



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



January 8, 2021

JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE

WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, JANUARY 8, 2021, 9:40 AM

JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR: GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I WANT TO WELCOME EVERYONE TO THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. WITH THAT, CAN I GO AHEAD AND RUN THE COVID ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR, PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC



January 8, 2021

1 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M.
2 YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO
3 THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE
4 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO
5 DO SO, AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
6 UPON THEM ON THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
7 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE THAT THE
8 CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE
9 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
10 TO DATE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING, YOU'RE MUTED.

13

14 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YES, I AM. THANK YOU. JESSE,
15 WITH YOUR PERMISSION I'M GOING TO DO MTC ROLL AND TURN IT OVER
16 TO YOU FOR YOU TO DO YOUR ABAG ROLL CALL, COMPENSATION AND
17 CONSENT CALENDAR IS THAT OKAY?

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

20

21 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** WITH THAT, PLEASE TAKE THE
22 ROLL FOR MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

25



January 8, 2021

1 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

8

9 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY NON-VOTING. COMMISSIONER

10 GIOCAPINI, NON-VOTING. COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE? COMMISSIONER

11 RABBIT? COMMISSIONER SLOCUM? COMMISSIONER SPERING?

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER STRACNER, NON-VOTING.

16

17 **JIM STRACNER:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MTC HAS A QUORUM.

20

21 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** JESSE, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO

22 YOU.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU. PLEASE

25 CALL THE ROLL OF THE ABAG MEMBERS.



January 8, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT? COUNCILMEMBER
3 PERALEZ?

4

5 **RAUL PERALEZ:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RABBIT IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
8 RAMOS?

9

10 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. I'M HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR ROMERO?

13

14 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

17

18 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** COMPENSATION
19 ANNOUNCEMENT?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW, I AM MAKING THE
22 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG BOARD IN
23 ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN
24 AMOUNT OF \$100 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH
25 EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.



January 8, 2021

1

2 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHAIR
3 SPERING, WOULD YOU LIKE ME TO GO TO ITEM THREE, THE ABAG
4 CONSENT CALENDAR.

5

6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YES, PLEASE.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** ITEM THREE ABAG
9 CONSENT CALENDAR APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF DECEMBER 11TH, 2020
10 AND 3B AUTHORIZE TO AMEND THE AGREEMENTS WITH REGENTS OF
11 UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA. I ASK FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE THE
12 CONSENT CALENDAR.

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** MOVE IT.

15

16 **BELIA RAMOS:** SECOND.

17

18 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND.
19 ANY COMMENT? I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF
20 HAS TOLD ME SHE'S ON THE ATTENDEE'S SIDE, AND SHE NEEDS TO BE
21 MOVED OVER. JESS, IF YOU COULD, PLEASE, ASSIST IN THAT, I
22 WOULD GREATLY APPRECIATE IT. SO, I WILL NOW ASK IF THERE IS
23 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM 3, THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CONSENT
24 CALENDAR. IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. I



January 8, 2021

1 DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED,
2 MR. CASTRO?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** CALL THE ROLL ON
7 THE MOTION.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE MOTION WAS BY SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ, AND
10 SECOND BY SUPERVISOR RAMOS. [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES
11 UNANIMOUSLY.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH
14 BACK TO YOU CHAIR SPERING.

15

16 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESS. MTC PLANNING
17 COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. IS THERE A SECOND TO JAKE
18 MACKENZIE'S MOTION TO APPROVE CONSENT?

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** I'LL SECOND.

21

22 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** WE HAVE A SECOND. ANY WRITTEN
23 COMMENT FROM SPEAKERS ON THIS ITEM.

24



January 8, 2021

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
2 THIS ITEM AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

3

4 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL
5 PLEASE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. MOTION BY MACKENZIE, SECOND BY
8 CONNOLY. [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
9 PRESENT.

10

11 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU. MOVING TO
12 ITEM NUMBER FIVE, I BELIEVE, MATT, YOU GUYS SENT OUT A COUPLE
13 OF ATTACHMENTS, AND CORRESPONDENCE ON THESE ITEMS HOPEFULLY
14 EVERYBODY RECEIVED THAT. WITH THAT, MATT, ARE YOU KICKING THIS
15 OFF? OR IS DAVID?

16

17 **MATT MALONEY:** THE ACTION BEFORE YOU IS TO APPROVE ADVANCEMENT
18 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AS THE PREFERRED
19 ALTERNATIVE AND ENABLING FURTHER PROGRESS ON OUR ENVIRONMENTAL
20 ANALYSIS THIS WINTER IN COMPLIANCE WITH STATE LAW THIS IS A
21 MAJOR MILESTONE FOR THE REGION IT'S A COMPREHEND NATION OF
22 THREE YEARS WORK BEGINNING WITH THE HORIZON PROCESS AND MOVING
23 DEEP INTO COMPREHENSIVE SET OF REGIONAL STRATEGIES ACROSS THE
24 TRANSPORTATION HOUSING ENVIRONMENT. I WANT TO LOOK AT WHAT WE
25 HAVE ACCOMPLISHED OVER THE LAST YEAR OR SO ALMOST ALL OF THAT



January 8, 2021

1 HAS BEEN IN THIS VIRTUAL ENVIRONMENT HERE ON ZOOM. LAST
2 FEBRUARY MTC AND ABAG APPROVED 25 DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES
3 AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. WE ANALYZE THAT AS A PACKAGE AND
4 RELEASED FINDINGS BACK TO YOU LAST JULY. AFTER THAT, LAST
5 SUMMER, REGIONAL STAFF ENGAGED WITH THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA
6 RESIDENTS, ALL IN THE VIRTUAL ENVIRONMENT, TO ENSURE THE FINAL
7 BLUEPRINT MOVED EVEN FURTHER TOWARD CRITICAL IDENTIFIED GOALS
8 IMPORTANTLY ACHIEVING GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGETS. THIS
9 FALL MTC AND ABAG REAFFIRMED AND EXPAND THE LIST OF STRATEGIES
10 AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WITH 35
11 STRATEGIES IN TOTAL. IF YOU RECALL WE MADE SOME BIG DECISIONS
12 AS PART OF THAT DECISIONS ABOUT PLANNING THE FUTURE OF THE
13 TRANSIT SYSTEM, INCLUDING SOME DISCUSSIONS AND DECISIONS ABOUT
14 MAJOR PROJECTS LIKE HIGH SPEED RAIL, THE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION
15 THE CALTRAIN, VALLEY LINK NEW STRATEGIES FOR ACHIEVING HOUSING
16 AFFORDABILITY GOALS AND PERHAPS MOST MEMORABLY A ROBUST
17 DISCUSSION ABOUT SO-CALLED STRATEGY EN7 FORMALLY KNOWN AS THE
18 TELECOMMUTE MANDATE NOW CALLED THE EMPLOYER COMMUTE TRIP
19 REDUCTION STRATEGY. WHAT WE'RE SHOWING YOU TODAY ARE THE
20 OUTCOMES, REALLY THE IMPACTS OF OUR ANALYSIS OF ALL THOSE
21 STRATEGIES AND THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES INCLUDING SORT OF THE
22 FUTURE GROWTH PATTERN THAT RESULTS FROM THAT. AS YOU WILL HEAR
23 IN TODAY'S PRESENTATION, AND I AM HAPPY TO REPORT, THE FINAL
24 BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS DOES SHOW THAT THIS ITERATION OF PLANNED
25 BAY AREA 2050 MEETS AND EXCEEDS STATE AND FEDERAL



January 8, 2021

1 REQUIREMENTS. INCLUDING, FOR THE FIRST TIME, THAT ALL
2 IMPORTANT GHG TARGET OF 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA BY THE YEAR
3 2035. AS YOU ALSO KNOW, WE ARE ENGAGED IN A PARALLEL EFFORT
4 RIGHT NOW, THAT'S THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION, OR
5 RHNA. RHNA IS RELATED TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND IT USES
6 ITS PATTERN OF HOUSING GROWTH AS A FOUNDATION. HOWEVER, THE
7 TWO PROCESSES ARE FUNDAMENTALLY DIFFERENT RHNA IS THE PROVINCE
8 OF ABAG SOLELY, AND THROUGHOUT THAT PROCESS WE HAVE BEEN
9 WORKING WITH THE ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE OR THE RPC,
10 AND THE RPC MEETS NEXT THURSDAY TO TAKE UP RHNA AND THEN OF
11 COURSE THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WHICH HAS THE FINAL DECISION
12 MAKING AUTHORITY OVER RHNA. SO RHNA IS NOT ON THE AGENDA
13 TODAY. WE DO RECOGNIZE THAT, DUE TO THE UPDATED LAND USE
14 PATTERN IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT A HANDFUL OF JURISDICTIONS ARE
15 SEEING RHNA INCREASES AND A HANDFUL OF JURISDICTIONS ARE
16 SEEING RHNA DECREASES. BROADLY SPEAKING THIS IS THE RESULT OF
17 A CLIMATE SMART LAND USE PATTERN COMPARED TO THE DRAFT
18 BLUEPRINT THIS WAS ESSENTIAL TO MEET THE STATE GHG TARGET AS
19 REQUIRED FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. SO MOVING FORWARD WITH
20 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TODAY DOES NOT DEBATE THE MONTHS AHEAD
21 ON RHNA NOT ONLY WILL THE EXECUTIVE BOARD ADVERTISE FINAL SAY
22 ON THE DRAFT FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY AND HOW THE PLANNED BAY
23 AREA 2050 WILL BE INTEGRATED BUT THERE WILL BE A PROCESS FOR
24 JURISDICTIONS TO APPEAL THEIR ALLOCATION THIS IS SUMMER AND
25 FALL. FOLLOWING THE ADOPTION OF THE EIR IT'S ESSENTIAL TO MOVE



January 8, 2021

1 FORWARD THIS TIME TO ENSURE TRANSPORTATION PROJECT DELIVER IS
2 NOT ADVERSELY IMPACTED SO IT'S IMPORTANT TO STAY ON TIME WITH
3 THE PLAN. IT'S ESSENTIAL ACTION TO KEEP RHNA INFORMED SO
4 JURISDICTIONS HAVE ENOUGH TIME TO UPDATE THEIR HOUSING
5 ELEMENT. I WILL INTRODUCE DAVE VAUTIN AND LISA ZORN, I KNOW
6 DAVE NEEDS NO INTRODUCTION, YOU KNOW HIM WELL HE HAS DONE A
7 GREAT JOB MANAGING THE SCOPE OF THE PLAN, NOT TO MENTION
8 OVERSEEING A LOT OF STAFF WORK ON RHNA AS WELL. BUT PROBABLY
9 LESS KNOWN TO YOU IS LISA ZORN, SHE IS OUR ASSISTANT DIRECTOR
10 OF FORECASTING MODELING AND SURVEYS. IT'S NOT OFTEN THAT WE
11 DRAG THE MODELERS OUT TO SPEAK TO ELECTED OFFICIALS BUT LISA
12 IS DIFFERENT, AS YOU WILL SEE. SHE LEADS A TALENTED STAFF OF
13 FORECASTERS AND MODELERS FOR BOTH LAND USE AND TRANSPORTATION.
14 SHE HAS DONE AN UNBELIEVABLE JOB PUSHING OUR TOOLS TO THE
15 LIMIT TO REPRESENT ALL THE FAR REACHING STRATEGIES AND
16 INVESTMENTS THAT YOU HAVE PRIORITIZED DURING THIS PROCESS.
17 DAVE, I WILL TURN IT OVER TO YOU.

18

19 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** MATT, HAVE YOU RECEIVED
20 CORRESPONDENCE VERY MUCH ON THE RHNA NUMBERS?

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** WE HAVE RECEIVED PUBLIC COMMENT, THROUGH THE
23 COMMENT PERIOD, ITSELF, AND THAT PERIOD HAS CLOSED SINCE WE
24 HAVE RELEASED THE DRAFT METHODOLOGY WE HAVE STARTED TO RECEIVE
25 CORRESPONDENCE AS WELL, WE ARE ENGAGED IN A SERIES OF OFFICE



January 8, 2021

1 HOURS THAT WE'RE DOING AT A STAFF LEVEL MEETING ONE-ON-ONE
2 WITH JURISDICTIONS. MANY JURISDICTIONS HAVE TAKEN US UP ON
3 THAT. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF BACK AND FORTH WITH STAFF AND
4 JURISDICTIONS.

5

6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** JESSE, ARE YOU HEARING VERY
7 MANY COMMENTS ON THE RHNA NUMBERS IN RELATION TO THIS PLAN?

8

9 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** WE RECEIVED A
10 SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF PUBLIC COMMENT ABOUT RHNA. BUT NOT --
11 AND THERE HAS BEEN DISCUSSION ABOUT THE INPUT INTO THE RHNA
12 METHODOLOGY. WHETHER IT SHOULD BE THE HOUSEHOLD GROWTH,
13 WHETHER IT SHOULD BE THE 2050 BLUEPRINT, THE SORT OF BASELINE
14 DATA. SO, WE HAVE GOTTEN A LOT OF FEEDBACK ABOUT THAT, YOU
15 KNOW, THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD DID VOTE IN OCTOBER TO MOVE
16 FORWARD OPTION 8A AS A METHODOLOGY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT SO ON
17 THE 21st WE'LL BE VOTING TO TAKE FINAL ACTION TO SEND THE
18 DRAFT METHODOLOGY TO HCD. SO, I ANTICIPATE THERE WILL BE
19 SIGNIFICANT COMMENT OVER THE NEXT FEW DAYS AND WEEKS ABOUT THE
20 RHNA METHODOLOGY. BUT I THINK IT WAS THE 19th, STAFF DID
21 RELEASE NOT ONLY THE METHODOLOGY, BUT ALSO THE FINAL
22 BLUEPRINT, AND THERE HAVE BEEN SOME CHANGES TO THE
23 DISTRIBUTION, FOR EXAMPLE, MY CITY HAS TO PLAN FOR 2,000 MORE
24 UNITS THAN IT DID BEFORE SO THERE HAVE BEEN SOME CHANGES.

