

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



January 13, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

2 **WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 13, 2021, 1:35PM**

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GOOD AFTERNOON AND WELCOME TO THE POLICY
5 ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR JANUARY 13TH, 2021. COULD I ASK STAFF TO
6 ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
7 ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
8 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR, PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER
9 N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT.
10 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR
11 WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER
12 SPEAKERS BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE
13 THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
14 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS
15 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO
16 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING
17 VIA ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE
18 OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
19 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
20 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED
21 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT
22 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC
23 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M.
24 YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO
25 THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE



January 13, 2021

1 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO
2 DO SO, AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
3 UPON THEM ON THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
4 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE THAT THE
5 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE
6 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
7 TO DATE.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, AND WELCOME TO THE POLICY
10 ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING OF JANUARY 13TH, 2021. I'M RANDI
11 KINMAN, AND I'LL BE CALLING THIS MEETING TO ORDER NOW. IF WE
12 COULD HAVE A ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BALDINI?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURNETT?

19

20 **RICHARD BURNETT:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CASTELLANOS?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COATS?

2

3 **RICK COATES:** HERE .

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COCHRAN .

6

7 **ABIGAIL COCHRAN:** HERE .

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ELDRED .

10

11 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE .

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLOREZ?

14

15 **VEDA FLOREZ:** HERE .

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER? BOB? GLOVER?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GOTUACO?

20

21 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** HERE .

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HEDGES?

24

25 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HERE .



January 13, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HERNANDEZ?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KALLINS?

7

8 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KINMAN?

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HERE. LEVIN? ADINA? I KNOW ADINA IS HERE.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** I AM HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MADDEN? YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MENDOZA? ADRIAN?

19

20 **ADRIAN MENDOZA:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOMOH?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MURRAY?

4

5 **CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BEN SCHWENG? I KNOW BEN IS HERE.

8

9 **BENJAMIN SCHWENG:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SCOTT?

12

13 **TERRY SCOTT:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILSON? HERE. HERE. I AM HERE TWICE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL GO TO AGENDA ITEM THREE,

20 THE CHAIR'S REPORT. I KNOW THIS IS NOT A TIME WHERE WE HAD

21 MUCH TIME OFF DURING THE HOLIDAYS OR DURING DECEMBER. SO I

22 WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR ATTENDING ALL OF THE MEETINGS

23 GOING TO EVERYTHING I HAVE SEEN YOU AT. AND I WANT TO START

24 OFF THIS YEAR BY THANKING THE STAFF THAT MANAGES TO KEEP US

25 ROLLING AND WHO IS SO EFFECTIVE AT DOING THAT. AND I WANT TO



January 13, 2021

1 THANK THE -- I WANT TO THANK THIS COUNCIL. BECAUSE IN -- I
2 CANNOT -- I CANNOT START THIS MEETING WITHOUT ACKNOWLEDGING
3 THE TURMOIL THAT IS AROUND US RIGHT NOW. AND I JUST WANT TO
4 SAY I APPRECIATE WORKING WITH A GROUP OF PEOPLE WHO, NO MATTER
5 WHAT OUR OPINIONS ARE, CAN COME TOGETHER, AND CAN COME TO
6 REASONABLE AGREEMENTS, AND WHEN WE DISAGREE WITH EACH OTHER,
7 WE TAKE THE MAJORITY AND WE MOVE ON, AND WE ARE STILL WORKING
8 TOGETHER TWO MINUTES LATER. SO I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT. I
9 THINK THAT WHEN THINGS ARE OVERWHELMING FOR ANY OF US, WE CAN
10 LOOK TO THIS BODY AS AN EXAMPLE OF HOW TO GET ALONG AND
11 CONDUCT BUSINESS. AND THAT'S THE SUM OF MY CHAIR'S REPORT. SO
12 WITH THAT, WE'RE GOING TO MOVE INTO ITEM NUMBER FOUR APPROVAL
13 OF THE DECEMBER 9TH, 2020 MEETING MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION
14 TO APPROVE?

15

16 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** SO MOVED.

17

18 **VEDA FLOREZ:** I'LL SECOND. FLOREZ.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I HAVE BALDINI MOVING. FLOREZ, SECOND. IS
21 THERE ANY DISCUSSION? NOT SEEING ANY HANDS RAISED. IS THERE
22 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT THAT I HAVE RECEIVED FROM --

23



January 13, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
2 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
3 HANDS RAISED.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT, WE'LL
6 CALL THE ROLL FOR THE VOTE, PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
9 MEMBERS PRESENT.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE
12 TO ITEM NUMBER FIVE, PUBLIC COMMENTS AND OTHER BUSINESS. HAVE
13 WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS OFF THE AGENDA?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO PROBLEM COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
16 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
17 HANDS RAISED.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THIS WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM
20 SIX SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. WE'LL START WITH THE EQUITY AND
21 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. VEDA FLOREZ.

22

23 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON THE EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE
24 MET MONDAY JANUARY 11TH WE HAD THREE INFORMATIONAL ITEMS FIRST
25 PAC CHAIR AND BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE MEMBER



January 13, 2021

1 RANDI KINMAN PRESENTED AN UPDATE ON CURRENT HAPPENINGS, THE
2 TASK FORCE CREATED A SUBCOMMITTEE OR WORKING GROUP TO DEFINE A
3 PROBLEM STATEMENT TO AID IN THEIR WORK. THE TASK FORCE IS
4 WORKING TO REVIEW THE PARATRANSIT CONSOLIDATION AND DELIVERY
5 PLAN BY REVIEWING DATA SUBMITTED TO OPERATORS TO MTC. OUR
6 SECOND ITEM WAS PRESENTED ON THE COORDINATED PUBLIC TRANSIT
7 HUMAN SERVICES TRANSPORTATION PLAN -- THAT'S A MOUTHFUL -- BY
8 DRENNEN SHELTON AND SHE DEFINED THE THREE WORKING CATEGORIES
9 OF OLDER ADULTS THOSE WITH DISABILITIES AND LOW INCOME
10 COMMUNITY. OUR SUBCOMMITTEE ASKED STAFF TO PAY CLOSE ATTENTION
11 TO THE HOMELESS POPULATION. LASTLY WE RECEIVED AN UPDATE ON
12 THE EQUITY BENCH BY MTC CHIEF OF STAFF NALUNGO CONNOLY.
13 DRENNEN AND HER TEAM WILL COME BACK IN APRIL OR MAY FOR
14 FURTHER DISCUSSION OUR NEXT ACCESS AND SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING IS
15 FEBRUARY 5TH AT 10:00 A.M. AND THAT CONCLUDES MY INFORMATION.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR
18 COMMENT FROM THE COUNCIL? WITH THAT, I WANT TO -- WE HAVE TWO
19 VACANCIES ON THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. DAISY OZIM IS
20 NO LONGER A MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND
21 CHRISTINA GOTUACO IS STEPPING DOWN FROM HER POSITION. SO I
22 WOULD LIKE TO APPOINT -- WELL, I WILL APPOINT WALTER WILSON,
23 WHO I WILL CALL BY HIS CORRECT NAME THIS TIME, TO ONE OF THE
24 VACANCIES, AND I WANT TO KNOW IF THERE IS ANYBODY ELSE WHO IS
25 INTERESTED IN TAKING ON ONE OF THOSE VACANCIES.



January 13, 2021

1

2 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES, IF THERE -- IF THERE IS A DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
3 BEING AN ALTERNATE AND BEING ON THE COMMITTEE, I WOULD LIKE TO
4 BE A MEMBER OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THERE IS A DIFFERENCE BECAUSE YOU BECOME
7 A VOTING MEMBER. SO WE CAN MOVE YOU INTO THAT POSITION. IF
8 THERE IS NO OBJECTIONS, AND CONGRATULATIONS. VEDA, YOUR
9 COMMITTEE IS NOW FULL AGAIN. IF THERE IS ANYBODY WHO WOULD
10 LIKE TO STEP UP AS AN ALTERNATE, NOW IS THE TIME TO RAISE YOUR
11 HAND, OR YOU CAN LET US KNOW AFTER THE FACT. AND ANYBODY IS
12 WELCOME TO ATTEND THAT MEETING.

13

14 **VEDA FLOREZ:** I APPRECIATE THOSE WHO ARE COMING ON THE
15 COMMITTEE, AND I HOPE THAT WE'LL WORK WELL TOGETHER IN THE
16 FUTURE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY, WITH THAT I SEE NO HANDS RAISED.
19 WE'LL MOVE INTO THE FARE COORDINATION --

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SAW MICHAEL BALDINI RAISE HIS HAND WAS
22 IT BECAUSE HE WANTED TO BE ALTERNATE?

23

24 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES. I AM AVAILABLE TO BE AN ALTERNATE.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OH GOOD.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YOU'RE IN. SOMEHOW I DIDN'T SEE THE HAND
6 GO UP. ANYBODY ELSE? OKAY. WITH THAT, WE WILL GO TO THE --
7 ADINA LEVIN, AND THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION
8 SUBCOMMITTEE.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO I BELIEVE THAT THIS BODY HAS MET SINCE
11 THE LAST MEETING OF THAT SUBCOMMITTEE, BUT I WILL PROVIDE
12 HIGHLIGHTS ABOUT THE NEXT UPCOMING MEETING OF THAT
13 SUBCOMMITTEE, WHICH IS GOING TO BE FRIDAY JANUARY 22ND, AND
14 THAT WILL BE, IS EXPECTED TO BE A VERY SUBSTANTIVE MEETING, AS
15 STAFF WILL BE BRINGING FORWARD OPTIONS FOR FARE COORDINATION
16 AND INTEGRATION, THAT THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE COMPOSED
17 OF TRANSIT AGENCY GENERAL MANAGERS AND MTC STAFF WILL BE
18 DECIDING ON A SET OF OPTIONS TO DO A DEEP DIVE ANALYSIS OF. SO
19 THOSE OPTION, MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT THEY WILL START TO BE
20 PRESENTED TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SUBCOMMITTEE ADVISORY
21 BODY AND SO ANYONE WHO IS INTERESTED IN THESE TOPICS AND WHAT
22 OUR OPTIONS FOR FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION MAY BE AND
23 WHAT SOME OF THE ORGANIZATIONAL REQUIREMENTS FOR THOSE OPTIONS
24 MAY BE, ARE ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND OR TO READ WHAT IS LIKELY TO
25 BE A PRETTY SUBSTANTIVE STAFF REPORT. ANY QUESTIONS?



January 13, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IS THERE ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE COUNCIL?
3 I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. DO WE HAVE ANYBODY IN THE
4 ATTENDEE LIST WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK? IF SO, NOW IS THE TIME
5 TO RAISE YOUR HAND. OR -- OH, I SEE RICH. RICH A GO AHEAD.

6

7 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YEAH. I WAS WONDERING, ADINA DO YOU THINK THAT
8 THE AREA WIDE MANAGER, THE TRANSIT MANAGER THAT THEY'RE
9 TALKING ABOUT, WILL HAVE ANY POWER TO COORDINATE FARES OR DOES
10 IT ALL HAVE TO BE --

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. THERE ARE A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT LOGICAL
13 OPTIONS FOR HOW TO STRUCTURE A TRANSIT NETWORK MANAGER. AND
14 SOME OF THOSE LOGICAL OPTIONS DO HAVE THE POWER TO COORDINATE
15 FARES AND SOME OF THE LOGICAL OPTIONS RETAINING A LOOSE
16 CONSIDERATION OF TRANSIT AGENCIES WOULD NOT HAVE SUCH POWER.
17 AND SO, DEPENDING ON THE NETWORK MANAGER CHOICE, WILL SHAPE
18 THE EXTENT OF FARE INTEGRATION THAT THE REGION MAY BE ABLE TO
19 ACHIEVE.

20

21 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YEAH. I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE THE TOUGHEST
22 LIST. THAT WAS THE TOUGHEST LIFT OF THE TRANCE CAR, AND
23 CLIPPER CARD.

24



January 13, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** THAT WAS CERTAINLY AN ISSUE WITH ANYONE THAT HAS
2 AN INTEREST IN THE OUTCOME AND PAYING CLOSE ATTENTION TO THE
3 CHOICES AND IMPLICATIONS OF THE CHOICES WEIGHING IN. SO
4 SOMETHING WE'RE FOLLOWING EXTREMELY CLOSELY.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER WHO IS HAVE
7 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? MARTHA ANYBODY OUTSIDE OF MY VIEW THAT?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
10 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
11 HAND RAISED.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE INTO
14 ITEM NUMBER SEVEN, THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE
15 UPDATE AND MELANIE CHOY.

16

17 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YOU HAVE GOT ME TODAY, UNFORTUNATELY, NOT
18 MELANIE.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THIS'S OKAY.

21

22 **THERESA ROMMELL:** MELANIE IS BUSY DOING BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
23 RECOVERY WORK SO I'M TAKE HER PLACE TODAY AND WILL GIVE YOU AN
24 UPDATE. I'M THERESA ROMMEL WITH MTC STAFF. TODAY I'M GOING TO
25 PROVIDE A QUICK RECAP OF NUMBER 14 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT



January 13, 2021

1 RECOVERY TASK FORCE MEETING AND PROVIDE A PREVIEW OF WHAT WILL
2 BE DISCUSSED AT THE MEETING ON JANUARY 25TH. I THINK THIS
3 COMMITTEE MET -- LAST MET ABOUT TWO DAYS PRIOR TO THE DECEMBER
4 BLUE RIBBON MEETING. SO HOPEFULLY YOU WERE ABLE TO SEE
5 FIRSTHAND THE INFORMATION THAT WERE GOING FORWARD THAT MONTH.
6 FIRST ON THE AGENDA WAS THE TOPIC OF EQUITY. AND THE NEED TO
7 INCORPORATE SEVERAL PRINCIPLES RELATED TO EQUITY TO HELP GUIDE
8 THE NEAR-TERM ACTIONS OF THE TASK FORCE. THOSE DRAFT
9 PRINCIPLES INCLUDED ACKNOWLEDGING DISPARITIES AND INVESTING
10 EQUITABLY, INCREASING ACCESSIBILITY, BEING INCLUSIVE, USING
11 DATA TO INFORM DECISIONS AND ADVANCING HEALTH AND SAFETY.
12 THERE WAS DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING ABOUT THE NEED TO ENSURE
13 WE ARE DOING SUFFICIENT OUTREACH TO RIDERS AND ALSO THE FACT
14 THAT CONNECTIVITY AND RELIABILITY, OR SPEED OF TRANSIT ARE
15 ALSO IMPORTANT EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS. THE INTENT IS THAT THE
16 FINAL PRINCIPLES WILL BE PRESENTED TO THE TASK FORCE AT ITS
17 JANUARY MEETING. NEXT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES PRESENTED ON GOAL
18 ONE, THEIR RECOVERY EFFORTS. THIS PRESENTATION COVERED
19 INFORMATION ON ONGOING RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE LOSSES DUE TO THE
20 PANDEMIC. I THINK WE'RE STILL, MOST OPERATORS ARE DOWN, STILL,
21 IN THE SEVEN -- BUS OPERATORS IN THE 75 TO 80 PERCENT RANGE
22 AND RAIL OPERATORS STILL DOWN IN THE 90 PERCENT RANGE. IT ALSO
23 -- THEIR PRESENTATION ALSO COVERED THE INCREASED LEVEL OF
24 COORDINATION THAT OPERATORS ARE ENGAGING IN NOW AND HOW
25 OPERATORS ARE MAKING DECISIONS ON SERVICE REDUCTIONS AND



January 13, 2021

1 OPERATING BUDGET REDUCTIONS. THE NEXT PRESENTATION COVERED
2 MTC'S EXISTING AUTHORITY IN REGARD TO TRANSIT COORDINATION.
3 THIS PRESENTATION COVERED THE LONG HISTORY OF LEGISLATION
4 INTENDED TO IMPROVE COORDINATION ON PUBLIC TRANSIT SERVICE
5 PROVISION IN THE REGION. A LOT OF WHICH IS NOW EMBODIED IN
6 WHAT WE CALL THE RESOLUTION 3866. WHICH MOST OPERATORS MUST
7 AGREE TO FOLLOWING IN ORDER TO RECEIVE REGIONAL FUNDING.
8 RESOLUTION 3866 HAS BEEN A VERY USEFUL TOOL IN ACHIEVING
9 REGIONAL PARTICIPATIONS AND PROGRAMS SUCH AS CLIPPER AND 511,
10 HOWEVER THERE ARE LIMITATIONS IN THAT THE ONLY REAL TODAY THAT
11 MTC HAS IS THE ABILITY TO WITHHOLD FUNDING. THERE IS OFTEN NOT
12 THE POLITICAL WILL TO CUT OFF FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS,
13 IN GENERAL, BECAUSE ULTIMATELY THAT ALSO HURTS RIDERS. SO THAT
14 PRESENTATION KIND OF WENT INTO THE PROS AND CONS OF UTILIZING
15 OUR EXISTING AUTHORITY FOR IMPROVING COORDINATION IN THE
16 REGION, AND THERE WAS QUITE A BIT OF DISCUSSION, I THINK, EVEN
17 SURPRISE THAT THIS AUTHORITY EXISTS, AND QUESTIONING AS TO WHY
18 IT HASN'T BEEN USED MORE FREQUENTLY. SO A LOT OF GOOD
19 DISCUSSION THERE. THE FINAL PRESENTATION WAS ALSO RELATED TO
20 GOAL THREE NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE. THE TASK FORCE
21 FACILITATOR STEVE KINSEY LOOKED AT SLIDES TRYING TO DEFINE THE
22 PROBLEMS THAT MIGHT BE SOLVED THROUGH IMPROVE THE NETWORK
23 MANAGEMENT. THESE INCLUDE A NUMBER OF ISSUES THAT WE'RE
24 FAMILIAR WITH, INTEGRATION, BETTER CONNECTIVITY UNIFORM
25 INFORMATION MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PARATRANSIT COORDINATION,



January 13, 2021

1 AND IN GENERAL EFFICIENCY DEFECTIVENESS CHALLENGES PARTIALLY
2 RESULTING FROM THE SHEER NUMBER OF OPERATOR IN OUR REGION.
3 STEVE KINSEY PROPOSED THE CONVENING OF TWO AD-HOC WORKING
4 GROUPS ONE COMPRISED OF STAFF FROM VARIOUS TASK FORCE -- AND A
5 TASK FORCE TO MANAGE NETWORK MANAGEMENT CONCEPTS AND REPORT
6 BACK TO THE FULL TASK FORCE. THE PROBLEM STATEMENT WORKING
7 GROUP HAS ALREADY MET AND WILL BE MEETING THIS WEEK TO
8 BRINGING FORWARD A DRAFT PROBLEM STATEMENT TO THE TASK FORCE
9 FOR ADOPTION THIS MONTH. AS FOR AS PREVIEW FOR THE UPCOMING
10 JANUARY MEETING THE TASK FORCE WILL BE ASKED TO ADOPT THE
11 EQUITY PRINCIPLES IN THEIR FINAL FORM. STEVE KINSEY HAS BEEN
12 WORKING WITH OTHER TASK FORCE MEMBERS AND OTHER WORKING GROUPS
13 TO FINALIZE THOSE EQUITY PRINCIPLES FOR ADOPTION. WE HAVE
14 SLATED A REVIEW OF CURRENT INITIATIVES TO BOTH INFORM THE TASK
15 FORCE AND DISCUSS WAYS THAT THESE INITIATIVES MIGHT BE
16 INTEGRATED WITH THE TASK FORCE ONGOING WORK. AT THE DECEMBER
17 MEETING, WE WERE SUPPOSED TO HAVE A PRESENTATION ON TRANSIT
18 PRIORITY PROJECTS, BUT THAT GOT BUMPED TO THE JANUARY MEETING,
19 SO THAT WILL BE PART OF THE PRESENTATION ON CURRENT
20 INITIATIVES AS WELL AS A PRESENTATION ON THE FARE INTEGRATION
21 WORK THAT'S ONGOING AS WELL AS REGIONAL MAPPING AND
22 WAYFINDING. THERE ARE OBVIOUSLY OTHER INITIATIVES AS WELL, AND
23 INFORMATION ON THOSE WILL BE INCLUDED IN SOME SORT OF HAND OUT
24 FORMAT FOR THE MEETING. AND THEN LASTLY, THERE WILL BE A
25 DISCUSSION OF THE NETWORK MANAGER PROBLEM STATEMENT, AS WELL



January 13, 2021

1 AS POTENTIAL NETWORK MANAGER ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES. SO
2 THE HOPE IS TO HAVE A FINAL PROBLEM STATEMENT APPROVED AT THE
3 FEBRUARY MEETING. AND ADDITIONALLY, THE AD-HOC WORKING GROUP
4 WOULD BEGIN ITS WORK AT THAT POINT TO LOOK AT AND EVALUATE
5 DIFFERENT NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES. SO THAT'S MY REPORT,
6 TODAY, AND I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE QUESTIONS OR
9 COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL? I DON'T SEE HANDS GOING UP. WHAT
10 I'M GOING TO SAY ABOUT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS, THERE IS
11 THIS SUBTLE PUSH SOMETIMES -- I RECOGNIZE THIS HAS BEEN AN
12 ENORMOUS LIFT FOR A LOT OF THE AGENCY IN THIS PARTICULAR TIME
13 TO ACTUALLY START WORKING ON INTEGRATING THEIR SYSTEMS WHILE
14 EVERYTHING IS COLLAPSING AROUND THEM. SO, WITH THAT -- I MEAN,
15 I TRULY APPRECIATE T BUT THE SUBTLE PUSH BACK THAT WE GET IS,
16 WE'RE WORKING REALLY HARD TOGETHER, AND SOMETIMES THIS THAT'S
17 LOOK A STATEMENT OF WE REALLY DON'T NEED A NETWORK MANAGER
18 BECAUSE LOOK HOW WELL WE'RE WORKING TOGETHER NOW. AND WE'RE
19 STILL WORKING AND WE WEREN'T WORKING WELL BEFORE THE PANDEMIC
20 SO WE REALLY NEED TO ORGANIZE THIS SO THAT'S ONE PUSH. AND I
21 THINK IT'S BOTH IRRITATING AND AMUSING BECAUSE THEY AT ONCE
22 ACKNOWLEDGE THE PROBLEM WHILE SAYING THERE IS NO PROBLEM. THE
23 PUSH BACK -- IT WOULD BE HARD TO DO THIS WORK EVEN THOUGH MTC
24 HAS THIS JURISDICTION AND AUTHORITY ALREADY LEGISLATED, IT
25 WOULD BE REALLY HARD, AND I THINK WE ALL REALIZE WE COME HERE



