

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



December 16, 2020

1 **BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY**

2 **WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 16, 2020, 9:40 AM**

3

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL

6 GO DO ROLL CALL PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAGGERTY?

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

13

14 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER IS PRESENT.

17

18 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. WORTH?

25



December 16, 2020

1 **AMY R. WORTH, VICE CHAIR:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. THAT WAS OF THE ROLL CALL FOR THE
6 BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY. WE'LL NOW MOVE TO
7 ITEM TWO WHICH IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR, ITEMS 2A AND 2B.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MOVE CONSENT, SPERING.

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND. DUTRA-VERNACI.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. KIMBERLY, WHAT YOU
14 HAVE GOT IN THE PUBLIC.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT
17 AND I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THE MOTION PASSES
22 UNANIMOUSLY.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO 3A, BAIFA
25 MEANS BASED TOLL PILOT PROGRAM. STAFF WILL GIVE A PRESENTATION



December 16, 2020

1 ON THE MEANS-BASED TOLL DISCOUNT PILOT PROGRAM, PIERCE WILL
2 GIVE THE PRESENTATION. THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY, NO
3 ACTION.

4

5 **PIERCE GOULD:** I AM PIERCE GOULD WITH THE EXPRESS LANES TEAM
6 AND AM EXCITED TO BE HERE TODAY TO TALK ABOUT THE MEANS-BASED
7 TOLL EXPRESS LANES. THIS IS OUR FIRST SIGNIFICANT PRESENTATION
8 TO BAIFA THE PILOT SINCE WE COMMITTED TO IT IN JUNE. NEXT
9 SLIDE. WAIT. LET ME ASK FOR PRESENTATION FIRST. NOW WE'LL GO
10 TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THERE WE GO. FOR A LONG TIME, WE HAVE
11 OPERATED UNDER THE PREMISE THAT EXPRESS LANES ARE A CHOICE
12 BECAUSE PEOPLE AREN'T REQUIRED TO USE THEM BUT OUR THINKING
13 HAS CHANGED IN THE PAST YEAR DUE TO EXECUTIVE AND COMMISSIONER
14 LEADERSHIP. THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE EVALUATION FOR PLANNED BAY
15 AREA 2050, AND A LOT OF PUBLIC COMMENT ABOUT EQUITY, WHEN WE
16 ADOPTED TOLLING RULES IN THE PAST YEAR. FOR EXPRESS LANES WE
17 ARE RECOGNITION THE CHOICE TO USE THE EXPRESS LANE IS LIMITED
18 TO PEOPLE WHO CAN AFFORD THE TOLL. WE'RE LOOKING TO ADDRESS
19 THIS REALITY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** EVERYBODY MUTE YOUR MICS.

22

23 **PIERCE GOULD:** MORE THAN 60 PERCENT OF LOW INCOME WORKERS DRIVE
24 TO WORK. WHILE PUBLIC TRANSIT IS AN IMPORTANT SERVICE FOR MANY
25 LOW INCOME WORKERS IT MAY NOT BE THE BEST OPTION FOR ALL LOW



December 16, 2020

1 INCOME WORKERS WHICH IS WHY WE'RE PURSUING THE PILOT. NEXT
2 SLIDE PLEASE. SO MTC IS MAKING A STRONGER COMMITMENT TO
3 ADDRESSING EQUITY ON OUR EXPRESS LANES. THE INABILITY OF
4 INDIVIDUALS WHO EARN A LOW INCOME TO BE ABLE TO AFFORD TO USE
5 EXPRESS LANES WHICH TRANSIT OR CARPOOLING ARE NOT GOOD OPTIONS
6 IS A PROBLEM AND WE WANT TO EXPERIMENT WITH HOW TO ADDRESS IT
7 BY PILOTING A MEANS-BASED TOLL DISCOUNT. THIS WILL HELP US
8 GROW OUR CUSTOMER BASE, WHICH IS GOOD, BECAUSE WE WANT OUR
9 EXPRESS LANES TO SERVE EVERYONE. WE ARE IN A UNIQUE POSITION
10 TO LEAD A PILOT SINCE WE OPERATE CLIPPER, WHICH LAUNCHED ITS
11 TRANSIT FARE DISCOUNT PILOT CALLED CLIPPER START IN JULY OF
12 THIS YEAR. CLIPPER START HAS DONE A LOT OF THE HEAVY LIFTING
13 THAT MADE A MEANS-BASED TOLL PROGRAM SEEM HARD TO PULL UP UP
14 UNTIL NOW AND WE WILL TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE TOOLS. WE ENGAGE
15 DRIVER AND PILOT DESIGN SO IT HAS THE BEST PRODUCT FOR
16 DELIVERING AT THE END OF THE DAY. NEXT SLIDE. WE WANT TO HAVE
17 WELL-DEFINED GOALS FOR THE PILOT SO WE CAN EVALUATE WHERE IT
18 SUCCEEDS AND WHERE CHANGES ARE NEEDED MOST ARE BORROWED FROM
19 CLIPPER START BUT SEEM A GOOD FIT FOR OUR PILOT. TWO GOALS,
20 IMPLEMENTATION AND IMPACT GOALS. IMPLEMENTATION GOALS ACCESS
21 PROGRAM OUTREACH PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION AND ALSO LANE
22 PERFORMANCE WHILE IMPACT GOALS ASSESS WHETHER THE PILOT MAKES
23 A DIFFERENCE FOR THE PEOPLE WHO USE IT AT THE END OF THE DAY.
24 WE'LL BE LOOKING AT THESE GOALS IN MORE DETAIL AND MAKE
25 ADJUSTMENTS AS NEEDED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ASIDE FROM THE