25



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESS. MATT, I JUST
2 WANTED TO PUT INTO CONTEXT WHAT YOU'RE HEARING. WITH THAT,
3 DAVE, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD MORNING
4 COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS IS LISA AND I ARE THRILLED TO
5 BE HERE TODAY TO SHARE THE RESULTS OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA
6 2050 BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS SPOTLIGHTING STRATEGIES AND GROWTH
7 GEOGRAPHIES YOU APPROVED. AS MATT MENTIONED WE WILL BE ASKING
8 AT THE ENDS OF TODAY'S ITEM THAT YOU REFER THIS ITEM TO THE
9 COMMISSION AND BOARD FOR APPROVAL. I'LL ASK STAFF TO LOAD THE
10 SLIDES AT THAT TIME AND MOVE TO SLIDE TWO. AS MATT MENTIONED
11 TODAY'S RELEASE BUILT UPON THE HORIZON INITIATIVE AND THE
12 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT PROCESS, THREE YEARS OF WORK
13 TO REALLY UNDERSTAND HOW OUR STRATEGIES PERFORM IN A DIVERGENT
14 UNCERTAIN FUTURE WHERE EXTERNAL, ECONOMIC, TECHNOLOGICAL
15 ENVIRONMENTAL AND POLITICAL FORCES CAN EFFECT THE REGION'S
16 TRAJECTORY. BY GENERATING THESE STRATEGY IDEAS AND STRESS
17 TESTING THEM OVER A PERIOD OF SEVERAL YEARS WE HAVE BEEN ABLE
18 TO CRAFT A PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT THAT'S MORE
19 RESILIENT AND EQUITABLE THAN PAST LONG RANGE PLANS HERE IN THE
20 SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA. WE FEEL THE STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN ARE
21 READY FOR THE POST COVID WORLD THAT JUST LIKE WHAT WE HAVE
22 STUDIED IS A HIGHLY UNCERTAIN FUTURE WORLD. BECAUSE THEY HAVE
23 BEEN STRESS TESTED AGAINST THESE DIFFERENT FUTURE CONDITIONS.
24 AS WE MOVE INTO THE FINAL YEAR IN THE PROCESS WE ARE READY TO
25 MAKE THAT TRANSITION AS YOU IMPLEMENT THE KEY MILESTONE FOR



January 8, 2021

1 THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ITERATION OF THE PLAN. THE FINAL
2 BLUEPRINT WAS DRIVEN BY PUBLIC INPUT NEARLY 300 MEETINGS WITH
3 33,000 COMMENTS 15,000 PARTICIPANTS OVER THREE YEAR PERIOD
4 WITH ENGAGEMENT AND REACHING OUT TO LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES OF
5 COLOR AND AN AUDIENCE AS DIVERSE AS THE BAY AREA IS TALKING TO
6 UNHOUSED POPULATIONS, NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS AND OTHER
7 POPULATIONS. THIS SPEAKS TO THE CRAFT OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
8 OF THE 35 STRATEGIES ENSURING THE BAY AREA IS AFFORDABLE
9 CONNECTED DIVERSE HEALTHY AND VIBRANT FOR ALL BY THE YEAR
10 2050. LIKE THE PUZZLE PIECES ON THE SCREEN THIS BLUEPRINT IS A
11 PACKAGE DESIGNED TO ACHIEVE SYNERGIES BETWEEN THE VARIOUS
12 STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. AS MANY OF YOU ARE AWARE, THE 35
13 STRATEGIES WERE DISCUSSED QUITE A BIT OVER THE COURSE OF 2020,
14 AND THEY CLUSTER UNDER 11 KEY THEMES THIS INCLUDES THE E --
15 REVISED STRATEGY EN7 FOR AUTO COMMUTE TRIPS REQUIRING
16 EMPLOYERS TO FUNDS INCENTIVES AND DISINCENTIVES TO SHIFT
17 TELECOMMUTE. ON THE LEFT IS A QUICK REFRESHER TO MAINTAIN AND
18 OPTIMIZE THE EXISTING SYSTEM NOT ONLY MAINTAINING EXISTING
19 INFRASTRUCTURE BUT OPTIMIZING IT MAKING OUR SYSTEM MORE
20 SEAMLESS. AND YOU KNOW, REALLY ADVANCING THE WORK OF THE BLUE
21 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE THROUGH BETTER CONNECTIONS
22 AND THROUGH REGIONAL FARE REFORM. NEXT, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
23 TRIES TO CREATE HEALTHY AND SAFER STREETS BY BUILDING A SYSTEM
24 OF OVER 10,000 MILES OF PROTECTED BIKEWAYS AND TRAILS AND
25 BUILD A NEXT GENERATION TRANSIT NETWORK OF OVER \$100 BILLION



January 8, 2021

1 OF NEW TRANSIT EXPANSION AND OPTIMIZATION PROJECTS. AND THE
2 HOUSING ELEMENT TO THE PLAN, STRATEGY IS REALLY FOCUSED ON
3 PRODUCTING AND PRESERVING AFFORDABLE HOUSING WHILE SPURRING
4 MORE HOUSING PRODUCTION AS ALL INCOME LEVELS TOTALING 1.5
5 MILLION UNITS OVER THE PLANNING PERIOD AND WORKING TO CREATE
6 MORE INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES BY BREAKING DOWN THE LEGACIES OF
7 DISCRIMINATION THAT REALLY CREATED PLACES THAT EXCLUDED SO
8 MANY OF OUR BAY AREA RESIDENTS. LOOKING AT THE ECONOMY
9 ELEMENT, THE STRATEGIES CLUSTER UNDER THE THEMES OF IMPROVING
10 ECONOMIC MOBILITY BY WORKING TO REDUCE INCOME AND EQUALITY AND
11 WORKING TO SHIFT THE LOCATION OF JOBS TO CREATE A BALANCE
12 WITHIN THE REGION AND WITH REGARDS TO THE ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT
13 OF THE PLAN THE STRATEGIES CLUSTER UNDER THE THEMES OF
14 REDUCING RISKS FROM HAZARDS WHETHER THOSE ARE SEA LEVEL RISE
15 EARTHQUAKE WILDFIRES EXPANDING ACCESS TO PARKS AND OPEN SPACE
16 AND OF COURSE VERY IMPORTANTLY REDUCING CLIMATE EMISSIONS.
17 THERE IS MUCH MORE INFORMATION ON THIS IN ATTACHMENT B OF THE
18 ITEM AS WELL AS PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG. NEXT SLIDE. THE STRATEGIES
19 HELP ACCOMMODATE THE FORECASTED REGIONAL GROWTH OVER THE NEXT
20 THREE DECADES WHICH TOTALS 1.4 MILLION NEW HOUSEHOLDS 1.5
21 MILLION NEW HOUSING UNITS AND 1.4 MILLION JOBS AND BETWEEN
22 2015 FOCUSED GROWTH AND LIT CAL CLIMATE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT
23 AREAS AND TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS AND BY FOCUSING
24 WITHIN THESE EXISTING URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES WE CAN WORK TO
25 PROTECT AGRICULTURAL NATURAL LAND FORM DEVELOPMENT WHILE



January 8, 2021

1 REDUCING HAZARDS AND MOVING US CLOSER TO OUR GREENHOUSE GAS
2 TARGET. MORE INFORMATION IN ATTACHMENT C. WITH REGARDS TO THE
3 FINANCIAL BREAK DOWN OF THE PLAN AS YOU ARE AWARE IT WILL
4 REQUIRE A BROAD SUITE OF REGIONAL STATE AND LOCAL MONEYS
5 TOTALING \$1.4 TRILLION, WITH REVENUES ESPECIALLY IMPORTANT FOR
6 HOUSING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND RESILIENCE ENVIRONMENTAL
7 ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN A BREAK DOWN FOR THE FINANCIAL PLAN IS
8 PROVIDED IN ATTACHMENT D WITH THE STRATEGY COST AND SHOWS HOW
9 THESE INVESTMENTS HAVE BEEN STRUCTURED TO ADVANCE EQUITY BY
10 STRATEGY BY PRIORITIZING PROJECTS WITH LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS
11 IN STRATEGY WITH CONTEXT OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. I'LL TURN
12 THIS OVER TO LISA.

13

14 **LISA ZORN:** THANK YOU DAVE. NEXT SLIDE. WE KNOW THAT THE FUTURE
15 OF THE WORLD AND THE FUTURE OF OUR REGION REMAIN QUITE
16 UNCERTAIN AND THAT'S YET HORIZON INITIATIVE WAS SO ESSENTIAL
17 UNDERSTANDING HOW STRATEGIES FARED IN A WORLD IN ECONOMIC BOOM
18 AND TELECOMMUTING. WE'LL TALK TODAY ABOUT POTENTIAL OUTCOMES
19 OF THE PLAN WE WANT TO RECOGNIZE IT'S THE STRATEGIES THAT ARE
20 THE CORE OF THE PLAN WHAT WE WILL WORK TO IMPLEMENT IN
21 PARTNERSHIP WITH OTHERS. WE HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO MAKE
22 STRATEGIC UPDATES TO THE PLAN SINCE THE EMERGENCE OF COVID-19
23 PANDEMIC IN MARCH LAST YEAR NEAR-TERM REVENUE IMPACTS
24 ESPECIALLY FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT WERE INTEGRATED IN THE
25 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE FORECAST PLUS DOUBLING DOWN ON LOW COST



January 8, 2021

1 STRATEGIES LIKE BIKE PED INVESTMENTS TO ADVANCE IN THE NEAR-
2 TERM. WE HAD A CHANCE TO RECALIBRATE THE ECONOMIC STRATEGIES
3 FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WITH ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES EXPLORED
4 DURING HORIZON DURING TIMES WEAKER TIMES OF ECONOMIC
5 CONDITIONS. WE WORKED WITH CARB CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD
6 ON TELECOMMUTE PROJECTIONS AND FURTHER ACCELERATE TELECOMMUTE
7 ADOPTION. EXPANDED STRATEGIES FOR OTHER TYPES OF NATURAL
8 DISASTERS INCLUDING WILDFIRES, EARTHQUAKES, AND MORE. NEXT
9 SLIDE PLEASE. BEFORE WE HIGHLIGHT POTENTIAL OUTCOMES
10 ASSOCIATED WITH THE STRATEGIES IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WE
11 WANTED TO PROVIDE A SYNOPSIS OF HOW WE ANALYZE THE OUTCOMES.
12 OUR TIME USES THREE PRIMARY MODELS, RUNNING FOR ECONOMIC
13 IMPACTS, BAY AREA ECONOMIC IMPACTS AND TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS.
14 WE MAKE ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT EXTERNAL FORCES IN THE FUTURE AND
15 REGULATORS REPRESENT IN THE ADOPTION STRATEGIES. WE MAKE SURE
16 POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE FEEDBACK LOOPS ARE CAPTURED NEW TRANSIT
17 PROJECTS MIGHT INDUCE MORE DEMAND FOR HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT
18 STATIONS. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO DAVE. >DAVE
19 VAUTIN: NEXT SLIDE. THE ANALYSIS OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
20 STRATEGIES GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES HIGHLIGHTED THAT MANY POSITIVE
21 OUTCOMES SHOWCASED IN JULY REMAIN IN EFFECT AS SHOWN IN SCREEN
22 TWO OF THE FINEST BLUEPRINT MAJORITY WALKABLE TRANSIT-RICH
23 COMMUNITIES HEALTH SHIFT. IT CONTINUES TO PROTECT NEARLY ALL
24 BAY AREA HOMES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE OVER THE PLANNING PERIOD IT
25 FUNDS RETROFITS FOR ALL HIGH RISK BAY AREA HOMES FROM SEISMIC



January 8, 2021

1 AND WILDFIRE RISK AND IT ENSURES THAT NO URBAN GROWTH IS
2 ENVISIONED OUTSIDE OF PRESENT DAY GROWTH BOUNDARIES.
3 IMPORTANTLY THE FINAL BLUEPRINT MAKES FURTHER HEADWAY ON THE
4 FIVE KEY CHALLENGES IDENTIFIED IN THE DRAFT THAT WERE THE
5 SUBJECT OF EXTENSIVE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT THIS SUMMER AND MADE
6 HEADWAY ON INSUFFICIENT AFFORDABLE HOUSING, CONTINUED
7 CONGESTION AND CROWDING DISPLACEMENT RISK, JOBS/HOUSING
8 IMBALANCES, AND IMPORTANTLY STATUTORY REQUIREMENT TO REDUCE
9 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. THE STRATEGIES ADOPTED LED TO AN
10 UPDATED GROWTH PATTERN COMPARED TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, WHICH
11 HELPS MAKE PROGRESS ON ALL OF THE CHALLENGES. YOU CAN SEE A
12 BREAK DOWN OF THIS GROWTH PATTERN IN ATTACHMENT F. A KEY
13 DRIVER HERE WAS GETTING TOWARDS MORE GHG REDUCING LAND USE
14 PATTERN AS THE GOAL OF CLOSING THAT GAP. YOU SEE THE HOUSEHOLD
15 GROWTH PATTERN ON SCREEN WITH THE GROWTH PATTERN IN THE DRAFT
16 ON THE LEFT. THE RIGHT SHOWS THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. BOTH
17 ACCOMMODATE SAME AMOUNT OF GROWTH. 1.4 MILLION NEW HOUSEHOLDS,
18 AND THE BUBBLE INDICATES THE SIZE OF THE SHARE OF REGIONAL
19 GROWTH. THERE ARE SOME SIMILARITIES HERE. THE LARGEST SHARE OF
20 THE HOUSING GROWTH CONTINUES TO BE IN THE SOUTH BAY WITH
21 SIMILAR DISTRIBUTION BETWEEN THE BIG THREE CITIES BAYSIDE
22 COMMUNITIES, INLAND, AND UNINCORPORATED AREAS. SIMILAR SHARE
23 OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES OVERWHELMING AMOUNT 85 PERCENT OCCURS
24 WITHIN THOSE AREAS. IT CONTINUES TO FOCUS GROWTH PLAN WITH
25 SIMILAR LEVELS OF GROWTH IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND



January 8, 2021

1 HIGH RESOURCE, TO THE HIGHER LEVEL THAN PLANNED BAY AREA 2040.
2 THE BIG CHANGE IS THAT MORE OF THE GROWTH IS IN TRANSIT-RICH
3 PLACES; INSTEAD OF 72 PERCENT IN THE DRAFT 82 PERCENT IS IN
4 TRANSIT RICH PLACES IN THE FINAL. THERE IS ALSO MORE GROWTH IN
5 SAN FRANCISCO AND IN PORTIONS IN THE EAST BAY, WITH LESS
6 GROWTH IN SONOMA AND NAPA COUNTIES IN THE DRAFT. AGAIN, THERE
7 IS MORE INFORMATION ON THIS IN PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG WITH THOSE
8 BREAKDOWNS INCLUDED THE PACKET TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHAT
9 DROVE THESE SHIFTS? OF COURSE EACH COUNTY AND SUBCOUNTY AREA
10 THAT WE EVALUATE HAS ITS OWN UNIQUE STORY, BUT HERE ARE KEY
11 DRIVERS OF THE CHANGE? FIRST, ONE OF THE HOUSING STRATEGIES TO
12 PROVIDE MORE DEVELOPMENT CAPACITY NEAR TRANSIT WAS MODIFIED
13 THIS FALL TO FOCUS A HIGHER SHARE OF GROWTH IN TRANSIT-RICH
14 HIGH RESOURCE PLACES THIS INCLUDES A GOOD NUMBER OF
15 NEIGHBORHOODS IN SAN FRANCISCO, AS WELL AS SOME OF THE HIGHER
16 RESOURCE EAST BAY COMMUNITIES LIKE LAMORINDA. THE PUBLIC LAND
17 STRATEGY WAS ADDED TO THE BLUEPRINT THIS FALL. THIS MEANT THAT
18 SOME OF THE LARGER SITES IN NORTHERN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AS
19 WELL AS PORTIONS IN THE EAST BAY BART STATION PARKING LOTS ARE
20 SEEING MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT WITH SIZABLE AMOUNT OF AFFORDABLE
21 HOUSING AND WE HAVE BETTER DATA DUE TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
22 WITH BASIC LAND INVENTORY AND ONGOING WORK WITH LOCAL
23 JURISDICTIONS TO REVIEW CONFIRM DATA FOR PIPELINE PROJECT BASE
24 LAND USE AND ZONING. THESE IMPACTS WERE GREATER IN SOME
25 COUNTIES AND AREAS THAN OTHERS. NEXT SLIDE. PIVOTING NOW TO



January 8, 2021

1 JOBS SIMILAR STORY HERE AGAIN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ON THE LEFT
2 FINAL BLUEPRINT ON THE RIGHT. YOU WILL SEE THERE IS SOMEWHAT
3 LESS JOB GROWTH IN THE SOUTH BAY IN THIS ITERATION OF THE
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT WITH MORE GROWTH IN SAN
5 FRANCISCO, ALAMEDA, AND SOLANO COUNTIES. SILICON VALLEY
6 REMAINS REGION'S LARGEST JOB CENTER AND LARGEST LOCATION FOR
7 FUTURE JOB GROWTH. THERE IS A BIT LESS JOB GROWTH IN NORTH BAY
8 OUTSIDE OF SOLANO COUNTY, SEEING JOB DECLINE IN MARIN COUNTY
9 AS FOLKS AGE OUT OF THE WORKFORCE AND E-COMMERCE REDUCES
10 RETAIL SECTOR EMPLOYMENT. ON THE MAP YOU WILL SEE SIGNIFICANT
11 MORE JOB GROWTH IN THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES ESPECIALLY IN THE
12 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS CRITICAL FOR CLIMATE GOALS AND LES JOBS IN
13 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS THAT ALREADY HAVE A SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF
14 JOB OPPORTUNITIES NEARBY. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT LED TO THE SHIFTS
15 BETWEEN DRAFT AND FINAL. FIRST THE REPLACEMENT OF FEE BASED
16 STRATEGIES WITH AN INCENTIVE BASED APPROACH TO SHIFT LOCATION
17 OF JOBS. STRATEGY EC FIVE. THIS WAS SUCCESSFUL AT ACHIEVING A
18 SMALL TO MODERATE SHIFT OF JOBS FROM EAST BAY TO NORTH BAY.
19 FOCUSING ON CITIES NEAR BART AND RAIL STATIONS AND YOU WILL
20 SEE A SHIFT IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WITH SOME COUNTIES NO LONGER
21 FACING THE EXTREMELY HIGH REGIONAL IMPACT FEES TO EXPAND THEIR
22 OFFICES IN JOB RICH LOCATIONS SUCH AS PALO ALTO. THE OTHER
23 ECONOMIC STRATEGIES, EC4 FOCUSED MORE JOB GROWTH NEAR TRANSIT
24 BY INCREASING ALLOWABLE COMMERCIAL DENSITIES IN THESE
25 LOCATIONS ESSENTIAL TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS LOCATIONS TO



January 8, 2021

1 LOCATE MORE JOBS AND MORE HOUSING NEAR PUBLIC TRANSIT.
2 ESPECIALLY THE HIGHEST QUALITY PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. NOW I'LL
3 TURN IT OVER TO LISA ZORN TO DISCUSS FINAL KEY OUTCOMES OF THE
4 FINAL BLUEPRINT.

