



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



January 27, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 27, 2021, 9:50 AM**

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SORRY. KIMBERLY, ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

5

6 **KIMBERLY WARD:** HAGGERTY?

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** STILL HERE.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

11

12 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

15

16 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

17

18 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.

21

22 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** HERE.

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. GIACOPINI.

25



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION
Meeting Transcript**

January 27, 2021

1 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

2

3 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HERE.

4

5 **SAM LICCARDO:** PRESENT.

6

7 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** PRESENT.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

10

11 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

12

13 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

14

15 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** HERE.

16

17 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** PRESENT.

18

19 **AMY WORTH:** HERE.

20

21 **KIMBERLY WARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE WILL
24 NOW MOVE TO ITEM 2, WHICH IS THE CHAIR'S REPORT. I HAVE A FEW
25 THIS MONTH. SO GIVE ME SOME TIME. FIRST ONE WOULD BE



January 27, 2021

1 RESOLUTION MTC RESOLUTION 4455. THAT WAS -- THAT WILL BE VOTED
2 ON AS A MOTION BY PAPAN AND WILL BE SECONDED BY CANEPA. I'LL
3 TELL YOU WHAT YOU JUST MOTIONED AND SECONDED TO. THIS IS
4 MOTION IS IN APPRECIATION OF COMMISSIONER WARREN SLOCUM ON HIS
5 OCCASION OF THE DEPARTURE FROM MTC. SINCE NO ONE WANTS ME TO
6 READ THE ENTIRE RESOLUTION LET ME ASSURE WARREN THAT THE
7 COMPLETE TEXT AND FRAMED IS BEING DELIVERED TO HIM. I WANT TO
8 MAKE SURE THAT OUR VAST VIRTUAL AUDIENCE THAT I WILL SHARE
9 JUST A FEW HIGHLIGHTS NOW. WHEREAS WARREN SLOCUM IS STEPPING
10 DOWN FROM THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AFTER
11 FOUR YEARS OF DEDICATED SERVICE REPRESENTING THE SAN MATEO
12 COUNTY. WARREN CONSISTENTLY AND -- CONSCIENTIOUSLY HAS
13 REPRESENTED -- I TRY TO READ TOO FAST IS THE PROBLEM.
14 REPRESENTED THE INTEREST OF THE BAY AREA WITH LOWER INCOME --
15 BAY AREA RESIDENTS WITH LOWER INCOMES, THOSE CHALLENGED BY THE
16 HIGH COST OF HOUSING AND THE PEOPLE WHOM ENGLISH IS NOT THEIR
17 ENGLISH LANGUAGE. WHEREAS, WARREN HAS SERVED AS A MEMBER OF
18 THE AD HOC COMMITTEE OF MTC COMMISSIONERS ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
19 MEMBERS THAT HELPED SHAPE THE DEVELOPMENT OF ASSEMBLY BILL
20 1487 THAT IS NOW ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE IN 2019 AND
21 ESTABLISHED BY THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. AND
22 WHEREAS ALL RECOMMENDATIONS BY WARREN AND HIS FELLOW COMMITTEE
23 MEMBERS ULTIMATELY INCORPORATED INTO THE LEGISLATION. AND
24 WHEREAS WARREN'S STEADFAST ADVOCACY MULTIMODAL ABILITY
25 IMPROVEMENTS IN THE DUNBAR TEN, HENNED THE FORWARD INITIATIVE.



January 27, 2021

1 THE LONG AND DISTINGUISHED CAREER THE PUBLIC SERVICE THAT
2 BEGAN WITH HIS ENLISTMENT IN THE U.S. ARMY AND YEARS OF WITH
3 WORK IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND WHIZ WINNING RE-ELECTION,
4 THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT THE COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF OF
5 MTC THANK ROWLAND -- THANK WARREN FOR HIS SERVICE TO THE
6 AGENCY, EXPRESS THEIR APPRECIATION FOR THE COLLEGIAL APPROACH
7 TO WHICH HE WORKED AND ADVANCED BOTH LOCAL AND REGIONAL
8 INTERESTS AND EXTENDED TO WARREN AND HIS FAMILY BEST WISHES
9 FOR GOOD TIMES AND GOOD HEALTH AND YEARS AHEAD. WARREN, ARE
10 YOU WITH US?

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** I DON'T SEE HIM HERE, MR. CHAIR.

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** REALLY?

15

16 **KIMBERLY WARD:** REALLY?

17

18 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WELL, THEN THAT WAS SUPPOSED TO BE
19 REMARKS BY WARREN. AND NOW I'M SAYING WARREN AGAIN OUR DEEP
20 THOUGHTS TO YOUR WORK FOR THE COMMISSION THE LAST FOUR YEARS.
21 IT WAS MOTIONED BY PAPAN AND SECOND BY CANEPA.

22

23 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** SCOTT CAN I JUST SAY A COUPLE WORDS ABOUT
24 WARREN? WARREN HAS REALLY BEEN AN INCREDIBLE COLLEAGUE. I WAS
25 HIS VICE PRESIDENT LAST YEAR. AND I THINK IF WARREN WAS HERE,



January 27, 2021

1 ONE OF THE THINGS THAT HE WOULD SAY IS THAT THIS BOARD HAS
2 REALLY BEEN COLLABORATIVE. AND ONE OF HIS SORT OF ISSUE FOCUS
3 AREAS HAS BEEN AROUND DUNBAR TEN RAIL. SO HE'S GOING TO
4 CONTINUE WITH THAT WORK AND OBVIOUSLY WORK IN PARTNERSHIP WITH
5 FACEBOOK. BUT I THINK IF WARREN WAS HERE, HE WOULD DEFINITELY
6 SAY THAT THIS BOARD HAS DONE A LOT OF GREAT WORK AND HE WAS A
7 PART OF IT. SO THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

8

9 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR,
10 FOR SPEAKING IN HIS STEAD. WE APPRECIATE IT. WE APPRECIATE THE
11 WORK THAT WAS DONE BY WARREN AND LOOK FORWARD TO HIS SUCCESS
12 IN THE FUTURE. SO, WITH THAT, I THINK IT HAS TO BE A ROLL CALL
13 VOTE; CORRECT?

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THAT IS CORRECT.

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD:** HAGGERTY?

20

21 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

24

25 **KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA IS AN AYE. AUN?



January 27, 2021

1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

3

4 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

5

6 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

7

8 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

13

14 **KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO? LICCARDO? I DON'T SEE CHAIR LICCARDO

15 OR COMMISSIONER LICCARDO SO I WILL MARK YOU AS ABSENT.

16 MACKENZIE?

17

18 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** HAPPILY AYE, YES.

21

22 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

23

24 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** AYE.

2

3 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** AYE.

4

5 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

6

7 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

8

9 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO THE NEXT ITEM
10 WE'LL MOVE TO IS ITEM 2 B. AND THAT IS A RESOLUTION 4452. I AM
11 LOOKING FOR A MOTION AND SECOND. I'M GOING TO ALLOW SOMEBODY.
12 WE'VE GOT A MOTION BY WORTH. AND THE SECOND IS BY.

13

14 **DAVID RABBITT:** .

15

16 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** RABBIT. SO WE'VE GOT A MOTION AND
17 SECOND. AND THE FOLLOWING, THE HOUSING THEME PICKED UP
18 RESOLUTION 4452. WE COME TO THE RESOLUTION JIMMY STRACNER ON
19 HIS OCCASION OF HIS DEPARTURE HAVING REPRESENTED HOUSING AND
20 URBAN DEVELOPMENT ON THE COMMISSION SINCE 2019. ONCE MORE I
21 WILL HONOR JIMMY'S SERVICE BY REFRAINING FROM THE COMPLETE
22 READING AND PROVIDE JUST A FEW HIGHLIGHTS THAT ENSURE HIS
23 COMMENDATION IS PROPERLY ENSHRINED. WHEREAS JIMMY STRACNER
24 STEPPING DOWN FROM THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
25 AFTER 19 YEARS OF SERVICE DURING HIS TIME REPRESENTED H.U.D.



January 27, 2021

1 WITH DIGNITY, DILIGENCE AND DECORUM AND WHEREAS PRIOR TO THE
2 APPOINTMENT AS A SENIOR ADVISER FOR THE H.U.D. DISTRICT 9,
3 JIMMY SERVED AS THE REGIONAL ADMINISTRATOR WHERE HE WAS THE
4 DEPARTMENT'S LIAISON TO MAYORS, CITY MANAGERS, STATE LOCAL
5 OFFICIALS, MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND NONPROFIT AND HOUSING
6 CONSUMERS. AND WHEREAS THE TIMING OF JIMMY'S COMMISSION PROVED
7 TO BE FORTUITOUS AS IT COINCIDED WITH THE MAJOR EXPANSION OF
8 OUR MTC'S POLICY PORTFOLIO UNDERTAKEN WITH THE ASSOCIATION OF
9 BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS. WHEREAS JIMMY'S MTC SERVICE WAS PRESUMED
10 TO GIVE HIM A DEEPER UNDERSTANDING OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING
11 CHALLENGES THAT MIGHT BE AVAILABLE IN THE COURSE OF HIS WORK
12 ELSEWHERE IN THE FOUR STATES AND THE THREE U.S. TERRITORIES
13 INCLUDING H.U.D.'S DISTRICT 9. NOW, THERE WERE, BE IT RESOLVED
14 THAT TESTIFY STAFF AND THE COMMISSIONERS THANK JIMMY FOR HIS
15 CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE COMMISSION, TO THE BAY AREA AND OUR
16 NATION AND WARMLY EXTEND BEST WISHES TO JIMMY FOR HIS
17 CONTINUED SUCCESS IN BOTH PUBLIC AND PRIVATE PURSUITS. JIMMY,
18 PLEASE KNOW THE COMPLETE RESOLUTION IS ON ITS WAY. IF YOU'VE
19 NOT ALREADY RECEIVED IT, I HOPE YOU HAVE SOME SAGE WORDS TO
20 SHARE WITH US AS YOUR NEXT CHAPTER BEGINS. JIMMY, ARE YOU WITH
21 US?

22

23 **JIMMY STRACNER:** YES, SIR. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

24

25 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I CAN. GO AHEAD.



January 27, 2021

1

2 JIMMY STRACNER. THANK YOU, CHAIR. CONGRATULATIONS ON YOUR
3 RETIREMENT. I'LL MAKE THIS REALLY SHORT. I WANT TO THANK YOU
4 ALL FOR THE PAST YEAR AND A HALF. IT'S BEEN A TREMENDOUS
5 LEARNING OPPORTUNITY FOR ME COMING INTO THE COMMISSION.
6 TRANSPORTATION IS, YOU KNOW, NOT MY FORTE. BUT I'VE LEARNED A
7 LOT. AND I'VE BEEN ABLE TO FIRSTHAND SEE WHAT GOOD GOVERNMENT
8 IS ABOUT. I THINK THE WORK THAT YOU FOLKS DO ON THE COMMISSION
9 IS SO VERY IMPORTANT. AND I APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S EFFORTS.
10 AND I APPRECIATE HOW MUCH YOU ALL DEEPLY CARE ABOUT YOUR
11 COMMUNITIES AND ABOUT THE BAY AREA AS A WHOLE. SO THANK YOU
12 AGAIN TO THE COMMISSION, TO THE STAFF FOR THIS. I REALLY
13 APPRECIATE THIS OPPORTUNITY. AND I WISH YOU ALL NOTHING BUT
14 THE BEST IN THE FUTURE. SO THANK YOU.

15

16 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, JIMMY. I APPRECIATE THAT. AND
17 I DO KNOW AT ONE POINT DURING THE COMMISSION, YOU WERE KIND OF
18 MY SEAT MATE. AND I ALWAYS ENJOYED SITTING NEXT TO YOU AND
19 HAVING SOME OF THOSE SIDEBAR CONVERSATIONS. THANK YOU VERY
20 MUCH. I WOULD ASK ARE THERE ANY OTHER COMMISSION THEIRS WISH
21 TO SAY ANYTHING? GO AHEAD, AMY.

22

23 **AMY WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I JUST WANTED TO ECHO A LOT
24 OF THE WORDS, JIMMY THAT, WERE IN THE RESOLUTION HONORING YOU.
25 I HAD THE HONOR OF HAVING CONVERSATIONS WITH JIMMY ON THE BART



January 27, 2021

1 TRAIN WHEN WE TOOK BART BACK FROM THE MTC MEETINGS. AND, YOU
2 KNOW, REALLY I THINK THAT THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS SUCH AN
3 IMPORTANT PARTNER IN OUR HOUSING EFFORTS. SO AS WE MOVE
4 FORWARD IN THESE LAST TWO YEARS IT'S BEEN WONDERFUL HAVING TO
5 BE ON THE COMMISSION BECAUSE I THINK HIS UNDERSTANDING OF
6 CALIFORNIA AND MANY OF THE HOUSING CHALLENGES THAT WE FACE
7 THROUGHOUT THE STATE HAS REALLY BEEN HELPFUL. AND I KNOW THAT
8 WE WILL CONTINUE TO REALLY NEED TO RELY ON THE FEDERAL
9 GOVERNMENT TO PROVIDE FUNDING AND SUPPORT OF OUR HOUSING
10 EFFORTS. YOU KNOW, PARTICULARLY ONE OF THE CHALLENGES IS YOUNG
11 FAMILIES THAT ARE FORCED TO COMMUTE LONG DISTANCES TO JOBS.
12 AND I KNOW THAT, JIMMY IN RAISING HIS FAMILY WAS COMMUTING A
13 LONG DISTANCE TO SERVE THE PEOPLE OF THIS COMMISSION AND THIS
14 REGION WHILE RAISING A YOUNG FAMILY. AND I DO BELIEVE THAT HE
15 WILL HAVE A GREAT FUTURE IN CALIFORNIA. AND I THINK THAT
16 PARTNERSHIP OF CONTINUING TO WORK WITH THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT
17 IN TERMS OF THE INITIATIVES AND THE FACT THAT THESE LAST TWO
18 YEARS WE WERE ABLE TO DEVELOP THE -- YOU KNOW, STAND UP THE
19 NEW HOUSING AUTHORITY AND REALLY LOOK COMPREHENSIVELY AT HOW
20 WE CAN INCREASE THE SUPPLY OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE REGION
21 IS REALLY CRITICAL. SO, JIMMY, THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK AND FOR
22 YOUR COMMITMENT. AND JUMPING INTO A NEW COMMISSION, IT WAS,
23 YOU KNOW, A GOOD LEARNING CURVE, WHICH YOU TOOK ON WITH GREAT
24 ENTHUSIASM AND GREAT WORKING WITH YOU AND LOOK FORWARD TO
25 WORKING TOGETHER IN THE FUTURE. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. ANYBODY ELSE? SO, JIMMY, I'D
3 ASK DID YOU GET THE RESOLUTION YET?

4

5 **JIMMY STRACNER:** YES, SIR, I DID GET IT. THANK YOU, IT'S
6 BEAUTIFUL.

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WELL, DON'T BE A STRANGER. YOU STILL
9 HAVE VALUABLE INPUT. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WHATEVER YOUR OTHER
10 ENDEAVORS ARE AND WE LOOK FORWARD.

11

12 **AMY WORTH:** I THINK GINA HAD HER HAND UP, TOO.

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WHO?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** I WANTED TO SAY IT REALLY HAS BEEN A PLEASURE
17 WORKING WITH YOU AND I HOPE WE CAN WORK TOGETHER IN THE
18 FUTURE. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR ALL YOU'VE DONE.

19

20 **JIMMY STRACNER:** ABSOLUTELY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. ANYBODY ELSE? YEAH, THE HAND,
23 THE NEW WAY THE ZOOM HAND GOES UP NOW IS SOMETIMES KIND OF
24 HARD TO SEE. SO I APOLOGIZE, GINA. SO WITH THAT, MY LAST BIT
25 OF MY REPORT, ANYWAY, IS I'D LIKE TO WELCOME --



January 27, 2021

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD:** MR. CHAIR, SORRY, BEFORE WE DO.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ROLL CALL VOTE. I APOLOGIZE.

5

6 **KIMBERLY WARD:** AND WE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN COMMENT FOR EITHER
7 OF THESE ITEMS. WITH THE MOTION BY WORTH AND THE SECOND BY
8 RABBIT. HAGGERTY?

9

10 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA? COMMISSIONER PEDROZA? ABSENT.

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

15

16 **AUN:** AYE.

17

18 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ? ABSENT. CONNOLLY?

21

22 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

2

3 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

4

5 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

6

7 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

10

11 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

12

13 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD:** SCHAAF? COMMISSIONER SCHAAF IS ABSENT?

16

17 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** NO, I'M NOT ABSENT. SORRY.

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD:** NO WORRIES.

20

21 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** YES.

22

23 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

24

25 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. THANK YOU FOR
3 KEEPING ME STRAIGHT THROUGH ALL THE MEETINGS.

4

5 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

6

7 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I'D LIKE TO WELCOME MR. DAVID CANEPA TO
8 HIS FIRST COMMISSION MEETINGS. HE WILL BE REPRESENTING THE SAN
9 MATEO COUNTY FILLING THE VACANT LEFT BY WARREN SLOCUM. I SEE
10 YOU ALMOST ON TV EVERY NIGHT. WOULD YOU LIKE TO SAY ANYTHING?