December 16, 2020

1 GOALS, THERE ARE MANY OTHER SYNERGIES WITH CLIPPER START. THIS
2 IS A SIDE BY SIDE COMPARISON OF THE CLIPPER START PILOT AND
3 BAIFA TOLL DISCOUNT PILOT IT IS MOSTLY IDENTICAL ASIDE FROM
4 PILOT LOCATIONS, THE DIFFERENCE IS THIS IS A FASTRAK PROGRAM
5 NOT A CLIPPER PROGRAM AND IT WILL BE ON EXPRESS LANES NOT
6 PUBLIC TRANSIT. WE WILL USE THE SAME DEFINITION OF LOW INCOME,
7 AS CLIPPER START, WE WILL LEVERAGE THE SAME FASTRAK AND
8 PROGRAM, AND CONTRACTOR ALREADY USED BY CLIPPER START TO
9 MANAGE ELIGIBILITY. WE WILL USE THE SAME OUTREACH TO GET THE
10 WORD OUT TO POTENTIAL CUSTOMERS. PILOT DURATION IS THE SAME
11 TOO, WE PLAN A 12 MONTH PILOT WITH AN ADDITIONAL SIX MONTHS OF
12 OPERATIONS TO FINALIZE THE EVALUATION AND DECIDE NEXT STEPS.
13 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO BAIFA'S AUTHORITY TO IMPLEMENT A MEANS-
14 BASED TOLL DISCOUNT PROGRAM LIKE THIS ONLY APPLIES TO THE BLUE
15 LANES ON THIS MAP WHICH ARE OWNED BY BEHAVE A OUR -- BAIFA OUR
16 PLAN IS TO IMPLEMENT ON THE I-880 EXPRESS LANES IN ALAMEDA
17 COUNTY TO GET SOMETHING UP SOONER. BUT THE POTENTIAL IS TO
18 EXPAND TO OUR 680 EXPRESS LANES IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY AND
19 EVEN OUR 80 EXPRESS LANES IN SOLANO COUNTY ONCE THEY'RE BUILT
20 AND OPEN. I WANT TO TALK A LITTLE BIT MORE ON WHY WE PROPOSE
21 TO PROCEED WITH 880 FIRST. NEXT SLIDE. IDEALLY, WE WOULD BE
22 ABLE TO PILOT ON BOTH MTC EXPRESS LANES, BUT THE COMPLEXITY OF
23 PILOTING ON MULTIPLE LANES AND THE DESIRE TO EXPEDITE DELIVERY
24 PLUS PILOT COST HAVE MEANT WE NEED TO FOCUS ON JUST ONE. WE
25 CAME UP WITH A LIST OF POTENTIAL CONSIDERATIONS TO HELP US



December 16, 2020

1 IDENTIFY THE CORRIDOR WITH THE MOST POTENTIAL TO ENGAGE LOW
2 INCOME CUSTOMERS, AND PROVIDE THEM THE MOST BENEFIT AND WE
3 TALKED ABOUT OUR IDEAS WITH THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
4 OF MTC'S POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE LIST NOT
5 IN PRIORITY ORDER INCLUDES POPULATION, CONGESTED JOBS, AND
6 OTHER FACTORS. 880 HAS THE EDGE, AND MANY SUPPORTED THIS
7 ASSESSMENT IF WE COULD PILOT ONLY ON ONE LANE. NEXT SLIDE
8 PLEASE. WHEN I TALKED WITH THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE,
9 SHARED WITH THEM FOUR MAPS TO HELP VISUALIZE SOME OF THE
10 DIFFERENT CONSIDERATIONS THEY JUST SHOWED YOU, AND I WANTED TO
11 SHARE THIS ONE MAP WITH YOU BECAUSE IT HELPS MAKE THE CASE FOR
12 FOCUSING ON 880 FIRST. THIS MAP SHOWS FAST CASH PAYMENT
13 LOCATIONS IN GREEN RELATIVE TO CENSUS TRACTS WHERE THERE ARE
14 HIGH CONCENTRATIONS OF LOW INCOME RESIDENT IN PURPLE. ALONG
15 680 IN THE PINK BUFFER THERE ARE NINE FASTRAK CASH PAYMENT
16 LOCATIONS MOST OF WHICH ARE IN SAN JOSE AND NONE OF WHICH ARE
17 IN WALNUT CREEK AND PLEASANTON ALONG 880 IN THE BLUE BUFFER
18 AREA, THERE ARE 24 FASTRAK CASH PAYMENT LOCATIONS AND THEY ARE
19 MORE EVENLY SPREAD OUT THROUGHOUT THE CORRIDOR. ALSO THERE ARE
20 460,000 LOW INCOME RESIDENT IN THE 880 BUFFER AREA COMPARED TO
21 200,000 IN THE 680 BUFFER AREA. THIS MAP AND POPULATION DATA
22 SUGGEST 680 SHOULD BE OUR PILOT CORRIDOR IN TERMS OF PROVIDING
23 ACCESS TO LOW INCOME RESIDENTS AND THOSE WITHOUT ACCESS TO
24 CREDIT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE ARE PLANNING A ROBUST
25 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT FOR THIS PILOT. OUR STAKEHOLDER PLANS



