONS THAT WE ARE PLANNING TO MODEL, AND RUN THROUGH THE FULL BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION. SO, WE PRESENTED EARLIER VERSIONS OF THESE OPTIONS IN THIS SETTING A WHILE AGO, AND IF YOU HAVE BEEN SITTING IN ON THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETINGS, I KNOW A NUMBER OF FOLKS FROM THIS GROUP HAVE MADE PUBLIC COMMENT THERE, YOU HAVE SEEN OPTIONS THAT ARE VERY SIMILAR TO WHAT'S HERE. BUT I THINK STILL WE WOULD LIKE TO RUN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THROUGH THEM. SIN WE'RE A SMALL GROUP TODAY, I THINK WE CAN BE A LITTLE MORE INFORMAL, SO IF FOLKS DO HAVE QUESTIONS, MAYBE THAT YOU COULD PUT YOUR HAND UP AND THAT THE CHAIR COULD RECOGNIZE COMMENTS AS WE RUN THROUGH, DOES THAT SOUND OKAY WITH THE CHAIR?

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GOOD.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: IF YOU HAVE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TO GIVE A SORT OF STEP-BY-STEP ON THE DEVELOPMENT, YOU, AS A GROUP, HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN EACH OF THESE STEPS, WE HAVE PUT TOGETHER BACKGROUND RESEARCH, DEVELOPED A LONG LIST OF POLICY ALTERNATIVES NARROW THE DOWN A SHORT LIST DEVELOPED VARIANTS ON THOSE OPTIONS AND NOW WHAT WE'RE SHOWING YOU HERE IS THE FINAL, OR NEARLY FINAL, LIST OF VARIANT OPTIONS TO TEST, THAT WE ARE PLANNING TO BRING TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE NEXT WEEK. AND THEN WE WILL BE MOVING INTO AN EVALUATION, BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION THAT BILL WILL DESCRIBE AFTER WE DESCRIBE THE OPTIONS. AND YOU KNOW, THE -- WE'RE AIMING TO HAVE THE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THAT EVALUATION OF THE INITIALLY PRESENTED TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IN JULY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THESE ARE -- LET'S SEE, IF YOU HAVE BEEN SITTING IN ON THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETINGS THIS GRAPHIC WILL LOOK FAMILIAR. IT'S THE SAME SIX OPTIONS WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PRESENTED TO THIS GROUP A COUPLE OF MONTHS AGO BUT REORDERED A BIT. I'LL TALK ABOUT THAT, THE LEFT SIDE ARE SIX FARE OPTIONS THAT WE MIGHT IMPLEMENT IN OUR REGION. WE DID THE REORDERING IN A LITTLE BIT OF RENAMING TO KIND OF MAKE A SEQUENCING CLEAR. SO NOW THE ORDER IS SETUP SO THAT THE SORT OF LEAST CHANGE OPTIONS ARE AT THE TOP AND THE MOST CHANGED OPTIONS ARE AT THE BOTTOM. YOU COULD SORT OF THINK OF A POSSIBILITY OF PROGRESSING THROUGH OPTIONS AT THE TOP TO OPTIONS AT THE BOTTOM OVER TIME IF DOING SO MET REGIONAL OBJECTIVES. SO, LET ME JUST LIST THEM OFF HERE. OPTION NUMBER ONE PASSES AND CAPS. THAT'S A ONE STRUCTURAL OPTION THAT INCLUDES, OBVIOUSLY, A LOT OF DIVERSE SET OF POTENTIAL POLICIES. EITHER PASSES MEANING PAY UP FRONT FOR ALL THE TRANSIT YOU CAN USE OVER A CERTAIN GEOGRAPHY OR A CAP MEANING AN A ACCUMULATOR THAT'S ANOTHER WAY PEOPLE SOMETIMES DESCRIBE THAT, WHERE YOU PAY YOUR NORMAL FARE UP TO A CERTAIN THRESHOLD AFTER THAT YOU DON'T PAY. WE WILL HAVE PASSES AND CAPS THAT WE'LL TALK ABOUT IN A MINUTE. DISCOUNT DOUBLE FARES REDUCING OR ELIMINATING THE PRICE PREMIUM FOR USING TWO DIFFERENT AGENCIES ON THE SAME TRIP AND THAT COULD BE BETWEEN ALL AGENCIES OR SOME SUBSET OF AGENCIES WE'LL TALK ABOUT THAT. NUMBER THREE IS MOST COMPLICATED TO DESCRIBE SO I'LL SET THAT ASIDE. OPTION 4 THROUGH 6 ARE TRANSFORMATIONAL OPTIONS WHERE ALL OF THE TRANSIT SERVICES IN THE REGION ARE BROUGHT UNDER ONE FARE STRUCTURE. OPTION FOUR WOULD BE A FARE BY DISTANCE WITH A LOCAL FLAT FARE SO ALL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOCAL SERVICES WOULD HAVE ONE FLAT FARE, AND THEN ALL OF THE REGIONAL SERVICES, REGIONAL SERVICES SUCH AS BART, CALTRAIN, EXPRESS BUS, FERRY, WOULD OPERATE ON A FARE BY DISTANCE STRUCTURE, SIMILAR, I SUPPOSE, TO THE ONE THAT BART OPERATES TODAY. SO THAT'S OPTION FOUR. OPTIONS 5 AND 6 ARE BOTH ZONE OPTIONS, FIVE HONEYCOMB ZONES THAT WOULD BE ONE ZONE MAP THAT APPLIES TO ALL TRANSIT IN THE REGION LOCAL AND REGIONAL, THE MORE ZONES YOU TRAVEL THROUGH, THE HIGHER YOUR FARE, THEN HONEYCOMB ZONES WITH LOCAL FLAT FARE SIX THAT MEANS A ZONE MAP THAT APPLIES THROUGH REGIONAL SERVICES AND LOCAL FLAT FARE FOR LOCAL BUS. AND THEN LET ME JUMP BACK TO OPTION THREE BECAUSE IT'S KIND OF A MIDDLE POINT BETWEEN SORT OF THE FIRST TWO AND THE LAST THREE. SO IN THAT WAY, YOU CAN SORT OF THINK OF SUBREGIONAL GROUPINGS, THAT WOULD HAVE STANDARDIZED INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNTS, A SUBREGIONAL AREA MIGHT BE THE EAST BAY, OR THE NORTH BAY, OR THE SOUTH BAY. YOU WOULD HAVE STANDARDIZED DISCOUNTS PERHAPS BETWEEN AGENCIES WITHIN THOSE REGIONS AND BETWEEN REGIONS BUT NOT EVERY SUBREGION WOULD HAVE EXACTLY THE SAME VERSION OF THOSE DISCOUNTS. SO YOU MAY THINK OF IT AS A -- A SOMEWHAT LOWER BARRIER IMPLEMENTATION VERSION OF REGIONAL INTEGRATION. SO THOSE ARE THE SIX OPTIONS THAT WE'RE GOING TO JUST TALK THROUGH BRIEFLY ON THE NEXT FEW SLIDES. AND THEN ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE GRAPHIC, YOU CAN SEE THE SAME SIX OPTIONS OVERLAID ON THE FOUR MANAGEMENT PATHWAYS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT IN EARLIER VERSIONS OF THIS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MEETING. SO IF YOU RECALL THOSE, THOSE MANAGEMENT PATHWAYS HAVE TO DO WITH HOW [INDISCERNIBLE] ABOUT FARES. BOTTOM RIGHT TRADE AGREEMENTS REPRESENTS THE SORT OF STATUS QUO, MORE OR LESS, YOU KNOW, BART AND AC TRANSIT WANT TO HAVE INTEGRATED FARES THEY CAN GET TOGETHER SETUP AN AGREEMENT AND HAVE VERSIONS OF AGREEMENT FARES. THAT'S MORE OR LESS STATUS QUO. TOP LEFT WOULD BE BIG TENT MEANING ALL OF THE SERVICES IN THE REGION ARE UNDER ONE FARE STRUCTURE AND THERE IS ONE SINGLE DECISION MAKING ENTITY. AND THEN, THERE IS TWO OTHER BOXES THAT ARE KIND OF VARIATIONS ON THAT THEME, SO GREAT ALLIANCE WOULD BE MULTIPLE -- SEVERAL AGENCIES COMING TOGETHER TO MAKE DECISIONS ABOUT FARES, BUT MAYBE COMING TO SOME AGREEMENT ABOUT A JOINT STRUCTURE. SO THAT GREAT ALLIANCE, YOU CAN THINK ABOUT THAT AS SIMILAR TO TODAY'S CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR EXAMPLE, MANY AGENCIES WORKING TOGETHER BUT AUTONOMOUS. AND THEN TOP RIGHT ONE DECISION MAKING ENTITY BUT DIFFERENT FARE STRUCTURES FOR DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION FOR EXAMPLE, IF THEY WERE ONE DECISION MAKING AGENCY THEY MIGHT SAY NORTH BAY CONDITIONS ARE DIFFERENT WE WANT ONE SET OF RULES UP THERE SOUTH BAY DIFFERENT SET OF RULES. THOSE ARE THE FOUR PATHWAYS AND FIXED FARE STRUCTURE OPTIONS. LET ME PAUSE THERE. BECAUSE THAT'S A LOT TO TAKE IN, AND ASK THE CHAIR IF THERE IS ANY CLARIFYING QUESTIONS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: LET'S SEE. ANYBODY HAVE ANY QUESTIONS? PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU WANT TO ASK THEM. WHILE PEOPLE ARE PONDERING ANY QUESTIONS THAT THEY MAY HAVE, I SEE -- I SEE -- WELL, I SEE THAT THE 4, 5, AND 6 ARE SPLIT AMONGST BIG TENT AND GREAT ALLIANCE. THE INSTITUTIONAL IMPLICATIONS AND NEEDS OF THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT CHOICES BE PART OF THE RESULTS OF THE ANALYSIS WHERE IT WILL DESCRIBE WHAT KINDS OF STRUCTURES WOULD BE NEEDED TO ADMINISTER ANY OF THE ABOVE?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH, IN THE BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS THAT BILL IS GOING TO RUN THROUGH, THERE IS ONE SECTION ON SORT OF IMPLEMENTATION, THE VARIOUS IMPLEMENTATION, AND OBVIOUSLY GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT APPROACHES ARE GOING TO HAVE TO BE PART OF THAT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: AND NO PRESSURE FOR QUESTIONS NOW WE HAVE A SLIDE ON EACH OF THESE OPTIONS COMING UP.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. THAT WAS THE NEXT QUESTION I HAD. ALL RIGHT. I AM STILL SEEING IF YOU HAVE A -- FOR MEMBERS OF THE BODY, IF A QUESTION COMES TO YOU WHILE THINGS ARE BEING FURTHER DISCUSSED, PLEASE DO RAISE YOUR HAND, AND WE'LL TAKE THE QUESTIONS LATER ON. MOVE ON.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. SO THE VERSION OF THIS WAS PRESENTED AT THE LAST FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AS WELL BUT THIS IS SORT OF A STRUCTURE OF THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF SERVICES IN THE REGION AND HOW THEY MIGHT RELATE TO SOME OF THESE FARE POLICIES. AS I WAS RUNNING THROUGH A FEW OF THE FARE OPTIONS THERE WAS A DISTINCTION BETWEEN LOCAL AND REGIONAL SERVICE THIS IS A FRAMEWORK OF HOW WE MIGHT MAKE THAT SPLIT THREE COLORS, GRAY IS INTERCITY, IT'S NOT IN OUR SCOPE BUT SOMETHING WE COULD CONSIDER WHEN THINKING ABOUT FARES, BUT THE TWO CATEGORIES BLUE REGIONAL FARES THOSE ARE BART FERRY EXPRESS BUS A NUMBER ARE LISTED HERE THIS IS AN EXAMPLE NOT A COMPREHENSIVE LIST. THIS IS A SERVICE WHERE YOU MIGHT THINK ABOUT PRICING TODAY MOST OF THESE SERVICES ARE OFFERED AT A PREMIUM TO LOCAL BUS FARE AND I THINK YOU PROBABLY -- AND THEY TRAVEL LONGER DISTANCES THAN WILL LOCAL BUS TRIP THIS WOULD CERTAINLY CONSIDER PRICING IF WE HAD OWN STRUCTURE OR JUST ACCORDING TO THE RULES OF THOSE STRUCTURES, THIS FARE PERSPECTIVE TYPICALLY COVERS SHORT DISTANCES AND ARE VERY AFFORDABLE AND ARE ALL LISTED LOCAL. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. SO NOW IT'S GOING RUN THROUGH EACH OF THE OPTION IN TURN. FIRST REGIONAL PASS CAPS MENTIONED THERE IS A LOT OF POSSIBILITIES UNDER THAT BROAD HEADER. HERE THEY ARE LISTED OUT. YOU CAN SEE WE HAVE GOT FIVE DIFFERENT LINES HERE, AND, YOU KNOW, FOR EACH OF THESE, THERE IS A PATH OPTION,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MEANING A PAY UP FRONT OPTION, AND EACH COULD -- MOST OF THESE, AT LEAST, COULD BE IMPLEMENTED AS AN A ACCUMULATOR OPTION, AS WELL, A ACCUMULATOR MEANING YOU PAY UNTIL YOU REAR A THRESHOLD BY TRIP AND OVER THAT THRESHOLD YOU DON'T PAY ANYMORE. SO THE VERSIONS WE HAVE GOT ON HERE, MULTIPLE AGENCY PASSES, A GROUPED OF AGENCIES UP TO AND PERHAPS INCLUDING ALL OF THE AGENCIES COULD HAVE A SINGLE PASS PRODUCT PRICED AS UP FRONT OR A ACCUMULATOR. THINKING OF THOSE AT LEAST IN THE BLACK BUCKET THERE AS A ONE PRICE PASS, THERE IS ALSO A TIERED PASS OPTION, USED OFTEN BY REGIONAL RAIL SYSTEMS FOR EXAMPLE, AND CALTRAIN HAS ZONED-BASED PASSES FOR EXAMPLE, YOU COULD CONSIDER A TIERING SYSTEM PERHAPS BUILT AROUND THE LOCAL REGIONAL STRUCTURE THAT I JUST DESCRIBED BUT THERE COULD BE MORE NUANCED PASSES AS WELL-BUILT AROUND EITHER DISTANCE-BASED, ZONE-BASED OR JUST PRICE LEVEL SHARING SYSTEM. BUT WE'RE GOING TO TEST OPTIONS THAT COVER THAT FULL RANGE OF PASS TYPES, ACCUMULATOR TYPES. YOU COULD HAVE -- YOU MENTIONED MULTIPLE AGENCIES YOU COULD HAVE ONE THAT SAYS THAT COVERS ALL TRAVEL IN THE WHOLE REGION EITHER A ACCUMULATOR. ONE OPTION IN GREEN THERE THAT IS WORTHY OF A LOT OF CONSIDERATION IS AN EMPLOYER OR INSTITUTIONAL PASS COMPARABLE TO CALTRAIN'S EXISTING GO PASS PROGRAM THAT WOULD BE DIFFERENT THAN OTHER TYPES OF PASSES IN THAT IT WOULD BE OFFERED TO INSTITUTIONS, EMPLOYER, UNIVERSITY, AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT, ET CETERA, IN BULK. THEY WOULD PURCHASE A LARGE NUMBER OF PASSES

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FOR A LARGE NUMBER OF PEOPLE, MANY OF WHOM WOULD NOT BE TRANSIT USERS SO IT'S A DIFFERENT KIND OF PRICING STRUCTURE AND POTENTIALLY WIN-WIN FOR EVERYONE, INCLUDING REVENUE, AS WELL AS TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND THE CONVENIENCE OF THE CUSTOMER. WE'RE DEFINITELY GOING TO EXPLORE THAT. WE THINK THERE ARE VERSIONS OF THESE PASSES THAT COULD -- THAT WE WANT TO TEST ON FOR CLIPPER START ONLY. SO YOU MIGHT IMAGINE A SITUATION WHERE AN EMPLOYER AND INSTITUTIONAL PASS IS OFFERED BUT WE'RE CONCERNED THAT THE BENEFITS MIGHT ACCRUE DISPROPORTIONATELY TO FOLKS ON THE HIGHER INCOME SPECTRUM FOR EXAMPLE, YOU MIGHT WANT TO PAIR THAT WITH A PRODUCT SPECIFICALLY FOR CLIPPER START USERS. SO, THAT ASK -- IS A BRIEF RUN DOWN OF PASS OPTIONS THAT WE'RE GOING TO TEST, EVALUATE, AND I'M GOING TO PAUSE THERE IN CASE PEOPLE HAVE QUESTIONS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE QUESTIONS? I WILL HAVE AT LEAST ONE, BUT I WILL GO LAST, AFTER OTHER PEOPLE ASK THEIR QUESTIONS. I SEE THAT JONATHON KASS HAS A HAND RAISED. JONATHON?