11

12 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** IT'S TAKE DELIGHT TO BE HERE. I'VE BEEN
13 FOLLOWING YOUR WORK FOR MANY YEARS. SO THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

14

15 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I REMEMBER WHEN YOU FIRST CAME ON THE
16 SCENE. I THINK I ALWAYS TOLD YOU MTC WAS THE SPOT YOU NEEDED
17 TO GET SOME DAY. AND I'M HAPPY TO SEE THAT AS I WALK OUT THE
18 DOOR, YOU'RE WALKING IN. GOOD LUCK AND I WISH YOU MUCH SUCCESS
19 AS AN MTC COMMISSIONER. YOU HAVE MADE IT TO ONE OF THE BEST
20 COMMISSIONS IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA IF NOT THE UNITED
21 STATES WITH GREAT LEADERSHIP BY OUR STAFF. SO I JUST WANT TO
22 BE CLEAR THAT YOU MADE IT, DAVID. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO MUCH
23 SUCCESS FOR YOU.

24

25 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** I'M A GOOD LISTENER.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I WILL APPOINT YOU. NOT FOR VERY LONG
3 BECAUSE OUR NEW CHAIR WILL BE COMING IN. AND HE'S GOING TO
4 HAVE HIS OWN IDEA OF WHAT HE WANTS TO DO. BUT FOR THE TIME
5 BEING, I'M GOING TO APPOINT YOU TO THE FOLLOWING STANDING
6 COMMITTEES UNTIL THE MIDTERM COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS ARE MADE
7 BY OUR NEXT COMMISSION CHAIR, WHOEVER THAT IS. YOU WILL BE ON
8 THE ABAG JOINT MTC LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE. YOU WILL BE ON THE
9 OPERATIONS COMMITTEE AND THE PLANNING COMMITTEE. DO I HAVE A
10 MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THIS APPOINTMENT AS PREVIOUSLY
11 STATED?

12

13 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** I'LL MOVE IT.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** SECOND.

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. WITH A MOTION BY SPERING, A SECOND BY
20 PAPAN. HAGGERTY?

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **AUN:** AYE.

4

5 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

6

7 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

8

9 **KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLLY?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

12

13 **KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA VERNACI IS AN AYE. GLOVER?

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

18

19 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

20

21 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

24

25 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

3

4 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** AYE.

5

6 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. SPERING?

7

8 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** YES.

9

10 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. THANK YOU.

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** KIMBER LIP, YOU DIDN'T INTERRUPT ME BUT
15 I'M ASSUMING THERE WASN'T ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THAT IS CORRECT. AND I'VE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
18 WRITING AND NO ONE EELS HAND IS RAISED. THANK YOU.

19

20 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THAT WAS PRETTY CONTROVERSIAL, ANYWAYS.
21 WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 3. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THAT AD HOC
22 COMMITTEE CHAIR JIM SPERING REPORT OUT ON THE AD HOC
23 NOMINATING COMMITTEE TO END THIS CURRENT REIGN OF TERROR.

24



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** THANK YOU, SCOTT TAD HOC COMMITTEE MET ON
2 JANUARY 13TH AND THE COMMITTEE WAS MADE UP OF MYSELF,
3 COMMISSIONER AMY WORTH, AND COMMISSIONER GINA PAPAN. THE
4 COMMITTEE INTERVIEWED ALFREDO IF HE HAD ROSA FOR CONSIDERATION
5 TO SERVE AS THE NEXT CHAIRMAN OF THE COMMISSION NEURAL STEM
6 CELLS, NICK JOE STEP WITS TO SERVE AS VICE CHAIRMAN FOR THE
7 TWO-YEAR STARTING IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR. THE COMMITTEE
8 DISCUSSED THE ROLE OF THE CHAIRMAN AND VICE CHAIRMAN AND THE
9 IMPORTANCE OF REPRESENTING AND LEADING THE COMMISSION OVER THE
10 NEXT TWO YEARS. THE COMMITTEE WAS VERY SATISFIED WITH BOTH
11 THEIR RESPONSES AND FEEL THEY BOTH WILL REPRESENT MTC, THE
12 REGION AND ALL THE COMMISSIONERS WITH DISTINCTION, FAIRNESS
13 DURING THEIR TERM. I'M HONORED TO NOMINATE ALFREDO PEDROZA TO
14 SERVE AS THE NEXT CHAIRMAN OF MTC AND NICK JOSEFOWITZ AS VICE
15 CHAIRMAN OF THE COMMISSION FOR THE '21/'22 TERM OF OFFICE.

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY. KATHLEEN, I NEED SOME HELP HERE
18 BECAUSE MY NOTES DO SAY CLOSE THE NOMINATION. BUT YOUR FEELING
19 IS I CANNOT CLOSE THEM AT THIS POINT?

20

21 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** WE CAN ASK FOR ADDITIONAL NOMINATIONS,
22 MR. CHAIRMAN.

23

24 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** NO, THAT'S NOT WHAT I'M TRYING TO DO.
25 KATHLEEN, CAN I CLOSE THE NOMINATIONS?



January 27, 2021

1

2 **WAYNE KENO:** UNFORTUNATELY THE AGENDA WASN'T UPDATED TO MAKE
3 THIS AN ACTION ITEM INSTEAD OF AN INFORMATION ITEM. WE CAN'T
4 TAKE A VOTE?

5

6 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** CAN WE ACCEPT THE NOMINATING
7 COMMISSION'S RECOMMENDATION?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YES.

10

11 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YOUR MOTION WILL BE TO ACCEPT THE AD HOC
12 NOMINATING COMMITTEE NOMINATION. IT DOES NOT CLOSE THE
13 NOMINATIONS. BUT I THINK WE'RE ALL PRETTY SATISFIED IN THE
14 DIRECTION OF THE COMMISSION AND IT'S NICE TO SEE THAT NICK HAS
15 TURNED ON HIS CAMERA SO WE CAN ALL SEE HIM NOW. SO, GREAT.
16 THERE HE GOES. WITH THAT, BEFORE I DO ANYTHING LIKE CALL FOR A
17 VOTE ON ACCEPTING THE NOMINATING COMMITTEE, ANYBODY WISH --
18 WELL, FIRST OF ALL --

19

20 **AMY WORTH:** IF WE CAN SHARE A SECOND?

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SLOW DOWN. ALFREDO, DO YOU WANT TO SAY
23 ANYTHING? WOULD YOU RATHER US VOTE FIRST?

24



January 27, 2021

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MR. CHAIR, I'LL JUST SAY THANK YOU FOR THE
2 OPPORTUNITY, FOR THE AD HOC COMMITTEE AND ALL THE
3 COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS AN INCREDIBLE PRIVILEGE TO BE IN A
4 POSITION TO WORK WITH YOU ALL AND LEAD US FORWARD. THESE ARE
5 GOING TO BE SOME DIFFICULT TIMES. BUT I DO THINK WE HAVE AN
6 INCREDIBLE FUTURE AHEAD OF US WITH SOME UNCOMFORTABLE
7 DECISIONS WE'RE GOING TO MAKE. BUT I'M READY TO WORK WITH YOU
8 ALL AND VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. AS YOU SAID, MR. CHAIR, THIS IS
9 AN INCREDIBLE ORGANIZATION. AND IT IS MY HONOR TO KEEP THAT
10 REPUTATION GOING AND ONLY GROW WHAT WE'VE DONE BECAUSE IT'S SO
11 NEEDED IN OUR REGION. SO JUST THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY
12 AND CONSIDERATION.

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. NICK?

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I JUST ALSO WANTED TO SAY I'M HUMBLER AND
17 INCREDIBLY GRATEFUL TO THE NOMINATING COMMITTEE FOR THE
18 OPPORTUNITY TO SERVE IN THIS CAPACITY. AND I'M REALLY EXCITED
19 TO BE SERVING WITH VICE CHAIR PEDROZA. AND I AM FULLY AWARE OF
20 THE BIG SHOES THAT I HAVE TO FILL, SCOTT, THAT YOU'RE LEAVING
21 AND THAT SO MANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS WHO HAVE BEEN CHAIRS AND
22 VICE CHAIRS BEFORE. AND I'M JUST REALLY EXCITED ABOUT TRYING
23 TO FORGE THESE KIND OF ENDURING REGIONAL CONSENSUSES ON SOME
24 OF OUR MOST CHALLENGING ISSUES AND REALLY EXCITED.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY. THANK YOU, NICK. KATHLEEN, I
2 NOTICE YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP AGAIN. IS THAT ON PURPOSE OR IS
3 THAT JUST THE LEFTOVER?

4

5 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I APOLOGIZE THAT WAS NOT ON PURPOSE.

6

7 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. ANYBODY ELSE WANT TO SAY
8 ANYTHING BEFORE I CALL FOR A MOTION AND A SECOND? GO AHEAD. I
9 SEE NOBODY -- YOU KNOW, I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I THINK ONE OF
10 THE GREATEST HONORS OF MY ELECTED LIFE WAS BEING A CHAIR OF
11 MTC. AND I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I LEAVE -- AND I'LL STILL BE
12 CALLING THE MEETING TOGETHER IN FEBRUARY, SO IT'S NOT LIKE I'M
13 GONE. BUT I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I'M VERY PLEASED WITH THE
14 DIRECTION AND THE LEADERSHIP THAT WE'RE LEAVING THIS
15 COMMISSION WITH. SO CONGRATULATIONS TO BOTH OF YOU. AND I KNOW
16 YOU WILL HAVE YOUR HEART AND SOUL IN THIS ENDEAVOR AS CHAIR
17 AND VICE CHAIR. SO WITH THAT, I DID NOT HAVE A MOTION. I HEARD
18 A LOT OF PEOPLE CLAMORING. I KNOW WORTH WAS TRYING TO GET A
19 CO-SECOND. BUT CAN WE JUST -- WHO WANTS TO MAKE THE MOTION?

20

21 **AMY WORTH:** I THINK JIM DID.

22

23 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** MR. CHAIR, I DID.

24

25 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** AND IT WAS SECONDED BY WORTH.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **SAM LICCARDO:** THIS ELECTION FEELS STOLEN ALREADY. [LAUGHTER.]

3

4 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** COULD I HAVE A RECOUNT?

5

6 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** MAC VOTING MACHINES HAVE BEEN HACKED.

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I'LL LEAVE A NOTE ON THE DESK. SO WITH
9 THAT, I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. KIMBERLY?

10

11 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. I'M SORRY. I'M TRYING NOT TO LAUGH
12 ANYMORE. HAGGERTY?

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YOU ALWAYS WANT TO MAKE IT ENTERTAINING.
15 YES.

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

20

21 **KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA IS AN AYE.

22

23 **EDDIE AUN:** AYE.

24

25 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** YES.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES. CONNOLLY?

3

4 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE.

7

8 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE. JOSEFOWITZ?

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** MACKENZIE?

13

14 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

15

16 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

19

20 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

21

22 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

23

24 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** BIG AYE.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** AYE.

2

3 **AMY WORTH:** AYE ECHOING LIBBY'S ENTHUSIASM.

4

5 **KIMBERLY WARD:** FANTASTIC. THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES
6 UNANIMOUSLY.

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. THERE YOU HAVE IT. SO WE'LL
9 FORMALIZE THIS AGAIN AT THE NEXT MEETING. BUT CONGRATULATIONS
10 TO BOTH OF YOU. AND I'LL HAVE MORE TO SAY ABOUT MY VICE CHAIR
11 AT THAT TIME. SO, WITH THAT, WE WILL NOW LEAVE THIS COMMITTEE
12 REPORT AND MOVE TO RANDI KINMAN TO DISCUSS THE POLICY ADVISORY
13 COMMITTEE REPORT. RANDI, ARE YOU WITH US?

14

15 **CHAIR KINMAN:** I AM. I NEEDED TO UNMUTE MYSELF. I KNOW
16 COMMISSIONER CANEPA AND PLEASE FEEL FREE TO CONTACT ME IF YOU
17 HAVE ANY QUESTIONS CONCERNING THE POLICY ADVISORY COMMITTEE.
18 JUST TO BRIEFLY REVIEW THE ACTIVITIES OF THE MONTH. THE POLICY
19 ADVISORY COUNCIL HE'S EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE MET ON
20 JANUARY 11TH. THE FIRST IS COORDINATION PLAN AND OUR FOUR-YEAR
21 UPDATE. BECAUSE THE PLAN WAS ADOPTED IN 2018, THE WORK ON THE
22 UPDATE BEGINS NOW. I DO WANT TO RAISE UP TWO ISSUES FROM THAT
23 DISCUSSION. THE COORDINATED PLAN IS MANDATED TO FOCUS ON
24 DELIVERY SERVICE FOR LOW INCOME SENIORS AND DISABLED. OUR
25 UNHOUSED POPULATIONS HAVE A DISPROPORTIONATE NUMBER OF PEOPLE



January 27, 2021

1 WHO FIT INTO ALL THREE CATEGORIES. SO MAKING SURE THOSE VOICES
2 ARE HEARD IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO THE UPDATE. THE SECOND
3 ISSUE IS PARATRANSIT SERVICE. WE'VE DONE AN EXCELLENT JOB OF
4 MAKING SURE THE C.M.A.'S PRIORITIZED MOBILITY MANAGEMENT FOR
5 THEIR JURISDICTIONS. WE NOW NEED TO ASSESS THE NEEDS THAT
6 CROSS COUNTY LINES. THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE ALSO
7 RECEIVED A REPORT ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF MTC'S EQUITY
8 PLATFORM'S EQUITY CONSULTANT'S BENCH. THIS IS AN EXCITING
9 PROGRAM THAT YOU'LL BE SEEING SOON BROUGHT TO YOU BY THE
10 DIRECTOR. THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MET ON JANUARY 13TH AND
11 WENT INTO OVERTIME DUE TO THE REALLY MEATY ISSUES OF THE DAY.
12 WE HAD AN UPDATE ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASKFORCE WITH DISCUSSION
13 ON NETWORK MANAGEMENT. AND I WILL REMIND THE COMMISSION THAT
14 WE FULLY SUPPORTED COHESIVE NETWORK MANAGEMENT IN THE VOTE ON
15 OCTOBER -- IN OCTOBER 2020. WE REVIEWED IF CARES ACT FUNDING
16 AND HOW THAT TIES INTO THE NEW EXPECTED FEDERAL RELIEF MONEY.
17 WE HAD A LENGTHY PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ABOUT PLAN BAY
18 AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT OPTION FOR THE E.I.R. AND WE'LL BE
19 BRINGING STAFF BACK TO REVIEW COMPONENTS. THE COUNCIL MEETS
20 AGAIN ON FEBRUARY 10TH. I KNOW THAT THIS IS A REALLY BUZZ TIME
21 BUT I WANT TO REMIND COMMISSIONERS THAT THERE'S SEVERAL LONG-
22 STANDING VACANCIES IN EQUITY THAT CAN BE FILLED THROUGH
23 APPOINTMENT TO THE ADVISORY COUNCIL. FINALLY THE FARE
24 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE, WHICH FEEDS INTO
25 THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION TASKFORCE, MET ON



January 27, 2021

1 JANUARY 22ND. THIS WAS ANOTHER REALLY DENSE MEETING THAT
2 COVERED THE PLAN OPTIONS. THEY DISCUSSED ALTERNATIVE PATHWAYS
3 TO INTEGRATION INCLUDING FARES, ZONE VERSUS DISTANCE, AND HOW
4 TO BREAK DOWN A COMPLEX ISSUE INTO EASIER OPTIONS FOR ULTIMATE
5 REVIEW. THIS COMMITTEE MEETS EVERY OTHER MONTH. WE'LL MEET
6 AGAIN IN MARCH. I WANT TO SAY I SIT ON OR MONITOR ALL OF THESE
7 SUBCOMMITTEES AND I WANT TO START OFF THIS YEAR BY TAKING A
8 MOMENT TO REALLY APPLAUD THE WORK OF STAFF WHO ARE DEVELOPING
9 NEW PROGRAMS WHILE INTEGRATING THEIR WORK ON PANDEMIC RESPONSE
10 AND THE COMPLEXITIES OF DELIVERING THEIR WORK PRODUCT WHILE
11 WORKING FROM HOME. THE AMOUNT OF MATERIAL AND SUPPORT THEY
12 PRODUCE IS ASTOUNDING. AND THEY TRULY WORK ON DEVELOPING
13 CONVERSATIONS AND GATHERING INPUT RATHER THAN DUMPING DATA
14 THROUGH POWERPOINTS. WITH THAT, I CONCLUDE MY REPORT.