December 16, 2020

1 ARE STILL EVOLVING BUT WE WILL BE RETURNING TO OUR EQUITY AND
2 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE NEXT YEAR WITH UPDATES OUR CURRENT THINK
3 SUGGEST TO HAVE AN ADVISORY COMMITTEE OF EXPRESS LANE AND
4 BRIDGE OPERATORS AND LIKELY SOME ADVOCATES AS WELL. THE GOAL
5 WOULD BE TO GET THEIR FEEDBACK ON BIG POLICY OR IMPLEMENTATION
6 ISSUES, AND KEEP THEM IN THE LOOP ON PILOT PROGRESS. OUR HOPE
7 IS THAT THIS COULD IMPROVE THE CHANCE FOR EXPANSION IF THE
8 PILOT IS SUCCESSFUL. LISTENING TO LOW INCOME DRIVERS AND
9 ADVOCATES THROUGH FOCUS GROUPS AND OTHERS MEANS WILL BE KEY
10 FOR FEEDBACK ON PILOT DESIGN SUCH AS GOALS AND POLICIES, AND
11 PILOT EVALUATION SUCH AS PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND ONE'S ACTUAL
12 PILOT EXPERIENCE. WE ALSO WILL WORK WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
13 ORGANIZATIONS TO TELL THE LOW INCOME COMMUNITY ABOUT THE PILOT
14 ONCE IT IS READY TO LAUNCH, AND ENCOURAGE ENROLLMENT. LASTLY,
15 WE WILL REPORT ON PROGRESS AND SEEK GUIDANCE OR APPROVAL ON
16 POLICY FROM THIS AND OTHER COMMITTEES AS MAKES SENSE. NEXT
17 SLIDE PLEASE. OUR SCHEDULE AIMS FOR A PILOT LAUNCH IN THE
18 FOURTH QUARTER OF 2021 BUT IT REALLY IS A VERY AGGRESSIVE
19 SCHEDULE. SO FAR, I'M ALMOST REGRETTING PUTTING IT DOWN ON
20 PAPER. [LAUGHTER] SO FAR WE FOCUSED ON DEVELOPING A DRAFT WORK
21 PLAN TO GUIDE THE PILOT INFORMING A TEAM OF MTC STAFF TO
22 DELIVER IT. THE NEXT STEPS ARE TO NEGOTIATE CHANGE ORDERS WITH
23 KEY CONTRACTORS AND DO PROCUREMENTS TO EVALUATION AND CUSTOMER
24 ENGAGEMENT WORK. AS PART OF PILOT DESIGN WE WILL ENGAGE
25 CUSTOMERS AND STAKEHOLDERS ABOUT PILOT GOALS, POLICIES AND HOW



December 16, 2020

1 TO MEASURE SUCCESS. LIKE CLIPPER START, WHERE WE HAD TO BUILD
2 A LINK BETWEEN OUR CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT SYSTEM AND
3 CLIPPER, SO THAT APPLICATIONS COULD BE RECEIVED AND ONCE
4 APPROVED BE SENT TO CLIPPER FOR CARD DISTRIBUTION, OUR
5 TECHNICAL SYSTEM'S WORK, WILL BUILD A LINK TO FASTRAK FOR TOLL
6 TAG DISTRIBUTION. WE WILL ALSO NEED TO AMEND OUR TOLL
7 ORDINANCE TO REFERENCE THE TOLL DISCOUNT, AND WE'LL DO THAT
8 THIS SPRING. FOR THE EVALUATION, WE WILL NEED TO COLLECT
9 TRAFFIC AND USER EXPERIENCE DATA BEFORE AND DURING OPERATIONS.
10 OPERATIONS WILL LAST 12 MONTHS, PLUS AN ADDITIONAL SIX MONTHS
11 TO WRAP UP THE EVALUATION ITSELF, AND TO DECIDE ON NEXT STEPS
12 WITH ALL OF YOU. EQUITY WILL BE CONSIDERED THROUGHOUT THE
13 PILOT ESSENTIALLY THROUGH CUSTOMER OUTREACH WORK TO SUPPORT
14 PILOT DESIGN AND EVALUATION. THERE ARE A VARIETY OF THINGS
15 THAT COULD IMPACT THE SCHEDULE, INCLUDING SCOPE CHANGES BASED
16 ON STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK THAT WE RECEIVE ALONG THE WAY. OUR
17 ABILITY TO SEQUENCE WORK ACROSS MULTIPLE CONTRACTORS AND ALSO
18 COMPETING PRIORITIES FOR THE FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER,
19 WHICH MUST ALSO SUPPORT THREE EXPRESS LANES OPENING IN 2021.
20 SO, OBVIOUSLY, IT HAS A LOT ON ITS PLATE ALREADY. NEXT SLIDE
21 PLEASE. THIS FINAL SLIDE IS OUR START-UP COST ESTIMATE FOR THE
22 PILOT, WHICH IS PRELIMINARY, BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T REQUESTED BIDS
23 FOR THE WORK YET. FOR 880, WE ESTIMATE A COST OF ABOUT \$3
24 MILLION. THE BIGGEST COST DRIVERS ARE THE TECHNICAL SYSTEMS
25 WORK, FOLLOWED BY DATA COLLECTION AND EVALUATION COST. WE ARE