JONOTHON KASS: SORRY. HI. JUST NOW THAT I'M SEEING THE LOCAL AND REGIONAL PUT TO USE IN THESE CATEGORIES, YOU SORT OF DEFINED LOCAL AND REGIONAL THROUGH EXAMPLE. DO YOU IMAGINE ALONG THE WAY HERE, THERE IS GOING TO BE SORT OF A DEFINITION

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF LOCAL VERSUS REGIONAL THAT IS NOT JUST THROUGH THE SORT OF AGENCIES OR PIECES OF AGENCY NETWORKS?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: LET'S SEE. MAYBE, FOR THAT QUESTION, CAN WE JUST FLIP BACK TO THE PRIOR SLIDE? SO, YEAH, I GUESS THE WAY THEY CHARACTERIZE IT WAS SORT OF LOOSE. THIS FRAMEWORK WAS THE SORT OF SEVEN LAYERS HERE WERE PUT TOGETHER BY PLANNERS FROM THE VARIOUS REGIONAL TRANSIT AGENCIES WORKING TOGETHER ON THE PLANNING AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON THE TRANSIT BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, AND I'LL ADMIT I DON'T KNOW ACTUALLY WHAT THE PRECISE CATEGORIZATIONS I THINK WHAT THEY TRY TO DO IS TAKE A RANGE OF DIFFERENT SERVICES WITH VARIOUS OVERLAPPING QUALITIES AND BUCKET THEM TO THE BEST OF THEIR ABILITIES. I THINK FROM A FARE PERSPECTIVE, THEY'RE, NEARLY EVERY SERVICE, I THINK, THAT FITS IN THE BLUE HERE IS PRICED AT A PREMIUM TO A LOCAL BUS FARE TODAY AND MOST NEARLY EVERY SERVICE IN THE ORANGE IS COMPARABLE TO PRICE TO THE LOCAL AGENCY FLAT BUS FARE. BEYOND THAT, I DON'T, TODAY, YOU KNOW, HAVE A PRECISE DEFINITION OF THESE CATEGORIES AND WE MAY HAVE TO THINK ABOUT CLEANING THAT UP A LITTLE BIT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS BEFORE I -- AH-HA, RICH HEDGES HAS A QUESTION. GO AHEAD, RICH.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RICHARD HEDGES: THE MAIN QUESTION -- IT LOOKS LIKE A COUPLE OF THESE COULD BE COMBINED I THINK AFTER MAXIMUM COST SHOULD BE COMBINED WITH ANYTHING WE DO BECAUSE THAT WOULD FIT A SUBSET OF RIDERS, BUT CERTAINLY NOT LOWER INCOMING RIDERS THEY USUALLY MAKE A DECISION BASED ON HOW MUCH THEY HAVE IN THEIR POCKET AND HOW MUCH GAS DO I HAVE. I DON'T THINK IT'S ALL OR NOTHING.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: RICH WE AGREE WITH THAT FLIP BACK TO THE SLIDE. ANY OF THESE OR MORE THAN ONE OF THESE COULD BE OVERLAID ON THE EXISTING FARE STRUCTURE OR COM-- AND/OR COMBINED WITH A NUMBER OF THE OTHER POLICIES THAT ARE UNDER CONSIDERATION. SO, YEAH, IT'S NOT MUTUALLY EXCLUSIVE BY ANY MEANS. OKAY. WHY DON'T WE KEEP MOVING.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: YES. SO I HAD A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS, BUT I WILL ASK, SEEING NO OTHER HANDS FROM FELLOW MEMBERS OF THIS BODY. AND THOSE ARE SOME MAYBE MORE COMMENTS RELATING TO ADDRESSING EQUITY ISSUES. SO, WITH THE CALTRAIN GO PASS LIKE SYSTEM, YOU PROBABLY HAVE BEEN WATCHING WITH WHAT CALTRAIN HAS DONE RECENTLY TO ADDRESS LIMITATIONS OF THE GO PASS, WHERE PREVIOUS VERSIONS DIDN'T ALLOW CONTRACTORS, WHICH IS A BIG PROBLEM. BECAUSE A LOT OF MAJOR EMPLOYERS HAVE -- LIKE, FOR EXAMPLE, FOOD SERVICE AND JANITORIAL WORKERS WHO ARE CONTRACTORS AND THAT WAS JUST CHANGED TO ALLOW IT TO APPLY TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THOSE, AND THEN THERE WAS A NON-PROFIT FEATURE CREATED AS WELL. SO THOUGHT WOULD BE TO GO INTO THAT TO ADDRESS THE EQUITY ISSUES WITH THAT KIND OF STRUCTURE, HOWEVER THAT KIND OF STRUCTURE, INCLUDING ALSO INCLUDING MULTIPLE AGENCIES WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL, BECAUSE THERE HAVE BEEN THESE, LIKE, REALLY PARADOX CAL SITUATIONS WHERE HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS HAVE TO DECIDE WHETHER TO GIVE A BUS PASS OR TRAIN PASS SO BEING ABLE TO GIVE OUT A TRANSIT PASS WOULD BE A MUCH MORE SENSIBLE THING, AND THEN ON THE TIER PATH, I HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT, WELL, WHAT DOES IT MEAN TO HAVE -- HOW WOULD IT WORK TO HAVE LOCAL SERVICE, REGIONAL SERVICE, OR LOCAL AND REGIONAL SERVICE? SO, WOULD IT LOGICALLY BE A THING THAT YOU WOULD GET A PASS THAT WOULD COVER A REGIONAL SERVICE AND NOT A CONNECTION? OR DO THOSE ALL BUNDLE TOGETHER SO THAT THE WAY CALTRAIN DOES IT, IT BUNDLES TOGETHER. AND THE OTHER ISSUE TO LOOK INTO TO DOING A TIERED PASS -- RIGHT NOW WE HAVE A LOCAL SYSTEM PASS WHICH PROVIDES NO DISCOUNT AGAINST THE REGIONAL SERVICE SO IF YOU GET A CALTRAIN MONTHLY PASS YOU GET -- YOUR SAMTRANS AND VTA CONNECTIONS, RIDES ARE INCLUDED BUT IF YOU HAVE A SAMTRANS OR VTA PASS YOU GET NO PASS ON CALTRAIN AND THAT IS INEQUITY. SO PLEASE DO TAKE A LOOK AT ADDRESSING THOSE INEQUITIES AND VERSION US THAT ARE CONSIDERING WHICH YOU MAY ALREADY BE DOING. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: GREAT. OKAY. THANKS FOR ALL THAT VERY HELPFUL STUFF. LET'S KEEP GOING. IS

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: YEP.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. ALL RIGHT. SO THIS ONE, NOW WE JUST HAVE A FEW SLIDES ON EACH OF THE REMAINING OPTIONS, DISCOUNTED DOUBLE FARES HERE. TODAY, IF YOU TRANSFER FROM AC TRANSIT TO BART PAY FULL FARE ON EACH AND GOT A SMALL DISCOUNT GOING IN THE OPPOSITE DIRECTION SO THIS OPTION IS CONSIDERED AS A RANGE OF POSSIBILITIES FOR REDUCING THOSE PRICE PREMIUMS FOR TRANSFERS WE'RE LOOKING AT A TARGET DISCOUNT BETWEEN AGENCY PAIRS THAT MEET EACH SEVERAL CRITERIA. THESE CATEGORIES ARE BROAD ENOUGH THAT THIS GROUPED COULD INCLUDE UP TO AND INCLUDING DISCOUNTED FARES BETWEEN ALL AGENCIES AND CONNECTIONS TO EACH OTHER WE NEED TO DEFINE THOSE VARIANTS IN THE MODEL AND WE'RE GOING TO BE TESTING LEVELS OF DISCOUNT BETWEEN 25 AND 100%. THIS IS AMONG THE MORE STRAIGHT FORWARD AND AMONG THE MOST PROBABLY LOWEST BARRIERS TO IMPLEMENTATION FROM MY VIEW WHERE WE SIT TODAY. OKAY. ANY QUESTIONS ON THIS ONE BEFORE WE MOVE ON?

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: WILL THERE BE -- MIGHT THE STUDY INCLUDE A, LIKE, NOT ONLY A VERSUS B, BUT A ROADMAP SAYING WE COULD DO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

A FIRST AND B LATER BASED ON FUNDING AND INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENT THAT ENABLE THEM?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YES. WE DON'T HAVE AN OUTLINE AT THE MOMENT FOR EXACTLY WHAT OUR IMPLEMENTATION PLAN LOOKS LIKE BUT I THINK WE COULD PUT SOME RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SORT OF A PATH BETWEEN NEAR-TERM AND LONG-TERM RECOMMENDATIONS. I WOULD LIKE TO OFFER THAT WOULD TALK TO THE ONGOING DIALOGUE AT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE ABOUT MANAGEMENT OPTIONS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL, RATHER THAN SAYING, YOU KNOW, OPTION X WILL TAKE MORE WORK, SO WE DON'T RECOMMEND IT, SO SAY OPTION X WOULD TAKE MORE WORK SO IF YOU DO SOMETHING EASY OR HARDER LATER. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND WENDI HAS A HAND RAISED.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: YES, ACTUALLY I WAS SORT OF SAYING THE SAME THING THAT YOU WERE ABOUT TO SAY WHICH IS -- COULD THERE -- YOU KNOW, I WAS GOING TO SAVE THIS UNTIL THE END, BUT COULD THERE BE A TIMELINE OF DOING SOME OF THE EASY FIXES RIGHT AWAY? THIS OBVIOUSLY WOULD BE AN EASY FIX, BUT THEN REALLY PLANNING FOR LONG-TERM FIXES THAT CREATE A MORE INTEGRATED SYSTEM. ONE OF THE ISSUES THEY HAVE WITH THIS PARTICULAR OPTION IS THAT, RIGHT NOW, YOU KNOW, IT'S OBVIOUS THAT THERE ARE CERTAIN AGENCIES THAT HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSFERRING FROM ONE SYSTEM TO ANOTHER, BUT PART OF THAT COULD BE BECAUSE IT'S SO CONFUSING TO TRANSFER, AND IF WE HAD AN EASIER SYSTEM, THERE MIGHT BE A LOT MORE TRANSFERS THAT WOULD GO ON. SO THAT GOES BACK TO WHAT ADINA -- BOTH ADINA AND I ARE ASKING, IS, COULD WE HAVE A TIMELINE OF DOING SOME IMMEDIATE SHIFTS THAT LEAD US TO AN ULTIMATE, MORE INTEGRATED FARE SYSTEM?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YES. I THINK THAT WE'RE THINKING ABOUT SIMILAR OPTIONS. I DO WANT TO POINT OUT, AS FAR AS THE NOTION OF AN IMMEDIATE SHIFT THAT WE'RE REALLY LOOKING AT THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CLIPPER TWO ACCOUNT-BASED SYSTEM AS THE TECHNOLOGY PLATFORM FOR A LOT OF THESE CHANGES, AND THAT IS SORT OF FALL 2023. SO, IMMEDIATE MIGHT NOT BE IMMEDIATE.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: IN PLANNING TERMS THAT'S IMMEDIATE.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: [LAUGHTER] FAIR ENOUGH.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS HERE? AND IF NOT, WE'LL MOVE ON. I'M NOT SEEING ANY OTHER QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. SO WE HAVE TWO VERSIONS OF OPTION THREE. I MENTIONED THIS WAS A LITTLE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MORE COMPLICATED TO EXPLAIN, BUT THIS IS NEIGHBORING CONNECTING INTER-AGENCY INTEGRATION THE HIGH LEVEL VERSION. THIS MAP HERE IS A VERSION OF SUBREGIONS THAT WE'RE SORT OF USING TENTATIVELY AS A BASIS FOR OPTIONS 3A AND 3B. IF YOU THINK ABOUT OPTION TWO IS NEIGHBORING AND CONNECTING TO INTEGRATION, THIS IS NEIGHBORING AND CONNECTING AGENCY INTEGRATION -- I'M SORRY -- IF OPTION TWO IS DISCOUNT DOUBLE FARES, THIS OPTION IS DISCOUNT DOUBLE FARES AND PERHAPS SOME INTEGRATION STEPS BETWEEN AGENCIES IN THE COLORED BLOCKS HERE. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, TODAY, IN THE EAST BAY, MOST OF THE AGENCIES ALREADY HAVE A STANDARD LOCAL BUS FARE AND A STANDARD INTER-AGENCY DISCOUNT. ADD AC TRANSIT AND UNION CITY INTO THE MIX AND THAT'S ALL AGENCIES IN THE GRAY LIKE SONOMA COUNTY HAVING SIMILAR ARRANGEMENT, IF YOU HAVE THE COLORED ZONES STANDARD INTER-AGENCY DISCOUNT AND STANDARD LOCAL FARE. YOU COULD ALSO IMPLEMENT STANDARDIZED DISCOUNTS BETWEEN THE COLORED AREAS. SO WHY IS THAT BETTER THAN OR DIFFERENT THAN DOING JUST DISCOUNT DOUBLE FARE BETWEEN ALSO AGENCIES, PERHAPS SIMPLE LOWER BARRIERS. AC TRANSIT AND UNION CITY TO THE MIX IN EAST BAY EASIER GETTING BETWEEN. OPTION THREE G IS A VARIATION THAT I'LL DESCRIBE IN A MOMENT BUT OPTION 3A STOPS RIGHT THERE WITH INTEGRATION OF FARES BETWEEN LOCAL AGENCIES IN THE COLORED BLOCKS. THAT ONE IS A LITTLE COMPLICATED TO DESCRIBE. IS THAT ANY CLARIFIES QUESTIONS ON THAT? NOPE?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BRIAN STANKE: BRIAN STANKE HERE. SO FOR THESE FIVE BLOCKS, WHO IS DETERMINING THE FARES IN EACH OF THE BLOCKS? OR IS IT FIVE OR SIX?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH, IT WOULD PROBABLY BE DETERMINED BY THE -- YOU WOULD -- THE AGENCIES WITHIN THE BLOCKS, AND THEIR GOVERNING BOARDS WOULD HAVE TO COME TO AGREEMENT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: I SEE THAT RICH HEDGES HAS A HAND.