January 13, 2021

1 TO DO HARD THINGS. THE ONE AREA OF FOCUS THAT I HAVE BEEN
2 REALLY CONCENTRATING ON IS OUR ACCESS ISSUES, OUR PARATRANSIT
3 ISSUES THAT HAS COME UP, THAT HAS COME UP REPEATEDLY, AND I
4 THINK THAT WE ARE -- THAT THAT IS PART OF THE OVERALL PROBLEM
5 STATEMENT THAT WE ARE WORKING ON, SO I'M A LITTLE BIT MORE
6 COMFORTABLE AT THIS POINT. I DO WANT TO MAKE THE STATEMENT
7 THAT THOSE WHO DO REPRESENT THE ECONOMY OR BUSINESS INTEREST,
8 I REALLY WANT YOU TO PAY ATTENTION TO WHAT'S GOING ON WITH
9 THIS, IN THAT OUR ECONOMY DOESN'T RECOVER WITHOUT TRANSIT AND
10 WITHOUT -- AND -- AND TRANSIT DOESN'T RECOVER WITHOUT OUR
11 ECONOMY RECOVERING. SO IT'S A HAND IN GLOVE KIND OF THING AND
12 I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THOSE VIEWS ARE LOOKING AT THOSE
13 -- THOSE EYES ARE LOOKING AT THE PROJECT AS WE MOVE ALONG. I
14 AM KIND OF TRYING TO STAY IN A COUPLE OF LANES HERE AND I'M
15 NOT GOING TO BE IN THE ALL THE LANES SO IT'S REALLY UP TO
16 EVERYBODY TO KIND OF PAY ATTENTION TO THIS. I SEE HAND UP NOW.
17 WE'LL GO TO WALTER WILSON FIRST. GO AHEAD WALTER AND UNMUTE
18 YOURSELF.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. LISTEN, I DON'T KNOW IF I
21 MISSED IT, BUT I WAS TRANSFERRING FROM MY CAR TO MY COMPUTER,
22 AND I JUST WANTED TO SAY THANK YOU FOR PUTTING ME ON THE -- ON
23 THIS NEW COMMITTEE WITH VEDA. I APPRECIATE IT. ON ME BEING ON
24 THAT COMMITTEE. I HAVE A QUESTION, TWO QUESTIONS. WHAT IS THE
25 POSITION OF THIS GROUP ON A NETWORK MANAGER THAT YOU'RE



January 13, 2021

1 TALKING ABOUT? WAS THERE EVER A VOTE TAKEN? DO WE HAVE A
2 POSITION? AND THE OTHER THING, THE PRESENTER WAS SPEAKING
3 ABOUT 3466, AND I KIND OF MISSED SOME OF THAT, AND I WOULD
4 LIKE TO KNOW MORE ABOUT WHAT THAT'S ABOUT BECAUSE IT SOUNDS
5 LIKE SOMETHING THAT GOVERNS TRANSIT.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO, I WILL SPEAK TO THE NETWORK MANAGER,
8 AND THAT IS SOMETHING THAT WE HAVE REPEATEDLY VOICED APPROVAL
9 FOR BECAUSE IT WOULD FALL IN LINE WITH OUR ONGOING PUSH TO
10 MAKE A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WORKS ACROSS THE REGION, AND THAT
11 HAS THE CONNECTIVITY AND THE AFFORDABILITY THAT OUR LOW INCOME
12 RIDERS NEED. SO THAT HAS BEEN SOMETHING THAT I DON'T RECALL --
13 I WOULD HAVE TO GO BACK THROUGH MINUTES BUT I -- OH, WE DID.
14 WE DID TAKE A VOTE ON THAT BECAUSE I REMEMBER STANDING BEFORE
15 THE COMMISSION AND SAYING WE VOTED ON THIS. SO WE HAVE TAKEN
16 THAT, IF YOU FEEL THAT THERE IS A REASON TO REVISIT THAT, WE
17 CAN. DOWN THE -- YOU KNOW, WE CAN. BUT WE'RE, KIND OF, RIGHT
18 NOW, IN THE MODE OF LETTING THE TASK FORCE ROLL WITH THAT,
19 THAT -- TO SEE HOW THAT'S GOING TO -- HOW THAT WOULD PLAY OUT
20 WITH -- AS A RELIABLE FEATURE OF OUR INTEGRATED SYSTEM.

21

22 **WALTER WILSON:** NO. I APPRECIATE THAT. I JUST WANTED TO GET UP
23 TO SPEED ON IT.

24



January 13, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THERESA IF YOU COULD ANSWER THE SECOND
2 QUESTION.

3

4 **THERESA ROMMELL:** RESOLUTION MTC3866 WHICH BASICALLY IS AN MTC
5 POLICY WHICH INTEGRATES VARIOUS LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY THAT
6 EXISTS FOR MTC TO BE THE REGIONAL KIND OF COORDINATOR OF
7 PUBLIC TRANSIT, TO A DEGREE. SO TO REQUIRE CERTAIN LEVELS OF
8 COORDINATION AMONG OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS. SO WE HAVE -- IT'S -
9 - IT'S KIND OF FOCUSED MOST ON THINGS LIKE -- SORRY --
10 PARTICIPATION, IN OUR CORE SYSTEM, 511, THOSE TYPES OF
11 PROJECTS, AND IT COULD BE A TOOL THAT THE BLUE RIBBON WANTS TO
12 PURSUE EXPANDING THAT AUTHORITY, AND THE COVERAGE OF IT, BUT
13 THAT'S WHAT KIND OF EXISTS RIGHT NOW AS OUR EXISTING AUTHORITY
14 TO KIND OF PROMOTE COORDINATION IN THE REGION. AND, AS I
15 MENTIONED, KIND OF THE STICK THAT IS PART OF 3866, OUR
16 LEVERAGE IS THAT WE ARE ABLE TO WITHHOLD CERTAIN FUND SOURCES
17 FROM OPERATORS WHO DON'T COMPLY WITH THAT RESOLUTION.
18 ALTHOUGH, THAT IN ITSELF IS A DIFFICULT THING TO DO AS WELL.

19

20 **WALTER WILSON:** THERESA, I JUST LOOKED IT UP AND IT SAYS IT'S
21 11 YEARS OLD IS THAT THE 13866, IT SAYS IT WAS 2010.

22

23 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH. THIS'S WHAT IT IS. IT HASN'T BEEN
24 UPDATED FOR SOMETIME.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **WALTER WILSON:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES?

4

5 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YEAH, THANKS THERESA. YOU MADE A STATEMENT
6 THAT WITH THE DISCUSSION OF WITHHOLDING FUNDING THAT THERE WAS
7 A LOT OF PEOPLE SURPRISED. THERE WAS DISCUSSION BEFORE THE
8 COMMISSION WITHHOLDING MONEY FOR CITIES THAT DIDN'T PRODUCE
9 BUILDING PENALTIES FOR 15 PERCENT OF THEIR RHNA ALLOTMENT. I
10 THINK IT WAS APPARENT THERE WAS A ONE VOTE MAJORITY TO
11 IMPLEMENT IT, AND BECAUSE OF SPLITTING THE COMMISSION THEY
12 BACKED OFF OF IT. SO IT WAS PRETTY HOTLY CONTESTED, I AM
13 SURPRISED PEOPLE DIDN'T REMEMBER T DO YOU REMEMBER THAT?

14

15 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH. ALTHOUGH I WOULD NOTE THAT 3866 IS
16 PRETTY FOCUSED ON TRANSIT COORDINATION. SO IT'S REALLY, MUCH
17 SO, I DON'T BELIEVE THAT REALLY -- UNLESS IT'S A CITY OPERATED
18 TRANSIT AGENCY I DON'T KNOW THAT IT WOULD APPLY TO THE
19 SITUATION YOU JUST REFERENCES.

20

21 **RICHARD HEDGES:** IT'S SIMILAR WITH THE FUNDING.

22

23 **THERESA ROMMELL:** ANY TIME YOU WANT TO WITHHOLD FUNDS YOU'RE
24 GOING TO HAVE A BIG DEBATE ON YOUR HANDS.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I REALLY PROBABLY 15 YEARS AGO WHEN WE HAD THE
2 TRANSIT ORIENTED SUBCOMMITTEE THAT WAS FROM THE VARIOUS GROUPS
3 THAT THERE WAS A MOTION AND SUPPORT ON THE COMMITTEE FOR
4 ASKING THE COMMISSION TO CLAW BACK FINDING GRANT MONEYS WHERE
5 THE PLANNING WASN'T DONE AND IT DIDN'T GO ANYWHERE. SO THAT'S
6 THE SUM OF MY COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO RICK COATES.

9

10 **RICK COATES:** YEAH. I THINK I WOULD JUST MAKE A SUGGESTION ON
11 HOW WE MIGHT GIVE THAT SOME MORE TEETH. FIRST OF ALL, STEALTH.
12 WE NEED TO START WITH TRYING TO USE IT ON THINGS THAT WE CAN
13 GET SUBSTANTIAL AGREEMENT TO; AND SET PRECEDENT, AND SLOWLY
14 BUT SURELY EXPAND THAT AUTHORITY BY ADDING OTHER ISSUES IN.
15 JUST A THOUGHT THERE. YET POLITICAL OPPOSITION IS ALWAYS GOING
16 TO BE A PROBLEM. AND CERTAINLY, WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT REDUCING
17 FUNDING. BUT, YOU KNOW, YOU GOT TO START SOMEWHERE. AND I
18 WOULD PUSH.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I JUST -- YEAH, I WANT TO BE
21 CLEAR THAT THE TASK FORCE ISN'T REALLY RECOMMENDING -- I THINK
22 THAT THE -- THE LINE OF THOUGHT THAT WE'RE MOVING ALONG
23 TOWARDS NOW IS MORE BENEFITTING PEOPLE WHO IS IDENTIFYING
24 REGIONAL WORK, AND USING THE CARROT, NOT THE STICK VERSION AT
25 THIS POINT, AND THERESA IS RIGHT, PEOPLE WERE REALLY KIND OF



January 13, 2021

1 SURPRISED TO FIND OUT THIS LEGISLATION ACTUALLY EXISTED. SO,
2 BUT I THINK YOU'RE RIGHT ON TARGET WITH THIS. WENDI IS UP
3 NEXT. WENDI, GO AHEAD.

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. I JUST HAVE A REALLY QUICK QUESTION. I
6 MIGHT HAVE MISSED IT. BUT WHEN IS THE NEXT BLUE RIBBON
7 MEETING.

8

9 **THERESA ROMMELL:** IT'S JANUARY 25TH.

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** AT WHAT TIME?

12

13 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I THINK IT'S AT 1:00, IF I'M NOT MISTAKEN.
14 LET ME JUST CHECK.

15

16 **WENDI KALLINS:** I WANT TO PUT IT ON MY CALENDAR.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IT'S AT 1:05 P.M. IT'S LISTED ON
19 MTC.LEGISTAR.COM AND IT'S ALSO LISTED IN YOUR SUMMARY SHEET
20 FOR THIS ITEM.

21

22 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANKS.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS GOING TO BE
2 LOOKING AT VARIOUS DIFFERENT WAYS OF PROVIDING THAT NETWORK
3 MANAGER FUNCTIONALITY AND AS, I THINK, RICH HAS ALLUDED TO,
4 THE ABILITY TO DO DIFFERENT KINDS OF FARE INTEGRATION OR
5 COORDINATION WILL DEPEND ON WHAT KIND OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT
6 FUNCTIONALITY IS PROVIDED. SO, I THINK THAT AS THIS GROUP GETS
7 AGENDA ITEMS ON THESE TOPICS, YOU KNOW, WE'LL BE INTERESTED IN
8 LOOKING AT WHAT THOSE OPTIONS ARE, AND WE MAY WANT TO EXPRESS
9 OPINIONS. YOU KNOW, LOOKING AT DIFFERENT OPTIONS AND TO SEE
10 OUT OF THESE DIFFERENT OPTIONS, YOU KNOW, WHAT WOULD CREATE
11 THE KIND OF POWER TO DO THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE BEEN TALKING
12 ABOUT, WANTING IN TERMS OF EQUITY, AND TRANSIT RIDER
13 EXPERIENCE AND SUPPORT OF THE ECONOMY. YOU KNOW, AS THE
14 DIFFERENT CHOICES ARE WE GOING TO GET -- YOU KNOW, WHAT KIND
15 OF ACCOUNTABILITY TO THE PUBLIC AS MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
16 REPRESENTING DIFFERENT SECTORS OF THE PUBLIC, YOU KNOW, WE'LL
17 -- WHATEVER IT IS THAT GETS SETUP, WILL HAVE THE KIND OF
18 ACCOUNTABILITY THAT WE WANT TO SEE FROM OUR PUBLIC
19 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. SO HOPEFULLY WE WILL SEE THE OPTIONS
20 THAT ARE COMING FORWARD, AND WE MAY WANT TO WEIGH IN ON WHAT
21 THOSE OPTIONS ARE BASED ON THEIR ABILITY TO ACHIEVE THE THINGS
22 THAT WE SAID WE WANT THEM TO ACHIEVE. TWO -- A COUPLE MORE
23 COMMENTS. AND ONE IS THAT, ON THE ONE HAND, THAT MTC DOES HAVE
24 THAT MANDATE, AND THERE WAS THE POLICY FROM ABOUT TEN YEARS
25 AGO, BUT THERE WAS ALSO SOMETHING FROM THE '90S ABOUT A LAW



January 13, 2021

1 THAT WAS PASSED. I HEARD ABOUT THE THING FROM THE '90S BUT
2 THERE WAS SOMETHING GOING BACK TO THE '70S THAT I DIDN'T KNOW
3 ABOUT, THAT WAS ON THE BOOKS, BUT IT'S NOT JUST SO MTC HAS
4 CONFLICTING -- IT'S THE AUTHORITY TO SET FARES AND COORDINATE
5 SCHEDULES, TRANSIT AGENCY ALSO HAS THE AUTHORITY TO SET FARES
6 AND SCHEDULES RIGHT NOW THERE IS CONTRADICTION IN TERMS OF WHO
7 HAS THE ABILITY TO DO THIS. TO RICK COATES'S POINT, ABOUT
8 STARTING SMALL, IT'S HELPFUL TO THINK ABOUT THERE IS MANY
9 INCREMENTAL STEPS TOWARDS INTEGRATION THAT OVER THE YEARS HAS
10 BEEN UNDONE THERE ARE TRANSIT PASSES THAT HAD TRANSFERS FROM
11 BART AND A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT AGENCIES THAT WAS IMPLEMENTED
12 THAT HAS BEEN UNIMPLEMENTED. THERE WAS A PILOT PROGRAM WITH
13 BART AND AC TRANSIT TO HAVE BETTER TRANSFERS THAT WAS
14 IMPLEMENTED AND NEVER ROLLED OUT, AND SO, I THINK THAT ON THE
15 ONE HAND, OFTEN, STARTING SMALL IS HELPFUL, BUT ON THE OTHER
16 HAND SOMETIMES STARTING TOO SMALL LEADS TO WHAT YOU'RE DOING
17 VULNERABLE, TO BEING UNSTABLE SO THAT'S GOING TO BE ANOTHER
18 THING THINKING ABOUT GOING FORWARD.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** CYNTHIA.

21

22 **CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR:** I APPRECIATE THE REFERENCING
23 THE ECONOMY AND INTERPLAY BETWEEN TRANSIT AND JOBS AND THE
24 ECONOMY. I JUST WANTED TO REINFORCE THAT WE ARE WATCHING THAT
25 AND VERY CONCERNED BECAUSE FROM THE MULTIPLE BLOWS CERTAINLY



January 13, 2021

1 GOING TO REQUIRE THAT WE HAVE THE RIGHT KIND OF INFRASTRUCTURE
2 AND ECONOMICALLY ECOSYSTEM IN PLACE FOR US TO HAVE THE
3 RECOVERY WE HOPE TO HAVE IN OUR BUSINESSES AND COUNTING ON
4 TRANSIT BEING THERE ONLY BECAUSE OF THE NEED TO BE ABLE TO GET
5 THEIR EMPLOYEES TO THE WORKSITE AND SOME OF THEM WILL BE
6 CONTINUING TO WORK REMOTE BUT MANY WILL NEED TO GO TO THE
7 WORKSITE, AND ADDRESSING CLIMATE CHANGE AND CLIMATE ADAPTATION
8 AND REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS FROM VEHICLES IS
9 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT TO ALL OF US AND WE NEED TO CONTINUE TO
10 REINFORCE THAT IN THIS WORK AND IT'S IMPERATIVE THAT WE FIGURE
11 OUT HOW TO REDUCE THAT AND OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM IS SOMETHING WE
12 REALLY COUNTED ON TO BRING THOSE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS DOWN
13 FOR SINGLE PASSENGER VEHICLES. THE OTHER ASPECT THEY THINK IS
14 IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER IN OUR NEED FOR TRANSIT IS HOW MUCH OF
15 OUR AFFORDABLE HOUSING TAX CREDITS ARE RELIANT ON ACCESS TO
16 TRANSIT. THEY HAVE TO BE WITHIN -- I'M NOT SURE IF I HAVE GOT
17 THE NUMBER RIGHT, BUT IT USED TO BE SOMETHING LIKE 500 FEET OF
18 TRANSIT STOP IN ORDER TO GET A TAX CREDIT. AND IF WE KEEP
19 LOSING TRANSIT AND TRANSIT STOPS IT'S REALLY GOING TO IMPACT
20 OUR ABILITY TO FUND THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING WE NEED WHICH AS WE
21 ALL KNOW IS ANOTHER CRISIS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO GET THROUGH
22 RIGHT NOW AND WE'RE -- AND DESPERATELY SHOWN HOW MUCH WE NEED
23 TO KEEP PEOPLE HOUSED ESPECIALLY IN A PANDEMIC AND WHAT IT
24 MEANS WHEN THEY'RE NOT SO I JUST WANTED TO RIDDEN ENFORCE WHAT



January 13, 2021

1 YOU SAID AND THROW OUT A COUPLE OF OTHER ASPECTS AND WHY THIS
2 IS SO CRITICALLY IMPORTANT.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE ANY OTHER COUNCIL
5 MEMBERS WITH QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? MARTHA, IS THERE ANY
6 PUBLIC COMMENTS?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO FOUNDATION PUBLIC COMMENT
9 SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
10 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE WILL MOVE INTO ITEM NUMBER
13 NINE, WHICH, AGAIN, WILL BE THERESA ROMMEL AND COVID-19
14 FEDERAL RELIEF FUNDING.

15

16 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE SKIPPED EIGHT.

19

20 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH. NEXT ON THE AGENDA.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH. IT'S YOUR SHOW.