December 16, 2020

1 PREPARED TO FUND START UP COSTS UP TO \$3 MILLION OF BAIFA
2 PROGRAM FUNDS. WE WILL ALSO SEEK OTHER FUNDS TO OFFSET
3 TECHNICAL SYSTEMS COSTS. AS WE ARE BUILDING A SCALEABLE
4 PLATFORM FOR MEANS-BASED TOLLS, AND ARE FOLLOWING THE CLIPPER
5 START MODEL TO BUILD A MOBILITY ACCOUNT, WE ARE SEEING
6 ADDITIONAL \$1 MILLION TO EXPAND 680 BUT PROCEED TO LOOK AT
7 IDENTIFICATION OF FUNDS AND ALSO ON HOW 880 GOES. WE WILL
8 RETURN TO BAIFA IN THE FUTURE WITH REQUEST TO FUND MONTHLY
9 PILOT OPERATIONS WHICH ARE MOSTLY FOR PROCESSING APPLICATIONS
10 AND FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE COSTS. THIS CONCLUDES MY
11 PRESENTATION, AND I AM HAPPY TO TRY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS FROM
12 MY COLLEAGUES.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FIRST,
15 THERESE.

16

17 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO TAKE
18 THE OPPORTUNITY TO UNDERSCORE HOW WELL THIS ILLUSTRATES THE
19 APPLICATION OF OUR EQUITY PLATFORM FROM, IN SOME WAYS TO
20 PAUSING IN OUR PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT TO ENSURE THAT EQUITY WAS
21 BROUGHT TO THE FOREFRONT TO THE CREATIVITY OF REALIZING HOW
22 MUCH WE CAN BUILD ON AND LEARN FROM THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM
23 IN TERMS OF ADVANCING, AND THE COMMITMENT TO WORKING WITH OUR
24 TRAVELING PUBLIC AND PARTICULARLY IN THESE TIMES. JUST WANT TO
25 AGAIN THANK STAFF FOR THEIR GREAT WORK, AND THANK THE



December 16, 2020

1 COMMISSION FOR THE SUPPORT YOU HAVE EXTENDED TO THE EQUITY
2 PLATFORM, AND I HOPE YOU ARE SEEING THE FRUITS OF THAT
3 DEMONSTRATED IN PROJECTS LIKE THIS. THANK YOU. IS

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. OKAY. MR. JOSEFOWITZ?
6 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

7

8 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. I'M NOT ON THE COMMITTEE, BUT
9 THANK YOU FOR GIVING MEET OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. I THINK THIS
10 IS REALLY EXCITING. AND IT WILL BE A GREAT STEP FORWARD. I
11 MIGHT HAVE TOTALLY MISSED T BUT WHAT IS THE MEANS? WHAT IS THE
12 DISCOUNT?

13

14 **PIERCE GOULD:** NO YOU DIDN'T ACTUALLY MISS IT. WE HAVEN'T
15 SETTLED ON A DISCOUNT YET. THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE GOING TO BE
16 DOING WITH THE LOW INCOME COMMUNITY AS PART OF OUR COMMUNITY
17 ENGAGEMENT PROCESS.

18

19 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** RIGHT. SO I WOULD THINK AT SOME POINT
20 THAT WOULD BE GREAT TON WHAT THAT IS, BECAUSE LITTLE DISCOUNTS
21 HAVE SORT OF LITTLE IMPACT AND BIG DISCOUNTS HAVE BIG IMPACT.

22

23 **PIERCE GOULD:** YES AND OUR INTENT IS TO HAVE A MEANINGFUL
24 DISCOUNT BUT WE'LL COME BACK AND LET YOU KNOW WHAT THE
25 DISCOUNT IS PROPOSED.



December 16, 2020

1

2 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. AND THEN ARE YOU PLANNING TO TRY
3 AND, SORT OF, WHEN PEOPLE APPLY FOR THE LOW INCOME DISCOUNT
4 FOR BAIFA, ARE YOU -- IS THERE SOME THINKING THAT YOU CAN
5 AUTOMATICALLY SHIP THEM A CLIPPER CARD THAT IS ALSO ELIGIBLE
6 FOR LOW INCOME DISCOUNTS? SO THAT WE CAN TRY AND HELP PEOPLE
7 NOT HAVE TO APPLY, SORT OF, MULTIPLE TIMES FOR ALL THEIR
8 DISCOUNTS, BUT JUST KIND OF APPLY ONCE AND GET ALL THEIR
9 DISCOUNT IN ONE PLACE.

10

11 **PIERCE GOULD:** I WOULD SAY YES WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT CROSS
12 QUALIFICATION I DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE YET, BUT YES,
13 THAT'S A GOAL.