RICHARD HEDGES: YES. THANK YOU. WITH THIS PARTICULAR SETUP -- AND I UNDERSTAND THAT WE HAVE TO SORT OF LEAD THE AGENCIES INTO THIS, SO I'M NOT COMPLAINING ABOUT THAT, BUT I JUST REMEMBER ALL OF THE PROBLEMS WE HAD GETTING TRANSLINK TO OPERATE ABOUT HOW THEY WOULD DEAL WITH FARES THAT REALLY WE WENT TEN YEARS UNTIL IT WAS ALMOST, THE FIRST VERSION WAS ALMOST OBSOLETE, CLIPPER. SO IF ANYONE WANTS TO GUESS HOW WELL THIS IS GOING TO WORK, I HAVE NO IDEA. THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ANY OTHER HANDS BEFORE WE GO TO 3B? I THINK I WILL HAVE A COMMENT, BUT I WANT TO SEE 3B AND THEN COMMENT.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. ALL RIGHT. WELL, SO BEFORE WE DO 3B, 3B OVERLAYS A FARE BY DISTANCE STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL SERVICE,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO GIVE YOU THE PUNCH LINE, BUT BEFORE WE DO THAT LET'S RUN THROUGH PRINCIPLES FOR FARE BY DISTANCE OVERALL. FOR THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE, WE HAVE TWO OPTIONS THAT USE FARE BY DISTANCE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES, AND WE HAD A FEW PRINCIPLES THAT WE'RE TRYING TO EXECUTE HERE TO DESIGN OUR FARE BY DISTANCE. ONE IS KEEPING THE USE OF SURCHARGES FAIRLY LIMITED AND TACTICAL, SO THE ONES THAT ARE STILL ON THE TABLE ARE TRANSBAY AND AIRPORT SURCHARGES. WE DO WANT STRUCTURES THAT ARE, AT LEAST, CAPABLE IN GENERATING SIMILAR REVENUE TO WHAT WE GET TODAY. WE DO WANT TO HAVE A BASE FARE THAT ALIGNS IN A REASONABLE WAY WITH LOCAL BUS FARES WE WANT TO AVOID DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACTS ON LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES. WE NEED TO MAINTAIN FLEXIBILITY AND JUST OVERALL PROJECT GOALS SO WE WANT THE PRICING TO ENCOURAGE EFFICIENT USE BAY AREA TRANSIT SYSTEM AND WE WANT TO HAVE AN ATTRACTIVE SERVICE TO PROVIDES. THOSE ARE OVERALL PRINCIPLES WE'RE USING WHEN DESIGNING FARE BY DISTANCE. GETTING BACK TO OPTION 3A, AND YOU KNOW WHAT? PROBABLY THE EASIEST WAY TO TALK ABOUT IT IS TO FLIP BACK TO THE VISUAL. WHEN WE TALKED VISUAL 3A SIMILAR INTEGRATION BETWEEN LOCAL SERVICE IN THE COLORED BLOCKS. 3B WOULD BE THAT SAME A ARRANGEMENT BLUE THE REGIONAL SERVICES WOULD ALL USE A COMMON FARE BY DISTANCE SERVICE CALTRAIN, FERRY, REGIONAL EXPRESS BUS WOULD ALSO USE FARE BY DISTANCE. AND THAT'S REALLY THE ONLY DIFFERENCE, AND THERE WOULD ALSO BE IN EITHER 3A OR 3B THERE COULD BE STANDARDIZED DISCOUNTS BETWEEN REGIONAL AND LOCAL SERVICE. THAT'S 3B. ANY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

-- ACTUALLY, YOU KNOW WHAT? BEFORE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS LET ME QUICKLY SUMMARIZE OPTION FOUR. BECAUSE IT'S CLOSELY RELATED. ONE MORE. FARE BY DISTANCE BY LOCAL FLAT FARE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ACTUALLY COULD WE GO BACK TO 3A. NOBODY ELSE HAD A THOUGHT ON 3A AND I WANT TO COMMENT ON THAT. I THINK FOUR IS GOING TO BE GOING IN A DIFFERENT DIRECTION. LIKE, 3B SEEMS PRETTY CONFUSING TO ME. AND I THINK MAYBE IT ONLY SEEMS FAMILIAR BECAUSE THAT, IT'S MORE, LIKE, WHAT THE BARRIERS ARE IN OUR CURRENT SYSTEM. BUT WE DON'T HAVE -- LIKE, OUR SYSTEM DOESN'T CHANGE, LIKE WHEN YOU'RE DRIVING BETWEEN SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND IT SEEMS CONFUSING FOR PEOPLE THAT THEIR SYSTEM WOULD HAVE TO DO THAT, LIKE, FOR A COUPLE OF REASONS, ONE IS THAT THE HIGHEST -- THERE IS, LIKE, HUGELY HIGH RIDERSHIP CORRIDOR BETWEEN OAKLAND AND SAN FRANCISCO, AND, LIKE, THOSE ARE ON THE OPPOSITE SIDES OF A LINE. PERSONALLY, ONE OF THE -- I DON'T DRIVE VERY MUCH, BUT ONE OF THE MAIN THINGS THAT I USE A CAR FOR IS TO CROSS THE BAY AT TIMES WHERE TRANSIT IS NOT RUNNING OR IS EXTREMELY INFREQUENT, WHICH IS OF COURSE AN ISSUE TO BE ADDRESSED BY FREQUENCY IN ADDITION, BUT IT ALSO MAKES THE FARE STRUCTURE FOR LIKE IF YOU TRAVEL BETWEEN THE PENINSULA AND THE EAST BAY WITH THE MESSAGE IS TELLING YOU IS, PLEASE, LIKE, GET A CAR. AND THAT SEEMS KIND OF CONFUSING AND NOT USER FRIENDLY, AT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LEAST FROM THIS PERSPECTIVE. AND I SEE THAT RICH AND BRIAN HAVE THEIR HANDS RAISED ON THIS WHILE WE ARE HERE.

RICHARD HEDGES: I WANT TO MAKE IT CLEAR I'M NOT NECESSARILY AGAINST THE SUBREGIONAL FARES. I JUST THINK IT'S GOING TO BE HARD NO MATTER WHAT WE DO TO GET AGREEMENT OUT OF THE DIFFERING AGENCIES ESPECIALLY IF THERE IS A RISK OF LOWERING THEIR INCOME ESPECIALLY SINCE WHAT'S HAPPENED SINCE COVID. AND THAT'S WHAT I SAY BY GOOD LUCK. I DON'T WANT TO MAKE IT SEEM LIKE I'M AGAINST THIS, I JUST HAVEN'T MADE UP MY MIND YET.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: AND STAFF IS ASKING SHOULD IT BE STUDIED, I'M GLAD IT'S GOING TO BE STUDIED, AND I THINK THAT THIS MAY RAISE SOME EASE OF USE ISSUES. BRIAN?

BRIAN STANKE: THANKS ADINA. YEAH, I DIDN'T ASK THIS QUESTION EARLIER BECAUSE I WAS THINKING IT WOULD BE ADDRESSED BY 3B. BUT, HOW ARE THE REGIONAL SERVICES ADDRESSED IN 3A? IS IT THEY'RE JUST NOT PART OF THIS SUBREGIONS? BECAUSE WE HAVE, BART IS PART OF, AT LEAST, THREE SUBREGIONS IN THIS. CALTRAIN, TWO OR THREE. ARE THEY INCLUDING THE SUBREGIONS? DO YOU GET A SURCHARGE FOR CROSSING SUBREGION?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: I THINK WE WILL FIRM UP THE DETAILS TO HAVE A STANDARDIZED INTER-AGENCY DISCOUNT FROM LOCAL OR REGIONAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SERVICE WITHIN EACH SUBREGION. SO, IT'S HARD TO IMAGINE US GOING TO THIS FRAMEWORK WITHOUT INVOLVING, FOR EXAMPLE, BART, AT ALL.

BRIAN STANKE: SO WOULD THIS AFFECT A BART RIGHT OR CALTRAIN RIDE THAT IS IN THE ONE SUBREGION? WOULD IT -- OR WOULD IT JUST BE THE SAME PRICE IT IS TODAY?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: SO ONE POSSIBILITY FOR AN INTER-AGENCY DISCOUNT WOULD BE 100% -- ESSENTIALLY 100% DISCOUNT FOR INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER. SO IF THAT WERE THE CASE AND THAT WERE APPLIED ON -- FOR THE LOCAL TO REGIONAL TRANSFER, YOU WOULD PROBABLY GET -- YOU WOULD EITHER, FROM YOUR TOTAL FARE, HAVE DEDUCTED THE PRICE OF THE LOCAL BUS OR THE MINIMUM FARE ON BART WHICH IS ABOUT THE PRICE OF A LOCAL BUS. SO YOU WOULD NOT -- IF YOU END UP PAYING IF YOU TOOK A LOCAL TRIP ON BART YOUR PRICE FARE WOULDN'T WOULD BE A LITTLE HIGHER. REMEMBER FOR INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNTS FOR 25 ALL THE WAY UP TO 100%.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: WENDI, I SEE YOU HAVE A HAND RAISED?

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: YEAH. I HAVE A BIAS, BECAUSE I LIKE OPTION THREE THE BEST. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW, WHAT IS, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS THE ADVANTAGES OR DISADVANTAGE OF USING THE HONEYCOMB OPTION, AS OPPOSED TO JUST HAVING A BY DISTANCE, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THEN A LOCAL FLAT FARE? WHICH SEEMS SO MUCH SIMPLER AND EASIER TO UNDERSTAND?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: WE'LL GET TO THE HONEYCOMB IN JUST A MOMENT.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: WE'RE NOT HONEYCOMBED YET?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: THIS IS A DIFFERENT SORT OF MAP. IT LOOKS LIKE A ZONE MAP.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: IT DOES.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: AND THAT MIGHT BE HELPING PEOPLE GRASP IT AND HELPING TO UNDERSTAND. BY THE WAY WE'RE DOING USER RESEARCH ON THESE IN DEPTH PROTOTYPING WITH PEOPLE TO MAKE SURE WE UNDERSTAND HOW UNDERSTANDABLE THEY ARE. THE PURPOSE OF THESE IS THE INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER DISCOUNTS ARE COMMON WITHIN EACH OF THE AREAS, BUT NOT NECESSARILY THAT YOU WOULD PAY A SECOND FARE OR A LONG -- OR A HIGHER FARE FOR MOVING BETWEEN ZONES. BETWEEN AREAS. DOES THAT --

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: SO THIS IS A VARIATION OF MY PREFERENCE WHICH IS THREE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OPTION THREE, THE LOCAL VERSION OF IT, THESE AREAS THAT ARE DRAWN HERE, ARE REALLY A VARIATION ON OPTION TWO. THEY ARE DISCOUNTED DOUBLE FARES BUT CONSTRUCTED WITHIN EACH OF THE SUBREGIONAL AREAS.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. I'M EVEN NOW MORE CONFUSED, DOUBLE DISCOUNT FARES. OKAY. I'M GOING -- I HAVE GOT YOUR PRESENTATION OVER HERE SO I CAN GO TO DIFFERENT SLIDES.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY.

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: OKAY.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: SO --

WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: OKAY. SO YEAH, WHAT, ACTUALLY, MY PREFERENCE IS FOUR. FARE BY LOCAL --

MICHAEL EISEMAN: LOCAL FLAT FARE. SO ONE THING -- AND OPTION 3B IS SIMILAR TO OPTION FOUR IN THAT IT HAS A DISTANCE BASED SERVICE FOR REGIONAL SERVICES. THE WAY THAT 3B AND FOUR DIFFER IS THAT WILL LOCAL FARE OR THE LOCAL INTER-AGENCY DISCOUNTS IN 3 AND 4 ARE -- IT'S JUST ONE BIG REGION, IT'S ALL THE SAME EVERYWHERE. AND OPTION 3B, THERE MIGHT -- THERE ARE GOING TO BE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN SUBREGIONS. AND, YOU KNOW, ADINA

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MENTIONED HOW THAT MIGHT BE CONFUSING OR UNHELPFUL IN CERTAIN SITUATIONS. IT MAY BE. THE ADVANTAGE THERE IS, TODAY LOCAL BUS FARES IN PARTS OF THE NORTH BAY ARE QUITE LOW, FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE REGION, IT MAY -- THAT TO SOME DEGREE CATERS TO LOW INCOME CUSTOMER BASE, AND IN SAN FRANCISCO OR THE SOUTH BAY, LOCAL BUS FARES ARE HIGHER. SO TRYING TO NORMALIZE BETWEEN THOSE TWO AREAS IT'S A BARRIER IMPLEMENTATION AND MAY DISADVANTAGE CERTAIN CUSTOMERS, 3B DOESN'T REQUIRE STANDARDIZATION. OPTION FOUR, MOVING FORWARD. AS DESCRIBED FARE BY DISTANCE LOCAL FLAT FARE. SO IT'S A BART LIKE STRUCTURE FOR THE REGIONAL SERVICES AND SINGLE FLAT FARE FOR LOCAL BUSES. PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. THEN OPTION FIVE, OH, OKAY. BEFORE WE GO TO OPTION FIVE, WE WANT TO SHOW YOU OUR ZONE MAPS HERE. SO WE HAVE GOT TWO DIFFERENT ZONE MAPS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: MAY I ASK A STUPID QUESTION FIRST?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: SURE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: SO IS 3B THE SAME AS IF YOU GO BACK TO FOUR -- THAT ONE -- IS 3B FARE BY DISTANCE EXCEPT FOR THE LOCAL FARE VARIED BY REGION?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YES. THAT IS THE PRIMARY DIFFERENCE. THE OTHER DIFFERENCE IS THAT OPTION FOUR, ALL VERSIONS OF LOCAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FARE -- ALL VERSIONS OF OPTION FOUR HAVE NO -- HAVE 100% TRANSFER DISCOUNTS BETWEEN LOCAL AND REGIONAL, WHEREAS OPTION 3B, THAT IS A VARIANT TO TEST.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. BECAUSE --

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH. FOR THE MOST PART, YES.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: BECAUSE THE 3B, WHICH IS FARE BY DISTANCE BUT WITH THE LOCAL FARE NOT BE STANDARDIZED, LIKE, DOES MAYBE MAKE SOME SENSE, AS LONG AS THERE ISN'T, LIKE, ALSO A TRANSFER PENALTY WHEN YOU'RE GOING BETWEEN SANTA CLARA AND SAN MATEO COUNTY?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: CORRECT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. AND I SEE RICH HEDGES'S HAND.

RICHARD HEDGES: JUST A THOUGHT. WHAT ABOUT THE 3A WITH THE VARIOUS REGIONS? HAVING FARES BY DISTANCE BETWEEN THOSE REGIONS, AND A FLAT FARE ON EACH REGION. THAT WOULD BE VERY SIMPLE FOR PEOPLE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH. SO THE ONLY DIFFERENCE BETWEEN -- I THINK, THE ONLY DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THAT AND THE WAY WE DEFINE IT NOW IS IF YOU TAKE A LOCAL TRIP THAT HAPPENS TO ACROSS A REGIONAL BOUNDARY, YOU STILL WOULDN'T NECESSARILY BE CHARGED A DISTANCE BASED FARE, YOU JUST PAY YOUR LOCAL FARE IN THE CURRENT DEFINITION OF 3A.