23

24 **THERESA ROMMELL:** OKAY. GREAT. WELL, I WILL PROVIDE AN UPDATE
25 SIMILAR TO WHAT I PROVIDED TODAY EARLIER AT THE PROGRAMMING



January 13, 2021

1 AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. LAST MONTH WE SAW LEGISLATION
2 SIGNED INTO LAW THAT PROVIDED SOME SIGNIFICANT FUNDING,
3 FUNDING RELIEF FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT, IN COMBINATION WITH THE
4 2021 FEDERAL APPROPRIATIONS. SO FOR COVID RELIEF THE PACKAGE
5 CONTAINED \$14 BILLION NATION-WIDE FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES.
6 AND EARLIER THIS WEEK, THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION
7 RELEASED THE APPORTIONMENTS FOR WHAT IS BEING CALLED THE
8 CORONAVIRUS RESPONSE AND RELIEF SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATIONS
9 ACT OF 2021 OR CRSSA SO OF THAT \$14 MILLION NATION-WIDE, THE
10 BAY AREA IS GOING TO BE RECEIVING ABOUT 982 MILLION ACROSS
11 THREE ELIGIBLE URBANIZED AREAS THAT AMOUNT IS HIGHER THAN WE
12 ANTICIPATED WHEN WE WROTE UP THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
13 COMMITTEE MEMO THAT'S GOOD NEWS BECAUSE WE'RE GETTING A LITTLE
14 BIT EXTRA. BAY AREA WILL ALSO RECEIVE A SHARE OF RURAL AREA
15 FUNDS, THAT AMOUNT IS ABOUT 74 MILLION STATEWIDE AND IT'S A
16 LITTLE UNCLEAR RIGHT NOW HOW MUCH WILL BE COMING TO THE BAY
17 AREA BUT WE WILL UPDATE EVERYONE ONCE WE KNOW. AND ABOUT
18 900,000 IN ENHANCED MOBILITY FUNDS FOR SENIORS AND INDIVIDUALS
19 WITH DISABILITIES. I MENTION THAT THE BULK OF THE FUNDING IS
20 GOING TO THREE URBANIZED AREAS AND THERE ARE 12 FEDERALLY
21 DESIGNATED URBANIZED AREAS IN THE BAY AREA, ONLY THREE ARE
22 ELIGIBLE FOR THE SUPPLEMENTAL COVID RELIEF FUNDS AND THE
23 REASON FOR THAT IS THAT THE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING IS CAPPED SO
24 THAT URBANIZED AREAS, NOT OPERATORS, BUT URBANIZED AREAS THAT
25 HAVE ALREADY RECEIVED 75 PERCENT MORE OF THEIR REPORTED



January 13, 2021

1 OPERATING EXPENSE, ARE NOT ELIGIBLE FOR SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING.
2 AND ALL URBANIZED AREAS ARE CAPPED AT 75 PERCENT OF THEIR
3 OPERATING EXPENSES, THROUGH CARES AND CRSSA SO ONCE THEY REACH
4 THAT 75 PERCENT THRESHOLD THEY ARE KIND OF CUT OFF FROM THE
5 SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING. THE FEDERAL REQUIREMENT IS WE CANNOT
6 ALLOCATE FUNDS TO OPERATORS THAT ARE NOT ELIGIBLE WITHIN THOSE
7 APPORTIONMENT AREAS BUT THE GOOD NEWS IS OF THE 25 FEDERALLY
8 FUNDED TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE REGION THERE ARE ONLY A
9 HANDFUL THAT ARE NOT ELIGIBLE TO RECEIVE FUNDING WITHIN THE
10 THREE URBANIZED AREAS THAT WERE APPORTIONED SOME OF THAT
11 FUNDING. SO FOR OUR PART WE PLAN TO RUN THE ANALYSIS OF NEEDS
12 AND REVENUE LOSSES FOR ALL OPERATORS AND ENDEAVOR TO MEET
13 THOSE NEEDS TO THE EXTENT POSSIBLE. IN TERMS OF A DISTRIBUTION
14 OF FUNDS, STAFF IS PROPOSING TO BRING AN INITIAL PROGRAMMING
15 ACTION TO THE JANUARY COMMISSION THIS MONTH AND THE INITIAL
16 PROGRAMMING WOULD FULFILL THE COMMISSION DIRECTOR THAT STAFF
17 RECEIVED IN JULY WITH THE PROGRAMMING OF THE CARES ACT FUND TO
18 APPLY A TRUE-UP OF THAT DISTRIBUTION TO ANY FUTURE ALLOCATION
19 OF FEDERAL PANDEMIC RELIEF FUNDING. SPECIFICALLY, WE WOULD BE
20 PROPOSING THAT PROGRAMMING OF FUNDING TO OPERATORS THAT
21 RECEIVED LESS CARES ACT FUNDING THAN THEY SHOULD HAVE DUE TO
22 INACCURATE FORECAST OF REVENUE LOSSES. SO THAT INITIAL
23 PROGRAMMING WOULD ALLOW US TO FULFILL THE COMMISSION DIRECTIVE
24 AS WELL AS GET FUNDING INTO THE HANDS EVER OPERATORS THAT ARE
25 STRUGGLING TO MEET OPERATING EXPENSES IN THE CURRENT FISCAL



January 13, 2021

1 YEAR. WE WOULD THEN PROPOSE TO DISTRIBUTE THE BALANCE OF THE
2 FUNDS IN FEBRUARY OR MARCH ONCE WE HAVE HAD TIME TO EVALUATE
3 ALTERNATIVE DISTRIBUTION SCENARIOS AND ALSO LOOK AT THE
4 VARIOUS OPERATOR CIRCUMSTANCES. MORE BROADLY IN REGARD TO THE
5 PROGRAMMING OF THE CARES ACT SEVERAL PRINCIPLE GUIDING
6 ALLOCATION OF FUNDING MUCH OF THE CONTENT OF THE PRINCIPLE
7 STILL RELEVANT TO DISTRIBUTION OF THE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS
8 RATHER IN REVISITING THE PRINCIPLES IN LIGHT OF THE NEW
9 CIRCUMSTANCES AND PRACTICAL EXPERIENCE WITH THE CARES ACT WE
10 RECOMMEND APPLYING SEVERAL FACTORS FOR CONSIDERATION IN THE
11 PROGRAMMING OF CRSSA FUNDING FIRST GOING TO OPERATORS THAT ARE
12 MOST IN NEED SECOND REMAINING COGNIZANT OF THE FACT THAT THIS
13 PANDEMIC HAS AFFECTED THE VARIOUS REVENUE STREAMS THAT
14 COMPRISE OPERATOR BUDGETS IN VARIOUS DIFFERENT WAYS AND WILL
15 LIKELY CONTINUE TO DO THAT. WE HAVE TO WORK WITHIN THE
16 FEDERALLY URBANIZED AREAS OF THE FRAMEWORK IN DEVELOPING
17 DISTRIBUTION AND WILL EXTEND TO THE EXTENT FEASIBLE
18 CONSIDERATION FOR SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING TO FILL THE GAPS FOR
19 OPERATORS THAT ARE NOT ELIGIBLE FOR DIRECT ALLOCATION OF
20 FUNDS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO PRIORITIZE THE NEEDS OF THE MOST
21 TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS TAKING INTO ACCOUNT RIDING SERVICE
22 RIGHT NOW AND CONSIDERATION OF FUNDING WHERE MAY NOT BE
23 SUFFICIENT TO PROVIDE CONSCIENCE FOR THAT DEMAND FINALLY FOR
24 THE PURPOSE OF TRANSPARENCY PROVIDING EFFECTIVE RESPONSE WE
25 FEEL IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE A CLEAR PICTURE OF FINANCIAL



January 13, 2021

1 STATUS FOR OUR OPERATORS FOR THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR AND
2 UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR AND PROVIDING THIS INFORMATION SHOULD BE
3 A CONDITION FOR RECEIVING FUNDS. THIS IS BASICALLY MY REPORT
4 AT THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE EARLIER, AND I AM
5 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MIGHT HAVE.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HAS HIS HAND UP FIRST. GO
8 AHEAD RICH, AND THEN WENDI.

9

10 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU AGAIN THERESA FOR A GREAT REPORT. I
11 HAVE TWO QUESTIONS. WHICH AGENCIES ARE NOT RECEIVING FUNDING
12 IF YOU KNOW, AND SECOND, IS THERE ANY HOPE OF ANY MONEY GOING
13 DIRECTLY TO PARATRANSIT OPERATORS?

14

15 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WELL, THE FUNDING CAN BE USED FOR PARATRANSIT
16 OPERATIONS. IT WILL BE DISTRIBUTED TO THE OPERATORS
17 THEMSELVES, AND IT WILL BE UP TO THEM TO USE IT FOR
18 PARATRANSIT OR FOR GENERAL OPERATIONS. THE SIX AGENCIES THAT
19 ARE NOT ELIGIBLE IN THE THREE URBANIZED AREAS THEY MENTIONED
20 ARE COUNTY CONNECTION, TRI DELTA, LAFTA, NVTA, PETALUMA, AND
21 VACAVILLE.

22

23 **RICHARD HEDGES:** ALL OF THE AGENCIES THAT CONNECT. A LOT OF THE
24 -- OKAY.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH. SO AS I MENTIONED WE ARE GOING TO BE
2 DOING QUITE A BIT OF ANALYSIS TO LOOK AT OPERATOR NEEDS. IT'S
3 NOT OUR INTENTION TO LEAVE ANYONE OUT IN THE COLD, OR TO FORCE
4 THEM TO USE SOME OTHER FUND SOURCE LIKE A CAPITAL REVENUE
5 SOURCE TO FUND THEIR OPERATIONS. WE FEEL THAT THE REMAINING
6 NEED WILL PROBABLY BE, YOU KNOW, SMALL ENOUGH THAT WE CAN
7 PROBABLY HANDLE IT THROUGH, YOU KNOW, WHAT OTHER TOOLS THERESE
8 MENTIONED EARLIER THAT WE MIGHT HAVE AVAILABLE. DID I SAY WE
9 HAVE SOME RURAL FUNDING IN THE COVID RELIEF PROGRAM THAT WE
10 CAN WORK WITH CALTRANS TO POTENTIALLY DIRECT TO THOSE
11 OPERATORS THAT WEREN'T ELIGIBLE FOR THE BULK OF THE FUNDING SO
12 THAT MIGHT TAKE CARE OF SOME OF IT AND THEN WE CAN KIND OF
13 LOOK TO SEE WHAT ELSE WE HAVE AVAILABLE FOR THEM.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SAW WENDI HAD HER HAND UP.
16 BUT I DON'T SEE IT NOW. WENDI? IF YOU --

17

18 **WENDI KALLINS:** MY QUESTION WAS ANSWERED.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. NEXT UP WILL BE WALTER.
21 GO AHEAD WALTER.

22

23 **WALTER WILSON:** YES ONE OF MINE WAS ANSWERED TOO, AND I THINK
24 SHE JUST ANSWERED THE OTHER WHETHER THE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS
25 WERE GOING TO COME TO ASSIST THOSE AGENCIES WHO NEED



January 13, 2021

1 ADDITIONAL ASSISTANCE. YOU CAN REITERATE THAT, PLEASE? AND
2 THEN ALSO, TELL ME WHAT CRSSA MEANS AGAIN. I'M SORRY.

3

4 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I'LL HAVE TO REFER TO MY NOTES ON THAT
5 QUESTION. THE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING I HAD NOTED WAS THE 5311,
6 IT'S A FORMULA FUNDING FOR RURAL AREAS. WE DON'T KNOW EXACTLY
7 HOW MUCH IS GOING TO COME TO THE REGION YET, AND THAT IS
8 NORMALLY CALTRANS, THE STATE WHO DISTRIBUTES THOSE FUNDS, BUT
9 WITH THE CARES ACT, CALTRANS DID WORK WITH US, TO ALLOW US TO
10 KIND OF USE THOSE FUNDS TO FILL IN THE GAPS IN THE FUNDING
11 DISTRIBUTION SO WE'RE HOPING WE CAN WORK WITH THEM AGAIN
12 TOWARDS PRIORITIZING FUNDING FOR THOSE OPERATOR THAT IS DIDN'T
13 RECEIVE ANY THROUGH THE OTHER SOURCE. AND CRSSA REFERS TO THE
14 CORONAVIRUS RESPONSE AND RELIEF SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATIONS
15 ACT OF 2021. SO NOT A CUTE ACRONYM THIS TIME.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VEDA IS NEXT.

18

19 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU THERESE FOR THAT VERY INFORMATIVE
20 PRESENTATION. I MENTIONED IN THIS MORNING'S MEETINGS THAT
21 OPERATORS, TRANSIT PROVIDES IN THE NORTH BAY ARE OFTEN LEFT
22 OUT OF THE FORMULAS, BECAUSE WE HAVE A SMALLER POPULATION
23 HERE. AND I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IN NAPA COUNTY, 40
24 PERCENT OF THE POPULATION IS FROM THE LATINX COMMUNITY, AND WE
25 HAVE A VERY HIGH POPULATION IN SONOMA COUNTY. AND I AM HOPING



January 13, 2021

1 THAT WITH THE RURAL FUNDING, THAT THESE OPERATORS WHO ARE NOT
2 -- WHO ARE NOT BEING FUNDED CAN BE PUT ON THE TOP OF THE LIST
3 FOR FUNDING OPPORTUNITY IN THE FUTURE.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHRISTINA?

6

7 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I HAVE A QUESTION. WAS THERE A DESCRIPTION
8 OF THE THREE AREAS THAT DIDN'T QUALIFY? LIKE A SPECIFIC?

9

10 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERE WERE ONLY THREE THAT DID QUALIFY.

11

12 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** I'M SORRY. THE AREAS THAT DID NOT QUALIFY
13 WERE?

14

15 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERE IS NINE OF THEM THAT DID NOT QUALIFY,
16 INCLUDING ANTIOCH, CONCORD, YOU KNOW, VACAVILLE HAS ITS OWN, I
17 BELIEVE. FAIRFIELD HAS ITS OWN AS WELL, NAPA IS ANOTHER ONE.
18 SO THERE IS A NUMBER OF THEM THAT DIDN'T QUALIFY, AND I THINK
19 GILROY IS ANOTHER. SO THE ONLY ONES THAT DID WERE SAN
20 FRANCISCO OAKLAND, SAN JOSE AND SANTA ROSA URBANIZED AREAS.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS.
23 AND WITH THAT 75 PERCENT CAP, SO WE HAVE THE THREE MAJOR AREAS
24 THAT THE POTS OF MONEY CAN BE ALLOCATED TO, WAS BART ALLOCATED
25 ITS ENTIRE 75 PERCENT ALLOTMENT IN THE CARES ACT? IN THE SAN



January 13, 2021

1 FRANCISCO OAKLAND AREA? BECAUSE IT SEEMS TO ME, I THOUGHT THEY
2 RECEIVED LIKE A HUGE -- NO?

3

4 **THERESA ROMMELL:** NO. IT'S VERY COMPLICATED AND I'LL ATTEMPT TO
5 EXPLAIN IT BUT THE 75 PERCENT CAP IS NOT APPLIED BY OPERATOR
6 IT'S APPLIED BY URBANIZED AREA AND WITH THE CARES ACT WE TRIED
7 TO BE AS BROAD AS POSSIBLE IN ORDER TO KIND OF FULFILL THOSE
8 PRINCIPLES THAT WE HAD DEVELOPED AND WE SPREAD THOSE URBANIZED
9 AREAS OUT TO THE MAXIMUM WE COULD. BART GOT A LOT OF MONEY
10 FROM CONCORD AND AREAS IN ANTIOCH HAVE AREAS THAT ARE NOT
11 ELIGIBLE RIGHT NOW BUT BECAUSE WE HAVE SO MANY OPERATOR IN THE
12 BAY AREA NOBODY RECEIVED 75 PERCENT OF THEIR OPERATING COST NO
13 SINGLE OPERATOR DID. BUT JUST THE WAY THAT THE CALCULATION WAS
14 DONE, IT DEPENDED ON WHERE THE OPERATOR REPORTED ITS OPERATING
15 EXPENSES IN THE NATIONAL TRANSIT DATABASE, AND THEN, YOU KNOW,
16 THEY APPLIED HOW MUCH CARES ACT THEY GOT TO THOSE OPERATING
17 EXPENSES AND HOW WE DISTRIBUTED THE FUNDING FOR THE CARES ACT
18 WAS MUCH DIFFERENT. JUST, NOBODY GOT 75 PERCENT OF THEIR
19 OPERATING COSTS MET AT ALL, NOT BY A LONG SHOT. BUT THE ONLY
20 PLACE THAT THERE IS STILL ROOM IS IN THE SFO AND SAN JOSE AND
21 SANTA ROSA URBANIZED AREAS.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO MY NEXT QUESTION IS, THERE WAS A
24 LOT OF DISCUSSION THIS MORNING ON THE ABILITY TO MOVE
25 OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE IN -- TO USE THE -- INTO OPERATIONS



January 13, 2021

1 MAINTENANCE INTO -- SO I THINK THAT'S REALLY A DISCUSSION THAT
2 EACH AGENCY IS GOING HAVE TO HAVE. MY CONCERN, BECAUSE THERE
3 IS A POT OF DEDICATED MONEY FOR SENIORS AND DISABLED IS THAT
4 PROJECTS THAT ARE MAINTENANCE PROJECTS, YOU KNOW, MAKING SURE
5 THAT WE ARE COMPLIANT, ADA COMPLIANT, OR ACCESS ISSUES, MY
6 CONCERN IS THAT THEY WILL LOOK AT THOSE, THAT FUNDING, AND
7 SAY, OH, WELL, WE HAVE IT IN THIS NEW COVID FUNDING, SO WE CAN
8 TAKE IT OUT OF OUR EXISTING FUNDING STREAM AND USE THAT FOR --
9 SO WHAT I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE NOT DOING IS
10 SUBSTITUTING THAT ADDITIONAL LITTLE TINY BONUS FOR SENIORS AND
11 DISABLED TO -- THAT WE'RE NOT -- WE'RE NOT USING IT THAT WAY.
12 THAT WE'RE NOT --

13

14 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I SEE WHAT YOU'RE SAYING. WE'RE ALWAYS WARY
15 OF SUPPLANTING FUNDING IN ANY WAY WITH NEW REVENUE STREAMS THE
16 CONCEPT IS TO AUGMENT THE PROGRAMS NOT SUPPLEMENT FUNDS. AND I
17 CAN TELL YOU THAT THAT PROGRAM ITSELF IS OPERATED THROUGH
18 CALTRANS NOT THE REGION THEY'RE THE ONES THAT KIND OF DIRECT
19 THE PROJECTS AND WE HAVE A VERY GOOD FACILITATOR OF WORKING
20 WITH CALTRANS AND VERY, YOU KNOW, ABSOLUTELY DEDICATED TO
21 MAKING SURE THAT THOSE FUNDS GO TO WHERE THEY'RE INTENDED, AND
22 I DON'T ANTICIPATE THERE BEING ANY ISSUE WITH SUPPLANTING OF
23 FUNDS.

24



January 13, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M NOT SAYING THAT THAT -- WHAT I'M
2 SAYING IS I HAD \$100 MILLION DOLLARS TO DO ADA UPGRADES OR TO
3 DO COMPLIANCE RIGHT NOW, BUT IF I CAN GET THAT \$100 MILLION
4 FROM ANOTHER FUND, I DON'T HAVE TO USE MY MILLION DOLLARS, I
5 CAN USE THE FUND MILLION DOLLARS. AND WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE
6 IS TO HAVE \$2 MILLION IN THAT POT RATHER THAN -- BECAUSE I
7 UNDERSTAND THAT MAINTENANCE, FLEET MAINTENANCE AND OTHER
8 UPGRADES AND OTHER ISSUES ARE NOT THE PRIORITY RIGHT NOW,
9 GETTING MORE BUSES ON THE STREETS AND KEEPING TRANSIT RUNNING
10 IS. SO THAT WAS WHERE I WAS GOING WITH THAT.

11

12 **THERESA ROMMELL:** NO, I HEAR YOU. AND IF YOU WOULD LIKE, WE'RE
13 HAPPY, ONCE THAT FUNDING BECOMES AVAILABLE, WE'RE HAPPY TO
14 COME BACK AND KIND OF TALK TO YOU ABOUT WHAT IDEAS WE HAVE FOR
15 IT.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. BECAUSE I KNOW WE DON'T EVEN KNOW
18 WHAT THAT IS YET. BUT I JUST WANT TO THROW OUT A LITTLE FLAG
19 ON THAT. I SEE WALTER'S HAND UP. WALTER, GO AHEAD.

20

21 **WALTER WILSON:** THANK YOU. YOU KNOW SINCE BART LOOKS LIKE
22 THEY'RE IN THE THREE AREAS THAT YOU TALKED ABOUT, DO THEY GET
23 FUNDING FOR ALL THREE AREAS? HOW DOES THAT WORK?

24



January 13, 2021

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THEY'RE ELIGIBLE FOR FUNDING IN THOSE THREE
2 AREAS I'M NOT SURE ABOUT SANTA ROSA, BUT FOR SURE SFO OAKLAND.
3 WITH THE CARES ACT FUNDING THEY DID RECEIVE MONEY FOR MULTIPLE
4 URBANIZED AREAS BUT WE ARE GOING TO TRY TO WORK AS MANY
5 OPERATORS IN AS WE CAN, INTO IT, SO THERE'S NO PRESCRIBED
6 FORMULA OR WHERE THEY DRAW THEIR FUNDS FROM.

7

8 **WALTER WILSON:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** VEDA?

11

12 **VEDA FLOREZ:** I WONDER IF YOU COULD COME BACK TO THE EQUITY AND
13 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE SO WE COULD HAVE SUBSTANTIVE CONVERSATION
14 ABOUT THE EQUITY ISSUES INVOLVED IN THIS. I THINK THAT EQUITY
15 IS A CHOICE, AND WE MUSTY OVERCOME THE PHILOSOPHY OF THIS
16 ATTITUDE THAT WE'LL GET TO IT LATER. SO THIS IS REALLY AN
17 EQUITY ISSUE FOR THE FAIRFIELD, NAPA, AND PETALUMA AREAS. AND
18 I HOPE TO HAVE A CONVERSATION IN THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
19 SUBCOMMITTEE.

20

21 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YEAH, ALL I WOULD SAY TO THAT IS, WE WOULD
22 APPRECIATE SOME TIME TO RUN OUR ANALYSIS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT
23 SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING MIGHT BE NEEDED AND THEN LOOK AT
24 ALTERNATIVES, AND WE'RE HAPPY TO COME BACK AND TALK TO YOU
25 ABOUT THOSE. BUT AS I MENTIONED, WE'RE GOING TO ENDEAVOR AS



January 13, 2021

1 BEST WE CAN TO FILL THOSE FUNDING GAPS AND MAKE SURE NOBODY IS
2 LEFT OUT OF THE DISTRIBUTION.

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THAT WOULD BE GREAT. WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY IN
5 MAY, POSSIBLY JUNE, IF YOU WOULD HAVE A PLAN AT THAT TIME.

6

7 **THERESA ROMMELL:** OH, WE WILL LIKELY HAVE A PLAN IN FEBRUARY.
8 BECAUSE WE'RE WORKING TO PUT THIS MONEY OUT BY MARCH.

9

10 **VEDA FLOREZ:** OH FANTASTIC. SO IF AN OPPORTUNITY PRESENTS
11 ITSELF, YOU HAVE AN INVITATION FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE.

12

13 **THERESA ROMMELL:** NO PROBLEM. THANK YOU.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICK COATES, GO AHEAD.

16

17 **RICK COATES:** I JUST WOULD LIKE TO GET A LITTLE CLARIFICATION.
18 YOU SAID THAT SANTA ROSA IS INCLUDED IN THAT, THE SANTA ROSA
19 AREA, DOES THAT MEAN THAT SMART COULD GET SOME OF THE MONEY?