15

16 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. APPRECIATE THAT,
17 RANDI. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OF RANDI? RANDI, YOU'RE GETTING
18 OFF EASY TODAY.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN:** I GUESS. THANK YOU.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** GREAT JOB. APPRECIATE THE WORK OF THE
23 POLICY ADVISORY COMMITTEE. ALL RIGHT. THERESE, ITEM 5,
24 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **THERESE W. McMILLIAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. LET'S ME
2 JUST SAY THAT THE TRANSITION-RELATED CONVERSATIONS AN ALWAYS
3 VERY REFLECTIVE AND IT'S NOT LOST ON ME, MR. CHAIR, SCOTT,
4 THAT THIS IS THE LAST MEETING YOU'LL BE ASKING ME TO MAKE THIS
5 REPORT. SO I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR OF COURSE EVERYTHING THAT
6 YOU'VE DONE AND THERE WILL BE A LOT MORE OF THOSE THANKS
7 COMING YOUR WAY. I WILL BE BRIEF BECAUSE THERE'S A LOT AHEAD
8 OF US ON THIS AGENDA. I WOULD NOTE THAT AS RANDI KINMAN JUST
9 HIGHLIGHTED, WE ARE MAKING GREAT PROGRESS ON SOME IMPORTANT
10 CONSULTANT BENCHES TO ASSIST IN OUR WORK. AND ALL BE HEARING
11 MORE ABOUT THE ON CALL EQUITY BENCH. WE RELEASED AN R.F.Q. FOR
12 THAT END OF DECEMBER AND ARE HOPING TO BRING SOMETHING TO YOU
13 IN FEBRUARY OR MARCH ON THAT. WE ALSO HAVE A REGIONAL PLANNING
14 BENCH AS YOU MIGHT APPRECIATE -- AS I KNOW YOU APPRECIATE,
15 THERE'S A LOT OF WORK IN THIS SPACE. AND SETTING THAT UP IS
16 GOING TO BE A REALLY IMPORTANT ASSET TO ASSIST STAFF IN OUR
17 WORK. A REALLY IMPORTANT MILESTONE WAS ACHIEVED ON JANUARY
18 25TH, OUR CLIPPER START PROGRAM WAS EXPANDED TO 21 TRANSIT
19 OPERATORS BY INCLUDING 11 MORE. AND THIS IS JUST SOMETHING I'M
20 PARTICULARLY PROUD OF BECAUSE WITH ALL OF THE INCREDIBLE
21 CHALLENGES AND BURDENS THAT THE COVID CIRCUMSTANCE LEVIED ON
22 THIS REGION AND THE STATE AND OUR NATION AND THE WORLD IT WAS
23 AN OPPORTUNITY TO ADVANCE A REALLY IMPORTANT EQUITY-DRIVEN
24 PROGRAM TO ASSIST OUR LOW INCOME TRANSIT TRAVELERS IN WAYS WE
25 HADN'T BEFORE. AND JUST SEEING THIS PROGRAM EXPAND AND WE'VE



January 27, 2021

1 RECEIVED 3500 APPLICATIONS SINCE ITS INCEPTION ON JULY 2020.
2 SO JUST WANTED TO LIFT THAT UP SO IN THAT VEIN, A QUICK NOTE
3 ABOUT THE TECHNOLOGY SERVICES WEB PROGRAM TEAM HAS BEEN
4 WORKING VERY DILIGENTLY TO ENSURE THAT OUR MORE THAN 30 AGENCY
5 WEBSITES ARE COMPLIANT WITH FEDERAL WEBSITE ACCESSIBILITY
6 STANDARDS. THIS IS AN IMPORTANT A.D.A. WORK. COMMISSIONER
7 GIACOPINI OF COURSE HAS BEEN BIG AND CONSISTENT VOICE ABOUT
8 BEING AHEAD OF THE CURVE WHEN WE CAN AND WE'RE MAKING VERY
9 GOOD PROGRESS IN THIS ARENA. SO WITH THAT, MR. CHAIR, I'LL
10 CLOSE AND TURN IT BACK TO YOU.

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OF
13 OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. ANY QUESTIONS? THERESE, YOU DID WELL.
14 THAT ONE, TOO. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS FOR THE TIME WHICH
15 COMMISSIONERS HAVE ANY COMMENTS? I GUESS THE COMMENT I WOULD
16 SAY IS I FAILED TO NOTE AND I WANT TO THANK THE PEOPLE THAT
17 WERE ON THAT SERVED ON THE AD HOC COMMITTEE. I FORGOT TO DO
18 THAT FOR THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. THANK YOU TO COMMISSIONER
19 SPERING, COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND COMMISSIONER WORTH. I
20 APPRECIATE YOUR WORK ON THAT. THAT'S MY COMMENT. ANYBODY ELSE
21 HAVE ANYTHING? IF NOT, I WILL MOVE ON. NO HANDS GOING OCCUPY.
22 NOBODY MOVING. OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON. WE'LL MOVE ON TO
23 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. DO I HAVE A MOTION ON THE CONSENT
24 CALENDAR?

25



January 27, 2021

1 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SO MOVED.

2

3 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** SECOND.

4

5 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** MACKENZIE AND DUTRA VERNACI. ANYBODY
6 FROM THE PUBLIC WISH TO SPEAK KIMBERLY?

7

8 **KIMBERLY WARD:** I RECEIVED NO WRITTEN COMMENT AND I SEE NO
9 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. I'M SORRY. THE
10 MOTION AND THE SECOND, WOULD YOU MIND REPEATING THOSE?

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** IT WAS MACKENZIE AND IT WAS DUTRA
13 VERNACI.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT.

16

17 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YEA.

18

19 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** VERY, VERY BUSY TODAY.

20

21 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES, SHE IS.

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY. SO WE'RE READY TO GO FOR THE ROLL
24 CALL? YES?

25



January 27, 2021

1 **KIMBERLY WARD:** HAGGERTY?

2

3 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

4

5 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

6

7 **KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. THERE SHE IS. THANK YOU. I
8 DIDN'T SEE YOU. AUN?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YES.

11

12 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

13

14 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES. CONNOLLY?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE. GLOVER? COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS AN
19 AYE. JOSEFOWITZ?

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

22

23 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

24

25 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

3

4 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

5

6 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

7

8 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** AYE.

9

10 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** AYE.

11

12 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

13

14 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

15

16 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE WILL MOVE TO
17 AGENDA ITEM COMMITTEE REPORT BY CHAIR GLOVER.

18

19 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** THANK YOU. THE REPORT THAT THE LEGISLATION
20 COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY JANUARY 13TH AND REFERS THE FOLLOWING
21 FOR APPROVAL. IT'S MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4422 REVISED, MTC
22 FISCAL YEAR 2021, THE OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET AMENDMENT.
23 IT APPROVES AMENDMENT NUMBER 2, INCREASING THE MTC PHYSICAL
24 YEAR 2021 AGENCY OPERATING BUDGET BY \$200,000 TO ACCOMMODATE
25 FOR PARTIAL REIMBURSEMENT OF EMPLOYEES FOR CERTAIN HOME OFFICE



January 27, 2021

1 EXPENDITURES INCLUDING INTERNET SERVICES AND NECESSARY
2 EQUIPMENT UPGRADES INCURRED BY MTC BY THE WORK FROM HOME
3 ALIGNMENT WITH COVID-19 LOCAL PUBLIC HEALTH DIRECTIVE. THE
4 INCREASED COSTS WILL BE COVERED BY THE INCREASE BY THE
5 TRANSFER FROM THE UNDESIGN OPERATING RESERVE WHICH HAD AN
6 ESTIMATED BALANCE OF \$32 MILLION AT THE START OF FISCAL YEAR
7 2021. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4422 REVISED.

8

9 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I HAVE A MOTION BY GLOVER.

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** I'LL SECOND IT. DUTRA VERNACI.

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PAY YOU MORE
14 THIS TIME. DUTRA VERNACI GOT THE SECOND. ANYBODY GOT ANY
15 QUESTIONS ON THIS, COMMENTS? ANYBODY IN THE PUBLIC?

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD:** NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
18 RAISED, AND I'VE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS
19 ITEM.

20

21 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH
22 THAT, WE WILL GO TO THE ROLL CALL VOTE.

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. HAGGERTY?

25



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

2

3 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES. ABE-KOGA?

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** AUN: YES.

8

9 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

10

11 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** CONNOLLY: AYE.

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE.

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE. WARD LICCARDO? LICCARDO IS AN AYE.

20

21 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

22

23 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

24

25 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** MACKENZIE IS AN AYE, AS WELL.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

5

6 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

7

8 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD:** SCHAAF? SCHAAF? I'M SORRY. I DON'T SEE YOU. I'M
11 GOING TO MARK YOU AS ABSENT. SPERING?

12

13 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** YES.

14

15 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

18

19 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE THAT
20 KIMBERLY. ITEM 9 IS A REPORT OUT FROM THE PROGRAM AND
21 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE CHAIRED BY NICK JOSEFOWITZ.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SOLE THE PROGRAM
24 COMMITTEE MET FOR THE TWO ITEMS OF APPROVAL. BUT BEFORE WE GET
25 TO THAT AGENDA ITEM 9 A IS BEING BROUGHT DIRECTLY TO THE



January 27, 2021

1 COMMISSION. MTC RESOLUTION 4453 PROGRAMMING OF CORONAVIRUS
2 RESPONSE AND RELIEF SUPPLEMENTARY APPROPRIATIONS ACT OF 2021.
3 PROPOSED 180 MILLION-DOLLAR OF CORONAVIRUS RESPONSE AND RELIEF
4 APPROPRIATIONS ACT OF 2021. KNOWN AS CRRSAA FUNDING TO BAY
5 AREA TRANSIT OPERATES THAT RECEIVED INSUFFICIENT SHARES OF
6 CARES ACT FUNDING DUE TO INACCURATE REVENUE LOSS FORECASTS.
7 THERESE WILL PRESENT THIS.

8

9 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON. I AM PLEASE
10 TODAY PRESENT THIS ITEM WHICH REPRESENTS THE FIRST STEP IN THE
11 NEWLY PROVIDED CORONA VIRUS RELIEF AND APPROPRIATIONS ACT
12 FUNDING OR AS WE CALL IT CRRSAA FUNDS AS WE REPORTED EARLIER
13 AT THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE, THE BAY AREA
14 RECEIVED APPROXIMATELY 982 MILLION OF THE 14 BILLION FOR
15 TRANSIT NATIONWIDE CONTAINED IN THE FEDERAL COVID RELIEF
16 PACKAGE. THAT 982 MILLION IS TO BE DISTRIBUTED THROUGH THREE
17 FEDERALLY DESIGNATED AREAS INCLUDING APPROXIMATELY 823 MILLION
18 FOR 2 SAN FRANCISCO OAKLAND URBANIZED AREA, 144 MILLION FOR
19 THE SAN JOSE URBANIZED AREA AND ABOUT 15 MILLION FOR THE SANTA
20 ROSA URBANIZED AREA. THIS FIRST TRANCHE OF FUNDING WE ARE
21 PROPOSING TODAY MAKES GOOD ON THE COMMISSION DIRECTIVE STAFF
22 RECEIVED LAST JULY TO PROVIDE A TRUE UP OF THE EARLIER CARES
23 ACT PANDEMIC RELIEF FUNDING. THE TRUE-UP INVOLVES COMPENSATING
24 OPERATORS THAT RECEIVED THE LESSER SHARE TESTIFY CARES ACT
25 FUNDING THAN THEY SHOULD HAVE DUE TO INACCURATE REVENUE LOSS



January 27, 2021

1 FORECASTS. TODAY'S ACTION, IF APPROVED, WOULD ALSO SERVE TO
2 GET FUNDING INTO THE HANDS OF THOSE OPERATORS THAT HAVE BEEN
3 SUFFERING THE GREATEST REVENUE LOSSES DUE TO THE PANDEMIC'S
4 IMPACTS AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. TO DETERMINE THE TRUE-UP, STAFF
5 RECALCULATED THE TOTAL CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION THAT RESULTED IN
6 A PROGRAMMING AMOUNTS APPROVED LAST JULY BUT SUBMITTED ACTUAL
7 REVENUE LOSSES FROM MARCH THROUGH DECEMBER 2021 RATHER THAN
8 THE ESTIMATED LOSSES THAT WERE USED IN THE ORIGINAL
9 DISTRIBUTION. AS YOU KNOW, BACK IN JUNE AND JULY, WE DID NOT
10 EXPECT THE SHELTER IN PLACE CONDITIONS TO HAVE LASTED THIS
11 LONG. AND EXPECT THAT TRANSIT PASSENGERS WOULD HAVE RETURNED
12 TO SOME DEGREE BY NOW. THAT DIDN'T HAPPEN. AND SO THOSE
13 OPERATORS THAT ARE HEAVILY DEPENDENT ON FARE REVENUES HAVE
14 EXPERIENCED MUCH HIGHER THAN ANTICIPATED LOSSES. CONVERSELY
15 OUR FORECAST OF REVENUE DERIVED FROM SALES TAXES WAS A BIT TOO
16 CONSERVATIVE AND IN MOST CASES, SAME FOR SAN FRANCISCO, SALES
17 TAX REVENUE LOSSES HAVE NOT BEEN NEARLY AS BAD AS ANTICIPATED.
18 THE TRUE-UP CALCULATION PROPOSAL TO ALLOCATE A TOTAL OF 179.6
19 MILLION TO FIVE OPERATORS AS LISTED IN THE SUMMARY TO THIS
20 ITEM. THIS LEAVES APPROXIMATELY 800 MILLION IN CRRSAA FUNDS
21 REMAINING TO BE DISTRIBUTED. EVEN THOUGH THERE ARE ONLY FIVE
22 OPERATORS THAT ARE PROPOSED TO RECEIVE A SHARE OF THIS FIRST
23 DISTRIBUTION, I DO WANT TO NOTE THAT ALL OPERATORS ARE FACING
24 OR WILL SOON FACE BUDGET ISSUES WITH THE ONGOING AND RESIDUAL
25 PANDEMIC IMPACTS. SOCIAL DISTANCING AND OTHER CONSTRAINTS MAKE



January 27, 2021

1 IT DIFFICULT FOR MANY OPERATORS TO MEET THE NEEDS OF THEIR
2 RIDERS CURRENTLY AND EVEN MORE IMPORTANTLY BUDGET FOR THE
3 POST-PANDEMIC REINSTATEMENT OF ADEQUATE SERVICE ONCE RIDERS
4 ARE READY TO RETURN. IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS FOR THE REMAINING
5 FUNDS OVER THE COMING WEEKS STAFF WILL BE DEVELOPING
6 DISTRIBUTION SCENARIO FOR THE REMAINING CRRSAA FUNDING. AS
7 WHAT DONE WITH THE CARES DISTRIBUTION, WE WILL BE
8 COMMUNICATING WITH YOU, COMMISSIONERS, AND TRANSIT OPERATORS
9 TO TRY TO BUILD SOME LEVEL OF CONSENSUS ON A DISTRIBUTION THAT
10 TAKES INTO ACCOUNT OPERATOR BUDGETARY NEEDS AS WELL AS SERVICE
11 NEEDS IN PARTICULAR FOR TRANSIT-DEPENDENT RIDERS. AT YOUR
12 FEBRUARY COMMISSION MEETING, STAFF WILL BE PROVIDING A REPORT
13 ON TRANSIT OPERATOR FINANCIAL AND SERVICE STATUS FOR BOTH THE
14 CURRENT YEAR AND THE UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR. SOME OF THIS
15 REPORTED INFORMATION COULD HELP TO THE DISCUSSION OF HOW TO
16 DISTRIBUTE THE REMAINING FUNDS. LASTLY, WE ARE TARGETING THE
17 MARCH PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING FOR
18 PROPOSED DISTRIBUTION OF THE REMAINING CRRSAA FUNDS. WITH
19 THAT, I WOULD ASK THAT YOU APPROVE RESOLUTION 4453 AND I'M
20 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, THERESE, FOR THIS REPORT.
23 THAT'S ALL GREAT NEWS. SOME OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS WE
24 NEED TO DO IS KEEP OUR TRANSIT ONLINE FOR OUR TRANSIT
25 DEPENDENT RIDERS. WE HAVE TO KEEP IT SAFE. AND WE HAVE TO BE



January 27, 2021

1 THERE AND BE AVAILABLE WHEN I THINK AS MS. ROMMEL MENTIONED,
2 AS WE ATTRACTED RIDERS BACK. AND I THINK WE ALL KNOW THAT THAT
3 WILL HAPPEN. SO I THINK THIS IS CERTAINLY GREAT NEWS FOR THE
4 REGION. HAVING SAID THAT, THERESE, MAYBE YOU COULD HELP ME A
5 LITTLE BIT. I KNOW THERE'S BEEN A LOT OF DISCUSSION IN
6 COMMITTEE AND SUCH ABOUT HOW WE WILL HELP THE SMALLER
7 OPERATORS OUTSIDE OF THE URBANIZED AREAS WHICH WILL BE A BIG
8 PROBLEM. I FORGET THE NUMBER NOW. IT'S LIKE 30 TO 40 PERCENT
9 OF LABDA'S RIDERSHIP, FOR EXAMPLE, IS BART ON/OFF. SO IT'S A
10 FABRIC OF WOVEN QUILT OR WHATEVER THAT REALLY PUTS ALL THESE
11 TRANSIT AGENCIES TOGETHER, YOU KNOW. SFMTA NEEDS BART. BART
12 NEEDS LABDA. IT'S KIND OF -- SO IT'S NOT -- I WANT TO MAKE
13 SURE WE DON'T GET TO A POSITION OF HAVES AND HAVE NOTS. SO DO
14 YOU WANT TO TALK MORE? TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT IT TODAY AND
15 THEN MAYBE I THINK WE WILL GO A LITTLE DEEPER IN FEBRUARY. BUT
16 I FELT IT NEEDED TO BE ADDRESSED.