RICHARD HEDGES: IT SEEMS TO ME THAT WHAT I JUST PRESENTED WOULD BE SIMPLER FOR PEOPLE TO UNDERSTAND IF THEY UNDERSTAND THE REGIONS AND HOW MUCH IT'S GOING TO COST THEM WHEN THEY GO FROM ONE REGION TO THE NEXT THEY KNOW THERE'S GOING TO BE AN ADDITIONAL CHARGE. THERE SHOULD BE DISCOUNTS ONCE YOU PAY THE FULL FARE FOR AN ADDITIONAL REGION.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH. I GET IT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. ALL RIGHT. I DON'T SEE ANY MORE HANDS. I GUESS WE CAN MOVE ON.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ALL RIGHT. SO OUR LAST TWO ARE ZONES. SO, HERE IS SOME PRINCIPLES ON TOP FOR ZONES. AGAIN, WE NEED, AT LEAST THE OPTION OF RAISING AT LEAST MUCH REVENUE AS WE RAISED TODAY. WE ARE WORKING WITH ARBITRARY PRICE BOUNDARIES. WE'RE LEADING IN THE POSSIBILITY OF SOME VIRTUAL ZONES, WHICH SORT OF REPRESENT SURCHARGES FOR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PARTICULAR TYPES OF TRIPS SUCH AS TRANSBAY AND AIRPORT. WE OBVIOUSLY NEED TO AVOID ARBITRARY PRICE PENALTIES FOR LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES. WE'RE TRYING TO BALANCE TWICE AND ZONE SIZE. SO, YOU GOT TWO VERSIONS OF A ZONE MAP HERE. ON THE LEFT, RELATIVELY SMALL ZONES, RELATIVELY FINE GRAINED, THOSE SORT OF HELP YOU TO OPTIMIZE THE PRICE PEOPLE PAY. BUT THERE MIGHT BE FOR SOME, THERE ARE SOME TO DECIPHER A MAP IN SUCH FINE GRAIN AND PERHAPS INTRODUCE MORE BARRIERS IN TRIPS AND THE RIGHT LARGER ZONE VERSION OF THE SAME ZONE CONCEPT. SO WE WILL BE TESTING BOTH LARGE AND SMALL ZONES. AND IF YOU FLIP TO OPTION FIVE. OKAY. SO HONEYCOMB ZONES FOR ALL SERVICES, WE WILL BE TESTING THIS OPTION. ALL AGENCIES, ONE ZONE STRUCTURE. AND THE VARIANTS HAVE TO DO WITH THE PRICE CHARGED FOR TRAVELING IN A ZONE TESTING THE OPTION OF A FREE SECOND ZONE REASONS TO MINIMIZE CERTAIN KIND OF ARBITRARY PRICE ZONES FOR PEOPLE MAKING SHORT TRIPS. HONEYCOMB ZONES. OPTION SIX, CLOSELY RELATED TO HONEYCOMB ZONES APPLYING ONLY TO TWO REGIONAL TRIPS SO YOUR LOCAL BUS FARES WOULD REMAIN AT THE FLAT FARE AND REGIONAL SERVICES WOULD BE INTEGRATED INTO A SINGLE STRUCTURE. ACTUALLY DO WE HAVE A NEXT SLIDE? WE DON'T. WE HAVE A VERSION OF THIS THAT WILL GO TO THE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE HAS A VERSION OF OUR ZONE MAP THAT'S TAILORED TO -- HELP ME OUT HERE, BILL, OPTION B ZONE STRUCTURE THAT WE SHOW THAT, IS NOT THAT; RIGHT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WILLIAM BACON: THAT'S RIGHT THERE IS A THIRD MAP THAT'S NOT INCLUDED HERE.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: THAT WILL GO INTO THE PACKET THAT WE POSE TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. IT'S A LARGE ZONE MAP SIMILAR TO CALTRAIN ZONE SIZES TODAY AND DIFFERENT FROM THE ZONE MAP THAT YOU SAW A MOMENT AGO IS IT IGNORES BOUNDARIES BETWEEN LOCAL SERVICE AREAS. LOCAL SERVICE AREAS AREN'T IMPORTANT WHEN WE'RE DEALING WITH REGIONAL SERVICES SO IT WOULD BE TAILORED TO EXISTING REGIONAL RAIL AND FERRY AND EXPRESS BUS NETWORK. OF COURSE IF YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT BARRIERS TO IMPLEMENTATION, THERE ARE A SHORT LIST OF REGIONAL OPERATORS AND A LONG LIST OF LOCAL OPERATORS, SO THIS WOULD INVOLVE CHANGES FOR FOUR EXISTING AGENCIES AND THEREFORE MIGHT HAVE LOWER BARRIERS TO IMPLEMENTATION AMONG OTHER ADVANTAGES. SO --

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT SO IS THE INTENT OF THE HONEYCOMB ZONE LOCAL FLAT FARE THIS, WHERE THE LOCAL FLAT FARE CAN BE NOT BE HARMONIZED OR NOT BE HARMONIZED AT THE START WHERE YOU HAVE THE, YOU KNOW, SFMTA'S FARE IS DIFFERENT FROM VTA, SO YOU WOULD BASICALLY USE THE LOCAL FARE AS THE BASE ZONE WHATEVER THAT IS?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: ADINA, THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. AND IT CALLS OUT THAT I JUST DESCRIBED THAT INCORRECTLY. THAT ADVANTAGE NOT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HAVING HARMONIZED FARES BETWEEN LOCAL BUS OPERATORS ACTUALLY DOESN'T APPLY IN THIS CASE. WE WOULD IN OPTION SIX HARMONIZE LOCAL BUS FARES TO ONE PRICE BUT REGIONAL FARES WOULD BE CHANGED TO A SINGLE FARE THAT ADVANTAGE I JUST DESCRIBED ACTUALLY APPLIES TO 3B. ONE LESS BARRIER TO IMPLEMENTATION OF OPTION SIX AS OPPOSED TO OPTION FIVE THAT I SHOULD HAVE MENTIONED IS THAT TODAY YOU DON'T HAVE TO TAG OFF YOUR LOCAL BUS. RIGHT? SO YOU WOULD NEED SOME TECHNOLOGY SOLUTION EITHER TAG ON OR TAG OFF OR SOMETHING FANCIER TO ALLOW YOU TO COLLECT LOCAL ZONE INFORMATION ON LOCAL SERVICES WHEREAS THE LOCAL FLAT FARE FOR REGIONAL ZONE HONEYCOMB SERVICES YOU COULD HAVE ROUGHLY THE SAME SYSTEM FOR LOCAL PAYMENT AS YOU HAVE TODAY.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: COULD YOU DO THE THING THEY DESCRIBED, WHERE YOU HAD HONEYCOMB ZONES, BUT THE -- YOU'RE -- YOUR BASE FARE WOULD DEPEND ON WHERE YOU ARE?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YES DEFINITELY COULD DO THAT. WE HAVE OPTIONS 3A AND 3B THAT HAVE SUBREGIONAL GROUPINGS, IT WOULD BE HARD TO OVERLAY A ZONE FARE MAP ON A SUBREGIONAL MAP, JUST VISUALLY, BUT OTHERWISE, YES, THAT IS ALSO AN OPTION.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: UH-HUH. SO, COULD -- IN THINKING ABOUT THE IMPLEMENTATION, I GUESS THIS WILL GET INTO THE IMPLEMENTATION AND FUNDING CHALLENGES, BUT IF IT IS -- IF THAT WINDS UP BEING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ONE OF THE HARDER CHALLENGES, THEN THAT MAY BE A LOGICAL OPTION TO ADDRESS THAT IMPLEMENTATION CHALLENGE. OKAY. I SEE THAT RICH HAD A HAND BUT THEN PUT IT DOWN. RICH, DO YOU HAVE A QUESTION?

RICHARD HEDGES: I WAS JUST GOING TO ASK ABOUT THE ZONE FARES BUT DECIDED THAT MY QUESTION WASN'T THAT MEANING.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: OKAY. SO THAT IS THE -- THAT'S THE SIX OPTIONS, AND THERE ARE SUBVARIANTS THAT WE ARE PLANNING ON TESTING. THE TESTING IS WHAT BILL IS GOING TO DESCRIBE IN THE NEXT SEGMENT HERE. I DON'T KNOW IF WE HAVE OVERARCHING QUESTIONS OR IF WE SHOULD JUST KEEP MOVING?

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: I GUESS -- I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS FROM THE BODY. SO A FORWARD MOTION WOULD BE WELCOME.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: WELL WITH THAT, THANKS FOR YOUR ATTENTION ON THAT. THAT WAS A LOT OF DETAIL. I'LL KICK IT OVER TO BILL.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: ACTUALLY, LET ME STOP HERE AND ASK A BROADER QUESTION, WHICH IS, I NEGLECTED AT THE BEGINNING TO ASK WHAT FEEDBACK YOU'RE LOOKING FOR FROM US AND WE HAVE BEEN GIVING YOU KIND OF IMPRESSIONISTIC FEEDBACK. IS THERE MORE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPECIFIC QUESTIONS THAT YOU WERE LOOKING FROM US THAT WE SHOULD THINK ABOUT BEFORE WE ARE DONE TODAY?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: NO. I THINK THE KIND OF FEEDBACK YOU HAVE BEEN GIVING SO FAR HAS BEEN EXACTLY WHAT WE NEED WHICH IS EITHER THINGS THAT ARE NOT CLEAR OR VARIATIONS ON THE THEMES THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO SEE EXPLORED BUT IF EITHER ONE OF THOSE IS COMING TO MIND, FURTHER, WE'RE ALL EARS.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: UH-HUH. OKAY. TERRIFIC. THANK YOU. SO I SEE THAT JONATHON HAS A HAND.

JONOTHON KASS: I GUESS I'M JUST COMING BACK TO A QUESTION AND MAYBE CONVERTING IT TO FEEDBACK. WITH RESPECT TO THE ISSUE OF LOCAL VERSUS REGIONAL TRIPS, THE CATEGORIES, THE EXAMPLES YOU GAVE, MADE A LOT OF SENSE. IF WE'RE SUCCESSFUL IN RECOVERY PLANNING OF CONTINUING TO DRY TO CREATIVELY ADAPT THE SYSTEM AND MATCH RIDE CUSTOMERS WITH LESS REGARD FOR WHERE INSTITUTIONAL BOUNDARIES ARE WE MAY HAVE MORE EXAMPLES OF SERVICES THAT ARE NOT AS CLEAN THAN WE HAVE TODAY. SO I JUST THINK IT MIGHT BE HELPFUL TO HAVE A DEFINITION THAT CARRIES FORWARD IN TIME.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YEAH. THAT'S A FAIR POINT. I THINK THERE IS DEFINITELY SOME SERVICES THAT ARE IN THE GRAY ZONE BETWEEN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOCAL AND REGIONAL. WE JUST HAD A COUPLE OF GENERAL MANAGERS FROM THE BAY SONOMA AND SOLANO COUNTIES AND THEY OPERATE, DEFINITELY, A HANDFUL OF SERVICES THAT ARE NOT COMPLETELY ONE OR THE OTHER, AT LEAST TO THE DEGREE THAT I UNDERSTAND THEM. YEAH THERE IS PROBABLY SOME BETTER DEFINING OF THAT THAT'S GOING TO BE NEEDED.

JONOTHON KASS: AND ONE SUPER BASIC QUESTION THAT I HAVE JUST FORGOTTEN, AS WE LISTENED TO THIS, YOU CAN REMIND ME HOW THIS INTERSECTS WITH CLIPPER, NEW GENERATION CLIPPER, BOTH FOR, YEAH, FOR THE EVALUATION, MAYBE, BUT ALSO JUST TIMELINE?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: SURE. YEAH. THAT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT QUESTION. SO WE ARE REALLY LOOKING TO THE DEPLOYMENT OF THE CLIPPER TWO ACCOUNT-BASED SYSTEM AS THE -- AS THE THING THAT WILL MAKE MOST OF THESE OPTIONS POSSIBLE. VERY FEW OF THESE CHANGES ARE ACTUALLY, CAN BE IMPLEMENTED IN THE C1 SYSTEM AS IT'S CURRENTLY SETUP. AND SO RATHER THAN ADAPTING IT AT GREAT EFFORT AND EXPENSE, THE TEAM IS FOCUSED ON DELIVERING CLIPPER TWO, AND SO WE WOULD PROBABLY BE LOOKING TO -- IT'S NOW SCHEDULED FOR FALL, 2023, AS WHEN WE'RE HOPING TO DEPLOY.

JONOTHON KASS: IN TERMS OF WAITING CONSIDERATIONS HERE, SOMETHING THAT CAN ACTUALLY BE DONE IN OUR CURRENT ENVIRONMENT IS NOT REALLY A WAIT IN THIS CONVERSATION. IS THAT RIGHT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: THAT'S MY SENSE. THERE IS [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] [INDISCERNIBLE] I MEAN, IF IT WAS A HIGH ENOUGH PRIORITY FOR ENOUGH REGIONAL STAKEHOLDERS TO DELAY THE CLIPPER TWO DEPLOYMENT, THEN WE COULD -- THE OPTIONS ARE WIDER, BUT THE -- I GUESS MY THOUGHT WOULD BE WE'RE LIKELY LOOKING AT CLIPPER TWO.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. INTERACTING WITH THE TOPIC EARLIER DESCRIBED, WHERE IF THERE IS A ROADMAP OF EASIER THINGS AND HARDER THINGS, IF THERE MIGHT BE EASIER THINGS THAT COULD BE DONE, EVEN IN CLIPPER ONE, AND HARDER THINGS THAT REQUIRE CLIPPER TWO FUNDING AND INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES, THERE COULD BE SUCH A ROADMAP WITH EASIER AND HARDER THINGS. OKAY. GREAT. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS. SO IT WOULD BE GREAT FOR THE DISCUSSION ABOUT THE TESTING, I THINK, WHICH IS NEXT?

WILLIAM BACON: YEAH, THANK YOU, THIS IS BILL BACON, AGAIN, YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS NEXT SECTION FOCUSES ON OUR BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION METHODOLOGY AS THE PROJECT TEAM AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM HAVE CONCEPTUALIZED IT SO FAR. SO, SPEAKING TO YOUR PREVIOUS QUESTION, ADINA, ABOUT FEEDBACK WE'RE SEEKING WE'RE PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN THE FOUR MAIN DIMENSIONS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IN THE CASE EVALUATION THAT ALIGN WITH THE OUTPUTS THAT YOU WOULD BE LOOKING AT IF YOU

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WERE TO EVALUATE THE PROJECT RESULTS WITH THE QUESTIONS THAT WE'RE ASKING AND WE'RE TRYING TO PRODUCE ANALYSIS FOR ARE THE RIGHT QUESTIONS IN THE RIGHT CATEGORIES. SO I THINK THAT'S A PARTICULAR AREA OF FEEDBACK WE WOULD BE REALLY INTERESTED IN. AND AGAIN, AS WE DID IN THE PREVIOUS SECTION, WE CAN TRY TO KEEP THIS INFORMAL AND ASK QUESTIONS AS WE GO THROUGH, SINCE THERE IS A GOOD AMOUNT OF CONTENT HERE AS WELL. SO WE CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, YOU KNOW, THIS PROJECT WAS VERY DELIBERATE IN ITS SCOPE IN THAT IT WAS NOT JUST A STUDY. IT WAS A STUDY AND BUSINESS CASE. AND YOU KNOW, WHAT DOES THAT REALLY MEAN? WHAT IS THAT IN PRACTICE? AND THE BAY AREA HASN'T TRADITIONALLY APPROACHED A LOT OF OUR TRANSPORTATION PLANNING OR TRANSPORTATION POLICY PLANNING EXERCISES THROUGH AS A BUSINESS CASE LENS AND TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW A CERTAIN SET OF POLICY ACTIONS WOULD IMPACT THE REGION FROM A SORT OF THESE FOUR KEY FRAMEWORKS TO THINK ABOUT. AND WHAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED HERE ARE A STRATEGIC ELEMENT, AN ECONOMIC ELEMENT, WHICH IS REALLY A BENEFIT-COST RATIO, A FINANCIAL DIMENSION AND DELIVERY DIMENSION. AND UNDERLYING ALL OF THIS IS THE FOUNDATION OF EQUITY AND TRYING TO ADVANCE EQUITY IN OUR REGION THROUGH POLICY CHANGE OR POLICY DELIVERY. SO, WHAT YOU CAN SEE SORT OF LAID OUT ON THE SLIDE, I LIKE TO CALL THIS SORT OF THE IPHONE SLIDE, IT SORT OF DOES LOOK LIKE A SMARTS PHONE IN MY EYES. SO THE FOUR KEY DIMENSIONS THE ANALYSIS LOOKS AT EACH PART AND FEEDING INTO THAT ARE MODEL OUTPUTS,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DATA FROM TRANSIT OPERATORS, DATA FROM, YOU KNOW, THE REGION AS A WHOLE, POPULATION, ET CETERA, THAT ALL WILL FEED INTO THE ANALYSIS OF EACH OF THE DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS AND HELP INFORM THE CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS THAT THE PROJECT WILL MAKE. YOU KNOW, JUST BECAUSE SOMETHING DOES REALLY WELL OR DOESN'T DO REALLY WELL, A BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS DOESN'T MEAN IT COULDN'T BE A RECOMMENDED ACTION. THE BUSINESS CASE PROCESS IS REALLY A TOOL SO THAT ALL THE STAKEHOLDERS CAN THINK ABOUT THE PROJECTS ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS THROUGH AN ORGANIZED STRUCTURE. SO WE CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO SINCE WE HAVE BEEN TALKING A LITTLE BIT ABOUT MODELING, WHICH CAN OFTEN BE A VERY, SORT OF, OBTUSE PROCESS, FOR MANY FOLKS, INCLUDING PEOPLE WHO WORK IN TRANSPORTATION. IT CAN BE A SORT OF STRANGE CONCEPT TO UNDERSTAND. SO, I -- WE TRIED TO BOIL IT DOWN INTO SOMETHING RELATIVELY SIMPLE HERE TO EXPLAIN WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING. WE ARE GOING TO BE USING MTC'S TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL WHICH IS USED IN PLANNED BAY AREA, AND IS USED BY A NUMBER OF AGENCY AROUND THE BAY AREA IN EVALUATING BOTH OPERATIONAL AND CAPITAL CHANGES TO THEIR SYSTEMS FOR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS, AND SORT OF THE SINGLE MOST IMPORTANT INPUT -- AND THIS IS NOT A COMPREHENSIVE LIST, BUT SOME OF THE INPUTS THAT WILL BE GOING INTO THE MODEL ARE VARIOUS TRAVEL TIMES BY MODE, SO CURRENT TRAVEL TIMES OR SHOULD I SAY PREPANDEMIC TRAVEL TIMES ON VARIOUS TRANSIT SERVICES, TRAVEL TIMES BY SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES, TRAVEL TIMES IN HIGH