14

15 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. AND THEN I WANT TO BRING UP A
16 BROADER QUESTION HERE AS WELL. BUT I THINK THIS IS A GREAT
17 FIRST STEP. BUT THERE ARE ALSO MANY OTHER THINGS ABOUT OUR
18 EXPRESS LANE, AND TOLLING POLICIES WHICH UNNECESSARILY AND
19 UNFAIRLY BURDEN LOW INCOME PEOPLE. AND JUST TO KIND OF, THE
20 ONE THAT IMMEDIATELY COMES TO MIND IS -- THE TWO THAT
21 IMMEDIATELY COME TO MIND ARE HOW WE DEAL WITH FINES AND FEES.
22 AND I'M NOT CLEAR ON WHAT LEVEL OF FINES AND FEES WE CHARGE ON
23 EXPRESS LANES OR ON OUR TOLLS, OR, BUT, YOU KNOW, AS A WHOLE
24 IN CALIFORNIA, THERE ARE \$3.6 BILLION OF TRAFFIC FINES ISSUED
25 EVERY YEAR OF WHICH HALF GO UNPAID LARGELY BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE



December 16, 2020

1 UNABLE TO PAY AND AS A RESULT CALIFORNIANS ARE HOLDING \$10
2 BILLION TRAFFIC FINE DEBT. AND A LOT OF THAT IS JUST SORT OF
3 ACCRUED TO LOW INCOME PEOPLE WHO HAVE NO WAY OF PAYING OFF
4 THESE TICKETS. AND JUST, THIS IS JUST SORT OF DRIVING THEM
5 INTO DEBT. AND THAT'S ONE THING. A SECOND THING IS HOW FASTRAK
6 TAKES MONEY OUT OF YOUR BANK ACCOUNT, FROM THE USER'S
7 PERSPECTIVE, SEEMINGLY AT RANDOM, AND I KNOW THERE'S A LOGIC
8 BEHIND IT FROM THE FASTRAK PERSPECTIVE. BUT FOR LOW INCOME
9 CUSTOMERS, WHO WANT TO SORT OF LINK THEIR BANK ACCOUNTS TO
10 FASTRAK, IT'S VERY, YOU KNOW, OFTEN THEY DON'T HAVE \$35 LYING
11 AROUND FOR FASTRAK TO JUST SORT OF TRY AND PICK UP. AND THEN
12 FASTRAK TRYING TO DO THAT SENDS THEM INTO ALL SORTS OF
13 FINANCIAL PROBLEMS WITH OVERDRAFT FEES AND THINGS LIKE THAT.
14 AND THEN LOOKING REALLY COMPREHENSIVELY, AND BROUGHT UP THIS
15 IN YOUR PRESENTATION, AT THE AVAILABILITY OF KIND OF THE, OF
16 SORT OF CASH PAYMENT, OF LOCATIONS TO BE ABLE TO LOAD CASH
17 PAYMENT ON TO FASTRAK. AND THINKING, REALLY, SORT OF
18 THOUGHTFULLY IN A THAT WE HAVE DONE WITH CLIPPER MAKING SURE
19 THAT WE HAVE THOSE LOCATIONS AVAILABLE. ANYWAY. AND I'M SURE
20 THERE IS A LOT OF OTHER THINGS AS WELL. BUT I WOULD REALLY
21 LIKE TO SEE US COME BACK WITH A SORT OF MORE COMPREHENSIVE
22 APPROACH TO KIND OF HOW LOW INCOME PEOPLE INTERACT WITH, KIND
23 OF THE PAYMENT STRUCTURES ON OUR ROADS, AND TRYING TO ADDRESS
24 SOME OF THESE PROBLEMS IN THE FUTURE RATHER THAN JUST KIND OF
25 LIMITING OURSELVES TO SORT OF MEANS-BASED DISCOUNTS.



December 16, 2020

1

2 **PIERCE GOULD:** THANK YOU. YES. ON THE SECOND ISSUE OF FASTRAK,
3 THE CASH PAYMENT LOCATIONS, AS I SAID, THAT IS ONE REASON
4 WE'RE FOCUSING ON 880 BUT YOUR POINT OF MAKING SURE THERE'S A
5 SOLID NETWORK ACROSS THE REGION, THAT'S AN IMPORTANT POINT. I
6 WILL DEFINITELY PASS THE FEEDBACK ON -- IT SOUNDS LIKE YOU'RE
7 SAYING THE RANDOMNESS OF THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT'S BEING
8 TAKEN OUT OF YOUR CREDIT CARD ACCOUNT TO THE FASTRAK STAFF,
9 MAYBE I CAN RELY ON ANDY OR LISA TO ADDRESS THE FINES AND
10 FEES, AND COMMENTS YOU BROUGHT FORWARD.