20

21 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YES, THEY'RE ELIGIBLE IN SANTA ROSA, I
22 BELIEVE. YEAH. IT ALL DEPENDS ON WHAT THEIR NEEDS ARE.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND YOU'RE RIGHT, I DID SWITCH
25 THE AGENDA AROUND TO KEEP YOU, LIKE, RUNNING NON-STOP. SORRY



January 13, 2021

1 ABOUT THAT. SORRY DAVE, I KNOW YOU'RE HANGING THERE. ARE THERE
2 ANY MORE QUESTIONS FROM THE COUNCIL? THERESA, THAT JUST KIND
3 OF REMINDS ME THAT THIS -- WE HAVE A LOT OF NEW MEMBERS HERE
4 WHO HAVEN'T BEEN THROUGH THIS. WE HAVE THOSE THREE FUNDING
5 AREAS, SO, IF YOU COULD SEND MARTI A LINK TO ALLOW US TO
6 ACTUALLY SEE THAT, THE DESCRIPTION OF THE -- HOW THAT BREAKS
7 DOWN INTO THE URBAN AND THE NON-URBAN, THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

8

9 **MARTI PASCHAL:** SURE.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH THEN WE CAN AT LEAST BE BETTER
12 INFORMED.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** OKAY.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WITH THAT, WE WILL CLOSE OUT IN ITEM. IS
17 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT MARTHA?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM
20 AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. MOVING BACK UP TO ITEM
23 NUMBER EIGHT MTC RESOLUTION 4451 AND ABAG RESOLUTION 2021 PLAN
24 FINAL BLUEPRINT PREFERRED ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT
25 ALTERNATIVE. DAVE VAUTIN. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD AFTERNOON I'M



January 13, 2021

1 DAVE VAUTIN WITH MTC ABAG PLANNING TEAM AND I AM JOINED BY
2 LISA ZORN OUR DIRECTOR OF MODELING TEAM. AND WE'LL BE
3 COPRESENTING THE PRESENTATION ON THE PLAN 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT
4 ANALYSIS. I'LL ASK STAFF TO BRING UP THE PRESENTATION. THE
5 RELEASE OF THE PLAN 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS REALLY BUILT
6 ON THREE YEARS WORTH OF WORK FROM THE HORIZON INITIATIVE AND
7 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 EFFORTS THE ANALYSIS SPOTLIGHT OF HOW
8 THE 35 ADOPTED STRATEGIES GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES LED TO THE
9 IMPROVED OUTCOMES COMPARED TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT
10 BLUEPRINT YOU ALL SAW IN JULY. WE'LL WALK YOU THROUGH THE
11 DETAILS ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT PRIOR TO THE COMMISSION AND
12 BOARD TAKING UP THIS ITEM TOWARDS THE END OF THE MONTH. YOU
13 WILL RECALL THAT HORIZON INITIATIVE FOCUSED ON THREE DIVERGENT
14 IMPACTS OF EXTERNAL ECONOMIC TECHNOLOGICAL ENVIRONMENTAL AND
15 POLITICAL FORCES ON THE REGION'S FUTURE. THE STRATEGIES CAME
16 OUT WERE STRESS TESTED OVER A NUMBER OF YEARS AND THAT HELPED
17 US CREATE A PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT THAT'S MORE
18 RESILIENT AND MORE EQUITABLE THAN ANY OTHER LONG RANGE PLAN
19 THAT'S BEEN DEVELOPED IN THE PAST. THE STRATEGIES IN THIS PLAN
20 ARE MORE PREPARED FOR A POST COVID WORLD THAT'S MORE CERTAIN
21 BECAUSE WE HAVE STRESS TESTED THEM UNDER A WIDE RANGE OF
22 FUTURE CONDITIONS. AS WE MOVE INTO THE PROCESS OF 2021 WE ARE
23 READY TO START THINKING ALONG WITH ALL OF YOU ABOUT HOW TO
24 IMPLEMENT THE BOLD FEATURES IN THIS PLAN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
25 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AT ITS CORE WAS DRIVEN BY YEARS OF PUBLIC



January 13, 2021

1 INPUT AS YOU CAN SEE HERE WERE 293 MEETINGS ARE 33,000
2 COMMENTS AND 15,000 PARTICIPANTS TO GET THROUGH THE THREE YEAR
3 PROCESS TO GET TO THE BLUEPRINT WE USED TACT PARTICULATES TO
4 REACH OUT TO LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES AND COMMUNITIES OF COLOR
5 AND TARGETED A DIVERSE AUDIENCE TALKING TO YOUTH, THE UNHOUSED
6 POPULATIONS, NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS AND MORE. NEXT SLIDE. THIS
7 FEEDBACK FED DIRECTLY INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND HELPED
8 REFINE THE 35 EQUITABLE AND RESILIENT STRATEGIES THAT WERE
9 ALIGNED WITH THE ADOPTED VISION FOR THE PLAN TO ENSURE THAT
10 THE BAY AREA IS MORE AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE HEALTHY
11 AND VIBRANT FOR ALL BY 2050 AND ULTIMATELY JUST LIKE THE
12 PUZZLE PIECES ON THE SCREEN THE BLUEPRINT ON THE SCREEN IS A
13 PACKAGE DESIGNED TO ACHIEVE SYNERGIES BETWEEN THE VARIOUS
14 STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. THE 35 STRATEGIES CLUSTER INTO 11 KEY
15 THEMES WHICH YOU PROBABLY RECALL FROM THIS FALL THERE WAS A
16 LOT OF DISCUSSION PRIOR TO THE ADOPTION BY BOTH MTC AND ABAG
17 AND ULTIMATELY THE FINAL BLUEPRINT INCLUDES THE REVISED
18 STRATEGY EN7, WHICH REDUCES AUTO COMMUTE TRIPS BY REQUIRING
19 EMPLOYERS TO FUND INCENTIVES AND DISINCENTIVES TO SHIFT FOLKS
20 TO TELECOMMUTE, WALK, BIKE, AND TAKE TRANSIT. ON THE LEFT SIDE
21 HERE, A BRIEF REFRESHER, THE 11 KEY THEMES FOR TRANSPORTATION
22 FOCUSING ON MAINTAINING AND OPTIMIZING THE EXISTING SYSTEM
23 CREATING HEALTHIER AND SAFE STREETS, AND BUILDING A NEXT
24 GENERATION TRANSIT NETWORK. FOR HOUSING, PROTECTING AND
25 PRESERVING AFFORDABLE HOUSING WHILE SPURRING HOUSING



January 13, 2021

1 PRODUCTION AT ALL INCOME LEVELS, AND WORKING TO CREATE MORE
2 INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES. THE ECONOMY OF THE PLAN STRATEGIES FALL
3 INTO THE CATEGORIES OF IMPROVING ECONOMIC MOBILITY TACKLING
4 INCOME AND EQUALITY AND SHIFTING LOCATION OF JOBS. AND LAST
5 BUT NOT LEAST, THE ENVIRONMENTAL ELEMENT OF THE PLAN INCLUDE
6 STRATEGIES TO REDUCE RISK FROM HAZARDS, EXPAND ACCESS TO PARKS
7 AND OPEN SPACE, AND, OF COURSE, REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS. IN
8 YOUR PACKET TODAY YOU WILL SEE A STRATEGY BRIEF THAT RUNS
9 THROUGHOUT 35 STRATEGIES APPROVED IN THE FALL. NEXT SLIDE
10 PLEASE. THE STRATEGIES HELP ACCOMMODATE THE FORECASTED
11 REGIONAL GROWTH OVER THE NEXT THREE DECADES WHICH TOTALS 1.4
12 MILLION NEW HOUSEHOLDS AND 1.4 MILLION NEW JOBS FOCUS GROWTH
13 AREAS THAT HELP ADVANCE CRITICAL CLIMATE EQUITY GOALS IN
14 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS AS
15 WELL AS REGIONALLY IDENTIFIED AREAS IN PLACES THAT HAVE NOT
16 NOMINATED AREAS FOR GROWTH INCLUDING TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND
17 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS SHOWN ON THE MAP ON THE RIGHT BY FOCUSING
18 GROWTH WITHIN THESE LOCATIONS WITHIN EXISTING URBAN GROWTH
19 BOUNDARIES HELPS TO PROTECT AGRICULTURAL AND NATURAL LANDS
20 FROM DEVELOPMENT WHILE REDUCING HAZARDS THIS GROUP IS
21 ESSENTIAL TO GETTING TO THE STATUTORY GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET
22 THAT THIS PLAN MUST MEET. YOU CAN FIND A MAP OF THE GROWTH
23 GEOGRAPHIES AGAIN THIS WAS ADOPTED IN SEPTEMBER OF 2020 IN
24 YOUR PACKET TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. TO IMPLEMENT PLANNED BAY AREA
25 2050 IT'S GOING TO REQUIRE A BROAD SUITE OF FEDERAL, STATE,



January 13, 2021

1 REGIONAL AND LOCAL MONEYS TOTALING \$1.4 TRILLION, IMPORTANT
2 FOR HOUSING ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENT AND RESILIENCE COMPONENTS OF
3 THE PLAN. THERE IS A BREAK DOWN OF THE STRATEGY COST IN YOUR
4 PACKET ATTACHMENT D, I BELIEVE, AND HOW THOSE INVESTMENTS HAVE
5 BEEN STRUCTURED TO ADVANCE EQUITY BY STRATEGICALLY
6 PRIORITIZING PROJECTS AND FUNDING THAT BENEFIT LOW INCOME
7 HOUSEHOLDS WITHIN EACH OF THE STRATEGIES. WITH THAT CONTEXT ON
8 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT COMPLETE, I'M NOW GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO
9 MY COLLEAGUE LISA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

10

11 **LISA ZORN:** THANK YOU DAVE. HELLO EVERYONE. SO, WE KNOW THAT
12 THE FUTURE OF THE WORLD, AND THE FUTURE OF OURSELF REGION
13 REMAIN QUITE UNCERTAIN AND THAT WAS WHY THE HORIZON INITIATIVE
14 WAS SO ESSENTIAL IT HELPED US UNDERSTAND HOW STRATEGIES FARED
15 IN A WORLD OF ECONOMIC BOOM AND BUST RELATIVE TO
16 TELECOMMUNICATIONS AND RETURN TO STATUS QUO WE WANT TO
17 RECOGNIZE IT'S THE STRATEGIES THAT ARE THE CORE OF THE PLAN
18 AND WHAT WE WILL WORK TO IMPLEMENT IN PARTNERSHIP WITH OTHERS
19 WE HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO MAKE STRATEGIC UPDATES TO THE PLAN
20 SINCE THE EMERGENCE OF THE COVID-19 IN MARCH LAST YEAR NEAR-
21 TERM REVENUE IMPACTS ESPECIALLY FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT WERE
22 INTEGRATED INTO THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE FORECAST PLUS
23 DOUBLE DOWN ON MOST RESILIENT LOW COST STRATEGIES LIKE BIKE
24 PED INVESTMENTS THAT CAN BE QUICKLY AND EFFICIENTLY ADVANCED
25 IN THE NEAR-TERM WE HAD A CHANCE TO RECALIBRATE THE ECONOMIC



January 13, 2021

1 STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WITH ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES
2 EXPLORED IN HORIZON THAT ARE ESSENTIAL IN TIMES OF WEAKER
3 ECONOMIC CONDITIONS. AND WE WORKED WITH THE CALIFORNIA AIR
4 RESOURCES BOARD OR CARB TO ADJUST BASELINE TELECOMMUTE
5 PROJECTIONS FURTHER ACCELERATED TELECOMMUTE ADOPTION THROUGH
6 FLEXIBLE STRATEGIES THAT SHIFT FOLKS OUT OF THEIR CARS AND
7 LASTLY DOUBLED DOWN ON THE RESILIENCE FOCUS OF THE DRAFT
8 BLUEPRINT WITH EXPANDED STRATEGIES FOR NATURAL DISASTERS.
9 BEFORE WE HIGHLIGHT POTENTIAL OUTCOMES ASSOCIATED WITH THE
10 STRATEGIES IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WE WANT TO PROVIDE A QUICK
11 SYNOPSIS OF HOW WE ANALYZED THESE OUTCOMES. PRIMARILY MODELS
12 ECONOMIC IMPACTS BAY AREA URBANISM 2.0 IS USED FOR LAND USE
13 IMPACTS AND TRAVEL MODEL 1.5 USED FOR TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS
14 WE BRING IN EXTERNAL FORCES AND FUTURE REGULATORS AND WE
15 ITERATE BETWEEN THE MODELS TO MAKE SURE POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE
16 FEEDBACK ARE CAPTURED FOR EXAMPLE, NEGATIVE TRANSIT PRODUCT
17 MIGHT INDUCE MORE TRAVEL FOR HOUSING NEAR STATIONS. I'LL TURN
18 IT BACK TO DAVE. >DAVE VAUTIN: GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES HIGHLIGHT
19 MANY OF THE POSITIVE OUTCOMES SPOTLIGHTED IN JULY IN THE DRAFT
20 BLUEPRINT REMAIN IN EFFECT ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT CONTINUING
21 TO FOCUS ON VAST MAJORITY OF NEW GROWTH IN WALKABLE TRANSIT-
22 RICH COMMUNITIES ENABLING SIGNIFICANT SHIFT AWAY FROM AUTO
23 DEPENDENT FOR COMMUTE AND NON-COMMUTE TRIP. IT PROTECTS ALL
24 BAY AREA HOMES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTS HIGH RISK BAY AREA
25 HOMES FROM SEISMIC AND WILDFIRE RISK THROUGH RETROFIT PROGRAMS



January 13, 2021

1 AND FOCUSING ALL THE REGION'S URBAN GROWTH WITHIN PRESENT DAY
2 URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES. IMPORTANTLY THE FINAL BLUEPRINT MAKES
3 FURTHER HEADWAY ON THE FIVE KEY CHALLENGES OF THE DRAFT THAT
4 WERE THE SUBJECT OF EXTENSIVE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT THIS SUMMER
5 INSUFFICIENT AFFORDABLE HOUSING CONTINUED CROWDING
6 DISPLACEMENT RISK JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND STATUTORY
7 REQUIREMENT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS WE MADE HEADWAY
8 ON ALL FIVE CHALLENGES WITH THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE
9 PLEASE. SO LET'S TALK ABOUT THE GROWTH PATTERN THAT THE
10 ADOPTED STRATEGIES WOULD YIELD. YOU WILL SEE TWO GRAPHIC THE
11 ON THE SLIDE HERE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ON THE LEFT RIGHT THE FINAL
12 BLUEPRINT INDICATING THE AMOUNT OF SHARED GROWTH WITH THE SAME
13 REGIONAL TOTAL OF 1.4 MILLION NEW HOUSEHOLDS BETWEEN THE DRAFT
14 AND THE FINAL THERE IS BREAK DOWN OF THE PATTERN ON THE FINAL
15 BLUEPRINT IN YOUR PACKET. LOOKING AT HOUSEHOLDS IN THE FUTURE
16 YOU WILL SEE SIMILARITIES BETWEEN THE DRAFT AND THE FINAL
17 BLUEPRINT THE LARGEST SHARE OF GROWTH CONTINUES TO BE IN THE
18 SOUTH BAY WITH SIMILAR DISTRIBUTION AMONGST THE BIG THREE
19 BAYSIDE AND INLAND COMMUNITIES SIMILAR SHARE OF GROWTH IN OUR
20 GROWTH GEOGRAPHY PLACES FOR FOCUSED GROWTH WITH SIMILAR LEVELS
21 IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS AT A
22 LEVEL GREATER THAN PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 THE KEY DIFFERENCE
23 HERE IS THE FINAL BLUEPRINT HAS A GREATER SHARE OF GROWTH IN
24 THE MOST TRANSIT-RICH PLACES IN THE BAY AREA WHEREAS THE DRAFT
25 ONLY HAD 70 PERCENT OF NEW HOMES IN THESE LOCATIONS THE FINAL



January 13, 2021

1 BLUEPRINT HAS 82 PERCENT OF HOMES SIGNIFICANT MOST TRANSIT-
2 RICH PLACES. IN PART THIS IS DRIVEN BY MORE GROWTH IN THE CITY
3 OF SAN FRANCISCO AS WELL AS NEAR EAST BAY BART STATIONS YOU
4 ALSO SEE LESS GROWTH IN NORTH BAY COUNTY OF SONOMA AND NAPA.
5 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WHAT DROVE SOME OF THESE SHIFTS? WELL
6 EACH COUNTY AND SUBCOUNTY AREA HAS ITS OWN UNIQUE STORY BUT
7 THESE ARE SOME OF THE LARGEST DRIVERS OF THIS CHANGE. ONE OF
8 THE KEY HOUSING STRATEGIES ALLOWING GREATER MIX OF HOUSING
9 DENSITY AND TYPES OF GROWTH AREAS MODIFIED THIS FALL TO FOCUS
10 ON HIGHER SHARE OF GROWTH IN TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH RESOURCE
11 PLACES INCLUDING SAN SIGNIFICATION AND EAST BAY COMMUNITIES
12 SUCH AS LAMORINDA AREA. OFFICE PARK REDEVELOPMENT WAS REVISED
13 AND PUBLIC LAND STRATEGY WAS ADDED. THIS INCLUDED PORTIONS OF
14 SANTA CLARA COUNTY IN THE EAST BAY AND MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT
15 WITH SIZABLE AMOUNT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. FINALLY THE FINAL
16 BLUEPRINT HAS BETTER DATA DUE TO IMPROVEMENTS IN OUR LAND USE
17 INVENTORY WE WORKED CLOSELY WITH JURISDICTIONS TO CONFIRM DATA
18 ON PIPELINE PROJECTS LAND USE AND ZONING AND THE IMPACTS WERE
19 GREATER FOR SOME COUNTIES AND SUBCOUNTIES THAN OTHERS. NEXT
20 SLIDE PLEASE. PIVOTING TO JOBS. WE SEE A SIMILAR STORY TO
21 HOUSING INsofar THAT THERE IS SOMEWHAT LESS JOB GROWTH IN THE
22 SOUTH BAY COMPARED TO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT BUT IT STILL REMAINS
23 THE LARGEST JOB CENTER AND LARGEST LOCATIONS FOR FUTURE GROWTH
24 MORE GROWTH IN SAN FRANCISCO ALAMEDA AND SOLANO COUNTY
25 COMPARED TO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND YOU WILL SEE A BIT LESS



January 13, 2021

1 GROWTH IN THE NORTH BAY OUTSIDE OF SOLANO EVEN A JOB DECLINE
2 IN MARIN COUNTY AS FOLKS AGE OUT OF THE WORKFORCE AND E-
3 COMMERCE CONTINUES TO CHIP AWAY AT RETAIL SECTOR AND
4 EMPLOYMENT. TURNING TO KEY STATS AGAIN AND FOCUS ON GREENHOUSE
5 GAS EMISSIONS YOU WILL NOTE MORE JOB GROWTH IN THE GROWTH
6 GEOGRAPHIES ESPECIALLY IN THE TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND THIS WAS
7 CRITICAL TO MOVE US TOWARD THE STATUTORY CLIMATE TARGET. YOU
8 WILL ALSO NOTICE THERE IS A BIT LESS JOB GROWTH IN HIGH
9 RESOURCE AREAS WHICH ALREADY HAVE A DISPROPORTIONATE AMOUNT OF
10 JOB OPPORTUNITIES NEARBY. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHAT'S LED TO SOME OF
11 THESE CHANGES BETWEEN THE DRAFT AND FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR JOBS?
12 FIRST THE REPLACEMENT OF SOME OF THE FEE BASED STRATEGIES WITH
13 AN INCENTIVE BASED APPROACH TO SHIFT OF THE LOCATION OF JOBS
14 WITH SUCCESS AT SHIFTING A SMALL TO MODERATE NUMBER OF JOBS
15 FROM THE SOUTH BAY TO EAST AND NORTH BAY. YOU WILL SEE THOSE
16 JOBS REFLECTED IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IN SOME CITIES NEAR BART
17 AND COMMUTER RAIL STATION SUCH AS VACAVILLE TRAIN STATION OR
18 BART STATIONS IN THE EAST BAY. YOU WILL SEE SHIFTS WITHIN
19 SANTA CLARA COUNTY AS SOME COUNTIES NO LONGER HAD TO AS FACE
20 FEES TO EXPAND THEIR OFFICE IN JOB RICH LOCATIONS THIS LED TO
21 THAT CHANGE IN TRI-COUNTY DISTRIBUTION. SECOND STRATEGY
22 RELATED TO GREATER COMMERCIAL DENSITIES FOCUSED MORE JOB
23 GROWTH TO TRANSIT BY INCREASING ALLOWABLE DENSITY IN THESE
24 LOCATIONS. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO LISA FOR
25 SOME OF THE KEY FINAL OUTCOMES OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.