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OCCUPANCIY VEHICLES, FOR A RANGE OF MODES AS WELL. AND DEMOGRAPHIC AND KEY GEOGRAPHIC DATA CHANGES IN POPULATION EMPLOYMENT APPEARANCE, AND TRIP APPEARANCE, AND UNFORTUNATELY ALL OF THIS DATA IS BASED ON OUR PREPANDEMIC MODEL IN THE TRAVEL WORLD. THERE ARE SOME, I THINK, PARTS OF THE TRAVEL MODEL THAT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ADAPT A LITTLE BIT TO THE ENVIRONMENT EXPERIENCE IN THE PAST YEAR AND I THINK THAT'S PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT WHEN IT COMES TO EMPLOYMENT AND WHERE PEOPLE ARE WORKING AND THE TRAVEL PATTERNS THAT THEY HAVE TO ACCESS THEIR PLACES OF WORK. FORTUNATELY THERE ARE LIMITATIONS BECAUSE WE REALLY DON'T WHATNOT PANDEMIC -- KNOW WHAT THE TRAVEL WOULD ELECTRIC LIKE WHEN THE PANDEMIC IS OVER SO THERE IS ANALYSIS SORT OF GROUND TESTING ON OUTPUTS OF THIS BASED ON WHAT THE TRAVEL DEMAND MOLD TELLS US. BUT THAT SORT OF CORE SORT OF DEMOGRAPHIC AND ECONOMIC AND TRIP DATA IS ONE OF THE THREE MAIN ELEMENTS OF THE MODEL. AND THEN FINALLY, AND PERHAPS MOST IMPORTANTLY FOR THIS PROJECT ARE THE TRANSIT FARES, AND THE POLICIES THAT ACCOMPANY THOSE FARES. SO BOTH EXISTING FARE POLICIES ACROSS OUR TWO DOZEN PLUS AGENCIES AND THE FARE PRICES, AND ACTUAL POLICIES THEMSELVES CONTAINED IN EACH OF THE OPTION THAT IS THE PROJECT WILL BE STUDYING. SO TOGETHER ALL OF THAT FEEDS INTO THE MODEL WHICH HAS, AGAIN, IT'S -- THERE IS A LOT MORE TO IT THAN WHAT WE BOILED IT DOWN HERE TO SHOW, BUT THE MODEL IS -- YOU KNOW, IT HAS ITS OWN EXISTING STRUCTURE INSTEAD OF ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT HOW THE ENTIRE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE IN THE REGION INTERACTS. AND THE INTENT OF DOING THIS ANALYSIS IS TO PROVIDE AT LEAST SOME WINDOW INTO HOW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP MAY CHANGE AS A RESULT OF THESE FARE POLICY ACTIONS, COMBINED WITH WHAT ARE THE POTENTIAL REVENUE IMPACTS TO TRANSIT AGENCIES IN AGGREGATE, AND AT AN OPERATOR LEVEL OF CHANGES IN FARE POLICY. AND THAT'S REALLY ONE PIECE OF THE ANALYSIS IS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, THROUGH THE MODEL, HOW RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE WOULD BE IMPACTED. YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, BACK ON THAT SORT OF IPHONE SLIDE WITH THE FOUR KEY DIMENSIONS THAT WERE COLOR CODED. THIS IS THE GREEN ELEMENT WHICH WE CALL THE STRATEGIC DIMENSION. AND THIS IS REALLY THINKING ABOUT HOW DOES FARE INTEGRATION MAKE OUR TRANSPORTATION NETWORK WORK BETTER, HOW DOES IT IMPROVE QUALITY OF LIFE IN THE BAY AREA? HOW DOES IT PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN OUR REGION, YOU KNOW, TO BUILD OUR HOUSING IN A SUSTAINABLE WAY, TRYING TO TACKLE OUR HOUSING CRISIS, HOW DOES IT PROMOTE GREATER PROSPERITY AND ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY FOR RESIDENTS LIVING AND WORKING IN THE BAY AREA, PEOPLE VISITING THE BAY AREA, YOU KNOW, HOW DID WE MAKE THE BAY AREA THE BEST PLACE THAT IT CAN BE? YOU CAN SEE THERE ARE A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT THEME AREAS HIGHLIGHTED AND THE NEXT SLIDE GETS INTO A LOT OF DETAIL. BUT I TOUCHED ON SORT OF THE FOUR MAIN THEMES AND IN THOSE ARE CORE ELEMENTS THAT WE WILL BE DOING SIGNIFICANT ANALYSIS O

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NEXT SLIDE I'LL BRIEFLY TOUCH ON IT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. YOU CAN ALL HEAR ME?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YES. WE'RE ON IT.

WILLIAM BACON: THANK YOU. SORRY. MY COMPUTER WASN'T UPDATING THERE. THE STRATEGIC DIMENSION SORT OF MADE UP OF THOSE MAIN THEME AREAS, I JUST TALKED ABOUT A BETTER NETWORK QUALITY OF LIFE AND SUSTAINABLE ENVIRONMENT AND REGIONAL PROSPERITY OR ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY. SO IN THE SORT OF BENEFIT COLUMN YOU SEE HERE IS SPEAKING TO SORT OF HOW WE WANT TO BREAK DOWN EACH OF THOSE MAIN THEMES, AND THE METRICS COLUMN IS REALLY SOLVES THE QUESTIONS OR WAYS WE WANT TO ORGANIZE THE ANALYSIS. THIS IS A LOT OF DETAIL AND AGAIN I DON'T WANT TO GO INTO ALL OF IT BUT I THINK TWO OF THE MAIN AREAS THAT I WANT TO EMPHASIZE FOR THE SUBCOMMITTEE ARE THE EQUITY AND THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. AND FOCUSING IN ON SOME OF THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING THERE. SO, FOR IMPROVEMENTS FOR CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, AS MIKE MENTIONED A FEW MOMENTS AGO USER EXPERIENCE IS A CORE PART OF THIS PROJECT OVERALL, EVEN THOUGH IT SHOWS UP AS ONE BULLET IN THE LONGER CONTENT ON THE SLIDE THE RESEARCH WORK AND SPECIFICALLY THE PROTOTYPING OF THE FARE OPTIONS THAT WE'RE ANALYZING THROUGH THE MODEL IS FOUNDATIONAL TO UNDERSTANDING HOW PEOPLE WOULD EXPERIENCE THE CHANGES THAT WOULD BE IMPLEMENTED IN A SPECIFIC OPTION. IS IT UNDERSTANDABLE? DOES

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT ACTUALLY IMPROVE ANYTHING ABOUT THEIR TRAVEL EXPERIENCE? DOES IT MAKE, YOU KNOW, FROM A COST STANDPOINT, DOES IT MAKE A DIFFERENCE TO THEM IN TERMS OF THE CHANGE, EITHER IN A GOOD WAY OR A BAD WAY, REALLY TRYING TO UNDERSTAND THAT. SO, EACH LINE HERE SORT OF IN THIS MORE SORT OF INTERNAL FACING DOCUMENT, THAT WE WANT TO SHOW YOU SORT OF A GLIMPSE SORT OF AN INSIDE THINKING OF THE PROJECT. THERE IS A LOT OF INDIVIDUAL WORK ELEMENTS INTO THAT. AND SAME TRUE FOR EQUITY. USER RESEARCH IS ALSO FOUNDATIONAL TO OUR EQUITY ANALYSIS AND TRYING TO SPEAK TO DIVERSE AND REPRESENTATIVE GROUPS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS, AND INDIVIDUALS. AS I THINK WE MIGHT HAVE MENTIONED THIS AT THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE LAST MONTH THAT THE PROJECT TEAM ACTUALLY DID HIRE A RECRUITING FIRM, A SORT OF MARKET RESEARCH RECRUITING FIRM TO ASSIST US WITH SOME OF OUR USER RESEARCH WORK SO THAT WE COULD SPECIFICALLY TARGET VERY DIFFICULT TO REACH INDIVIDUALS AND MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE VERY REPRESENTATIVE GROUPS OF PARTICIPANTS FOR OUR USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES AND WE HAVE VERY -- BASED ON THE DATA THAT I HAVE SEEN, WE HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL IN GETTING TO THE VOICES THAT WE WANT TO HEAR FROM AND THROUGHOUT THE PROJECT WE ARE OFFERING COMP SAYING TO PARTICIPANTS AS WELL FOR BEING PART OF OUR USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES. AND I'LL ALSO NOTE THAT, IN TERMS OF THE SORT OF EQUITY ELEMENT HERE, YOU KNOW, WE WANT THE WORK WE'RE DOING IN THIS PROJECT TO BE USEFUL TO ACTUALLY IMPLEMENTING CHANGE. SO IN THE STEPS THAT AGENCIES WOULD HAVE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO TAKE TO DELIVER FARE POLICY PERFORM. SO WE REALLY WANT THE EQUITY METRICS WE LOOK AT TO BE HELPFUL IN THAT PROCESS TO INFORM AND REGULATORY OR, YOU KNOW, BOARD APPROVAL ACTIONS THAT WOULD BE NEEDED TO DELIVER FARE POLICY ACTION. SO WE WANT THE EQUITY AND ANALYSIS THAT WE'RE DOING AS PART OF THIS WORK TO BE USEFUL FOR THAT, SO UNDERSTANDING IMPACTS ON PEOPLE -- I'M SORRY -- ON TRANSIT USERS BASED ON CHARACTERISTIC, LIKE AGE, RACE, DISABILITY STATUS, INCOME, DIFFERENT CATEGORIES LIKE THAT. SO OUR ANALYSIS IS BOTH INFORMATIVE FOR THE PROJECT ITSELF, BUT ALSO FOR DECISIONS THAT MIGHT TAKE PLACE ONCE THE PROJECT IS COMPLETE. YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AND AGAIN, IF FOLKS HAVE QUESTIONS, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HANDS. SO, THE ECONOMIC DIMENSION, WHAT WE REALLY MEAN BY THIS IS, WHAT IS THE ECONOMIC BENEFIT TO INDIVIDUALS AND SOCIETY AS A WHOLE. SO THIS REALLY SPEAKS TO, IF YOU'RE FAMILIAR WITH THE CONCEPT OF A COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS, THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO LOOK AT IN THIS PART OF OUR BUSINESS CASE. AND YOU KNOW, THERE ARE PROJECTS IN THE BAY AREA THAT HAVE UNDERTAKEN COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS, PLANNED BAY AREA HAS UNDERTAKEN COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS FOR CERTAIN TYPES OF PROJECTS IN THE PROJECT FOR THE BETTER PART OF THE LAST DECADE AND THIS ISN'T A COMPREHENSIVE LIST BUT FROM A USER BENEFIT STANDPOINT AND ECONOMIC IMPACTS TO INDIVIDUAL TRAVELERS, TO BUSINESSES, TO SOCIETY AS A WHOLE FROM CHANGES IN TRAVEL TIME, IF MORE PEOPLE TAKE TRANSIT, MAYBE THERE ARE SOME IMPROVEMENT IN TRAVEL TIME IN THE SENSE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IF THERE IS LESS CONGESTION IN AN AREA, MAYBE FARE POLICY THOSE ARE STRETCHES THAT WE'RE THINKING ABOUT. AND EXTERNAL BENEFITS AGAIN CHANGES IN RIDERSHIP DO YOU SEE ANY CHANGES IN EMISSIONS OR CHANGES IN WALKING AND BICYCLING USAGE OR IN TERMS OF ACCESS TO TRANSIT OR OVERALL TRAVEL PATTERNS. SO THAT'S REALLY TRYING TO GET, AGAIN, AT MORE OF A BENEFIT-COST RATIO FOR EACH PROPOSED FARE POLICY OPTION. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THE FINANCIAL DIMENSION IS DIFFERENT FROM THE ECONOMIC DIMENSION, BECAUSE THIS IS REALLY FOCUSED ON WHAT DOES IT COST TO ACTUALLY INTEGRATE FARES OR TO COORDINATE FARES IN A WAY THAT'S DIFFERENT THAN WHAT WE DO NOW? SO, AS SORT OF NOTED HERE IN THE ORANGE BOX ON THE RIGHT OF THIS SLIDE, WE WERE TRYING TO ILLUSTRATE LIKE, WHAT IS THE ACTUAL CASH FLOW CHANGE THAT YOU MIGHT SEE FROM A FARE POLICY ACTION. AND WHAT WOULD THAT MEAN FOR AGENCIES? WHAT WOULD THAT MEAN IN AGGREGATE FOR A REGION AS A WHOLE. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE IS WE'RE REALLY LOOKING AT THIS FROM A REGIONAL STANDPOINT AND TRYING TO THINK ABOUT THE COSTS OF DELIVERING FARE POLICY CHANGE, YOU KNOW, FOR THE BAY AREA, OR FOR WHATEVER THE APPROPRIATE GEOGRAPHY IS FOR AN INDIVIDUAL OPTION. WE'RE NOT THINKING EXCLUSIVELY AGENCY BY AGENCY BUT AS WE DO THE ANALYSIS WE CAN ZERO IN AND THINK ABOUT WHAT WILL THE IMPACTS BE ON BART, WHAT WOULD BE THE IMPACTS ON CALTRAIN SORT OF THINKING OF THIS IN AGGREGATE DOING ANALYSIS CAN WE FIGURE OUT THE PROBLEMS FOR THE BAY AREA AS A WHOLE AND CAN WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FIGURE OUT DOLLARS AND CENTS FOR INDIVIDUALS AGENCIES THAT CAN WORK FOR THE WHOLE. I THINK THE AGENCY HAS GOTTEN BOGGED DOWN WITHOUT LOOKING AT INDIVIDUAL AGENCY WITHOUT LOOKING AT THE BIG PICTURE AND WE'RE TRYING TO ZERO IN ON THE BIG PICTURE AND THEN ZERO IN ON MORE DIMENSION. THIS IS FOCUSED ON WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DELIVER THE OPTION THAT WE'RE ANALYZING IN THAT SITUATION. SO, HOW WOULD IT WORK FROM A MANAGEMENT STANDPOINT IN TERMS OF ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF SETTING FARE POLICY OR IF THERE WAS A COMMON LOCAL FARE ACROSS THE REGION, HOW WOULD THAT ACTUALLY WORK? HOW COULD WE PRACTICALLY DELIVER THAT. WHAT ARE THE CHANGES THAT WE WOULD NEED TO MAKE TO ANY CAPITAL ASSETS TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER A CHANGE. SO MIKE TOUCHED ON THAT A MOMENT AGO. IF YOU HAD TO TAG OFF ON A LOCAL BUS TRIP, YOU KNOW, MOST OF OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES DON'T HAVE CLIPPER MACHINES AT THE REAR DOOR. SO IF YOU WERE REQUIRING PASSENGERS TO TAG ON AND TAG OFF, PHYSICALLY WITH A CARD OR THEIR SMART PHONE, WOULD YOU NEED TO INVEST IN CLIPPER READERS, OR SOME OTHER TYPE OF TECHNOLOGY FOR TRANSIT VEHICLES? YOU KNOW, ARE THERE ISSUES AROUND, YOU KNOW, BEING ABLE TO ACTUALLY IMPLEMENT, YOU KNOW, THE ACTION IN CLIPPER TWO. I THINK I'M PRETTY CONFIDENT THAT ALL THE OPTIONS WE'RE CONSIDERING ARE VERY DELIVERABLE IN CLIPPER TWO, BECAUSE THERE ARE VARYING LEVELS OF COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH BEING ABLE TO DO THAT AND TECHNOLOGICAL IMPLEMENTATION COMPLEXITIES FOR USERS. AND FINALLY THE DOWNSIDE RISKS ASSOCIATED WITH DIFFERENT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MODELS IN TERMS OF INTELLIGENCE, AND BEING ABLE TO DEPLOY A FARE POLICY CHANGE IN A WAY THAT BOTH STAFF AND CUSTOMERS CAN BENEFIT FROM IS AN IMPORTANT ELEMENT TO THINK ABOUT TOO. SO WE'RE ALMOST DONE HERE IN THIS SECTION. IF WE GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE, THIS SLIDE IS JUST AN EXAMPLE OF SORT OF HOW, YOU KNOW, A SUMMARY OF SOME OF THE BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS MIGHT BE PRESENTED ONE MORE SLIDE, THIS IS AN EXAMPLE OF A FARE POLICY ANALYSIS THAT WAS DONE IN TORONTO, IN CANADA, BY OUR SAME CONSULTANT TEAM, AND YOU CAN SEE HERE HOW IT'S BROKEN DOWN IN A SIMILAR WAY TO WHAT WE JUST TALKED ABOUT AND THIS WOULD BE A SUMMARY, SOMETHING YOU WOULD SEE IN THE EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF OUR FINAL REPORT. BUT YOU KNOW, THIS GIVES YOU SORT OF THAT BREAK DOWN AND WHERE WE WOULD ACTUALLY BE GOING WITH THIS IS IN THE FINAL REPORT DOCUMENT ITSELF, YOU WOULD SEE DETAILED, YOU KNOW, CHAPTERS, FOR EACH DIFFERENT ELEMENT OF THE BUSINESS CASE, STRATEGIC, ECONOMIC, FINANCIAL, AND THE DELIVERABILITY, IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSION. SO THAT, I THINK, THAT'S THE LAST SLIDE OF THIS SECTION. BUT WE'RE HAPPY TO DISCUSS AND ASK QUESTIONS -- ANSWER QUESTIONS FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND THE PUBLIC. I THINK YOU'RE MUTED ADINA.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: YEAH, WE'LL TAKE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS FIRST FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND THEN FROM THE PUBLIC. I'M GOING TO HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS, BUT WOULD LIKE TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GO LAST, IF ANYBODY HAS ANY THOUGHTS, PLEASE DO RAISE YOUR HAND. JONATHON?