17

18 **TERESA ROMMEL:** ABSOLUTELY. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR, FOR BRINGING
19 THIS UP. THIS IS ONE OF THE TRUE SPOTLIGHTS THAT WE ARE
20 PUTTING ON OUR WORK GOING FORWARD JUST AS QUICK BACKDROP AS
21 YOU ALL PROBABLY REMEMBER. THE CRRSAA ACT HAD A DIFFERENT
22 NATIONAL FORMULA STRUCTURE. AND RESPONDING IN PART TO THEIR
23 OWN IMBALANCES THEY'D SEEN WITH THE CARES ACT. AND ON THE
24 UPSIDE, AND IT'S A BIG UPSIDE, THAT RESTRUCTURED FORMULA
25 BROUGHT PROBABLY 200 MILLION PLUS, MORE FUNDING TO THE BAY



January 27, 2021

1 AREA THAN WE OTHERWISE WOULD HAVE GOTTEN. BUT IT WAS WITH
2 THESE STRICTURES THAT ONLY THREE URBANIZED AREAS ABSORBED THAT
3 FUNDING. NOW, MANY OPERATORS OPERATE IN THOSE THREE URBANIZED
4 AREAS INCLUDING A NUMBER OF OUR SMALLER OPERATORS THAT CROSS
5 THE BORDER AND THEREFORE WOULD BE ELIGIBLE, BUT THERE ARE
6 SOMEWHERE THAT IS NOT AS CLEAR, NOT AS EVIDENT. SO A TOP
7 PRIORITY FOR US IS TWO THINGS. ONE IS TO MAKE SURE THAT WE
8 HAVE THE OPERATING NEEDS OF EVERY SINGLE OPERATOR IN THE
9 REGION FOR THE BALANCE OF THIS FISCAL YEAR AND THE NEXT FISCAL
10 YEAR. THE NEEDS OF EVERYBODY. AND THEN BASED ON THAT NEED, WE
11 WILL BE LOOKING TO ENSURE THAT THOSE NEEDS WILL BE MET
12 SOMEHOW. AND WE ARE PUTTING TOGETHER A TOOLKIT, A VERY
13 OVERUSED METAPHOR, BUT ONE I THINK APPROPRIATE HERE, OF WHAT
14 WE CAN BRING TO THE TABLE IN TERMS OF EITHER ALTERNATIVE
15 REVENUES OR ALTERNATIVE WAYS WE WORK WITH EXISTING REVENUES
16 THAT ARE ALREADY DIRECTED TO OPERATIONS TO ENSURE THOSE NEEDS
17 ARE MET. SO INDEED WE WILL BE BRINGING MORE INFORMATION ON
18 WHAT WE SEE ON THE TABLE IN FEBRUARY AS PART OF THAT REPORT ON
19 FINANCIAL STATUS.

20

21 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. GOT TAKE COUPLE QUESTIONS. I
22 GOT COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND COMMISSIONER SPERING.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** SO QUICK QUESTION. THIS FUNDING ONLY BRINGS THOSE
25 TRANSIT AGENCIES UP TO DECEMBER OF LAST YEAR; IS THAT CORRECT?



January 27, 2021

1

2 **TERESA ROMMEL:** THAT'S CORRECT.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** THAT IS JUST COVERING THAT. THANK YOU.

5

6 **THERESE ROMMEL:** IT'S CALCULATING THE RECALCULATION OF SHARES
7 FOR THE MARCH THROUGH DECEMBER PERIOD. IT DOESN'T NECESSARILY
8 TIE DIRECTLY TO THE AMOUNT OF ACTUAL LOSSES EACH OPERATOR HAS
9 EXPERIENCED OVER THAT TIME PERIOD.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

14

15 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. FIRST, I WANT TO
16 THANK COMMISSIONER LICCARDO. THIS WAS HIS IDEA. AND AT THE
17 TIME I THOUGHT IT WAS CRAZY. BUT IT WAS THE RIGHT THING TO DO.
18 AND SO, SAM, THANK YOU, FOR HAVING THAT VISION TO SEEING THAT
19 PROBLEM THAT WAS GOING TO BE BEFORE US. THE OTHER, MR.
20 CHAIRMAN, IS I JUST WANT TO ECHO YOUR COMMENTS THE SMALL
21 OPERATORS. I KNOW THE FOUR NORTH BAY COUNTIES, WE'RE REALLY
22 CONCERNED. WE FEED INTO THE TRANSIT NETWORK. AND WE HAVE
23 TRANSIT-DEPENDENT PEOPLE. AND SO THEY JUST CAN'T BE
24 OVERLOOKED. SO THERESE, I HOPE THAT WE WILL REALLY FOLLOW UP
25 ON THE CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS ON THE SMALLER OPERATORS BECAUSE



January 27, 2021

1 THEY DO PLAY A ROLE IN THE REGIONAL SYSTEM. THANK YOU, MR.
2 CHAIRMAN.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, MR. SPERING. COMMISSIONER
5 CHAVEZ?

6

7 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO ECHO CHAIR
8 HAGGERTY'S CONCERN HOW WE'RE CONCERNING LOW INCOME AND
9 TRANSIT-DEPENDENT RIDERS EVERYWHERE. I THINK THAT'S A REALLY
10 CRITICAL POINT. AND IT'S CERTAINLY SOMETHING THAT BTA IS
11 CONCERNED ABOUT. THE OTHER POINT I WANTED TO RAISE IS I THINK
12 THE POINT THAT BOTH COMMISSIONER SPERING AND CHAIR HAGGERTY
13 RAISED ABOUT THAT INTERCONNECTEDNESS BETWEEN OUR AGENCIES IS
14 REALLY IMPORTANT. AND ONE THING THAT WE'VE BEEN REALLY FOCUSED
15 ON AT BTA IS WE'RE ACTUALLY FUNDING A LOT OF OUR PARTNER
16 ORGANIZATIONS RIGHT NOW. AND SO MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE
17 INCLUDING THAT AS WE THINK ABOUT, YOU KNOW, FUTURE FUNDING.
18 AND THEN THE LAST IS THAT I DO WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE
19 LOOKING AT HISTORICAL AVERAGES FOR ALLOCATIONS WE'RE NOT IN AN
20 EMERGENCY FRAMEWORK. SO I JUST WANTED TO RAISE THOSE AS THINGS
21 I'D ALSO LIKE THE STAFF TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE CONSIDERING. AND
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

25



January 27, 2021

1 **AMY WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO
2 CONCUR WITH THE COMMENTS OF OUR CHAIR AND COMMISSIONER SPERING
3 IN TERMS OF THE IMPORTANT NEEDS OF THE SMALLER OPERATORS. WE
4 ARE PROVIDING, AGAIN, SIMILAR SERVICE TO OUR TRANSIT DEPENDENT
5 COMMUNITY AND ALSO SUPPORTING THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
6 NETWORK. SO I REALLY APPRECIATE STAFF WORKING WITH THIS. I
7 KNOW THAT THE UNIQUENESS OF THE BAY AREA'S FEDERAL URBANIZED
8 AREAS IS SOMEWHAT DIFFERENT THAN A LOT OF THE AREAS AROUND THE
9 COUNTRY. SO I RECOGNIZE THAT THIS FORMULA HAS BROUGHT
10 ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO THE BAY AREA AND AT THE SAME TIME WE
11 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT ALL OF OUR RIDERS HAVE THE BENEFIT --
12 AND THE OPERATORS AND OUR FOLKS THAT WORK IN THE TRANSIT
13 AGENCIES HAVE THE BENEFIT OF RECEIVING THE APPROPRIATE
14 FUNDING. SO I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR WORKING ON THIS AND LOOK
15 FORWARD TO IT COMING BACK IN FEBRUARY.

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. RABBITT. COMMISSIONER
18 RABBITT?

19

20 **DAVID RABBITT:** JUST TO BEAT THAT DRUM A LITTLE FURTHER AND
21 REINFORCE IT. OBVIOUSLY THE URBANIZED AREAS HAVE GREAT BENEFIT
22 BUT ALSO AGREE THAT THOSE WHO RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT, WHAT WE
23 SEE HERE IN THE NORTH BAY, THOSE WHO ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS
24 RELYING ON PUBLIC TRANSIT ARE JUST AS IMPORTANT AS ANY OTHER
25 PERSON WITHIN THE ENTIRE BAY AREA. RIGHT NOW, THE COMMUTE



January 27, 2021

1 TIMES FOR THEM ARE INCREASING BECAUSE OF THE LACK OF SERVICES
2 AND EVEN THE LACK OF CAPACITY ON THE BUSES THEMSELVES, PASSING
3 THEM UP WHEN THEY'RE FULL BECAUSE OF THE COVID RESTRICTIONS.
4 SO I KNOW WE ALL FEEL THIS PAIN. AND I KNOW THAT WE ALL WANT
5 TO SOLVE THAT ISSUE GOING FORWARD. SO I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE
6 IT'S FRONT AND CENTER. AND I APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

9

10 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. APPRECIATE ALL THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE
11 BEEN MADE SO FAR. JUST WOULD ADD I THINK CONSIDERATION IN
12 PARTICULAR FOR OPERATORS THAT HAVE TIGHTENED THE BELT
13 THEMSELVES AND REALLY ADJUSTED THEIR SERVICE LEVELS FOR
14 REDUCED RIDERSHIP AND REALLY FOCUSED ON REDUCING THEIR
15 OPERATING COSTS. WE KNOW THESE ARE ALL REALLY PEOPLE
16 DECISIONS, BUT WE JUST DON'T WANT TO SEE MORE REGIONAL DOLLARS
17 GO AFTER AGENCIES THAT AREN'T TAKING THOSE DIFFICULT DECISIONS
18 FIRST.

19

20 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** GOING TO MY VICE CHAIR, COMMISSIONER
21 PEDROZA.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I JUST WANT TO CONFER
24 WITH THE COMMENTS FROM MAYOR LICCARDO. HOW DO WE CAPTURE THAT
25 DATA? I THINK THAT'S THE OPPORTUNITY WE HAVE HERE. TO LOOK AT



January 27, 2021

1 WHAT THOSE OPERATORS DID THAT WAS INNOVATIVE, THAT WAS TRYING
2 TO REDUCE COSTS, THAT WAS TRYING TO BE SUSTAINABLE. AND I
3 THINK THIS IS WHAT WE CAN LEARN, WHETHER YOU'RE A BIG OPERATOR
4 OR SMALL. I COULD SPEAK ABOUT SHIFTING TO ON-DEMAND SERVICE TO
5 BE MORE NIMBLE AND FLEXIBLE. SAVING COSTS BUT ALSO INCREASED
6 RIDERSHIP, ACTUALLY, RIGHT? I THINK IT'S NOT JUST THE SENSE OF
7 DOLLARS. HOW DO WE CAPTURE THE INNOVATION THAT WE SAW DURING
8 THESE HARDEST TIMES? BECAUSE I DO BELIEVE WE HAVE SOME
9 INNOVATIVE OPERATORS OUT THERE. THANK YOU. AND AGREE WITH
10 COMMENTS FROM THE CHAIR.

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. THERESE, DID YOU WANT TO
13 RESPOND TO ANY OF THAT?

14

15 **THERESE ROMMEL:** JUST TO SAY AS I MENTIONED THIS IS TOP OF
16 MIND FOR US. AND I DEFINITELY APPRECIATE A COUPLE OF THE
17 REITERATING POINTS. A LASER FOCUS ON THOSE THAT MOST NEED THE
18 SERVICE. LOW INCOME POPULATIONS AND OUR MINORITY POPULATIONS,
19 OUR TRANSIT DEPENDENT POPULATIONS. ONE OF THE THINGS -- ONE OF
20 THE IMPORTANT DATA POINTS WE WILL HAVE THIS TIME FROM LAST
21 TIME IS WHO IS ACTUALLY -- WHO HAS BEEN USING THE SERVICE IN
22 THESE ENSUING MONTHS THAT COVID'S BEEN THERE? THAT'S AN
23 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT PIECE OF INFORMATION WE DID NOT HAVE BACK
24 IN THE SPRING WHEN ALL THIS STARTED. AND THAT WILL BE
25 CONSIDERED AS A FACTOR IN OUR EVALUATIONS. I ALSO WOULD SAY



January 27, 2021

1 THAT THE INNOVATIONS THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE PUT INTO
2 PLACE ARE INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. YOU KNOW, I WOULD NOTE THAT
3 SOMETIMES OUR SMALLER OPERATORS HAVE THE CAPACITY TO BE MORE
4 NIMBLE, OFTEN, IN LOOKING AT ALTERNATIVE SERVICE DELIVERY
5 SIMPLY BECAUSE OF, YOU KNOW, THE EASE AT WHICH THEY CAN PIVOT
6 AND CHANGE SERVICES. AND I THINK THOSE ARE CRITICAL LESSONS
7 LEARNED, NOT JUST AS A RESPONSE IN THIS ONGOING RECOVERY BUT
8 AS, YOU KNOW, JIM SPERING HEADING UP THE BLUE RIBBON TASKFORCE
9 IS LOOKING AT, IT'S GIVING US A SENSE OF THE CAPACITY OF OUR
10 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO RESPOND AND DO BETTER TO THE NEEDS THAT
11 THEY SEE FROM THE CUSTOMER. IN TIMES OF CRISIS AND WITHOUT. SO
12 REALLY APPRECIATE THOSE OBSERVATIONS AND WILL BE INCORPORATING
13 THAT INTO OUR WORK.

14
15 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. SO I DON'T SEE ANYBODY ELSE
16 THAT WISHES TO SPEAK. I WOULD JUST LIKE TO SAY THAT IT REALLY
17 GOES WITHOUT SAYING, I WANT TO THANK, AGAIN, OUR STAFF.
18 REBECCA LONG, RANDI RENTSCHLER. OUR FEDERAL PARTNERS, WHETHER
19 IT'S THE STAFFS OF THE CONGRESS, CONGRESSIONAL MEMBERS, THE
20 SENATE. THERE WAS A LOT OF WORK PUT INTO THIS. AND I THINK WE
21 OWE THEM A CONGRATULATIONS. BUT I THINK ULTIMATELY WHAT THIS
22 IS DOING IS THIS IS KEEPING PEOPLE EMPLOYED. THIS IS -- IT'S
23 NOT JUST THE PEOPLE THAT ARE DRIVING THE BUS AND THE BART AND
24 THE FERRIES AND THAT KIND OF STUFF, IT'S KEEPING PEOPLE
25 EMPLOYED THAT, YOU KNOW, ARE NOT JUST EMPLOYED BUT PROVIDING A



January 27, 2021

1 SERVICE. AND I THINK THAT'S THE IMPORTANT THING. WE'RE
2 PROVIDING A SERVICE TO HELP OTHER PEOPLE STAY EMPLOYED, ALSO
3 THAT DEPEND ON TRANSIT IN THEIR EVERYDAY USE. SO I'M REALLY
4 PROUD OF THIS ACTION. AND I JUST WANT TO SAY I THINK IT'S A
5 GREAT JOB BY EVERYBODY. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I LOOK
6 FORWARD TO MORE CRRSAA MONEY IN THE FUTURE. SO WITH THAT, DO I
7 HAVE ANYBODY IN THE PUBLIC THAT WISHES TO SPEAK?

8

9 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES, MR. CHAIR. I'VE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC
10 COMMENT. AND THE FIRST PERSON IS SOMEONE FROM PUBLIC
11 ADVOCATES. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO?

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES, I CAN HEAR YOU.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS EMILY. I'M A MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR
18 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION AND I'D LIKE TO SPEAK IN
19 SUPPORT OF THE PROPOSAL TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL STABILITY FOR
20 TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES DOLLARS FOR OPERATIONS. I ALSO
21 WANTED TO SUPPORT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN'S PROPOSAL THAT
22 THE FEDERAL RELIEF FUNDING BE DISTRIBUTED BASED ON AGENCY
23 NEED. I BELIEVE THIS NEED SHOULD INCLUDE A DETERMINATION OF
24 WHICH RIDERS ARE BEING PASSED UP BY BUSES. I KNOW, FOR
25 EXAMPLE, BTA WAS HAVING TO PASS UP MANY RIDERS AT BUS STOPS



January 27, 2021

1 BECAUSE THEIR BUSES WERE FILLED DUE TO THE NEW COVID-19
2 MAXIMUMS. AND I'D LIKE TO SEE MONEY BE SPENT SO THAT THESE
3 AGENCIES CAN INCREASE THEIR SERVICE SO THAT NOBODY IS PASSED
4 UP AND EVERYONE IS ABLE TO SAFELY RIDE THE BUS. I ALSO WANT TO
5 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT DESPITE THE EXCELLENT PROPOSALS, THIS MONEY
6 WILL NOT BE ENOUGH TO ENSURE THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT SURVIVES THIS
7 CRISIS. SO I'D LIKE TO ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO USE EVERY
8 AVAILABLE AVENUE TO ADDRESS IT. ONE EXAMPLE BEING THE NEW
9 FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION RELIEF FUNDS, WHICH COULD BE
10 PRIORITIZED FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. PUBLIC TRANSIT IS SO ESSENTIAL
11 FOR THE REOPENING OF OUR ECONOMY AND ESPECIALLY WITH OUR
12 CLIMATE CRISIS THAT THREATENS THE EXTINCTION OF OUR SPECIES. I
13 THINK THAT MONEY SHOULD SURELY BE PRIORITIZED THERE INSTEAD OF
14 FOR HIGHWAYS, FOR EXAMPLE. THANK YOU SO MUCH. HAVE A GREAT
15 DAY.