January 13, 2021

1

2 **LISA ZORN:** ON THIS SLIDE WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT A HIGH
3 LEVEL OVERVIEW OF EQUITY AND PERFORMANCE OF THE FINAL
4 BLUEPRINT FEATURED IN MUCH GREATER DETAIL IN YOUR PACKET.
5 LET'S START WITH SOME OF THE CRITICAL METRICS WITH OUR REGION
6 AFFORDABILITY MODE SHIFT AND GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS ON THE LEFT
7 PIE CHART TYPICAL BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS SPENDING INCOME IN 2015
8 WITH 33 PERCENT ON HOUSING AND 25 PERCENT ON TRANSPORTATION
9 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MADE CONSIDERABLE HEADWAY WITH NEW HOUSING
10 STRATEGIES AND MEANS BASED TOLLS FOR TRANSPORTATION THIS IS
11 REFLECTED IN THE PIE CHART YOU CAN SEE ADDITIONAL BENEFITS
12 PROVIDED BY EXPANSION OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROTECTION AND
13 PRESERVATION STRATEGIES AND REDUCED SHARE OF HOUSEHOLD INCOME
14 SPENT ON HOUSING AND YOU CAN SEE IMPACTS ON PARKING STRATEGY
15 ON TRANSPORTATION COSTS TICKING UP A FEW POINTS CLOSER TO THE
16 2015 CONDITIONS. HOUSING PLUS TRANSPORTATION COST COMBINED
17 DECLINED FROM 58 PERCENT IN 2015 TO JUST 45 PERCENT IN 2050
18 WITH HOUSING COSTS FORECASTED TO BE LESS THAN TRANSPORTATION
19 COST FOR THE FIRST TIME IN DECADES. AND THERE ARE EVEN MORE
20 GAINS FOR LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS WHICH WE'LL COVER IN A MINUTE.
21 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LET'S PIVOT NOW TO THE COMMUTE MODE SHARES.
22 HOW DOES THE TYPICAL WORKER GO TO WORK. IN 2015 NEARLY THREE
23 QUARTERS OF WORKERS DROVE TO WORK ON A TYPICAL WEEKDAY WITH
24 THE REMAINDER TAKING TELECOMMUTING TRANSIT BIKING OR WALKING.
25 THE DRAFT INTRODUCED HIGHEST PERFORMING TRANSIT INVESTMENTS



January 13, 2021

1 AND INCREASING WALK MODE BIKE SHARES TELECOMMUTING FORECASTED
2 TO INCREASE IN POPULARITY POST PANDEMIC EVEN WITHOUT PUBLIC
3 SECTOR INTERVENTION. EMPLOYER FUNDED COMMUTE REDUCTION
4 PROGRAMS HELPED THE SHIFT AND NEARLY HALF THE POPULATION
5 [INDISCERNIBLE] TO GET TO WORK BY 2050. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO
6 ALL OF THESE MODE SHIFTS AND OTHER STRATEGIES HAVE RESULTED IN
7 US BEING WELL POSITIONED TO ACHIEVE THE STATE-MANDATED
8 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET. AND THIS WAS CERTAINLY NOT A FOREGONE
9 CONCLUSION DUE TO UPDATED ASSUMPTIONS AND FUTURE EXTERNAL
10 FORCES FOR EXAMPLE, PRICE OF GAS GROWING MORE SLOWLY THAN
11 PREVIOUSLY FORECASTED ADOPTING PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 AGAIN
12 RIGHT NOW WOULD ACHIEVE A HANDFUL OF GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION
13 POINTS AS SHOWN ON THE SCREEN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT CLOSED HALF
14 THE GAP TO THE NEWLY INCREASED 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA TARGET
15 FOR PASSENGER VEHICLES BY YEAR 2035 BUT IT WASN'T ENOUGH TO
16 ACHIEVE THIS AMBITIOUS STATE-MANDATED TARGET WITH THE EXPANDED
17 SUITE OF THE 35 STRATEGIES ADOPTED THIS FALL -- OR LAST FALL
18 RATHER WE'RE NOW PROJECTING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT COULD ACHIEVE
19 UP TO 22 PERCENT PER CAPITA REDUCTIONS TOWARDS THE SB 375
20 TARGET WITH EVEN GREATER REAL-WORLD REDUCTIONS IF YOU COUNT
21 STATE AND FEDERAL ACTIONS TO FURTHER IMPROVE EFFICIENCY. THIS
22 MEANS THAT WE'RE GOING INTO A CONSULTATION REVIEW PROCESS WITH
23 CARB THAT MEETS THE TARGET. THE UP TO 22 PERCENT LANGUAGE
24 THERE IS INTENTIONAL BECAUSE CARB CAN REQUIRE MORE ASSUMPTIONS
25 ON THE STRATEGIES CALCULATIONS THAT COULD MOVE US BACKWARDS.



January 13, 2021

1 FOR EXAMPLE, DUE TO THE GOVERNOR EXECUTIVE ORDER TO BAN NON-
2 ELECTRIC VEHICLES IN 2035 CARB HAS ALREADY STARTED CALLING
3 BACK HALF OF THE GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION ASSOCIATED WITH THE
4 STRATEGIES. IT'S IMPORTANT WE MOVE FORWARD WITH A BIT OF SLACK
5 TO MAXIMIZE ODDS OF APPROVAL IN 2021. WHAT STRATEGY
6 IMPROVEMENTS DROVE THE GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION? FUNDING THE
7 ELECTRICAL VEHICLE STRATEGY WAS INCREASED BY FACTOR OF X AND
8 THE STRATEGY DESIGNED TO ACCELERATE THE BAY AREA AND HELPED TO
9 CLOSE A SIZABLE CHUNK OF THE GAP. THE COMMUTE TRIP REDUCTION
10 WITH MAJOR EMPLOYERS HELPED TO SHIFT MORE WORKERS TO
11 TELECOMMUTING AND OTHER ALTERNATIVE MODES AND THIRD EXISTING
12 STRATEGIES WERE REFINED TO ACHIEVE GREATER GREENHOUSE GAS
13 EMISSIONS REDUCTION THE PLANNED USE PATTERN INFLUENCED BY
14 HOUSING AND ECONOMY STRATEGIES IS MORE FOCUSED NEAR TRANSIT
15 AFFORDABLE HOUSING STRATEGIES PROVIDE MORE OPTIONS FOR LOWER
16 INCOME WORKERS TO LIVE CLOSER TO WORK AND THE ALL LANE HIGHWAY
17 TOLLING STRATEGY WAS EXPANDED TO MORE FREEWAY CORRIDORS TO
18 BETTER MANAGE DEMAND AND REDUCE TRAFFIC CONGESTION AND THOSE
19 ASSOCIATED EMISSIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO NOW THAT WE HAVE
20 COVERED SOME OF THOSE KEY METRICS LET'S EXPLORE HOW THE FINAL
21 BLUEPRINT OUTPERFORMS THE DRAFT ON ALL FIVE GUIDING PRINCIPLES
22 AND HOW IT MOVES US TOWARD THE ADOPTED VISION FOR EACH
23 PRINCIPLE WE DEFINED TWO EVALUATION QUESTIONS EARLIER IN THE
24 PLANNED BAY AREA PROCESS TO UNDERSTAND IF THE PLAN WAS MOVING
25 IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION STARTING WITH AFFORDABILITY THE FINAL



January 13, 2021

1 BLUEPRINT IS CERTAINLY MORE AFFORDABLE THAN THE DRAFT. BAY
2 AREA RESIDENTS WOULD SPEND LESS ON HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION,
3 JUST 45 PERCENT COMPARED TO 58 PERCENT IN 2015. AS I HAVE
4 COVERED EARLIER, BUT REDUCTIONS ARE EVEN GREATER FOR LOW
5 INCOME RESIDENTS WHO SPENT A WHOPPING 133 PERCENT ON HOUSING
6 AND TRANSPORTATION IN 2015 AND SHOULD DECLINES TO 58 PERCENT
7 OF INCOME IN 2050 THANKS TO ROBUST AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND
8 MEANS-BASED DISCOUNTS FOR TRANSIT AND TOLLS. WITH REGARDS TO
9 THE SECOND QUESTION, YES, THE BAY AREA WOULD PRODUCE AND
10 PRESERVE MUCH MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
11 STRATEGIES ARE IMPLEMENTED. FOR NEW REGIONAL AND LOCAL REVENUE
12 MEASURES THE REGION COULD ENSURE THAT AT LEAST ONE QUARTER OF
13 ALL BAY AREA HOMES ARE DEED RESTRICTED BY THE YEAR 2050. NEXT
14 SLIDE PLEASE. MOVING ON TO CONNECTIVITY. BAY AREA RESIDENTS BE
15 ABLE TO ACCESS THEIR DESTINATIONS MORE EASILY? THE SHORT
16 ANSWER IS YES, IF YOU ARE USING PUBLIC TRANSIT. STATISTICS ON
17 THE RIGHT HAND SIDE SHOW THAT THE NUMBER OF JOBS ACCESSIBLE BY
18 TRANSIT WOULD MORE THAN DOUBLE BETWEEN 2015 AND 2050 DUE TO
19 COMPACT LAND USE DEVELOPMENT APPEARANCE AND MORE THAN \$100
20 BILLION INVESTMENT TO EXPAND THE REGION'S BUS AND RAIL
21 SYSTEMS. RESIDENTS OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN WOULD CONTINUE TO
22 HAVE BETTER ACCESS TO REGIONAL JOB CENTERS AND TRANSIT THAN
23 THE AVERAGE BAY AREA RESIDENT. A TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM RELY ON
24 MOTORISTS? YES. PROVIDING MUCH MORE RELIABLE TRAVEL TIMES FROM
25 POINT A TO POINT B. FOR TRANSIT RIDERS SELECT SYSTEMS REMAIN



January 13, 2021

1 CROWDED IN 2050 EVEN WITH INCREASES ON MANY RAIL SYSTEMS
2 HAVING BUS LINES AND RAIL SYSTEMS CONSTRUCTED WHILE THIS IS
3 NOT A MAJOR CONCERN TODAY CROWDING IS SOMETHING WE NEED TO
4 KEEP AN EYE ON IN THE DECADES AHEAD. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ALL
5 RIGHT. MOVING NOW TO DIVERSITY. SO THE FIRST QUESTION IS, WILL
6 BAY AREA COMMUNITIES BE MORE INCLUSIVE? THE ANSWER IS YES BUT
7 ONLY TO A LIMITED DEGREE SHOWN IN THE STATISTICS ON THE RIGHT
8 SIDE THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING STRATEGIES AS WELL AS STRATEGY TO
9 PROVIDE MORE ASSISTANCE TO LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES AND
10 COMMUNITIES OF COLOR TO HELP THEM BECOME FIRST TIME HOMEOWNERS
11 DO ENABLE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS TO BECOME MORE DIVERSE OVER TIME
12 GOING FROM 20 PERCENT LOW INCOME RESIDENT IN 2015 TO 24
13 PERCENT IN 2050. THE METHODOLOGY ACCELERATES NEAR-TERM GROWTH
14 IN HIGH RISK AREAS TO STRONGLY AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR
15 HOUSING IN THE EARLY YEARS OF THE PLAN CYCLE. THE SECOND
16 QUESTION IS WILL BAY AREA RESISTS BE ABLE TO STAY IN PLACE?
17 THE ANSWER HERE, IT REALLY DEPENDS ON WHERE THEY LIVE. WE
18 INTEGRATED STRATEGIES TO REDUCE THE RISK OF DISPLACEMENT IN
19 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT SOME ARE STATISTICS SHOWING SHARE OF
20 GROWTH ON THE RIGHT SIDE DUE TO THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
21 DEVELOPMENT IN THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. DISPLACEMENT RISK
22 REMAINS HIGH IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN DATA INDICATES THAT
23 MANY HOUSEHOLDS ARE MOVING TO OTHER CITIES AND GEOGRAPHIES
24 BEING DISPLACED. FURTHERMORE RENTER PROTECTION STRATEGIES ARE
25 NOT FULLY CAPTURED IN OUR MODELING WORK AND THUS DON'T SHOW UP



January 13, 2021

1 IN THE DATA MODELING POINTS ON THE SCREEN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
2 OKAY. ON THE HEALTHY METRICS. SO BAY AREA RESIDENTS WILL BE
3 HEALTHIER AND SAFER AS A RESULT OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
4 STRATEGIES IN ADDITION POINTS EARLIER ABOUT RESILIENCE CLIMATE
5 AND NATURAL LAND USE PROTECTIONS FINAL BLUEPRINT INVEST IN
6 PARKS AND OPEN SPACE EMPHASIS ACHIEVING MORE EQUITABLE
7 OUTCOMES. IN THE RIGHT, SHOWING WEALTHIER COMMUNITIES OR WHITE
8 COMMUNITIES WITH STRATEGIC INVESTMENTS WERE ABLE TO CLOSE --
9 [INDISCERNIBLE] THE ENVIRONMENT OF THE BAY AREA WILL BE
10 HEALTHIER AND SAFER NEW STRATEGIES IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT REDUCE
11 EMISSIONS FROM NON-TRANSPORTATION SECTORS WHILE CREATING
12 MIDDLE WAGE JOBS IN THE PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE AS A QUICK
13 SIDE BAR, AND WE'LL BE SHARING IT A BIT MORE WITH THE ABAG
14 BOARD THIS MONTH ON THE INTEGRATION OF RESILIENCE WHICH WE
15 HAVE HIGHLIGHTED IN PREVIOUS BLUEPRINT PRESENTATIONS WE WANT
16 TO REMIND EVERYONE THAT BOTH THE DRAFT AND FINAL BLUEPRINT
17 INCLUDE A SUITE OF STRATEGIES TO TACKLE WILDFIRE RISK SEA
18 LEVEL RISE SEISMIC AND DRAFT DEFICIENCIES AND MORE. AND FOR
19 THE SAME OF TIME WE'LL REFER YOU TO THE ATTACHMENT IN YOUR
20 PACKET WHICH PROVIDES FURTHER CONTEXT ON THIS IMPORTANT ISSUE.
21 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. CONTINUING ON TO OUR FINAL GUIDING
22 PRINCIPLE WHICH IS ECONOMIC VIBRANCY. FOR THE FIRST QUESTION
23 WILL JOBS AND HOUSING BE MORE BALANCED IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT?
24 THE ANSWER IS ABSOLUTELY. WITH CONTINUED FOCUS ON BAY AREA
25 ESPECIALLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING SHIFTING JOBS TOWARDS EAST BAY



January 13, 2021

1 AND NORTH BAY RAIL STATIONS HAS PAID OFF, SUBREGION STRETCHING
2 FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO SILICON VALLEY IS THE MOST JOB RICH AREA
3 IN THE BAY AREA TODAY WITH THE FINAL BLUEPRINT GOING FROM 1.8
4 JOBS PER HOME IN THAT AREA TO 1.5 JOBS PER HOME FURTHERMORE
5 COMMUTE DISTANCES DECLINE THANKS TO THE LAND USE DEVELOPMENT
6 PATTERN. AND THE FINAL QUESTION IS WILL BE BAY AREA ECONOMY
7 THRIVE? WE BELIEVE THE ANSWER IS YES. DESPITE ALL OF THE
8 CHALLENGES OF 2020 THE REGION IS A POWERHOUSE WITH DIVERSE
9 COMMUNITIES WITH ABUNDANT AND NATURAL AMENITIES. IN THE YEARS
10 AND DECADES AHEAD HELPING US INVEST IN THE REGION WE CALL HOME
11 TACKLING SOME OF ITS BIGGEST CHALLENGES STRATEGIES TO CREATE
12 NEW JOBS AND HELP START BUSINESSES CAN BE A KEY ROLE IN GROWTH
13 SPECIFICALLY IN CRITICAL PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS IN THE
14 YEARS AHEAD. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THAT WRAPS UP OUR FINAL
15 BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES AND GROWTH PATTERNS WE HAVE HELD WEBINARS
16 IN THE PAST THREE WEEKS AND CONTINUE RUNNING WINTER OFFICE
17 HOURS TO CONTINUE ANSWERING QUESTIONS THAT AROSE FROM THIS
18 RELEASE IN DECEMBER. AND MORE INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE IN YOUR
19 PACKET TODAY. AND WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK TO DAVE TO WRAP
20 UP TODAY'S PRESENTATION. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS FOR YOUR
21 PATIENCE WITH THE LENGTHY WALK THROUGH. I WANT TO POINT OUT
22 WHAT'S NEXT IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AFTER THE PROPOSED ACTION
23 BY THE COMMISSION AND BOARD THIS MONTH KEY FOCUS FOR 2021 THIS
24 LAST YEAR THE PLANNING PROCESS WILL BE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE
25 PLAN. WE CONTINUE TO HAVE A STRONG COMMITMENT TO ROBUST PUBLIC



January 13, 2021

1 ENGAGEMENT EVEN THOUGH WE RECOGNIZE THAT IT'S YEAR TWO OF THE
2 PANDEMIC AHEAD AND THAT MORE VIRTUAL ENGAGEMENT WILL BE
3 REQUIRED. THIS WINTER WE'RE GOING TO FOCUS ON GETTING FEEDBACK
4 ON THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WITH SMALL GROUP MEETINGS AND
5 COMMUNITY FOCUS GROUPS TO DISCUSS IMPLEMENTATION IDEAS AND
6 THESE WILL BE DONE IN CONCERT WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
7 ORGANIZATIONS. WE'LL ALSO BE HAVING AN ONLINE AND TEXT BASED
8 SURVEY THAT'S NOW LIVE TO PRIORITIZE STRATEGIES FOR
9 ACCELERATION AS THE TOP IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS OVER THE NEXT
10 FEW YEARS. MOVING INTO THE SPRING WE ANTICIPATE RELEASING THE
11 DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, THE DRAFT PLAN DOCUMENT AND THE
12 DRAFT EIR AND WE'LL HAVE A ROBUST SET OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND
13 INFORMATION EFFORTS FROM VIDEOS, PODCASTS WEBINARS IN MULTIPLE
14 LANGUAGES, VIRTUAL PUBLIC MEETINGS AND DIGITAL WEBINARS WITH
15 PARTNERS TO HELP FOLKS LEARN ABOUT THE DRAFT PLAN POSTCARDS
16 FLYERS COMMENT LINE DIGITAL LANGUAGE PROMOTION AND THE MOST
17 FUN PART DIGITAL SCAVENGER HUNT. WE ARE RECOMMENDING TO THE
18 COMMISSION AND THE BOARD THAT THEY INCLUDE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
19 AS THE PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE FOR THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
20 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT AND IT WILL BE STUDIED AGAINST A
21 NO PROJECT ALTERNATIVE AS TWO OTHER ALTERNATIVE CURRENTLY
22 UNDER DEVELOPMENT SPECIFICALLY ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS. THANKS
23 FOR YOUR PATIENCE WITH TODAY'S PRESENTATION AND LISA AND I ARE
24 HAPPY TO TAKE YOUR QUESTIONS.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE A NUMBER OF HAPPENED
2 ALREADY RAISED. WE'LL START WITH VEDA. GO AHEAD.

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU, DAVE, AND LISA, I APPRECIATE THE
5 PRESENTATION. VERY THOROUGH AND ANSWERED A LOT OF MY
6 QUESTIONS. AND I AM LEFT WITH TWO REMAINING. AND OTHER THAN
7 ZOOM AND TELECONFERENCING, HOW HAVE HEALTH EMERGENCIES, SUCH
8 AS THE CORONAVIRUS BEEN INCORPORATED INTO THE PLAN? >DAVE

9 VAUTIN: I GUESS THERE IS A COUPLE OF THINGS TO POINT OUTER
10 THERE. THIS IS A TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE PLAN SO WE HAVE
11 BEEN THINKING ABOUT THE TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE IMPACTS OF
12 COVID AND AS WE TALKED ABOUT TELECOMMUTING AS ONE OF THOSE KEY
13 IMPACTS THERE ARE ALSO A LOT OF UNKNOWNNS, YOU KNOW,
14 PREFERENCES FOR LIVING IN DIFFERENT TYPES OF HOUSING, THE
15 UNKNOWNNS OF WHETHER PEOPLE WILL RETURN TO WANTING TO SHARE
16 SPACE WITH OTHERS ABOARD TRANSIT AREAS AND THE JURY IS OUT ON
17 WHAT THAT MEANS. STRATEGIES WERE TESTED AGAINST HIGH LEVELS OF
18 TELECOMMUTING HIGH AND LOW LEVELS OF TOLERANCE TO CROWDING WE
19 HAVE TESTED STRESSES AND FORCES THAT COVID BRINGS BUT ALSO THE
20 FACT THAT SINCE WE WON'T KNOW EXACTLY HOW THINGS LAND ON SOME
21 OF THOSE FRONTS WHEN THIS -- BY THE TIME THE PLAN IS ADOPTED
22 WE UPDATE THE PLAN EVERY FOUR YEARS SO THERE WILL BE AN
23 OPPORTUNITY TO CONTINUE TO REFINE THAT IN THE POST COVID
24 WORLD.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **VEDA FLOREZ:** WELL THANK YOU, AND I KNOW THAT WITHOUT LOOK INTO
2 YOUR CRYSTAL BALL, YOU'RE DOING THE BEST THAT YOU CAN. AND
3 FINALLY, I JUST WANTED TO MENTION THAT MANY OF OUR COMMUNITIES
4 OF CONCERN, IN MARIN COUNTY ACTUALLY USE A PROGRAM FOR A
5 HEALTHIER COMMUNITY BY CHECKING OUT A PARK SPACE OR A PERMIT
6 THROUGH THEIR LOCAL LIBRARY. SO THIS IS SORT OF AN OUT-OF-THE-
7 BOX APPROACH TO ALLOWING PEOPLE WHO DON'T -- WHO CAN'T AFFORD
8 IT, TO BE PART OF THE HEALTHIER COMMUNITY AND TO ENJOY OUR
9 BEAUTIFUL OPEN SPACE AND PARKS. SO IF YOU COULD EXPAND THAT
10 PROGRAM THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, I THINK IT WOULD -- COULD BE
11 HELPFUL. AND THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE WALTER UP NEXT, AND
14 THEN RICH HEDGES. GO AHEAD WALTER.