5

6 **LISA ZORN:** THANK YOU DAVE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE GOING TO
7 PROVIDE A HIGH LEVEL OVERVIEW OF THE EQUITY PERFORMANCE AND
8 OUTCOMES OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT NOW WHICH ARE FEATURED IN MUCH
9 GREATER DETAIL IN ATTACHMENT E. LET'S START WITH THE MOST
10 CRITICAL METRICS FOR OUR REGION, AFFORDABILITY, MODE SHIFT,
11 AND GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS. ON THE LEFT, A PIE CHART SHOWING HOW
12 A TYPICAL BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS SPENT THEIR INCOME IN 2015, WITH
13 33 PERCENT ON HOUSING AND 25 PERCENT ON TRANSPORTATION. THE
14 DRAFT BLUEPRINT MADE CONSIDERABLE HEADWAY WITH NEW HOUSING
15 STRATEGIES AND MEANS-BASED FARES AND TOLLS FOR THE
16 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. THIS IS REFLECTED BY IMPROVEMENTS SHOWN
17 IN THE CENTRAL PIE CHART. IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, YOU CAN SEE
18 THE ADDITIONAL BENEFITS PROVIDED BY THE ROBUST EXPANSION OF
19 THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION STRATEGIES
20 AND THE REDUCED SHARE OF HOUSEHOLD INCOME SPENT ON HOUSING.
21 AND YOU CAN SEE IMPACT ON PARKING STRATEGY TRANSPORTATION
22 COSTS, WHICH TICKS BACK UP A FEW POINTS [INDISCERNIBLE]
23 CONDITIONS. IN SOME, THOUGH, HOUSING PLUS TRANSPORTATION COST
24 DECLINE FROM 58 PERCENT IN 2015 TO JUST 45 PERCENT IN 2050,
25 WITH HOUSING COST FORECASTED TO BE LESS THAN TRANSPORTATION



January 8, 2021

1 COST FOR THE FIRST TIME IN DECADES. THERE ARE EVEN GREATER
2 GAINS FOR LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS, WHICH WE'LL LOOK AT MORE IN A
3 MINUTE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LET'S PIVOT NOW TO COMMUTE MODE
4 SHARES. HOW DOES THE TYPICAL WORKER GET TO WORK? IN 2015
5 NEARLY THREE QUARTERS OF WORKERS DROVE TO WORK ON A TYPICAL
6 WEEK DAY WITH THE REMAINDER TAKING TRANSIT, TELECOMMUTING,
7 WALKING OR BIKING. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INTRODUCED THE HIGHEST
8 PERFORMANCE TRANSIT INVESTMENTS AS WELL AS A 7,000 MILE
9 PROTECTED BIKE LANE NETWORK SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASING TRANSIT
10 AND WALK, BIKE MODE SHARES. TELECOMMUTING IS ALSO FORECASTED
11 TO INCREASE IN POPULARITY POST-PANDEMIC, EVEN WITHOUT PUBLIC
12 SECTOR INTERVENTION. THE FINAL BLUEPRINTS EMPLOYER FUNDED
13 COMMUTE TRIP REDUCTION PROGRAMS FUNDED BY COMBINED ADDITIONAL
14 BIKE/PED INVESTMENTS HELP TO FURTHER GROWTH THAT MODAL SHIFT.
15 NEARLY HALF THE POPULATION OPTS TO FOREGO THE AUTOMOBILE TO
16 GET TO WORK BY 2050. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS IT WAS ALLUDED TO
17 EARLIER WE ARE HAPPY TO SHARE THE GOOD NEWS ABOUT GREENHOUSE
18 EMISSIONS. THANKS TO THE AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES ADOPTED BY THE
19 MTC AND ABAG BOARDS THIS FALL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS POSED
20 TO ACHIEVE THE STATE-MANDATED GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET. THIS IS
21 CERTAINLY NOT A FOREGOING CONCLUSION. DUE TO EXTERNAL SOURCES,
22 FOR EXAMPLE, THE PRICE OF GAS IS GROWING MORE SLOWLY THAN
23 PREVIOUSLY FORECASTED. ADOPTING PLANNED BAY AREA 2040, AGAIN,
24 WOULD HAVE ACHIEVED A HANDFUL OF GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION
25 POINTS AS SHOWN ON THE SCREEN. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT CLOSED HALF



January 8, 2021

1 OF THE GAP TO THE NEWLY INCREASED 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA TARGET
2 PER PASSENGER VEHICLES BY YEAR 2035, BUT IT WASN'T ENOUGH TO
3 ACHIEVE THIS AMBITIOUS STATE-MANDATED TARGET WITH THE EXPANDED
4 SUITE OF THE 35 STRATEGIES ADOPTED THIS FALL WE ARE NOW
5 PROJECTING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT COULD ACHIEVE UP TO 22 PERCENT
6 PER CAPITA REDUCTIONS TOWARD THE SB 375 TARGET WITH EVEN
7 GREATER REAL-WORLD REDUCTIONS IF YOU COUNT STATE AND FEDERAL
8 ACTIONS TO FURTHER IMPROVE FLEET EFFICIENCY. THIS MEANS WE'RE
9 GOING INTO THE CONSULTING AND REVIEW PROCESS WITH CARB WITH A
10 PLAN THAT CLEARLY MEETS THE STATE TARGET. AND OF COURSE, THE
11 UP TO THE 22 PERCENT LANGUAGE IS INTENTIONAL. CARB COULD
12 REQUIRE EVEN MORE CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS ON SELECT STRATEGY
13 CALCULATIONS THAT COULD MOVE US BACKWARDS. FOR EXAMPLE, THE
14 GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER TO BAN NON-ELECTRIC VEHICLES IN
15 2035, CARB IS ALREADY STARTING TO [INDISCERNIBLE] HALF OF THE
16 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION ASSOCIATED WITH ELECTRIC VEHICLE
17 STRATEGIES, WHICH WOULD BE EQUIVALENT TO SEVERAL GREENHOUSE
18 GAS REDUCTION POINTS. SO, IT'S IMPORTANT TO MOVE FORWARD WITH
19 A BIT OF SLACK TO MAXIMIZE THE ODDS OF APPROVAL IN LATE 2021,
20 EARLY 2022. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LOOKING AT WHAT STRATEGIES
21 DROVE THE IMPROVEMENT IN GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION BETWEEN THE
22 DRAFT AND THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. FIRST A MENTIONED FUNDING FOR
23 THE REGIONAL ELECTRIC VEHICLE STRATEGY WAS INCREASED BY FACTOR
24 OF 8X. THIS STRATEGY WAS DESIGNED TO ACCELERATE THE BAY AREA
25 TOWARD AN ELECTRIC FUTURE FASTER THAN THE STATE AS WHOLE AND



January 8, 2021

1 HELP TO CLOSE A SIZABLE CHUNK OF THE GAP REMAINING. THE
2 COMMUTE TRIP REDUCTION PROGRAMS AT MAJOR EMPLOYERS, COMBINED
3 WITH PARKING POLICIES AND THE TRAVEL DEMAND MANAGEMENT
4 STRATEGIES HELP TO SHIFT MORE WORKERS TO TELECOMMUTING AND
5 OTHER MODES. AND THIRD, EXISTING STRATEGIES WERE REFINED TO
6 ACHIEVE GREATER GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION. THE LAND
7 USE PATTERN INFLUENCED BY HOUSING AND ECONOMY STRATEGIES IS
8 MORE FOCUSED NEAR TRANSIT. AFFORDABLE HOUSING STRATEGIES
9 PROVIDE MORE OPTIONS FOR LOW INCOME WORKERS TO LIVE CLOSER TO
10 WORK AND THE ALL LANE HIGHWAY TOLLING STRATEGY WAS EXPANDED TO
11 MORE FREEWAY CORRIDORS TO BETTER MANAGE DEMAND AND REDUCE
12 TRAFFIC CONGESTION AND THEIR ASSOCIATED EMISSIONS. NEXT SLIDE
13 PLEASE. SO NOW THAT WE HAVE COVERED SOME OF THE KEY METRICS
14 LET'S EXPLORE HOW THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTPERFORMS THE DRAFT ON
15 ALL FIVE GUIDING PRINCIPLES AND MORE IMPORTANTLY HOW TO MOVES
16 TOWARDS THE ADOPT OF VISION. HOW IT MOVES US TOWARDS THE
17 ADOPTED VISION. FOR EACH PRINCIPLE WE EVALUATE TWO QUESTIONS
18 EARLIER IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS TO ENSURE THE
19 PLAN WAS MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION STARTING WITH
20 AFFORDABILITY THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IS MORE AFFORDABLE THAN THE
21 DRAFT. BAY AREA RESIDENTS WOULD SPEND LESS ON HOUSING AND
22 TRANSPORTATION 45 PERCENT COMPARED TO 58 PERCENT IN 2015 AS WE
23 COVERED EARLIER REDUCTIONS ARE GREATER FOR LOW INCOME
24 RESIDENTS WHO SPENT A WHOPPING 113 PERCENT OF INCOME ON
25 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION IN 2015 AND DECLINES TO 58 PERCENT



January 8, 2021

1 OF INCOME IN 2050 THANKS TO ROBUST AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND
2 MEANS-BASED DISCOUNTS FOR TRANSIT AND TOLLS. WITH REGARDS TO
3 THE SECOND QUESTION, YES, THE BAY AREA WOULD PRODUCE AND
4 PRESERVE MUCH MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
5 STRATEGIES ARE IMPLEMENTED. THE NEW REGIONAL AND LOCAL REVENUE
6 MEASURES THE REGION COULD ENSURE THAT ONE QUARTER OF ALL BAY
7 AREA HOMES ARE DEED RESTRICTED BY THE YEAR 2050. NEXT SLIDE
8 PLEASE. MOVING TO CONNECTIVITY. BAY AREA RESIDENTS BE ABLE TO
9 ACCESS THEIR DESTINATIONS MORE EASILY? THE SHORT ANSWER IS
10 YES. IF YOU ARE USING PUBLIC TRANSIT, STATISTICS ON THE RIGHT
11 HAND SIDE SHOW THAT THE NUMBER OF JOBS ASSESSABLE BY TRANSIT
12 WOULD MORE THAN DOUBLE BETWEEN 2015 AND 2050 DUE TO LAND
13 DEVELOPMENT USE PATTERNS AND MORE THAN \$100 BILLION TO EXPAND
14 THE REGION'S BUS AND RAIL SYSTEMS. COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN
15 WOULD CONTINUE TO HAVE BETTER ACCESS TO REGIONAL JOB CENTERS
16 BY TRANSIT THAN THE AVERAGE BAY AREA RESIDENT. NEXT, WILL BAY
17 AREA RESIDENTS HAVE A TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT THEY CAN RELY
18 ON? FOR MOTORISTS IT'S A DEFINITE YES ROAD PRICING ON KEY
19 CORRIDOR PROVIDES LESS CONGESTION AND IMPROVES TRAVEL TIMES
20 FROM POINT A TO POINT B. REMAINING CROWDED IN 2050 EVEN WITH
21 FREQUENCY INCREASES ON MANY SYSTEMS AND NEW RAIL BUS LINES
22 HAVING BEEN CONSTRUCTED WHILE NOT A MAJOR CONCERN TODAY CROWD
23 SUGGEST SOMETHING WE NEED TO KEEP AN EYE ON IN THE MEDIUM TO
24 LONG-TERM AS RIDERS RETURN TO THE SYSTEM IN THE YEARS AND
25 DECADES AHEAD. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE MOVING ON NOW TO DIVERSITY.



January 8, 2021

1 QUESTION ONE IS, WILL BAY AREA COMMUNITIES BE MORE INCLUSIVE?
2 THE ANSWER IS YES TO A LIMITED DEGREE. IN THE STATISTICS ON
3 THE RIGHT HAND SIDE THE AFFORDABLE STRATEGIES AS WELL AS
4 PROVIDE MORTGAGE ASSISTANCE TO LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES TO HELP
5 BECOME FIRST TIME HOMEOWNERS ENABLE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS TO
6 BECOME MORE DIVERSE FROM 20 PERCENT RESIDENTS HAVING LOW
7 INCOMES IN 2015 TO 24 PERCENT IN 2050 IN ADDITION THE RHNA
8 METHODOLOGY ACCELERATES NEAR-TERM GROWTH TO FURTHER FAIR
9 HOUSING IN THE EARLY YEAR OF THE PLAN CYCLE. NEXT QUESTION IS
10 WILL BAY AREA RESIDENTS BE ABLE TO STAY IN PLACE? THE ANSWER
11 IS IT DEPENDS ON WHERE THEY LIVE. SOME ARE VISIBLE IN
12 STATISTICS LIKE THE SHARE OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHY TRACKS AT RISK
13 OF DISPLACEMENT SHOWN ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE DUE TO AFFORDABLE
14 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. DISPLACEMENT RISKS
15 REMAIN HIGH IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. MANY HOUSEHOLDS ARE
16 MOVING TO OTHER GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES NOT BEING DISPLACED TO THE
17 REGION'S PERIPHERY AND BEYOND BUT STILL SHOWING UP IN THE
18 METRIC RESULTS. AND RENTER PROTECTION STRATEGIES ARE NOT ABLE
19 TO BE FULLY CAPTURED IN OUR MODELING AND DON'T SHOW UP IN THE
20 DATA POINT ON THE SCREEN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO MOVING ON TO
21 ENVIRONMENTAL AND PUBLIC HEALTH. BAY AREA RESIDENTS WILL BE
22 HEALTHIER AND SAFER AS A RESULT OF FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES.
23 IN ADDITION EARLIER POINTS ABOUT RESILIENCE, CLIMATE AND
24 NATURAL LANDS PROTECTION. THE FINAL BLUEPRINT INVESTS IN PARK
25 AND OPEN SPACE WITH EMPHASIS ON ACHIEVING MORE EQUITABLE