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ROWLAND LEBRON.
20 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR, FOR CONTINUING THIS
23 CONVERSATION. I'D LIKE TO BRING UP TWO AGENCIES WHICH ARE
24 BASICALLY COMPLETE OPPOSITE END OF THE SPECTRUM HERE TO YOUR
25 ATTENTION. THIS IS -- AND CALTRAIN. ON THE ONE HAND YOU'VE HAD



January 27, 2021

1 THE VTA WHO HAVE BEEN OVERCAUTIOUS AND HAVE DRASTICALLY
2 REDUCED SERVICE. AND IF YOU LOOK THE WORKSHOP WE HAD LAST
3 FRIDAY WHERE THE BUDGET WAS DISCUSSED UNDER ITEM 3.2, BY JUNE,
4 THE DEFICIT WILL ONLY HAVE BEEN \$11.6 MILLION. WHICH MEANS
5 THAT BY THE TIME WE APPLY THE FUNDING, IN JUNE 2021, THE VGA
6 WILL HAVE A SURPLUS 124.5 MILLION IN CARES ACT FUNDING. AT
7 THIS POINT IN TIME WHY ISN'T THE VGA USING THAT MONEY TO
8 PROVIDE SERVICE TO THE HUNDREDS OF PEOPLE THAT ARE BEING LEFT
9 ON THE SIDE OF THE ROAD RIGHT NOW? NOW, MOVING TO THE OPPOSITE
10 END OF THE SPECTRUM, LET'S START LOOKING AT CALTRAIN AND MAKE
11 IT VERY CLEAR THAT IF THAT AGENCY NEEDS TO BE AS RESPONSIBLE
12 AS THEY'VE BEEN FOR THE LAST EIGHT MONTHS WITHOUT REGARD TO
13 THE KIND OF SERVICE THEY'RE PROVIDING, THAT QUITE FRANKLY,
14 BARELY ANYBODY IS INTERESTED IN, SOME REGIONAL ACTION IS GOING
15 TO TAKE PLACE AND PROBABLY STARTING WITH THE COMPLETE
16 REPLACEMENT OF THE UPPER MANAGEMENT. THANK YOU.

17
18 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPREE.
19 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20
21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SCOTT HAGGERTY. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
22 RECORD. AS I LOOK AT THIS CHART HERE, YES, SOME PEOPLE ARE
23 GOING TO WALK AWAY UNHAPPY. BUT I THINK WHAT WE ARE SEEING
24 HERE IS TO BE ABLE TO GET HELP TO THOSE WHO NEED IT MOST. AND
25 BART IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT IN THE REGION. WHILE I SAY THAT NO



January 27, 2021

1 ONE OPERATOR, LARGE OR SMALL, IS ANYMORE IMPORTANT THAN
2 ANOTHER, BART HAS THE UNIQUE POSITION IN THAT IT CROSSES WATER
3 AND BRINGS TWO SIDES OF THE BAY TOGETHER. IT'S KIND OF A
4 HYBRID, I THINK, BETWEEN NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY AND THE METRO
5 NORTH RAILROAD. NOW WE JUST NEED SOME GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL
6 FOR YOU. AND IT'S A SYSTEM THAT I'VE DEPENDED ON. SO I THINK
7 THAT MONEY WILL HELP. I THINK TRUE-UP IS REASONABLE BECAUSE
8 SOMETIMES WE HAVE TO DO AN AFTER-ACTION REVIEW IN ORDER TO BE
9 ABLE TO GET MONEY BACK BECAUSE I FEEL VERY STRONGLY THAT BART
10 IS THE A REGARD THAT NEEDS TO KEEP RUNNING. THANK YOU.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS KIM BUCOWSKI.
13 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. MR. BUKOWSKI, ARE YOU THERE? YOU'RE
14 UNMUTED ON THIS END, MR. BUKOWSKI. I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING
15 TO BE ABLE TO HEAR HIM.

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WHEN I'VE HAD MR. BUKOWSKI AT OTHER
18 TIMES, IT SEEMS TO BE HARD TO GET HIM ON. SOMETIMES HE TURNS
19 AROUND AND COMES IN ON A DIFFERENT LINE. SO WE'LL GO AHEAD AND
20 MOVE ON, KEN. IF YOU CAN GET BACK IN, WE'LL GET YOU BACK IN.
21 BUT RIGHT NOW WE CAN'T SEEM TO MAKE CONTACT. WE WILL MOVE
22 FORWARD. I SEE NO OTHER SPEAKERS. IS THAT CORRECT?

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THAT'S CORRECT, MR. CHAIR.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** NOBODY WISHING TO SPEAK ON THE
2 COMMISSION SIDE. I WOULD SAY THAT WAS A MOTION BY JOSEFOWITZ
3 AND I'M ASSUMING IT'S A SECOND BY LICCARDO? IS THAT CORRECT,
4 MR. LICCARDO OR MAYOR LICCARDO?

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'LL SECOND, MR. CHAIR IF LICCARDO IS NOT ON.

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WE'LL TAKE YOU SECOND, ALFREDO.
9 KIMBERLY, WE'RE GOOD FOR A VOTE?

10

11 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. HAGGERTY?

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AUN: AYE.

20

21 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. CANEPA?

22

23 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

24

25 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLLY?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE.

7

8 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO? COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

13 MACKENZIE?

14

15 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

18

19 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

20

21 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

22

23 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** AYE.

24

25 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** YES.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THE NEXT TWO ITEMS ARE REFERRED BY THE
7 PROGRAMMING ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. AND I DON'T THINK THERE'S
8 STAFF PRESENTATION. SO IF WE MIGHT WANT TO TAKE THEM TOGETHER,
9 CHAIR?

10

11 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES. THE CHAIR WOULD LIKE TO TAKE THEM
12 TOGETHER. THANK YOU.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. TO ITEM 9 B. MTC RESOLUTION
15 TRANSFERRING CAPITAL PRIORITIES STARTING 2021. ESTABLISHES THE
16 PROCESS CRITERIA STARTING WITH FY2021. THE TCP PROGRAM GOVERNS
17 THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION BRIDGE TOLLS AND OTHER
18 REGIONAL REVENUES DESIGNATED FOR CORE CAPACITY GRANT PROJECTS
19 AND STPC MAC FUNDS DESIGNATED FOR TRANSIT PRIORITIES THROUGH
20 THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM FUND FOR REHABILITATION AND
21 MAIN TEN ANSWER OPERATIONS. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION
22 NUMBER 4444. AGENDA ITEM 9 C. NUMBER 3925 REVISED 4202 REVISED
23 SAFE AND SEAMLESS QUICK STRIKE PROGRAM ADOPTS THE POLICY
24 PROGRAM FOR A SAFE AND SEAMLESS QUICK STRIKE PROGRAM TO BE
25 FUNDED THROUGH CAPACITY CREATED BY THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY



January 27, 2021

1 INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAM. SINCE THE JANUARY COMMITTEE MEETING,
2 STAFF HAS UPDATED APPENDIX A.B. 11 OF NUMBER 42082. THIS
3 UPDATED ATTACHMENT IS INCLUDED IN THE PACKET. I MOVE APPROVAL
4 TO RESOLUTION NUMBER 3525 REVISED AND 4402 REVISED.

5

6 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I A MOTION.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** WILL SECOND THIS.

9

10 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** DID YOU HAVE ANYTHING?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I'M GOOD.

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY. QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS BY
15 COMMISSION MEMBERS? KIMBERLY ANYBODY IN THE PUBLIC?

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. I RECEIVED TWO PUBLIC COMMENTS. ONE FOR
18 ITEM 9 B IS FROM VOICES OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND ONE FOR
19 ITEM 9 C. FOR BAY AREA BICYCLE ORGANIZATION. AND I DO HAVE A
20 COUPLE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED FIRST IS
21 ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SCOTT HAGGERTY. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
24 RECORD. CAPITAL IS IMPORTANT EVEN IN THIS CHALLENGING TIME
25 THAT IS COVID. AND THE DIVERSION OF MONEY FROM CAPITAL TO



January 27, 2021

1 OPERATIONS CONCERNS ME. I STATE THAT I THINK AN EXTREMELY
2 IMPORTANT PRIORITY IN CAPITAL ALLOCATIONS IS FOR WHAT IS
3 CALLED ADA WORK. THERE ARE STILL VARIOUS FACILITIES IN THE BAY
4 AREA SUCH AS 22ND STREET STATION ON CALTRAIN THAT ARE NOT ADA
5 ACCESSIBLE. AND I ADVOCATE FOR ALL OF OUR REGIONAL PUBLIC
6 TRANSIT NETWORKS TO BE 100 PERCENT ADA ACCESSIBLE. WHILE WE DO
7 HAVE A POWER TRANSIT NETWORK, THE ELIGIBILITY FOR POWER
8 TRANSIT -- PARATRANSIT IS QUITE NARROW. . AND SO I ASK THAT IN
9 THIS POLICY, THAT WE NEVER SACRIFICE ADA IN ORDER TO KEEP OUR
10 SYSTEMS OPERATING. THANK YOU.

11
12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU.

13
14 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER LAST FOUR
15 DIGITS 7838. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16
17 **SPEAKER:** HI THERE, COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS CHRISTOPHER WHITE,
18 I'M PROGRAM DIRECTOR AT THE SAN FRANCISCO BICYCLE THE
19 COALITION. AND I AM JUST WANTING TO VOICE FIRST OF ALL THE
20 BICYCLE STRONG SUPPORT FOR THE MOBILITY QUICK STRIKE PROGRAM
21 AND REALLY WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSIONERS FOR CONSIDERING
22 THIS RESPONSIVE FUNDING TO HELP SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION
23 ACROSS THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

24
25 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. NOBODY ELSE FROM THE PUBLIC?



January 27, 2021

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD:** ONE MORE FROM BIKE EAST BAY. PLEASE UNMUTE
3 YOURSELF.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS DAVE CAMBLE WITH BIKE EAST BAY. I ALSO AM IN
6 SUPPORT. I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF FOR THEIR QUICK THINKING
7 HERE, THEIR INNOVATION AND RESPONSIVENESS AND ALSO SUPPORT FOR
8 BIKE PROGRAMMING ACTIVITIES IN ADDITION TO QUICK BUILD BIKE
9 WALK TRANSIT PROJECTS. WE'RE ALREADY TALKING WITH A LOT OF
10 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS WORKING HARD AS WELL AS WITH
11 TRANSIT AGENCIES LIKE A.C. TRANSIT TO SEE IF WE CAN GET SOME
12 QUICK IMPROVEMENTS FOR WALKING, BIKING, AND TRANSIT IN A
13 MULTIMODAL FASHION. SO THANKS TO MTC FOR YOUR SUPPORT. LOOKING
14 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH THE ALAMEDA C.T.C. AND THE CONTRA
15 COSTA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY HERE IN THE EAST BAY TO GET
16 GOING IMPLEMENTING THIS MONEY. THANK YOU.

17

18 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MONICA MELON HAS RAISED HER HAND.
19 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF MS. MELON.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HI, THIS IS MONICA MALON. A TRANSPORTATION RIDER AND
22 ADVOCATE AND MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
23 COALITION. HOPEFULLY YOU'VE ALL READ OUR LETTER. BUT WE DO
24 REALLY STRONGLY SUPPORT ITEM 9 B AND THE POSSIBLE THAT IT
25 WOULD HELP PREVENT TRANSIT CUTS AND LAYOFFS. THANK YOU.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THAT IS THE LAST PUBLIC SPEAKER MR. CHAIR.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY. I HAVE A COUPLE COMMISSIONERS THAT
5 DECIDED THEY WANTED TO SAY SOMETHING. SO COMMISSIONER WORTH,
6 FOLLOWED BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

7

8 **AMY WORTH:** YEAH, THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. YOU KNOW, I'LL BE
9 BRIEF. BUT FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR PULLING THIS
10 TOGETHER. THIS IS AN INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY FOR OUR REGION TO
11 TAKE QUICK ACTION ON PROJECTS THAT ARE READY TO GO. AND I
12 THINK THE FACT THAT IT ACCOMMODATES BOTH AN OPPORTUNITY FOR
13 INVESTMENTS IN LOCAL COMMUNITIES AS WELL AS SOME OF THE
14 REGIONAL INVESTMENTS SUCH AS OUR BRIDGE FORWARD PROGRAMS AND A
15 VARIETY OF INITIATIVES THAT WE CAN IMPLEMENT IMMEDIATELY TO
16 ACHIEVE THE GOAL OF INCREASED MOBILITY AND ALSO INVESTMENT TO
17 PROVIDE AS A LEGACY AS WE MOVE FORWARD TO REALLY ADDRESS THE
18 ISSUES OF LOCAL MOBILITY AS WELL AS IMPROVE ACCESS FOR TRANSIT
19 IN ALL OF OUR CORRIDORS. SO THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH,
20 STAFF.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

23

24 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO ASK STAFF IF THEY
25 COULD JUST EXPLAIN A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN



January 27, 2021

1 THE APPROACH OF QUICK STRIKE VERSUS QUICK BUILD. I READ THE
2 REPORT, AND IT FEELS INTERCHANGEABLE. BUT I'M NOT SURE -- I
3 WANT TO MAKE SURE THERE'S NOT ANYTHING I'M MISSING.

4

5 **THERESE ROMMEL:** I THINK COMMISSIONER WE REFER TO QUICK BUILD
6 AS SOMETHING THAT COULD BE QUICKLY BUILT AND PUT INTO USE.
7 QUICK STRIKE I THINK IS A LITTLE BIT OF A BROADER CONTEXT THAT
8 WE USE JUST TO SAY THAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR PROJECTS THAT CAN BE
9 DELIVERED QUICKLY BUT MAYBE NOT QUITE FITTING THE DESCRIPTION
10 OF THE QUICK BUILD. BUT DELIVERED ON A SHORT TIME FRAME AS
11 OPPOSED TO A QUICK BUILD, WHICH IS SOMETHING TEMPORARY,
12 QUICKLY PUT TOGETHER TO PROVIDE BENEFIT.

13

14 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO QUICK BUILD REFERS TO TEMPORARY
15 IMPROVEMENTS?

16

17 **THERESE ROMMEL:** SOMETIMES THEY ARE TEMPORARY. SOMETIMES THEY
18 CAN BE MADE PERMANENT. BUT THEY ARE TEMPORARY.

19

20 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** ONE CONCERN I HAVE IS WAS THIS A
21 PROGRAMMATIC -- WAS THIS A CHANGE OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS
22 FROM GOING FROM QUICK BUILD TO QUICK STRIKE? I THINK IT'S KIND
23 OF -- I MEAN, AGAIN, THE LANGUAGE IS A LITTLE CONFUSING.

24



January 27, 2021

1 **THERESE ROMMEL:** THE LANGUAGE IS I THINK CONFUSING BUT THERE
2 HASN'T BEEN ANY CHANGE WHEN WE INITIALLY ENVISIONED THIS, WE
3 LOOKED FOR PROJECTS THAT COULD BE QUICKLY DELIVERED WHICH IS
4 WHY WE USED THE QUICK STRIKE PROGRAM VERSUS WHAT WE NORMALLY
5 TALK ABOUT BEING QUICK BUILD PROJECTS.

6

7 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. I SEE NO OTHER QUESTIONS. I
10 DO WANT TO SHARE ONE OF THE CALLERS ACTUALLY ALLUDED,
11 MENTIONED THE CAUTION ON USING CAPITAL MONEY ON OPERATIONS.
12 AND ALTHOUGH I BELIEVE IT'S A TOOL IN THE TOOLBOX, I DON'T
13 BELIEVE THAT IT'S SOMETHING WE SHOULD ALWAYS JUST RUN TO
14 BECAUSE I THINK ONE OF THE BIGGEST PROBLEMS WE CAN EVER GET TO
15 IS HAVE AN AGING FLEET THAT'S BREAKING DOWN THAT BECOMES
16 UNRELIABLE. I THINK THAT'S ALWAYS BEEN ONE OF THE THINGS I'VE
17 BEEN MOST PROUD ABOUT IN THE BAY AREA IS WE DO HAVE GOOD
18 EQUIPMENT THAT RUNS AROUND THE STREETS AND ON THE WATERS AND
19 NOW WITH MAJOR INVESTMENT IN BART, WE MADE A MAJOR INVESTMENT
20 INTO TRANSIT AND KEEPING IT RELIABLE. AND BY STARTING TO ALLOW
21 THEM TO USE CAPITAL MONEY COULD ONLY HURT US IN THE FUTURE. SO
22 I THINK IT'S A TOOL IN THE TOOLBOX, BUT I DON'T THINK IT'S ONE
23 THAT WE HAVE TO GO TO RIGHT AWAY. THAT'S MY COMMENT. ANYBODY
24 ELSE? I SEE NOBODY ELSE. WE DID THE PUBLIC COMMENT. THIS DOES



January 27, 2021

1 REQUIRE A VOTE. IT WAS ON BOTH MOTIONS. AND I'M ASSUMING OUR
2 ATTORNEY IS OKAY WITH THAT. SO WITH THAT.

3

4 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT IS TOTALLY FINE.