15

16 **WALTER WILSON:** OKAY. THAT WAS A GREAT PRESENTATION, YOU GUYS.
17 IT'S REALLY WONDERFUL. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I HAVE A COUPLE OF
18 QUESTIONS, AND I AM NOT SURE YOU ANSWERED THE QUESTION ABOUT
19 COVID BECAUSE YOU DID SAY THIS REPORT WAS, I THINK, COMPLETED
20 IN SEPTEMBER, WHICH WAS PRECOVID, AND YOU SAID YOU TESTED IT
21 AGAINST EXTREME TELECOMMUTING ON EACH END, BUT I DON'T THINK
22 YOU COULD HAVE ANTICIPATED WHAT'S HAPPENING RIGHT NOW, IN
23 SEPTEMBER. SO, I THINK THAT'S GOING TO HAVE -- IF WHAT I'M
24 SAYING IS FACTUAL IN TERMS OF YOUR TIMING, THE TELECOMMUTING
25 NOW AS IT CURRENTLY SOUNDS, NOBODY APPOINTED THIS. BECAUSE



January 13, 2021

1 LITERALLY EVERYBODY IS AT HOME. PROBABLY 85 PERCENT OF THE
2 PEOPLE. AND SOME OF WHAT'S HAPPENED WITH THE COVID IS BEING --
3 IT'S INFLUENCING PEOPLE, LIKE THE REPORT THAT CAME UP ON
4 TELECOMMUTING FROM THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
5 THAT THE MAYORS IN SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN JOSE GOT UPSET
6 ABOUT, BECAUSE WHAT'S HAPPENING AND THIS IS HAPPENING
7 EVERYWHERE EVEN IN THE COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA THAT HAS 45
8 EMPLOYEES AFTER COVID IS OVER THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE 15,000
9 PEOPLE STAYING HOME FACEBOOK, GOOGLE, EVERYBODY IS DOING THAT.
10 SO I'M GOING GIVE YOU A COUPLE OF QUICK QUESTIONS AROUND THAT
11 BECAUSE THAT'S GOING CHANGE THIS PLAN DRAMATICALLY AND IT'S
12 ALSO GOING CHANGE PEOPLE'S MIGRATION PATTERNS BECAUSE IF YOU
13 CAN WORK IN UTAH AS OPPOSED TO SILICON VALLEY AND GET PAID THE
14 SAME MONEY OR WHEREVER YOU CHOOSE TO THAT'S HAPPENING RIGHT
15 NOW SO I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A MAJOR IMPACT. THE OTHER
16 QUESTION I HAVE IS, YOU TALKED ABOUT THE IMPROVED
17 TRANSPORTATION AND THE COST OF IT, AND I WAS CURIOUS IF YOU
18 INCLUDED BART, HIGH SPEED RAIL, AND OTHERS IN TERMS OF THE
19 GROWTH THAT'S HAPPENING. BECAUSE PART OF WHAT'S HAPPENING WITH
20 HIGH SPEED RAIL, ESPECIALLY, IN RURAL AREAS, IT'S GOING TO BE
21 MASSIVE GROWTH AND MIGRATION AWAY FROM THE URBAN CENTERS AS A
22 RESULT OF THAT. AND THEN -- EXCUSE ME -- THERE IS -- OH, THE
23 HOUSING COST WILL REDUCE -- THIS IS A QUESTION. ARE YOU SAYING
24 HOUSING COST WILL REDUCE AS A RESULT OF INCREASED OVERALL
25 SUPPLY AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING? AND THE OTHER THING THAT'S



January 13, 2021

1 CONSIDERED -- AND I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CONSIDERED THIS IN YOUR
2 PLAN -- IS WHAT'S HAPPENED WITH GENTRIFICATION AND
3 DISPLACEMENT. THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: QUICK RESPONSES TO YOUR
4 QUESTIONS. I KNOW THERE IS A LOT OF QUESTIONS. SO, FIRST ON
5 THE QUESTION ABOUT COVID INTEGRATION. SO IN THIS HORIZON
6 INITIATIVE THAT WE DID, YOU'RE RIGHT, IT WAS DONE BEFORE
7 COVID, BUT WE HAD TEAMS IMAGINE DIFFERENT FUTURES INCLUDING
8 ONE WHERE ALMOST ALL KNOWLEDGE SECTOR WORKERS TELECOMMUTED AND
9 AT THE TIME WE WERE TOLD THAT WAS FANTASY THAT WOULD HAPPEN
10 BUT BY EXPLORING WE LEARNED A FEW THINGS ABOUT WHAT A WORLD
11 WITH HIGHER TELECOMMUTING WOULD LOOK LIKE THAT HELPED US
12 EXPAND THIS PLAN SO THAT HELPED US. WE UPDATED THE REGIONAL
13 GROWTH FORECAST AFTER COVID SO WE IMPLEMENTED ADVERSE IMPACTS
14 COVID IS LIKELY TO HAVE ON OUR ECONOMY AND DEMOGRAPHICS AS A
15 RESULT IN THIS PLAN CYCLE AND A LOT OF THIS IS PLAYING OUT IN
16 REALTIME AND WE DON'T HAVE A PERFECT CRYSTAL BALL THAT'S WHY
17 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THE STRATEGIES ARE ALLOWED CHANGE AND
18 PIVOT IN THE YEARS AHEAD. ON THE TRANSPORTATION COST YES
19 YOU'RE CORRECT YES WE HAVE INCORPORATED HIGH SPEED RAIL AND
20 THE BART EXTENSIONS AND INCLUDED THE REGIONAL FARE REFORM
21 WHICH WOULD INCLUDE AN EQUITABLE SET OF FARES WITH MORE
22 CONSISTENT PRICES AND DISCOUNTS ACROSS THE REGION AND THEN
23 WITH REGARDS TO HOUSING COST, IN ADDITION THE STRATEGIES YOU
24 MENTIONED WE ALSO HAVE STRATEGIES THAT ARE DESIGNED TO REDUCE
25 DISPLACEMENT RISK AS WE NOTED SOME OF THOSE STRATEGIES WERE



January 13, 2021

1 SUCCESSFUL THERE ARE STILL SOME REMAINING CHALLENGES ON THAT
2 FRONT THAT'S AN AREA AS WE MOVE INTO THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN
3 WE WANT TO THINK ABOUT NEAR-TERM ACTIONS TO DO MORE ON.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES, AND THEN ADINA.

6

7 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HI DAVE. [INDISCERNIBLE] ECONOMISTS SAY THAT A
8 DOLLAR WITHIN THE COMMUNITY CIRCULATES ABOUT EIGHT TIMES AND
9 INCREASES ECONOMIC OUTPUT. IN THE '70S WE WENT FROM A
10 PRODUCTION MANUFACTURE EXPORTING COMPANY TO A CONSUMING
11 IMPORTING COUNTRY. AND I'M LOOKING AT THE NUMBERS OF
12 TELECOMMUTERS AND EVEN IF YOU'RE RIGHT IT'S ABOUT A FOUR
13 PERCENT INCREASE OVER A PERIOD OF THE PLAN, AND I THINK IT MAY
14 BE GREATER. IN FACT I'M PRETTY SURE IT MAY BE GREATER. THAT'S
15 GOING TO BE FOCUSING IN AREAS LIKE THE PENINSULA IN SILICON
16 VALLEY AND IT'S GOING TO REDUCE A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF
17 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BECAUSE PEOPLE WHO DON'T LIVE IN THE
18 LOCATION DON'T SPEND IN THE LOCATION. AND WE HAVE TO GENERATE
19 MONEY BEING SPENT IN A VIABLE ECONOMY. AND IN MY OPINION, HOW
20 YOU FEEL ABOUT TELECOMMUTING. >DAVE VAUTIN: I THINK THE
21 SITUATION OF LIKELY IMPACTS WITHIN THE REGION WHERE AREAS THAT
22 WERE JOB CENTERS WHERE COLLECTING THOSE SALES TAX REVENUES
23 FROM WORKERS COMING IN MAY SEE ADVERSE IMPACTS BUT AT THE SAME
24 TIME IF MORE FOLKS ARE WORKING FROM HOME THERE MAY BE MORE
25 MONEY SPENT WITHIN ONE'S COUNTY THEY RESIDE. IF YOU ARE GOING



January 13, 2021

1 FOR A CUP OF COFFEE NOT COMING INTO THE OFFICE YOU WOULD HAVE
2 DONE IT IN SAN FRANCISCO WHEREAS WITH TELECOMMUTING, YOU'RE
3 NOW GOING TO YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD COFFEE SHOP. AND THAT WOULD
4 LEAD TO REVENUE IS BEING GENERATED IN A DIFFERENT COUNTY. SO I
5 THINK WHAT YOU'RE BRINGING UP SPEAKS TO THERE NEEDS TO BE
6 THOUGHT ABOUT REGIONAL REVENUE SHARING. THERE HAS BEEN WHOLE
7 TAX REVENUE STRUCTURE IN THE STATE AND IN OUR REGION IT'S
8 CREATING VERY UNEVEN EFFECTS AND CERTAINLY THE TELECOMMUTING
9 COULD LEAD TO AN IMPACT OF ANOTHER WAY OF SHIFTS THERE.

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** SOMETHING THAT'S BEEN DISCUSSED FOR YEARS NOW
12 IS CHANGING THE WAY CITIES AND COUNTIES ARE FUNDED AND MOVING
13 AWAY FROM [INDISCERNIBLE] AND WOULD BE AN IMPORTANT ISSUE
14 OVERALL. I THINK THE REPORT, THE 2050 PLAN IS GREAT BUT I
15 THINK WE'RE IN THE UNKNOWN SITUATION WHERE IT COMES TO THE
16 ECONOMIC IMPACTS OF TELECOMMUTING, OTHER THAN IT IS GOING TO
17 HAVE A NEGATIVE IMPACT IN SOME COMMUNITIES. THANK YOU VERY
18 MUCH. I REALLY APPRECIATE IT.

19

20 **LISA ZORN:** I WOULD ADD THAT ON THE TELECOMMUTING QUESTION, IN
21 TERMS OF EFFECT ON LAND USE, WE REALLY DIDN'T HAVE MODEL
22 STRONG EFFECTS ON LAND USE AND THAT'S DUE TO A LACK OF DATA
23 RIGHT NOW. I THINK RIGHT NOW THE TELECOMMUTING EFFECT IS
24 STRONGER THAN WHAT WE WOULD SEE IN A POST-COVID WORLD BECAUSE
25 OF SHELTER-IN-PLACE ORDERS. BUT THE OTHER THING IS, I THINK



January 13, 2021

1 RIGHT NOW THERE IS PROBABLY MORE MIGRATION OUT OF THE AREA DUE
2 TO SCHOOLS BEING CLOSED AND CHILD CARE ISSUES AND THOSE THINGS
3 POST-COVID MIGHT RETURN TO NORMAL. SO A LOT OF THE STUFF THAT
4 WE'RE SEEING RIGHT NOW IS PROBABLY MORE EXTREME THAN WE'LL SEE
5 IN THE LONG-TERM AND WE REALLY DONE DIDN'T WANT TO SORT OF
6 REACT TERRIBLY STRONG TO THE THINGS WE'RE SEEING IN THE NEWS
7 AROUND TELECOMMUTING BECAUSE OF SAYING WE THINK THERE MIGHT BE
8 SOME REBOUND AND IT'S TOO SOON TO TELL. SO THIS IS DEFINITELY
9 SOMETHING WHERE WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO CONTINUE LOOKING AT
10 DATA, AS, OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS, AND HOPEFULLY CAPTURE IT IN
11 A MORE COMPLETE AND SORT OF EDUCATED WAY IN THE NEXT PLAN.

12

13 **RICHARD HEDGES:** MY COMMENTS OBVIOUSLY REFLECT WHY WE HAD A
14 NEGATIVE REACTION IN THE BAY AREA COUNCIL AND SOME OF THE
15 MAYORS ON THE 60 PERCENT WE'RE DISCUSSING. ANYWAY, THANK YOU.
16 I DON'T WANT TO TAKE UP ANY MORE OF YOUR TIME.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA AND THEN RICK COATES.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS TO STAFF FOR A REALLY THOROUGH
21 PRESENTATION AND A MIGHTY EFFORT TO COME UP WITH NEW VERSIONS
22 OF THE PLAN THAT REALLY ADDRESS THE PROBLEMS WITH
23 AFFORDABILITY AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND THE ISSUES THAT
24 SHOWED UP IN THE FIRST DRAFT AND COMING UP WITH PLAN THAT
25 ADDRESSED THEM. A COUPLE OF COMMENTS, AND JUST A -- LIKE, WITH



January 13, 2021

1 MY NON-PROFIT HAT O I'M ACTUALLY WORKING WITH SOME OTHER NON-
2 PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS ON SOME COMMENTS AND MAYBE REACHING OUT
3 FOR A CONVERSATION, SHORTLY, WITH THOSE HATS ON, LIKE -- AND A
4 COUPLE OF THOSE THINGS GOING TO THE -- LIKE, GO BACK TO THE
5 CHANGING THE 60 PERCENT TELEWORK MANDATE TO A 60 PERCENT NON-
6 DRIVING WHICH WAS WRITTEN IN TERMS OF LARGE COMPANIES. BUT
7 THERE ARE SOME INNOVATIVE THINGS THAT ARE BEING DONE THAT
8 MIGHT BE ABLE TO BE SCALED THAT ALLOW NON--- SMALLER COMPANIES
9 TO PARTICIPATE AS WELL. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, THE CITY OF PALO ALTO
10 SETUP A TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION THAT HAS
11 PARTICIPATION WITH SMALL BUSINESSES AND LIKE THEY ARE POOLED
12 TOGETHER, AND THIS ORGANIZATION PROVIDES FREE TRANSIT PASSES
13 TO LOW INCOME WORKERS WHO DON'T GET THE SAME KIND OF TRANSIT
14 BENEFITS THAT A LARGE EMPLOYER DOES. AND THEN, JUST NOW LAST
15 WEEK, CALTRANS UPDATED ITS GO PASS DISCOUNT PROGRAM SO THAT
16 UNUSED PASSES CAN BE DONATED TO A NON-PROFIT TO BE USED WITH
17 PEOPLE RECEIVING SOCIAL SERVICES OR POTENTIALLY A
18 TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION SERVING RETAIL WORKERS
19 AND SO ON. SO, I THINK THAT THERE MAY BE SOME INNOVATIVE WAYS
20 OF DEMOCRATIZING THAT IDEA AND BRINGING IT TO THAT ARE WORKING
21 AT SMALL COMPANIES, AND IN PARTICULAR, LOW INCOME WORKERS AT
22 SMALLER COMPANIES. AND ANOTHER THOUGHT ABOUT THAT, IS A, LIKE,
23 ONE WELL-KNOWN THING IS THAT PEOPLE ARE OPEN TO TRANSPORTATION
24 CHANGE BEHAVIOR IS WHEN PEOPLE ARE HAVING LIFE CHANGE, MOVING
25 OR CHANGING A JOB, LIKE PEOPLE GETTING VACCINATING THERE IS



January 13, 2021

1 GOING TO BE VAST POPULATIONS GOING THROUGH AT THE SAME TIME A
2 CHANGE AND I WONDER WHAT OUR REGION AND MTC AND TRANSIT
3 PROVIDERS AND EMPLOYERS CAN DO TO HELP PEOPLE -- YOU KNOW, WHO
4 ARE ALL GOING THROUGH THAT CHANGE TOGETHER AND SEE IF THERE IS
5 OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE TO MAKE SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION
6 CHOICES AT THAT TIME. AND LASTLY I WANT TO CHIME IN, IN THE
7 CRYSTAL BALL ON HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE REMAINING
8 WORKING AT HOME. AND HOW, ON THE ONE HAND, THIS FLEXIBILITY
9 HAS UNCOVERED OPPORTUNITIES BUT THE FLEXIBILITY HAS ALSO
10 UNCOVERED LIKE HOW MANY PEOPLE HAVE BEEN IN A MEETING WHERE A
11 SMALL CHILD HAS CLIMBED OVER THEIR KEYBOARD OR A PET HAS
12 JUMPED ON THEIR KEYBOARD OR YOUR HEARING PEOPLE'S HOUSE MATES
13 TALKING IN THE BACKGROUNDS A LOT OF CHALLENGES THAT GOT
14 SURFACED AND SO -- I STUDY LITERATURE IN COLLEGE, AND REMEMBER
15 SOME CLASSICS OF THINGS THAT WERE WRITTEN DURING THE PLAGUE
16 WHERE THE WRITERS WERE OFF IN A COUNTRYSIDE WHERE THEY SAID
17 I'M WAITING OUT THE PLAGUE IN A HOUSE SOMEWHERE BUT IT'S NOW
18 OVER AND I'M GOING BACK TO THE CITY. I THINK I HEAR LISA
19 SAYING HEY WE CAN'T TOTALLY PREDICT AND NEED TO WAIT. PEOPLE
20 STILL WANT TO HAVE THEIR BIRTHDAY PARTIES IN PERSON AND WE'LL
21 SEE HOW MUCH PEOPLE WANT TO DO THE REST OF THEIR LIVES IN
22 PERSON. THAT'S IT.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICK COATES AND THEN BEN.

25



January 13, 2021

1 **RICK COATES:** I'M ONE OF THOSE FOLKS THAT'S WAITING OUT THE
2 PANDEMIC IN THE COUNTRY. AND I'M NOT GOING BACK. I WANTED TO
3 PLAY OFF OF WALTER'S COMMENTS ABOUT TECH WORKERS MOVING TO
4 IDAHO. I HAVE RELATIVE IN MONTANA. ONE OF THEM SENT ME A
5 POSTCARD THAT SHOWED A PICTURE OF TWO MONTAN ANS POINTING UP
6 AT THE MONTANA BIG SKY WATCHING TWO FLYING SAUCERS, AND THE
7 CAPTION ON IT READS, CALIFORNIANS I SUPPOSE. THEY'RE ALREADY
8 EXPERIENCING THE MIGRATION. AT ANY RATE, I WANTED TO THANK
9 DAVE, IN PARTICULAR, ABOUT HIS WORK HERE. BECAUSE THIS HAS
10 BEEN A HUGE JOB. IT'S COMPLEX, CONVOLUTED, SOMETIMES SELF
11 CONTRADICTORY, VERY DIFFICULT TO UNDERSTAND, AND YET, DAVE,
12 YOU HAVE BEEN SO ARTICULATE AT EXPLAINING THIS THING, THAT I
13 KEEP WONDERING, HOW CAN WE GET YOU A PROMOTION? THERE IS A LOT
14 OF STUFF HERE AT MTC THAT NEEDS YOUR KIND OF SKILL TO EXPLAIN
15 IT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND THANK YOU, TOO, LISA, YOU HAVE DONE
16 A GOOD JOB. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANK YOU, RICK, FOR THOSE VERY
17 KINDS WORDS, AND THERE ARE REALLY, TWO DOZEN FOLKS BEHIND US
18 THAT DO A LOT OF THE HARD WORK SO I WANT TO CONDITIONAL THEM
19 AS -- ACKNOWLEDGE THEM AS WELL. THEY HAVE BEEN WORKING UNDER
20 VERY DIFFICULT CIRCUMSTANCES.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** BEN.

23

24 **BENJAMIN SCHWENG:** I HAVE TWO OVERALL COMMENTS ONE IS CONCERN
25 ABOUT THE OUTREACH FOR PLANNED BAY AREA, THAT EVEN THOUGH



January 13, 2021

1 THERE IS TUFF THAT'S GOING ONLINE, THAT THE DEMOGRAPHICS OF
2 THE PEOPLE WHO ARE COMMENTING NOW MAY NOT BE THE SAME PEOPLE
3 WHO HAD COMMENTED IN YEARS PRIOR, WITH ACCESS TO TECHNOLOGY
4 AND OTHER OUTREACH EFFORTS EVEN THOUGH WE MAY BE GETTING
5 SIMILARLY SLIGHTLY LOWER VOLUME BUT THE THINK THE DEMOGRAPHICS
6 ARE GOING TO BE DIFFERENT AND I THINK WE'RE LOSINGS OUT SOME
7 OF THE PEOPLE WHO MIGHT SHOW UP TO AN EVENT BUT DON'T HAVE
8 THAT TECHNOLOGY ACCESS OR ARE JUST OVERWHELMED DUE TO THE
9 PANDEMIC BECAUSE THEY'RE TAKING CARE OF THEIR KIDS. MY OTHER
10 COMMENT AROUND BAY AREA HOUSING PRODUCTION WHICH SEEMED GREAT,
11 BUT I THINK THAT -- I HAVE SOME CONCERNS ABOUT WORK-FROM-HOME.
12 WHILE WORKING FROM HOME DEFINITELY HELPS WITH GREENHOUSE
13 GASSES, I THINK -- AND I'M WONDERING IF YOUR MODELS ACCOUNT
14 FOR THE LOSS OF HOUSING UNITS DUE TO WORK-FROM-HOME. LIKE I
15 HAVE GOT A HOUSING UNIT, I GOT A RENTAL UNIT THAT IS VACATED
16 BECAUSE THE SAME TWO PEOPLE ARE MOVING TO A THREE BEDROOM,
17 FROM A TWO BEDROOM, BUT BECAUSE OF WORK-FROM-HOME. AND I AM
18 SEEING THAT ALL OF THE MOVEMENT IN THE BAY AREA, FROM CITY TO
19 CITY, IS PEOPLE -- IS BECAUSE PEOPLE NEED AN EXTRA BEDROOM AS
20 A HOME OFFICE AND THESE ARE LARGER TECH WORKERS THAT CAN WORK
21 AT HOME LONG-TERM. BUT AS WE COUNT OUR HOUSING UNITS OR
22 BEDROOM UNITS A LOT OF THOSE BEDROOM UNITS THAT WE HAVE NOW
23 ARE BECOMING OFFICES AND WILL NOT BE HOUSING PEOPLE. >DAVE
24 VAUTIN: SO BEN, GREAT POINTS THERE I'LL START WITH THE PUBLIC
25 ENGAGEMENT ONE THIS IS WHY WE DON'T JUST DO ZOOM MEETINGS AND



January 13, 2021

1 SUCH FOR OUR ENGAGEMENT, FOR OUR ENGAGEMENT RIGHT AT THE
2 MOMENT, YES WE HAVE AN ONLINE SURVEY BUT WE ALSO HAVE A SORRY
3 HAVE A WHERE YOU CAN USE A NON-SMART PHONE TO TEXT BACK AND
4 FORTH TO OUR TEAM WITH YOUR FEEDBACK ON THE PLAN, AND IT WILL
5 ASK YOU QUESTIONS ABOUT THE IMPLEMENTATION PRIORITIES TO HELP
6 FOLKS, WHO, AGAIN, MAYBE DON'T HAVE INTERNET ACCESS OR A SMART
7 PHONE. SIMILARLY WITH OUR COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION
8 ENGAGEMENT, YOU KNOW, DOING CONFERENCE CALLS OR ZOOM MEETINGS
9 DEPENDING ON THE TECHNOLOGY PREFERENCE OF THAT ORGANIZATION
10 WORKING WITH COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN SO WE DO HAVE ENGAGEMENT
11 AND WE ARE GOING TO START VENTURING BACK OUT THERE IN THE
12 WORLD WITH OUR SCAVENGER HUNT, DIPPING OUR TOW INTO THE WATER
13 IN A WORLD OF IN-PERSON ENGAGEMENT AS WE GO INTO 2022. I WOULD
14 POINT OUT THE EXTREME SCENARIO OF SHELTER-IN-PLACE SO THE
15 TELECOMMUTE LEVELS ARE OFF THE CHARTS. YOU KNOW, WHAT WE
16 EXPECT COMING OUT OF THIS IS SOMEWHERE IN THE MIDDLE WE'RE NOT
17 GOING TO GO BACK TO SIX PERCENT OF PEOPLE WORKING FROM HOME
18 BUT WE EXPECT TO SEE A SIZABLE NUMBER OF FOLKS CHOOSING TO DO
19 THAT. THIS IS WHY THE PLAN HAS STRATEGIES TO CREATE MORE
20 HOUSING AT A GREATER RATE THAN POPULATION GROWTH BECAUSE WE
21 WANT TO HAVE UNITS THAT AREN'T SQUEEZING PEOPLE IN AND MAKING
22 THEM FEEL LIKE THEY DON'T HAVE THAT SPACE TO WORK-FROM-HOME.
23 AND, YOU KNOW, THAT'S PART OF THE GOALS OF THE PLAN IS TO
24 PRODUCE THOSE 1.4 MILLION UNITS SO PEOPLE HAVE AN ADEQUATE
25 AMOUNT OF SPACE FOR THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO LIVE IN THEIR



January 13, 2021

1 HOUSEHOLD BUT AGAIN THIS IS ONE OF THOSE THINGS WHERE THERE IS
2 SO MUCH UNCERTAINTY AND THIS IS WHERE WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO
3 WATCH THOSE LAND USE DECISION MAKING TRENDS AND HOW WE COME
4 OUT OF IT.