January 8, 2021

1 OUTCOMES AS SHOWN ON THE RIGHT SIDE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN
2 HAVE FEWER PARKS TODAY THAN WEALTHIER WHITER COMMUNITIES. WITH
3 STRATEGIC INVESTMENTS, WE'RE ABLE TO CLOSE THE GAP BY 2050
4 WITH NEW PARKS AND OPEN SPACE STRATEGIES. FURTHERMORE, THE
5 ENVIRONMENT OF THE BAY AREA WILL BE HEALTHIER AND SAFER. NEW
6 STRATEGIES IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT REDUCE EMISSIONS FROM NON-
7 TRANSPORTATION SECTORS WHILE CREATING MIDDLE WAGE JOBS IN THE
8 PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS A QUICK SIDE BAR WE'LL BE
9 SHARING A BIT MORE WITH THE ABAG BOARD IN JANUARY ON THE
10 INTEGRATION OF RESILIENCE WHICH WE HAVE HIGHLIGHTED IN
11 PREVIOUS BLUEPRINT PRESENTATIONS. WE JUST WANT TO REMIND
12 EVERYONE THAT THE DRAFT AND FINAL BLUEPRINT INCLUDE A SUITE OF
13 STRATEGIES TO ATTACK WILDFIRE RISK, SEA LEVEL RISE, SEISMIC
14 AND DROUGHT DEFICIENCIES, AND MORE. FOR THE SAKE OF TIME
15 TODAY, WE'LL REFER YOU TO ATTACHMENT G IN THE PACKET WHICH
16 WILL FURTHER PROVIDE CONTEXT ON THIS IMPORTANT ISSUE. NEXT
17 SLIDE PLEASE. CONTINUING TO OUR FINAL GUIDING PRINCIPLE WHICH
18 IS ECONOMIC VIBRANCY. FOR THE QUESTION, WILL JOBS AND HOUSING
19 BE MORE BALANCED IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT? ABSOLUTELY. A
20 CONTINUED FOCUS ON SOUTH BAY AND WEST BAY HOUSING, ESPECIALLY
21 AFFORDABLE HOUSING COMBINED WITH STRATEGIES TO SHIFT SOME JOBS
22 TOWARDS EAST BAY AND NORTH BAY RAIL STATIONS HAS PAID OFF. THE
23 COMBINED WEST BAY AND SOUTH BAY SUBREGIONS STRETCHING FROM SAN
24 FRANCISCO TO SILICON VALLEY IS THE MOST JOB RICH AREA IN THE
25 BAY AREA TODAY. WITH A FINAL BLUEPRINT WE GO FROM 1.8 JOBS PER



January 8, 2021

1 HOME IN THAT AREA TO JUST 1.5 JOBS PER HOME. FURTHERMORE
2 COMMUTE DISTANCES DECLINED SLIGHTLY THANKS TO THE MORE
3 BALANCED LANDS USE PATTERN. AND THE FINAL QUESTION IS, WILL
4 THE BAY AREA ECONOMY THRIVE? WE BELIEVE THE ANSWER REMAINS
5 YES. DESPITE ALL THE CHALLENGES OF 2020 THE REGION IS AN
6 INNOVATION POWERHOUSE WITH DIVERSE COMMUNITIES IN ABUNDANT AND
7 NATURAL AND CULTURAL AMENITIES. THESE REVENUE MEASURES IN THE
8 DECADES AHEAD CAN HELP US REINVEST IN THE REGION WE CALL HOME
9 AND TACKLING SOME OF THE BIGGEST CHALLENGES. STRATEGIES TO
10 CREATE NEW JOBS AND HELPFUL STARTS FOR BUSINESSES PLAY A KEY
11 ROLE TO JUMP-STARTING JOB GROWTH SPECIFICALLY IN CRITICAL
12 PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS IN THE YEARS AHEAD. NEXT SLIDE
13 PLEASE. THAT WRAPS UP OUR WALK THROUGH OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
14 OUTCOMES. WE HAVE HELD SEVERAL WEBINARS IN THE LAST THREE
15 WEEKS AND CONTINUE RUNNING WINTER OFFICE HOURS. IN THE PROGRAM
16 WE HAVE BEEN ANSWERING QUESTIONS, AND MORE INFORMATION IS
17 AVAILABLE IN YOUR PACKET AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO DAVE TO WRAP
18 UP TODAY'S PRESENTATION. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANK YOU LISA AND
19 THANKS FOR YOUR PATIENCE IN WALKING THROUGH THE DETAILED
20 OVERVIEW OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. I WANT TO CLOSE WITH TWO LAST
21 SLIDES HERE. KEY QUESTION IS WHAT'S NEXT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA
22 2050 AFTER THIS MONTH'S PROPOSED ACTION? THE KEY FOCUS FOR
23 2021, THE FINAL YEAR OF THIS FOUR YEAR PROCESS WILL BE
24 IMPLEMENTATION. OUR STRONG COMMITMENT TO ROBUST PUBLIC
25 ENGAGEMENT CONTINUES EVEN AS WE ENTER THE SECOND AND HOPEFULLY



January 8, 2021

1 FINAL YEAR OF THE PANDEMIC. THIS WINTER WE'LL BE FOCUSING ON
2 GETTING FEEDBACK ON THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WITH SMALL GROUP
3 MEETINGS AND COMMUNITY FOCUS GROUPS TO DISCUSS IDEAS FOR
4 IMPLEMENTATION. WE'RE DOING ONLINE TEXT BASED SURVEY TO
5 FURTHER PRIORITIZE STRATEGIES FOR ACCELERATION OVER THE FIVE
6 YEAR PERIOD AND IN THE SPRING WE ANTICIPATE RELEASE OF THE
7 DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN DRAFT DOCUMENT AND EIR. YOU CAN SEE
8 THE PUBLICATION AND INFORMATION EFFORTS ON THE SCREEN THAT WE
9 PROVIDED A SPOTLIGHT ON LAST MONTH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OF
10 COURSE SPEAKING OF THE EIR GIVEN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT ADDRESSES
11 ALL FIVE AREAS INCLUDING MEETING AND EXCEEDING THE GREENHOUSE
12 GAS EMISSIONS TARGET AS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT ALL THROUGH 2020.
13 AND THAT IT PRESERVES THE AREAS OF SUCCESS FROM THE DRAFT
14 BLUEPRINT. IT IS OUR STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO ADVANCE THE FINAL
15 BLUEPRINT AS THE FINAL ALTERNATIVE FOR THE PLAN 2050
16 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT. WE'LL BE STUDYING AGAINST A
17 PROJECT ALTERNATIVE AS WELL AS OTHER ALTERNATIVES CURRENTLY
18 UNDER DEVELOPMENT BASED ON COMMENTS RECEIVED DURING THE
19 SCOPING PROCESS SPECIFICALLY TO UNDERSTAND ENVIRONMENTAL
20 IMPACTS AND SEEING IF THERE ARE ALTERNATIVES TO ACHIEVE THE
21 PLAN'S OBJECTIVES THAT HAVE FEWER IMPACT ON THE ENVIRONMENT.
22 AND RESOLUTION 4451 AND RESOLUTION 2021 RESPECTFULLY FOR
23 APPROVAL THAT THE PLAN CAN BE ADOPTED THIS FALL. THANK YOU.
24 WE'RE HAPPY TO ADDRESS ANY QUESTIONS.
25



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY
2 COMMISSIONER OR BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS? CINDY CHAVEZ?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THANKS, I FEEL FOR YOU.
5 YOU ALL HAVE MADE THIS PRESENTATION TO US SO MANY TIMES AND
6 KIND OF FEATHERING ALL THIS NEW INFORMATION IN, I APPRECIATE
7 IT. ONE THING I WANTED TO MAKE SURE I UNDERSTOOD WAS THAT YOU
8 RAISED AN INTERESTING POINT ABOUT THE RULEMAKING THAT CARB MAY
9 MAKE RELATIVE TO OUR PLAN, AND I WANT TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THE
10 IMPLICATIONS OF THAT, AND WHETHER OR NOT THERE SHOULD BE A
11 VERY DIRECT RESPONSE TO WHO GETS CREDIT FOR WHAT? BECAUSE
12 THAT'S WHAT I THINK THIS IS ABOUT. BUT COULD YOU MAKE SURE I
13 UNDERSTAND THAT? >DAVE VAUTIN: SO THIS IS AN EXCELLENT
14 QUESTION BECAUSE IT'S AN AREA THAT THERE ARE SHADES OF GRAY
15 HERE AND IT'S NOT IN THE STATE'S RULES AREN'T ALWAYS SUPER
16 CLEAR. WHAT WE'RE ENTERING IS A PERIOD OF THE PROCESS WITH
17 CARB WHERE WE CONTINUE TO REVIEW TECHNOLOGICAL ASSUMPTIONS.
18 AND WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH THEM FOR MORE THAN A YEAR ON
19 THIS. IT WILL LIKELY EXTEND THROUGH MUCH OF 2021. WE HAVE
20 HEARD THEY HAVE STARTED TO FLOAT THE IDEA WITH OTHER MPOS TO
21 ENSURE THE ELECTRICAL VEHICLE STRATEGIES SHOULD BE SOME SORT
22 OF 5050 SPLIT THIS IS MOVING FORWARD ON THE EXECUTIVE ORDER.
23 WE'RE GOING TO SEE HOW THOSE CONVERSATIONS GO THIS YEAR.
24 ULTIMATELY CARB DOES HAVE APPROVAL AUTHORITY ON THE ASSUMPTION
25 IN THE PLAN AS WELL AS ON THE FINAL PLAN AND WE ANTICIPATE



January 8, 2021

1 IT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO BE RESOLVED IN THE NEXT FEW
2 MONTHS BUT WILL PROBABLY LAST ALL THROUGH 2021 AND MAYBE INTO
3 EARLY 2022. THE SHORT ANSWER IS, A LOT MORE CONVERSATION HAS
4 TO HAPPEN AND THERE HASN'T BEEN A TON OF CLARITY FROM THE
5 STATE ON HOW IT'S GOING TO PROCEED IN TERMS OF DIVVYING UP
6 CREDIT FOR THAT.

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I GUESS WHAT I'M WONDERING IS, IS THIS ONE OF
9 THOSE AREAS THAT WE NEED A LEGISLATIVE FIX TO, SO AS TO INCENT
10 BEHAVIOR, AND ALSO NOT TO PUT US IN A BOX TO MAKING CHOICES
11 THAT VERGE ON THE RIDICULOUS. YOU KNOW WHAT I MEAN. SO THAT'S
12 -- IS IT PART OF OUR LEGISLATIVE STRATEGY TOO? >DAVE VAUTIN:
13 YES IT IS. AND I WOULD --

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE -- LET ME TAKE
16 THAT. THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.
17 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, I THINK WHAT YOU'RE HIGHLIGHTING IS ONE
18 OF THE KEY ELEMENTS OF OUR THINKING GOING FORWARD, WHICH IS
19 THE BROADER NEED TO LOOK -- TO DO AN ASSESSMENT ON THE
20 EFFECTIVENESS OF SB 375. MUCH OF THESE TARGETS THAT WE ARE
21 GIVEN, NOT JUST. GHG, HOUSING OTHER AND THINGS, ALL DERIVE
22 FROM THAT BODY OF WORK. AND I THINK WE RECOGNIZE, AS OTHER
23 REGIONS AROUND THE STATE, THAT TEN YEARS IN, THERE ARE SOME
24 THINGS WORKING WELL, AND OTHERS, PARTICULARLY, THIS RIGIDITY
25 THAT'S ATTACHED TO THE ANALYTICS OF HOW YOU ACHIEVE VARIOUS



January 8, 2021

1 GOALS AND PARTNERSHIPS THAT WE BELIEVE WARRANT A DEEPER DIVE,
2 AND SO I WOULD SAY THAT'S THE LARGEST ARENA WHERE WE NEED TO
3 TAKE A LOOK AT THAT.

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THAT'S HELPFUL. THANKS.

6

7 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. NICK JOSEFOWITZ? NICK?

8

9 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I THINK THIS IS
10 REALLY ENCOURAGING THAT ON SO MANY OF THE METRICS, THIS FINAL
11 BLUEPRINT IS DOING A LOT BETTER THAN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT, AND
12 THAT WE ARE KIND OF RETAINING THIS LEVEL OF AMBITION NOT TO
13 JUST KIND OF HIT THE TARGETS, BUT TO EXCEED THEM. BECAUSE
14 OFTEN THE TARGETS ARE NOT ENOUGH FOR OUR REGION. AND SO, ON
15 CLIMATE, AND ON AFFORDABILITY, I THINK IT'S REALLY
16 ENCOURAGING. I DID GET MY E-MAIL BLOWN UP OVER THE PAST FEW
17 DAYS BY FOLKS IN SAN FRANCISCO GOVERNMENT ABOUT, SORT OF NOT
18 REALLY UNDERSTANDING WHERE THERE WAS A SHIFT IN HOUSING FROM,
19 SORT OF, VERY JOBS RICH COMMUNITY IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, LIKE
20 CUPERTINO, TO SAN FRANCISCO, IN PARTICULAR, TO THE SOUTHEAST
21 OF THE CITY, IN SAN FRANCISCO, WHICH IS NOT A HIGH RESOURCE
22 SET OF COMMUNITIES. AND I KNOW I SENT YOU AN E-MAIL ABOUT,
23 THIS AND I HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO READ YOUR RESPONSE, DAVE,
24 BUT I JUST WANTED TO BRING UP THIS. BECAUSE I THINK THIS IS --
25 IT -- EVEN AFTER READING YOUR RESPONSE, IT DOESN'T QUITE --



January 8, 2021

1 I'M STILL NOT QUITE UNDERSTANDING WHY, SORT OF, BETWEEN THE
2 DRAFT, AND THE FINAL, WE HAVE SHIFTED A BUNCH OF JOBS OUT OF
3 CUPERTINO INTO POOR BLACK AND BROWN COMMUNITIES IN THE
4 SOUTHEAST -- WE HAVE SHIFTED HOUSING FROM CUPERTINO TO POOR
5 BLACK AND BROWN COMMUNITY IN SOUTHEAST SAN FRANCISCO.

6

7 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** MATT, DID YOU WANT TO RESPOND
8 TO THAT?

9

10 **MATT MALONEY:** IT LOOKS LIKE DAVE WILL DO THIS ONE. >DAVE
11 VAUTIN: THIS IS A PROCESS OF 35 STRATEGIES, A LOT OF
12 COMPLICATED INTERACTION, AND DATA. I'LL TRY TO BREAK IT DOWN.
13 WE KNOW THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DIDN'T MEET THE GREENHOUSE GAS
14 TARGET. ONE OF THE WAYS TO CLOSE THAT GAP IS THROUGH THE LOWER
15 GHG LAND USE PATTERN. IDENTIFIED THE WAY STRATEGIES WERE
16 TWEAKED TO SHIFT HOUSING AND JOBS TOWARDS SOME OF THE MORE
17 TRANSIT-RICH PLACES IN OUR REGION. THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT WE'RE
18 SEEING IN THE GROWTH PATTERN. YOU KNOW, YES, PARTS OF THE
19 SOUTH BAY DO HAVE TRANSIT-RICH NEIGHBORHOODS. BUT, COMPARED TO
20 THE FREQUENCY AND THE COVERAGE OF SERVICE IN A PLACE LIKE SAN
21 FRANCISCO OR SOME OF THE OTHER TRANSIT-RICH PLACES IN THE
22 REGION THE LEVEL OF GHG PER CAPITA IN SAN FRANCISCO IS LOWER
23 EVEN IN AREAS OF THE SOUTH BAY. SO THOSE STRATEGIES DID LEAD
24 TO SOME OF THE HOUSING SHIFTING TO PLACES LIKE SOMA, AND THE
25 NORTH EASTERN NEIGHBORHOODS OF SAN FRANCISCO, THE WEST SIDE



January 8, 2021

1 HIS SEEN HOUSING GROWTH LARGE TRANSIT-RICH HIGH RESOURCE
2 AREAS. THESE STRATEGIES INCREASE CAPACITY IN THOSE LOCATIONS
3 AND WE'RE SEEING MORE HOUSING IN THE CITY AS A RESULT. THE
4 OTHER THING AS I WALK THROUGH WE DID SIMPLY HAVE BETTER DATA
5 AND ONE OF THE THINGS IN SAN FRANCISCO IS WE REFLECT THE FULL
6 SET OF PIPELINES IN THE CITY WHICH LEAD TO MORE HOUSING GROWTH
7 OVERALL IN SAN FRANCISCO. THE LAND USE PATTERN THAT IS IN THE
8 FINAL BLUEPRINT BECAUSE OF ITS GROWTH IN SAN FRANCISCO AND
9 SOME OTHER TRANSIT-RICH PLACES DID ACHIEVE BETTER GREENHOUSE
10 GAS PERFORMANCE. WITH REGARDS TO SOME OF THE SOUTH BAY
11 COMMUNITIES SOME KEY STRATEGIES THAT WERE PRECLUDING ANY
12 SIGNIFICANT JOB GROWTH AND REALLY PROMOTING HOUSING GROWTH IN
13 THOSE AREAS WERE REPEALED AS PART OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
14 ACTION. SO WE DO SEE A BIT LESS HOUSING GROWTH STILL VERY HIGH
15 RHNA NUMBERS FOR THOSE LOCATIONS WITH LARGE SHARES, YOU KNOW,
16 I THINK AROUND 25 PERCENT INCREASE IN HOUSING AND COMMUNITIES
17 LIKE PALO ALTO AND CUPERTINO IN FINAL BLUEPRINT DATA BUT THERE
18 WERE SOME STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT THAT DID
19 LEAD TO SHIFTS THERE.