JONOTHON KASS: THANK YOU. JUST TWO THINGS. I GUESS, SEEING THIS EXAMPLE THAT YOU'RE, THE CONSULTANT HAS DONE THIS SAME THING WITH THESE SAME FOUR CATEGORIES OF EVALUATION. [LAUGHTER] SEEMS LIKE IT'S ALL WORKED OUT. BUT -- SO IT WORKS. IN SOME WAYS, THE FINANCIAL CASE SEEMS -- IT FEELS A LITTLE BIT PART OF DELIVERABILITY. AGAIN IT'S POSSIBLE THAT THERE IS FINANCIAL COSTS TO DOING THIS THAT YOU CAN'T PAY FOR EVEN IF THERE IS A HIGH BENEFIT-COST, BECAUSE THE BENEFITS ARE NOT -- THERE IS NO WAY TO GET INCOME FOR THOSE BENEFITS. SO YOU JUST MAYBE CAN'T AFFORD IT. BUT IT'S SORT OF -- IT FEELS A LITTLE BIT LIKE A COMPONENT OF DELIVERABILITY.

WILLIAM BACON: I'LL JUST SAY I WOULDN'T FOCUS TOO MUCH ON THE SPECIFIC ANALYSIS THAT YOU'RE SEEING HERE IN THIS SAMPLE SLIDE AND MAYBE WE SHOULD GO BACK TO SORT OF THE IPHONE SLIDE, SLIDE 19. YOU KNOW, I THINK IN THE TORONTO CASE, THEY HAD A VERY SPECIFIC POLICY, SORT OF GUIDANCE ABOUT THE FINANCIAL CONSTRAINTS THAT THEY COULD EXAMINE IN THAT PROJECT THERE WAS A REVENUE NEUTRAL ANALYSIS AND A SORT OF 5% OF TOTAL REVENUE THAT THEY COULD PLAY WITH AS THE INVESTMENT AMOUNT FOR HOW THEY WOULD CHANGE FARE POLICY. SO I THINK THAT REALLY LEAD THEM TO THE SPECIFIC ANALYSIS STRUCTURE THAT THEY HAD THERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND OUR STRUCTURE HERE IS NOT EXACTLY THE SAME. I ACTUALLY THINK IT'S PRETTY DIFFERENT IN A LOT OF WAYS EVEN IF THESE HEADLINE NAMES ARE VERY SIMILAR OR THE SAME, THE DETAILS UNDERNEATH IT ARE QUITE DIFFERENT. BECAUSE WHAT WE'RE REALLY FOCUSING ON IS IF WE WERE TO DESIGN A NEW FARE POLICY FOR THE REGION, YOU KNOW, HOW WOULD WE DO THAT? AND HOW WOULD WE DELIVER IT IN A WAY THAT'S BENEFICIAL TO CUSTOMERS. I'M HEARING SOME FEEDBACK. I DON'T KNOW IF WHEN IT'S MUTED -- OKAY. IT'S BETTER. I THINK OUR CONSULTANT HAS EXPERIENCED DOING A BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS WHICH IS ONE OF THE REASONS WHY, YOU KNOW, I THINK THE TEAM ENDED UP SELECTING THAT CONSULTANT, YOU KNOW, TO WORK ON THIS PROJECT, BUT WE HAVE A DIFFERENT REMIT IN THE SENSE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO GROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND WE WANT TO UNDERSTAND THIS SORT OF BROAD RANGE OF IDEAS FROM, YOU KNOW, OPTION SIX, HONEYCOMB ZONES, AND THE LOCAL FLAT FARE, THAT'S REALLY A FUNDAMENTAL CHANGE TO OUR ENTIRE FARE POLICY AND MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE FOR FARES, DOWN TO, YOU KNOW, ARE THERE WAYS THAT WE COULD REDUCE TRANSFER PENALTIES, AND THAT'S A VERY DIFFERENT AGREEMENT THAN WHAT THEY HAVE DONE IN TORONTO.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANKS. DOES ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS? QUESTIONS ON THE BODY, IF YOU DO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND, IF NOT I'M GOING TO START SOME. AND RAISE YOUR UNDERSTAND WHAT -- HAND WHEN I'M IN THE MIDDLE. ANOTHER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

QUESTION ABOUT USER RESEARCH, AND THESE IDEAS ARE MUCH MORE CONCRETE THAN WHAT WE SHOWED PREVIOUSLY BUT IN ORDER FOR SOMEONE TO EVALUATE THEM THERE'S AN INTERACTIVE ELEMENT TO BE, LIKE, YOU KNOW, LIKE, HOW WOULD THIS EFFECT MY COST, HOW WOULD THIS AFFECT SOME OTHER ASPECT OF MY TRAVEL? SO ONE QUESTION I HAVE IS, IS THAT -- IS THE USER RESEARCH ASPECT BEING DONE IN THAT KIND OF AN INTERACTIVE MANNER? I'LL BUNDLE ALL MY QUESTIONS, THEN YOU CAN TAKE THEM IN WHATEVER ORDER YOU WANT TO. ALSO, INTERESTINGLY, IT'S REALLY GREAT TO SEE ALL OF THE USER RESEARCH BEING DONE FOR THIS PROJECT INCLUDING MAKING SURE TO BRING IN PEOPLE IN, YOU KNOW, USER CATEGORIES AND SO ON THAT YOU ARE LOOKING FOR, IS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS ARE THERE ANY RECOMMENDATIONS THAT YOU WILL BE MAKING IN TERMS OF INSTITUTIONALIZING THE PRACTICES OF USER RESEARCH THAT ARE BEING PIONEERED HERE IN THIS STUDY? LET'S SEE. AND SIMILARLY, IF THIS IS A ROADMAP PIECE OF THE RECOMMENDATION, WILL THERE BE ANY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR HOW TO ITERATE BASED ON WHAT IS FOUND OUT FROM THE INITIAL STEPS? LET ME SEE. I AM GLAD THAT THE, YOU KNOW, AGENCY BY AGENCY COST IS NOT SEEN AS A, YOU KNOW, PRELIMIT ON THIS STUDY THAT DID LIMIT SOME PREVIOUS STUDY SO I'M GLAD THAT'S NOT AS A LIMIT AND JONATHON HAD SAID I THINK YOU COULD COME UP WITH SOMETHING, IT WOULD COST A TRILLION DOLLAR, AND I THINK THERE ARE SOME PRICE TAGS THAT WOULD BE CONSIDERED OUT OF SCOPE BUT THERE ARE SOME PRICE TAGS THAT IF THEY HAD EXTREME BENEFITS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THAT WOULD BE A POLITICAL QUESTION IN THE BROADER SENSE OF POLITICS, LIKE WHAT KINDS OF DECISIONS ARE WE LOOKING TO MAKE IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE THE BENEFITS THAT WE WANT TO. IN TERMS OF THE USER RESEARCH, ARE YOU SPEAKING TO INSTITUTIONS AS WELL AS INDIVIDUALS? SO, FOR EXAMPLE, I WAS TALKING TO SOMEONE WHO WAS INVOLVED IN A SIGNIFICANT UNIVERSITY IN THE CITY OF SAN JOSE, AND THEY WERE TALKING ABOUT THE TRAVEL NEEDS OF SOME OF THEIR WORKERS AND EMPLOYEES THAT ARE NOT MET BY THE TRANSIT SYSTEM, AND I SEE THAT THERE IS SOME INSTITUTIONAL PASSES THAT ARE HERE. SO I'M WONDERING IF THE USER RESEARCH INCLUDES TALKING TO THE INSTITUTIONS? AND I WILL ADD ONE MORE THING INTO THE BUNDLE, AND THEN I'LL STOP, AND THEN I'LL ASK ONE MORE QUESTION BEFORE I'M DONE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR PATIENCE IN LISTENING TO THESE VARIOUS QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. MY -- THE LAST QUESTION IN THIS BUNDLE IS, I'M REALLY GLAD TO SEE THAT THE TOPIC OF A RISK IS SEPARATED OUT FROM THE TOPIC OF COST, BECAUSE IN IMPLEMENTATION, THOSE ARE POTENTIALLY VERY DIFFERENT BUCKETS OF THINGS. SO, YOU MIGHT HAVE SOMETHING THAT MIGHT BE REVENUE POSITIVE, BUT WOULD HAVE SOME KIND OF A START-UP RISK. AND IN THAT CASE, THE MITIGATION TO ENSURE AGAINST THE START-UP RISK IS REALLY DIFFERENT FROM THE COST OF SOMETHING THAT IS EXPECTED TO HAVE JUST A NET COST. SO I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR FRAMING IT IN THAT WAY AND WOULD HOPE THAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS WOULD SIMILARLY SEPARATE OUT RISKS AND MITIGATIONS VERSUS THE OVERALL COSTS. I WILL STOP THERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOOK FORWARD TO ANY ANSWERS YOU HAVE TO THE QUESTIONS THEY ASKED, AND THEN BACK TO ONE LAST QUESTION, UNLESS ANYBODY ELSE HAS A HAND, IN WHICH CASE I'LL TAKE THAT FIRST.

WILLIAM BACON: THANKS ADINA. I WAS TRYING TO TAKE NOTES HERE IF I MISS SOMETHING IN MY RESPONSES JUST REMIND ME. FIRST OFF INSTITUTIONALIZING USE RESEARCH AND HAVING A PROCESS FOR DOING THAT. I'M NOT SURE THE PROJECT TEAM HAS TALKED PARTICULARLY WITH HOW WE WOULD DO THAT, BUT, I THINK, I'LL BE COMPLETELY HONEST WITH EVERYONE THIS HAS BEEN A LEARNING PROCESS FOR THE PROJECT TEAM AND DOING USER WORK THE WAY WE HAVE BEEN DOING IT AND WE ARE WORKING WITH CONSULTANTS AND RESEARCH SPECIALIST AND PROFESSIONALS AND THAT HAS BEEN A LEARNING EXPERIENCE AND IT'S GOING TO BE BENEFICIAL, WITH THE AGENCIES MTC BART, SAMTRANS WHICH HAS BEEN INVOLVED FROM BEGINNING AND I THINK THERE IS A LOT OF VALUE IN WHAT WE HAVE BEEN DOING. I'M NOT SURE I COULD ANSWER YOUR QUESTION IN HOW WE COULD INSTITUTIONALIZE IT BUT HAVING THE EXPERIENCE OF THIS WORK AND HAVING THE TOUCH OF MULTIPLE TRANSIT OPERATORS AT MTC SHARES THAT EXPERIENCE IN A WAY THAT IT'S MUCH MORE LIKELY THAT USER RESEARCH WILL GO BEYOND THE AGENDA FOR FUTURE WORK. AND I THINK THAT FEEDS INTO SOME OF THE BROADER DISCUSSIONS AT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE TOO, BUT I'M NOT REALLY SURE I CAN SPECIFICALLY GIVE YOU A COMMITMENT ABOUT HOW IT COULD BE INSTITUTIONALIZED. BUT IT'S A GOOD THOUGHT, AND WE CAN THINK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ABOUT A WAY IF THERE IS A WAY TO TALK ABOUT IT IN THE FINAL REPORT. I THINK YOU HAD ANOTHER QUESTION ABOUT HOW TO ITERATE IN THE SENSE OF DIFFERENT OPTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WOULD BE SORT OF THE CONCLUSION FROM THE WORK, AND I THINK -- CORRECT ME IF I'M NOT ANSWERING THE QUESTION IN THE WAY THAT YOU MEANT IT, BUT I ASSUME THE WAY YOU MEANT IT IS THAT THERE ARE DIFFERENT LAYERS IN IMPLEMENTATION BOTH FROM A TECHNICAL AND PHYSICAL DEPLOYMENT PERSPECTIVE AND ALSO HOW YOU WOULD AFFECT CHANGE AND I THINK IT'S LIKELY THAT OUR WORK WILL TALK ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS THROUGH A SORT OF TIMELINE PERSPECTIVE. YOU KNOW, THERE ARE NOT A LOT OF EXAMPLES OF FARE POLICY CHANGE IN LARGE REGIONS LIKE THE BAY AREA WHERE JUST WENT FROM THE STATUS QUO TO SOMETHING RADICALLY DIFFERENT IN ONE DAY. YOU KNOW, IT'S A PROCESS TO DELIVERING CHANGE. SO I THINK WE'RE VERY FOCUSED ON WHAT ARE SOME -- WHAT ARE SOME LIKELY, SORT OF, NEAR-TERM DELIVERY ACTIONS WE CAN DO AND BE ABLE TO BASE OUR ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ON HOW WE CAN THINK ABOUT DELIVERY THAT WAY. SO WHAT CAN WE DO IN THE NEARER TERM, WHETHER THAT'S, YOU KNOW, BETWEEN NOW AND 2023, LIKE THE VERY, VERY NEAR-TERM, OR, YOU KNOW, WITH CLIPPER TWO IN 2023, AND WHAT ARE SORT OF THE EXPECTATIONS THAT WEEKEND DO IN -- THAT WE COULD DO IN THAT TIME FRAME, WHAT ARE THE EXPECTS FOR C TWO AND WHAT ARE EXPECTATIONS WE CAN DO FOR DIFFERENT MANAGEMENT OR GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES ARE FUNDING STRUCTURES IN THE REGION WHERE THERE IS ADDITIONAL FUND THAT'S ABLE TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SUPPORT THEIR POLICY CHANGE THE PROJECT TEAM SINGLING ABOUT IT ALL AT THOSE DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS AND WE'RE FOCUSED ON WHAT COMES RIGHT AFTER THIS AND HOW WE MOVE FORWARD. DOES THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: YES.