5

6 **BENJAMIN SCHWENG:** WITH THE LAND USE ISSUES AND YOU'RE SEEING
7 DEVELOPERS IN OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY AND CERTAINLY HERE AS
8 WELL ENGAGE AND ARE CREATING MORE SPACES THAT, IN THE HOME
9 THAT, YOU KNOW, BECAUSE OF PARKING RESTRICTIONS OR WHAT NOT,
10 THEY'RE TRYING TO NOT MAKE THESE BEDROOMS BECAUSE THEY'RE FOR
11 OFFICE ONLY GYMS OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE
12 WANTING MORE SPACE AND AS THAT SORT OF SHIFT IN THE BAY AREA
13 HOW THAT AFFECTS THE NUMBER OF UNITS THAT WE CAN CREATE WHEN
14 EVERYONE NEEDS JUSTICE A LITTLE MORE SPACE AT HOME. --

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** MICHAEL LOPEZ THEN CARLOS. THANK YOU FOR
17 A REALLY GOOD PRESENTATION, WELL DOCUMENTED AND EVERYTHING.
18 AND OF COURSE, THE THINGS YOU BROUGHT UP FIRST WERE THE
19 HOUSEHOLD GROWTH AND THE JOB GROWTH.

20

21 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** AND I WAS JUST WONDERING, ALL OF THIS IS VERY
22 LOGICAL AND MAKES A LOT OF SENSE, BUT WAS THERE EVER -- OR
23 MAYBE THERE S SOME EVALUATION. IMPACTS OF THE RESOURCES THAT
24 JOBS AND HOUSEHOLD INCREASES WOULD CAUSE. I MEAN, THE ONE
25 THING THAT COMES TO MIND IS, IS THERE GOING TO BE ENOUGH



January 13, 2021

1 WATER? BECAUSE NEW HOUSES, MORE PEOPLE. MORE HOUSEHOLDS, IS
2 THE NEED FOR MORE WATER. IS THAT EVALUATED SOMEWHERE? >DAVE
3 VAUTIN: YES. SO WE HAVE DONE EVALUATIONS ON WATER BOTH ON THE
4 HORIZON EFFORT WHERE WE HAVE ENGAGED WITH WATER DISTRICTS AND
5 IN THE EIR WHICH HAS A WHOLE CHAPTER ON WATER SO WE'LL HAVE
6 MORE TO SHARE ON WATER TOPICS AS WE GO THROUGH THE YEAR. BUT I
7 THINK A POINT FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PLAN IS THE FOOTPRINT
8 OF GROWTH DEVELOPMENT IS LIMITED AND THE BIGGEST WATER DEMAND
9 SOURCE FOR MOST HOMES IS THE LAWN. RIGHT. AND SO THE UNITS
10 THAT ARE BEING BUILT IN THIS PLAN ARE OFTEN MORE COMPACT THEY
11 DON'T NECESSARILY HAVE THAT GRASS THAT NEEDS TO BE WATERED AND
12 MAINTAINED. AND SO THROUGH EFFICIENCY STRATEGIES, WITH
13 EXISTING UNITS, AND ALSO BUILDING MORE SMARTLY GOING FORWARD
14 WE CAN ACCOMMODATE THAT GROWTH AND WORK WITHIN OUR WATER
15 RESOURCES.

16

17 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** GREAT. THANK YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CARLOS AND THEN RAHMON.

20

21 CARLOS CASTELLANOS THANK YOU DAVE. I WANTED TO COMMENT ON THE
22 SLIDE THAT TALKED ABOUT HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS AND DIVERSITY.
23 I AM NOT QUESTIONING -- I THINK THAT WE DEFINITELY -- I THINK
24 EVERYTHING THAT'S GONE INTO THE PLAN WILL BE HELPFUL. I JUST
25 WANTED TO BRING UP THAT SOME OF THE FACTORS THAT WE'RE SEEING



January 13, 2021

1 RIGHT NOW, IN DEVELOPING AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND IN
2 DIVERSIFYING THESE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS, YOU KNOW, THAT ARE
3 HOPEFULLY, IN A 30 YEAR SPAN, YOU WILL SEE CHANGES, BUT THERE
4 IS STILL LOCAL OPPOSITION IN TERMS OF BOTH, JUST WITH THE
5 NEIGHBORHOOD, AS WELL AS, SOMETIMES EVEN LOCAL OFFICIALS. YOU
6 KNOW, TOWARDS HAVING MORE HIGHER DENSITY HOUSING. AND THEN THE
7 OTHER THING I WOULD MENTION WHICH WAS BROUGHT UP EARLIER AND I
8 WOULD ALSO LINK IT WITH THIS, IS HOW THESE AREAS IN THE
9 SILICON VALLEY OR SOUTH BAY PENINSULA WHERE YOU MAY SEE A
10 DECLINE IN ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, THAT'S KIND OF -- SOMETIMES,
11 SOME OF THOSE CITIES USE THOSE, THAT'S THEIR ENGINE FOR
12 CREATING LOCAL AFFORDABLE FUNDS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING FUNDS
13 THROUGH THEIR IMPACT FEES. SO THAT SAME DYNAMIC OF KIND OF
14 DISPERSION OF COMMITMENT DEVELOPMENT FROM THESE ECONOMIC
15 ENGINES COULD MAKE IT MORE DIFFICULT FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO
16 GET BUILT IN THOSE AREAS. SO I THINK FROM MY COMMENT TO
17 EVERYONE TOO, AND TO THE STAFF, IS, YOU KNOW, HOPEFULLY YOU
18 CAN COME UP WITH MESSAGES THAT REALLY MAKE IT CLEAR HOW
19 IMPORTANT IT IS THAT WE HAVE THIS -- AND YOU ARE ALREADY --
20 JUST TO CONTINUE TO REACH OUT AND MESSAGE TO THE COMMUNITIES
21 OF THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING THE DIVERSE NEIGHBORHOOD AND OF
22 HAVING, YOU KNOW, TO HAVE A WORKFORCE THAT CAN SERVICE THESE -
23 - THE JOBS THAT WILL BE THERE, BECAUSE THERE STILL WILL BE
24 JOBS AND MAYBE A LITTLE MORE DISPERSION OF THE TECH WORK WHY
25 YOU'RE GOING TO NEED TO HAVE THESE JOBS AND A RICH DIVERSE



January 13, 2021

1 NEIGHBORHOOD AND I WANT TO BRING IT UP HOPEFULLY WE CAN
2 ACHIEVE THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RAHMON?

5

6 **RAHMON MOMOH:** I WANT TO ECHO, I THINK RICK MENTIONED THE GREAT
7 JOB DAVE HAVE DONE, I REMEMBER WHEN I STARTED AS A MEMBER, I
8 SAW HIS PRESENTATION, AND I WAS BLOWN AWAY, SO ANY TIME YOU
9 MAKE A PRESENTATION AND CLARIFICATION I'M ALWAYS WRITING DOWN
10 YOU WOULD MAKE A GOOD PROFESSOR SO THINK OF TEACHING. I AM A
11 RELATIVELY NEW MEMBER BUT NO LONGER NEW, I HAVE BEEN ON THE
12 BOARD THREE YEARS NOW, SO HOW FREQUENT DO YOU UPDATE YOUR
13 DATA? BECAUSE THIS IS FOR 2050, AND OF COURSE, 2050 IS
14 ETERNITY, JUST LIKE 9/11, I DON'T THINK WE WILL BE BACK TO THE
15 WAY WE USED TO BE AFTER THE COVID LOCKDOWN. I KNOW THAT, WHERE
16 MY SON WORKS THEY TOLD HIM NOBODY'S COMING BACK TO WORK SO
17 EVERYBODY IS GOING TO BE PERMANENTLY -- SO THOSE WILL BE, YOU
18 KNOW, TELECOMMUTING, OF COURSE YOU HAVE TO LOOK AT IT AS A
19 TREND, YOU ARE THE METRO TRANSPORTATION, BUT I KNOW THE STATE
20 OF CALIFORNIA IS NEGOTIATING WITH THE UNION RIGHT NOW WHERE BY
21 A MINIMUM OF 25 PERCENT OF THE WORKERS WOULD NOT GO BACK TO
22 WORK BECAUSE THEY HAVE SEEN THE SAVINGS, TREMENDOUS SAVINGS.
23 SO THE QUESTION IS HOW OFTEN DO YOU UPDATE YOUR 2050 REPORT?
24 AND, TWO, IN TERMS OF TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES, WE ALL READ
25 THE SAN FRANCISCO CHRONICLE REPORT ON ONE OF OUR MEMBERS, I



January 13, 2021

1 WAS REALLY MOVED BY THAT. BECAUSE I TRIED TO GO TO MY TEENAGE
2 -- ONE TIME, AND IT TOOK ME LIKE THREE HOURS MY TEENAGER LIVES
3 NEAR ME, SO I THINK THE INTEGRATION OF REGIONAL AGENCY SHOULD
4 BE ONE, [INDISCERNIBLE] IS TOO MUCH. I I'M NOT SURE HOW YOU
5 ADDRESS THAT. FINALLY WHEN I STARTED AS A NEWCOMER, I DIDN'T
6 SAY MUCH, I WAITED FOR RAND TOW TEACH ME WHAT TO SAY. I FIGURE
7 THAT WOULD BE DROPPED AS PART OF THESE STRATEGIES BUT IT SEEMS
8 TO BE COMING BACK AND THEN WE SLAP IT BACK AND IT COMES BACK
9 SO I'M NOT SURE WHY WE KEEP BRINGING BACK [INDISCERNIBLE]
10 ESPECIALLY WITH THE IMPACT ON LOW INCOME. DISADVANTAGED
11 COMMUNITIES. SO, I MEAN, A LOT OF COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS. BUT,
12 AGAIN, DAVE, THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND I ENJOY LISTENING TO
13 YOU. THANK YOU SIR. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANK YOU FOR YOUR QUESTIONS
14 RAHMON, I CAN PROVIDE SOME QUICK ANSWERS IT LOOKS LIKE RANDI,
15 YOU MAY WISH TO -- IS IT OKAY IF I PROVIDE ANSWERS.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I WANT TO REMIND EVERYBODY WE'RE ON A
18 TIGHT DEADLINE. NOT TIGHT, BUT WE'RE GETTING THERE. GO AHEAD.
19 >DAVE VAUTIN: WE UPDATE THE PLAN EVERY FOUR YEARS, IT'S BEEN A
20 MAJOR UPDATE TO OUR LONG RANGE PLAN WE ANTICIPATE THE NEXT ONE
21 WILL BE MORE MODERATE BUT IT WILL HAVE A LOT OF GOOD POST-
22 COVID DATA TO INFORM UPDATES TO THE PLAN SO WE ANTICIPATED
23 DOING THAT WORK STARTING IN 2023. WITH REGARDS TO INTEGRATION
24 OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, THERE ARE STRATEGIES. WE DIDN'T
25 SPEND TIME ON THEM TODAY BUT IN TERMS OF INTEGRATING ALL THE



January 13, 2021

1 FARES REQUIRING SEAMLESS CONNECTIONS BETWEEN THE DIFFERENT
2 COMMISSIONS ADOPTED BY THE BOARD, THIS IS AN ADMINISTRATIVE
3 DECISION WITH THE MERGE AND IS BEING DISCUSSED. --
4 [INDISCERNIBLE] IN REGARDS TO THE TOLLING WE HAVE HAD CONCERNS
5 ON THAT THE FIRST TIME WE BROUGHT IT TO YOU IT WAS I CAN'T
6 TOLL PER MILE, AND IT HAD EQUITY IMPACT AND WE WENT BACK AND
7 RECRAFTED THAT WHOLE STRATEGY INTO A MEANS-BASED COMPONENT AND
8 YOU WILL SEE THE IMPACTS OF THE STRATEGY ARE MUCH GREATER ON
9 HIGH INCOME HOUSEHOLDS THROUGH THE MEANS-BASED STRATEGY WE'RE
10 ABLE TO BRING DOWN THOSE IMPACTS FOR LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND
11 USE THOSE MONEYS TO BENEFIT LOW INCOME AND COMMUNITIES OF
12 COLOR SO WE BELIEVE WITH ALL THOSE CHANGES THE STRATEGY IS
13 NEUTRAL OR POSITIVE FOR EQUITY IN THE WAY IT'S BEEN UPDATED
14 HERE AND AT THE END OF THE DAY THAT STRATEGY WAS ONE OF THE
15 MOST POWERFUL ARROWS IN OUR QUIVER SO TO SPEAK TO GET TO THAT
16 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET, WITHOUT THAT IT WOULD HAVE FAILED AND
17 WE WOULD HAVE STARTED LOSING TRANSPORTATION MONEY LATER THIS
18 YEAR.

19

20 **RAHMON MOMOH:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

21

22 **LISA ZORN:** I WOULD ADD ANOTHER QUICK POINT ON THE DATA
23 COLLECTION ISSUE WHICH IS THAT OUR MODELS ARE ONLY AS GOOD AS
24 THE DATA THAT'S BEHIND THEM AND IN THE PAST WE HAVE CALIBRATED
25 AND ESTIMATED OUR MODELS BASED ON HOUSEHOLD TRAVEL DIARIES



January 13, 2021

1 SURVEYS WHICH HAVE BEEN TRADITIONALLY MAYBE ONCE EVERY TEN
2 YEARS WE REALIZE NOW THAT IS INFREQUENT GIVEN THE CHANGING
3 LANDSCAPE OF ALL THE THINGS WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT TODAY WE
4 ARE TRYING TO MOVE TOWARD A CONTINUOUS SERVING METHODOLOGY
5 WHICH INCLUDES A SMALLER EFFORT BUT MUCH MORE FREQUENT LIKE
6 ANNUALLY OR EVERY OTHER YEAR SO WE CAN SORT OF GET AT THE
7 TRAVEL BEHAVIORS AND THE CHANGING TRAVEL BEHAVIORAL LANDSCAPE
8 WE'RE SEEING RIGHT NOW BASED ON THE PANDEMIC AND PEOPLE'S
9 CHANGES AND PREFERENCES FOR TRAVELING BASED ON THE PANDEMIC
10 AND TELECOMMUTE PREFERENCES THAT ARE CHANGING IN THE AFTERMATH
11 OF THE PANDEMIC SO THIS'S THE APPROACH TO TRYING TO BE MORE
12 RESPONSIVE TO THESE KINDS OF ISSUES.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CYNTHIA?

15

16 **CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU RANDI. SO A COUPLE OF
17 COMMENTS. ONE ON THE POPULATION GROWTH IN THE NORTH BAY THAT
18 LOOKS SO LOW. WE'RE, I THINK, ONE OF THE ONLY COUNTIES IN THE
19 STATE THAT HAVE LOST POPULATION RIGHT NOW. SO WE'RE NOT
20 GROWING OLD, WE'RE ACTUALLY LOSING POPULATION, AND THAT'S TIED
21 INTO THE HIGH HOUSING COST. SO I THINK THAT THERE NEEDS TO BE
22 SOME ABILITY TO REALLY UNDERSTAND THAT IF WE CAN'T FIX THE
23 HOUSING, WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO HAVE A LOSS OF POPULATION,
24 ESPECIALLY SINCE MORE PEOPLE DON'T HAVE TO LIVE HERE TO WORK
25 HERE. AND I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU BUILD THAT INTO YOUR MODELS,



January 13, 2021

1 BUT I FEEL LIKE IT'S NOT IN THERE NOW AND IT NEEDS TO BE
2 ADDRESSED. THE OTHER IS, I JUSTICE DON'T SEE, IN THE TRAFFIC
3 PROJECTIONS, TRANSPORTATION AS A SERVICE OR MOBILITY AS A
4 SERVICE, YOU KNOW, THEY SAY THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE NOT OWNING
5 VEHICLES IN THE NEXT 20 YEARS, DEFINITELY I WOULD SAY BY 2050,
6 AND THAT WE'LL JUST USE, YOU KNOW, DOOR-TO-DOOR SERVICE
7 THROUGH ELECTRIC VEHICLES THAT, NOT ONLY WILL CHANGE TRAFFIC,
8 BUT ALSO REDUCE COST FOR PEOPLE, WE'LL SAVE SOMETHING LIKE, IF
9 IT COST \$9,000 A YEAR TO HAVE A CAR NOW, WE'LL PAY \$3,000 A
10 YEAR TO USE MOBILITY AS A SERVICE AND IT WILL BE MORE
11 EQUITABLE AND CLEANER AND LESS TRAFFIC. SO I DON'T SEE THAT IN
12 THERE AND I'M NOT SURE HOW YOU CANNOT ADDRESS IT WHEN THERE IS
13 SO MUCH RESEARCH NOW THAT SHOWS THAT. IT DOES FEEL LIKE THE
14 WHOLE IMPACT OF DISASTERS IS REALLY BEING SHORT SCHIFTED AGAIN
15 IN THE NORTH BAY WE'RE ALSO SEEING PEOPLE LEAVING BECAUSE THEY
16 CAN'T TAKE THE CONSTANT THREAT OF POWER, THE OCCURRENCE OF
17 FIRE POWER SHUT OFF IMPACT OF SMOKE THAT'S A YEARLY EVENT NOW
18 NOT A RARE EVENT, AND I THINK WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND IT'S NOT
19 JUST THE NORTH BAY BUT SO MUCH OF THAT IS GOING TO PLAY OUT
20 AND THEN SEA LEVEL RISE, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE THE POSTER CHILD
21 FOR SEA LEVEL RISE AT HIGHWAY 37. I DON'T FEEL LIKE THAT'S
22 REALLY UNDERSTOOD, OR REALLY FULLY CAPTURED IN THE PLAN. AND
23 THEN, THE WHOLE MESS WITH MUNICIPAL FINANCE AND THE TAX
24 REFORM, THE FACT THAT WE'RE IN A POST CONSUMER SOCIETY AND
25 SALES TAXES AREN'T GOING TO CONTINUE TO GENERATE WHAT THEY



January 13, 2021

1 USED TO, AND THE IDEA THAT WE PLANNED ALL THESE PROGRAMS AND
2 PROJECTS WITHOUT A FUNDING SOURCE IS REALLY CONCERNING TO ME
3 BECAUSE IT'S A LOT LIKE WHAT WE DO ON OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS
4 BECAUSE WE MAKE EVERYBODY PLAN FOR HOUSING AND IT NEVER GETS
5 BUILT BECAUSE THE BARRIERS TO DOING IT AREN'T REMOVED. SO IT'S
6 NICE TO HAVE A PLAN BUT IF IT CAN'T BE IMPLEMENTED THEN IT'S
7 NOT REALLY WORTH MUCH. THANK YOU.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MICHAEL BALDINI.

10

11 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES THANK YOU LISA AND DAVE. ONE OF THE
12 CONCERNS I HAVE, THAT WAS TOUCHED UPON RIGHT NOW BY CYNTHIA
13 AND ALSO BY RICHARD IS I WOULD LIKE TO SEE A SLIDE OR TWO, IN
14 A SIMPLIFIED MANNER, FLOW CHARTING THAT DOLLAR, WHERE THOSE
15 MONEYS ARE PLANNED TO COME FROM, WHERE THEY'RE GOING, AND WHAT
16 THE FUTURE REVENUE STREAM IS -- WHAT'S IT LOOK LIKE, JUST
17 ELABORATE ON THAT. THANK YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA?