5

6 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** APPRECIATE THAT. WITH THAT, ROLL CALL
7 VOLT, PLEASE.

8

9 **KIMBERLY WARD:** WITH A MOTION BY JOSEPH WHICH IS SECOND BY
10 DUTRA VERNACI. HAGGERTY?

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE. AUN: AYE.

17

18 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

19

20 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

21

22 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. CONNOLLY?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE.

2

3 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

6

7 **KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO? COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

8 MACKENZIE?

9

10 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

13

14 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

15

16 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

17

18 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** AYE.

19

20 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** YES.

21

22 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE NOW GOING TO
2 MOVE TO ITEM 150 WILLIS OUR PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT BY
3 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

4

5 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN, THE WITH THE
6 ABAG COMMITTEE MET ON JANUARY 8TH AND THE MTC PLANNING
7 COMMITTEE REFERRED ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.
8 MR. CHAIRMAN, WITH YOUR PERMISSION I'D LIKE TO MAKE THE REPORT
9 AND STAFF WILL PUT A LITTLE CLARITY ON THE MOTION ITSELF. SO
10 WITH YOUR PERMISSION, THAT'S WHAT I'D LIKE TO DO.

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THAT'S CORRECT. WE HAD TALKED ABOUT IT
13 YESTERDAY. AND I THINK THAT'S THE PROPER TO GO. SO GO AHEAD
14 AND MOVE FORWARD, PLEASE.

15

16 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. AGENDA ITEM 10
17 A, MTC RESOLUTION 4451, PLAN BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT.
18 APPROVAL AS PREFERRED ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT ALTERNATIVE.
19 IDENTIFIES A FINAL BLUEPRINT AS THE PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE FOR
20 THE PLAN BAY AREA 2050. AS THE COMMISSION IS AWARE, THE
21 ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS CONSIDERED THIS ACTION AS
22 REFERRED BY ITS ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ON JANUARY 21ST. YOU
23 MAY ALSO BE AWARE THAT SEVERAL JURISDICTIONS SENT LETTERS TO
24 BOTH ABAG AND MTC INCLUDED IN THE MTC CORRESPONDENCE THAT
25 HOPEFULLY YOU ALL HAVE SEEN IDENTIFYING SIGNIFICANT IMPACTS



January 27, 2021

1 THEY BELIEVE ACCRUED WITH CHANGES MADE FROM THE DRAFT TO THE
2 FINAL BLUEPRINT, INCLUDING INCREASES IN THEIR ASSIGNED
3 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ASSESSMENTS, HOUSING ALLOCATION THAT
4 PIVOT FROM THE PLAN BAY AREA PROJECTIONS. ABAG HEARD FROM
5 SEVERAL JURISDICTIONS DURING ITS MEETINGS. AND THAT MEETING
6 WENT ON FOR SIX HOURS. RESPONDED TO, IN PART, WITH A STAFF
7 PRESENTATION ALSO INCLUDED IN YOUR ATTACHMENTS. PRESIDENT
8 RECOGNIZED THAT SEVERAL JURISDICTIONS EXPERIENCED DIFFERENT
9 HOUSING CHANGES AS THE PLAN SOUGHT TO BALANCE THE DUELING
10 STATE DRIVE MANDATES FOR HOUSING PRODUCTION AFFORDABILITY AND
11 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS AMONG OTHERS, WHICH HAVE BEEN
12 ENDEMIC THROUGHOUT THIS LONG-RANGE PLANNING PROCESS. ABAG
13 RECOGNIZE THAT HAD POTENTIAL GENTRIFICATION AND DISPLACEMENT
14 IMPACTS PARTICULARLY IN MAJOR CONCERN WITH FUTURE DEVELOPMENT
15 THROUGH THE BAY AREA ACKNOWLEDGED WITH SEVERAL PLAN BAY AREA
16 2050 STRATEGIC INITIATIVES. ABAG ADOPTED A FINAL BLUEPRINT AS
17 THE PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE WITH THE FOLLOWING. AND THIS IS IN
18 QUOTES. UPON THE MOTION BY PRESIDENT ARREGUIN AND SECONDED BY
19 MYSELF, THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD ADOPTED ABAG RESOLUTION
20 012021 AND REFERRED TO STAFF TO CONSIDER REGIONAL ISSUES OF
21 GENTRIFICATION AND DISPLACEMENT IN THE E.I.R. ALTERNATIVES
22 DEVELOPMENT AND DESCRIBED IN SLIDE 9 AS YOU'LL SEE IN THE
23 STAFF PRESENTATION. IT IS IMPORTANT FOR MTC TO LIKEWISE
24 RECOGNIZE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO FURTHER EXAMINE THIS REGIONAL
25 NEED, I MOVE APPROVAL OF THE MTC RESOLUTION 4451 PLAN BAY AREA



January 27, 2021

1 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT APPROVAL AS PREFERRED ENVIRONMENTAL
2 IMPACT REPORT ALTERNATIVE REPORT AS PRESENTED TODAY WITH A
3 REFERRAL THAT STAFF FURTHER CONSIDER REGIONAL ISSUES OF
4 GENTRIFICATION AND DISPLACEMENT IN THE E.I.R. ALTERNATIVE'S
5 DEVELOPMENT. CONSISTENT WITH THE INFORMATION PROVIDED TO THE
6 ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD ON JANUARY 21ST AND ALIGNED ABOUT
7 ADOPTING THE MOTION OF THAT BODY.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I'LL SECOND, MR. CHAIR.

10

11 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, I JUST WANT TO THANK
12 PRESIDENT ARREQUIN OF ABAG. HE OVERSAW A SIX-HOUR ABAG MEETING
13 WITH A LOT OF DISCUSSION. AND I THINK THIS MOTION IS A GOOD
14 MOTION. I THINK IT'S GOING TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT
15 SOME OF THE LARGER ISSUES, SUCH AS SAN FRANCISCO, I THINK
16 OAKLAND AND SEVERAL OTHER JURISDICTIONS. AND SO IT WILL GIVE
17 US AN OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT SOME OF THESE IMPACTS. AS MOST OF
18 YOU KNOW, THESE NUMBERS CHANGED AT THE LAST MINUTE. AND SO,
19 YOU KNOW, I WOULD APPRECIATE A CONSIDERATION ON THE MOTION. SO
20 WITH THAT, I THINK STAFF IS GOING TO MAKE THE PRESENTATION.

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND ON THE
23 TABLE. I HAVE TO LAUGH YOU KEEP REFERRING TO SIX-HOUR MEETING
24 AT ABAG. I WANT TO KNOW WHY YOU GUYS GOT OUT SO EARLY. ALL
25 RIGHT. THERESE.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** THAT'S BECAUSE RABBITT WASN'T IN CHARGE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** ACTUALLY I APPRECIATE THE KUDOS TO JESSE ARREQUIN.

5 HE'S A GREAT FRIEND. HE'S JUST AN AMAZING ELECTED OFFICIAL, TO

6 BE VERY HONEST WITH YOU. AND I KNOW THAT THIS WAS REALLY

7 WRANGLING SOMETHING THAT WAS PRETTY DIFFICULT. AND I

8 APPRECIATE YOU ACKNOWLEDGING HIM BECAUSE HE IS A GOOD

9 PRESIDENT OF ABAG AND HE DOES A GREAT JOB AS THE MAYOR OF THE

10 CITY OF BERKELEY, WHICH AS YOU PROBABLY IMAGINE IS NOT THAT

11 EASY, EITHER. SO WITH THAT, DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** IF YOU'RE TOSSING IT OVER TO ME, THANK YOU, MR.

14 CHAIR. STAFF, IN YOUR PACKETS, WE HAD INCLUDED A POWERPOINT

15 THAT IN -- IT'S AMAZINGLY IN A FEW SLIDES COMES THIS THREE

16 YEARS OF WORK AS WELL AS SOME SUPPLEMENTAL SLIDES PIVOTING OFF

17 OF AND IN PREPARATION FOR THE ABAG ACTION THAT WAS TAKEN LAST

18 WEEK. WE CAN QUICKLY RUN THROUGH BOTH IF COMMISSIONER SPERING

19 AND CHAIR HAGGERTY YOU THINK THAT WOULD BE MOST USEFUL TO THE

20 COMMISSION.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I'LL LEAVE IT UP TO THE COMMITTEE CHAIR.

23

24 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, THROUGH THE CHAIR, MR.

25 CHAIRMAN, UNLESS COMMITTEE MEMBERS OR COMMISSIONERS NEED THAT



January 27, 2021

1 BACKGROUND INFORMATION, I THINK THIS IS FAIRLY
2 STRAIGHTFORWARD, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO HERE. AND
3 IT'S CERTAINLY VERY CONSISTENT WITH THE PREVIOUS ACTIONS OF
4 THIS COMMISSION.

5

6 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** CERTAINLY. YOU KNOW, AS I VIEW THIS, YOU
7 KNOW, WE'VE HEARD SO MUCH OF PLAN BAY AREA. YOU KNOW, I THINK
8 THE ONLY THING WE'D BE REMISS IF WE DIDN'T DO IT AND THAT'S TO
9 THANK STAFF. MATT AND DAVE AND ALL THOSE THAT HAVE -- I'D LIKE
10 TO THINK WE'VE PUT THEM IN A REVOLVING DOOR AND EVERY ONCE IN
11 A WHILE WE SPUN THEM AROUND AND SAW WHICH WAY THEY WOULD GO
12 THE NEXT TIME. BUT THEY'VE BEEN REALLY GOOD WORKING WITH
13 ELECTED OFFICIALS AND TRYING TO GET THIS PLAN DONE. AND I
14 THINK IT'S REALLY GOOD WHAT'S COME OUT OF THIS IN THE LAST FEW
15 DAYS BECAUSE WHEN YOU'RE DOING SOMETHING AS GRAND AS THIS AND
16 WHEN WE HAVE TRIED TO MOVE THROUGH THESE PLAN BAY AREAS AS
17 WE'VE BEEN DEVELOPING THEM, WE'VE NOTICED THERE'S BEEN
18 UNINTENTIONED CONSEQUENCES SOMETIMES. AND I THINK THIS ONE'S
19 CAUGHT EARLY. I THINK THIS IS ONE THAT MAYBE DESERVES A LITTLE
20 BIT MORE DRILLING DOWN. SO I THINK IT'S A GREAT DIRECTION IN
21 WHICH WE SHOULD BE MOVING. I PERSONALLY DON'T BELIEVE THAT WE
22 NEED TO GO THROUGH THE STAFF PRESENTATION. BUT I DO IF WE --
23 IT'S NO DISRESPECT TO STAFF. IF WE DON'T DO IT WEEKS GIVE THEM
24 GREAT KUDOS AND BIG THANKS. BUT IF ANYBODY WANTS TO HEAR THE
25 STAFF PRESENTATION, I WOULD ASK YOU TO RAISE YOUR HAND AT THIS



January 27, 2021

1 POINT OR SAY SOMETHING. THERE YOU HAVE YOUR ANSWER. SO,
2 KIMBERLY, I'M GOING TO ASK IF YOU HAVE ANYBODY IN THE PUBLIC
3 THAT WISHES TO SPEAK.

4

5 **KIMBERLY WARD:** I'M SORRY. EXCUSE ME. I DID RECEIVE WRITTEN
6 CORRESPONDENCE FROM CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO SIGNED BY
7 MAYOR LONDON BREEN, SUPERVISOR RONEN, SUPERVISOR MAR AND
8 SUPERVISOR MANDLEMAN AND A LETTER FROM CITY OF PALO ALTO.
9 THERE ARE A COUPLE OF MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
10 RAISED. THE FIRST IS CALLER LAST FOUR DIGITS 5555. PLEASE
11 UNMUTE YOURSELF AND YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES, MR. CHAIR? IS THAT
12 SUFFICIENT?

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** HOLD ON ONE SECOND. I WANT TO LOOK AT
15 WHAT YOU'VE GOT HERE SO I KNOW WHAT WE'RE UP AGAINST. NO, I
16 THINK WE CAN DO THREE MINUTES IF YOU CAN SAY IN IT TWO THAT
17 WOULD ALWAYS BE GREAT. AND, MARGARET, I SEE YOUR HAND UP, SO
18 WE'LL GET TO YOU. GO AHEAD.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD:** CALLER 5555, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE
21 THREE MINUTES.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YEAH, THIS IS KEN. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

24

25 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES, WE CAN HEAR YOU.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I HAVE A COUPLE OF ISSUES WITH PLAN BAY AREA.
3 ONE OF THEM IS THE VARYING RECOVERY EFFORTS MADE IN
4 TRANSPORTATION FACILITIES. I THINK THIS IS A CENTRAL KEY
5 ELEMENT WHICH NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. WE'RE PROVIDING FUNDS TO
6 PROPERTY OWNERS. AND WE'RE NOT GETTING ANYTHING BACK IN
7 RETURN. THAT'S A SIGNIFICANT POT OF MONEY WHICH NEEDS TO BE
8 LOOKED AT. THE OTHER ISSUE IS THAT REAL HOUSING PROBLEM WAS
9 CAUSED BY A LOT OF THE TECH COMPANIES. BUT I DON'T SEE ANY
10 MECHANISM HERE WHERE THEY'RE PAYING FOR THAT IMPACT. I JUST
11 SEE CITIES RESPONDING TO THE NEED FOR HOUSING AND NOTHING BACK
12 FROM THE PEOPLE WHO REALLY CAUSED THE HOUSING PROBLEMS. THANK
13 YOU.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MR. BUKOWSKI. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS
16 PETER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, COMMISSIONERS. PETER POPADOPOLIS
19 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE MISSION DEVELOPMENT AGENCY IN SAN
20 FRANCISCO. IT'S CRITICAL THAT THIS COMMISSION VOTE TODAY TO
21 NOT ONLY ASK THAT AN EQUITY ALTERNATIVE E.I.R. BE PREPARED BY
22 ABAG BUT TO SEND AN EXPLICIT MESSAGE THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO
23 SEE THIS EQUITY MODEL REVERSE THE ACCELERATED INEQUITIES OF
24 THE EXISTING BLUEPRINT PROPOSAL. THE CURRENT PLAN BAY AREA
25 2050 BLUEPRINT NOT ONLY INCREASES THE QUANTITY OF MARKET RATE



January 27, 2021

1 HOUSING THAT SAN FRANCISCO HAS ALLOCATED TO BUILD BUT IN THE
2 FINAL UPDATE IT EVEN INCREASES ITS ACTUAL SHARE PERCENTAGE.
3 ALMOST BY DEFAULT DUE TO ZONING, THERE WERE, THIS PROPOSAL
4 WILL SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASE THE QUANTITY, SHARE, AND
5 ASSOCIATED HARMFUL IMPACTS OF ADDITIONAL MARKET RATE HOUSING
6 ALONG WITH THE INCENTIVE TO DEMOLISH EXISTING HOUSING IN SAN
7 FRANCISCO'S LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES OF COLOR SUCH AS THE
8 MISSION DISTRICT. THESE DENSE NEIGHBORHOODS HAVE ALREADY
9 ENDURED PROFOUND HISTORIC INEQUITIES WHICH ARE NOW BEING
10 COMPOUNDED, AS WE KNOW, BY THE MOST RECENT DEVASTATING COVID
11 IMPACTS. THE CURRENT FINAL BLUEPRINT PROPOSAL WOULD SIMPLY ADD
12 ANOTHER LAYER OF UNJUST OUTCOMES, ESPECIALLY WHEN COUPLED WITH
13 STATE LAW IN THE FORM OF A SURGE OF BY RIGHT MARKET RATE
14 HOUSING, DEMOLITIONS AND THE SILENCING OF COMMUNITY VOICES
15 FROM INFLUENCING THESE OUTCOMES. THE RESPONSIBILITY TO DEMAND
16 A MORE EQUITABLE OUTCOME FOR THIS PLAN IS YOURS TODAY.
17 OTHERWISE THIS RESPONSIBILITY WILL BE PUSHED ONTO THOSE
18 VULNERABLE NEIGHBORHOODS THEMSELVES. PLEASE VOTE TODAY TO
19 DEMAND AN EQUITY ALTERNATIVE THAT, A, DOES NOT INCREASE THE
20 SHARE OF MARKET RATE HOUSING IN MAJOR URBAN CITIES LIKE SAN
21 FRANCISCO AND THEIR SENSITIVE COMMUNITIES, B, ELIMINATES THE
22 INEQUITABLE REQUIREMENT THAT THIS ALTERNATIVE PERFORM BETTER
23 ENVIRONMENTALLY THAN THE EXISTING BLUEPRINT. AND, C, ENSURE
24 THAT THE NEW RHNA NUMBERS ARE MODIFIED TO REFLECT THESE EQUITY
25 CHANGES. THANK YOU.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ROWLAND LEBRON.
3 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. YOU'VE PROBABLY HEARD THIS
6 BEFORE, BUT FIRST OF ALL LET ME APOLOGIZE FOR NOT ATTENDING
7 THIS ABAG MEETING WHICH WAS THE CORRECT VENUE TO SAY WHAT I'M
8 ABOUT TO SAY. THE ISSUE WE HAVE IS THAT THE BAY AREA HAS
9 EVOLVED OVER THE YEARS. AND IN PLANNING FOR THE NINE BAY AREA
10 COUNTIES IS BASICALLY ANTIQUATED. IT NO LONGER REFLECTS THE
11 CURRENT SITUATION WHEREBY THE CENTER OF THE UNIVERSE HAS
12 SHIFTED SOUTH. AND THE RESULT, WHERE I LIVE, IS ABSOLUTELY
13 GENTRIFICATION. MY ENTIRE NEIGHBORHOOD IS LEAVING. THE ENTIRE
14 NEIGHBORHOOD IS BEING BOUGHT UP BY GOOGLE, YOU KNOW, APPLE,
15 OR, YOU KNOW, OR ANYBODY ELSE. BUT THE PEOPLE THAT MOVE STILL
16 HAVE THEIR JOBS IN THE SILICON VALLEY. BUT THEY HAVE MOVED
17 EITHER TO GILROY OR SOUTH OF GILROY. AND THE SITUATION WE'VE
18 GOT DOWN THERE IS NOT SUSTAINABLE. BECAUSE THEY'RE BUILDING
19 TENS OF THOUSANDS OF UNITS OF HOUSING. AND THERE ARE NO JOBS
20 DOWN THERE. AND WE DO NOT HAVE THE TRANSPORTATION
21 INFRASTRUCTURE FOR THESE PEOPLE TO BASICALLY COMMUTE BACK AND
22 FORTH TO WHEREVER THEIR HOUSES ARE IN SILICON VALLEY. SO I
23 HOPE THAT WE WILL BE RE-VISITING THIS ISSUE DURING THE
24 WORKSHOP. QUITE FRANKLY, MY RECOMMENDATION WILL BE AT THE
25 MINIMUM COOPERATION AND THE BEST CASE SCENARIO IS THE



January 27, 2021

1 INTEGRATION OF ABAG AND AMBAG, WHICH IS THE ASSOCIATION OF
2 MONTERREY BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ABAG PRESIDENT
7 MAYOR JESSE HEIR E BEGAN. JUST SAY.