20

21 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I REALLY --

22

23 **MATT MALONEY:** I WILL ADD TO WHAT DAVE MENTIONED IN TERMS OF
24 FAIRNESS AND EQUITY. YOU KNOW, THAT IS, IN THE RHNA PROCESS,
25 WE HAVE ESTABLISHES METRICS AND TARGETS ESSENTIALLY FOR



January 8, 2021

1 EQUITY, AND AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. MOVING INTO
2 THIS FINAL BLUEPRINT IN THE NEW METHODOLOGY WE CONTINUE TO
3 ACHIEVE THOSE TARGETS AS A REGION. SO I DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
4 THAT IT'S VERY TEMPTING TO LOOK AT TWO OR THREE JURISDICTIONS
5 AND LOOK AT THE SHIFTS, AND KIND OF ASK WHAT'S GOING ON, BUT,
6 AS A REGION, AS A NINE COUNTY BAY AREA, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE
7 RHNA PROCESS, WE ARE CONTINUING TO ACHIEVE THE FAIR HOUSING
8 TARGET, WHILE WE ALSO ACHIEVE THE GREENHOUSE TARGET IN THE
9 PLAN. THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT THESE TWO PROCESSES
10 ACCOMPLISH BOTH OF THOSE THINGS.

11
12 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT COMMENT. AND I
13 KNOW HOW COMPLICATED IT IS TO SORT OF MANAGE ALL THE DIFFERENT
14 FACTORS HERE. AND I WANTED TO RAISE IT, AND MAYBE WE CAN FIND
15 AN OPPORTUNITY TO SIT DOWN WITH SOME OF THE STAFF OF THE CITY
16 OF SAN FRANCISCO TO KIND OF GO OVER THEIR CONCERNS AROUND
17 THIS. SO -- AND I WANTED TO MAKE ONE MORE POINT. I THINK THE
18 MODELING IS TERRIFIC. AND I HAVE LEARNED SO MUCH ABOUT THESE
19 POLICIES THAT WE GRAPPLE WITH EVERYDAY. I HOPE THAT AS WE MOVE
20 INTO THE IMPLEMENTATION PHASE, WE CAN CONTINUE TO GROUND THE
21 MODEL, THE SORT OF IMPACT THAT THESE VARIOUS STRATEGIES HAVE,
22 ON THE KIND OF GOALS THAT WE HAVE SET OURSELVES, AS TO HOW WE
23 KIND OF PRIORITIZE AS WE GO FORWARD. AND I HOPE THE MODELING
24 DOESN'T TURN INTO A KIND OF, OKAY, WE HAVE DONE THAT GOTTEN
25 COMPLIANCE AND NOW IT'S ALL EIR. I HOPE WE CONTINUE TO GROUND



January 8, 2021

1 OUR WORK IN THE DATA-DRIVEN APPROACH THAT MAKES WHAT YOU'RE
2 DOING SO POWERFUL AND SUCCESSFUL.

3

4 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** I APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION AND WORK THAT WENT
7 INTO THIS. THERE IS A LOT TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT CHANGING FROM
8 EXPANDING INCENTIVES BY INCREASING FOCUS ON AFFORDABLE. BUT I
9 WANT TO FOCUS ON WHAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ FOCUSED ON WHICH
10 IS THE HOUSING GROWTH JOB ASSUMPTIONS IN SAN FRANCISCO. IT'S A
11 53 PERCENT INCREASE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT AND INCREASE OF UNITS
12 ALONE FROM 139,000 TO 213,000. SO, YOU KNOW, JUST TAKING ALL
13 OF THIS INTO CONSIDERATION, I WOULD JUST, AGAIN, URGE -- YOU
14 KNOW, I'M UNDERSTANDING THAT THERE IS A DEADLINE THAT HAS TO
15 BE MET WITH PLANNED BAY AREA. I WOULD INITIALLY SAY WE SHOULD
16 NOT MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS FINAL BLUEPRINT AS ITS DRAFTED
17 TODAY, HOWEVER RECOGNIZING THE DEADLINE PRESSURE WE'RE UNDER,
18 I SUGGEST WE MOVE IT WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION AND THEN URGE
19 THESE CONVERSATIONS TO HAPPEN ON THE GROUND IN TERMS OF WITH
20 THE SAN FRANCISCO'S PLANNING DEPARTMENT FIRST TO JUST
21 UNDERSTAND HOW THESE ASSUMPTIONS HAPPENED, MAKING SURE WE'RE
22 NOT SETTING UNREALISTIC EXPECTATIONS IN THESE HOUSING GOALS AS
23 WELL. THERE ARE SERIOUS EQUITY CONCERNS INVOLVED THAT I HAVE
24 ALONGSIDE THIS. SO I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT FOR NOW.

25



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** HEY, MATT, I DON'T KNOW THAT
2 I SUPPORT THAT RECOMMENDATION, THAT WE DON'T MOVE FORWARD.
3 THERE'S BEEN TOO MUCH TIME, EFFORT, AND ANALYSIS GONE INTO
4 THIS. BUT IS THERE GOING TO BE ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS
5 THIS? I THINK JESSE WAS TALKING ABOUT, THIS IS GOING TO BE AN
6 ISSUE THAT ABAG IS GOING TO BE DEALING WITH. IS THERE GOING TO
7 BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE?

8

9 **MATT MALONEY:** I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT RHNA IS ON A
10 PARALLEL TRACK ON A DIFFERENT TRACK AND DIFFERENT APPROVAL
11 PROCESS FOR THAT. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HAS A LOT TO DO WITH
12 THE RHNA METHODOLOGY, BUT THERE IS THINGS WE CAN DO, SORT OF
13 PURELY FOCUSING ON THE RHNA SIDE TO ADDRESS ISSUES. SO, YOU
14 KNOW, THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, YOU KNOW, CAN TAKE UP, SORT
15 OF, JUST THE ISSUE OF THE RHNA METHODOLOGY ITSELF. AND AS I
16 MENTIONED, THERE IS ALSO A PROCESS, YOU KNOW, THIS SUMMER, VIA
17 APPEALS WITH THE JURISDICTIONS. SO THAT IS ALL YET TO COME. SO
18 I THINK, ON A STAFF LEVEL, YOU KNOW, OUR PREFERENCE WOULD BE
19 CERTAINLY TO MOVE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FORWARD, SINCE IT
20 INCORPORATES YOU KNOW, THESE 35 STRATEGIES THAT WERE APPROVED
21 BY THESE BODIES. TO MOVE THAT FORWARD, IT'S A COMPLIANT PLAN
22 AT THE STATE LEVEL. BUT TO, YOU KNOW, TO KIND OF ADDRESS ANY
23 ISSUES WITH RHNA, OVER ON THE ABAG SIDE.

24



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** SO THE ISSUES THAT EDDIA
2 RAISING. IF WE GO FORWARD TODAY, IS THERE GOING TO BE AN
3 OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THOSE ISSUES THAT HE IS RAISING TODAY?

4

5 **MATT MALONEY:** THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THOSE ISSUES VIA
6 DISCUSSIONS ABOUT THE RHNA DRAFT.

7

8 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THAT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT
9 WITH THE ADJUSTMENT THAT WAS MADE THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE AN
10 OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS THAT ITEM. AIM E BEFORE YOU GO TO YOU,
11 GINA, CAN YOU UNMUTE YOURSELF, TO SEE IF YOU CAN PLUG IN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

14

15 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GO AHEAD. GINA
16 TEXTED SOMETIME AGO AND WAS HAVING TROUBLE RAISING HER HAND.
17 GO AHEAD GINA.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** I DID FIGURE IT OUT. AGAIN MY CONCERN S AND I
20 DON'T KNOW HOW MANY TIMES I HAVE TO REITERATE THIS. I GET THE
21 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION THING BUT IT SEEMS LIKE STAFF KEEPS
22 IGNORING RESEARCH, EXISTING RESEARCH, ON LAND USE IMPACTS ON
23 TRANSIT. DAVE, I THINK, JUST ONCE AGAIN, MENTIONED DEVELOPING
24 HOUSING ON BART PARKING LOTS, THE FIASCO, AND THE TRAGEDY THAT
25 HAPPENED IN MILLBRAE HERE WAS THAT HOUSING WAS PUT IN WITHOUT



January 8, 2021

1 FIRST ADDRESSING ACCESS TO TRANSPORTATION. I THINK, I HOPE, WE
2 CAN ALL AGREE, THAT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES, WE NEED TO
3 GET PEOPLE ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. IF YOU ARE REMOVING PARKING, AND
4 YOU DON'T EMPHASIZE ACCESS TO TRANSIT CENTERS, OR TRANSIT
5 STATIONS, PEOPLE WILL NOT TAKE TRANSIT. I GET HOUSING AROUND
6 TRANSIT. BUT IF THIS PLAN KEEPS IGNORING THE STUDY, WHICH I
7 HAVE SENT ON MULTIPLE TIMES HERE, SAN FRANCISCO DID THE STUDY,
8 I MEAN, WE'RE SHOOTING OURSELVES IN THE FOOT. WE HAVE TO HAVE
9 A BALANCE BETWEEN THE GREENHOUSE GASSES, GETTING PEOPLE ON
10 TRANSIT, HOUSING, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT. BUT, YET, I KEEP
11 HEARING STAFF SAYING, THESE THINGS WHICH SEEM TO IGNORE THAT.
12 AND, AGAIN, THIS STAFF, A LOT OF HARD WORK AND EFFORT. I GET
13 THAT. IS THROUGHOUT, THIS YOU KEEP CALLING IT THE FINAL PLAN,
14 THE FINAL PLAN, YET WE STILL HAVE TO KEEP TWEAKING IT. THE
15 FINAL PLAN WAS 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE OR WHAT, AND WE HAVE TO
16 TWEAK THAT TOO. WE WANT THE BEST POSSIBLE PLAN. I DON'T KNOW
17 WHAT I HAVE TO DO HERE TO GET STAFF TO RECOGNIZE THE
18 ESTABLISHED RESEARCH. I DON'T DO THE RESEARCH. BUT THE
19 RESEARCH WHICH SHOWS WE NEED TO REALLY ENHANCE OUR ACCESS TO
20 TRANSIT. INSTEAD OF KEEP EXPANDING IT WITHOUT REPERCUSSIONS TO
21 WHAT'S ALREADY THERE. PLEASE, HELP ME TO GET THAT RECOGNITION
22 IN THERE, SO WE'RE NOT MAKING MISTAKES AND WE'RE NOT
23 DECONSTRUCTING THE STRAIGHT WE ALREADY HAVE, AND ACCESS TO
24 THAT TRANSIT. SO, AGAIN, I'LL INVITE STAFF DOWN TO OUR AREA TO



January 8, 2021

1 SEE WHAT'S HAPPENING HERE. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THESE THREE
2 ELEMENTS ALL WORK TOGETHER. PLEASE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU GINA. AMY, AND THEN
5 DAMON.

6

7 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF
8 FOR THE EXCELLENT PRESENTATION TODAY. THE CITIES IN OUR COUNTY
9 CONTINUE TO HAVE THIS QUESTION ABOUT THIS CHANGE THAT HAPPENED
10 WITHIN THIS BOX JUST RECENTLY AND PEOPLE ARE STRUGGLING WITH
11 HOW TO UNDERSTAND THIS MASSIVE, YOU KNOW, HUGE SHIFT OF
12 HOUSING, AND THE JOBS NUMBERS. SO I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO TAKE
13 THE OPPORTUNITY TO SIT DOWN WITH STAFF, WITH A FEW OF OUR
14 PLANNERS TO REALLY UNDERSTAND WHAT HAPPENED. BECAUSE WE STILL
15 ARE GRAPPLING WITH THAT. AND I GUESS THE CONCERN -- SO, I
16 THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO LOOK AT THOSE CHANGES, AND, I
17 GUESS, TRY TO UNDERSTAND THAT FROM A GREENHOUSE ASSUMPTION,
18 THE ASSUMPTION IS THAT THOSE ADDITIONAL, THAT INCREASE IN
19 JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE IS GOING TO BE TAKEN CARE OF BY
20 TELECOMMUTING. THAT'S WHAT SEEMS TO BE THE CASE. THE CHALLENGE
21 IS WITH LONG-TERM PLANNING IS YOU HAVE TO DEAL WITH IT IN
22 CONTEXT OF WHAT'S GOING ON AROUND US. IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR
23 STAFF TO PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO, WE'RE DOING LONG-RANGE PLANNING
24 ON THE BASIS OF ASSUMPTIONS BUT WE HAVE SEEN A LOT RECENTLY IN
25 THE MEDIA THERE WAS A COLUMN IN THE EAST BAY TIMES THE OTHER



January 8, 2021

1 DAY THAT TALKED ABOUT INTERVIEWING, YOU KNOW, THE BAY AREA
2 COUNCIL, SOME OF THESE JOB AND HUGE CORPORATE SHIFTS, HOUSING
3 SHIFTS, POPULATION DECLINE, AT WHAT POINT DO WE START TO SAY,
4 OKAY SOME OF THESE CHANGES ARE SIGNIFICANTLY REALLY REAL AND
5 THEY'RE GOING TO IMPACT OUR PLAN? IS THAT -- DO WE DO THAT TO
6 SORT OF TRY TO ANTICIPATE THAT NOW? OR DOWN THE ROAD? THE
7 REALITY, FOR EXAMPLE, IN SOME OF THESE HOUSING NUMBERS, THE
8 REALITY, THOSE ARE REAL NUMBERS, AND WE OBVIOUSLY WANT TO BE
9 ABLE TO PROVIDE THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS THAT THE REGION
10 REQUIRES, BUT THE QUESTION S YOU KNOW, HOW DO WE FEEL THAT
11 THIS PANDEMIC, AND THIS SHIFTING ECONOMIC IMPACT IS GOING TO
12 IMPACT THESE PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS? I DON'T NEED AN ANSWER NOW.
13 BUT I DO THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR STAFF TO PROVIDE SOME
14 INSIGHT TO SOME OF THESE QUESTIONS. THESE ARE BEING RAISED IN
15 THE PUBLIC IN AND AROUND CALIFORNIA IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO
16 HAVE SOME INSIGHT INTO THE ANSWERS IS HOW WE APPROACH THAT.
17 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU AMY. DAMIAN AND
20 THEN CARLOS.

21

22 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** THANK YOU CHAIR. JUST STICKING WITH THE KIND
23 OF DISCUSSION THIS MORNING AROUND JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND
24 HOW WE'RE ACHIEVING THE STATE OF GOALS. MARIN WITH REGARD TO
25 THE FINAL PLAN AND DRAFT IT LOOKS LIKE ASSUMED JOBS CREATION



January 8, 2021

1 HAS DECREASED BY 14 PERCENT AND THERE IS ACTUALLY NOW A
2 SLIGHTLY NEGATIVE NUMBER. ON THE OTHER HAND, PROJECTIONS FOR
3 INCREASE IN HOUSING IS AT ABOUT 34 PERCENT. SO JUST WANTED TO
4 DIG DOWN ON THAT A LITTLE BIT UNDERSTANDING THE CONVERSATIONS
5 WILL BE ONGOING, HOW DOES THAT FIT IN WITH ACHIEVING THE
6 STRATEGIES AND PARTICULARLY WITH RESPECT TO ISSUES LIKE
7 IMPACTS ON THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM?