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THERE ARE A LOT OF ITEMS WE WOULD LIKE TO
13 PURSUE. IT'S A LITTLE BIT OF A BROKEN RECORD, UNTIL SOME OF
14 THE CLASS ACTION SUITS GET RESOLVED OUR GOAL IS TO NOT MONKEY
15 WITH THE PROCEDURES. YOUR GOALS ARE MANAGEABLE AND OVER THE
16 COURSE OF THE YEAR AS WE TRANSITION INTO ALL ELECTRIC TOLLING
17 WE CAN TACKLE THOSE ITEMS EFFECTIVELY AND MAKE PROGRESS IN THE
18 DIRECTION YOU'RE BRINGING FORWARD. THERE IS ALSO PLENTY OF NEW
19 PAYMENT OPTIONS WE'RE LOOKING AT. THE WORLD IS CHANGING
20 QUICKLY WITH THE ADVENT OF THE PHONE AND SORT OF TOOLS THAT
21 ARE MUCH MORE AVAILABLE TO EVERYBODY, AND WE DO WANT TO TAKE
22 ADVANTAGE OF THAT. WE'RE PAYING ATTENTION TO WHAT OTHER
23 AGENCIES ARE DOING AS WELL, AND THINK THERE ARE PLACES WE CAN
24 CERTAINLY MODERNIZE THE POINTS YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT SO WE'RE
25 SUPPORTIVE, AND YOU WILL SEE MORE FROM US ON THIS.



December 16, 2020

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NICK?

3

4 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU ANDY. I APPRECIATE THAT.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PIERCE, THIS IS A GOOD REPORT AND GOOD WORK.

9 THANK YOU AND STAFF. PIERCE, IN THE FUTURE, COULD YOU BRING

10 BACK A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL ON THE OUTREACH? OR HOW WE'RE

11 ACTUALLY MAKING CONTACT WITH THESE LOW INCOME INDIVIDUALS, AND

12 JUST GIVE US A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL ON THE OUTREACH SIDE AS

13 THIS DEVELOPS? THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

14

15 **PIERCE GOULD:** ABSOLUTELY. NO PROBLEM.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HOLD ON, I'M HAVING A LITTLE TECHNICAL

18 DIFFICULTY HERE. CAROLE DUTRA-VERNACI? COMMISSIONER DUTRA-

19 VERNACI?

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES, THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR HAGGERTY.

22 SO ACCORDING TO THE TIMELINE, I'M HAPPY TO SEE THAT BY THE

23 FOURTH QUARTER OF THIS YEAR, THIS LOOKS LIKE THIS IS GOING TO

24 BE OPERATIONAL. AND I JUST WANTED TO, WELL, COMMENT, FIRST OF

25 ALL, THEY AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IN TERMS OF THE



December 16, 2020

1 FINANCING PART OF THIS FOR LOW INCOME FOLKS TO BE ABLE TO HAVE
2 THE OPPORTUNITIES TO AVOID FINES AND PENALTIES THIS THEY CAN'T
3 PAY, AS WELL AS THE LOCATIONS TO PAY CASH. BECAUSE A LOT OF
4 LOW INCOME FOLKS WILL NOT HAVE BANK ACCOUNTS NECESSARILY
5 BECAUSE OF THE FEES THAT THEY'RE CHARGED FOR LOW DOLLAR
6 AMOUNTS IN THE ACCOUNT. BUT THE OTHER COMMENT I WANTED TO MAKE
7 WAS, I WAS ON 880, I GUESS, LAST WEEK OR SO, AND IT WASN'T
8 COMMUTE TIME, IT WAS MIDDLE OF THE DAY, AND I WAS OBSERVING
9 THE EXPRESS LANES VERSUS THE OTHER LANES, AND I NOTICED HOW
10 CONGESTED THE OTHER LANES SEEMED TO BE FOR THAT TIME OF THE
11 DAY, COMPARED TO THE NUMBER OF USERS IN THE EXPRESS LANES. SO,
12 I THINK THAT THIS MEANS-BASED PROGRAM WILL BE VERY HELPFUL.
13 BECAUSE SOME OF THOSE LOWER INCOME FOLKS WILL BE ABLE TO TAKE
14 ADVANTAGE OF THE EXPRESS LANES, AND THEN EASE UP SOME OF THE
15 CONGESTION AND THE NON-PAYMENT LANES. SO I'M VERY EXCITED
16 ABOUT THIS. AND I ALSO WANT TO MENTION IN TERMS OF
17 COMMISSIONER SPERING IN TERMS OF OUTREACH, I WANT TO MAKE SURE
18 THAT FOLKS UP-AND-DOWN 880 LEARN ABOUT THIS AND HAVE AN
19 OPPORTUNITY TO GIVE INPUT AS WELL. THANK YOU.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER
22 DUTRA-VERNACI. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

23

24 **AMY R. WORTH, VICE CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANT
25 TO THANK STAFF FOR THEIR WORK ON THIS. THE FACT THAT WE HAVE