8

9 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I DID NOT KNOW HE WAS ON AND HE SENT ME
10 A TEXT. AND I ASKED HIM TO SPEAK. HE WASN'T ON TO SPEAK. BUT,
11 LOOK, HE'S AMONGST FRIENDS. AND HE'S DONE A LOT OF HARD WORK
12 ON THIS. SO I THOUGHT HE SHOULD SPEAK. SO JESSE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, MR. CHAIR AND GOOD AFTERNOON,
15 COLLEAGUES. I FIRST WANT TO TAKE THE TIME TO PRAISE THE
16 OUTGOING CHAIR. I KNOW THERE WILL BE AN OUTGOING OPPORTUNITY
17 TO DO THAT IN THE FUTURE, AS WELL. HE'S A GOOD FRIEND. AND YOU
18 KNOW IS REALLY A GIANT. AND THE IMPACT HE'S HAD ON THIS REGION
19 AND ON TRANSPORTATION IN IN REGION WILL BE LASTING FOR
20 DECADES. SO I REALLY JUST WANT TO THANK FORMER SUPERVISOR
21 HAGGERTY, CHAIR HAGGERTY, FOR HIS PARTNERSHIP WITH ABAG,
22 PARTICULARLY THROUGH THIS PLAN BAY AREA PROCESS. SO I WANT TO
23 THANK THE STAFF FOR ALL THEIR INCREDIBLE WORK. I MEAN, THIS
24 HAS BEEN A THREE-YEAR PROCESS. AND EVERY STEP OF THE WAY THEY
25 PROVIDED EXCELLENT ANALYSIS AND INFORMATION TO LOCAL



January 27, 2021

1 GOVERNMENT LEADERS THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS. I'M GLAD WE WERE
2 ABLE TO FIND A COMPROMISE TO ADDRESS THE REGIONAL IMPACTS
3 AROUND EQUITY AND DISPLACEMENT THAT'S REFLECTED IN THE MOTION
4 THAT CHAIR SPERING PUT FORWARD. AND I THINK BY LOOKING AT THIS
5 ALTERNATIVE IN THE E.I.R., THAT WILL GIVE US ADDITIONAL
6 INFORMATION TO INFORM FUTURE DECISIONS AROUND PLAN BAY AREA.
7 THESE ARE IMPACTS THAT ARE NOT UNIQUE TO SAN FRANCISCO.
8 IMPACTS MY CITY. IMPACT OTHER CITIES IN THE BAY AREA. SO THIS
9 IS AN ISSUE OF REGIONAL IMPORTANCE AND SHOULD BE STUDIED.
10 LASTLY I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE ALL THE HARD WORK OF THE ABAG
11 EXECUTIVE BOARD. IT IS TRUE WE HAD A SIX-HOUR MEETING. THAT IS
12 NOT UNCOMMON. BUT, YOU KNOW, I'M REALLY PLEASED WITH OUR
13 ABILITY TO REACH CONSENSUS. THIS WAS A MOTION THAT PASSED BY A
14 VERY SIGNIFICANT MARGIN OF ABAG MEMBERS. AND GOING FORWARD,
15 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH MTC AS WE COMPLETE PLAN BAY AREA.
16 SO THANK YOU ALL.

17

18 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, MAYOR, THANK YOU FOR COMING
19 ON. THANK YOU FOR THE COMMENTS. BUT IT'S BEEN A LOT OF WORK
20 FOR THREE YEARS AND APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S HARD WORK ON THIS.
21 SO AS WE WRAP THIS UP, COMMISSIONER SPERING, CHAIR SPERING,
22 ANY FINAL THOUGHTS BEFORE I CALL FOR A VOTE?

23

24 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, YOU GOT A COUPLE OTHER
25 SPEAKERS. GINA PAPAN AND MARGARET.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OH, YEAH. I EVEN TOLD THEM HOW MUCH I
3 HAD THEIR BACK. OKAY. I'M SORRY, MARGARET, YOU GET 1-1/2
4 MINUTES. GINA, YOU GET A MINUTE. AND, NICK, YOU GET 30
5 SECONDS. GO AHEAD.

6

7 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I REALIZE I'M COMING AT THE TAIL OF THIS
8 THREE-YEAR PROCESS. I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FROM THEIR HARD
9 WORK. WATCHING IT FROM THE OUTSIDE, IT WAS QUITE A PROCESS. SO
10 I APPRECIATE ALL THE EFFORT PUT IN AND PLEASED WITH THE
11 CONSENSUS THAT'S BEEN BUILT. ONE THING I'M HEARING JUST FROM
12 THE SOME OF MY COMMUNITIES AT THE STAFF LEVEL AS WE MOVE
13 FORWARD AND START TO SEE THE IMPLICATIONS OF PLAN BAY AREA
14 INTO THINGS LIKE THE GRANULAR, LIKE WITH THE RHNA PROCESS,
15 REQUEST FOR AS MUCH CLARITY AS POSSIBLE AS TO HOW THESE
16 STRATEGIES ARE BEING IMPLEMENTED IN THE FORMULA THAT'S BEING
17 USED FOR THOSE ALLOTMENTS AS WELL AS THE WEIGHT OF THOSE
18 VARIOUS STRATEGIES. SO THAT WOULD JUST BE A REQUEST. I THINK
19 ONE OF THE CORRESPONDENT'S LETTERS MENTIONED THAT, AS WELL. SO
20 I JUST WANTED TO ASK FOR STAFF'S SUPPORT ON THAT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY. GINA.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I REALIZE THIS IS THREE
25 YEARS OF WORK AND MUCH GREATLY APPRECIATED. SOME OF THE



January 27, 2021

1 CHANGES THAT WERE REQUESTED I THINK WERE THE RESULT OF
2 ASSUMPTIONS MADE WITHOUT LOCAL JURISDICTIONS BEING CONSULTED.
3 I HAVE A DEEP CONCERN ON THE ALL-TOLLING LANE INITIATIVE
4 THAT'S BEING PROPOSED HERE. THE STUDY HAS NEVER BEEN COMPLETED
5 ON THIS. AND I KNOW MY JURISDICTION IN PARTICULAR SUPPORTS THE
6 STUDY ON THIS. BUT THE DIRECT IMPLEMENTATION I THINK IS GOING
7 TO HAVE A HUGE NEGATIVE EFFECT IT'S NOT -- AS FAR AS EQUITY
8 GOES HERE, WE DON'T KNOW HOW IT'S GOING TO IMPACT PEOPLE THAT
9 HAVE TO DRIVE. I UNDERSTAND THE ENVIRONMENTAL CONSEQUENCES.
10 HOWEVER, A LOT OF ELECTRIC CARS ARE HAPPENING. HOPEFULLY SOME
11 MORE AFFORDABLE. AND WE MAY BE NEGATIVELY IMPACTING A WHOLE
12 POPULATION HERE THAT REALLY NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED. I DON'T
13 THINK THE CONSIDERATION HAS BEEN DONE AT THIS POINT. I THINK
14 IT WAS A HUGE LEAP ON STAFF'S BEHALF AND GET IT IN ORDER TO
15 MEET THE STANDARDS HERE. BUT THIS NEEDS TO BE COMMUNICATED
16 MORE PRECISELY TO THE REGIONS. I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO
17 WORK IN A LOT OF REGIONS HERE. WE HAVE TO BE CONCERNED ABOUT
18 THE IMPACT ON THOSE PEOPLE WHO NEED TO DRIVE TO WORK. AND I
19 JUST AM DEEPLY CONCERNED ABOUT THAT PROCESS. I HOPE MOVING
20 FORWARD HERE THAT THAT COMMUNICATION IS DONE. WE HAVE CONTROL
21 OF OUR MANAGED LANE. BUT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT ALL THE REST OF
22 THE LANES ON 101 FEEDING THE AIRPORT, THE RESOURCES OF ALL THE
23 PEOPLE THAT WORK THERE. SO THIS IS REALLY AN IMPACT, I THINK,
24 AN UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCE THAT IS BEING PRESENTED HERE. AND I
25 WISH WE DIDN'T GET TO THAT POINT. THANK YOU.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONER PEDROZA.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. JUST REALLY WANT TO
5 CONGRATULATE AND THANK CHAIR SPERING FOR USHERING THIS. IT'S
6 BEEN QUITE A JOURNEY. AND JUST TO REMIND FOLKS. PLAN BAY AREA,
7 IT'S EVERYTHING COMING TOGETHER AND THE TENSIONS ARE NATURAL
8 FROM MEETING THE MANDATES OF S.B.375 AND THE HOUSING NUMBERS
9 AND THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE SEEING THE MANIFESTATIONS OF THESE
10 TENSIONS AT THE LOCAL LEVEL. I REALLY SUPPORT LOOKING AT
11 GENTRIFICATION AND DISPLACEMENT AT A REGIONAL LEVEL. BUT,
12 REALLY, HAVING THAT BEING SOMETHING MEANINGFUL THAT WE CAN USE
13 TO GO BACK TO THE LEGISLATURE AND SAY HERE'S WHAT'S HAPPENING
14 LOCALLY. HERE'S WHAT WE'RE HAVING TO DO AT A VERY LOCAL LEVEL
15 BECAUSE IT IS GETTING HARDER AND HARDER TO MEET THESE MANDATES
16 AND THESE OBJECTIVES THAT THE LEGISLATORS ARE PUSHING DOWN TO
17 THE LOCAL LEVEL. SO AGAIN I THINK THIS IS A GREAT STEP IN THE
18 RIGHT DIRECTION TO LOOK AT GENTRIFICATION AT A REGIONAL LEVEL.
19 BUT UNDERSTANDING THAT WE ALL HAVE RESPONSIBILITY TO MEET
20 THESE HOUSING NUMBERS THAT ARE BEING IMPOSED ON US. SO I MAKE
21 THESE COME IN ANY EVENT, MR. CHAIR.

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. AND I WAS GOING TO HOLD MY
24 COMMENTS TO THE END. BUT I ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH A LOT OF WHAT



January 27, 2021

1 YOU JUST SAID. COMMISSIONER WORTH AND THEN COMMISSIONER
2 CANEPA.

3

4 **AMY WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I REALLY AGAIN AS YOU, I WANT
5 TO CONCUR WITH VICE CHAIR PEDROZA'S COMMENTS WITH REGARDS TO
6 THIS. I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER SHARING SPORE SHEPHERDING
7 THIS. HE AND CHAIR HAGGERTY AND PRESIDENT HEIR E GENE WERE A
8 GREAT TEAM IN MOVING THIS FORWARD. AND I THINK IT'S A GREAT
9 POINT TO BE ABLE TO REALLY LOOK IN TAKING A DEEP DIVE RIGHT
10 NOW IN THE COMING MONTHS ON THE ISSUES THAT WERE RAISED AT THE
11 ABAG MEETING. YOU KNOW, ALSO I SIT, I REPRESENT MTC ON THE CAL
12 COG BOARD. AND I KNOW THAT THE SAME CHALLENGES ARE BEING FELT
13 IN THE OTHER REGIONS AROUND THE STATE. THESE CONFLICTING
14 REQUIREMENTS IN HOW DO WE MAKE SURE THAT ULTIMATELY WE'RE ABLE
15 TO HAVE A SUSTAINABLE PLAN AND TO ADDRESS SOME OF THESE VERY
16 SERIOUS HOUSING NEEDS THAT EXIST AND SO I APPRECIATE US HAVING
17 THE OPPORTUNITY TO WORK IN THE COMING MONTHS TO REALLY LOOK AT
18 THESE ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED. SO THANK YOU.

19

20 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

21

22 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WANT TO THANK
23 CHAIR ARREGUIN FOR ALL HIS WORK. I SIT ON THE ABAG. IT WAS A
24 SIX-HOUR MEETING BUT IT WAS A THOUGHTFUL AND DELIBERATIVE
25 MEETING. I KNOW IN MY PARTICULAR COUNTY, WE HAD FALLEN BEHIND



January 27, 2021

1 IN HOUSING FOR DECADES. I THINK THE ALLOCATION WAS FAIR
2 BECAUSE OF THE JOB CENTER, JOB CENTERS WE HAVE. I DO WANT TO
3 ASK THERESE A QUESTION. I THINK THIS IS WHAT SUPERVISOR PAPAN
4 OR COUNCILMEMBER PAPAN WAS ALLUDING TO. CAN YOU SPEAK TO THE
5 TOLL LANES AND SPECIFICALLY WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN. SO IN
6 CERTAIN REGIONS, WE HAVE ONE TOLL LANE AND THERE ARE FOUR
7 OTHER LANES THAT ARE NOT TOLL LANES. BUT CAN YOU KIND OF SPEAK
8 TO WITH THIS ACTION TODAY WHAT WE DOING?

9

10 **THERESE W. McMILLIAN:** I'D BE HAPPY TO. THOUGH I WANT TO KEEP
11 IT AT THE TOP LEVEL. I THINK THE FIRST THING TO REITERATE WITH
12 RESPECT TO PLAN BAY AREA GENERALLY IS THAT IT'S A PLAN. AND
13 THAT'S IMPORTANT. WE'RE LOOKING OUT 35 YEARS. AND EXCEPT FOR
14 CERTAIN DISCRETE ELEMENTS SUCH AS ON THE FEDERAL LEVEL WHERE
15 WE HAVE TO HAVE -- AND MAJOR PLANS CAN'T GO FORWARD UNLESS
16 THEY'RE IN THE PLAN. IN THIS POINT THE CROSSWALK TO RHNA,
17 THERE ARE NUMBERS WHERE THEY HAVE TO BE DONE. NOTHING IN THIS
18 PLAN FORCES IMPLEMENTATION. AND WE ARE IN FACT ENGAGED NOW IN
19 ANOTHER ELEMENT OF THE PLANNING PROCESS CALLED THE
20 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WHERE WE ACTUALLY LOOK AT THESE STRATEGIES
21 THE 35 THAT THE COMMISSION ADOPTED BACK IN SEPTEMBER TO
22 ACHIEVE OR TO TRY TO DEMONSTRATE HOW WE COULD ACHIEVE THESE
23 INCREDIBLY DIFFICULT AND CRITICAL CHALLENGES BEFORE US. LIKE
24 THIS GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. WHICH MIND YOU WE BARELY MET IN
25 TERMS TESTIFY KNOWN STRAIGHTING OUR PLAN. AND WE KNEW AT THE



January 27, 2021

1 OUTSET IT WOULD BE INCREDIBLY DIFFICULT. SO THE NEXT STAGE IS
2 TO SAY WHAT DOES IT TAKE TO REALLY DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT THESE
3 SHOULD THE COMMISSION AND OUR PARTNERS AND THE LEGISLATURE
4 CHOOSE TO GO FORWARD? AND SO THERE'S A WHOLE OTHER LEVEL OF
5 DISCUSSION ON WHAT IT TAKES TO ACTUALLY DO IT AND I WANT TO
6 REITERATE A POINT THAT COMMISSIONER SPERING HAS MADE IN HIS
7 ROLE IN SHEPHERDING THIS. THIS WAS RENEWED EVERY FOUR YEARS.
8 WE HAVE TO REDO THE PLAN EVERY FOUR YEARS BECAUSE CONDITIONS
9 CHANGE, INFORMATION IS DIFFERENT, WE HAVE MORE DATA THAT CAN
10 INFORM WHERE WE'RE GOING. WE WILL HAVE COMPLETED STUDIES, JUST
11 LIKE THE ACTION THAT YOU'VE ARE CONSIDERING FOR APPROVAL TODAY
12 AND A STUDY THAT'S GOING TO ACCOMPANY THE TOMG TO SEE WHAT
13 DOES IT REALLY TAKE IF WE MOVE ON THIS PLAN? SO I THINK MAKING
14 SURE THAT WE SEPARATE THAT THIS IS AN ASPIRATIONAL GUIDE TO
15 ACHIEVE REALLY DIFFICULT OBJECTIVES IN THE ECONOMY, IN SOCIAL
16 EQUITY, IN THE ENVIRONMENT AND IN TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING
17 FROM THE REAL ACTIONS TO MOVE FROM PLAN TO SOMETHING ON THE
18 GROUND IS A BIG STEP THAT'S AHEAD OF US. I HOPE THAT ANSWERS
19 YOUR QUESTION W.