8

9 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** MATT, DO YOU OR DAVE WANT TO
10 COMMENT ON IT? >DAVE VAUTIN: I CAN SPEAK A BIT TO THE MARIN
11 NARRATIVE THERE. FIRST OF ALL, THERE ARE SOME EXPANDED HOUSING
12 STRATEGIES IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT THAT DO HAVE IMPACTS ON
13 MARIN. INCLUDES FOCUSING MORE HOUSING GROWTH NEAR THE SMART
14 STATIONS TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND USE OF THAT SYSTEM
15 THAT'S PART OF THE PUZZLE THERE. IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER
16 THE PLAN IS NOT JUST ABOUT GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. THE
17 INTEGRATION OF HIGH RESOURCE AREAS IN THE PLAN IS REALLY
18 IMPORTANT FOR SOCIAL EQUITY GOALS. SO I -- WE DEFINITELY
19 RECOGNIZE THAT THE JOB GROWTH IN MARIN IS NOT EXPECTED TO BE
20 ANY OF THESE THINGS SIGNIFICANT AND SEEING SOME SMALL DECLINES
21 ACTUALLY BUT PROVIDING ACCESS TO AMENITIES, SCHOOLS OTHER
22 OPPORTUNITIES MARIN COUNTY HAS PROVIDE BENEFITS FOR THE BAY
23 AREA POPULATION AS WELL. IT'S A SMALL SHARE OF THE REGION'S
24 HOUSING GROWTH I THINK THREE PERCENT OF THE GROWTH IS
25 ANTICIPATED FOR MARIN COUNTY AND THAT IS REFLECTIVE OF TRYING



January 8, 2021

1 TO ADDRESS DECADES OF LIMITED PRODUCTION, VERY LIMITED
2 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE COUNTY AND OPENING UP OPPORTUNITY TO
3 OPEN UP A BROADER SWATH OF THE POPULATION.

4

5 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** JUST A QUICK FOLLOW UP AND AGAIN WE CAN
6 CONTINUE THE CONVERSATION. IS IT FAIR -- I THINK THIS GOES TO
7 MATT'S EARLIER POINT -- IF YOU ARE LOOKING SUBREGIONALLY, IT'S
8 IMPORTANT TO DISTINGUISH THAT FROM, OR JUST UNDERSTAND GOING
9 IN, THAT WHEN WE SAY WE'RE ACHIEVING THE GOALS, INCLUDING
10 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS, SUBREGIONALLY, THERE MAY BE
11 DIFFERENT PERFORMANCE THAN THE REGION OVERALL. IS THAT A FAIR
12 STATEMENT? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES, I WOULD SAY THAT'S A FAIR
13 STATEMENT. JUST AS WE WERE TALKING ABOUT SAN FRANCISCO, THE
14 MORE FOCUSED GROWTH IN SAN FRANCISCO IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IS
15 ONE OF THE KEY CONTRIBUTORS TO MOVING FORWARD ON THE CLIMATE
16 TARGETS.

17

18 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** CARLOS THEN JAKE WILL FOLLOW
19 CARLOS. CARLOS? CARLOS, UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 **CARLOS ROMERO:** CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

22

23 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YES.

24



January 8, 2021

1 **CARLOS ROMERO:** FIRST I WANT TO TOUCH ON THE GREENHOUSE GAS
2 REDUCTION STRATEGIES. I'M GLAD TO SEE WE'RE TRYING TO GET TO
3 EIGHT FOLD INCREASE IN THE USE OF ELECTRIC VEHICLES. I
4 MENTIONED BEFORE AND I THINK WE SHOULD SERIOUSLY CONSIDER HOW
5 WE PARTNER WITH THE NUMEROUS COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY
6 AGGREGATORS THAT ARE NOW POPPING UP THROUGHOUT AND IN SOME
7 WELL ESTABLISHED THROUGHOUT THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA, MARIN
8 CLEAN ENERGY CERTAINLY DOWN HERE, PENINSULA CLEAN ENERGY, YOU
9 KNOW, AGENCIES THAT ARE NOW SELLING AND DISTRIBUTING CLEAN
10 ENERGY, BUT ALSO UTILIZING THE PROFITS FROM THOSE SALES TO
11 CREATE AND INCENTIVIZE BOTH CHARGING STATIONS AS WELL AS THE
12 PURCHASE OF ELECTRIC VEHICLES. AND I THINK WE'RE GOING TO GET
13 TO THIS NUMBER IF WE CAN ALL COLLECTIVELY, AROUND THE NINE
14 COUNTY BAY AREA, SEEK OUT SUBSIDY PROGRAMS THAT ALLOW FOR THE
15 PURCHASE OF CHEAPER ELECTRIC VEHICLES THAT ARE NOW COMING ON
16 THE MARKET IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS, AS WELL AS AUGMENT OUR
17 ELECTRIC CHARGING STATIONS. I THINK A COLLABORATIVE UNIFIED
18 APPROACH TO DOING THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND I THINK WE IN
19 PLANNED BAY AREA SHOULD BE ABLE TO HELP GENERATE THAT. SO, I
20 APPLAUD THE EIGHT FOLD INCREASE, BUT I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE
21 MORE COORDINATED STRATEGIES IN ACTUALLY GETTING THERE WITH OUR
22 LOCAL COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY AGGREGATORS. SECONDLY, I DO WANT
23 TO SECOND EDDIE AHN'S CONCERN AROUND SOME OF THE EQUITY ISSUES
24 RELATED TO HOUSING AND DISPLACEMENT. I MEAN, I THINK THE
25 REPORT SPECIFICALLY SAYS THAT, PROBABLY, THERE WILL BE A



January 8, 2021

1 REDUCTION IN THE NUMBER OF LOW INCOME FOLKS THAT CAN ACTUALLY
2 STAY IN THE BAY AREA BASED ON THESE STRATEGIES. AND THAT IS
3 INDEED TRAGIC, BECAUSE WE HAVE SEEN AN OUT-MIGRATION OF LOW
4 INCOME FOLKS FROM THE BAY AREA FOR QUITE SOMETIME. SO I AM
5 HOPING THAT THESE STRATEGIES REQUIRE ULTIMATELY SOME SORT OF
6 NINE COUNTY BAY AREA FUNDING APPROACH. AND I THINK WE ARE
7 BEGINNING TO WORK ON THAT AT ABAG AND MTC, BUT I THINK IT'S
8 CRITICAL FOR US TO MAKE THAT A PRIORITY OVER THE NEXT COUPLE
9 OF YEARS TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE ACTUALLY STAND THAT UP.
10 OTHERWISE, WE ARE GOING TO SEE LARGER MORE WHOLESALE
11 DISPLACEMENT OF LOW INCOME AND PEOPLE OF COLOR AND INABILITY
12 TO PRESERVE EXISTING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE NINE COUNTY BAY
13 AREA. LASTLY, I WANT TO POINT OUT, THAT WE'RE DOING LONG-RANGE
14 PLANNING, BUT AGAIN, THIS IS A FIVE YEAR PLAN AS WE ALL KNOW,
15 AMY, WE HAVE BEEN THROUGH THIS, THIS HAS BEEN MY THIRD TIME
16 GOING THROUGH, THIS YOU HAVE BEEN THROUGH THIS PROBABLY FIVE
17 TIMES. WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO MODIFY THE PLAN PROBABLY
18 STARTING IN THE NEXT YEAR TO SEE HOW WE CAN EMPIRICALLY DEFINE
19 THESE STRATEGIES AFFECTING US. AND BROUGHT TO MY ATTENTION BY
20 GIN A THERE IS A QUESTION ON THE MAP, AND I'M LOOKING FOR THE
21 PAGE, THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. IT DOES APPEAR REDWOOD CITY IS
22 SLIGHTLY OUT OF PLACE. SO MAYBE IT NEEDS TO BE MOVED -- IT
23 SEEMS LIKE IT'S IN SAN CARLOS. SO MAYBE IT NEEDS TO BE MOVED
24 OUT IN THE MAP SO IT CLEARLY SHOWS WHERE THE CITY S AND THE
25 NEXT POINT GINA HAS POINTED OUT, WE'RE INDICATING THE PORT OF



January 8, 2021

1 OAKLAND, RICHMOND HAS A PORT BUT IT MAY NOT SEE THE PRODUCTION
2 CAPACITIES THAT THE PORT OF OAKLAND DOES, BUT, IS THERE ANY
3 REASON WHY WE HAVE EXCLUDED THE PRESENCE OF A PORT IN REDWOOD
4 CITY? SO, I WILL LEAVE MY COMMENTS THERE. THANK YOU. >DAVE
5 VAUTIN: COMMISSIONER ROMERO, JUST A COUPLE OF POINTS ON WHAT
6 YOU RAISED. I WANT TO CLARIFY, YOU KNOW, I THINK PERHAPS YOU
7 MISHEARD LISA'S POINT ABOUT THE DISPLACEMENT. WE EXPLICITLY
8 SAID THE OPPOSITE, OUR FINDINGS INDICATE THIS WOULD NOT LEAD
9 TO AN OUTFLOW OF FOLKS OUTSIDE OF THE REGION THE PLAN IN THE
10 STRATEGIES WOULD PROPOSE ENOUGH DEED RESTRICTED HOUSING FOR
11 EVERY LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLD IN THE REGION. WHILE SOME LOW
12 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS MIGHT RELOCATE TO ACCESS DEED RESTRICTED
13 HOUSING THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITIES FOR RESIDENTS TO REMAIN IN
14 THE REGION. I WANT TO CLARIFY THAT POINT. WITH REGARDS TO THE
15 MAP, WE'LL BE HAPPY TO ADJUST THE LABELING THERE'S A PORTION
16 IN REDWOOD CITY BUT MAYBE FURTHER FROM CITY CENTER. THE MAP IS
17 ALREADY QUITE FULL. WE SHOWED THE PRIMARY SEA PORT FOR THE
18 REGION, WHICH IS THE PORT OF OAKLAND. THERE ARE SOME SECONDARY
19 SEA PORTS AND WE WOULD REFLECT THOSE ON THE MAPS IN THE
20 PLANNED DOCUMENT INCLUDING PORT OF RICHMOND, PORT OF REDWOOD
21 CITY AND SAN FRANCISCO. JUST FOR DECLUTTERING THE MAP WE
22 FOCUSED ON THE MOST DOMINANT SEA PORTS.
23
24 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVE. JAKE, THEN
25 ALFREDO. JAKE?



January 8, 2021

1

2 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR, AS THE LAMEST OF LAME
3 DUCKS SITTING HERE ON THE COMMISSION, YOU CAN TREAT MY REMARKS
4 THUSLY. FIRST OF ALL, IF THERE WAS EVER A CASE MADE FOR TRUE
5 REGIONAL GOVERNANCE IN THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES, YOU HAVE
6 JUST HEARD IT. THIS PARALLEL TRACKING OF THE RHNA PROCESS IN
7 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I REST MY CASE ON THAT. SECONDLY, AND A
8 VERY PAROCHIAL PLACE, I JUST READ THIS MORNING, THAT THE NEW
9 CITY COUNCIL IN PETALUMA HAS REJECTED THE PROPOSAL FOR A
10 TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT AT THE SUPPOSEDLY TO BE BUILT
11 NORTH PETALUMA SMART STATION, ACCOMPANIED BY AFFORDABLE
12 HOUSING AT THE EXISTING DOWNTOWN STATION. TO ME, THIS IS GOING
13 ABSOLUTELY IN THE WRONG DIRECTION. OBVIOUSLY, IT'S TOTALLY
14 AGAINST THE PLAN IN SONOMA COUNTY FOR A MULTI-MODAL
15 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM UP-AND-DOWN THE 101, AND FLIES IN THE
16 FACE OF WHAT'S BEEN TALKED ABOUT TODAY. I WILL BE GIVING MY
17 FINAL REPORT TO THE MAYORS AND COUNCIL MEMBERS OF SONOMA
18 COUNTY AFTER THIS MEETING TODAY AND FORWARDING THE DOCUMENTS
19 THAT HAVE BEEN PRESENTED TO US. SO IT WILL BE UP TO THE NEW
20 MTC COMMISSIONER, HOPEFULLY, TO COMMUNICATE WITH MY FORMER
21 COLLEAGUES. I HAVE TO SAY THAT THE ACTION BY PETALUMA IS
22 EXTREMELY DISAPPOINTING. WE'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT. AND THE LAST
23 THING I'LL SAY -- AND THIS IS A QUESTION -- I THINK ALL OF US
24 HAVE BEEN READING IN THE MEDIA ABOUT RELOCATION FROM THE NINE
25 BAY AREA COUNTIES, AND SACRAMENTO HAS GOTTEN A MAJOR SHOUT



January 8, 2021

1 OUT, IT SEEMED TO ME THAT THIS BRINGS UP THE IMPORTANCE OF THE
2 MEGA REGION WORK THAT THE COMMISSION HAS BEEN INVOLVED IN,
3 BECAUSE I'M THINKING, AS THIS PLAN IS BEING APPROVED OVER THE
4 NEXT YEAR OR SO, THAT WE MAY BE SEEING EVEN FURTHER SHIFTS.
5 AND I DON'T KNOW IF STAFF HAS ANY COMMENT ON THAT. >DAVE
6 VAUTIN: COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE YOU'RE BRINGING UP SOME GREAT
7 POINTS THERE. I THINK WE WOULD NOTE THAT'S ANOTHER IMPORTANT
8 AREA WE THINK ABOUT SENATE BILL 375 REFORM, THE ROLE OF MEGA
9 REGIONS, AND THE INTERACTION BETWEEN REGIONS. WE DID UPDATE
10 THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST TO REFLECT THE RECESSION WE'RE
11 EXPERIENCING RIGHT NOW, THE OUT-FLOW OF JOBS OCCURRING.
12 EARLIER IN 2020 WE INTEGRATED SOME OF THAT DATA WE CAN PLAN ON
13 BEST AVAILABLE DATA AT THE TIME THAT'S WHY WE UPDATE THE PLAN
14 EVERY FOUR YEARS BUT WE'RE DOING OUT BEST TO INCORPORATE THE
15 PANDEMIC AND RECESSION AND WE'RE SEEING RIGHT NOW THE FUTURE
16 IS OBVIOUSLY QUITE UNCERTAIN IN THE YEARS AHEAD.

17

18 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I'LL HAVE MY SECOND FINAL WORD, AND THAT IS
19 THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. THESE ACTIONS THAT WILL BE DISCUSSED
20 BY YOU ALL OVER THE NEXT 12 MONTHS, BELIEVE ME, WHEN WE PUT IN
21 PLACE AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, AND THE LAST GO AROUND, IT HAD
22 HUGE CONSEQUENCES. AND, SO, I WILL BE ADVISING MY FORMER
23 COLLEAGUES IN SONOMA COUNTY TO PAY EXTREMELY CLOSE ATTENTION
24 TO THE ITEMS THAT ARE FINALIZED IN THAT IMPLEMENTATION ACTION



January 8, 2021

1 PLAN. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I WILL LEAVE Y'ALL WITH. AND THANK
2 YOU VERY MUCH, MR. CHAIR.

3

4 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU JAKE. ALFREDO?

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO THANK STAFF
7 FOR THE EXTENSIVE PUBLIC OUTREACH THEY TOOK ON. 130 MEETINGS,
8 100 COMMUNITY EVENTS, YOU HAVE DONE AN INCREDIBLE JOB REACHING
9 OUT TO THE LOCAL LEVEL. AND IN COMMENT, I THINK WHAT WE'RE
10 SEEING HERE IS WE'RE TRYING TO GRAPPLE WITH HAVING TO MEET SB
11 375 GRAPPLING WITH THE HOUSING NUMBERS AND NUMBERS WHERE JOBS
12 ARE BEING CREATED THOSE ARE THE PRESSURE POINTS THE PLAN IS
13 TRYING TO DO AND I THINK STAFF DID A GOOD JOB OF MELDING ALL
14 OF THOSE DIFFERENT INTERESTS INTO A PLAN THAT COULD BE
15 SUPPORTED IN THE BAY AREA. I SUPPORT THE PLAN GOING FORWARD.
16 BUT HOW DO WE CONDENSE THIS INFORMATION INTO HOW WE EXPLAIN IT
17 LOCALLY. THE COMMUNITY IS NOT UNDERSTANDING WHAT 375S AND WHY
18 CAN'T WE JUST SAY NO. OR WHY DO WE HAVE TO MEET THESE HOUSING
19 NUMBERS. AND THIS PLAN IS THE CULMINATION OF THE LEGISLATIVE
20 OBJECTIVES IT WE HAVE TO MEET. SO CONDENSING THIS INTO
21 SOMETHING WE CAN COMMUNICATE IN A SIMPLE WAY WOULD GO A LONG
22 WAY IN EXPLAINING WHY THIS HAS TO HAPPEN, AND WHY WE'RE HAVING
23 THESE PLANS TO INTEGRATE ALL THESE DIFFERENT STRATEGIES. NOT
24 SO MUCH OF A QUESTION BUT MORE OF A COMMENT.