WILLIAM BACON: AND THE QUESTION ABOUT INSTITUTIONS, OUR USER RESEARCH CONSULTANTS ARE REACHING OUT TO SOME INSTITUTIONS WHEN WE FOCUS ON PROTOTYPING INSTITUTIONAL BUSINESS PRODUCTS THAT WE'RE THINKING ABOUT WHETHER THAT'S EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS UNIVERSITIES COLLEGES, BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT AIR DISTRICTS CHAMBERS OF COMMERCE, EMPLOYERS, AND IMPORTANTLY DEVELOPERS, AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS, FOR PROFIT DEVELOPERS, ET CETERA. THOSE ARE THE KINDS OF GROUPS THAT MIGHT FIT INTO THAT INSTITUTIONAL CATEGORY AND I THINK WE'LL ASK OUR USER RESEARCH CONSULTANTS TO ENGAGE WITH STAKEHOLDERS FROM SOME OF THOSE GROUPS. AND YOUR STATEMENT ABOUT RISK. I'M NOT SURE THERE WAS MUCH OF A QUESTION, THERE WAS MORE OF A COMMENT?

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: YES.

WILLIAM BACON: OKAY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: GREAT. I GUESS I WOULD MAKE, BASED ON YOUR ANSWER, I WOULD RECOMMEND THAT TAKING THINGS LIKE LEARNING FROM THE USER RESEARCH, PUTTING IT INTO THE RECOMMENDATION SECTION OF THE REPORT. LIKE, IF THE TEAMS HAVE DECIDED, WOW, THIS IS SOMETHING REALLY GREAT, I WISH THAT WE HAD THE INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY TO DO MORE OF THIS ON AN ONGOING BASIS, THAT WOULD BE A THING TO INCLUDE IN THE CONCLUSIONS AS A CAPABILITY, THAT AS A REGION WE MIGHT WANT TO HAVE. SO, I DON'T SEE ANYBODY ELSE'S HAND. PLEASE DO RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU WANT TO ASK A QUESTION BEFORE I ASK MY LAST QUESTION.

JONOTHON KASS: I HAD ONE MORE QUESTION, BUT I CAN'T GET MY HAND RAISED.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. GO AHEAD.

JONOTHON KASS: JUST WITH -- I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE I UNDER -- THE BIG PREMISE HERE THAT A BUNCH OF PEOPLE DON'T USE TRANSIT OR DON'T USE TRANSIT AS MUCH BECAUSE IT'S COMPLICATED AND FARES ARE ONE PIECE OF WHAT'S COMPLICATED, ONE OBVIOUSLY ASSUMES THAT THAT CASCADES INTO THE COST BENEFIT OF A WHOLE BUNCH OF SIMPLIFICATION PIECES BUT THAT'S NOT REALLY CAPTURED IN THE MODEL AND COEFFICIENT ASSUMPTIONS THAT WE USE TODAYS. I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND THE USER RESEARCH FITTING IN. DOES THE USER RESEARCH ABOUT HOW PEOPLE RESPOND TO THE BENEFITS OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FARE SIMPLICITY OR THE NEGATIVE OF THE FARE COMPLEXITY, DOES THAT LEAD YOU TO DO SOME QUANTIFIED ESTIMATE OF WHAT THE EFFECT WOULD BE SIMPLIFICATION, AND DOES THAT QUANTIFY IN A QUALIFIED WAY OR A QUALITATIVE WAY?

WILLIAM BACON: GOOD QUESTION. THE SHORT ANSWER IS IT'S BOTH QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE, WHICH REALLY IS A MODEL EXERCISE IN THE TRIAL OF MTC'S TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL, IT DOES HAVE THE CAPABILITY OF TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW FARE CHANGES IN POLICY IMPACT RIDERSHIP AND BUILT BOO -- INTO THAT, THIS IS MODELING LANGUAGE THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND, BUT OUR TRAVEL DEMAND MODELERS, HAVE BUILT IN ASSUMPTIONS THAT IF THERE ARE FEWER STEPS REQUIRED IN COMPLETING A TRIP THEN THAT COULD BE MULTIPLE PAYMENT ACTIONS IN THE MODEL, WHERE YOU'RE PAYING A FARE HERE AND TRANSFERRING THERE, YOU KNOW, TO COMPLETE A TRANSFER, I SHOULD SAY, THAT REDUCES THE LIKELIHOOD THAT PEOPLE WILL USE THAT SERVICE IN THE MODEL, WHICH WOULD THEN EITHER HAVE THEM NOT TAKE THE TRIP OR TAKE A DIFFERENT TRIP OR USE A DIFFERENT MODE TO COMPLETE THE TRIP. IT'S SORT OF LIKE FRICTION ON THE JOURNEY. SO MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT SOME OF THE CHANGES IN FARE POLICY THAT THESE OPTIONS, YOU KNOW, CONTAIN, WOULD MODIFY THAT FRICTION. ESPECIALLY WHEN TRANSFERRING BETWEEN AGENCIES, WHICH WOULD MAKE THE -- WOULD MAKE AN INDIVIDUAL IN THE MODEL MORE LIKELY TO USE THAT SERVICE, YOU KNOW, ON TRANSIT. SO THERE ARE A LOT OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LIMITATIONS TO THAT. A TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL IS NOT AN ORACLE. IT ISN'T THE ANSWER TO ALL OF OUR QUESTIONS. IT'S ONE ANALYTICAL TOOL, AND THERE ARE SOME AREAS WHERE IT'S A LOT STRONGER AT BEING ABLE TO PROVIDE ANALYSIS, AND OTHER AREAS WHERE I THINK IT'S A LOT WEAKER, AND I THINK DEFINITELY A USER EXPERIENCE, CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE PERSPECTIVE, IS AN AREA WHERE IT'S NOT THE RIGHT TOOL TO LOOK AT AS YOUR ONLY SOURCE OF BENEFIT. YOU KNOW, I WILL NOTE, JUST BECAUSE IT'S RELATED TO FARE POLICY, AS A PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND THE MODELING THAT WAS DONE FOR THE PLAN, THERE WAS A STRATEGY RELATED TO CHANGES IN FARE POLICY, AND IT DID SHOW A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP FROM FARE POLICY CHANGE. SO THAT, YOU KNOW, THE MODELING OUTPUTS THERE RELATED TO INCREASED USAGE, BASED ON HAVING, I THINK, WHAT WAS INCLUDED IN THE MODEL THERE WAS ESSENTIALLY A ZONE BASED SYSTEM, IF THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT TRANSITION, WHICH INCLUDED CHANGES TO PRICE, CHANGES TO THE SORT OF FRICTION IN TERMS OF MAKING TRANSFERS, ALL OF THAT SHOWED UP IN INCREASED RIDERSHIP. BUT I CAN'T TELL YOU EXACTLY HOW THAT WILL PLAY OUT FOR ALL OF THE SIX OPTIONS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IN THIS PROJECT ALONG WITH EACH OF THE VARIANTS. BUT THERE WILL BE SOMETHING THAT THE TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL TELLS BUS THAT. DOES THAT GET AT A LITTLE BIT OF YOUR QUESTION JONATHON, I DON'T KNOW IF WITH THE WAY I ANSWERED IT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JONOTHON KASS: THAT'S GREAT. SOUNDS VERY POSITIVE. I THINK ONE BASIC -- I THINK YOU ANSWERED IT A LITTLE BIT BUT I DIDN'T FULLY UNDERSTAND, WHAT YOU'RE MODELING EACH OF THESE OPTIONS BASED ON THE OUTCOME OF THE MODEL, THERE IS -- DO I UNDERSTAND THAT IT'S POSSIBLE, THEN, TO RECOMMEND TO PIECE -- TAKE SOME SUB-PIECES OF THESE AND PAIR THEM TOGETHER. IS THAT RIGHT?

WILLIAM BACON: YEAH. AND MIKE, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WANT TO CHIME IN?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: YOU'RE RIGHT ON THAT ONE. FOR EXAMPLE, WE COULD EASILY RECOMMEND PAIRING A DISCOUNT DOUBLE FARE OPTION WITH A, YOU KNOW, CLIPPER START A ACCUMULATOR OPTION. RIGHT? THESE THINGS COULD BE PAIRED, AND THERE'S NOTHING ABOUT THE MODELING EXERCISE THAT PRECLUDES THAT. THE OTHER THING IS -- I THINK THIS IS CLEAR FROM WHAT BILL SAID, THE MODEL OUTPUT ITSELF IS NOT THE SOLE BASIS OF THE RECOMMENDATION. SO WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO MODEL OUTPUT COMBINE WITH OTHER CONSIDERATIONS IN THE BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS FOR EXAMPLE, USER RESEARCH FINDINGS, AND IMPLEMENTATION BARRIERS, ET CETERA, AND WE'LL MAKE INFORMED RECOMMENDATIONS, YOU KNOW, THAT INCLUDED INPUT FROM STAKEHOLDERS. SO IT'S NOT A -- IT'S NOT A, LIKE, PUT THE NUMBERS IN AND TURN THE CRANK AND PICK THE TOP OPTION. IS THAT WHERE YOU'RE HEADED, JONATHON?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JONOTHON KASS: THE MODEL WHERE THERE ARE FIRM BOUNDARIES BETWEEN ACTIONS, RIGHT?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: ABOUT THE MODELING, EVERYTHING ABOUT -- MY UNDERSTANDING THE WAY THE MODEL WORKS IS SIMILAR TO BILLS BUT THE PRIMARY DRIVER EXPLAINED TO ME IN TRAVEL BEHAVIOR RELATES TO FARE POLICY PRICE, THE BIGGEST DIFFERENCES IN TRAVEL BEHAVIOR ARE GOING TO COME FROM THINGS THAT ARE SIMPLY CHEAPER OR MORE EXPENSIVE AND PART OF THE REASON IS THAT DON'T HAVE A GREAT EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE THAT SIMPLICITY DRIVES TRAVEL BEHAVIOR. IT'S A COMPLEX ISSUE AND WOULD BE A HARD THING TO DEMONSTRATE. IF WE HAVE THAT, IT WOULD BE GREAT TO SEE RESOURCES THAT FOLKS HAVE ON THE APPLICATION SPECIFICALLY.

WILLIAM BACON: I'LL ADD TO THAT. I COMPLETELY AGREE WITH WHAT YOU'RE SAYING IN TERMS OF HOW YOU CAN TRANSLATE THAT INTO A MODEL WHERE BOTH THE USER EXPERIENCE AND PRICE SORT OF INTERSECT JUST LIKE AS A REAL-WORLD EXACT, IF YOU WERE MAKING A JOURNEY ON CALTRAIN FROM PALO ALTO AND YOUR FINAL DESTINATION IS OAKLAND AND THAT'S TRANSFERRING TO BART AND MILLBRAE, RIGHT NOW YOU'RE GOING TO BE PAYING A FARE BASED ON TWO DIFFERENT SYSTEMS WITH TWO DIFFERENT FARE POLICIES IF THAT WAS WITHIN ONE STRUCTURE AS SOME OF THE OPTIONS TALK ABOUT SOME OF THAT FRICTION IN THERE IS REDUCED AND SOME OF THAT SHOWS UP IN PRICE. AND DOES THAT CHANGER RIDERSHIP. SO I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMPLETELY AGREE. THIS IS REALLY -- DIGGING INTO THE WEEDS OF THE MODEL. SO THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT THAT IS NOT BE OUR ONLY TOUCH STONE BUT ONE OF THE MANY PIECES OF DATA THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: AND PLEASE BE REASSURED THAT WE'RE INCLUDING OUR CONSULTANTS IN USING THE MODEL AND OTHER TYPES OF INFORMATION AND TAKE EVERYTHING WITH AN APPROPRIATE GRAIN OF SALT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: KIND OF A PROFESSIONAL SALT SHAKER. MY LAST QUESTION IS KIND OF ABOUT PRESENTATION AND COMMUNICATIONS AND MAYBE SOME BIT OF POLITICS, AND THEN WE'LL -- UNLESS ANYBODY HAS ANY OTHER QUESTIONS WE'LL MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT. WHICH IS THAT, IN, LIKE, DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION, ONE AREA WHERE WE SEE, YOU KNOW, ADVOCACY FOR FARE CHANGE, IS ABOUT FOR FREE FARES ON LOCAL SERVICE, WHICH IS -- YOU KNOW, IS SOMETHING THAT WOULD PROVIDE A COST BENEFIT TO A SET OF PEOPLE AND WOULD NOT, YOU KNOW, CHANGE THE ACCESS PEOPLE HAVE BEYOND ANY PARTICULAR AGENCY THAT WENT FARE FREE I'M WONDERING, HARMONIZING LOCAL FARES MAY SEEM POLITICALLY DIFFICULT BUT ON THE OTHER HAND COMPARED TO THE COST OF GOING FARE FREE -- LIKE, I'M JUST WONDERING WHETHER THERE WILL WIND UP BEING SOME PRESENTATION ABOUT, YOU KNOW, ALTERNATIVES THAT, YOU KNOW, CONSIDER, YOU KNOW, GOING -- GOING FARE FREE LOCALLY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND MAKING NO OTHER CHANGES VERSUS SOME OF THE OTHER CHANGES THAT WOULD INCREASE ACCESS AND OPPORTUNITY.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: I MEAN --

WILLIAM BACON: GO AHEAD, MIKE.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: THE LOCAL ADVOCACY ON FARE FREE HAS SHIFTED SINCE WE STARTED THIS PROJECT. WE HAVE ELIMINATED FROM OUR LONG LIST FREE FARES ALL TOGETHER, QUITE A WHILE AGO. MAYBE I SHOULD LET YOU SPEAK TO THIS BILL. I DON'T KNOW THAT WE HAVE NECESSARILY INTEGRATED THE MORE RECENT ADVOCACY ON FREE FARE IN SAN FRANCISCO AT THE MOMENT WE DON'T NECESSARILY PLAN TO MAKE THAT COMPARISON. BILL? IS THAT RIGHT?