December 16, 2020

1 KIND OF BEEN ABLE TO COORDINATE THIS WITH THE WORK ON THE
2 CLIPPER START PROGRAM HAS ENABLED STAFF TO REALLY BRING
3 FORWARD A SCHEDULE THAT'S MUCH FASTER THAN IT WOULD HAVE BEEN
4 HAD WE STARTED FROM SCRATCH ON THIS. AND I THINK THE COMMENTS
5 THAT HAVE BEEN MADE BY THE COMMISSIONERS ARE, YOU KNOW,
6 ABSOLUTELY ON POINT IN TERMS OF MOVING FORWARD. IT'S ALSO, I
7 THINK, EFFECTIVE WE'RE DOING A LOT OF OUTREACH ON THE PLANNED
8 BAY AREA. IT GIVES US AN OPPORTUNITY TO BE IN TOUCH DIRECTLY
9 WITH THE EQUITY GROUPS THAT CAN PUT US IN DIRECT TOUCH WITH
10 OUR CONSUMERS THAT WE'RE LOOKING TO REACH, AND TO PROVIDE
11 SUPPORT. AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO REALIZE THAT MANY, MANY OF THE
12 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WE'RE TRYING TO REACH WHO ARE --
13 WOULD TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS STRUCTURE, ARE ONES THAT DO
14 REQUIRE DRIVING. THEY NEED CARS, GIVEN WHERE THEY LIVE, AND
15 WHERE THEIR JOBS ARE LOCATED. SO I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT
16 THAT WE PUT FORWARD THIS PLAN, I THINK, AS THERESE POINTED
17 OUT, IT IS A VERY VISIBLE SIGN OF OUR COMMITMENT TO ADVANCING
18 OUR EQUITY PRIORITIES. I'M ALSO HOPEFUL THAT THIS CAN BECOME A
19 TEMPLATE FOR THE OTHER TOLL OPERATIONS AROUND THE REGION. AND
20 I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE LEARNING A LOT FROM IT AND HOW IT
21 WORKS AND HOW THE OUTREACH IS SO CENTRAL, AND HOW THE
22 ADMINISTRATION OF THIS IS GOING TO BE VERY IMPORTANT IN
23 IMPLEMENTING IT IN THE WAY WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE IT, IN ITS
24 SUCCESS. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

25



December 16, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT EXHAUSTED
2 COMMISSIONER'S COMMENTS. KIMBERLY, ANYTHING IN WRITING,
3 ANYBODY WISHING TO SPEAK IN THE ATTENDEES?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING, AND I DO SEE
6 THREE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YOU CAN CALL ON THEM? AND THEN I'LL GET
9 BACK. GO AHEAD.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ALETA DUPREE, YOU CAN UNMUTE YOURSELF?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR SCOTT HAGGERTY AND MEMBERS. ALETA
14 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS GOOD WORK. IT'S IMPORTANT WE
15 HAVE AN EQUIVALENT TO CLIPPER START ON THE HIGHWAYS. AND AN
16 AFFORDABLE WAY FOR PEOPLE TO HAVE FULL USE OF THE HIGHWAYS,
17 INCLUDING EXPRESS LANES. AND I HAVE BEEN USING USER FEE
18 OPERATED ROADS FOR 50 YEARS. AND NOT LONG AFTER I GOT MY FIRST
19 DRIVERS LICENSE, FOR THE FIRST TIME IN -- ALBANY NEW YORK, I
20 WAS DRIVING ON THE FREEWAYS, I HAVE USED IT ON A NUMBER OF
21 TOLL ROADS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY. WE CAN'T BE HELPLESSLY ON
22 GAS TAX MOVING FORWARD AS WE HAVE HOPE FOR MORE ELECTRIC
23 VEHICLES. THIS IS A START. BECAUSE WE HAVE TO PAY FOR OUR
24 ROADS, AND I THINK THIS MEANS-BASED PROGRAM IS A WAY FOR



December 16, 2020

1 EVERYBODY TO HAVE A PART IN HELPING TO CONTINUE TO HAVE GOOD
2 SAFE ROADS IN CALIFORNIA. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RICH
5 HEDGES. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. HEDGE THANK YOU.

6

7 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK PIERCE. ON THE 880
8 CORRIDOR IT MAKES SENSE. THAT'S A GREAT SELECTION.
9 DEMOGRAPHICS ARE BETTER AND WE GET GREAT RESULTS BASED ON
10 POPULATION AND INCOME ALONG THE 880 AND THE ISSUE OF CASH
11 AVAILABILITY TO MAKE CASH DEPOSITS TO FASTRAK. I CAN'T TELL
12 YOU HOW MUCH I KNOW ABOUT THIS FOR THE FIRST 20 YEARS OF MY
13 LIFE, I HAVE LIVED ON A VERY LOW INCOME. AND KNOW WHAT IT'S
14 LIKE TO MAKE A CHOICE ON WHETHER TO DRIVE OR TAKE PUBLIC
15 TRANSIT. MANY, MANY PEOPLE MAKE THE DECISION BASED ON WHAT'S
16 IN THEIR POCKET. IT COSTS \$7 TO TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT BUT YOU
17 ONLY FIGURE THE AMOUNT OF GAS YOU HAVE IN YOUR TANK BECAUSE
18 YOU CAN'T GET TO THE PLACE WHEN YOU'RE THINKING IN TERMS OF AN
19 AUTOMOBILE VERSUS PUBLIC TRANSIT. THIS IS A GREAT DECISION AND
20 IT'S A GREAT DECISION FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE MEMBERS OF MY
21 UNION WHO ARE INVOLVED IN JUST IN TIME SCHEDULING AND WHEN
22 TRAFFIC IS HORRIBLE AND THEY CAN'T ACCESS THESE LANES
23 FINANCIALLY THEY ARE TREAT WORK AND GET A WRITTEN WARNING, AND
24 AFTER ASCERTAIN AMOUNT OF WRITTEN WARNINGS, THEY ARE OUT OF
25 WORK. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT IDEA TO USE 880. I WANT TO THANK