25



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERESE, I WOULD
2 LIKE YOU TO RESPOND TO YOUR ITERATION.

3

4 **EDDIE AHN:** IT WAS ASSUMPTION BETWEEN JOBS AND HOUSING GROWTH
5 PARTICULARLY TO SAN FRANCISCO BUT WE HAVE HEARD OTHER CONCERNS
6 AS WELL, JUST TRYING TO GET AT THE WHY. SO, JUST,
7 UNDERSTANDING, FOR INSTANCE TRANSIT INFRASTRUCTURE, EVEN ARE A
8 RICH TRANSIT CITY LIKE SAN FRANCISCO IS ALREADY STRESSED
9 PREPANDEMIC UNDERSTANDING HOW THOSE ASSUMPTIONS HAVE CHANGED
10 FROM THE DRAFT VERSION TO FINAL VERSION WOULD BE HELPFUL.

11

12 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU EDDIE. THERESE, I
13 DON'T HAVE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS HANDS RAISED. I'M GOING TO
14 GO TO YOU. WE HAVE HEARD A LOT OF COMMENTS HERE. IF YOU COULD
15 HELP RESPOND TO EDDIE'S CONCERNS, THERE, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

16

17 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I -- THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR SPERING. I'M
18 HAVING TECHNICAL ISSUES, IF I AM BREAKING UP PLEASE LET ME
19 KNOW AND I'LL GO OFTEN THE MEETING. TO PIVOT OFF OF VICE CHAIR
20 PEDROZA'S OBSERVATIONS, AND THOSE OF COMMISSIONERS, ABOUT THIS
21 EVER-PRESENT TENSION OF A LONG RANGE PLAN THAT'S 35 YEARS
22 LONG, AND THE IMPACTS THAT WE SEE TODAY. THAT IS
23 [INDISCERNIBLE] AND ELECTED OFFICIALS TO DEAL WITH IT
24 DYNAMICALLY AND -- GENERAL -- THAT'S [INDISCERNIBLE] TO THIS
25 EXERCISE. AS AN EXAMPLE, WE HAVE TO ALSO REALIZATION THAT WE



January 8, 2021

1 MUST DO THIS PLAN-BASED ON CURRENT AUTHORITIES, CURRENT
2 REGULATIONS, THE BEST AVAILABLE DATA AT THE TIME, AND
3 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THAT'S JUST NOT A PERFECT SET OF INFORMATION.
4 SO YOU'RE ALWAYS JUST GOING TO BE DOING YOUR BEST WITH
5 IMPERFECT CIRCUMSTANCES. THAT SAID, YOU KNOW, WE TRY TO DO
6 SOME -- WE HAVE TRIED TO DO SOME ADJUSTMENTS AS DESCRIBED BY
7 STAFF FOR THE COVID DRIVEN PANDEMIC SITUATION, AND REMIND YOU,
8 IT'S LESS THAN A YEAR. AND WE MADE THE BEST SET OF ADJUSTMENTS
9 IN THE NEAR-TERM, ON WHAT WE KNOW AT THIS POINT TO BE THE FALL
10 OUT. WE WON'T KNOW WHAT THAT'S GOING TO LOOK LIKE FOR A NUMBER
11 OF YEARS. THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT TO UPDATE THIS PLAN EVERY
12 FOUR YEARS. SO, WE HAVE TO DEAL WITH WHAT THE BEST COMBINATION
13 OF WHAT WE KNOW NOW. WE WILL HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO GO BACK
14 AND, IN FOUR YEARS, LOOK AND SEE WHAT DIFFERENT INFORMATION,
15 WITH DIFFERENT DATA, DIFFERENT EVIDENCED ON THE GROUND WE HAVE
16 TO MAKE THE NEXT PLAN WORK. SO THAT'S ALWAYS SOMETHING TO KEEP
17 IN MIND. THIS ISN'T A STATIC, DROP THE HAMMER DOWN MOMENT.
18 WE'LL LOOK AT THIS IN ADJUSTMENT. AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN,
19 THAT'S AN OPPORTUNITY LOOKING AT FRONT END OF THE PLAN FOR THE
20 NEXT FIVE YEARS, CAN TAKE INTO ACCOUNT CONSIDERATION OF
21 CURRENT CIRCUMSTANCES AND UNCERTAINTY ON OUR DECISIONS
22 COLLECTIVELY ON ACTIONS WE'RE GOING TO TAKE IN THE NEXT FEW
23 YEARS. IN SOME CASES, THERE MAY BE A DECISION TO SAY, YOU KNOW
24 WHAT? WE'RE GOING TO HOLD BACK ON TAKING SOME DEFINITIVE STEPS
25 FORWARD UNTIL WE SEE HOW THE PANDEMIC SHAPES OUT. WE MAKE



January 8, 2021

1 THOSE ADJUSTMENTS. IN OTHER CIRCUMSTANCES WE'RE GOING TO BE
2 RESPONDING TO THINGS HAPPENING RIGHT NOW AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL
3 STATE LEVEL AND LEGISLATIVE HOUSING AS THEY ARE PERHAPS
4 CHANGING THE AUTHORITIES AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORKS THAT WE
5 HAVE, AND WE CAN TAKE THOSE INTO ACCOUNT AS WELL, GIVEN THE
6 CIRCUMSTANCES. SO, I THINK THAT THE BEST PLACE WE HAVE OF
7 BALANCING THE NEED TO DO A LONG RANGE PLAN-BASED ON THE RULES
8 AND REGULATIONS, AND AUTHORITIES THAT WE HAVE TO MEET, AND
9 BEING ABLE TO BE AS NIMBLE AS WE CAN WITHIN THAT IN A SHORT
10 AMOUNT OF TIME GIVEN THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN ACTIONS THAT MUST
11 BE CONSISTENT WITH THE PLAN, BUT THERE IS SOME LEVEL OF
12 ADJUSTMENT WE CAN HAVE. SO, MR. CHAIR, I THINK THAT'S THE
13 BROADER CONTEXT I WANTED TO PROPERTY, PARTICULARLY THIS NOTION
14 THAT WE WILL BE ABLE TO RELOOK AT THIS ENTIRE PLANNING CONTEXT
15 IN FOUR YEARS. WE'RE GOING TO KNOW A LOT MORE, PARTICULARLY IN
16 TERMS OF SOME TRENDS. I WOULD IMAGINE, CERTAINLY, ON BOTH THE
17 JOB AND HOUSING ELEMENT, YOU KNOW, AT THAT TIME, BUT, YOU
18 KNOW, WE HAVE DONE THE BEST WE CAN, WITHIN THE AUTHORITIES AND
19 REGULATIONS TO BALANCE OFTEN COMPETING GOALS THAT WE HAVE.
20 THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

21

22 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. STAFF, DO WE HAVE
23 PUBLIC SPEAKERS? MARTHA?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.



January 8, 2021

1

2 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** HOW MANY?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS -- SO FAR WE HAVE TWO. IF ANY OF
5 THE MEMBERS WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND
6 FEATURE NOW OR PRESS STAR NINE. SO YES, STILL TWO. WOULD YOU
7 LIKE FOR ME TO CALL ON THEM? AND HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE
8 TO GIVE THEM?

9

10 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** DID YOU SAY WE HAVE TWO
11 SPEAKERS SO FAR?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES TWO.

14

15 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** GIVE THEM THREE MINUTES AND
16 MORE THAN THAT WE'LL SHORTEN IT UP.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED FROM THE CITY
19 MONTECERNO, AND IT WAS DISTRIBUTED TO ALL COMMISSIONERS,
20 COMMITTEE MEMBERS, AND POSTED ONLINE LAST NIGHT. WE HAVE
21 ROLAND. GO AHEAD, YOU HAVE THREE MINUTES.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND HAPPY NEW YEAR. BY THE
24 WAY WHAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT, THIS BEAUTIFUL PICTURE IS THE NEW
25 DIRIDON STATION, YOU ARE LOOKING AT THE SAN FERNANDO UNDERPASS



January 8, 2021

1 AT THE BOTTOM. FIRST OF ALL, TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN, AND THE
2 TAMIEN STATION IN SOUTH SAN JOSE, SLIDE 14 SHOWS THAT THE
3 EPICENTER OF THE ECONOMY ACTIVITY IN THE BAY AREA HAS SHIFTED
4 TO THE SOUTH IT'S NOT IN THE MIDDLE OF THE BAY AREA. NOW, THE
5 PROBLEM, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE SLIDES, IS THAT YOU'RE GOING TO
6 SEE THERE IS A COMPLETE WIDE AREA THAT WE'RE NOT PLANNING FOR
7 WHICH IS SURROUNDING SOUTH SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AND THE
8 POPULATION, YOU KNOW, YOU CAN SEE IT ON THIS ONE A LITTLE BIT.
9 THE POPULATION, IN THESE WHITE AREAS, IT'S IN EXCESS OF THREE
10 QUARTER OF A MILLION PEOPLE. IT IS THREE TIMES THE POPULATION
11 OF MARIN COUNTY. WE'RE NOT PLANNING FOR THIS. AND THEY'RE NOT
12 EXACTLY PLANNING, YOU KNOW, WITH US EITHER. BECAUSE ALL
13 THEY'RE DOING DOWN THERE IS TO WIDEN FREEWAYS. AND THE ONLY
14 OPTION NOW WE'RE FACE SUGGEST THAT WE DON'T HAVE TO WIDEN
15 HIGHWAY 101 TO SAN JOSE AND GILROY TO FOUR LANES IN EACH
16 DIRECTION JUST LIKE WHAT HAPPENED IN HIGHWAY 580 ON THE EAST
17 SIDE. THIS IS NOT SUSTAINABLE. I HAVE BEEN HERE BEFORE. I AM
18 GOING TO MENTION COMBINED STATISTICAL AREAS. I WILL BE BACK
19 LATER IN THE MEETING. IF YOU GOOGLE THIS SPECIFIC AREA IT SAYS
20 THE OMD DEFINES THE CSA AS EXISTING VARIOUS COMBINATIONS OF
21 ADJACENT METROPOLITAN AREAS WITH ECONOMIC SIZE MEASURED BY
22 COMMUTING PATTERNS. YOU CAN'T GET MORE TO THE POINT THAN THAT.
23 THAT IS THE ISSUE. TELECOMMUTING IS NOT AN OPTION FOR THESE
24 PEOPLE, BECAUSE THEY ARE LOW INCOME, THE SERVICE, YOU KNOW,
25 THEY'RE WORKING IN STORES, THEY'RE BARBERS. THOSE KINDS OF



January 8, 2021

1 JOBS, TELECOMMUTING IS NOT AN OPTION. THEY'RE ALSO NOT
2 ELECTRIFIED. THE WE ARE GUESSING IN SOUTH SANTA CLARA COUNTY
3 ARE NO LONGER SUSTAINABLE. I WILL BE BACK LATER, AND I'LL GIVE
4 YOU TWO OPTIONS ABOUT WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO ABOUT IT, AND I
5 GUARANTEE YOU YOU'RE NOT GOING TO LIKE ONE OF THE TWO OPTIONS.

6

7 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT WE HAVE RICH. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
10 YOURSELF.

11

12 **RICHARD HEDGES:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND CHAIR SPERING.
13 I THINK THE STAFF HAS DONE A GREAT JOB. I'LL JUST REMIND YOU
14 THAT IN 2008/09 MELT DOWN MTC WAS CRITICIZED BY THE GENERAL
15 PUBLIC FOR POPULATION GROWTH PROJECTIONS WHICH BECAME VERY
16 INSUFFICIENT AFTER WE HIT THE NEXT ECONOMIC EXPANSION. IT'S
17 VERY DIFFICULT OVER THE PROCESS OF 30 YEARS TO MAKE CLEAR
18 PREDICTIONS. FIVE YEAR ASSESSMENTS WILL HELP CLARIFY MUCH OF
19 THIS, AND EVENTUALLY WE MAKE MUCH OF THE 2050 PLAN. SO, I
20 WOULD JUST URGE EVERYBODY TO BE PATIENT, TO UNDERSTAND HOW
21 DIFFICULT THIS PROCESS IS FOR THE STAFF, AND TO UNDERSTAND
22 THAT WE HAVE A VERY DYNAMIC REGION, AND A VERY DYNAMIC
23 ECONOMY. AND AFTER SAYING ALL THAT, I WILL THANK YOU. BUT JUST
24 ONE OTHER ADDITIONAL POINT ON ELECTRIFIED CARS. WE NEED TO
25 MOVE THE STATE LEGISLATURE TO INSERT MILEAGE REPORTING SYSTEMS



January 8, 2021

1 INTO NEW ELECTRIC VEHICLES AND AT LEAST REQUIRE THEM TO REPORT
2 MILEAGE, NOT WHERE WE'RE GOING BUT HOW FAR YOU'RE GOING, TO
3 THE STATE, SO THEY CAN BE ASSESSED PER MILE TO HELP REPAIR
4 HIGHWAYS. AS THESE NUMBERS INCREASE WE'RE JUST NOT GOING TO
5 HAVE THE INCOME TO DO WHAT WE NEED TO DO RELYING ON THE GAS
6 TAX AND FORCING EVERYBODY TO IMPLEMENT THE MILEAGE DOING IT
7 OVER A PERIOD OF 30 YEARS WITH PEOPLE MOVING TO ELECTRIC CARS,
8 BOTH GENERAL MOTORS AND FORD HAVE SAID THEY'RE SWITCHING TO
9 ELECTRONIC VEHICLES, AND TOYOTA HAS GONE TO FUEL CELLS, AND
10 ARE ACTUALLY BUILDING FUELCELL FUELING STATIONS IN THE BAY
11 AREA RIGHT NOW. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO THOSE ARE
14 ALL OUR SPEAKERS MARTHA?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE
17 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

18

19 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ED E DO YOU WANT
20 TO HAVE A FINAL COMMENT BEFORE AN ASK FOR A MOTION TO MOVE
21 FORWARD?

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** YES. I WAS ACTUALLY GOING TO MAKE A MOTION TOO, AS
24 PART OF MY COMMENTS. THE BASIS IS I'M APPRECIATIVE OF STAFF
25 AND ALL THE MOVING PIECES OF PLANNED BAY AREA, AND I



January 8, 2021

1 APPRECIATE THE COMMISSIONER COMMENTS FROM ROMERO AND
2 JOSEFOWITZ, THAT WE WANT TO PREVENT BURDENING OF COMMUNITIES
3 OF COLOR THROUGH DEVELOPMENT AND I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE THE
4 FINAL BLUEPRINT TO THE COMMITTEE WITH UNDERSTANDING THERE ARE
5 GOING TO BE ONGOING CONVERSATIONS WITH SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING
6 AND OTHER JURISDICTIONS IN INTEREST OF ENGAGING THE PROCESS AS
7 WELL. TO ENSURE WE GET TO A FINAL BLUEPRINT THAT AGREES WITH
8 EQUITY CONCERNS.

9

10 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** SECOND TO THE MOTION?

11

12 **CARLOS ROMERO:** SECOND THE MOTION.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE'RE DOING MTC AND ABAG.

15

16 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** CARLOS, YOU CAN'T.

17 [INDISCERNIBLE].

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** I WAS SAYING THAT CARLOS --

20

21 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** HE'LL -- ABAG --

22

23 **SAM LICCARDO:** I'LL SECOND. LICCARDO.

24



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** SECOND FROM SAM. MATT, DID
2 YOU HAVE FINAL COMMENT ON THE MOTION? WE'RE GOING AHEAD AND
3 MOVING IT FORWARD.

4

5 **MATT MALONEY:** I'M STRUGGLING WITH WHAT THE PARTICULARS OF WHAT
6 THE EMOTION MEANS WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION. AS IT'S MOVING TO
7 THE FULL COMMISSION.