WILLIAM BACON: I THINK THAT'S RIGHT, MIKE. AS YOU SAID, WE DID EARLY ON IN THE PROJECT AND WE TALKED ABOUT IT AND THE SUBCOMMITTEE DECIDED NOT TO MOVE FORWARD WITH A FREE FARE SORT OF OPTION. YOU KNOW, I THINK THE WAY YOU FRAMED IT, ADINA, AS IF YOU HAD A SPECTRUM OF A COMMON LOCAL FLAT FARE, HAD YOU FREE FARES, YOU HAD, PERHAPS -- WELL IF YOU DIDN'T HAVE THE SINGLE LOCAL FARE YOU SAID EACH AGENCY HAS ITS OWN LOCAL FARE BUT THAT LOCAL FARE IS TRANSFERRABLE TO ANY OTHER LOCAL AGENCY MAYBE MUNI IS 250 AND SAMTRANS 25 YOU COULD -- THERE IS A SPECTRUM OF DIFFERENT LEVELS OF CHANGE OR IMPLEMENTATION COST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MAYBE. SO, I DON'T KNOW. I MEAN, I THINK YOU PROBABLY WILL TALK ABOUT SOME OF OUR RECOMMENDATIONS ON SORT OF A SPECTRUM. ON THE FREE TRANSIT QUESTION, I'M NOT SURE. SINCE IT'S SORT OF -- WE DECIDED THAT WE DIDN'T WANT TO DO THAT ANALYSIS EARLY ON. I MEAN, IF THE SUBCOMMITTEE HAS RECOMMENDATIONS OR A SUGGESTION ABOUT THAT, WE WOULD BE OPEN TO LISTENING.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. SO I THINK THERE IS A -- I THINK THERE ARE VARIANTS HERE THAT MIGHT MAKE THE BASIS ZONE ZERO OR A VARIANT THAT MAKES THE BASE ZONE A BUNCH LOWER, ALONG WITH OTHER CHANGES. AND BEING ABLE TO COMPARE THOSE, I THINK WOULD BE HMM IN THE SPECTRUM OF IDEAS THAT ARE CIRCULATING. OKAY. DO I -- I AM NOT SEEING ANY OTHER HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PANEL. I SEE A HAND FROM A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC. ROLAND LEBRUN, CAN WE HAVE ROLAND?

SPEAKER: THANK YOU MIKE AND BILL FOR THE PRESENTATION. I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE ECONOMY DIMENSION AND HOW PEOPLE DON'T EVEN SAN MATEO COUNTY -- CALTRAIN. LET'S START WITH THE BASICS, GOOGLE MAPS AND START AT SANTA THERESA LIGHT HAIL AND DESTINATION 375 BEALE STREET THE TRANSIT TIME IS GOING TO BE TWO HOURS 15 MINUTES DRIVE IS ONE IN TEN MINUTES BASICALLY MEANS YOU LOSE ONE HOUR IN EACH DIRECTION. WE HAVE THE BABY BULLETS PREPANDEMIC AND GO AT 150% OF CAPACITY AND THIS GENERATES A NET POSITIVE CASH FLOW DIRECTLY RESPONSIBLE FOR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE RECOVERY, THESE TRAINS HAVE YET TO BE REINTRODUCED BY SAMTRANS AND THEIR ABSENCE IS A PRIMARY REASON WHY CALTRAIN IS STUCK AT 5% WHEN CAPITAL CORRIDOR HAVE RECOVERED TO 19% BECAUSE THEY DIDN'T CHANGE THEIR SERVICE PATTERN. I'M GOING TO WRAP UP HERE WITH A QUESTION FOR MIKE AND BILL. IN CALTRAIN, CALTRAIN RUNS MIX TRAFFIC AND SOME OF THAT MIX TRAFFIC IS ESSENTIALLY INTERCITY TRAFFIC. AND HOW IS IT POSSIBLE, THERE, IN THE MODEL, AND ARE WE GOING INTO DISINTEGRATION TO ACCOUNT FOR THAT, SO CHARGING A CITIZEN FARE FOR, I GUESS LOCAL OR REGIONAL OR WHATEVER THEY CALL IT, AND THEN THESE PEOPLE WANT TO GO REALLY, REALLY FAST BETWEEN SAN FRANCISCO AND GILROY, AND I'M GOING TO CLOSE UP AND GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE. I DID A SURVEY ABOUT SIX YEARS AGO AND I MET PEOPLE ON CALTRAIN WHO WERE WILLING TO PAY $20 EACH WAY BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND SAN FRANCISCO AS LONG AS THE SERVICE COULD OPERATE IN 30 MINUTES OR LESS. THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I SEE THAT ALETA DUPREE HAS A HAND. ALETA?

SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR ADINA LEVIN, ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I WAS INSPIRED TODAY WITH THIS IDEA IN FARE INTEGRATION, WHERE I IMAGINE A MAP THAT'S FOUND ON TYPICAL RAILROAD CONTROL BOARDS SUCH AS WHAT WOULD BE FOUND ON THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY AND GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL AND MANY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OTHER PLACES WHERE THE MAP SHOWS TRAINS THAT MOVE ALONG THROUGH INTERVALS, AND I KIND OF IMAGINE THE PASSENGER AS THEY MOVE ALONG THROUGH THE INTERVALS OR BLOCKS, THE LONGER THAT THEY TRAVEL, REGARDLESS OF THE MODE, THE AMOUNT OF FARE IS CALCULATED BASED ON THE NUMBER OF MILES TRAVELED. SO IT EVENS IT OUT FOR PEOPLE, WHETHER THEY ARE TRAVELING FROM A CITY CENTER TO THE SUBURBS, OR WITHIN SUBURBS OR IN CROSS TOWN OR CROSS COMMUNITY SITUATIONS, AS OPPOSED TO SIMPLY CALCULATING IT ON THE HUB AND SPOKE. SO FOR LONGER DISTANCES, WHERE YOU'RE MOVING AWAY FROM A FLAT FARE SYSTEM, SUCH AS WHAT MAY BE FOUND ON MOST BUS SYSTEMS OR ON THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY, THE DISTANCE FACTOR CAN BE PUT IN. IN SUCH I THINK SHOULD BE INCORPORATED WITH A FARE CAPPING IDEAL, IN WHICH AN AVERAGE COULD BE TAKEN OF THESE MOVES IN ORDER TO HAVE SOME KIND OF A CAP, I WOULD SAY. IT'S STILL CLEAR AS MUD, PERHAPS, AT WHAT I'M SAYING, BUT THAT'S KIND OF WHERE I'M SEEING IT GOING. CERTAINLY TECHNOLOGY IS ESSENTIAL, AND I THINK IT'S BEST TO GET THE C TWO DONE SO THAT WE DON'T DISRUPT THINGS ALONG THE WAY. IT'S VERY HARD TO TRY TO GO BACK AND FORTH. SO C2 IS ESSENTIAL IN GETTING OUR CUSTOMERS ON TO C2 BECAUSE EQUITY IS INCLUSIVE. SO THIS IS A DRIVER FOR HELPING PEOPLE OF MODEST MEANS TO GET BANK ACCOUNTS AND VARIOUS OTHER FORMS OF ELECTRONIC BANKING. BECAUSE IT'S TIME TO MOVE AWAY FROM CASH AND PAPER TICKETS. IT'S AN ACCIDENT WAITING TO HAPPEN. THANKS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AGAIN. SOME OF THIS IS STILL CLEAR AS MUD BUT CLEARER THAN BEFORE AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING SOME FARE SCHEDULE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET'S SEE. I THINK THE PREVIOUS POINT FROM THE FIRST MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, IN TERMS OF THE FARE RELATIONSHIP TO SPEED, I THINK WAS SOMETHING THAT THE STUDY WAS GOING TO BE LOOKING AT IN TERMS OF THE USER RESEARCH AND WITH OTHER DIMENSIONS ABOUT HOW THAT RELATES TO EQUITY AND, ACTUALLY, HOW PEOPLE PERCEIVE VALUE. SO I HOPE THAT DOES COME OUT IN WHAT WE GET FROM SOME OF THE USER RESEARCH. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE BODY. IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE THAT STAFF WOULD LIKE TO LEAVE US WITH, AND WOULD LIKE TO ALSO ASK THE AGENCIES -- MEETING STAFF HOW WE ARE DOING ON QUORUM. I KNOW SOMEONE LEFT. THEY HAD AN EMERGENCY THAT HAD TO GO. SO IF WE DON'T HAVE QUORUM, WE NEED TO DO THE MINUTES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS RECEIVED BY 5:00 YESTERDAY, AND YES WE HAVE LOST THE QUORUM TO GO BACK TO ITEM NUMBER THREE. YES. WE HAVE LOST THE QUORUM.

WILLIAM BACON: I BELIEVE THAT WE CAN TAKE -- THERE CAN BE NO ACTION TAKEN BY THE SUBCOMMITTEE BUT THE MINUTES FROM THE PREVIOUS MEETING CAN BE INCLUDED IN THE AGENDA FOR THE NEXT SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING NEXT MONTH, I BELIEVE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THAT WILL BE ALSO A GOOD REMINDER IF WE WOULD BE ABLE TO, IF WE HAVE A LONG DISCUSSION WE CAN STOP IN THE MIDDLE AND APPROVE THE MINUTES IF WE LOSE THE FORUM. DOES STAFF HAVE ANY COMMENTS?

MICHAEL EISEMAN: WE ARE MOVING INTO THE FAST PACED PART OF THE STUDY HERE MOVING QUICKLY TOWARDS RECOMMENDATION IN JULY IF EVERYTHING IS ON TRACK. SO THANK YOU FOR STAYING ENGAGED AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR COLLABORATION SO FAR. WE ARE CERTAINLY OPEN TO YOUR FURTHER COMMENTS, FEEDBACK, QUESTIONS, IN WRITTEN FORM AFTER THE MEETING.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: AND REASON GREAT THANKS TO THE TEAM FOR DOING THIS REALLY ROBUST WORK, WHICH HAS BEEN LONG AWAITED AND SO IT'S GREAT TO SEE THIS HAPPENING. AND IT SEEMS LIKE QUITE A LOT OF WORK. SO, THANK YOU.

MICHAEL EISEMAN: SURE.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: SO MOVING TOWARD THE SCRIPT FOR HOW TO CLOSE THE MEETING.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ACTUALLY THE NEXT ITEM IS ITEM FIVE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: YES. ITEM FIVE NEW BUSINESS. SO THE MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MAY BRING UP NEW BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO A FUTURE AGENDA. DO WE HAVE ITEMS OF NEW BUSINESS THAT MEMBERS WANT TO BRING UP? I'M NOT SEEING ANY HANDS. AND SO THEN, AGENDA ITEM SIX IS PUBLIC COMMENT, OTHER BUSINESS. SO WE'LL ASK IF THERE HAVE BEEN ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS SUBMITTED BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY OR ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT HAVE COMMENT ON ITEMS RELATED NOT ON TODAY'S AGENDA.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED YESTERDAY BY 5:00, AND I SEE ROLAND HAS HIS HAND RAISED. ROLAND, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. PLEASE UNMUTE.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. SO WHAT I WANT TO DO IS GIVE YOU A QUICK PREVIEW TO YOU OF SOMETHING I'M GOING TO SEND TO THE RECOVERY TASK FORCE. IT'S A LINK TO A YOUTUBE VIDEO CALLED WHICH IS FASTER, HIGH SPEED ONE OR THE TUBE. BASICALLY IT'S MINUTES LONG AND IT'S FOUR BLOGGER WHO IS MEET IN ONE LOCATION AND THEY HAVE TO TRAVEL TO FRANKFURT AND OFF THEY GO AND YOU'RE GOING TO FIND LOTS OF INTERESTING CONTENT. NUMBER ONE THE BEST CONNECTION IS NO CONNECTION. HIGH SPEED RAIL IS FASTER THAN LIGHT RAIL THAT'S ANOTHER CONCEPT, OYSTER, WHICH IS THE EQUIVALENT OF CLIPPER IS CHEAPER THAN PAPER AND ONE CONCEPT I HAVE YET TO HEAR ABOUT IS THE QUESTION OF ON PEAK AND OFF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PEAK. NOBODY SELECTS A BUS FOR OBVIOUS REASON EVEN THOUGH THE BUS IS THE CHEAPEST, AND THE [INDISCERNIBLE] HIGH SPEED RAIL GOT THEIR 20 MINUTES EARLIER THAN THE LAST PERSON. AND I'M GOING TO WRAP UP SHARING DIFFERENCE IN COST. YOU HAVE CONTACT AND CONTACTLESS AND PAPER PARTICULATES ON ONE AXIS THEN PEAK AND OFF PEAK, AND ALSO THE IDEA OF THE DAILY CAP, [INDISCERNIBLE] AND THE DIFFERENCE -- SORRY -- THERE IS OYSTER, PAPER PARTICULATE, AND THEN [INDISCERNIBLE] THE DURING PEAK [INDISCERNIBLE] PAPER PARTICULATE $6.60, OFF PEAK THE PAPER PARTICULATE IS THE SAME PEOPLE THAT BUY PAPER TICKETS DON'T GET DISCOUNT, THE TUBE FARE DROPPED TO $2.40, AND IF YOU USE OYSTER, OFF PEAK, IT'S A FOUR POUNDS. SO THAT OPTION YOU USE, THE SLIDE IS FIVE MONDAYS 26 SECONDS AND THE VIDEO IS CALLED WHICH IS FASTER HIGH SPEED OR THE TUBE AND IT'S ON ITS WAY. THANK YOU.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I SEE THAT ALETA DUPREE HAS HAND.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR ADINA LEVIN. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I'M VERY APPRECIATIVE THIS WORK GOING FORWARD AND THAT WE HAVE SOME PEOPLE ON THIS TEAM WHO ARE EXPERTS IN THIS, CERTAINLY WAY ABOVE MY PAY GRADE, AND I AM GLAD TO PAY PEOPLE TO DO DIFFICULT JOBS. BECAUSE THIS IS A VERY DIFFICULT JOB. AND I ASK THAT IN YOUR ADVOCACY, BOTH

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

YOU, AS A COMMITTEE, AND IN STAFF, TO IMPRESS UPON THE IMPORTANCE TO OUR TRANSIT AGENCY LEADERS AND BOARDS, OF THE HAVING TO BE UNIFORM ON THIS. IN ORDER FOR US TO IMPLEMENT THIS EQUITABLE UNIFORMED INTEGRATED FARE SCHEDULE IS GOING TO REQUIRE EVERYBODY TO BE ON BOARD WITH TECHNOLOGY. AND I FAVOR THAT, AS I HAVE STATED BEFORE. HOW CAN WE MEET THE RESISTANCE TO DOING THINGS IN NEW WAYS? IT IS TRANSIT THAT REALLY HAS BEEN THE DRIVER FOR CONTACTLESS PAYMENT CARDS TO BECOME WIDESPREAD IN THE UNITED STATES. AND IT'S BASICALLY THE DEFAULT NOW. BECAUSE THERE IS A REAL NEED FOR THEM. AND THERE ARE MANY DIFFERENT REASONS WHY PEOPLE CHOOSE DIFFERENT MODES. THERE ARE SOME WHO MAY RIDE A BUS IN, SAY, NEW YORK CITY, BECAUSE THEY MAY NOT FEEL SAFE RIDING THE TRAIN. I LIVED THROUGH THE DAYS OF THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY IN THE 70S AND THE 80S WITH THE GRAFFITI, BROKEN LIGHTS, AND HIGH CRIME. SOME PEOPLE MAY ENJOY THE MORE PLUSH EXPERIENCE RIDING METRO NORTH INTO THE BRONX THAN NECESSARILY RIDING ON THE HARDER SEATS OF THE SUBWAY TRAIN. SO THERE IS A LOT OF MOVING PIECES HERE. FARE INTEGRATION IS IMPORTANT. BUT WE CERTAINLY WANT TO BE COGNIZANT OF THE REASONS WHY PEOPLE CHOOSE DIFFERENT MODES, AND THEN WE CAN ADJUST A FARE SCHEDULE THAT SHOULD BE, BASICALLY EVERYBODY'S NEEDS, BUT IT'S NOT THE WHOLE THING.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH ALETA.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. APPRECIATE IT.

ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: SO WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO ADJOURN. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE WILL BE HELD MONDAY JUNE 7TH, 2021 AT 10:00 A.M. BY WEBCAST ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND WE'RE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NTT

Broadcasting Government