December 16, 2020

1 STAFF. THIS IS A GREAT PROGRAM. AND IF I WERE DOING IT I WOULD
2 DO A 50 PERCENT DISCOUNT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND LEBRUN.
5 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION.
8 REALLY ENCOURAGING. THE REASON I'M ADDRESSING YOU IS BECAUSE I
9 WOULD LIKE US TO DO SOMETHING SPECIAL FOR THE TRANSIT
10 OPERATORS WHO FACE GRUELING LONG DISTANCE COMMUTES, LONG
11 BEFORE THE START OF PUBLIC TRANSIT OPERATIONS. BECAUSE THEY'RE
12 THE PEOPLE WHO ARE GOING TO START THE OPERATIONS. SO I WOULD
13 LIKE US TO START THINKING ABOUT 100 PERCENT DISCOUNT FOR THESE
14 PEOPLE, INCLUDING NO TOLLS ON EXPRESS LANES, OR BRIDGES, AS
15 PART OF THE COMPENSATION PACKAGE. AND THE LAST POINT IS THIS
16 ISSUE DIDN'T EXIST UNTIL WE STARTED THINKING ABOUT 24/7
17 TOLLING. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS HAYDEN MILLER.
20 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I WANT TO SAY I SUPPORT THE PROGRAM AND LOOK
23 FORWARD TO HIGH DISCOUNTS TO MAKE SURE THAT IT WORKS OUT WELL.
24 I THINK 50 TO 75 PERCENT IS A GOOD NUMBER. AND I LOOK FORWARD
25 TO IT BE EXPANDED TO ADDITIONAL EXPRESS LANES BESIDES JUST THE



December 16, 2020

1 880. BUT I THINK IT'S A GREAT PROGRAM. AND I ALSO AGREE WITH
2 ONE OF THE COMMISSIONERS POINTS ABOUT INCLUDING A CLIPPER CARD
3 SO IT'S A SIMPLE ONE APPLICATION FOR BOTH PROGRAMS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
6 SPEAKERS, MR. CHAIR.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN?

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. FIRST I WANT TO THANK
11 STAFF BECAUSE THEY HAVE BEEN OUTSTANDING IN WORKING WITH THE
12 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
13 SUBCOMMITTEE. I DO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT YOUR PREVIOUS
14 ADVISORY GROUPS, PRIOR TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL HAD THE
15 EQUITY OF THE TOLL LANES FRONT AND CENTER LONG BEFORE ANY
16 PIECE OF PAINT WAS LAID OR ANY LANE WAS BUILT. SO THIS HAS
17 BEEN A LONG TIME PROJECT THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON, AND WE
18 THRILLED TO SEE IT COMING TO FRUITION AND WOULD LOVE TO SEE
19 THIS BE AS SUCCESSFUL AS POSSIBLE. I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS
20 FROM ALL THE COMMISSIONERS ON THIS. I ADOPT TO POINT OUT ONE
21 THING THAT THE LIMITED CHOICE OF AREAS FOR PILOTING IS DUE TO
22 THE FACT THAT WE'RE OPERATING A SYSTEM THAT'S NOT INTEGRATED
23 THAT WE HAVE DIFFERENT CARRIERS OPERATING PORTION OF THE
24 SYSTEM THAT WAS A FACT IN THE 880 BUT WE'RE THRILLED THAT
25 PORTION OF IT IS BEING USED FOR THE PILOT. THANK YOU.



December 16, 2020

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RANDI. I HAVE NO OTHER
3 SPEAKERS ON THIS ITEM. A LOT OF GREAT INFORMATION. A LOT OF
4 GOOD FEEDBACK. PIERCE, I THINK YOU STILL HAVE A LITTLE BIT OF
5 WORK TO DO. SOME COMMISSIONERS WOULD LIKE TO SEE ADDITIONAL
6 INFORMATION, OUTREACH, THINGS LIKE THAT. BUT GREAT
7 PRESENTATION. APPRECIATE IT. ANYBODY ELSE? OKAY. THANK YOU.
8 I'M NOW GOING TO MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO
9 LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS
10 ITEM AT INFO BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE
11 RECORD I WOULD ALSO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
12 PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WHO WISH TO SPEAK ON ITEMS NOT
13 RELATED TO ITEMS ON THE AGENDA IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND
14 AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. KIMBERLY?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND
17 THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. WITH THAT, THE NEXT COMMITTEE OF
20 THE AUTHORITY IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD JANUARY 27TH, 2021 AT
21 THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER -- NO IT'S NOT. IT WILL BE REMOTELY.
22 SO WE'LL GIVE YOU THE ZOOM INFORMATION. WE COULD PROBABLY
23 CHANGE THIS LAST -- THE WAY WE WORD THIS BECAUSE WE'RE GOING
24 TO BE REMOTELY FOR A WHILE. OKAY. THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED.
25 THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]



December 16, 2020

1



Broadcasting Government