20

21 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** PERFECTLY.

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

24



January 27, 2021

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO THANK COMMISSIONER
2 SPERING AND THERESE AND DAVE AND MATT AND LISA WHO I DON'T SEE
3 ON THE CALL FOR BEING SO OPEN TO KIND OF HEARING THE CONCERNS
4 THAT SAN FRANCISCO BROUGHT FORWARD AT THIS LATE STAGE. AND I
5 KNOW IT'S NEVER -- IT'S NOT PARTICULARLY KOSHER TO BRING
6 CONCERNS FORWARD LIKE THREE YEARS INTO A THREE-YEAR PROCESS.
7 BUT GIVEN KIND OF THE CHANGES BETWEEN DRAFT AND FINAL, I JUST
8 WANTED TO REALLY THANK YOU FOR SORT OF BEING OPEN TO THAT AND
9 BEING SO THOUGHTFUL IN YOUR APPROACH. AND I THINK THIS IS A
10 TOWERING AND AWESOME PLAN FOR THE BAY AREA THAT ADDRESSES --
11 ULTIMATELY ADDRESSES SO MANY OF THE CONCERNS THAT WE FACE AS A
12 REGION. AND IT'S REALLY SORT OF I THINK SETS THE BAR FOR WHAT
13 WE HOPE TO ACHIEVE HERE AS A REGION AND HOPEFULLY INSPIRES US
14 AS MUCH AS ANYTHING ELSE.

15

16 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, NICK. I AM NOW GOING TO GO TO
17 THE PERSON WHO STARTED ALL THIS, COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE.

18

19 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** WELL, THAT'S A HELL OF AN INTRODUCTION, MR.
20 CHAIR. ANYWAY, A LITTLE REMINDER S.B.395 WAS LEGISLATION THAT
21 WAS MEANT TO BOOK END A.B. 32. AND SO WE ARE DRIVEN, AS I
22 UNDERSTAND IT, BY REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE APPROVED BY THE AIR
23 RESOURCES BOARD IN TERMS OF GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS. AND SO
24 THERE ARE CERTAIN FORCING MECHANISMS IN PLACE HERE. BUT I'M
25 ACTUALLY JUST LIKE TO REMIND US ALL OF THE IMPORTANCE OF THE



January 27, 2021

1 ACTION THAT YOU ALL WILL BE FACING IN THIS COMING YEAR. MUCH
2 TO MY REGRET, I WON'T BE PART OF THAT DEBATE. BUT I'M
3 CERTAINLY ONE WHO WAS IMPACTED BY THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN
4 ITEMS THAT CAME OUT OF THE PLAN UNDER WHICH WE'RE CURRENTLY
5 OPERATING. AND SO AS PEOPLE WERE TALKING ABOUT THE
6 ASPIRATIONAL ASPECTS OF THE 35 STRATEGIES, BELIEVE ME, IT'S
7 WHEN YOU START PUTTING IN PLACE ACTUAL IMPLEMENTATION STEPS TO
8 MAKE SURE THAT WE MEET THE CARB REQUIREMENTS FOR GREENHOUSE
9 GAS REDUCTIONS, IT'S AN AWFUL CLICHE BUT THAT'S WHERE THE
10 RUBBER MEETS THE ROAD. AND SO I WISH YOU WELL DOING THAT. AND,
11 AGAIN, THANKS TO EVERYBODY. THE STAFF AND EVERYBODY WHO'S BEEN
12 INVOLVED IN THIS INCREDIBLY DIFFICULT PROCESS. AND THESE ARE
13 MY REMARKS, MR. CHAIR.

14

15 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. APPRECIATE
16 THOSE. YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S ALL BEEN SAID, BUT CERTAINLY
17 APPRECIATE ALL THE HARD WORK BY EVERYBODY. AND I DON'T KNOW
18 THAT EVERYBODY JUST REALLY WRAPS THEIR ARMS AROUND THIS AND
19 SAYS WOW, THIS IS GREAT. AND I THINK THAT BUT WHAT IT IS IS
20 IT'S THE BEST WE CAN DO BASED ON WHAT HAS BEEN GIVEN TO US.
21 AND IT'S NOT A COPOUT. I MEAN, I THINK WE ALL WANT A BETTER
22 BAY AREA. AND I THINK THAT'S REALLY WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO.
23 BUT THERE ARE GOING TO BE PUSH AND PULLS THAT I THINK WE ALL
24 HAVE TO AT SOME POINT STEP BACK AND SAY: THIS WAS THE RIGHT
25 THING TO DO. AND TODAY WHEN I CAST MY VOTE, I KNOW THAT THIS



January 27, 2021

1 IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO. THAT I THINK THE COMMISSION AND ABAG
2 HAVE BOTH WORKED VERY HARD ON THIS. THE STAFF HAS WORKED
3 INCREDIBLE AMOUNTS OF TIME. MATT AND DAVE. AGAIN, I'VE
4 MENTIONED THEIR NAMES. INCREDIBLE AMOUNTS OF TIMES. AND FOR
5 THERESE, KIND OF WALKED INTO THE MIDDLE OF THIS THING. ALL
6 RIGHT. WHAT'S UP HERE AND HAD TO GET UP TO SPEED QUICK. SO AT
7 THIS POINT, I DON'T HAVE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS WISHING TO
8 SPEAK AND I REALLY WOULD LIKE TO MOVE TOWARDS A VOTE AND SEND
9 YOU ALL ON YOUR WAY POSTHASTE. SO, I THINK WE CAN DO IT,
10 KIMBERLY.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** ALL RIGHT. WITH A MOTION BUY SPERING, A SECOND
13 BY PEDROZA. HAGGERTY?

14

15 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

20

21 **AUN:** AYE.

22

23 **KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

24

25 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** YES.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **DIR. CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLLY?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** AYE.

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. GLOVER? GLOVER IS ABSENT.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

13

14 **KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO?

15

16 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

17

18 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MACKENZIE?

19

20 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

23

24 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

2

3 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** AYE.

4

5 **DIR. JAMES SPERING:** YES, AYE.

6

7 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. AND WORTH.

8

9 **AMY WORTH:** AYE.

10

11 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THERESE, I WAS UNDER THE IMPRESSION THAT
14 ABAG ALSO PASSED IT UNANIMOUSLY?

15

16 **THERESE W. McMILLIAN:** YES. AND I UNDERSTAND FROM MY HISTORIANS
17 FOR THE FIRST TIME THERE WAS A UNANIMOUS AYE VOTE ON A LONG-
18 RANGE PLAN AT ABAG. [LAUGHTER.]

19

20 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** CONGRATULATIONS.

21

22 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** WHAT THE HELL HAPPENED?

23

24 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I THINK, TERESA, ON THE FIRST ONE I WAS
25 THE LONE NO VOTE. I APOLOGIZE. BUT AT LEAST HISTORY'S BEEN



January 27, 2021

1 MADE. THAT'S GREAT NEWS. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE
2 ALL THE HARD WORK BY EVERYBODY, ABAG, MTC AND OUR STAFF. GREAT
3 JOB. SO WITH THAT, I'M NOW GOING TO MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT.
4 AND I WILL NOW ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER
5 PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AT
6 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV INTO THE RECORD. I WOULD ASK IF ANY
7 MEMBERS NOT RELATED TO THE ITEMS ON TODAY'S AGENDA, PLEASE USE
8 THE RAISE YOUR HAND FEATURE OR STAR 9 AND I WILL CALL UPON
9 YOU. ANYBODY WISH TO SPEAK KIMBERLY?

10

11 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. I'VE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT
12 FOR THIS ITEM. AND THERE ARE SEVERAL MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
13 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. THE FIRST IS ROWLAND LEBRON. PLEASE
14 UNMUTE YOURSELF, MR. LEBRON.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. SO AS MOST OF YOU MAY KNOW BY
17 NOW, WE HAVE A POSITION ON THE VGA IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AND
18 I WOULD LIKE TO BRING TO THERESE'S ATTENTION SOME OF THE
19 ASPECTS OF THAT POSITION. IS THAT FIRST OF ALL THE POSITION
20 COMES WITH CHALLENGES WHICH ARE ALSO KNOWN AS AN OPPORTUNITY
21 TO SUCCEED. IT ALSO COMES WITH A VERY COMPETITIVE SALARY AND
22 BENEFIT. AND THE VGA BOARD HAS A SEVEN-TRACK RECORD OF TAKING
23 EXCELLENT CARE OF THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE. BUT OBVIOUSLY NONE OF
24 THE ABOVE WERE WHEN THE CALL CAME IN. THANK YOU.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, ROWLAND.

2

3 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THE NEXT SPEAKER IS CAROLE TAYLOR. PLEASE
4 UNMUTE YOURSELF, MS. TAYLOR.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI, HOW DO YOU DO? THIS IS A SIDEWAYS CONCERN. IT'S
7 SORT OF OBLIQUE. BUT RIGHT NOW A LOT OF THE OPERATORS ARE
8 GOING BACK TO FRONT DOOR ENTRANCES AND FARE COLLECTION.
9 COMMISSIONER RABBITT, YOU KNOW OUR SONOMA BUS COMPANIES ARE
10 DOING THIS. AT THE TIME THAT WE'RE GETTING A BRAND NEW STRAIN
11 OF COVID. AND SO I KNOW THAT THE IMPACTS ON REVENUES IF WE GO
12 BACK TO NOT COLLECTING FARES, I KNOW THAT -- AND HIGHER RATES
13 OF ILLNESS, BTA-- EXCUSE ME THE UNION IS SAYING THAT THEY
14 THINK THERE'S INCREDIBLY INCREASING CASES THE LAST MONTH IS
15 DUE TO FRONT DOOR BOARDING. THIS IS SOMETHING TO LOOK AT. THIS
16 IS SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO HAVE AN IMPACT ON US IN FUNDING
17 AND IN PRACTICES. AND I'M JUST PUTTING IT OUT THERE. SO THANK
18 YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER LAST FOUR
21 DIGITS 5555. I BELIEVE THAT'S MR. BUKOWSKI. PLEASE UNMUTE
22 YOURSELF. WE CAN'T HEAR YOU, MR. BUKOWSKI, IF THAT'S YOU.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** I'M HERE. I'M HERE.

25



January 27, 2021

1 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** I JUST WANT TO KNOW IF THERE'S ANY POSSIBILITY TO GET
4 ANY KIND OF A STUDY TO SEE HOW THE VALUE OF PROPERTY IS
5 INCREASED WHEN TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS ARE MADE. HAVE WE
6 EVER CONSIDERED SETTING ASSESSMENT DISTRICTS FOR THESE
7 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS SO THAT THOSE WHO BENEFIT CAN REPAY
8 THE COST OF THE IMPROVEMENT? I THINK THAT'S A VERY IMPORTANT
9 THING THAT JUST DOESN'T SEEM TO BE GETTING ANYBODY'S
10 ATTENTION. THANK YOU.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. AND THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RICH HEDGES.
13 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF, MR. HEDGES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ARE WE IN GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT? I GOT A
16 LITTLE BIT CONFUSED.

17

18 **KIMBERLY WARD:** YES, SIR.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I WANTED TO SAY A FEW WORD ABOUT SCOTT BECAUSE I'M
21 NOT SURE I CAN BE ON NEXT TIME SINCE SCOTT'S CAREER BEGAN.
22 HE'S BEEN A VERY EQUITABLE PERSON. HE'S WORKED WITH THE
23 COMMISSION. MARSHAL AND I DID A LOT OF RESEARCH ON
24 ACCESSIBILITY AT TRANSIT STATIONS, BART AND CALTRAIN. AND WITH
25 THE HELP OF JIM DID A PRESENTATION TO THE COMMISSION AND SCOTT



January 27, 2021

1 MADE THE MOTION TO EXEMPT FROM PLANNING GRANTS ANY STATIONS
2 THAT WEREN'T ACCESSIBLE TO HOUSING. WE REALLY APPRECIATED
3 THAT. HE'S BEEN FORTHCOMING ON MOST OF THE EQUITY CONCERNS
4 THAT WE'VE HAD. I ALSO VERY MUCH APPRECIATE HIS FORTHRIGHTNESS
5 AND WHEN HE HAS A PROBLEM WITH SOMEBODY, HE STATES IT. I CAN
6 REMEMBER HIM COMING IN THE BACK OF A MEETING ROOM AS THE
7 MEETING WAS CLOSING AND HOLLERING AT ME. AND WE HAD A GOOD
8 JOUST RIGHT THERE AND THEN. BUT I ALWAYS APPRECIATED THAT. I'M
9 ONE WHO APPRECIATES SOMEBODY WHO HAS A PROBLEM, THEY CLEAR THE
10 AIR AND THAT'S SCOTT. AND SCOTT, I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
11 EVERYBODY YOU'VE DONE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU, RICH. I APPRECIATE IT. AS I
14 LOOK BACK ON PUBLIC LIFE, ONE OF THE GREAT THINGS IS TO BE
15 ABLE TO WORK WITH PEOPLE LIKE YOU. THANK YOU. SAM, YOU HAD
16 SOMETHING YOU WANTED TO SAY?

17

18 **SAM LICCARDO:** JUST A QUESTION. I JUST WANT TO CONFIRM BOTH
19 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE AND COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY WOULD BE
20 RETURNING TO US NEXT MONTH SO THAT WE CAN APPROPRIATELY ROAST
21 YOU?

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** IT'S QUITE POSSIBLE WE MAYBE. WE HAVEN'T
24 DISCUSSED WHETHER OR NOT WE'LL BE IN FULL OR NOT OR WEARING
25 OUR KILTS. SO THAT IS BEING DISCUSSED.



January 27, 2021

1

2 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** IF YOU WILL, I WILL.

3

4 **SAM LICCARDO:** ALL RIGHT. I'LL WEAR THE KILT, JAKE. ALL RIGHT.
5 THANK YOU.

6

7 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** BOTH OF US WILL BE HERE NEXT WEEK. MY
8 DUTY IS LIMITED. AND WILL GO RATHER QUICKLY. BUT I CERTAINLY
9 WILL BE THERE FOR THE ENTIRE MEETING. THANK YOU FOR ASKING,
10 SAM. OKAY, WITH THAT.

11

12 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** THANK YOU, SAM.

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** IF WE HAVE NOBODY ELSE WISHING TO SPEAK,
15 I DON'T SEE ANYBODY, I WILL ADJOURN THE COMMISSION MEETING.
16 OUR NEXT MEET BE WILL BE HELD ON WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 24TH. IT
17 WILL BE A WEBCAST MEETING. AND WE WOULD ADVISE YOU OF ZOOM
18 DETAILS AND EVERYTHING YOU NEED. WITH THAT, I WANT TO SAY
19 THANK YOU AGAIN TO OUR STAFF. I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU AGAIN TO
20 THE COMMISSIONERS FOR THE VERY HARD WORK. AND I APPRECIATE YOU
21 ALL STAYING ON TODAY. AND TO THE COMMISSIONERS, NEW
22 COMMISSIONERS TODAY, WELCOME TO THE GREATEST COMMISSION IN THE
23 UNITED STATES. AND I TRULY MEAN THAT. SO ENJOY THE RIDE.
24 YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE A BLAST, MOST OF THE TIME. WITH THAT,



January 27, 2021

1 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THERESE, DID YOU HAVE SOMETHING YOU

2 WANTED TO SAY?

3

4 **THERESE W. McMILLIAN:** NO. JUST THANKING EVERYONE FOR

5 EVERYTHING THAT YOU'VE DONE TO SUPPORT US AND THE EFFORTS OF

6 THE REGION. THANK YOU.

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WE ARE ADJOURNED.

9

10 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** ONLY A THREE-HOUR MEETING, SCOTT. (MEETING

11 ADJOURNED)

12



Broadcasting Government