8

9 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** MAYBE YOU CAN CLARIFY. I
10 THOUGHT HE WAS SAYING HE WASN'T MAKING ANY. BUT CLARIFY THE
11 MOTION, EDDIE.

12

13 **EDDIE AHN:** YES. IT WOULD BE WITHOUT POSITIVE RECOMMENDATION.
14 WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT THIS PROCESS IS MOVING FORWARD,
15 BUT AT THE SAME TIME, WE ARE ENSURING THAT LOCAL CONVERSATIONS
16 ARE HAPPENING.

17

18 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** SO ARE YOU MOVING THE PLAN
19 FORWARD AS PRESENTED?

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

22

23 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THAT'S WHAT I UNDERSTOOD
24 MATT. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. MTC. WITH THAT, GO AHEAD
25 AND TAKE THE ROLL, PLEASE, MTC.



January 8, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SO THE MOTION IS FOR, TO MOVE IT FORWARD
3 WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION, AS PRESENTED TODAY, AND IT WAS MADE BY
4 COMMISSIONER AHN, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER LICCARDO. [ROLL CALL
5 VOTE].

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M A LITTLE CONFUSED BY THE MOTION BUT I'LL SAY
8 YES FOR TODAY. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES 5 TO 1. FIVE AYES, ONE
9 NO.

10

11 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** JAKE, JUST FOR CLARITY, I
12 WANT TO MAKE SURE WE ALL UNDERSTOOD THE MOTION. MOTION WAS
13 WE'RE MOVING THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FORWARD AND THERE
14 WEREN'T GOING TO BE ANY CONDITIONS.

15

16 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** THE REASON I DIDN'T SUPPORT THE MOTION IS THAT
17 I BELIEVE THAT THIS COMMITTEE, YOU KNOW, SHOULDN'T -- SHOULD
18 BE RECOMMENDING. FOR THE MOTION TO INCLUDE THE PHRASE,
19 "WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION" I OBVIOUSLY DISAGREE WITH THE WORDING
20 OF THE MOTION. AND I PRETTY MUCH FIGURED OUT THAT I WOULD --
21 THAT THIS WOULD COME OUT THE WAY THAT IT DID. SO IT WAS --
22 ANYWAY --

23



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YEAH. I'M JUST TRYING TO GET
2 CLARITY, BECAUSE WHAT I THOUGHT EDDIE HAD SAID IS THAT HE'S
3 NOT MAKING ANY EDIT THAT WAS, TO HIM --

4

5 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** MAYBE I SHOULD HAVE SPOKEN UP EARLIER.

6

7 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** THE COMMITTEE IS NOT MAKING A RECOMMENDATION.

8

9 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I BELIEVE THE COMMITTEE SHOULD MAKE A
10 RECOMMENDATION, AND I AM OBVIOUSLY IN THE MINORITY. I CAN'T BE
11 ANY MORE CLEAR THAN THAT.

12

13 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** EDDIE WAS YOUR MOTION THAT
14 THE COMMITTEE IS NOT MAKING A RECOMMENDATION TO ADOPT THE
15 PRESENTED PLAN?

16

17 **EDDIE AHN:** IT WOULD BE ADOPTING THE PLAN AS PRESENTED TODAY
18 BUT FORWARDING TO THE FULL BOARD, THE COMMISSION FOR
19 CONSIDERATION. THAT'S THE AMENDMENT. AND THE AMENDMENTS CAN BE
20 MADE AT THE FULL COMMISSION TOO.

21

22 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED CLARITY.
23 I AM MOVING THAT WE'RE MOVING THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FORWARD
24 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AND THE ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN
25 RAISED ARE CERTAINLY GOING TO BE ADDRESSED AT SOME OTHER TIME.



January 8, 2021

1 THAT WE'RE NOT CONDITIONING THIS RECOMMENDATION TODAY. IS THAT
2 CORRECT?

3

4 **EDDIE AHN:** SO, NO, THERE IS NOT A CONDITIONING IN THE SENSE
5 THAT THERE IS NO CHANGES CURRENTLY TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.
6 THAT'S CORRECT.

7

8 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. JAKE, SO WE ARE MOVING
9 FORWARD AS STAFF PRESENTED.

10

11 **AMY R. WORTH:** THAT'S NOT --

12

13 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I'M SORRY, I --

14

15 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** NO. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE
16 SURE. BECAUSE IF IT HAD CONDITIONS, I WAS NOT GOING TO SUPPORT
17 THE MOTION. SO I WANTED CLARITY THAT IT WAS PRESENTED TODAY
18 AND IT'S MOVING --

19

20 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** OBVIOUSLY I BELIEVE WE SHOULD HAVE A
21 RECOMMENDATION TO MOVE FORWARD TO THE FULL COMMISSION. THE I
22 WOULD ALWAYS EXPECT THAT ANYTHING THAT WAS FORWARDED FROM THIS
23 COMMITTEE WOULD BE SUBJECT TO FULL DEBATE BY THE COMMISSION,
24 AND SUBJECT TO POTENTIAL AMENDMENTS BY THE COMMISSION AT THE
25 TIME IT WAS BEING CONSIDERED.



January 8, 2021

1

2 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY.

3

4 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** ANYWAY.

5

6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. THAT'S FINE. WE'LL JUST
7 TAKE IT.

8

9 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YEAH. WE'RE GOOD.

10

11 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** SCOTT, DID YOU WANT TO
12 COMMENT BEFORE I CLOSE?

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES, MR. CHAIR. MAYBE, LIKE JAKE, I'M A WEE
15 BIT CONFUSED. FIRST OF ALL, TO STAFF, I THINK YOU HAVE DONE A
16 WONDERFUL JOB. AND I THINK AT EVERY STEP OF THE WAY, THEY HAVE
17 TRIED TO BE AS ACCOMMODATING AS POSSIBLE. BUT I -- AND I HAVE
18 BEEN LISTENING TO THIS -- BUT I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, IS THE
19 ARGUMENT THAT SAN FRANCISCO IS TAKING TOO MUCH HOUSING?

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** THERE IS ALREADY A ROBUST -- SPEAKING JUST FOR
22 MYSELF, AS THE COMMISSIONER -- THERE IS ALREADY A ROBUST
23 PIPELINE IN THE WORKS. I THINK THE CONCERN IS NOW THE WAY THAT
24 THE PIPELINE TARGET HAS BEEN ADJUSTED TO BE SO EXCESSIVE IS



January 8, 2021

1 GOING TO UNINTENTIONALLY IMPACT COMMUNITY IN SAN FRANCISCO OF
2 THE SO JUST SPEAKING FOR SAN FRANCISCO, YES.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I THINK ALAMEDA COUNTY IS THE SECOND HIGHEST
5 ACHIEVER OF HOUSING IN THE PLAN. I COULD GO BACK AND LOOK.
6 IT'S SECOND OR THIRD. AND YOU KNOW, I THOUGHT WE WENT THROUGH
7 ALL THIS. I THOUGHT WE WENT THROUGH THIS WITH JULIE PIERCE.

8

9 **AMY R. WORTH:** RIGHT.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, THIS AND CARLOS PUSHING
12 VERY HARD TO STAY WITH WHAT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE
13 CAME UP WITH AND NOW WE'RE SAYING WE'RE GOING TO TAKE IT AND
14 MAKE IT A FREE-FOR-ALL AT THE COMMISSION MEETING. I TOTALLY
15 DISAGREE WITH THE DIRECTION THIS ADMISSION IS GOING. WE HAVE
16 HAD THE DISCUSSIONS AND AT THE 11th HOUR, 59th MINUTE WE'RE
17 SAYING LOOK LET'S SEND IT TO THE COMMISSION AND HAVE A FREE-
18 FOR-ALL. I THINK SAN FRANCISCO SHOULD TAKE THE HOUSING MAYBE
19 THEY HAVE A ROBUST PIPELINE BUT THEY SPENT DECADES NOT
20 BUILDING HOUSING AND FORCING HOUSING ON EVERYBODY ELSE. SO
21 DON'T FEEL SORRY FOR SAN FRANCISCO AND LOOK IF WE'RE GOING TO
22 OPEN IT UP, OPEN IT UP, GET THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE
23 BACK TOGETHER AND LET'S START OVER AND IF I SOUND LIKE I'M
24 ANGRY. I AM. I'M EXTREMELY ANGRY. WE HAVE HAD THESE
25 DISCUSSIONS OVER AND OVER AND OVER. WE HAVE HAD PEOPLE



January 8, 2021

1 JUSTIFYING WHAT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE DID. SOME OF
2 THE PEOPLE THAT JUST SUPPORTED THAT WE SEND IT TO THE
3 COMMISSION AND HAVE A FREE-FOR-ALL. DON'T AGREE WITH THIS.
4 IT'S ABSOLUTELY ASININE.

5

6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THAT'S WHY THERE IS SO MUCH
7 CONFUSION ON THIS MOTION. I THINK MAYBE WE NEED A SUBSTITUTE
8 MOTION FOR CLARITY. WE HAVE THE ACTUAL RESOLUTION WHICH SAYS
9 THIS APPROVES THE FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS
10 IMPACT REPORT REQUIRED UNDER THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL CEQA
11 DISCUSSION CONTAINED IN THE PLANNING COMMITTEE. ANYWAY. I'M
12 GOING TO MOVE THE RESOLUTION THAT IS PRESENTED TO THIS
13 COMMITTEE. SO THAT WOULD BE THE MOTION --

14

15 **SAM LICCARDO:** MR. CHAIR?

16

17 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YES?

18

19 **SAM LICCARDO:** MR. CHAIR, I THINK YOU NEED TO MAKE A MOTION FOR
20 RECONSIDERATION. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SUPPORT IT.

21

22 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU SAM. MOTION FOR
23 RECONSIDERATION.

24

25 **SAM LICCARDO:** I SECOND.



January 8, 2021

1

2 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** WE HAVE A SECOND. LET'S TAKE
3 A VOTE ON THAT.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. [ROLL CALL VOTE]. IT PASSES 5 TO 1.

6

7 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY I'M GOING TO MOVE THE
8 RESOLUTION 4451. THIS IS THE RESOLUTION --

9

10 **EDDIE AHN:** MR. CHAIR, IF I MAY, JUST BRIEFLY --

11

12 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** GO AHEAD EDDIE.

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** I DON'T WANT TO JAM UP A PROCESS AND EXPLICITLY
15 ASKED FOR NINE WISHES. I REALLY BELIEVE IN THIS AS AN
16 INITIATIVE WHICH IS WHY THIS CAME ACROSS MY RADAR TWO DAYS
17 AGO. AND FOR ME TO STEP ON THIS COMMISSION AND TRY TO
18 ARTICULATE THESE CONCERNS IN A THOUGHTFUL MANNER IS ALWAYS MY
19 INTENT. I UNDERSTAND THE VOTE AS IT'S GONE DOWN.

20

21 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND BY JAKE.

22

23 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** CORRECT.

24



January 8, 2021

1 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** WITH THAT, TAKE A ROLL CALL
2 VOTE ON THE MOTION.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE].

5

6 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** I WANT TO APOLOGIZE TO
7 EVERYBODY. I MISUNDERSTOOD THE MOTION. SO I WOULD NOT HAVE
8 SUPPORTED THE ORIGINAL MOTION. SO I APOLOGIZE FOR THE
9 CONFUSION. SO JESSE, WITH US CLEARING ALL THAT UP, I'M GOING
10 TO HAND IT OVER TO YOU.

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** I WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT BEFORE I ENTERTAIN A
13 MOTION WHICH IS THAT I'M VERY SYMPATHETIC TO THE CONCERNS
14 ABOUT INCREASING THE PRODUCTION OF MARKET RATE HOUSING IN THE
15 CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO RESULTING IN INCREASED DISPLACEMENT RISK
16 BUT THAT DISPLACEMENT RISK IS ALSO GOING TO BE FELT BY
17 OAKLAND, AND EAST PALO ALTO, BY SAN JOSE. I THINK WE COME TO
18 THESE MEETINGS REPRESENTING INDIVIDUAL JURISDICTIONS, BUT WE
19 ALSO HAVE TO LOOK REGIONALLY, AND I DO THINK THIS IS A GOOD
20 PLAN THAT IS FORWARD THINKING, AND THAT DOES WORK TO INCREASE
21 THE PRODUCTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND PRESERVATION OF
22 EXISTING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND ULTIMATELY THE IMPLEMENTATION
23 PLAN IS GOING TO BE WHERE THE RUBBER MEETS THE ROAD. AND WE'RE
24 GOING TO HAVE TO WORK TO MAKE THE PLAN A REALITY. AND TO MAKE
25 SURE WE CAN ADDRESS ISSUES LIKE DISPLACEMENT IMPACTS. AND MAKE



January 8, 2021

1 SURE WE HAVE RESOURCES TO BE ABLE TO INCREASE THE PRODUCTION
2 OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO ENTERTAIN A MOTION
3 FROM THE ABAG MEMBERS TO REFER ABAG RESOLUTION 01201, THE
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE
5 BOARD FOR APPROVAL.

6

7 **BELIA RAMOS:** I WILL MAKE THAT MOTION. BELIA RAMOS.

8

9 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** MITCHOFF WILL SECOND.

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY
12 DISCUSSION FROM ABAG MEMBERS? FURTHER DISCUSSION? OKAY. IF
13 NOT, WE TOOK PUBLIC COMMENT. CORRECT, MR. CASTRO? SO WE CAN GO
14 ROLL CALL?

15

16 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ON THE ABAG MOTION. [ROLL CALL VOTE].
19 MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BACK TO
22 CHAIR SPERING.

23

24 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU JESS. THANK
25 YOU BOARD MEMBERS AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS. APPRECIATE MOVING US



January 8, 2021

1 FORWARD. A LOT OF HARD WORK. THANK YOU, STAFF, GOOD
2 PRESENTATION TODAY. SO WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE INTO PUBLIC
3 COMMENTS. ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS? MARTHA?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON
6 THIS ITEM. AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
7 HAND RAISED. ROLAND. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. VERY BRIEFLY, WHAT I WOULD
10 LIKE TO TALK ABOUT IS THE LOCATION OF THE NEXT WORKSHOP. WHICH
11 I UNDERSTAND IS GOING TO BE VIRTUAL. WE HAVE BEEN TO SAN JOSE.
12 WE HAVE BEEN TO NAPA, WE HAVE BEEN TO LIVERMORE. WHAT I AM
13 SUGGESTING THAT THIS YEAR, WE EITHER VIRTUALLY GO DOWN TO
14 MORGAN HILL, OR GILROY. AND -- SORRY, IS MY TIME UP?

15

16 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** NO. GO AHEAD. YOU HAVE GOT 30
17 SECONDS.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WHAT I WOULD LIKE YOU TO DO THIS
20 YEAR IS TO INVITE OUR NEIGHBORS FROM THE SOUTH, IT'S CALLED
21 AMBAG, THE ASSOCIATION OF MONTEREY BAY AREA GOVERNMENT, WHICH
22 REPRESENTS THE THREE QUARTER PROBABLY A MILLION PEOPLE RIGHT
23 NOW THEY MENTIONED EARLIER. AND AT LEAST GET SOME INPUT OF
24 WHAT THEY'RE DOING DOWN THERE AND THEN THE COMMISSION IS GOING



January 8, 2021

1 TO BE MORE INFORMED MOVING FORWARD HOW WE'RE GOING AHEAD IN
2 THE NEXT FIVE YEARS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THANK YOU ROLAND. MARTHA IS
5 THAT THE END OF THE SPEAKERS

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
8 HANDS RAISED.

9

10 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** OKAY. I WANT TO THANK
11 EVERYONE. AND IF THERE IS NO FURTHER BUSINESS OF THIS
12 COMMITTEE, JESS, I ASSUME ABAG HAS NO FURTHER BUSINESS?

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE CHAIR:** YES. THANK YOU, MR.
15 CHAIR.

16

17 **JIM SPERING, MTC PLANNING CHAIR:** THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED.
18 AND THANK YOU ALL OF YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE. [ADJOURNED]

19



Broadcasting Government