20

21 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET'S SEE IF I CAN
22 MAKE THIS WORK. YES. I JUST REALLY WANTED TO SAY THANK YOU.
23 STAFF HAS BEEN INCREDIBLY RESPONSIVE TO FEEDBACK FROM THIS
24 BODY AND IN PARTICULAR IN THE FEET -- FEE PER MILE
25 RESTRUCTURING AS SOMEONE WHO HAS LOUD ABOUT EQUITY ISSUES IN



January 13, 2021

1 THAT PARTICULAR STRATEGY, THEY SPENT A LONG TIME AND BROUGHT
2 STAFF TOGETHER TO HAVE A PRIVATE MEETING WITH ME, AND HAVE
3 DONE AN EXCEPTIONAL JOB OF ADDRESSING THE CONCERNS THAT WE
4 BROUGHT FORTH AT LEAST IN THIS MODEL. SO I JUST WANT TO REALLY
5 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. AM IT'S REALLY IMPRESSIVE. THEN ASK ABOUT
6 THE, YOU KNOW, THE MODELS ONLY BEING AS GOOD AS THE DATA IS A
7 REALLY GOOD POINT TO ADD, AND SO JUST ASK ABOUT STEPS THAT
8 WILL BE IN PLACE TO MONITOR ACTUAL IMPACTS SO THAT WE HAVE THE
9 OPPORTUNITY TO ADJUST FOR REAL LIFE, BECAUSE OUR MODELS WILL
10 BE WRONG IN SOME WAYS, SO I JUST WANTED TO ASK ABOUT THAT.
11 >DAVE VAUTIN: ANNE OLIVIA GREAT QUESTION. I WANT TO NOTE ON
12 THE PRICING STRATEGY JUST BECAUSE THAT PLAN IS APPROVED
13 DISAPPOINT MEAN THAT STRATEGY IS MOVING FORWARD IN THE NEXT
14 YEAR OR TWO. KEY STEP IN THAT IS DOING A DETAILED STUDY
15 GETTING BETTER DATA ON THOSE IMPACTS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW
16 THAT SORT OF STRATEGY COULD BE PHASED, HOW WE OVERCOME THE
17 CONCERNS FROM DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION, SUBURBAN AND
18 RURAL AREAS THAT MIGHT BE MORE IN OPPOSITION TO THAT STRATEGY.
19 THERE IS GOING TO BE SIGNIFICANT COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND
20 PLANNING WORK THAT WE ARE SEEKING STATE MONEYS TO ADVANCE OVER
21 THE NEXT TWO YEARS. BUT CERTAINLY IF ANY CORRIDORS ARE
22 IMPLEMENTED IN THE NEXT FOUR YEARS OR EVEN OVER THE NEXT
23 DECADE THERE WOULD NEED TO BE THAT MONITORING IN REAL LIFE TO
24 ENSURE -- AND WE CERTAINLY AGREE THAT WOULD BE A TOP PRIORITY.
25



January 13, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HAVE TERRY SCOTT THEN
2 WALTER. AND I AM GOING TO ADVISE YOU ALL THAT THESE FOLKS CAN
3 COME BACK AND TALK TO US BUT I'M HEARING A LOT OF THINGS THAT
4 NEED TO BE BROUGHT BACK WITH SOME MORE CLARIFICATION. TERRY,
5 GO AHEAD.

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. MY COMMENTS RELATE TO THE DATA THAT WE
8 HAVE AS WELL AS THE MODELS. THE ONLY CONSTANT IN LIFE AND IN
9 THIS PLAN, IF YOU WILL, IS CHANGE. AND IT'S CHANGING RATHER
10 RAPIDLY. WE, TOO, AT INA, HAVE EXPERIENCED A REDUCTION IN
11 OCCUPANCY AND RESIDENTS HERE IN THE LAST YEAR OR SO. AND
12 THAT'S GOING TO CONTINUE TO CHANGE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW,
13 WHAT -- HOW ARE YOU GOING TO MODEL? AND HOW ARE YOU GOING TO
14 CONSTANTLY INSERT THE DATA THAT DETERMINES THE MODELS THAT
15 INDICATE THE CHANGE THAT'S COMING, RECOGNIZING THAT THAT
16 CHANGE IS GOING TO BE ON AN -- AT LEAST AN ANNUAL BASIS AND
17 SOMETIMES PERHAPS EVEN MONTHLY. I LIKE WHAT YOU HAVE DONE. I
18 COMPLIMENT YOU, AND LISA BOTH ON YOUR ARTICULATION OF THE
19 PLAN, AND WHERE WE STAND, AND HOW WE'RE MOVING FORWARD, BUT
20 THE CONSTANCY OF THE CHANGE IS SOMETHING I'M NOT SURE YOU CAN
21 KEEP UP WITH. I WOULD BE INTERESTED TO HEAR MORE. >DAVE

22 VAUTIN: I'LL NOTE ONE THING TO KICK IT OFF, THE POINT OF DOING
23 MODELING WORK IS NOT TO PREDICT THE FUTURE BECAUSE ONE THING
24 WE KNOW ABOUT PREDICTIONS IS THEY'RE ALMOST ALWAYS WRONG, THE
25 POINT IS, WHAT CAN YOU LEARN FROM MODELING. IN THE HORIZON



January 13, 2021

1 PROCESS WE STUDIED A WHOLE BUNCH OF DIFFERENT FUTURES
2 INCLUDING ONE WHERE THE ECONOMY WAS WEAK AND THERE WAS VERY
3 LITTLE GROWTH IN THE REGION AND WE LEARN THERE ARE STRATEGIES
4 THAT FIT THE GROWTH PATTERN IT'S PLAIN AND PROJECTIONS THE
5 STRATEGIES THEMSELVES ARE RESILIENT TO DIFFERENT LEVELS OF
6 GROWTH. LISA DO YOU WANT TO SPEAK ABOUT HOW WE DO IT IN THE
7 MODEL CONTEXT.

8

9 **LISA ZORN:** IN TERMS OF MODELING, AND DEMOGRAPHICS AND JOBS AND
10 CHANGING RAPIDLY, THE MODEL AND BEST GUESS WE HAVE RIGHT NOW
11 GIVEN THE INFORMATION WE HAVE RIGHT NOW, WE DO CONTINUE TO
12 WATCH THESE TRENDS AND CONTINUE TO WATCH EMPLOYMENT NUMBERS,
13 AND DEMOGRAPHIC NUMBERS AS THEY'RE RELEASED ANNUALLY AND WE'LL
14 BE UPDATING OUR MODELS TO REFLECT THAT. AND THE OTHER THING I
15 WOULD SAY IS THAT THESE LONG RANGE FORECASTS EVEN THOUGH WE
16 TEND TO PLOT LINES THAT ARE PRETTY SMOOTH, I THINK WE HAVE
17 WHICH WE INDICATE THAT WE UNDERSTAND THERE IS A LOT OF
18 WAVINESS IN THERE THAT WERE NOT CAPTURED AND IF WE DID CAPTURE
19 THOSE WE WOULD ALL BE RICH. THAT'S NOT THE PURPOSE OF THIS,
20 WHAT WE DO IS CONTINUE LOOKING AT DATA TRYING TO FILL IN DATA
21 GAPS WITH ADDITIONAL SURVEYING, AND WHEN IT'S TIME TO DO THE
22 NEXT PLAN IN FOUR YEARS WE'LL ADAPT TO THE NEWEST INFORMATION
23 THAT WE HAVE.

24

25 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU.



January 13, 2021

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WALTER.

3

4 **WALTER WILSON:** THANK YOU GUYS AGAIN, THIS IS REALLY GREAT. YOU
5 KNOW, LOOKING AT YOUR PLAN, AND THEN LOOKING AT THE WAY THINGS
6 ARE NOW, YOU KNOW, IT GIVES ME SOME PAUSE. PARTICULARLY AS IT
7 PERTAINS TO PEOPLE OF COLOR AND POOR AND DISADVANTAGED PEOPLE,
8 THE CORRELATION BETWEEN TRANSPORTATION AND DEVELOPMENT AND
9 JUSTIFICATION IT'S ALMOST A DOUBLE EDGED SWORD TRANSPORTATION
10 IS BROUGHT INTO COMMUNITIES THAT NEED IT MOST AND OTHER BRINGS
11 IN OTHER ELEMENTS THAT EVENTUAL LEER CAUSES DISPLACEMENT
12 PARTICULARLY AROUND GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT AND I'M NOT SURE
13 HOW MANY YOU GUYS ARE FOCUSED ON THAT BUT I THINK THAT'S A
14 VERY IMPORTANT ELEMENT TO SEE HOW WHEN WE LOOK AT A 50 YEAR
15 PLAN OR 25 YEARS PLAN -- 30 YEAR PLAN WHAT THE IMPACT IS GOING
16 TO BE ON THOSE THAT ARE MOST DISADVANTAGED AND HOW WE CAN
17 IMPACT THAT. THANK YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HAVE NO MORE HANDS, AND
20 WE'RE RUNNING WAY LATE ON TIME HERE. SO I'M GOING TO -- I'M
21 GOING TO SUGGEST THAT DAVE AND LISA COME BACK WITH SOME OF THE
22 QUESTIONS THAT WE HAVE. BECAUSE I HAVE A WHOLE PAGE HEREOF
23 QUESTIONS, WHICH, I'M GOING TO TAKE MY PREROGATIVE AND DO NOW
24 BEFORE WE HEAD TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I WANT TO MAKE SURE I HEARD
25 THAT WE WERE LOOKING AT ALL LANES BEING ESSENTIALLY -- THE --



January 13, 2021

1 NEVER MIND. SCRATCH THAT QUESTION. WE'RE GOING TO GO OFF THAT
2 TOPIC. MY BIG QUESTIONS, AND YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BRING
3 BACK PROBABLY THE RHNA DISCUSSION ON THIS, IS HOUSEHOLD GROWTH
4 AND JOB GROWTH, ISN'T NECESSARILY BALANCING OUT THE IMPACT ON
5 SPECIFIC CITIES. I'M FROM SAN JOSE. SO WE'LL JUST START WITH
6 THAT. OUR JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE IS WHAT IT IS AND IT'S
7 SIGNIFICANT. SO WHEN WE LOOK AT THAT, THERE IS A COUPLE OF
8 ISSUES. WHEN WE LOOK AT THIS WE'RE LOOK AT US AS A MINI REGION
9 WITHIN A REGION, AND I HAVE TO SAY I'M GOING TO PUSH BACK ON
10 THAT. BECAUSE, HISTORICALLY, WHAT HAPPENS IS ALL THE CITIES
11 THAT ARE UNDERDEVELOPED AND HAVE NEVER DONE -- MET THEIR RHNA
12 GOALS ARE NOW BEING HIT WITH, "OH YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO
13 PRODUCE 30 PERCENT MORE HOUSING THAN YOU PLANNED ON" AND I
14 KNOW PALO ALTO TOLD THEIR STAFF NO WE'RE NOT GOING TO DO THIS
15 AND WE NEED TO WRITE A LETTER AND TELL ABAG, JUMP IN THE
16 OCEAN. WHICH STAFF BASICALLY SAID, YEAH -- IT'S OUT OF OUR
17 HANDS. IT'S NOT OUR JOB. SO, I WANT A DISCUSSION TO COME BACK
18 ON HOW THAT -- HOW WE -- WHAT LEVERS THERE ARE TO MAKE THE --
19 THIS, ACTUALLY HAPPEN. BECAUSE IT'S ONE THING TO SAY WE'RE
20 GOING TO USE -- THESE AREAS ARE GOING PULL THEIR WEIGHT AND
21 IT'S ANOTHER TO SEE THE ACTUAL ZONING THAT MAKES THAT HAPPEN.
22 THE ECONOMIC AND HOUSING STRATEGY DEPENDS ON THAT. UNDER
23 ECONOMIC STRATEGIES NONE OF IT IS FOUNDED. SO I WANT TO KNOW
24 HOW THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN. AND PLEASE FEEL FREE TO BRING THAT
25 BACK, HOW WE THINK THAT'S GOING HAPPEN. AND I'M ALSO GOING TO



January 13, 2021

1 POINT OUT THAT WE HAVE A WEALTH OF COMMUNITY COLLEGES WHO
2 WOULD BE GLAD FOR YOU TO START PARTNERING WITH US TO SUPPORT
3 LEGISLATION TO HELP US PROVIDE MORE JOB TRAINING. WE ARE
4 RESTRICTED BY HOW WE OPERATE, AND I THINK IF YOU HAD A BETTER
5 UNDERSTANDING OF THAT, WE -- YOU COULD SUPPORT THE MTC
6 LEGISLATIVE AGENDA SHOULD INCLUDE THAT, THAT, SO THAT WE'RE
7 NOT SEEING A BUNCH OF POP-UP TRAINING GROUPS THAT WIND UP
8 STEALING PEOPLE'S MONEY, AND THEY DON'T GET TRAINED FOR
9 ANYTHING, A WORTH WHILE JOB. THAT'S MY PITCH ON THE ECONOMIC
10 STRATEGIES AND ON THE ENVIRONMENTAL PORTIONS I WANT TO MAKE
11 SURE WE TALK ABOUT SEA LEVEL RISE AND PROTECT THE HOUSES AND
12 PROTECTING THE ROADS, WE HAVE A LOT OF OPEN SPACE AND PARKLAND
13 THAT IS ADJACENT THAT'S GOING TO BE IN THAT TWO FOOT ZONE,
14 THAT WE WILL LOSE. SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR STRATEGIES
15 ARE INCLUDING THAT LOSS, AS WE'RE LOOKING AT THE NEED FOR OPEN
16 SPACE AND PARKS, WHICH, AGAIN, IS ANOTHER THING THAT'S NOT
17 FUNDED IN THE PLAN. I MEAN IT'S GOT A LITTLE BIT OF FUNDING
18 THE MAJORITY OF FUNDING THAT WE NEED ACTUALLY ISN'T THERE. I
19 WANT MAKE SURE WE HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT THAT WE HAVE PDAS, I
20 AM SURROUNDED, MY NEIGHBORHOOD IS SURROUNDED LITERALLY BY PDAS
21 WE HAVE -- I'M WITHIN HALF A MILE OF FOUR OR FIVE OF THEM,
22 WHICH INCLUDE PARK REQUIREMENTS. BUT WHEN WE GET TO THE POINT
23 OF IMPLEMENTING THAT PORTION OF IT, BUYING LAND IN URBAN
24 AREAS, FOR COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE NO ACCESS TO PARKS OR OPEN
25 SPACE IS COST PROHIBITIVE, SO WHAT THEY WIND UP DOING IS



January 13, 2021

1 SAYING, OH WELL, PUT THE MONEY INTO A REGIONAL POT FOR PARKS
2 WHICH IS NOWHERE NEAR MY HOUSE SO I'M GOING TO CENTER IT ON ME
3 MY HOUSE DOESN'T HAVE A PARK THEY CAN WALK TO. MY HOUSE IS
4 ADJACENT TO HOUSING PROJECTS WHERE PEOPLE ARE TRANSIT
5 DEPENDENT AND DURING COVID PLEASE PEOPLE HAVE BEEN IN THEIR
6 APARTMENTS THEY HAVEN'T HAD ANY OUTDOOR SPACE. SO THOSE
7 CONVERSATIONS CAN BE BROUGHT BACK SO WE CAN ACTUALLY IMPACT
8 AND HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT THAT. BECAUSE I KNOW THAT THAT'S
9 PART OF THE UPCOMING EIR, BUT THIS IS A STELLAR JOB. THANK YOU
10 FOR -- THANK YOU FOR ALL OF THIS. BUT NOW YOU HAVE AN ENTIRE
11 MEETING TO COME BACK TO. SO I JUST -- I'M LOOKING AT IT GOING
12 YEAH, YOU WILL HAVE ANOTHER 90 MINUTES WITH THIS. I'M GOING TO
13 HALT OUR CONVERSATION ON THIS, AND ASK STAFF, IF WE HAVE ANY
14 PUBLIC COMMENT WAITING.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
17 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
18 HANDS RAISED.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU. I WILL CLOSE OUT THIS
21 BECAUSE WE HAVE TO BE RESPECTFUL THAT WE'RE A HALF AN HOUR
22 LATE RIGHT NOW AND STAFF HAS OTHER MEETINGS THEY'RE SUPPOSED
23 TO BE ATTENDING. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO ITEM NUMBER TEN. AND
24 THANK YOU BOTH, LISA AND DAVE, AWESOME. STAFF LIAISON REPORT,
25 MARTI.



January 13, 2021

1

2 **MARTI PASCHAL:** MARTI PASCHAL STAFF TO THE COUNSEL I'LL
3 HIGHLIGHT MY REPORT DAVE MENTION THE SURVEY, A LINK TO THAT
4 SURVEY IN ENGLISH SPANISH AND CHINESE ARE IN MY REPORT, AND I
5 MENTIONED A TEXT BASED SURVEY I WILL SENDS INFORMATION ABOUT
6 THAT IN AN E-MAIL AFTER THE MEETING. THANK YOU.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT LANGUAGES, I HAVE
9 A LARGE VIETNAMESE POPULATION HERE I'M GOING TO SAY THAT.

10

11 **MARTI PASCHAL:** ONLY ENGLISH, SPANISH, AND CHINESE.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. I'M GOING TO STOMP MY FEET AND SAY
14 WE NEED TO DO BETTER. WE ABSOLUTELY NEED TO DO BETTER. AND SO
15 IF YOU CAN PLEASE PASS THAT ALONG. JUST KIND OF GOING TO ONE
16 BEN'S POINTS ABOUT OUR SURVEYS BECAUSE I SEE A LOT OF THAT
17 POP-UP ON FACEBOOK OUR PLANNED BAY AREA SURVEYS THAT POP-UP
18 THERE, AND I CAN GUARANTEE YOU THOSE COMMENTS ARE COMING FROM
19 THE SAME PEOPLE OVER AND OVER, AND I FEEL REALLY SORRY FOR THE
20 STAFF THAT HAS TO READ THEM AND TRY TO FIGURE OUT WHAT TO DO
21 WITH THEM BUT I APPRECIATE FIGURING OUT HO TO GET MY
22 COMMUNITIES INPUT. THAT'S MY TWO CENTS. AND I DO WANT TO POINT
23 OUT TO PEOPLE THAT DIDN'T READ THE STAFF REPORT THAT THERE IS
24 A LICENSE PLATE ACCOUNT FOR BAY AREA TOLLING. FOR BRIDGES,
25 CORRECT? RATHER THAN FASTRAK. SO I'M READING THIS CORRECTLY.



January 13, 2021

1 YOU DON'T HAVE TO BUY A FASTER PASS LIKE ME AND YOU CROSS THE
2 BRIDGE EVERY SIX MONTHS YOU CAN REGISTER YOUR LICENSE PLATE
3 EVERY SIX MONTHS AND DO IT THAT WAY. MATTER OF FACT, I HAVEN'T
4 CROSSED A BRIDGE IN A YEAR AND A HALF NOW. OKAY, WITH THAT,
5 THAT TAKES US TO COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS. MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL
6 MAY REPORT ON LOCALLY RELEVANT ISSUES OR EVENTS. DOES ANYBODY
7 HAVE ANYTHING TO REPORT? I SEE ADRIENNE. GO AHEAD.

8

9 **ADRIAN MENDOZA:** QUICKLY, I HAD SENT AN E-MAIL ON TO MARTHA
10 MARTI, AND KY-NAM ABOUT -- AN E-MAIL THEY RECEIVED FOR AN
11 ONLINE COURSE CALLED PARKING IN THE CITY, WHICH WAS A BOOK
12 CALLED THE HIGH COST OF FREE PARKING, AND THIS IS HOW YOU CAN
13 GET IT, AND I JUST WANTED THAT SENT ON TO THE MEMBERS. THANK
14 YOU.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANYTHING TO
17 BRING UP FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER? I SEE NO HANDS RAISED.
18 FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS. WE HAVE QUITE A LIST COMING UP. IS THERE
19 ANYTHING WE HAVE FORGOTTEN? I SEE NO HANDS RAISED. WITH THAT,
20 WE ARE COMING TO THE AGENDA -- TO THE ADJOURNMENT. NEXT
21 MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD ON
22 WEDNESDAY FEBRUARY 10TH, 2021, AT 1:35 P.M. AND REMOTELY AND
23 BY WEBCAST AS APPROPRIATE DEPENDING ON THE SHELTER-IN-PLACE
24 ORDERS. I'M NOT LEAVING MY HOME SO WE'RE DOING IT ON THE WEB
25 JUST LIKE EVERYBODY ELSE.



January 13, 2021

1

2 **RICHARD HEDGES:** MOVE ADJOURNMENT.

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** SECOND.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE'RE NOT GOING TO MOVE ON THAT.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE DON'T HAVE TO MOVE ON THE ADJOURNMENT.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** PARDON ME?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU DON'T HAVE TO VOTE ON ADJOURNMENT.

13

14 **RICHARD HEDGES:** MOTION TO ADJOURNMENT DOESN'T NEED A SECOND.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE NEVER NEED A MOTION TO ADJOURN. I JUST

17 GAVEL AS CLOSED. AGAIN I WANT TO REITERATE WHAT A JOY IT IS TO

18 WORK WITH EVERYBODY HERE, ACTUALLY WORKING ON PROBLEMS AND

19 SOLVING THINGS. BRAVO TO EVERYBODY, AND I HOPE THE REST OF

20 YOUR WEEKS OR SO UNTIL WE MEET AGAIN, ARE AS PLEASANT AS THIS.

21 AND WITH THAT I'M GOING TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. THANK YOU VERY

22 MUCH. [ADJOURNED]

23



Broadcasting Government